CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON TECHNOLOGY

____X

April 29, 2015 Start: 01:07 p.m. Recess: 03:11 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

BEFORE:

INEZ D. BARRON Chairperson

JAMES CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:

Co-Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

FERNANDO CABRERA

JAMES CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:

JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS

LAURIE A. CUMBO VANESSA L. GIBSON

YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ

ANNABEL PALMA

DAVID G. GREENFIELD

MARK S. WEPRIN STEVEN MATTEO

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

[gavel]

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good afternoon. Good afternoon.

[background comments]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I want to welcome everyone to today's hearing on Diversity at CUNY TV, the City University of New York's Television station. I'm Inez Barron Chair of the Committee on Higher Education. We are joined today by the Committee on Technology chaired by my colleague Council Member James Vacca. Witnesses invited to testify on today's topic include representatives from CUNY, the professional staff congress, student advocacy organizations, and other interested parties. Established in 1985 CUNY TV is an independent television station and the recipient of 11 New York Emmy Awards and other prestigious industry honors including the Tele Award and Communicator Awards. According to its website CUNY TV is the largest university television station in the country with a reach from nearly 1.7 million cable households in New York City and 7.3 million broadcast households in the New York metropolitan area. In our previous hearings we've looked at

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY diversity in the student body and diversity in the 2 faculty. Diversity of voices is also important. 3 CUNY TV is a powerful tool and has a potential to 5 fulfil an important educational function for the community it serves. In a city as diverse as New 6 7 York and a university as diverse as CUNY it is important that the programming and management of 8 9 the organization reflects that diversity. While CUNY TV has received accolades, many accolades for 10 productions that do reflect the, the city's 11 diversity this hearing will examine the status of 12 CUNY TV today including what programs are currently 13 14 in production and development, who creates those 15 programs, who makes those decisions, hiring and 16 promotion policies that apply to those decision makers, and the opportunities for CUNY students to 17 participate in the, in the production of CUNY TV 18 program. CUNY as we said has done great work. We 19 know that this week is Immigration Now and they 20 have a great outreach for that. We know that the 21 master plan talks about having CUNY radio 22 23 especially reach out to the immigrant population. We know that the advance media group seeks to 24 25 partner with colleges both in production and in

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY editing. So we want to see how CUNY TV supports the 2 master plan and what it is that's happening. I 3 would like to recognize my colleagues for present, 5 first my colleague James Vacca who is on the committee and is also the chair of the Committee on 6 7 Technology. And we've been joined by colleague Mark Weprin. I would like to also thank my staff for 8 9 their work on today's hearing, my legislative 10 director and CUNY liaison Indigo Washington, my committee council Jeff Campania, and lastly I would 11 like to thank Tanya Cyrus who is not with us today 12 because she is touring a homeless shelter with the 13 14 speaker as a part of her work as a policy analyst 15 to the general welfare committee. Tanya has served 16 on this committee's policy analyst for seven years including three chairs, including Council Members 17 Ydanis Rodriguez, my husband Charles Barron, and 18 I'm very sorry to say... oh thank you... I'm very sorry 19 to say that she's leaving this committee to focus 20 full time on the portfolio of agencies overseen by 21 the general welfare committee. I want to conclude 22 23 by stating on the record that we will miss the deep knowledge and experience that she has brought to 24 25 higher education over the years by wishing her well

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON TECHOLOGY

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

in her new role. I would like to recognize Chairman

Vacca to offer opening remarks and also say that

Council Member Matteo is here with us as well.

CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: Thank you. And as chair of the Committee on Technology my agency oversees the Mayor's Office of Media and Entertainment. So in that role I wanted to be here today and to learn more about CUNY TV. I have to tell you as an aside that I watch CUYTV a lot and I see many of the shows. In fact when I first came to the council Ronnie Eldrige had, had invited me to be on her show and I thought, I thought it was great not just because I was in the show but I thought it was, was, was very informative. So I'm here, I'm here, I'm here... I heard you Steve Matteo. I want you to know that we, we always have an obligation to do outreach and to make sure that we involve as many people as possible and I'm glad to see that we have shows even for Italian Americans because I know that that's been a subject over the years that I've been interested in. So I'm here today to be supportive of all that we can do. And I thank the chair and my co-chair for today.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you Council Member. Normally the procedure is that the agency would go first. However we're having a little break in that, in that we've never had a hearing to talk about CUNY TV in all the years that we've had hearings and we thought it would be appropriate to not just go into it blindly but be able to hear from those who are intimately involved in CUNY TV so that when CUNY TV, when the CUNY panel comes forward they can perhaps address issues that have been brought forward. So I'm going to call the first panel and I want to thank CUNY for acknowledging that. So the first panel will be... Uma Kutwal from CUNY TV, Claude... oh I'm sorry from DC37, Claude Fort from DC37, Tyrique Washington from CUNY TV, Michelle Keller Vice President of DC37 Local 375, and Mario Rosales. So if they're here would they please come up? And if the panel members would raise their right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth... would you raise your right hands please. Thank you. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before the committee and to answer all

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

- 1 ON TECHOLOGY
- 2 | members' questions honestly? Thank you. You may
- 3 begin.

4 ...Member Barron, Chair Member Vacca,

5 | fellow New York City council members first let me

6 thank you for the great opportunity to come before

7 | you today to testify on the topic of diversity or

8 the lack of of the senior staff and the elevation

9 of people of color at CUNY TV. My name is Tyrique

10 Washington. I joined the CUNY TV staff in July 2005

11 therefore July of this year 2015 will mark my 10th

12 | year of being employed at the station operating as

13 | its, its only full time music producer. Over the

14 | years including this year I've been nominated for

15 | six New York Emmy Awards, and won my first Emmy in

16 | March of 2014. To date I hold the distinction of

17 | being the only CUNY TV employee ever to win a craft

18 specialty award. The, the distinguished craft

19 specialty award is an award cater, category that is

20 dedicated to key technical disciplines in behind

21 | the scene craft essentials to television

22 production. For the record CUNY TV has won a total

23 of 13 New York Emmy Awards which is one of the

24 | highest awards you can achieve in television. Ten

25 ∥ out of, ten out of that 13 New York Emmys was won

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY primarily by the work of black and Latino 2 producers. Nine of those awards were won by a show 3 entitled Nueva York. The show is staffed by a team 5 comprised primarily of all Latino producers. Even with this great accomplishments these same black 6 7 and Latino producers are still the lowest paid employees at CUNY TV. While these are the, while 8 9 there are shows that cater to and display people of 10 color such as Bob Herbert TV, One on One, Study with the Best, Black Writers in America, and Nueva 11 in New York all of the senior producers for these 12 shows are white. The job of a senior producer 13 14 dictates and approve the show script, the show 15 guests, topics that we discuss on the show, and the 16 final edit that will be viewed where in lies the power and the problem. For an example in 2006 I was 17 given a great opportunity to produce a five minute 18 segment for the show Study with the Best on the 19 topic of reentry and the school to prison pipeline. 20 For this segment I chose a very successful reentry 21 22 program Houstat in Medgar Evers College in 23 Brooklyn. Myself and the crew spent days at the college and at Ryker's Island Correctional 24 Facilities, interviewing professors, former 25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY prisoners, and elected officials collecting factual 2 data to be used for the show. While I was allowed 3 to discuss the content and practices of the day to 5 day activities of the reentry program at Medgar Evers I was not allowed to present or discuss a 6 7 full narrative that explodes the systematic reasons of reentry and the very first place. Discussions 8 such as the war on poverty, a poor education system 9 in urban communities, etcetera. This information 10 was either, this information was watered down or 11 edited out. I want to note here that I am also an 12 independent film producer who have produce and 13 14 written and directed two feature films outside of 15 CUNY TV with one of them receiving distribution 16 through iTunes. I'm introducing this fact only because I want the committee to understand that as 17 a independent film producer I know how to bring a 18 five minute clip to life and how to frame to life 19 and to frame it so it tells a complete story. But 20 because my senior producer and senior editor were 21 22 both white I truly felt it was easier for them to romanticize a success story of a former prisoner 23 than to deal with the naked truth of incarceration 24 25 in America. This superb piece of work was then to

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY deal with an, I'm sorry, this superb piece of work 2 was watered down and presented in a fashion that 3 made the prisoners a product of, prisoners a 5 product produced of they own circumstances. This leaves me to draw the conclusion that because there 6 7 is no multi-cultural influences in top management, because there is no senior producers of color the 8 9 films and shows being produced at CUNY TV will 10 never be able to depict the true extinction and experiences of urban life and be a true voice of 11 independent public broadcast television. Finally I 12 ask you to turn to attachment number one given to 13 14 you with my testimony. That attachment shows the 15 employees flow chart distributed by the Executive 16 Director of CUNY TV Mr. Robert Isaacson highlighting the names of the executive TV, 17 executive management staff. Please note that there 18 is not one person of color who serves as a member 19 of the executive staff. My testimony today focuses 20 on the fact that black and brown people do not have 21 managerial positions of power that help to shape 22 23 the creative direction or day to day operation of the services of CUNY TV provides to the five 24 25 boroughs of New York City nor is the executive

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY staff a reflection of the CUNY, of the CUNY student 2 population or a reflection of its reach of 7.3 3 million households in New York City. All of my, all 5 of the minority staff at CUNY TV is employed as broadcast associates while the white staff 6 7 population varies in positions from broadcast associates to higher education officers. Positions 8 which can result into higher pay and better city 9 benefits. I truly believe that the lack of 10 multicultural voices represent, represented at the 11 highest level of staff management results in a lack 12 of diversity show programming, the elevation of 13 14 people of color and the overall respect given to 15 the minority staff at CUNY TV. On a national scale 16 we are seeing a greater acceptance of multicultural voices of the senior level of media and 17 entertainment in the public setter, public sector. 18 Consider the New York Times, Epic Records, HBO for 19 an example. And places like Los Angeles and New 20 York we are seeing political initiatives and tax 21 insensitives [phonetic] all designed to encourage 22 my minority inclusion. Here in the city council 23 members are calling for new bills that would force 24 25 city contractors to disclose board, board room

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

- 1 ON TECHOLOGY
- 2 demographics. Council Member Darlene Mealy, a
- 3 Brooklyn democrat was quoted as saying I believe
- 4 | this bill is a good first step in increasing
- 5 transparency and closing the pay gap that has
- 6 existed far too long in our city and, and country.
- 7 Thank you for this opportunity and I look forward
- 8 to your questions.

9

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Next.

10 MARIO ROSALES: Thank you Chairwoman

11 Barron, Chairman Vacca and members of the New York

12 | City Council for the opportunity to speak today. My

13 | name is Mario Rosales and I been working at CUNY TV

14 | for 10 years and I never got any raise in my pay

15 | rate substantially. My pay rate is substantially

16 | lower compared to our editors or producers at the

17 station. I came to New York in 2002 to pursue my

18 dream to becoming a film maker and earn my master's

19 degree at the City College of New York. In January

20 2005 I began working at CUNY TV. I was hire with a

21 | team of predominately Latino producers for the

22 creation of a new show called Nueva York focusing

23 | on Spanish speaking culture in New York City. Since

24 I began in, begin in CUNY TV I've been responsible

25 | for creating the image of the show, providing

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY essential ideas that remain to date as a hallmark 2 3 of the program such as the logo, the intro, promos, and, and credits of the show. Each season many of 5 these elements are renew. The proposal and ideas production and editing and post production are the 6 7 result of my creative process. In 2007 just two years after the creation of Nueva York the show was 8 9 nominated for the first, for the first time for an Emmy in the category of best magazine show. In 2008 10 Nueva York, Nueva York won the best magazine 11 category making the first Emmy win for CUNY TV, in 12 CUNY TV history. In consecutive years we continue 13 14 to win Emmy awards for best magazine show in 2009, 15 2010, 2011, and 2013. The Nueva York team has had 16 16 Emmy nominations in different categories and has won 10 Emmys. After we won our first Emmy we were 17 hoped for a raise. Instead the show went from 18 19 monthly to a twice a month with no economic compensation. As a producer of Nueva York I've been 20 focused on developing topics of great important to 21 Latino community related to social issues and 22 23 cultural expressions. For example together with my colleague Estella Sanders I was responsible for 24 25 the planning, research, production, and editing of

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY several thematic chapters of Nueva York, the Nueva 2 York about the immigration movement in this 3 country. This piece was nominated for a 2013 Emmy award for best feature of social content. In 2010 I 5 was promoted as a senior editor of Nueva York. So 6 7 in addition to my contribution as the producer of the show now I'm responsible for over, overseeing 8 9 the final expert, half of the, half of the episodes of each season. This means revising content 10 produced by other producers, technical aspects of 11 post-production and assembly each show, each show. 12 However this increased job responsibilities didn't 13 14 meant any elevation in my salary. At this moment 15 I'm currently renovating the image of Nueva York 16 meaning that I'm producing, shooting, editing, and post producing a new intro for the show portraying 17 different characters in the CUNY Latino community 18 as well as a series of promos that have just been 19 nominated for an Emmy for best musical composition 20 by... Washington. Since 2010 when the economic crisis 21 of CUNY TV cut the overtime for all the employees 22 23 to avoid firing people. But that meant a big cut in my paycheck. Several months later extra funds were 24 25 allocated to some at the station but the recipient

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY were selected by CUNY TV management. I was not one 2 of them. And most Nueva York don't receive that 3 extra check. Since 2010 I've been living paycheck 5 to paycheck. In addition to asking for a raise in my base salary I have asked for that extra check 6 7 that at least twice the answer has been no with explanation that there is no money but that check 8 9 is significant to the people who receive and who gets it and who does not gets show that is 10 arbitrary. In December 2014 I asked for a raise in 11 my base salary. I asked this time because I getting 12 married in October and I'm going to become a 13 14 father. I haven't receive a raise in 10 years even 15 though my responsibilities have increased. And with 16 the founding members of Nueva York team we were hire in, we were hire under broadcast two line in 17 our union contract. In fact we have always been 18 19 doing broadcast three work and all have the, and we all have our master's degree all the members of the 20 team. But what that means is that those of us who 21 founded the show have been underpaid for a decade. 22 At CUNY TV there are 10 employees who are alumni 23 from the MFA program at city college. Six members 24 25 of the Nueva York team. We all earn an annual

2 income of 58 thousand or less. Outside the Nueva

4 thousand to 90 thousand. So these, these disparity

York team other alumni employees earn between 80

5 leaves me with a big and uncomfortable questions.

6 What accounts for the big difference in the pay

7 scales? Why has there been no elevation in our pay

8 rates when the Nueva York team has constantly been

9 winning the biggest awards in television and other

10 shows have not. Is Latino work simply the cheap, is

11 considered just cheap labor? When I found out that

12 my new wife was pregnant with twins I went to the

13 senior management and asked for a raise. Not only

14 did I get a no but I also got the comment that with

15 | my pay line I shouldn't get more kids. This comment

16 stung. Not only because I was facing a real

17 | economic reality of needing to be the sole provider

18 of a new family but I felt that the comment had

19 racist undertones. What I hope coming out of this

20 | hearing is for everyone at CUNY TV to start having

21 | equal opportunity. I'm hoping for equality in pay

22 scales based on the actual work individuals are

doing regardless of the skin color of ethnic

24 background.

23

1

3

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Before I go on.

Congratulations, good luck. I'm a new a grandmother for the first time so it's an exciting experience.

Next panelist.

CLAUDE FORT: Mic is good. Yeah. Good afternoon honorable chairperson Inez Barron and congratulations to new grandmother and honorable chairperson James Vacca and honorable committee members. My name is Claude Fort. I am the President of the Civil Service Technical Guild which is Local 375 of DC 37. Our local represents close to 7,000 engineers, architects, scientists, and other technical professionals. We cover more than 200 civil service titles in about 30 municipal agencies all throughout this great city including the broadcast associates at the CUNY TV. We are very proud of our members and what they do for the city they love. In general our members design, maintain, and preserve the infrastructure of New York City. In the last 78 years our members have participated greatly in the design and maintenance of New York City's infrastructure. And that includes the design of the six billion dollar project, a water tunnel a number three project. On behalf of Local 375 I want

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY to thank you for this hearing which gives us the 2 opportunity to share with you and the general 3 public some of the issues our CUNY TV members face 5 in the work place. You just heard the two brothers, Brother Washington and Brother Rosales and who 6 7 believe they are not being treated fairly Brother Rosales he's going to have twins right, for that 8 9 alone he deserves a raise right? But joke aside I 10 think they are doing a great job and when we sat down with them we were able to identify other 11 issues that they are going through and, and those 12 areas of concerns include the lack of promotional 13 14 opportunities, the lack of civil service 15 examination because all of them are provisionals. 16 The use of part time workers, or excessive use of 17 part time workers and some... arrangement that could be discussed maybe... and definitely the lack of 18 19 diversity or rather the lack of fair treatment and promotional opportunities for our black and Latino 20 CUNY TV members. At this time I would like to turn 21 it to my colleague here, my colleagues First Deputy 22 Michelle Keller and Local 375... Uma Kutwal who is a 23 CUNY employee and a university engineer level three 24

25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

- 1 ON TECHOLOGY
- 2 | to go into some specifics. Thank you very much for
- 3 | your time.
- 4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Just before you
- 5 | begin we've been joined by other Council Members
- 6 Cabrera, Cumbo, and Mealy. We want to thank them
- 7 | for coming. Please continue.

8 MICHELLE KELLER: Good afternoon New

9 York City, Council Chairpersons Inez Barron and

10 James Vacca, distinguished colleagues, labor,

11 community partners, and CUNY. I am Michelle Keller,

12 | the first Vice President of the Civil Service

13 | Technical Guild Local 375 ask me. We are so proud

14 of our members and the work that they do to move,

15 | build, maintain, educate, and preserve New York

16 City. Thank you for convening this hearing to give

17 | labor a platform to speak out to the public. Our

18 presentation serves to illuminate the lack of equal

19 poportunity of our members and systemic positions

20 of power that offer real and positive educational

21 entertainment for the communities of color. The

22 | city's equal opportunity mandates sites in part

23 | that the municipal workforce reflects the

24 diversity, spirit, talent, and dedication of a

25 | city's population. When city employees experience

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY discrimination it threatens the productivity and 2 efficiency of city government. Discrimination is 3 illegal and will not be tolerated. Agency heads, 5 managers, and supervisors should understand their obligation to prevent discrimination. Mayor 2013, 6 7 20, 2003. The members you have heard from today are talented professional productive and seasoned but 8 9 consider themselves to be unfairly browbeaten. The members' careers are being constructively eroded. 10 They have been maintained as provisional and no 11 civil service examinations since the program's 12 inception in 20, in 2005. They have remained in 13 14 this nebulous position toiling for this program for 15 decades. Over the last few years CUNY has chosen to 16 completely snatch the members' job security leaving them frightened, stressed, and vulnerable. Our 17 members are now being hired part time. No choices. 18 They work hard with no recognition. Kept short of 19 logging in full time hours and receiving total 20 benefits. Black and Hispanic workers known as 21 broadcast associates lack the full recognition and 22 23 comparable salaries of their white counterparts. This is both sad and disrespectful given their 24 25 exemplary service, experience. Repeated Emmy award

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY winning honors year after year. Built into our 2 civil service system is a natural order of 3 promotional opportunity and progression. The 5 occupational group in this case is called a broadcast associate. It offers three levels of duty 6 7 and assignment responsibility. Each of these levels has its own minimum to maximum salary wage 8 spectrum. It is so easy to provide timely and 9 grateful recognition for good work. Work has 10 dignity. Beyond the jurisdiction of our collective 11 bargaining unit are management's levels of 12 administrative assignment. Supervising, reviewing, 13 14 reporting and analyzing information, project 15 management, strategizing, consulting, and moving 16 the priorities of the industry. While labor has no representation in this area of assignment we have 17 been told that there are no members of color being 18 hired or promoted into these powerful prestigious 19 and influential positions. It's been a long time. 20 How is the community being served with our online 21 staff stifled and ignored? These members get no 22 23 respect. They endure daily stress, low morale, inequitable compensation, and ghost maneuver for 24 others to deliver their creative project to the 25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY public. We have got to fix this inequity now. We 2 want to be clear that the members who have stepped 3 out today will not experience any retaliation 5 overtly or subtly as they return to their work floor. We want all the members who do the good work 6 7 of this organization that have placed CUNY TV in its stellar standing of media entertainment to reap 8 9 the benefits as well. If you can make it here you can make it anywhere. Anybody know who said that? 10 Frank Sinatra. Thank you for listening and thank 11 you for your attention to this most serious matter 12 of equal opportunity. We understand that and we are 13 14 handling this case with care. We demand that CUNY 15 investigate these circumstances and find a 16 reasonable solution immediately. Thank you. CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Next 17 panelist. We also want to acknowledge we've been 18 19 joined by Council Member Gibson. UMA KUTWAL: Okay. Good afternoon Madam 20 Chair, Committee Chairperson, and committee members 21 my colleagues in labor and my colleagues at CUNY 22 23 university. My name is Uma Kutwal. I'm a CUNY employee since 1985... university engineer level 3 in 24 the Department of Design Construction and 25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY Management. I'm also a... of CUNY chapter 36 of Local 2 37, 375 DC 37 since 1994. Currently I'm on union 3 release time serving a grievance part the local 5 375. I represent CUNY Chapter 36 members that also include member employed by CUNY TV. There are total 6 7 of 67 full time full time and 69 part time broadcasts associate working at various CUNY 8 9 campuses for CUNY TV. Majority of full time 10 broadcast associate and all part time broadcast associate work at CUNY's graduate center and the 11 rest of full time broadcast associate are assigned 12 to various campuses including School of Journalism, 13 14 Kings Borough Community College, LaGuardia 15 Community College, and John Jacobs. There are five 16 main issues that broadcast associate are facing and they are lack of promotional opportunity, no civil 17 service examination, all the broadcast associate 18 full time and part time they are provisional. Part 19 time, part timers with no full benefits and sitting 20 space for part time broadcast associate and lack of 21 22 diversity at top, at top management. I would like to discuss now briefly all these item which are 23 listed... Foster the lack of promotional opportunity. 24 25 Biggest complaint of broadcast associate is lack of

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY opportunity to advance to higher level in their 2 title. There are many talented employees who have 3 achieved excellence in producing, editing, 5 monitoring, broadcast program, and progress to maintain consistent quality of picture and sound, 6 7 reproduction and planning and maintain broadcast schedule. Few of these employees have won Emmys, a 8 9 clear testimony to the expertise and dedication. 10 Lack of structure to promote other hardworking employees is nonexistent at CUNY TV. To make thing 11 worse every salary of a broadcast associate is 12 about 50 thousand... well below the salary that 13 14 cameraman producer... man in commercial media 15 television industry. Second issue which is very 16 important issue for us and for the labor is the civil service exam or lack of it, of these title. 17 All 69 part timer and 67 full time employees, 18 they're all provisional. What that mean? There was 19 no civil service exam was given to them so that 20 they can take that exam and become permanent in 21 22 their title. Why this is important? Because if you 23 want to employ and if you want to... the minority participation in this, in this title you must make 24 25 sure you know they have the security that they

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY going to have the job tomorrow. Because like the 2 part time employees they don't have almost no 3 protection, civil service protection but I'll deal 5 that with later on. Now these people are pure provisional mean they can be let go in case some 6 7 situation... you know... like you know the financial situation... seniority or anything. And this is 8 9 despite the fact you know that the civil service 10 law that states that no provisional should be in the title for more than nine month. And here we are 11 talking people who are there 10 year, 15 year, 12 12 year you know in those title. The next issue is the 13 14 part time broadcast associate. More than half of 15 the broad, broadcast employee at CUNY TV are part 16 time, part timers. Being part time broadcast associate means one gets paid only for hours work 17 and do not get paid for any holiday or for personal 18 time off. CUNY TV takes advantage by forcing some 19 part timer to work up to 32 hours, just three hour 20 short of regular 35 hour work week. And what it 21 mean? If these people work 35 hour they will get 22 23 full benefits meaning they will have you know all these holidays, vacation time, and all of that. But 24 25 just forcing them to work more than you know 20

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY hours and up to 32 hour which is very close to the 2 full time work hour these people are deprived of 3 the full vacation and paid holidays. That mean if 5 the child got sick at the home and they take time off that time will be without any pay. So moreover 6 7 being a part timer one doesn't have any job security under CUNY civil service system. That mean 8 any time management want to get rid of somebody 9 there is no procedure you know in a sense, there is 10 no right to appeal or right to present their case. 11 They can just be let go. Now there's another 12 situation that we believe is linked with the, the, 13 14 the majority of the people in the Broadcast 15 Associate title whether part time or full time. 16 Since most of them they are either female or from the minority... testimony from Director of the Human 17 Resources from CUNY there are almost 40 percent 18 female in this title and 45 percent... mean from 19 black, Hispanic, American Indian, other you know 20 minority group. These people are kind of packed in 21 a room which is maybe one fourth of this room. 20 22 23 of the or 15 of them without any proper sitting space and they're told you know to sit in this area 24 25 which is used also as a eating facility meaning

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY cafeteria, not a cafeteria, like a lounge or 2 something. And they will say okay stay there and we 3 will call you when you have to do something. I 5 believe, and so does this union you know that every single person must be provided a dignified working 6 7 space. To deprive them is totally totally unacceptable to the union and especially I believe 8 9 to CUNY which is a great institution, a liberal great institution which value the, the value of the 10 human being and human life. The next one is the 11 lack of diversity in upper management. As I said in 12 this testimony from the director of the human 13 resources at, at CUNY it's said you know that there 14 15 are 40 percent female and 45 percent you know 16 people from the minority group are... protected. But I had one brother testify there is not a single one 17 in the executive staff. That tells you something 18 you know what's happening at CUNY TV. And also many 19 TV, CUNY TV employees have their origin in foreign 20 countries or belong to minority committees, 21 communities; black, Latino, etcetera but makes a 22 23 very small percentage of upper management at CUNY TV. This is evident at CUNY TV's community program... 24 25 talk managers are not from black or Latino group of

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON TECHOLOGY

2 | employees of broadcast associate who are actually

3 planning, producing, and editing those program but

4 | are not given on air credit for such programs. We

5 asked the New York City Council Committee on the

6 | technology to look seriously into this issue

7 | broadcast associate are facing at CUNY TV and we

8 | will like to see Committee on Technology to make...

9 to CUNY TV to improve on these issues which we

10 mentioned, listed above in, in my testimony. And

11 | thank you very much.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I want to thank the panel for all of their information, for the presentation. Some of what you said is very troubling, very disturbing. And it follow what we sometimes understand is unspoken which is the tendency to not address situations or to push them to the side or to say well we'll get to it over a period of time. And that's not what I think CUNY's about. I'm a proud CUNY graduate from Hunter College and received what I think is an excellent education and all of the aspects of programs at CUNY operates needs to reflect what it is that we say CUNY is about and where it doesn't, where it falls short we need to make sure that we design a

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	program and come up with a response that in fact
3	reflects what we see are inequities. We talk about
4	a society that has gross inequities especially in
5	terms of skin color and also by gender. So we've
6	got to address that. Just to ask a question about
7	what exactly is an Emmy and how many have you been
8	involved in that process? And just very succinctly
9	because we do want to move the panel quickly. What
10	is an Emmy? What does it represent.
11	MARIO ROSALES: [off mic]Emmy, the Emmy
12	award [on mic]is given by the Academy of
13	Television and Sciences so it's the highest award.
14	TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: [off mic] One of
15	the highest awards.
16	MARIO ROSALES: One of the highest
17	awards. CUNY TV have 13 Emmy awards and 10 of them
18	is but, has been won by the work of the team of
19	Nueva York.
20	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay so you've,
21	you're a part of a team that's
22	MARIO ROSALES: Yeah.
23	CHAIRPERSON BARRON:won? And Mr.
24	Washington you also have a, an Emmy?

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: Right. I have 2 received a, a Emmy for my musical arrangement that 3 I actually produced for Nueva York... [cross-talk] 5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So how do you get nominated for an Emmy? What's the process? Do you 6 7 call them up and say listen I've... [cross-talk] TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: No. Well there is 8 a, we, we actually have a, a, awards are 9 coordinated by the name of Vanessa, Vanessa Milner 10 who is selects, helps you select, well is appointed 11 by the Executive Director Mr. Robert Isaacson who 12 you can be able to submit to her and then there is 13 a, I guess a pull from the executive staff or 14 15 whoever decides what is going to be submitted to ... 16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So you can't submit it individually. The organizations that you work 17 for has to offer your name to the... 18 19 TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: Well... CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...body to... 20 TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: Correct. 21 22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. 23 TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: Correct. But there are some, you, I guess if you willing to pay for it 24 25 but I don't know if that, the clearance is right so

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	the legal there might be some technicality of you
3	being able to submit it on your own.
4	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.
5	TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: But right CUNY TV
6	does submit and
7	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.
8	TYRIQUE WASHINGTON:then pays for it
9	as well.
LO	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And, and then to,
L1	to the, to the labor representatives what is the
L2	process to call for a civil service exam? What, why
L3	hasn't it happened in ten years?
L4	UMA KUTWAL: That's a question we are
L5	asking CUNY for last ten year or more. And the
L6	process you know the labor, the CUNY management
L7	the exam.
L8	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So you have to
L9	request of And have you done that?
20	UMA KUTWAL: A number of times. And
21	nothing has happened so far.
22	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And was is the
23	response to your request?
24	UMA KUTWAL: They will look into it you
25	know simply and it

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Okay Chair Vacca do you have any questions?

any questions but I, I do know that historically in New York City the issue of provisional versus civil service is always a bone of contention. It's been a bone of contention in this city going back many, many, many years. Provisional employees are often employees that do end up increasing diversity because they can be hired and although they never took a civil service test you're allowed to look at issues as to what is needed for a particular agency at a particular point. So I did want to state that but otherwise I don't have any question.

UMA KUTWAL: May, may I make a comment on that? Well what you said is very true but at the same time there is a... of that also, the negative side. Because when you give a civil service exam you pick a person based upon the ability and you know the capability of that person and experience. And when you give the authority to the management to pick anyone, anyone then there it goes you know the question of diversity and all those kind of thing.

CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: I, I

acknowledge that there are pros and cons and that there, there's certainly has been discussion of this for many many years. So I'm not advocating for either one I'm just pointing out a point of view.

We want to point out that this, what's happening in CUNY TV may not be a reflection of what's happening in CUNY... other areas of CUNY in general. I mean this is something that we could say, I don't know if it's as related to CUNY TV but definitely very present in CUNY TV. So I don't want you to have the, the wrong impression that we are talking about CUNY overall at CUNY.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. We've been joined by Council Members Rodriguez and Greenfield and we have a question from Council Member Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much Madam Chair for holding this hearing. I, I just have a simple question. How many, how many are employee management? You mentioned that there are no minorities right? Did I, did I hear right that in management you don't have...

TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: Well in 2011 there was a email sent out of senior staff. And I provided that flow chart that's available for the, my testimony package. And though it's not pictures connected to the names that senior staff is a reflection of all white executives there. And so when we say senior staff we are talking about the people who run the day to day operation who help create or shape the direction or mission of the actual show. And to show you I guess even how important this even circle of this hearing has been there has been even some maneuvering so to speak of even a few to or one or two, to, o elevate themselves in a matter of a week or two, or the couple of days to be considered senior staff because it's a, a direct reflection of a, just a blatant obvious look at me sign that diversity at the senior level doesn't exist. So we not talking about a question of is there black or Latino people that work at CUNY TV, that is not the shape of the conversation that I think or any of us are, are laying out. But the senior staff that calls the shots so to speak no, definitely no.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

could be clear the, the, and you help me, you're helping me to zoning in the issue is not with the overall employee pull but how many make it to the senior... And now these that are listed here by name they've been there since 2011? They were originally picked?

TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: Well some have been there longer than 2011 but that's when that was sent out by again the executive director in 2011 was, which is, was a flow chart.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay.

TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: And but, but, let, let me just if I can the importance of when you have somewhat of a structure of television, I don't know if any of you guys worked in television. I know Mr. Vacca has definitely has some expertise in this field, the, the structure is not so much... if you look at a senior supervising producer or, or, or executive in charge of production so to speak that person okays the script.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Right.

TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: Also maybe oversees or allocates certain resources to an individual's

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

ON TECHOLOGY shows and because CUNY TV to my understanding... somebody can correct if I'm, if I'm wrong is not Nielsen rating. That means that we don't know if five million people have watched on that particular night there's a certain level of uniqueness of how certain resources or certain people who are moving up the ranks if it's not about the Emmy because if we have one and it never elevated then it goes to the question then what is it about that have some have elevated to the senior staff and there's definitely not a, a chance of black or brown people on that reflection of that flow chart that has been sent out. So you know it's a certain level of uniqueness. So even when you do have people who are producers, they still have to deal with senior management to structure or okay the structure of

regards to that have you witness instances where you felt that those who were employed in the, from you know people of color that they were at a disadvantage to the other let's say Caucasian employees that they were not given an opportunity or do you feel that they're all given the same

shows or the topic of even, a topic of a show.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY opportunity except that at, at the management 2 senior level as you call it that you have not seen 3 people be able to rise up? 5 TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: Well, and I, and I 6 can... 7 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: And I, the only reason I brought it up is because you brought up 8 9 the issue... TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: No definitely. 10 Definitely. 11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...that. 12 TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: And I, I think in 13 14 my testimony and Mario can definitely chime in on 15 this at, at the end, my testimony, I gave a, 16 somewhat of a kind of a good example. There you gonna probably see a promo that has a show of Black 17 Writers in America which is canceled so, but they 18 still play it. Black Writers in America, One on 19 One, Bob Herber TV, Nueva York, Canape that, well 20 let's leave Canape out of it, that display or cater 21 to a certain demographic. But their senior producer 22 who I have respect for but their senior producer is 23 white. So it's not the question the conversation of 24

you know the topic of black people or whatever but

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY it's more so, and I spoke about it here, I gave an 2 3 example of the reentry program that we focused and highlighted on at Medgar Evers College. And I was, 5 that story was turned around to, to somewhat romanticize the somewhat young man who pulled his 6 7 self out of bootstrap, came out of jail, and make a great significance of society but didn't want to 8 9 talk about the systemic problem the, the war on drugs, or the reason why the Medgar Evers program 10 even has the reentry program and how they deal with 11 the, the kind of key things of cultural erichment 12 [phonetic] and, and you know from that perspective. 13 14 So there has been such a blatant level, and then 15 Mario can talk about the disparities of senior 16 editors. He has rosen [phonetic], I've been a music producer since my being there. He has risen from a 17 producer to a senior editor as well. And the 18 disparities of income who have the same, graduated 19 20 from the master's program, have an MFA, came out of 21 the same college, same alumnis [phonetic] that we 22 have, definitely have a great relationship for 23 they're doing the same work, he's Latino, they are white, the pay discrepancies is almost close to 30 24 25 thousand dollars more. So you have seen a certain

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY level of disenfranchisement of people being even 2 elevated not even to senior management but to just 3 regular somewhat senior positions on shows. 5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here's my last question. And what do you anticipate the 6 7 administration is going to respond to everything that you have brought up today? I'm just curious. 8 9 TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: For me, and I'll let the... I don't want to talk too much, but for me 10 I will hope that like Sony who has recently come 11 out with what was perceived to be racist emails and 12 acknowledge that they have a systemic problem of 13 14 not enough black people, or black or brown people 15 in key positions I will hope that we can leave this 16 conversation here to really looking at addressing that issue and not to somewhat cover up or be able 17 to just prop certain black faces and consider that 18 diversity but to really have an open dialogue to be 19 able to push a further agenda that represents New 20 York City. 21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Can I just ask 22

TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: [off mic] Sure.

23

24

25

your background prior to...

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: What is your 2 master's in? You have a... 3 4 TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: [off mic] I don't 5 have a master's degree. I don't... [cross-talk] COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: What it, well 6 7 what it, what is your BA in? TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: [off mic] I don't 8 9 have a BA. [on mic] I don't have a B, BA degree. I, I was somewhat kind of deemed by the Julliard Music 10 Advancement Program at a very early age as a 11 prodigy so to speak. I don't consider that title 12 even though we can debate that a little bit. But at 13 14 a very early age I got early into the private 15 sector working at the age of 16 with Jeff Jam 16 Records and Atlantic Records and somewhat producing a multi-platinum projects so... 17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I, I appreciate 18 that. I just wanted to ask for the record. But your 19 comparison, your comparison of CUNY with the Sony 20 situation. 21 TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: Sure. 22 23 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: The chair made an opening statement which I think we, in, in this 24

respect reflects how most people feel...

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: Mm-hmm. 2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...and the 3 4 gentleman also indicated that CUNY's held in wide, 5 in high regard by most people. TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: Sure. 6 7 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Why would you equate them with Sony? Is that, is that ... 8 9 TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: No, no... COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: The Sony 10 situation, is that a fair comparison, CUNY versus 11 12 Sony? TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: No no no I don't 13 think it's so much a fair comparison but it was a, 14 15 it was a response to what is my background. So I do 16 think that, the same way that we're equating the Emmys which is a national, which is a national 17 organization, I have a chapter here that have 18 19 private sector companies that compete at that, at this highest level. I felt it would be appropriate 20 to equate some of the private sector companies to 21 display my background. So I don't think it's a 22 23 fair, definitely not a fair analysis. But what I 24 would say in that context is that there are people 25 there of color that do have the BA, that do have

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY the master's degree that are still are not on the 2 sea level as their white counterparts. So it's not 3 a question of me trying to equate Sony or anything 5 like that but it was to make a broader analysis of what I believe is a, a certain level of 6 disenfranchisement at CUNY TV. COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so 8 much Madam Chair. And may I say, I just have to do 9 this, that we've been joined by my mommy. My 10 mommy's here and I have to honor her. 11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh where is she? 12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: She's right 13 14 over there. 15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh hi mom. 16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So... Thank you 17 so much. CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. We've 18 been joined by Council Member Williams as well. And 19 we have a question from Council Member Cumbo and 20 then we're going to wrap this up and move to the 21 22 next panel. 23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Chair Barron. And I appreciate you giving us the 24 25 opportunity to have the presenters present before

1 ON TECHOLOGY

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

the CUNY representatives that way we're able to have a open dialogue where we're hearing all of the conversations and perspectives. I had a question in terms of in the, in the briefing notes that we have it talked about and you mentioned as well the African American Legends Program and it states here that the program does not to be currently in production as recent and upcoming episodes listed are re-airings and the digital archive for online viewings are from 96 to 2013. And then the other program Black Writers in America was listed as, the website says it does not list regular air times for Black Writers in America and there's no information about whether or not the show is currently in production. So do you have, do you have information in terms of out of how many shows are produced how many specifically out of that catchment area specifically focus on communities or, or people of color in their programming in comparison to the entire production of the, of the programs that come out? And also my second part of my question is is there any way or any open dialogue or conversation and this might be a question for CUNY as well, as are you able to see which programs get how much

- 1 ON TECHOLOGY
- 2 | funding or is that kept internal and it's not
- 3 transparent or do you know which programs get how
- 4 much in resources.

5 TYRIQUE WASHINGTON: [off mic] I will

6 | not answer that and... [on mic] allow the, I will not

7 answer that and, and I think that will be a great

8 question for the, the CUNY to, to be able to

9 answer. But no we don't have that access to that

10 | information.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

GOUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay. And I, I guess just in final in closing just more of a comment then not Council Member Barron too much to her credit has organized many hearings as it pertains to CUNY. And one of the challenges seems to be this kind of dialogue which is challenging for me because if CUNY is what CUNY is supposed to be and we're excited about CUNY and its possibilities I feel that the graduates that come out of CUNY should be so adequately prepared to have the level of diversity seen in the student body rise to the level of having executive level positions all throughout the administration here and beyond. So when we're talking about capital dollars, when we're talking about professors in

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY areas of higher ed and we're talking about students 2 transcending also into many of those programs and 3 right here which is a topic that we normally would 5 not focus a great deal of energy and attention on we're seeing the same exact thing. And so I 6 7 appreciate you bringing this to our attention and bringing this to light. An I certainly look forward 8 9 to working without chair on these issues that seem to be very prevalent throughout. So thank you very 10 much for your testimony. I thank you for your 11 honesty. And to the gentleman second in I, I 12 apologize that someone said to you that you need to 13 14 discontinue how many children you have versus the 15 idea of you coming forward and simply asking for a 16 raise and being told that maybe you should stop having children. So I apologize to you that that 17 happened and that's something that should never 18 happen to anyone. Thank you. 19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I want 20 to thank the panel for coming, for your testimony. 21 And we're going to call the next panel now. Thank 22 23 you. Okay. We're now going to hear ... next panel; Robert Isaacson Executive Director of CUNY TV, 24

Sonya Pierson Executive Director of the Office of

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	Human Resources and Labor designee for CUNY, and
3	Gary Pierre-Pierre Senior Producer at CUNY TV.
4	Thank you.
5	[pause]
6	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: If you would raise
7	your right hand I'd like to swear you in. Do you
8	affirm
9	[background comments]
10	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Do you
11	affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and
12	nothing but the truth in your testimony before this
13	committee and to answer members questions honestly?
14	[cross-talk]
15	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. You may
16	begin. I expect nothing less than media production.
17	Thank you.
18	ROBERT ISAACSON: [off mic]Good
19	afternoon. My name is Robert Isaacson.
20	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is your mic on?
21	Could you pull it closer? Okay pull it closer.
22	ROBERT ISAACSON: [off mic] Good
23	afternoon.
24	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Once again. Once
25	again. The red button in the front.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY ROBERT ISAACSON: [off mic] I'm pressing 2 3 it... [cross-talk] CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. 5 ROBERT ISAACSON: ...it's not working. CHAIRPERSON BARRON: There it is. 6 7 ROBERT ISAACSON: There it is. Okay. CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. 8 9 ROBERT ISAACSON: Good afternoon again. I'm Robert Isaacson, Executive Director of CUNY TV. 10 Madam Chair, Mr. Chairman, members of the 11 committees, and council members who have joined us. 12 Thank you for inviting me to talk about CUNY TV. 13 14 I'm here today with my colleagues Sonya Pierson who is Executive Director of Human Resources at CUNY 15 16 Central and Gary Pierre-Pierre a Journalist and Senior Producer at CUNY TV. They will also brief 17 you. CUNY TV is an independent award winning 18 19 noncommercial educational television station staffed by professionals. We operate channel 75, a 20 citywide cable channel reaching 1.7 million 21 households and a digital broadcast channel, channel 22 25.3 reaching seven million homes in the region. 23 Each channel's on 24 by seven. About three years 24 ago WNYE, the mayor's TV and radio operation needed 25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY to be moved from its Brooklyn facility. The New 2 York City, with New York City's approval the 3 university moved WNYE to CUNY TV at the graduate school of 5th Avenue and 34th Street. To accommodate 5 WNYETV we upgraded our facility without any funding 6 7 from the city of New York and in return WNYE assigned a broadcast channel, 25.3 and an HD radio 8 9 station to CUNY TV for its exclusive use. The new merged broadcast center is a state of the art 10 tapeless file server based operation. As stated in 11 the university's 2012 through 16 master plan 12 approved by the chancellor and the CUNY board of 13 14 trustees CUNY TV reporting to senior vice 15 chancellor for university relations has an 16 important mission, to present the rich diverse knowledge base of the university and talent of, of 17 the best urban public university system in the 18 country, I'm sorry, beyond its campus walls and 19 into the homes of New Yorkers in the region with 20 quality programming. Our trademark is lifelong 21 learning through quality television. Program 22 development is decided by the executive director. 23 Our executive in charge of production Gail Yancosek 24 her deputy Susan Igor [sp?], senior producers and 25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY at times with input from the senior vice chancellor 2 for university relations Jay Hershenson. The goal 3 is to reach audiences within the new demographics 5 of the city and the university. Our prime time schedule is listed every day in the New York Times 6 7 and we are often selected for highlights in the newspaper, in the paper's What's on TV column, 8 9 What's on TV Tonight column. Our programming has also been mentioned in the daily news and the New 10 York Post. Since January 2015 we have received 11 press coverage in nearly, nearly 60 times in a 12 variety of print and online publications. I would 13 14 like to pause for a moment now and show you a brief 15 video, montage of CUNY TV's diverse programming. 16 [music] TINABETH PINYA: Hello I'm Tinabeth 17 Pinya and welcome to CUNY TV. Operating broadcast 18 19 channel 25.3 and cable channel 75 CUNY TV produces award winning program for the community in Arts, 20 Science, Human Interest, and Public Affairs. 21 22 ...programs in their original language curates a weekly international film festival and acquires 23 content from national and international resources. 24

CUNY TV has garnered 13 New York Emmys, 56 New York

1 ON TECHOLOGY

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- 2 | Emmy nominations, and numerous local, national, and
- 3 | international awards. It has established
- $4 \parallel$ relationships with New York's ethnic and community
- 5 | media, New York City cultural institutions, and
- 6 | national and international news organizations that
- 7 serve these communities.

DONNA HANOVER: CUNY TV celebrates the arts every day. Our monthly magazine program; Arts in the City posted by Magalie Laguerre-Wilkinson profiles communities, people, and performers in everything from music and art to theatre, dance, and film. In partnership with the New York Times we bring you Times Talks, interviews with leading figures in literature, film, television, music, and more. On Theatre Talk, New York Post Columnist Michael Riedel and Susan Haskins chat with actors, playwrights, directors, and behind the scenes personnel. For art films and documentaries tune into programs like Classic Arts Showcase for a selection of music, dance, performance, and visual art. And our acclaimed international film festival City Cinematheque brings films from around the world right into the homes of New Yorkers.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON TECHOLOGY

TINABETH PINYA: Our Emmy nominated program, Asian American Life hosted by Ernabel Demillo is an in depth news magazine program that address topical issues affecting the Asian American Communities nationwide and profiles Asian American leaders. Tune into our New York Emmy Winner Nueva York, a program featuring interview an documentary pieces about Latino life and...

UNKNOWN FEMALE: Italics, a monthly series that features successful members of the Italian American Community. And Canapé, a French Cultural Magazine.

TINABETH PINYA: CUNY TV is also the home away from home for renowned programs produced abroad and aired in their native languages. Check out Mexico's legendary Tratos y Retratos and France TV 5's new series La Grande Librairie.

MIKE GILLIAM: If it's New York politics and public affairs it's on CUNY TV. Bob Herbert's Op-Ed dot TV is a weekly half hour program that takes a close look each week at a compelling contemporary issue. Journalist Sheryl McCarthy talks with newsmakers about their sources of inspiration. On Doug Muzzio City Talk you'll meet

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON TECHOLOGY

- 2 | the movers and shakers who shape our public policy.
- 3 And on the Eldrige and Company Ronnie Eldrige goes
- 4 | in depth with prominent New Yorkers. New York

1

10

11

12

13

14

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- 5 Developer Michael Stoler follows real estate trends
- 6 | in the tri-state region on The Stoler Report. Radio
- 7 | favorite Brian Lehrer explores the web's most
- 8 popular political blogs and podcasts along with the
- 9 hottest issues of the day on Brian Lehrer dot TV.

ABI ISHOLA: Our Flagship series Study with the Best hosted by Tinabeth Pina gives you an opportunity to learn about this great urban public university showcasing its students, alumni,

15 GARRY PIERRE-PIERRE: CUNY

faculty, and staff.

GARRY PIERRE-PIERRE: CUNY TV also produces two original Science Series... Science & U is an Emmy nominated monthly program that looks at science in our everyday lives. Science Goes to the Movies a new monthly series that looks at the science in contemporary motion pictures. There's also a wide range of special programs and documentaries to explore the most provocative subjects of the day in greater depth. Many of our original series can be seen beyond New York City on noncommercial TV stations across the country and

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY others reach national audiences on PBS like Black 2 Writers in America introduced by the late great 3 Ossie Davis African American writers reflect on their storied careers and creations. Irish Writers 5 in America profiles compelling authors of Irish 6 7 Decent who capture the literary imagination today. 8 ERNABEL DEMILLO: CUNY TV's own 9 independent sources is a weekly magazine program 10 that reports on the issues making headlines in New York City's ethnic and immigrant communities. Our 11 programming brings independent news and analysis to 12 New Yorkers as an alternative to mainstream mass 13 14 media. 15 TINABETH PINA: And there you have it. 16 That's just a sample of CUNY TV. Quintessential noncommercial television at its best 24 hours a day 17 365 days a year from the City University of New 18 19 York. UNKNOWN MALE: This is CUNY TV, the City 20 University of New York. 21 ROBERT ISAACSON: I'd like to take the 22 opportunity now to speak a little bit about CUNY TV 23 on students and how we work with them in three 24 major ways. The first is the Graduate School of 25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY Journalism. In approximately 2007 Chancellor 2 Goldstein asked me to design, CUNY TV to design the 3 technical infrastructure for the new Graduate 5 school of Journalism. When the school was opened in 2008 21 CUNY TV staff members were assigned to the 6 7 school full time to support the students' mastery of hardware and software technologies. In addition 8 for the past five years journalism students who 9 turn to broadcasting produced a monthly half hour 10 news magazine for CUNY TV in consultation with 11 their professors. The second is CUNY, CUNY TV 12 internships. Sever CUNY TV campuses offer 13 14 undergraduate broadcast programs and two campuses 15 offer MFA programs, those are masters in fine arts 16 programs. We often accept student interns for 17 either a semester or sometimes for a year. And some are hired when they graduate. CUNY graduates make 18 up 80 members of the 180 persons now currently on 19 staff. Many have been working at CUNY TV for more 20 than 15 years. And the last is college productions. 21 Baruch, John Jay, Brooklyn College, and Lehman 22 23 College provide us with their campus produced programs on a regular basis. Students participate 24 25 in these production either in front of or behind

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

ON TECHOLOGY the cameras. At the discretion of and guidance of their faculty. As a file server based facility we now have the advantage having archived, digitally archived 35 thousand hours of programming to start categorizing the content enabling us to create research websites. We're mining this data, this, this rich content. The first two websites we will publish are Education Forum which is a series of more than 100 programs that was host, that were hosted by the late honorable Herman Badillo former chairman of the CUNY Board of Trustees. The second is African American Legends, a collection of over 200 interviews hosted by Doctor Roscoe C. Brown Junior, an American legend himself. We will find more in this 35 thousand hours of programming and create research tools for our faculty and staff. Finally I would like to mention in addition to receiving 13 Emmy awards we are nominated for six more this year for a total of 56 nominations. The Emmy awards ceremony take place this Saturday night and we're looking forward to it. Our six nominations are for Study with the Best our flagship series about the university, its faculty staff, students, and programs. We are nominated for

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY the Best Education Program in the nomination 2 categories. For Nueva York for a segment on autism 3 in the Latino community. This is very near and dear 5 to one of the members of Nueva York who has an autistic child and she was just, it's very 6 7 emotional for me I'm sorry. And the Asian American Life series which we just launched we're doing a 8 9 segment on adoption of Asian children. And on Theatre Talk which is distributed nationally to 70 10 markets across the country and is a way an economic 11 engine for the city because people who come in as 12 tourist often want to go to a Broadway show. We 13 14 have an episode that's been nominated, the episodes is on Raisin in the Sun and it features Denzel 15 16 Washington and has an archival interview that we did with the late Ruby Dee. Finally the last two 17 nominations are for craft. One is for post-18 production editing and the last is for original 19 music composition which you've heard about from the 20 21 previous panel. I am very proud of everyone who works at CUNY TV and of the mission of lifelong 22 learning through quality television that we give to 23 the public. I'm grateful for the support from the 24 25 University for our efforts and I thank you for your

- 1 ON TECHOLOGY
- 2 | time. And now would like to have Garry Pierre-
- 3 Pierre talk a little bit about his experience as a
- 4 | senior producer at CUNY TV.

5 GARY PIERRE-PIERRE: Good afternoon. I'm

6 Gary Pierre-Pierre. Thank you Bob. Madam Chair, Mr.

7 Chairman, members of the committee, and council

8 members it's a pleasure to address you at this

9 | time. I'm a journalist and I'm the co-host and

10 producer of the show Independent Sources which I by

11 | the way which I think is one of the best shows on

12 | television public or otherwise but anyway I'm bias.

13 Independent Sources is a unique show in that it

14 | covers news and views about ethnic and immigrant

15 communities in New York City. At a time when media

16 | outlets in the city are cutting back on local

17 reporting it is really refreshing to be part of a

18 program that covers the city unlike any other. I

19 | joined Independent Sources at the show's debut in

20 2007 and it's been one of the best associations

21 I've ever had professionally. CUNY TV provided me

22 with an opportunity to explore new talents and

23 | skills. Since then I've learned the intricacies of

24 | television productions and the nuances of covering

25 | television, conducting rather television

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY interviews. There are few opportunities for print 2 journalists like me to make the transition to 3 television and I'm grateful that CUNY TV gave me 5 the chance to grow professionally. As one of the show's producers I travel across the city 6 7 documenting peoples' achievements and challenges particularly New, New Yorkers. I put the scores of 8 9 segments but I want to highlight a couple that 10 stand out to me. Last year I did a piece about the growing political cloud of the Bangladesh community 11 in the Bronx, not Jackson Heights Queens the 12 neighborhood widely associated as a Bangladeshian 13 14 clave. Another story that I'm particularly proud of was a recent interview that I did with the head of 15 16 the Zoroastrianism Church in New York City focusing on efforts to revitalize this ancient religion in 17 the metropolitan area. Immigration stories and 18 stories about immigrants are the focus of our half 19 hour weekly program. CUNY TV's commitment to 20 diversity does not stop inside its offices. We are 21 in the process of writing several grants to 22 23 increase our coverage of New York City at a time again when the city's newspapers and television 24 25 stations are cutting back by hiring graduate

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY fellows in our television programs at CUNY. You've 2 heard the statistics about the diversity of CUNY TV 3 or you will hear more about that. Let me tell you 5 how affirming it is to work at CUNY TV with people like Abby Schoeller [sp?], Zyphus Lebrun, Judith 6 7 Escalona, Waylu [sp?], Dash Henley, Sara Pizon, Nickie Miller, Crystal Law, and many others on the 8 9 staff. The staff diversity is... it transcends ethnicity and nationalities. And we also emphasize 10 that this is no small matter. I spent 12 years 11 working for daily newspapers including the New York 12 Times where I was part of the team that won the 13 Pulitzer Prize in 1993. I don't need to explain the 14 15 Pulitzer Prize to anyone do I? Okay. I thought so. 16 I left mainstream journalism to follow the Haitian Times in 1999. Eight years later I joined CUNY TV 17 Independent Sources. I've never been around such 18 19 diverse staff as I am at CUNY TV. As you know the mainstream media again do not represent the city, 20 the diversity of their communities. I'm proud to 21 say that CUNY TV and Independent Sources do. Thank 22 23 you. ROBERT ISAACSON: [off mic] My pleasure 24

25 now to introduce... [on mic] It's my pleasure now to

- 1 ON TECHOLOGY
- 2 | introduce Sonya Pierson, Executive Director of
- 3 Human Resources at the City University of New York
- 4 | Central Office.

5 SONYA PIERSON: Good afternoon. My name

6 | is Sonya Pierson and I am the Executive Director of

7 Human Resources for CUNY Central Office. I am

8 pleased to have the opportunity to join my

9 colleagues from the university in addressing the

10 | Committee on Higher, the Committees on Higher

11 | Education and Technology about employment practices

12 at, at CUNY TV including hiring, promotions,

13 management, and diversity. I will preface my

14 remarks with a brief overview of the university's

15 | employment policies and practices in this area.

16 Appointments to CUNY TV positions like other titles

17 | in the University's classified staff series are

18 governed by civil service law which requires that

19 as far as practicable classified staff positions be

20 | filled through examinations that ascertain relative

21 merit and fitness. To recruit the largest pool of

22 applicants vacancies for provisional appointments

23 as well as notification of scheduled examinations

24 | for permanent positions in the classified service

25 | are advertised widely on the CUNY website, in the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY chief, and our numerous job boards. Candidates for 2 both provisional and permanent titles in the 3 classified service must meet published minimum 5 qualifications in order to be eligible for permanent positions employees serving in 6 7 provisional titles must complete the competitive exam process. Once they have successfully completed 8 9 the exam process candidates are placed on an eligible list for possible appointment rank ordered 10 by their exam scores. Following publication of the 11 eligible list person serving in provisional titles 12 must be replaced within 60 days by candidates on 13 14 the certified list who are reachable. The employees at CUNY TV fall into four title series; the 15 16 executive compensation plan, classified managerial, hire education officer series, and classified 17 service. The majority or 66 percent are employed in 18 the broadcast associate title which is a classified 19 position with three assignment levels. Assignment 20 level is determined by the duties and 21 responsibilities of the position, qualifications, 22 seniority, and/or specialization. Since January 23 1st, 2014 eight percent of CUNY TV's employees have 24 25 received advancement either from hourly to full

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY time titles, level, level movement within title, or 2 3 appointment to a higher title. In the event that an employee believes that he or she is working out of 5 title the university has a process in place to review such claims. Interviews are conducted by 6 7 central office human resources with both the complainant and separately with the complainant's 8 9 supervisor to ascertain the actual duties and tasks being performed by the employee. The findings are 10 analyzed to determine if the level of work is 11 compliant with the job description and the results 12 are reported back to both the supervisor and the 13 14 employee with appropriate recommendations. As I, as 15 I previously noted an examination process is 16 required by law in order to fill a permanent classified staff position. The university is 17 currently conducting a job analysis of the 18 19 broadcast associate title in order to update the job description and develop an appropriate 20 examination. Going forward it is our intention to 21 offer an examination for the Broadcast Associate 22 title that will allow provisional employees the 23 opportunity to compete for permanent positions. In 24 25 addition we will be offering career development for

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY CUNY TV staff that will include test taking 2 strategies. In order to prepare staff for future 3 management opportunities we will offer them 5 professional development and a number of managerial competencies featuring courses such as Preparing 6 7 for Supervision, Fundamendals [phonetic], Fundamentals of Supervision, and Understanding and 8 9 Supervising staff. Finally I would like to point 10 out the diversity of the staff at CUNY TV which suggests the effectiveness of the recruitment and 11 selection process. Of its 180 employees 40 percent 12 are female and 45 percent are from protected groups 13 14 including six 16 percent Hispanic or Latino, 14 15 percent black or African American, 10 percent 16 Asian, four percent Italian American, and one percent American Indian. Females comprise 45 17 percent of the 118 employees in the broadcast 18 associate title, the racial and ethnic composition 19 of this title reflects 45 percent from protected 20 groups including 21 percent black or African 21 22 American, 16 percent Hispanic or Latino, seven 23 percent Asian and three percent Italian America. I want to assure you that we are committed to 24 25 sustaining a systemic presence of diversity,

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY inclusion, excellent, and, and, excellence and 2 opportunity at CUNY TV and throughout our entire 3 university. We continue to build on our strength as 5 a workplace that welcomes all and we look forward to working with the New York City Council to ensure 6 7 that these ongoing goals are met. Thank you. CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you so much 8 for your presentation. And I have some questions 9 and some of my colleagues do as well. We've been 10 presented with an organization chart and it states 11 Robert Isaacson is Executive Director. And then the 12 second level has a person's whose names I hope I 13 14 don't mispronounce, George Casturani Director of 15 Broadcast Operations Jay Schools at School of 16 Journalism, okay, Dan Reshef IT Director, William Laziza Executive Engineer, John Harvey Chief 17 Engineer, Saul Spicer Director of New Media, Gale 18 Yankasec [phonetic]... 19 20 ROBERT ISAACSON: [off mic] Close 21 enough. CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...Yankosec Executive 22 23 in Charge of Production, Adam Walker Director of Operations, Brian Capp Director of Programming, 24

Lauren Mussisio [sp?] Director of Development, and

	66
	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	Lisa Beth Kovetz Director of Special Projects.
3	Would those be the persons who are considered in
4	the management level?
5	ROBERT ISAACSON: Some of them. Some of
6	them have left.
7	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh some of them
8	ROBERT ISAACSON: Keep in mind that's
9	five years old.
10	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So some of
11	them have left. So with those that are still there
12	of the names that I've called they considered
13	management?
14	ROBERT ISAACSON: Pretty much so.
15	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Are any of
16	them black?
17	ROBERT ISAACSON: No.
18	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Are any of them
19	Latino?
20	ROBERT ISAACSON: But keep in mind it's
21	changed.
22	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Say again.
23	ROBERT ISAACSON: That's [cross-talk]
24	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.
25	ROBERT ISAACSON:five years old.

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Are there others
3	management level that belong in that tier that I
4	don't have?
5	ROBERT ISAACSON: Some of them were
6	moved down, some of them were moved up [cross-
7	talk]
8	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. In the level
9	of management that I've just
10	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yes.
11	CHAIRPERSON BARRON:cited
12	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yes.
13	CHAIRPERSON BARRON:are there others
14	whose names I don't have?
15	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yes.
16	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay could you give
17	me those names?
18	ROBERT ISAACSON: One that comes to mind
19	is Michael Serman. Michael Serman.
20	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And his position?
21	ROBERT ISAACSON: He is Director of
22	Engineering.
23	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Director of
24	Engineering. Okay that's an addition that's not
25	

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	the executive engineer that's, that's separate
3	titles.
4	ROBERT ISAACSON: No, separate titles.
5	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So I
6	appreciate your testimony and how great you have
7	the numbers and the percentage of female, protected
8	groups, and Italian American, black American,
9	African American, females associates. I'm
10	concerned about diversity in management, in
11	decision making positions. And I want to know how
12	it is that in 2015 it appears that we don't have
13	any. There was no time over the past number of
14	years, how many years have you served in this
15	position sir?
16	ROBERT ISAACSON: Since, since 1992 I
17	believe.
18	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: 1992. And during
19	that time you haven't had an opportunity to
20	encounter anyone whose qualifications and
21	experience and matching up to what CUNY's mission
22	is to apply or be eligible
23	ROBERT ISAACSON: To
24	CHAIRPERSON BARRON:for any of these
25	positions?

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY ROBERT ISAACSON: To some degree you 2 have to appreciate the structure of the university... 3 [cross-talk] 5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I, that's what we're talking about. 6 7 ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah... [cross-talk] CHAIRPERSON BARRON: The structure that 8 9 has... 10 ROBERT ISAACSON: I know that. I ... 11 [cross-talk] CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...prevented this 12 13 from happening 14 ROBERT ISAACSON: ...multiple appointments 15 and, and a certain form of tenor that people find 16 themselves in after a number of years not just professorial tenor. 17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right so over ... my 18 19 question is over, since 1992 have you not had an 20 opportunity, have you not sought out, have you not recruited, have you not tried to identify a black 21 or Latino person qualified to all of the conditions 22 23 that you've just cited to fill an important 24 position of making a decision and having the power 25 and authority...

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY ROBERT ISAACSON: I think that ... 2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...to serve in that 3 4 management level? ROBERT ISAACSON: I think that as the 5 university allowed CUNY TV to grow the bulk of the 6 7 diversified staff came in at a lower level and we're at a point now where they will rise. Some of 8 9 them will rise. CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You know... You know 10 there's, Martin Luther King wrote a book Why We 11 Can't Wait. 12 ROBERT ISAACSON: Mm-hmm. 13 14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: We've been waiting all this time and I... 15 16 ROBERT ISAACSON: Okay. CHAIRPERSON BARRON: It's wonderful now 17 that we're going to now consider when we're going 18 to have this examination. I didn't hear a timeline 19 as to when the exam... The first panel said they've 20 been asking for a number of years and have not had 21 22 an opportunity to have a schedule presented of the 23 one that... Do you have a date for when those persons 24 who are provisional and don't have the guarantees 25 of a permanent title who are working 32 hours, just

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY below what would it would take to be a full time 2 and get those benefits, do you have a date as to 3 when that would happen or is that still in the 5 planning and discussion stage? SONYA PIERSON: I don't have the date 6 7 certain but we've begun the job analysis. 8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right. How long do 9 you think that would take? A rough estimate. 10 SONYA PIERSON: The job analysis should take approximately a month. And once that's done 11 then the description is updated and then we develop 12 the exam and... [interpose] 13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What's the earliest 14 15 the exam could be developed? 16 SONYA PIERSON: I, I don't know that 17 off... [interpose] CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's not good 18 19 enough. That's not good enough. It's, it's been a 20 problem that has not been addressed all these years and we don't have a date certain by which we can 21 say... oh by October of this year it'll be ready. 22 23 That's not good enough. 24 SONYA PIERSON: I can get back to you

with a date but I don't have it with me.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay I appreciate 2 that. I have other questions but I'm going to allow 3 4 my colleagues to come in. First question will be 5 Cumbo followed by Williams. CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: No I'm the Co-6 7 Chair here... [interpose] CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh I'm sorry. I'm 8 sorry. 9 10 CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: No problem. CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I apologize. 11 CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: No problem. I 12 want to talk to you about our getting the word out 13 14 regarding CUNY Television. I'm Chair of the 15 Committee on Technology and perhaps you can go into 16 how CUNY is using technology and social media to advance your programming and to increase your 17 audience. 18 19 ROBERT ISAACSON: Every, well we have a Director of Communications who writes public 20 21 relations, press releases every week and submits 22 them and usually we get some nibbles from the New 23 York Times and other online publication. We also 24 have every show I believe has its own Facebook Page 25 and every show Twitters an that's how we're raising

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	consciousness about shows. We have no advertising
3	budget, not five cents.
4	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: Why is that?
5	Explain that to me.
6	ROBERT ISAACSON: It's, you know we have
7	a, we have a large budget that's devoted to staff
8	and, and some equipment you know operating money
9	but that's a luxury for us.
10	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: That's
11	interesting too, How do you know, how do you select
12	what goes online I wanted to ask. Are many of your
13	shows online if I, if I couldn't watch the show?
14	ROBERT ISAACSON: Everything that we
15	produce is on our website.
16	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: Okay.
17	ROBERT ISAACSON: When we acquire
18	something usually the rights don't include online.
19	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: Now I think you
20	mentioned digital archiving before.
21	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yes.
22	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: So how do you
23	determine what should be digitally archived?
24	ROBERT ISAACSON: Anything that we own.

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: Anything that
3	you own.
4	ROBERT ISAACSON: We own and produce
5	over the years, yeah. This, this digital archive of
6	35 thousand titles goes back 30 years.
7	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: The student, the
8	student internships
9	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yes.
10	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA::that you
11	mentioned. Do many of the students end up at CUNY
12	Television after an internship?
13	ROBERT ISAACSON: Well over the years.
14	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: Do you employ
15	students?
16	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah.
17	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: Are they, do
18	they get some kind of a consideration, preference,
19	explain to me what, what how you address
20	internships. Because many
21	ROBERT ISAACSON: We
22	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA::students go for
23	internships based on the possibility of
24	ROBERT ISAACSON: Sure.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: ...of getting a 2 3 job. ROBERT ISAACSON: Well I think we have a 5 pretty good record in, in, in accepting interns and if they want to stay with us and we have the 6 7 ability to put them on the payroll we, we will hire them. We, we try to take care of our own you 8 9 know and and grow them. CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: I often, I'm on 10 a cable show in the Bronx, Bronx Net. 11 ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah Bronx Net, sure. 12 CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: And the students 13 14 have input into the programming also. Do you give 15 students input into programming or, or ideas that 16 they may have in so much as producing a show? ROBERT ISAACSON: Well we, we leave that 17 to the campuses as I said in my, in my remarks. If 18 19 a show comes from the campus then it's the campus' responsibility to deal with the students as they 20 see fit. When they come to us as interns it's a 21 22 learning experience so their first you know getting hands on experience with equipment, they're 23 observing production and observing the production 24 25 process and then we see if we can fit them into,

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	some of them are interested in operation, some of
3	them are interested in production, some of them
4	like to go out on remotes or work in the studio. So
5	we see if, where we can, where we can utilize them
6	and if we can you know make a match we will hire
7	them.
8	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: Do the
9	internships fit into a structured degree program
10	that any of the colleges [cross-talk]
11	ROBERT ISAACSON: Some, yeah some of,
12	some of the students do a one semester internship
13	for credit, yeah. Sometimes they'll come back in
14	the summer and we'll give them a little job for the
15	summer.
16	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: And there are a
17	variety of disciplines that being an intern for
18	CUNY TV could fit into within CUNY? Is there a
19	variety of degree programs or is this
20	ROBERT ISAACSON: Usually they come from
21	the broadcast programs.
22	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: The broadcast
23	program.
24	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah.

CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: Okay.

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah.
3	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you Mr. Co-
4	Chair. We'll now hear from Council Member Cumbo
5	followed by Council Member Williams.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you both
7	two co-chairs Barron and Vacca. My question is one
8	that I wanted to follow-up with that I asked
9	earlier. How many programs does CUNY actually
LO	produce itself?
L1	ROBERT ISAACSON: I would say percentage
L2	wise about 35 percent of the programs.
L3	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: 35 percent of the
L 4	programs you produce yourselves.
L5	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yes.
L 6	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And that means
L 7	out of those 35 programs
L8	ROBERT ISAACSON: About 35 percent.
L 9	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: 35 percent
20	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah yeah.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO:of the total
22	programs that
23	ROBERT ISAACSON:television programs
24	on the air.

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO:are aired on the
3	television program
4	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO:are the ones
6	that you produce.
7	ROBERT ISAACSON: Right, correct.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: How many is that
9	in terms of a number?
10	ROBERT ISAACSON: Titles? Probably 15.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So you produce
12	15
13	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO:programs
15	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO:through CUNY.
17	ROBERT ISAACSON: Most are weekly, some
18	are monthly and that's a function of budget.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: How many of those
20	are programs of, that are produced in nature around
21	subject matter impacting African American, Latino,
22	and Asian communities.
23	ROBERT ISAACSON: Well there's Asian
24	American Life
25	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	ROBERT ISAACSON: There's Nueva York.
3	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: Excuse me, you
4	must include Italian Americans [cross-talk] since
5	we are part of the protected groups.
6	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah yeah.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: That's right.
8	CO-CHAIRPERSON VACCA:: Thank you.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.
10	ROBERT ISAACSON: I said Asian American
11	Life
12	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.
13	ROBERT ISAACSON:Nueva York, Italics
14	those are the three.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.
16	ROBERT ISAACSON: Okay. And we, we have
17	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Say them, I'm
18	sorry say them again because I was Uh-huh.
19	ROBERT ISAACSON: Asian American Life,
20	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Uh-huh.
21	ROBERT ISAACSON:Italics, Nueva York,
22	African American Legends. Now there is a, you know
23	Roscoe has been working with us for gosh more than
24	25 years and you know Roscoe has slowed down a
25	little bit at this point and

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You are talking
3	about Doctor Roscoe Brown?
4	ROBERT ISAACSON: Doctor Roscoe Brown,
5	well he's a friend you know so… a very dear…
6	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: But for the record
7	we would like to have
8	ROBERT ISAACSON: Doctor Roscoe Brown,
9	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.
10	ROBERT ISAACSON:for the record,
11	Junior. Okay.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And what is the
13	total amount that CUNY spends on the programming
14	that it produces itself?
15	ROBERT ISAACSON: The total budget of
16	CUNY TV is 13 million dollars a year.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.
18	ROBERT ISAACSON: Of that 13 million
19	Well we, we're also responsible for outside of the
20	academic side of the Jay School, we're responsible
21	for the technology side of the Jay School.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.
23	ROBERT ISAACSON: That's about two
24	million. So it's hard to define how each program is
25	funded because they're all funded from a pool. from

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	that pool. So I can't say that we spend X on this
3	and Y on that you know
4	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: How do you make
5	that determination?
6	ROBERT ISAACSON: It's the amount of
7	people that work on a show.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And how do you
9	make that determination?
10	ROBERT ISAACSON: It, it depends on how
11	many people are needed to get a show done over the,
12	you know over the course If it's a monthly show
13	there may be a few less. If it's a weekly show
14	there may be a few more you know staff members to
15	that show. But there's no, there are no real
16	resources on top of that. They're not given a
17	production budget.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I guess I could
19	keep walking that question back
20	ROBERT ISAACSON: Sure.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO:in terms of
22	saying
23	ROBERT ISAACSON: Go ahead.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: How at a certain
25	point do you say this seems like a program that

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY would require 20 people, we want it on the air 2 twice a week. We want it to have repeat viewership. 3 We want it to have this ... 5 ROBERT ISAACSON: When it gets to that 6 point... COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm. ROBERT ISAACSON: ... I go back to the 8 9 well. 10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm. ROBERT ISAACSON: I ask for some more 11 12 money. COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay. Well 13 14 perhaps one of my colleagues can ask the question 15 better than I so I, I will move on with that. Are 16 you content right now with the four programs out of the 15 that you mentioned? Are you content with the 17 level of diversity that those programs represent 18 19 out of the 15? Or... 20 ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah... COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: ...do you, or do 21 you feel challenged by it? 22 23 ROBERT ISAACSON: No... 24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And you feel that we, we've got to do more or we've got to do... 25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY ROBERT ISAACSON: Well we can always do 2 more. There's no question about it. But I don't 3 consider those four separate from the others. COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm. 5 ROBERT ISAACSON: Because a program like 6 7 Brian Lehrer's program which is a weekly program... 8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm. 9 ROBERT ISAACSON: ...contains tremendous diversity within it. 10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm. 11 ROBERT ISAACSON: A program like, you 12 know like Bob Herbert's program Independent Sources 13 14 also contain tremendous diversity within it. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm. 16 ROBERT ISAACSON: So you know they, they may not have that, that branded name... title of the 17 program but there's diversity in everything. And 18 19 I'm very proud of that you know. That's what the university's about. And that's what CUNY TV is 20 about. 21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm. 22 23 ROBERT ISAACSON: You know we are, we are a, a, an electronic extension of the 24 25 university's mission.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And the programs 2 also that were mentioned in terms of Black Writers 3 in America... 5 ROBERT ISAACSON: Right. COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: ...and, and some of 6 7 the other programs that, that were mentioned in terms of our briefing what are the status of those 8 9 programs? ROBERT ISAACSON: Let me speak to that 10 11 okay? COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. 12 ROBERT ISAACSON: Black Writers in 13 14 America came out a, a... I don't remember if it was 15 every two years or every four years there was a 16 conference at Medgar Evers... COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Yeah. 17 ROBERT ISAACSON: Okay. And we went out 18 19 there one, one year, this was 12 years ago maybe more and we camped out and we took a, we took an 20 office in one of the buildings and we dressed it up 21 as a studio I mean this is really grass roots kind 22 of stuff. And we caught over the three or four day 23 24 period of the, of the conference we cherry picked 25 certain authors and brought them in and did these

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY interviews okay. We went back, we did all the post 2 production, we packaged it into eight half hours. 3 And then we offered it to PBS. And in those eight 5 half hours there were phots. There were film clips. Walter Mosely did many films so we, we had to 6 7 achieve and buy the rights and we did that out of operating money. But that lasted for five years. We 8 9 bought five year rights. The total cost of the 10 rights was about 100 thousand dollars. We offered it to PBS. And at that point PBS had an adult 11 learning service transponder. So for the five years 12 that we had the rights every February during Black 13 14 History Month that series was played across the 15 country. 16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm. ROBERT ISAACSON: Everybody loved it. 17 Everybody played it. And then when it went out of 18 19 rights we were in a kind off a lean year period, a lean budget period and we did not have the money to 20 re-up the rights. So it is now in our library and 21 22 as long as it's not broadcast rights we can, we can

use it and, and, as a resource for research. If

somebody's doing a paper on Walter Mosely there's

20 minutes of Walter Mosely talking about some of

23

24

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	the books that he's written and people can use
3	that. We just can't broadcast it.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member
5	Barron and I recently went to Medgar Evers for the
6	conference and we've
7	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO:seen such
9	speakers as Angela Davis and…
10	ROBERT ISAACSON: Right.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Daniel McLover
12	[phonetic]
13	ROBERT ISAACSON: Right.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO:and many others.
15	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah we haven't been
16	back there to do that but we should go back there
17	to do it.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Is it because
19	they don't have an interest in it being done
20	anymore or is there a decision that's being made to
21	say that's not where we're going to put our
22	resources?
23	ROBERT ISAACSON: No. No no we just, the
24	producer did that. I've asked him a number of
25	times. This is the same producer that, that does

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY Nueva York and he just became the chairman of the 2 MFA program, well about a year ago the chairman of 3 the MFA program at City College. So he's got a lot 5 on his plate. But we, we'll get ... COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I would like to 6 7 see... and, and I'm sure you don't have it today but if we could see a budget breakdown of the 8 9 television programs and how resources are allocated that would be very helpful to us. 10 ROBERT ISAACSON: It's all out of a pool 11 there's, a show has a number of people on staff... 12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm. 13 14 ROBERT ISAACSON: There is no budget to 15 buy you know a whatever for that particular show. 16 If anything is needed it comes out of a pool. But there's very rarely anything on the shows that we 17 produce there, there are very, there's very rarely 18 any rights issues that we have to deal with you 19 20 know and, and purchase rights. Yeah we, we do have a grant now that we, we have from the Sloan 21 Foundation. 22 23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm. 24 ROBERT ISAACSON: And we're doing a show

called Science Goes to the Movies. And we've

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	cleared rights to all the trailers for current
3	movies and, that are in the theatres. And we're
4	talking about Science embedded into feature films.
5	It's going quite well.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Well I hope that
7	we can bring Black Writers in America back into
8	that
9	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO:mystical pool of
11	sorts and we
12	ROBERT ISAACSON: Okay.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO:can make sure
14	[cross-talk] that they have some opportunities to
15	present there as well. [cross-talk]
16	ROBERT ISAACSON: It may, it may be
17	easier to do another one then to go and try to
18	retrieve the rights to all the pictures and re-up
19	them so
20	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I think so.
21	ROBERT ISAACSON: The next time, the
22	next time you have a conference we'll be there.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.
24	ROBERT ISAACSON: Okay.

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Before Council
3	Member Williams starts following up on Council
4	Member Cumbo's question, since it, I didn't quite
5	understand your answer to what is the budget that
6	is allocated or connected to these programs that
7	are aired. So is there a budget and can we get for
8	example what was spent last year for these
9	programs, these 15 programs that you have?
10	ROBERT ISAACSON: Budget [cross-talk]
11	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: In terms of what
12	was a dollar amount that was spent.
13	ROBERT ISAACSON: The, the budget
14	[cross-talk]
15	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: For each of the
16	programs.
17	ROBERT ISAACSON: The budget is the
18	people. Now [interpose]
19	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay so what is the
20	dollar amount for the people associated
21	ROBERT ISAACSON: I can't tell you off,
22	I can't tell you off the top of my head. We, we can
23	get you that information but
24	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	ROBERT ISAACSON:we do, we do acquire
3	programming. We do buy programming for a rights
4	period. So we can subtract that out of the total
5	budget and then we can figure out [cross-talk]
6	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.
7	ROBERT ISAACSON:how much the totality
8	is is, the total budget is for in house production.
9	But it's… [cross-talk]
10	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.
11	ROBERT ISAACSON:basically people.
12	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: It's basically
13	people.
14	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah it's basically
15	people yeah.
16	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So who was it
17	who produced Doctor Roscoe Brown's program African
18	American Legends? Who was the producer for the
19	program? He was the host. Who was the producer? Is
20	that person still around?
21	ROBERT ISAACSON: Sure.
22	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay so I don't
23	think Doctor Roscoe Brown has had that program, any
24	segments current for the last maybe
25	ROBERT ISAACSON: About a year.

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: A year?
3	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah.
4	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So my concern is
5	that for a year we've had to rely on rebroadcast
6	ROBERT ISAACSON: Right.
7	CHAIRPERSON BARRON:of program and not
8	had any new programs and certainly there are lots
9	of topics that have occurred in the past year that
10	could have been brought to that platform, to that
11	setting that could have been aired. So I think that
12	there's
13	ROBERT ISAACSON: In, in, in that show
14	[cross-talk]
15	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I think that
16	there's an opportunity here
17	ROBERT ISAACSON: In
18	CHAIRPERSON BARRON:to make sure that
19	we have current
20	ROBERT ISAACSON: In that show
21	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: If I could finish
22	my point.
23	ROBERT ISAACSON: Sure. Sure.
24	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I think there's an
25	opportunity here to make sure that we don't miss

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	timing of current critical issues, that they can be
3	incorporated in an airing such as this format that
4	would keep people informed and not rely on what has
5	been done in the past and it's outstanding and
6	certainly so.
7	ROBERT ISAACSON: Are you, are you
8	suggesting in that show title?
9	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Perhaps, yes.
10	ROBERT ISAACSON: Well [cross-talk]
11	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: If we had someone
12	who had that creative imagination
13	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah.
14	CHAIRPERSON BARRON:and ability to
15	see
16	ROBERT ISAACSON: Right, well
17	CHAIRPERSON BARRON:how that could
18	happen.
19	ROBERT ISAACSON:I out of, out of
20	respect for Doctor Brown I will not put anybody
21	else into that show title as a, as a host until I,
22	I know that I can. And right now I won't do that.
23	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right so for a
24	year
25	ROBERT ISAACSON: So, so, so

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes. 2 3 ROBERT ISAACSON: ...so we're running 4 repeats and there's some wonderful programs in 5 those 200 shows that we can show. And a person like Bob Herbert will take issues and, and bring on the 6 7 appropriate guest to, to address those issues that are contemporary to our times and show, and so will 8 9 Sheryl, Sheryl McCarthy and you know we achieve it 10 in that, in that way. CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right. 11 ROBERT ISAACSON: But... 12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: But I think ... 13 ROBERT ISAACSON: ...Roscoe's show ... 14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Mm-hmm. 15 16 ROBERT ISAACSON: ...Doctor Brown's show is Doctor Brown's show until he says I don't want 17 18 it anymore. 19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Fine. But I think we've lost an opportunity for a time slot that 20 could have in addition to what is archived and 21 filed could have had a new opportunity if someone... 22 23 [cross-talk] had that creative thought or to see that here's a void, here's a vacuum, and here's an 24 25 opportunity.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY ROBERT ISAACSON: We are, we are filling 2 3 the vacuum. 4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: It hasn't been 5 filled in a year. That's my point. ROBERT ISAACSON: But we're, we're 6 7 talking the same thing in a sense. I'm saying that 8 I will not fill the show titled African American 9 Legends until Doctor Brown makes up his mind what 10 he wants to do. He is a little under the weather and when he decides that he either wants to retire 11 from the show or continue that show I will not turn 12 that show into anything else. So we're, we're 13 14 dealing with the issues, the contemporary issues in other formats. 15 16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: With that understanding I think again we've missed an 17 opportunity to create, think imaginately 18 19 [phonetic], think forward to be able to have another opportunity to in the interim have a show 20 that would address those kinds of current issues in 21 addition... 22 23 ROBERT ISAACSON: Okay. 24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...to...

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY ROBERT ISAACSON: We are both... [cross-2 3 talk] CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Mr. Herbert's show 4 5 that exists. ROBERT ISAACSON: We are both hearing 6 7 each other. Thank you. CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Council 8 9 Member Williams. COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you 10 Madam Chair, Mr. Chair. Thank you for your 11 testimony. I do want to give a special thank you to 12 Mr. Pierre-Pierre for the work you've done in media 13 14 and ancient media in particular. So I, I get tired 15 of diversity hearings. But I get more tired of 16 having to have diversity hearings. So hopefully there'll be one day when the situation is fixed 17 where I don't have them. But until them I'm very 18 thankful that the chair has decided to bring this 19 to light. I do have to say that what I saw here was 20 appalling. I know that there's diversity and 21 22 diversity was pointed out. It usually is a 23 diversity the more you go to the bottom the more diverse it is. And CUNY is not unique and that 24 25 happens all over. But I would, and want to hold

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY CUNY in higher regard and so I think they should do 2 even better. But this chart, this chart is 3 appalling. Like I didn't expect to see this. It was 5 actually very stunning when I saw it. And I want to focus... although there are several protected 6 7 categories I do want to focus on black and Latino because those communities are affected in the 8 9 workplace, in the stores they go to, in the communities they live in in a way that no one else 10 is. So this is one, two, three, four, five, six, 11 seven, eight, nine, 10, 11, 12 if I have counted 12 correctly senior staff members. Not one of them are 13 14 black or Latino. Are you going to say that this is 15 justifiable. 16 ROBERT ISAACSON: I'm going to say it's five years old and it's changed. 17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay in 2011 18 would you say that this chart was justifiable? 19 20 ROBERT ISAACSON: It was in revision and it's changed. 21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: It was not. It 22 23 was not justifiable in 2011. It is not justifiable now. Even though it has changed I still haven't 24 25 heard that you say it is changed and does now have

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY a black or Latino or several included in that. So 2 has the change occurred where there is diversity 3 with black and Latino people in the senior staff? 5 ROBERT ISAACSON: In the top, not yet. COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: That is... I mean 6 7 CUNY services this population in a way that no other institution does. We continually say that and 8 9 we're very proud of it. But when it comes to this 10 either the education that CUNY is giving is not good enough to black and Latino people or we're not 11 hiring them and they're going somewhere else. Can 12 you explain to me how we can be educating this 13 14 population and that your chart looks like this. 15 ROBERT ISAACSON: I think you need to 16 understand... COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I would like to 17 understand, that's why I'm asking. 18 19 ROBERT ISAACSON: Okay. I'm going to ask Sonya Pierson to explain the, the way contracts 20 work and the way that people are positioned in 21 certain titles. 22 23 SONYA PIERSON: Okay so for the current composition of senior management there are eight 24 people and there are, they're all white. The people 25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON TECHOLOGY

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- 2 | have been with CUNY TV for a very long time. Some
- 3 of them started in hourly positions and they, and
- 4 | they moved up. So the most recent person who was
- 5 | hired it was 2008. So since that time there have
- 6 been no changes in senior management. There have
- 7 been no positions that have opened up for senior,
- 8 for that section of CUNY TV.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: If this chart was in the 1970s I think it would have been appalling. So you've gone back to few, few dates to try to explain... I think there's, there's no way to excuse what's happening here. And these are the folks that are actually making decisions and too often in, in our communities we are told that someone else can tell the stories better, can make the decisions better than the affected communities. And I just, I don't, I don't, I don't know what to say. I still have a lot of love for CUNY and I always will but the diversity is a problem, particularly the higher up you go throughout the institution. I have never, I don't think I remember seeing as bad as this particular staffing chart. Usually one or two people thrown in so we can make a show of it. This one doesn't even do that. And so COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON TECHOLOGY

I hear this response a lot. It takes time. The way

it works. There's some mechanisms we have to go

through. It's, I hear it throughout the administration. I hear it throughout when I ask these questions. You know it's 2015. If we haven't worked through the mechanisms I'm not sure when we will. I think the chair asked some questions about when tests were being taken, there was no answer to that. Now I don't want to spend too much more time but I, this, you should not be proud of this. And you should have come in describing how we're going to fix it. And in terms of the budget it would have been good if we were coming into a CUNY TV hearing to have some information about how much it costs so we can have the conversation a bit more intelligently. With that thank you for the work that you are doing. But we, I think you, I think everybody here knows that this is not acceptable.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Just before Council Member Gibson asks her question... Are these management positions, are they civil service positions, the ones that you're talking about, the eight positions, are they civil service?

25

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON TECHOLOGY

2 SONYA PIERSON: Two of them are, three 3 of them are.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Three of the eight are civil service. So the others moved up...

SONYA PIERSON: Oh three, three are classified civil service, and then one is classified managerial.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay thank you. Council Member Gibson.

much Chair Barron and Chair Vacca. I appreciate the chance to be here and... your leadership. Thank you CUNY for being here and certainly I won't, I'll belabor and continue to be repetitive but I will say as a CUNY graduate of Baruch, as someone who continues to fight for higher education, as a former member of the State Assembly who was always a champion for higher education we certainly can do a lot better. And so I take this hearing as really an opportunity to understand the challenges that we have faced all these years and the fact that even at this hearing I guess I would have appreciated that CUNY had been a little bit more prepared. If we're having a conversation about CUNY TV, the lack

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY of diversity, promotional opportunities, 2 opportunities to grow within the CUNYTV family I 3 would have appreciated a little bit more detail on 5 how we can better prepare. And so now a lot of the comments that you will get from us are going to be 6 7 questions that you're not able to answer but certainly are going to keep having this 8 9 conversation. So let me just get to one quick question. And you know we all have this graph 10 that's five years old. A lot of the, the staff, the 11 executive staff that are here as you have described 12 are seasoned veterans who have been here. So I 13 14 quess my number one question is if there are no 15 opportunities to grow in terms of getting at the 16 top, there are no current vacancies what can we do to create new positions of management? Is that 17 possible? And can we make that happen? 18 19 ROBERT ISAACSON: I would think that's a function of budget and we will look into that. 20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay so we're in 21 the midst of a budget season now and so that's why 22 it's important to bring these questions up. Because 23

if we're having a conversation about growth and

25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY opportunity and there's a cost it's something the 2 council will need to know. 3 ROBERT ISAACSON: State budget. 5 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: State budget, okay. So that's even, we're past that season now. 6 7 ROBERT ISAACSON: Right. COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Another question 8 9 I wanted to ask and I noticed that the majority of 10 the staff you have are in the position of broadcast associates right, at CUNY TV. And that is a 11 provisional position, position correct? So many of 12 them are in these provisional positions and I 13 14 assume that many of them have been there for more than nine months? 15 ROBERT ISAACSON: That's for sure. 16 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: That's correct? 17 So I think it may have been raised already but 18 you're aware of the state law that says that you 19 know we cannot have provisional staff in place for 20 more than, is it nine months that they cannot be in 21 that position? Is that the case? So is it up to 22 CUNY to provide the civil service exam that would 23 24 be necessary to shift these provisional staff out 25 of that current title?

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY SONYA PIERSON: Yes. 2 3 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Is that how it 4 works? 5 SONYA PIERSON: Yes. COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: So do, I think 6 7 you may have asked and I apologize so we're looking at a timeline on when a civil service exam will 8 9 come? 10 SONYA PIERSON: Yes... COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, okay. 11 SONYA PIERSON: ...get back to you with 12 13 the exact date. COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay I just 14 wanted to make sure. And I think Council Member 15 16 Vacca talked a little bit about but I'm a huge fan of, of internships. I got my start as an intern in 17 Albany at SUNY and that's how I was able to get to 18 19 the New York State Assembly which ultimately got me here. Most of my current staff in my district 20 office are all former interns and many are through 21 the CUNY different programs like the Tony Rogalski 22 program and others. So my question is in terms of 23 24 formatting and content of your current shows how 25 involved are students and do you have a number of

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	internship opportunities and does that particularly
3	lead to employment opportunities at CUNY TV?
4	ROBERT ISAACSON: In my Thank you. In
5	my remarks it was noted that of the 180 members of
6	the staff 80 of them were former students in the
7	university. So I think on that, and probably a good
8	percentage of those 80 were interns so that we
9	could observe them and work with them and then hire
LO	them.
L1	COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay.
L2	ROBERT ISAACSON: So yeah I think we're
L3	pretty good on that.
L4	COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: And are they
L5	involved in the actual developing of the shows as
L6	well?
L7	ROBERT ISAACSON: Well if they're hired
L8	and they're on staff now they could be doing any
L9	number of things.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay.
21	ROBERT ISAACSON: They could be
22	technical people who like and enjoy doing
23	operations.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY ROBERT ISAACSON: Or they could be 2 creative people or craft people. 3 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: And the 5 internship program I imagine is ongoing so with the enrollment increasing and further opportunities at 6 7 internships that number I imagine would would grow 8 right? 9 ROBERT ISAACSON: The problem is space is the final frontier. We have some space problems 10 so we can only take on a certain number of interns 11 in the space that we have. There was mention of 12 certain members of the staff not having desks and 13 sitting in a, sort of like a, let's go back to the 14 15 previous administration, a bullpen type of spite, 16 space. So we, we are kind of restricted to how many interns we can take. 17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay. 18 19 ROBERT ISAACSON: Sometimes it's five and sometimes there's, sometimes there's less. 20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Could you talk 21 just a little bit about the promotional 22 opportunities to grow within CUNY TV from the 23 different levels of broadcast associate to other 24

positions. How often does that growth happen? So is

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON TECHOLOGY

2 there a certain timeframe that a person would be a
3 broadcast associate before they move up.

ROBERT ISAACSON: Sonya has some detail on that.

SONYA PIERSON: Generally movement between levels it happens when the job changes or if you become a senior producer or if you supervise staff. But those, when those requests come in we look at them, we gather information, and then we have an independent review by our classification unit of all of the duties and then they come up with a recommendation.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay. So I guess there's just so much going on and to talk about but I guess I would just emphasize the real importance and the unique opportunity we have here. We need to keep having this conversation about diversity, about qualified people rising to the top. We all know the decisions are made at the top. And we want the reflectiveness to rise to that level where we can say that there is diversity and also not just cultural diversity but also opportunities for women as well which I'm very supportive of. So I appreciate your presence here and you know

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY certainly the numbers just reflect the work that 2 must continue to happen. And you know I speak for 3 myself and not my colleagues but consider us as 5 partners in this. We don't need to come back to this table two months later and have the same 6 7 disappointing numbers. I want these numbers to get better. If we can help you as a council as partners 8 9 then we want to do that. But you have to give us 10 the information. Coming to us unprepared is not acceptable. We need to make sure that we have 11 numbers, we have detail, so that we can see how 12 best that we can help you in the council as we're 13 14 in the season of this budget here at the council. 15 So I appreciate your work. And thank you CUNY has 16 been a huge part of my life and I'm thankful for the education that I got at CUNY. So I thank you 17 for your presence here. And thank you to our 18 19 chairs. Thank you chairs. CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Just 20 before we move to Council Member Williams. In the 21 previous panel one of the panelists said that they 22 23 moved from I think, they moved to the position of Senior Editor but there was no additional 24

compensation that was attached to that. How did

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON TECHOLOGY
that happen? As I'm listening to you you said
people move up so that's not
SONYA PIERSON: It depends on all of the
factors. You know I would have to review that case
specifically. But we look at the duties, we talk to
the supervisor, and we have the independent review.
CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay so we'll give
you the particulars and we could get further
clarity as to how that happened. Council Member
Williams you have additional questions.
COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: thank you very
much. You mentioned Michael Serman, Director of
Engineering.
ROBERT ISAACSON: Yes.
COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: When was that
position created?
SONYA PIERSON: It's been a couple of
years.
COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So it was
created after the chart was
ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah.
COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS:changed? So

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	ROBERT ISAACSON: Yes because somebody,
3	someone left the position. So it wasn't an
4	additional position.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So the chart
6	that we have here, in the chart that we have here
7	from 2011 doesn't have the position of Director of
8	Engineering.
9	ROBERT ISAACSON: That's correct.
10	Somebody was in that position after that chart was
11	established, that person left. And then Serman took
12	the place of that
13	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: That position
14	was created however after 2011?
15	ROBERT ISAACSON: After, after 2011.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So we did
17	create a position after this chart?
18	ROBERT ISAACSON: Right, correct.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: And there's
20	one, two, three, four, five, six, seven, eight,
21	nine, 10, 11 positions. You said there's now eight.
22	ROBERT ISAACSON: There's now eight
23	yeah. Three
24	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So
25	ROBERT ISAACSON:have dropped down.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So we can fill 2 3 that? ROBERT ISAACSON: No no three have 4 5 dropped down to a different, second level. COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: They kept the 6 7 same salary? 8 ROBERT ISAACSON: Yeah. 9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. Alright 10 I hope when we have these discussions that there's a discussion on how you plan to fix it. And that's, 11 that's what kind of struck me even more like there 12 wasn't a, there should've been at least a Maricopal 13 14 [phonetic] or whatever you want it call it... this is 15 bad. And this is what we're doing to try to fix it. 16 And I haven't hear that. So I don't even know... into the pipeline create... I don't know what's going on 17 to address this. And so I'm hoping if we, if and 18 19 when we have this discussion again that will be 20 addressed because it has to be addressed. There's, there's no doubt about that it has to be addressed. 21 ROBERT ISAACSON: Well we're going to 22 have internal discussions I'm sure. 23 24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: The, the

programs that were mentioned from African American

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE 1 ON TECHOLOGY Legends, Black Writers... all those programs, are 2 they all currently in production? 3 ROBERT ISAACSON: African American 5 Legends is on hold. Black Writers is, is from the past. We have, we've done some acquisitions. We 6 7 just stopped showing a series called Great African 8 American Authors which we acquired from a, I don't 9 remember the source. We have shown lots of 10 different series from Europe; Euro Arts Jazz Series with Miles Davis, Jimmy Hendricks, fantastic 11 series. We've done Caribbean Folk Tales... series 12 from Caribbean Television Association, a series of 13 14 films from the Black Films Foundation Series, 15 series of local black independent films. So we are 16 constantly looking for content to put on the air that represents all of the different groups that we 17 are needing to represent. 18 19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: But some of the 35 percent that my colleagues spoke about and 20 were shown up here even though we use it here 21 they're not currently in production. 22 23 ROBERT ISAACSON: No everything that was

on the screen is in production.

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Everything
3	that's on the screen
4	ROBERT ISAACSON: Except for Black
5	Writers and, and
6	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So everything
7	wasn't on there, everything except that one.
8	ROBERT ISAACSON: I'm sorry.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Everything
10	except the one you're saying was in production.
11	ROBERT ISAACSON: Black Writers is not
12	in production.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay.
14	ROBERT ISAACSON: Okay. African American
15	Legends is on
16	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay.
17	ROBERT ISAACSON:hiatus at the moment.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay.
19	ROBERT ISAACSON: Everything else is in
20	production.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: And they had
22	some question about whether those programs had
23	digital archives for online viewing, so do they all
24	have digital archive?
25	

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	ROBERT ISAACSON: They're being
3	formatted now to be their own websites. They will
4	have, yeah. You can go in and source the now
5	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay.
6	ROBERT ISAACSON:but we're going to,
7	we were going to you know brand them as websites.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: You talk about
9	a second layer of management.
10	ROBERT ISAACSON: Right.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Can you talk
12	about that and who's on there?
13	ROBERT ISAACSON: Not off the top of my
14	head, no.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I just will
16	revert back to what my colleague Council Member
17	Gibson said. If we're going to have this discussion
18	it'll be good to have this, this information.
19	ROBERT ISAACSON: Okay.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you
21	Madam Chair.
22	CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you Council
23	Member. I do want to thank you for coming. As you
24	have heard we have lots of issues, lots of
25	concerns. We're not satisfied with the status as it

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON TECHOLOGY

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

is. We want a time table for the exams that will be brought forth. We want to also engage you in conversation as to what other, what other ideas we can make, we can engage in to achieve diversity in management, senior management so that we can see a reflection of black and Latinos in those decision making power positions. We know that CUNY, we heard how great the diversity is among students, amongst the lower rungs of the panel of, lower rungs of the employees here but that's not good enough. And as has been said we did ask you to come prepared and we don't think that your preparation was adequate. And we do hope that you'll be able to supply us with the information that was requested. We did ask for the overall budget, the organizational structure, diversity in budgeting, wage issues and disparities, who determines programming and content, what type of outreach... well you did answer that one. So we, we will reframe those questions for you again and we look forward to working collaboratively with you to fix this problem because I feel that this is a great disservice. And in New York City where the mayor talks about closing the gap and doing away with the income

	COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1	ON TECHOLOGY
2	inequality and having equity we have to make sure
3	that CUNY is in the forefront of making that a
4	reality. So we thank you for coming and for your
5	testimony and we look forward to the responses to
6	the questions that we've posed. Seeing that there
7	are no other panelists, no other persons offering
8	testimony. We will conclude this hearing. Thank
9	you.
LO	[gavel]
L1	
L2	
L3	
L4	
L5	
L6	
L7	
L8	
L9	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	

CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date _____May 7, 2015