

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON AGING

----- X

April 15, 2015
Start: 10:13 a.m.
Recess: 11:49 a.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Room
14th Floor

B E F O R E: MARGARET S. CHIN
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Maria del Carmen Arroyo
Karen Koslowitz
Deborah L. Rose
Chaim M. Deutsch
Mark Treyger
Paul A. Vallone

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Caryn Resnick
Deputy Commissioner for External Affairs
New York City Department for the Aging - DFTA

Karen Taylor
Assistant Commissioner
Bureau of Community Services
Department for the Aging - DFTA

Jordan Press
Policy Director
NYC Department of Housing Preservation & Development

Raymond Hodges
Deputy Director of Planning
Division of Special Needs Housing
Housing Loan Program
NYC Department of Housing Preservation & Development

Robert Piccolo
First Deputy Commissioner
Mayor's Office for People with Disabilities
Author of Inclusive Design Guidelines: New York City

Edith Prentiss
Legislative Vice President
Disabled in Action, DIA and DNYC Board Member

Maggie Castro-Stevens
Associate State Director for AARP

Lisa Morgenroth
Co-Chair for the Design for Aging Committee
NYC Chapter of American Institute of Architects - AIA

Christine Hunter
Principal
Magnusson Architecture and Planning
Co-chair for Design for Aging Committee
NYC Chapter of American Institute of Architects -AIA

Andrea Gianfani [sp?]
Live On New York

Melissa Munoz-Patterson
Regional Aid for Interim Needs - RAIN

Molly Krakowski
Director of Legislative Affairs
Jewish Community Relations Council - JASA

2 [sound check, pause]

3 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Okay, ladies and
4 gentlemen, we're going to--about to start. Make sure
5 all the cell phones are turned into silent. Thank
6 you.

7 [pause]

8 [gavel]

9 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Good morning. I'm
10 Council Member Margaret Chin, Chair of the Aging
11 Committee. I'm pleased to be joined today by Council
12 Member Andrew Cohen, who's the sponsor of the Reso
13 that we are talking about today. Today, the
14 Committee will be hearing two pieces of legislation.
15 Both addressing the critical question of how we
16 ensure that our seniors can continue to age in place
17 in New York City. Seniors overwhelmingly wish to
18 continue to live in their homes and community as they
19 age. Yet, many live in apartments that are
20 unaffordable on limited income, and are ill equipped
21 to handle mobility and other physical challenges that
22 come with growing older. According to DFTA,
23 disability raters for older New Yorkers are slightly
24 higher than the overall senior population in the
25 United States. Over 25% of seniors reported a

2 physical disability affecting such activities as
3 walking, climbing stairs, reaching, lifting and
4 carrying. However, 36% of residents 60 and older
5 lives in buildings without elevators, and 40% live
6 without grab bars. As the city's senior population
7 grows, the need to adapt housing will become
8 increasingly important.

9 Introduction No. 702 introduced by our
10 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito and myself will help
11 provide building owners with important information on
12 modifications and improvements that may be made to
13 dwelling units to allow more senior tenants to
14 continue to live safely and comfortably in their
15 apartment. DFTA would be responsible for working the
16 Department of Housing Preservation and Development,
17 the Department of Buildings, and those advocates who
18 have been doing valuable work in this area to create
19 and distribute a guide that will help building owners
20 ensure seniors live in a safe environment.

21 This morning we will also hear Reso 426
22 introduced by Council Members Cohen and Rosenthal,
23 which calls on--upon the State Legislature to pass
24 and the Governor to sign legislation eliminating the
25 Sunsets Provisions related to the income threshold

2 increases for the SCRIE and DRIE programs. As you
3 know, last year the City increased SCRIE and DRIE
4 income threshold from \$29,000 for SCRIE and \$29,484
5 per household for DRIE to \$50,000 for all households.
6 According to the Department of Finance, this made
7 13,403 new households eligible to have their rent
8 frozen, and keep it affordable for them to remain in
9 their homes. Unfortunately, the state law, which
10 authorizes to City to expand this eligibility is set
11 to expire in July 2016. If the State does not
12 permanently extend the income threshold, the ability
13 of thousands of households to afford their rents will
14 be seriously affected. We strongly urge Albany to
15 act to allow seniors and individuals with disability
16 to stay in their homes. I thank the Administration
17 for joining us today, as well as advocates who
18 continue to champion these important issues.

19 I would also like to introduce well,
20 Council Member Deutsch from our committee who just
21 joined us. Good morning. And I would like to have
22 Council Member, the sponsor of the resolution to say
23 a few word.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you, Chair
25 Chin. I just really wanted to come today and thank

2 you personally for your leadership on this issue and
3 giving this resolution a hearing. I want to thank my
4 colleague, Helen Rosenthal for working
5 collaboratively to get this resolution. Albany did a
6 great thing by expanding the income eligibility for
7 SCRIE and DRIE, but for reasons only known to the
8 ways of Albany, there is a sunset provision in this--
9 in this--in the new law. And seniors and people on
10 DRIE, people with disabilities, don't need to live
11 under a cloud of instability. These increases have
12 made DRIE and SCRIE accessible to thousands of new
13 New Yorkers who were previously not eligible. But
14 they need the stability. They need to know that they
15 can rely on SCRIE and DRIE into the future. So, this
16 is a common sense amendment that will keep these
17 people out of the back and forth Albany, you know,
18 passing bills in the middle of night. Midnight in
19 July when we'll be going--all try going up to Albany
20 to find out if we can expand--whether this will be
21 renewed or not. If they would move this sunset
22 provision, people would know that they could rely on
23 SCRIE and DRIE. I think that there is broad support
24 in the Council and I appreciate you having a hearing
25 today. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Thank you, Council
3 Member, and I also wanted to thank our Committee
4 staff, Eric Bernstein our Counsel, James Subudhi our
5 Policy Analyst and Dohini Sompura our Finance
6 Analyst. We invite the Administration, we invite the
7 Deputy Commissioner for DFTA, Caryn Resnick, our
8 first panel. Karen Taylor, Assistant Commissioner;
9 Jordan Press from HPD, and Ray Hodges from HPD. The
10 Committee Council will swear you in. Thank you.

11 COUNSEL BERNSTEIN: Would you raise your
12 right hand, please. Do you affirm to tell the truth,
13 the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your
14 testimony before this committee, and to respond
15 honestly to council member questions?

16 JORDAN PRESS: I do.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: I do. Good
18 morning, Chair. Am I on? Yes. Good morning
19 Chairperson Chin and members of the Aging Committee.
20 I am Caryn Resnick, Deputy Commissioner for External
21 Affairs of the New York City Department for the
22 Aging. And I'm join today by Karen Taylor, Assistant
23 Commissioner for the Bureau of Community Services at
24 DFTA, and Jordan Press and Ray Hodges from the New
25 York City Department of Housing Preservation and

2 Development. Thank you for the opportunity to
3 discussion Intro No. 702 in relation to requiring the
4 development of a guide for building owners regarding
5 aging in place. Seniors represent the fastest
6 growing segment of New York City's population.
7 According to New York City's census data, New York
8 City's older adult population includes 1.4 million
9 people over the age of 60. Between 2000 and 2030 the
10 population of those 60 and over is expected to
11 increase by more than half. In addition, nearly 32%
12 of all older New Yorkers report challenges with
13 mobility and self-care. A primary concern for
14 seniors in New York City is housing. Most older New
15 Yorkers prefer to continue living in the present
16 homes and communities as they grow older. As the
17 population of older New Yorkers continues to
18 increase, homes and communities become more and more
19 important in the aging process as well.

20 There are a number of resources, and
21 literature by aging advocacy organizations, academic
22 institutions, trade associations, design firms and
23 other groups that provide recommendations for
24 successful aging in place. Given the divers needs of
25 the older adult population, aging in places resources

2 propose a range of home modifications to address
3 physiological changes that are associated with aging
4 such as changes in sensory perception, strength,
5 flexibility, mobility and cognition. A report issued
6 by AARP, for instance, references that doors can be
7 too narrow for a walker or a wheelchair. Lighting
8 can become insufficient for safe cooking. An oven
9 can be out of reach for an individual with reduced--
10 reduced flexibility. And exterior stairs can make
11 entry and exit difficult.

12 The Alzheimer's Association recommends
13 installing a hidden gas valve or circuit breaker on
14 stoves. Using an automatic thermometer to monitor
15 hot water temperature, and adding extra lighting in
16 entryways, hallways, stairways and bathrooms. These
17 are some examples of the various resources in
18 relation to--in relation to safe aging in place. To
19 prepare the city for the aging boom, Age-Friendly NYC
20 was launched as a collaboratively initiative by the
21 Bloomberg administration, New York City Council and
22 the New York Academy of Medicine. Since the fall of
23 2007, Age-Friendly NYC has been working to address
24 this trend, and meet the challenges of growing older
25 in New York City. The goals of Age-Friendly NYC

2 were to re-access the City's responsiveness to the
3 needs of older New Yorkers, develop recommendations,
4 and implement strategies that allow New York to
5 sustain and enhance its status as an Age-Friendly
6 city.

7 In August, 2009, the City announced 59
8 initiatives to make New York City more Age-Friendly.
9 One of the Age-Friendly initiatives was to promote
10 the use of universe design guidelines through
11 Education and awareness efforts. The Mayor's Office
12 of People with Disabilities, MOPD, along with DFTA
13 and other agency partners released Inclusive Design
14 Guidelines: New York City publication in November
15 2010. I have a prop so you can see it. [coughs]
16 The mayor--the book is a New York City blueprint for
17 universal design. The aim of the guidelines is to go
18 beyond the requirements of the City's updated
19 building code to create more user-friendly and safe
20 buildings and landscapes that improve the quality of
21 life for everyone including children, older adults,
22 and individuals with disabilities. The IDG, which
23 can be used both as a standalone publication and in
24 conjunction with the Building Code, contains
25 recommendations for all use and occupancy

2 classifications especially residential and commercial
3 buildings. Many topics are covered including basic
4 building components, roots and building elements;
5 plumbing elements and facilities; communications
6 elements and features; selected spaces, furnishings
7 and equipment and dwelling and sleeping units.
8 Building on the successes of Age-Friendly NYC, the
9 Administration looks forward to working with the City
10 Council and the Academy of Medicine as we embark on
11 the next phase of this initiative.

12 As in the past, the Commission will be
13 comprised of leaders in a variety of fields including
14 business, education, law, architecture, healthcare
15 and aging. Currently, we are working together on re-
16 launching the Age-Friendly NYC Commission. The
17 Administration shares the concerns prompted--
18 prompting the introduction of Intro No. 702, a
19 successful and safe aging in place is of paramount
20 importance. Similar to the IDG publication issued by
21 MOPD, which was the result of an Age-Friendly
22 initiative, the development of an aging in place
23 guide, as this bill requires, can be part of the next
24 phase of Age-Friendly. Developing an authoritative
25 guide for residential building owners on aging in

2 place specific to New York City will require
3 technical expertise and resources outside of DFTA's
4 capacity. The public/private partnership under Age-
5 Friendly, which encompasses architectural and other
6 expertise is well suited for this endeavor. Thank
7 you again for this opportunity to provide testimony
8 on Intro 702, and I'm pleased to answer any questions
9 that you may have.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, and
11 we've been joined by Council Member Koslowitz. Does
12 HPD have any testimony or are you just here to help
13 answer questions?

14 JORDAN PRESS: [off mic] No testimony.
15 [sic]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay, thank you.
17 Any of my colleagues wants to ask any questions
18 before I start. Council Member Deutsch?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: [off mic] I
20 have none.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: All right, I'll
22 start. Has the Department of Aging, DFTA, previously
23 worked with architects and specialists on how to work
24 with building owners. Have you ever confronted with
25

2 this issue about making apartments more Age-Friendly
3 on Age-Friendly modifications?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: Only by way
5 of the Age-Friendly NYC initiative, and I know you're
6 going to hear later from our--the architects in
7 Aging. So yes, as under the Age-Friendly rubric,
8 there was a committee--you'll hear about it--that has
9 begun to address many of these ideas. But the
10 department not directly.

11 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: But what do you--I
12 mean what do you have right now? Do you have any
13 kind of resources right now that--that can assist
14 DFTA in creating this guide?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: No, we
16 don't.

17 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: So when you talked
18 about the Age-Friendly initiative so it's--so we're
19 asking the private sector to help create this?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: I mean
21 with--HPD can chime in. You know, there is certainly
22 expertise within city government. So you will hear
23 today from MOPD, Robert Piccolo and, of course, my
24 colleagues at HPD. And there are many existing
25 guides and, you know, we've done a cursory look at

2 the literature, and I think working with architects
3 in Aging as well as AARP and other organizations
4 that, you know, combined certainly, you know, the
5 knowledge base is out there. But it currently does
6 not reside within DFTA. We would have to go to the
7 experts to gather the material.

8 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Has HPD or DFTA ever
9 consulted with building owners on making
10 modifications for senior tenants? And are there any
11 like major challenges that landlords have expressed
12 about these modifications?

13 RAYMOND HODGES: Not that I'm aware of at
14 HPD. You know, we have design guidelines for senior
15 buildings for the senior projects that we fund, but--
16 but not in the--yet right for new construction. But
17 not in the way that you're talking about.

18 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: So no landlord has
19 ever come forth and asked you for help with
20 modifications?

21 RAYMOND HODGES: I mean they must I'm
22 sure, but not--not to me directly, but--

23 [pause]

24 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: But is there--does
25 DFTA or HPD receive any kind of federal or state

2 funding to assistance landlord and/or seniors in
3 making modifications and repair?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: We have two
5 very small home repair programs, and I'm not actually
6 sure where the funding comes from.

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: [off mic]
8 Community Funds and your foundation. Community
9 Development Block Grant is federal, and the Council
10 is council. [sic]

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: Yeah, so
12 one is Council funded. The Net Council's Home Repair
13 Program, and the New York Foundation for Senior
14 Citizens also has a small contract, which is through
15 the Community Development Block Grant, which is
16 federal. But together, these don't total a million
17 dollars. So they're very, very small, and they do
18 very minor home repairs. This would not be, you
19 know, a full on home modification. Perhaps the
20 installation of grab bars, but, you know, lighting.

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: [off mic]
22 And one is only for homeowners.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: And one is
24 only for homeowners, not for landlord/tenant.

2 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: So the--the one in
3 the--the one that's available to assist homeowners is
4 also a very small grant? I mean to do--like to do
5 what, grab bars and--?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: Lighting,
7 small--small repair jobs.

8 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: So it doesn't seem
9 like there's anything out there that--that right now
10 that can give people some guidance or make people
11 aware that, hey, that this is something that needs to
12 be done.

13 JORDAN PRESS: So the federal funding
14 that HPD receives so for example federal home grants
15 from HUD are usually on the opposite side of the
16 spectrum are used much more broadly for major--for
17 major projects. Right now, we're really just using
18 it for--for new construction and for down payment
19 assistance. It can also be used for rehabilitation
20 of buildings. But, again, we're looking at putting
21 homes towards major rehabilitation work, and not just
22 kind of, you know, more unit by unit kind of
23 modifications. I did also want to mention, though,
24 the--our senior citizen home. I'm forgetting the
25 name, it's called SCHAP S-C-H-A-P, Assistance

2 Program, which provides no interest loans to senior
3 citizens to make home repairs. I believe it's up to
4 \$40,000--

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER TAYLOR:

6 [interposing] Yes.

7 JORDAN PRESS: --which--which is a
8 program that we do have. Again, it's for homeowners,
9 senior citizen homeowners. So it--it doesn't tackle
10 the issue that I know that the committee is concerned
11 about, which would be for--for senior renters where--
12 where the landlord-- You'd--you'd essentially be
13 asking the landlord to be making the repairs to the
14 units.

15 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: [off mic] But I mean
16 that's--that's like a program that you could expand,
17 right because it's homeowners. So if a building
18 owner wants to do some modification in the building
19 in apartments for seniors, could they come and apply
20 for the loan?

21 JORDAN PRESS: So that--that program is
22 too small and targeted toward--because it's a loan to
23 a homeowner if we were to--we would have to create a
24 new program to do--to do those kinds of
25 modifications. You know, where in a rental building

2 now with HPD provides a loan, it comes along with a
3 regulatory agreement for extended affordability. It
4 also comes with income restrictions. So, it would
5 just be a--a longer conversation to have. And
6 sometimes landlords are just simply--simply not
7 interested in signing a regulatory agreement for
8 extended affordability or putting units into rent
9 stabilization simply to get that cheap money, if you
10 will, from--from the city.

11 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: But you might be able
12 to create other programs that can offer incentive,
13 you know, to help landlords--the good ones. Help
14 them to [laughter]--

15 JORDAN PRESS: [interposing] Yeah, yeah.
16 Listen we--

17 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: --help them to fix
18 the, you know, to modify their apartment so that a
19 senior can age comfortably in place.

20 JORDAN PRESS: Yeah, so, I would say that
21 the Mayor's Housing Plan has a--a special place for
22 seniors, and it recognizes the need for senior
23 housing. In his State of the City Address, the Mayor
24 referenced the preservation or creation of 10,000
25 senior units. There's--there's a, I think

2 significant interest in this issue, and we really
3 appreciate this kind of dialogue with the committee,
4 and your interest and your pushing us to--to, you
5 know, to think this way. So, to that degree, I
6 think it should--it should be, you know, a continued
7 conversation about how--how our preservation programs
8 can work, you know, along these lines.

9 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: I mean--I mean that's-
10 -that's one of the--the reasons for pushing for an
11 aging in place guide is that to really compile, you
12 know, all the information and all the expert advice.
13 So it's not going through a big book or like looking
14 for different, you know. resources. Some place where
15 it's simple. There's a guide available of what
16 people can do, and also resources that they can
17 access to help make it happen. And I think this way
18 the Mayor is talking about preservation. This is
19 preservation. It's the preservation of affordable
20 housing for seniors.

21 JORDAN PRESS: [interposing] Yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: We definitely want to
23 build more housing, but it takes a long time to build
24 housing. No matter how much we build, it's never
25 going to be enough. So we have to preserve what we

2 have also. So we've got to find some creative way,
3 and we'll hear from advocates and experts late. But
4 we definitely want to work with DFTA and HPD, and
5 really make it a priority for people to consciously
6 think about modifying and fixing those apartments so
7 that seniors can age comfortably in place. And since
8 all of us are going to get there. This is something
9 that's guaranteed. Some of us already are or are
10 going to become seniors. Some of us are already
11 there. So we need to create those--those housing
12 units. So we're--we're looking forward to working
13 with you on that. Any questions from my colleagues?
14 Oh, we're joined by Council Member Rosenthal. Any
15 questions?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well, thank
17 you. I mean so as always, I mean thank you for your
18 input on that, Jordan, but is that something
19 specifically that you would be willing to--that you
20 guys are working on, this notion of a no-interest
21 loan for a landlord who in whose property there are
22 units that could be renovated for seniors to age in
23 place?

24 JORDAN PRESS: Well, the--the no interest
25 product is a product for senior homeowners. Whether

2 we can make it work within existing preservation
3 programs, which--which do come along with a favorable
4 interest rate, I would need to consult with my
5 preservation team about--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
7 Yeah, yeah.

8 JORDAN PRESS: --how that--how that might
9 work.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Is it in the
11 hopper of things you guys are working on?

12 JORDAN PRESS: Not to my knowledge, but
13 let me go back and check.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: What would be
15 the downside? Do you think landlords are just not
16 interested?

17 JORDAN PRESS: I think that--I think that
18 it's a matter of the scope of changes that you would
19 need to do to a unit. If you're talking about
20 inputting grab bars and modifying doorways, you know,
21 do you really need a loan from the city in order to
22 accomplish that? I--I don't know what that--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
24 And bathrooms.

2 JORDAN PRESS: Yeah, I mean I don't--I
3 don't know what the take-up rate would be. So, I'd--
4 I'd need to go back to my experts on that.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay. Thank
6 you.

7 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Council Member
8 Deutsch.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Just to follow
10 up on the no-interest loan questions. Three things.
11 Number one, where does the money come from? How much
12 money is available, and how many people actually are
13 using this to take up loans. And number four, how--
14 how do you advertise this?

15 RAYMOND HODGES: The SCHAP Program I
16 don't know the exact number, but it's between a half
17 million and a million dollar annual funding, and I
18 think it's City Capital. It's not home. Yeah, and
19 in terms of the--the number of people on a given year
20 to take advantage of it, I'm not--that I don't know
21 but we could--we could get that to you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yeah, I think
23 that's important if you can get all those numbers,
24 the figures and if you could get it to the committee.
25 This way we could let our constituents know. I think

2 it's a very good program if people take advantage of
3 it. But, you know, I think it's--we should know more
4 about it.

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Just to--
6 just to add tot hat, both the SCHAP program as well
7 as the New York Foundation Community Development
8 Block Grant Program are for one to four-family
9 homeowners. So small buildings.

10 JORDAN PRESS: We've--we've done 680 shop
11 loans since the beginning--beginning of the program,
12 which started in the late 1990s.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Could we--could
14 we get like a what areas that they come from, you
15 know, where these are given to. Brooklyn, Bronx? I
16 mean, which part of the five boroughs, if it's spread
17 out?

18 JORDAN PRESS: Sure.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: iPhone--iPhones
20 are amazing, right.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: Blackberry.
22 [laughs]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Blackberry.

24 JORDAN PRESS: It was in my testimony
25 from yesterday on foreclosure prevention.

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: Oh,
3 finally.

4 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Very impressive--

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK:
6 [interposing] Yeah.

7 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: --if you could answer
8 a question just like that. But I think that I mean
9 the--the point is that it's great to have these
10 programs, and we want to make sure more people know
11 about it. Especially now, definitely homeowners they
12 can use more help, and we want to help seniors age in
13 place. We've got to make sure that they know about
14 these programs. I think Council Member Rosenthal you
15 wanted to ask something about the SCRIE questions?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Right. So,
17 today the other thing that we're looking at is
18 eliminating the sunset for the increased income level
19 to \$50,000 or \$51,000 DRIE and SCRIE recipients. Do
20 you know how many more people have been helped by
21 increasing the rent cap?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: I don't
23 actually. We'd have to ask the Department of
24 Finance.

1 COMMITTEE ON AGING

27

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I was just
3 looking around. Is anyone from the Department of
4 Finance here? Okay. Does--or does your office, the
5 Mayor's Office of People with Disabilities maybe do
6 you have that information on many more DRIE--

7 ROBERT PICCOLO: [off mic] No, the same
8 thing, you'd have to go to the Department of Finance--
9 -

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
11 Finance.

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO: --to get a
13 summary of what's actually happening.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay.

15 JORDAN PRESS: We can--HPD administers
16 the--the SCRIE program for people in Mitchell-Lama
17 Housing and we can get you the numbers--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Oh.

19 JORDAN PRESS: --for the--the increase
20 within--that we've administered.

21 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: [off mic] Oh, good.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay, have you
23 found that--what have you guys been doing at DFTA to
24 increase communications about it? To get the word
25 out?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: So, we have
3 been working very, very closely with the Department
4 of Finance on a whole outreach and education
5 campaign. They've produced a lot of literature. We
6 have been distributing it. It went into every meal,
7 to our home delivered meals clients. We have it
8 posted in all of our senior centers. I think we've
9 Tweeted and re-Tweeted on social media staff. We
10 have a small outreach team at the agency, and so we
11 have partnered with the Finance SCRIE outreach team,
12 and we're out at fairs, and we are just doing mass
13 distribution. And I know that Finance is doing some
14 very targeted outreach and trying to do mailings to
15 actually pinpoint where potential folks are living in
16 rent controlled--rent stabilized housing, and trying
17 to reach out directly. So there's been a lot of
18 outreach going on.

19 JORDAN PRESS: HPD has also been doing
20 SCRIE workshops and SCRIE and DRIE workshops in
21 conjunction with our partners at our sites, and also
22 out of the DOF Campaign for Freeze--

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK:
24 [interposing] It's the Freeze Your Rent Campaign.

2 JORDAN PRESS: It's the Freeze--it's the
3 Freeze Your Rent button. It's--it's very good, and
4 we've added it as well to our website.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Do you have a
6 sense of how many people you've enrolled since the
7 law changed.

8 JORDAN PRESS: Yeah, that's--that the
9 number that--

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK:
11 [interposing] Well, we don't enroll.

12 JORDAN PRESS: Well, we--we do.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: Oh, you do?

14 JORDAN PRESS: Yeah, we--we do, and I can
15 get you that number.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: It's not in
17 your Blackberry?

18 JORDAN PRESS: No, it's not in my
19 Blackberry.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: You didn't
21 talk about it at the foreclosure thing yesterday?

22 JORDAN PRESS: It was in my--my budget
23 hearing prep, but not for this one.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great, and are
25 you signing up seniors at senior centers?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: Absolutely.
3 Wherever we can sign up seniors, we do. So we have
4 applications on site in centers. We have our
5 outreach team that goes to every health fair and town
6 hall, and community event, and is armed in our case
7 management agency. So we're always armed with SCRIE
8 applications, and helping people fill them out.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay. Could
10 you--would it be possible for you to list the ones
11 that you've gone to? Because I can't--and sort of by
12 Council District, and I'm thinking in my district I'm
13 sure. There are a couple of senior centers that I
14 haven't heard from as getting help with outreach on
15 SCRIE.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: Well, the
17 centers themselves should have the ability to help
18 people.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yes, indeed,
20 but sometimes they need help.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: Okay.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay. I think
23 we have a couple in my district, Lincoln Square
24 Neighborhood Center--

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK:

3 [interposing] Uh-huh.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --for example.

5 Okay, great.

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: We can
7 certainly set something up, and send out a team.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well, it's not
9 just that. I mean those are examples in my district,
10 but it would be great to see for every Council
11 District sort of where you've been. So that the
12 council members could see where there's--where there
13 are gaps. Okay. I think I'm going to leave it at
14 there. Thank you very much.

15 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Question? The other
16 question I have for HPD that you're here is that I'm
17 really curious. Do you have any data on Mitchell-
18 Lama Program that--that exited the program. There
19 were people who--I assumed there were people who are
20 seniors that had SCRIE. When they exited the
21 program, did they lose their SCRIE benefit. I mean
22 when the landlord exited the program?

23 JORDAN PRESS: I--I would want to check
24 with my SCRIE team, and get back to you.

2 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Yeah, yeah if you can
3 like get back to us on that because if HPD managed
4 the SCRIE program for Mitchell-Lama--

5 JORDAN PRESS: [interposing] Right.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER: --it would be
7 interesting to look at, you know, all the Mitchell-
8 Lama that were exited, you know that exited the
9 program. What was the--was there like loss of
10 applicants?

11 JORDAN PRESS: I--I believe it would
12 continue, but I mean the SCRIE.

13 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: [interposing] Yes, if
14 it was continued, and the other thing we ask because
15 we are looking at legislation right now to see if we
16 can expand the program to sort of include that, all
17 the seniors that lived in Mitchell-Lama that left the
18 program.

19 JORDAN PRESS: Uh-huh.

20 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Because I don't think
21 they qualified because when we were very excited
22 about the--income, you know, the cap was raised to
23 \$50,000 we were all like celebrating that some of the
24 buildings that exited Mitchell-Lama they said they
25 didn't qualify.

2 JORDAN PRESS: For--for new registration?

3 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Yeah.

4 JORDAN PRESS: For new registration
5 that's correct.

6 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Yeah, so if you have--
7 if you still have data on like how many are still in
8 the program from the Mitchell-Lama buildings--

9 JORDAN PRESS: [interposing] Okay.

10 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: --then that would be
11 good. Because we're trying to get them back into the
12 program. Is there any data on how many units of
13 housing in New York City are specifically adaptive
14 for senior living?

15 JORDAN PRESS: Not that I know of.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: Maybe of
17 new construction there may be. I don't know.

18 [background comments]

19 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: No, no--absolutely no,
20 except for senior buildings. I guess for senior
21 buildings are adaptive. But when you were talking
22 about the whole Age-Friendly idea, the whole idea of
23 universal design. So are--is HPD requiring that now
24 in all new construction whether they're a senior
25 building or not? I mean if we could implement that,

2 right, then we don't have to worry about retrofitting
3 later on.

4 RAYMOND HODGES: Right, all of our units
5 have to be adaptable. So they, you know, they have
6 the ability to be, you know, to add grab bars and
7 take the counters out from under the sinks and that
8 sort of thing. So they're--they're ready to go, but
9 they're not all built that way from day one.

10 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Okay, but they still
11 need modification.

12 RAYMOND HODGES: Right.

13 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Is there a way to do
14 it where you don't have to do modifications later on?

15 RAYMOND HODGES: I should say also, too,
16 that those design requirements are sort of specific
17 to disability requirements not sort of specific to
18 what I would think that, you know, the types of
19 design recommendations that a team that was
20 specifically looking at aging would--would put
21 together under this initiative. So it would be a
22 little bit--a little bit different.

23 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Oh, okay. Well,
24 we'll--we'll ask the experts later on that.

25 RAYMOND HODGES: [interposing] Yeah.

2 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Yeah.

3 [background comments]

4 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Oh, could we ask the--
5 the representative from the Mayor's Office for People
6 with Disability, can you join the panel.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO: Sure.

8 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Just to answer some
9 questions. How com you didn't--how you're not part
10 of the panel. [laughter]

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO: They ran
12 out of space.

13 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: The Council will have
14 to swear you in.

15 COUNSEL BERNSTEIN: Can you raise your
16 right hand, please? Do you affirm to tell the truth,
17 the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your
18 testimony before this committee, and to respond
19 honestly to council member questions?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO: I do.

21 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Council Member
22 Rosenthal.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you. I
24 just sort of want to check in with you on this, and
25 see how you feel about how the outreach is going for

2 people with disabilities in terms of them signing up
3 to get DRIE.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO: To my
5 knowledge, it's been pretty effective. I don't have
6 the numbers, but our office has reached out through
7 the Internet primarily, all the advocacy groups
8 through DFTA. But again, I don't have the numbers,
9 but we were celebrating also. When the--when the
10 ceiling was increased, we were very happy about that
11 our office has been fighting for.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So the
13 mechanism you use for outreach is through the
14 Internet?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO: It's one of
16 the methods. I mean wherever we held--hold meetings
17 we discuss this. It's one of the topics that comes
18 up. So we're in constant communication with the
19 advocacy groups.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Do you sign
21 people up. Does--do you have experts in your office
22 who can sign people up for DRIE or do you travel with
23 the people from the Department of Finance?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO: Well, we
25 have one housing expert because we're a small office.

2 It's only nine people. So one of the--one of the
3 staff members specializes in housing. And part of
4 the problem that we had was that we were getting a
5 tremendous number of questions from people with
6 disabilities about how to sign up? What do they do
7 and all that. So we had tried to defer them to the
8 Department of Finance. So it seems like they need
9 more people to answer questions. They need to speak
10 to a real person on the other end, and to have a--a
11 more open and clear communication about the program.
12 That's just my general opinion.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So how many
14 calls do you think your office got?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO: Over a
16 year? I don't know. Probably it had to be a few
17 hundred. At least a couple hundred.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And you refer
19 them to the Department of Finance?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO: It's a
21 little informal. We try to help the applicant fill
22 out applications where they're having problems. It's
23 hard to tell. We don't know if someone has a
24 cognitive disability, and sometimes we sort of have
25 to read between the lines. We can't ask about their

2 condition. So if it's a person with disability and
3 they're having a hard time, we try to help them as
4 much as possible. But there's a limitation because
5 of the number of people in our office. And there are
6 a lot of people that want to sign up for that program
7 so--

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I don't want
9 to get you in trouble--

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO:
11 [interposing] No, I don't want to get in trouble.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --but are you
13 asking for more staff for the Mayor's Office for
14 People with Disabilities? If you had more staff, you
15 could do your job--you could reach out to more
16 people.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO: Maybe more
18 dedicated people on the Department of Financing
19 perhaps where there's a group that would respond to
20 calls, directly to individuals.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: If you had
22 your druthers and you could do the outreach in a way
23 that you think would be really effective, what types
24 of additional things do you think would be helpful to
25 get the word out? I mean, it's my understanding that

2 something like 13,000 more--by raising the cap, we
3 could capture about 13,000 more seniors. Do you have
4 a sense of how many more people with disabilities--

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO:

6 [interposing] No.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: -were going to
8 be captured, and how we've done in getting the word
9 out?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO: Now, that's
11 a pretty elusive number. I--I think at the beginning
12 when SCRIE--well, when DRIE--when we were initially
13 pushing it, we were trying to get a handle on those
14 numbers, but we couldn't. It was very difficult. I
15 think at the very beginning of the program, the
16 people that were involved were trying to find out
17 what those numbers were. It was pretty difficult.
18 It was a moving target.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Do you have a
20 sense of how many people are signed up for DRIE now
21 through the Department of Finance?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO: No, I don't
23 have those numbers.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Could you try
25 to find that--

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO:

3 [interposing] Sure.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --and get back
5 to us on that?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO: Sure.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: The
8 Department of Finance issued a really, really
9 comprehensive guide and it has all of those numbers
10 in there. So we can get that--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
12 Great.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: --to you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.
15 Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: We've been joined by
17 Council Member Rose. Sir, can you identify yourself
18 and then make sure you fill out a slip so that we can
19 get it on record

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO: Okay.

21 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: We don't know who you
22 are.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO: [laughs] I
24 know. I'm Robert Piccolo. I'm the First Deputy

2 Commissioner in the Mayor's Office for People with
3 Disabilities. I'm also the author of--

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK:

5 [interposing] And, the author of this--

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PICCOLO:

7 [interposing] The Inclusive Design Guidelines.

8 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: [off mic] Thank you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I actually can
10 ask one more--I can ask this question?

11 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: I don't think so.

12 [laughs] Council Member--Council Member Rose, do you
13 have any questions?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I'm afraid to ask
15 any questions because I don't want to be redundant.
16 You know, when you come late, you kind of have to
17 suffer the consequences. But, I--I'm really
18 concerned about, you know, how--is there a program
19 that HPD has to help actually modify buildings that
20 are under the purview for these who haven't recently
21 fallen, and need a--use a walker now. I've
22 encountered buildings where doorways aren't wide
23 enough to, you know, give me access. And so, are all
24 of our HPD guideline regulated properties accessible,
25 and have we made sure that they are Age-Friendly?

2 RAYMOND HODGES: So we have a program,
3 it's our SCHAP, Senior Citizens Housing Assistance
4 Program. It's specific for homeowners for small
5 buildings one to four-family homes I believe to, you
6 know, to make renovations so they can age in place in
7 their homes. There isn't anything specific for our
8 larger rental buildings. But we have--we have a
9 range of preservation programs that, you know, that
10 do retrofits of buildings. But there isn't anything
11 specific for this, you know for this type of work.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: How many people
13 access this program? How many landlords? Is this
14 something that--

15 RAYMOND HODGES: We're going to get back
16 to you with that number.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay.

18 RAYMOND HODGES: No, it was 680 over--
19 since the--since the late '90s.

20 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: But that's only for
21 one to four-family homes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing]
23 Right.

24 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: So they talk about
25 that.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: That's not the
3 high-rise.

4 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: But I--I wanted to
5 follow up on Council Member Rose's question, which is
6 like HPD has done all of these affordable housing
7 projects with Community Developers. So those are the
8 buildings that HPD still monitor, you know, still
9 monitor. So, what about, you know, looking at these
10 buildings, and seeing how to help them modify so that
11 they can--the seniors that lives in those buildings
12 can comfortable age in place? Because a lot them are
13 permanent, affordable, and these are HPD buildings
14 and HPD helped finance these buildings. So they
15 could be the one that we start with in terms of
16 preservation of affordable housing and helping
17 seniors age in place. Have you looked at some of
18 those buildings and see how to help them do that?

19 RAYMOND HODGES: I think not today, but
20 like Jordan was saying we should talk with our
21 Preservation folks, and we can do that.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Madam Chair, she
23 brings up an excellent question. With the affordable
24 housing movement that is afoot in New York City when
25 we're doing these buildings is required that all of

2 these amenities. They're not amenities, all these
3 necessities are in place from--you know, as an onset?
4 Is it a part of the design?

5 RAYMOND HODGES: The--so all of the new
6 construction buildings, the units are adaptable. So
7 they, you know, they're--they're built to be able to,
8 for instance, take the counter out from underneath
9 the sink and if it was needed at some point. But
10 that has to do more with requirements that are in
11 place MEMBER ROSE: based upon needs for people with--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing]
13 That's the ADA.

14 RAYMOND HODGES: --disabilities. Yeah,
15 exactly.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: What about the
17 hallways, the width of the hallways? And, you know--

18 RAYMOND HODGES: Yes, definitely. All of
19 our new construction buildings are designed to meet
20 those requirements. Yeah.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: We've been joined by
23 Council Member Vallone, Chair of our Senior Center
24 Subcommittee. So I would like HPD to really follow
25 up with us about the preservation part because I

2 think--I mean in your portfolio I'm sure you have
3 thousands of units.

4 JORDAN PRESS: I--I do want to be clear
5 about quote, unquote "HPD Buildings." So HPD does
6 have certain City-owned units in our portfolio, but
7 that is a greatly diminished portfolio compared to 10
8 or 15 years ago. The vast majority of our work today
9 is with private properties where we act as a lender.
10 So just to be clear, when we discuss HPD properties,
11 they're--they are most--they are mostly privately
12 owned properties that HPD has a regulatory agreement
13 with. Not that we know. Just to--just to be clear.

14 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Yes. I mean I think t
15 hat's what we meant. The ones that you helped
16 finance and you still have some oversight. I mean
17 those are the buildings that--I mean the City
18 Council.

19 JORDAN PRESS: [interposing] Well, we
20 have--our--our oversight, though, for those buildings
21 is limited to what's in the regulatory agreement.

22 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Well, also they--a lot
23 of them they come back to the City Council, you know,
24 for tax exempt--extensions and things like that. So,
25 those are the--the buildings we could start working

2 with to see how the preservation and helping seniors
3 age in place. Or, we're able to collect data from
4 them how do they hold their tenants who are--who are
5 seniors aging in place, and what resources they might
6 need. I think that--that's a good place to start.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Madam Chair,
8 just a quick question.

9 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you.
11 Sorry for coming late. Thank you, Madam Chair. As
12 we embark on these new Age-Friendly districts that
13 everyone is excited about, and you may have brought
14 it up, I've been given some questions from landlords
15 and owners who would like to try to do that. And I
16 see some of the questions. So just maybe quickly
17 what could we tell some of the homeowners or the
18 landlords who would like to try to start to make some
19 of the properties and apartments more Age-Friendly
20 and more senior accessible, and make some changes?
21 What resources could we provide, as a quick summary.

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: Well, what
23 I testified to was the fact that we would need-- We,
24 Department for the Aging, would need to rely on the
25 expertise, a lot of which resides in this room, and

2 you're going to hear from them very shortly. The
3 architects in aging that has been very closely with
4 us under the Age-Friendly rubric. And there are many
5 existing guides online that people can avail
6 themselves to now. You know, we need to design
7 something specific for New York City. But AARP has a
8 toolkit that exists online, and there are any other
9 number of guides that talk about how to make
10 apartments accessible and Age-Friendly.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Are there any
12 economic resources or ability--?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK:
14 [interposing] We discussed that. From the City,
15 very, very few.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Maybe that's
17 something we could look into as we go forward?
18 Thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Again, I apologize
20 for coming in late, and I just heard the tail end of
21 something. In terms of DRIE, it's difficult to get
22 the numbers of people who are eligible for it or did
23 I mishear that?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: We at the
25 table or each of our agencies at one point MOPD and

2 DFTA used to oversee SCRIE and DRIE, and we do not
3 any longer. So Finance has all those numbers, and
4 they did produce a publication with all those numbers
5 and what the expected numbers looked like of those
6 that might be eligible with the raise of income. So,
7 yes, the data is available. We just don't have it
8 with us today.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, and--and
10 there is you feel--or when you were there, did you
11 feel that there was sufficient outreach to those
12 that--

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK:

14 [interposing] I'm very pleased--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: --would be eligible
16 for DRIE, or were there any handicaps in obtaining
17 access to those--

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK:

19 [interposing] Well, I can speak to the SCRIE side
20 more than the DRIE side. But, you know, we now have
21 a very, very strong partnership with them. In fact,
22 we have weekly check-ins with them, which has been
23 ongoing for the past year, and we've given extensive
24 guidance in terms of outreach and partnerships. So I
25 feel like we're doing a good job.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Can I ask you this,
3 and this is my last question. I'm sure when you
4 looked at the data and the demographics, you saw that
5 Staten Island doesn't have a lot of people who are
6 participating in those programs. Can you kind of
7 give me your assessment as to why? Because I'm not
8 sure why we don't have more significant numbers--

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK:
10 [interposing] I would guess it's--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: -on SCRIE and DRIE.

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: I would
13 guess it's because you have primary--primarily
14 private homes on Staten Island and less numbers of
15 rent controlled, rent stabilized units.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And it's only--

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK:
18 [interposing] And less of a population.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And it's only--

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK:
21 [interposing] It only applies to--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: --it's only
23 applicable for rent stabilized?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: Yes, and
25 rent control, and you know we're losing those units.

1 COMMITTEE ON AGING

50

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Uh-huh, Uh-huh.
3 Mitchell-Lama is not included?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: Under a
5 separate--

6 JORDAN PRESS: [interposing] Yeah.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: --program.
8 Yes.

9 RAYMOND HODGES: Well, it's--I mean it's
10 still--it's the same program, but HPD administers
11 the--the SCRIE Program and Mitchell-Lama units are
12 included there.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you so much.
14 Thank you Madam Chair.

15 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Thank you, Council
16 Member Rose, and thank you to this panel.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RESNICK: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: And we would look
19 forward to having more follow up with you and
20 interesting discussions. Thank you. I would like to
21 call up the next panel. From AARP Maggie Castro-
22 Stevens. Lisa Morgenroth from American Institute of
23 Architects. Edith Prentiss from DIA.

24 [pause]

25

2 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: You may begin. Please
3 identify yourself first.

4 LISA MORGENROTH: Good morning. My name
5 is Lisa Morgenroth, I'm the Co-Chair--

6 [pause]

7 LISA MORGENROTH: It's on, right? Good
8 morning. My name is Lisa Morgenroth. I'm the Co-
9 Chair for the Design for Aging Committee for the New
10 York City Chapter for the American Institute of
11 Architects. And I'd like to ask permission to invite
12 my other co-chair up, Christine Hunter, if that's
13 okay.

14 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: [off mic] Can you just
15 make sure she does have a seat?

16 LISA MORGENROTH: Will do. Thank you.

17 [pause, background comments]

18 MAGGIE CASTRO-STEVENSON: Good morning. My
19 name is Maggie Castro-Stevens, and I'm Associate
20 State Director for AARP.

21 [background comments]

22 EDITH PRENTISS: [off mic] I'm Edith
23 Prentiss. I'm sorry. You know, when you've got the
24 new ones it just confuses it. My--I'm Edith
25 Prentiss, and I'm the Legislative Vice President of

2 Disabled in Action, DIA, a DNYC Board Member, yada
3 yada. And also a member of the Washington Heights
4 Council on Aging Board.

5 CHRISTINE HUNTER: And I'm Christine
6 Hunter, a principal at Magnusson Architecture and
7 Planning, and with Lisa a co-chair. We are co-Chairs
8 of the Design for Aging Committee of the New York AIA
9 chapter.

10 EDITH PRENTISS: I would like to beg your
11 indulgence to allow me to go first. I have an event
12 at Renwick at noon. Thank you. [coughs] The sunset
13 provision is particularly onerous for the DRIE
14 population of rent freeze in that many of us were not
15 eligible until the increase. Well, many of us did
16 not have DRIE because DRIE did not begin until 2005.
17 Then, it comes in at the new ridiculously low-income
18 level, and then finally, you know, jumped after we
19 all made a---including the Council is on our side.

20 Thank you very much--made a huge stink as
21 to increase to SCRIE without any increase to DRIE.
22 So you have a population whose rent was not frozen at
23 the time they became disabled. So one of the things
24 that we're looking for the rollback. I mean if
25 you're say 30% of our income, no one in a disability

2 community unless they are in subsidized housing their
3 rents are those numbers. [sic] I personally am over
4 my income--my Social Security Disability income in my
5 rent. Other individuals speak about being 50, 70%
6 and this is extremely problematic. I think that
7 landlords should be required to notify every tenant
8 of the Rent Freeze Programs because individuals with
9 invisible disabilities who are you, or as a landlord
10 to say who is eligible for DRIE. Yeah. Usually,
11 it's a little obvious for individuals over the age of
12 52, but it's certainly not obvious for many
13 individuals in the disability community. Secondly, I
14 love the concept of developing a business-building
15 guide, but I want to say first and foremost what
16 we're talking about in aging is not an age issue.

17 It's a functional means issue.
18 Individuals who are aging by virtue of being a
19 certain age do not need accommodations and
20 modifications. They need it because they are
21 individuals with disability be it normal aging or be
22 it disability. I strongly believe that DFTA and
23 Buildings and others should work with MOPD because,
24 as you know, that Project Open House already does
25 this. Project Open House does modern modifications.

2 You know, I mean it's like my favorite is walk-in
3 tubs, widen indoors. [sic] You know, I mean we joke
4 about it. I can't get my wheelchair into my kitchen.
5 It just doesn't go there. These are the issues that
6 most of us deal with. And we believe that MOPD has a
7 lot of experience in this, and should be included at
8 the table and the disability community should be
9 included. My concern is that as we've experienced
10 with the state program a number of years ago and MOPD
11 [sic], the landlord has to agree. And in the state
12 program the problem was that the landlord was
13 committee to rent the unit to another individual with
14 a disability who needed those modifications.

15 And the landlord was not willing to make
16 that requirement. Secondly, the landlords have to
17 agree to have the modifications done. Some of the
18 regulations include the responsibility to restore an
19 apartment to the pre-modification standards. So if
20 you have a roll-in shower put in, as an individual
21 you are required to replace that roll-in shower with
22 a regular bathtub. And this is an issue. I mean
23 roll-in showers cost like--by the time you're done
24 with all the work about \$10,000. So that's a major
25 issue that most individuals won't--cannot do.

2 Widening the door can only be done if it's not a
3 structural entity. So there are a lot of issues that
4 need to be looked at, and what unfortunately are not
5 looked at carefully. There are other issues that the
6 landlord is responsible to do. The landlord is
7 responsible to do grab bars.

8 Why should this program do the grab bars,
9 when that's the responsibility of the landlord. I
10 personally would not have grab bars, as you think of
11 them, put in my apartment because I'm not convinced
12 the walls would hold them. Instead, there are other
13 grab bars that mount on the side of the tub. So we
14 need to look at that in a broader capacity, and see
15 what is the landlord responsible to do? For example,
16 the landlord is responsible for installing the
17 necessary alarms with lights or bells or whatever is
18 needed. It's not the landlord's--you know, just put
19 in these \$15 ones from Home Depot. If the tenant
20 needs those accommodations, it is the landlord's
21 responsibility. So I think that there needs to be
22 maybe one offered for a certain number of years.
23 But, that we might want to then come to the topic,
24 and say the landlord has a responsibility. Thank you
25 very much.

2 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Thank you.

3 EDITH PRENTISS: I'm sorry.

4 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: No, thank you, Edith.

5 Thank you for coming down.

6 EDITH PRENTISS: Someone died and we're
7 having a celebration of life.

8 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Well, it's good to
9 celebrate to this life. Thank you for coming, Edith.
10 Next.

11 MAGGIE CASTRO-STEVENSON: Chairwoman Chin
12 and members of the Aging Committee on behalf of our
13 750,000 members, age 50 and older in New York City, I
14 want to thank you for the opportunity to express our
15 support for two important items on the agenda today.
16 Introduction 702, as you all know, aging in place is
17 the ability to live in one's own home and community
18 safely, independently and comfortably regardless of
19 age and disability [sic] level. According to AARP
20 research, older New Yorkers are no different from
21 older Americans nationally in their universal
22 preference to stay in their own homes as they age. A
23 2014 AARP survey of voters 50 and over in the city
24 found 90% says it's very--it is very important as
25 they age to be able to stay in their own homes where

2 they have social networks and a sense of familiarity.
3 One-fourth of all NYC residents age 50 and older are
4 living with disability and rates of disability more
5 than double after city residents turn 65. Jumping
6 from 60% for those--16% for those between the ages of
7 50 and 64 to 40% for those 65 and older. Among New
8 York City's seniors 65 plus nearly one-third have a
9 physical disability, and 22% have difficulty going
10 out of their homes. As the senior population grows,
11 it will be important to more people that the city is
12 prepared to address the needs of its residents who
13 are disabled or mobility challenged. AARP believes
14 that it's important to provide safe, decent and
15 accessible housing that promotes independence and
16 aging in place through home modification and repair.
17 Appropriate design features in new and rehabilitated
18 housing through principals such as universal design,
19 visibility, inclusive home design and energy
20 efficiency, and the use of innovative home products.
21 For these reasons, AARP supports Introduction of 702
22 as a first step in education--in educating building
23 owners on the types of modifications and improvements
24 that can be made to allow tenants to remain in place
25 as long as possible.

1 In 2014, a report by AARP that surveyed
2
3 New York City votes 50 years and older [coughs]--and
4 this is regarding Res 426--the issue of affordable
5 housing surpassed all other community concerns. Half
6 of all 50 plus NYC registered voters cited the lack
7 of affordable housing as a major concern.

8 Additionally, affordable housing ranks first in major
9 problem ratings among total registered voters. Among
10 the most engaged voters it stands out more clearly as
11 the top regarded major problem as the city's issues
12 in the survey. Older Americans, many of whom are on
13 fixed and limited incomes are particularly vulnerable
14 to rising rental costs. A Harvard Joint Center for
15 Housing Studies report on housing conditions for
16 older adults, finds that approximately 52% of adults
17 age 65 to 79 are paying more than they can afford for
18 rental housing, more than 30% of their income. In
19 addition, approximately 28% of renters in the same
20 age group are spending more than 50% of their income
21 on housing costs. These older renters meet the
22 definition of severely cost-burdened. Moreover, the
23 current production of affordable housing is unable to
24 keep pace with growing demand. Programs like SCRIE
25 are important in making sure that older NYC

2 residents, who meet the qualifications are not priced
3 out of housing due to rent increases. And AARP
4 applauded New York City and the State for increasing
5 the income eligibility for SCRIE in 2014 to \$50,000.
6 [coughs] Excuse me. That provision is set to sunset
7 on July 1, 2016. We must act now by passing
8 Resolution 426 to ensure that New York City's most
9 vulnerable residents have the stability that
10 affordable housing provides, and are not impacted by
11 the expiration of the income eligibility threshold.

12 Chairwoman, Chin and members of the
13 Committee, thank you for the opportunity to highlight
14 a few of the many needs for the New York City
15 residents as they age. Given the importance
16 affordable and appropriate housing plays in the lives
17 of older New York City residents, I urge your
18 committee and City Council colleagues on behalf of
19 AARP New York to favorably pass the Introduction 702
20 and Resolution 429.

21 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Thank you.

22 MAGGIE CASTRO-STEVENS: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Next.

24 LISA MORGENROTH: Good morning Chairwoman
25 Chin and Committee. The Design for Aging Committee

2 OF THE AIA New York City Chapter aims to increase
3 public awareness of the needs of seniors in an urban
4 environment and to create an Age-Friendly New York
5 City by promoting design that accommodates those
6 needs. The AIANY DFA Committee strongly supports the
7 efforts of the City Council in establishing an aging
8 in place guide for building owners. An aging in
9 place guide would help New York's burgeoning senior
10 population to remain active and engaged in our
11 communities. Thus, aging with dignity, working
12 toward improving existing residential buildings in
13 ways that enable independent seniors to live safely
14 and comfortably in their neighborhoods and apartments
15 or to age in place is an important aspect of creating
16 an Age-Friendly city. In this effort, the Council
17 should also ensure that the proposed bill includes
18 plans to promote and incentivize the implementation
19 of these improvements. For the past five years, the
20 DFA Committee has been exploring multiple issues of
21 aging [pause] within a dense urban environment. In
22 May 2013, we conducted a charette, which is an
23 intensive all-day--all--one-day workshop with an
24 interdisciplinary group of professionals to generate
25 ideas for modifying the existing housing stock of New

2 York City to enable seniors to continue to live
3 independently in their current apartments and
4 communities. The result of this charette were
5 exhibited at the Center for Architecture in January
6 of 2014, and are now available on the website and
7 that address is here. The ideas generated can be
8 considered for incorporation into the guide for
9 building owners on how to adapt their properties to
10 better accommodate the needs of tenants who are
11 seniors.

12 In May 2011, the DFA Committee produced a
13 short document, *Urban Design and Architectural*
14 *Guidelines for an Age-Friendly New York City*, which
15 contains numerous detailed suggestions for elements
16 that should be included in the Aging In Place Guide,
17 and that's attached to the copy of the testimony I
18 have today. That document is also available on our
19 website. By creating a plan to work with property
20 owners, relatively straightforward recommendations
21 such as those outlined in the 2011 documented can be
22 applied to buildings throughout New York City and
23 significantly improve the lives of seniors. The
24 Committee along with the New York Academy of
25 Medicine, BCID and AARP also participated in an Age-

2 Friendly design audit of Brooklyn Borough Hall in
3 February of this year. We assembled a public
4 building access checklist that the borough
5 president's office swiftly completed, and hopes to
6 implement two other city buildings throughout New
7 York City. This document can also help advise the
8 Council's proposed guidelines for private buildings.
9 The Design for Aging Committee would be very pleased
10 to participate in developing the guide and to assist
11 the Council in city administration and all efforts to
12 improve buildings and neighborhood for senior
13 residents. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Thank you for your
15 testimony. We're going to--we have a, you know, a
16 couple of questions. You know, you guys are the
17 experts on this. Have you worked with landlords in
18 terms of requesting, you know, modification to their-
19 -to their buildings? Have you gotten any kind of
20 requests from building owners or worked with building
21 owners or homeowners.

22 MAGGIE CASTRO-STEVENSON: We have not, not
23 to my knowledge.

24 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Uh-huh. What about
25 AIA?

2 CHRISTINE HUNTER: Well, within--within
3 our practices, I mean within my practices yes I've
4 worked with numerous existing building owners and
5 some of them with senior residents. And I guess our
6 committee included the Charette that Lisa referred
7 to, you know, was very interdisciplinary and included
8 owners as well. And also other professionals in kind
9 of aging related professions such as occupational
10 therapists. Those kinds of people who--who do have
11 the experience of going into people's apartments and
12 really trying to make them--the apartments and
13 buildings work for them.

14 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: I mean, what kind of
15 examples maybe you could share with us like that
16 have--you have successfully done some modifications.
17 Like for seniors that lives in a walk-up building,
18 what kind of modification could be done to help them
19 with that.

20 CHRISTINE HUNTER: Well, I think one very
21 essential element--I mean two very essential elements
22 even when the building is not going to become fully
23 handicapped accessible, you know, that is the stairs
24 will remain and it's not practical for various to
25 include ramps. Are railings and lighting as two very

2 important elements, and then colored differentiation
3 to make, you know, what are sometimes dark and kind
4 of gloomy or very--you know, someone with--with not
5 good vision may have trouble kind of orienting
6 themselves in certain environments. So there are
7 modifications--numerous modifications that can make
8 a big difference. I think also grab bars--grab bars
9 do make a big difference, and one point, you know,
10 right now there was discussion with HPD about the--
11 all apartments being adaptable. And that's true and
12 a tremendous amount of effort goes into putting in
13 grounds from those grab bars. Which are then
14 concealed by sheetrock. So nobody knows that they're
15 there. And I think one of the--one of the aspects of
16 aging as opposed to somebody with a defined
17 disability is that you never know what's coming next.
18 So, the first time you slip in the tub, two days ago
19 you didn't think you were going to slip in the tub.
20 And so, in my mind considering, you know, making some
21 of those--putting in some of those grab bars even
22 regular apartments would be--would be a very positive
23 aspect of universal design.

24 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Yeah, those are good
25 suggestions. I think we--I've heard about the

2 universal design concept from one of your colleagues
3 at AIA, and we really look forward to your expertise
4 in helping us do that. In the new building I think
5 they're--they're more pushed to do this universal
6 design. I mean even with grab bars, for example, you
7 don't have to--you could put in now. I think all of
8 us could use it. Not just for seniors. So there are
9 certain things that could be put in place in the
10 beginning--

11 CHRISTINE HUNTER: [interposing] I agree
12 with you.

13 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: --to do that.

14 CHRISTINE HUNTER: I agree with you.

15 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Do we have other
16 questions from my colleagues? Oh, we've been joined
17 by Council Member Arroyo. Council Vallone.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Good morning.
19 So thank you again. We have all of the advice and
20 the point to different documents that we can look at.
21 It's always appreciated. Is there any other
22 municipalities that you've worked with that maybe are
23 providing a successful subsidy or some additional
24 program to--that we could use to look at that maybe

2 has worked successfully with landlord or older
3 construction or on new construction projects?

4 MAGGIE CASTRO-STEVENSON: I mean I'm--I'm
5 sort of looking at AARP as the national model. [sic]

6 CHRISTINE HUNTER: Well, I would have to
7 check back with my colleagues because I'm sure that
8 they're working conjunctively with some of those
9 organizations. I'm just not 100% certain on with--
10 with which--with whom they're working.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Well, that would
12 be helpful I think if we could--

13 CHRISTINE HUNTER: [interposing]
14 Absolutely.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: --model or take
16 a look at something t hat's been successful, that's
17 always a--it always come in the finances. So it's
18 always one of the biggest challenges to see what the
19 direct result of those programs had led to within the
20 community.

21 CHRISTINE HUNTER: Okay. We'll get back
22 to you then.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Council Member Rose,
25 yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I was looking at--
3 at your suggestions, the Design, Urban Design and
4 Architectural Guidelines for Age-Friendly. It sounds
5 wonderful, and so I'm wondering what comparatively--
6 would it cost so much more for a building to be built
7 with all of these recommendations. Or, could they be
8 built, you know, relatively within the framework of
9 what a new construction would cost.

10 CHRISTINE HUNTER: Well, I mean new
11 construction and new residential construction in new
12 York City especially anything that involves an
13 elevator building--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing] Uh-
15 huh.

16 CHRISTINE HUNTER: --already incorporates
17 many of these recommendations. But as I say, in the
18 guise of adaptability so they have to be ready to be
19 adapted if somebody moves into that apartment. To
20 actually implement some of those for instance once
21 you put the grounds in to hold the grab bar, the grab
22 bar itself is not an expensive item.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Well, I was
24 thinking more like if this build--this building was
25 built for seniors--

2 LISA MORGENROTH: [interposing] Right.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: --with all of
4 these--

5 LISA MORGENROTH: [interposing] There are
6 not a lot of things--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: --accommodations.

8 LISA MORGENROTH: --I think that cost
9 more. A lot of this is decisions that the architect
10 makes. But at the end of the day a client has the
11 opportunity to sort of override that. But to answer
12 your question, many of these things do not have a
13 cost. They're--they're purely--I mean we're talking
14 about the height that something gets mounted at.
15 That's a decision that someone makes. If you we're
16 talking about a color, that's a paint selection or a
17 finish selection, and there shouldn't be an
18 associated consequence.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Where we're talking
20 about benches or something in the lobby, a deeper
21 vestibule, things of that nature.

22 LISA MORGENROTH: And many of the things
23 on here are code required, and ADA compliant design
24 requirements.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Uh-huh. So why
3 can't we sort of legislate that buildings should be
4 built, you know, to--to meet these specifications?

5 LISA MORGENROTH: I think a lot of--I
6 don't know. I think that's a rhetorical question
7 because--

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing] Yeah,
9 it really is. You know, you don't have to answer
10 that. I'm just--I'm just wondering because I think
11 the suggestions are really--are really good.

12 LISA MORGENROTH: It really comes down to
13 the priority of the person who's--who's writing the
14 check. So if the homeowner or the landlord is
15 committed to something like this and the architect is
16 aware of these recommendations, then they can use
17 this to--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing] Well,
19 that's why I was asking because if the cost is
20 prohibitive, if there's such a big difference and you
21 said, you know, that there really isn't. So, you
22 know--

23 CHRISTINE HUNTER: Well, and that's
24 definitely true in terms of new construction. But

2 when we're talking about the whole housing stock, you
3 know, existing housing stock of--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing]

5 Right, yes.

6 CHRISTINE HUNTER: --New York City, more
7 than half of the rental apartments, by the way are
8 walkups, in New York City. Being that we think of
9 ourselves as a high-rise city, it's actually [laughs]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing] So,

11 yes--

12 CHRISTINE HUNTER: There are significant
13 costs.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: --adaptive would be
15 costly.

16 CHRISTINE HUNTER: Yes, there are
17 significant costs. One of the ideas that was
18 generated by our charette is the idea of creating a
19 kind of--we called it a toolkit of modest
20 improvements, which, you know, made-- I mean I want
21 to say maybe \$2,500 and you get lighting and grab
22 bars and some instructions and things like that. So
23 that we feel that there are not very costly
24 provisions that could make a difference? Would then
25 solve very problem.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing] No.

3 CHRISTINE HUNTER: No. You know,

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: No, you can stay.

6 Don't go.

7 LISA MORGENROTH: I just want to say one
8 more thing that isn't really addressed on here, and
9 it might have to do with the fact that we wrote it
10 back, you know, four years ago. But technology is
11 playing a very--there's a lot of technology that is
12 available to architects and developers now for
13 detecting false prevention. Not false prevention,
14 but protecting falls, occupancy sensors. Remote
15 contact with doctors and nurses, and families.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Uh-huh.

17 LISA MORGENROTH: And as we all know,
18 technology can be expensive in the beginning, but
19 eventually it becomes very reasonable, and I-- Just
20 based on the sort of trend of everything else, I
21 think we're looking at a very near-term ability for
22 housing to have that technology. It doesn't have to
23 be very sophisticated. There are carpets that can
24 tell you when someone has fallen. Things like that,
25 but there are other sort of--just sort of monitoring

2 devices that if someone was comfortable with that
3 personally, I think it's a social question also those
4 kinds of things could be installed.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Well, we're
7 definitely, you know, looking for your expertise in
8 helping us, you know, develop this guide. As you
9 said, a lot of the buildings are walk-ups. You know,
10 a regular building a lot of seniors reside in. And
11 we also wanted to make sure that somehow we can
12 create some--some incentive program to encourage the
13 landlord to do these things. And when they know
14 that, you know, that it's not inexpensive, the city
15 can sort of help subsidize or kind of help them along
16 to really make these improvements. So we definitely
17 will be asking for your help--

18 CHRISTINE HUNTER: [interposing] Great.

19 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: --on this, and if you
20 have other suggestions in terms of the legislation,
21 please let us know.

22 CHRISTINE HUNTER: Okay.

23 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Okay. Thank you to
24 this panel.

25 CHRISTINE HUNTER: Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Thank you for coming
3 today.

4 MAGGIE CASTRO-STEVENS: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: The last panel we're
6 going to call up Andre Gianfani [sp?] for Live On New
7 York. Molly Krakowski from JASA and Melissa Munoz-
8 Patterson from RAIN.

9 [pause, background comments]

10 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: You may begin, yeah.
11 Please identify yourself first.

12 ANDREA GIANFANI: Good morning. Thank
13 you Councilwoman Chair--Chair Chin and the committee.
14 My name is Andrea Gianfani. I'm with Live On New
15 York, formerly Council of Senior Centers and
16 Services. We are very happy to be here today to talk
17 about two very important initiatives that are core to
18 our mission in making New York a better place to age.
19 Affordable senior housing is very important to older
20 New Yorkers and to all the work that our community
21 base providers do. We have an affordable senior
22 housing coalition made up of 25 of the city's non-
23 profit housing providers with services that focus on
24 seniors. And providing upwards of 20,000 units of
25 senior housing across the city. So we are very

2 interested in these initiatives, and partnering with
3 you to make sure that seniors are able to age in
4 place. Seniors who are often the cornerstones of
5 stable communities and keeping--keeping those
6 communities stable it's very important to our
7 mission. So thank you for--very much for bringing
8 these initiatives today.

9 First on the building guide to help
10 seniors age in place and to help landlords understand
11 different ways to do that we-- Again our senior
12 housing providers it's core to many of their missions
13 to do just that. To allow seniors to age in place,
14 and that is the housing they provide. It's a
15 wonderful idea, and it was--it's something that we
16 would be very excited to work with the Council on and
17 provide their expertise to help develop this guide.

18 Moving to SCRIE, again, another issue
19 that's vital to keeping thousands of seniors in their
20 home. We work very closely with City Council and the
21 State. We were proud last year that the income
22 eligibility was increased, and we thank the Council
23 for working very quickly on that issue. I know there
24 was a lot of talk about numbers this morning with
25 populations with SCRIE. And I actually brought a

2 copy of the Freeze Your Rent Program provided back in
3 December by the Department of Finance, which is very
4 comprehensive and outlines those number very well.
5 According to the report, the--they're estimating the
6 population for SCRIE eligibility to be 121,729. And
7 as far as the utilization rate for SCRIE, it's about
8 43%. So, as you can see, it's a very important and
9 vital program to keeping seniors in their homes.
10 And, prevents them from facing eviction and
11 homelessness, but it is very under-utilized. And
12 that's something that we are very focused on working
13 with you all to reach out to every single senior to
14 make sure that they understand that this program
15 exists.

16 Part of the testimony that we submitted
17 today includes the SCRIE under-utilization map by
18 neighborhood. So hopefully, that's helpful in the
19 outreach efforts. One of things that we've--we've
20 put forth is that SCRIE really needs a focused public
21 awareness campaign. A very good example is the Pre-K
22 Enrollment Campaign, which you see everywhere and
23 it's wonderful. And not only targeting seniors for
24 enrollment in SCRIE, but also their families and any
25 other individuals that might be aware of this that it

2 makes sense to make them aware. So that is something
3 that we are looking forward to continuing to work on
4 as well as an enrollment program, which we do have an
5 enrollment program as well for SCRIE.

6 The second part about SCRIE that is
7 something that's very important is that many seniors
8 who do manage to find out about SCRIE and do get on
9 SCRIE do so when they're already on the fiscal cliff.
10 They're finding out about SCRIE when they're at the
11 40 to 50% of their income. Which it's wonderful that
12 the rent is frozen at that level. However, they
13 still remain on this fiscal cliff and at a very
14 serious threat of losing their homes. So one idea
15 that we have been putting forth is the idea of a
16 rollback to the affordability rate where that freeze
17 would actually be rolled back to the point where they
18 could have gotten on SCRIE if they knew about it at
19 the affordability, the 30% rate. So that is
20 something we don't have an idea on the cost.
21 Obviously, the cost comes along with that. So that
22 is something that we would suggest that possibly the
23 IBO or the Department of Finance take a serious look
24 at and provide a fiscal analysis. So again, those
25 are--these are two very important programs through

2 our core mission, and we look forward to supporting
3 and working with the Council moving forward. Thank
4 you very much.

5 [pause]

6 MELISSA MUNOZ-PATTERSON: Hello. Oh,
7 cool. Good morning. It is a lovely spring morning
8 to be walking in Manhattan. So I appreciate you guys
9 having this hearing and inviting us in. My name is
10 Melissa Munoz-Patterson, and I'm representing RAIN.
11 That's Regional Aid for Interim Needs. We have been--
12 --we were founded in the Bronx by Beatrice Castiglia
13 Catullo. She is our founder. She is 99 this year.
14 So it's pretty--you know, when you talk about seniors
15 aging in place, I have to be honest, if you needed a
16 poster child I have one for you. RAIN has been a
17 pillar in the community providing essential quality
18 services for the past 51 years. We employ many New
19 York City residents who are well versed in the needs
20 of our city, and the needs of our seniors. Two
21 programs we provide in an array of programs, it's in
22 our paperwork in front of you. But two of the
23 programs I want to bring up are case management and
24 our RAIN One Stop, both, which provide SCRIE
25 assistance. I'm missing one of the numbers so I

2 apologize. But overall we've assisted over 400
3 seniors in our locations alone. And I haven't even
4 talked to the senior centers yet to see what they've
5 done in terms of assistance there, and we have 11
6 senior centers. So we really do fully support this
7 Sunset Provision rollback, and you know, any rollback
8 obviously would be just that much better. But we
9 fully support the Sunset Provision, and we really
10 think that it's very important to ensure that the
11 seniors that need this benefit continue to have it
12 passed when it's currently set to cancel.

13 What I'd really like to focus on because
14 we do have two senior buildings, and I will tell you
15 that our senior buildings are lovely. But what we're
16 focusing on now is actually introducing a lot of the
17 technology that the two people from the AIA had
18 mentioned earlier. We're focusing on trying to bring
19 in those falls. It's not a fall prevention, but it's
20 a falls prevention, but it is a falls notification.
21 So we're looking at the--to bring in these
22 notifications of when a senior gets out of bed and
23 doesn't move after getting out of bed, it would
24 notify-- And there's a whole list. You know, it
25 notifies their family. It notifies the security in

2 the building. So those are things that we're looking
3 to get into, but ultimately when you look at these
4 suggestions currently offered, our two buildings with
5 the little book community models, all have that.
6 But, when you look at the issues because RAIN is all
7 about allow seniors to age in place with dignity, and
8 allowing them to stay home.

9 It benefits the senior. It benefits the
10 community. There's no negative to keeping the
11 seniors at home. This is what RAIN does, and in the
12 best of all worlds we could legislate that and we
13 could say dear landlords go fix it and fix it now.
14 But without having any teeth in it, or any
15 enticement, I don't see landlords saying, let me go
16 spend some money and let me go fix it just to keep
17 the senior in there. Our concern, or one of our
18 suggestions I would say would be maybe a tax credit.
19 Again, I don't know what the tax---the implications
20 of that would be, but it would be able to entice
21 landlords to making repairs that ultimately probably
22 would not have made before. My point of caution, and
23 this is something that we really want to draw
24 attention to is that as improvements are made in
25

2 apartments, landlords have the ability to increase
3 the rent.

4 Any doors widening. Any, you know, big
5 changes with cabinetry, all increases could increase
6 the tenant's rent. So potentially you're putting the
7 tenants and these seniors into--in a dangerous
8 position because either one of two things could
9 happen. Either rent could increase or (b) the rent
10 could increase past the rent control threshold. And
11 potentially, you could price the senior out of the
12 apartment even while you're trying to keep them in
13 the apartment. So this is--again RAIN really
14 supports it. We think it's a great initiative and a
15 worthy intention, but we really think that the guide
16 has to come with the mechanism to encourage and
17 support landlords as they make the necessary updates
18 in investments in order to keep the seniors in their
19 homes and communities. While at the same time taking
20 into account the potential pitfalls that could
21 controvert the goals of the potential legislation.
22 So I think you very much for the opportunity to
23 address you, and I hope everyone enjoys the lovely
24 day.

2 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Thank you. Just on
3 one point that you raised. I mean I think that a
4 tax credit is--is an idea. I mean we have to look at
5 there are some incentive, and also even if the
6 landlord do the improvement, and apply for an
7 increase based on the apartment improvement, if the
8 tenant is a senior, then SCRIE would kick in an-- So
9 it might be an incentive, but like if it's a senior
10 citizen--

11 MELISSA MUNOZ-PATTERSON: [interposing]
12 Uh-huh.

13 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: --but the landlord
14 will be able to get some rent increase, but it's
15 still--the city is still, you know, paying for it.

16 MELISSA MUNOZ-PATTERSON: [interposing]
17 Uh-huh, and the--again, there is a percent--
18 percentage even when you look at the numbers that
19 were provided. I'm sorry. I don't know your
20 numbers. But when you provide the numbers, and you
21 look at how many seniors can apply for SCRIE, there's
22 still a percentage, and a pretty decent percentage
23 particularly in some of our neighborhoods that can't
24 apply for SCRIE. So you could--you are potentially
25 again pushing them out of communities, because they

2 may not be eligible for SCRIE. So we're just really
3 cautioning, you know, let's just be careful. As we
4 try to get there, let's not push anybody out
5 unintentionally.

6 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Yeah, I mean, we
7 always have to be mindful of that. But I think it's
8 right now how do we sort of create some incentive
9 for--so that at least-- Because we're encouraging
10 landlords to do this. Right now, we're not
11 mandating.

12 MELISSA MUNOZ-PATTERSON: Uh-huh.

13 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: We're not there yet.
14 [laughter] We'll start by like encourage them to
15 work in partnership with the City to--to sort of
16 modify and adapt these apartments, and see how that
17 goes. But I think that the interesting point that
18 you also raised earlier is that senior buildings, how
19 to also help those senior buildings to help seniors
20 to continue to be able to live in the senior building
21 and to age in place. So that's something that we
22 also have to be mindful of when we talked earlier
23 about affordable housing that the City helped
24 finance. How do we make sure those buildings are

2 doing that? So, I think that's something that we
3 definitely have to follow up.

4 MELISSA MUNOZ-PATTERSON: We actually
5 spoke to a senior that lives in a building that has
6 this technology. And I think she named it, and she
7 says good morning to it every morning. And it's
8 really like when you talk about, you know, issues of-
9 - Because I was worried. I said, You know, don't
10 you find it intrusive? And she said no, no, no.
11 It's there for my protection and I love it. I know
12 she name it like Arthur or something. And it was
13 adorable to see her walk around and be like, I say
14 good morning. I wave. It's my friend. And I said,
15 Okay. [laughter] That's good. Thank you for
16 sharing those experiences.

17 MELISSA MUNOZ-PATTERSON: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Next.

19 MOLLY KRAKOWSKI: Hi. Good morning. My
20 name is Molly Krakowski. I'm Director of Legislative
21 Affairs at JASA. Thank you Council Member Chin for
22 chairing today, and for the committee for holding
23 today's hearing. I will be very brief. We are very
24 supportive of the Intro and also the Resolution. And
25 as we've discussed over the last number hearings, and

2 we all know that that aging population is just
3 booming. JASA suggests that now is the time to
4 invest further in services for older adults to stay
5 ahead of the trend, to prepare, to invest in services
6 that are needed to maintain people in the community.
7 And Intro 702 certainly does go in that direction.
8 And at the Aging Committee on NORCs, we heard from a
9 lot of people who live in buildings that are not
10 NORCs, but would like them to be NORCs. And, you
11 know, obviously, we would love to have that funding
12 come through for more NORCs to be developed and
13 Neighborhood NORCs. But in the interim, to have
14 something like Intro 702. And even once we get money
15 for NORCs to have funding for those types of
16 buildings to be developed. Intro 702 provides a
17 clear path through both management and for older
18 adults to be able to point to things that could
19 actually help them age in place in their communities.
20 So we think everybody would really benefit from a
21 clear set of guidelines, and necessary tools to
22 provide maximum safety for tenants. And we do get a
23 lot of phone calls obviously from people who want to
24 remain in their homes. Who also would love to be
25 lists for senior housings, but with 12-year wait

2 lists and 10-year wait lists. And we do have senior
3 housing, and it does do wonderful things, and
4 obviously any upgrades that we could do, we would
5 love to do. And if there was funding to do it, we
6 would love to do it. But I think the biggest problem
7 and the biggest issue is the lack of possibilities
8 for people to just continue aging in their homes, and
9 in their--and in the communities.

10 In terms of Resolution 426, we obviously,
11 would agree to any expansion and extension of the
12 raising and limits and income limits. There's a huge
13 gap that still remains despite having raised the--
14 raised the cap, and the qualifications. And we
15 definitely--I know that earlier there was question
16 about what senior centers are doing and how we're
17 informing people about the--the rise to \$50,000 as
18 the new income. And that's what the social workers
19 do on a regular basis. They're constantly meeting
20 with tenants--you know, constantly meeting with
21 clients who are telling them exactly what it is that
22 they need. And certainly I can talk for our shop
23 that the social workers are very well aware of the
24 new limitations. But again, as--as Lavonne
25 mentioned, I think there needs to be a big campaign.

2 And as Edith Prentiss mentioned. And as Edith
3 Prentiss mentioned, it has to do with disabled
4 increased exemption as well. It's we really aren't
5 doing enough to educate the general population about
6 what exists, and that we need to broaden it. So
7 thank for the hearing today, and we're supportive.

8 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Thank you for your
9 testimony and thank you for coming down. We have
10 gotten a lot useful information to really help with
11 this. And I think the whole idea of housing
12 preservation when the Mayor is talking about building
13 and preserving affordable housing, this has to be in
14 place. We have to be able to help seniors age in
15 place.

16 MOLLY KRAKOWSKI: Can I just add one last
17 thing?

18 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Yes.

19 MOLLY KRAKOWSKI: Which is that Intro 214
20 I just want to mention as well, which is protecting
21 against harassment and displacement from
22 neighborhoods. So I just would put that into the
23 conversation as well because I think any of the--any
24 of the discussion having to do with affordable
25 housing we also have to continuously remember that we

2 need Council for people to make sure that they're not
3 being displaced.

4 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Yes.

5 MOLLY KRAKOWSKI: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: That's--that's all the
7 Council's efforts to try to keep people in their
8 homes. So, thank you for your advocacy and thank you
9 for coming down today.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Just a quick
11 thought. As we were talking it came up to me and you
12 mentioned the building and that you named the
13 building all that. What if we were to come up with
14 some type of program whether either an architect or
15 a landlord or a developer with certain--if they
16 achieved a certain goal, the building would be marked
17 as an Age-Friendly apartment building or construction
18 or--to let them know. And also to give some good
19 will back to the person who created the building or
20 the entity, that they're complying with all of these
21 goals that we've put in. And as a result, now this
22 building gets an additional accreditation to make
23 that 20% of the apartments who are Age-Friendly and
24 sensitive to the needs, and have been incorporated
25 into the apartment. It might be something that can--

2 that we can work forward with Margaret and I and the
3 committee to--if they can reach that level then there
4 would be some type of benefit. Whether it's a tax
5 abatement or some type of incentive. Can you heard
6 of anything like that or--?

7 MOLLY KRAKOWSKI: No.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: See, you always
9 come up with good ideas.

10 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: That's right, we're
11 going to credit that to you, Council Vallone.

12 MOLLY KRAKOWSKI: Age Friendly New York,
13 though, does have the businesses that are considered
14 sort of starred as Age-Friendly businesses. So it
15 probably falls within--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Maybe. And
17 yesterday I met with the Senior Task Force. I ended
18 up going, and it came up that for--some seniors are
19 faced with financial predatory tactics and abuse that
20 to have in New York City something that we can
21 control having a financial institution being marked
22 as Age-Friendly if they adhere to certain voluntary
23 practices to help our seniors because we can't
24 control that. But if they do I think that would be a
25 great way within the city. I know Margaret has been

2 a great champion of that for a number of years, [sic]
3 too. I think we could continually expand in all
4 aspects of our city Age-Friendly initiatives, and
5 then those businesses, and banks, and landlords
6 should get that acknowledgement so that we can work
7 with them more. I think that will separate, and that
8 will help the voluntary aspect of getting these
9 incentives out there also.

10 MOLLY KRAKOWSKI: Yeah, that LEED service
11 type of thing.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Exactly,
13 exactly.

14 MOLLY KRAKOWSKI: That's a great idea.

15 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Age-Friendly
16 certified.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Age-Friendly
18 certified. I just came up with a new acronym. All
19 right. So that's all the thought for this day.
20 Thank you for mentioning it.

21 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: Thank you so much for
22 coming today, and thank you everyone for being here
23 today. The meeting is now adjourned.

24 [gavel]

1 COMMITTEE ON AGING

90

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 27, 2015