

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC
SCHOOLS

----- X

April 14, 2015
Start: 01:12 p.m.
Recess: 06:57 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:

VANESSA L. GIBSON
Chairperson

DANIEL DROMM
Co-Chairperson

CHAIM M. DEUTSCH
Co-Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

JAMES VACCA
JULISSA FERRERAS
JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS
RAFAEL L. ESPINAL, JR.
RITCHIE J. TORRES
ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.
RORY I. LANCMAN
STEVEN MATTEO
VINCENT J. GENTILE

COUNCIL MEMBERS: (CONTINUED)

ALAN N. MAISEL

ANDY L. KING

ANTONIO REYNOSO

DANIEL R. GARODNICK

DEBORAH L. ROSE

INEZ D. BARRON

JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS

MARGARET S. CHIN

MARK LEVINE

MARK S. WEPRIN

MARK TREYGER

STEPHEN T. LEVIN

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Allen Fagin
Executive Vice President
Orthodox Union

Jeff Leb
Managing Director-Government & External Relations

Joseph Rosenberg
Catholic community Relations Council

Joy Jones
Administrator
Ebenezer Preparatory School

Debbie Klugmann
Beth Jacob of Boro Park

Ahmad Hamid
Al-Noor School

Steven Lorch
Solomon Schechter School of Manhattan

Stuard Klammer
Shulamith School of Brooklyn

Barry Spitzer
District Manager
Brooklyn Community Board 12

David Tanenbaum
Agudath Israel of America

Daniella Gatlib
Parent

Lois Herrera
CEO of Offices of Safety & Youth Development
Department of Education

Brian Conroy

A P P E A R E N C E S (CONTINUED)

Assistant Chief
Commanding Officer School of Safety Division

Vincent Schiraldi
Senior Advisor
Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice

Nicholas Sheehan
Advocates for Children

Johanna Miller
New York City Civil Liberties Union

Matthew Guldin
Dignity in Schools Campaign of New York

Kate McDonough
Girls for Gender Equity

Anna Bean
Dignity in Schools Campaign of New York

Onyx Walker
Future of Tomorrow

Matthew Evans
Future of Tomorrow

Carlos Suarrow
Sisters and Brothers United

Perla Ramos
Sisters and Brothers United

Juritza Gigel
Urban Youth Collaborative

Latrell Stone
Youth Ministries for Peace and Justice

A P P E A R E N C E S (CONTINUE)

Zakiyah Ansari
Alliance for Quality Education

Nancy Ginsburg
Legal Aid Society

Tara Foster
Legal Services NYC

Amber Decker

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
2 ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC
3 SCHOOLS

4 [gavel]

5 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Good afternoon

6 everyone. Welcome to the city council. I am Council
7 Member Vanessa Gibson of the 16th district in the
8 Bronx and I'm proud to chair the City Council
9 Committee on Public Safety. I also want to thank my
10 fellow co-chairs here with us; Council Member Danny
11 Dromm Chair of the Education Committee and Council
12 Member Chaim Deutsch chair of the Subcommittee on
13 Non-Public Schools and thank each of them for co-
14 chairing this very important hearing this
15 afternoon. I'd also like to thank members of all of
16 the committees who are here and I welcome you all
17 to this very important hearing. Today we are
18 examining school climate and school discipline
19 codes and the critical issue of school safety in
20 the city of New York. The safety of our students is
21 of paramount importance to everyone and we depend
22 on our school safety agents to play a critical role
23 in ensuring the safety of our students, our
24 parents, and our educators. It is essential that we
25 strike a delicate balance between education and
public safety. A misguided emphasis on discipline
must not derail the educational environment of our

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 students. Detention should be the last resort and
3 not the first. We need a cultural shift to ensure
4 that our students are a pipeline to success and not
5 a pipeline to jail or prison but rather college and
6 careers. We must focus our energies on education
7 and providing sufficient resources to better enable
8 the prevention and de-escalation of problem
9 situations before they get out of hand. A
10 disciplinary system that treats all students
11 equally with respect and dignity can only be
12 achieved through transparency and accountability. I
13 want to recognize and applaud our mayor Bill de
14 Blasio and our education chancellor Carmen Farina
15 for their recent announcement in February on a
16 focus on school climate and discipline reforms. Some
17 of these reforms include creating a new school
18 discipline code and implementing restorative
19 justice programs in our schools. Strategies to
20 support court involved students reducing an
21 effective suspensions and decreasing a reliance on
22 9-1-1 calls to address behavioral issues are all
23 geared to improving the overall safety and school
24 climate. Through this partnership with the NYPD
25 School Safety, The Mayor's Office of Criminal

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 Justice, The City Council, Department of Education,
3 community groups, advocacy groups, and in
4 particular many of our students this administration
5 has established the school climate leadership team
6 to report on the progress of these reforms and
7 create a climate in all New York City public schools
8 that promote student safety and dignity, creative
9 approaches to prevention and a refocus on school
10 resources such as conflict mediation and other
11 tools that deescalate many school infractions. I am
12 pleased to know that this school climate leadership
13 team is composed of principals, educators, parents,
14 students, union representatives, and others from
15 the various agencies, city council representatives
16 and various community and advocacy groups.

17 Prevention not detention is the ultimate goal. In
18 furtherance of these goals we will be hearing three
19 bills this afternoon. I'm proud to be cosponsoring
20 Intro 730 which expands and amends the current
21 student safety act with my colleague Corey Johnson,
22 chair of our Health Committee to emphasize the
23 importance of this bill to me on a personal level
24 this is the very first bill for which I am the lead
25 sponsor that is heard in this committee on public

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 safety. And I'm very proud of that. Through this
3 legislation the DOE and NYPD would be required to
4 report the number of times EMS or NYPD is called to
5 schools, multiple suspensions for the same student,
6 the number of times mechanical restraints or
7 handcuffs are used on students, the number of metal
8 detectors in schools, and reporting on all
9 complaints made against school safety agents.

10 Council Member Johnson will speak further about
11 this legislation. Intro 65 which we're hearing
12 today cosponsored introduced by Council Member
13 David Greenfield, chair of our Land Use Committee,
14 requires school safety agents to be placed at
15 public, non-public schools if the school requests
16 one. Council Member Greenfield will speak more
17 about this legislation in detail. Intro 719 we're
18 also hearing sponsored by Council Member Ritchie
19 Torres, Chair of our Public Housing Committee, this
20 bill requires the DOE to report to the council and
21 post on its website the ratio of guidance
22 counsellors to school safety agents. Council Member
23 Torres would also speak further about this
24 legislation. Today we'll be hearing first from
25 members of the public including advocates,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 students, and parents followed by the
3 administration joining us at 3:00 which will
4 include the NYPD School Safety, Department of Ed
5 and the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice. After
6 the administration we will continue with more
7 testimony from members of the public. I like to
8 thank and recognize all of the members of my team
9 of the Public Safety Committee for their efforts
10 and hard work in putting this hearing together. Our
11 Council Deepar Ambicar [sp?], our legislative
12 analyst Beth Gollub, our Policy Analyst Lorrie Wen,
13 Robert Colandra, Bryan Crow, and the rest of my
14 team on finance, Ellen Aang, Regina Perada Ryan,
15 Frisa Ali, Pascal Brenard, and Theodore Moore in
16 the Speaker's Office. I know we have a lot to get
17 to and I want to recognize ad thank all of our
18 educators and our students who are here to testify
19 this afternoon. And now I will turn this hearing
20 over to my first Co-Chair, Chair of Education
21 Council Member Danny Dromm.

22 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very
23 much. And good afternoon. I'm Council Member Daniel
24 Dromm the Chair of the Education Committee. I want
25 to thank my co-chairs Council Member Gibson and

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 Council Member Deutsch for their work with me here
3 today. Also thank you to the bills' sponsors
4 Council Members Gibson, Greenfield, and Torres who
5 we, who we will hear from shortly. And of course
6 thanks to all of you for turning out today to
7 listen and to discuss the issues at hand. Today's
8 hearing is big. As you heard from Chair Gibson it
9 includes oversight and three builds. However it's
10 not just big because of the substance of
11 legislation and amount of testimony we'll be
12 hearing but also big because the matters being
13 discussed are of utmost importance. The safety and
14 security of students while in school is not only a
15 key component to their success of students but
16 essential to their overall health and wellbeing in
17 general. A school's culture or climate should be
18 welcoming and supportive. As a former longtime
19 teacher I know that the tenor, tenor of the
20 principal affects teachers and administrators that
21 ripples to the student body. If done properly it
22 can be a transform, it can be transforming in the
23 life of a child. And with that said I also need to
24 express that I personally do not believe that
25 school safety agents should be under the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1 jurisdiction of the NYPD. Let me repeat that. I do
2 not believe that school safety agents should be
3 under the jurisdiction of the NYPD. I strongly
4 believe that principals should have a final say in
5 what happens in their schools and how a student is
6 treated. It is my opinion that this transfer of
7 power during a previous administration was a
8 mistake. I believe it was a pivotal moment that
9 while probably unintended created a climate that
10 criminalizes juvenile behaviors with an emphasis on
11 punishment rather than on de-escalation and
12 conflict resolution. We have heard a number of
13 horror stories about students being mistreated and
14 mishandled under this type of policing in our
15 schools. For example recently, and I'm really upset
16 about this and I'm going to question the DOE
17 heavily on this issue, at John J. High School
18 Campus, Park Slope School, a student whose broken
19 glasses, and I need the public and people to
20 understand what courage it takes first for a
21 student to put glasses on because often times
22 they're harassed and teased or bullied just for
23 wearing glasses, but for a student to put on
24 glasses with a safety pin on it and still want to
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 go to school to be confronted with the type of
3 violence actually that he met at the school door
4 that morning and being deemed as a threat by school
5 safety agents. Now I'm not sure what damage pin
6 could do in someone's eyeglasses but I'm going to
7 ask more questions about that later. What happened
8 is that when the student refused to remove the pin,
9 remember they're holding together his glasses, the
10 school safety agent confiscated his glasses. Then
11 when he tried retrieving the glasses which he most
12 likely relies on he was thrown to the ground and
13 handcuffed. This is a child, okay, who was treated
14 this way, a child under our care. After that while
15 he was in the principal's office writing the
16 account of the incident he was allegedly recuffed
17 and issued a summons which still stands according
18 to newspaper stories as of this morning. It's not
19 the student who should have been handed the
20 summons. This is wrong on so many levels. This kind
21 of treatment of students in schools is
22 reprehensible. With proper training that includes
23 how to work with children, because remember our
24 students are children, and principal oversight,
25 many of these incidents wouldn't reach this level

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 of egregiousness. I also question what kind of a
3 system has more police trained safety agents than
4 guidance counsellors. Let me say that again. I also
5 question what kind of a system has more police
6 trained safety agents than guidance counsellors.
7 And I can't help but thinking we're on the wrong
8 path. I know that the chancellor has expressed her
9 desire to increase principal control and to
10 incorporate restorative justice practices so I'm
11 hopeful that the climate will improve but do
12 strongly urge you to reconsider many of these
13 practices. I'm going to stop here but I want to
14 thank my staff as well for the work that they've
15 done for this hearing. And I want to thank Asia
16 Shawnburg [sp?] who is my council, Jan Atwell the
17 policy analyst, and Joan Pavolney [sp?] for all the
18 work that they've done in preparing for this
19 hearing. And I thank you again for coming and now I
20 will turn it over to my co-chair Council Member
21 Deutsch, Chair of the Subcommittee on Non-Public
22 Schools who will say a few words and then we will
23 hear from the other bills' sponsors. Madam Chair
24 thank you.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Thank you

Chairs Gibson and Dromm and thank you all for joining us today. And I want to thank the committee staffers and my staff for the hard work in preparing for today's hearing. We are here today to listen to and consider testimony into one particular intro that I'm very concerned about and that's Intro 65, a local law that would require many of the administrative code of the city of New York in relation to requiring the New York City Police Department to assign school safety agents to public and non-public schools upon the request of such non-public schools. These are turbulent times. It is rare for a week to go by without hearing of a violent and sometimes fatal attack somewhere in the world. Disturbingly recent trends indicate a rise in violent attacks on children attending classes. Here in New York City our public school children are protected by NYPD school safety agents assigned to every public school when ensure the safety and security to ensure the safety and security of our children. These same protections are currently not provided to the 265 thousand students of non-public schools. In recent years we have been shaken by

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 attacks on schools and the US including in 1999 the
3 Columbine High School Massacre that left 13 dead
4 and 21 injured. In 2007 Virginia Tech massacre they
5 left 32 dead and 17 injured. In 2008 North Illinois
6 University shooting that left five dead and 21
7 injured. In 2012 Sandy Hook Elementary School
8 shooting that left 26 first grade students and
9 teachers dead. And around the world in 2004, 2004
10 Beslan in school in North Osetia Russia terrorist
11 attack that left at least 386 dead and over 700
12 injured. In 2008 Mercaz HaRav Yashiva attack in
13 Jerusalem that left eight dead and seven, seven
14 wounded, wounded. In 2012, and this is in, in,
15 Toulouse school shooting in France that left three
16 schoolchildren dead. And 2014 in Peshawar school
17 attack in Pakistan that left 141 children dead and
18 130 injured. And just two weeks ago in Garissa
19 University College attack in Kenya that left 141
20 students dead. And just yesterday April 13th a
21 school employee was killed in a shooting on the
22 campus of Wayne County Community College in Gilsbar
23 in North Carolina. Now these tragic killings are a
24 stark reminder of the peril facing our children
25 whenever they enter the confines of an educational

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 institution. The threat is a reality to all of our
3 schools. In my district alone there have been
4 recent incidents of trespassing and on public
5 schools that would have ended disastrously if not
6 for the quick response of alert school staff
7 members who averted potentially dangers
8 confrontations. Our first and foremost priority is
9 the safety and wellbeing of all our precious
10 precious children. The passage of Intro 65 will
11 help to ensure protection for nearly 1.4 million
12 children in our city who attend public and non-
13 public schools. And unfortunately while, while I
14 listen to my, to my colleague here Council Member
15 Dromm regarding guidance counsellors it's
16 unfortunately that, it's unfortunate that guidance
17 counsellors cannot protect the outdoors, the
18 building of our local schools. So that's why we
19 need to rely on under NYPD we need to rely on
20 school safety, NYPD school safety office and I look
21 forward to hearing positive testimony on ensuring
22 that all our schools are equally protected with
23 school safety agents. Thank you very much.

24 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much
25 chairs Dromm and Chair Deutsch. I appreciate your

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 leadership and helping me co-chair this hearing
3 today. I'd like to acknowledge the presence of
4 members of the city council our colleagues Council
5 Members Rory Lancman, Mark Treyger, David
6 Greenfield, Antonio Reynoso, Danny Dromm, Chaim
7 Deutsch, Corey Johnson, Julissa Ferreras, Steve
8 Matteo, and Vincent Gentile. And now we're going to
9 have opening remarks from the three prime sponsors
10 of the three legislation that we're hearing this
11 afternoon. We're going to start with Intro 65 which
12 amends the administrative code of the city of New
13 York in relation to requiring the NYC Police
14 Department to assign school safety agents to public
15 and non-public schools upon the request of such
16 schools. Our prime sponsor Council Member David
17 Greenfield.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you
19 Chair Gibson and thank you for your overall
20 leadership as a public safety guru here in the city
21 of New York, an advocate we're certainly very
22 grateful for that. I also want to thank Chair Danny
23 Dromm who's an outspoken fighter on behalf of all
24 of our school children here in New York City and
25 especially want to thank Council Member Deutsch

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 who's been a hardworking partner with me on this
3 piece of legislation and his role as the chair of
4 the Non-Public School Committee of the New York
5 City Council, certainly grateful for his support.
6 You know I'm actually very pleased that
7 Introduction 65 comes with overwhelming council
8 support. 46 out of 51 council members support this
9 legislation. I think the reason, it's simple. It's
10 a matter of public safety. We want to make sure
11 that all of our children are safe. It's not just
12 council members who support it. But we actually
13 have a support from the spectrum of the non-public
14 school world, the catholic community relations
15 council, the orthodox union, the archdiocese of New
16 York, the diocese of Brooklyn and Queens, Agudath
17 Israel of America, the Muslim Community Network,
18 the Islamic School Association, the New York State
19 Association of Independent Schools as well as
20 teamster locals 237. The concept is really simple
21 and that is that no parent should have to worry
22 about their child when they go to school. We have a
23 longstanding history in New York City and New York
24 State at providing the basics for non-public school
25 education. Every child in this city whether they go

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 to public or non-public school goes on a bus in the
3 morning. That bus is paid for by the city and
4 state. And they're safe when they go on that bus
5 and we have standards on that bus. But once they
6 get off that bus and they enter into their non-
7 public schools now they're at risk because in most
8 cases most schools and most children do not have
9 any security. But it's more than just bussing. We
10 provide food services. We provide school books. We
11 provide computers. We also provide nursing which
12 the council did a few years ago understanding that
13 health and safety of children was something that
14 was important. I think that my council colleague
15 Council Member Deutsch articulated very well the
16 risks and threats that we have not just from
17 international terror being located here in New York
18 City but also the threats that we face domestically
19 from an active shooter situation. We live in New
20 York. It's the greatest city in the world and as a
21 result everybody wants to come here; the good, the
22 bad, and the ugly. The good of course are children
23 who are innocently going to school every day and
24 deserve to be protected from both the bad and the
25 ugly and that's really what it's about. It's not

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 even about equity as some people will say. It's not
3 even about fairness. It's just about public safety.
4 How can anyone disagree that children who are going
5 to school deserve to be safe. And I think that's
6 why we've had the overwhelming super majority
7 support of the New York City Council. I want to
8 thank all my colleagues who have signed onto this
9 bill and I especially once again one to thank Chair
10 Gibson for her leadership as the chair of Public
11 Safety. And I'm looking forward to a robust
12 hearing. Thank you very much.

13 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much
14 Council Member Greenfield. And now Intro 719 which
15 amends the New York City Charter in relation to
16 requiring the Department of Education to report the
17 school by school ratio of school safety officers to
18 guidance counsellors. And our prime sponsor in, in
19 addition to Council Member Ritchie Torres we have
20 Council Member Reynoso.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you Chair
22 Gibson. I also want to thank Chair Dromm and Chair
23 Deutsch for having this hearing today. As a young
24 man of color I'm particularly concerned about the
25 school to prison pipeline and I think it's very

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 important that we ensure student safety without
3 over policing our youth. As you all know, are aware
4 of the lack of restorative justice practices that
5 have led to the overuse of suspensions and other
6 forms of punishment particularly for students of
7 colors. I would like to commend the DOE for
8 updating its discipline code to encourage the use
9 of restorative justice practices though I would
10 like to see this step taken a bit further and have
11 these processes or these practices be required, not
12 just suggested. Last year I was proud to pass Into
13 403, a reporting bill on the presence of guidance
14 counsellors and social workers in the public school
15 system. We receive the first report recently I
16 work, are now working on some data analysis that
17 would help us really understand where more of
18 these, these services are needed. However one thing
19 we wanted to analyze was the presence of SSAs along
20 with the presence, the presence of guidance
21 counsellors and social workers. We want to ensure
22 that the SSAs aren't being used as a go to when in
23 fact intervention by a counselor social worker
24 could and would be more appropriate. However when
25 my staff called NYPD to request the data about the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 presence of SAA,, SSAs in schools they were told
3 that they needed to, to foil it and that the NYPD
4 didn't want this information to be public despite
5 the fact that NYPD are already required to report
6 this data according to section 14150 of the
7 administrative code. So I asked Council Member
8 Torres or Council Member Torres actually introduced
9 his bill that we are hearing today which would
10 require the DOE to report on his information. I'd
11 like to suggest that this bill be updated so that
12 the information would be added to the report that
13 is currently required by Intro 40 through, 403. This
14 information would be added to the report that is
15 currently required by Intro 403. This information
16 along with the information generated by CM Gibson,
17 Council Gibson and Council Member Johnson's bill
18 would help us increase transparency about where
19 these officers are working and give us the tools we
20 need to ensure that the DOE isn't filling gaps in
21 its ability to implement restorative justice
22 practices by policing its students. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much
24 Council Member Reynoso and the last bill that will
25 be hearing this afternoon is Intro 730 introduced

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 by myself and Council Member Jonson and other co-
3 sponsors. It is a bill to amend the administrative
4 code of the city of New York in relation to reports
5 on school discipline and police department activity
6 relating to schools and speaking on behalf my, my
7 co-sponsor Council Member Johnson.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you Chair
9 Gibson for holding this incredibly important
10 hearing today. The student safety act was the
11 result of a four year campaign led by a coalition
12 of community based advocacy in legal organizations
13 who saw a serious need for a transparency bill that
14 would hold the NYPD and the Department of Education
15 accountable for their school safety and
16 disciplinary policies. The numbers have shown that
17 they are extreme racial disparities within the
18 education and juvenile justice system. As we know
19 African American, Latino, LGBT, special education
20 students are significantly more likely to face
21 discipline than their peers. These increased out of
22 class time and in school arrest rates in turn
23 severely decrease their likelihood of graduating
24 for high school. For instance in the 2011 2012
25 school year more than 95 percent of school based

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 arrests were of black and Latino students, more
3 than 95 percent. In addition black students
4 accounted for about 30 percent of public school
5 enrollment but more than 50 percent of suspensions.
6 Since 2011 the student safety act has provided city
7 officials with a biannual report of expulsions and
8 suspensions issued by the DOE as well as a
9 quarterly report of ticken, tickets and and
10 summonses issued by school safety agents and has
11 required all information in these reports to be
12 disaggregated by race gender and ethnicity. The
13 recent announced changes to the department of
14 education's disciplinary code are a good step in
15 the right direction aimed at decreasing unnecessary
16 suspensions, recognizing the adverse effects of
17 such punishments and fairly enhancing safety at
18 schools citywide. I want to thank our chancellor
19 Carmen Fiorina, the NYPD, Mayor de Blasio and his
20 Office of Criminal Justice as well as my colleagues
21 here on the council particularly a council member
22 and education committee chair Danny Dromm for their
23 hard work and dedication that it took to achieve
24 these recent reforms to the DOE disciplinary code.
25 Using the data that we have city officials and

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 advocacy groups made these arguments for sweeping
3 changes in the disciplinary code winning this major
4 battle just two months ago. Strengthening the
5 student safety act will give us more information to
6 devise solutions that focus less on detention and
7 more on prevention. Despite the successes of the
8 original student safety act huge gaps still exist
9 and the reporting that what we get about what's
10 going on with school discipline including the lack
11 of useful data on arrests on a school by school
12 basis. The student safety act 2.0 this bill
13 cosponsored by Chair Gibson and myself will fill
14 some of those gaps which will increase access to
15 data about the removal of children through
16 mechanism other than suspension including referrals
17 to the emergency medical services, EMS, and
18 temporary removals. It will also provide critical
19 information about the presence of metal detectors
20 in our schools and the use of mechanical
21 restraints, handcuffs on students, including some
22 as young as five years old. We must bring an end to
23 suspensions for extremely minor infractions and we
24 should focus on positive interventions to ensure
25 that all of our students have a safe supportive

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 environment in which to learn. We must keep working
3 with our educators to develop solutions that get at
4 the root causes of students' behavior and to both
5 prevent such behavior from repeating itself and to
6 keep our kids in school where they belong. I again
7 want to thank Chair Vanessa Gibson for her
8 incredible leadership and the team work that she
9 and I have been able to accomplish over these many
10 months of working together and all of the member
11 organizations of the student safety coalition who
12 each one of us has worked so close with over the
13 past year in preparing this bill Chair Gibson thank
14 you so much for the opportunity to speak and I
15 really am grateful that you and I have been able to
16 do this work together. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much
18 Council Member Johnson and I, I neglected to
19 mention Student Safety Act 2.0. It kind of goes in
20 line with our recent announcement yesterday on
21 council 2.0 where we're making the internet and the
22 website more accessible to everyday New Yorkers who
23 uses social media and other mechanisms to really
24 reach every constituent. So I appreciate that and
25 thank you very much. We've also been joined by

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 Council Members Allen Maisel and Andy King. Thank
3 you for being here. And now we will begin with our
4 first panel. Chair Dromm.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Sure. Allen Fagin
6 please from the Orthodox Union, Jeff Leb from the
7 UJA Federation of New York, Joseph Rosenberg from
8 the Catholic Community Relations Council, Joy Jones
9 from Ebenezer Preparatory School, and Debbie
10 Klugmann from Beth Jacob Boro Park. Just want to
11 remind our people giving testimony that we are
12 limiting people today to three minutes each. So
13 we're going to ask you to please keep your
14 testimony to three minutes.

15 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: You may begin.
16 You're microphone's not on.

17 ALLEN FAGIN: Sorry.

18 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay thank you.

19 ALLEN FAGIN: Good morning Chair Gibson,
20 Chair Dromm, Council Member Greenfield to whom we
21 want to extend the special acknowledgement as the
22 prime sponsor of this bill for all of your support
23 and leadership Chair Deutsch and members of the
24 committee. My name is Allen Fagin. I am the
25 Executive Vice President and Chief Executive

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 Officer of the Union of Orthodox Jewish
3 Congregations of America, the nation's largest
4 orthodox Jewish umbrella organization. On behalf of
5 the more than 106 thousand Jewish day school and
6 yeshiva students in this city and the tens of
7 thousands of students in other non-public schools
8 we want to thank you for holding this hearing on
9 this enormously important subject Intro 65. School
10 violence has become all too commonplace in our
11 society. And politically motivated attacks on
12 innocent students faculty and staff have increased
13 at an alarming rate across the globe. In 2015
14 violence can erupt at any time at any place and
15 with no warning. I think it's fair to say that most
16 of us do not choose our child's school based on its
17 security infrastructure nor should we have to. But
18 given the recent attacks in France and other highly
19 publicized incidents here at home security is at
20 the top of everyone's mind. The primary function of
21 our government is to provide security to its
22 citizens. And as it relates to security there
23 should be no distinction between public and non-
24 public schools. Every one of our citizens, everyone
25 of ur students should be entitled to protection.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 According to the justice department's bureau of
3 justice statistics more than one million nonfatal
4 criminal acts took place on school grounds in 2012
5 alone including almost 750 thousand violent
6 incidents at schools. This statistic does not
7 include the many school shootings in the two years
8 since the horrific events in Newtown Connecticut or
9 the high profile terror attacks on schools across
10 the globe including the Jewish school in Taluses
11 France in March of 2012 and the girl's school in
12 Pesewa Pakistan last December. Beyond our students'
13 physical safety having the appropriate security
14 infrastructure in place is crucial for their
15 development as well. Children need to feel safe.
16 They need to feel that they are in a secure
17 environment in order to thrive at school. And
18 certainly installing better lighting or better
19 windows or better surveillance system are ways to
20 improve the safety of a school building's physical
21 structure. The Orthodox Union has been instrumental
22 in addressing these needs on the federal level
23 spearheading the creation of the Department of
24 Homeland Security's nonprofit security grant's
25 program. But the most effective and most visible

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 way for a school to ensure the safety of its
3 students is through hiring personnel whose sole
4 responsibility is the safety and security of the
5 student body, the faculty, and staff. In New York
6 City the city government foots the bill for public
7 schools to have uniform school safety agents
8 stationed at their premises.

9 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: I'm sorry to
10 interrupt you I just need you to wrap it up. I
11 apologize. Just out of respect to your fellow
12 panelists.

13 ALLEN FAGIN: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you.

15 ALLEN FAGIN: Let me just conclude by
16 saying that...

17 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay thank you.

18 ALLEN FAGIN: ...no such protection exists
19 for the city's non-public school students. Most
20 private schools lack the capacity to provide it. We
21 thank the city council, the 46 members who have
22 signed onto this legislation for their leadership
23 on this effort and hope that this legislation will
24 pass. Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
much.

Good afternoon everyone. We just want
to thank you all for the opportunity to come and
present our remarks here today. And we want to
thank honorable David Greenfield and all those in
support of Intro 65 the School Safety Agents Act.
My name is Joy Jones and I'm the administrator of
Ebenezer Preparatory School, a small independent
Christian school that teaches students age three to
14. Been there for 34 years. On the corner of Kings
Highway and Avenue D and Foster and Brooklyn. We
want to just reiterate the need for School Safety
Agents at our school and our communities faith
because we do need this extra protection for our
students, for our parents and for all of our
faculty and staff that come out to educate our
students. Our students do exceptionally well and we
want to focus on education, academics and building
character and moral standards in our students and
we don't want to be left to just you know exposure
without the proper protection. And we know this
bill will definitely be a wonderful impact for us

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 in the school. We hope that this bill will pass.

3 Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: You may begin.

5 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Thank you. Good
6 afternoon committee Chairs Gibson, Dromm, Deutsch,
7 and members of the City Council Committees on
8 Public Safety Education and Non-Public Schools. I
9 am Joseph Rosenberg the Director of the Catholic
10 Community Relations Council representing the arch
11 dioceses of New York and the dioceses of Brooklyn in
12 New York City on local legislative and policy
13 matters. I am pleased to be before you today to
14 testify in support of Intro 65. I'd like to thank
15 Council Member Greenfield and the 46 council
16 members who are the sponsors of this very important
17 legislative initiative. Current law provides for
18 school safety agents to be assigned to public
19 schools to ensure and enhance the safety of
20 students in these facilities. This bill expands
21 that requirement to include non-public schools. If
22 passed Intro 65 would specifically require the New
23 York City Police Department upon the request of the
24 authorities of a public or non-public school to
25 assign no less than one school safety agent to such

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 school. This legislation itself is only one short
3 page but if passed speaks volumes about the
4 commitment and the absolute importance of providing
5 security for all of New York City's students. The
6 catholic schools of the archdiocese of New York and
7 the diocese of Brooklyn provide quality education
8 for over 80 thousand students from Pre-K to high
9 school in our city. Preschools are a major and
10 consistent success story in the history of New York
11 City with 99 percent of the senior class graduating
12 every year. The safety of our students is a
13 priority. Each school ensures that their doors are
14 locked during school hours and have safety plans
15 and responds to emergencies. These plans are in
16 place throughout all the catholic schools in New
17 York City. Catholic schools however have fewer
18 financial resources than public schools to invest
19 insecurity measures leaving our students more
20 vulnerable to acts of violence. In these uncertain
21 times the additional, the additional degree of
22 protection that will be provided by the passage of
23 this legislation is essential and would be a
24 tremendous assistance to the faculty and
25 administrators of the catholic schools but most

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 importantly to our student body and their families.
3 Who amongst us wants to wait for a compelling
4 incident to realize what we should have done. We
5 can do it now. Public sector funding for essential
6 nonreligious functions in catholic schools has a
7 long tradition in our city especially when it comes
8 to safety. New York City finances the harboring of
9 nurses to protect the health of students in
10 catholic schools and provides bus transportation to
11 ensure these students get to and from school
12 safely. The sponsors of this bill recognize that
13 when it comes to safety there should not and cannot
14 be a preference or advantage provide for one
15 population of students in our city over any other.
16 Public schools in New York City already have safety
17 agents in their buildings. Everyone in this chamber
18 understands that in non-public schools the same
19 protection must be in place. Our children and
20 families deserve nothing less. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you. Right on
22 time. Perfect. And you too, thank you. You may
23 begin.

24 JEFF LEB: Good afternoon Chairwoman
25 Gibson, Chairman Dromm, Chairman Deutsch, our prime

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 sponsor of this bill Council Member David
3 Greenfield as well as all the other members for
4 joining us here today and if I can be specific;
5 Council Member Williams, Council Member Lander,
6 Council Member Lancman, Council Member Treyger,
7 Council Member King, Council Member Vacca, and
8 Council Member Reynoso. Thank you so much for being
9 here at this hearing and for giving us your time.
10 My name is Jeff Leb. I'm the Managing Director of
11 Government Relations and External Affairs at UJ
12 Federation of New York and I am representing the
13 organization. We are an umbrella Jewish
14 philanthropy supporting a vast network of health
15 and human service agencies in addition to the large
16 network of Jewish schools throughout the city
17 educating about 106 thousand students. We're also
18 the largest local philanthropy in the world.
19 Education is an important communal priority and we
20 remain committed to ensuring the safety of those
21 who use the institutions with... network. We have,
22 advocate each year for an increase in the federal
23 non-profit security grant program which provides
24 funding to religious schools, helped establish a
25 four and half million dollar program in annual

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 safety grants for non-public schools on the state
3 level and to also develop relationships with the
4 NYPD and local agencies to provide active shooter
5 trainings and target... consultations for our
6 schools. That we need to prioritize security is an
7 important part of an agenda speaks to an
8 unfortunate reality. Violence is commonplace and
9 has been increasing steadily over the past several
10 years. I'm here today to folks in just one aspect
11 of our community network, non-public schools and
12 the safety of the approximately 266 thousand
13 students attending non-public schools throughout
14 New York City. New York City pays for public
15 schools to have a uniform safety officer stationed
16 at their entrances. These officers provide
17 important physical presence to deter crime and
18 ensure safety. Students and faculty feel safer
19 creating a better educational environment. This
20 year presence of a safety officer is proven to foil
21 deadly plots at schools. Just this past December in
22 Plain City, Utah students reported to a uniformed
23 officer that a fellow student was seen to have a
24 gun hidden under his clothing. The student later
25 confessed that he had planned to kill his former

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1 girlfriend and then open fire on other students.
2
3 Some non, some non-public schools do provide
4 security but the majority of non-public schools
5 cannot afford to do so. For us as parents and
6 community leaders these conversations are difficult
7 to have. We're facing each day living in a society
8 where more and more people act in unjustified
9 hatred towards others. There have been many school
10 shooting in addition to the tragedy in... Connecticut
11 including a very deadly one in Toulouse, France
12 which was referenced before in March 2012 where
13 four children and one teacher from a Jewish
14 community were injured and died. For us this
15 reality is very real. Our advocacy and other
16 funding streams have gone a long way. Federal and
17 state programs have brought millions of dollars to
18 non-public school sector for two way intercoms and
19 camera systems, bullet proof gafts, glass... lighting
20 and other important... aspects. But none of is as
21 good as an actual security officer, a trained
22 public safety professional who gets to know the
23 building, how it gets used, the community, and the
24 important people who are in it. Intro 65 will
25 guarantee the presence of an NYPD detail in all

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 non-public schools that require one with passages
3 built with safeguard all New York students
4 regardless of the school they intend and send the
5 message that in this city the safety and security
6 of all students and their teachers are important.
7 This bill is wide partisan support and we urge it's
8 immediate pass. Thank you so much.

9 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
10 much.

11 DEBBIE KLUGMANN: Good afternoon
12 everyone. I'd like to thank you for the opportunity
13 to speak. My name is Debbie Klugmann. I work for
14 Beth Jacob of Boro Park which is one of the largest
15 all girls' school in Boro Park Brooklyn. We have
16 over 2,000 children with a staff of over 300
17 people. It seems to me like a no brainer that the
18 safety of our students should always be number one.
19 And particularly in these times that every, as
20 everybody mentioned we don't want to do too little
21 too late. And we want, like to thank Councilman
22 Greenfield for his help. In the past he's visit our
23 school a couple times. Brad Lander has visited our
24 school as well. We have on staff right now we have
25 a security officer. But we could ill afford this in

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 our school. We take tuition in our school. We have
3 support staff that helps. We accommodate students
4 that have no money. We let them go on scholarship.
5 So this would be something that if you pass this
6 bill... I'm surprised there's only 47 out of 51. I
7 figured it would be 51 out of 51. Nobody mentioned
8 that maybe they're not feeling well. Anyway I would
9 just like this bill to pass as soon as possible and
10 I would like to thank you for the opportunity to
11 speak today and just let it pass. Thank you so
12 much.

13 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much
14 to each of you. I appreciate your testimony in
15 being here today. I just had one very quick
16 question because I want to turn this over to my two
17 co-chairs and then there are four colleagues that
18 do have questions for this panel. So my first
19 question is each of you talked in support of Intro
20 65 and I'd like to know the current makeup of
21 security in your schools now, the population that
22 you serve, and this bill if enacted are you doing
23 or have you done an assessment on the level of
24 safety agents that you would need for your school
25 or schools if you have more than one? If, if anyone

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 has any details to provide that would be great. So
3 number one the current structure of safety in your
4 schools and have you done an assessment to
5 determine how many safety agents if this bill
6 passes you would need for your schools.

7 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Joe Rosenberg from
8 the Catholic Community Relations Council. There are
9 approximately slightly over 200 catholic schools in
10 the five boroughs. And I think as indicated
11 previously the intent of the bill is to have at
12 least one safety security agent in each school. So
13 certainly the way the bill was drafted that would
14 be 200 security agents at the 200 schools. The
15 security that is in place right now at the bulk of
16 these schools involves an insurance that the
17 schools, the school doors are locked right after
18 the students have been admitted and remain closed.
19 Occasionally there are faculty patrolling. There
20 are an instance of some schools where they have
21 hired a part time security guard but in that the
22 resources of the catholic schools of both the
23 archdiocese and the diocese are extremely
24 stretched. That is the way it proceeds right now,
25 this bill would go tremendously far in ensuring

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 that they're safety. And that's why we support it
3 as strongly as we do.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: What about cameras?
5 You didn't mention.

6 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: There are cameras at
7 many of the entrances and exits of the schools.
8 More are currently being installed. We're aware of
9 the importance of that.

10 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

11 JOY JONES: Okay. My name is Joy Jones
12 from Ebenezer Prep School. We currently have 160
13 students in our school. We used to have a security
14 guard several years ago. We are not able to afford
15 one anymore. But we do have locked doors. We have
16 an intercom system where the people buzz in and the
17 receptionist buzzes them in. We do have
18 surveillance cameras as well throughout the
19 building and we have gates on our windows. So there
20 are security measures in place. But to have someone
21 at the door to you know police the grounds... we have
22 two buildings, we have two entrances on you know a
23 major street as well as in the back entrance. We
24 have a playground. So we do have surveillance
25 cameras there but within the budget constraints we

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 always plan more towards educational development
3 than security. But we do need the security.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. Anyone else?

5 DEBBIE KLUGMANN: My name is Debbie
6 Klugmann also Beth Jacob of Boro Park. We have one
7 guard but we have many open doorways in our
8 building. We have many connecting buildings. We
9 have a, a huge corner of Boro Park on 13th, between
10 13th and 14th Avenue and 46th Street. We have
11 surveillance cameras but there're not enough
12 personnel to patrol this whole area because it's a
13 huge, a huge building with a huge amount of
14 children.

15 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

16 JEFF LEB: If I may I can't provide a
17 comprehensive or systematic survey of what each
18 school does. Many of our schools have no capacity
19 to hire any security personnel. Some do. I would
20 say that there is funding available from the
21 Department of Homeland Security for physical
22 security infrastructure; reinforced doors, windows,
23 cameras, and related equipment that a number of
24 schools have been able to take advantage of. But
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 they do not provide for human security for
3 individuals.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Mm-hmm.

5 JEFF LEB: More importantly I think that
6 those schools that do have security guards have no
7 capacity to be able to train them or to equip them
8 in the way that they really need to be trained and
9 equipped as responders to emergency situations. So
10 having trained personnel as opposed to someone who
11 stands at the door untrained and without the real
12 capacity... When, when we've done security
13 assessments for our institutions one of the biggest
14 problems that we face is that you know sort of the,
15 the rent-a-person who stands at the door may be a
16 partial deterrence but having a truly trained
17 individual who knows how to respond to emergency
18 conditions is really the effective deterrent and
19 that's something that is beyond the capacity of
20 almost all of our schools to be able to handle.

21 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. Thank you
22 very much. We've been joined by Council Members
23 Jimmy Vacca, Brad Lander, Jumaane Williams, and
24 Inez Barron. And I will turn this hearing over to
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 my two co-chairs and I will start with Chair
3 Dromm.

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Chair
5 Gibson. And thank you all for coming in today. I
6 have some questions and I just wanted to start off
7 by first acknowledging the great work that you do
8 in terms of educating students in New York City and
9 express my support for your right to be able to do
10 that. But I do have some concerns and I have some
11 constitutional concerns and conternal [phonetic]
12 curtailment concerns in terms of what it is that we
13 as a council can or allowed to do. So my first
14 question to all of you is that you're asking for
15 the school safety agents. And I'm wondering where
16 it will end, if we give school safety agents to
17 private schools and to you know religious schools.
18 What's the next thing that you'd want?

19 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Okay. Let me give
20 that a shot. We view this as a safety measure and
21 only as a safety measure. I think that the, and I
22 don't mean to speak for my colleagues here but the
23 city has determined in the past that the safety of
24 children in non-public school is important by
25 providing nurses. The city in the past has

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 determined that the safety of the students is
3 important by providing bus transportation. This is
4 not a question of asking anything more than what
5 public school students have. A ten year old in a
6 public school has the right to be safe. A ten year
7 old in a non-public school has the right to be
8 safe. It's not just an equity issue. It also raises
9 the question of when this law was originally
10 drafted. Was there clearly a intent or an interest
11 that one segment of students should have a safety
12 protection that another doesn't. So I think that's
13 really a way certainly I feel about this point it's
14 a safety issue. You asked what would be next. The
15 focus from the perspective here is just one of
16 safety to make sure that these kids are safe.

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So what type of
18 safety protection are you looking for because
19 school safety agents are actually peace officers?
20 The NYPD is actually responsible for the prevention
21 of terrorism and I, I heard a lot of that in the
22 testimony. School safety agents have no right to
23 intervene in a terrorist attack on a school. It
24 would be the NYPD who would respond to something
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 like that. And so I'm wondering what type of
3 protection it is that you're looking for?

4 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: This would have a
5 tremendous deterrent effect on many levels. If
6 someone perhaps has the intent of entering the
7 school for a malicious purpose someone in a
8 uniform, someone who has a knight stick and a radio
9 could certainly prevent that kind of action. This
10 is just one level of many other ways that these
11 schools can be made more safe, safer. And that's
12 why we support it.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So you would
14 expect them to intervene if somebody entered the
15 school with a gun?

16 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: We think that having
17 someone on site with a radio who has access to
18 obtain help from other entities throughout the city
19 would helpful than having no one on site who would
20 be able to do that... [cross-talk]

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...but obviously...
22 [cross-talk]

23 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: ...problem that we face
24 now.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But obviously
they wouldn't be able to intervene if someone
entered the school with a gun, they are not armed
themselves.

6

JOSEPH ROSENBERG: No they're not...

7

[cross-talk]

8

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Right?

9

JOSEPH ROSENBERG: ...armed and that is

10

one reason why this is strongly supported as well.

11

[cross-talk] individuals have knight sticks...

12

[cross-talk] and they have radios so they can

13

communicate with the people who really are the

14

experts in this field to make sure that our...

15

[cross-talk]

16

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That's the NYPD.

17

JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Yes.

18

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Right?

19

JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Thank you.

20

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So why can't your

21

staff do that now?

22

JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Our staff are

23

teachers and they're teaching. That's what they're

24

doing.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So your schools
3 are unprotected right now? You have nobody... [cross-
4 talk]

5 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: No I'm not saying
6 that.

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...at the door?

8 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Our schools have the
9 doors locked and occasionally when a faculty member
10 is not teaching they patrol the halls.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: It seems to me
12 that you're asking for a cost saving measure here.
13 Estimates are running as high as 250 million
14 dollars to be able to provide school safety agents
15 in all of the private schools, money that the
16 public schools desperately need. I don't know how
17 you can justify that request.

18 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: My understanding is
19 that it perhaps cost 50 thousand dollars for a
20 school safety agent to be retained. Again my
21 recollection is that the legislation talks of at
22 least one school safety agent per school. I'm not
23 doing the math but it seems to me that this cost is
24 deminimis compared to the safety it could have and
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 the effect it could have on the protection of our
3 kids.

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I don't think we
5 can ever put a, you know a number on the safety of
6 our students but I just do think that the cost is
7 probably closer to about 250 million dollars. I'd
8 like to hear from the other panelists though on
9 both of my questions. What is, specifically is the
10 expectation that you would have for these school
11 safety agents in your schools and how would you
12 justify the costs?

13 JEFF LEB: Thank you Chairman. I, I want
14 to echo... Jeff Leb from UJ Federation of New York. I
15 want to echo a lot of what Mr. Rosenberg said being
16 that a school safety agent, a peace officer, the
17 fact that that peace officer has a uniform on acts
18 as a tremendous deterrent against you know possible
19 acts of terrorism or acts of violence in a school.
20 I think it's a tremendous deterrent. And you know
21 unfortunately many schools do not have any sort of
22 safety agents at the door. We, we heard from
23 schools here, they have lock doors, they have
24 cameras. They don't have anyone actually surveying
25 the property and surveying the school and I think

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 that the ability to, there is constant
3 communication with the NYPD and with the NYPD
4 uniform that they're wearing even though they're a
5 safety agent would be a tremendous deterrent. And
6 as far as, as far as the cost I mean you said
7 yourself how much, how much is the life of a child
8 worth, we really can't place a, a number on that.
9 And I think that in issues in security and nursing
10 as we said before we're talking about the health,
11 welfare, and safety of our students.

12 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So how many
13 terrorist attempts on your school have there been?

14 JEFF LEB: I know how many have been
15 foiled by the NYPD but you know we hear all the
16 time at you know...

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But the NYPD
18 obviously is in charge of foiling them so...

19 JEFF LEB: Of course. Well we, we've,
20 we've heard many times before the holidays there's
21 always different, there are always different
22 neighborhoods that are targeted, you know murmur
23 chatter about different, different neighborhoods,
24 different schools... We have to be on lock down all
25 the time... schools. It's not a, it's not a great

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 existence when we have to be, you know when we
3 can't have a constant presence there to at least...

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So you've had no
5 attempts, terrorist attacks on your school?

6 JEFF LEB: Very very fortunately. In, in
7 recent history in New York City there has not been
8 any terrorist attacks on any...

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is that true of
10 all the panelist? There have been no terrorist
11 attacks on your school or attempts... [cross-talk]

12 JOY JONES: We've not had terrorist
13 attacks but we've had several robberies in our
14 school... [cross-talk]

15 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: At night?

16 JOY JONES: Excuse me?

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: At night or
18 during the day?

19 JOY JONES: During the day when... [cross-
20 talk]

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: During the day
22 people have walked in and rob them?

23 JOY JONES: Yes.

24 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And did you call
25 the police?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

JOY JONES: Yes we did.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: They came in,
they took statements, they you know fingerprinted
and did things like that but it's still, it's a
deterrent to have someone there to you know be that
first line of defense, the same way in the public
schools when you enter their schools the safety
agents are there to provide you know the scanning
or take your idea or... things like that. You just
want, we just think we're entitled to get the same
help for our students as well.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: It's just
interesting to me that you would want to relinquish
control of safety over in your school. Because you
know once the school safety agents do come in
principals in the public school system for example
do not have control over the safety agents. They
have to rely on the NYPD. And I, if you were here
earlier when I gave opening remarks I mentioned...
[cross-talk] the incident that happened in, in Park
Slope where the principal was helpless to do
anything. So I'm just, it's, it's fascinating to me
that you would want to relinquish that control that

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 the principal has in your buildings over the safety
3 of your students.

4 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: The principals of the
5 archdiocese and the diocese of Brooklyn Schools are
6 very very supportive of this. They feel it is an
7 additional layer of protection.

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So they would...
9 [cross-talk] they would agree to relinquishing
10 that... [cross-talk]

11 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: ...are looking forward
12 to working with school safety agents... [cross-talk]

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That's not what
14 I'm asking. I'm asking would they relinquish
15 control because that essentially is what you would
16 be doing. You would not have a say over what that
17 school safety agent does in your school when
18 they're on your premises. That would be a decision
19 made by the NYPD and not by your principal. That's
20 one of the purposes of this hearing is that we are
21 investigating, we are looking at, we are doing
22 oversight over the role of these school safety
23 agents in the schools something that I took issue
24 with in the opening remarks. And as it stands now
25 you would have to relinquish that control over

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2 those, over those safety decisions in your schools.

3 You still support it?

4 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: If that is one of the

5 consequences of this then it is still supported

6 because... [cross-talk]

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Does everybody...

8 [cross-talk]

9 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: ...this is, this is...

10 [cross-talk]

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...on the panel

12 agree with that?

13 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: ...this is paramount.

14 This is a safety issue and we want to make sure the

15 kids are protected.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Everybody on the

17 panel agrees with that?

18 JOY JONES: Yes I agree with that.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: You all agree,

20 okay.

21 DEBBIE KLUGMANN: Excuse me, I just...

22 [cross-talk]

23 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Let me ask you

24 another question.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: Excuse me. Could I
interrupt for... [cross-talk]

2

3

4

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes.

5

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: ...a moment? I'd just
like to add one more thing. This gentleman sitting
next to me, I'm sorry I didn't catch your name.

6

7

8

ALLEN FAGIN: Allen Fagin.

9

10

11

12

13

14

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: Allen Fagin. He made a
comment that we'd like to have trained safety
officers. We don't want to have just a suit sitting
there. We'd like to have those that are trained in
dealing with this type of situation, dealing with a
school environment...

15

16

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well that's what
we want too.

17

18

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: ...dealing with
children. Like that's what we would like.

19

20

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That's what we
haven't gotten. And that... [cross-talk]

21

22

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: And that's what we...
[cross-talk]

23

24

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...that's why I'm
raising this... [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: I heard what you said
before. I agree with the part that you said. That
is what I would, we would like for our schools as
well.

2

3

4

5

6

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: No I, I agree
with you on that. And I...

7

8

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: Mm-hmm.

9

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...think that's
what the purpose of this hearing is but the
question comes down to really your willingness to
relinquish control over those decisions. Because as
it stands now that is exactly what would happen if
you had these school safety agents in your schools.

10

11

12

13

14

15

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: We would actually, yes
if that would be part, like one of the consequences
but we're hoping that you'll be successful in
getting us trained safety agents.

16

17

18

19

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well...

20

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: We're hopeful.

21

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That's the
purpose of this hearing is that...

22

23

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: Okay.

24

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Let me ask you another question. Do you abide by the New York City human rights laws? Do you subscribe to them?

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: Yes, of course.

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So you don't discriminate on the basis of sexual orientation? I know the diocese does but what about the other schools?

JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Please.

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well you've never, you've never supported the human rights code of, of New York City as, in relation to sexual orientation?

JOSEPH ROSENBERG: I don't want to practice law here Chair Dromm but I believe that there is a carve out in the human rights law for religious institutions...

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Correct.

JOSEPH ROSENBERG: ...to follow the precepts of their religion. We abide by the human rights law in all of its... [cross-talk]

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But when you ask for public funding then I think you have to abide by public laws and public rules. And one of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 things that we say in New York City is that we do
3 not value discrimination for all of the protected
4 classes. But in particular I have a, a certain
5 thing because I had a friend who was fired from a
6 Catholic School for marching in the St. Patrick's
7 Parade. Mary Louis Academy as a matter of fact. And
8 that's why I'm curious to know that you're willing
9 to hire same sex school safety agents in your
10 schools and to uphold their right to talk about and
11 to actively engage with people in your schools and
12 talk just as a, a heterosexual couple would about
13 their family and there would be no consequences for
14 that.

15 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: I, I don't believe
16 that the agents that we're talking about would be
17 employees of the schools.

18 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That is, that is
19 correct. But if they did I'm asking if you would
20 support their right to be able to do so.

21 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: But they don't.

22 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm sorry?

23 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: But they don't. They
24 are not employees of the schools. The schools will
25 not be responsible... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: You're not
3 answering my question. My question is do you, do
4 you agree with the New York City Human Rights Law
5 that protects classes of people based on religion,
6 sexual orientation, race, etcetera and if you do
7 not then I don't know why you're asking for our
8 employees.

9 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Let me see if I can
10 summarize. We believe in the provisions of the
11 human rights law. We equally believe in the
12 provisions of the human rights law that uphold the
13 right of religions to follow the dictates of their
14 practices which is embedded... [cross-talk]

15 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That's not what
16 I'm asking though sir...

17 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Excuse me... [cross-
18 talk]

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What I'm... No no...
20 [cross-talk]

21 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Excuse me...

22 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...excuse me this
23 is our hearing first of all.

24 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: But you've, you've
25 asked the question I'm trying to...

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...excuse me.

3

JOSEPH ROSENBERG: ...respond to you.

4

5

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm not asking
that. You're avoiding the question that I'm asking.

6

7

The question that I'm asking is whether or not you
would be able to uphold that person's right to be

8

in your school as a school safety agent as an

9

openly gay person? Would you uphold that right? Yes

10

or no?

11

JOSEPH ROSENBERG: The answer is they

12

would not be our employees..

13

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That's not...

14

JOSEPH ROSENBERG: It would not be up to

15

us to hire them, to terminate them, or to

16

discipline them.

17

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright I, Chair

18

I have a lot of problems with this issue and I

19

think that we're headed in the wrong direction.

20

Thank you.

21

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you. We've

22

been joined by Council Members Ritchie Torres and

23

Debbie Rose. And now we're going to turn this over

24

to my other co-chair Chair Deutsch.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Thank you. And thank you very much. Let's talk about school safety offices actually patrolling the outside of your school building. Let's say we pass an intro requiring the city of New York to give school safety agents to be... outdoor vicinity of your school building to protect the, the, the school, the children who are in the school. My question is is that if, if you should see someone suspicious or something out of the ordinary or watch something in one of your cameras what is your protocols? What do you do?

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Currently if someone is seen who's suspicious then the local precinct would be contacted. Generally there is not an interest in directly confronting someone where there is a concern that they might be interested in entering the school illegally or causing harm to any of the kids?

21

22

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Okay did you need to notify 9-1-1? [cross-talk]

23

24

JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Yes... [cross-talk]

25

yes.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: And what was
3 the response time?

4 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Immediate response.
5 Sometimes as shortly as two minutes or so. Luckily
6 in most instances the person had already left so
7 there wasn't any confrontation.

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: So it's, so and
9 where's your, where's your school, you're talking
10 about which school? Any specific school that they
11 had a quick response time?

12 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: These were a handful
13 of schools that...

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Handful of
15 schools.

16 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: ...go throughout the
17 five boroughs that are under the jurisdiction of
18 the catholic church... the diocese or the archdiocese
19 of New York.

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Okay so the
21 police respond, could I, let me get, I want to get
22 a, an answer from everyone in the panel if you
23 don't mind the same questions.

24 JOY JONES: Similar response. We'd call
25 9-1-1 as well. Sometimes one of the teachers... we

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 don't... well one of the teacher's cars was being
3 broken into went, and he went out and was pretty
4 much running out to the person but that's a
5 ridiculous response. But generally we call 9-1-1
6 and have a police officer come. Sometimes they're
7 prompt sometimes they're not.

8 ALLEN FAGIN: I, I, I don't know what
9 the protocol is on a school by school basis.

10 DEBBIE KLUGMANN: I, I don't know about
11 a school by school basis but in our school we would
12 call 9-1-1 if we saw something suspicious. That
13 would be our first you know...

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Great.

15 DEBBIE KLUGMANN: ...response.

16 JEFF LEB: For the, the schools in our,
17 in our membership for the most part obviously the,
18 the first move is to call 9-1-1 but I've been told
19 that response times are... varied between the schools
20 between the type of incident. You know it could
21 take as quick as two minutes or as much as five
22 minutes or a half hour depending on the type of
23 incident. So obviously if there was a say school
24 safety officer on premises you know we'd probably a
25 more expeditious response.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: So you feel
having a school safety agent that has a radio on
him with direct contact to the NYPD which I believe
they do have... so you believe it's beneficial right?
Let's go around the panel if you don't mind.

JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Yes absolutely and
that's why we support this legislation so strongly.
The, you can have someone here who would... we
contact 9-1-1 they're there promptly. This
additional level of protection though would be
absolutely essential and crucial to making sure
that the school...

JOY JONES: Yes I agree.

ALLEN FAGIN: Yes, absolutely.

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: We agree as well. That
would make it a quicker response. That would have
like a better connection for us, more immediate is
what we feel and we're happy for this legislation.

JEFF LEB: Obviously I'm in full
agreement.

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Okay. Question
did you receive like an invite or go through some
type of counterterrorism training most recently or
within the last couple of years, few years that you

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 were notified to some training by the police
3 department to attend let's say active shooter
4 training. Did anyone have some type of training...
5 Because I know that the NYPD did have an active
6 shooter training that they did have, they did reach
7 out to different communities as well as they had a
8 number of training courses that they did within OEM
9 and emergency response and, and different divisions
10 of NYPD that in case there, god forbid there is an
11 active shooter how they respond to it so... So I, I
12 see that the threat is like real. I know that in my
13 district, I know for myself that there was an
14 individual who was wearing a cap, an ICIS cap and
15 because of the alertness of several individuals in
16 the school they were able to divert anyone, that,
17 that individual from coming into the school and
18 notify 9-1-1 where the police responded and, and
19 took the person out. Do you have in the same, the
20 buildings that your facilities, your institutions
21 are, do you have special needs children that you
22 have classes for.

23 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: We have several
24 schools that are dedicated exclusively to special
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 needs students as well as general schools that have
3 special need populations as well.

4 JOY JONES: We're not equipped to handle
5 students with special needs in our school.

6 ALLEN FAGIN: Yes many, many of our
7 schools have either set aside programs or
8 structured classrooms for special need students.

9 DEBBIE KLUGMANN: Our school has special
10 need students as well, all ages, several.

11 JEFF LEB: Likewise. The schools in our
12 membership have either classes set aside or fully
13 integrated classes with special needs individuals.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: So you feel
15 that having a school safety agent outside would be
16 beneficial by having you know by having these
17 special needs in the building you feel that the
18 school safety agent would be beneficial to protect
19 these children as well?

20 JEFF LEB: Absolutely. In the same manor
21 that the public school special need children have
22 this protection so should the children that are
23 under the jurisdiction of the people here. Agreed
24 completely.

25 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Do you agree.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: Yeah we agree.

3

4

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Alright thank
you very much. Okay no further questions at this
point. Thank you.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much
Chair Deutsch. And now we have a number of
colleagues that have questions. And to all of my
colleagues unfortunately we have a time limit. The
administration is coming at 3:00 and we are very
anxiously awaiting their arrival and their
testimony so we have several panels after this
current panel. So I ask each of you to be
cognoscente of the time frame and get through your
questions as quickly as possible. We will begin
with Council Member Barron followed by Council
Member Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madam
Chair and to the co-chairs that are hosting this
very important hearing and to my colleagues I
didn't jump the line. I was here earlier so...
Because I see... I see the daggers. Why is she first,
she just got here... So I just wanted you to know I
did establish protocol earlier. I was an elementary
school teacher and I retired from the Board of Ed

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 as a principal. The building of which I was a
3 principal was located in Bedford Stuyvesant. It was
4 a four story building. There were about 700
5 students at that time, about 75 staff members, and
6 I believe there were about 24 doors to my school.
7 Of course we know doors are not locked from the
8 inside so that any time if a child were to go out
9 and leave a door ajar unattended someone might
10 enter. Initially I had two school safety agents but
11 then due to budget cuts one was pulled so I had one
12 school safety agent. The New York Times recently
13 cited the passing of Reverend Doctor Gardner C.
14 Taylor who was a genius and a giant in terms of
15 preaching, in terms of fighting for civil rights,
16 in terms of education. He served as a senior pastor
17 at Concord Baptist Church in Brooklyn. He
18 established an elementary school, a senior housing
19 development, and another development to provide for
20 the needs of the community. In terms of using
21 federal and city funds to address the needs of
22 private schools he was very much opposed to that. I
23 am as well very much opposed to using city funds
24 for non-public schools. We know that our budgets
25 are strapped. We know that children's lives are

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 important. All of that is very true. It's my
3 opinion that if a parent chooses for whatever
4 reason to put their child in a private school they
5 need to bear the responsibility of the costs of
6 what it takes for that school to operate. I do not
7 believe that city funds should be taken and given
8 to the needs of children within a private separate
9 building that is not available to public school, to
10 public students. If that's your choice then I think
11 as a part of the responsibility for the operation
12 of that school you need to bear the responsibility
13 of that cost. Additionally, in addition to the
14 comments raised by the Chair of Education who was
15 again a member of the Board of Education has a very
16 detailed insight as to how schools operate. We're
17 talking about the fact that school safety agents
18 are in fact as has been said employed by the board
19 of, by the Police Department to function in the
20 schools. But those are positions that are in short
21 number. I'm very pleased. I've heard some little
22 innuendos about the functioning of school safety
23 agents. I have to defend them in my particular
24 school because they operated in conjunction with
25 what my philosophy was and the culture that I

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 sought to establish. They were highly regarded,
3 highly respected, known in the community, and
4 respected in the community. I think that this Intro
5 65 is misguided. I think that private schools need
6 to bear the cost of operating in the totality of
7 what it needs for their children to attend those
8 schools. I do not think it's a burden that public,
9 public taxpayers should bear. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much
11 Council Member Barron. And now we will have Council
12 Member Lancman followed by Council Member Reynoso.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Thank you. Good
14 afternoon. So I, I want to address a couple of
15 topics. I mean there are things that I'm, that I'm
16 hearing that I, I didn't think were up for debate
17 but I think might need some clarification. And I
18 speak with some experience both as a, as a parent
19 of students, kids who attended Jewish day schools,
20 two of whom still do as well as representing the
21 large Jewish community and for that matter a large
22 Muslim community as well who have their own
23 security concerns. The threat of terrorism against
24 Jewish institutions including schools is real and
25 acute. And I'm, I find it a little odd that I, that

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2 I need to say that and clarify that but I'm sure
3 that you in the schools that you operate have
4 briefed your parents on the level of terrorism
5 threat at your institutions the same way that I
6 have been briefed as a parent of students at two
7 different Jewish day schools especially after the
8 wave of terrorist attacks against Jewish schools in
9 particular in Europe, the most sensational was the
10 murder of four Jewish students in, in France a
11 couple of years ago. Is that part of your, your
12 regular dialogue with parents, the threat level?
13 And, and is that part of the briefings that you
14 receive from your local precincts as, as the
15 schools that I, that my kids go to receive?

16

ALLEN FAGIN: Yes councilman that's
17 certainly been our experience is that most schools
18 are running the same type of parent education
19 programs and staff education programs that you're
20 familiar with. I don't believe that those
21 educational programs are a substitute for the type
22 of physical security... [cross-talk]

23

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: I understand.
24 But... [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 ALLEN FAGIN: ...that Intro 65... [cross-
3 talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANMAN: ...but... I
5 understand that but your institutions like mine
6 have been briefed on threat levels and, and that is
7 transmitted out to the parents.

8 ALLEN FAGIN: Absolutely. And, and there
9 are agencies within our community including SCN,
10 Safe Community Network that goes institution to
11 institution conducting threat assessments and
12 looking at ways to enhance physical... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: So...

14 ALLEN FAGIN: ...security.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: ...I understand.
16 So, and the schools that my kids have attended and
17 the schools that are in my district the security
18 that's provided and... is very ad hoc. Their, someone
19 that they hire within the budget that they have
20 they may have varying degrees of professional
21 experience. They don't have a direct link to the
22 NYPD. They're not particularly trained the way that
23 school safety officers are. And do you find in, in
24 the communities that you interact with that there's
25 the same kind of like ad hoc let's pull something

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 together with the resources that we have security
3 system that is, is far from the level of
4 professionalism and organization that we see from
5 public security, public safety agents.

6 ALLEN FAGIN: Councilman I think you've
7 hit the nail exactly on the head. I know our
8 organization has a security guard. Security guard
9 sits at a, at a reception desk and is there and has
10 a telephone and can respond if there is an issue.
11 But that person is not trained to be able to
12 observe surroundings to be able to anticipate
13 issues. And I, and I think we've got to draw
14 distinction between reaction to a violent incident
15 and the ability to prevent that incident in the
16 first instance. Many of the situations that we've
17 read about which luckily have averted catastrophe
18 have been situations where someone recognized that
19 surveillance of an institution was taking place and
20 the NYPD was notified. They were able to catch the
21 perpetrators or perspective perpetrators before any
22 damage was done. That requires a level of training
23 and a level of sophistication. This is a science.
24 It's not a question of having a warm body just
25 standing there. There, there is training to be had

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 here in observation of surroundings, in recognizing
3 potential threats, that's why we have safety
4 agents. And, and as I understand it the thrust of
5 this legislation is simply to provide parody...

6 [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: And let me, let
8 me just, let me just ask you a question about
9 parody. Because as a, as a parent of a student,
10 students in, in these religious schools I accept
11 the fact that I'm going to pay separate tuition.
12 For that I'm not availing myself of the public
13 schools. I, I do want to just clarify all of your
14 parents who are paying this separate tuition
15 they're also New York City taxpayers right?

16 ALLEN FAGIN: Absolutely.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Okay.

18 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: I thought so.

20 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much
21 Council Member Lancman. Next Council Member Reynoso
22 followed by Council Member Williams.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you
24 Chair. I just wanted to ask for the diocese
25 specifically. What is the, do you know the ratio

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 breakdown of the, the demographic breakdown of your
3 schools? Do you have that handy?

4 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: You're referring to
5 how many schools are in Brooklyn and Queens?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: No, no how
7 many, the students breakdown of...

8 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Of ethnicity?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Yes ethnicity.

10 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: I, I can get that to
11 you. It has a very large percentage of minorities
12 in, in the schools throughout the entire city.
13 They, many of them are children of immigrants.
14 There are many low income individuals as well. It,
15 it mirrors the city system to a tremendous... [cross-
16 talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Would, would, I
18 would really appreciate that, that, that
19 information. And also what about income breakdown?
20 Do you also have that available?

21 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: I can provide that to
22 you. Again there's a tremendous amount of low
23 income. These reflect the families of the cities.
24 Schools in certain neighborhoods reflect the
25 individuals who live in those neighborhoods.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So you feel
3 that you're going to be able, you can showcase
4 through those documents that the income breakdown
5 and the ethnic breakdown of the, of your students
6 is reflective of the districts that you serve?

7 JOOSEPH ROSENBERG: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Or the
9 districts that you're located?

10 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Yes absolutely.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay. And I
12 just want... For full disclosure I went to a Catholic
13 School. I went to Lasd Academy [sp?]

14 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Mm-hmm.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...in, in
16 Manhattan. And I just want to say at a, at a
17 personal experience there were several incidents
18 and several times where you know I felt my safety
19 was threatened. And we had a dean that was, that
20 had intervened twice. He was a ex-Marine. And
21 because of it he handled the situations very well.
22 But I do want to say that there are going to be a
23 lot of valid points here on why we can't or can do
24 this. But I think at the foundation of it all is
25 just safety of, of children in the city of New

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 York. I do want to say that I wanted to see if we
3 can add a, a amendment for no objection in regards
4 to race, religion, creed, whether you're LGBT or
5 not. I just want, there's no objection. If you got
6 a safety agent that is your safety agent and there
7 can be no objection. I want to make sure that that
8 is part of this.

9 JEFF LEB: I just want a, I just want
10 add thank you very much Council Member. I just want
11 to add to your point and to a point made by
12 Chairman Dromm before that a lot of, a lot of
13 members of the staff and faculty of our member
14 schools are openly LGBT. So...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Just no
16 objection. You, you get a safety agent...

17 JEFF LEB: None once so ever.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay. But I
19 want that written in legislation, in the
20 legislation. I want to make sure that it, yes. No,
21 no word yet... But, but these are real concerns that
22 you know Council Member Dromm has, has said.
23 There's human rights issues here. There's a lot of
24 issues that, that I think, I would love to address.
25 I don't think that we have the capacity in this

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 hearing to do that. But I do want to say that
3 they're real, his concerns, and, and are things
4 that we should be mindful of. But again if you
5 break it all down it's about the safety of children
6 and I was one of those children at one time and I
7 would have appreciated some level of, of
8 professionalism in the safety that I received in
9 that time. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
11 much. Just a quick question. I think one of you
12 talked about some of your schools that currently
13 have some level of a security officer. Has there
14 been any conversation with training some of your
15 staff so that they could have more experience in
16 securing the schools? I don't remember who said but
17 someone has schools.

18 DEBBIE KLUGMANN: Actually we have it in
19 our school right now.

20 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

21 DEBBIE KLUGMANN: It's sort of like
22 rent-a-suit and take the packages in kind of a
23 thing meaning that they don't have the experience
24 at all to be capable of you know quick response.
25 They're more like making sure that you know they,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 they do like other things. They're not specifically
3 designated as the official security officer. It's
4 more like watch the door pre-receptionist let's
5 call it you know. So it's really very necessary for
6 our school somebody that would be trained as a you
7 know special agent to help us with this. Because
8 right now we feel, our parents feel actually that
9 their children are, are unsafe. They constantly
10 concerned about this. It's a constant issue. I want
11 to address one thing that's, that I heard one of
12 the council members mention. It's different, we
13 don't have the threat within our school, it's
14 outside of our school. It's like our children, our
15 younger children, they don't come to school, we
16 don't have the need for like, they don't come to
17 school with knives or guns or anything that have to
18 be checked because we have pre-k through eighth
19 grade in an all-girls school. And also it's a
20 different time. It's like the threat is from the
21 outside, not from within, not from within our
22 student body. Meaning that's why we'd need the
23 patrol on the outside of our school.

24

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. But all of
you recognize the current role of SSAs where they
you know are physically inside of a school...

5

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: Yes.

6

7

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: ...so it's not their
job to go outside and patrol the perimeters of that
particular school building right?

9

10

11

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: But see by the door,
the entryways is where we're, we're concerned
about...

12

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

13

14

15

16

17

18

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: ...getting into our
building. The protection of before you get into our
building. They shouldn't even get into our
building. That's where we would need them right in
front, like the front line officer if that's what
you'd like to call it. That's what I would think.

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

JEFF LEB: Chairwoman yes, as mentioned
before by Council Member Greenfield and Chairman
Deutsch they, there is lots of federal money goes
into training the, you know some of the faculty
and, and administration of the schools as they
recognize that you know religious schools are a
higher target for terrorist attacks. But the issue

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 is that even if the training gets done it's too
3 late often by the time the person, a faculty person
4 has the ability to actually use that training. By
5 having the school safety agent at the front visible
6 to the school that acts as a tremendous deterrent
7 that someone who's trained in terrorism
8 preparedness would not be able to you know
9 administer.

10 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: So each of you has
11 described relatively low crime within the school or
12 no crime at all. So absent of this legislation
13 passing moving forward what are your schools, what
14 are you going to do to address safety of your
15 children. So everything not being predicated on
16 passage of this bill but how do you move forward
17 and educate your children and provide the public
18 safety that's necessary?

19 JEFF LEB: Well I can't speak for all
20 the, all, all the panelists and all the schools
21 here but obviously some schools have the ability to
22 have security guards and safety agents or security
23 guards and some schools don't. And it's really a
24 matter of you know finances being able to afford
25 that security officer. So for those who don't,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 they'll you know try to put more money into the
3 infrastructure keeping the doors locked, taking the
4 safety precautions but there really is no
5 substitute for an actual body.

6 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: That's the same
7 instance that we would have with the catholic
8 schools throughout the five boroughs. Some schools
9 have perhaps slightly larger budgets than others.
10 Most of them have tremendously strained resources.
11 I think you're all witnesses to schools
12 occasionally having been closed because of physical
13 constraints in lowering student bodies but the
14 intent would be here is to just make sure that
15 everyone ad additional training, make sure that the
16 school, the doors were locked at the right time.
17 And if schools did have the ability to hire anyone
18 to monitor the hallways they would give them
19 additional training but that really is the reason
20 why we're here because most of these schools do not
21 have the ability to hire people of that nature to
22 protect their kids.

23 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. Let's move
24 forward. Council Member Williams followed by
25 Council Member Maisel.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you
3 Madam Chair and to all the chairs. Thank you for
4 your testimony. So I just want to be clear what I
5 think... I don't know if it's the elephant in the
6 room, I don't know what it is I think what people
7 are focused on, the fundamental question should we
8 be spending money private educational institutions,
9 particularly private religious educational
10 institutions. So I'm on the bill. I plan to stay on
11 it but I do have trepidation, I do have some
12 questions. And what's keeping me on is it seems
13 like we've had this discussion, it's definitely
14 worry that have but the city had decided that the
15 answer is yes because they have funded nurses, they
16 funded bussing, they funded books and things of
17 that nature. So there seems to be a continuation of
18 that. But I think there's some legitimacy in still
19 asking questions so I wanted to first follow-up on
20 one of the first questions I heard which was what,
21 what makes this different than, than you coming
22 back and saying we should pay for some additional
23 teachers. Like what, how does this, where does,
24 where is a line in what should be funded and should
25 not be funded?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 JEFF LEB: This is not just a parody
3 issue or an equity issue. I think this is an
4 instance especially because of un, such uncertain
5 times and the, I don't want to be a prophetess like
6 Cassandra here but there also... targets. Fortunately
7 they have not occurred in the city of New York but
8 this is not asking for money for an additional
9 teacher to teach kids science or an additional
10 cafeteria aid to provide more options for food.
11 This is a visceral strong need that the public
12 school students have, that we feel very strongly
13 that the private school students have. It's
14 actually, we feel it's that direct and visceral a,
15 a point where the protection should be for all the
16 students in the school.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I, I, I hear
18 that. And again I still think the conversation
19 needs to continue because I think there is a
20 legitimate point of someone saying if you're going
21 to this institution you bear responsibility for
22 getting the education and the... things that come
23 with it. And so, but we have, a city have decided
24 something else which is why I'm on the bill. But
25 I'm not, I'm still not clear from your answer when

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 does it stop? Like we can have this discussion
3 about a lot of things that are needed in the, the
4 religious institution and, and in private
5 institutions because I, I'm still not clear how do
6 you differentiate, I mean there can be dire
7 situations that come around, maybe there's funding
8 laws you don't have any teachers teaching. And so I
9 mean I think that is a question that really needs
10 to be answered. And I, I am concerned and I think
11 we just have to have this discussion as we move
12 forward I'm not, I'm still going to continue to
13 support the bill based on the precedence that's
14 been set. But I think it's a question that is worth
15 asking as we're fighting for every dollar for
16 public school how do we decide when to chop off
17 some of that to give it to private institutions? My
18 last question I just wanted to ask more clearly..
19 would you seek transfers for agents that are from
20 the LGBT community?

21 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: No.

22 JEFF LEB: No.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

24 Thank you Madam Chair.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much
Council Members. Next Council Member Maisel.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

So I assume you'll agree with that?

24

DEBBIE KLUGMANN: Absolutely.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: That's just a
3 sticky way of making a statement. The other thing
4 is for those, for the, for the, not for the
5 catholic schools because catholic schools have a
6 different mode of operation but in the non-public
7 in the Jewish schools for the most part no I was, I
8 taught in a, in the Jewish... school. Most of the
9 teachers after the third grade are public school
10 teachers who finish their work at 3:00 and then go
11 to the, the Yeshivas to teach. It would be
12 physically impossible to train any of those
13 teachers other than trying to get them to go
14 through traffic faster so they can get to their
15 assignments by 3:30. The other question is that,
16 that I really want to ask is how often is there a
17 liaison with the police department in your, in your
18 localities? How often do the police get in touch
19 with you about concerns? So if there's something
20 that happened in an international way... Well let,
21 let me give you an example. I worked 20 years ago.
22 There was a, a threat from outside the country. The
23 police department was very concerned about it. And
24 for about two or three weeks all of the teachers in
25 the school, before we could go home we had to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 escort our students to the bus stop, make sure
3 everybody got on the bus stop if they weren't
4 taking school busses. If they were taking city
5 transportation we had to be there to make sure they
6 got on the busses safely. I'm not sure what would
7 have happened if there was a threat because I
8 certainly wasn't trained to deal with any threats.
9 So there's no way that the public school teachers
10 who are going to the, the Yeshiva after 3:00 in any
11 way could be of any assistance if god forbid there
12 was some kind of threat. Would you agree with that?

13 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Definitely.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Is that
15 consensus?

16 [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Well then I rest
18 my case.

19 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you Council
20 Member Maisel. And now we will hear from Council
21 Member Greenfield.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you
23 Madam Chair. I appreciate it. So just wanted to
24 clarify a few things as a sponsor of the bill
25 because I think some folks may not have all the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 details. The first thing is that the bill is
3 actually priced out at approximately 50 million
4 dollars if every single school were to participate
5 and quite frankly I don't think that every school
6 would to participate to speak to Chair Dromm's
7 point I think some schools would probably opt out
8 for whatever reason. So the max cost is 50 million
9 but realistically it probably would be a lot less.
10 The second point I want to make which I think is
11 important is we're not taking any money away from
12 public schools. This is a safety issue. This is a
13 budget that goes to the NYPD. The NYPD has a budget
14 of well over four billion dollars with a B. This
15 would be adding a few million dollars to the NYPD's
16 budget and certainly we're not taking anything away
17 from the Department of Education in terms of the
18 public schools. Council Member Williams to your
19 point in terms of when does it stop I think, I
20 think that's what we call the legislative process
21 which is that folks are going to come in and
22 they're going to ask for things and we're going to
23 have to decide when we give it to them and when we
24 don't. I think what we can all agree upon is that
25 when it comes to the safety of our children it

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 doesn't matter what their religious beliefs are or
3 whether they go to public or non-public schools,
4 just like it doesn't really matter when you call 9-
5 1-1 they don't ask you hey what are your religious
6 views, what are your personal views, what are your
7 political views, oh well we're not sure if we're
8 going to respond to this call because we don't
9 agree with you. That's not, that's not how we do
10 public safety in New York or anywhere else in this
11 county. We base it on the need. The reality is that
12 there is a need for public safety for children.
13 These children have the same blood that courses
14 through their veins as any other child in New York
15 including those in non-public schools and in public
16 schools. They have parents like any other child in
17 New York. They've got brothers and sisters and
18 aunts and uncles and grandparents who care about
19 them as much as everyone else and that's what we're
20 talking about and it's one issue and it's public
21 safety. And so I certainly understand that there's
22 always a need and an interest and we come to a
23 hearing where we like to talk about many different
24 issues but I would like to refocus us on in fact
25 the one and singular issue and that is do children

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 need public safety in non-public schools? And so my
3 question is really going to focus on that to the
4 panel. And it's, it's a difficult question to ask
5 because it puts you in a tough position. But the
6 reality is... Do you feel like your children are
7 adequately protected now and do you believe that
8 having school safety agents would increase their
9 protection to a minimal level similar to that of
10 public school children?

11 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: We have done all we
12 can in terms of trying to maximize the security in
13 our schools as I previously said. There are
14 cameras. There are occasionally people who are
15 hired. It is, we have no doubt that the passage of
16 Intro 65 would improve and maximize security and
17 have a tremendous deterrent effect moving forward
18 here. We think it is an absolutely essential bill.
19 We thank you for being the prime sponsor of it.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you.
21 Is it fair to say that the panel agrees with that
22 assessment? [cross-talk] ...I think that really needs
23 to be our focus. The reality is that this year
24 we're going to spend approximately two billion
25 dollars more than we spent last year. We have more

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 revenue in this city. We have more spending. We
3 spend on a lot of different very important issues.
4 The question I think that we have here today which
5 is a basic question and that is of the two billion
6 dollars of more money that we spend do we spend a
7 few million dollars to ensure that a quarter of a
8 million school children, these are regular kids,
9 they're innocent kids, they didn't do anything to
10 anybody, they didn't beat up on anyone, they're
11 just going to school, whether those children
12 deserve to be safe. And I think that really is the
13 critical issue. And I think you would all agree
14 that right now the resources just aren't there. And
15 I think Joe you said it best you're dealing with
16 limited resources, you're doing the best that you
17 can but the reality is you can't have a school
18 safety agent in front of every school because you
19 can't afford it. And if we're getting into details
20 I would care to mention that incidentally that the
21 reason we have so much extra money in our budget is
22 because approximately four and half billion dollars
23 of savings that these non-public schools provide to
24 the city of New York, that they're actually not
25 spending this money. So I don't think it's whether

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 we agree or disagree on in terms of the schooling
3 and the education and the beliefs. I think the
4 focus needs to be on the safety of our children and
5 that is paramount. And I think every parent
6 watching this on television and every reporter who
7 has a brother or sister or a child or a niece or a
8 nephew and every council member has to ask
9 themselves a very basic question; do we want our
10 kids to be safe or not? That's the only question
11 that we're dealing with. And certainly we can have
12 enlightened and interesting conversations about
13 different issues but the bottom line is this, this
14 budget and this bill deals with one singular issue,
15 the safety of that individual child. And the votes
16 are going to be very clear. You either support a
17 child's safety or if you vote against it you don't
18 support children safety and that's really what my
19 legislation is all about. Thank you very much.

20 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much
21 Council Member Greenfield. And thank you to our
22 panel. Thank you for being here today. Thank you
23 for your testimony. And we look forward to working
24 with you. Thank you. We're going to call our next
25 panel so we can move this hearing along. Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Our next panel
3 will be Ahmed, Ahmad Hamid Al-Noor School, Steven
4 Lorch I believe Solomon Schechter School of
5 Manhattan, Stuart Klammer from the Shulamith School
6 of Brooklyn, Barry Spitzer from the Brooklyn from
7 Brooklyn Community Board 12, David Tanenbaum from
8 Agudath Israel of America, and Daniella Gatlib
9 [sp?] of the Luria Academy.

10 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay Mr. Hamid
11 we're, okay you may begin. Thank you all for be..
12 And we have to remind you all that there is a three
13 minute timeframe so if you could summarize any of
14 your remarks just to get through out of respect to
15 all of your fellow panelist. Thank you very much
16 again.

17 AHMAD HAMID: [off mic] Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Hit the red button.

19 AHMAD HAMID: Thank you Madam
20 Chairperson and members of the panel. Thank you for
21 the opportunity to speak. I, I represent Al-Noor
22 School, one of the largest Muslim school in New
23 York with about 650 kids. Founded in about 1995. We
24 do have a security officer but with our size and
25 having three buildings our finance will not afford

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 the kind of security required. Security and safety
3 of our students have, has never been so important
4 as it is right now. Schools may have security
5 personnel but most of them are not trained to
6 handle dangerous situations. The shootings and
7 crimes within a school, within the schools
8 emphasize the importance of security. People with a
9 criminal and sick mind are bent on violence and
10 will not differentiate between public or private
11 school between races or religious beliefs. Private
12 schools provide education with specific reference
13 to Muslim schools. There are about 5,000 students
14 scattered in the city. And collectively non-public
15 schools provide education for about 25 percent of
16 students. These students who attend private schools
17 are equally, they are equally entitled to the
18 security of their school provided by the state. The
19 extent to which this can happen depends on the
20 representation... Israel as the deliberation of
21 members of the council. But the fact remains that
22 the students of private schools need to be feel
23 secured and wants to come to school feeling that
24 they're secured, their parents will feel it of
25 degree of confidence that in a crisis their

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 students will be protected. The question might be
3 raised about terrorism. Every time there's an
4 incident on the international scene I give specific
5 instructions to our school personnel that... exercise
6 strict measures of security. Even example if to be
7 specific if something happens in Pakistan or
8 something happens in Israel, something happens in
9 Pakistan or something happens in Israel or
10 something happens in, in Iraq by ISIS we are very
11 much concerned of a repercussion or, or, or
12 response in a New York City and within our schools
13 and neighborhood. Thank you very much.

14 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
15 much. You may begin.

16 STUART KLAMMER: Okay. My name is Stuart
17 Klammer. I'm head of Shulamith School in, in
18 Flatbush in Midwest section. I want to thank
19 Councilman Greenfield and Councilman Deutsch and
20 the Chairs Gibson and Dromm... And thank you for,
21 Council Members for sponsoring this bill. In my
22 area where we, where my school is located as you
23 are aware several... three members of, potential
24 members of ISIS were captured not that long ago.
25 Also swastikas were placed upon, or painted upon

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 automobiles. Not far from my school Leiby Kletzky
3 was abducted and murdered several years ago. These
4 are very real crimes and there are things that are
5 on the minds of my parents and even my students and
6 they have nightmares about these kinds of things
7 practically after the Leiby Kletzky incident and
8 the ISIS fighters incident my teachers, my faculty
9 was, was terrified. And hate crimes in fact come
10 very close to home. The incident in Taluses France
11 was mentioned recently. One of the teachers in my
12 school had family in that school in France and so
13 that hit very close to home. And when we heard
14 about incidents in our own neighborhood it was
15 particularly frightening. I spent most of my day
16 unlike today with children. And you see I'm wearing
17 a bus tie. And I'm watching the children as they
18 get on the busses as they enter the school in the
19 morning. And as they go about their daily
20 activities And I'm, frankly I'm very frightened.
21 I'm frightened as I look around the neighborhood,
22 as I read the newspapers everyday but I, I try to
23 hide my fright an put on a good face and I smile.
24 But I see my children, the girls in my school,
25 they're quite frightened. It's an all-girl school.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 And I see my faculty also. And that's what this is
3 about. This is about providing a measure of safety
4 so that my faculty can teach and my students can
5 learn without interruption and without fear, that
6 they're able to go to school each and every day
7 without, without having to worry. And I would
8 strongly urge the council to sponsor this again. I
9 would also stress this is not a measure of
10 religious parody but it's a matter of safety of the
11 children. And also we spoke a lot about physical
12 safety. But I'm also concerned about psychological
13 and emotional safety that the, the students in my
14 school should be able to sit there at their desk
15 and not have to worry about what's going on
16 outside, who's going to enter their school. And
17 we've tried, we've, we've used precious funds which
18 we can ill afford because my school provides an
19 education for multiple ethnicities for multiple
20 backgrounds from all different countries from all
21 over the world. And many of my parents can ill
22 afford the tuition and we provide many
23 scholarships. So we have diverted funds and to try
24 to pay for security but it's a tremendous
25 tremendous strain on our budget and that money

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 would be spent rather for education for textbooks
3 for paying salaries for teachers rather than for
4 providing security which is very very difficult for
5 us to afford. So I, I applaud the council and I
6 thank them for their attention to this bill and I
7 am confident that it will pass. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
9 much.

10 STEVEN LORCH: My name is Steve Lorch. I
11 am the head of the Solomon Chapter School of
12 Manhattan a, an elementary school for 145 children
13 on the upper, upper west side of Manhattan at
14 100th, 100th Street and Columbus Avenue. And I too
15 thank the council members for inviting me and
16 affording me the opportunity to testify on behalf
17 of this bill. I take the security of my students
18 very seriously. We are a school that does contract
19 with a security firm and through the security firm
20 we have a trained security guard on the premises
21 whenever children are on the premises. That is not
22 only during the school day but after hours and
23 weekends when we have programs for children as
24 well. Nevertheless we know I'm not a security
25 expert, we are told by our security experts that

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 deterrence is the key and one of the most important
3 aspects of deterrence is visibility. The security
4 agent that we, that we hire, that we contract for
5 comes in a regular suit, does not come in a New
6 York City Police Officer's uniform. And that would
7 make a significant difference to the deterrence
8 that would be, that it would be provided and the
9 safety of our students. A couple of months ago
10 shortly after the terrorist attacks in Paris Mayor
11 de Blasio travelled to Paris on a fact-finding
12 mission and returned and spoke in my synagogue. And
13 reported with great pride that the New York City
14 Police Department does not require any special
15 protocols to respond to terrorist incidents
16 whenever they occur around the world. They increase
17 the, the level of threat and respond accordingly
18 with increased presence and increased surveillance
19 of all possible targets. And I thought that was
20 great. But I wondered about what, one thing. What
21 happens if the terrorist attack is on my school? We
22 need New York City security guards looking after
23 the safety of every school child in New York City,
24 in my school as well. Thank you very much.

25 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 BARRY SPITZER: Good afternoon. My name
3 is Barry Spitzer and I'm the District Manager of
4 Community Board 12 in Brooklyn which is home to
5 more private schools than any other district in the
6 city. I'm here today to testify in support of Intro
7 65. I would like to start off by thanking Council
8 Member Vanessa Gibson Chair of Committee on Public
9 Safety for bringing this important legislation to
10 your committee for a hearing and also the Committee
11 on Education and the Subcommittee on Non-Public
12 Schools for being part of this hearing.

13 Additionally I would like to thank the 46 council
14 members who co-sponsor this bill which helped bring
15 this to the forefront and give it the attention
16 that it deserves. Most importantly I would like to
17 thank Councilman David Greenfield for introducing
18 this bill. And as years as a council member
19 Councilman Greenfield has introduced many important
20 pieces of legislation. But in my opinion this is
21 the most important one yet. I started by saying
22 that I'm here to testify but it's more than that.
23 I'm here to make a plea. I'm here for two reasons.
24 The first is because as I said before I represent
25 the district that has the largest concentration of

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 private schools than anywhere else in the city. In
3 my district alone we have more children attending
4 private schools than there are children attending
5 public schools. Each morning there are
6 approximately 300 school busses on the streets of
7 my district dropping off thousands of children to
8 these schools. Just to give you an idea I took a
9 sampling of just five institutions of my district.
10 The bub of... institutions have a combined number of
11 close to 15 thousand children. That's just five
12 institutions which does not include the dozens and
13 dozens of schools with hundreds of children
14 attending each of them. The second reason and
15 perhaps more importantly is because as a parent
16 whose children attend these schools I'm personally
17 affected by this. This is what keeps me up at
18 night. When the NYPD came and gave our schools a
19 presentation on a active shoot, active shooter
20 scenario it became very clear to me that our
21 schools are woefully unprepared in the event of an
22 attack. There's an ever increasing threat of
23 terrorism in which I don't need to elaborate. We
24 all read the news. What scares me more is the
25 threat of what is called the lone wolf or a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 deranged individual scenario which I feel is even
3 more dangerous because there is no intelligence or
4 chatter preceding the attack and therefore is
5 extremely unpredictable. Public schools have safety
6 agents which dramatically add to the safety of the
7 children in those schools. Although I's not 100
8 percent foolproof it still adds a measure of safety
9 for the children. These safety agents are trained
10 professionals who know how to act in event of a
11 crisis and they conserve, and they do serve as a
12 deterrent, deterrent for somebody with bad
13 intentions. Children in private schools currently
14 have no protection. Most of these schools do not
15 have the finances to hire private security guards
16 nor should they be forced to. Children in private
17 schools should be afforded the same protection as
18 children in public schools. This is not a matter
19 that is particular to any religion or race. Just a
20 few months ago at our January meeting, our board
21 which is comprised of Jewish, Catholic, Asian, and
22 Muslim members unanimously adopted the resolution,
23 a copy which is attached to this testimony calling
24 of the council to pass this bill and for the mayor
25 to sign into law.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: I'm sorry can you
just wrap up the last two paragraphs you have?

3

4

Thank you.

5

6

BARRY SPITZER: I, I'm just going to add
that...

7

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

BARRY SPITZER: ...talk about... [cross-
talk] about money. The life of a child has no
price. Every parent that sends their child to
school whether public or private has expectations
that the child will be safe. There's nothing more
precious than the life of a child and the city
should take responsibility for the safety of each
and every child in this city regardless of the
school they attend. So as a father and the public
servant my plea to you today is please approve this
bill. Thank you for letting me speak here today and
thank you for listening.

20

21

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
much.

22

23

24

25

DAVID TANENBAUN: Thank you to Chair
Gibson, Chair Dromm, and Chair Deutsch. A special
thank you to Council Member David Greenfield for
spearheading this effort and introducing the bill.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 My name is David Tanenbaum. And I'm here as a
3 representative of Agudath Israel of America a 93
4 year old national organization that advocates on
5 behalf of the orthodox Jewish community across the
6 country. I am also a New York City Department of
7 Education 36 year retiree as a supervisor in the
8 Queens high schools. Locally one of Agudath
9 Israel's primary areas of focus is to advocate for
10 the needs and interest of the approximately 106
11 thousand students and attend Yeshiva elementary and
12 secondary schools here in New York City. Agudath
13 Israel along with other organizations representing
14 different faith groups is a member of the committee
15 of New York City religious and independent school
16 officials. Indeed Rabii David Zwiebel our executive
17 vice president chairs that committee. I am here
18 this afternoon to offer our support for Intro 65, a
19 local law to amend the administrative code in the
20 city of New York in relation to requiring the New
21 York City Police Department to assign upon request
22 school safety agents to non-public schools. The
23 administrative code currently mandates school
24 safety agents to be assigned to every public
25 school. We believe that it is a responsibility of

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 the city to protect all students who attend non-
3 public schools with the same level of security and
4 protection as it does to those who attend public
5 schools. The safety of all our children should be
6 our priority. There is no legal or constitutional
7 basis for denying this protection to the close to
8 250 thousand children or almost 20 percent of New
9 York City students who attend non-public schools.
10 This is no different than the fire safety, fire,
11 the police, or emergency service departments
12 responding to these in a non-public school just as
13 they do in a public school. We recently conducted a
14 representative sampling of Jewish schools in New
15 York City asking them if they would be interested
16 in having school safety agents assigned to them.
17 The vast majority of respondents responded
18 positively. There is a real need in today's dangers
19 world to enhance school security. While we believe
20 that all students in public and non-public schools
21 should be protected we in the Jewish community feel
22 especially vulnerable. There have been several
23 attacks on synagogues and Jewish schools around the
24 world and even here in our city. This bill is a

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 first step in the right direction and we urge your
3 support. Thank you for your attention.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
5 much.

6 DANIELLA GATLIB: Hello. Good afternoon.
7 My name is Daniella Gatlib and I'm a parent at
8 Luria Academy. Luria Academy is located in Prospect
9 Heights Brooklyn. We have 160 students in
10 preschool, elementary, and middle school. We have
11 over 30 staff working in our building. Our local
12 students walk, scoot, or bike to school and other
13 come in car pools or on school busses. Safety is
14 our number one priority. And given the high
15 insecurity concern these days in neighborhoods
16 adjacent to ours safety is our number one concern.
17 My three year old and I walk to school each morning
18 and I deliver him into the hands of his kind and
19 caring teachers who spend the day teaching him and
20 caring for his safety and wellbeing. It is a huge
21 burden to worry about not only the safety of our
22 students but also the teachers and the parents that
23 trust that these, their most precious, precious
24 possessions are safe each day. Tragedies like
25 columbine and the assassination of two police

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 officers in nearby Bedford-Stuyvesant demonstrate
3 that anything can happen at any time. Having an
4 extra layer of protection would prevent such
5 potential, prevent such tragedies. School is my
6 second, my son's second home. I mean he spends six
7 hours a day at school. And I just, we want to make
8 sure that he's safe ad his classmates are, are
9 safe. Our school is extremely diverse and while
10 affording the religious education we provide is a
11 challenge it is also a priority. And keeping
12 tuition affordable is our priority. All our income
13 goes directly to paying teachers' salaries and
14 classroom materials. We do not have the funds to
15 support a security guard but all of us would feel
16 much safer if an NYPD school safety agent was
17 present. Passage of this bill will allow our
18 teachers and students to have security consistent
19 with on, other NYC schools. I also would like to
20 touch upon Councilman Greenfield's point. If
21 there's anyone that's saying you know why should we
22 do this it's taking funds away from public schools,
23 it's coming out of the NYPD's budget and it would
24 only cost 50 million, not 250 million which I think
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 was pointed out before as well. Well thank you very
3 much for your time and I...

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. Thank you
5 very much to all of the panelists who are here.
6 Thank you for your testimony. So for the record let
7 me just clarify the school safety agents and the
8 budget for SSAs comes out of the Department of
9 Education not the NYPD okay just so that we're
10 clear and we understand moving forward. SSAs and
11 the budgets for them comes out of DOE and not
12 NYPD's budget okay. The last panel that was here
13 spoke in support as well of Intro 65. And my
14 general question to each of you, you represent a
15 number of students in schools the current security
16 measures that are in your schools whether it's a
17 security officer or cameras or a combination of
18 both. And have you done an assessment to determine
19 what your needs would be should this bill pass? And
20 if this bill is not successful in passing and you
21 do not get the school safety agents then what will
22 you do to address future public safety for your
23 students and your educators moving forward? Anyone
24 that can speak to it. You don't all have to speak.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

STEVEN LORCH: I'll, I'll, I'll start.

3

We have a security guard on premises during the

4

school day and at other times as I mentioned. We

5

would continue to do that if the bill did not pass.

6

We are in consultation both with our security firm

7

and with NYPD about upgrades to our security from,

8

from time to time generally about twice a year we,

9

we receive advisories about upgrades and we would

10

continue with that practice as well. Never the less

11

we believe that having a uniformed NYPD security

12

agent at our school would provide deterrence that

13

we are, would otherwise unable, be unable to

14

provide.

15

STUART KLAMMER: I, I would add just as

16

I said before that we would divert funds from

17

school supplies and from staffing and other things

18

which we really need and we end up spending it for

19

security. So it, the children's education would

20

suffer.

21

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. Anyone else?

22

DAVID TANENBAUM: In many of our schools

23

there would be no security available without this

24

laws because there is no, no funds available. Some

25

of the schools... they, they vary. They vary widely

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 from well, well-funded schools to impoverished
3 schools where there is barely enough to keep one
4 teacher per grade. And there's nothing else for,
5 nothing remaining for security.

6 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay thank you all.
7 We've been joined by Council Members Margaret Chin
8 and Ydanis Rodriguez. And now we will hear from
9 Chair Deutsch.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Thank you very
11 much. I don't really have a question. I just want
12 to do like, give a little closing remarks for the
13 people that we had today testifying on behalf of
14 Intro 65. And I think that when it comes to
15 security we should not differentiate between public
16 and non-public schools. These are our children and
17 it should all be, we should all be equal and alike
18 when it comes to security. And our common goal
19 should be, all our common goals should be
20 protecting our children. And we do have what's
21 called school crossing guards that ensured that our
22 children crossed the street safely going to school
23 and you know once the children crossed the streets
24 you still need them to remain safe. So one to get
25 into the building and they go into the school

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 buildings, you want them to be safe, you want them
3 to leave school safely and you want to make sure
4 that we take all prevent, all types of preventive
5 measures to ensure that our children are safe. In
6 addition I think that school safety offices, agents
7 are crucial and unfortunately we didn't have the
8 administration here before. But I believe once we
9 question the school safety division that they do
10 carry radios. So when you call 9-1-1 for some type
11 of incident a 9-1-1 operator is like a messenger.
12 If you don't give the message properly or
13 accurately that message doesn't go over the radios
14 the same way or maybe sometimes it gets less
15 diluted, more diluted. So having a school safety
16 agent with direct contact to the NYPD by saying
17 we're at a school and we have a, a person who
18 trespassed then those offices will be there within
19 seconds. If you ever see a 10-13 you have several
20 vehicles from different station houses, different
21 precincts there within literally within under a
22 minute. So I think that is very important to have
23 school safety agents protecting our children in all
24 schools. And frankly it's our obligation to protect
25 all citizens and unfortunately we couldn't have a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 school safety agent for every person living in the
3 city. But when you have locations or potential
4 targets where we already had around the world and
5 here in United States it is our obligation to make
6 sure that we protect these targeted locations. We
7 have officers. We have protection in different
8 colleges throughout the city, throughout the state.
9 And there's a reason for that. You have large
10 crowds. You have officers that come out and do or
11 protect people of such large crowds, when you have
12 demonstrations, when you have protests in different
13 areas. And a school is a targeted location. So I
14 believe that having school safety agents in all
15 schools is very important especially now we also
16 set a precedence in, in public schools protecting
17 children so why only protect 1.1 we need to protect
18 right, right, right under 1.4 million children. And
19 all children need equal protection. Thank you very
20 much.

21 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much
22 Chair Deutsch. And we have two final remarks from
23 our colleagues; Council Member Williams and Council
24 Member Greenfield to close.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very
3 much. And thank you for your testimony. Although I
4 was, I was listening to it and I'm not sure, I
5 think, fine the school safety agent, but I'm not
6 sure that they will be able to stop a terrorist
7 attack or stop a shooter. So I wanted to make clear
8 that we're not putting more than what we're
9 expecting them to be. From some of the descriptions
10 it sounded like you need, you would prefer an armed
11 police officer there as opposed to a school safety
12 agent. So I'm not sure that they can necessarily do
13 that. I think that what Council Member Deutsch
14 described seemed to be the most type of thing that
15 they can have a direct link or immediately get to
16 NYPD in columbine with Sandy Hook. I believe they
17 had safety agents there and people who had that
18 charge and I don't know... necessary stops... I want to
19 make sure we have a, a realistic view of what the
20 safety agent can do. [cross-talk] And, and can't
21 do.

22 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Can I respond?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: In one second.

24 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Sure.
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Because I
think I only have... I did want to ask what is the
smallest and largest size of the schools that you
represent?

6

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Let me ask the first
question about...

7

8

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Wait no, no
can you answer the second one first and then after...

9

10

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yes...

11

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: ...because I
have only so much time.

12

13

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: We, our organization
represents close to 270 Jewish day schools in the
city ranging from 12 15 children up to several,
five six thousand.

14

15

16

17

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: My, my concern
is for the smaller schools. So, now, now I mean I
was told that this money was coming out of NYPD.
And then so now it's coming out of DOE. So I have
concerns that there are schools that have hundreds
of students in it and they don't feel they have
adequately staffed...

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Right.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: ...safety

3

agents. And now we may pull one from there to a

4

school that may have just a dozen students. So that

5

all... [cross-talk]

6

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I, I don't know that

7

all the smaller schools will request them as a, as

8

the law states it's upon request. Not every

9

school's going to ask for one. In terms of the

10

adequacy, the function of the safety agent that I

11

can point out that everyone from the federal state

12

local government, all the organizations, all the

13

police departments, they're all telling us if you

14

see something say something. That's the first line

15

of defense. You have to know what you're looking

16

for. And the school safety agent knows what to look

17

for. He's trained by the police department. The

18

principal of the school or the teachers of the

19

school or the hired security guard really doesn't

20

know what he's looking for or looking at. So just

21

the presence of the school safety agent with a

22

police department radio and a police department

23

training will be an effective deterrent and will be

24

able to save lives.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Sure. I agree with most of what you said. But I'm not... As, as I, you know that I think it, continue thinking through, I think the fundamental question here is whether we should be giving public funds to private religious institutions.

3

4

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Why is this different...

5

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: And again...

6

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Why is this

7

different than... [cross-talk]

8

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Let me finish...

9

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: ...the fire

10

department...

11

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Let me just

12

finish what I'm... say. As I mentioned before I think

13

we did answer that question so I'm not sure I see a

14

difference between this and the nurses that we do

15

provide. I think if we want to open that discussion

16

here at the council we should actually have it and

17

maybe dele a little deeper into it but if, if we,

18

if we're not doing that it seems to be in line. But

19

it does have... I still have another question. I'm

20

not sure when it stops. I mean, I mean you can make

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 a case that you don't have sufficient math teachers
3 and so the teachers are not passing the state exam
4 and then ask for additional math teachers. So that
5 does concern me as well. But thank you for your
6 testimony.

7 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: ...just respond to
8 that last point where it stops. I think that... you
9 know I don't, that's not a question we could answer
10 right now but I think that it does, it clearly,
11 issues of safety and health we can all agree on.
12 You know there are different levels of human needs.
13 And I think we all agree that the most basic level
14 of all humans' needs are, is sense of safety,
15 emotional safety and especially physical safety and
16 health. So whatever issues that anyone might have
17 with any other areas this I think we can all agree
18 upon. So it, there's no danger in this particular
19 bill of it going further in other areas because are
20 on the most basic human levels of needs.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Sure. There,
22 there's no need unless another crisis or another
23 issue comes up. I mean I think we also fund some
24 bussing which, which, which I can see as something
25 because many of my students are not, are, who are

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 not in the private institutions take public
3 transportation. So I think this is a larger, a
4 larger question that... I, I can only, I can only
5 speak to this question personally. I have never
6 testified on behalf of any other funding for non-
7 public schools and I never would. I only agreed to
8 testify because this is an issue of student safety.
9 Well any issue of student safe, if I would, I would
10 speak on behalf of and that's where I would draw
11 the line. I, my school may benefit from other
12 funding. My students in my school may benefit from
13 other funding but I would not put my reputation on
14 the line to testify on behalf of funding non-public
15 schools.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Well...

17 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: ...for anything other
18 than student safety.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.
20 Thank you Madam Chair.

21 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you Council
22 Member Williams. Council Member Greenfield and
23 closing now Council Member Rodriguez.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...that me,
25 thank you Chair. Thank you. I just wanted to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 respond to just a point of clarity because I think
3 there was some confusion. Currently the funding for
4 the current school safety agents is provided to the
5 DOE because traditionally they did it and was
6 transferred to the NYPD. And my understanding is
7 that that funding is then given to the NYPD.
8 However because it's a new legislation we would
9 actually be giving the funds directly to the NYPD
10 not to the DOE. So we do not seek to compete with
11 any DOE funding just as a matter of clarity. I
12 think, I think you know the representative from
13 Solomon Schechter actually said it best which is
14 the folks that you see up here today and that
15 you've seen testify over the last hour have many
16 different backgrounds right; independent schools,
17 Muslim schools, catholic schools, Jewish schools,
18 it is a diversity and differences of opinions on
19 many different issues with all of these schools.
20 And as to the question of, of where does it stop
21 their focus really on one issue. And they probably
22 don't agree on a lot of other issues but on this
23 issue they agree which I think all of us should
24 agree and that is that the safety of our children
25 is paramount. We shouldn't play politics with our

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 children's safety. These are kids like anyone
3 else's' kids. It's your son, your daughter, your
4 brother, your sister, your nephew, your niece, your
5 grandchild. And that really is the focus. And to
6 you question Council Member Williams, where does it
7 stop, it's the same question you could ask any
8 advocate. When they come in when they talk about
9 police reform where does it stop. That's what we do
10 as a legislature. We evaluate and decide what makes
11 sense and what doesn't make sense. And I think we
12 could all agree public safety makes sense. And when
13 we talk about the threat of a loan shooter that
14 Barry Spitzer pointed out, the district manager of
15 Community Board 12 it's a very real threat, it's a
16 very dangerous threat. And the police actually tell
17 us if you had someone there that would actually
18 prevent the threat. So there's all sorts of reasons
19 why not to do something. There's politics, there's
20 control, there's mayoral control, there's NYPD
21 prerogatives, there's that the commissioner likes
22 to do whatever he wants and I'm sure you're very
23 familiar with that Council Member Williams. But in
24 the end of the day we're talking about a
25 fundamental issue and that is can we ensure that

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 our children, all of our children are safe. And
3 right now we can't say that to ourselves. And so
4 when we leave here today, when you go to sleep
5 tonight we have to ask ourselves are we keeping
6 every child in New York City safe. If that's the
7 standard I think we can all agree the answer is
8 yes. And I think we appreciate that there's a
9 robust date obviously about other issues and that's
10 certainly an appropriate debate to have as other
11 issues come up but I think there is such wide
12 spread support for this because it is simply about
13 the safety of each and every single child. So I
14 want to thank all of you on the panel. I want to
15 thank all of you on the previous panel. I certainly
16 want to thank my council members for a robust
17 discussion on a critical issue on can we keep every
18 child in New York City safe regardless of their
19 background or opinions or where they come from. And
20 let's just make sure that all of our kids in fact
21 are safe. Thank you very much.

22 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you Council
23 Member Greenfield. Council Member Rodriguez.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you all
25 of you for being here and representing like

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 different religious expression. And it is our
3 responsibility as my colleague is say to be sure
4 that the more vulnerable individual in our society
5 are safe. So for me like... as a city we know that we
6 always have to be proactive. We also all have to be
7 on time and planning not only to respond by, by
8 planning for what can happen in the future. And I
9 believe that a, identifying the sources of funding
10 to provide the necessary protection for children is
11 the right thing to do. And for me at that level I
12 don't see religions. I don't see the privates. I
13 don't see the public. I see the more vulnerable
14 one. And as a father with two daughter I want my
15 daughter to be safe in any place where they are. So
16 thank you and you will have our support.

17 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you Council
18 Member Rodriguez. And thank you to the panel for
19 being here. We appreciate your presence and your
20 testimony and thank you again.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay so now I'm
22 going to call the next panel and that will be from
23 the administration Lois Herrera CEO Office of
24 Safety and Youth Development in the DOE, Assistant
25 Chief Brian Conroy CO School Safety Division NYPD,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 and Vincent Schiraldi Senior Advisor Mayor's Office
3 of Criminal Justice. So I'm going to swear you in.
4 I'm going to ask if you'll raise your right hand.
5 Just waiting for my colleague. Do you solemnly
6 swear or affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth
7 and nothing but the truth and to answer council
8 member questions honestly? Okay thank you. Mr.
9 Herrera would you like to start. Oh there is, oh
10 okay there's other testimony? I thought there was
11 only one piece of testimony. Sorry about that.

12 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: We have three.

13 [cross-talk] Definitely afternoon.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I don't think
15 your mic is on.

16 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: The red button.

17 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: I'll try again.

18 This, where my good morning isn't on the record.
19 Good afternoon Chair Gibson, Chair Dromm, Chair
20 Deutsch, and members of the Committee on Public
21 Safety, education, and the subcommittee on non-
22 public schools. I'm Vincent Schiraldi Senior
23 Advisor to the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice
24 and formerly Commissioner of Probation in New York
25 City. Thanks for the opportunity to testify today.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 The mayor's office of criminal justice advises the
3 mayor on public safety strategy and together we're
4 their partners inside and outside government,
5 develops and implements policies aimed at achieving
6 three main goals reducing crime, reducing
7 unnecessary incarceration and arrests, and
8 promoting fairness. In the realm of school climate
9 policies our office advises the mayor on creating
10 policies that ensure the safety of students and
11 staff while reducing the likelihood that students
12 will become involved in the criminal justice
13 system. Before discussing the school safety and
14 climate reforms the mayor announced in February
15 including the leadership tea on school climate and
16 discipline. I'd like to give some background on
17 data and school safety and discipline that shows
18 substantial improvements in several areas over the
19 past two plus years. The data show what this
20 administration whole heartedly believes and
21 continues to strive for, that we can have both
22 safer schools and fewer arrests and suspensions.
23 From school year 11-12 to school year 13-14 there's
24 been a substantial 55 percent decline in arrests
25 and 67 percent decline in summonses issued by NYPD

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 School Safety Division which Chief Conroy runs.
3 During those same two years there was a 23 percent
4 decline in student suspensions. That favorable
5 trend has continued this school year. DOE's
6 aggregate data shows that suspensions have declined
7 by another 11 percent from July 1st through April
8 2nd. Likewise data from NYPD showed that from July
9 1st through April 5th arrests and summonses in
10 schools are down an additional 19 percent and 12
11 percent respectively when compared to the same time
12 last year. But the reduction and suspensions
13 arrests and summonses is only half of the equation.
14 The programs and policies were undertaking aim to
15 make schools less punitive and safer. And we are
16 constantly keeping an eye on school safety while
17 carefully trying to improve school climate and
18 reduce punitive student discipline. That's why it's
19 encouraging to note that from School year 11-12 to
20 school year 13-14 overall crime reported I school,
21 schools failed by 24 percent and major crimes fail
22 by 20 percent. Again that trend is continuing this
23 year with a seven percent decline in overall crime
24 through April 5th. Now national research shows that
25 when kids are suspended it makes them behind held

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 back in school, dropping out, and juvenile justice
3 system contact all more likely even when you
4 control for individual student characteristics and
5 school characteristics. That's why we're proud that
6 we have declines in suspensions, arrest summonses,
7 and crime. Because it means that more students are
8 in school where they belong rather than station
9 houses or in juvenile detention. In February to
10 build on this success the mayor announced a raft of
11 school climate reforms including 1.2 million
12 dollars for restorative practices training, 2.4
13 million dollars to support educational planning and
14 reengagement for court involved students, 1.5
15 million dollars to provide therapeutic crisis
16 intervention to, training to 15 hundred staff
17 members over the next three years in high needs
18 schools, and 432 thousand for a saga innovations
19 math tutoring program for a grand total of 5.4
20 million dedicated to school climate initiatives. A
21 major part of the mayor's February announcement was
22 the establishment of the leadership team on school
23 climate and discipline which I co-chair with DOE
24 Chief of staff or Salina Ramirez. The mission of
25 this task force is to recommend ways to further

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 improve the climate for learning and enhance the
3 wellbeing and safety of students and staff by using
4 more effective methods of addressing disciplinary
5 challenges. The leadership team is a collaborative
6 effort involving multiple stakeholders including
7 representation from the city council, city
8 agencies, community members, unions, researchers,
9 teachers, principals, students, parents, and
10 service providers that will convene for a total of
11 12 months. To fulfill its mission the leadership
12 team will produce recommendations on strategies and
13 funding required to improve the use of data to
14 assess the effectiveness of current policy and
15 practice and spreading promise, promising positive
16 discipline innovations, increase access to mental
17 health and other community based supports for high
18 need students, reduce the frequency and duration of
19 suspensions and minimize arrests and referrals to
20 the justice system for school based disciplinary
21 offenses, reduce race gender and disability
22 disparities in student discipline, and update the
23 memorandum of understanding between NYPD and DOE to
24 align the use of school security personnel and
25 security measures with support of school climate

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 goals. As I stated earlier the leadership team was
3 announced in February but the idea of creating a
4 taskforce to improve our school's climate had been
5 a long time effort of many of the advocates in this
6 room who I believe will be testifying before you
7 shortly. Advocates presented several
8 recommendations with their number one priority
9 being the leader, the creation of this leadership
10 team. We carefully designed a structure and mission
11 of this initiative in partnership with the advocacy
12 community and a consultation with union
13 representatives, principals, teachers, students, of
14 course DOE and NYPD. The leadership team itself was
15 comprised of a 30 person governing body charged
16 with providing direction to the execution of the
17 initiatives mission. In addition five working
18 groups each led jointly by a government member and
19 a nongovernmental expert are currently working to
20 produce policy recommendations that will later be
21 reviewed by members of the leadership team. Each of
22 the leadership teams five working groups is
23 invested in developing recommendations to improve
24 different aspects of student disciplinary policies.
25 The school climate working group is co-chaired by

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 my co-panelist today Lois Herrera CEO of the Office
3 and Safety and Youth Development and Kim Sweet
4 executive director of Advocates for Children. This
5 group will produce recommendations to improve
6 system wide implementation, a positive discipline
7 strategies with a particular focus on high priority
8 schools. The data and research working group is co-
9 chaired by Michelle Smirnoff of the Mayor's Office
10 of Criminal Justice and Edward Fergus an assistant
11 professor of educational leadership and policy at
12 New York University. This group has created a
13 methodology for selecting high priority schools,
14 schools that could benefit from additional
15 supports. Additionally the group is creating a
16 descriptive analysis of school climate data and
17 will offer recommendations to improve data
18 collection, quality and use. The Resource
19 Integration Working Group is co-chaired by ACS
20 Commissioner Gladys Carrion and Nancy Ginsburg
21 Director of the Adolescent Intervention and
22 Diversion Team at Legal Aid. This group will
23 produce recommendations for approving educator
24 access to community and citywide resources and
25 services. The School Safety Working Group is co-

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 chaired by Chief Conroy and Kathleen Decataldo the
3 Executive Director of the New York State Permanent
4 Judicial Commission for Justice for Children. This
5 group is analyzing the effectiveness of current
6 practices for improving school safety while
7 continuing to reduce arrests and summonses. They'll
8 recommend training and other strategies to improve
9 police, student relations, and recommend updates to
10 existing protocols for responding to non-emergency
11 situations in schools among other recommendations.

12 The legislative council for city council is a
13 member of this working group as well as of the
14 leadership team. Lastly the Principal's working
15 group whose membership numbers over 20 principals
16 is co-chaired by Julie Zuckerman, principal of
17 Castle Bridge School in Washington Heights and
18 Celeste Douglas Wheeler Principal of Ron Brown
19 Academy in Bedford Stuyvesant. This is the only
20 working group that has two governmental chairs and
21 this working group will review and vet policy
22 recommendations from the other working groups and,
23 but will produce its own recommendations to improve
24 school climate as well. Each working group has met
25 twice and we'll met for a third time within a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 month. Met, meetings have been well attended by
3 over 150 participants and have been characterized
4 by a high degree of enthusiasm, candor, and good
5 will. Working group co-chairs have expended
6 considerable time... and I think that both of them
7 could attest to that. Preparing for and chairing
8 meetings with the assistant of the leadership team
9 staff additionally many working groups are formed
10 multiple subcommittees. One example is at the
11 request of the principals the last principals
12 working group meeting was eight hours long. This
13 high level of investment and commitment speaks
14 volumes to the timeliness of this initiative and
15 the concrete need that the leadership teas address.
16 The leadership team will review a set of
17 preliminary policy recommendations this spring and
18 will release an update to the mayor, council,
19 chancellor, police commissioner, relevant agencies,
20 and the public in the summer. The task force will
21 then continue to review progress and finalize
22 priority topics for discussion during the next
23 phase of initiative which will begin in the Fall.
24 And approximately December the leadership team will
25 produce its final policy recommendations. So as you

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 can see we've made much progress. There's still
3 much to do. Principals and teachers in some schools
4 feel like they do not have the resources necessary
5 to implement positive behavioral strategies,
6 suspensions, arrests, and summonses are often
7 clustered in the small number of schools. Moreover
8 racial, ethnic, and special education disparities
9 persist with regard to suspensions, arrests, and
10 summonses. The leadership team working
11 collaboratively with DOE, NYPD, and MOCJ teachers
12 principals students and community members will
13 continue to strive to improve the climate for
14 learning and reduce the need for suspensions,
15 arrests, and summonses in our schools. I'm happy to
16 answer any questions you may have. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: You may begin.

18 Good afternoon chairs Dromm, Gibson,
19 and Deutsch and members of the Education, Public
20 Safety and Non-Public School Committees. My name is
21 Lois Herrera, Chief Executive Officer of DOE's
22 Office of Safety and Youth Development. Thank you
23 for the opportunity to discuss the work DOE has
24 undertaken to ensure that all our schools maintain
25 a safe and supportive learning environment and to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 address Intro 719 and Intro 730. At the outset I'd
3 like to thank members of the city council for your
4 leadership on these important issues. Over the
5 years DOE has worked very closely with the city
6 council on several school climate initiatives from
7 respect for all to most recently the anti-gun-
8 violence initiative. Cultivating and maintaining a
9 positive school culture and improving school safety
10 are key elements of this administration's efforts
11 to raise student achievement. We have significantly
12 increased preventive and conflict resolution
13 programming and staff training. Last year we
14 establish the office of guidance and school
15 counselling which provides professional development
16 to school staff on promoting positive behavior and
17 progressive discipline. In addition by the end of
18 this school year we will have trained approximately
19 100 schools in conducting restorative circles. But
20 the one third of these schools participating in
21 more advanced training in restorative conferencing.
22 In collaboration with the city council we have been
23 able to implement supports to schools under the
24 anti-gun violence initiative. These include
25 expanding a restorative practices to an additional

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 20 to 25 middle and high schools as well as
3 implementing conflict resolution programming and 34
4 schools across 17 target police precincts.

5 Additionally we are providing algebra tutoring to
6 students at the four high schools on the Thomas
7 Jefferson campus and training to staff in
8 collaborative problem solving. A de-escalation
9 strategy focused on addressing behavioral
10 challenges. The DOE's division of specialized
11 instruction also provides support and expertise to
12 schools that are engaged in positive behavioral
13 interventions and supports known as PBIS. A
14 research based school wide behavioral system that
15 teaches and models clear behavioral expectations
16 for students. We will continue to build the
17 capacity of schools to implement social emotional
18 learning programs and work with our community based
19 organization partners to maintain and strengthen a
20 positive school climate. DOE's strong partnership
21 with the NYPD School safety division has resulted
22 in a dramatic reduction and crime in our schools
23 creating a safer environment for our students. Our
24 work with the school safety division includes
25 establishing safety protocols and procedures in

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 schools developing school safety and emergency
3 preparedness plans and providing training for
4 school safety agents across many topics such as
5 conflict resolution, crisis de-escalation,
6 collaborative problem solving, gang prevention,
7 anti-bullying, and awareness of the misuse of
8 prescription drugs. As Vincent Schiraldi mentioned
9 as a result of recent policy changes and our
10 collaboration with the NYPD School Safety Division
11 we are seeing a decrease in the number of
12 behavioral incidents and principal and
13 superintendent suspensions this year as compared to
14 the same period last year. While we recognize that
15 suspensions are a necessary option for seriously
16 dangerous behavior they are not the sole means by
17 which we hold students accountable. We've taken
18 significant steps to promote alternative
19 interventions to address student behavior and
20 reduce schools overreliance on suspensions. Our
21 citywide behavioral expectations to student, to
22 support student learning, the discipline code which
23 includes the bill of student rights and
24 responsibilities sets forth clearer standards for
25 student behavior. The discipline code provides a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 range of guidance interventions and possible
3 disciplinary responses to be used to foster
4 progressive discipline, accountability, and
5 behavioral change. The discipline code is reviewed
6 and updated each year in consultation with various
7 stakeholders including school leaders, teachers and
8 other school based staff, students, parents, and
9 community members. The recently implemented
10 revisions to the discipline code were part of an
11 interagency collaboration on school climate reforms
12 undertaken by this administration. In order to
13 ensure appropriate disciplinary responses to
14 insubordinate behavior. Principals are now required
15 to seek authorization from the CEO of the Office of
16 Safety and Youth Development. As the chancellor's
17 designee prior to invoking a principal suspension
18 for defying or disobeying lawful authority often
19 known as infractions A-22 and B-21 in the revised
20 discipline code. Now a school must explain prior
21 disciplinary guidance and intervention measures
22 they have used to support the student and why the
23 behavior disrupts the educational process and or
24 poses a danger to the school community. The revised
25 code also requires this authorization prior to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 invoking a principal suspension for students in
3 grades K through three. Principals are no longer
4 able to invoke a suspension for students in, in
5 grades K through three under the infraction for
6 minor altercation or super intendant suspension for
7 minor altercation for students in grades four
8 through 12. We recently proposed a new chancellor's
9 regulation addressing crisis de-escalation and
10 contacting 9-1-1 for students experiencing
11 behavioral crisis. The regulation sets forth the
12 policies and procedures to be followed when these
13 situations occur. The regulation requires schools
14 to make every effort where possible to safely just
15 deescalate the behavior using strategies and
16 interventions for addressing behavioral crisis and
17 establishes the criteria for when 9-1-1 should be
18 notified in these instances. It also sets forth the
19 procedures to be followed once 9-1-1 has been
20 contracted including the requirement that a report
21 be filed in OORS, the Online Occurrence Reporting
22 System. Every school will be required to develop a
23 crisis de-escalation plan as part of its annual
24 consolidated school and youth development plan and
25 conduct an orientation for all school staff on the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 crisis de-escalation plan and the requirement of
3 the requirements of the escalation. In the upcoming
4 school year the DOE will increase the number of
5 school staff who have trained in therapeutic crisis
6 intervention for schools also known as TCIS. The...
7 enhancements to OORS to further refine the data
8 captured when the school contacts, contacts 9-1-1
9 for emergency medical services or EMS response. I
10 would like to turn to the proposed legislation.
11 Intro 719 requires the DOE to report the guidance
12 counsellor and school safety agent ratio for each
13 school. Approximately 2,700 guidance counsellors
14 and 1,200 social workers currently work at NYC
15 schools. Since the formation of the Office of
16 Guidance and school counselling over 250 new
17 guidance counsellors have been hired throughout the
18 system. In addition we have established 128
19 community schools. These schools will provide
20 students and families with a range of wrap around
21 services additional counselling services. Pursuant
22 to Local Law 56 of 2014 the guidance counsellor to
23 student ratio for each school can now be found on
24 the DOE's website. The NYPD currently employs
25 approximately 5,000 school safety agents. We

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 concerned that this bill requires the reporting of
3 the number of SSAs assigned to each school,
4 information that is not included in the NYPD's
5 quarterly report to city council because disclosure
6 could compromise the safety of our school
7 communities or could otherwise compromise law
8 enforcement operations. We support the council's
9 goal to increase transparency around student
10 suspensions and behavioral incidents outlined in
11 Intro 730. We would like to work with the council
12 to clarify specific reporting requirements and
13 ensure that they are consistent with DOE Policy.
14 Intro 7320 requires DOE to report on the number of
15 suspensions as well as the number of students
16 suspended disaggregated by various categories.
17 Given the scope of the reporting requirements and
18 the level of disaggregation required by the
19 proposed legislation as currently written we
20 concern that much of the data would have to be
21 redacted in compliance with the Family Educational
22 Records and Privacy Act or FERPA's you are aware
23 under FERPA DOE is required to ensure that records
24 containing student identifying information are not
25 disclosed data can be considered student

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 identifying information even if student names or
3 identification numbers are not disclosed we look
4 forward to discussions with the council to ensure
5 the proposed legislation meets the twin goals of
6 increased transparency and compliance with student
7 privacy laws. We will continue our efforts to
8 ensure a safe and supportive school environment for
9 all students that is conducive to learning and that
10 will foster social emotional growth and resiliency
11 in our students. We have made great strides through
12 the years but recognize that there is more work to
13 do to support our students. Thank you again we look
14 forward to a continued partnership with the council
15 on this important issue.

16 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you.

17 BRIAN CONROY: Good afternoon committee
18 chairs and members of the council. I am Assistant
19 Chief Brian Conroy Commanding Officer of the NYPD's
20 School Safety Division. On behalf of Police
21 Commissioner William J. Bratton I would like to
22 thank you for this opportunity to speak to you
23 about public safety in New York City schools.
24 Responsibility for managing school safety personnel
25 and designating school safety agents or SSAs to be

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 employees of the police department over the years
3 members of the police department have discussed
4 with the council the reasons for that change and
5 the level of crime that dangerously comprises
6 safety and security of the city's public schools at
7 that time to the ultimate detriment of the
8 educational mission. We not that there has been a
9 52 percent crime reduction in major crimes; 654
10 versus 1368 over the last 10 years comparing the
11 2013-14 school year to the 2003-4 school year. That
12 includes a 69 percent reduction in robberies and a
13 56 percent reduction in felony assaults. In other
14 words 205 students were the victims of robbery and
15 218 fewer students were the victims of serious
16 assaults during the last school year than had been
17 victims during the school years 10 years ago. Today
18 I am pleased to be here to talk with you about the
19 tremendous work that the school safety division has
20 done in improving the safety of the school
21 environment by continuing to reduce crime within
22 our schools. The department is also pleased to
23 report on the very significant progress being made
24 regarding school climate and the substantial
25 reduction and the number of students who are

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 arrested or issued summons by school safety
3 division personnel. Of course if you have heard
4 from my colleagues improving school climate and
5 reducing crime is not something that the school
6 safety division does alone. We have several
7 important partners who make it possible. We begin
8 with our partners in the Department of Education
9 with whom we work very closely on all issues
10 related to school climate, school safety, and
11 training. We also could not be as successful
12 without the strong work relationships with school
13 principals, school administrators, teachers,
14 parents, and most importantly the people we are
15 there to protect are students. Over the last
16 several years these partnerships have grown even
17 stronger which I believe significantly as
18 contributed to the improvement of school safety and
19 school climate. The numbers speak for themselves as
20 my colleagues mentioned. Over the past three school
21 years 2011-12 through the 2013-14 the school safety
22 division has reduced arrest by 55 percent. And the
23 numbers for that is we made 398 arrests during the
24 2013-14 school year versus 891 in the 2011-12
25 school year. And summonses reduced by 67 percent,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 558 versus 1682. At the same time major felony
3 crime in schools has decreased by 20 percent, 654
4 versus 813 over the same time period. If these
5 trends continue during the current school year in
6 which 54 fewer students were arrested by the school
7 safety division personnel through April 5th, 2015
8 as compared to the same period last school year for
9 a 19 percent reduction. Summonses are also
10 decreasing by 237 versus 291. So the downward trend
11 is continuing in both arrest and summonses. In
12 addition school safety continues to reduce both
13 areas and continues to work strenuously to continue
14 this trend. We also have a reduction of seven
15 percent reduction in, in crimes for this current
16 school year. So that downward trend in crime is
17 also continuing... the downward trend in arrest and
18 summonses. We attribute much of our success to our
19 enhance and training program for the 4,918 school
20 safety agents and 138 police officers assigned to
21 the school safety division. It is not a coincidence
22 that school climate and school safety improve
23 together as we have ramped and enhanced our
24 training. The training for our new school safety
25 agents recruits has been increased from a 15 week

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 training program at the police academy to a 17 week
3 program. The comprehensive program includes
4 training in the areas of war, police science,
5 behavioral science, and physical education and
6 tactics. Included also is the areas of bullying,
7 the LGBT community, tactical communication, and
8 defusing hostility. In order to assist in preparing
9 SSAs for their special role as part of the school
10 community the partner of education personnel also
11 participate in a training as instructors and
12 address specific areas such as special education,
13 school administration, school governance,
14 adolescent suicide, conflict resolution, bullying,
15 child abuse, and substance abuse prevention. The
16 additional two weeks has been dedicated to giving
17 the school safety agents training on how to better
18 work with the school administration and students in
19 the collaborative problem solving, conflict
20 resolution, de-escalation techniques, and working
21 with special needs students. For the first time we
22 went outside the department to bring in experts in
23 the fields of collaborative problem solving and de-
24 escalation and conflict resolution. Doctor Stuvant
25 Avalon [sp?] from the Massachusetts General

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 hospital is working with the school safety division
3 utilizing the distinct kids program. All agents and
4 police officers receive an introductory one day
5 training... program in September 2013. We have just
6 initiative a new segment of this program called
7 tier one which was given to a total of 300 agent
8 and police officers just last week. Tier one is a
9 two and a half day training by Dr. Avalon [sp?] and
10 collaborative problem solving. The agents are also
11 getting a half day training on restorative... from
12 Department of Education trainers. The second major
13 training initiative was conflict resolution
14 training for Nicholas Long from the Life Space
15 Crisis Intervention Institute. This is a very
16 intense and interactive three day training program
17 that not only teaches agents and police officers
18 how to deescalate conflicts and also ask both
19 agents and police officers to look at how they
20 react to conflict. These trainings have been very
21 positively received by both agents and police
22 officers. Both of the new training programs were
23 implemented in a collaborative effort with the
24 Department of Education. Equally important to the
25 successful work of the school safety divisions are

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 our partnerships and strong working relationships
3 with elected officials and with organizations and
4 advisory groups from outside city government. One
5 particularly effective partnership has been
6 deployed with, being developed with the Bronx
7 Parent Action Committee, a group of concerned
8 parents who meet with us on a regular basis to
9 discuss on ways to handle crime and disorder in
10 schools and to improve school tone. They have
11 participated in training school safety agents and
12 continue to provide valuable feedback and counsel.
13 We want our police officers and school safety
14 agents to be gatekeepers to prevent unauthorized
15 intruders and weapons from entering our schools.
16 The need to keep weapons from our schools requires
17 in some instances the use of magnetometers which
18 has begun in 1988 by the Board of Education's
19 Division of School Safety. So far this school year
20 as of April 5th we have recovered 1,036 weapons and
21 dangerous instruments on school grounds including 9
22 firearms which represents an 11.6 percent increase
23 in the number of weapons recovered over the same
24 period last year. We also want our personnel and
25 agents to work with school administrations to keep

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 young and vulnerable student population from
3 leaving the school without adult supervision.
4 Finally we want our school safety personnel to work
5 collaboratively with school principals to prevent
6 students from being removed from school buildings
7 for low level offenses that can be handled within
8 the school environment. As you have heard the
9 School Safety Division is now an integral part of
10 the Mayor's Leadership Team. The leadership of the
11 school safety division is working with our
12 representatives from other city agencies, advocacy
13 groups, union leaders, and school principals
14 develop new ideas and make policy recommendations
15 that will further improve the school environment
16 and further enhance the positive role that our
17 police officer and school safety agents have in
18 creating the safe and productive learning
19 environment. Now... overview of the work of the
20 school safety division and its partners we would
21 like to offer our comments on Intro 65 and 730. At
22 the outset let me state the obvious. Non-Public
23 schools represent a vibrant part of the life of
24 each precinct and our precinct personnel maintains
25 solid relations with the leaderships of all schools

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 in their precincts both public and non-public. The
3 need to protect our most precious resource, our
4 children is never far from the local precinct
5 commander's mind and we are always eager and
6 willing to have a conversation with the council and
7 local community about ways you feel your local
8 police force from precinct commanders to be cops
9 can better serve New Yorkers. The department
10 typically assigns as needed personnel to the routes
11 commonly traveled by students to and from schools
12 whether public or non-public both above and below
13 ground and assigns school crossing guards to both
14 public and non-public schools as needed. Of course
15 any school like any other, of course any school
16 like any other member of our community may request
17 a crime prevention survey from the department to
18 assist in improving the security of its premises
19 and may receive briefings on other, or other
20 assistance from the department, experts on various
21 topics of interest such as handling a terrorist
22 threat or an active shooter scenario or efforts to
23 combat prescription drug abuse, or the wide variety
24 of opportunities for interaction activities offered
25 to young people by the department. If and when a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 problem arising connection with a non-public school
3 the full resources of the police department are
4 deployed appropriately to address it. Where there
5 is a crime problem or a quality of life problem or
6 a threat. Last year for example at a large non-
7 public school in Brooklyn a homeless individual
8 entered the premise and refused to leave. The
9 police were called and promptly arrested the
10 individual for criminal trespass in the second
11 degree. In another instance an individual who was
12 observed committing a traffic infraction refused to
13 produce his license and registration and attempted
14 to flee into a large non-public school. He was
15 pursued and arrested immediately. In a tragic event
16 involving a synagogue rather than a non-public
17 school as students, a student was stabbed in the
18 head by an individual who was threatened who then
19 threatened the responding police officers, one of
20 whom fatally shot him. Within that context we would
21 now like to discuss Intro 65 which would require
22 the assignment of at least one NYPD school safety
23 agent to every non-public school at the school's
24 request. While the intent behind the bill is
25 understandable the proposal raises several serious

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 concerns for the administration. The creation of
3 legislation mandating a particular level of
4 staffing undermines the normal budget process
5 that's set forth in the city charter which
6 determines how agency personnel budgets are
7 established. That process is designed to address
8 the changes in the city's needs and resources all
9 the time. We respectfully suggest that the annual
10 budgeting process should continue to reflect the
11 real time development of the city's funding and
12 staffing priorities without the type of
13 legislatively mandated staffing that would prevent
14 the budget process from responding to current
15 needs. Further city agencies possess broad
16 flexibility under the city's laws in determining
17 how to use their staff and resources in order to
18 satisfy their missions. This is one of the most
19 important ways the mayor and agency heads are held
20 accountable. That is they're expected to deploy
21 staff and resources effectively. We note that the
22 police commissioner must balance many priorities to
23 deal with both continuing and emerging security
24 challenges. The commissioner needs to be able to
25 alter deployment rapidly to respond to those

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 challenges without going through the law making
3 process. If legislation requires that the
4 commissioner deploy particular staff to particular
5 locations and if this type of legislation serves as
6 a model for other similar initiatives the
7 accountability and responsibility that are inherent
8 in the jobs of both the police commissioner and the
9 mayor will be deeply compromised, potentially
10 compromising public safety as well. Intro 65 will
11 replace the expertise and judgment of the police
12 commissioner and NYPD on where and what needs
13 police protection on a given day with that of
14 private non-security experts. We agree with the
15 spirit of the bill that non-public schools need and
16 deserve protection. We work hard to do that now and
17 enjoy strong relationship with these institutions
18 all over the city. We are open to talking about how
19 to do it even better but the police need to reach,
20 to retain prerogatives and responsibility for how
21 their force are deployed to achieve the, the
22 protection that these institutes, institutions
23 deserve. The NYPD is also aware that Intro 65 is
24 not the only bill that the council has introduced
25 related to security and non-public schools. Intro

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 330, a bill introduced by Council Member Koo takes
3 a very different approach, one that focuses on
4 physical security improvement. These are also legal
5 and logistical questions surrounding that approach.
6 But the Intro 65 we are always willing to have a
7 contra, a conversation with you about the best ways
8 to protect New York's children. With respect to
9 Intro 730 we understand that the council's intent
10 to expand the amount and kinds of information that
11 are reported to the police department by the police
12 department on a quarterly basis in order to gain
13 greater insight into department's activities and
14 public schools. As I hope you have we have
15 communicated. We are highly focused on working in
16 collaboration with all our school safety partners
17 including the council and we welcome the discussion
18 of the bill in much greater detail at a staff level
19 in order to determine how we may provide more
20 information in a practical matter consistent the
21 way we keep records and without compromising
22 student privacy or safety. Thank you for the
23 opportunity to speak with you today and I'll be
24 pleased to answer any questions you may have.
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
3 much. Thank you Ms. Herrera. Thank you Mr.
4 Schiraldi and thank you Chief Conroy for being
5 here. I want to acknowledge the presence of Council
6 Members Rafael Espinal and Robert Cornegy and due
7 to time I'm going to just turn over my questioning,
8 I'll get back to you, to Chair Dromm for questions.
9 Thank you.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very
11 much Chair Gibson and thank you all for coming in
12 to testify today. I don't know if you heard my
13 opening remarks but in my opening remarks I did
14 question the need and the validity of why we have
15 police in our schools rather than have educators
16 make decisions about school discipline. And I have
17 a fundamental basic problem with that. And in terms
18 of even just looking over your testimony and please
19 don't take this personally but you know I'm reading
20 the titled Mr. Schiraldi you know Mayor's Office of
21 Criminal Justice. First of all our students are not
22 criminals and they shouldn't be presumed to be
23 criminals. But be that as it may titles are
24 important. And I, I appreciate the fact that the
25 chancellor separated two offices recently due to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 titles. But the fact that we're having this
3 discussion with the criminal justice head and with
4 an officer in a, in a uniform as well is, is
5 troubling to me. I'd like to know do other school
6 districts around the state have police in their
7 schools?

8 BRIAN CONROY: ...not aware of if they do
9 or do not. You know we didn't come prepared to
10 answer that.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So this is a
12 unique need to New York City?

13 BRIAN CONROY: I don't think it's unique
14 to New York City but I'm not prepared to provide
15 information on what other districts do.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Ms. Herrera do
17 you know? No. I guess we're not going to get an
18 answer to that. So let me talk to you about then
19 the number of school safety agents versus the
20 number of guidance counsellors. I believe in the
21 testimony that I heard it's almost four to one. So
22 there are four safety agents to almost, to one
23 guidance counsellor or thereabouts [phonetic]. So
24 that's about 1,200 guidance counsellors?
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 LOIS HERRERA: No. No no it's, it's
3 2,683 guidance counsellors, 1,207 social workers.
4 Together that's 3,890.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And how many
6 school safety agents? 5,000. So there's
7 substantially more, more school safety agents in
8 our schools than there are guidance counsellors.
9 Ms. Herrera do you see that as a problem?

10 LOIS HERRERA: I would always say it's
11 great to have more guidance counsellors as, as I
12 have testified before but I don't think one role
13 precludes the other role.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Mr. Schiraldi do
15 you think that that speaks to the priorities of
16 this administration?

17 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: I think that the
18 administration has expanded the number of guidance
19 counsellor has in schools and not expanded the
20 number of school safety agents though.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: At the insistence
22 of the, of this committee actually. We held a
23 hearing on it and we did some reporting bills on it
24 to shine the light on the fact that there weren't
25 enough guidance counsellors in the school. So I'm

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 glad that you're, you're willing to take credit for
3 that but in fact it was at the insistence of this
4 committee that we did that. I have a fundamental
5 problem also as do a number of the council members
6 with the fact that there are so many more school
7 safety agents than there are guidance counsellors.
8 So when we talk about restorative practices I
9 believe that really we should be talking to
10 educators about that and that's not to undermine
11 your qualifications for the jobs that you do as
12 well but do either of you have any background in
13 child development?

14 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: Either of us? I...

15 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes.

16 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: ...have a Master's in
17 social work and I ran a juvenile justice system in
18 Washington D.C. before... [cross-talk]

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay.

20 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: ...Department.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chief Conroy?

22 BRIAN CONROY: I do not. But our role is
23 to provide safety and security.

24 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What type of
25 background do your school safety agents have to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 diffuse these type of situations? I mean it, it's,
3 I've heard an awful lot today about training and
4 training is good but what type of background do
5 they have to be able to deal with students on this
6 very very sensitive level?

7 BRIAN CONROY: That's exactly what's
8 part of their training so... [cross-talk]

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But currently
10 they have none or very little. It's only been
11 recently that you've been training them in more
12 restorative practices. And I applaud the chancellor
13 for doing that but prior to that there really was
14 none.

15 BRIAN CONROY: They always received some
16 level of training on... [cross-talk]

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And...

18 BRIAN CONROY: ...restorative... [cross-
19 talk]

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...what was that
21 level?

22 BRIAN CONROY: ...resolution. [cross-talk]

23 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What was that
24 level of training? [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

BRIAN CONROY: ...received that at the
police academy. We've enhanced that training...

4

[cross-talk]

5

6

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How long was that
training for?

7

8

BRIAN CONROY: So it was a part of the
15 weeks training that they received at the police
academy.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: 15 weeks. And
we're dealing with very complicated social and
emotional issues that students bring to our schools
every single day. It, it really calls to question
exactly what we're doing in terms of handling
students who bring issues to school. Now I have to
tell you I read the newspaper again today and I was
very disturbed about an incident for a student who
I don't believe had many issues but was stopped at
the front door of his school by school safety
agents who threw him to the ground after having
grabbed his eyeglasses. I have to tell you how
disturbed I am by this. You know as a teacher, as a
New York City public school teacher for 25 years
before I got elected to the council. And ensuring
the dignity of every student who walks through the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 door is something that was of the highest priority
3 to me. And I know that when students wear glasses
4 to school one they open themselves up to bullying.
5 And it takes courage even for those students to put
6 on those glasses. But it takes even more courage
7 for a student who's put together his eyeglasses
8 with a pin to continue to want to go to school. But
9 then when he's found to meet opposition at the door
10 and the grabbing of his glasses as I understand
11 press reports and the throwing of the student to
12 the ground, the handcuffing of this student does
13 not speak well to any of the training or the, or
14 the restorative practices that the Department of
15 Education or the NYPD, or the school safety agents
16 alleged that they do. So can you explain to me what
17 went on at this Park Slope School on the John Jay
18 Campus?

19 BRIAN CONROY: That matter is presently
20 under investigation so... [cross-talk]

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well I had a
22 feeling that that's what you say. And that's what
23 always happens when you come in here. What about
24 Ms. Herrera because this is an education issue.
25 Where do you stand on this issue?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 LOIS HERRERA: We are working very
3 closely with the NYPD and working on protocols for
4 when students enter buildings... [cross-talk]

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: As a guidance
6 counsellor Ms. Herrera do you believe that this is
7 the best approach to handling our students in the
8 New York City public school system?

9 LOIS HERRERA: I would hope that all our
10 students are treated with dignity when they enter
11 the school building and I know that Chief Conroy
12 would agree with me on that.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: The problem is is
14 that we're tired of waiting. We've heard these
15 stories over and over and over and over again. And
16 this probably to me was one of the most egregious,
17 for me to have to hear that as a New York City
18 public school teacher was just horrible. Where are
19 the officers with an S now? Have they been
20 suspended, have they put on restrictive duty?

21 BRIAN CONROY: Again that matter is
22 under investigation.

23 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That's not part
24 of the investigation. I would like to know where
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 those officers are and I would like to know the
3 answer to that question now.

4 BRIAN CONROY: As I indicated that
5 matter is under investigation.

6 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Are they still in
7 the school?

8 BRIAN CONROY: Some of the agents are
9 not currently in the school at this time.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm sorry?

11 BRIAN CONROY: Some of the agents
12 involved are not currently in the school at this
13 time.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And some are?

15 BRIAN CONROY: Not all the agents who
16 work in that school were involved in the incident.

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But a number of
18 them were. Have you identified all of the agents
19 that were involved in that incident?

20 BRIAN CONROY: Again that matter is
21 under investigation. Those agents... overall. And I
22 also met with the principals in that school after
23 the incident to express our interest in making sure
24 that we respond and act properly inside the school.
25 We've done a tremendous job in that school in

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 making that school a safe environment for students.

3 And we will continue to do that and continue to

4 work with the school administration and the

5 Department of Education to continue with that

6 mission.

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Ms. Herrera do
8 you agree that principals should not have the final
9 say in determining what happens in situations like
10 this?

11 LOIS HERRERA: I think if the agents
12 feel if, that a crime has been committed they take,
13 they take priority. But I think certainly the
14 wishes of the principal should be taken into
15 consideration.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: so do you believe
17 that wearing eyeglasses with a pin in it is a
18 crime?

19 LOIS HERRERA: I do not.

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay do, do Mr.
21 Schiraldi or Chief Conroy believe that a pin is a
22 dangerous weapon?

23 BRIAN CONROY: Again we're going to look
24 at that incident from the totality of the whole
25 incident as it happened... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm just asking
for future reference so that students know whether
they should pin their glasses together any longer
or not.

6

BRIAN CONROY: Typically a pin is not
considered a weapon.

8

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And Ms. Herrera
was the student who had the glasses pinned together
offered any opportunity for help in securing a new
pair of glasses?

12

LOIS HERRERA: I don't know.

13

CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Then so much for
the restorative practices then. That's what I, all
I can say on this matter. It's very very
disturbing. If it was me and a student did that
and, and he had the courage to come into school
with a pin in his glasses what I would have done is
try to offer him a new pair of glasses or try to
find out a place where he could go to get a new
pair of glasses. Alright I think I've made my point
on that issue. But let me just go to a couple of
other issues that are of concern to me. Can you
describe the roll of the hearing officer in

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 determining whether or not a suspension is granted
3 and the length of the suspensions?

4 LOIS HERRERA: So the, the hearing
5 officer actually hears the merits of the case and,
6 and a superintendent suspension can make
7 recommendations and ultimately the final
8 disposition after the hearing is in the
9 jurisdiction of the early resolution counsellor who
10 is a pedagogue.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And when those
12 hearings are upheld the suspension must proceed and
13 the student goes to an alternative learning center
14 what type of follow up is done to make sure the
15 student is getting appropriate instruction and what
16 type of follow-up is done once the student's time
17 in the alternative learning center is, is finished
18 and communication back to the school?

19 LOIS HERRERA: We're actually very proud
20 of the academic rigor that we offer and the
21 alternate learning centers we have certified
22 pedagogues in all of the ALCs in subject areas and
23 so we're confident that we're offering students
24 academic coursework commiserate with what they
25 would receive in their home school. And there are

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 guidance counsellors at each of the ALCs who make,
3 who make contact with the home school to ease the
4 transition back.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I, I just want to
6 go back to the question I was asking before in
7 terms of the training. What type of measurable
8 outcomes are you expecting from school safety
9 agents in terms of what they're expected to do in,
10 in, in any type of situation how they handle these
11 situations?

12 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: So Chair Dromm we're
13 expecting the outcomes that we're so far receiving
14 which is a very substantial decline then arrests
15 and summonses at the same time that we're having a
16 very substantial decline in crime.

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: No... I'm
18 specifically talking to the situations where,
19 situations could have been deescalated and, and
20 then how do you measure that and how do you
21 determine whether the officer acted appropriately,
22 not necessarily the suspension rate which I
23 congratulate you on in, in terms of lowering the
24 suspension rates. But I do believe that actually
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 that's probably more roll of the DOE and actually
3 the, the school safety agents.

4 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: So I was talking
5 about arrest rates...

6 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Mm-hmm.

7 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: So with, with 5,000
8 or so SSAs and 1.1 million students the SSA has
9 arrested 398 people last year. So I guess my point
10 is your question earlier you said how long are we
11 going to wait and I am absolutely understand the
12 concern about this issue. We've heard about, I
13 don't want to talk about this issue because it is
14 under investigation but during the time that we've
15 had this leadership team we've heard of other
16 individual issues of this type that young people
17 were treated in ways that no one would want their
18 kid treated. So I don't, I don't want to sit here
19 and act as though none of us have feelings about
20 that we all absolutely do and we share your
21 concerns. That's exactly why we're doing what we're
22 doing. Since they started this training arrests and
23 summonses, not just suspensions but arrests and
24 summonses have plummeted. I went to the training
25 last week. DOE people were there. NYPD people were

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 there. The trainers from Harvard basically,
3 Massachusetts General that's affiliated with
4 Harvard were there. They, it was ironic because
5 they were discussing a case at that very moment
6 extremely similar to the case that you just talked
7 about. And so they're not, they're not fooling
8 around there. They got some of the best people in
9 the country to come and train their staff. Short of
10 getting rid of SSAs completely and that could
11 certainly be a debate about that they're doing a
12 pretty good job. They've trained all of them on
13 level one. They've extended the, the academy by two
14 weeks so that the fresh ones coming in get more
15 than just regular police training but get the sort
16 of social emotional training that you would want
17 them to get. And in their training all of them on
18 level two and then they're going to start training
19 all of them on level 3 which are much much deeper
20 levels of being able to deescalate. So far they're
21 doing a pretty good job I think of, of moving the
22 numbers down. Doesn't mean everybody's going to get
23 caught. I ran two large government bureaucracies.
24 Every day I woke up knowing somebody in those
25 bureaucracies were doing something I wish they

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 didn't do. But you can't have sort of universal
3 compliance. What you can have is a real solid
4 attempt which I think they have of training people
5 to behave in ways they want them to behave and then
6 holding people accountable and you can only hold
7 them accountable after you do the investigation.

8 [cross-talk]

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well first of all
10 let me, let me just say that I don't blame all
11 school safety agents for the faults of some and I
12 green with you on that totally as I would with
13 teachers and other in, employees of the Department
14 of Education. But when we're talking about
15 restorative justice measures with people who have
16 not been previously trained in some of these
17 measures one of the things that I think we need to
18 look to is having some type of measurable outcome.
19 Then we can see where these changes are occurring
20 in the school safety officers. So do you do an
21 evaluation of the school safety officers on an
22 annual basis?

23 BRIAN CONROY: As NYPD police officers
24 do school safety agents also get an annual
25 evaluation. So if there's problems with their

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 conduct it will be noted in their evaluation.
3 People are sent for retraining. People, assignments
4 are changed and they continue to be evaluated. And
5 we certainly don't tolerate any behavior that
6 doesn't comply with our goals and our mission to
7 provide that safe environment that, and working
8 together with our partners in school safety it,
9 within the school which also includes the students.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So does their
11 evaluation include a section that says
12 implementation of restorative justice practices or
13 something along those lines?

14 BRIAN CONROY: It does not. I don't
15 believe it says that specifically but I'm not sure
16 how we would measure that. But we measure... We
17 certainly review... if they get any complaints...
18 [cross-talk]

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well I think if
20 you had something on an evaluation that an officer
21 would see it places priority on that and then it
22 sends a clear message to the school safety agents
23 that this is something that they must employ if
24 they wanted to be rated satisfactorily.
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 BRIAN CONROY: That certainly could be
3 taken into consideration so...

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Certainly
5 something that we do with the pedagogues and the
6 teachers in the schools is to put that on different
7 types of evaluations. So in just... I think it was in
8 Ms. Herrera's testimony in terms of the FERPA issue
9 there must be a way that we can get this
10 information without violating the FERPA, am I
11 correct on that.

12 LOIS HERRERA: Yes, and I'm sure that we
13 can work that out.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay good because
15 that's something that we want to move forward on
16 with that as well. Alright I mean I, listen I'm
17 very very upset about what happened in Park Slope.
18 I'm glad that you've shown some empathy for the
19 student. I hope that the DOE has gone out and
20 talked to the student and held the student up for
21 his courage and for what he has done. I understand
22 that there's still a summons out and that he has to
23 go to court. And I think that there needs to be a
24 way to be, to find out that this student does not
25 have to go to court for something that he did not

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 do wrong. Are you going to commit to finding a way
3 to making sure that that student does not have to
4 go to court?

5 BRIAN CONROY: I can, I cannot commit to
6 that.

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well I have a
8 thing here. Student given summons over pin in
9 broken glasses ask NYPD to drop charges. So note
10 there, there's no way that you can have the charges
11 dropped against the student? What did he do wrong
12 that he has to show up for court now?

13 BRIAN CONROY: Again the entire incident
14 is under investigation so there was an incident
15 inside that school...

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright.

17 BRIAN CONROY: ...received a summons for
18 so that needs, that is part of the investigation.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well I certainly
20 hope that you investigate quickly. Maybe we should
21 have you back in a couple of weeks and we can find
22 out what your investigation has uncovered. That
23 would probably give you enough time and then we can
24 find out what the, how this has been adjudicated.
25 Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much
3 Chair Dromm. I appreciate it and I know you have to
4 go. We've been joined by Council Member Corey
5 Johnson. And today is my day of being extremely
6 courteous to my colleagues because I'm going to
7 also divert my time and turn this over to Council
8 Member Lander for a quick question.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very
10 much Chair Gibson and to Chair Dromm and, and Chair
11 Deutsch as well. And, and I'll be brief because I
12 do, I just want to hone in on not so much this
13 incident but some of the questions it raises more
14 broadly. I appreciate the testimony that you all
15 gave and that this administration is moving in a
16 strong and positive direction on these issues is a
17 far cry from the last administration. At the same
18 time there's a long way to go. These are hard
19 issues and we aren't getting them right yet. And so
20 I, you know on the morning that incident happened I
21 reached out to Inspector Pintos at Community
22 Affairs and he was right on top of it and he
23 reached out to, to you and to the other divisions
24 and assured me in a way that I found genuine that
25 there's a, a real investigation underway in your

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 investigative unit, in IAB, and with a CCRB
3 referral which says to me that this is an incident
4 that's being taken seriously and that pending
5 investigation we don't know but that there's an
6 openness on the part of 1PP that this was handled
7 very badly. And to me... I'm not going to ask you to
8 respond to this until you have the investigation,
9 it looks like it was handled very badly. And I, I
10 need to extend a little on what the chair said. Not
11 only that the metal detector was set off by a
12 safety pin that led to a, a really problematic
13 interaction at the point of view of the scanners
14 but then the student was upstairs in the
15 principal's office when an officer not from school
16 safety but from the precinct came in and dragged
17 him out of the principal's office, was going to
18 arrest him and ended up in the issuance of a
19 summons all over, at least as anyone seems to be
20 able to tell, the fact that the metal detector was
21 set off by the safety pin holding his glasses
22 together. So I'll wait for your investigation to
23 find out that something else happened but if the
24 facts has been reported sort of publically and by
25 teachers and by school personnel and by the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 principal are that then I will expect that there is
3 real you know accountability and discipline and I
4 want to ask you to do that today and that for sure
5 if that's the case that this summons is vacated you
6 know assuming that that's the, the fact pattern of
7 what actually happened. And it is deeply troubling
8 so... But my questions actually go to the scanners
9 because the problem for me is this is a school that
10 I've been pushing to see the scanners removed for
11 years. Several of those principals have wanted them
12 removed. And in my opinion they do much more harm
13 than good I know and I've asked and I get told how
14 many knives and other metal objects get pulled out
15 but I also know it creates a culture in that school
16 where a ton of kids the vast majority of whom don't
17 do anything wrong get to made to feel like they're
18 criminals on the daily basis where the school can't
19 let kids go out to lunch because they can't come
20 back in because they've got scanners in the school.
21 And I have asked in the past can someone please
22 explain to me or point me at a policy for where we
23 put the scanners, how we track where we put the
24 scanners, what the data is that guides it, how we
25 watch whether they're needed, how we let the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 schools know that there's a path where safety could
3 be increased so they could get rid of them, and
4 where there's also a policy for knowing where they
5 come out based on a broader set of goals of safety
6 building within a school and restorative justice.
7 And in the past no one has been able to show me a
8 policy that answers any of those questions. And so
9 my question is is there a policy for the placement
10 removal and planning around the scanners in our
11 schools?

12 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: We are working very
13 closely with the Department of Education to make
14 sure that there is a clear policy so everybody can
15 understand it... also part of the leadership team.
16 And... We are working on coming up with a policy that
17 the public and city are open to the council that
18 will demonstrate what the protocol is clearly for
19 everyone as far as removing or requesting scanning
20 be, to be put into a school. The one thing I do
21 want, you know when I met with the principals the
22 vast majority of the principals in that school are
23 for the scanning in that school. They want the
24 scanning in the school, very clearly want the
25 scanning in the school. The other part of that is

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 you know there's no intention certainly on the
3 school safety or Department of Education to have
4 the scanning be something that is criminalizing all
5 of our students to feel that way. And as part of
6 our job is to make sure students don't feel that
7 way. And we have met with students and we hear from
8 both sides. We hear from students that say they
9 feel safer in the building because of scanning and
10 there are of course students that, that object to
11 the scanning. So there is, there is an argument on
12 both sides of that. So we are certainly committed
13 to making sure that the policy is clear working
14 together with our partners. And, and we also have
15 to mention about the number of weapons that do get
16 recovered. Those weapons would be in the school if
17 they were not recovered in scanning. And just to go
18 back to... on the pin we're not clear yet and the
19 investigation will determine that and I'll let you
20 know is whether that pin actually did set off the,
21 the scanner or that was just an independent action
22 regarding observation.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: So just so I'm
24 clear you're saying there is not currently a clear
25 policy but you are working to develop one?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

VINCENT SCHIRALDI: ...we have, we, we

have a policy. It's based a lot on the principal's

desires to... [cross-talk] have it or not and we'd

like to broaden that policy to maybe in, include...

[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: First...

VINCENT SCHIRALDI: ...some other factors.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: First if there

is one I would appreciate it if you could provide

it to the committee.

VINCENT SCHIRALDI: Mm-hmm.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And I guess I'm

asking about the placement as well as the removal.

Because as far as I can tell there is a removal

policy which is if all of the principals in a... what

I was told is the policy is, and this was in the

prior administration last time I tried to get these

ones removed, if every principal in the building

signs a letter asking for them to be removed then

they will get to go to a scared straight session

with the NYPD where they are told if there are

problems in the building after the scanners are

removed we'll blame it on... you know... you will be

responsible. So would you like to have the scanners

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 removed. And then of course all the principals
3 remove the names from the letter and say no I don't
4 want the scanners removed. How could I have it on
5 my head as to collaborative planning for how to
6 achieve shared goals. So it's not surprising to me
7 that at this point the principals haven't said that
8 they want them removed. But that's not a policy.
9 And it's not a policy for placement either. That's
10 a policy about removal. I don't believe you, I
11 don't believe there is a policy that explains where
12 they are currently in ways that would satisfy any
13 of us that are data driven based on the kinds of
14 data we ought to use to make these decisions. So I,
15 I...

16 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: We're doing exactly
17 what you just talked about. So, I mean not, not the
18 previous thing but the next thing which is trying
19 to come up with a data driven way to have this
20 decision get made. We don't know what the end of
21 that conversation's going to be like but that is
22 actually in the working group co-chaired by Chief
23 Conroy right now which is what is a sort of data
24 driven logical way to decide where scanners should
25 and should not be. And then what's the process for

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 moving them from where they shouldn't be to where
3 they should be. And so that, that is going to
4 happen. And that was in the works before this
5 incident ever happened. That was on the school
6 safety agenda.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: So then let me
8 just conclude by asking just for two dates. I mean
9 by when do you think there'll be a, a policy that
10 we can review and look at and, and by when do we,
11 should we, you think the investigation of this
12 particular incident will...

13 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: We, we should have
14 the recommendations done by the summer. I'll let
15 you answer the investigation...

16 BRIAN CONROY: As far as... I don't want
17 to put a target date at this time until I look at
18 where it's progressed so far and then I will get
19 back to you... you know when I anticipate...

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: So we would
21 appreciate if you would follow-up with the
22 committee in the next week with a date by which
23 that investigation will be done and we'll look
24 forward by the summer to having, a policy refer,
25 view more broadly on, on scanner placement removal.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 Thank you. And Madam Chair thank you for your
3 indulgence.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much
5 Council Member Lander and just want to make sure
6 for the record Council Member Dromm is being
7 honored this evening with our chancellor so he did
8 have to leave but he does apologize and certainly
9 he knows how to reach you so we'll make sure we
10 follow up. I just had a couple of questions. So
11 going through all three testimonies... And obviously
12 the announcement in February to me sets forth a
13 vision of how this administration is going to be
14 different in its approach to providing public
15 safety for our schools. Recognizing the role the
16 SSAs play, the value they bring but also changing
17 the culture and there being a cultural shift so
18 that the environment that we create for our
19 children is an environment that produces respect,
20 dignity, and learning and not the pipeline to
21 prison right. I said that in my opening. And I want
22 to make sure I focus on that because in the
23 testimony I was a little disturbed to see that we
24 have almost 5,000 SSAs, 27 hundred guidance
25 counsellors, and 12 hundred social workers for 17

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 hundred school buildings in this city. So obviously
3 when we talk about resources in the classroom and
4 in the schools it is important that there is an
5 investment in guidance and social workers and I
6 know you know you know that. Because we're having a
7 lot of conversations about SSAs and the roles that
8 you know they play. And you know obviously the
9 incident at the John Jay Campus is a classic
10 example of what goes wrong right. And I think we
11 can all agree. I know there's a current
12 investigation but we can all acknowledge that that
13 incident could have been prevented and it would
14 have played out in a different way. I believe that
15 the SSAs at that school, I would assume and hope
16 that in their level of responsibility, expertise,
17 and experience that they would have the training
18 necessary to deescalate that situation so that the
19 police department is not called. That should be the
20 absolute last option in any instance. And I guess
21 I'm fearful because that incident hit the paper but
22 I can only imagine what other things go on that
23 don't make the paper. And I guess that's the reason
24 why we keep doing the work we do and why we have
25 such conversation about this shift because there

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 has to be a shift. The work that we're doing and
3 the restorative practices, the educational
4 planning, the reengagement for many of our court
5 involved students, the therapeutic crisis
6 intervention, the math tutoring program, saga
7 innovations... That's five million dollars that we
8 are adding to DOE's budget. So what I'd like to
9 know with the school leadership climate team that's
10 been composed of educators and parents and
11 advocates which I appreciate the city council has
12 representation there. You mention Mr. Schiraldi
13 that there is a report that will be coming out this
14 summer. So the five million dollars that we are now
15 beginning to invest are we looking for that
16 investment to provide results that would be in this
17 report or is this just the overall recommendations
18 of what we expect to be produced?

19 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: So this first round
20 of recommendations will be future oriented. It
21 really won't be examining the outcomes of that five
22 million dollars because most of those services
23 haven't even been procured. Saga has started but
24 these, you know when you put money into a budget it
25 doesn't mean they automatically start right away

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 after RFP things procure them and they start up. So
3 that was the amount the mayor put in the budget to
4 improve school climate, only a very small amount of
5 which has already begun because it only was you
6 know announced in February.

7 LOIS HERRERA: Okay. But there is an
8 evaluative component to, to SAGA that, that'll kick
9 in for the next school year. So SAGA started in
10 February and should it be expanding but it will
11 also have an, a third party evaluation to it.

12 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay and... [cross-
13 talk]

14 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: ...answer your
15 question?

16 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Yes, sure. Of
17 course. Ms. Herrera in your testimony you talked
18 about two revisions that we have made to
19 disciplinary responses to insubordinate behavior.
20 And I think a lot of the advocates have come to all
21 of us about A-22 and B-21 right? And we acknowledge
22 we need to make substantial changes. So what I'd
23 like to understand is this new process in order for
24 a principal to suspend a student from K to three
25 and four to 12 they have to now go through an

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 approval to demonstrate why that student is being
3 suspended and provide some of the history of that
4 particular student. So in order for that to be
5 approved it has to go through your office. And what
6 happens if your office says this suspension is not
7 approved what happens to that student in the
8 school?

9 LOIS HERRERA: So the, this is an
10 automated process that goes through, to our
11 suspension directors and our, and our hearing
12 offices. It goes through our...

13 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right.

14 LOIS HERRERA: We have brought on
15 additional staff to do this. It will happen in a
16 very timely way. We're hoping that this will be a
17 teachable moment and a, a great opportunity to have
18 conversations with principals around this so that
19 we can ensure a certain degree with confidence that
20 the suspensions aren't being given
21 indiscriminately. What happened with the
22 insubordination infraction is that there's a lot of
23 latitude. What I might consider willful defiance
24 perhaps somebody else might not. And so we're using
25 this as an opportunity to have a conversation with

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 the principal and get a sense of to what degree do
3 the behavior disrupt, instruction, what were the
4 prior behaviors, is this part of a pattern, and
5 what interventions have been used. And on the basis
6 of that my office will make a determination yay or
7 nay whether that principal suspension can go
8 forward. There are other disciplinary responses
9 that are options. So suspension is not the only way
10 to address behavior and this might be a fruitful
11 to, to request that the principal using other means
12 to address the behavior. By no means, by no means
13 are we saying that dis, disruptive behavior or
14 defiant behavior is okay or acceptable but we're
15 saying that we don't think the suspensions is the
16 way to go if it wasn't something that interfered
17 with instruction or if it wasn't part of a pattern
18 of behavior.

19 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right. So are we
20 looking with a lot of this reform talk at some of
21 the core issues that lead to this type of behavior?
22 Because I always say there's a reason for
23 everything and students with multiple suspensions
24 in a given school year to me is a cry for help. So
25 the programs that we talk about, the guidance

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 counsellors, the social workers. Conflict mediation
3 I have to say is the most crucial in, in terms of
4 ways to deescalate these situations. There've been
5 too many instances where young people were issued
6 summons, arrested, suspended for things that really
7 need to be dealt with at the school level. And you
8 know I, I always say sometimes you know we have to
9 understand that the 21st century our children are
10 learning in a different environment now and they're
11 coming to school with a multitude of problems. So
12 many children are in shelters. They are foster kids
13 and they have special needs. They have
14 disabilities. And that really requires us as the
15 adults to do things different, to address a lot of
16 those issues and be more preventative than
17 reactionary. So with cases of multiple suspensions
18 where there's one student that just keeps getting
19 suspended for pretty much the same reasons what,
20 what, how do we address and how do we deal with
21 those, those students?

22 LOIS HERRERA: Well that's why we're
23 looking at the interventions that have been used
24 with the student before. So if we see that there's
25 a pattern but that there haven't been attempts at

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 interventions then that's the way we engage the
3 principal.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. And while we
5 do not have enough guidance counsellors, and I'm
6 saying that on the record, nor social workers a
7 number of our public school buildings have school
8 based health centers which I'm a huge fan of when I
9 was in the assembly very supportive of funding from
10 Albany to implement more school based health
11 centers. So in terms of the partnerships where the
12 sum of our schools and medical providers I know we
13 have a number of community schools which I'm also a
14 fan of and our renewal schools what types of
15 partnerships do we have at the school level and
16 I'm, I'm getting to the multiple 9-1-1 calls that
17 are made from schools to pick up and take children
18 to the local emergency room for a behavioral or a
19 medical or a mental issue. So at the school level
20 what types of partnerships do we have where there's
21 almost a protocol, if a student is disruptive, IEP
22 disability do we automatically call a medical
23 professional if they're not on site? Do we go to
24 the doctor that's in the school? How does that work
25 before we get to the emergency room?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 LOIS HERRERA: Well that's part of the,
3 the new chancellor's regulation that's up for, for...
4 it'll go before PEP in May. This has to do with de-
5 escalation and training that we've agreed to do for
6 our school staff particularly in schools, the 20
7 schools that had the highest number of calls to EMS
8 for behavioral reasons and we'll be constantly
9 looking at that data and inviting more schools to
10 participate in training. So yes we are looking at
11 ways of deescalating so that we don't automatically
12 pick up the phone and call 9-1-1 for behavioral
13 incident that could be deescalated o the school
14 level. And yes we do have partnerships with the
15 school based health clinics that have mental health
16 components. And in other places we have a mobile
17 crisis unit that has been deployed, that can be
18 deployed if there is a behavioral incident and we
19 need assistance. So yes we're always looking for
20 other ways of, of handling behavioral incidents
21 that don't automatically require an ambulance to be
22 called.

23 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Where are our
24 mobile crisis units? There's one in the Bronx
25 right?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

LOIS HERRERA: Yes.

2

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And where else?

3

That's it?

4

LOIS HERRERA: No I think also in...

5

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: There are two?

6

LOIS HERRERA: There... in Queens.

7

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: There's one in

8

Queens and there's one in the Bronx. So right now

9

if we have situations where students are disruptive

10

and there's no like medical professional onsite

11

then we would automatically call this mobile unit

12

and they would physically come or how would that

13

work?

14

LOIS HERRERA: Well first of all if we

15

can deescalate the conflict and, and resolve it so

16

that the behavior is at a, a level where it can be

17

addressed by the school, that's number one. But if

18

we do need to call a mobile crisis unit because we

19

think that there is something more going on for the

20

student we would do that and they would, they come

21

to the school.

22

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Are we looking to

23

expand on that, on the mobile units?

24

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 LOIS HERRERA: It's not a DOE
3 initiative.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Oh okay.

5 LOIS HERRERA: The mobile crisis unit.

6 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Oh okay. I'm sorry.
7 I apologize. Sorry. I wanted to ask... so as you know
8 there are three bills that we have been talking
9 about Intro 65, 719, and 730 which two of them are
10 looking for additional reporting. So I don't
11 remember who but one of you talked about some of
12 the restrictions and, and Chair Dromm really
13 emphasized that. So I'm hoping that we can have a
14 conversation on how we can get beyond you know the
15 federal regulations simply because we need the
16 data, the data will demonstrate for us trends and
17 patterns of students that have multiple
18 suspensions, the metal detectors, the permanent
19 ones in place, how we define where they go and
20 those that are removed. Because we, you know we
21 have many co-located schools and we have some
22 principals that want the metal detectors and some
23 that don't as you know. So it's a struggle because
24 many of them come to us and it's really hard to
25 find a balance. The other thing that's been really

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 disturbing for me is the high level of children
3 that have been restrained by handcuffs. And sadly
4 many of them have been as young as five years old.
5 And as I said you know this conversation is about
6 prevention. So using restraints whether they are
7 Velcro restraints or other devices is that a part
8 of the conversation and what are we doing to make
9 changes so that children as young as five do not
10 have to be restrained by handcuffs?

11 BRIAN CONROY: We are working very
12 closely, have been working very closely with the,
13 with the Mayor's Office on developing policies that
14 would certainly reduce or, the number of students
15 that are handcuffed. So the part of the key
16 component of that policy is dealing with students
17 under the age of 12. And by that the last resort
18 would be metal handcuffs. Our first option there is
19 verbal commands or constructive restraint. Even the
20 Velcro cuffs would only be used if it was for the
21 safety of the child involved or other people that
22 may be present. So it's progressive. If metal
23 handcuffs or handcuffs are used to restrain
24 somebody under 12 there'll be an immediate response
25 by a, a high level executive from the police

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 department to review that incident that will report
3 back to myself and the chief of patrol on what
4 happened... and see what we can learn from that also.
5 But we have... It's clear from the discussions we've
6 had, and agreements we had with city hall that we
7 are going to make every effort not to use metal
8 handcuffs unless under... circumstances or emergency
9 situations on certainly students under 12 years
10 old.

11 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: So I think we're,
12 we're getting to an agreement here. So we all agree
13 that again last resort when there are absolutely no
14 alternatives that will work that children under 12
15 should not be placed in handcuffs right?

16 BRIAN CONROY: That's correct.

17 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. In a lot of
18 the conversations with summons and arrests, and I
19 really appreciate the work that has been done
20 because I represent many of the parents and
21 advocates from the Bronx justice organization
22 starting from new settlement PAC, the parent's
23 action committee and many of the parents from
24 school district nine in the Bronx. We have made
25 tremendous strides from where we started. And we're

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 only going to get better because we're now having
3 the same conversation. So I know you referenced it
4 Chief Conroy and I wanted to make sure that I
5 recognize that because these are examples of what
6 happens and what can happen when people really come
7 together with the same mindset and the same vision
8 and the same goals. I am proud that district nine
9 has decreased in terms of arrests and suspensions
10 but I'm also looking at more preventative measures
11 for us to go a step even further. And through a lot
12 of the conversations we've talked about a warning
13 card system that we would put in place instead of
14 children being given summons. So I know we're still
15 in the infancy stages but could you describe a
16 little bit about what the warning card system would
17 look like and what you're ultimately looking to
18 achieve by having a warning card system instead of
19 issuing summons.

20 VINCENT SCHRIALDI: Well as I indicated
21 in my testimony and provided by the numbers we've
22 made tremendous progress in reducing the number of
23 arrests and, and summons... schools. I mean dramatic
24 drops in, in the last two years alone. And we know
25 there's still areas that we can still improve and

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 we continue to reduce it. And this year those
3 numbers continue to drop. So the warning card is
4 something that's in discussing with the leadership
5 team as another potential way to continue to reduce
6 summonses and arrests. So the basic premise of the
7 warning card would be to give a warning to somebody
8 who is eligible or potentially committed an offense
9 that would be a criminal court summons could be
10 issued for. And instead of issuing that criminal
11 court summons we give the warning card. And we
12 return that and push that incident over to, to the
13 school officials to handle it as they see fit under
14 their, under their procedures. So the, that warning
15 card program is like everything else we're doing.
16 It's working very closely with the Department of
17 Education to sort of handle these incidents within
18 the school.

19 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Mm-hmm. Just
20 another question and then I'll turn it over to my
21 fellow chair. So Chief Conroy you talked about
22 school safety agents undergoing a 15 week training
23 that's an increase from the 12 I believe right...

24 BRIAN CONROY: 17 weeks... [cross-talk]

25 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: 17, I'm sorry.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

BRIAN CONROY: Used to be 15.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

you understand what I'm trying to ask.

24

VINCENT SCHIRALDI: Yes and, and it's

25

very...

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Because training is
3 important and... [cross-talk] that's where everything
4 starts, at the training.

5 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: But it's only part
6 of it. Training is important. And we have to give
7 the agents and our police officer tools to work
8 with what they're doing every day, working with
9 children, working with students. But it's also
10 important that we give the right message from the
11 executive leadership within school safety or within
12 the police department. So you know I'm not the
13 expert on training people on how to do
14 collaborative problem solving or de-escalation
15 techniques. However I can present very strongly the
16 message that we want out there and that we want our
17 students to be handled fairly and treated as
18 students and at best we can let things be handled
19 with, inside the school and working closely with
20 our partners. And we emphasize that all the time
21 and I emphasize that personally that the school
22 administration are our partners. And we're working
23 together with them to provide that safe
24 environment. So as I mentioned in the testimony we,
25 we look at ourselves as sort of the gate keepers.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 We want to prevent... people from coming in the
3 school that are, can do our students harm. But we
4 also want to try to prevent students from remove
5 from the school either under arrest or issued a
6 summons at best we can to work with the school
7 administration. So it's, I think it's a two part
8 approach. It's training but it's also the message
9 that we're conveying to our agents and police
10 officers.

11 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: So some of the data
12 that we receive at the council... You know we
13 acknowledge that a lot of the work has really
14 resulted in a decrease in suspension and arrests
15 and, and that's incredible. That's a huge step of
16 progress and I want to continue to do better. You
17 know the reason why we've had a lot of this
18 conversation has been because of the
19 disproportionate impact on communities of color on
20 children with disabilities and IEPs, children that
21 require extra attention. And so when we are looking
22 at a lot of the restorative justice and the reform
23 in different practices that are necessary we want
24 those numbers to keep going down. So as we have had
25 numbers decreasing has there been less children of

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 color and children with disabilities and other
3 special needs that has been on the decrease or is
4 it other, other populations of students in our
5 school system. The disproportionality that, that
6 you're speaking about in terms of suspensions while
7 the overall number and rate of suspensions has gone
8 down the disproportionality remains and we're very
9 conscious of that. And that's why we looked
10 particularly at the insubordination... fraction
11 because this was an area where our youngsters of
12 color were more likely to be involved in
13 suspensions. So for insubordination 19 percent,
14 pardon me, 52 percent of the students suspended for
15 insubordination were students of color. That's why
16 we put in that extra level of, of scrutiny so that
17 we can really try to reduce that
18 disproportionality. And the same thing with, with
19 students with disabilities. 36 percent of the
20 suspensions for insubordination were students with
21 an IEP. This is as of last year's data but it, it
22 tells us that this is something that we needed to
23 address. And we're, we're hoping by that extra
24 layer of review for, for, before there's a
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 suspension for insubordination that we can lower
3 this disproportionality.

4 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: Chair, Chair Gibson
5 let me just add to that which I totally agree with.
6 Part of what we're doing with the leadership team
7 is to try to identify as high priority schools and
8 if we can identify high priority schools and
9 prioritize them for both training and additional
10 resources we believe that'll further drive down
11 this proportionality because many of those schools
12 will be, schools that are disproportionately kids
13 of color. So for example last year the decline in...
14 a decline in suspensions. So overall in schools
15 that didn't get restorative practice training
16 they're, they're change in suspension was flat,
17 suspensions were flat overall. All of the decline
18 in suspensions last year were from schools that
19 were training in restorative practices. So if we
20 can identify school at high needs and those schools
21 are schools that are disproportionately, the
22 students are kids of color we feel we can further
23 drive down disproportionality.

24

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: So I'm looking at
several numbers and I guess my, my ultimate
question was is the disproportionality going down?

5

VINCENT SCHIRALDI: No.

6

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: It, it's not?

7

VINCENT SCHIRALDI: No.

8

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay so we still
have...

10

VINCENT SCHIRALDI: The number of kids
of color getting suspended has...

12

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right.

13

VINCENT SCHIRALDI: ...gone down but it
went down at pretty much the same rate as the
number of white kids getting suspended.

16

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right. So
essentially the problem still exists right? It's
just less of an impact.

19

VINCENT SCHIRALDI: And we...

20

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. And in
addition to students with disabilities students
with IEPs, students of color, there's also a
disproportionate impact male versus female. So our
young men, our, our boys are getting in trouble
more with summons and arrests and suspensions more

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 than females. So in the climate conversations are
3 we looking at some of the creative ways that we can
4 provide a unique component for young men, like
5 mentoring or some of the other programs where
6 there's a focus on young men because as the numbers
7 say more young boys are being arrested and, and
8 facing a lot of the challenges.

9 LOIS HERRERA: We actually have an
10 initiative that's part of YMI that looks at three
11 schools and it's called mentoring for real and we
12 are working with students in a multi-tiered
13 approach to try and address both climate issues in
14 general in the schools but also the individual
15 behavioral needs of the students. And this also is
16 being evaluated through a third party. So we're
17 very hopeful that this is a, a model that's worth
18 replicating.

19 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. And in
20 addition with mentoring for real I, I never heard
21 of that. But I, I know the young men's initiative
22 because a lot of the funding comes through the
23 council. But in addition there's also another
24 disproportionate impact geographically on Brooklyn
25 and the Bronx. And I'd like to know your thoughts

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 on that and is there anything we're doing to have
3 an emphasis with respect to the other boroughs but
4 there being more of a high probability of many of
5 these cases coming from Brooklyn and the Bronx.

6 LOIS HERRERA: Yes. In the process of
7 restructuring the DOE is going back to a more
8 geographic support, field support in our borough
9 field support centers. And so we will be able to
10 work with geographic or school district communities
11 to address trends that we see. As of this moment in
12 time the, the network center of the field support
13 at this point are not geographic. And so it's been
14 a little bit more of a challenge to look at schools
15 within one, one neighborhood and one community but
16 we will be in the new structure able to do that.

17 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay thank you.

18 Chair Deutsch.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Thank you very
20 much.

21 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay oh before you
22 go... I'm sorry hold on for one second. I just wanted
23 to go on record because I noticed that in all of
24 your testimonies there was a little bit of talk
25 about Intro 65 which is the legislation that we've

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 been talking about this afternoon that would
3 provide a school safety agent in non-public
4 schools. And I just wanted to know your thoughts on
5 that. Chief Conroy you alluded to it a little bit
6 but I didn't get anything from DOE or MOCJ? Intro
7 65?

8 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: So I, the point I
9 would make about that is that we are trying to
10 protect all of our children equally. We feel as if
11 there is a threat, a terrorist threat or a hate
12 crime threat. We have the best police force in the
13 country that can respond to that threat and make
14 sure that our children are safe. But for the same
15 reasons that Chief Conroy pointed out in terms of
16 allocation of resources we would have concerns.

17 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: So currently with
18 the 5,000 SSAs we have is there a criteria that
19 defines where the SSAs go? Is it per student
20 population, the number of schools, the age, the
21 location, anything that we take into consideration
22 on where our SSAs currently go?

23 BRIAN CONROY: Well the basic premise we
24 have at least one agent in every single public
25 school. So the allocation model which was done many

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 years ago in 2006 was the last time it was done
3 took a lot of things into consideration, the number
4 students, the prior crime incidents inside the
5 school, the size of the building, the number of
6 schools in the building, the exits, the number of
7 entrances and exits in the building.. So a lot of
8 factors came up with, to determine how many agents
9 would be assigned. But there's a general of
10 elementary schools with, with one agent or you know
11 sometimes a little more. There's general things of
12 how many would go into a high school or a middle
13 school but that, that's how we determine it. But
14 there's at least one agent in every single public
15 school.

16 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And also at, at
17 each of the schools you have different levels of
18 SSAs right? Level one, level two, level three is
19 supervisor right?

20 BRIAN CONROY: A level three is a
21 supervisor. A level two is more of a mobile who..
22 respond to different problems and go from one
23 school to another school to address different
24 issues. The level one agent is the one who's
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 stationary either in or just outside the perimeter
3 of the school.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: So there are times
5 when that level three rotates within a school
6 district right? Based on need or if there's
7 something that arises?

8 BRIAN CONROY: Correct. So not, not
9 every school has a level three so we have what we
10 call cluster level three. So a level three assigned
11 to a junior high school or a middle school would
12 also be responsible for supervising the level one
13 agents in the nearby elementary schools or a single
14 agent or a two agent schools.

15 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay thank you.
16 Chair Deutsch.

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Thank you. I
18 knew it was too good to be true before. Anyway my
19 first question is who funds SSA? Who funds the
20 school safety agents?

21 BRIAN CONROY: Department of Education.

22 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: So it all comes
23 from, everything comes from DOE then it goes to the
24 NYPD?

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 BRIAN CONROY: Correct. There's a budget
3 process in there but that's a, it does come through
4 the DO, from the DOE.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: From DOE
6 originally. Okay what is the school safety agent's
7 role in protecting the children from outsiders? I'm
8 not talking about, we spoke about summonses, we
9 talk about arrests and everything but what is their
10 role in protecting the school building, the school
11 children from anyone walking from outside who
12 doesn't belong in the school?

13 BRIAN CONROY: ...we consider that one of
14 the primary function of a school safety agent is to
15 monitor or visitor control as we call it, visitor
16 control procedures to, to control who comes in and
17 outside of the building. And that's done within the
18 partnership with the principal on deciding how
19 we're going to do that but we have certainly
20 standard procedures of people need to sign in
21 inside the school, present identification prior to
22 coming to school. There's not so many known to the
23 school safety agent or the school. So we do that
24 in, in every school.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Okay in every...

okay. Do you believe that the school building,
school buildings in general are targeted, a target
location?

BRIAN CONROY: I have no... As far as
terrorism?

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: As far as
people walking in from the outside. I mean you
mentioned before there were three incidents, two
incidents in a non-public school and one incident
which happens which was in a synagogue so obviously
there is some type of threat that I see that, that...
and it's school buildings, you know they're,
they're vulnerable too. So do you believe that a
public school building or any school building has
that threat of someone coming from the outside and
committing a crime like you had in the synagogue?
Do you have somebody walking in and stabs a, one of
congregants on the head?

BRIAN CONROY: We have no like direct
threat information. However it's certainly always
the possibility that somebody could try to come
into a school that doesn't belong in there for
whatever reason. They could come in to try to steal

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 laptops off a desk. So there, there's reasons why
3 somebody could come into a school other than a
4 terrorist threat. But there's certainly always the
5 possibility that somebody who does not belong in
6 the school building could enter it. And that's one
7 of the primary rolls of the agents is to prevent
8 that from happening along with the school staff.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: So like a
10 sanitation garage. Anyone could walk into a
11 sanitation garage with a gun but I don't consider a
12 sanitation garage a place where someone's going to
13 want to come in with a weapon and start shooting.
14 So where you have a building where you have
15 children inside you know I don't think we could
16 afford to wait for something to happen. I believe
17 that's, you know I think we all feel that this, the
18 children need to be protected so we cannot wait for
19 something to happen and then say I told you so. So
20 you have the school safety agents around the
21 schools, around the public schools. And we did
22 have, you did mention on your testimony that there
23 were two incidents in the schools which I think are
24 very important to, to, to log. So my question is to
25 you that where you have with your feeling in the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 building that has school children inside do you
3 believe a building like that has more of a threat
4 than any other type of institution that is not a
5 school with children and not there.

6 BRIAN CONROY: ...that information that I
7 could provide you if it's any more of a threat to...
8 However as mentioned in those two incidents the
9 police department quickly responded and resolved
10 those two incidents. And as we also mentioned in
11 the testimony the police precincts have a very
12 close relationship with schools within their
13 precinct boundaries and provide adequate security.
14 There's a specific threat just like a school, if we
15 knew there was going to be a specific threat to a
16 school we would up, necessarily maybe up a level of
17 security and put a uniform police officer there. So
18 I think the same thing would apply to a private
19 school that there was a specific threat they would
20 assign a uniform presence as needed. We also offer
21 the ability of crime prevention, a very extensive
22 crime prevention program where a crime prevention
23 officer would be able to go to a school and do a
24 security assessment of any school building you know
25 based on request.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Just want to amplify
3 one thing and you correct me if I'm wrong on this.
4 When you say a uniformed presence you also mean an
5 armed presence right because the SSAs are not
6 armed, isn't that correct?

7 BRIAN CONROY: That's correct.

8 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: And so, so the, the
9 5,000 that are in the elementary school I'd say
10 one... [cross-talk] they don't have a gun to prevent
11 somebody who would be armed from...

12 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: I understand
13 that. So if I would call 9-1-1 from a school
14 building and I would say in a school building
15 someone just trespassed. What is typically, what is
16 the response time if I do call 9-1-1 for the NYPD
17 who are armed to respond to that location opposed
18 to calling 9-1-1 from another location which is not
19 a school which may be a commercial establishment by
20 saying there is someone trespassing. So is there a
21 difference between the response time by the NYPD
22 when 9-1-1 is called?

23 BRIAN CONROY: I think if there was any
24 sort of, we'd have to do a comparison study to
25 determine the response time to incidents in

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 schools. As far as private schools there's been, we
3 did some research and it was very minimal number of
4 calls to a private school for a, a criminal type
5 incident. But certainly a, a response to a school
6 of an incident would be a priority for, for the
7 police officers. But to give you an exact response
8 time we would not, I could not do that at this
9 time.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: So in other
11 words the 9-1-1 dispatcher would understand that
12 you're calling from a school and there would
13 dispatch with saying that the, a school is calling
14 that there is a trespasser walking into the school
15 or in the school right now. So you're saying that
16 that is a priority? Does that go high up as a
17 priority if there's a robbery, a call, a call for
18 robbery that comes in or a burglary so that would
19 that be in the same category, in the same level?

20 BRIAN CONROY: ...and, and because it'll
21 be an in progress incident it would get a high
22 priority.

23 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: So...

24 BRIAN CONROY: Not something as if a
25 past incident happened and for example property got

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 stolen and somebody want to report that stolen. So,
3 but certainly a crime in progress would get a
4 higher level priority.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Is a trespass
6 considered a, something of a high priority which of
7 a crime in progress in that category?

8 BRIAN CONROY: Certainly, certainly
9 could be and should be.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: It should be
11 but possibly...

12 BRIAN CONROY: It would be. If somebody
13 had a trespasser in the school you know and it also
14 depends on how that information was relayed to the
15 police department. So I would consider that in most
16 circumstances that would be a, a high priority call
17 not being able to account for the exact thing that
18 happens. So hypothetically... [cross-talk]

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: So...

20 BRAIN CONROY: ...incident here.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON DUETSCH: So if I call 9-
22 1-1 and I say I'm in a school building and there's
23 a trespass that would be highest, that would be a
24 high priority, that would be top priority? [cross-
25 talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

BRIAN CONROY: Correct.

3

4

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Does S, school
safety agents receive active shooter training?

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

BRIAN CONROY: School safety agents are
part of the general response protocol training at
the, the Department of Education provides to their
school administrative staff on how to react and
what to do during emergencies. As far as active
shooter training what we do give the agents is
training on how they should, that they should part...
general response pro... what... shelter in... they get
training in that. To actually, they don't get
training on how to confront an active shooter. We
do give them training on how to provide basic
medical triage. Each one gets a medical kit and if
there was, basically... to stop any bleeding as
quickly as possible pending the arrival of
emergency medical personnel.

20

21

22

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Does the police
department approach active shooters? What's their
protocol, the NYPD?

23

24

25

BRIAN CONROY: The department's protocol
on an active shooter training is to end the threat.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Is to end the
threat... So they would confront an active shooter.

2

3

4

BRIAN CONROY: That's correct.

5

6

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: They'll
confront. So...

7

8

VINCENT SCHIRALDI: [off mic] ...talking
about regular police... [cross-talk]

9

10

BRIAN CONROY: Regular police... [cross-
talk]

11

12

13

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Regular,
regular police. So the school safety officers, do
they carry weapons, any type of weapons?

14

15

BRIAN CONROY: No they do not.

16

17

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Mace?

18

BRIAN CONROY: No.
CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Nothing like
that. Do they carry radios?

19

20

BRIAN CONROY: Yes.

21

22

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Yes. Those
radios can they communicate with a person who's
armed, someone from the NYPD?

23

24

BRIAN CONROY: They could, would
communicate through our, through our radio dispatch

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 system. They don't communicate directly with an
3 armed police officer.

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: So they could
5 go directly to a dispatcher now. When you go on the
6 radio and you call in an incident of occurrence
7 which is active right now then would that response
8 come quicker than if someone in a school building
9 call, calls 9-1-1? Which one will get a quicker
10 response?

11 BRIAN CONROY: That's something we'd
12 have to do a study on because I, I don't really, I
13 am not prepared to say at this time under what
14 circumstances you'd get a, you'd get a quicker
15 response on that.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Okay so, okay
17 so if you could get back to me with those two...

18 BRIAN CONROY: We'll have to do an
19 analysis of that.

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Now does school
21 safety keep a log of all incidents in public
22 schools of trespass?

23 BRIAN CONROY: School safety agents
24 prepare a criminal or an incident report. So for
25 all incidents that happen inside a school. So that

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 could be from somebody who slips and falls, a
3 student slips and falls and hurts themselves... to a,
4 to a criminal incident or certainly to somebody and
5 somebody trespasses inside a building.

6 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: So a trespass
7 would be a highly, would be top, top priority
8 right? Would be in the highest category of a crime
9 trespass? So...

10 BRIAN CONROY: There are, there are
11 different levels of trespassing. There are students
12 who sneak into schools to, or try to sneak into
13 schools to be with their friends for the day. You
14 know that, that certainly, that type of trespasser
15 would be different than the person who's coming in
16 that building to create some sort of harm inside
17 the building.

18 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: So do you have
19 a separate, do you have a log of a trespass who
20 might not be a student, someone that doesn't belong
21 in the school, are there separate logs for that
22 type of...

23 BRIAN CONROY: We, we could go through
24 our, our incident reports and pull out which ones
25 are student trespass which is a vast majority is a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 student trespasser and or any incident that was
3 somebody who was an adult intruder. So we, we could
4 go through our records to come up with that
5 information.

6 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: So... Okay so you
7 don't have anything right now that's...

8 BRIAN CONROY: No I... Well I don't have
9 anything here that breaks it down...

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Okay so yeah I
11 would love to see how many trespass if you could...

12 [cross-talk]

13 BRIAN CONROY: Okay.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: ...back to the
15 committee to see how many trespass incidents you
16 have in the public school system. And also if you
17 collaborate with the NYPD... Actually you mentioned
18 about the security survey. Does school safety ever
19 do a, a survey on private schools and on public
20 schools or do you rely on crime prevention to do
21 that survey?

22 BRIAN CONROY: It would be the
23 responsibility of crime prevention to do that, to
24 do that survey. We do respond to requests from
25 private schools if they want us to talk about our

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 active shooter program or what the general response
3 protocol program is. Upon request we have done
4 that. We do go to private school and talk about
5 what the, what programs we do use within the public
6 school to provide safety. So, and we're certainly
7 willing to do that.

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Uh-huh. Okay
9 and when school safety agents need outs, need help
10 you mentioned that some schools may have one school
11 safety agent. Some may have more. So in a school
12 where you have one school safety agent and that
13 person needs backup, does that person call 9-1-1 or
14 does that individual, the school safety agent go
15 over the radio and call for backup?

16 BRIAN CONROY: The protocol will be go
17 over, go over the radio... [cross-talk]

18 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: But we're not
19 sure which one would be a quicker response so
20 wouldn't we... be like for the safety of the officer
21 to know which way is a quicker response because
22 maybe he should go call 9-1-1 to ask, to, to call
23 for backup. So...

24 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: I think it would be
25 important for me to, to... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: ...if, if a
school safety...

3

4

VINCENT SCHIRALDI: ...to give you data...

5

[cross-talk]

6

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: ...if a school
safety agent needs to go over radio to call for
backup then I would assume that that's probably a
quicker response to get, to get a backup then to
get uniformed officers. So, and that's why I fell
how important it is for all schools to receive and
to have school safety agents in all the schools
because all our children need to be protected. And
having the school safety agents at the schools who
carry radios and before the administration came in
to testify we had several panels that came up here
and really no one knew what the role of a school
safety agent is until we speak to administration.
But I believe from what I hear that a radio that a
school safety agent has probably gets a, a lot
quicker response than picking up the phone and
calling 9-1-1 because otherwise you would have the
school safety agent calling 9-1-1 opposed to going
over the radio. So that's, I feel that every
school, every child needs to be protected. Under

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 1.4 million children throughout the city in public
3 school and non-public schools all deserve the same
4 protection. We're all children of god and we all
5 deserve that protection. So I have no more further
6 questions at this time. I might come back a little
7 bit later.

8 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you. Thank
9 you Chair Deutsch. And now we'll have Council
10 Member Greenfield for a couple of minutes. Thank
11 you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you
13 Madam Chair. First I just want to say at the outset
14 that I'm a supporter of Intro 719 and 730. I
15 especially want to thank the chair for her
16 leadership on this issue. I certainly agree with
17 the school safety division that overall crime,
18 crime is down. But I think as the chair has pointed
19 out we have some issues and we could resolve those
20 issues. We could always be better. We could always
21 improve the situation. So I want to thank Chair
22 Gibson for her leadership on this vital issue.
23 Because I have limited time I'm going to focus
24 specifically on my legislation, Introduction 65,
25 which would provide school safety agents to public

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 schools and non-public schools that request. And so
3 I just want to reiterate a few of the things that
4 my colleague, the chair of the Non-Public School
5 Committee Chaim Deutsch already reiterated which is
6 that one of the main goals and you said this is to
7 prevent unauthorized intruders and weapons from
8 entering our schools. I'm sure you would agree
9 because that's in your testimony, is that correct?

10 BRIAN CONROY: That's correct.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay. So
12 this is a particularly salient point because
13 earlier today there was some confusion over what
14 exactly the role is of school safety agents and I
15 think we would agree that's one of the primary
16 roles and certainly as that would apply to non-
17 public schools that's a very important role as
18 well. So I certainly appreciate the fact that as
19 you mentioned that non-public schools are a vibrant
20 part of, of each precinct and that when you have
21 resources you do I fact try to assign them around.
22 I want to, I want to know about school crossing
23 guards. You, you're currently, you do assign school
24 crossing guards to non-public schools, is that
25 correct?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 BRIAN CONROY: That's correct, as needed
3 as we put in testimony.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: As is needed
5 you have some at non-public schools. And as you
6 said when there is a specific threat to a school
7 you will provide an officer sometimes even a full
8 uniformed officer, armed officer to that school if
9 it's a non-public school as well, is that correct?

10 BRIAN CONROY: Correct. It would always
11 be a uniformed officer, it would never be a school
12 safety agent to a... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay.

14 BRIAN CONROY: ...non-public...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: So I think
16 the, the point that I'm making is that obviously
17 from, from a technical and legal standpoint there's
18 no bar to providing these services because you're
19 already providing these services because I think
20 that's a very important point that we, we want to
21 make. So I guess my next question is if you do
22 provide school safety officers to public schools
23 why not provide to non-public schools right? You
24 provide school safety agents but why don't you
25 provide them to non-public schools? Is it a matter

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 of you are limited resources currently in terms of
3 where your school safety agents are?

4 BRIAN CONROY: I think as we, as I
5 indicated in the testimony that the decision to
6 assign resources needs to be left up to the police
7 commissioner. As far as the school safety agents
8 assigned to public schools they've always been
9 assigned to the public schools going back many
10 years when... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: That's
12 right.

13 BRIAN CONROY: ...school safety was under
14 the, the Board of Education so... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: We agree. I
16 mean... So that's my point. My point is that if
17 you're assigning them to public schools, we're
18 assigning school crossing guards there's no reason
19 why we can't extend that to non-public schools. But
20 I want to focus specifically on your argument which
21 is that the commissioner and the mayor need
22 flexibility. The council has proposed today in its
23 budget response despite the fact that the mayor has
24 not asked for it that we add a thousand additional
25 police officers to the NYPD. Is NYPD opposed to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 that recommendation based on what you just said
3 where we should not be telling you how, what
4 resources you need and don't need?

5 BRIAN CONROY: I don't think that's for
6 me to respond here at this, at this time.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay. That's
8 fair. I, I imagine the answer's probably going to
9 be no considering that the commissioner's indicated
10 that... supportive. I see the assistant commissioner
11 is smiling in the front row. And so I think it
12 proves my point which is that I think the NYPD is
13 somewhat selective over what legislative
14 interference they want versus what legislative
15 interference they don't want. Right when you like
16 our legislative interference when we're going to
17 give you a thousand more cops I think the NYPD's
18 supportive and then when we're saying hey we might
19 need some more school safety agents and you, you
20 may not think that's your priority, you may not be
21 supportive, so I would just suggest that it's not
22 really fair to, to pick and choose. But I, I do
23 want to focus on, on one final issue and that is
24 the safety. You mentioned, and you know the mayor
25 likes to mention that whenever there's a public

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 safety threat in fact one of the prior speakers
3 actually addressed this issue that the NYPD always
4 comes into position and they cover as necessary
5 non-public institutions such as synagogues or
6 churches or in many cases schools, yeshivas,
7 catholic schools, Muslim schools whatever. And that
8 is what you said is part of the practice. Is that
9 correct, that that is done on occasion as
10 necessary?

11 BRIAN CONROY: Correct.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay. So I
13 guess my practical question is it's my
14 understanding that in the typical precinct at any
15 given time there are approximately four cruisers
16 that are actually available that are dispatched.
17 Would you agree that it might be somewhat difficult
18 in a community such as mine where I have over 200
19 non-public schools for those four cruisers to
20 actually cover those 200 non-public schools when
21 there is an incident or a security threat?

22 BRIAN CONROY: The police department has
23 always responded very effectively to any calls for
24 service. [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I'm not,
3 that's not... [cross-talk], that's not, I'm not
4 questioning that by the way. We love the police
5 department. As you know I'm a big fan and a
6 supporter and I think you guys do great work. The
7 point that I'm making, and it's okay not to
8 respond, is that the reality is that when the mayor
9 gets up and he says I am there and the NYPD is
10 there when we have threats the NYPD simply doesn't
11 have the resources right now. And that's the
12 challenge, especially in a district like mine when
13 we have hundreds of non-public schools and on
14 average you have four police cars that are going,
15 going around. Even if you wanted to put all four
16 which probably would not be advisable considering
17 that you then probably couldn't answer to other
18 calls and do arrests and things like that is just
19 not feasible. And that is why... This just responds
20 to your testimony, that is why we as a legislature
21 we feel it necessary to give you the additional
22 resources to handle those situations because we
23 think your resources are... So I'm going to
24 respectfully disagree with your assessment. And I
25 will point out that on occasion the NYPD, such as

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 when we offer overall more police officers actually
3 will accept that, and I would encourage the NYPD to
4 reconsider and to take our very generous offer
5 which is we'd like to give you some more school
6 safety agents to cover our non-public schools.

7 Thank you very much.

8 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: The, just, just two,
9 two points I'd like to make. One is...

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Sure.

11 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: ...the, the, those
12 same four cruisers that are in, in your precinct
13 and I'm going to accept that that's the right
14 number would also have to cover the public schools
15 in many cases if there was an external threat.
16 Because in, in many of those public schools there
17 will be an unarmed SSA. And as far as the
18 characterization around NYPD's acceptance of
19 external resources the difference with this is that
20 it's not just a council offering additional
21 resources, it's that it's left up to a great many
22 individual schools to decide that they want a
23 resource. And that, I think in, in, in Chief
24 Conroy's testimony I think he fairly points out
25 that that's a kind of different way of allocating

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 resources than we're used to and, and sort of
3 challenges the budget of the city to allow
4 individual private entities to make decisions about
5 how to allocate resources... sort of no check on
6 that, no balance.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...I
8 understand.

9 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: But I, I
11 would just... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Council Member we
13 have to move on.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I would just
15 close with this final point where I would...

16 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: You should have
17 closed two minutes ago.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay. I, I
19 will...

20 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay please...

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I'm just
22 responding to Louis's point which is I think your
23 first point Louis as far as the need at other
24 public schools proves my point that we actually do
25 need more school safety agents and to your second

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 point I would say we're a pretty innovative city.
3 We, we can deal with a little bit of change but
4 thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. Thank you.

6 Thank you. I just had one question. I just wanted
7 to make sure for the record, DOE in your testimony
8 Ms. Herrera you didn't talk about Intro 65 so I
9 just wanted to know if you had a position or if
10 that was up to conversation on Intro 65, the bill
11 that many people have been talking about today.
12 It's, it's not in your testimony. You've talked
13 about 719 and some of the limitations around ratio
14 of guidance counsellors to school safety agents and
15 some of the issues that you have raised is that
16 this could compromise the safety of schools in our
17 communities or other law enforcement operations.
18 Does NYPD agree with that? Because you didn't
19 mention 719 in your testimony Chief Conroy. So this
20 is the bill that would ask for a report from the
21 administration on the number of guidance
22 counsellors as it relates to the number of school
23 safety agents.

24 BRIAN CONROY: I think our general
25 response is that we consider it two separate

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 issues. School safety, providing the security to
3 the schools is not related in any way to the number
4 of guidance counsellors.

5 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Understanding some
6 of the mechanisms and dynamics behind it is that
7 there are 5,000 SSAs in comparison to 27 hundred
8 guidance counsellors. So many of us don't know
9 where the SSAs nor the guidance counsellors are in
10 our public schools. So this bill is an attempt to
11 see do we have for every one guidance counsellor
12 six or seven SSAs? So that's the logic behind the
13 bill. I understand the concern from DOE in terms of
14 you know limiting law enforcement operations. I, I
15 get that. But I'm just trying to understand is
16 there a way that we can keep having conversations
17 so we can overcome that hurdle?

18 LOIS HERRERA: We report out in, in, in
19 another bill from last year. We report out on
20 counsellors and where they are by school. And so...
21 [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And that's on the
23 website?

24 LOIS HERRERA: Yes.

25 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 LOIS HERRERA: To be fair I'd like to
3 correct something I said earlier because I've been
4 given more information.

5 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

6 LOIS HERRERA: About the mobile response
7 teams. And I know that was something that you were
8 concerned about. There are 29 mobile response
9 times, that it's a DOHMH initiative in
10 collaboration with DOE. The model offers triage
11 assessments, classroom observations, case
12 management, crisis intervention, and professional
13 development for staff should it be needed.

14 VINCENT SCHIRALDI: Ad they're in all
15 five boroughs, not just the Bronx and Queens.

16 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Oh okay. Okay.
17 Great. Well thank you very much. I know for the
18 sake of time... We have a lot to continue to talk
19 about but I am very encouraged by the school
20 leadership climate team. And I know that we will
21 have multiple conversations. But I appreciate your
22 presence. Thank you for your testimony and I look
23 forward to working with the administration. [cross-
24 talk] Thank you for being here. Thank you. Okay. So
25 this hearing is still continued. I want to thank

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 everyone for their extreme patience this afternoon.
3 I know many of you have been waiting quite a bit to
4 testify and I do appreciate it. Everyone will be
5 heard that signs up today. I assure you of that.
6 Your testimony will be put into our record so that
7 we do have your information. So we're going to
8 start with a panel of advocates. And then we're
9 going to move to students. And then we're going to
10 alternate back and forth. But I do appreciate again
11 your patience everyone and thank you for being here
12 this afternoon. And we're going to have our first
13 panel speaking on 719 and 730 Nicholas Sheehan from
14 the Advocates for Children, Joanna Miller from the
15 New York City Civil Liberties Union, Matthew Guldin
16 from the Dignity in Schools Campaign of New York,
17 Anna Bean also from the Dignity in Schools Campaign
18 of New York, and Kate McDonough from Girls for
19 Gender Equity. Nicholas Sheehan, Joanna Miller,
20 Mathew Guldin, Anna Bean, and Kate McDonough please
21 come forward. And if you have testimony please make
22 sure that our Sergeant at Arms receives it for the
23 committee. Thank you again.

24 [pause]

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. Thank you all
for being here and we'll start with Mr. Sheehan.

3

4

Thank you. And everyone I'm sorry we always have to

5

limit you. So we'll have three minutes. So if you

6

can summarize I really appreciate it. Thank you so

7

much.

8

NICHOLAS SHEEHAN: Yeah I'll try and go

9

as quickly as possible. So thank you very much for

10

the opportunity to testify today. My name's Nick

11

Sheehan. I'm a staff attorney in Skadden Fellow at

12

Advocates for Children New York... represent

13

students... New York City school to prison pipeline.

14

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Is your microphone

15

on?

16

NICHOLAS SHEEHAN: I think it is.

17

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay I... Is the red

18

button on?

19

NICHOLAS SHEEHAN: That looks like it's

20

on yeah.

21

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. Thank you.

22

Okay.

23

NICHOLAS SHEEHAN: I'll project, use my

24

outside voice.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: AFC plays a

3

leadership role in the Dignity in Schools Campaign

4

New York, the Student Safety Coalition, and the

5

Mayor's School of Climate Leadership team which

6

we've heard a lot about today already. As part of

7

the leadership team we're working very closely with

8

New York City police department, the Department of

9

Education and other partners to examine and reform

10

school policing and discipline practices. The NYPD

11

and DOE have been very willing and able partners in

12

this work and we just want to commend them for

13

being at the table and being a part of those

14

conversations. We support passage of both

15

Introduction number 730 which amends the student

16

safety act and Introduction number 719 requiring

17

the DOE to report on the ratio of school safety

18

officers to guidance counsellors in each schools.

19

My testimony focuses briefly on two of the big

20

significant gaps in the acts, student safety acts

21

current reporting requirements. First we heard from

22

the previous panel about significant reductions in

23

summonses and arrests in schools. Those numbers

24

reflect only summonses and arrests issued by the

25

school safety division of the NYPD and not

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 summonses and arrests made or issued by regular
3 precinct or patrol officers. The act would remedy
4 that limitation expanding the reporting to cover
5 any NYPD employee who makes an arrest or issues a
6 summons in a school. We think that's important
7 because at present the act fails to capture this
8 other entire universe of school based summonses and
9 arrests so we have no data on those right now.
10 Second in regards to the DOE's reporting the big
11 gap there is that because of their privacy concerns
12 there are a number of redactions in the data which
13 make it really essentially impossible to calculate
14 statistics around you know the number of students
15 suspended, the number of students of color, the
16 number of students with disabilities who are
17 suspended, the number, what, like what, what
18 infraction codes they're being suspended for, how
19 long their suspensions are lasting. So the
20 amendments that we are proposing today or the, the
21 council is proposing would remedy that by one
22 thing. They will aggregate the, the data that's
23 reported at the school district and citywide
24 levels. This is going to solve both the DOE's
25 privacy concerns and the redaction concerns. When

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 you redact it, excuse me, when you aggregate the
3 data into large numbers it's hard to tell
4 individual student data from those numbers. So
5 that's... the DOE's privacy concerns. And that is how
6 that's going to work. We also support the passage
7 of Intro 719 which would require the DOE to report
8 to city council, the school by school ratio of SSOs
9 to guidance counsellors. In our work on school
10 climate leadership team we'd regularly hear from
11 principals and school administrators about the
12 importance of social workers, guidance counsellors,
13 and school psychologists. So we'd encourage the,
14 the council to consider including those ratios as
15 well, school safety officers to social workers and
16 school psychologists. And also really the very most
17 important ratio is the staff to student right? We
18 think this bill is important because we'll shed
19 light on how the city chooses to allocate its
20 resources between school safety officers and key
21 personnel but ultimately you want to have a low
22 counsellor, psychologist, social worker, to student
23 ratio and we think learning what those ratios are
24 in each school will be very important.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
3 much. Thank you. Who's next? You can go.

4 ANNA BEAN: Okay cool. Hi, my name's
5 Anna Bean. I'm the campaign coordinator with
6 Teacher's Unite and we're a member of the Dignity
7 in Schools Campaign New York and the student safety
8 coalition. I'm actually reading a statement written
9 by Drum South Asian Organizing Center. So these are
10 not my words but I agree with them. The student
11 safety act has been a pivotal piece of legislation
12 that has contributed to greater transparency and
13 accountability in the education and juvenile
14 justice systems. The student safety act data has
15 shown that the work of community based advocacy and
16 legal organizations that led to win this policy to
17 end the racial disparities and the policies and
18 practices that negatively impact the lives of low
19 income students of color is rooted in facts.
20 However over the years we have seen how the act has
21 shed greater light on these issues and have seen
22 the limitations and loopholes of the reported data.
23 Schools can bypass the reporting of required data
24 by enacting the practices that have negative
25 impacts on a student's ability to learn and feel

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 safe and supported in schools. For example schools
3 are not required to report interactions with
4 emergency medical services which many youth are
5 referred to as a method of dealing with
6 disciplinary issues and also does not require
7 reporting of student interactions with NYPD
8 officers like summons or arrests which all have
9 negative implications on a student's education and
10 life. While we need to pass the amended student
11 safety act because it will further weaken the
12 school to prison pipeline we need to question why
13 the over 5,000 school safety agents are even under
14 the authority and training of the NYPD. The school
15 safety agents should be full employees of the New
16 York City Department of Education as the more than
17 17 hundred schools are locations they are operating
18 in. And yet the over 239 million dollar budget is
19 automatically given to the NYPD for their authority
20 over the SSAs. This money should stay in education
21 just as SSAs should stay under the authority of our
22 education system.

23 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you.

24 MATTHEW GULDIN: Alrighty, thank you.

25 Good afternoon Council Members. I am Matthew Guldin

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 former Dean of Students at East Side Community High
3 School now serving as a school climate coach at the
4 Bronx Studio School for Writers and Artists. I'm a
5 member of Teachers Unite, a member organization of
6 public school educators that works alongside
7 students, parents, and advocates in the Dignity in
8 Schools Campaign New York Chapter and the Student
9 Safety Coalition. I'm here today to address the
10 need for more transparency in the data around
11 school climate and safety particularly on the issue
12 of multiple suspensions for students. Data reports
13 from the DOE currently include the number of
14 suspensions issued at each school but tell us
15 nothing about the students who are suspended more
16 than once. The proposed amendments to the student
17 safety act would include needed information about
18 multiple suspensions at schools. The student safety
19 coalition is asking for this change not to put
20 schools on blast but to get critical information
21 from the DOE which can effectively help schools
22 deal with their challenges. It's hard work to
23 create a safe carrying accountable school
24 community. And with more complete information the
25 city can better support schools, students, and the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 families that need it the most. And if we don't
3 offer help we all know that the data shows that
4 multiple suspensions in high school greatly
5 increases the teenager's likelihood of dropping out
6 of school, being on the street, and ending up in
7 jail. I'll tell you about Junito, not his real
8 name, a sensitive and intelligent kid who was
9 involved in gang related activity on the street
10 which sometimes spilled into the school in the form
11 of defying authority, graffiti, and fighting. Of
12 course we couldn't let those behaviors go
13 unpunished and so Junito was suspended many times.
14 We did offer counselling and family services
15 through local CBOs and one of my assistant deans
16 even tried being his big brother. But our efforts
17 working alone fell short. In the end we didn't have
18 the skills and resources to keep Junito in school
19 and out of jail. If the DOE had highlighted those
20 schools with multiple suspensions and again not in
21 a gotcha sense sort of way they would have been
22 more equipped to help us support us in our work
23 with Junito. Perhaps they would have given us
24 access to interagency services that we did not
25 possess. Junito's road may have been altered.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 Furthermore it's not only the students whose needs
3 will be addressed by such reporting. Some staff
4 members in schools may be taking the easy way out
5 by pushing for suspensions of a child rather than
6 by engaging in the heart of work of adequately
7 addressing his or her needs. Having the information
8 on multiple suspensions can lead us to finding out
9 which schools or school personnel need support to
10 develop different approaches to teen and preteen
11 misbehavior. Finally having the multiple suspension
12 info may help us uncover where some of the
13 ingrained racial prejudice in our system lies. We
14 all know that 27 percent of our student population
15 is African American and yet 54 percent of our
16 suspensions are of African American young people.
17 With the multiple suspension data on hand we will
18 be able to look at our school suspension data
19 objectively and see where some of our systems
20 structural racism may lie. I thank you for
21 listening and look forward to your questions.

22 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
23 much.

24 KATE MCDONOUGH: Good afternoon. My name
25 is Kate McDonough. I'm the Director of Organizing

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 at Girls for Gender Equity. We're an
3 intergenerational grassroots organization based in
4 Brooklyn. We do work citywide. We're also a member
5 of the school climate working group. So for the
6 past years our sister in strength youth organizers
7 who are all high school aged young women of color
8 have been conducting their own research on
9 discipline practices in school and calling
10 attention to how racial and gender stereotypes
11 about young women of color, particularly black
12 girls cause them to be uniquely and unfairly
13 disciplined. I'm going to share you, share a story
14 from one of our organizers, Saharan, who is a tenth
15 grader at a New York City public high school in
16 East New York. She couldn't be here earlier today
17 because of commitments to class and also had
18 commitments after school. So here's her story. In
19 school I have to go through metal detectors so
20 anything that disturbs or makes it go off is told
21 to be taken off. There was a time I had my hair
22 wrapped with bobby pins and it caused the machine
23 to go off. I was told to remove the pins from my
24 hair but I refused. I was threatened by being told
25 that my parent was going to be called but I didn't

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 care. The safety agents made it seem like I was
3 doing something wrong or as if my hair being
4 wrapped was dangerous. After refusing to undue her
5 hair Saharan's mother was called, she missed her
6 first period class, and furthermore Saharan now
7 feels like she can't show up at school as her full
8 self without being penalized. This is not an
9 isolated incident. Many of our sister in strength
10 youth organizers reported being punished simply for
11 having their hair wrapped and being forced to
12 choose between undoing their hair and getting to
13 class on time. When schools are not required to
14 report on the presence and use of metal detectors
15 we fail to make the important connections between
16 the harmful policies and practices and students
17 dropping grades or school attendance. Girls for
18 Gender Equity fully supports the amendments to the
19 student safety act which will enable us to see
20 where change is really needed within our school
21 system, not just in the behavior of individual
22 students but increasing positive adult supports and
23 safety of their environments. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
25 much.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 JOHANNA MILLER: Can I have her extra 30
3 seconds? I'm just kidding. Johanna Miller, I'm the
4 advocacy director at the New York Civil Liberties
5 Union. We strongly support Intro 730 and 719. And
6 as probably one of the leading experts on the
7 operations, the successes and the failures and
8 shortcomings of the school safety division we
9 respectfully oppose Intro 65. And I'll talk a
10 little bit about that. I just want to say I won't
11 add to what everyone said, sort of the list of
12 things we think these amendments, Intro 730 will do
13 that is great. Everything in there is great. This
14 is a bill that grew out of one of the most
15 progressive and impactful measures our city has
16 ever taken on school safety. I'm very fortunate
17 right now to be working really closely with Brian
18 Conroy, with Lois Herrera, with others. It's
19 amazing to be at the table with them. They, they're
20 great partners but we wouldn't be at that table if
21 it wasn't for the student safety act. It is not an
22 exaggeration to say that. So I think we need to
23 take a deep breath when we hear the sort of
24 institutional arguments that it's either too
25 resource intensive or it's a safety danger or a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 privacy danger to collect this information because
3 with those were the same things we heard in 2011.
4 And all it has gotten us is good. Nobody's safety
5 has been threatened. Nobody's institutional systems
6 have been damaged. In fact we are the closest to
7 having a functioning school safety system that
8 we've been probably since '98 when the transfer
9 happened. So I commend you for your sort of courage
10 and looking at the big picture here and your
11 colleague Council Member Dromm for sort of saying
12 we need to get past... concerns we need to get past
13 this phantom safety concern. Because the student
14 safety acts has only ever done good and it will do
15 good again if we can continue to improve it. One of
16 the good things that we'll do is allow us to
17 monitor progress as schools start to turn things
18 around which I think with the recommendations from
19 the leadership team we're going to see some
20 turnaround but let's see it. At, earlier Vinny was
21 up here and he mentioned that most of the reduction
22 and suspensions has happened in schools that have
23 had training on restorative practices. That in fact
24 is a statistic that is not publically available and
25 that has never been said before. But under these

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 amendments that would be something that would be
3 reported. So if you're wondering about the value of
4 having school level reporting I think it's fairly
5 self-explanatory just from that piece of
6 information. Let me say quickly about Intro 65... The
7 school safety division is the fifth largest police
8 force in the nation. They out, outnumber guidance
9 counselors and other support services as has been
10 stated you know by 50 percent. They have an
11 enormous budget and a climate where budget dollars
12 are enormously scarce and they're working really
13 hard to improve their service to public schools
14 right now to change how they operate, to change how
15 they train. I believe that adding more to their
16 plate right now could set that work back. And so I
17 respectfully ask that we think about timing this if
18 we're going to do it in a way that makes sense with
19 some of the reforms that are happening and not in
20 way that actually makes them more complicated to
21 make happen. Right now the, finding the budget
22 money to do this, finding extra school safety
23 personnel to do this feels like an impossibility
24 and feels like it's going to strain some really
25 important work. I would also say presumably schools

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 that charge tuition do have a budget that includes
3 things like paying for their rent, paying for their
4 cafeteria, and paying for safety. And the fact as
5 was stated by the people who testified earlier that
6 none of them have budgeted adequately to get
7 security services that they're happy with I think
8 reflects the fact that they haven't prioritized
9 that because there's isn't really that much of a
10 need. School safety agents are not deterring
11 terrorist plots. Nobody thinks they're doing that.
12 They are hardworking men and women who we hope will
13 offer support to students not sort of intervene and
14 do some kind of diehard action movie thing. It's
15 just not the reality of what's happening. So I
16 would just urge some caution and some
17 thoughtfulness in proceeding and particularly with
18 some, some thought to the changes that are under,
19 currently underway and are not solid yet at all. So
20 sorry I went over but that was my 30 seconds.

21 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Well thank you
22 very... [laughter] have to laugh, thank you all. I
23 appreciate it. I guess I just have one general
24 question. Many of you are members and
25 representatives of your organizations on the school

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 leadership climate team. So I appreciate you know
3 the work that is being done. And I know a lot of it
4 we're still in the working stages. But I am very, I
5 guess I'm very optimistic because the mindset to me
6 has been changed right? So the administration is
7 now looking at school safety, at SSAs, and we're
8 looking at to me in a more holistic way right? And
9 so I appreciate a lot of the work that's been done.
10 So I guess I would say to you that are on this
11 leadership tea because you are the voices that can
12 really have an impact on the change that's
13 necessary do you think we're moving in the right
14 direction and what other suggestions would you
15 offer to the council that we should be mindful of
16 moving forward with the budget season, with a lot
17 of the work around restorative justice and B21 and
18 all the other measures like what more could we do,
19 be, what more could we be doing as a council to
20 make this, you know to expedite a little bit of
21 this if that makes sense. Anyone have any
22 suggestions? How many of you are on the leadership
23 team right now? AFC is on right? Nighclue
24 [phonetic] is on, okay yes, okay. Any... Okay. Any
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 suggestions or anything you think we should be
3 looking at?

4 MATTHEW GULDIN: ...have a suggestion. And
5 it, it's come up in the school climate working
6 committee at, at some point but I, we would like
7 money funded for pilot schools, 10 to 20 pilot
8 schools that will do restorative justice, solely
9 start making that transition be it the high need
10 schools or schools that have already started with
11 restorative justice practices, started on that
12 transition role from zero tolerance to restorative
13 care and community in their school. But that would,
14 that takes money because you'd have to hire a
15 restorative justice coordinator and that's a full
16 salary. And then you'd have to have money set aside
17 for trainings and all of that. So that is you know
18 150 thousand, 200 thousand per school. But you want
19 pilots to focus in on that where everyone is
20 committed. And we've written, in some of our
21 earlier work we've written an RFP for that and we
22 share that in conjunction with the DOE with Lois
23 Herrera and Company.

24 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. Anyone else?
25 Johanna?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 JOHANNA MILLER: I think to the extent
3 that we're talking about funding one of the things
4 that we've heard a lot from administrators is that
5 the grant will come for a year or two years and
6 then it dries up and they're on to the next
7 program. And so I think to the extent that the
8 council has control over funding making that
9 funding stream consistent and making it have some
10 evaluative component feels really important and
11 could be really impactful and convincing principals
12 to invest in something that is a lot of work as,
13 you know Matt said it really well it's harder work
14 but it's better work. And so I think knowing that
15 that funding stream is not going to dry up or there
16 will, it will continue to come and they'll continue
17 to get support feels really impactful.

18 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. And I
19 appreciate a lot of the work that has been done to
20 get us to this point. The student safety act passed
21 in 2011 was an incredible step of progress and now
22 with student safety act 2.0 I'm very excited but I
23 certainly encourage you all as you have been to
24 continue to work with us because 730 719 to me are
25 just steps in terms of more data, more reporting

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 because we really know what the numbers will tell
3 us but now we need to see it on paper. And some of
4 the challenges under federal reg and other things
5 that DOE and NYPD expressed. I mean I, I agree too.
6 I don't think there is anything wrong with more
7 reporting. I am a little disappointed at some of
8 the data that's not being recorded right now in
9 terms of the number of schools with metal detectors
10 and the criteria we use on implementation and
11 removal and the rotating ones that go from school
12 to school, very concerned about that. I know many
13 of us have talked about a plan of action to pilot a
14 phase out because many schools may not need them
15 right now. So I think a lot of that stuff we really
16 need to look at and it has not been looked at for
17 quite some time. So I know you all agree and I
18 thank you. And if you have questions... okay. I'll go
19 to my, my Co-Chair, Chair Deutsch:

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Thank you. This
21 question is for Johanna. So just two questions. One
22 is you mentioned that school safety agents on,
23 shouldn't take, shouldn't take die hard actions.
24 When we rely on the NYPD or the fire, firefighters
25 or EMS they are the professionals. We need to leave

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 you know the, any type of criminal activity or what
3 the jobs are for we need to leave it to the
4 professionals. So when you talk about school safety
5 agents we just had the administration here, they
6 did say that they have training, individuals in
7 schools don't have the type of training. So yes
8 they are hardworking people and they, you know we
9 need to leave it to the professionals. So yes if
10 school safety agents are protecting our schools we
11 need to rely on them to protect our schools. That's
12 number one. Number two is that you also mentioned
13 that there's not enough of school safety agents.
14 Well I didn't question the administration but just
15 like every agency you probably do have people in
16 school safety headquarters that are doing clerical
17 work, there are school safety agents. So if they
18 replace them and bring out the school safety agents
19 in the schools then you might have a substantial
20 amount of more, of additional school safety agents
21 to be at the schools and not sit in the office do
22 clerical work. So I just wanted to bring out those
23 two points.

24 JOHANNA MILLER: Can I, is that okay if
25 I respond?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Of course.

JOHANNA MILLER: Okay. I couldn't agree with you more. We, in emergency situations, school, school safety, anybody involved they're calling 9-1-1, they're calling the precinct. School safety agents are trained but only for 15 weeks. They don't go to the police academy. Their training has a lot, they are trained for two days on the school discipline code. They are trained for a couple days on restorative practices. Those things are really important for their responsibilities but it doesn't make them the same as a police officer. So I just want to be sure that like I, I don't disagree with you. We should love those emergency response to professionals who are trained. School safety can do some interventions but I don't want us to look to them to provide a service that they aren't ready to provide or, or equip to provide. And I think you said it yourself earlier you know you said you know before now we hadn't really thought too much about what the role is or what the purpose is of school safety. To me that, that's very loud and clear. I mean these, these school safety agents have been in schools for 17 years and nobody has thought about

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 their role, their purpose, their training until
3 now. And if that discussion has to happen because
4 private schools are, are interested in having
5 school safety agents that's great, we welcome that
6 discussion but that discussion needs to happen and
7 it can't just be an extension of a system that's
8 already not perfect to include other kids in that
9 system. This is a system that has backfired really
10 badly on teachers and on kids in really harmful
11 ways. And so expanding it before we work that out
12 just feels like the wrong thing for, for those
13 kids. On your other point I have to go on record to
14 say I did not say there are not enough school
15 safety agents. There are more than enough school
16 safety agents. There are so, there are, the school
17 safety division is the fifth largest police force
18 standing alone in the country. There are enough
19 school safety agents. How they're deployed, how
20 they're trained and what the school safety division
21 does with its budget is what I was raising a
22 question about and whether sort of adding requests
23 that they have to answer to that list is the right
24 way for them to sort out those issues. I have
25 questions about that. And I have questions about

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 whether that would mean that they sacrifice some of
3 the training and the additional supervision that we
4 want to see for the million kids who have already
5 been dealing with a somewhat broken school safety
6 system for 17 years.

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Well first of
8 all given what's, what's been going around the
9 world and especially also here in the United States
10 that is what's bringing up the issue of school
11 safety agents also for non-public schools. It's not
12 just something that came up. You had hundreds of
13 people that were killed in, in terrorist activity
14 and people that came into schools and just active
15 shooters. So that is what brought up speaking about
16 Intro 65. Secondly any agency you look at, I did
17 meet a traffic officer who wrote a, was a writing a
18 bogus summons. When I questioned him he said, he
19 just ignored me. But when a supervisor did come
20 down it was a bogus summons and they only have a
21 week training. That's what the guy told me. So yes
22 NYPD is being retrained in certain things. Everyone
23 needs more training. And yes school safety agents
24 maybe they need more training on protecting the
25 schools. So I agree with, with that that they do,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 that do need more training. But in addition I
3 think no, at the end of the day we have 1.1 million
4 public school children and 265 thousand non-public
5 school children and, and they all deserve the
6 protection. I'm there for everyone. I'm not saying
7 that we should take school safety agents and put
8 them for non-public schools and forget about the
9 public schools. I support teachers. I support
10 children. I support our school children. I go
11 around to all my schools in my district. My first
12 order of business before I got elected was visiting
13 all my public schools in my district. And I do
14 support all the school children in our city. So
15 thank you for that.

16 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you. Thank
17 you Chair Deutsch. And thank you to each of you for
18 being here. I appreciate your testimony. Thank you
19 for the work you do and I'm looking forward to
20 working with all of you. Thank you again. Next
21 we're going to have a panel of students and
22 advocates, yes. To all of my young people who have
23 been patiently waiting I appreciate you. Thank you
24 thank you thank you so much. I'm going to call all
25 of you up together, those that signed up. So I'm

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 going to start with Matthew Evans from Future of
3 Tomorrow and Urban Youth Collaborative Dignity in
4 All Schools, Carlos Suarrow [phonetic] from Sisters
5 and Brothers United Urban Youth Collaborative,
6 Perla Cristae Ramos [phonetic] Sisters and Brothers
7 United, Juditza Gigel [phonetic] from Urban Youth
8 Collaborative and Make the Road, Christine
9 Rodriguez from Make the Road and Urban Youth
10 Collaborative, Latrell [phonetic] Stone from Youth
11 Ministries for Peace and Justice Urban Youth
12 Collaborative, Onyx Walker from Future of Tomorrow
13 Urban Youth Collaborative, and Dianna Zaromeno
14 [phonetic] are you here? I'm going to call the
15 names one more time. I got Matthew Evans you're
16 here? Carlos Suarrow are you here? Perla? Okay.
17 Juditza? You here. Christine? Latrell? Onyx?
18 Dianna? Dianna's not here? Oh okay, Julian. Okay
19 great. Julian I just need you to fill out a slip
20 okay just for the record? Okay? Okay, oh great
21 thank you. Okay. And if any of you has any
22 testimony that you want me to read please make sure
23 we, we get it at the front. Okay. Okay. Okay so
24 we're going to start with, to my furthest, to my,
25 my right and your left my sister, we're going to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 start with you. You're first up. Let's go. And make
3 sure the red light is on so you can speak directly
4 into the microphone.

5 PERLA RAMOS: [speaking Spanish]

6 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: [speaking Spanish]

7 CARLOS SUARROW: Should I start?

8 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: You can go thank
9 you.

10 CARLOS SUARROW: Good afternoon. My name
11 is Carlos Suarrow. I'm a student at... High School in
12 the Bronx and a youth leader at Sisters and
13 Brothers United. ...National I've seen conflicts that
14 could be resolved with peer meditation and other
15 restorative practices. Instead, instead it's, it
16 ends up with students in handcuffs and... arrest... I
17 know that treating student this way doesn't solve
18 the, anything. ...students... getting the student
19 safety act amendment so that we get, so that we
20 could get information on handcuff and really have
21 an impact because he can show how many of us are
22 impacted by the use restraints and the need to
23 change this policy. This year we started the BC
24 leadership council coordinated by Sisters and
25 Brothers United. It brings together students from...

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 National, Bronx Academy for Software Engineering,
3 and High School for Technology and energy to
4 promote restorative justice to deal with conflict.
5 We're having inter, interschool circle to talk
6 about issues affecting students lives like
7 violence, bullying, and other topics. We're also
8 trying to strengthen the relationships between the
9 students and teachers... student and teacher say
10 circles. I think the... really have a positive impact
11 in a school culture and we need to put more
12 resources into this kinds of progress. But I am
13 concerned because we don't have resources this
14 kinds of problem but the city council's considering
15 a bill that will mean we have to put more money
16 into school police officers. The priority is to
17 create a safe and supportive environments for
18 students then we need to invest money in this
19 program and not more in, not more police in school.
20 Having more detailed data in the student safety act
21 can really help show that schools need resources
22 for positive support to deal with the conflicts
23 like restorative justice. When it is amendments to
24 the student safety act because need our schools to
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 be safe and comfortable in a comfortable place for
3 our students.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
5 much. Thank you Carlos.

6 LATRELL STONE: Hello. My name is
7 Latrell Stone. I am 17 years old. I attend East
8 Bronx Academy and I'm here today representing Youth
9 Ministries for Peace and Justice and the Urban
10 Youth Collaborative. For the past five years of my
11 school I seen many students get suspended
12 especially for minor B21 infractions. This puts
13 students on the path to the school to prison
14 pipeline because of the high rates of suspensions
15 and disengages so many students from learning. This
16 continues students on a destructive path where they
17 are pushed out of schools and are more likely to
18 end up in prisons. Just a few weeks ago one of my
19 fellow classmates was suspended for refusing his
20 hand his phone over to the teacher. The teacher
21 asked for the phone and the student refused to but
22 instead offered to put the phone back into his
23 pocket. The teacher however kept pressuring the
24 student to hand his phone over and after a few
25 minutes that student was suspended. So now many

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 students hand in their phones in fear of getting
3 suspended for something that is very little. There
4 have been many times I wanted to stand for my peers
5 and say this whole discipline system is wrong but I
6 fear... get suspended for defying authority. Please
7 to the city council the student safety act needs to
8 be passed because we need, we need to know how many
9 students are being suspended multiple times so we
10 can understand that it's not effective. East Bronx
11 Academy has realized that suspensions aren't
12 working and after having one of the highest
13 suspension rates in the city my school is working
14 on reducing suspensions. We won't know the impact
15 of the school to prison pipeline on black and
16 Latino students until we know all of the data. The
17 same students are being suspended over and over
18 again. We don't need more school police and metal
19 detectors. We need guidance counsellors, social
20 workers, and... and restorative justice. We spend 30,
21 300 million dollars on policing, on policing us and
22 only one million dollars on restorative justice.
23 That's 300 dollars per student for policy that, for
24 policies that end up pushing us out and... person,
25 and for policies that would keep us in school. We

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 should not, we should not be considering putting
3 even more money into policing. We could end this
4 pipeline now passing the student safety act can
5 change NYC public schools and give students like me
6 a better chance at getting into college and
7 succeeding in life.

8 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
9 much. Thank you Latrell. I hope it's okay I call
10 you guys by your first name. It's okay right? Okay.
11 Okay next.

12 CHRISTINE RODRIGUEZ: Good afternoon. My
13 name is Christine Rodriguez. I am 17 years old
14 senior at the Bushwick School for Social Justice.
15 I'm a youth leader at Make the Road New York as
16 well as the Urban Youth Collaborative. Today we
17 have come together to advocate for a stronger
18 student safety act so that we can have all the, all
19 the data we need to address school discipline
20 practices across the city, especially the
21 disparities. In 2011 we were able to pass the
22 student safety act which for the first time made
23 public what we already knew that too many black and
24 Latino youth were being pushed out of schools
25 through arrests and suspensions for minor behavior.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 The true impact of the school to prison pipeline on
3 black and Latino students won't be known until we
4 know all of the data. There are hundred, hundreds
5 of students that have been arrested in schools that
6 is not currently capturing the data. We also do not
7 have access to data showing when students are
8 suspended multiple times. And students as young as
9 five years, five years old are handcuffed inside of
10 schools. This amendment will change that. The, this
11 data is important in making policy changes. So we
12 deserve to see better and stronger data in order to
13 see better and stronger policies to support
14 students like eliminating suspension for... authority
15 which is the number one reason why students are
16 getting suspended. There are already schools that
17 are investing in restorative justice approaches
18 that are refusing to suspend students for minor
19 behavior like insubordination right here in New
20 York City. These schools have created a safe
21 environment while keeping students in school.
22 Speaking as a youth who has attended New York
23 Public, New York City public schools my whole life
24 I want to say how important it is to hear directly
25 from us, the students. We live the impact of these

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 policies every day. We know what works and what
3 doesn't. Now that I am part of the mayoral
4 leadership team on school climate and discipline I
5 am committed in bringing solutions we know work to
6 the table. Making this amendment to the safety,
7 the... sorry, to the student safety act is another
8 important step to the right direction. But we need
9 to push ourselves to do more to stop pushing
10 school, students out of school and investing in
11 their future. In New York City 300 million dollars
12 are being spent to police and criminalize students
13 while one million dollars is invested in
14 restorative justice. What does this tell us about
15 how the city decides to invest in students and our
16 education. More money is spent on police than
17 guidance counsellor and social worker especially in
18 schools like mines. Investing in restorative
19 justice is investing in our New York City scholars.
20 In order to take a big step in ending the school to
21 prison pipeline in our New York City schools we
22 must strengthen the student safety act and invest
23 in restorative justice today.

24 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you
25 Christine. Next.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 JERITZA GIGLUM: Good afternoon. My name
3 is Jeritza Giglum [phonetic]. I'm an organizer with
4 Make the Road New York and the Urban Youth
5 Collaborative as well as with Dignity in Schools
6 New York Chapter. I was 16 years old when we
7 started organizing to pass the student safety act.
8 That was eight years ago. As young black and Latino
9 and Latina students we were fighting for people to
10 recognize that we were pushed out of our school
11 through suspension summonses and arrests. In 2010
12 the city council passed the student safety act and
13 in 2011 it was signed into law. It was important
14 for us to get the data that proved that we were
15 being over policed, criminalized in our schools.
16 Getting the data was a stepping stone in the right
17 direction to create new policies in a system of
18 accountabilily [phonetic] accountability, excuse me
19 grounded in positive approaches to school
20 discipline. We acknowledge that the city is going
21 in the right direction and that over the last year
22 suspensions and arrests have gone down. As we
23 continue to move in the right direction it is
24 imperative that we pass the new amendments because
25 we're still seeing major disparities with black and

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 Latino students and students with disabilities
3 being impacted the most. We know that there are
4 still hundreds of students being arrested by police
5 called into school and we're not seeing the data.
6 We need to be able to see the full picture of
7 what's happening inside our schools to make the
8 changes happen. The amendments to the student
9 safety act will also provide us with presence and
10 use of metal detectors in all schools, the numbers
11 of students receiving multiple suspensions, the use
12 of restraints on students, and referrals to EMS
13 because of discipline or behavioral issues and
14 incidents involving police and students. While
15 getting access to the data we will still definitely
16 maintain student privacy. I've had to see and live
17 the impact of these policies for years. Two
18 different high schools, pushed out of my first high
19 school, and my second two years I spent my mornings
20 waiting in line to go through metal detectors with
21 safety agents yelling in my face. I have watched my
22 classmate get punched in the face after being
23 handcuffed while another agent held her in place.
24 After graduating I returned to my community school
25 to organize young people from my old high school. I

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 witnessed a young black man handcuffed with his
3 pants at his ankles, tears rolling down his face
4 after making him walk through the hallways with his
5 pants at his ankles while the cuffs left abrasions
6 on his arms. I can only imagine the humiliation
7 that he felt and all the adults that failed to see
8 him. It was even more upsetting to look into the
9 eyes of one of my youth leaders, an openly gay
10 afro-Latino young man with an IEP and have him tell
11 me the fear and the anger he felt at being
12 surrounded by safety agents and cops handcuffed and
13 forced into an ambulance to be sent to the hospital
14 for a psych eval after a verbal incident with
15 another student. As you can see after eight years
16 the stories haven't changed and the students who
17 have been failed by the structural racism of
18 policies and practices left in place haven't
19 changed either. The system is failing our black and
20 brown boy, young men and women. It is failing our
21 LGBTQ students and our students with special needs.
22 We can't continue to criminalize black and brown
23 behavior. We have to access this data to truly
24 understand the impact of the school to prison
25 pipeline on black and Latino and LGBTQ students in

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 our schools if we want to create real change in our
3 young peoples' lives and for New York City to lead
4 in way of transforming our education system to
5 support all students to succeed. And for the record
6 we are not in support of Intro 25 because why would
7 invest more public dollars for more cops in schools
8 for private institutions when we are trying to
9 shift an over police culture in our public schools.
10 Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you Jeritza.
12 I think it's Intro 65 just to make sure. Okay,
13 thank you.

14 ONYX WALKER: Hi guys, I mean good
15 evening. My name is Onyx Walker and I'm a youth
16 leader with Future of Tomorrow and the Urban Youth
17 Collaborative and I attend the Franklin K Lane
18 Campus High School. So I have a story for you guys.
19 I lost my metro card during the last week of summer
20 school. To get to school the next day I had to
21 borrow my friend's metro card who was finished with
22 his regents that same week. It was the last day of
23 summer school and they were not issuing new metro
24 cards. Now I needed one to get back to get myself
25 in my locker because I had gym for summer school.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 When I got to the train station after picking up my
3 things I went to school, had a fine time, and then
4 when I got back and I left the train station I was
5 stopped by a police officer. He asked me how did I
6 get onto the train. I told him I swiped the school
7 metro card. He then asked to see the metro card. He
8 asked why did I have this metro card, summer school
9 was over. And then I said today was actually the
10 last day of summer school and had to return to
11 retrieve my belongings. He then asked me for my
12 information and I gave him my school ID. The
13 officer then told me he could give me a ticket for
14 using someone else's metro card when I qualified
15 for a free metro card. So I gave him it and then he
16 returned my ID and rapped his hand signaling,
17 signaling me to leave. Since that was the last day
18 of summer school and many students get on the same
19 train daily I was curious as to why he actually
20 stopped me in the first place so I asked him why.
21 He responded what and I said again why did you stop
22 me. He then furiously told me now I deserve the
23 ticket. He gave me the ticket because I asked why I
24 was being stopped. So then I tried to get on the
25 next train and decided I'll leave it alone but he

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 and his partner blocked me from getting on the
3 train. They told me to leave the train station or I
4 would be arrested next. So I was kicked out of the
5 train station in front of a bunch of other students
6 and other kids. It was kind of embarrassing and
7 insulting all at the same time and was it reported
8 to the school or to the Department of Education
9 probably not. I just was trying to get home and why
10 are cops waiting for students outside of their
11 schools to hand out summons and tickets. Hundreds
12 of black and Latino students are constantly policed
13 in their communities on the way to and from school.
14 And sadly policed in the school as well. In no way
15 did I feel safe with this cop. And he only raised
16 more concern with me even feeling safe with cops
17 inside of my school as well. We currently only know
18 how many students are arrested and given summons by
19 student safety agents in schools. We need the data
20 on all the interactions with police and students in
21 schools. We know that black and Latino students are
22 primarily affected from the school to prison
23 pipeline but we will never know the full impact
24 without all of the data. Thank you.
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you. Thank
you Onyx. You're up Julian.

4

MATTHEW EVANS: Julian?

5

6

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: No you're not
Julian. I'm sorry.

7

MATTHEW EVANS: Matthew.

8

9

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: You're Matthew yeah
sorry. Julian's my dad's name. That's why. I'm
sorry.

10

11

MATTHEW EVANS: It's okay. Good evening.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

My name is Matthew Evans and I'm a youth leader
with Future of Tomorrow and a Urban Youth
Collaborative. I attend the Franklin K Lane Campus.
This June I will graduate and I'll be attending
SUNY Cobleskill College this fall. Every day for
the past four years I walked into my school and I
was greeted with a line. When I finally get into
the school doors I'm face to face with several
school safety agents and three metal detectors. I
rarely hear, heard a good morning. I was most
likely to hear remove your items in your pockets,
take off your boots and step aside to get wanded
down. Not, it was not always the best way to be
greeted in the morning. Especially when you're

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 being slowed down to get to your first period by
3 the line in the metal detectors. The metal
4 detectors cause flare ups, items being thrown away.
5 Mix ups of belongings and rushing hundreds of
6 students through the metal detectors. I got so
7 accustomed to taking my belt off during scanning I
8 always forgot to put it on before, after the end of
9 the day. School officers, school safety officers,
10 metal detectors, scanning machines. These things
11 are criminalizing our innocent youth. Why does
12 walking into school feel like walking into Ryker's
13 Island? When I, I wish to see the day when students
14 can enter my school with having, waiting in a line.
15 I look forward to the day when students walking
16 into my school seeing teachers, principals, and any
17 other staff person at school saying good morning
18 and wishing them a productive and successful day. I
19 want to see the day when student keep their belts
20 on, their boots on, any items in their pocket
21 before going to school. Hopefully the future
22 students of my high school can get a well-deserved
23 education without being criminalized. I came to
24 city hall last month for a hearing. Me and my
25 friends went through the metal detectors just like

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 all of you today. We started taking off our belts
3 and my friend Onyx removed his boots. The guard
4 said whoa keep your shoes on keep, and, and your
5 belts. We're not the TSA. They started to laugh. Of
6 course they meant no harm but little did they know
7 students at my school and other schools with
8 hundreds of students had to take off their belts
9 and boots daily to get our education. We are over
10 policed and criminalized in our schools. It doesn't
11 make me feel any safer in school. We don't need no
12 more school safety agents. We need guidance
13 counsellors. We need social workers, student
14 success centers, most importantly support. The
15 power is in your hands to either support the school
16 to prison pipeline or end the school to prison
17 pipeline. The choice is yours.

18 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
19 much. Julian you fooled me. You went over there
20 that's why I didn't see you. Thank you Matthew that
21 was a great way to close. Thank you. I appreciate
22 it. Julian you're up.

23 JULIAN: Sorry Ms. Gibson. Okay. I'm
24 here today representing Youth Ministries for Peace
25 and Justice and Urban Youth Collaborative. Today I

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 want to share with you all my experience at one of
3 the worst managed schools in the Bronx. Just being
4 in the hallways in, in my school often... incidents
5 with the SSA. I know we, we call them school safety
6 agents but sometimes fear is the first thing that
7 comes to mind when we see uniforms. On various
8 occasions officers have falsely accused myself and
9 students of trespassing even if you were simply
10 walking to the bathroom or using free periods to
11 tutoring and seeing guidance counsellors. I know
12 experience... not unique because 5,500 cops are in
13 New York City public schools handling students
14 compared to over 3,200 guidance counsellors
15 receiving only 1.2 million on restorative justice
16 yet 300 million is spent on policing. A majority of
17 us come from disadvantaged neighborhoods and
18 disabilities and identifying as LGBTQ as well. This
19 makes it even harder for us to not end up in the
20 school to prison pipeline and we stand in long
21 lines waiting to go through metal detectors to
22 enter school. We spend over 300 times more money
23 to... even though it's been proven by the school to
24 prison pipeline that suspensions over ineffective
25 because it does not go, get to the root of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 cause of the issue. This keeps students in a cycle
3 that shuts them down from learning making it more
4 likely for them to end, end up incarcerated and off
5 the path towards higher learning. The department of
6 education needs to fund more money or restorative
7 justice practices to schools to provide students
8 with emotional support essential guidance, college
9 readiness and alternatives from zero tolerance. I
10 demand that the DOE and the mayor take back the
11 power from the NYPD to turn out schools back into
12 safe havens and to provide support and education
13 that our students need for bright and successful
14 futures. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Questions? Thank
16 you guys. That was awesome. I appreciate it. Each
17 of you has shared a story or a personal experience
18 as students in our public school system. And now
19 being advocates many of you are on the school
20 leadership climate team which I'm very happy to
21 hear the work that we're doing yes will affect you
22 and it's important that your voice is heard. So I
23 appreciate that our students are at the table and
24 that you're really talking about a lot of the
25 issues. We don't all claim to know it all and I was

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 educated in public schools but that was just a
3 couple years ago, not that long ago, but things
4 have changed. And so we need your voices to be
5 heard and I continue to encourage you to talk to
6 your fellow students and others about the work
7 that's being done and how it's going to impact
8 their future. And I agree with everything that's
9 been said. I just have one question that I will
10 throw out at the panel whoever wants to catch it is
11 fine. With a lot of the restorative justice and
12 some of the initiatives and other work that is
13 being done do you think that we are moving in the
14 right direction? And also what would you suggest as
15 council members that represent, I represent many of
16 the schools in the Bronx, some that you described,
17 the East Bronx Academy on Southern Boulevard and
18 some of the other schools in district nine, so what
19 do you think we can do more to really make a
20 difference and make a dent in a lot of the
21 statistics and data that we know exist right now?
22 Does anyone want to answer?

23 JURITZA GIGEL: I would say yes we are
24 going in the right direction. We need to go further
25 in order to have even more of an impact in our

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 young peoples' lives ending racist policies that
3 clearly target black and brown young men and women
4 like B21 and getting rid of it and not doing
5 oversights of that policy would be great. And then
6 addressing the issue of handcuffing not just for 12
7 and under but also our older young people. They
8 should not, you know they are, have been a part of
9 this oppressive system and...

10 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Mm-hmm.

11 JURITZA GIGEL: ...handcuffing is clearly
12 not the way to deal with our young folks. We need
13 more resources and funding geared to restorative
14 justice and positive and alternatives to discipline
15 and positive approaches. So that's definitely
16 different ways that we can be going further.

17 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. How many of
18 you have been issued a summons before? Have any of
19 you been arrested? Suspended? Oh okay wow, okay,
20 okay. And I have some, hands in the audience too.
21 So again I know you speak from experience because
22 you know this is what we are trying to avoid right?
23 So a lot of the conversation I've said has to be a
24 refocus and a cultural shift and now more
25 preventative and not reactionary. So the current

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 climate we have now there about 5,000 school safety
3 agents and 17 hundred or so school buildings in our
4 city. So we know that there is a roll and there is
5 value in school safety agents right? We can all
6 agree on that. But how they do their work is the
7 question at hand. Can any of you give me an
8 experience or any infraction where a school safety
9 agent deescalated a situation that could have arose
10 to an arrest or suspension or the local precinct
11 being involved? Is there anything that you could
12 think of where an SSA has done a good job that we
13 could use as an example? Right. So I, I know we've
14 heard a lot of bad but I want to hear just maybe
15 one good story where an SSA did something good to
16 deescalate a situation. Matthew, yes?

17 MATTHEW EVANS: Well this is SSA Ms.
18 Washington in our... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Mm-hmm.

20 MATTHEW EVANS: I think it was about two
21 years ago when I was in 10th grade. I was in
22 geometry class right. You know I'm not a good math
23 whiz so I wasn't, I wasn't doing the work properly
24 so I asked a student and you know he's being a
25 know-it-all, he's like oh I'm better than you, I

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 know this and I know that. I'm like why you got to
3 act like that. So I guess the arguing escalated
4 into a fight and then Ms. Washington the SSA broke
5 it up. She sat us down and we, she just deescalated
6 the fight.

7 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

8 MATTHEW EVANS: She, she used kind words
9 and she spoke to us instead of handcuffing us.

10 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right. And that,
11 that was a good thing right?

12 MATTHEW EVANS: Yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Because that could
14 have escalated out of control.

15 MATTHEW EVANS: Yeah...

16 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

17 MATTHEW EVANS: ...could have got hurt.

18 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: So no and I'm, I'm,
19 the reason why I ask the question is because we
20 know a lot of the challenges we face. We know some
21 of the stories that reach the media but we know all
22 of the stories that don't make it to the paper. And
23 so what we're trying to do and in the leadership
24 team we're trying to look at ways in which the
25 training of these SSAs can be better where there can

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 be more resources where there are medical
3 professionals, school guidance counsellors, and
4 social workers, and psychiatrists that are on site
5 to deescalate these situations so we don't call the
6 precinct. We don't all 9-1-1 and we don't take that
7 student to the emergency room. I mean that to me
8 has to be an absolute last resort after we have
9 exhausted everything else right? So I appreciate
10 that. Does anyone have any other stories that they
11 want to share with the council? Okay. Okay well let
12 me... I'm going to turn this over to my chair Chair
13 Deutsch and we also have a question from oh Council
14 Member Greenfield.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you
16 very much Madam Chair. First of all I want to thank
17 all of you for coming out here. I want you to know
18 how important it is to get your perspective as
19 council members. As Chair Gibson mentioned she is
20 very young incidentally so she had just graduated
21 from school but we are not in school anymore so you
22 provide an invaluable perspective. I, I will just
23 tell you, and I think it's important to know is
24 that you know if you could see chairing this
25 hearing is Chair Gibson. She's the first African

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 American and first woman who chairs the public
3 safety committee in the history of New York City.
4 She's a strong fighter on your behalf. She cares
5 passionately about these issues and obviously it's
6 her legislation that we're considering today. So
7 you have many friends and allies. In case you could
8 not tell just so that you know I'm an Orthodox Jew,
9 you see the Yamaka on my head, the beard. I
10 represent Borough Park in Midwood. I do not
11 represent a lot of children who go to public
12 schools. Most of my children go to non-public
13 schools but hearing your stories today I want you
14 to know that I support you and I certainly
15 appreciate the points that you're making and I
16 think we do have to make improvements and reforms
17 and I think that the stories that you brought here
18 today are very powerful. So I want to thank you for
19 that and I just want you to know that we appreciate
20 it. Just want to clarify one misconception perhaps
21 and that is that Intro 65 which we discussed before
22 would actually not apply to public schools. We're
23 not trying to put more school safety agents in
24 public schools. It's really the non-public schools
25 currently that don't have any security. And that's

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 why they want it. So I just, once again I want to
3 thank you for your testimony. I want you to know
4 that we're hearing you loud and clear. And I'm
5 actually just curious about this because I'm,
6 really don't know. Is there any way for you to give
7 feedback on the school safety agent if you're
8 unhappy with your experience. And it seems like
9 some of you were unhappy and for the fellow in the
10 corner just so that you know I wasn't very good at
11 math and I did okay so don't worry about it. Is
12 there, is there any way you can give feedback on
13 school safety agents or does not, does that process
14 not exist?

15 JURITZA GIGEL: No there's no process of
16 accountability. There's no way to hold school
17 safety agents accountable right now unfortunately.
18 And there's no way to, for, in terms of like the
19 students actually giving feedback about SSAs in
20 schools no that's not happening.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Alright. So
22 I appreciate that. I would certainly love chair to
23 look at that process to see if there might be some
24 sort of way where we could actually allow students
25 to provide feedback if not parents to provide

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 feedback on interactions with the SSAs because it
3 sounds like from what you're saying there are some
4 good SSAs but there are a lot of them who are not
5 so good and certainly not being respectful. And
6 that's... that's certainly is unacceptable. And so I
7 want you to know that we're listening. We're here.
8 We appreciate your testimony. And you certainly
9 have our support especially under the great
10 leadership of Chair Vanessa Gibson. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you. Thank
12 you very much Council Member Greenfield. I
13 appreciate it. I appreciate your words. I didn't
14 tell him to say that, I promise. I just wanted to
15 make sure that I understood correctly. I think some
16 of you talked about metal detectors but a lot of
17 the challenges we have with them. So in the
18 leadership climate team we're looking at metal
19 detectors, we're asking for more reporting on where
20 they are, the permanent one, the temporary ones,
21 the ones that are roaming. Because we have metal
22 detectors that rotate throughout a district in, in
23 the city. So we're looking at more of that
24 information but for us as elected officials we have
25 so many schools that are collocated with multiple

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 schools, thousands of kids. And we have some
3 principals that think they're a safe haven. And we
4 have some principals that don't want them anymore.
5 So we are in a midst again. We're having a lot of
6 conversation about a possible pilot to phase some
7 out. But we have to look at the criteria by which
8 they were there in the first place. And that
9 assessment has not been done for quite some time.
10 So I just wanted to know if any of you had any
11 suggestions or any thoughts because many of you are
12 at schools where there are metal detectors right?
13 They were put there for a reason. Now in terms of
14 the crime in your schools have you seen witness
15 yourself crime going down because of the metal
16 detectors or have you seen crime getting even worse
17 or has it been flat with the metal detectors in
18 place. So you two at Franklin K Lane right, they
19 have metal detectors right? So have you seen crime
20 decrease or the same or you're not sure?

21 MATTHEW EVANS: There wasn't much crime
22 when I got there I guess but the metal detectors
23 certainly didn't like help bring it down. Like I
24 don't really think it had much of an effect. Most
25 of the effects that it had were kind of I should

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 say smaller such as... Like it wouldn't be smaller it
3 would how should say lead to something else rather
4 than the actual crime happening, it would lead to
5 like a suspension because you're late or something
6 like that.

7 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Mm-hmm. Okay. Did
8 you want to add?

9 ONYX WALKER: Those metal detectors at
10 our, that's in our school well I remember, I
11 remember they were, they are not being there at a
12 certain time but they've been there ever since back
13 back way back in the day when Franklin K Lane used
14 to be one school like I think like in the 80s or
15 70s. So they've been there forever and they need... I
16 guess there's hasn't been a lot of crime you know.
17 They're just standing there. They just, they just,
18 they just standing there they're, they're a
19 obstacle, they're making us late so... There's not
20 really crime in our school. There's just leading to
21 suspensions for no reason.

22 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. Did anyone
23 else want to add? Okay. Chair.

24 CO-CHAIRPERSON DEUTSCH: Yeah thank you
25 Chair. I just want to mention that you know in the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 council we're pushing for body cameras to NYPD
3 officers and I would consider also pushing since
4 school safety agents are, do make arrests, they do
5 give out, issue summonses so, and they also fall
6 under the NYPD so this is something that we need to
7 push for and you know legislatively this is
8 something I'm going to look into to make sure that
9 when we talk about the NYPD using body cameras
10 school safety agents should be in the same
11 category. So I want to thank you all for being
12 here.

13 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you again
14 everyone for being here. We appreciate your
15 presence. Thank you for your patience, your
16 testimony, and we look forward to working with you
17 and know that you have a voice. I as well as my
18 colleagues we are here to be your partners in this
19 effort and we want to make sure that as we look
20 into school climate, disciplinary changes,
21 restorative justice, additional reporting that we
22 make sure that our students are, voices are heard.
23 So we thank you so much for your patience and thank
24 you for being here this afternoon. Thank you. God
25 bless you. Thank you. Alright thank you guys. Thank

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 you again. Ready? Oh really? Okay. Our next panel
3 that we will call forward is Zakiyah Ansari from
4 the Alliance for Quality Education, Dasia Reed from
5 the Children's Defense fund, Nancy Ginsburg and
6 Cara Chambers from the Legal Aid Society, Vanessa
7 Ramos from the Committee for Hispanic Children and
8 Families, Karen Farces from the families and
9 criminal and family court involved students, Nick
10 Petra from Make the Road New York. Are you all
11 here? Okay let me just call the names again. Okay
12 so... Zakiyah here, Dasia... Dasia may have left okay,
13 Nancy Ginsburg and Cara, okay, Vanessa Ramos, oh
14 yeah I saw her earlier? Karen? Karen Farces, okay
15 she's not here. And Nick Petra? Nelson Marr? I saw
16 Nelson, he's gone too? Okay. Tara Foster from legal
17 services NYC? Amber Decker are you here? Because
18 they're different? Okay Tara Foster again. Sara
19 Fajardo from Coalition for Asian American Children
20 and Families? Okay. So what happens when they're
21 not here? Okay are you guys already. Is, Zakiyah
22 you may start us off. Thank you again for being
23 here. Thank you for being patient to everyone.

24 ZAKIYAH ANSARI: So good evening. My
25 name is Zakiyah Ansari. I'm the advocacy director

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 for the Alliance for Quality Education. Today we
3 are here to present our full support for bill,
4 Intro 719 requiring the Department of Education to
5 report ratios of school safety officers to guidance
6 counselors school by school. AQE also wants to
7 acknowledge support for Intro 730 which would add
8 another layer of reporting to the school safety
9 act. These two bills we believe move us in the
10 right direction. They move us towards a more
11 accountable and transparent department of
12 education. Thanks to a reporting bill passed
13 recently we are finally able to capture the lack of
14 services specifically the startling ratio of
15 guidance counsellors per student. This is in part
16 how we begin to hone in on disparity and address
17 achievement gaps. This new bill would focus on the
18 ratio of safety officers to guidance counsellors
19 giving us a more comprehensive understanding of
20 what the department is or should be prioritizing in
21 our communities. Similarly Intro 730 amends the
22 student safety act to strengthen data transparency
23 to ensure all stakeholders have the full picture of
24 the impact of our school discipline policies in our
25 communities. We know that so much police activity

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 in our school goes under reported and we need to
3 enact policies that dismantle the school to prison
4 pipeline. Lastly we are disheartened by the city
5 council's almost unanimous support of Intro 65.
6 This is not the direction we believe a progressive
7 city should be taking at the state level for the
8 second year we have had to... off a bill that
9 threatened to syphon hundreds of millions of public
10 dollars for private religious institutions through
11 a tax credit. It's shocking that New York City is
12 also moving in that direction. Increasingly there
13 seems to be these blurred lines of separation of
14 church and state. And under a progressive mayor our
15 progressive city council we must not allow public
16 dollars to continue to be diverted away from our
17 struggling public institutions like our schools,
18 libraries, and parks and into the hands of private
19 religious institutions and charter schools which
20 already receive free rent or New York City
21 taxpayers cover their rent. We must prioritize our
22 public education system that's strapped for
23 resources. Many schools are faced with one guidance
24 counsellor per 500 or more students and here we are
25 thinking about footing the bill for private

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 religious school safety agents. It was clear from
3 the state, statements from the students stories
4 that I've heard over and over again that we haven't
5 even gotten it right in public schools and the, the
6 need for more school safety agents is not the
7 issue. So what exactly is the financial cost for
8 the city? More importantly what will be the
9 psychological cost for children in those schools by
10 increasing the number of safety agents? Is there
11 some special force of officers being trained
12 different from the ones who are already in our
13 public schools or will we see an increase in
14 suspensions and summonses to students in those
15 schools as well? Will they be under the same
16 monitoring oversight? Are private and parochial
17 under the same discipline code? Like there's tons
18 of questions that need to be answered. And I think
19 before we pass this bill or resolution those
20 questions need to be addressed. I was just here
21 last month testifying in support of resolution by
22 the city council to support campaign for fiscal
23 equity and demand... the state fully funded. I have
24 to admit I was a bit shocked by the overwhelming
25 majority of city council members who signed off on

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 this resolution. And I'll close by saying this... As
3 I just was in Staten Island yesterday sending off
4 dozens of, of marchers to, who are marching to DC
5 for the march to justice planning to walk 250 miles
6 to DC to send a message and take demands to our
7 congress around police accountability there are
8 many of these city council members who were there
9 yesterday talking very passionately about the, that
10 they support this march and the need for police
11 accountability. And after listening to these
12 students. And after coming... three month budget
13 fight that hasn't, it's not over yet and knowing
14 that how scarce and precious our public dollars are
15 that this is something we really need to look at.
16 And it starts off as this is what everybody needs
17 and then next time what is, what else is it that
18 people will need for, from our public dollars. And
19 at the same time we are the first ones to want to
20 talk about how our public schools are failing. Our
21 public dollars are precious. We need to make sure
22 that we hold onto them. Absolutely every child
23 deserves to safe but our public dollars if I make a
24 choice as a parent of eight and a grandmother of
25 three to send my child to a public school or a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 private school then I am, I understand where I'm
3 sending them to. And my dollars pay for that and my
4 public dollars pay for other things. So I hope that
5 we will, we're in full support of the 719 ad 730
6 but not Intro 65. Our public dollars are really
7 precious to us.

8 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
9 much. Thank you.

10 NANCY GINSBURG: Good evening. My name
11 is Nancy Ginsburg. I'm testifying for the Legal Aid
12 Society. We have submitted lengthy written
13 testimony. I am not going to read it. I'd like to
14 respond to some of the things that were said today.
15 First I would like to raise something that the DOE
16 said which they have been saying since I've been
17 testifying on this issue since the earth cooled
18 that when a crime has been committed it's an NYPD
19 decision and that they have nothing to do with
20 that, that's simply not true. That is the position
21 that they have historically taken and they
22 certainly have taken that position since the NYPD
23 has entered the school. But there are many
24 instances where school personnel try to convince
25 school safety agents that they don't want action

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 taken against students and those policies could be
3 changed and the DOE from Tweed down could change
4 that policy and they have chosen not to and we
5 would urge the city council to urge the DOE
6 leadership to change that position. Another issue
7 that came up, there's been lots of discussion about
8 scanning. It's a big issue. It is a hot point, a
9 flash point for conflict in the schools. I would
10 submit that most schools don't even follow the
11 chancellor's regulation on scanning neither the
12 school personnel nor the SSAs follow that
13 regulation. I would urge the council to urge both
14 agencies to follow that regulation in addition to
15 all of the requests that were made today. As far as
16 the issue about holding agents accountable, this is
17 a very very big issue. I, we are very encouraged by
18 the current administration and by the current NYPD
19 and the current DOE and the changes that they have
20 made. They are moving a very large force of agents
21 trained in one way and pushing them to act in a
22 different way. But many of those agents because of
23 the years and years of training and instruction
24 they received in the past are having trouble making
25 this transition. And we would urge once again the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 council to hold the NYPD and school safety
3 accountable to hold their agents accountable. And
4 in the case that was addressed earlier today in
5 Park Slope Collegiate if, if agents saw that their
6 fellow agents were being held accountable for
7 behavior that was not acceptable that behavior
8 would decrease. But because we very rarely if ever
9 see accountability in those situations, and I do
10 think that those incidents, those agents are in the
11 minority and many many agents are trying to do
12 their best to work with these kids. But we do think
13 that there are a number of agents that pose a
14 consistent problem in a number of schools and
15 school safety and NYPD know who those agents are.
16 And because there is no accountability there's very
17 little movement to improve those practices.

18 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
19 much. Thank you.

20 CARA CHAMBERS: Good evening I'm Cara
21 Chambers, also from the Legal Aid Society. And I'm
22 just adding a bit to the comments that my colleague
23 Nancy has made. I wanted to speak briefly about
24 Intro 719 requiring the Department of Education to
25 report on the ratio of school safety officers to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 guidance counsellors. We strongly support that. And
3 we also recommend that the bill require reporting
4 on the ratio of school safety officers to school
5 social workers and guidance counsellors as well.
6 All of those professionals can play very pivotal
7 roles in crisis mediation and social emotional
8 skills building and that is especially important
9 for New York City's most vulnerable children which
10 are often the, the same children that the legal aid
11 society represents on a daily basis, children who
12 are homeless, who have suffered from abuse and
13 neglect, children who have become involved in the
14 juvenile delinquency system or the criminal justice
15 system. Many of these children suffer from post-
16 traumatic stress disorder, complex mental health
17 issues, other disabilities, and those disabilities
18 often manifest themselves in school based, in
19 behaviors in schools that are problematic and are
20 disruptive. But those behaviors require treatment
21 and support, not punishment, not arrest, not
22 summonses. Presently most schools have just one
23 guidance counsellor, one part time social worker
24 and one part time psychologist for hundreds of
25 students. And those staff members spend the vast

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 majority of their time conducting evaluations and
3 providing services to students who have
4 disabilities whose individualized education
5 programs require services under federal law. That
6 leaves them with little to no time to provide, to
7 provide services like crisis intervention,
8 therapeutic support, interventions to prevent
9 bullying in school, mental health referrals to the
10 community, conflict mediation, or conflict
11 resolution skill building. Consequently the number
12 of these staff members in schools has to increase
13 considerably in order for there to be significant
14 change. Requiring reporting on the ratio of, of
15 these DOE staff members to school safety agents
16 will shine a light on that and will force this city
17 to recognize and acknowledge the backwards emphasis
18 that is being placed on the type of services and
19 the type of supports that these children are, are
20 receiving. So we are strongly in support of Intro
21 719 and hope that it will help call greater
22 attention to the shortage of guidance counsellor,
23 social workers, and psychologists in our schools.
24 Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 TARA FOSTER: Did anyone have any
3 questions for my colleague?

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: I'm going to wait
5 until after the whole panel's done.

6 TARA FOSTER: Oh okay, great. So good
7 evening. My name is Tara Foster. I'm here for Legal
8 Services NYC. And my clients feel that Intro 719 is
9 also a very very important piece of legislation.
10 And segwaying from that because legal services has
11 been very active in supporting more supports and
12 services in schools we also agree that there should
13 be more data with regard to social workers. And,
14 then I'd like to just take that point to segway
15 into although there has been tremendous effort to
16 reduce suspensions in schools in recent years...
17 we're very grateful to the administration there has
18 concurrently been a rise over the last three years
19 in EMS calls. Therefore the data on EMS calls and
20 transports under the student safety act Intro 730
21 is vitally important in order to give us a full and
22 complete picture of discipline responses, other
23 disciplinary responses to disruptive students.
24 Finally I wanted to take that one step further and
25 suggest to the council that looking forward you

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 know when we look at Intro 719 it mentions all
3 public schools including charter schools. And I
4 think with regard to the student safety act looking
5 forward it's... to point out that many of the same
6 climate issues that the DOE has struggled with
7 concerning school discipline and expulsion have
8 really come to a head in the charter school
9 settings. We are seeing children who are receiving
10 multiple suspensions. We are seeing students who
11 are being expelled after multiple suspensions. We
12 are seeing public dollars placed into these schools
13 and yet children are not getting process. Nancy
14 alluded, my colleague Nancy Ginsburg alluded to
15 having been here for all time and it's true. People
16 who have been doing this work for as many years as
17 we have known how hard it was to fight to get the
18 rights that peoples' kids have and suspension
19 hearings and I think we need to start thinking
20 about that with regard to charter schools as well.
21 Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
23 much. Do you have any testimony? Okay.

24 AMBER DECKER: I just want to say that...
25 My name is Amber Decker.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Oh Amber?

3

AMBER DECKER: Yeah.

4

5

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Oh okay you are
here. Thank you. Okay.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

AMBER DECKER: And I, I, the whole time
I was here I didn't hear anything about school
safety plans and I think that they're very
important because the way that they are being
monitored is nonexistent according to the
Chancellor's regulation a for, 14 titled safety
plans it states that the office of school and youth
and development is available to provide ongoing
technical assistance. It also says that principals
have to submit this very document to the safety
administrator from the school office of youth and
development and yet there's no check on whether or
not these schools are following the school safety
plans that they go through great links to create.
And embedded in the school safety plans are
numerous data in terms of safety and arrival and
dismissal procedures and things of that nature. So
in reference to 730 and 719 I think that those are
both very important and, and should, I totally
agree with them. And in reference to 60, is it 65 I

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 think there's a confusion about SSA agents and
3 traffic officers. Where I think there's a lack of
4 traffic officers usually when kids are crossing and
5 going home by themselves but in terms of SSA agents
6 I don't see the need to have such a heavy presence
7 in school. So with that...

8 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very
9 much. Before I get to my question let me just
10 acknowledge that we have received testimony on the
11 record from the Brooklyn Defender services, the
12 Committee for Hispanic Children and Families as
13 well as the Children's Defense Fund to be put into
14 the record. So I think all of you are our last
15 panel for the evening. But it's been a very very
16 productive hearing to me. We've seen multitude of
17 different voices that are at the table. So I just
18 want to ask a question; legal services and legal
19 aid are you involved with the DOE and NYPD right
20 now as it relates to many of our students who are
21 court involved? And if, if not then what could we
22 as a council do in the school leadership climate
23 team to make you one of the partners if you're not
24 already?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1

2

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Well we are the
primary defender in New York City so we represent
most of the kids who are arrested in schools, many
of whom are given summonses. And many of the
children who are prosecuted through the family
courts on school offenses.

8

9

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: But my question is...
[cross-talk]

10

11

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: We are involved with
them on a...

12

13

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: ...do you get them
before they get to court?

14

15

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: We are both
involved in the Mayor's taskforce.

16

17

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

18

19

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Some of the
schools because of the work that we've been doing
in the field will call us ahead of time so...

20

21

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: That's what I'm
getting at. [cross-talk]

22

23

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: ...we do enter the
cases, some of the cases earlier than court filings
if we are notified about it.

24

25

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: But there's no
3 mechanism to make that happen.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right. So there's
5 no like formal agreement or like a memorandum of
6 understanding where you would automatically be like
7 the provider that would be readily available like
8 an on-call basis. So a lot of it is based on the
9 school leadership climate team conversation but
10 also your relationships with the principals and the
11 educators where if, you know and the principals
12 know their students, they know the students that
13 are involved in court. So if an incident should
14 arise they can call you or, and in the past they
15 have called you right?

16 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Correct.

17 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Does that make
18 sense? Okay.

19 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. So a lot of
21 the questions I've been asking has really been
22 about preventative measures right and not being
23 reactionary and looking at school safety agents in
24 a different light so to speak like changing that
25 cultural environment so it's not so prison like. I

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 mean I get it. I get the challenges that we face.
3 So my question to all of you is as advocates and
4 those you are in the field doing this incredible
5 work, do you like the direction that we are going
6 in and what would you suggest to the council as
7 additional things that we could look at as we're
8 having budget conversations now that would be
9 helpful in this restorative justice and school
10 discipline reform that we know is necessary?

11 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: The schools
12 consistently say that they do not have the
13 resources to do the kind of work that they would
14 like to do. They are so overwhelmed with testing
15 and all the other things that they're required to
16 do that to, to implement a real restorative justice
17 plan or practice in the school takes resources.
18 It's not just training. They need people in the
19 schools to implement that kind of work. So I think
20 many of the school safety coalition there have been
21 many suggestions that there should be coordinators
22 available to help facilitate that work on the
23 ground. It needs to be coordinated among the
24 schools, within the schools. There needs to be
25 additional training and support because sometimes

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 that work is difficult. There also needs to be...
3 school wide training across staff of teachers to
4 improve classroom management because we've heard
5 many stories about teachers calling in school
6 safety and school safety being asked to participate
7 in classroom management when that is not why school
8 safety is placed in the schools. And that is a very
9 big issue in many many schools. And that's a
10 conversation that I think is starting to be had but
11 really needs to be had, held publically about how
12 the, the, that division of labor should be, should
13 be approached and how schools can be supported so
14 that teachers get additional classroom management
15 skills and that school safety is actually allowed
16 to withdraw from a, from a call they're really not
17 supposed to insert themselves.

18 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay. You wanted to
19 add?

20 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: The DOE does this
21 successfully in other programs. They do this in the
22 nest program almost to the detriment of many of the
23 other New York City public school kids. But they
24 have very well oiled machines with many many
25 experts. And there's ownership in the program and

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 there's training from the top down and there's
3 coordinators as Nancy indicated that's so crucial.
4 And I do know that when we were litigating the TH
5 lawsuit which you know helped to provide some of
6 that TCI training that will be going forward with
7 the city and some of the top schools with high
8 rates of... we were really hoping that there could be
9 more of that coordination. So perhaps... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

11 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: ...that could be
12 something... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

14 ZAKIYAH ANSARI: I just wanted to say
15 real quick I think as simple as it is it really is
16 about vision too. And a public vision coming from
17 the top down.

18 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Vision 2.0.

19 ZAKIYAH ANSARI: So... absolutely. I think
20 if you city council is here talking about it we
21 know we have advocates and folks who have been
22 talking about it for a number of years that the
23 vision has to come from the top. And imagine the
24 mayor really putting out a vision and saying we
25 will not accept the things that we are hearing now

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 and change is going to happen. City council is
3 saying it. The parents and students are saying it.
4 And we're beginning to implement a lot of the
5 suggestions that were here. I think the other piece
6 is that we have to really engage young people in
7 these conversations to the point where not that
8 we're just like oh what do you think, like
9 implement those things, and that they be an
10 integral part of saying are they working. Because
11 often what happens is we implement things and then
12 the folks who they're supposed to impact we don't
13 even ask them if it's working which is why we're in
14 the issue, the issue we're in right now in
15 education as a whole because those impacted bodies
16 policies are never asked are they working. And then
17 the other piece I just want to say real quick is I
18 think what's missing here and I appreciate those
19 who are still here with us is that there needs to
20 be, and it's not the first time I am or others have
21 suggested a panel like this that happens before the
22 folks who are quote unquote the experts speak so
23 that it informs some of the questions that you and
24 other council members that sit here can ask.
25 Because now if it was two parents, two students,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 two advocates who've been doing this for a long
3 time and they sharing their stories like now you
4 can bring up DOE and NYPD and everybody else and
5 say what about this. And put them on the spot to
6 really after, answer these questions. And I think
7 it's not just education it cross, it's cross the
8 board. They need to hear these stories because then
9 they can hide away and shy away from addressing
10 them but we know that you're the advocates and
11 you're advocates and you're going to ask them and
12 press them on those questions. But imagine how... it
13 is for them to have to sit here and listen to young
14 people, parents, advocates who are doing this day
15 in and day out call them on their stuff that they
16 have not been doing. And so I sat here and heard
17 them state all the things they were doing and I
18 just heard a bunch of people here and a panel of
19 amazing young people share the things they're not
20 doing. And those are the things they never hear or
21 have to atone for or listen to I think.

22 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Awesome. Yes. And
23 you're a parent too. Thank you.

24 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Yeah. I just want
25 to add that my son's been to several schools. And

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 according to the chancellor's regs every
3 principal's responsible for having an annual school
4 safety meeting. I have never been invited to such a
5 meeting. And I ask you as parents of children if
6 you have children in public schools when was the
7 last time your principal invited you to an annual
8 town hall school safety meeting where the bureau of
9 safety...

10 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Yeah the bureau of
11 safety of... [cross-talk]

12 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: ...is supposed to
13 present. The traffic individual is supposed to be
14 present. The lockdown procedures and protocols are
15 supposed to be clearly stated to the parents and
16 parents have no idea what's going on because
17 they're never, not all of them are on the Committee
18 of Safety that's in the school.

19 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Okay.

20 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: So... I, I think
21 that making sure that that five year chancellor's
22 reg that was created five years ago is actually
23 being done at each school is you know something
24 that they failed to make sure the central office
25 fails to make sure that each principal is having

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 this annual school safety meeting. They are not
3 having them.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right. Okay. Thank
5 you. I appreciate it. A wealth of knowledge and
6 experience from all of you. And certainly as a
7 council we are trying to be a little bit more
8 creative in how we hold hearings. The, you know the
9 alternate of the panels, some of us are taking our
10 hearings out into the city outside of city hall. So
11 again I mean a lot of that is in conversation in
12 terms of how we reach every New Yorker whether it's
13 through public hearings, our website, and some of
14 the other things that we just launch with council
15 2.0. So I appreciate it and I, I really thank you.
16 I do think that we are going in the right direction
17 and that's why we're asking for more of this data
18 and reporting because we know what the numbers are.
19 I will say that in Intro 730 there is a component
20 that will focus on the process by which a student
21 can file a complaint against an SSA because right
22 now we really don't know what the process is and
23 many students wouldn't file a complaint against an
24 SSA that they have to see every day when they go to
25 school. So you know a lot of it we're, we're just

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 trying to talk and, and look at how we can get more
3 of the data. But it has been raised before.
4 Students have come to us and it's something that we
5 are taking very seriously. So I appreciate the work
6 you guys do and I thank you very much for being
7 here this evening. Thank you again. Yes. And I also
8 just want for the record to state that we have
9 testimony from a member of Make the Road New York
10 Dianna Zuriminna [sp?] who was not here but we do
11 have her testimony. And as this hearing on the
12 Committee of Public Safety, Education, and the
13 Subcommittee on Non-Public Schools comes to an end
14 today's hearing on exploring school climate and
15 discipline codes... a very extensive conversation
16 around school discipline, around reforming our
17 restorative practices and our public schools. We
18 also looked at three pieces of legislation; Intro
19 65, 719, and 730. And I appreciate everyone's
20 presence here. I want to thank my co-chairs; Co-
21 Chair Danny Dromm and Co-Chair Chaim Deutsch who's
22 still here with us and thank all of the prime
23 sponsors of the legislation who are also here an
24 all of my colleagues. And as I close I just always
25 want to recognize the incredible staff. We are a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION AND SUBCOMMITTEE ON NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS

1
2 part of a team and if not for their work the long
3 hours that we put in to really make these hearings
4 happen we would not be here. So I want to first
5 recognize all the sergeants at arms who have been
6 here. Thank you so much. As Chair of Public Safety
7 you know that they are extremely important to my
8 hearings each and every month but also all the
9 staff starting with Asia Shamburg, Deepak Embeckar
10 [phonetic], Beth Gollub, Laurie Wen, Rob Collantra,
11 Ryan Crow, Ellen Aang, Regina Pereda-Ryan, Faisa
12 Ali, Pascal Brenard, Theodore Moore, and in my
13 office Dana Wax. I want to thank everyone for this
14 wonderful hearing and we look forward to working
15 with each and every one of you. And I want to
16 thank, yes I want to thank Jan Atwell as well.
17 Thank you. Yes and Joan. Thank you so much Joan as
18 you leave. Thank you Joan. We love you. We
19 appreciate you. And again this hearing is
20 officially adjourned.

21 [gavel]

22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date _____ April 26, 2015_____