

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND CONCESSIONS

----- X

April 13, 2015
Start: 01:36 p.m.
Recess: 01:58 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E:
INEZ E. DICKENS
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
ANDREW COHEN
DARLENE MEALY
MARK TREYGER
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Artie Pearson
Director of Land Use
HPD

Corinne Maulsby
HPD

Malcom Punter
Vice President
Congregations for Community Improvement

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND CONCESSIONS 3

2 [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Good afternoon.

4 I'm Council Member Inez E. Dickens, Chair of the
5 Subcommittee on Planning, Dispositions, and
6 Concessions. I would like to welcome everyone to
7 today's hearing. And I want to give the gold star
8 to Council Member Cohen who was here first. And I
9 want to apologize to, to those that are here to
10 testify and to the members of the public for the
11 lateness of getting started. I want to thank and
12 acknowledge my Sergeant at Arms Ramone Rodriguez,
13 my Land Use Director Raoul Mon, Deputy Director Amy
14 Leviton, and my attorneys Ann McCoyhee and Dillon
15 Casey. I want to acknowledge my esteemed colleagues
16 who are members of the Planning Committee; Council
17 Member Andrew Cohen gold star, Council Member
18 Darlene Mealy, and Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez
19 who did not get the gold star no. We, we have two
20 items on our calendar today that we will be hearing
21 and voting on. I am opening up the, the hearing for
22 Land Use Item number 203 the fifth avenue committee
23 renaissance for properties located in Council
24 Members Levin and Lander in Brooklyn. This
25 application is submitted by HPD for the termination

2 of existing damp benefits and 420C tax benefits and
3 there approval of an Article 11 tax exemption that
4 will be covering the same area with a new
5 regulatory agreement of 32 years. Gee can everybody
6 get that? 32 years? I'll stand for the 32. You
7 ready to testify. Please give your name and where
8 you're from.

9 Afternoon Chair Dickens and members of
10 the subcommittee. The mic is on. Good. Okay.
11 Afternoon Chair Dickens and members of the
12 subcommittee. I'm Artie Pearson Director of Land
13 Use within HPD's Office of Governmental Relations
14 and Regulatory Compliance. For today's agenda I am
15 joined by Corinne Maulsby Deputy Director of the
16 LIHTC Preservation 15 year program within HPD's
17 division of preservation finance. Land Use number
18 203 consists of proposed amendments to UDAP's [sp?]
19 previously approved under several of HPD's
20 rehabilitation programs from the 1990s, through the
21 consolidation of six entities, the exemption area
22 is comprised of 21 multiple dwellings and will be
23 known as the 5th Avenue Committee Renaissance
24 Project. Together the buildings will provide a
25 total of 146 rental units for low income families.

2 The exemption area is located at Block 387 Lot 41,
3 Block 388 Lot 9, Block 389, I'm sorry, 388 Lot 9,
4 Block 389 12, 13, and 22, Block 395 Lot 48, Block
5 399 Lot 1, Block 411 Lot 11, Block 413 Lot 36,
6 Block 468 Lot 2, Block 3, I'm sorry, 934 Lot 41,
7 Block 947 Lots 8 and 11, Block 949 Lot 46, Block
8 952 Lot 15 and 67, Block 955 Lots 39 and 52, Block
9 963 Lot 1, Block 992 Lot 32, and Block 1098 Lot 52.

10 There is a mixture of rental unit types including
11 studios 1, 2, 3, and 4 bedroom apartments plus 2
12 units for superintendents. Additionally there are
13 ten occupied commercial spaces within the
14 portfolio. The sponsor will enter into a new
15 regulatory agreement establishing certain controls
16 upon the operation of the exemption area including
17 income and rental targets between 50 and 80 percent
18 of AMI and 10 units at 165 percent AMI. The average
19 rents will vary between \$700 for a studio and \$915
20 for a four bedroom apartment. Currently the sponsor
21 is seeking an Article 11 tax exemption that will
22 coincide with the new regulatory agreement for a
23 term of 32 years that will allow for the continued
24 affordability of these rental units and council
25 members Levin and Lander support the project.

2 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Would you identify
3 yourself please.

4 CORINNE MAULSBY: Corinne Maulsby, thank
5 you. The Director of the LIHTC, Deputy Director of
6 the LIHTC.. [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Would you speak a
8 little louder please?

9 CORINNE MAULSBY: Sure. I'm Corinne
10 Maulsby, the Deputy Director of the LIHTC
11 Preservation Program at HPD.

12 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Do you have
13 anything you want to add to the testimony?

14 CORINNE MAULSBY: No, I'm here to
15 address any questions the members may have.

16 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Alright now there,
17 the, is it my understanding that the damp benefits
18 will expire and Article 11 will take its place?

19 ARTIE PEARSON: That is correct. I
20 believe that they are being terminated or have they
21 already expired?

22 CORINNE MAULSBY: So you can't have both
23 at the same time so the Article 11 will as you said
24 replace the damp benefit.

2 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Now what is the
3 difference between the damp benefits which is also
4 a tax benefit and the Article 11 and will that add
5 affordability to the units? That's one. How will
6 that impact upon the rents for the residents, two.
7 Three, are there any commercial overlays?

8 ARTIE PEARSON: I believe the damp
9 benefits and the Article 11 are the same because
10 damp projects did receive Article 11 tax
11 exemptions. I believe Corinne can address the
12 balance of your questions.

13 CORINNE MAULSBY: Mm-hmm. So there are
14 ten commercial spaces within the project.

15 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Can you tell me
16 what those 10 are.

17 CORINNE MAULSBY: Sure. It's a variety
18 of different businesses, several retail stores, a
19 couple restaurants, coffee shop, daycare, and a
20 non-profit organization.

21 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: And what, what are
22 their rents. Are their rents below market for that
23 area or at market or above market.

24 CORINNE MAULSBY: It's a combination
25 again. Most are below market.

2 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Are these tax
3 benefits in any way going to impact upon that.

4 CORINNE MAULSBY: The commercial spaces
5 are excluded from the tax benefit.

6 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: And there will be
7 no displacement of the resident at all?

8 CORINNE MAULSBY: There is no
9 displacement.

10 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Are, is any rehab
11 work planned in the near future for this
12 development?

13 CORINNE MAULSBY: There is some
14 rehabilitation that will occur in the building.

15 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Is there mortgage,
16 additional mortgage going to be put on? Is the
17 money going to be put in by HPD? Is it going to be
18 a combination?

19 ARTIE PEARSON: I believe Corinne you
20 can answer those questions.

21 CORINNE MAULSBY: Sure. It will be a
22 variety of different sources from the city will be
23 using HPD a new subsidy and will also be using both
24 borough president and city council Reso A funds.

2 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: What is the
3 program within HPD that will be utilized for the
4 funds?

5 CORINNE MAULSBY: It's a LIHTC
6 preservation program.

7 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: It's a what?

8 CORINNE MAULSBY: LIHTC preservation
9 program.

10 ARTIE PEARSON: That's the Low Income
11 Housing Tax and Credits.

12 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: And that's only
13 for low income?

14 CORINNE MAULSBY: So this was a
15 combination of two low income housing tax credit
16 properties and then we're combining four non tax
17 credit properties and we're wrapping those into an
18 affordable structure. Several of the units are
19 currently unregulated so we're capturing a lot of
20 affordability here particularly for very low income
21 at the 50 percent AMI level.

22 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Uh Corinne are
23 there any vacancies in the residential and are
24 there any vacancies in the commercial?

2 CORINNE MAULSBY: There are a few
3 vacancies on the residential side and on the
4 commercial side everything's occupied.

5 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Did you say about
6 the... I'm sorry.

7 CORINNE MAULSBY: So there's just a few
8 vacancies on the residential... [cross-talk] so it
9 kind of, it, it fluctuates because they're in the
10 process of leasing up because it's not occupied
11 property. But right now I know of like two that
12 they're in the process of leasing up.

13 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: And what about on
14 the commercial? Are there any vacancies in the
15 commercial?

16 CORINNE MAULSBY: No.

17 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Do my colleagues
18 have any questions? I'm the only one that always
19 has questions? Alright thank you for your
20 testimony. And where, I'm going to now close the
21 public portion of the hearing on this land use item
22 203 and I'm going to open the, now the public
23 hearing on land use item 204 the Northern Manhattan
24 Equities Phase 2 for the termination of an existing
25 420C tax exemption that will cover the same area

2 with a new regulatory agreement. It is my pleasure
3 to provide continued support to the Northern
4 Manhattan Equities Phase 2 project located in my
5 village. But now I will hear testimony from HPD.
6 Again Identify yourselves.

7 ARTIE PEARSON: Artie Pearson, Director
8 of Land Use at HPD's Office of Governmental Affairs
9 and Regulatory Agreement and Compliance. And again
10 I'm joined by Corinne Maulsby. Our Land Use number
11 204 consists of the proposed amendments to UDAPs
12 [sp?] previously approved under HPD's
13 rehabilitation programs from the 1990s. Through the
14 consolidation of three entities the exemption area
15 is comprised of nine multiple dwellings and will be
16 known as Northern Manhattan Equities Phase 2.
17 Together the buildings will provide a total of 207
18 units for low income families. The exemption area
19 is located at Block 1823 Lot 18, Block 2025 Lots
20 44, 46, 47, and 49, and Block 2031 Lots 5, 7, 10,
21 and 12. They're a mixture of rental unit types
22 including 1, 2, and 3 bedroom apartments plus two
23 units for superintendents. The sponsor will enter
24 into a new regulatory agreement establishing
25 controls upon the operation of the exemption area

2 including income and rental targets between 50 and
3 100 percent of AMI. The average rents will vary
4 between \$682 for a one bedroom apartment and \$888
5 for a three bedroom apartment. Currently the
6 sponsor is seeking an Article 11 tax exemption that
7 will coincide with the new regulatory agreement for
8 a term of 31 and a half years to allow for the
9 continued affordability of these rental units and
10 the chair has indicated that she supports this
11 project.

12 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you Artie.

13 I'm going to ask my colleagues to please hold your
14 questions as we have a, a member of the public that
15 is here to give testimony; Malcom Punter. Would you
16 please come up? Identify yourself and where you're
17 from.

18 MALCOM PUNTER: Good, good morning Madam
19 Chair and committee members. My name is Malcom
20 Punter. I am the Executive Vice President of Harlem
21 Congregations for Community Improvement, the
22 organization that currently owns the, the three
23 projects that are subject of the hearing. In that
24 capacity as executive vice president I'm
25 responsible for the strategic development of low

1 income housing. For the organization we, we
2 currently are managing over 2,000 units of
3 affordable housing and it's been our continuous
4 mission to maintain these units as affordable and
5 any project that we enter into, any partners that
6 we allow to work with us must buy into that
7 philosophy and mission. And I'm happy to say that
8 the Northern Manhattan Equity's group which is a
9 partnership between HCCI and exact capital have
10 bought into that and we will continue to maintain
11 our buildings, the buildings that house our family
12 members and our friends in Harlem Community at the
13 level that they can afford.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: At this
16 development site is, is there plan to be any type
17 of rehab to the units at all? And is there a
18 commercial overlay?

19 MALCOM PUNTER: Yes we will do both
20 rehab as well as maintain the commercial units
21 there.

22 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Is it moderate?
23 [cross-talk] Moderate rehab?

24 MALCOM PUNTER: It's going to be a, it's
25 going to be a moderate, yes it's going to be a

2 moderate rehab. None of the residents will be
3 required to vacate their units during the rehab. In
4 the first phase we've successfully rehabbed the,
5 probably 60 percent of the units that the, the 399
6 units and we can, will do the same with the 207
7 units. The residents are pleased that after 18 or
8 20 years they finally are getting a refurbishing of
9 the building on a capital scale. We will do this as
10 well with the 207 units.

11 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: HPD, Artie are you
12 putting in any funding for this rehab in order to
13 maintain the affordability of the units?

14 ARTIE PEARSON: I'm going to let Corinne
15 answer that question.

16 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: And would you
17 speak a little louder? My colleagues have indicated
18 they cannot hear you. Would you put it closer to
19 you? Thank you.

20 CORINNE MAULBY: Okay. Yes we'll be
21 putting capital subsidy into this project as well.
22 We'll be putting roughly 4.2 million toward the
23 project.

2 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Now would you
3 please Mr. Punter describe what moderate rehab
4 means for the units?

5 MALCOM PUNTER: So essentially we would
6 do new kitchens and baths for all of the units. We
7 will also conduct boiler replacement in each
8 building, window repair as necessary. We will, we
9 will replace the roofs on the buildings with new
10 systems and cap sheets. The facades we will make
11 sure that each building is in compliance with Local
12 Law 11 of 1998 to make sure that the facades are
13 sound and there's no water penetration, elevator
14 repair when necessary, we also will install new
15 video concierge systems that allow residents to see
16 who are entering the building. We believe that will
17 increase the safety of each building. We also are
18 working to make sure that each building the
19 interiors are painted. And that's essentially the
20 moderate rehab that we've described in this
21 project.

22 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Are there any
23 violations on these buildings? One. Are, are you up
24 to date in your Local Law 11 filings?

2 MALCOM PUNTER: We are for, for these
3 buildings that's correct.

4 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Are there any
5 violations?

6 MALCOM PUNTER: The violations are being
7 reviewed and eliminated in the course of the
8 project. We are maintaining compliance with the
9 violations as, as required.

10 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Now what about the
11 HVAC system and the roof?

12 MALCOM PUNTER: So each roof as
13 necessary will be replaced. And there's no central
14 air systems in the buildings but any duct work, any
15 duct cleaning will, will also be a part of the
16 work.

17 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: What type of
18 heating?

19 MALCOM PUNTER: The heating is...

20 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Hot water?

21 MALCOM PUNTER: I think it's Hydro. So
22 those units will, the, the heating system in terms
23 of the pipes in the building will not be replaced
24 as they don't need to be replaced but new boilers

will be installed with new energy efficient boilers.

CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Okay thank you.

Thank you so much for your testimony Mr. Punter and for HPD. And I would like, do any of my colleagues have questions. I'd like to make a statement in support. Over the last several years Northern Manhattan has experienced an enormous decline in affordable housing while seeing an increase in luxury housing. We need to protect our low income families and individuals who are in jeopardy of being pushed out of the community by the rising cost as well as middle income families. Extending the Article 11 tax credit period for the building will help to reduce the financial stress for its tax liability so that they are able to make that very much needed repairs. It is of utmost importance that we continue to preserve an increase of affordable housing stock for those families who are in constant fear of facing the homelessness. A family should never have to choose between paying rent, buying food, or other necessities. So Mr. Punter I want to commend you and Northern Manhattan Equities for continuing the fight in, in a very

2 hard economic times for affordable housing. Please
3 note that, that phase 2 contains nine multiple
4 dwellings that are a total of 207 units is that
5 correct?

6 ARTIE PEARSON: That's correct.

7 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: And 205 are
8 occupied?

9 MALCOM PUNTER: Yes that's correct.

10 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: That's very good.
11 And two units vacant. What size are the two units?
12 Do you know?

13 MALCOM PUNTER: I don't know.

14 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Alright. Eight
15 units, eight units are at 50 percent and 200 units
16 at 60 percent AMI, is that correct?

17 MALCOM PUNTER: Eight...

18 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: HPD is that
19 correct?

20 CORINNE MAULSBY: Do you have that
21 information?

22 MALCOM PUNTER: I do.

23 CORINNE MAULSBY: Okay.

24 MALCOM PUNTER: Would you like to
25 answer...

2 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Anybody, is that
3 correct?

4 CORINNE MAULSBY: Can you repeat the
5 question?

6 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: I was asking about
7 the AMIs, the percentage of units at the two AMIs.

8 CORINNE MAULSBY: At, at the 50 percent..
9 [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: One being 50
11 percent and one being 60 percent, is that correct?
12 None is, any, there's no AMI any higher than 60
13 percent, is that correct?

14 CORINNE MAULSBY: There are units at 100
15 percent AMI currently.

16 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: At what?

17 CORINNE MAULSBY: 100 percent AMI.

18 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Oh well I didn't
19 know that. Let's hear about that one. That's not so
20 affordable.

21 CORINNE MAULSBY: So those are the,
22 currently in place at, there's 32 units currently
23 at 100 percent AMI but there's also 41 units that
24 are unregulated that through this benefit will be
25 putting under a regulatory restriction.

2 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: So how many units
3 then will be at, are any going to be at market?

4 CORINNE MAULSBY: No.

5 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Alright so then
6 they'll be at a 100, the highest will be 100
7 percent?

8 CORINNE MAULSBY: That's correct.

9 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: So how, what is
10 the percentage of units that will be at 100 percent
11 AMI?

12 CORINNE MAULSBY: So 15 percent.

13 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: 15 percent?

14 CORINNE MAULSBY: That's correct.

15 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: And how many at 60
16 percent?

17 CORINNE MAULSBY: That will be..

18 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Percentage.

19 CORINNE MAULSBY: so 61 percent will be
20 at 60 percent.

21 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: And 50? Are there
22 any at 50 percent.

23 CORINNE MAULSBY: ...50 percent AMI would
24 be four percent. And then there's also going to be

2 an 80 percent AMI band that'll account for 20
3 percent.

4 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: An 80 percent?

5 CORINNE MAULSBY: That's correct.

6 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: A hundred makes me
7 nervous. 80 percent I can handle but 100 percent
8 makes me nervous. Artie?

9 ARTIE PEARSON: Understood.

10 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: I didn't hear you,
11 I'm sorry.

12 ARTIE PEARSON: Understood.

13 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: You are requesting
14 a full Article 11 tax benefit and terminating
15 existing J51, is that correct? And 420C real estate
16 tax? Is that correct?

17 ARTIE PEARSON: That's correct.

18 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Is J51 still in
19 existence? Or is it just being phased out?

20 ARTIE PEARSON: I, actually I'm not
21 clear about that. I'd have to get back to you..

22 [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Can you get back
24 to me with that?

25 ARTIE PEARSON: Absolutely.

2 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: This will be a new
3 regulatory agreement with HPD?

4 CORINNE MAULSBY: That's correct.

5 ARTIE PEARSON: That's correct.

6 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: I'm closing the
7 public hear, do any of my colleagues have any
8 additional questions?

9 [background comments]

10 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Council Member
11 Rodriguez.

12 [background comments]

13 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Well I, I'm not
14 comfortable with 100 percent AMI but I am going to
15 support this because of, that it's a low
16 percentage. HPD is fully aware and cognoscente of
17 my requirements as it relates to a low and moderate
18 income family units. And so I'm going to pass on
19 this because I'm fully aware of Northern Manhattan
20 Equities and the work that they do and the work
21 that Mr. Punter does that has been excellent and
22 maintaining and great management. And so as a
23 result of that I am going to support this project.
24 And I'm going to ask my colleagues to pass on this
25 because of the work that they do, because they're

2 trying to maintain a, a good quality while being
3 affordable. And with the understanding that some of
4 the units will have to be raised as, as far as
5 rents. And as long as it doesn't go above 100
6 percent AMI and that percentage isn't increased
7 then I can strongly support this and I ask my
8 colleagues to do the same. Do any of... Council
9 Member Mealy.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: What percentage
11 is 60 percent?

12 CORINNE MAULSBY: 61 percent.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: 61 percent, okay.
14 Do you have any 50 percent?

15 CORINNE MAULSBY: Yeah so... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: ...AMI or 30
17 percent AMI at all?

18 CORINNE MAULSBY: So there are... Maybe
19 you could speak to the current tenancy but as far
20 as the regulatory restrict... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I can't hear you.

22 CORINNE MAULSBY: Maybe Malcom can speak
23 to the current tenancy rates... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: There is a 50
25 percent AMI.

2 CORINNE MAULSBY: ...but there's going to
3 be a 50 percent AMI band which accounts for eight
4 units or four percent of the total portfolio.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Eight units?

6 CORINNE MAULSBY: That's correct.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So none of them
8 is 30 percent AMI, all 50 and up?

9 MALCOM PUNTER: The way we account for
10 the 30 percent of AMI is to make sure that anybody
11 with a Section 8 voucher that wishes to remain in
12 the property. Any resident with a Section 8 voucher
13 pays 30 percent of the income.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: How many do you
15 have in there now?

16 MALCOM PUNTER: I don't, I don't know
17 the number but I'm positive that it's about 20
18 percent throughout the portfolio.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay because we...
20 [cross-talk]

21 MALCOM PUNTER: And no, and, and, and I
22 just want the committee to take note that there's,
23 there's no displacement in this project. Nobody
24 asked to leave. Everybody who wants to stay will
25 stay. Everybody that has Section 8 will remain. In

2 fact under the current regulatory scheme there are
3 units that are unregulated... actually eliminated all
4 on regulated units to bring them to a 30 year
5 regulation which really assures that this, that
6 those residents can remain there. Under the
7 unregulated units you know who knows someone might
8 try to deregulate. This makes it impossible to
9 deregulate.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay. Would this
11 construction you're going to be using WMBEs?

12 MALCOM PUNTER: The, the minority
13 business enterprise actually comprises of the
14 project owners themselves. ACCI has its own WMBE
15 requirement. So when we look for partners we look
16 for partners that are majority owned by MWBEs,
17 exact capitals is such a, a, a project. The... entity
18 will also mandate that they have at least 20
19 percent of WMBE participation.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay then. Thank
21 you.

22 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: And in actuality
23 Mr. Punter most of the, any work that you do is
24 MWBE.

25 MALCOM PUNTER: That's correct.

2 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Alright we've been
3 joined also by Council Member Mark Treyger who also
4 has a question.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you
6 Chair. And just a quick question about the
7 conditions of these apartments. Do we, can we speak
8 to the conditions of the apartments or, and, and
9 these dwellings, if there's any violations
10 concerns... someone could speak to them please.

11 MALCOM PUNTER: So the general
12 conditions are as I've been part of the operations
13 of this building for over nine years has been kept
14 to a standard where an... HCCI is that if our
15 president or our executive vice president would not
16 live in that building then it's not suitable for
17 the residents. With that being said any violations
18 that come up we systematically remove them. I spoke
19 earlier about the Local Law 11 of 1998 work. We're
20 going to make sure that that is completed and filed
21 current as a part of the construction process.
22 These buildings are 20, 20 years old in terms of
23 being in current operations. So there is some, some
24 need for repair. And that is why we are conducting
25 this, this project to make sure we get all of those

2 repairs done and the residents have been pleased so
3 far in the first phase and they are sending us
4 letters of support that they would like to see
5 other residents in their neighborhood get the same
6 treatment.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And to be
8 clear... HPD are there currently any violations in
9 the dwellings?

10 CORINNE MAULSBY: All dismissal requests
11 have been submitted for all current violations on
12 the property.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: This...

14 ARTIE PEARSON: So what that means is
15 that if there's anything that's recorded on the
16 system it doesn't necessarily reflect what's
17 actually in the apartment. And as part of the
18 process dismissal requests have been submitted so
19 that HPD sends out an inspector to make sure that
20 those violations have actually been removed and is
21 removed from the database.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: The reason why
23 I, I've asked this and the chair knows we've, we've
24 been talking about this you know quite a bit each
25 hearing is because we want to make sure that

1 affordability does not compromise quality. Just
2 because apartment's affordability shouldn't mean
3 that there's, it's any, it's any less quality. You
4 know people deserve to live in affordable quality
5 apartment that's safe for themselves and their
6 families.
7

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So that's
9 something that we all take very serious.
10 Affordability without... and we're not questioning of
11 course. We're, we're saying in general. We're not
12 questioning anyone here today. We're just saying
13 that as principle that just because, you know we're
14 fighting to make sure that we preserve New York to
15 be an affordable place for people. But if they, if
16 they're not safe in their building, if they're not
17 safe in their apartment, if, if there's issues that
18 are, that are plaguing the building we have to take
19 that into account equally as, as, as we take into
20 account affordability. So that's HPD's role and
21 that's something that we'll be working with HPD to
22 make sure that that is the policy citywide. Thank
23 you Chair.

24 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Council Member
25 Rodriguez.

1 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...no doubt
2
3 that amazing thing is happening in Harlem. You
4 know... one million dollars, 110, apartment 6,000
5 dollar rents. Great thing people... want to come to
6 live close to central park. And... American
7 community, they can come to Harlem. Good for them
8 and for diversity. But I have a issue when a
9 community is changed so drastically as it happened
10 in Harlem turning Harlem a community that is not a
11 majority black anymore. So with these project will
12 these apartment be accessible for the working class
13 resident of Harlem, those who are stay there living
14 in the 80s and the 90s when many people left?

15 MALCOM PUNTER: I really thank you for
16 that question Council Member. I am a lifelong
17 Harlem-ite. My father was born in Harlem, my
18 grandfather came from the West Indies in 1919 and
19 settled in San Juan Hill in Manhattan. And then
20 when the riots happened they came up to Harlem.
21 There's, you know I, I submit that there's no
22 individual... you know like myself that is not
23 committed to the, the current residents on Harlem.
24 I am a MBA trained in finance. I don't have to
25 necessary live in Harlem. I raise my children

1 there. And I, and my mother lives there. I'm
2 committed to making sure that any resident that
3 currently lives in Harlem who wishes to stay there
4 can stay there. And that's my vocation. And that's
5 what HCCI Harlem Congregations for Community
6 Improvement has done over the 29 years it has been
7 in existence. Our organizers who are Clergy members
8 of the community mandated that in their own mission
9 statement and their bylaws. And we, we, we have
10 continued to maintain that philosophy. And in a day
11 that I could not fulfil that philosophy would be
12 the day I couldn't work for HCCI.

14 [background comments]

15 MALCOM PUNTER: It is. That's correct.
16 It is affordable at the AMI level of 50, 60, 80,
17 and 100 as the project stands now, the regulatory
18 scheme today there are at least a significant
19 portion that is unregulated meaning that they are
20 so called market units. We're eliminating those
21 market units and bringing it into a regulatory
22 scheme under HPD's supervision.

23 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you. Are
24 there, do any of my colleagues have any further
25 questions? And in support of this application I

2 want to state that HCCI has for the, the 30 years
3 of its existence has provided affordable housing,
4 quality housing has fought to maintain
5 affordability with a conscience. And I do support
6 you. I commend you for that unlike so many of the
7 developers that come through HPD that have
8 staggered AMIs that go up to 160 percent AMI. I, so
9 I strongly support this application. I ask my
10 colleagues to vote in the affirmative for this. I
11 am closing the public hearing on Land Use number
12 204. And I want to note as I've already said that I
13 am in full support of this application and council
14 members Levin and Lander are in support of their
15 application. I a voting aye and I ask my colleagues
16 to vote aye to approve the motion. Please would my
17 council call the roll.

18 COUNCIL: Chair Dickens.

19 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: I vote aye.

20 COUNCIL: Council Member Mealy.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye on
22 all.

23 COUNCIL: Council Member Rodriguez.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]
25 Aye.

2 COUNCIL: Council Member Cohen.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

4 COUNCIL: Council Member Treyger.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

6 COUNCIL: Land use numbers 203 and 204

7 are approved with five votes in the affirmative,
8 zero in the negative, and zero abstentions.

9 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: I would like to
10 thank the members of the public and my colleagues
11 and then the, my council, and my land use staff for
12 attending today's hearings. I want to thank those
13 who came to give testimony. Please mark your
14 calendars and be sure to attend our next hearing to
15 be held on April 23rd. This hearing is hereby
16 adjourned.

17 [gavel]

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 14, 2015