

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

December 17, 2014
Start: 1:30 p.m.
Recess: 3:10 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers
City Hall

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES
Public Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Maria Del Carmen Arroyo
Inez D. Barron
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Inez E. Dickens
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.

Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras
Daniel R. Garodnick
Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L. Gibson
Daniel G. Greenfield
Vincent Ignizio
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Mark S. Weprin
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Principal Barnett
PS 150 Tribeca Learning Center

Jane Chiu, Program Director
Benjamin Rosenthal Self-Help
Innovative Senior Center

Teresa Fitzgerald
Hour Children

Georgia Lerner
Women's Prison Association

Dr. Una Clarke
Former New York City Council Member

Rabbi Eli Mansour
The Edmond J. Safra Synagogue

2 [sound check]

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All right. I
4 think we're going to--we have a jam packed number of
5 ceremonials today for-- I think our colleague
6 Margaret Chin is ready, and Margaret Chin is going to
7 be recognizing PS 150 folks. Come on up. [applause]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [off mic] The whole
9 third-grade class is here.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: The whole third
11 grade?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [off mic] Yes.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: The whole third
14 grade class is here. Come on up.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [off mic] Come on
16 up.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So, PS 150 is
18 being named a Blue Ribbon School. So we're here to
19 acknowledge, and Council Member Chin will let us know
20 all about it, but welcome to the People's Chamber
21 young ones.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: And beside this, we
23 are giving them a lesson.

24

25

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh, you're
3 getting a history lesson about this beautiful space.
4 All right, you Margaret.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Come on over here,
6 guys. Come on. Come on. [background comments]
7 This is our school here.

8 [Pause]

9 [background comments]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay, let's get
11 started. Good afternoon. It gives me great pleasure
12 to recognize PS 150-- [cheers] today [applause] at
13 the City Council Meeting. This time last year we
14 were told that the Department of Education wanted to
15 relocate PS 150, and use it to incubate a new larger
16 school in Chelsea. This school would have
17 essentially meant the end of PS 150 as we know it.
18 But, thanks to the amazing efforts of parents like
19 Wendy, Lisa Buxton [sic] we were able to successfully
20 stop this plan, and keep this school open downtown.
21 [applause] Now, PS 150 is a truly unique school, and
22 it's the only school downtown that draws from the
23 entire Lower Manhattan. And with it's one-class per
24 grade model, it offers individual support and a
25 creative nurturing space for our young downtown

1
2 youngsters. Now, I am so proud that not only were we
3 able to keep PS 150 open, but that in November, they
4 were recognized with the highest academic honor, a
5 Blue Ribbon from the U.S. Department of Education.
6 [cheers/applause] So, congratulations to Principal
7 Barnett, the staff, the parents and, of course, all
8 the students because this is so well deserved. And
9 we have here the whole third grade. So
10 congratulations to all, and we want the clerk to read
11 the Proclamation. [cheers]

12 CLERK: Council City of New York
13 Proclamation:

14 Whereas, the Council of the City of New
15 York is proud to honor PS 150 in celebration of it
16 being named a National Blue Ribbon School by the U.S.
17 Department of Education; and

18 Whereas, PS 150, also known as the
19 Tribeca Learning Center has one class per grade.
20 While it may be a small elementary school, it is
21 active and vibrant enough to overcome big challenges.
22 Last year PS 150 faced a controversial proposal to
23 move it out of Lower Manhattan, and merge its
24 students into a large new school in Chelsea,
25 effectively severing it from the community where it

1
2 has long been a prized option among parents of young
3 children. United by their caution, PS 150 tightened
4 the community as students, staff, teachers, and
5 parents worked together and eventually with the
6 support of elected officials and other members of the
7 community beat long odds to keep the school intact;
8 and

9 Whereas, each year the U.S. Department of
10 Education seeks out and recognizes great American
11 public and private elementary, middle, and high
12 schools where students achieve very high learning
13 standards, and all are making notable improvements in
14 closing the achievement gap. On October 1, 2014, the
15 U.S. Department of Education named PS 150 a National
16 Blue Ribbon School. The only school in Manhattan to
17 receive this honor. [cheers]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: All right. [cheers
19 and applause] Okay.

20 CLERK: And whereas-- I'm sorry, I'm not
21 finished. And whereas, the U.S. Department of
22 Education's awarded citation to PS 150 notes that
23 quote, "Its rich rigorous curricula aligned with
24 Common Core encompassed the Teachers College Reading
25 and Writing Project and math [sic] and focus. And

1
2 calls the school a place where dedicated teachers
3 create content studies and social studies in science,
4 which infused with skilled music and art instruction
5 create meaningful interdisciplinary learning
6 experiences for students. [background comments]

7 Hold on.

8 Whereas, PS 150 is one of only 18 schools
9 in New York State, and one of only six schools in New
10 York City, and one of 337 schools in the United
11 States to be named a National Blue Ribbon School.

12 While no financial award accompanies the recognition,
13 the award is great validation for its direction, and
14 an even greater morale booster for its community.

15 The school also receives a special National Blue
16 Ribbon Flag to grace its building; and

17 Whereas, in November, PS 150 was honored
18 at a special ceremony in Washington, D.C. to receive
19 its designation. Today, we celebrate PS 150 in New
20 York to bestow our own congratulations.

21 Now, therefore, be it known that the
22 Council of the City of New York honors PS 150 for
23 earning the U.S. Department of Education's National
24 Blue Ribbon Award. [cheers] And we wish its
25 students, teachers and staff continued success in the

1
2 years ahead. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the
3 Entire Council, Margaret S. Chin, Council Member
4 First District Manhattan, Daniel Dromm, Council
5 Member 25th District Queens. Congratulations.

6 [cheers and applause]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: So I'm going to ask
8 Principal Barnett to say a few words.

9 PRINCIPAL BARNETT: Hey, third graders.
10 You're blue ribbon kids. You have to behave and be
11 awesome, and you are. Thank you. Thank you, guys so
12 much. Thank you Councilwoman Chin. It's been an
13 amazing year so far. PS 150 is truly the little
14 school that does big things to quote Wendy Chapman.
15 We love that quote. We're very, very proud to have
16 won this award, and we continue to work hard and to
17 be the best school that we can be. So I just want to
18 thank you again so much for letting us come. This is
19 such a special, special moment for the kids and for
20 all of us. Thank you. [applause and cheers]

21 CHAIRPERSON COHEN: Thank you to all of
22 you. Thank you and happy holidays. Thank you.

23 [cheers and applause]

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All right,
25 congrats to these wonderful children, and

1
2 congratulations to the principal and all the
3 teachers. [applause] And we're going to move on--
4 Okay, we're going to move onto Council Members Koo
5 and Vallone that have a-- Okay, and Margaret Chin is
6 going to join as well. They have a Proclamation for
7 Jane Chiu, who is celebrating her 15th year of
8 service as the Program Director at the Benjamin
9 Rosenthal Self-Help Innovative Senior Center in
10 Flushing. Is that the one I visited? Is that the
11 one where I did the virtual bowling? How fun. All
12 right. That was really fun. So, yeah, the virtual
13 bowling. I got a strike. I think I got a strike.
14 I'm not sure about that, or a gutter ball. [laughs]
15 All right, Council Members Koo and Vallone come on
16 and then Chin.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: [off mic] I got
18 two strikes. [laughs] Where is Peter Koo? Come
19 Self-Help. Come on come on up. It's not everyday
20 you get our speaker bowling, and that's what we
21 managed to do. So Self-Help is a pillar within our
22 Senior Centers and with our next level of technology,
23 and one we were privileged to go through and take the
24 Speaker. It is without hesitation that we came up
25 with this wonderful proclamation. It is overdue, but

1
2 it is something that we wanted to make sure that
3 Self-Help is recognized for the work that they do
4 throughout the City, and it is an honor to present it
5 today. And we even have our Public Advocate.

6 [background comments] Peter.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Good afternoon,
8 everyone. We are here to honor Jane Chiu for her 15
9 years of wonderful and excellent senior service to
10 Prince Street Senior Center. She has been working
11 very hard for the senior center, and I know her for
12 more than ten years. And she is really wonderful,
13 and she keeps the senior center neat, and the
14 programs excellent. And she's one of the first
15 virtual senior centers in New York City created by
16 Self-Help. Today, we are also honored to have Stuart
17 Kaplan, CEO from Self-Help Community Service, right,
18 and Tover Kline [sp?] Executive Director, and
19 Ascenscia Baronette [sp?] Managing Director, and then
20 we are--the Chairwoman from the senior center is
21 here. And all of the members are here, or some of the
22 members are here to share the honor. Margaret here.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I just want to
24 congratulate Jane and it's a beautiful center, and I
25

1
2 know the speaker visited. I visited it before. So
3 congratulations and thank you for your hard work.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you very
5 much, Jane, and it's through your work that all of
6 the senior centers now are going to follow your lead
7 on what's there. So let's hear from our Speaker
8 Melissa Mark-Viverito.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: No, I mean having
10 personally witnessed the Center, I want to thank Jane
11 and Self-Help and everybody because it really is
12 providing such incredible service to our seniors
13 those who physically can come in and those who can't.
14 And it really is improving the quality of life. So
15 definitely, a model that we would love to see
16 replicated. Thanks to your leadership and thanks to
17 efforts that you do each and every day. So thank you
18 very much, and very well deserved, and I think with
19 that we'll ask the Clerk to read the Proclamation.

20 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Council City of New
21 York Proclamation:

22 Whereas, the Council of The City of New
23 York is proud to honor Ms. Gin Chang Jane Chiu [sp?]
24 for her 15 years of excellent work as Program
25 Director of Self-Help Innovative Senior Center that

1
2 has had a tremendously positive impact throughout our
3 community; and

4 Whereas, born in Shandi, China, Ms. Chiu
5 immigrated to the United States 1995. Four years
6 later, she received her Master's Degree in Social
7 Work. Then went on to earn her Doctor of Philosophy
8 Degree in Social Work from the Yeshiva University;
9 and

10 Whereas, Ms. Chiu began working for Self-
11 Help Community Services in 1997 as a Social Work
12 Intern at the Prince Street Senior Center. Through
13 hard work and dedication to its mission, she became
14 the center's director in 2004; and

15 Whereas, in 2010, when Prince Street
16 Senior Center merged with the Benjamin Rosenthal
17 Senior Center, and two years later the newly formed
18 center was designated as one of the first innovative
19 senior centers in New York City; and

20 Whereas, during Ms. Chiu's tenure as
21 Program Director, the Self-Help Innovative Senior
22 Center has become one of the most vibrant centers for
23 the elderly in the entire city with more than 350
24 individuals attending and participating in activities
25 daily. Additionally, the Center is the focal point

1
2 for the Self-Help Virtual Senior Center, which gives
3 homebound individuals the opportunity to participate
4 in activities from their home; and

5 Whereas, Ms. Chiu has truly distinguished
6 herself as a champion of older residents seeking to
7 sustain and improve their quality of life. She has
8 not merely worked for this great organization, but
9 for its larger cause, one close to her heart. In all
10 of her endeavors, she has remained committed to
11 ensuring that the seniors it serves are supported
12 with the dignity and respect they deserve.

13 Now, therefore, be it known that the
14 Council of the City of New York proudly honors Gin
15 Chang Jane Chiu in celebration of her 15th
16 anniversary at Self-Help Innovative Senior Center,
17 and her enduring contributions to our community.
18 Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the entire
19 Council, Peter Koo, Council Member, 20th District,
20 Queens, Paul A. Vallone, Council Member 19th
21 District, Queens, Margaret S. Chin, Council Member,
22 First District, Manhattan.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All right, and
24 [applause] do you want to say a few words, Jane?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Before Jane says a
3 few words, you might ask Stuart. He's the CEO of
4 Self-Help. Maybe he can say a few words to
5 compliment Jane.

6 STUART KAPLAN: Thank you so much to all
7 Council Members and the Speaker. This is a marvelous
8 day for Self-Help, but most importantly because of
9 our staff. And today in the case of Jane Chiu, who
10 represents the best of the best when it comes to
11 senior center, and caring for the aging. Our virtual
12 senior center, our long history of serving Holocaust
13 Survivors from which we built senior centers. It's a
14 very proud day after over 75 years of heritage of
15 Self-Help. Thank you to all the Council Members.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All right, Jane,
17 up to you now.

18 JANE CHIU: Thank you. Thank you Council
19 Speaker, and thank you council members for your
20 public recognition of my work in senior services. But
21 I do not regard this as a personal honor. It is a
22 collective honor for Self-Help innovative senior
23 centers here. We have our pack [sic] members here,
24 representatives of our pack members here. It is an
25 honor of Self-Help Community Services and our CEO

1
2 Stuart, and our Vice President Tover, and Ascensia is
3 here. Because Self-Help is working as a whole, as
4 Stuart just said it, and based on our leisure
5 achievements. We plan to continue our endeavor to
6 further reach out to our community to help others
7 that see us like Melissa said. And also to leverage
8 more funding for better senior services. And thank
9 you again. It is just a beginning. It is not an
10 end. Thank you. [applause]

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Jane.
12 Thank you so much. [cheers, applause, background
13 comments] And the next ceremonial once we finish the
14 cliquing. [pause] Thank you guys. The next
15 ceremonial will be by Council Member Crowley to be
16 given to Hour Children and the Women's Caucus and our
17 Public Advocate. We have a ceremonial for Hour
18 Children and the Women's Prison Association on their
19 service to incarcerated women and their families both
20 during and after their incarceration. So I'll hand
21 it over to Council Member Crowley and the rest of the
22 Women's Caucus.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you,
24 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito. It's an honor to join
25 the Women's Caucus and my Chair, my Co-Chair Council

1
2 Member Darlene Mealy, and all the women of the
3 Council, the strong leaders of the Council in
4 honoring two great organizations: Hour Children and
5 the Women's Prison Association. This time of year,
6 we all get distracted with the holidays. So many
7 different parties or out to buy presents when there
8 are thousands of New Yorkers that can't be together
9 because a family loved one is in prison. And
10 unfortunately a lot of times it's our youngest kids
11 who are looking to be with their parents and their
12 parent is not around. So we thank all of the council
13 members who brought in toys today, and the Women's
14 Caucus, and these two really great organizations for
15 doing so much around this time of the year in
16 providing for families who have loved ones
17 incarcerated. And also for all you do for women who
18 are part of the jail or prison system, the Mentoring
19 Programs, the job training, education, and housing.
20 Such vital services that help not only the women, but
21 the family and the entire community. And I would
22 like to now give the microphone back to the Speaker
23 and then read [off mic]

24 CLERK: Council City of New York
25 Proclamation.

1
2 Whereas, the Council of the City of New
3 York is proud to honor the Women's Prison Association
4 and Hour Children for their distinguished commitment
5 to service to incarcerated women and their families;
6 and

7 Whereas, Hour Children was founded in
8 1995 by Sister Teresa Tesa Fitzgerald in hope of
9 maintaining the bond between mothers in prison and
10 their children. The organization is called Hour
11 Children to acknowledge the critical hours that shape
12 the life of a child with an incarcerated mother. The
13 hour of their mother's arrest, the hour of their
14 visit, and the hour of her release. For nearly two
15 decades now, Hour Children has addressed this urgent
16 need for residences and support centers for children
17 from infancy to 21 years. Offering a wide range of
18 vital services including day care and after school
19 programs, mentoring and job training programs, a
20 thrift store, and a food pantry. Today, more than
21 700 of Hour Children's housing alumnae have
22 successfully transitioned to independent living.
23 They have rejoined the community, reunited with their
24 families, and are living healthy secure lives; and

1
2 Whereas, Women's Prison Association
3 founded in 1845 partners with Criminal Justice
4 involved women and their families in New York prisons
5 and city jails to bring positive change to their
6 lives. This great organization provides incredible
7 support to incarcerated women, supports them as they
8 plan for release, and a dependable guide as they
9 rebuild their lives. Women's Prison Association
10 strives to ensure that every woman in prison is able
11 to successfully re-enter her community with an
12 education and the skills to find employment. By
13 promotion alternatives to incarcerations and
14 strengthening the ties with their families, the
15 Association helps women reunite with their children,
16 find safe housing, and break the cycle of poverty and
17 incarceration that devastates many families and
18 communities; and

19 Whereas, the enthusiastic and
20 compassionate staff at both organizations have given
21 these women not only hope, but critical skills for
22 personal and professional success. Crucial pre and
23 post-release services guide their success by offering
24 the mother's advocacy, parenting skills, support
25

1
2 groups, and counseling to encourage all to live with
3 dignity and respect.

4 Now, therefore, be it known that the
5 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors
6 Hour Children and the Women's Prison Association for
7 giving women, families and communities a second
8 chance to thrive. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for
9 the entire Council, Elizabeth Crowley, Co-Chair,
10 Women's Caucus, Council Member 30th District, Queens,
11 Darlene Mealy, Co-Chair Women's Caucus, Council
12 Member 41st District, Brooklyn and all of the members
13 of the City Council's Women's Caucus.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Laurie Cumbo was
15 whispering in my ear. The men contributed, too. So
16 I want to thank the-- What is the caucus for really
17 organizing this toy drive for this great, these two
18 great organizations. This is really the spirit of
19 the holiday season to really reflect that, and to
20 lend a hand. So, thank you all that contributed, and
21 I think we would love to hear a few words from both
22 of the organizations that are represented here and
23 for all of the wonderful work that you do. Thank you
24 so much.

1
2 TERESA FITZGERALD: Talk about the
3 multiplication of the toys [laughs]. Forget the
4 loaves and fishes. [laughter] Some people got that.
5 Good. That's it. I stand here in deep gratitude on
6 behalf of the mothers of Hour Children. They are the
7 true heroines who after a period of incarceration re-
8 enter society to rebuild their lives with grace and
9 dignity. And I thank you for your support today, and
10 I offer you a visit across the RFK Bridge to Queens
11 where we are located. Thanks. Good bless and have a
12 wonderful holiday season. [cheers/applause]

13 GEORGIA LERNER: I'm Georgia Lerner from
14 the Women's Prison Association, and I just want to
15 express our gratitude on behalf of all of our clients
16 and their families. We've been serving New York City
17 since 1845, and I really wish there was no need for
18 our services. But until we can put ourselves out of
19 business, we're going to keep working on helping
20 women who have criminal justice involvement and do
21 everything we can to divert women and families from
22 going into the system all. Thank you. [applause]

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Well, thank you
24 again, and as we take the last pictures, if we can
25 have our helping elves, anybody as we pick up the

1
2 toys that we can give to the organizations. We have
3 a great last proclamation, and we'll take some
4 photos.

5 [Pause, background comments]

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you to
7 everyone helping. Now we have the last and the most
8 important ceremonial. It has been signed--this
9 proclamation has been signed by all the members of
10 the Brooklyn Delegation. [cheers] But all of my
11 colleagues that are here that would love to join us
12 at the front, we are honoring and giving a
13 proclamation to one of our former colleagues
14 [cheers/applause] Dr. Una Clarke on her wonderful
15 80th birthday. [cheers/applause] And I think most
16 people in this hall know and love Dr. Clarke. She is
17 a spirited strong willed woman, the way it should be,
18 incredibly accomplished and a leader not only in the
19 Caribbean-American community in particular, but in
20 this City of New York. And so, I know that all my
21 Brooklyn colleagues will be really happy to sign.
22 Look at all the signatures we got on this. We
23 probably could have put more, but we would love to
24 have the clerk read the proclamation. I will then
25 ask our Public Advocate also to say a few words.

1
2 She's here, and then we can hear from our Dr. Clarke.
3 So with that, the clerk can read the proc.

4 CLERK: Council City of New York
5 Proclamation. The Council of the City of New York is
6 proud to honor Sister Teresa Tesa Fitzgerald in
7 celebration of her 80th birthday for she has served
8 the Council, shaped our communities, and is an
9 inspiration to all, and

10 Whereas, Dr. Clarke was born on December
11 2, 1934 in the Parish of St. Elizabeth, Jamaica, West
12 Indies. In 1958, she immigrated to the United States
13 as a foreign student armed with a powerful mix of
14 bold ambition and unrelenting optimism. In 1991, Dr.
15 Clarke was elected to the New York City Council
16 making her the first Caribbean born woman elected to
17 our city's legislature. For the next ten years, she
18 sponsored more than 300 pieces of legislation on a
19 wide range of issues including child welfare,
20 education, health and mental health issues, economic
21 development, public safety, and transportation. She
22 was also an active member of the Council's Black and
23 Hispanic Caucus; and

24 Whereas, Dr. Clarke directed millions of
25 dollars for economic development, education, health

1
2 and mental health to her district and pursued the
3 implementation of critical projects and programs
4 through her ability and support from labor,
5 government, community and business leaders. An
6 educator by profession, she leveraged millions of
7 dollars to upgrade schools in her district, and
8 ensured they were technologically prepared for the
9 21st Century. She also fought to expand services for
10 the elderly, rebuild parks and playgrounds, and
11 increase quality childcare programs; and

12 Whereas, during Dr. Clarke's decade as a
13 Council Member, she consistently worked toward
14 creating a more representative and responsive
15 government, the kind that draws immigrants from
16 around the world to the United States. When doing
17 so, she empowered our city's Caribbean community
18 politically and economically like no one else. By
19 the end of her time as a council member, Dr. Clarke
20 not only achieved many of her goals, she kept the
21 door open for others to follow; and

22 Whereas in 2001, she was succeeded by
23 Yvette D. Clarke, making them the first
24 mother/daughter succession in city history. That
25

1
2 same year, Una Clarke became the first Caribbean-born
3 woman to receive the Ellis Island Medal of Honor; and

4 Whereas, today Dr. Clarke remains a
5 powerful catalyst for positive change, and continues
6 to champion causes close to her heart including
7 childcare, early childhood education, and American
8 foreign policy towards the Caribbean particularly on
9 issues on trade and immigration. As well as the
10 preservation of Caribbean history and culture.

11 Now, therefore, be it known, that the
12 Council of the City of New York is proud to pay
13 tribute the Honorable Dr. Una St. Clarke
14 [cheers/applause] in celebration of her 80th birthday
15 and her enduring contributions to our community.

16 Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the entire Council
17 and the entire Brooklyn Delegation of the City
18 Council. [cheers/applause]

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And I'm going to
20 ask the Public Advocate, but I did not have the
21 pleasure to serve with Dr. Clark. I had the pleasure
22 to serve with her daughter, Yvette Clarke. But I've
23 gotten to know you, and I'm so inspired by you each
24 and every day, your advocacy. You're still very
25 firmly committed to equality and inclusion, and that

1
2 means a lot to many of us. So thank you for your
3 efforts, and I'll have our Citywide Public Advocate
4 say a few words.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. We
6 affectionately refer to her as Mama Clarke, and she--
7 we stand on her shoulders. She's broken the ceiling
8 for countless for a countless number of elected
9 officials not only Caribbean's, African-Americans,
10 Latinos, Asians, everyone. She's a force to be
11 reckoned with, a political powerhouse, and she's 80
12 years young. [cheers/applause] and so she has more
13 energy than most individuals. We proudly support her
14 and want to say happy birthday. Good bless you Mama
15 Clarke. [cheers/applause]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I am very proud
17 to say to Mama Clarke thank you. Without you I
18 wouldn't be here, and so I want to say [sings] Happy
19 birthday to ya'. Happy birthday to ya'. Happy
20 birthday, happy birthday, happy birthday to ya',
21 happy birthday to ya', happy birthday, happy
22 birthday, happy birthday, happy birthday to you.
23 [cheers/applause]

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Dr. Clarke, you
25 can say a few words.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [off mic] Karen
3 said she has to do it, okay. [sic]

4 KAREN: Let--let Karen get the story.
5 [laughter/background comments] I had the pleasure of
6 serving with Una, and she was dynamite, and we became
7 friends. We went to Jamaica together, and we slept
8 in the same room. We shared a room. [laughter]

9 [Pause]

10 DR. CLARKE: First, let me say to the new
11 generation of council members that when I left the
12 Council, I was afraid that the new generation of
13 council members wouldn't take a hold of the city and
14 do what needs to be done. I take all of that fear
15 back, and say to you, this generation of council
16 members understand that we are living in a new time
17 and a new age. What was good for my generation, must
18 be passed onto the new generation of leadership.
19 Because I could not use the computer when I first--
20 when it first came out. And I had to say to my
21 daughter and my son, You cannot leave me behind.
22 Whatever you're up to, I'm up to the same thing and
23 some more. [laughter]

24 So I am pleased to have come to this
25 country as an immigrant foreign student to be able to

1
2 make my contribution to a nation that has given me
3 much. I am honored but I also want to give notice
4 that those who are anti-immigrants, you don't know
5 what you're losing in terms of human [applause]
6 service and the power and the ability to make a
7 contribution to this country. So having come as a
8 student, having given voice. When I said I was a
9 Caribbean-American, everybody said she's being
10 divisive. Why don't she say she's black. I'm black
11 but I'm a Caribbean-American. How about that. I
12 named myself and tell people how I want to be called.
13 And so just for that alone I think I was able to
14 withstand the criticism.

15 And I'm glad that every third generation,
16 Caribbean-American and I will say my grandfather, and
17 my grandmother also came to these shores. So I am
18 honored and I am privileged to continue to give
19 voice. Eighty is a number. My mother lived to be
20 103, [cheers/applause] I promised myself 110, if I
21 can remain in good health the way she was in good
22 health at the end. I don't want to live just for
23 living's sake. I want to live the quality of life,
24 but I tell everyone as long as my brain is still at
25 work, and my mouth can work my brain [laughter] you

1
2 will hear from me, and you will know that I'm still
3 around. So I gave you--I gave Congresswoman Yvette
4 Clarke who was in this hall with all of you. And if
5 I can take credit for anything, it will be that I
6 made sure that my children know that they are born in
7 America, but they have roots, and those roots are in
8 the Island of Jamaica.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All right.

10 [cheers/applause] Thank you, Dr. Clarke. Words to
11 live by. Thank you.

12 [Pause]

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: You didn't know
14 about the district. All right, Dr. Eugene who
15 followed if you could say a few words.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
17 much Madam Speaker. I'm going to be very, very
18 brief. I would be remiss if I didn't take a moment or
19 so to extend from the bottom of my heart my best
20 wishes to the former Council Member Dr. Una Clarke,
21 known as Mother Clarke. You all know that. She's a
22 true trailblazer, and she played a very important
23 role in being a city council member today. And I
24 want to thank you for your service to the community,
25 for your support to me, and for everything you have

1
2 done in this honorable body the City Council, and
3 working together with my colleagues, we will follow
4 your steps. May God bless you and the best thing
5 that I wish you is health, health. [applause] And
6 I'm not--you say 110, I say 120. God bless you.
7 [cheers/applause]

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Dr.
9 Eugene, and with that, we end ceremonials. Thank
10 you.

11 [Pause, background conversation]

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,
13 can I have your attention, please? Can I please have
14 your attention. All quiet on the floor, please.
15 Quiet on the floor. [applause/cheers] All quiet on
16 the floor. At this time, please place all electronic
17 devices to vibrate. Will all non-Council employees,
18 non-Council employees please leave the main floor of
19 the Chambers. There is additional seating upstairs.
20 Thank you.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
22 Chambers. May everyone have their seat. Quiet in
23 the Chambers. Everyone have their seat, please. We
24 are about to begin. All visitors if you're exiting,
25 please exit quietly. Members please have your seat.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

You have gentlemen in the balcony, please remove your hat. Thank you.

[Pause]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.

[Pause]

CLERK: Arroyo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.

CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [off mic] Here.

CLERK: Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

CLERK: Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

CLERK: Cohen.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

CLERK: Constantinides.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

CLERK: Cornegy.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY. Here.

CLERK: Crowley.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

CLERK: Cumbo.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

CLERK: Deutsch.
COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yes.
CLERK: Dickens.
COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.
CLERK: Dromm.
COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.
CLERK: Espinal.
COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.
CLERK: Eugene.
COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.
CLERK: Ferreras.
COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Here.
CLERK: Garodnick.
COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.
CLERK: Gentile.
COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.
CLERK: Gibson.
COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.
CLERK: Greenfield.
COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: [off mic]
Here.
CLERK: Johnson.
COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: [off mic] Here.
CLERK: Kallos.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

CLERK: King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Present.

CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
Chambers please. Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic]

CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [off mic] Here.

CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

CLERK: Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

CLERK: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

CLERK: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: [off mic]

CLERK: Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present.

1
2 CLERK: Menchaca.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.
4 CLERK: Mendez.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.
6 CLERK: Miller.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.
8 CLERK: Palma.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic]
10 CLERK: Reynoso.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.
12 CLERK: Richards.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.
14 CLERK: Rodriguez.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Present.
16 CLERK: Rose.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.
18 CLERK: Rosenthal.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.
20 CLERK: Torres.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [off mic] Here.
22 CLERK: Treyger.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.
24 CLERK: Ulrich.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.

1
2 CLERK: VACCA.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.
4 CLERK: Vallone.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.
6 CLERK: Weprin.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Here.
8 CLERK: Williams.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLAIMS: [off mic] Here.
10 CLERK: Wills.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Here.
12 CLERK: Ignizio.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Here.
14 CLERK: Matteo:
15 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.
16 CLERK: Barron.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.
18 CLERK: Van Bramer.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER Here.
20 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.
21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Here.
22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet
23 in the Chambers, please. Please rise for the
24 Invocation delivered by Rabbi Eli Mansour, The Edmond
25

1
2 J. Safra Synagogue, 1801 Ocean Parkway, Brooklyn in
3 the Borough of Brooklyn. Quiet.

4 RABBI MANSOUR: Thank you, Honorable
5 Speaker, members of the Council. I appreciate the
6 opportunity to stand before you this afternoon, and
7 address you in invocation. This morning I was asked
8 by members of my synagogue in Brooklyn, Rabbi, are
9 you nervous to deliver this speech. My answer was
10 very nervous. They said, Well, Rabbi, there are only
11 51 members on the Council and you're accustomed to
12 speaking in front of thousands of people around the
13 world. I said, But I will explain to you why I'm
14 nervous, and why I'm very nervous because this is the
15 largest audience that I have ever spoken in front of
16 clearly in my life. He said, Why? I related a small
17 anecdote about the Queen of the Netherlands, the
18 Queen Pauline Helena Maria, when she stood on the
19 balcony of her palace in Amsterdam. She turned to
20 her mother and she said, Mama, do all these people
21 belong to me? She said, No, my child, it is you who
22 belong to all these people. When I stand in front of
23 the Council, I'm not standing in front of 51 members.
24 I'm standing in front of all of those millions of
25 people that you represent. It is you who belong to

1
2 all these people. And, that's why I'm very nervous
3 because I never spoke--I never have spoken in front
4 of millions and millions of people.

5 Members of the Council, I was asked a
6 second question: Is it worth your time, Rabbi to
7 come all the way to Manhattan and to expend energy
8 for a three-minute invocation? I said, It is worth
9 it. Because as a rabbi I sometimes also forget that
10 the congregation does not belong to me, but I belong
11 to the congregation. And when I came here, I knew
12 that I would be inspired. I'm inspired to see that
13 everybody takes this job of civic responsibility and
14 duty very seriously. All the issues that are dealt
15 by all these members they're done in an idealistic
16 way, an altruistic way, and all of you are making a
17 big difference. I knew I would come in contact with
18 people that recognize that it is you who belong to
19 all these people, and I needed to remind myself of
20 that. And, therefore, I said it's worth it to come
21 here even to see these presentations that were done.

22 To get inspired by all the public
23 services being done around me. I am re-energized and
24 re-inspired at my job at the synagogue. Although
25 I've come this afternoon to give the invocation, but

1
2 all of you members of the Council have actually given
3 me the best invocation that I ever received. But I
4 was asked to give a blessing, and in the old
5 literature of our Holy Works we are told to pray for
6 the welfare of government. Pray for its integrity,
7 and as well, very humbly. I pray for your welfare.
8 I pray for your peace of mind. May the Almighty give
9 you counsel in order to continue the great work, and
10 to be a motivator to young rabbis like myself that
11 look at you with great admiration and respect for all
12 that you do. As the Queen was told by her mother,
13 the people are not yours. You belong to the people.
14 Thank you very much. [applause]

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. You
16 may be seated. Motion to spread the invocation,
17 Council Member Treyger.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet, please.

20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet, please.

22 Council Member Treyger.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Motion to spread
24 the invocation in full upon the record. It is my
25 honor and privilege to welcome Rabbi Eli Mansour--

1
2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,
3 please.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Rabbi of the
5 Edmond J. Safra Synagogue, and one of the most
6 respected and prominent members of Brooklyn's Jewish
7 community. As many of you know, large number of
8 Sephardic Jews began emigrating to our city and
9 country from Syria during the early part of the 20th
10 Century. Many originally settled in the Lower East
11 Side before establishing themselves in neighborhoods
12 in Brooklyn including Gravesend. This led to the
13 construction of synagogues and Yeshivas to spread a
14 love and appreciation of their heritage in the next
15 generation, and a commitment to carry on these
16 traditions in America. Over the years, the Sephardic
17 Jewish community has become an integral part of our
18 borough and our city, and has contributed much to
19 those in need. Rabbi Mansour continues to provide
20 inspiration at the Edmond J. Safra Synagogue, which I
21 am proud to report is a thriving and growing
22 congregation that is preparing to move to even a
23 larger facility. The success of this congregation is
24 the result of the great leadership envisioned by
25 Rabbi Mansour, and really is symbolic of how our city

1
2 welcomes people of all religions and backgrounds.
3 With that, I am proud to welcome Rabbi Mansour to
4 City Hall, and thank him for providing words of
5 wisdom and guidance before today's important meeting.
6 Thank you.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
8 Adoption of Minutes. Council Member Ulrich.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I make a motion,
10 Madam Public Advocate to spread-- I'm sorry. That's
11 the wrong one. I make a motion that the minutes of
12 the Stated Meeting of November 25th, 2014 be adopted
13 as printed. Thank you.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
15 Messages and Papers from the Mayor.

16 CLERK: None.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
18 from City, County, and Borough Offices.

19 CLERK: None.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
21 Chambers, please.

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please. Sit
23 down.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
25 Chambers. Petitions and Communications.

1
2 CLERK: None.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-
4 Ups.

5 CLERK: None.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quite in the
7 Chambers as we hear from the Speaker Melissa Mark-
8 Viverito.

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All right, thank
11 you, Madam Public Advocate, and good afternoon to all
12 in the room and to my colleagues. I would like to
13 ask my colleagues to please stand. This part
14 Thursday former Council Member Jay O'Donovan passed
15 away. Jay was a decorated Marine Corps Veteran who
16 earned two Bronze Stars and field promotion to
17 Captain while serving in Vietnam. He served on the
18 Council from 1982 through 2001, and was Chair--in the
19 District that is now represented by Council Member
20 Rose, and was Chair of the Economic Development
21 Committee. Jay was well liked by all his colleagues
22 and all who knew him. He was most proud of the work
23 he did to set up the Economic Empowerment Zones,
24 clean up the Fulton Fish and Hunts Point Markets,
25 control over development. And the bringing of

1
2 millions of dollars in funding for new classrooms,
3 school computers, arts and reading projects.

4 We definitely send our deepest sympathies
5 to his family, and many friends who knew him. And
6 Council Member Gentile has asked to say a few words.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Thank you, Madam
8 Speaker. Council Member Jay O'Donovan came to these
9 Chambers as a decorated Marine Veteran and a Vietnam
10 war veteran. He was an early supporter of Peter
11 Vallone, Sr. for Speaker, and soon thereafter became
12 Chairman of the Economic Development Committee. And
13 as you heard, he was in the mix of the economic
14 development issues of the day. Particularly on
15 Staten Island and the Homeport and a lot of the
16 preservation issues.

17 When I came to Staten Island, my senate
18 district overlapped Councilman O'Donovan's Council
19 District. So he took me graciously under his wing.
20 And we worked together on a bunch of local issues
21 like the power plant in Rosebank, the hospital at
22 Bayley-Seton. And moreover, Jay O'Donovan schooled
23 me about the intricacies of politics on Staten
24 Island, and for those of my colleagues on Staten
25 Island, you know that can be a real education, the

1
2 politics of Staten Island. So I greatly appreciate
3 what Jay did for me back then as the State Senator.
4 Councilman Jay O'Donovan did what he did with a
5 smile, and with some comic relief always. He was
6 just a joy to be around, and to work with. So rest
7 in peace, my friend. Councilman Jay O'Donovan was a
8 credit to Staten Island. He was a credit to the City
9 Council. He was a credit to the whole of the New of
10 New York. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
12 Council Member. I want to ask my colleagues to just
13 remain standing just for a minute as we acknowledge a
14 recent attack on a school in Peshawar, Pakistan,
15 which killed over 140 innocent people, wounded many,
16 many others, and the ones that died were mostly
17 children. This is clearly deplorable. It's a global
18 tragedy, and our thoughts and prayers go out to the
19 Pakistani community as we collectively mourn the loss
20 of life. [pause for a moment of silence] Thank you,
21 colleagues.

22 Today, the City Council will be voting no
23 a package of four bills regulating pet shops in New
24 York City. These bills will prohibit pet shops in
25 the city from selling rabbits obtained from any

1
2 source, and dogs and cats obtained from brokers or
3 from breeders who have been cited for violations of
4 the Animal Welfare Act. These bills will require pet
5 shops to provide purchasers and prospective
6 purchasers with detailed information about an
7 animal's breeder and its USDA inspection history.
8 Additionally, pet shops that sell cats and dogs will
9 now be required to obtain a permit from the
10 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene. In order to
11 obtain these permits, pet shops must certify that
12 they have not knowingly sold animals from prohibited
13 sources since the law went into effect for the past
14 two years--or for the past two years for permit
15 renewals. Among many other measures, this package
16 also includes proposals to require that all dogs and
17 cats sold by city pet shops be spayed and neutered by
18 a licensed veterinarian. But pet shops must not
19 release a dog to a customer until the customer has
20 completed a dog application first. That pet shops
21 obtain records of the animal sold, and the contact
22 information of the purchaser. That pet shops check
23 the Animal Abuse Registry before selling animals and
24 will not provide animals to anyone who has been
25 convicted of animal abuse crimes.

1
2 With this package of bills, we are making
3 it clear that New York City will not tolerate abuse
4 of pets before, during, or after the time that they
5 are living in pet shops. We will not do business
6 with puppy mills or allow pets to fall into the hands
7 of those who would abuse them. These bills make the
8 city safer and more humane for pets waiting to find a
9 home. I want to definitely thank, Jeff Campagna, Dan
10 Hafetz, Crystal Pond, Terzah Nasser, and Lyle Frank
11 who worked diligently as well as the staff of the
12 council members on these bills. And with that, I'll
13 ask Council Member Crowley first to say a few words,
14 then followed by Council Member Johnson.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you,
16 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito and Council Member
17 Corey Johnson for moving these important bills
18 forward today. The bills we are passing would make
19 New York City a national leader in animal rights. As
20 a New Yorker who cares deeply about animals, sadly so
21 many of us are given false information at pet stores
22 causing many New Yorkers to buy pets that come from
23 puppy mills without even knowing. The passage of
24 Intro 55-A pet shops would be prohibited from
25 obtaining their animals from brokers who often serve

1
2 as the middleman for abusive breeders. Brokers have
3 a long history of engaging in deceptive practices,
4 and they are the largest players in the pet industry
5 that facilitates a system enabling puppy mills to
6 currently exist and thrive. Intro 55-A will mandate
7 that pet shops have verifiable information about--

8 [crowd comments]

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
10 Chambers. Excuse me, Council Member. Please, quiet
11 in the Chambers.

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I apologize,
14 Council Member.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Okay, Intro 55-A
16 will mandate that pet shops have verifiable
17 information about the sources and health of animals
18 they are offering for sale by requiring pet shops to
19 have direct relationships with the breeders. This
20 will ensure humane treatment and breeding of all new
21 pets purchased in New York City. And establish much
22 needed transparency for concerned consumers.
23 Additionally, I'm proud to be the prime sponsor of
24 145-A-- I'm sorry, 146-A, which will reduce the
25 amount of puppies and cats in our shelter system. It

1
2 will require pet shops to spay or neuter any cat or
3 dog before releasing it to a purchase. And to
4 register the pet with the City before leaving the pet
5 shop. Reducing the number of unwanted animal births
6 is key to reducing the animal shelter population.
7 And preventing animals from being needlessly put
8 down.

9 Our shelters are gravely over-burdened.
10 Nearly 30,000 dogs and cats were abandoned in New
11 York City animals shelters lasts year, and of which
12 thousands were euthanized. That is why I'm mandating
13 spaying and neutering of new pets is an important
14 step to save countless animal lives. Again, I want
15 to thank Council Member Corey Johnson, the Speaker,
16 all the advocates including the Mayor's Alliance for
17 New York City Animals, the ASPCA, the Humane Society,
18 and New York City Bar Association Committee on Animal
19 Law. We are sending a strong message today to cities
20 and states across the nation, and also to fellow New
21 Yorkers about acceptable standards for the animals we
22 love so much. Thank you. And if I could encourage
23 all my colleagues, and their constituents if you were
24 thinking of giving a pet for Christmas this year, go
25

1
2 to the shelter first before the pet stores. Thank
3 you.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Council Member
5 Johnson.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
7 Speaker. I am very proud of the package of four
8 bills that we are voting on today. I want to thank
9 Council Member Elizabeth Crowley who has been a
10 champion for animals in this Council. And as she
11 outlined what we are doing today, but I think it's
12 important to repeat if anyone has seen the photos of
13 what puppy or kitten mills look like, it is
14 disgusting. It is inhumane, and it is wrong.
15 Today's bills do a series of things, but we have to
16 cut out these bad actors that using animals in an
17 inhumane way solely for money and profits, and that's
18 what this bill does. It is going to save countless
19 lives. As my colleague said, 30,000 animals ended up
20 in the shelter system last year, and 6,000 animals
21 were euthanized, put down or killed. In a city of
22 8.4 million, I think we can find 6,000 loving homes
23 for animals. But part of the problem is that
24 consumers unwittingly buy animals from pet shops that
25 are getting their animals from putting and kitten

1
2 mills and those animals have congenital health
3 problems. The consumer doesn't know about it. They
4 buy the pet, and then they can't afford the
5 veterinary care. So they end up in a shelter, and
6 sometimes they up put down. Today is about trying to
7 stop this dangerous pipeline that has hurt many
8 animals. We're also tackling bills on mandatory spay
9 and neuter and mandatory microchipping, which our
10 animal shelters AC&C already do. And lastly, we are
11 updating the Animal Abuse Registry. Taken together,
12 these bills will enable the city to strengthen its
13 shelter system, empower consumers, decrease the
14 number of unwanted litters, increase the number of
15 lost animals returned to their owners. And join the
16 nationwide effort to keep bad actors out of the pet
17 supply chain.

18 I want to thank Assembly Member Linda
19 Rosenthal who passed a bill in Albany, which enabled
20 the City Council to take action on this. I want to
21 thank Elizabeth Crowley who has been incredible to
22 work with. I also want to thank Jeff Campagna, who
23 has worked so hard on this. And my staff Louis
24 Cholden-Brown, my Staff Director; Jeff Mailman,
25 Council Member Crowley's Legislative Director, Dan

1
2 Hafetz, Crystal Pond, and Crilhien Francisco from the
3 Health Committee Staff, and Matt Gewolb, Laura Papa,
4 Lyle Frank, and Terzah Nasser. This is a very big
5 day for animals in New York City. It's going to make
6 our city more just and more humane, and I look
7 forward to continuing to fight on behalf of animals
8 in our city. Thank you very much.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So I want to
10 thank both Council Members Crowley and Johnson.
11 Issues of humane treatment of animals is something
12 that I feel strong about as well. So what has been
13 encouraged in this time where we talk about it,
14 giving pets away as gifts, let's think about our city
15 shelters and adopting some of those wonderful pets
16 that are looking for a loving home.

17 Today, also we're going to vote on
18 legislation to regulate social adult daycare
19 programs. Social adult daycare programs provide
20 functionally impaired individuals such as those
21 suffering from Alzheimer's or Dementia with personal
22 care and nutritious means, and the opportunity to
23 socialize in a safe supervised environment.
24 Unfortunately, some programs are funded by companies
25 that compensate them each additional participant they

1
2 enroll for social adult day care. This creates a
3 monetary incentive to enroll seniors who are not
4 functionally impaired into programs through
5 giveaways, free takeout food and programming that is
6 beyond the financial reach of senior centers.

7 And, in fact, pulling these seniors away
8 from the senior centers. Further, when programs
9 enroll participants who are not truly eligible, they
10 are committing fraud by misusing precious Medicaid
11 dollars. New York State has developed comprehensive
12 regulations for social adult day care. However, they
13 currently only apply to programs that receive public
14 funding. This bill will apply those same regulations
15 to social adult day care programs in New York City
16 that do not receive public funds. These programs
17 would be required to register with the Department for
18 the Aging and adhere to basic standards on
19 participant eligibility, program services, and
20 facilities. Seniors are a vulnerable population, who
21 should not be exploited or taken advantage of.

22 With this legislation, we will hold all
23 social adult day care programs accountable for their
24 practices and ensure that participants are eligible
25 and enrolled for legitimate reasons.

1
2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So I want to
4 thank and acknowledge Kelly Taylor, Dan Hafetz,
5 Crystal Pond, Terzah Nasser, and Lyle Frank. And I'm
6 going to call on Margaret Chin, who has been an
7 incredibly strong advocate on this issue across time.
8 So that is just the first year that she's been
9 involved in this issue in calling us to take action.
10 And I want to also acknowledge her as our Chair of
11 our Committee on Aging, and ask her to say a few
12 words. Thank you so much for your leadership,
13 Margaret.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Madam
15 Speaker. Good afternoon. I wanted to thank all the
16 advocates and seniors and so many of my colleagues,
17 48 council member sign-ons supporting Intro 358 to
18 create oversight over social adult day care
19 facilities in our city. It will bring New York City
20 in line with the almost 40 other states in the
21 country that have regulations already for social
22 adult day care. This bill is about making sure that
23 taxpayer dollars are going to the good actors who are
24 actually serving seniors with mental and physical
25 impairments. It is also about making sure that our

1 most vulnerable seniors are protected and adequately
2 served. Social adult day care is important and
3 needed, and is only going to become more important.
4 That is why we have to take this action now so that
5 we can take action against bad actors abusing the
6 system. And make sure seniors are able to access the
7 good centers. This bill will require all social
8 adult day care facilities to register with the city
9 so that we finally will know where and who they are.
10 It will create an ombudsman with the Department for
11 the Aging. So that we finally have someone who can
12 address issues with the way facilities are operated.
13 And most importantly, it will also have civil
14 penalties so that the city will have the ability to
15 address problems with social adult day care
16 facilities.
17

18 I would like to thank all of the co-prime
19 sponsors of this bill, Council Member Vallone,
20 Johnson, Vacca, Arroyo and I really particularly want
21 to thank Council Member Corey Johnson, the Chair of
22 our Health Committee who has been a huge supporter,
23 and my partner in these efforts from the beginning.
24 Corey, I truly appreciate your smart counsel every
25 step of the way, and you know where we have to go to.

1
2 You play an essential part in getting this bill to
3 the floor today. I also want to thank your
4 incredibly smart Legislative and Budget Director,
5 Louis Cholden-Brown, who has been a tremendous help
6 in this effort. But Speaker Melissa, you have been
7 there, and you have been stepped out in your report
8 in letting us move forward with this important
9 legislation. It is something that many of us first
10 starting working the last term. And it's no small
11 part to the support of our Speaker that we have been
12 able to get this down within the first year of the
13 new term. I would also like to thank some of the
14 central staff, Laura Papa, Matt Gewolb, and Crilhien
15 Francisco, and also Dan Hafetz and, of course, the
16 great Kelly Taylor, [cheers] and my Chief of Staff,
17 Yumai Kierasay [sp?]. They have been working on this
18 for over two years, and it's fair to say that without
19 all this-- They're smart, diligent and always fought
20 the war or we would not be voting on this piece of
21 legislation today. And I once again want to thank
22 all my colleagues. We're making history, and I want
23 to thank you all for your support.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
25 Margaret. [applauds] Colleagues, as you're well

1
2 aware, this is going to be the last Stated Meeting of
3 2014, and I want to take a quick moment to thank all
4 of you for the hard work, the long hours, and passion
5 that you contributed to help make this year a great
6 success for the Council. And clearly, that's
7 extended to our staff, both in our district offices
8 and here centrally.

9 Twenty-one of our 51 members are in their
10 first year at the City Council. Back in January
11 there were cynics who wondering if a council with so
12 many fresh men, fresh women members and new
13 leadership-- I'll have to edit that. My staff did
14 it. [laughter] It wasn't gender-neutral there.
15 [background comment] And new leadership would up to
16 the task of passing good legislation, and conducting
17 responsible oversight. We answered those questions
18 by getting right to work, and producing results for
19 New Yorkers in all five boroughs. I'm proud of all
20 that we've done in 2014, and truly can't wait for all
21 that's ahead for this Council in the year and years
22 to come. I hope that you all have a safe and happy
23 holiday season that you have a Happy New Year, and
24 hope you'll get some well-deserved rest. I say Feliz
25 Navidad and Feliz Ano Nuevo. And those who are

1 celebrating tonight, Happy Hanukkah, and with that, I
2 end communication from the speaker.
3

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Seeing no hands
5 for general orders, Council Member Ulrich to vote?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I ask for
7 unanimous consent to vote aye on all orders on the
8 General Order Calendar.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you. I
11 vote aye.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
13 Council Wills to vote.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I ask for
15 unanimous consent to vote--

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,
17 please.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
19 Chambers, please.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: --on items on the
21 General Orders.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
23 Wills.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I ask for
25 unanimous consent to vote on all General--

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: --Calendar Orders.

Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: You vote aye?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

Report of Special Committees.

CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Report of

Standing Committees.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on

Finance, Pre-considered Intro 588, the Mayor's

Preliminary Management Report.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on

General Order with a message of necessity.

CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 519

Organization Funding.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on

General Orders.

CLERK: Preconsidered LU 160 and Reso 521

through Pre-Considered LU 163 and Reso 524 various

projects.

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
3 General Orders.

4 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
5 Health, Intro 55-A regulating pet shops.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
7 Coupled on General Orders.

8 CLERK: Intro 73-A, Animal Abuse
9 Registration Act.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
11 Coupled on General Orders.

12 CLERK: Intro 136-A, Spaying, Neutering
13 and Licensing of Animals.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
15 coupled on General Order.

16 CLERK: Intro 146-A, Microchipping
17 animals.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
19 coupled on General Order.

20 CLERK: Intro 358-A, Adult Day Care.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
22 coupled on General Order.

23 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land
24 Use, LU 147 and Reso 525, Tax Exemption.

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
3 General Orders.

4 CLERK: LU 51 and Reso 526, Zoning
5 Amendment.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
7 General Orders.

8 CLERK: LU 59 and Reso 527, Tax
9 Exemption.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
11 General Orders.

12 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Rules,
13 Privileges and Elections, Pre-Considered M211 and
14 Reso 528 Approving the Election of Honorable Ben
15 Kallos as a member of the Commission on Public
16 Information and Communication.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
18 General Orders.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
20 Could we have it quiet in the Chambers, please?
21 Quiet please?

22 CLERK: Preconsidered M212 and Reso 529
23 approving the designation of Barbara A. Lowe, Health
24 and Hospitals Corporation.

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
3 General Orders.

4 CLERK: Preconsidered M213 and Reso 530
5 approving the designation of Honorable Deborah Rose,
6 Waterfront Management Advisory Board.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
8 General Orders.

9 CLERK: On the General Order Calendar.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] The
11 General Order Calendar.

12 CLERK: Resolution appointing persons
13 Commissioner of Deeds.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Commissioner on
15 General Orders, and at this time I ask for a roll
16 call and-- A roll call on all items on the General
17 Order Calendar.

18 CLERK: Arroyo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

20 CLERK: Barron.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye on all, and
22 abstain on 136-A.

23 CLERK: Cabrera.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all and
3 congratulations to Council Member Crowley and Council
4 Member Chin.

5 CLERK: Chin.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

7 CLERK: Cohen.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Constantinides.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on
11 all.

12 CLERK: Cornegy.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY. Aye on all.

14 CLERK: Crowley.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye on all.

16 CLERK: Cumbo.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye on all.

18 CLERK: Deutsch.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.

20 CLERK: Dickens.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.

22 CLERK: Dromm.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

24 CLERK: Espinal.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Eugene.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

CLERK: Ferreras.

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Aye.

CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [off mic]

CLERK: Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: May I be excused
to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Okay, thank you.
Congratulations to Council Member Johnson for adding
the pet shops to the Animal Abuse Registry, and
Council Member Crowley. Also congratulations to
Margaret Chin on Intro 358 on regulating adult day
care. Seniors in my district I know have been
involved in this issue over the years especially
those seniors from the Amico Senior Center led by Dr.
Joan Pastore. And many of them including Dr. Pastore
are with us today in the audience watching this vote.
So with that, I will vote aye on all.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet please.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
balcony, please. Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

CLERK: Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Congratulations to my colleagues, and I vote aye on all.

CLERK: Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you. Just to briefly explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: First of all, I want to congratulate Council Member Corey Johnson. I think that his dedication is admirable. You could say that on these issues he's been a pit bull, and we certainly are [applause] appreciative and we thank you very much.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the Chambers, please.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Also, I want to congratulate Council Member who has always had a focus on public safety issues. And, of course, nobody works harder for seniors in New York City than Margaret Chin. She has always been on top of this issue, and she is really the greatest champion that seniors have. Thank you very much. I also just want to wish folks a Happy Hanukkah, Merry Christmas, Happy Holidays, Happy Kwanzaa, and for those who

1
2 celebrate Happy Festivus, and please be sure to pick
3 up a donut on the way out in the members lounge in
4 honor of Hanukkah. Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: That's a good
7 question. I'm going to go with aye on all.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I think that's
9 good.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you.

11 CLERK: Johnson.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Permission to
13 explain my vote.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I just want to
16 briefly thank Council Member Margaret Chin who has
17 been pushing this issue to protect vulnerable seniors
18 since the very beginning of this year. Getting 48
19 co-sponsors on a piece of legislation is impressive
20 and she had been tenacious, tireless, and incredible
21 to work with. So I want to thank her, and the staff
22 in her office. I also want to say that it's been a
23 real pleasure working with Council Member Crowley.
24 I'm very proud that today we're voting on pieces of
25 legislation--

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

3 Excuse me, Council Member. May we have quiet in the
4 Chambers, please? Quiet, please. I apologize
5 Council Member Johnson.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I'm very proud
7 today that we're voting on five pieces of legislation
8 out of the Health Committee, and the reason why that
9 is, is because an incredibly dedicated wonderful
10 staff who I could not do this work without. I just
11 want to thank Louis Cholden-Brown, Dan Hafetz,
12 Crystal Pond, and Crilhien Francisco who have been an
13 all-star team to work with. And with that, I proudly
14 vote aye on all. Thank you.

15 CLERK: Kallos.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to
17 explain my vote.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Congratulations
20 to Council Members Chin, Crowley, and Johnson and on
21 behalf of the first feline of District 5, Pandora,
22 who was adopted from an animal shelter, I proudly
23 vote aye on all.

24 CLERK: King.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: First, I want to
3 congratulate all of my colleagues today for passage
4 of their legislation. Happy Hanukkah to everyone and
5 peace and blessings, and I vote aye on all.

6 CLERK: Koo.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Congratulations to
8 Council Members Johnson, Crowley and Chin, and I vote
9 yes on all and happy holidays. Feliz Navidad and
10 Merry Christmas.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughter] Next.

12 CLERK: Koslowitz.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: May I be
14 excused to explain my vote?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, Council
16 Member.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I want to
18 congratulate my colleagues on their legislation, and
19 I want to wish everybody a very, very happy holiday
20 season, and I vote aye.

21 CLERK: Lancman.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic] Aye.

23 CLERK: Lander.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Congratulations
25 to Council Members Johnson and Chin for their great

1
2 advocacy. Also, congratulations to Council Members
3 Rose and Kallos on their appointments to these
4 advisory boards, and I do want to flag, thanks to the
5 Manhattan Delegation for Barbara Lowe's appointment
6 to the Health and Hospital Corporation. She is going
7 to be a very strong member and do the City, HHC and
8 this body proud. I vote aye on all.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. *

10 CLERK: Levin.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
12 explain my vote?

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I just want to
15 offer my congratulations to Council Members Crowley,
16 Chin and Council Member Corey Johnson. I
17 particularly congratulate Council Member Johnson for
18 three stated meetings in a row passing legislation.
19 That is a phenomenal way to end his first year in the
20 Council, and with that, I vote aye on all.

21 CLERK: Levine.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: With heartfelt
23 congratulations and admiration for Council Members
24 Johnson, Chin, and Crowley, I, too, proudly vote aye
25 on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Aye on
all.

CLERK: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 136-A, 55-
A, 358-A, aye on the rest.

CLERK: Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye on all.

CLERK: Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: With heartfelt
congratulations to my colleagues and happy holidays,
Feliz Navidad, I vote aye on all. Thank you.

CLERK: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye on all.

CLERK: Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye on all
with the exception of 136-A I abstain.

CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic] Aye on
all.

CLERK: Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Happy holidays.
Congratulations to my colleagues, and I vote aye.

CLERK: Richards.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye on all.

CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ:

Congratulations to Council Members Crowley, Chin, and
of course, our Corey Johnson, and I vote aye.

CLERK: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I'd like to extend
congratulations to all of my colleagues for a most
productive sessions, and we wish them all happy
holiday. And I hope a commitment to peace and
justice to all in the near year, and I vote aye.

CLERK: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye on all.

CLERK: Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all. *

CLERK: Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

CLERK: VACCA.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye on all.

CLERK: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Permission to
explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Today is the day
3 we see bills being passed by Councils Members very
4 passionate about what they do. So a big
5 congratulations to Council Members Crowley and
6 Johnson, and especially to Margaret Chin.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I am very proud
9 to co-sponsor today's bill on social adult day care
10 press conferences, and as chair of the Senior Centers
11 this is something that has been brought to both of
12 our attention at every hearing. And it couldn't be
13 brought in at a better time, and we need to regulate
14 an industry that is not regulated. And a wonderful
15 Merry Christmas and Happy Hanukkah and all the
16 holidays to my colleagues. We had a wonderful
17 children's holiday parade last week, which is a true
18 symbol of the city's greatness where everything was
19 celebrated and every agency was there. So God bless
20 and Happy New Year.

21 [Pause]

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Did you vote,
23 Council Member.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Weprin.

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Thank you. I
vote aye on all.

CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLAIMS: I vote aye on
all, and please sign me onto Intro 1-- I'm sorry.
Intro 358-A. [Speaking foreign language] Merry
Christmas. Happy Kwanzaa. Happy New Year to
everyone.

CLERK: Ignizio.

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: I vote no 136-A
and 355-A and 358-A and I want to wish everybody a
Merry Christmas and a Happy Hanukkah, and to my
friend Peter Koo [speaking foreign language]. All
right. I felt bad because he said that he's not an
adult so he had to say it in Chinese. [laughter] Be
well everybody.

CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER Well, congratulations
all, and I proudly vote aye.

CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye and I
hope to see all my colleagues later at our holiday
party.

[Pause]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All items on today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a vote of 41--

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet please.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the Chambers, please. Were adopted by a vote of 51 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0 abstentions with the exception of Intro 136-A, which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 2 in the negative and 2 abstentions. And Intro 55-A, which was adopted by a vote of 49 in the affirmative, 2 in the negative, and 0 abstentions. And Intro 358-A, which was adopted by a vote of 49 in the affirmative, 2 negatives, and 0 abstentions. At this time Introduction and Reading of Bills.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills referred to committee as indicated on the agenda.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Discussion of Resolution 417. Quiet in the Chambers, please. Discussion of Resolution 417, a resolution recognizing and commemorating January 13th as a Korea-American day in the City of New York sponsored

1
2 by Council Member Koo. Seeing none, all those in
3 favor of Resolution 417, say aye?

4 COUNCIL MEMBERS: [chorus of ayes]

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All those
6 opposed? Any abstentions? The ayes have it. Now,
7 General Discussion. Council Dickens.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you, Madam
9 Public Advocate and Speaker Mark-Viverito. I'm
10 calling on my colleagues to sign onto Resolution 517
11 and 518, which calls upon the New York State
12 Legislature to require common deadline for all
13 charter school applications, and a common lottery
14 date for any charter schools using lottery
15 admissions. And the second resolution requires
16 charter schools to fill any Vacancies.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
18 Quiet in the Chambers.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: --created by--

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I apologize
21 Council Member. Quiet in the Chambers, please.
22 We're still in session.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: --created by
24 departing students at any grade level from students
25 that are on the charter school's wait list

1
2 respectively. Finally, it is important to remember
3 that the holiday seasons reminds us about the
4 commitment to one another to help each other. Let
5 us remember that we are one family of diverse and
6 unique individuals, and as we celebrate this holiday
7 season, we must remain focused on the problems facing
8 our communities. Just this morning a 24-year-old and
9 a 25-year-old individuals were shot in my district at
10 140th Street and Fredrick Douglas Boulevard. To all
11 central staff, administrative staff, speaker staff,
12 my colleagues and their staff, but particularly my
13 staff, and my phenomenal Land Use staff--

14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: --a resounding
16 thank you for a year of dedicated work. I wish all a
17 very merry Christmas, a blessed Hanukkah, a blessed
18 Kwanzaa, a Happy New Year filled with peace, safety,
19 and good health. God bless us all.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet
21 in the chambers, please. Council Member Paul
22 Vallone.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you, Madam
24 Advocate. I rise today just to give everyone a
25 little bit more detail on where we have a press

1
2 conference today with Council Garodnick on the Drone
3 Bills that were introduced. I don't think there's a
4 topic that's been in the news more than the constant
5 infiltration [sic] of drones going on. There are two
6 separate bills. My bill is looking to place the
7 first regulations, as the FAA has done, to create
8 safe places. And make sure that the space above our
9 airports, above our hospitals, above our schools, and
10 places of interest like Freedom Tower that drones
11 aren't banned completely, but there are safe places
12 that they can be done such as in the parks and less
13 than 100 feet. So with Intro 601 that is our--we
14 have almost two dozen council members now signed on
15 to ban the drones in those regulated areas. And have
16 violations from \$250 to \$1,000 and a misdemeanor for
17 anyone knowingly using a drone with malicious intent
18 or over those areas. Thank you very much.

19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please, quiet in
21 the Chambers, please, please. Council Member Koo.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you Madam
23 Advocate. I want ask all my colleagues to support
24 Resolution 417, a resolution recognizing and
25 commemorating January 13 as Korean-American Day in

1
2 New York City. I want to thank Speaker Melissa Mark-
3 Viverito and a special-- and also the Chair of the
4 Cultural Committee, Speaker--not Speaker--Council
5 Member Van Bramer for their support. Finally, I
6 enjoy working with every one of you. So happy
7 holidays to each one. And also I want to thank all
8 the central staff for supporting us for doing good
9 work for New York City, for making lives better for
10 all New Yorkers. Happy holidays. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
12 Council Member Gibson.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you Madam
14 Public Advocate. I'd like to call my colleagues'
15 attention to two bills that I'm co-sponsoring with
16 Council Member Williams, Intro 606, which will
17 related to the Police Department issuing quarterly
18 reports on the use of force, and its relationship to
19 quality of life offenses. And Intro 607, which
20 relates to the creation of a police officer body worn
21 camera taskforce, and ask my colleagues to please
22 consider supporting those very important bills.

23 Today marks five months since the tragic
24 death of Eric Garner on Staten Island, and as a city
25 I know that we continue to pray for the Garner family

1
2 as no one should have to spend the holiday season
3 mourning the loss of a husband, father, uncle,
4 brother, and friend to many. It is important--

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
6 Quiet. Excuse me, council member. Please--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: My time is
8 running

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
10 council member.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: It is important
12 during this highly emotional and significant time in
13 our city that we continue to acknowledge the great
14 challenges that we face with the broken criminal
15 justice system that continues to be perpetuated by a
16 broken--broken windows and the systemic pattern of
17 discriminatory practices that disproportionately
18 impact communities of color. As the protests and
19 demonstrations continue throughout this time, I
20 continue to encourage and pray for non-violence,
21 peace and remaining united and focused on our goals.
22 Understand that no movement is successful by the
23 people's silence. The marches call to actions have a
24 very impactful role in this movement. Yes, black
25 lives matter, but all lives matter. And I also want

1
2 to acknowledge the incredible work of our public
3 servants in the Police Department. They work each
4 and every day to protect us. We do not condone nor
5 accept any acts of violence against anyone, and
6 condemn the recent acts of violence against police
7 officers. Let me be clear. The select few who think
8 violence is acceptable will cloud our path, and will
9 cause us to lose focus and be distracted.

10 I want to thank you Madam Public Advocate
11 and our Speaker and all of my colleagues, and most
12 importantly my constituents for their prayers for me
13 over the last few weeks. As we leave City Hall
14 today, I want to wish all of you a blessed and
15 amazing holiday season. Happy Hanukkah to my
16 colleagues. May this holiday season bring you
17 happiness, prosperity and a renewed spirit to
18 continue serving the needs of all New Yorkers. And
19 as I close, I want to thank our Speaker for--

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Could you please
21 bring your comments to a close, please council
22 member.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I want to thank
24 our Speaker for an amazing and productive first year
25 in the Council, and I want to thank all of the

1
2 incredible staff for their work. God bless you all,
3 and thank you so much, Madam Public Advocate.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
5 Council Member Kallos.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I rise today on
7 Introduction 593 for early voting for New York City
8 to allow two weeks of early voting in municipal
9 elections. Two-thirds of states in the United
10 States and Washington, D.C. currently offer early
11 voting, which makes it no wonder that we are
12 currently 46th in the nation for voter turnout. It's
13 time for New York City to join the rest of the nation
14 in allowing residents to vote when they want to vote,
15 not when we want them to vote. And according the
16 U.S. Census Bureau in 2010, 20% of non-voters said
17 the reason they didn't vote was because they were too
18 busy or could not get time off. It's time we
19 increase participation for allow New Yorkers to vote
20 early. Thank you to Council Member Constantinides,
21 and members of the Progressive Caucus for working
22 with me on this legislation. I hope all of you will
23 join on in signing Introduction 593.

24 I'm also very happy to be introducing
25 Introduction 594 with Council Member Helen Rosenthal

1
2 and Council Member Constantinides. There is a New
3 York State Court of Appeals decision, which is
4 something that some of the nerds in the room were
5 following and reading about hydrofracking, allowing
6 towns and municipalities to ban hydrofracking. And
7 in a symbolic gesture to stand with our brothers and
8 sisters in 80 municipalities throughout New York
9 State, we were introducing legislation to ban it.
10 The great news is as of today, a couple hours ago,
11 Governor Andrew Cuomo has announced he'll be banning
12 hydrofracking in New York State. This bill is a
13 testimony to our support for those municipalities and
14 gratitude to the Governor for his decision and
15 leadership. Introduction 594.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
17 Williams.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.
19 First, I want to recognize one of my legislative
20 interns, Jared Bowman, whose last day is today. He's
21 moving on to bigger, better, and brighter things. I
22 want to thank him so much for his service. I want to
23 bring our attention to my colleagues to a couple of
24 bills to which Council Member Gibson spoke of, which
25 I appreciate. Intro 605 would require the NYPD to

1
2 post on its website the number of successful and
3 failed chokeholds and seat belt holds, and Intro 608,
4 sponsored by myself and Council Member Vallone. It
5 would ban placing a GPS tracker on cars without
6 permission with the goal of eliminating GPS stalking.
7 And I also as we're moving into a new year, I just
8 want to make mention that we are in a conversation,
9 and it seems like the rhetoric is moving up into a
10 feverish and dangerous pitch. And my hope is that as
11 we move into the New Year we can be more careful with
12 our words. I started out last week being personally
13 responsible for gang violence in New York City, and I
14 ended up being responsible for discrimination and
15 support police brutality.

16 So, depending on who you speak to, you
17 get some different rhetoric. I do want to say I hope
18 the protests continue. I hope the police see
19 protestors who are human beings, and have a very
20 legitimate concern even though some people have
21 alleged them not having those concerns. And, I hope
22 the protestors see police officers who are human
23 beings in uniform who have a job to do. And I'm glad
24 that they are doing it, and just as not all of the
25 protestors are violent, not all police officers are

1
2 doing the things that we are trying to fight for. So
3 I hope they both see each other that way. I don't
4 hope that we remain calm. I think we have to be very
5 loud, but I do hope that we remain non-violent. I
6 also want to condemn all the acts of violence that
7 happened in the past few days. But this conversation
8 is very important, too important to get lost in
9 stupidity and rhetoric. And I hope in the New Year
10 coming we can begin to resolve some of these issues
11 with our generation. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
13 Council Member Levine.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam
15 Public Advocate. Today, Jewish communities
16 throughout New York City and around the world
17 celebrate the first of the eight-day festival of
18 Hanukkah, a time when we remember an ancient triumph
19 of freedom over oppression, and remember miracles
20 small and large. And we affirm the power of a single
21 light no matter how small to illuminate the darkness.
22 So I want to wish everyone [speaking foreign
23 language] Feliz Navidad, Merry Christmas, Happy
24 Kwanzaa, and Happy New Year. Thank you.

25

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
3 Council Member Barron.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam
5 Public Advocate. I want to call my colleagues'
6 attention to Reso 516, which I'm introducing, which
7 asks that there be a re-examination of the CERC
8 process so that it looks at the socio-economic
9 expanding of the communities in which proposed
10 development will come. And make provisions where
11 there's an adverse effect. So that there will be
12 some protections for the housing and for business for
13 persons who have been in that community, and that
14 they not be displaced.

15 Secondly, I want to join--ask you to join
16 with me in asking that the District Attorney of
17 Brooklyn conduct a preliminary hearing, which will
18 require that the police officer who killed Akai
19 Gurley be arrested. That the police officer be
20 arrested, and this is a requirement that can take
21 place before any grand jury looking at an indictment.
22 So often police officers do not suffer the same
23 procedures as regular citizens who commit crimes. And
24 we're asking that this officer be arrested and
25 charged. And finally, I want to wish all of my

1
2 colleagues a happy holiday, whatever holiday it is
3 that you celebrate. And I want to commend all of us
4 for our first year, and I think that we made some
5 great strides especially looking at the rules reforms
6 and other initiatives that we put forth. And I look
7 forward to going forward in the years to come, and
8 match that and surpass that. Thank you.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
10 Council Member Richards.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: For the past
12 six years New York has maintained a ban on hydraulic
13 fracking due an issue of uncertainty of risks
14 associated with this process. Considering the
15 state's location along the Marcellus Shale, many in
16 the industry eyed New York as a profitable market to
17 further their exploitation of natural gas preserves.
18 After a trip into Eastern Pennsylvania to visit a
19 community that initially welcomed the natural gas
20 industry, I was able to glimpse the environmental
21 health and societal devastation brought by fracking.

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
24 Chamber, please.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: The
3 contaminated groundwater, and the stories of growing
4 frustration from residents in our neighboring state
5 convinced me that this is not something that should
6 ever occur in New York State. Although today's
7 announcement came after years of speculation,
8 Government Cuomo decision--Governor Cuomo's decision
9 to finally ban hydraulic fracking--fracturing in New
10 York State is one of the most important announcements
11 of our time. In order to address and combat climate
12 change, legislators from local municipalities to the
13 federal government must draw the line and make
14 decisions to end our alliance on fossil fuels,
15 conspicuous consumption and conducting business as
16 usual.

17 Mahatma Gandhi said earth provides enough
18 to satisfy every man's needs, but every man's greed.
19 Our reliance upon natural gas or any other fossil
20 fuel is a step away from building a truly sustainable
21 and environmentally sound future. Ultimately, the
22 protection of the environment is the protection of
23 human life. I applaud once again Governor Cuomo and
24 his administration for making what history will
25 remember as the right decision.

1
2 I also would like to thank the Speaker
3 and this body who earlier in the year supported the
4 People's Climate March, which certainly signaled that
5 we are serious about standing for the people, and not
6 necessarily for the industry. I also would like to
7 acknowledge my intern, Mercedes Buchanan, who has
8 just joined my team. And also say that we, the
9 progressive have not burned this city down, and we've
10 done a phenomenal job in our first year. So thank
11 you Speaker for everything you're doing and all of my
12 colleagues. Have a happy holiday. So thank you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
14 Council Member Eugene.

15 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
17 Chambers, please.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you. Thank
19 you very much, Madam Public Advocate and my
20 colleagues. I would like to draw your attention to
21 Intro 587, which it will reform the system from which
22 the Taxi and Limousine Commission fines drivers and
23 collects formalities. [sic] Under the current
24 rules, drivers have 30 days to pay off the fine. If
25 they don't pay back, their license will be suspended.

1
2 And those drivers are very hard working people,
3 rendering a wonderful service to New Yorkers. We say
4 that if the City doesn't sleep, they don't sleep
5 also.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
7 Quiet in the Chambers, please.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: They try to make
9 a living for themselves, and for their families.
10 When their licenses are suspended, they cannot work.
11 They cannot have the money to pay back? How are they
12 going to do that? This bill will ask the Taxi and
13 Limousine Commission to create a payment plan in
14 order for them to pay back the fine. And also to
15 continue to work the system for their family. And
16 that will allow the Taxi and Limousine Commission to
17 collect the pay in a timely fashion. And I'm asking
18 all of my colleagues to support this introduction,
19 this bill. To conclude, let me wish to all my
20 colleagues a happy and blessed holiday. God bless
21 everybody in our city. [sic] Thank you very much.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
23 Council Member Cabrera.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Sorry. I want
25 to give a special thanks to Council Member Andy King,

1
2 Council Member Margaret Chin, Council Member Vanessa
3 Gibson, Council Member Laurie Cumbo. And also to the
4 rest of my colleagues who sent people yesterday, last
5 night at 6:30 for the Prayer Walk for Justice and
6 Peace who literally walked in the rain seven times
7 around. I want to let you know, colleagues, that you
8 have people out there who are praying for you. They
9 are praying for every single one of us. So will have
10 the wisdom that we need. One thing we do agree on
11 New Yorkers, 95% of New Yorkers we do believe in
12 prayer. And so, do know that we do have their
13 support out there.

14 I also want to congratulate Council
15 Member Kallos. I'm very excited about that bill that
16 he just introduced today, Intro 593. I think it's
17 time to get more voters to be able to vote. The
18 dismal numbers that we have right now really we can't
19 go another year having so few people voting. And I
20 want to wish everyone a merry Christmas, Happy
21 Hanukkah, Happy Kwanzaa. Have a good one. Enjoy
22 your Happy New Year.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
24 Dromm.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very
3 much Madam Public Advocate. I'd like to speak on
4 Intro 585, term limits for community board members.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
6 Quiet in the Chambers, please. I apologize, Council
7 Member.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Uh-huh.
9 Communities change, and it's time for our community
10 boards to reflect this change. That's why I'm
11 introducing, along with Council Member Kallos, a bill
12 that would limit community board members to six
13 terms. Twelve years is a long time in the life of
14 our city's ever-changing neighborhoods, and it is
15 certainly long enough for an individual to gain the
16 knowledge and experience to serve the district. This
17 bill will actually increase expertise on community
18 boards. So that the boards will be constantly
19 refreshed with members closest to the issues
20 impacting the district. It is worth noting that the
21 boards can and should continue to consider the
22 insight of former voting members, and include them on
23 board committees. Community boards represent
24 democracy in action, and term limits will allow more
25 of our neighbors to have a voice. I ask my

1
2 colleagues to join me in supporting this measure to
3 increase the responsiveness of community boards to
4 the communities they serve. Thank you very much.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 Council Member King. Quiet in the Chambers, please.
7 Quiet in the Chambers.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] Thank
9 you, Madam Public Advocate. I rise today just to
10 wish everyone a very enjoyable and healthy holiday.
11 I also want to say thank you to our pastor and
12 Council Member Fernando Cabrera for organizing us as
13 we walked around in prayer and changed and sang. We
14 go through struggles as council members each and
15 every day to provide service and better opportunities
16 for our constituents. And I think that the
17 challenges that we have in this great role requires
18 prayer from time to time to protect us from the evil
19 and the wickedness around the world. But I want to
20 also thank the Speaker for her leadership throughout
21 the year. A lot of us are still figuring out our
22 jobs, me included, and I'm grateful that her
23 leadership has allowed us to stay united on the
24 things that matter to not only this Chamber, but to
25 everyone outside of the Halls.

1
2 I also want to end the year saying to all
3 the staff that's been so helpful in helping me and
4 helping all of us get the job done each and every
5 day. Happy holidays. And thank you to all the
6 security that makes sure that our Speaker stays safe.
7 Thank you to each and every one of you. Again, Feliz
8 Navidad, Merry Christmas, Happy Kwanzaa, and Happy
9 Hanukkah, and blessed New Year to each and everyone
10 of us. God bless.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
12 Chambers. Council Member Johnson.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
14 Public Advocate. I rise today to briefly mention
15 Introduction 592, which is a law that would amend the
16 Administrative Code of the City of New York in
17 relation to the preservation of hotels. We have seen
18 many hotels that have been converted to luxury
19 condominium uses, and with that we have seen good
20 middle-class jobs with great protections and benefits
21 lost. And we need to ensure that we keep good
22 middle-class jobs in New York City. So this bill
23 would say that if you are a hotel with a more than
24 150 rooms, and you wanted to convert more than 20% of
25 your room space to a residential use, you would need

1
2 to be granted a waiver to do that. We have over 20
3 co-sponsors on the Introduction, and I would love for
4 my colleagues to sign on. I again want to thank all
5 of the staff here at the City Council. We can't do
6 our jobs without their tremendous hard work. And I
7 want to thank Speaker Mark-Viverito. It has been an
8 incredible year, a productive year. We've gotten a
9 huge amount of work done for the people of New York
10 City. And these chambers continue to be the people's
11 house. We listen to the public, and we do good work
12 impacting public policy in the City of New York. So
13 I am very proud of the legislative agenda, and what
14 we have accomplished this year. And I look forward
15 to having a more productive 2015. Happy Holidays to
16 all of my colleagues. It's an honor and privilege
17 every day to serve in this body, and I don't forget
18 that. Thank you very much.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. The
20 BLAC meeting immediately following the Stated Council
21 and for closing remarks, let me just say-- Oh,
22 Council Member Levine--Levin.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam
24 Public Advocate. I, too, want to wish my colleagues
25 and the entire City of New York a happy, healthy and

1 safe holiday season whatever holiday you celebrate.

2 And I, too, want to acknowledge a tremendous first

3 year for Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito in doing the

4 people's business honestly, justly. And with the

5 goal towards bringing as many services to those in

6 need as possible, and governing this city with an eye

7 towards justice and goodness. And with that, I thank

8 you very much, Madam Speaker. Happy holidays to all.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Happy holidays,

10 and again the BLAC meeting immediately following

11 Stated. I, too, want to thank the Speaker and the

12 Council for allowing me to preside over these Stated

13 Meetings, and also would like to say that all New

14 Yorkers mourn with Pakistan and the Pakistani New

15 Yorkers affected by the intentional targeting and

16 killing of at least 132 innocent children. At this

17 time when most of us share the love and company of

18 family and friends, let us not forget those who

19 suffer in Peshawar because of this senseless tragedy.

20 Let's keep them in our hearts and prayers. And now

21 to close, the Speaker of the City Council, Speaker

22 Melissa Mark-Viverito. Quite in the Chambers.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Public

24 Advocate Tish, and I did want to thank you for

1
2 presiding and being partners with us in governance of
3 this city. It was a good day today to not only hear
4 that Governor Cuomo is not allowing the fracking to
5 happen in New York State. It is also good news
6 [applause] to hear that the United States of America
7 will finally start normalizing with Cuba. [cheers]
8 And I'm happy to hear that as well. [applause] So
9 to again all, I hope to see you at the holiday party
10 coming up. Let's get ready to that. And again,
11 Happy Christmas, Merry Christmas, Happy Kwanzaa, and
12 Happy Hanukkah to all. Thank you so much.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We now stand
14 adjourned until January 7, 2015. [gavel]

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 24, 2014