

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

NOVEMBER 20, 2014

Start: 1:27 p.m.

Recess: 3:52 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Daniel R. Garodnick  
James Vacca  
Margaret S. Chin  
Stephen T. Levin  
Deborah L. Rose  
James G. Van Bramer  
Mark S. Weprin  
David G. Greenfield  
Costa G. Constantinides  
Carlos Menchaca  
I. Daneek Miller  
Antonio Reynoso

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Polly Trottenberg, Commissioner  
New York City DOT

Joshua Benson, Director  
Bicycle and Pedestrian Programs  
New York City DOT

John Frost, Executive, Director  
Bike Share Programs  
New York City DOT

Matt Berlin, General Manager  
New York City Bike Share, LLC

Dani Simons, Director  
Communication and External Affairs  
New York City Bike Share, LLC

Mary Beth Kelly  
Families for Safe Streets

Fabricio Ayora  
Make the Road New York, Amherst, Queens

Rachel Weski  
Bushwick, Brooklyn Resident

Paul Steely White, Executive Director  
Transportation Alternatives

Carol Wasser, Past President  
New York Cycle Club

Neal Weisman, President  
New York Cycle Club

Eric Mc Clure  
Street Paths, Park Slope Neighbors, and  
Parks Slope Safety Partnership

Peter Frishauf, Director  
Street Paths, NYC

Joshua Miller for President Chris Wojas  
Bike and Roll, New York City

Ken Podziba, President  
Bike New York

Joanna Altman-Smith  
Safe Streets Advocate

Brad Conover, Co-Founder  
Bike Upper Manhattan

Steve Vacarro, Attorney  
Law Firm of Vacarro and White

Keegan Stephan, Organizer  
Right-of-Way

Anthony Griffith  
Bus Industry Safety Council Member  
World Certified Director  
Safety and Security in the World Safety  
Organization

Hilda Cohen  
Kidical Mass, New York City

Martina Bravo, Member  
Immigrant Movement International and  
Women in Movement by We Bike

David Dartley  
Elena Santogade

Thomas Levitt, Appearing for Rod Taylor  
Friends of Morningside Park



[sound check]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good afternoon, everyone, and welcome to today's hearing of the City Council's Transportation Committee. I am Ydanis Rodriguez, the Chair of the Committee. And first, I would like to acknowledge my colleagues who are here Council Member Levin, Weprin, and Treyger.

Before we get into our topic today, I would like to say that I refer to that today the TLC brought an important rule regulating and transforming the industry. However, there is one area where this rule can be expanded. Base should be required to enter into a binding agreement with other Base. This will prevent an operating dissatisfaction [sic] in benefit bases and drivers alike. And I'm working with my staff to introduce legislation that will require this agreement through local law. With this agreement, Driver's Base and Insurance Services all will win.

And in relation to our hearing topic today, this past September Bicycling Magazine named New York in the United States the most bike-friendly city and we are. We have the largest population of bike commuters in the country. More and more people

are deciding to use bikes to review the city's carbon footprint. Between 2007 and 2011, the number of bike commuters on our streets doubled. We have the largest population of bike commuters in the country. We also have great bike shops and bike clubs as well as world-class bike events such as the Five Borough Bike Tour. And more recently, we have the largest bike share system in North America. But just because we are number one, does not mean that we can become complacent.

If New York is to remain the world-class city that it is, we must keep up with our growing and changing population. Too many communities in our city lack easy access to transportation resources. We must explore how biking can connect these communities to the ready assistance of that network. We need to significantly and smartly invest in a diverse transportation system that gives people options, most people and efficiently serve the entire city. And, of course, keeps people safe. That's why this committee has focused recently on the urgent need for an investment in mass transit. Not only must we invest dollars, we must invest time to make sure that we develop an even bigger culture

surrounding bikes in our city. More than 500,000 New Yorkers use bikes at least several times a month. Mayor de Blasio has said that by 2020 biking will comprise 6% of all transit trips in the city. And we are committed to work with this administration to accomplish this goal. To me, that ambitious goal while maintaining a safe and efficient network of roads for all users, we need to lay the foundation for a connected network throughout all areas of our city, not just the downtown center.

Since 2006, the DOT has installed, or is in the process of constructing over 438 miles of bike lanes. We look forward to hearing more about DOT's plan regarding bike lanes expansion today. Bike lanes particularly protected bike lanes are invaluable for cyclists, and have a potential to make the streets safer for all. I am committed to working with DOT to ensure that protected bike lanes like all the street changes and other projects, which will affect local neighborhoods, are planned and installed with proper collaboration between the City, the local communities, especially the community boards as DOT has been working with them so far.

Other cities have heavily invested in expanding and installing protected bike lanes. We should follow the model and aim to protect our cyclists should we want usage of these lanes. Of course, under the aim of Vision Zero, street safety has become the foremost concern of this Committee. This Council and this Administration, especially our Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito and Mayor Bill de Blasio. We are keenly aware of how vulnerable cyclists are on roads largely designed for an era in which cars were the overwhelming focus. We can always do more especially when it comes to a street designed to protect our cyclists. We must always keep in mind the safety of our pedestrians. Drivers and cyclists must consistently follow the rules of the road if we are going to achieve the Vision Zero goal of a safe city for all. The vision is of a streetscape where pedestrians, cyclists, and drivers can safely coexist. It can be achieved with a commitment from everyone involved.

Thank you to the representatives from the Outer Bike Share for coming to today's hearing. I look forward to hearing from you and the DOT, and your plans for the future of Citi Bike. You now



operate the largest bike share system in the county, and with that comes great responsibility. We look forward to hearing about how some of the problems that have affected the Citi Bike Share system are going to be fixed, and how you plan to expand your services to the community that needs more transportation resources, the Outer Borough of our city. Again, this will be an important instance where meaningful collaboration with local communities will be critical along with effective communication and responsiveness to Citi Bike's customers.

An ever-growing city needs a growing transportation system to match. That's why we need to do more to ensure that cyclists continue to be a visible and safe option for New Yorkers. Today's hearing mark the beginning over the Council's oversight concerning biking in New York. I look forward to a future joint hearing with Public Safety Committee and the Consumer Affairs Committee to further oversee the regulations and enforcement of those regulations for our ever-expanding bike rental programs. Further, cycling is among the healthiest and greenest forms of transportation out there.

I very much look forward to discussing all of these and more at today's hearing. I would like to thank everyone here for being with us today, in particular the DOT Commissioner and the representative from Bike Share, the Project Manager for Citi Bike from Alta. I now invite the Commissioner to deliver her opening statement following the affirmation from my Committee Counsel.

COUNSEL KELLY TAYLOR: This is Committee Counsel Kelly Taylor. Will you please raise your right hand? Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before the committee, and to respond honestly to Council Member questions? Thank you.

[Pause]

All right. Ready to go? Okay. Good afternoon, Chairman Rodriguez and members of the Transportation Committee. My name is Polly Trottenberg, and I'm the Commissioner of the New York City Department of Transportation. Today, I'm joined by Joshua Benson, Director of Bicycle and Pedestrian Programs, and John Frost, Executive Director of DOT's Bike Share Programs. Thank you for having us here today to discuss cycling in New York City. As the

title of this hearing suggests, and the Chairman's comments echo, New York City Has become a leader in cycling nationally. All of our hard work has been recognized by Bicycling Magazine, which recently named New York City as the best biking city in the U.S. This is an exciting honor and a testament to the groundbreaking innovation, vision, determination, and careful implementation of New York City's Bicycle Program. It is also due to the strong support of our City's elected leadership and the tireless advocacy community.

Cycling is a mode of transportation, which is inexpensive to own and operate, burns no fuel, emits no carbon, helps tackle obesity, connects people to their communities, and let's face it, brings joy. New Yorkers love to cycle, and they bring an energy and passion that is unique to this city. In recent years, we've seen tremendous growth in cycling in New York City. Cycling is more than quadrupled from 2002 to 2013. Over, 340,000 trips per day are made by bikes in New York City, and nearly 30,000 of those trips are now made using Citi Bike. New Yorkers today can ride on 960 miles of bike lanes, including 650 miles of on-street lanes,

of which 35 are protected-- 35 miles of protected lanes. And the remaining 310 lanes from our greenways, parks, and bridges.

New Yorkers have also embraced Bike Share with nearly 90,000 annual members taking over 14 million trips since May of 2013. Bike Share has become an integral part of the City's transportation system, and a world-class amenity, and the program will double in size by the end of 2017. However, even with all the progress we've made so far, DOT is planning to aggressively pursue Mayor de Blasio's ambitious goal of doubling cycling trips in New York City by 2020. To achieve this, we must continue to quickly expand the City's bike lane network and successfully roll out the next phase of Bike Share. We're committed to building 50 miles of bike lanes citywide year, and this calendar year we've already installed 42 miles including five miles of protected bike lanes such as the recently completed protected lane on Lafayette Street in Manhattan.

New Yorkers are calling for more protected bike lanes, and you can understand why. They are safe, innovative, and increasingly the standard used in cycling cities throughout the world.

We are continuing to build our bike network beyond the Central Business District. Such as the two-way fully protected lane on Paerdegat Avenue in Canarsie; the Franklin Avenue bike lane extension in Crown Heights; the 106th Street lane spanning East Harlem; and the upcoming Fort George Hill two-way protected lane in Washington Heights. We are also working intensively at the neighborhood level in communities such as Brownsville, East New York, Long Island City, and Ridgewood to build bike networks customized to community needs. And we are very excited about the newest Neighborhood Initiative we've just kicked off with Council Members Reynoso and Espinal in Bushwick.

To get to the Mayor's goal of doubling cycling trips, we know we have to continue to up our game. And one big way to do that is by improving bike access on our bridge network. Our bridges are a critical component of the transportation system in here island city, and are especially important access points for the bicycle network. Our four East River bridges carry more than 19,000 bike trips per day, and we've always placed an emphasis on access to and from those bridges. Today, I'm announcing DOT's Bikes on Bridges Campaign, a renewed and expanded

look at New York City's bridges, and how they can accommodate increased and safer cycling.

We hear a lot from cyclists particularly in the Bronx about the Harlem River crossings. So we will be studying each of the 15 Harlem River crossings and their Bronx and Manhattan approaches and depth. The study will yield recommendations for network improvements we can make in the short term, and will guide future capital investments as we rehabilitate the bridge structures in the long term. With these improvements, we can significantly enhance the cycling experience in Upper Manhattan and the Bronx.

Also on the bridge front, I have some other exciting news to share. We're going to be working with the MTA on a Bikes on Buses Pilot for some key bus routes. This will consist of adding for the first time ever on a New York City Transit Bus a bike rack on the front of the bus where the customer loads and unloads their bike. The pilot is just in its preliminary stages, and we will need to work closely with the MTA and get input from bus drivers and cyclists. But I think the celebration of the 50th Anniversary of the Verrazona Bridge would be the

ideal time to pilot this program on an needed crossing for the bike network. And as the network grow across the City, we have been diligent about adding bike parking to keep up with the increased ridership. We now have over 22,000 bike racks including 46 multi-rack bike corrals. DOT also administers the Bikes in Buildings Program, which currently covers nearly 350 buildings and provides access for over 6,500 bicycles.

Let me now turn to safety. Even as we expand cycling in the city, DOT remains focused on the Mayor's Vision Zero goals of reducing traffic injuries and fatalities to zero. While the overall trend in cyclist safety over the last ten years is headed in the right direction, tragically this year, and the Chairman mentioned, we've seen 18 bicyclist fatalities due to crashes. So our work on cyclist safety remains urgent as ever at DOT.

Nearly ten years ago, New York City released the landmark report *Bicyclist Fatalities and Serious Injuries in New York City* that looked into the causes of these incidents. The report created a robust set of guiding principles that helped shape DOT's work and propel New York to become a national

leader in cycling. The time has come to update the fatality and injury report, and we plan to release a new version in 2015 with new data to enable a fresh review of bike safety informed by our experiences over the last ten years as well as the experiences in other great cycling cities. Studies around the world have found that greater bicycle use coincides with a stronger cycling safety record. A greater presence and visibility of cyclists on city streets habituates motorists, pedestrians, and cyclists themselves to the presence of regular bicycle traffic.

In September, DOT released a new study that shows that on streets with protected bicycle lanes injuries for all roadway users declined by 20%. The results confirm the safety benefits of protected bicycle lanes here in New York, and DOT is committed to adding five miles of protected bike lanes each year. As part of our Vision Zero efforts, well-designed bike lanes also protect pedestrians by including refuge islands, which shortened the crossing distances of wide avenues, and trees, which humanize the street and signal to motorists that the area is residential. They can also include priority left



turn lanes, and signals, which deter conflicts between motorcyclists and pedestrians.

While the City's bike lane network clearly makes riding on our streets safer, a helmet can dramatically reduce injury in the event of a crash. DOT fits and gives away the official New York City bicycle helmet at events throughout the city and has distributed nearly 125,000 free helmets since 2007. We have conducted many helmet giveaways with community partners, and many of you here at the City Council. And while we're focused on cyclist safety, we are also concerned about the two recent pedestrian deaths caused by cyclist crashes in Central Park this past summer. We have worked with our partners at NYPD, the Parks Department, and the Central Park Conservancy to find a solution that would create a safer and more enjoyable environment for everyone in the park.

Earlier this week, we announced we would be lowering the speed limit from 25 to 20 miles per hour for all modes of transportation, and we will be shortening four pedestrian crossings with the worst crash histories. We will also be distributing our Bike Smart brochures, and Central Park specific

safety brochures geared toward cyclists and pedestrians.

Let me now turn to Citi Bike. At the beginning of the year, it was clear that all New Yorkers loved Citi Bike. The system was facing financial and operational challenges. And from day one, the de Blasio Administration focused on fixing this. The Administration's priority was to improve service, and accountability for the riders of the system all while keeping it privately funded. Our effort is resulting in a new ownership with a proven transportation leader, Jay Walder at the helm, and a guaranteed infusion of \$30 million. These funds will help stabilize the system's software and equipment, and double its size from its current 330 stations and 6,000 bikes to over 700 stations and 12,000 bikes by the end of 2017. For the first time, the program will extend to Queens. The agreement provides for an expansion of 1,000 bikes into Long Island City as well as Greenpoint, Williamsburg, and North Bedford-Stuyvesant by the end of 2015. After that, the expansion will continue contiguously up the east and west sides of Manhattan into Harlem and into Cobble Hill, Durham Hill, Prospect Heights, Carroll Gardens,

Gowanus, Park Slope, Red Hook, Crown Heights in Brooklyn and Astoria in Queens by the end of 2017.

DOT will be conducting an extensive community outreach process in these areas, and will work with elected officials, community board and local groups to site the new bike stations. We will hold community-planning workshops at community boards throughout the expansion zones. And we are already encouraging New Yorkers to use our Suggest a Station portal online at NYC.gov/bike share. We are also thrilled that Alta Bike Share will be moving its national headquarters from Portland to New York City creating well paying jobs for New Yorkers under the leadership of New York City General Manager Matt Berlin, who I know you'll be hearing from today.

We expect the customer's experience to be greatly improved. Although New Yorkers love the program, we often hear concerns about bike availability, functionality of the docking stations and the accuracy of the real time app. I know Matt will be addressing those issues, and will speak to them in more detail in his testimony. There will be an new sustainable pricing model for Citi Bike, which will support the improved system and operations. And

I'm proud to say we're continuing the \$60 membership for NYCHA residents, and members of participating credit unions. And we will be working closely with NYCHA to spread the word to residents about this affordable membership in both the current and expanded bike share service area.

To summarize, cycling in New York City has never been safer, easier, and more popular. But at DOT and in the de Blasio Administration we pledge nonetheless to continue to grow and improve cycling throughout the city. Thank you, Chairman Rodriguez, and members of the Committee. We would be happy to take your questions.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, Commissioner. I would also like to recognize Council Members Van Bramer, Lander, and Rose. I have a few questions, but I will the rest of my colleagues. One is about our 2030 Plan, Bike Lane Plan that we have as a City. Is the City on track to meet the biking goals by the current and previous administration including completing 1,800 miles of bike lanes by 2030? That bicycling will comprise 6% of all trips in the city by 2020 and installing the 4,000-meter rack by converting all parking meters to miles? [sic]

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'm happy to say I think we are on track to meet those very ambitious goals. And certainly, I know we're going to be hearing today from some of the advocacy community who are going to want us to move even more aggressively. I think that's a discussion that the de Blasio Administration will be having as part of our ten-year capital discussion, and one we will very much look forward to having with Council Members as well.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I don't know. Maybe Joshua can give a quick answer to that. He's the person tracking every mile.

JOSHUA BENSON: Sure. We have about in the mid 900s of miles of bike network out there right now, and we're adding about 50 miles per year. So, you know, we'll be braking 1,000 very soon.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Do you expect that we will be able to--

JOSHUA BENSON: To meet the 2030 target, absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

JOSHUA BENSON: Yeah, and, you know, I think as we get closer it's going to evolve, and we may well, as the Commissioner mentioned, decide to do more than that as a city. And that's something for further discussion, but we're certainly on track to meet the existing commitments.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, on the protect land-- lanes, what will it take in order for us to continue expanding the protection, the protecting lanes in our city?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Yeah, and right now, DOT is committed to doing five miles or protecting lanes a year. And just a reminder in Manhattan, that's the equivalent of about 100 city blocks. And, you know, there is a fair amount of intensive work that goes into a safely designed, protected bike lanes. We work with community groups. We work with our engineers. We work with merchant groups. There is a lot of work that goes into getting it right, and work that we think is very, very important. So that as we build out the network we have the communities' support, and the merchant support that we need. If we want to accelerate that rate, and I'm sure you will hear today from folks

that want to do that, I think that's a discussion for us. At some point, I think with our existing resources we think we're moving as aggressively as we can, and New York City is moving more aggressively than any other city in the country. If we're going to really take it to the next level at some point, again we're going to have to talk about additional resources and additional personnel if we're going to make a big leap in the growth of the program of the protected bike lanes.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But I just hope that you know that we will continue working together. So with that role, I remember like my last semester in City College, in '93 I did it in Fudan University in China. In Shanghai in '93 like most of those bike lanes, they were a protected lane already. And I just hope that especially in a city where, as I was told by someone in the streets saying that the culture of bikes is something that we've been growing in the last decade So from the interest of the cyclists but also the pedestrian like we need to protect those other lanes. And I just hope that as we, especially in the Progressive Caucus, we were committed, and many of us, to allocate one \$1 million

each to expand the expansion of a bike program through out community. But also, we look on the importance including as a priority the protected lanes.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Mr. Chairman, we would certainly welcome capital contributions, but again also, there is a lot of community work that needs to go on. Putting in protecting bike lanes in the dense roadways of New York City obviously we want to work closely with the community boards, with local residents, with merchants. And that's another area where we would welcome your partnership, and your leadership.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: When you, when we, you know, from the cyclists group, I know that they were very happy in knowing that our city became recognized as the one that has the best program. When you heard the news, or when you looked at the magazine, what was like the most important area that you look at say, even though we celebrate that we are the best one, there are two or three areas where we still should improve when it came to like the--

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]  
I think actually you touched up them in your opening



statement. I think New York has made really remarkable strides in becoming a cycling city. And one of the things that if you read the magazine what I really liked about it is that it basically said it's just miraculous that it's New York that they've gotten this far. That a city this dense and complex was able to do this. I mean clearly I think from the Administration's two big focuses for us is continuing to build the network out further and further into the other parts of the city. And moving up through the rest of Manhattan and into all the other boroughs. And if you look at our bike network map, you can see where it extends, and you can see the areas that right for further expansion. The other area that we've all touched upon is safety. Cycling in New York has become ever safer, but that's not an area where we're ever going to rest again. We're going to be doing in-depth study and looking at how we can continue to drive down fatality numbers.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So let's now call our colleagues, and we will be putting on five, the time five minutes as you know that we also have another meeting later on. So we would like to be sure that we got enough time to ask the questions for

advocates to be able to share their testimony. So first Member Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very, Mr. Chairman for convening the hearing.

Commissioner, it's wonderful to have you here, to have you as a constituent as well. And especially to have you continuing the expansion of an ever safer and more used bicycle infrastructure in the City. That is something that we're in a very different place in New York City a decade ago or even five years ago both in terms of what was getting built out and popular support for it. And I just really appreciate you and your teams continuing. There's a lot more to do as you said, but we're-- You know, we're on a steady path of improvement.

Let me start with Bike Share. First, I'm obviously very happy that the transaction is done and Mr. Walder will be leading the organization and that we can move forward this phased expansion. So that's great. I am obviously also very happy that many parts of my district are included in phase 2. And, of course, we're eager to work together. As I have said before, I think the Interactive Planning Tools that DOT has been using on safety projects like 4th

Avenue in my district as well as on Bike Share siting is a real model for engaging communities. Not only online but physically out in the neighborhoods and real planning efforts. So I'm glad to hear that's part of the process. I'm glad the \$60 fee for the housing low-income residents remains. You know, I am-- and I'm glad to see all of that was done with the same model. Basically, it's a higher membership fee, but still, you know, using the model that was originally established. But I do also want to get to phase 3. Folks in Windsor Terrace and Kensington don't want to wait five or eight years to get included. And so, I want to understand how much of that is planning, and how much of that is resources. Because I continue to believe that if what's necessary there is no other city in the world that's building out its bike share network without any public funds. And if what's necessary is to achieve the expansion we want to all neighborhoods regardless of income that makes sense within the network. If that takes public resources, it's a public transportation infrastructure, and we should be willing to do it. So help me understand how much of the phasing is logistical, whether additional

resources could drive it. And how we just keeping forward so that it doesn't take 20 years to building out the bike share network that the city needs.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: I really think there are three steps. And step number one is logistical, technical or whatever you want to say. And I'm happy to say I have gotten to spend some time with Jay Walder and really talk to him about his vision for bike share in New York City and bike share across the county. And he's heard from me some of the things that I think are big priorities for the de Blasio Administration and that I've heard from all of you. And that that I've just heard from New Yorkers in my travels. Number one is fixing the existing system. There are, and I'm sure Matt will talk some about that today in his testimony. So number one is getting that right, fixing the software, fixing the equipment, fixing the docking stations. Making sure that when New Yorkers or visitors use our system that they have a smooth and easy experience. That their credit cards work, that the bike will go back in the dock that the equipment is in good working order. I think Jay has got a great vision about how to get there, but that's going to take some work.

Step number two is clearly going into the areas that we have already delineated as our phase two areas, and you need them more in your district, and some of the other members here. And I think we're going to be on track to do it again. That's contractually guaranteed by the end of 2017. But one thing that Jay and I did discuss is that we agree with you. That doesn't mean we're not going to be thinking ahead to phase 3, and that we're not going to try and do everything we can even faster. He's as interested in doing that as we are.

For now, as you know, my Mayor has made it a principle that this is not going to be a taxpayer-funded program. And I've heard from many members of the Council that yes but in some point in terms of the expansion, might we want to put public money in? I think we're not ready to make an announcement on that today, but certainly we want to press ahead on phase 3 and look at all the questions that are going to arise. How we're going to do siting. Where we exactly want to go in our notional half moon there, and what would be the funding arrangement that would make sense. But I am happy to say I think we have a commitment very much from Jay

and from Alta to be thinking onto the next phase in tackling all the challenges that we'll present ourselves to get us there. You know, one thing my Mayor said to me, and I said to me-- He said to me, This needs to be a five borough system, and I'm looking at you to figure out how to do that.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And that's great to hear. And look, it's not that we want to put public dollars into it. It's that we want the system built out on a reasonable timeframe regardless. Obviously, there is logistical concerns about where stations make sense, but I think they make sense, from my point of view, all over the city. And we want that to be possible regardless of the income of the residents of that neighborhood. So if it's necessary to get a comprehensive and equitable system in a reasonable time, then let's do it. So it's good to hear that there is thinking going on about that.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: There is. I will just add, thought, that your district is one that we'll be siting a lot of new stations. And obviously, we look forward to the help and leadership of council members.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Absolutely.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I think as we move out perhaps from the very densest part of the Manhattan Station side, it will get a little easier, but it's always going to be a lively subject.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: If I could just ask my question and then I'm done. I have many more, but I am just going to ask one more. I'm glad to see the Bikes on Bridges Plan, and I just-- You didn't say it specifically in your testimony, but I hope that will include a look at the Brooklyn Bridge. Which you and I spoke about in the past that my office did a little study on that is crowded especially on nice sunny and somewhat warmer days than some of these dangerous. And we need, whether it's an engineering solution that expands the path or some additional approach to making the Brooklyn Bridge bike lane and pedestrian way safer. So I hope that will be part of the Bikes on Bridges study process.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We are going to take a look at that. I will flag the engineering challenges are profound, and one tip I would say in the short run is the Manhattan Bridge has a lot of capacity on it for cycling. At least on the Brooklyn

side they're pretty close. A little more spread out on the Manhattan side, but we will be taking a look at that.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: In that direction, I would like also for you to look at the 223 Bridge crossing from Manhattan to Riverdale. I know that in the past there were like some challenges to improve the condition for cyclists. And that's important to be sure that the residents or Riverdale are able to cross that bridge.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Yes, that will be on our list.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Treyger.

[Pause]

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you. Welcome Commissioner. Thank you for having me. I'm not an official member of the Committee, but certainly there are issues that are relevant to my district, and I think other vulnerable communities. I would like to just ask some questions. I happen to chair a different Committee, the Recovery Resiliency Committee in the City Council. And I'm just



wondering has there been discussions, coordination between DOT, the Office of Recovery and Resiliency, and Bill Goldstein, the Mayor's Senior Advisor on Sandy, with regards to resiliency planning in the most vulnerable neighborhoods? One of the things that we are looking at is modes of transportation in areas that were hit hard by Super Storm Sandy. As we know, many cars were flooded out, and there were-- People had to rely on different modes of transportation. The subway system was hard hit. No question about that. But there were also, there were bikers who were able to use bikes to help others and so forth. Many of the maps that we've seen so far, I'm seeing all the most vulnerable areas included in the vision in the planning. I'm just wondering if you can comment on that, and the level of discussion so far with the Office of Recovery and Resiliency. Thank you.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: That's a good question. I'm happy to say we do a lot of our work in very close coordination with Bill Goldstein, and the Office of Resiliency and Recovery. And we are really striving as we build out all the City's infrastructure, roadways and everything else to have

resiliency in our mind in the design and planning. I actually want to turn to Joshua to give you a little more detail in what we're doing in some of the neighborhoods you're talking about.

JOSHUA BENSON: Yeah, I think one of the best examples we can give right is in Rockaway. First off, we have worked with the Parks Department to create, to recreate the boardwalk after it was destroyed in Super Storm Sandy and the roadway. So we created a temporary boardwalk there to get people that mobility back immediately. So they could walk and bike comfortably along the beach. And you have a whole Jamaica Bay greenway study that we have kicked off in the last year where we're looking at all the opportunities around Jamaica Bay not only in Rockaway, but including Broad Channel, and some of the other communities in Brooklyn that are adjacent to Jamaica Bay. So I think a lot of that work is going to lead to some great new resiliency efforts. Part of that we have already-- The Commissioner mentioned in her testimony the new bike lane on Paerdegat Ave. is part of that effort. So it's already bearing fruit, and I think we're going to keep pushing in that direction as we go forward.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I mean we have, and I definitely appreciate the fact that Rockaway is definitely one of the most vulnerable neighborhoods. But I would also include in that Coney Island as well in Southern Brooklyn. And I would definitely like to work with your office to make sure that we are building up our resiliency efforts as far as different modes of transportation in and out of the most vulnerable neighborhoods. Particularly, there are many people who came from other parts of the state to help us in Coney Island. To make sure they have access and to help us, and also help us get out and evacuate. So I would definitely like to work with your offices on that measure.

I'd like to also just mention you might have heard about the new Bike Safety Bills that are being introduced in the Council. A couple of things that surprised me that I would like to share and just get your reaction and comments. First of all, I witnessed something on Stillwell Avenue where a bicyclist was texting while biking and almost caused a collision. But what really got me was that there was no regulation currently in the State of New York concerning this issue. But, in the same reports

we've found that there were over 400 tickets written to bicyclists while carrying a phone. Have you had conversations with NYPD about what exactly have they been enforcing where there is no current law that prohibits this type of thing?

COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Well, we're aware of your legislative effort and some of the others. And we have been in a dialogue with NYPD in general about how we enhance enforcement. You know, as part of Vision Zero the guiding philosophy is that everyone needs to engage in safe behavior on our roadways, motorists, cyclists, and pedestrians. And part of that is enforcement, but part of that is also education. It's culture change, it's reminding all New Yorkers about their role in creating a safe transportation system. So as you know there are a lot of nuances to the way the State and Local Laws interact. And the NYPD and how they allocate their enforcement resources. But, yeah, we're in an ongoing dialogue about how we do what is the most sensible and appropriate job of education and enforcement of all the users of the roadway.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And I appreciate the education because that's what the bills actually

help establish. But I am surprised to learn as well that the City of New York has not had an official bike safety program. [bell] In the state for example, they partner with groups to provide defensive driving courses and so forth to promote driver's safety. But I know that in New York City there are some awful non-profits that might provide some courses. But nothing at the citywide level like getting citywide coordination. And the measures that we're trying to put forward would be actually the least. As far as the ban on the texting and biking and using the cell phones is that it's the least punitive in the country. What's being considered in California as more punitive. The ban in Chicago. There is no bike safety class. It's just pay a penalty. We're trying to promote education here. More and more New Yorkers-- As you mentioned, more and more New Yorkers are using bikes, which I think is a good thing. But what are we doing to make sure that we're providing them the right educational tools to promote and support responsible safe cycling?

Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes. Thank you.

Council Member Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you very much, Mr. Chair, and I want to number one say thank you, Commissioner Trottenberg for your amazing leadership, and it's been great working with you with all of your team. And I want to say how excited I am about the 50 new miles of bike lanes per year, and I'm anxious to have as much of that in my district as possible. Maybe 49 miles we'll settle for. But I did want to ask if you have a breakdown of where you plan to go with those 50 new miles, and where does Queens, and obviously in particular Western Queens, but does Queens fit in?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Actually, maybe Josh can give you the details on that. Western Queens is a big piece of the puzzle, but I do just want to say we really are, as I mentioned to an earlier question, we really are trying to branch out to all parts of the city. And we do really want to be five boroughs. We love Western Queens. We want to get further into Eastern Queens. So that is really one of our goals. Again, working with local communities every step of the way to build that network out, and maybe Josh can give a little more specifics on the 50 miles.

JOSHUA BENSON: Sure. So, yeah, we've actually done quite a bit of work in my own city over the last year working with Community Board 2. And we're planning to continue that into next year. We don't feel like we're done yet, and I don't think your constituents feel like we're done yet either. So that's a big part of it. Ridgewood, Queens we've been working kind of on a neighborhood level. The similar idea there is what we've been doing in my own city. So you're going to see more work there. Brownsville and East New York we've been working hand-in-hand with the community there. We're looking to work in Council Member Ferreras' district in the Corona area in the coming year. So it's kind of a new model for us that we really have gotten a lot of success with. Is going in and building at the super local level. Getting the input and customizing the network to the needs of the community. So those are the communities. We're already working with Bushwick, too, the Commissioner mentioned in her testimony.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Great, and can I just interrupt--

2 JOSHUA BENSON: [interposing] And that's  
3 not to say we only will work in those communities.  
4 Those are the ones who are actively going.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Yes.

6 JOSHUA BENSON: So if there are more  
7 council members who want to help us get something  
8 started in their district, we'll be happy to do so.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: [interposing]  
10 Absolutely, and I know you know this. No one loves  
11 Long Island City more than I do, but I also want  
12 Astoria, Sunnyside, and Woodside included in  
13 everything we do. Speaking of which both the Chair  
14 and Council Member Lander talked about the expansion  
15 of Bike Share. And the willingness on the part of  
16 some of us to invest capital should that be necessary  
17 and make sense to do so. And I really want to make  
18 sure that we bring Bike Share out to Sunnyside, have  
19 docking stations under the arches of the 7 Train. I  
20 think that would be brilliant, and I want you to know  
21 that I am committed as are my colleagues to making  
22 that happen. And so, I just want to say that because  
23 we are grateful, and we are so thrilled that we're  
24 going to get the bikes on Long Island City including  
25 in Queens Bridge, the largest public housing



development in the country. That is great. But as that bubble expands and goes east, we want to make sure that it's all throughout Sunnyside, Woodside, and, of course, all of Queens and all of the neighborhoods. But forgive me if I am a little bit more in love with Sunnyside, Woodside and Long Island City and Astoria.

I do want to ask about the Pulaski Bridge, because at the last Transportation Committee meeting we I think make some news with the fact that the contract was going to be registered, and we were going to move forward with construction. So, now our next Transportation Committee meeting maybe we will have an update on where we're at with Pulaski.

JOSHUA BENSON: Yeah, we are-- We actually just had a preconstruction meeting with the contractor. The contract was, indeed registered. We expect them to start construction next year, and finish next year. So it's the first job on an 11-job package.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So exciting when you say next year. There are 12 months in that year. Can we--

JOSHUA BENSON: [interposing] So we have--

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER? --narrow it down a little bit?

JOSHUA BENSON: --we have 14 months from the date of the MTP, which was earlier this month to finish the work. So they will be, they will be complete before the end of next year.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: When do you think construction could begin?

JOSHUA BENSON: The construction could begin as soon as, you know, they find their field office. And, you know, there's a few little logistical things to take care of but you know, I think early next year.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: That's great news. I wanted to just finish on Queens Boulevard, which is a great place always to begin and end. Obviously, we're all committed to Vision Zero and Queens Boulevard in my district, and really all throughout Queens. It has long been a place where we needed to focus more after it's-- And, obviously you've done a lot, and we're very, very pleased that the speed limit has been lower. And thank you,

Commissioner, for your leadership. But as part of your broader study of a safer Queens Boulevard [bell]-- And I'm one who firmly believes that everyone is safer when there are more bicyclists on our street, more bike lanes, and I believe that. Do you think that, and is it part of your taking a look at Queens Boulevard, to contemplate how to make Queens Boulevard safer. Where are you at with the bike lane, or some kind of access there that would make it safer for all.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: I just want to say particularly thanks for the question on the issue of Queens Boulevard and the speed limit. This is one actually where some thanks goes to the Mayor. He in particular has also personally focused on Queens Boulevard and talked to me and our department about what can we do. And speed limit is one of the things we've talked about. But, yes as you've pointed out, Council Member Van Bramer, we are looking at a larger re-design of the street. And, yes we are definitely looking at how we could make a bike lane work there. That said, there are a lot of things we have to figure out in terms of the engineering, and the community work. But it is, yes, it is part of our

analysis for sure, and I think we're making some progress in coming up with some of the solutions.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Great. Just continue to include me as a partner. I am a cyclist, you know, a big fan of a lot of folks in the audience here. And I look forward to working with our community board, which has come a long way in a short time to be incredibly bike-friendly. And I just look forward to continuing that work with you, with your department, and everybody in the audience. So thank you very much.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

Before calling the next council member to ask questions, I would like to ask a question from a constituent who sent the question through Twitter, which was, when will the City expect to be compensated from the parking space? And this is all related to that Alta agreed to split any profit, any profit from the Citi Bike with the City? The question is when do you expect, or when do we expect of the city that we will see profit?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Right and just to be clear, I think I'll talk about what the

contract has been in the past, and now what it will be going forward. In the past, there was a profit sharing agreement. But Alta never made any profit. In fact, it was losing a significant amount of money. So the city garnered no profits there. Going forward, we simplified the profit sharing agreement. It was previously going to be calculated as what the net profits would be, and that was going to be a very complicated analysis. We're not going to do a smaller piece of gross profits, if those should come. I think Alta is confident that they will turn a profit at some point. I can't tell you when, though. I think it is too soon as we do this rollout to say when that will come, but if it comes, the City will eventually get a piece of that outside.

In terms of the parking, the previous agreement was that Alta would compensate the City for lost parking revenue. But if it turns out the way the contract was drafted that was a fairly complex question, because there were contractual requirements about how much the city had to try and minimize the loss of parking. So in truth I was asked many times what was that number. A number was never

established, and give that Alta was losing so much money it seemed a little bit beside the point.

Going forward what we have agreed is that Alta will compensate the City a flat million dollars a year for lost parking. And that they will work closely with us going forward. Again, this is something else I talked to Jay Walder about. To really minimize the taking out of parking both for the convenience of motorists around the city, and also to minimize the revenue lost to the city. So that's something we're committed to try and do a good job on. I don't know, John if you have anything to add to that.

JOHN FROST: I have nothing.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And as I said before, even to the previous Administration, Citi Bike is a great program. We have sponsors of Citi Bike throughout the whole city. I know that you are committed to continue working with the expansion. But I think that it is a fair thing to expect that we should have some expectation on when do we expect some information from Alta on their revising number. And saying, okay, we make a profit. We will follow

our agreement and explain about revenue. So when, you know, it's all about--

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]

But I'm confident--

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --when do we

expect that we will get some report.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]

But I mean confident in our contractual arrangements that we will get some version of the profit sharing. I think in these early months, and they've already started, they're in the investment phase. Which is a good thing. We need it. They are investing in rehabbing all the equipment, in dealing with the software and hardware problems. So at the moment they are an investment role, which is a good thing. So they're not generating profits yet. But I promise you as their financial pictures becomes clear and the operation smooths out, we will-- One thing I pledge to the Council, we're going to keep you very informed about the financial picture with Alta. And what the City's position is, and when we think there's an opportunity for the city potentially to either engage in profit-sharing or engage in taking those revenues and investing them in expanding the system.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Council Member Levin.

[Pause]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. Hi, Commissioner. I know no one knows that we have this expansive development project on the waterfront of Staten Island. That in three years is going to increase the ferry ridership, and the tourists that come to Staten Island. I was wondering how does the City plan to extend Citi Bike into Staten Island since we weren't included in the Outer Boroughs in the action plan?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: As you can see from our somewhat illustrative map, we do want to get to Staten Island in our phase 3. And as I said in my testimony, we are going to work closely with Alta to try and make that phase 3 happen as quickly as possible. Separately, as we are working closely with you and the other members of the Staten Island delegation, I'm looking at all of the transportation challenges obviously that you are going to be facing with development. Looking at the roadway network, and how we're going to handle commuting and parking during the construction phase. How we can improve



frankly the circulation of the vehicles for pedestrians and cyclists. So we will be doing that in parallel as well.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: We have not participated in Citi Bike at all. Is there a reason why Staten Island wasn't even a part of the initial or there's been an expanded program? Are there strategy, or are there infrastructure? Are there structural reasons? What are the reasons why we weren't and haven't been included?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: And again, I was not present at the creation, but I think the way Citi Bike has rolled out is New York actually rolled out with a pretty big start. But it's an enormous city. So, you know, even though 6,000 bikes and covering the area you see in blue is a big area. It's a bigger of an area, bigger than many cities altogether. Obviously, given the enormous size of New York City and that we're five boroughs, some islands only connected by bridges. The program, you know, it only really started in two boroughs. I mean it was not in Staten Island, Queens, or the Bronx. It didn't get nearly as far into Manhattan or Brooklyn as many of the residents and elected

officials of Manhattan and Brooklyn would like. So one of the challenges you have with the Bike Share Network is you want to make it contiguous. You don't really want to just stick nodes of stations out, and not connected to each other. Because the stations need to be pretty close together for it to work as a functioning system.

So for Staten Island, there is the question of connecting, and obviously via the ferry. And as we talked about today, one thing we're going to be looking at is the Bikes on Bridges Program. And one element of that is going to be perhaps having bike racks on buses that can go to, for example, State Island over the Verrazano and give bicycles a way to access, to get to access the island. And then also, building out your network. So that when you get to Staten Island you'll have places to ride.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Are we on any statistics about bike fatalities for Staten Island fatalities with pedestrians or with automobiles? And do you have those numbers?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Yeah, we do and I think in terms of cyclist fatalities that's been mentioned, we've unfortunately had 18 this year,

which is high. It's actually higher than has been the norm in the city in recent years. We have the list here. Are there any-- Josh is looking at it. Are there any in Staten Island?

JOSHUA BENSON: In 2014, there have not been any bike fatalities in Staten Island. So, you know it's--

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing] Why is that?

JOSHUA BENSON: Why is that?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Uh-huh.

JOSHUA BENSON: Um, you know, there are a bunch of factors, but there are certain fewer people cycling. And there are fewer people in Staten Island generally than in the other boroughs, and there are fewer people cycling in Staten Island than in the other boroughs.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Do you think, though, that these accidents were attributable to the fact that we do not have bike lanes? Or, do you think that we would have been able to prevent them had there been dedicated bike lane?

JOSHUA BENSON: I think there are a lot of different circumstances at play in these crashes,

and I think that's going to be why it's very important to re-up this study of bike fatalities and serious injuries to really dig deep and find out what is going on. Absolutely, we think bike lanes and protected bike lanes protect cyclists and are a good way to improve safety to prevent future fatalities, definitely. In any of these particular cases would they have saved this person or that person? It's very difficult to say that, you know, in hindsight, but I can go and pull it up--

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing] Will you look at these locations when you look at where you would like to put bike lanes on Staten Island? Will these locations be taken into consideration?

JOSHUA BENSON: Sure but, you know, as I mentioned earlier, we're not going to see many bike fatalities in Staten Island. We're going to go back. You know, we'll have a ten-year span of data, but you're not going to see very many. So we're going to be-- We will rely on other data as well, injury data and not just fatalities where there are more data points. That's certainly a guiding force for us crash data, and we use that regularly in a lot of work that we do. We are working right now with the

Community Board on Clove Road. We're very interested in improving Clove Road for cycling. We had a very positive meeting a couple of weeks ago. So I think we are looking at data. We're looking at the community to help us learn where it's important for people in the community to cycle, and where they need to go and get to go. There are a bunch of actors. But it's a combination of data and community input.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: All right. I know my time is up. I just want to ask a simple yes or no question. The Verrazano-Narrows Bridge is celebrating its 50th anniversary this week, and they're putting an HOV lane on the Verrazano Bridge. Is DOT looking into allowing a bike path on the Verrazano Bridge?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: It is the 50th anniversary, and as you know, the Verrazano is an MTA bridge, and we have been talking to them about a whole series of capital projects. This is one we're looking at, but it has a big price tag on it. Right now, I think one of the big challenges we have with the MTA, as I'm sure everyone is aware, is they have a five-year capital budget that they have proposed that is only half funded. So they are facing a \$15

1 billion funding gap on the capital budget, as it  
2 exists, let alone adding new projects to it. Now,  
3 the good news potentially about a project on the  
4 Verrazano Bridge is projects that they do on their  
5 toll facilities are paid for out of toll and  
6 revenues. So in theory that could be used, but again  
7 I think right now we're just taking a preliminary  
8 look at all the challenges that we're facing with the  
9 MTA Capital Plan. But as I mentioned, we think  
10 perhaps at least a good starting step while we looked  
11 at that larger issue is to have buses be able to take  
12 bikes over the bridge. So at the very least cyclists  
13 could get, they could ride through Brooklyn or Staten  
14 Island, and put their bike on the bus to go to the  
15 other borough.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Commissioner,  
18 following, Council Member Rose, of course, like you  
19 announced like a great initiative today, including  
20 the one that will then NYC Transfer Buses, which is  
21 like a good one. When in the case with Staten  
22 Island, will those cyclists have the condition to  
23 carry on the bikes through the ferry, too?

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: You can bring  
25 bikes on our ferries.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. I guess even though like, you know, I would like to see Northern Manhattan included in the phase 2, but I would say that I would trade my interest even though now it's in phase 3. But I hope that Staten Island because of being closer to the locality also in this area, I hope that we can revise and see if State Island can be included in the next phase.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: As I have said, my Mayor has said to me he wants this program to be a five-borough program. So Staten Island is on our list, and we are going to work closely hopefully with Council Member Rose and all the leadership there to try and make it happen.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you, Chair Rodriguez.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Chin followed by Council Member Miller and Constantinides.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair. Commissioner on the Citi Bike is the City reviewing all the stations for the Citi Bike? Because I remember raising one of the stations in my district,

being in an area that is really congested, overcrowded. And it actually has caused a number of accidents, people tripping on it and things like that. So, is the City looking at some of those places to see whether some of them might be-- should be moved to some other location?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean, we are not generally saying we're going to reopen looking at every station because I think mostly the stations are working well. Obviously, we're always happy if there is a particular station at any time that anyone in the community wants to bring to us where you think there are safety concerns that are a real problem. Of course, we're always happy to take a look. We do move stations around or reconfigure them if we feel that we need to.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Well, the one on Elizabeth Street between Canal and Hester, and I think that we've raised it to the Department many times and it's still there. I mean one time the community thought it was gone because somehow they took away all the bikes. And people were so happy. They thought wow, the city finally listened, and they



are going to take away the station. And then a couple days later the bikes came back.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, actually, I'm going to turn it over to John Frost here who is now-- He's running our DOT's end of the Citi Bike program, and he's going to be the man to talk to in terms of siting stations in the future. So you should all get to know him I think.

JOHN FROST: So I would add on station siting in the way the Bike Share System functions in general in order for it to be a really functioning transportation system for New Yorkers, it requires a dense network of stations. Because even though it's a bike share and what you're using is bikes, it's really about walking. People use it, and people find it useful when they can easily walk to a bike at any point. Or when they can dock a bike, and easily walk to whatever their destination is. So in order to achieve that, the stations are sited very densely within the service area. And it's about one station for every thousand square feet, which in New York geography terms is Midtown Manhattan three blocks north/south or one avenue east/west. So I certainly understand that there are number of stations that

people have concerns with, but because we need to maintain this density, the stations would have to move to somewhere very close by, and they is not necessarily always something viable that can accommodate that. But the concerns that people have about a particular station need to be weight against the benefits that the riders are seeing that they would lose if you were to leave holes in the network.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I mean I don't know. I mean we have a number of stations that we have a number of stations in the community that people are very happy with, and I think that they're just asking to relocate it to another block or whatever. I think the City should work with the community on that because it's in a block where you have supermarkets, and you have other stores in the area. It's really congested, and it's the first left turn off the bridge. So it just might not be the most appropriate area, but we could also look at other streets.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, let us come and take a look at it. We're happy to do that.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah, I mean like we really need to do that. I mean even this is in

the last administration. We took a Deputy Mayor down to look at it, and he agreed with is, but then he left. So I really ask you to really come down, and look at that one. Elizabeth between Canal and Hester. Okay. The other issue in terms of bike safety, I want you to also look at Canal Street, right. The way Canal Street traffic is, there are a lot of trucks coming off the bridge from Manhattan Bridge, and then they go to the Holland Tunnel because there is no toll. It's really not a safe area for pedestrians and bicyclists. You know, people on bicycles. So I'm asking for DOT to really work with us to really look at that street. I mean even though now the speed limit has decreased, which is great, but still the problem is not solved. I mean we have people getting hit, and killed on the street. I mean one day I almost got hit because these trucks coming off the bridge they just don't look at pedestrians. They look at the light. They want to hit the next light, and if someone is not careful, you step off the sidewalk and the truck could just come zooming by. So I really want DOT to really look at Canal Street.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And I would say that Canal Street obviously for the reasons you stated, Council Member Chin, is one of the most challenging streets in New York. We do have this issue, obviously, of the trucks that are taking that free route over the bridge, and we were happy that we made it an arterial slow zone. We've done engineering work there. We're happy to come back again. This is one also, though, where we really need to work hand-in-hand with NYPD because obviously enforcement is going to be a piece of calming down the traffic there, and making it a safer street.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah, I think definitely NYPD needs to be there at the bridge, and I think also if DOT could really look at some way of slowing the trucks and cars down before they enter into Canal Street. That is something that is really critical. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Chair Rodriguez, and good to see you again, Commissioner. I have a couple of questions here. So in terms of obviously in Southern Queens, Southeast Queens we

have yet to roll out the bike plan there. And while we are looking forward to it, we want to ensure that there have been proper feasibility studies done around that. Obviously, we have a bus lane issue that was on it, and we want to know how that would impact. In fact, the bike lanes, in addition to bike lanes, has it had any impact on the bus lanes that have been introduced at least particularly in the Borough of Queens?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: It's a very good question, and it's another area where we're really trying to work very closely with New York City Transit. And make sure that as we do the designing of our bike lanes that we are not impacting bus operation. And I think I will have Joshua speak in a little more detail about that. But we recognize we have to make sure that if we're putting bike lanes in that the road is going to continue to function well for all users, and that buses are a particularly important piece of that.

JOSHUA BENSON: And I would just add to the Commissioner's point that we do work very closely with New York City Transit on not only bike network projects, but other projects that the agency does.

So we do a briefing with the transit staff, and review all project and get their input, and make adjustments. We work hand-in-hand with them on certain projects. SBS is the best example where we developed the projects together. A strategy we often have for dealing with cycling and bus routes is putting the bike lane on the left hand side of one-way streets. A lot of people in other cities always put the bike lane on the right hand side. They tend to have more two-way streets than we do. So we have the luxury of the one-ways put them on the left, but bus stops are on the right, and that's a huge way to ensure safety. But also to keep the bus operation from being affected by the cycling route. So we do that as a common strategy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay. Well, I do appreciate that you are working collaboratively with the TA. I could vouch and certainly attest that it hasn't always been efficient. So, Commissioner, back in August the NYPD rolled out Operation Safe Cycle, and I had requested some data on that initiative, and have yet to hear back on that. Obviously, safety is a big component of this program, and I'm a cyclist myself. But there are sort of professional cyclists

and then amateur cyclists that don't really adhere to those rules and regulations. What are we doing in terms of that? In particular I mean you could almost step out front here on Broadway at any given moment and see cyclists failing to stop or yield to pedestrians, bike lane obstructions, and things of that nature. Do you have any data from that initiative.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Actually, I don't have the NYPD data. One thing that we have recently done I'm very proud to say. If you go to our Vision Zero website, we've really upped our data in terms of if you can go online now, you can click on any neighborhood, any borough even any intersection and look at safety data, and look at all the interventions we've done. I think there is a piece of the NYPD enforcement data that still needs to be added into that. But aside from the data, we have really been trying to work closely with the NYPD with Transportation Chief Chan and a lot of his leaders at the borough level. To figure out how to do the best bicycle enforcement, and to make sure that we are engaging first in education. Again, one thing I've said and I'll just repeat it again, we

really do think as part of Vision Zero education is an important element. And it's important for everyone, for motorists, for cyclists, and pedestrians. And then work together on how to improve the enforcement of cyclists. Look, I think even probably amongst the members sitting here today, there can be some divergence of opinions on the best way to do that. And when it's appropriate to warn and summons, and what types of things we should be giving cyclists summonses for. But I can promise you it's a really active dialogue we're having with the NYPD. But one again where I think we welcome input from communities and from elected officials and from the advocates from the cycling community. I think we all have a common goal of making cycling safer in New York, and also making it feel safe for the pedestrians who are interacting with cyclists.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Absolutely, I take this initiative. So, in terms of the Bike Share Program, obviously-- Have we achieved the number that we thought we would achieve in the rollout of the program? And as we go further and we enter into a new agreement, have we considered as we build out rider fatigue and what the unintended consequences,



what impact or investment that the City may have to make in the program at that moment?

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: I think for the initial rollout of City Bike, the ridership numbers for New Yorkers for the residents of New York far exceeded the estimates. Regular New Yorkers really embraced it. They embraced it, you know, not only for pleasure trips, but to connect to the subway. You're in a district you know or some people know it's the only other subway to connect to that last mile to the subway. So we have tremendous ridership by New Yorkers. In fact, New Yorkers use the system twice as much as local residents in other cities. We have far less of what would be called the casual or tourist user who comes in and just uses it for a day or a couple of days. And that's in part I think because there were some system glitches and it wouldn't take credit cards. And so, I think one thing we're looking at is can we build up the casual users. The casual users actually are more profitable to the system than the regular New York users. In terms of the question of eventual public funding, I mean right now the Mayor has been clear that we're not putting public funding in. And one thing we're

pleased with this deal, we were able to have the public funds in, and get a great infusion of private sector investment. I think in the long run, you know, some of your fellow council members have raised the question as we continue to expand further and further into the city, some of you all may want to put in public funds. We're not there yet, but obviously I think as this system expands, that's a question we'll all no doubt return to at some point. I sense there is probably a bit of divergence of opinion about the wisdom of that.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you so much, Commissioner.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Costa.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you, Chair Rodriguez and Commissioner. Great to see you again.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Great to see you.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I just have a few questions. One, just quickly on-- I represent the 22nd District, Astoria, a little bit of Long Island City, Woodside. And one of the big

things or challenges we've been having a dialogue with DOT about is 21st Street. And with that being a very chaotic corridor, I have discussed it with you in the past. I really sort of functions more like a highway than a street, and the community is really looking forward to seeing the DOT plan. But sort of looking at it through the spectrum of a bike rider. 21st Street over 1,000 cars an hour even on off peak hours. How do we sort of integrate a bike-friendliness to 21st Street to Crescent Street to 31st Street? And I'll also give a shout out to my colleague Jimmy Van Bramer who has been working on this issue as well, and really been a leader on it. How do we integrate of all 31st and 21st into a bike-friendly network?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I'll give you a general interview, and then I may turn to the expert to get a little more granular. Certainly, you represent some real challenging pieces of terrain in terms of roadway design and making it safer and accommodating all users. As you know, I've been in the neighborhood and looked at some of the areas, and have seen some of the work we've done. But I also know that there is a lot more we need to do there. I

don't think there is any question. You know, obviously as we're now rolling out Bike Share that's going to be coming to these areas, it's really-- One of the things we're proud about with Bike Share, and in general the cycling in New York City despite the uptick this year, it has been pretty safe. Bike Share in particular has been extraordinarily safe, and we're very, very proud of that. And so we absolutely want to make sure as we expand the system that we continue that strong safety record. So maybe Josh can talk in some specificity about some of the techniques we're going to use.

JOSHUA BENSON: Sure. 21st Street, as you mentioned, Council Member, it's a huge challenge because of traffic volume, and it's a rush hour only situation. It's all through the day. It's like a 12-hour long peak period, which is something we often see in Manhattan, but it's not as common in Queens and some of the other places. So traffic is very intense. On the cycling side, we've actually done a lot of work on Vernon Boulevard, which is very close by. It provides a great cycling experience. We last year upgraded the bike lanes that were there to a two-way path. And we've just gone back to both

Community Boards 1 and 2 to do some further upgrades of Vernon Boulevards. And I think that's-- You know, not that we want totally dismiss 21st Street as a cycling route.

But given all the challenges, given the proximity of Vernon Boulevard, given that we already have cycling infrastructure there, we think it makes sense to kind of double down on the investment in Vernon. On 21st Street, I think the improvements we're going to see are going to be much more pedestrian focused, and improving the crossings. Attempting to shorten their crossings to the extent we can. We're looking at whether some more of the intersections can be signalized. There are a number of intersections right now that are not signalized. So that's part of what we're looking at. And we're also looking at the signal timing strategies in general that might limit the opportunity for speeding. Right now, as you see, during the off peak hours, it can be quite easy for people to pick up speed. So we have some techniques that we've used on the arterial slow zones to offset the signals in a way that makes it less rewarding to speed.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Well, I'm  
3 definitely looking-- You know, the community as well  
4 as am I are looking forward to seeing those  
5 improvements as soon as possible. I know that we've  
6 been talking about this for almost a year now. So we  
7 are very excited to see when that is going to come  
8 through, and I know the community is waiting for it.  
9 As it comes through, Bike Share and Citi Bike, we  
10 are-- Put me in the list of council members that are  
11 willing to put our money where our mouth is and be  
12 part of how we could roll out this expansion in a  
13 much more quick way. I know our community is waiting  
14 for Bike Share, and any way we can move it forward in  
15 a better manner, we're looking forward to having that  
16 done.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Thank you.  
18 Thanks for your leadership on that, and all your  
19 colleagues as well.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank  
21 you, Commissioner.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.  
23 Commissioner, what is it-- I only have like two or  
24 three more questions. Then we will let you go and we  
25

will call the next panel. What are the operational and capital costs for Citi Bike?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'm sorry, what do you--

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]  
The operational and capital costs for this program?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Actually, maybe I'll have John pull out the detailed numbers. I'll talk a little bit about big picture, and what we've managed to do with the latest renewal of the deal. Alta is going to be putting in an additional \$30 million in investment. So that will be I think for both capital and operational improvements. Also, over time we will be taking in actually in another \$70 million in sponsorship revenue from CitiBank. And they will also be taking in rider revenue, but I don't actually know it. Maybe, John, you can tell us what the rider revenue projections look like. And I don't know how detailed they made those yet for the coming years.

JOHN FROST: Yeah, we actually don't. Given that the price has just changed, that's, I think, more of a question for Matt Berlin of NYCBS

who will be on the next panel. In 2013, they generate I think about \$14 million in rider revenue.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Can we say that the 35-mile of protected lanes is safer for everyone, for the cyclists, for the pedestrians? And that are less accidents in those particular protected lanes than the rest of the lanes that we have in the City?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I mean we have actually found when we've studied roadways where we've put in protected bike lanes, that injuries from crashes went down in all categories, cyclists, pedestrians, and motorists. So, yes, they really are a great safety enhancement. And that's just not New York City's experience. That's the experience worldwide and in all the great cycling cities.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: All right. So, you know, with that in mind, as we agree that protected lanes have to continue being expanded that we have to continue exploring sources of funding. So that area is where the cyclists are more safe. And also the pedestrians. So definitely we should look for a potential source of funding so that we can



continue expanding from those 35 miles of protected lanes that we have so far in the city. So with that, thank you.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Thank you.

[Pause]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Now, we're going to be calling the next person Matt Berlin from New York City Bike Share, operator of Citi Bike.

[Pause]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And we just want to say that we thank you that you're here, and, of course, like for the next hearing that we will be holding looking to have the DOT, Consumer Affairs, and NYPD, the Public and Safety. We would also like to have you and Jay also present in the next hearing.

[Pause]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks.

MATT BERLIN: Sorry. So obviously I think Jay will be happy to come in the future. As you know, he just started with the company. Is there an affirmation or no? Okay. Well, good afternoon, Chair Rodriguez. Thank you for having this hearing and Members of the Transportation Committee. My name is Matt Berlin, and I'm the General Manager of New

York City Bike Share, LLC, the operator of New York City's Bike Share System. And I'm joined by Dani Simons, the Director of Communication and External Affairs for the company.

As you know, Citi Bike launched in May 2014 with 6,000 bikes and 332 stations. The program, though not without issues, has really quickly become part of the fabric of New York City and a vital part of our transportation network. We currently have nearly 90,000 annual members, and over 665,000 causal passes have been used across the system. During non-winter months, we average about 34,000 daily trips. Peak days top 40,000. In fact, the past two cold days, Tuesday and Wednesday we had close to 20,000 trips a day.

We've rolled out this new piece of the transportation network in a relative blink of an eye. The fact that people have taken to it so quickly is a testament in part to the work of New York City DOT to make the streets safer and more attractive to people who want to ride bikes. It's a testament to the hard work of the 172 employees of New York City Bike Share, with whom I work everyday. It's a testament to the hard work of the advocacy and bicycling

organizations in this room that have created such a demand. And it's also a testament to the fact that New Yorkers are hungry for more flexible on-demand transportation options.

The beauty of it is that people are making Bike Share what they want it to be whether it's to commute to work, to connect to the subway or just to go to a movie. Bike Share puts the control in each person's hands. It reflects the way we live our lives today. It used to be that what we called public transit was mass transit. It was designed for the masses. If you had a job that wasn't a regular 9:00 to 5:00 job, or you didn't happen to live in an outer borough and commute to the central business district, then you had to wait for a train or a bus or you had to make several transfers to get there. But today, Bike Share provides personal transit. It's transit for the individual, and it opens up a whole variety of trips, and it connects neighborhoods in a whole new way.

And now, we're going to have the opportunity to reach more New Yorkers than ever before as we double the size of the Citi Bike system. This expansion will begin in 2015 and will include

more of Bed-Stuy as well as Williamsburg, Greenpoint, and Long Island City. These neighborhoods were planned as part of Citi Bike's initial rollout, but they were delayed after a significant portion of our equipment was lost during Hurricane Sandy. And then, by the end of 2017, you'll be able to find Citi Bike stations as far north in Manhattan and Harlem, in Queens and Astoria and Long Island City, and in Brooklyn, in Dumbo, Brooklyn Heights, Downtown Brooklyn, Fort Green, Clinton Hill, Greenpoint, Williamsburg, Prospect Heights, Crown Heights, Park Slope, Carroll Gardens, Bourne Hill, Cobble Hill, Red Hook, Gowanus, and Bedford-Stuyvesant.

But in order to expand, we must re-strengthen the Citi Bike System. This includes overhauling every bike this winter and improving the technology that Citi Bike runs on. I'm happy to say that for the first time ever, our parent company has a vice president for our Technology who is solely focused on this issue. He started only 16 days ago, and while it's obviously too soon for me to go into specifics, I have confidence that we will be able to deliver a system that works better for our annual members and casual members come spring. And our

parent company is committed to ensuring that we have better technology to manage and operate this system as well.

As we grow, we will continue our ongoing efforts to reach out and invite more New Yorkers to try bicycling. In the past year alone, we've set up 11 community ride clubs that provide access to the Citi Bike via school and community development centers in our service area, and they encourage ridership by all New Yorkers. We continue to offer a discounted membership of \$60 per year to residents in New York City Housing Developments. And also for members of participating community development credit unions. We've worked closely with NYCHA and DOT to promote this program, including conducting helmet fittings and events with DOT in all nine NYCHA developments adjacent to current Citi Bike stations. We've also placed information about the program in the NYCHA Journal and NYCHA and on the Citi Bike websites, on NYCHA rent statements, and on NYCHA and Citi Bike social media. And we attend resident association meetings, development management meetings and family events. We are committed to continuing these outreach efforts as the system expands.

The future of bicycling is also about green jobs. During our peak season, we employ well over 200 people and over 95% of them live in the five boroughs. These are jobs that didn't exist three years ago, and they include jobs for drivers, mechanics, technicians, customer service agents, and sales people. As we grow, we expect to create more local jobs that pay a living wage or more.

The future of bicycling in New York City also looks safer. The City is doing its part from the Vision Zero Initiative to reduce the speed limit, installing more bike lanes, and more protected bike lanes. And at Citi Bike we have a unique opportunity to promote safety. We can communicate directly with tens of thousands of people as they begin to think about using a bike. It's a time when people are actively seeking this kind of information, and they're ready to learn. So through our membership kits, our website, our station kiosks, and even directly printed on the handlebars of the bikes themselves we share the four cardinal rules of biking in New York: Yield to pedestrians; stay off the sidewalk; obey traffic lights; and ride with traffic.

With our partners at Biking New York, we offer Citi Bike street skills classes that are designed to teach the rules of the road, and give people the knowledge they need to be safe and confident on the streets. To date, over 1,000 people have taken this free class. And we promote helmet use and the local biking economy with a \$10 discount coupon that every new Citi Bike member receives in their walking kit. The coupon is good for seven different brands of helmets, and can be redeemed at any bike shop in the five boroughs. This enables members to choose a helmet that fits their price point, and the coupon makes it possible to get a safe helmet for as little as \$20. And we think you are more likely to wear a helmet if it's something that matches your style and fits you just right.

In the bigger picture what's really exciting is to see how Bike Share is helping mainstreaming grow bicycling. Not long ago our collective mental image of bike riders in New York was either messengers or Spandex clad weekend warriors in the parks or headed out to the GW Bridge. But today, thanks in part to Citi Bike, that's changing. You see many women dressed for work

peddling at a sedate pace, avoiding breaking a sweat. You see people who never would have thought of owning their bike, taking a Citi Bike to run an errand to get there a little faster than they might have by walking. One thing that is very important to us as a company, and as New Yorkers is that as Citi continues its excellent work of expanding bicycling infrastructure, and Citi Bike expands, a safer well connected bike network is essential to making our customers and all New Yorkers feel safe enough to make the decision to ride a bike to get them where they need to go.

In conclusion, I and the entire team of New York City Bike Share couldn't be more excited about the future of bicycling in New York City. With the expansion of Citi Bike we look forward to serving even more New Yorkers, being even more accessible to more neighborhoods and continue to invite more people to experience for themselves the bright present and future of bicycling in New York City. Thank you, and I'll be happy to answer any questions.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

Thanks and I am happy that we have been able to save on our Citi Bike throughout the buyout process, and



the re-negotiation with the city and your company.

From the business perspective, based on your business plan, when do you expect to start getting revenue from Citi Bike?

MATT BERLIN: Well, we've always been generating revenue from Citi Bike, and we generate revenue from our memberships and from our sponsorships. So we have always generated revenue.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] When do you expect to start getting a profit.

MATT BERLIN: So we, you know, obviously the owners of the company expect it to be profitable, and it is a private company. So we disclosed some information about our revenues on our monthly reports on website, but we do expect to be profitable.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: When will the City start getting their fair share from this program?

MATT BERLIN: So it's really as Commissioner Trottenberg said, it's really too soon to say exactly when we will start to make all of our payments based on the contract, but we are discussing that with the City.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But are you  
3 getting revenue? Are you making some profit?

4 MATT BERLIN: Well, so the revenue we've  
5 got--

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing] As  
7 you know, we are not into the financial work. Like  
8 you guys are the ones, you know, from the business  
9 perspective. So this is something that you see as  
10 profitable. This is something that you will be able  
11 to get a good return from investments based on  
12 membership, based on whatever contract you have with  
13 Citi Bike. So, how soon will the City be able to get  
14 some share?

15 MATT BERLIN: So right now, our focus is  
16 on investing and strengthening the system. And so,  
17 we are using the revenues we have plus the investment  
18 capital from our new owners to invest in making the  
19 system work better for New Yorkers.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Can we say that  
21 next year the City will be getting-- Because for  
22 someone who is in the business, you know, you don't  
23 live then for the expectation let's see how things go  
24 next year. You know, there is a plan in the business  
25

2 community. So when do you expect that the City will  
3 be getting some revenue?

4 MATT BERLIN: Right now, we're not  
5 prepared to discuss a date when we will be  
6 profitable. Right now our focus really is in  
7 investing in the system so that the bikes are  
8 functioning, so the docks are all functioning. And  
9 it's a strong system that has expanded to 12,000  
10 bikes and 600 stations.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Does  
12 that include when the City will expect to be getting  
13 some profit?

14 MATT BERLIN: So the contract suggests  
15 that that's something that we will work at as we're  
16 moving forward.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: By leaving it  
18 open? It doesn't say two years from the program,  
19 three years from the program. It doesn't have any  
20 timeframe?

21 MATT BERLIN: So I'm not aware of the  
22 exact timeframe. As the General Manager, my main  
23 focus is on investing and strengthening. And so, I'm  
24 not as involved in the financial arrangements between  
25

the City and the Bike Share parent company working as a contractor.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Well, this is something that I will follow up and see when can we guess on-- An expectation from when the City will getting like a return from this investment. What about CitiBank? How much is CitiBank contributing in this program, and how much do you value the promotional level through thousands of bicycles throughout New York City?

MATT BERLIN: So CitiBank has been absolutely valuable and really a terrific corporate citizen helping large Citi Bike and helping expand it. And as Commissioner Trottenberg mentioned, their contribution is \$70 million.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: \$70?

MATT BERLIN: \$70 million over the program, as Commissioner Trottenberg mentioned. But again these are private arrangements between the company that I work for and CitiBank. And really we're a private company operating in the system.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, and I just, you know, like moving forward, I just hope that at some point we get to value how much CitiBank is also

getting from promoting the level, and thousands of bicycles being an exclusive one. Have you considered also to include other corporations to promote the level or CitiBank has exclusive to be the only one?

MATT BERLIN: So it's a complicated arrangement with CitiBank, but CitiBank is our primary named sponsor. We certainly have other sponsorship opportunities. if you go out and look at the stations right now for example, you'll see that MasterCard is our main payment sponsor. And, in fact, if you travel around the city, you'll see that I think 50 bikes have been painted red for the commemorative for the musical Annie. So there are other sponsors, and we are actively seeking additional sponsors. But certainly, CitiBank and MasterCard have been our lead, our initial sponsors. They've been terrific at helping to promote bicycling in New York City.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But does the contract leave the opportunity for the program to include other private--

MATT BERLIN: [interposing] Yes, there are--

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --companies?

2 MATT BERLIN: --opportunities for  
3 additional sponsorship. Yes.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. When you  
5 went through the whole process of negotiating this  
6 contract, how was the contract structured so that  
7 there is like a win-win benefit from both, from all.  
8 From the private sector and in this case Alta who is  
9 relate who is also included in this process, the  
10 City, and the consumer?

11 MATT BERLIN: Well, so again, you know,  
12 the contract is really negotiated by the parent  
13 company. So I'm not an expert on the contract, but I  
14 will say that the City benefits because by putting  
15 more-- As Council Member Van Bramer said, by putting  
16 more bicycles on the street not only are we serving  
17 citizens who use Citi Bikes, I think we're making  
18 biking safer for everyone in New York City. So we're  
19 creating a much better transportation infrastructure.  
20 For the City itself there are financial preservation  
21 both in our profit. There is a repayment for lost  
22 parking revenue. And for us as a company, it's an  
23 opportunity for us through membership fees and  
24 through advertising revenue to make return on our  
25 investment.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. What are the challenges to expand. And, of course, like I know that this commitment is there, that the plan is there to go through all the phases, phase 2 and phase 3, and to expand Citi Bike throughout the city. Why couldn't the program be expanded including the outer borough in this phase? What are the challenges financially that you face in order to be able to expand?

MATT BERLIN: Right. So I think really three challenges we face before we can get onto phase 3 and beyond. First of all, we need to spend this winter and this spring strengthening the current system because while it functions terrifically, it doesn't function as well as we would all expect. Second, we need to get through the expansion to which we have already committed. And we simply have a supply and a time issue of just getting those stations down. And moving up through Harlem and along the Brooklyn waterfront and into Brooklyn and into Queens. And then we'll work with the City both on financing and siting, so that we can expand beyond the area, beyond the phase 2 area. Which we always were interested in as everyone in this room.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Do you know what percent of people who rent those bikes are tourists and what percent is our New Yorkers?

MATT BERLIN: So it is about-- It's been 665,000 rides that have been casual riders. We don't know whether or not they are tourists or whether they are people from New York City. It is a vast majority more than our New York City residents who are annual members, and that's a challenge that we face as a business. And something that we would like to again, as Commissioner Trottenberg talked about, we would like to expand the number of those casual riders.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks. I just would like to say that we truly believe in the public and private partnership. We believe that this is like a formula that should be benefitting everyone. And we thank all the private institutions that have become partners in this process. We just want to be sure that we continue working together, and that the win-win situation is something that if we had to-- If you see the opportunity to get also other private institutions if that helps. If by inviting other private institutions to promote the level through all the phases, we hope to get to those phases sooner



that what we expected that you would look at also that opportunity. It's all about like creating again the opportunity for the ones to do it. For the investor to get a good return, for the City to get a good program. And all of us support Citi Bike. And we just hope that you are successful, and that you don't go back to the crisis that affected this program.

MATT BERLIN: We won't do that. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

01:37:30 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you, Chair. So just if I heard correctly you mentioned that the bulk of the ridership are actually tourists and not city residents?

MATT BERLIN: No. Well, the bulk are annual members.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Right, and the Chair asked for a breakdown if you have a breakdown of any type of information with regards to are these city residents? Are these tourists you getting information about?

MATT BERLIN: I'm sorry. I didn't bring those exact numbers with me. The numbers I have off

hand are that 90,000. We have about 90,000 annual members, and then since inception we've had 665,000 rides about of casual riders. Those are people buying a day pass or buying them weekly.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And have you had any concerns, feedback from the community about affordability?

MATT BERLIN: So we have not. You know, we realize that \$149 is a lot of money for a lot of people. We do offer the affordability program for residents, as I discussed, residents of NYCHA houses and members of community development credit unions. We are working on rolling out some other affordability options to make Citi Bike affordable. So we do know that that's a concern. So yes we have some concerns, and we're trying to establish some other ways of Citi Bike and participating in Citi Bike to make it more affordable.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I think one other area the Chair and others, you know, we should consider is that the city be rolling out some of the Municipal ID cards, and they are partnering with many institutions to offer discounts to residents, which is what I think should be happening. And this could

be another areas where city residents get discounts to really a city resource. And I'll just add what I said before to the Commissioner that you had mentioned that you had lost some equipment yourself from Hurricane Sandy, is that correct?

MATT BERLIN: We have, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Do you have a figure on that, how much?

MATT BERLIN: So this was before I started. I think it is and, of course, there is a dispute with the insurance company. I feel like it was about \$5 of \$6 million, but again this is well before I joined. I really only joined Citi Bike in late August.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I just think that, and I'll reiterate the point that as we look to expand the program that we cover the most vulnerable communities in New York--

MATT BERLIN: [interposing] Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: --because we had situations where obviously cars were destroyed. The transportation-- the train system had many damages. The MTA in its infinite wisdom actually reduced bus service to certain parts of the areas that were the

most vulnerable. But there were many, several bikers who were able to come in and help many of the impacted communities. I think that this needs to be a part of Resiliency Planning working with DOT and OEM through the Office of Recovery and Resilience to make sure that his program expands the most vulnerable areas with regards to emergency planning.

MATT BERLIN: We would be happy to participate in those discussions.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you and thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And with that, I would like to thank you for being here with us today, and we are hoping to continue working with you.

MATT BERLIN: Thank you. We do as well.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks. I am now going to be calling on the other members of the public and, of course, the first panel is going to be one of the most important ones. Since they will talk about the Families for Safer Streets. So they can testify about their experience and their expectations on how critical it is to keep our city safe for everyone, for pedestrians and for cyclists. And before calling on them, I would like to share with

the public that our next hearing is going to be on December 3rd, Oversight about applications to technology and the transformation of the taxi and for-hire industry. So that is going to be the next hearing that we will have, that our Transportation Committee would have. So now the next panel Mary Beth Kelly, Rachel Weski [sp?] Paul Steely White from Transportation and Fabricio Ayora. .

[Pause]

[background discussion]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So because of the timing we will allocate to this panel two minutes each, and to the rest of the panels one minute each.

[Pause]

MARY BETH KELLY: Now can you hear me? Okay. I would just like to start up by saying I collect heroes, and you have become one of the collection. Thank you for spearheading this, and for doing such a great job, and having the vision of New York as a livable, likeable city. Families Safe Streets, as you know, is an organization that formed this year, and all of our members have either been seriously injured themselves in traffic crashes or have lost a loved one in this way. And we carry our

1 pictures, and we tell our stories, and influence  
2 dramatically the reduction in speed in the city from  
3 30 to 25 most recently. This is the picture I carry.  
4 It's my husband, Dr. Carl Henry Nacht, who was killed  
5 when the two of us were riding our bicycles one  
6 beautiful summer night.

7  
8           And a two truck failed to yield at an  
9 intersection where we had the right-of-way. This is  
10 the second greatest reason why people die in traffic  
11 crashes in New York City, speed being the first. And  
12 the redesign of city streets is key to saving lives.  
13 And we redesign a street, to be a complete street,  
14 which includes a protected bike lane. Indeed, the  
15 serious injuries and deaths to all street users on  
16 those avenues comes down by 25% minimum. That's  
17 huge. So I think that the ramping up and the  
18 execution of protected bike lanes throughout the city  
19 is key. We have to think in terms of where young  
20 people want to live, and they don't want to live in  
21 the suburbs any more. Most young people getting out  
22 of school want to come to cities. And they want to  
23 be there because that's where things are happening.

24           That's where they can get jobs. That's  
25 where their peers are. And they particularly want

bikeable and walkable cities. They want to be able to raise a family in those cities. They want to walk with them to school, and to work. And what we can do to make New York always a city that people will want to come to, and not be losing on our streets like people like Essie Fremone [sp] a budding co-ed or Sam Hindi, whose Internet startup was about to be bought by Google. Dying on their bicycles on the streets of New York because we have not protected them as vulnerable users of our streets. Yes, I have a red face today. It's the result of a medical procedure I had this morning because when you ride your bike for millions of miles unprotected as I did for many years before there was sun screen, you get skin cancer. So we can protect our skin, and we can protect our bodies, and we can protect our city population by what we do structurally to make it safe. Thank you.

[Pause]

FABRICIO AYORA: Hey, good afternoon.

Thank you Council Member Rodriguez, and the rest of the people here, the committee for holding this very important hearing. My name Fabricio Ayora, and I am a member of Make the Road New York, Amherst, Queens. I reside in Jackson Heights. I'm here because I

think it is a very good opportunity to tell my story. I work as a computer technician, and I moved myself from place to place to make a decent living, from house to house. The reason I don't take sometimes the bus is because they don't service where I need to go. Rather, I use my bicycle to move myself, and I have experienced a lot of sad tragedies. I've seen accidents on the street, in the streets. And I am worried about getting in another accident. Very recently, a taxi, a Yellow Cab, I opened the door and I was struck, and I flew. I was injured but I think we need to enforce city bike a bit more for us to get for example not only to work but on the weekends for recreation with our families to the park and in different places. We need more bicycle lanes, and also to enforce bike lanes so there are no more accidents or injured people. I thank you so much. Thank you, and that's all I have to say. Thanks.

TRANSLATOR: I was here because we thought we might do translation.

[Pause]

RACHEL WESKI: Hello. Thank you for the opportunity to speak before you today. My name is Rachel Wedski [sp?]. I'm a current resident in



Bushwick, Brooklyn and I'm here today to express to you the importance of continuing to increase bicycle infrastructure in all five boroughs of New York, but especially in the neighborhoods that produce a lack of proper bicycle networks. This opinion, while my own, is backed by the majority of New Yorkers who consistently vote for the increase of bicycle networks in the polls. And for the increase in bicycle commuters, a number that doubled from 2009 to 2013. The influx of cycles also leads to an increase in safety for all street users, which I think is important to all of us. We just recently passed a 25 mile per hour law, and when you increase bicycle infrastructure, you are helping slow down the streets for cars making sure that they comply with this law. You make streets safer for pedestrians because cyclists who have been previously afraid to ride on the road, they've been riding on the sidewalk, they get off the sidewalk, and the road feels a little bit safer.

Cars become more aware and they're slowing down, and they are paying more attention when they're on the road. So I think it's safe to say that bicycle infrastructure is good for everyone. As

we make advances towards reducing the traffic deaths to zero and complying with Vision Zero I think it's really important that we start focusing on the major arterials, roads at Queens Boulevards and Atlantic Avenue. These roads are large and intimidating to most cyclists. And while they only make up 15% of most roads [sic], they are where 50% of most fatalities are happening. Personally, I'm afraid to ride on Atlantic Avenue. Even though I could bike it to work everyday, it's huge and intimidating. There are thousands of cars, and even when you're stopped on the sidewalk like-- [bell] Thank you for your time.

PAUL STEELY WHITE: So we all know that the most sure fire way to prevent fatalities and injuries to bikers, pedestrians, drivers, passengers alike is to redesign these dangerous arterial streets. The City has about a thousand miles of these legacy arterial streets that were built in a different era, before the Vision Zero era. And we know that when we redesign these arterial streets, we absolutely save lives. As Mary Beth Kelly just said, 20, 25, 30 and sometimes 50% reduction in casualties on arterial streets that have been redesigned. To

date, we do not have the resources we need as a city to redesign these dangerous streets. The City's Ten-Year Capital Plan must incorporate an ambitious timeline for redesigning these dangerous arterial streets. And moving forward with the city budget season coming up with the fresh look at the City Capital Plan, we will be ensuring that we have the resources necessary to safeguard our citizens on these big dangerous streets.

The second and final point that I want to make pertains to this map to my left. You can see that the current bike lane network matches very well with the current Citi Bike Zone. You can also see that the expansion zone where Citi Bike soon will be looks very different than the current bike lane network that we have in the current Citi Bike zone. In other words there is a big mismatch between where Citi Bike will soon be, and the current state, the paltry state of our bike lane network in Manhattan north of 59th Street and in Western Queens in particular. The bike lane network simply does not exist in any safe and cohesive manner outside the current Citi Bike Zone. So really we call upon the City Council. We call upon the DOT, Mary de Blasio

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 100

2 to redouble their efforts and absolutely accelerate  
3 the roll out safe bike lanes the proposed now actual  
4 Citi Bike expansion zone.

5 [Pause]

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]

7 PAUL STEELY WHITE: Oh, I'm sorry. Paul  
8 Steely White, Executive Director Transportation  
9 Alternatives.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Our  
11 next panel is going to be Carol Wasser, Neal Weisman,  
12 Eric McClure, Peter Tisdell [sp?] and Chris.

13 [background discussion]

14 [Pause]

15 CAROL WASSER: Good afternoon, Mr.  
16 Chairperson and members of the Committee. My name is  
17 Carol Wasser. I'm a recreational cyclist and the  
18 past President of the New York Cycle Club, which  
19 represents over 2,000 recreational cyclists in New  
20 York City. To address Intro 544, this bill is overly  
21 broad. This is this the bill concerning prohibiting  
22 texting while cycling. But the bill is worded in an  
23 overly broad manner, and will cause untold confusion  
24 for both the NYPD and the bicycle community. By  
25 defining electronic communication device as any hand-

held device used or capable of being used in a hand-held manner that is designed or intended to receive or transmit electronic messages with such device.

Including, but not limited to, wireless telephones, personal digital assistance, and portable or mobile computers.

You would effectively ban all GPS cycling computers as well as the use of a cell phone mounted to the handlebars and used as a cycling computer. If you wish to ban texting while cycling, then write a bill that specifically bans texting while cycling.

Do not write a broad prohibition of any electronic device that could at some point be held in the hand while seeking information. I use a Garmin 800 mounted to my bicycle. It would be considered a mobile computer. I use it for navigation as well as standard cycling computer modes. I can hold it in my hand, and query where is the nearest bike shop or the nearest Starbucks and how do I get there from here? I would not do that kind of query while actually riding.

Unlike many drivers who program their dashboard GPSs while driving. Yes, I've seen taxi drivers do this. But I don't wish to be ticketed for

having this device on my handlebar. Likewise, for use of a cell phone a cycling computer has become more popular with the availability of apps for that purpose. They are mounting devices that hold the phones securely attached to the bike, and apps that use GPS and Bluetooth technology to provide both navigational and data input to the cyclists about the ride. Also, allowing the rider to upload the ride statistics to a personal computer after completing the ride. I beg you to reword this bill. I am all for prohibiting texting while bicycling, but not prohibiting the devices that we use. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And what I can say as someone that together with my colleagues here, I am the sponsor of this bill. We are open to any suggestions. So, you know, that's what I think is the most important piece is what you're saying in the intention to ban texting while cycle. That's the most important piece, and I assume that knowing the Council Member he would like to say something about it. We're open to it.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Yes, absolutely. Really, the intention and we will definitely look at the wording very carefully to make sure it is

tailored towards this intention. It is that clearly when a cyclist is in motion cycling look at their phone or looking at a Garmin while they're cycling is not a safe practice. And we have to make sure that, of course, if you're stationary looking at a device. Or if it's on your handlebar, that's fine and long as it's-- You know, if you're biking and you're looking elsewhere, that's not a safe practice. As you pointed out correctly, it's not safe for drivers, and certainly not safe for bicyclists. So I am more than happy to work with you and the Chair to make sure the language is tailored as such that the intent is reached. Thank you.

CAROL WASSER: Thank you very much.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you.

CAROL WASSER: I will contact your staff.

NEAL WEISMAN: Chairman Rodriguez and council members, my name is Neal Weisman. I'm President of New York Cycle Club. Two issues I would like to bring to your attention. First is the effort by Parks supported by activists around the city to connect the Bronx Greenway system to the North and South County Trailways. It's a flat traffic free 46-mile path that connects Putnam,

Westchester through parks, wetlands, nature preserves before dead-ending at a muddy remnant of the Putnam Railway in Van Cortlandt Park. As-is the trail is unrideable after a storm, but there is no other way for people to get there from the Bronx, and the roads in Yonkers are traffic and hilly, and beyond the ability of average cyclists. The Parks plan would open up a backbone of strong accessible connections between the city and our neighbors to the north, and it comprises an immunity for the entire region.

The second issue is the George Washington Bridge, and I'm sorry. I've prepared three minutes here. Over the coming decade Port Authority will replace all 592 suspended cables, which support the main span. Because the existing paths will have to be ripped out, and reinstalled to access the anchors, we have a once-in-a-life span opportunity to extend the six foot nine inch paths into a facility compliant to the National Guidelines for High Use. Once capable of sustaining growth of the regional bicycle network throughout the century. The GWB is the sole bikeable connector between North Jersey and New York City. It connects the two most heavily cycled road in the country, Hudson Greenway and Route



9W. It is already incredibly crowded. Traffic counts are already above 500 uses per hour, and well exceed the 300-user threshold for high use.

For Port Authority to create a dual 14-inch facility is consistent with guidance from Federal Highways Administration, U.S. Department of Transportation, American Association of State and Highway Traffic Officers, and even Port Authority's own Bicycle Master Plan. If it is not done, it will cripple the growth of bi-state cycling--

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Could you please summarize?

NEAL WEISMAN: Basically, [completeshorage.org/needs](http://completeshorage.org/needs) [sic]. It will cripple the network. [Completeshorage.org/benefits](http://Completeshorage.org/benefits) they're off the chart.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. You have a great suggestion, and especially with the one at George Washington Bridge. This is something that I particularly would like to be working with you. So let's be sure that we follow up with some meeting later on so that we can talk about how we can work together on this.

NEAL WEISMAN: Thank you so much.

ERIC MC CLURE: Thank you. We're getting two minutes or one minute for testimony?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]

ERIC MC CLURE: My name is Eric Mc Clure on behalf of Streets Path as was Park Slope Neighbors and the Parks Slope Safety Partnership. I would like to thank you Chairman Rodriguez, and the members of the Committee on Transportation for holding this important hearing today. The importance of your commitment and the commitment of the entire Council to forge a bright new future for bicycling in New York City cannot be overstated. First off, let me say that I am shocked that no one from Neighbors for Better Bike Lanes is here to unveil its 63-Point Plan for improving cycling in New York City. I jest because nearly 4 years ago, I sat in hearing with this Committee, and listened to members of the strangely named group spin a fanciful tale of woe about the Prospect Park West Bike Path, which was at the time was just a few months old. Of course, they cared only about one bike lane, and their interest was in getting rid of it, not in making it better. Unfortunately, the baseless lawsuit this group filed in March 2011 has, despite failing to gain any

traction in the courts had a deeply chilling affect on the roll out of the type of world class safe and protected cycling infrastructure that the Prospect Park West Path exemplified.

After the bike path was installed, biking on PPW tripled almost instantly. Riding on the sidewalk dropped by 90% and speeding bike riders on Prospect Park West plummeted falling by 70%. Best of all, young children who were able to start riding unaccompanied on a street that had previously scared off many adults. Sadly, however, in the heat of the so-called bike flash engendered by the ill-conceived lawsuit and embedded by tabloid editors, the Department of Transportation largely lost its appetite for creating class one bike facilities. Despite the mountains of evidence for protected paths like those on Prospect Park West and 9th Avenue significantly improves safety, not only for cyclists but for pedestrians and drivers alike, the City has just not built of them. Without more protected bike paths, and connected extended neighborhood bike networks, especially in communities that are currently underserved, we have no chance of achieving Mayor de Blasio's goal of 6% bicycle mode share by

2020. Nor do we have any hopes of achieving Vision Zero, no more traffic deaths by 2024. Not one of the 18 cyclists killed in crashes this year, I need to note, was killed on a protected path. We've come a long ways as a bicycling city these past few years to be sure. And the Department of Transportation has made great strides to clearly make safety a top priority. But we have a long bike lane ahead before we will truly lead the way for bicycling. I urge this committee to push hard on the Mayor and the DOT to ramp up the implementation protected lanes and an expanded and connected bike network. And to be champions in your own districts and citywide for making New York a truly world class bicycling city. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And again for the next member of the audience who wants to speak we are limiting it to one minute even though my plan is to have a meeting with everyone who as an individual or are representing an institution we would like to get together so that we can have some quality time to discuss your initiative. So because of the timing and the number of members in the audience that wants to share their concerns and their point of view we

are limiting to one minute. But I will be putting a meeting together with my staff so that we will be inviting all of you to have a conversation. With more time so that we can have a plan of working together.

PETER FRISHAUF: Thank you, Council, Chair Rodriguez, and the Council. My name is Peter Frishauf. I'm a life long resident of the Upper West Side, and I'm the Director of Streets Paths. My primary concern is this very modest five miles of protected bicycle lanes that has been alluded to this afternoon. On the Upper West Side alone, Community Board 7 has asked DOT to present a complete street plan for Amsterdam Avenue. If you extended that south into other arterials such as 5th and 6th Avenue, all very deadly streets, you would quickly exceed the five miles of protected lane that Commissioner Trottenberg described as 100 blocks just if they did it in Manhattan alone. With the expansion of Citi Bike, this can become a potentially deadly goal of just five miles of protected lanes. The City and the City Council very wisely supported the increase in protected lanes in advance of the

first Citi Bike rollout. They need to do the same right now. Thank you very much.

JOSHUA MILLER: Thank you Chairman Rodriguez and members of the Committee on Transportation for the opportunity to testify here today. I'm Joshua Miller. I'm actually going to testify for Chris Wojas, the President of Bike and Roll New York City. And Chairman we had a great relationship we've had a great relationship with you as we have tried to deal with the issue of illegal bike vendors at our cornerstone location at Central Park, Columbus Circle. Bike and Roll is City's largest bike tour and bike rental company, and we have ten locations in Manhattan, Brooklyn, and North Jersey. Since we began operations at that location in 2008, the presence of illegal bike vendors has undermined the City's efforts and ours to promote bike safety.

In addition to harassing tourists and threatening to Bike and Roll staff on a daily basis, these vendors illegally solicit rentals on Parks property with minimal or inconsistent enforcement. They rent out stolen equipment, which undermines the City's ambitious Vision Zero initiative. They also

harass Citi Bike employees near their docks in the vicinity of Central Park South. And we actually wrote a letter jointly with Bike Share to Deputy Mayor Alicia Glen. And besides that, they also fight amongst each other, and these real vendors partner with local bike shops to solicit rentals off book and tax free.

To conclude, you know that bike safety is our highest priority. We have included for you guys today packets of media coverage to date of the illegal vending situation at Central Park Columbus Circle along with letters that Council wrote to the Mayor, and our letter that we wrote with Bike Share to the Deputy Mayor. And we are thankful to you Chairman, and your colleagues for the support we have received to date. And we look forward to continuing our work with you on this very important safety issue.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I said that the beginning, we will have a future hearing with Consumer Affairs and the NYPD to address the other issues that were not included in today's hearing. So this is very important. I also have interviews I believe language and legislation addressing with some

guidance for individual institutions that are renting in our city.

JOSHUA MILLER: And I was aware of that. So thank you very much for that.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. So the next panel is Ken Podziba. Joanna Altman-Smith, Brad Conover, Steven Vacarro, and Keegan Stephan.

[Pause]

KEN PODZIBA: Should I go first? Okay. Hello, my name is Ken Podziba, and I'm the President of Bike New York, and I would like to thank Chairman Rodriguez and the Transportation Committee for allowing me to testify at this hearing. I've gotten to know a number of you over the years, and we are thrilled to work together to establish New York City as the standard by which other cycling cities around the world will be measure. This is our opportunity to reflect on how we can raise the bar and show not just America but the world what it means to embrace and cultivate a pedal-powered community.

Bike education plays a critical role in building a bike-friendly city. For nearly a decade, Bike New York has been New York City's bike education leader, and has developed the nation's largest urban



bike education program. In the past three years alone, we've held more than a thousand free classes and programs reaching more than 41,000 kids and adults throughout the five boroughs and growing the next generation of cyclists. We've held 432 free youth and adult learn to ride classes attended by more than 9,200 people who learned to ride a bike for the first time. More than 75% of adult participants are women, which is traditionally an under-represented population among cyclists.

We've held over 150 classes that cover basic bike skills, traffic safety tips and rules of the road. Since 2011, we've taught 2,100 adults and impressed upon them the importance of abiding by all traffic laws and conducting themselves in a responsible, courteous manner. As you've heard from the representatives of Citi Bike, we've partnered with them to develop a pilot program of first ever bike safety classes for an urban bike share program. Since Citi Bike's launch, we've held more than 50 classes, and reached more than a thousand Citi Bikers.

Many New York City youths rarely leave their neighborhood, and many don't ride bikes at all.

We're changing that with our summer camp and after school programs. For nearly three years, these programs, which operate out of 12 different locations throughout the five boroughs have provided more than 5,000 New York City campers, and almost 1,300 after school participants with the opportunities to learn how to ride.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]  
Sorry, but you have to summarize.

KEN PODZIBA: Okay, let me-- I just want to say that--

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing] We have your testimony, but because of the time as I said before we will have our meeting and more time. So we ask you to please summarize, and be aware that we are limited on time.

KEN PODZIBA: I will summarize. We ask the Committee to hear and approve Council Member Treyger's bill. Prohibiting the use of cell phones is one more step toward achieving the goals outlined in Mayor de Blasio's Vision Zero Initiative.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

KEN PODZIBA: Okay.

[Pause]

JOANNA ALTMAN-SMITH: Hi. My name is Joanna Altman-Smith. I'm an Safe Street Advocate. As New Yorkers we're fortunate to have many transportation options, but the one I personally choose to make as many trips a week with is with my bike. Because it's convenient, healthy, affordable, fun, and efficient. But, unfortunately, there are so many variables that disrupt my travels across the city, and I'm hoping that the Council will address some of these.

Our main priority should be tackling issues that endanger those who currently travel by bike, and prevent others who fear for their safety from even trying it at all. First, we need more Class 1 fully protected bike lanes, tons more. Simply put, if we continue to build infrastructure that removes road use conflicts, all road users will benefit. While the lack of this infrastructure continues to be a hurdle for many potential bicyclists. In particular children whose cognitive ability is non ready to put them on the streets contending with traffic. We need to vastly expand protected bike lanes so that riders of all ages and

abilities have a safe way to go about their daily business. And I will try and summarize quickly.

I had an idea that cyclists could start using traffic signalization that is set up for pedestrian priority because cyclists are just as vulnerable as pedestrians when it comes to contending with large vehicles at dangerous intersections. I am also hoping that the DOT will be much more efficient in handling roadway deficiencies because these present a real and present danger to people trying to get around the city on bike. And I am hopeful that the NYPD, while they have made great strides in improving enforcement in the past year, will come up with a way to incentivize their precincts to take traffic stat statistics as importantly as they take over crime comp stat statistics. There needs to be some way to motivate precincts who are currently ignoring Vision Zero and make sure that they are stepping up their enforcement to protect all of us. Thank you for your time.

BRAD CONOVER: Good afternoon, Chairman Rodriguez. My name is Brad Conover. I'm a co-founder of Bike Upper Manhattan. I'm here to speak and advocate for expansion of the bike network up

into Inwood and Washington Heights. As you may know, CB12 has adopted two resolutions asking for that kind of action. Very little has been done. We like the fact that the bike network is expanding, and we just believe that:

Number one, out of an interest in fairness to the less affluent areas in our neighborhoods bikes are extremely important both for economic and health reasons.

Number two, the area of Inwood and Washington Heights is a fairly narrow strip of land compared with the rest of Manhattan. You will get a big bang for your buck up there. A couple of protected lanes on North and South Avenues would make and tremendous difference, and have a great impact.

Number three and perhaps very important to all New York City residents. As you know, Chairman Rodriguez, our neighborhood is the hub of access north, south, east, and west for all cyclists and pedestrians. And the bridges up in our neighborhood are particularly dangerous getting access over. So improvements on those bridges will open up what is now a closed network to an open network.

1  
2 Finally, on the issue of safety, you  
3 heard Mary Beth's testimony. Dr. Nacht was my  
4 doctor. So that's very important to me. I had  
5 broken both my collar bone and my pelvis riding a  
6 bike. The issue in his accident and my accident was  
7 not just bike lanes, but the importance of paying  
8 attention to the conditions of the streets, and the  
9 bike paths themselves. For example, on the West Side  
10 now you have green lights where Dr. Nacht died.  
11 Years later. You have a green light on the Hudson  
12 Highway going south. Trucks are turning in, and you  
13 have a green light, a bicycle green light on the  
14 south. Bikes going on the path. So both are  
15 speeding up at the same time. So my point is there  
16 needs to be a sensitivity to these details as we  
17 implement Bike Network. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Definitely. As  
19 you know, as someone living in there, I would like  
20 you to follow up with Matthew Gewold [sic] one of my  
21 staff members so that we can meet and address some of  
22 those needs especially that we have there in Northern  
23 Manhattan.

24 BRAD CONOVER: Thank you.  
25

STEVE VACARRO: Thank you. My name is Steve Vacarro. I'm with the Law Firm of Vacarro and White. We represent pedestrian and cyclist crash victims. I am also very active in advocating for cyclists and pedestrian rights here in New York City. My comments are in my greater expanse found in my written comments. So I will refer to that, which includes many citations to what I'm about to say. We are doing a lot right for cycling in New York. What we're doing wrong is the way we do enforcement. And it's rooted in the attitudes of too many NYPD officers who through years of policing critical mass and how they're trained in the Academy are too often taught to look upon cyclists as criminals. I have taken discovery from the NYPD training materials, and the only thing they learn at the Academy is that kids on bikes or people on bikes may be drug couriers, or gang lookouts.

And this attitudes comes through in police giving criminal summonses for people who are bicycling on the sidewalk when it should just be a traffic violation. I don't think we need more law. What we need is [off mic]-- but there are 14 steps to even figuring out what law applies in a given

situation, much less what the law says. So adding new laws such as Mr. Treyger's bill, Council Member Treyger's bill, I would respectfully submit is not the way to go. But rather, keep it simple. Focus on things like failure to yield and staying off the sidewalk and going with the flow of traffic. We have a lot of work to do in that area with cyclists and enforcement is appropriate and needed before we start adding in new laws that the police, as shown in my comments I put in that time and again have issued summonses that need to be voided because they are not trained in what the traffic laws actually are that apply to cyclists.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: We will in today's hearing basically focus onto the DOT and expanding the Citi Bike, and the condition of the roads and the safety. So as I said, I have always said, I am looking forward to a future meeting with the NYPD, the Public Safety Committee, and the Consumer Affairs to address other issues related to this topic. And we will continue working, too.

STEVE VACARRO: Thank you.

KEEGAN STEPHAN: Thanks for holding this hearing. My name is Keegan Stephan. I'm an organizer



with Right-of-Way. There is also much more in my testimony that you can read. I'm going to skip to the data because I think it speaks for itself. I think that to achieve Vision Zero, we have to use all of our resources in a data driven manner, and if we all want to reduce cycling fatalities we need to look at the data on cycling fatalities. To that end, Right-of-Way compiled all the information available on every cycling fatality this year and codified the known causes. In five of the 18, three is no information available. Meaning it was not reported at the time of the crash, and no information has been given. In three of the remaining 13 cases, no action by the driver or cyclist is reported to have contributed to the crash. For example, it was not reported who had the green light in a crash in an intersection. And exactly one of the ten crashes for which there are any reported contributing factor, an error of the cyclist was the primary factor. In this case, the cyclist was riding against traffic. In the remaining nine of ten crashes for which there is any reported contributing factor, the driver is reported to have committed a violation that led to the death of the cyclist. I go onto detail all of those

violations, but suffice it to say that's nine of ten crashes in which--

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing] Ten more seconds.

STEPHAN KEEGAN: --the driver was at error, and their violation led to the death of the cyclist. So I think we should focus our resources on those drivers, and not waste it on law enforcement for cyclists, which is what we've seen through Operation Safe Cycle and more legislation that Mark Treyger's bill proposes.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Is that it? Yes, sir?

STEPHAN KEEGAN: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Again, a great idea, a great suggestion. I will be reading those documents, and also study that I want with Vision Zero. I think it is important to have this framework basically to know where we are when it comes to the bikes. Not only the Bike Share but the bike lane for the bike rental, the safety. And as we also say like we are just embodying everyone from drivers to pedestrians to cyclists for all the boroughs to contribute in improving the safety in our streets.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 123

2 But the protected bike lane for me is one of the top

3 priorities that I will have when it comes to bikes.

4 The next panel Anthony Griffith, Alex Amadeo [sp?]

5 Brian Beninghove [sp?], Hilda Cohen, Martina Bravo,

6 and Jobi Jackie [sp?].

7 [Pause]

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Did I call your

9 name?

10 [Pause]

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Did I call your

12 name, sir?

13 ANTHONY GRIFFITH: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sit in the chair,

15 sir. Okay, you may begin.

16 ANTHONY GRIFFITH: Good afternoon,

17 Councilman. My name is Anthony Griffith. I am-- I

18 wear many hats, but primarily I am a member of the

19 Bus Industry Safety Council. I am World Certified

20 Director of Safety and Security in the World Safety

21 Organization, and I have been a bus operator in New

22 York City for 30 plus years. I have notice that part

23 of the problems are the placement of bus lanes in the

24 city. There is no continuity to them. They could be

25 on the left side. They could be on the right side.

On one-way streets, they could be anywhere, and they are also shared lanes in the city on roads that should not be because there not enough room on those lanes. And there are even situations in the cities where bus lanes and bike lanes are in the same place. So you can't have a bus lane and a bike lane together. As far as enforcement, just fairness doing your part. Everybody has to be responsible for themselves. I see many incidents where there are many violations of laws with bicycles and some vehicles. And so there should be some sort of shared responsibility. Thank you.

ALEX AMADEO: Hi. Thank you for the opportunity to speak. My name is Alex Amadeo. I'm a Transportation Alternative Member, and I'm an advocate for Safe Streets. I'll be Brief. I heard some excellent and very optimistic views of the expansion of Citi Bike and the infrastructure for cycling, but I would Point to Mr. Steely White's map showing that really do need more for access in Northern Manhattan and Queens and Outer Boroughs before we necessarily get Citi Bike in there. So I think that I would call for DOT to speed up the implementation of bike lanes there. I think a lot of

the council members from outer boroughs and places with less infrastructure has expressed interest in that. And I also think that a lot of them have expressed even the ability to pay or the willingness to pay for Citi Bike expansion. So would encourage you to maybe try to do a pilot program to get some kind of maybe quicker paced expansion with your areas. [bell]

BRIAN BENINGHOVE: Thank you to the Council. Thank you to Chair Rodriguez for hearing us today. My name is Brian Beninghove [sp?], and I currently serve on Manhattan Community Board Six as well as the New York Cycle Club Board. I'm an avid bike participant and trainer as well as Safe Streets Advocate. And I'll wrap up my remarks quickly. I can elaborate with my written remarks that I've submitted. Basically, with my observation and participation activities in New York City regarding cycling here is what I recommend.

Please continue to study all modes of transit, and make personal observations about how the different modes interact with one another. Note that established designs like complete streets have recently gained favor, have been talked about in the

community boards surrounding 5th, 6th, and 7th Avenues. Do not give into a witch hunt mentality against cyclists. Do not let enforcement habits and priorities become the guideline of future policy. Instead, focus on facts, direct observations and professional studies. And dedicate more resources to encouraging cycling and supporting cycling assisting facilities in the City. I have faith that you can achieve much progress in encouraging safe cycling in New York by heeding these recommendations. I hope you will consider them. Thank you.

HILDA COHEN: Okay, I'm Hilda Cohen. Thank you. I'm here on the behalf of Kidical Mass, New York City. We bring together kids and their adults for group rides in New York City, and we celebrate the fact that the kids are traffic, too. We aim for family fun on vehicles that don't hurt our future, and we use it as another excuse to peddle around the city with your kids. We focus our routes on protected bike lanes, and some of the great amenities and infrastructure. But guess what? We can't get there. The end. Halfway through our routes, we have to get off. We have to go 15, 20 blocks out of our way because they don't connect.

These gaps are blips on a map, but they're like chasms when you're actually on the street. So filling in the gaps in our networks, in the networks that actually exist that is one of the most important things. It shouldn't be part of 50 additional bike lanes we have. And once that paint is gone, you don't have a bike any more. You are stuck in the middle of the street, and when it's your kids, when it's vulnerable people, it's going to stop them from keeping biking.

[Pause]

MARTINA BRAVO: [Speaking Spanish]

TRANSLATOR: Thank you to the Transportation Committee for this opportunity to speak. My name is Martina Bravo, and I'm a member of Immigrant Movement International, and Women in Movement by We Bike.

MARTINA BRAVO: [Speaking Spanish]

TRANSLATOR: As a group of women we have the experience together of learning how to use bicycles. We learned about bike maintenance and the rules to follow, and we had an education that was spiritual and even emotional. I was really terrified of getting on a bike, and I didn't buy my children

bicycles because I was afraid of the streets. But I have the necessity and so I learned.

MARTINA BRAVO: [Speaking Spanish]

TRANSLATOR: Now, I go out and enjoy the park with grandchildren, and my friends who have also learned to ride a bike. My friends and I are members of the community that have learned to appreciate the benefits of riding bicycles.

MARTINA BRAVO: [Speaking Spanish]

TRANSLATOR: But we've also learned the rules, and we learned what it is-- what is needed that we all learn the rules. We also need bike lanes. For example, in my neighborhood in Corona, Queens, we need a better way to get to Flushing Meadows Corona park in a way that is safe. A protected bike lane on 111th Street is fundamental. We also support the addition of a protected bike lane on Queens Boulevard.

MARTINA BRAVO: [Speaking Spanish]

TRANSLATOR: We appreciate your help and cooperation with the construction of new bike lanes, and the education of the community. Many thanks.



CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. So the next panel. David Dartley, Elena Santogade, Michael Moses, and Thomas Levitt.

[Pause]

DAVID DARTLEY: Hi, my name is David Dartley, and I'm just a citizen who has been biking for years. I am just so pleased that the New York City Council is having hearing called Leading the Way for Bicycling in America. I've been a bike commuter for ten years, and also using a bike for lots of different transportation needs. For New York City to continue to lead America in cycling, it's got to go way beyond five miles a year for bike expansion. I know it's been sort of heralded and applauded, but it's kind of not sufficient.

Citi Bike expanding is amazingly important, but don't just expand it. Add a biking dock saturation to the already served area, too. Without doing that, expanding will not help the problem of rebalancing, which remains an unfortunate major fault in the system. One way the city can try to lead is to meet the admittedly very difficult design challenges, slowing down all vehicles, including bikes on one hand, yet improving the

ability for buses and emergency vehicles to move fast. But if those two things really are mutually exclusive, better to favor the former. Well, slowing down vehicles because that's a better net for public health and safety. Thanks.

ELENA SANTOGADE: Hello, my name is Elena Santogade [sp?]. I've lived in Prospect Heights Brooklyn for the past nine years, and I've been commuting by bicycle in New York City for as long. I currently work out of an office in Crown Heights, Brooklyn on Atlantic Avenue between Kingston and Albany Avenues. I bike to and from this office a few times a week, and it was brought to my attention the need for a better street design on Atlantic Avenue. From July 2012 to the present there have been 13 deaths on Atlantic Avenue and 1,419 crashes causing injury. Not to mention the over 6,000 total crashes that have occurred on Atlantic Avenue in this time.

Right now, I go out of my way to avoid riding or walking on Atlantic but with an office address right on the avenue, I have to brave a couple of blocks either way. I doing so, I see how much this thoroughway can benefit from the kind of street redesign that we've seen on 8th and 9th Avenues in

Manhattan. Not only to keep me safe during my commute, but to benefit all street users, to ensure that the kids crossing from the C train to the school that's on my block can't get clipped by a turning truck. Or, that the bicyclists, who would benefit from the use of this street, aren't contending with cars that speed ahead as the road widens. Thank you.

MICHAEL MOSES: Council, my name is Michael Moses. The City Council passed a regulation requiring landlords to make buildings bike accessible. Presumably, this regulation was for the advantage the bike community who wanted to bring their bikes to the city and wanted to leave them in buildings. Unfortunately, the advantage is not reaching the intended beneficiaries because it is mediated by tenants. The tenants of the buildings, i.e., corporations and businesses themselves decide whether or not they are going to take advantage of this access. And many of them are not taking advantage of this access. So the employees and workers cannot bring their bicycles into the buildings.

One of the biggest in the City of New York is presumably the City of New York.

Unfortunately, the City of New York does not have a uniform policy with regard to bringing bikes into buildings and, therefore, many of the City employees themselves cannot bring their bikes into the buildings and, therefore, are inhibited from riding their bikes to work. A uniform policy by the City of New York will allow all City employees to bike commute with if they chose to by allowing them a secure place to leave their bikes. Because as far as the inhibiting factor to bike commuters is where do you leave your bike? If you find a place to lock it up outside, components such as it being held and your license can be taken away for the bike. So bike security is paramount. So now if you have city policy, first of all the city becomes the leader setting the example for the bikes and encourages more bike commuting for the bike community.

I would like to address the sister bill that this was--

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing] 15 seconds.

MICHAEL MOSES: 15 seconds. The city also passed a regulation saying-- they had a clause you have to allow bikes in garages, but they never

promulgated any regulations for anything further saying about the cost unlike the other regulation. So garages charge as much for a bike as a car. So if you go and look at any bike rack in the City of New York in a garage, they are empty because the City needs to address that and put a value on what they could charge. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

THOMAS LEVITT: Council, thanks so much. I'm actually reading a letter on behalf of Rod Taylor of Friends of Morningside Park. So thank you for holding this important oversight hearing today, and for the opportunity to submit testimony. I'm a 56-year-old resident of West Harlem and Morningside Heights who became an avid bicyclist less than 18 months ago. His experience has been life changing for me, and I believe can and will be for many other residents of Upper Manhattan provided we have improved key aspects of the city's infrastructure to encourage this healthy and environmentally friendly form of transportation.

Firstly, I would like to ask the City for improvements to bridges, crossing to and from Harlem. I believe that some of the dangerous conditions for

cyclists at these bridges have been an impediment to getting more people like me to venture onto bicycles, and make trips between boroughs. I look forward to any plan improvements that will help alleviate the dangerous conditions. And I will skip to the conclusion.

Lastly, I urge the Council to strongly support the expansion of Citi Bike Program in Harlem and Upper Manhattan. This is a crucial matter of equity. Corporate sponsors must not be allowed to cherry pick areas with the highest incomes in the city and leave out those less fortunate who have perhaps the most to gain from the healthy benefits of cycling. I thank you again for allowing me to submit this testimony. [bell]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. With that, we have come to the end of this hearing. I would like to thank our committee staff, our great committee staff, Kelly Taylor, our Counsel; Jonathan Masserano, Policy Analyst; and Gafar Zaaloff, and Chima Obichere, Finance Analyst, and Gafar our Policy, and my Communication Director Lucas Acosta, and my Chief of Staff Carmen De La Rosa.

2           Again, there is a lot that we have to  
3   celebrate. Having our city, the city that has the  
4   best bike program in the nation. We will continue  
5   working with all of you, and everyone in here today  
6   to continue improving safety for all of use,  
7   cyclists, pedestrians, drivers. We can make this  
8   together. Thank you. And with this, this meeting is  
9   adjourned. [gavel]

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 25, 2014