

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

November 25, 2014
Start: 1:35 p.m.
Recess: 3:14 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Melissa Mark-Viverito
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Margaret S. Chin
Rosie Mendez
Corey D. Johnson
Daniel R. Garodnick
Ben Kallos
Helen K. Rosenthal
Mark Levine
Inez E. Dickens
Ydanis Rodriguez
Andrew Cohen
Andy L. King
James Vacca
Fernando Cabrera
Ritchie J. Torres
Vanessa L. Gibson
Maria Del Carmen Arroyo
Annabel Palma
Paul A. Vallone
Peter A. Koo

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Council Members:

Julissa Ferreras
Costa G. Constantinides
Mark S. Weprin
Rory I. Lancman
Daniel Dromm
James G. Van Bramer
I. Daneek Miller
Ruben Wills
Karen Koslowitz
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Donovan J. Richards
Eric A. Ulrich
Stephen T. Levin
Antonio Reynoso
Laurie A. Cumbo
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Rafael Espinal, Jr.
Carlos Menchaca
Bradford S. Lander
Mathieu Eugene
Darlene Mealy
Inez D. Barron
Vincent J. Gentile
David G. Greenfield
Jumaane D. Williams
Alan N. Maisel
Mark Treyger
Chaim M. Deutsch
Deborah L. Rose
Steven Matteo
Vincent M. Ignizio

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Letitia James
Public Advocate

Henry Timms
92nd Street Y

Zachary Glenn Jones
Bishop at Unity Fellowship Church of Christ

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I think we're
3 going to get started. We have three ceremonials
4 today. First, we'd like to ask our colleague Council
5 Member Ben Kallos, which is declaring December 2nd,
6 coming up soon, as Giving Tuesday, and we have here
7 the head of the 92nd Street Y, who has started the
8 Giving Tuesday movement, right? So we want to hand
9 it over to Council Member Ben Kallos.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Hey everybody,
11 how are we doing today? At this time of year, New
12 Yorkers come together to consider what they're
13 thankful for. Giving Tuesday, a new national day of
14 giving, encourages us to show what we are thankful
15 for by giving back. The 92nd Street Y, in
16 partnership with the UN Foundation founded Giving
17 Tuesday to encourage generosity and giving to the
18 causes that are important to individuals. In 2013,
19 more than 10,000 charities of volunteer
20 organizations, corporations and foundations come
21 together in over 40 countries with one common
22 purpose, to help others to incentivize ways to give
23 more, give smarter, and kick off the holiday giving
24 season, and it has raised giving. We have seen up to
25 a 90 percent increase in giving from the years prior.

1
2 Giving Tuesday has also changed the global
3 conversation. It has reached millions through
4 traditional media and more than 300 million on
5 Facebook, as well as two billion individuals on
6 Twitter. I'd love to have that many followers
7 myself. I could not be more pleased to honor Henry
8 Timms, the excellent new Director at the 92nd Y, and
9 the Y itself, which is a jewel of my district for its
10 efforts to promote Giving Tuesday. Under Henry
11 Timms, the 92nd Street Y is innovating and elevating
12 the traditional community center. The world renowned
13 organization continues to impress New Yorkers with
14 its excellent offerings and generosity of spirit. In
15 2014, Henry Timms was named the Nonprofit Times
16 Influencer of the Year. In addition to being
17 Executive at the Y, he is a member of the selection
18 committee for the 2015 CECP Excellence Awards and the
19 Lipman Prize Committee at the Wharton School at the
20 University of Pennsylvania. Henry serves on the
21 board of the Nightingale-Bamford School in New York.
22 He is also a fellow of the Royal Society for the Arts
23 where he is Chair of the nominating committee for the
24 RSA's Benjamin Franklin medal. The 92nd Street Y is
25 now celebrating its 140th anniversary. It has always

1 celebrated health and fitness, the arts, Jewish life
2 and more. It welcomes 300,000 people a year. Thank
3 you to Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito for joining us
4 in honoring the 92nd Street Y and its Executive
5 Director Henry Timms for founding Giving Tuesday, and
6 the Council is thrilled to declare December 2nd to be
7 Giving Tuesday.
8

9 [applause]

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Council, City of New York
11 Proclamation, whereas at this time of year New
12 Yorkers come together again for Thanksgiving to
13 express our gratitude for the countless blessings in
14 our lives and to reflect upon the meaningful progress
15 as well as the aspirations for a better world which
16 remain. Henry Timms, the Executive Director of New
17 York's 92nd Street Y recognized this, and in
18 partnership with the United Nations Foundation
19 founded a new national day, Giving Tuesday, and
20 whereas, Giving Tuesday is a new national day of
21 giving added to the calendar, the Tuesday following
22 Thanksgiving, Black Friday and Cyber Monday.
23 Families and individuals are encouraged to be
24 generous in whatever ways that matter to them,
25 whether that means volunteering at a local charity or

1 donating to a favorite cause, and whereas, in 2013
2 more than 10,000 charities, volunteer organizations,
3 corporations and foundations came together in over 40
4 countries with one common purpose, to help others and
5 to incentivize ways to give more, give smarter, and
6 kick off the holiday giving season. This was an
7 enormous increase from the year before. In fact, one
8 source measured a 90 percent increase in online
9 giving when compared to Giving Tuesday 2012, which
10 was increased by 53 percent from 2011. The number of
11 transactions increased by 36 percent and the size of
12 donations increased by 40 percent, and whereas with
13 the support of the White House, Bill and Melinda
14 Gates and many celebrities and philanthropists,
15 Giving Tuesday has a tremendously positive impact.
16 Last year, Paypal saw a 123.8 percent increase in the
17 total US charitable donations on Giving Tuesday, and
18 many other sources, including the online fundraising
19 site Network for Good, the United Methodist Church
20 and Good Ventures all reported significant increases
21 compared to 2012. Giving Tuesday has also already
22 reached millions through traditional media and more
23 than 300 million on Facebook as well as two billion
24 individuals on Twitter, and whereas, we commend Mr.
25

1 Timms and the 92nd Street Y for their visionary
2 efforts to raise awareness and motivate global action
3 for the common good, the inherent desire we share to
4 help our fellow neighbor transcends politics and
5 exemplifies our national spirit. Whether it's a
6 family at the dinner table discussing giving, a local
7 school organizing a blood drive, a large company
8 organizing its employees to volunteer or an entire
9 city rallying residents to drive change. People
10 everywhere can find their own ways to celebrate their
11 common bond of community, whether we look toward the
12 coming year with cautious optimism or eager
13 anticipation, may we remember the best way to predict
14 the future is to create it, beginning with and never
15 ending on Giving Tuesday. Now therefore, be it known
16 that the Council of the City of New York hereby
17 proclaims December 2nd, 2014 to be #GivingTuesday in
18 the City of New York, Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker
19 for the entire council, Ben Kallos Council Member 5th
20 District Manhattan.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay. So, thank
23 you Mr. Timms. If you want to say a few words? You
24 were sharing with me some great information regarding
25 one of my organizations in my district and how they

1
2 are participating in Giving Tuesday. So if you want
3 to say a few words? Thank you for your leadership.

4 HENRY TIMMS: Thank you, Speaker, and
5 thank you, Councilman. This year, on December the
6 2nd over a thousand organizations in New York will be
7 participating in Giving Tuesday. So after two days
8 of Black Friday and Cyber Monday, they're all about
9 consuming things. Giving Tuesday is a day about what
10 the 92nd Street Y is about, which is community. And
11 I just want to give you two examples of things that
12 are going to be happening on Giving Tuesday. The
13 Union Assessment [sic] Association in East Harlem, on
14 Giving Tuesday, are sending their staff out into the
15 community to hand out single fare metro cards, and
16 the Nightingale-Bamford School near us at the 92nd
17 Street Y has created a free online curriculum for
18 teachers and children everywhere so they can learn
19 about how to be givers early in their lives. So, on
20 Giving Tuesday, December the 2nd, let me encourage
21 all of you to find a way to give back to the
22 community in New York that we all cherish. Thank
23 you, Speaker. Thank you, Ben.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you so
25 much. Great, good work. Congratulations. Okay, the

1
2 next one, we have another ceremonial by our colleague
3 Costa Constantinides, the 20th anniversary of Sharing
4 and Caring, and Costa will let us know a few words.
5 Alright, Costa, it's all yours.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Alright,
7 so we have from Sharing and Caring we have their
8 President Anna Kril. We also have Board Members and
9 Founder Eartha Washington, Carolyn Scarano and Mary
10 Demakos. We have Anna Zabniakh, Mercy Pechinio
11 [sp?], Rosa and Laura Jean Hawkins. Sharing and
12 Caring was founded on May 7th, 1994 by Anna Kril,
13 Carolyn Scarano, Lucille Hartmann and Mary Demakos.
14 The group was founded to serve and support women
15 diagnosed and treated for breast and other cancer
16 exclusive to women. The organization also provides
17 countless services to families of these women as
18 well. Since their founding in 1994, Sharing and
19 Caring has helped hundreds if not thousands of women
20 in finding treatment and comforting them in their
21 final days. Through advocacy, the group strives to
22 dramatically improve medical services for all women
23 through early detection treatment and information
24 about living with the effects of breast cancer. For
25 over a decade, Sharing and Caring has partnered with

1
2 local physicians in our hospitals to offer a wide
3 range of medical services that have saved countless
4 lives. Because of these reasons we are proud to honor
5 Sharing and Caring for 20 years of their services.
6 And really, this is an organization about hope and
7 about love. The City Council played a major role in
8 the very beginning. Speaker Peter Vallone, Senior,
9 who was here earlier today, was one of the first
10 Council Members to fund them, and we've had a
11 continued relationship with Sharing and Caring and
12 really giving hope for those in their days in finding
13 out about their cancer diagnosis and giving them the
14 love that they need to survive cancer and to
15 transcend cancer. So, thank you for all the great
16 work that all of you do to benefit not only Astoria,
17 but our entire borough of Queens. Thank you.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Could I
20 please have the clerk read the proclamation?

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Council, city of New York
22 proclamation, whereas the Council of the city of New
23 York is proud to honor Sharing and Caring for 20
24 years of dedicated service to women and their
25 families, and whereas, Sharing and Caring was founded

1 on May 7th, 1994 by Anna Kril, Carolyn Scarano,
2 Lucille Hartmann and Mary Demakos to serve and
3 support women diagnosed with and treated for breast
4 cancer and other cancers and to instill hope in those
5 facing such diseases. It is not only provided
6 meaningful support to these women, but also their
7 families, and whereas, Sharing and Caring wide range
8 of services include everything from pharmaceutical
9 assistance to providing transportation for women
10 undergoing treatment. The organization also provides
11 breast health outreach and support and advocacy
12 services for medically underserved and uninsured
13 women. Over the course of the last two decades,
14 Sharing and Caring has helped hundreds if not
15 thousands of women in finding treatment and much
16 needed comfort, and whereas Sharing and Caring has
17 also served the community by providing individual
18 advocacy, referrals, support groups, stress reduction
19 workshops and educational forums. Through their
20 advocacy, this group strives to dramatically improve
21 medical services to all women through early detection
22 treatment and information about living with the
23 effects of breast cancer, and whereas equally
24 important, Sharing and Caring has worked tirelessly
25

1
2 and successfully to increase awareness about the
3 importance of early detection, self-administered
4 breast examinations and mammography screenings, and
5 also partnered with local physicians and hospitals to
6 offer a wide range of medical services. Now
7 therefore, be it known that the Council of the city
8 of New York gratefully honors Sharing and Caring in
9 celebration of its 20th anniversary and its
10 outstanding service to women and their families in
11 New York City, Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the
12 entire Council, Costa Constantinides, Council Member
13 22nd District Queens.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright. Well,
15 congratulations, and who is going to be speak on
16 behalf of this great organization?

17 UNIDENTIFIED: I'll speak for all of us.
18 The founders are here. We're 20 year breast cancer
19 survivors and this organization was founded by breast
20 cancer survivors and I'm happy to say we're still
21 alive today.

22 [applause]

23 UNIDENTIFIED: So, anyone-- and healthy
24 and well. We are very grateful to this council and
25 to our Speaker for this wonderful, wonderful

1
2 recognition and we thank you very much, but we also
3 want to say that we are very, very committed not only
4 to eradicating the pain and suffering of those who
5 are diagnosed with cancer, but we are most committed
6 to our young women and our young men in helping them
7 to be empowered and very vigilant about their
8 wellbeing and their health, and sharing the messages
9 that they learned from us throughout our high school
10 outreaches to bring those messages home, share it
11 with their parents, and encourage their parents to go
12 for screening so that they do not have to succumb end
13 stage cancer. So, this is what Sharing and Caring is
14 all about, and as survivors, I'm sure we more than
15 happy to be here this afternoon. So we thank you all
16 so very, very much.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Congratulations.
18 Congratulations. It means a lot the work that you do
19 on behalf of so many women in the city of New York.
20 So thank you for that. Thank you. Okay, the last
21 ceremonial by three of our colleagues, Council
22 Members Chin, Mendez and Johnson. They are
23 recognizing Doris Diether. I hope--Diether, 50th
24 anniversary as a Community Board Member, 50 years.

1
2 Alright. So I'll hand it off to my colleagues. Who
3 will start?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. So let's
5 invite up Doris. We also have Terry Koo [sp?], the
6 Vice Chair of Community Board Two and Bob Golemi
7 [sp?] the District Manager of Community Board Two.
8 So, today, Council Member Johnson, Mendez and I would
9 like to honor a very special woman who has a huge
10 impact on her neighborhood as a member of Manhattan
11 Community Board Two. Doris Diether--Diether was
12 appointed to the Community Board Two in 1964, and she
13 has served as Community Board Two member for 50
14 years. Just by itself that is a monumental community
15 achievement, right? But Doris has not just sat on
16 Community Board Two for 50 years. Throughout that
17 time she has taken strong action to protect her
18 community against bad landlords, developers and play
19 a key role in helping to defeat Robert Moses' plan
20 for the West Way [sic] and the Millet [sic]. Doris
21 is a true community icon for the village, and she is
22 greatly considered to be truly a wise member of
23 Community Board Two. So, it is our pleasure to
24 present this proclamation to Doris on her incredible
25

1
2 commitment to the community. So, yes, Council Member
3 Johnson?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I do not know
5 how Doris has done it. Fifty years on any Community
6 Board would be monumental. Fifty years on Community
7 Board Two is something even more special. For those-
8 -the Speaker was on CB Two, you guys served together.
9 I served eight and a half years on the Community
10 Board before I was elected to the Council, and that
11 felt like eight life times. So, I don't know how
12 you've done it. Doris, you are amazing. You are a
13 true treasure of Greenwich Village and of our city,
14 and we are so deeply grateful for your commitment to
15 service and all that you have done over the many
16 decades. By the time I was born in 1982, you had
17 already been on the Community Board for 18 years. I
18 can't even fathom that. So, thank you very much,
19 Doris, congratulations.

20 [applause]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you. So
22 this is a really special moment. Fifty years on a
23 Community Board, never mind 50 days would be enough
24 sometimes depending on the board, but you have three
25 Council Members here who really respect and love

1
2 Doris. When I became a Chief of Staff of my
3 predecessor we were dealing with something called the
4 Cooper Union Large Scale Development Plan. We had a
5 joint taskforce of Community Boards Two and Three,
6 and I was told, "Go see the zoning maven. Learn
7 everything you need to know about zoning." That's
8 Doris Diether, and so between Doris and then my
9 friend on CB3 who later became my Chief of Staff,
10 Lisa Kaplan [sp?], I know everything, and what I
11 don't know, don't blame on them. That has to do with
12 me. But this is a real special moment. She's
13 dedicated her life to zoning, spot zoning,
14 preservation, and it is just wonderful that we were
15 able to get here today to celebrate this moment.
16 And Madam Speaker, you served on CB Two, so you know
17 what a big moment this is. Thank you very much.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And we're going
19 to have the clerk read the proc. I lived on West
20 Fourth between McDougal [sic] and Sixth for several
21 years. I served on the board around three years, so
22 I know what a tough board that is. And so,
23 congratulations on your service, and if the clerk
24 could read the proclamation.

25

COUNCIL CLERK: Council City of New York

proclamation: Whereas Doris Diether has served as a member of Community Board Two for 50 years since her appointment in 1964 and has been advocating for tenant's rights and the character of Greenwich Village since serving as the Chair of the Tenant's Committee of Save the Village in 1959. And whereas, Ms. Deither has been involved in numerous civic advocacy efforts, large and small, from preventing Robert Moses' plan for the Houston [sic] Westway [sic] to protecting E. E. Cummings from eviction and other work on behalf of countless other tenants, and whereas Ms. Diether, armed with her knowledge of New York City zoning has authored articles and taught classes about the subject she is so familiar with. Her work has earned her a page in the Remington Registry of Outstanding Professionals. Doris has taught a zoning course for the Municipal Art Society for several years. Her lectures and her courses have been accredited by the American Institute of Architects, and by the City--and the City Planning Commission acknowledges her expertise in zoning and welcomes her editing of their zoning material. And whereas, Ms. Diether has used her position as a

1
2 Community Board Member to help those who could not
3 help themselves. In 2013, the New York Times
4 described her as a one woman shame squad against
5 crooked landlords, reckless renovators and haughty
6 developers all over the city. And whereas, through
7 her work tenacity and love of her city and its
8 cultural heritage, Ms. Diether can be called the
9 mother of historic preservation, one of the nation's
10 leading authorities on zoning, a fighter who once
11 walked a pig around the Governor's office to protest
12 greed and corruption, fought Robert Moses and won,
13 and whereas, whether referred to as a passionate
14 advocate, public figure or land use expert, Ms.
15 Diether is truly an inspiration to community activist
16 and puppeteers alike. She is beloved by countless
17 people in our community. After five decades of
18 incredible work, she can rest assured that her
19 dedication will continue to have a very positive
20 impact and shape our city for generations to come.
21 She is a true champion for her fellow New Yorkers.
22 Now therefore, be it known that the Council of the
23 City of New York gratefully honors Doris Diether for
24 50 years of outstanding service to Community Board
25 Two and the community at large, Melissa Mark-

1
2 Viverito, Speaker for the entire Council, Margaret S.
3 Chin, Council Member First District Manhattan, Corey
4 Johnson, Council Member Third District Manhattan,
5 Rosie Mendez Council Member Second District
6 Manhattan.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, and with
8 that--

9 [applause]

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And with that,
11 Doris, if you could say a few words.

12 DORRIS DIETHER: Well, I started in 1957,
13 I think, working on community affairs, and I believe
14 everybody should get involved in their communities
15 and put in efforts to get, find out what's going on
16 in their community and get active in it.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you very
18 much.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, and with
20 that, we end ceremonials on a high note. Thank you,
21 Doris.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Ladies and Gentleman, can
23 I have your attention, please? Can I please have
24 your attention? All quiet in the Chambers, please.
25 At this time, please place all electronic devices to

1
2 vibrate. Will all non-Council employees, non-Council
3 employees please leave the main floor of the
4 chambers. You can have a seat in the balcony. Thank
5 you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise. Those
7 not having business before the Council, please exit.
8 Please rise for the pledge of allegiance, and please
9 remove your hats. I pledge allegiance to the flag of
10 the United States of America, and to the Republic for
11 which it stands, one nation, under God, indivisible
12 with liberty and justice for all. Please be seated.
13 Roll call.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Arroyo? Barron?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I rise, Council
16 Member King here. We stand today as members of the
17 New York City Council representing our
18 majority/minority city to proclaim in city that Black
19 lives Matter.

20 [gavel]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Black lives matter.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] Black
24 lives matter.
25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member,
3 your view--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] In
5 Ferguson, Missouri--

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
7 Council Member please, you're out of order.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] black
9 lives matter.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
11 King, may--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [cross-talk] of
13 NYCHA as well as--

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] I
15 please have your attention?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] the
17 streets of Staten Island--

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
19 Council Member King--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] black
21 lives matter to the--

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] I
23 need your attention, please.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] In
25 the present [sic] city of America, in the body--

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

24

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

Council Member King, I would ask that--

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [cross-talk]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: you please cease.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] Not
as members of Michael Brown's family--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

Council Member King, we are in the middle of Roll
Call.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing]

[cross-talk] justice in the criminal justice system.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
King--

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] Not
when young people putting bodies on the line--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
Please--

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing]
marching the streets to met with tear gas--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
Council Member King, we are in the middle roll call.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] smoke
bombs and--

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

3 Council Member King, we are in the middle of roll

4 call.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] There

6 is no American tradition of--

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] Next

8 roll call after Barron.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] That,

10 we will be walking out today--

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

12 Real the roll call please.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: That is thing--

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

16 Next.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] this

19 body does not run.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next?

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing]

23 [cross-talk] all of us.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next.

25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 26

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] In

3 the Council, we're asking--

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] for

7 your support to join us as we--

8 COUNCIL CLERK: [interposing]

9 Constantinides?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] our

11 statement that black lives matter.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Constantinides?

13 Next.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Black lives matter.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Black lives

17 matter.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Crowley?

20 UNIDENTIFIED: Black lives matter.

21 [chanting]

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch?

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 27

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Dickens?

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Dickens? Next.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Ferreras?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: Black lives matter.

16 [chanting]

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next member,

18 please.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Garodnick.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Gentile?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson? Greenfield?

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 28

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Johnson?

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Next.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated

7 in the balcony.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Next.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: King? Koo?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman? Lander?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin? Levine?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel? Matteo?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy? Menchaca?

21 Mendez? Miller? Palma? Reynoso? Richards?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez? Rose?

24 Rosenthal?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger? Ulrich? Vacca?

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Weprin?

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Williams? Wills?

Ignizio? Van Bramer?

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Here.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the chambers, please. We're counting vo--we're counting doing the roll call. We have a quorum. Please rise for the invocation. Quiet in the chambers. Invocation delivered by Bishop Zachary Glenn Jones, Unity Fellowship Church of Christ at 2131 Fifth Avenue in Manhattan.

BISHOP JONES: Dear Holy One, we come to you in the most humble fashion, giving thanks for your many blessings and loving care. In this assembly of our caretakers of this wonderful city, we

1
2 give thanks for diversity. We give thanks for
3 peaceful city. We give thanks for our ability to
4 recognize that we are all one with you and with each
5 other. We ask for your continued guidance and wisdom
6 towards our greater good. We ask for your guidance
7 around the difficult issues such as housing, jobs,
8 immigration and our land usage. We are all aware
9 that our world has changed and we must change with
10 it. We are all aware that our demographics have
11 changed and we must change with it. We are all aware
12 that our earth is changing and we must change with
13 it. As change is never easy, give us the insight to
14 say as Doctor King stated that we are now faced with
15 the fact that tomorrow is today. We have confronted
16 with the fears, urgency of now in this unfolding
17 quandrum [sic] of life and history there is such a
18 thing as being too late. We may cry desperately for
19 time to pause in her passage, but time is deaf and
20 with every plea she rushes on. Therefore, let us be
21 fortified with the courage to change the way we
22 relate to one another and the way we take care of
23 those who are most vulnerable to the tides of change
24 within our climate, within our housing policies,
25 within our urban, ex-urban and suburban dwellings.

1
2 Be with those who are struggling with HIV and AIDS
3 and other physical challenges. Allow us to make the
4 choices today that bring peace to all who suffer and
5 strengthen those who live among us. Amen.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.
7 We'd like to thank Bishop Jones for his invocation.
8 Bishop Jones's church was once in the 35th
9 Councilmatic [sic] District of which I was the former
10 Council Member. Thank him for his invocation during
11 this difficult time and the challenges not only in
12 our city and our nation. May he continue to look out
13 for the most vulnerable and those who are living with
14 AIDS, and particularly the LGBT community. So I thank
15 Bishop Jones, and I now make a motion to spread the
16 invocation in full upon the record. Council Member
17 Richards?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Motion to
19 spread the minutes of the Stated Meeting of October
20 22nd be adopted as printed.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Messages and
22 papers from the Mayor?

23 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
25 from city, county and borough offices?

COUNCIL CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
communications?

COUNCIL CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use call-
ups?

COUNCIL CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
chamber. Quiet in the chambers as we now hear from
the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
Public Advocate and good afternoon to all my
colleagues. You know, I would be remiss if I didn't
start off today's communication from the Speaker by
acknowledging what is currently happening in
Ferguson, Missouri and in areas all across this
nation. Obviously as a result of last night's
decision to not indict Officer Darren Wilson in the
death of Michael Brown. Today, my heart, and as I'm
sure it is for many of my colleagues goes out to the
Brown family and to all of those who are undergoing
unfortunately similar circumstances. This case and
the death of Michael Brown and the subsequent
actions, inactions, decisions is a constant reminder

1
2 of the greater systemic challenges that we have and
3 that each struggle against. Those of us that have as
4 a moral compass equity and justice really should
5 strive and be motivated and moved to continue to
6 fight for change, and that is what is happening right
7 now across this nation, is a demand for change. Many
8 of us here will continue to advocate for reforms and
9 for changes in police practices, and what has
10 happened last night and what is happening throughout
11 this nation is a call to action. We need to continue
12 to strive for equality for all. So, it is a moment
13 to do that and it is a calling. So today I want to
14 talk about a number of bills and some larger Land Use
15 items that we will be voting on today. First, we
16 have legislation that is sponsored by Council Member
17 Mark Levine to increase the pace of adding accessible
18 pedestrian street signals to our streets. I want to
19 recognize Matt Guwalb [sp?], Teresa Naster [sp?],
20 Kelly Taylor, Befar Zalof [sp?], Jonahton Massarano
21 [sp?] and Lyle Frank for their work on this bill. It
22 is an important bill as all bills on the calendar
23 today, and I'd like to ask my colleague Council
24 Member Mark Levine to say a few words.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you so
3 much, Madam Speaker. I will indeed say a few words
4 about Intro 216, which calls for the city to increase
5 the pace at which we install accessible pedestrian
6 signals known as APS's. Our city has taken
7 extraordinary strides towards making our streets
8 safer for all New Yorkers through Vision Zero.
9 However, we have not taken significant steps to
10 address the special needs of New Yorkers with
11 disabilities. In particular, those pedestrians with
12 vision difficulties, a group which numbers nearly
13 360,000 in the five boroughs. These New Yorkers put
14 their life at risk every time they cross a busy
15 street, but we have the ability to make them safer
16 through installation of accessible pedestrian
17 signals, which emit a mix of beeps and spoken
18 instructions to cue a visually impaired person that
19 it is safe to cross. As is the case with most
20 accommodations we make for people with disabilities,
21 this technology ends up benefitting almost everybody,
22 with wheelchair users relying on the device when a
23 crowded corner makes it difficult for them to see the
24 walk sign, hearing impaired people taking cues from
25 the device's vibrating button and countless

1
2 distracted smart phone users getting an extra alert
3 when they might not be looking up. Despite all these
4 benefits, as of today of the 12,460 intersections in
5 New York City, only 96 currently have an APS
6 installed, leaving visually impaired New Yorkers to
7 fend for themselves when crossing 99 percent of
8 intersections. Intro 216 will change that by tripling
9 the pace of new APS installations from 25 to 75 per
10 year. This is a critical step forward towards making
11 the promise of Vision Zero real for all New Yorkers,
12 and it wouldn't have been possible without an
13 incredible coalition of advocates and elected
14 officials, starting with Borough President Gale
15 Brewer who was championing this issue since her days
16 in the City Council, and the incredible advocates of
17 pedestrians for accessible and safe streets. Of
18 course, I also want to thank Chairman Rodriguez for
19 his critical step in pushing this bill forward, and
20 the support of Council Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.
21 Finally, I want to thank staff members who were
22 instrumental in drafting and/or advocating for his
23 bill, Amy Slattery [sp?], Shula Warren [sp?], Carmen
24 de LaRosa [sp?], Kelly Taylor, Johnathon Massarano
25 [sp?], Gafar Zalof [sp?], Gema Obachery [sp?], Lau

1 Frank [sp?], Matt Gewalb [sp?] and Rob Calandra.

2 Thank you.

3
4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
5 Council Member. We also have legislation sponsored
6 by Council Member Corey Johnson and Steve Levin,
7 allowing domestic violence survivors to more easily
8 make the needed transition to city homeless shelters.
9 On this one, we'd like to thank Matt Gewalb, Tersa
10 Nazir [sp?], Andrea Vasquez, Tonya Cyrus and Lyle
11 Frank for the work on this item and would ask each of
12 my colleagues, Council Members Johnson and Levin to
13 say a few words.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
15 Speaker. I am very proud that this bill today will
16 be my first piece of legislation to be passed in the
17 New York City Council. The bill before us will grant
18 presumptive eligibility for any families residing in
19 HRA domestic violence shelters who are attempting to
20 access DHS shelters, Department of Homeless Services.
21 This is an incredibly important step for a quarter of
22 the families who are currently homeless in New York
23 City. Twenty-five percent of people who are homeless
24 in New York City are victims and survivors of
25 domestic violence and often times they are the most

1 vulnerable members of our shelter population.
2
3 However, they also come up against more barriers than
4 others, largely due to time limitations on stays in
5 domestic violence shelters due to New York State law
6 regulation. They are timed out at 180 days.
7 Following the abuse these families suffered
8 initially, the grueling process of reporting such
9 violence, and actually extracting themselves from
10 their homes, survivors have already gone through
11 exhaustive and extensive intake processes to access
12 these shelters in the first place. Presently, upon
13 the end of their 180 day stay, they then have to
14 apply again at the Department of Homeless Services
15 prevention assistance and temporary housing path
16 intake center in order to secure DHS placement. The
17 path process entails trying lengthy interviews in
18 which a parent oftentimes must discuss his or her
19 domestic violence history with a social worker in
20 front of their own children. These survivors should
21 not be forced to undergo these extra steps. This is
22 why I'm so proud that this bill will pass, which
23 deems families who have already been living in
24 domestic violence shelters automatically eligible for
25 DHS shelters without having to undergo unnecessary

1 and repetitive pain steps in the path process.
2 Introduction 361A is extremely timely. In 2013, the
3 NYPD responded to about 800 domestic violence reports
4 per day, which totals up to be about 285,000 per
5 year. Of course, domestic violence itself is not a
6 growing phenomenon. We know it has long been a
7 problem. What the increase on the reporting of such
8 abuse signals is an enhanced awareness of domestic
9 violence as a huge issue in our city. Given that
10 more New Yorkers are bravely speaking up, we must
11 ensure that our shelter system is able to support
12 them, transitioning from domestic violence shelters
13 to DHS shelters should they still be without a home
14 in the most seamless way possible. I want to thank
15 you, Madam Speaker, for allowing this bill to come
16 forward. I also want to thank the Chair of the
17 General Welfare Committee, my friend Steve Levin who
18 has championed issues combatting domestic violence
19 and helping homeless families in this council. I also
20 want to thank my Legislative Director Louis Sheldon-
21 Brown [sp?], the Committee Counsel for the General
22 Welfare Committee, Andrea Vasquez, Laura Popa [sp?],
23 Matt Gewalb, and Tera Nazir from the Legislative
24 Division. Thank you very much.
25

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
3 Council Member. Congratulations on your first bill.
4 And Council Member Steve Levin?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
6 much, Madam Speaker. I want to congratulate Council
7 Member Corey Johnson on his first legislation passed
8 through this body, and it is a very important piece
9 of legislation. I want to thank you, Madam Speaker,
10 for supporting this piece of legislation and for
11 moving this quickly through the Council as well as
12 our Legislative Division, Matt Gewalb, Tera Nazir,
13 Laura Popa, Andrea Vasquez, Tonya Cyrus. This is a
14 common sense piece of legislation. This is something
15 that we should have been doing all along. Families
16 that are the survivors of domestic violence have
17 already gone through many forms of trauma from the
18 original domestic violence that led them to the
19 shelter system and the trauma of going through the
20 shelter system, which is difficult for families and
21 especially children at any time. For them to go
22 through the additional hurdles of going and applying
23 at the path for placement into the DHS system when it
24 not required by law, it is not necessary. There is
25 no reason for them to do that. That is something

1
2 that they should never have been doing all along, and
3 so this is common sense legislation. It respects the
4 humanity of those that are in our shelter system, and
5 those that are the survivors of domestic violence and
6 says to those families and individuals that they are
7 not alone and that the city of New York stands behind
8 them and supports them. Thank you very much, Madam
9 Speaker.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Council
11 Member. Next we have two bills dealing with agency
12 based voter registration. We have Introduction 356A
13 sponsored by Council Member Jumaane Williams and
14 Introduction 493A sponsored by Council Member Ben
15 Kallos, expanding and enhancing the agency based
16 voter registration program to seven additional
17 agencies. I want to thank David Sietzer [sp?] and
18 Rachel Cordero [sp?] for their great work on both of
19 these bills. And finally, actually I'd like to say
20 if Council Member Kallos and then Council Member
21 Jumaane Williams could say a few words?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I rise today to
23 speak on Introduction 493, expanding agency based
24 voter registration. According to the New York State
25 Board of Elections, 40 years ago 60 percent of

1 eligible New York City voters cast their ballots.

2 Now that percentage has plummeted--

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

4 Excuse me, Council Member. Quiet in the chambers,
5 please. Thank you. I apologize.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Now, that

7 percentage has plummeted into the low 20's. Election
8 after election, our state and especially our city
9 ranked near the bottom of the list in terms of voter
10 turn out. It is incumbent upon us to do everything
11 possible to reverse this trend and make sure that we
12 empower our residents to participate in our
13 democracy. The first step to doing so is to get
14 every eligible voter registered. This bill adds seven
15 additional agencies that are required to provide
16 voter registration forms to individuals seeking
17 agency services. If requested by an individual, it
18 requires the agencies to provide assistance in
19 filling out the form and to mail the form back to the
20 Board of Elections. It also adds a December 1st, 2015
21 deadline for agencies to physically integrate their
22 forms with the voter registration form. Adding this
23 date certain after 14 years finally bring our
24 agencies into compliance with the city's pro-voter
25

1
2 law of 2000. This bill is one piece of a larger
3 initiative to improve voter registration. I'd like
4 to thank the Speaker for her commitment to a city
5 where every eligible is registered and ready to vote.
6 I'd also like to thank the members of the Progressive
7 Caucus for their support on this issue and all the
8 members who joined as co-sponsors. Finally, I'd like
9 to thank David Sietzer, Counsel to the Gov Ops
10 Committee, as well as Matt Gewalb for their great
11 work on this bill and the many other projects the
12 committee has undertaken to improve our elections.
13 Thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'd like to
15 thank the Council for about to vote and hopefully
16 pass pro-voter bills that will work to improve
17 compliance form city agencies. Voter participation
18 in New York is at a all-time low. As a matter of
19 fact, we are 47th in the nation, and more must be
20 done to make voter registration more accessible. I
21 want to thank the Speaker for her support of these
22 bills and Council Member Ben Kallos, Chair of
23 Committee of Governmental Affairs for pushing this
24 important bill, along with his bill and being a
25 leader on this issue. I also want to thank Citizen

1
2 UNR [sic], the Center for Popular Democracy, and many
3 other good government groups who have shown support
4 on these bills in the past. Center for Popular
5 Democracy published a recent report that 84 percent
6 of visitors to government agencies were never
7 afforded a chance to register, and 60 percent of the
8 agencies didn't even have a voter registration form
9 in their office. Further, 95 percent, a full 95
10 percent of the clients were never even asked if they
11 wanted to register to vote. I believe government has
12 a responsibility to maximize the potential of voter
13 turnout. That's why I'm proud that the Council will
14 be passing this very important voter pro-voter bill.
15 Intro 356 is in response to the fact that our city
16 agencies are not doing enough to make voter
17 registration easier, even though they are required by
18 law. I believe this bill will concretize many of the
19 good steps by executive order that has been done with
20 the Mayor. Unfortunately, it wasn't concretized by
21 executive order and there was no room for this
22 Council to play the oversight position when it came
23 to increasing voter participation. That's why I'm
24 happy that we'll be voting on this bill, and it's my
25

1
2 hope that 2016 voter turnout will improve not just in
3 New York City, but across the country.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. And
5 finally today we are voting on approval of the
6 Astoria Cove Development Project. This project is
7 going to provide a significant number of affordable
8 housing units in a growing Queens's neighborhood.
9 The agreement struck by the City Council and the
10 developers at Astoria Cove, ensuring affordable units
11 within the development not only benefits tenants, but
12 also demonstrates the Council's commitment to keeping
13 New York City a home of the middle class. I want to
14 thank obviously the leadership of the Council Member
15 Costa Constantinides for his efforts and clearly, the
16 message being sent as the Council will not sit on the
17 sidelines and allow New York to become unaffordable
18 to New Yorkers. We're going to continue to fight to
19 ensure the five boroughs remain a place where people
20 can live, build families, and put down roots. So I
21 want to thank all the parties who helped make this
22 possible, the Council Member as I indicated,
23 especially thank Raju Mann [sp?] and the Land Use
24 Division and the amazing staff of the Land Use
25 Division for the work on this project. They worked

1
2 tirelessly. I would like to ask Costa to say a few
3 words, and Council Member Greenfield, Chair of our
4 Land Use Committee.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank
6 you, Madam Speaker, and thank you for your great
7 leadership. Astoria Cove, when built, will be a
8 transformative moment in Astoria. It'll be fully
9 integrated, innovative, contextual and inclusive of
10 our community. I am proud to have reached, we have
11 reached all these goals by passing this historic
12 agreement at Astoria Cove. This agreement will mark
13 the first time that developers mandated by law to
14 permanently provide affordable housing that's within
15 the reach of middle class and the working class
16 residents of our neighborhood. Twenty-seven percent
17 of the floor area will be set aside as affordable,
18 over 460 units. Five percent will be at 60 percent
19 of AMI with rents as low as 800 dollars a month.
20 Fifteen percent will be reserved for families with
21 incomes at 80 percent of AMI or below, with rents as
22 low as 1,200 dollars a month, and seven percent will
23 be reserved for families with middle incomes at 125
24 AMI with monthly rents as low as 1,800 a month.
25 There'll be good jobs associated with Astoria Cove.

1
2 It'll be built at a fully--with health benefits with
3 living wage and with pension benefits with the full
4 training necessary to ensure that there are good jobs
5 accessible during and after construction. It'll be
6 fully funded ferry dock connecting Astoria Cove with
7 the entirety of New York City and easing the burden
8 on our already overburdened transit system in
9 Astoria. And lastly, this wasn't built in a vacuum.
10 The surrounding community will receive necessary
11 infrastructure improvements. There'll be over a
12 million dollars allocated to our local library,
13 500,000 to the NYCHA Senior Center. There'll be a
14 supermarket built with the cooperatives, with the men
15 and women who work, they'll have the opportunity to
16 earn equity and hopefully ownership of that
17 supermarket. There will be improvement to Whitey
18 Ford Field with a comfort station being built. I
19 would be remiss if I don't thank everyone involved,
20 our Mayor Bill de Blasio for his strong leadership on
21 affordable housing and setting the bar, our Speaker
22 Melissa Mark-Viverito for her strong guidance and
23 commitment to making sure that the middle class are
24 heard in New York City and are protected, our Land
25 Use Chair David Greenfield who at all hours of the

1 night was fighting with me and for our neighborhood;
2 I appreciate it, Council Member Greenfield, Chairman
3 Mark Weprin of the Zoning Committee, all of my
4 colleagues, the Land Use staff, Raju Mann, Anne and
5 Amy, you know, Ramon Martinez who never likes to get
6 thanked, but I'll thank him anyway, and of course,
7 the developer and my staff, Nick Rolsten [sp?], Nick
8 Wazowski [sp?] and Shaw Hasharon [sp?]. Thank you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you,
11 Madam Speaker. Thank you, Council Member
12 Constantinides. I will just say that today really in
13 the world of Land Use is a historic day in New York
14 City. We're setting a new standard for how we
15 develop properties and how we change zoning and how
16 that reflects the impact that it has on the city. I
17 will point out that the Administration initially
18 agreed to a project that could have had as little as
19 20 percent affordable, and what this project does is
20 it increases that by seven percent for an additional
21 122 units. That's the work that we in the Council
22 negotiated. It also provides for good jobs, which is
23 incredibly important as we see these mega
24 developments in New York, we want to make sure that
25 they not just create jobs, but good jobs to sustain

1 the middle class who are living in New York City, and
2 I think that the model that we see really is these
3 three pieces, which is good jobs, more affordability
4 and benefits for the community. And I will just say
5 that there are very few people in this city who can
6 negotiate like Council Member Costa Constantinides.
7 He was firm. He was focused. He made sure that he
8 got the maximum affordable housing while keeping this
9 project sustainable. He made sure that there were
10 incredible improvements from parks to libraries and
11 senior centers, and of course, most importantly
12 transportation for his district. And I really do
13 want to take this opportunity as well to acknowledge
14 the terrific leadership of the Land Use Committee. I
15 want to thank Raju Mann, who is our Director. I want
16 to thank Anne McCoye [sp?], who's our counsel, Amy
17 Levitan, our Deputy Director of the entire staff. I
18 want to thank Mark Weprin, Chair of the Subcommittee
19 on Zoning and Franchises for holding hearings. I
20 want to thank the folks at Build Up NYC who worked
21 with us hand in hand to make sure that we attained
22 our goals, and it is certainly a unique day in New
23 York where you can walk away and we can all be proud
24 where we've set a new standard, twenty-seven percent
25

1
2 affordability. The first 25 percent has no
3 subsidies. There are good jobs and there are
4 significant improvements to this neighborhood, and
5 this is the model that all developers should be
6 looking at and should be looking to follow in the
7 future, which is win/win for everybody. And finally,
8 I want to thank the developers. They came. They
9 stepped. They negotiated a fair deal. They may be
10 making a little bit less money, but they are
11 certainly improving the city in a very significant
12 way and that had a great part in that as well. So
13 thank you very much, and thank you once again,
14 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, for making it clear
15 that the Council will play a primary role in
16 negotiating Land Use deals and ensuring that we will
17 have more affordability, more support for our middle
18 class and better jobs. Thank you very much.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
20 Council Member. And finally, before we wrap up today,
21 I want to acknowledge, obviously the difficulties
22 that our friends in Buffalo, New York have been
23 dealing with. If anyone has seen the images of what
24 happened last week, they're pretty daunting. It's
25 obviously very difficult and challenging situation,

1
2 continues to be, I'm sure. That snow is still there.
3 With tremendous snowfall they've had to deal with the
4 past week, and we've seen the response by our
5 Governor Cuomo and Mayor Byron Brown in dealing with
6 this weather emergency. So, I believe I speak behalf
7 of the whole Council when I say that we're hoping for
8 them to bounce back quickly and send obviously our
9 best wishes. And of course, I want to thank and
10 congratulate everyone and wish everyone a happy and
11 safe Thanksgiving and great holiday season. And
12 thank you all, and that ends communication from the
13 Speaker.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, Madam
15 Speaker, and congratulations to Council Member
16 Johnson and Council Member Constantinides.
17 Discussion of general orders? Seeing none. Report
18 of special committees?

19 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
21 standing committees?

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
23 on Finance Reso 462, various bids.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
25 General Orders.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 51
2 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 476,
3 organization funding.
4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
5 General Orders.
6 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on
7 General Welfare, Intro 361A, domestic violence
8 shelters.
9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
10 coupled on General Order.
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
12 on Governmental Operations, intro 356A, pro-voter
13 law.
14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
15 coupled on General Orders.
16 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro--
17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
18 Quiet in the chambers, please. Quiet. Thank you.
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 493A, agency based
20 voter registration.
21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
22 coupled on General Orders.
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on
24 Land Use LU 133 and Reso 482, tax exemption.
25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 52

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on

3 General Orders.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 134 and Reso 483,

5 sidewalk café.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on

7 General Orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 139 and Reso 484 and

9 LU 140 and Reso 485, UDAP Brooklyn.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on

11 General Orders.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 141 and Reso 486 and

13 LU 142 and Reso 487, termination of tax exemptions.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General

15 Orders.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 143 and Reso 488,

17 sidewalk café?

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled to be

19 filed pursuant to lateral withdrawal.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 146 and Reso 489,

21 Zoning Amendment.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on

23 General Orders.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 148 and Reso 490,

25 termination of tax exemption.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 53
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General
3 Orders.
4 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 149 and Reso 491 and
5 LU 150 and Reso 492, tax exemptions.
6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
7 General Orders.
8 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on
9 Transportation, Intro 216 B, accessible pedestrian
10 signals.
11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
12 coupled on General Orders.
13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: General Order
14 Calendar.
15 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 126 and Reso 493
16 through LU 131 and Reso 498, Astoria Cove.
17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
18 General Orders.
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Resolution appointing
20 various persons Commissioner of Deeds.
21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
22 General Orders, and at this time I ask for a roll
23 call on all items on the coupled General Order
24 Calendar.
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Arroyo?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

54

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Barron? Cabrera?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye. I'd like to
congratulate Corey Johnson on his first passed bill.

COUNCIL CLERK: Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I wanted to
congratulate Council Member Johnson and Council
Member Levine, and of course, Council Member
Constantinides on the great work of the Land Use, and
I vote aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides?

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: With
congratulations to my colleagues Council Member Mark
Levine and Corey Johnson on their first bills, and
with a happy Thanksgiving to all, I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy? Crowley?

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo? Deutsch?

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Dickens?

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 55

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Congratulations
3 to my colleagues on the passage of the legislation
4 and their resolutions, and I vote aye.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Equally,
7 congratulations to Council Member Levine, Johnson and
8 Constantinides, and I vote aye.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Big
11 congratulations to my friends and colleagues Corey
12 Johnson, Mark Levine and Constantinides, and I vote
13 aye.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: In
16 congratulations to my colleague and the passing of
17 the bills, and I vote aye on all.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Ferreras?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Congratulations
20 to all my colleagues and the advocates surrounding
21 Astoria Cove and Council Member Constantinides, I
22 vote aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Garodnick?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Gentile?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I vote aye on
3 all with hearty congratulations to all.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson? Greenfield?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: May I explain
6 my vote?

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you.
9 I'm actually very proud of the work that we're doing
10 here today. I think that the legislation being
11 supported by Council Member Johnson and Council
12 Member Levin really is common sense and will save
13 thousands of folks from the harrowing experience as
14 they are victims of domestic violence. We're really
15 thrilled about that. Want to congratulate Council
16 Member Levine. His work is really going to help
17 thousands more in New York City who are visually
18 impaired. And finally, I want to give a shout out to
19 Council Members Kallos and Williams for working hard
20 to make sure that we can register more voters in New
21 York, and of course, today is Costa's day. I'm
22 officially calling it Costa's day because of the
23 great work that he did and the great advocacy that
24 he's provided his community. I'm proud to vote aye
25 on all, and a happy Thanksgiving to all as well.

COUNCIL CLERK: Johnson?

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: With big thanks to the Speaker, to Chair Steve Levin and to my colleagues, I proudly vote aye, and I also want to congratulate my good friend Mark Levine and Costa Constantinides who has done an incredible job advocating for his community. I proudly vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: We, the people of the United States, in order to form a more perfect union, establish justice, ensure domestic tranquility and secure the blessing of liberty to ourselves and our prosperity did establish this great nation. And yet, injustice anywhere is threat to justice everywhere in the words of Martin Luther King. The decision in Ferguson was not justice, and I stand with my colleagues in this body, this city and the nation on this issue. I also want to take a moment to acknowledge and congratulate my colleagues, Corey Johnson on passing his first legislation as well as Council Member Costa Constantinides for setting a new

1
2 standard for affordable housing with sustainable
3 development that supports local infrastructure at a
4 living wage with no poor-door and a ferry that will
5 serve not only his district but New Yorkers from
6 every district surrounding it. I also want to give a
7 huge thank you to my Director of Internships. We've
8 got about 50 interns. Joseph Strong, who's also my
9 Director for Constituent Services on Roosevelt
10 Island. I vote aye on all.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
12 chambers, please. Quiet in the chambers.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Johnson?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I was remiss in
15 my excitement and thanks in voting yes on everything,
16 when in fact I do want to vote yes on all with the
17 exception of Land Use 134 and Reso 483. Thank you.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: King?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I want to
20 congratulate my neighbor here on his first piece of
21 legislation. Everyone who had a piece of legislation
22 passed, congratulations and I vote aye on all.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye, and I
25 also want to congratulate Council Members Johnson,

1
2 Levine and Council Member Costa. Good job. Thank
3 you. Happy Thanksgiving.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I want to
6 congratulate my friend Corey Johnson on his first
7 piece of legislation and I want to congratulate
8 Costa. I know how hard he worked on this and how much
9 it meant to him and to Mark Levine, and I vote aye
10 and wish everyone a happy Thanksgiving.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
15 permission to explain my vote?

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I'm very
18 enthusiastic about the package that we're passing
19 today. I want to congratulate my colleagues. Council
20 Member Johnson, the fact that we were previously
21 putting stumbling blocks in the way of domestic
22 violence survivors. To get the shelter they needed
23 was appalling. This is a good strong bill. Council
24 Member Levine, the fact that we were not removing
25 stumbling blocks from people who need to be able to

1
2 cross our intersections, and to Council Members
3 Kallos and Williams, the stumbling blocks that we
4 continue to put in front of people's right to vote
5 are a little lower today thanks to each of you, and I
6 really want to honor that. I'm grateful for the
7 bills that we're passing. And to Council Member
8 Constantinides, I think it's a decade I've been
9 hoping that this body would have the opportunity to
10 vote on mandatory inclusionary zoning that would not
11 simply incentivize but require developers to include
12 affordable housing when significant new units were
13 built, and the fact that along with many other things
14 for your district, you are bringing home the first
15 time in this body when we are making that
16 requirements. It's a great credit to you and your
17 leadership, also to Chairs Weprin and Greenfield and
18 to the advocacy of this body as well. I proudly vote
19 aye on all.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye on all
22 with the exception of Land Use 134 and accompanying
23 Reso 483 in which I vote no. Thank you.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Permission to very
3 briefly explain my vote, Madam?

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Well, I feel like
6 I'm in wonderful company today with my colleagues,
7 Council Members Johnson, Constantinides and Kallos.
8 Congrats to them for passing these wonderful pieces
9 of legislation, and thanks to everyone in the chamber
10 for your support of Intro 216, and I proudly vote Aye
11 on all. Thank you.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Aye on all.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [off mic]

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
20 explain my vote?

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I want to also
23 extend my felicitades to Council Member Johnson for
24 his first bill. You make us proud. And Levin too
25 for the support he gave Constantinides for his work

1
2 on the committee and Levine as well. Thank you all,
3 and I vote aye.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Mendez?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye on
6 all.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller? Reynoso?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Congratulations
9 to my colleagues again for passing their first pieces
10 of legislation and Costa Constantinides for his work
11 on Land Use, and I vote aye on all.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye on all.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: May I explain
16 my vote?

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I would like
19 to vote aye, but I would like to also say that the
20 Astoria development project I support it mainly
21 because I know it's important for the colleague that
22 represents the area. I just hope also that the 27
23 percent affordable that we were able to get into that
24 project is not a standard that follow any other major
25 project citywide, but that we look at any project

1 district by district. My first question to the
2 Council Member was, "What is the median income of
3 your districts?" And he explained to me that this is
4 good for his district. I just want to be sure that
5 it doesn't apply to all the districts, that districts
6 such as the one that I represent that has a 35,000
7 median income does not--it cannot work with a 20 or
8 26 percent affordable even though there's other
9 investments in other areas such as it happened there
10 in Astoria. Second, Alba [sic], which is the
11 major[sic], he's the one developing this plan. I
12 hope that also they take this as a opportunity.
13 There's some concern about also how Alba has been
14 following Vantage and Pinnacle when it comes to push
15 people out in certain community. We work on Alba
16 over anybody who also get into the business of
17 developing, but they have to understand that as a
18 city we deal with Vantage and Pinnacle. We would not
19 work with anyone that came to any particular part of
20 the city and push people out. I also would like to
21 say that, and I'm going to be asking for permission
22 also to vote aye on all the General Order, but before
23 that I also would like to say my prayers to the
24 family of Michael Brown's, and as we have a standing
25

1
2 previous case in this city from Eluna Bompers [sic],
3 Juan Rodrigue [sic], Anthony Bise [sic], we will
4 stand with the family and we will participate in any
5 organized civic action to ask for justice for the
6 Brown family. With that I would like to vote aye in
7 all General Order.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Rose.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Quiet please.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to
12 explain my vote?

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I'd like to vote
15 aye on all with the exception of LU 134 and Reso 483.
16 I want to congratulate my colleagues on the
17 legislation that they passed today, and I just want
18 for you to indulge me a moment. I want my colleagues
19 and my friends, I want to tell you that I rise today
20 to thank you from the bottom of my heart for your
21 showing of support for me last Monday when my 2009
22 campaign and two members of my campaign were indicted
23 in a politically motivated witch hunt against the
24 working families party. I could not be here for the
25 press conference because I was at the hospital with a

1
2 family member, but I have seen the video and I read
3 the press release, and it is probably a good thing
4 that I was not here, because I'm sure that I would
5 not have been able to maintain my composure. I was
6 and humbled, very moved and deeply grateful for all
7 of your support of me and with that support from you,
8 my family and friends, I have no fear that right and
9 good will prevail. I thank you all sincerely for
10 your support.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well that's a
13 tough act to follow. May I explain my vote?

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you. So
16 glad. Welcome back Council Member Rose. We missed
17 you. We support you. I want to vote aye on all,
18 especially congratulate Council Member Johnson and
19 his first bill is a really good one. So
20 congratulations. And to the other Council Members,
21 Council Member Levine, Levin, Kallos, Williams for
22 their bills. I also really want to congratulate
23 Council Member Constantinides for including in his
24 Land Use negotiation the worker cooperative that will
25 take--be initiated at the grocery store. That has

1
2 really work well done, and bodes well for the future
3 movement of the worker cooperatives, which are going
4 to help raise people out of poverty and dead end
5 jobs. So I'm really appreciative of that. And
6 lastly, if you could just beg my indulgence for one
7 minute. It's important and I appreciate the
8 Speaker's words very much. I share with her in just
9 noting the heartbreaking decision by the Grand Jury
10 in Ferguson, Missouri, which resonates with everyone
11 because we believe in equality and justice and while
12 we still have a ways to go to ensure police
13 accountability and the safety of people that the
14 police are meant to protect. I commend the New
15 Yorkers who led by example last night in a peaceful
16 protest in Times Square. Thank you very much.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Still aye on
19 all. I said it first. Thank you.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Permission to
22 explain my vote? Just want to extend a--

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: full throated
25 congratulations to my colleague and friend Council

1
2 Member Johnson as well as Council Member Levine for
3 their passage of their bills, and I want to extend my
4 congratulations to Council Member Constantinides for
5 pioneering inclusionary zoning here in the Council
6 and for negotiating what could be the Land Use deal
7 of the year. So, congratulations to all, and I vote
8 aye on all.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye on all, and
11 aye on all previous Land Use call-ups. Thanks.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye on all.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Vacca?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: With
16 congratulations to my colleagues, I vote aye on all.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Madam Advocate,
19 a minute to explain my vote?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Prior to voting
22 aye on all, I just wanted to disclose for the council
23 record today that with regard to Land Use 126 through
24 131 that my father's consulting firm, Constance and
25 Vallone were retained by the applicant, but they have

1
2 no relationship to myself and my office. I do vote
3 aye on all, and I want to give a special thank you to
4 Council Member Johnson for passing his first
5 legislation. And today is an impressive package of
6 votes and regulations. And happy Thanksgiving.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Weprin?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: May I have an
11 opportunity to explain my vote?

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: So I want to vote
14 aye on all. I did want to comment on Astoria Cove.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
16 chambers please. Quiet in the chambers.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: It's very
18 important the Council, and you know, has realized
19 that smart development can be a great economic
20 engine, and this project is a great example of all
21 the wonderful things that can come along with
22 development, affordable housing, supermarkets,
23 stores, clearing a path to the waterfront, fixing up
24 fields, doing adding transportation options, those
25 are all great things. But one thing that does come

1
2 with mandatory inclusionary housing is an all or
3 nothing deal here. So, if you get to the point where
4 a no vote ever happened, we would get no affordable
5 housing, and I think it's important my colleagues
6 realize that. And I watched Costa negotiate here,
7 that that number he got to was not easily come by,
8 and I'm actually convinced that if the number went
9 any higher we'd have no deal whatsoever. And the
10 economics of these deals are not done in the air.
11 They're done with banks, they're done with lenders,
12 and very often these developers are working with a
13 margin where they don't know exactly how it's going
14 to turn out. So I know a lot of people would love to
15 give 100 percent affordable or other things, but it
16 just doesn't work in the economics of a lot of deals.
17 So this particular deal, I got to say, Costa got
18 higher than I thought he would ever get, and he got
19 so many advantages for community as well as a strong
20 workforce and wonderful benefits for this community.
21 So this project is definitely a win, but as we go
22 forward, it's important we realize the economics of
23 these projects as well. With that in mind, I vote
24 aye on all.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Williams?

1 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be
2 excused to explain my vote?
3

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I just wanted
6 to say congratulations to Council Member Levine and
7 Johnson on their first bill. I again, wanted to thank
8 the Speaker for support of my bill, and thank Council
9 Member Kallos for his leadership in getting the bill
10 out of committee. I vote aye on all.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Wills? Gibson?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye on all.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: With
15 congratulations to all of my colleagues, in
16 particularly Council Member Costa Constantinides who
17 with his hard work and determination is going to make
18 an already great place, Astoria, even greater, and I
19 would like to vote aye on all, except for no on Land
20 Use 134 and Reso 483.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito?

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulatoins
24 to all, and we love you, Debbie Rose. All items on
25 today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a vote

1
2 of 43 in the affirmative, zero in the negative with
3 the exception of Land Use 134 and Resolution 483,
4 which was adopted by a vote of 39 in the affirmative,
5 4 negative and 0 abstentions. Introduction and
6 reading of bills.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
8 referred to committees as indicated on the agenda.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Any discussion of
10 the resolution? Seeing none, we'll now vote on the
11 Resolution, preconsidered Resolution 480, a
12 resolution calling upon the New York State
13 legislature to pass and the Governor to sign
14 legislation permitting voter registration forms
15 utilized by agencies participating in the agency
16 assisted voter registration program to code their
17 registration forms and for such codes to be withheld
18 from public inspection. All of those in favor say
19 aye.

20 COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those
22 opposed? Any abstention? They ayes have it.
23 General discussion. Council Member Levine? Council
24 Member Levine?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Apologies, Madam
3 Public Advocate. Thank you very much. I'd like to
4 call my colleague's attention to Intro number--sorry,
5 a little unprepared here. This is an intro that
6 keeping with our theme of making New York City
7 accessible to people with disabilities would mandate
8 that the city's Park Department--this is intro 558,
9 apologies. That the City's Park Department provide a
10 report to the City Council to update us on its
11 progress in compliance with the Americans with
12 Disabilities Act. Currently, today, as many of my
13 colleagues know, relatively few of the Parks
14 Department's comfort stations are accessible to
15 people in wheel chairs. We want to change that, and
16 we want a report from the city's Parks Department
17 that would update us on their progress towards
18 meeting that goal. That's the intent behind Intro
19 558, which I ask my colleagues to support. Thank
20 you.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
22 Dromm?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very
24 much, Public Advocate. I'd like to speak about Intro
25 552. While New York City has the largest lesbian,

1
2 gay, bisexual, transgender and queer population in
3 the country, you wouldn't know it from the data
4 collected by the city. Intro 552 will ensure that
5 New York City agencies collect data on sexual
6 orientation and gender identity wherever they collect
7 other demographic data. Counting the number of self-
8 identified LGBTQ individuals who interact with these
9 agencies will improve--

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

11 Quiet in the chambers, please. Quiet in the
12 chambers. We're still in session. We apologize,
13 Council Member.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: will improve the
15 design and implementation of programs aimed at LGBTQ
16 people including but not limited to youth and senior
17 citizens. In addition, the inclusion of questions
18 about sexual orientation and gender identity will
19 raise awareness of the needs among agency staff. It
20 will also indicate to LGBTQ New Yorkers that the city
21 agencies are aware of and working to meet their
22 needs. Finally, it will serve to increase the
23 visibility of the LGBTQ community among all
24 individuals who interact with city agencies. The US
25 census began collecting data on same sex households

1
2 in 2010. New York state agencies are now beginning
3 to collect data around sexual orientation and gender
4 identity. It is time for the city, the birthplace of
5 the modern LGBTQ rights movement to do the same.
6 LGBTQ lives count, and so it is time for us as a city
7 to start counting LGBTQ lives. Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
9 Council Member Williams?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I'd
11 like to call my colleague's attention to three bills
12 I'm introducing today. Intro 568 is a bill aimed at
13 improving police community relations in communities
14 of more color by requiring NYPD support reports
15 related to motor vehicles. It's well known that
16 policing is applied differently in black and brown
17 communities. This bill will allow us to see how NYPD
18 regulates quality of life traffic violations in each
19 community. Despite the Department of Homeless
20 Services recent efforts to upgrade security measures,
21 violence continues to plague the city-funded shelter,
22 which serves women with a range of mental illnesses.
23 In light of this, Intro 569 will establish a
24 taskforce to study how to improve safety of city's
25 homeless shelters and producing annual report. Intro

1
2 570 is a commuter van bill, and I'm introducing with
3 Council Member Kallos to eliminate the prearrangement
4 of passenger manifest requirements for commuter vans
5 and repealing the requirement that commuter vans
6 renew their license every six years. Finally, I'd
7 like to voice my concern as everybody probably has in
8 last night's grand jury results in Michael Brown's
9 case, which unfortunately is not surprising but
10 disheartening none the less. There are many who'd
11 like us to focus on the minutia of one case, but we
12 cannot miss the forest for a much dense more
13 problematic trees, which is the multitude of pattern
14 of practice of young black and brown, usually men,
15 shot and killed unarmed and no one held accountable,
16 including many in New York City. It is time and
17 hopefully we focus on reforming our broken system and
18 understand that the problem is much wider than any
19 one case. I join the family of Michael Brown in
20 asking for more protests of peace as long as others
21 who have the same request join in the call for
22 justice and equity. Justice and equity are what
23 people deserve. It's what people should hear so they
24 can fully understand the call for peace. In 2014, it
25 should not be this difficult by virtually every

1 single statistical metric to be black in America.

2 Thank you.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member

4 King?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I rise, and I thank

6 Council Member Williams for his remarks, and I co-

7 sign it also. But I also want to ask my colleagues

8 to sign onto Intro 557, a Local Law to amend

9 administrative code of New York City, New York in

10 relationship to requiring the city to repair damage

11 to sidewalks caused by trees. After a number of

12 complaints and incidents, a number of home owners are

13 being taxed with the cost of repairing sidewalks or

14 even having roots of trees infringed on their

15 basements, but they are responsible for paying for

16 the replacement of these sidewalks and trees that the

17 damage is caused by city trees. So this law is

18 asking the city to accept responsibility for the

19 trees that they plant and all the city trees that

20 have disrupted sidewalks, whether the cost of the

21 winter weathers or whatever, and that's what this law

22 attempts to address. So I'm asking colleagues please

23 to sign on, not only just for yourselves, but just

24
25

1
2 for the homeowner and all New York City residents who
3 endure this each and every year. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 Council Member Koo?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Madam
7 Public Advocate. I want to say I'm very disappointed
8 with the Ferguson verdict, but we are a country of
9 people where the rule of laws, so we have to respect
10 the law, and a lot of times good people prematurely
11 or innocently, but still we have to respect the rule
12 of law. And another point I want to make is that we
13 don't want to over criticize the police, because most
14 of the police are good people, only a few people are
15 bad apples. So we don't want to over criticize them.
16 Then, they don't have the morale to work. Finally,
17 Thanksgiving is approaching us. I want to use this
18 opportunity to thank my colleagues on the right, and
19 my left and in front of me, and the back of me.
20 Thank you. Let's do good work, because together we
21 can make New York City a better city. Thank you.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

23 Council Member Greenfield?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you,
25 Madam Public Advocate. I wanted to let my colleagues

1
2 know about a new piece of legislation that I have
3 introduced at today's Stated. Intro 556 would
4 prevent Uber and other livery companies from engaging
5 in price gouging. They've got a fancy name for it.
6 They call it surge pricing, but surge pricing is
7 nothing less or nothing more than price gouging.
8 Last night I went to Home Depot. I picked up two
9 bags of ice melt, and there weren't that many bags
10 left, but Home Depot did not charge me ten times more
11 because they were running out. In fact, the whole
12 reason that the taxi industry is regulated in New
13 York City is to prevent exactly that, price gouging,
14 so that a yellow cabby doesn't stop and pick up when
15 it rains and says, "Oh, you want to get across town
16 and be dry? Instead of 25 bucks, I'm going to charge
17 you 250 bucks." Oddly, though, Uber does this every
18 single day. They do it during rush hour. They do it
19 during rain. They do it during snow, and most
20 famously they do it on New Year's Eve, which is
21 really honestly one of the worst forms of bait and
22 switch, because Uber actually goes out there and
23 says, "Sign up with Uber. We're cheaper than yellow
24 cabs." And you may get one or two cheap rides, but
25 when you really need them, they sock it to you with

1
2 these major fees in terms of the cost of getting from
3 one place to the other. We need to call a spade a
4 spade. In any other market we would call this price
5 gouging. That's what it is. We certainly understand
6 that Uber says they want to have more cars on the
7 streets during inclement weather, and that's why my
8 legislation would allow them to raise the price 100
9 percent, but to raise the price 900 percent is truly
10 outrageous. A 30 dollar cab ride should not cost 270
11 dollars. That's simply unfair. I ask my colleagues
12 to sign onto this. It's Intro 556. Thank you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
14 Lander?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam
16 Public Advocate. I'd like to associate myself with
17 the remarks of the Speaker at the beginning of the
18 meeting and those of Council Member Williams earlier
19 and with the leadership that you Public Advocate and
20 others in this room have taken. It is an important
21 for white allies to speak up as well. I, too, am sad
22 and angry about the lack of justice for Mike Brown,
23 and in too many cases of young men in color,
24 including Eric Garner, Kye Gurly [sp?], and Tamira
25 Rice [sp?] just in recent days killed by police

1 officers when deadly force was not needed. Most
2 officers work hard every day with good intentions and
3 without incident and risk their safety for ours, but
4 when it's consistently a black or brown young man,
5 when there is every reason to believe that deadly
6 force was not necessary, when there's so rarely
7 accountability, it is time for us to face up to this
8 systemic impacts of race in how we police. We need
9 the Justice Department to establish real national
10 standards in the use of deadly force for training,
11 accountability and justice. Here in New York City,
12 we should use the remedial process coming out of the
13 Floyd trial to address deep and long standing
14 tensions between the NYPD and communities of color,
15 including body worn cameras, changing the tenor of so
16 many street interactions and recommitting to
17 community policing in a partnership that is honest
18 about race, serious about accountability and
19 insistent on respecting civil rights upon keeping all
20 of us safe. This Thanksgiving, one thing I am
21 grateful for is being a member of this body, for your
22 leadership Madam Speaker, and your gavel wielding
23 Madam Public Advocate. As some of you know, I was
24 born in and I'm headed to St. Louis for Thanksgiving
25

1 where the leadership has been shameful, honestly.
2 There's just no way other to say it. And I'm proud
3 to be in a place where the leadership at a hard time
4 is modeling what I think this country can be. So,
5 that's one of the blessings I'll be counting this
6 Thanksgiving. Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 Council Member Richards?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you.

11 Before I read a statement on behalf of Daneek who had
12 to leave, I also wanted to voice my concerns
13 obviously with the verdict in Ferguson and speak of
14 basically--this is a powder keg. You know, we keep
15 seeing these issues pop up all over the United States
16 of America, and as a young black male in particular,
17 you know, I all too well understand the amount of
18 pressure on us even just to walk to the store in
19 particular. You know, we're hassled in some places.
20 So, with that being said, it's very hard for me to
21 really speak on this issue, but I do want to say that
22 until we prosecute officers for misconduct, walk-
23 outs, marches, all of these things, they're not going
24 to matter, and I think we have to--this nation is
25 going to have recognize that or I'm afraid we're

1
2 going to see a lot more Fergusons. On behalf of
3 Daneek who's not here. "I rise today to deliver an
4 urgent call for safety standards on behalf of our
5 shared constituency in the name of traffic safety and
6 Vision Zero. Last Tuesday, New York City police
7 engaged a commuter van in a high speed chase, which
8 spanned several miles throughout Brooklyn. The van
9 evaded police through Districts 40, 45 and 46
10 represented by Council Members Eugene, Williams and
11 Maisel before it ultimately crashed into a passenger
12 car injuring three people including one off duty
13 sergeant and her daughter. The young girl was sent
14 to the hospital in critical condition. During the
15 pursuit, two cops were hit by the fleeing van." I'm
16 going to cut short on this. "Today, there's an Intro
17 Number 570, which seeks to completely eliminate all
18 license and renewal requirements for vans. With all
19 due respect, such a de-licensing attempt is severely
20 misguided. A serious examination is needed as to the
21 justification for lowering standards within an
22 already troubled industry. With that I urge you to
23 proceed with caution and not sign onto the commuter
24 van legislation put forth before the Council today.
25 And as a representative of southeast Queens, we all

1
2 know too well about vans and the dangers of them, and
3 under no condition should we not have them licensed."

4 Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 Council Member Eugene?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
8 much, Madam Public Advocate. I want to draw the
9 attention of my colleagues to two bills, Intro 544, a
10 bill that would expand the number of city employees
11 who are trained to identify and assist runaway [sic]
12 sexual exploited youth, and Intro 553, which seeks to
13 improve the newly expanded DYCD run and sponsored
14 after school program by requiring that in school
15 district where more than one third of the students
16 are classified as English language learners. This
17 after school program will include a bi-language
18 component. As Chair of the Youth Service Committee
19 I'm so pleased that this Administration has dedicated
20 itself to working with DYCD to create an engaging
21 program for youth during their out of school time.
22 We know our young people are a priority of need, and
23 that to serve them we cannot have a one size fits
24 all. Thus, today I ask my colleague to work with me
25 to bring these program to children of the variety of

1
2 English language ability and create a bilingual
3 component in after school programs. Thank you very
4 much, Madam Public Advocate.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
6 Council Member Ulrich?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you, Madam
8 Public Advocate. I want to take this opportunity to
9 thank the leadership of our Speaker Melissa Mark-
10 Viverito and also my good friend and colleague Steve
11 Levin in helping us organize this year's veterans
12 food drive, which culminated with the delivery of
13 over 3,000 pounds of food items and nonperishable
14 goods to the Borden Avenue veteran's shelter in Long
15 Island City. I want to thank my colleague Jimmy Van
16 Bramer for stamping my passport, for allowing me in
17 his district, because that shelter is located in his
18 district. But they're doing great work and they have
19 for a very long time. We mentioned just days before
20 Thanksgiving about and we talk a lot about hunger and
21 homelessness being real issues in this city and they
22 certainly are, especially now more than ever, but I
23 think people forget how many homeless veterans there
24 are in our city sleeping in the streets, the subways
25 and in shelters every night and how often sometimes

1
2 we take for granted the freedoms that they fought to
3 protect, and now they are counting on us to be there
4 for them. So I want to thank not only my colleagues
5 who were there that day, but the over 35 members of
6 this body. That was just one of many days of me
7 being privileged enough to sit in the City Council to
8 feel proud to be here. I mean, there were many
9 occasions, but Friday was just another one of those
10 days when I was just so proud to be there and to help
11 deliver over 3,000 pounds of food that over 35
12 members of the Council help collect to help needy
13 veterans and their families and we went there. It
14 was a beautiful day. The Speaker took a tour along
15 with myself and Jimmy and so many folks on central
16 staff that came as well. I want to thank Food Bank
17 for NYC for helping to deliver the food and Project
18 Renewal, which really is doing God's work every day
19 to help our veterans. And I want to wish all my
20 colleagues a very happy Thanksgiving. Thank you very
21 much.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
23 Council Member Dickens?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you,
25 Madam Public Advocate. I want to thank Walter

1
2 Alergon [sic] and the Speaker's Office for their help
3 today on a very bad fire that was in my district on
4 Striver's Road on the block in which I live at 139th
5 Street and Frederick Douglass Boulevard. I also want
6 to acknowledge OEM and the Fire Department and the
7 Red Cross for quickly responding to the fire and to
8 the needs of the residents of my community. Also, I
9 want to take a moment to remember the life of Michael
10 Brown and Gurley and all the lives that are being
11 lost to violence and brutality. The no indictment
12 decision reached yesterday robbed that community of
13 justice. The actions taking over Ferguson were
14 similar to the actions taken in Harlem during the
15 riots of 1964. I feel your pain, but it is time that
16 as a community we begin to riot, not with our fists
17 and violence, but respond with our voice and demand
18 for positive change. We cannot change people's
19 opinions of us, but we can and we must demonstrate
20 that as a black and brown community, we are more than
21 just our color, but that we are humans as well. We
22 all have the same rights, and it's time that as a
23 society that we move forward to being treated as
24 individuals than being judged by the color of our
25 skin. In memory of black lives lost, I pray peace

1
2 and hope to our Speaker and to my colleagues and to
3 the staff as we break bread with families and friends
4 for Thanksgiving. Thank you and God bless.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And the last
6 Council Member speaking before we hear from our
7 Speaker is Council Member Rose. No? Council Member
8 Chin?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Madam
10 Public Advocate. You missed me again.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Sorry, I sorry.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Good afternoon. I
13 like to draw my colleague's attention to a bill,
14 Intro 551 and Reso 472 that I'm introducing today
15 with Council Member Johnson and Kallos. This bill
16 would make it possible for individual of multiracial
17 background to be able to identify as multiracial on
18 government forms. We also have a resolution that
19 calls on the state and federal government to allow
20 this as well, particularly since we are required in
21 many instance to use their forms. Currently, there
22 are a number of government forms including DCAS new
23 hire form that do not allow anyone to identify as
24 more than one race. It is time to bring New York City
25 into the 21st century. This will allow New Yorkers to

1 identify their heritage and be proud of it.

2 Multiracial people shouldn't have to choose between
3 one identity or another. They shouldn't have to just
4 check one box. So I urge my colleagues to join me in
5 signing onto Intro 551 and Reso 472. Thank you.
6

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I apologize
8 Council Member Chin. And now, before we hear from
9 the Speaker it's Council Member Gibson to close.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you very
11 much, Madam Public Advocate, and good afternoon to
12 all of my colleagues. I'd first like to just call up
13 the family of Mr. Kwok [sp?], the 61 year old
14 gentleman who was a resident of the Bronx who was
15 pushed off of a subway platform in the Bronx on
16 Sunday, November 16th. It is very unfortunate that
17 this man was with his wife and they were on their way
18 to lower Manhattan to go shopping, and unfortunately
19 at that time he was encountered by a man who was
20 apparently disturbed and was accused of pushing
21 someone else off of a train early in the month, and
22 unfortunately, he lost his life. And so I just ask
23 all of my colleagues to please keep the family of Mr.
24 Kwok in your thoughts and prayers. A wife no longer
25 has her husband and children no longer have their

1 father during this time. I also want to echo the
2 sentiments of all of my colleagues who have really
3 talked about our disappointment, frustration and
4 anger at the recent decision in the Ferguson Michael
5 Brown case. We speak the name of so many young men
6 of color who have lost their lives unfortunately.
7 Michael Brown, Akai Gurley [sp?], Trayvon Martin,
8 Remarley Graham, Amadu Deallo [sp?], Ms. Evette Smith,
9 Shaun Bell [sp?], Anthony Bias, Timothy Stansbury,
10 Nicholas Hayward, Eleanor Bumpers [sp?], the list
11 goes on. This is something that's a part of a
12 national conversation in how communities of color
13 engage in relationships with law enforcement across
14 America. This is not immune to New York City, and as
15 someone who's been working with all of my colleagues
16 these last 11 months, it is truly up to us to be the
17 change agents, to continue to work with the police
18 department in necessary reforms that will shift the
19 culture so that communities of color are not policed
20 in an aggressive and discriminatory way, so that we
21 really have public safety across this city. And so,
22 I join with all of you in my prayers for the family
23 of Michael Brown, and I thank the Speaker for her
24 leadership in helping me and my district deal with
25

1
2 Mr. Kwok, and I wish every one of you a wonderful
3 Thanksgiving season. Thank you, Madam Public
4 Advocate.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. And
6 let me just also say that I too as Public Advocate am
7 concerned, but more importantly I'm committed to
8 reform that brings together police and those they
9 serve. That's why I've been proud to lead the fight
10 for body cameras and reforming how public housing is
11 policed and improving conditions. Recent events
12 should raise the sense of urgency for reform and to
13 bring all of us together. And with that, I wish
14 everyone a happy holiday, and to close, our Speaker
15 Melissa Mark-Viverito.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
17 Public Advocate, and again, wishing everybody a happy
18 Thanksgiving. I was at a legislative breakfast
19 yesterday organized by the Food Bank of New York that
20 came out with a policy paper and the Public Advocate
21 was there as well. We should always be concerned
22 about hunger, and that is something that this council
23 has very much discussed and acted on. That policy
24 paper indicates that as a result of actions taken by
25 Congress, which is a reduction in food stamps, we

1
2 have seen an incredible burden, additional burden on
3 our food pantries and our soup kitchens, and that
4 unfortunately looks like it will only get worse. So
5 in this time in particular and these holidays where
6 we come together, let's just be resolute and continue
7 to be committed to providing greater access to all of
8 those in our communities. And again, that in light
9 of the unfortunate decision in Ferguson, that we
10 reflect and as a body act united, not divided on
11 these issues. Thank you very much.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We stand
13 adjourned.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 2, 2014