

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

----- X

November 17, 2014
Start: 01:21 p.m.
Recess: 03:08 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway- Committee Rm, 14th Fl.

B E F O R E:
INEZ D. BARRON
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

FERNANDO CABRERA
JAMES VACCA
JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS
LAURIE A. CUMBO
VANESSA L. GIBSON
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good afternoon.

Good afternoon.

[cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. My name is Inez Barron and I am the chair of the Committee on Higher Education. Our hearing today is on the City University of New York's graduate programs. CUNY is made up of 24 member institutions of which five are graduate at professional schools; The Graduate School and University Center, The Graduate School of Journalism which is the only publically funded graduate school of journalism in the northeast, The School of Law which is recognized as one of the nation's premier public interest law schools, The School of Professional Studies, and The School of Public Health. At these schools CUNY offers over 800 graduate programs and 160 graduate degree majors to over 30 thousand graduate students. Clearly CUNY provides a lot of opportunities for New Yorkers to obtain the advanced degrees that are increasingly needed to succeed in today's economy. The question I have is whether enough is being done to extend those

opportunities to, to so-called minority and economically disadvantaged students. According to the United States Census Bureau the city's population is 33.3 percent white, 25.5 percent black, 28.6 percent Hispanic, 12.7 percent Asian, .7 percent American Indian or Alaskan Native, 0.1 percent Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander, and 4 percent multi-racial. CUNY's undergraduate student body reflecting this diversity is 24 percent white, 25 percent black, 30 percent Hispanic, 19.5 percent Asian, and 0.3 percent American Indian or Native Alaskan. However the student body makeup of CUNY's graduate programs is considerably less diverse; 54.6 percent as white, identified as white, 15., 15.5 percent as black, 15.7 percent as Hispanic, 13.9 percent as Asian or Pacific Islander, and 0.2 percent as American Indian or Native American. As we move further up the academic ladder the population becomes even less diverse. In the School of Law the instructional staff is 56.2 percent white, 16 percent black, 7.5 percent Hispanic, 13.7 percent Asian. At the Graduate Center the instructional staff is 68.7 percent white, 6.4 percent black, 7.6 percent Hispanic, and 13.5

percent Asian. And at the school of Journalism the instructional staff is 71.3 percent white, 12.2 percent black, 3.5 percent Hispanic, and 6.1 percent Asian. Today we will review graduate program offerings with a particular focus on CUNY programs that promote diversity within its graduate student population. We will examine efforts to recruit graduate students from the undergraduate populations and to recruit black and Hispanic students from other undergraduate campuses. We will also examine financial assistance, career counselling, and job opportunities available to CUNY graduate students as well as the diversity of graduate faculty. I would like to acknowledge my colleagues on the committee; Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer and thank my... oh I'm sorry... James Vacca. Do you forgive me? Okay. And thank my legislator director and CUNY liaison Indigo Washington, the committee's policy analyst Tanya Cyrus, and committee Council Jeffrey Campano. We're ready to begin and we'll call the first panel. Sonja Gomez Director of Enrollment Management Marketing and Auxiliary Services, Ricardo Fernandez President of Lehman College at CUNY, Robert Ptachik Senior

University Dean of Enrollment for CUNY and Don Rob,
Don Robithin, Robotham Professor Director of
Advanced Research Collaborative at the CUNY
Graduate Center. If you would all raise your right
hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony
before this committee and to respond honestly to
council member questions? Thank you, you may begin.

ROBERT PTACHIK: Good afternoon
Chairperson Barron and members of the Higher
Education Committee. Thank you for the opportunity
to testify about CUNY graduate programs and how
they serve the diverse population of the city of
New York. I am Bob Ptachik, CUNY Senior University
Dean for the Executive Office of Enrollment. I am
joined this afternoon by, at the far end, Lehman
College President Ricardo Fernandez the longest
serving among CUNY's 24 current presidents and
Deans. Throughout his tenor he has expanded the
college's commitment both to educational excellence
and to access to higher education for the
economically disadvantaged. Among President
Fernandez' many achievements are being named by
Crain's New York Business Magazine as one of the

People to Watch in Higher Education in 2014. To my immediately, to my immediate left is CUNY Graduate Center Professor Donald Robotham. Doctor Robotham is an anthropologist who is focused on issues of development and concomitant difficulties caused by advanced capitalist globalization. Professor Robotham has served as the Executive Officer of the Office of Educational Opportunity and Diversity Programs, a project that provides services to all graduate students enrolled in CUNY but particularly those from underrepresented groups. He is currently the director of the Advanced Research Collaborative at the Graduate Center. Sonja Gomez Prophete who is CUNY's Director of Enrollment Management, Marketing, and Auxiliary Services is also to my left. Ms. Gomez Prophete has led an effort over the past year to publicize and promote centrally CUNY's graduate programs. She has also played a lead role in helping to recruit veterans to City University. She is also a graduate of a CUNY Master's Program. About 30 thousand students are enrolled in 800 graduate programs at 13 CUNY colleges. About three-quarters of these students are studying for a Master's degree, about 15 percent for Doctoral

degrees, and the remainder for either advanced certificates or first professional degrees. For purposes of comparison graduate enrollment at CUNY is equal to the total enrollment at Columbia University and about twice the total enrollment of Fordham University. The largest areas of study at CUNY are teacher education, public administration and social services, the health professions, and the business disciplines. Many and perhaps most of CUNY's graduate students emerge from those programs to enter or continue in careers that provide direct services to New Yorkers. Tuition at most of CUNY's master's programs is less than 10 thousand dollars a year which is a small fraction of the tuition charged by almost all universities, all other universities. Despite our relatively low tuition however the cost are a challenge to many CUNY students. CUNY is supporting graduate students in a number of ways to help them with this burden. In each of the last two years CUNY has provided 1.5 million dollars in tuition waivers for graduate students. These funds are distributed to the colleges which are able to determine and support those students with the greatest need. The

Counseling Assistantship Program known as CUNYCAP provides about 150 graduate students the opportunity to receive tuition waivers for six credits in each of the Fall and Spring semesters and to be paid an hourly wage to work in the area of student services. CUNY also provides for tuition waivers for up to six credits for employees enrolled in Master's programs. We believe this effort enhances the, the diversity of these programs. Finally there is a proposal from the Graduate Center to the Board of Trustees to waive the 125 dollar application fee to Doctoral programs for any CUNY graduate interested in attending one of those programs. I would now ask that each of my colleagues make brief statements on the issues at hand. Thank you. President Fernandez would you like to start. Okay.

PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: Good afternoon Chairwoman Barron and members of the City Council's Committee on Higher Education. I'm Ricardo Fernandez, President of Lehman College, the Senior College of the City University in the borough of the Bronx. Lehman was established in 1968 and is a federally designated Hispanic serving institution

and a minority serving institution. In fall 2013 12,085 students were enrolled at Lehman College. Almost 22 hundred of them, 2199 to be exact, 18 percent of the enrollment were graduate students concentrated as you heard earlier in professional programs such as nursing, education, social work, business, speech and hearing sciences, and health sciences. Over 75 percent of all enrolled students at Lehman are Hispanic or African American. In addition two-thirds of Lehman students are women. The ethnic and racial profile of our graduate students is as follows; 33 percent Hispanic, 28 percent black or African American, 27 percent non-Hispanic white, and 5 percent Asian or Pacific Islander. 43 percent of our students are residents of the Bronx, 19 percent come from Westchester, and almost 10 percent from Manhattan. Since 1968 Lehman has had a collaboration with researchers at the New York Botanical Garden and the CUNY Graduate Center in a doctoral program in Botany, and we've graduated over the last almost 50 years 87 students from various countries including the United States. I'm proud to say that Lehman College offers over 40 graduate programs in the arts and humanities

natural social sciences, education, and the health sciences. Lehman's most popular and growing graduate programs are in the health, education, and service professions. The overwhelming majority of graduate students are enrolled in teacher education, social services, nursing, allied health professions. We recently established graduate programs in business administration and accounting. These are the two most popular under graduate areas at Lehman. And these programs are enrolling increasing numbers of master students. Now let me say a couple of things about the Bronx and employment. The largest employment sector in the Bronx is health and human services. And Lehman is responding to the current or projected workforce needs in this area. Students earning degrees in these fields do internships in schools, hospitals, community based agencies, and statistics reflect that they tend to continue providing these vital services after they graduate. This past summer we hired the founding dean of our new School of Health Sciences, Human Services, and Nursing. Lehman already offers graduate degrees in these areas. And the college is known for its nursing, social work,

speech, language, hearing programs. Expanding graduate offerings in these fields is a top priority for us. Additionally we've added a number of programs over the last decade and MFA in Visual Arts, MAT in Film Scoring, the only one in this region, an MS in Nursing Practice, a Master's of Public Health in partnership with the Graduate School of Public Health, an MSW Masters of Social Work, a Master's in Business Administration, not an MBA which Baruch offers along with CUNY but a Master's in business, an MS in Geographic Information of Science and several Master's programs in education. We're looking at exploring some online programs such as an MS in business, an MA in Health Education Promotion, and a Doctoral program in Nursing Practice. We're also looking into developing other doctoral programs in the future such as doctoral of Audiology. Industry trends in Information Technology and Computer Graphics including virtual reality, digital media, animation, gaming technology, and a myriad of... smartphones and tablets have prompted discussion of developing a master's program in Computer Science and Art. Given the strength and expertise of our

faculty in these areas as well as our state of the art multimedia center Lehman is uniquely qualified to do so. Our faculty and administration are also considering a school of business potentially in the future to house burgeoning undergraduate and graduate programs in economics, accounting, and business administration. And let me just say that here the inclusion of a, of a degree in not-for-profit management would set this school apart from many other business programs at area institutions. Again these programs are being developed to address the educational needs and career aspirations of current and perspective students and the changing socioeconomic conditions of the region. Beyond these numbers and percentages of students and the description of the programs graduate programs I want, I want to address two areas in detail, in some detail. Because of their relevance and potential impact to students and on the programs to be developed by us in the future. These two areas are one program planning and development and two financial aid for graduate students. As part of our commitment to accountability and to the relevancy of our mission Lehman College is currently engaged

in a campus wide planning exercise to prioritize all of its academic and non-academic programs and services for the next three to five years. An integral part of the planning process is an analysis of the current workforce and workforce needs of the borough, city, and region, and a look at what you, what future projections tell us. We're taking a close look at various documents to inform this planning process including an economic snapshot of the Bronx in 2013 produced by the Office of the New York State Comptroller, an article from US News and World Report on jobs in New York City that go unfilled, and a July 2013 report by the New York City Economic Development Corporation Borough Trends and Insights. And in addition I want to highlight the regional report from JP Morgan's Chase's five year 250 million dollar initiative new skills at work titled Closing the Skills Gap. It provides useful information of New York City's top six industries, industry categories based on a number of employees. And the top two of those are healthcare and technology. Lehman College is prepared and willing to meet this challenge. Now regarding financial aid in response

to the need to open up opportunities for CUNY undergraduate students to pursue graduate study five year BA MA combined programs have been developed at Lehman and at other CUNY senior colleges. At Lehman programs in history, biology for select high achieving students allow participating students who have completed 90 credits towards the Baccalaureate degrees to enroll and receive graduate credit for uncertain number of courses. The main advantage of a dual undergraduate graduate credit program is that students can earn a specified number of graduate credits 12 to 15 while enrolled as undergraduates and thus pay lower tuition which for many students is covered by PELL and TAP grants. ...as well to accelerate their progress toward completion of a graduate degree in their chosen field of study. Now some of, some of this is still in development but once launched it will offer significant savings to participating students. These are but two examples of initiatives on the way at Lehman and at other senior colleges of CUNY to help lower the cost of graduate education to students to enable them to complete a graduate degree more quickly. Finally a concrete

way in which the city council could assist students in earning graduate degrees and simultaneously address New York City's urgent workforce needs would be to fund scholarship for graduate students in selected fields such as nursing, pre-k 12 science education and special education and various areas of technology where there are many many jobs waiting to be filled by properly credentialed professionals. I thank you for the opportunity to share this information on graduate students and programs at Lehman as well as our vision for future graduate program development in response to the needs of New York City's workforce. I look forward to the discussion... responding to your questions. Thank you very much.

PROFESSOR ROBOTHAM: Good afternoon Chairperson Barron, other members of the Higher Education Committee. Thank you for this opportunity to present information to you. My name is Don Robotham. I am Professor of Anthropology at the Grad Center and Director of the Advanced Research Collaborative. The Grad Center is a principal doctoral granting institution of CUNY. We have approximately 5,000 students, 141 centerline

faculty, 1661 college based faculty. Along with Columbia we're the largest grant, doctoral granting institution in the city and one of the largest in the country. And last year, last commencement we awarded 523 doctorates and we're 12,800 doctorates in the lifetime history of this, of the Grad Center. About 7,000 of our graduates are employed in the New York City area, 5,000 employed to postsecondary institutions. As a part of our graduate training each year our doctorate students teach about 7,700 undergraduate courses with an enrollment of 200 thousand students, principally 75 percent in the CUNY senior colleges. I want to point out that the CUNY Grad Center is also a research university with 31 research centers producing path breaking work in many critical areas of public policy such as a differential performance of female versus male minority students in college and hope to address the challenges of multilingualism in the education system on economic inequality not only at the national but at the city and municipal levels and on immigration. We also address key issues of public concern through our public programs. We are one of the first

universities to have a round table on the Ebola crisis on September 22nd. We hosted the large Afro-Latina conference organized by the Afro-Latino Forum on October 24th. On December 5th we shared host a main national conference... in Nigeria and in many other events of that nature we should, we can speak to in the question time if, if the committee's interested. Let me speak to the issue of diversity which the chairperson raised directly. Auditors in, is consistent with what you presented. 7.4 percent of our students are black, 14.5 Hispanic, 8.8 percent Asian. Percentages of our faculty black are 4.5 black, 6.7 Hispanic, 14 percent Asian. About 57 percent of our students are female and that if I may add tend to be on the younger side total population. I would say our graduate students are probably 6-70 percent 35 and older I would say in general, just a young population. In terms of where the students come from; 49 percent are from families with parents having... graduate degree or less and about 15 percent of all doctoral students are from families in which a parent has a high school education or less. In order to improve these numbers we have

taken certain steps and I, I will just mention a couple of them, not all of which are here. The single most important step which we have taken Madam Chair is to establish diversity committees at the program level that in other words at the departmental level. The reason why this is critical is because the decisions are on admissions of students are taken at the departmental level and therefore it is critical that the intervention be at that level and not simply at the level of the provost... we've already established these committees, we already have diversity plans from them, and we intend very much to monitor and dare I say it enforce the plans which are neutrally agreed on. The other things which are important in this, in this area is the, the continuous recruitment which we do at particular areas like at the CUNY colleges, at the, the Black Male Initiative and at various events of that nature. In that, in that regard the pipeline program is a critical one and I'm quite happy to answer questions on that. The essential thing that we need to do and we tend to do on the pipeline program if we get enough financial support is to establish local pipelines

1 at the college level. This is really a critical
2 intervention in my opinion. It will require more
3 funding and hopefully we'll be able to find the
4 funding. But we have not had this so far. The other
5 thing which is critical is the proposal before the
6 city, before the board of trustees which is coming
7 up which is the removal, the waiving of the one 25
8 dollar application fee for CUNY students. This is,
9 this is one of the highest fees in the, in, in,
10 generally Columbia I think is 105 or some such
11 figure and the waiver of this fee for CUNY students
12 applying to the grad center would be a critical
13 intervention in opening up the doors of access. The
14 last point I want to mention on this is a question
15 of our new tuition packages. Going forward from
16 2015 every student admitted will get at least their
17 tuition paid and many will get more than that so
18 that from 2015 going forward the question of
19 tuition cost should not be a factor in the
20 enrollment of students in the graduate center. And
21 we regard this as a really...

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Pardon the
24 interruption, could you repeat that, I was reading
25 some other charts. [cross-talk]

PROFESSOR ROBOTHAM: I'm so sorry...

[cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...repeat that...

[cross-talk]

PROFESSOR ROBOTHAM: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...please?

PROFESSOR ROBOTHAM: Okay the grad center's been able to try and support... to have new tuition packages and these new tuition packages, and remember the exact numbers I can get them for you later if you wish but basically they're two sorts. One package will be tuition plus a stipend of about 25 thousand dollars per year which is a substantial competitive stipend and the other package will be tuition either in state or out of state level. What this means is that tuition cost will not be constraint for people from all colleges who wish to enroll in graduate education. One...

[cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So just I, I...

[cross-talk]

PROFESSOR ROBOTHAM: Sorry...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...just want to come in on this. That'll be for...

PROFESSOR ROBOTHAM: Doctoral, doctoral grad center, doctoral.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh.

PROFESSOR ROBOTHAM: No, no doctoral.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

PROFESSOR ROBOTHAM: I'm... thank you for the clarification.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

PROFESSOR ROBOTHAM: I'm... speak on behalf of the grad center somewhat, somewhat limited. But can I make... this is really really important for, for obvious reason. If, if I may end on a note of hope which is that our incoming class of doctoral students is 21 percent from so, so-called underrepresented groups. The trend is... to increase. The issue before us really is how do we intensify the efforts to push this increase further. Thank you very much.

SONJA GOMEZ PROPHETE: Thank you. Good afternoon Chairperson Barron and members of the Higher Education Committee. My name is Sonja Gomez Prophete. I'm the Director of Enrollment Management Marketing at the CUNY Central Office of Enrollment Management. I'm a graduate of Baruch Zicklin School

of Business with a Master's Degree in marketing. And I earned my degree working full time at the Central Office and raising two children. I'm a typical example of a, of a student going through CUNY's graduate programs. A major part of my responsibilities is to oversee the CUNY Office of Graduate Studies. This, this office coordinates recruitment activities throughout the university. Today I will provide you with a quick overview of CUNY's initiatives to recruit masters and doctoral students. CUNY enrolls over 29 thousand graduate students at our 13 colleges that offer graduate degrees. In January 2014 the Chancellor's Office charged the Office of Enrollment Management with assisting the colleges with marketing and recruitment with the goal of boosting graduate enrollment. The Office of Graduate Studies was created and it is a one stop shop supplying perspective students with information about all 800 graduate degree programs and also our, our advanced certificates and other programs. Trained staff members answer questions via phone, email, and social media and then shepherd the students onto professionals at the campus that can further assist

them through the admission's process. A comprehensive recruitment plan was created with the guidance from, with guidance from the colleges as well as industry best practices. Our campaigns are event based and include advertising such as radio advertising, like 1010 wins, WNYC, print advertising such as am New York and metro newspapers, also digital advertising... such as UFT.org, email marketing, and as well as grassroots marketing such as calendar listing from the more expansive and New York One and and NYC.gov to more focus such as Caribbean Life. Since January the Office of Graduate Studies has offered 19 information sessions at the central office at 42nd Street. These sessions range from general graduate sessions which walk folks through through the process, through the graduate admissions process and then we also have more focus sessions which cover disciplines in detail. We also host sessions for different groups such as career changers, veterans, international students and of course underrepresented minorities. Also of note our graduate fairs held in the fall and the spring these are some, these are among the largest

graduate fairs in New York City. In fact we have one coming up this week, this Thursday November 20th from 2:00 to 7:00 p.m. at the Grand Hide [sp?] at Grand Central. This event will showcase all 800 programs and will include faculty led workshops. We invite members of this committee to attend and I'll share some information after the, the meeting so that you can share it with your constituents. So CUNY's strength is in its depth and breadth of programs, its value as well as its diversity. Our diversity program page on the CUNY graduate studies website is one of the most highly visited portions of the webpage. For this reason we've created information sessions showcasing our diversity programs and are also partnering with minority clubs on the campuses to showcase these programs to current students and alumni. As a result of these efforts as well as the college's efforts a new grad enrollment in fall 2014 was up eight percent. The Office of Graduate Studies will continue to serve as a resource to students, staff, and the community as we work to augment 13 college's marketing and recruitment efforts. Thank you to the committee.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you for your testimony and we've been joined by Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez. And I've got some questions that I would like to ask of you. In terms of the presentation that we have about Lehman College there's some statistics which were offered at a previous hearing in terms of the hiring practices and I was wondering if you had any particular facts about Lehman in terms of the percentage of the ethnicity breakdown of the college in terms of the faculty rather.

RICARDO FERNANDEZ: [off mic] I, I did not include that in the testimony that I just presented... [cross-talk] about 10 minutes ago anticipating that question come from... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh can you shift the mic over?

RICARDO FERNANDEZ: I expect to have this information shortly. I'm asking it from my Office of... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

RICARDO FERNANDEZ: ...Research.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's great. Now in, and then back to the question of the program at

1 CUNY, at Lehman which targets students that have
2 promised that gives them the opportunity to take
3 some graduate level courses as an undergrad; how
4 many students did that reach out to? How many
5 students were incorporated in that program?

6 RICARDO FERNANDEZ: We have, we have
7 just two programs. One in history which is small.
8 And then we have, I don't have the exact number of
9 the students but the, the one in Biology is of
10 particular... [cross-talk] interest to us because
11 that's an area of significant need in the schools
12 and beyond. I, I can try to provide that
13 information. I don't have it... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. And then you
15 indicated that you were doing... and some outreach to
16 see what the needs were as you were going forward?

17 RICARDO FERNANDEZ: Well we, we... [cross-
18 talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How will that
20 influence the design of courses going forward? Will
21 you then shift? Will you get an outreach for...

22 RICARDO FERNANDEZ: We, no let, let me,
23 let me just... Normally when courses are proposed at,
24 at a senior college or a university the faculty
25

1 indicate that they are interested in offering a
2 course in X or Y. And that goes through its own
3 process. Normally there isn't an analysis of the
4 workforce needs or the environment in which those
5 individuals are going to be functioning once they
6 graduate. What we're trying to do at Lehman which
7 is the first time really we've been doing this in
8 a, on an ongoing basis is to look at the broad
9 picture of the workforce needs of the borough and
10 the city and try to factor that in. That will not
11 be necessarily the defining factor on whether we
12 offer a program or not but we believe that that has
13 to be an integral part of the planning process.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. And I've
16 heard about the Lehman program and, and the
17 graduate center. I have some questions about the
18 law school and about the Sophie Davis School of
19 Biomedical Education.

20 ROBERT PTACHIK: [off mic] We have a
21 representative of the law school here in the
22 audience who can hopefully respond to your
23 questions.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay are, have you
25 submitted a slip? Okay so I'll direct the question

specifically to you. We'll have her come on an additional panel so that we can address that issue. Do, do you find that black and Hispanic undergrad students report a higher or lower household income than same ethnic groups on the undergrad level? Do you find that... what has been the statistics on income level?

ROBERT PTACHIK: [off mic] David Crook... who manages our Office of Institutional Searches here and hopefully... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay well then I'll ask you to come up and can you address that question. If you would please when you come up you can pull that chair up a little. And would you raise your right hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee?

DAVID CROOK: [off mic] I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. And give your name please.

DAVID CROOK: [off mic] My name is David Crook.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Can you come a little closer to the mic?

DAVID CROOK: So the question is is the income of... could you repeat the question for me... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes. Do you find that for black and Latino students on the graduate level there's a significant difference in the household income at, as compared to students on the undergrad level, black and Latino students... [cross-talk]

DAVID CROOK: On the whole of the, I don't have the exact data but I can tell you that the average household income of graduate students is higher than it is for our undergraduate students. Our undergraduate students have relatively low family, family incomes [cross-talk] takes family resources to go on up the educational scale.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So it's higher than those... [cross-talk]

DAVID CROOK: So... [cross-talk] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So do you, we, do we find then that that would be an impediment for those students who are in the undergrad that costs are greater moving up to graduate school so that

that might reduce the number of students and
undergrads who are moving on to, who are...

DAVID CROOK: Probably in a case of
doctoral studies there's pretty good support for
students for doctoral study, for masters study that
that would tend to be more out of pocket for those
costs so there's always publically a choice between
having to go to work after they graduate from
bachelor's program and continuing their, their
schooling in a, in a master's program.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. And in terms
of finances... Well as, as we talk about the, the,
and that might not be a question that you could
answer but to the panel if, if diversity is a
factor in the number of students that we're getting
and if 50, 54 percent of the graduate students are
white when only 33 percent of New Yorkers are white
what is causing that fracture, what is causing that
gap, that schism? Why aren't student... and I know
people are not going to tell me well they just want
to get into that workforce and not pursue higher
but what are some of the reasons that you think
would contribute to those students...

ROBERT PTACHIK: Well I'll, I'll start out by saying I, I believe that, you know there are multiple reasons but one certainly would be uh support for the tuition. As I mentioned our tuition is relatively low but it, it's still 10 thousand dollars a year plus other costs; books, travel, and so on. The largest graduate enrolling institutions in the city of New York are besides CUNY, Columbia, NYU, Teacher's College, Touro, St. John's, Fordham. These are all places with many more resources to provide support for students. I don't have data and I don't know if anyone here has data on the degree to which they provide scholarship support to students. But beyond the one and half million dollars in the other small programs that I mentioned earlier CUNY just does not necessarily have the resources to do that. To the other point you raised the, as, as I'm sure you've heard at other hearings there are many more opportunities for financial aid for undergraduate students; the Federal Pell program which whose benefits normally run out by the time a student graduates, the TAP program, New York state TAP program, the new City Council Academic Scholarships, these are all

1
2 programs that are geared to undergraduates and
3 their benefits are normally gone by the time a
4 student reaches, is ready for graduate work.

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay but, and then
6 considering I'm not sure if this is, is this
7 graduate or is this undergrad, do you know? Is
8 that... it would probably be undergrad because... mm-
9 hmm... this is... okay. Okay a question now again for
10 about, regarding the faculty at Lehman college in
11 particular since you're here to talk about, give
12 your testimony. The statistics that I have here
13 regarding faculty indicate that in 2013 from July
14 2012 to June 2013 there were 29, actually a total
15 of 50 black men and women who apply to faculty
16 positions at Lehman. And of the 50 who applied to
17 Lehman only three were granted an interview. And of
18 the three none of them were given an offer to join
19 the faculty. I find that troubling.

20 PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: Well I, I find it
21 troubling too and I wish I had known about this
22 before I came so I could have done some research as
23 to why these numbers are there. I, I need to, I
24 would love to have the information, the specific
25

data that you have and the source of the data so
that I can... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: It's the
information that I received from CUNY from a
previous hearing that was held.

PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: Well I understand
that but I don't, with the specific reference would
have allowed me to at least give you some sort of
response.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Mm-hmm.

PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: I do have data on
the numbers of faculty in absolute numbers... [cross-
talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay would you like
to... [cross-talk]

PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: ...if I could share
those... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...share them?
[cross-talk]

PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: ...with you. These
are faculty by gender and ethnicity fall of 2013.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Mm-hmm.

PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: There was a total
of 378 faculty. 261 of them were white non-

Hispanic, 52 were Hispanic, 39 were black African American, and 24 were Asian Pacific Islander, 2 American Indian. I don't have the percentages of that but that's easily...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Mm-hmm.

PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: ...calculated. So I, I'm estimating 69 68 69 percent white and then decreasing percentages of the other groups.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Mm-hmm. So what, what... [cross-talk]

PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: These are full time faculty, I'm sorry.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: These are full time. How do we address, I know that CUNY has a plan. I don't know where we are in this plan, this diversity plan but what are we doing to turn this around?

PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: Well I can tell you at Lehman we monitor the searches that are done for faculty position by every department. We request to see the list of people, in fact before people can be brought in for interviews we want to

see whether they have a diverse pool of applicants.

And my office insists on, on reviewing and

approving those lists before any search can move

forward. And in fact we have turned back a number

of searches because in the opinion of our, my staff

they haven't had a diverse enough pool. That

happens more than just once in a while. We do that.

We also obviously have a plan in which we, we have

a diversity council made up of faculty members from

across the institution and some staff because they

meet and they have put together some, a number of

programs to inform people. We need to cast a, you

know a wide enough net but one of the realities in

CUNY is that a lot of the faculty hiring happens

from the big pool of very qualified faculty many of

whom are adjuncts who are long term employees of

the college. So it is not unusual that when you

apply, when you announce or advertise a position

some of the applicants that are best known to the

search committees have come from that pool. And

that pool of adjuncts is not really planned, it's

anyone who comes here and offers to teach a course

and is qualified. That is a reality that we

understand but we in spite of that search for and

1
2 apply and announce these positions as widely as
3 possible in, through media, we publish in journals,
4 we put advertise, advertisements in newspapers in
5 the Chronicle of Higher Education and in a number
6 of other publications that are aimed at ethnic
7 groups specifically.

8 DAVID CROOK: ...it might be worth...

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Little closer
10 please.

11 DAVID CROOK: Sorry. ...note, noting that
12 the, the pool that is available to recruit from is,
13 is constrained. I, I do have data on the minority
14 enrollment nationally in doctoral programs and
15 public institutions...

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Well I would only
17 be interested in it if it were populations that
18 were similar to New York City populations. I'm not
19 interested in you know Colorado or Nebraska. So if
20 you have it in that regard it might be helpful.

21 DAVID CROOK: I have the national
22 picture and...

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay well...

24 DAVID CROOK: ...it's a national, it's a
25 national labor mark... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay if you'd like to, you know at some point tease that out and do that I would, I'd be glad to see that. Oh, you have a question? Okay. We've been joined by Council Member Cumbo from Brooklyn and we are going to give Council Member Rodriguez an opportunity to ask questions.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah. Thank you Chairman, Chair. Look this is, as we said before this is like, it's like business as usual. Like we been dealing with this situation as all the topic like for so many decades and it's still like when we here the same explanation on we've been making progress on this area, the percentage is here. Say... when is a, we will wake up... that... you know we had to address the, the, the real cause of... especially the lack of diversity. So even though when we started a community college the student population they look more like what New York City is. And then we go into the BA, the senior colleges you know it's then... we started seeing some difference, especially if we look at the, at the top senior colleges. You know diversity has been affecting the last couple of years. And... city

college like you know if I... [cough] [pause] [off mic] You know when, even like being a student, and I... never... it's like a teacher when you're being a teacher that's about all you do... so as a student activist you know like... friends that we... and... education is a pathway for the future. [on mic] And, and, and if we, in order for us who... And the, and the... improving diversity is not only you know good for those of us who are the black and Latino that advocate for the diversity. You know... the society where we are living today if someone is white and it's like a liberal and it's a progressive you would like to see you know your child being taught by someone that if... teaching any particular class... that look they, that show the diversity that we have as a city. So when we look at these data and, and at the graduate center we are 68 percent white, six percent black, seven percent Hispanic... what is, what is it we will do you know to address that, to address that situation. That's beside the graduate course teacher at city college, teacher at Lehman College, teacher at all the Senior College. That's a number that we have at graduate center. So I would like to hear, and I'm

DOCTOR ROBOTHAM: May I address that
Chair?

DOCTOR ROBOTHAM: Thank you. There's the

data that Council Member Rodriguez is accurate data. So there's no contesting the data, nor is there any contesting the history which has been presented. The question is what do we do going forward. And there, there are a couple things here. First of all I think the most important thing that we are doing is to address this problem at the local departmental level which we have never done before. Decisions about recruitment or faculty, decisions about admission of students are not taken by a provost or a president. They are taken by people in history or people in economics and so on. We have never had a situation where we say to each program, first of all you must have a responsive body including students who will speak to this question of diversity, not in the graduate center

but in history or in English or in artistry, or in whatever field. So you have to give a specific set of plans with details for both students and faculty for which we will hold you accountable. To me that is the single most important one at the graduate center. We waived fees, tuition fees going forward will no longer be a constraint. Nearly all... substantial part of our students will get stipends as well as tuition. So on the financial side we should be in a better position going forward from Next year? But on a local responsibility level this is rarely crucial that this be enforced and that the people's feet be held to the fire at the local level. This is the... of it. Let me add one other thing which is... and I don't want to go down the road that Chairperson Barron ironically referred to about excuses. It's not an excuse. I don't think from my experience... because I used to go around from campus to campus, Medgar Evers and Lehman and City College beating the drum for graduate education, for doctoral education, let me be specific. And what I found is our students are very alive to graduate education in the professional fields. So engineer, there's no engineering

business law that... alive to that. They're not as alive as they need to be to graduate education in the other fields. And we had to push it by making us like a different argument from what you presented which is an argument about the shaping of public policy and public opinion. If you want to shape public policy and shape public opinion then you've got to have a diversity of people who analyze and speak on these issues. And in the absence of that other people will make public policy for you. ...very clear on this point. However we've got to carry that message into an organizational form and not just you know statements. And this is why we try to do it, to try to do to New York in particular as an experiment and it worked to some degree. We've got to intervene with our students at the, for doctoral programs in their freshman year. And this idea we have of building pipelines at the local level to the graduate center from the freshman year is a new approach. Now it will take some resources and god knows we don't have the money for it and so on we, it will have to be found somehow. But this to me is critical so it, our, our students at Lehman and New

1 York, and Medgar, and throughout the city there,
2 the importance of, of aspiring to the highest
3 possible of, level of education is clear to them
4 from the point of entry into college. So that is
5 what is new. When you call us back a year from now
6 or two years from now I cannot say the situation
7 would be any different, I sincerely hope so. Thank
8 you.
9

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: And, and you
11 know I'm happy to hear some new information. I and,
12 and, and some initiative to create that pipeline.
13 But I, I just believe that we have to be more
14 accountable. I believe that we need to have a plan
15 or what is the number that we would like to achieve
16 in the next ten year. I don't think that we can
17 leave those number of the percentage that other
18 composition of the graduate programs who let's see
19 what the outcome is going to be. I believe that we
20 need to create that pipeline and I agree with you.
21 And I, and this is one other hearing that we are,
22 this was one of the hearing that we are, this was
23 one of the hearing that I have when I was sharing
24 this committee. I'm happy to see this information.
25 I'm happy to know that we, the President Fernandez...

big heart on addressing this issue. But I want to see what's going on at the Graduate Center. And I would like to see what is the dynamic there, what is the commitment that we have, what is the investment that we make and also I would like to see some changes in the Search Committee. Because I believe that the Search Committee also it should reflect the population of our city. Because you know if this has not been working. Even still in 20, 2014 this is what we have with the diverse, with the you know the graduate this is tough. Even right now like we've been addressing this conversation with the NYPD and they've been talking about some unit that they didn't have in one Latino in the Anti-, Anti-, Anti-Terrorism and they say we going to make those changes. So for me and I know that this is the... that we have now at the Council when it come to the need to increase diversity I personally would like to see that plan. I personally would like to see something that in the year that I will leave at the council that we can say today at the Graduate Center there's only 6.4 percent black, there's only 7.6, same 7.6 percent Latino in the next year our plan is to bring it to

20. And the next plan is to bring it to 50. But we need to have that goal in front of us.

PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: If I may I, I would like to address some of the comments that you have made as well as the, the Chairwoman. On search committees you're quite right, search committees, because they are departmental based operate independent of the administration. That is the current system that we have. So we have, what we're doing to address the issue is to provide some training for search committees in terms of how to go and develop a more diverse pool of applicants. And we have devoted a significant amount of effort to that. Now all is not lost. I, I've been at Lehman now almost 25 years. And I know that in the next several years we're going to have a huge number of retirements among faculty, senior faculty at this institution of the City University of New York. I have at Lehman a number of faculty who are in their 60s. I have faculty who are in their 60s, I have faculty in their 70s, I have faculty in their 80s. Faculty, there's no retirement mandatory for faculty and many of them, some of them I would say have retired already but they're still on the

1 faculty. But never the less some of them, many of
2 them are going to be retiring in the next five ten
3 years and that will open up a significant number of
4 possibilities. So the idea of a plan or benchmarks
5 that we could then monitor to see what progress
6 we're making against that I think is a, certainly a
7 sound one. Let me just address one other issue
8 which is something that I find when we try to hire
9 people who are working us in other universities.
10 The salary structure of the City University of New
11 York sucks.

12 [laughter]

13 PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: Let me put it this
14 way very plainly we have not have, we have not had
15 an increase, and the faculty has not had a contract
16 for five years now. CUNY used to have the best
17 salaries back in the 70s and attracted incredible
18 numbers of talented people. The reality is that
19 CUNY offers salaries 50 thousand and more below the
20 private universities against which we're competing.
21 The talent market is a national market and we are
22 competing frankly without weapons in terms of
23 salary offers that we can make. Yeah we can raise
24 salaries beyond a certain point for certain people
25

but we don't have the resource to, to do that. I mean if you're talking about the university that's something that really needs to be addressed otherwise we're competing with one hand tied behind our backs.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Last question is about retention even though we have those percentage you know. It doesn't mean that that is the percentage that, student who graduate. This is the percentage of student who apply and are accepted into the graduate program. How are we doing with retention when it come to diversity. What is the difference of retention per... to?

DAVID CROOK: We, we don't have the data with us by race. I can tell you for masters programs that the overall graduation rate in, in four years from our mater's programs is about 74 percent of those who start, graduate within four years. And it's probably safe to say that there are some racial differences in those numbers. We can get those for you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: But we can assume that there's a, a real difference and retention when it come to ethnicity too.

1 DAVID CROOK: The, there probably,
2
3 probably is for some of the same reasons that we've
4 talked about before economic differences, pool of
5 work, needing to work before graduation and, and,
6 and so forth.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Mm. I, I just
8 think that for... if you can... that information it
9 would be great. I just think that, you know that
10 for me as it is topic into, two thing. One is the
11 student population which is yes, let's be sure that
12 we follow that approach you know. We need to start
13 to recruiting a student into the... program since
14 they are in the, at the freshman level. And I don't
15 think that we are doing it so aggressively at our
16 senior colleges. No going in the past at least I
17 can talk about from my experience there I believe
18 that we can grow when it come to going through
19 these freshman classes... Since the first semester we
20 can see... especially how can we go and advertise and
21 create that pilot program for the student see
22 himself or herself not only getting her BA but also
23 getting her master degree and then getting a PHD.
24 So that's one area what I hope we will continue
25 like exploring and, and making improvement. When it

1
2 come to what the staff, the composition of the
3 staff... is, one is a pipeline but the other is the
4 commitment in the understanding that we have to
5 create a win win situation by increasing the
6 diversity of the staff at CUNY.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you Council
8 Member. I certainly appreciate the comment that
9 salary for faculty needs to be improved. Can you
10 tell me how it is that we were able to offer a
11 million dollars to General Petraeus to come on
12 staff?

13 PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: I'm, I'm not sure
14 any of us can answer that. You might want to ask
15 the person who made the offer. I don't, I don't
16 really, I don't know anything about that. I do know
17 that he did agree to do it pro bono after people...
18 [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: After people raised
20 their voices and said what.

21 PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: Correct.

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.

23 PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: Yes.
24
25

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So did he in fact do it pro bono or did he in fact, he made an offer but did he in fact...

PRESIDENT FERNANDEZ: To my knowledge he is not receiving a salary from the City University... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, okay. Thank you. And then in terms of the students that we're talking about bringing into the graduate program how many of the students that are in the graduate program are CUNY undergrads that have moved on? What percentage are we talking about?

SONJA GOMEZ PROPHETE: So 30 percent are CUNY graduates.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So 30 percent graduated from CUNY and moved into...

DAVID CROOK: And, and I can offer another statistic the other way around. Of, of all of our Bachelor's graduates in a given year a quarter of them will go on to graduate study in CUNY within five years. So that's the, the pipeline going the other way. And it's... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Mm-hmm.

DAVID CROOK: ...something certainly we can work on raising. They, they also are some of the most heavily recruited students for graduate study out, out there. Students of color have many opportunities to go outside of CUNY as well.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Okay, oh Council Member Cumbo left, okay. Well I'm, I'm pleased again for your coming and bringing your testimony. I'm very disturbed at the lack of black Latino Asian faculty that are offered positions. I don't want us to have to wait five to 10 years for people to leave either vertically or horizontally leave the system, I don't think that that's fair, I don't think that's right, and I don't think that that's what our society is based on doing. I think there needs to be, I understand that you're saying the departments make the decisions but perhaps we need to understand how we might need to reshape that because they're not giving us the results that we need. We're not getting what we, what's fair. We're not getting the results that we need to be able to offer people who have gone through the system either here or with other colleges and are qualified and then not getting the offers. I've

1
2 gotten some complaints from people personally about
3 instances. But, and my other question is okay so a
4 person who qualifies for one department, who does
5 not qualify at one college might in fact qualify at
6 another. So there's obviously a lot of subjectivity
7 in selecting staff. And people are not getting
8 their fair share, or an opportunity to participate.
9 So I'm not going to be here next year and have the
10 same numbers come forward and be in any way
11 satisfied. That's totally unacceptable. So that
12 means we got to look at this plan, this diversity
13 plan that we've got, we need to look to see how we
14 can make it a reality and not just a plan on paper.
15 Thank you so much for coming and sharing your
16 testimony. I did have one other question someone
17 had asked. Is there a language requirement as
18 students move into doctoral programs? Is there any
19 type of language requirements?

20 DOCTOR ROBOTHAM: No on, on, on doing,
21 on the way in not, not entering but in the course
22 of...

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.
24
25

DOCTOR ROBOTHAM: ...being admitted to candidacy yes there's a language requirement but not for entry, no.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay good. Thank you so much. And at this time we're going to call on Cheryl Howard who's here to answer questions from the CUNY School of Law.

[pause]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Would you raise your right hand? Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee and to answer all questions truthfully?

CHERYL HOWARD: Yes I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Would you state your name?

CHERYL HOWARD: My name is Cheryl Howard. I am the Associate Dean of Student Affairs and the Director of the Pipeline to Justice Program at CUNY School of Law.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So you don't have testimony you're just here to answer questions?

CHERYL HOWARD: Yes I was asked to come as a resource to answer questions.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. How long have you been at the School of Law?

CHERYL HOWARD: I've been at the School of Law in many different rolls since 2002.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay and presently your title again?

CHERYL HOWARD: I am the Associate Dean of Student Affairs.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

CHERYL HOWARD: And the Director of the Pipeline to Justice Program.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Can you briefly tell us about the Pipeline to Justice Program?

CHERYL HOWARD: The Pipeline to Justice Program is a program that is partially funded by the efforts of city council through the BMI grant. It, the goal of the Pipeline to Justice program is to allow us to capture students who we feel would be very good law students but don't necessarily have the indicators, the academic indicators that are necessary to be admitted directly to the

program. We identify students who show a commitment to public service, who may in, on a more granular look at their grades show a real improvement in grades over time, who have underperformed on the standardized test, the LSAT, which is the admissions test for law school. We take those students through a yearlong program. The program starts in the fall with an LSAT prep program that's offered at a price now of 800 dollars which is, which I will explain later translates into no cost for many of the students. That program is unusual in that it's not just a straight LSAT program, it's a program where people are given support on test taking where we work with the students very closely on any kind of barriers that are keeping them from being successful on the test. People may have learning disabilities. Sometimes it's a personal situation. Sometimes it's, and many time it's anxiety about test taking. The Student Affairs Office, the entire law school is committed to having resources available to these students in the way of counselling. We do training and meditation and calming themselves during the test. We work very closely with them to analyze why they're not

1 doing well on the test, what kind of things I can
2 do and more importantly we have an opportunity to
3 get to know them as individuals so that we... [cross-
4 talk] tailor our support to them individually. If
5 the students show us during that semester that they
6 have the kind of grip it takes to go through law
7 school and or they get a certain level on... [cross-
8 talk] LSAT when they take it in the spring they're
9 admitted to the second part of our program. The
10 second part of our program is an intensive
11 analytical writing program teaching them to write
12 in the format that law requires called IRAC Issue
13 Rule Analysis Conclusion. This is the bedrock of
14 all... writing. It is what we found that students who
15 are underprepared at an undergraduate level lack.
16 And they could in an intensive 8-week course, if
17 they do well enough in that course they are
18 admitted directly into the law school. And that 800
19 dollars they paid for the course becomes their seat
20 deposit so they don't pay any additional... Once
21 they're in the school they continue to be supported
22 by us in that we have counselling. I track the
23 grades, my staff and I track their grades. We track
24 how they're doing on their exams. We talk
25

individually to them and to their professors so that we can intervene at an early time if there any problems. What we find is our population in pipeline are what we call fragile students. They're fragile in that they may have life events that interfere with their ability to finish law school. Law school is a form of education that was designed for rich men who had people to support them. It has not really changed. We give them more work than they can do and then we test them on all of it. That is the nature of law school. If you have people who are fragile economically or don't have family support they tend to fail for nonacademic reasons. We try to address that by being individually supportive of our students throughout their law school career. I have handed out folders with information on the law school. In that folder you will see our final BMI report which is given to you every year. And on the cover is me standing with a number of the pipeline graduates who proudly wear a sash saying that they are from pipeline. And as a student's call it it's called Pipe for Life. And they are proud that they've put in this extra year, that they've shown the kind of dedication

that other students haven't shown to get through law school.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay so these are students who have graduated from a CUNY institution and who want to go to law school and who will put in a year after having graduated from a CUNY school to be in this program?

CHERYL HOWARD: They're not just CUNY students. We have another part of our pipeline program that is dedicated to CUNY students. We started an undergraduate program, a two week summer program for undergraduates. It's targeted at all of the colleges, community colleges and senior colleges. This year we had 22 students from 12 undergraduate programs. Those students were taken through an intensive two week program, they were taught by actual law professors in law classes. They were given analytical writing. They were given an introduction to the LSAT program. And they were finished up with a visit to Pam Jackman Brown, the honorable Pam Jackman Brown who was a Supreme Court Justice who was a pipeliner. And they had a moot court competition at the end. We are applying for grants so that we can make this a more robust

1 program. But on our own we are continuing to be in
2 contact with the population, bringing them back for
3 programming throughout the year. They have said
4 they want a second program which at this point we
5 couldn't support but which we would love to
6 support. We are trying to build a cohort that has
7 comfort in a law school environment so that when
8 they apply, whether they apply to us or to someone
9 else but we're hoping they come to us, when they
10 apply they're moving into an environment that they
11 understand. We think that this will give them
12 better position, put them in a better position to
13 be successful. Everything should be in context,
14 lawyers, underrepresented people in, in this
15 population are only 11 percent of the bar.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Say that again.

18 CHERYL HOWARD: 11 percent of the bar is
19 the underrepresented population meaning what would
20 be typically known as minority population. At CUNY
21 we think it is part of our mission to, to bring
22 underrepresented people into the profession. You
23 will look and see the statistics are that I could,
24 I must say that I do get a little bit off because I
25 see these statistics every year but I believe it's

45 percent, 49 percent of our students are minority. 45 percent are first generation at higher education. ...I think at least three percent are women. And 42 percent of our professors which are the powerhouses in, in university, the ones with security, the ones who are the major teachers are minority in a, as a graduate school since we are competing nationally for really a small group of people because you have to reference back to the point that the population of attorneys who are minority in the bar is only 11 percent.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Mm-hmm. So did you say that last year you worked with 22 students?

CHERYL HOWARD: 22 undergraduate students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: 22 undergraduate students. And all of them were accepted into the law school?

CHERYL HOWARD: They were, no we're targeting this program for students who are not, who are our first and second year students... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So this... [cross-talk]

CHERYL HOWARD: This program is for undergraduates, people who are currently undergraduate. We did in this first program accept some people who were seniors and two of those people have, are now in the Pipeline to Justice Program for entering the law school.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay just for clarity the Pipeline to Justice Program is a one year program that targets students that have perhaps been underperforming and didn't do well on the SAT but that you feel that potential and would benefit and... [cross-talk]

CHERYL HOWARD: Yes... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...you give them the intensive training and preparation so that at the end of that year they can be admitted to law school.

CHERYL HOWARD: That's correct.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay how many, how many faculty are dedicated to this program?

CHERYL HOWARD: I'm dedicated to this program. Faculty come in on an as needed basis. We have faculty, I teach the second half along with my assistant who is the Associate Director for the

Pipeline to Justice Program. I was an adjunct faculty in the school from 2002 to 2010. We do have other faculty that come in to teach dedicated classes. This year we will be having more faculty come in to teach the dedicated classes. We found that this is very good for the students and I've been able to prepare the curriculum so that they know what level to teach their... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So is it, is it that they're two persons and then other faculty members come in?

CHERYL HOWARD: That's correct. [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. And what is the cost... [cross-talk] operating this program.

CHERYL HOWARD: We receive... let's be honest this is a profit making program for us. We regularly contribute 10 percent of the class to CUNY School of Law. This has been a benefit all the way around. I'm paid to be the Dean of Student Affairs. I'm not paid any extra money to be the director of the Pipeline to Justice Program.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

CHERYL HOWARD: We use our own
resources...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

CHERYL HOWARD: ...to support this
program.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I see.

CHERYL HOWARD: But we see this program
as a critical and important part of the law school.
And our dean, partially on the basis of this
program, received the City Bar Diversity Award last
year for her real commitment to the Pipeline
Program.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. What
percentage of admit, of students who are admitted
to the law school are the underrepresented groups?

CHERYL HOWARD: I don't know students
who are admitted, but students who attend it's 49
percent.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: 49 percent. So 49
percent of the students at the CUNY School of Law
are the underrepresented black, Latino, Asian,
Hispanic...

CHERYL HOWARD: That's correct.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And what percent, how do you attribute such a, that seems to be larger than most... How do you, how do you, to what do you attribute getting that, that large number?

CHERYL HOWARD: I think what happens is we target underrepresented groups. We, that's where we're looking. We are putting resources into, into targeting that group. We have a good reputation. We're considered one of the top five schools by, on being a black lawyer for minority students. We have a large percentage of minority faculty that didn't happen in my school and... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What percent would you say is minority faculty, so-called minority faculty?

CHERYL HOWARD: 42 percent...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Now as we talk about these underrepresented groups the titles are interesting in the reports that have to be sent to the FEDS it includes black or African American, Hispanic or Latino, Asian or National Hawaiian other Pacific, American Indian, and then there's also a category included white Italians.

CHERYL HOWARD: Mm-hmm.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So are you including that group with your 49 percent because...

CHERYL HOWARD: No.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay so is it that only, I believe we have a figure of nine percent of students who are black at the Law School. Is that accurate?

CHERYL HOWARD: No I do not believe that it is. I don't have that broken down but I would be very surprised if that were true. Is this for the 13 we have... Okay, thank you. We had 13.5 percent Asian Pacific Islander, it says 8.7 percent black, 16.1 percent Hispanic, 61.7 percent white.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So you're then surprised that it's...

CHERYL HOWARD: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...only nine percent black.

CHERYL HOWARD: Yes I am because they are everywhere. They are on moot court, they are on law review...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: But now that you know that it's only nine percent black and, and

that surprises you what and we expect that would happen to increase that number?

CHERYL HOWARD: Well what it, is happening to increase that number, more recruitment in the CUNY population farther down, drilling down the pipeline because what you find is that when you look at like the focus of the Black Male Initiative is on black males. When you look at the available population to take an LSAT the numbers are miniscule. And what I mean by available is able to go to law school full time, able to deal with the expense of the LSAT, whose getting through undergraduate school. We're already talking about the group being selected out before they ever get to the admissions pool. This is not our admissions pool policy. Last year I had three black males stolen out from under me by other law schools after I got their indicators up on the LSAT...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So you did all the work, you did the grunt work... [cross-talk]

CHERYL HOWARD: And then they go...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...and somebody else came...

CHERYL HOWARD: ...full scholarship, boom.

There you go because they're so desperate to pick the very few people who are available that they're more than willing, the private schools are more than willing to poach the people that have come through my program. This is why we're starting to do things in the undergraduate program. And this is why we have a high school program as well. Unless we create a cohort that's ready to go to law school there's not going to be the numbers. A lot of this work needs to be done before hand, before you try to push them into a, an, a uh level of law school.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You talked about the, the work that you do to get students to be able to qualify for law school and how they're offered scholarships by the other schools that have the ability and have the supports and the finances to do that. Generally speaking as law schools look for applicants that they will invite to come to their schools they're looking for a certain LSAT score, they're looking for a certain grade point perhaps, what other criteria are they looking for. They're looking for students who have completed school within a certain time frame because we know

of many times students have other responsibilities and obligations and they don't finish in four or five but it may take six or seven. Is that a detriment or is that a, a drawback?

CHERYL HOWARD: Not for Pipeline.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: No, no for students in, in the law, law schools.

CHERYL HOWARD: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: they want students in a finish, in a timely four or five...

CHERYL HOWARD: They want people who because the predictors of success in law school...
[cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...they consider that a predictor, one of the, the time how long it took you to finish.

CHERYL HOWARD: And that's another reason that we are one of the few schools in the nation through the hard work of our academic dean we have now have a part time program because that's the other way we lose minority students. They're perfectly qualified to come in but when they get to the door they have other obligations. They really can't afford to just be in law school for three

years. They need to support their families. They have other obligations and we are hoping with the start of our part time program in the fall of 2015 that we'll be able to attract an either, even wider population of students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. I'm going to ask Council Member Laurie Cumbo if she would like to ask questions.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Madam Chair. Good afternoon. Thank you for your testimony today. Wanted to ask in general during the time when throughout CUNY many different black studies departments in those sorts of programs came on the scene in CUNY in a very big way. Were these and, and also very famous professors from Doctor Leonard Jeffries and on became at the forefront of, of our CUNY institutions as well as many others wanted to know at those times were those statistics that Chair Barron brought up in terms of the percentages, have we regressed or have we moved forward? Because I'm wondering if like in the 19, 1970s and, and so on and so forth were there opportunities where there were more professors, more students of color than in the past?

CHERYL HOWARD: I don't have that data.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.

CHERYL HOWARD: I could get it for you
but I really don't have it.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm. Because
it, it is, I believe there is a correlation in
terms of the, the status, in terms of understanding
like many students would be very excited to attend
a university if they knew that someone like a
Doctor Leonard Jeffries was going to be teaching
there and that was their interest and wanting to
know like how do we recruit the types of professors
that young people would be attracted to in terms of
studying with that they would know or have a
reputation that, that would attract their interest?

CHERYL HOWARD: Well we, we actually are
the second most diverse law school in the country.
So vis-à-vis our peers...

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.

CHERYL HOWARD: ...we're knocking it out
of the park.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.

CHERYL HOWARD: But I think I go back to
again you have to understand how small a percentage

of the entire bar minorities people are. So we have 11 percent. You have a really small percent that go into academia. So vis-à-vis that number we're doing very well at having 42 percent professors, not just adjuncts, not... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.

CHERYL HOWARD: ...lecturers but professors who are minority. And they are leaders in the, in the academic community. In fact last weekend we just had the minority professors conference here at the law school.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Hmm, mm-hmm. Now let me ask you as well with the student representation have there been, has there ever been any concerted effort in terms of focusing on K through 12 education? Have you seen any dynamic where in the K through 12 grades young people are beginning the, to understand that they're going to be tracked for higher education for academia as you would say, law school, those sorts of things? Have you seen any concerted effort or does it generally start to happen only in the undergraduate levels?

CHERYL HOWARD: There are programs I know that are starting now that are not related to

1 law school. You see we're so, we're far up that
2 academic tree.
3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.

5 CHERYL HOWARD: And by the time you get
6 to that part of the tree a lot of things have
7 happened. If anybody said how do you want to
8 improve law school enrollment the first thing I
9 would say is improve elementary school education.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.

11 CHERYL HOWARD: Because we're working
12 with a very small pool by the time we get to
13 admission to law school.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: You know what's
15 always so interesting to me with this is that on so
16 many levels particularly in communities of color
17 and then beyond afterwards that so many of our
18 young people all throughout their academic career,
19 particularly black and brown children are going
20 through an educational system where they're often
21 not seeing teachers, professors, principals, and
22 administration that look just like them right. And
23 so the theory behind that is that you know that
24 they're getting a superior education of some sort
25 because the administration or the staff don't look

1 like them and they're going to be in a better
2 positon. But somehow through all of this, and this
3 has been going on for generations while we're
4 continuously not having educators and professors
5 that look like us we're also still not advancing in
6 terms of the areas where we would like to see. So
7 that way when you're talking about those pools and
8 this, and the, and the selection being so thin we
9 haven't really, we haven't really advanced beyond
10 that in a, in a very significant way.

12 CHERYL HOWARD: Now I have to say that I
13 think people are really looking at that in a really
14 textured way. I participated in a program and I
15 will get you all the information on it where they
16 were targeting middle school students who were
17 being introduced to the law.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.

19 CHERYL HOWARD: And doing trial
20 practice.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.

22 CHERYL HOWARD: These kind of programs
23 are invaluable. You have to create an exposure. I
24 went into law school, nobody was a lawyer in my
25 family. My mom's... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.

CHERYL HOWARD: ...one of 15 kids from a sharecropper family. And my father was from the hills of Kentucky. Nobody was a lawyer. And even after going through college, going into the culture of law which was so different than my own culture it was very difficult. And I did very well. But it was extraordinarily difficult. So there are more and more people recognizing that this kind of exposure at a very young age, this creation of comfort with language, comfort with cultural norms in professions at a very young age is critically important to having a pool of people available by the time they get to law school.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Let me just... and this'll be my final question. Do you find with white children in particular that they are being exposed specifically to law or they're just being exposed in... they're gaining a greater exposure to the world in general or do you find that there's something very different in the exposure level in, because our schools are so segregated, they're so segregated that I'm trying to understand, do you think that, that something is happening in the way

1 of what's being exposed in terms of schools that
2 are predominantly white and what's being exposed in
3 terms of schools that are predominately African
4 American or Latino. Because what, at the end of the
5 day there are, there are, there's a, there's a, an
6 endless of, of subjects or topics or professions
7 that you could be exposed to; the educational, the
8 doctoral, medical, fashion, art, design, all these
9 different things you could be exposed to. So I'm
10 trying to figure like what's, what's missing or, or
11 what's, what's the challenge in that way. Do you
12 think it's more of a family exposure or a family
13 thing that's happening or it's a academic thing
14 that's happening?

16 CHERYL HOWARD: First of all I don't
17 think it's purely racial.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.

19 CHERYL HOWARD: I think it's a class
20 issue.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm-hmm.

22 CHERYL HOWARD: And as class is a
23 tracker of race in the United States then it
24 becomes a problem for people of color. But I do
25 think it's a class issue. Second I think that what

happens is... I think it's very complex but I'll just focus on something we're finding. What we find is the people in our pipe line program, one of the reasons, one of our theories that we're studying is the reasons they don't do well on the LSAT is they don't have the vocabulary. They're busy so they can't read their reading comprehension's not as good because they're stopping to translate the word because they don't have that broad vocabulary...

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Mm.

CHERYL HOWARD: ...that children with more resources have as a natural course. So what we're saying is that people are not being, as well as being undereducated in bad schools they're being under stimulated and exposed to basic things that make access to this level of education possible. I, I wish I was the one who had the answer to that but I'm not. But this is just something, this is a theory we're working on. We're trying to do a sort of long term longitudinal study to look at these factors but we figure that many of our students, very smart, very smart... they fail on these tests because they don't finish them. They don't finish them because more of the vocabulary is unfamiliar

1 to them. So therefore their reading, their reading
2 speed is slower and therefore they don't answer as
3 many questions and they get lower scores. That's
4 not something we can correct in law school. We can
5 try to support people through and I've seen people
6 really rise up from places I didn't think they
7 could. But when we look at what's happening we see
8 that they don't have that basic preparation that
9 makes this possible as far as exposure you have to
10 be very flexible to move through these cultures
11 that are not yours. And some people can't, the
12 stress of it is just hard. Law school's very
13 stressful. The third thing is they're fragile in
14 that they have a lot of family responsibilities.
15 They're fine as long as everybody is fine. But
16 usually the ones who go to law school, they're the
17 most responsible kid in the family. So if mom gets
18 sick or dad loses a job or your sister goes to jail
19 and you have to take care of her seven year old you
20 can't do that and law school too.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

23 CHERYL HOWARD: You're welcome.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. We've
25 also been joined by Council Member Vanessa Gibson.

Did you have any questions that you wanted to ask?

Okay. Just finally the we thank you for your, for coming to give your testimony and in terms of the packet that you had we've got financial aid CUNY School of Law annual tuition 14 thousand dollars for New York state resident. And then you have information about scholarships and fellowships as well.

CHERYL HOWARD: Mm-hmm.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How many students, or what percentage of students are able to qualify for support and to get tuitions or get, I mean to get... [cross-talk] scholarships...

CHERYL HOWARD: I can get you that definitively but almost all our students are financial aid of some sort.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: In some degree, some percentage... [cross-talk]

CHERYL HOWARD: Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So when they graduate they've got an awesome burden, awesome debt that's due... [cross-talk]

CHERYL HOWARD: CUNY...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...loans and...

CHERYL HOWARD: CUNY is one of the most cost effective law schools to go to. Our next competitors charge 25 to 30 thousand a year and law school can be up to 62 thousand a year.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Okay no further questions? We thank you for coming. Thank you... [cross-talk]

CHERYL HOWARD: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...for your testimony. We'll call our next presenter, Mr. Moran [sp?] if you would come forward please. Thank you. Raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee and to answer questions truthfully? Thank you. If you would give us your name and do your testimony.

TONY MORAN: Hi, my name is Tony Moran and I apologize for all these typos on this testimony. I just drafted it on my way out here. Speaking as a student, a grad student. Good afternoon. My name is Tony Moran. I'm a graduate student currently enrolled at the Murphy Institute for Labor Studies Program and I greatly appreciate this opportunity to speak out today on what I

consider to be two of the most important issues regarding adult graduate students today which is increasing tuition cost and student debt. After finishing my undergrad studies at York College I had no choice but to pause my graduate endeavors and focus on lowering my student loan debt. As a New York City... and proud union member which is SIU 32-BJ... specify that I have been able to manage my debt and pursue my academic dreams of completing a master's program with the strong support of my loving wife. The pressure of simultaneously repaying a student loan debt while trying to cover increasing graduate tuition does take its toll as a parent, a husband, and a worker. As a parent of two college students it has not been easy in, living in a city where income and equality affordable housing and rising cost of living in this city which has skyrocketed to unimaginable proportions I come today to speak on behalf of my Latino brothers and sisters who might feel defeated and hopeless in these, these times where they have to choose in, they have to choose between education or economic stability. As a Bushwick Brooklynite from Puerto Rican decent I can't avoid but notice how the

Latino contribution within the labor movement in New York City is almost non-existent. I often wonder and question where the champions and heroes that have gone far beyond to make change in this city possible. Other than the late Great Cesar Charrious [sic] where are the stories of the Puerto Rican farm workers and social radicals... who were able to change the narrative when it comes to undeserved, underserved communities? Where are the stories of the immigrants of today and yesteryears who will continue to fight for economic equality, citizenship, and the families? If the working adults have given up on furthering their education then we'll have no one to publish, teach, or lecture our contributions. Where are the text books and publishings, academic journals, professors, and university presidents which supposed to reflect the diverse Latino community in this city? If we continue to make education inaccessible we, the Latino working class, have relinquished the pen that would have written out history for the next generation to read. I might have missed the glory days of free education once offered at CUNY but nothing will deter me from pushing forward and

demand tuition reform along with establishing labor union funding partnerships to help level out the playing field where all students, especially those within the labor ranks, my rank... brothers and sisters to have an equal chance to pursue their dreams. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you for your testimony. You said you graduated from York?

TONY MORAN: Yes I graduated... marketing at York. That was in 2010.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What was your degree?

TONY MORAN: Marketing.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Marketing, okay. And have you been able to pursue the graduate studies that you want to?

TONY MORAN: Yes after, like I said I have two, two kids in college. I have been able... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Congratulations.

TONY MORAN: ...to continue... Thank you. In 2013 I decided to pursue my Master's in Labor, Labor Relations Field which is at the Murphy Institute which is a great program at CUNY. And

1 I've been trying to organize my coworkers as well
2 to participate in this program but must, much of
3 the issues they have is a financial one. And we try
4 to devise with, between ourselves and the unions to
5 see if we could have some kind of partnership where
6 our unions could actually help and assist in these
7 programs, make these programs unique and, as far as
8 funding or scholarships. Usually we get
9 scholarships towards the end of the loan process as
10 far as qualifying for these scholarships so it
11 already limits the amount of people who actually
12 participate in these programs. But that's what I'm
13 there for, to help and support and hopefully we can
14 move this program which is a great program at
15 Murphy Institute. And, and... speaking about the Law
16 School which is something that I aspire to do as
17 well so I'm trying to undergo my master's program
18 while I prep for the LSAT and it's costly.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Mm-hmm.

20 TONY MORAN: And it takes great, takes
21 strength to go through all these economic
22 loopholes.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Mm-hmm. So does the
24 union have a program in place where they do offer
25

TONY MORAN: There are a few programs available to my knowledge. As far as the unions go even though they have... trade schools... [cross-talk]

TONY MORAN: ...32 BJ have their own part... fund with a real estate advisory board. They have great schools as far as a handy man that kind of work but when it comes to graduate level schools you don't hear those conversations within the membership ranks. And this is something that worries me because you know I'm student at labor study, I'm a student at Murphy and I rarely hear our... as far as speaking of myself as far as Puerto Rican or Latino contributions within the labor movement. And if we're not there to actually continue and, and pursue or even get into those levels of academia where we could... lecture... speak on the... on these issues then... Council Member mentioned before there's nobody that looks, that

looks like me teaching these courses and we need to make that change and that's kind of where I'm at now as a student and also as an organizer.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And that's so true. We have to be able to tell our own story because there's a saying that if the wolf tells a story, if the chicken, if the chicken and the wolf are telling the same story they come out with very different results. So we need to be able to tell our own stories from our own perspective. Do any of my colleagues have any questions? Alright. And I just want to say that I did have the benefit of going to CUNY because of the fact that it was no tuition. So I appreciate the, the efforts that you're making in terms of tuition reform and getting that assistance. And that's one of my objectives, to make sure that we can lower and remove tuition at CUNY so that it will once again be free. If we could do it during the depression I think during these improving economic times we can find a way to make that happen as well.

TONY MORAN: I hope so and that's, takes... champion the cause and that's what I'm going to do.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

TONY MORAN: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you so much
for your testimony.

TONY MORAN: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: There being no
further persons wishing to testify we will close
this hearing. Thank you very much.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 19, 2014