CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

----- X

October 7, 2014 Start: 10:27 a.m. Recess: 10:53 a.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E:

JULISSA FERRERAS Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Ydanis A. Rodriguez James G. Van Bramer Vanessa L. Gibson Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.

Laurie A. Cumbo
Corey D. Johnson
I. Daneek Miller
Helen K. Rosenthal
Vincent M. Ignizio
Ritchie J. Torres

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)
Blaise Backer
Deputy Commissioner
Neighborhood Development
Department of Small Business Services

James Mettham
Assistant Commissioner
Neighborhood Development
Department of Small Business Services

Patrick Cammack Director Business Improvement District Development Department of Small Business Services

Wilma Alonso
Executive Director
Fordham Road BID

David Rose Chairperson Fordham Road BID President, Automotive Realty Corp.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

[gavel]

2.2

[background comments]

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Good morning. I'd like to first acknowledge Chair Cumbo and Chair Gibson; today is DV Awareness day and we are wearing any shades of purple, so thank you to the colleagues also; this is something that's very important to both chairs and to all of us as council members, so DV Awareness Month is something very important to all of us.

Welcome to today's Finance Committee
hearing; I'm Council Member Julissa Ferreras and I
chair the Finance Committee. There are four items on
our agenda today; a transparency resolution, two land
use items and a BID item.

The transparency resolution sets forth
new changes in the designation of certain
organizations receiving local aging and youth
discretionary funding as well as new changes in the
designation of certain organizations receiving
funding pursuant to initiatives in the budget. The
transparency resolution is needed as a cleanup
resolution to make technical corrections to prior
designations, but has also set forth new designations

for three council initiatives the New York City
Youth Build Project initiative, the Food Pantry
initiative and the Adult Literacy initiative.
Organizations appearing in the resolutions that have
not yet completed the prequalification process
conducted by the Mayor's Office of Contract Services,
the Council or any other entity are identified in the
attached charts with an asterisk. As with all
transparency resolutions, council members will have
to sign a disclosure form indicating whether or not a
conflict exists with any of the groups on the
attached list. If any council member has a potential
conflict of interest with any of the organizations
listed, he or she has the opportunity to disclose the
conflict at the time of their vote. As a reminder,
please disclose any conflicts you may have with
proposed subcontractors that are used by
organizations sponsored by discretionary funding.
These disclosures must be made excuse me these
disclosures must be made before the subcontractor can
be approved; Jeremy Plofker from the General
Counsel's Office can assist you with any questions or
concerns regarding disclosures

Next are the rand use Items; the IIIst Is
the Alberta Alston House, sponsored by the
Presbyterian HDFC in my district in Queens. This
property provides 150 units of affordable housing for
low-income seniors. Last June the Council granted
the property a full 40-year property tax exemption,
but the resolution omitted one tax lot and one
demapped panel. This resolution will correct the
omission and include all of the project's tax lots.
I'm very proud to support this project; the Alberta
Alston House has been serving low-income seniors
since 1984; the property is geared towards seniors
who live independently and provides its residents
with numerous opportunities to engage in new
activities, attend health and cultural events and
interact with a variety of people. I want to welcome
the Executive Director of the Presbyterian Senior
Services, Rimas Jasin, who's in the back thank you
for joining us who is here today and thank him for
all the important work.

The second land use item is renewal of

HDFC, which is a 7-building, 129-unit project

spanning Council Member Cabrera's and Council Member

Torres' district in The Bronx. Through a prior

2.2

resolution passed last year, the Council granted the property a full 40-year property tax exemption; however, there was a typographical error related to the block and lot numbers receiving the exemption, so this resolution corrects the error. The council members have been notified of this technical amendment and representatives from HPD are here to answer any questions you may have on the land use item.

item, Int 0480, which relates to the Fordham Road business improvement district in Council Member Torres' district. On September 23rd this Committee voted on Res 0415 to set today as the hearing date to hear from individuals who may be affected by the proposed changes of the Fordham Road BID. The Fordham Road BID was established in 2005 and generally covers the regional commercial centers of The West Bronx. The BID includes the third busiest retail corridor in New York City and serves over 80,000 visitors a day. It includes over 300 businesses which have total annual sale revenues of over \$500 million. The retailers in the BID are both small, independent merchants as well as large and

2.2

national and regional chain stores. At this time the BID is seeking Council approval for three things: 1. to expand its boundaries to include two additional tax lots, including 1 Fordham Plaza, a 14-story office building with numerous retail establishments on the ground floor and Fordham Plaza; a public plaza that also serves as a major transportation hub; also, to increase its annual expenditure for \$625,000 to \$670,000 a year and to amend the district plan to include a cap on all assessments so that the maximum annual assessment to be paid by any individual property will not exceed \$45,000.

First we will hear from any witnesses who wish to testify; once we've heard from any testimony we will then adjourn the hearing at least 30 days to allow any property owners within the existing BID or proposed extension to file an objection to the extension of the BID with the City Clerk. In the absence of objections filed either by the majority of all impacted property owners or by property owners owning a majority of the assessed value of the property within proposed extended BID, the Committee and the Full Council may adopt the legislation extending the Fordham Road BID. In order to do so,

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

2.2

23

24

25

the Committee and the Full Council must be prepared to answer the following four questions in the affirmative: Were all the notices of hearings for all hearings required to be held published and mailed as required by the law and otherwise sufficient; does all the real property within the extended district boundaries benefit from the extension of the district except as otherwise provided by the law; is all the real property benefited by the extension of the district included within proposed extensions, and is the extension of the district in the best interest of the public? If the Committee and the Full Council find in the affirmative of these four questions and the number of objections required to prevent the extension of the BID are not filed, then legislation can be adopted. In addition, the Committee and the Full Council must determine if it is in the public interest to authorize an increase in the maximum annual expenditure amount, that the relevant tax and debt limits will not be extended and that notice of the increased proposed expenditure amount was properly published.

Council Member Torres supports the proposed extension and other changes to the BID. For

further details on the management and district

3 profile of the Fordham Road BID and a description of

4 | the services that are and will be provided and the

5 information regarding the properties located within

6 the BID and the proposed extension, please refer to

7 | the Committee Report and the attached City Planning

8 Commission Report and the BID proposed extended

9 district plan.

1

2

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

Those are the four items for today; I will first open the floor to questions on the transparency resolution and then the land use items and then we will hear from the Department of Small Business Services and anyone else who wishes to speak on the Fordham Road BID. We've been joined by Council Members Ignizio, Johnson, Cumbo, Van Bramer, Rosenthal, Gibson, Rodriguez, and Torres. [background comment] Does anybody have any questions on the transparency resolution? Are there any questions or concerns on the land use? [background comments] And now we'll have Torres say a few words on his BID and then we'll also at this time call SBS to come forward and testify. And I did all of that with no glasses.

[laughter, background comments]

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Thank you.

[background comments] I'll just say a few brief words. I am strongly supportive of the Fordham BID expansion; it is the largest BID in The Bronx and one of the largest in the City, so what is good for Fordham will be good for The Bronx as a whole. think the word that would describe the BID expansion is logical. It's going to be expanded to include Fordham Plaza, which is undergoing a federally-funded reconstruction and 1 Fordham Plaza, which is a 14story commercial building that has large retail tenants like T.J. Maxx and Applebee's and so you know, I wish this would've been the original cashvenary [sic] of the BID and I see this as a culminating moment in the revitalization of Fordham Road and I'm strongly supportive.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you Council

Member. SBS. And due to our reform in policies,

we're gonna swear you in. [background comment]

FEMALE VOICE: Do you affirm that your

testimony will be truthful to the best of your

BLAISE BACKER: I do. Good morning,
Chair Ferreras and members of the Finance Committee;

knowledge, information and belief?

2.1

2.2

2	I am Blaise Backer, Deputy Commissioner of
3	Neighborhood Development at the Department of Small
4	Business Services. I am joined today by my Assistant
5	Commissioner, James Mettham and Director for BID

6 Development, Patrick Cammack.

SBS supports the expansion and amendments of the district plan of the Fordham Road Business Improvement District in the Borough of The Bronx.

The Fordham Road BID has successfully completed the planning and outreach work consistent with SBS program rules. In addition, SBS has reviewed the boundaries of the proposed expansion and found them to be acceptable.

Geographically, the existing BID includes properties generally bounded by East 192nd Street to the north, Jerome Avenue to the west, East 198th Street to the south and Webster Avenue to the east. The proposed expansion would extend the district to include properties bounded by East Fordham Road to the north, Washington Avenue to the east, East 189th Street to the south and Park Avenue to the west. The expansion would integrate two significant assets, including 1 Fordham Plaza, a 14-story office building opened in 1986 with over 25 nonprofit, government and

Ŭ

2.2

for-profit tenants and Fordham Plaza, which is being renovated by the City and the BID expects to enter into a maintenance agreement with Department of Transportation.

The proposed expansion area is within

City Council District 15, which is represented by

Council Member Ritchie Torres; the existing BID is

located in Bronx Community Boards 5, 6 and 7 and the

expansion area is represented by Community Board 6.

All three community boards support the proposed

expansion and the district plan amendments. The

Fordham Road BID will extend the same security,

sanitation and promotion services that are provided

in the existing BID to the expanded area.

SBS worked with the BID on developing the proposed increase to the annual assessment of the district from \$625,000 to \$670,000, extended boundaries and to change the method of assessment to include a maximum assessment for each individual property of \$45,000.

As required by law, the Fordham Road BID mailed the summary of the City Council resolution no less than 10 days and no more than 30 days before today's hearing to the following parties: to each

Z 4

owner of real property within the proposed district at the address shown in the latest city assessment roll to such other persons as are registered with the City to receive tax bills concerning real property within the district and to tenants of each building within the proposed district.

In addition, SBS arranged for the publication of a copy of the summary of the resolution at least once in the City Record and the BID published in a newspaper having general circulation in the district and notice stating the time and place of the public hearing and stating the increase in the amount to be expanded annually in the district.

I would also like to acknowledge that members of the BID staff and board of directors are present today to testify and answer any questions about the specifics of the BID plan. At this time we're happy to take any questions.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Members; any questions? No, you did an excellent job. Thank you.

BLAISE BACKER: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Now we will have the BID Executive Director and the BID Chairperson

3

Ŭ

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

1213

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

come to testify. Welcome. Also, while they settle in, I know that we had had conversations about having a briefing on BIDs; we still have that in the pipeline and it's gonna be scheduled as soon as possible. You may begin.

WILMA ALONSO: No... sorry. [background comments | Good morning to all. The Fordham Road BID was established in 2005; since then, through the core services of Sanitation, marking, promotions and capital improvement projects, the Fordham Road commercial corridor has been transformed into a robust, fast-growing economic engine, the largest and prime shopping destination of the world, with over 300 stores. The BID promotes Fordham Road's unique character and its accessibility as a major attraction. Our overall marketing campaign includes a wide range of programs and events, discount programs, sidewalk sales, seasonal events, and our holiday promotions, all of which have definitely helped to increase sales and attract shoppers to experience Fordham Road.

In 2012 the Fordham Road BID seized the opportunity to offer its core services and increase commercial vibrancy to the eastern portion of Fordham

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

Road by expanding its boundaries to include East
Fordham Road from 3rd Avenue to Washington Avenue,
Washington Avenue from East Fordham Road to 189th
Street and 189th Street from Washington Avenue to
Park Avenue. By doing so, a major commercial office
and retail anchor of 1 Fordham Plaza and the Center
Public Plaza of Fordham Plaza will be added into the
BID.

The BID conducted extensive community outreach for this expansion by hosting numerous public meetings, presentations with area stakeholders, seeking their support and input. Through these efforts we achieved full support from 1 Fordham Plaza LLC, Bronx Community Boards 5, 6 and 7, Applebee's, Apple-Metro, St. Barnabas Hospital, Union Health Community Center, the Four Bronx Institutions Alliance, Bronx Zoo, Botanical Garden, Montefiore Hospital and Fordham University, to mention a few.

We strongly believe that local businesses, residents and visitors will benefit for the addition of these properties into the Fordham Road BID boundaries. Our strong commitment and innovative approach is a major part of our role in

25

the community. I would like to ask all of you to

2.2

vote in favor of the Fordham Road BID expansion.
Thank you very much.

[background comments]

DAVID ROSE: Good morning. My name is

David Rose; I'm the Chairperson of the Fordham BID

and the President of Automotive Realty Corp., a

member of the BID. Thank you for the opportunity to

testify in connection with the expansion of the BID

to include the proposed boundaries. At this time I

would like to register the endorsement and support of

Automotive Realty Corp. for the expansion as

described earlier.

In 2004 I testified in front of the City

Council Finance Committee in favor of the creation of
the BID; I am thankful for its creation and the
positive impact it has had on the commercial corridor
known as Fordham Road.

I have been doing business on Fordham

Road since 1999 and my family since 1948. I can see on a daily basis the tremendous impact the Fordham Road BID has had on the district. Our streets and buildings are cleaner, our merchants feel a greater sense of safety and pride and business is improving and expanding. The vision of making Fordham Road,

2.2

the outdoor mall, a cleaner, safer, brighter and more desirable place to shop continues. Business participation has been consistently rising, with many stores joining the vast array of BID marketing programs and events. Automotive Realty Corp. owns two properties in the existing boundaries, 327 East Fordham Road and 2490 to 2500 Webster Avenue. The second property is adjacent to the open space known as Fordham Plaza, which up until now has been an eyesore and a detriment to our property and soon to be another major enhancement to the district. This property will greatly benefit by the completed park which will substantially enhance the area.

As property owner and BID chairperson, I strong support the expansion, as it will include two properties that were in the original boundaries of the BID during the first days of its design and which are largely part of the BID. It will improve the surrounding area and further strengthen the district by adding the businesses in the expansion area to our programs. The businesses in 1 Fordham Plaza have been asking to participate in our programs for quite some time now.

2.2

So in conclusion, I believe that the expansion, if approved, will build on the strength of the Fordham Road retail, keep it a desirable place to shop and attract new shoppers and their families. thank you again for the honor and opportunity to speak today and ask for the unanimous approval of the City Council Finance Committee on the proposed expansion of the Fordham Road Business Improvement District.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very much for your testimony. As procedure, we will have a follow-up hearing and then we'll vote on this BID, so now we have to let it sit for 30 days. Thank you. Council Member Torres; anything else you would like to add?

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Sure. Who's your favorite council member? [laughter] So I'm actually supportive of the BID despite the high rent that my landlord, David Rose charges for my office, so I will... it's fine. [sic]

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you Council Member Torres; Council Member Cumbo.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I just wanted to ask one question. I'm from Brooklyn, so I don't make

my way to The Bronx as frequently as I would like to,
but I have frequented lately in my new role. I guess
my question is, just looking at all of the stores
that are listed here, from Best Buy to Walgreens and
Marshall's and so on and so forth, is there in that
particular area; are there or is there an
encouragement to local Bronx business stores as well
that are locally homegrown that have an opportunity
to grow and develop and flourish there? Although
this is like outside the scope of what you're
proposing today, but has there been a lot of
consideration given to trying to preserve or create
or promote or support or establish or to give a
pipeline for local businesses that are coming from
the community specifically and coming from the
community specifically not through an avenue of
existing franchises, but through their own
businesses?

WILMA ALONSO: Our membership is very diverse; we have from big chain stores to small mom and pop stores; we have stores that have been there for 45, 75 years and they are very small, they are family-owned. So I think that they are the ones that receive the benefit because they don't have marketing

dollars, they don't have any kind of like sense of what to do, what kind of like involvement; sometimes they don't even have an email. So I think that the core of our members, even though we list a lot of like national chain stores, we have a lot of family-owned businesses and I think they receive most the benefit of our services.

because like in Brooklyn, we have a major
thoroughfare as well, on Fulton Street and I went to
two of the businesses last night, just
coincidentally, and both of them are slated to be
closed, two local businesses that had been there for
quite some time. Are you finding that a lot of the
local businesses, as a lot of the chain stores locate
to The Bronx and set up, is the same trend happening
where a lot of these local mom and pop stores are
being bought out or closed or can't make ends meet in
the transition that The Bronx is going through?

WILMA ALONSO: That has not been the case in our district; most of the national chain stores have been in properties that have large spaces; the mom and pops have been there for a long time and they own small stores, but they receive the benefit and

2.2

they grow; sometimes they move from one building to the other and they get a bigger space, but definitely the receive a lot of help from us, you know.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And I apologize for taking up so much time on this, but I'm new to the world of BIDs in some ways, but are there any provisions or steps put into place to see that a BID also has mechanisms to place to support the smaller existing mom and pops and so on and so forth that have been there?

WILMA ALONSO: Do you wanna say something?

DAVID ROSE: So yes, the BID has a lot of programs that we've introduced over the last few years that work with these mom and pop stores to bring them some of the things that they lack the chain stores have; you know, from bringing them documents on rules and procedures, things from Consumer Affairs, like programs that are designed to give them the things that they lack. Automotive Realty Corp. has about 35 commercial tenants on Fordham Road, both in and out of the boundaries; of those 35, 31 or 32 of them are actually mom and pop stores, so I don't see, from my experience as a

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

2 landlord, I don't see displacement of mom and pop stores; I haven't actually removed any mom and pop 3 stores in favor of a chain and I think that Fordham Road was built on mom and pop stores and we have a 6 healthy mix of mom and pop stores as well as chains 7 and one of the things that we're doing is to see why people leave the district to shop and try to fill 8 those gaps and I think one of the things that's 9 important is that we offer both, the mom and pop 10 11 experience and some of the chains, so.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, Council Member Cumbo; thank you for your testimony. I think all your questions were very valid and they're gonna be part of that training that we're trying to do for members only so that we're able to have a very intimate conversation with SBS. But in many cases, a lot of the small businesses also sit on the boards, so before decisions are made, they have a voice on the boards of a lot of these BIDs, but you know; these are all the intricacies that we'll hopefully be informed by SBS on. Thank you very much for your testimony. We've been joined by Council Member Cornegy.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo.

24

1	COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 24
2	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.
3	COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.
5	COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of 7 in the
6	affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions,
7	all items have been adopted; members please sign the
8	committee reports. Thank you.
9	CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: We will leave the
10	roll open for 10 minutes. [background comment] Oh,
11	okay. Oh, here comes Vinny. [background comment]
12	COMMITTEE CLERK: Ignizio.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes.
14	[pause]
15	COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.
17	COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Miller.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.
19	COMMITTEE CLERK: Vote now stands at 10
20	in the affirmative.
21	CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Council Member
22	Levine's staff, if you're in the room, have him come
23	in the next 15 minutes; we'll keep the roll open.
24	Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2	COMMITTEE CLERK: Final vote in Committee
3	on Finance is now 10 in the affirmative, 0 in the
4	negative and no abstentions.
5	[background comments]

${\tt C} \ {\tt E} \ {\tt R} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt F} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt C} \ {\tt A} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt E}$

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 9, 2014