

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

September 23, 2014

Start: 01:46 p.m.

Recess: 03:25 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
Speaker

LETITIA JAMES
Public Advocate

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- ALAN N. MAISEL
- ANDREW COHEN
- ANDY L. KING
- ANNABEL PALMA
- ANTONIO REYNOSO
- BEN KALLOS
- BRAD S. LANDER
- CARLOS MENCHACA
- CHAIM M. DEUTSCH
- COREY D. JOHNSON
- COSTA G. CONSTANTINIDES
- DANIEL DROMM
- DANIEL R. GARODNICK
- DARLENE MEALY

COUNCIL MEMBERS (CONTINUED):

DAVID G. GREENFIELD
DEBORAH L. ROSE
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS
ELIZABETH S. CROWLEY
ERIC A. ULRICH
FERNANDO CABRERA
HELEN K. ROSENTHAL
I. DANEEK MILLER
INEZ D. BARRON
INEZ E. DICKENS
JAMES G. VAN BRAMER
JAMES VACCA
JULISSA FERRERAS
JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS
KAREN KOSLOWITZ
LAURIE A. CUMBO
MARGARET S. CHIN
MARIA DEL CARMEN ARROYO
MARK LEVINE
MARK S. WEPRIN
MARK TREYGER
MATHIEU EUGENE
PAUL A. VALLONE
PETER A. KOO
RAFAEL L. ESPINAL, JR.
RITCHIE J. TORRES
ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.
RORY I. LANCMAN
ROSIE MENDEZ
RUBEN WILLS
STEPHEN T. LEVIN
STEVEN MATTEO
VANESSA L. GIBSON
VINCENT IGNIZIO
VINCENT J. GENTILE
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

[gavel]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay I think we're going to start our ceremonials. We have three today. Get some quiet. First one is our college Costa Constantinides on the 40th anniversary of the center for Byzantine and Greek Studies at Queens College. And we have with us the new Queens college president. It's great to see you Felix and our former president of Hostos Community College. It's great to see him. So with that I'll hand over the mic to Costa to do the presentation.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: So we're here today to celebrate an illustrious accomplishment. The Center for Byzantine and Modern Greek Studies at Queens College is celebrating its 40th year of academic success as a program. Harry Psomiades the, was a director of this center and founding this, founded it in 1974 until his passing in 2003. Today we are joined by the Consul General of Greece Mr. Georgios Iliopoulos.

[applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you Mr. Consul General for being here. Current President of Queens College Mr. Felix Matos

1 Rodriguez, our current director Christos Ioannides.
2 I'm a Greek who, who's, I'm, I'm, I'm, I'm really
3 butchering names, my apologies, little nervous. We
4 have Assistant Director, longtime advocate for the
5 center Effie Lekas. Thank you Effie for being here.
6 And all the Board Directors John Moustakas [sp?],
7 Markos Marinakis [sp?] Orestes Veriotis [sp?],
8 Costos Vonjatos [phonetic], Leandros Papayiannis
9 Papifanioso [phonetic], I'm pronouncing it wrong,
10 and Andrew Yiannakos [sp?]. One of the primary
11 objectives of the center is promote and preserve
12 the Greek identity, history, and culture through
13 education and research. The center is located in
14 the middle of the largest Greek community in the
15 United States. The center is the only academic
16 program outside of Greece that allows its scholars
17 to obtain a BA in Byzantine and Modern Greek
18 studies. The academic program is the largest Greek
19 studies program in the United States. Over 16
20 thousand students have gone through its doors and
21 they have been provided with a link to the past by
22 providing these students a working framework, the
23 understanding of the future of Hellenism and the
24 Greek identity in the world. The center also
25

1 provides scholarship and emergency financial aid..
2 the students as well. The center publishes a
3 popular journal and has a 6,000 volume specialized
4 library... the center for decades, for four decades
5 it succeeded in its mission to preserve the Greek
6 tradition, history, and culture. The ideals of
7 Hellenism and Greek democracy have impacted the
8 world for thousands of years. And the center at
9 Queens College teach the students to pass on these
10 values to future generations. I am proud to honor
11 this center for its great academic work and as the
12 first Greek-Cypriot elected to the City Council it
13 brings me great pride to, for this center to be
14 acknowledged here in the people's house today. If
15 the clerk could read the, the proclamation.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Council City of
18 New York proclamation. Whereas the council of the
19 city of New York is proud to honor the center for
20 Byzantine and Modern Greek studies at Queens
21 College for their 40 years of dedication to the
22 ideals of Hellenism. And whereas the center for
23 Byzantine and Modern Greek Studies was established
24 at Queens College in 1974. Because of the growing
25 interest of students in the history, institutions,

1
2 and culture of the Greek people from the late
3 Byzantine era through the present day. Harry J.
4 Psomiades was the Director of the center from its
5 founding in 1974 until 2003. Christos Ioannides is
6 the current director and Effie Lekas has been
7 assistant director since 1985. Doctor Felix Matos
8 Rodriguez is the current president and whereas one
9 of the primary objectives of the center is to
10 promote and preserve Greek identity, history, and
11 culture through education and scholarly research.
12 The center offers a unique academic program. It is
13 not seen anywhere else in the, in the united states
14 as it allows students to obtain a bachelor's degree
15 in Byzantine and Modern Greek studies. Over 16
16 thousand students have been impacted by the
17 teachings of the center which has provided these
18 students a vital link to the past while providing
19 these students a working framework for
20 understanding the future role of Hellenism in, and,
21 and Greek identity in the world and whereas
22 importantly the center offers scholarships and
23 emergency financial assistance to students as well.
24 The center publishes a general, has a book
25 publication series, and has a 6,000 volume

1
2 specialized library that Alexander himself would be
3 proud of. And whereas for four decades the center
4 has succeeded in its mission in preserving Greek
5 tradition, history, and culture through education
6 and scholarly research. The ideals of Hellenism and
7 Greek democracy have impacted the world for
8 thousands of years and the center at Queens College
9 teaches its students to pass on these values for
10 future generations. Now therefore be it known that
11 the Council of the City of New York proudly honors
12 the Center for Byzantine and Modern Greek Studies
13 at Queens College for 40 years of outstanding
14 dedication to the ideals of Hellenism. Mellissa
15 Mark-Viverito Speaker for the entire council, Costa
16 Constantinides Council Member 22nd District Queens,
17 Rory I. Lancman Council Member 24th District
18 Queens.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay thank you.
20 And I think we're going to hear a few words from
21 the new president of Queens College. But Counsel I
22 have to say I was in Greece on vacation a couple of
23 years ago. Beautiful country and I do hope to go
24 back very very soon. It's probably one of the most
25 memorable trips for many reasons. It's truly

1
2 historic and it's just architecturally beautiful in
3 all different ways. But Felix nice to see you here
4 and say a few words on behalf of, of Queens
5 College.

6 DOCTOR MATOS RODRIGUEZ: Thank, thank
7 you so much. And thank you my own speaker and thank
8 you to the... of Queens College for this recognition
9 to the members of the City Council. Also we're so
10 proud of the work that we've done for 40 years and,
11 and you have here the people that, well the Board
12 of Directors, their faculty, their staff that have
13 made this center such an important part of the work
14 that we do in, in Queens and the work that we on
15 behalf of the Greek American community here in New
16 York City. We're delighted with 40 years of hard
17 work. We invite you all to our 50th anniversary
18 coming up soon right. And, and I think that after
19 hearing the speaker talk about her experience in
20 Greek we organize a nice cultural tour with... City
21 Council coming up so we can continue promoting
22 Greek culture and Greek American values here in New
23 York. So thank you so much for this recognition.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you very
25 much.

[background comments]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay the next, the next ceremonial is Council Member Eric Ulrich, oh and Council Members Crowley and Koslowitz and Wills but he's, I don't think he's here. Lancman I see, who else, Vallone I see, Van Bramer I see, Dromm, Queens, Koo... whoa you got the whole, all of them here. So Council Member Ulrich is celebrating and recognizing Mary Ann Carey a retiring Queens Community Board 9 District Manager after 30 years of service to Community Board 9. Council Member Ulrich.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you thank you thank you. Mary Ann Carey is coming up to the front. I, I like her family and her, and the Community Board Chair of Community Board 9 Ralph Gonzalez to come up and join her staff, her wonderful staff to join me and my colleagues. Please everyone come up to the front it's fine. We've got plenty of room. I'm not going to speak very long because I had the opportunity to pay tribute to Mary Ann at the last Community Board 9 where the Borough President and probably almost every other elected official that ever represented

1
2 or had a piece of Community Board 9 had a chance to
3 talk about the many many contributions that Mary
4 Ann has given, not only to the communities of Kew
5 Gardens, Ozone Park, of Woodhaven, of Richmond
6 Hill. Am I forgetting any others? Ozone, well we
7 said Ozone Park and we said Kew Gardens but over 35
8 years of service to the community to the residents
9 of Queens County and before we present her with the
10 proclamation I want to introduce Council Woman
11 Karen Koslowitz and then Liz Crowley to say a few
12 words before we present here.

13 KAREN KOSLOWITZ: I just want to say I
14 know Mary Ann Carey for at least 30 25 years when I
15 worked for Council Member Arthur Katzman and she
16 was at that time working for Council Member Walter
17 Ward. And then she went on to be the District
18 Manager of Community Board 9 and I was the council
19 member after Arthur Katzman and had Community Board
20 9. And after that I was in charge of Community
21 Boards when I worked for the Borough President I
22 was Deputy Borough President. So I go back with
23 Mary Ann a very long time. And Mary Ann you have
24 done a wonderful job I hope you enjoy your vacation
25

1
2 for a long time and I could tell you this I'm going
3 to miss you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Good afternoon.
5 It gives me great pleasure to join my colleagues in
6 honoring you Mary Ann Care for all the work that
7 you've done over the years and I, I don't remember
8 going back when you started. I don't have as many
9 members as Karen does but I know as soon as I
10 became a council member we worked on some very good
11 projects together. You know every inch of your
12 community board. You represent the diverse
13 districts better than anyone can and we are so very
14 grateful for you years of service. Thank you very
15 much.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you very
17 much. So before we make the official proclamation
18 and before we have some other presentations I just
19 want to remind all the folks here how important
20 community boards are to the communities they serve.
21 I know that we know that as elected officials but
22 for members of the public, for the interns, for the
23 staff, for the lobbyist, for anyone in this room
24 this is a fine example of what community boards and
25 community service all about local residents

1
2 stepping up to the plate, fighting the powers that
3 be, fighting the good fight on behalf of the people
4 who often don't have a voice in the political
5 process and community boards. As in Mary Ann's case
6 she has outlasted how many mayors? Starting with
7 Mayor Koch Donald Manes was Borough President. Mary
8 Ann started 1983, I was born 1985, I'm just saying.
9 I'm just saying. I'm not trying to draw comparisons
10 but I just want to make that known that she's been
11 in this job a pretty long time. But anyway she in
12 so many ways is a role model for young women. Okay
13 she started on that job at a time when politics was
14 as we all know a good ol' boys club breaking the
15 glass ceiling, achieving a very important position,
16 holding that position for many years doing it
17 better than most others I mean let's be honest
18 though she does a fine fine job and she decided to
19 pack it in and that's why she is surrounded by a
20 wonderful family and all the community board
21 members who in some cases took a day off of work to
22 be here to salute Mary Ann for everything that
23 she's done. So I'm going to let Mary Ann speak.
24 What's that? Oh we're going to read the
25

1
2 proclamation and then we're going to let her say a
3 few words.

4 UNKNOWN FEMALE: Council City of New
5 York proclamation whereas the Council of the City
6 of New York is proud to honor Mary Ann Carey upon
7 her retirement as District Manager of Community
8 Board 9. In recognition of her profound impact
9 throughout our community and our city and whereas
10 born and raised in Ozone Park Mary Ann Carey
11 attended Queens College where she earned a Bachelor
12 of Arts in Urban Studies. She married the late
13 Donald Carey and raised her family in Ozone Park
14 before moving to her current home in Howard Beach.
15 And Whereas Mary Ann was first hired to serve as
16 Assistant District Manager for Queens Community
17 Board 10 and for 10 years where she honed her
18 skills to become the best and hardest working
19 advocate for the community. And whereas in 1983
20 Mary Ann was selected to become the District
21 Manager of Queens Community Board 9. In this role
22 she has overseen the operations of the Community
23 Board and has managed the delivery and
24 accountability of city services to over 142
25 thousand residents. She is a performance driven

1
2 woman who has worked tirelessly to fight for our
3 communities. Mary Ann has served honorably and with
4 dedication in this world for more than 30 years.
5 And whereas Mary Ann has been instrumental in many
6 communities and projects throughout this, the
7 community board including creating and
8 strengthening neighborhood organizations, working
9 to improve and grow our schools, teaming with the
10 NYPD to address and reduce crime, provide funding
11 for many expense and capital projects, and
12 improving the quality of life for all New Yorkers.
13 And whereas Mary Ann is an active member of many
14 organizations in the community including Community
15 Board 27 the Ozone Park Kiwanis Club, Ronald Reagan
16 Republican Club in South Queens Boys and Girls
17 club, the Sons of Italy, and was New York State
18 Committee Woman for the 30th Assembly District. And
19 Whereas Mary Ann is the proud mother of two
20 daughters Ann Marie and Christine, proud
21 grandmother of seven grandchildren; Laura, Megan,
22 Billy, Shawn, Christopher, Justine, and Steven and
23 the proud great grandmother of Helena and Mikaela.
24 And whereas upon her retirement we commend Mary Ann
25 Carey for her stellar service to our community for

1
2 she has truly earned the respect and esteem of all
3 New Yorkers. Now therefore be it known that the
4 Council of the City of New York honors and
5 congratulates Mary Ann Carey for her stellar 10
6 year as district manager of Community Board 9 for
7 her enduring and extraordinary contributions to the
8 community. Melissa Mark-Viverito speaker for the
9 entire Council, Eric A. Ulrich Council Member 32nd
10 District Queens, Karen Koslowitz Council Member
11 29th District Queens, Elizabeth Crowley Council
12 Member 30th District Queens, Ruben Wills Council
13 Member 28th District Queens. And I also want to
14 mention that the mayor, and a letter dated
15 September 9th has also recognized and thanks Mary
16 Ann Carey for her distinguished service and sends
17 his best wishes for a wonderful retirement.

18 [applause]

19 MARY ANN CAREY: I want to thank first
20 of all the City Council, Queens delegation of the
21 City Council, Council Members Eric Ulrich, Karen
22 Koslowitz who goes back a long time with myself,
23 Elizabeth Crowley and Ruben Wills for this honor
24 and anybody I've missed. How can I have served for
25 the city for 35 years, I'm only 39. When I started

1
2 I was four. Some smart-aleck reporter noted that
3 Councilman Eric Ulrich was not even born when I
4 began working for the city. He must have been
5 talking about somebody else, not me, like those of
6 us who remember Jack Benny. I admit to being 39.
7 Seriously I am overwhelmed and honored by being in
8 this place. And here in the City Council the halls
9 where many people have served before me. These are
10 usually reserved for people and individuals such as
11 Council Members, the past former Council Members
12 Walter Ward, Arthur Katzman, Peter Vallone Senior
13 who were the Council Members when I began my tenor
14 at Community Board 9. I never viewed my position as
15 a job. I viewed it as a challenge, a learning
16 experience. I never knew what challenge I would
17 face in the morning or what would happen next. It
18 was never a dull moment and I enjoyed the ride. It
19 was a privilege to serve Community Board 9. I just
20 wish to acknowledge my family and thank them for
21 their continuous support, my daughters Ann Maries
22 Spies [sp?] Christine Guardino [sp?], their
23 children, and many grandchildren as you can see,
24 and great grandchildren, and great grandchildren,
25 and my soul mate and significant other Joseph

1 Allen, my community board, my family, Sam Esposito,
2 Chair Ralph Gonzalez, Marie Churley, and Community
3 Board 10 representing Community Board 10, Rosemary
4 Frazoni [sp?], my friends from Kiwanis Club of
5 Ozone Park, my fellow district managers from Queens
6 Boards one through 14. If I left out anybody I
7 apologize. After 35 years there's a lot of people
8 to mention. A manager is only as good as his or her
9 staff. I have two fantastic employees who are my
10 best friends. Lisa Gomez was with me 21 years who I
11 hope will be the next district manager if the board
12 sees fit. And Irina Barae [phonetic] listen I can't
13 say her name. I, I've worked with her all these
14 years and I still can't say Baraeva. Irina
15 immigrated first from Russia and then to Israel and
16 then to the United States. Her family has achieved
17 the American dream. Her children graduated from
18 college and she just recently bought a home. I
19 think it was not in Board 9 but I'm not going to
20 say where it was. A, A, and of course we welcome
21 all of us who gave an opportunity to, were given
22 the opportunity to succeed. My family immigrated
23 from Naples Italy in 1880. I am a third generation,
24 an ordinary citizen and nobody here, nobody in here
25

1
2 a citizen, I don't hear what I said, here, I am
3 being honored by the city, a citizen and here I am
4 being honored. I'm nobody and being honored by the
5 City Council in this great city, the best city in
6 the world, a multi-cultural multi-ethnic multi-
7 racial melting pot in a country that affords the
8 opportunity to all to succeed. Thank you all for
9 this honor. God bless the united states of America
10 and may god keep us safe. Thank you.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Well Mary Ann
12 thank you so much for your service. You have, I
13 think this is the strongest show of support for any
14 individual receiving a proclamation so, and having
15 as many council members up here and the words that
16 I've heard speak volumes of your commitment and how
17 beloved and dear you are too many. So thank you for
18 that and it's always a pleasure to be able to
19 welcome people into the people's chamber and be
20 able to recognize their contributions and so you've
21 given so much. Thank you very very much.

22 [applause, background comments]

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright no of
24 course. So congratulations to Mary Ann. One more
25 ceremonial before we start. And I please do ask

1
2 everyone that's in the chamber to maintain silence
3 while we finish these ceremonials. The last
4 ceremonial is by Majority Leader Jimmy Van Bramer.
5 It's already been an emotional day on an issue
6 that's really important. We were just at the pre-
7 stated talking about the legislation that Jimmy
8 will be introducing today and having, having a
9 mother of someone who unfortunately died as a
10 result of an irresponsible driver who fled the
11 scene. I know that he is recognizing the advocates
12 who are fighting each and every day and the family,
13 the advocates for victims of Queens traffic
14 fatalities. Jimmy Van Bramer our Majority Leader
15 has a proclamation for making Queens safer and I
16 will give the mic over to our Majority Leader.

17 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
18 very much Madam Speaker and to all the Queens
19 Members who are here and those who aren't... feel
20 free to join us. We're honoring today those
21 activists who are committed to achieving Vision
22 Zero who have been out on the streets on the
23 boulevards on the avenues, all over the Borough of
24 Queens every time there has been a tragedy, every
25 time there has been a collision, every time there's

1
2 been an injury these courageous women and men have
3 raised their voices and demanded action. And today
4 we thought it so appropriate to have them here
5 because we are passing a very important bill that
6 punishes those who would flee the scene of an
7 accident and I'll mention them all but we're joined
8 right here by an amazing woman, an amazing amazing
9 champion of our city, the mother of Louis Bravo, a
10 19 year old who was killed in Woodside Queens in my
11 district and Marta Puruncajas thank you for being
12 here. Thank you for inspiring all of the men and
13 women you see around us and thank you for your
14 efforts in making sure that no mother or father
15 ever has to experience what Marta has experienced.
16 We are all committed to Vision Zero and these
17 activists remind us every single day that there's
18 more to be done, lives to be saved. They are real
19 heroes, everyday heroes. I know they've been
20 incredibly active in my district but they've also
21 been active in Council Member Dromm's district and
22 so many other districts in Queens. So we honor all
23 of you today and thank you for your courage and for
24 stepping up and making sure that we do what we do
25 because this bill that we're passing today is as a

1
2 result of your efforts, the grassroots pushing up
3 and making sure that government responds. So thank
4 you, we honor you, and we can read the proclamation
5 for Make Queens Safer. Thank you very much.

6 UNKNOWN MALE: Council City of New York
7 Proclamation. Whereas the Queens, the Make Queens
8 Safer was founded in response to the plight of
9 injuries and fatalities which have befallen far too
10 many victims of automobile collisions and reckless
11 driving. By effectively advocating for increased
12 enforcement of traffic laws, encouraging safety
13 minded street design, and deterring the actions of
14 reckless drivers Make Queens Safer is saving lives
15 and protecting all the residents of our city. And
16 Whereas we gratefully honor the members of Make
17 Queens Safer including Maribel Egipciaco, Christina
18 Furlong, Todd Goldman, Liss Coss [phonetic], Shie
19 Palieao [phonetic], Laura Newman, Marta Puruncajas,
20 Hillary Sedowich [phonetic], and Amy Tam for their
21 tireless efforts to make our streets safer. The
22 borough of Queens and the entire city of New York
23 are strengthened by your advocacy whose results
24 allows us all to feel safer walking biking and
25 driving along our sidewalks and streets. And

1
2 whereas the recent deaths of Noshat Nahian age
3 eight, Louis Bravo age 19, Karen Perez age 20,
4 Kumar Ragunath age 64, and Tenzin Drudak age 16
5 which all took place in Council District 26 are
6 tragedies that could have been prevented. The
7 accidents that have stricken these individuals and
8 their loved ones have afflicted similar pain and
9 sadness on far too many people throughout our city.
10 As we move towards the goal of preventing all
11 traffic related tragedies and achieving Vision Zero
12 Make Queens Safer is a practical partner in our
13 endeavor. And whereas Make Queens Safer has
14 achieved many successes while advancing their
15 mission including providing care and support for
16 the families of victims, raising awareness to the
17 issue of pedestrian safety, and advancing important
18 legislation and policy decisions to calm our
19 streets and punish those who disobey our laws. The
20 entire community is emboldened and empowered by the
21 tremendous efforts of Make Queens Safer which is
22 establishing a legacy of safety and
23 conscientiousness from all New Yorkers from which
24 all New Yorkers will benefit. Now therefore be it
25 known that the council of the city of New York

1
2 gratefully honors Make Queens Safer for its
3 tireless advocacy for safer streets and support for
4 victims and their families, Melissa Mark-Viverito
5 Speaker for the entire council, Jimmy Van Bramer
6 Majority Leader Council Member 26th District
7 Queens.

8 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
9 very much and I want to recognize some of the folks
10 who are here in addition to Marta, her sister Anna
11 Puruncajas is with us, Rodrigo Salazar [sp?] is
12 with us, Lora Newman [sp?] Maribel Egipciaco and
13 Christina Furlong [sp?] is with us as well so Laura
14 will speak on behalf of the group. Maribel will do
15 a, a little in Espinal and I just want to thank you
16 all.

17 LAURA NEWMAN: Thank you so much. Thank
18 you honorable City Council Speaker Mark-Viverito
19 and honorable City Council members for
20 acknowledging today the work of our safe streets
21 group Make Queens Safer. We especially thank City
22 Council Majority Leader Jimmy Van Bramer for
23 inviting us here on this day, an important day in
24 the evolution of New York City's realization of
25 Vision Zero. This thanks to the hopeful passage of

1
2 the Justice for Hit and Run Victims bill, a strong
3 piece of legislation that Majority Leader Van
4 Bramer introduced in the surface of traffic
5 enforcement. We extend our gratitude to our local
6 Queens Council Members who have listened to,
7 supported, and collaborated with us from our
8 inception as an ardent but fledgling group of
9 neighbors intent upon making an important change on
10 our shared streets. Sometimes it takes a tragedy to
11 galvanize a movement. Sadly just a year ago in the
12 Jackson Heights Corona neighborhoods of Queens we
13 suffered a third of three unnecessary and tragic
14 deaths of young people in the space of a year.
15 Miguel Torres, middle schooler struck on his way to
16 school, Yahid Figadora [phonetic], three years old
17 walking with his mother, and Louis Bravo, working
18 college student teen returning home with a friend
19 killed by a hit and run driver. There's only so
20 much shock, sadness, and disbelief a community can
21 feel before the impious for change grabs hold. When
22 it grabs hold of a small army of parents a
23 community may never be the same. Make Queens Safer
24 was born in that way. Despite our momentum the day
25 before the winter school break brought the horrific

1 death of 8 year old Noshot Nahian [sp?] who was
2 crossing Northern Boulevard to go to school with
3 his sister when he was struck and killed by a
4 turning tractor trailer whose driver had a
5 suspended license. How could this keep happening on
6 our local streets. We were aggrieved, we were
7 afraid, we were enraged. Make Queens Safer held yet
8 another vigil. But we were acutely aware that no
9 vigil ever brought back a family's child. Sadly
10 Queens was not alone in the suffer, in the
11 suffering of traffic violence on our streets.
12 Nationwide the strong and smart organization
13 transportation alternatives have been fighting this
14 fight for years. Right of Way, Make Brooklyn Safer,
15 and Park Slopes neighbors served as teachers and
16 role models for how to safety up our streets. The
17 group which created a title wave of awareness was
18 and is families for safe streets. The mother and
19 sister of Louis Bravo, Marta Puruncajas, and Sara
20 Bravo both my neighbors and friends are among those
21 who have fought relentlessly to make our city safer
22 for pedestrians in the wake of Louis's death. Yet
23 no driver has been identified or charged as his hit
24 and run killer. When the people who have lost the

1
2 most profoundly their children, siblings, partners,
3 parents, grandparents, nieces, nephews, aunts,
4 uncles, and friends are the very ones who give the
5 most fully. The rest of us must dig as deep as we
6 can to make real the changes that had they come
7 sooner may have kept their loved ones living today.
8 Mayor de Blasio, Department of Transportation
9 Commissioner Trautenberg [sp?], and our local
10 electeds [phonetic] did dig in and the age of
11 commitment to Vision Zero in New York City began on
12 January 1st, 2014. A year into our work at Make
13 Queens Safer we see the city's commitment baring
14 fruit. As we speak about everyone playing a role I
15 must take a moment here to express our deepest
16 condolences to the Tarla [sp?] family as they mourn
17 the death of Jill Tarla [sp?] who was struck by a
18 cyclists in central park and who died yesterday.
19 Several of us in Make Queens Safer are cyclists. We
20 have a working cyclist in our core group and
21 several bike commuters. I am one. We all play a
22 role. Everyone who shares the street must fully
23 embody the word share. Thank you all for our street
24 safety work and for the work that you will continue
25 to do.

1
2 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
3 very much. And briefly thank you... Maribel. Thank
4 you.

5 MARIBEL EGIPCIACO: [speaking Spanish]

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright and
7 again I want to thank all the advocates. You are
8 the ones that are really making the change happen
9 on the ground. Unfortunately due to these tragedies
10 which we can never replace you know the lives lost.
11 But thank you for what you're doing or for others
12 who will be saved thanks to your efforts and you're
13 an inspiration to communities across the city so
14 thank you for what you do. Thank you and that
15 concludes ceremonials.

16 UNKNOWN MALE: Ladies and gentleman can
17 I have your attention please. All quiet on the
18 floor. Can I have your attention please? At this
19 time please place all cell phones and pagers to
20 vibrate. All non-council employees, all non-council
21 employees please leave the main floor of the
22 chambers. There's additional seating upstairs in
23 the balcony. Thank you.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please rise for
25 the pledge of Allegiance.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

[combined pledge]
PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Roll Call.
[gavel]
COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo.
COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.
COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera. Chin.
COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen. Cohen.
COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.
COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.
COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley.
COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo.
COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.
COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens.
COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.

STATED MEETING

30

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.
3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal.
4 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.
5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene. Ferreras.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Here.
7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.
9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.
11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Present.
13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.
15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.
16 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.
17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.
19 COMMITTEE CLERK: King.
20 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.
21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.
22 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.
23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz.
24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.
25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.
3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.
4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.
5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.
7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.
9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.
11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel
12 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.
13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo. Mealy.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present.
15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca.
16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [speaking
17 Spanish]
18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.
20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.
22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.
24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso. Richards.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.
4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose. Rosenthal.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.
6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Here.
8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.
10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.
12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.
14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.
16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.
18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Weprin.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: I am here.
20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.
22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Present.
24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ignizio. Van Bramer.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Present.

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I ask my
4 colleague Council Member Koo had a say, he was
5 respectful in saying it in Spanish. I'm going to
6 say [speaking foreign language] for present,
7 [speaking Spanish] I'm here.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please rise for
9 the invocation delivered by Rabbi Andy Bachman,
10 senior rabbi at Congregation Beth Elohim 274
11 Garfield Place in the borough of Brooklyn.

12 RABBI BACHMAN: Dear friends and
13 neighbors and fellow citizens of this great city.
14 In a little more than 24 hours' time the Jewish
15 people here in New York and around the world
16 welcome in the new year, a year that we hope for
17 all people to be a year of wellbeing and good
18 health and a shalom of peace. The call to the
19 Shofar, the ancient ram's horn is meant to awaken
20 in all of our souls the essential humility that we
21 embrace in life, the awe of humanity and gods
22 wonder, and the call to build a world of justice
23 and peace for all people. The Jewish tradition
24 teaches us [speaking foreign language] that
25 [speaking foreign language] it is the birthday of

1
2 the world. And we're reminded of the ancient
3 biblical tradition that in the Garden of Eden the
4 first human beings were made in the divine image.
5 All colors, all races, all sizes, all genders, each
6 of us share the essential traces of the divine.
7 There are great and vast differences in this city,
8 in this city but we are united by them, united
9 together as one humanity to build a world of
10 justice and kindness and peace. So may this body in
11 its work in this great city be inspired to work in
12 the spirit of unity and love and kindness to build
13 a greater New York of justice and of Shalom of
14 peace. Amen.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Motion that the
16 minutes of this stated meeting of August 21st be
17 adopted as printed by Council Member Lander.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madam
19 Public Advocate. As we say in Synagogue [speaking
20 foreign language] be this god's will on the cusp of
21 [speaking foreign language] I'm thrilled that the
22 invocation was offered by one of my rabbis Andy,
23 Andy Bachman. He's a true leader at Congregation
24 Beth Elohim in Brooklyn in the American Jewish
25 Community. He's built a vibrant welcoming Jewish

1
2 congregation that truly builds bridges across the
3 city. After Hurricane Sandy hit rabbi Bachman and
4 his congregante climbed 20 plus floors in high rises
5 in the Rockaways and Redhook, cooked tens of
6 thousands of meals, and staffed the shelters for
7 those who have been displaced. His evocation of
8 humility notwithstanding we are blessed to have his
9 leadership and I move to spread the invocation in
10 full upon the record.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you for
12 spreading the invocation Council Member Lander. And
13 now adoption of minutes, a motion that the minutes
14 of the stated council of August 21st be adopted as
15 printed by the Home Run Slugger from Staten Island
16 Council Member Matteo.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Is that, is this
18 my, the benefit of being the MVP? I, the motion of
19 the minutes to be accepted at the stated meeting of
20 August 21st to be adopted as printed.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Messages and
22 papers from the mayor.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: M147 Mayor's
24 management report.

25

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Received,
3 printed, and filed.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAEMS: Communication
5 from city, county, and borough offices.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered M148
7 transfer of city funds between agencies.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Finance.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: M149 quarterly
10 performance report.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Received,
12 ordered, printed, and filed.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
14 communications.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use call
17 ups.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: m150 AND 151.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on call
20 up vote and as for roll call?

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera. Chin.

STATED MEETING

37

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.
COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.
COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Yes.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.
COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Yes.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley.
COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Yes.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo. Deutsch.
COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yes.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens.
PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Dickens.
COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: [off mic]
COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.
COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Pass.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal.
COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Yes.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene.
COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Yes.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Ferreras.
COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: I vote aye and
with, on all call ups and with permission on all
general orders.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Madam Public

Advocate I'd like to vote aye on all call ups with
permission.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I vote aye on all,
all call ups and general, on general orders and
resolutions. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I'd like to
vote aye on all call ups and ask for permission to
vote on all general orders and resolutions.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: [off mic]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: May I have
permission to call on all land use and general
orders?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye on
3 all.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yes.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I just need
8 clarification. Are we voting now on item M150?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Okay. Permission
11 to explain my vote.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Okay. My
14 colleagues today we are voting on a sidewalk café
15 that is located on the west side of 5th Avenue in
16 Council Member Corey Jarren, Johnson's district. I
17 represent the East side of 5th Avenue. Today you
18 can vote to disapprove and restore the intent of
19 the zoning resolution by prohibiting sidewalk cafes
20 in this residential neighborhood. Or you can vote
21 to approve a nonconforming use and open up a
22 Pandora's box that would allow a sidewalk café to
23 exist contrary to zoning. My colleague Corey
24 Johnson believes that this is a legal nonconforming
25 use that therefore qualifies for a grandfather

1
2 status. However the applicant has failed to
3 convince me with irrefutable evidence that their
4 request for a sidewalk café is a legal
5 nonconforming use. Ultimately that is a dispositive
6 issue here whether this is a legal or illegal
7 nonconforming use. However I believe that we never
8 get to those arguments because this application
9 fails on procedural grounds. Under section 20-226
10 of the administrative code the Department of
11 Consumer Affairs was required to file the
12 restaurant's unenclosed sidewalk café application
13 with the City Council no later than July 28th. Here
14 DCA files that application with the speaker's
15 office... [cross-talk]

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Can we have
17 quiet in the chamber. Quiet in the chamber. Sorry
18 Council Member.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: On august 14th 17
20 days after the deadline. Additionally the
21 applicant submitted a written request for an
22 extension to modify the application on August 6th
23 nine days after the July 28th deadline. More
24 troubling is that the applicant appeared before the
25 Community Board State Liquor Authority Committee

1
2 where they voted to grant an on premise license for
3 24 4th Avenue provided that conditions and
4 stipulations agreed upon by the applicant were met
5 which included not having a sidewalk café. The
6 applicant comes back seven months later in front of
7 a different committee, the sidewalk café committee
8 fails to mention his appearance at another
9 committee and... [cross-talk]

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
11 please conclude your remarks.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: ...and is seeking
13 a sidewalk café. For all the aforementioned reasons
14 I wanted my colleagues to know that I am voting no
15 on this land use call up. Thank you very much.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES JAMES: Thank you.
17 Continue with roll call.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I vote aye on
22 all, on all land use call ups and with permission
23 would like to go on all general orders and
24 resolutions.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Thank you. I vote
3 aye.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Madam Public
9 Advocate I'd like to vote aye on all the call ups
10 with your permission. With permission I'd like to
11 vote on all coupled general orders and resolutions.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I vote aye.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger. Ulrich.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye on
24 all land use call ups and I ask for unanimous
25

1
2 consent to vote aye on all orders on the general
3 order calendar.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye on all
8 land use items and I ask for permission to vote aye
9 on all general order calendar numbers.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I'd like to
13 vote aye on all the call up with the permission.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I'd like to
16 vote on all coupled general orders and resolutions
17 as well. I vote aye.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Vallone.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Weprin.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I'd like to vote
3 aye on all the call ups and with permission I'd
4 like to vote on the all coupled general orders and
5 resolutions.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I vote aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Treyger.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ignizio.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Today's land use
19 call ups are adopted by a vote of 48 in the
20 affirmative, zero in the negative with M150 being
21 adopted by 47 in the affirmative and one in the
22 negative. Quiet in the chambers. Communication from
23 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito. Quiet.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madam,
25 thank you Madam Public Advocate. So good afternoon

1
2 to everyone. I want to begin by asking everyone to
3 join me in honoring Officer Michael Williams who we
4 all know tragically lost his life on Sunday while
5 in the line of duty. Officer Williams was riding...
6 I'm sorry if we could get some silence. Officer
7 Williams was riding in an NYPD van that collided
8 with a highway divider in the Bronx. Police
9 officers in this city we all know too well put
10 themselves on the line every day. And it goes
11 without saying what a terrible tragedy this is. So
12 I'd like my colleagues and everyone in the chambers
13 to please join me in a moment of silence for
14 Officer Williams.

15 UNKNOWN FEMALE: Please rise.

16 [silence]

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. Today
18 we're going going to vote on legislation sponsored
19 by Council Member Van Bramer to crack down on hit
20 and run collision violators. While the state allows
21 criminal fines of up to 5,000 dollars for those who
22 knowingly leave the scene of a traffic accident.
23 These charges can be difficult to pursue. And
24 currently there is no mechanism for local civil
25 penalties to be imposed on violators. This bill

1
2 will change that and allow up to 10 thousand
3 dollars in civil penalties for violators depending
4 on the circumstance. I'd like to thank Kelly Taylor
5 [sp?], Lyle Frank [sp?], Befar Azalof [phonetic],
6 Johnathan Masarono [sp?], and Tursa Nazer
7 [phonetic], Tursah Noser [phonetic] for their work
8 on this bill and ask Council Member Majority Leader
9 Jimmy Van Bramer to say a few words.

10 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
11 very much Madam Speaker for your leadership on this
12 issue and for your support of this piece of
13 legislation Intro 371 which I'm very proud to have
14 introduced alongside our Transportation Committee
15 Chair Ydanis Rodriguez and over 20 of our
16 colleagues. This bill, the Justice for Hit and Run
17 Victims Act will establish civil penalties of up to
18 10 thousand dollars for fleeing the scene of a
19 coalition. In response to the death of three people
20 who were killed in my district by drivers who
21 committed this atrocity of fleeing the scene of an
22 accident. Louis Bravo who was 19 years old was
23 killed on Broadway in Woodside Queens. His mother
24 Marta Puruncajas is here today to honor her son's
25 life and to support our efforts to make sure that

1
2 no mother feel the pain that she has felt. In
3 addition to Louis Bravo, Kumar Ragunath who was 64
4 and Karren Perez who was 20 were also killed in
5 Long Island City by drivers who instead of stopping
6 and seeing if they could help seeing if there could
7 be a call to 911 made that could have resulted in a
8 life saved. Instead of doing that they left the
9 scene of the crime and they allowed those three
10 individuals to literally die in the street. That's
11 an outrage, one of the worst things that one human
12 being can do to another. The civil penalties set
13 forth in this bill cannot bring back the life of
14 Louis Bravo, Karren Ferras, or Kumar Ragunath. But
15 they will punish these crass actions of the
16 offenders of these crimes. And I believe we will
17 save lives today by deterring those who may now
18 think twice before attempting to flee the scene. I
19 want to thank again Speaker Mark-Viverito Chair
20 Rodriguez for his leadership and the Vision Zero
21 movement. I want to thank all the staff Lyle Frank
22 who was tremendously helpful in this legislation as
23 well as Kelly Taylor the Transportation Committee
24 Council. I also want to thank my staff Cody Rider
25 [sp?] my legislative director, Matt Wallis my chief

1
2 of staff and Jason VanRay [sp?] my deputy chief of
3 staff. And to Mrs. Puruncajas... [speaking foreign
4 language]

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [speaking
6 foreign language] And the co-lead sponsor of the
7 legislation is the chair of the Transportation
8 Committee Ydanis Rodriguez.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
10 speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito. Today I rise to
11 speak in favor of Intro 371 also known as the
12 Justice for Hit and Run Victims Act which I have...
13 with Majority Leader Van Bramer. These bills always
14 pass through. For the first time in city history we
15 are imposing civil penalty up to 10 thousand on hit
16 and run drivers. Today we send a message to drivers
17 that if you leave a victim on the streets you will
18 not be tolerated. Citizens across our city have
19 asked for justice and today the council answer the
20 call one more time. This issue is an issue close to
21 my heart. In 2012 Josbel Rivera a close family
22 friend was struck and killed on Mosholu Parkway.
23 Josbel had just graduated from college and was
24 about to begin his first job on his field. After
25 such success Josbel life ended because of the

1
2 insensitive actions of the, of a driver. Either
3 driver who hit Josbel had taken a moment and call
4 for medical help probably he could have been happy
5 and alive today. Instead however the driver not
6 only left the scene but burn his car to get rid of
7 all the evidence tying him to the incident.
8 Incidents like Josbel happen far too often in our
9 city. Under Vision Zero we at the council are
10 dedicated to not just dramatically reducing
11 accidents like this but eliminating them entirely.
12 Today marks another step toward making our street
13 safer. I want to thank our speaker, Melissa Mark-
14 Viverito, Majority Leader Van Bramer and his staff
15 for working with me and my office on this
16 legislation. I also want to thank the NYPD, the New
17 York City Departments of Transportation, the Taxi
18 and Limousine Commission, Mayor de Blasio, Family
19 for Safer Street, and Transportation Alternative. I
20 ask that my colleague join me in sending.. a strong
21 message to New York drivers and vote aye on the
22 Justice for Hit and Run Victims Act. Thank you.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Today
24 we're also voting on legislation sponsored by
25 Council Member Chin to increase penalties for

1
2 landlords who harass tenants and try to push them
3 out of their homes. While laws are already in place
4 to stop this behavior thousands of cases have been
5 reported in recent years. So we're taking action to
6 show that this is a serious law and violating it
7 will not be tolerated. In addition to increasing
8 penalties this law will require the department of
9 housing, preservation, and development to post
10 information about landlords who have engaged in
11 tenant harassment so New Yorkers know if their
12 potential landlord has a history of harassing
13 renters. I want to thank Jennifer Wilcox, Ed Atkin,
14 Guillermo Patino, Jose Condo [sp?], and Jeff Baker
15 who helped on this bill. We also have two bills
16 that we're passing at the request of the mayor to
17 fix some technical corrections and time tables for
18 the city's construction code. So I want to first
19 ask Margaret Chin as lead sponsor of the bill and
20 our speaker for supporting this important
21 legislation. I would also like to thank Ed Atkin,
22 Jen Wilco [sp?], and Kelly Taylor, excellent center
23 staff who worked on this intro 129-A. This bill
24 doubles the maximum fine a landlord may be charged
25 from up to 5,000 to up to 10,000. I would like to

1
2 clarify that this does not mean that every landlord
3 would have to pay 10,000 dollars. It broadens a
4 judge's discretion to issue a fine up to that
5 amount in cases where a landlord is found guilty of
6 tenant harassment depending on how egregious the
7 situation is. The bill will also increase the
8 minimum fine for repeat offenders from 1,000 to
9 2,000 dollars. Review this increase in this penalty
10 range as an essential mean to deter landlords.
11 Without the increase landlord may view current
12 tenant harassment fine as just a cost of doing
13 business. The bill will also create a public online
14 list of those landlord found guilty of tenant
15 harassment. When a landlord is found guilty of
16 tenant harassment their company name and the
17 address of the building will be listed with the
18 violation on the HBD website. Each year our city
19 loses too many rent regulated apartment because of
20 tenant harassment. We have to make landlord see
21 beyond just the money that can be made by harassing
22 seniors out of the homes that they have lived in
23 for decades. This bill is about making landlords
24 pay for pain they willingly inflict on tenants for
25 the sake of profit. This bill is about telling

1
2 landlords we're not going to let you get away with
3 it anymore. If you harass your tenant you are going
4 to be shame, we're going to shame you so that
5 everyone knows who you are and we're going to make
6 you pay a real fine, not something that you can
7 dismiss just as the cost of doing business. So I
8 wanted to thank my colleagues who have already
9 signed on to support this bill. And I urge all my
10 colleague to vote in favor of it. Thank you very
11 much.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
13 Williams.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you
15 Madam Speaker and thank you for your support and
16 thank you to, to the primary sponsor Margaret Chin
17 for championing this having been a, a tenant
18 organizer before I was a council member understand
19 firsthand how tenants are harassed. And so I'm
20 happy to be part of a solution to this. Just to
21 also be clear and reiterate what was already said
22 the intent of the bill is to make sure that our
23 landlords understand that we are serious about
24 tenant harassment. But the intent is not to
25 generate revenue for revenue's sake and the intent

1
2 is not to hit every landlord with a maximum of 10
3 thousand but to provide some discretion for
4 particularly egregious and repetitive bad actors...
5 give the judges discretion to hit them where it
6 hurts so that they can finally understand that this
7 is unacceptable. So I'm proud to be a part of it
8 and proud that the body is passing it today. Thank
9 you.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you
11 Council Member. Additionally we're voting on a
12 resolution sponsored by Council Member Espinal
13 recognizing September as Ovarian Cancer Awareness
14 Month in New York City. The American Cancer Society
15 estimates that almost 22 thousand women will
16 receive a new diagnosis of Ovarian Cancer. And over
17 14 thousand women will die from ovarian cancer in
18 the united states in 2014 and Ovarian Cancer ranks
19 5th in cancer deaths among women. This is certainly
20 a worthy cause for raising awareness. So I
21 definitely want to thank Council Member Espinal for
22 that and I want to thank Dan Haffowitz [sp?],
23 Crystal Pond, Lyle Frank, and Terza Masser
24 [phonetic]. Additionally as always my thanks to
25 Matt Gwab [phonetic] and Laura Popa [sp?] for their

1
2 work on all legislative matters. Today we're also
3 announcing a groundbreaking public private
4 partnership that's going to help fund legal
5 services for unaccompanied minors. This country is
6 facing an immigration crisis but these children
7 face a crisis in their home countries that far
8 surpasses anything we debate on Capitol Hill, City
9 Hall, or on Cable TV. This isn't a political issue,
10 it's a moral one. And today we're bringing to chart
11 a different course. Today's a day where we're
12 saying enough. And today's the day when we fulfill
13 the promise of this country as a beacon for the
14 oppressed while congress turns away. When I toured
15 the surge docket last month and I know others have
16 as well it was heartbreaking. And after the tour I
17 knew that we needed to act. Can you guys, I'm sorry
18 can you, thank you. These are children who have
19 fled unspeakable horrors in their countries. They
20 are places where murders, roving gangs, and
21 kidnappings are all just part of an average day.
22 But when they get to the courts these children are
23 not provided government appointed council to
24 represent them. This is despite the fact that many
25 of these children have legitimate claims to relief.

1
2 But without legal representation these young people
3 will be sent back to their home countries where
4 they will likely encounter abuse, persecution, gang
5 violence, or possible death. We cannot turn our
6 backs on these children and we cannot turn a blind
7 eye to their plight. We cannot pretend that they do
8 not exist. Simply put New York City will not stand
9 by as this crisis unfolds and we plan to take
10 action. These children need and deserve
11 representation and that is what we're funding
12 today. So just to quickly explain how this works
13 under New York City Council funding comes from one
14 million dollars in council funds that were
15 earmarked for legal services already in the fiscal
16 year 2015 budget. The council will be allocating
17 these funds to providers to supply legal services
18 to these children. A million dollar investment
19 would have been good enough but we wanted to do,
20 and go bigger. That is why we are joined today and
21 we were joined earlier today by the Robin Hood
22 Foundation and the New York Community Trust. We
23 engaged them with a plan that the council would
24 allocate money to legal providers and we wanted to
25 see if they would help. So sure enough they were

1
2 both eager partners and jumped at the chance to
3 help. The Robin Hood foundation helped match the
4 council's funding with a donation of 550 thousand
5 dollars. And New York Community Trust added a
6 donation of 340 thousand dollars. So all told it's
7 just about 1.9 million dollars in funding. So the
8 funding for this initiative will focus primarily on
9 increasing access to council for children and
10 removal proceedings which was described by the
11 advocates as the most critical and urgent need.
12 They will leverage high quality pro bono
13 representation and integrate social services to
14 lessen the growing backlog of children appearing on
15 the juvenile and surge dockets. This will begin to
16 ensure the due process for minors were struggling
17 to maneuver the immigration system alone. The
18 partner agencies will utilize different models of
19 representation. So as part of this program the
20 legal aid society and the door will each accept
21 cases for direct representation and also co-council
22 cases with pro bono lawyers from select New York
23 City law firms. Catholic charities community
24 services will provide direct representation through
25 staff attorneys and law student interns under

1
2 strict staff supervision. The safe passage project
3 will place cases pro bono with alumni of the New
4 York Law School as well as pro bono associates from
5 New York aerial law firms. Make the Road New York
6 will accept cases for direct representation and
7 accept referrals from the juvenile and surge
8 dockets. Central American Legal Assistance will
9 accept referrals from the juvenile and surge
10 dockets for direct representation. It will also
11 help with social, mental health, and medical
12 services. Clearly this is government functioning at
13 its best. We've identified a problem, found a way
14 to use existing resources to fix it, while at the
15 same time engaging with partners in the private
16 sector to help leverage our commitment. So I
17 definitely want to commend Robin Hood and the New
18 York Community Trust for their promise to help
19 this, these children and for being a true partner
20 with us. With Washington's failure to act on
21 comprehensive immigration reform it's falling to
22 states and very often cities to fill in the gap. So
23 today we're just more, we're doing more than just
24 filling in the gap. We're... announcing a program
25 that's going to make a difference and has a

1
2 potential to change and save lives. New York has
3 always been a city that has opened its arms to
4 those in need. That is the promise of New York.
5 That is the promise of this country. And that is
6 why we're announcing this program today. We're
7 living up to our highest ideals and I'm thankful to
8 all the partners and I really want to thank the
9 colleagues who when we said that we wanted to
10 allocate the million dollars definitely stepped up
11 to the plate. You all should be commended as well
12 for your true partnership on this matter. And this
13 is just a moral issue that I think we had a
14 responsibility. I want to thank on the staff side.
15 I want to thank Elizabeth Delligne [sp?], Corillian
16 Francisco, Rob Newman, Matt Gwab, Yvonne Jevons,
17 Erica Gonzalez, and the Council Press Office for
18 all of their work. And so again congratulations to
19 everyone. Before I wrap up though I just want to
20 mention a couple of quick other things. First of
21 all the people's climate march took place on Sunday
22 and clearly it was a resounding success. I think we
23 had between 20 to 21 council members that marched.
24 It was really, a really strong presence and that
25 after we rolled out our climate agenda in the week,

1
2 in the days prior to the climate summit it was a
3 great to be part of such a large and enthusiastic
4 movement and to see so many different groups come
5 together in support of making changes to protect
6 our planet. This is a very environmentally
7 conscious council. There are many here who, who
8 advocate for the.. and I really look forward to the
9 contributions that we can make in the future to
10 advance this issue. And finally the council had our
11 highly anticipated softball match against the
12 mayor's office last Wednesday at MCU Park in Coney
13 Island. Thank you Mark Treyger for hosting us. For
14 anyone who missed the game I want to take the
15 opportunity to provide a quick recap. The council
16 beat the mayor's office by a final score of 17 to
17 13.

18 [applause]

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Our big
20 highlight for our team demonstrating that this is
21 truly and was truly a bipartisan effort. It was
22 Council Member Steve Matteo's grand slam in the
23 second inning. That along with his excellent
24 fielding which earned him the distinction of being
25 named MVP of the game. So I want to thank him. And

1
2 then a big highlight for the other team was a
3 performance of Mayor de Blasio. I know that our,
4 our public advocate was rooting on the sidelines
5 for Team Council. We had our mayor who exited the
6 game at the start of the third inning. I think I
7 stuck it through... fourth inning so you know... So
8 we're looking forward to facing off the mayor's
9 office in basketball game. But since we now are
10 used to winning I think we're going to have to wait
11 until Robert Cornegy can't participate in that one.
12 I know he's still, he's still in rehab. So again
13 thank you. And finally, finally I, that's one game
14 I won't play. I will not, I'm not a basketball
15 player. I want to wish all of our Jewish colleagues
16 and Jewish New Yorkers [speaking foreign language]
17 and I'd like to call on Mark Levine the chair of
18 the Jewish caucus to say a few words.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you Madam
20 Speaker... say... [speaking foreign language] And now
21 in English I want to wish everyone who's
22 celebrating the New Years here in New York and
23 around the world a sweet and happy new year, sweet
24 as honey and full of love and peace. Thank you.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you Council Member Levine and with that we have communication from the speaker.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [speaking foreign language] Any discussion of general orders? Seeing none. Report of special committees.

COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Reported of, reports of standing committees?

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee on Finance, preconsidered Reso 415 Fordham Road Business Improvement District.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 416 organization funding.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered M148 and Reso 423 transfer of city funds between agencies.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: LU113 and Reso 424 HDFC Council District number 37.

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
3 general orders.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the
5 committee on housing and buildings Intro 129A
6 tenant harassment.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
8 coupled on general orders.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 472A corrections
10 to the New York City construction codes.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
12 coupled on general orders.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 474, effective
14 dates for construction codes.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
16 general orders.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the
18 Committee on Land Use, LU110 and Reso 425 sidewalk
19 café.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
21 general orders.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the
23 Committee on Transportation Intro 371 A penalties
24 for leaving the scene of an incident without
25 reporting.

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
3 coupled on general orders.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: General order
5 Calendar.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Resolution appointing
7 various persons, commissioner of deeds.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
9 general orders and at this time I ask for a role
10 call on all items on the coupled general order
11 calendar.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye on all.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera, Chin.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye on all.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on
22 all.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: May I explain my
vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
much. Ovaries are very important structures, organs
in the reproductive system of a woman. And ovarian
cancer is a single most common type of... cancer
affecting so many woman. It is very important that
we take necessary measure to raise awareness about
this very devastating disease because there are so
many woman who lost the life and that also destroys
so many families. And I want to, I believe that
this is a very important bill. And I want to

1
2 commend and congratulate Council Member Espinal and
3 I vote aye. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: ...abstain on
9 land use item number 110 and Reso 425 and vote aye
10 on the rest.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye on all.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: May I
16 explain my vote?

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: First I want
19 to thank our colleague Council Member Espinal for
20 raising this important issue with us and proudly
21 sporting a ribbon... [cross-talk]

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
23 Greenfield we're going to be discussing the
24 resolution in a minute or two right after the vote.
25 You may continue if you wish.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I wish.

Thank you. Like I was saying I was thanking Council Member Espinal for his leadership. Proud to sport the ribbon today in honor of all those who have suffered including his family and the loss that he's had and appreciate him sharing it with us to make us aware of it. Also wanted to wish all of my colleagues and all of those who are celebrating a happy and healthy new year. Mark said it in three languages. I will add the fourth in Yiddish. We wish a... [speaking Yiddish] happy and healthy new year and I vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: As the chair
of the Immigration Committee I'm really proud to be
standing with all the colleagues that are in voting
process right now for the reso that is increasing
funding for the unaccompanied minor crisis. I want
to underscore a couple things though that in this
partnership with our philanthropic partners we are
going to be leveraging the million dollars. This is
really connected to a series of work that this
council has been doing this year connecting it to
the New York Immigrant Family Unity Project. The
newly scaled public defender program. These are the
models that are going to have ripples across the
country and I'm very proud to be working in

1
2 partnership with the speaker and the rest of this
3 incredible council. We're funding superheroes right
4 now and, that are going into these immigration
5 courts and allowing for, for people that have never
6 had the chance before to have legal representation
7 and deportation proceedings and... now in this
8 docket, the search docket. The other thing I want
9 to connect it to is the climate change is affecting
10 people's migration patterns and they're coming
11 here. And so this is, they're, people are not just
12 fleeing violence and countries. They're fleeing
13 climate change disasters and so I want to make sure
14 that we're thinking about that as we're voting. And
15 so I vote aye on all. Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Permission to
18 explain my vote?

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I like to for
21 all the reasons I said earlier vote no on land use
22 110 and the accompanying Reso 425 and I'd like to
23 vote yes on Land Use call up M150. Thank you Madam
24 Public Advocate.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye on
all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal. Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye. And I vote
aye on previous land use call ups.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Weprin.

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [speaking
foreign language] and aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Ignizio.

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All items on
3 today's general order calendar were adopted by a
4 vote of 49 in the affirmative, zero in the
5 negative, and zero abstentions with the exception
6 of LU110 and Reso 425 which was adopted by a vote
7 of 47 in the affirmative, one negative and one
8 abstention. Revised Land Use call ups were adopted
9 by a vote of 49 in the affirmative, zero negatives.
10 Discussion of resolutions Council Member Espinal.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: thank you Madam
12 Public Advocate. I just first and foremost I want
13 to say that everyone looks great in their ribbons.
14 So I want to thank the speaker and her staff for
15 helping me get these out to everyone in the room.
16 This is a very important resolution for me because
17 I was personally affected by Ovarian Cancer, not me
18 personally as a male but my mom is, she was
19 diagnosed two years ago and passed away rather
20 quickly. She was, went to the doctor complaining of
21 back pain and when she went in they sent her home
22 with some muscle relaxants and told her that it
23 must be a pulled muscle. And a month or two later
24 she went back and they figured out that the cancer
25 has actually spread to her spine. And quickly after

1
2 that she passed away. But this resolution is to
3 make sure that New York City recognizes September
4 as Ovarian Cancer Awareness Month. I think it's
5 important for every woman, every mother, every,
6 every daughter, every every sister of ours gets
7 themselves checked periodically. Because it is
8 called the silent killer. You know there, there are
9 many symptoms that the women get that can seem to
10 be just a normal, normal symptom like frequent
11 urination and the back pains, maybe some minor
12 bloating. And you know I just think it's important
13 that we let the women of New York City know to get
14 themselves checked. It's important. Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Introduction and
16 reading of bills.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
18 referred to committees as indicated on the agenda.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
20 Johnson on the resolution.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you Madam
22 Public Advocate. I want to thank Council Member
23 Rafael Espinal for sponsoring the resolution we are
24 considering today and for being a true leader and
25 addressing this incredibly important issue. Today

1
2 the council will be voting on resolution number
3 380A which will recognize September as Ovarian
4 Cancer month in New York City, Ovarian Cancer
5 Awareness Month in New York City. As chair of the
6 Health Committee I'm proud to report the committee
7 unanimously voted in favor of this resolution
8 yesterday and I encourage all my colleagues to do
9 the same today. Cancer has touched the lives of so
10 many of us and we all know that early detection is
11 key. Currently there are no reliable screening
12 tests for ovarian cancer and researchers are
13 continuing to look for new tests to help diagnose
14 this disease early. Symptoms are subtle and are
15 often confused with other ailments by both
16 practitioners and patients. Given the critical
17 importance of improving awareness it is the
18 obligation of the City Council to recognize
19 September as ovarian cancer month in New York City.
20 To bring attention to this important issue and
21 ensure women have the information they need to
22 detect and treat ovarian cancer as early as
23 possible. I want to thank my legislative director
24 Louis Cholden-Brown Health Committee Council Dan
25 Havitz, Policy Analyst for the Health Committee

1
2 Crystal Pond, Corillian Francisco the finance
3 analyst for the health committee for their work on
4 this resolution. And again I'd like to thank and
5 congratulate Councilman Espinal on the passage of
6 this resolution today and also the advocates. Thank
7 you Madam Public Advocate.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
9 Council Member Cumbo.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. More
11 on a personal note I just really want to thank
12 Council Member Rafael Espinal for his bravery and
13 courage to share something so personal that so many
14 of us would keep more to ourselves. That he's not
15 only put this out there in such a huge way to bring
16 greater awareness to ovarian cancer but he's
17 actually doing something about it. And I think in
18 the council I think we're so special and gifted
19 that many of the challenges that we face we
20 ultimately turn into opportunities for the entire
21 city of New York. So I certainly commend my
22 colleague for his work and for bringing greater
23 visibility to something that has impacted him so
24 personally that will affect all of New Yorkers. And
25 so I'm so happy to see all of you in your teal and

1
2 recognizing that we have to bring greater awareness
3 to this. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
5 Council Member Williams.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I
7 too just wanted to give my colleague Council Member
8 Espinal continued prayers of peace and comfort and
9 I know how, no matter how much time has passed it's
10 very hard to lose a mom and I'm sure provide...
11 someone to offer prayers of peace and comfort to
12 you and your family. And what a fantastic way to
13 honor your mom. Thank you for allowing me to be a
14 piece of that and spreading this information on
15 Ovarian Cancer to hopefully to the entire city.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
17 Levin.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you Madam
19 Public Advocate. I, I, I also want to commend
20 Council Member Espinal on his courage and his
21 consideration in introducing this legislation and,
22 and ensuring its passage. I had the opportunity to,
23 to know Rafael's mother during his first campaign
24 for the state assembly and I know she was a great
25 matriarch that meant the world to her children and

1
2 I know that she is very proud of the work that
3 Rafael has done and, and this is a great way to
4 honor her memory. So thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Any
6 other members wishing to speak on the resolution?
7 And now to a vote. A resolution on Reso 380-A, an
8 amended resolution recognizing September as Ovarian
9 Cancer Awareness Month in New York City. All of
10 those in favor say aye.

11 [Combined 'Aye']

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those
13 opposed.

14 [silence]

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Any abstentions?

16 [silence]

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May your mother
18 rest in peace. General discussion. Council Member
19 Levine.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you Madam
21 Public Advocate. Like to call my colleague's
22 attention to Reso 418 which I'm pleased to be
23 introducing today which calls upon the New York
24 State Legislature and the Governor to expand upon
25 the Compassionate Care Act which offered a legal, a

1
2 limited legalized medicinal marijuana when passed
3 in July making New York the 23rd state to legalize
4 medicinal marijuana. This is a major step forward
5 but the law as written is, is quite narrow and
6 we're seeking for, to see it expanded on three
7 counts. First the existing law limits the number of
8 permissible diseases for which marijuana can be
9 prescribed to cancer aids, Parkinson, and a few
10 others while leaving conditions like muscular
11 dystrophy, PTSD, Rheumatoid Arthritis, and many
12 others excluded. Policy experts estimate that only
13 about 10 percent of patients that could actually
14 benefit from medicinal marijuana are included under
15 the current law. Second the current law limits the
16 number of dispensaries in the state to 20. That's
17 about one per one million residents in New York
18 State compared to Arizona which has 98 dispensaries
19 for six million people. We have one fifteenth the
20 number. And that would make New York the lowest per
21 capita number of dispensaries of any of the over 20
22 states which have legalized medicinal marijuana.
23 Finally and perhaps the most fundamental flaw is
24 that the existing New York state Compassionate Care
25 Act does not allow patients to smoke marijuana,

1
2 requires them to consume it through food, oils,
3 pills, vapors, etcetera which advocates agree
4 limits the cheapest and most efficient way of
5 delivering marijuana for those who are in medical
6 need. This is a state in which 83 percent of voters
7 currently support medicinal marijuana and so we can
8 do better here which is what we're calling for in
9 this resolution. Thank you.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
11 Treyger.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you. I
13 first wanted to thank speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito
14 and her great staff who were very helpful. We had a
15 wonderful celebration yesterday honoring the
16 Russian speaking New Yorkers and I thank all my
17 colleagues who are able to join us. Thank you very
18 much for making sure that New York City is home to
19 all. I also just want to speak about resolution 421
20 that would call upon the New York State legislature
21 to pass and would require the MTA to notify the
22 public of when there are bed bug infestations on
23 busses or trains and also would require them to
24 disclose what steps they are taking to remedy this.
25 This issue is twofold. Number one there is

1
2 obviously a public health concern because we
3 learned about the, these cases on the news not
4 because the MTA stepped forward but because a
5 transit worker was bitten repeatedly and came home
6 and found bites throughout his body. So this is an
7 issue that also requires us to consider the
8 economic consequences. Think about the people who
9 ride the buses and train. These are working New
10 Yorkers, nurses, teachers, you name it. If they
11 come home with a bed bug and their homes get
12 infested it's thousands of dollars you're talking
13 about to replace bedding, furniture, clothing. No
14 one should be afraid to ride our busses and trains
15 to come home to infest their homes with very
16 closely bugs. I, I urge my colleagues to please
17 support Reso 421 that would require the MTA to
18 disclose number one cases of infestations and
19 number two what steps they're taking to remedy the
20 situation. And I' like to close by also just
21 thanking the speaker and so many of my colleagues
22 for wishing us a very happy and healthy Jewish new
23 year... [speaking foreign language] Thank you.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
25 Barron.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madam
3 Public Advocate. Today I'm introducing a bill that
4 had been introduced in a previous session. And I'm
5 being, it's being co-sponsored by Council Member
6 Dromm. And it's called the elderly eviction bill.
7 You may remember a very outspoken consumer rights
8 advocate by the name of Florence Rice. She was a
9 senior who was, lived in Harlem and she was
10 subjected to what we consider to be perhaps illegal
11 and targeted eviction. So it's a companion piece to
12 my colleague Council Member Chin's bill. But this
13 one specifically says that we need to put in place
14 protections for seniors. So what the bill does is
15 it requires a landlord if he's issuing a notice of
16 eviction to notify HPD. And then it requires HPD to
17 contact the tenant and give them a list of services
18 to which they can avail themselves so that they can
19 have representation to fight the eviction notice.
20 And it also requires a reporting of the cases that
21 are specifically targeted at seniors to see if
22 there are any patterns of discrimination. So I
23 invite all of my colleagues to read the bill and
24 sign on. I'll be glad for your support. And I also
25 want to recognize my council, my colleague council

1
2 member Espinal for sharing his tragedy in a way
3 which enlightens all of us to protect ourselves and
4 to take those precautions. And I want to wish all
5 of my Jewish colleagues happy holidays.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
7 Koo.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you Madam
9 Public Advocate. My fellow Council Members. Well
10 today I'm introducing Resolution 417 recognizing
11 and commemorating January 13 as Korean-American day
12 in the city of New York. Why January 13? Because
13 101 years ago the... 1903 January 13 107 Koreans came
14 from Korea and their life on Honolulu, Hawai'i and
15 ever since then a lot of people immigrate to
16 America. And there are two, almost two, 20, 24
17 thousand Korean owned businesses in New York state
18 which is only second most in the nation. And they
19 generate an estimated annual income, or I should
20 say revenue of 7.7 billion dollars for the economy.
21 Korean Americans have served with distinctions in
22 our military. They have contributed to our society
23 across a wide range of field including but not
24 limited to law, government, performing arts, social
25 science, medicine, academia. And in 2005 the US

1
2 Senate and House passed resolutions by unanimous
3 consent expressing support for the goals and
4 aspirations of Korean American day which is also
5 celebrated... [cross-talk] numerous states and
6 municipalities but not in New York City. So I hope
7 to work with my colleagues to change that, make
8 January 13 Korean American day in the city. Thank
9 you very much.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 Council Member Miller.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Madam
13 Public Advocate. I'd like to speak on two related
14 resolutions today. Resolution 419 and 420. First
15 please recognize that Reso 419 which would declare
16 National Missing Children Day to be concurrently
17 known as Missing Person Day here in New York City.
18 Every year thousands of people go missing. In 2012
19 the number were over 8,000 and in 2013 over 1,000
20 of those cases still remain active. Daily across
21 the United States 23 hundred persons are reported
22 missing on average. Many of these persons are not
23 only children but young adults, grownups, and
24 senior citizens. To the date the 25th of May has
25 simply been known as Missing Children Day which

1
2 does an injustice to the thousands of adults age,
3 loved ones who've gone missing every year. I ask
4 that you sign onto the resolution to have May 25th
5 concurrently known as Missing Person Day in New
6 York City in order to raise awareness that people
7 of all ages are subject to disappearance. Secondly
8 Resolution 420 will allow me to shed some light on
9 why this is so important. When La Mont Dottin then
10 aged 19 disappeared in 1995. His parents spent four
11 years attempting to find him. Their pain and grief
12 was unmeasurable. What followed was just tragic. La
13 Mont's parents discovered that after four years
14 that their son's body was buried in an unmarked
15 grave in Potter's Field. Authorities had discovered
16 the body within days of his disappearance but
17 because Lamont was 19 and over the age needed to
18 trigger an immediate search response discovery went
19 unreported and the family's connection was made,
20 wasn't made for another four years. State senate
21 bill number 70, 7404 and Assembly 898, 8961 will
22 extend unique powers... the law, the law and
23 enforcement for children, not just children but
24 missing persons of all ages.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
3 please conclude your remarks.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: It will provide
5 the increased training, expanded data collection of
6 law enforcement agency while state legislation will
7 not come until... fall I ask that all my colleagues
8 sign onto Resolution 419 and 420 to address this
9 egregious actions. Thank you Madam Speaker or
10 Public Advocate [cross-talk]

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
12 Council Member Vallone.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you Madam
14 Advocate. Today Council Member Corey Johnson and I
15 have submitted Intro 1125 and I think a one
16 sentence read of the bill sums it up. Animal
17 shelters... department shall ensure that a full
18 service shelter is maintained in each borough of
19 the city of New York. As of September 23rd, 2014
20 two boroughs still do not have a full service
21 animal shelter. This bill will rectify and
22 reintroduce what was approved in 2000 so that Bronx
23 and Queens can finally get their animal shelters.
24 Thank you for the Bronx and Queens delegations for
25 supporting us. And I ask my fellow council members

1
2 to help make this a reality since in 2010 it was
3 removed by the previous speaker. Thank you very
4 much.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
6 Council Member Gibson.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you Madam
8 Public Advocate. I too want to join with all of my
9 colleagues in commending Council Member Espinal for
10 recognizing September as Ovarian Cancer Awareness
11 Month. As someone who has lost a parent to cancer
12 the pain is all too real. But one thing I recognize
13 about pain is it allows us to turn that pain into a
14 plan with a purpose. And so we as elected officials
15 working with advocacy groups will continue to do
16 work to educate and to provide access to many New
17 Yorkers and women on access to health and care. I
18 also just wanted to make a point and congratulate
19 all of my colleagues on all the bills that were
20 passed today. I want to recognize the speaker for
21 the incredible public/private partnership on
22 unaccompanied children in New York City. It's a
23 great way to provide services for children that
24 need a lot of opportunity and, and programs. And as
25 a point of information earlier today I just wanted

1
2 to recognize so many colleagues that stood together
3 with many of the advocacy groups of Muslim and
4 Jewish faith in denouncing the ads that will soon
5 be placed on many of the subway systems and our MTA
6 system. We as a city recognizing diversity,
7 recognizing that diversity is our greatest strength
8 will certainly not stand for any acts of violence
9 or discriminations or racist acts and
10 discrimination against any people in this city. And
11 so I just wanted to reaffirm my commitment as Chair
12 of Public Safety to stand with all of my colleagues
13 across this city as well as all of our advocacy
14 groups in denouncing that and working with the MTA
15 as well as our administration and our public
16 advocate on this issue. Thank you very much Madam
17 Public Advocate.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
19 Council Member Rodriguez.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I just wanted
21 to congratulate the organizer who for the second
22 day yesterday march it on the climate change. I
23 also like to thanks the men and woman the NYPD for,
24 on how they... those five hours where the protestor
25 is sitting... So for me what I... yesterday is a new

1
2 day on how the NYPD is handling on these non-
3 violence protests.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
5 Williams.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I
7 wanted to call attention to, my colleagues to look
8 at Resolution 422. In the stay of the UN meeting
9 around climate change we had lots of activity
10 around climate change in the city these past few
11 days. There was a bill on the governor's desk from
12 Senator Ortiz and Assembly Member Rosenthal which
13 will extend the compliance period in which people
14 can sign up to put solar electric generating
15 systems in their homes and get a tax abatement.
16 This resolution is asking for the governor to sign
17 that piece of legislation. So we can extend that
18 period and many people can do their part to reduce
19 our carbon footprint. Thank you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
21 Greenfield.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you
23 Madam Public Advocate for allowing me to speak this
24 time. I'm grateful. I'd like to speak on
25 Introduction number 481 which is an introduction

1
2 that would require restaurants and catering halls
3 to specifically detail possible food allergies in
4 their food including things like eggs, fish, milks,
5 peanuts, tree nuts, shellfish, soy, and wheat. This
6 is a very common problem that we have in New York
7 City. You walk into a restaurant you ask the waiter
8 are there any nuts in here the waiter says oh no of
9 course not. Next thing you know you take a bite
10 and.. you literally go into shock and potentially
11 have a fatal situation. So this is a very simple
12 piece of legislation that would have a sign that
13 would simply detail whether or not these
14 ingredients are served so that it will be very
15 clear for all consumers. I encourage my colleagues
16 to sign onto introduction 481 and I wish everybody
17 a wonderful day.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
19 Cumbo.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I
21 would first like to start off by thanking Speaker
22 Melissa Mark-Viverito for leading our team towards
23 a win against the mayor's office 17 to 13 at MCU
24 park last Wednesday. It was an incredible game but
25 I, what I also want to add is next time I hope that

1
2 more of my women colleagues will participate. We
3 need more women power on those teams. And I hope
4 that you all will participate the next time. Also
5 I'm very proud on Friday with my colleague Council
6 Member Inez Barron. I have the distinguished honor
7 of joining the Medgar Evers College center for
8 black literature and presenting a proclamation to
9 celebrate the 80th birthday of Sonia Sanchez. She
10 is an accomplished poet, humanitarian,
11 international lecturer, scholar, editor, activist,
12 and she is considered a lion in literature's
13 forest. And that was a coin, a phrase coined by
14 Doctor Maya Angelou the godmother of the Black Arts
15 Movement. Sonya has authored more than 20 books,
16 lectured in over 500 colleges and universities, and
17 was selected as the first poet laureate of
18 Philadelphia where she currently resides. And
19 finally just want to make everyone aware that we
20 are approaching domestic violence awareness month
21 and please stay tuned for a complete series of
22 events that our office in collaboration with many
23 of our partners and advocates and council members
24 and hearings that will be conducted around this
25 very important issue. Thank you.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
3 Rosenthal.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you
5 Madam Public Advocate James. At this time I'd like
6 to ask my fellow colleagues to co-sponsor Intro
7 483, a local law calling on the New York City
8 Department of Buildings to provide users with email
9 notifications when updates to building permit
10 applications available through the building on my
11 block web portal. DOB's website allows residents to
12 search for construction activity in the surrounding
13 area and has been a helpful tool for community
14 members, community boards and elected officials.
15 This bill would go the next step and make tracking
16 information regarding permits and new construction
17 activity in the effected community easier to do as
18 the process moves forward. In addition to the value
19 it will have for interested community members and
20 organizations creating a more user friendly web
21 portal will demonstrate to the public DOB's
22 commitment to transparency. In closing I ask my
23 colleagues on the council to join me in supporting
24 Intro 483 and I look forward to working with the
25 advocates, my fellow colleagues, and the

1
2 administration on crafting the right enhancement to
3 an already great service. This is especially
4 critical on the upper west side and other districts
5 where the influx of new development and new, new
6 buildings are just taking over our streets. Thank
7 you very much.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And lastly
9 Council Member Eugene.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
11 much Madam Public Advocate. I want to commend and
12 thank Madam Speaker for our leadership you know so
13 on... when dedication to put an immigrant... young
14 people. Today we, we, I was a very delighted to, to
15 join the speaker in the announcement of her very
16 important initiative the one million, one million
17 dollars from the City Council. And I want to.. all
18 the partners because we all know that United State
19 of America is a land of immigrants and people came
20 from everywhere for the same reason. And each one
21 of us we can trace our origin for, to one of seven
22 countries. Those young people that are fleeing
23 their countries because of violence, because of
24 threat on their life I think that we have the moral
25 obligation to, as, as a American to stand together

1
2 and give the assistant that they need. And I think
3 that... the humanitarians are our morality and also
4 the principal of all American believe impose us to
5 act and to act now in the best interest of those
6 children. And I commend one more time, Madam
7 Speaker I commend you for that and I thank you for
8 that. And I thank also all the partners. This is
9 the right thing to do. And I think, as a, most of
10 us we, we... privileged and blessed to have a piece
11 of American dream. Those young people tomorrow
12 there would be the elected official, the speakers,
13 the congress members, the assembly members, the
14 City Council members, doctors, and productive
15 citizen that will... to this great nation United
16 State. Thank you very much Madam Public Advocate.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Speaker to
18 close.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madam
20 Public Advocate and thank you to all colleagues.
21 It's been an emotional day on many different levels
22 but a very productive one as well. And I think
23 we're demonstrating true leadership again. And it's
24 a, a great way that we can close the day knowing
25 the positive impact we're having on people's lives

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

at all different levels. So thank you Madam Public
Advocate, thank you my colleagues, and at about
3:25 we are adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date September 26, 2014