

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON IMMIGRATION

----- X

April 30, 2014
Start: 10:06 a.m.
Recess: 1:48 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers
City Hall

B E F O R E:
CARLOS MENCHACA
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Mathieu Eugene
Daniel Dromm
Peter A. Koo
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito
Fernando Cabrera
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Antonio Reynoso
Jumaane D. Williams
Mark Levine
Brad S. Lander
Deborah L. Rose
Public Advocate Letitia James

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Lucio Escamilla
NYC Resident

Batya Miller
Manhattan Together

Sue Dorn
Member of Central Synagogue

Bryan Ellicott
NYC Resident

Mindy Tarlow
Director
Mayor's Office of Operations

Nisha Agarwal
Commissioner
Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs

Steven Choi
Executive Director
New York Immigration Coalition

Johanna Miller
Advocacy Director
New York Civil Liberties Union

Emily Tucker
Staff Attorney
Center for Popular Democracy

Deyanira Del Rio
Co-Director
New Economy Project

Esther Sanchez
Faith in New York

Jeong Min Yu
MinKwon Center for Community Action

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jason Chang
National Federation of Community
Development Credit Unions

Linda Sarsour
Executive Director
Arab American Association of New York

John Lugo
Unidad Latina en Accion
New Haven, CT

Eric Mar
District 1
San Francisco Board of Supervisors

Arely Gonzalez

Juan Carlos Gomez
Make the Road New York

Jesus Castellanos
Make the Road New York

Carlos Vasquez

Jojo Annobil
Attorney
Legal Aid Society

Jeff Foreman
Policy Director
Care for the Homeless

Jessica Orozco
Director
Immigration and Civic Engagement
Hispanic Federation

Diana Reyna
Brooklyn Borough Deputy President

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Elana Redfield
Representative
Sylvia Rivera Law Project and
Peter Cicchino Youth Project

Noah Lewis
Staff Attorney
Transgender Legal Defense and Education
Fund

Lynly Egyes
Attorney
Sex Workers Project

Glenda Testone
Executive Director
New York City Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and
Transgender Community Center

Mizue Aizeki
Immigrant Defense Project

Mark Noferi
Center for Migration Studies and
New York City Bar Association

Annie Wang
Co-Chair
Comprehensive Immigration Reform Committee
New York Chapter of the American
Immigration Lawyers Association

Owen Rogers
Picture the Homeless

Nancy Mageson [sp?]

Gabriela Sandoval Requena
Policy Analyst
Coalition for the Homeless

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Rev. Getulio Cruz
Pastor
Monte Sion Christian Church
Manhattan Together and Metro IAF

Laurie Izutsu
Senior Staff Attorney
Brooklyn Legal Services

Yolanda Castro
Mexican Consulate

Lauren Burke
Executive Director
Atlas: DIY

Unknown Speaker
The Fortune Society

Diane Steinman
Director
New York State Interfaith Network

Jeff Weiss
Counsel
Assemblyman Felix Ortiz's Office

Joseph Rosenberg
Executive Director
Catholic Community Relations Council

Louis Quinones
Representing
President George Miranda
Teamsters Joint Council 16

Dr. Paule Cruz-Takash
Oakland City ID

Ethan Carr
MasterCard Worldwide

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Hally Chu
Representative
Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer

Rev. Terry Troia
Director
Project Hospitality

Liam O'Doherty
Pastor
Our Lady of Good Counsel Parish

Bishop Orlando Findlayter
Chairman
Churches United to Save and Heal

Gene Judy
First Nation Baptist Church

Prof. Raul Hinzosa
UCLA

Daniel Rose
MasterCard

Freddy Cruz Martinez
Volunteer Leader
Little Sisters of the Assumption Family
Health Services, Manhattan Together and
Metro IAF

[gavel]

[background comments]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish] **00:00:17**

and welcome to our City Council Chambers. I am Carlos Menchaca, Chair of the New York City Council's Committee on Immigration. This morning our Committee will consider Int. No. 253, a Local Law to amend the Administrative Code of the City of New York in relation to the creation of a New York City identity card program. I am proud to have co-sponsored this bill with my colleague, Council Member Danny Dromm.

The Notion of the New York City identity card is not a recent idea; in fact for many years now the City Council and advocates have learned of the many communities who lack access to basic City services and the foundation of this bill has come out of the experiences of our immigrant community here in New York. We repeatedly heard stories of families not being able to see a doctor or pick up a prescription because they do not have an ID. We heard stories of parents who couldn't pick up their kids from school or attend PTA meetings in school because they didn't have an ID. We heard of people too scared to call the police for help or to report a

1
2 crime simply because they didn't have identification.
3 All of these stories made us realize that there is a
4 serious problem and that we need to find a serious
5 solution and that is what this bill is.

6 But immigrants are not the only New
7 Yorkers who face these issues. In our years of
8 researching we have learned that seniors, homeless;
9 especially our homeless youth, the transgender
10 community who struggle to obtain identification that
11 affirms their gender expression, or making it more
12 convenient, like people... or for people like me who
13 ride a bike, or prefer to ride a bike, prefer to take
14 public transportation; they could all benefit from a
15 municipal ID program; this is what makes this concept
16 so exciting. And our vision of impact doesn't stop
17 there; whether you are born here or immigrated from
18 another country or another state, we all know that a
19 New Yorker is a special kind of person, and the truth
20 is, when New York [background comments] acts, we have
21 national and global impact; this card can go beyond
22 giving people the right to identify themselves and
23 access basic services, like bank accounts; this card
24 has the ability to unite us as New Yorkers, giving us
25 access to things that make New York New York; our

1
2 world-class cultural institutions in every borough,
3 our libraries in every borough, our Bike Share
4 program, or maybe even one day our subway system.

5 Int. No. 253 presents us with a New York solution to
6 a New York challenge. This creation of a municipal
7 ID card is of importance not only to me, but to my
8 colleagues, including our great Speaker, Melissa
9 Mark-Viverito, as well as Mayor de Blasio. I am
10 happy that this initiative has wide support, both in
11 City Hall and with the City Council. I look forward
12 to hearing from the Mayor's Office of Immigrant
13 Affairs and Operations, immigrant advocates and legal
14 practitioners on how we can make the municipal
15 identification card program the largest of its kind;
16 the most successful of its kind. Int. 253 calls on
17 the Mayor's Office of Operations to create a
18 municipal identification program for all New York
19 City residents. The New York City identity card will
20 help thousands of New Yorkers who lack acceptable
21 identification to access City services, feel safer in
22 their communities and foster a feeling of unity for
23 all New Yorkers; additionally, protections,
24 protections would be built into the program to
25 protect against fraud.

1
2 I would like to thank everyone for coming
3 to this morning's hearing and I would like to thank
4 everyone in advance for their testimony. And due to
5 the large number of witnesses here today, we will be
6 putting the timer on all our witnesses and also to my
7 colleagues, I will also ask you to keep your
8 questions and comments brief of two minutes, and
9 lastly, I would like to mention that we will be
10 reading people's tweets throughout today's hearing;
11 if you have a comment or a question regarding
12 municipal IDs, we urge you to tweet your comment to
13 @NYCCouncil with the #nycID and before we move
14 further, I want to present to you our incredible
15 Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito, who will be making an
16 opening statement, someone that has been [Spanish]
17 **00:04:43** on this topic and so many other ones that
18 are gonna bring more justice and more access and more
19 safety to our New Yorkers, our great Speaker, Melissa
20 Mark-Viverito.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Chair
22 Menchaca, [Spanish] **00:04:55**, good morning; I have to
23 say that this is an extremely exciting day
24 personally, something that I have been fighting for,
25 along with my great colleague Danny Dromm here for

1
2 some time and know that this hearing is the first
3 step towards achieving that ultimate goal of the
4 largest municipal ID program in this country; very
5 excited that we're having this hearing today.

6 Before I make my comments, I understand
7 also we do have translation equipment [Spanish]
8 **00:05:24.** If people need translation equipment, it
9 is in the back and you can feel free to get that, so
10 it's great that we have that available.

11 So again I wanna thank our great Chair,
12 Carlos Menchaca, and thank Council Member Danny Dromm
13 for the introduction of this vitally important
14 legislation.

15 Currently many New York residents have
16 difficulty getting access to basic public services
17 because they do not have a government-issued ID card;
18 this includes some of the most vulnerable among us.
19 This legislation will change that, it will give
20 anyone who lives in the five boroughs the opportunity
21 to obtain a municipal identification card. The
22 legislation will require City agencies to accept this
23 card as a form of valid ID, so those who make use of
24 this program can rest assured that with this ID card
25 they will be able to access essential City services.

1
2 The bill requires that the card be
3 designed in a way that deters fraud, much like a
4 driver's license or passport does. The Council is
5 very serious about safety and security; we will
6 explore ways to ensure that the ID cards are
7 protected from fraud in this hearing and in continued
8 conversations with stakeholders and the
9 Administration. We do not want these ID cards to end
10 up in the wrong hands and we wanna make sure every
11 step is taken to safeguard users' identities and
12 their privacy.

13 Other municipalities have seen success
14 with their municipal ID programs; it is time to
15 replicate that success on a larger scale here in New
16 York City. This Council also looks forward to
17 continuing our productive conversations with the law
18 enforcement community, along with others from the
19 senior, immigrant, LGBT, youth, and other communities
20 who stand to benefit from this legislation. For too
21 long the Federal Government has lagged behind on
22 immigration reform and it's fallen to municipalities
23 like New York to take the lead and I think that we've
24 done quite a stellar job over the years of making it
25 clear that our immigrant communities are welcome and

1
2 that we will make sure that we do everything to
3 protect them.

4 While we would like to also see action in
5 Washington, we know that when New York City has big,
6 bold ideas, like muni IDs, that often the rest of the
7 country follows. This hearing is the next step; I
8 look forward to hearing some of the testimony and let
9 it be known and let it be clear that this is a
10 priority for this New York City Council and we will
11 have municipal IDs in New York City. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you,
13 Speaker. And now we'd like to hear some opening
14 statements from prime sponsor, Danny Dromm, Council
15 Member.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very
17 much, Chair Menchaca; it's indeed a pleasure to be
18 here today. I want to also start off by thanking
19 Speaker Mark-Viverito for the translation equipment,
20 because if I'm not mistaken, it's the first time
21 we've had translation equipment and that is a great
22 step forward; I am also going to be using that
23 translation equipment for my hearing on Tuesday, my
24 Education Committee hearing, so that is a great
25 addition to the City Council and you are true to your

1
2 word in terms of making these hearings more
3 accessible to people, as you have done with many of
4 the proposals put forth just last week, in terms of
5 the budget and the transparency issues that we
6 prioritize here in the Council.

7 You know, for many years Speaker Mark-
8 Viverito and I have wanted to put forth this
9 municipal ID program and now the time is right. We
10 feel that in this Committee and in this Council we
11 have great leadership; we have leadership from the
12 Mayor's side of the fence as well, and we believe
13 that we have come up with a very good proposal, one
14 that will be a model for the rest of the country and
15 one that will help to move all communities forward.
16 The way that I look at this municipal ID is that it's
17 a municipal ID for all, and we want to make sure that
18 all New Yorkers avail themselves of this
19 identification; that is crucial to the distribution
20 of these IDs.

21 I wanna thank Chair Menchaca as well for
22 his leadership on this issue and for fighting so hard
23 from the moment he came in; I don't know that he was
24 elected one day that he wasn't knocking at my door
25 saying, where is that bill and we work very closely

1
2 together to ensure that this piece of legislation has
3 come out. When passed, this is going to be a major
4 benefit for all New Yorkers, and Chair Menchaca, your
5 fingerprints are all over this, so thank you for your
6 leadership on this as well.

7 I do look forward to hearing from people
8 today who will be giving testimony and we'll have a
9 number of questions for the Administration, but this
10 a very proud day for me and for us in the City
11 Council, and thank you to everyone who has come to be
12 a part of this historic day. Thank you very much.

13 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, Council
14 Member Dromm and I wanna second that partnership that
15 we've built in the Council and as someone who's just
16 come into the City Council, there's no one better to
17 work with than our good Council Member Danny Dromm,
18 who has been, and was the Chair of Immigration
19 before, so it's just been a great thing to kinda take
20 that mantle and to continue it and you have two
21 fighters here. We have also other fighters in this
22 incredible Immigration Committee, Council Member Koo
23 and Council Member Eugene, thank you so much for
24 being here; this is a Committee that is really made
25 up of people who are incredibly passionate about this

1
2 topic, but really making sure that immigrants in the
3 City continue to prosper and get access.

4 So without further ado I wanna call up
5 the first panel, and we'd like to invite up Batya
6 Miller, Sue Dorn, Bryan Ellicott, [background
7 comment] and Lucio Escamilla [sp?]. Thank you. If
8 you have statements, we'll take them as well. We're
9 gonna put the clock at two minutes; we know you have
10 written testimony, so if you don't get through the
11 testimony, just hand it over and we'll take the rest
12 into record, and we'll start with... well actually,
13 we'll... we're gonna... let's start from the left over to
14 the right, if that's okay. Go ahead, Mr. Escamilla.
15 Thank you.

16 LUCIO ESCAMILLA: Hello, my name is Lucio
17 Escamilla and I am member of Immaculate Conception
18 church and a leader in South Bronx Churches and
19 Metro-IAF. I know personally how important it is
20 that all New Yorkers have access to an ID that is
21 recognized everywhere in the City. In 2005 I was
22 stopped by the police; they asked to see my ID. I
23 showed them my Mexican Consulate ID card and a valid
24 Michigan driver license and they claimed that both
25 were fake; actually threw them on the ground; then

1
2 they took me to a holding cell for the night. The
3 next day the judge dismissed the case immediately and
4 I was free to go, but I should not have had to spend
5 the night in jail, my family should not have had to
6 worry. And I know many people in my community, in my
7 church who have also spent the night in the jail only
8 because they did not have a recognized ID. The City
9 of New York has to start producing its own ID so
10 that this never happens again. People should not be
11 taken to the jail unnecessarily and the police should
12 be able to spend their time on the real criminals.
13 Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, Mr.
15 Escamilla.

16 BATYA MILLER: Do I have to press it
17 again?

18 SUE DORN: No, it's on. [background
19 comment]

20 BATYA MILLER: It's on. Okay. Hello, my
21 name is Batya Miller and I am with Manhattan
22 Together. I'm here today to talk about why it is
23 useful and important for all of us to apply for a
24 municipal ID. This City program would finally give
25 countless New Yorkers an important benefit they now

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

lack. While it will certainly help vulnerable New Yorkers like undocumented immigrants, the homeless and the formerly incarcerated, it would also improve my life and the lives of many others.

Like many other New Yorkers, I don't drive and I love living in a city where you don't need to. A driver's license has become the de facto photo ID all over the country, [background comment] I've somehow managed to squeak by all these years with... [interpose]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Ma'am, can you speak closer to the mic so we can... we can hear you... [crosstalk]

BATYA MILLER: Oh, sorry. I've somehow managed to squeak by all these years with my university library card that has a photo on it and more recently my senior citizen MetroCard when I've been asked to show photo ID. Such situations have been stressful at times, as not everyone readily accepted them. I finally hit a brick wall several months ago when I went to return something at a major women's clothing chain; they would not refund the credit charge because they did not view either ID I showed them as official. I was not able to return

1
2 the item and have never gone back to the store. As a
3 non-driver I am really looking forward to receiving a
4 New York City ID. The ID should be relatively easy
5 to apply for at community-friendly places like
6 libraries and congregations; it can then become a
7 primary or the primary ID for the many non-drivers in
8 this city, citizens and others. I know it will both
9 simplify my life and link me in a small but
10 significant [bell] way to other New Yorkers who
11 contribute to the wonderful diversity of this great
12 city.

13 [background comment]

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much
15 for that.

16 SUE DORN: Good morning. My name is Sue
17 Dorn and I am a member of Central Synagogue and a
18 leader of Manhattan Together and Metro-IAF.

19 A hundred and ten years ago this summer a
20 woman left the Ukraine with her three small children;
21 she landed in Boston, made her way across the United
22 States to Oregon where she met her husband who had
23 gone there the year before. He eventually became a
24 citizen, but between raising their 11 children and
25 helping with their small grocery store, she never had

1
2 the opportunity. Although life was so much better in
3 the United States, she was never completely
4 comfortable because she was not a citizen. As a
5 result, for most of her life she always carried her
6 alien registration card, this card, in the back of
7 her mind she thought someone might pick her up and
8 send her back to the Ukraine, separating her from her
9 family and friends. This apprehension was so intense
10 that she took the card with her to the hospital when
11 she was on death's doorstep. I have this card
12 because she was my grandmother. Even as a small
13 child I understood her uneasiness and how much this
14 card was a lifeline for her. No one should have to
15 walk the streets without recognized identification,
16 things happen, people get stopped, buses jump curbs,
17 and in an era of increasing security, we all need ID
18 to enter places where we have to go. The lack of an
19 easy, accessible ID is a major problem for many,
20 including immigrants, students whose permanent
21 residents are elsewhere, the elderly, and those who
22 do not drive. As an 80-year-old, I won't be driving
23 much longer and would find it helpful to have an
24 easy, attainable [bell] municipal ID than go through
25 the hassle of dealing with New York State's DMV.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Metro-IAF looks forward to working with the City to make sure this effort is implemented properly; outreach will be necessary to convince all New Yorkers why it's to their benefit to get the ID. I'll be among the first to be issued one; like my grandmother, I will always carry it.

[background comment]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much for that.

BRYAN ELLICOTT: Good morning. My name is Bryan Ellicott and I fully support Int. 253 as an open and proud transgender man who is looking forward to the day when I feel appropriate, my appropriate gender marker is on my identification. I am pleased to see this legislation is co-sponsored by so many members of the City Council and this entire Committee.

The idea that New York City will allow me to decide that my true and proper gender identity is one displayed on this piece of identification is something I couldn't be more excited about. Think about the number of times a day you show your ID, any given day, looking at my New York State ID you know my name, my birth name, where I live and the gender I

1
2 was born, and it doesn't look like I do now. As my
3 transition has progressed, the idea of a female
4 gender marker on my identification is something that
5 brings a lot of distress and dysphoria to my life,
6 especially going out with friends and coworkers, many
7 who know I'm transgender and some that don't.

8 The protections of Title 8 in New York
9 City define gender in the New York City Human Rights
10 Law, as it was amended in 2002, as your actual or
11 perceived gender identity; self-image; appearance and
12 behavior or expression, or within the identity, self-
13 image, behavior of the invil [sic] assigned at birth.
14 New York State has very strict guidelines for
15 changing your gender marker on pieces of
16 identification, such as birth certificates and the
17 Department of Motor Vehicles.

18 New York State [background comments]
19 Administrative Code says a letter from a surgeon
20 specifying date and place of your type of sexual
21 reassignment, or gender reassignment surgery
22 performed, an operative report and if additional
23 medical information is needed to change your gender
24 marker.

1
2 New York City Administrative Code also
3 states that in order to change your gender marker on
4 your birth certificate you also need to have surgery.

5 Insurance companies do not cover these
6 procedures and the State finds it unacceptable for
7 you to change it without so. An estimated close to
8 \$30,000 is needed to have these surgeries and then
9 you get your gender markers changes; that's a lot of
10 money, a lot of saving; a lot of fundraising on top
11 of then having [bell] to spend money to have them
12 changed. My suggestion to the Council is to ask for
13 letters from either your health provider or the
14 therapist that can provide your HRT; those are the
15 letters that are needed by the New York State and New
16 York City to change those identifications to prevent
17 fraud.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, Bryan.
19 And thanks to this first panel; clearly you've now
20 heard from New Yorkers who are engaged in many
21 reasons why municipal IDs could be beneficial. And
22 so I'm gonna open it up to questions that Council
23 Members have, but really I wanna actually start with
24 you, Bryan on the suggestion you just gave us. Can
25 you tell us a little bit about how that suggestion is

1
2 different from current IDs that you might want to be
3 able to get and how this municipal ID has to be a
4 little bit different?

5 BRYAN ELLICOTT: This... [background
6 comment] What is I'm asking is a suggestion is that
7 you get the letter... that the letters... we can get
8 those letters easily; the letters come from our
9 therapists, we have to see a therapist in order to
10 get hormone replacement therapy or from the doctor
11 who already provides a hormone replacement therapy.
12 Those letters doctors write easily, they write them
13 pretty much within the five minutes you ask about
14 them. What I'm not asking is that we have to have
15 surgery in order to prove that we have our genders
16 changed, all I'm asking is that we're allowed to use
17 the same letters we need to have surgery and to say
18 that we're ready to have surgery in order to get
19 those IDs without the surgery.

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Great. Thank you
21 for that. And I just wanna let everyone know that
22 our Council Members Koo, Eugene, Dromm, Espinal, and
23 our Speaker are here today, thank you. And any
24 questions from our council members for the panel?
25 [background comment] Council Member Eugene.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
3 much, Mr. Chair. And I want to commend your to come
4 in and thank each one of you from the panel, and
5 thank you also, especially to you gentleman, for your
6 courage, you know for explaining, sharing with us,
7 you know what you went through because of the ID,
8 your ID that you provided to the police officer; you
9 were stopped and arrested. And my question to you,
10 very simple; how do you think that you know the
11 municipal ID will prevent such thing to happen?

12 [background comment]

13 LUCIO ESCAMILLA: The municipal ID is
14 gonna help me about... I'm gonna work in the City like
15 free and I can prove I live in New York City and also
16 many of my families and especially in my church, in
17 my community, where I know thousands of the people,
18 they need that kind of ID to identify anywhere,
19 especially open accounts in the bank, especially to
20 go to probably places where they can show they live
21 in New York.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
23 much. In your testimony Miss, you mentioned that
24 outreach would be necessary and we know that, but
25 since we are dealing with immigrants and we know the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

immigrant people are... they are facing so many challenges in everyday life, because of language, because of difficulty to navigate through the system; [background comments] what can you tell us, you know, what your organization can do in terms of reaching out to immigrant people, especially those who don't speak English, you know as a first language; what do you advise to do in term of outreach?

SUE DORN: I'm... I'm sorry; I...

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: In terms of outreach, you know... [interpose]

SUE DORN: In the outreach?

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: outreach...

SUE DORN: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: we know that immigrant people, all of us, especially I'm immigrant too...

SUE DORN: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: and many of immigrant people, you know, they don't speak English proficiently, so whenever there is a service available in the City of New York, they'll face, you know, challenges in term of being able to navigate through the system and get the resources that are

1
2 available to them. Do you have any idea, any
3 thought, [bell] you know, any advice in terms of how
4 to reach out [background comments] to immigrant
5 people and especially those who don't speak English
6 properly?

7 SUE DORN: Many are members of churches,
8 synagogues, other congregations and through those
9 organizations, through the social service agencies in
10 their communities would be a great way to start with
11 reaching out to people.

12 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much
13 and we're actually... [crosstalk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you so
15 much; appreciate that. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: gonna be hearing
17 from... from some faith leaders later today in
18 testimony. I'm gonna hand it over to Council Member
19 Dromm.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you, Chair
21 Menchaca. So my question is kind of related a little
22 bit to what Council Member Eugene was getting at as
23 well. Not only the outreach to the community, but I
24 was wondering if you might have ideas about how we
25 would set up offices to begin to do the intake for

1
2 the documentation so that people can actually apply.
3 Where would places... what types of places would be
4 most convenience for people to go to [background
5 comments] to apply for the municipal ID?

6 BATYA MILLER: Well I think it's really
7 important if we can possibly set up... [interpose]

8 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Can you speak into
9 the mic a little bit closer?

10 BATYA MILLER: It's really important if
11 we can possibly set up places of application that are
12 known and friendly to the community, whether that be
13 congregations or libraries; [background comment] I
14 think that's a way that... a non-threatening way that
15 you're going to get people to come. You know, I
16 think that's as important, those kinds of decisions,
17 as the... making the process as least cumbersome as
18 possible, but to have places that are friendly
19 [background comment] to the community and perceived
20 that way; I think especially churches would be a
21 wonderful way of doing that, if you can.

22 BRYAN ELLICOTT: A suggestion I have is
23 that we use, for the trans community, the LGBT
24 centers we have in Manhattan, Staten Island and
25 Brooklyn, as those are places the transgender

1
2 community and even the immigration community feel
3 safe; that we should use those as open houses to
4 apply for the IDs.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So one of the
6 concerns that I have is ensuring that we have many..
7 all New Yorkers, 8.5 million New Yorkers, applying
8 for this card. I see an issue, moving forward, that
9 if there is not some type of a benefit attached to
10 it, that those who already have drivers licenses and
11 other types of identification might not be as
12 interested in this; [bell] do you have any
13 suggestions in terms of what type of benefits we
14 might attach to it that would bring other people in
15 who already have some type or form of identification?

16 SUE DORN: One of the thoughts some of us
17 had was if it could be in fact connected to a library
18 card; that that would be good for families as well,
19 and also help bringing children into the library so
20 that there would be another benefit from that.

21 BATYA MILLER: I think another
22 possibility is if you can get discounts, small
23 discounts at major institutions, like museums; that
24 could be very appealing to people, the fact that they
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

would save money with this card, you know, which you certainly don't do with your driver's license.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Right. Thank you for that. And we've been joined by Council Member Cabrera as well. Thank you so much. Thank you so much to this panel and we'll be looking forward to continuing our conversation.

We're gonna call up our next panel, Miss Mindy Tarlow from Operations and Commissioner Nisha Agarwal from MOIA, the Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs. And Council Members, you have their testimony in front of you. [background comments] Should we leg 'em know? [background comment] Just to clarify on the testimony that we have, there might be a page missing; can we double... [interpose]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Miss Tarlow, on your testimony, I think there might be a page missing.

MINDY TARLOW: I think we can provide a new copy. [background comment]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: It's okay; I mean we'll lis... yeah, we'll just... just to get this [background comments].

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Let's see if we
3 can get the whole testimony, but we'll go ahead and
4 start with your oral testimony. Thank you.

5 [background comments]

6 MINDY TARLOW: Good morning, Chairman
7 Menchaca, members of the Committee, Speaker Mark-
8 Viverito, colleagues in government, and members of
9 the public. My name's Mindy Tarlow and I'm the
10 Director of the Mayor's Office of Operations and on
11 behalf of the Administration I would like to thank
12 you, Chairman Menchaca and Council Member Dromm, for
13 introducing this vital legislation and for inviting
14 me to testify at this hearing. At the direction of
15 Mayor de Blasio, who has made the creation of a
16 municipal ID a signature priority of this
17 administration, my office has been working closely
18 with Commissioner Agarwal at the Mayor's Office of
19 Immigrant Affairs (MOIA) and numerous City agencies
20 to prepare for the timely and effective
21 implementation of this initiative, should the Council
22 approve it.

23 The municipal ID will be an ID for all,
24 every single New Yorker benefits by having a
25 government-issued photo identification card that can

1
2 be broadly recognized by New York City government
3 entities and private establishments. We support
4 development of an identification card program that
5 can be both widely utilized by New Yorkers of all
6 backgrounds and easily accessed by marginalized
7 populations.

8 For those of you who aren't familiar with
9 the Mayor's Office of Operations, we are responsible
10 for performance management and accountability across
11 all City agencies and as you probably know, we're
12 responsible for delivery of the Mayor's Management
13 Report, and under the de Blasio administration we
14 have additional functions that have been moved
15 underneath Operations, including the Center for
16 Economic Opportunity and the Mayor's Office of Data
17 Analytics so that we can more fully support the
18 Mayor's equality agenda. Finally, Operations
19 undertakes a range of cross-agency initiatives to
20 facilitate the effective implementation of citywide
21 projects and we're particularly focused on helping to
22 realize the Mayor's priority initiatives, such as
23 this one, the Municipal ID Program.

24 But before I discuss our planning around
25 the municipal ID I'd like to tell you a little bit

1
2 about my own experience regarding the importance of
3 expanding access to government identification for
4 marginalized populations.

5 Prior to joining the de Blasio
6 administration, I spent nearly two decades as the
7 founding CEO and Executive Director of the Center for
8 Employment Opportunities. The Center for Employment
9 Opportunities is a New York City-based national
10 organization that's exclusively dedicated to
11 connecting recently incarcerated individuals to
12 employment, and one of the often overlooked barriers
13 to reintegration for people with criminal records is
14 the lack of proper documentation, and my years at the
15 Center for Employment Opportunities vividly
16 demonstrated to me how important the securing of
17 government-issued photo identification can be in
18 helping people start down the pathway to legitimate
19 employment and securing basic essential services; I
20 saw it every day for two decades.

21 This Administration is committed to
22 helping all New Yorkers, including marginalized
23 populations, access the proposed municipal ID;
24 populations such as disconnected young adults,
25 seniors, homeless individuals, undocumented

1
2 immigrants, and formerly incarcerated persons are
3 some of the key demographic groups that have
4 historically retained government-issued photo
5 identification at lower rates than the population at
6 large and the municipal ID can and will vastly
7 improve this.

8 We support creating an enrollment model
9 for the municipal ID that will readily facilitate
10 access for all New Yorkers and incorporate fraud
11 prevention and security protocols to ensure the
12 integrity of the identification card. Should the
13 Council approve this legislation, we support a
14 municipal ID enrollment model that designates
15 multiple sites in each borough where New Yorkers can
16 apply for the municipal ID card.

17 As Council Members Menchaca and Dromm
18 have laid out in this bill, the process for applying
19 for a municipal ID card and demonstrating proof of
20 identity and residency will be similar to the
21 Department of Motor Vehicles' model -- individuals
22 will be required to demonstrate evidence of their
23 identity and residency by providing acceptable
24 documents and we support a system of weighted values
25 for documentation, similar to what is used by the

1
2 DMV. The City would leverage existing facilities as
3 intake centers, looking for sites and convenient
4 locations across a range of agencies covering all
5 five boroughs. We propose having two types of sites
6 where people can sign up for the municipal ID, what
7 we're calling "active sites" would be broadly
8 promoted as places the general public can visit to
9 sign up for the municipal ID. What we're calling
10 "passive sites" would include agencies where many
11 members of the public already go to receive services
12 and are likely to already have brought necessary
13 proof of identity and residency with them so they can
14 access the municipal ID at that time.

15 Turning to fraud prevention, we are
16 working closely with NYPD, other law enforcement
17 entities, government agencies that issue
18 identification cards and cities from around the
19 country who have implemented similar programs to
20 ensure we are incorporating all appropriate fraud
21 prevention and security procedures. Design of the
22 municipal ID card would be inspired by DMV-style
23 government-issued photo identification cards, but
24 with a distinct New York City branding. We would
25 embed a full array of security features into the

1
2 card, such as holographic laminates, special
3 cardstock material and engraved text.

4 With respect to records retention, we are
5 highly sensitive to the issue of document retention
6 and the concerns that have been raised by Council
7 Members and advocates alike. This administration is
8 emphatically committed to protecting the privacy of
9 the information gathered from this proposed
10 initiative and particularly attuned to safeguarding
11 any and all information that could potentially hint
12 at the immigration status of a cardholder. We would
13 employ every tool at our disposal to guarantee
14 protection of information submitted by applicants.

15 I believe that there is generally broad
16 consensus among the Administration, Council Members
17 and advocates about the municipal ID initiative and I
18 would like to commend the lead sponsors of the
19 legislation, Council Members Menchaca and Dromm, as
20 well as Speaker Mark-Viverito for crafting this bill.
21 I would however like to suggest a few items be
22 revisited. I would strongly encourage the Council to
23 consider allowing for more flexibility in the
24 administration of the municipal ID initiative by
25 mayoral agencies. Under this model the Mayor's

1 office could capitalize on the back end
2 infrastructure of the Human Resources Administration
3 (HRA) to ensure the successful implementation of the
4 municipal ID. My office, the Mayor's Office of
5 Operations, conducted an analysis comparing all City
6 agencies that could potentially perform this back end
7 function, including our own, and determined that HRA
8 is best positioned to undertake the back end
9 responsibilities necessary to successfully implement
10 and operate the municipal ID initiative. HRA has the
11 most relevant expertise in issuing identification
12 cards at scale, including reviewing and verifying the
13 authenticity of the identification. Considering the
14 aggressive timeline to make the municipal ID
15 available to the public this calendar year, HRA's
16 procurement infrastructure and administrative support
17 will cost-efficiently and swiftly get this program up
18 and running. HRA would support day to day
19 administration of the budget, procurement and general
20 back end office functionality regardless of HRA's
21 heavy involvement in the back end; however, they
22 would have no involvement and would not be associated
23 with the public branding of this initiative.
24

1
2 I also wanna emphasize that Mayor de
3 Blasio, Deputy Mayor Barrios-Paoli and HRA
4 Commissioner Steve Banks have committed HRA to a
5 mission of fighting inequality and poverty every
6 single day and the municipal ID is a key initiative
7 that will help HRA realize that essential mission.
8 My team and MOIA have worked closely with HRA
9 throughout the municipal ID planning process and we
10 can say firsthand that the senior leadership at the
11 agency is deeply committed to this initiative and
12 supporting the communities who will benefit from it.
13 I believe the Council and the Administration are
14 equally committed to the successful implementation of
15 the municipal ID and I hope you will consider
16 permitting HRA to conduct the back end office
17 functionality that can best position us to realize
18 that shared objective.

19 I would also like to suggest removing
20 Section 3-139 on penalties from the legislation. The
21 conduct being regulated in this section is already
22 captured by several provisions in the Penal Law.

23 One additional concern about Int. 253
24 that I would like to raise relates to the
25 availability of applications and intake of the

1 municipal ID. The legislation indicates the
2 Administration would make "applications for such card
3 available for pickup and submission at any agency or
4 office where there is substantial contact with the
5 public." This implies that any City facility that
6 serves the public would be a site where New Yorkers
7 could apply for the municipal ID; this would
8 represent thousands of locations around New York City
9 and could be logistically infeasible and cost-
10 prohibitive if it were implemented or taken literally
11 at its word, so we strongly suggest working with us
12 so that we can identify the best sites to offer
13 intake for the municipal ID that will navigate the
14 security, the cost, the technology; the staffing so
15 that we can address everything that we're trying to
16 address at each and every municipal ID site.

18 The de Blasio Administration is
19 enthusiastically committed to the swift, [bell]
20 secure and successful implementation of the municipal
21 ID initiative, the Mayor's Office of Immigrant
22 Affairs and the Mayor's Office of Operations will be
23 directly and intimately engaged in the planning and
24 implementation of the municipal ID and we look
25 forward to partnering with individual members of the

1
2 City Council and the many advocates and supports
3 across the City to generate robust public awareness
4 and tremendous citywide take-up of the municipal ID.

5 Thank you again for this opportunity to
6 testify on the municipal ID and it's now my privilege
7 to turn things over to my new colleague and friend,
8 Nisha Agarwal, Commissioner of the Mayor's Office of
9 Immigrant Affairs and we'll of course both be
10 available to answer any questions you'll have after
11 our testimony.

12 NISHA AGARWAL: Good morning. Thank you,
13 Mindy for the introduction and for so clearly laying
14 out the groundwork on the municipal ID. Thank you
15 again to Chairman Menchaca and Council Member Dromm,
16 members of the Committee, Speaker Mark-Viverito and
17 the Council as a whole for advancing such a critical
18 issue, and thank you, actually, to the first panel of
19 New Yorkers who spoke in support of this issue.

20 My name is Nisha Agarwal and I am the
21 Commissioner of the Mayor's Office of Immigrant
22 Affairs, or MOIA; I welcome the opportunity to speak
23 further about municipal ID.

24 As the Commissioner of MOIA, my role is
25 to advance our City-chartered mandate to work with

1
2 the Mayor and the Council to create policies and
3 programs that improve the lives of immigrant New
4 Yorkers; this mandate clearly encompasses today's
5 legislation for which we commend the Council's
6 leadership, and Mayor de Blasio's charge to us of
7 ensuring the creation and solid implementation of the
8 municipal ID card.

9 My office's work also includes
10 collaborating across the Administration to support
11 programs that bolster access to services and well-
12 being for all New Yorkers, whether their immigrant
13 ancestry is recent or generations ago. In that light
14 we are clear that the municipal ID is a
15 groundbreaking program that will reach beyond
16 immigrants to all of our communities.

17 Before I discuss the program in more
18 detail I would like to speak briefly about my own
19 professional experience which has centered on
20 increasing access to services for marginalized
21 populations, including but not limited to immigrants.
22 Before I joined the de Blasio Administration I worked
23 on increasing access to legal services for immigrant
24 New Yorkers and improving language access in health
25 care settings and government agencies. As a civil

1
2 rights lawyer I worked on cases and campaigns to
3 ensure that all New Yorkers, regardless of race,
4 citizenship, language or disability are able to
5 access all our city has to offer on equal terms.

6 Recently I was part of the Center for
7 Popular Democracy's research effort to study the
8 implementation of municipal identification cards
9 across the country as a vehicle to understand how our
10 city could learn and improve upon other cities'
11 programs. As such, increasing access to our city's
12 services, attractions and spaces to more New Yorkers
13 who currently struggle to obtain a basic entryway, a
14 form of government identification is a natural
15 continuation of my work over the years and a key
16 aspect of MOIA's leadership on the issues of equality
17 and unity. It's our view that the proposed municipal
18 identification card will serve as a unifying force
19 across many communities, providing valid
20 identification to many who have lacked access to
21 identification while providing meaningful benefits to
22 those who already have access to ID.

23 It is also our view that the municipal ID
24 would allow more New Yorkers of all backgrounds to
25 more easily access City services, public and private

1
2 programming and increase participation in our local
3 economy by accessing banking and financial
4 empowerment services.

5 Of course, part of our commitment is a
6 response to the very harsh realities faced by
7 undocumented immigrants, estimated to number
8 approximately half-a-million in New York City who
9 face numerous obstacles as a result of not having
10 government-issued identification. For example,
11 undocumented immigrants and other communities without
12 identification may fear law enforcement, are often
13 afraid to report housing and labor violations, or
14 have a harder time signing leases or opening bank
15 accounts or even visiting their children's schools.

16 I wanna emphasize that these obstacles
17 are not faced by our undocumented communities alone;
18 it is a real issue for many marginalized communities,
19 such as our elders, victims of domestic abuse,
20 runaway and other disconnected youth, the disabled,
21 transgendered individuals, and those who are
22 re-entering our society after incarceration. In
23 other words, it is clear that many communities beyond
24 immigrants will benefit from a municipal ID and
25 indeed, to avoid a reality in which the card is

1
2 viewed merely as an immigrant card, it is crucial
3 that the card have widespread appeal and we support a
4 program that meets this goal.

5 One of the ways we will meet this goal is
6 to build many benefits into the municipal ID so that
7 the card is meaningful to all New Yorkers. We are
8 still in the early stages of exploring for the
9 municipal ID, but I can share with you some of the
10 benefits that we support. To begin, the municipal ID
11 should be broadly recognized and accepted by City
12 agencies; we would like to ensure, for example, that
13 parents would be able to use the municipal ID to gain
14 entry into their child's school. Our goal is also
15 that the municipal ID will enable New Yorkers who
16 previously lacked government-issued identification to
17 better access private-sector services. For example,
18 our hope is that the municipal ID will serve as the
19 government-issued photo documented needed to get a
20 bank account so New Yorkers can avoid predatory
21 financial services and check-cashers.

22 These benefits and others will assist
23 communities that have been needlessly marginalized in
24 their day to day interactions with the City. But
25 again, I wanna emphasize that the municipal ID is an

1
2 identification card that will benefit all New
3 Yorkers, even those with government-issued photo ID.

4 If this legislation is enacted, we would
5 work with City agencies and private-sector entities
6 across the five boroughs to explore how we might
7 embed the municipal ID with benefits and discounts at
8 educational, arts and cultural institutions,
9 restaurants and other small businesses,
10 transportation, and an array of other services.

11 Importantly, even after the municipal ID
12 program has launched, it would important to continue
13 working to expand the suite of benefits available to
14 cardholders to ensure that this is a program that
15 grows over the years. We are open, of course, to
16 hearing ideas from the Council and others on
17 additional benefits and services that could be
18 attached to the card.

19 Beyond the benefits of municipal ID, I'd
20 like to share our ongoing efforts to engage
21 communities and learn from other cities' experiences.
22 To this end we've been hearing and learning from
23 three layers of advisers -- (1) are community
24 advocates representing the diverse communities in New
25 York; (2) municipalities who have implemented similar

1
2 programs across the country, and (3) our governmental
3 partners to support the program.

4 On the community level we have been in
5 active conversation with many groups -- the Arab
6 American Association of New York, the New York Legal
7 Assistance Group, Make the Road New York, The New
8 Economy Project, Faith in New York, the Center for
9 Popular Democracy, Picture the Homeless, Northern
10 Manhattan Coalition for Immigrant Rights, the New
11 York Civil Liberties Union, the New York Immigration
12 Coalition, and truly, many other leaders from the
13 advocacy, business and faith communities. These
14 groups, along with many others, have been extremely
15 helpful in informing our thinking.

16 In terms of other municipalities, we have
17 learned from the experiences of Oakland, Los Angeles
18 and San Francisco in California, as well as New Haven
19 in Connecticut. While the scale in these cities is
20 not comparable to New York, we have gleaned many
21 important lessons that will inform our effort here.

22 On the governmental side, we have spoken
23 to the New York City Department of Motor Vehicles at
24 the State level, governmental partners, such as CUNY
25 and all three of New York City's library systems, and

1
2 many City agencies, including the Department of
3 Homeless Services, the Department of Corrections,
4 NYPD, the Mayor's Community Affairs Unit, the
5 Department of Cultural Affairs, the Department of
6 Finance, the Department of Environmental Protection,
7 the Department of Consumer Affairs, the Taxi and
8 Limousine Commission, the Small Business Services,
9 the Department of Transportation, the Department of
10 Parks and Recreation, and others. Our agencies have
11 been incredibly committed to the success of this
12 proposed program and I have no doubt that robust
13 partnerships with our agencies will be at the heart
14 of the municipal ID.

15 We are clear that the widespread adoption
16 is critical for the card to be most meaningful and
17 have preliminary ideas for an expansive outreach
18 strategy to reach every neighborhood through a
19 citywide campaign. For any outreach effort on
20 municipal ID, MOIA would work closely with the
21 Mayor's Community Affairs Unit and Operations,
22 alongside our trusted community partners who have
23 proposed working closely with us to accomplish our
24 shared goals of seeing the municipal ID get into the
25 hands of as many New Yorkers as possible. We would

1
2 also look to partner with the Department of Education
3 and other City agencies with strong and widespread
4 touch points across all five boroughs. We would also
5 plan to leverage the capacity of our agencies and the
6 Mayor's Community Affairs Unit, who already have
7 relationships in the community, to provide accurate
8 information on the program and help steer residents
9 to efficiently access the card. We would anticipate
10 promoting the card through social media, community
11 and educational institutions, notable New Yorkers,
12 like yourselves, foreign consulates, faith-based
13 institutions and beyond, and we look forward to the
14 prospect of working with your local offices to help
15 your constituents get the municipal ID and make the
16 program a resounding success.

17 Thank you again for inviting us to
18 provide testimony; I welcome any questions, along
19 with Director Tarlow, now or at any time after the
20 hearing.

21 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you
22 Commissioner and thank you Director, and what I wanna
23 just underscore really is your testimony, both of
24 your testimonies kinda show a real commitment on the
25 Administration to understand this, your multiple

1
2 conversations with really, probably all agencies kind
3 of show a breath of understanding about how this
4 piece of legislation as it's written is gonna impact
5 the Administration and how to get this out quickly.
6 Every agency adds on the table, so thank you so much
7 for confirming that for us; this is something that
8 we've been engaged in conversation. So I'm gonna
9 start the questions off and then I'm gonna open it up
10 to our council members. But really what I wanted to
11 understand is, in your legislative recommendations,
12 as we kind of continue to evolve this bill, you
13 mentioned increasing agencies that can come in and
14 help out the efficacy of this bill; can you talk a
15 little bit about the procurement process and I think
16 you give the dynamics of it, but what compels the
17 Administration to understand procurement and its
18 benefits [background comment] for HRA?

19 MINDY TARLOW: I think there is multiple
20 things at work here -- (1) I think you pointed out is
21 just the speed and efficacy with which we're trying
22 to get this very important and complex initiative off
23 the ground, [background comment] and the initiative
24 itself has a lot of moving parts; it has to do with
25 technology, it has to do with understanding of how ID

1
2 cards are put together and used, it has to do with
3 just knowledge and experience about procurement in
4 general and the speed with which you can put those
5 things together and having the underlying apparatus
6 and experience to do that. I referenced in my
7 testimony that Operations had done an evaluation of
8 multiple agencies who could conceivably have one or
9 more of those kinds of experience and HRA had all of
10 them, and we felt that given the complexity of this
11 initiative, the speed with which we're trying to get
12 it to happen and the importance of it to both the
13 Council and to the Administration, we felt in our due
14 diligence in preparation for hoping that this will go
15 forward, that was the conclusion that we drew, that
16 HRA was the most well-positioned to play that role.

17 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Does that affect
18 cost as well? Is... [interpose]

19 MINDY TARLOW: Uhm...

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: is there a cost
21 savings in moving to this multiple agency approach?

22 MINDY TARLOW: Yes, ultimately I think
23 there will be; we're still of course working out the
24 cost proposals; we're... we're... [interpose, crosstalk]

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Can you tell us
3 about what the costs are... [crosstalk]

4 MINDY TARLOW: we're really working on
5 budget process right now; as everyone knows, we're
6 deeply engaged in that, so what we're trying to do is
7 just develop a budget framework that matches and
8 compliments the vision that I laid out in the
9 testimony and we're working on that right now. But
10 we do think this is the most cost-effective and...
11 because time is money, as we all know, and
12 [background comment] for something to happen quickly,
13 that generally means it's more cost-efficient.

14 NISHA AGARWAL: And the one thing I would
15 just add to what Director Tarlow said is that, you
16 know one possibility, right, would be to create a
17 separate apparatus for implementation of the
18 municipal ID, but of course, that comes with all of
19 its, for lack of a better word, overhead. If we
20 leverage existing agencies that we have that already
21 have the procurement functions, have all of those
22 different administrative functions built in and have
23 been doing it at volume, we save the program a
24 considerable amount of money.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Gotcha. Okay. I
3 have some other questions, but I wanna give Council
4 Members the time and opportunity; we've been joined
5 by Council Member Antonio Reynoso and I'm gonna give
6 it up to Council Member Dromm.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So I just wanna go
8 a little bit more to the cost as well. Have we
9 thought about partnering with businesses or banks,
10 MasterCard, anything like that; there are models in
11 other cities that I've heard of that have done that,
12 that have seen those types of businesses pick up the
13 cost for it; what's your opinion on that; have you
14 thought about that and can you give us a little bit
15 more information about that?

16 NISHA AGARWAL: Sure. So, you know we
17 have conducted research into the feasibility of
18 adding a banking component to the municipal ID; at
19 least at the initial stages we don't anticipate that
20 we'll incorporate a debit component into the
21 municipal ID card when it's issued this year, just
22 because we don't have confidence we can offer a truly
23 safe and affordable product that effectively meets
24 the needs of low-income New Yorkers. If options
25 available were to evolve, we would of course

1
2 reconsider accordingly; that said, the Administration
3 is working very closely with the Department of
4 Consumer Affairs and the Office of Financial
5 Empowerment to identify banks and credit unions
6 across the City that are eager to accept the
7 municipal ID as a form of identification for
8 accessing bank accounts and non-predatory financial
9 services. So we're confident that the municipality
10 [sic] will provide financial access in that way, from
11 the outset, or at least we're having those initial
12 conversations and they're going well.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So my question, a
14 little bit different, I think; has there been any
15 consideration about having one of those businesses
16 pick up the cost for that? So in other words, that
17 they would cover the cost of production of the card.

18 NISHA AGARWAL: So, you know I can speak
19 to... we have not spoken, at least for the financial
20 institutions, about that issue, but we're exploring a
21 variety of different models in terms of the costing
22 and the budgeting at this point, but nothing specific
23 to share.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So is there any
25 timeline in terms of your mind what you would

1
2 consider for the vendor to be selected as we move
3 down the road?

4 [background comment]

5 MINDY TARLOW: We have set some
6 timeframes for trying to get this grounded within the
7 calendar year, so that sets the stage and that's one
8 of the reasons we've tried to do a lot of due
9 diligence now; you know, obviously this is a critical
10 part of the process here today and we're not trying
11 to -- what's the right phrase -- get over our skis,
12 but we're trying to do the due diligence that's
13 necessary so that we're ready to press go and you
14 know we did set this calendar year timeframe in front
15 of us and we're trying to make good on that, should
16 this go forward.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So I believe that
18 the Mayor originally spoke about allocating about
19 \$400,000 for the initial startup of this.

20 MINDY TARLOW: That was in the February
21 financial plan, yes, for the planning process.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So how much money
23 will be allocated moving forward for outreach and
24 education?

25

1
2 MINDY TARLOW: We are working on the
3 budget right now and as I said earlier, it has a lot
4 of moving parts, as does the budget as a whole and
5 we're deeply engaged in that right now and trying to
6 create a budget for this project that matches the
7 vision that we laid out in the testimony around the
8 hub and spoke model of having the intake centers and
9 the back end functionality that we described, the
10 kind of outreach that Nisha described; we're trying
11 to put all that together right now and looking at
12 different kinds of modeling and imbedding that within
13 the budget discussions that are going on right now.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay. Thank you,
15 Mr. Chair.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, Council
17 Member. Council Member Koo.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you Chair
19 Menchaca and Council Member Dromm for this wonderful,
20 very important initiative. Thank you, Commissioners.

21 My first question for you is; you know,
22 we all know this municipal ID card is really good,
23 really important to new immigrants or undocumented
24 immigrants, but there is a stigma attached to it and
25 people told me, why do I wanna apply a card that even

1
2 though I'm documented? So my thought is, in order to
3 solve that problem we... like you said, we encourage
4 all citizens from New York City to apply, but why
5 would a citizen or other immigrants that have already
6 proper IDs to apply a municipal ID? So there must be
7 an incentive there, so in order for us, and including
8 our council members; the Mayor may be the first one
9 to apply for one, you know [background comments,
10 laughter] and in order for other people to do the
11 same thing, we have to have some incentive or make it
12 really usable. Now say we combine it with a MTA
13 card, you know, everybody use a MTA card, there's no
14 distinguish when use... this card... nobody know you're
15 second-class or first-class or whatever, you know.
16 [background comment] So my suggestion is... because on
17 the MTA card there are a lot of space and like this
18 one is Grand Central Station, do the advertisement
19 there, no, 100 years and this would be one of the
20 ideas you know because I don't know if MTA will agree
21 to that because with this you can add money to the
22 card and you can use every day, and the black one is
23 a... this a municipal ID card too; just one of the
24 thoughts. [background comments] And another thing I
25 wanna ask you is, with this municipal ID, suppose one

1
2 carried this and they go on interstate travel on a
3 bus and the bus stop by immigration service, they
4 check IDs, with this... [bell] is this okay for
5 immigration purpose; would they... would the immigrant
6 official detain the passenger because they carry this
7 kind of municipal ID? [background comment]

8 NISHA AGARWAL: So I can respond about
9 this question. So we could not... the Administration
10 could not agree more, that this is a card that has to
11 have benefits and incentives built into it that make
12 it appealing to all New Yorkers, which is the reason
13 why we've been having conversations both with other
14 agencies within City government as well as with
15 private-sector entities to figure out, are there ways
16 to get, as was mentioned in the prior panel,
17 discounts at cultural institutions so that parents
18 and students can access all that New York City has to
19 offer and really expand their education, right; make
20 New York City the platform for their education, using
21 the municipal ID card. So that is absolutely
22 something that we are very focused on and working on
23 and when the card is launched, it will have benefits
24 not only for undocumented immigrants, but really that
25 will make you and everyone else wanna sign up first

1
2 to get the ID, so we are hard at work on that. On
3 the issue of interstate travel and some other issues
4 that cards may be used for, like drivers licenses,
5 one of the things that we should look at is whether
6 we should have warning language on the card about
7 what purposes the card cannot be used for, 'cause we
8 have... the City has limited authority about what cards
9 can be accepted for state and federal purposes and
10 we'll wanna properly inform and educate the users of
11 the card about the limitations as well, so that's
12 something we've been exploring preliminarily and
13 would certainly continue if this bill were to pass
14 and we were to implement.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Can I... [crosstalk]

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

17 Council Member Cabrera.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Can you... can you...
19 one more... just real quick... [crosstalk]

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Quick follow up.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Can you use the card
22 for like get on the airplanes?

23 NISHA AGARWAL: That's... the use of
24 identification for that purpose is actually not
25 within the City's authority, that's a federal issue

1
2 and so we would need to inform people... the federal
3 government about those limitations.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. We're
6 gonna adhere to the strict two minutes per council
7 member. Council Member Cabrera.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
9 much and I'll take 10 seconds of that. To Mr. Chair
10 and Council Member Dromm, I really wanna take a
11 moment to praise you for really putting a tremendous
12 amount of time; I don't think people realize how much
13 time you have dedicated to this cause and I know
14 Council Member Dromm, for years you have, as the
15 former Chair, have indeed given a tremendous amount
16 of effort and now is gonna become a reality, so I
17 compliment both of you. I'm gonna make a quick
18 statement and then I'll follow up with a question,
19 since I only have a minute-and-a-half. I wanna
20 follow up with Council Member Dromm's question, that
21 it would seem to me it will make sense to add the
22 banking piece to it, and let me tell you why, for a
23 couple of reasons -- (1) if we change our minds later
24 on, it's gonna cost us a tremendous amount of money,
25 and to say the least, headaches; (2) why not have a

1
2 public-private kind of setup that really, it'll
3 defray all the cost; this is gonna cost us millions
4 of dollars; I could tell you, based on what I've seen
5 in Oakland, minimum we're gonna be spending \$50
6 million, minimum. I would encourage you to really do
7 the research on this; I would rather use those \$50
8 million for something else, and let the private
9 sector pay for it; they have the money, they can
10 afford it, and they wanna do it; that's the really
11 interesting piece here; they really wanna do it and
12 it will be a win-win situation and having said that,
13 the banking piece I think is important; I think we're
14 leaving it to kind of a luck, chance situation and
15 based on the history, what we have seen in other
16 municipalities, banks tend not to [bell] be amicable
17 to the idea of using these IDs in order for them to
18 get banking; I think this would empower our people
19 and, respect to the Chair, I'll stop here. But
20 please, if you could address that; at least stay
21 open-minded as we go through this process.

22 NISHA AGARWAL: Sure. So thank you;
23 that's a very legitimate point. One thing to be very
24 clear on is that we are designing the system, or at
25 least our initial plans would not foreclose the

1 possibility of adding banking features later on, so
2 the concern about the cost escalating because we
3 didn't think of it at the outset I think is
4 somewhat alleviated, because we're... that's very much
5 on our radar screen. We also, on the other side,
6 wanna be sure that we are as thoughtful and as
7 protective of the needs of low-income New Yorkers who
8 we wanna be able to provide a safe, affordable,
9 effective financial product to; that's a very serious
10 consideration, and so while we're open-minded, we do
11 wanna be very thoughtful about how we implement that
12 and that's sort of our thinking at the moment.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.
15 Next I wanna give it up to my brother from Brooklyn,
16 Council Member Reynoso.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you,
18 Chair, thank you so much; I'm really happy to be here
19 at this moment with you Chairing this hearing and
20 speaking on an issue that I think is extremely
21 important. I'm gonna say one thing that I haven't
22 thought out and one thing that I have. When it comes
23 to our youth and being able to have them participate
24 in this program, I think it's extremely important; it
25 might be a little difficult, our incentivizing or the

1
2 programs that we have to incentivize folks to join
3 this program, it might not be attractive to people
4 that have state IDs already; the resources or the
5 gains that they get from having a City ID might not
6 be attractive; I'm hoping that we could implement a
7 very early age in which you can obtain this ID, even
8 as low as 12 years old, because then once they're
9 there, they're gonna cycle through and continue to
10 maintain or have this ID, so maybe in 40, 50, even 60
11 years every single person can have this ID and we
12 would eliminate the stigma of only undocumented
13 having it, [background comment] so just being mindful
14 of that. [background comment] And well, what are
15 you thoughts on it?

16 NISHA AGARWAL: Sure. So we... that's very
17 much something the Administration is looking into and
18 supports and access for young people to this
19 identification is something that we're thinking
20 about; of course, with appropriate protections for
21 minors, you know, that may be necessary and so, I
22 would say I agree and we will also be having
23 conversations with the Department of Ed and other
24 agencies that work with young people to be able to
25

1
2 leverage some of their resources as well to reach
3 that population.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: And then the
5 last part was -- I'm a biker, I bike, and this might
6 not be popular and I haven't thought this one out,
7 [background comment] but maybe there's an opportunity
8 here for, you know, proper biking, riding in the City
9 of New York and having to go through a course and
10 maybe obtaining this [background comment] ID through
11 that as well; just thought I'd bring it up; maybe
12 it's an idea that could also work. [bell] But thank
13 you for being here and good job, by the way.

14 NISHA AGARWAL: Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, Council
16 Member Reynoso. And now we'll hand it over to
17 Council Member Eugene.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
19 much, Mr. Chair and thank you to each one of you for
20 your testimony. To Miss Mindy Tarlow, [background
21 comment] in your testimony you mentioned that we
22 propose; that's your nice pose [sic], we proposing
23 having the two type of site where people can sign up
24 for the municipal ID; you mentioned active site and
25 passive site; where those sites would be located;

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

would they be located in government building, in government agencies, private institution or private organization, and what will be the process to choose them if they would be located in private institutions?

MINDY TARLOW: So we're looking at a wide range of sites right now and I... I... I did wanna reference the earlier panel and was encouraged to hear that they were thinking along similar lines; that made us feel that we're also on the right track. We're looking at sites that are government, but also community-based, where people would go for other kinds of services that cover a broad range of things, whether it's parks or whether it's libraries, things like that, where people would normally go; we consider those active sites and we're trying to make sure that they cover a wide range of topics so that it would draw a wide range of people and also make sure that they cover a wide range of geographies and that they cover all boroughs, and we're looking at a number of different options and we're trying to talk to as many people as possible so that we can get the broadest range of options available.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: In terms of the
3 whole process, will you create an agency to oversee
4 the process or to oversee all the sites?

5 MINDY TARLOW: What we're proposing to do
6 is to have the Mayor's Office, sort of broadly
7 speaking -- Operations, the Mayor's Office of
8 Immigrant Affairs, the Community Assistance Unit, the
9 groups that [bell] Commissioner Agarwal was
10 describing earlier -- oversee the project at large
11 and make sure that we have the right kind of
12 communication and interaction with the active sites,
13 but also, make sure that we're working closely with
14 the back office operation to make sure that the IDs
15 are properly administered, that the program is
16 properly put on the ground; the technology and
17 procurement process is adequately secured. So we
18 would try to have the Mayor's Office, again, sort of
19 generally speaking, oversee the whole process.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
21 much. [background comment] Thank you, Mr. Chair.

22 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Council
23 Member Eugene. And I'm gonna round it off with some...
24 a series of questions, just to kind of really fill in
25 the experience of New Yorkers, and the first one I

1
2 wanted to ask about was, maybe right after, kinda
3 thinking about the mobility of this program and how
4 it's gonna interact with New Yorkers; how are you
5 gonna evaluate, (1), and do you have a plan to
6 evaluate the current kind of front end workers, and
7 how are you thinking that out? And on the flip side;
8 how are you evaluating the experience of every New
9 Yorker, and we've kind of talked a lot about seniors,
10 LGBT community, our undocumented immigrants, and
11 evaluating their experience as well and kinda share
12 that?

13 NISHA AGARWAL: So I can start and then,
14 you know, our goal would be, in terms of the front
15 end staff, to have a very extensive and thorough
16 training program for them to be able to, you know,
17 look at and sort of identify the veracity of
18 documents that are presented for identity and
19 residency and to have a kind of cadre of people who
20 are focused on municipal ID as the individuals who
21 would be doing some of the front end work, and in
22 addition, you know, I think part of what you're
23 asking is, would they have the kind of cultural
24 competency training, the sort of linguistic support,
25 the other kinds of training that's needed to make the

1
2 card truly accessible at the point of contact, and
3 that's of course something that we would work to
4 ensure is the case so the training is not just, are
5 these documents real or not, but the training is, how
6 do we make this a welcoming process for people who
7 wanna get the card, so absolutely. And then in terms
8 of about... oh, sorry.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Before you go to
10 the second component, and just stay on the kind of
11 worker experience, language access; can you really
12 talk about that and really the commitment to language
13 access for New Yorkers?

14 NISHA AGARWAL: Sure. So the commitment
15 on language access, I will say personally is an
16 issue, very near and dear to my heart; that's the
17 work I started doing in my career as a lawyer and
18 it's very important to the Mayor, and so in
19 implementing this program, along with all of the
20 other major initiatives that have been happening,
21 like universal pre-K, etc., there will be, you know,
22 translated materials available for people, the access
23 to interpretation services, all of the basic language
24 access services, as we have at this hearing, right,
25 to make it possible for New Yorkers of all languages

1
2 and all backgrounds to be able to access the program.
3 So I'll just emphasize that commitment now.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And then the
5 second part to the question about the kind of
6 experience that New Yorkers are gonna have and how
7 you plan to evaluate that; how are we gonna know and
8 hopefully in real time that this is a highly
9 accessible, but great experience?

10 MINDY TARLOW: I think that the Mayor's
11 Office of Operations, along with MOIA, we actually
12 have a very close-working relationship around
13 language access and among other things; we do a lot
14 of work around customer service and I think that we
15 will come up with ways of using that experience to
16 make sure that we can test and survey New Yorkers to
17 make sure that their experience is a good experience
18 and use the things at our disposal to make sure that
19 we are finding out how the public is experiencing
20 municipal ID and you know, try to come up with some
21 creative ways to really understand that experience.

22 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Next question is,
23 Director Tarlow, what kind of outreach to previously
24 incarcerated people would be successful in getting
25

1
2 municipal IDs in... really into their hands and can you
3 kinda drill down on that point for us?

4 MINDY TARLOW: Right and if I had another
5 hat I would put it on right now. [laughter] I think
6 that New York City has one of the strongest
7 community-based apparatus in the country in terms of
8 people who deal with formerly incarcerated people,
9 especially those who are just coming home and
10 reintegrating into their communities, so I would tap
11 into that network; it's quite robust, and that would
12 be my first stop, would be to engage that community,
13 it's where people are going for services, it's where
14 people feel... it's a place of trust and comfort and I
15 think that would be my first thought, would be to
16 engage that community.

17 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And we're really
18 looking forward to your expertise on this as we
19 continue to develop... develop the program.

20 [interpose, crosstalk]

21 MINDY TARLOW: And I would be delighted
22 to share it.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: The next question
24 is really for... for you again on... or actually, for
25 both of you on understanding the consulate IDs and it

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

kind of come into ecosystem in New York City, you've heard from the first panelists a little bit about that experience, and so, have you reached out to the consulates and what's your conversation in really understanding what they bring to the table in understanding identification [background comment] being part of the weighted point system to [background comment] get a municipal ID?

NISHA AGARWAL: Yes. So we are engaging... the Mayor's Office of Urban Affairs has historically worked with the consulate offices, as you can imagine, on a range of different issues and we are sitting down with them to learn both about their consular ID process as well as to understand how some of the IDs and the programs that they have may interface with the municipal ID, and so that's a conversation that's ongoing, and you know, I think the consulates will may be important partners in outreach and some of the consulates that have ID programs that have done outreach efforts, they have people coming at 6 in the morning to line up for this card and there's clearly a pent-up demand for identification cards of this sort, and one of things they've done well is actually doing some of that

1
2 outreach in the community itself, not requiring
3 people to come into Manhattan to obtain the consular
4 ID, and so we'd like to learn from those experiences
5 and we'd like to partner with the consulates very
6 much on outreach in addition to understanding the
7 kind of ID mechanics as well.

8 MINDY TARLOW: Just; not to pick up on
9 that, which I think was beautifully stated, but back
10 to your earlier question, one additional thought is
11 about the Department Probation, which, as you know,
12 is a sentence in and of itself where people are going
13 for the first time; again, another really important
14 agency in the community that might be a very, very
15 important, as we were saying earlier, passive site
16 that people can go to directly to get a municipal ID,
17 because they're going to probation for other
18 services, and I think they're a very important agency
19 to engage and Commissioner Bermudez I'm sure would be
20 a really great active partner in this effort.

21 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And really, in
22 kinda thinking about the kinda mechanics of this, for
23 New Yorkers who are homeless, and really maybe can
24 you describe just the process that you'd imagine;
25 someone goes into a mobile passive active site, they

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

apply; what's the time... the lag time; [background comment] is it mailed; can you kinda describe a little bit about what you're thinking on that?

MINDY TARLOW: Yeah, I mean the idea would be that somebody comes into a site, passively or actively, they sign up for the ID, they give their paperwork, that then gets processed on-site, that gets sent to the back end site for final processing, and when the card is ready it does get mailed out to their official address and we will be working with experts in the field about how you get a card out to somebody who doesn't in fact have a permanent address and there, fortunately or unfortunately, is a lot of expertise out in the field about that, whether it's, you know finding folks who are in shelter or finding folks who are transient and moving from one place to another and we're very committed and have already started some of those conversations about how best to contact those folks who don't have a permanent address.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And last, any other questions... Council Member Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Hi again. When we talk about housing, especially lotteries in

1
2 affordable housing, a lot of times; actually, all the
3 time you need to input your social security number,
4 you have to add your social security number and
5 unfortunately many folks don't have social security
6 numbers that in the City of New York are allowed to
7 apply, but there's obstacles obviously in the way and
8 that's one of them. I've put in legislation to allow
9 for a tax identification number to be used in place
10 of social security for an application, an affordable
11 housing application; what I'm hoping is that that
12 legislation is obsolete or is not needed, because
13 these IDs will work as an opportunity to apply for
14 affordable housing for anyone that's a resident of
15 the City of New York. Do you think that that's gonna
16 be something that, working alongside HPD we might be
17 able to accomplish through this ID?

18 NISHA AGARWAL: So we are in conversation
19 with many agencies, including HPD, to understand, you
20 know, whether it's signing up for a lease where you
21 have to show identification or accessing different
22 programs, to ensure that the identification card is
23 accepted broadly across City agencies, so that's
24 certainly a commitment. One thing we won't be able
25 to change with the ID card is what the rules and

1
2 requirements might be that are made at the state or
3 the federal level, so to the extent that there are
4 limitations imposed on that, that's not entirely
5 within our control, but whatever is within our
6 control we will of course wanna increase access to
7 the maximum extent possible.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Council
9 Member Reynoso. And really, I just wanna clarify
10 something -- I'm just kinda reading the Twitter feeds
11 -- and that this card is not gonna be able to be used
12 for interstate travel; this is a municipal ID that
13 will work in New York City and really only in New
14 York City and that this card essentially doesn't
15 really... this card lives within the bounds of the
16 state and federal laws, [background comment] and so
17 do one of you wanna expand on that a little bit?

18 NISHA AGARWAL: Absolutely. There is
19 nothing about this identification card that will
20 break state or federal laws, it is a community-
21 building, it's an access-creating card for New York
22 City and that's some of what its power is, is that
23 it's a New York City card for New Yorkers; well, you
24 know, were we able to change the federal and state
25 laws, I would have a lot of ideas on that, but we

1
2 are, for now, you know we have the power to do what
3 we can at the city level. [interpose]

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish]
5 [laughter] Okay. Well thank you so much; we're
6 gonna get some other panelists up; [background
7 comment] thank you so much for your time and we look
8 forward to working with you.

9 MINDY TARLOW: Thank you very much.

10 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And our next
11 panel, we'd like to call up Johanna Miller from New
12 York Civil Liberties Union, Emily Tucker from Center
13 for Popular Democracy, Steven Choi from the New York
14 Immigration Coalition, and Miss Deyanira Del Rio from
15 the New Economy Project. Please come on up. And I
16 do wanna say that we had a couple Twitter questions
17 about language access and we asked it; this is from
18 Christina S. Chang, from the MinKwon Center; thank
19 you so much for saying that question, and really
20 continue, if you wanna engage us, on #nycID. Thank
21 you. And we're waiting for one more. Steven, can
22 you start, please?

23 STEVEN CHOI: Sure.

24 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.
25

1
2 STEVEN CHOI: Good morning; my name is
3 Steve Choi and I'm the Executive Director of the New
4 York Immigration Coalition, an umbrella organization
5 with nearly 200 member organizations.

6 On behalf of New York City's vibrant and
7 diverse immigrant communities, who continue to face
8 barriers in accessing government-issued
9 identification, we believe that the municipal ID
10 envisioned by this legislation, an ID available to
11 all New Yorkers, would go a long way to break down
12 the stigmatizing barriers for immigrants. My
13 testimony is informed by the New York Immigration
14 Coalition's experiences and the crushing consequences
15 of a lack of proper identification are a common theme
16 in our work. Time and time we've heard stories of
17 individuals who are not able to provide identity to
18 hospitals, of parents who cannot enter their child's
19 school and New Yorkers who cannot open bank accounts.
20 But we've also seen how strong policy can break down
21 these barriers. With the support of the City
22 Council, the NYIC was able to begin the Key to the
23 City Consular ID Initiative to work with the
24 consulates to provide over 19,000 New Yorkers with
25 services and nearly 13,000 people have stood in line

1
2 for hours to receive these critical identify
3 documents. These consular ID initiatives have not
4 only shown the incredible need in immigrant
5 communities, but have also provided a model structure
6 for engaging partners in successfully reaching
7 diverse communities.

8 I also wanna emphasize today that the
9 best ID for immigrants will be an ID widely adopted
10 by non-immigrants. The muni ID cannot be a proxy for
11 undocumented status; it should be a badge of civic
12 pride that unites all residents, but it will only be
13 so if it is linked to a robust package of discounts,
14 privileges and other benefits that will appeal to
15 everyone. And to that end, we believe it will be
16 critical to establish a joint task force of the
17 Administration, City Council and community
18 organizations to bring this package to life. We must
19 also ensure that the application process is smooth
20 and secure, that City agencies are properly trained
21 and above all, the confidentiality of personal
22 documents and information must be guaranteed. [bell]

23 In conclusion, we at the Coalition look
24 forward to working closely with the Administration
25 and the City Council to make municipal IDs a reality

1
2 and I know I cannot wait to get my own New York City
3 municipal card myself. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: I'll be right
5 there with you. Thank you. Johanna.

6 JOHANNA MILLER: Hi, good morning. My
7 name is Johanna Miller; I'm the Advocacy Director at
8 the New York Civil Liberties Union, speaking today on
9 behalf of our 50,000 members statewide.

10 We are pleased to be here today to join
11 our allies in supporting the access that the NYC ID
12 promises to diverse New York communities, but in the
13 interest of time I'm gonna focus my comments on one
14 of our primary concerns, which is for the privacy of
15 applicants for the ID card.

16 We commend the City Council for designing
17 legislation that protects against the risks of
18 disclosure of applicants' private information to the
19 maximum extent possible. Closely linked with making
20 the NYC ID appealing to broad communities is the
21 City's promise that people's information will not be
22 entered into a database or shared with third parties.
23 The current language in the bill prohibiting
24 retention is the best way to guarantee this promise;
25 we applaud the Council for including that language.

1
2 These foundational documents are some of
3 the most sensitive pieces of information that people
4 have -- passports, benefit cards, pay stubs, bank
5 statements, information about their children's public
6 school attendance -- these are things that people
7 don't even want disclosed to family members; it is
8 essential that the City takes the same care in
9 preserving privacy.

10 Revelations about the NSA's domestic
11 spying program and public outrage over New York State
12 Education Department's contract with data servicer
13 inBloom speak loudly to the public's wariness about
14 government abuse of privacy rights. So retaining the
15 documents we think creates an unnecessary risk of
16 disclosure. The threat is not abstract; as you
17 probably know, in New Haven the information about
18 people who had the municipal ID was requested by
19 anti-immigrant activists who said they were gonna
20 turn it over to ICE; New Haven was able to defeat
21 that request, but we think that the threat of
22 something like that actually defeats some of the
23 broad appeal of the ID and could scare away potential
24 applicants [bell] that the City needs to make this
25 program a success. So we fully support the work

1
2 you've put in to protecting confidentiality and we're
3 happy to continue providing our expertise in that
4 area.

5 EMILY TUCKER: Good afternoon and thanks
6 to Councilman Menchaca and the Immigration Committee
7 for convening today's hearing and for inviting me to
8 testify on this important issue. My name is Emily
9 Tucker and I'm a Staff Attorney at the Center for
10 Popular Democracy in Brooklyn, where I support state
11 and local initiatives to promote immigrant rights and
12 promote racial justice and economic justice.

13 One of the things I've seen over and over
14 again in the communities I work with is how seemingly
15 small changes in circumstances can lead to huge
16 improvements in the well-being of individuals,
17 families and whole cities. At CPD we look for
18 initiatives like this which often simply by removing
19 obstacles to basic goods, like health and security
20 that most of us take for granted will enable people
21 to live better, happier lives. Municipal ID is one
22 such initiative and I'm here today to voice my full
23 support and the support of my organization for this
24 legislation that would bring IDs to New York City.

1
2 Access to a widely-accepted form of ID is
3 a right, but increasingly in this country we treat it
4 as a privilege, a privilege that tends to go along
5 with other privileges of race, of class and of
6 citizenship. Many of us take IDs so much for granted
7 that we don't even realize how much we rely on it.
8 Over the last decade it's become increasingly crucial
9 to have ID, increasingly difficult to get ID and
10 increasingly risky to share personal information with
11 the government agencies that issue ID; at the same
12 time, ID continues to gate-keep every aspect of life.

13 In response to this problem, a wave of
14 municipalities across the country have enacted local
15 ID car programs, starting with New Haven, Connecticut
16 and now including San Francisco, Oakland, Richmond,
17 Los Angeles in California, Asbury Park and Mercer
18 County in New Jersey, and Washington D.C. Campaigns
19 are also currently underway in cities as diverse as
20 Phoenix, Philadelphia and Chicago. The programs in
21 these jurisdictions take a variety of forms and have
22 a range of different features tailored to the
23 particular localities they serve; my organization has
24 researched all the existing programs and we've
25 identified several key features that we believe will

1
2 be important for municipal ID cards to be successful
3 here in New York City.

4 The first of these is accessibility;
5 [bell] in order for a city ID to actually serve the
6 purpose for which it's designed, it has to be more
7 accessible than existing forms of state and federal
8 ID, and that means the application process has to be
9 clear and simple and the methods of proving residency
10 and identity in order to qualify for the card must be
11 flexible. That doesn't mean verification of identity
12 and residency can't be robust, it just means the
13 program has to be designed to fit with the particular
14 circumstances of those in this City that typically
15 have trouble getting ID. The next piece is privacy;
16 I'm not gonna go into that, 'cause I think Johanna's
17 covered that very well, but we found that the cities
18 that have the most robust privacy policies -- San
19 Francisco being an example, and you'll hear from
20 someone from San Francisco later today -- tend to
21 have the highest rates of adoption. The last piece
22 is broad appeal -- as other folks have mentioned, we
23 don't want the card to become a scarlet letter where
24 an individual is assumed to be a member of one or
25 more vulnerable groups simply by virtue of being a

1
2 cardholder and the best way to avoid this is to
3 ensure the card appeals to and is adopted by as broad
4 a cross section of the population as possible; many
5 jurisdictions have done this -- Los Angeles and San
6 Francisco -- and the cards there are viewed as
7 legitimate and viewed as non-stigmatizing.

8 The last thing I wanna say is that it's
9 crucial to all of the communities in New York City
10 that support this card that the NYPD accept it, that
11 they view it as a legitimate way of proving your
12 identity and they accept it for the purpose of
13 issuing summonses.

14 Though there are many variables that can
15 impact the success of an ID card program, our
16 research shows that these are especially fundamental
17 and we're excited to see that the current draft bill
18 addresses all of these points. We're lucky to be in
19 a position to learn from the other jurisdictions that
20 have already implemented municipal ID card programs
21 and we have a chance to make New York [cough] card
22 the best in the country.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, Miss
24 Tucker. Miss Del Rio.

1
2 DEYANIRA DEL RIO: Thanks. Hi, good
3 morning...

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.

5 DEYANIRA DEL RIO: thank you for the
6 opportunity to testify. My name's Deyanira Del Rio;
7 I'm the Co-Director of New Economy Project, formerly
8 NEDAP; we're an organization that works with
9 community groups around New York City to fight for
10 economic justice and to build a new economy that
11 works for all.

12 And I specifically want to address in the
13 proposal, which we enthusiastically support, some of
14 the issues around banking access; this is an area in
15 which we've done work for many years, working to hold
16 banks accountable to communities in New York City and
17 also working to eliminate barriers that immigrants,
18 young people and many others, including people in
19 communities of color face to accessing fair and
20 affordable financial services and you know, which
21 leave people not only vulnerable to high-cost and
22 predatory lenders and other institutions, but
23 actually blocks people from all kinds of other
24 economic opportunities by virtue of not having
25 banking or credit histories. Unfortunately, the

1
2 reality of that today without a banking and credit
3 history, it's increasingly hard to get housing, jobs,
4 insurance, cell phones, and the list is growing,
5 thanks to aggressive marketing by the credit bureaus.
6 The City Council is separately looking at a bill to
7 ban employment credit checks and that would at least
8 eliminate one of these unfair practices. But the
9 implications for being financially excluded are
10 really severe and expansive and that's the point I
11 wanna make, it's not just about saving fees from
12 check-cashing, it's really about economic access as a
13 whole.

14 We are really excited about the potential
15 for the municipal ID to be a tool that the City and
16 New Yorkers and advocacy groups and organizers can
17 use to press for accountable banking in the City and
18 to really expand fair and affordable financial
19 services for all New Yorkers.

20 There is in my testimony lengthy, sort of
21 documentation that the City has put out regarding the
22 numbers of people who right now do not have any
23 credit union or bank account at all; it's somewhere
24 upwards of 800,000 New Yorkers that have no account
25 and that doesn't include many hundreds of thousands

1
2 more that maybe have an account, but are still
3 relying on high-cost, you know fringe services,
4 [bell] predatory services to meet some of their
5 needs. So literally expanding financial access in a
6 meaningful way could literally put millions of
7 dollars back in the pockets of low-income New Yorkers
8 and their communities and so it's a really, you know
9 critical issue for that reason.

10 I am going to, in the interest of time,
11 just jump ahead a little bit into some of the
12 recommendations that we have to make sure that the ID
13 is an effective tool to promote banking access,
14 because as everyone knows, I believe up here that
15 lack of a government-issued ID is one of the major
16 impediments that people face to getting access to an
17 affordable, safe, regulated bank or credit union
18 account, so not having a government-issued ID, it's
19 not just immigrants; it's all the other communities
20 that you've heard so far face these challenges. One
21 is that we would recommend that the City take into
22 account the federal banking requirements, including,
23 for example, under the Patriot Act, and design the ID
24 to meet those minimum requirements so that banks can
25 accept that ID card as sufficient government ID to

1
2 open an account, so the Patriot Act sets forth very
3 basic minimum requirements -- name, address, a photo,
4 for example; a birth date, and then, critically, an
5 identification number that's unique. And so making
6 sure there's a unique ID number on the cards will
7 hopefully go far to making sure banks and credit
8 unions accept that card. Second, we urge the City to
9 use its leverage and its relationships with local
10 banks and credit unions to press them to accept the
11 ID not as a second or third ID, but as the primary ID
12 which meets federal law, federal banking
13 requirements, as a primary ID to allow people to open
14 basic, affordable savings and checking accounts. And
15 we think that the City has several leverage points,
16 including the New York City Responsible Banking Act,
17 which gives the City the ability to evaluate how
18 banks are meeting community credit and banking need;
19 when the City is deciding where to put its deposit.
20 And so this, you know acceptance of the ID, service
21 to people who have the ID could be one way that the
22 City evaluates banks under that law. We also think
23 that the City could go a step further and do what we
24 understand San Francisco did, which is, in its
25 statute, it requires all entities that do business

1 with the City to accept the municipal ID card, and so
2 that's yet another kind of hook or leverage with
3 banks and others. And then finally, we would say
4 that we have anecdotally heard from some financial
5 institutions that they are already kind of viewing
6 the ID a little bit skeptically, thinking it's not
7 really a full... a true government-issued ID; it's
8 gonna be a little too flexible or they're saying,
9 well we'll accept it, but we're gonna develop a
10 special product for those people, and you know
11 unfortunately that... for those that do this work, the
12 code there are, you know, inferior products, there
13 are like fewer products and services and you know,
14 things like pre-paid debit cards that aren't
15 federally protected and insured in the same way as
16 other banking services, for example and often have
17 really high and hidden fees for people. So we wanna
18 ask the City to make sure that institutions are
19 viewing the City ID as a true and full government-
20 issued ID; the ID is about unifying and really
21 expanding access, equal access for all New Yorkers,
22 it's not about creating separate and segregated
23 systems and products, so we would want to make sure
24 that the City has its radar up for that.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Great. I'm gonna
3 pause you there; I just... [crosstalk]

4 DEYANIRA DEL RIO: Okay. Okay, thank
5 you. That was it.

6 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: I wanna... I wanna
7 make sure that we can ask some questions, and I wanna
8 recognize our great Public Advocate Tish James who's
9 joined us; no stranger to this body and this room,
10 but a fierce fighter for all New Yorkers, and I wanna
11 give you an opportunity to say a few words and to ask
12 a question.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Good morning. I
14 wanna thank Immigration Chair, Council Member Carlos
15 Menchaca for inviting me to speak on the topic of New
16 York City Municipal ID Card Program.

17 Across the country a growing number of
18 municipalities have begun to issue municipal ID cards
19 to their residents; these municipal identification
20 cards typically feature the photo and address of the
21 cardholder. Although typically available to all
22 residents, the cards are particularly valuable for
23 the most vulnerable community residents, undocumented
24 immigrants, homeless populations and others who may
25 have difficulty obtaining and retaining other

1 government-issued ID. As know, governmental
2 identification is needed to obtain access to service
3 most New Yorkers take for granted, like opening bank
4 accounts, access to financial services, leasing
5 apartments, entrance into certain governmental
6 buildings, and even simply getting a library card.
7 Today over half-a-million undocumented New Yorkers
8 unfairly live in the shadows; it's now time that they
9 step out of the shadows, and I am pleased to hear
10 that this Council is considering.. I am pleased to
11 hear that this legislation is being considered within
12 the Council and that the Administration has moved
13 forward with the Mayor's Office of Contract Services
14 to secure project management and quality assurance
15 services for the municipal ID application system, as
16 well as a company that would oversee the program. As
17 in the Office of Public Advocate, we also look
18 forward to making sure that that company, that there
19 is some oversight over that program and that company.
20 I would hope to further discuss specifics regarding
21 the procurement process, specifically how
22 registration data will be compiled and secured and
23 accessed both by the contracting company and that
24 individuals' information is safe. And I again thank
25

1
2 you for the opportunity to speak on the proposed New
3 York City Municipal ID Card Program, but I want
4 everyone to know that the Office of Public Advocate
5 is a friend to all regardless of status and that we
6 support this initiative going forward and whatever we
7 can do in our capacity to ensure that there is equal
8 opportunity for all, the Office of Public Advocate,
9 the office of Letitia James, is here to serve. Thank
10 you.

11 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Public
12 Advocate Tish James. And really with that note, I
13 wanna hand it... or direct my question to Johanna from
14 NYCLU and really understand how you envision
15 protecting the privacy during the period in which the
16 City has explained to us that they're gonna take
17 information, the... well I guess I should just... I'll
18 leave it there. How did you feel like that's gonna
19 happen from your perspective?

20 JOHANNA MILLER: So as a threshold
21 matter... my understanding is that the City has
22 concerns about whether the people who are kind of the
23 storefront recipients of these applicants in order to
24 make it widespread may not have the correct training
25 to be able to verify documents and so they need to

1
2 either scan them or retain them in some way to have
3 them -- like a two-step verification process. So as
4 a threshold matter, we don't think that that's a
5 legitimate reason to retain documents, we think that
6 that indicates, quite frankly, a troubling lack of
7 investment in proper training of those individuals;
8 we think if there is a tension between widespread
9 access and proper training, the City has to err on
10 the side of training, and that's not just a safety
11 concern with verifying the documents, but also, as
12 you raised yourself, a customer service concern; a
13 lot of the populations that are going to be best
14 served by this identification card have had
15 historically from interactions with many government
16 agencies, including HRA, and so I think they're
17 concerned that people won't be trained to verify a
18 paper document, whether it's true or not, to me
19 raises those secondary concerns about whether those
20 people will actually be trained to handle the many
21 different circumstances that people are going to
22 present and make sure that they have a dignified
23 experience. But as a secondary matter, we are not
24 yet convinced that scanning and retaining the
25 documents actually presents the right kind of

1 verification, the means of verification at all; in
2 fact, many of the security features of these types of
3 documents are security features that you can only
4 verify when you have the document in your possession
5 and so scanning them... so things like embossed seals,
6 watermarks, things that even a high-quality scanner
7 are not going to show, and so that two-step
8 verification process, we haven't seen evidence yet
9 from the City, we haven't had detailed conversations,
10 but I have not seen evidence that actually would even
11 work at all and in fact there are in-person
12 mechanical verification methods that we would
13 encourage the City to explore, like using UV lamps on
14 some documents where the, you know, watermarks can
15 show up on UV; we think that people can be trained to
16 do this work and we think if that means that there
17 are slightly fewer of them, that's probably the right
18 path to go down.

19
20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. And my
21 next question is to Miss Tucker, you mentioned really
22 the value of NYPD accepting this piece of
23 identification; can you just frame for us the value
24 and why it's so essential for the NYPD to accept
25 this?

1
2 EMILY TUCKER: Yeah, I mean I think there
3 are a few communities that are represented in our
4 advocacy coalition that could speak to this
5 firsthand, but you know the... just to give a basic
6 overview, undocumented immigrants are often afraid to
7 take advantage of law enforcement in their
8 communities because they worry that if they have to
9 present identification, that identification might tip
10 law enforcement off to their undocumented status and
11 that that could trigger a pickup by ICE or their
12 personal information being submitted to ICE and
13 consequences not only for themselves and their family
14 members and that has huge consequences we've seen in
15 the domestic violence advocacy circle, many, many
16 examples of individuals who are suffering from
17 domestic violence and fear going to the police
18 because they don't wanna bring to light their status
19 or the status of their family members and there
20 actually have been incidents where individuals have
21 gone to the police in cases of domestic violence and
22 have ended up in deportation proceedings. So that's
23 one example and the other example would be the, for
24 example, homeless individuals who often don't have
25 current forms of identification and will be, you

1
2 know, they'll be in the subway and have their feet on
3 the seat and it's 3 a.m. and the cops are doing
4 sweeps and aren't able to present a valid form of
5 identification for the purposes of getting a summons
6 and so they end up having to spend the night in jail.
7 So those are some of the examples and it's really,
8 really crucial for NYPD to accept the ID.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Miss
10 Tucker. Next question from Council Member Reynoso.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you. This
12 is to Mr. Choi. You specifically talked about
13 incentives and discounts; are you saying that maybe
14 we get 10 percent off at Macy's for getting this
15 card; is that what you're implying... [crosstalk]

16 STEVEN CHOI: Think we rely upon you as
17 Council Member to make that happen.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [laugh] Well, I
19 do want to see if you've thought of any creative ways
20 that you think... [interpose]

21 STEVEN CHOI: Sure.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: you can make
23 this popular and make it attractive to folks and
24 speak to the discounts or incentives that you were
25 talking about.

1
2 STEVEN CHOI: Absolutely. So as I stated
3 before in my testimony and as you see in the written
4 testimony, we think that this package of potential
5 benefits is going to be the most critical thing. As
6 I said before, the best thing for immigrants about
7 this card is to make sure that non-immigrants are
8 taking advantage of it, and that is gonna be
9 absolutely critical to dealing with the issue of
10 avoiding this being a scarlet letter. And so what I
11 would say is, as I mentioned earlier, we should
12 establish a joint task force, get the Mayor's folks
13 to come together, get the City Council to come
14 together, and this broad network of nonprofit
15 organizations, this robust network that we have here
16 in New York City, get our minds together and lets
17 think together strategically and creatively. If we
18 think about it, there is a whole range of benefits
19 that could be... that we can make eligible through this
20 card -- discounts to restaurants, discounts to
21 Macy's, although I don't shop at Macy's, I don't have
22 enough money to shop there, but really thinking
23 through all the different ways in which we could
24 connect it up. We could connect it up with... and this
25 is just some brief brainstorming, but we could

1
2 connect it up with a restaurant week, we could
3 connect it up with the City Bike system, and this is
4 all just sort of brainstorming that we're thinking
5 about. Procedurally we should create a joint task
6 force; I think we should actually build it into the
7 bill, where we talk about brining these folks
8 together so we're not doing this in a haphazard way,
9 but in a thoughtful and careful and strategic way
10 where we are identifying not only what's best for
11 immigrants, but also what's gonna attract citizens
12 and green card holders and students to all say, I
13 want this bill as well. So ultimately, at the end of
14 the day, there should be this robust package of
15 benefits that every single person in this room should
16 say, there's something in it for me.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Okay. Well with
19 that I think... I wanna thank you for being on this
20 panel; we're gonna hear from so many other New
21 Yorkers and we're gonna continue our conversations.
22 Thank you for being engaged in this process up until
23 this point; we're gonna continue. So thank you so
24 much. [background comment]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Our next panel we call up Jason Chang from the National Federation of Community Development Credit Unions, Jeong Ming Yu [sp?] from the MinKwon Center, Linda Sarsour from the Arab American Association of New York, and Esther Sanchez from Faith in New York. Please make your way up to the table. [background comments] [Spanish] **01:46:16...**

[interpose]

ESTHER SANCHEZ: [Spanish] **01:46:17**

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish] **01:46:21**

Can we have a translator, please?

MALE VOICE: [Spanish] **01:46:28**

[interpose]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish] **01:46:31**

ESTHER SANCHEZ: [Spanish] **01:46:32**

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

[background comment]

ESTHER SANCHEZ: [Spanish] **01:46:36**

[background comment]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish] **01:48:17**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: So I'm going to translate and it says, "My name is Esther Sanchez, I living in New York for more than 15 years, a mother of three autistic children and because of the

1
2 diagnostic or the condition of my children I have to
3 take them constantly to the hospital and on various
4 occasions, because I didn't have an ID, my children
5 were not attended at the hospital and I've had to
6 come back to my house really worried that something
7 bad could happen to my children because they didn't
8 receive medical assistance that day. Also, when I go
9 to my children's school they also ask me for an ID to
10 be able to get in and in various occasions I showed
11 them my consular ID, the ID from my country and I
12 have been discriminated and rejected and I have to
13 always, you know be going through very difficult
14 times and I don't wanna go to my children's school
15 because I don't feel accepted there. So for me this
16 ID will change my life because as a mother I have
17 experienced discrimination and having a municipal ID
18 in New York is really important for me and for a lot
19 of mothers that are in my same situation; it will
20 take me out of the shadows and I would be able to
21 live with tranquility and peace. You know, after so
22 many years of living here I will finally feel that
23 I'm a part of this city.

24 [background comment]
25

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

[background comment] Mr. Yu.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Good morning Council Members Menchaca and other council members. Thank you for this hearing and the opportunity to share my experience and my thoughts on the municipal ID program.

My name is Jeong Min Yu and I am a member of the MinKwon Center for Community Action. I'm going to hold up my green passport and then just tell you about a recent exchange at a Home Depot while returning an item.

The Home Depot rep had said, "Can I see your ID?" And I said, "Yeah, here you go." And then he said, "I'm sorry, but we can't accept this." And then I said to him, "Why?" And he says, "We can only accept U.S. Government IDs here." And I was like, "It's a Korean Passport, it's from Korea." And he said, "Sorry," you know. And so as I walked away I heard another worker say, probably mockingly; sarcastically, "You know, if you're in America you should have your American ID." And than I shot back, "You know, not everybody can be an American citizen," sad but true. And so nonetheless, my passport is my

1
2 only sole documentation of the journey from Korea 33
3 years ago and I was born in Seoul and brought to the
4 States at the age of 1 and my family moved to New
5 York when I was 8; I went to Mark Twain and
6 Stuyvesant High School and went to college and
7 graduated magna cum laude. Even with all this, when
8 it comes to being an actual person in the eyes of the
9 law, I continue to live in the shadows. I've aged
10 out of the Deferred Action Program by one year and
11 have not been able to drive, work and travel like my
12 younger stream of [sic] peers; they now have a valid
13 U.S. ID while I still do not.

14 Experiences like the one at Home Depot
15 leave me wondering, what can be done for the people
16 like me, undocumented immigrants without other forms
17 of ID or even international students who might be
18 relying on foreign passports as their sole means of
19 government-issued ID? Banks, post offices and even
20 rental properties can and do ask for secondary forms
21 of IDs, but our very limited options basically
22 imprisons us and our existence in the real world.
23 [bell] This municipal ID program would rectify some
24 of the problems I face as I continue to live in this
25 great city for another, 10, 20; 30 years. While so

1
2 many of us wait for Congress to act, I hope you do
3 pass Int. 253 now, and not just for me, but for the
4 other immigrants who have just arrived or who have
5 been listed as Deferred Action Program, not to
6 mention for the entire immigrant community who every
7 day and in every way wishes to contribute to this
8 great city. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. Next,
10 please.

11 JASON CHANG: Good morning. My name is
12 Jason Chang and I'm with the National Federation of
13 Community Development Credit Unions. The Federation
14 is an association of community development credit
15 unions with more than 250 members across the country,
16 serving over 2.5 million members in urban and rural
17 settings. The Federation works to support member
18 credit unions in their mission to serve under-served
19 populations while complying with Know Your Customer
20 rules and other existing regulations. Community
21 Development Credit Unions, or CDCUs, are in a unique
22 position in the financial sector because they work
23 with immigrants, low- and moderate-income populations
24 and historically under-served communities. As such,
25 CDCUs have an extensive experience working with

1
2 alternate forms of ID, such as the Matricula
3 Consular. However, while some national consulates
4 are proactive in helping their citizenry, immigrants
5 may not always be able to obtain passports or IDs if
6 they do not have immigration status and may be
7 required to pay hundreds of dollars for services that
8 they cannot necessarily afford. A municipal ID can
9 help remove these barriers for immigrants and expand
10 access by providing a government-issued ID that all
11 New Yorkers can use and CDCUs and other financial
12 institutions can accept to open accounts and provide
13 other needed services. The Federation believes in
14 equal access to financial products and services and
15 therefore wholly supports the efforts to introduce
16 municipal IDs that can help immigrants and all New
17 Yorkers establish banking accounts. We look forward
18 to working with the City Council and a membership to
19 expand and maximize access to financial products and
20 services and we thank you for the time and the
21 opportunity to speak on this important issue.

22 LINDA SARSOUR: Okay. So thank you,
23 Council Members for having us here today. My name is
24 Linda Sarsour and I'm the Executive Director at the
25 Arab American Association of New York and I'm here to

1 wholeheartedly support the creation of a New York
2 City identification card for all New Yorkers. The
3 key here is to ensure that this card has broad appeal
4 to the pastor in Staten Island, the transgendered
5 teen in Queens, successful business owner in the
6 Bronx and the undocumented mom from Brooklyn. Any
7 New Yorker should be proud to carry this new ID; we
8 want to ensure and stress to the New York City
9 Council and Mayor de Blasio that this does not become
10 a scarlet letter. In order to avoid this we call on
11 the New York City Council and the Mayor's Office to
12 pool their resources to implement a robust outreach
13 and marketing campaign that leverages the power and
14 deep routes of ethnic and community-based
15 organizations, chambers of commerce to reach the
16 widest possible audience. A comprehensive media
17 marketing campaign will also need to be a top
18 priority and we hope the Council will commit those
19 resources. We envision this card as the key to New
20 York City, exploring opportunities with museums,
21 other tourist sites, City Bike rental, libraries are
22 just some examples of the potential of this card to
23 appeal to every corner of New York City. We recommit
24 to working with members of the New York City Council
25

1
2 and the Mayor's Office to foster the relationships
3 needed to make this a multi-purpose ID. We believe
4 that the aesthetics of the card are important and
5 appealing to a broader base. Ideas around using the
6 Statue of Liberty or other landmarks as part of
7 making this a New York City centric functioning
8 document that also acts as a memento of who we are
9 and what we represent as New York City. This card is
10 long overdue in a city like New York; I know we have
11 a lot of support in the New York City Council and
12 from our Speaker and Mayor; since we're gonna do it,
13 let's do it big and let's do it right. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much
15 Miss Sarsour for testifying, and thank you all for
16 coming today to talk about your experiences of really
17 all New Yorkers and particularly I wanna ask Mr. Yu
18 to talk a little bit more about the relationship and
19 something we talked earlier about, language access
20 and how language access is such an important
21 component and what that means to you on the ground,
22 understanding it through different programs that
23 you've already been engaged in?

24 JEONG MIN YU: My parents, they own a
25 grocery store and even though they've been here like

1
2 30 years, their English is, you know, somewhat basic...
3 you know, my English is great 'cause I've been raised
4 here and it's... I think the issue of language access,
5 especially for Korean immigrants, is just so key,
6 because some of these are international students and
7 you know, it does take some time, especially when
8 they come as teenagers, to learn the language
9 basically to move about and stuff like that. I think
10 for them and for all the Asian immigrants and, not
11 just Asian immigrants; Latino immigrants and
12 everybody else, that we have programs to actually
13 benefit them and you know, even for this Deferred
14 Action Program, which I am not a part of right now, I
15 hope that they could actually take part in it and get
16 their own program and even for this ID, I think that
17 would be the right step and to just understand what
18 it entails and to move forward. And especially for
19 educational purposes, when going to college and
20 getting jobs, I think that would be such a huge
21 benefit for them and I think that's what we need to
22 push for as well.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

24 JEONG MIN YU: Thank you.
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And I have another question, [Spanish] **01:58:29**. And then, just to translate, I asked a little bit about the relationship, about her and... she talked a lot about in her testimony her relationship with her school and agencies, but really on the police side, how she could feel a little bit more secure and safe in talking to the Police Department, for example.

ESTHER SANCHEZ: [Spanish] **01:59:12**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: So as an immigrant it's terrifying to go to a precinct and report anything because you're afraid that they're gonna arrest you or you're gonna get deported.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish] **01:59:47**

ESTHER SANCHEZ: [Spanish] **01:59:49**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: One time I was talking to my husband on the phone, he was a block away, and out of nowhere he stopped talking to me, I later found out that he was stopped by the police and he was questioned and he was taken in to the precinct because he did not have identification, so the next morning I had to go and look for him; it was a terrible experience because I had not... I did not know what had happened.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish]

02:01:21. Council Member Reynoso.

ESTHER SANCHEZ: [Spanish] **02:01:27**

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: My question is for Linda; how are you, first? Speaking of being in New York and going big, I think that's extremely important and it not being a scarlet letter; do you think... So originally in the beginning we keep speaking about who we think are gonna be the people most attracted to this card; what place do CBOs like yours have in ensuring that they can get broad support from their membership and even further than that; do you feel that you play a role outside of the City of New York's work in regards to what they need to do? What role do you think you could play in helping with the marketing?

LINDA SARSOUR: Thank you for that question and I think that's actually, for me personally, it's the critical point that we have to really clarify here. If we wanna make this broad appeal, I'm all about using existing resources, like the Human Resources Administration, but to be honest with you, let's be serious; the Human Resources Administration has a stigma behind it as an agency

1
2 that provides services and support to low-income New
3 Yorkers, so if we wanna appeal to the Upper West
4 Side, if we wanna appeal to the people in, you know
5 Greenpoint, Park Slope, you know this kind of... you
6 know our allies and others in the community, we need
7 to make sure that we're providing access points to
8 people that don't wanna be part of that stigma. And
9 the role of community-based organizations is multi-
10 faceted. First of all, we represent organizations
11 where many of us are multi-lingual, multi-cultural,
12 we understand how to work with our people, and I
13 think that that's why I'm talking about a very robust
14 campaign, similar to that of UPK; I mean there was a
15 lot of resources and marketing around universal pre-K
16 and we think this is just as important if not even
17 more important to ensure that while we're trying to
18 get our kids into a pre-K program, that their parents
19 are not barred from going and being part of their
20 educational experience because of lack of documents.
21 I think our role could be as... doing education, doing
22 workshops, helping to be part of a committee to look
23 at the translation materials around the marketing;
24 there's a lot of roles for ethnic-based
25 organizations, for the faith-based community, for the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

financial institutions, for the credit unions, and I think the idea here is, how do we use this as a time in a new administration to build relationships with all the sectors -- government, private, nonprofit. If we can't do it on municipal IDs, then we're gonna be in trouble in the future on future initiatives. So I think that's a conversation to have about how we can ensure that this is not a scarlet letter, that it is not only attractive to the undocumented and to the homeless and to transgender and the LGBT community, but it's something that every single New Yorker -- basically, if you are a cool New Yorker and you're a real New Yorker, you're gonna have a municipal ID, and that's the kind of theme that we hope this initiative does.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Miss Sarsour and I think we can put a #coolfactor on that... on that piece of testimony. [laughter] But thank you for that, and really thank you for everyone who's testified. We're gonna move on to our next panel now, and we have [background comments] folks from other jurisdictions; I wanna call Mr. John Lugo from New Haven to the table, and we have two folks on the

1
2 phone... [background comment] and we're gonna have John
3 Lugo go first, or are we ready... [background comments]
4 Great, thank you so much. We're gonna to with John
5 Lugo first, who's here, and we'll be testifying from
6 New Haven; this is a panel we've asked and we've
7 compiled from other jurisdictions to give us their
8 perspective. Thank you so much for being here, Mr.
9 Lugo. And when you're ready you can begin.

10 JOHN LUGO: [background comment] Okay.

11 My name is John Jairo Lugo; I am the founding member
12 of Unidad Latina en Accion, a grassroots organization
13 created in 2002 in New Haven, Connecticut. At that
14 time, immigrant workers came together to seek a
15 driver license, but the bill was defeated in the
16 Connecticut legislature. After that defeat, we
17 decided to create a platform of policies to make New
18 Haven a model city for the integration on new
19 immigrants in the social fabric.

20 One of the most innovative ideas was the
21 creation of the municipal ID card. The reasons were
22 clear, we did not have a driver license, but we still
23 need the ID. Many of our members were detained by
24 the police for simple traffic violations or the
25 police report refused to release them for several

1
2 days because they could not produce an ID. Without
3 an ID, many immigrants could not open bank accounts
4 and they were targeted by criminals as walking ATMs
5 because they carry cash. In 2006 one of our members,
6 Manuel Santiago Vasquez was murdered during a robbery
7 and we could no longer stay silent. We created
8 alliances with other organizations in the city, we
9 went to Junta for Progressive Action; the Director,
10 Kica Matos agreed to work with us in this platform.
11 We met with the Mayor, John DeStefano, and he was
12 open to the idea; he recruited the Yale Law School
13 for the legal research. They found the municipal ID
14 could not contra... doesn't contradict the federal or
15 state law. Mayor DeStefano convinced different
16 sectors of the city to support this project. The
17 Board of Aldermen held several public hearings and
18 people from different neighborhoods came in support
19 of the proposal, others questioned the idea [sic]
20 anti-immigrant and neo-Nazi groups came from outside
21 of New Haven to attack the city; they sent hate
22 emails and death threats to the city officials.
23 These groups tried to rally the African American
24 community against the immigrant community, they
25 passed out flyers saying that immigrants were the

1
2 cause of African American inequality [bell]; however,
3 African Americans saw the immigrants were suffering
4 the same attacks as they have suffered in the past
5 and they came out in support of the ID card; that's
6 how the Board of Aldermen ended voting 25-1 in favor
7 of the ID card, becoming the first city in the nation
8 to create this initiative. Two days later, Federal
9 Immigration agents came to the city of New Haven and
10 raided the homes of immigrants and detained 29
11 people. We later confirmed through a lawsuit that
12 this ICE raid was an act of retaliation against the
13 city. Days after the raid diverse sectors of the
14 city marched to denounce the raids -- immigrants,
15 African-Americans, Puerto Ricans, Jews, people of
16 faith and city officials -- they also raised the
17 money to free all these brothers and sisters who were
18 detained. A few weeks later, when New Haven began to
19 issue the ID card, thousands got online and get the
20 document; they were not just Latinos, because people
21 saw the ID card as a way to integrate a society that
22 was segregated and divided. Since then, more than
23 10,000 people have applied for the ID.

24 The advantages are clear, many people can
25 now open bank accounts, so they are not targeted by

1
2 criminals. The relationship with the police has
3 improved because now we are citizens of the city of
4 New Haven. People coming out from jail who had no
5 documents can apply for the ID card and now they can
6 integrate into the social fabric. High school
7 students, now they have an ID. We're one city,
8 united we stand, divided we fall. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Mr. Lugo
10 for that testimony and so much of what you're talking
11 about is alive and well in New York City and is at
12 the base of what we're trying to do here, so thank
13 you so much for your testimony. What we have...
14 [background comment] And so, thank you so much.
15 We're gonna go... you can stay here at the table; we're
16 gonna... we might have some questions for you. We have
17 Mr. Eric Mar?

18 ERIC MAR: Yes it is.

19 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Mr. Mar, thank
20 you. Can you please identify yourself; we're gonna
21 give you a couple minutes for testimony; I know
22 you're calling from San Francisco.

23 ERIC MAR: Yes; my name's Eric Mar; it's
24 M A R; I'm a member of our Board of Supervisors in
25 San Francisco; I represent District 1, which is Ocean

1 Beach and Golden Gate Park, for those New Yorkers
2 that don't know where it is. [sirens] I've been on
3 our Board of Supervisors since 2009, when we first
4 implemented our San Francisco municipal ID card; I am
5 one of 11 members of our Board of Supervisors. Way
6 back in 2007, when many other parts of the country
7 were facing immigration raids, ICE raids, San
8 Francisco had a group of grassroots, mostly Latino,
9 immigrant organizations that came together to discuss
10 the need for bringing people out of the shadows,
11 giving dignity and creating more public safety for
12 the immigrant communities; they brought this issue to
13 the Board of Supervisors; Supervisor Tom Ammiano, at
14 the time, he's now a State Assemblyman, took the
15 legislation with others on our Board; they strongly
16 championed it; we planned it for quite a while, about
17 a year-and-a-half. Part of the challenge was, our
18 mayor at the time, Gavin Newsom, who's now our
19 Lieutenant Governor, was more lukewarm on the issue,
20 but our Board of Supervisors and a grassroots
21 coalition from the immigrant community pushed hard
22 and they really tried to frame it as, not just for
23 immigrants or undocumented people, but for homeless
24 people and low-income youth or seniors that needed a
25

1 sense of legitimacy and also to be able to talk with
2 the police to report crime, so it was about framing
3 it for increasing civic engagement for vulnerable
4 populations, not just for immigrants. We implemented
5 it in January of 2009; it really took a strong push
6 from our immigrant community organizations through a
7 network called The San Francisco Immigrant Legal and
8 Education Network, or SFILEN, and I think some of the
9 challenges at the time also were broad public
10 education, countering the media's framing in an
11 environment in 2008 [bell] and 2007 of anti-immigrant
12 sentiment, but to frame it as, it's about public
13 safety for immigrant communities and for everyone,
14 and it was about better access to service for
15 vulnerable populations as well. We have about 40,000
16 ID cards right now; I... or no, 20... 20,000 right now in
17 our City of 800,000 people; it's been about 4,000 per
18 year and they're heavily from the Latino community,
19 though it's a diverse population of people that have
20 ID cards. It cost us about \$828,000 to set it up in
21 the first year and part of that was buying the
22 expensive machines that were laser-etching that could
23 create a document that could prevent fraud, and I
24 think there have been no incidents of fraud reported
25

1
2 in San Francisco, so the fear of easy illegal
3 activity are not true, there's no incidents of fraud
4 within our city that we know of. The card...
5 [interpose, crosstalk]

6 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Supervisor Mar...

7 ERIC MAR: also costs \$15 per person, but
8 if you're low-income and you could verify that, it's
9 \$5.00 per card and we do not... or, if used for many
10 services like New Haven and other places, as a step
11 towards opening up a checking account or a banking
12 account with our Bank on San Francisco, which other
13 cities use as well, there are 40-50 businesses that
14 allow discounts or other benefits from using the card
15 and I think there's still a broad community of
16 support from the nonprofits and community-based
17 organizations that support this in addition to our
18 whole city government, so all departments are
19 supposed to acknowledge this card. There were
20 initial challenges with the police department that,
21 [background comment] in speaking one of our police
22 commissioners in San Francisco, Angela Chan, who
23 served really with a focus on protecting the
24 immigrant communities on the Police Commission, but
25 she said that at different times police would

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

confiscate the card from someone or they wouldn't know what it is, so we've had to do a lot of broad education with our police department, with our police chief and others to make sure that the law is followed in San Francisco and that the card is used as a key identification purpose whenever somebody wants to report crime or even if you get in a fender-bender. There are some challenges right now also when a car is impounded and somebody needs to get their car back as well. But I think overall, for increasing public safety, expanding access to low-income and immigrant people to services, from health care to other types of services in the city, that it's been a wonderful addition to our city and at a fairly low cost to our city, but really expanding civic engagement and bringing people out of the shadows so that they have legitimacy and a feeling of unity in being a San Franciscan.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much for that testimony. And we're gonna keep you on the phone for a couple minutes; we have a couple questions for you; do you have a couple more minutes?

ERIC MAR: Yes I do.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: So my first
3 question is, in really understanding the issue of
4 privacy, how has San Francisco ensured privacy for
5 your residents throughout this program?

6 ERIC MAR: Yeah, I think that's a great
7 question. I think for these municipal ID cards, the
8 verification first of using of the documents to show
9 that you are who you are and that you have resided in
10 San Francisco for over 15 days has been a challenge;
11 we've... actually, before I get to privacy, we've shown
12 some flexibility in how to document that you live in
13 San Francisco and you are who you are; we also allow
14 nonprofit organizations, legitimate nonprofit
15 organizations, to write a letter to verify that a
16 person is who they are and has been living here for a
17 period of time to show residency. So that's another
18 flexibility, because often people weren't able to
19 produce the documents that our County Clerk that
20 verifies everything could use. But none of the
21 information that you show for validity is kept by our
22 County Clerk, so that's a key part of, I think
23 protecting privacy. Also, even Supervisor Ammiano at
24 the time went through the line to get his municipal
25 ID, and he kinda jokes about it in some ways as well;

1
2 again, he's a State Assemblyman now, but even he
3 could not provide, when we first implemented it in
4 January of 2009, enough evidence to show that he was
5 a resident and who he was. So we've had to deal with
6 the challenges of verification, but we've been
7 flexible. And I think the challenges in setting this
8 up were protecting people's privacy and I know our
9 current Mayor Ed Lee, who was a city administrator at
10 the time, and our police department and many
11 departments really developed a system that is
12 protecting the privacy of especially undocumented
13 people so that no information is reported to the
14 Department of Homeland Security or ICE and that
15 people feel absolutely secure that they could provide
16 the information to get the ID card.

17 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.
18 There's two quick questions and then... actually, three
19 quick questions, if we can keep them brief; is the
20 confirmation that the SFPD was not part of the
21 creation and implementation of the card program; is
22 that right?

23 ERIC MAR: Actually, I'm not sure. I
24 know that our Police Chief, Heather Fong at the time,
25 there were some challenges in the beginning, but

1
2 there is a departmental memo from the police chief to
3 the department after long meetings with the city
4 leadership so that the police know that they're
5 supposed to comply with and to accept the use of the
6 card. I know there are some exceptions that the... if
7 the police reasonably see that there might be fraud
8 involved, but again, there's been on incidents of
9 fraud; they don't have to accept the ID card. But I
10 think in the early days there were some police
11 officers that were confiscating ID cards, but I think
12 with broader education from our Immigrant Legal
13 Education Network and work with the police that we've
14 cleared up a lot of that confusion about the use of
15 the card. But we'll try to get a copy of the
16 directive from the police chief to the department on
17 how the card is supposed to be accepted by the police
18 as a department.

19 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. And
20 the next question is about how San Francisco allows a
21 designation of gender on the municipal IDs?

22 ERIC MAR: So San Francisco has a strong
23 tradition of equal rights for everyone, including
24 transgendered people; our card does not designate
25 gender at all, and I think it was specific to be very

1
2 inclusive to use the card so that transgender people
3 didn't have to be in a situation of having the card
4 questioned by people. So I think that was a key part
5 of our promotion of dignity and civil rights for
6 everyone.

7 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. And we
8 have one question from Council Member Cabrera.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you, Mr.
10 Chair. My question is in reference -- I just wanna
11 understand it right -- it is about \$50, the cost per
12 card in the economy of scale; is it \$50 per person
13 and how many people again do you have in San
14 Francisco that are using the ID?

15 ERIC MAR: Thank you. It's not \$50; it's
16 \$15, one, five... [interpose]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay.

18 ERIC MAR: \$15. San Francisco has about
19 800,000 people, though our population doubles or
20 triples during the workday, with many people coming
21 into our city, and there are 20,000 cards issued,
22 about 4,000 per year and the card is... it lasts for
23 two years and then you have to renew the card.

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON IMMIGRATION

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So that's... just to be clear, the \$15 is what people pay or is \$15 the cost... is your cost as a city?

ERIC MAR: It costs the person \$15. And what... is there a cost to the city at all? How much you're spending [interpose] or did you RFP this out and there's a private entity involved in this? How is that working out?

ERIC MAR: No, it's our City Clerk's Office that administers it. I think it costs roughly the amount that it brings in, so it costs us about \$200,000 a year and I think the fees are roughly paid for by that \$15 fee. And again, there are \$5.00, low-income cards issued and then, there are many homeless people in the city that utilize the card and the fee is waived if you could verify that you are homeless as well. So my understanding is there are hundreds of cards that are for homeless people that provide dignity and bringing them out of the shadows as well.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Our next and final question is from Council Member Reynoso.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Hi. I just
3 wanted to ask if there's any advice you would give us
4 to expand on participation? You said 20,000 folks
5 have it out of 800,000; that seems like a low number;
6 what would you have done different to allow for that
7 number to be larger?

8 ERIC MAR: I think that's a great
9 question. I think one of the challenges, when we
10 first implemented, was an anti-immigrant sentiment
11 and a budget crisis that was going on. I think
12 funding, not only your city's immigrant commission;
13 we have an Office of Civic Engagement and Immigrant
14 Affairs with a director and staff; we have an
15 Immigrant Rights Commission; we have a network of
16 immigrant rights organizations. I used to be the
17 Director of our Immigrant Rights Coalition in the
18 city in the 90s, but we have a SFILEN network that...
19 our city does some funding for outreach for language
20 access and lots of other needs and services, but I
21 think cities' funding capacity in immigrant
22 communities with the nonprofit organizations and
23 raising awareness early on is important. I think a
24 big blitz with media to frame it not just for
25 immigrants but for everyone, to improve public safety

1
2 and civic engagement is really critical. I think at
3 the time we implemented ours there was an anti-
4 immigrant hysteria; we had minutemen, right-wing,
5 anti-immigrant minutemen coming to protest at city
6 hall, but it was a climate that was different than
7 what you have. We also had a mayor that was not that
8 supportive, Gavin Newsom, and immigrant communities
9 had to organize like crazy to push it forward with
10 our support of city council I think the vote was
11 10-1 at our city council to support it, so there was
12 near unanimous support. But having Mayor de Blasio
13 and your City Council Chairman and Councilman Dromm
14 and Lander and Menchaca and so many others of you
15 supporting it I think is a big, big plus for you.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you
17 Supervisor Mar, and thank you for your time and we
18 look forward to continuing to work with you and
19 follow up on some of the things we brought up during
20 this testimony. Thank you and we'll talk to you
21 soon.

22 ERIC MAR: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Okay.

24 ERIC MAR: Bye.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. And
3 Mr. Lugo -- Does anyone have any questions for
4 Mr. Lugo? I mean I don't know if there's anything
5 that you've heard, but clearly there's [bell] a
6 kinda... a over-arching theme to the way that all these
7 programs have kind of been rooted and it's just great
8 to hear from you and New Haven as the first; it was
9 not easy and now we're here in New York, so just
10 thank you so much for your testimony today.

11 JOHN LUGO: Thank you very much.

12 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And so we're gonna
13 call up our next panel, Jesus Castellanos, Make the
14 Road, a youth member, Arely Gonzalez, Juan Carlos
15 Gomez, and Carlos Elias Vasquez Zambrano [sp?]. If
16 we can have you to the table, please. Thank you so
17 much. [background comments] And the panel after
18 that, just so you could be ready for this next panel,
19 is Diana Reyna, Brooklyn Deputy Borough President,
20 Jeff Foreman from the Care for the Homeless, Jessica
21 Orozco, Hispanic Federation, and then Jojo Annobil
22 from Legal Aid Society, [background comment] the
23 panel after this. [background comment] [Spanish]

24 **02:25:25.**

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON IMMIGRATION

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:25:31...**

[background comments]

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: My name is Arely Gonzalez and I am from... [interpose]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Could you get him a chair, please?

ARELY GONZALEZ: Make the Road.

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: Make the Road New York.

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:25:56**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: I know that the City entirely is emotional about the proposal from the Mayor...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:26:08**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: the other forces are pushing for this legislation...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:26:19**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: thanks to the leadership of Pechaco [sp?]?

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:26:30**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: thanks... thank god... I mean, thanks to the leadership of Mr. Pechaco, the leadership...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:26:40**

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: for the community,
the immigrant communities and the transgender
communities...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:26:50**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: this initiative is
very important.

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:26:54**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: We wanna count on a
form of identification that show who we are...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:27:04**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: that we are
residents of the State of New York.

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:27:11**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: Since we know it's
difficult, like me, undocumented, having obtaining a
piece of identification...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:27:23**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: and a lot of us,
it's been difficult for us to obtain the ID and come
out of the shadow.

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:27:38**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: We're scared that
sometimes when we walk outside that we're gonna walk
to... talk to police officers or other people...

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:27:53**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: a part of the
community of EBT... [background comment] [Spanish]

02:28:02

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:28:05**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: us, like transgender
women, we don't identify with the ID that... identify...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:28:21**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: like our
corresponding gender and our names...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:28:28**

[bell]

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: and it would also
reduce the amount of arrests due to not having ID.

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:28:38**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: The implementation
of... [Spanish] **02:28:44?**

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:28:45**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: so we could have...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:28:48**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: our names and our
preferred genders...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:28:52**

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON IMMIGRATION

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: will open the doors
to our lives...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:28:57**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: like people who will
form part of the community..

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:03**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: like members of the
community of EBT, I mean [Spanish] **02:29:09..**

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:10**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: this initiative is
very important for us.

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:15**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: Like me, as a
transgender woman...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:21**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: people make fun of
us when the police stop us...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:29**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: to ask for ID.

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:32**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: they tell us that we
are not women...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:37**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: they make fun of us...

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON IMMIGRATION

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:40**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: sometimes I don't carry an ID that has my gender and my date of birth...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:49**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: because I am ashamed that... I am embarrassed that maybe someone might see it.

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:58**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: This ID, this form of ID will open our lives much easier...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:30:10**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: we would have something that we can show to the police officers who we are...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:30:20**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: and we could have confidence...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:30:23**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: we would feel like we are more a part of the city...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:30:28**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: and would do it strongly.

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:30:32**

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: The ID has to not involve our identity of our gender...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:30:43**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: if it's not on the ID, it wouldn't be useful for me or other individuals who are transgender.

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:30:55**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: For other people...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:31:03**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: For all those reasons...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:31:06**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: I believe that the municipal ID...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:31:10**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: to have the people to sign...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:31:14**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: the gender that they have...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:31:18**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: would be a big help.

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:31:21**

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON IMMIGRATION

133

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: It would help us
create a more security city...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:31:28**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: and just with
results. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: **02:31:34**

[background comments]

JESUS CASTELLANOS: [Spanish] **02:32:05**

[interpose]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish] **02:34:40**

So can we... We're gonna go through the whole panel
really quick... **02:34:48**. Okay. [background comments]
Yeah, we're... let's just go through the whole panel,
then we can go back and... and do a quick translation.
Okay. [background comments]

JUAN CARLOS GOMEZ: Good afternoon...

[interpose]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: **02:35:09**

JUAN CARLOS GOMEZ: Okay. Yeah. Good
morning... or good afternoon... [interpose]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: **02:35:21**

JUAN CARLOS GOMEZ: Okay. Okay. Thank
you. Good afternoon members of the Commission of the
Immigration and everyone attending to this meeting.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

My name is Juan Carlos Gomez, member of the Make the Road New York and today I want to share with you only small part of my personal history. In this point I want to switch to Spanish for be more clear.

[Spanish] **02:35:51** [bell]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Gracias.

CARLOS VASQUEZ: [Spanish] **02:37:50**

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish] **02:39:00**

we're not gonna translate for this panel. We have another public hearing in less than an hour, so we wanna make sure everyone that wants to talk about their experience gets to do that; we're gonna change the time to one minute per testimonial. [Spanish]

02:39:21.

Can we have the next panel that I called earlier, Jojo Annobil, Jessica Orozco, Jeff Foreman, and then our Brooklyn Deputy Borough President, Diana Reyna please? [laugh] Thank you. Okay. And the next panel after that is Miss Glennda Testone, Elana Redfield, Lynly Edgars... Egyes, from the Sex Workers Project, and Mr. Noah Lewis, from the Transgender Legal Defense and Education Fund; they'll be testifying next. We're gonna try to speed through this; I'm sorry for the speed-through, but we have

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

another really great, important public hearing on Vision Zero, so thanks so much for your appreciation and your consideration.

DIANA REYNA: Turn on...

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: The mic is on? Thank you so much. [background comment] I'll stop you at one minute.

JOJO ANNOBIL: Sure, no problem. [laugh] So my name is Jojo Annobil and I'm the attorney in charge of The Legal Aid Society's Immigration Law Unit. Thank you so much for giving us an opportunity to testify today.

We basically agree with a lot of the comments and suggestions made here today; one of the things that we just wanted to highlight is the fact that we all talk about having an identify document which would... this would make a lot of undocumented immigrants be able to get an identity document, but also improving public safety; it will encourage people to feel much more comfortable reporting crimes, but it's a two-way street. If the Police Department is not going to accept these municipal cards as identity documents, then we are going to run into the same whole problem of for simple, non-

1
2 criminal offenses like riding a bike on the sidewalk,
3 open container of alcohol, all these are non-criminal
4 offenses; however, it allows the Police Department,
5 [bell] if you don't have an ID, to run your
6 fingerprint; once they run your fingerprint you are
7 basically put into a pipeline. [interpose]

8 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

9 JOJO ANNOBIL: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. And
11 that's been a consistent theme in conversation.

12 JOJO ANNOBIL: Okay.

13 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Next. Thank you.

14 JEFF FOREMAN: Chair Menchaca and members
15 of the Committee, thanks for the opportunity to
16 testify; I'm Jeff Foreman, the Policy Director for
17 Care for the Homeless.

18 If this legislation did nothing more than
19 document undocumented people, it would be a visionary
20 important piece of legislation that we would be very
21 happy to enthusiastically support, but it actually
22 does far more than that, it promises to help people
23 who have lost documents, people who have misplaced
24 documents and certainly help many people who are
25 homeless, like our clients. For all the people that

1
2 a municipal ID program offers relief, why wouldn't we
3 support our neighbors in need? And this bill wisely
4 also requires not just that IDs be appropriately
5 issued, but that they be promoted to include things
6 like public and private institutions and banking that
7 many poor people desperately need and do not have
8 access to... [bell] Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much
10 for that support as well. How do you say your last
11 name?

12 JESSICA OROZCO: Orozco.

13 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Orozco. Okay,
14 sorry; I... I couldn't read it. [crosstalk]

15 JESSICA OROZCO: Yes, right; my
16 handwriting...

17 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: I'm sorry about
18 that.

19 JESSICA OROZCO: It's okay.

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. Go
21 ahead.

22 JESSICA OROZCO: So good afternoon; my
23 name is Jessica Orozco and I'm the Director of
24 Immigration and Civic Engagement at the Hispanic
25

1
2 Federation; thank you for this opportunity to
3 testify.

4 Hispanic Federation is a premier Latino
5 membership organization in the nation and was founded
6 to address the many inequities confronting Latinos
7 and the nonprofits that serve them. Our member
8 agencies are located within the heart of Latino
9 communities throughout the City and witness the
10 difficulty New Yorkers encounter when attempting to
11 obtain a widely-accepted photo ID. With member
12 agencies like Spanish-speaking Elderly Council and
13 Institute for the Puerto Rico Elderly, which provide
14 access to essential senior services, we see how
15 difficult it is for the City's elderly to acquire a
16 photo ID. For example, in New York for a U.S.-born
17 citizen to obtain a non-driver ID card, they must
18 show their birth certificate, passport or military
19 photo ID to prove date of birth. Seniors living in
20 the City may have been born at home and never
21 obtained a birth certificate or their certificate may
22 have been lost or destroyed over the decades.
23 Additionally, many elderly in New York City may have
24 disabilities that prevent them from getting to the
25

1
2 DMV or a few agencies that may assist them in getting
3 these documents reissued. [bell]

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you again.

5 JESSICA OROZCO: And I provided written
6 testimony.

7 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Yeah. Thank you
8 so much for your written testimony. And our... someone
9 that's not a stranger to this amazing body, our great
10 Deputy Borough President from Brooklyn, Diana Reyna.

11 DIANA REYNA: Thank you so much. Good
12 afternoon, Chairman Menchaca and Committee staff; I
13 want to just, for the sake of time, introduce my
14 Brooklyn Borough President, Eric Adams, who is not
15 here today and on his behalf, as his Deputy, I am
16 testifying in support of what would be Int. 253,
17 Municipal IDs. I just wanted to thank the Speaker,
18 Melissa Mark-Viverito for her staunch support on this
19 proposal and Mayor de Blasio for his unwavering
20 leadership to making this program a reality, along
21 with the Council; your leadership here is avid and
22 making sure that this continues to be at the
23 forefront of our agenda in government.

24 Each day the gates of New York City civic
25 life are open for those who can prove their identity

1
2 and display a photo ID; lacking an ID affects the
3 countless numbers of members of New York City's
4 immigrant communities, the growing number of homeless
5 people in our City, children in the foster care
6 system, the elderly, formerly incarcerated
7 individuals, and those who are disabled, mentally ill
8 or from the LGBTQ communities. Our communities grow
9 stronger and our city becomes one [bell] only when
10 all our neighbors can enjoy the multitude of
11 opportunities. I wanted to just express that an ID
12 is not worth the plastic it is printed on unless we
13 have the public's trust [background comment] and I
14 believe that we in Borough Hall, along with what
15 would be your leadership and the Mayor, to be able to
16 work together to provide what would be IDs being
17 processed at the center of our borough's civic
18 universe in Brooklyn Borough Hall, [background
19 comment] and so we want to welcome the opportunity to
20 work with you, we agree with the merits behind this
21 bill, but we also wanna make sure that the access to
22 the processing is one that would garner a lot of
23 synthesizing [background comment] between agencies
24 and working together to making sure that the
25 obstacles are reduced, that the distance is shorter

1
2 and that the economic barriers are removed. Thank
3 you so much. [crosstalk]

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And that... that is...
5 that is a priority of this City Council. So thank
6 you so much for... [crosstalk]

7 DIANA REYNA: Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: echoing it, and I
9 do have to say that on Twitter I did see that the
10 Borough President would welcome Borough Hall to be a
11 place where we could have application processes too,
12 so I just wanna acknowledge that.

13 DIANA REYNA: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much
15 for this panel. The next panel, if you can come up
16 as I called your name last time, Elana Redfield, Miss
17 Glenda Testone, Lynly Egyes -- please correct me in
18 your pronunciation of your name -- and Noah Lewis.
19 [background comments] Okay. We'll start on this
20 end, please. Identify yourself; thank you so much.
21 Stick to the one minute. Thank you. Actually, the
22 red button. [crosstalk]

23 ELANA REDFIELD: the button. My name is
24 Elana Redfield and I'm speaking today on behalf of
25 the Sylvia Rivera Law Project and also the Peter

1
2 Cicchino Youth Project. So in my short time today I
3 want to emphasize how critical it is that the Council
4 and the Mayor's Office make these IDs gender-
5 affirming. It's an essential component of reducing
6 discrimination; one study found 40 percent of
7 respondents experienced harassment because their ID
8 did not match their gender presentation. In order to
9 make the ID accessible to the most vulnerable people,
10 I must emphasize the critical importance of gender
11 self-determination; no medical evidence should be
12 required. Why is this important? First, every
13 individual is the best expert on their own internal
14 sense of gender, but secondly, many transgender
15 people do not have access to the medical treatments,
16 so providing a doctor's letter may be hard or
17 impossible. Even finding a doctor or affording
18 medical care can be a challenge for low-income trans
19 people, especially considering that New York State
20 Medicaid does not cover transgender health care. So
21 this leave many people without the option of
22 obtaining IDs. And by obtaining an ID that affirms
23 their gender accurately, [bell] trans people can
24 reduce and in some cases eliminate the shame and
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

humiliation and harassment of using an ID that
doesn't match their gender.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.

NOAH LEWIS: I'm Noah Lewis, Staff
Attorney with Transgender Legal Defense and Education
Fund and I echo Elana Redfield's comments
wholeheartedly. Through our name change project
we've helped hundreds of transgender New Yorkers
change their name and we understand the problems that
they do have accessing doctors letters to get their
gender record changed and I would emphasize also that
New York already recognizes self-designation with
regards to access to homeless shelters, people can
choose for themselves which shelter best fits them;
they are the best determiners of whether they are
male or female and the New York City Human Rights Law
already makes it unlawful to ask for ID when
accessing sex-specific facilities, like restrooms, so
people are already able to use the facilities that
match and having ID that matches will just help when
they are unlawfully confronted for using those
facilities. Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you for
3 that, and well aware of the name change project and
4 thank you so much for that.

5 LYNLY EGYES: Hi, my name is Lynly Egyes;
6 I'm an attorney at the Sex Workers Project..
7 [interpose]

8 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Can you speak
9 closer to the mic; pull it closer to you?

10 LYNLY EGYES: Sure.

11 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: You can pull it
12 closer to you. Yeah.

13 LYNLY EGYES: I'm an attorney at the Sex
14 Workers Project at the Urban Justice Center; one of
15 the groups that I wanna talk about today that will be
16 impacted by this legislation is victims of
17 trafficking. The best way to explain how this will
18 impact victims of trafficking is to tell you about
19 two of my clients. Rebecca was brought into the
20 United States by a very powerful family, she worked
21 as a nanny, but upon arrival her entire situation
22 changed; she was forced to work up to 20 hours a day
23 without any pay, she was deprived of food, sleep and
24 subjected to sexual and physical abuse; immediately
25 her trafficker took away her passport; when she was

1
2 able to finally escape, she had to leave her passport
3 behind. Luckily she found her way to my office with
4 her birth certificate in hand, when I suggested that
5 we go and get a new passport for her, she said her
6 traffickers would find her, which they would have.
7 And so she spent all of this time living without ID,
8 which made her fearful to even walk on the street...
9 [bell] I guess I'm out of time to tell you about my
10 other clients, but this is really important for
11 victims of trafficking to be able to report crimes.
12 So many of my clients actually choose not to report
13 crimes to law enforcement because they don't have
14 proper identification, especially my clients who are
15 transgender, walking into any type of law enforcement
16 office [background comment] they basically choose not
17 to because of the fact that they don't have
18 identification that matches their gender.

19 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.
20 And again, all this testimony is gonna be brought in;
21 we're gonna analyze every single piece of it. Miss
22 Testone.

23 GLENNDA TESTONE: Good morning, my name
24 is Glenda Testone; I'm the Executive Director of the
25 New York City Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender

1
2 Community Center; thank you for allowing me to
3 testify today. The Center sees 6,000 unique
4 individuals a week from all over the City and the
5 number one thing that we see firsthand is the power
6 that this proposed legislation has to impact numerous
7 New Yorkers, including many of the LGBT community.

8 In particular I wanna talk today about
9 LGBT youth, immigrants and transgender people.
10 Transgender New Yorkers face unrelenting
11 discrimination and harassment and are placed at the
12 highest risk; they tell us every day about the
13 challenges that they face trying to obtain the most
14 basic but vital identification. This municipal ID
15 will allow transgender people to accurately self-
16 identify their gender; it's welcome, vital and
17 overdue. LGBT youth are over-represented among the
18 homeless population in New York City and many young
19 people are forced to run away from their homes
20 without any identification. [bell] LGBT immigrants
21 also face increased barriers to employment, along
22 with increased stigmatization and violence when they
23 don't have accurate ID documents that record their
24 legal status. The Center wholeheartedly supports
25 this municipal identification card as a powerful tool

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

to help some of the most vulnerable New Yorkers step out of the shadows, take better care of themselves and help eliminate the two New York's that we do have, the ones with [background comment] ID and the ones without, and I for one wanna say I look forward to getting my municipal ID.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Great.

GLENNDA TESTONE: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much for that enthusiastic support. And thank you so much for this panel [background comment] and for... make sure that we have your testimony as well.

Next panel, Annie Wang, Mark Noferi, Annie... Annie Wang, from the American Immigration Lawyers Association New York Chapter, and Mizue [background comment] Aizeki, Mizue Aizeki. Thank you so much. And the panel after that, we're gonna have Tawney Mill, Samuel Palmer-Simon, Lucia Gomez, and Gabriela Sandoval Requena. I hope I said those names correctly. And if we can start [background comments] now, maybe with Mizue.

MIZUE AIZEKI: Sure. Thank you very much for your time; I know you've taken a lot of time to listen to all our concerns. My name is Mizue Aizeki;

1
2 I'm with the Immigrant Defense Project and just to
3 really quickly summarize, I think that we all
4 understand that one of the primary ways someone can
5 get deported nowadays is by interaction with the
6 police and so to emphasize the importance, both of
7 the NYPD accepting this ID but not sacrificing the
8 very critical concerns about privacy, right, data-
9 sharing of information, it's a very big concern for
10 immigrant communities as well as the self-designated
11 gender; we think that people need to feel like they
12 own this idea and they're proud to have it. And the
13 other piece I just wanna alert as well; you know,
14 when we do our Know Your Rights trainings in the
15 community, having an ID that the police accept is
16 really critical; for many immigrants we also, in
17 terms of, you know, maybe preventing arrests or
18 deescalating, we wanna be clear to people that that's
19 not gonna prevent your arrest and once you get
20 brought into the precinct your risk of deportation is
21 equally as strong until we have a very robust
22 detainer policy in New York City. So thank you very
23 much [bell] for your time.

24 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you very
25 much for that enthusiastic support again. And I

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

wanted to remind everyone, if we can keep it quiet in the chambers please so we can hear the testimony; it's a real short testimony, but very powerful. Can we have the next person? Thank you.

MARK NOFERI: Thank you Council Member, I'm Mark Noferi of the Center for Migration Studies think tank and the New York City Bar Association.

Two clarifying points: (1) on implement... [interpose]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Can you talk into the mic closer?

MARK NOFERI: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Pull it closer to you.

MARK NOFERI: (1) on implementation -- the Council may want to amend this legislation to clarify the operational responsibilities here so that this program is ensconced beyond this administration's four years [background comments] -- this is on Page 4 and 5 of my testimony and San Francisco may be a good example here. The San Francisco legislation explicitly directs administration by the Clerk in explicit consultation with the Immigrant Rights Office, under the explicit

1 supervision of the City Administrator. Similar here,
2 New York could explicitly direct administration by
3 the Clerk or HRA or the boroughs, but with an
4 explicit role for MOIA and Commissioner Agarwal and
5 an explicit role for the Office of Operations,
6 although the Office of Operations does innovative
7 work, they don't have the capacity to process
8 potentially 200,000 applications, as they mentioned.
9 Additionally, the San Francisco legislation also
10 gives the Immigrant Affairs Office an explicit role
11 in coordinating with city agencies to promote the
12 card and develop multiple uses for it; (2) on
13 confidentiality -- we support Section 3.136, but the
14 Council could amend it to specifically direct
15 regulations to clarify the outstanding issues, and
16 there are several. For example, whether immigration
17 courts could subpoena ID card records in deportation
18 proceedings, whether these records are exempt under
19 the Freedom of Information Act; whether the City has
20 an obligation to disclose names, if not the records.
21 The San Francisco legislation specifically exempts
22 names as well as records; how long the city will keep
23 these records. All of these might be addressed by
24 regulations to clarify; other parts of the
25

1
2 legislation specifically provide for regulations and
3 Section 3.136 could as well. Thank you very much.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Mark for
5 that. And I think you hit some [bell] big points
6 that are on the table right now in discussion, so
7 we'll be in touch.

8 ANNIE WANG: Good afternoon... [interpose]

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Can you make sure
10 that the button is pressed?

11 ANNIE WANG: How's that?

12 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: That's perfect.
13 Thank you so much.

14 ANNIE WANG: Thank you. I'm Annie Wang,
15 Co-Chair of the Comprehensive Immigration Reform
16 Committee of the New York Chapter of the American
17 Immigration Lawyers Association. I don't want to add
18 to the eloquent testimony already given about the
19 need for an accessible and attractive ID card; I do
20 wanna mention that with regard to undocumented
21 immigrants who would benefit from this card, that
22 there is a unique challenge faced by undocumented
23 youths who were brought to this country at a young
24 age. Even though many of these youths would qualify
25 for deferred action for childhood arrivals, many of

1
2 these undocumented youths who should qualify for DACA
3 have a very difficult time proving that they have
4 been continuously present in the U.S. In addition,
5 if Congress were to pass immigration reform, [bell]
6 it's likely that any future legislation will require
7 similar evidence of continuous presence in the U.S.
8 Thank you for [background comment] allowing me to
9 contribute to this discussion.

10 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Well thank you for
11 much for contributing and again, we all wait for that
12 final federal moment of immigration reform that we've
13 all been fighting for. Thank you so much.

14 [background comments]

15 Next panel please, Miss Gabriela Sandoval
16 Requena from the Coalition for the Homeless -- please
17 correct me there if I did not read it correctly --
18 Lucia Gomez from La Fuente, Samuel Palmer-Simon and
19 Tawney Mill. [background comments] Are the rest of
20 you... anybody else here on this list? Okay, we're
21 gonna move on... we're gonna add to this panel,
22 [background comment] Nancy Magitzgar or Mogador from
23 Brooklyn, Rev. Getulio Cruz, Rev. Cruz, Manhattan
24 Together, Rogers from Picture the Homeless.

25 [background comments] Come on up. [background

1
2 comment] Okay, great; thank you so much. And
3 Rogers, can you begin and remember, one minute, if
4 you can end promptly. And you can begin, thank you
5 so much.

6 OWEN ROGERS: I am a member of Picture
7 the Homeless, a local nonprofit group that works with
8 thousands of homeless New Yorkers, many of whom are
9 marginalized because we don't have acceptable
10 identification to work a steady job or to have an
11 apartment. We are many thousands of New Yorkers who
12 need this proposed form of municipal identification.
13 We come from many places in the U.S. and overseas, we
14 come from prisons, we come from shelters, we come
15 from municipalities that don't document births in
16 records the way that New York City does. Some of us
17 came up through the foster care maze, we come from
18 the streets. What we have in common is that we all
19 need to be recognized and affirmed by the City of New
20 York and its agencies and to the businesses to whom
21 we turn for support. We need to be respected as well
22 by law enforcement, we are former felons, we are
23 street homeless people; we're immigrants. All of us
24 are New Yorkers who are running into governmental
25 obstacles when we try to open a bank account, to rent

1
2 a room, apartment; register for school. I used to
3 work for the Police Department in the City of New
4 York; they have my fingerprints and documents on
5 file, [bell] but without documentation that they will
6 not give to me, I am one of the people who needs
7 municipal ID.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much
9 for that. And I just wanna make a quick reminder,
10 for anyone who has already given us your slips,
11 everyone will be testifying today, so don't leave;
12 everyone will have a chance to testify. Next.

13 NANCY MAGESON: My name is Nancy Mageson
14 [sp?] and I would like to speak today about how
15 municipal IDs can be utilized to make New York City
16 transit more accessible to riders with invisible
17 disabilities.

18 Currently the MTA complies with the ADA
19 by asking able-bodied riders to give up their seats
20 to those with disabilities; this works when a
21 disability is plainly evident, but for those with
22 invisible disabilities, this compliance strategy
23 fails. When I haven't needed my seat I have tried to
24 decide if other passengers did, but it is very hard
25 to discern whether someone is chronically ill,

1
2 suffers from a weakened immune system or cancer, is
3 feeling ill from the first months of pregnancy or has
4 an injury or disability that makes standing painful
5 or difficult, nor should passengers be expected to
6 intuit this information. The voluntary city ID for
7 people with invisible disabilities would begin to
8 address this gap in accessibility; the ID would
9 require medical documentation, have a clearly printed
10 expiration date and use a logo, perhaps the
11 wheelchair icon; it could be work on a chain or
12 strings or carried by hand. I believe that the
13 majority of New Yorkers would, like me, willingly
14 give up their seats if they knew that others truly
15 needed one. Under the current system, riding public
16 transit can be stressful, painful or simply
17 impossible for those with invisible disabilities,
18 never knowing if a seat will be available; [bell] is
19 in no way compliant with the ADA; New Yorkers with
20 injuries, illness or disabilities should not have to
21 rely on their negotiating savvy or on good luck in
22 order to be able to ride public transit. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much,
24 and we... can we make sure we have a copy of that too?
25 Great. Thank you.

1
2 GABRIELA SANDOVAL REQUENA: Hi, my name
3 is Gabriela Sandoval Requena, Policy Analyst for
4 Coalition for the Homeless... [interpose]

5 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Requena.

6 GABRIELA SANDOVAL REQUENA: and the
7 Coalition would like to, first of all, thank the City
8 Council and the Committee on Immigration for this
9 opportunity to testify in support of the municipal ID
10 program. Many New Yorkers who are homeless are not
11 able to obtain one, even if they're able to gather
12 all the documentation and the money to cover the cost
13 they're simply not able because of their lack of
14 fixed residence. So needless to say, creating a
15 municipal identification program that addresses the
16 need of New Yorkers regardless of their housing
17 status will improve the quality of life of homeless
18 individuals and families [sic] tremendously. We
19 strongly support this initiative and we look forward
20 to working with the Administration and the Committee
21 to ensure that the implementation includes rules
22 around proof of residency and waiver of fees that
23 would make new municipal ID cards accessible to all
24 homeless New Yorkers who need it. Thanks.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much
3 again. Can you reset the clock? Thank you.
4 Reverend.

5 REV. CRUZ: I am Reverend... I am Rev.
6 Getulio Cruz, pastor of [bell] Monte Sion Christian
7 Church on the Lower East Side, I'm also a leader in
8 Manhattan Together and Metro IAF. We are a network
9 of 100 diverse member congregations and other
10 organizations in New York City. My fellow clergy in
11 Metro IAF and in other churches in my council, the
12 Assembly of Christian Churches, have heard too many
13 stories of people's lives being disrupted by the lack
14 of recognized ID; this is why some Metro IAF member
15 organizations started to produce their own IDs; we
16 have worked with the police and other agencies in our
17 communities to ensure they recognize these local IDs.
18 We strongly support the City producing its own ID
19 that all New Yorkers can get. We also know these IDs
20 must be distributed in the right way. Metro IAF is
21 ready to work with the Mayor, Council, the police and
22 the rest of the City to ensure these IDs are designed
23 in a professional manner that will be useful to a
24 wide variety of New Yorkers. We want to encourage
25 thousands of our members to sign up for IDs; if it

1
2 can be done securely, we would love to have City
3 officials come to our congregations and perhaps
4 [bell] public libraries to sign people up.

5 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And we will be
6 there in your and everybody else's congregations, and
7 you're absolutely right, that the word needs to get
8 out in outreach. So thank you so much for each of
9 your pieces of testimony and we'll be in touch with
10 you and again, make sure that we have copies of what
11 you used to testify.

12 Next we wanna call up Lauren Burke from
13 Atlas, Sunset Park, Yolanda Castro, Dr. Kirk Anthony
14 James, and Laurie Izutsu for this panel. And the
15 panel after that we'll have Gene Judy [sp?) from the
16 Premier Baptist Haitian, [background comments] Joseph
17 Rosenberg, [background comments, laughter] Diane
18 Steinman from the Interfaith Network, Jeffrey Weiss
19 from Assemblyman Ortiz' office. [background
20 comments] And I just wanna acknowledge our Council
21 Member from Brooklyn, Jumaane Williams, is here as
22 well... [background comment] okay -- who will say a few
23 words; we're gonna clock you at one minute.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you for
25 allowing me; I was chairing another hearing, so I

1
2 couldn't be here early, but this issue is very
3 important to me. I wanna thank you and Council
4 Member Dromm for taking the leadership on this. A
5 lot of people ask why I haven't signed on yet; it's
6 not because... I'm fully supportive of the issue. I do
7 have one concern that I know might've been mentioned
8 here, which is just making sure... I think it was
9 mentioned, that it doesn't become a scarlet letter,
10 that really concerns me; I wanna make sure that the
11 ID is something that all New Yorkers can use for
12 something or the other; that's very important to me.
13 Just anecdotally, my brother, I learned much later in
14 life, was not a citizen, he was over 50 when I
15 realized and that was because his mother died and he
16 could not go to the funeral, so these issues are
17 issues that really hit home to me.

18 And lastly, I wanna make a plug to
19 anybody who's listening, the Caribbean community has
20 been largely missing from this discussion and I think
21 out Latino brothers and sisters for really taking the
22 helm, but I'm pushing everyone who this will affect
23 to really get their voice be heard, because it
24 touches a lot more, even more than the thousands of
25 people already who have been screaming and yelling,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

so I wanna make sure that everybody who is an immigrant and have immigrant families get involved in this discussion. Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Council Member. And if we can begin here on the left-hand side, please. Thank you. Ma'am.

LAURIE IZUTSU: Oh, sorry... Okay, sorry.
[laughter, crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Sorry; you're... you're... you're up. One minute.

LAURIE IZUTSU: Okay. Good afternoon, my name is Laurie Izutsu and I'm a Senior Staff Attorney with Brooklyn Legal Services. My office is a part of Legal Services NYC, the country's largest provider...
[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Can you speak closer to the mic, so... so we can...

LAURIE IZUTSU: sure... for low-income individuals and families. Thank you for the opportunity to provide testimony today. One population I would like to highlight that would be substantially impacted by the ID cards is survivors and victims of domestic violence. The creation of a municipal identify card program enhances the capacity

1
2 for undocumented domestic violence victims to
3 establish independence from their abusers by improved
4 access to financial services and the ability to sign
5 a lease. Additionally, the program would ease the
6 ability of those without state-issued identification
7 to interact with the police and the criminal justice
8 system, an important measure where often survivors of
9 domestic violence are retraumatized by the very
10 agencies from which they seek help. It is clear
11 based on these circumstances and the testimony you've
12 heard already that the need for municipal ID cards is
13 great; however, I would like to emphasize that it is
14 not just a matter of language access with [bell]
15 implantation of the ID program, but immigrants with
16 limited English proficiency won't reap the full
17 benefits if the City's language access policy isn't
18 also consistently and effectively implemented along
19 with that. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. Thank
21 you for that.

22 YOLANDA CASTRO: Hello, good afternoon.
23 My name is Yolanda Castro; on behalf of the Mexican
24 Consulate we thank you for allowing us to testify
25 today; we are the agency that issues the consular ID

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

cards that have been referred to here by other testimonies; I just wanna let you know that we are... for our government is paramount importance as our consular ID cards are regarded as a safeguard and secure document and form of identification. We issue them to our citizens; last year we issued 35,000 of these IDs, because we know how important and strategic it is for them to have a form of ID for any type of business and even for survivor matters, so we are very happy to have this new initiative being brought and we are happy to open up and discuss whatever the security characteristics of our consular security ID bears, because we wanna make them available for... we've [bell] been working very hard to make them available and secure for everybody and we are open for discussion if you need it. 'Kay.
[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. Miss Castro, one question... [crosstalk]

YOLANDA CASTRO: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: the 35,000 IDs that you've issued out; is that a New York number or is that a national number?

1
2 YOLANDA CASTRO: No, it's just only in
3 the New York area.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: New York City..
5 incredible. [crosstalk]

6 YOLANDA CASTRO: Yeah, it's... the ID, the
7 consular IDs are issued [coughing] to citizens that
8 live in our jurisdiction...

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Right.

10 YOLANDA CASTRO: so in the whole United
11 States it's around one million... [crosstalk]

12 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: That's amazing.

13 YOLANDA CASTRO: consular ID cards, and
14 in some states are even used to get driver's license,
15 because they have been officially admitted. So we
16 continue to work towards... with agencies,
17 organizations and we are, you know, welcome any
18 inquiry and in the handouts you can see the very high
19 security traits these... [crosstalk]

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And on the high
21 security... sorry to interrupt... this is something that
22 you've been in contact in coordination with our city
23 agencies, including the NYPD; is that right?

24 YOLANDA CASTRO: That's correct, we... we...
25 [crosstalk]

1 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Okay.

2 YOLANDA CASTRO: do seminars and we do a
3 lot of workshops and presentations and we're always
4 welcoming whoever wants to know about them, we will...
5 we happily make a presentation and [interpose]

6 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Right.

7 YOLANDA CASTRO: answer any questions.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much
9 for being here today.

10 YOLANDA CASTRO: Thank you.

11 LAUREN BURKE: Hi. Hello, thank you for
12 having us. My name is Lauren Burke; I'm the
13 Executive Director of Atlas: DIY (Developing
14 Immigrant Youth), and both my office and my home are
15 located in District 38, so raise the roof to District
16 38. [laugh] Atlas: DIY represents transgender young
17 people, homeless young people, undocumented young
18 people; everybody who's brought up today who would
19 benefit from the issuance of these ID cards. I also
20 have a secret; I have been using my Massachusetts
21 State ID card for the past eight years, due to the
22 fact that I do not have the documents I need because
23 of expiration, divorce, losing cards, etc. So if I
24 myself, a very privileged attorney, 30-year-old
25

1
2 citizen of New York City could utilize these, so
3 could everyone else. I also wanna offer that Atlas:
4 DIY is ready and excited to be a site that these
5 could be issued through; we have notaries and
6 attorneys on staff, we speak Spanish, English,
7 Mandarin, Urdu, and I know that so many other
8 community-based organizations would be thrilled and
9 love to be an organization that could be seen as a
10 host site. Lastly, this is a away to make all New
11 Yorkers feel like they belong to this great city,
12 it's a place that I've wanted to belong since I was
13 12, and so I'm very excited to finally have an ID
14 that proves it. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Well said. Well
16 said. [bell] Thank you so much for that.

17 MALE VOICE: Hi, I'm here on behalf of
18 the Fortune Society, which serves over 4,000 citizens
19 coming home from prisons and jails across New York
20 City. Many folks leave prisons lacking ID, yet
21 they're expected to obtain jobs, housing and health
22 care without any ID. The municipal ID program must
23 be available to them by way of their discharge
24 papers, meaning that as they leave prison the
25 discharge paper should be enough to obtain an ID and

1
2 that the chances of these men and women, mothers,
3 fathers, and sisters, their success and integration
4 into the community would be greatly compromised.
5 Many opponents of the municipal ID speak of the
6 possibility of ID fraud, yet the New York State Penal
7 Law already protects other IDs from those measures,
8 and again, the municipal ID program will allow people
9 leaving from prison to obtain the basic human rights
10 guaranteed under the constitution; it will also
11 continue to create a safer New York by allowing
12 formerly incarcerated people to access the tools
13 necessary to become contributing members of our city.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you again.

15 And our final panel member. [background comment]
16 Panel two. Okay. [bell]

17 DIANE STEINMAN: Good afternoon, I'm
18 Diane Steinman; I'm the Director of the New York
19 State Interfaith Network for Immigration Reform,
20 which is a religiously, racially and ethnically
21 diverse network of faith leaders and organizations
22 that advocates for just and humane comprehensive
23 immigration reform and municipal laws that treat all
24 immigrants, regardless of status, with fairness,
25 justice and compassion and based on our values, we

1
2 are proud to join the many testifiers who are
3 supporting the creation of a municipal ID and the
4 strategies to promote its widespread use by the
5 diverse communities that need this ID in order to
6 become part of the mainstream of city life. I do
7 wanna amplify one point that the Speaker made this
8 morning; at this watershed moment in the future of
9 our democracy, when many elected officials in
10 Washington and around the country are driven by
11 political self-interest and negative attitudes toward
12 undocumented immigrants, the poor and the
13 marginalized, they're driven by those attitudes to
14 pass laws that do them harm and prevent passage of
15 laws that would do them good. Passing the New York
16 City ID law at this moment would serve as a
17 repudiation of their toxic attitudes and harmful
18 actions and an affirmation that public policies must
19 satisfy the moral requirements to treat all who live
20 among us with dignity, justice and compassion, thus
21 presenting an alternative model for federal, state
22 and local lawmakers to emulate in the critical days
23 ahead.

24 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much
25 for that. And if we can... [background comments] And

1
2 the next panel's names, while you get ready, is Miss
3 Hally Chu, who will be reading testimony on behalf of
4 Gale Brewer, our Borough President, Louis Quinones,
5 Dr. Paule Cruz Takash and Ethan Carr from MasterCard
6 Worldwide. And you can begin. [interpose]

7 JEFF WEISS: I will try to finish up this
8 panel with less than a New York minute. My name is
9 Jeff Weiss; I'm counsel to Assemblyman Felix Ortiz
10 from Sunset Park, Cobble Hill, Bay Ridge, Borough
11 Park, Red Hook; the same district as the Chairman.
12 I'll make two points; that Assemblyman Ortiz is in
13 Albany today in session, but in his capacity in
14 Albany chairs the Puerto Rican and Hispanic Caucus,
15 has a bill in Albany to provide non-resident New
16 Yorkers with a driver's license based on certain
17 federal criteria; he's also a member of the National
18 Conference of State Legislatures Immigration Task
19 Force and has been working in Washington with other
20 states on issues similar to this which he strongly
21 supports and asked me to let you know that he stands
22 ready to work with the Council in Albany and in
23 Washington to achieve the same goals and to thank you
24 very much.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much
3 for that support and send our best.

4 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Good afternoon, I'm
5 Joseph Rosenberg; I'm the Executive Director of the
6 Catholic Community Relations Council, a not-for-
7 profit corporation established by the Archdiocese of
8 New York and the Diocese of Brooklyn to represent the
9 church on local legislative and policy matters. I'm
10 pleased to be here to testify strongly in support of
11 Int. 253. By providing the ability for immigrants to
12 obtain identification cards to access government
13 services, this bill will vastly improve the lives of
14 so many residents of our city. We're a city of
15 immigrants, many of us second and third generation;
16 the tradition continues in the instance of the more
17 recent arrivals to our city who will benefit from
18 this bill. The Catholic Church has long been in the
19 forefront of immigration reform and services to
20 immigration communities regardless of one's place of
21 origin or religious beliefs; this legislation will go
22 far in embracing this population.

23 The mission of the Catholic migration
24 services of the Diocese of Brooklyn is to empower
25 underserved immigrant communities in Brooklyn and

1
2 Queens regardless of religion or ethnicity, their
3 immigrant tenancy advocacy program provides free in-
4 person housing services to help low-income immigrant
5 tenants in their fight for decent, affordable
6 housing. The division of immigrant services for the
7 archdiocese provides a similar comprehensive range of
8 [bell] services, not just in Manhattan, Bronx, but in
9 boroughs upstate, they assist more than 100,000
10 individuals annually, they offer over 55 English as
11 second language courses and [background comment] and
12 provide free legal assistance on deportation
13 proceedings along those lines. They also have a
14 hotline that answers 25,000 calls annually
15 [background comment] in 17 different languages; in
16 short, we embrace this bill, we embrace your
17 leadership for bringing it and we hope that it is
18 soon enacted and signed by the Mayor. Thank you very
19 much.

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Well and thank you
21 for that. And let's call the next panel; I'll make a
22 comment, but we recently stood, I think in Corona,
23 Queens with you and other advocates in making sure
24 that immigrants always have a way to connect; this is
25 just another way to do that with an identification

1
2 card, but our faith leaders and organizations have
3 always been an incredible connector and we need you
4 all to be part of this team and this task force that
5 will make this happen. So thank you so much for
6 coming today.

7 I'm gonna call the next panel up, Ethan...
8 Ethan Carr, MasterCard Worldwide, Dr. Paule Cruz-
9 Takash from the Oakland ID Prepaid SF Global, Louis
10 Quinones, Teamsters -- Teamster are in the house --
11 and Hally Chu from Gale Brewer. [background comment]
12 A reminder, we have one minute and I'll be asking you
13 to keep it to one minute, thank you so much.

14 [background comments] If we can begin at the left
15 here, and make sure to speak into the mic. We have
16 one minute; thank you so much.

17 LOUIS QUINONES: Hi, my name is Louis
18 Quinones; I'm here on behalf of George Miranda,
19 President of Teamsters Joint Council 16; I will read
20 a statement of President Miranda.

21 "Teamsters Joint Council 16 represents
22 120,000 members over the New York area. The New York
23 City Teamsters support municipal identification cards
24 for any New Yorker, regardless of immigration status.
25 This proposal from Mayor de Blasio, Speaker Mark-

1
2 Viverito, Council Member Dromm and Council Member
3 Menchaca makes sense for a diverse city. Ours is a
4 city of immigrants; with our immigrant community, not
5 only would we lose the art, culture, food and values
6 that make us New Yorkers, our city would literally
7 cease to exist. Immigrants, many of them
8 undocumented, do the jobs that run New York; they do
9 them without the rights and recognition from the city
10 they deserve. The reality for many of our
11 undocumented neighbors is one of exclusion. They can
12 send their children to the public schools, but cannot
13 visit them. They can earn money, but cannot open a
14 bank account to keep it safe. They can call the
15 police, but cannot identify themselves to an officer.
16 With municipal ID cards, undocumented and other New
17 Yorkers will have access to banks, schools, other
18 public and private buildings [bell] and essential
19 services. You have the support of the New York City
20 Teamsters in making the proposal law."

21 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.

22 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: Thank you, uhm...

23 [interpose]

24 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Make sure that the
25 red button's on.

1 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: Red button is on.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.

3 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: Thank you. My

4 name is Dr. Paule Cruz-Takash; I am one of the two

5 intellectual architects of the Oakland City ID and

6 the Richmond City ID prepaid debit card, which is

7 also a MasterCard; we incubated this card in our

8 research center at UCLA, we are activist scholars and

9 we also created a company in order to carry the

10 platform that would allow us to offer low-cost

11 financial services to poor and low-income folks of

12 all nationalities and backgrounds and we are the

13 company that was contracted by the City of Oakland

14 and the City of Richmond; we're about to open up our

15 offices in the City of Richmond; we also are

16 contracted by Casa de Maryland, which is one of the

17 largest immigrant service organizations in the

18 country. Casa de Maryland understood that this issue

19 goes beyond a need for ID, that's a critical ID, but

20 they contracted with us because they said the banks

21 have not responded to the municipal ID cards that are

22 out there and that we need to be able to provide our

23 folks with a low-cost financial alternative [bell].

24 I wanted to bring attention to the costs; our company

25

1
2 officers this service in the City of Oakland and
3 Richmond at no cost to the City or to the taxpayers
4 and... [interpose]

5 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

6 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: so I also wanted
7 to say that the San Francisco supervisor estimated
8 that it cost them about \$200,000, but their City
9 Clerk that implements this program has estimated that
10 the card costs about \$70 per card for that city
11 [background comment] to implement. You all are
12 talking about... [interpose]

13 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, do you
14 have... uh just...

15 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: multiple sites
16 and also city staff that would be required to
17 implement that program, [background comment] so you
18 are talking about a huge, huge budget, not only to
19 implement this program, but to sustain it over time,
20 [interpose]

21 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

22 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: so we would work...
23 [crosstalk]

24 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And if you have...
25 if you have...

1
2 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: welcome the
3 opportunity to work with you.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Yeah, thank you,
5 and especially, you have testimony that talks about
6 those pricings, we'd love to see that analysis.

7 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: Yes. Thank you.
8 [crosstalk]

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.

10 ETHAN CARR: Good afternoon everyone; I'm
11 Ethan Carr with MasterCard Worldwide; it's a pleasure
12 to be here with you today. [interpose]

13 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you for
14 being here.

15 ETHAN CARR: Okay. What I wanna talk
16 about, basically I wanna ask the question -- we would
17 like you to consider the financial option as you go
18 forward with this program, [background comment]
19 because we believe it will give greater access to not
20 only city services, but also financial services to
21 your residents. We see all over the country where
22 the governments are at all levels adopting the pre-
23 paid card solution and to look at reducing costs,
24 save money, add convenience and make it more
25 efficient for the organization. Since 1990

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

governments have increasingly migrated to direct deposit and pre-paid cards as a way to distribute over \$140 billion in payments; this include in the form of grants, unemployment, child support, all kinds of means of government disbursement. We think you'd do a great service to your residents if you give them the ability to be included in that financial service spectrum by allowing them to have that option to get disbursed benefits on the card.

[bell]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you for that and thank you for being here.

HALLY CHU: Hi, good afternoon; my name is Hally Chu and thank you for the opportunity to testify on behalf of Borough President Gale Brewer of Manhattan. I'm just gonna summarize some of her recommendations which already have been mentioned by a lot of other people. First is that municipal IDs must not become the de facto form of identification for just undocumented and just to provide being stigmatized and the Borough President recommends a host of different services attached to the card, which you've already heard. Second is, municipal IDs need to have NYPD support and that includes a lot of

1
2 safety measures and security that is incorporated
3 into the municipal ID card. And third and also
4 fourth, the municipal IDs must first not be too
5 costly for citizens to... for New Yorkers to obtain and
6 also not too difficult. So the cost, as you can see
7 some other cities have implemented a sliding scale,
8 and also difficulty, in terms of language access,
9 [bell] the Borough President strongly encourages uses
10 community-based organizations to help with that. So
11 thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you for the
13 voice of the Borough President and send her our best.
14 Thank you so much to this panel. We're gonna call
15 the next panel up and before I do that I wanna just
16 recognize we've been joined by Council Member Rose
17 and Council Member Rodriguez. Gene Judy, Bishop
18 Findlayter from CUSH, Rev. Terry Troia, Project
19 Hospitality, Rev. Liam O'Doherty from Our Lady of
20 Good Counsel Parish. [background comments]

21 And our final panel is Daniel Rose, Dr.
22 Raul Hinjosa and Freddy Martinez from LSA, Manhattan
23 Together. [background comment] But let's have our
24 first panel speak and we'll start over here from the
25 left. Please introduce yourself; make sure that the

1 mic is on [background comments], red light.

2 [background comments] Thank you.

3
4 REV. TERRY TROIA: Hi, uhm... [background
5 comment] thank you for having me; I'm Rev. Terry
6 Troia, Director of Project Hospitality and I sit on
7 the Board of Directors of El Centro del Immigrante in
8 Staten Island, and hello to our Councilperson, Debi
9 Rose and all the other council people, thank you for
10 having us here. I've worked for more than 30 years
11 with homeless people on Staten Island; there is a
12 group of chronic homeless people in the City of New
13 York, mostly elderly with memory loss who cannot move
14 out of shelters because of lack of appropriate
15 documentation. Even in the aftermath of Hurricane
16 Sandy on Staten Island we served non-immigrant
17 families in the city's evacuation center and in FEMA
18 hotels who did not have sufficient identification to
19 apply for necessary services. A municipal ID card
20 similar to programs set up in other cities would
21 really help us move forward for getting chronic
22 homeless people with severe impairments some level of
23 service and housing. I can cite many examples of
24 local Staten Island residents, mostly impoverished,
25 who have been detained, arrested and held at the

1
2 precinct because they did not have an ID for these
3 reasons -- they were sleeping in an abandoned
4 building or sleeping in a garage or riding a bicycle
5 on the sidewalk or taking a used newspaper out of a
6 garbage can on the Staten Island Ferry or calling the
7 police to report an incident of domestic violence.

8 [bell] Poor people, disabled people, elderly
9 persons, persons with profound memory loss and
10 immigrants who are out of status are among those who
11 bear the suffering of being hauled in, disappeared
12 into our criminal justice system [interpose]

13 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

14 REV. TERRY TROIA: for not having an ID.
15 Thank you for... I... we support Int. 253 with the
16 support and cooperation of the NYPD to protect the
17 civil rights of our neighbors.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And thanks again
19 for coming in today; we'll make sure to take your
20 testimony.

21 LIAM O'DOHERTY: 'Kay. Yes, I am Liam
22 O'Doherty; I'm pastor of Our Lady of Good Counsel
23 Church in Staten Island and also a member of Staten
24 Island Clergy Leadership. Staten Island has the
25 largest percentage increase in immigrant population

1
2 in the City of New York and a large percentage of
3 these law-abiding citizens of our borough and our
4 city do not have acceptable means of documentation
5 for police stops. For instance, Carlos, not his real
6 name, an elderly man and insulin-dependent diabetic,
7 who collects empty cans for money was arrested for
8 collecting cans in a supermarket cart he had found in
9 an abandoned lot; he was arrested for theft of the
10 cart, he did not have ID; he spent a few days in
11 jail; his family attempted repeatedly to give the
12 police his insulin, but without his insulin he fell
13 into a diabetic coma, ended up in ICU chained to a
14 bed with police assigned to guard his room. After an
15 outcry from the community, the Parish of St. Mary's
16 of the Assumption, in backdoor meetings with the
17 local precinct captain, who explained that he was
18 being held because he did not have acceptable ID.
19 The precinct had agreed to release Carlos from
20 custody; Carlos almost died. It would have been an
21 unbearably high price to pay for the right to feed
22 his family. For the life of Carlos and for the lives
23 of all immigrants like him, I urge you to make this
24 program a reality. Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.

BISHOP ORLANDO FINDLAYTER: Good

afternoon, my name is Bishop Orlando Findlayter; I'm the Chairman of Churches United to Save and Heal, a clergy organization primarily of Caribbean American and African American pastors. We are proud supporters of the rights of all citizens, including those who are undocumented. We applaud Council Member Carlos Menchaca for introducing the Municipal ID bill and we urge members of this body to support the bill, vote for it and let's make municipal ID a reality in New York City. Too many hard-working New Yorkers can't open a bank account, can't enter City buildings, have difficulty registering their children in schools and are fearful every day of being stopped without the ability to produce a valid, government-issued ID. Municipal ID is a step in the right direction for this City; it will restore dignity to hundreds of thousands of our neighbors who have been marginalized by the nation's broken immigration system. We represent the faith community who is overwhelmingly supporting this bill; it is our belief that this a moral issue; every citizen deserves the right to have an ID [bell] and so we urge to pass this bill. Thank you.

[laugh]

GENE JUDY: Thank you, Chairman and the members of the Committee. My name is Gene Judy from the First Nation Baptist Church; I want to thank the pastors and the secretary and the administration who accompany me today. The NYC needs a general ID to ensure that everybody in New York can be easily identified. Secondly, it will help all New Yorkers to have something in common, regardless of their immigration status. Third, ID card with a waiver component will reduce the stress level of the homeless population, which constantly needs to fight to identify themselves because they have lost their document after losing their bed. Last; not the least, NYC ID will help the undocumented residents to hold a legal document they can call theirs and by simulation they will feel 100 percent New Yorkers. Research shows that it takes seven years for an immigrant to accept their adoptive land; by issuing the ID card you will reduce the stress level on the immigration and help them to integrate the society less than seven years. [bell] Thank you for listening.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much
3 to this panel again. And we'll be in touch with you
4 and all faith leaders really that are coming to us
5 with support. And our final panel, Daniel Rose from
6 MasterCard, Dr. Raul... yes... Dr. Raul Hinjosa; Freddy
7 Martinez from LSA. And we've been joined by Council
8 Member Brad Lander, Council Member Mark Levine and I
9 think I already mentioned, but Council Member Debi
10 Rose [background comment] from Staten Island.
11 [background comments]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Mr. Chairman,
13 thank you so much for your leadership on this; it's
14 wonderful to be a part of this historic hearing and I
15 appreciate all the testimony; the leadership that you
16 and Council Member Dromm and the Speaker are
17 providing in making this move forward to reality.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, thank
19 you so much Council Member Lander. And we'll give an
20 opportunity for Council Members to say... quick moment
21 at the end, after this panel. Let's begin.

22 PROF. RAUL HINJOSA: How do you do,
23 members of the Council? I am Professor Raul Hinjosa
24 at UCLA; I'm also the CEO of Liberation Card
25 Services, which is a company dedicated to exactly

1
2 what we're talking about here, empowering the
3 undocumented and empowering the unbanked throughout
4 cities and we are now actively doing ID cards with
5 banking services built in in California, which I flew
6 out to talk with you for a minute for, but I
7 appreciate the opportunity. We think that the
8 solution that we have now spearheaded in California
9 in the last year is the solution for New York,
10 particularly for the type of issues that were raised
11 here, the scarlet letter issue. While there's half-
12 a-million undocumented in New York, there's almost a
13 million under-banked and people that don't have
14 access to proper identification; that's the way you
15 do it, through a combination of an ID card with an
16 advanced set of financial services at the same time.
17 Second thing, the cost issue is extremely important;
18 [bell] I don't think that it's been even given good,
19 adequate information. What we're seeing in the case
20 of the cities where they -- both New Haven and San
21 Francisco -- they require huge government subsidy;
22 what we have done is not only have extremely low...
23 basically zero cost to the city [background comment]
24 for the implementation of this, but also providing
25

1
2 financial services, which are the lowest in the
3 country in terms of being able to access... [crosstalk]

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

5 PROF. RAUL HINJOSA: zero fee options for
6 people that have this. [crosstalk]

7 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

8 PROF. RAUL HINJOSA: Finally, the issue
9 -- it's not just Macy's that you wanna get involved
10 in this; we provide a mechanism whereby all local
11 businesses can also participate in this program, all
12 built through something that everybody also has in
13 their pockets, which is [background comment] a mobile
14 phone, which is the future, and so I suggest you look
15 at that alternative at the same time that you look at
16 the others. [interpose]

17 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And we... and we
18 definitely will. And if there's anything you wanna
19 give us... I know you gave us a packet, thank you so
20 much for that.

21 DANIEL ROSE: Good afternoon; I'm Daniel
22 Rose; I'm from MasterCard, the payments network. I
23 think that the idea, the concept of the ID card is a
24 homerun, so I think... congratulate you on that; I
25 think it's a winner. However, I think you're missing

1
2 an opportunity and I'm gonna, you know, piggyback off
3 of what Dr. Raul Hincosa said, that I think financial
4 inclusion is an important aspect that could be
5 addressed with the same initiative. Here in the New
6 York City area, in the New York City metropolitan
7 area, the FDIC did an under-banked study; about 24
8 percent of the households in the metropolitan... in the
9 New York City area are under-banked, so they don't
10 have access to the financial mainstream. I believe
11 by... and you coupling the payment functionality with
12 the ID card that you'll hit a homerun and address a
13 lot of issues that a lot of these under-banked
14 families have today.

15 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you for
16 that.

17 FREDDY CRUZ MARTINEZ: So good afternoon
18 everyone. My name is Freddy Cruz Martinez; I'm a
19 volunteer leader with Little Sisters of the
20 Assumption Family Health Services, Manhattan Together
21 and Metro IAF, so finally I'm here to testify. Eight
22 years ago, while coming home from late work, I was
23 stopped by the police; they asked, "Do you hear the
24 gunshot?" I said, "No." They asked to see my ID and
25 I show my Mexican consular ID, [background comment]

1
2 they said this is fake; [background comment] I was
3 afraid because I thought that they would take me to
4 the jail; fortunately, all they did was search me,
5 asked me a few questions and let me go, but others
6 haven't been so lucky. We've heard many story of
7 people in our community that have been taken to the
8 prisons for hours when they couldn't produce an ID
9 that the police recognize. So like Metro IAF, member
10 congregations, we at Little Sisters, we [bell]
11 started produce our own IDs like the police
12 recognize. A local credit union even lets people
13 open up an account with them.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Right.

15 FREDDY CRUZ MARTINEZ: Yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: So thank you, and
17 we wanna make sure to take that testimony and again,
18 thank you for your own personal experience and really
19 giving us a sense of what we've been hearing
20 throughout the entire hearings. So thank you to this
21 panel. [crosstalk]

22 FREDDY CRUZ MARTINEZ: Great.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much
24 to this panel. And we're gonna... I'm gonna allow for
25

1
2 Council Member Rose to say a few words and then I'm
3 gonna close up and say thank you to all.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you so much,
5 Chair and I will be brief. I just want to thank you
6 so much for pushing this legislation along; several
7 years ago in my district we had a proliferation of
8 bias crimes against undocumented Mexican residents in
9 my district and we found that one of the major causes
10 were, they were crimes of opportunity, because the
11 day laborers were carrying all of their cash on them
12 because they had no safe way of keeping their funds
13 secure, and because they lacked identification they
14 were not able to open up bank accounts, and so in
15 conjunction with the Mexican Consulate, we, I
16 believe, started the first precursor by getting them
17 at least their Mexican ID so that they have
18 identification and we brokered a deal with the banks
19 to accept that ID so that they could then open up
20 their accounts. And we have subsequently not had
21 anymore of those type of bias crimes. And so we've
22 seen the [background comments] benefit of ID, but ID
23 is important to everyone because it will change the
24 economic disparities in communities where people lack
25 ID. And what happens is, people have to go to

1
2 predatory services, they have to go to check cashing
3 places, they have to go [bell] to rent-a-centers,
4 they have to go to places where they get less for
5 their dollar and it perpetuates the financial
6 inequities. So I wanna thank you so much, Chairman
7 Menchaca for, you know, pushing this legislation
8 forward.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much,
10 Council Member Rose. And really, I think what that
11 says is that so much of this work has really happened
12 even before this session started with so many of our
13 senior council members in the City Council and what I
14 wanna do is just let you know for the record that the
15 Central American Legal Assistance Group, the New York
16 Legal Assistance Group, Safe Horizon, New York City
17 Gay and Lesbian Antiviolence Project, the Coalition
18 for Asian American Children and Families, SEIU 32BJ,
19 NYS Interfaith Network also dropped off testimony for
20 the record. I wanna thank the incredible staff that
21 has put so much time; you heard earlier that day one
22 I came in with the strength of horses really to push
23 this forward, but this would not have happened if it
24 wasn't for Julian Beckford, Jennifer Montalvo [sp?]
25 on the Committee staff, Lee Wellington, my Chief of

1
2 Staff, Mary Brooke from my office as well, Ivan
3 Luevanos and Faisal Ali, who just joined us,
4 Sebastian McGuire from Danny Dromm's office, and so
5 many more of the Speaker's office that have put so
6 many hours in analyzing this information and will
7 continue to analyze everything we've heard today.
8 And so really in closing, what I wanna say is that
9 you've heard today no just from organizations and
10 advocates, you've heard from New Yorkers at the
11 beginning, you've heard from the Administration, the
12 Operations and MOIA about the commitment that both
13 the City Council and the Mayor have to making this
14 happen; everyone is at the table under the pillars of
15 this entire project that range from safety and fraud
16 protection and making sure that people have access,
17 not just at our immigrant New Yorkers' base, but
18 really everybody that wants to be able to connect and
19 unify around this card is understood and we're gonna
20 keep on moving forward, this is our first hearing and
21 we're gonna come back to you with more information
22 and analysis as we move forward. So with that I'm
23 gonna say thank you so much for staying; I know we
24 over-stood our stay and I hope you stay for the next
25 hearing, chaired by our Chairman of Transportation,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON IMMIGRATION

191

Ydanis Rodriguez. Thank you so much and this concludes our hearing.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 19, 2014