

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS,
PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME USES

----- X

April 23, 2014
Start: 11:00 a.m.
Recess: 12:00 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers
250 Broadway - Hearing Room,
16th Fl

B E F O R E:
PETER A. KOO
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Annabel Palma
Ben Kallos
Inez D. Barron
Maria Del Carmen Arroyo
Rosie Mendez
Stephen T. Levin

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Kate Daly
Executive Director
Landmarks Preservation Commission

Latisha James
City Council Member and Public Advocate

Michelle Abulu
Historic Districts Council

Leray Brown, Senior Vice President
Strategic Planning
Community Health and Intergovernmental
Relations

Joanna Oplustil, President and CEO
CAMBA and CAMBA Housing Ventures

Diane-Louard Michel
Corporation of Supportive Housing

2 [background discussion]

3 CHAIRPERSON KOO: [gavel] Good morning.

4 COUNCIL MEMBERS: Good afternoon.

5 CHAIRPERSON KOO: This is Council Member
6 Peter Koo, Chair of this Committee on Landmarks,
7 Public Siting and Maritime Use. We want to welcome
8 everyone to this hearing. To my left is Committee
9 Member Mendez, and Council Member Kallos. And to my
10 right is Council Member Annabel --

11 COUNCIL MEMBER: Palma.

12 CHAIRPERSON KOO: -- Palma, and Maria
13 Arroyo. We want to open up with the LU Land Use Item
14 Number 36, and the 88th Police Precinct Station
15 House, Application Number 20145287 HKK.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic]

17 CHAIRPERSON KOO: And we want to call
18 Kate Daly to testify for us.

19 KATE DALY: Good morning, Council
20 Members. My name is Kate Daly, Executive Director of
21 the Landmarks Preservation Commission. I'm here
22 today to testify on the Commission's designation of
23 the 4th, now the 88th Police Precinct Station House
24 in Brooklyn. On December 17, 2013, the Landmarks
25 Preservation Commission held a public hearing on the

2 proposed designation as landmark of the 88th Police
3 Precinct Station House. Two people including
4 representatives of the Historic District's Council
5 and the Metropolitan Chapter of the Victorian Society
6 in America spoke in favor of designation. One
7 person, a representative of Brooklyn Community Board
8 No. 1, spoke in opposition to designation. The
9 Commission received a letter from City Council Member
10 Latisha James in support of designation, as well as a
11 letter of support from Police Commissioner Raymond
12 Kelly. On January 14, 2014, the Commission voted to
13 designate the 88th Police Precinct a New York City
14 individual landmark.

15 The former 4th Police Precinct Station
16 House at the southwest corner of Classon and DeKalb
17 Avenues is an impressive example of Romanesque
18 Revival style architecture. It replaced an earlier
19 station house located at Myrtle and Vanderbilt
20 Avenues, and during construction was described in the
21 Brooklyn Eagle as "palatial" and comparing favorably
22 with anything of the kind in America. Completed in
23 November 1890, the 4th Precinct Station House was
24 designed by George Ingram, a civil engineer who was
25 associated with the Brooklyn Department of City Works

2 in the 1880s. Under Commissioner Thomas Carrow, the
3 Department of Police and Excise took significant
4 steps to improve working conditions for Brooklyn's
5 growing police force. Ingram may have been
6 responsible for designing as many as ten police
7 buildings, including two that are now New York City
8 landmarks. Faced with red pressed brick and
9 sandstone, the street elevations of the 4th Police
10 Precinct Station House feature arched windows with
11 transoms, and distinctive molded hoods. The fortress
12 like exterior is very well preserved, and includes a
13 picturesque turret that rises asymmetrically about
14 the entrance porch.

15 Following the consolidation of Greater
16 New York in 1898, the 4th Police Precinct became
17 known as the 156th Precinct and later the 96th
18 Precinct. The 4th Police Precinct originally had a
19 separate patrol station and cells building, which was
20 demolished in the mid 1920s. This structure was
21 replaced by a three-story brick extension that was
22 designed by Architect Thomas O'Brien, a Lieutenant in
23 the Police Force, to create the impression that it
24 was constructed at the same time as the original
25 building.

2 In 1953, a Title I Slum Clearance Plan
3 for the area around the Pratt Institute was approved
4 by the City of New York. Although most of its team
5 focused on developing two super blocks of high rise
6 apartments, a small group of historic buildings on or
7 near DeKalb Avenue were selected for preservation,
8 including the this handsome Station House, which has
9 served the Clinton Hill and Bedford Stuyvesant
10 Communities for nearly 125 years. The Landmarks
11 Commission urges you to affirm this designation.

12 Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Any
14 questions from members of the committee? No
15 questions.

16 KATE DALY: Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON KOO: This Chair would like
18 to call on Public Advocate Latisha James.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic]

20 CHAIRPERSON KOO: And the Chair of the
21 share, I believe, of the Historic District.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All right. I want
23 to thank the City Council as well as the Subcommittee
24 on Landmarks, Public Siting, and Maritime uses for
25 allowing me to say a few words with regards to the

2 88th Precinct Station House within my former
3 district, which is located at 298 Classon Avenue, at
4 the far eastern side of Clinton Hill in Brooklyn.
5 The Romanesque Revival Style architecture of the 88th
6 Police Precinct Station House has always served as
7 complement to the rich brownstones of Fort Greene and
8 Clinton Hill and the mansions that line the historic
9 blocks throughout Clinton Hill.

10 The red pressed brick structures are both
11 distinctive and attractive, and for nearly 125 years
12 the Station House, which boasts a five-story turret
13 and a cone shaped roof has continuously served the
14 community. Since 2006, local preservationists have
15 called for the landmarking of the building. As a
16 former City Council Member I've supported that
17 effort. And with the Landmarks Preservation
18 Community recently moving forward with this proposal,
19 I joined in the support of this designation along
20 with the Historic Districts Council and the
21 Metropolitan Chapter of the Victorian Society in
22 America.

23 If the landmarking process is approved, I
24 would strongly advocate for the NYPD seeking an
25 appropriate location for the 88th Precinct. This

2 proposal is also supported by Commissioner Bratton as
3 well as NYPD, who I had an opportunity to have a
4 discussion with yesterday. With rapid paced
5 development in Fort Greene, Clinton Hill, and
6 Bedford-Stuyvesant at an all time high, it is
7 increasingly important to maintain our architectural
8 gems.

9 Some of our unique structures such as One
10 Hanson Place, Greensberg Bank have become condominium
11 housing. It's clear that we need to do all that we
12 can to preserve our past. As we consider what a
13 Clinton Hill expanded Historic District looks like, I
14 thank the Landmarks Preservation Committee and the
15 City Council for including the voice of the long-term
16 stakeholders such as the Society of Clinton Hill, as
17 well as the larger Clinton Hill community. And I
18 would urge all of you to vote in support of this
19 designation. And I thank you for this opportunity.

20 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you, Madam and
21 Public Advocate.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, Council
23 Member.

24 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Any question for
25 members from this meeting?

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON KOO: And we also want to
4 acknowledge the presence of Council Member Barron.
5 Next, we are going to hear from the Chair, I believe,
6 of the Historic District. Thank you.

7 MICHELLE ABULU: The Historic Districts
8 Council is the advocate for New York City's
9 designated --

10 COUNCIL MEMBER: Say your name, please.

11 MICHELLE ABULU: Michelle Abulu from the
12 Historic Districts Council. The Historic Districts
13 Council is the advocate for New York City's
14 designated Historic District, landmarks, and
15 buildings meriting preservation. HDC is happy to
16 support the landmarking of this distinctive building.
17 The former 4th Precinct Station House is a symbol of
18 one of those buildings that one assumes is a
19 landmark. Situated on a prominent corner in the
20 Clinton Hill neighborhood, the grand Romanesque
21 Revival style building of red brick is a striking
22 place. Not was it designed to be a palatial, as the
23 Brooklyn Eagle described it, the Precinct was once
24 designed to improve working conditions of the police
25 force as it grew to keep up with the area's growing

2 population. The building survived the 1953 Title I
3 Slum Clearance Plan for the area. The landmark
4 designation will ensure the building's continued
5 existence. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you very much.

7 Any questions?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic]

9 CHAIRPERSON KOO: We're supposed to hear
10 on this item.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic]

12 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Now, we're going to go
13 to LU 51, the Kings County Hospital Campus, Building
14 G, Application No. 20145391 HHK, application
15 submitted by the New York Health and Hospitals
16 Corporation for the proposed lease by HHC to CAMBA
17 Housing Ventures, Incorporated at Building G on the
18 Kings County Hospital Center Campus. We're going to
19 call Leray Brown from HHC and Joanne Oplustil. And
20 first up to testify -- you start, Leray. Thank you.

21 LERAY BROWN: Good morning Committee

22 Members. My name is Leray Brown, and I'm the Senior
23 Vice President for Strategic Planning and Community
24 Health and Intergovernmental Relations for the New
25 York City Health and Hospitals Corporation. Thank

2 you for the opportunity to provide testimony in
3 support of a proposed lease agreement between HHC and
4 CAMBA Housing Ventures, Inc. for a parcel of land
5 located on the campus of Kings County Hospital
6 Center.

7 I am joined here today by the CEO of
8 CAMBA, Inc. CAMBA is a Brooklyn based social
9 services organization that serves approximately
10 45,000 individuals and families each year. Their
11 mission is to provide services, which connect
12 individuals and families with opportunity to enhance
13 their quality of life. As some of you know, HHC has
14 engaged in several collaborations with housing
15 providers and developers in recent years to create
16 affordable and sustainable housing on the parcels of
17 land that are no longer needed for healthcare
18 services delivery.

19 Nearly four years ago, the City Council
20 approved a similar collaboration between HHC and
21 CAMBA for the creation of CAMBA Gardens. More than
22 209 units, or more than 200, but exactly 209 housing
23 -- units of housing on the grounds of Kings County
24 Hospital Center. The proposed lease that we are here
25 today for is proceed with Phase II of the CAMBA

2 Gardens project. Our proposed sublease agreement,
3 that we hope that you will approve, would permit
4 CAMBA to develop 293 additional units of housing on
5 what is now the dilapidated and unused G Building on
6 the grounds of Kings County Hospital Center.

7 The housing will be for low-income
8 families and single adults, including families and
9 individuals who are formerly homeless, as well as 50
10 units for Kings County, and the Susan Smith McKinney
11 Nursing Home patients and residents. The building
12 will feature on-site case management services
13 provided by CAMBA, and programming as well as 24-hour
14 building security. Prior to entry into the lease,
15 HHC will receive a fair market value payment
16 established by an appraisal. This is anticipated to
17 be not more than \$2.5 million.

18 The terms of the Sublease Agreement will
19 be for 99 years. Construction is expected to begin
20 in July of 2014, and is anticipated to be completed
21 in the late fall of 2016. HHC Board of Directors
22 conducted a public hearing in Brooklyn on March 6,
23 2014, with respect to the proposed lease. Our Board
24 of Directors subsequently authorized the leasing of
25 the parcel on March 20, 2014. Thank you for your

2 consideration of this proposed lease. I will now
3 turn to CAMBA for them to provide a presentation,
4 which I see you have in front of you. And then we
5 can take questions together --

6 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay, sure.

7 LERAY BROWN: -- if you'd like,
8 Chairperson.

9 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Sure.

10 LERAY BROWN: Thank you.

11 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Thank you, Leray and
12 thank you very much for having us here today. We are
13 very grateful. I'm Joanne Oplustil, the President
14 and CEO of CAMBA, CAMBA Housing Ventures. As Leray
15 said, we now serve over 45,000 individuals in varying
16 services in economic development, education, and
17 youth family support, housing, health, and legal
18 services. We service low income individuals;
19 individuals moving from welfare to work; individuals
20 who are homeless, who are at risk of being homeless;
21 transitioning out of the shelter system; people who
22 are living or at risk of HIV; immigrants, refugees,
23 children, young adults, entrepreneurs and other
24 groups working to become self-sufficient in the City
25 of New York.

2 A number of years ago, we took over our
3 third homeless shelter. Today, unfortunately, we are
4 running seven homeless shelters. This is not a happy
5 thing. When we started on our third shelter, we said
6 we cannot continue to do this in good conscience
7 without addressing the issue and having at least a
8 partial solution to the problem. So we developed
9 CAMBA Housing Ventures with the concept of developing
10 permanent supportive housing for formerly homeless
11 individuals and low-income individuals.

12 And, fortunately, we've been successful
13 at doing that. To date, we have completed 605 units
14 in Brooklyn representing \$174 million in public and
15 private investment. We have 175 units in
16 construction representing \$60 million of investment.
17 And we have in pre-development, 746 units, which
18 represents about \$255 million in development. All of
19 these units are in Brooklyn. In total, CAMBA has in
20 ventures is developing over 1,500 units, which would
21 represent \$490 million towards our usual goal, which
22 was 1,000 units.

23 So we are very grateful to HHC for
24 working with us, and helping us achieve this goal,
25 and to the City Council and for your approvals of the

2 work that we've done. CAMBA Gardens I we started in
3 July of 2011, and we completed on time within budget
4 October 2013, 209 units of housing. And I would like
5 you to know that we had 7,000 applications, 7,000
6 applications for 209 units of housing. So we have a
7 huge, huge need. Working with HHC and being on Kings
8 County Campus gives us the opportunity to ensure that
9 the tenants have appropriate healthcare.

10 We hook them up with a hospital. It's a
11 very unique situation where we're working hand-in-
12 glove with the hospital, all their different services
13 to ensure that the children and the families have
14 appropriate healthcare. And we've also replaced two
15 buildings that were costing the City, HHC, and Kings
16 County money because they were not used and were
17 vacant, as is the G Building.

18 The New York City Department of Health
19 and Mental Health released a report recently showing
20 that there's a savings of \$10,000 per tenant in each
21 unit by doing supportive housing, and using the New
22 York-New York 3 Model. Now one of the important
23 parts, and where I feel and Leray feels strongly
24 about, is the economic impact of what does this mean
25 for the community? I was born and raised in this

2 community. I still live there. My mother lives
3 there. My father's business was in the community.
4 Most of my family still lives there. So I'm very
5 much a part of the Flatbush community.

6 We created 42 permanent jobs through
7 CAMBA Gardens Phase I, including maintenance, front
8 desk security, and on-site social services. We
9 hired, and with a contractor, 59 Brooklyn residents
10 were employed at CAMBA Gardens. Twenty-one were from
11 Community Boards 9 and 17. Eighty-one Brooklyn based
12 contractors, subcontractors, and vendors worked in
13 CAMBA Gardens. The contractors, subcontractors, and
14 vendors employed 1,166 people that lived in Brooklyn.
15 There was 19 million, over \$19 million in contracts
16 awarded to Brooklyn based contractors and
17 subcontractors. Seven -- over \$7.5 million of
18 materials and equipment was purchased from Brooklyn
19 based vendors. The project exceeded the New York
20 State OTDA, and HHP Goal of 5% MBE, and .5% of WBE.
21 Nineteen, almost 20% of our hard costs were
22 contracted by the New York State Certified Minority
23 or Women-Owned Businesses. And we are very committed
24 to those statistics for CAMBA Gardens II.

2 CAMBA Gardens II will have a mixed 209 --
3 293 units, a mixture of studios, one, two, and three-
4 bedroom apartments. There is over 250,000 square
5 feet, and it will be leveled at five, seven, and nine
6 stories. We have 24/7 security, and services on
7 site. We have indoor and outdoor space. We'll have
8 play space for the children, outdoor garden space
9 with an outdoor sculpture. We have inside computer
10 rooms, workrooms for the tenants, and community rooms
11 for meeting for the community as well as for the
12 tenants.

13 In the packet, we talked about the
14 community units. They'll be 60% AMI, and there will
15 be 100 units for that. Okay, and 182 for special
16 needs. Also, in the packet it gives the maximum
17 income, which I won't go through. And then it's just
18 the financing and then the photos of the two
19 buildings, CAMBA I and CAMBA Gardens II. Thank you
20 very much.

21 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Do you have
22 questions from the council members of Joanne?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER: Yes, thank you.

24 [background discussion]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Good morning.
3 Thank you, Mr. Chair, and thank you for presenting to
4 our committee, and I see that you have a chart for
5 the apartments that will be made available. And the
6 studio apartments, one bedroom, two and three. Can
7 you tell us exactly how many of each of these types
8 of apartments? I see the rental will be at \$833 for
9 a studio, one bedroom, two and three.

10 LERAY BROWN: Actually, on page 7 are the
11 numbers of the units.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER: The page before.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: The page before,
14 okay. Thank you. And where it says prop total by --
15 the last column on page 7.

16 LERAY BROWN: Total by population type?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Uh-huh.

18 LERAY BROWN: Yeah. So basically, if you
19 -- Thank you. So if you start from the left to
20 right, there are going to be community units, which
21 would be your point about the 60% average median
22 income, and -- So out of the 293, there will be 110
23 units that will be for folks who need that 60%
24 average median income, and depending on the size of
25 their apartment. And again their income. For

2 example, if you go to the next page for a studio, for
3 which there will be 17 in that category.

4 The maximum rent a tenant would pay
5 including -- excluding I should say -- their
6 electricity, would be \$833. That's the maximum.
7 Most people will pay less because the maximum rent is
8 based on that individual's income. And I should note
9 -- You'll see on the bottom of the page we're using
10 the current HUD, Housing and Urban Development
11 Guidelines. They change each year. So we're giving
12 you this as basically a proxy or an approximation.

13 That an individual to be eligible to
14 receive those -- to be able to rent those studio
15 apartments can make no more than \$35,380. So to go
16 by size, you'll see it differs in terms of the
17 maximum rent, the size of the household. Although, I
18 don't know where that half person is. In terms of
19 the average household for the one-bedroom, and the
20 maximum amount of income they can make. And as I
21 note, most people will make less than these maximum
22 incomes and, therefore, pay much less than the
23 maximum rental. Does that answer your question,
24 Council Member Arroyo?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes, thank you.

3 On page 7, so most of the units then are going to
4 formerly homeless--

5 LERAY BROWN: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: --and special
7 needs.

8 LERAY BROWN: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Do you have a
10 determination as to special needs? Are they the SM1s
11 and SM2s and -- ?

12 LERAY BROWN: The special populations --
13 in the special populations piece, there of that 158
14 that you see in that box, 50 will be folks who are
15 patients of Kings County --

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: [interposing]
17 Okay, I'm -- I would rather go to the total 182.

18 LERAY BROWN: You want to go up to the
19 182?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yeah.

21 LERAY BROWN: Okay. So I'll still
22 start with the 50.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Okay.

24 LERAY BROWN: So 50 of that 182 will be
25 patients who are served by Kings County Hospital

2 Center, or are in a nursing home, which is the Susan
3 Smith McKinney Nursing Home. As you may know, at HHC
4 Hospitals, we have a lot of folks who stay longer
5 than they clinically need because they can't afford
6 apartments. Or in some cases the apartments that
7 they came from they can't go back to because they may
8 not be able to do five floors, or they need
9 apartments that are designed to meet their needs.

10 So part of our interest in this is to at
11 least have 50 of that 182. The rest of the 182 I'll
12 let Joanne speak to. They are individuals, who as
13 she mentioned earlier, are transitioning from
14 homeless -- Individuals and family members who are
15 transitioning from homeless. So perhaps she can give
16 you a little bit more about the demographics.

17 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Well, they will SNYS
18 [phonetic] they're part of the New York-New York 3
19 population. So they're special needs population with
20 a mental illness. So it's just part of the New York-
21 New York 3 category. And they will be from the
22 shelter system.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Okay. So what
24 specifically will be the support services because
25 when we're talking about the SNY, a lot --

2 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: -- of these.

4 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Yes, we've got -- we
5 don't have the dollar amount for the CAMBA Gardens II
6 from the Department of Health yet. But we have
7 caseworkers, social workers, case managers to work
8 with the population that is in the building. So they
9 will work with them if they're on meds to do the
10 Medicaid management. If they're looking for jobs, to
11 help them find a job. If they need nutritional
12 services, we do that. And if they need any kind of
13 mental health services, we work --our work and the
14 hospital's work.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Do you have a
16 ratio of how many persons will be assigned to each of
17 these support people?

18 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: It's a staff. I
19 believe it's about one to twenty a caseload.

20 LERAY BROWN: And if I may add, Council
21 Member, to the services. As you know, Kings County
22 has a very large mental health service compendium.
23 So not just the inpatient services, or the
24 psychiatric emergency services, we have a very large
25 outpatient mental health treatment clinic. We have

2 what we call crisis teams, and in addition we have
3 substantial ambulatory care, detox services.

4 And one of the excellent symmetries that
5 would exist with the CAMBA Gardens II, as well as
6 CAMBA Gardens I being on, you know, like a stone's
7 throw literally from the hospital campus, is that
8 individuals will be more easily able to access those
9 services. You know, folks won't get lost between
10 taking two buses and a subway. They can --
11 literally, they'll be walking across the campus for
12 their services. And as importantly, our treatment
13 teams will be working very closely with the care
14 managers that are employed by CAMBA.

15 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: And I also want to add
16 that all of the clients or tenants are interviewed.
17 So we need tenants that are able to live
18 independently. This is a permanent house, a
19 permanent residence. They have a key to their own
20 apartment. So we -- individuals who are not able to
21 live on their own will not be chosen to live in the
22 building.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Is there any
24 security that you plan to have?

25 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: There's 24/7 security.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Is that in the
3 form of a person or in the form of a camera?

4 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: It's both. We have a
5 guard, a security guard 24/7 as well as cameras.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON KOO: I have a question from
8 Council Member Annabel Palma.

9 [Pause]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Thank you both for
11 your testimony. In terms of the homeless families
12 that will be coming into CAMBA, what kind of support
13 services will there be for children in terms of
14 childcare. Like what coordination there's going to
15 be in terms of DOE?

16 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Yeah, we work with the
17 schools as well, and we ensure that the children are
18 registered in school. And there are facilities for
19 child -- as I said, the playground. We do not have a
20 daycare center, but we ensure that if the children do
21 need daycare centers, we have them registered and set
22 up in daycare. So we take a holistic approach.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: But there will not
24 be no onsite services for those families who may

2 require additional -- their children may require
3 addition --

4 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: [interposing] There are
5 services, but we don't do daycare services. But
6 there are services for the families if they need them
7 in the form of service, and also in the form of
8 referral to where they need to be. But we absolutely
9 make sure that the children are going to school.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Thank you.

11 LERAY BROWN: And we also want to make
12 sure that the children have a medical home, right?
13 So we make sure that they have their primary care.
14 Hopefully, their guardian or parent will choose Kings
15 County because we have a very large and comprehensive
16 pediatric services system. And that's the other
17 issue in terms of this collaboration. We're
18 essentially -- we're creating a community on the
19 campus where we also provide a full range of mental
20 health, physical health, and other types of
21 healthcare services for individuals and families.

22 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Any other questions?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [off mic]

24 [background discussion]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Currently, it
3 costs the city, \$74.80 a day for every single
4 homeless person, and it costs \$100.74 per day. So
5 we're talking about the City is having to spend
6 \$3,000. So it looks like we're going to be dealing
7 with 182 formerly homeless and special needs. So
8 that seems like it's an incredible cost savings for
9 our city. How can we expand this program to more
10 locations?

11 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: I love it. I love it.

12 LERAY BROWN: That's a perfect setup for
13 her.

14 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Yeah.

15 LERAY BROWN: [off mic]

16 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Yeah, we do need to do
17 more. We need more supportive housing, more
18 development by the not-for-profit world because we're
19 the ones that are ensuring that people are getting
20 out of the homeless situation, and leading a normal
21 life. And with the opportunities of getting jobs and
22 the children going to school, and moving on to
23 college. So it really is for the City and the City
24 Council to expand the support of Housing Network, and
25 the buildings.

2 LERAY BROWN: So how? How? HHC is a
3 really small cog in the how, but one of the things
4 that are important about our collaboration is we are
5 on city owned land, right. And as healthcare
6 delivery system, the less beds. And the more
7 consolidated our operations can become, and they will
8 be, the more opportunity there will be for these kind
9 of collaboration where we take the availability
10 because as you know, in New York City land is so
11 premium.

12 We take the availability of public land,
13 the proximity of support services, and we create
14 affordable and accessible housing. Now, in some of
15 HHC's -- on some of HHC's campuses, we don't have a
16 lot of land, but there are others in which we do.
17 And so, CAMBA is just one example of that
18 partnership. We're also working with a non-profit
19 developer. And our colleagues at HPD because they're
20 an important consideration in this to identify other
21 sites on other HHC campuses for similar types of
22 arrangements.

23 Of course, the population may be a little
24 different because communities' needs are different,
25 but that's one approach. The other approach I'm sure

2 that you will want to have a more expansive
3 discussion with my colleagues at HPD because they
4 have many strategies as to how to create greater
5 opportunities to do exactly what you figured with the
6 math, which is to save the City money in terms of the
7 cost of sheltering individuals who are homeless.

8 But also, frankly, this saves federal and
9 state governments money. Because there are people,
10 as I mentioned just the 50, but there will be more
11 than that 50. But there are people who are sleeping
12 in expensive inpatient and nursing home beds. And
13 HHC's nursing home beds are at least \$104,000 a year
14 for a patient or a resident. So if someone sits into
15 our nursing home because they don't have supportive
16 housing or affordable housing, that's costing the
17 state, the federal government, and the city \$104,000
18 in Medicaid costs.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [off mic] I know
20 it's at least \$15,000 a month, and one thing I just
21 want to leave you with is, I -- if we can use eminent
22 domain to crush a neighborhood and turn it into a
23 stadium, I'm okay taking old stadiums and crushing
24 those and turn them into affordable housing and turn
25 them back into neighborhoods.

2 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Well, we
3 have Council Member Arroyo.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Good morning. I
5 wanted to ask a question -- Council Member Palma --
6 as a follow up. The rent. If a high student gets a
7 part-time job, what happens to the family's rent?

8 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: It doesn't change. It
9 doesn't change. It doesn't change.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: It's not factored
11 into the baseline?

12 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Not if they're -- if
13 they're in the apartment and then somebody gets a job
14 and nobody is kicked out of the apartment for -- if
15 the original rent does not change.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Ever?

17 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Well, no, there are
18 increases, but not necessarily --

19 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: But what are
20 there, and how often do they happen?

21 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: It's really a HUD issue
22 and they are I think every two years. Margaret.
23 Margaret knows this better than I do. They're only
24 every -- Yeah, they're only ever couple years, and I
25 can't -- they're really a very small increase.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: So the council
3 member whose district this is in is not going to get
4 phone calls from--

5 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: [interposing] No.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: --individuals
7 saying they're being priced out of their homes?

8 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: No, no, no, no, no.
9 No, not at all.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: So phase - this is
11 Phase II. You articulated that you have nearly a
12 thousand units. How many of them are composed of the
13 same nuances?

14 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: They're all -- every
15 one of the buildings that were in -- Well, I know I
16 need to preface it. The ones that CAMBA has
17 developed, which is 300, over 300 -- Well, with the
18 193 units. I'm sorry 605. Those are all supportive
19 housing.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Okay. So how old
21 are those?

22 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Morse Manor, the first
23 one, is 2009.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Okay, so do you
3 have data on how many families stay permanently in
4 the units --

5 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: [interposing] In --

6 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: -- and how many
7 enter the shelter system again?

8 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: We haven't had any
9 enter the shelter system. We don't -- people are not
10 leaving these units, and most of them that we have
11 are studio units. CAMBA Gardens I is the only
12 building that we've done that is actually also with
13 families.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: So you have a good
15 track record of keeping them permanently --

16 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: [interposing] Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: -- in the
18 community? What about seniors?

19 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: There's no special
20 designation for seniors, but seniors are included in
21 the mix. If the seniors qualify in the low income,
22 they are included. But there is not a special
23 designation.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [interposing] I
25 recommend that you make some special efforts, because

2 I think the folks that are sitting in a nursing homes
3 are probably those very same individuals who we don't
4 have enough--

5 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: --housing for in
7 the community. So I think we need to be deliberate
8 in how we organize how we're selecting families for
9 those units. Especially those one-bedroom units, the
10 SROs or whatever they're called.

11 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: They're not SROs.

12 Thank goodness. They're studio apartments.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [interposing]
14 Well, I mean you call it that. I call it something
15 else.

16 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: It's okay.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: You know, they are
18 what they are.

19 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: To answer your
20 question, though, in CAMBA Garden Is -- Garden I, I
21 believe those 33 of the individuals who are in those
22 209 apartments who are seniors.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Okay.

24 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: And in terms of the HHC
25 nursing homes, I think you know this because having

2 been the health chair, the HHC nursing homes are sort
3 of different. We don't have -- you know, we have a
4 range of young people as well as seniors in our
5 nursing homes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I know, but I am
7 particularly about the seniors --

8 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Absolutely.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: -- that live and
10 sleeping on somebody's couch, and becomes the nanny,
11 the cook and the housekeeper in order to keep a roof
12 over their heads. And I don't think that we as a
13 city or our developers in the community are being
14 deliberate about addressing that very specific
15 population. Because they don't fit in these special
16 needs categories.

17 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Right.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Which I find
19 disheartening. And then why not sell the land to
20 them. What's the deal with the 99-year lease?

21 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: You guys don't want us
22 to. We have --

23 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Really?

24 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: -- there was actually
25 litigation several years ago, which your counsel can

2 probably be more eloquent than I about that precludes
3 HHC from selling land or buildings or hospitals.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Okay.

5 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: So the 99-year lease--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: That's one of the
7 things.

8 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: --and that's why we are
9 in front of you as well.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: All right, thank
11 you.

12 CHAIRPERSON KOO: And Council Member --

13 COUNCIL MEMBER: Thank you. Just one
14 follow-up question, and it's piggybacking on the
15 question of the 99-year lease. Back on page 8, The
16 above resident incomes are provided as reference, not
17 the actual rents, for GC II, CAMBA Gardens II. So
18 how much of a variation might you see?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER Not very much

20 JOANNE OPLUSTI: And the reason we had to
21 put that disclaimer there is because as I mentioned,
22 the rents -- the income levels and rents are
23 established by the Federal Government's Housing and
24 Urban Development Agency and they I believe it's

25

2 every other year or so they promulgate new guidelines
3 for rents and income levels.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER: Right, but it says --

6 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER: Right, I got that but I
8 wanted to know might it go up and how much?

9 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: It again I think in
10 reference to the question that was asked by Council
11 Member Arroyo it goes -- it may -- if it goes up in
12 that every two-year adjustment, it would be de
13 minimis. It's not significant, but because, for
14 example, the Federal Governments reports out changes
15 in what they consider Federal Poverty Level. Also,
16 periodically, it's driven by that.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER: And my final question.
18 So is this guarantee, or this price range tied to the
19 99 years?

20 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: The 99 years is the
21 contract -- well contract lease between HHC and the
22 CAMBA Housing Ventures. It's separate and apart from
23 the lease payments for -- that the tenants would have
24 to pay for their respective apartments. Separate.
25 Separate and apart.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER: How long is this
3 guaranteed? How long is this locked in for?

4 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: In terms of the
5 tenants' apartments?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER: Right.

7 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: It's forever. The
8 tenant, this becomes his or her or that family's
9 apartment. HHC is leasing the land --

10 COUNCIL MEMBER Right.

11 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: -- to CAMBA.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER: There are some instances
13 where the guarantees for these low incomes is limited
14 to 30 years.

15 LERAY BROWN: [off mic]

16 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Yeah, yeah, right.
17 That's their financing.

18 FEMALE SPEAKER: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER: That's what I want to
20 know. I want to be clear. Not 99.

21 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Yes, it is. That's a
22 tax credit issue.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER: Right.

24 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: And you are correct
25 that for 30 years it is required that this building

2 and any other supportive housing building that is
3 built with tax credits that it is maintained as a
4 supportive housing building for 30 years. After 30
5 years, CAMBA Housing Ventures is able to either
6 continue the building as it is, or it could if it
7 chose to change the usage.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER: Right. I just wanted my
9 colleagues to be clear.

10 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Yeah, that's--that--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER: [interposing] This is a
12 30-year, and it's no anywhere stated. So I know it's
13 tied to the tax credits, but we need to be clear.

14 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Right. I think, though,
15 in the case, and they're conferring here, but in the
16 case of HHC's expectations, we have a 99-year lease
17 for this use.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER: Right.

19 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: This is the use that
20 we've kind of got a view for. This is the use that
21 our board committed to the public when we had our
22 hearings. So there is somewhat of a double
23 protection there. But again, our lease for the land
24 is different than their financing and whatever

2 commitments they have in terms of the financing for
3 this project.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you very much.

6 This is a good model for us to do more of this
7 housing in the future, especially for people with
8 mental health, and disabilities. They live there on
9 campus, a medical campus. It's very convenient for
10 them. Thank you.

11 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: And Councilman Kallos,
12 I just want to mentioned when you asked how do we do
13 it? When we talk about hospital property, that's a
14 great thing. But when we talk about a private, it's
15 very hard for the non-for-profit to compete to buy
16 land, or a building to be torn down with the for-
17 profit-developers. And that's what we're battling
18 with is we can only pay market of the assessed
19 appraised value. That's the only thing we're allowed
20 to pay, and get reimbursed by in essence by HPD. So,
21 we are competing with the for-profit developers in
22 this world, and this is a challenge for us.

23 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay, you're all right.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I think that just
25 my feeling on this is that EGC can give away 1,400

2 acres of land on the Upper East side for a dollar,
3 and give that to a private developer. The City can
4 do the same to build non-profit housing. In other
5 cities around the world, there's 60% plus affordable
6 housing. The only construction that happens, the
7 only new development that happens is affordable
8 housing. So I think we just need to push harder, and
9 I look forward to working with you.

10 JOANNE OPLUSTIL: Thank you very much.

11 [background discussion]

12 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Next we
13 have Diane Mitchell?

14 DIANE LOUARD-MICHEL: Louard-Michelle.

15 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Louard-Michel from the
16 CSH to testify.

17 [pause]

18 DIANE LOUARD-MICHEL: My name is Diane-
19 Louard-Michel. I work for the Corporation of
20 Supportive Housing, now known as CSH. CSH has been
21 around for over 20 years. We were set up as a
22 national not-for-profit to work with communities and
23 organizations across the country. Based here in New
24 York City, our whole mission has been to advance the
25

2 development and creation of affordable and supportive
3 housing.

4 We do this through a variety of
5 methodologies. I am now -- I used to be the Program
6 Director for the New York Program, the New York State
7 Program. I now work as Senior Loan Officer basically
8 transporting some of the things that we've done in
9 New York to other parts of the eastern region. With
10 that said, we do a bunch of lending, we do a lot of
11 policy on program development, and lots of model
12 development, and documentation of the model.

13 Most recently, I would say that one of
14 the growing models for CSH and across the country is
15 the recognition that supportive housing is
16 healthcare, that housing is healthcare. And that is
17 being seen in lots and lots of different venues and
18 kind of coming together. But today, I'm here to
19 speak in support of CAMBA Garden Phase II. And
20 actually applaud the efforts of both CAMBA, CAMBA
21 Housing Ventures, and New York City Health and
22 Hospitals Corporation coming together, another
23 exemplary project.

24 The proposed 293 unit project is going to
25 be the Lead Platinum Building. It's going to be,

2 again, on the Campus of Kings County Hospital, as you
3 know. And it will be providing the number of units
4 for supportive housing, as well as community-based
5 housing for low income families from the local -from
6 the neighborhood. I think it's a really wonderful
7 plan to both abate and demolish this particular site
8 G, but then create something new and vital and
9 vibrant.

10 That will actually probably spur about
11 \$80 million of additional investment. And as a
12 lender, and a person who has always been sort of
13 focused for over 15 years on creating additional
14 resources and making those resources work better,
15 that's really a wonderful thing. I just want to
16 disclose that CSH is very pleased. We did provide
17 \$500,000 worth of early stage financing for
18 development support, for this project, and \$750,000
19 for the Phase I Project.

20 Actually, we take our community
21 investments really, really seriously. We're always
22 looking for projects that we think have good legs,
23 and good bones. But they also --

24 CHAIRPERSON KOO: [off mic]

2 DIANE LOUARD-MICHEL: Okay, but that also
3 are going to leverage, be able to leverage additional
4 capital operating service funding for the requisite
5 uses. I just want to point out that among the many
6 funding sources that are involved in this project,
7 one comes from the Medicaid Redesign Team, the
8 Affordable Housing Work Group. For the last three
9 years, the Department of Health, the State Department
10 of Health has been convening stakeholders, mostly
11 from New York City, to think about ways in which they
12 can reinvest Medicaid savings into supportive housing
13 interventions. And this has been one.

14 These projects have been one of the
15 stellar examples of how that can happen, and it's is
16 extremely competitive to raise funding. So they are
17 secure. A lot of my testimony is right here. I
18 don't want to repeat things I've already said, but I
19 do want to point out that CAMBA was actually, and I
20 will say another disclosure. I nominated CAMBA
21 Gardens I to be a potential project of the year among
22 the Eastern Region, the Eastern Seaboard for CSH's
23 annual conference. There were in a very, very, I
24 think competitive field of three other projects also

2 in New -- Well, two in New York and one in New Jersey
3 serving vets.

4 And they actually were not just in the
5 finals, but they actually won that competition. I'd
6 say I think a lot of it had to do with them, you
7 know, because there were so many noteworthy products.
8 They were all exemplary, but I think there was
9 something about the sustainability. And the ability
10 to replicate this model of not-for-profits working in
11 collaboration with municipal public hospital systems
12 to use both surplus land. But also to leverage their
13 collective resources, their ability to provide on-
14 site case management that's directly attuned to
15 individual needs of tenants.

16 But also to link back to community-based
17 hospitals systems that are also part of the safety
18 net system for indigent people. And it will allow
19 them to enhance their behavioral health, primary
20 health, and other kinds of resources. So, again, I
21 want to congratulate them once again for winning
22 that. And I just want to say that I lend my support
23 wholeheartedly to this project. I think we should
24 have more of the, and I'd be happy to answer any
25 questions you might have.

2 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Any
3 questions from the Council members?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic]

5 DIANE LOUARD-MICHEL: Thank you very
6 much. We will close the hearing. Council Member
7 Eugene Mathieu has something to say.

8 MATHIEU EUGENE: [off mic] Thank you very
9 much, and thank you, Mr. Chair. I'm going to be
10 very, very brief first and foremost for what was said
11 today, because I wanted to be here for that because
12 this is a project in my district. And I had to go to
13 the cross-conference by the Speaker, about the
14 response that they're putting in a budget response to
15 the Mayor. You know, this is very important for us
16 also. This is the work that we to be -- we would
17 like to support, the good program in our district and
18 also support New York City. Let me say that CAMBA is
19 one of the organizations in my district, and I work
20 closely with CAMBA, and they are doing a wonderful
21 job serving the people in that --- my community first
22 and also the people in Brooklyn. Not only in my
23 Council District, people all over Brooklyn and
24 beyond. CAMBA Phase II is a project that I'm very
25 concerned about, and Phase I went very well. And we

2 are talking about affordable housing, we are all
3 agreed that we got to create more affordable housing.
4 Because housing is a big crisis in New York City, and
5 the Mayor is trying to bring in more affordable
6 housing. You know, CAMBA Phase II won't be enough to
7 provide affordable housing to everybody who need
8 affordable housing. Even now you see in Brooklyn and
9 the City of New York, but this is a good step. This
10 is a project that should we support, and I am
11 supporting it and I want to see that.

12 And one other -- I got single issues.
13 Not issues, concern, requests because you know that
14 we City Council members, elected officials, not only
15 do we got to work together for the wellbeing for our
16 constituents, we got to make sure that our
17 constituents, you know, get their fair share. So
18 since it is a program in our District, and I met with
19 CAMBA and also HHC, it was on TV, and it was done and
20 it was right here. And the concern of the issues that
21 I raise was about job opportunities. Because we have
22 the moral obligation to create jobs for our
23 constituents and for other people and even in New
24 York. But I'm very happy to see that. In the Phase
25 I, CAMBA was about to create some jobs for the people

2 in the community and local people in addition to job
3 opportunities for other people. I was very pleased
4 with that. And also, the meeting that I had with
5 you, I mentioned and I said that I'm very focused on
6 that. And I'm hoping that you go on to community to
7 create job opportunities not only to the people in
8 the community, to my district, to the people in the
9 community. Because it makes sense because the people
10 only drive there, and they shoot at us. So a job
11 opportunity they feel it. They should feel that they
12 are part of this program. And I want to commend you
13 for Phase II, and I'm looking forward to working
14 together with you, and congratulations. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON KOO: [off mic] We also want
16 to welcome Council Member Levin for our committee.
17 We are going to vote on agenda items 36 and 51, and
18 we're going to vote. And the Committee Council will
19 call a vote and the Chair of the committee has a yes
20 vote.

21 CLERK: On LU No. 36 and LU No. 51

22 CLERK: Chair Koo?

23 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yes.

24 CLERK: Council Member Palma.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Yes.

2 CLERK: Council Member Arroyo.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes.

4 CLERK: Council Member Mendez.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

6 CLERK: Council Member Levin.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

8 CLERK: Council Member Barron.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes.

10 CLERK: Council Member Kallos.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

12 CLERK: By a vote of 7 to zero, no
13 abstentions, no votes in the negative, the
14 aforementioned LU 36 and 51 are hereby adopted and
15 referred to the full committee. Thank you.

16 [applause.] Adjourned.

17 CHAIRPERSON KOO: [gavel] Meeting
18 adjourned. Thank you.

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 28, 2014