

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, MARITIME USES

----- X

January 28, 2014
Start: 11:23 a.m.
Recess: 12:05 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm,
16th Fl.

B E F O R E:
PETER A. KOO
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

MARIA DEL CARMEN ARROYO
INEZ D. BARRON
BEN KALLOS
STEPHEN T. LEVIN
ROSIE MENDEZ
ANNABEL PALMA

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 COMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, MARITIME USES 3

2 [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Good morning everyone.

4 [gavel]

5 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Hi, my name's Peter
6 Koo and I am the Council Member representing the
7 20th council district in Queens. Today is an
8 exciting day for me and it's the first meeting I'm
9 convening as the new chair of the Land Use
10 Committee on Landmarks, Public Siting, and Maritime
11 Use. I look forward to getting down to business and
12 working with everyone in my new capacity. There are
13 certain expectations that I have to, I have to as
14 to how I operate this committee. But before I
15 continue allow me to introduce my colleagues who
16 will be serving under this committee with me. We
17 have Council Member Mendez, and Councilman Barron,
18 and Kallos on the committee. And then we have
19 Council Member Arroyo, Palma, Levin they are on the
20 way yeah.

21 Thank you for all being here and being
22 prompt. It's important to me that we conduct all
23 our businesses with the utmost professionalism and
24 we respect the public who have come to tell their,
25 tell us their views on the application before this

2 subcommittee. If you know you will be late or will
3 not be able to make a committee meeting I will
4 appreciate if you will call me or call the land use
5 division so we can appropriate changes. We want to
6 hear from all members of the public who are here to
7 voice their concerns and opinions and regarding
8 matters that come before us. Toward the end all
9 those wishing to speak must fill out a speaker slip
10 which you can obtain from the Sargent of Arms
11 sitting at the desk by the door. The completed
12 forms should be returned to the Sargent who will
13 submit them to me. Everyone who submits a form
14 will, will be called to speak. You will have three
15 minutes to speak and can only speak once on an
16 item. If others who have previously made the points
17 that you wish to make to the committee when your
18 name is called you are welcome to sit your time to
19 speak. I will read your name into the record
20 indicating either your support or objection of the
21 application. The calling is important to me and
22 critical to the public hearing process. Please do
23 call out, applaud, or boo as you will not be
24 tolerated. Please show others the same respect that
25 you want when it's your time to speak. Should you

2 need to use a cell phone please go outside of the
3 room to do so. Today we have four Landmarks
4 designations on our calendar. The first of which is
5 to consider land Use item 20145176 HKM Tammany
6 Hall. Item number also, and 140163 HKM this is
7 located at 100 East 17th Street also known as 100-
8 102 East 17th Street. And I would like to open this
9 hearing and call on Kate Daly from the Landmarks
10 Preservation Committee to present the designation.
11 After the commission, the testimony I will call on
12 members of the public who have signed up to speak
13 on this item. You will follow the same, we will
14 follow, we will follow the same format for the
15 remainder of the items on today's calendar. And we
16 also want to acknowledge our chairman from Land Use
17 Committee Mr. Greenfield is here. So welcome to our
18 sub-committee. So Ms. Kate Daly, yeah.

19 KATE DALY: Yes, thank you. Good
20 morning Chair Koo and council members. My name is
21 Kate Daly. I'm the Executive Director of the New
22 York City Landmarks Preservation Commission and I'm
23 here today to testify on the commission's
24 designation of Tammany Hall in Manhattan. On June
25 25th, 2013 the Landmarks Preservation Commission

2 held a public hearing on the proposed designation
3 as a landmark of Tammany Hall. There were 17
4 speakers in favor of designation including
5 representatives of Council Member Rosie Mendez,
6 State Assembly Member Richard Gottfried, State
7 Senator Liz Krueger, Manhattan Community Board 5
8 Landmarks Committee Chair Howard Mendez, former
9 City Council Member Carol Greitzer, representatives
10 of the Union Square Community Coalition, the
11 Gramercy Neighborhood Association, the New York
12 Landmarks Conservancy, the Historic Districts
13 Council, and the National Democratic Club. A
14 representative of the owner indicated that the
15 owner was not opposing the designation and looked
16 forward to continuing the relationship with the
17 Landmarks Commission. There was no testimony in
18 opposition to this designation. The commission has
19 received a statement in support of the designation
20 from Assemblymember Deborah Glick and has also
21 received two letters in support of the designation
22 from the Samuel J. Tilden Democratic Club.

23 On October 29, 2013 the commission
24 voted to designate the building a New York City
25 Individual Land Mark. Built in 1928 to the designs

2 of Thomson Holmes and Converse and Charles B.
3 Meyers this handsome Neo-Georgian building is the
4 only surviving headquarters building of Tammany
5 Hall, the democratic party machine that dominated
6 New York City politics in the 19th and early 20th
7 centuries. The building replaced Tammany's old
8 headquarters on 14th Street and was both a reminder
9 of the society's origins in the federalist period
10 and a symbol of the reform minded New Tammany
11 Organization that emerged in the late 1910s. When
12 the building was commissioned the Tammany Society
13 was at the height of its political popularity.
14 Robert F. Wagner was beginning his distinguished
15 career in the U.S. Senate, Al Smith was a popular
16 and widely respected governor and the leading
17 contender for the democratic candidacy for
18 president, and Jimmy Walker was an extraordinarily
19 mayor. Within a few years of the building's
20 completion revelations of municipal corruption led
21 to Walker's resignation and a split in the
22 democratic party with Franklin Delano Roosevelt and
23 other reformers distancing themselves from Tammany
24 and ensuring the election of Fiorello La Guardia as
25 Mayor. In 1943 the Tammany Organization sold the

2 building to local 91 of the International Lady's
3 Garment Workers Union and the main meeting hall
4 became one of the most important centers for union
5 activities in New York City. Since the mid-1980s
6 the building's large auditorium has been home to
7 off Broadway theatre housing the roundabout company
8 until 99, 1991 and a number of distinguished
9 independent productions since then. The remainder
10 of the building has been occupied by the New York
11 Film Institute since 1994. The building was
12 praised for its dignified architectural treatment,
13 one of the chief motifs of which are the severe
14 colonial columns in the centers of the union square
15 and 17th street façades which were called the days
16 of early American architecture. This
17 architecturally distinctive building remains a
18 significant reminder of New York City's political,
19 theatrical, and labor history and the Commission
20 urges you to affirm this designation. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON KOO: ...call on... Council
22 Member Mendez do you have a statement?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Yes, good
24 morning. It's still morning for another half hour.
25 Good morning everyone. It is a pleasure to be back

2 in this new legislative term and to be part of this
3 subcommittee again and to see some of my friends
4 out there. The land marking of Tammany hall has
5 been a long, long work in progress so I represent
6 district two besides sitting in this committee and
7 100-102 East 17th Street which is known as Tammany
8 Hall is the subject premises that we are asking to
9 landmark. But before I say anything further about
10 the rich history of Tammany Hall I really want to
11 give a special thank you to Jack Taylor, an active
12 member of the Union Square Community Coalition who
13 for many years made this one of his personal
14 projects. A dear friend of mine of 16 years we've
15 worked on many things together prior to me being in
16 the council and now. And you're a gem and this is
17 happening because of your hard work. Tammany Hall
18 was built in 1928 for use by the New York City
19 Democratic Party. It was built in the Colonial
20 Revival style which dates back to the founding of
21 our nation located across from Union Square Park
22 the design of the building in many substantial and
23 significant ways seamlessly marries with the
24 purposes for which it was constructed. The home of
25 the democratic party from 1928 to 1943 during the

2 time of Governor Al Smith who was then running for
3 president, Mayor Jimmy Walker. It was a time of the
4 great depression and the tenor of the anti-Tammany
5 reform Mayor Fiorello La Guardia. From 1943 until
6 several decades later the building was home to the
7 International Lady's Garment Workers Union, an
8 association of singular importance in the history
9 of this city and of organizing and labor organizing
10 and advocacy throughout the world. As is widely
11 noted today the building still serves an important
12 public and social purpose as the home to the New
13 York Film Academy and the Union Square Theatre.
14 After several standstill agreements the tireless
15 efforts of community groups and my friend Jack
16 Taylor and the Union Square Community Coalition,
17 the Landmarks Preservation Commission Process I am
18 both excited and proud to see the land marking of
19 Tammany Hall come before the city council. I am in
20 favor of said designation and I ask all my
21 colleagues to vote in favor. Thank you Mr. Chair.

22 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you Council... Oh,
23 we are also, we are also joined by Council Member
24 Steve Levin. Thank you. Any members on the
25

1 COMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, MARITIME USES 11

2 committee have any questions for the, either for
3 the speaker or... Sure yeah.

4 UNKNOWN MALE: [cross-talk] ...after I, I
5 yield to my distinguished colleagues.

6 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Council Member Barron
7 yeah.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, good
9 morning. First I want to say I'm pleased to be on
10 this committee. This is my first official committee
11 meeting and I'm so pleased to be a part of this and
12 look forward to looking. I have lots of concerns as
13 we talk about land marking. The burdens that they
14 sometimes pose on owners. I'm glad to see that
15 there's no opposition on this one but my question
16 refers particularly to the research that was done
17 in terms of the Landmarks Preservation Commission
18 presenting their report. And I wanted to know, did
19 your history reveal any interaction with those
20 persons of African ancestry who were living in New
21 York City during that period of time?

22 KATE DALY: Mm-hmm. Our research staff
23 is, is tasked with doing a very thorough research
24 of all of the different demographic groups and
25 architectural significance of the building. This

2 building was built in 1928 and the, the real focus
3 of the research was on the political and labor
4 movements that were affiliated with the building.

5 In our reports if there were prominent African
6 American figures associated with a building that's
7 always included in the report. For buildings that
8 were built before 1865 if there is any indication
9 that there was labor of enslaved people involved in
10 building to building that is always included in the
11 report. If the building was built before that date
12 and was on land that was held by owners of enslaved
13 people we include that history all the way back to
14 colonial times in the report. For a building this
15 modern we found that it was primarily the labor
16 history and the political history that, that were
17 the documents of record that we were able to
18 unearth.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Well we know
20 that the labor movement had a very negative history
21 in terms of African Americans being involved and
22 that that existed until recently up until the 1950s
23 when that, there was a shift. So I would be
24 concerned to know that your history would record
25 the interactions or the struggle of the black labor

2 movements to be a part of what was going on. As
3 we're talking now about looking at that so I would
4 ask that you look to see what that might have been
5 and include it in your report.

6 KATE DALY: I, I'd be happy to look into
7 that and discuss it with our researchers.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Council Member Kallos.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you for
11 your great and detailed report. I'm Ben Kallos. I
12 represent the upper Eastside midtown East El
13 Barrio. Anyone watching at home it's @Kallos and
14 love to hear from you. I just wanted to say this
15 being my first meeting I think that landmarks are
16 so essential for our city. They provide a living,
17 standing monument in context to our rich culture.
18 In fact in my inauguration on Sunday we had an
19 entire presentation on the landmarks from my
20 district as part of the, the celebration.
21 Unfortunately we couldn't actually bring the
22 monuments there but we did have a wonderful
23 presentation from the Historic Districts Council,
24 the friends of the upper eastside. And I just
25 wanted to say as much as I stand against the, the

2 corruption that is represented by Tammany Hall,
3 it's good for it to be there and I'm glad that it
4 will be hopefully with my colleagues' vote and if
5 we all agree Council Member Mendez I, I, I think,
6 at least I do that it will be there as a reminder
7 of where we come from and how far we've come. And
8 so I, I support this land marking.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you I
10 forgot to add a little something in my speech and
11 since he mentioned the corruption. Actually before,
12 you know some things start from a good place and
13 actually the democratic party in Tammany Hall
14 started as a social safety net when none existed.
15 And then unfortunately it got rooted in corruption.
16 So it came from a good place and so we all should
17 remember that, you know that is part of the
18 history. Thank you.

19 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON KOO: We have two persons
21 who want to testify. The first one is Simeon
22 Bankoff. Then the next one is Andrea Golden.

23 [background comments]

24 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Do you have a, a
25 prepared statement or something?

2 ANDREA GOLDEN: Okay sure. [mic static]

3 Sorry. Good morning Chair Koo and Council Members.

4 I'm Andrea Golden speaking on behalf of the

5 Landmarks Conservancy. I'd just like to start by

6 congratulating all the council members on election,

7 reelection, welcoming back members to the

8 subcommittee, new members to the subcommittee,

9 Chair Koo, and Chair Greenfield of Land Use thank

10 you. The Conservancy is pleased to join with public

11 officials, preservationists, and advocates in

12 supporting designation of Tammany Hall in

13 particular as Council Member Mendez mentioned Mr.

14 Jack Taylor who's kept the designation status of

15 this building on the radar of the preservation

16 community for many years. This handsome building

17 has both architectural and cultural significance

18 and it's an anchor of its neighborhood set on the

19 East side of Union Square itself an icon of labor

20 history and a significant public space. Tammany

21 Hall is a fine example of Colonial Revival

22 Architecture often found in social service and

23 institutional buildings of the era. With its red

24 brick façade, white granite and limestone trim

25 Tammany was designed to evoke the early days of

2 American architecture according to the real estate
3 record of 1928. Not only was this an attractive
4 style but it could recall the founding days of the
5 nation, a positive association for the political
6 machine of the New York City Democratic Party
7 facing accusations of corruption. The historic
8 fabric is mostly in tact with some alterations at
9 the ground floor storefronts. Tammany also had an
10 important role in cultural history starting as home
11 to the NYC Democratic Party from 1928 to 43. And
12 since then has served, excuse me, continued to be a
13 center of political and arts communities housing
14 the International Ladies Garment Workers Union,
15 later an off-Broadway theatre and now the New York
16 Film Academy. Back in 1985 the Conservancy first
17 wrote to the Landmarks Commission requesting that
18 Tammany Hall be considered for designation. Nearly
19 30 years later we thank the Commission for acting
20 to designate the site and urge the council to
21 affirm that designation. Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you.

23 SIMEON BANKOFF: Good morning Council
24 Members. I'm Simeon Bankoff, Executive Director of
25 the Historic Districts Council. First off I would

2 like to also welcome and greet all of you. It's a
3 pleasure to be here and I look forward to working
4 with all of you in this new session. The Historic
5 Districts Council is the citywide advocate for New
6 York's historic neighborhoods. We are here in
7 strong support of the designation of Tammany Hall.
8 I can only echo what Council Member Mendez said and
9 also my colleague Ms. Golden said about the
10 importance of this building. It is, it occupies a
11 very critical point in the understanding of how New
12 York came to be and in the cultural and social
13 history of New York City. Tammany was one of the
14 building blocks that helped create our modern city
15 and it is entirely proper that it should be
16 protected. Finally I would like to also thank the
17 Council, thank the Landmarks Commission on their
18 long work on this. It was a very involved process
19 that they went through with the property owner and
20 we admire their fortitude. And a special thank you
21 to Jack Taylor who has been keeping this not only
22 on our radar but on our priorities for almost 30
23 years. It is a pleasure to not have to continue
24 writing letters asking that this become a landmark,

2 instead simply celebrate its landmark designation.

3 Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you very much.

5 Any questions for the speakers? No. So with that we

6 move on to...

7 [background comments]

8 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Do we have any further

9 comments from the public? Then we will close the

10 hearing on this matter. We are happy to have

11 Council Member Arroyo to join our Committee. The

12 next item is 39 Worth Street building, 20145191

13 HKM...

14 [background comments]

15 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Oh, let me repeat

16 that. 20145191 HKM, this is located at 39 Worth

17 Street. This is to apply for a designation as an

18 historic landmark. So can we have Ms. Daly again to

19 testify?

20 KATE DALY: Thank you Chair Koo. We've

21 combined our testimony on both 39 and 41 into one

22 testimony to, in the interest of time but I'm happy

23 to testify on both separately as well.

24 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay, then we combine

25 the two items to be detailed as 41 Worth Street

2 Buildings 20145186 HKM. 41 Worth, Worth Street to
3 apply as an Historic Landmark. So you can combine
4 the two items together.

5 KATE DALY: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you.

7 KATE DALY: For the record my name s
8 Kate Daly. I'm the Executive Director of the New
9 York City's Landmark Preservation Commission and
10 I'm here today to testify on the Commission's
11 designation of 39 and 41 Worth Street buildings in
12 Manhattan. On June 25th, 2013 the Landmarks
13 Preservation Commission held a public hearing on
14 the proposed designation as landmarks of 39 and 41
15 Worth Street. Three people spoke in favor of the
16 designation of the two buildings..

17 [background comments]

18 KATE DALY: ...including representatives
19 of the Historic Districts Council, the Victorian
20 Society of New York and the Tribeca Trust. The
21 president of the White Rose Artists Corporation
22 Board spoke in opposition. The Commission also
23 received three letters in opposition to designation
24 from members of the White Rose Artists Corporation
25 Board including the president and Vice President.

2 The Commission had previously held a public hearing
3 on these buildings on September 19th, 1989. On
4 October 29th, 2013 the Commission voted to
5 designate the buildings New York City individual
6 landmarks. The five story former store and loft
7 buildings at 39 and 41 Worth Street were designed
8 in 1866 by Isaac Duckworth, an architect who
9 designed several store and loft buildings in what
10 are now the Tribeca East, Tribeca South, and SoHo
11 Cast Iron Historic Districts. Built as an
12 investment for James Smith, a prominent
13 manufacturer of fire engines, the cast iron façades
14 manufactured by Daniel Badger's architectural iron
15 works are intact above the first story.

16 Incorporating elements of the Italianate and Second
17 Empire styles and designed in the Venetian Inspired
18 Italianate styles respectively the 39 and 41 Worth
19 Street buildings feature distinct architectural
20 features with deep cornices with medallions and
21 brackets. From the 1860s until the early 1970s they
22 were occupied by companies engaged in the dry goods
23 business. Now residences, the two buildings with
24 ground floor commercial at 39 Worth Street are rare
25 surviving examples of 1860s era cast iron store and

2 loft buildings constructed South of Canal Street at
3 the time that that area was become, becoming the
4 city's dry goods district. The Commission urges you
5 to affirm this designation. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Any
7 questions from the, the Committee? Council Member
8 Barron?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Thank
10 you for your testimony. In the supporting
11 documents, on page two I guess of what I have which
12 talks about the scription[phonetic] and analysis
13 for the 39 Worth Street Building. It talks about
14 the early history and it says that the land was
15 owned by Anthony Rutgers who was a brewer and slave
16 holder and that it was built, there was a mansion
17 built and he also received a patent to drain the
18 swamp that covered much of the area. As I mentioned
19 in my first remarks I'm very concerned that the
20 work of African Americans is noted adequately in
21 the research that's done. If he were a slave holder
22 the African Americans who were enslaved did the
23 work. He did not do the work. I think that should
24 be noted. And especially in terms of talking about
25 draining the swamps and this reference is made in

2 terms of the architecture, the iron work that's
3 done. I doubt that many people know that if you
4 were to travel to Ethiopia much of the iron work
5 that we see here in New York City and in other
6 Metropolitan nations is done there historically
7 going back hundreds and hundreds of years. So I
8 would even venture to say that much of the cast
9 iron work that we see was done in fact by those
10 persons that he held in slavery. I don't think that
11 just a mention of this fact that he was a slave
12 holder is adequate. It does not talk about, it does
13 not destroy that image of enslaved Africans as
14 being anything other than just laborers and
15 workers. And we also know that that area is the
16 area of the African burial ground. So I'm sure, I
17 don't have evidence of this point, but I'm sure
18 that there was a lot of the labor that was done in
19 that area was done by those who were enslaved of
20 African ancestry. I would encourage you to do
21 further research. I see you have a reference there
22 but I would encourage you to do further research
23 because that entire area was actually outside of
24 the boundaries of the city limitations at that
25 time. So it was an area that was surrounded by

2 those who did the work, who paved the roads, who
3 built Broadway. It talks about it was at the corner
4 of Broadway and Chambers. That is the African
5 Burial Ground site. That is the African Burial
6 Ground site. So I'm looking to see that much more
7 detailed information be given in terms of what was
8 the contribution so that it's not a foot note that
9 he was a slave holder. He was a slave holder and he
10 used those persons that he held in childhood
11 slavery to enrich himself and build this, build
12 this area and particularly this building. So I
13 would certainly want to see that expanded upon. And
14 additionally, well that covers it if I come back to
15 my other point that I'll asked to be recognized in
16 that.

17 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you so, we have
18 any members from the public who want to speak on
19 these items? No? Okay, hearing is closed for the
20 public hearings these two items. All your
21 questions. Yeah. We go to the Chairman of Landmark
22 Committee, on the Land Use Committee.

23 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you Mr.
24 Chairman. I just have one question. It notes over
25 here that Commission [static] previously held a

2 public hearing on the building September 1989. So
3 what...

4 KATE DALY: Right.

5 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: ...I guess that's
6 like 25 years ago.

7 KATE DALY: Right.

8 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: What, what
9 happened?

10 KATE DALY: The, it's not that uncommon
11 for the Commission to hold hearings, in particular
12 the Commission held many many hearings in 1966 and
13 1967 and if at that time there was opposition from
14 the owner or the Commission sat other priorities
15 sometimes they moved ahead without holding a vote
16 on the designation. At the, the time of the earlier
17 hearing there were likely issues like that,
18 opposition of the owner, perhaps not the support of
19 the local Council Member and so the Commission sat
20 aside that building and moved on to other
21 priorities. But we're constantly trying to revisit
22 buildings that were determined to be eligible in
23 the past and had public hearings held on them in
24 the past to bring them forward and make a final
25 determination one way or the other.

2 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: What about the
3 case? I'm just curious 'cause the folks testified
4 on, on this that Tammany Hall that it's been in the
5 pipeline for 30 years. What's the story with that.

6 KATE DALY: The, Tammany Hall wasn't
7 calendared and, and held a public hearing and voted
8 on until last year but it's something that had been
9 proposed as eligible for landmark designation for
10 many years. The Commission sets priorities each
11 year in terms of which buildings it will review. We
12 receive about 250 requests for evaluation each year
13 in addition to the hundreds of buildings that we
14 review through our own surveys that we conduct. And
15 so the, the Commission had set priorities and, and
16 determined that that building wasn't a top priority
17 in the past. In recent years the Commission has
18 been meeting with the property owner and entered
19 into several successive standstill agreements as
20 Council Member Mendez mentioned so that we could
21 ensure that the owner did not take any action to
22 alter the architecture of the building but at the
23 same time allowed us really some breathing room so
24 we could continue that conversation and try to work
25 in a very close partnership with the owner which

2 was ultimately a very successful partnership.
3 After, after the, the delays we were able to reach
4 a point where the owner no longer opposed the
5 landmark designation and has been very supportive
6 of the landmark designation of the building and the
7 Commission's work.

8 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.

9 KATE DALY: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON KOO: You want to go ahead?

11 Oh go ahead.

12 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: During the
13 standstill agreements in the past 25 years the
14 alterations that were made to the first floors of
15 both buildings, did that occur during that or
16 prior?

17 KATE DALY: The, the standstill
18 agreements were just entered into within the past
19 three years or so and so the alterations predated
20 the standstill agreements and those alterations
21 were made to accommodate the changing uses of the
22 building over time. The commercial, Commission sees
23 those changes as part of the history of the
24 building.

2 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you. And
3 thank you Rosie for indulging my follow-up.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you. Like
5 I said earlier we have, in the community done a lot
6 of work on this and the Landmarks Preservation
7 Commission has worked closely with the owners and
8 part of that was doing a standstill agreement while
9 other issues were looked at. And eventually we all
10 were on the same page I'm happy to say. I, for some
11 reason my good friend Jack Taylor is a little shy
12 and is not giving testimony today but he brought an
13 op-ed that was in the New York Times on January
14 18th and I, so I just wanted to read just a small
15 little section that was written in here about, by
16 Terry Calway [phonetic] saying political machines
17 clearly aren't what they used to be but last fall's
18 designation of the old Tammany Hall headquarters on
19 Union Square has a city landmark as a reminder of
20 just how powerful the nation's most famous was and
21 why it remains a presence in political
22 conversations. Going back to you know the fact that
23 I said political machines were serving the people
24 when government wasn't. And so thank you Jack and I
25 want to thank the members of this this committee

2 and again I hope everyone votes in favor of this
3 designation.

4 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay. Council Member
5 Barron.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, thank you.
7 I, I regained my lost thought. How close is this
8 area to the area that was known as Little Africa?

9 KATE DALY: My understanding is that
10 Little Africa is closer to the neighborhood that we
11 would now call the South Village and that Little
12 Africa fell within the boundaries of our recent
13 designation of the South Village Historic District.
14 And through a designation report for the South
15 Village Historic District did discuss Little Africa
16 as well as the, the other demographics of the area
17 and the immigrant groups but, as well as the
18 foundation and formation of Little Africa in that
19 area noting particular streets and even you know
20 people who live there as part of that community.

21 [background comments]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And then my
23 other question then is the notes that I have, the
24 summary sheet that I have says the owners are

25

2 opposed. Are you saying that the present owners are
3 no longer opposed?

4 KATE DALY: No, the current owners are
5 opposed to the designation. We've been meeting with
6 them and, and have had many conversations with them
7 to explain to them what the regulation would mean
8 and to make sure that they do understand the entire
9 landmarks process. Although they're not planning
10 any serious changes to their building or any
11 alterations to the important historic felt they,
12 the felt that on principal they, they simply didn't
13 want to get a Landmarks Commission permit in
14 addition to a Department of Buildings permit in the
15 even that in, at some time they did want to do work
16 on the building. It's a, it's a residential co-op
17 building and they have no plans to demolish the
18 building or to significantly alter the building but
19 they chose not to support the landmark designation.
20 But we did have a very lengthy outreach process
21 with them to make sure that all of their questions
22 were answered and that they had all the information
23 they needed in order to make that decision on their
24 position.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay, anymore... Okay,
3 so these two landmark buildings are in Council
4 Member Chin's area, district I mean and Council
5 Member Chin is supportive of the designations of
6 both items to be designated historic landmarks. So,
7 so public hearing for these two items is also
8 closed. Now we have one more item. 339 Grand Street
9 House 20145189 HKM to apply as an historic
10 landmark. So Council, Ms. Daly can you...

11 KATE DALY: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON KOO: ...testify again?

13 KATE DALY: Thank you Chair Koo. For the
14 record my name is Kate Daly. I'm the executive
15 director of the New York City Landmarks
16 Preservation Commission. I'm here today to testify
17 on the Commission's designation of the 339 Grand
18 Street House in Manhattan. On June 28th, 2011 the
19 Landmarks Preservation Commission held a public
20 hearing on the proposed designation as a landmark
21 of the 339 Grand Street House. There were five
22 speakers of designation including representatives
23 of the Historic Districts Council, the New York
24 Landmarks Conservancy, The Greenwich Village
25 Society for Historic Preservation and the Bowery

2 Alliance of Neighbors. There were two speakers in
3 opposition to designation including representatives
4 of the owner of the building and the Lower Eastside
5 BID. On October 29th, 2013 the Commission voted to
6 designate the building a New York City individual
7 landmark. The 339 Grand Street House was one of
8 only five federal style row houses built by John
9 Jacob Astor in 1831 to 1833. Astor at the time of
10 his death in 1848 was the wealthiest man in
11 America. His wealth originally accumulated in the
12 fur and china trades which largely concentrated in
13 New York City real estate after 1834. Early tenants
14 of the house included several dry goods merchants.
15 The five Grand Street houses were devised by a
16 codicil to Astor's will to six of his grandchildren
17 by his daughter Dorothea Astor Langdon. A partition
18 deed in 1855 provided for the 339 Grand Street
19 House to be allocated to his granddaughter Cecilia
20 Langdon Denon Beck. A full lot rear yard addition
21 fronting on Ludlow Street was built in 1855. There
22 has been a store front at the ground floor of the
23 grand street façade since 1844. The house remained
24 in the Denon Beck family until 1950. The 339 Grand
25 Street House is a remarkable, rare surviving,

2 example of a federal style house in Manhattan. It's
3 design is characteristic of the federal style and
4 the house retains a significant amount of its
5 original architectural fabric including its
6 original foreman materials, three and a half story
7 height and 17 and a half foot width and front
8 façade with Flemish bond brickwork, high peaked
9 roof and dormer. The early rear yard addition also
10 retains a significant amount of its original
11 architectural fabric including its three story
12 height, flat roof, stone lintels and sills, and
13 cornice. Of the five federal style row houses built
14 on Grand Street by John Jacob Astor the 339 Grand
15 Street House is the only one that is largely
16 intact. The Commission urges you to affirm this
17 designation. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Council Member Barron.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, thank you
20 for your testimony. In the history that you've
21 given for this landmark; it talks about the Lenape
22 Indian, the, Native Americans which we call the
23 Lenape Indians and they're particularly interesting
24 to me because they are also the Native Americans
25 that were part of the East New York Community so

2 they are part of that. And then we did some
3 research and we found some remains of African
4 Americans in the East New York section and the
5 Lenape Indians were a part of that history as well.
6 In your third paragraph you talk about
7 Stenewick[phonetic] and he held several positions
8 in the colonial governments and you identify him as
9 having participated in the slave trade but it
10 cannot be determined if he, himself owned any
11 slaves. I would ask that you do further research
12 because someone who participated in the slave trade
13 I would imagine would want more of the benefits. So
14 I would ask that you do further research and find
15 out what was the extent and also to talk about how
16 the slave trade enriched this country and this city
17 and how the benefits of the economics came from
18 those who did the work and were not paid.

19 KATE DALY: That's certainly something,
20 an area that our staff has done a great deal of
21 research in and I'll take a look at the, that are
22 and talk to them more about what were they able to
23 find that perhaps they thought didn't rise to the
24 level of including in the report or perhaps
25 documents that couldn't be substantiated or where

2 the documentary evidence was, was lacking and see
3 if we can take another look.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON KOO: No member of the
6 public is here to testify so we will close the
7 public hearing. But I want to, want to emphasize
8 that these Landmark designations located in Council
9 Member Chin's district and she is really supportive
10 of the designation of 339 Grand Street to be an
11 historic landmark.

12 [pause]

13 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Now we're going to
14 have a vote on the first, the, the, the three items
15 in Council Member Chin's area, district which is
16 item number 2014, 20145189, 2014186, and 20145189.
17 And, and also 20145176. And the Chair will commend
18 a yes vote.

19 UNKNOWN FEMALE: Chair Koo.

20 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yes.

21 UNKNOWN FEMALE: Council Member Arroyo.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Mr. Chairman my
23 apologies for being late, I had a flat. I don't
24 know how to use a jack and Superman was nowhere to
25 be found. And congratulations on your new

2 assignment. I look forward to working with you and
3 aye on all.

4 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you.

5 UNKNOWN FEMALE: Council Member Mendez.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I like to vote
7 aye on all and Superman was here waiting to have
8 Tammany Hall called to the calendar. Sorry about
9 that.

10 UNKNOWN FEMALE: Council Member Levin.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye on
12 all.

13 UNKNOWN FEMALE: Council Member Barron.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye on
15 all with the understanding that there will be
16 further research done into the areas that I
17 expressed my concern about.

18 UNKNOWN FEMALE: Council Member Kallos.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

20 UNKNOWN FEMALE: By a vote of six in the
21 affirmative, zero abstentions, and zero in
22 negatives the landmarks designations of Tammany
23 Hall, 39 Worth Street, 41 Worth Street, and 39
24 Grand Street House are approved and referred to the
25 full Land Use Committee.

2 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Okay so,
3 the, the meeting's adjourned. Thank you.

4 [gavel]

5 [background comments]

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date _____ January 29, 2014 _____