CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK ----- Х TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES Of the SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES ----- X December 17, 2013 Start: 10:23 a.m. Recess: 12:19 p.m. HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm. 16th Fl. BEFORE: MARK S. WEPRIN Chairperson COUNCIL MEMBERS: Leroy G. Comrie Robert Jackson Albert Vann Daniel R. Garodnick Vincent Ignizio Domenic M. Recchia, Jr. Jessica Lappin Diana Reyna World Wide Dictation 545 Saw Mill River Road - Suite 2C, Ardsley, NY 10502 1

World Wide Dictation 545 Saw Mill River Road – Suite 2C, Ardsley, NY 10502 Phone: 914-964-8500 * 800-442-5993 * Fax: 914-964-8470 www.WorldWideDictation.com

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Philip Robertson Madison Global LLC

Hari Nathan Kalyan Owner/Operator The Randolph at Broome

Marty Markowitz Borough President Brooklyn, NY

Hardy Adasko Senior Vice President of Planning New York City Economic Development Corporation

Karl Frey Executive Vice President iSTAR Financial

Scott Streeb Senior Associate Michael Van Valkenburgh Associates Inc. Landscape Architects

Larry Scott Blackmon Deputy Commissioner for Community Outreach NYC Department of Parks

Nancy Kohn Director Green Thumb Program NYC Department of Parks and Recreation

Karen Becker Director of Government Relations NYC Department of Parks and Recreation

Roland Choulaute Deputy Director Green Thumb Program NYC Department of Parks and Recreation

Jennifer Kao Planning NYC Department of Parks and Recreation

Howard Weiss Member of the Firm Davidoff Hutcher & Citron LLP

David Eisenman Project Manager NYC Economic Development Corporation

Charles Krezell Founder Loisaida United Neighborhood Gardens

Susan Frazier Green Acres Community Garden Bedford-Stuyvesant, Brooklyn, NY

Carolyn McCrory Garden Member/Employee Coney Island Amusement Area

Ann M. Valdez Member/Resident People's Coalition of Coney Island

Martin Levine Member Community Board 13

Dick Zigun Founder/Artistic Director Coney Island USA

Johanna Zaki Director of Operations The Alliance for Coney Island

Keith Suber Executive Director Suber Foundation Coney Island, Brooklyn, NY

Sheila Smalls Director CI Youth Alive

Raymond Figueroa, Jr. President NYC Community Garden Coalition

Anthony Butler Executive Director St. John's Bread & Life Program

Wycliffe Wilkinson Associate Director of Development Futures in Education

Nicole Robinson-Etienne Assistant Director of Government and Community Affairs New York Aquarium

Eddie Mark Chairman Community Board 13

Benjamin Hunter Resident Coney Island, Brooklyn, NY

Paul Custer Senior vice President YMCA of New York City

Anthony Hayes Representing 911 Homesavers/Suber Foundation

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

1

2 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Alright, good 3 morning, everyone. My name is Mark Weprin and I'm chair of the Zoning and Franchises Subcommittee. 4 5 Wishing everyone a very happy holiday season and 6 we're here today with the following members of the 7 subcommittee: Council Member Leroy Comrie, Council 8 Member Robert Jackson, Council Member Al Vann, 9 Council Member Dan Garodnick, Council Member 10 Vincent Ignizio and myself, Mark Weprin. We have a 11 number of items on today's agenda. Some of the 12 items we have on we are laying over. Lane Use 13 Numbers 961, 62 and 963, which is 77 Commercial 14 Street. We'll have a... we're going to be having a 15 meeting later this week where we hope to take that 16 up. Land Use Number 987, Nello's; we already had 17 the public hearing on this and the committee is 18 recalling the applicant's representative to read 19 the agreement that we have and I'm going to do that 20 right now. Philip Robertson, who is here for 21 Nello. Mr. Robertson, please make your way to the 22 table. You got a nicer backdrop than usual. 23 Usually that backdrop looks like you know, you're 24 in a hostage situation, but with a nice Seaside 25 Park thing it's much nicer so please, if you'll

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 7
2	read the agreement into the record. State your
3	name for the record again and make sure the mic is
4	on. Thank you.
5	PHILIP ROBERTSON: Good morning,
6	Council Members. My name is Philip Robertson and
7	I'm representing Nello Restaurant. I'll be reading
8	the letter of agreement.
9	Dear Council Member Garodnick, this
10	letter serves as our agreement with the Chair,
11	Council Member Mark Weprin, and the encompassing
12	members of the Subcommittee on Zoning and
13	Franchises that we will commit to the following:
14	1. To the removal of the planters permanently
15	unless a permit is obtained in accordance with
16	regulations for small unenclosed sidewalk cafes.
17	2. The tables will be set according to the approved
18	plans by the Department of Consumer Affairs. 3.
19	The restaurant's doors and windows will be closed
20	every night at 11:30 p.m. 4. A direct phone number
21	for any complaints is 212-980-9099. Thank you.
22	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: And I'd like to
23	call on Council Member Garodnick, who represents
24	Nello's.
25	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 8
2	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you
3	and briefly we appreciate your willingness to
4	reduce (background static). And we as you know,
5	there were community issues and community board
6	disapproval of this item, so we look forward to a
7	more productive relationship between the neighbors
8	and Nello's going forward and we are glad to have
9	the ongoing contact to be able to ensure that.
10	Thank you.
11	PHILIP ROBERTSON: Thank you, sir.
12	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: We will now move
13	onto our next sidewalk café, which is The Randolph
14	at Broome in Council Member Chin's district. My
15	eyes are not very good here, but I'd like to call
16	up Hari Nathan Khan what is that, Kaylan,
17	Esquire? You'll you'll
18	HARI NATHA KALYAN: [interposing]
19	It's
20	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [interposing]
21	You'll you'll say it, but your you know your
22	handwriting is very small and my eyes are very bad,
23	so anyway, just state your name for the record and
24	you can describe the application and I think we
25	
l	

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 9
 okay and I know you have an agreement that you want
 to read into the record also, so please.

HARI NATHAN KALYAN: My name's Hari 4 5 Nathan Kalyan. I am the owner/operator of The 6 Randolph at Broome. I've submitted a... well, good morning, Council Members and thank you for having 7 I've submitted a letter with exhibits in 8 me. response to some of the issues that have arisen 9 10 regarding the sidewalk café. I've also put in some information about my businesses and our locations 11 12 and no complaint history and so on. I'm also 13 available for... to answer any questions or resolve 14 any issues. You have my direct contact information, so I'm happy to work with the 15 community on any issues, so I'm going to read an 16 enumerated list of the corrective action taken in 17 response to the issues that have arisen. 18

19 Issue number 1: The sidewalk café 20 alleged to take up more than 50 percent of the 21 sidewalk. The corrective action taken: The 22 railings have been tethered together and fixed to 23 the storefront. This will ensure that the end of 24 the café provides the correct amount of clearance 25 as per our approved diagrams, in compliance with SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 10
 DCA regulations and that's in Exhibit B, which are
 photos of the tethered sidewalk café railings.

Issue number 2: Wait service alleged 4 5 not to be provided. Corrective action: Our staff provides table service at all times. The café is 6 open and alcohol is served only to seated 7 customers. The only times there would be standing 8 customers would be at times when the café is 9 10 closed. We have signs posted clearly that informs 11 our customers of our policies regarding table 12 service, no smoking, respecting our neighbors and 13 keeping voices down, and that's in Exhibit C, which 14 is... which are photos of the signs posted and affixed to the storefront. 15

16 Issue Number 3: Sandwich board being 17 used to advertise. Corrective action: We do not 18 use a sandwich board and will not use one at any 19 point in the future.

I've also annexed as Exhibit A a letter
from Community Board 2 confirming that we have
never had any issues at any of my locations. I
also have a third location in Brooklyn Community
Board 1 that has not had any issues as well so.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 11
2	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Alright, thank you
3	very much. I know Council Member Chin's office has
4	been negotiating this with you and is comfortable
5	with what you just read into the record. `Kay, so
6	I'm going to move to close this public hearing
7	because we have no one else to testify on it; on
8	Land Use Number 1002 and we'll close that and we
9	thank you very much for coming. I'm sorry for
10	butchering your name.
11	HARI NATHAN KALYAN: Thank you very
12	much.
13	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: You're welcome.
14	[Pause]
15	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Give us just one
16	minute and we we may vote on these first two
17	items.
18	[Pause]
19	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay. We're
20	joined by Coney Island's finest, Domenic M.
21	Recchia, Jr. How are you, sir?
22	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Domenic!
23	[applause]
24	
25	
l	I

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 12 2 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: 'Kay, I made 3 the... I got R.J. started again. That was a mistake. 4 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Domenic, East 5 6 Side Park, we're going to start there. 7 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: I know. CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: We're sort of... 8 we're in a... in a lull at the moment. We're 9 10 waiting for... [laughter] 'Kay, we're waiting for Domenic to... 11 12 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Domenic, you 13 pick up the check. I've heard that before. 14 [laughter] [background voices] CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay, here we go. 15 We have our six for a quorum in the room. See how 16 17 that works? So I'm going to couple these two restaurants; these two cafes, Nello's and The 18 19 Randolph at Broome, which we heard and have closed 20 the hearing on. These cafes have agreements, so we 21 will call Ann McCoy [phonetic] to call the roll and to vote on these two cafes. 22 23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Chair Weprin. 24 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: I vote aye on 25 both.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 13
2	COMMITTEE CLERK: Chair Comrie.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Aye on both.
4	COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member
5	Jackson. Council Member Jackson on Land Use
6	[laughter]
7	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: I vote aye on
8	both.
9	COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Vann.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Aye.
11	COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member
12	Garodnick.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.
14	COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member
15	Ignizio.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Aye.
17	COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of six in
18	the affirmative, zero abstentions and zero
19	negative, Land Use Items 987 and 1002 are approved
20	and referred to the Full Land Use Committee.
21	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Excellent,
22	alright.
23	[Pause]
24	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Good morning. You
25	can have a seat have a seat, Mr. Borough
I	I

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 14
2	President, while I introduce you and call up our
3	item here. Alright, ladies and gentlemen, we are
4	now going to hear Land Use Numbers 994, 995, 996,
5	997, 998 and 999, known as the Seaside Park and
6	Community Arts Center in Council Member Domenic M.
7	Rechhia, Jr's district and we are going with
8	permission of the applicants, we are going to go
9	outside our normal rules and welcome our guest for
10	the last time as Borough President of Brooklyn I
11	believe at this committee for sure. It is an honor
12	and a privilege to welcome the Borough President of
13	Brooklyn, Marty Markowitz.
14	MARTY MARKOWITZ: Thank you, thank you,
15	thank you, Mark. [applause] Thank you and I want
16	to say if I may, apart from this, Domenic, it's
17	really been an honor working with all of you and I
18	especially value my relationship with Domenic
19	Recchia. He is everything you want in a public
20	official and he has truly made historic
21	contributions in so many ways. In many ways,
22	Domenic, I have followed your leadership and I've
23	been proud to do so. And also, to the Brooklynites
24	that may be here and New Yorkers, thank you for
25	letting me be part of your life. My dream in

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 15
 public service if elected was only to be Brooklyn
 Borough President and I'll admit it took me many
 years to get there, but I thank you for the
 opportunity. I thank you.

6 Anyway, let me thank Chairman Mark 7 Weprin and all the members of the City Council Land Use Subcommittee for Zoning and Franchises for the 8 opportunity to testify on the proposed Seaside Park 9 10 and Community Arts Center. With the reopening of 11 Coney Island Library and the grand opening of a 12 brand new YMCA that Dom and I were at at Community 13 Center two weeks ago, it's clear that at every step 14 of the way we've been dedicated to getting Coney Island back on its feet and focused on creating the 15 jobs, improving infrastructure and providing 16 services that will make residents of Coney Island 17 even prouder of their neighborhood, and that's why 18 I'm here today. There is no question that this 19 project, to bring the city's first covered seasonal 20 21 amphitheatre to Coney Island will be a tremendous 22 benefit to Coney Island and Brooklyn and all of New York City. The Seaside Park and Community Arts 23 24 Center will add even more energy and excitement to Coney Island. It'll provide a new home for summer 25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 16 concerts and events by the boardwalk. 2 It will 3 serve as a catalyst for residential and commercial development and finally bring improvements so 4 desperately needed in the infrastructure of Coney 5 6 Island, like water and sewer upgrades that reduce flooding, which really impact this neighborhood, 7 and other critical services that Coney Island's 8 West End residents have been seeking and absolutely 9 10 legitimately for years. Moreover, this project 11 will ensure that Coney Island is one of America's 12 top destinations for family amusement and 13 entertainment, which increases tourism and 14 stimulates the economy, and Coney Island residents are in the best position and location to reap the 15 rewards of this project. This amphitheatre will 16 17 attract more visitors. That means more retail; that means more restaurants; more businesses that 18 will put Coney Islanders to work and create the 19 20 maximum number of jobs possible and even bring more 21 housing, including what we desperately need, and that is affordable housing and of course, the 22 amphitheatre will create hundreds of good paying 23 24 jobs. The developer has committed to prioritizing local residents both for construction jobs and the 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 17
2	jobs that are required to run the amphitheatre, and
3	by reusing the historic Childs Restaurant building,
4	which, by the way, has been closed since before I
5	was born, but actually when I was two years old it
6	closed and that's a few years ago, we can breathe
7	new life into this underutilized section of the
8	Riegelmann Boardwalk and by building a lush
9	neighborhood park where none exists now, we can
10	jump start the Coney Island plan to deliver on the
11	city's promise of building green spaces.
12	Now, there's no doubt that this will be
13	one of the most popular parks in the city.
14	Residents from across the city, especially those
15	that are within walking distance of Coney Island,
16	will flock to the area to enjoy seasonal
17	entertainment and concerts, year-round seaside
18	dining and during the winter the music and food
19	will continue inside this restored Childs building
20	that's been closed to the public all these years.
21	And in the summer, there'll be plenty of open space
22	where families can picnic, enjoy stunning views of
23	the ocean and it's hard for you to imagine, but
24	when you're there you don't even know there's an
25	ocean on the other side because your view is
I	l

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 18 2 blocked in most of the area, by the way. And kids 3 can run free in play areas that we need for the 4 families there. In addition, when the concert 5 season's over, the developer has pledged to have 6 local residents use the amphitheatre for community 7 events and programs of their choice.

8 For too many years, Coney Island hasn't received the attention that it deserves. 9 Public housing has not been maintained as it should and 10 sadly, we know that's true in the entire NYCHA 11 12 inventory. And infrastructure is in dire need of 13 improvement and Sandy proved that big time, but 14 that's exactly why we need the amphitheatre. It'll keep the city's focus on Coney Island and its 15 16 needs.

17 So let me thank Mayor Bloomberg, Speaker Quinn and especially Speaker Quinn to thank 18 her so very, very much and of course, Mr. Coney 19 Island, Domenic Recchia, who I've been thrilled to 20 21 work with to ensure that Coney Island finally 22 receives their long overdue attention that it deserves and I also want to thank Deputy Mayor 23 24 Robert Steel; City Planning Commissioner Amanda Burden; Purnama Kapoor, the head of the City 25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 19 2 Planning Department's Brooklyn Office; of course, 3 Haeda Mihaltses, Intergovernmental Affairs; the first Deputy Mayor's Chief of Staff Nanette Smith 4 5 and EDC President Emeritus Seth Pinsky and Brooklynite I might add, and current President Kyle б Kimball along with iSTAR CEO Jay Sugarman; 7 Executive Vice President Karl Frey, and it's been a 8 pleasure to work with Karl. And then I've got to 9 10 say something about one person that's here and if 11 you ever believe in an angel, and I do believe in 12 angels and I do believe that things happen for a 13 reason, and when Marty Cottingham entered my life; 14 I knew him before a little bit, but when he entered my life this Irishman, a proud Irishman, if there 15 was such a thing as a blessing of an angel 16 17 visiting, I got to say that Marty Cottingham's as close as you can get to that, of Avison Young, for 18 making this vision come true for the benefit of 19 20 this and future generations. I thank you for the 21 opportunity. Thank you, by the way, for your service. We all know that as elected officials, 22 it's a unique experience to work on behalf of the 23 24 public. We know that, but we wouldn't exchange it

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 20
2	for any other profession. You know that and it's
3	just a great opportunity that we've had for years.
4	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Well, thank you.
5	Borough President Markowitz, you're going to make
6	us cry here. [applause] Thank you very much for
7	your service as well. You have been the model of
8	what a borough president should be and you've done
9	an amazing job for the people of Brooklyn and
10	indeed the entire city of New York. I want to call
11	on you all you wanted to speak now? Yeah,
12	okay, I'd like to call Domenic M. Recchia, Jr. who
13	has comments
14	[crosstalk]
15	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Yeah, I just
16	wanted to
17	[crosstalk]
18	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: To make to the
19	borough president.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Yes, I want to
21	say a few words. First of all, Marty, it's been a
22	pleasure working with you. The last past 12 years
23	you've been an outstanding borough president and
24	together we really accomplished something that many
25	people thought would not ever happen, and that's
I	l

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 21
2	that revitalization of Coney Island, and not only
3	in Coney Island the amusement area, but for the
4	residents and for the surrounding communities;
5	Brighton Beach and Bensonhurst, Bath Beach,
6	Gravesend and just seeing so many good things
7	happen and I think the last thing to happen is for
8	this amphitheatre to be built and I just want to
9	say that to make it clear to a lot of people that
10	these concerts that you will be running; is that
11	correct?
12	MARTY MARKOWITZ: Well, I don't know,
13	I
14	[crosstalk]
15	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Well
16	[laughter] The the
17	[crosstalk]
18	MARTY MARKOWITZ: Not for
19	[crosstalk]
20	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Not-for-
21	profit
22	[crosstalk]
23	MARTY MARKOWITZ: 35 years and
24	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Alright, the
25	not-for-profit
I	I

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 22 2 [crosstalk] MARTY MARKOWITZ: I hope they continue. 3 [crosstalk] 4 5 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: But we will... [crosstalk] 6 7 MARTY MARKOWITZ: Let me tell you. COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: There will be 8 free concerts. 9 10 MARTY MARKOWITZ: I hope so. Of 11 course. 12 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Absolutely. 13 Absolutely free concerts. I want to make this 14 clear. There will be free concerts just the way... 15 they will continue. In addition to that, the community will be able to also use this 16 17 amphitheatre. Is that free of charge? 18 MARTY MARKOWITZ: Listen, I can't speak 19 for... but I would assume there'll be a mix of free and fee... 20 21 [crosstalk] 22 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Right. [crosstalk] 23 MARTY MARKOWITZ: Concerts and the 24 use... of course it's... it for the... it's good 25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 23 for the amphitheatre to be used on the off season 2 by the community. That's who it's meant for. 3 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Right. 4 5 MARTY MARKOWITZ: So of course, it's no one else. б 7 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Right. No, because several people have asked me and I just 8 want to set the record clear that there will be 9 time set aside for the community... 10 MARTY MARKOWITZ: [interposing] 11 12 Absolutely. 13 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: To be used. 14 MARTY MARKOWITZ: And that includes, by the way, graduations... 15 [crosstalk] 16 17 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Right, graduations you know ... 18 19 [crosstalk] MARTY MARKOWITZ: You know for public 20 schools that want to do it outdoors rather than in 21 an auditorium. 22 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Sure. 23 Α 24 number of schools already contacted me to see if 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 24
2	they'd be able to have their graduations here and I
3	just want to set the record and
4	[crosstalk]
5	MARTY MARKOWITZ: Well and certainly.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: So Marty,
7	thank you very much. You know I support this
8	project.
9	MARTY MARKOWITZ: I know.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIO: Alright, we're
11	here to hear from other people.
12	MARTY MARKOWITZ: Of course.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIO: And I just
14	want to thank you for years
15	MARTY MARKOWITZ: Thank you.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: For Brooklyn,
17	for Coney Island and working with me and
18	MARTY MARKOWITZ: And Buon Natale.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Buon Natale.
20	[background voices]
21	MARTY MARKOWITZ: I guess that's it so.
22	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay, okay well,
23	thank you very much, Marty.
24	MARTY MARKOWITZ: Thanks everybody.
25	Thank you.
I	I

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 25 2 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: You're on your 3 way. One more round of applause [applause] for Marty Markowitz. Thank you and to you and your 4 5 family. 6 [Pause] CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay, now I'd like 7 to call up the presenting panel for this project. 8 Hardy Adasko; Karl Frey; Scott Streeb and Howard 9 10 Weiss I believe is the group. Gentlemen, do we 11 need extra chairs? Sergeant-at-Arms, could we get 12 one extra chair? We're going to need a fourth 13 chair. Once the applicants will present, there'll 14 be questions I'm sure from the panel, and then we have people in opposition as well as people in 15 favor of the projects. They will be called up 16 17 all... we're going to start with people in opposition and then people in favor. We're going 18 19 to have to limit people due to the hour and to the 20 amount of people to around two minutes each, so in 21 your minds if you can try to sort your statement 22 out and limit it to two minutes and I'll try to give you a little leeway on that, but I can't give 23 24 you like that much more than that, okay? That'll be after this panel and all the questions are done. 25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 26 'Kay, gentlemen, whenever you're ready. 2 3 [background voices] 'Kay, good morning. HARDY ADASKO: On? 4 My name is Hardy Adasko, Senior Vice President of 5 6 Planning, New York City Economic Development Corporation, here to speak on behalf of the Seaside 7 8 Park Project. In 2008, the council approved an 9 10 ambitious vision for Coney Island and memorialized 11 a variety of actions to implement that, and the 12 results have been spectacular since then. At that 13 time, the concerts had existed for several decades 14 in Asser Levy Park and there were plans and funds allocated to build a more permanent facility with a 15 roof, which we assumed would happen. Later, it 16 17 became obvious that there were problems with that location and at the borough president's request, 18 EDC worked with other community leaders to find 19 alternate locations. We looked at a wide variety 20 21 of locations, particularly using the ballpark and squeezing concerts in; however, with the very dense 22 schedule of minor league games during the three 23 24 month period and the need for set up and take down on a grass field, that was not feasible. We also 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 27
2	looked at using the very temporary location that
3	they are at today. Doing that would've entailed a
4	delay in the affordable housing that is planned for
5	that site; mixed use housing; of 10 years and that
6	was not an acceptable scenario. And so we settled
7	on what is really I believe was a perfect plan;
8	perfect because it will continue the concerts; will
9	lead to the reactivation of the landmark Childs
10	building as a year-round facility, restaurant,
11	entertainment venue and seasonally part of it being
12	used as a stage for the concert series. In
13	addition, it will provide funds for the creation of
14	the park that was identified in the council's
15	earlier approval that will be built and will
16	survive the concert series and become a public park
17	at the end. In addition, the current users of the
18	site, a relocation site has been found for them on
19	HPD property a couple of blocks away, and they will
20	be able to continue even though that site is not
21	part of has not been part of the Green Thumb
22	Program for many years. And the venue is designed
23	to meet three standards of noise regulation, both
24	in terms of distance from a sensitive receptor, in
25	terms of noise leaking outside of the facility and
l	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 28
2	in terms of the increase in noise in the
3	neighborhood. It will not have adverse impact.
4	With that, I urge you to support the project and I
5	turn it over to the rest of our team. I'm happy to
6	answer questions when the time comes.
7	KARL FREY: Good morning, Chair,
8	council persons and intrepid staff. My name is
9	Karl Frey. I'm Executive Vice President of iSTAR
10	Financial, a real estate investment trust trader on
11	the New York Stock Exchange.
12	iSTAR has completed more than \$35
13	billion of commercial real estate investments
14	during its 14-year history. While many financial
15	institutions elected to liquidate investments
16	during the downturn of the real estate markets
17	recently, iSTAR has decided to take a long-term
18	approach with its portfolio and has become one of
19	the largest residential and land developers in the
20	country. Our current portfolio includes properties
21	in the Coney West subdistrict of the special Coney
22	Island district that represent approximately 70
23	percent of Coney West's developable floor area.
24	While we have begun to plan for the
25	development of our Coney West properties involving

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 29
2	market rate and affordable housing, current
3	conditions in Coney West hampered our ability to
4	move ahead with the planned construction. We
5	brought our stalled plans to the attention of the
6	Brooklyn borough president and it was suggested
7	that iSTAR work with the city to develop an interim
8	use for Coney West involving a seasonal
9	amphitheatre in tandem with restoring the landmark
10	Childs Restaurant and creating an expansive
11	neighborhood park. After careful study, we
12	concluded that this project could stimulate our
13	residential development, the development intended
14	by the Coney Island rezoning, in the same way the
15	Bank of America Pavilion, the 5,000 seat
16	amphitheatre at Boston's Faneuil, was a catalyst
17	for residential and commercial development in the
18	Boston Harbor area, including a highly successful
19	Park Lane Seaport and \$130 million residential
20	development of 465 units that was completed
21	directly across the street from the Bank of America
22	Pavilion.
23	We are pleased to join with Coney
24	Island USA, a community-based non-profit
25	organization that has a 33-year history of

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 30
2	sponsoring neighborhood events and advocating for
3	the betterment of Coney Island to develop the
4	project for the city and oversee its operations
5	during the 10 year term of the proposed special
6	permit. There will be a total of 40 to 50 free and
7	paid concerts throughout the season from April
8	through October. 15 of those will be the free
9	Seaside Summer Concert series. We will expect that
10	these will be run by the renowned concert promoter
11	and artist manager, John Scher, with his team at
12	Metropolitan Entertainment and they have been
13	working with us throughout this preapproval
14	process. On non-event days, in season and during
15	the rest of the year, the plaza will be used for
16	community-based cultural, civic, educational and
17	recreational activities. The community-based
18	programming will be organized by Coney Island USA
19	in consultation with the Community Advisory
20	Committee.
21	The Childs building will be restored
22	for restaurant and catering use, including the
23	historic use of its roof for outdoor dining. The
24	restoration and operation of the Childs at the same

25 time that the amphitheatre construction will be

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 31 2 completed is a critical component of the project. 3 Although the project is being developed with city 4 capital funds, the operation and maintenance of the 5 park and amphitheatre will be supported solely by 6 the income from the Childs operations and the paid 7 concert events.

The expansive park component of the 8 project will be accessible to the neighborhood at 9 10 all times, including when the concert events are 11 taking place in the amphitheatre portion of the 12 project site. At the end of the special permit 13 term, the Parks Department will take over the 14 operation and maintenance of the park. The park has been designed in close collaboration with the 15 Parks Department, and the ground lease for the 16 17 project details the park condition and amenities that are required at the time the Parks Department 18 assumes jurisdiction over the property at the end 19 20 of the 10-year special permit.

21 iSTAR is committed to being a partner 22 in the future of Coney Island and believes that the 23 amphitheatre development will both meet the goals 24 established by the Coney Island rezoning and spur

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 32
2	the residential development planned in the Coney
3	Island West subdistrict. Thank you.
4	SCOTT STREEB: Hi. My name is Scott
5	Streeb. I'm with Michael Van Valkenburgh
б	Associates, Landscape Architects and I'd like to
7	begin just by walking you through some existing
8	site photos.
9	Here you see the historic Childs
10	Restaurant in much need of repair. All the
11	architectural detailings are falling apart. We
12	propose to revitalize this building. The site
13	currently has a bus parking lot, which we will
14	relocate and repurpose as park land and as
15	President Markowitz stated earlier, the entire site
16	is much lower than the boardwalk level, so you
17	can't really get a sense of the ocean beyond. We
18	propose to bring the park up to the boardwalk level
19	with handicap accessible grades.
20	Through a lot of coordination with New
21	York City Parks and New York City Planning, we have
22	developed this site plan. It has amenities for all
23	ages, including a playground at the north here; a
24	meandering garden with picnic seating and lush
25	horticultural planting for the elderly group and a

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 33
large lawn space oriented towards the community for
picnics. Lastly, we have the paved area, which can
seat 5,000 people and will be a community art space
and concert venue for Coney Island. There's three
different conditions for the plaza space with
regard to its covering. I'll get into that a
little more detailed in a second.
With regard to parking, this diagram,
showing in blue, are the proposed parking areas.
We will utilize the existing lot for the baseball
stadium and during nights where there are
concurrent events, both at the baseball stadium and
the project site, we will utilize the parking lot
at the aquarium and shuttle visitors to and from
that site.
Here we're showing you a site section.
This is going to highlight the three different
conditions of the amphitheatre roof. During the
off season in the winter months, the amphitheatre
roof is completely removed from the site. During
the season, a large portion remains up as a shade
structure and semi-permanent covering and on the
night of events we deploy an additional fabric
region, which provides acoustical insulation.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 34
2	Here's a view looking up the access of
3	22nd Street with the view out to the ocean that we
4	were talking about earlier, the semi-permanent
5	amphitheatre roof and the amphitheatre seating to
6	the right. When an event is in place, that's the
7	additional fabric region that's deployed to create
8	acoustical insulation. Here's an aerial view just
9	giving you a sense of its relationship to the ocean
10	and the boardwalk; a view along the boardwalk with
11	the revitalized Childs building and park space; a
12	view looking east towards the Parachute Jump
13	showing the lawn space and the garden space and
14	lastly, a view of the plaza on a day where the
15	community is using it for either a Farmers Market
16	or a children's performance, whatever the community
17	decides to use it for. Thank you.
18	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you. Before
19	we move on, I just want to acknowledge that Larry
20	Scott Blackmon from the Parks Department, Deputy
21	Commissioner of Parks is here as well and he'll be
22	testifying a little bit as well. Is he testifying
23	as well for right now or [background voices]
24	Okay well, you can go ahead, Larry, okay. Sorry we

25 left you out.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 35
2	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BLACKMON: Oh, no
3	problem. Let me get a little closer. Good
4	morning, Chair Weprin and members of the
5	Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises. I am Larry
6	Scott Blackmon, Deputy Commissioner for Community
7	Outreach with the New York City Department of
8	Parks. Thank you for allowing me to speak to you
9	this morning on the Coney Island Seaside Park and
10	Community Arts Center project, and before I begin,
11	I'd like to acknowledge several Parks Department
12	staff members that are with me: our Director of
13	Government Affairs, Karen Becker and it pleases me
14	to introduce our new Director of the Green Thumb
15	Community Garden Program, Nancy Kohn; [applause]
16	Roland Chaouloute, the Deputy Director of Green
17	Thumb is with us, as well as Jennifer Kao from
18	Parks Planning.
10	This proposed project involves the

19 This proposed project involves the 20 development of approximately two and a half acres 21 of publicly accessible open space in Coney Island, 22 Brooklyn, including a 5,100 seat seasonal 23 amphitheatre for concerts and other events. Over 24 the past year, Parks along with City Planning and 25 the Public Design Commission have worked with the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 36 2 applicant to improve upon and influence the design 3 before you today, including incorporating standard parks details and specifications. This open space 4 5 will extend between West 21st Street and West 23rd 6 Street along Riegelmann Boardwalk, and will include passive and active recreational areas. The design 7 8 includes landscaping and playground amenities located at the northwestern corner. The defining 9 10 feature of this open space would be a large 11 landscaped lawn area that would serve as a place 12 for lawn seating and passive recreation. A steeped 13 path extending off of the plaza will lead visitors 14 down to Riegelmann Boardwalk and to new public restroom facilities. The open space will also 15 feature a planted entry garden with native 16 17 plantings and bench seating at the southwestern portion of the development site. The proposed 18 amphitheatre will operate between May and October. 19 20 During the concert season, the amphitheatre would 21 be fully accessible to the public, except during 22 ticketed events. Temporary screening around the 23 seating area would allow other areas of the open 24 space to be used while events are taking place. The proposed amphitheatre and other project 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 37
 elements are expected to be completed by the summer
 of 2015.

As part of the 2009 Coney Island 4 rezoning, the portion of the project area west of 5 6 22nd Street was designated as an approximately one and a half acre neighborhood park. The tax lots 7 that comprise Highland View Park are privately 8 owned and have not been formally established as 9 10 public park land. This project will create new 11 open space in that area. The open space will be 12 maintained and managed at the applicant's cost for 13 the next decade. Upon conclusion of the 10-year 14 special permit, the Highland View Park portion of the site will be transferred to Parks for operation 15 as a public park. This park land will include the 16 17 expansive lawn and playground amenities mentioned earlier and we anticipate that this park land will 18 be well-used addition to the New York City Parks 19 20 portfolio.

I would also like to address the status of Block 7071, Lot 142, the location of a previously decommissioned community garden. Block 7071, Lot 142, referred to as Boardwalk Garden, was assigned the Parks of DCAS on July 15th, 1997. A

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 38
2	community garden was licensed for the site through
3	Green Thumb until 2004, when it was decommissioned
4	as part of the Coney Island comprehensive rezoning
5	plan that was approved in 2009. On August 20th,
6	2013, the Parks Department surrendered Block 7071,
7	Lot 142 to DCAS as part of the Coney Island
8	rezoning proposed development. It is extremely
9	important to note that this property is not, nor
10	was it ever mapped as park land. In 2002, there
11	was a settlement agreement with the New York State
12	Attorney General's Office over development of
13	community garden sites. The agreement specified
14	that gardens in the Park's jurisdiction would be
15	overseen by the Green Thumb Program unless the city
16	determined that it intended to sell or develop any
17	such garden lot. It was also established by the
18	settlement agreement that development of any
19	licensed garden site was required to undergo review
20	in accordance with the Garden Review Process. The
21	Garden Review Process for this earlier Coney Island
22	ULURP required that the gardener of record be
23	notified and provided a list of available city-
24	owned vacant land if any within a half mile of the
25	existing garden to provide for an alternative

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 39
2	gardening site. Parks worked with the gardener of
3	record to provide an alternate location. In August
4	of 2004, the gardener of record agreed to relocate
5	to an alternate site in Coney Island on West 28th
6	Street and Surf Avenue and informed the Green Thumb
7	office of this decision in writing. The garden was
8	then relocated to the alternative site. Since the
9	city had reached agreement with the gardener or
10	record to previously surrender and relocate to the
11	new site, under Section 6E3 of the settlement
12	agreement, there was no requirement that the city
13	comply further with the Garden Review Process.
14	Since that time, Block 7071, Lot 142 has not been
15	licensed by the Green Thumb Program and no
16	authorized garden activities have taken place
17	there. Although not a registered Green Thumb
18	garden and not subject to the Garden Review
19	Process, Parks has, as a sign of good faith, worked
20	with the developer, iSTAR, to make improvements;
21	significant improvements at an existing garden to
22	accommodate additional gardeners. Additionally,
23	any member of the community who wishes to garden
24	can avail themselves at any one of the five
25	community gardens in Coney Island, and we are more
l	

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 40
 than happy to take memberships at those gardens at
 any time.

I thank you for the opportunity to 4 speak before you today and welcome any questions 5 you may have, and I'd like just to close, if I 6 don't have the moment, just to say thank you to 7 Council Member Domenic Recchia. It's been a 8 9 pleasure and a joy to work with you, not just on 10 this project, but on many Parks projects citywide. 11 You're an ardent supporter of our agency and on 12 behalf of Commissioner White I want to thank you 13 and the same to Council Member Leroy Comrie and 14 Council Member Robert Jackson, as this is probably the last forum I'll have to do so publicly. Thank 15 16 you. Thank you. 17 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay and then Howard, you're going to now testify as well? 18 19 HOWARD WEISS: [off mic] Yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay, okay.
21 HOWARD WEISS: [off mic] I'll be brief.
22 Good morning, Mr. Chair, Council Members. Howard
23 Weiss, Davidoff, Hutcher and Citron. We're project
24 counsel. I've submitted statements from several
25 individuals who are in support of the project that

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 41
2	could not be here and you, I believe, have copies.
3	One was a statement from Mr. Myron Winiarsky, whose
4	family owns a good part of the properties adjacent
5	to the project site, including a 40 unit
6	residential building that's immediately adjacent to
7	the site, and he explains in his statement the
8	reasons for his strong support; a statement from
9	Charles Denson, Executive Director of the Coney
10	Island History Project and the author of a number
11	of well-known books about the history of Coney
12	Island, again strongly supporting the project. And
13	lastly, a statement from Juan Rivero on behalf of
14	Save Coney Island, a community advocacy group
15	that's been active in Coney Island over the years
16	advocating for the betterment of Coney Island.
17	During the Public Review Process there
18	were a number of issues that arose and I'd just
19	like to very briefly tell you how they've been
20	addressed and they have been addressed. One, there
21	had been a concern about noise impacts, and as the
22	FEIS and the other ULURP documents that you've seen
23	reveals, this project will be entirely compliant
24	with the city's Noise Control Code and it's been
25	designed in a way so that the activities that will

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 42 be undertaken on site will have no impacts based 2 3 upon the standards in the CEQR manual, and Scott briefly described and showed you the base design of 4 5 the project that's going to provide for the sound 6 attenuation that assures that there will be no impacts. There were concerns about traffic 7 8 impacts. There's a Memorandum of Understanding that's been entered into between the project 9 10 developer and the police department to provide traffic enforcement agents, the cost of which will 11 12 be paid for by the project to the extent that when 13 there are activities at MCU Park and there are concerts at the same time, if there would be any 14 potential impacts, those would be mitigated by the 15 use of the TAs. There was also concern about the 16 community garden and I think Commissioner Blackmon 17 has adequately and very forcefully explained the 18 status and what the project team has done to 19 20 accommodate those who are the gardeners and you can 21 see on the site plan the relocated community 22 garden, which is only five blocks west of the boardwalk garden. It's in green on the map up on 23 2.4 the wall and you should know that in fact, the planting beds have been installed, fresh topsoil 25

1SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES432has been delivered and there are persons who have3already laid claim to some of the plots at the4relocated garden site who are active at the5boardwalk garden.

6 We think that this project, based upon everything that's been revealed in the FEIS and 7 8 ULURP documents, shows in many different ways how it will, in fact, be a positive influence on the 9 10 community and will, in fact, at the end of the day achieve the objectives of the Coney Island plan and 11 12 ultimately not only provide real life and activity 13 at this west end of the boardwalk, but will, in 14 fact, give a jump start to the development of the housing that was critical to the Coney West 15 subdistrict, in which the project site is located, 16 17 and with that, I thank you for your attention.

Okay, we can go back. So the actions 18 that were approved by the Planning Commission that 19 are before you now is a modification of the 20 21 approved city map change. At the time of the Coney Island rezoning, there was a mapping action to 22 establish Highland View Park that was described by 23 24 Commissioner Blackmon and by Scott Streeb and also the demapping of West 22nd Street that runs through 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 44
2	the project site. To facilitate the amphitheatre
3	we're administratively separating the mapping of
4	Highland View Park from the demapping action and
5	that's the first action that's before you for
6	approval; a zoning map change that will extend the
7	Coney Island West subdistrict of the Special
8	District to include fully the project site. Right
9	now the Highland View Park portion does not lie
10	within the subdistrict. The acquisition of
11	property by the city, as was mentioned, other than
12	Lot 142, the former community garden site, the
13	balance of the project site is privately owned and
14	you will be approving the acquisition of those
15	private properties, most of which, except for the
16	Childs building, would needed to have been acquired
17	to realize the development of Highland View Park,
18	so this project accelerates the acquisition of the
19	properties for the development of the community-
20	based park that was approved by part of the Coney
21	Island rezoning. Then there'll be a disposition of
22	city-owned property, but once the land is acquired
23	it will be disposed to EDC's Local Development
24	Corporation through a lease agreement between the
25	city and the Local Development Corporation and then

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 1 45 subleased to the entity that will be operating the 2 3 project. And I should emphasize and it needs to be understood that the project site when the project 4 5 goes forward will be entirely owned by the city and 6 the project is being developed entirely with city capital funds and in fact, this project is a 7 municipal facility. That for the 10-year special 8 permit term will be operated by a partnership 9 10 between Coney Island USA, the community-based notfor-profit and an iSTAR entity as it will be 11 12 developed by that partnership, but it is all being 13 done on behalf of the city for a municipal project. 14 There's a zoning text change that establishes a special permit that allows the amphitheatre use. 15 Right now the special use provisions of the Coney 16 Island Special District allows for an amphitheatre 17 of 2,000 seats and this increases the capacity to 18 19 5,100 seats and then the special permit itself, the proposed special permit, which would allow the 20 21 amphitheatre use of the project site. Thank you 22 very much. 23 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you. Ι'd 24 like to call on Council Member Recchia, who has

some questions. [background static] We also ...

25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 46
2	Domenic, one second. We've been joined by Council
3	Member Jessica Lappin as well.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: And Diana
5	Reyna.
6	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Oh, and Diana
7	Reyna. I didn't see you there, Diana. Council
8	Member Diana Reyna.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: `Kay, thank
10	you, Mr. Chairman and thank you for this hearing
11	today. Good morning, gentlemen. I just have a few
12	quick questions. As far as hiring is concerned,
13	are you what's the issue with that on hiring
14	local from the Coney Island community?
15	HOWARD WEISS: There's been an absolute
16	commitment, Mr. Council Member, to hire locally and
17	in fact, there's already been an outreach to the
18	community. You're going to hear testimony from
19	Keith Suber of the Suber Foundation, who, as you
20	know is very proactive in the community in terms of
21	fostering local employment and there is an absolute
22	commitment in writing to foster that local hiring
23	with respect to both the development of the
24	project, construction jobs and operations once the
25	project is built.
I	I

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 47
2	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Okay and are
3	you building this prevailing wage?
4	HOWARD WEISS: Prevailing wage and
5	prevailing wage benefits, yes and that's, in fact,
6	memorialized in the funding agreement between the
7	city and the project partnership.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Okay and the
9	community use of the facility; could we just talk
10	about that a little bit?
11	HOWARD WEISS: Yes, there will be 15
12	free concerts and up to 25 paid concerts during the
13	concert season. All other times; all other times
14	this project site will be available for community-
15	based use. It was no coincidence that this project
16	is called the Seaside Arts Community Center because
17	the vision is that it's a community-based facility.
18	To facilitate and ensure transparency and
19	inclusiveness, there will be a Community Advisory
20	Committee established and we will work with the
21	council member and the community board and
22	stakeholders in the community to form that
23	Community Advisory Committee and they will work
24	with iSTAR and Coney Island USA in setting up
25	protocols and determining the appropriate uses and
I	

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 48 we envision the way the project site's been 2 3 designed; anything from concerts; community-based concerts; dance recitals; graduations; educational 4 5 events, flea markets. The potential for communityб based use is as expansive as one's imagination would take us. 7 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Okay, I just 8 want to make sure that schools will be able to have 9 10 their graduations there. HOWARD WEISS: And we actually... and I 11 12 believe you will be hearing from the Coney Island Y 13 this morning and we've been engaged with them and 14 working with them to help begin the process of thinking about how we program this, but at the end 15 of the day, it will be totally inclusive in terms 16 of the broad community interest. 17 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Okay and the 18 19 schools to have their graduations. This was very clear. They'll be able to have their 20 21 graduations... 22 HOWARD WEISS: Yes. 23 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: There? Okay. 24 HOWARD WEISS: Yes. 25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 49 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: In addition to 2 3 that, those documents where you said this is in writing, we would like copies of those. Is that 4 5 possible? HOWARD WEISS: Yes, I think the Land 6 Use staff has, but I will review after today's 7 8 proceedings... 9 [crosstalk] 10 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Yeah, if we could just see ... 11 12 [crosstalk] 13 HOWARD WEISS: What you have and make 14 sure that you have everything. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Okay, alright, you could work with... 16 [crosstalk] 17 HOWARD WEISS: Absolutely. 18 19 [crosstalk] COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Our staff, 20 Alonzo, absolutely. Alright, I have no further 21 22 questions. Thank you very much. HOWARD WEISS: Thank you, sir. 23 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: I'd like to call 24 on Council Member Comrie for a question. 25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 50 2 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Alright, you 3 alluded that there were gardeners. How many gardeners that were there and have they all 4 5 transferred? 6 HOWARD WEISS: They all have not 7 transferred and I'm not sure how many individuals 8 really are there. Some who were there have, in fact, laid claim to plots on the West 29th Street 9 10 site, others have not and that's an open process and they've been invited to transfer to that site. 11 And let me just say, we spent a year trying to 12 13 identify appropriate locations because we 14 recognized that although this was not a sanctioned community garden, the gardeners who have been there 15 they've developed a sense of community and it was 16 17 very important to try to find an appropriate site within the community where they could all be 18 relocated together so they could stay together as a 19 20 gardening community. 21 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Mm-hm. HOWARD WEISS: And fortunately, the 22 West 29th Street site was underutilized and it will 23 24 accommodate everyone who's at the former boardwalk garden site and we worked very closely with New 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 51
2	York City Parks Green Thumb to ensure that would
3	happen.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay. Yes,
5	Commissioner.
б	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Mr. Blackmon, make
7	sure to state your name.
8	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BLACKMON: Sure,
9	Larry Scott Blackmon, Deputy Commissioner of Parks.
10	Since 2004, there was no license agreement with
11	anyone at the site because at that time the
12	gardener of record, who was recognized by the city,
13	had agreed to move to a different site under
14	[crosstalk]
15	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Right.
16	[crosstalk]
17	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BLACKMON: A
18	previously agreed upon
19	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Right, I read
20	that. I'm clear that
21	[crosstalk]
22	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BLACKMON: So
23	[crosstalk]
24	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: The people that
25	were there were there without

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 52
2	[crosstalk]
3	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BLACKMON: Park
4	license.
5	[crosstalk]
6	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Without a
7	permit, but they were there.
8	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BLACKMON: Right
9	and so we've been working with them nonetheless.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Right.
11	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BLACKMON: And I
12	would say that we've had several meetings with them
13	and I would say that there were maybe 15 to 20.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: And you said
15	there are other gardens in the area also that
16	[crosstalk]
17	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BLACKMON: Yes.
18	[crosstalk]
19	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: People can
20	utilize?
21	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BLACKMON: Yes.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay, alright.
23	Well, I'm good. I just wanted
24	[crosstalk]
25	
I	I

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 53
2	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BLACKMON: Thank
3	you.
4	[crosstalk]
5	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: To know that
6	they're having an opportunity to utilize a new
7	space.
8	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BLACKMON: We're
9	trying our best.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Alright, thank
11	you.
12	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BLACKMON: Thank
13	you.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Just one other
15	question. You talked about the graduations. Can
16	any school in Brooklyn now utilize the site or will
17	this just be for Coney Island schools?
18	HOWARD WEISS: No, the [laughter]
19	Coney Island schools have priority.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Alright.
21	HOWARD WEISS: It's a Coney Island
22	based facility, but it's there for the borough and
23	it's there for the city, so again, it will be
24	programmed and made available to appropriate
25	
I	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 54
2	community-based uses, whether it's Coney Island or
3	whether it's Kings County.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay and will
5	this be free to them or will there be a
6	[crosstalk]
7	HOWARD WEISS: We'll work we'll have
8	to work that out and the there is going to be
9	during the 10 years of the operation of this
10	facility no city funds used to support it.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay.
12	HOWARD WEISS: So what we expect is
13	that the paid concerts and excess revenues that
14	will be realized through the operation of the
15	Childs building, that will be sufficient to support
16	the maintenance and operation of the facility. To
17	the extent that's possible, then yes, it would be
18	free to the extent that there may be a shortfall,
19	so there may be some minimal costs, but the
20	objective is for it to be free. And let me just
21	say also, with respect to the paid concerts,
22	there's a commitment to provide to community
23	residents a number of subsidized lower rate concert
24	tickets recognizing that we want to optimize the
25	community's use of this facility, not only for the
I	I

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 55 free concerts, but also at the times when there are 2 3 paid concerts. COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: And will you 4 5 also be teaching children music since you're 6 focusing on concerts? Is there a component in there that will be giving people an opportunity to 7 8 enjoy music at some point or learn music or understand music? 9 10 HOWARD WEISS: As part of the program in the facility, Coney Island USA and iSTAR will 11 12 work with community groups, and one of the visions 13 was that the educational aspect of this facility 14 and that it could be used for that purpose, so we will look to work with community-based groups that 15 engage in that sort of activity to provide that 16 kind of opportunities for local children. 17 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Right and the 18 amphitheatre, all of those pieces will be stored 19 within this site and who's... 20 21 [crosstalk] HOWARD WEISS: Yes. 22 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Going... and is 23 24 there going to be a separate entity that will be 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 56
2	doing the lighting and the sound or is that all
3	part of the same entity?
4	HOWARD WEISS: It's all part of
5	Metropolitan Entertainment would oversee that and
6	what happens is acts come in with their lighting
7	and with their equipment and then there'll be
8	permanent lighting that's on the site and that'll
9	all be organized by the concert operator.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: And will there
11	be opportunities for training and teaching for
12	people to be light and sound and stage technicians
13	as well since that's going to be a major component?
14	HOWARD WEISS: We haven't thought about
15	that, but that's an interesting idea, Council
16	Member, and I think it's something that we can
17	seriously consider and discuss with Coney Island
18	USA and the community groups that will be
19	participating in programming the site.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I would
21	strongly suggest that as well and that could go to
22	all Brooklyn residents as well, not just Coney
23	Island residents that may want to learn that since
24	that is a big part of New York now. I would
<u> </u>	

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 57 2 strongly suggest that be added. That's it. Thank 3 you. HOWARD WEISS: Thank you, Council 4 5 Member. 6 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you. 7 Council Member Diana Reyna has some questions. COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: 8 Thank you, Mr. I apologize for coming in late. There's an 9 Chair. 10 opportunity here. I wanted to just commend the work of Council Member Recchia, who for the last 12 11 12 years, we've heard nothing but Coney Island, and 13 especially this particular site where the building 14 is being restored as far as the landmark building is concerned and it's very exciting to see that 15 there is this history; rich history that Brooklyn 16 17 can continue to preserve and see for generations to come and so I wanted to thank you for that vision. 18 19 I've heard and caught up with a lot of what has already been mentioned, but I wanted to confirm I 20 21 didn't hear what would be your procurement policy in relationship to this project for MWBEs and LBEs, 22 the Local Business Enterprise communities, so I 23 24 just wanted to get some elaboration on your policy as a holding company; any provisions in the 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 58
2	contract with EDC that will acknowledge what would
3	be procurement opportunity for the MWBE community
4	and LBE.
5	KARL FREY: I might ask for a little
6	help from someone from EDC who's here because I
7	know I've reviewed the provisions in the contract.
8	I know there is a specific addendum to the contract
9	that requires procurement and although I've gone
10	through it, I am not familiar with the details of
11	it.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Absolutely.
13	EDU
14	[crosstalk]
15	KARL FREY: So
16	[crosstalk]
17	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Is welcome to
18	come and join us.
19	DAVID EISENMAN: Hi. My name's David
20	Eisenman. In the contract between iSTAR and New
21	York City Land Development Corporation there are
22	MWBE provisions. At the closing, iSTAR will submit
23	an MWBE program and anticipates supporting a goal
24	of 15 percent MWBE participation in the
25	construction of the project.
I	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 59
2	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: 15 percent. Why
3	not 20 as per what would be the goal that projects
4	at the minimum have been based on as well as just
5	government procurement overall in the city of New
6	York supporting what would be Local Law 1 to be
7	able to spill over into what would be the private
8	sector? Is there any reason why EDC would have
9	agreed to 15?
10	DAVID EISENMAN: This was the
11	proposal we received from iSTAR and we'd be open to
12	continuing those discussions.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I'd like to see
14	that; those discussions continue as chair of the
15	Small Business Committee and working with our chair
16	or rather our local council member, Council Member
17	Recchia, understanding the background of trying to
18	reach what would be goals procured for MWBEs for
19	opportunity. It's very important that we start
20	recognizing that, especially when there's
21	opportunities when it's city-owned land that is
22	being issued to a private entity, so a minimum of
23	20 percent is what we would seek. As far as this
24	particular application is concerned; correct me if
25	I'm wrong, Chair, all the work that the city
I	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 60
2	council has been gearing towards to see headway
3	within the MWBE community. As far as this
4	particular percentage is there going to be a
5	monitoring agent on the MWBEs?
6	DAVID EISENMAN: Can you elaborate on
7	that?
8	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: A monitoring
9	agent to reach outcomes of the goal.
10	DAVID EISENMAN: EDC monitors all of
11	our MWBE requirements through our Contracts
12	Department.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: So EDC is
14	expected to oversee what would be the monitoring of
15	the 15 percent MWBE on the holding company for
16	{crosstalk]
17	DAVID EISENMAN: Correct.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: For this
19	project?
20	DAVID EISENMAN: Correct.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And the LBE was
22	the second part of the procurement question. Is
23	there any mention of the Local Business Enterprise?
24	
25	

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 1 61 DAVID EISENMAN: Not in our documents. 2 3 I know iSTAR has committed to working with local businesses. 4 5 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Can we see that committed into language within the contract? 6 7 [background static] I'm going to share my mic. DAVID EISENMAN: We can discuss that 8 9 with iSTAR in our internal pane. COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: How soon will 10 that conversation continue? 11 12 DAVID EISENMAN: As soon as possible. 13 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And this vote is 14 scheduled for when? DAVID EISENMAN: Tomorrow. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: So you have less 16 than 24 hours I would say. Correct? 17 DAVID EISENMAN: Correct. 18 19 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Okay. COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: I would just 20 like to... Mr. Chair, could I just say one thing? 21 I would just like... 22 [crosstalk] 23 24 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Yes, Mr. Recchia. 25 [crosstalk]

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 62
2	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: To say that
3	iSTAR has been phenomenal in local hiring. There
4	is no other company out there who has done what
5	iSTAR has done in hiring local, alright, the Suber
6	Foundation is the lead over here and we have Mr.
7	Suber, who'll be testifying shortly, in hiring
8	local. They have done an outstanding job in hiring
9	local and in working in part of the property in
10	getting the new garden ready and they hired the
11	Suber Foundation who have been out there made up of
12	local hiring; Coney Island residents who've been
13	there and so I just want everyone to know that they
14	are keeping their word and they did this before
15	anyone requiring them to do it. So and they've
16	been always there to work with us in hiring local
17	and after Superstorm Sandy iSTAR was out there
18	hiring local and putting people to work, so they've
19	been doing this for years and I you know trust them
20	and know them; that they will you know keep on
21	doing this because it's to their benefit to hire
22	local. Thank you.
23	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Do you have more
24	questions, Council Member Reyna?
25	
I	I

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 63
2	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I just want to
3	make sure that the MWBE and LBE portion is met in
4	the contract and I want to commend the work of
5	iSTAR and obviously Council Member Recchia knows
6	better than anyone the local hiring piece, but that
7	is something that we should not just stop as far as
8	local hiring is concerned and this council has made
9	great strides in making sure that the MWBE
10	community and Local Business Enterprises take part
11	in a lot of the economic development that has
12	happened in the city of New York and I only look
13	forward to iSTAR's continued success because when
14	we have MWBE contracting and LBE contracting, we
15	see greater growth in the job marked and so it's a
16	benefit to our communities and Brooklyn as a whole,
17	which contributes to the economy of our city. So I
18	look forward to hearing from EDC as to their
19	achieving what would be greater goal on the MWBE
20	and I'd imagine that there is concession rights to
21	this project. Is that not true?
22	KARL FREY: The concession rights are a
23	part of the 10-year special permit and the lease
24	and the sublease that iSTAR will be a part of with
25	EDC.
I	I

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 64
2	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Mm-hm. Yes.
3	KARL FREY: There's tremendous risk
4	involved in the project for
5	[crosstalk]
6	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Mm-hm.
7	KARL FREY: For a private investor.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Yes.
9	KARL FREY: The imposition of a
10	regulation that the government can work with at the
11	20 percent level versus a 15 percent level that
12	might be more common in private industry
13	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Mm-hm.
14	KARL FREY: Is a strong ask, but we
15	have 24 hours to work on that and I'm sure we'll be
16	back with you.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I appreciate
18	that and is there any reason would you be able
19	to elaborate on the risk?
20	KARL FREY: Certainly. Over the course
21	of the 10-year special permit, iSTAR is obligated
22	to run and operate the facility and it's specified
23	in the contract what that means at a minimum the 15
24	free summer concerts have to be produced and
25	[crosstalk]

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 65 2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Mm-hm. 3 KARL FREY: Operated as well as operating agreements for the Childs Restaurant 4 5 facility. COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Mm-hm. 6 7 KARL FREY: None of which is guaranteed to produce any revenue so... 8 9 [crosstalk] 10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Right. KARL FREY: So iSTAR is on the hook for 11 12 the costs... 13 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: [interposing] 14 Sure. 15 KARL FREY: Of operating and maintaining the park and the restaurant and the 16 amphitheatre for 10 years. 17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And the project 18 19 is coming with what would be IDA Tax Abatement? KARL FREY: No. 20 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: No... no 21 22 particular programs that are... KARL FREY: As a matter of fact, we 23 were pretty surprised that as city-owned land we'll 24 still be paying taxes. 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 66 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Okay.

1

2

3 HOWARD WEISS: Council Member, if I may I think the genesis of this project is very 4 important for everyone to understand. 5 istar 6 controls property that constitutes a good part of the project site. When they went to the borough 7 president to say it's our intent to develop this 8 with the market rate and affordable housing that 9 was envisioned, but we have concerns because Coney 10 West is desolate and we control 70 percent of the 11 12 developable floor area in the area, but right now 13 we don't see it moving forward, the borough 14 president suggested perhaps you would consider as an interim temporary use the amphitheatre facility 15 16 that could then perhaps spur on economic interest in developing the housing, force the development of 17 the park that was envisioned and also reactivate 18 19 the Childs building.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Mm-hm. 21 HOWARD WEISS: iSTAR agreed to then 22 settle into the city. Along the way in discussions 23 with EDC iSTAR then was asked to stay in the mix 24 and then to work with the community-based not-for-25 profit to develop this project for the city. It's

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 67
2	being developed solely with city capital funds on
3	land entirely owned by the city. This entire
4	project is to be owned by the city and it's simply
5	going to be subleased to this partnership for the
6	10-year special permit term. So the reality is
7	that this is really not a private development by a
8	private developer. This is a private developer who
9	has agreed with the city to aid in the development
10	and operation of this project for 10 years.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And the sublease
12	is for?
13	HOWARD WEISS: A 10-year term.
14	KARL FREY: I think it would be
15	appropriate at this time just to mention as city
16	councilmen and council persons, you should take
17	great pride in the staffs that work for your
18	various organizations. EDC was exceedingly tough
19	on iSTAR throughout these negotiations. This has
20	not been an easy project to get to the goal line.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Mm-hm.
22	KARL FREY: And we have been asked to
23	and agreed to do extraordinary things as a private
24	developer that we would normally not undertake. If
25	you if the question pops in your mind then why
I	l

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 68
2	would you do this, we do have an additional site
3	that's slated for residential development and we
4	see no reason for any market or affordable housing
5	to be built on Coney Island. There's no economic
6	reason to do that absent the amphitheatre project,
7	so there was a great deal of give and take and hard
8	fought negotiations on both sides to bring this
9	project to where it is, and we see this project as
10	the catalyst that allows us to make further
11	investments in Coney Island and develop our
12	residential project, which is now bookended on one
13	end by the amphitheatre and on the other end by the
14	newly renovated New York Aquarium.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Mm-hm. Well, I
16	look forward to monitoring this project beyond what
17	would be today's and tomorrow's meeting. I just
18	want to make sure that we get to a point of making
19	sure that the city as a whole is investing in

want to make sure that we get to a point of making sure that the city as a whole is investing in partners that will commit to the work that we have... the foundation that we have laid as far as economic development spurring throughout all five boroughs and this particular project has been in the pipeline for quite some time. To see it come to fruition is of most interest, but that doesn't

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 1 69 2 mean that we can't do better and consistently 3 challenge ourselves to do better. So thank you very much. 4 5 KARL FREY: Thank you and we respect б your advocacy. 7 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay well, 8 gentlemen, thank you very much. We are going to move onto our panels in opposition to start and 9 10 then in favor until everyone is heard. Yes, there 11 are. So we're going to call up four people in 12 opposition. I remind you that we're going to put 13 the clock on for two minutes for each person. Ι'd 14 like to call up Charles Krezell; Suzanne Frazier; Carolyn McCrory and Ann Valdez. Are all four of 15 you here? 16 [Pause] 17 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: While we're 18 19 setting up, we are going to call on Council Members Reyna and Lappin to vote on the two sidewalk cafes 20 that we heard earlier today that are in full 21 22 agreement with the council members. COMMITTEE CLERK: Land Use Items 987 23 24 and 1002. Council Member Reyna. 25 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I vote aye.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 70
2	COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member
3	Lappin.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Aye.
5	COMMITTEE CLERK: Vote now stands eight
6	in the affirmative, zero abstentions, zero
7	negatives.
8	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you. Okay,
9	ladies and gentleman, if you could just remember
10	when you speak to please state your name and you
11	can decide who wants to go first and again, we'll
12	have a two minute clock and it makes a really
13	annoying noise when it's done, just to warn you.
14	So who wants to go first? Gentleman first.
15	CHARLES KREZELL: Hi. My name is
16	Charles Krezell. I'm with Loisaida United
17	Neighborhood Gardens, "LUNGS." We're a group of 40
18	gardens on the Lower East Side. Last year can
19	my time can my time stop?
20	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: I think it already
21	started. [background voices] Yeah, let's change
22	mics. We'll restart the clock. We'll do a do-
23	over.
24	CHARLES KREZELL: Thank you. Hey,
25	hello, hello?
I	I

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 71
2	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Yeah, okay, speak
3	up and we should be starting now. Okay, go ahead.
4	CHARLES KREZELL: Okay, my name is
5	Charles Krezell. I'm with the Loisiada United
6	Neighborhood Gardens. We represent 40 gardens on
7	the Lower East Side. Last year, we had a call out
8	from Coney Island. The garden had been flooded
9	during Hurricane Sandy. There were three feet of
10	sand there. People from my neighborhood and around
11	the city went out and helped them remove the sand.
12	There were 50 gardeners that were working in the
13	garden. It's still an active garden and I've been
14	out there four times in the last year. It's a
15	community of immigrants, but it's very much an
16	active garden. It may have been decommissioned as
17	far as Green Thumb is concerned, but it's been
18	active ever since and has never shut down and the
19	people that I have talked to are not happy at all
20	about going out there. The thing is, you guys are
21	building a sand castle. This is on sand. This is
22	a flood zone. This is not a place that you should
23	be putting city money into building this is
24	it's not right. This is you're going to have
25	to Sandy flooded the entire area and you're
I	I

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 72
2	building right on the boardwalk, so I don't see how
3	the city can justify putting public money into
4	something like that. I don't think the it just
5	doesn't make any sense; it's a flood zone. So
6	that's basically what my take on it. Thank you.
7	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Mr.
8	Krezell and thank you for your help on the garden.
9	Okay, ma'am. Whenever you're ready.
10	[crosstalk]
11	SUSAN FRAZIER: My name okay, my
12	name is Susan Frazier and I'm with Green Acres
13	Community Garden in Bed-Stuy, and I've come to
14	voice my opposition to the Coney Island
15	Amphitheatre. The boardwalk garden is a large
16	space, like ours is. Ours is in Bed-Stuy, they're
17	in Coney Island and these spaces were considered
18	virtually worthless 10 or 15 years ago and during
19	the intervening years, these gardens have
20	exemplified the devotion of caring volunteers, who
21	faithfully tended this land due through the crack
22	epidemic; the real estate crash; the homicide
23	epidemic. These volunteers demonstrated that
24	people in these communities care about their
25	neighborhoods; they care about beautiful things;
I	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 73
2	they care about environmentalism. Now these green
3	spaces are threatened by the very prosperity that
4	they helped to prosper. We can't let big money
5	interests one by one take the city's remaining
6	green spaces away and turn them into fancy real
7	estate projects. If we do, all the caring; all the
8	history; all the culture; all the beauty; all the
9	health benefits; all the environmental benefits
10	that these community gardens bring to the city will
11	be gone for good. Our city will be more flood-
12	prone and these waters that come in with the
13	hurricanes will just stand and continue to wreak
14	their devastation while it is the soul of the city
15	that will drain away. Thank you.
16	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay, thank you.
17	Next, please.
18	CAROLYN MCCRORY: Hello. Hi,
19	everybody. I'm wondering if I can change the slide
20	to the map and just show something with my pointer.
21	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Would you mind
22	doing that for us? Why don't we hold off the clock
23	for a second? What the heck. That's what you
24	wanted? This is what you want? Okay. Oh, wow,
25	nice. [background voice] Are you going to swallow

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 74
 that after like swallowing the sword... [laughter]
 and okay.

CAROLYN MCCRORY: Actually I just 4 5 wanted to show my cat toy, but I'm a garden member. I'm also a member of the Coney Island Amusement 6 Family. My name's Carolyn McCrory. I've marched 7 in and love Coney Island USA; marched in that 8 parade since probably 1987 on and off. One year, I 9 10 won Judge's Choice. I gave a lot of bribes that 11 year. Anyway... that's a part of the parade for 12 people that don't know. Anyway, I just want to 13 make a couple factual points about the Coney Island 14 community in general and also the community gardens in Coney Island and maybe a little bit about the 15 Amusement area as well. First of all, my 16 testimony; my written testimony for the City 17 Planning Commission, for some reason, is not in the 18 FEIS, so I do have copies of that. I don't know 19 20 why it was excluded. My comments were accepted. 21 They were call distributing. In fact, the lawyer very eloquently addressed a couple of my points 22 that I made in my written testimony, which were 23 24 alternates to this plan because I feel like this plan has a lot of heart. It has a lot of great 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 75
2	elements, but the plan could be made way, way
3	better and there's this push, this rush; it's okay,
4	this is how the city does things. Maybe it's
5	imperfect; maybe it's flawed, but we have to get it
6	in. We have to get that money, but I do believe
7	that there can be a dedication for that \$51 million
8	capital funds committed to this project, but also a
9	commitment to make the plan better because I do
10	believe it could be made better. I feel like the
11	garden site on the boardwalk is an absolute
12	treasure. It's maybe not being used completely to
13	its full potential, but for some reason City
14	Planning and developers do not look at a community
15	garden and say, "Oh my God, we have to work around
16	this! It's so amazing! This land belongs to the
17	people; this land belongs to the people." And I
18	feel like continually that's pushed aside and oh,
19	we'll relocate them. Well, five blocks maybe
20	it's only five blocks and a half away, [chime] but
21	that five and a half blocks is a world of dreams.
22	It's not on the boardwalk. It's in a different
23	part. We've created a safe zone right now and to
24	move us to a piece of HPD land, which is
25	unprotected; which has been discussed being a
I	

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 76 2 school over the years. HPD is not... this piece of 3 land was a relocation site and 12 different gardens in Coney Island have already been destroyed. 4 It 5 was supposed to be permanent, it was part of the Parks Department and if it's so easy to just be б well, you were permanent, but actually we want to 7 8 use the land, then what's even the point of saying 9 that a garden is permanent? I'm just asking for 10 the city and developers to open their mind a little 11 and see the potential of our garden there and also 12 community gardens in general. And I love Coney 13 Island. Yesterday, I went to the library. I tried 14 to swim at the new Y. Apparently the pool is opening today. I love the Amusement area; I work 15 16 in the Amusement area. I totally want what's best 17 for Coney Island and I just think if we put the brakes on this a little bit and get more people at 18 the table; at the real table where the decisions 19 20 are being made ... there should be a community 21 benefits agreement on paper in writing that the community... beforehand that the community feels 22 good about and the developer and the city all feel 23 24 good about, I think it's a possibility and I don't

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 77
2	see that there's any reason why this can't happen,
3	even if it has to happen quickly. Thank you.
4	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay, I was
5	waiting for you to take a breath just to stop
6	[crosstalk]
7	CAROLYN MCCRORY: Okay.
8	[crosstalk]
9	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: You, but I finally
10	got one. So I appreciate you bringing the issue
11	about your comments to FEIS. Do you have a copy of
12	those with you?
13	CAROLYN MCCRORY: I have two copies on
14	my iPad that are
15	[crosstalk]
16	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: okay.
17	[crosstalk]
18	CAROLYN MCCRORY: Somehow linked, but I
19	can forward those to you.
20	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Yeah, if you can
21	get them to us, and someone will give her the
22	information on how to get them to us, and we will
23	raise it with City Planning and find out exactly
24	what happened and
25	[crosstalk]
I	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 78
2	CAROLYN MCCRORY: Yeah, I
3	[crosstalk]
4	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Make sure they're
5	aware of them.
6	CAROLYN MCCRORY: I also want to say as
7	far as that goes, one of the things I mentioned was
8	alternatives the lawyer did address. That's the
9	first time I ever heard that. You know, iSTAR, God
10	bless them, I think that they're a great company.
11	They own the parcel on the other side of the Childs
12	building as well, and also I do believe that
13	something could be worked out with the ballpark.
14	They said I'm not really sure if there were ever
15	those discussions, but I feel like there is
16	potential there to put sink some money into that
17	ball stadium and make it accessible and a permanent
18	amphitheatre, not just one for 10 years because
19	Coney Island; the Coney Island community deserves a
20	permanent amphitheatre, not one for just 10 years.
21	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Got it. Alright,
22	thank you very much. The last member of the panel,
23	please. Careful. Yeah, don't grab it by the mic.
24	ANN VALDEZ: Good morning, everyone.
25	My name is Ann Michelle Valdez. I am born and
I	I

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 79
2	raised in Coney Island. When all these different
3	things are being discussed, it's really difficult
4	to I didn't write anything down ahead of time
5	and when I speak, I speak directly from my heart.
6	I don't need to have a piece of paper to tell me
7	what I should be saying. A lot of different things
8	have been mentioned. We talked about like for
9	instance, the hiring process. Yes, Mr. Keith Suber
10	was mentioned several times. I know Mr. Keith
11	Suber personally; we were raised together, but Mr.
12	Keith Suber will not be the only person employing
13	people and he works in a position his area is
14	more in the construction decisions. Okay, I'm not
15	planning to be a construction worker, so when we
16	talk about what the wages are going to be, words
17	are used, but not figures, okay? We all have
18	I'm also with Community Voices Heard as well as the
19	People's Coalition of Coney Island, as well as many
20	other organizations. I have spent my life fighting
21	for justice. Anywhere I need to go, I speak. My
22	issue here is that I think there's too many issues
23	coming up that haven't been answered. Okay, it was
24	brought up about where they're going to place it
25	and we don't believe that this is a good location
I	1

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 1 80 and the... for instance, the back-up of sewage; the 2 3 draining process has always been a problem in Coney It is still a problem in Coney Island. Island. 4 Ι 5 cannot see why so much money would go into 6 rebuilding this area and building this amphitheatre knowing that yes, it is a flood zone and there's 7 8 constant sewage problems. I appreciate our City Councilman Domenic Recchia trying to do his hardest 9 10 to get things moving, [chime] but I don't believe that this is really beneficial to the community and 11 12 the community didn't really have a say in it. It 13 was never actually discussed in full and I believe 14 there's too many unanswered questions [background voice] for this project to move forward and no 15 questions asked. 16 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay, thank you, 17 Miss Valdez. Council Member Recchia has a question 18 or a comment. 19 20 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: No, no, not a 21 question. I'd like to comment about the sewer issue. Okay, in the rezoning of Coney Island, 22 alright, there is an agreement between... in the 23 agreements that \$300 million will be spent to 24

upgrade the sewers in Coney Island. The first

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 81
2	phase, there's \$135 million in the budget for the
3	sewer to be upgraded; for all the infrastructure to
4	start. It's in the planning stages now, but I
5	believe the contract is going out to bid and the
6	project is supposed to start the end of sometime
7	during 2015, so the money is the sewer problem
8	is being addressed and it's addressed in the
9	rezoning and there's \$135 million in the budget
10	right now, okay, and as we go ahead, they will have
11	a better idea of how much more it's going to cost
12	and the city has agreed to put that money in, so
13	the sewers will be addressed, so just so the Coney
14	Island community knows that.
15	ANN VALDEZ: When was this agreement
16	made?
17	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: When the
18	rezoning of Coney Island.
19	ANN VALDEZ: 2004?
20	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Yes.
21	ANN VALDEZ: That's almost 10 years
22	ago.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: No, no, it
24	was but when we passed it and I believe we
25	passed it in 2008 nine 2009 it was passed at
I	I

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 82
2	that time. At that time the city put in \$135
3	million, the money is still there and the money
4	will stay there and the project is going to begin
5	and the DEP had to do a major plan that is being
6	[crosstalk]
7	ANN VALDEZ: And it took them to make
8	that plan?
9	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Yes, the
10	sewer
11	[crosstalk]
12	ANN VALDEZ: Because the sewer's been a
13	problem for many years.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: I know. It's
15	been very well
16	[crosstalk]
17	ANN VALDEZ: And I don't think it
18	should be everything everyone to be rushing now
19	to get everything to look pretty for the
20	amphitheatre. I believe that the residents of
21	Coney Island have been left out and not cared for
22	for too many years. We've had a sewer problem. I
23	have raised three children, alright? Two of my
24	children are adults. I have grandchildren. This
25	is ridiculous. I have taken my son to school in PS
I	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 83
2	188, which is one of your favorite schools there,
3	and I have taken my children to school in water
4	that was knee-high. I had to pick them up from
5	school at that time. So with the sewer problem and
6	now we had Hurricane Sandy, all that sewage backed
7	up. All the ocean water; the bay water all backed
8	up. It was horrible, the smell. God knows how
9	toxic the water is; how toxic the land is. I don't
10	think that waiting four years we should sit here
11	and pat anyone on the back for making an effort.
12	An effort should've been made years ago. This is
13	all being done to push through this amphitheatre,
14	which once again, I say is being a rushed job and
15	not enough questions are being answered ahead of
16	time to make sure everything and everyone is going
17	to be taken care of.
18	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Miss
19	Valdez.
20	ANN VALDEZ: Thank you.
21	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: We appreciate it.
22	Thank you very much, panel. I'd now like to call
23	up a panel in favor. Again, we're going to limit
24	people to two minutes. Martin Levine, Dick Zigun,
25	Johanna Zaki and Keith Suber. I am going to step

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 84
2	out for a minute. Council Member Comrie, the chair
3	of the Land Use Committee, is going to supervise
4	and chair for a minute. I just have to address one
5	issue, so I'll be back.
6	[Pause]
7	MARTIN LEVINE: Okay, thank you. Thank
8	you, council members. I support the proposal as
9	passed by the Martin Levine is my name. I'm a
10	member of Community Board 13 and Land Use Committee
11	Chairman of Community Board 13 from '96 to 2000,
12	and I spent 10 years as the Director of Coney
13	Island Development Corporation. I support the
14	proposal as passed by the Community Board 13 joint
15	Economic Development Land Use Committees with the
16	following comments: due to the hard work of the
17	Friends of Terra Cotta and other community groups
18	in February 2003, the Childs building on the
19	Rigelmann Boardwalk and West 21st Street was
20	declared a landmark. The landmarking, although a
21	public relations high point, is a community and
22	development nightmare. The hazardous materials on
23	the site preclude the use of the building by
24	residents or groups for amusement or entertainment
25	of any sort. We have that in Addendum A. The
l	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 85
2	stringent landmarking requirements, under which
3	construction and remediation would take place, make
4	the rehabilitation of the building unaffordable.
5	That's why Taconic Investment Partners could not
6	pursue its modernization. That's why New York City
7	had to step in to transfer ownership. The building
8	continues to lie empty decades after it has gone
9	out of use. The exterior may be pleasing to the
10	eye, but the building itself poses an environmental
11	hazard, what with the interior rotting, decaying
12	and filled with the hazardous substances such as
13	asbestos containing material, PCBs and fuel oil
14	residue. Damage from Hurricane Sandy leaves in
15	question whether or not mold abatement was or may
16	have successfully been performed on a vacant
17	building, and even though boarded up, how long will
18	it take to become a refuge for the homeless, for
19	drug use and a haven for those who have no desire
20	to see a revitalization in the West End of Coney
21	Island? One of the mandates of the redevelopment
22	plan for Coney West is to stimulate increased use
23	of that area on a 12-month a year basis. This is
24	beneficial to not only encourage growth in the
25	local economy, but to reduce crime. The perfect
, I	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 86
2	example of this is the eastern end of the
3	Riegelmann Boardwalk where restaurants and
4	pedestrians traffic [chime] flourish and where a
5	12-month a year sustainable economy local well
6	okay, if you want me to stop, I'll stop, but
7	anyway
8	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: [interposing]
9	I'm sorry.
10	MARTIN LEVINE: The bottom line is that
11	one of the major problems is the you know, the
12	Childs building that has to be remediated and it
13	will be remediated as part of the amphitheatre plan
14	and the other two points I had, which were in the
15	addendum, were addressing the community gardens
16	issue and the community benefits agreement.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you.
18	MARTIN LEVINE: Okay.
19	DICK ZIGUN: I'm Dick Zigun, founder
20	and Artistic Director of Coney Island USA. We are
21	the not-for-profit in the joint venture with iSTAR
22	for this wonderful project. I've personally been
23	invested in this site for over a decade. It was
24	Coney Island USA with Friends of Terra Cotta that
25	got the landmark status for Childs Restaurant at a

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 87
2	time when 21st Street was basically a location for
3	crime, drug use and prostitution solicitation. The
4	adjacent property I helped advocate to bring the
5	circus in for Marty Markowitz to do his concerts
6	there in an unimproved lot, which to this day has
7	broken sidewalks. We are building a park where
8	there were only empty lots and buses. We are
9	taking a landmark building, the best quality
10	building in Coney Island, revitalizing it and
11	restoring it. We are bringing jobs and I would
12	like to point out that when the rezoning happened
13	several years back, I wasn't happy, but thanks to
14	hard working politicians, Domenic Recchia and Marty
15	Markowitz, who, even when the rezoning was done,
16	listened to dissent from people like me in their
17	community and fixed the plan and made the plan
18	better. To the opposition, I want to point out
19	that unity is a two-way street. If you destroy
20	this project you don't get \$53 million to do other
21	things in Coney Island. We are in this together.
22	Please support us; we will support you. Of course
23	your concerns are legitimate that Coney Island the
24	West End has gotten a rotten deal, but learn the
25	political process. Form alliances with the
l	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 88
2	amusement park. Don't be a hater of our project
3	solving our decades long problems when you want us
4	[chime] involved working with you in the future,
5	which we are anxious to do. Thank you.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you. The
7	next person.
8	JOHANNA ZAKI: Good morning. My name
9	is Johanna Zaki. I'm the Director of Operations
10	for the Alliance for Coney Island and I'm speaking
11	on behalf of the Alliance here today. The Alliance
12	for Coney Island is dedicated to the continuing
13	transformation of Coney Island into a year-round
14	world-class recreational oceanfront destination.
15	Our founding members represent Coney Island's major
16	business and non-profit stakeholders, whose
17	institutions collectively have over 330 years of
18	history in Coney Island. The Alliance brings
19	together local businesses, community organizations
20	and residents to work together on initiatives that
21	foster further development, promote increased
22	visitorship and support Coney Island's vibrant,
23	substantial community of over 50,000 residents.
24	The Alliance for Coney Island is in favor of the
25	proposed Seaside Park and Community Arts Center.
I	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 89
2	As outlined, the project complements the Alliance's
3	work and mission by accomplishing multiple
4	objectives. Advancing Coney Island's upward moving
5	progress, as outlined by the published rezoning
6	plank, provides increased programming opportunities
7	for the area, including free entertainment options
8	for the benefit of local residents, attracts new
9	audiences and draws increased vistorship year-
10	round. It stimulates economic activity with an
11	increased demand for goods and services that
12	support other businesses and generate new business
13	opportunities and support local workforce
14	development by making new job placement
15	opportunities available for local residents. Thank
16	you.
17	KEITH SUBER: Good morning, everyone.
18	My name is you guys should know. I want to
19	thank Ann Valdez for giving me that great
20	introduction. My name is Keith Suber. I'm the
21	Executive Director of the Suber Foundation in Coney
22	Island, Brooklyn, and I'm also a principal with a
23	construction company called 911 Homesavers, and
24	iSTAR has been working extremely closely with us to
25	make sure that people from the community are hired.
I	I

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 90 2 I know for sure that councilmen along with other 3 elected officials gave us funding to make sure that people had their OSHA cards, scaffolding training, 4 5 flagging and we wanted to make sure that those 6 certificated go to work. I wasn't expecting for my name to be called that much, but you know, I really 7 appreciate it and I just want to let my fellow 8 9 community people know; other organizations, that I 10 don't want to be looked at as the lead person on 11 this project in helping this project move forward, 12 but the thing is that there has been opportunity 13 granted through this. We all know certain 14 individuals that represent iSTAR came out and met with us, and the purpose of that meeting was for us 15 to forward our concerns in writing, so this way we 16 17 can have a voice. The opportunity is there, but what we have to do is put it in writing and demand 18 what you want. I'm not in the position because I 19 20 have my lips puffed up. I'm in the position because 21 I got on the phone every morning; I beat Domenic Recchia's phone up; I beat iSTAR's phone up and I 22 spoke up about jobs in other communities and that's 23 24 what I do and I heard Karen behind me say, "That's true," `cause I call her all the time as well. 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 91
2	[laughter] Okay, so it's definitely not about what
3	the Suber Foundation is doing alone. It's just
4	that I'm taking the initiative to be persistent
5	because persistence overcomes resistance and if
6	that \$51 or \$53 million is not used for that
7	proposed project, it's not guaranteed [chime] to go
8	back into that project I mean to go back into
9	the infrastructure work, so we might just lose that
10	capital in all and if iSTAR pulls out, then that
11	property will be dormant for the next 10 years and
12	is that what we really want for our community?
13	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you.
14	Thank you for coming down and testifying today and
15	also for your participation and community service
16	in the Coney Island area. Our next panel is Ray
17	Figueroa, President of New York City Community
18	
-	Garden Coalition and Sheila Smalls from CI People's
19	Garden Coalition and Sheila Smalls from CI People's Coalition. Is anyone else here that wanted to
19	Coalition. Is anyone else here that wanted to
19 20	Coalition. Is anyone else here that wanted to testify either in opposition or for? [background
19 20 21	Coalition. Is anyone else here that wanted to testify either in opposition or for? [background voice] Somebody else might've come in. I'm just
19 20 21 22	Coalition. Is anyone else here that wanted to testify either in opposition or for? [background voice] Somebody else might've come in. I'm just asking. Can I ask a question? Thank you. Is
19 20 21 22 23	Coalition. Is anyone else here that wanted to testify either in opposition or for? [background voice] Somebody else might've come in. I'm just asking. Can I ask a question? Thank you. Is there anybody else that wanted to [background

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 92
2	just checking if anybody else didn't sign up,
3	right, in opposition. Okay, Miss Smalls, can you
4	use that far mic over there, not the other one.
5	Yes. Thank you. You can put that on the floor so
6	they don't use it anymore. Thank you.
7	SHEILA SMALLS: `Kay.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Yes, whenever
9	you're ready.
10	SHEILA SMALLS: Okay, good good
11	after well, I don't know if it's afternoon or
12	morning. What time is it? Well, whatever. good
13	morning, Council, everyone here. My name is Sheila
14	Smalls. I am the Executive Director of CI Youth
15	Alive. I am also on the Black National Network.
16	I'm an outstanding member and also a member of the
17	People's Coalition of Coney Island. I am here to
18	say that I'm really not really opposed, but that's
19	the only thing that they give you `cause you're
20	either for it or you're against it. The way it is
21	right now, I'm against it. Okay, I'm not a hater,
22	okay, but the point is first of all, they did not
23	meet with the community as a whole to say, "Well,
24	is this what you want?" I went door-to-door to
25	2007, which is directly across the street from the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 93 proposed amphitheatre, and knocked on doors; talked 2 3 to people in English, in Spanish; broken, of course, and asked them did they know about this 4 5 monstrosity that they was going to put there and were they in favor of it or did they want it or did 6 they not want it. A lot of people are not even 7 8 aware of it, so I'd say that they really... the community really needs to be involved. 9 If you want 10 to do something involve the community. We have input; we have feelings. You can't walk in 11 12 somebody's house and just say, "Here, take this." 13 No, that's not the way it's done. It's not the way 14 it's done. And you talk about we can work together. Well, sure, let's sit down. Let's make 15 a talk. The iSTAR people asked us to come and 16 17 speak with them; the Coalition came and spoke with them and what they did was go back to the next 18 council meeting and say, "Yeah, we met with the 19 20 people, but nothing was... you know, nothing was 21 ever settled. We just had a talk and that was it." Okay, so there should be some community-based 22 agreement. There should be you know, a lot of 23 conversation before this is rushed through because 24 it is a good idea and perhaps it will help a lot of 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 94
2	people. Okay, Dick Zigun, nobody on the West End
3	knows who you are. I know who you are because I go
4	down to the amusements, so to say that you're the
5	Mayor of Coney Island, that's something that I
6	guess the borough president just thought of because
7	there are CBOs in Coney Island that could have
8	surely wanted to be on that process to be picked to
9	see if they could work along with iSTAR. They did
10	not even consult the other CBOs. Okay, so being a
11	person from Coney Island, born and raised out
12	there Karen, I love you, but guess what? All of
13	ya'll owe Domenic something. I don't owe him
14	anything. Okay, I don't owe him anything. Okay,
15	you work for him and everybody that's coming to
16	[crosstalk]
17	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: You're
18	[crosstalk]
19	SHEILA SMALLS: Talk owes him
20	something.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: You're over two
22	minutes.
23	SHEILA SMALLS: Oh, I'm sorry.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: That's okay.
25	SHEILA SMALLS: Okay.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 95 2 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you. 3 SHEILA SMALLS: Alright. COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thanks for 4 5 coming in. 6 SHEILA SMALLS: Thank you. 7 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Mm-hm. SHEILA SMALLS: Okay, so we just need 8 to have a conversation. 9 10 RAYMOND FIGUEROA: Yes... [crosstalk] 11 12 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Go ahead. 13 RAYMOND FIGUEROA: Thank you for this 14 opportunity. My name is Raymond Figueroa, Jr. I 15 am President of the New York City Community Garden Coalition and I just want to thank the 16 distinguished, honorable members of this 17 subcommittee for this opportunity. I'm just going 18 19 to cut to it because of the time. The Final 20 Environmental Impact Statement that ran through in 21 conjunction with the ULURP process is extremely 22 flawed. The Final Environmental Impact based improperly cited Section 6E3 of the 2002 Garden 23 Agreement between the State of New York and the 24 City of New York, according to that Final 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 96
2	Environmental Impact Statement, the Boardwalk
3	Community Garden, located on Block 771, Lot 142,
4	was decommissioned by the city in 2004. The FEIS
5	claimed that the city followed a process for
6	decommissioning gardens that was authorized under
7	that Section 6E3 of the 2002 agreement between the
8	City and the State of New York Attorney General's
9	Office, but the Final Environmental Impact
10	Statement overlooked a key piece of information.
11	The 2002 agreement created two lists of community
12	gardens: 1. Gardens that were owned under the
13	jurisdiction of Parks were listed as Parks Open
14	Space. 2. Second list, gardens that were under the
15	jurisdiction of various city agencies and were
16	listed under the title Subject to Development.
17	Boardwalk Garden was under Parks Open Space Parks
18	Department, as part of Parks Open Space list. We
19	will submit a copy of this list. It will be
20	forthcoming, which we obtained from the city, as
21	per that agreement. The Section E3 only applies to
22	gardens that were Subject to Development list, so
23	the city was never authorized to use Section E3 of
24	the 2002 agreement to decommission the Boardwalk
25	Community Garden. Several part of that FEIS were
I	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 97
2	based on the assumption that the Boardwalk
3	Community Garden was properly decommissioned using
4	that section process. [chime] As such, it is
5	necessary according to relevant governing rules and
6	regulations to prepare the new Environmental
7	Impact, which accounts for the fact that the garden
8	was not properly decommissioned. Furthermore, the
9	garden is not park land, and as such, it is subject
10	to public trust park land procedures for park land
11	alienation and there are three things, and I'll
12	just finish. This map represents the city's clear,
13	unequivocal manifestation of attempt to dedicate
14	this particular garden as park land. This park
15	land has been accepted for park land purposes and
16	this park land has been used park land purposes as
17	a community garden. Therefore, taken together,
18	this is an irrevocable dedication of Boardwalk
19	Community Garden as park land and it represents an
20	erroneous attempt on the city's part to
21	decommission this community
22	[crosstalk]
23	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you.
24	[crosstalk]
25	RAYMOND FIGUEROA: Garden and it's
I	

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 98
2	[crosstalk]
3	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you.
4	RAYMOND FIGUEROA: Completely without a
5	legal basis.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay, we have
7	your
8	[crosstalk]
9	RAYMOND FIGUEROA: Thank you.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: We have your
11	entire testimony and
12	[crosstalk]
13	RAYMOND FIGUEROA: Yes.
14	[crosstalk]
15	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: We can take a
16	look at it. Thank you for coming
17	[crosstalk]
18	RAYMOND FIGUEROA: Thank you very much.
19	[crosstalk]
20	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Down and
21	testifying. Thank you. We have the next panel:
22	Anthony Butler from St. John's Bread and Life;
23	Wycliffe Wilkinson from Futures in Education;
24	Nicole Robinson from the New York Aquarium and
25	Eddie Mark from Community Board 13.
I	

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 99 ANTHONY BUTLER: 'Kay, want me to go ahead?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Yes, whenever5 you're ready.

1

2

3

ANTHONY BUTLER: Well, good afternoon. 6 7 I'm Anthony Butler from St. John's Bread and Life. St. John's Bread and Life is the largest emergency 8 food provider in Brooklyn, providing over a million 9 10 meals; emergency meals to folks last year through 11 our soup kitchen, our food pantry and our mobile 12 soup kitchen. One of our outreaches is that we 13 provided over 120,000 meals to the Coney Island 14 community, and I'm here speaking in support of this because the hunger problem in New York City, where 15 one in five New Yorkers uses emergency food, is not 16 a problem of food access. It's a problem of 17 poverty. And with the caveat that this development 18 hires folks, brings prevailing wage jobs to the 19 20 community, provides this cash coming in; this \$52 21 million coming into the community, that's how 22 hunger is addressed. And as it works towards that, I support that project. I also support it on its 23 24 other kind of venue is that it's supporting the non-profit and the community-based groups, 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 100
2	primarily through Coney Island USA, but other
3	groups because those kinds of resources are very
4	necessary for the non-profit community. I'm
5	usually here asking for money from the City
6	Council, who are generous, but still, all my
7	government funding is only seven percent of my
8	entire budget. I have to raise \$4 million a year
9	to feed hungry New Yorkers and that comes from the
10	community. It comes from the business community
11	and it comes from investors. It comes from
12	fundraisers and all of that. So I support this
13	project on both levels that it provides prevailing
14	wage jobs and good jobs and investment in the
15	community to address the issues of poverty and that
16	it partner with the community to provide
17	opportunities. Thank you.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you for
19	being succinct. Next person?
20	WYCLIFFE WILKINSON: Good afternoon,
21	committee members and thanks for the opportunity to
22	speak. My name is Wycliffe Wilkinson and I am the
23	Associate Director of Development for Futures in
24	Education. We are a non-profit foundation, which
25	provides needs-based tuition assistance
I	

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 101 scholarships to families making less than \$28,000 a 2 year and last year, our foundation provided \$7 3 million in aid to families seeking a grammar school 4 5 education of their choice in Brooklyn and Queens in the best interests of their children. We believe 6 that the only way to truly combat poverty is 7 through education with results, and each year among 8 the many events that we hold to reach our goal is 9 10 through the Great Irish Fair, which is held at Coney Island. Currently, the proceeds from the 11 12 Great Irish Fair help Coney Island directly affect 13 and assist families in providing their children 14 with the education that they need and there is no venue for the fair. The Great Irish Fair in Coney 15 Island, because there's no venue, we must pay for 16 stages, restrooms and other essentials to operate 17 the event safely. This takes money out of the 18 pockets of the needy families that we serve and 19 20 with the construction of the amphitheatre, we will be able to have a venue for the Great Irish Fair 21 and lower our costs and allow us to get closer to 22 our \$11 million goal, of which we currently fall 23 short of. The building of this amphitheatre will 24 be beneficial to our families making less than the 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 102
 \$28,000 a year and provide a real chance for those
 children looking to break the cycle of poverty.
 Thank you.

NICOLE ROBINSON-ETIENNE: 5 Good 6 afternoon. My name is Nicole Robinson-Etienne. Ι am the Assistant Director of Government and 7 8 Community Affairs for the New York Aquarium. I am 9 here today to express support for the Seaside Park 10 and Community Arts Center. The project, as you've already heard, includes the construction of the 11 12 amphitheatre and a public park. It will further 13 the goals of Coney Island being a year-round world-14 class recreational oceanfront destination. This proposal, of course, will enliven the western end 15 of the Coney Island Boardwalk and create new 16 17 facilities for passive and active recreation, outdoor and indoor entertainment, dining and 18 catering and employment opportunities for Coney 19 Island residents. In addition, the project will 20 21 finally restore the historic Childs Restaurant building, giving new life to a beautiful, but 22 neglected landmark, becoming an active venue for 23 24 catered events and year-round indoor entertainment. Just as the aquarium provides a year-round anchor 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 103
2	to Coney Island community on the eastern end of the
3	amusement district, this project will do the same
4	to the western end. The Seaside Park and Community
5	Arts Center will become an economic catalyst for
6	the community by diversifying and expanding
7	permanent employment opportunities to neighborhood
8	residents, providing public amenities to residents
9	and tourists and spur the city's investment into
10	addressing the community's infrastructure needs.
11	The amphitheatre is a critical part of the
12	continued health of Coney Island and further
13	bolsters Brooklyn's reputation as a cultural hot
14	spot for New York City. Thank you very much.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you.
16	EDDIE MARK: Good morning, council
17	members, community members and guests. My name is
18	Eddie Mark and I am the Chairman of the Community
19	Board 13. I am in support of this project for our
20	neighborhood. As we see the big picture; that
21	there have been things happening in Coney Island.
22	We have new attractions, from the baseball stadium
23	to the Luna Park to the B&B Carousell and the
24	Parachute Jump. This is only going to add to the
25	neighborhood. We had the YMCA that opened two
I	I

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 104
2	weeks ago and we were very, very happy with what
3	Domenic has done with Marty and it's a big plus to
4	the area. Since the zoning, a lot has changed. We
5	have done Alliance for Coney Island, which has
6	helped with the job training with the amusement and
7	the people in the neighborhood to get permanent
8	jobs and to work with job fairs. We also see that
9	this can work as a year-round destination by having
10	this theatre here. Our board and the subcommittee
11	has voted 10 to one for this project. The full
12	committee did not the General Board did not vote
13	for it, due to some of the outcries in the
14	community seats, but we do support this, as myself
15	for the community at large. Thank you.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you all
17	for coming. Now just a question. You said Irish
18	Festival?
19	WYCLIFFE WILKINSON: The Great Irish
20	Fair, yes.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: The Great Irish
22	Fair.
23	WYCLIFFE WILKINSON: Yes, sir.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay and you
25	have an Irish derivative?

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 105 2 WYCLIFFE WILKINSON: Myself? Yeah, I'm... [laughter] luckily... actually especially at 3 the festival. 4 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Right, right. 5 б Well, my last name actually is from Scotland. 7 WYCLIFFE WILKINSON: Oh, wow. 8 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Right, so. I was just asking. 9 10 WYCLIFFE WILKINSON: Oh, well, some of the... many of the children that we serve come from 11 12 various backgrounds so... 13 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Alright. 14 WYCLIFFE WILKERSON: It helps us get to the constituents in between so... 15 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I got it. I'm 16 just having a little fun, but Comrie, there is a 17 town in Scotland called Comrie actually. I haven't 18 19 been there yet. Last panel? Oh, God, the 20 Chairperson is back. CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [off mic] Yeah, 21 I'm sorry. 22 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: 23 See, I was 24 starting to act like him making jokes and everything. [laughter] 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 106
2	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Council
3	Member Comrie, for your help. I apologize that I
4	had to step out for a while.
5	[Pause]
6	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Alright, so I'd
7	like to call up the following people in favor of
8	the project: Paul Custer, Benjamin Hunter and
9	Anthony Hayes. Is there anyone else here who is
10	here to testify whose name I haven't called yet?
11	Good, good. That's good I didn't miss anybody.
12	So, gentlemen, are we missing we're alright,
13	we may be missing someone and I understand it's a
14	late if the hour's late we sometimes lose
15	people, but these are the three who had testified
16	in favor, so gentlemen, whenever you're ready,
17	please state your name for the record.
18	BENJAMIN HUNTER: Yes, good morning,
19	ladies and gentlemen in attendance and honorable
20	council members. My name is Benjamin Hunter. I've
21	been a resident of Coney Island for the past 30
22	years, probably longer on and off. I was raised by
23	my aunt out there. I work closely with Keith Suber
24	from the Suber Foundation and I just briefly want
25	to express my support from I shall say from a
I	

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 107 laborer's point of view; like I just worked in 2 3 construction throughout the years; my father worked In fact, he helped build houses from when 4 there. they were bungalows to a lot of the high-rise 5 6 development projects that currently exist out there. In short, I think everything that really 7 needs to be said in favor has been mentioned. 8 However, it should also be pointed out from a 9 10 grassroots level, iSTAR has intensely attempted to 11 contact our community representatives, as well as 12 community activists through various means. They 13 have been extremely successful through the Suber 14 Foundation, who, as we are speaking now, we're currently trying to develop other ways to inform 15 and enlighten other community members and other 16 17 community groups so that they can become proactive in the process and in the development of this 18 project, which is desperately needed out there, not 19 only for the infrastructure; for the sewer, et 20 21 cetera, et cetera, but also for the enhancement and the training of a lot of the individuals that come 22 from Coney Island, which this will provide an 23 24 opportunity for them to learn skills, become a little bit more responsible as individuals and take 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 108
2	advantage of a lot of the programs that's going to
3	be offered as a result of the project moving
4	forward and being completed. With that, I'm clear.
5	Thank you.
6	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: That's great. Can
7	we see where you live on this map or no? We may
8	get do you want a cat toy to point it out?
9	BENJAMIN HUNTER: 2749.
10	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay, alright.
11	BENJAMIN HUNTER: A little farther
12	down.
13	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: A little further
14	down, okay. Thank you.
15	BENJAMIN HUNTER: Mm-hm. You're
16	welcome.
17	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Gentlemen, put the
18	cat play away, okay.
19	PAUL CUSTER: My name is Paul Custer
20	and the Senior Vice President of the YMCA of New
21	York city. On December 6th, about 10 days ago, we
22	had the great opportunity and great honor of being
23	able to cut the ribbon at the Coney Island YMCA and
24	many folks here were in attendance, and obviously,
25	Council Member Recchia certainly presided at the
I	I

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 109 event, along with the borough president. We are 2 proud to be able to add our 24th YMCA to the 3 neighborhoods in New York City and we feel a 4 5 special responsibility to make sure that we make 6 this an extraordinarily accessible community center. We also have learned from experience that 7 when we open new YMCAs, there is an awful lot of 8 interest in participating in activities and often 9 10 our programs get filled and having access to other 11 similar types of spaces for certain types of events 12 is always very good, and so we very much support 13 the project and see that the Y Programs will 14 certainly have ample use of the space. We also expect that we will work cooperatively with other 15 community youth organizations to be able to make 16 17 sure that programs are going to be available that can use the space. Thank you. 18 19 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you. I'm 20 sorry. Sir, you're testifying as well, yes? Okay, 21 thank you. Just tell us your name. 22 ANTHONY HAYES: Okay, my name is 23 Anthony Hayes. I'm representing the 911 Homesavers 2.4 and the Suber Foundation. iSTAR and Avison Young have been very instrumental in helping us hire 25

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 110
2	local community residents doing any construction
3	work; teaching people different trades; teaching
4	people different skills; being able to utilize
5	them; getting people off the street and actually
6	doing something productive with their lives. So
7	I'm in favor of this project and hopefully with the
8	commitment from iSTAR and Avison Young to actually
9	hire community residents, I'm definitely in favor
10	for this project.
11	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you,
12	Anthony. Thank you very much. Let me see if Marty
13	left, okay. Gentlemen, thank you very much. We
14	appreciate it. I want to thank everyone for their
15	time and patience today. We're going to close this
16	hearing. We will not be voting today. So I'm
17	going to close the hearing on this one, Land Use
18	Numbers 994 through 999 inclusive. The next Zoning
19	Subcommittee will actually be tomorrow morning at
20	the City Hall Committee Room, 9:15 in the morning,
21	followed by the Land Use Committee at 9:30. And
22	with that in mind, the meeting is now adjourned.
23	Thank you.
24	[gavel]
25	
I	I

CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.



Date: ____01/15/2014