

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
USES

----- X

August 19, 2013  
Start: 11:23 a.m.  
Recess: 12:43 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm, 16th Fl

B E F O R E:

BRAD S. LANDER  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Maria del Carmen Arroyo  
Rosie Mendez  
Annabel Palma  
Jumaane D. Williams

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Dean Bodnar  
Senior Vice President  
New York City Economic Development Corp.  
Asset Management Division

Mike Burke  
Chief Operating Officer  
Statue Cruises

Michael Owen  
Outreach Community Coordinator  
Landmarks Preservation Commission

Mitchell Grubler  
Friends of the Bialystoker Center

Joyce Mendelsohn  
Author  
"The Lower East Side Remembered  
and Revisited"  
Columbia University Press, 2009.

Nadezhda Williams  
Historic Districts Council

Linda Jones  
Seward Park Preservation and  
History Club

Blaire Walsh  
New York Landmarks Conservancy

LaRay Brown  
Senior Vice President  
Corporate Planning, Community  
Health and Intergovernmental  
Relations  
New York City Health and Hospitals  
Corporation

Matthew Washington  
Community Board 11

Henry Butler  
Community Board 3  
District Manager

Evelyn Collier  
Chair  
Landmark Committee Community Board  
3

Frampton Tolbert  
Deputy Director  
Historic District Council

Claudette Brady  
Founder  
Bedford-Stuyvesant Society for  
Historic Preservation

Peri DeFino  
Bedford-Stuyvesant Society for  
Historic Preservation



1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND

2 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Alright, good  
3 morning [gavel]. My name is Brad Lander. I'm  
4 pleased to chair the City Council's Land Use  
5 Subcommittee on Landmarks, Maritime Uses and Public  
6 Sitings, and we have some of all of the above today  
7 which is rare.

8 Let me welcome, we have with us this  
9 morning members of the Committee, Council Member  
10 Rosie Mendez and Council Member Maria del Carmen  
11 Arroyo, and we're pleased to be joined by Council  
12 Member Margaret Chin. We have two items in her  
13 district on the calendar.

14 And we're going to go out of order a  
15 little on the calendar. We're going to start with  
16 the two items in Council Member Chin's district,  
17 Land Use 873, the Pier 15 Maritime Lease and the  
18 Bialystoker Center. Then we're going to do the HHC  
19 Project, the Goldwater Hospital, and then come back  
20 and finish the Landmarks agenda.

21 Thank you all for being here. So that  
22 means we're going to start with Land Use Number  
23 873, Application 20145031, the Pier 15 Maritime  
24 Lease, and I'm pleased to ask the Representatives  
25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 of New York City Economic Development Corporation  
3 to come up and present it to us.

4 DEAN BODNAR: Good morning, my name is  
5 Dean Bodnar... [interject]

6 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: I think... push it,  
7 yeah, there you go.

8 DEAN BODNAR: Oh, there we go. How's  
9 that? Excellent, okay. Good morning, my name is  
10 Dean Bodnar. I'm a Senior Vice President with the  
11 New York City Economic Development Corporation's  
12 Asset Management Division. I'm here today seeking  
13 approval from this subcommittee and the City  
14 Council to enter into a lease with an excursion  
15 cruise operator to berth on Pier 15 within the East  
16 River Esplanade in Manhattan.

17 The Esplanade is a two-mile waterfront  
18 park stretching from Battery Maritime Building up  
19 the East River to Pier 35. As you may well know,  
20 the \$165,000,000 East River Waterfront Esplanade is  
21 revitalizing a once neglected stretch of the city  
22 owned land and transforming the Lower Manhattan and  
23 Lower East Side waterfronts. It also contributes  
24 to the Waterfront Vision and Enhancement Strategy  
25 that the City issued in 2011, a plan that set forth

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 a sustainable blueprint for reconnecting New  
3 Yorkers and visitors to our waterways.

4 The Esplanade is a result of an  
5 extensive four-year planning process during which  
6 EDC worked closely with Community Boards 1 and 3  
7 and local elected officials to create a continuous  
8 open space amenity that neighbors and visitors  
9 alike can enjoy. Revenue must be generated to  
10 maintain this great amenity. A few discreet  
11 locations along the Esplanade are intended for this  
12 purpose. This includes the berthing areas on the  
13 newly constructed Pier 15 for which EDC on behalf  
14 of the City issued an RFP in April of 2010.

15 Hornblower New York, LLC submitted the  
16 proposal that won the RFP. The proposal includes  
17 economically viable programming concepts to enhance  
18 the East River Waterfront Esplanade experience and  
19 create positive impacts on the adjoining community.  
20 The proposal was responsive to the pier's  
21 neighborhood contacts and presents a strong team to  
22 operate the berths. Hornblower will occupy and  
23 operate the pier pavilion that is vacant today and  
24 use the berthing areas on the south and north sides  
25 of the pier. At those berths, Hornblower operate

2 dell (SIC) excursion cruises. The eastern berth of  
3 the pier will be used for historic ships on a  
4 limited basis. Also, Hornblower will attach a  
5 floating eco barge to the pier adjacent to its  
6 pavilion for education and community tie ups.

7 The lease for the maritime pavilion in  
8 certain berth areas on Pier 15 which is scheduled  
9 to commence on September 1st, subject to City  
10 Council approval, will be for a 10-year-term with  
11 one 5-year renewal option. Rental revenue from  
12 this lease as well as community restaurant leases  
13 for the other pier pavilion and the newly  
14 constructed Maiden Lane pavilion will cover much of  
15 the cost of maintaining the Esplanade.

16 Finally, I'd like to highlight that  
17 Hornblower's committed to public programming that  
18 will enhance the East River Esplanade.  
19 Hornblower's partnership with the New York Harbor  
20 School will maximize Pier 17's potential for making  
21 it a destination for maritime education as well as  
22 public and chartered vessel excursion services.  
23 EDC selection of Hornblower as the lessee for the  
24 berth areas at Pier 15 will help ensure that the



1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 Esplanade, a beloved community asset, remains well  
3 maintained for years to come.

4 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very  
5 much. Oh, we've been joined by Council Member  
6 Annabel Palma, welcome. Council Member Chin, as  
7 this is in your district, do you have either a  
8 statement or questions you'd like to kick us off  
9 with?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah, I just am  
11 very excited that the Hornblower is coming to Pier  
12 15, and I also wanted to thank the Maritime  
13 Division of the EDC for putting this lease  
14 together, and this will really help expand the  
15 maritime use in District 1, and I'm real excited  
16 about the partnership with the Harbor School. I  
17 think that will really create a great educational  
18 opportunity on the pier itself, but also allow our  
19 students to really have an educational opportunity  
20 there on the Pier 15 as well as their school in  
21 Governors Island. So I support this application.  
22 Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you. Anyone  
24 else on the Committee, Council Member Arroyo?

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
11070

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: When are you  
3 going to do one in the Bronx?

4 DEAN BODNAR: That's a good question.  
5 Ma'am, I'm focused right now on Lower Manhattan.  
6 The Bronx is... you know what, when I back to EDC,  
7 I'll talk to the Bronx portfolio manager, and I'll  
8 ask him when we're going to get something going in  
9 the Bronx.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Okay. And  
11 you'll call us back and let us know?

12 DEAN BODNAR: Absolutely.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Okay.

14 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Sorry, do you have  
15 a... can you... go ahead and I need to push the button.  
16 Introduce yourself, and...

17 MIKE BURKE: Hi, my name is Mike Burke.  
18 Having grown up on Decatur Avenue in the Bronx, we  
19 would definitely bid on that project if it comes  
20 along. I represent Hornblower Cruise and Events.  
21 I'm also the Chief Operating Officer of Statue  
22 Cruises, and we run the ferries as a Hornblower  
23 affiliate to the Statue of Liberty and Ellis  
24 Island. So I have a statement if you will.

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
HCFE

2 Hornblower Cruise and Events, its  
3 background since founder and CEO Terry McCray  
4 purchased a small charter business in 1980,  
5 Hornblower has operated under the overall mission  
6 to satisfy the needs of our guests. For over 33  
7 years, Hornblower's offered amazing experiences  
8 from home ports around the U.S. including San  
9 Francisco, Los Angeles, Sacramento, San Diego, New  
10 York, and starting in 2014 Niagara Falls, Canada.  
11 Today, Hornblower's affiliates operate the largest  
12 private passenger vessel company in North America.  
13 2012, we performed than 150,000 vessel voyages and  
14 safely carried more than 16,000,000 passengers  
15 globally on 98 vessels. Statue Cruises here in New  
16 York carries over 4,000,000 visitors to the Statue  
17 of Liberty and Ellis Island. Our dinner cruise  
18 fleet carries 500,000 passengers a year. We also  
19 provide marine service around the globe for  
20 private, public and U.S. military operations.

21 We have a track record of treating our  
22 employees well, paying competitive wages. The  
23 hourly wage range for an employee that is part of  
24 the marine crew is anticipated to be between \$15  
25 and \$24 per hour, and for those working on the pier

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
ITCFE

2 or in the ticket office, the hourly wage range is  
3 anticipated to be \$10 to \$18.

4           Regarding educational and community  
5 programming, we have a history of working with  
6 community works, educational institutions,  
7 marketing organizations and not-for-profits to  
8 provide maritime, environmental, cultural and  
9 historical programming. A sample of some of the  
10 activities planned for Pier 15 include in our  
11 cruise school during the months of May, June, July  
12 and August we will offer subsidized educational  
13 harbor cruise for schools and camps in the Tri  
14 State area, offering a great opportunity for local  
15 children to learn more about New York Harbor and  
16 its ecology. Together with the New York Harbor  
17 School we will build a multi-purpose eco barge on  
18 the south side of Pier 15. This barge will create  
19 new marine habitat and at the same time serve as an  
20 educational outpost for the New York Harbor School.  
21 We will be partnering with local schools including  
22 the Harbor School to offer a paid internship  
23 program. As part of this new and exciting  
24 opportunity they will work in frontline roles while  
25 learning transferable skills, gain real world

2 experience, and be part of a select successful  
3 team. The strategy there is that the student  
4 becomes the teacher.

5 A sample of some of the other planned  
6 activities at the maritime pavilion, in cooperation  
7 again with the New York Harbor School will offer  
8 classes and workshops open to the public, a safe  
9 boating course, Red Cross First Aid certification,  
10 public classes and workshops, open to various  
11 organizations, lead among them will be the Harbor  
12 School. Another planned activity anticipated for  
13 the pavilion is the installation of a vessel  
14 simulator that will be available to the general  
15 public on a limited basis.

16 The western part of the pavilion will  
17 function as a visitor center and ticketing area for  
18 Hornblower customers and the downtown community.  
19 We will encourage information on other downtown  
20 businesses and attractions to encourage Hornblower  
21 customers to explore the neighborhood. There has  
22 been some conversation also with NYC and Company  
23 that they will work in that space with us to  
24 provide even more outreach.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME

HERE

2 Description of community services.

3 Hornblower evaluated a broad range of excursion  
4 services and activities that are commonly  
5 associated with public piers related passenger  
6 vessel services. Hornblower vessels are the  
7 newest, most environmentally friendly vessels in  
8 the harbor. For Pier 15, the initial operation  
9 will include three cruise offerings. We may add  
10 additional passenger vessel excursion services as  
11 provided under the lease agreement. The first is  
12 and the primary is the narrated sightseeing.

13 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Sir, I don't want  
14 to... this is a great testimony and I wonder if it's  
15 possible given we have a lot of people and a lot of  
16 items if you could either summarize the rest of it  
17 and... [crosstalk]

18 MIKE BURKE: Sure.

19 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you so much.

20 MIKE BURKE: So, in summary we hope our  
21 marketing capability will appeal to both visitors  
22 and locals and help activate Pier 15. On behalf of  
23 Hornblower, thank you for having us here to talk  
24 about our history and our plans for the operations  
25 of Pier 15. Thank you.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
ITCFE

2 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you. I  
3 apologize.

4 MIKE BURKE: Not at all.

5 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: And we have the  
6 written and submitted testimony for the record  
7 which lists the full testimony, so thank you very  
8 much. Welcome to Council Member Williams who has  
9 joined us. Any other questions? I do have one.  
10 This is a little more for EDC than for Hornblower.  
11 So, I'm encouraged by you're telling us the wage  
12 range and that these look to be good jobs in  
13 addition to the many good things that they'll bring  
14 to the waterfront, but I do want to ask EDC and I  
15 mean I recognize that this is the subject of  
16 litigation that the administration is not  
17 enthusiastic about our living wage law, but as I  
18 read it the living wage law would apply to this  
19 lease, and I guess I want to ask whether you share  
20 that point of view and have had that conversation  
21 with Hornblower? It sounds like they would comply  
22 which is great but, you know...

23 DEAN BODNAR: As far as what is outlined  
24 in the lease itself, you know, I don't think  
25 there's a direct connection with the living wage.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
ITCFE

2 It's not called out in the lease, but we will work  
3 closely with Hornblower to make sure that, you  
4 know, they're providing the highest possible wages.

5 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: So I would just  
6 urge, and I guess I would urge this on Hornblower  
7 as well because whether the lease explicitly  
8 includes that clause or not, if I'm correct, that  
9 the Council's living wage law which covers leases  
10 as well as substantial economic subsidies applies,  
11 it applies irrespective of whether it's in the  
12 lease. It doesn't look from... looking at this, I  
13 think where it's 10.50 instead of 10, so... and I'd  
14 be happy to provide you with, you know, with the  
15 legislation or with our reading of it. The  
16 Bloomberg administration has been litigating  
17 against it, but we believe the legislation is going  
18 to outlast the Bloomberg administration, and the  
19 whole goal is to bring businesses with good jobs  
20 into those lease positions so don't read this as  
21 anything other than enthusiasm for having you, but  
22 we are eager to make sure that the laws comply with  
23 greater jobs, so...

24 DEAN BODNAR: Fair enough.

25



1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
ITCFE

2 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Good, thank you.

3 Otherwise, you know, it's a very encouraging and  
4 positive project so thank you.

5 DEAN BODNAR: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Any other questions  
7 for my colleagues? Seeing none, we'll say thank  
8 you for your testimony and go ahead and close. We  
9 don't have anyone signed up to testify from the  
10 public on this item, so unless someone speaks up  
11 now we'll go ahead and close the public hearing.  
12 We'll do all the votes together at the end of the  
13 hearing and join them, so that will close the  
14 public hearing on Pier 15. Thank you very much for  
15 your time and for bringing this great project to  
16 us.

17 Alright, we're going to split the  
18 Landmarks items so that we can do both of the ones  
19 in Margaret's district first, and I'm pleased to  
20 call Michael Owen from the Landmarks Preservation  
21 Commission. I guess Jenny's getting some well  
22 earned vacation, and this is for Land Use Number  
23 Blank, Preconsidered Land Use... the application  
24 number 20135751, the designation of the Bialystoker

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 Center and Home for the Aged at 228 East Broadway.  
3 And welcome, we're glad to have you.

4 MICHAEL OWEN: Thank you very much. And  
5 good morning, Council Members. My name is Michael  
6 Owen, the Outreach Community Coordinator for the  
7 Landmarks Preservation Commission. Regrettably,  
8 Jenny could not make it today, Jenny Fernandez,  
9 who's the Director of Intergovernmental and  
10 Community Relations for the Commission. A death in  
11 the family so she couldn't make it today. But I'm  
12 here today to testify on the Commission's  
13 designation of the Bialystoker Center and Home for  
14 the Aged in Manhattan.

15 On February 12th, 2013, the Landmarks  
16 Preservation Commission held a public hearing on  
17 the proposed designation of the Bialystoker Center  
18 and Home for the Aged. A representative testified  
19 for the owner but did not oppose the designation.  
20 Twenty-two people spoke in favor of designation  
21 including sending Council Member Margaret Chin, a  
22 representative of Manhattan Borough President Scott  
23 Stringer's office and a representative of Manhattan  
24 Community Board 3 as well as representatives of the  
25 Friends of the Lower East Side, the Historic

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
DCFC  
2 District's Council, the Lower East Side History  
3 Project, the New York Landmarks Conservancy, and  
4 the Two Bridges Neighborhood Council. A letter and  
5 supportive designation from State Senator Daniel L.  
6 Squadron was also entered into the record during  
7 the hearing. On May 21st, 2013, the commission  
8 voted to designate the Bialystoker Center and Home  
9 for the Aged a New York City individual landmark.  
10 The Lower East Side of Manhattan is one of New  
11 York's most storied neighborhoods. It's synonymous  
12 with the American immigrant experience and once  
13 home to the largest population of Jewish residents  
14 in the world. The Bialystoker Center and Home for  
15 the Aged built in 1929-31 and designed in a  
16 distinctive Art Deco style by architect Harry  
17 Hurwit. It was one of the largest and most  
18 enduring landsmanshaft or immigrant home  
19 association established in the neighborhood and  
20 remains a significant landmark in the history of  
21 New York City's Jewish community. The Bialystoker  
22 Center takes its name from Bialystok, an industrial  
23 city in what is now Poland. The Jewish Bialystoker  
24 immigrant community in New York City has a long and  
25 rich history having established a number of mutual

2 benefit societies and a synagogue as early as the  
3 1860s. By the mid 1920s, with the recovery of  
4 eastern Europe and the passage of national  
5 immigrations restrictions, the Center's focus  
6 shifted in supporting the existing Jewish community  
7 in New York. A central component of this new  
8 mission was the creation of a home for the aged.

9 A new building to house both the  
10 Bialystoker Center and the Home for the Aged was  
11 completed in 1931. The prominent nine-story  
12 structure was designed by architect Harry Hurwit,  
13 1888 - 1963, and its distinguished Art Deco style  
14 is rare for the Lower East Side. The Lower East  
15 Side has experienced significant changes in both  
16 its demographics and its physical fabric. The  
17 neighborhood, once dominated by the Jewish  
18 community, is now home to a diverse assortment of  
19 immigrant populations. There have been renewal  
20 projects such as the Seward Park Houses that  
21 surround the Center, resulted in the demolition of  
22 many historic structures during the 1950s and  
23 1960s. When the Bialystoker Center's Home for the  
24 Aged closed its doors in 2011, it was one of the  
25 last remaining and longest running landsmanshaft in

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
111111

2 New York. Its building, however, remains one of  
3 the Lower East Side's prominent landmarks and  
4 recalls a vanished era when the Bialystoker Center  
5 and its distinguished Art Deco-style Home for the  
6 Aged played a significant role in the world's  
7 largest Jewish community, and the commission urges  
8 you to affirm this designation. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very  
10 much. Council Member Chin, any statement or  
11 questions?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I support the  
13 designation because it's been a long road and we  
14 have people in the community who is going to speak.  
15 I would love to hear them. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Alright, so we do  
17 have some members of the community signed up to  
18 testify on this item, and since I don't think we  
19 have other... oh, I'm sorry, Council Member Mendez?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you. This  
21 is in Margeret's District that borders on mine, and  
22 it's been a very important issue to our community,  
23 and I've heard from both our constituents on this  
24 matter so I look forward to the testimony.

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
11050

2 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Super. I'll add my  
3 enthusiasm like all New York City Jews who trace  
4 their roots to the Lower East Side, the litany of  
5 famous Bialystokers is long, so we're delighted to  
6 be doing this today. Alright, so thank you for  
7 your testimony and I have four people signed up to  
8 testify, and we'll just invite them all to come up  
9 at once for one panel. Mitchell Grubler from  
10 Friends of the Bialystoker Center Home; Joyce  
11 Mendelsohn; Nadezhda Williams; and Linda Jones.

12 Yes, you can hand in your written  
13 testimony if you have it and then go ahead and  
14 begin and just state your name for the record  
15 first, please.

16 MITCHELL GRUBLER: I'm Mitchell Grubler.  
17 Good morning Council Members. Friends of the  
18 Bialystoker Home was formed in September of 2011  
19 when we learned that the Home was dispersing its  
20 residents to other homes and closing. We are  
21 grateful for the wonderful support provided by 16  
22 sponsoring organizations including the Lower East  
23 Side Jewish Conservancy, the Lower East Side  
24 Tenement Museum, and the Historic Districts  
25 Council. We gathered hundreds of letters and

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 petition signatures from concerned individuals,  
3 academics and city-wide preservation, educational  
4 and cultural organizations to support Landmark  
5 designation.

6 Rebecca Kobrin, author of the  
7 definitive book on Bialystok, Poland and Its  
8 Diaspora, and Russell Knapp, Assistant Professor of  
9 American Jewish History at Columbia University,  
10 wrote, "We cannot let this bill which tells the  
11 tale of an important chapter in Jewish history and  
12 New York history be removed from our memory and our  
13 understanding of the Jewish immigrant encounter  
14 with America."

15 Michael Zisser, Chief Executive Officer  
16 at University Settlement Society of New York wrote,  
17 "Unfortunately we have seen the destruction or  
18 inappropriate renovations of many historic  
19 structures in the Lower East Side community over  
20 the past few decades. Much of the character of the  
21 community has been lost. We understand that use  
22 cannot be protected and that designating a landmark  
23 does not prevent the inevitable consequences of  
24 gentrification. However, when unique buildings  
25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 present themselves for protection action must be  
3 considered."

4 After three extensive hearings,  
5 Community Board 3 adopted a resolution in favor of  
6 landmarking, and we're especially grateful for the  
7 steadfast support of Council Member Margaret Chin  
8 who wrote to the Landmarks Commission, "I am  
9 writing to express my full support for the landmark  
10 designation of the Bialystoker Center for Nursing  
11 and Rehabilitation."

12 At the Landmarks Commission's public  
13 hearing on February 12th of this year, after more  
14 than a year and a half struggle to save this  
15 important component of Lower East Side history,  
16 Friends of the Bialystoker Home was overjoyed to  
17 hear Gary Ambrose, Treasurer of the Bialystoker  
18 Board of Trustees, say that the owners do not  
19 oppose landmarking Bialystoker. We urge the  
20 subcommittee to follow the example of the  
21 Bialystoker Board and vote to uphold Landmark  
22 designation for this worthy building.

23 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you. Go  
24 ahead.

25



1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
ITCFE

2 JOYCE MENDELSON: Good morning, Council  
3 Members. I'm Joyce Mendelsohn, the author of "The  
4 Lower East Side Remembered and Revisited", Columbia  
5 University Press, 2009. I want to emphasize that  
6 the Bialystoker home should be preserved not only  
7 for its cultural heritage, religious significance  
8 and architectural distinctiveness, but as an  
9 important component of economic development on the  
10 Lower East Side, a place where people yearn to live  
11 and work and where every year tens of thousands of  
12 tourists are drawn to connect with the lives of  
13 earlier generations on trips to the Tenement  
14 Museum, walking tours sponsored by organizations  
15 like the Lower East Side Jewish Conservancy and  
16 other special events.

17 At the same time, visitors spend  
18 dollars. They are eager to eat, shop and explore  
19 galleries in a world-renowned neighborhood with a  
20 very special character anchored by a few landmark  
21 buildings that have adapted to new uses. These  
22 include the Jewish Daily Forward, a Yiddish  
23 newspaper, now an upscale condo; Jarmulowsky Bank,  
24 currently transforming into a trendy hotel; and  
25 Anshei Chesed, a synagogue converted to an events

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 and cultural center, all demonstrating that  
3 historic buildings can enrich a neighborhood  
4 increasingly filled with luxury housing and  
5 expensive hotels. Your vote to approve designation  
6 of the Bialystoker Center and Home will support the  
7 ongoing vitality of the Lower East Side and enhance  
8 the City of New York as a must see destination.  
9 Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you. You  
11 guys are doing very well.

12 NADEZHDA WILLIAMS: Good morning. I'm  
13 Nadezhda Williams with the Historic Districts  
14 Council. HDC is the applicant for New York City's  
15 Designated Historic Districts, Landmarks and  
16 Buildings Meriting Preservation. HDC  
17 wholeheartedly supports the proposed landmarking of  
18 the Bialystoker Center at 228 East Broadway. The  
19 building has long been a favorite of  
20 preservationists and neighborhood residents, but  
21 its future has been precarious since the closing of  
22 the institution.

23 You've heard all about the cultural and  
24 architectural and historical merit and so I won't  
25 go through that again, but if you have time read

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 LPC's designation report. It's very interesting,  
3 even a good summer beach read. But to sum up, the  
4 Bialystoker Center's architecture is a solid  
5 reminder of the storied Jewish community and a way  
6 of life here on the Lower East Side, and HDC hopes  
7 that this solid reminder may be made permanent  
8 through Landmark designation. We appreciate the  
9 LPC's responsiveness to local advocates' request  
10 for this designation, and we ask you to confirm it.  
11 Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very  
13 much.

14 LINDA JONES: What are we, good... still  
15 good morning. I'm Linda Jones. I'm a resident of  
16 the Seward Park Houses, and I'm representing the  
17 Seward Park Preservation and History Club. As you  
18 all know, our houses surround the Bialystoker Home.  
19 It's our neighbor.

20 Residents of Seward Park Co-op were  
21 devastated with a valued neighborhood institution,  
22 the Bialystoker Home for the Aged was closed in  
23 November 2011. At the time, the board of the Home  
24 advertised it for sale as a development site  
25 triggering efforts among neighbors to save the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
ITCFE

2 building. We quickly collected 64 signatures on  
3 petitions posted on our co-op bulletin boards and  
4 joined with the Friends of the Bialystoker Home in  
5 a massive effort to achieve Landmark designation.  
6 We were pleased to hear from Gary Ambrose, a  
7 Bialystoker Center and Home board member, that the  
8 Board understands and does not oppose the  
9 designation of the Bialystoker Center as a  
10 landmark. We hope that the home and its adjacent  
11 properties will find a positive reuse that will  
12 enhance the neighborhood while preserving the  
13 building.

14 We have support from neighborhood  
15 business owners who believe that preservation and  
16 restoration of the Bialystoker Home will bring more  
17 people into the neighborhood and to their  
18 businesses and from co-op residents who want  
19 something of the past to remain for their children.

20 We especially want to thank Council  
21 Member Chin for her steadfast support of our  
22 efforts. We urge you to approve Landmark  
23 designation of this unique and special building.

24 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very  
25 much. And we have one more...

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
ITCFE

2 BLAIRE WALSH: Good morning, Chair  
3 Lander and Council Members. I'm Blaire Walsh  
4 speaking on behalf of the New York Landmarks  
5 Conservancy. The Conservancy joins elected  
6 officials, community members and local  
7 preservationists in supporting designation of the  
8 Bialystoker Center as an individual landmark. We  
9 believe this building merits designation for both  
10 its rich history and its distinguished  
11 architecture. The Bialystoker Center served vital  
12 community needs for nearly 80 years as home for the  
13 aged, as a social center offering religious  
14 services, and as a gathering place for the  
15 Bialystokers, one of New York's largest Jewish  
16 immigrant groups. Funds raised from those  
17 immigrants ensured that the building would be  
18 completed to serve as a residence for the elderly  
19 in the neighborhood they called home.

20 Along with the nearby landmark  
21 Bialystoker Synagogue, the Center is part of the  
22 immigrant experience that defines New York's  
23 cultural heritage. It is also an attractive 1931  
24 Art Deco tower. Decorated with more Morris Style  
25 terracotta ornament, the Bialystoker Home is a

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 contributing building within the Lower East Side  
3 National Register Historic District. The structure  
4 itself connects architecture to history with  
5 symbols at the entrance representing the 12 tribes  
6 of Israel, a motif often found in synagogue  
7 decoration. The golden brick facade is intact and  
8 there have been few alterations. We thank the  
9 Landmarks Commission for acting swiftly to  
10 designate this significant site which is so deeply  
11 connected to its community and urge the Council to  
12 affirm that designation today. Thank you for the  
13 opportunity to present the Conservancy's views.

14 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very  
15 much, and I apologize for not having called you  
16 before your card was in the Bed-Stuy pile, so we'll  
17 be calling you back later. Any questions for this  
18 panel? Thank you all very much for taking the time  
19 to come down and testify and for your passion in  
20 preserving some of the wonderful things of the  
21 Lower East Side and its history. So that is all  
22 the people that were signed up testify on the  
23 Bialystoker Center and Home for the Aged so we'll  
24 close [gavel] the public hearing on that item with  
25 thanks. And we will now... and thank you, Council

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
HERE  
2 Member Chin for joining us. You're welcome to  
3 stay.

4 And we're now going to move on to the  
5 item on the calendar with the New York City Health  
6 and Hospitals Corporation, and that is the  
7 Goldwater Hospital, which is Land Use Number, also  
8 Preconsidered Application Number 20145045. And I'm  
9 pleased to ask the representatives of the New York  
10 City Health and Hospitals Corporation to come up  
11 and present it to us.

12 LARAY BROWN: Good morning. Good  
13 morning. My name is LaRay Brown, and I'm Senior  
14 Vice President for Corporate Planning, Community  
15 Health and Intergovernmental Relations at the New  
16 York City Health and Hospitals Corporation. I'm  
17 here to provide testimony regarding HAT's request  
18 to surrender to the City of New York a parcel of  
19 land and buildings Block 1373, Lot 20 that  
20 comprised the campus of Goldwater Specialty  
21 Hospital and Nursing Facility on Roosevelt Island.  
22 The Goldwater campus opened in 1939 and has served  
23 patients who require skilled nursing care and long  
24 term acute care services. Several years ago, it  
25 became clear that HHC could no longer continue to

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
HHC

2 optimally serve our patients in such an old and  
3 outdated facility without extensive renovations or  
4 rebuilding. These capital investments would be  
5 required to bring the building up to federal  
6 standards and in line with how skilled nursing care  
7 is provided today. The setting and approach for  
8 how care is delivered differs greatly today from  
9 what was the norm seven decades ago. HHC had been  
10 weighing different options for rebuilding going  
11 back several years. All of the options required a  
12 significant investment of resources. Estimates of  
13 rebuilding were in the hundreds of millions of  
14 dollars, and for those of you familiar with our  
15 budget you know that these resources HHC did not  
16 and does not have.

17 In 2010, we were approached by the  
18 State of New York to gauge our and New York City's  
19 interest and ability to be part of a solution to  
20 the bankruptcy closure of North General Hospital in  
21 Harlem. To briefly summarize what took months to  
22 negotiate, we were able to come to an agreement  
23 whereby HHC would relocate services that were being  
24 provided on our Goldwater campus to the North  
25 General site at a lower cost and with some state



1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 funding than the cost of rebuilding the facility on  
3 Roosevelt Island.

4 After renovations are complete, the  
5 former North General Hospital building will house a  
6 201-bed long term acute care hospital, and we are  
7 also constructing a new 164-bed skilled nursing  
8 facility on the parking lot of that former  
9 hospital. Once Goldwater patient transfers have  
10 taken place this fall, HHC will no longer require  
11 the use of the Goldwater campus. As such, we seek  
12 to return the land to the City of New York pursuant  
13 to HHC's Enabling Act which permits a surrender of  
14 land back to the City of New York when that land is  
15 no longer needed for corporate purposes. HHC's  
16 Board of Directors convened a public hearing on  
17 July 11th, 2013 regarding the surrender. On July  
18 25th, 2013, HHC's Board of Directors formally  
19 approved the surrender of this parcel on Roosevelt  
20 Island.

21 Thank you for the opportunity to give  
22 testimony, and I can now address any of your  
23 questions.

24 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very much  
25 for testifying before us. I know that Council

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
HHC

2 Member Lappin asked me to represent that she's a  
3 supporter of this project, and we had a hearing in  
4 this Subcommittee on the North General siting that  
5 Council Member Mark-Viverito attended, and just for  
6 my purposes, currently there's two hospitals on  
7 Roosevelt Island, right, this one and Coler, is  
8 that the other one?

9 LARAY BROWN: Yes, on one end... they sort  
10 of cover both tips of Roosevelt Island. On one end  
11 is the Goldwater Specialty Hospital and Nursing  
12 Facility, and the other is the Coler Specialty  
13 Hospital and Nursing Facility. The Coler facility,  
14 which will have about 814 beds, will remain in  
15 operation on Roosevelt Island for our patients.

16 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: That's also an HHC  
17 facility?

18 LARAY BROWN: Exactly.

19 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Oh okay.

20 LARAY BROWN: That's an HHC facility, a  
21 very important one.

22 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Great, thank you  
23 for clarifying that. Anyone have questions for  
24 HHC, Council Member Arroyo?

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
ITCFE

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes. Hi, LaRay,  
3 nice to see you. Always a pleasure.

4 LARAY BROWN: Good to see you as well.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: And the concerns  
6 that we deal with as Chair of the Committee on  
7 Health and the deficit and the fiscal challenges  
8 that the corporation faces year after year, what  
9 savings do you anticipate the surrender of this  
10 facility will provide for HHC.

11 LARAY BROWN: Sure, sure. As you know,  
12 Council Member, given your history of healthcare  
13 administration, it takes a lot of funds to actually  
14 operate, not staff, but provide the heating and all  
15 of the infrastructure costs, and as I mentioned in  
16 my testimony, the Goldwater building was actually  
17 constructed in 1939, and it is a huge campus, a  
18 building or several buildings I should say, that  
19 are frankly not being used to their fullest, and  
20 moreover is very, very inefficient in terms of the  
21 other-than-personnel costs. So we will save  
22 significantly on just the issue of just operating  
23 the building because, in fact, now with the use of  
24 the North General campus, we will only have two  
25 structures in which we provide patient care, and

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
HERE

2 essentially one is a newly constructed skilled  
3 nursing facility, and the other has essentially  
4 been gut rehab with all new infrastructure, so new  
5 heating and plumbing and all of those types of  
6 infrastructure costs will be significantly reduced.  
7 We also are consolidating our patient care so that  
8 we will be much more efficient in terms of our  
9 staffing because we'll have one building in which  
10 the long term acute care is provided and another  
11 for the skilled nursing facility. So we will have,  
12 in addition to some other-than-personnel cost, we  
13 will be able to bid in over time some staff saving  
14 cost. But at this point that is not immediate.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Okay, thank you.

16 LARAY BROWN: You're welcome.

17 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Any other questions  
18 here? And I guess just, so I don't think this was  
19 flagged in your testimony, but I guess I think we  
20 should just flag it for members of the committee,  
21 the surrender to the City is so that it can be part  
22 of the Cornell/Technion Applied Sciences campus,  
23 right?

24 LARAY BROWN: Yes, when we relocate all  
25 of our operations from the Goldwater campus, we

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 surrender our parcel and then the City executes its  
3 agreement with Cornell/Technion.

4 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Great. Okay, we  
5 thank you for your testimony.

6 LARAY BROWN: Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: We do have one  
8 person, Matthew Washington, representative of  
9 Community Board 11 here to testify, give public  
10 testimony on this matter. Thanks for joining us.

11 MATTHEW WASHINGTON: How are you, LaRay?  
12 Good morning. My name is Matthew Washington, Chair  
13 of Community Board 11. Thank you for the  
14 opportunity to speak today. I want to start by  
15 saying Community Board 11 has been fully supportive  
16 of the Cornell/Technion School of Applied Sciences  
17 and Engineering School moving forward. I'm very  
18 excited about the opportunities for New York City  
19 and also for East Harlem, which is just north of  
20 this facility.

21 What I wanted to talk with the  
22 Committee about and really request the Committee's  
23 support on is certainly this project is important  
24 for the City and the City has put it on a fast  
25 track program to get done. The challenge that

2 we've seen in East Harlem is that all of the  
3 facilities that LaRay was just talking about are  
4 being relocated into our community without much  
5 consultation with the local community without  
6 initial work to identify the needs within the local  
7 community. LaRay and her team have tried, but have  
8 not met the needs of our community. East Harlem is  
9 a community of about 110,000 residents. With a 16  
10 percent unemployment rate, we have 45,000 outside  
11 of the workforce who are on some sort of public  
12 assistance, so over half of our community is not  
13 working. When looking at development projects, we  
14 are certainly looking for jobs, employment  
15 opportunities at all levels.

16 In October of 2012, the local, local  
17 being East Harlem hiring hours, East Harlem  
18 residents represented 3.8 percent of total hours  
19 worked on this job. In March of 2013, East Harlem  
20 residents represented 3.6 percent of the total  
21 hours worked on this job. We really need the City  
22 Council and the administration to invest in East  
23 Harlem to make sure that the people in our  
24 community are working, are finding opportunities to  
25 be employed. It's critical when you have a

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
HHC  
2 community with over half of its residents outside  
3 of the workforce. So today I'm here to ask the  
4 Council and the administration for your support in  
5 making sure that this project continues to seek  
6 local hiring from the East Harlem community and not  
7 the broader local target that HHC has identified.  
8 Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very  
10 much. Council Member Williams and then I'll make  
11 reference. Okay, so let's ask, if it's alright  
12 with you, let's ask HHC to come back up and so we  
13 can some questions about this. And I know when the  
14 North General siting took place that Council Member  
15 Mark-Viverito raised some of the broader set of  
16 concerns that you're articulating here and did some  
17 negotiations with the administration, but it sounds  
18 like there's more to do, so...

19 MATTHEW WASHINGTON: It's certainly  
20 ongoing.

21 LARAY BROWN: So just to clarify, the  
22 project that Council Member Viverito was involved  
23 with had to do with our developing housing in East  
24 Harlem on Metropolitan Hospital's campus. Now it  
25 does get confusing because it is somewhat related

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
HHC  
2 to our relocating, our goal and our operations,  
3 inasmuch as that housing development is for  
4 individuals discharged from Goldwater who require  
5 supportive and/or housing for people with  
6 disabilities.

7 In terms of the construction on the  
8 North General campus and the renovations of the  
9 North General Hospital. As Matt said, HHC and EDC  
10 because EDC actually is the construction manager  
11 for this project, have been engaged over many  
12 months with Community Board 11 with the specific  
13 issue being around the hiring of, frankly,  
14 residents from Community Board 11, very  
15 specifically to do the construction and the  
16 renovation work. And so we engaged in a process in  
17 which there was frequent updates to the Community  
18 Board as to how we were either not achieving or in  
19 some cases achieving not only the MWBE requirements  
20 related to the project but to the very specific zip  
21 codes of Community Board 11. Unfortunately, we  
22 didn't need Community Board 11's high bar in terms  
23 of very specifically the zip codes from Community  
24 Board 11. While we met a pretty significant bar of  
25 providing opportunities for individuals in Harlem,



1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
HERE

2 this is the reference that Matt made. In terms of  
3 the broader geography, we were not able... I think,  
4 Matt, the expectation was, was it 30 percent or?

5 MATTHEW WASHINGTON: We always look for  
6 35 percent.

7 LARAY BROWN: 35 percent, right, we were  
8 not able to make that. There was extensive  
9 outreach conducted by the Gilbane-McKissack, who  
10 are the actual builders, and in particular  
11 McKissack in actually creating a community-based  
12 outreach center to engage local residents in work  
13 ranging from laborers to construction, but  
14 unfortunately we did not meet that high standard of  
15 the Community Board. And, again, that's related to  
16 the very time specific renovation and construction  
17 work.

18 MATTHEW WASHINGTON: And with that, you  
19 must use a 35 percent local hiring target until we  
20 recognize that. We had talked about it in  
21 conversations with LaRay looking for a 10 percent  
22 for East Harlem, but ultimately this is... it's  
23 important when decisions are being made at the  
24 administration level, at the council level for  
25 development projects to move for to identify the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
needs of the local community. In looking at  
2 documents like Statement of District Needs that  
3 community boards distribute and really helping to  
4 understand how we can impact the communities so we  
5 are developing in a positive way.  
6

7 LARAY BROWN: And HHC is, frankly, in  
8 wholehearted support of doing such. There was not  
9 a disagreement on our part in terms of trying to  
10 achieve that aim. We were just not able to.

11 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: And this goes to  
12 obviously a much broader issue Council Member Vann  
13 and Council Member Arroyo and many on the council  
14 have been pushing on a wide range of projects to  
15 improve MWBE, both contracting and hiring, and I  
16 think we all feel, you know, that we're glad goals  
17 are being set and raised but that there's more that  
18 has to be done to find ways to enable the city on  
19 public projects and private projects to meet them,  
20 so Council Member Arroyo has a question.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: LaRay and, I'm  
22 sorry, I didn't...

23 MATTHEW WASHINGTON: Matthew.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Matthew. What  
25 did we learn about why we didn't reach the target,

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
11070

2 is it an issue of not being able to identify  
3 residents in East Harlem or the local community  
4 with the required skills, and if that's the case  
5 then we have some homework to do about how do we  
6 get them prepared for the jobs that can potentially  
7 come to the community because not reaching the  
8 target, although we tried is nice, but it doesn't  
9 help us solve the problem long term.

10 LARAY BROWN: Absolutely. And I'm sure  
11 Matt will add to what I have to say. One of our  
12 biggest, and I say our, but one of the biggest  
13 challenges that the construction firm faced was  
14 actually having folks who had union cards. You  
15 know, people from Community Board 11, residents of  
16 that community board with the requisite union  
17 membership. That was what was articulated as one  
18 of the biggest challenges. We did meet the MWB.  
19 That was not the issue. It was literally trying to  
20 work in partnership in recognition of the very high  
21 need of Community Board 11 residents to be on that  
22 job, but Matt, if you want to expand?

23 MATTHEW WASHINGTON: Sure, certainly. I  
24 think there are a couple of issues. The first  
25 being that this project was on an accelerated

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 timeframe. It happened very quickly and so being  
3 able to ramp up and identify work with the local  
4 community, as I mentioned earlier, a 16 percent  
5 unemployment, 45,000 people outside of the  
6 workforce on some sort of public assistance, so  
7 getting to people is important. Making sure that  
8 if it is a union card that they need to do that but  
9 really having the time to ramp up. We have shown  
10 that when we work in collaboration with the city,  
11 with development partners, we can achieve great  
12 local hiring targets. With the East River Plaza,  
13 for instance, right at 116th Street and the FDR  
14 Drive, Marshall's, one of the retail stores, at  
15 opening had 60 percent hiring from the East Harlem  
16 community, and it was just through a real attention  
17 to detail and making sure that we're addressing the  
18 needs and finding out what the skills and  
19 qualifications are for the positions that are  
20 available, and it's really that timing piece that  
21 happened. This has been a rush project, and  
22 certainly we understand that the goals and the need  
23 for the School of Applied Sciences and Engineering,  
24 but there's a smart way to do it and there is just  
25 a better way to do this. And I want to be clear

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
11070

2 that I'm not trying to be critical of HHC directly.  
3 I think they have been working but we need to do  
4 more, and certainly as a city we need to do more  
5 collectively to address these needs. And LaRay has  
6 heard some unfriendly words from me at meetings  
7 when she's brought in low local hiring numbers  
8 because I'm passionate about my community and then  
9 want to make sure that we can really help make a  
10 difference in the East Harlem community.

11 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Has there been any  
12 discussion, I mean obviously this is a slightly  
13 complicated link set of projects, but I wonder  
14 whether, and I know there's the issue of the hiring  
15 for the Applied Sciences campus is a much broader  
16 issue, but it's closed East Harlem. It's a  
17 community of need and separate from the  
18 construction on North General, and if there's any  
19 way for the longer term jobs and positions that are  
20 being created on the Applied Sciences campus if we  
21 can push EDC and Cornell/Technion to attend to the  
22 needs of East Harlem in particular as that.

23 MATTHEW WASHINGTON: Definitely. I  
24 think it's really important understanding what  
25 those positions, what the qualifications are.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
11070

2 There's going to be time before this is fully built  
3 out. It's a lot of time. We have plenty of time.  
4 Certainly Cornell/Technion knows what the needs  
5 will be, so being able to distill that information,  
6 work with local hiring organizations to ramp up for  
7 it, and really create a pipeline for it, that's  
8 really the way to do it. And also making  
9 connections with local schools. There are going to  
10 be a lot of resources at this institution.

11 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: So maybe one thing  
12 I could suggest and if you want to work on this  
13 with Council Member Mark-Viverito, if there were a  
14 letter, you know, either to EDC or to  
15 Cornell/Technion reflecting some disappointment in  
16 the shortage of, you know, the inability to meet  
17 the goals on them, the hiring on this job, and that  
18 that reflects our desire to see some of that made  
19 up for as the Applied Sciences work moves forward.  
20 We'd be glad to work with you on that.

21 MATTHEW WASHINGTON: Can I start the  
22 letter as Council Member Brad Lander suggested?

23 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: I'll sign on.  
24 There's local representatives and others.

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
11276

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: I think there's  
3 a really interesting complication here and that is  
4 the requirement for the union card, and where is  
5 the opportunity to provide local residents a  
6 pipeline into the union, and the union has to be  
7 part of the conversation. We cannot leave them out  
8 of it because we just need to become better at  
9 finding alternatives to addressing this very  
10 complicated issue. As long as it's only a member  
11 with a card who's going to be hired for the job,  
12 the local residents are not going to have an  
13 opportunity and that's a very, very serious problem  
14 across the board when you're building union. You  
15 cannot leave them out of this conversation.

16 MATTHEW WASHINGTON: We completely agree  
17 and it's something that we've been working on quite  
18 regularly in East Harlem. Oftentimes, they're told  
19 you need an apprenticeship but our people aren't  
20 even getting to apprenticeships. What we've  
21 recently done at Community Board 11 is passed a  
22 resolution that says that we want an apprenticeship  
23 program required for every job in our community  
24 with a 50 percent local preference on all those  
25 apprenticeships but you have to get people, and

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
HERE

2 absolutely we've been working and urging the unions  
3 that they need to change their practices so that we  
4 can get people union cards. It's been very  
5 difficult for East Harlem residents to do that.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: And there's some  
7 great examples of some locals that have done some  
8 incredibly phenomenal work around opening  
9 opportunities for local community residents and  
10 their apprenticeship programs. It's been proven it  
11 works and it makes sense.

12 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: And so let me close  
13 this down. This has actually been a fruitful  
14 conversation and I'm mindful of the fact that it's  
15 in some ways a transitional one. Obviously this  
16 was rushed in part to try to move some things  
17 forward before the end of the Bloomberg  
18 administration and I think longer term  
19 opportunities to continue to improve the way the  
20 City builds on those examples and does this so  
21 really going to sit more with the next  
22 administration but it's good that we continue to  
23 really keep a focused eye on it, so I want to thank  
24 you for taking the time of presenting it to us.  
25 Thank you.



1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
ITCFE

2 MATTHEW WASHINGTON: Thank you for your  
3 time.

4 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Alright, that  
5 closes the public hearing on the Goldwater  
6 Hospital. We have one item remaining on the  
7 calendar and a nice set of people signed up to  
8 testify on it. Let me flag in advance that it's  
9 possible that Council Member Williams and I will  
10 need to run out for about five minutes while the  
11 testimony on Bed-Stuy is taking place. If that  
12 happens, we will come back up for the vote. You  
13 have your council member, Council Member Vann, who  
14 we welcome here to join us for this item, and if  
15 that happens, we'll ask Council Member Arroyo as  
16 the senior member of the Landmarks Subcommittee 2  
17 to take the gavel. So the last item on our  
18 calendar for today is Land Use Number 866, the  
19 Bedford-Stuyvesant and Expanded Stuyvesant Heights  
20 Historic District designation, and we'll start by  
21 asking Michael Owen again to come up and present it  
22 to us and then we have a half dozen or so people  
23 signed up to testify in support.

24 MICHAEL OWEN: Good morning Council  
25 Members. My name is Michael Owen, Community

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 Outreach Coordinator for the Landmarks Preservation  
3 Commission. I'm reading this testimony on behalf  
4 of my collision Jenny Fernandez, who regrettably  
5 could not be here today.

6 I'm here today to testify on the  
7 commission's designation of the Bedford-  
8 Stuyvesant/Expanded Stuyvesant Heights Historic  
9 District in Brooklyn. On August 2nd, 2011, the  
10 Landmarks Preservation Commission held a public  
11 hearing on the proposed designation of the Bedford-  
12 Stuyvesant/Expanded Stuyvesant Heights Historic  
13 District. Twenty-six witnesses spoke in favor of  
14 the designation including Council Member Albert  
15 Vann, Assembly Member Annette Robinson as well as  
16 representatives of Brooklyn Borough President Marty  
17 Markowitz, State Senator Velmanette Montgomery, the  
18 New York Landmarks Conservancy, the Historic  
19 Districts Council, and the Victorian Society. In  
20 addition, the Commission received 13 letters, 108  
21 e-mails and 146 postcards in support of the  
22 designation including correspondence from Brooklyn  
23 Community Board #3.

24 Over the course of several years, LPC  
25 staff has responded to the community led efforts to

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 protect resources in several areas of the Bedford-  
3 Stuyvesant neighborhood. The Commission designated  
4 the Stuyvesant Heights Historic District in 1971.  
5 Following an expansive survey of the area, the  
6 Commission held a public hearing in 1993 on the  
7 extension of that district.

8 After public testimony from community  
9 owners and residents expressing mixed support for  
10 the expansion no further action was scheduled.  
11 More recently, the Commission began to receive  
12 inquiries and requests from the community groups  
13 and residents requesting the Commission revisit the  
14 calendared expansion of the Stuyvesant Heights  
15 Historic District. LPC staff has attended numerous  
16 evening meetings and has mailed out several letters  
17 outlining each step of the Commission's actions in  
18 addition to offering meetings with individual  
19 property owners at their request and the many  
20 meetings and outreach efforts that have been  
21 conducted by the community.

22 On April 16th, 2013, the Commission  
23 voted to designate Bedford-Stuyvesant/Expanded  
24 Stuyvesant Heights a New York City Historic  
25 District. The Bedford-Stuyvesant/Expanded

2 Stuyvesant Heights Historic District consists of  
3 approximately 825 buildings and is located within  
4 the area roughly bounded by Tompkins Avenues on the  
5 west, Macon and Halsey Streets on the north,  
6 Malcolm X Boulevard on the east, and Fulton Street  
7 on the south. The boundaries of this proposed  
8 district encompass and extend the boundaries of the  
9 Stuyvesant Heights Historic District designated in  
10 1971 and more than doubles the size of the existing  
11 Historic District. The Bedford-Stuyvesant/Expanded  
12 Stuyvesant Heights Historic District is significant  
13 as part of a larger Bedford-Stuyvesant area which  
14 for two-thirds of the twentieth century has been  
15 one of the nation's largest and best known African-  
16 American and Caribbean-American residential  
17 communities. The buildings within the Bedford-  
18 Stuyvesant/Expanded Stuyvesant Heights Historic  
19 District mostly dating from the late nineteenth  
20 century form extraordinary streetscapes of row  
21 houses and small apartment buildings with community  
22 ground stories interspersed by churches, schools  
23 and related public and institutional buildings.

24 The immediate area became known as  
25 Stuyvesant Heights by the first decade of the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 <sup>11272</sup>  
3 twentieth century and was probably named for its  
4 first major thoroughfare, Stuyvesant Avenue. From  
5 the mid 1880s into the 1890s, the east-west streets  
6 and Stuyvesant Avenues were developed with rows of  
7 speculatively built houses reflecting stylistically  
8 the popular trends of the era: neo-Grec, Queen  
9 Anne, Romanesque Revival and Renaissance Revival.  
10 During the 1890s, four- and five-story brick and  
11 stone apartment buildings or "French flats"  
12 generally designed in the Romanesque Revival and  
13 Renaissance Revival styles were also erected in the  
14 district expansion.

14 Many of the late nineteenth century  
15 residents of the area were families of New England  
16 origins while others were members of immigrant  
17 groups such as the Germans and the Irish who had  
18 prospered sufficiently to be able to afford the  
19 purchase of a newly constructed row house or the  
20 rental of a flat in one of the apartment buildings.  
21 During this early period, prosperous African-  
22 Americans also purchased houses within the area.  
23 By World War I, the demographics of the area began  
24 to change, and African-Americans and members of  
25 white ethnic groups that were discriminated against

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 <sup>ITCFE</sup>  
3 elsewhere in the city were able to acquire decent  
4 affordable housing in Bedford-Stuyvesant. If  
5 Harlem was perceived as the center of New York's  
6 black cultural life with the rise of the Harlem  
7 Renaissance in the 1920s and 1930s, Bedford-  
8 Stuyvesant offered an alternative, a residential  
9 community within the borough of homes and churches  
10 with block after block of attractive row houses and  
11 small apartment buildings. With its unparalleled  
12 opportunities for home ownership, Bedford-  
13 Stuyvesant became the community of choice for many  
14 of New York's African-American residents.

14 The Commission urges you to affirm this  
15 designation. Thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Thank you. I  
17 think we have a number of people signed up to  
18 testify. Council Member Vann, would you like to  
19 make a statement now or you want to wait for the  
20 public? You'll wait, okay, thank you. And, okay,  
21 so... okay, so we'll do two panels. We're going to  
22 call Henry Butler, Community Board 3 District  
23 Manager. Henry, hi. Evelyn Collier, Community  
24 Board 3 Landmarks Committee; and Blaire Walsh, New  
25 York Landmarks Conservancy. Okay, we're going to

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 continue to use the clock and hopefully your  
3 testimony will be summarized. We're not reading  
4 verbatim from your written statements, right? Real  
5 and direct testimony we find is the best one that  
6 we hear. So you proceed, flip a coin, however you  
7 want to go.

8 HENRY BUTLER: I guess I'll go first.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Okay. The light  
10 is on, the mic is working.

11 HENRY BUTLER: Good afternoon. Henry L.  
12 Butler, former Chairperson of Community Board 3,  
13 New District Manager of Community Board 3, thank  
14 you.

15 I'm here to state that the Community  
16 Board, the role of the Community Board and this  
17 process, has been a process of we did not determine  
18 who and what would be landmarked. We let the  
19 residents decide that, so it was the residents who  
20 came to us asking for assistance in getting the  
21 areas landmarked. We told the residents it was up  
22 to them to show and prove to the Community Board,  
23 to elected officials, to LPC, that landmark was  
24 something that was desired by the residents in the  
25 designated area that we're here speaking on today.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
HERE

2 After various meetings that were held,  
3 once that was done, the Community Board came  
4 onboard with full support behind this designation  
5 because it was shown with significant numbers that  
6 there was support for landmarking the Stuyvesant  
7 Expansion area. So the official statement will be  
8 read by the Landmark Chairperson, Ms. Evelyn  
9 Collier, and I just wanted to put out there to the  
10 Council Members that the role of the Community  
11 Board is to neither support nor be against  
12 landmarking, but to I guess you could say guide the  
13 residents of Bedford-Stuyvesant at what need to be  
14 done if they want an area designated as landmark  
15 following the guidelines set forth by OPC, and I  
16 can fully state that when it comes to the  
17 Stuyvesant Heights Expansion, those guidelines have  
18 been met by the residents, and we at Community  
19 Board 3 fully support the designation of the  
20 Stuyvesant expansion. Thank you.

21 EVELYN COLLIER: Okay. My name is  
22 Evelyn Collier. I am the Chair of the Landmark  
23 Committee for Community Board 3, and I'm reading  
24 the testimony represented Community Board 3,  
25



1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 chairperson Tremaine Wright, Henry Butler, District  
3 Manager.

4 "Dear Chair Landers and the Landmark  
5 Subcommittee:  
6 Community Board 3 and the Bedford-  
7 Stuyvesant/Expanded Stuyvesant Heights Historic  
8 District Community would like to thank the New York  
9 City Council and our esteemed Council Member Albert  
10 Vann for holding this hearing today, August 19th,  
11 2013. This community seeks your acknowledgement  
12 and your commitment to bestow designation to this  
13 historic district today. The designation of the  
14 Bedford-Stuyvesant/Expanded Stuyvesant Heights  
15 Historic District by the City Council will be  
16 beneficial to the present and future generation of  
17 this community because it will preserve the  
18 architectural, social and cultural diversity as  
19 well as the many beautiful and one of a kind  
20 streetscape in our neighborhood.

21 During the nineteenth century, the  
22 community was populated by people of European  
23 descent. By the first World War, African-Americans  
24 and Caribbean-Americans had become a significant  
25 part of the demographic in the neighborhood drawn

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
11070

2 by the high quality housing and lack of  
3 discriminatory practices and purchasing policies.  
4 In the 1920s and the 1930s, Bedford-Stuyvesant  
5 became the focal point of black culture in New York  
6 City. By the 1960s, there was a citywide economic  
7 downturn, discriminatory banking policies and  
8 increase in absentee landlord and political  
9 corruption among other things took a toll on  
10 Bedford-Stuyvesant and many other neighborhoods in  
11 New York City.

12           These practices led to abandonment of  
13 thousands of properties. The Bedford-Stuyvesant  
14 Restoration Corporation, the nation's first and  
15 largest community development corporation was  
16 formed in 1967 to create jobs, rehabilitate  
17 existing housing and construct new residential  
18 building. This effort combined with the subsequent  
19 formation of public and private partnership and  
20 investment by individual home and business owners  
21 brought renewed stability to this historic  
22 neighborhood.

23           The New York Landmark Commission LPC  
24 held its first public hearing on a proposal to  
25 expand the Stuyvesant Heights Historic District in

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
11070  
2 1993, and a second one on August 2nd, 2011  
3 following extensive outreach to the community.

4 On April 16th, 2013, LPC voted to  
5 designate the Bedford-Stuyvesant/Expanded  
6 Stuyvesant Heights Historic District. This  
7 district consists of properties bounded by Halsey  
8 and Macon Street to the north, Fulton Street to the  
9 south, Malcolm X Boulevard to the east and Tompkins  
10 Avenues to the west. The new district surrounds  
11 the 1971 designated 430-building district of  
12 Stuyvesant Heights district. The expanded district  
13 comprised of 825 buildings largely characterized by  
14 architecturally diverse nineteenth century row  
15 house, four- to five-story apartment buildings,  
16 architecturally designed in the Queen Anne, neo-  
17 Grec, Romanesque Revival and Renaissance Revival  
18 style. We are excited that this community  
19 continues to stand with unity, pride and dignity,  
20 all the while fighting for the common cause to  
21 become a designated district. Homeowners conducted  
22 extensive outreach while the Community Board 3  
23 Landmark Committee, our elected official Councilman  
24 Vann, Borough President Marty Markowitz, retired  
25 Congressman Edolphus Towns, State Senator

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
ITCFE

2 Velmanette Montgomery and many others proved  
3 steadfast in their unbending support to help the  
4 community move the designation process forward.

5           The community did not do this alone.  
6 They called upon the Landmark Preservation  
7 Commission seeking education information about the  
8 landmarking guidelines and the rules and  
9 regulations. We commend the Landmarks  
10 Preservation, Commissioner Robert Butera (SP?) and  
11 his staff with particular thanks to Kate Dailey,  
12 Jenny Fernandez, Marybeth Betts (SP?) and others.  
13 They have been astounding in their efforts to  
14 preserve the many historic districts and individual  
15 landmarks throughout the city. They have made  
16 these accomplishments with limited resources and  
17 staff. We thank you for your commitment. We look  
18 forward to partnering with LPC on the designation  
19 of Bedford Historic District and the future  
20 designation efforts with Stuyvesant East, North and  
21 West. We commend the Historic District Council and  
22 the New York Landmark Conservancies for their  
23 undying support and allotting time to this  
24 community when called upon to speak and answer  
25 questions at the many public informational forums.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
11070

2 Today, August 19th, 2013, is a great day in New  
3 York City designation history for any historic  
4 district to be considered for designation by the  
5 New York City Council. Today is a great day for  
6 the Bedford-Stuyvesant/Expanded Stuyvesant Heights  
7 Historic District because we're looking to become  
8 designated as one of New York's pristine and unique  
9 historic districts. Let the record show that this  
10 community is proud to be counted among the 31 or  
11 more Brooklyn pristine and unique historic  
12 districts already designated by the Landmarks  
13 Preservation Commission.

14 Further, this designation will booster  
15 our community's credence and recognition as we  
16 will... therefore, I'm sorry, as we will thereafter  
17 be one of three historic district designations  
18 within Bedford-Stuyvesant/Brooklyn. We'd like to  
19 thank you for your time and consideration.

20 Sincerely, Tremaine S. Wright,  
21 Chairperson, Community Board 3."

22 BLAIRE WALSH: Good morning, Council  
23 Members. I'm Blaire Walsh speaking on behalf of  
24 the New York Landmarks Conservancy.

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
HERE

2 The Conservancy strongly supports the  
3 designation of the Expanded Stuyvesant Heights  
4 Historic District. We're pleased to join with  
5 residents, public officials and preservationists in  
6 doing so. I'd like to reiterate that the interest  
7 in this extension came from the community, and the  
8 designation filed dozens of meetings.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Is the mic on,  
10 yeah. I don't think she turned it on.

11 BLAIRE WALSH: I think it's on. The  
12 light's on. The designation followed dozens of  
13 meetings where residents and owners heard from  
14 their own neighbors, the Commission and advocates  
15 and asked many thoughtful questions. Like the  
16 original Stuyvesant Heights Historic District, the  
17 extension is an extraordinary collection of  
18 architectural treasures with attractive  
19 streetscapes and a vivid sense of place. The  
20 groups of houses and apartments that comprise the  
21 district feature a dazzling array of the styles  
22 from the late nineteenth and early twentieth  
23 century. While there have been alterations, the  
24 rows retain their low-scale original materials and  
25 attractive details. The sense of place is

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 heightened by a strong sense of community with  
3 landscaping that competes for the greenest block in  
4 Brooklyn and families that have owned their homes  
5 for generations.

6 The Conservancy knows this area very  
7 well. Over the years we have received over 350  
8 inquiries from Bedford-Stuyvesant residents, gone  
9 on dozens of site visits and spoken at community  
10 meetings. We've completed over 20 projects funded  
11 with low interest loans to homeowners and grants to  
12 religious properties. Those were mostly within the  
13 Stuyvesant Heights Historic District, and there's  
14 little doubt that this designation will spur more  
15 applications and more restoration. The designation  
16 of this expanded district is long over do. The  
17 Stuyvesant Heights community initiated it,  
18 supported it, and achieved it, and now we urge the  
19 Council to affirm it. Thank you for the  
20 opportunity to express the Conservancy's views.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Now mine is not  
22 working. Thank you. Any questions? Thank you.  
23 Okay, the next panel. Frampton Talbert [phonetic],  
24 if I said that wrong, please correct it. Claudette  
25 Brady. And Peri DeFino. State your names for the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 record because I butchered them obviously. Okay,  
3 when you're ready, begin. And make sure the light  
4 is on and that you speak directly into the mic.

5 FRAMPTON TOLBERT: Good afternoon,  
6 Committee Members and Council Member Vann. My name  
7 is Frampton Tolbert. I'm the Deputy Director of  
8 the Historic District Council, and HDC is thrilled  
9 to have the opportunity to speak and support of the  
10 Bedford-Stuyvesant/Expanded Stuyvesant Heights  
11 Historic District.

12 The architectural splendor of this  
13 remarkable Brooklyn neighborhood speaks for itself.  
14 It is one of New York City's richest and most  
15 remarkable collections of nineteenth century row  
16 houses punctuated with some handsome small  
17 apartment buildings and drop dead gorgeous  
18 institutional structures. In addition to the  
19 obvious architectural merit of the area, the  
20 cultural significance of the area is also  
21 noteworthy. Bedford-Stuyvesant is a supreme  
22 example of the enduring value of historic  
23 neighborhoods. Built for immigrant population of  
24 Europeans and New Englanders, it became home to  
25 another newly arriving population during the



1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 ~~ITCFE~~

3 twentieth century transforming into one of the  
4 largest and well-known black neighborhoods in  
5 America. The African and Caribbean-American New  
6 Yorkers who have called this neighborhood home for  
7 almost a century have grown deep roots in the  
8 community, roots which are nurtured by and have  
9 helped protect this fantastic built environment.

10 This community is truly an example of a  
11 lasting value of a historic neighborhood. These  
12 buildings have been home to a generation of New  
13 Yorkers, and with the LPC's oversight, they  
14 remained to become the homes and churches and  
15 gathering places for generations to come. HDC has  
16 had for many years now the pleasure of working  
17 closely with a diverse, intelligent and passionate  
18 group of volunteers from Bedford-Stuyvesant who are  
19 devoted to preserving and protecting their  
20 neighborhood. We would especially like to  
21 acknowledge Council Member Vann, Community Board 3,  
22 including Henry Butler, Landmarks Committee Chair  
23 Evelyn Collier and the other countless supporters  
24 and volunteers, several of whom are here today. It  
25 is to a large extent due to their efforts that we  
have come to today's hearing which by our rough

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
HDC

2 estimate is around the 30th public meeting on this  
3 topic we have participated in, most of which have  
4 been held in church basements, auditoriums and  
5 community meeting rooms in the neighborhood.

6 This popular effort has also received a  
7 great deal of public attention from citywide  
8 newspapers and local blogs, so it would be fair to  
9 say this topic has been very well publicized and  
10 discussed. HDC urges you to support this popular  
11 community driven effort and confirm the landmark  
12 designation of this long awaited historic district.  
13 Thank you.

14 CLAUDETTE BRADY: Good afternoon. My  
15 name is Claudette Brady. I am one of the founders  
16 of the Bedford-Stuyvesant Society for Historic  
17 Preservation.

18 As you all know or have heard before,  
19 the Stuyvesant Heights Expanded District was  
20 originally calendared in 1993; however, LPC did not  
21 move forward on designation at the time because of  
22 lack of consent among community members. Through  
23 the efforts of the local residents and most  
24 significantly Council Member Vann, LPC revisited  
25 the designation in Bedford-Stuyvesant at large in

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 2010 and held a public meeting in February of 2011  
3 and then the later vote on the Stuyvesant Heights  
4 public hearing in later 2000.

5           What I want to speak about today is the  
6 feeling of the residents in the neighborhood about  
7 designation. At the LPC public hearing, the  
8 majority of people, I'd say 99 percent of the  
9 people testifying and all the people testifying  
10 testified in favor, but about 99 percent of those  
11 people testifying were African-Americans between  
12 the ages of 60 and 93. These people spoke of their  
13 homes, their ancestors, their grandparents who  
14 bought these homes in the '30s or the '50s and  
15 struggled through red lining, urban renewal, and  
16 all the plights of the early century and maintained  
17 their homes rather than leaving. Their pride,  
18 their respect for their forbearers, their  
19 sticktoitness [phonetic] in sticking with this  
20 community and making sure that it survived, that it  
21 thrived and designation was the fruition and part  
22 of the culmination of all those efforts. The  
23 stories were heartfelt. I mean I was teary-eyed  
24 and so were actually some of the commissioners at

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
LPC. So this effort, you know, we go to a lot of  
2 public hearings.  
3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Go ahead, sum it  
5 up, sum it up.

6 CLAUDETTE BRADY: We go to a lot of  
7 public hearings and we hearing people talk about  
8 the architecture and the value, but for residents  
9 in Bedford-Stuyvesant, the value, their homes are,  
10 to use the cotton commercial, is part of the fabric  
11 of their lives. It is what keeps them grounded.  
12 It is what keeps us alive as a community. It is  
13 where we spend our lives together on our stoops, so  
14 we want to keep that feeling intact and the  
15 architecture is what grounds us and keeps that  
16 community strong.

17 PERI DEFINO: What she said. My name is  
18 Peri DeFino and I worked with Claudette at the  
19 Bedford-Stuyvesant Society for Historic  
20 Preservation. I've also worked with the Community  
21 Board with outreach to the residents to educate  
22 people as to what it means to be a historic  
23 district, to make sure people knew what it was, and  
24 what I found was that people who lived with  
25 calendaring for so long that everybody was very

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
11070

2 well aware of what it was to be a historic district  
3 and was more than ready for this to happen. So as  
4 a resident, as somebody who's worked with other  
5 residents, I urge you to support designation.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Council Member  
7 Vann?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: I concur. I think  
9 that it's obvious, and I'm very proud of the  
10 involvement of the residents of our community. The  
11 level of their participation, their commitment to  
12 each other and just the whole process was very  
13 illuminating. I attended most of the meetings, if  
14 not all of them, and so I stand with all that  
15 you've heard, all the testimony that you have heard  
16 which has been outstanding, and I'm very proud to  
17 be the representative of Bed-Stuy and the newly  
18 expanded historic district as well. So I ask my  
19 colleagues to be supportive as I know that you will  
20 and approve the designation of this extended  
21 district of Bed-Stuy. Thank you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Thank you,  
23 Council Member. Before I close the hearing on this  
24 item, is there anyone else in the audience who's  
25 here to testify on this item? Okay. With that, we

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
11070

2 close the hearing on this [gavel] portion. And we  
3 are going to vote. A couple to approve Land Use  
4 Number 866, the last that we heard, we're going to  
5 list first Bed-Stuy Expanded Stuyvesant Historic  
6 District, Land Use Number 873 Pier 15 Maritime  
7 Lease, Preconsidered LU Item Designation of  
8 Bialystoker Center and Preconsidered Land Use Item  
9 Surrendering the Goldwater Hospital facility and  
10 property. And we are going to call the vote and we  
11 urge a yes on all items.

12 CITY CLERK: Acting Chair Arroyo?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye on all.

14 CITY CLERK: Council Member Palma?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye on all.

16 CITY CLERK: Council Member Mendez?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Permission to

18 explain to my vote.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Okay.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you.

21 First on Bialystoker, I'm very proud that we're  
22 gonna be able to Landmark that building. It's been  
23 a long time coming and a lot of work from people in  
24 my community, and in terms of Bed-Stuy, the very  
25 eloquent testimony, and I always tell the kids in

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
HERE  
2 my district that we need to know our history, that  
3 our history defines us, and our history is told not  
4 just by what happened in our community and the  
5 lives that people led before but also the buildings  
6 tell our history so congratulations to you all for  
7 all your hard work in the community of Bed-Stuy. I  
8 was in the neighboring community of Williamsburg so  
9 very proud of you all. Thank you very much. Aye  
10 on all.

11 CITY CLERK: By a vote of three of the  
12 affirmative, zero abstentions, and zero negatives,  
13 Land Use Items 866, 873, Preconsidered Land Use  
14 Item...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Okay. So we are  
16 going to, yeah, turn it back to the Chair and we  
17 have two more votes to hear from.

18 CITY CLERK: Chair Lander?

19 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Aye.

20 CITY CLERK: Council Member Williams?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Which one are  
22 we doing, everything?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: We coupled all  
24 the items.

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
11376

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Oh okay. I'm  
3 voting aye. I did hear some rumors about problems  
4 with the landmarking in Bed-Stuy. Nobody was here  
5 to talk about it and I know Council Member Vann has  
6 a storied history with Bed-Stuy and would never do  
7 anything that would harm the community.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: And everyone  
9 testified in favor.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So I'm proud  
11 to vote aye.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Okay.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Madame Chair?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Could I be heard  
16 briefly?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Absolutely.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: I just wanted to  
19 mention for the record how proud I am of the  
20 leadership in Bed-Stuy that made all this happen.  
21 Brother Henry Butler who was here was the Chair of  
22 Community Board 3 at the time. Ms. Evelyn Collier  
23 chaired the Landmarks Preservation Committee, did  
24 an extraordinary job, and you heard from Ms. Brady  
25 that she epitomizes the volunteerism and the spirit



1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
2 of Bed-Stuy, so I'd like to commend all of them as  
3 I commend my entire community for their involvement  
4 and participation in the process.

5 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: And let me just add  
6 my... I want to first apologize for missing the  
7 testimony which I'm sure was deep. People care  
8 about their neighborhoods and as someone who worked  
9 at the Pratt Center for Community Development for  
10 five years or so, the history. I know that folks  
11 at Pratt have been working with the leadership with  
12 Council Member Vann first and foremost and with the  
13 leadership in the community and that the  
14 preservation of that neighborhood in the sense of  
15 its history and its buildings, in the sense of its  
16 economic vitality and in the sense of its people  
17 really come together very nicely in this action  
18 today. So congratulations to Council Member Vann  
19 and all the leadership from Bed-Stuy. A thank you  
20 to Council Member Arroyo for chairing in my  
21 absence.

22 CITY CLERK: By a vote of five in the  
23 affirmative, zero abstentions and zero negatives,  
24 Land Use Items 866, 873 and Preconsidered Land Use  
25 Items Designation of Bialystoker Center and the

1       SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
          rrcpc  
2       surrender of the Goldwater Hospital by HHC are  
3       approved and referred to the full Land Use  
4       committee.

5                   CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very much  
6       [applause]. This meeting of the Subcommittee is  
7       adjourned [gavel].

8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date 08/20/2013

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME  
HCS