

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

-----X

June 20, 2013
Start: 1:12 pm
Recess: 4:59 pm

HELD AT: Council Chambers
City Hall

B E F O R E:
PETER F. VALLONE, JR.
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
Erik Martin Dilan
Helen D. Foster
Daniel R. Garodnick
James F. Gennaro
Vincent J. Gentile
Daniel J. Halloran III
Eric A. Ulrich
David G. Greenfield

APPEARANCES (CONTINUED)

Cas Holloway
Deputy Mayor for Operations
City of New York

Linda Gibbs
Deputy Mayor for Health and Human Services
City of New York

Steven Banks
Chief Attorney
Legal Aid Society

Giselle Routhier
Policy Analyst
Coalition for the Homeless

Michael Stoller
Executive Director
Human Services Counsel

Sara Felsenthal
Metropolitan Council on Jewish Poverty

David Berman
Disaster Services Lead
Food Bank for New York City

Lisa Levy
Policy, Advocacy and Organizing Director
New York City Coalition against Hunger

Juan Camilo Osorio
Director of Research
New York City Environmental Justice Alliance

Christine Rangel
National Electrical Contracting Association

APPEARANCES (CONTINUED)

Jeffrey Frediani
Legislative Analyst
AAA New York

Jose Sogard
Metropolitan Waterfront Alliance

Susan Dooha
Executive Director
Center for Independence of the Disabled

Julia Pinover
Senior Staff Attorney
New York Office of Disability Rights Advocates

Jeff Lieberman
Director
Coalition of Institutionalized, Aging and Disabled

Sophia Carlton
Coalition of Institutionalized, Aging and Disabled

Ruth Finkelstein
New York Academy of Medicine

Patricia Caridad
New York State Nurses' Association

Rabbi Jenice Batitia
Leadership Team
Disaster Chaplaincy Services of New York

Laura Abel
Senior Policy Counsel
Lawyers' Alliance for New York

Mark Ladove
Staff Attorney
New York Lawyers' for the Public Interest

APPEARANCES (CONTINUED)

Grace Oddo
New York State Nurses' Association

1
2 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Welcome
3 everyone to this hearing on the Public Safety
4 Committee. I am back to the Committee room. We
5 have not been in this room in years for a hearing,
6 and it is clearly not big enough. I remembered
7 this being bigger. Sorry about the short delay,
8 but today we are holding an oversight hearing to
9 review the city's Hurricane Sandy after action
10 report and recommendations. Additionally, we will
11 be considering ten pieces of legislation all of
12 which aim at improving the city's response to
13 severe weather events and emergencies. On October
14 29th, as we know super storm Sandy hit. As a
15 result 43 New Yorkers lost their lives, half of
16 those on Staten Island. Tens of thousands were
17 injured, were temporarily or permanently displaced
18 by the storm's impact. In an effort to assess the
19 city's preparation for and response to and the
20 recovery efforts stemming from Sandy, the Council
21 held 11 hearings in January and February of this
22 year. At these hearings, the Council heard
23 testimony from the Mayor's Office and various city
24 agencies, advocates, community members - - gain
25 insight into the city's response. With this

1
2 knowledge, the Council was able to identify
3 shortcomings in the city's response and develop a
4 list of recommendations regarding how the city can
5 better prepare and respond to emergencies. We
6 gave those recommendations to the Mayor's Office
7 and then on May 3rd, Deputy Mayor Cas Holloway and
8 Deputy Mayor Linda Gibbs released the city's
9 Hurricane Sandy after action report. This
10 evaluated the city's response and issued
11 recommendation on how the response could be
12 strengthened in the future. These recommendations
13 focused on six core areas including
14 communications, general and healthcare facility
15 evacuations, public safety, general and special
16 medical needs sheltering, response and recovery
17 logistics and community recovery services. As a
18 result the information obtained at the hearings,
19 the Council recommendations and the
20 administration's plan, the committee is now
21 considering ten bills today aimed at improving the
22 city's response to future emergencies. These
23 bills would require the city's Office of Emergency
24 Management to work with city agency partners and
25 others to improve the city's preparation for these

1
2 type of events, specifically, these bills require
3 OEM to develop strategies and implement the
4 following: Intro 1053 introduced by Council
5 Members Arroyo and Lappin, seeks to create a plan
6 to track the location and medical needs of
7 individuals in special medical needs shelters;
8 Intro 1054 introduced by Council Member Comrie
9 would create a community recovery plan that
10 provides a basic structure for relief operations
11 in the community including - - recovery directors,
12 who would act as a point of contact for residents
13 of community groups; Intro 1065 introduced by
14 Council Members Koppell and Gonzalez would create
15 a plan to identify vulnerable and homebound
16 populations before, during and after emergencies
17 to ensure that they have access to necessary
18 supplies, such as food, water and medicine; Intro
19 1069 introduced by Council Member Oddo would
20 create a plan to ensure that the public has
21 adequate access to food and water; 1070 introduced
22 by Palma creates a plan to ensure that evacuation
23 shelters are properly stocked and adequate for
24 short, medium and long stays; Intro 1072
25 introduced by Council Member Reyna would create a

1
2 recovery plan for small business; 1073 introduced
3 by Council Members Richards, Lappin, and Arroyo
4 would create a plan to improve coordination in the
5 event of evacuations from healthcare facilities;
6 1076 introduced by Council Members Rose and Vacca
7 seeks to create a traffic management plan and 1077
8 introduced by Vacca would create a fuel management
9 plan to ensure access to fuel as well as - -
10 priority in obtaining fuel during such a shortage.
11 In addition, the - - proposed bill introduced by
12 Council Members Rodriguez and Gentile would
13 require OEM to regularly review these plans, the
14 coastal storm plans and any other plans created by
15 the office to make appropriate changes regularly
16 and as necessary. Furthermore, they are required
17 to provide copies of these plans to the Council as
18 well as any proposed changes to the plans
19 determined by these regular reviews. I would like
20 to remind people that prior to Sandy the Public
21 Safety Committee held two hearings, one in '05 and
22 one in '09. In '05, the city had no plan and '09
23 I held another hearing entitled are we ready for a
24 hurricane, and many people made fun of me saying
25 we are never going to have a hurricane, but the

1
2 city had a plan and to its credit, it implemented
3 that plan, and I think lives were saved because
4 they had that plan. Clearly, the plan didn't go
5 far enough, and that is why we are here today to
6 keep improving that plan. I do want to go off
7 topic for a half a second. Two days ago, I walked
8 around the Rockaways with about 20 to 30 members
9 of the community and frankly I was outraged at the
10 lack of progress that is going on in that area. I
11 was appalled that the entire peninsula has been
12 left defenseless. At this late date eight months
13 after Sandy, it is still defenseless to the next
14 storm. Virtually nothing has been done to protect
15 the residents. I watched high tide come right up,
16 right up, just regular high tide to the remains of
17 the boardwalk. The entire peninsula faces--
18 reading from this book, and I am quoting from this
19 book, the entire Rockaway Peninsula faces
20 continued risk of flood and wave action. In the
21 event of a storm, the entire peninsula without
22 additional protection is vulnerable to a storm
23 surge, and yet there has been no beach
24 replenishment, no jetties put in, no dunes put in.
25 there have been small islands of the boardwalk

1
2 that have been completed, but they haven't been
3 made as a barrier by any stretch of the
4 imagination. I don't know why they are just a
5 boardwalk with room underneath it for water to go,
6 and I read this PlanNYC, and it calls for more
7 plans and more studies and we hope to have some
8 beach replenishment started in July and we hope to
9 put up some sort of barrier, which I heard about
10 today, which basically is sandbags along the
11 beach. Eight months after Sandy what I did see
12 are lifeguard stations, which look like spaceships
13 that cost apparently four million dollars each. I
14 was a lifeguard. I never had a station. I didn't
15 need a station, but the city put up lifeguard
16 stations costing millions of dollars before they
17 put up any protection for these stations. I hope
18 these stations float because if a storm hits, they
19 are going to be really expensive lifeboats, and
20 are a complete waste of taxpayer money. Who puts
21 up lifeguard stations before they put up
22 protection for those stations and protection for
23 our businesses? The priorities are out of whack,
24 and I am looking forward to hearing testimony
25 about not just planning, but the implementation of

1
2 these plans and why the people in the Rockaways
3 are still vulnerable after eight months. - -
4 joined by the members of the Public Safety
5 Committee and other people who have bills on
6 today. We have Council Members Palma and Ignizio
7 and Garodnick and Koppell and Oddo, and I know
8 that I mentioned a few of them, so let me go to
9 Council Member Koppell, who is a sponsor of one of
10 the bills for a few short remarks.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Thank you.
12 You have introduced the bills, and I think they
13 all deal with significant problems that were
14 identified in our hearings. As you know, one of
15 the responsibilities of the committee I chair are
16 disability services and there are certainly
17 shortfalls, shortcomings in the response to the
18 disabled, and in fact we heard testimony at the
19 hearing, there was as much as ten days later than
20 people who couldn't leave their homes because of
21 disabilities were finally contacted, and in
22 addition many of the contacts of the disabled were
23 done by voluntary organizations and not for
24 profits. There is nothing wrong with that, but
25 they were uncoordinated. There were efforts made

1
2 by different organizations and different areas and
3 undoubtedly some people were overlooked. There
4 has got to be a coordinated response. I also
5 might mention, Mr. Chairman, that for a number of
6 years long before Sandy, I sponsored similar
7 legislation to the ones being considered today,
8 which looked at providing for a plan to assist
9 disabled individuals in the case of an emergency.
10 I believe and still continue to believe that it
11 would be worthwhile to develop a register of
12 people. Now I know there is some people who are
13 concerned about being put on such a register, and
14 we certainly could have a procedure that if
15 someone didn't want to be on the register, they
16 could be taken off the register. And another
17 concern that has been raised with respect to
18 registers is that people move. Of course people
19 move, but with modern computers and other devices
20 to identify where people are, the fact that
21 someone moves is not a reason not to put them on
22 the list. Either they can be asked to identify
23 themselves when they move or if they have moved
24 and then they are identified, the list can be
25 amended, so I believe that in fact it would be

1
2 wise to have such a register and Bill 1065
3 contemplates the possibility of the creation of
4 such a register and I think that work has to be
5 done to develop such a register as I said. I
6 think safeguards can be incorporated, but I want
7 to make mention of the fact that this is not only
8 for a hurricane. This is where a building catches
9 fire. This is where there is a cutoff of
10 electricity for a period of time to a particular
11 neighborhood. This is where there is a cutoff of
12 water, where there is a water main break. The
13 government should know, relevant agencies should
14 know where there are people that need special help
15 in the case of an emergency, and I think that this
16 bill moves so well in that direction, and I hope
17 that when the plans are created it is created not
18 only for hurricanes, but for any emergency. Thank
19 you.

20 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you.

21 Briefly to Council Member Oddo. I do want to
22 point out that these aren't the first bills that
23 he and I sponsored legislation, which had already
24 been passed, which doubles the penalties and fines
25 for looting in an evacuation zone, so there has

1
2 already been legislation that we passed going out
3 of our investigation.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Mr. Chairman,
5 I just want to make a brief very comment, and that
6 is to say that that Tuesday morning after the
7 storm hit, when we drove down Father Capodanno
8 Boulevard in Staten Island. Those are images that
9 will stay with me to my dying day--stuff that we
10 had only seen in the movie screens and on TV and
11 there was sort of Technicolor in your home
12 community and we still have to move heaven and
13 earth to make sure that that scenario doesn't play
14 itself out. I am appreciative to the
15 administration for the work to date. I recognize
16 that we have a whole lot more to do. I am
17 probably as impatient as anyone in this building
18 in getting the work that needs to be done, and I
19 appreciate the ten bills that are on today. We
20 have six months and two weeks left working
21 together, and I just I want to maximize that time,
22 so I appreciate the cooperation and look forward
23 to passing these bills and doing a whole lot more
24 than that. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

25 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you. A

1
2 few more sponsors have shown up, so I am going to
3 give them an opportunity for a brief opening
4 statement. The testimony by the administration
5 will be lengthy and comprehensive and we have a
6 number of people who have signed up to testify.
7 Remember right now look at your testimony; it is
8 going to be three minutes. We are going to try to
9 limit everyone to three minutes so that everyone
10 can get to speak, so if it is longer than that you
11 are going to have to summarize. We are going to
12 go to Council Member Vacca--Annabel Palma? Jimmy,
13 she waved--would you like to speak or no?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I have been
15 speaking for years. Thank you, Mr. Chair, and
16 thank you - - . I wanted to speak on my bills and
17 we in the Bronx were significantly spared compared
18 to what happened in other boroughs in this city,
19 yet we still had major problems and what we do in
20 the future concerning fuel management and traffic
21 pertains to all of us here in the city of New
22 York. If super storm Sandy taught us anything it
23 is that we need to be better prepared for future
24 disasters. We can't control the weather, but it
25 is absolutely imperative that we learn from our

1
2 prior shortcomings and plan for future states of
3 emergency. I propose two pieces of legislation,
4 Intro 1076, which calls for a traffic management
5 plan in response to emergency conditions and Intro
6 1077, which calls for a fuel management plan. I'd
7 like to thank Council Member Rose for co-
8 sponsoring 1076. As we remember, it was not easy
9 to get around the city following the devastation
10 that super storm Sandy brought. Subways were
11 flooded, were severely damaged. Roads were
12 treacherous and a prolonged power outage
13 victimized our city and left it in the dark.
14 While many of these things were out of our
15 control, 1076 requires OEM to work with other
16 agencies to devise a traffic management plan so
17 that New Yorkers are not left stranded when
18 disaster strikes. The plan would include back up
19 sources of power for traffic signals and street
20 lights, expanded bus and ferry service, alternate
21 bus routing, permitted - - for livery vehicles and
22 better accessible transportation for people with
23 disabilities. While traffic management is key,
24 this plan will be difficult to implement with the
25 fuel management plan proposed in 1077. My bill

1
2 requires OEM to devise a fuel management plan
3 during times of scarcity. In emergency
4 conditions, it is essential that we are able to
5 receive critical fuel supplies. Furthermore, it
6 is important that those limited fuel resources are
7 prioritized for emergency and rescue efforts and
8 other critical infrastructure, so I thank you,
9 Chair Vallone. I thank members of the Committee
10 for their consideration.

11 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Okay.

12 Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank
14 you, Chairman. One thing that we as a city
15 learned is that after Irene and Sandy is that it
16 is in our history to expect that we will be hit
17 major natural disasters every 100 years. all the
18 experts they are saying that we can even be hit
19 every ten years, so we have to continue being more
20 prepared as a city, and that it is why it is so
21 important - - calling on my colleagues to support
22 the Intro that I have to - - Council Member
23 Gentile, 1075, would call for reporting, talking
24 points. The OMB reporting bill will provide full
25 transparency as to how the city government has

1
2 learned from the recent storms and - - the Council
3 to inform our constituency of our emergency
4 preparedness and how agencies will cope with large
5 scale emergencies. As such this bill is a forward
6 thinking policy that if implemented will reduce
7 the human and financial costs for coordinated
8 disaster response in our city. So I believe that
9 - - this is a bill that also will allow to learn
10 from previous and future natural disasters so that
11 we can be better prepared and inform our city on
12 what they should do in order to be ready for a
13 potential natural disaster. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Council
15 Member Reyna?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Thank you,
17 Chair Vallone. I just wanted to chime in on the
18 proposed bill that we have in front of us for the
19 small business recovery plan, Intro 1072. In
20 February the Committee on Small Businesses held a
21 public hearing on the state of the small business
22 community post Sandy, and we were amazed at the
23 approximate number of 13,000 plus small businesses
24 accounted for post Hurricane Sandy. Two of the
25 main points that were made very clear by the

1
2 business owners and advocates that testified at
3 that hearing despite best efforts, many impacted
4 businesses did not know that there were resources
5 provided by the city, specifically for businesses
6 in need and two, the city did not have the proper
7 mechanisms in place to identify the most pressing
8 needs of impacted businesses quickly and
9 efficiently. The bill that I have sponsored and
10 that will be discussed today will call upon the
11 city to develop an emergency plan to address those
12 concerns in the small business community. The
13 bill requires the Mayor's Office of Emergency
14 Management to coordinate with the Department of
15 Small Business Services to create a strategy for
16 how the city can predict and prevent damage to
17 businesses and in the event of an emergency to
18 expeditiously assist in the recovery of impacted
19 businesses so that there is a reduction or at best
20 the elimination of any delay. I would like to
21 thank our Speaker for her unwavering leadership
22 post Hurricane Sandy, working with the
23 administration on their efforts in fulfilling the
24 commitment of getting to this point and Chairman
25 Vallone for conducting this hearing and my

1
2 colleagues for the package of bills as we better
3 prepare for any emergency disaster. I would like
4 to thank Jeffrey Campana [phonetic], counsel to
5 the committee and Faith Corbett, policy analyst to
6 my Committee on Small Business. Thank you, Chair.

7 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you.

8 Now we are going to go to our witnesses from the
9 city. I guess we will begin with Deputy Mayor Cas
10 Holloway. Thank you.

11 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Thank you,
12 and good afternoon everybody. Good afternoon,
13 Chairman Vallone and other members of the Council.
14 Thank you for having me here today to talk about
15 the progress we have made evaluation the city's
16 response to Hurricane Sandy and our roadmap to
17 improve our operations for the next coastal storm
18 and other severe weather events. I am joined
19 today by Deputy Mayor for Health and Human
20 Services, Linda Gibbs, who co-chaired the city's
21 post storm review, and when I testified before the
22 City Council in January of this year, I committed
23 that we would review every aspect of the city's
24 preparation for and immediate response to
25 Hurricane Sandy including the operations to clear

1 debris, de-water infrastructure and housing,
2 provide temporary power to critical facilities and
3 housing with generators, assess damage to
4 structures and effected areas and provide relief
5 by distributing food and water, medical care and
6 supplies to thousands of New Yorkers. We have
7 fulfilled that commitment on May 3rd when Deputy
8 Mayor Gibbs and I released the Hurricane Sandy
9 after action report here. It contains 59 specific
10 recommendations in six categories that Chairman
11 Vallone you described and they are designed to
12 strengthen the city's capacity to respond to
13 future coastal storms. The after action report is
14 the product of a rigorous collaborative process
15 with more than 125 city employees who work for
16 more than two dozen city agencies and offices. In
17 addition to input from frontline responders and
18 agency managers, the Council held comprehensive
19 hearings about Sandy earlier this year, some of
20 which were discussed in opening statements. You
21 shared many of your findings with us and thanks
22 very much to the very great work of the staff who
23 put together very intensive summaries of those
24 hearings. Thank you for your thoughtful attention
25

1
2 and feedback. In comparing the Council's
3 recommendations with our report, a majority are
4 completely aligned with our findings. Our other
5 recommendations seek to achieve goals that we also
6 identified in our review, but differ on the terms
7 of proposed implementation and other details.

8 Some brief context. Hurricane Sandy was a
9 devastating storm that tragically took the lives
10 of 43 New Yorkers and severely impacted thousands
11 of families. The details of the storm and its
12 impacts are already well chronicled and I won't
13 recount them here except to direct you to the long
14 term resiliency plan that Mayor Bloomberg released
15 on June 11th. We call it a stronger, more
16 resilient New York, and it is available on
17 nyc.gov, and if you know who to talk to you, you
18 might be able to get a copy. Taken together the
19 after action review and the mayor's resiliency
20 plan provide a detailed roadmap to first
21 strengthen the city's emergency preparedness and
22 response to future disasters; second, understand
23 the full impacts of Hurricane Sandy on the city
24 and future climate change impacts New Yorkers can
25 expect; and third, the concrete steps we can take

1
2 in the immediate, medium and long term to prepare
3 the city to weather these impacts, and just with
4 respect to this plan which Chairman Vallone, you
5 referenced at the beginning as a book, this is a
6 comprehensive plan, not just a report that has 250
7 initiatives in it. It is true that some of them
8 require plans because planning is important. Many
9 of them though chronicle things that we are
10 already doing including on the Rockaway Peninsula
11 where for example, the 1.5 million cubic yards of
12 sand that Sandy took away from beaches along the
13 Rockaways is going to start to be replaced by
14 three and a half cubic tons of sand as of two
15 weeks from now. All of the 35 lifeguard stations
16 that were destroyed as a result of Sandy have been
17 replaced. It is true far from being a waste of
18 taxpayer money though, all of those have been
19 elevated and replaced so that the beaches could be
20 opened in time for this year's summer season,
21 which I think considering millions of New Yorkers
22 use those beaches for the entire summer that is
23 probably a pretty good investment of money. We
24 also have dozens of other initiatives in the
25 Rockaways, all of which are chronicled. In

1
2 addition for all of the neighborhoods that were
3 hardest hit by Sandy, you will find in this report
4 and plan which I submit is probably the most
5 comprehensive plan of its type that has ever been
6 done, and it was done in seven months and that is
7 thanks to Seth Pinsky and a team of 30 professions
8 we put together, they detail the history of the
9 neighborhoods most heavily impacted, their
10 geography, what Sandy did to them, the
11 infrastructure that was impacted, the economic
12 impact and a full demographic breakdown in
13 addition to very detailed initiatives, many of
14 which are already underway in terms of bringing
15 resources to those neighborhoods, so I should
16 start by saying that while this is about a report
17 of an after action plan and since in opening
18 statements you referenced the SIRR review we are
19 doing far more than writing words on paper. In
20 fact we are not just planning. We are acting.
21 The United States Department of Housing and Urban
22 Development has approved the city's action plan A,
23 which outlines how we will spend the first
24 installment of 1.77 billion in federal relief aid
25 to assist many New Yorkers impacted by the storm

1
2 as possible and better prepare the city for the
3 next storm and other climate related impacts. In
4 fact on June 3rd, the mayor launched build it back,
5 the city's program to assist homeowners, landlords
6 and tenants that is currently accepting
7 registration on nyc.gov and 311. As of 8 am this
8 morning in fact and Council Member Oddo, you were
9 there, the announcement of this, we were in Staten
10 Island together, 9,000 property owners and tenants
11 have registered for build it back, all of which
12 has about four or five separate programs, all of
13 those are on schedule, and we are helping business
14 owners recover too. Today we have approved more
15 than 650 loans totaling nearly 15 million and we
16 have waived three and a half million in sales
17 taxes related to 157 million of rebuilding work by
18 nearly 100 businesses. We are also accepting the
19 applications for loans in federal relief funds and
20 expect to begin issuing those loans shortly from
21 our action plan. Now, turning to the after action
22 report specifically, which again is about the
23 immediate preparations for and response to the
24 storm itself by the city, it is a high level
25 summary of recommended improvements to the city's

1 operations before, during and after the storm. It
2 is not intended to be and it is not an exhaustive
3 list of all lessons learned and internal
4 adjustments that city agencies will make and in
5 many cases already have made to staffing,
6 communications, and deployment of resources. The
7 report has been online for several months and I
8 have actually spoken myself extensively about it,
9 each with some of the members here individually,
10 so I am not going to summarize every
11 recommendation, but I would like to highlight a
12 few that will illustrate the breadth and depth of
13 the effort. First on updated hurricane evacuation
14 zones, one of the key recommendations was to
15 review and update the evacuation maps and zones
16 that are a critical component of the city's
17 comprehensive coastal storm plan. This past
18 Tuesday OEM Commissioner, Joe Bruno and I released
19 new hurricane evacuation zones that reflect more
20 sophisticated modeling and forecasting from the
21 National Weather Service than was previously
22 available. The evacuation zones on the pre-Sandy
23 maps are correspondent to the anticipated flooding
24 caused by hurricanes categorized on what is the
25

1 Saffir-Simpson Hurricane Wind Scale. One of the
2 major differences between Hurricane Sandy and
3 Irene that explains their vastly different impacts
4 on the city was the different bearings of those
5 storms, specifically the direction and strength of
6 the storm winds as Sandy approached and ultimately
7 struck the city, and in fact, the first chapter of
8 the SIRR report is a detailed analysis of exactly
9 how this storm formed and impacted the city, and I
10 strongly encourage you if you want to understand
11 why it was so unique and powerful in its impacts
12 to review that chapter. Based on this updated
13 modeling a Category 1 hurricane heading
14 north/northwest would have impacts similar to a
15 Category 2 storm brewing north/northeast. These
16 more finely calibrated evacuation zones will allow
17 the mayor to more effectively communicate with and
18 evacuate those residents who are most at risk
19 based on the characteristics of a particular
20 storm. During Sandy, we saw that many New Yorkers
21 who live in an evacuation zone did not follow the
22 mayor's instruction to evacuate in advance of the
23 storm. In fact a survey we conducted as part of
24 our after action review shows that people decided
25

1
2 not to evacuate for a number of reasons ranging
3 from concern about personal property to a believe
4 that their homes were well-built and could
5 withstand the impact of a storm. Tragically we
6 saw that that was too often not the case. In
7 connection with release of the new maps, OEM is
8 update its ready New York hurricane guide in 11
9 languages and a copy will be mailed to every home
10 and business in the evacuation zones later this
11 month. We are also working with community groups
12 and organizations to raise awareness of the zones
13 and emergency preparedness in these areas, and
14 while these efforts should help us to boost
15 compliance with an evacuation order next time,
16 anything that the Council can do generally and
17 specifically to spread the word particularly
18 members who represent New Yorkers who live in
19 those zones would be greatly appreciated.

20 Improved healthcare facility evacuations, one of
21 the findings in our after action review was that
22 not enough of the health care facilities from
23 hospitals to senior centers to other special needs
24 facilities had adequate emergency preparation
25 plans either to shelter in place or to evacuate

1
2 both before and after the storm. New York State
3 regulates healthcare facilities and requires that
4 nursing homes and hospitals have a backup power
5 source to allow them to shelter in place and
6 continue services in the event of a power outage.
7 The city's special medical needs shelters are
8 intended to serve individuals who do not live in
9 or receive care from those facilities, but who
10 require more resources than what are available at
11 general evacuation shelters. In the case of
12 Sandy, we saw that special medical needs shelters
13 became a last resort placement option for licensed
14 facilities that were unable to shelter in place or
15 evacuate their residents to another location to
16 limit the disruption to care and risk of the
17 increased morbidity associated with healthcare
18 facility evacuations, a concern that I highlighted
19 in my testimony in January and Dr. Farley did as
20 well, and that is discussed in our after action
21 review. We committed to work with the state
22 Department of Health to enforce existing
23 regulations for minimum facility standards--

24 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: [interposing]

25 Can you please make sure that they don't use that

1 door that they come through that door on the side?

2 Thank you.

3
4 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Thank you.

5 ...Department of Health to enforce existing
6 regulations for minimum facility standards and
7 evacuation planning and to develop any new
8 regulations necessary to fill gaps in the existing
9 regulatory framework.

10 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Excuse me.

11 Standing inside the door is not going to do it.
12 Someone has to go outside and make sure that they
13 know that and put a barrier up there. Thank you.

14 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Additional
15 public safety assets, the city had approximately
16 120 light towers on hand immediately after the
17 storm to maintain public safety and continue
18 recovery efforts after dark in the areas that lost
19 power. Given the scope of the power outages Sandy
20 caused across the city, it is clear that we need
21 more light towers and other assets available in
22 future emergencies. Just yesterday I reviewed an
23 acquisition plan with chief fleet officer Keith
24 Kerrman [phonetic], who works in the Department of
25 Citywide Administrative Services, and we are

1
2 already moving forward with the purchase of 26
3 million dollars of equipment which includes 200
4 light towers, 35 fuel trucks and 60 forklifts. In
5 fact I was out in Flushing Meadows Park at the
6 annual fleet show that we do, and saw there are
7 actually some solar light trucks that we are going
8 to be getting as part of these 200 additional
9 light towers for use by the police department and
10 public safety agencies. In addition, the police
11 and fire departments are purchasing boats and
12 other assets to increase their response capacity
13 in future emergencies. Better data integration
14 and coordination, field data about on the ground
15 conditions was critical to target response
16 operations where they were needed most. For
17 example, matching HPD's records of high density
18 buildings with utility data enabled us to quickly
19 identify high density buildings without critical
20 services--heat, light and power. This and many
21 other data collection and analytics efforts
22 generally expedited recovery efforts, and in fact
23 it was those efforts that gave rise to one of the
24 more successful immediately post storm programs
25 rapid repairs, in which we decided rather than

1
2 bringing temporary shelters like trailers in, we
3 would try to get people back in their homes. FEMA
4 worked with us to help us to do that, and is
5 paying for it, and we ultimately made repairs to
6 20,000 residential units. In this year's state of
7 the city address highlighting the importance of
8 the data and analytics that made those kinds of
9 initiatives possible, Mayor Bloomberg appointed
10 Mike Flowers to the newly created position of
11 chief data and analytics officer. In this role,
12 Flowers and his team are pulling and synthesizing
13 data from dozens of agencies and scores of data
14 sources to increase our understanding of
15 properties and infrastructure that could lead to
16 problems down the road or in an emergency. In
17 fact, the recently activated risk based inspection
18 system at the fire department is a prominent
19 example. Based on an algorithm developed with
20 firefighters, officers and other indicators, for
21 example, age, construction, and use of a building
22 fire suppression and egress systems, the new
23 system dramatically increases the likelihood that
24 fire companies will be directed to inspect those
25 buildings that present the greatest risks. The

1
2 point of this example is that by using multiple
3 data sources to find out where you could see the
4 highest risk locations or where problems would
5 exist you can allocate resources more efficiently.
6 There is no time that that is more important than
7 in an emergency. The conditions immediately after
8 Sandy required massive around the clock recovery
9 and relief operations spread over a large
10 geographic area that encompassed communities in
11 all five boroughs. City employees worked
12 tirelessly to manage the logistics of de-watering
13 buildings and infrastructure, placing generators
14 at hospitals and nursing homes, distributing food
15 and water and instituting high occupancy vehicle
16 lanes when other transit options were not
17 available among many other roles. Some
18 preparation and response operations like
19 activating the evacuation shelter system proceeded
20 almost seamlessly because of experience gained
21 from Hurricane Irene as well as training and
22 intensive planning in advance of the storm.
23 Others while successful were developed in a
24 comparatively ad hoc way based on operational
25 need. Through the after action review Linda and I

1
2 concluded along with many others that a number of
3 these operations should be codified in what we
4 called in our review playbooks, written plans that
5 detail a strategy and implementation plan to
6 deliver a service or services following an
7 emergency that can be activated in advance of a
8 coastal storm or other event. Playbooks currently
9 in development include a food and water
10 distribution plan, a fuel and transportation plan,
11 as I believe Council Member Vacca discussed, a de-
12 watering and generator plan and a volunteer and
13 donation management plan. There is a voluntary
14 and special medical needs plan as well, Council
15 Member Koppell. We are currently meeting with
16 stakeholder agencies to put many elements in as
17 many of these plans in place as possible by the
18 beginning of the New York City hurricane season on
19 August 1st. June 1st is on the National Weather
20 Service's calendar as the beginning of hurricane
21 season in New York City as a practical matter. We
22 don't see the temperatures and kind of conditions
23 that can give rise to those kinds of storms until
24 August--at least not so far. These are just a few
25 examples of the recommendations in the after

1
2 action report. If there is an area I neglected to
3 mention or cover, please raise it in the questions
4 and answers following my testimony. I will turn
5 now to the proposed bills, many of which seek to
6 legislate the creation of the additional plans or
7 playbooks that I just described. I'd like to
8 begin with a heartfelt thank you to Speaker Quinn
9 in particular and her team as well as you, members
10 here before me and many other members of the City
11 Council who worked throughout the storm with Linda
12 and I to--and we were really side by side out in
13 the boroughs, at OEM, in many places at every part
14 of the city helping New Yorkers respond and we
15 witnessed together how quickly conditions change
16 on the ground and how important it is to have
17 flexible options to meet the most critical needs.
18 Indeed, that is precisely why the coastal storm
19 plan has a modular framework that allows for
20 flexible activation at the discretion of the
21 mayor, his senior staff and commissioners and the
22 seasoned managers and public servants responsible
23 for everything from policing to sanitation to in
24 Linda's case navigating complex human and
25 emergency service processes. The general

1
2 observation at the outset with the exception of
3 Intro 1075 the so called reporting bill and Intro
4 1073, the special medical needs evacuation bill,
5 which I will address shortly, the administration
6 supports the general goals of these bills, and we
7 recognize that additional planning is needed in
8 these areas in the form of additions or
9 refinements to the existing coastal storm plan.
10 As currently drafted and as we have made clear to
11 Council staff in advance of this hearing, so no
12 surprises, many of the bills however, seek to
13 legislate to a level of detail and impose layers
14 of iterative oversight that we believe we
15 inappropriate, unworkable and will actually
16 decelerate and delay future emergency responses
17 rather than accelerate them. They are
18 inappropriate because the details and
19 responsibility for implementation are properly a
20 function of the mayor and his or her staff and
21 responding agency personnel, unworkable because
22 this level of detail will either prevent the
23 planning and execution of a successful response
24 plan or else the law will be ignored--I know the
25 Council wouldn't want that to happen--and a

1
2 decelerate [phonetic] because the requirements of
3 the law in the face of unanticipated or ill-suited
4 circumstances will at best create confusion and
5 delay and at worse create a bureaucratic tendency
6 toward mindless and ineffectual adherence.

7 Unnecessary perquisite to maintaining public
8 safety is the ability to bring to bear the
9 expertise, judgment and discretion that first
10 responders, emergency managers, healthcare
11 professionals and dozens of other city employees
12 in managerial and line level positions are hired
13 and trained to provide. That includes established
14 the operations necessary to provide dozens of
15 services in a manner best suited to the particular
16 circumstances of an event and not in a matter
17 dictated by a rule or law. Rather than address
18 each bill individually, I will discuss our general
19 concerns as they apply to the group and let me say
20 that I do believe most of these issues can be
21 addressed through basically markup sessions
22 between our staff and the Council staff, as long
23 as you are willing to do that. The level of
24 detail included in the legislative plans,
25 emergency plans are not assembly manuals, they

1
2 must be flexible enough to accommodate particular
3 circumstances and cannot rigidly prescribe how the
4 mayor and city responders must react to every
5 condition triggered by severe weather. Our first
6 concern about this set of bills is a level of
7 detail and specificity that far surpasses what is
8 practicable. For example, the community recovery
9 plan would have us set requirements for the exact
10 criteria of how to select a borough recovery
11 director and a deputy borough recovery director.
12 It would have us detail their roles and points of
13 contact for generator placements, debris removals,
14 shelter options, operations, food and water
15 distribution, household item distribution and
16 medical services deployment. This level of
17 specificity ignores the reality that future
18 emergencies will likely require different
19 community services with different leadership
20 structure than what was put in place during Sandy
21 as effective as they may have been. Or that at
22 best the person for the job might have a different
23 background from the borough recover directors who
24 Mayor Bloomberg appointed following the most
25 recent storm. The shelter plan required under

1
2 Intro 1070 legislates the specific mechanism by
3 which outgoing shelter staff must transition to
4 incoming staff. Like the hearings that produced
5 this legislation our after action review found
6 room for improvement in shelter staffing
7 operations, and we have committed to developing a
8 plan to shorten how long congregative evacuation
9 shelters remain open, so let me be clear we agree.
10 Improvements need to be made to the shelter
11 staffing process, but the requirements in the bill
12 are unduly prescriptive and they single out just
13 one of many elements in a shelter plan. The bill
14 calls for the assignment of an OEM staff member at
15 every evacuation shelter effectively eliminating
16 the ability of the OEM commissioner to direct
17 agency operations or the mayor or other senior
18 managers to decide which staff are best suited to
19 which assignments, and let me just offer personal
20 observation that overly prescribing at the staff
21 level who should do what would make things really
22 difficult unless you made a decision in the
23 executive capacity that you just were going to
24 take it as advisory and then do what was best, but
25 I assume that is not what the Council has in mind.

1
2 So the city's non-profit service providers and
3 advocacy groups took over food and water
4 distribution for the city as we transitioned from
5 immediate relief to ongoing recovery. This
6 transition worked well and we expect to
7 memorialize it in the food and water distribution
8 plan that we are developing; however, the food and
9 water plan requires detailed logistics, planning
10 and execution that will depend on the specific
11 incident. For example whether the affected areas
12 have power, the impact of the incident on regional
13 transportation and that supplies the city with
14 food and the needs of effected communities. As
15 written this bill would not allow the city to
16 focus recovery efforts where they are most needed
17 because it adds the additional obligation of
18 supporting food pantries, soup kitchens and food
19 benefits programs without consideration of whether
20 or not these providers will have the greatest
21 impact where help is needed the most. This bill
22 would have us sacrifice valuable time to figure
23 out the questions such as whether a building that
24 houses one of these providers has power, is
25 structurally sound and is accessible by available

1
2 means of transportation, another personal
3 observation. The identification of buildings,
4 residences and other facilities without power or
5 the prioritization of what was going to be
6 repowered and how was probably one of the tasks
7 that consumed the greatest amount of my time
8 immediately after the storm, and while we
9 certainly need to develop a plan and our after
10 action report contemplates that and we are happy
11 to be ordered to do so in a bill. The level of
12 detail that is included in the bill has to be
13 carefully balanced between wanting to have a plan
14 that you can know what is going to happen or know
15 that that need that was done in an ad hoc way this
16 time around is going to be addressed and you are
17 going to be able to do things in advance the next
18 time around and deciding that the bill is going to
19 decide how you are going to execute that. So that
20 is the theme that runs through the
21 administration's objections to most of the bills,
22 and again, these are details that I think the
23 quickest fix to many of them is just strip out
24 some of the detail, and we will produce the plan
25 and we will take your feedback. Pre-

1
2 identification of resources and locations and the
3 need for confidentially, the effects of Hurricane
4 Sandy were most severe in the communications - -
5 Jamaica Bay, and eastern shores of Staten Island
6 and Lower Manhattan. One thing we learned while
7 researching a stronger more resilient New York was
8 if the storm had had during a different period in
9 the tide cycle, the Bronx and northern Queens
10 would have borne the brunt of the damage. I note
11 this to illustrate the futility of committing to
12 use pre-identified resources and locations for
13 recovery operations, not to mention the planning
14 and other resources that would be wasted in doing
15 so. Recovery operations must be adapted to the
16 circumstances on the ground. Without mass transit
17 or fuel even a quarter of a mile is an
18 insurmountable distance for some and city agencies
19 cannot be bound by two locations are forced to
20 make personnel assignments dictated by a law that
21 has no connection to the facts. Moreover, pre-
22 identifying and publishing the locations of assets
23 and staging areas presents a public safety hazard
24 by introducing the risk that New Yorkers seeking
25 shelter would arrive at a shelter that had not

1
2 been opened or that people seeking food would
3 arrive at a location that had not been activated.
4 Unfortunately, we must also consider that people
5 with malicious intent could use this information
6 to damage facilities that are critical to city
7 operations. This is also true for fuel sites,
8 evacuation routes and transportation routes for
9 priority goods and services. This is not to
10 suggest that any reporting would be unduly
11 burdensome. A number of city agencies including
12 the NYPD have regular reporting requirements to
13 the Council and have protocols in place to redact
14 certain types of information and to limit how the
15 documents are distributed. It is imperative that
16 these sites or protections be applied to any
17 emergency plan that is shared with the Council,
18 and I believe that we did develop such an
19 effective way of transmitting information even
20 with the current coastal storm plan before the
21 hearings in January. Registry and--before I move
22 on to the registry of vulnerable and homebound
23 individuals maybe a summary 'cause these are the
24 areas on which as a practical matter there is no
25 plan that you are asking us to develop except for

1
2 the evacuation plan that I will talk about in a
3 minute for special and medical needs people that
4 we object to and nor do we object to being
5 legislated, but this balance between the detail
6 and flexibility and what is actually being asked
7 for in the law is extremely important, and while
8 all of us here to a person actually went through
9 the storm experience once you legislate things
10 like this, and I have seen this in the application
11 of rules by other government agencies, they will
12 follow the rule before they will think
13 independently about what is going to best meet the
14 circumstances of the situation, and that is
15 something that we definitely do not want. New
16 York City is famous for not doing that. We don't
17 want to start doing it. In the months after the
18 storm, the city - - with the National Guard and
19 nonprofit and voluntary organizations to go door
20 to door to check on the well-being of the city's
21 homebound residents in areas without power.
22 Although this operation was one of the most
23 important ways in which provided necessary food,
24 water and household items and medical care to some
25 of the city's most vulnerable residents, we cannot

1 support the creation of a standing registry of
2 citizens who may require care at their homes
3 during and after an emergency. FEMA and the
4 Department of Homeland Security Office of Civil
5 Rights and Civil Liberties in fact has published
6 guidance about the limitations of registries for
7 special medical needs and vulnerable populations,
8 including "that registries should not be used as a
9 master tool for first responders and that the
10 smaller the community, the more effective the
11 registry." Unfortunately, that doesn't really
12 apply to New York. For these reasons we do not
13 think that a registry is a viable solution to the
14 challenge of providing care to homebound and other
15 vulnerable individuals in a city as large as New
16 York, though the plan we are drafting will
17 certainly address this challenge through other
18 strategies and again, it is not that we--we
19 understand that you have to be able to identify
20 people with special needs. The specific remedy is
21 the question, and one more thing. We have
22 registries that are very effective. For example,
23 the World Trade Center healthcare registry. It
24 also is true that we have invested millions and
25

1
2 millions of dollars in making that effective, and
3 it is a fixed comparatively population that we
4 followed for years. This is a much different
5 thing, and so if it is going to be required, you
6 need to keep in mind the level of resources that
7 it would take to do something which in our view
8 one of the biggest problems with it is it
9 essentially becomes obsolete from the minute it
10 gets finished, and so that is one of the most
11 significant objections we have. I am going to
12 turn now to the two specific, probably more
13 significant objections or issues--regulatory
14 authority of the special medical needs evacuation
15 bill and duplication of work for the special
16 medication needs tracking bill. As I described in
17 my testimony on January 16th, the city collocated
18 many operations with our partners in the state and
19 federal governments. One example is the state
20 Department of Health, the regulatory authority
21 over healthcare facilities who worked from the
22 healthcare evacuation center at the OEM emergency
23 operations center. Based on the experience that
24 many facilities that are required to have systems
25 in place to allow them to shelter in place did not

1
2 have those systems in place or that those systems
3 were inadequate, the city committed in our after
4 action report to work with the state to hold
5 facilities responsible for meeting the existing
6 requirements for backup power and patient
7 tracking--the subject of two of the considered
8 bills. Linda and I both have dealt with
9 Commissioner - - in the state Department of
10 Health, and it is obviously a priority for them as
11 well. Although we are firm in our commitment to
12 better preparing health care facilities for severe
13 weather events, the city does not have the
14 jurisdictional authority to implement the measure
15 of the special medical needs evacuation bill and
16 must oppose it. Furthermore, on June 5th, Governor
17 Cuomo announced the New York State evacuation of
18 facilities and disasters system also known as the
19 New York State e-fines [phonetic], which will
20 largely fulfill the goal of the tracking bill. I
21 urge the Council to work with us to form an
22 appropriate solution for achieving these goals in
23 a way that does not give rise to a battle between
24 the city's administrative code and New York State
25 law or that duplicates the efforts of a parallel

1 state agency. Threshold for activation and
2 reporting, many of the city's weather related
3 emergency plans are activated frequently and
4 without need for significant review after every
5 activation. For example a personal favorite, the
6 flash flood warning plan, was activated three
7 separate times during the weekend of June 22nd and
8 23rd. This is not uncommon during--last year that
9 is. This is not uncommon during New York City's
10 hot and humid summers. As former DEP
11 commissioner, the flash flood activation plan was
12 the most often activated plan, and it is a good
13 example of how the reporting bill would impose an
14 impractical and burdensome obligation if required
15 to assess the adequacy of this plan after every
16 activation. In its current form--and by the way
17 that is every time that the weather forecast calls
18 for the potential of an inch or more of rain in a
19 60 minute period. In its current form, the
20 reporting bill is unworkable and we have to oppose
21 it. We are very willing to work with the Council
22 to amend the bill as well as of the proposed
23 legislation in all of this legislation in ways
24 consistent with my comments, and I hope you will
25

1
2 work with us to do so. For example, we propose
3 that the reporting bill be limited to the
4 component elements of the coastal storm plan and
5 that the city only be required to notify the
6 Council of material changes to these plans
7 regardless of whether they are made in connection
8 with an activation or for any other reason, and in
9 fact that is one way in which we are suggesting a
10 broader reporting requirement. After the plan is
11 activated of course you are going to want to
12 evaluate what happened in a given situation.
13 Agencies do that all of the time for things big
14 and small. If we are able to draw the right kind
15 of boundaries for what would be required in terms
16 of reporting to you even when those evaluations
17 are done, I am sure that we could come to some
18 kind of an agreement, but it is the case that some
19 of these plans are being looked at in ordinary
20 course or because new leadership or management
21 comes into play, and I presume that the Council
22 would want to have any material change to a plan
23 reported to it regardless of the circumstances
24 under which it was made, so we would certainly be
25 willing to do that as well. Now I have only

1
2 discussed the major themes of our objections to
3 the considered bills. There are many other
4 smaller specific concerns that I am sure as I said
5 can be address on a markup session or two that we
6 stand ready and willing to do. In closing, I want
7 to reiterate that we share almost every one of the
8 goals in the bills, and we are absolutely in
9 alignment on the overall goal, better preparedness
10 going forward and capacity to respond before,
11 during and after an emergency whether expected or
12 unexpected. Thanks for the opportunity to
13 testify. I can't wait to do it again tomorrow.
14 Deputy Mayor Gibbs and I will now answer any
15 questions.

16 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you.
17 Tomorrow if people want to come back we are having
18 a hearing on the 911 system. It should be just as
19 interesting as today's hearing. Very
20 comprehensive thank you. Let me start quickly
21 back with our lifeguard stands. How many
22 lifeguard stands did you say you replaced?

23 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: 35 are
24 planned. I think we are probably in the 30s. I
25 am not sure if we have finished all 35.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: How much did
3 each stand cost?

4 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: I don't
5 know the per stand cost, but I assure you that the
6 cost and design were specifically made to be able
7 to withstand future storms, so they are all
8 elevated, and they are all resilient. Generally
9 we build city infrastructure to last.

10 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: They are all
11 exceptionally ugly, and they are I am told cost
12 between one to four million dollars per stand. I
13 was a lifeguard. You don't need that. You need a
14 wooden stand on a beach. You don't need a four
15 million dollar shack. You need a wooden stand on
16 the beach in order to open a beach. That is all
17 you need--a lifeguard on a stand. You don't need
18 a four million dollar shack. It should not have
19 been a priority to replace shacks when the
20 community is left unguarded.

21 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: I think we
22 will have to just disagree.

23 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: We do. How
24 much of the beach will actually be open?

25 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: What's

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

that?

CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: How much of the Rockaway Beach will actually be open?

DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: The majority. A lot of it is already open, so I can get you the exact numbers, but there are 14 miles of beaches. My understanding is that we have most of that mileage open.

CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: I was down there. I disagree, but we will disagree about that too. I am going to go to my colleagues quick because they are the ones that sponsored the bills, but let me just say this. On page 5 you said our bills are inappropriate because these plans such as our fuel plan are the function of the mayor. The mayor when it comes to the fuel and our gasoline, the mayor had no plan and if you think we should sit back and hope that this mayor has one for the next disaster, that the next mayor has a plan for the next disaster when it comes to fuel, well, we can't. It is too important. He had absolutely no plan, and it is our job to ensure he has a plan and not take your word for it that it is your job and you will have one for the

1
2 next time. He had less than a plan. He didn't
3 seem to care at all about our fuel, and when he
4 finally did mention it, he said, it is in the
5 pipeline, whatever that means to people who are
6 sitting on a four hour gas line and getting a gun
7 drawn on them. He said, one day you will wake up
8 and it will be there. Finally, a week after
9 Jersey, he implemented odd, even. Odd, even isn't
10 a plan. It's a kids' game. So frankly, we don't
11 think we can sit back and wait for the
12 administration to come up with a plan and hope
13 that they have a plan. I understand your other
14 concerns regarding the level of detail of some of
15 this, and I hope that the sponsors will be able to
16 work with you on that because you have some
17 legitimate concerns about the detail that these
18 plans go into and how you will be able to
19 implement that and how that might hurt you, but I
20 think we do need to legislate in a lot of these
21 areas to make sure that future mayors have plans
22 that are in place and that we can review those
23 plans when it comes to borough commissioners and
24 the like, so let me first go to--

25 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY:

1 [interposing] Council Member, if you don't mind, I
2 would just like to respond for a second. I didn't
3 suggest and in fact if you read my testimony, I
4 think probably four or five separate times I said
5 we don't disagree with the goals of making plans,
6 nor do we disagree with legislating the plans.
7 Page 11 of--page 5 that you referred to "however
8 many of the bills seek to legislate to a level of
9 detail and impose layers of iterative oversight
10 that are inappropriate and unworkable. That is
11 saying that the level of detail and iterative
12 oversight in many cases are what is inappropriate,
13 unworkable and will actually frustrate response."
14 That is what I said was inappropriate, and so you
15 know, I took a lot of time to prepare. I'd
16 appreciate it if you would characterize it
17 correctly if you can.

18
19 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Okay. I am
20 reading from the top of page 5 which says they are
21 inappropriate because the details of and
22 responsibility for implementation are properly a
23 function of the mayor and his staff, so--

24 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY:

25 [interposing] Okay. Alright.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: I don't
3 disagree with you about the detail. If I
4 misunderstand that line then I apologize, but it
5 does say responsibility, and I think we have some
6 responsibility. What we are going to do right now
7 is take a two minute break and move next door
8 because I don't like to see people standing, and
9 it is noisy in here. They redid this room and it
10 seems to be a lot noisier than it used to be. In
11 two minutes we are going to start up again next
12 door, so please--thanks.

13 [long pause]

14 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you
15 all. I think everybody has seats, which is good,
16 and we were joined by Council Members Ulrich,
17 Greenfield and Rose and to update everyone we
18 agreed to disagree on lifeguard shacks and some of
19 the language, but we agree completely about the
20 important work to be done and that we want to work
21 together to make sure that that does happen, and
22 we appreciate all the work you have done on this,
23 and then as you said, this is a book. This is a
24 giant book, and I am almost done with it, but you
25 guys have done a ton of work, and we appreciate

1
2 that. We are going to now to Council Member Oddo.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Thank you,
4 Mr. Chairman. Deputy Mayor, I have three minutes,
5 so if it is alright, I am just going to hit you
6 with three questions back to back to back, and
7 then wait for your response. One is sort of
8 overarching. Two are parochial and specific. I
9 appreciate the testimony and the level of
10 specificity, and the overarching question is given
11 everything that you have said and the
12 administration has done, and know that some
13 changes can happen overnight and some rebuilding
14 is multi-year, I am wondering if there is a way
15 that you could calculate how better off we are
16 today--how better prepared we are today for the
17 next hurricane, albeit it not necessarily to the
18 level of Sandy, but if there is a way of sort of
19 summarizing that and the two specific questions
20 have to do with--one has to do with the report.
21 In the Staten Island section there are two
22 recommendations that rightfully suggest that we
23 accelerate a couple of capital projects in Council
24 Member Ignizio's district, and there is a specific
25 reference to pump stations. The second question

1
2 is, can I forward you for your consideration three
3 projects in my district in Sandy-impacted areas
4 that are already on the books that I would ask the
5 administration to take a second look in terms of
6 accelerating including the infamous Mason Avenue
7 pump station that we have talked about in the
8 past? And then the last question I have for you
9 is a few weeks ago during the budget hearing we
10 had the Parks Commissioner come testify and there
11 was an interesting exchange between the agency and
12 myself and the agency and Chairman Recchia about
13 the boardwalk, and we were left with the--at least
14 I was left with the impression that some decisions
15 about the boardwalk, about repairing it are
16 predicated on the Army Corps' study and I was left
17 with the understanding that this isn't about which
18 nail we need to hammer into which piece of wood to
19 repair the boardwalk, but this is a decision we
20 have to make in terms of are we integrating the
21 protection of residents, whether it is the seawall
22 or the levy that the mayor spoke about in the
23 report with the boardwalk, are they separate
24 things? I think the Staten Island public needs to
25 have some clarity about why the boardwalk isn't

1
2 up and if it has to do with protecting residents,
3 then let's be clear of that, and I would gladly
4 stand with the administration because my top
5 priority as much as I love the boardwalk and folks
6 exercising on the boardwalk is the protection of
7 people, so if the boardwalk is not back online
8 because we are trying to figure out how to best
9 protect people, let's just simply tell the public
10 that. Those are my mish mash of three questions.
11 Thank you.

12 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Okay. I am
13 going to answer them in reverse order. So on the
14 boardwalk, first the--I am not familiar with all
15 of the specific details of the exchange, and I
16 will talk to Commissioner White and others about
17 it. I can tell you that there is some significant
18 planning that is required in terms of what we are
19 going to put on the beach. We are moving by I
20 think anyone's measure certainly comparatively,
21 extremely fast to bring back for example, the
22 three and a half million cubic yards of sand in
23 the Rockaways. We are doing emergency nourishment
24 and replacement in Staten Island, and that is not
25 just putting it back the way we found it. We are

1
2 actually going to be doing some significant
3 coastal protection measures too, and I will be
4 happy to send you kind of a detailed list of what
5 is going in. I will get back to you specifically
6 on the boardwalk question. I don't know what
7 would be driving--what decisions have to be made
8 and whether protection is--I am sure it is a
9 question; whether it's a driver, I don't know.
10 Second, Staten Island - - yes, forward any
11 requests for acceleration on the pump stations.
12 Pump stations are a special interest of mine. You
13 know, there are 94 of them that DEP has, and
14 almost 50 of them have already been strengthened
15 and that was in my tenure. Mason Avenue and a
16 couple of others I know we need to deal with. We
17 did and I don't think it's specifically reflected
18 in the book in addition to the projects you
19 mentioned, we are also putting 20 million dollars
20 in to accelerate the mid-island blue belt, and
21 make some special capital investments. So let's
22 look at whether we can do pump stations as well.
23 I think maybe the most important question for this
24 hearing that you asked, and really for the
25 immediate present is how better off are we today?

1
2 Are we ready for hurricane season? The short
3 answer is yes, and so what is being prepared for
4 hurricane season mean now--we have replaced our
5 emergency stockpile. In fact, we have enhanced it
6 with additional supplies based on things that we
7 didn't have enough of or didn't have during Sandy.
8 I don't have the comprehensive list of those
9 things, but I will get them for you. We have our
10 evacuation centers are ready to go. They can be
11 turned on. The thing about a coastal storm is you
12 at least have a few days when you see the storm
13 forming, so I can't say we would open them
14 tomorrow. We would if we had to, but we would
15 open them within the normal number of days. In
16 fact, we are doing surveys of all of those right
17 now, making sure to address there are some
18 specific accessibility issues and things in
19 particular places that we want to make sure we
20 address so that anybody who is disabled or has
21 special needs can get into all of the places.
22 Those are some things that are also addressed more
23 specifically in the after action report. And so
24 activating--if we had to activate the plan based
25 on a storm that showed up on the radar next week,

1
2 we are ready to do that, and it would be a better
3 activation even I think than Sandy; however, we
4 lost a million and a half cubic feet of sand in
5 the Rockaways. We lost millions of cubic feet in
6 other places. We have clearly identified some
7 areas in this report and our recommendations
8 reiterated and enhanced in some places in your
9 legislation and hearings that we need to improve.
10 Not all of those things are going to be fully
11 baked. They are not fully baked today. Some of
12 them will be by August 1st--what if a storm comes
13 before August 1st? But then even after that there
14 are some investments and things that are going to
15 take a little bit longer. So we are definitely
16 not where the post Sandy, post after action report
17 world that we want to get to, but I am confident
18 that we are prepared to activate, and I think one
19 other final note, the new coastal storm zones and
20 the communication of millions of communications
21 that we are sending out now are also critically
22 important. The storm is obviously top of mind in
23 these areas. It can only help that that would be
24 going out even if we hadn't changed the zones, but
25 I think we even have a better plan in that

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

respect.

DEPUTY MAYOR GIBBS: If I can add we have had workgroups that have been meeting throughout the storm and they just never stopped working after their operations shut down and they have been putting the lessons from the storm response into their own sort of outlines for those action plans. We have ongoing meetings where we bring them all together, and so there is a strong exchange across the various workgroups. There is a workgroup for each of the areas of the Council legislation, and so in some cases those are workgroups that are joint city, state groups, and they are under a deadline that we have set for as much as can possibly be completed by August 1st to have that as a significant milestone and then once August 1st passes, we will go on to do all of those things that can't be done by August 1st, so they are just not stopping. If God forbid, a storm happened on July 5th, we would have much of the work already documented and outlined, so even though it is not sort of tied in a bow, it is there and it is ready and probably key is that the key managers that are responsible for action on

1
2 those items have been part of a group that has
3 stayed together, so they would be ready to go just
4 because they have got it in their head.

5 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: We were
6 joined by Council Member Gonzalez, and we are
7 going now for questions to Oliver Koppell.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Thank you,
9 Mr. Chairman. I noted, Deputy Mayor, you made a
10 little comment you don't agree with the idea of
11 creating lists or registries. I had thought that
12 your attitude toward that had changed or the
13 administration's attitude had changed. There was
14 a report in the press to that effect. Are you
15 familiar with an organization or a contractor
16 called Delta Development Group that provides
17 emergency registry lists or assists in compiling
18 them and maintaining them?

19 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: I am not.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Okay. I
21 call it to your attention because I have a report
22 from them and it includes--it's by the way, it is
23 a voluntary registry so people who don't want to
24 go on it don't have to, but they apparently serve
25 the entire state of New Jersey, and they have a

1
2 quote here from the Rockland County fire and
3 emergency services that talks about the value of
4 this. We are very pleased with this invaluable
5 system. it is this system of special needs
6 registry. We are very pleased with this
7 invaluable system because there is one central
8 source of vital information for emergency first
9 responders. This system has eliminated many hours
10 of data entry, antiquated data sharing of vital
11 information. So the fact is that this agency and
12 maybe others, and I am not promoting this agency.
13 I have only heard of it actually this morning, but
14 it indicates it serves a whole bunch of
15 communities. I mention New Jersey and Rockland
16 County, and again, I believe a registry can be
17 created and maintained. It is not necessarily
18 going to be 100 percent accurate, but it is not
19 going to be totally outdated the day after it is
20 created. Furthermore, are you aware that Con
21 Edison, and I believe this is true, but you can
22 tell me whether you know about it, Con Edison
23 maintains a registry of those who are on special
24 life preserving equipment that requires power so
25 that they can be in touch with those people if the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

power goes off?

DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: I am aware that there is some outreach that Con Ed has. I do not know the specifics of whether it is a registry or what they characterize it as. On the general issue, I want to turn it over to Linda.

DEPUTY MAYOR GIBBS: And what I would say is that that is a great example of a potential resource of a variety of types that we want to look to. The idea that has formed in the workgroup discussion through various conversations reaching out with individuals that have experience in managing these type of registries is that you want to create a process so that when your event transpires that you have the ability to access as comprehensive updated and correct, a list of vulnerable populations so that when you are asking people to go out and to reach out to them to do the door to door, to bring them the supplies, to check on highest priorities for supplemental energy needs, whatever the variety of needs are for the different populations that would be includes that you have the most accurate information so people's resources are being used

1 well, and you are not going to ten places where
2 perhaps, there was somebody six months ago who was
3 in a wheelchair, but they are not there anymore.
4 They have moved or they have recovered or they
5 have a different household need going on. So what
6 the recommendation is from FEMA and the Department
7 of Homeland Security Office of Civil Rights and
8 Civil Liberties has said that the lessons that
9 they have found from registries that are voluntary
10 and intend to sort of have that kind of a sign up
11 feature is that because of the movement of the
12 population and the changing of the needs that they
13 do become quickly updated. I know we all agree
14 that we hope that the next storm is not five
15 months from now or five days from now, but five
16 decades from now and actually hopefully never.
17 Right? And so, we really have to think that is
18 really another key recommendation I make is when
19 you think about a registry you have to think about
20 how large and diverse your community is or small,
21 and known your community is and what the frequency
22 of the event is that you are anticipating. I
23 think the bottom line is this is that we believe
24 we need the best process of establishing a way of
25

1
2 quickly identifying the vulnerable populations in
3 advance of a storm so that the moment it hits you
4 are ready--well, in advance that you can provide
5 the warning and the moment you hit, you have the
6 most effective way of using resources to get to
7 those in need. Clearly agree on that.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Well, let
9 me just say that as I indicated in my opening
10 remarks, we are not only talking about a storm,
11 and these days with modern computers and many
12 people having cell phones and other ways of
13 contacting them to update information I believe it
14 should be possible to create a registry that
15 allows to a reasonable degree of reliability that
16 we can identify in these case not only of a storm,
17 of a fire, of a power outage or other--identify
18 populations, and look, admittedly you have to work
19 with that list as best you can, but for instance
20 let's assume you just have a building and a fire
21 in the building and you look in your registry, and
22 it says six people are in wheelchairs, and if the
23 registry has--you have to make an estimate as to
24 whether you can reach those people or not, whether
25 in the wheelchair or not, I am not asking the fire

1
2 individuals, fireman, forewoman to go to an
3 apartment just based on a registry, but knowing
4 that there is a person there, if it is safe to get
5 there, they should go. If they have a cellphone
6 number they should call and find out if the person
7 is there. I am not asking them to risk their
8 lives needlessly, but there are many ways that you
9 can help people who need help without necessarily
10 risking your life because the person might not be
11 there. I think a registry can be helpful, and I
12 think given modern data transmission it can be
13 pretty reliable.

14 DEPUTY MAYOR GIBBS: The way that
15 we actually did this, and so maybe it is just
16 language, the way that we did this is to tap into
17 existing registries of active cases, for instance
18 of the Department for the Aging and adult
19 protective services at HRA, and of the visiting
20 nurse service contracts of a variety of sorts with
21 populations that they were serving, and so those
22 form effectively a registry and they have the
23 benefit of being active and current, and so we
24 knew that those were places that there were active
25 caseworkers that were present in those homes and

1
2 that there were individuals that needed support
3 and services. I think we need to search to see
4 whether there are additional lists that can
5 supplement that so we can have as complete a list
6 as possible.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Just to
8 conclude, I am obviously not your director or your
9 boss in any sense, but what I would urge that you
10 do or you have a staff person do because I have
11 this is contact this Delta Development Group that
12 seems to have prepared these registries in many
13 communities around the country and see how they do
14 it. Thank you. I might say that if I might Mr.
15 Chairman, that Council Member Gonzalez is a co-
16 sponsor of me on - - .

17 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: I didn't give
18 her an opening. She says she has one quick
19 question on this topic, and so she is going to go
20 ahead of some of the other council members who
21 have graciously agreed to let you do that.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Deputy
23 Mayor, I want to tell you that during Sandy I was
24 out in Red Hook. I was out there in the spring
25 with the Office of Emergency Management so that

1
2 folks would prepare. I was out there before
3 evacuating and I was there every single day. And
4 this registry and the reason that I wanted to be a
5 part of this was because I understood there was a
6 need. I really think that we need to look at it
7 together, and if it needs some kind of amendment
8 we could do that, and work on it, but it was very
9 difficult in Red Hook houses for example, to get
10 to the folks in the towers. There were people
11 that waited there a long time. Fortunately, there
12 were incredible people there from the fire
13 department, the police department, there were the
14 national guard, but it took a lot of volunteers
15 and folks to make it up them stairs, and
16 fortunately there were healthy people that could
17 go up and down and bring food to people that
18 needed it because there was no light, there was no
19 water running, so I think that we need to really
20 look at this because it has already happened, and
21 so moving forward, we probably will spend some
22 money, but save some money in the process. Thank
23 you.

24 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you,
25 Council Member. Council Member Greenfield?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank
3 you, Mr. Chairman. Thank you, Deputy Mayors. I
4 want to specifically focus on intro number 1077,
5 and understand what if any objections you have to
6 that. That specifically deals with the fuel
7 challenges, which I think we all know is one of
8 the major challenges that we had after Sandy where
9 there was a serious disruption and shortage of
10 fuel. I guess my question is why--it seems like
11 just from reading your testimony that you would
12 not be supportive of this bill, and I am wondering
13 why not, and how you would approach this
14 particular challenge that we have had.

15 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Do you want
16 1077? I just have the intro numbers memorized. I
17 am sorry.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: It is
19 the bill that deals with the fuel management plan.

20 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Sure. Can
21 you give me one second to... I have the intro. So
22 while I am going through this let me just say I
23 don't have an objection and we do not have an
24 objection to a fuel management plan, and we do not
25 have an objection to a bill that requires that a

1
2 fuel management plan be done, and the overarching-

3 -

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD:

5 [interposing] You do not have an objection then?

6 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: No, no. We
7 don't have an objection to a fuel management plan
8 and we don't have an objection to a bill if it is
9 Intro 1077 with the right amendments to actually
10 do it. The overarching issue that we have and I
11 am not--1077, I didn't go through each intro. I
12 hit on some of the specific details in some of the
13 plans. For example, the requirement that you
14 appoint a borough director and a deputy borough
15 director or that you identify specific community
16 locations and do specific things out of those
17 locations.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I heard
19 that and I understand that. I just - - about this
20 particular piece of legislation though.

21 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: On this
22 particular piece of legislation, I guess the best
23 I can say without is that we are fine with doing a
24 plan. We would want to sit down with you and go
25 through the details and make sure that there is

1
2 not an overly prescriptive level of detail in it,
3 and so there is not a--so that it actually does
4 the opposite of what is intended, which is made
5 sure that we are ready.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: And
7 that is a laudable goal in general, but then for
8 this particular piece of legislation, and you know
9 of no problems that you have with 1077?

10 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well, I do-
11 -hang on for one second. So to a couple of the
12 issues that we want to make sure that we would
13 want to address in the plan and the summary is
14 that what you are looking at is the creation of
15 the plan. It talks about fuel reserves and the
16 amount to be maintained by the city, and the
17 prioritization of fuel access for persons
18 involved, including but not limited to emergency
19 services and medical and uniformed services. So
20 the key issues that we would want to address in
21 the intro is what is the threshold for activation
22 of the plan and in terms of making sure that any
23 reporting on fuel supply levels or any
24 requirements to provide that information is
25 something that we would want to address,

1
2 publication of the level of fuel reserves in the
3 city, we might have an issue with what exactly is
4 published, the level of detail in that, and in
5 terms of the pre-selection of transportation
6 routes and the prioritization of fuel access, and
7 I can tell you that this prioritization question
8 who gets fuel and how do you set up, so we set up
9 a couple of different things. out at Floyd
10 Bennett Field w set up a massive operation for
11 buses and emergency services and workers. We set
12 up contracts immediately with ten Hess stations to
13 enable critical personnel. One of the issues that
14 we obviously have to address, and we want to
15 codify beforehand is knowing beforehand how we are
16 going to set all of that up, so that is one of the
17 things that our plan is going to include. So I
18 think those are some of the areas that we would
19 want to make sure in the particulars that we are
20 in agreement.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay.

22 So you have some concerns about some details, but
23 you think it is a workable piece of legislation?

24 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Yes.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Let me

1
2 ask you this. What is the current fuel management
3 plan then? What is the protocol right now?

4 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well, the
5 current fuel management plan--we are developing a
6 fuel management plan as one of the recommendations
7 in this report, and we did not have an off the
8 shelf fuel management plan.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: So it
10 doesn't exist.

11 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well, it is
12 in development.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: We are
14 agreeing. We are not disagreeing. Development
15 doesn't exist--just trying to understand it. That
16 is all. So there is no plan, and did you come to
17 a conclusion based on what at least identifying
18 what the issues were in terms of your opinion that
19 led to the lack of fuel supply after the
20 hurricane?

21 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Absolutely.
22 Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: What
24 was your conclusion?

25 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well, there

1
2 are a number of different issues. First, the
3 primary issue was the damage to infrastructure,
4 and one of the things if you look at the chapter
5 on fuel - - there are two chapters in here on
6 power supply and liquid fuel supply that address
7 some of the issues. There is a common I think or
8 what has been written about the most in the press
9 at least is electricity, and that the lack of
10 power was the main issue. That really wasn't the
11 main issue. The main issue was a massive
12 disruption to fuel infrastructure getting into the
13 city that started really in New Jersey and with
14 the closing of the harbor. That actually took out
15 of the city basically three complete days of fuel
16 supply, and we never caught that up, and so we
17 initially put in place the HOV restrictions and
18 then I think it was probably a week after that the
19 fuel rationing which fundamentally was able to
20 address the longest lines and the biggest issues,
21 but we didn't have good visibility immediately
22 into how critical the fuel shortage was, and even
23 the power because there was kind of a focus on
24 that question of well, if I get electricity back
25 it will be able to dispense gas. It turns out not

1
2 to be true. It was really the supply that was the
3 problem, so there are short term things to do,
4 and--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD:

6 [interposing] And that was limited just in New
7 York City 'cause places like New Jersey right over
8 the bridge they had fuel. I am just curious.

9 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well, New
10 Jersey and New York City did the same things in
11 different time, so New Jersey implemented a
12 rationing program before New York City did, and I
13 have not studied that implementation, but we know
14 that one of the things we did not have that is in
15 our review, and I am sure is intended by the bill
16 is we did not have an off the shelf what are the
17 triggers and conditions under which you implement
18 a fuel rationing plan. That is one of the central
19 questions that you need to address that needs to
20 be part of the plan, not identifying it
21 necessarily to the gallon, but we know that the
22 potential disruption points are, and if those
23 points are actually disrupted, well, the
24 presumably that would trigger the plan. I want to
25 point out one other thing. As far as the city's

1
2 fuel supplies were concerned, we did act quickly
3 even before the major part of the storm hit. We
4 sent trucks from--DCAS sent trucks to get extra
5 fuel reserves. We activated special contracts
6 really before the storm hit so that as far as we
7 had more than 100 fueling facilities that are city
8 facilities for emergency vehicles and recovery
9 operations. We never had as far as city vehicles
10 a serious disruption to the fuel supply for those
11 vehicles that were necessary either for emergency
12 response or for recovery, and that was thanks to
13 quick thinking and good planning on the part of
14 particularly the Department of Citywide
15 Administrative Services; however, what we learned
16 and what I was pretty surprised by is that there
17 are tens of thousands of people that when you take
18 the fuel out of the system, they are very
19 important to let's call it recovery if not direct
20 emergency response who didn't have fuel and didn't
21 have access to fuel and there are two or three
22 different ways to solve that. You can either try
23 and give them a pass and get them fuel. You can
24 put carpooling arrangements in place or you can
25 advise certain critical facilities that they have

1
2 to make plans for example to bring staff in and
3 have them stay there for a 48 hour shift. So
4 these are all the kinds of things that we need to
5 have in a codified plan, a bill that requires a
6 plan, Intro 1077 or another number would be fine.
7 It is really the details.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: So just
9 getting back to that one specific point just
10 because it was always a curiosity, but an
11 important one, so you do think it was the lack of
12 the fuel rationing immediately that caused the
13 discrepancy between New York City and New Jersey
14 in terms of the availability of gas because it
15 seems like what you said, you did your advanced
16 work, right, and you got the extra fuel in, and
17 you had the fuel for your essential city cars or
18 automobiles or vehicles, so was that really the
19 issue? I can't - - and you are here so I am
20 asking is that the major distinction between what
21 New York and New Jersey did that led to New York
22 not having fuel and New Jersey having fuel? I am
23 just trying to understand that particular point.

24 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: I can't say
25 that definitely. I think what I said and what is

1 true is that number one, have not studied in
2 depth exactly what happened in New Jersey. I do
3 know for a fact that some rationing was
4 implemented there sooner than in New York City. I
5 do not know whether if rationing had been
6 implemented sooner here the extent to which the
7 shortages that were experienced would have been
8 lessened, mitigated, but I can tell you that going
9 forward, which I think is the most important
10 consideration that we have to focus on, we need to
11 establish clearer criteria under which that step
12 would be taken.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Just
15 final point on this issue, I am just trying to
16 understand. Do you know why it took longer in New
17 York to get to that rationing point? Is that
18 because there was no criteria or what was sort of
19 the tipping point in your world when you guys
20 said, okay, now we are at the point where we need
21 rationing.

22 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well,
23 another element of the fuel and--this is detailed
24 quite well in the SIRR report. It is not just a
25 city issue. In the same way for electricity and

1
2 other services regulated utility services, but
3 particularly with fuel, we really, the city by the
4 way doesn't have a strong regulatory role in it.
5 We are responsible for making sure people get
6 essential services and operations, so we need the
7 fuel, so we have a very strong interest in it.
8 The state, the federal government have the primary
9 regulatory authority, and so certain things to
10 solve the fundamental issue, which was getting
11 more fuel into the region or getting
12 infrastructure repaired, we had to work with them
13 on, and it was a coordinated decision. Some of
14 that decision making is coordinated, and so I am
15 just thinking back. There wasn't a particular
16 tipping point. I think we had put in HOV
17 restrictions and taken certain measures, and
18 eventually, the mayor came to the decision that
19 what we had been doing up to the point before the
20 rationing was not sufficient, and so then we put
21 the rationing in place.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: okay.

23 I mean the reason I ask, I am not trying to be
24 nitpicky or - - even though I was calling for
25 rationing for one week before you implemented it,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I am just saying that--

DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY:

[interposing] I didn't remember that.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I can give you my copies of press releases and Twitter feeds. I think it just might be instructive in terms of going forward, and I do think that overall you have done yeoman's work and I just want to be clear about that. I am really not trying to be nitpicky, but this was at the time a significant issue, and I thank both of you for your leadership, and I think that overall, the job that you performed has been really high, but I do think it is instructive to understand sort of what happened and why it happened, and so in terms of when we come up, we hopefully, 'cause now we are going to do this together with Intro 1077. When we come up with this plan, we have some sort of understanding of okay, this was the bar where we suddenly realized well, now we need to do gas rationing 'cause gas rationing of course is extreme, and it made international news when that decision was made. So if there is any other insight you can provide in terms of how that

1
2 decision was made or when it was made or why it
3 was made, I think that would be helpful for all of
4 us going forward understanding sort of when that
5 should be triggered.

6 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well, it
7 sounds like we will be working on the plan
8 together--the bill that requires the plan and we
9 will certainly get your input for the plan.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD:
11 Alright. I appreciate that.

12 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you.
13 Council Member Ignizio and then Reyna.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Thank you,
15 chairman. Just for some insight into my colleague
16 vis-à-vis New Jersey it was the governor who
17 called it immediately and as a border district as
18 I like to call myself, many of my constituents
19 went to New Jersey to fill up and they found the
20 system worked well. It is so easy to Monday
21 morning quarterback all of us. Why didn't you do
22 this? Why didn't you do that? When you are in
23 the head of destruction, but I think the job that
24 it was to call the rationing rested on the second
25 floor in Albany, and I don't think the governor

1
2 thought that we needed it as much. he was wrong,
3 and ultimately I hope that he learned from it as
4 well, and I think the mayor showed enormous
5 leadership, but questionable authority to give
6 himself the ability to make the city go on a
7 rationing program on its own. It was the right
8 decision. - - New Jersey has a very different
9 geography in that you can go inland. Some of the
10 other counties in New Jersey didn't have a
11 rationing program while others did, and it worked
12 well for them. Hopefully we learned from that. I
13 want to speak though particularly about Staten
14 Island. Staten Island is very unique because it
15 is an island, and the problem is once you close
16 the bridges, once you shut the borders down, you
17 are in it. It is kind of locking down your
18 windows and now you are in this house until you
19 ride out the storm, and some of the issues that
20 came up with that I think just need to be vetted
21 and need to be discussed, some of which of the
22 pre-positioning of apparatus be them fire
23 apparatus, EMS apparatus, many of which we took
24 from some other communities that ultimately ended
25 up needing them as well. I know my colleague,

1
2 Domenic Recchia, speaks about you took some fire
3 apparatus and you moved it to Staten Island
4 because of its island requirement, wouldn't be
5 able to get across the bridge, and then ultimately
6 Coney Island needed it and didn't have it. So I
7 don't want to talk about the budget and cutting
8 fire houses. That is not for this discussion, but
9 do we have or can we have sufficient apparatus on
10 the island or is there a plan to ensure that we
11 have sufficient apparatus be it fire, EMS, police
12 located on Staten Island and covering the other
13 border districts such as Coney Island so we don't
14 have what happened here. It is kind of a
15 conversation that I think we need to have. Let's
16 start there.

17 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well, so a
18 few observations. First we candidly acknowledge I
19 believe it's candid in the after action report
20 that there are certain things that we didn't have
21 or that we need more of in terms of basic assets
22 to ensure public safety--lights, boats, forklifts,
23 fuel trucks and some of these I can tell you, one
24 of the first things that Commissioner Cassano said
25 that he needed the day after the storm was more

1
2 boats, and it is in here, and it is in the budget
3 and we are buying them, and Commissioner Kelly
4 said I need more light towers now, and it took us
5 longer to get them than we would have liked
6 because we needed more of them that we thought, so
7 we are getting them. In terms of the deployment
8 of resources and you are asking specifically about
9 fire trucks. I will say two things. One, that we
10 are always looking at the amount of equipment that
11 is needed to ensure that you can put out fires,
12 the fire department is one of the best in the
13 world at response times, particularly for fire
14 response have been getting better and better.
15 Part of that is fewer fires to respond to because
16 of good prevention, which is key. The best fire
17 is the fire that never starts, but second is the
18 continued training and the experience of the
19 department. There is always I would submit going
20 to be decisions that have to be made about where
21 you put stuff and it is in the discretion and
22 expertise of the mayor and the mayor makes this
23 very clear is the way that he runs the city that
24 the fire commissioner ultimately decides where
25 resources are going to go and we pre-positioned

1
2 sanitation assets, EDPS, that's fire assets,
3 police assets before the storm, and we would do so
4 again and it was based in part on the track of the
5 storm and so forth. So I can't say that there
6 would never be a case where there wasn't an asset
7 that was pre-positioned that you might say in the
8 next case you would put it there, but we will
9 always make every effort to ensure that we move
10 more assets where we think they could be needed
11 and the best judgment of the fire commissioner or
12 whichever commissioner for assets that is
13 responsible for that particular service, and that
14 because it is not a matter of are there enough
15 fire trucks in New York City to put out the fires.
16 There are. There are. I think the evidence of
17 performance by the department in emergencies and
18 every day demonstrates that. It is a question of
19 where do you put them and how do you allocate them
20 for the special circumstances, and I know that is
21 top of mind for Commissioner Cassano. So we could
22 I think maybe the best thing to do rather than
23 debate the specifics here, I would be happy to set
24 up a meeting with the commissioner to have him
25 talk through with you how that planning is done,

1
2 what the thought process is, obviously get your
3 input on it, but it is a critical part of what the
4 fire commissioner does.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Sure, and
6 like I said, it is very easy to Monday morning
7 quarterback. We are trying to do that to
8 ultimately build a better mouse trap, and there
9 are some things that the city could have done
10 better, but in the light of when the disaster
11 actually strikes, that is when you find the - -
12 that is when you find out what worked and what
13 didn't work, and I just remember that night very
14 well being in the community, being in my truck
15 driving around and ultimately being in my home
16 speaking to people on Facebook that 911 was a very
17 difficult to get through. Many busy signals, many
18 issues, fire department on the radios couldn't get
19 to certain areas because of lack of - - or police
20 officers would literally - - police officers tying
21 themselves to each other to try to get people out
22 and trying to get to the huge amount of people
23 that were calling, and just to say when it really
24 does go bad, that is always going to be an issue,
25 but if there are ways that we can get ahead of it,

1 particularly in a place where you can't bring
2 other apparatus in because the bridge is closed,
3 because the storm is going, because of whatever,
4 that is my main concern, and I am happy to have
5 the conversation. I have very high regard for
6 Commissioner Cassano. I want to point out. I am
7 reading through the book. I am getting there.
8 There is only so much that you can get to in any
9 one day, but I will read the whole thing hopefully
10 by week's end if my daughter doesn't keep me up at
11 night, but that is a great body of work. It is a
12 lot of work that went into it, and the
13 administration deserves a lot of credit for it. I
14 think a lot of it is implementable, but some of it
15 that almost sounds like we are going to talk to
16 the Army Corps of Engineers about that, that kind
17 of jumped off the page at me because as a person
18 who has been in government for a long time, when
19 you say yeah, we are going to have discussions
20 about that, it sounds like a very protracted we
21 want to talk about that, and not so sure it is
22 ever going to happen. can you speak to that
23 somewhat about those--that asterisk of we are
24 going to talk to the Army Corps and how we
25

1
2 actually get beyond the talking stage to
3 implementing the recommendations of the plan with
4 the Army Corps, and that is my last question.

5 Thank you.

6 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well,
7 having line edited a lot of it, I can tell you
8 that the language, that specific language, the
9 language that is at the beginning of the
10 initiative that says call on the U.S. Army Corps
11 of Engineers some of the ones where we already
12 have work underway or where we were far enough--
13 here was the dividing line between call on and
14 work with. This was a big editorial discussion,
15 not much of a conversationalist. We really like
16 to do stuff. Where we already had capital money
17 in the budget or a project that was underway or
18 something that was 95 percent along the way there
19 or we knew based on all of our experience that it
20 is going to move forward. That is where the work
21 with language was used. Call on the Army Corps to
22 complete a study, call on so and so for - - meant
23 to highlight two things. one is that in many of
24 these cases, especially when you are talking about
25 coastal protections and things that are in the

1
2 waterways of the United States or the interior
3 waterways, which are under this jurisdiction of
4 the Army Core of Engineers that they are a
5 necessary party, and that we didn't want to say
6 ask or write a note to and suggest. It was call
7 on. Now you could have said demand., but we were
8 trying to strike a balance between a it's 250
9 things, 250 demands. So there was a lot of
10 thought into the way that we phrased those things,
11 but I think the more important point and I am
12 sorry, Chairman Vallone is not here, 'cause I
13 think this is important for the whole Council and
14 for the people to understand probably the most
15 important thing to do in the next six months
16 because everybody asks us well, what are you going
17 to do in six months, well, there is a chart. I
18 think it is on page 413 and 414, which says what
19 are our priorities for the next 60 days, but there
20 is one thing that is more important than only of
21 those. In order to get a lot of these coastal
22 protections done, it is going to require and the
23 best and most effective efficient way to do it
24 would be to get another supplemental through
25 Congress, and the best precedent for doing that is

1
2 the Katrina case where a number of supplemental
3 were done for the immediate kind of relief and
4 community development block grant work that
5 happened. I am just happy it went through so the
6 fact that it took three months longer than it
7 should have, you know, oh well, but we got it.
8 This plan--there are multi-billion dollars of
9 ways---many, many different ways to skin a cat.
10 This plan in the seven months that it was under
11 development looked at two things--what is
12 implementable as you said, what is cost effective
13 and what is a way to whether you think that there
14 is some grand solution of the coastal protection
15 problem. What is the most cost effective and we
16 think quick way to do this? We think it comes
17 down to 20 billion dollars of investments, 15
18 billion roughly of that has been identified or we
19 expect that we can get. You basically have a five
20 billion dollar gap. That is for phase one of the
21 coastal productions in this plan. We say we will
22 put up a one dollar to every five, and we need to
23 go to Congress and say let's get a supplemental
24 that authorizes the Army Corps to do that work
25 because let's assume that you got the money. That

1
2 is only 50 percent of the problem. The Army Corps
3 of Engineers which has been a great partner of the
4 city's in many projects, but they do what Congress
5 tells them to do, and that is the way that it
6 works, and if you talk to Congresswoman Velazquez
7 and others who I've met with in Washington on
8 other Army Corps projects, everybody talks about
9 the famous or infamous list of 1500 Army Corps
10 projects. If the 37 coastal protection
11 initiatives in this plan get put at the back of
12 that list then you know, your kids will be talking
13 about those coastal protection measures. What we
14 need is a commitment by the city to put skin in
15 the game. We will. Authorization explicit to the
16 Army Corps in no uncertain terms that they are
17 authorized to do these projects independent of
18 whatever else they might need to do, and that is
19 how a multi-billion dollar levy system got build
20 in New Orleans in seven years, and it is
21 impressive, and if you haven't stood on top of it--
22 -I think you were down there when I was--you
23 should. These things are doable, and that is
24 pretty amazing. That is the single most important
25 thing to do, and the further away Sandy gets the

1
2 less likely it is, and so we are still here, which
3 I am happy about, particularly for this. It is
4 nice to be employed as well, but in order to get
5 this done, it has to happen now. So that is the
6 single most important thing to do. I think.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Council
8 Member, you good? Acting chairman. I am
9 practicing for next year. Thank you. How much is
10 it by the way that you would need from Congress?

11 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Five
12 billion.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Has
14 anyone introduced that legislation yet?

15 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Not yet.
16 We need to put it together and put it in. we need
17 to get somebody to introduce it.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I have
19 never met any shy Congress members. This is a
20 good opportunity. - - Council Member Reyna?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Thank you,
22 acting Chair. I wanted to take this opportunity
23 to just ask what is the communication between
24 city, state and federal agencies coordinating
25 during and after the storm in relationship to what

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

is novice document?

DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: The SIRR
report?

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Mm-hmm.

DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Okay.

Right after the storm the president identified and
appointed Sean Donovan [phonetic] to become the
head of--and I am going to forget the official
name, but let's just say the special regional
director of recovery, so in addition to being HUD
secretary he has this special role, and in this
role, he is responsible for coordinating the
entire federal response for the entire region to
Sandy. They came to us, the secretary came to us,
came to Mayor Bloomberg and we sat with Linda and
myself, Bob Steele [phonetic], and some other of
the senior staff, and he said, this is my
organization that I am building. We are--one of
the key questions is what do the feds do, what
does the state do, what does the city do? We
don't want to tell you how to do--how to best
protect New York City. The idea here is not that
the federal government is going to come in and
take that over and he had a particular

1
2 appreciation for why that wouldn't work, being a
3 New Yorker and having worked for the Bloomberg
4 Administration. I think he was also fairly
5 confident that we would in short order produce
6 something like this. He said, I am going to
7 create this organization though to make sure that
8 the federal government is deeply involved and
9 responsible for number one, getting the federal
10 money out the door, number two, they control the
11 federal insurance program, another really
12 important area. Number three FEMA and the
13 reimbursement and eligibility issues very
14 important, getting the mitigation dollars out the
15 door, very important, and to their credit, a lot
16 of those processes have been radically accelerated
17 I think thanks to the fact that special attention
18 was put on it and that it is - - . We communicate
19 with them every day at a staff level, and in fact,
20 the way that we established the group that put
21 this report together was inspired by and certainly
22 informed by what the way that Sean put his
23 organization together because we knew that they
24 were going to have their kind of 10,000 feet
25 responsibilities, get the money out the door, but

1
2 then we were going to be responsible for being
3 able to intelligently say what we would do with
4 it, both in terms of the immediate recovery, and
5 that is where you get rapid repairs, and then
6 build it back and the - - business and loan
7 programs, but then the longer coastal protection
8 and resilience things, which are the special what
9 do we do in the future, and so the integration
10 between the state and the federal government is
11 very good. The state did the same thing. There
12 is a person by the name of Jeremy Creelan
13 [phonetic], who works for Howard Glaser
14 [phonetic], and he has a whole team. We work with
15 them every day--the programs that they want to do
16 in terms of housing. So I think that the
17 communication and the coordination between the
18 city, state and federal governments has been very
19 strong. That doesn't mean we agree on everything.
20 I am sure everyone up here can think of one thing
21 that we have had different opinions on, but as a
22 general matter, we are working together on all of
23 the big issues, and it is pretty good.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: So I just
25 wanted to point out to a discrepancy as far as the

1
2 accountability of assessing the damages to the
3 small business community--

4 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY:

5 [interposing] Can I just say one thing too? I
6 totally forgot, and maybe the best news in recent
7 times our homeless services commissioner, a big
8 loss for us and for Linda, but is now responsible
9 for coordinating all of the Sandy response for the
10 state, so he has recently taken on that role, and
11 so I think our coordination is going to be even
12 better, which is exciting. Anyway, I am sorry.
13 Businesses...

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Sure. The
15 small businesses as far as the February hearing we
16 had in the City Council had pointed to the 13,000
17 plus small businesses that were accounted for by
18 City Hall with teams that were deployed to
19 physically get a site observation of and a very
20 anecdotal effort to understand who was there
21 before, and who was not or may have been there
22 afterwards, and there is a HUD report that
23 estimated 100,000 small businesses, and I
24 reference what you had just referenced to as far
25 as better coordination amongst what would be the

1
2 city, state and federal government and the issue
3 of connecting what would be our figures based on
4 City Hall's number of 13 plus and the discrepancy
5 of the federal government with 100,000 plus small
6 businesses that were impacted by Hurricane Sandy.

7 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Better
8 coordination. What is the question?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: The question
10 is if there is better coordination why is there
11 such an enormous discrepancy in the number?

12 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well, I
13 think what I should do is after this go to Seth
14 Pinsky and the Economic Development Corporation
15 and look at the numbers. I am not sure if it is
16 an apples to apples number. I know that there
17 were 13,000 - - look at that testimony maybe that
18 were initially surveyed. If you look in the
19 stronger, more resilient New York report, there is
20 a profile of each of the areas that were hardest
21 hit, and the number of businesses and employees
22 and the number of employees per business and so
23 forth, and I would have to add that all up. I
24 don't know that it is a coordination issue that
25 would explain the difference between those

1
2 numbers. The first thing I would want to look at
3 is what is in the 13,000 and what is in the
4 100,000?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And as far
6 as the book is concerned, I haven't thoroughly had
7 an opportunity to go through it, but as I did so
8 throughout the hearing just trying to look for
9 what would be the resiliency package or recovery
10 efforts in relationship to small business, is this
11 the document that you would expect small
12 businesses to turn to online or at a library to
13 figure out how are they going to be helped with
14 assistance or how to better plan for their own--

15 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY:

16 [interposing] As the primary resource? No. I
17 would expect them to call 311 or go to nyc.gov and
18 they will be able to go immediately to the NYC
19 recover page, which will direct them to immediate
20 and much more direct loan, grant and other
21 resilience programs that they are already going to
22 be able to sign up for or be eligible for. We
23 have already given 14 million dollars' worth of
24 loans and grants to 630 businesses, and that
25 number is going to go up dramatically as we start

1
2 to get the CDBG programs in place. That is not to
3 say this is not very important. I would encourage
4 any business in one of the impacted neighborhoods
5 to look at this and get an understanding of where
6 they fit in and there are some longer term
7 initiatives that are contemplated in here that
8 people can definitely get a jump on thinking about
9 okay, are these the kind of protections that I
10 should be thinking about and working with us over
11 the intermediate and long term to do it, but I
12 think if a business is in the circumstance that
13 right now today they are either not operating or
14 operating in a severely reduced capacity as a
15 result of Sandy they don't have to go to the
16 library to get this or download it. They should
17 be calling 311 or going right to the website.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Wouldn't you
19 agree, Deputy Mayor that creating an opportunity
20 to have a small business registry not to reference
21 back to the original two comments earlier, but in
22 our hearing that was one of the many suggestions
23 that were brought up in order to be able to have
24 real time access to information for small
25 businesses to have an accounting of in the midst

1
2 of an emergency to be able to send out a message
3 through technology to be able to give specific
4 instructions, whether that is in preparation of or
5 post any emergency?

6 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well, why
7 don't we talk about that--the contours of what
8 that would be after? I think that we do have, and
9 I just want to note Rob Walsh and Small Business
10 Services, he I probably spent more time with him
11 in the last seven months than certainly in the
12 prior seven years only because our portfolios
13 lined up because has been out in every one of
14 these impacted communities talking to thousands of
15 business owners and putting programs in place, and
16 we do have I think a good interface with the small
17 business community in these areas. Whether that
18 translates into a registry or should translate
19 into a registry that would be used for both pre
20 and post storm purposes I don't know whether that--
21 -what he thinks of that idea, but we should find
22 out.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I just want
24 to share the idea was shared at the hearing and
25 wasn't met with resistance, and I just wanted to

1
2 point to page 410 in this book. There is no
3 mention of the Department of Small Business
4 Services, and it concerns me--

5 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY:

6 [interposing] On 410?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Yes. The
8 difference between one week, a month for a small
9 business can mean just bankrupting, going out of
10 business and the assistance that it has provided
11 starts with the city of New York.

12 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: I agree. I
13 am looking at page 410.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And while
15 you are looking at 410, I just want to point out
16 it is important that we have a systematic
17 methodology in order to understand that an
18 anecdotal team being deployed from city hall as
19 admirable as that was it spends a lot of time
20 unproductively and doesn't really take into
21 account with accuracy and to increase the accuracy
22 it is important that we build a system so that
23 there is an accountability that is more doable.

24 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: If the goal
25 is to improve and strengthen the ability to

1
2 immediately communicate with businesses before and
3 after they know what researchers are available and
4 help them we totally agree. I don't know the
5 specific page that you are referencing or the
6 things--the ad hoc deployment that you are noting.
7 I am not exactly sure what your--how the related
8 specifically to the businesses. I can say that
9 business recovery is an absolutely essential
10 element to this and in this plan whether on page
11 410, it is certainly on other pages. There is a
12 great focus on what business initiatives are
13 needed in the intermediate and long term and then
14 the immediate recovery programs that we have set
15 up are already under way. I think we want to do
16 the same thing. Why don't we talk about it more?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Absolutely,
18 and I am open to having that discussion. I just
19 wanted to make sure that we were able to
20 understand this report is very elaborate and it is
21 welcomed and it is needed, and to know that the
22 small business community can count on it not being
23 forgotten in this book.

24 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: It's not,
25 definitely not.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I wanted to
3 just understand as far as the role that non-
4 profits had played in the recovery efforts during
5 and after the storm and how the city will utilize
6 those particular non-profits in the future because
7 I know, and I have mentioned this in the past
8 Accion USA [phonetic] had come to the hearing and
9 had mentioned had they been invited from the very
10 beginning as opposed to waiting three months later
11 to get the referral of a small business that did
12 not qualify for an SBA would have been the
13 difference of being able to open its doors one
14 week later as opposed to three to four months
15 later.

16 DEPUTY MAYOR GIBBS: I would say on
17 the discussions around the non-profits really has
18 two components. One is very much as small
19 businesses in need in the impacted communities and
20 for every comment that your discussion has
21 included around the need for coordination and
22 assistance and support to understand what their
23 needs are as victims in the storm, the non-profits
24 need our attention and the fact that they are not
25 able to respond as the community groups closest to

1
2 the need because of their own--the fact that they
3 have had their own impact further disables the
4 communities, and so I am very intent in working
5 together with my colleagues to make sure that as
6 we look at these redevelopment plans at the
7 community level we are focused on the non-profits
8 that are functioning in those communities. The
9 second way that non-profits played a critical role
10 was as helpers. They as you know in the social
11 services in New York City 90 percent of the work
12 that is done is delivered through non-profit
13 organizations, and in the reality of our
14 communities, non-profit organizations are there
15 doing work day in and day out even if they don't
16 have a city contract, and so they are really key
17 to the strength and vibrancy and social support to
18 individuals in the communities, and part of the--
19 one of the initiatives that we are discussing is
20 volunteer and donation coordination and how we can
21 bring in and foster communication among all of the
22 groups both those that we are calling on by virtue
23 of the fact that they have a contract with the
24 city or in the case of--one of the lessons that
25 came out of Katrina the federal government

1
2 established emergency case management contracts
3 for every state to have in place in the event a
4 storm happens and necessitates a case work support
5 to individuals who have been harmed. We were able
6 to draw upon that contract and to bring community
7 organizations in to support, so there is dual
8 functions. I think a critical goal for us to make
9 sure that we have under contract for emergency
10 purposes the non-profit groups that we need to
11 serve functions, and they will become part of our
12 game plans and in addition we need to have a
13 supplemental network of communication support so
14 that all those other really strong helping groups
15 can best coordinate with the government services
16 and our contracted services that are present in
17 the community.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And I am
19 happy that you wrapped it up so well because that
20 is exactly what we were looking for and to be very
21 specific that it is not just on the social service
22 forefront, but that we meet with the same level of
23 service at the non-profit level for small
24 businesses and I point to the industrial business
25 solution providers who have been cut out of this

1
2 budget, Deputy Mayor Holloway, just to make sure
3 that we understand that they played a pivotal role
4 in what would be the waterfront areas and
5 representing the interest of the small business
6 navigating government, making sure that those
7 loans were already and available for them, that
8 the process was not to be hindered by any
9 misunderstanding or not comprehending the
10 application process, and so we have to assist
11 currently, and we have an opportunity to not zero
12 out those providers, and I hope that that begins
13 with today after this hearing to look back at
14 those providers as nonprofits to the small
15 business community.

16 DEPUTY MAYOR GIBBS: You are
17 probably aware the mayor's fund one of the first
18 actions it took and one of the most significant
19 commitments of resources was for an emergency
20 relief fund focused specifically at the non-
21 profits to deal with their immediate needs, and so
22 that was a great example of where the voluntary
23 contributions that came in we could act quickly
24 and you didn't have to wait for every governmental
25 official to think whether or not it is allowed to

1
2 spend money on something. It was really training
3 to find a place where all of those generous
4 contributions that the city received could be
5 quickly deployed to this very need.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Thank you
7 very much. I wanted to understand as far as FEMA
8 is concerned there is supposed to be these
9 training programs that FEMA provides to houses of
10 worship and non-profit organizations that is free
11 of charge. During Hurricane Katrina in New
12 Orleans there was training and that was a focus
13 and it was a gap that was realized very early on
14 and was provided, and I hope that we are able to
15 do the same. I don't know if you are aware of the
16 specific training I am referring to.

17 DEPUTY MAYOR GIBBS: Again, two
18 pieces, I think there was a lot of assistance that
19 was create to provide instructions to houses of
20 worship and non-profit organizations regarding the
21 specifics of benefits that they as FEMA eligible
22 clients were eligible for, and so those trainings
23 were conducted through the FEMA offices at the
24 district level, and the lesson that came out of
25 Katrina is they didn't have the emergency case

1
2 management contracts, and so there was a real ad
3 hoc development system that built up and the
4 lesson that the federal government learned from
5 that is that we need to have this
6 institutionalized and so that is where bringing
7 those emergency contracts in place already having
8 the contract entered into really clear guidance on
9 how the work is to be done, and then the master
10 contractor worked with a variety of local
11 community based contractors in order to effectuate
12 those services.

13 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: I am aware
14 that you have to leave at 3:45, and I want to make
15 sure we get to the other council members who have
16 questions. I have to apologize. We are having a
17 caucus downstairs where we are debating the
18 inspector general and Intro 1080 and some
19 important topics, and so they needed my expertise.
20 Council Member Rose? And thank you, Council
21 Member Greenfield for chairing.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you,
23 Deputy Mayors. How are you? I will be brief,
24 Chair. I just have several concerns, and as my
25 colleague, Council Member Ignizio stated the

1
2 obvious that Staten Island is an island, not that
3 anyone here didn't know that, but that we have
4 unique needs and especially in times of an
5 emergency, and so as a result of the storm, we
6 were without ferry service, which is our major
7 source of transportation, especially for people to
8 get into work, so five days without that was
9 really an economic hardship. And so what have you
10 looked at in terms of transportation alternatives
11 especially that affect major transportation hubs?
12 Not only was the ferry impacted, but the Whitehall
13 side of the ferry was also impacted. The ferries
14 of the subways were not able to run. Have you
15 looked at alternatives for Staten Island in terms
16 of when in an emergency the transportation hub is
17 totally incapacitated and people need to get off
18 of the island?

19 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well,
20 clearly one of the most--when the bridges are
21 closed, clearly the car traffic--cars are not an
22 option, and one of the things that we did I think
23 were able to set up pretty nimbly was alternative
24 ferry service in different areas or alternate
25 landing sites, and if you look at the

1
2 transportation chapter in the SIRR the stronger
3 more resilient New York report, there is a focus
4 on those kinds of options. So yes, it is
5 something that we are looking at as a serious
6 issue.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: However
8 Deputy Mayor and this is really sort of a pet
9 peeve of mine, most of the ferry options that were
10 looked at were for the south shore, and the north
11 shore has the major ferry service, and there was
12 no alternative put in place on the north shore in
13 terms of ferry service, so are you saying that
14 that will now become something that will be looked
15 into is a north shore site in terms of ferry
16 service?

17 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Let me say
18 this. On the transportation in terms of the
19 specific landing sites and where we would put
20 them, I just don't have at hand where they should
21 be, but I certainly support the idea that we need
22 to identify where can you safely put potential
23 alternative, particularly ferry service because
24 that is really the best option from Staten Island
25 in these kinds of situations, and so why don't I

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

get back to you on that?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, and since the ferry is a major transportation hub, would you consider looking at since bus travel was our only alternative would you look at maybe making that the site for bus service that would be leaving Staten Island?

DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: I am sorry, that?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: At the ferry as opposed to you know, we have express bus routes that run throughout the island, but I am talking about since this is our major transportation hub would you also look at the possibility of putting in place enough buses, surface transit so that people could get off of Staten Island?

DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well, we do want to make sure we have enough transit options, so rather than answer specifically on that one, let me get back to you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, and my other concern is that in the evacuation plan you carefully identify evacuation shelters and people go there because they rightfully so know that it

1
2 is going to be safe, it is going to be warm, there
3 will be food, and whatever provisions they need;
4 however, very few of them had backup generators,
5 and it causes a lot of concern for me that you--
6 the assumption is that you are going somewhere
7 that is not going to be impacted like your home
8 would have been impacted, so we really need to
9 look at having emergency generators at all of
10 those sites. Now I understand that there are
11 challenges because many of these locations are
12 schools; however, then we need to look at maybe
13 what the sites are for these shelters so that
14 there should not be a shelter that doesn't have an
15 emergency generator to provide the light, heat,
16 people who have medical needs, so I didn't see
17 anything that specifically addressed generators at
18 each evacuation site that is identified.

19 DEPUTY MAYOR GIBBS: I would agree
20 with you, and I think it actually gets a little
21 bit to one of our points around some of the
22 specificity in the legislation. What we believe
23 is that you need to do as much planning in advance
24 as you can and designate options to the greatest
25 extent possible including all of the

1
2 considerations around what makes a location
3 viable. This was significant as well for
4 individuals with disabilities who came into
5 facilities in need of power recharging for any of
6 their supportive equipment, and you then need to
7 select the sites with an understanding of the size
8 and shape and nature of the storm that you are
9 facing, and so the ability to actually identify
10 the sites which are going to be capable of meeting
11 these needs are really - - to the event that you
12 are facing, and so what we will want to discuss
13 with you as we move forward in finalizing these
14 legislations is how you can have a planning
15 document that deals with the basics and then
16 leaves the specificity to the event as you are
17 experiencing it.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I agree. But
19 with the shelters, especially on Staten Island,
20 these are the shelters that have been identified
21 maybe not even by the city, maybe federally.
22 These are--there is signage directing people to
23 them. They were not emergency evacuation
24 shelters. These are our typical stated evacuation
25 shelters that everybody is aware of, so does that

1
2 mean then we will be revisiting whether or not
3 these locations should be shelters?

4 DEPUTY MAYOR GIBBS: In our lessons
5 that we learned in the sheltering strategy is that
6 the plan itself was great for quickly getting into
7 emergency evacuation shelters that served
8 immediate needs. The ability of those shelters to
9 satisfy the needs beyond four or five days started
10 to become somewhat attenuated and our revisions of
11 the sheltering plan are really going to have to
12 focus on what is necessary to accommodate an
13 evacuation population for a longer period of time,
14 and that may then reflect back on whether all
15 sites that have been identified to date are the
16 best sites for that purpose.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, and
18 then this is just a comment. You know, the
19 evacuation plans, the level of resources and even
20 in the resiliency plan I think you have grossly
21 underestimated the damages and the impacts that
22 the north shore sustained, and I really would like
23 you to revisit that because there is a lot of
24 emphasis--and rightfully so based on the
25 devastation that happened this time--the south

1
2 shore, even the east shore, but the north shore,
3 it's in its entirety from the ferry terminal to
4 the Goethal's Bridge sustained significant damage
5 in the tens of millions of dollars, and there was
6 residential damage and people needed to evacuate
7 their homes. I just need for that to be
8 acknowledged in all of the plans going forward.

9 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well, we
10 agree, and one of the things about this--the after
11 action report really addresses how do we respond
12 here and then what do we need to put in place in
13 terms of additional plans and so forth, and they
14 would have general applicability whether the
15 coastal storm that comes next time or extreme
16 weather event is going to hit the ocean facing or
17 maybe if as we said, this report explains in
18 pretty alarming detail when you really get it into
19 it if it had hit nine hours early and the high
20 tide cycle had been switched, you would have seen
21 a lot more problems in the Bronx and other areas,
22 so this plan and the strategies that the
23 resilience plan lays out are explicitly not
24 focused exclusively on where Sandy hit hardest.
25 There are special chapters on it because those

1
2 communities need to be brought back in addition to
3 the immediate household recovery and so forth, but
4 if you look at the hardening, the coastal
5 protections, the infrastructure networks and all,
6 they talk about the city as a whole and that is by
7 design, and so maybe one of the things we should
8 do is get a member of the team from now the Long-
9 term Planning and Sustainability and our new
10 director of resiliency, Dan Zirilli [phonetic],
11 who is--I will tell you he is on vacation for a
12 week--well deserved, but maybe one of the first
13 things we can do is sit down and go through with
14 you where on Staten Island as a whole some of
15 these issued are addressed.

16 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you for
17 being brief. The last council member, and then we
18 will get to the public, and if I could ask you to
19 try to limit it to two minutes because I want to
20 get to everybody, and you all have been waiting a
21 long time. Council Member Gentile?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Thank you,
23 and I thank both Deputy Mayors for being here
24 today and I am the one last person that separates
25 you from leaving today, so I will be brief. I am

1
2 told that we know that OEM has a coastal storm
3 plan and hazardous mitigation plan. Are there
4 other emergency response plans that OEM currently
5 has?

6 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: There are
7 other plans. There is a list of pretty extensive
8 plans that OEM has for different circumstances.
9 There is a flu plan that would be a vaccine
10 distributing. I am just listing. There are a
11 couple, but yes, there are other plans. There are
12 also plans that are much more quotidian in their
13 applications, so the flash flood, emergency flash
14 flood plan is activated all the time, and so yes.
15 There are.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Would
17 those plans include similar to what Council Member
18 Rose was asking about--would those plans include a
19 plan that responds to the continuing
20 transportation problems that were a cause of
21 Hurricane Sandy? For example, what we are about
22 to see in the Brooklyn Transportation System being
23 affected by the closure that the MTA is proposing
24 or planning for the break between Brooklyn and
25 Manhattan through the Montague Street Tunnel?

1
2 Would OEM have contingency plans for something
3 like that?

4 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well, we
5 coordinate with the MTA and the Port Authority and
6 even within city agencies. Part of OEM's
7 responsibility is coordinating among those
8 entities to first and foremost try to identify
9 disruptions whether they are going to be like that
10 with the MTA or even just what the street closures
11 are on a given weekend in the summer for the
12 street parades or the street fairs that are going
13 to happen, so there are--I don't know specifically
14 about this, but I am certain that there have
15 already been discussions probably between OEM, the
16 MTA and even the NYPD on what options we need to
17 put in place and if they haven't, then we
18 certainly will, so I will look into that, but yes,
19 there are I think--I just want to draw a
20 distinction between something like the coastal
21 storm plan, which is a plan that anticipates a
22 specific event that could have let's just say
23 beyond the normal every day disruption that you
24 might expect in New York City. Car accidents
25 happen every day. Water mains break every day. I

1
2 wish they didn't, but they do, and what we have in
3 place for that is what is called the citywide
4 incident management system. that is itself a plan
5 of plans. It is a set of procedures, standard
6 operating procedures that exists for dozens and
7 dozens of different types of incidents, and it was
8 put in place after 9/11 based on the national
9 incident management system where all of our
10 operating agencies got together and said, okay, if
11 there is a fire, who is in charge? The fire
12 department has primary responsibility for putting
13 out structural fires, and if there is a let's say
14 an event of criminality is suspected in a crash,
15 well then it becomes the police. If it is just a
16 life recovery, it would be the fire. Sometimes
17 there is joint command. That could go on and on.
18 I won't, but just to say for your more ordinary,
19 more foreseeable, more frequent types of events,
20 not foreseeable--a coastal storm is foreseeable,
21 but that happen more frequently, there is a set of
22 procedures that are more like SOPs that just
23 happen every time there is a response.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Although
25 this one that is being planned is as a result of

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

the storm?

DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Yes. Yes, but for whatever reason if you are going to have a long term infrastructure disruption, yeah, we need to coordinate that.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: So it is in the process of being done?

DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Yes, and I will look into it and get back to you.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Okay. I appreciate that. Just a question or two about Intro 1075, which would require the OEM to provide the Council with a copy of any plan that would involve a multi-agency response. I am just a little bit perplexed by what I read from your opening statement. It seems to me that 1075 basically is pretty much a vanilla type of piece of legislation where it says let's just sit down and discuss what plans you have available or that you are working on and every so often let's sit down and review those plans even if they have not been activated. It doesn't seem to comport with the kind of stilted bureaucratic constrictors that you suggest in your statement that I believe you

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

made when you first began.

DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: So I think that when I concluded that section of the testimony I pointed out and I don't think it is actually written in what I said that this is a matter I think more of line drawing than anything else. What we need to make sure is that whatever the level of reporting is that it is a frequency that is not unduly burdensome, that what has to be reported takes due account of confidentiality and other issues and that the triggers for the reporting because there are some that say every two years you shall do this, that is the frequency, and then if something happens, you shall report afterwards on you know, what you did. Depending on what those triggers are, you could end up with just literally endless reports of everyday typical garden variety stuff that is what the Office of Emergency Management is designed to do, and I think one of the things that struck me is interagency--everything is an interagency response. There is basically nothing that happens out in the field when an agency responds to an incident where at least two agencies - - except

1
2 for the most basic kind of thing. There is lots
3 of police response--low level police response that
4 it would just be maybe a patrol car out there, but
5 if there is a fire, it is automatically police and
6 fire at a minimum, probably buildings, and then
7 DEP, and maybe the Department of Health every
8 single time. So you know, I think that it is a--
9 what we should really do I think is just sit down
10 and go through the language of the bill. We will
11 tell you exactly where we think it is overbroad
12 because that is the primary issue; it is
13 overbroad. I also think there is one area where
14 you would want us to report more--the trigger that
15 is defined primarily in the bill for reporting
16 significant changes is after an event, and
17 significant changes can happen at any time, so I
18 would suggest that you rather just say any time
19 you have a significant change no matter why you
20 tell us if that makes sense.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: It does
22 indicate that every two years whether or not a
23 plan has been activated it should be reassessed.

24 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well, yeah,
25 but I can tell you for example on the snow plan

1
2 this a hypothetical, but the snow plan has in it
3 for example that we are going to have contracts
4 for the plowing of tertiary streets. If somebody
5 just decided tomorrow--and we are not deciding
6 this--that they weren't going to do that anymore,
7 I think you would want to know sooner than two
8 years from now, so I think that--well, I use the
9 word material significant, what have you,
10 something where it would be clear that the
11 expectation for anybody paying attention that A
12 would happen, but maybe once you decide that you
13 are going to do B, you would want to know.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I would
15 think to address your issues about being too rigid
16 and not being I think you said it would be a
17 bureaucratic tendency towards mindless adherence
18 if it was to--well said. But I think if you had
19 contingency clauses in what plan you discussed, I
20 think that overcomes any kind of stilted
21 bureaucratic tendency that you complain about.

22 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: And I don't
23 want to characterize it as a complaint... More than
24 the reporting, the stilted bureaucratic tendency,
25 I am very concerned having been on the receiving

1
2 end of government agencies where you have--we are
3 all familiar with rules for what is reimbursable,
4 what qualifies as homeland security or qualifies
5 for emergency shelter and so forth, and right now
6 even though we have stopped the last--we have
7 repaired the last home under rapid repairs - - I
8 can tell you, people are going to be dealing with
9 the receipts and paying the invoices for the next
10 18 months. Okay? When you put the rule in place
11 that says you shall appoint this person to do this
12 thing this way when all of us are long gone who
13 went through all of this stuff, and it was the
14 reason that the thing was put in place, if it is
15 too prescriptive you will definitely get people
16 who say well wait a minute, nope, we have to make
17 this appointment this way because that is what
18 this says even if that clearly makes no sense or
19 is not in keeping with the spirit of things, so I
20 you know, the testimony is drafted in a way to
21 emphasize that--two things. we agree with eight
22 out of ten bills--I think it's ten or if it is
23 nine out of 11 that we are fine with them being
24 bills, that we are fine with doing the reports and
25 the plans. It is just a question of--even with

1
2 the reporting we will do reporting. There are
3 issues with how often, what has to be reported and
4 then what is the extent to which the law is trying
5 to tell someone in a situation that is inherently
6 unpredictable how they have to behave. That is
7 all.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: So your
9 objection is not discussing the making of those
10 plans with the Council?

11 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Nope. No,
12 I think we agree more than we disagree, but we
13 wanted to be clear because just in the prior
14 leading up to here we had meetings with the
15 Council. We took all of the feedback. We really
16 did incorporate a lot of it into our plan. The
17 bills as drafted came out significantly more
18 detailed than we expected, and having expressed
19 some of those concerns, I think Linda and I just
20 wanted to make sure that it was absolutely clear
21 in our opportunity to express them in this forum
22 that we still think that is the case. We think it
23 can be addressed. We think that at the end of the
24 day, there is a lot of good to be had out of most
25 of this package.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Mr.

3

Chairman, I will take that under advisement.

4

Thank you.

5

CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you,

6

and we are just right at the time limit, so just

7

let me end with this one thing. You may not even

8

be aware of this, but if you go to the Queens

9

portion of PlaNYC it literally says the first

10

initiative is a beach replenishment, which is

11

expected to start in July. As a lifeguard for

12

seven years, they rarely start when they are

13

expected to start, and you are not doing that. I

14

know the federal government is. The second

15

initiative is bulkheads, which says subject to

16

available funding, the city will launch a program,

17

and all the rest of the initiatives are calling on

18

the Army Corps of Engineers to study and do

19

things, so when it comes to Queens, there is a lot

20

of planning. There is a lot of stuff that will

21

happen, but they are waiting for things to happen

22

now, protection wise. I know you are doing a lot

23

of other things out there, but to protect them

24

from the next storm.

25

DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: I just want

1
2 to point out because I did have this drawn up
3 while I have been sitting here. So there are two
4 components in the Rockaways. I am just going to
5 talk specifically about the Rockaways. The Corps
6 has awarded the Rockaway contract to Weeks Marine
7 [phonetic], who I have worked with to do 600,000
8 cubic yards of sand that is going to start in
9 July, and I can tell you if they have awarded the
10 contract the Corps as a general matter once the
11 contract is awarded the work actually does happen.
12 the next contract, which is--

13 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: [interposing]

14 Is there a date in July? Did you say it?

15 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: I don't
16 know the date. I don't have it in front of me.
17 I don't have a date here, but I will get you the
18 date. I also have talked personally to Colonel
19 Paul Owen, who is the head of region 2 here and
20 then his boss, Tom Bostic [phonetic], who runs the
21 Army Corps and I think might even be coming to
22 town next week, so I will be sure to see him again
23 to talk about the Rockaways, but the second
24 contract for three million cubic yards, which will
25 cover the entire area from 200 feet, up to 200

1
2 feet in some places. They plan to release the bid
3 documents tomorrow, and the bids will be opened in
4 July. Construction will start in August. So
5 600,000 cubic yards now. The big problem with the
6 Corps--not problem, the Corps is--it is how it is
7 set up in the law. They do what they are
8 authorized to do, but you can't get from planning
9 to do until you have the funding in place to do
10 it. If we are at the stage where they are putting
11 the bid documents out, and I will shoot you a note
12 tomorrow and let you know that they went out, they
13 have the funding 'cause they are not allowed to do
14 that.

15 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: I will let
16 the community know. Who is the Queens borough
17 director now for the Sandy recovery?

18 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: Well, so
19 the borough director structure is I think better--
20 let me talk to you after about who the right
21 person to get it is.

22 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: So I would
23 like to set up a meeting--

24 DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY:
25 [interposing] But the Parks is really overseeing

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

that piece of this.

CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: I would like to set up a meeting with myself and some of the residents with whoever is in charge. We need to discuss this.

DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: We should also get the Corps. They will come. We could get the Corps. They will come.

CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: So I know you guys had to go. We have two Deputy Mayors here. They didn't send Commissioners. They have got two Deputy Mayors who have not taken a break in a long long time and we are--other than lifeguard shacks, we are on the same page here. I think we all agree that we need these plans. We need them in place whether they are legislated or not, but they can't be too specific, so that they handcuff you as you are trying to--or the next mayor as they are trying to respond to a disaster so one of the best attorneys over here - - and our staff is going to continue to work with yours to get that done, so I know you have to go. Thank you for coming by and keep up the great work.

DEPUTY MAYOR HOLLOWAY: See you

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

tomorrow.

CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: We are going to go right straight to a panel, and I hope you all keep your testimony to two minutes. Steven Banks [phonetic], Legal Aid; Giselle Routhier, Coalition for the Homeless and Michael Stoller, Human Services Counsel, if they are still here. I am trying to go quickly so everybody gets to speak before dinner.

MICHAEL STOLLER: - - Human Services Council. I can sit with Steve because he hasn't paid dues to my organization.

CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: I feel the same way. I am a former prosecutor. We thought it was free.

MICHAEL STOLLER: Yeah, tell it to the judge.

CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Identify yourself.

MICHAEL STOLLER: Michael Stoller, the executive director of the Human Services Council. With me is Susan Felsenthal from the Met Council on Jewish Poverty. And thank you for the opportunity to testify. You have my written

1 testimony. Let me just briefly summarize it. The
2 HSC is an umbrella organization of all the not for
3 profit social service agencies in New York, and as
4 you know, Council Member, the human services
5 sector response to Hurricane Sandy was tremendous.
6 People were out on the street right from the
7 second it was happening, and are still there, and
8 we work very well with the city. The cooperation
9 between us and the deputy mayor's office is
10 terrific. What is needed is what is reflected in
11 the legislation before you which is a plan. So I
12 just want to read one or two paragraphs from my
13 testimony. I know we have not a lot of time. So
14 while the response of the human services sector to
15 Hurricane Sandy has indeed been admirable, the
16 lack of established systems for coordination has
17 caused [phonetic] a scrambling effect and there is
18 much reason to believe that service would be
19 better coordinated had a rehearsed and
20 comprehensive plan been in place. There was such
21 a plan during 9/11 and after 9/11. The United
22 Services Group - - used - - state funding, which
23 got cut, so right now, we have generous funding
24 for the Ortman [phonetic] Foundation and from the
25

1
2 mayor's fund and from - - federation of New York
3 to do some convening, but the real issue is
4 preparing for later. We are first responders as
5 are NYPD, the fire department and others. We
6 don't take away from them what they do, which is
7 incredible work, but the fact is, we need the
8 funding also to prepare for the next disaster we
9 know is just around the corner, whether it is
10 climate change or a terrorist attack or just some
11 crazy people shooting other people, so we are
12 asking the Council as we are working also with the
13 folks in the state to create and fund a
14 sustainable ongoing disaster preparedness systems
15 so that we are as well prepared as others who are
16 responding to disaster. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you.

18 SARA FELSENTHAL: Sara Felsenthal,
19 Met Council. I don't really have formal
20 testimony, but we are here sort of to support the
21 Human Services Council, but also from our
22 experience from working on the ground right from
23 the beginning of after the aftermath of Sandy we
24 really see that the most critical--what sort of is
25 most critical for those who are still recovering

1
2 from Sandy is that there is still a need for
3 disaster case managers who are critical for
4 guiding clients through government and private
5 resources and really connecting them to whatever
6 is going down through the pipeline. A lot is
7 going down through federal, state, city, but
8 people are having difficulty accessing those
9 resources, and it is critical to have disaster
10 case managers that help people through that
11 difficult process, especially when they are still
12 recovering from the storm. Any questions?

13 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thanks.

14 GISELLE ROUTHIER: Hi. My name is
15 Giselle Routhier. I am a policy analyst with the
16 Coalition for the Homeless. I firstly want to
17 thank the Council for calling this hearing and
18 proposing the set of bills that are looking to
19 improve the city's response to future emergencies.
20 The Legal Aid Society and Coalition for the
21 Homeless have submitted joint testimony, and I am
22 just going to briefly go over the section on the
23 sheltering bill. In February the Coalition for
24 the Homeless and Legal Aid Society testified
25 before the General Welfare Committee about the

1
2 city's response to Hurricane Sandy and among the
3 problems we witnessed and reported were poor
4 shelter conditions for evacuees, unmet medical
5 needs, a severe lack of accountability and
6 inadequate rehousing assistance, so we want to
7 thank the Council for including these issues
8 raised in the proposed bill. The details laid out
9 in the proposed bill on sheltering were required
10 descriptions of shelter staffing and
11 accountability, the assessment of emergency supply
12 stockpiles, plans for shower and laundry
13 facilities and provision of adequate food,
14 continued provision of public benefits and
15 mechanisms for tracking the census. We want to be
16 clear that we support all of these requirements in
17 their detail. The Deputy Mayor testified that he
18 felt that some of the language was too detailed,
19 but we want to just emphasize that when looking to
20 improve the future, the response to future
21 emergency events we want to make sure that we
22 address areas where improvements are needed, and
23 these have all been areas identified by advocates
24 and folks that experience them as needing a vast
25 area of improvement over what happened during

1
2 Sandy, and I just want to briefly mention one
3 other issue that we think the Council should
4 consider in the sheltering bill. One of the more
5 common problems that we witnessed and part of our
6 outreach is a lack of assistance for individuals
7 with medical needs. Many individuals came into
8 the shelter system having lost all or most of
9 their prescription medications and were unable to
10 reach their doctors or healthcare providers who
11 were often in the same impacted communities, so
12 there are potentially serious health risks posed
13 to these individuals and most of them were not in
14 the special medical needs shelters, so we just
15 want to raise that as an issue, and have the
16 Council consider adding that to the sheltering
17 bill. Lastly, the city of New York already has
18 existing legal obligations to provide adequate
19 shelter and services to homeless individuals and
20 families as laid out in - - and city of New York
21 and these allegations should establish the minimum
22 standards for safe, secure and adequate shelter
23 and continue to guide the provision of emergency
24 shelter following all future emergency events.
25 Just to wrap up, I mean eight months after

1
2 Hurricane Sandy there is still hundreds of
3 displaced families living in temporary hotels and
4 shelters throughout New York City and we want to
5 emphasize that any goal for future emergencies is
6 to minimize the amount of time that people have to
7 spend in emergency shelters and to really make
8 sure that the city is committed to providing
9 affordable housing assistance much more quickly
10 than it has thus far.

11 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Steven?

12 STEVEN BANKS: Thank you very much,
13 and certainly commend the Speaker and you as the
14 chair.

15 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: You just have
16 to say your name for the record as everyone does,
17 so a thousand years from now they will know who is
18 speaking when they find the tapes.

19 STEVEN BANKS: Steven Banks, I am
20 the attorney in chief of the Legal Aid Society.
21 Thank you very much. we commend the leadership of
22 the Speaker and your leadership as the chair of
23 this committee. In this area the Council has been
24 very focused and conducted a series of very
25 thoughtful public hearings, and now you have got

1
2 comprehensive legislation, which we certainly
3 support. Our testimony is extensive, and we are
4 not going to go through it as we have indicated,
5 but I wanted to just highlight a few issues in the
6 testimony from the city and as it relates to our
7 recommendations for some refinements in the
8 overall approach. First of all, this issue about
9 whether legislation is too detailed or not, the
10 Council has a very strong track record of
11 legislating in the area of homelessness and if you
12 look through the years actually beginning during
13 the Vallone council period, a number of the
14 groundbreaking pieces of legislation were enacted
15 in that period of time, and they began as more
16 general prescriptions as to what could or couldn't
17 be done regarding the provision of shelter and
18 what the record indicates is that it was a
19 requirement for additional legislation in order to
20 deal with continued problems that came up, so the
21 Council's current legislation really addresses
22 that problem by being detailed and avoiding what
23 the experience was in the 1990s and early
24 thousands in terms of going from general
25 legislation and the need for continual specific

1
2 legislation. So we certainly support your
3 detailed approach. In a few areas, it is worth
4 emphasizing some of the recommendations that we
5 have made. One is in the area of language access,
6 and how critically important it is to ensure that
7 communications are in the language that is
8 prevalent in particular communities. We certainly
9 counted clients who didn't evacuate because the
10 evacuation instructions were not provided in a
11 language that they could understand. Secondly,
12 accessibility is critically important. It has
13 been emphasized by a number of different community
14 groups, and as you know, the Legal Aid Society has
15 litigation challenging the failure to have
16 accessible sites for obtaining food stamps, the
17 idea that there would be only one site open for a
18 part of the week in Staten Island and at the site
19 in Brooklyn, when there are many, many zip codes
20 that were effected, highlights that the
21 specificity of legislation is important so we
22 don't repeat this. Of course, there is the other
23 related issue in terms of litigation that we have
24 got in terms of only focusing on a narrow sliver
25 of the effected communities as opposed to all the

1
2 effected zip codes. So that is another important
3 issue. As to the transportation as we found
4 transportation was a vital link. It frequently
5 was out, but for low income communities the
6 inability to be able to access public
7 transportation because of lack of fares given the
8 fact that people weren't working we would urge you
9 to take a look at whether or not there should be
10 the ability to suspend fares and have free
11 transportation during certain periods of time.
12 Last but not least is the question of the registry
13 and the list. There has been a lot of debate
14 about lists. It was just emphasized that
15 obviously perfect is the enemy of the good.
16 Having a list is better than what we encountered
17 in this situation. We certainly as we have
18 described in prior hearings testified about
19 relatives if they were only contacted they could
20 have cared for people, and they didn't. We have
21 given the example and others of people in the
22 Housing Authority where homecare attendants
23 remained in the Housing Authority for a number of
24 days trying to help people who literally couldn't
25 be contacted. HRA in particular has a code in the

1
2 WMS computer system that we would urge you to take
3 a look at for all homebound New Yorkers, and this
4 is an element that you could strengthen the laws
5 by requiring HRA to identify homebound individuals
6 before a storm hits, and take appropriate action
7 before. In closing, we appreciate your focus on
8 this and the points that we have made with regard
9 to HRA as an area we hope you will take a look at.

10 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: You guys are
11 definitely attorneys. There is a lot of in
12 closings, lastly, I will finish up with this, and
13 it keeps going, but you all did a pretty good job
14 staying within two minutes. We finally have a
15 clock. I am going to say this to this panel, and
16 then I am not going to repeat it for everybody,
17 but it applies to everybody. There was no one
18 down there after Sandy hit. There was no FEMA.
19 There was no Red Cross. There was no OEM, nobody,
20 but you guys were down there. All of the not for
21 profits, all the churches, the synagogues, you all
22 were down there, and I just want to thank you on
23 behalf of all of us for all the work everybody in
24 this room did after Sandy to help the people while
25 the agencies were not, so thank you all you guys

1
2 have done. Thank you. We are going to call now--
3 that's the last group. David Berman [phonetic],
4 Food Bank, Lisa Levy [phonetic] from the Coalition
5 Against Hunger, Amaya Galeman [phonetic], Alliance
6 for a Just Rebuilding [phonetic] and Juan Camilo
7 Osorio, [phonetic] New York City Environmental
8 Justice Alliance. We have a clock we think is
9 working which is over there, so you can time
10 yourselves with that. Thanks. Anyone who wants,
11 just identify themselves and go. Hit that little
12 red button.

13 DAVID BERMAN: Great. Good
14 afternoon. My name is David Berman, and I am the
15 disaster services lead at Food Bank for New York
16 City. On behalf of Food Bank, we thank the
17 Committee on Public Safety for calling this
18 important hearing and advancing these critical
19 bills. Food Bank has submitted my testimony in
20 full to the Committee. I would like to highlight
21 specific points with respect to Introductions
22 number 1069 and 1077 dealing with the food and
23 water access plan and fuel management plans
24 respectively. After Sandy HRA generously and
25 wisely released efap [phonetic] supplies already

1
2 in food banks warehoused to be used for disaster
3 response. Swift release of this food was
4 instrumental in enabling Food Bank to provide
5 nutritious products to meet the needs of the
6 impacted areas. Food Bank requested the City
7 Council to authorize the automatic release of efap
8 supplies for use in emergency response during
9 emergency conditions is defined by Section 497 of
10 the New York City Charter. Second, Food Bank
11 distributed more than 40 tractor trailers of food
12 after Sandy; however, had additional trucks been
13 available, more could have been done and had our
14 trucking partner been incapacitated by Sandy Food
15 Bank would have been unable to distribute
16 emergency food; therefore, Food Bank recommends
17 City Council amend Introduction 1069 to require
18 that food and water distribution plan include a
19 strategy to ensure that emergency good
20 distributors have adequate trucking to provide
21 food and water to impacted areas. Thirdly, with
22 respect to Introduction 1077 Food Bank requests an
23 amendment to include identified emergency food
24 providers and their key staff members with fuel
25 access prioritization. And lastly, Food Bank

1
2 requests the City Council to amend Introduction
3 1069 to formally recognize identified emergency
4 food providers as emergency responders during
5 conditions that affect the ability of New York
6 City residents to access food and water. We
7 welcome any thoughts, questions or requests from
8 the Committee, and thank you for the opportunity
9 to testify.

10 LISA LEVY: Good afternoon. I am
11 Lisa Levy, the policy, advocacy and organizing
12 director of the New York City Coalition against
13 Hunger. My testimony today is on behalf of the
14 1,100 soup kitchens and food pantries in New York
15 City and the more than 1.4 million New York City
16 residents who even before Sandy hit lived in homes
17 who couldn't afford sufficient food. The New York
18 City Coalition Against Hunger endorses the
19 legislation proposed by Council Members Comrie,
20 Gonzalez, Koppell, Oddo, Rose and Vacca, namely
21 the food access plan, the community recovery plan,
22 the outreach and recovery plan for vulnerable
23 populations and the transportation plan. My
24 testimony today focuses on eight points. Given
25 that local poverty and hunger food and security

1
2 were soaring even before Sandy hit and agencies
3 serving low income people were unable to keep up
4 with the growing demand, the storm and its
5 aftermath made a bad situation worse. Evacuations
6 did not adequately address the unique challenges
7 in communicating with low income populations.
8 Evacuation plans did not adequately protect food
9 supplies and water supplies at soup kitchens and
10 food pantries. Not profit groups who were second
11 responders tasked with providing helps soon after
12 a storm were themselves hampered by lack of
13 adequate post-storm infrastructure and
14 communications. There was unacceptable delay in
15 food relief reaching some of the hardest hit low
16 income neighborhoods, and some of the food
17 distributed immediately after the storm was
18 unsuited to many of the people in need.
19 Recipients of SNAP benefits formerly known as food
20 stamps had serious difficulty using them at
21 neighborhood retailers in the hardest hit
22 neighborhoods and disaster SNAP was unduly delayed
23 and limited. Lastly, the greatest needs for low
24 income people are long term. We are still
25 struggling. We are still hungry. Don't forget

1
2 about it. We are still here. Even before
3 Hurricane Sandy hit New York that is the message
4 we heard time and time again from low income New
5 Yorkers in all five boroughs as well as from the
6 staff and volunteers of more than 11 food pantries
7 that we represent. This message reflects the
8 reality of the ongoing struggle in New York City.
9 Federal data calculated by the coalition found
10 that even before the storm more than 1.4 million
11 New Yorkers lived in households that couldn't
12 afford enough food.

13 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: I don't know
14 how much more you have there, but are you
15 finishing up? When that bell goes off, please...

16 LISA LEVY: I can summarize.
17 According to a federal food insecurity data, in
18 2009 to 2011 an estimated average of 1.42 million
19 or approximately 17 percent of New Yorkers were
20 food insecure. That represents one in six New
21 Yorkers. Many of those same people are effected
22 right now by cuts in sequestration and are
23 probably going to be effected cuts that are going
24 to happen with SNAP cuts, which thankfully may not
25 happen as a result of the House not passing the

1
2 farm bill, which happened earlier today thanks
3 from support from this City Council, which I would
4 like to thank those of you who are still here, but
5 the fact is hungry children can't eat. Hungry
6 adults can't work. Hungry senior citizens can't
7 stay independent, and all of these problems cost
8 the economy money.

9 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: You have got
10 to finish up. It is not fair to everyone else.

11 LISA LEVY: Evacuation plans had
12 great impact on low income people, and they focus
13 on communicating with impacted residents. Many
14 low income people in the hardest hit areas,
15 especially in public housing did not receive full
16 and complete or any information about city
17 evacuation plans.

18 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Can I move on
19 to the next person? One more sentence because you
20 are well over two minutes, and I asked everyone to
21 stay within two minutes. Okay.

22 LISA LEVY: I understand.

23 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: We do have
24 your statement here, and it gets entered into the
25 record. Okay. Thank you. Let me go with you now

1
2 over right here on the right, my left, and my
3 right. The left.

4 JUAN CAMILO OSORIO: Thank you. My
5 name is Juan Camilo Osorio--

6 LISA LEVY: [interposing] Can I
7 just--

8 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: No, you have
9 been going way over your limit, and I asked you to
10 sum up nicely a few times. You just keep reading,
11 so I can't let that happen. Yes, you go, sir.

12 JUAN CAMILO OSORIO: Thank you. My
13 name is Juan Camilo Osorio. I am the director of
14 research with New York City Environmental Justice
15 Alliance. I prepared a three minute testimony
16 that I am going to try to summarize as much as
17 possible. Founded in 1991, the New York City
18 Environmental Justice Alliance is a non-profit,
19 citywide membership network linking grassroots
20 organizations from low income neighborhoods and
21 communities of color in their struggle for
22 environmental justice. When the city of New York
23 initiated its overhaul of the comprehensive
24 waterfront plan in 2010 EJA began an advocacy
25 campaign to convince the Bloomberg Administration

1
2 to reform waterfront zones designated as
3 significant maritime and industrial areas and EJA
4 discovered that the six SMIA's are all in hurricane
5 storm surge zones and that the city of New York
6 had not analyzed the - - contamination exposure
7 risks associated with clusters of heavy industrial
8 users in such vulnerable locations. So following
9 the aftermath of super storm Sandy, EJA co
10 convened the Sandy - - assembly, which is an
11 association of environmental justice
12 organizations, community based groups, labor
13 unions and our allies to discuss from vulnerable
14 areas in new York and New Jersey to discuss
15 recommendations, goals and articulate our recovery
16 agenda that was released on April 1st, e-mailed to
17 the City Council and handed to the SIRR for its
18 inclusion in the city's recovery plan. This is a
19 summary of the main features within those
20 recommendations. Number one, as part of the City
21 Council's efforts to address the needs of
22 vulnerable groups requiring special attention we
23 urge you to consider the following recommendations
24 as the relate to Intros 1053, 1070, 1073 and 1065-
25 -address the specific needs of vulnerable

1
2 populations by maintaining privacy rights while
3 creating a public housing registry of elderly or
4 disabled residents, at the same time train
5 volunteers and local SIRR teams in collaboration
6 with community based organizations that should
7 receive funding for training community members.
8 Number two, as part of the City Council's efforts
9 to create a community recovery plan to respond to
10 emergency conditions, we urge you to consider the
11 following recommendations as they relate to Intros
12 1054, 1076 and 1072--I am going to summarize--by
13 highlighting the need to address potential public
14 health impacts of climate change on vulnerable
15 communities, which means identifying industrial
16 waterfront threats, funding of participatory
17 investigation of public health risks associated
18 with potential exposures to industrial clusters of
19 hazardous substances and toxic chemicals and the
20 opportunities to mitigate them as a collaborative
21 effort between community, industry and government.
22 You have our testimony. I urge you to review
23 these specific recommendations that we have
24 indicated as they relate to the bills under
25 discussion as well as the Sandy Original Assembly

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

[phonetic] recovery agenda. Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you.

Do you need ten seconds to say something you forgot?

LISA LEVY: The greatest need for food aid is long term, and we just wanted to say that we worry greatly that as the cameras leave and elected officials--not city officials, but other officials migrate to the next disaster, low income and hungry New Yorkers will again face neglect and we hope that the feelings of good will immediately following the storm can be expanded to include understanding that no one should go without food.

CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you.

There were decided lack of press cameras here today. Thank you all. Now we are going to go to Christina Rangel [phonetic] from the National Electrical Contracting Association, Jeffrey Frediani [phonetic], AAA, Harrison Peck [phonetic], Metropolitan Waterfront Alliance. If anyone is still in the room... Okay, Christina, you start.

CHRISTINE RANGEL: Good afternoon,

1
2 and thank you, Council Member Vallone. My name is
3 Christine Rangel of the National Electrical
4 Contractors Association, the New York City
5 chapter. Today I speak on behalf of those
6 contractors. We are the largest chapter of the
7 National Electrical Contractors Association in the
8 United States and the voice of the unionized
9 electrical construction industry in New York City,
10 Westchester and Fairfield Counties. We are
11 comprised of over 300 unionized member firms
12 employing over 15,000 men and women contributing
13 to over 20 million man hours of work per year.
14 Over 2.5 of those million man hours were dedicated
15 to the recovery and reconstruction efforts in the
16 aftermath of Hurricane Sandy. Since 1892 our
17 association has been building and powering New
18 York from the smallest bodega to the Freedom Tower
19 and everything in between. We represent an
20 important contingent and resource for the city
21 during emergency situations. We have assisted in
22 reconstruction efforts to get New York back up and
23 running in times of disaster and crisis, whether
24 it be fire, blackouts, terrorist attacks, storms
25 or Hurricane Sandy, we have always been at the

1
2 forefront in times of need with manpower and
3 expertise to get the city back on its feet.
4 Immediately following Hurricane Sandy our
5 contractors were in every corner of the Rockaways,
6 Staten Island and downtown Manhattan installing
7 hundreds of power providing generators and working
8 swiftly to get New Yorkers back online. We
9 participated in the early meetings with OEM. The
10 city called on us to mobilize our contractors and
11 our massive workforce to participate in the rapid
12 repairs program. if there is one thing that we
13 have all learned from Hurricane Sandy it is that
14 rapid response is what is needed in the immediate
15 aftermath of the disaster. One recommendation in
16 the New York City Hurricane Sandy after action
17 report is to "develop a comprehensive plan to
18 expedite power restoration to multi-family, public
19 and private housing." We believe that we can play
20 an integral role in your development of a
21 comprehensive disaster recovery plan, so when you
22 are doing your emergency response planning, please
23 allow us to join you at the table to work out the
24 many specific details relating to electrical
25 construction. We have the ability to mobilize and

1
2 attend to immediate needs of our city during
3 crisis, restoring infrastructure, street lighting,
4 power and communications systems and get the
5 subways, homes and businesses running. We are
6 well organized, reliable, agile and we are able to
7 deploy teams immediately. We have responded to a
8 call in the past, and we will do it again. Thank
9 you.

10 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: And I am
11 making sure our staff has your information so that
12 you are kept involved.

13 CHRISTINE RANGEL: Thank you.

14 JEFFREY FREDIANI: Good afternoon.
15 My name is Jeffrey Frediani. I am a legislative
16 analyst with AAA New York, and we serve more than
17 1.6 million members residing in the city of New
18 York and adjacent counties in New York State. We
19 support both Intro 1076 and 1077. We support the
20 implementation of Intro 1076 before another
21 natural disaster strikes because it is vital for
22 safety that traffic lights continue to be
23 operational, particularly at high traffic
24 intersections in the event of a power outage.
25 Installing alternate power, solar or both would go

1
2 a long way towards reducing the number of traffic
3 lights and signals that would otherwise not be
4 illuminated which jeopardizes public safety, and
5 in addition we support Intro 1077 as a fuel
6 management plan would in our opinion help mitigate
7 disruptions to the fuel supply. It is especially
8 important to assess the potential transportation
9 routes to allow fuel providers to reach their
10 destinations within the city of New York as
11 required by this Intro. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: That is the
13 quickest yet. Thanks. Are you Harrison?

14 JOSE SOGARD: No my name is Jose
15 Sogard [phonetic]. I am--

16 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: [interposing]
17 But you are from the same group?

18 JOSE SOGARD: That is correct.

19 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you for
20 coming to the community board about the Astoria
21 Ferry Service because that is going to be
22 important.

23 JOSE SOGARD: I will relay that
24 message to him. Thanks. So good afternoon, and
25 thank you for the opportunity to submit this

1
2 testimony. I am testifying on behalf of the
3 Metropolitan Waterfront Alliance, a coalition of
4 over 730 businesses, community and recreational
5 groups, educational institutions and other
6 stakeholders committed to transforming the New
7 York and New Jersey harbor and its waterways to
8 make them cleaner and more accessible with great
9 parks, great jobs and great transportation for
10 all. Super storm Sandy sounded a wakeup call
11 across the five boroughs. We applaud Speaker
12 Quinn and the City Council for their aggressive
13 approach to preparing New York for the hazards of
14 climate change and extreme weather. In particular
15 we are pleased to see that the Council recognizes
16 how critical ferries are in emergency situations.
17 As the most resilient mode of public transit, it
18 is essential that ferries are central to all
19 contingency transportation plans; however, the
20 maximize the utility of ferries under emergency
21 circumstances there are several policy measures
22 the city can undertake in the short term to ensure
23 we are adequately prepared for the future. First
24 of all at present, New York City suffers from a
25 conspicuous dearth of coastal infrastructure for

1
2 ferry boat tie up. Legal regulations require that
3 all airplanes, public buildings and subway cars be
4 equipped with unobstructed emergency exits to
5 allow for quick and safe evacuations; however the
6 fringe with the 520 mile coastline New York City
7 lacks analogous requirements for water borne
8 evacuation points. The vast majority of New York
9 City's marine edge precludes public access
10 entirely or is designed for passive use while
11 opportunities for active maritime use and water
12 access are extremely limited. Second, in the wake
13 of an emergency event that results in power
14 outages and transit shutdowns, New Yorkers
15 instinctively flock to piers and landings, waiting
16 in long lines to board ferries and rescue boats,
17 which lead to overcrowding and delays and
18 available vessels are overwhelmed by passenger
19 demand. Transit experts have consistently
20 recommended adding more interborough ferry routes
21 in order to mitigate congestion on both the water
22 and the land. Especially given rapid population
23 growth projected over the coming decades,
24 increasing maritime mass transit will strengthen
25 the city's capacity for water borne evacuation and

1 the effectiveness of its emergency response.
2 Finally, though ferry crews are vital to water
3 borne evacuation efforts, they lack official
4 authorization as emergency management personnel.
5 This inconsistency manifests itself following
6 emergencies when police officers and emergency
7 response officials often deny ferry crews access
8 to blockaded roads and river crossings, delaying
9 their ability to get to vessels or prohibiting
10 them from entering disaster areas. Moreover, when
11 fuel shortages result in excessive wait times at
12 gas stations, ferry operators and their crews
13 should be prioritized for fuel allocation so that
14 they may quickly travel the water and run
15 necessary water borne transit service. To rectify
16 these problems, the city must grant ferry
17 operators and their crews emergency personnel
18 status. Thank you for the opportunity to deliver
19 this testimony.
20

21 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you
22 all. The next panel will be Susan - - , Julia. I
23 will just go with the first names. You can yell
24 out your last name. Edith Prentice [phonetic],
25 that is an easy one, Sophia Carlton [phonetic] and

1
2 Jeff Lieberman [phonetic]. - - Normally we lose
3 half the people because they can't stay, but you
4 guys are all staying, which is nice. You are
5 here. You can start while we are waiting for the
6 rest. just hit the button.

7 SUSAN DOOHA: My name is Susan
8 Dooha [phonetic]. I am the executive director of
9 Center for Independence of the Disabled in New
10 York, and we are one of the agencies that has been
11 responding to disasters in New York City since
12 2001 when we became the leading agency responding
13 on behalf of people with disabilities. We have
14 attempted over the many years to work with the New
15 York City Office of Emergency Management on
16 creating an inclusive disaster preparedness plan
17 and response; however, we owe it to the City
18 Council for providing us with a real opportunity
19 to address the gaps in emergency preparedness and
20 disaster response on the part of the city. We
21 applaud you for keeping these issues before the
22 city officials and believe that absent a full plan
23 that accounts for the needs of all communities we
24 unnecessarily place the lives of people with
25 disabilities and seniors at risk. We are

1 particularly pleased the ten bills. We think they
2 present a positive step. We would certainly like
3 to see some of those bills strengthened. For
4 example, in the area of transportation ensuring
5 that para transit is able to access emergency
6 zones just as other transportation is able to in
7 the wake of a disaster or going further than
8 looking at simply the deployment of existing
9 accessible transportation resources, looking at
10 the adequacy of those resources in the event of a
11 disaster. 80 percent of the city's subways are
12 inaccessible for people with disabilities. It is
13 absolutely imperative that we look at whether our
14 transportation system is capable of meeting the
15 needs in a disaster. Similarly although Mr.
16 Calloway [phonetic] said that we are ready for
17 hurricane season, we know that the shelters are
18 not ready, the evacuation centers are not ready to
19 meet the needs of people with disabilities. We
20 believe that the city council is taking important
21 steps to address this, and we would like to see
22 those efforts strengthened. With respect to a
23 special needs registry we actually share the
24 concerns of the city about a registry approach to
25

1
2 addressing people with disabilities and seniors
3 living in the community, and we would like to
4 recommend a different kind of community planning
5 process that would allow us to address evacuation
6 needs. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you.

8 Why don't we finish up this side of the table
9 first? You guys are in charge.

10 JULIA PINOVER: Good afternoon. My
11 name is Julia Pinover [phonetic]. I am a senior
12 staff attorney in charge of the New York Office of
13 Disability Rights Advocates. First I would like
14 to thank the City Council for recognizing that
15 there are serious failures with the city's
16 emergency plans and I applaud the City Council for
17 taking steps to improve the city's plans. These
18 bills deal with emergency preparedness and the
19 Council should be aware that emergency
20 preparedness for New Yorkers with disabilities is
21 the subject of a federal class action lawsuit. I
22 am one of the attorneys working on that lawsuit.
23 There was a trial on these issues in March and we
24 are currently awaiting a ruling from a federal
25 district judge. What became clear at trial is

1
2 that OEM's emergency plans do not adequately serve
3 the needs of New Yorkers with disabilities, and
4 without guidance from you or the court OEM's plans
5 will continue to fail seniors and people with
6 disabilities. The bills in front of the City
7 Council today may improve the city's emergency
8 response for persons with disabilities, but as is
9 the package of legislation remains problematic. I
10 am going to give some overall recommendations
11 rather than dissect each one. I have four points
12 to make today. First, with regards to persons
13 with disabilities much of the proposed legislation
14 is vague. Second, formalized agreements with NGOs
15 are necessary for an effective response to persons
16 with disabilities needs. Third, the efficacy of
17 plans must be assessed with respect to persons
18 with disabilities. Fourth, communities of persons
19 with disabilities must be consulted in developing
20 a plan. I don't have much time, so I will just
21 say--I will skip to the end--community
22 consultation. Persons with disabilities are
23 really in the best position to identify their
24 foreseeable emergency needs and to problem solve
25 realistic ways of meeting those needs. OEM has

1
2 not effectively or meaningfully incorporated the
3 community feedback into their plans in the past,
4 and they should be directed to do so in the
5 future. Thank you.

6 JEFF LIEBERMAN: Good afternoon.

7 My name is Jeff Lieberman, and I am director of
8 the Coalition of Institutionalized, Aging and
9 Disabled. We are a non-profit grassroots
10 organization run by and for - - residents and
11 resident councils. In the aftermath of Hurricane
12 Sandy, CIAD staff worked around the clock to
13 locate displaced residents, report their needs to
14 state agencies and provide assistance. We are
15 currently working with students and recent
16 graduates from the Columbia University School of
17 Social Work, of which Sophia Carlton is joining me
18 today, on a participatory research project on
19 Hurricane Sandy that provides a powerful platform
20 from which adult home [phonetic] residents can
21 communicate their stories and concerns to
22 policymakers like you. The preliminary findings
23 of the report support aspects of the proposed
24 legislative package before us today, but also
25 point to how these important proposals can be

1 strengthened to improve the states and city's
2 disaster preparedness. For example, several of
3 the bills require the commissioner of OEM to
4 develop and implement several plans including a
5 health facilities evacuation plan, a sheltering
6 plan and a special medical needs tracking plan.
7 Of course planning is essential to disaster
8 preparedness, but essential to developing a good
9 plan is its inclusiveness and engagement with the
10 disabled communities it is meant to serve. The
11 development of these plans must include the
12 participation and input of adult home residents,
13 nursing home residents and people with
14 disabilities living in the community. Furthermore
15 because of the unique situation of adult homes and
16 nursing homes as state regulated facilities that
17 will inevitably be dependent on municipal services
18 in a disaster New York City and New York State
19 must work together to develop a comprehensive
20 disaster plan not only for the orderly and timely
21 evacuations of people and institutions as proposed
22 in 1073, but also for the development of a safe
23 and adequate sheltering plan. We applaud the City
24 Council for its leadership in this area. We
25

1
2 believe that 1053, 1070, 1073 and 1075 are
3 critically important first steps. I will now turn
4 it over to Sophia, who will discuss our
5 preliminary findings and responses to the bills
6 and a little more detail. I want to point out to
7 you that you have the brief of our report attached
8 to our testimony. Thank you.

9 SOPHIA CARLTON: Thanks, Jeff.

10 Good afternoon, and thank you for this opportunity
11 to testify. My name is Sophia Carlton, and I am a
12 recent graduate of Columbia University's School of
13 Social Work. I have submitted a longer testimony,
14 but will give a brief summary here. As Jeff
15 mentioned, during my last semester as a student I
16 partnered with CIAD to investigate issues
17 surrounding the evacuation and sheltering of adult
18 home residents with a framework of participatory
19 action research. For this project, myself and
20 three other Columbia students visited eight adult
21 homes and conducted focus groups and one on one
22 interviews with 28 residents who were affected by
23 the storm. Although the results I speak about
24 today are preliminary we believe that these
25 findings provide evidence in support of several of

1
2 the bills on the agenda today and also highlight
3 areas where these proposals could be strengthened.
4 For instance bill 1070 would provide mechanisms to
5 ensure the availability of transportation and beds
6 at healthcare facilities in the event of an
7 evacuation. Given that all of the participants in
8 our study who were evacuated reported issues with
9 the process, adult home facilities must be
10 included in this legislation. In addition our
11 study revealed many concerns of residents who were
12 evacuated to other adult homes. Part pants cited
13 instances of gross overcrowding with room
14 capacities more than doubling in some cases. At
15 one point Queens Adult Care Center provided
16 shelter to two additional facilities. A system to
17 monitor available beds at other adult home
18 facilities could have prevented the conditions
19 that residents faced. Bill 1070 would also
20 address several of the concerns brought to light
21 in our research. For example, all of the
22 residents who were evacuated to DHS operated
23 shelters reported concerns with restrooms with
24 issues ranging from cleanliness to accessibility
25 to a lack of adequate facilities. Bill 1070 would

1
2 make sure than mechanisms would be put into place
3 to solve some of these issues. Finally, we would
4 like express not only our support, but also the
5 urgency for bill 1053. Our study uncovered
6 shocking consequences likely spurred by destroyed
7 medical records or records that were in disarray
8 after the evacuation. Nearly 20 percent of all
9 residents interviewed reported having troubles
10 with medication during the evacuation or
11 sheltering period. One individual we spoke with
12 was admitted to a hospital for two weeks after his
13 medication was mixed up with another resident's.
14 similar issues could be prevented in the future
15 with a mechanism to track the medical needs of
16 individuals when files are destroyed. We look
17 forward to sharing the final report once it is
18 completed and working with Council Members to
19 ensure that these critical steps are taken to
20 improve emergency planning for future disasters.
21 Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank though,
23 I think your name is a little long. Coalition of
24 Institutionalized, Aging and Disabled. Is there
25 even an acronym for that that that is shorter?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SOPHIA CARLTON: CIAD.

JEFF LIEBERMAN: C-I-A-D.

FEMALE VOICE: - - the
organizations feel they need to have long names.

CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: It is very
difficult to say it quickly.

JEFF LIEBERMAN: Now you will
remember us.

CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: I will, and I
took my two minutes trying to say your name.
Thank you all. I look forward to working with
you. The next panel--we have two more panels.
This one is rather large, Ruth Finkelstein
[phonetic], Melaney Everett [phonetic], Patricia
Caridad [phonetic] and Bove and - - Denise - - .

RUTH FINKELSTEIN: My name is Ruth
Finkelstein, and as I usually do, I am going to
just submit the written testimony and talk about a
couple of things with you that I think are
salient. I am here from the New York Academy of
Medicine, and one of the things that we work on
very intensely is health aging, and one of the
issues with disaster preparedness is the need as
the previous panel just said to consult directly

1
2 with the vulnerable populations about what they
3 need to prepare for, recover from, and regain
4 their normal lives from a storm. I don't see that
5 consultation explicitly mentioned in your
6 legislation just as I don't see that consultation
7 having occurred in the city's planning process.

8 Because we have conducted quite a bit of that
9 consultation, I want to summarize a couple of key
10 findings from it. The first is that just
11 exhorting people to evacuate or how to prepare is
12 not enough. Many people need direct assistance in
13 order to follow those directions effectively, to
14 understand the directions and to evaluate what
15 they should do personally about it. Issues that
16 require assistance include need for assistance
17 with accessibility as has been described with
18 language as has been described with other medical
19 and pharmacy issues as has been described and non-
20 profits, the NGOs, the community based
21 organizations that people are used to interacting
22 with are your key sort of translators and levers
23 and trusted sources particularly when we are
24 talking about people with particular needs. The
25 second point I want to make is that instead of

1 focusing on what we believe to be a time and
2 resource squandering of this issue of a new
3 registry rather than aggregation of information
4 from existing sources is instead to focus on
5 creating the kind of community cohesiveness and
6 neighborliness and communicativeness that we think
7 is more effective to helping people to prepare to
8 shelter and to recover, and we see a remarkable
9 dearth of this community mindedness in the
10 federal, the state and the city responses, which
11 very much focus on the individual. I would like
12 to recommend to you the excellent testimony,
13 detailed testimony of the Gray Panthers
14 [phonetic], Jack Cufferman [phonetic], who really
15 takes apart all the current research on this
16 registry issue, and I think it will help your
17 thinking enormously to read it. Lastly, I'd like
18 to say that the New York Academy of Medicine has a
19 team whose job it is to conduct evidence based
20 policy analysis. We know a lot about this topic,
21 and we are able to research effectively and well.
22 Use us please. We know that we share a common
23 objective to be sure that the needs of every New
24 Yorker particularly those with special needs are
25

1
2 anticipated and adequately met in the event of a
3 range of disasters. Let us help you do that.

4 Thank you.

5 FEMALE VOICE: Thanks for this
6 opportunity. I am from the Mental Health
7 Association of New York, specifically Life Net.
8 Life Net is the only multi-cultural crisis center
9 operating 24/7 with mental health professionals
10 providing free behavioral health assessments,
11 interventions and support. Nationally the
12 disaster distress help line is a network of crisis
13 centers providing 24/7 hotline and tech support
14 for people struggling with difficult emotions
15 before, during or after any disaster in the U.S.
16 The disaster stress line is a program of - -
17 administered by MHA NYC. Our organization has
18 also provided trainings, technical assistance,
19 disaster case management through our crisis
20 counseling service, all which have been utilized
21 in response efforts including September 11th
22 terrorist attacks, Sandy Hook Elementary
23 shootings, Boston Marathon bombing, Hurricane
24 Katrina, tropical storm Irene and now Hurricane
25 Sandy. In light of MHA NYC's service to New

1
2 Yorkers over the years and now with Hurricane
3 Sandy, I am here today to call attention to the
4 importance of addressing mental health in all
5 aspects of emergency planning and management.
6 Regarding disasters basic material needs are
7 understandably being planned for, distributed and
8 measured in all stages of preparedness, but it
9 essential that we remember mental health is also
10 basic need; therefore, it is vital to make the
11 public aware of all available services and to
12 educate on recognizing the signs of such mental
13 health issues as depression, anxiety and substance
14 abuse, all which may be exacerbated in reaction to
15 disasters and their enduring impact. Shortly
16 after Hurricane Sandy a Gallup Survey was
17 conducted among residents of New York and New
18 Jersey with findings that those living in zip
19 codes most directly affected by Hurricane Sandy
20 experienced a 25 percent increase in depression
21 diagnosis in the six weeks after impact. I have
22 shared a copy with the panel. So our suggestions
23 would be to mandate that Life Net as New York
24 City's designated mental health and substance
25 abuse crisis intervention be included in all

1
2 disaster response, educational materials,
3 training, disaster planning, outreach events so
4 that New Yorkers experience emotional distress
5 before during and after the disasters know where
6 to turn for 24/7 support, highlight the need for
7 continued and expanded funding for mental health
8 services that play a critical role in disasters
9 such as Life Net, which coincidentally was
10 identified as perhaps the single most important
11 asset in the 9/11 mental health response, ensure
12 that mental health experts, providers and
13 consumers are invited to the emergency planning
14 and management table of the committee's taskforce
15 and other opportunities, address the mental health
16 needs of all effected individuals, including
17 response and recovery workers and other high risk
18 populations, children, seniors and people with
19 disabilities and offer resources for evidence and
20 - - disaster mental health training such as list
21 and protect and connect psychological first aid
22 for New York City employees. A city that supports
23 year round comprehensive culturally inclusive
24 mental health initiatives and disaster planning is
25 a stronger more resilient city, one that is better

1
2 equipped to bounce back after a devastating
3 disaster such as Hurricane Sandy. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Our clock guy
5 left, but I think we are going to be back on
6 schedule.

7 PATRICIA CARIDAD: Good afternoon.
8 My name is Patricia Caridad. I am a registered
9 nurse, and I work with the New York State Nurses'
10 Association. I was responsible for coordinating
11 medical care for the residents of Staten Island in
12 the aftermath of Sandy. I have also done Sandy
13 recovery work in Coney Island, Far Rockaway, and I
14 have visited Oklahoma. On the coordination of
15 services loss of durable medical equipment after
16 Sandy was a major problem for survivors in Staten
17 Island. An arrangement needs to be made with
18 medical supply companies before a disaster so that
19 disaster survivors who have lost their equipment
20 can have it replaced in timely fashion. During
21 the aftermath of Sandy NYSNA leaders pleaded with
22 the Mayor's Office to help us obtain portable
23 nebulizers. We were told that these were not life
24 or death medical devices. These are lifesaving
25 machines for many patients, so through

1
2 neighborhood outreach we were able to reconnect
3 survivors with the equipment they needed and from
4 people out of state, not our own city. Develop an
5 emergency response tetanus vaccination plan to be
6 conducted by registered health professionals
7 within the disaster area going door to door.
8 During the weeks after Sandy me and my team
9 vaccinated at least 500 individuals who had been
10 injured during the recovery. These tetanus
11 vaccinations were donated by a Staten Island
12 doctor because we were getting the runaround from
13 the city and we were not able to attain them
14 through the city. How medical services can be
15 made available to effected residents, in Oklahoma
16 when I provided emergency relief to the victims,
17 they have clinics in a can, which are freight
18 containers converted to clinics. They station
19 these clinics right in the neighborhood and can
20 administer care to victims immediately. I ran a
21 clinic like this in Coney Island for six months
22 and was able to care for 40 patients that had no
23 way of getting medical care because their clinic
24 was closed. Mental health issues must be
25 addressed on a consistent, ongoing basis, PTSD is

1
2 rampant and survivors should have support from the
3 city to attain therapy. Anybody who has survived
4 or experienced the losses associated with a
5 disaster must be treated immediately to enable
6 their lives to get on. The closing of the Bailey
7 Seton [phonetic] inpatient detox center has been a
8 true hardship and detrimental to Sandy survivors.
9 This has compounded the problem by cutting the
10 patients off. NYSNA has been involved in the long
11 term recovery organization on Staten Island since
12 November, and we feel that this group should be
13 part of any ongoing situation with the city.

14 Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you.

16 Rabbi?

17 RABBI JENICE BATITIA: Thank you
18 for this hearing today. My name is Rabbi Jenice
19 Batitia [phonetic]. I am on the leadership team
20 for Disaster Chaplaincy Services of New York.
21 Disaster Chaplaincy Services is the pre 9/11 non-
22 profit multi-faith, multi-cultural, multi-language
23 spiritual care disaster relief chaplaincy
24 organization. our 160 volunteer chaplains
25 represent 28 faith traditions, speaking 30

1
2 different languages. Each of our chaplains is
3 trained in emergency spiritual care. Even before
4 9/11 the importance of spiritual care during a
5 disaster was apparent. Subsequent to Hurricane
6 Katrina Disaster Chaplaincy Services of New York
7 was one of the partnering agencies helping to
8 write the New York City coastal storm plan. We
9 encouraged the city and agencies to make sure that
10 disaster chaplaincy services be utilized during
11 any event. During and in the aftermath of Sandy
12 Disaster Chaplaincy Services worked with and
13 offered interfaith spiritual care to victims of
14 the storm to people working with the city and
15 private agencies to people involved with other
16 organizational volunteer groups and their support
17 systems. The spiritual and emotional care
18 provided is difficult to calculate in numbers
19 except for statistics that I will offer you in a
20 moment. Disaster Chaplaincy Services knows from
21 all of our contacts that the service we provide is
22 deep and abiding. While Sandy was still wreaking
23 havoc Disaster Chaplaincy Service leaders were
24 communicating with our volunteer chaplains to
25 determine their safety and availability to be

1
2 deployed. One-third of our chaplain responders
3 were either directly affected by Sandy, their
4 houses of worship or their congregants were badly
5 effected as were mine on the south shore of Long
6 Island. They rejoined our team as soon as they
7 were capable of. I was one of two disaster
8 chaplaincy service chaplains, part of an initial
9 advanced fact finding team in the Rockaways as
10 early as November 1st. During and after Sandy, 76
11 chaplains from Disaster Chaplaincy Services were
12 deployed. Of those 76 we staffed 16 shelters and
13 nine other locations, which included feeding
14 vehicles, feeding centers, the employee assistance
15 plan because the Mayor's Office of Labor Relations
16 requested that we work directly with the EAP
17 employees and the employees of the Sanitation
18 Department. We also volunteered at bulk
19 distribution centers for food, clothing and
20 information. Our chaplains were available for 197
21 shifts in addition 43 shifts at the American Red
22 Cross headquartered totaling 240 shifts. Our
23 chaplains spent 645 hours in the field related to
24 Sandy. We had over 900 contacts of individuals in
25 the field, and an additional 344 contacts at the

1
2 American Red Cross Headquarters totaling 1244
3 contacts. Disaster Chaplaincy Services of New
4 York's chaplains while volunteering at shelters in
5 the American Red Cross Headquarters and other
6 locations not only served the victims of Sandy,
7 but also offered spiritual care to mental health
8 volunteers and support staff through the end of
9 February 2013.

10 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: You need to
11 finish up.

12 RABBI JENICE BATITIA: I've got 30
13 seconds. Our chaplains reside and work in a large
14 area from Columbia County down through the five
15 boroughs. Due to the widespread damage of Sandy
16 and the inability to travel, Disaster Chaplaincy
17 Services could not employ all of our chaplains.
18 Not knowing the duration or the long term need
19 disaster, Disaster Chaplaincy Services implemented
20 what we call the just in time program for faith
21 leaders not yet volunteering with us. Our
22 leadership reached out to the extended interfaith
23 community. In that time, we trained 71 clergy, 24
24 of whom are now part of our clergy team. We
25 strongly urge that Disaster Chaplaincy Services of

1
2 New York be utilized to the fullest extend to
3 provide enduring spiritual care during any and all
4 disasters that occur in New York and all of her
5 boroughs. Thank you for your time.

6 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you.

7 The synagogues and the churches I saw down there
8 most when I went down there, which is why I
9 sponsored a bill to have FEMA restitution go to
10 private groups like synagogues and churches. Last
11 panel is Mark Ladoff [phonetic], Laura Abel
12 [phonetic], Melissa McCrum [phonetic] and Betina
13 Delmiani [phonetic]. Has anyone else signed up
14 that did not testify? You put in a card? And
15 your name is? Just come on up, and you will
16 testify. Give her one slip to fill out in case we
17 lost it. Thank you. Why don't you start on the
18 end, ma'am, while we are waiting? Thanks.

19 LAURA ABEL: Hi. My name is Laura
20 Abel. I am the senior policy counsel at Lawyers'
21 Alliance for New York. We are the leading
22 provider of business and transactional legal
23 services to the non-profits that work in New York
24 City neighborhoods. As Council Member Reyna and
25 Deputy Mayor Gibbs discussed community based

1 organizations play a critical role in disaster
2 recovery. These organizations need to be an
3 integral part of the city's disaster planning
4 process, not just the response. We support the
5 ten bills that have been introduced, but those
6 bills would be stronger and more consistently
7 directed OEM to work closely with non-profits in
8 every aspect of disaster planning. I have given
9 specifics suggestions in my written testimony, but
10 I will just give one example. Intro 1054 directs
11 OEM to include in its community recovery plan a
12 description of ways to leverage community based
13 organizations, service providers and volunteers.
14 The Commissioner should develop that plan in
15 collaboration with existing community based
16 organizations and service providers, not just
17 reach out to them when it needs them. The bills
18 should also say how the city will help non-profits
19 recover from physical or other damage they
20 received. Non-profits should be included in the
21 small business recovery plan described in Intro
22 1072 or there should be a separate bill requiring
23 OEM to develop a non-profit recovery plan. I have
24 attached to my written testimony a list of these
25

1
2 and other suggested changes to the already very
3 strong bills. Thank you.

4 MARK LADOVE: Thank you, and good
5 afternoon. My name is Mark Ladove [phonetic]. I
6 am a staff attorney with New York Lawyers' for the
7 Public Interest, and I work in NYLPI's
8 environmental justice and community development
9 project representing communities facing
10 disproportionate environmental burdens. NYLPI is
11 a member of the Sandy Regional Assembly, a
12 coalition of over 40 community based and non-
13 profit organizations who represent and serve the
14 communities hit hardest by super storm Sandy. We
15 also want to commend the City Council for taking
16 action to help our communities rebuild after Sandy
17 and for holding hearings like this to make sure
18 that the public has a voice in this process. The
19 New York City Environmental Justice Alliance has
20 already submitted testimony today that describes
21 some of the recommendations of the Sandy regional
22 assembly as they relate to the goals of these
23 bills. We full endorse that testimony, and we
24 urge the Council to take action to implement those
25 proposals. Those recommendations are the product

1
2 of hard earned wisdom from the community residents
3 who worked on the front lines after Sandy and who
4 know what worked and what did not work in the
5 recovery process. I'd like very quickly to make
6 two points, I think very much echoing what Laura
7 Abel just said. First, community organizations
8 and residents must be a formal part of a
9 participatory and transparent planning process. I
10 think that the small business recovery bill that
11 Council Member Reyna has introduced, I think
12 hopefully best reflects these priorities so far.
13 That bill requires the consultation with small
14 business owners. It sets up an infrastructure to
15 better communicate with small business owners, and
16 critically that bill requires the city to
17 communicate to small businesses in the languages
18 that reflect the communities impacted. All of
19 those principles need to be core parts of the
20 rebuilding and resiliency planning process and
21 could be and should be implemented into all of the
22 bills that the Council is considering today, and
23 secondly I would just like to urge the Council to
24 further invest in community infrastructure and
25 preparedness. After Sandy as you have said,

1
2 Council Member Vallone, community based
3 organizations and residents were critical first
4 responders. They helped vulnerable neighbors.
5 They distributed resources. They organized
6 volunteers. They led the local recovery effort.
7 The testimony that the New York City Environmental
8 Justice Alliance has submitted includes specific
9 proposals for training and funding community based
10 response teams. I would also mention that the
11 SIRR plan calls for a pilot program to identify
12 and address gaps in community capacity. We hope
13 that the City Council will similarly urge
14 investment in these kinds of community based
15 programs. Thank you.

16 GRACE ODDO: Good afternoon. I
17 don't know if it is fortuitous or not, but the t-
18 shirts that we are wearing today is we were at
19 Bellevue for a staff day and we were all asked to
20 wear these shirts and these were our Bellevue
21 storm shirts - - . My name is Grace Oddo
22 [phonetic]. I am a registered nurse at Bellevue
23 Hospital and on the board of directors for the New
24 York State Nurses' Association. I am here to
25 speak about Intro number 1073 in relation to the

1
2 evacuation of persons with special medical needs
3 during and after the emergency conditions. First,
4 I want to thank you for holding this hearing, and
5 I just want to let you know, I did work the storm
6 and the days that followed with many of my
7 colleagues who were extraordinary. Let me say
8 that October 1st seems very far away given that we
9 are already in Hurricane season and considering
10 that the National Weather Service says we are
11 expecting 11 hurricanes this year. I suggest that
12 the date for completion of this evacuation plan
13 could possibly be moved up so that we are not
14 caught unprepared during a dangerous time.

15 Secondly, it is imperative that the plan made in
16 consultation with all health care providers on the
17 ground who will be responsible for implementing it
18 including but not limited to RNs, doctors,
19 assisted personnel, engineers, machinists and
20 maintenance people. These critical members of the
21 emergency response teams in our facilities have
22 much experience to share from both Irene and Sandy
23 and no real plans can be developed without us. On
24 the issue of developing a coordinated
25 communications mechanism during Sandy at Bellevue

1
2 Coney Island and Coler Goldwater we were able to
3 do a remarkably well coordinated evacuation. We
4 didn't lose one patient, but the communication was
5 sorely lacking in two areas. There was no uniform
6 system of communicating with the staff and at the
7 outset there was a serious lack of communication
8 to the community. There were staff members left
9 in the dark figuratively and literally with no
10 phones or computer access. In many cases we wrote
11 out in long hand the treatment plans, pinned them
12 on the patient's bed sheets of the patients
13 transferred to other facilities. There should be
14 one data system for all of HHC where all of our
15 hospitals can talk to each other and follow every
16 patient. Many staffs themselves were impacted by
17 Sandy and had flooding - - flooded out staying
18 with them and communications plans need to address
19 the issue of a uniform method of reaching out to
20 the staff. There was also staff who tried to get
21 to work by driving, but were turned away when they
22 tried to cross the bridges. There should be
23 designated emergency lanes for emergency
24 caregivers. Residents from the community kept
25 coming to the hospital after we were shut down,

1 and there was no proper communication with them.
2
3 There needs to be some focus on redirecting the
4 community to alternative healthcare facilities
5 once a hospital has been evacuated. Also,
6 transportation needs to be made available for the
7 community for the closed facility to the
8 alternative site even after the evacuation has
9 been completed. Clearly the mechanisms for
10 coordinating with appropriate New York State
11 Officials will help ensure the next disaster
12 response is better coordinated and managed than it
13 was during Sandy. NYSNA suggestions that
14 incorporating in the plan, a mechanism for
15 communication with federal officials as well--

16 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: [interposing]

17 Can you sum up please?

18 GRACE ODDO: --for FEMA and
19 homeland security.

20 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you.
21 Thank you everyone in the room for waiting around
22 until this hour to testify. It is all on the
23 record, and we have your testimony. There are a
24 lot of bills today. I only had to read them, but
25 the people who had to write them are all here also

1
2 in addition - - , we have Molly Murphy and Andrea
3 Vasquez and Kelly Taylor [phonetic], Carmine - - ,
4 Lyle Frank and Jeffrey Campanas [phonetic], some
5 of whom are still hanging out in the room also,
6 and they had to write--I did say Kelly Taylor, I
7 hope. If I didn't, I'll say it again. They had
8 to write all of those bills, and they will be
9 making amendments based on your testimony. So
10 thank you all for being here, and this public
11 safety hearing is now adjourned.

12 [gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Kimberley Campbell certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature

Kimberley CampbellDate 7/15/13