CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

----X

June 4, 2013

Start: 10:09 a.m. Recess: 1:22 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers

City Hall

B E F O R E:

MARK S. WEPRIN Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Leroy G. Comrie, Jr. Daniel R. Garodnick

Robert Jackson Jessica S. Lappin

Diana Reyna Joel Rivera James Vacca Albert Vann

Vincent M. Ignizio

Ruben Wills

APPEARANCES

Robert Callahan Representative Rosemary's

Howard Goldman Representative Metro Storage New York

Richard Lobel Sheldon Lobel, P.C.

Carolyn Grossman Director of Government Affairs NYC Department of City Planning

Richard Suarez
NYC Department of City Planning

Jed Wolentis Principal Two Trees Management Company

Ray Levin
Two Trees Management Company

James Karss

Carol Lee Fink
Office of the Mayor

Mabel Bernstein New York City Economic Development Corporation

Joe Coletti
New York City Economic Development Corporation

Terry Moore Business Manager Metal Lathers Union Local 46

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Melissa Shetler Laborers, Local 79 and 79

Peter Bray
Park Slope Civic Council

Michael White Citizens Defending Libraries

Karen Brooks Hopkins President Brooklyn Academy of Music

Carlo Scissura
President and CEO
Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce

Linda Johnson CEO and President Brooklyn Public Library

Alan Fishman Chairman of the Board Brooklyn Academy of Music

Diti Sen SEIU Local 32 BJ

Deborah Howard Pratt Area Community Council

Leslie Schultz Downtown Brooklyn Arts Alliance

James Caldwell
77 Precinct Community Council

Danny Simmons Concerned Citizen

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Conrad Walker Berkeley College

Dominique Bravo Cumbrae Dance

Ginny Loloudis Executive Director Alliance of Resident Theaters New York

Philip Kellogg Executive Director Fulton Area Business Alliance

Doreen Sevaris Director of Development and Special Projects Crescent Consulting Associates

Aaron McKinney Associate Producer 651 Arts

Jackie Bush Mark Morris Dance Group

2	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay. We are
3	going to get started. Ladies and gentlemen, if we
4	could have some quiet please. My name is Mark
5	Weprin. I am chair of the Zoning and Franchises
6	Subcommittee, and I am joined today by the
7	following members of the Subcommittee: Robert
8	Jackson, Leroy Comrie, Al Vann, Joel Rivera,
9	Vincent Ignizio. That is everyone, right? That
10	is everyone who is here so far. We have a number
11	of items today, so we are going to ask for
12	some patience here. We are going to hold the BAM
13	South [phonetic] project 'till the end the last
14	one because it's got the most people here. We
15	will get to that; it will be the longest one. We
16	will try to move very quickly through the rest of
17	the agenda. So without further ado, I just want
18	to state that Land Use number 821, which is the
19	telecommunications authorization resolution is
20	laid over. We have a couple of cafes, and we have
21	people here who have to get back to their
22	businesses that were asked to be called up. I'd
23	like to call up the first one is Rosemary's, Land
24	Use number 827. That is in Speaker Quinn's
25	district, Robert Callahan [phonetic] is here. Mr.

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Callahan, if you could please state your

application. I understand you have been in

consultation with the Speaker's office, and

everything has been hunky dory.

ROBERT CALLAHAN: My name is Robert We had previously submitted a letter of Callahan. agreement to the Council. I will just read from that letter. Dear Council Member Quinn, this letter serves as our agreement with the Chair, Council Member Mark Weprin and the encompassing members of the Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises, that we will commit to the following: number one, the use of sandwich boards will be terminated, number two, the use of benches will be terminated, number three, we will remove all planters from within the sidewalk café and from the sidewalk, number four, we will reconfigure the sidewalk café to have one set of two top tables at each end of the café replacing the current arrangement of two single two top tables. will be done while maintaining eight tables and 16 seats and reducing the length of the café at the southern end. These changes will be reflected in revised plans submitted to the New York City

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2	Department	of Consumer	Affairs. I	f there are	any
3	questions,	please call	my office.	Sincerely,	
1	Carlos Suar	ez [phonetio	c], Managing	Member.	

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Mr. In consultation I know with the Callahan. Speaker's Office, these agreements were agreed to by the Speaker's Office and with discussions with the community, so members, any questions on this? Seeing none, we are going to close that hearing. Mr. Callahan, stay where you are because I understand you are also representing Land Use number 836, which is 44&X Hells Kitchen. sure exactly... roman numeral ten or is that an X? I don't know, but before I have you speak, Mr. Callahan, I just want to say we have been joined by our east side colleagues, Jessica Lappin and Dan Garodnick. Go ahead, Mr. Callahan on the next item, and you can tell me how to pronounce it.

ROBERT CALLAHAN: Yes, this is 44 by X, actually Roman numeral ten, 10th Avenue Group Inc. Again, we previously submitted a letter to the Council. I'll read from that letter. Dear Council Member Quinn, this letter serves as our agreement with the Chair, Council Member Mark

Weprin and the encompassing members of the
Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises that we will
commit to the following: number one, we will
shorten all four topped tables to 42 inches from
48 inches and shorten two top tables to 21 inches
from 24 inches to allow for increased clearance,
number two, we will arrange our sidewalk cafe
tables and chairs according to the plans on file
with the New York City Department of Consumer
Affairs and ensure a three foot water service
aisle is in place, number three, we will ensure
the appropriate sidewalk café license is clearly
posted, number four, we will revise and submit
plans to the New York City Department of Consumer
Affairs in order to reflect the presence of muni
meter, planters and smaller table size, number
five, the use of waiter station within the
sidewalk café will be terminated and number six,
we will ensure that all sidewalk café furniture is
stored nightly. If there are any questions,
please call my office. Sincerely, Bruce Horowitz
[phonetic], President.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very much, and once again, this is in Speaker Quinn's

2.

district and in consultation with the Speaker and
the community, they have agreed to these changes
and reductions. Any questions from the panel? I
see none. I thank vou Mr. Callahan.

ROBERT CALLAHAN: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

excused, and we appreciate your time. I know on Land Use number 828, which is RYU, there is a motion to file, and we will not be considering that today. Mr. Callahan, also if you could just remember to send us a copy of the plans - - .

Okay. Thank you. Okay. We are now going to move on to... we are going to do Land Use number 832, which is the Knapp Street project in Council Member Fidler's district. I'd like to call up Howard Goldman, representing Metro Storage New York. Mr. Goldman, whenever you are ready, please make sure to state your names when you speak if more than one person is speaking especially, and whenever you are ready.

HOWARD GOLDMAN: Okay. Howard Goldman, representing Metro Storage. This is an application to cancel a restrictive declaration

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

that was imposed in 1984 on a piece of property in Sheepshead Bay in connection with a retail project that was never built. The site is vacant. It has been 30 years. There have been several proposals to develop this site, but none have going forward. The property is located due south of the Coney Island sewage treatment plant, and this cancellation will allow the development of a four story self-storage facility. We have been working in consultation with Council Member Fidler's office on this. We have agreed to a number of limitations on development and landscaping improvements, which will be recorded against the property and will bind the future development of the storage facility. You have just been handled a package of material, including some photographs and site plans and elevations of the facility, so I would be happy to answer any questions.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very much, I actually have a copy of a letter from Council Member Fidler, which I will read into the record. It is a little lengthy, so I will try to do it as quickly as possible with some of those changes that you had discussed, so without further

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

ado dear Chairman Weprin, on behalf of the community, I have had discussions with the applicants Knapp Street Metro Storage this land use application to remove a November 5th, 1984 restrictive declaration from the property. I expressed to them the concerns raised by the local community regarding the potential impact of the development of this property; therefore, to address these concerns we have reached an agreement. The application agreed to be bound by the declaration containing the conditions outlined below and I have agreed to support the land use application before this City Council. conditions we have agreed to are as follows: number one, lighting fixtures placed on the eastern façade of any development on the subject property shall consist only of down lighting, and the number of fixtures shall be limited to a minimum amount reasonable necessary to ensure public safety, number two, no advertising signage shall be placed on the eastern façade of any development on the subject property and any advertising signage placed on the southern façade shall be located westerly towards Knapp Street to

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

the greatest extent reasonably possible, number three, security cameras shall be places on all four facades of any development on the subject property that store the surveillance footage for a reasonable amount of time, and such footage shall be made available to law enforcement agents upon request, number four, a bench shall be provided behind the eastern façade to any development on the subject property and public waterfront access shall be permitted over the subject property between the hours of 9 a.m. and 6 p.m. on Monday through Saturday and 10 a.m. to 4 p.m. on Sunday, number five, any development of the subject property including any signage shall be limited to a maximum building height of 50 feet above grade subject to encroachments by parapets, mechanical equipment and other permitted obstructions as set forth in the zoning resolution, six, any development of the subject property shall include plantings and greenery along the Knapp Street side, seven, the applicant shall plant ivy or an equivalent substitute at the base of the eastern façade of any development on the subject property and ensure its growth and maintenance as to

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

reasonably conceal the face, eight, the applicant shall plant and maintain trees on the landscaped area located between the eastern façade and any development of the subject property and the adjacent body of water to the extent necessary so as to reasonable obscure the façade with the goal of making if further aesthetically pleasing. applicant has agreed to file and record a new restrictive declaration containing the above conditions in the Office of the City Register of the City of New York, and this will be done immediately after receiving all the required approvals to cancel the prior declaration at issue in this land use item; therefore, based on the above conditions and based upon the agreement to record the aforementioned document, I have agreed to support the cancellation of the November 5th, 1984 declaration and to support the land use application. Sincerely, thank you, Lewis Fidler. So I just want to be clear, I know there was some issues raised by community people. They are not here testifying, but the issue of across the water of how it would look--these address those issues in your opinion?

would have the public coming in off of Voorhies

25

Τ	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 16
2	coming down to the landscaped area?
3	HOWARD GOLDMAN: Yes.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: But you all
5	have security cameras in that area?
6	HOWARD GOLDMAN: Security cameras,
7	yes. There is a parking lot. There is lighting.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay and
9	this is already there? is that the new
10	project that they are planning?
11	HOWARD GOLDMAN: It will be
12	provided, and it is in order to filter the water,
13	take out the impurities from the water going into
14	the Shell Bank Creek.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay, and
16	this facility is going to be three stories?
17	HOWARD GOLDMAN: Four stories.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: And your
19	entrance is going to be where exactly?
20	HOWARD GOLDMAN: The main entrance
21	is off of Knapp Street?
22	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Where it
23	looks like glass on the ?
24	HOWARD GOLDMAN: Correct.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Alright.

HOWARD GOLDMAN: Thank you, sir.

25

б

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Our next item
we are going to go to is Land Use number 838,
which is the 28 th Avenue rezoning in Council Member
Vallone's district. Richard Lobel [phonetic] is
here, and he brings charts. Mr. Lobel, take your
time, set those up properly, and then you know the
drill. Please state your name for the record,
describe your application. We will get to that.
We will follow this. City Planning will be next
and we will try to get to that as soon as
possible, and then we will do BAM South. So I
apologize to those who are here for BAM South, but
I want to help get these people on their way.

Thank you for having us today. My name is Richard Lobel from the law firm of Sheldon Lobel P.C. I am joined by Norah Martins [phonetic], my colleague, and as the Chair stated, we are here for the 28th Avenue rezoning. Very simply, the 28th Avenue rezoning is in between 42nd and 43rd Streets on 20th Avenue in Astoria, and the proposal is to place a C12 overlay over the existing R5 zoning district. We have handed out some materials to the council members. The existing zoning, which

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

is R5 doesn't really reflect what is on this block and the block right now, especially this frontage is defined by commercial uses along 28th Avenue. There is a beauty parlor. There is a tax preparation office. There is a printing shop, and the business which we are concerned with and which the applicant owns, which is an Italian Restaurant fronting on the corner of 42nd Street and 28th Avenue, the restaurant has been there since for about 40 years. It was previously a commercial establishment dating back to 1947, so we have an existing non-conforming commercial use here, and in line with the City Planning rezonings of the last ten years, we are attempting to put down this commercial overlay to better reflect the zoning on the ground. The rezoning will help the applicant to establish commercial parking to the rear. There is a paved area to the rear of these properties, which can accommodate 22 cars. very clear, the restaurant can continue to operate without this parking as they have done and they have a certificate of occupancy. What this does is it allows them to first legalize the commercial occupancy on this frontage and second to provide

16

17

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2	these 22 parking spaces. The fact that this is a
3	good application was supported by the community
4	board in a vote of 31 to 3 from Community Board 1,
5	the Queens Borough President's Office also voted
6	in favor as did the City Planning Commission, so
7	we feel that this is a good rezoning and
8	reflecting what is actually on the ground. We
9	feel that the community supports this rezoning and
10	we would be happy to answer any specific
11	questions.
12	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.
13	Spoken quickly too. That is good. Anybody on the
14	panel have any questions? We had last discussions

18 Council Member Comrie?

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: What restaurant is it?

RICHARD LOBEL: It's Piccolo

Venizio [phonetic]. My Yiddish is better than my

Italian.

with Council Member Vallone's office is that they

were fine with it, and that is your experience

with them as well; therefore, for this as well.

 $\label{eq:CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: That is not } \mbox{just any restaurant.}$

RICHARD LOBEL: I know. It's a neighborhood icon, and the community board was distraught over the fact that anything might happen to it, so it is well loved, and we were happy to have their support.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: and the 22 parking spaces are right adjacent coming in off of $42^{\rm nd}$ Street?

RICHARD LOBEL: That is correct.

There is a curb cut on Lot 9, which is about 125 feet off of that corner. The paved area in the rear was paved since prior to the applicant's ownership of the site, and the 22 parking spaces would be attended. There would be a valet to attend to that parking.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay. Thank you.

RICHARD LOBEL: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very much. Does anybody else have a question from the panel? I don't see any. Thank you, Mr. Lobel.

Thank you, Norah. We appreciate your help.

RICHARD LOBEL: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: -- and your

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

cooperation in waiting. So we are going to close this hearing. Any members of the public here on this item? I see none. Thank you. I am going to close this hearing. You can take your charts.

RICHARD LOBEL: Thanks again.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Unless you want to autograph them. We have one more item before we get to BAM South, and that is the City Planning is here for Land Use number 837, the Water Street POPS text amendment. This is a fascinating one, so even the people who are waiting for BAM South will be fascinated to know what we are up to here and City Planning is doing in order to help the downtown economy of Manhattan. So Richard Suarez and Carolyn Grossman [phonetic] are here from City Planning. promised me a quick presentation at the same time letting people know how important this is for downtown Manhattan. As soon as you guys get that working, if you will state your names Richard, and make your presentation.

CAROLYN GROSSMAN: Good morning,
Chair and council members. My name is Carolyn
Grossman, director of government affairs for City

Planning. I am joined by Richard Suarez, who will be giving your presentation on the Water Street POPS text amendment just as soon as it loads.

This is a text amendment that has been developed in consultation with community groups, the local council members, elected officials and our sister agency the Economic Development Corporation and City Hall as part of a coordinated effort to bring more life and activity to the area of Water Street in Lower Manhattan. Richard will be walking you through a very short presentation, and I will be here to answer questions as well.

Carolyn. My name is Richard Suarez for the

Department of City Planning. This is a proposal

by the Department of City Planning for a zoning

text amendment to the special Lower Manhattan

district to allow events and new amenities in

existing - - owned spaces along the Water Street

corridor for the summer, fall and holiday seasons

of this year. This text amendment will apply to

all existing POPS which are privately owned public

spaces--

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [interposing]

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 A little slower.

Which are public RICHARD SUAREZ: spaces that have been provided in exchange for additional floor along or near the Water Street corridor between Fulton and State Streets? The -- nature of this text serves two goals; the first is to allow - - programming of POPS without requiring a design change certification to increase pedestrian activity following Hurricane Sandy, and two, to allow City Planning to study the types of events, programs and amenities that would be compatible with these spaces which can inform long term strategies for the Water Street POPS and the corridor. I will note that in parallel to the text amendment an event coordinator was selected by the Economic Development Corporation to put together a robust calendar of events, to perform outreach, and to coordinate programming with all the local owners. The proposed text amendment would apply again to the area generally bounded by Pearl Street to the west, Fulton Street to the north, South Street to the east and State Street to the south. Within this area, there are 22 buildings with one or more

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

privately owned public space that has been provided through a varied array of zoning mechanisms. There are about 20 plazas, 19 arcades and 1 indoor space. Many of the spaces within the area were developed under the earliest guidelines for bonus plazas which did not require any amenities and often resulted in very uninviting public spaces. The concentration of these spaces, their particular designs and lack of amenities have failed to support the active street life originally envisioned along Water Street. I am just going to flip through some of the examples that the - - Plaza at 55 Water Street, the special permit space at 88 Pine Street, the urban plaza at 77 Water Street and the big expansive plaza at 1 New York Plaza and the little slither [phonetic] space at 160 Water Street. In 2011 as you may know, the Council approved a City Planning text amendment to allow tables and chairs in existing arcades along Water Street by chairperson certification. That text amendment served as a tool to strengthen this important connection from the South Street Seaport area to the Battery and a few buildings have already taken advantage of this

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

new provision. As you know in October of 2012, the - - caused by Hurricane Sandy brought significant damage to Lower Manhattan, especially to the ground floors and basements of the Water Street buildings. Even seven months following the storm, some buildings were still not fully restored. In some cases leases have been terminated and buildings left empty. Although these were taken in March, the condition does still exist in some of these areas. Following the storm, City Planning has been working very closely with the mayor's office, the Economic Development Corporation and the Department of Transportation on short term efforts to rejuvenate the Water Street, Seaport areas. The Department of Transportation will be implementing a number of temporary streetscape improvements, including expansion of the Whitehall Plaza, closing of - slip - - Lane and painting - - at key crossings. EDC in a set program will be hosting a lighting program to activate East River waterfront esplanade, and the group also envisioned a program of events to take place beginning this summer that The idea would make use of the Water Street POPS.

would be to create excitement and economic
activity, reinforce connections between the
waterfront and the core and reverse the negative
perceptions of Water Street that were made worse
following the storm and in order to allow
programming in these spaces a zoning text
amendment is necessary. The text would be written
into the special Lower Manhattan district and
would allow events and a wide range of temporary
amenities to occupy an existing POPS without
action by City Planning until January 1st, 2014.
Current regulations require a chairperson
certification for new amenities and events are not
expressly permitted in these spaces, but are more
common in special permit spaces. The proposed
text will allow all of these without certification
or special permit. The new section would have a
sunset date of January 1 st , 2014 after which time
all spaces must be returned to their compliant
state. This will allow events to take place
during the summer and fall months with
activation during the holiday season, and the text
has been divided into two sections, one for
temporary amenities and the second into events.

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

In terms of temporary amenities anything as simple and effective as tables and chairs up to cultural exhibits and kiosks will be permitted in the spaces, and we are hoping that the flexibility in programming will invite experimentation and creativity in these spaces. As for events, events should be required to be open to the public and would have to meet the provisions for temporary amenities if provided. Events will require notification to the mayor's street activity permit office, which often coordinates street fairs and events on public streets and sidewalks, and if SAPO [phonetic] believes that the proposed event will extend to the street or sidewalk they will require a permit, which can be issued in a matter of days. Furthermore, City Planning will have a record of all of the events, where they are taking place, so that we can then go out and experience and observe to see again where again long term improvements can be made. So again, the text amendment would lift the need for any actions from City Planning and the two objections would be to allow for immediate programming of these spaces following Hurricane Sandy and allow us to study

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

these spaces in a way we never have before, which can - - longer term improvements, and again, will be effective for the summer, fall and holiday seasons of this year. The community board voted unanimously in favor for the text amendment. borough president also issued a letter of support for the text amendment, and the City Planning Commission as you know on May 8th voted in favor to adopt the text amendments. The Economic Development Corporation through a request through expressions of interest elected three groups to host events on the Water Street Corridor. Berman Group [phonetic] will serve as an event coordinator between all of the owners and prepare the - - calendar events and the LMCC and Matchmaker Café [phonetic] are just a couple of groups that will host events. The Berman Group has also been working with a number of local groups to host events on the spaces -- that is that they would front all of the money. There would be no cost to the owners. Owners can still choose to have events if they so choose, but the programming and the outreach will incorporate community board and council member feedback in promoting local

2.

businesses and organizations, and the calendar is
currently being prepared right now, and the hope
is to have kick off events the first week in July.
Thank you. I'd be happy to answer any questions.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very much. Let me just clarify. So after the holiday season, after December, it sunsets and the text amendment goes away.

RICHARD SUAREZ: It goes away. All spaces must be returned to their compliant state and we will have a team of DOB inspectors out there.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: And let's say next summer we say, "Hey, that was so good last year." How do we go about reinstating the text amendment? Are we back here again next year?

RICHARD SUAREZ: Yes, I think we would have to do another text amendment, but the hope is that this is short enough to just see what will work and then we will spend the winter studying, going through, reporting back to the community board. I was very interested in what was going to happen, and if there is an opportunity then we would be happy to pursue.

2	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Our
3	conversations with Margaret Chin's office, who
4	represents this area, have been very positive.
5	She is very excited about this, having worked with
6	the community board and with City Planning to put
7	this in place, and they are all excited for the
8	summer and fall to have this programming out on
9	the streets, try to bring in some tourists and
10	some business for those restaurants that have been
11	suffering so badly. Is that correct?
12	RICHARD SUAREZ: Yes.
13	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Does anyone
14	hereCouncil Member Lappin?
15	COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Sorry if
16	you addressed this, and I just didn't hear it.
17	Who is paying for the programming?
18	RICHARD SUAREZ: So the hope is
19	that the individual groups will do it that want to
20	come in and that the Berman Group, which is the
21	coordinator would also front most of that money.
22	Owners can still choose to do their own events,
23	but the hope is that there would be no cost to the
24	building owners.
25	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: And what is

the process to set up an event or how would that a go about--they work with a...

with the building owners on Thursday last week.

They have been given a survey asking what type of events would you like to have in these spaces.

The Berman Group has been going out and reaching out to a number of groups to prepare a menu of items or events and then going back to those owners with their preferences and asking them which would you like. As long as the owners sign off on everything, the Berman Group would do most of the coordination and set up of course with necessary support from the owners for access to electricity, water, restrooms, all the other necessary support.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay. Great.

Anybody else have a question for this on this temporary text amendment? Great, great shot in the arm for Lower Manhattan. Council Member

Comrie has a quick question. You can't leave yet.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I just wanted to echo what Council Member Weprin is saying that this is a great opportunity to revive

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

an area in Lower Manhattan to try to restimulate the economy down there, and I hope it works, and also I do hope that you will make sure that the amenities for people that are down there--make sure that the vendors have places - - bathrooms and opportunities for people to have a chance to relax as well as doing vendors, and I hope that the vendors that are selected are mostly New York City based vendors. I know that we don't get a direct opportunity in this, but I would hope that the Berman Group is a Queens or a New York City based group--thinking Queens first lately, but it is a New York City based group and also that we have a real opportunity to take a look at this as soon as the summer season is over I think you will get a good idea on how that is working, but since a lot of those areas are just kind of bland it would be good to see what you do on a permanent level as well. Thank you. CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you,

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you,

Chairman Comrie. We have no other questions for

the panel, so thank you very much. Thank you for

the quick read, and we thank you and we will close
this hearing. We are going to move actually to

vote on all the items we have heard today now.
BAM South, we will be doing the hearing today. We
will not be voting today, but the other items on
the agenda we are all going to vote on, so we are
going to try to cast votes with those who are here
at the moment. There is a hearinga budget
hearing across the street, which is why a lot of
members had to leave, so please don't be offended.
It is trying to juggle a budget season. So with
that in mind, we are coupling the following items:
Land Use number 827, 832, Land Use number 836, 837
and 838. We are withdrawing with a motion to file
828, the other café that we didn't hear today, and
821 is laid over to the next meeting. With that
in mind, I am going to call on Ann, the counsel,
to please read to roll.
COUNSEL: Chair Weprin?
CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Aye.
COUNSEL: Council Member Rivera?
COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye.
COUNSEL: Council Member Reyna?
COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Aye.
COUNSEL: Chair Comrie?
COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Aye.

are going to be starting any minute, so just give

25

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

us a couple of minutes just to get our acttogether, and we will start BAM South. Thank you.

[background conversation]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Alright. So this is--I take responsibility for this, but we are going to be about maybe ten minutes at the most, hopefully less, so if you want to go downstairs and buy a cup of coffee, it is only a dollar downstairs. Just for the record, the way this is going to work is we are going to have the applicant testify first. That will probably take a while because there will be questions from the panel. We are going to give them all the time we need to deal with them, since they have all of the answers. We will then bring up a panel in opposition. I know there is members of the labor community here. They will be the first panel to speak after the applicant. That will be as long as it takes to get through the applicant. shouldn't be too long, but I have been bad at judging time today. And then the people in favor will be testifying. We will alternate panels as long as we have a lot more people here to testify in favor, I see in this particular case. So also

2	the people who will testify will be limited to
3	three minutes when they get up there each. We are
4	going to have a clock and a really annoying bell
5	so if you can keep your testimony in your head to
6	three minutes, try to work it out, at most. You
7	are welcome to do less than three minutes.
8	Especially once you are repeating points that have
9	been made already; it does help to be quick. We
10	are going to do that because we do have a number
11	of people scheduled to speak. I understand it's a
12	busy day and people don't anticipate spending
13	their whole day here, so some people may actually
14	have to leave, but we will read your name into the
15	record even if you do have to leave and we will
16	get started as soon as we can. I will try to keep
17	it moving, but we have real serious questions we
18	have to have asked and answered, so we will take a
19	little while with the applicant, and then we will
20	get to the first panel in opposition. Okay? Are
21	we good? Alright. So hopefully within six
22	minutes or so, we will get started.
23	[long pause]
24	[background conversation]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: I am going to

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

now--we are now going to move on to the main event of the morning, which is BAM South. This is number 829, 830 and 831. It is in Council Member Tish James' district and I'd like to call up the following people who are here on behalf of the application, Jed Wolentis [phonetic], James Karss [phonetic] and Ray Levin [phonetic], and sure enough they are here. I apologize for the delay again. I will take responsibility for that. whenever you are ready because there is three of you, if you could please when you speak state your name for any transcribed record that we have of this. We will want to know who was speaking at the time. So Mr. Wolentis, are you starting? Make sure--the button sometimes is counterintuitive on what is on and what is off, and just make sure the mic is on, and whenever you are ready, we can get started.

JED WOLENTIS: Thank you, Chair
Weprin, council members. My name is Jed Wolentis.

I am a principal with Two Trees Management
Company, and I am here with my colleagues and
Carol Lee [phonetic] from City Hall to present our
BAM South project. It has been something that has

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

been a long time in the making. I think we have been working on this for about four years. a quintessential public private partnership with the city of New York. We are buying the land from the city and building what we think is a great publically purposed project that will start later this year should this process conclude favorably. So I will spend a couple of minutes and just go through the project in an overall sense and turn it over to my colleagues who have some more technical information for you. We're Two Trees. Most of you know our work in Dumbo. We have done a lot of work in downtown Brooklyn as well. generally try and cluster activities in a couple of neighborhoods and really leave places and communities better off than we found them. very excited about this sort of foray into the BAM district. We think it's a really exciting part of New York City and Brooklyn. These are a couple of the projects we have done over the last 10 or 15 years. I think the next slide shows some others--110 Livingston Street in downtown Brooklyn, the Mercedes House project up in West 54th Street in Manhattan. We just completed 1,000 apartments

2 there, all 80/20. This is the site where we propose to build this project. It is a current 3 parking lot in the BAM district. It is a 4 5 triangle. It is extremely difficult to build on. There are subways in all three streets, Flatbush, 6 Lafayette and Ashland [phonetic], and as you go to the next slide, you can get another view of it and 9 maybe the next slide. So this gives a sense of 10 the project and the project as I said is really 11 focused on its public components. There are a 12 couple of very important public components that 13 the city wanted to make sure came with this project and activated this cultural district in a 14 15 way that we think is meritorious of the district 16 and all of the activities going on there. 17 you see here is a rendering of a 10,000 square 18 foot public plaza that will be on sort of the 19 fatter, more useable part of the triangle. 20 faces the rest of the district. It gets great sun and light and really creates a great open plaza 21 22 for gathering, lunch, arts, activities, 23 programming, all kinds of things with the folks 24 from BAM and the other actors in the district to 25 program that plaza in a thoughtful and energizing

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

way. In addition, the project at the base of the project features about 50,000 feet of cultural space that will be given to the city for them to give out to different users. I think the program right now is for BAM to be one of the users, the library, the Brooklyn Public Library to be one of the users, and then for about 12,000 feet of space to be made available to local dance and other groups for rehearsal space and office space, and auxiliary spaces to make small arts organizations function to the community. We will also have some restaurant and café space that will open up under the plaza and then about 15,000 square feet of retail that will really focus on the point--the slightly less useable part of the space that faces the train station and the new arena. Above all of this public space essentially will be mainly housing. We will build about 300,000 square feet of housing. It will come to roughly 300 units. It will be an 80/20 with deep levels of affordability. The apartments will be at 40 and 50 percent of AMI. They will be preferenced to existing members of the community as you normally see. There will be local outreach that gets done,

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

credit programs to make sure people can qualify, all of the normal things that responsible developers do within local communities to make the affordable housing as much as it can possibly be and as useful as it can possibly be for the community, and we will also provide 225 onsite parking spaces underground--it will be accessed off of Ashland I believe -- to replace most of the parking that is there. Obviously as the district continues to develop, as BAM continues to program there, there will be parking needs. We are going to try and meet those needs and gets cars off of 14 the street and into a garage in a safe and efficient manner from a traffic standpoint. kind of mentioned the plaza already. This speaks a little more to it--just some of the programming that can take place there. We really think it is the center point of this development, and it is something that will get built for the city, for the taxpayers as a result of this project really without public dollars, and as I said, the best part of the real estate from the triangle is dedicated to the plaza to make it the most useable plaza that it can possibly be, and lastly, working

with Councilwoman James like we do with most of our projects, we are really going to try and put good local hiring practices in place. We are working with - - and Crescent [phonetic]

Consulting to achieve the following goals on our construction hiring: 32 percent MWBE, 20 percent local. We run all of our own construction. It puts us on a very good place to be able to meet these goals, so we went through a similar process on our Dock Street [phonetic] job that we are building now in Dumbo. And now I will turn it over to Ray Levin to go through some of the technical issues with the application.

RAY LEVIN: My name is Ray Levin.

What we are seeking is a change in the zoning
district from C61 to C62. The basic purpose of
that is to increase the residential floor area
from 3.44 to 6.02. The other parameters under
both zoning districts are the same--6.5 for
community facilities and 6.0 for commercial use.

We are also proposing a text change. The text
change would create a special permit, which would
allow the floor area on the project to go up by
.5, the community facility floor area to go up by

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

.5 in exchange for providing the cultural space that Jed mentioned. It also--that special permit would allow modifications of height and setback signage, street frontage, other provisions that are required by the special downtown Brooklyn district. Basically what that special permit would do, it would lock in the design of this project to what we have proposed. This drawing shows what would happen under existing zoning--the contract of sale on this property should this action not succeed, the project would be sold under current zoning, and you can see the red lines as to the envelope that the C61 provides and our proposed building within that envelope, so the building could in fact move around on the site, and be totally different form. The C62 because it is a sky exposure plain district [phonetic] we have to waive a lot of things, and in doing so, the design is locked in because those waivers pursuant to the zoning would then become part of the approvals and part of a restrictive declaration so that what you see is what you get unlike if we went as of right. The special permit as I mentioned there is a condition to the special

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

permit that 40,000 square feet at least 40,000 square feet of cultural facility space be provided and in order to have that approved there are a number of findings, which you can see up here-that there is ample visibility that the street wall will facilitate access to the site that we are trying to increase the open space through the bulk modification and making that tower narrower, and the de-articulated design was something that was of much concern to City Planning, so if you look at the building, it sort of folks in on itself and has different glazing patterns on it and different heights in order to reduce the appearance of bulk and that the signage was basically, the modifications were to permit the signage to address the cultural uses, not for advertising or commercial means so that some of it had to do with the height of the signs, so you could see them from Flatbush Avenue and Lafayette, so those are the special permits requirements, which we have addressed each of them, and I am done. James?

JAMES KARSS: My name is James
Karss with Ten Architect - - .

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Get a little closer to the mic, James.

JAMES KARSS: I just wanted to touch on a few things. As Jed mentioned, the site is exceptionally complicated with its form, its subsurface conditions, the nature of a triangular site poses a lot of challenges to creating a great urban space here. What we have actually done is we have located the tower in such a way to preserve use to the BAM Opera House from the Flatbush and Lafayette intersection to sort of build up the prominence and sort of continue the prominence of that cultural institution on the district, and we have moved the tower in such a way as to also preserve use from the Williamsburg Savings Bank, which is a major residential tenant in the neighborhood as well as an icon for the entire neighborhood. The plaza as Jed mentioned is located on the largest, most usable portion of the site, so we have actually sort of taken on the challenge of moving the tower to a more complicated portion of the site and located the retail at the less desirable areas at the point. In this slide you can see the relationship between

the proposed tower design and the Williamsburg 2 Savings Bank. There is an articulated design with 3 4 the tower stepping down at a portion which is to 5 preserve views from some of the neighboring streets to the clock tower element of the 6 Williamsburg Savings Bank allowing to sort of to maintain the presence of this building within the 9 community as a visual icon. You also can see that there are a number of cuts articulated within the 10 11 façade. These are to break down the scale of the 12 massing, and this has been a collaborative process 13 with City Planning--I should mention that has gone 14 on for over four years--to sort of design the 15 parameters of the design in such a way as to 16 deliver a product that is in keeping with the 17 urban principals of the area as well as the design 18 aesthetic of a developing BAM cultural district. 19 These are a couple of images here that show the 20 articulated ends of the building, the sort of 21 thinness of this tower, the splitting of its 22 residential elements to sort of really pull this 23 down in scale and you also see the point here and 24 sort of an upper level cultural terrace for the 25 BAM cinema tenants. Here is a view down Ashland

looking at the same end of the building, and a view from Ashland and Lafayette where you can see the cultural lobby at the ground floor, the BAM cinema elements projecting out and creating a sort of signage element in a relationship with the BAM presence along Ashland. And again, the cultural plaza which includes access to the BAM cinema component, the dance rehearsal spaces and the new Brooklyn Public Library branch at the top of the sort of public stair here as another program space. I'll turn this over to Carol Lee.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Carol Lee, state your name, where you are from.

[phonetic] from the Mayor's Office here to discuss the cultural space in the project. As Jed mentioned this is a public, private partnership and as part of the business deal, Two Trees will build 50,000 square feet of cultural space and transfer it to the city of New York. The city will own the space and will ensure that the cultural space is offered to local cultural groups for affordable rates in perpetuity. The city has chosen three primary tenants for this space, but

it will be designed flexibly so that local
organizations will have access to the space at
affordable rates. The Brooklyn Public Library is
one of the tenants and will use this space to open
a new branch. They are here today and can get
into more of the specifics of their programing.
The BAM is also another tenant for this space and
is going to use it to expand their programming.
It is anticipated that there will be theaters, but
those theaters will be flexible so that other
types of uses like talks and educational programs
will take place there, and finally, 651 arts
[phonetic] will operated and manage the studio and
rehearsal center, which is a flexible performance
space that is much needed in the district and will
be open to many Brooklyn based and local community
organizations that are in need of this space. I
think that concludes the presentation, so we are
happy to take your questions.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay. Great.

Thank you very much. Before I know Council Member

James has some comments she wants to make or

questions, but before we do that I just had a

couple of preliminary questions. Could you

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

did that work.

explain to me what the process was in Mr. Wolentis or Carol Lee, if you want to do it, describing how you purchased this property or went about trying to purchase this property? Was it an RFP? How

JED WOLENTIS: I will give you my perspective. Carol Lee can correct me if I misstate anything. It was quite a while ago. believe the city of New York had an RFP to build a garage or the parking only components on this piece of real estate. I don't know. I think the RFP was five or six years ago at some juncture. We were either the only respondent or a superior respondent. I am not sure which. And they then entered into negotiations with us at which point the idea of a larger project came about. I think somebody in the administration made the determination that they wanted to leverage this asset into being able to create more cultural space and more affordable housing in the district, and I don't know why the reason--what the rationale was for not having another RFP once the project kind of changed, but that is not how it went, and we negotiated both a transaction price

б

and a set of ground rules and the sort of long list of public benefits that you see in the project, mainly with Seth Pinsky at EDC. That negotiation took several years. We signed a contract probably in 2010, 9, and we will be closing later this month on the real estate.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: So you negotiated directly with Seth Pinsky's office on the price and were there parameters given to you on like how to accomplish this price, what kind of amenities, what kind of flavor, what kind of other aspects of the project?

All of the parameters were obviously negotiated because you couldn't agree on a price without understanding how much affordable housing you would have to build, how big the plaza would have to be, what sort of architectural constraints there would be, what sort of labor constraints there would be, how the parking would be run, et cetera, et cetera, et cetera. So all of those things were negotiated over the course of several years, and I can't speak for the city. I don't know if Carol Lee wants to, but they made a

б

balance of choices between higher sales price and
more public benefits, and they ended up with sort
of a menu of public benefits that you get
including our sales price, which goes into the
public fund, but obviously all of the other public
benefits that we are providingthe parking, the
plaza, the cultural space, the affordable housing,
the LEEDS certification, have a cost, a
corresponding cost that is going to come out of
that sales price, and so it wasn't purely driven
by get the highest sticker price for the
transaction; it was come up with the right mixture
of public benefits for the site.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: And when you negotiated these prices, you went through this laundry list of things. If we do this, it will cost this. I mean that is how the price was obviously agreed to?

JED WOLENTIS: On some of those issues there was some discussion like that, obviously the union, non-union labor issue. There was a discussion that went along those lines.

Some things were sort of very clear from the city and they didn't really care—the affordable

2	housingSeth didn't come to me and say if you
3	build all market rate housing how much more money
4	can we come up with. I think it was very clear ir
5	the beginning there would have to be an affordable
6	component. So some of the things there was
7	conversation about if we do it this way, how much
8	more can you pay us, or if we do it this way, how
9	much will that cost us, and some things they were
10	very clear this is just going to be part of the
11	program.
12	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: So just to
13	extrapolate on that, so obviously affordable
14	housing was a priority you are saying for EDC, but
15	obviously using union labor was not?
16	JED WOLENTIS: You can certainly
17	infer that from how this went down.
18	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: You
19	discussed union labor at one point?
20	[crosstalk]

JED WOLENTIS: And I made it clear that if we were--and I don't want to in any way, shape or form indicate that we are not going to build this with union labor. We haven't even heard from the unions on this project. We build

2 lots of our projects union. We build lots of our
3 projects mixed.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: You will.

them? I am sure that we will. But I think what is most important for us was maintaining flexibility to negotiate something reasonable with them. This is an outer borough site. Rents here are not what they are in other places in the city, and there needs to be a cost reality to how a project like this gets built. So it is not really a union or non-union issue as much as it us what is it going to cost to build this and what can you reasonably build this structure for with this level of architecture, this level of public amenity and have it work out.

I have and then I want to turn to Council Member

James. So you mentioned before what you could

build as of right if by some chance this was

rejected here at the City Council just for the

sake of discussion of hypothetically here. You

don't own the property yet, right? I mean what is

the next step to you actually purchasing the

property? When do you close? Is that something
that is set in stone that you are going to close?

JED WOLENTIS: I mean set in stonenothing is totally set in stone I suppose, but we are closing the end of this month. We fully intend to close. We are closing with cash. We don't need financing. The contract is done. We have our money. There is—I mean I could hit by a bus when I leave here, but we have no thought process of not closing whatsoever.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: But if you were to build it without all of these things that the city said they really want--cultural aspects, all these things, and you said all of a sudden we are going to build as of right, and we are not putting that stuff in, maybe you could do all market rate, does the city still--is that part of the contract? Is that something that you could still close if you don't do that?

RAY LEVIN: Yes. The contract provides two scenarios, a scenario that—Ray Levin—a scenario that follows from an approval of the zoning change and a scenario that follows from the denial of the zoning change. The closing is

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

not contingent because you have the two scenarios. You close no matter what. One scenario you build this project, another scenario you can build as of right under the existing zoning, no zoning change involved, so you have a C61 zoning district. can building 3.44 residential, which is less than what this proposes, but you could build virtually the same size building, a 6.5 building, if you did part of it as community facility, which the contract provides. You get half the community facility under the no approval scenario, and we can build up to 6 and a half FAR using commercial and as you know in this district, there is a fairly large commercial building as part of Atlantic Center. There is some interest in commercial and downtown Brooklyn, so it is conceivable that a 6.5 FAR building could be built with a 10,000 foot plaza and I think it is something slightly under 25,000 feet of cultural space. With no affordable housing, the design would not be this design, it would be whatever an as of right zoning district would allow, and it would go forward. Both parties have signed this contract, and therefore, if you don't go forward,

absence of any zoning change, there is no

MALE VOICE: There is no

requirement pursuant to the contract.

22

23

24

25

requirement--

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: And if there was no approval, I believe someone said that you would consider selling the property or would you build?

JED WOLENTIS: To be totally candid, we have spent five or six years working on this project with the city. We have obviously talked to you a bunch about it. We think this is the right project for this part of the world and this part of Brooklyn. I have not spent any real time studying what we would do in the alternative if this gets turned down. I would find that to be fairly shocking. It is not something that we have spent a lot of time studying or any time studying or thinking about. We are working with James and his team on construction drawings to build this. This is a project that has had a lot of scrutiny from lots of people in this administration and this community and all of our time and energy has been spent on making this proposal as great as we can possibly make it and executing it.

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: That notwithstanding if you were shocked and if it were turned down, what would you do?

Τ	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 59
2	JED WOLENTIS: We would go and
3	reevaluate our options.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: In regards
5	to the library, is the library part of the
6	contract with the city of New York?
7	RAY LEVIN: I can say no.
8	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Make sure when
9	you speak to say your name.
10	RAY LEVIN: Ray Levin. No.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: So is it
12	possible that that space that has been set aside
13	for the library, could that be reconfigured or
14	redesignated as additional cultural space or more
15	housing?
16	CAROL LEE FINK: So the library is-
17	-Carol Lee Fink from the Mayor's Officethe
18	library is part of the cultural space.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: And who
20	makes that decision?
21	CAROL LEE FINK: The city of New
22	York.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: And is that
24	contingent upon the zoning text?
25	CAROL LEE FINK: No.

2	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: And is that
3	coupled with the selling off the Pacific Street
4	Library or the Brooklyn Heights Library?
5	CAROL LEE FINK: the library
6	who is here can answer this in more detail. I
7	believe that they were hoping for proceeds from
8	either one of those transactions to help
9	facilitate the fit out costs for the new library,
LO	but I am not sure we are at a if this doesn't
11	happen we can't go in there yet.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: And the
13	selling off of the Pacific Street Library as well
L4	as the Brooklyn Heights Library, is that a
L5	separate application?
L6	CAROL LEE FINK: It is a separate
L7	ULERP [phonetic]. It will be a separate approval
L8	process
L9	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES:
20	[interposing] It's coupled with this project.
21	CAROL LEE FINK: It's decoupled,
22	completely 100 percent decoupled from this
23	project.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: But you just
25	indicated that the proceeds might be used to

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 61
2	outfit this.
3	CAROL LEE FINK: Might be. Didn't
4	say must be.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: But there is
6	a possibility
7	CAROL LEE FINK: [interposing]
8	Could be.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: But the
10	possibility still exists?
11	CAROL LEE FINK: Possibility.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: And okay,
13	the possibility still exists, and obviously as you
14	know, I am strongly opposed to the selling off of
15	any libraries for the purposes of outfitting this
16	project. I have indicated this in the past, and I
17	remain firm on that. I believe Mr. Wolentis, you
18	indicated that the city had suggested that a
19	priority for the city was affordable housing. I
20	don't believe that 20 percent is a firm commitment
21	to affordable housing in a district where you have
22	a crisis in affordable housing, and where people
23	are doubling up and tripling up and a significant
24	number of people have already been displaced.
25	That to me does not signal a priority at all.

2	That to me just signals doing business as usual,
3	and this 80/20 obviously is unacceptable, which is
4	why there are so many individuals who
5	unfortunately are paying most of their income for
6	rent and there are so many individuals who are now
7	homeless and so many people who are now leaving
8	the city of New York because of the crisis of
9	affordable housing and the administration's
10	failure to address it. 20 percent is also
11	unacceptable, and I remain firm on that as well.
12	I hope that you would take note of that. In a
13	project of this size and magnitude, I believe that
14	we can do better than 20 percent, and in fact, let
15	me get back to my initial question, which is what
16	was the purchase price for this land?
17	CAROL LEE FINK: I believe it was
18	1625.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Mr.
20	Wolentis, did you apply for 421a or any other
21	types of benefits?
22	JED WOLENTIS: We haven't applied
23	for anything yet. There is nothing built yet.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: But would
25	vou consider applying for 421a?

2	JED WOLENTIS: If we build the
3	rental housing program as we envision, we will
4	certainly apply for 421a.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: And 421a
6	currently requires you to buildto set aside 20
7	percent of the units for affordable, correct?
8	JED WOLENTIS: I believe that is
9	the case.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Is that 20
11	percent on top of the 20 percent that the city has
12	indicated was a priority or does that? No, so
13	that is already incorporated in the project, and
14	so we are not gaining anything additional when you
15	apply for 421 benefits, correct?
16	JED WOLENTIS: I don't agree with
17	that assessment, but you are entitled to your own
18	opinion.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: No, I
20	understand that, but my point is that the 20
21	percent that you would normally get if you applied
22	for 421a. It's not any additional affordable
23	housing.
24	JED WOLENTIS: You are making the

assumption we wouldn't just build an all market

	2	rate	deal	and	not	apply	for	421a
--	---	------	------	-----	-----	-------	-----	------

making the assumption that you are applying for 421a, and part of applying for 421a you are required to build 20 percent that you are already building.

JED WOLENTIS: Except we are going to apply for the 421a because we are required to build the 20 percent. The order is not quite accurate.

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: My point is that New Yorkers and Brooklynites are not getting anything additional by you applying for 421a.

JED WOLENTIS: I totally disagree.

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Okay. What are they getting additionally?

JED WOLENTIS: They are getting the 20 percent low income units. To help me afford to do that, I am getting 421a tax benefits, but if the city had not made affordable housing a priority, there is a very high likelihood that we would build an all market rate project here with no affordable housing and not apply for 421a. That would be a very--I haven't done the math on

that because that is not part of what we are doing here. The city made it very clear that they wanted the 20 percent affordable housing, and I think the 80/20 program is a laudable program that we have seen work over and over again in our projects. I think it is great. I understand there is a need for more and more affordable housing. There is a cost that comes with that, but for you to say arbitrarily that we would automatically build the 20 percent irrespective of the city's requirement for us to do so, I don't think is totally fair in this instance.

that I am saying is that it appears to me that there is sort of a double dipping. The administration is requiring you to build 20 percent based upon what you just testified and then you are applying for 421a, which requires you to build 20 percent, and all that we are getting from this project, Brooklynites and New Yorkers is a minimum of 20 percent. If you add 20 percent that they are requiring and the 20 percent that you would have to do when you applied for as a result of 421a, that adds up to 40 percent, but we

2	are not ge	etting 40	percent.	Wе	are	only	getting
2	20 percent	t Veg?					

JED WOLENTIS: You are getting 60 units of affordable housing that are incredibly expensive to build and there is enormous public benefit to that component.

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Thank you. In regards to the cultural component, Ms. Carol Lee, you indicated that the library—and we have already discussed the library, you also indicated that there was another cultural component and in the presentation that was submitted, there is a reference to—

CAROL LEE FINK: 651.

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Can you speak little bit more about that?

CAROL LEE FINK: Sure. 651 will manage the flexible rehearsal dance portion of the city's cultural condo. They are a local Brooklyn organization that is growing out of their existing space. This will give them a new home and they will be working directly with other local organizations to make that flexible space as highly utilized as possible.

25

2	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: They are
3	currently at BAM Harvey [phonetic]. Do you have
4	any idea what BAM plans to do with the space that
5	they will be vacating?
6	CAROL LEE FINK: I do not, but BAM
7	is here, and you can ask them.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: So my
9	question is since they are vacating from BAM
LO	Harvey, why can't the movie theatersBAM Harvey
11	be outfitted for the movie theaters in that
12	existing building?
13	CAROL LEE FINK: Again, you can ask
L4	BAM that question.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: You know
L6	that a number of individuals have contacted me
L7	regarding the expansion of BAM. BAM as you know
18	now has a new building BAM Fisher. They have
19	purchased property at Forte. They have BAM Harvey
20	and then they currently have the opera house. So
21	that is four building sites from BAM and yet we
22	have all of these other cultural organizations in
23	the district. What are we doing for them?

CAROL LEE FINK: Well, this project

is going to be a great place for all those local

organizations. I don't know the ones that you are talking about specifically.

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: It is a list of organizations in the district that provide cultural, dance, visual arts, and yet they are not getting the same types of benefits or the same type of audience with the administration.

agree with that. In the case of this cultural condo, we have tried to, and we will be continuing to design it so it is as flexible as possible and that as many organizations in the district have access to it. We understand that there is a dearth of this resource in the area, and that is why we worked with Two Trees to create this 50,000 square foot space, and why we are also leveraging the other underutilized city owned property in the district to have large cultural components so that these organizations have places to expand and grow and thrive.

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: You are absolutely right. There is a dearth, and though you provide performance space, they need space for their administrative offices and to grow, and so

2.

it just appears that we are primarily focusing on
one cultural organization in the district and
there is thousands of others or I should say
hundreds of others, which unfortunately would like
to have the same types of benefits, but moving on,
who is going to be responsible for the programming
of the plaza?

CAROL LEE FINK: We are talking to the Downtown Brooklyn Partnership about maintaining and programming all of the space in the district.

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: There is other organizations in downtown Brooklyn that would love to be a part of the programming.

CAROL LEE FINK: And they will be part of it, certainly.

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: But if you give it to Downtown Brooklyn Partnership, which is primarily not a cultural organization, it is primarily a business improvement district, an organization focused on the redevelopment of downtown Brooklyn, I would think that you would want to give it to an organization that has experience in programming plazas.

think give is not really the appropriate word to use in this context. Along with managing the space comes a number of responsibilities including security, maintenance, operations, and Downtown Brooklyn Partnership has experience in all of those responsibilities. Downtown Brooklyn Partnership also has a proven track record at involving all stakeholders in the discussion of programming, operations and they have assured us in this case that they will continue to reach out to all stakeholders to make sure that all the spaces are actively programmed with all that want to utilize them.

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Thank you,
Mr. Chairman. My last two questions—I obviously
disagree with that assessment as someone who works
with Downtown Brooklyn Partnership and all
stakeholders in the district as well as the
community overall, and I am on the ground on a
daily basis. I can tell you that that is not
true. Let me also say that I am also concerned
obviously about the labor standards, about safety,
building in downtown Brooklyn, you do know that we

23

24

25

2	have had at least I think last count was four to
3	five deaths of individuals who were working on
4	non-union developments in downtown Brooklyn. Most
5	of them unfortunately were undocumented workers.
6	Most of them were individuals who unfortunately
7	were not skilled laborers and were not part of the
8	union. Aren't you concerned that going forward
9	that we are going to continue to build projects
10	that unfortunately are not built according to
11	certain codes and certain standards and according
12	to safety requirements in the city of New York and
13	given the record of tragedy in downtown Brooklyn,
14	wouldn't you demand or make it a requirement that
15	this building be built union?
16	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Is that for
17	Ms. Fink? Okay.
18	CAROL LEE FINK: I would demand and
19	require that any building is built according to
20	codes and existing safety standards.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: But you are

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: But you are aware that we have had a number of deaths in downtown Brooklyn?

CAROL LEE FINK: I am not familiar with what you are speaking to.

2	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: I can
3	provide you with all of the media and the names of
4	all of the individuals that unfortunately have
5	died on developments in downtown Brooklyn that
6	were all built non-union, and I can also provide
7	you with two major developments that are now the
8	subject of litigation because of shoddy
9	construction.
10	CAROL LEE FINK: I would be happy
11	to review those materials.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: And I hope
13	that you would reconsider as we close on this
14	building and/or negotiate with the labor unions
15	that will be testifying today that this building
16	be built union and be built as safe as possible.
17	Last question is, on page 4 of the presentation
18	there was all of this other development that was
19	marked in red. Ms. Lee, could you identify those
20	other developments in downtown Brooklyn that are
21	being proposed?
22	CAROL LEE FINK: If you go back to
23	four
24	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Just for the

record, it's Carol Lee Fink. Fink is the last

Т	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES /3
2	name.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: I am sorry.
4	I apologize.
5	CAROL LEE FINK: So the red, yes,
6	they are in process projects. The large red in
7	the upper part of the screen, that is Barclay
8	Center and the rest of the Atlantic Yards
9	development. If we move to the left portion
10	these are not all city projects by the way. They
11	are just projects that either have a city
12	component or private that are in some stage of
13	construction.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Could you
15	designate which ones are city-owned projects?
16	CAROL LEE FINK: Sure. It is
17	probably easier for me to point.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Would you
19	please, if you don't mind, Mr. Chairman?
20	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: You can point,
21	but you have to have the mic near you if you are
22	going to speak. Just jump the table.
23	CAROL LEE FINK: Maybe I can hold
24	this up and show you?
25	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Sure.

CAROL LEE FINK: That parcel, that
is north site two. That is a project that is
currently owned by the city, and HPD has an active
RFP for that site right now. We expect to
designate a developer in the coming months. Then
on the far side, that is north site one. That
project is in the planning stages. We expect to
break ground December 2013. That will be a
project with 600 units of housing, 300 of which
will be affordable. It will also include retail
and cultural space. Then the lot right adjacent
to that on the right, that is also a city owned
lot. That is a new facility for Tefana [phonetic]
That is in the final construction stages. We
expect to complete that September of this year.
The other projects that are in red are privately
owned.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Tish, if you can wrap up soon, I would appreciate it.

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Just last question, I know on the commercial, I understand that you currently have a tenant. What about the restaurant? Do you currently have a user for that establishment yet?

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

JED WOLENTIS: No, definitely not.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Thank you.

So thank you, Mr. Chair, for providing me that latitude and being so gracious with your time. Again, my concerns is that this development project is not being built with union labor. really want to maintain the highest standards of construction at this particular site, and the best way to do that is to build it union. Two, in order for the union workers to actually be in a position to apply for these housing and my constituents, I would hope that you would increase the amount of affordable housing on this site. percent is totally inadequate given the crisis in this city and the fact that in this particular community there was two recent articles have indicated that some of it has now outpaced--some of the rents in downtown Brooklyn are closely outpacing that of Manhattan, which is unacceptable for most Brooklynites, and three, that the cultural space that we share in the city of New York and open it up to all stakeholders in downtown Brooklyn, so that it can reflect the wonderful diversity that I hope this

JED WOLENTIS: Luckily I have a cheat sheet here on the affordable because I would have had no idea. At 40 and 50 percent of AMI,

23

24

25

25

	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES ''
2	which is what we will be providing, the monthly
3	rents at 40 percent AMI families for zero, one and
4	two bedrooms are 529 dollars, 569 dollars and 692
5	dollars a month. At the 50 percent
6	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:
7	[interposing] I am sorry. 529
8	JED WOLENTIS: 529, 569, and 692.
9	That is for a studio, one and two, and then at the
10	50 percent income band the zero, one and two
11	bedrooms are 675, 726, and 880. In terms of the
12	market rate units, I don't totally know what the
13	market is here. It will be a couple of years
14	before we deliver the product. My guess is in
15	today's world we would probably get about 50
16	dollars a square foot in market rent in this part
17	of the world.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay.
19	Those affordable numbers that you came to, that
20	you spoke about today will those be the same
21	numbers project at the earliest for this
22	project to be completed?
23	JED WOLENTIS: Those are

established by law, not by me.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: But will

JED WOLENTIS: - -

24

25

throughout the--

unfortunately speak to what the borough president requested. I can say we went through a four year process with the Department of City Planning and their professionals and our architects to come up with the best possible overall urban design that provided for optimal light and view conditions both to and from the bank building and also given the other urban conditions in and around the district, but I cannot articulate a point by point response to Marty's comments.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I was just trying to see because your design doesn't really show the light and shadow on how it reflects on the bank site; it just shows a--you can go back to that slide. Do you know what time of day that is that is showing the shadow from the bank now?

JAMES KARSS: Yeah, this is James

Karss, and at this time of day, this would

probably be around noon that this shadow is being

projected from the Williamsburg Savings Bank. We

are located north of the Williamsburg Savings

Bank, so we are not projecting shadows really onto that building.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay, and

2	thewhat is that? A four or five story plaza
3	that the glass enclosureis that going to be all
4	commercial and retail?

JAMES KARSS: No. The glass portion of the base is 43 feet, 10 inches high. There are—the library component right now comprises the majority of the upper level of that plaza or of that glass enclosure. Below that at the nose, the triangular portion of the site is retail and some of the—and actually the café is sort of wedged underneath the stair space in what is sort of the less usable parts of the site, so the cultural space has been given some of primacy and given the spaces that are most usable.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: And where is the rehearsal space going to be?

JAMES KARSS: Rehearsal space is on the fourth floor on top of the cinema boxes, so the upper level of these boxes along Ashland and the floor plate at this level is the rehearsal spaces.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay. And how much time do I have, Mark?

25 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: As little as

2 possible.

as possible? That is not good. Alright, so then since I don't have a lot of time... you made a statement earlier that you wouldn't be able to build this iconic a building if you were just doing it market rate. Why would you say that? Wouldn't you still be able to in this environment in downtown Brooklyn as it is such a destination location now to use the word to be able to still build an iconic building even if you didn't build this affordable project?

what came across. I was not trying to articulate that. What I was trying to articulate—well, a couple of things. As part of our—two separate things that might answer your question, but if I am not clear you can re—ask me. The city was very concerned and mandated a certain list of architects that get used for this project and mandated that they basically maintain design control as we went through the process. Part of the business negotiation early on with the city was that we don't just build an ordinary building,

wanted excellent design here. They thought the

BAM cultural district was a place that was worthy

24

25

of extraordinary design and they expected us to step up to the plate and deal with both the work involved with doing that and also the extra cost involved in doing that.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: But you intimated that if it was an as of right project you wouldn't build as the--that seemed to be the inference from the presentation.

infer that. I only meant to infer that we haven't studied in any way, shape or form on as of right building form, and this building form is totally locked in through this ULERP process, and if this ULERP process does not go forward, we would totally start over. I am not trying to color the discussion one way or another that the project would be more or less iconic, just that we have done no work on looking at what that project would be.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay. And since you are doing a lot of work in Brooklyn and in the city and clearly there are concerns about Two Trees opportunity to be inclusive, what assurances can you give the committee that there

will be some full discussions between now and the road to ensure that the current concerns of all of the advocates, the labor people can be ameliorated, so that they can feel comfortable with moving in this process?

than happy to have a conversation with all aspects of labor. Nobody has reached out to me in this process. We are probably close to a year away from really starting construction here. We have built a lot of work in this town union and we are more than happy to—we just need to have a building that we can afford to build and finance so we can create all of the public benefits that come with it.

willing to have those--to make those agreements that there will be full discussion between you and all parties so that the Council Member and the committee can find out what those discussions are so we can be clear on exactly what the levels of discussion were, how the discussions were handled and so that we can be clear all parties were heard?

you.

2		JED	WOLENTIS:	Ι	am	always	happy	to
3	have	diacussions	gir					

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Great.

Well, since I am on short stacked time [phonetic]

I won't ask any other detailed questions. I hope
to be able to talk to you before the vote. Thank

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Absolutely.

Thank you, Council Member Comrie. I would like to call on the neighboring district Council Member

Levin for a quick question that he has.

very much, Mr. Chairman. Good afternoon, gentlemen and madam. Very nice to see you all. I just had a quick question about the cultural space. There has been a lot of discussion about this space being replacement space for the Pacific Branch Library, which is in my district on the corner of Pacific Street and Fourth Avenue, and that type of arrangement, the plan put forward by BPL is to raze that building. It is a Carnegie branch. It is not landmarked. I believe it should be landmarked. It was the first Carnegie branch in Brooklyn, and there has been ongoing

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

community dialogue. I get about 25 or 30 e-mails a day encouraging me to landmark the building and not tear it down from constituents. Is this locked in? it says here in the plan, Brooklyn Public Library for the cultural space. Is that something that is in contract because as I am sure you are aware, I think it was the original EIS for the downtown rezoning called for there to be a cultural library here, part of BPL, but not a replacement library for the Pacific Branch, so I guess my question to you is is this locked in? Is this a contract with BPL or is there an opportunity for another type of library to be there or for another type of cultural use because I am on the record wanting Pacific Branch to remain standing.

CAROL LEE FINK: Carol Lee Fink.

So there is not a contract per se with the

Brooklyn Public Library for this space. There has

long been an understanding that some portion of

the space on this site would be used for a

library—I think a performance library was

originally thought for the space. We have been in

close conversations with the library all through

this process, and it is clear that there have been discussions around the other branches in the area.

Our conversations have not been if we don't close this—if we close this branch, then we come. If we don't close this branch, then we can't come.

It hasn't been a one for one discussion, and again the library is here today and they can talk more about how they are looking at the picture, but we don't know. We don't have a hard contract with them.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I think augmenting the system is a good thing that a performance library or some other cultural branch would be I think a benefit to the entire downtown area, and so I think that that is a good idea to move forward. I just want to make sure that I am out there on the record as part of the record for this hearing today saying that I do not want to see this happen at the expense of a historic resource like the Pacific Branch, which is an important part of the landscape of the district that I represent, and my constituents feel very strong about that. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very

_	
2	much, Council Member Levin. I'd like to call on
3	Council Member Reyna.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Thank you,
5	Mr. Chair. I just wanted an opportunity to
6	understand, this RFP was intended for a garage.
7	Correct?
8	CAROL LEE FINK: Yes, I believe
9	that is correct.
LO	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And that was
11	in 2006?
12	CAROL LEE FINK: That sounds right.
13	I don't know for sure.
L4	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And that was
15	in response to what would be a traffic mitigation
L6	for Barclay Center or…?
L7	CAROL LEE FINK: I don't think so.
L8	No, I don't believe so.
L9	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: So what was
20	the original intent to build on city land what
21	would be a parking garage?
22	MALE VOICE: As part of the
23	downtown Brooklyn rezoning, which rezoned the
24	whole downtown Brooklyn area
25	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA:

overall understanding of how the city wanted to

25

	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 91
2	use its resources in downtown Brooklyn.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: But since
4	then, we have also taken away parking spaces.
5	MALE VOICE: Since then we have a
6	rezoning that lessened the parking requirements.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Correct. So
8	there is no need for parking garages as it once
9	was supposedly projected as a need.
LO	MALE VOICE: Correct.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: So the RFP
L2	six years ago was not necessary?
L3	MALE VOICE: The RFP six years ago
L4	projected
L5	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA:
L6	[interposing] Are you speaking on behalf of the
L7	city
L8	MALE VOICE: I am trying to answer
L9	your questions. That is all I happened to
20	be around at that time.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I appreciate
22	that. I think the city of New York
23	MALE VOICE: [interposing] Fine. I
24	will stop speaking.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I just want

to make sure that the city of New York gives me a clarification as why would we put out an RFP that would call for a garage?

CAROL LEE FINK: I believe that that was part of the plan at that time, and I wasn't there, so I can't speak to why the plan changed, but I am happy to look into that and get back to you.

as the call for a garage having done a study later why was the actual RFP not rescinded based on the fact that we were reducing what would be parking in the downtown area?

CAROL LEE FINK: Again, I wasn't there at the time, but I am happy to look into that and get back to you.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: So now fast forward, the design of this is spectacular. It is an all-inclusive, it takes into consideration everything that the city of New York did not put out for an RFP, but just happens to have what would be brilliant ideas because the respondent who originally was applying for the RFP that was calling for a parking garage sees a greater

2	vision, and now this is being entertained as an
3	all-inclusive, many public benefits, and
4	everything from the entertainment piece to the
5	cultural piece to the housing piece, and clearly
6	what would be the job component during
7	construction as well as post construction. Why
8	was that not the element of a new RFP?
9	CAROL LEE FINK: Again, I wasn't
LO	there at the time, but I will look into this, and
11	I am happy to get back to you after the hearing.
L2	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And no one
L3	from the city of New York is here to answer those
L4	questions prior to you?
L5	CAROL LEE FINK: I would be EDC,
L6	and we do have people from EDC here.
L7	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: They are
L8	here. Okay. Can they come and testify?
L9	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Is there
20	someone from EDC who is in the room now who can
21	answer this question specifically who wants to
22	come up to the mic and identify themselves
23	quickly? Oh wow, we have a volunteer. Make sure
24	to state your name, and if you can quickly answer

this so we can get moving we have a lot of people

_	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND PRANCITIBES 93
2	MABEL BERNSTEIN: It also included
3	a plaza.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: A plaza. So
5	there is a public plaza attached to this?
6	MABEL BERNSTEIN: Yes.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And that
8	still continues under this new rezoning?
9	MABEL BERNSTEIN: Yes, it is in the
10	design as well.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: So in
12	addition to a public plaza now we are receiving
13	what would be a library, cinema, rehearsal space,
14	restaurant, cafes, retail, housing both market and
15	public affordable. The public plaza and the
16	parking spaces will continue as set forth in the
17	original RFP?
18	MABEL BERNSTEIN: Well, the
19	original RFP was terminated, so I don't believe
20	there was ever a concrete plan that was determined
21	from the original RFP.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: So if the
23	original RFP to a proposal that was issued has
24	been terminated
25	MABEL BERNSTEIN: The original RFP

2	was	terminated.	We	did	get	some	proposals.
---	-----	-------------	----	-----	-----	------	------------

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Mr. Wolentis explained before that they had originally applied for the parking issue, and then the city decided to go for something grander, and then went outside the RFP process.

exactly what Mr. Wolentis had mentioned. He also stated that he wasn't too sure if they had rescinded or not so I wanted clarity on behalf of the city of New York to give us the facts as far as the original RFP which called for what was a parking garage in addition to a public plaza which then was rescinded.

MABEL BERNSTEIN: Yes, it was terminated before any selection was made.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Okay, so there was no new RFP that was issued?

MABEL BERNSTEIN: No.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And now we are looking at an application for a sole source [phonetic]?

MABEL BERNSTEIN: Yes, Two Trees was designated as the sole source.

2	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Okay. And
3	the sole sourcing of this application of a
4	rezoning from a C6-1 to a C6-2 is for a rezoning
5	and disposition of land?
6	MABEL BERNSTEIN: The application
7	is only for rezoning, not for disposition.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And the
9	disposition will occur when?
10	MABEL BERNSTEIN: Well, EDC already
11	owns the land, and the disposition to Two Trees is
12	anticipated to occur later this month.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: But the
14	application will come to the Land Use Committee
15	for a disposition?
16	MABEL BERNSTEIN: No, the
17	disposition was already approved through a MOCS
18	procedure in 2010.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: In 2010.
20	And thenow for the clarity I appreciate EDC
21	coming to state the facts as far as how we have
22	come this far. I wanted to just take a moment to
23	ask as far as the parking spaces to this project,
24	what is going to be intended to be built out as
25	far as the accommodations of parking for the venue

[background conversation]

So Ms.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA:

24

25

Benjamin is just confirming the affordable housing units not in need of parking requirements, which was something that I don't recall, but she is confirming, and you were in the middle of your statement regarding 64 spaces.

RAY LEVIN: The reason that I am talking from the environmental assessment that was done, the reason that is 64 is that the maximum number of spaces, which is how you do environmental planning, we showed 400 units of housing, there are only going to be 300, so actually the requirement would be 60 from the 240 would be 48 would be required if we did 300 units.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: So only 48 would be required, but you are providing in this plan--

RAY LEVIN: [interposing] I am sorry. I misstated. The environmental analysis is based on a larger number of units. You have to use the reasonable worst case, and therefore, the number that is included in the environmental assessment is 64 because we were talking about 400 units and 80 affordable at that point. The plan now is to do 300 units with 60 affordable, so

therefore, the requirement for that project would be 48.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Okay.

RAY LEVIN: And beyond that the new downtown Brooklyn parking requirements said that you could provide up to 225 spaces for public parking without requiring a special permit. We are not asking for a special permit, so therefore, beyond the 48 or whatever number it turns out to be, which will be based on exactly how many residential units we build, beyond that you can go up to 225 for public parking. And that is what our analysis shows that we would build up to 225 spaces, 48 of which would be required or 64 depending on how many units were actually built.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: But according to the plan that we are voting on the as of right, the proposed zoning calls for how many units to be built out as far as the residential component?

RAY LEVIN: 20 percent of the-COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I am not
referring to the affordable; I am referring to the
total number of units.

_	
2	RAY LEVIN: You have to refer to
3	the difference because they have different
4	requirements. So it is 20 percent of the non-
5	affordable units.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Which is 240
7	is what 20 percent of 240, 48, right, but I was
8	just asking for the total. And the accommodation
9	for what would be the cinema, the library, the
10	rehearsal space, the restaurant café, the retail,
11	how is that accommodated in the parking space
12	matter?
13	RAY LEVIN: The zoning does not
14	require any for the commercial uses in this
15	district. We can build up to 225 spaces without a
16	special permit. Now as you know because this site
17	is a very odd configuration, how many spots we can
18	put onto the below grade level because of the
19	angle makes it difficult. I am not sure exactly
20	how many will be provided, but it will be up to
21	225.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Mm-hmm.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Council Member 23 Reyna, if we can wrap up please. 24

25 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And as far

as the public benefits according to the cinema,

25

2	the retail, the restaurant, café, there is letters
3	of lease commitments that have been entered as
4	part of EDC's contract or there is no discussions
5	of any preliminary signed commitments?
6	JED WOLENTIS: For our commercial
7	space users? No, zero. We havewe occasionally
8	field calls from interested people, but it is
9	premature for us to be talking to operators.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And that was
11	not part of the contract as far as EDC is
12	concerned?
13	MABEL BERNSTEIN: Mabel Bernstein,
14	no, that is never part of the contract typically.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And is there
16	a contract with the library as far as this
17	particular proposal is concerned?
18	MABEL BERNSTEIN: No.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I want to
20	thank the chair for the opportunity to have me ask
21	these questions and I look forward to further
22	discussion.
23	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very
24	much, Council Member Reyna. I appreciate that,
25	and since at the moment, it is just me and you, I

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

am going to assume there are no more questions 'cause I have none, so I want to thank this panel. I want to thank you guys for pitching in, and we are going to move on, so I assume people will stick around from Two Trees just to listen to the rest of the discussion - - representatives, and we thank you very much for your time, and we will be in discussions. I am going to call up panels, one after the other. We are going to limit people again to three minutes, so try to limit that. Thank you very much. I'd like to call up the following people in opposition to this project: Terry Moore [phonetic] from the Iron Workers, Melissa Shetler [phonetic] from the Laborers, Peter Bray from the Park Slope Civic Council and is it Michael White, Citizens Defending Libraries. Your name almost gives up all your testimony. Look at that. I am going to put you--again, it's three minutes. I know that is difficult. It is just we have a lot of people still to testify if they have still hung in there, so whenever you can settle in make sure to state your name for the record, and I apologize for the waiting for the people who have to wait. We will go after this to

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

a panel in favor of the project and we will call them up after. Gentlemen and lady, whenever you guys want to start. Terry is going to do ladies first I assume. Alright, Mr. Moore, whenever you are ready.

TERRY MOORE: Good morning or are we in afternoon? Yep. Good afternoon. My name is Terry Moore. I am the business manager of the Metal Lathers Union Local 46. I want to thank everybody for hearing me today. I think it is important to recognize that BAM South is a public, private project -- the financing, the city, the land comes from the city, the financing from the company sponsored by the Economic Development Corporation, and it would not be possible to do without the public land and the major rezoning before you today. When we make this kind of investment in public private partnerships, our communities should get real tangible benefits. When we make the kind of investment, we have to ask ourselves, who really benefits, our communities or just wealthy private developers? At BAM South, the community deserves safe, responsible development that utilizes well trained

construction contractors. Our communities deserve 2 good jobs that provide a pathway to the middle 3 class. Our communities deserve real, affordable 4 5 housing that strengthens our communities. Unfortunately BAM falls short on all of these 6 Two Trees has refused to commit to hiring fronts. safe, responsible construction contractors to 9 perform the work. It is more troubling since Two Trees has hired an asbestos abatement contractor 10 11 with a shocking history of unsafe practices at the 12 Domino Sugar [phonetic] and is currently being 13 sued for faulty construction practices that have 14 harmed the property of neighboring residents in the Dumbo area. Two Trees has refused to ensure 15 16 that the construction jobs created at BAM South 17 provide decent wages, healthcare and retirement benefits that will build the middle class and 18 19 strengthen communities. They have provided what 20 we consider a bare minimum of affordable housing 21 on the project, 60 units and 240 luxury units to 22 be built on currently city-owned land. New York City is making a significant investment in the Two 23 24 Trees with the BAM South project. With public land and without major rezoning, which could 25

significantly impact the community, BAM South is simply not possible, and I think Mr. Wolentis pointed that out. I also believe that the construction workers who build this public private project on public land with public subsidies should be paid prevailing wages, and I think that is the most foremost issue at this hearing. On April 13th, 2013, the Federal Department of Labor ordered that a similar mixed use development City Center in the District of Columbia be built in accordance with the federal prevailing wage law and - -.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Wrap up quickly.

TERRY MOORE: I'll finish up. We believe that New York should be at least as protective of its middle class as the District of Columbia, and we urge that you take this precedent seriously in your deliberations on the project.

In closing, I would like to say that before City Council, if you have any deal City Council should know what the deal is in writing. You should have it before the Land Use Committee gets it. A deal between Seth and Jed wherever it was made,

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

whatever room it as made in, it should clearly be transparent and the people on the board should know exactly what that deal is when they are voting on what is going to happen with future taxpaying money of the city workers and the people of New York City. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Mr. Moore. Next please.

MELISSA SHETLER: Thank you. name is Melissa Shetler. I am with the Laborers. I represent Local 78 and 79 here in the city. Jed Wolentis said a statement that he likes to leave communities better off than when he found them, and I just want to pick up on that for a minute, and say that I think that without true economic development and true investment in real jobs, in union jobs, especially in the construction industry, you are not leaving that neighborhood better off than you found it by any means. We believe strongly in local hire. We are very, very equipped to staff those kinds of union jobs in downtown Brooklyn, and we often here that that is not the case, so I just want to state that we would be happy if it was local, but we also

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

know that it needs to be union. Our public dollars through HPD and through other organizations are going to low road contractors on a regular basis and Two Trees may say that they are more than happy to work with us, but on the Domino Sugar project we brought up the issue of New York Insulation who is this low road asbestos contractor, and let's just say it is not just any, it is the worst we know in the industry. have been debarred by the Department of Labor and they have been disqualified from the SCA, but they are perfectly able to remediate asbestos in a large community with children. I have a problem with that and I really disagree with Two Trees representation of their willingness to listen to the labor unions when we are concerned about low road contractors and to also engage with us using high road contractors that pay real union wages. Lastly I would say that especially with money that is public money or public land, the investment in the underground economy is a double tax against us as taxpayers. You are paying people 10, 12 dollars cash off of the books, which means you are losing your payroll taxes. It means people have

2.

no health insurance and they are accessing
emergency rooms in order to get care, and that
money is not coming back. So I would just like to
state that I hope you really consider that all of
the things that come forward that have any kind of
public subsidy whether it's land or public dollars
has real prevailing wage and real job
qualifications for the developers.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Ms. Shetler, and thank you for being under the three minutes. That is always good. Next please.

PETER BRAY: My name is Peter Bray.

I am a 30 year resident of Park Slope and I am a trustee of the Park Slope Civic Council, and I wanted to comment today on a portion of the project that is going to adversely affect the residents of Park Slope and Boerum Hill. You have heard earlier about the cultural uses that are going to be incorporated into this project including a new facility for the Brooklyn Public Library. I want to be clear that the library has publically stated that its construction is contingent on the sale of the Pacific Branch Library and that they have also publically stated

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

that this plan is a virtual fait accompli and that they will shortly execute a memorandum of understanding with EDC to enable them to use the proceeds from the sale of the Pacific Branch Library to outfit their new space within the BAM South project. I also want to be clear that the Park Slope Civic Council is not in any way opposed to a new library branch in this building. What we are opposed to is the fact that they would sacrifice Park Slope's and Boerum Hill's library for a wholly new set of library users. Pacific Branch has served these two communities for 110 years. These communities have fought in the past to save this library and to improve the library and to see that it was rehabilitated because it is a critically important resource for our communities, and the Brooklyn Public Library has made the claim that the BAM South site is only across the street from the Pacific Branch Library, and the fact is that these two neighborhoods will not be well served by the library for several reasons. First, the BAM site South is on the wrong side of Flatbush Avenue, Atlantic Avenue and Fourth Avenue. The transportation alternatives

group has found that these avenues are highly
dangerous thoroughfares. The library is well used
by elderly persons and by young children and they
will not or they should not be crossing those
avenues. The Pacific Branch is used as a safe
refuge for children after school hours to do their
homework, wait for their parents to pick them up
after work, and it also serves schools in the area
that do not have their own libraries. Second, we
object to the sale because the Pacific Branch is
meeting a growing need within those two
communities. The city has rezoned up, up zoned
Fourth Avenue. It is getting hundreds of new
residents. There is going to be a need for more
libraries, not less libraries. So I just want to
conclude by saying that we are asking the City
Council if it approves this rezoning or this
zoning change to not make it contingent or to
understand the connection between this project and
the abandonment of the Pacific Branch. We also
want to thank Council Members Levin and James for
their support on our position. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Got it. Mr.

White, ditto?

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 MICHAEL WHITE: Not quite ditto.

Michael White for Citizens Defending Libraries. Last week I was at a panel discussion about the Historic Districts Council about the selling off of our libraries. One of the main topics that came up was the enormous distrust that people now have for our library officials. David Giles [phonetic] brought that up, observed--he is from the Center for an Urban Future, and he wrote the report that says that library usage is way up and they are being underfunded. He wondered why. That was quickly answered in the discussion--lack of transparency in deals that are designed from the top down and deals presented as done deals when they are presented, and a lack of value that is got for the public as a result. Also the motivations are sell offs of the public libraries. They are being used as chess pieces in a real estate shell game, and that might be a mixed metaphor -- two different, chess and shell game, but we do have a mixture of games going on in a project here like Pacific Street promises of libraries for a zoning change, promises of libraries for variances, and then the selling of

the Pacific Branch to create the BAM South branch,
the cultural condominium. Now the calculations
don't really work out. If you do the math that
was presented, you are getting a net loss to the
public. But back to the distrust issue. I think
you heard Councilman James and you heard
Councilman Levin asking for assurance, which is
very difficult when there is a lack of trust that
if BAM South is going to be approved that it be
clearly understood and assured that there would be
no sacrifice of Pacific Street as a result to
outfit that library. Now there are plenty of
reasons to disapprove this project. I was
astounded to hear that it began as an RFP for a
garage and we I don't think should be repeating
what was done with the Wolentis' when they
blackmailed the public with a school on Dock
Street [phonetic], but the City Council has to be
absolutely very careful and Pacific Street should
not be sacrificed for this project and the City
Council has to be clear that that should be
prevented.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very much. I want to thank this panel very much. I

appreciate your patience as well as the patience
of the people yet to come. Do you have any
questions, Diana, of this group? Excellent.
Thank you all very much. You okay? Okay. I am
now going to call on a panel in favor of this
project. I'd like to call Carlo from the Brooklyn
Chamber of Commerce, Alan Fishman [phonetic] from
BAM, Karen Hopkins and Linda Johnson from the
Brooklyn Public Library. I trust you, Linda.
Don't worry. We got a little tight fit over
there. Maybe we could clear that extra chair
away. We need four chairs. When the music stops,
you have got to be in a chair.
KNDEN DDOOKS HODKING: Mr Chair

KAREN BROOKS HOPKINS: Mr. Chair, if you don't mind I am going to go first, Karen Brooks Hopkins, president of BAM and then excuse myself because we actually have a fundraiser tonight. Is that alright?

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: As long as you approve, I have no problem. We don't care. Go ahead whenever you are ready. Three minutes, and you are off and running.

KAREN BROOKS HOPKINS: Thank you.

Karen Brooks Hopkins, president of the Brooklyn

3

4

5

б

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Academy of Music where I have worked for 33 years. I am really speaking today on behalf of the project on behalf of the district. The BAM cultural district I believe when it is finally complete and after 33 years, I think the completion is now in sight will be the greatest cultural district of the $21^{\rm st}$ century in the United States. This is my prediction. Why? Unlike the Lincoln Center model of the '50s that was sort of edifice plaza [phonetic], this district will include institutions small and large grounded in diversity and a mix of visual and performing arts. Everything will look different and be pulled together with a common street scape and lighting. It will be an incredible public space that will also include the plazas and a variety of cultural institutions reflecting the urban energy of New York City today. Within the four block radius from the Barclay Center to the northern border of the district at the BAM Harvey, you will have venues ranging from 200 to 19,000 seats of all different kinds, and there is no other place on the planet as far as I know that has this kind of amenity along with great transportation assets and

a great architectural hotspot--Shop, Enrique 2 Norton, Hugh Hardy, the 19th century BAM and so on, 3 and the art deco building at One Hanson Place 4 5 [phonetic]. What are the benefits of this kind of a district for this community? Small businesses б will thrive, restaurants, shops and so forth. already know this from the 700,000 people a year 9 that attend BAM alone. There will be jobs. will be tourism. There will be education 10 11 programs. There will be energy and there finally 12 be in New York City a great cultural center that 13 will not be in the borough of Manhattan. 14 South project represents a confluence of service 15 for local artists through 651 and BAM, the BAM 16 cinemas today already have 200,000 Brooklynites a 17 year that attend and there will be more opportunities for local film festival 18 19 organizations. We intend to build these theaters 20 as smart theaters so that they can be used during 21 the day for conferences and educational 22 gatherings. The archive of over 150 years of BAM 23 history will be resourced for the public, and the 24 library will provide an additional service to all 25 of the community members that will be living

2.

within the confines of the cultural district and
for people in the surrounding communities, so for
this reason, this project is a winner. It has
taken ten years at least just to get it in shape,
and the time is now to move forward with no
further delay. Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very much. You are welcome to leave and we will send you any questions. She has got to run. Do you want to ask her a question specifically?

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: There was some concerns from Council Member James about BAM selling space or giving away space or utilizing space, all of the space that you have now you are going to keep in perpetuity?

to keep it all in perpetuity. We have never given away any space. We have never—what we do do is make affordable space in the Fisher building and in other buildings we have raised private funds to subsidize community usage for our buildings so that everybody will have access despite in the larger facilities, it is very expensive to use them, and Alan will talk more about that.

2	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Mr. Fishman is
3	from BAM as well.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I knew
5	that. I just wanted to Alright. I just
6	wanted to ask that question. Thank you.
7	KAREN BROOKS HOPKINS: Thank you,
8	Council Member. Thank you.
9	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.
10	Enjoy. Decide who is next.
11	CARLO SCISSURA: Good afternoon,
12	Councilman Weprin. Thank you. Always a pleasure
13	to be with Council Members Reyna and Comrie as
14	well. Diana, thank you for all that you do in
15	Brooklyn. My name is Carlo Scissura. I am the
16	president and CEO of the Brooklyn Chamber of
17	Commerce. We are Brooklyn's largest economic
18	development and business advocacy organization,
19	over 1200 members. Our mission is simpleto
20	support and advocate for healthy and robust
21	business environment throughout the borough. I am
22	here to wholeheartedly support the proposed
23	project for the South site in BAM cultural
2.4	 district. There are very few times I think in our

lives and as you know, Councilman, I spent five

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

years working for Marty Markowitz, where you get to actually look at a project that will transform a skyline and transform a neighborhood and really create an iconic structure, a place that brings together pedestrians, community and people from all over and to one spot. This is one of those examples. I talk about the iconic structure because one of the things I know many people have said including myself, Marty, many of the council members when we did a rezoning on Fourth Avenue was a lack of beautiful, new, exciting buildings. This is different. This is a really new, exciting, beautiful building. You have heard about the housing it's great affordability, very important. I think it is wonderful that there will be a preference given to people already in the neighborhood, very, very important to stress. It is great for business. It will create a 10,000 square foot public plaza, but it is going to be a boom for mom and pop stores in the neighborhood, and one of the things the chamber will be working with Two Trees on is making sure that we provide them with a list of mom and pop stores from the community looking to expand that want to be in

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

that area. I think one of the exciting things is the goal that has been set of 32 percent participation by MWBE contractors, something we applaud greatly. We have already spoke to Two Trees about working with the chamber's MWBE committee about making sure that our members in that world get contracts, and I think that is to be commended for. You have heard from Karen. You are going to hear from Alan about the cultural aspect. I think it is amazing. We think having a great space in Brooklyn that by the way is close to almost every subway line in the city of New York, the traffic will be easy, the congestion will be - - because people will be on a subway and get there, and I think that having a new branch, a culture branch for the Brooklyn Public Library is very exciting. I should say I sat for five years as a board member on the Library, and it is no secret I am preaching to the choir here what libraries go through with funding cuts, so I think that is important to know. And finally, I think the rehearsal space for local artists is very exciting, and you have my testimony, so I just want to say please support this, it is a great

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 project.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very much, Carlo.

LINDA JOHNSON: Good morning, Chairman Weprin, members of the committee. My name is Linda Johnson and I am CEO and President of Brooklyn Public Library, and I am pleased to be here this morning to testify in favor of Two Trees Management's ULERP application for the BAM South project. Two Trees is seeking to build as we have heard this morning, a beautifully designed mixed use project, which will contribute immensely to the already vibrant BAM cultural district and will enliven a significant stretch of Flatbush Avenue with new retail and cultural spaces. The project includes an innovative cultural center as well as much needed affordable housing and new public open space. Brooklyn Public Library is thrilled to have the opportunity to participate in this project. As part of BAM South, Brooklyn Public Library will open a new 16,500 square foot neighborhood library. This inspiring and accessible new branch will allow us to deliver modern public library services to the Fort Green,

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Park Slope and Boerum Hill communities. We are excited to work with the community to develop a design and program for the new branch that reflects the diverse needs of our patrons and leverages the branches unique location at the center of one of the city's most exciting cultural communities. The new branch will be ideally located above one of the busiest transit hubs in New York City. We hope this library will quickly emerge as a regional library capable of offering expanded programming available to all Brooklynites. As you may know Brooklyn Public Library has long faced extraordinary challenges to both operating and capital budgets. This year we face a crippling 36 percent cut to our operating funding and continue to struggle with over 240 million dollars in deferred maintenance for all 58 of our branches. One of the reasons we are so excited about this opportunity, the space at BAM South would be provided to the library at no cost with the library having responsibility only to fit out the branch. We have proposed funding these costs through the sale of the existing Pacific Street branch located two blocks away. This aging

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

facility fails to meet modern library needs in many ways. It suffers from nearly 11 million dollars in maintenance needs. It is inaccessible to people with disabilities and anyone with limited mobility, and it is unable to support sufficient technology and is poorly configured for a modern library, leading to high operating costs. We have begun to discuss our plans to build a bigger, better, more modern library at BAM South with community stakeholders in Park Slope, but has become clear that the community highly values the Pacific Street branch and its historic building. Brooklyn Public Library is and intends to continue to be a vital part of the Park Slope and Boerum Hill neighborhoods and we are sensitive to community concerns. While we strongly feel that the existing Pacific Street branch cannot accommodate the types of services that define successful modern libraries and the kinds of service that the community deserves, we also recognize the community's strong attachment to the library. We are interested in working together with elected officials and the community to develop a plan that allows Brooklyn Public Library

2.

б

to build a modern, bigger library at BAM Sout	h and
to address the future of the Pacific Street	
building in a way that acknowledges the needs	of
the library and the community.	

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay. We have got to wrap you up. I can't have everyone go too far over then my whole three minutes goes out the window. I think we got your point there.

the building of the new library and what happens at the Pacific Street branch are decoupled and have never been contingent upon one another. It is also true that in order to maintain Pacific Street as a library, the costs begin at 12 million dollars and go from there and to the extent that we could do all of it, we would love to.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Got it.

Understood. Sorry. Mr. Fishman?

am Alan Fishman, and I am pleased to have the opportunity to testify on behalf of the project.

I am chairman of the board of the Brooklyn Academy of Music and chairman of the board of the Downtown Brooklyn Partnership, and so as such in those

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

capacities I have had the opportunity to have been involved in many aspects of this proposed project for quite a long time as it has evolved. Like all of the key elements of the BAM cultural district or the downtown Brooklyn cultural district, this project contributes many of the essential pieces to the district and its complexity has taken an awfully long time to come together. The proposed project for the south site in the cultural district, which will be--is an innovative public private partnership to transform what is now an underutilized actually filthy dirty parking lot into a large public plaza, which would be an essential gathering point and focal point for the district, into a cultural asset that you have all heard about, which would be enjoyed by all residents of the surrounding neighborhoods and used really quite extensively--and the apartment building that has been much discussed today. Many of the residents, speaking as an active citizen of downtown Brooklyn, many of the taller residential towers that are now being planned and constructed in downtown Brooklyn are for little or no public benefits in the form of affordable housing, public

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

open space or cultural uses. Instead the joint proposal by Two Trees and the city today seeks to respond to these needs and includes the public benefits that we have discussed--the affordable housing, the minority and women owned business and local businesses, and in fact, the BAM construction just completed at the Fisher building exceeded the numbers that have been proposed by Two Trees by considerable amounts, so I don't think there is any reason why that won't be achieved as well. The public plaza we have talked about, a brand new branch of the library we have talked about, the new movie theaters at BAM, which serve the direct community, they are to serve the children of the community with the most affordable entry level ticket price that BAM offers and more than 12,000 critical feet of rehearsal space for local arts group, which would be operated by a long time respected local arts organization, so you know all of the benefits. The gateway site to the entire district is what is being discussed here today, and I think we have tried very hard to fulfill those needs, those diverse needs in a very responsible and professional way, so we hope we

LINDA JOHNSON: I believe that what 25

new library site?

24

you are referring to is our workforce one centers
that help people get jobs. It is a partnership
with the city of New York, and no, we do not
propose to make a workforce one center resident at
the BAM South site nor is there one ta the Pacific
Street Library.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Is there a reason why you wouldn't explore? Is there a possibility to explore workforce one center there or the Bond Street is too close to...?

things that we are trying to do throughout the borough is distribute the services that we offer. There is a workforce one center at the Central Library just a mile up Flatbush Avenue, and we think that there is not a need for a second one so closely situated.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Mm-hmm. So you anticipate keeping the one at the Grand Central Library. Grand - - sorry.

CARLO SCISSURA: If I could just add one thing, the Bond Street location that you mentioned is about four or five blocks away from this proposed library, so people who need

workforce services literally within half a mile to a mile have two major workforce centers right near this.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: It is the north and south that need the assistance. Thank you very much, and as far as the small businesses, Mr. Scissura, that you were mentioning, if you can just express to us the communication regarding letters of interest from small businesses that would like the opportunity for local placement what mechanisms right now do you foresee that you are going to have put in place so that when there is the open house there isn't this complete disconnection with what you were just mentioning here today?

CARLO SCISSURA: Sure. That is a good question. I think we don't want to put the cart before the horse as they say, so once the Council approves this we will then set up time to meet with Two Trees, and we have already started discussions with them about understanding how much space, what the breakout will be, et cetera, and then we will use our database, which has 15,000, 18,000 small businesses in there, particularly the

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

ones in the area that are a) either looking to expand or looking for new space or looking for something like that and then working within the community we will be able to say, okay, as you are about to lease out, here is a list. The one thing I should add also is Two Trees has a great track record with small businesses. If you talk to some of their businesses that started in Dumbo or in other properties, they will tell you they were able to get really great negotiated deals on rent to help businesses that are flourishing, Jacques Torres [phonetic] is the perfect example. He went out to Dumbo many years ago, no one knew who he was, they gave him a great deal because they knew he had no money, he has now expanded into Sunset Park and building hundreds of jobs within the borough, so I think this can become another example of local small businesses, mom and pops, MWBE, we have the list. We will work with Alan and his team and really put it together, which is exciting.

ALAN FISHMAN: I would also mention if I can that by doubling the theater availability, the move theater availability alone

2	you will dramatically increase the attendance in
3	the neighborhood and the opportunities for small
4	businesses. If you ask any of the merchants
5	around the BAM district today, what they will tell
6	you is when BAM is dark it is a problem in the
7	neighborhood for business. When BAM is lit, it is
8	a big deal. This will double the number of movie
9	attendants from 200,000 a year to about 400,000 a
10	year more or less.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I don't
12	disagree with that considering we just opened up
13	the first theater in decades in our neighborhood
14	in Williamsburg. Thank you so much, Mr. Chair.
15	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Ms.
16	Reyna. Thank you very much.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I just
18	wanted to ask with the library space you said how
19	much was the build out for this space?
20	LINDA JOHNSON: How much is the
21	square footage or how much would it cost?
22	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: How much
23	would it cost to build out?
24	LINDA JOHNSON: We haven't gotten

numbers yet for that, but we imagine--

Τ.	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 13
2	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:
3	[interposing] But you said your idea was to sell
4	Pacific Street so that you could build out
5	LINDA JOHNSON: We have many
6	capital needs across the borough and one way to
7	fund building out the space at BAM South would be
8	to sell the Pacific Street Library.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: But you
10	didn't come up with a number?
11	LINDA JOHNSON: You can do an
12	estimate. We have guessed that it could cost us
13	between five and six million dollars, but we
14	haven't gone out and gotten pricing.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: And do you
16	have preliminary agreements signed with the city
17	already or all this is conditional upon what we do
18	in the committee?
19	LINDA JOHNSON: No, we have no
20	signed agreements.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Has BAM had
22	any conditional signed agreements yet.
23	ALAN FISHMAN: No.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Then just

25 to ask you again, Alan, you said that BAM has no

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 134
2	desire or plans to sell any of the property that
3	it presently holds now?
4	ALAN FISHMAN: No.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: This
6	property would be an extension of everything that
7	BAM is holding. How long would the proposed lease
8	be? Did they give you an idea?
9	ALAN FISHMAN: I think we hold it
10	in perpetuity. I think it's close to No?
11	MALE VOICE: [off mic]
12	ALAN FISHMAN: 25 years with a 25
13	extension. I am sorry. But the point is that
14	this is central to the BAM campus. This would be
15	the fourth property on the BAM campus.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay.
17	Alright. Thank you.
18	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Mr.
19	Comrie. Thank you very much, panel. If you could
20	try in your head to keep your testimony to three
21	minutes, that would really be helpful. I am going
22	to call the next panel in favorwe only have
23	people left in favor, and I know some of them are
24	similar organizations, so if you can limit your
25	testimony. If by some chance you have to leave

because I know people do have other lives, we will read your name into the record, and that you do support the project. I'd like to call a Diti Sen [phonetic] from 32 BJ, Deborah Howard from the Pratt Area Community Council, Leslie Schultz from the Downtown Brooklyn Arts Alliance and James Caldwell of 77 Precinct Community Council. I am going to leave Council Member Comrie in charge for a few minutes. I just have to run across the street and check into a Finance Committee hearing, so I apologize to this panel, and you are in charge, Mr. Chair.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: You can pick among you if you want to go in the order that he called it Ms. Sen from 32 BJ?

DITI SEN: Yes. Again, my name is
Diti Sen. I am here from SEIU Local 32 BJ and we
are here to testify in support for Two Trees'
proposed BAM South project. This project presents
a unique opportunity for the neighborhood in that
the development of this project will allow for
more permanent jobs in the area that pay good
wages and provide access to quality affordable
healthcare. These are the kind of jobs that

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

working people need to survive and raise families in New York City. Of course, we hope and expect that Two Trees and the construction trade unions will come to a workable agreement to ensure that all of the jobs at the development are good jobs. In addition to being a responsible job creator, Two Trees is committed to providing new and much needed amenities for this part of Brooklyn things that could serve to enhance the public realm. Ιf the project moves forward, it will take a site that was formerly a parking facility and replace it with a lively artistic hub offering affordable rehearsal space to local artists, multiple new theaters, and a state of the art public plaza that can also double as a performance space. Two Trees will make sure that the development also responds to some housing needs. 20 percent of the building's units will be affordable, which is a significant improvement to some of the other towers in the area with more going up that will provide no affordable housing and even more rare in the city, these units will have genuine affordability because they are geared towards families making between 40 to 50 percent of AMI

and giving priority to those who live in the
neighborhood. Not every developer is committed to
this mix of high quality jobs in operation,
cultural innovation and affordable housing that
allows workers and community members to care for
their families and thrive in the city, not just in
the present but well into the future. We need to
support responsible community partners and
recognize projects like this one that will help
building service workers and hopefully all workers
earn the wages and benefits they need to make a
decent living in the city. For these reasons, I
urge the City Council to approve this proposal.
Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Next

panelist. Reset the clock please. Also, I am

taking personal privilege, Danny Simmons

[phonetic] is here and he has to be on this panel.

I know he is pressed for time, so I'm taking

Chairman's privilege to put him ahead. So thank

you. Next panelist? No, no, you are next.

DEBORAH HOWARD: Yes. Hi. My name is Deb Howard. I am the executive director of Pratt Area Community Council. We serve the

Central Brooklyn Communities of Fort Green, 2 Clinton Hill, Bed Stuy and Prospect Heights. 3 4 close to 50 years, we have represented the 5 neighborhoods in this community and worked through tenant organizing, affordable housing development, 6 economic development geared towards local merchants and foreclosure prevention and home 9 buyer and home owner services. PACC supports the 10 proposed project in the BAM South site for several 11 reasons -- the first one being the creation of a 12 considerable number of new apartments for low 13 income families. We understand that the building 14 will have approximately 60 units for individuals 15 and families making below 50 percent of area 16 median income, which for a family of three for 17 instance is less than 37,350 and for a family of 18 three in a 40 percent AMI is 33,200. For the most 19 part this - - range has been left out of the 20 revitalization of the downtown Brooklyn area. Too 21 many new developments either have no affordable 22 apartments at all or when the developments are 23 marketed as affordable, the rents are beyond the 24 reach of the low and moderate income families in 25 our community. They generally serve what is a

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

middle income population; therefore we support this new proposed project for providing the working poor and low income residents in this neighborhood that PACC serves. Secondly, the project is proposed to have 50,000 square feet of cultural space including rehearsal space for local organizations, and we really support 651 Arts being the cultural partner in this. They have been a longtime Brooklyn cultural organization and there is also the new theaters operated by BAM and the Brooklyn Public Library with the public plaza really being an amenity that I think can be used by number of local cultural groups. PACC welcomes the development projects that incorporate public benefits, especially those, because so many others do not. We do encourage that cultural space be mostly used by local cultural groups at below market rents. Two Trees has also been a responsible developer committed to hiring minority owned and women owned businesses. In this case it will be 32 percent for minority and women owned businesses and 20 percent to local. We advocate for this. We understand that the city's incentive programs that developers use new buildings allow

2.

for multiyear affordability and that the
affordability ultimately expires. This is more a
policy issue for the 80/20 program at New York
State, which we would advocate and hope that the
Council think in terms of making sure that the 20
percent affordable remain affordable permanently
as rent stabilized apartments. In closing, we
support the approval of this project for the
public benefits it provides and the creation of
truly affordable apartments for residents in the
surrounding communities. Thank you.

GOUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Did you give a copy of that testimony to the sergeant at arms? If you could e-mail it to us, that would be fine. Next panelist.

Schultz. I am the president of BRICK [phonetic], but I am also a member of the steering committee of the Downtown Brooklyn Arts Alliance or DBAA, a consortium of 31 arts organizations based in downtown Brooklyn. I am here today to testify on behalf of DBBA. A little bit of background, DBAA was conceived in summer of 2010 by a group of 12 Brooklyn cultural organizations who wanted to

2	respond to common concerns and opportunities.
3	Within six months we had 21 members and currently
4	have 31 members. We represent a broad range of
5	arts organizations ranging from the New York
6	Transit Museum to the Mark Morris Dance Group, and
7	from OKADA [phonetic] and Brooklyn Ballet and
8	American Opera Projects. BAM and 651 Arts are
9	also part of the alliance. As an alliance, we
10	have engaged in dialogue with numerous government
11	officials, conducted a survey about our economic
12	impact, been in conversation with real estate
13	developers, co-presented an outdoor performing
14	arts program and connected our respective staffs
15	on many levels. Today however represents the
16	first time we have formally testified on a
17	project. We have a policy to not take public
18	positions unless we have polled our members and
19	there is no objection and we did poll our
20	membership. We have chosen to be here today
21	because of the importance of the south side
22	project to the vibrancy of the downtown Brooklyn
23	cultural district. The elements of the project
24	that are particularly important to us are the
25	10,000 square foot public plaza and the 50,000

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

square feet of space that will be owned by the city and dedicated to cinemas for BAM, affordable rehearsal space for local arts organizations managed by 651 Arts and the new branch of the Brooklyn Public Library. DBAA organizations are close neighbors of the south side, and thus, many of us have paid close attention to the plans for the site. We believe that the project as currently proposed will have an important impact on the burgeoning downtown Brooklyn cultural district. Brooklyn residents, art patrons from throughout New York City and visitors and tourists alike will surely be drawn to the area by the sheer density of cultural programming. We believe particularly strongly in several aspects of the proposed plan. First, the contemplated affordable artist work space is critical to the growing district. Artists working in the area and not just being presented will inevitably enrich the creative energy in the neighborhood. Second, a local branch of the Brooklyn Public Library will be a tremendous asset and potential partner for many of the arts and arts organizations in the district. Third, the BAM rose [phonetic] cinemas

б

are an extremely popular amenity of the district
bringing hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers to
the area each year and expansion of the cinemas
will have a beneficial multiplier effect. Last
but certainly not least, the proposed major public
plaza will greatly enhance the area. There is a
dearth of open public space in the district, so
the plaza will fill a real need. The plaza will
also allow for outdoor programming, including
performing arts, open air markets and other
community uses, which will greatly enrich the
experience of visitors. The proposed project thus
represents a key part of the remarkable potential
for our neighborhood and DBAA is extremely hopeful
for its success. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Right on time.

DANNY SIMMONS: Good morning, Mr. Chairman. My name is Danny Simmons. I am the former chairman of New York State Council on the Arts, but mostly I am here to testify as an individual artist living in the community. The BAM cultural district has increased the opportunities for artists within Brooklyn a

hundred fold. I personally have benefitted from 2 the new Fisher building and every artist I know 3 has gained increased visibility because of all the 4 5 cultural density that is happening in downtown This proposed project I have listened Brooklyn. 6 to every aspect of it. I have read about it. There are no downsides on the face of it that I 9 can see--affordable housing, a space for the 10 library. I was actually a board member of the 11 Brooklyn Public Library when we started thinking 12 about that space and that space has always been an 13 underutilized space for cultural activities except 14 for three days during the summer when they have 15 Dance Africa. Other than that, it is not used--it 16 is not even a fully used parking lot because it is 17 very often mostly empty. So to create a cultural 18 space and affordable housing in that space is only 19 a plus for the neighborhood, and it is a plus for 20 David and them of course that they are going to 21 have the rest of it to build full market rate 22 housing, but even bringing new residents into the 23 neighborhood increases the opportunity for 24 artists' work to be seen by these new residents 25 because they are the patrons of the arts, the new

residents. So I mean there is no downside to it. I did listen to the part about union workers, and I am sure that that is going to be ironed out. I am hoping that is going to be ironed out, but other than that, I can't see any reason the City Council would not approve this project. It is a win/win for the artist. It is a win/win for cultural organizations, certainly a win/win for BAM of who I am a member of the board of, and we have been looking for this expansion not only for BAM's expansion, but to expand and create a cultural district with so many diverse things going. That was it for me.

JAMES CALDWELL: Good afternoon.

My name is James Caldwell, and I am the president for the 77 Precinct Community Council, and I am here today to represent those construction workers that are living in our community that are non-union that in a lot of cases do not get an opportunity to participate when big development comes to our area, and with the community our benefits that Two Tree Management is offering, it gives us an opportunity to be a part of this project, and in our community, it is about jobs.

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Jobs, jobs, jobs is what it is about, and we need the Council to support this project and not to leave our people out in the cold. We get left out in the cold too much and when I say our people, I am talking about the poor people, black, white. That is what I am talking about and we do not--when unions come in and we cannot be a part of the unions, that means there is no work for us, and when there is no work as the president of the Precinct Community Council, crime goes up in our neighborhood whether we would like to acknowledge that or not because people have to have a way to eat, they have to have a way to take care of their kids, so we are asking you all to support this project because Two Trees Management is trying to work with the community, but if this project goes all union, we would be left again. We will not get an opportunity to enjoy all the cultural we have in our community, so we are asking you, we are pleading with you, please, please don't let this project go all union because if it do, we are shut out once again, so I am asking you on behalf of the 77 Precinct Community Council we have lived in this community for over 40 years and we need an

opportunity for our peoples to participate because
they have skills too. They just don't have union
cards. So if you would take that into
consideration our community certainly would
appreciate it. Thank you for this opportunity.
COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you.
I want to thank the panel for coming down and
staying and testifying today. I appreciate it.
Council Member Jackson to vote on all of the items
on today's calendar exceptwell, this is not
being voted on. All of the items that are being
voted on on today's calendar.
COUNSEL: Land Use items 827, 832,
836, 837, 838, Land Use to approve and Land Use
item 828 to file. Council Member Jackson?
COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: I vote aye
on all. I apologize. I was over chairing the
Education Committee hearing, which I must return
back to as of now. So I vote aye on all. Thank
you.
COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: We just had
to let him go. He has been chairing the Education

Committee. They have been fighting with the

chancellor all morning. He has to go back to the

hearing, so we appreciate your accommodation. The next panel is Conrad Walker from Berkeley College, Dominique Bravo [phonetic] from Cumbrae Dance--can come and sit at the table, Lane Harwell [phonetic] from Dance New York, Susan Chin from Design Trust and Ginny Loloudis [phonetic] from Art New York.

[background conversation]

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I just want to check, there was some people that didn't put names or Dance - -, Urban Bush Women, Office of the Brooklyn Borough--this is all the same handwriting. 651 Arts--is someone from 651 here? Did you write out a name? Brooklyn Public Library testified already. Okay. Any of these other groups that I named here? No. Okay. Alright. You can start.

DOMINIQUE BRAVO: Hi. My name is

Dominique Bravo. I have lived in Park Slope for

over 20 years. I have three kids who go to school

in the Brooklyn Heights neighborhood. I am also a

small business owner. I opened a Cumbrae Center

for African and Diaspora Dance about a year ago,

which is located about a block up Flatbush from

the proposed site. I am also a member of

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Community Board 6 and I am very active in the community, not just in the cultural center, but also with a variety of community groups, and I just wanted to come and lend my full support for the project. As a small business owner very close in the BAM cultural district, it is hugely important for our business to survive for people to feel comfortable and to come into the area. BAM has been incredibly helpful to us as have the cultural non-profit groups and we have seen just over the last several months with Barclays that our business really has picked up. As a dance studio we get requests every day from artists who would like rehearsal space and other space for public events, and while we try to do as much as we can, the proposal for space available for artists in the project is just so important. just fully support and the public space also we are really excited about the prospect of having events in the public space, and just really working to make this part of Brooklyn the center, the cultural center that it is becoming, so I would just like to--I will submit my testimony by e-mail I guess. We are in full support of it.

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2			COT	UNCIL	MEMBE	R CC	MRIE:	Thank	you
3	for	coming	down.	Than!	k you	for	testi	fying.	

CONRAD WALKER: Alright. Hello. My name is Conrad Walker, and I am from Berkeley College and I also serve on the board of the Downtown Brooklyn Partnership and the Fulton Mall Improvement Association. At Berkeley College we have been in the community now in downtown Brooklyn for about three years where I serve as the campus operating officer and as Karen Brooks Hopkins mentioned a little earlier, you know, as an educational institution this is the type of cultural partnership and the type of cultural organization that we support because of all that it does for our community and all that it does for the students in the communities that we serve. Berkeley College, we have in the three years that we have been in downtown Brooklyn about 700 students all of whom are from the neighboring communities -- Bedford Stuyvesant, Crown Heights, Flatbush, all of the neighboring areas that would get advantage from this cultural center and so we know our students are interested in participating and enjoying the many benefits of this

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

organization, and then on top of that, there is an educational advantage for all Brooklyn citizens to take part and to enjoy this space and all that is being proposed here, so as one of the major educational institutions in Downtown Brooklyn Partnership you know we do support this project, and we hope that it gets pushed forward.

GINNY LOLOUDIS: Hello. Good afternoon. I am Ginny Loloudis, executive director of the Alliance of Resident Theaters New York, the leading service and advocacy organization for New York City's non-profit theaters all 375 of them. I am here to offer Art New York's support for Two Trees Management's proposed project design by the world renowned Enrique Norton for the south site of what we call the Downtown Brooklyn Cultural District. I think I was asked to testify because ART New York was the first organization besides Mark Morris to become part of the BAM cultural district, and in fact they expanded their north boundaries to include my building, which houses 20 affordable offices and three rehearsal studios. Our tenants include Urban Bush Women, Elders Share the Arts,

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

American Arts Projects. We provide dance classes. We have music for aardvarks for toddlers in the neighborhood. We have White Bird Productions does a summer camp, so we are very active in the neighborhood, and I think that was the reason I was invited. We have since developed a similar affordable and office rehearsal space in the fashion district and we are now involved with a similar project, mixed use development with the developer who got special benefits for including three theaters, three non-profit theaters. We are in the Department of Design and Construction's design excellence program and Council Member Comrie, that program allows us to work with a world renowned architect like Toshiko Mori [phonetic], so I am not sure if when they said that the city forced them to use a world renowned architect if they were in the design excellence we didn't feel we were forced. program. COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:

[interposing] That is a whole bigger issue--just to try to enlighten you. The issue of the mayor's office or the City Planning laying out and dictating design and that is a larger issue for

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

the entire development community, not particularly this project, and the issues of whether or not the development community can feel unshackled is really what I was driving to, not around the BAM project or even the design. I think it's a great design. It is interesting that when we try to bring up those terms on the Council side, they push back, but when they try to dictate on their side, they keep it under cover, so the fact that that was even brought out to light today was interesting for the members that have been trying to get their particular projects done and been getting pushback from the city. It really has nothing to do with this particular design or building. It is just that when you have an administration that likes to dictate these types of things happen.

GINNY LOLOUDIS: I'll deviate and get to the point because I know you have been here and as usual Council Member Comrie is here from the beginning to the end, and I am always grateful to that. I'll just leave you with this message. There is a critical space shortage in theater, which is why ART New York is working so hard for

subsidized non-profit rehearsal performance and
office space. There is also a Brooklyn resident
and owner of a house and a landlord a shortage of
affordable space, and I understood everything Tish
James had to say and I am very sympathetic by it.
I think 20 percent, 80/20 housing in the project
that we are doing the most recent one, which is
called Archstone Clinton [phonetic], it has 80/20
housing rental units, plus our building, our
theaters are in luxury high rise condominiums
across the street. Of course we would love more
than 20 percent, but at least this project has 20
percent. So in conclusion, we are supportive. We
heard all the comments. I hope you heard the
comments, and I hope Two Trees heard the comments,
and it would be very nice if a consensus could be
reached. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you. Thank you, panel for coming down.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very much, and I apologize for having to run across the street, and just so you know Two Trees has a representative here, so even if they didn't hear it directly they will hear it through their

PHILIP KELLOGG: I will be brief so we can go outside. Good afternoon I should say.

My name is Philip Kellogg and I am the executive director of the Fulton Area Business Alliance, the FAB Alliance business improvement district on Fulton Street in Fort Green and Clinton Hill in

Brooklyn, and our business improvement district
represents over 225 small businesses, most of them
locally owned and operated within the district
that is just one block from this proposed project
site. Transforming the underutilized parking lot
into a vibrant mixed use development will continue
the dramatic growth of the Downtown Brooklyn
Cultural District while providing a wide range of
benefits for the community. The additional public
space of course in the form of the large public
plaza plus a cultural and civic facilities.
Benefits to the local businesses will come in the
form of the substantial increase in foot traffic
generated at all times of the day every day of the
week, and that is something that might not happen
if it wasn't such a dynamic mixed use proposal, so
with that on behalf of the Fulton Area Business
Alliance, I respectfully ask for the Council to
support this project. Thank you.
CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

DOREEN SEVARIS: Good afternoon.

> My name is Doreen Sevaris [phonetic]. I work with Crescent Consulting Associates. I am the director of development and special projects. I am here

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2	today on behalf of Rohan Defreytas, the principal
3	of Crescent Consulting, who unfortunately could
4	not be here due to medical reasons.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: I am sorry to hear that. I hope everything is okay.

DOREEN SEVARIS: Thank you.

Crescent Consulting specializes in providing management services for affirmative action, equal employment opportunity, prevailing wage and diversity initiatives that are associated with construction projects. We have a successful track record in achieving contract requirement goals for the - - of minority owned, women owned and locally based businesses as well as workforce initiatives. We have vast experience working in Brooklyn in projects which include the Brooklyn Navy Yard's buildings 92, 77 and the - - manufacturing center. We have worked on the BAM Fisher building, the BAM Harvey Theater, city point project [phonetic] and currently with Steiner studios on the 25 Washington Avenue project. Crescent has worked with Two Trees Management on several projects. Most recently we launched an aggressive outreach campaign for the Dock Street project to promote

б

contracting opportunities to minority women and
Brooklyn based businesses. We worked with Two
Trees late last year to coordinate their first
ever MW and LBE project outreach event for the
Dock Street project with over 100 individuals
registered to attend the event that was held at
Brooklyn Navy Yard demonstrating the great
interest that businesses have to work with Two
Trees and on downtown Brooklyn projects. For that
particular event, we had a great deal of support.
We were supported by Commissioner Towns [phonetic]
of the New York State Housing and Community
Renewal Agency. We had representatives,
Councilwoman Letitia James was there as well. We
have the Brooklyn borough president's office in
attendance. Representatives from Senator Daniel
Squadron's office were also there. We have worked
with Two Trees to develop innovate local workforce
initiatives run by Ed Brown of Team Brown
Consulting [phonetic] to give opportunities to
qualified laborers, who live in and around
downtown Brooklyn, and although construction is
only just underway for this particular project,
individuals have already been placed at the

2	project site with some of the contracting
3	businesses. Two Trees has committed to ambitious
4	goals for the BAM South project of which Crescent
5	will work closely with the project managers to
6	accomplish those goals. The project has
7	established a contracting goal of 32 percent MWBE
8	participation and 20 percent local business
9	participation. These firms will of course have
10	the appropriate MWBE certification with the city
11	of New York and the state of New York and like the
12	Dock Street project, Two Trees has committed to us
13	that they will engage in early outreach of the
14	MWBE contracting community to make sure that
15	qualified firms are aware of the many
16	opportunities that will be available at the BAM
17	South site project. As an advocate for small
18	businesses, minority and women owned businesses,
19	Crescent Consulting is in support of this project.
20	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.
21	Just don't use the clock anymore. Try to keep it
22	to three minutes, the two of you. Thanks.
23	AARON MCKINNEY: Good afternoon.
24	My name is Aaron McKinney, associate producer for

651 Arts. On behalf of our executive director,

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Shea Waver [phonetic], the board and staff of 651 Arts, I am here to express our support of the south side project. 651 Arts has been a presenter in the Downtown Brooklyn Cultural District for 25 years, and we are excited to have the opportunity to expand our presence in the neighborhood and to increase our support of local artists and arts organizations. One of our core programs is providing support for emerging and rising artists of African descent. Having the space to provide these services will allow us to continue to fulfill our mission in a different scale and in a more comprehensive manner. Since the beginning of 651 we have had administrative offices inside of BAM's Harvey Theater and have used venues in and around the area of our presentations. In addition to managing the space at the south side project for other organizations use, we will be able to present selected programs in the space while using other area venues for our larger events. Having space for local dance companies and others is sorely needed. It will provide a much needed option in Brooklyn versus having to commute into Manhattan. We are honored to be one of the three

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

designated cultural organizations to occupy the development and we fully support this project.

4 Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you. We would never use the clock if people were that quick.

JACKIE BUSH: Good afternoon. My name is Jackie Bush [phonetic], and I am here on behalf of Nancy - - , executive director of the Mark Morris Dance Group and the Mark Morris dance group itself to offer our support to the south site development project. A little background is just that we are located at 3 Lafayette Avenue right across the street from this project. With affordable housing, cultural space and an outdoor plaza included in this project, this development responds perfectly to the needs of the community in downtown Brooklyn. The 12,000 square feet of rehearsal space fills a great need for the ever growing demand for rehearsal space for local artists, which we certainly recognize as we also rent out this space and never have enough to offer. There is incredible potential for the outdoor public plaza to serve as the gateway to

the cultural district offering a gathering space for local residents, theater attendees and tourists as well as a space for arts organizations to present programming. One of the reasons that Mark was excited for the dance group to move to Brooklyn 12 years ago was because he could see so much sky, and so we appreciate that this beautiful design balances a 32 story building while maintaining views and open sky. The south site development project is a welcomed and needed addition to the Downtown Brooklyn Cultural District, and we look forward to having it across the street.

much. I don't have any questions for you. We do appreciate your testimony. Is there anyone else here who wanted to testify that I didn't get to? Okay, seeing none. Well, thank you very much. I am sorry you guys were kept waiting this long. I am going to close the hearing now on BAM South and the meeting will be recessed. I was hoping to hear from Council Member Ignizio, who I know is across the street at a hearing. I know we are going to recess so he could vote later on

б

Thursday, assuming he could be there, but we are going to give him--just give me five minutes to try to get his whereabouts and if he would rather come vote now. So with the rolls open for five minutes to figure out where Councilman Ignizio wants to be, we are going to recess to Thursday, June 6th, at 9:30 here in this room. So that is Thursday, June 6th, and we will take up the BAM South vote at that time we assume. You never know. That is the plan. I didn't promise. Anyway, with that in mind, the meeting is now recessed with a five minute window with the roll open for Council Member Ignizio. Thank you.

16 [gavel]

I, Kimberley Campbell certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

	Kimbuly Campbell	
Signature	0 - 1	
Date	6/27/13	