

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

-----X

February 27, 2013

Start: 2:04 p.m.

Recess: 4:10 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers
City Hall

B E F O R E:
JOEL RIVERA
President Pro Tempore

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Joel Rivera
Christine C. Quinn
Maria del Carmen Arroyo
Charles Barron
Gale A. Brewer
Margaret S. Chin
Leroy G. Comrie, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Inez E. Dickens
Erik Martin Dilan
Daniel Dromm
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras
Lewis A. Fidler
Helen D. Foster
Daniel R. Garodnick

A P P E A R A N C E S

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

James F. Gennaro
Vincent J. Gentile
Sara M. Gonzalez
David Greenfield
Daniel J. Halloran III
Vincent M. Ignizio
Robert Jackson
Letitia James
Andy King
Peter A. Koo
G. Oliver Koppell
Karen Koslowitz
Brad S. Lander
Jessica S. Lappin
Stephen T. Levin
Melissa Mark-Viverito
Darlene Mealy
Rosie Mendez
Michael C. Nelson
James S. Oddo
Annabel Palma
Domenic M. Recchia, Jr.
Diana Reyna
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Peter F. Vallone, Jr.
James G. Van Bramer
Albert Vann
Mark S. Weprin
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Kevin Colucci

Catherine McVay Hughes
Chair
Manhattan Community Board 1

Mark Amaruso

Allan Tannenbaum

Captain Michael McPhillips
Director of Social Services and Benefits
Feal Good Foundation

Chief Ed Wilmarth
President
New York City Volunteer Firemen's Association

Father Ambiorix Rodriguez
Our Lady of Mercy Church

1
2 SPEAKER QUINN: All right, we have
3 three ceremonials today. The first one is being
4 led by Council Member Mark Weprin, and it is for
5 the St. Francis Prep High School girl's volleyball
6 team, who are numerous time winners, as I
7 understand it.

8 All right, well let's have the
9 Terriers come up and Mark will tell--Hi, Peter--
10 about their accomplishment.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Well, here
12 is the women's volleyball team from St. Francis
13 Prep in Queens, New York. For the sixth year in a
14 row, actually, they've won the Brooklyn-Queens
15 Catholic High School Championship, so we want to
16 wish them congratulations. Where are you going,
17 Madame Speaker? I'm ruining the picture here.
18 The problem with a volleyball team is you can't
19 find a short person to stand behind to get in the
20 picture, so I'm going to go over here. I'll stand
21 with you.

22 SPEAKER QUINN: [off mic]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Just one
24 little piece of trivia, and I want to let another
25 Council Member say hello. All very talented young

1
2 ladies. One in particular happens to be the
3 grandchild of the former speaker of the City
4 Council, Peter F. Vallone, Sr. If you do your
5 math, that means she's the daughter of another
6 Council Member, Peter F. Vallone, Jr.

7 SPEAKER QUINN: Yay.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: So we
9 brought Peter up here today. I invited the women
10 here today, and Peter wanted to partake. Caroline
11 Vallone, who's here, wanted to borrow some money.
12 So between those two acts of you seeing your
13 daughter and her... Anyway, no. I would like to
14 give Peter Vallone a chance.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you,
16 Mark; thank you, Speaker Quinn for this great
17 honor for these girls. As Mark said, six years in
18 a row with one defeat, and man, was that defeat
19 avenged. By the way, these girls didn't win all
20 six; they won four. It's not like they got left
21 back or anything. In fact, you know the reason
22 they won is just because they're better athletes
23 and they train harder and they have better coaches
24 with Mr. C. It's because of what's up here. I
25 think almost every girl in this team, every girl

1
2 probably has over a 90 average, the most high--way
3 higher than that. Yep.

4 SPEAKER QUINN: Yay.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: And what's
6 in here. These girls, you know, have the hearts
7 of lions. That's why they've been winning six
8 years in a row. They really do deserve this
9 honor. They represent New York and Queens on the
10 court. Off the court, they all have great futures
11 ahead of them. I'm proud to have not missed one
12 of their games. So, thanks girls.
13 Congratulations. If I could ask the clerk to read
14 the proclamation.

15 CLERK: The City of New York is
16 proud to honor the St. Francis Preparatory High
17 School Girl's Volleyball Team for outstanding
18 teamwork that led to a triumphant win at the
19 Brooklyn-Queens championship for the sixth
20 consecutive season.

21 And whereas, St. Francis
22 Preparatory High School, commonly known as St.
23 Francis Prep, in Fresh Meadows, Queens, is the
24 largest private Catholic secondary school in
25 America. This year, the members of St. Francis

1
2 Prep Volleyball Team, also known as the Terriers,
3 reaffirmed their school's reputation for athletic
4 excellence when the team, led by Coach Kevin
5 Colucci and Assistant Coach Rose Delnnocentiis
6 Ruesing, won the Brooklyn-Queens championship.

7 And whereas, the players who
8 comprise St. Francis Prep's Terriers are: Jessica
9 Vishnunad [phonetic], Caroline Vallone, Nicole
10 Tong, Kaitlyn Sluyk, Stephanie Socalich
11 [phonetic], Katie Shields, Johary Rivadeneira,
12 Kiara Pierre, Kira Otero, Tara O'Rourke, Kendra
13 McCalla, Jacyln LaForgia, Caroline Gorecki, Kelly
14 Flynn, Daniele Devana [phonetic], and Kayla
15 Burlovan [phonetic].

16 And whereas, the Terriers owe their
17 championship victory, not only to the hard work,
18 discipline and dedication of each player, but also
19 to the shared commitment and enthusiastic
20 teamwork. We congratulate each of these champions
21 on their accomplishments and we wish them
22 continued success, both on and off the volleyball
23 court.

24 Now, therefore, be it known that
25 the Council of the City of New York honors and

1
2 congratulates the Terriers, the St. Francis Prep
3 Girl's Volleyball Team for their outstanding
4 teamwork and for their victory in the Brooklyn-
5 Queens championship. Christine C. Quinn, Speaker
6 for the entire Council; Mark Weprin, Council
7 Member 23rd District Queens; Peter F. Vallone,
8 Jr., Council Member 22nd District Queens.

9 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Mike. I
10 think we might have gotten one or two of the staff
11 member names wrong. So when whoever or the staff
12 speaks, if you can correct that, that would be
13 great. I just want to congratulate everyone on
14 the volleyball team. Peter, you're making us look
15 bad with the keys. I want everyone on the team to
16 know that's a special gift in this ceremonial that
17 most folks don't get.

18 Congratulations. This is quite a
19 victory for many of you to have won four times in
20 a row and for your team and school to have won six
21 times in a row, and on top of that for all of you
22 to be such great scholar athletes. This is just
23 another example, in my opinion, of why sports,
24 particularly for young girls and young women are
25 really a critical part of education and help us

1

2 become better women, stronger, more confident and
3 better students as well. So congratulations.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

I love your mascot, because you
know what you can say about a terrier? It's
scrappy. If there's one thing you want to be in
life, girl, it is scrappy. Trust me; it's better
than even being smart, but be both if you can. So
let me turn the mike over now to whoever wants to
speak from the coaching or the academic staff.

11

12

13

14

KEVIN COLUCCI: My name is Kevin
Colucci. I'm the coach for St. Francis Prep
Volleyball Team. Steph Horan is actually my
assistant coach.

15

SPEAKER QUINN: Yay.

16

17

18

19

20

21

KEVIN COLUCCI: The name was wrong.
I can't do anything without her. I want to thank
Speaker Quinn and Council Member Weprin for
inviting us here and giving us this great
privilege. It is a great bunch of girls. I love
them all and they deserve everything they've got.

22

23

24

25

SPEAKER QUINN: Does the captain or
the co-captains want to speak on behalf of the
team? No, nobody else? Okay. Well, thank you
guys. Our chief of staff, Chuck Meara, St.

1
2 Francis Prep is his alma mater. So thank you for
3 making him look good, too. So thank you girls
4 very much. Congratulations.

5 The next ceremonial is going to be
6 led by Margaret Chin, and that is honoring
7 activists on post-9/11 health issues who've for
8 the Zadroga Health Act. If we could ask--oh here
9 she is--Council Member Chin to come on up, and if
10 the folks who are here for this could make their
11 way up.

12 [Pause]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you,
14 Madame Speaker. Today, I'm pleased to present
15 proclamation to four individuals who were
16 instrumental in getting the James Zadroga 9/11
17 Health and Compensation Act passed and signed into
18 law. These four individuals have been staunch
19 advocate for 9/11 health-related issue, both for
20 the first responder community and the Lower
21 Manhattan community.

22 Most recently, their advocacy
23 effort have led to getting 30 types of cancer
24 added to the Zadroga Act.

25 [Applause]

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: First, I want
3 to introduce Catherine McVay Hughes. On September
4 11, 2001, Catherine McVay Hughes, currently the
5 chair of Community Board 1, was living just one
6 block each of the World Trade Center. Since the
7 attack, Catherine has been a community leader on
8 World Trade Center health issue. She has helped
9 review scientific and medical evidence and has
10 helped to make recommendation to the World Trade
11 Center Health Program Administrator and most
12 recently on what illnesses should be covered by
13 the Zadroga Act.

14 Mr. Mark Amaruso [phonetic]. On
15 September 11, 2001, Mark Amaruso was volunteering
16 as a poll worker at an election site when the
17 attack happened. As the crisis unfold, Mark
18 volunteered to help evacuate others, and headed to
19 the site immediately after the collapse of the
20 tower, to search through the rubbles for
21 survivors. For three and a half days, Mark worked
22 at the World Trade Center site. Mark traveled to
23 Washington, D.C. to appeal to Congress to pass the
24 Zadroga Act. When the act was passed, he
25 continued to fight for the inclusion of cancer

1

2 under the law.

3 [Applause]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you.

5 Mr. Allan Tannenbaum. On September 11, 2001,
6 Allan Tannenbaum, a well known photojournalist,
7 documented with his camera the attack on the World
8 Trade Center. Allan published 9/11 still killing
9 the hidden victims to document the serious illness
10 people suffer from the exposure to 9/11 toxin,
11 which helped bring the issue to national
12 attention.

13 And last but not least, we have a
14 proclamation for Mr. John Feal. Unfortunately,
15 John could not join us here today. He has had an
16 operation. Here to accept on his behalf is
17 Captain Michael McPhillips [phonetic], a 9/11
18 first responder and director of social service and
19 benefits for the Feal Good Foundation. Even
20 though John isn't here, I would still like to say
21 a few words about him.

22 He was an Army veteran. John Feal
23 volunteered to assist the recovery effort at
24 Ground Zero in the days after the attack on the
25 World Trade Center. John has spent the last ten

1
2 years advocating for compensation for first
3 responders, recovery workers, building cleaners,
4 returning workers and downtown residents. John
5 founded the Feal Good Foundation to raise money
6 for those in need of medical help and to raise
7 public awareness of the problems of medical
8 coverage for first responders.

9 He organized bus loads of
10 firefighters, police officers, paramedics,
11 construction workers, cleaners and residents to
12 travel to Washington, D.C. to rally at the U.S.
13 Capitol in support of health care and compensation
14 for those affected by 9/11. John has been
15 recognized as instrumental in getting the James
16 Zadroga 9/11 Health and Compensation Act passed
17 and signed into law, and for getting cancer added
18 to the list of illness covered by the act.

19 So I'm glad that the Council has an
20 opportunity to honor the four individuals for
21 their advocacy and hard work on the James Zadroga
22 Act and also getting cancer included. So, thank
23 you for being here today.

24 [Applause]

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Can I ask the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

clerk to read the proclamation? Thank you.

CLERK: Council City of New York Proclamation. Whereas, on September 11, 2001, terrorist attacks resulted in the deaths of almost 3,000 people at the World Trade Center, Pentagon and near Shanksville, Pennsylvania. Emergency responders and ordinary citizens stepped forward and risked their lives to help others. At the site of the World Trade Center, the collapse of the twin towers resulted in massive dust clouds throughout the downtown area. For days that followed, fine, white ash fell from the sky, yet federal agencies advised the public that air was safe to breathe.

And whereas, in the aftermath of the terrorist attacks, residents were encouraged to return to their homes and downtown workers were encouraged to return to work. Emergency responders and volunteers toiled at the Ground Zero site without adequate respiratory equipment to protect them from breathing in toxic particulates. Many who lived or worked downtown and who responded to the crises later developed serious and debilitating mental and physical

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

problems.

 However, it was only through years of dedicated, tenacious advocacy by a group of citizens and first responders that the James Zadroga 9/11 Health and Compensation Act was passed in 2010. This legislation allows individuals to apply for compensation for 9/11 related health problems through the World Trade Center Health Program. In 2012, this same group of citizen advocates achieved a major victory in the fight for fair coverage: 30 types of cancer were added to the Zadroga Act.

 The City Council is grateful to honor four of those people that are here today: Catherina McVay Hughes, Allan Tannenbaum, Mark Amaruso, and John Feal.

 Now, therefore, be it known that the Council of the City of New York gratefully honors Catherine McVay Hughes, Allan Tannenbaum, Mark Amaruso and John Feal for their outstanding service to all New Yorkers. Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for the entire Council; Margaret S. Chin, Council Member 1st District Manhattan.

[Applause]

1
2 SPEAKER QUINN: Well, Margaret,
3 first I want to thank you for organizing this
4 ceremonial today, because I think it's really
5 important every day, but particularly today, which
6 is yesterday was the 20th anniversary of the first
7 attack on the World Trade Center in 1993. So for
8 this week to be standing here thanking and
9 recognizing New Yorkers who have fought so hard to
10 make sure this city was able to rebuild, come
11 back, and not just say we were never going to
12 forget, but show that we're never going to forget,
13 by making sure those who risked their lives in
14 helping with the recovery and the rebuilding get
15 the care that they need and the recognition and
16 the support they need for their health needs from
17 the federal government. So, Margaret, thank you
18 very much for reminding us that we can't just say
19 we're never going to forget, we need to actually
20 do it through our deeds and our actions. Thank
21 all of you for the work you did in those darkest
22 of days right after September 11th, but in all the
23 work you have continued to do to show a clear
24 message that New York City cannot be put down or
25 kept down. So, thank you all very much. You're

1

2 examples. If you would convey that to John for us
3 as well, a great, great, valiant and strong New
4 Yorkers. So thank you all. I don't know if any
5 of you want to say a few words.

6

MALE VOICE: Thank you. Just thank
7 Madame Speaker and Councilwoman Chin. All this
8 hard work and--when I was down at Ground Zero as
9 they call it, one of the most important things
10 that we got in the Zadroga bill was that residents
11 and volunteers that weren't necessarily affiliated
12 with a union or a government agency were covered
13 in the bill. That was the thing I really wanted
14 to get in there and it's in there.

15

ALLAN TANNENBAUM: I want to thank
16 Council Member Chin and Speaker Quinn and my
17 fellow New Yorkers. You know, as a press
18 photographer, when people are running away from a
19 situation, we're often running in and that's why
20 we're considered first responders as well. I
21 think that this also shows the power of the
22 photograph and the press image. A lot of the
23 things that were shown in the photographs helped
24 in various ways. For example, at Senate and House
25 hearings, where they were on display, how the

1
2 power of an image can help pass this piece of
3 legislation.

4 [Applause]

5 CATHERINE MCVAY HUGHES: There are
6 many people really to thank, who worked behind the
7 scenes and made many, many trips to Washington,
8 D.C. over the last almost 12 years. As Bruce
9 Springsteen says it best, "We take care of our
10 own." I'm honored to receive this proclamation on
11 behalf of many people that helped. But I do want
12 to remind people that there's the looming budget
13 cuts in Washington, D.C. right now for the James
14 Zadroga bill and for the victims of Hurricane
15 Sandy. I urge that we pay a lot of attention to
16 this so that all of our hard work is not lost.
17 Thank you very much.

18 [Applause]

19 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very
20 much. Thank you, Margaret. Thank you guys.
21 Thank you for all your work.

22 [Pause]

23 SPEAKER QUINN: All right, so the
24 next and last ceremonial is going to be led by
25 Council Member Eric Ulrich, and it is to recognize

1

2 and thank five volunteer fire departments who were
3 critical in responding to the needs of victims
4 during Hurricane Sandy and to all of the
5 rebuilding efforts since Sandy. So let me give
6 the mike over to Council Member Ulrich.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you,
8 Speaker Quinn. My colleagues, today we are in the
9 presence of representatives from five volunteer
10 fire departments in my district. I'll give you a
11 little brief history here.

12

SPEAKER QUINN: I'm sorry. Guys,
13 can you just step up a little, because the Council
14 Members want to get in the picture too, because
15 everybody loves the volunteer firefighters.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: So as
17 everyone knows, and as the Speaker mentioned,
18 Hurricane Sandy had a devastating impact on my
19 district. You'll recall the footage on the news
20 of homes burning down in Breezy Point, for
21 instance, or the floodwaters rising in Broad
22 Channel, Hamilton Beach and in other parts of
23 Rockaway. We know that it also had a devastating
24 impact on the districts that my colleagues
25 represent in Brooklyn and Staten Island and

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Manhattan as well. We're not trying to take away from that.

In my district, there are five volunteer fire departments. There are three in Breezy Point. You can clap for that.

[Applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: You have the Roxbury Fire Department, you have the Point Breeze Volunteer Fire Department, and you have the Rockaway Point Volunteer Fire Department. In Broad Channel, we have the Broad Channel Fire Department. And in Hamilton Beach, you have the West Hamilton Beach Volunteer Fire Department.

While their homes were either burning down or being flooded out, or their own safety was at risk, these individuals and the volunteers that belong to these fire organizations were extinguishing fires, preventing further damage, performing rescue operations and saving lives. We are eternally grateful for everything that they did, not only during Hurricane Sandy and after Hurricane Sandy, but the service that they provide to the community year round and before Hurricane Sandy. We are extraordinarily grateful

1
2 for everything that they have done. We know that
3 there was no loss of life in my district as a
4 result of the fire and the flood, and that is due
5 in large part to the work of these fine gentlemen
6 here.

7 [Applause]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I'm going
9 to hand it off to the Speaker and then we'll have
10 Chief Wilmarth [phonetic] give a speech.

11 SPEAKER QUINN: Well, first of all,
12 Eric, thank you for organizing this so we could
13 bring in representatives of the volunteer fire
14 departments so we could all really say thank you.
15 I know Eric and I met with some representatives of
16 the different volunteer fire departments before
17 Sandy hit. And when literally the day before the-
18 -you know, the sirens were going off, everybody
19 was going everywhere to say get out, you guys were
20 hunkering down--to stay exactly in the place that
21 we were urging people to leave--to make sure that
22 people go taken care of and that we could minimize
23 damage to property, we could save lives, we could
24 protect people's homes.

25 It's a remarkable job and I know we

1
2 have some of our members of the FDNY with us today
3 and members from the Uniformed Fire Officers
4 Association. It's a remarkable thing to be a
5 firefighter as a profession, but you all are
6 risking your lives as volunteers, you know as a
7 real calling to serve your community in parts of
8 the city, quite frankly, where it's hard at times
9 for the FDNY to get to. It was hard for the FDNY
10 to get everywhere it needed to get during Sandy.
11 We know that, because of all of the call that were
12 out there.

13 So we just really want to thank
14 you. As bad as things got, they would have been a
15 million times worse if it wasn't for all of you
16 and the men and women who work with you every
17 single day. So thank you, more than we could ever
18 say, for what you did on Sandy, since Sandy,
19 before Sandy, and what you've done every day and
20 will do every day in our community. So thank you
21 guys. If the clerk can read the proclamation and
22 then we'll hear from the chief.

23 CLERK: Council City of New York
24 Proclamation. Whereas, the Council of the City of
25 New York is proud to honor the members of the

1
2 Breezy Point volunteer fire departments for their
3 courageous service during and after Hurricane
4 Sandy.

5 And whereas, on October 29, 2012,
6 Superstorm Sandy unleashed many assaults across
7 our city, but its wrath upon Breezy Point was
8 among its most cruel. In addition to leaving
9 2,834 houses waterlogged or listing on sunken
10 foundations, Sandy ignited a monstrous blaze.
11 Fueled by winds at 80-miles-an-hour, it was one of
12 the worst residential fires in New York City's
13 history, devastating 126 homes, damaging 22
14 others, and leaving a conspicuous hole in the
15 heart of a close-knit community, widely known for
16 its high percentage of residents who are
17 firefighters and police officers. Though property
18 was destroyed in all directions, no lives were
19 lost, thanks in large part of members of the
20 Breezy Point volunteer fire departments.

21 And whereas, throughout the year,
22 members of the Breezy Point volunteer fire
23 departments respond not only to all variety of
24 fires but also accidents, downed wires, boats in
25 distress, blackouts and more. As Sandy made

1
2 landfall, however, many of their buildings and
3 vehicles were submerged. When the fire erupted,
4 many watched helplessly as it remained impossible
5 to reach, even as flames engulfed their own homes.
6 Even then, these first responders put the safety
7 of fellow residents above their own.

8 And whereas, members of the Point
9 Breeze Volunteer Fire Department and the Rockaway
10 Point Volunteer Fire Department responded to
11 another fire that night that prevented countless
12 more homes from being destroyed.

13 And whereas, the Roxbury Volunteer
14 Fire Department managed to leave its flooded
15 firehouse by 11 p.m. to get its single truck
16 called "Wild Thing" near the northeastern edge of
17 the fire. With 70 houses ablaze already, they
18 faced the fire head on, with support from the
19 Point Breeze and Rockaway Point volunteers as well
20 as the FDNY. With gas tanks exploding, telephone
21 poles vanishing, sinkholes opening, and no water
22 mains available, the Roxbury team used a suction
23 hose to employ saltwater from the street.

24 Together, the firefighters lugged the heavy hose
25 300 feet through four-foot deep water to reach the

1
2 blaze. Several did not leave the fire until 6
3 a.m. Tuesday morning.

4 And whereas, the West Hamilton
5 Beach Volunteer Fire Department had to improvise
6 to save lives. With their trucks damaged by
7 flooding and the streets submerged, they used a
8 boat that had been donated for Hurricane Irene to
9 rescue as many people as they could. Without any
10 life saving equipment to support their first
11 responder roles, they began distributing supplies,
12 clothing and food.

13 And whereas, the volunteer
14 firefighters and EMTs from the Broad Channel
15 Volunteer Fire Department headed out in the worst
16 of it and managed to rescue more than 30 of their
17 neighbors before the storm overtook them,
18 endangering their lives. Rip currents in the
19 streets grabbed on to one of the volunteers, and
20 they had to save one of their own.

21 And whereas, members of the
22 Rockaway Point Volunteer Fire Department fled
23 their flooded firehouse and trucks on two small
24 motorboats. The water was so deep, they saw cars
25 drifting beneath them, but they gradually plucked

1
2 40 residents from the area and 10 cats and dogs,
3 to take them to their clubhouse, which remained
4 just above the water line.

5 Now, therefore be it known that the
6 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors
7 the volunteer fire departments of Point Breeze,
8 Roxbury, Rockaway Point, Broad Channel and West
9 Hamilton Beach for their outstanding service to
10 the Breezy Point community during and after
11 Hurricane Sandy. Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for
12 the entire Council; Eric Ulrich, Council Member
13 32nd District Queens.

14 [Applause]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Chief
16 Wilmarth?

17 SPEAKER QUINN: Eric, I'm sorry.
18 Can I just say one thing? I was just thinking,
19 when I was listening to that proclamation, if
20 somebody wrote that story of the fire that night
21 and all of this in a movie script and handed it,
22 you know, to Hollywood, they would tell them to
23 rewrite it because it was too much and it would
24 just be unbelievable. But it is the truth of what
25 you guys did that night, and it's just amazing

1
2 every time I heard it retold, everything you did.
3 So thank you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: That is
5 above and beyond the call of duty. They really
6 are our local heroes. And I know that the
7 children of these communities and my constituents
8 look up to these men and women, by the way, there
9 are women involved with the volleys, as their role
10 models because of the example that they set,
11 again, not only in response and during and after
12 to Sandy but also each and every day. We are so
13 proud of that. I am so proud to have the five of
14 them in my district. On behalf of the five
15 departments, Chief Wilmarth is going to speak for
16 just a minute.

17 [Applause]

18 CHIEF ED WILMARTH: Ed Wilmarth,
19 President, New York City Volunteer Firemen
20 Association. On behalf of all of us, we thank
21 Speaker Quinn and Councilman Ulrich for this
22 honor.

23 [Applause]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Roxbury has
25 a gift. Ms. Riley [phonetic].

1
2 MS. RILEY: Well, we'd just like to
3 present these t-shirts to you and to City Council
4 chief Quinn.

5 SPEAKER QUINN: That's great.

6 [Applause]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I also want
8 to thank my colleagues, many of whom are standing
9 up here alongside with me, for everything that
10 they have done to help the people of my district.
11 I see Danny Dromm and Jimmy Van Bramer and Sara,
12 who had her own district to worry about, and Tish
13 James and Inez Dickens and Karen Koslowitz and
14 Julissa and MMV and Leroy Comrie and Peter
15 Vallone, Mike Nelson, Annabel, Peter Koo. They
16 were delivering supplies to these firehouses in
17 West Hamilton Beach and in the Rockaways and in
18 Broad Channel. They were sending bodies down to
19 help with the recovery effort and volunteers.
20 They sent their own staff. They took away
21 resources from their own districts to help the
22 people in my district. For that, I am really
23 appreciative. I think it showed the unity and the
24 strength and the true spirit of what it is to be a
25 New Yorker. I was so proud that day and I'm proud

1
2 today to stand here with all of them. Thank you
3 very much.

4 [Applause]

5 SPEAKER QUINN: Eric, we were
6 before and are still, but during Sandy, incredibly
7 proud of you and your effort too. So thank you
8 very much, Eric. This concludes our ceremonial.

9 [Pause]

10 CLERK: Could I have your attention
11 please? Can I please have your attention at this
12 time? At this time, please place all cell phones
13 and pagers to vibrate. Will all non-Council
14 employees please leave the main floor of the
15 chambers? Thank you.

16 [Pause]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: My
18 colleagues, please rise for the Pledge of
19 Allegiance.

20 [Pledge of Allegiance]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Roll call.

22 CLERK: Arroyo?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.

24 CLERK: Barron?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Here.

1
2 CLERK: Brewer?
3 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here.
4 CLERK: Cabrera?
5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: [No
6 response].
7 CLERK: Chin?
8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.
9 CLERK: Comrie?
10 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: [No
11 response].
12 CLERK: Crowley?
13 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [No
14 response].
15 CLERK: Dickens?
16 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.
17 CLERK: Dilan?
18 COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Here.
19 CLERK: Dromm?
20 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.
21 CLERK: Eugene?
22 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.
23 CLERK: Ferreras?
24 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Here.
25 CLERK: Fidler?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Here.

CLERK: Foster?

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: [No
response].

CLERK: Garodnick?

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [No
response].

CLERK: Gennaro?

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here.

CLERK: Gentile?

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: [No
response].

CLERK: Gonzalez?

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Here.

CLERK: Greenfield?

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.

CLERK: Halloran?

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: [No
response].

CLERK: Ignizio?

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: [No
response].

CLERK: Garodnick?

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

1
2 CLERK: Jackson?
3 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Here.
4 CLERK: James?
5 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Here.
6 CLERK: King?
7 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.
8 CLERK: Koo?
9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.
10 CLERK: Koppell?
11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Here.
12 CLERK: Koslowitz?
13 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.
14 CLERK: Lander?
15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.
16 CLERK: Lappin?
17 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: [No
18 response].
19 CLERK: Levin?
20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [No
21 response].
22 CLERK: Mark-Viverito?
23 COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:
24 Here.
25 CLERK: Mealy?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [No
3 response].
4 CLERK: Mendez?
5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: [No
6 response].
7 CLERK: Nelson?
8 COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Here.
9 CLERK: Palma?
10 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.
11 CLERK: Recchia?
12 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Here.
13 CLERK: Reyna?
14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Here.
15 CLERK: Rodriguez?
16 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [No
17 response].
18 CLERK: Rose?
19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [No
20 response].
21 CLERK: Ulrich?
22 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: [No
23 response].
24 CLERK: Vacca?
25 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

1

2

CLERK: Vallone?

3

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: [No

4

response].

5

CLERK: Van Bramer?

6

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

7

CLERK: Vann?

8

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: [No

9

response].

10

CLERK: Weprin?

11

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Here.

12

CLERK: Williams?

13

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

14

CLERK: Wills?

15

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Here.

16

CLERK: Oddo?

17

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: [No

18

response].

19

CLERK: Rivera?

20

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Here.

21

CLERK: Gentile?

22

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

23

CLERK: Speaker Quinn?

24

SPEAKER QUINN: Here.

25

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: A quorum is

1
2 present. My colleagues, please rise for the
3 Invocation being delivered by Father Rodriguez
4 from Our Lady of Mercy Church.

5 FATHER AMBIORIX RODRIGUEZ: God of
6 grace, peace and justice, thank you for the
7 opportunity to be here and to serve our fellow
8 Americans. Give us wisdom and a spirit of humble
9 service so that we may work in fairness and in
10 truth, treating all persons, no matter how weak or
11 poor, with the reverence your creation deserves.
12 God of compassion, send your blessings upon those
13 who still suffer the consequences of natural
14 disasters in our city, the state and beyond. May
15 they receive the necessary assistance to stand
16 tall on their feet and brighten their future.

17 We pray for victims of violence.
18 Help us all to make our city and all its
19 communities safe haven for every family, every
20 child and every elderly. Despite our differences,
21 may we work together to find solutions to the
22 needs and challenges we face as a city and help us
23 not to be discouraged.

24 On this day, we thank you for the
25 Dominican community that celebrates 169 years of

1
2 their independence. We thank you for their
3 contribution to our city, to art, sports,
4 education, but most of all to their day-to-day
5 hard work. With them, bless every immigrant
6 community that with honesty and hard work makes
7 our city a better place, and may be all contribute
8 to help them fulfill the American dream.

9 Finally, renew us all with the
10 strength of your presence in order to build a city
11 worthy of the people we are called to serve. We
12 all say amen.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
14 very much, Father. At this point in time, I'll be
15 spreading the Invocation in full upon the record.
16 We now move on to our adoption of the minutes.

17 CLERK: None.

18 SPEAKER QUINN: If I could ask my
19 colleagues to rise again please, Mr. Majority
20 Leader. On February 14, 2013, Richard Murphy, 68,
21 the former youth commissioner for Mayor David
22 Dinkins, passed away after a bout with stomach
23 cancer.

24 In the 1960s, as a part time social
25 worker, Richard noticed a problem of truancy and

1
2 obtained funding to start the Rheedlen Foundation
3 to help truants finish school. The foundation
4 later became the Harlem Children's Zone, which now
5 provides after school and educational services to
6 12,000 young people and their families in 97
7 blocks in northern Manhattan, primarily in Harlem,
8 and also has become a national model.

9 After being appointed youth
10 commissioner by Mayor Dinkins, Richard Murphy
11 helped create the Beacon School program, which
12 kept many schools open after hours to provide our
13 youth with sports, tutoring, arts education and
14 other opportunities in a safe environment.

15 After his city service, Richard
16 Murphy worked nonprofit organizations including
17 the Food Bank for New York City. Commissioner
18 Richard Murphy is survived by his son and
19 daughter, two brothers and a grandson. Our
20 thoughts and prayers go out to his entire family
21 and the hundreds and hundreds of thousands who
22 have benefited from his dedication, commitment and
23 the programs he created and helped to create. I'd
24 now like to call on Council Member Gale Brewer to
25 say a few words.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you
3 very much, Speaker Quinn. I have attended two
4 memorial services for Richard Murphy, one at Union
5 Theological, where Murphy--we always called him
6 Murphy or Murph--had an office for his national
7 iMap project. It helped young people figure out
8 how to map. Then we went to one with Reverend
9 Alfonzo Wyatt [phonetic] and Jeff Canada at Harlem
10 Children's Zone.

11 Murphy, as the Speaker indicated,
12 founded the Rheedlen Foundation, hired Jeff and
13 Jeff became the executive director when Murphy
14 became youth commissioner under Mayor Dinkins, and
15 the rest is history. Jeff changed the name to the
16 Harlem Children's Zone and it does great things.

17 Jeff once asked Murphy, "why do you
18 call our organization the Rheedlen Foundation and
19 not Rheedlen Program for Youth?" Murphy answered,
20 and this was typical, "Because if people think you
21 have money when you're a foundation, they will
22 meet with you and then they'll give you money for
23 young people." That was typical.

24 I met Murphy when he was a director
25 at Rheedlen and Jeff was a karate teacher for one

1
2 of my kids. Like most creative people, Murphy
3 always looked at the world or the problem to be
4 solved as an inspiration to think about or do
5 something about in unconventional ways. This was
6 key to his tireless innovation on behalf of young
7 people in need. That's how he started the
8 Beacons. And he was kind of artist, I think, in
9 the way he went about revealing to the rest of us
10 a vision or blueprint for healing the world or
11 even just one life, in ways the rest of us hadn't
12 gotten around to.

13 I never ever knew anyone or will
14 know anyone as effective as Richard, who was more
15 self-effacing. There's only one picture of him on
16 the net. Or who deflected praise more deftly. It
17 was just about impossible to get him to take
18 credit or acknowledge what huge positive impact he
19 was having on the lives of others. But he knew,
20 of course, and you could tell from the glimmer in
21 his eye when he knew his schemes were working and
22 he was enjoying every minute.

23 It's in keeping with his character
24 that the thousands of acts of kindness he engaged
25 in had no public face. They stayed strictly

1
2 between him and whomever he was thinking of. One
3 of his great charms was his unexpectedness and
4 mystery of receiving, out of the blue, some
5 missive or gift. And who among us doesn't marvel
6 at how he quietly kept track of everyone's life
7 and somehow knew just what to say, or what to
8 give, or how to make us laugh, when reminding us
9 that he was out there and he was watching and that
10 the course of our lives never ceased to matter to
11 him?

12 There was always smiley in his eyes
13 and he had the knack of being completely engaged
14 with you in that moment. While at the same time,
15 you could see that part of him was watching and
16 thinking from very far away about who knew what.
17 He was tough and at the same time resigned to the
18 harshness of the world and eternally optimistic, a
19 tireless believer in the redemptive and in his
20 capacity to move mountains and bend the light of
21 the world toward justice.

22 As I said before, hundreds and
23 hundreds of people, including hundreds of many
24 young men of color, whom he helped, supported and
25 loved, and are now successful. Sean Dove

1 [phonetic] is an example. Came to the services.
2 I lived next door to him for years in Manhattan
3 Valley and know his greatest accomplishment was
4 raising two young people, a bother and a sister--
5 now mentioned as his son and daughter--who had no
6 other person to turn to and are both doing well
7 today because of him.

8
9 He also founded Food and Finance
10 High School, which Jessica Mates was here today--
11 is one of the directors of--and with the Speaker's
12 permission and the community, we would love to
13 suggest naming it after him.

14 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Gale. I
15 also want to note on another sad note that on
16 February 24, 2013, Muriel Billups-Carrington, 84,
17 the mother of Council Member Debi Rose, passed
18 away after a long illness. I think we all
19 remember Debi's father died fairly recently as
20 well, which makes this loss even worse. He died
21 just two months ago, actually.

22 Muriel Carrington was born in
23 Brooklyn, graduated Curtis High School, attended
24 classes at the College of Staten Island and lived
25 in St. George on Staten Island. She retired after

1
2 20 years as a claim representative for Allstate
3 and was a proud foster parent to a number of
4 children. She was especially proud to have been
5 honored by the Children Aid Society for her foster
6 parenting. A member of the Lambda Kappa Mu
7 Sorority. Ms. Carrington was an active member of
8 her community.

9 She is survived by her daughter
10 Debi and her son Wayne. Her funeral is this
11 Friday at St. Phillips Baptist Church in Staten
12 Island. Our thoughts and prayers go out to Debi
13 and to her entire family.

14 [Pause]

15 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Mr.
16 Majority Leader. Just on a happier note, I want
17 to recognize some honored guests we have with us
18 today. I think everybody knows Alix Pustilnik,
19 our Deputy Legislative Director. What you may not
20 know is every piece of legislation or resolution
21 we're passing today was overseen by Alix
22 Pustilnik. Alix's mom and dad and husband are
23 with us today to mark what we're calling Alix
24 Pustilnik Day at the New York City Council. So
25 welcome and thank you all for being with us. They

1
2 were with us at the Pre-Stated Press Conference as
3 well, where I just couldn't answer all the
4 questions and Alix had to come to the mike. It
5 happens sometimes. Thank you, Mr. Majority
6 Leader.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you,
8 Madame Speaker. We now move on to messages and
9 papers from the Mayor.

10 CLERK: M1045, submitting the name
11 of Anthony Crowell appointment--

12 SPEAKER QUINN: [interposing]
13 Rules, Privileges and Elections. Sorry.

14 CLERK: M1046, submitting
15 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report, Fiscal Year
16 2013.

17 SPEAKER QUINN: Received, ordered,
18 printed and filed.

19 CLERK: M1047, Mayor's veto and
20 disapproval message of Introductory 814-A.

21 SPEAKER QUINN: Civil Rights.

22 CLERK: M1048, Mayor's veto and
23 disapproval message of Introductory 978-A.

24 SPEAKER QUINN: Government
25 Operations.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA:

Communications from City, County and Borough
Offices.

CLERK: M1049, New York City

Districting Commission, election of members of New
York City Council.

SPEAKER QUINN: Received, ordered,

printed and filed.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Petitions

and communications.

CLERK: None.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Land Use

call-ups.

CLERK: M1050 through M1055,

sidewalk cafes.

SPEAKER QUINN: I'd like to couple

all of those Land Use Call-ups and please have a
roll call on the Land Use Call-ups.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.

CLERK: Arroyo?

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

CLERK: Barron?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

CLERK: Brewer?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.

CLERK: Cabrera?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: [No
response].

CLERK: Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

CLERK: Comrie?

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Aye.

CLERK: Crowley?

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [No
response].

CLERK: Dickens?

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.

CLERK: Dilan?

COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: [No
response].

CLERK: Dromm?

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

CLERK: Eugene?

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

CLERK: Ferreras?

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Aye.

CLERK: Fidler?

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Yes.

1

2

CLERK: Foster?

3

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: [No

4

response].

5

CLERK: Garodnick?

6

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

7

CLERK: Gennaro?

8

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: [No

9

response].

10

CLERK: Gentile?

11

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.

12

CLERK: Gonzalez?

13

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: [No

14

response].

15

CLERK: Greenfield?

16

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.

17

CLERK: Halloran?

18

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Here.

19

CLERK: Ignizio?

20

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Here.

21

CLERK: Jackson?

22

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Yes.

23

CLERK: James?

24

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: May I be

25

excused to vote on all General Order Calendars,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Land Use items and the resolutions?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: I vote aye
on all. Thank you.

CLERK: King?

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye.

CLERK: Koo?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yes.

CLERK: Koppell?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: I vote aye
and I would like unanimous consent to vote aye on
all matters on the General Orders Calendar and all
resolutions.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: I vote
aye.

CLERK: Gonzalez?

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Sorry. I
vote aye on all call-ups. With permission, I'd
like to vote yes on all coupled general orders and
resolutions. Not often do it do this. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.

CLERK: Koslowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Lander?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

CLERK: Lappin?

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: [No
response].

CLERK: Levin?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.

CLERK: Mark-Viverito?

COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye.

CLERK: Mealy?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [No
response].

CLERK: Mendez?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

CLERK: Nelson?

COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Aye and I
request unanimous consent to vote aye on all item
on the General Order Calendar.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.

CLERK: Palma?

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

CLERK: Recchia?

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Aye.

CLERK: Dilan?

1

COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Aye.

2

3

CLERK: Reyna?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Aye.

5

CLERK: Rodriguez?

6

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [No

7

response].

8

CLERK: Ulrich?

9

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye.

10

CLERK: Vacca?

11

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

12

CLERK: Vallone?

13

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I vote aye

14

on the land use and ask unanimous consent to vote

15

on the General Order Calendar only. Thank you.

16

In which I vote no on 982-A and 989-A and I on the

17

rest. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

18

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Okay.

19

CLERK: Van Bramer?

20

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

21

CLERK: Vann?

22

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Aye.

23

CLERK: Weprin?

24

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye.

25

CLERK: Williams?

1

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

2

3

CLERK: Wills?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye.

5

CLERK: Oddo?

6

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Yes.

7

CLERK: Rivera?

8

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye.

9

CLERK: Speaker Quinn?

10

SPEAKER QUINN: Aye.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Today's

12

Land Use Call-ups were adopted by a vote of 42 in

13

the affirmative with zero in the negative. We now

14

move on to communication from the Speaker.

15

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. We are

16

voting on a package of legislation coming out of

17

the Consumer Affairs Committee. I want to thank

18

Rachel Cordero, Alix Pustilnik, Damien Butvick and

19

everyone else who worked on this package of

20

legislation. I want to thank Dan Garodnick, who

21

is sponsor of three of the bills and whose

22

committee this package went through. I also want

23

to thank Council Member Melissa Mark-Viverito and

24

Council Member Gale Brewer and Council Member

25

Steve Levin, who are also sponsors of these pieces

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

of legislation.

In total, these bills seek to address issues relating to street vendors. First, they seek to deal with the real issue out there, that street vendors are getting excessively high fines for violations that do not warrant that level of financial penalty.

Two, the package seeks to clarify what the rules and regulations are around street vending to make it easier for vendors to follow them and also to make it easier for pedestrians to go about their business on the sidewalks of the streets of New York.

Three, the package of legislation seeks to deal with a persistent problem in the City of New York which is that we are not collecting the fines that we are levying against street vendors. This piece of legislation, by reducing the maximum fine on all violations that are not Health Code related and do not include vending without a license, from \$1,000 to \$500 will make sure that the size of the violation is in correspondence to the nature of the infraction and that we are not finding vendors out of

1

2 business. They are an important part of our small
3 business infrastructure in this city.

4 Two, it's going to clarify to some
5 degree where vendors can and can't be and expand
6 some areas they can't be to help out in particular
7 hospitals and health care institutions. And
8 through Council Member Garodnick's legislation,
9 make sure we now require that we note the permit
10 number of a vendor's cart when we are noting a
11 violation so we can follow-up with the permit
12 holder, not just the vendor license holder, to
13 actually collect money. I want to thank Council
14 Member Garodnick, because I believe this is going
15 to have a very positive effect on our budget.

16 I also want to thank the advocacy
17 community through the Vendors Rights Project and
18 others who have been active and well organized and
19 respectful and forceful in their process of
20 advocating for this package of legislation, which
21 I am very proud to pass today. So let me first
22 call on Chair Garodnick, who is sponsor of a
23 number of the bills then offer Council Member
24 Levin, Council Member Brewer and Council Member
25 Mark-Viverito an opportunity to speak if they

1

2 would like.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very much, Speaker Quinn, for bringing this package of vendor bills to a vote today. I want to thank and congratulate Council Members Levin, Mark-Viverito and Brewer, who were the authors of three of the bills that we're going to be voting on today. I authored, as you heard, three additional bills which when taken together are designed to improve the way we regulate food and general vendors.

Street vending has a long history in New York City. As early as the 1800s, many immigrants began the road to a new life in this country by making a living as a street vendor. Although Silicon Valley has made the idea of a startup culture popular, we shouldn't forget that long before tech companies existed, street vendors, which have a relatively low cost of entering business, were the original startups.

Yet despite this long history, many ambiguities in vending laws remain, frustrating vendors and the public alike. Those laws, which we do have currently are frequently ignored or

1
2 misunderstood. So, as chair of the Consumer
3 Affairs Committee and a Council Member who
4 represents many popular streets for vending I have
5 heard these frustrations, and believe this package
6 of legislation will help address concerns on both
7 sides.

8 Vendors were frustrated that they
9 were getting large fines for what they argue were
10 minor infractions, like wearing a coat over their
11 badge on a cold day. My constituents and many of
12 our constituents were frustrated that vendors were
13 blocking access to their buildings by vending too
14 close to business entrances or to hospitals by
15 vending in no-standing zones abutting them or even
16 in taxi zones.

17 People who are concerned about the
18 city budget should be concerned that the fines in
19 many cases went unpaid because permit holders were
20 not on the hook. That's why this package of bills
21 is so important.

22 Vending locations and regulations
23 are clarified and vending fines will be more
24 proportionate to their violation. Permit holders
25 will be responsible for fines that are issues to

1
2 licensees working on their behalf. So I encourage
3 my colleagues to vote aye on all of these bills,
4 which I believe will make the rules and fairer all
5 around. Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you
7 very much, Speaker Quinn and Chairman Garodnick
8 for your support of Intro 434-A and for your
9 diligent, diligent work on this issue.

10 Street vendors in New York City
11 currently face exorbitant fines for minor offenses
12 like setting up a table inches too far from a curb
13 or too close to the entrance of a building, or as
14 Chairman Garodnick mentioned, wearing their
15 license underneath an overcoat. Fines of up to
16 \$1,000 for this type of offense are in effect
17 punitive and prohibitive. Most vendors barely
18 earn enough money to make a living and these
19 excessive fines can easily put them out of
20 business.

21 As evidenced most recently in a
22 University of Wisconsin study, vendors are
23 actually more likely to be able to pay their fines
24 when they are not prohibitively expensive.
25 Reducing the maximum fine from \$1,000 to \$500 and

1
2 restructuring the penalty schedule so that the
3 fines do not escalate for unrelated offenses is a
4 common sense measure that will support small
5 business owners in New York City. I want to thank
6 the Speaker. I want to thank her legislative
7 staff, in particular Rob Newman, who did amazing
8 work on this, Alix Pustilnik, Laura Popa, Margaret
9 Nelson, Damien Butvick, Rachel Cordero, Council
10 Member Mark-Viverito and everyone at the Street
11 Vendor Project, especially the vendors who serve
12 as board members. That's Guadalupe Galicia,
13 Gyatso Lama, Mohammed Omar, James Williams, Lei
14 Bai, Mohammed Atlaf Hussain, Soledad Pabon, Hakim
15 Abduraheem, Maria Leone, Derek Wilmot, Helodora
16 Vivar-Flores, and all the staff members,
17 especially Sean Bsinski, Matthew Shapiro and Lee
18 Wellington who worked so hard on this legislation.
19 Thank you very much.

20 [Applause]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you
22 very much. I'm Gale Brewer and I, too, want to
23 thank Speaker Quinn and Consumer Affairs Chair Dan
24 Garodnick for their assistance in bringing 684 to
25 a vote today.

1
2 In current city law, general
3 vendors, these vendors selling merchandise or art
4 are banned from vending within taxi stands, the
5 general vendors. However, food vendors are
6 allowed. It doesn't make sense to prevent one
7 type of vendor from operating within a taxi stand
8 and not another. So Intro 684 would correct this
9 discrepancy and not allow vendors from operating
10 in taxi stands. It would ban even the food
11 vendors, keeping taxi stands free to allow people
12 access to transportation. I am very supportive of
13 vendors. They are a very important part of our
14 city's small business landscape, as we've heard,
15 but we need common sense regulations.

16 I am a co-sponsor of the great bill
17 sponsored today by Council Member Levin, Intro
18 634-A, which reduces the maximum fines for vending
19 violations.

20 I believe this package put together
21 by the Speaker's Office and Council Member
22 Garodnick, which we're passing today, strikes the
23 appropriate balance of common sense regulation
24 with a reduction in exorbitant fees.

25 Congratulations to Urban Justice Street Vendor

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Project. Thank you.

[Applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: As has been indicated earlier, vending has been an essential part of the fabric of New York City life for generations. Instead of supporting these hard working entrepreneurs, however, the city has too often resorted to overly aggressive enforcement. Under the current fine structure, the punitive fines leveraged against vendors can easily mount into the thousands, making it difficult for vendors to make a living. Hard work is not something we should be criminalizing in New York City.

I'm proud that the Council is acting on this important legislation today, sponsored by Council Member Steve Levin, which will cap the maximum fines at \$500 and reform the unfair escalation of fines. These measures should help alleviate some of the heavy burden of fines and will hopefully serve as a critical first step towards efforts to provide greater support to our vendor community.

I want to thank Speaker Quinn and

1
2 Council Member Levin for pushing this bill
3 forward. Particularly, I want to thank the Street
4 Vendor Project for the incredible effort that has
5 gone into hard fought and very effective advocacy
6 campaign.

7 I'm also happy that the Council
8 will be voting on my bill, Intro 16-A, which will
9 require the reporting of data related to vendor
10 licenses and permits, as well as the outcomes of
11 vendor adjudications. It is only with information
12 like this that we can continue looking at ways to
13 make additional reforms to vendor policy in the
14 City of New York.

15 So, again, congratulations to all
16 the sponsors and thank you, Speaker Quinn.

17 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very
18 much.

19 [Applause]

20 SPEAKER QUINN: We're also voting
21 on two pieces of legislation coming out of our
22 Immigration Affairs Committee, Intro 982-A and
23 989-A, that are sponsored by myself, by Council
24 Member Dromm and Council Member Melissa Mark-
25 Viverito. I want to thank Chair Dromm for his

1
2 work and committee on this. I want to thank
3 Julene Beckford, Jennifer Montalvo, Alix Pustilnik
4 and Rob Newman for their work on these pieces of
5 legislation.

6 These bills build on the work we
7 did about a year or so ago around ICE's
8 involvement at Rikers. I think folks will
9 remember that prior to the Council's legislation,
10 every non-American born person who ended up at
11 Rikers was flagged for Federal Immigration
12 Service, for them to check their status of their
13 immigration situation.

14 Remember, when you're at Rikers,
15 whether you're a citizen or not, you are charged
16 with a crime, you're not convicted. In the United
17 States, you're innocent until proven guilty. So
18 through that piece of legislation, we limited the
19 number of folks being detained at Rikers who could
20 be flagged for ICE by the Department of
21 Corrections.

22 Today, we will take further action
23 to limit the involvement and interaction of the
24 Department of Corrections with Federal Immigration
25 Services. And we will also, in the context of so-

1
2 called secure communities, which over the
3 objections of Governor Cuomo now is being enforced
4 in the city and state of New York, we will put in
5 place limitations around the Police Department of
6 what fingerprints they will forward to ICE.

7 Now, there are exemptions in this
8 bill to make sure those who have past criminal
9 records will have detainers given. Those who are
10 charged with felonies will have detainers given.
11 Those who are charged in particular misdemeanors
12 will still be flagged for detainers.

13 We believe this bill, bills that we
14 will pass today, following on what we've done,
15 actually fit the true definition of the criminal
16 alien program. Before our actions, what we had
17 was not a criminal alien program but a dragnet
18 against all immigrants in the City of New York.
19 This is a balance that fits clearly with the
20 perspective of President Obama, which we have
21 recently heard him rearticulate and is critical,
22 given--although we hope the federal government
23 finally fixes the immigration system, there is, of
24 course, no guarantee of that.

25 I just want my colleagues to know

1
2 that in just the six months that the first piece
3 of legislation that was passed went into law, over
4 250, I believe it's 267 individuals, have had
5 deportations prevented, individuals who pose no
6 public safety risk to the City of New York. We
7 now have a criminal alien program, after we passed
8 these laws, not a dragnet against criminals.

9 Let me first call on the chair,
10 Council Member Dromm and then the sponsor of the
11 other piece of legislation, Council Member Melissa
12 Mark-Viverito. If we could get a little quiet in
13 the chambers for the Council Members. Thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you,
15 Speaker Quinn. Through your leadership and the
16 vision of Melissa Mark-Viverito, we are able to
17 move yet another step closer to providing justice
18 for our immigrant communities and their families.
19 This law will build upon Local Law 62 of 2011 by
20 further limiting the use of valuable city
21 resources toward facilitating federal immigration
22 enforcement.

23 It will prevent many of the tragic
24 situations that devastated families that were
25 brought to my attention when one of their members

1
2 is swept up in the criminal justice system and yet
3 is not convicted or has only a minor conviction.
4 But our city's large immigrant communities are not
5 the only ones to benefit. This law will make the
6 city safer for all of us by increasing cooperation
7 between police and immigrants. Gaining and
8 maintaining the trust of these communities is
9 critical to keeping these truly dangerous
10 criminals off of our street.

11 Finally, I want to acknowledge all
12 of the advocates whose input was so important, as
13 well as Alix Pustilnik, counsel Julene Beckford
14 and policy analyst Jennifer Montalvo. Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:

16 Today marks another proud day for the City
17 Council, as we reaffirm our commitment to
18 supporting and embracing our city's vibrant
19 immigrant communities. The pieces of legislation
20 before us today will expand upon the work we did
21 to limit the reach of federal immigration
22 enforcement in our city jails in 2011.

23 With the forced rollout of the so-
24 called Secure Communities Program, over the
25 objection of so many of us, including our

1
2 governor, immigrants can now be funneled into our
3 deportation system directly from Central Booking.
4 Under SCOM, the fingerprints of arrestees that are
5 ordinarily shared with the FBI will now also be
6 transferred to ICE, which can ask the NYPD to hold
7 individuals for deportation.

8 The two bills that Speaker Quinn,
9 Chair Dromm and I have sponsored expand upon the
10 landmark protections we previously put in place
11 for immigrants in our city jails, so the Police
12 Department, which would no longer be able to hold
13 immigrants on a detainer if they meet certain
14 specific criteria outlined in the legislation.

15 They also broaden the protection of
16 immigrants under both NYPD and Department of
17 Corrections custody to ensure that immigrant youth
18 and immigrants with minor or very old misdemeanors
19 as well as misdemeanors related to their
20 immigration status are covered under the bill.

21 These pieces of legislation do not
22 tell the federal government what to do. We are
23 still in the Secure Communities Program, as much
24 as we might not like to be in what. But we are
25 clear that we will not use our personnel or

1
2 resources to hold immigrants that pose no danger
3 to our city.

4 These bills actually align our
5 city's policy on immigration detainers with what
6 President Obama has stated publicly regarding the
7 need to exercise prosecutorial discretion and not
8 deport low-level offenders and people with strong
9 ties to the United States. Unfortunately,
10 prosecutorial discretion has been widely regarded
11 as a failed policy, but we in the City of New York
12 are committed to protecting our immigrant
13 communities that do so much to contribute to the
14 life of our city. We will codify this rhetoric
15 into action with the two bills before us.

16 I believe strongly that we will
17 have a comprehensive immigration reform this bill,
18 it has to happen. The momentum continues to grow
19 and our President is clearer than ever on the need
20 for this legislation to pass. But in the
21 meantime, we must continue to take steps to
22 protect our city's immigrant community.

23 So again, I want to thank Speaker
24 Quinn and Chair Dromm, once again, as well as the
25 Bloomberg administration, for continuing to

1
2 support measures like this and also be a voice for
3 immigrant reform nationally. I would especially
4 like to thank Make the Road New York, the Cardozo
5 Law School, who continue to provide such immense
6 support and leadership in helping us formulate
7 these important pieces of legislation, as well as
8 the legislative staff has been mentioned: Rob
9 Newman, Alix Pustilnik, Julene Beckford and
10 Jennifer Montalvo. It is truly, truly a proud day
11 for New York City today. Thank you.

12 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Melissa.
13 I just want to echo Melissa's thanks to the
14 Cardozo Law School and their civil rights center,
15 to Make the Road, to the other advocates who have
16 been part of this effort. And in particular,
17 overall to the Bloomberg administration but in
18 particular to the Criminal Justice Coordinator
19 John Feinblatt, who worked hand in glove with our
20 staff to make sure that we found a way to do the
21 first piece of legislation and the additional two
22 today.

23 I also want to thank Land Use Chair
24 Leroy Comrie, Amy Levitan and Gail Benjamin and
25 Danielle Decerbo for their work on the Land Use

1
2 items; Tanisha Edwards and Scott Crowley for their
3 work on today's transparency resolution, and Chair
4 Recchia. I also want to thank Chuck Davis and
5 Yasmin Vega and Chair Rivera for the appointment
6 of Joseph Puma to be the Manhattan representative,
7 and thank the Manhattan delegation to the Civil
8 Complaint Review Board.

9 That concludes communications from
10 the Speaker on today's legislation.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
12 very much, Madame Speaker. We'll now move on to
13 discussion of general orders. Council Member
14 Jackson?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you.
16 My colleagues, I rise this afternoon to
17 congratulate--

18 SPEAKER QUINN: [interposing] Could
19 we get a little quiet for Council Member Jackson?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: --to
21 congratulate all of my colleagues involved in
22 moving forward the legislation concerning the
23 whole issue of the immigration issue with those
24 individuals that were arrested. As the Speaker
25 said, and Melissa Mark-Viverito indicated, so far

1
2 over 267 individuals have been positively impacted
3 and not deported to their country of origin.
4 That's a good thing in keeping families together.
5 So, thank you, on behalf of all of those
6 individuals and many, many more that will
7 positively be impacted.

8 Also, I was given these a long time
9 ago. These here are stickers that the vendors
10 were saying that no to \$1,000 fine. So now that
11 this piece of legislation is going to be passed by
12 the City Council, let me just say I'll take this
13 \$1,000 one and I'll rip it up because it's no
14 longer in effect.

15 [Applause]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: I've kept
17 these in my drawer for a long time and I will keep
18 this one for memento purposes, understanding
19 though that this is what you were up against. I
20 tell you as individuals that are struggling to
21 feed your family, \$1,000 fine was absolutely
22 absurd and ridiculous, and I'm glad that we're
23 passing legislation to reduce the maximum fine and
24 the graduation stage to \$500. Congratulations to
25 all of the vendors. Congratulations to all of the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

sponsors and the Speaker for all of us in moving forward this. Congratulations to all of us.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you very much, Council Member Jackson. We now move on to Council Member Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Thank you. This Saturday, I will join the Workers Justice Project on Bay Parkway as they reopen the Immigration Job Center, which was rebuilt after Hurricane Sandy. Thirteen years ago, I initiated the establishment of that very job center for day workers in my district, and it's become a model for day labor or work recruitment centers citywide.

So today, I speak as one with a history of working with immigrant workers. Yet overlaid with this history of fighting for the immigrant worker is also a sense of fairness for all. In this case, the food vendor bills that are before us. I see the one as unfair is Intro 434-A. By limiting fines only for food vendors and not for brick and mortar stores, the independent retail stores and mom and pop businesses, many of which were started and run by immigrants, we are

1
2 not being fair to those business people who try to
3 make ends meet each and every day.

4 We must all hear what they're going
5 through with city agencies trying to finagle a way
6 to wring them dry with fines and fees. They are
7 not happy and they are struggling. We need to
8 level the playing field. But today, instead, we
9 are tilting the scales. What sort of message are
10 sending to the mom and pop shops that are the
11 lifeblood of our communities, if we are lowering
12 the fines for the street vendors but not for them?

13 Recently, a small business owner in
14 my district was fined \$1,000 a day after her \$30
15 pet grooming license inadvertently expired. A \$30
16 license, a \$1,000 fine. Does that seem fair to
17 you? I bet she would love to have her fines
18 reduced overall, as would every small business
19 owner. We need to come to the aid of small
20 businesses before they collapse. We need to lower
21 fines for the brick and mortar business owner,
22 already paying a premium to rent a storefront on a
23 main commercial strip, while paying business and
24 property taxes, water bills and private
25 sanitation.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Council

3

Member?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Okay. And

5

deal every day with the city's appetite for

6

revenue. It's a glaring double standard that

7

needs to be addressed. This bill is too narrow

8

and cannot address it--

9

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA:

10

[interposing] Council Member?

11

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: --and I

12

cannot support its unfairness.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you

14

very much. We now move on to Council Member

15

Ignizio.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes, thank

17

you. I rise to somewhat dovetail on what my

18

colleague, Council Member Gentile, spoke of, and

19

that is the almost preying, if you will, by the

20

administration on small business owners in the

21

city. I'm happy that we're passing this bill. I

22

think it's a good thing. I think this might set

23

the tone going forward that we have to view our

24

businesses as just that, the lifeblood of our

25

community, putting money back into our economy,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

back into the city.

We need to go a step beyond. The Department of Health is viewing our restaurants, our vendors as a cash cow for the rest of the city, and it has to stop. If the issue or the concern is about overall revenue to operate their agency, then we can have that discussion. When my restaurant owners, vendors here behind me, and everyone else sees somebody with the Department of Health, for them to fear their government, fear the people who are coming in because they're going to wipe out everything they made for that week or that month is just fundamentally unjust.

So my hope is that we take a different posture here in this Council and with the future administration, because I really don't have any faith that this administration will change its current policies. That is that if you want to do business in this city, we welcome you. If you have critical violations that affect public health, then you will pay. But these minor violations that we're all hearing about, that we all have heard from our business owners, they should be met with a warning letter. They should

2 be met with education. They should be met with a
3 reprimand but not a \$1,500 fine, \$1,000 fine.

4 I think sometimes the Department of
5 Health and the inspectors therein come out and
6 they give out these things like they're giving out
7 candy and they don't appreciate how many hotdogs
8 you have to sell to make \$1,000, how many gyros
9 you have to sell to make \$1,000. If we're going
10 to take the posture in this business--in this
11 city, excuse me--that business is welcome and we
12 want to encourage it, with all these different
13 business proposals--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA:

15 [interposing] Council Member?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: --then we
17 have to ensure that we're not going to put them
18 out of business by the fines that this agency
19 levies. Thank you very much.

20 [Applause]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
22 very much. Thank you very much. We're going to
23 ask that everybody please refrain from applauding
24 too much because we have to run a meeting. We
25 have Council Member Koo is next.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: My dear
3 colleagues, I also support this street vending
4 bill, but like my two previous colleagues have
5 said, we also have to pay attention to our
6 licensed small business owners. They pay license
7 fees. They pay taxes. They pay rent. They pay
8 real estate tax. But meanwhile, we have these
9 different agencies coming in to do to so-called
10 inspections and fine them on a lot of just little
11 things, like they forgot to put a sign up or the
12 sign said wash your hands in bathroom is missing.
13 They can fine you a lot of money for that. Those
14 things are not fair to the small business people.

15 So I ask my colleagues in this City
16 Council, we have to take care of our regular
17 business people too. So we have to find some way
18 to lower the fines or make sure the Department of
19 Health doesn't do too many inspections. Before,
20 restaurant owners told me, they only do one or two
21 inspections a year. Now, they go every two weeks
22 or three weeks. Some owners told me they are not
23 even afraid of them. They don't care when they
24 come in because they see them too many times, you
25 know.

1
2 So this is something we have to
3 look into. So I want to ask every one of you and
4 I'm going to ask the Speaker maybe if we can do
5 something on this in the very near future.
6 Otherwise, all the small business is going to be
7 disappear. So I ask all my colleagues, please
8 consider similar legislation on helping our small
9 business owners. Thank you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
11 very much. We now move on to Council Member Oddo.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: I wasn't
13 going to speak on this but I'm sort of inspired by
14 the comments from Council Members Gentile and
15 Ignizio.

16 I just want to say that a couple of
17 weeks ago, DEP came out into the Westerly section
18 of my council district, where the homeowners were
19 having sewer backups. We traced the problem back
20 to grease in the line. To DEP's credit, they went
21 out and went to 23 commercial establishments in
22 the commercial area of Westerly and instead of
23 handing out summonses, did an education program
24 and worked with those businesses, so that we
25 resolved the problem for the homeowners without

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

leading with summonses.

The policy changes when the executive changes. You heard within the last seven days, the Mayor say yet again that fines are a replacement for taxes. Be grateful that we're issuing fines and not increasing the taxes. That is a really strange perspective of what the inspection policy in this city is about. Despite the best efforts of this Council, who have worked to try to change that view, they see it not in terms of we want to assure that establishments are clean for all of our constituents. They see this in terms of dollars and cents.

The Mayor said matter-of-factly within the last week or so that be grateful that we're handing out fines because if we didn't we'd be raising taxes. This is about revenue, not about what the inspection system fundamentally was supposed to be about.

So while I applaud this legislation, I acknowledge the frustration of Council Members Ignizio and Gentile. But overall, across the board in this city, you're going to have ten more months of this and whomever is the

1

2 next mayor is going to have to change that
3 fundamental understanding and perspective of what
4 inspections are supposed to be about.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
6 very much. We now have Council Member Vacca.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I very much
8 wanted to echo the remarks of my colleague,
9 Council Member Ignizio. I'm going to vote for
10 these bills, but let me tell you something, the
11 small business communities in this city are being
12 hit and they're being hit hard and it's day and
13 night.

14 You have inspectors walking in at 9
15 and 9:30 at night, and with 30 or 40 or 50 people
16 having dinner, places are being closed down.
17 People who struggle every day to pay rent, people
18 who work day and night for their customers, who
19 want to make a living in this city are absolutely
20 having their backs against the wall. If we don't
21 understand this, if we don't hear what's going on
22 in this city, well then no one's listening.

23 I'm concerned. This can be
24 addressed now, by the way, but I do think it's
25 going to have to wait for the next administration

1
2 because all the meetings we've have, every
3 incident we've pointed out, no one has taken any
4 action. Of course this is all about raising
5 revenue, it's the same thing with the traffic
6 tickets and the parking violations and everything
7 else. I'm not for any taxes, but I'm going to
8 tell you something, I'd rather have a tax upfront
9 than have a hidden tax. These are hidden taxes
10 that people can be told that there's no tax
11 increase? Come on, we're not stupid. This is a
12 tax increase that's not transparent, but it's
13 going to come to haunt this city.

14 Trust me. Because people are
15 leaving the city and storefronts will be vacant
16 and prices that are going to have to be charged to
17 people are going to go up because those who rent
18 space in this city who try to have a small
19 business are being hit to extinction each and
20 every day in this city. So I'll vote yes but I
21 wanted to give an explanation of what's going on.
22 We've met with people time and time again hoping
23 somebody will listen. To date, no. But by the
24 way, it's not over. It's not over.

25 This happened this weekend where

1

2 somebody is texting me at 9:30 at night saying
3 that the inspectors were there. Some of these
4 inspectors don't know what they're doing. They
5 don't know. I don't know where they came from.
6 Maybe they're from DOE and there are people like
7 at DOE who are here from Ohio yesterday. This is
8 the feeling we get. Thank you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
10 very much. Council Member Koslowitz?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank
12 you. I must add my voice to my colleagues. I
13 can't walk into a store in my neighborhood without
14 them jumping at me and showing me the fines they
15 are getting. This is out of hand.

16 I did a press conference in my
17 district a couple of weeks ago, and the
18 commissioner came back with a very nasty reply. I
19 don't care. I will fight this until my dying day.
20 Enough is enough. He can't put my businesses out
21 of business with the fines.

22 The florists got a ticket for \$500.
23 He's a one-man shop and his date to appear in
24 court was Valentine's Day. If he didn't go, he
25 had to pay the fine. This is enough. Someone in

1

2 my district went to pay the fine and they were
3 told they shouldn't go see the judge because if
4 they saw the judge, they would have to pay the
5 full fine. Otherwise, if they give the 250, they
6 could leave and that would be that. That's not
7 fair. Enough is enough.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
9 very much. We now move on to Council Member
10 Barron?

11

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: It's good
12 to see that my colleagues are getting militant up
13 in here.

14

[Laughter]

15

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I get to
16 see this. Thank you for the company. It's been
17 lonely. I do want to say I absolutely agree with
18 you. We have a restaurant in Brooklyn called Bush
19 Baby. Bush Baby restaurant is impeccably clean,
20 delicious food and they're being harassed as we
21 speak, on tedious little things, and these are big
22 fines. So I couldn't agree with you more.

23

I also want to say that on this day
24 I want to honor Phil Reed [phonetic]. Phil Reed
25 worked very, very hard. When I first came in the

1
2 Council, he was chair of the Consumer Affairs
3 Committee. He's passed on now. But I know Phil
4 is looking down on this day to see that some of the
5 legislation that he worked very hard on with the
6 vendors over the years, to see passed. I'm
7 certain Phil would also like to see, along with
8 Council Member Comrie and I, the cap raised. We
9 have to have the cap raised so we can have more
10 vendors. There are not enough vendors that have
11 the opportunity to vend in this city.

12 [Applause]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Now that
14 we're prohibiting them from vending in places that
15 might cause congestion, and I know there's some
16 differences on those bills, now that all of that's
17 in place, and I think the fines should be reduced
18 to \$100 next piece of legislation, instead of
19 \$500. But anyway, we'll take the five now. We
20 need the cap raised, because too many people who
21 have decided to make income for themselves in a
22 very creative way are now not able to do that
23 because they can't get a license to vend. So
24 let's pass that one next. Raise the cap.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

very much, Council Member.

[Applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Finally, we have Council Member Ulrich.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you, Mr. Majority Leaders. My colleagues, I join the chorus of support for the small business community in this city. I too have a horror story. Karen Koslowitz had one about Valentine's Day and a florist. I have a barber around the corner from my district office that received a \$250 fine from the Department of Consumer Affairs because he didn't have a sign on the wall that said "all sales are final." Now I don't know about you, but after you get a haircut--

[Laughter]

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: After you get a haircut, whether you like it or not, they can't pick the hair off the floor and put it back on your head.

SPEAKER QUINN: God knows Jimmy's tried.

[Laughter]

SPEAKER QUINN: So give Eric a

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

little more time, sir.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: So just in case you were unaware, when you go to the barber shop and you get a haircut, all sales are final. Otherwise, if you own and operate a barbershop, a very small hole in the wall, a two-man operation there, he received a \$250 fine. That's not right. There are stories like that across the five boroughs.

What about the story when Speaker Quinn came to my district and we met a restaurant owner in Howard Beach on Cross Bay Boulevard and he received a \$300 or \$500 fine for a fly.

SPEAKER QUINN: Yep.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: That was in a restaurant.

SPEAKER QUINN: \$350.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: \$350 fine from the Department of Health for a fly. Then he went into the kitchen and he gave him another \$350 fine for a fly. And he said, well how do you know it's a different fly? How do you know it's not the same fly?

[Laughter]

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: The reality
3 is he's right, it could have been the same fly.
4 He received two violations for flies in the
5 restaurant when in reality it could have--maybe we
6 could put trackers on the fly and then we'd know.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Exactly.
9 No, that's true. Anyway, the point is that we are
10 not business friendly in this city. Because of
11 that, businesses are fleeing. When businesses
12 leave our city, they take their tax revenue and
13 their jobs with them. If our focus is on
14 revitalizing our economy, creating jobs and
15 keeping people in New York, then we have to do
16 more to support the small businesses in our
17 communities. Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
19 very much. Seeing no others on this particular
20 item, I'm going to have the last word. I have to
21 concur with Council Member Ulrich. All sales on
22 barbershops are final. Actually, when I first got
23 my head shaved, I asked for the hair to be put
24 back and they said sorry, couldn't do it. So I
25 just want to concur with you on that one. We now

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

move on to reports of special communicates.

CLERK: Report on the Committee on Consumer Affairs, Introduction 16-1, requiring reports on vendor adjudications.

SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Excuse me. The report of special committees, there's none.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Reports on standing committees.

CLERK: Report on the Committee on Consumer Affairs, Introduction 16-A, requiring reports on vendor adjudications.

SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Introduction 434-A, vending rules.

SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Introduction 684-A, vending against or within taxi stands.

SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Introduction 727-A, vending

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

in front of building entrances and exits.

SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
on General Orders.

CLERK: Introduction 789-A,
prohibiting vending adjacent to hospitals.

SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
on General Orders.

CLERK: Introduction 817-A, notices
of violation issued to food vendors.

SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
on General Orders.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on
Finance, Preconsidered Resolution 1664,
organizational funding.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
Orders.

CLERK: Preconsidered Resolution
1665, SoHo BID.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
Orders.

CLERK: Proposed Resolution 1651-A,
Hub Third Avenue BID.

SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
on General Orders.

1
2 CLERK: Proposed Resolution 1652-A,
3 Myrtle Avenue BID.

4 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
5 on General Orders.

6 CLERK: Preconsidered Land Use 764
7 and companion Resolution 1666, multi-family
8 preservation loan program, Brooklyn.

9 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
10 Orders.

11 CLERK: Report on the Committee on
12 Immigration, Introduction 982-A, persons not to be
13 detained by the Police Department.

14 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
15 on General Orders.

16 CLERK: Introduction 989-A, persons
17 not to be detained by the Department of
18 Correction.

19 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
20 on General Orders.

21 CLERK: Report on the Committee on
22 Land Use, LU 756 and Resolution 1667, zoning map
23 change, Brooklyn.

24 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
25 Orders.

1
2 CLERK: Land Use 760 and Resolution
3 1668, JFK Industrial Business Zone.

4 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
5 Orders.

6 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
7 Rules, Privileges and Elections, Preconsidered
8 M1056 and companion Resolution 1669, approving the
9 designation of Joseph A. Puma as member of the
10 New York City Civilian Complaint Review Board.

11 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
12 Orders.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: General
14 Order Calendar.

15 CLERK: Resolution approving
16 various persons commissioner of deeds.

17 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
18 Orders. At this point, I'd like to ask for a roll
19 call on all items that have been coupled on the
20 General Order Calendar please. If we could get a
21 little quiet for the vote on the General Calendar.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.

23 CLERK: Arroyo?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye on all

25 CLERK: Barron?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye on all.

CLERK: Brewer?

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I'm going to vote aye on all. I do want to point out in terms of small business that the Department of Consumer Affairs, and we've all walked with them on the streets, does education before they give out a ticket. I think that's exactly what we want. They go and they say to the storekeeper, the sign isn't like this, you don't have a price tag there. And then they don't come back until maybe a month later, and the person has at least been advised. Those storekeepers change managers. They don't know some of these silly little laws. The fact of the matter is, education, they want to comply. That's what I would suggest for all of our businesses. Thank you very much.

CLERK: Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

CLERK: Comrie?

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I'm sorry.

[Laughter]

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I'm voting aye on all. I just want to echo the sentiments of

1
2 my colleagues regarding horror stories with small
3 businesses. I think that the Council has spoken
4 in one voice on this issue and is working together
5 with Council Member Oddo on the small business
6 taskforce a couple of years ago, I think that it's
7 necessary that we revive that and make sure that
8 we go with renewed vigor into trying to save our
9 small businesses. I know many of my restaurants
10 have come to me with the same horror stories. I
11 know that Rob Bookman, also from the nightlife
12 industry has started a new association to deal
13 with the fact that small businesses in this city
14 are being picked on by government.

15 We as elected officials need to
16 really focus on how to help them as soon as
17 possible. Because if this city is changing and
18 evolving, it's the restaurant industry, it's the
19 nightlife industry that sparks the tourism that
20 someone across the hall is highlighting. If you
21 can't have places for the tourists to go, we're
22 not going to continue to have a vibrant city.
23 That's all over in five boroughs.

24 I just want to take the opportunity
25 to thank also Alix Pustilnik for everything that

1
2 she did for today's agenda, and also to thank all
3 of the Council Members for the bills that are
4 passed today.

5 I do want to just end up on we do
6 need to look at opening up the vendor cap. I hope
7 that that is a discussion that will be had as
8 well. We need to encourage business. We need to
9 encourage entrepreneurs. We need to also move
10 from having New York as one of the ten worst
11 places for businesses to be evolved at or to work
12 from. We need to change that image.

13 I think today's response from the
14 members here will go a long way to making sure
15 that that happens faster, with cooperation
16 hopefully from both sides and an acknowledgement
17 that this city can only grow when we help our
18 small businesses. As our forefathers had before
19 us, this city was based on small business, based
20 on immigrants, based on entrepreneurs and we need
21 to refocus on that. Thank you.

22 CLERK: Crowley?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote
24 aye.

25 CLERK: Dickens?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Ditto on
3 all that Council Member Comrie said. I agree that
4 the taskforce needs to be reinstated and the fines
5 need to be reduced that's impacting upon our small
6 businesses. I vote aye.

7 CLERK: Dilan?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Dromm?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye on all.

11 CLERK: Eugene?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

13 CLERK: Ferreras?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Aye on
15 all.

16 CLERK: Fidler?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: We got some
18 tough ones today. Majority Leader Rivera, may I
19 be briefly excused to explain my vote?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: I was so
22 compelled by the words of Council Member Gentile
23 that for a moment I was tempted to vote no. I
24 don't think that's a good idea. I think, frankly,
25 he's so right that if we don't do what we've all,

1
2 you know, said here has to be done, then they'll
3 be words without deeds. Ad I know it will give
4 our Mayor a spasm but I think we need to look at
5 the fine structure for all of our businesses in
6 the city and not just complain about it. I look
7 forward to working with everybody on that.

8 On the ICE bills, I don't know,
9 some of you may know that I spent about 18 years
10 as a partner in a law firm with a concentration of
11 practice in the immigration law. During those 18
12 years, we never looked at immigration detainers as
13 requests. We kind of looked at them as orders.
14 We had to go to seek relief from judges from
15 detainers during that time. I am assured by our
16 crackerjack legal staff here that the legal effect
17 of a detainer is not in the nature of a federal
18 order. Because of that, I'm going to respect that
19 opinion, together with the fact that I also
20 appreciate the policy of not ripping families
21 apart for nonviolent and inconsequential minor
22 criminal acts. I don't think that--the federal
23 government needs to get their act together in that
24 regard and the immigration court needs to get its
25 act together in that regard.

1
2 So I'm going to vote aye on all,
3 and hope that explains my vote.

4 CLERK: Foster?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: I'd like to
6 vote aye on all and vote aye on the Land Use Call-
7 ups please.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.

9 CLERK: Garodnick?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

11 CLERK: Gennaro?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Yes on the
13 General Order Calendar and yes on the Land Use
14 Call-ups.

15 CLERK: Gentile?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I vote aye
17 on all, except for Intro 434-A and Intros 982-A
18 and 989-A, I vote no.

19 CLERK: Greenfield?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: May I
21 be excused to explain my vote?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank
24 you, Mr. Leader. I just want to say I'm very
25 pleased to be voting in favor of the land use

1
2 action, as submitted by Fairmont Lanes, LLC, which
3 will allow the conversion from an M-1-1 district
4 to R-6-A, which will build desperately needed
5 housing in the communities of Borough Park.

6 I also, obviously, agree with my
7 colleagues as to the onerous nature of the fine
8 structure and how wanton they are in fining small
9 businesses in the city. I would like to disclose
10 that Sean Basinsky, who is the director of the
11 Street Vendor Project, was my classmate at
12 Georgetown University Law Center. I want to
13 congratulate him for his hard work. This is a
14 terrific, terrific bill. We're very excited to
15 pass it. Hopefully, this can be the beginning of
16 much more sorely needed relief for small
17 businesses and hard working men and women in New
18 York City. I vote aye on all.

19 CLERK: Halloran?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: May I be
21 excused to explain my vote?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: I vote
24 aye to all except Intros 982-A and 989-A. Having
25 served in the prosecutors offices in this city and

1
2 also having been a defense attorney, I do not
3 doubt for a minute that there are many people who
4 are subject to immigration detainers who do not
5 belong in the system. The problem is not the
6 NYPD. The problem is not the local ICE office.
7 The problem is the U.S. government's failure to
8 act on immigration reform.

9 At the end of the day, by us taking
10 it within our province to determine on behalf of
11 the entire city what is or isn't a serious
12 offense--with all due respect to any colleague of
13 mine who characterizes a crime committed in the
14 city is not serious--I would say to you we are
15 taking a step backwards when we talk about quality
16 of life.

17 At the end of the day, if it's in
18 the Penal Code of the State of New York, it's a
19 crime. Whether that crime is a B misdemeanor or
20 an A misdemeanor, it is a crime. If we're going
21 to protect the immigrants who come here, even in
22 an illegal fashion, who do the right thing, we
23 cannot reward the people who come here and do not
24 do the right thing.

25 At the end of the day, if you are a

1
2 guest of this nation and you cannot abide her
3 laws, you do not belong here. Period, the end of
4 discussion. If, however, you've come here through
5 no fault of your own or through your own
6 mechanisms and we can find a way to normalize your
7 status, I am all for that at the federal level,
8 because we have millions of people contributing
9 positively. They should not be tarnished with the
10 brush of people who come here and commit crimes.

11 At the end of the day, if it's in
12 the Penal Law, it's a crime. We're not talking
13 about administrative violations. We're not
14 talking about Administrative Code law. We're
15 talking about the Penal Law of the State of New
16 York.

17 So, my colleagues, while I
18 appreciate the sentiment with which you've passed
19 this bill, and I know it will pass, it nonetheless
20 undermines the very point immigration advocate
21 make, that immigrants who come here don't commit
22 crimes. Well now we've just exempted a whole
23 bunch of criminals from due process. Thank you
24 very much, Mr. Speaker.

25 CLERK: Barron?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes. I
3 just wanted to adjust my vote. I vote no on the
4 Fairmont Lanes project, land use project, because
5 they don't allow for any affordable housing. I
6 voted no in the Land Use Committee, so I wanted to
7 be consistent and vote no on that item, LU 756 and
8 the accompanying Reso 1667.

9 CLERK: Ignizio?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes. I
11 just wanted to just clarify. Before the social
12 engineers at Department of Health have their way
13 with my colleagues in the press and alter what
14 we're saying here in the Council, speaking on
15 Department of Health violations. What I was
16 saying was for critical violations that are a
17 threat to public health, the fines ought to remain
18 what they are. For all other ancillary
19 violations, there need be a review, warnings
20 issued and to have a much better system than it is
21 to issue the exorbitant fines that they currently
22 are. With that, I vote no on 982-A, 989-A and aye
23 on all others. Thank you.

24 CLERK: Jackson?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: I vote aye

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

on all.

CLERK: King?

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.

CLERK: Koo?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

CLERK: Koslowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on

all.

CLERK: Lander?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye on all.

CLERK: Lappin?

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: [off mic]

Aye on all and..

CLERK: Levin?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you

for all your support on 434-A, and with that I

vote aye on all.

CLERK: Mark-Viverito?

COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye

on all.

CLERK: Mealy?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I want to

salute my colleagues for their legislation today.

Can I have permission to vote on all general

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

orders and land use call-ups?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye
on all. Thank you.

CLERK: Mendez?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye on all.

CLERK: Palma?

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: You okay
there?

[laughter]

CLERK: Recchia?

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: I vote no
on 434, vote no on 982-A, vote no on 989-A and aye
on everything else.

CLERK: Reyna?

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Aye on all.

CLERK: Ulrich?

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I am voting
no on Intros 982-A and 989-A and I am voting aye
on all others. I support comprehensive
immigration reform but I cannot support these
bills for a variety of reasons, some of which were
already articulated by Council Member Halloran.

1

CLERK: Vacca?

2

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye on all.

3

CLERK: Van Bramer?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on

5

6 all.

6

CLERK: Vann?

7

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: To explain my

8

9 vote.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Basically,

11

12 I'd like to be associated with the remarks of so

12

13 many of my colleagues who spoke very passionately

13

14 against relieving and eliminating the burden, the

14

15 policies and actions that constitute a burden on

15

16 our small business people. I feel strongly about

16

17 that. I also support the comments that we should

17

18 do even more than we've done today. I withdraw my

18

19 request and vote aye on all.

19

CLERK: Weprin?

20

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: I vote no

21

22 on 434-A and aye on the rest.

22

CLERK: Williams?

23

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be

24

25 excused to explain my vote?

25

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I just wanted to say congratulations to Council Members Garodnick, Brewer, Levin and Melissa Mark-Viverito. I'm very proud of the leadership the Speaker has shown on these two issues. The immigration, in particular, is very important. Unfortunately, with ICE Secure Communities in combination with the failed policies of stop, question and frisk are particularly onerous for immigrants. In my community, I have an additional burden that many of the immigrants are from Haiti and have a language barrier. So that's even a double and triple whammy. I'm very proud that we're dealing with this situation now.

17

18

19

20

21

22

To my colleagues, I just want to say that there are many laws on the books that are not just, and even the laws that are on the books, not every law makes a crime equal and not all crimes should be treated as such. So I'm proud that we're doing this.

23

24

25

I'm also proud about the vendor bills. Having the honor of co-chairing the restaurant hearings, it was made quite clear that

1
2 most of these fines, even on the restaurants, are
3 for revenue building and not to solve any kind of
4 health problem. We're burdening our vendors. Of
5 course, everything has been said. I'd like to
6 associate myself with that as well. I'm looking
7 forward now to seeing more flattering pictures of
8 the Speaker splashed across vendor trucks across
9 the city. I vote aye on all.

10 CLERK: Wills?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I echo the
12 sentiments of my colleagues. Aye on all.

13 CLERK: Oddo?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: No on Intro
15 982-A and no on 989-A. I would just like to thank
16 Council Member Barron for invoking the memory of
17 Phil Reed. Phil was my friend and we often sat
18 next to each other during the Health Committee
19 hearings many years ago. He taught me a lot about
20 people, and he's missed. If these bills honor his
21 memory, that's just an added bonus. I vote aye on
22 all others, except for 982-A and 989-A.

23 CLERK: Rivera?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye
25 on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Speaker Quinn?

SPEAKER QUINN: I vote aye on all.

I just want to note for my colleagues that in the next few weeks, in the near future, please check the calendar. We have having a regulatory review oversight hearing. Folks will remember that the regulatory review--oh, tomorrow actually. The Government Operations Committee, chaired by Council Member Brewer, with the Small Business Committee, chaired by Diana Reyna, are going to be having a regulatory review hearing that will, in part, look at some of the issues that were raised today around fines.

Folks will remember the regulatory review work of Council Members Oddo and Comrie and former council member Yassky. So I just wanted to note that as part of our ongoing work in this area. Thank Diana and Gale in advance. I think, Diana, it's going to be a heated hearing, to say the least. And just to say, we will continue to do work on this area as it relates to vendors and internal small businesses, too, for lack of a better description. So folks should go to Gale and Diana's hearing tomorrow. I vote aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Thank you.

[Applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: All items on today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative with zero in the negative and zero abstentions. With the exception of Intro 982-A, which was adopted by a vote of 40 in the affirmative, with seven in the negative and zero abstentions. And Intro 989-A, which was adopted by a vote of 40 in the affirmative and seven in the negative and zero abstentions. And Intro 434-A, which was adopted by a vote of 44 in the affirmative, three in the negative and zero abstentions. LU 757 and Reso 1667, which was adopted by a vote of 46 in the affirmative, one in the negative and zero abstentions. The revised Land Use Call-ups were voted with 47 in the affirmative and zero in the negative.

We now move on to introduction and reading of the bills.

SPEAKER QUINN: All bills have been referred to committees, as indicated on the agenda. I also just want to note that attached to your agenda is the most up to date schedule on the

1
2 preliminary budget hearings. Please note those
3 and please note the calendar on the Council's
4 website in case there are any changes. The most
5 up to date schedule is attached. Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
7 very much. We still have other items on the
8 agenda, so please, silence in the chambers. We
9 have discussion of resolutions. We have one
10 resolution on today's agenda, Reso 81-A, an
11 amended resolution calling on the City of New York
12 to acknowledge the years of suffering of all those
13 involved in the Central Park jogger case,
14 including both the five men whose convictions were
15 vacated and the jogger herself. By settling this
16 matter out of court as expeditiously as possible--

17 SPEAKER QUINN: [interposing] If we
18 could get--shh. Thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you.
20 Expeditiously as possible, in order to avoid a
21 continuation of this painful, lengthy and costly
22 legal proceeding that will only cause further
23 anguish for all parties. We have Council Member
24 Barron speaking first on this item.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you

1
2 very much. I would just like those in the
3 balcony, to our vendors, these young men supported
4 you. You need to sit down and support them on
5 this resolution. It'll take a minute. You need
6 to have a seat because these are the same young
7 men who supported you in your legislation. So if
8 you could just have a seat for a minute, I'd
9 appreciate it.

10 I just wanted to bring attention
11 and thank my colleagues in the City Council. It's
12 often said that you're innocent until proven
13 guilty. Well, in our case, black and Latino youth
14 were guilty until they can prove their innocence.
15 These young men suffered some of the best years of
16 their lives, 6 to 13 years in prison. They were
17 wrongly convicted. There was nothing connecting
18 them to this crime. No semen. No hairs. Nothing
19 connecting them to this crime. Hours of
20 interrogation by the police department forced
21 statements, not confessions, forced statements.
22 And even in these statements, they were
23 inconsistent with the evidence. So I just want to
24 have--two of them are here today--

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA:

1

2 [interposing] Council Member?

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

[Applause]

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: If they could just stand for a moment. Raymond Santana and Korey Wise is here. Please stand. These young men suffered. Today, we'll passing a resolution that really calls for the mayor to settle out of court.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I want to thank the Black and Latino and Asian Caucus for your support on this and all that involved and this even brings relief for the Central Park jogger herself.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Council Member?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: That we can bring some closure to this by having the mayor settle out of court. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you very much. We now move on to Council Member Jackson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you. My colleagues, I rise and ask you to support this resolution. I appreciate the leadership that our

1
2 colleague Charles Barron has taken on this
3 particular resolution. Clearly, I appreciate the
4 Speaker's involvement in helping to move this
5 along. One of the things I say to all of you, if
6 you have not been in prison for years, then you
7 don't know what it's like.

8 Clearly, these individuals have
9 spent years in prison for something they did not
10 do and commit. Not one piece of physical
11 evidence, no blood, no semen, no hair, no dirt
12 relating to the crime, no clothes, fabrics,
13 anything, not one piece. They were railroaded by
14 the system. Justice needs to be had not next year
15 but now. We need to resolve this particular
16 matter. I thank the members of this body in
17 passing this resolution today.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
19 very much, Council Member. We now move on to
20 Council Member Brewer.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you
22 very much. I just want to thank Council Member
23 Barron and the amazing hearing that we had in
24 Governmental Operations with the families who came
25 forward and all of the testifiers. I know I was

1
2 around and stood with State Senator Perkins, I
3 think it was in the City Council at the time, or
4 even maybe not in office, and I was head of the
5 National Women's Political Caucus when we stood in
6 support of these young men many years ago. So I
7 am quite familiar with the case. I'm glad that
8 this resolution is passing, and we look forward to
9 a resolution so there's not many hours of trial
10 and challenges for the families. Thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
12 very much. Council Member Dromm?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I also want
14 to stand in support of this resolution. I want to
15 thank Council Member Barron for all his work that
16 he did on this. I attended the hearing. To see
17 those young men in the audience was very moving,
18 but to hear the words of Yusef Salaam's mother was
19 even more moving. I look forward to going to
20 Washington, D.C. with Council Member Barron to
21 also continue the fight for justice and find out
22 if this was in fact malicious prosecution, as I do
23 believe that it was. Congratulations and I look
24 forward to voting in favor of this resolution.
25 Thank you.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
3 very much. Seeing no others, we'll call on a vote
4 for Resolution 81-A. All in favor say aye.

5 COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: All opposed
7 say nay. Any abstentions? The ayes have it. At
8 this point in time--

9 [Applause]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: We now move
11 on to general discussion. Back to Council Member
12 Barron.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I want to
14 give attention to my colleagues on a commission
15 bill that Council Member Wills is coming up with.
16 I think it's critical that we support this piece
17 of legislation to put a commission together to
18 look at the root causes of violence. You know,
19 oftentimes we say violence, and the minute you
20 mentioned violence, you want gun control laws.
21 Yes, we should ban assault rifles and the
22 magazines that go with them. But in our
23 neighborhoods, that's not what's killing us.
24 What's killing us more than anything else is
25 poverty. What's killing us is unemployment. You

1
2 can find any weapon when you lose hope and decide
3 that you want to end your life or someone else's
4 life. So if we're going to get serious about
5 ending violence, we need to look at the root
6 causes of racism and economic and justice as it
7 relates to violence. I think this commission will
8 be very, very--a big step in the right direction
9 for that. I applaud Council Member Wills for
10 putting forth this piece of legislation.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
12 very much. Council Member Jackson? Can we get
13 silence in the chambers?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: My
15 colleagues, I rise to bring to your attention some
16 terrible news. In fact, you knew that as a result
17 of no teacher evaluation being reached, the City
18 of New York lost \$250 million that our children
19 did not receive. In fact, Mayor Bloomberg in his
20 State of the City address stated that they
21 announced that as result of that loss, the city
22 was going to be losing approximately 700 guidance
23 counselors and teacher lines, increases in class
24 size was going to occur, cuts in after school
25 programs and anti-bullying programs, cuts in pre-

1

2 kindergarten, special education and cuts in test
3 preparation as a result of that loss.

4 Well, the terrible news that I
5 received this afternoon from our attorney Michael
6 Rebell, and he tweeted from the Campaign for
7 Educational Equity, "New York City Department of
8 Education plans to go ahead with the school cuts,
9 despite an injunction preventing the state from
10 penalizing our city kids." That's absurd. I
11 don't understand the logic behind that.

12 Then he said, "cutting services to
13 students at this point is unreasonable,
14 irresponsible and illegal." In fact, we're going
15 to go back in court Friday morning to enjoin the
16 City of New York in implementing these cuts.
17 Mayor Bloomberg, Joel Klein--Dennis Walcott,
18 Chancellor, please don't hurt our children
19 anymore. They've been hurt enough. We need more
20 money and not less money. You don't have to
21 implement these cuts because we have a preliminary
22 injunction. Please understand that. Do no more
23 harm to our children. Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
25 very much. We now move on to Council Member

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Comrie, followed by Council Member Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I want to just join Council Member Robert Jackson's sentiments of asking the Mayor's Office and DOE not to institute these cuts until every opportunity is to replace the money. Speaker Silver and the legislature has indicated and intimated that they are serious about putting the money back in the budget. I think it only behooves the mayor to not harm our kids in doing so. By trying to remove these dollars now makes absolutely no sense.

I just wanted to acknowledge and thank, I have three interns that are here in the chambers with me today. I've been honored with Nancy Iaden [phonetic] and Curt Benson [phonetic] and Daniel Kim [phonetic], who are interning with my office this semester. I hope that we will not run them away after today's meeting, but only further engage them in public service.

With that, I also want to, again, thank--those are not for me--I also want to thank Council Member Wills for putting together the Intro 1012 and ask my colleagues to seriously look

1
2 at it. The root causes of what are going on out
3 here in the city with our young people is only due
4 to the fact that they are being under educated and
5 if we try to continue to cut education dollars on
6 one end, we're going to continue to have an
7 increase on crime on the other end.

8 The root causes of crime and the
9 root causes that create violence in this city are
10 something that we seriously need to look at in a
11 holistic manner so that we can be preventative and
12 also give children other real alternatives that we
13 had growing up. We need to go back to those
14 rubrics, go back to that time when we had
15 opportunities for people to be engaged, especially
16 now when we have so many people that are
17 disengaged from reality. Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
19 very much. Council Member Williams, followed by
20 Council Member Brewer.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank
22 you. I wanted to make sure I gave some time.
23 Council Member Barron inadvertently forgot to
24 mention the mother of Yusef Salaam, one of the
25 Central Park five's Ms. Sharon Salaam is here as

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

well. I just want to thank her.

[Applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Also, I'm very proud that we passed that resolution. It's very important that we did so to provide just a little bit of balance. We still have a long way to go. I wanted to also say I'm proud to co-sponsor Intro 1012, Council Member Wills' bill. It's very important. Too often, the policies that we make to try to bring crime down involve locking up as many black and brown men as humanely possible. We know that that does not work, has never worked and will never work. There is a more comprehensive approach that is needed. I think this bill begins to lend to that.

I'm always appalled at every meeting where a commissioner, DYCD, NYCHA, other, NYPD, come and I always ask have you discussed with each other better practices to deal with the crime issue and the answer has always been no, which was frustrating to me. So I'm very happy about this bill. I think it will take us further to really bringing the crime issue under control, particularly around gun violence.

1
2 Lastly, I wanted to say
3 congratulations to my media relations director
4 Stephen Rengel [phonetic], who was elected as
5 president of the Brooklyn Young Democrats. Thank
6 you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
8 very much. Council Member Brewer?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you.
10 I just want to thank Sarah Renko [phonetic], who's
11 an intern, Zach Broadkin [phonetic] and Michael
12 Lansey [phonetic] in my office. I just want to
13 talk just for one minute. Richard Murphy was the
14 one who did Cops and Kids, the kids portion during
15 the Dinkins administration. So I just think that
16 this is a great time to be reuniting with that
17 concept. If we're talking about guns, we also
18 need to talk about young people, and certainly in
19 his memory it would be great. Thank you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
21 very much. Seeing no others, this meeting is
22 adjourned.

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Donna Hintze certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature _____ *Donna Hintze* _____

Date March 21, 2013 _____