

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON TECHNOLOGY

-----X

March 1, 2013  
Start: 10:13 a.m.  
Recess: 11:05 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers  
City Hall

B E F O R E:  
FERNANDO CABRERA  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:  
Council Member Gale A. Brewer  
Council Member Letitia James  
Council Member G. Oliver Koppell  
Council Member Mark S. Weprin

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Nicholas Sbordone  
Director of Intergovernmental Affairs  
Department of Information, Technology and  
Telecommunications

Colin Reilly  
Director of Citywide Geographic Information Services  
Department of Information, Technology and  
Telecommunications

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Good morning.  
3 And welcome to this hearing concerning Intro 984,  
4 which will require the Department of Information  
5 Technology, DoITT, and Telecommunications, to  
6 create and maintain an interactive crime mapping  
7 website. Crime mapping is a tool that allows the  
8 public to receive information about recent crime  
9 activity in their neighborhood. The use of crime  
10 mapping as a tool for public safety has a long  
11 history, and it has been adopted as a growing  
12 number of cities and towns across the United  
13 States, including Oakland, California, Baltimore;  
14 Maryland; Albany; to name a few. The bill we are  
15 considering today requires DoITT to provide an  
16 interactive crime map on the City's website, to  
17 the public displaying the total number of crime  
18 complaints that have been filed with the New York  
19 City Police Department on a monthly basis,  
20 searchable by address, zip code or NYPD patrol  
21 precinct. The Committee looks forward to hearing  
22 from DoITT and other witnesses today, about the  
23 merits of this bill, and how such a crime map will  
24 be created and available to the public. And let  
25 me recognize Council Member Koppell who has joined

1  
2 us today. And I'm going to turn it over to the  
3 panel - -

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL:

5 [interposing] Mr. Chairman, before you do that--

6 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: --let me  
8 compliment you on this idea, which apparently has  
9 been adopted in other jurisdictions. And while I  
10 will hear with interest the comments of the  
11 witnesses, I think it's such a good idea that even  
12 before hearing those comments, I'd like to be  
13 added as a sponsor.

14 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Well, thank  
15 you so much, Council Member Koppell, really  
16 appreciate that. So let's turn it over to the  
17 panel, if you could identify yourselves. Thank  
18 you so much.

19 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Thank you, good  
20 morning. Good morning, Chairman Cabrera and  
21 Members of the City Council Technology Committee.  
22 My name is Nicholas Sbordone, Director of  
23 Intergovernmental Affairs at the Department of  
24 Information, Technology and Telecommunications, or  
25 DoITT. Thank you again for the opportunity to

1  
2 testify today on City Council Intro 984 of 2012,  
3 which would require DoITT to create and maintain  
4 an interactive crime mapping website. With me  
5 today, to my left is Colin Reilly, DoITT's  
6 Director of Citywide Geographic Information  
7 Services. For eleven years now, the Bloomberg  
8 Administration has been at for the forefront of  
9 making New York City government more open and  
10 transparent than ever. The City provides a wealth  
11 of information and data, which every day is being  
12 made more abundant and accessible from NYC 311, to  
13 the revolutionary citywide performance reporting,  
14 to the recently launched interactive Mayor's  
15 Management report, the amount of city information  
16 to which NYC.gov facilitates access today far  
17 exceeds anything previously available in the  
18 City's long history and compares favorably to that  
19 of any city in the world. DoITT is proud to have  
20 played an integral role in these efforts. The  
21 spirit of these efforts was codified in the City's  
22 administrative code through Local Law 11 of 2012.  
23 This seminal piece of legislation, on which we  
24 were honored to work closely with Council Member  
25 Brewer, Chairman Cabrera and the Council's stellar

1  
2 Technology Committee staff. I should add as an  
3 aside that the City's stellar Technology Committee  
4 staff also helped to get us set up today with a  
5 laptop and a projector, so thank you for that.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: [laughs]

7 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: This bill  
8 represents by far the most ambitious open data  
9 legislation in the country. Signed by Major  
10 Bloomberg last March, Local Law 11 commits City  
11 agencies to systemically categorize and make  
12 accessible in open formats their data for those to  
13 whom it belongs: the public. Importantly, that  
14 open data is now law means the next Mayor cannot  
15 roll back but must rather build upon, the  
16 Bloomberg Administration's historic transparency  
17 gains. It's data, of course, from which  
18 applications are conceived and built. When it  
19 comes to mapping applications for the City,  
20 DoITT's citywide GIS team, led by Colin here,  
21 employs technology to provide agencies with  
22 mapping and location based information services,  
23 better equipping them to make informed decisions.  
24 Most city mapping interfaces are built with a  
25 similar look and feel to the popular New York City

1  
2 map, which is, as you can see on the screen behind  
3 me, that's actually not it, but that is. Which  
4 provides a wealth of information to the public and  
5 allows other City agencies to leverage its open  
6 source platform to build mapping tools of their  
7 own. In addition to indicating the specific  
8 [background comment] Sure.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: [off mic]  
10 --make a point, not on the testimony itself. But  
11 I've made this point in other committee hearings -  
12 - most of these people who come to hear I think  
13 the - - I love technology, although I'm of a  
14 generation that [on mic] doesn't understand it as  
15 well as younger members, like Chairman Cabrera.  
16 However, in addition to using technology, I have  
17 been successful in interrupting in this way, in  
18 getting witnesses when they come with this kind of  
19 presentation, PowerPoint, to also have a hard copy  
20 so we can read it. 'Cause quite honestly, I can't  
21 read that, it's useless to me. It's pretty, but  
22 it's useless. I can't read it.

23 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Okay.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: And if we  
25 had a hardcopy here, I could. And I might note

1  
2 that the Department, the Education Department  
3 testified the other day they had hardcopies. I  
4 think 'cause I'd made a point to this, other  
5 people have done it. So, in the future, I would  
6 appreciate if we had a hardcopy of PowerPoints,  
7 that we have at our desk.

8 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Sure. I would  
9 note for the record, so this isn't a PowerPoint  
10 presentation, this is the open internet. I'm  
11 happy, though, to email your staff afterward.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: [off mic]  
13 - - green.

14 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Sure.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: [off mic]  
16 --to have it on paper, until maybe when the  
17 Council is more well financed, and all have a  
18 little laptop in front of them.

19 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Happy to email  
20 your staff afterward, with all the particular  
21 links and the details about the things I'm  
22 demo'ing--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: - -  
25 objection.



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Thank you.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Okay. So,  
going back to City Map, I'll just jump down.  
Leveraging NYC City Map and similar technologies,  
DoITT has worked with agencies across the City to  
launch many interactive websites, and applications  
serving a range of audiences and needs. These  
include PlowNYC, which delivers a new public  
facing view into the City's snow clearing  
operations. When activated during snow events,  
this tool features a map to view snow removal  
activities, including color coded street segments  
by time intervalled and noting when a street was  
last plowed. PlowNYC was used to great effect  
during the citywide snow emergency last month,  
which was February 8th and 9th. The Board of  
Elections sample balloting, which builds upon the  
extant poll site locator application. We added a  
tool that enables users to enter their addresses  
and view online the sample ballots they will  
receive at their polling locations. There are  
thousands of variations of election ballots based  
on the voter's location, and this user friendly  
tool helps better inform the electorate before

1  
2 they vote. NYC Street Closures was pursuant to  
3 Local Law 32 of 2011, passed also by the Council,  
4 of course, which displayed street closure  
5 information across the five boroughs, provides  
6 real time information on current and future street  
7 closures obstructing normal vehicular traffic,  
8 street fairs, block parties, etc., and allows  
9 users to conduct searches based on date, time and  
10 location. Digital tax map provides public and  
11 Department of Finance staff access to official  
12 City tax maps, tax map changes and historical  
13 records. The zoning and land use application, or  
14 ZOLA, for short, provides a new way to find a  
15 whole range of land use information in  
16 interactive, highly readable map layers,  
17 pertaining to a particular property.

18 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Nick, I'm  
19 sorry to interrupt you--

20 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Sure.

21 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: We're miss--  
22 we happen to be missing page two.

23 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Oh, is it on  
24 the back?

25 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: No.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: [off mic]

Not on our copies, not on our copies.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Maybe some of your staff can--

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: - - printer snafu [laughter]

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Okay.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: [off mic] It prints double-sided. [on mic] Sorry about that.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Not a problem, I just want to make sure that we're following you. And also if we could get a copy to all five Council Members. Thank you so much.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Thank you, I'm so sorry about that.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: It's okay, not a problem, Nick.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Okay, sorry about that, you want to wait, or shall I continue?

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Go ahead, yeah, go ahead.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Okay. So, ZOLA provides an information and interactive highly readable map layers pertaining to a particular

1  
2 property or the City at large. Previously, before  
3 the tool, searching for the specifics of zoning  
4 regulations was a difficult, time consuming task,  
5 involving searching through maps and cross-  
6 referencing other official documents. The Census  
7 Fact Finder, much in the same way, provides 2010  
8 census data in a new revamped form, including  
9 information about how many people rent versus  
10 homes, own homes in the community, the number of  
11 housing units in neighborhoods, etc. The stimulus  
12 tracker, is the award winning tool that New  
13 Yorkers can use to track the City's use of federal  
14 recovery funds provided through the American  
15 Recovery and Reinvestment Act of 2009. The 311  
16 service request map, which I'll bring up here,  
17 it's also a very popular tool. It provides  
18 location status and information for 311 complaints  
19 filed over the past year, as well as those  
20 recently closed across 15 categories and more than  
21 100 subcategories, allowing users to evaluate  
22 conditions and trends from the hyper local to  
23 citywide levels. NYC Scout Map, the Street  
24 Conditions Observation Unit, or SCOUT, is a team  
25 of inspectors who drive each City street monthly,

1  
2 to report conditions to 311 that negatively impact  
3 quality of life. NYC Scout Map displays each  
4 condition's specific occurrence, marking repeated  
5 conditions by a graduated circle with drill down  
6 capability. By clicking on the circle users can  
7 view the list of SCOUT conditions reported. And  
8 by clicking on each condition, receive each  
9 respective complaint number. In each case above,  
10 and in all other instances when DoITT has been  
11 called upon to deliver a map based website or  
12 application, our response was the same: give us  
13 the data, and give the requirements, and we'll  
14 give you a map. Turning now to Intro 984, the  
15 goal of the legislation seems to fit squarely with  
16 this mission, with DoITT's mission, to support  
17 agency mapping needs. And more generally, the  
18 overall intent of the bill would seem to fit with  
19 the Bloomberg Administration's long held  
20 commitment to making more City information  
21 available to more people in more easy to use ways.  
22 Our concerns with the bill as currently drafted  
23 include foremost the effective date and less so  
24 sufficient distinction in the bill's language  
25 between the proposed crime mapping website and the

1 existing NYC street closures tool. Taking quickly  
2 each of these in turn, 180 days from bill  
3 enactment may not necessarily be enough time to  
4 implement an interactive crime mapping website  
5 from start to finish. DoITT of course will  
6 require a continuous feed of data from the New  
7 York City Police Department, as we do from all  
8 agencies for which we host mapping tools. And  
9 also sufficient development time to build the  
10 website's functionality. Next, the proposed  
11 language in the New York City, in the language  
12 required on the interactive crime map, follows  
13 immediately the language mandating DoITT's  
14 creation and maintenance of the NYC Street  
15 Closures tool. While presumably clear to DoITT  
16 that there is no intention by the Council to  
17 combine the two, NYC Street Closures and NYC Crime  
18 Mapping, as it were, we might suggest exploring  
19 language that makes clearer the distinction. This  
20 is important not only for technical and aesthetic  
21 reasons, but more importantly so that the public  
22 has an unambiguous sense of where and how to find  
23 the information for which it is looking. From NYC  
24 City Map, for example, users can easily toggle  
25

1  
2 between it and other clearly delineated map themes  
3 and the same clarity should be afforded to users  
4 in this case. Otherwise, I thank the Committee  
5 for its time this morning, and Colin and I now  
6 look forward to answering any questions you have,  
7 and further discussing going forward with the  
8 members and some of these ideas. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so  
10 much. I have a few questions before I turn it  
11 over to Council Members. You mentioned that you  
12 suggest exploring language that makes clearer that  
13 distinction. Can you give me an example of that  
14 or do you have any ideas as to what kind of a  
15 language are you looking for?

16 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Yeah, I mean, I  
17 think it's something we can probably discuss also  
18 thereafter. But it's fairly simple, it's not a  
19 huge concern, because I think, and when I spoke  
20 with Colin about this, it was something he had  
21 brought up. I think that it's not, it's clear to  
22 us that the Council didn't have any intention, but  
23 the way it's Section 1072 of the Charter, a couple  
24 of years ago, and I mentioned it in my testimony,  
25 there's NYC Street Closures, which requires DoITT

1  
2 to build the map for DOT, which marks street  
3 closure due to construction. That's great. The  
4 Council I think took the same tack this time,  
5 which was to simply add, not another letter under  
6 that, that says, "Okay, well, this letter, I guess  
7 it was H." Actually, if you'll bear with me a  
8 second.

9 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: No, go ahead.

10 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: I do have it  
11 here. So, it's ... Okay. So, it's Local Law 32,  
12 so it amends the City Charter, adds a new section,  
13 I guess, or a new addition to Section 1072. It's  
14 letter q, to provide the public at no charge on  
15 the City's website, an interactive map to display  
16 street closures. It goes through that. Now the  
17 way this proposed bill is drafted, it simply  
18 follows on that. The next letter says, now we  
19 also want you to build, at no charge to the  
20 public, an interactive map doing crime mapping.  
21 It's clear to us that the one letter is the one  
22 and the next letter is the other thing. We just  
23 wanted to make sure we weren't setting an  
24 expectation for the public that crime mapping  
25 information would somehow need to be overlaid on



1  
2 the street closures map. That's all. And I think  
3 that's a quick fix, basically just saying, they're  
4 two distinct things. It doesn't mean, now, for  
5 instance, this is exactly why we wanted this, we  
6 have our New York City map application, you'll see  
7 here, as you mouse across the top--I'm sorry,  
8 Council Member Koppell--you'll see other map  
9 themes. You can simply click on that and from  
10 there you can click down to any number of the  
11 other maps that we have, some of which I mentioned  
12 in what I just said. For instance, you can go  
13 from here to street closures, click on that and  
14 bring that up, which is great. We just want to  
15 make sure that there's a clear distinction that we  
16 wouldn't want on street closures, the expectation  
17 that we're then going to overlay crime mapping  
18 data on that. 'Cause that wouldn't be clear for  
19 the public, they're going to want to be able to  
20 see crime, or they want to be able to see  
21 closures, that's all.

22 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And that was  
23 not the intention, actually.

24 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: No, no, no,  
25 absolutely, and we didn't think it was, it's maybe

1

2 just tweaking a line, we can make sure that's  
3 clear.

4

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: So, so, now  
5 just so I'm clear, DoITT will be able--right now,  
6 as we get stats regarding crime, it's by precinct.  
7 So we don't know what block, what street. Share  
8 with us what would that look like, in terms of  
9 once DoITT has the opportunity to build the site,  
10 what would it look like? How would people be able  
11 to identify which areas certain crimes? Would it  
12 be by categories? Or would all the crimes be  
13 listed, such as burglary versus assault.

14

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Yeah. I think  
15 it, that's a great question. I think it--I think  
16 Colin would say the same thing, 'cause whenever we  
17 talk about this, it depends, I hate to give that  
18 answer, but it depends on the data, it depends on  
19 the data and the granularity and kind of the  
20 requirements of the map. To give you an example,  
21 this isn't that, but so this is something we use  
22 all the time, this is the 311 service request map.  
23 Okay? Very popular. As you can see, even by  
24 going on City Map, which will click back to its -  
25 - it's based on the same look and feel. Okay?

1  
2 It's easily accessible, you go to NYC.gov/311, you  
3 click on the map, and what this is going to give  
4 you is a color coded map, this is all community  
5 boards across the City, with the number of  
6 complaints filed in them. So, mousing over any  
7 one of them, okay, Community District 12  
8 Manhattan, for instance, there are 3,616  
9 complaints, that'll pop up. You can mouse over  
10 any of these. Drilling down into the map, I think  
11 is where you really get to the meat and potatoes  
12 of it.

13 COLIN REILLY: Can I interject  
14 here?

15 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Yeah, sure.

16 COLIN REILLY: This is Colin  
17 Reilly, from, also from DoITT. So if you were  
18 going to get the data aggregated by precinct  
19 level, then you won't be able to go any further,  
20 you wouldn't be able to go drill down and see the  
21 data aggregated at a lower geographic level by say  
22 zip code or the individual crime locations  
23 themselves. So, if it's aggregated by precinct,  
24 that's basically restricting the view to precinct  
25 or higher. Then you can go to borough. So--

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: But with the  
3 spirit and intent of this law, not only would be  
4 by citco [phonetic], but by street. So what you  
5 have--

6  
7 COLIN REILLY: [interposing] Right,  
8 so then you shouldn't ask for aggregated data at  
9 the precinct level, you'd want data aggregated  
10 either at that level or the raw data itself.

11 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And you don't  
12 believe that this, the - - language--

13 COLIN REILLY: I can't speak for  
14 the Police Department. I--

15 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: They have the  
16 data, they have--the sector stats are there, they  
17 have the data.

18 COLIN REILLY: Right.

19 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Which is  
20 ironic, because the purpose, as I receive my  
21 briefing, it was to deploy resources. And that's  
22 the very reason, that's the intent of this law, is  
23 so nonprofit organizations, the community, so  
24 religious organizations, whosever, to deploy  
25 resources in a particular area, so--because right

1  
2 now, we're blind, we're shooting blind, when we--  
3 or it's word of mouth, and the only ones that have  
4 that data, is the Police Department, which seems  
5 kind of ironic, if they need it, how much more the  
6 community needs it, as well, if you're going to  
7 do--they'd do the inter--they'd do the criminal,  
8 you know, dealing with the criminal aspect, but we  
9 need to deal with the prevention aspect, which  
10 they do very little of that, not for fault of  
11 their own, because that's not their mission. So,  
12 having said that, that's what I'm really looking  
13 forward having in this website, having that raw  
14 data. Can you put it in different categories,  
15 one, you know, you can have one aspect of your  
16 website where you have like precinct, and then  
17 another icon by street, or--

18 COLIN REILLY: Sure, sure, but I  
19 was responding to your question where you said the  
20 data would be aggregated by precinct. I'm not  
21 advocating it was that, I would say--

22 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: - - we're  
23 saying now it's, at present it's by precinct.

24 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Okay, right.

25 COLIN REILLY: So, if we're given

1

2 the raw data, then we can aggregate it, slice it,  
3 dice it, any way shape, or form, right.

4 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Gotcha, thank  
5 you.

6 COLIN REILLY: It's more of an open  
7 canvas. When you're given it aggregated at a  
8 precinct level, then that restricts what you can  
9 do.

10 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Definitely.  
11 So, it depends what they give, based on what they  
12 give.

13 COLIN REILLY: Correct.

14 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And we're  
15 going to, this law is telling them to give you the  
16 raw material.

17 COLIN REILLY: Okay.

18 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Okay.

19 COLIN REILLY: And in that case,  
20 then you have an open canvas and you can do query  
21 by zip code, aggregate by zip code, see things  
22 that are happening on city blocks, yes.

23 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: So, you would  
24 see, for--I don't know what happened now, to what  
25 I did. Hold on. Okay, so, going back then to the

1  
2 311 map, you can enter any address in the City.  
3 So for instance, 250 Broadway, in Manhattan, would  
4 net you essentially dots on a map, which would  
5 then allow you to go in and drill down into any of  
6 the particulars. So here is the building. These  
7 would be, each of these dots represents complaints  
8 that came in to 311. The smaller the circle, the  
9 fewer the complaints; the larger the circle, the  
10 more. Mousing over them will tell you at any  
11 point how many were at that location. Clicking  
12 into it will give you the particular complaint.  
13 This was noise from jackhammering on January 3rd.  
14 Drilling into that further will give you the date  
15 it was created, the status, and the latest message  
16 to the customer from the servicing agency--in this  
17 case, DEP.

18 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Is this kind  
19 of the presentation that you will have, the  
20 format--

21 COLIN REILLY: This is one  
22 possibility, yes.

23 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Again, it  
24 depends--

25 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: What other

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

possibilities do you have?

COLIN REILLY: Well, there's more advanced techniques nowadays. I mean, this was developed quite a number of years ago. I mean, you can do like heat maps that you're creating a surface and showing sort of hot spots of where, you know, crime rates are higher. And you can do it by time interval, you can do it by geographic location. So, there's many ways of understanding what's happening without looking at just those raw points, right, to add, if you will, intelligence, to it. so you're seeing where clustering of crimes are happening.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And still be able to giber that detailed information.

COLIN REILLY: Yeah, obviously you'd want to mask certain personal information, right, but yes, you can, yeah, so this is sort of -

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Example.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: So, the one thing I would add is, again, like Colin said, and like we had said from the start, give us the data and we can get a map. We can build a map, based



1  
2 on the requirements. I think there may be, there  
3 may be--and you may hear about this, I don't know  
4 if there's other people testifying after us, on  
5 either side--there may be a public policy  
6 decision, a public policy discussion to be had at  
7 the value of drilling down to the exact address of  
8 a particular incident. And again, I'm agnostic,  
9 I'm not taking position one way or the other. Our  
10 position is we're the tech guys. Give us the  
11 data, we'll build it. But as someone who has also  
12 had the pleasure to work on the open data bill, I  
13 know that it was a lengthy and important  
14 conversation we had about exactly what types of  
15 data we were going to open up. And that was not  
16 because the City wanted to be cloistered and hold  
17 all its data close to the vest, not any more so  
18 than normally. But because there are legitimate  
19 questions to be had about privacy and personal  
20 information. I think when you're talking about  
21 311 data, for instance, the number of complaints  
22 that you may get filed about whatever this  
23 complaint might be here, give that a second to  
24 open up, a pothole or a streetlight or whatever it  
25 may be, that is public information which doesn't

1  
2 necessarily have a personal impact on someone. I  
3 would imagine, however, if you were a victim of a  
4 crime, that's intensely personal. I don't know  
5 what can be more personal than that. And there  
6 may, again, there may be conversation to be had  
7 about putting locations on a map of forced  
8 entries, or sexual abuse. I don't know that, if I  
9 knew someone who was a victim of sexual abuse, or  
10 I was, that I'd necessarily want my address  
11 splashed on a map for people for see. Even  
12 without my name, people know I live in a building,  
13 and that happened there, that might be something  
14 that I think there needs to be maybe a discussion  
15 about that.

16 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Council  
17 Member Koppell.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: I think--  
19 do we have someone from the Police Department  
20 testifying today? Because I think that there are  
21 two questions that are--first of all, I appreciate  
22 that DoITT is in favor, in general, of doing this.  
23 And I encourage the Counsel to the Committee and  
24 the Committee to pursue it, and to put the bill  
25 together. And it's interesting, I haven't--I'm

1  
2 going to now do it, I haven't looked at that  
3 complaint driven map, which is excellent from  
4 seeing it here, I haven't taken it--I know we  
5 required it--

6 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: --but I  
8 haven't checked it, but looking at it here, it  
9 really is excellent. And I think you're  
10 absolutely right about the concerns about privacy.  
11 I think that what I would ask the--if the Council  
12 would--I want 'em to hear what I say, so ... Okay,  
13 I want you to hear what I had to say, so I  
14 stopped. Right now, because I go to the community  
15 board meetings, and you do, too, I know, the  
16 police do have the data, obviously aggregated by  
17 precinct, that's all there. And I believe they  
18 also have it as, the Chairman I think suggested  
19 before, aggregated by sector, 'cause they divide  
20 the precinct into sectors. And certainly  
21 providing it on that basis there's no problem.  
22 There might well be a problem if you drill down to  
23 do it by address, because again, there could be  
24 privacy concerns. But I think that, what I would  
25 ask the Council to do is discuss that with both

1  
2 the police and maybe the Corporation Council's  
3 office, and consider those privacy concerns 'cause  
4 I think they're real. And I think that we should  
5 then redraft the bill to reflect both what's  
6 available with some sensitivity to privacy  
7 concerns. I certainly wouldn't want names or  
8 addresses--well, certainly not names, and probably  
9 not even addresses, but maybe by street, wouldn't  
10 be a bad idea. But I think the bill should  
11 indicate that the information is available more  
12 than simply by precinct. 'Cause I think that's,  
13 precincts are pretty big, and I think that frankly  
14 this mapping, which will display to people what's  
15 going on in their neighborhoods, you know, it  
16 allows them to be vigilant or more vigilant and  
17 say, you know, talk to their precincts, precinct  
18 commanders, and say, "Well, we got this big  
19 problem on Perry Avenue," which I mention only  
20 because we have a big problem on Perry Avenue,  
21 over the years. Why aren't you posting more  
22 officers there? Or what should we do to get more  
23 officers on Perry Avenue? Happens to be my  
24 district. So, I look forward to the redraft of  
25 the bill, but I hope that the bill will move

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

forward. As I say, it's a good idea. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so much, Council Member Koppell, and your suggestions are definitely worthy of following up. Let me ask you this question. You know, Oakland and we mentioned Baltimore, already ahead of us when it comes to this. Have you had an opportunity to check out the website?

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: So I did some research on this, I didn't check out Oakland, Baltimore. What I did, I did look at Chicago, which I had pulled up here. So this is the City of Chicago.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Okay.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Crime map. This is based on data.cities.gov. Now, when you first see this, you're going to say, "Wait, wait, wait, that looks just like this."

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Right.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: But I don't think it does, because if you actually look at it-

-

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: It doesn't.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: --it's actually

1  
2 at a higher level. It's more akin, I think, to  
3 the precinct level, than it is to the specific  
4 location level. And the reason I know that is  
5 because not only does it give you a polygon here,  
6 but if you look at the disclaimer language here,  
7 it opens up for you, it says where the data is  
8 located, and then beginning this sentence here, it  
9 says, "In order to protect the privacy of crime  
10 victims, addresses are shown at the block level  
11 only." And specific locations are not identified.  
12 So, this suggests, and I think that New York City  
13 is somehow not really where it needs to be, I  
14 don't know, but I don't think we're as far as some  
15 people might think we are, because it's pretty  
16 close to what we have now. So, now just be  
17 example, by comparison, this is the new Mayor's  
18 Management Report, the new interactive site, just  
19 launched last week, very exciting. It's exciting  
20 if you're a wonk like I am.

21 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Yes,  
22 congratulations.

23 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: It's exciting  
24 to me 'cause I deal in this stuff all the time.  
25 If you go to performance mapping report, and

1  
2 again, Council Member Koppell, I'll send your  
3 staff all this. You open up your little  
4 performance mapping, and what it's going to do is  
5 open up for you a map that will show you, actually  
6 on this one, it's probably easier to do in, it's  
7 probably easier to do ... in IE. Give me a  
8 second. [pause, background noise] And, now you  
9 know how to find it, as well. So you go to  
10 nyc.gov, okay, you go to MMR, you go to the  
11 website here. And what that's going to bring up  
12 for you is, it's just a browser, it's actually  
13 easier in IE to do this. You go to performance  
14 mapping. Okay. That will bring up for you a map,  
15 which will allow you to, you can, from here, what  
16 performance mapping means, you choose any  
17 indicator you want to see. So, these are all the  
18 indicators the City makes available, through  
19 what's called a Citywide Performance Reporting,  
20 which is monthly reporting that then populates the  
21 twice monthly MMR, which is the PMMR and the  
22 fiscal year. Scrolling down, of course, you can  
23 go to--sorry, the screen is a little narrow here--  
24 but scrolling down here, you can run to the Police  
25 Department, and there's any number of indicators

1  
2 that they have. So, for instance, crimes, related  
3 to domestic, murder, major felony, so for instance  
4 let's take major felony crime. That little globe.  
5 You click on it, and what that's going to open up  
6 for you is a map, by precinct, with all the  
7 particulars. So, if the technology cooperates,  
8 the map will load and you will see that  
9 information there.

10 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: There's a lot  
11 of clicking going on. [laughter]

12 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Well, I'm--

13 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: You know,  
14 most people are, two clicks--

15 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: I'm  
16 demonstrating for the benefit--

17 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: --two clicks,  
18 they tend to--

19 COLIN REILLY: Yeah, I'm not  
20 responsible for that interface.

21 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: [laughs]

22 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: [crosstalk]

23 For the benefit of the Committee, I'm just showing  
24 how to - -

25 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: [interposing]



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

But this, this does not show by street, right?

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: It doesn't show the streets [crosstalk]

COLIN REILLY: --aggregated, yes.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Yeah, but again, Chicago, and I don't think other cities actually--I don't know, I can't say - -

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: [interposing] Well, the one that I just saw from Chicago, it seemed to me, I saw streets there, I mean, it seems clear. It doesn't say that--doesn't list the address, right, but it has the street, the blocks.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: I think it, I don't know.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: I mean, I just saw--

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Yeah, well, the little--

COLIN REILLY: --aggregating to a center point of each one of those geographic areas. It's sort of giving you the illusion of being the actual points.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: It's not

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

giving, it's not giving--

COLIN REILLY: It's not.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: --it's not giving addresses.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Okay.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Yeah, well we'll bring it back up here.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: But the street, the overall area, so if I say, like Perry Avenue, for me it might be Davison Avenue, around, you know, between two blocks, a two block area, let's see what we have here.

[crosstalk]

COLIN REILLY: And if you wanted to, you could aggregate it at the block, right, so if a crime happened at--

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: You see, you see the corners, I mean, it seems very obvious that they're going for a block.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Yeah, Colin made the right point.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And - -

COLIN REILLY: [interposing] You notice each one of those points are at the center-

1

2 -

3 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: It'll go right  
4 the middle.

5 COLIN REILLY: - - those polygons,  
6 that they're sort of faking it. They're making it  
7 look like it's an actual location where crime is  
8 happening, and it's actually just an aggregate of  
9 all those crimes at the center of that geographic  
10 area.

11 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: So you're able  
12 to get the sense of what the activity there is,  
13 without giving an address.

14 COLIN REILLY: It's the illusion of  
15 accuracy.

16 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Okay. So--

17 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: His words, not  
18 mine.

19 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: --if I hear  
20 you right, can you--

21 COLIN REILLY: This is Chicago, not  
22 New York.

23 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: --can you go  
24 back, can you go back a little bit?

25 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Oh, sure, sure,

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

sure, sure, sure.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: So, for example, at 113 over there, corner of West Lake Street, and I can't read the other one because I'm getting to be like Koppell, Councilman Koppell, I'm with you, I feel your pain, and [laughter] but that corner right there, so what I hear you saying is that, and I'd be interested to give them a call, too, so we can accurately know if this is what's going on, that they're not specifically addressing that corner?

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Correct.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And they are addressing what then? See, to me, you see that--

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Well, I mean--

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: --you see that, those, that purple--

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: --perimeter? I think that's what they're addressing, that somewhere in that area, in that purple--

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Yeah, there's 113--within that area, there's 113 in--whatever incident it is.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Okay.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: I don't know what incident this is measuring, but I think that's, I think, and again, I don't want to speak for Chicago, I think that's - -

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: But we're not there.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Doesn't mean that there's 113 at that corner.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Yeah, not here, but within a block-and-a-half.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Whatever precinct, yeah, that's [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: That little-- that's just a corner, I mean, that's just a block-and-a-half that I see there.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Right? You had that--

COLIN REILLY: Could be their unit of dispatching, you know, beats or something like that.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: I don't know, I don't know what those numbers mean, but--

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COLIN REILLY: Sectors, they're different, yeah.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: But we know there's a lot of activity, and we could tell by colors one versus 229, that--

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: I don't know, yeah, I don't know how it aligns, I don't know how this might align with the what a precinct is. I don't know if this is at the same level or lower. Chicago, I guess, has wards or beat, or whatever area it is, I don't know what they call it.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: So, it would follow that it would make sense for us to first look at what everybody else is doing, so we don't have to reinvent the wheel, possibly. We don't have to reinvent the wheel.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Right, and I think that will be helped by also, I think, again, and I'm sorry if the map is not coming up here, even though I tried, this is not any reflection on Colin, who did a great job, of course, getting this. The map isn't coming up, but I think it would also be helpful to look at the map we have. I don't know if you're familiar with it, but it

1  
2 has at the precinct level. And again, I don't  
3 know more than that, but right now, there are - -

4 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: [interposing]

5 Yeah, we need one at the precinct level. Look, I  
6 have the 52nd Precinct, Council Member Koppell is  
7 very familiar with the 52. It's huge! It doesn't  
8 tell me anything. It tells me, you know, it  
9 covers such a vast area, that I can't do anything  
10 with that information. It's useless. And so,  
11 that's the whole point of this intro, is to  
12 actually do some--we need, the whole, the reas--if  
13 the Police Department needs that information, why  
14 wouldn't the nonprofits and everybody else that  
15 wants to do something for the community, community  
16 boards need to make decisions, Council Members  
17 need to make decisions, as to where the resources  
18 are going to go. The community needs to know the  
19 resources the Council Members are putting in,  
20 going to the right place. You know, that's one of  
21 the complaints we hear sometimes. "Oh, you put it  
22 all in this section of the Council, yet all the  
23 crimes are on this side." Well, how do I know  
24 that? You know, how are we going to make informed  
25 decision if we don't have the data and the

1  
2 information? And do it in a transparent way. And  
3 I'm with you, regarding the issue of specific  
4 addresses. I don't think anybody is asking for  
5 that, at this point. Or you know, that's not the  
6 intention. The intention is to know where the hot  
7 spots are at. And so if I know something's  
8 happening--I really like, actually, Chicago model,  
9 if indeed there's a hot spot and you see the  
10 perimeter there, it shows me that within that  
11 block-and-a-half, there's something going on  
12 there, and we need to put the resources there,  
13 that will make sense to me. I wanted to ask you,  
14 will DoITT do this work itself, or would it  
15 contract with an outside company or agency?

16 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: So we have  
17 Colin's staff that does, leading the work in terms  
18 of building--you want to answer? Thank you.

19 COLIN REILLY: Sure, we could do  
20 this in-house. Yep.

21 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And  
22 realistically, I know you mentioned in your  
23 testimony that you didn't know if the 100 days was  
24 a sufficient amount of time. What would be a  
25 sufficient amount of time? To build it up?



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: I think

[crosstalk]

COLIN REILLY: Yeah, I mean, the--  
really, the long - - intent is to get the data  
from NYPD. So, from that point, 180 days, but if  
it takes them 160 days to get us the data, then  
it's a problem, right?

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: So, what  
takes you time is--[crosstalk] Let me ask the  
question first, so you can--let me ask the  
question, so you can properly answer it. So the  
question is, Is it a problem of building it or is  
it a problem inputting the information?

COLIN REILLY: Well, you build it--

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Because  
you're going to have to build it--

COLIN REILLY: --based on the data  
that you have, right? So, you need to have the  
data to start building the application. And if it  
takes a long period of time to get that data, you  
can't start building stuff. So you need  
requirements.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Yeah, you need  
to know what you're building to. So, generally

1  
2 speaking, yes, I mean, we're a technology agency,  
3 so I don't want to give the impression it's going  
4 to take us an undue amount of time. Six months  
5 development time should be enough, but that's from  
6 the point at which we have everything we need to  
7 start building. And that would be obviously the  
8 data that we need to start building to.

9 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: So the key  
10 here is to get the NYPD to get you the data, so  
11 that it's possible, so that you know how--the one  
12 month getting the information updated, with the  
13 latest once a month, how do you feel about that?

14 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Again, I mean,  
15 you know, we have information here, so this, the  
16 311 map here is updated every day. The frequency  
17 of the updates, within reason, is probably--no,  
18 never mind us, I think we can update it, we have  
19 the raw data feeds on NYC--on open data, and  
20 again, I show this only because I'm so proud of  
21 it, I think we do great work, as well I should.  
22 But if you go to [nyc.gov/data](http://nyc.gov/data), this is our NYC Op-  
23 -if I could type, that would also be helpful--NYC  
24 Open Data portal. This is, these are raw data  
25 feeds from agencies across the City, you'll look

1  
2 here, for instance, 311 service request from 2010  
3 to the present, what--this is refreshed every  
4 night, and you will have the exact records of the  
5 311 complaints that come in every day with the  
6 agency, the descriptor, the location, the cross  
7 street, etc. Now, this is very, very specific,  
8 because again it's not crime information. But in  
9 terms of updating it, it's not an issue to us to  
10 update it when we get it. That said, it's really  
11 not also to point a finger at the Police  
12 Department, we would need this for any agency.  
13 So, if we were building a map for the City  
14 Council, or any other agency across the City, it's  
15 just a matter of getting the data and working  
16 through what that agency, the business need and  
17 the requirements to get the map up.

18 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: I'm asking -  
19 - 'cause I have some, no knowledge about this.  
20 When NYPD gives you the information, is there  
21 somebody that has to input this information? Or  
22 do you already have the ability to be able to  
23 bring that, you know, through some kind of a  
24 command, that you transfer, it knows where to go  
25 automatically.

1  
2 COLIN REILLY: Yeah, so, in the  
3 case of the 311 service request map, that's  
4 pulling the data from a data warehouse, which is  
5 an automated procedure of loading that data on a  
6 nightly basis, into a data warehouse, and then  
7 it's retrieving that in an automatic fashion.

8 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And so, we  
9 would--

10 COLIN REILLY: Dynamically. So, we  
11 would want something similar set up with--

12 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Very good.

13 COLIN REILLY: --the Police  
14 Department, where there's no manual intervention.  
15 Right? You'd want it a live feed, you'd want to  
16 dynamically retrieve that data and render it.

17 [crosstalk]

18 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: That's very  
19 good, I would love to see that happen, and we're  
20 going to encourage the NYPD to make your job  
21 easier and efficient, 'cause it's really about  
22 efficiency, and it's going to save us money. I  
23 mean, at the end of the day, they are, that's the  
24 bottom line. Now, will visitor have to, to the  
25 website, will they have to log on? Or input any

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

personal information? Or they can just go through like the one we saw in Chicago--

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: It shouldn't--

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Will there be any disclaimers, also, as well?

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: No, I--well, those are two separate questions there. They shouldn't have to--shouldn't have to sign in or create an account or log in to use it, this is on the open internet. All the sites I've demo'd today, from City Map, to Street Closures, to 311 complaints to CPR, to Chicago's, obviously, to ours, this is all open to the public, there's no registration requirement. In certain instances, when you're using open data, so, for instance, this is a good site, when you're downloading data, and going to a particular data set, there sometimes will be disclaimers basically letting you know that once the data leaves the site, that the City is not responsible for what you do with it. Which I think frankly is a concern for many agencies, which is once we open up the data, there's always that inherent, I guess not risk, there's always that consideration that needs to be

1  
2 had, that once we open it up, anybody can do  
3 anything with it, it's obviously incumbent upon  
4 the party, if they want to be a responsible party,  
5 to put it in context. Once the data is raw, it's  
6 just that. What we've found, and this is just my  
7 experience anecdotally, most people are respectful  
8 of that, they want the data, and they want to do  
9 the right things with it. But there is always the  
10 chance that someone can get data, and then just do  
11 whatever it is with it. Imagine, for instance, if  
12 someone were able to access your files and change  
13 letters you've written to people just because they  
14 could. I think there is that element. So, there  
15 will be disclaimers in that case that we basically  
16 say, "Once the data leaves the site, the City's no  
17 longer responsible for it. Nor is the City  
18 responsible for anything you might do with that  
19 data." Once it leaves. Once you assume the  
20 responsibility to take it, and to download it.

21 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Where exactly  
22 would the website be? Working--where would people  
23 go to find this information?

24 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: I--

25 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Would it be

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

at the NYPD website? Would it be--?

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: I think it, it really kind of really depends on, I don't know how we want to have it. What I imagine it now, and again we're very preliminary here, but I can imagine something similar to--I shouldn't have X'd out of that, but I'll bring that back up. So, City Map here, this has all layers on it, I would imagine that you might have though is, like I said before there's other map themes. You might be able to link to it from there. And again, I don't know, I'm just saying hypothetically you might be able - -

COLIN REILLY: [interposing] That you can link to it from nyc.gov, NYPD--you could link to it from multiple.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: You can link to it multiple places, and then if you're on a map, for instance, City Map, which gets a lot of usage, you can also have it linked out here, that from this map you can go to other map themes and click out to scout, for instance, or any other of these maps, that would there. So, that might just be a list there. So when you open this list, you may

1  
2 see something like, you know, NYC Parks, and it  
3 might say, "NYPD Crime Mapping." Depends on where  
4 that would reside.

5 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Have you  
6 spoken to the NYPD about this intro? And if you  
7 did, did they share any concerns or suggestions or  
8 were they happy? If you could just share whatever  
9 you can share.

10 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Well, I mean,  
11 we work with the Police Department regularly. I  
12 mean, like, it's a great organization, I get a lot  
13 of interaction with them. I don't know their  
14 position on the bill. Probably is not best for me  
15 to say it. But I'm sure the Police Department can  
16 answer. But, again, just like with any other  
17 agency, we're partners, happy to work with them to  
18 support their needs, business needs, whether it's  
19 towards legislation or anything else, as we always  
20 do.

21 [pause, background noise]

22 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Let me ask  
23 you this question. How, in the future, do--based  
24 on the way you see technology developing, what is,  
25 what do you see--this is going to be built two



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

years from now, and I'm sure you're looking as to the new technology, new ways to present information. How do you see potentially how we could responsibly show the data and the information and where these incidents are taking place?

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: I mean, it's a good question. This stuff is evolving every day, as we know. It's, you know, it's a very iterative process. I got back to kind of the things I'm experiencing and I know, again, going through the process of drafting the open data bill. And that was arduous, it was long, it was, for a while I thought it was the worst thing I'd ever seen. Now, I love it, it was, it's a great accomplishment, I think, from Mayor Bloomberg. And for the Council to get this in place, to compel not just mayoral agencies, but City agencies across the board, elected officials, community boards, etc., to kind of open up their vast treasure troves of data. It's easy to say that, though, sure, open data, open data. The devil, as always, is in the details, when you kind of really have to roll up your sleeves and go

1  
2 through multitudinous data sets that we might not  
3 even have a handle on how many there are. And go  
4 through and start saying, "Okay, well, this data  
5 set can be included, this data set can't. Why  
6 can't it? If we think it can one day, when do we  
7 think it can be?" How do we roll up our sleeves  
8 and go through it? And so it's very iterative. I  
9 don't think the stuff is going to happen  
10 overnight. But it's, that kind of that steady  
11 process of putting markers in place to know that  
12 by a certain date we want to have, we want to have  
13 this stuff open, and you proceed that way. Crime  
14 data, of course, is a separate animal altogether,  
15 because a lot of that is not necessarily public  
16 data because there is a personal component  
17 associated with it. So that just gives you  
18 another level of I think care and concern you have  
19 to take. So--I don't - -

20 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: [interposing]  
21 In your experience, is there a category that  
22 should not be listed?

23 NICHOLAS SBORDONE: I would--

24 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: A category of  
25 crime.

1  
2                   NICHOLAS SBORDONE: I'm probably  
3 not qualified to say that. I mean, I can speak  
4 personally, I don't know that I would want, my  
5 house was robbed, to be a dot on a map. Right?  
6 It's almost kind of funny, we're so immersed in  
7 data and data is by and large gridded, it helps us  
8 make decisions, the Mayor himself always says, "In  
9 God we trust, every else bring data," which I  
10 think is magnificent. That's how you make  
11 decisions, you can be as anecdotal as you want,  
12 but at the end of the day you need hard data.  
13 That said, the other side of it is, you always see  
14 people say, "I don't want to just be a statistic."  
15 So I don't know that if I were the victim of a  
16 crime, I would necessarily want to be a dot on a  
17 map that people can then say, "Oh, look, this guy  
18 was robbed," or "This neighborhood is, it's a lost  
19 cause, there's so much crime. We're not going to  
20 invest here. We're not going to try and bring new  
21 businesses, it's just it's crime ridden, forget  
22 about it." Now, generally speaking, the crime  
23 rates in the City have gone down to record lows  
24 and continue to go down. That's due to the great  
25 work of the Police Department. But I don't know,

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

that's just my personal opinion. As far as policy decisions, it's probably not for the technology agency to say.

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: I just want to say, I thought that was a fascinating presentation. [laughter] I just want to be clear about that. I apologize, I was stuck in traffic on the BQE, it was an accident.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: No problem.

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: And I'm sure it was the best testimony we've ever had and thank you Mr. Chairman for asking questions.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: [laughs]  
Well, I want to thank both of you for coming, it was very informative. We welcome any suggestions and also I would love to speak to you regarding the language that's going to go forth, so there is clarity. And your point is definitely well taken that you mentioned at the beginning. So, thank you so much.

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Are there no other panels?

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: I lost my

1

2 breath.

3

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Well, thank

4

you so much.

5

NICHOLAS SBORDONE: Okay, thank

6

you, guys.

7

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: All right.

8

[gavel] Have a good--

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, JOHN DAVID TONG certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "John David Tong". The signature is written in black ink and is positioned to the right of the printed word "Signature".

Date March 18, 2013