CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

----X

December 10, 2012 Start: 1:54 p.m. Recess: 3:14 p.m.

HELD AT:

Council Chambers

City Hall

B E F O R E:

LEROY G. COMRIE, JR. President Pro Tempore

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Maria del Carmen Arroyo
Charles Barron
Gale A. Brewer
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret Chin
Elizabeth Crowley
Inez E. Dickens
Erik Martin Dilan
Daniel Dromm
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras

Daniel R. Garodnick

Lewis A. Fidler

APPEARANCES

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

James F. Gennaro Vincent J. Gentile Sara M. Gonzalez David Greenfield Daniel J. Halloran Vincent Ignizio Robert Jackson Letitia James Peter Koo G. Oliver Koppell Karen Koslowitz Brad Lander Jessica S. Lappin Stephen Levin Melissa Mark-Viverito Darlene Mealy Rosie Mendez Michael C. Nelson James S. Oddo Annabel Palma Christine C. Quinn Domenic M. Recchia, Jr. Diana Reyna Joel Rivera Ydanis Rodriguez Eric Ulrich Peter F. Vallone, Jr. James G. Van Bramer Albert Vann Mark Weprin Jumaane D. Williams Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Larry DePrimo Officer NYPD

Ivan Marcano Detective NYPD

Donia Waldman

Reverend Duane Sleet Pastor First Baptist Church of Far Rockaway

	SPEAKER	QUINN:	Get	the	ceremoni	lals
started, w	we have three	today.	And	the	first on	ne
	SERGEAN	Γ-AT-ARMS	S: Ç	Quiet	t, please	÷ .

SPEAKER QUINN: Let's move Office
DePrimo over here for a second. Oh, so you're
going to be in the middle right over here. Right
on that black thing or whatever it is that were
there, okay. Want a couple folks just go on the
other side just so we balance out a little bit.
Great, thank you, Peter.

Jessica, why don't you come on?

Jessica and Ydanis come on up and Annabel.

Well we're here today 'cause we wanted to take a moment to thank Police Officer
Larry DePrimo for what he did a little bit ago on the streets of New York City. Officer DePrimo is a member of the 6th Precinct, which I've said before is my favorite precinct in the city of New York, in Greenwich Village, the best precinct.

And I think we all have now--or most of us now have heard and seen this story, seen the picture. This police officer, doing his work, protecting

New York City residents went out of his way when he saw a homeless person, a homeless man with no

shoes on, took money out of his pocket--and we all know how much police officers make, and it ain't that much, but let's not go there now--and went and bought a really nice pair of boots for this homeless person. I assume 'cause he didn't want to go home at night and put his head down in a warm bed and know that that man was going to sleep all night with his feet freezing.

It was a very simple gesture, but it was an enormously kind gesture that has caused, as I just said to the officer, a ripple effect in this city. Conversation after conversation that I have heard of individuals reminded that we need to be generous, reminded that we need to see our city as a bigger community, and reminded that we need to stop walking down the street not noticing each other, or even worse, looking away sometimes from the people we think we don't want to see.

You, instead, Officer, saw in that person, that homeless man, not a nuisance, not a vagrant, not a bum, you saw somebody who needed help and you went out of your way and you gave them help. And you not just helped him, you helped our entire city post-Sandy at a time we

б

needed to be reminded of the power of helping each
other. And that is not something they taught you
at the academy, it's not something you learn in a
roll call training, it's just something you have
ingide of you

So I just want to thank you. You are clearly exactly the kind of person we want to be on the NYPD, exactly the kind of New Yorker we need more of. And, you know, I don't know why we all walk by people sometimes and don't do what you did, but you did it, and you've raised the bar about what it means to be a member of the NYPD and what it means to be a New Yorker, so on behalf of all of us, thank you so much.

[Applause]

SPEAKER QUINN: And if I could ask the clerk to please read the proclamation.

COUNCIL CLERK: Council, City of New York Proclamation.

WHEREAS, the Council of the City of
New York is proud to honor NYPD Officer Larry
DePrimo, whose selfless generosity has inspired
countless people to act upon their own spirit of
compassion; and,

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2. WHEREAS, on one freezing night in 3

mid-November, Officer DePrimo, a two-year veteran of the NYPD, was working a counterterrorism post in Times Square when he saw an older barefoot man huddled on the sidewalk who appeared to be homeless and shivering. Seeing the large blisters on the man's bare feet, Officer DePrimo approached him and asked him if he wanted a pair of socks, then went into the shoe store nearby and returned not only with a pair of thermal socks, but also a pair of \$75 insulated winter boots; and,

WHEREAS, while Officer DePrimo helped the man put them on his feet, a passerby said later the man's face lit up like it was Christmas and he had just been given literally \$1 million. His simple act of kindness would have gone unnoticed and mostly forgotten, but that passerby, Jennifer Foster, photographed the moment on her cell phone. Ms. Foster, the director of Public Safety Communications at a county sheriff's office in Arizona and the daughter of a Phoenix police department officer, is no stranger to the everyday courage of law enforcement, but she was very moved by Officer DePrimo's generosity and

2	shared the photograph with the NYPD; and,
3	WHEREAS, when the NYPD posted the
4	photo on its Facebook page, it garnered hundreds
5	of thousands of comments and went viral online and
6	through news outlets. A simple image of a police
7	officer providing warmth to a stranger on the
8	street warmed hearts around the world; and,
9	WHEREAS, Officer DePrimo did not
LO	seek the spotlight for his charity, but it is a
11	privilege to publicly pay tribute to him on this
12	occasion for he has reminded everyone of the
13	character and caliber of individuals who make up
L4	the NYPD, the greatest law enforcement department
15	in America. He is truly one of New York City's
L6	finest.
L7	NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT KNOWN that
L8	the Council of the City of New York gratefully
L9	honors NYPD Officer Larry DePrimo for his
20	inspiring compassion and outstanding service to
21	his fellow New Yorkers.
22	Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for the
23	entire Council.
24	[Applause]

SPEAKER QUINN: --say a few words?

1	STATED MEETING 9
2	LARRY DEPRIMO: Thank you so much.
3	SPEAKER QUINN: You're very
4	welcome. Would you like to say a few words?
5	LARRY DEPRIMO: Sure.
6	SPEAKER QUINN: I'll hold that for
7	you.
8	LARRY DEPRIMO: Thank you for
9	having me, it's absolutely, it's such an honor to
10	be in this room and with all these people here
11	standing next to me.
12	I just wanted to say, you know,
13	thank you, everybody, for their support and this
14	has been such an unreal moment in my life. And,
15	you know, again, I just really hope that this
16	inspires people to go out there and help other
17	people in such a hard time for our country and New
18	York state.
19	[Applause]
20	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. You're
21	terrific, thank you.
22	LARRY DEPRIMO: Thank you.
23	SPEAKER QUINN: Be safe. Thank you
24	very much, and you be safe. Happy Holidays to you

and--

1	STATED MEETING 10
2	[crosstalk]
3	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:parents,
4	are those your parents, those your parents?
5	LARRY DEPRIMO: No, my parents
6	[Crosstalk]
7	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: You gave
8	credit to them for
9	LARRY DEPRIMO: [Interposing]
10	Absolutely, my parents and grandparents are the
11	biggest inspirations.
12	[Crosstalk]
13	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you.
14	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, wish
15	them a Happy Holidays for us, Officer. You be
16	safe, thank you very much.
17	And our second ceremonial today is
18	keeping on the theme of great police officers is
19	going to be led by Council Member Fernando
20	Cabrera. Is Council Member Cabrera here?
21	MALE VOICE: Yes.
22	SPEAKER QUINN: Oh, great, there he
23	is, sorry, I didn't see you. And it is
24	recognizing NYPD Detective Ivan Marcano, who was
25	shot while off duty, didn't have to do it, while

he was trying to stop a mugger. So if Detective
Marcano and anyone he has with him could please
come up, and let me turn the mic over to Council
Member Cabrera, and thank him for bringing this
detective to us today so we can thank him

SO MUCH, Madam Speaker. We're here to recognize a true hero from the Bronx, a true hero from the Bronx, and he's here with his wonderful family and his very brave girlfriend, who was part of the pursuit and going after those who were trying to commit a robbery in the Bronx. He put his life on the line, he was shot after he identified himself as a police officer, and then pursue three—the three people who were involved in the crime, and he was able to really go and triumph on that day and protect our neighborhood. You're truly a role model for our young people, thank you so much for really putting your life on the line and bringing the best of the Bronx.

The clerk at this moment will be reading the proclamation.

COUNCIL CLERK: Council, City of New York, Proclamation.

			-	Гhе	Cour	ncil	of	the	City	of	New	York
is	proud	to	hon	or	Ivan	Mar	cano	o in	reco	gni	tion	of
his	cour	ageo	ous	ser	vice	and	out	staı	nding	de	dica	tion
to	the co	ommı	ınit [.]	у;	and,							

WHEREAS, Ivan Marcano is one of the thousands of tireless NYPD officers who protect and serve our city with professionalism and selflessness, yet he has distinguished himself by going above and beyond the call of duty.

While off-duty really means offduty to many people, this Bronx native has proven that his dedication to our city and its residents remain uncompromised long after the end of his shift; and,

while off-duty, Officer Marcano risked his own life to protect the life of a citizen in need. He was with his girlfriend in her car when they witnessed two armed assailants attempting to rob a helpless man and he immediately leapt into action. After identifying himself as a police officer, one of the suspects fired at him, hitting him in the chest. The bullet barely missed his vital organs. The two gunmen jumped in a car driven by a third

б

2 person and sped off.

Incredibly, despite his wound,

Officer Marcano climbed back into his girlfriend's

car and, with her at the wheel, pursued the three

suspects in a harrowing chase until the getaway

car crashed and they fled on foot. With one hand

applying pressure to his own wound, Officer

Marcano fired at them, taking down one of the

assailants. While following the others, he came

across an ambulance which took him to the

hospital. The getaway driver was arrested later

that night and the other robber turned himself in;

and,

WHEREAS, shortly after the incident, at a cozy ceremony at Officer Marcano's bedside in Bronx Lebanon Hospital Center, the New York City Police Department rewarded him for his bravery, marksmanship, and calm under pressure with a promotion to detective.

[Applause]

COUNCIL CLERK: And, WHEREAS,

Detective Marcano's quick thinking action is

another reminder that great risks that members of

the NYPD confront in their daily lives, both on

and off duty, the courageous men and women put
their lives on the line and protect our own, and
they have all earned our deepest respect for their
service. Whether on or off duty, Detective
Marcano is truly one of New York City's finest.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT KNOWN, that the Council of the City of New York gratefully honors Detective Ivan Marcano for his lifesaving heroism on October 24th, 2012.

Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for the entire Council; Fernando Cabrera, Council Member, 14th District, the Bronx.

[Applause]

SPEAKER QUINN: Detective, that is really an unbelievable story. I mean, it's like on of those things you see, you know, on Law & Order or something like that and think, that couldn't really happen. But I just want to thank you. I mean, you were off-duty, you didn't have to do what you did, and you clearly put your life on the line, literally continuing to chase a bad guy putting just your hand over your wound. So I wish there was more we could do than just give you a detective shield, but we just want to say thank

2	you so very much for being so incredibly,
3	incredibly selfless and so dedicated to this city.
4	And thank you for bringing us such
5	a pretty little girl today in such a beautiful
6	party dress, you're making us allwow. So thank
7	you very much, Detective, and would you like to
8	say a few words?
9	DETECTIVE IVAN MARCANO: I just
10	want to say thank you to everybodymy family, my
11	co-workers, the cityfor the support, it's
12	tremendous. And it helped put me throughor
13	helped me get through this and thank you guys
14	also.
15	[Applause]
16	SPEAKER QUINN: And you're all
17	well, you're all better? Thank you guys, Happy
18	Holidays to all of you, be well and be safe.
19	Thank you, Detective.
20	Okay. And then we have one more
21	ceremonial. Council Member Levin and Council
22	Member Rodriguez, who
23	[Off mic]
24	SPEAKER QUINN: Council Member
25	Levin and Council Member Rodriguez and we are

2	going to remember the late Elana Waldman, a
3	beloved teacher who tragically passed away from
4	breast cancer at the very early age of 45. So if
5	whoever is here for that ceremonial could join us.
6	Why don't you go over there, Steve, in the middle?
7	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you,
8	Madam Speaker. We are here to honor Elana
9	Waldman, who tragically passed away earlier this
LO	year after a long battle with breast cancer.
11	SPEAKER QUINN: Why don't you guys
12	step up a little bit? Come on, everybody just
L3	you could line up over here.
L4	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Elana was a
L5	dedicated
L6	SPEAKER QUINN: [Interposing] What
L7	pretty girls.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I know. And
L9	we're joined by her family and colleagues and
20	friends and her principal at I.S. 52 in Inwood,
21	whome she had made her home error the last eight
	where she had made her home over the last eight
22	years. She touched my office through family,
22	
	years. She touched my office through family,

2	she described as a red-headed firecracker, which
3	is well-known to this chamber.
4	DONIA WALDMAN: Elana was
5	headstrong and many other words that you normally
6	associate with redheads. She was tough, she was
7	tough on her students, but she cared about them.
8	The kids were really what she was always about.
9	She would go above and beyond, she would buy prom
10	dresses for her kids, she would visit some and at
11	least one in who was struggling in juvenile
12	detention. She went above and beyond, she
13	arranged for me and for anybody who had any
14	interesting job to come in and do an assembly to
15	teach the kids that there are many, many things
16	out there, many possibilities. She lived for
17	those children and they knew it and they loved
18	her, and her whole school just loved her. And we
19	appreciate it and we appreciate this honor. Thank
20	you so much.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Could we
22	have the clerk read the roll, please?
23	COUNCIL CLERK: Council, City of
24	New York Proclamation.

WHEREAS, the Council of the City of

б

New York is proud to posthumously honor E	lana
Waldman for her outstanding service and	
contributions as a New York City public so	chool
teacher; and,	

WHEREAS, Elana Waldman was born in Brooklyn on May 27th, 1967. Although she and her family moved to Nebraska for five years, they returned to New York and settled in Jackson Heights, Queens. There, she attended a Jewish primary school before graduating from a Jewish high school in Manhattan and earning a Bachelors of Arts degree in English literature from Queens College in 1989.

Eventually, she found her true calling when she became an assistant teacher in March 2003 and worked for Goodwill Industries teaching Adult Basic Education and English as a Second Language. One year later, with her passion for education fully ignited, she entered the Pace Teaching Fellows Program, where she earned her MS in Secondary Education; and,

WHEREAS, Ms. Waldman began teaching seventh and eighth graders at I.S. 52 in Inwood. From the start, she was known for always being

б

ahead of the curve as a teacher. She always tried
innovative techniques before they were required or
became commonplace. For example, she created a
teacher portfolio, a collection of her work and
her students' work throughout the school year that
invited reflection and helped identify success, as
well as areas for improvement. She also
integrated units of study to deepen her students'
understanding of a subject and pushed them to
higher levels of learning.

As a founding member of the I.S. 52 Inquiry Team, she helped her colleagues learn to analyze student data and use such information to drive teaching and learning in their classrooms; and,

WHEREAS, Ms. Waldman understood that quality education involves not only books, facts, and homework assignments, education also concerns the building of character. Her colleagues and friends say that her most important contributions as an educator cannot be measured by looking at test scores or data, her greatest contribution to teaching was, quite simply, her; and,

2	WHEREAS, on August 24th, 2012, at
3	the age of 45, Ms. Waldman passed away after
4	battling breast cancer for several years. Though
5	the disease may have ended her life, it will never
6	erase the profoundly positive impact she has had
7	in the lives of her students, colleagues, friends,
8	and family.
9	NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT KNOWN that
10	the Council of the City of New York proudly honors
11	the life and memory of Elana Waldman for her
12	enduring contributions to New York City public
13	schools.
14	Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for the
15	entire Council; Stephen Levin, Council Member,
16	33rd District, Brooklyn; Ydanis Rodriguez, Council
17	Member, 10th District, Manhattan.
18	[Applause]
19	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I'd also
20	like to thank her sister, Donia [phonetic], for
21	being here as well, thank you.
22	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you all for
23	coming, I know these are things are nice, but
24	often not easy on the family and so we just really

2	inspiring us to make sure we're all more focused
3	on our public schools and the children of New York
4	City. So thank you guys and we wish you the best
5	holiday season you can possibly have. Thank you,
6	take care.
7	[Long pause]
8	SPEAKER QUINN: Well with three
9	lovely stories of great New Yorkers who are all
10	terrific public servants and gave so much to us,
11	this concludes today's ceremonials. And also with
12	some beautiful additions, who made our chambers
13	much more fun today, so thank you, girls, for
14	being here. This concludes today's ceremonials.
15	[Long pause]
16	COUNCIL CLERK: Ladies and
17	gentlemen, could I have your attention, please?
18	Can I please have your attention? Quiet, please.
19	Quiet, please. At this time, please place all
20	cell phones and pagers to vibrate. Will all non-
21	Council employees please leave the main floor of
22	the chambers? Thank you.
23	[Pause]
24	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Pledge of
25	Allegiance.

1	STATED MEETING 22							
2	[Pause]							
3	MULTIPLE VOICES: I pledge							
4	allegiance to the flag of the United States of							
5	America and to the republic for which it stands,							
6	one nation under God, indivisible, with liberty							
7	and justice for all.							
8	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Roll call.							
9	[Pause]							
10	COUNCIL CLERK: Arroyo.							
11	[Pause]							
12	COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: [No							
13	response].							
14	COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.							
15	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Here.							
16	COUNCIL CLERK: Brewer.							
17	[Pause]							
18	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [No							
19	response].							
20	COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.							
21	COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.							
22	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.							
23	COUNCIL CLERK: Chin.							
24	COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.							
25	COUNCIL CLERK: Comrie.							

1	STATED MEETING				
2		COUNCIL	MEMBER	COMRIE: Here.	
3		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Crowley.	
4		COUNCIL	MEMBER	CROWLEY: Here.	
5		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Dickens.	
6		COUNCIL	MEMBER	DICKENS: Here.	
7		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Dilan.	
8		COUNCIL	MEMBER	DILAN: Here.	
9		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Dromm.	
10		COUNCIL	MEMBER	DROMM: Here.	
11		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Eugene.	
12		COUNCIL	MEMBER	EUGENE: Here.	
13		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Ferreras.	
14		COUNCIL	MEMBER	FERRERAS: Here.	
15		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Fidler.	
16		COUNCIL	MEMBER	FIDLER: Here.	
17		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Foster.	
18		[Pause]			
19		COUNCIL	MEMBER	FOSTER: [No	
20	response].				
21		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Garodnick.	
22		[Pause]			
23		COUNCIL	MEMBER	GARODNICK: [No	
24	response].				
25		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Gennaro.	

1		STATED MEETING	24
2		SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down,	
3	please.		
4		COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: [No	
5	response].		
6		COUNCIL CLERK: Gentile.	
7		COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.	
8		COUNCIL CLERK: Gonzalez.	
9		COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Here.	
10		COUNCIL CLERK: Greenfield.	
11		COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.	
12		COUNCIL CLERK: Halloran.	
13		COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: [No	
14	response].		
15		[Pause]	
16		COUNCIL CLERK: Ignizio.	
17		COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: [No	
18	response].		
19		[Pause]	
20		COUNCIL CLERK: Garodnick.	
21		COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.	
22		COUNCIL CLERK: Jackson.	
23		COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: [No	
24	response].		
25		[Pause]	

1		STATED MEETING	25
2		COUNCIL CLERK: James.	
3		COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Here.	
4		COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.	
5		COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.	
6		COUNCIL CLERK: Koppell.	
7		COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Here.	
8		COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.	
9		COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.	
10		COUNCIL CLERK: Lander.	
11		COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.	
12		COUNCIL CLERK: Lappin.	
13		COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Here.	
14		COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.	
15		COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.	
16		COUNCIL CLERK: Mark-Viverito.	
17		COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: [N	0
18	response].		
19		[Pause]	
20		COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy.	
21		COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [No	
22	response].		
23		[Pause]	
24		COUNCIL CLERK: Mendez.	
25		COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.	

1	STATED MEETING			
2	COUNCIL CLERK: Nelson.			
3	COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Here.			
4	COUNCIL CLERK: Palma.			
5	COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.			
6	COUNCIL CLERK: Recchia.			
7	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Here.			
8	COUNCIL CLERK: Reyna.			
9	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: [No			
10	response].			
11	[Pause]			
12	COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.			
13	COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here	€.		
14	COUNCIL CLERK: Rose.			
15	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [No			
16	response].			
17	[Pause]			
18	COUNCIL CLERK: Sanders.			
19	COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: [No			
20	response].			
21	[Pause]			
22	COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich.			
23	COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.			
24	COUNCIL CLERK: Vacca.			
25	COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [No			

1	STATED MEETING			
2	response].			
3	[Pat	ıse]		
4	COU	CIL CLERK:	Vallone.	
5	COUL	NCIL MEMBER	VALLONE: Here.	
6	COUL	CIL CLERK:	Van Bramer.	
7	COUL	CIL MEMBER	VAN BRAMER: Here.	
8	COUL	CIL CLERK:	Vann.	
9	COUL	NCIL MEMBER	VANN: [No	
10	response].			
11	[Pat	ıse]		
12	COUL	CIL CLERK:	Weprin.	
13	COUL	NCIL MEMBER	WEPRIN: [No	
14	response].			
15	[Pat	ıse]		
16	COUL	CIL CLERK:	Williams.	
17	COUL	NCIL MEMBER	WILLIAMS: Here.	
18	COUN	CIL CLERK:	Wills.	
19	COUN	ICIL MEMBER	WILLS: Here.	
20	[Pat	ıse]		
21	COUL	CIL CLERK:	Oddo.	
22	COUN	NCIL MEMBER	ODDO: [No	
23	response].			
24	[Pat	ıse]		
25	COUN	ICIL CLERK:	Rivera.	

of us who continue to struggle in the aftermath of

Superstorm Sandy and as we celebrate Advent,

24

25

24

25

2	Hanı	ukkah	, Kv	vanz	za,	or wh	atever	our	faith	tradit	ion
3	is,	help	us	to	see	your	favor	in	grace.	Amen.	

4 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Spread the 5 motion -- do the motion to spread the Invocation in full upon the record. I want to thank Rev. Duane 6 Sleet for the First Baptist Church of Far Rockaway. They're located right in the flood 9 zone, in fact, his church has been devastated, the basement of his church was devastated and flooded 10 11 out in the storm, but he has still since been 12 providing food and clothing and support for not 13 only his parishioners, but all of the members of 14 the Rockaways and during this difficult time, even 15 though his church is still under difficulty 16 because they have not been able to make the 17 repairs yet. There's still repairs underway as 18 they have to restore their basement where their 19 facilities were and many of their supplies were. 20 So I want to thank Rev. Duane Sleet for coming all 21 the way from the Rockaways today to deliver the invocation. Thank you. 22

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. And if I could ask my colleagues to remain standing and I want to also echo leader Comrie's thanks to the

б

Reverend.

On December 5th, 2012, Jon Kest, 57, the Executive Director of New York's

Communities for Change, and one of New York City's leading organizers and progressive community activists, passed away due to complications of cancer. The sad news of Jon's death is further compounded by the tragic loss of his daughter, Jessie, during Hurricane Sandy. Some of you may remember, she and her boyfriend were walking their dog and a tree fell on them and they were both killed.

Jon's devotion and dedication will be deeply missed by thousands and thousands and thousands of tenants, parents, low wage workers in communities who benefited from his tireless commitment to those in need. He was truly an advocate for so many without a voice. Jon's funeral was held yesterday at the UFT headquarters. Our thoughts and prayers go out to his wife, Fran, their son, Jake, to his parents, his siblings, his in-laws, and his nieces and nephews.

I also just want to take a moment

to--at the last Stated Meeting, I had to leave early, I mentioned to folks that my brother-in-law, who had been diagnosed with pancreatic cancer the day before our wedding in May, had taken a turn for the worse and last night he passed away at Sloan Kettering and I just wanted--before I vote and leave, to let folks know that I wanted to thank all of you for your incredible expressions of support, e-mails, calls, offers of help over the past 6 1/2 months and in particularly over the past two weeks. I more importantly want to thank all of you for the great kindness you showed Anthony when he was here with us on so many occasions.

Anthony grew up and was a gay man and was in New York in the seventies at a very different time when there never have been an openly gay Speaker or a Pride celebration in City Hall. So for him to come here in the city, a city he loved, and be so welcomed by so many elected officials of so much diverse background, you'll never know what that meant to him. They just were cleaning out his room and they opened up his drawers and found programs from our events and

2	news clippings of the events. And I want you all
3	to know how you made him happy by making him feel
4	so very much a part of New York City in a way he
5	never had until he got to be part of the wonderful
6	extended family of the New York City Council. So
7	thank you all.
8	I am going to vote aye on all, I'd
9	encourage you all to do that as well, 'cause even
10	though I'm not here, I will know. And see you all
11	later, thank you. I vote aye on all.
12	[Long pause]
13	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Adoption of
14	the Minutes. Council Member Levin is here.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Motion that
16	the Minutes of the Stated Meeting of November 13th
17	be adopted as printed.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Messages
19	and Papers from the Mayor?
20	COUNCIL CLERK: None.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:
22	Communication from City, County, and Borough
23	Offices?
24	COUNCIL CLERK: M 979,
25	Communication from the Kings County Democratic

1	STATED MEETING 33
2	County Committee, Julie
3	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA:
4	[Interposing] Rules, Privileges, and Elections.
5	COUNCIL CLERK: M 980,
6	Communication from the New York City Districting
7	Commission withdrawing M 945.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Received,
9	Ordered, Printed, and Filed.
10	COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered M
11	981, Communication from the Office of Management
12	and Budget, MN-1.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Finance.
14	COUNCIL CLERK: M 982 through M
15	1001 on page four, Approval of New, Renewal, and
16	Relocation Base Stations.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA:
18	Transportation.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Petitions
20	and Communications.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: None.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Land Use
23	Call-Ups?
24	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: None.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:

Council Member Garodnick, who is the sponsor of

the bill, who will be speaking on the item.

24

25

today.

2	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank
3	you very much. I want to thank you, Mr. Majority
4	Leader, Speaker Quinn, Chair Dilan, for moving the
5	Recycling Space bill. The Council has passed
6	important environmental legislation over the past
7	number of years from the Greater Greener Buildings
8	package to individual pieces of legislation, like

the Recycling Space bill that we're going to pass

As we pledge to reduce the city's greenhouse gases 30% by the year 2030, it became clear that the Council needed to focus on policies that both upgraded existing buildings and created better standards for new construction. This legislation joins the list of commonsense--with copyright citation to David Greenfield here--changes that we have made to encourage a sustainable city. By requiring better, more accessible recycling space on every floor of larger, new multi-family residential buildings, just as we require space for garbage, we hope to make the act of recycling as built into our daily routines as brushing our teeth is in the morning.

As policy makers, we need to do

2	everything we can to encourage recycling, as New
3	York City's rates lag far behind other cities.
4	Last year, the proportion of waste that we recycle
5	was 15%, compared to cities like Seattle, 54%, and
6	San Francisco, 77%.
7	[Crosstalk]
8	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay. All
9	right.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: So this
11	legislation couldn't come at a better time and we
12	need to do more to make recycling as accessible as
13	possible to meet the city's goal as part of PlaNYC
14	of doubling the amount of waste that we can divert
15	from landfills by 2017, this will help us get
16	there.
17	When this legislation takes effect
18	on January 1, 2014, it will be even easier for New
19	Yorkers to make smart decisions. By placing
20	recycling bins right next to our garbage

When this legislation takes effect on January 1, 2014, it will be even easier for New Yorkers to make smart decisions. By placing recycling bins right next to our garbage containers, there will be a daily reminder to recycle. This is an important next step in protecting our environment and I encourage my colleagues to join me in support of 575-A. Thank you.

very much, Councilman Garodnick. We also want to thank the chair of the Committee, Council Member Dilan, for his support on this measure and we also want to thank the staff, Jeff Baker, Laura Rogers, and Jarret Hova as well for their hard work on this particular item.

We now move on to the Finance vote on today's agenda. We have a couple of items there, Intro 926, Intro 958-A, and Preconsidered Intro 979. On Intro 926, we're going to have the sponsor of the bill, Council Member Lappin, say a few words.

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Thank you. I just wanted to remind the Council that we at first initiated this biotech tax credit back in 2009, and the reason we are here today renewing it, and I ask for your support to renew it, is because that it has been very successful in keeping small businesses here in the city and enabling us to compete with other cities across the country. And given that we do have 9 world-class research institutions, 26 medical centers, and 175 hospitals in this city, and really an

25

2	unparalleled talent pool, it's important for us to
3	keep the businesses and the products that spin out
4	from those institutions here employing people in
5	New York.
6	So I wanted to thank the Speaker
7	and the Finance chair for their support, and urge
8	you all to vote in favor of it today.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Okay.
10	Thank you very much, Council Member. We also want
11	to thank the chair of the committee, Council
12	Member Domenic Recchia, for his hard work on these
13	bills, as well as the staff, Ray Majewski, Paul
14	Sturm, Emre Edev, and Tanisha Edwards for their
15	hard work.
16	Next, we're going to be talking
17	about Intro 958-A. We have Council Member Oddo,
18	who will be speaking on this item, and also Intro
19	979.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Thank you.
21	If I could just real quickly address one other
22	item. Last Stated Meeting was the first Stated
23	Meeting that the Staten Island delegation had been

back to since Sandy hit and I wanted to say a few

words, but I wanted Christine to be here, but,

2	obviously, God had other plans. But I don't want
3	another week to go by without saying this.
4	And I just want to tell all of you
5	on behalf of Council Member Ignizio and Council
6	Member Rose and the people of Staten Island, we
7	want to thank you for your prayers, your well
8	wishes, your food, your supplies, your volunteers,
9	and for the mad love that Jumaane sent me via
10	Twitter. We really needed it.
11	I want to thank the
12	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Man love?
13	COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO:Chris used
14	the phrase extended family, I want to thank all
15	the folks in the staff who came out to Staten
16	Island who worked helping people. It was really,
17	truly appreciated.
18	I want to thank Edgar Moya in
19	particular who, the night Sandy hit, I truly
20	believe helped us save lives as Council Member
21	Ignizio and I were pulling names of people trapped
22	in homes off of Facebook and sending them to
23	Edgar, who was putting them in the OEM site.

I want to thank Ramon for his friendship. And John Madden [phonetic] in the

Speaker's detail who spent five weeks out on Staten Island.

I am--yeah, Chris got weepy, I guess I can--I am so grateful for your friendships for the phone calls. Charles, you touched my heart as you often do. And the people of Staten Island noticed the friendships that Debbie and Vinnie and I have here, and I'm so proud of all of them. And you guys have made me a better person being around you for 20 years and 10 years and 5 years and I really appreciate you being there for us in our time of need.

We have two bills on today, one is Sandy related, it provides just a little bit of help to the people who were hit the hardest. For folks who have been red-tag, this allows the Council to do to the extent of our powers, to do-provide them a little bit of relief. It delays the payments of the property bills from January to April. The genesis of this is a business owner on Staten Island by the name of John Toto [phonetic], who, on top of everything else he's going through, pointed to his business and said I have \$13,000 tax bill I have to pay. This particular bill

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

helps him for his home that was wiped out, it

doesn't help him for his business. We have some

more work to do, but, frankly, but for the Speaker

and her staff, we wouldn't be standing here

providing this relief for those Staten Islanders

and those New Yorkers who were hardest hit, so I

want to thank you for that.

The other bill which seems sort of petty at this point, but--or less important, but we talk about transparency in this body, we talk about transparency in this building, everybody in government talks about transparency, the biggest single investment most of us will make in our lifetime is for our homes, yet in this era of transparency, no one understands how their property taxes are reached, and every year when we send out those two bills and there are increases, people naturally think the City Council somehow voted and raised their property taxes and you guys know we did not. When the class shares are voted on, it's the one time that room nine and this chamber probably groans in unison because we have to explain it to them and then they have to try to digest it and explain it to the public, and none

2.

б

of us succeeds. And what we're doing today is
passing a law to mandate that the Department of
Finance try to put this convoluted process, this
process that culminates three decades of state law
and city law and court decisions and political
backroom deals that is our property tax system, it
tries to explain it. It was supposed to be a one-
pager, it's this draft of a 13-page little
booklet, that's how convoluted this process is.

Now, it doesn't change anybody's taxes, it doesn't lower their property taxes, I get that, please don't go on SI Live and say, Oddo, you gave us nothing. If you want to change the system, you have to understand the system, and mostly, 99.9% of our general public, they have not the foggiest clue how their bills are reached. Hopefully, this will start the process of educating the public.

I want to thank Tanisha for her wonderful job. I want to thank the Council staff, I want to thank counsel, Chairman Recchia for his help, Preston, obviously, Emre for all of their hard work on this. And I thank you for your indulgence.

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you very much, Council Member. We also want to hear from Council Member Ignizio on Preconsidered Intro 979 as well.

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Thank you very much, and thanks to my colleague, Minority Leader Jimmy Oddo, for articulating exactly what we're doing here today. And I just wanted to just give voice to some of my constituents, in this case, Mike Abruzzo [phonetic], who has lost his home totally to nothing. In fact, if you walk where his home is today, it's just his kitchen floor, which managed to survive 'cause it was built on a slab, and there is absolutely nothing there. His children, we went through the remnants of his home to find pieces of his children's history, and it was quite moving when we found some jewelry and whatnot. But throughout the process of working with Mike, he said to me, I'm down on my luck, everybody wants to help, and I know in a couple of months, you know, we're going to get sent a property tax bill and if anybody can help with things like that, that would be appreciative because the City just continues to

send out the bills and what could we do.

And Jimmy and Senator Lanza were working on the other side of the island in Jimmy's district and talking about some businesses who were dealing with the same frustrations. This is the least we can do. My colleague, Eric Ulrich, is dealing with that increasingly in his communities as well. The least we could do is to tell people we're going to defer your tax rate 'cause it's the only power we have in this body, while we have discussions with our colleagues in the state on offering some sort of abatement to try to help them. When everybody says, how could we help, this is one of the small ways we can.

And I'm grateful to this Council for taking the lead on it as well, and I'm appreciative that the Mayor's office signed on, and I'm hopeful that we'll be able to have a more robust conversation about the commercial property tax owners who are getting bills of 15 and \$20,000 for businesses that no longer exists.

So I wanted to thank my colleagues as well for a lot of their messages and their comments, as Jimmy said, and to let you know that

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council

Member Barron to speak on General Orders.

24

25

2	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you
3	very much. I just want to encourage my colleagues
4	to vote no on LU 740. The United Jewish
5	Organization of Williamsburg gets the privilege of
6	being sole sourced. It's very difficult for any
7	African Americans or Latinos to go to HPD and not
8	have a RFP sent out for property and get it sole
9	sourced, which is a privilege that HPD has for
10	groups. I don't see a whole lot of that happening
11	here in the City Council. In the past, I voted
12	this particular parcel up because it didn't have
13	all the information and when we get new
14	information, I think we should act accordingly to
15	that new information that we get. We should not
16	allow 740 the United Jewish Organization of
17	Williamsburg to get property sole sourced without
18	an RFP going out and giving opportunities for
19	other groups to have a chance to get it as well.
20	Not to mention the fact that there
21	are some conflict around that whole prior project
22	which may not be directed at them, but HPD are not
23	allowing or wanting to allow only three and four
24	family homes and seven-story units, that's still

in court a part of the whole Broadway Triangle

2	project. So why would we have a group involved in
3	all of that sole sourced and we pass it before all
4	of the findings in that trial, which may not
5	directly be them, but we should not allow the sole
6	sourcing to go forth for one particular group.
7	When it comes to blacks and Latinos, how many of
8	you have passed somethingland that was sole
9	sourced for blacks and Latinos in this body? It
LO	just doesn't happen hardly at all and I don't
11	think we should allow it to go down now.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Before
L3	Council Member Levin, I need to be excused so I'm
L4	going to allow myself permission to vote on all
L5	items on today's agenda, so moved. I vote aye.
L6	Thank you. Got to go.
L7	[Off mic]
18	[Crosstalk]
19	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council
20	Member Levin is next to speak, Council Member
21	Dickens will preside. Thank you.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Inez,
23	you're on deck.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you
25	very much, Mr. Majority Leader. I want to

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

encourage my colleagues to vote yes on Land Use number 740. While I sympathize with the point that Council Member Barron raised about sole sourcing not being prevalent in communities of color, I would encourage you not to use that—or hold that against this project in particular.

This project has come before the Council before in which this Council voted unanimously to approve. The United Jewish Organizations of Williamsburg is proposing to construct a seven-unit building of affordable rental housing for individuals and families earning less than 40, 60, and 80% of area median income. The project will be located on a 2,970 square foot vacant lot at 640 Broadway situated between Jerry Street [phonetic] and Bartlett Street [phonetic] in the Williamsburg section of Brooklyn. Again, the Council voted to approve this project in 2009, we are returning to vote on an amendment today that would decrease the number of units from nine units to seven units because it is being changed from a rehab to a new construction.

And I want to point out that the

United Jewish Organizations of Williamsburg is a	
50-year organization that has an exemplary track	
record of providing social services and affordabl	е
housing. The entire community of Williamsburg,	
their affordable housing developments at 907	
Driggs Avenue, it's a 20-unit affordable housing	
development which is entirely integrated between	
Hasidic Jewish, Latino, and African American	
families; 293 and 301 Hooper Street is a 68-unit	
affordable housing development which is entirely	
African American, Latino, and Asian; and Schaefer	
Landing, which is a 140-unit affordable housing	
development is integrated between Hasidic Jewish,	
Latino, and African American, and Asian families.	
They have provided, again, exemplary service and	
will do so in this case.	
I encourage my colleagues to vote	
yes on Land Use item number 740. Thank you.	
COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Council	
Member Koo.	
COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Madam Majorit	У
Leader, I'd like to have permission to vote on al	1
Land Use and General Order calendars.	

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: So moved.

Coupled on the General Order calendar.

COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the

24

25

1616, designation Landmarks Preservation

24

25

Commission.

1	STATED MEETING 53
2	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Coupled on
3	the General Order calendar.
4	COUNCIL CLERK: LU 739 and Reso
5	1617, 237 Wadsworth Avenue, Manhattan.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Coupled on
7	the General Order calendar.
8	COUNCIL CLERK: LU 740 and Reso
9	1618, approved UDAAP, Brooklyn.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Coupled on
11	the General Order calendar.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: General
13	Order Calendar.
14	COUNCIL CLERK: Resolution
15	appointing various persons Commissioner of Deeds.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: At this
17	time, I ask for the roll call on all items on the
18	Coupled General Order calendar.
19	COUNCIL CLERK: Arroyo.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.
21	COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote no
23	on LU 740 and the accompanying Reso 1618, and aye
24	on all the rest.
25	COUNCIL CLERK: Brewer.

2	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I will vote
3	aye. I just want to add something to the kind
4	words from the gentleman from Staten Island, the
5	gentlemen from Staten Island and Councilwoman,
6	which is that, in addition to all the good things
7	they said, I want to say how great your staffs
8	were because we in Manhattan above 39th Street did
9	send a lot of materials to Staten Island, as well
10	as other locations. I cannot tell you how great
11	your staff was because we had to know we want to
12	go to this corner or that corner or this location
13	and people around the borough asked us where to
14	go, and we were able to tell them because of the
15	great information that your staffs provided. So I
16	just want to add that to your work. Thank you
17	very much.
18	I vote aye.
19	COUNCIL CLERK: Chin.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.
21	COUNCIL CLERK: Crowley.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote aye
23	and I'd like to recognize that we've been joined
24	by my new chief of staff, Roman Paprocki, it's his
25	first day here at City Hall.

1	STATED MEETING 55
2	COUNCIL CLERK: Dickens.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.
4	COUNCIL CLERK: Dilan.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Aye on all.
6	COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.
8	COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.
10	COUNCIL CLERK: Ferreras.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Aye.
12	COUNCIL CLERK: Fidler.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Aye.
14	COUNCIL CLERK: Garodnick.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.
16	COUNCIL CLERK: Gennaro.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Madam
18	Leader, I would like the opportunity to speak on
19	my vote? Madam Leader
20	[Crosstalk]
21	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS:
22	[Interposing] So ordered.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you,
24	Madam Leader. I vote yes on all items.
25	I would like to recognize and thank

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Council Member Garodnick for his leadership on the recycling bill and I'd like to thank Chair Dilan for moving that forward. And also would like to urge everyone to vote for the designation—for the landmark designation of the Brinckerhoff Cemetery, which we're—we'll be doing today.

It's one of the oldest colonial era cemeteries in Queens that was used from the 1730s until the 1930s. This was a property that was calendared for ten years before it was finally designated and we're grateful that we've come to this good day. I just want to thank the Speaker and her staff for helping us to move this forward; Council Member Lander, who was a voice of reason in this process; Council Member Comrie, as chair of the Land Use Committee; and Council Members Halloran, Weprin, Vallone, and Crowley, who were very strongly for this. I'd like to thank Councilman Halloran in a special way for some legal work that he did that was very helpful in the last hearing. And also in the chambers, we have one of the main advocates for this, the leaders of the local civic association, Mr. and Mrs. James Gallagher from the Fresh Meadows

1	STATED MEETING 57
2	Homeowners Association, they worked on this for
3	ten years.
4	I worked on this from before I was
5	even a councilman and I'm glad that we're getting
6	this done. And I vote everyone to vote aye on the
7	designation of the Brinckerhoff Cemetery. Thank
8	you, Madam Leader.
9	COUNCIL CLERK: Gentile.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.
11	COUNCIL CLERK: Gonzalez.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Aye on
13	all.
14	COUNCIL CLERK: Greenfield.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye on
16	all.
17	COUNCIL CLERK: Halloran.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Aye on
19	all.
20	COUNCIL CLERK: Ignizio.
21	[Off mic]
22	COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Thank you
23	very much, if I could just briefly explain my
24	vote. I wanted to reference the bill that Jim had
25	the lead sponsor on, which was the information on

1	STATED MEETING 58
2	property taxes. I just believe and Jim believes
3	if we empower people with information, that gives
4	them the opportunity whether they want to petition
5	or challenge their government in any ways
6	possible, and I think that's a good thing.
7	I'm voting no on Land Use 720 and
8	Reso 1609, and aye on all others. Thank you.
9	COUNCIL CLERK: Jackson.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Aye on
11	all.
12	COUNCIL CLERK: James.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: May I be
14	excused to explain my vote?
15	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: So
16	ordered.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: First, to
18	the Staten Island delegation, congratulations, and
19	thank you for providing leadership to the city of
20	New York. The thoughts and prayers of all New

Yorkers are with you during this time. It was an honor and a privilege to volunteer with the City Council on several weekends to assist your constituents.

21

22

23

24

25

And with regards to tax

1	STATED MEETING 59
2	liabilities, I believe that tax liabilities of all
3	of those whose homes have been destroyed, the
4	value of their homes should be reduced to land
5	value only as we have done in the past. It's the
6	least that we can do in addition to delaying the
7	taxes that they owe on their property, and I would
8	urge that the State of New York obviously consider
9	this as we have done in the past for other
10	disasters.
11	I vote aye on all.
12	COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on
14	all.
15	COUNCIL CLERK: Lander.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye on all.
17	COUNCIL CLERK: Lappin.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Aye.
19	COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.
21	COUNCIL CLERK: Mark-Viverito.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye
23	on all.
24	COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye.

on all abstain
abstain
on all.
on all.
on all.
on
ssion
you.
n Land
m
urce
munity
ther
k to be
ָרָ בְּיִבְּיִבְּיִבְּיִבְּיִבְּיִבְּיִבְּיִ

developed for affordable housing since the 2005 rezoning, has stalled, and as a matter of fact, have not been moved in any direction to be able to be developed and have only been entertained as an RFP. In addition to that, this is part of a greater bounded area that was considered to be adjacent and within the boundaries of the Broadway Triangle, as had been designated 40 years ago. And over the course of 40 years, there have been multiple discrimination counts that have led to what has been a very segregated community, and I will not stand idly by allowing for another Land Use action to promote what would be the perpetuation of additional discrimination.

The seven-unit building that is being considered for this property is going to be considered where the amount of units will be dedicated to what would be over 50% of the units for three and four bedroom apartments, despite the fact that the demand for that is less than 5% in the whole community board. And so this is part of what is an injunction that's permanent to stop the properties from being developed, as has been told by the Supreme Court by the judge who ruled in

1	STATED MEETING 62			
2	January of this year, and I wanted to make			
3	everyone aware that this is part of a larger scope			
4	of a bounded area called Broadway Triangle.			
5	I vote no on Land Use item 740 and			
6	accompanying Resolution 1618, and aye on all the			
7	rest.			
8	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Can we get			
9	some silence in the chambers, please?			
10	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down,			
11	please, keep it down. Quiet down.			
12	COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.			
13	COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye, and			
14	I would like to ask permission to vote aye on all			
15	the			
16	[Off mic]			
17	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: So			
18	ordered.			
19	COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.			
20	COUNCIL CLERK: Rose.			
21	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [No			
22	response].			
23	COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich.			
24	COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye.			

COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.

25

2	that is the case in this particular issue, so even
3	though I voted no in committee for what I knew
4	then, I vote aye on all issues including 740,
5	primarily on the principle of supporting what a
6	member wants in his or her district. Thank you.
7	COUNCIL CLERK: Weprin.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye.
9	COUNCIL CLERK: Williams.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Excuse to
11	explain my vote?
12	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: So
13	ordered.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank
15	you. Seven forty is very disturbing to me from
16	the things that I heard. I'm going to go ahead
17	and vote aye on all, including 740, for the
18	primary reason this is, from my understanding, an
19	amendment of something that has already gone
20	through the process and I think the sole source is
21	a huge issue that needs to be addressed and I hope
22	of some of us bring it up in a letter, in
23	hearings, that we will get the support that is
24	needed from our colleagues. And I respect what
25	Diana Reyna brought up and I definitely respect

2.

what council Member brought upcouncil Member
Barron, but I also respect Steve Levin, whose
district it is in. And I'm very concerned that
there may be a problem there, but for the simple
fact that this was a project that came through the
City Council, this is simply an amendment based on
some zoning changes, I'm going to go ahead and
vote aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Oddo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: I would like to vote yes on all, and just say one thing real quickly, and that is--well two things. One, I just want to thank Gale Brewer for her kind comments. I want to thank my counsel, Chris DeCicco, for all of his work and my staff. I want to thank Council Member Ignizio's chief of staff and Assemblyman-Elect Joe Borelli, for all his work, and my own chief of staff, Steve Matteo, who has worked for the last six weeks on the front lines. I'm real proud of them.

And I just want to let everyone know that the pamphlet will be available on the

2	Department of Finance website starting January
3	15th, please get them, get them into the hands of
4	your constituents. Thank you.
5	Vote yes on all.
6	COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye
8	on all.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: All items
LO	on today's General Order calendar were adopted by
11	a vote of 46 in the affirmative, zero negative,
12	and zero abstentions, with the exception of Land
13	Use item 740 and the accompanying Reso 1618, which
L4	was adopted by a vote of 43 in the affirmative, 2
15	in the negative, and 1 abstention; and Land Use
L6	item 720 and accompanying Reso 1609, which was
L7	adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 1 in
18	the negative, zero abstentions.
L9	Introduction and Reading of Bills.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: All bills
21	are referred to committees as indicated on the
22	agenda.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Discussion
24	of Resolutions. Seeing none, Preconsidered
25	Pegolution 1601 regolution calling upon the

2	United States Congress and the President of the				
3	United States to reach an agreement on debt				
4	reduction before the end of the year that would				
5	avert short-term economic damage. It was adopted				
6	by the Committee on Finance. All those in favor,				
7	say aye by a voice vote.				
8	MULTIPLE VOICES: Aye.				
9	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Any				
10	against? Any abstentions? The resolution is				
11	hereby adopted.				
12	General Discussion.				
13	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Council				
14	Member Melissa Mark-Viverito.				
15	COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:				
16	Thank you. Recently, the City celebrated 24 hour-				
17	_				
18	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS:				
19	[Interposing] Excuse me, excuse me, Council				
20	Member.				
21	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down,				
22	quiet				
23	[Crosstalk]				
24	COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: We				
25	can start the clock again.				
	1				

2		CO	UNCIL MEMBER	DICKENS:	Just a
3	minute.	Please.	Thank you.	Go ahead,	Council
1	Member.				

COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:

Recently, the City celebrated 24 hours without a single murder, stabbing, or shooting. Such an occurrence is rare on the island of Puerto Rico, which is half the size of New York City, but last year suffered over 1,000 murders. Puerto Ricans on the island, in New York City, and beyond are simply fed up. Fueled by the drug trade, police corruption, and high unemployment, this enormous wave of crime has taken far too many lives.

One of the latest victims which has aspired a mass movement is Jose Enrique Gomez, who was forced to withdraw \$400 from an ATM machine before he was beaten, doused with gasoline, and set on fire. Since then, tens of thousands of Puerto Ricans organized online under the banner, Todos somos Jose Enrique, or We are all Jose Enrique, and held demonstrations on the island and here in New York.

Embroiled within this mass movement is a huge pushback against a show on Puerto Rican

2.

network, WAPA-TV, which is also shown here in New			
York. This program, La Comay, has long been			
criticized for its use of vile homophobic slurs.			
In April 2010, the Council's LGBT Caucus,			
Congresswoman Nydia Velazquez, and I wrote to the			
FCC to call for an investigation into this			
offensive language which has prompted an apology			
from the show.			

This show crossed another line when it attacked Jose Enrique Gomez and suggested that he was killed because he was on a street known for prostitution. This latest controversy which has happened in the past week has ignited a historic boycott that has pressured sponsors, including Wal-Mart, to pull advertising from the show. The network is feeling the pressure. We've heard enough apologies, nothing short of taking this show completely off the air would be acceptable.

We are more united than ever in fighting to stop the violence in Puerto Rico and stop the hatred that is regularly spewed on this offensive show. It is my sincere hope that with all of this pressure and with a new change in leadership coming in the new year, we see positive

2	changes on the island moving forward. ¡Basta ya
3	con la violencia! ¡Todos Somos José Enrique.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Council
5	Member Lander.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you,
7	Madam Chair. I missed my window apparently to
8	talk on Preconsidered Reso 1601, so can I have the
9	dispensation to say a few words now?
10	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: So moved.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you
12	very much. We just votedthank you to my
13	colleagueson a resolution regarding the so-
14	called fiscal cliff. As President Obama and
15	Congress continue negotiations to avert the cliff,
16	we need an agreement on deficit reduction that
17	promotes economic fairness and long-term broadly-
18	shared prosperity. The staff of the Finance
19	Committeeand I really want to thank them,
20	Tanisha Edwards, Ray Majewski, Paul Sturm,
21	Alexander Gevorkian [phonetic], Jonathan Auerbach,
22	and, of course, Preston Niblackdid research on
23	just what the falling off the fiscal cliff would
24	mean for New York City, and it's really very dire.

Besides pushing the broad economy potentially back

б

into recession, they project that New York City
would lose 170,000 jobs, that gross city product
would fall by 2%, the City's budget would directly
see a nearly \$300 million in lost federal funds,
we might lose as many as 8,000 Section 8
certificates, homelessness would go up, cuts to
child care and to public hospitals, and on and on.
It would also have a real dire impact on working
families in the tax area. So a single mother with
two children and an income of \$24,000 would see a
tax increase of \$1,670, and the list goes on and
on and on.

There is a better solution, as I think people know. President Obama has proposed, and I believe that any deal passed should repeal the Bush era tax cuts for the wealthiest 2% of households, make sure to attend to job creation, to broadly-shared economic recovery, and to economic fairness, as well as achieving long-term deficit reduction.

I want to thank the Speaker,

Finance Chair Recchia, and Council Member Foster.

This Council has shown real bipartisan leadership
in making sure we achieve budgets that achieve

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2	+ha+	kind	٥f	long-term	halanda
4	l lliat	KIHO	OT	10114-161111	Dalance.

And while I was very moved by what the Minority Leader said and almost feel bad putting a resolution on the floor that references federal policy debates, this is obviously an important issue in the country. I really appreciate the way we've been able to do things in this body. And I'm glad and really appreciate everyone's vote for a resolution urging Congress to do the same. Thank you very much. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you, Council Member. Council Member Brewer. MALE VOICE: Williams, Williams. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Oh, Williams? That's all right. COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much. I just want to thank those who came to the Governmental Operations to oversight of the Board of Elections, we were there for about seven hours. The good news is we had the good government groups and the state come before the Board of Elections and the Board of Elections said it was the best hearing they'd ever been to.

And so what we're doing now is

23

24

25

fan of NYCC.

2	we're putting on a spreadsheet which we will share					
3	with everyone and the board and the state					
4	officials and the good government groups, all the					
5	recommendations, whether they're state or city,					
6	and how quickly they can be done.					
7	So I just want to thank everybody					
8	for your input and let you know that we will make					
9	a difference. Thank you very much.					
10	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Council					
11	Member Williams.					
12	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I					
13	couldn't leave without saying a couple of words					
14	about Jon Kest, who recently passed away. I was					
15	trying to remember the first time I met him, I					
16	believe it was when I was executive director at					
17	Tenants and Neighbors, and then ACORN was working					
18	with us, they took the lead in saving Stiver					
19	[phonetic] City. From the first time I met him					
20	and Bertha Lewis, I realized how great these folks					
21	are at community organizing and someone that I can					

And the Kest family, as mentioned, has gone through an amazing amount of tragedy, I

model myself after. And was a fan of ACORN, I'm a

б

can't even understand how they were able to continue to move forward.

But Kest has done a lot for this city and actually nationally, and so I think a very large person in the community organizing world was lost today and I wanted to make sure I said a few good words for the great work that Jon Kest and the entire Kest family has done and has meant to New York City and community organizing as a whole.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Council Member Vann.

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Yeah, thank you, Majority Leader. I call ask my colleagues if they would sign up to three very, very important resolutions, 1604, 1605, 1606. Sixteen oh-four and oh-six amend support legislation—state legislation that amends the Social Security law. Two specific instances, it would support the Assembly bill—two Assembly bills and the senate bill that would amend the social service law in relation to considering the opinion of a public assistance applicant's health care practitioner when determining if an applicant has work

2 limitations. That's being abused and this
3 legislation would correct that.

The second one deals with an Assembly bill 9700 and it also amends the social service law that states that no applicant or recipient who is a parent or a caretaker of an eligible child shall be subject to ineligibility provisions due to lack of child care. It seems that workers are now not providing services to those who seek welfare assistance because they don't have child care, and that seems absurd, so this would correct that.

And the third, 1605, is a resolution calls on the Congress to pass and the President to sign the so-called cram-down legislation that would enable bankruptcy courts to reduce underwater mortgages to fair market values, thereby, greatly reducing the number of foreclosures nationally and stimulating the economy as well. According to leading national economists, this type of legislation could add up to \$71 billion to the economy and over a million jobs.

One other point on that, this

2	legislation would improve the loan modification
3	outcomes for homeowners by providing an important
4	bargaining chip for homeowners negotiating with
5	banks for a sustainable mortgage modification.
6	One last point, the national
7	mortgage settlement we all have heard about which
8	was led by New York State Attorney General Eric
9	Schneiderman and he helped to negotiate the same.
10	We found out on a hearing inthat I had in
11	October that there are many borrowers from
12	companies that indicated in the settlement who
13	lost their homes to foreclosure between 2008 and
14	2011, they are eligible for cash payments of at
15	least \$840 minimal. I've circulated a letter to
16	your offices, please get that information out.
17	Thank you, Majority Leader.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Council
19	Member Chin.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I would like
21	to ask my colleagues to sign on to Intro 976 and
22	Reso 1597. New York City is a racially diverse
23	city that frequently celebrate its diversity as
24	one of its greatest strength. Two point four

percent of individual in the U.S. Census self-

reported as mixed race in 2000. This number has
grown by 32% as of the 2010 census. Our
President, Barack Obama, is of multiracial
heritage, yet a number of government forms in the
city, state, and federal level, including forms
used by DCAS and NYPD, still only permits
individual to identify themselves as only one
race. For example, the FBI fingerprinting card
used throughout the country gives 7 options for
eye colors, 14 options for hair colors, including
purple and green, but only 5 for race: Asian,
Black, American Indian, White, or Unknown, and you
can pick only one of them. And the New York City
DOE employment form gives only five option, again,
check one, American Indian, Asian, Black,
Hispanic, or White. So the Local Law that I've
introduced in the resolution would seek to amend
government forms to make it possible for
multiracial individual to identify themselves
accurately and truthfully as what they aremore
than one race. Thank you.
COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you,
Council Member. Council Member Levin.
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you

б

Madam Assistant Majority Leader. I just wanted to
speak for a second about Jon Kest. I had the
pleasure earlier this year with Council Member
Vincent Ignizio sponsoring two bills regarding
PCBs in our schools and Jon was a leading force
behind those bills and was brilliant in his
ability to organize around the issue and to hone
in on the important pieces of it. And it's
legislation that is yielding great success, as the
Administration has just come out with additional
\$100 million towards remediation of the PCBs in
our schools. And one thing that just struck me
about Jon in that instance was his ability to
cross over partisan lines, working with Council
Member Ignizio, a Republican, myself, a Democrat,
New York Communities for Change, a decidedly
liberal organization, but crossing those lines in
order to further the benefit of our children. And
I think that we will all be missing his presence.
Thank you.
COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Seeing no
others for General Discussion, the Stated Meeting
of December the 10th, 2012, is hereby adjourned.
[Gavel]

I, Tammy Wittman, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature Tammphathman

Date _December 25, 2012_