

Staff:  
Rachel Cordero, Counsel  
Damien Butvick, Policy Analyst



**THE COUNCIL**

**COMMITTEE REPORT OF THE GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS DIVISION**

*Robert Newman, Legislative Director*  
*Alix Pustilnik, Deputy Director, Governmental Affairs Division*

**COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AFFAIRS**

*Daniel R. Garodnick, Chair*

**December 17, 2012**

**Proposed Int. No. 702-A:**

By Council Members Fidler, Rivera, Brewer, Dickens, Eugene, Gentile, James, Koppell, Lander, Mendez, Nelson, Recchia, Rose, Williams, Rodriguez and Dromm

**TITLE:**

A Local Law to amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to requiring that all gas stations post road signs displaying the total selling price of gasoline and/or diesel motor fuel and that such road signs and any other sign, poster or placard advertising the price of gasoline and/or diesel motor fuel disclose the total selling price for cash and credit or debit card purchases.

## **I. INTRODUCTION**

On Monday, December 17, 2012, the Consumer Affairs Committee, chaired by Council Member Dan Garodnick, will vote on Proposed Introductory Bill Number 702-A (“Proposed Int. No. 702-A”), a Local Law to amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to requiring that all gas stations post road signs displaying the total selling price of gasoline and/or diesel motor fuel and that such road signs and any other sign, poster or placard advertising the price of gasoline and/or diesel motor fuel disclose the total selling price for cash and credit or debit card purchases. The Committee previously heard a version of Int. No. 702 on December 14, 2012.

## **II. BACKGROUND**

During economically uncertain times, fluctuations in the price of certain goods, such as gasoline, can have a debilitating impact on working families. Unfortunately, gasoline prices have experienced an upward trend in the past year in the New York City metropolitan area. According to the New York State Energy Research & Development Authority, regular grade gasoline averaged nearly \$3.65 per gallon on December 3, 2012.<sup>1</sup> For the majority of New York City residents, the price of gasoline is a major concern. According to the Siena Research Institute, in August of 2012, 53% of residents within the five boroughs considered gasoline prices to be “a somewhat or very serious

---

<sup>1</sup> N.Y.S. Research & Dev. Auth. “Weekly Average Motor Gasoline Prices,” at <http://www.nyserda.ny.gov/Page-Sections/Energy-Prices-Supplies-and-Weather-Data/Motor-Gasoline/Weekly-Average-Motor-Gasoline-Prices.aspx> (accessed September 12, 2012).

problem.”<sup>2</sup> The necessity of gasoline in daily life became all too clear in the aftermath of Hurricane Sandy, when fuel shortages shuttered some gas stations and left others with lines of cars stretching several blocks long. In light of its expense, and the fact that gas is often not an optional purchase, it is critically important that consumer protection regulations are enforced and that gasoline pricing policies be as transparent as possible.

**a. State and Local Regulation of Gas Stations**

Several provisions in State and local law address gasoline pricing and regulate the form and manner by which prices are disclosed in order to promote clear and accurate communication of information to consumers. First, consumers are protected against price gouging of any consumer goods and services by the State General Business Law, which prohibits offering or selling goods and services considered “vital and necessary,” such as gasoline, at “unconscionably excessive” prices during times of “abnormal disruption” of the market.<sup>3</sup> When price gouging is alleged, the State Attorney General can apply to enjoin or restrain the offensive activity, and whether or not the activity violates the price gouging prohibition becomes a question for the court.<sup>4</sup>

Second, local consumer protection laws prohibit, among other deceptive practices, acts that result in “a gross disparity between the value received by a consumer and the price paid, to the consumer’s detriment.”<sup>5</sup> Specifically, local law defines fraudulent practices in which sellers of gasoline and petroleum products (“gas stations”) are

---

<sup>2</sup> Siena Research Inst. “Seriousness of Gas and Food Prices: Percentage of NY’ers,” at [http://www.siena.edu/uploadedfiles/home/parents\\_and\\_community/community\\_page/sri/nys\\_cc/Gas%20and%20Food%20Table0812.pdf](http://www.siena.edu/uploadedfiles/home/parents_and_community/community_page/sri/nys_cc/Gas%20and%20Food%20Table0812.pdf) (accessed on September 12, 2012).

<sup>3</sup> N.Y.S. Gen. Bus. Law § 396-r.

<sup>4</sup> *Id.*

<sup>5</sup> N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 20-710(b).

prohibited to engage, such as the sale of gasoline “in any manner so as to deceive, or tend to deceive the purchaser as to the price, nature, quality or identity thereof.”<sup>6</sup>

Additionally, the State Agriculture and Markets Law requires that the selling price per gallon of gasoline be posted on all dispensing devices from which gasoline is extracted, and the law dictates the size and style of such posting.<sup>7</sup> The law also requires the posting of multiple prices on a dispensing device that offers more than one type or grade of gasoline for sale. A civil penalty of \$100 is assessed for violating the law once and subsequent violations can be punished by fines of up to \$500. The law authorizes DCA to enforce the provisions that relate to price posting at the pump.<sup>8</sup>

Local law provides further regulations on price posting for gas stations in New York City. All signs displaying the price of gasoline at or near the premises of a gas station, such as road signs visible to drivers, must state the name or brand, grade or quality, and the total selling price per gallon of the gasoline.<sup>9</sup> The total selling price is defined as “the sum of the basic price per gallon plus all applicable taxes.”<sup>10</sup> Further, local law dictates the size and style of such postings, requiring that all numbers and letters relating to the price of the gasoline be the same size and that the font shall be black on white background.<sup>11</sup>

In 2006, the Council passed Local Law 38, which requires that sellers of gasoline adhere to the prices posted on such road signs, and prohibits such sellers from raising the posted prices for a period of 24 hours once they are posted.<sup>12</sup> The local law also

---

<sup>6</sup> N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 20-673.

<sup>7</sup> N.Y.S. Agric. & Mkt. Law § 192(5).

<sup>8</sup> *Id.*

<sup>9</sup> N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 20-672.

<sup>10</sup> *Id.*

<sup>11</sup> *Id.*

<sup>12</sup> LL 38/2006; *see* N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 20-672(b).

contained recordkeeping requirements related to pricing.<sup>13</sup> Additionally, the Agriculture and Markets Law and the Administrative Code both regulate disclosures at the pump related to octane ratings and proper representation of gasoline as either leaded or unleaded.<sup>14</sup>

## **b. Enforcement**

Fortunately for drivers in New York City, DCA is tasked with ensuring that those who purchase gasoline are getting their money's worth. DCA's "gas squad" inspects each gas station at least once a year, testing for "pump dispensing accuracy; gas octane at levels advertised as priced; proper maintenance of gasoline storage tanks; properly marked fill ports for gas delivery; functioning equipment, including indicator lights, nozzles, air compressors, and valves; and proper signage, including matching prices on pumps and curb signs."<sup>15</sup> According to DCA, its inspectors check the accuracy of every pump in the City, visiting each gas station about twice a year.<sup>16</sup>

In 2010, DCA conducted a sweep of gas stations in the City and found a 97% compliance rate for accuracy at the pump.<sup>17</sup> The department inspected over 1,800 gas stations and 10,850 gas pumps, 345 of which were faulty and taken out of commission pending repairs.<sup>18</sup> Three hundred eighty-two violations were issued for reasons that included failing to disclose octane ratings, improper priming of pumps, short measure on pumps, deceptive practices, and scales that failed to conform to the standards for weights

---

<sup>13</sup> *Id.*

<sup>14</sup> N.Y.S. Agric. & Mkt. Law §§ 192-A, 192-B and 192-C; N.Y.C. Admin. Code §§ 20-673.1 and 20-673.2.

<sup>15</sup> N.Y.C. Dep't of Consumer Affairs, "Department of Consumer Affairs Keeps Close Watch Over Gas Station Accuracy," Press Release, July 1, 2009, at [http://www.nyc.gov/html/dca/html/pr2009/pr\\_070109.shtml](http://www.nyc.gov/html/dca/html/pr2009/pr_070109.shtml).

<sup>16</sup> *Id.*

<sup>17</sup> *Id.*

<sup>18</sup> *Id.*

and measures as laid out by the National Institute of Standards and Technology.<sup>19</sup> Of the 382 violations, 28 related to signage problems, including improper curb signage.<sup>20</sup> That year, DCA also received approximately 645 complaints about gas stations.<sup>21</sup> The most common complaints were “overcharging, inaccurate meters and defective fuel pumps.”<sup>22</sup>

In 2011, the Office of New York State Attorney General Eric Schneiderman launched an investigation into possible price gouging and zone pricing in response to dramatic price fluctuations that were occurring throughout the state. Examining 89 gas stations throughout the state between February 1 and April 1 of 2011, the Attorney General’s office ultimately concluded that despite the dramatic rise in gasoline prices during the period studied, and with the exception of two gas stations outside of New York City, price gouging did not occur and retail mark-ups on gasoline remained relatively consistent.<sup>23</sup> The fluctuations in gasoline prices, it was determined, were simply a reflection of the changes in the price of crude oil.<sup>24</sup> The Attorney General’s office did, however, find that gasoline wholesalers were engaged in zone pricing, a practice where different gas stations are charged different prices depending on their location.<sup>25</sup> The report noted that, while such practice was banned by the State in 2008, weaknesses in the law’s language render it unenforceable.<sup>26</sup>

Attorney General Schneiderman revisited the issue of price gouging in 2012 in the wake of Hurricane Sandy. Prior to the storm making landfall, the Attorney General’s

---

<sup>19</sup> N.Y.C. Dep’t of Consumer Affairs, data submitted via email to Council staff on February 28, 2012.

<sup>20</sup> *Id.*

<sup>21</sup> N.Y.C. Dep’t of Consumer Affairs, *supra* note 14.

<sup>22</sup> *Id.*

<sup>23</sup> Office of the N.Y.S. Attorney General “Report on New York Gasoline Prices,” December 2011, at 3.

<sup>24</sup> *Id.*

<sup>25</sup> *Id.*, at 4.

<sup>26</sup> *Id.*

office warned vendors in certain areas of the state against engaging in price gouging.<sup>27</sup> After the hurricane, the office received hundreds of complaints relating to price gouging, the majority of which related to gasoline prices.<sup>28</sup> The Attorney General subsequently launched an investigation into these allegations.<sup>29</sup> To date, his office has initiated enforcement proceedings against 25 gas retailers in the state, twelve of which are located in New York City.<sup>30 31</sup>

### **c. Cash Versus Credit Pricing**

Despite the broad compliance with applicable laws and apparent lack of price gouging in New York, consumers still have reason to exercise caution when patronizing a gas station. A 2008 investigation of gas stations launched by then-Attorney General Andrew Cuomo found that roughly one quarter of the 130 stations examined in the New York City area were engaged in deceptive practices.<sup>32</sup> Specifically, the Attorney General's office found that the offending gas stations were "charging customers more for using a credit card [and] posting only the lower cash prices on their large, street-facing signs in order to lure patrons to their station and then charging them more at the pump."<sup>33</sup>

---

<sup>27</sup> Office of the N.Y.S. Attorney General, "A.G. Schneiderman Details Post-Hurricane Price Gouging Investigation As Consumer Complaints Rise," Press Release, November 5, 2012, at <http://www.ag.ny.gov/press-release/ag-schneiderman-details-post-hurricane-price-gouging-investigation-consumer-complaints>.

<sup>28</sup> *Id.*

<sup>29</sup> *Id.*

<sup>30</sup> Office of the N.Y.S. Attorney General, "A.G. Schneiderman Announced 12 More Enforcement Actions Against Gas Retailers in Post-Sandy Price Gouging Investigation," Press Release, November 29, 2012, at <http://www.ag.ny.gov/press-release/ag-schneiderman-announces-12-more-enforcement-actions-against-gas-retailers-post-sandy>.

<sup>31</sup> Office of the N.Y.S. Attorney General, "A.G. Schneiderman Brings First Series of Enforcement Actions in Post-Hurricane Price Gouging Investigation As Consumer Complaints Rise," Press Release, November 15, 2012, at <http://www.ag.ny.gov/press-release/ag-schneiderman-brings-first-series-enforcement-actions-post-hurricane-price-gouging>.

<sup>32</sup> Office of the N.Y.S. Attorney General, "Attorney General Cuomo Issues Consumer alert for NYC Drivers After Investigation Reveals Nearly 25% of NYC Area Gas Stations Inspected Engaged in Deceptive Practices," Press Release, August 28, 2008, at <http://www.ag.ny.gov/press-release/attorney-general-cuomo-issues-consumer-alert-nyc-drivers-after-investigation-reveals>.

<sup>33</sup> *Id.*

The Attorney General’s office found that while some of the gas stations did include the word “cash” in their street-level signs, the font size was too small to be legible from the street.<sup>34</sup>

The New York State General Business Law prohibits retailers from applying a surcharge to purchases made with a credit card.<sup>35</sup> Nevertheless, State law does not prohibit retailers from applying discounts to their sales. Therefore, gas stations are permitted to charge a discounted price for gasoline purchases made in cash. Many gas stations do so, charging the higher “non-discounted” price on non-cash purchases to offset the processing fees (also known as “interchange” fees) incurred when a consumer uses a debit or credit card.<sup>36</sup> It has been reported that gas stations in New York State are advertising only the (often lower) cash price on their street-level signs without adequate disclosure that such advertised price applies to cash transactions only.<sup>37</sup> As the 2008 investigation revealed, it is not always clear that the price being advertised on the street-level sign reflects only the cash price until the consumer has already pulled into the gas station next to a pump.

Price differentials received renewed attention earlier this year when drivers in Long Island complained about disparities of up to two dollars between cash and credit purchases.<sup>38</sup> This significant markup, combined with the high cost of fuel and the failure of gas stations to adequately label the cash price, prompted New York State Senator Lee Zeldin (R, C, I-Shirley) to introduce a bill that would require gas stations to post the

---

<sup>34</sup> *Id.*

<sup>35</sup> N.Y.S. Gen. Bus. Law §518.

<sup>36</sup> Morell, J., “Filling up the tank? It may pay to use cash,” *CreditCards.com*, August 28, 2008, Available at <http://www.creditcards.com/credit-card-news/gas-discounts-for-cash-1275.php>.

<sup>37</sup> Polsky, C., “Ire over credit card pricing,” *Newsday*, July 11, 2008, at A19.

<sup>38</sup> “New York Senator Takes Aim At Gas Cash-Credit Price Gap,” *CBS New York*, April 24, 2012, Available at <http://newyork.cbslocal.com/2012/04/24/new-york-senator-takes-aim-at-gas-cash-credit-price-gap/>.



credit price on street-level signs when the disparity between the cash and credit price exceeds seven percent.<sup>39</sup> A similar bill was passed by the Westchester County Board of Legislators in December 2011, though that bill simply required that both cash and credit prices be displayed.<sup>40</sup> That same month, in response to price disparities in Long Island, Senator Charles Schumer (D-NY) sent a letter to the Federal Trade Commission asking them to consider rules that would require street-level signs at gas stations to more clearly disclose the cash and credit prices of gasoline.<sup>41</sup>

#### **d. September Gas Station Hearing**

The Committee first heard Int. No. 702 on September 20, 2012 along with an oversight hearing entitled “Gas Stations in New York City: Putting a Premium on Consumer Protection.” At that hearing, Council Member Fidler, the sponsor of Int. No. 702, asked Jeffrey Frediani, a Legislative Analyst at AAA New York, for his opinion on whether all gas stations in New York City should be required to have street-level signs so that gas prices are legible to drivers on the road. Mr. Frediani stated that this requirement would give consumers more information prior to entering the gas station. In light of this information, Int. No. 702 was amended to require that all gas stations have such street-level signs advertising the gas prices.

---

<sup>39</sup> “Gas Price Gap Between Credit And Cash Up to \$2 A Gallon At Some L.I.,” *CBS New York*, April 20, 2012, Available at <http://newyork.cbslocal.com/2012/04/20/rising-gas-price-gap-between-credit-and-cash-up-to-2-a-gallon-at-some-l-i-stations/>.

<sup>40</sup> Swift, J., “Westchester Legislators Okay New Gas Pricing Law,” *Peekskill Daily Voice*, December 1, 2011, Available at <http://peekskill.dailyvoice.com/news/kaplowitzs-law-gasoline-pricing-signs-passes>.

<sup>41</sup> Coen, A., “Sen. Schumer Appears in Wantagh Calling for Better Cash Price Disclosure,” *Wantagh-Seaford Patch*, December 6, 2011, Available at <http://wantagh.patch.com/articles/sen-schumer-appears-in-wantagh-calling-for-better-gas-price-disclosure>.

### **III. PROPOSED INT. NO. 702-A**

Proposed Int. No. 702-A would require all gas stations in New York City to maintain a sign, poster or placard advertising the selling price of gasoline that is visible to drivers of approaching vehicles. It would also require all gas stations to clarify any price differences that may exist between cash and credit or debit purchases on such road signs, posters or placards. It would require gas stations that charge cash-paying customers less than customers who pay with credit or debit cards to post the total selling price for each type of accepted payment. Proposed Int. No. 702-A would also require that the language distinguishing the price for cash purchases from credit or debit purchases be written in letters no less than half the size of the numbers displaying the price.

Proposed Int. No. 702-A

By Council Members Fidler, Rivera, Brewer, Dickens, Eugene, Gentile, James, Koppell, Lander, Mendez, Nelson, Recchia, Rose, Williams, Rodriguez and Dromm

A Local Law to amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to requiring that all gas stations post road signs displaying the total selling price of gasoline and/or diesel motor fuel and that such road signs and any other sign, poster or placard advertising the price of gasoline and/or diesel motor fuel disclose the total selling price for cash and credit or debit card purchases.

Be it enacted by the Council as follows:

Section 1. Subdivision b of section 20-672 of the administrative code of the city of New York, as amended by local law number 38 for the year 2006, is amended to read as follows:

[(b)]. [Where a sign, poster or placard advertises the selling price per gallon of gasoline or diesel motor fuel on, at or about the premises where such gasoline or diesel motor fuel is sold or offered for sale, or where such] In addition to any sign or placard required pursuant to subdivision five of section one hundred ninety-two of the agriculture and markets law, there shall be a sign, poster or placard clearly visible to drivers of approaching motor vehicles on the premises of every location at which gasoline and/or diesel motor fuel are sold or offered for sale. Such sign shall be in a size and style to be determined by the commissioner. Such sign, in addition to any other sign, poster or placard that advertises the selling price of gasoline and directly or indirectly refers to a premises where the advertised gasoline [or] and/or diesel motor fuel [is] are sold or offered for sale, [such sign, poster or placard] shall state the name, trade name, brand, mark or symbol and grade or quality classification of such gasoline or diesel motor fuel, together with the total selling price per gallon. Total selling price shall be the sum of the basic price per gallon plus all applicable taxes. Such sign, poster or placard shall

conform to the rules and regulations of all governmental agencies with jurisdiction as to structure and location.

1. A retail dealer shall only sell at [such posted] the total selling price. Any such price when posted may not be raised for a period of not less than twenty-four hours. [Such sign, poster or placard shall conform to the rules and regulations of all governmental agencies with jurisdiction as to structure and location.]

2. Where the total selling price for purchases made with cash is less than the total selling price for purchases made with credit card, debit card or other form of non-cash payment, such sign, poster or placard shall state the total selling price for each type of accepted payment.

§2. Subdivision c of section 20-672 of the administrative code of the city of New York, as relettered by local law number 31 for the year 1988, is amended to read as follows:

c. All numbers referring to price shall be the same height, width and thickness. Identification of the gasoline or diesel motor fuel offered for sale, and any non-numerical language distinguishing the total cash selling price from the total credit card, debit card or other form of non-cash payment selling price shall be in letters and numbers not less than one-half of the height, width and thickness of the numbers referring to price. Letters and numbers shall be black on a white background.

§ 3. This local law shall take effect one hundred twenty days after it shall have been enacted into law; provided that the commissioner and the commissioner of the department of transportation may take any actions necessary for the implementation of this local law prior to such effective date including, but not limited to, promulgating

rules.

R.C.  
LS # 2362  
12/5/12