

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

-----X

October 23, 2012
Start: 10:18 a.m.
Recess: 1:40 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers
City Hall

B E F O R E:
MARK WEPRIN
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
James Vacca
Leroy G. Comrie, Jr.
Daniel R. Garodnick
Albert Vann
Jessica S. Lappin
Vincent Ignizio
Robert Jackson
Diana Reyna

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Matt Viggiano
Director, Land Use and Planning
Council Member Margaret Chin

Stefanie Marazzi
Slater & Beckerman
54 Greene Street Realty Corp

Michael Phillips
Chief Operating Officer of Jamestown
Chelsea Market

Melanie Meyers
Attorney
Fried, Frank, Harris, Shriver & Jacobson

David Burns
Principal
Studios Architecture

Deborah Glick
Assembly Member
New York State

Thomas Duane
Senator
New York State Senate

Richard Gottfried
Assembly Member
New York State

Paul Fernandes
Chief of Staff
Building and Construction Trades Council of Greater
New York

Robert Benfatto
District Manager
Manhattan Community Board 4

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Lee Compton
Co-Chair, Land Use Committee
Community Board

Betty Mackintosh
Community Board 4

Joe Restuccia
Co-Chair Housing Committee
Community Board 4

Andrew Berman
Executive Director
Greenwich Village Society for Historic Preservation

Amanda Davis
Save Chelsea Market Coalition

Katy Smith
Congressman Jerry Nadler

Edrie Cody

Michael McKee

Bill Borock
President
Council of Chelsea Block Association

Madelyn Margolis

James Mari

Jim Jasper

Paul Gronke

Miguel Acevedo

Ian McGregor
Owner and operator
Lobster Place

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jordan Isenstadt
Deputy Director
Association for a Better New York

Patricia Holding

Paul Brown

Donathan Solcott

Dave Holoka

Lloyd Van Pragh

Martika Sawin

Lesley Doyel
Co-President
Save Chelsea

Lenora Friedlander
Assistant to President
SEIU Local 32BJ

Oliver Greeves

Philip Wilson

Linda Crosby

Andy Humm
President
London Terrace Tenants Association

Franklin Low

Judy Richheimer
Executive Vice President
Chelsea Reform Democratic Club

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Larry Lippman
Member
Chelsea Coalition on Housing

Hilda Regier
Board Member
Save Chelsea

Lisa Rodano
L'Arte del Gelato

Joshua David
Co-Founder
Friends of the High Line

Karen Jacob

Frank Eadie

1
2 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay. Good
3 morning, everyone, my name is Mark Weprin, I am
4 the Chair of the Zoning and Franchises
5 Subcommittee, I want to welcome everybody here
6 today.

7 I am joined by the following
8 members of the Subcommittee: Council Member Jimmy
9 Vacca, Council Member Leroy Comrie, Council Member
10 Dan Garodnick, Council Member Al Vann, Council
11 Member Jessica Lappin, Council Member Vincent
12 Ignizio. Did I miss anybody?

13 We have a number of other items
14 before we get to Chelsea Market. I know many of
15 the people here are here for Chelsea Market, so
16 we're going to try to go through this as quickly
17 as possible. You'll have to please bear with me,
18 I'll repeat this later on, but we're going to need
19 cooperation today. Please don't have outbursts,
20 I'm usually fairly lenient on this stuff, but you
21 can't be screaming out and clapping and yelling,
22 you know, you can use your hands if you want or
23 other things that are quiet, but, you know, we try
24 to keep it in orderly, let people speak. We're
25 going to let everybody speak who has signed up to

1

2 speak.

3

4 Okay. So we're going to start, we
5 have a couple of cafés to deal with first. The
6 first item on our agenda is Land Use number 708, a
7 Juicerie in Council Member Chin's office. This is
8 a hearing we already had and closed and there's
9 been some suggestion of a modification. I'd like
10 to call up Matt from Council Member Chin's office
11 to describe what that modification is. Matt,
12 would you please head to the mic? State your name
13 for the record and describe what it is you and
14 Council Member Chin would like to propose.

14

15 MATT VIGGIANO: Good morning, Mr.
16 Chair and members of the Committee. My name is
17 Matt Viggiano, I'm the Director of Land Use and
18 Planning for Council Member Margaret Chin. I'd
19 like to thank you for the opportunity to speak on
20 behalf of the Council Member.

20

21 Council Member Chin is asking that
22 the Committee approve her recommendation for
23 modification of the sidewalk café permit for 19
24 Kenmare, Juicerie LLC. The Council Member is
25 recommending modification of this application to
10 tables with 20 seats.

1
2 Kenmare Street is located in a
3 commercial district in the Little Italy
4 neighborhood of Community Board 2 within Council
5 District 1. Kenmare Street is a high-volume
6 vehicular traffic artery. This is due to vehicles
7 traversing Manhattan on their way to the Holland
8 Tunnel, this creates, as you may guess, lots of
9 cars and trucks headed down Kenmare Street, it
10 also brings lots of visitors to the area.

11 This commercial corridor, while not
12 prohibited from having sidewalk cafés, is new to
13 the experience of sidewalk cafés. This is an
14 important factor in the Council Member's
15 recommendation.

16 Council Member Chin believes that
17 sidewalk cafés will help enliven streets and that
18 this particular corridor is transitioning towards
19 that goal. We believe that the applicant should
20 be allowed to have a café and that, in fact, other
21 businesses just down the street have them--one
22 example is one approved by this Committee not too
23 long ago, and that application was for 6 tables
24 and 12 seats total.

25 So we recognize that this area is

1
2 able to accommodate outdoor cafés. The Council
3 Member believes that approval should be done
4 deliberately and at a pace respectful with
5 residents. Again, we recommend modification to 10
6 tables with 20 seats.

7 And that's all I have on that.

8 [Off mic]

9 MATT VIGGIANO: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

11 Does anyone have any questions or comments for
12 him? All right, seeing none, we're going to be
13 incorporating this modification into our vote a
14 little later on. We will be voting on a number of
15 items before the Chelsea Market hearing and then
16 we will hold the Chelsea Market hearing. We will
17 not be voting on Chelsea Market today.

18 I'd like to now mention that Land
19 Use number 723, the next item on our agenda, Bar
20 30 Lounge, in Council Member Vallone Jr.'s
21 district has been withdrawn pursuant to a letter
22 of withdrawal.

23 So we move on to Land Use number
24 722, which is 54 Greene Street. Who do we have
25 here for that? And I'd like to call up the

1
2 applicants on this matter, Stefanie Marazzi and
3 Spring Wang.

4 Ladies, whenever you're settled,
5 please turn the microphone on, state your name
6 when you speak 'cause for the record when we have
7 a transcript we need to know who's speaking at the
8 time.

9 STEFANIE MARAZZI: Good morning, my
10 name is Stefanie Marazzi from the law firm Slater
11 & Beckerman. We represent the owner of 54 Greene
12 Street, who is with me today.

13 Fifty-four Greene Street Realty
14 Corp is applying for a special permit under
15 Section 74-711 of the Zoning Resolution to allow
16 conversion of the second and fourth floors to Use
17 Group 17D, joint living-work quarters for artists,
18 and to legalize the Use Group 6 retail on the
19 first floor and cellar of the building.

20 Specifically, we're requesting modification of ZR
21 42-14D(1)(b), which prohibits JLWQA in pre-1961
22 buildings with over 5,000 square feet of lot
23 coverage, and modification of ZR 42-14D(2)(b),
24 which prohibits Use Group 6 uses below the second
25 floor in M1-5B districts.

1
2 The premises are at the southeast
3 corner of Greene and Broome Street in SoHo in an
4 M1-5B manufacturing district within the SoHo Cast
5 Iron Historic District. The building is a six-
6 story loft building constructed in 1873, with
7 33,000 square feet of floor area and a total lot
8 coverage of 5,500 square feet.

9 Currently, there is retail in the
10 cellar and on the first floor, offices and a
11 clothing store on the second floor, joint living-
12 work quarters for artists on the third, fifth, and
13 sixth floors, and office and wholesale on the
14 fourth floor. There are three retail units on the
15 ground floor of the building, of which the
16 smallest, Unit 1C, is a pre-existing grandfathered
17 Use Group 6 retail use. The existing joint
18 living-work quarters for artists on floors three,
19 five, and six were permitted pursuant to a ZR 74-
20 782 determination of residential loft occupancy in
21 1985.

22 In exchange for the change of use,
23 the owner has entered into a restrictive
24 declaration to perform restoration work, including
25 repainting and repairing the cast iron façade,

1
2 replacing missing cast iron features, repairing
3 and painting the sheet metal cornice, and
4 repairing the sidewalk cast iron and glass vault
5 covers.

6 In response to concerns raised by
7 the Community Board, the borough president, and
8 Council Member Chin, the owner has committed to
9 not leasing the ground floor and cellar of the
10 premises to a Use Group 6 eating and drinking
11 establishment and will make a determined effort to
12 rent the ground floor and cellar to diversified
13 retail uses, not to big box or chain stores. I
14 will read into the record a letter from the owner
15 stating those commitments.

16 Dear Council Member Chin, Thank you
17 and Mr. Viggiano for meeting with us regarding the
18 application for a special permit under ZR 74-711
19 for 54 Greene Street. As I mentioned in our
20 meeting, I will not lease the ground floor and
21 cellar of the premises to a Use Group 6 eating and
22 drinking establishment. I will make a determined
23 effort to lease the first floor and cellar of the
24 premises to diversified retail uses and not to big
25 box or chain stores.

1
2 As we discussed, I would prefer to
3 retain multiple retail units on the ground floor
4 of the premises, however, I would like to retain
5 the flexibility to merge units 1A and 1B if and
6 when it becomes necessary. Retail tenants in unit
7 1A have difficulty staying in business due to the
8 lack of a direct entrance on Greene Street. Its
9 current entrance is a lobby shared by the
10 residents and tenants of upper floors. The store
11 entrance and windows are three to four feet above
12 sidewalk level and, thus, have poor pedestrian
13 visibility.

14 Since the current configuration of
15 unit 1A may not be viable for retail, I may merge
16 unit 1A and 1B so that the combined unit has a
17 single entrance at the corner of Greene and Broome
18 Street. My preference, however, would be to
19 retain the current configuration of the three
20 retail units on the ground floor.

21 I greatly appreciate your time and
22 consideration of the application. Respectfully
23 submitted, Spring Wang, President 54 Greene Street
24 Realty Corp.

25 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

much.

STEFANIE MARAZZI: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: I do want to acknowledge for the record and for the panel that this application was approved by the Community Board, Community Board 2, 38 to nothing, and that Council Member Chin is supportive of this proposal.

Does anyone on the panel have any questions for these two women? Seeing none, we thank you very much.

STEFANIE MARAZZI: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: We're going to close this hearing.

STEFANIE MARAZZI: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: You're welcome. I then will--at our last meeting, we had an extensive hearing on the West Harlem Rezoning and Text Amendment, which is Land Use number 715 and 716. After detailed discussions, Council Member Jackson is with us to describe a modification that he has proposed. Council Member

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Jackson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair, my colleagues, good morning. I propose a modifications to the West Harlem Rezoning, specifically changing from an R8A to an R7D an area along West 145th Street between Broadway to the west and Amsterdam to the east.

Also, the second modification which I propose is changing from R6A to R7A an area along St. Nicholas Avenue between 152nd Street and 153rd Street.

Those are the two modification I propose to make, and I recommend my colleagues go along with this. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very much. Do any members of the Subcommittee have any questions of Mr. Jackson or any questions? Seeing none, thank you, Mr. Jackson. We are going to corporate these modifications into this item.

And we are going to move to a vote now on all the items we have heard today.

[Pause]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: That will include Land Use number 708, Juicerie, which has

1
2 the modifications that were described by Matt
3 Viggiano from Council Member Chin's district. I
4 reiterate that 723 is off the agenda pursuant to
5 withdrawal of that application. Land Use number
6 722, which is 54 Greene Street which we just heard
7 from, and Land Use number 715 and 716 is the West
8 Harlem Rezoning and Text Amendment with the
9 modifications that were just described by Council
10 Member Jackson. So we are going to couple all
11 those items into one vote. I'd like to call on
12 counsel now to read the roll and we will vote on
13 these items and then we will move on to Chelsea
14 Market.

15 [Pause]

16 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Included in
17 this vote is 723, which is a motion to withdraw
18 Bar 30, which I mentioned is off the agenda
19 because it has a motion to withdraw, so that's
20 included within this vote. Thank you.

21 [Pause]

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Chair Weprin.

23 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Aye.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member
25 Reyna.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member
Comrie.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member
Jackson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member
Vann.

[Pause]

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member
Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [No
response].

COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member
Lappin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Aye, and
congratulations to Council Member Jackson.

COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member
Vacca.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member
Ignizio.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: By a vote of eight
in the affirmative, none in the negative, land--

[Pause]

COUNCIL CLERK: --item 722--number
722 is approved, Land Use item 708, 715, and 716
are approved with modifications, and the motion to
withdraw Land Use item 720--

[Pause]

COUNCIL CLERK: --pursuant to
withdrawal is passed and referred to the full Land
Use Committee.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very
much.

[Pause]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay. So
we're now going to move onto the main event of the
morning, still a morning, which is the Chelsea
Market, thank you, very good. Quiet sign lifting
is always appropriate.

[Pause]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Mr. Garodnick,
we just voted on a number of items before the
Chelsea Market hearing, so we're going to call on

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

you to vote, so let's do that.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: You ready for me? I vote aye, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: There you go, well done, Mr. Garodnick. And we're going to move on to this hearing. Again, really I ask for cooperation from the audience, I know this is a good group and will keep it quiet. I understand people have very strong emotions on this, but we ask for quiet and respect to everyone who's testifying on both sides of the issue.

I just want to let the people who are going to be testifying after the applicants that, because of the large amount of people who have signed up to testify, we're going to limit people to about two minutes on their testimony. You know, if you could try to summarize in your head or on your paper your remarks and get your main points out within two minutes, you know, I may show a little leniency at the beginning if things are going well, but please try to keep it short. It's the only way we can get through everyone and make sure everyone's voice is heard. I apologize, I have a bit of a cold, so that may

1
2 make me more cranky than usual, I should have
3 taken a paid sick leave day, but I didn't know if
4 that would get me in trouble.

5 So anyway, we will move on.

6 [Pause]

7 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: I'd like to
8 call on now the following people to testify on
9 behalf of the application: Michael Phillips,
10 Melanie Meyers, and David Burns.

11 [Pause]

12 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Again, whoever
13 is speaking, please state your name each and every
14 time you speak if there's a break in you speaking,
15 and I see you have a couple of charts and graphs
16 and those are very appreciated. So whenever
17 you're ready, you may start.

18 MICHAEL PHILLIPS: Good morning,
19 Council Members, Chair Weprin, and Chair Comrie,
20 thank you for having us this morning. My name is
21 Michael Phillips, I'm the Chief Operating Officer
22 of Jamestown, the owner of Chelsea Market. We
23 have been working on plans to expand Chelsea
24 Market for several years and are very pleased to
25 come before you this morning with our Land Use

1
2 proposals. I will be followed by Melanie Meyers,
3 our Land Use counsel, and David Burns, the
4 architect who designed the project. They will
5 discuss in greater detail our Land Use proposals
6 and the project's design and how we've improved
7 the design during the process. I'd like to start
8 by letting you know who we are and our vision for
9 Chelsea Market and the goals in the proposal
10 before you.

11 Jamestown is a real estate company
12 that's been investing in New York City and
13 specifically in Chelsea, West Chelsea, and the
14 meat packing district since 1998. We've been the
15 majority owner and managing member of Chelsea
16 Market for almost a decade. We've invested in and
17 managed over 3.5 million square feet in New York
18 City in that time period.

19 As you know, Chelsea Market is a
20 special property with dynamic public retail
21 concourse on the ground and loft-style office on
22 the upper floors. In recent years, we've seen the
23 market grow and thrive and as tenancies change
24 marketedly for the better. For example, on the
25 ground floor concourse, we have successfully

1
2 implemented a strategy to incubate startup food
3 related retailers and, accordingly, have increased
4 the number of tenants substantially from 23 to 33
5 in just the past five years, with even more on the
6 way with our new kiosk plans.

7 On the upper floors, Chelsea Market
8 has been transformed over the last decade to house
9 more than 3,500 jobs in media, creative arts, and
10 high-tech industries. Among our major tenants are
11 NY1, Google, Major League Baseball, Advance Media,
12 the Food Network. These businesses represent some
13 very few industries that have grown during the
14 recession. These businesses come to Chelsea
15 Market because of the vibrancy of the ground floor
16 and the opportunities presented in large floor
17 plates and high floor-ceiling heights of Chelsea
18 Market, and the synergy of located with other
19 like-minded industries and workers.

20 In turn, Jamestown has invested and
21 will continue to devote substantial resources
22 towards bringing food and technology offerings to
23 the market to the broader community. Through
24 participation in nutrition programming, annual
25 scholarships to Fulton Youth of the Future with

1
2 our partner, James Beard Foundation, and job
3 development programs, we believe the synergy
4 happening inside the market is having a direct and
5 positive effect on our neighbors.

6 As a result of these successes and,
7 in particular, to the recent growth of our high-
8 tech and media tenants, Chelsea Market is now out
9 of room. We are asking for the opportunity to
10 allow these businesses to continue to expand and
11 thrive in what has become their home, and which
12 will also allow for Chelsea Market to remain
13 vibrant, contributing resource that it has
14 developed into over the past 15 years.

15 Our proposed expansion of the
16 market is intended to accomplish some meaningful,
17 long-lasting goals for improving the Chelsea
18 neighborhood. First, the expansion creates the
19 much-needed space for our expanding tech and media
20 company tenants widely viewed as the next great
21 economic opportunity for New York City.

22 Second, it will provide funds to
23 support the development of new affordable housing
24 units in the West Chelsea neighborhood.

25 Third, it will support the High

1
2 Line Park through a contribution of funds and new
3 amenities, such as educational workshop rooms,
4 back-of-the-house space, public restrooms, and
5 freight elevator access.

6 Fourth, addition to space for
7 office workers, it will support ground floor food
8 market, allowing it to thrive into the future.

9 Finally, the expansion is
10 anticipated to create more than 1,200 new
11 permanent jobs in the high-tech and media
12 industries, as well as an additional 600 union
13 construction jobs and the expansion of unionized
14 security, engineering, electrical, and
15 housekeeping workforce.

16 We greatly appreciate the
17 constructive input from the Community Board and
18 other stakeholders throughout this public review
19 process. As Melanie and David will further
20 discuss, we have been able to respond to these
21 important concerns in a number of ways, but in
22 particular, through making revisions to the
23 proposed design and a mechanism for the project to
24 generate a contribution to affordable housing in
25 the community.

1
2 We appreciate your consideration
3 and ask for your support.

4 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.
5 Ms. Meyers, you going to speak next?

6 MELANIE MEYERS: Yes.

7 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay.

8 MELANIE MEYERS: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Say your name
10 anyway.

11 MELANIE MEYERS: I will. Good
12 morning, my name is Melanie Meyers, I am an
13 attorney with Fried, Frank, Harris, Shriver &
14 Jacobson, and am here representing the applicant
15 before you.

16 What I want to do is three things:
17 I want to talk a little bit about the building and
18 the context of the building, want to very briefly
19 describe the proposal, and, as Michael said, the
20 Community Board and the borough president worked
21 very hard on making a number of recommendations
22 and we want to talk about the modifications that
23 we have made in response to the concerns that
24 we've heard.

25 So first looking at the site

1
2 itself, the Chelsea Market is located between 15th
3 and 16th Street, 9th and 10th Avenues in West
4 Chelsea. It is an interesting building, it is
5 actually a combination of somewhere between 14 and
6 19 buildings, depending on who's counting, that
7 were built between the turn of the century until
8 about the 1940s. It was the home of the Nabisco
9 factory and as the Nabisco factory grew and
10 flourished, new buildings were built, buildings
11 were connected, and it ended up with a really
12 interesting compilation of buildings.

13 When the Nabisco factory left the
14 area, the building remained, but it didn't quite
15 have the dynamism that it had before. The upper
16 floors became vacant or were turned into more
17 storage and warehouse uses. The ground floor had
18 limited uses at that point.

19 The past 15 years, about, there's
20 been a real change. The Chelsea Market has made a
21 complete transformation in terms of the uses, both
22 on the ground floor and in the upper floors. The
23 ground floor has a really interesting food-related
24 concourse that is both a amenity for the
25 community, for visitors to the building. It is

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

also the lobby for the uses up above.

Above the ground floor is about 900,000 square feet of space which, again, over the past 10 to 15 years has been transformed into the homes of some of the most important media and tech companies in the city.

To the east and to the west of Chelsea Market are other buildings which have sort of experienced the same sort of transformation. The neighbor to the east is Google headquarters, and the property to the west of Chelsea Market also has a series of high-tech tenants.

From a physical location standpoint, the Chelsea Market block is immediately south of the Special West Chelsea District as it exists today. That was a zoning that was adopted in 2005, as you know, you were all part of it--or many of you were part of it at that point, and that was a proposal that was designed to allow for additional density, additional uses in the area, in exchange for contributions and improvements to the High Line Park and for other amenities.

Looking at the site from a sort of

1
2 more physical standpoint--and this maybe, David,
3 it would be helpful if you could take a look a
4 little bit--Chelsea Market is in the mix of a sort
5 of series of smaller--of older and newer
6 buildings, taller and shorter buildings. The
7 first, I guess it's the upper left-hand corner, is
8 sort of showing the Chelsea Market, which is a
9 small building, looking up 10th Avenue and it is
10 currently sort of in line with a series of
11 buildings ranging from a height of about 200 feet
12 to 250 feet. If you move to the upper right-hand
13 corner, that's bringing in a little bit closer and
14 you can see part of the proposal about to be--to
15 show you.

16 From the north, in the lower left-
17 hand corner, what you see is a building that's
18 immediately north of the Chelsea Market block,
19 it's called the Caledonia, it's a residential
20 building that was built as part of the Special
21 West Chelsea District.

22 And the last image is looking
23 northward on 9th Avenue, where you can see the
24 shape of Chelsea Market on the left-hand side and
25 the Fulton Houses to the north.

1
2 Looking at the image--looking at
3 the block sort of closer in, what--again, I think
4 this image is helpful to see sort of how the built
5 form sits around the Chelsea Market block. Right
6 now, it's sort of a low point in what is a
7 mixture, again, of low and high-rise buildings.
8 You can see the buildings on the 10th Avenue side
9 ranging from an FAR standpoint from 7 1/2 to 12
10 FAR, and from a heights ranging from about 185
11 feet to 250 feet. On the 9th Avenue side, again,
12 you see heights of buildings and densities ranging
13 from about 220 feet and 275 feet.

14 So the proposal would be to really
15 take the Chelsea Market block bring it into what
16 we think is kind of zoning parity with some of its
17 neighbors and to make two additions to the block.
18 On the 10th Avenue side, the proposal would be to
19 add an approximately 210,000 square foot office
20 component that would be expansion space for the
21 existing tenants that exist in Chelsea Market, as
22 well as space for new media, technology tenants
23 that might locate in the area.

24 On the 9th Avenue side, there is an
25 additional development, and that would be about a

1
2 90,000 square foot office addition that would,
3 again, sort of work within, we believe, the
4 framework of the existing Chelsea Market and the
5 surrounding area.

6 I do want to point out, there's an-
7 -in this particular image there is a dotted line,
8 which I think is just too important to know that is
9 a currently a vacate site that's fully permitted
10 and it is permitted for a 284-foot tall building
11 which is under construction. So there'll be one
12 additional taller building that would be added to
13 the complex.

14 In order to achieve this plan, we
15 are seeking two actions today. One is a zoning
16 map amendment, and the second is a zoning text
17 amendment, which would be an amendment to the
18 Special West Chelsea District. The map amendment
19 would be to maintain the current zoning
20 designation of M1-5, but it would be to extend the
21 Special West Chelsea District to cover the entire
22 Chelsea Market block.

23 The zoning text amendment has a
24 number of elements to it. The first would be--the
25 Special West Chelsea District currently has--

1
2 should count--I think it's eight sub-area, sub-
3 area 8 is sub-area H, and there are specific
4 controls that relate to each of those that relate
5 to the overall--the specific context of each of
6 those areas. We would be creating a new sub-area
7 J for the Chelsea Market block and there would be
8 a number of elements that would be part of the
9 sub-area J controls.

10 The first would be to establish a
11 specific envelope controls for the site.
12 Currently, under the M1-5 zoning, tower controls
13 are allowed on the site, height and setback
14 controls are allowed, and the potential for a
15 quite tall building is something that is--it
16 exists today under current zoning. And rather
17 than having those sorts of limitations or those
18 sorts of rights, what we'd be proposing is a
19 maximum height limitation with specified setbacks
20 on the 10th Avenue side with a maximum height of
21 230 feet, and David will go through those
22 particulars. And on the 9th Avenue side, a
23 maximum height of 135 feet.

24 We would allow under the zoning
25 text amendment the ability to increase the density

1
2 of the site from the current zoning, which the
3 current building is about 5.4 FAR, the zoning
4 would allow for an increase in overall density to
5 7.5 FAR and to do that it would be employing
6 controls that currently exist in the Special West
7 Chelsea District, and they are controls that have
8 been used for development in the area, including
9 the Caledonia to the north.

10 There'd be three things that would
11 be a requirement to reach the maximum development
12 potential: There would need to be a contribution
13 made on a per-square foot basis to a affordable
14 housing fund which exists as part of the Special
15 West Chelsea text, and that would be a
16 contribution that would be made at the time
17 development proceeds.

18 There would also be a contribution
19 to a High Line Improvement Fund, also that exists
20 in the zoning text today and it would be applied
21 to this block.

22 And third, there would be physical
23 amenities that would be built as part of the
24 development to benefit and support the activities
25 and operations of the High Line. And, again,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

David will go through that as well.

There are also some additional controls that would be part of the--that are part of the text. In response to community concerns, the text has been amended at the City Planning to prohibit the use of hotels use within any new development. It also would include a requirement for preserving the ground floor retail concourse and it will also impose certain design and preservation requirements, which was, again, something that we spent a lot of time working and talking to the Community Board. So that's the overall view, the text amendment itself.

In terms of the modifications, the Community Board made a very thoughtful and a very long and a detailed recommendation on this project, and we really thank them and the borough president staff for their deliberations, their considerations. I think we've been able to achieve a number of the goals and requests of the Community Board and I did want to just sort of run through that. You know, first there was a request that we modify the maximum height from the certified height, and we were able to do that.

1
2 There was a request that we reduce any heights and
3 any additions in the mid-block, and we were able
4 to do that. There were requests to modify and
5 change the envelope on 10th Avenue and, while we
6 didn't meet what the Community Board and what
7 you'll see isn't 100% what the Community Board
8 asked for, we made some significant modifications
9 to that development envelope. They asked for a
10 mechanism to provide for contributions to the
11 affordable housing, and we've been able to do
12 that. They asked for the prohibition on hotel, we
13 were able to do that. They asked for ground floor
14 retail controls, we were able to do that. They
15 asked for measures to protect both the existing
16 fabric of Chelsea Market, as well as the quality
17 of the new additions, and we were able to do that.
18 And we also made commitments to the Community
19 Board to continue public art displays in the
20 concourse, which is something that happens today,
21 to work with the Community Board for job postings,
22 for job fairs, for residents of the community to
23 build the enlargements to a LEED Silver standard,
24 to adopt a construction task force as part of any
25 development that proceeds, and to not have any

1
2 above-grade open air eating and drinking
3 establishments.

4 So we think we've responded to many
5 things we heard in the process, we think we have a
6 great project. It was gratifying to us that as
7 part in recognition of these changes that we got a
8 unanimous approval from the City Planning
9 Commission recommending approval as modified of
10 the application and we're here to ask for your
11 support.

12 Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

14 DAVID BURNS: My name is David
15 Burns, I'm a principal with Studios Architecture,
16 and as Melanie and Michael said, I'm going to
17 elaborate a little bit more on the proposals. I'm
18 going to start quickly with just the site and the
19 proposals and how they interact and sit on the
20 site, then I'll go into a little bit more detail
21 on 9th Avenue, then 10th Avenue, and then I'll
22 return to the High Line amenities that Melanie had
23 just alluded to.

24 So, again, the overall image of the
25 site, the combination of buildings, and the view

1
2 of the proposals. So at 10th Avenue, a commercial
3 addition that has some immediate setbacks and then
4 we'll talk about this proposal shows the changes
5 from the ULURP certification through the process
6 to where we are today. Overall height at 226 feet
7 on the west side of the site and 135 feet on the
8 east side of the site, with the mid-block being
9 reduced to 130 feet.

10 This just shows an image of the
11 current usage on the ground floor to get a better
12 understanding of the retail uses versus non-retail
13 uses. So the portions that are grayed out are the
14 loading kind of service areas that are also office
15 entries, those function as the buildings, the
16 office spaces' main lobby. So the elevators all
17 interact with the space, which helps kind of
18 support that dynamism and synergy between the
19 retail functions and the office functions above.

20 The same plan, but with the new
21 vertical circulation shown. So the two areas--and
22 I'll use the mouse to highlight these--this would
23 be the new elevator bank that would take people up
24 to the 10th Avenue portion. The two elevators on
25 the eastern side of the site would be the two new

1
2 elevators to the 9th Avenue portion. Really
3 showing the minimal impact on the overall ground
4 floor of the market. The overall impact in retail
5 is under a total of about 1,000 feet. The two
6 other areas are falling within existing loading
7 docks and existing freight elevators. This is
8 part of the structural support system for the 10th
9 Avenue addition, really to minimize overall impact
10 on the market, the spaces above, and the ground
11 floor uses.

12 So first with 9th Avenue, 9th
13 Avenue is a one-story building currently at 16th
14 Street and 9th Avenue flanked by two three-story
15 buildings. Immediately to the south, is an eight-
16 story portion that's one of the more iconic
17 portions of Chelsea Market, which is the entry.
18 The entry to the building is here, kind of between
19 the three-story and eight-story portions. And a
20 slide of the ULURP massing, which originally was
21 designated as a hotel use, to the current massing,
22 which is an office use. The office use would be
23 aligned floor plates with a façade design that
24 you'll see in a second that mimics a lot of the
25 façade that's happening on the south side of the

1
2 block. With a setback at the existing building
3 height cornice on the 9th Avenue side, and a 15-
4 foot setback over the townhouse on 16th Street,
5 which was also a request from the Community Board.
6 The overall height at 135 feet is lower than the
7 total height at this corner, which is about 142.

8 A view from the north looking south
9 along 9th Avenue showing a terra cotta façade with
10 windows and a similar rhythm to the windows that
11 are currently on the building, and a top floor
12 that is set back from the street on both sides.

13 And then the view from the south
14 again looking north. Again, the terra cotta
15 coloration will be similar to that of the brick
16 that exists on the market today.

17 So from here I'll go quickly
18 through 10th Avenue. Again, the ULURP massing,
19 which was eight stories of new construction that
20 sat in line with the 10th Avenue façade of Chelsea
21 Market. The High Line passes through this portion
22 of the building, which makes for some of the
23 structural challenges of the building. Through
24 the process, through the Community Board process,
25 and with City Planning and borough president,

1
2 we've shifted the mass and pushed the mass 15 feet
3 back from 10th Avenue, pushed the setbacks back
4 accordingly, and included an additional setback at
5 the top of another 40 feet at the eighth floor to
6 minimize the visibility from the street and from
7 the High Line, and also maximizing light and air
8 to the High Line.

9 The material images, the references
10 on the top right and the lower left are references
11 from Community Board 4 about material coloration,
12 as well as smaller apertures, smaller elements in
13 the fenestration design, both of which we've
14 incorporated into the new design. We are
15 proposing a terra cotta façade, which is actually
16 lighter in weight than a brick façade, given some
17 of the structural challenges we have, but the
18 coloration will be very similar to what is on the
19 building below in a combination of that and some
20 gray metal surrounds on the windows, which is also
21 similar to the fenestration of the existing
22 building of the market.

23 So a view from the west side
24 highway. We see the initial setback off of 10th
25 Avenue, this is the Caledonian in the background,

1
2 and 85-10th across the street. This was really
3 part of the process of determining that that datum
4 of that first setback to have a reference with the
5 immediate neighborhood, and you see the terra
6 cotta material and the depth of the façade, which
7 relates to the masonry depth below.

8 A view from the High Line with the
9 façade pulled back from 10th Avenue.

10 And then a view from the north on
11 10th Avenue, again, looking south with the
12 Caledonian in the foreground on the left-hand
13 side.

14 So very quickly I'll describe the
15 High Line amenities, which was one of the elements
16 that Melanie mentioned. The portion that is being
17 proposed for the High Line amenity is dotted in in
18 white. This represents about 50% of the frontage
19 along the High Line passage as the High Line
20 passes under the existing building. And in
21 orange, you'll see where that is an area of what
22 it is in the floor. The space currently is at the
23 same level as the High Line that, as Melanie
24 mentioned, there'll be a combination of restrooms
25 for the High Line, new freight elevator, back-of-

1
2 house staging space, as well as educational space
3 that can be used directly off of the High Line.
4 This is approximately about 5,000 square feet of
5 space that's currently office space. This also
6 includes a new freight elevator that will have
7 access--dedicated access to the basement as well,
8 for an additional 1,200 square feet or so of
9 storage for back-of-house uses for the High Line.

10 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay. Thank
11 you very much. I'm going to let my colleagues
12 start, I'm going to ask Council Member Dan
13 Garodnick to start, please, ask some questions or
14 comments.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank
16 you very much, Mr. Chairman, and I just want to
17 note Council Member Lappin was kind enough to let
18 me jump the line for a moment because I have to
19 rush out.

20 Thank you for your testimony. I
21 want to just focus on two very quick issues, and
22 then will defer back to Council Member Lappin.
23 The first is on the affordable housing fund, it
24 sounds like the 7 1/2 FAR is achieved if there is
25 a contribution, and among other requirements, to

1
2 the affordable housing fund that was created in
3 the context of the West Chelsea rezoning. How
4 much of a contribution is that; what exists in the
5 fund today? Help us understand where things stand
6 on that affordable housing fund.

7 MELANIE MEYERS: Sure. When the
8 Special West Chelsea was adopted, they did create
9 the concept of these two funds: The High Line
10 Improvement Fund and the affordable housing fund.
11 Both of them established a monetary contribution
12 for every square foot of development. So at the
13 time of the adoption of the Special West Chelsea
14 District, the contribution was \$50 a square foot.
15 That's adjusted annually for CPI, and so I believe
16 that the current number is \$59.70, and it will
17 fluctuate every July 1st for those portions.

18 For the Chelsea Market project, the
19 first 80,000 square feet of development would
20 generate a contribution towards the affordable
21 housing fund, and if you do the math, that adds up
22 to about \$4.7 million.

23 If the full project, as David has
24 described, is built out, the overall contribution
25 to both the affordable housing fund and the High

1
2 Line Improvement Fund is about \$17 1/2 million.

3 Today, this would be the first use
4 of the affordable housing fund in Special West
5 Chelsea when this project is adopted. At least at
6 this point, nobody has contributed to that fund,
7 so this is a great opportunity to use that fund.
8 For the High Line Improvement Fund, the Caledonia
9 to our north, has contributed to that fund for its
10 project. I can't give you the exact number of
11 what their contribution added up to because I just
12 don't know the math, but that was used for capital
13 improvements to the High Line fund.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I see.
15 So the \$59.70 per square foot, which is the
16 current threshold, or the current dollar amount
17 for contribution to the fund, none of that has
18 been paid into the fund to-date, is that correct?

19 MELANIE MEYERS: That is for this
20 project, for this project, that is absolutely--

21 [Crosstalk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK:
23 [Interposing] Sorry, I mean overall, in terms of
24 the dollars in the West Chelsea affordable housing
25 fund, there is no money in there to--

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

[Crosstalk]

MELANIE MEYERS: [Interposing] That is correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay. And is that because that was an option for developers or is it because the development that was within that area did not happen?

MELANIE MEYERS: Again, you know, there are these variety of sub-districts and they all have, sort of, their unique controls. At the time of the adoption, I would say that the focus of the--or the impetus for the text was really about the High Line and how to encourage the High Line and I think that, sort of, in many of the districts, the High Line improvements are actually given, I'd call it, preference over contributions to the affordable housing fund. This would actually reverse what has happened in other sub-districts to have the affordable house sort of benefit from development first. And I'm not sure I'm quite answering your question--

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [Interposing] Yeah, I'm not sure that that does because what I don't understand is whether that

1
2 was an option or a requirement in the West Chelsea
3 rezoning, and if it was a requirement, why there
4 are no dollars in the fund for affordable housing
5 there.

6 MELANIE MEYERS: [Interposing] I
7 see. I think it's more accurate to call it an
8 option, and it--for other areas and, again, for
9 most areas, the ability to take--to put monies
10 into the affordable housing fund is limited. So,
11 for example--and this is just an example--the
12 affordable housing fund is available to sites
13 that--there's another mechanism--let me step back--
14 -there's another mechanism in Special West Chelsea
15 that allows for development rights that are over
16 the High Line to be transferred, to be sold by the
17 owner of those properties to other properties in
18 the area. There is a provision in Special West
19 Chelsea that says that after 95% of that floor
20 area has been transferred, if somebody else wants
21 to build and take advantage of a higher density,
22 they can do so by making a contribution to the
23 affordable housing fund. So that's sort of an
24 example of how in other areas there's sort of a
25 preference for High Line improvements. And,

1
2 again, so we can sort--we can provide sort of
3 details on all of the mechanisms, but I think it's
4 generally fair to say that there's a preference
5 for and options for the High Line Improvement
6 Fund.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: So then
8 for here--

9 MELANIE MEYERS: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --let's
11 talk specifically about this project. It's an
12 80,000 square foot development, the contributions
13 to the affordable housing fund would be calculated
14 in the same way it's calculated in the West
15 Chelsea rezoning, so that would be today \$59.70--

16 MELANIE MEYERS: Correct.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --and
18 that could change, obviously. Is this an option
19 in the same way that it is an option in the rest
20 of the West Chelsea rezoning as you described it,
21 or is this something that has to happen
22 contemporaneous with or prior to the construction
23 of those 80,000 square feet?

24 MELANIE MEYERS: It is different
25 than the other mechanisms. The requirement would

1
2 be for the--in order to take advantage of the
3 bonus that and in order to have take advantage of
4 the first 80,000 square feet of bonus, the monies-
5 -the contribution would go first to the affordable
6 housing fund. The overall project is about
7 290,000 square feet, so they start on 9th Avenue,
8 it's an 80,000 square feet project that--if that
9 was the first part that started, you'd pull a
10 building permit and at the time of pulling the
11 building permit, the contribution to the
12 affordable housing fund would be required to be
13 made. Does that answer your question?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I think
15 it does.

16 MELANIE MEYERS: Okay.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I'm
18 going to defer back to my colleague, Council
19 Member Lappin, I just will note that we want to be
20 certain that when there are commitments made here,
21 particularly on affordable housing, that there are
22 mechanisms in place to make sure that it happens
23 and that it's locked in. So we're certainly going
24 to talk to you more about this and make sure that
25 we have a very clear picture. I will just note, I

1
2 had a couple of other questions which, hopefully,
3 will come out in the course of the testimony today
4 about the retail uses, how much of that is food,
5 what the current balance is, what the other 40% is
6 beyond 60%. But I will leave that and I certainly
7 will have staff here as I go. So, Council Member
8 Lappin, thank you again.

9 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Mr.
10 Garodnick. Council Member Lappin.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Thank you,
12 Mr. Chair. I have a few questions for you. So
13 seven years ago, there was the creation of the
14 Special West Chelsea District in 2005, I was not
15 in the City Council, I was elected to the City
16 Council in 2005. So I'm hoping you can educate
17 me, especially since I think, Mr. Phillips, you
18 said in your testimony you've been a majority
19 stakeholder for a decade, so you must have been
20 involved in those talks back then.

21 [Off mic]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Okay. So
23 this property was not included in that district.
24 Why? And were there discussions about including
25 it in the district at that time?

1
2 MELANIE MEYERS: So I'm going to
3 talk a little bit, and then turn it over to
4 Michael because he obviously has more sort of
5 direct... You know, there were discussions and if
6 you read the Community Board's recommendation for
7 the Special West Chelsea District that was adopted
8 at that point, it includes recommendations of
9 extending the district southward. The Jamestown's
10 management of the property occurred in 2004--
11 that's right?--and at that point, the scope of the
12 Special West Chelsea District had been established
13 and they were sort of working through it. You're
14 right, it didn't get adopted 'til 2005, but I
15 think that there's a record that the ownership of
16 Chelsea Market is actually on support and on board
17 with the Special West Chelsea District, support
18 for the High Line, and a desire, even from that
19 point, to be included within the district.

20 When the Jamestown came into the
21 picture, it was, frankly, too late to do it at
22 that point, so that--

23 [Crosstalk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN:

25 [Interposing] So it was--

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MELANIE MEYERS: --part of it.

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: --so it was purposefully excluded then at the time.

MELANIE MEYERS: And if you ask why the prior owner was concerned and I would say opposed to Special West Chelsea District at that time, you know, he is not here. Some of the things that I think it's important to keep in mind--and, you know, Chelsea Market is an established building in the community, it is an established, we think, amenity, the retail concourse is something that I think people really prize and cherish, but it's not that old of a building. It was an underutilized building until the end of the 1990s, it was converted to its current concept starting at that point. So in 2002 and 2003, when they're starting to think about the High Line, we didn't have a Chelsea Market that's as vibrant, as healthy as it is now, we had a new concept.

I can see somebody who was creating a new concept being worried about change and I think it may well be that.

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: No, I

1
2 understand it's not a very old building, it's not
3 a very old Special West Chelsea zoning district
4 either, right? So would you like to address that,
5 Mr. Phillips?

6 MICHAEL PHILLIPS: Yeah, maybe I
7 would just say that Chelsea Market is a whole city
8 block and at the time of the West Chelsea special
9 zoning district prior to our management of the
10 building and the contemplation of it in the early
11 2000s, it was very unclear what it meant to have a
12 West Chelsea special zoning district and to have a
13 whole city block with the High Line going through
14 it, I think probably provided a certain amount of
15 fear to the previous owners about what that meant.
16 And so as we became involved in the building, we
17 immediately, you know, went through a process of--
18 our earliest letters to the City Planning were in
19 2004, and so we've worked in earnest to become
20 part of the West Chelsea special zoning district
21 since that time.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: So you had
23 a consistent position, but I guess City Planning
24 has not? Because City Planning decided this was
25 not in the scope at that time.

1
2 MELANIE MEYERS: I think it was
3 more a question of that the previous owner of the
4 building had some real concerns and that City
5 Planning listened to those concerns. And at the
6 time in 2004, bringing in another block, they had
7 a proposal that was well under way.

8 I mean, one other thing I just
9 wanted to mention is, you know, Chelsea Market, if
10 you think of it as an asset, as a building, again,
11 it's 17 buildings, it sort of has different floor
12 plates heights and every building has a different
13 height. It's not an easy building to make
14 successful.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: I
16 understand.

17 MELANIE MEYERS: And at the time,
18 you know, the options for the site is, if you
19 think about it as a development site and you think
20 about the ability to build a tower on a full city
21 block, that's an option that I think somebody who
22 was worried about what the future of the building
23 would be, would probably more interest--

24 [Crosstalk]

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN:

1
2 [Interposing] I want to keep moving, I just want
3 to highlight, I mean, a lot of work, you know, I
4 wasn't here, but I'm told a lot of work went into
5 creating a district that, you know, now there are
6 attempts to change and it hasn't been a district
7 for that long, so that raises a flag for me.

8 I wanted to ask about the
9 affordable housing fund within the district. Has
10 any affordable housing ever been built by
11 contributions to that fund?

12 MELANIE MEYERS: The fund, again,
13 part of 2005 and there has not been a contribution
14 to that fund today, and if this project proceeds,
15 then it would be probably the first contribution
16 to that fund.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN:
18 [Interposing] So it hasn't been particularly
19 successful. So how--where would be the money be
20 transferred to and who would be responsible for
21 building the affordable housing?

22 MELANIE MEYERS: The affordable
23 housing fund is managed by the City and under the
24 authority of HPD.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: So has HPD

1
2 shared rules or thoughts on how they will build
3 the housing? Where it will be built, et cetera?
4 How they will logistically do it?

5 MELANIE MEYERS: [Interposing] HPD,
6 as you know, has a big portfolio and has lots of
7 developers working with them, and so if you're
8 asking whether or not there has been a formal
9 designation of any monies in the affordable
10 housing fund to any site, the answer is no.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: So it's a
12 big question mark still. Traffic, do you think
13 this project will add to the traffic in the
14 neighborhood?

15 MELANIE MEYERS: We looked at
16 traffic, we did an exhaustive environmental
17 assessment statement. At the end of the day, you
18 know, what we have is a project--at the time of
19 certification it was a project which was about 300
20 and--do the math--340,000 square feet. The
21 environmental analysis that was done was based on
22 looking at a project of that size, it did not show
23 the potential for significant adverse impact.
24 Since the timing of the certification, the project
25 has been reduced in scale substantially so it's an

1
2 even smaller project and there is I think even
3 less of a concern.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: So that's a
5 no, you don't think it will add traffic to the
6 area.

7 MELANIE MEYERS: We do not think it
8 will cause an impact, there will be certainly some
9 minimal traffic that will be added.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Okay. And
11 my last question, you know, I understand that a
12 lot of the businesses there have been successful
13 and that is a positive thing for the City, but I
14 think the idea is for these businesses to grow,
15 but not necessarily to only grow in one spot. And
16 there are, you know, Hudson Yards springs to mind
17 as another place where businesses could
18 potentially locate. You, in your presentation,
19 had a building across the street that you said was
20 already permitted. Is that permitted for
21 residential or commercial use?

22 MELANIE MEYERS: The buildings to
23 the east and the west?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: There was a
25 building across the avenue that you had--

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

[Crosstalk]

MELANIE MEYERS: [Interposing] Oh,
to the south.

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: --line.

MELANIE MEYERS: Oh, that is a
hotel and it'll be, again, a 284 26-story hotel.

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: So I guess
my question is, is it your position that there are
not other locations in and around Chelsea where
some of these businesses could grow?

MELANIE MEYERS: The building is a
unique asset, the building has a number of
elements which are really important to these sorts
of users. The building also has an incredible
amount of infrastructure and investment that these
types of users need. It's not a--if you look on
the roof of 111-8th Avenue, which is across the
street, if you look at the roof of Chelsea Market,
it's filled with equipment, it's filled with
materials that are able to be accommodated in a
building that occupies a full city block and its
infrastructure that would be both expensive and
difficult to recreate in many other types of
buildings. Michael, do you want to say?

1
2 MICHAEL PHILLIPS: Yeah, I would
3 just add and the need of these users is to grow
4 jobs and people, not necessarily more technology.
5 So if you look at the expansion needs and
6 expansion that's occurred today, it's largely been
7 adjunct workforce to those businesses.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: No, I
9 understand, I've been in the Google space and, you
10 know, we're rushing through an East Midtown
11 rezoning because I'm hearing the argument that we
12 need to build more space that I guess would be
13 competitive with Chelsea Market.

14 MICHAEL PHILLIPS: I don't think
15 Midtown is competitive with Chelsea Market in
16 regards to technology and media, I think, you
17 know, Midtown has its own drivers.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: I guess
19 that's exactly the point I'm getting to, that
20 we're not going to grow thousands of jobs in just
21 Chelsea Market, right? We're going to have to
22 have businesses grow in other buildings and other
23 locations for the long-term economic viability of
24 the city. Right? We can't make Chelsea Market
25 become sort of a massive--

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MICHAEL PHILLIPS: Certainly.

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Right. So, okay, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Ms. Lappin. Council Member Comrie.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you, Chair Weprin. What is your--your building envelope, is it higher or wider than any of the contiguous buildings in the area?

MELANIE MEYERS: I think we have is a board the development envelope or else we have it towards the end of this presentation. David, do you remember?

DAVID BURNS: [Off mic] board.

MELANIE MEYERS: Yeah, so let's put this in two ways, is it the first one? Yes. I don't know that this isn't the prettiest picture in the world, but this sort of shows it and maybe it's helpful, yeah, that's actually a better picture 'cause it shows it in the context. So just to give you a sense of the heights, along 10th Avenue, the building that's immediately to the north of the site, it's the Caledonia, it's 250 feet tall, this is on the 10th Avenue side.

1
2 The maximum height of our project is 250 feet. As
3 you move further down on 10th Avenue, the High
4 Line building is 203 feet; the standard hotel,
5 which is another block south, is 250 feet. So we
6 think from a height standpoint on 10th Avenue,
7 we're well within what's there.

8 On the 9th Avenue side, the
9 building that's immediately across the street is
10 111-8th Avenue, our proposal is 135 feet for
11 maximum height; the 111-8th Avenue building is 275
12 feet tall; the Fulton Houses buildings to the
13 north, which is probably kind of--you know, it's
14 one of the older residential buildings in the
15 area, is 220 feet tall; and, as we mentioned, the
16 hotel that's being proposed on the south is 284.

17 From a floor area standpoint, the
18 Google building is about a 13 FAR building, the
19 buildings to the west are about between 10 and 11
20 FAR, and the Caledonia building, which was built
21 to 7 1/2 and what we're proposing is a proposal
22 which brings it up to 7.5.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: So your
24 building is not creating any light and shadow
25 issues for any of the adjacent buildings or any of

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

the properties around the particular area.

MELANIE MEYERS: We think that it's well within the existing fabric. One of the analyses that was done as part of the environmental assessment statement was a shadow study and in particular shadows on the--whether or not there would be a significant increase in shadows on the High Line, because that's the public park that's in the district, and the analysis showed, you know, very limited incremental shadows, and with the modifications from City Planning of pulling the building back further, you know, even those small shadows will be reduced a little bit.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: And what is your construction plan for the building, what part of the building is going to be developed first? Is it this part of 10th Avenue or the part over-- or the 9th Avenue side?

MELANIE MEYERS: [Off mic].

MICHAEL PHILLIPS: I mean, I would think our current plan would be to build both sections at the same time--

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Same time.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MICHAEL PHILLIPS: --in the same sequence.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay.

MICHAEL PHILLIPS: And I think it matters about what engineering resolutions are easiest.

MELANIE MEYERS: And overall, it's about a 18-month construction schedule.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: And have you worked out a mitigation with the traffic and the issues on 9th and 10th Avenue and 14th Street and how that would--those construction issues would not impede traffic flow or pedestrian traffic for High Line--

[Crosstalk]

MELANIE MEYERS: [Interposing] What we've committed to is to create a construction task force at the time of construction to work with the Community Board to make sure that, you know, the construction measures work as best as possible to make sure that you don't have the kinds of effects that you're talking about.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: The fund for the High Line, will you be administrating that

1
2 directly or is that given to the--is that given to
3 whoever's in charge of the High Line project
4 specifically?

5 MELANIE MEYERS: It is a
6 contribution that is made to the City, it's
7 administered by the Department of Parks and
8 Recreation, and the Friends of the High Line are
9 certainly have a role in looking at that, but the
10 monies are actually given to the Department and
11 Parks.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: And since
13 your building encompasses part of the High Line,
14 will there be structural or interior improvements
15 done to enhance the walkway or the High Line in
16 that area or within the building itself?

17 MELANIE MEYERS: And, David, do you
18 want to go through it? Like, David can go through
19 a little bit.

20 DAVID BURNS: Sure. The areas
21 where the High Line amenities will happen, there
22 will be changes to those façades where the High
23 Line passes through the building. The remaining
24 façades will depend on the user that occupies that
25 other portion along the High Line.

1
2 As far as structural changes, the
3 structure is designed to avoid any changes to the
4 High Line. So all the structure happens east of
5 the High Line, so we're avoiding any penetrations
6 through the existing High Line structure and being
7 isolated completely from it.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: My
9 understanding was that there was going to be some
10 ease of access for the High Line when the
11 documents that were presented to me earlier.
12 There's--

13 MELANIE MEYERS: [Interposing] Yes,
14 there will be. Again, there'll be about--there
15 are three elements in terms of what the developer
16 would be building within the existing Chelsea
17 Market for the High Line. The first would be a
18 dedicated freight elevator that would be accessed
19 from West 16th Street and that would provide
20 access both directly up to the High Line level, as
21 well as to the basement. Maybe there's four
22 elements.

23 There is storage within the
24 basement that would be dedicated to the High Line
25 at the High Line level, in addition to the freight

1
2 elevator, the developer would be building out
3 public restrooms that would be accessed from the
4 High Line, and in addition would be creating about
5 5,000 square feet of space--is that the right
6 number? About 5,000 square feet of space at the
7 High Line level within the existing Chelsea Market
8 building, and that would be space that would be
9 used by the High Line and dedicated to the High
10 Line for use as educational space, as use for
11 support space for any activities or events on the
12 High Line.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: And what
14 floor would that be approximately? First floor,
15 second floor?

16 DAVID BURNS: It's approximately
17 the third floor, there--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:
19 [Interposing] Third floor?

20 MELANIE MEYERS: Yeah.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: So it could
22 be used for a community space for the Friends of
23 the High Line or Community Board meetings or
24 anything else?

25 MELANIE MEYERS: You know, I think,

1
2 again, it's dedicated to and would be dedicated to
3 use by the High Line, but that being said, they
4 certainly are expecting that it could be used for-
5 -they have educational programs that it could be
6 used for that and there's, I'm sure, the potential
7 at certain times for additional uses.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I mean,
9 that would be under the management?

10 MELANIE MEYERS: That would be
11 under the City's management and, again, they would
12 work with Friends of the High Line to manage--to
13 figure out the best way of using that space. I'm
14 going to have the terminology not quite right, but
15 the Friends of the High Line basically are in a
16 position of sort of managing the operations of the
17 High Line at this point, making sure it's properly
18 maintained, et cetera, and they would continue
19 that role.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: And then
21 just my last series of questions, the first floor,
22 which is sort of unique, are there any--going to
23 be any substantial changes to the traffic flow and
24 the amenities on the first floor area with this
25 expansion?

1

MELANIE MEYERS: Again, the--

2

3

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:

4

[Interposing] The first level, I guess--

5

[Crosstalk]

6

MELANIE MEYERS: [Interposing]

7

Yeah, the first level. There will be very little

8

changes, I think David showed--in terms of the

9

concourse, which I think is the element that

10

people are rightly the most concerned about and,

11

frankly, Jamestown is as well because it's really

12

an important part of the character and value of

13

the building. There would be about a 1,000 square

14

foot impact on the concourse. The concourse has

15

approximately--I'm going to do the math in my

16

head--about 100,000 square feet of retail use from

17

9th Avenue to 10th Avenue, and so the effect of

18

the addition of the one elevator bank is quite

19

small.

20

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay. and

21

then just you're doing a lot of amendments and

22

you're putting into the High Line fund and the

23

affordable housing fund to be used whenever. Is

24

there any other community benefits that you've

25

promised to the community? Local hiring or M/WBE?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Have you put in any of those into your plan?

MELANIE MEYERS: You know, we certainly talked with the community and made commitments about jobs posting and working with the Community Board's office to organize job fairs and postings for properties and for projects in the--for--excuse me, for jobs within the market. We certainly have talked about doing a LEED Silver building, which we're committed to. We have agreed to do public art in the concourse, which we've agreed to do. In terms of hiring policies, I think--

MICHAEL PHILLIPS: [Interposing]
Yeah, we're very committed to M/WBE and, you know, would work to get to as close to 20% as we could.

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay. And you mentioned again the LEEDs, that means you're going to make the building retroactively the entire complex LEED Silver?

MELANIE MEYERS: We're really talking about the enlargements. Again, it's such a bizarre building and has so many sort of weirdnesses that the LEED's commitment would be to the additions to the project.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Just to the
3 additions.

4 MELANIE MEYERS: Correct.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Not to the
6 existing building.

7 MELANIE MEYERS: Correct.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: 'Cause it's
9 very difficult to work backwards, okay.

10 MELANIE MEYERS: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: All right.
12 Well thank you. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

13 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Mr.
14 Comrie. Council Member Jackson.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you,
16 Mr. Chair, and good morning everyone. So I have a
17 couple questions, I was looking at the specifics
18 as per your presentation and in the brochure that
19 you submitted along with the Community Board's
20 action and the borough president's action. And it
21 seems as though, based on from the initial actions
22 taken by the Community Board, along with the
23 borough president's office, there has been, I
24 guess, changes made through discussions, and I
25 believe you're having those primary discussions

1
2 with the Council Member whose district it's in,
3 which is Speaker Christine Quinn, is that correct?

4 MELANIE MEYERS: Yes, I mean, we
5 have made a number of changes already and we're
6 certainly continuing discussions.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: So, as you
8 know, you can see yourself, there are people here
9 that do not want upzoning. Compared to those--and
10 there was a press conference, my understanding by
11 Build It, by union people that were outside saying
12 that they want it built, these are jobs. In my
13 opinion, this is the normal situation when major
14 projects come about, you have those that are in
15 favor, those that are against, and from the time
16 that it starts to the time that it ends, there's a
17 lot of discussions, testimonies, hearings, give-
18 and-takes. So what do you perceive are some of
19 the outstanding issues that could be resolved
20 between now and then? And you know when then is,
21 I believe I looked at the City Council deadline is
22 November 2nd, which is just right around the
23 corner. Are you continuing to have discussions
24 with the parties that are involved with this in
25 order to see if a consensus can be reached?

1
2 'Cause that's the ideal situation, you would
3 agree?

4 MELANIE MEYERS: We certainly would
5 agree that a consensus would be the ideal, and I
6 think we spent a lot of time, again, with the
7 Community Board, and we'll continue to have
8 discussions. We think that the changes to the
9 building form are things that make the building--
10 we thought it worked within the neighborhood
11 before, we think it's a better project the way it
12 is today. And, you know, we're certainly willing
13 to consider any additional ideas or thoughts, but
14 we think we have the right building at this point.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: So
16 considering, do you believe, based on the proposed
17 changes by the Community Board and by the borough
18 presidents, have you basically, in your opinion,
19 have considered and acted on 25%, 50%, 75%?

20 MELANIE MEYERS: We would think
21 about 90%.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Ninety
23 percent.

24 MELANIE MEYERS: Yes. Yes. Again,
25 we can go through it. They asked for a reduction

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

in height on 9th Avenue, we did that--

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON:

[Interposing] Okay. Now you say about 90%.

MELANIE MEYERS: Yep.

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Okay. So talk to me about the 10% that you believe have not been acted on for whatever reason.

MELANIE MEYERS: I think that the things--I think we've addressed everything that was in the Community Board's recommendation. I think two of the ideas that were in the Community Board that Jamestown I think is very open to and there's different ways of doing it, is to think-- to look at outreach to the local schools and to--

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON:

[Interposing] Outreach to what?

MELANIE MEYERS: To the local schools and also to think about whether or not there are--because there's so much technology, there are so many medias, there's so much advanced technology in the building, whether or not there is a way of leveraging that aspect of Chelsea Market into a community benefit. And those are two things that Jamestown is absolutely anxious to

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

continue discussions on, you know, beyond this process 'cause it's important to them.

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Anything else?

MELANIE MEYERS: I think we've actually addressed everything else in the recommendation.

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Okay. I guess a little later in the hearing, we will hear from those that would, I guess, disagree with you. When you said 90%, you heard some of the people, like, gasp and/or chuckle--

MELANIE MEYERS: [Interposing] Yes, we did.

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: --so I just--

MELANIE MEYERS: And I also want to be clear, we're talking about the Community Board's recommendation--

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON:
[Interposing] Yes.

MELANIE MEYERS: --one of the major recommendations of the borough president was to shift bulk to 9th Avenue and that is something we

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

did not do.

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Okay.

MELANIE MEYERS: So just want to be clear about that.

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Well, I mean, clearly, in my opinion, as someone that has gone through--we just voted on this morning the West Harlem rezoning with modifications and I've gone through with my colleagues, Mark Weprin, Inez, Leroy, and everyone here concerning Columbia's expansion, which is in my district. And though, obviously, in negotiations and discussions are not easy, but I think that when people go in there and do the best that they can, understanding that besides development you have communities, people that have lived in the community for decades and decades and want to see a community that is livable in many people's respect, and I'm sure that you see it and the developers see it as a livable situation also, and that's why I'm hoping that a compromise consensus can be reached on those matters that are outstanding. So and just keep the faith and keep plugging away, November 2nd is just around the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

corner.

MELANIE MEYERS: It's just around the corner, you're right.

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Mr. Jackson. Like to call on Al Vann, Council Member Al Vann.

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Yeah, good morning. I just was unclear on your response to Council Member Comrie when he asked about your commitment to M/WBE. Would you just clarify for me what that commitment is? 'Cause I didn't understand.

MELANIE MEYERS: I think we were talking about construction?

MICHAEL PHILLIPS: Right.

MELANIE MEYERS: Yeah, so in the construction of the project.

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: What about it? What is your--what are the goals and what guarantee will you meet those goals, M/WBE?

MICHAEL PHILLIPS: Our goal is to achieve a 20% W/WBE use of minorities and women in

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

our construction process.

MELANIE MEYERS: And it will be a union construction and they'll work with the contractor to assure that those goals are reached.

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Those goals are written goals or just what you would like to do?

MELANIE MEYERS: At this point, we know--I think that the goals will be part of the agreement that will be with the contractor at the time of construction. Right now, what we're looking at is approval for a zoning change, so we aren't in the place--we don't have a contractor at this point.

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Have W/MB--

MELANIE MEYERS: But we are committed to the goals.

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Yeah. Have the Community Board established any such goals for you? Is that part of your negotiation with them or that's separate and apart?

MELANIE MEYERS: I think it's separate and apart, but I'm sure it's something that the Community Board is very interested in.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Twenty
3 percent. And that's just construction, right?

4 MELANIE MEYERS: Correct.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Okay. Are
6 any non-construction activities of any economic
7 value? But they're all construction--

8 [Crosstalk]

9 MELANIE MEYERS: I think--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: --pre-
11 construction, architectural sorts--

12 MELANIE MEYERS: [Interposing] I
13 think there's a few things. Again, one of the
14 things that we did talk to the Community Board
15 about and commit to is to really to try to
16 facilitate job postings and information about jobs
17 that are available at Chelsea Market. Again,
18 there's going to be another 1,000 jobs, 1,200 jobs
19 as a result of this particular proposal, and we
20 absolutely think that, you know, that qualified
21 people from the neighborhood should know about the
22 jobs and have an opportunity to have part of them-
23 -to be part of them.

24 In terms of Jamestown's operations,
25 it's a quite diverse group and Michael can talk a

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

bit about that.

MICHAEL PHILLIPS: Certainly. We as a company pride ourselves in having a diverse workforce. And certainly in building operations would continue to pursue those goals.

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: You mentioned the 1,000 or so jobs non-construction, is there a preference for local Community Board residency? In other words, would they have priority of 20%, 50% or--

MELANIE MEYERS: [Interposing] I think there's two different types of, there's two different types of workers. Again, this is an office building, there are a variety of different types of users in the buildings. I mean, one of the things that is interesting about the upstairs of Chelsea Market is that there are people that are in the high-tech world and you think about, you know, the people that graduate from these fancy schools, there also are the camera guys that are operating the cameras at, you know, NY1 studios. There's a real--and then there's the people who are working on the ground floor who have started their own businesses and are there.

1
2 So there's a real diversity of types of
3 backgrounds for the people that are in there. So
4 we think that there are great opportunities in the
5 building for a variety of different people that
6 live in Chelsea and live in the city.

7 They are the tenants in the
8 building and so it's quite difficult to say you
9 can be our tenant, but you have to hire X and Y
10 people. So there's that, that's a challenge. But
11 the types of users in the buildings actually lend
12 themselves to the people who live in Chelsea
13 Market.

14 MICHAEL PHILLIPS: And we have
15 active intern programs and scholarship programs
16 that we've been in the neighborhood operating for
17 a long time, so we certainly would continue to
18 pursue that. And, as Melanie stated, job postings
19 and preference for local jobs is certainly a
20 priority for us.

21 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Mr.
22 Vann. Okay. I don't see anyone else on the panel
23 with a question. We're going to let--obviously,
24 you'll probably be sticking around. If you want
25 to leave the charts there, that could be helpful,

1
2 maybe some of the other speakers. We thank you
3 very much. I'm now going to turn--excuse me--we
4 are joined today--we are honored to be joined by
5 Assembly member Deborah Glick and a man who made
6 an entrance, Senator Tom Duane. I'd like to call
7 them up on behalf of the community to testify now.

8 [Pause]

9 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Welcome.
10 Senator, you're starting to feel nostalgic
11 already? Come on up. I didn't hear what you
12 said, but I'm sure it was funny.

13 [Pause]

14 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: I'm sorry, I
15 don't understand your hand signals.

16 [Off mic]

17 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: I intended the
18 Assembly Member to go first. First of all, I
19 served with her, I never served with you. Second
20 of all, she was here early.

21 [Off mic]

22 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you,
23 Senator. Assembly Member Glick, whenever you're
24 ready.

25 ASSEMBLY MEMBER DEBORAH GLICK:

1
2 Thank you very much for the opportunity to testify
3 before you today concerning the proposed expansion
4 of Chelsea Market. The Chelsea Market is a unique
5 source of food, retail, and specialty stores that
6 are a staple for the surrounding offices and
7 residences, and a destination for New Yorkers and
8 visitors from all over.

9 The upper floors, as you know, are
10 home to media and software companies, and as the
11 former home of the Nabisco factory, it is listed
12 on the state and national Registers of Historic
13 Places--I didn't hear that mentioned today--and is
14 bordered by the Gansevoort Historic District,
15 spans a whole block, and is contained within my
16 district.

17 There is a very lovely photo of the
18 proposal from the open space to the expansion. It
19 would be more instructive for the committee if you
20 had a before and after photo so that you could see
21 exactly how much of the space in the community is
22 going to be taken over by this incredible
23 enlargement.

24 The applicant is proposing to amend
25 the zoning granted under Special West Chelsea

1
2 District to increase the floor area in exchange
3 for contributions to the High Line and for a fund
4 for low and moderate income housing. As you've
5 heard, there actually is no--has been no prior
6 contribution, even though there have been to the
7 housing fund, even though that has been one of the
8 things that is consistently recommended and
9 suggested, and every developer says they're going
10 to put money into it and it never actually
11 happens. This is going to be one more of those
12 cases where it will be a promise for zoning change
13 and a result that doesn't add any more affordable
14 housing, but puts more pressure on the local
15 neighborhood for increased cost of rentals, either
16 for housing or, quite frankly, for office space.

17 And there is a modest modification
18 made by City Planning about the space over the
19 High Line and the shadows that would be created.
20 Despite that, I am opposed to this current
21 proposal. The buildings are tall, they're bulky,
22 they're out of context with the historic district
23 to which they are adjacent, and I request that you
24 deny this.

25 The ink is barely dry, as was

1
2 suggested by Council Member Lappin, on the West
3 Chelsea district, and yet there's an application
4 to change the rules that govern the district.

5 When it was created, the zoning for the Chelsea
6 area was reviewed and amended to its current state
7 and the goals were not to just help protect the
8 High Line, but also to move bulk away from the
9 High Line and to allow for air, light, and view
10 corridors to be maximized.

11 I'm racing through my testimony,
12 you have it in front of you, but it was
13 interesting to hear that the 9th Avenue side, that
14 the plans for a hotel were withdrawn, but there
15 continues to be a plan to develop office space.
16 That there is no impact on traffic is mind
17 boggling. Everybody who lives in the city
18 understands that when you build substantially
19 larger buildings, there will be an increase of
20 traffic.

21 Where they are going to actually do
22 the construction is fascinating. If you come down
23 9th Avenue, at that point, DOT has forked the road
24 so that if you're heading straight down Hudson
25 Street, there are two lanes to the left, there are

1
2 allegedly two lanes to the right. There is almost
3 never available lane in the parking lane because
4 of cabs and people standing waiting for people who
5 are either at the Food Network or at NY1 or maybe
6 in some of the other offices, so you have the
7 black cars or others standing in that parking
8 lane. That spot is a constant traffic nightmare.
9 We've, in fact, asked DOT to do a full review of
10 that very corner because it is so dangerous. And
11 so their notion that they can build right there on
12 that corner, I don't know where the construction
13 crane is going to be, and 18 months is going to be
14 a disaster for the neighborhood and the community
15 if you allow for that building on 9th Avenue,
16 which is actually less egregious than the building
17 on 10th.

18 The density proposed moves the FAR
19 from 5 to 7 1/2, this violates the intention of
20 the zoning district and would permit the density
21 on this block that is unprecedented anywhere else
22 in the zoning district.

23 The alleged community benefits,
24 very happy that there'll be public art, perhaps it
25 will be views of the sky. And while it is well-

1
2 intentioned for them to provide some educational
3 and training, I think that's terrific, but the
4 M/WBE contribution, A, is not written in stone,
5 hopefully will be in there. And just for
6 construction jobs, they didn't want to talk about
7 that the only other commitment might be to some
8 security jobs and some janitorial jobs, which is
9 why some of our good friends from local unions are
10 at least happy that they've made that much of a
11 commitment, but it is not--the only commitment to
12 jobs for people in the neighborhood or a diverse
13 workforce is essentially, we'll do job postings.
14 That's, you know, you can take that to the bank.

15 And it's, you know, those
16 amenities, I think it's great that there'll be
17 some more bathrooms for the tourists who are on
18 the High Line, but we already know that the High
19 Line is not a park for the neighborhood. People
20 in the neighborhood only go to the park on very
21 thin slivers of time when the tourists have left.
22 That is an amenity that has to do with visitors,
23 it has nothing to do with the people who live in
24 the community. And there are lots of newspaper
25 articles now about how it's a great amenity for

1
2 the city, but it's not an amenity for the
3 neighborhood.

4 The 10th Avenue building is out of
5 scale, it is out of context. Any attempts to do
6 some setbacks, while that's welcome, it does
7 nothing for the large box that is being put on a
8 historic building that, as I said, was eligible
9 for--well actually is on the state and national
10 Register of Historic Places. If this addition was
11 on it, it wouldn't be.

12 So as far as where could these
13 companies grow, we have a great site that we're
14 proposing at Pier 40 for--which is a unique space.
15 As unique in many ways as the Chelsea Market, but
16 it actually will have space right outside for a
17 real park, not this thin sliver.

18 The proposal, it's clear why there
19 wasn't--why the building wasn't included initially
20 in the district itself, and that was because the
21 owner was trying to sell it to Jamestown, did that
22 successfully, and, obviously, part of that was if
23 this is more restricted, then we don't want it; we
24 want to be able to build, build, build. And we
25 understand that New York is about change, New York

1
2 is about progress, but not all change is progress,
3 and losing neighborhoods where people live is not
4 progress; it's change, but it's not progress.

5 I urge you to deny this request.

6 [Applause]

7 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay. Just
8 keep it to a minimum. Thank you, Assembly Member
9 Glick. Senator Duane.

10 SENATOR THOMAS DUANE: Thank you
11 very much. So you know what the application is,
12 you are well aware of what happened at City
13 Planning, I'm going to go over just a couple of
14 things.

15 The modification from City Planning
16 Commission--and I share much of--I think all of
17 the Assembly Member's concern, shall we say--
18 anyway, CPC modified the proposal to include
19 reductions in the scale of both buildings and a
20 codified restriction on hotel use in the 9th
21 Avenue building and the transfer. And I really
22 want to spend some time emphasizing this, nearly 5
23 million of those, \$4.73 million, to the affordable
24 housing fund from the contribution to the High
25 Line and then also a minimum of 60% retail

1
2 frontage on the ground floor, pedestrian
3 passageway connecting the 10th and 9th Avenue
4 buildings.

5 Look, I appreciate the changes that
6 have occurred to-date, but there's more work to be
7 done here and it's falling into your purview.

8 For an acceptable addition, West
9 Chelsea, you know, acceptable addition of
10 something at the Chelsea Market to the West
11 Chelsea district, you've heard from many community
12 organizations, many of which I've been a member
13 of, one of which, Save Chelsea, I'm a founding
14 member of, and I share their concerns about this
15 non-contextual overdevelopment and other threats
16 to the historic character of the area.

17 I'm also very grateful to Board 4
18 for crafting the resolution which they crafted,
19 which was very comprehensive and thoughtful and I
20 think very helpful, not only to CPC, but I
21 encourage you to--which I know you will anyway--
22 really take a look at the roadmap that they put
23 forward that would really dramatically improve
24 this proposal. And I know CPC took some much of
25 their proposals or their roadmap, but not all of

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

it.

So, you know, as an elected official who's fought alongside Community Board 4 to include a significant affordable housing requirement for applications, including but not limited to residential development in the Special West Chelsea District, I am pleased that the CPC authorized Jamestown to shift 30% of the total contribution originally designated to the High Line and to the affordable housing fund created by the City Council during the 2005 West Chelsea rezoning process. And I love the idea that we might get new affordable housing in our neighborhood where, let's face it, soaring retail prices are excluding New Yorkers, including those who have made Chelsea so great and a place where people want to live and work and visit. But ensuring the existence of viable housing options for all New Yorkers, including those with low and moderate incomes, is the proven and best way to keep our neighborhoods diverse, dynamic, and vibrant. And furthermore, I just believe, and I think many of us believe, it's the right and fair thing to do.

1
2 And the Special West Chelsea
3 District fostered significant luxury residential
4 development, as well as the affordable housing
5 that was incentivized by the rezoning, and I think
6 that that incentivizing was brilliant and is
7 working. I know there was a--you know, people
8 said, no, mandate, mandate, but I think that the,
9 you know, the providing the opportunity by
10 incentivizing has really worked there and here's
11 another opportunity to provide more affordable
12 housing. And, you know, the slow down in the
13 economy and various things has made it so that the
14 affordable housing that was already supposed to be
15 built on the Fulton housing site hasn't happened,
16 but this is a good receiving site for this
17 additional money and so we can add in.

18 And I truly believe, I was going to
19 say, you know, that, and again, you know, people
20 are concerned that it's not going to happen, and I
21 say in my testimony, cautiously optimistic, but
22 I'm optimistic, I really am, that it is going to
23 happen 'cause I trust you and I think we'll be
24 fighting alongside to make sure it happens. But
25 it's sort of a promise made and promise given--

1
2 talk about that in a moment. All right, I got to
3 hurry because I want to make some extra [off mic].

4 So anyway, all right, you'll hear
5 from historic preservation people, you heard from
6 the Assembly Member, I'm in agreement with them on
7 we have to be very careful with how--and make sure
8 that we do preserve what has made this
9 neighborhood so great, which is including the
10 people and the bricks and mortar, quite frankly.
11 And, you know, Jamestown agreed to modify its
12 design in that area, but there's more work to be
13 done, which you will hear about and have heard
14 about.

15 So, you know, at the very least,
16 let's look at what CB 4 has said about, you know,
17 the additional panels of appropriate materials for
18 whatever happens there, which is too much what
19 Jamestown wants to do by far, but let's preserve
20 the character of what's there 'cause it's a
21 beautiful building, it's a beautiful, wonderful
22 building and the reuse of it has been fabulous.
23 And it's a big building and there's a lot of use
24 in it already.

25 You know, I don't want to take up

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

all of your time and you could read it--

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay.

SENATOR THOMAS DUANE: --you know, let me say just one thing, no, and I have, you know--

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [Interposing]
You're such a tease, yes.

SENATOR THOMAS DUANE: Yeah, I know, I didn't say I'm going to wrap up, I said I'm rushing through it.

You know, there was a lot of discussion about what happened on the Upper West Side and the zoning proposal for helping to provide local retail and, you know, there was some criticism, I supported it, I think it'll work, but what we've suggested for Chelsea Market, I think will work and I think it is--I think it's great and very creative, like the incentivizing of affordable housing to have smaller local businesses. We hear a lot about that during the presidential debate, don't we? We debate about small businesses being the engine of--anyway. So and, you know, I like that young people will be able to get internships in technology, I mean, who

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

wouldn't be, you know, for that?

So let me just say the last additional things. Look, when we did the Chelsea plan, we gave up a lot to preserve not as much as we wanted and we provided lots of development sites. You need only look up and down Sixth Avenue and 23rd Street to see where we gave up a lot to preserve a small part and--of Chelsea. Expanding historic district but where the historic district isn't, people are putting on top of buildings, they're building to the permissible zoning envelope wherever they can. So there is development happening even on top of low-rise buildings that are not within the historic district, Chelsea district. And a lot of the nice buildings have gone--they're gone 'cause they were not in the historic district and new buildings have been built there to the entire permissible envelope. So we gave up a lot.

We only permitted housing in East Chelsea. Our idea was those parking lots, if you built housing there, you were supposed to put affordable housing there. We didn't get that. City Planning at the time, we didn't get it, it

1
2 wasn't in there. What we were told by the
3 commission and, you know, I was there, we were
4 promised, well, you know, you can take advantage
5 of whatever programs exist, and this is where I
6 have a slight disagreement with some people, there
7 is a lot there where there's money available to
8 sanitation we're getting low-income housing in
9 East Chelsea, but not much, not by far what we
10 wanted. Because the Chelsea plan was develop, it
11 was preservationist, it was local businesses, it
12 was housing activists, it was a great coalition
13 and, you know, let me say Jane Wood, we were
14 promised affordable housing and that's why I keep
15 stressing that. We were promised that in exchange
16 for what we gave up with development sites.

17 So now Gansevoort, advocates didn't
18 get everything that we wanted in Gansevoort, and I
19 know you've all been to Gansevoort, and you know
20 why? 'Cause I know that I would have to wear
21 flats because of the cobblestones, but we still
22 didn't get everything we wanted there and we--
23 having it a pedestrian place is good, people come
24 there, by the way, from the High Line for hired
25 cars and cabs, and they drive around there. So

1
2 the traffic is a problem there in an area which we
3 want to encourage more pedestrian and less
4 vehicular traffic.

5 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Senator, if
6 you could wrap up, we've actually been joined by
7 another guest we're going to put on your panel.

8 SENATOR THOMAS DUANE: Guest? And
9 also let me say this also about Chelsea. Look, we
10 are--when the Salvation Army wanted to put a
11 facility in on 20th Street, right, for people--
12 special needs housing, for people living with AIDS
13 and they wanted to go a little bit more than the
14 envelope, and you know what? We said okay, it's a
15 neighborhood that says okay to reasonable
16 additions. Jamestown bought this building with
17 their eyes wide open. I mean, right? I mean,
18 they knew what they were getting into and you must
19 take that into account.

20 So all right, how do I--

21 ASSEMBLY MEMBER DEBORAH GLICK: I
22 only have one sentence I want to get in so--

23 [Crosstalk]

24 SENATOR THOMAS DUANE:
25 [Interposing] All right. [Off mic] High Line and

1
2 then I'm done. So, you know, I know this sounds
3 weird now, but, you know, we took a risk with the
4 High Line. We didn't know it was going to work.
5 It has worked, right? You see New Yorkers walking
6 down the street dressed in black, you look up
7 there, you see non-New Yorkers dressed in bright
8 colors, that's how you can tell, but, you know, it
9 has--and you can't deny this taken resources--the
10 pie should be big enough to take care of the
11 Waterside Park too and that hasn't happened,
12 right? So if, you know, the--it is more of the
13 people's park. Sure, the High Line worked. It
14 was a risk when it went in, it's a risk that paid
15 off, but not enough is being done.

16 And, by the way, another place
17 where we gave up commercial sites along the
18 Waterside Park, many piers--Pier 40, three piers
19 in Chelsea, in Hell's Kitchen piers were given
20 over for commercial development. I mean, we do
21 give a lot, right? And we're willing to work with
22 people, but Jamestown has to do more and we'll
23 work with them, but this is not enough. It's just
24 not enough for a neighborhood that gives and gives
25 and gives and doesn't really get in return what

1
2 we've given. I'm not saying we should all be
3 canonized, right? Maybe we should, but we have
4 been willing to work with developers and Jamestown
5 should work with us more.

6 Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you,
8 Senator, that's why we're here today.

9 We have been joined--and I
10 apologize and please--

11 SENATOR THOMAS DUANE:

12 [Interposing] I just--

13 [Crosstalk]

14 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: --allow me--
15 wait, let me just call on Deborah before--we are
16 joined by your neighbor to the north, the longest
17 tenured member of the New York State legislature
18 Richard Gottfried is here so--

19 SENATOR THOMAS DUANE: He's--

20 [Applause]

21 SENATOR THOMAS DUANE: --tier one.

22 [Crosstalk]

23 ASSEMBLY MEMBER DEBORAH GLICK: As
24 the Assembly Member is arriving--

25 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: He's 88,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

that's how--

ASSEMBLY MEMBER DEBORAH GLICK: --

if I could just make one--

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Yeah.

ASSEMBLY MEMBER DEBORAH GLICK: --

point, I was--

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Yeah, sure.

ASSEMBLY MEMBER DEBORAH GLICK: --

trying to rush through my testimony, but
apparently that was foolish on my part.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Well you don't

have to necessarily follow--

ASSEMBLY MEMBER DEBORAH GLICK: Let

me just make--

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: --the

Senator's lead.

ASSEMBLY MEMBER DEBORAH GLICK: --

let me just make one point. As all developers do,
they take the largest buildings in a general area
and then use that as the marker. And I'd like to
point out that the Caledonia, while it is high, it
is not on 10th Avenue, it is set back in the mid-
block, and Fulton Houses is not over the High
Line. So the notion that the mitigations that

1
2 City Planning has put in about setbacks, this is
3 right on the High Line and so those mitigations
4 aren't sufficient and using those other buildings
5 as the marker is inappropriate, in my humble
6 opinion. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you,
8 Deborah.

9 [Applause]

10 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Please keep it
11 quiet. Assemblyman Gottfried, if you could try to
12 keep it a little brief, we have a lot of people
13 been waiting a long time and I do pay you three
14 the proper respect. You would make a great talk
15 show someday, the three of you, and we'll all
16 watch at that time. But thank you, Dick.

17 ASSEMBLY MEMBER RICHARD GOTTFRIED:
18 Well what can I say? Good morning, my name is
19 Richard Gottfried and I represent the 75th
20 Assembly District, which includes Chelsea. I
21 appreciate the opportunity to testify on the
22 proposed Chelsea Market expansion, which I oppose.

23 The 2005 Special West Chelsea
24 District which will create a corridor of large
25 commercial and residential buildings running north

1
2 from Chelsea Market was intended largely to
3 compensate property owners for the preservation of
4 the High Line. It has changed the face and much
5 of the neighborhood feel of Chelsea. ULURP should
6 be more than a process where the community's
7 concerns are watered down to become tweaks to a
8 developer's proposal which was made excessive in
9 anticipation of those tweaks.

10 While the modifications proposed--
11 while the modified proposal--I'm sorry--approved
12 by the City Planning Commission does some harm
13 reduction, I remain opposed to the project. It is
14 too large, too damaging, and contains too little
15 for the community. This is still a massive
16 expansion being added to a development corridor in
17 a neighborhood that is already overburdened.

18 City Planning followed the
19 recommendation of Community Board 4 by requiring
20 Jamestown, the developer, to redirect a portion of
21 its promised financial contribution from the High
22 Line Improvement Fund to the affordable housing
23 fund created by the City Council in 2005. This
24 redirecting of the developer's contribution does
25 not mitigate the upzoning. City Planning says

1
2 that the supplementary money should create
3 affordable housing in addition to the affordable
4 housing that was already promised to the community
5 in 2005 in the trade offs for the massive Special
6 West Chelsea District rezoning. However, that
7 promise, the affordable housing promise in 2005,
8 has still not been fulfilled seven years later.
9 Putting more money into a pipeline that isn't
10 moving does not do much good.

11 The proposal would have a
12 devastating effect on the architectural quality of
13 the Chelsea Market building. The Landmarks
14 Preservation Commission should have landmarked the
15 Chelsea Market long ago. It is critical to
16 maintain the structure, façade, and character of
17 Chelsea Market. The developer promises to protect
18 the building and seek landmark status, but only
19 after the building is defaced by the proposed
20 development.

21 The project would also have a
22 visually jarring and disruptive effect on people
23 enjoying the High Line Park, even with additional
24 setbacks on the 10th Avenue side.

25 If the project does go through,

1
2 another improvement that will be critical to the
3 support--is the support of Community Board 4's
4 request for a community technology space.

5 Jamestown must work with the neighborhood and
6 neighborhood groups in crafting a community
7 technology job training center for neighborhood
8 youth.

9 In conclusion, while the changes to
10 the plan imposed--or proposed by City Planning and
11 that may yet come in further negotiations can
12 diminish the harmful impact of the project, the
13 negatives of this project strongly, still strongly
14 outweigh any potential gains. This plan would
15 dramatically alter and scar an important
16 historical building and neighborhood. I call on
17 the City Council to reject this application, and
18 thank you for the opportunity to speak today.

19 [Applause]

20 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you. We
21 have quiet, please. I'd like to call on Council
22 Member Lappin, although I'm hesitant to do so if
23 you get them talking too much, okay?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Well first
25 of all, I--

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [Interposing]
I don't mean you, of course.

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: --wanted to
make sure that Senator Duane knew that I'm a New
Yorker who's not afraid to wear dual tones,
obviously.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: I've seen him
wear bright colors on a number--

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN:
[Interposing] I do, I do.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: --of
occasions.

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: I'm just
trying.

SENATOR THOMAS DUANE: --just
commented that it--

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN:
[Interposing] No, I understand. At any rate, I
wanted to say I think I share the concerns you've
all iterated about the affordable housing,
promises made that have been promises broken and
that is a very real concern. I guess my question
is, because you each, particularly Assemblywoman

1
2 Glick and Senator Duane, did make some suggestions
3 for modifications, so I guess my question is, if
4 there were modifications along the lines that you
5 suggested regarding small businesses, regarding
6 affordable housing guarantees, et cetera, et
7 cetera, not to reiterate them all, is it then
8 something you could see yourself supporting?

9 ASSEMBLY MEMBER DEBORAH GLICK: The
10 building is dramatically out of scale with the
11 existing structure that is on the State and
12 National Historic Register, so that in itself I
13 think is something that the Council needs to take
14 into consideration. That there is a need for some
15 of the businesses there to expand and they would
16 like to expand in place might suggest that there
17 might be some compromise, but they have made
18 minimal, as my colleague in the Assembly has
19 pointed out. As is now the case in almost all
20 instances, developers add 20% of disgusting height
21 bulk density, which they then applaud themselves
22 for removing when there is a negotiation.

23 So I am a little bit concerned
24 about saying that there is some--this much is a
25 good compromise. I do think that it is

1
2 significantly larger than it should be and that
3 that is the focus--should be the focus. The
4 tweaks, adding some extra bathrooms, lovely, we
5 all--you know, women in particular. Apparently,
6 there are many places where, despite how many
7 men's rooms you have, they're not used anyway. So
8 that is, you know, the bathrooms, I've been on the
9 High Line, it's a good thing that there's extra
10 bathrooms, but it doesn't make the proposal and
11 its impact on the neighborhood less.

12 The traffic issue, to say that
13 there is no traffic impact is shocking, but
14 somehow not surprising. So those are things
15 balancing how much additional traffic that area
16 can absorb, especially if they're going to be
17 constructing for 18 months on 9th Avenue, that
18 corner is already problematic. It would be
19 interesting to see the construction plan.

20 So the big piece is less bulk, less
21 height, and actual commitment to real M/WBE, not
22 window dressing. Right now, I heard it's a real
23 important goal with the, you know, with the
24 construction company, not so much thereafter.

25 So those are real issues that are

1
2 really of concern. And I reiterate that if these
3 companies are looking for a place to grow, we are
4 looking at making it possible for them to grow at
5 Pier 40, which will have beautiful unrestricted
6 views of the water, lots of natural air and light,
7 and a true recreational facility immediately
8 outside of the facility, as opposed to where they
9 are now.

10 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay.

11 SENATOR THOMAS DUANE: And I just
12 want to reiterate--

13 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Go ahead,
14 Senator, last--

15 SENATOR THOMAS DUANE:
16 [Interposing] No, it's a neighborhood and a
17 Community Board which has always been willing to
18 have fair negotiations, they ended too quickly
19 here and that's not right. And something you
20 could help us with and the board and the
21 neighborhood [off mic] is, we're saying there are
22 even more development sites if you expanded the
23 West Chelsea Special District and from 27 to 30th
24 Streets, there would be even more opportunities.
25 We want to create jobs, permanent jobs, union

1
2 jobs, construction jobs, and, as Deborah said, to
3 empower and get jobs for those who--for companies
4 that previously have not had a chance, you know,
5 had a seat at the table. And we have given a lot
6 of that already. Look around, we've given a lot.
7 And we don't always get what we're supposed to get
8 so what we should get.

9 And though I am confident we're
10 going to get that housing and that's on you guys--
11 well--

12 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

13 SENATOR THOMAS DUANE: --and you--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Gal.

15 SENATOR THOMAS DUANE: --gals, yes,
16 in bright colors. But seriously, we're fair.
17 We're tough, but we're fair.

18 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [Interposing]
19 Okay. We will--

20 SENATOR THOMAS DUANE: So listen to
21 us.

22 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: --we're going
23 to stipulate to that. Hey, I want to thank all
24 three of you, it was great to see you all, and I
25 appreciate you coming down. Senator Duane, in

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

particular I want to mention--

SENATOR THOMAS DUANE:

[Interposing] My swan song.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: --this may be the last time I see you as an elected official, although you never know what the future brings. I wish you much success and I thank you for your service to the West Side of Manhattan and the entire state of New York.

SENATOR THOMAS DUANE: And the East Side, I--

[Crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [Interposing] And we'll work on that. Oh, and East Side, I apologize.

SENATOR THOMAS DUANE: And I used to have a lot of the Lower East Side.

[Crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: And we'll work on that canonization, okay?

SENATOR THOMAS DUANE: I've been all over.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you all very much.

ASSEMBLY MEMBER RICHARD GOTTFRIED:

You're welcome.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Whew. Thanks.

All right, so I appreciate everyone's patience.

We are going to--you know, we like to give representatives of the community their due time so that's what we have done. We are going to now move to panel discussions, I'm going to call people up as a group, we are going to try to limit people to two minutes. Again, I know that's tough thing to do, but we're going to try to do that.

So I'm going to call this next panel, this panel will be in favor. I might need some help with the Sergeant-at-Arms to get a couple extra chairs--oh, we got it, all right. I'd like to call Paul Fernandes from the Buildings Trades Council; Bob Benfatto from Community Board 4; Lee Compton from Community Board 4; Betty Mackintosh, Community Board 4; and Joe Restuccia?

[Off mic]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Restuccie.

Restuccia, okay. Thank you.

[Pause]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: I don't know,

1
2 you guys decide who goes first. Again, I'd remind
3 you, we're going to try to put a two-minute clock
4 on you and please try to keep your remarks
5 limited, and state your name before you speak.
6 And thank you very much. Whenever you're ready.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and
8 gentlemen, please [off mic] quiet, take any
9 conversations outside. Thank you so much for your
10 cooperation.

11 PAUL FERNANDES: Good morning, Mr.
12 Chairman and members of the Subcommittee, my name
13 is Paul Fernandes, I'm the chief of staff of the
14 Building and Construction Trades Council of
15 Greater New York, an organization that consists of
16 local affiliates of 15 national and international
17 unions representing 100,000 working men and women
18 in the five boroughs of New York City. We're
19 pleased to testify today in support of the Land
20 Use application submitted by Jamestown Premier
21 Chelsea Market, LP, to allow for the construction
22 of 290,000 square feet of office space for the
23 technology community to meet the demand for
24 improved and modern facilities capable of
25 supporting job retention and growth in this

1
2 important sector of our economy.

3 This project enjoys strong support
4 from organized labor in the building and
5 construction industry. It's \$195 million design
6 and construction investment will create 600
7 construction jobs at a time when they are
8 desperately needed. Jamestown Properties
9 committed in December 2011 that these will be
10 union construction jobs, thereby assuring that
11 they will in fact be jobs with good wages, health
12 insurance, and pension benefits.

13 This commitment is worth noting as
14 many developers coming before this Subcommittee
15 and the Council do not make such a commitment to
16 working men and women and, furthermore, often do
17 not do so early in the process and voluntarily.
18 Employment in construction in New York City based
19 on data from September 2012--last month--remains
20 more than 21,000 jobs below the peak of employment
21 in the industry in 2008. Recovery in our industry
22 remains slow. Every worthy project that can
23 contribute to putting members of our affiliated
24 unions back to work and others back to work is,
25 therefore, critical to strengthening our

1
2 employment outlook and the overall health of the
3 city economy.

4 We, therefore, urge the
5 Subcommittee and the Council to support the Land
6 Use applications needed to allow this important
7 project to advance and we look forward to working
8 with you to do so. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Mr.
10 Fernandes. Well done, too, by the way. Mr.
11 Benfatto. State your name though.

12 ROBERT BENFATTO: Yes. Good
13 morning, Mr. Chairman, my name is Robert J.
14 Benfatto and I am the district manager for
15 Manhattan Community Board 4.

16 MCB 4 has been dealing with this
17 project for almost the entire time I have been
18 district manager. We were presented with informal
19 versions of this project at our Chelsea Land Use
20 Committee in March 19, 2007; April 21st, 2008; and
21 September 17th, 2010. I would state that all
22 these presentations were for the most part mirror
23 images of what was finally presented as a
24 preliminary proposal on March 21st, 2011.

25 In my notes for the 2007 meeting, I

1
2 have as a presentation a proposed 225-foot high
3 building on the 10th Avenue side, 7.5 FAR, High
4 Line amenities, views to the south, the
5 possibility of a community space or a space for a
6 nonprofit. In fact, the only real change over the
7 years has been the addition to the proposal for a
8 building on 9th Avenue.

9 The Land Use committee held a
10 community discussion on October 17th, 2011, and
11 heard a presentation from my office on our draft
12 building analysis on December 12th, 2011. We held
13 a public forum on February 23rd; on April 16th, we
14 had the official presentation 'cause the ULURP
15 began; we had a public hearing on May 2nd; the
16 committee voted on May 31st, and the full board on
17 June 6th. I bore you with all these dates just to
18 show how involved, how thought through, how well
19 considered our dealings with this project have
20 been for five plus years.

21 The offshoot was a resolution
22 passed 22--26 to 14, there was a denial unless
23 affordable housing mitigation was produced as part
24 of the project and then, and only then, with the
25 certain--secondary, but still very important

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

conditions, have been met.

I'm pleased to state in our negotiations of the applicant prior to our full board vote, we were able to come to an agreement on a number of issues and as the process has continued, further agreements have been reached, most notably in the affordable housing trust fund. However, as you will hear from some of my colleagues this morning, there are still issues to be resolved on how the affordable housing trust fund will work and what it will produce. Our request for a funded technology jobs training center for neighborhood residents located within the market--almost done--whether to landmark the building or how to get well-defined, enforceable restrictions on changes to the exterior, and the need for an extension of the Special West Chelsea District and the area south of West 15th Street between 9th and 10th Avenues.

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

Next, please.

LEE COMPTON: Good afternoon, Mr. Chairman, my name is Lee Compton, I am co-chair of

1
2 CB 4's Land Use Committee. It's a pleasure to
3 appear before you again. I'm here to discuss the
4 Special West Chelsea District and specifically its
5 expansion to include the Chelsea Market block and
6 other neighboring blocks.

7 I was chair of CB 4 when the
8 special district was enacted, but more
9 importantly, I was co-chair, along with Ed
10 Kirkland of the Chelsea Land Use Committee when
11 the special district was conceived, negotiated,
12 and created. I am privileged to have been part of
13 that process and I'm very proud of what we
14 accomplished.

15 Primarily, the Special West Chelsea
16 District is a set of tools to achieve outcomes
17 that benefit the community and the city, including
18 High Line preservation and enhancement, building
19 bulk and form controls, and affordable housing to
20 mitigate market rate development. These are all
21 elements of the current proposal and also the
22 board's recommendation.

23 Our original concept for the
24 district included the Chelsea Market block, the
25 subject of the present ULURP, as well as other

1
2 adjacent areas. Unfortunately, the then-owner of
3 Chelsea Market opposed inclusion in the special
4 district and he had the ears of the commission and
5 of the Council. Instead, the City committed to
6 studying the adjacent areas for future inclusion
7 in an expanded district.

8 We are pleased that the current
9 owner of the Chelsea Market has requested
10 inclusion in the special district and is
11 continuing to support both the High Line and
12 affordable housing in West Chelsea, but we are
13 disappointed that this single block is going
14 through ULURP without consideration of the other
15 adjacent areas proposed. It is time for the City
16 to follow through with promises made during the
17 creation of the special district to study the
18 adjacent areas. We have asked City Planning
19 repeatedly to authorize such a study, but they
20 have not done so.

21 In 1996, the City Council adopted
22 the first 197-A plan, the Chelsea plan, developed
23 by the Community Board and the community. In this
24 tradition, we have begun our own study on the
25 expansion of the Special West Chelsea District and

1
2 we hope that City Planning will join with us and
3 that it'll lead to the inclusion of these adjacent
4 areas in an expanded district. We believe it will
5 benefit the existing Special West Chelsea District
6 and the greater community.

7 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very
8 much. Next, please.

9 BETTY MACKINTOSH: Good morning,
10 Chair Weprin, my name is Betty Mackintosh and I'm
11 going to speak briefly about Community 4's
12 initiation of a Land Use study for the expansion
13 of the Special West Chelsea District and then the
14 need to designate the existing Chelsea Market
15 building as a landmark.

16 Community Board 4 is so passionate
17 about the need to expand the Special West Chelsea
18 District that we have begun a study of the
19 potential expansion area and hope to develop
20 recommendations this winter. We have formed a
21 planning team made up of myself, Alissa Mitrisin,
22 an experienced planner and attorney at the Clinton
23 Housing Development Company; and Alan Lightfeldt,
24 Community Board 4's intern, who is an NYU Urban
25 Planning graduate student. I worked at the

1
2 Department of City Planning for over 30 years,
3 much of that as a community planner.

4 We hope to coordinate with City
5 Planning and City Council staff to develop height,
6 setback, street wall, and land use controls.
7 Starting with three blocks south and west of the
8 Chelsea Market site, we have prepared a base map,
9 surveyed the uses in the field, taken photographs,
10 and begun data collection on building
11 characteristics.

12 Just shifting a minute, Community
13 Board 4 believes that the exterior of the existing
14 Chelsea Market building and two related bridges
15 should be designated a landmark because they are
16 excellent illustrations of the area's industrial
17 past. The building was constructed as space for
18 the Nabisco company and utilized the rail system
19 there. A restrictive declaration can cover many
20 preservation aspects, but a landmark designation
21 would provide stronger protections.

22 Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

24 JOE RESTUCCIA: My name is Joe
25 Restuccia, I'm the co-chair of Community Board 4's

1
2 Housing Committee. I want to speak to the
3 affordable housing. First, I'm sorry Member
4 Lappin is not here.

5 West Chelsea was adopted in 2005
6 and since that point in time, six years ago, there
7 have been 858 affordable units either constructed
8 or preserved. That is 60% of the administration's
9 total commitment. In my experience in the past 32
10 years, that's a remarkable achievement because
11 usually commitments are made and not delivered, in
12 this case, 60% from West Chelsea rezoning.

13 On the West Chelsea affordable
14 housing fund, there's been a lot of discussion
15 this morning that's just not accurate. The
16 Community Board asked for affordable housing fund,
17 City Planning said no. The final solution was
18 that after 90% of all the High Line transfer
19 development rights were sold, then there could be
20 contributions to the affordable housing fund. The
21 affordable housing fund would not be invoked,
22 therefore, unless 90% of their rights were sold.
23 Only 50% of the rights have been sold to-date,
24 therefore, it does not exist because it has not
25 met its trigger.

1
2 We took the text in that fund and
3 asked specifically for City Planning to reverse
4 the paradigm and to say on the Chelsea Market
5 site, instead of that being last, affordable
6 housing be first. And, in fact, that's what
7 happened. So the first 80,000 square feet of the
8 bonus from Chelsea Market will create an
9 affordable housing fund through the same text,
10 that text has been modified. So this is not a
11 last-in, this is a first-in, it's very different.

12 In order for this developer to pull
13 a permit for any part of the building, 80,000
14 square feet, they must make the payment of 4.73
15 million based upon today's calculation of the \$59
16 a square foot, that will change over time.

17 The most important issue is when a
18 contribution is made, where does it go? We were
19 not born yesterday in Community Board 4. We have
20 a site on the Fulton Houses as part of West
21 Chelsea, it's on West 18th Street, that site under
22 the West Chelsea 2005 points of agreement would
23 create 100 units. The intention and the specific
24 targeting is to create an additional 50 units of
25 moderate and middle-income housing on that site.

1
2 So we have a location for it to land as opposed to
3 a vague promise.

4 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very
5 much. I do want to point out that, although it's
6 a busy day and some people had other meetings to
7 run to, and I'm sitting here, at the moment, this
8 is being streamed live on the computers and many
9 people are watching them in their offices right
10 now, as well as it's going to be shown on public
11 access TV. So everything you say here today will
12 be talked about and put as part of the discussion
13 as we go forward, so don't worry about that. We
14 want to thank this panel. Mr. Fernandes, thank
15 you very much, and I apologize for the wait. And
16 I will try to keep things moving as much as
17 possible while still getting everyone's voices
18 heard. So thank you all very much.

19 [Pause]

20 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: All right,
21 we're going to call up, try to get a panel of five
22 again up. I'd like to call up Andrew Berman, who
23 I saw here; Amanda Davis; Edrie Kotz; Michael
24 McKee; and Katy Smith. Is that right, Smith? I'm
25 not sure I read that right.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

[Off mic]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: What's your name?

FEMALE VOICE: What's your name?

[Pause]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay. Whenever you're ready. Andrew, you want to start?

ANDREW BERMAN: Thanks very much. Good afternoon, Council Members, my name is Andrew Berman, I'm the executive director of the Greenwich Village Society for Historic Preservation. We're the largest membership organization in Greenwich Village, SoHo, and the East Village, with many members in Chelsea as well.

GVSHP has a long history with Chelsea Market. It was included in our proposed Gansevoort Market Historic District in 2001, which was designated but with Chelsea Market removed due to owner objections. And in 2007, we got the Chelsea Market complex listed on the State and National Register of Historic Places.

We urge you in the strongest of terms not to approve this application in any form

1
2 or to upzone Chelsea Market in any way. There is
3 no good reason to upzone Chelsea Market and many
4 good reasons not to. It is an iconic, beloved,
5 and successful example of adaptive reuse. The
6 former Nabisco factory where Oreos were invented,
7 Chelsea Market is a landmark in the truest sense
8 of the word. The proposed additions atop the
9 complex would destroy its character and aesthetic
10 integrity.

11 Further, this application does not
12 exist in a vacuum. In recent years, the City has
13 approved enormous rezonings in Community Board
14 number 4. The West Chelsea rezoning, Hudson
15 Yards, the Western and Eastern Rail Yards. These
16 have created literally tens of millions of square
17 feet of new development potential in Chelsea and
18 around and only a small portion of it has yet been
19 built. A massive development is planned nearby at
20 Pier 57. As a result, in the coming years, we'll
21 see any ever-growing swell of traffic and
22 congestion in an area already bursting at the
23 seams from new activity. The neighborhood is
24 hard-pressed to absorb all of this traffic and
25 crowding as it is and it's hard to imagine how

1
2 we'll handle the millions of square feet of
3 additional development planned for the coming
4 years. Upzoning Chelsea Market to allow the
5 addition of hundreds of thousands of square feet
6 of office space that is not allowed under the
7 current zoning would only add insult to injury.

8 The Chelsea Market complex is not
9 suffering as a business endeavor. Far from it, it
10 is thriving. There is no need for an upzoning or
11 these large additions on top. The sole motivation
12 is this international real estate developer's
13 desire for even greater profits. While it is
14 their job to maximize their profits, it is the job
15 of our city officials to look at and consider the
16 entire public's interest and well-being before
17 considering changes to our zoning.

18 If you do, in this case, I am sure
19 you will see that the public, and especially the
20 local community and those aspects of the Chelsea
21 Market which the public holds dear, will be
22 gravely harmed if this upzoning is approved. We
23 urge you not to do so.

24 I am also submitting to the Council
25 a copy of our petition with 1,500 signatures

1
2 calling for the plan to be rejected.

3 Thank you.

4 [Applause]

5 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

6 Okay.

7 AMANDA DAVIS: Okay. I'm--

8 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [Interposing]

9 Short and polite, that's fine.

10 AMANDA DAVIS: --I am Amanda Davis
11 and I am speaking on behalf of Save Chelsea Market
12 Coalition, which includes the Greenwich Village
13 Society for Historic Preservation, Save Chelsea,
14 the Historic District's Council, Tenants Political
15 Action Committee, Council of Chelsea Block
16 Associations, the Chelsea Reform Democratic Club,
17 Chelsea Village Partnership, Greenwich Village
18 Community Task Force, London Terrace Tenants
19 Association, 100 West 16th Street Block
20 Association, Chelsea Coalition on Housing, and
21 Lower Chelsea Alliance. I'll be submitting full
22 testimony, but speaking only a portion of it here,
23 and it echoes what Andrew just said.

24 We take strong issue with the
25 proposal to allow the upzoning if financial

1 support for a stalled affordable housing
2 development at the Fulton House is included. The
3 affordable housing development in question is one
4 which was promised to the community as a condition
5 of the West Chelsea rezoning approved by the City
6 Council in 2005. Though that affordable housing
7 was promised, it has not materialized because the
8 City has failed to provide the funding necessary
9 for it to move ahead.
10

11 To make the Chelsea community pay
12 for this promised amenity a second time by giving
13 away more of our light and air and adding to our
14 traffic and congestion would be outrageous. This
15 community wants and is owed truly affordable
16 housing, but we should not have to pay for it
17 twice.

18 I would also like to mention that
19 the provision in the approvals to limit heights on
20 the site and preserve the existing buildings are
21 cold comfort at best. The complex is overbuilt as
22 is and under existing zoning, would surely never
23 be torn down and additional bulk could not be
24 added. So saying that the new zoning would
25 establish height limits where none currently exist

1 ignores the reality of the current conditions.

2 Similarly, placing provisions in
3 the agreement to quote unquote preserve the
4 existing buildings is locking the proverbial barn
5 door after the horses are almost entirely out.
6 Preserving the buildings while putting these huge,
7 out-of-character additions on top is not
8 preservation at all.

9 Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very
11 much. Ms. Smith?

12 KATY SMITH: Very good timing, yes.
13 Hi, everyone, Katy Smith, I represent Congressman
14 Jerry Nadler and I'm here submitting testimony on
15 his behalf. Thank you, Chair Weprin, Land Use
16 Chair Comrie, and Speaker Quinn.

17 As we all know, Chelsea Market is a
18 unique food, retail, and wholesale destination and
19 office building in New York City. Its location
20 next to the High Line and role as an integral part
21 of Silicon Alley and as an incubator for creative
22 businesses has helped to revitalize West Chelsea.
23 While the Chelsea Market proposal would allow the
24 expansion of a growing part of New York City's
25

1
2 economy, it raises serious concerns about the
3 impact on the surrounding neighborhood and
4 residents.

5 The Congressman would like to thank
6 Community Board 4 and the borough president for
7 their work and recommendations, as well as the
8 City Planning Commission for their recommendations
9 and improvement to the original proposal, which
10 mitigate many of the concerns for the
11 neighborhood. In particular, the addition of the
12 affordable housing fund, the preservation of the
13 current mid-block heights, the preservation of the
14 ground floor retail experience, and the
15 prohibition on hotel use reduce some of the
16 negative impacts of the expansion. However, the
17 Congressman still has some concerns about the
18 proposal and would like the City Council to
19 consider some additional improvements.

20 In particular, as a long-time
21 advocate for affordable housing, the Congressman
22 is obviously very alarmed by the decline in
23 affordable housing in the West Chelsea and has
24 joined with Community Board 4 and his fellow
25 elected officials to ask for provisions to be

1
2 incorporated in this proposal to reverse this
3 trend. He's very pleased at the inclusion of the
4 affordable housing fund and it's imperative that
5 the City Council take all available measures to
6 ensure that this fund is effective and actually
7 provides benefits to the community in the near
8 future.

9 The Chelsea Market buildings are
10 historically significant, both in their appearance
11 and use, and the Congressman urges the City
12 Council to work toward preserving existing Chelsea
13 Market buildings as Community Board 4 and the
14 borough president have recommended.

15 And finally, the City Planning
16 Commission has recommended a series of setbacks on
17 the 10th Avenue building. While this will reduce
18 bulk and mitigate the impact of shadows on the
19 High Line, the City Council should examine--one
20 more sentence--

21 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: You can finish
22 it.

23 KATY SMITH: --whether additional
24 reductions can be made to make the building more
25 contextual to the existing Chelsea Market

1 buildings.

2 Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: We let you go
4 over 'cause we knew if Congressman Nadler was
5 here, he would've gone a lot longer so...

6 [Crosstalk]

7 KATY SMITH: Yeah. Thank you.

8 EDRIE CODY: Hello, my name is
9 Edrie Cody [phonetic], I have lived in Chelsea for
10 40 years, first on the 300 block of West 20th
11 Street, then for 32 years at London Terrace
12 Gardens where I was president of the London
13 Terrace Tenants Association, which represents
14 tenants of 1,000 rental apartments on the 400
15 block of West 23rd and 24th Streets, and currently
16 reside at Penn South on the 300 block of West 28th
17 Street.
18

19 Although I've gradually moved
20 further away from the site of the Chelsea Market
21 through the years, I still consider it to be in my
22 neighborhood. Residents of the Chelsea community
23 worked long and hard to get the existing zoning
24 laws enacted and I am adamantly opposed to
25 changing those laws to facilitate commercial,

1
2 self-serving, high-rise development plans of the
3 deep-pocketed and greedy German developer,
4 Jamestown property, who will do nothing to enhance
5 the quality of life in Chelsea.

6 You are on a slippery slope here.
7 If you authorize this change in the zoning laws,
8 other developers will surely come knocking at the
9 door to ask for similar concessions, which will
10 result in increasing density of buildings,
11 vehicular gridlock, and skyrocketing cost of
12 living, and all but eradicating the once-peaceful
13 life in residential Chelsea.

14 In 2005, the community was promised
15 100 affordable housing units by the City in return
16 for an upzoning that allowed a huge influx of
17 high-rise luxury housing. That promise was never
18 delivered. Jamestown bought off public housing
19 tenants in Chelsea by promising a jobs training
20 program. Community residents are concerned that
21 the promises of affordable housing and jobs will
22 never be delivered; that Jamestown, which only
23 bought the complex a few years ago, might build a
24 monstrous additions atop the Chelsea Market
25 buildings, then flip and disappear with the

1
2 profits. Even if the promise of jobs for
3 community residents and affordable housing for the
4 community were real, it would not make Jamestown's
5 proposal acceptable.

6 Over the years, we Chelsea
7 residents have been fortunate to be represented by
8 elected officials at local, state, and federal
9 levels who have looked out for our interests. Our
10 City Council Member, Speaker Quinn, cut her teeth
11 in public service working on housing issues. She
12 worked side-by-side with her Clinton Chelsea
13 constituents in defeating the equally ill-advised
14 proposal to build a stadium for the New York Jets.
15 As her more than three terms as a City Council
16 Member is coming to an end, her constituents have
17 every right to expect her and her City Council
18 colleagues to do what will best serve the city by
19 voting no on Jamestown's ill-advised self-serving
20 proposal.

21 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very
22 much.

23 [Applause]

24 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Mr. McKee.

25 MICHAEL MCKEE: Good morning, my

1
2 name is Michael McKee, I have lived in Chelsea for
3 47 years, I'm obviously not going to read my
4 entire statement, and now the clock is working.

5 If there ever were a definition--

6 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [Interposing]

7 No coincidence.

8 MICHAEL MCKEE: Yeah. If there
9 ever were a definition of an inappropriate
10 development project, this one is it. Everything
11 about Jamestown's proposal is a negative from the
12 community's point of view.

13 While ruining these important
14 buildings, this project would also exacerbate the
15 already unbearable traffic congestion in the 9th
16 Avenue corridor leading to 15th Street and add to
17 secondary displacement pressures on residential
18 and commercial tenants in the surrounding
19 community. The supposed community benefits that
20 are supposed to come with this project--a small
21 number of affordable housing units and job
22 training, not jobs--for public housing residents
23 are the usual fraud. Even if these promises were
24 real and not a mirage, these benefits in no way
25 would be enough to justify forcing Chelsea to

1
2 swallow yet another unnecessary and damaging
3 upzoning.

4 I want to comment on the process
5 that has led us to this point. The members of
6 this committee are as aware as anyone in New York
7 City that the ULURP process is corrupt and in
8 serious need of repair. Before this application
9 was even certified, there was no doubt a handshake
10 deal behind closed doors between the Mayor's
11 office, the Speaker's office, and the City
12 Planning Commission to green-light this
13 destructive proposal with the understanding that
14 there would be some tweaks down the road in the
15 form of supposed community benefits. Don't insult
16 our intelligence by asking us to pretend that the
17 wheels of this train were not greased several
18 months ago.

19 Having obtained this tacit
20 approval, the well-connected developer then
21 proceeded to buy all the interested parties off.
22 Millions of dollars to the High Line for park
23 maintenance and never mind the damage to the park
24 itself. Construction jobs for the trade unions,
25 even though this project could be built elsewhere.

1
2 And training for local public housing residents
3 with the hope that some of them might actually
4 land a job in a few years.

5 I strongly urge the City Council to
6 vote the self-serving proposal down and I urge
7 Speaker Christine Quinn, our City Council Member,
8 to remember her roots and put our community first.
9 Don't do this to our neighborhood. We deserve
10 better treatment by this committee--

11 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Sir--

12 MICHAEL MCKEE: --by the Speaker,
13 and by the City Council.

14 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Mr.
15 McKee.

16 MICHAEL MCKEE: Thank you.

17 [Applause]

18 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.
19 Please keep quiet. I want to thank this panel for
20 testifying. Easy on the applause. Thank you very
21 much. We'll now call up another panel in
22 opposition I think, or in favor of?

23 FEMALE VOICE: Favor. Or are we
24 doing--

25 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [Interposing]

1
2 Okay. I'm going to do one more in opposition, I'm
3 sorry, just 'cause I did--there's one gentleman as
4 particular who was led to believe he would go on
5 the first panel I didn't realize, so I'm going to
6 let them go. 'Cause we have more oppositions at
7 this point. So Bill Borock, come on up; Madelyn
8 Margolis; James Murray; is it Tom Jaspar or Toss--
9 is it Jim maybe? Jim Jaspar; Paul Grunke, Gronke.
10 Gentlemen, would you all let--and lady--Bill go
11 first? Sir, if you want to leave after your
12 testimony, you can do so, we won't be insulted. I
13 know you were in a rush. And then we'll come back
14 to panels in favor, I apologize to them. Whenever
15 you're ready.

16 [Pause]

17 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Make sure the
18 mic is on.

19 BILL BOROCK: Sorry, my name is
20 Bill Borock and I am president of the Council of
21 Chelsea Block Association. The Council Chelsea
22 Block Association was formed in 1961 and is now a
23 coalition of 11 block associations covering 21
24 blocks active in Chelsea. The CCBA wants you to
25 know that we are against the Jamestown plan for

1
2 the Chelsea Market site and that we ask you to
3 vote no.

4 Today you will hear testimony that
5 thousands of Chelsea residents have signed
6 petitions and letters opposing the proposed plan
7 for the Chelsea Market and, in addition, a broad
8 coalition of many community groups, including
9 affordable housing activists representing many
10 more thousands of people have also made their
11 opposition to the plans known.

12 The Jamestown plan does not have to
13 be a done deal with business as usual. There is
14 an alternative, which, accepted, will provide a
15 win-win situation. The Council of Chelsea Block
16 Association asks that you support the community
17 position that the existing zoning, which we worked
18 hard to get for the benefit of our community, not
19 be changed for the benefit of Jamestown. To
20 change the zoning will set a very bad precedent.
21 The existing zone should be allowed to remain in
22 effect.

23 Jamestown can build its office
24 buildings elsewhere. For instance, in the World
25 Trade Center area where financial perks are

1
2 available to developers and where the community
3 will welcome it. The Hudson Yards is another area
4 of possibility. Why build in a community where
5 you are not wanted? Why not build in a community
6 where you are wanted and will be welcomed?

7 The CCBA is not against unions and
8 union jobs. Whatever jobs are created could still
9 be created at a different location. The technical
10 training that Jamestown proposed for the community
11 residents can still come to fruition, again, just
12 at another location. The iconic historic Chelsea
13 Market is already thriving and it can remain as it
14 is and not be defaced by building on top of it.
15 We are not against the existing Chelsea Market.

16 A bad plan is a bad plan, even if
17 some changes are made to it. At various public
18 hearings, overwhelming majority of Chelsea
19 residents spoke against the Jamestown plan and
20 asked that it be rejected. Even our local
21 Community Board members thought that the plan was
22 a bad plan. With a very, very close vote, they
23 voted to okay it because they felt the only way
24 they could have input with regard to any changes
25 because they thought approval was a done deal. We

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

are not--

[Crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [Interposing]

Thank you.

BILL BOROCH: --group--in

conclusion, a motion--mention was made about potential givebacks. Unfortunately, as has occurred in many places including Chelsea and other areas, promised givebacks to the communities don't always happen, and this includes the promise of affordable housing. And if somehow, some of what is called affordable gets built, it is not affordable for those that really need it and the housing is usually not permitted. We ask that you vote no--

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [Interposing]

Thank you.

BILL BOROCH: --there is an

alternative. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very

much. Next in line. Please.

MADELYN MARGOLIS: Hello, my name

is Madelyn Margolis, I'm not a lawyer or a developer or a politician, I don't represent any

1
2 group, I'm a resident of Chelsea since 1975--most
3 of my adult life.

4 New York City has many office
5 towers; many buildings, but only one Chelsea
6 Market, one High Line. We just have one Chelsea
7 Market. The proposed towers are an abomination;
8 they're an architectural travesty that will
9 destroy the market and create shadows on the High
10 Line Park. A park is supposed to provide light
11 and air, it shouldn't be in the shadow of some
12 ungainly tower.

13 The goodies promised by the
14 developer, if indeed they, you know, they are
15 really provided, it's really putting, if you'll
16 pardon the expression, lipstick on a pig, which is
17 what this proposal is. And many years ago, we in
18 New York City lost Penn Station, it can't be
19 brought back. If you destroy Chelsea Market, it's
20 not going to be able to be rehabbed. So I urge
21 City Council people members vote on the right side
22 of history and protect and preserve Chelsea
23 Market.

24 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very
25 much.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

JAMES MARI: Hello, Council Members, my name is James Mari, I am unaffiliated with any of the groups here, I do have some neighbors, like this woman here.

I was born in New York, I mostly have spent my life here, much of that in Chelsea, and I also am a retired FDNY firefighter.

Chelsea is a neighborhood and I know a lot of my neighbors, and I have yet to meet one who thinks this project is a good idea. And my letter is, like the destruction of the original Penn Station for the profit of a few corporate interests, this project will be a destructive scar on the faster disappearing architectural history. To disfigure this building by ignoring zoning laws, which were enacted to stop this kind of perverse corporate corporatism, is wrong. The zoning law was enacted to favor residents and to keep the historical character of the neighborhood.

If we as a people let the greed of the corporations overrun our laws, then there is no reason to enact the laws or elect representatives. Allowing this project to move forward in any capacity will, for all intents and

1
2 purposes, render the community-minded law invalid
3 to any corporation with a team of lawyers and
4 lobbyists.

5 This is a line in the sand. Our
6 country has been kowtowing to corporate interests
7 over the wishes and well-being of the people for
8 too long. It's time our elected officials put the
9 well-being of the neighborhood that it was elected
10 to serve above the well wishes of connected out-
11 of-town corporations. Jamestown's American
12 corporate headquarters is in Atlanta, they have no
13 vested interest in the community of Chelsea and
14 West Village. Their only purpose is to maximize
15 profits. Profits are not a bad thing, but when
16 they come at such a high cost to a community only
17 to enrich shareholders who do not live or care
18 about the community, then those profits are
19 immoral.

20 I'm all for capitalism.

21 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Just finish up
22 quickly.

23 JAMES MARI: What citizen of New
24 York can it there be has changed the law or a
25 statute for their own monetary gain? If a citizen

1
2 cannot do such a thing, why should it be allowed
3 of a corporation? Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.
5 Thank you, Mr. Murray, appreciate it. Gentlemen,
6 you guys, choose up.

7 JIM JASPER: Good afternoon, I'm
8 Jim Jasper, and for more than 20 years now I've
9 lived on West 15th Street, about 100 yards from
10 the building that's now Chelsea Market.

11 Our neighborhood is under severe
12 stress. We're choking on crowds and traffic and
13 noise, and we need your help to uphold the city
14 zoning laws, we need you to use these laws to help
15 protect us. We all know that there are lots of
16 cases of very tough trade-offs between preserving
17 real neighborhoods, and jobs and development on
18 the other hand. This is not one of those cases.
19 There's no evidence that this project will create
20 a single permanent job. It will just move them
21 from one neighborhood of New York where they might
22 be needed and wanted, to a neighborhood where they
23 are not needed or wanted.

24 The idea that this is a jobs
25 proposal, that somehow we need this for

1
2 development is nonsense. And I especially want to
3 say something because there are a lot of very well
4 intentioned union people here today. Jamestown is
5 no friend of trade unions. Jamestown bought the
6 Madison Hotel in Washington a year and a half ago,
7 the first thing they did was to fire all of the
8 unionized employees of that hotel. They hired
9 some of them back after a three-month strike, a
10 very bitter, nasty strike. The idea that there
11 are going to be any permanent, good union jobs
12 that come out of this project is nonsense. Thank
13 you.

14 [Applause]

15 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

16 Quiet, please.

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down.

18 Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Gronke.

20 PAUL GRONKE: My name is Paul
21 Gronke, I've been a resident of Chelsea for 27
22 years. Chelsea Market is a historic and iconic
23 complex, listed on the New York State and National
24 Register of Historic Places. The proposed
25 rezoning would allow the complex to be entirely

1
2 disfigured and ruin its integrity. As it stands
3 now, Chelsea Market is not only an incredibly
4 vital economic engine for the West Side, but a
5 well-preserved link to the commercial industrial
6 past of our city. Please don't allow this to be
7 ruined.

8 The revised plans for the proposed
9 towers would not only destroy the historic
10 character and architecture of Chelsea Market, but
11 they would loom over and shadow the High Line
12 Park. Additionally, the large increase in
13 commercial square footage would generate
14 significant extra traffic in an area that is
15 already overburdened. And the plan building
16 already being scheduled for 9th Avenue along with
17 the Pier 57 development is only going to bring
18 more traffic to the area that's already baked in
19 the cake. Please vote no for the Chelsea Market
20 proposal. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very
22 much. I'd like to now call out the following
23 panel in favor of this project: Miguel Acevedo
24 [phonetic], Jan McGregor, Pat Holding [phonetic],
25 Paul Brown, and Jordan--is it Eisenstadt,

1
2 Isenstadt? Isenstadt. I see Grace Ralph from NY1
3 is here, are you here to testify as a tenant or
4 are you here covering the story, Grace? I didn't
5 know.

6 [Off mic]

7 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: I guess she's
8 working, I'm sorry.

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and
10 gentlemen, if you have any copies of your
11 statements--

12 [Background noise]

13 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay. When
14 the music stops, everyone needs a chair, okay.
15 Great. And decide who wants to go first. Make
16 sure to state your name, please.

17 MIGUEL ACEVEDO: Good afternoon,
18 Council Members, and thank you for having me here
19 today. My name is Miguel Acevedo, I'm a resident
20 of Robert Fulton Houses. I'm here in support
21 because I have a family of eight that I am
22 raising, three college graduates who are looking
23 for affordable housing who are employed within the
24 community but have limited employment because of
25 the way the economy is today. They are looking

1
2 for computer jobs, computer training, and ways to
3 develop better skills in the future. And that's
4 why I'm totally in support of this project and I
5 appreciate that Jamestown is looking forward to
6 help us in the community as they've done for
7 years.

8 Also, my youngest daughter has
9 volunteered at Chelsea Market over the years, and
10 to me it's discriminating to hear people say that
11 residents of Robert Fulton Houses have been bought
12 out from this develop--it's the last thing that we
13 will ever do is be bought out by any developer.
14 So I am appalled at what you people are saying
15 about my residents because that's not we're about.
16 We're not about taking money to support
17 development, okay?

18 One other things that this same
19 group has said about us, that we read at a third-
20 grade reading level, which to me is discriminating
21 against us. It's bad enough we deal with stop-
22 and-frisk because of where we live in public
23 housing. So I will never, ever support a group
24 that has so much discrimination against residents
25 because of where we live.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Thank you.

[Applause]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very much. Quiet, quiet, please. Thank you. Next, please?

IAN MCGREGOR: Good afternoon, members of the City Council, my name is Ian McGregor and I'm the owner and operator of the Lobster Place, one of Chelsea Market's original tenants.

In 1995, my parents brought the Lobster Place at Chelsea Market with 15 employees and a tiny retail fish market. Due in no small part to the environment Chelsea Market provides, in particular the symbiotic relationship between ground-floor merchant and upstairs office tenant, we now employ 100 people across two locations, 55 in Chelsea Market alone, and we operate the largest retail seafood market on the East Coast.

From my perspective, the Chelsea Market expansion is the next chapter in a great story of shared prosperity that has characterized the growth of the market since way back in '95, when my parents arrived. Jamestown's approach to

1
2 the management of the market has defied the notion
3 that real estate development is a zero-sum game.
4 They provide generous support to the ground-floor
5 merchants and genuinely recognize that our success
6 contributes to theirs.

7 My projections indicate that,
8 should the expansion go forward, the Lobster Place
9 will hire 40 to 45 new staff and management
10 employees over the next 45 years, and we're only
11 one of dozens of small businesses that would
12 benefit from this project.

13 On behalf of all the small
14 businesses that call Chelsea Market home and in
15 the name of helping Chelsea Market continue to be
16 one of the greatest small business incubators in
17 the city, I urge the Council to approve the
18 project.

19 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.
20 Next, please.

21 JORDAN ISENSTADT: Good afternoon,
22 Chairman Weprin, my name is Jordan Isenstadt, and
23 I am the deputy director of the Association for a
24 Better New York. ABNY is among the city's longest
25 standing civic organizations advocating for the

1
2 policies, programs, and projects that make New
3 York a better place to live, work, and visit. We
4 represent the broad fabric of New York's economy,
5 and our membership includes New York's most
6 influential businesses, nonprofits, arts and
7 cultural organizations, educational institutions,
8 labor unions, and entrepreneurs. I'm testifying
9 today on behalf of ABNY in support of the
10 amendment to the Special West Chelsea District
11 proposed by Jamestown Properties to expand Chelsea
12 Market.

13 In the name of brevity, I'm going
14 to skip through the next couple of paragraphs and
15 get to the main point. As you may know, ABNY has
16 spent a significant amount of time looking at the
17 importance of the tech sector to the growth of New
18 York City's economy. Recently working in
19 partnership with the Center for an Urban Future,
20 we issued a report entitled New Tech City, which
21 identifies the need to create new desirable office
22 space to attract and retain tech companies in New
23 York.

24 We believe the Chelsea Market is
25 critical to the growth of the tech sector and to

1
2 the broader economic development of our city.
3 When completed, the project will create 1,200 new
4 full-time jobs, generate millions in tax revenue
5 to the city and state, and with Google right next
6 door, develop highly demanded office space,
7 creating a true hub for established and emerging
8 technology companies.

9 This project is critical for New
10 York City's economic growth and we hope that the
11 City Council Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises
12 approves the amendment. Thank you for the
13 opportunity to testify.

14 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

15 PATRICIA HELDING: Good afternoon,
16 my name is Patricia Holding, I am here to support
17 Jamestown. I am the owner of a very small bakery
18 inside Chelsea Market, and one of the things that
19 I really love about New York City is that it is
20 not wall-to-wall chain stores.

21 Most of the businesses inside
22 Chelsea Market are entrepreneurial, they're
23 artisan, and most of us owners work on the site.

24 Chelsea Market is an important
25 business model because it has an incubation

1
2 environment, and I think it should be encouraged.
3 I'm supporting it.

4 I am lucky to be part of the market
5 and have been able to grow my business there. I
6 support the expansion, I look forward to more
7 businesses and a broader tax base for the City of
8 New York.

9 Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very
11 much.

12 PAUL BROWN: All right. My name is
13 Paul Brown, and we are the original tenants of
14 Chelsea Market. Back in 1995, we moved in, small
15 business. We do retail advertising and our
16 clients are international. They come to New York
17 from China, Japan, Korea, all of Western Europe,
18 and the majority of our business is here from the
19 United States, it includes Target, Nordstrom's,
20 Neiman Marcus. The destination is the Chelsea
21 Market, which is our brand.

22 There have been suggestions that
23 maybe we move, but our business and the Chelsea
24 Market are who we are. Jamestown has been very
25 supportive of that. We're looking to expand, but

1 we found that there's no place to expand into.

2 The proposal that's being brought
3 before us is not only tax-based revenue and
4 services, but it's also it's going to help us
5 grow. We're in support of it. And thank you for
6 your time.

7
8 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very
9 much. Thank you all very much.

10 Now we're going to call up the
11 following panel in opposition: Donathan Solcott
12 [phonetic], David Holoka, Lesley Ann Doyel,
13 Martika Sawin, I apologize for any names I messed
14 up. Got four. And then Lloyd Van Pragh
15 [phonetic]. Sorry.

16 MARTIKA SAWIN: Nobody wants to go
17 second?

18 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: And whenever
19 you're ready, whoever's ready first can start.

20 MARTIKA SAWIN: You go ahead.

21 DONATHAN SOLCOTT: Hi, my name is
22 Donathan Solcott--oh. Hi, my name is Donathan
23 Solcott, I'm a 30-year resident of Chelsea. I met
24 my wife in Chelsea, she is a lifelong member. And
25 thank you for this opportunity.

1
2 Please vote no in changing the
3 Chelsea zoning laws that will allow Jamestown to
4 build a massive development on Chelsea Market.
5 Formerly known as Nabisco factory, the building is
6 on the National Register of Historic Places, it's
7 rich in history of Chelsea's working class and
8 should be celebrated as a landmark, a city
9 landmark.

10 And although inside, the market has
11 lost some of its local novelty, my wife used to
12 shop there--she no longer does, she says it costs
13 too many clams to buy a scallop, but it's
14 integrity outside and its sunlight should be
15 protected.

16 Our community has worked hard to
17 establish existing zoning laws. The local zoning
18 laws already too friendly to the swarm of
19 developers circling every crevice of land and air
20 and need not to be changed.

21 According to the 2010 census,
22 developers shoehorned in over 19,000 more people.
23 Many lifelong Chelsea-ites can't afford Chelsea
24 and are being replaced by those that can. Daily,
25 thousands commute to work in Chelsea and thousands

1
2 more come to enjoy our new parks and High Line.

3 We are being trampled by the
4 existing laws, and the changes are becoming
5 borderline Charles Dickens. We now have avenues,
6 a private school for affluent students opposite
7 the street of the ball fields of the Elliot
8 housing projects, whose youth are routinely
9 subject to stop-and-frisk.

10 We need the community--your
11 committee needs to probably--thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Oh, okay,
13 thank you. Thank you for being so prompt.

14 DONATHAN SOLCOTT: Change in
15 Chelsea needs to slow down, not speed up.

16 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay. Good.
17 Can go over, we like the clams line, so that was
18 good.

19 DONATHAN SOLCOTT: Thanks.

20 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Yes, next.

21 DAVE HOLOKA: Hi, I'm Dave Holoka
22 [phonetic], I'm an architect and Chelsea resident.

23 Jamestown's proposal flunks Urban
24 Planning 101 on the zoning basics: Use, bulk, and
25 environmental impact. Look at use. Every block

1
2 of the adjacent Special West Chelsea District has
3 zoning that allows office construction, yet it
4 remains largely undeveloped, including the entire
5 parking lot block just 320 feet north of Chelsea
6 Market.

7 Look at bulk. Even if there really
8 was a need for more office space, the last place
9 to build it would be where it will rob the High
10 Line of light and open space deliberately
11 orchestrated by existing zoning, which shaped the
12 neighboring Caledonia apartment building to step
13 down toward the High Line in Chelsea Market's
14 existing roof, complementing the very space
15 Jamestown now wants to seize.

16 Look at impact. The historic
17 Chelsea Market complex won't be enlarged, just
18 made into a base for Jamestown's anonymous office
19 space, which will cast shadows over the High
20 Line's 10th Avenue grandstand feature, especially
21 during colder months when sunlight is most
22 welcome.

23 Jamestown wants Chelsea Market
24 brought into the special district just so it can
25 exploit the district's High Line Improvement

1
2 bonus. Here's how City Planning's website
3 describes this bonus: In recognition of the
4 unique condition of the High Line between West
5 16th and 19th Streets where it broadens and
6 crosses over 10th Avenue, adjacent development on
7 these blocks could receive additional floor area
8 through restoration, remediation, and
9 implementation of the High Line open space at
10 perhaps its most prominent location. Jamestown
11 would turn this bonus from a reward for
12 cultivating open space into a reward for seizing
13 it. Its proposal would even make irrelevant the
14 spatial contribution already made under the bonus
15 on a huge scale by the neighboring Caledonia
16 building.

17 The Department of City Planning
18 will apparently do anything for Friends of the
19 High Line, even let them hold a fire sale at
20 integral High Line open space that over 100
21 million public dollars made valuable. The absence
22 of basic zoning motives points to a deal between
23 financially interested parties, a somehow budget
24 vulnerable High Line, and a predatory Jamestown,
25 which gets to buy its way around zoning to hog

1
2 prime space on the money trough it sees in the
3 High Line.

4 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay.

5 DAVE HOLOKA: I ask the Council to
6 honor the public interest and the very purpose of
7 zoning and to stop every square inch of this
8 outrage.

9 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

10 Next, please.

11 LLOYD VAN PRAGH: My name is Lloyd
12 Van Pragh, next year will make 20 years that I've
13 been a Chelsea resident. Myself and many others
14 of Chelsea are opposed to inconsistent, spotty,
15 out of control, bizarre development which is
16 destructive for the community while serving
17 private enrichment. In fact, we are for mindful,
18 sensible development that respects our purposeful
19 zoning rules, our community, its resources, and
20 its residents. Upzoning Chelsea Market would
21 create a bad precedent that other developers could
22 pursue. Our current zoning rules would be
23 perceived as meaningless.

24 Even so, there is a big difference
25 between zoning that is beneficially malleable and

1 zoning bent to serve private enrichment at the
2 expense of the common good. Jamestown is asking
3 to be included in the Special West Chelsea
4 District in order to expand especially at the
5 highly lucrative 10th Avenue side with its
6 lucrative views and larger floor plates.
7

8 Contrary to that special purpose
9 district's current zoning to preserve open space
10 around the High Line, the proposed 240,000 square
11 foot building on 10th Avenue side would tower
12 directly over and beside the High Line Park,
13 obstructing views, light, and air. Shadows from
14 the proposed expansion would cover the 10th Avenue
15 square grandstand seating area of the High Line in
16 its entirety during sun hours. These items
17 violate the general purposes section of the
18 Special West Chelsea District zoning resolution,
19 as well as specific sections, such as Section 98-
20 421, which speaks about open space for the High
21 Line.

22 Additional development at this
23 particular site of Chelsea Market is not needed.
24 Indeed, it is greed, driven by money and only
25 money. Any need, true need, for additional office

1
2 space can be accommodated by development in nearby
3 Special West Chelsea District, the Hudson Yards,
4 and at Ground Zero. The one time, the one-time
5 \$19 million contribution to the High Line will be
6 spent down to nothing one day while incongruous
7 problematic buildings atop Chelsea Market will
8 remain a permanent blight on our skyline and the
9 High Line Park, along with its persistent myriad
10 problems for the community.

11 Contributions for the High Line can
12 and are coming from elsewhere. The High Line will
13 soon have new office and storage space annexed to
14 the new [off mic] museum currently under
15 construction at the southern terminus of the High
16 Line on Gansevoort Street.

17 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: If you could
18 wrap up really quick.

19 LLOYD VAN PRAGH: All right.
20 Plopping new buildings atop Chelsea Market's
21 architecturally and historically important complex
22 would create an incongruous structure that is
23 neither contextual nor compatible with its
24 surroundings. Indeed, the expansion will cause
25 permanent traffic congestion and noise along with

1
2 nearby developments, such as Pier 57 with 375,000
3 square feet to the western end of 16th Street and
4 a large lot on the south side of 15th Street and
5 9th Ave on which now exists a lumber yard and
6 adjoining empty lots extending about halfway
7 towards 10th Avenue. Another developer currently
8 proposes a 28-story structure at this site for
9 which it is already zoned. This represents a
10 great demand in the increase on--a great increase
11 on the area's infrastructure.

12 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very
13 much.

14 LLOYD VAN PRAGH: Under the 19--

15 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [Interposing]
16 I got to wrap you up, we're going to get you a job
17 though doing disclaimers on the end of the drug
18 ads, you know, really quick talking, but I just
19 got to cut you off there, I'm sorry. Next,
20 please.

21 MARTIKA SAWIN: My name is Martika
22 Sawin, I am the widow of James Marston Fitch, a
23 founding father of historic preservation. We
24 lived--and I still do--in the West Village five
25 blocks from the Chelsea Market, which Jim Fitch

1
2 regarded as the most creative example of adaptive
3 reuse in the entire city.

4 I am speaking simply as a
5 neighborhood consumer. It has been my great
6 pleasure over the past 14 years to shop in the
7 Chelsea Market, enjoying the best fish market in
8 New York, a great variety of the freshest fruits
9 and vegetables at reasonable prices, Italian
10 specialties, organic dairy products from a New
11 York State dairy, and bread that you can see being
12 pulled out of the oven. The throngs of people
13 strolling along the indoor street include groups
14 of schoolchildren, foreign tourists who may be
15 reminded of the great public markets in their own
16 cities, restaurant chefs, families with strollers
17 and toddlers, construction workers eating lunch,
18 musicians performing, and on Saturday afternoons,
19 tango dancers of all shapes and ages.

20 In June, the proposed upzoning was
21 the subject of a Community Board 4 hearing at
22 which a procession of vendors, bakers,
23 fishmongers, grocers, shopkeepers testified as to
24 how their businesses had prospered thanks to the
25 Chelsea Market. Did they really believe their

1
2 businesses would survive the coming years of
3 construction? Do they really think corporate
4 executives in the office towers will tolerate a
5 genuine crowded market place on the ground floor
6 living over the fish market? Instead, there will
7 be a slicked up mall lined with shops franchised
8 by national chain corporations.

9 In recent weeks, we've been hearing
10 a great deal about the crucial role of small
11 business. Why should the City Council of New York
12 choose to fatten the wallets of foreign investors
13 rather than encouraging individual enterprise
14 among its own citizens? What possible excuse is
15 there for voting the destruction of a neighborhood
16 treasure, a neighborhood, I might add, that is
17 still a mixed income community, despite the
18 overwhelming influx of luxury high-rise building.
19 Besides, it's downright ugly, a sore thumb.

20 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you,
21 thank you very much.

22 [Applause]

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

24 LESLEY DOYEL: Okay. My name is
25 Lesley Doyel, I am co-president of Save Chelsea,

1
2 and we have strongly opposed this proposal
3 consistently since we learned of it. And I
4 thought it worth just ending this panel by
5 emphasizing the breadth of the opposition to this
6 proposal.

7 Throughout the ULURP process and
8 before, Save Chelsea has been joined by a broad
9 coalition of other groups in opposition to this
10 plan. These include the Council of Chelsea Block
11 Associations, the Chelsea Reform Democratic Club,
12 the Greenwich Village Society for Historic
13 Preservation, the Chelsea Coalition on Housing,
14 the Chelsea Village Partnership, the Lower Chelsea
15 Alliance, Friends of the Gibbons Underground
16 Railroad Historic site, the London Terrace Tenants
17 Association, the West Side Neighborhood Alliance,
18 the Greenwich Village Community Task Force, the
19 Victorian Society's Metropolitan Chapter, and the
20 Historic Districts Council. We have shown up in
21 force repeatedly, we have written hundreds of
22 letters and postcards and gathered literally
23 thousands of petitions in opposition to this plan.

24 We respectfully ask that the
25 Subcommittee and the City Council hear our

1
2 collective voices and vote an absolute no to this
3 proposal.

4 Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very
6 much and thank you all the members of this panel.
7 I'm going to have Ann read the next names of the
8 panels, I'm going to be taking a two-minute break,
9 duty calls, and I'll be right back, okay? So you
10 can call the names and just wait for me for two
11 minutes.

12 ANN: Lenora Friedlander, Oliver
13 Greeves [phonetic], Philip Wilson, Keith Rippy,
14 Tom Gray.

15 LENORA FRIEDLANDER: Two of us did.

16 [Crosstalk]

17 LENORA FRIEDLANDER: Just put them
18 right up here, anybody--you guys want water? You
19 want some water?

20 OLIVER GREEVES: No, thanks.

21 LENORA FRIEDLANDER: Did you want
22 some water?

23 LINDA CROSBY: No, thank you.

24 LENORA FRIEDLANDER: Okay.

25 [Off mic]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MALE VOICE: Why are you here?

LENORA FRIEDLANDER: We're in support of the project.

MALE VOICE: Are we in the wrong room?

LENORA FRIEDLANDER: This is Chelsea Market expansion.

MALE VOICE: They told us this was the New York City land dispositions for three buildings.

LENORA FRIEDLANDER: For which three buildings?

MALE VOICE: There's three buildings downtown the City is selling.

LENORA FRIEDLANDER: Maybe it's afterwards, you can check with the Sergeant-of-Arms.

OLIVER GREEVES: Send me that, man.

[background noise]

OLIVER GREEVES: Think I'm playing.

PHILIP WILSON: You ready for them?

OLIVER GREEVES: Yeah, man, ain't nothing to it. I'm a shooter, man, got to shoot when it's time.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PHILIP WILSON: Right.

LENORA FRIEDLANDER: It's been a long morning.

LINDA CROSBY: Oh, my goodness.

[Long pause]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: That's much better, yeah. Gale, you sorting out a problem over there? Okay.

[Pause]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Been drinking tea, a lot of tea, you know, it makes for a need for a break occasionally. Ready? Sorry about that.

FEMALE VOICE: He has a question--

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Whenever you're ready, whoever wants to start first.

LENORA FRIEDLANDER: Great, thank you very much, Chairman--

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

LENORA FRIEDLANDER: --Weprin. My name Lenora Friedlander, I'm the assistant to the president of SEIU Local 32BJ.

As many of you know, we represent 70,000 property service workers in New York, and

1
2 we have some members here today. We are here
3 testifying in support of the Chelsea Market
4 expansion project. And I'd like the 32BJ group to
5 actually stand up for a minute, we're doing this
6 quietly. These are the faces of the security
7 officers, these are the faces of the office
8 cleaners, these are faces of door people and handy
9 people and building superintendents. These are
10 the faces of working New York, and we're here in
11 support of it--thank you guys, thank you very
12 much--we are here in support of this project
13 because the property--the developers made a
14 commitment as part of this project to create good
15 jobs--jobs that provide middle-class wages, that
16 provide health insurance, that provide retirement
17 for workers and property service workers. And too
18 often we are in fights with developers who have
19 walked away from their social contract or social
20 responsibility to the community. This is an
21 opportunity when we are here in support of a
22 project and of a developer who has made a
23 commitment to creating good jobs as part of their--
24 --as part of this project.

25 And, as we all know, the cost of

1
2 living is increasing, that the transportation,
3 that rent is increasing and so it's critical that
4 we support the creation of good jobs that helps
5 create a path to a strong economy, good jobs
6 create strong communities and are part of the
7 economic recovery that we all deserve.

8 So, again, thank you for the time
9 and the opportunity to testify in support of the
10 project.

11 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

12 LENORA FRIEDLANDER: Okay. Go down
13 the line and then we'll come back.

14 OLIVER GREEVES: All right.

15 LENORA FRIEDLANDER: Okay.

16 OLIVER GREEVES: Good morning, my
17 name is Oliver Greeves, I work as a security guard
18 at the Chelsea Market. I'm not a union member,
19 but I'm in the process of becoming one thanks to
20 the Chelsea Market expansion plan.

21 I haven't had quality health
22 insurance since I started working, you know, about
23 eight, nine years. And I know from personal
24 experience that, you know, health care is very
25 expensive. The expansion to Chelsea Market will

1
2 allow for more permanent jobs that not only pay
3 good wages, but, most importantly, in my opinion,
4 provide access to quality and affordable health
5 care.

6 It is these kinds of jobs that
7 working people like future security guards at
8 Chelsea Market need to survive and raise families
9 in the city. The expansion will create the kind
10 of good jobs that this city needs for working and
11 middle-class people to prosper. Please approve
12 this expansion.

13 Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

15 PHILIP WILSON: Good afternoon, my
16 name is Philip Wilson, I'm a security officer at
17 Chelsea Market, and at this time we are now
18 enrolled in 32BJ union, which will provide us with
19 good benefits, health care, good wages, and job
20 security. So I, at this time, here to say we
21 support the expansion of Chelsea Market. Thank
22 you.

23 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

24 LINDA CROSBY: Thank you. Hi,
25 Council, and thank you so much of giving us this

1
2 time to speak out. My name is Linda Crosby, I'm a
3 more than a 10-year resident of the Fulton Houses,
4 and I'm--while it's interesting to hear how so
5 many other people have a lot to say about Fulton
6 Houses and how this Jamestown expansion will
7 affect Fulton Houses, I would just like to say
8 that, as a mother of seven, I have children who,
9 although they are in school and looking forward to
10 college and some of them are adults and some of
11 them are still small and young, we would like
12 jobs, we would like, you know, free airspace and
13 we don't like, you know, millions and millions of
14 people going in one direction and we're going in
15 another.

16 However, if you do approve this
17 last end of this, you know, ULURP process for this
18 development to take place, I would just hope--and
19 we all as a Fulton community would hope and would
20 ask that you hold Jamestown's feet to the fire and
21 make sure that they keep every promise that they
22 have made not only for the Fulton community, but
23 for the Chelsea and village community at large.

24 Thanks so much.

25 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Ms.

1
2 Crosby. Thank you all very much. Want to thank
3 this panel.

4 OLIVER GREEVES: Thank you.

5 [Long pause]

6 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: One second.
7 I'd like to call up the following panel in
8 opposition: Hilda Regier, Andrew Humm, Larry
9 Lippman, Judy Richmeyer--Richheimer, sorry--

10 [Off mic]

11 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Uh-oh. And
12 Franklin Low.

13 [Long pause]

14 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: You were the
15 one, huh?

16 [Long pause]

17 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay. I
18 apologize for messing up those names. Whoever
19 wants to start, please do.

20 [Long pause]

21 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: All right,
22 calm down. You could sit, push the button, make
23 sure the mic's on, and state your name. Take your
24 time, go ahead.

25 ANDREW HUMM: Sure. My name is

1
2 Andy Humm, I'm the president of the London Terrace
3 Tenants Association, lived in Chelsea for 27 years
4 and in the city since '76, so you want to take a
5 look at that picture? Anybody from Jamestown
6 still here? All right.

7 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Yes, there
8 are.

9 ANDREW HUMM: Where are you going
10 to put the construction site, you want to tell us?
11 You didn't tell us during the testimony. What are
12 you going to close off on 9th Avenue?

13 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: All right.

14 ANDREW HUMM: How many lanes of
15 traffic are you going to close up on 9th Avenue
16 and 10th Avenue to build this thing?

17 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Sir, I know
18 you--

19 ANDREW HUMM: [Interposing] It's a
20 question.

21 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: I know you're
22 not--we're not going to be able to have them
23 answer their question--

24 ANDREW HUMM: [Interposing] Well
25 you ought to want to know that answer and you

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

didn't get that answer.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay.

ANDREW HUMM: This is my time to testify.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Yes, sir.

ANDREW HUMM: I don't know how you on the City Council can live with yourselves. How many people here think that Chelsea is not developed enough? That it's not overcrowded right now? No hands--oh, well one person from the High Line thinks it's not developed enough yet. Well I have to live there, I have to live there, and the congestion is terrible, the prices are terrible, the pressure on housing costs and on the cost of just going to the grocery store are terrible at this point, and all you want to do is bring in more rich people to drive it up even more. That is not the purpose of changing the zoning laws.

We need something like a hospital in Chelsea or in the village, that's the kind of thing you change the zoning law to, to benefit the people who live there, not this kind of a project.

I don't know how you live with yourselves, other than these are the developers

1
2 that give the big campaign contributions and you
3 need the union support, but the union people are
4 gone now, but the idea that they were being played
5 like stooges by this union busting company just
6 infuriates me.

7 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Duly noted,
8 thank you.

9 [Applause]

10 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

11 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Who wants to
12 follow that gentleman? Won't call it an act.

13 FRANKLIN LOW: Yes, my name is
14 Franklin Low, and I have a list of reasons--a
15 long-time resident of Chelsea, I have a list of
16 reasons why we should not upzone Chelsea Market.

17 Poor stewardship of taxpayer
18 assets. The West Side Yards, Lower Manhattan
19 redevelopment, and the Roosevelt Island, Cornell
20 University, high-tech project, which are supported
21 by billions of dollars of taxpayer assets will be
22 diminished by the fact that a Jamestown Chelsea
23 Market upzoning may well siphon jobs away from the
24 multibillion-dollar project. For the City
25 Planning Commission to approve and the City

1
2 Council to contemplate approving Jamestown's
3 application is to demonstrate poor stewardship of
4 taxpayer public assets for the principal benefit
5 of a private party. Jamestown does not create or
6 control the jobs they claim may be brought to the
7 area, nor does high-tech have to be in the same
8 building. Jamestown obviously has not heard of
9 telecommuting.

10 Damage to the High Line. The
11 Jamestown upzoning proposal will bring irreparable
12 harm to the High Line in respect to light and
13 openness for which no amount of money is a
14 substitute. As of right, 28-story hotel at 450
15 West 15th Street will serve to amplify this
16 damage. Mr. Phillips, the manager of Jamestown,
17 in public hearings held at Fulton Houses this past
18 spring, stated that tourists from the High Line do
19 not spend much money at the market as they pass
20 through it and that he had no space available at
21 the time to honor the Jamestown commitment to the
22 High Line. Jamestown speaks ill of the High Line
23 and its visitors, but will throw millions of
24 dollars at the High Line in the hope that the city
25 politicians will grant them upzoning.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Zoning should not be for sale. Jamestown, through the promise of money, has very deftly attempted to subvert the planning and zoning process in New York City. The fact that Jamestown is a foreign German-based investment company interfering in New York politics is particularly offensive.

Permanent and irreversible damage to the character of Chelsea. Spurious claims about lack of space, Google donated to the Cornell high-tech center--

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [Interposing] Could you please skip to the end? I know you have a lot more but--

FRANKLIN LOW: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: We have it here but--

FRANKLIN LOW: Very well, I will skip to the end. I will read my last paragraph.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Fine.

FRANKLIN LOW: Hiding under the skirts of affordable housing and jobs, finally even the affordable housing advocates are against the project as it contributes so little to

1
2 affordable housing. I attended the CB 4 vote
3 calling for the contribution by Jamestown of 20--
4 equal to 27% of the projected 300 million project
5 cost towards affordable housing. As of now,
6 Jamestown's contribution will be less than 2% of
7 the projected cost--about 5 million. Jobs and
8 affordable housing in the instance serve only to
9 give political cover to bad decision-making--

10 [Crosstalk]

11 FRANKLIN LOW: --as manifested, as
12 mentioned above, is poor stewardship of public
13 assets. An example of affordable housing--I will
14 skip that. A particular family that I know lives
15 in a proposed supposed affordable housing
16 building, they have a \$3,400 amount two-bedroom
17 apartment, they had to substantiate an income of
18 in excess of \$110,000. One must ask, affordable
19 for whom?

20 If Jamestown were serious and
21 interested in the community, they would not ask
22 for the zoning change. They are only interested
23 in the money and are a duplicitous player. To
24 grant an upzoning would be a breach of public
25 trust.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

FRANKLIN LOW: You're welcome.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

FRANKLIN LOW: I thank you for the time to speak.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Ladies, which-want to go next?

HILDA REGIER: Want to go--

JUDY RICHHEIMER: Okay. Sure. Do I have--

[Pause]

JUDY RICHHEIMER: Hello, I'm Judy Richheimer, executive vice president of the Chelsea Reform Democratic Club, which has stood in long opposition to this rezoning proposal.

Now you've heard how many of us believe that the congestion that this rezoning would bring would increase--be an exponential burden on streets that are already highly congested and it would make a tremendous rent in the fabric of the very history of Chelsea, but I want to put these feelings in a larger context, namely, that of civic virtue.

Now there's no residential

1
2 neighborhood in New York City that yearns for an
3 influx of new towers, however, most of us are
4 realistic and know that growth is inevitable, and
5 even the most ardent preservationist accepts that
6 our streets will not necessarily always look like
7 they did in the day of horses and bayonets.

8 However, we insist that any zoning change be
9 accompanied by planning, planning that's
10 intelligent, farseeing, comprehensive, and, above
11 all, fair.

12 Spearheaded by the redoubtable Ed
13 Kirkland, the idea of allowing communities in New
14 York to have at least a say in planning the future
15 of their own streetscapes was virtually invented
16 in Chelsea. Mr. Kirkland and others worked out a
17 kind of covenant with city government that said,
18 okay, we know that development will take place,
19 but at the same time it must take place within a
20 context of respect for the flavor and character of
21 our neighborhoods. The rezoning of western
22 Chelsea was accomplished with just that spirit of
23 cooperation and compromise, serious compromise on
24 our part.

25 To overturn such a recent agreement

1
2 that was long in the making and, frankly, allow
3 developers to grab a great deal of our air and
4 sky, and also robbed us of several important
5 buildings, including one designed by Ernest Flag,
6 mocks the principle of community-based planning,
7 and that brings us back to civic virtue.

8 The community virtuously took on
9 the burden of new towers, and in return we
10 expected our government to hold up its end of the
11 bargain and to behave with a corresponding sense
12 of virtue. To smash this covenant now between a
13 neighborhood and city government is to replace
14 virtue with cynicism.

15 Please do not break faith with the
16 people of Chelsea.

17 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Ms.
18 Richheimer. Next, please?

19 [Pause]

20 LARRY LIPPMAN: My name is Larry
21 Lippman, I am a member of the Chelsea Coalition on
22 Housing. There are so many reasons not to rezone
23 the Chelsea market and expand this complex. You
24 have heard, and probably read, most of them
25 already. But speaking from the heart, as a

1
2 resident of Chelsea for 30 years, I urge you not
3 to contribute to destroying the character of this
4 historic building--a building which has proven to
5 be a unique example of adaptive reuse.

6 We urge you to listen to the voices
7 of the community--your community, Speaker Quinn--
8 and vote no to this unnecessary proposal.

9 Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you, Mr.
11 Lippman. Last, but not least.

12 HILDA REGIER: Honorable Council
13 Member, I'm Hilda Regier, a resident of Chelsea
14 since 1968, former chair of Community Board 4,
15 former president of the Council of Chelsea Block
16 Associations, currently a board member of Save
17 Chelsea, and of the Metropolitan Chapter of the
18 Victorian Society in America.

19 You have before you a proposal to
20 rezone one city block owned by one financial
21 entity. Doesn't that give you pause? It's spot
22 zoning--never a good policy. It is a request to
23 add to the coffers of one company that is already
24 making a profit on the property. The proposal
25 reeks of greed, not need.

1
2 I'd like to correct something that
3 was said by the Jamestown representative here this
4 morning. The 9th Avenue Fulton Houses are not
5 built as high as she said, they are six stories
6 high, so they're about half as high as the
7 proposed 9th Avenue addition by Jamestown. That's
8 not in my written testimony, but that needs to be
9 noted by the Council.

10 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay. You
11 could speak to them afterwards, she's nodding as
12 well or commenting, so you guys may want to talk
13 about it after.

14 HILDA REGIER: Okay. The Chelsea
15 Market, as built, is iconic, a landmark recognized
16 on the State and National Registers of Historic
17 Places, but not designated as a New York City
18 landmark. Jamestown properties at CB 4 graciously
19 offered to support designation after it builds the
20 two egregious towers it proposes to plop on top of
21 the complex. How likely is designation then?

22 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Just I'll give
23 you a couple of seconds if you got a last second
24 thing.

25 HILDA REGIER: I've got--

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

[Crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay.

HILDA REGIER: This is a bad proposal, surely you can see that; therefore, I ask you to show your intelligence, savvy, and independence and vote no without equivocation to defeat this proposal in its entirety.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you. I want to thank this panel, you all were very heartfelt and that came across very strongly.

I'd like to now call on this panel in favor. I don't know if he's here, but Keith Rippey [phonetic] if he's here, Josh David from Friends of the High Line, Tom Grey, Alan Phillips, Lisa Rodano [phonetic]. Is there anyone else here testifying in favor of the project who hasn't been heard from? Excuse me. Okay.

Well whoever's--I just mentioned who's here, please come on up. I know we lose-- you know, people have other things to do in their lives and I know we lose some people along the way. Really, we try to keep these hearings quickly moving so people could be here. So that five people is down to two I'm afraid, but I'm

1
2 sure it's a good two. So whenever you're ready,
3 Lisa, I guess it is--

4 LISA RODANO: Yes.

5 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: --and please,
6 whenever you're ready.

7 LISA RODANO: Hi, my name is Lisa
8 Rodano, I'm here representing L'Arte del Gelato,
9 and it has been an honor and a pleasure for us to
10 have our flagship gelatiere, our laboratorio, and
11 our offices in the Chelsea Market for the last
12 eight years. I know I'm also speaking for other
13 Chelsea Market artisanal food purveyors who are
14 probably serving lunch right now.

15 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [Interposing]
16 Try not to mention lunch, okay?

17 LISA RODANO: The beautiful
18 renovation of the Nabisco building created
19 opportunity for many artisanal food crafters. The
20 market was in the forefront of New York's food
21 movement and it remains a touchstone location to
22 this day. Over the years, we have seen the
23 neighborhood grow from the heart of the market
24 out. Businesses came, visitors increased, and the
25 whole area was lifted. The market became a must-

1
2 see destination for visitors and a joy to
3 residents.

4 For us, it's really a beautiful
5 thing on a daily basis to participate in something
6 that we know brings happiness and joy to people to
7 share food, to share the seasons, and to share
8 holidays. If you go in the market now, you'll see
9 that every inch of it is decorated for Halloween,
10 you'll see kids running around, everyone having
11 fun. It's pretty rare in the world today to feel
12 like you could be a part of something that's
13 wholesome and good, and we feel very much that way
14 being in the market and selling our gelato.

15 And we feel that Jamestown's
16 expansion will only continue that vitality and
17 that positive direction. We hear that new
18 businesses, many of them in the cutting edge
19 technology sector, will be coming. We think
20 anyone who brings in new thinking and new jobs
21 should be applauded in these difficult times.

22 We also trust Jamestown's sense of
23 aesthetics. Again, I said about the decorations
24 that happen seasonally. The walls are always
25 covered in art, all of the signs for the stores

1
2 are beautifully done--I'm almost done. We know
3 that Jamestown cares about their neighbors and
4 that they've been supporters of the High Line, as
5 well as other local projects and companies.

6 The main thing that we want to say,
7 though, is we feel very beholden and thankful to
8 Jamestown, we respect them tremendously, and we're
9 very grateful that they're a part of making our
10 dream of having an artisanal food company come
11 true in New York with such a difficult place to do
12 that. And we know that with the expansion,
13 they'll be offering that to more small businesses--

14 -

15 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [Interposing]
16 Thank you.

17 LISA RODANO: --and we feel that's
18 a positive--

19 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [Interposing]
20 Thank you very much. Okay. Next, please.

21 JOSHUA DAVID: Thank you, Chair
22 Weprin. I'm Joshua David, I am co-founder of
23 Friends of the High Line and also a 27-year
24 resident of Chelsea. On behalf of all of the
25 Friends of the High Line, I thank the City Council

1
2 for its history of commitment to the High Line's
3 transformation into a treasured public amenity for
4 New York City and our community.

5 Since the project's earliest days,
6 the Council has worked to create a great public
7 space while balancing the needs of many
8 constituencies. Through its leadership in the
9 creation of the Special West Chelsea District, the
10 Council helped create a host of public benefits
11 for our community, including affordable housing,
12 contextual building controls, and support for the
13 arts district, as well as much-needed provisions
14 to support the High Line's adaptive reuse.

15 We support the proposal before you
16 today, as do 1,800 individuals whose signatures
17 are on a petition that had been submitted to you
18 by Chelsea Market. The proposal expands the
19 district by one block to include Chelsea Market
20 and provides a host of benefits, including a
21 dedicated freight elevator, a central back-of-
22 house storage space, and much-needed public
23 restrooms for the High Line's 4 million annual
24 visitors, a half of which come from New York City
25 and the surrounding area.

1
2 It creates a dedicated space for
3 the 450 free and low-cost education and community-
4 based programs the High Line presents each year.
5 Most important, it provides critical capital
6 funding for the City of New York to help meet its
7 obligation to complete long-term repair and
8 maintenance projects on the High Line. These
9 funds, to be paid into a city-controlled High Line
10 Improvement Fund, are critical. Today, the High
11 Line is new and it looks great, but it will need
12 major capital repairs in coming years and if the
13 city does not have the funds to meet its
14 obligations, the High Line could fall into
15 disrepair.

16 Under our license agreement with
17 the City, it is Friends of the High Line's
18 obligation to pay for virtually all park
19 operations through private philanthropic
20 fundraising. Every custodian, gardener,
21 electrician, maintenance technician, greeter,
22 docent, and educator you see on the High Line is
23 paid for this way.

24 [Off mic]

25 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Sir, keep it down, please.

JOSHUA DAVID: It is the City's obligation meanwhile to--I'm almost done--to maintain the High Line bridge structure and to undertake major capital maintenance and replacement projects as needed, but there is no designated budget line to meet the City's obligation, which is why the funding provided in this proposal is so critical to the High Line and its surrounding community.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Please wrap up, yeah.

JOSHUA DAVID: Thank you again for all your work on this proposal. We urge you to vote in favor of it, its success is vitally important to the future sustainability of the High Line.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you both very much, and we thank this panel. I'd like to now call up, I think it's our last panel, it's in opposition: Karen Jacob, Frank Eadie, pronounce that right? Anyone else here to testify in opposition who has not been called? Okay. Come on up. They're here, the two of them are here?

1
2 Yes. Frank, what's your last name, Fadie? Eadie,
3 apologize again. Whenever you're ready, state
4 your name, make your statement.

5 KAREN JACOB: Thank you, my name is
6 Karen Jacob. I am torn between two lovers--

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down,
8 please.

9 KAREN JACOB: I'm going to repeat
10 that. I am--

11 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Go ahead.

12 KAREN JACOB: --I am torn between
13 two lovers. I work with the High Line, I've been
14 working with them since before they opened, and
15 the things that they need are very, very genuine.
16 They need a freight elevator, they need more
17 space, Lord knows they need more bathrooms up
18 there. But not this way and not this project.

19 I've been living in Chelsea since
20 the middle seventies. I've seen it change. When
21 I moved here, people thought I was crazy. It's so
22 wonderful. This project is misguided, wrong for
23 the neighborhood, wrong for Chelsea, and I highly
24 recommend, stress, beg you to turn it down.

25 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.

1
2 Sir, you get to wrap up.

3 FRANK EADIE: Okay. I have lived
4 in Chelsea at 310 West 18th Street for the last 40
5 years, served on Community Board 4 for 20 of those
6 years, and on the Chelsea Planning and
7 Preservation Committee for most of those 20 years.
8 And this project is an exercise in bad faith if
9 there ever was one, and we've seen plenty over
10 those 20 years.

11 The City's refusal to finance the
12 housing that it had promised, more than decades of
13 repeated approvals of upzonings, of projects after
14 project, and repeated failure of project sponsors
15 to fulfill promises to employee and to now to
16 train local residents have created a tremendous
17 cynicism, even desperation, for both middle-class
18 and those that would become middle-class living in
19 Chelsea. Meantime, the City is repeating
20 unfulfilled promises, and this time we're seeing
21 the iconic and most historic and most symbolic
22 building in the entire West Side of Manhattan, and
23 perhaps the most filmed structures in the country.

24 Those buildings have been in
25 hundreds of movies, of music videos, of all kinds

1
2 of creations by students, by professionals, by all
3 kinds of people. It is an icon of the city which
4 we are about to lose. It will not be the same
5 building once these project goes forward. It will
6 not represent what it has, it will not be a place
7 where people can come to see what they've seen in
8 the films or in the ads and everything else that,
9 you know, that Chelsea has come to symbolize.

10 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you,
11 thank you very much.

12 FRANK EADIE: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you both
14 very much. Okay. I want to thank everyone for
15 their cooperation. I know it's been a long day
16 and everyone was on their very best behavior, we
17 kept the outbursts to a minimum, try not to quiet
18 anyone beyond the reasonable nature.

19 So what we're going to do now is
20 we're going to close this hearing and we are going
21 to move to recess this Committee. Over the next
22 few days, we're going to be discussing what we
23 heard here today and what changes can be made and
24 what we might be doing as a Subcommittee. So I
25 thank you all for your participation, for your

1
2
3
4
5
6

cooperation, and I wish you all a good day.

So this hearing is closed and the meeting is now recessed until Thursday at 9:30 in the morning. Thank you. And that'll be at 250 Broadway, 16th floor. Thank you.

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Tammy Wittman, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature *Tammy Wittman*

Date November 9, 2012