CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

-----X

March 28, 2012 Start: 2:36 p.m. Recess: 4:48 p.m.

Council Chambers

City Hall

HELD AT:

BEFORE:

LEROY G. COMRIE, JR. President Pro Tempore

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Speaker Christine C. Quinn Maria del Carmen Arroyo Charles Barron Gale A. Brewer Fernando Cabrera Margaret S. Chin Elizabeth S. Crowley Inez E. Dickens Erik Martin Dilan Daniel Dromm Mathieu Eugene Julissa Ferreras Lewis A. Fidler

Ubiqus 22 Cortlandt Street – Suite 802, New York, NY 10007 Phone: 212-227-7440 * 800-221-7242 * Fax: 212-227-7524

A P P E A R A N C E S

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Helen D. Foster Daniel R. Garodnick James F. Gennaro Vincent J. Gentile Sara M. Gonzalez David Greenfield Daniel J. Halloran III Vincent M. Ignizio Robert Jackson Letitia James Peter A. Koo G. Oliver Koppell Karen Koslowitz Brad S. Lander Jessica S. Lappin Stephen T. Levin Melissa Mark-Viverito Darlene Mealy Rosie Mendez Michael C. nelson James S. Oddo Annabel Palma Domenic M. Recchia, Jr. Diana Reyna Ydanis A. Rodriguez Deborah L. Rose James Sanders, Jr. Larry B. Seabrook Eric A. Ulrich James Vacca Peter F. Vallone, Jr. James G. Van Bramer Albert Vann Mark S. Weprin Jumaane D. Williams Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Claude Trahan Executive Vice President, Gas Operations Con Edison

John Kane III Operating Supervisor, Gas Operations Unit Con Edison

John McDonnell Mechanic B, Gas Operations Unit Con Edison

Michael Santeramo Mechanic A, Gas Operations Unit Con Edison

Michael Cuthbertson Auxiliary Police Captain 26th Precinct Auxiliary Police Force

Chris Yip Police Officer

Reverend Dr. LaKeesha Walrond Executive Pastor First Corinthian Baptist Church

1	STATED MEETING 4
2	SPEAKER QUINN: Okay. The first
3	one led by Council Member Vallone? Oh, there you
4	are. Council Member Vallone and Council Member
5	Halloran. Council Member Halloran and Vallone,
6	actually. We are going to recognize two Con
7	Edison workers and their bravery, so let me give
8	the mic over to Council Member Halloran. And if
9	we could ask Michael Santeramo and John McDonnell
10	and whoever is there with them to come on up to
11	the front, please. Michael and John, where are
12	you?
13	COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Thank
14	you, Madam Speaker. Guys come on up. Come on up.
15	Yes, your family too. Yes, yes, everybody. Come
16	on up. They're very shy. There's a third worker,
17	yes. There's actually three workers, John Kane,
18	John McDonnell and Michael Santeramo.
19	SPEAKER QUINN: Why don't we step
20	up a little bit, folks, and if you can make a
21	little bit of a semicircle behind us.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Madam
23	Speaker, we're very fortunate to have with us the
24	Executive Vice President, Claude Trahan, who is
25	here with us. The president of Con Edison had to

1	STATED MEETING 5
2	leave. He was here earlier, Craig Ivey, but he
3	wanted to make sure that you were aware, he was
4	here, and of course Intergovernmental Relations,
5	Carol Conslato is here, and she's hiding out, and
6	John Banks is here, so. We had the good fortune
7	to have three workers from Con Edison in the Gas
8	Division out in Bayside, and these brave men heard
9	the cries of a young woman who was being mugged at
10	weapon point, and they intervened, came to her
11	rescue, and then chased down the individual who
12	attempted to rob the young lady. The police
13	obviously arrived. And because of the hard work
14	of these three individuals, that woman is safe, is
15	sound, her property is secure, and we owe them a
16	great debt of thanks for their hard work. Thank
17	you very much, guys. I'm going toCouncil Member
18	Vallone, the Chair of Public Safety, who works
19	with me on all of these issues.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you.
21	As Chair of Public Safety, I just want to add my
22	commendation to Council Member Halloran and
23	Speaker Quinn. I've alwaysI've been complaining
24	that our police force has been dwindling over the
25	year, we don't have enough, and always ask the

1	STATED MEETING 6
2	community to get involved, but you guys to took
3	that to a whole other level. I wasn't really
4	talking about this, but I'm verywe're very glad
5	that you did this and stepped in when you sawnot
6	everyone would have done that, and you guys really
7	deserve the praise of this room, and this room
8	represents the entire city, and we thought it was
9	appropriate to bring you down here and really show
10	you on behalf of the entire city that we
11	appreciate what you did on this woman's behalf.
12	Thank you.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: And I
14	guess Con Edison?
15	SPEAKER QUINN: Well, first let's
16	just havewe'll have the Clerk read the
17	proclamation. But I just want to say before we
18	have the Clerk read the proclamation and then we
19	hear from Con Edison and our honorees, I just want
20	to say, wow. Thank you guys. What Peter said is
21	true. We ask the community to get involved, but
22	this is above and beyond. I mean, real examples
23	of heroism. So thank you very, very, very, very
24	much. And if we could ask Mike if you could read
25	the proclamation and then we'll hear from the rep

1	STATED MEETING 7
2	from Con Ed and then from our heroes?
3	THE CLERK: Council City of New
4	York Proclamation. Whereas the Council of the
5	City of New York is proud to honor John Kane III,
6	John McDonnell, and Michael Santeramo for
7	courageously rushing to save the victim of a
8	violent purse snatching in Bayside, Queens; and
9	whereas John Kane III from Centereach on Long
10	Island is a hardworking father of three and an
11	Operating Supervisor for Con Edison's Gas
12	Operations Department, he has been with Con Edison
13	since 1988; and whereas John McDonnell, from
14	Rockaway Beach, Queens, is a Mechanic B for Con
15	Edison's Gas Operations Department, he has been
16	with the company since 2005 and is a fourth
17	generation Con Ed employee; and whereas Michael
18	Santeramo from Valley Stream on Long Island is a
19	Mechanic A in Con Edison's Gas Operations
20	Department, he has been with the company since
21	2007; and whereas on the night of January 25th,
22	2012, these Con Edison workers were working on a
23	gas leak at the corner of 201st Street and 42nd
24	Avenue in Bayside, Queens, when they suddenly
25	heard a young woman screaming nearby. The crew

1	STATED MEETING 8
2	from Con Ed flew into action without considering
3	their own safety and discovered a man violently
4	assaulting a woman in an attempt to steal her
5	purse. She was being punched in the face and
6	bleeding. As the team approached, the suspect
7	wielded a gun at them, barking at them to step
8	back. Clearly outnumbered, the armed assailant
9	then fled by foot. Con Ed's men in blue ran after
10	him, chasing him through a backyard, but despite
11	their determination, the perpetrator escaped their
12	grasp. Nevertheless, the 24-year-old victim was
13	very grateful for the worker's rescue and for
14	staying to help her until the NYPD arrived at the
15	scene. Without their quick response, the incident
16	would have cost the victim much more than her
17	broken tooth. And whereas their heroic
18	intervention serves as an important reminder that
19	each time we recognize our shared responsibility
20	for the safety of our neighborhood and help a
21	stranger in need, we reveal the strength of
22	character that is the mark of great New Yorkers.
23	Now therefore be it known that the Council of the
24	City of New York gratefully honors John Kane III,
25	John McDonnell, and Michael Santeramo, for their

1	STATED MEETING 9
2	outstanding heroism on March 25th, 2012.
3	Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for the entire
4	Council, Daniel J. Halloran, Council Member 19th
5	District, Queens, Peter F. Vallone, Jr., Council
6	Member 22nd District, Queens.
7	[applause]
8	SPEAKER QUINN: Wow, when you hear
9	the full story, it really completely blows you
10	away. So, thank you guys. I shouldn't say blow
11	you away when I'm talking about Con Edison, but
12	you know what I mean. Sorry, John. But next
13	we're going to hear from Claude, who is the Vice
14	President for Gas Operations, and then we'll hear
15	from our heroes. Thank you very much, sir.
16	CLAUDE TRAHAN: Okay, thank you.
17	I'm not going to be long. I just want to say that
18	we at Con Edison are very, very proud of John,
19	John and Mike for their very heroic acts. We
20	applaud you and we support you. Thank you.
21	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very
22	much.
23	JOHN KANE: I want to say thank you
24	to everybody for coming. We would do it, you
25	know, we definitely would do it again for anybody.

1	STATED MEETING 10
2	I definitely am glad to stand up here and
3	represent Con Edison, and we're very proud for the
4	company we work for. Thank you.
5	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. There
6	you go.
7	JOHN MCDONNELL: I second what John
8	says, ditto.
9	SPEAKER QUINN: The true mark of a
10	hero, and I'll tell you, every time there's been a
11	firefighter, police officer, EMS whatever here
12	where they've done the kind of things you guys
13	have done, they never have much to say and just
14	say what you guys said, that's all in a day's
15	work. So, further evidence. So, thank you guys
16	and thank you very much. Bill? Did you get some
17	pictures with her camera? Okay, good. All right.
18	Thanks, John. Oh, nextlet's see. All right.
19	We have two more ceremonials. The next one is
20	going to be led by Council Member Robert Jackson
21	and Assistant Majority Leader Inez Dickens, and
22	honor Auxiliary Police Captain Michael Cuthbertson
23	and the 26th Precinct Auxiliary Police Force for
24	their tremendous service to the NYPD and the
25	community at large. So, if we could ask the

1	STATED MEETING 11
2	Captain and the Officers to make their way up
3	here.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you,
5	Madam Speaker. While the Auxiliary Officers of
6	the 26th Precinct in Harlem come up, you can see
7	why there are so many of them, and the reason why
8	is the 26th Precinct Auxiliary Force is the
9	largest Auxiliary Force of any precinct in the
10	entire country. And under the leadership of its
11	Captain and Commanding Officer, Michael Cumbertson
12	[phonetic] when he moved from the 24th Precinct to
13	the 26th Precinct, he found out there were only
14	eight Auxiliary Officers at that particular time.
15	And in eight years under his leadership, it has
16	from eight to 150 officers, keeping all New York
17	City residents who happen to come visit relatives
18	or walk through the streets of the 26th Precinct,
19	keeping them safe and sound. And when there's
20	parades and there's demonstrations, and when
21	there's other events or when they're just
22	patrolling the 26th Precinct under the leadership
23	of its Commanding Officer, we are so proud of all
24	of these volunteers. They don't get paid; they
25	volunteer. And we thank all of them for providing

1	STATED MEETING 12
2	the safety and security of the people of the 26th
3	Precinct and the entire city, under the leadership
4	of its Captain, who is the Commanding Officer.
5	Inez Dickens and I represent the 26th Precinct,
6	and let me just say that I have two huge housing
7	developments within the confines of the 26th,
8	Grant Houses and Manhattanville Houses, and
9	there's a lot of issues and concerns there. But,
10	in my opinion, if we did not have these fine
11	officers, both women and men, to patrol the
12	streets of the 26th Precinct, it would not be as
13	safe as it is. So, on behalf of myself and Inez
14	Dickens, we thank you, and let me turn the mic
15	over to my colleague, Inez Dickens.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you
17	so much. Captain, you deserve this and more.
18	This Auxiliary Force from the 26 represents the
19	community patrolling the community. And we say
20	thank you, because without you and your
21	leadership, your dedication, your commitment to
22	our community, to the residents, to the tenants,
23	surely there would be other incidents that would
24	be appalling to all of us. So, here at the City
25	Council, we say thank you. You don't hear it

1	STATED MEETING 13
2	often enough because you volunteer. No one forced
3	you to do this, and you're not doing it for money.
4	You're doing it for the love of your community.
5	Thank you, God bless you, and may you always
6	continue to be safe.
7	[applause]
8	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: So, Madam
9	Speaker, may I ask the Clerk to read the
10	proclamation?
11	SPEAKER QUINN: Please.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Here you
13	go.
14	THE CLERK: Council City of New
15	York Proclamation. Whereas the Council of the
16	City of New York is proud to honor Auxiliary
17	Captain Michael Cuthbertson and the 26th Precinct
18	NYPD Auxiliary Police Force for their tremendous
19	service to the NYPD and to the community at large;
20	and whereas the NYPD Auxiliary Police's program
21	for civilian volunteers to assist police in their
22	daily policing duties, these civilian volunteers
23	are fully trained and provide a uniformed presence
24	on the street, thereby significantly deterring
25	crime throughout the five boroughs. These

1	STATED MEETING 14
2	selfless volunteers provide both emergency and
3	non-emergency assistance, such as quality of life
4	complaints as well as security at countless
5	events, including the Harlem Jazz Festival,
6	concerns in Central Park, monthly community board
7	meetings, 4th of July fireworks shows, National
8	Night Out Against Crime, and the New York City
9	Marathon, accident scenes, street fairs, and our
10	City's many annual parades, to cite only a few.
11	They also fulfill these roles in a professional
12	manner, while forging better relationships with
13	the police officers and precinct commanders; and
14	whereas in 2005, after 11 years serving the 24th
15	Precinct Auxiliary Police, Captain Cuthbertson
16	became the Commanding Officer of the 26th Precinct
17	Auxiliary. At the time there were eight active
18	auxiliaries patrolling the streets of Harlem in
19	the 26th Precinct. Quickly recognizing the need
20	for the omnipresence of many officers, he began
21	recruiting eligible volunteers. Over the course
22	of five years, he grew the 26th Precinct Auxiliary
23	from those eight auxiliaries to 150 active
24	members.
25	[applause]

1	STATED MEETING 15
2	THE CLERK: Today they are not only
3	the largest and most decorated Auxiliary in New
4	York, but also across the nation. And whereas
5	Captain Cuthbertson and the 26th Precinct
б	Auxiliary have played a major role in New York
7	City's continued success as the safest big city in
8	America. From June 2011 through November 2011
9	alone, they volunteered more than 20,000 patrol
10	hours. They are among New York City's finest and
11	are worth of the esteem of all New Yorkers. Now
12	therefore be it known that the Council of the City
13	of New York gratefully honors Captain Michael
14	Cuthbertson and the members of the 26th Precinct
15	NYPD Auxiliary Police Force for their outstanding
16	service to all New Yorkers. Christine C. Quinn,
17	Speaker for the entire Council; Robert Jackson,
18	Council Member, 7th District, Manhattan; Inez E.
19	Dickens, Council Member, 9th District, Manhattan.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you.
21	So, Captain, Commanding Officer, please address
22	not only all of my Members and Colleagues of the
23	City Council, but all the visitors here. We thank
24	you and all of the officers, 150 strong from the
25	26th Precinct. Captain.

1	STATED MEETING 16
2	MICHAEL CUTHBERTSON: Thank you
3	very much, Council Members. I just want to say
4	thank you, from the bottom of my heart. I want to
5	thank my guys. This is just a few of many of my
6	officers that patrol the streets of Manhattan, and
7	we love doing it. We'll continue to love doing
8	it, and we thank you, the City of New York,
9	Council Member Robert Jackson, Inez Dickens, thank
10	you very much. We appreciate it.
11	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. Thank
12	you very much, Captain. Thank you all, very, very
13	much. Thank you. And we have one more ceremonial
14	after this. Which, thank you guys. Hey, Lew.
15	All right. The next ceremonial, while folks are
16	exiting, is going to be led by Tish James, in
17	honor of New York City Police Officer Chris Kakit
18	[phonetic] Yip, who gives piano concerns to raise
19	money for neighborhood charities and non-profit
20	groups. It's a great day for the Police
21	Department here today.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Thank you.
23	Hello? How are you? Congratulations. Could my
24	colleagues please join me in honor of Officer Yip?
25	Today this City proclamation is being awarded to

1	STATED MEETING 17
2	an individual who has served the Great City of New
3	York in more ways than one. He is a leading
4	example of what one can do for their community.
5	Chris Kakit Yip came to New York from Hong Kong
6	with his parents at the age of ten, where after
7	pursuing an education he earned a teaching
8	certificate and a bachelor's degree in linguistics
9	from SUNY Stony Brook. He later decided to become
10	part of the New York's Finest and serve in the
11	NYPD in both the 75th Precinct and the 88th
12	Precinctthat is part of my Council District.
13	And at present in the Community Affairs Bureau,
14	Officer Yip, he seeks out new challenges. He
15	began to play the piano, a talent he decided to
16	share with the Fort Greene and Clinton Hill
17	community. Officer Yip keeps his ideal of giving
18	back to the community first and foremost. He may
19	be the only police officer on the force to
20	regularly host benefit concerns for his local
21	neighborhood charities, giving back all proceeds
22	from his ticket sales to non-profit organizations.
23	For the performance in February 2011, Officer Yip
24	donated half of the ticket proceeds to the
25	Chinese-American Planning Council. Yay.

1	STATED MEETING 18
2	[applause]
3	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: And the
4	other half to the Brooklyn Music School in Fort
5	Greene, for children who unfortunately are
б	indigent and their families cannot afford to pay
7	the tuition. Most recently, for the holiday
8	benefit, of which I attended, in December 2011 at
9	the Brooklyn Music School, Officer Yip's
10	performance was dedicated to supporting the Auburn
11	Family Shelter, where the vast majority of the
12	children are homeless. At that time Officer Yip
13	told me that no one has ever celebrated him, no
14	one from NYPD has ever
15	SPEAKER QUINN: [Interposing] Can
16	we get quiet? Because I just want to make sure
17	everybody hears this extraordinary story of
18	service above and beyond that Tish is telling us,
19	so.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Thank you.
21	Thank you. Officer Yip dedicated all of the
22	proceeds from his performance during the holiday
23	to homeless children in Fort Greene. Some of the
24	poorest children in the City of New York. In
25	fact, the most recent census indicated that part

1	STATED MEETING 19
2	of my District is the poorest census track in the
3	City, and Officer Yip decided to give back
4	proceeds to that organization. He indicated to me
5	that he has never ever been saluted or celebrated
6	by anyone from NYPD, and so I thought that it
7	would not be robbery that all of us could come
8	together to honor this fine man that serves our
9	community. The work done by Officer Yip serves as
10	a true illustration on how immigration should be
11	seen as a good thing, and how we should continue
12	to allow New York in being a pro-immigration
13	state. Through the arts he has been able to serve
14	a community full of diversity and find a common
15	ground which is shared by everyone. I decided to
16	honor this great man because I saw what he could
17	do. He not only patrols our streets, but during
18	his own time he decides to give back. Not to his
19	community, but to a community which is full of
20	diversity. And today, Officer Yip, I say to you
21	on behalf of the residents of my District and all
22	citizens throughout the City of New York, we
23	congratulate you and we say thank you.
24	[applause]
25	SPEAKER QUINN: I just want to echo

1	STATED MEETING 20
2	everything Tish has said. You know, being a
3	Police Officer is often long, hard days of work,
4	very grueling on your feet, constantly having to
5	have your senses about you, and you would beno
6	one could blame you if you decided every second
7	you weren't working you were going to relax, be
8	with your family, have fun. And instead that
9	you're drawn to take one of your god given talents
10	and give it back to the City you serve is just
11	further example of whathow lucky we all are that
12	you're in this City and you're part of the NYPD
13	and really why you are one of New York's finest.
14	Finest of the finest. So, thank you, and let me
15	give you the mic. Tish will hold the proc.
16	CHRIS YIP: Okay. Thank you very
17	much, everybody. Thank you very much. It is
18	always my interest to help people anyway, and
19	since I was a little, I enjoyed playing the piano
20	very, very much. It's one of my passions. I can
21	easily add the two together and do something to
22	the community, which is hold benefit shows. In
23	the past, Councilwoman James already said, that I
24	already had shows. And actually this May at the
25	music school, Brooklyn Music School, dedicated to

1	STATED MEETING 21
2	the school for the Centennial Celebration, and a
3	Mother's Day tribute. In the future I plan on
4	having more shows, of course, to benefit other
5	agencies. I'd like to choose a food shelter maybe
6	in the future, whatever it is I will choose from
7	talking to other people, learning from different
8	people with different needs, and hopefully I can
9	help them out even further. Thank you.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Thank you.
11	[applause]
12	SPEAKER QUINN: And I forgot, I
13	jumped ahead of the order. But if the Clerk could
14	please read the proclamation? I was just so
15	excited by
16	THE CLERK: Council City of New
17	York Proclamation. The Council of the City of New
18	York is proud to honor New York City Police
19	Officer Chris Kakit Yip, for his outstanding
20	service to all New Yorkers; and whereas at the age
21	of ten, Officer Yip came with his parents from
22	Hong Kong to New York, where they made a new home
23	in Queens. After earning his bachelor degree in
24	linguistics and his teaching certificate from SUNY
25	Stony Brook, he worked for several years as a

1	STATED MEETING 22
2	teacher and youth counselor for the Chinese-
3	American Planning Council, a community-based
4	organization which encourages young people to take
5	an active role in the community. His experiences
6	there showed him the tremendously positive impact
7	that such institutions have, particularly in
8	Manhattan's Chinatown and in other locations in
9	Queens and Brooklyn, and instilled in him a
10	commitment to supporting such vital organizations
11	in the future, and whereas after earlier
12	assignments proudly serving Brooklyn's 75th and
13	88th Precincts, Officer Yip is now a part of the
14	Community Affairs Bureau. In 2007, during his
15	tenure at the 88th Precinct, he became acquainted
16	with the Brooklyn Music School and began to take
17	piano lessons there with the renown Ukrainian
18	pianist, Valentina Nazarenko. With consistent
19	practice he honed his skills to such an impressive
20	degree that his fellow officers nicknamed him
21	Yiperace. And whereas, Officer Yip is the only
22	known police officer on the force to regularly
23	host benefit concerns for local neighborhood
24	charities, giving back all proceeds from his
25	ticket sales to non-profit organizations. For his

1	STATED MEETING 23
2	performance in February 2011, he donated half of
3	all ticket proceeds to the Chinese-American
4	Planning Council, and the other half to the non-
5	profit Brooklyn Music School. His December 2011
6	Holiday concert at the Brooklyn Music School was
7	dedicated to supporting the Auburn Family Shelter.
8	This year, Officer Yip plans to continue holding
9	more performances to raise funds for non-profit
10	organizations, as well as provide his audience
11	with the opportunity to enjoy good music while
12	supporting important organizations. Now therefore
13	be it known that the Council of the City of New
14	York gratefully honors Chris Kakit Yip, for his
15	outstanding service and contributions to the
16	community. Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for the
17	entire Council; Letitia James, Council Member,
18	25th District, Brooklyn.
19	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, and
20	Officer, thank you very, very much. And Tish,
21	thank you for bringing Officer Yip to our
22	attention. So, that concludes our ceremonials for
23	the day.
24	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and
25	gentlemen, can I have your attention please? At

1	STATED MEETING 24
2	this time, please place all cell phones and pagers
3	to vibrate. All non-council employees, please
4	leave the main floor of the chambers. For those
5	of you who are sitting up in the balcony, if you
6	have a sign, you can hold it chest high. No
7	higher than that. Thank you.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Pledge of
9	allegiance. All rise.
10	UNISON: I pledge allegiance to the
11	flag of the United States of America, and to the
12	republic for which it stands, one nation, under
13	God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for
14	all.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Roll call.
16	THE CLERK: Arroyo.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.
18	THE CLERK: Barron.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Here.
20	THE CLERK: Brewer.
21	[pause]
22	THE CLERK: Cabrera.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.
24	THE CLERK: Chin.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

1	STATED MEETING	25
2	THE CLERK: Comrie.	
3	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Here.	
4	THE CLERK: Crowley.	
5	[pause]	
6	THE CLERK: Dickens.	
7	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.	
8	THE CLERK: Dilan.	
9	[pause]	
10	THE CLERK: Dromm.	
11	COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.	
12	THE CLERK: Eugene.	
13	COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.	
14	THE CLERK: Ferreras.	
15	[pause]	
16	THE CLERK: Fidler.	
17	COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Here.	
18	THE CLERK: Foster.	
19	[pause]	
20	THE CLERK: Garodnick.	
21	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.	
22	THE CLERK: Gennaro.	
23	COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here.	
24	THE CLERK: Gentile.	
25	[pause]	

1	STATED MEETING	26
2	THE CLERK: Gonzalez.	
3	COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Here.	
4	THE CLERK: Greenfield.	
5	[pause]	
б	THE CLERK: Halloran.	
7	COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Here.	
8	THE CLERK: Ignizio.	
9	[pause]	
10	THE CLERK: Jackson.	
11	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Here.	
12	THE CLERK: James.	
13	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Here.	
14	THE CLERK: Koo.	
15	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.	
16	THE CLERK: Koppell.	
17	COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Here.	
18	THE CLERK: Koslowitz.	
19	COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.	
20	THE CLERK: Lander.	
21	COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.	
22	THE CLERK: Lappin.	
23	COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Here.	
24	THE CLERK: Levin.	
25	[pause]	

1	STATED MEETING 27
2	THE CLERK: Mark-Viverito.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:
4	Here.
5	THE CLERK: Mealy.
6	[pause]
7	THE CLERK: Mendez.
8	[pause]
9	THE CLERK: Nelson.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Here.
11	THE CLERK: Palma.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.
13	THE CLERK: Recchia.
14	[pause]
15	THE CLERK: Reyna.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Here.
17	THE CLERK: Rodriguez.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.
19	THE CLERK: Rose.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.
21	THE CLERK: Sanders.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Present.
23	THE CLERK: Seabrook.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Here.
25	THE CLERK: Ulrich.

1	STATED MEETING	28
2	[pause]	
3	THE CLERK: Vacca.	
4	[pause]	
5	THE CLERK: Vallone.	
6	COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.	
7	THE CLERK: Van Bramer.	
8	COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.	
9	THE CLERK: Vann.	
10	COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Here.	
11	THE CLERK: Weprin.	
12	COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Here.	
13	THE CLERK: Mealy.	
14	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present.	
15	THE CLERK: Williams.	
16	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.	
17	THE CLERK: Wills.	
18	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Here.	
19	THE CLERK: Oddo.	
20	[pause]	
21	THE CLERK: Greenfield.	
22	COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.	
23	THE CLERK: Ulrich.	
24	COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.	
25	THE CLERK: Ignizio.	

1	STATED MEETING 29
2	COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Here.
3	THE CLERK: Oddo.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Here.
5	THE CLERK: Rivera.
6	[pause]
7	THE CLERK: Speaker Quinn.
8	SPEAKER QUINN: Here.
9	THE CLERK: We have a quorum.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay. All
11	rise for the invocation, which will be delivered
12	by the Reverend Dr. LaKeesha Walrond, Executive
13	Pastor, First Corinthian Baptist Church,
14	Manhattan.
15	LaKEESHA WALROND: Let us pray.
16	Gracious God, we come to you with grateful hearts.
17	We're so thankful for your presence in this place
18	today. We thank you for your never ending love,
19	and how you continue to keep us. Because of you,
20	and in spite of us. We thank you that as we
21	engage in this conversation, that you will lead us
22	in a way that our hearts and mind will be focused
23	on what's good and what's right and what's best.
24	We pray that you remind us that although we are
25	chosen for greatness, we are also called to serve.

1	STATED MEETING 30
2	And in the spirit of service, that we've come that
3	we might live lives that you've created us to
4	live, that we might love beyond the limits of our
5	own prejudices, and that we might serve
6	graciously, with dignity and with honor. We love
7	you, God, and we lift this prayer in your holy
8	name, and we say together, Amen.
9	UNISON: Amen.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council
11	Member Dickens? Motion to spread the record by
12	Council Member Dickens.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: I am
14	pleased that this esteemed member of the Harlem
15	Community, Reverend Dr. LaKeesha Walrond, the
16	Executive Pastor and First Lady of First
17	Corinthian Baptist Church, located at 116th and
18	Adam Clayton Powell Boulevard, has given our
19	invocation today. First Corinthian, or FCBC, as
20	their 6,000 parishioners affectionately call it,
21	is Harlem's beacon for spiritual guidance and
22	community service. Dr. Walrond oversees more than
23	20 ministries designed to engage congregants and
24	the community with programs such as Healed
25	[phonetic], helping a race age through love,

1	STATED MEETING 31
2	education, and deliverance; and their enormous
3	food pantry addresses not only Harlem's needs, but
4	the entire city, for no one is turned away.
5	Furthermore, they have a thriving youth ministry
6	that was critical to the fight to save the middle
7	school at Wadleigh Secondary School for the
8	Performing and Visual Arts. I want to make note
9	of the work that Dr. Walrond and her husband,
10	Pastor Michael Walrond, is doing with our young
11	people. I am motivated and happy when I come to
12	their church that is overflowing with positive,
13	inspirational energy for our young people. And
14	boy, can they sing. I am thrilled that Reverend
15	Dr. LaKeesha Walrond is giving today's invocation.
16	Motion to spread the invocation in full upon the
17	record.
18	SPEAKER QUINN: If I could ask my
19	colleagues to please rise again.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: All rise.
21	SPEAKER QUINN: On February 26th,
22	2012, Trayvon Martin of Miami, Florida, an unarmed
23	high school student visiting his father's
24	fiancée's house in Sanford, Florida, was killed
25	while walking from a convenience store carrying a

32 1 STATED MEETING bag of Skittles and Snapple. Trayvon was engaging 2 in the most innocent of high school acts. 3 He was going to see friends and family to watch 4 5 basketball. He was by all accounts doing 6 absolutely nothing wrong. Trayvon had hopes of 7 pursuing a career in aviation mechanics, but his 8 life was mercilessly cut short by a self-styled 9 vigilante, who clearly disregarded the explicit instructions of the 911 operator, who told him not 10 11 to engage, to stand down, not to take any action. 12 This vigilante, Mr. Zimmerman, was carrying a gun. 13 There was no need to be carrying a gun in a gated 14 community as he did his night patrol, or whatever 15 he was doing. That individual has remained free, 16 carrying a gun for over a month. So, we are here today following the passage of resolution on this 17 18 matter, following a press conference earlier 19 today, to first and foremost mark the life that 20 was cut short of Trayvon Martin, to offer our 21 deepest sympathies to his mother, Sabrina, and his 22 father, Tracy, who have acted with such tremendous 23 grace and dignity in the wake of the most 24 horrible, horrible of tragedies. But in addition 25 to marking the loss of this important life, in

1	STATED MEETING 33
2	addition to marking the loss of what Trayvon might
3	have brought this country and this world, and in
4	addition to sending our deepest sympathy to his
5	family, we also stand in this moment of silence in
6	outrage over this murder, in outrage over the fact
7	that there has been no real investigation, in
8	outrage over the fact that the police seem to have
9	turned a blind eye and a deaf ear to what happened
10	on February 26th, and in support of the Federal
11	Department of Justice effort to bring justice in
12	this case. I'm next going to call on Council
13	Members Melissa Mark-Viverito and Tish James. I
14	want to thank them for the resolution that they
15	sponsored, and the press conference and hoodie
16	event that they have organized. I also want to
17	take a moment to thank Chair Debbie Rose of the
18	Civil Rights Committee who moved very quickly to
19	hold an emergency hearing today. Let me pass the
20	mic over to Melissa. Robert, hand that to her.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:
22	Thank you, Madam Speaker. And I think a lot has
23	been said today just through this action, and I
24	really want to thank all the Council Members, all
25	the staff, everyone that has been supportive.

1	STATED MEETING 34
2	It's a very moving moment. It was such a tragedy,
3	what has happened to Trayvon, and the continued
4	tragedy that is being inflicted upon this family
5	when justice is not served. So, I'm glad that
6	today we are taking this action, but we're also
7	having this resolution that sends a strong message
8	from New York City and this Council, on us calling
9	for justice in this case, supporting the
10	Department of Justice investigation. But deeper
11	than that, just having us take a moment to reflect
12	and look at the societal prejudices and racism
13	that exist that continue to, unfortunately, have
14	events and tragedies like happened to Trayvon
15	happen in different communities across this
16	country, even in our own backyard. So, I am very
17	touched and moved and thank everyone for the
18	support, and hoping that the killer will be
19	brought to justice, and that as a nation we can
20	strive to better understand and overcome the
21	prejudices that led to Trayvon's death, and have
22	contributed to the death of so many others.
23	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Council
24	Member. And let me next call on Council Member
25	Tish James, and then the Chair of the Civil Rights

1	STATED MEETING 35
2	Committee, Debbie Rose.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: This simple
4	article of clothing has been transformed to a
5	powerful symbol of protest, a protest symbolizing
6	our call and demand for justice. Today I am
7	Trayvon. I am not suspicious. The tragic murder
8	of Trayvon Martin has struck a chord with many
9	Americans, including myself. I thank the diverse
10	coalition of members who stood with us today,
11	recognizing the humanity of all of God's people.
12	And here in New York City, we are telling our
13	young Black men and Latino men that they should
14	not have to be subjected to stop, question, and
15	frisk, without reason; that an institutional
16	change needs to be made, and it needs to be made
17	in this City and in all of our hearts. But on a
18	rainy evening in Florida, a young Black man was
19	stalked, confronted, and murdered without reason,
20	by an individual affiliated with no law
21	enforcement agency. And today the man who pulled
22	the trigger has walked free for over a month,
23	despite overwhelming evidence that implicates him.
24	I'm tired of attending the funerals of young Black
25	and Latino men. I am tired of consoling and

1	STATED MEETING 36
2	holding their mothers. I am tired of being
3	confronted simply for speaking out with Police
4	records and school records and blurry pictures on
5	social networking websites of what someone thinks
6	is an intimidating or suspicious Black or Latino
7	man, of a narrative that chews on every mistake
8	that a person has ever made in their life, as if
9	any of this makes a child's death less tragic, or
10	their life less valuable. The demonization and
11	the stereotyping of Black and Latino men of color
12	must stop. The presumption that someone is guilty
13	of a crime simply because of the way that they
14	look must stop, both on an institutional and
15	social level. We cannot allow what happened to
16	Trayvon Martin to ever happen to another child. I
17	thank all of you here today, for wearing your
18	hoodies, drinking your iced tea, and eating your
19	Skittles.
20	SPEAKER QUINN: Chair Rose?
21	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I'd like to
22	thank the Speaker for her leadership and moving so
23	quickly to bring this to the floor, and for
24	Council Members Mark-Viverito and Tish James for
25	recognizing that a unified voice needed to be
1	STATED MEETING 37
----	--
2	heard. You know, wearing a hoodie should not be a
3	death sentence. We're standing here today in
4	solidarity with all of the Trayvons, who have been
5	cut down in their prime solely because of how they
6	look and what they wear. The choice of clothing
7	that one chooses to wear should not relegate them
8	to unwarranted search, negative profiling, or the
9	most tragic of outcomes, death. All people of
10	good conscience and a sense of justice must stand
11	to ensure that this type of vigilante justice is
12	stopped now. And we must decriminalize walking
13	while Black. Thank you.
14	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. May
15	Trayvon rest in peace.
16	[pause]
17	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. And
18	that concludes our moments of silence for today.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Adoption of
20	the minutes. Council Member Reyna?
21	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Motion to
22	[off mic]
23	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Message and
24	papers from the Mayor?
25	THE CLERK: None.

1	STATED MEETING	38
2	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:	
3	Communication from city, county, and borough	
4	offices?	
5	THE CLERK: Preconsidered M 771	
6	submitted under the name of Michelle de la Uz,	
7	City Planning Commission.	
8	SPEAKER QUINN: Rules, privileges	
9	and elections.	
10	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Petitions	
11	and Communications?	
12	THE CLERK: None.	
13	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Land Use	
14	call-ups?	
15	THE CLERK: None.	
16	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:	
17	Communication from the Speaker. Quiet, please.	
18	Keep it down, please.	
19	SPEAKER QUINN: We're voting on	
20	numerous pieces of important legislation and Land	
21	Use actions today, the first being Intro 18-A,	
22	which is passed out of the Finance Committee. It	
23	deals with prevailing wages. I want to thank	
24	Chair Recchia for his work on this piece of	
25	legislation, and Council Member Melissa Mark-	

1	STATED MEETING 39
2	Viverito, the lead sponsor. I want to thank the
3	staff who have worked very, very long and hard on
4	this bill, particularly the Counsel to the Finance
5	Committee, Tanisha Edwards. I also want to thank
6	Ray Majewski, and Emer Edev, and everyone else in
7	the Economists team in Finance. I want to thank
8	Preston Niblack and Jeff Rodus, as well as Rob
9	Newman and Chuck Mara and members of the Speaker's
10	Staff who worked on 18-A. 18-A quite simply says
11	that when the City gives significant subsidies\$1
12	million or more in economic development projects
13	or rents a significant portion, majority
14	basically, of a building, when that much City
15	taxpayer money is going into these projects, into
16	these buildings, it only makes sense that there
17	should be a requirement about fair pay for the
18	building workers who are being paid through the
19	subsidy or through the rental payment. In our
20	building service industry, the standard wage is
21	prevailing wage. The good news is, a majority of
22	these workers are already making the prevailing
23	wage. The bad news is, if we don't take this
24	action, you'll see an outlier part of the industry
25	potentially begin to destabilize the entire

1	STATED MEETING 40
2	industry, and create a reverse domino effect that
3	would turn wages down, not up. The last thing we
4	want taxpayer dollars to do is be moving wages in
5	the wrong direction. So, I want to thank everyone
6	who worked very long and hard on this bill to make
7	sure that we got the final version just right, so
8	that we can confidently say it is a bill that will
9	not decrease job growth. It is not a bill that
10	will cost us jobs, but in fact a bill that will
11	stabilize an important sector of our economy
12	building service workersa part of our economy
13	that is often an entry-level for new immigrants in
14	our city, and help stabilize that sector and raise
15	wages for those workers. Let me first call on
16	Chair Recchia and then Melissa Mark-Viverito.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Thank you,
18	Madam Speaker. First, I'd like to thank Speaker
19	Quinn for her leadership and support of this great
20	legislation the sponsor of this bill, Councilwoman
21	Melissa Mark-Viverito, and the Finance staff who
22	worked around the clock under the guidance of
23	Preston Niblack, Jeffry Rodus, Ray Majewski, and
24	Emrani Bave [phonetic], Antonio Brito and the rest
25	of my Finance Staff. But I have to give a

1	STATED MEETING 41
2	personal shout out to my outstanding attorney,
3	Tanisha Edwards. Words cannot say the hard work
4	she put in and the dedication she had to making
5	sure that this bill got accomplished. About two
6	years ago the Finance Committee had its first
7	hearing on the Prevailing Wage Bill. Speaker
8	Quinn, the administration, my Finance staff and I,
9	as well as 32 BJ and REBNY, worked together to
10	carve out a bill that is balanced, fair, and one
11	we can be proud of. It is a bill that provided
12	increased wages to building service workers
13	without causing damage to the financial health of
14	our city. Fair and appropriate wages should be
15	expected in a city as great as New York. It sends
16	a message that New York City is looking out for
17	its middle class, and taking steps to ensure a
18	full economic recovery, and to secure a stable
19	financial footing for the future. Thank you.
20	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Domenic.
21	Melissa?
22	COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:
23	Thank you, Madam Chair. And I think what's been
24	said by you and by Domenic in terms of, like, the
25	essence of the bill really summarizes it, so I

1	STATED MEETING 42
2	don't want to go too much into it. But just to
3	say that as a promoter of economic development,
4	the City commits significant resources including
5	millions of dollars in subsidies and incentives
6	for development projects across the city. And as
7	a tenant, the City spends millions of tax dollars
8	each year leasing spaces for City agencies from
9	private landlords. So the bill we're voting on
10	today stems from the Council's concern that many
11	individuals benefit tremendously from profitable
12	city leases or generous economic development
13	financial incentives. These people are very
14	fortunate. However, there are some that do not
15	ensure that the building service employees that
16	they employ or use receive the prevailing wage,
17	and that's what we seek to do with this bill.
18	Because of the Council's work, building service
19	workers affected by this legislation will now see
20	a 35% to 45% increase in their hourly wages. And
21	it's no windfall even at that. The average
22	cleaner will now make \$22.65 an hour, plus \$8.76
23	in benefits. And for security guards, they'll
24	make an average of \$14.35, plus \$4.65 in benefits.
25	This legislation makes a difference that building

1	STATED MEETING 43
2	service workers and their families will be able to
3	see and feel, and will make a tremendous impact on
4	the lives of many New Yorkers who are in search of
5	employment opportunities that will serve as a
6	vehicle to a middle class standard of living. Our
7	economic development policies have to be rooted in
8	a desire not only to benefit developers and
9	business owners, but to create as many good
10	quality, family-sustaining jobs as possible. And
11	this legislation moves us further in that
12	direction, and I'm proud to be a sponsor of this
13	bill, the prime sponsor. But also as the Speaker
14	said, and Domenic, it's been a two-year process.
15	It's been very thoughtful, very deliberate, to
16	take into account the concerns that had been
17	raised. So that has to be taken into account.
18	And obviously all the staff that worked so
19	incredibly hard on this, Preston Niblack, Tanisha
20	Edwards, Ray Majewski, Emer Edev, Paul Sturm and
21	Anthony Brito from Finance Division. 32 BJ
22	clearly, and REBNY, and also in particular to the
23	Speaker, for her leadership on this, and really
24	providing great support for the passage of this
25	bill. It's a proud day for New York City in that

44 1 STATED MEETING we pass this bill, and once it goes into effect, 2 and we are a better city for it. Thank you very 3 4 much. 5 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Melissa. 6 Next let me speak about the Land Use items that we 7 are passing today. We'll be voting today on a 8 rezoning for the West Village. I want to thank 9 Christian Hylton, Danielle DeCerbo, Chuck Meara, Wayne Kawadler, Allie Nudelman from my District 10 11 Office, and my District Office Chief of Staff 12 Melanie La Rocca, and all of the other staff who 13 worked on this rezoning. I want to thank the 14 Chair of our Land Use Committee, Leroy Comrie, and 15 the Subcommittee for Zoning Chair, Council Member 16 Mark Weprin. This rezoning, which deals with the 17 property that was once the St. Vincent Hospital, 18 will not bring us back the full service hospital 19 that we all want in the village. We will continue 20 that fight to bring back the hospital. But what 21 this rezoning as reworked by the Council will do 22 is make sure we have a 24-hour healthcare facility 23 there. It will make sure--24 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: 25 [Interposing] Quiet, please. We will not tolerate

1	STATED MEETING 45
2	talking.
3	SPEAKER QUINN: Through the
4	Council's action, this rezoning, in addition to
5	the healthcare facility, is responsive to
6	community concerns. It has fewer apartments than
7	the original proposal, a demand of the community.
8	It has fewer parking spots than the original
9	proposal, a demand of the community. The Reiss
10	Building on 12th Street, which was part of the old
11	St. Vincent's psychiatric facility will not be
12	torn down, an important part of preserving the
13	historic integrity of that block, and also
14	minimizing construction disruption in the village.
15	We also will have very specific restrictions on
16	the commercial space on 7th Avenue and 12th
17	Street, as well as restrictions on the signage
18	that can be used there, to keep in historic
19	context. Also, as part of this overall plan,
20	there will be a significant contribution from the
21	Rudin Organization, the developers, to what was
22	the Foundling Hospital for Orphan Children on 6th
23	Avenue, to convert that into a school. There will
24	also be contributions to art education at PS 3 and
25	PS 41, and most significantly, not in the zoning

1	STATED MEETING 46
2	actions we will be taking, but as part of this
3	overall action, we were able to get the State of
4	New York to reduce the price of the 75 Morton
5	Street building they own in Greenwich Village, and
6	we were able to get the Department of Education to
7	purchase that seven-story building, which will now
8	become a school or schools desperately needed in
9	Greenwich Village. So, I want to thank everyone
10	on the staff and everyone in Land Use who worked
11	so hard to get this proposal to be responsive to
12	the needs and demands that were articulated by the
13	Greenwich Village community. And I assure all of
14	my colleagues that just as we need to in the
15	Rockaways, we will continue the struggle in West
16	Village to bring back a full-service inpatient
17	hospital. Let me next call on the Chair of our
18	Land Use Committee, Leroy Comrie. And then the
19	Chair of our Subcommittee, Mark Weprin.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I want to
21	thank Speaker Quinn and her staff and all of the
22	people that were involved in this project. As I
23	said in the Committee meeting when
24	SPEAKER QUINN: [Interposing] Can
25	we get quiet for the Chair?

1	STATED MEETING 47
2	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: As I said
3	in the Committee meeting that when you have a
4	project such as the size of this magnitude with
5	this impact, to have a completed project, there's
6	no one that's satisfied, then you've come to an
7	agreement that at least people have had the
8	opportunity to be heard. We endeavored. I want
9	to congratulate Council Member Mark Weprin, who
10	ran a great committee meeting to make sure that
11	anyone that wanted to speak, any issue they wanted
12	to be vetted was allowed to be vetted. I want to
13	congratulate all of the people that had an
14	opportunity to speak on this project at that time.
15	We have to remember that as we move forward, we
16	are suffering a crisis in hospital and medical
17	facilities in this country. Right now, as we are
18	dealing with the issues at Peninsula Hospital in
19	the Rockaways and in Queens where we suffered four
20	closings of hospitals since 2008, we have a real
21	problem with trying to maintain hospitals that are
22	doing indigent services. We have a real problem
23	with trying to find a way to fund them and finance
24	them. The Rudins tried to do everything they
25	could to find a provider that would want to

1	STATED MEETING 48
2	continue that, and they've come up with an option
3	that they thought would be the most viable and
4	actually innovated. We have to work with the
5	community. The project has been reduced
6	significantly from its original concept. The
7	project has been amended to allow for community
8	input and community input on the park, which is a
9	historical site for many issues that happened
10	around making sure that AIDS and the people that
11	were dealing with AIDS were treated with dignity
12	and respect. There was a lot of work that went
13	into developing this project. There was a lot of
14	work that was developed in trying to meet the
15	needs of the community and move forward. I want
16	to urge all my members to vote Aye on this
17	project. Again, and congratulate to all of those
18	whoplease be quiet. And I want to congratulate
19	all of those people who worked for so many hours
20	to try to get this to where it is today.
21	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Chair
22	Comrie. Chair Weprin?
23	COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Thank you,
24	Madam Speaker. Just briefly. You know, I know
25	that there are people who are here and are upset

1	STATED MEETING 49
2	about some of the aspects of their not being a
3	full service hospital. We would have liked
4	nothing more than to put a full service hospital
5	somewhere in the area. Unfortunately, as Council
6	Member Comrie mentioned, Queens we've lost four
7	hospitals, and there's nobody there ready to build
8	them. We want hospitals too. Speaker Quinn would
9	love a hospital there, but unfortunately we didn't
10	have a magic wand we could wave to make a hospital
11	appear, and the issues that were brought to us by
12	the community and the ones that were before us at
13	the hearing, we tried to address. A lot of
14	community concerns; the speaker mentioned a lot of
15	the concessions that were made by the Rudins, her
16	fighting to get us a piece of land to have a new
17	school on Morton Street, her putting a park
18	together that's going to address a lot of the
19	needs of the community, and North Shore LIJ
20	putting an emergency care facility on the site,
21	across the street, to help deal with many of the
22	concerns of people who need medical care there.
23	Obviously it's not everything we would want, but
24	again, we can't make things happen. And those who
25	said, you know, you have to oppose this; we oppose

1	STATED MEETING 50
2	this measure, it doesn't happen, then there's no
3	emergency care facility and you still have an
4	empty building there with no medical services.
5	So, I can't argue with the passion of the people
6	who are upset about not having a hospital. I
7	agree with them. But that's not what is before us
8	here today. And Speaker Quinn and the staff and
9	the Committee really tried to address a lot of the
10	concerns of the community, the quality of life
11	concerns and other concerns that is going to try
12	to make this project work and work well for the
13	community. Thank you very much.
14	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Chair
15	Weprin. I also want to thank Community Board 2
16	for their work on this project, and the other
17	local elected officials, Borough President Scott
18	Stringer, Assembly Member Deborah Glick, State
19	Senator Tom Duane, and Assembly Member Dick
20	Gottfried. Let me also now move on to a number of
21	bills we are voting on and vetos we are overriding
22	that come out of the Transportation Committee.
23	Let me start by thanking Lyle Frank and Molly
24	Murphy, and Jarret Hova, and Laura Popa, and the
25	other staffDan Averywho have worked on these

1	STATED MEETING 51
2	pieces of legislation. There's Intro 183-A, which
3	is in relation to accessible pedestrian signals,
4	sponsored by Council Member Gale Brewer. Intro
5	449-A, a piece of legislation that requires a
6	livery passenger bill of rights to require bill of
7	rights provisions around wheelchair accessibility,
8	sponsored by Council Member Oliver Koppell. We
9	have Intro 745-A, requiring the Department of
10	Transportation to post on its website pedestrian
11	related project information in a way that is
12	accessible to people with disabilities,
13	particularly the visually impaired. That was
14	introduced by the Chair of the Committee, Jimmy
15	Vacca. We alsolet me start with those and then
16	we'll move on to the two overrides after that.
17	But clearly this package of three bills is
18	designed to make sure New York City is easier for
19	people with disabilities to get around in. It is
20	also designed to make sure that our Department of
21	Transportation is more responsive to the needs of
22	people with disabilities particularly by moving
23	towards having many, many more walk/don't walk
24	signs in addition to the countdown clocks be
25	audible, so visually impaired people will be able

1	STATED MEETING 52
2	to hear when it is safe for them to cross the
3	street and not cross the street, and also have
4	DOT's website have all the information about bike
5	lanes, about pedestrian plazas, so when
6	particularly impaired people set out to plan their
7	days they can use the website, since it will be
8	audible, to know where are areas they will have an
9	easy time going to and from and what areas they
10	should avoid, and of course making sure that our
11	livery industry is responsive to the needs of
12	folks in wheelchairs. So, I want to thank Chair
13	Vacca first and foremost, also Council Member
14	Koppell and Council Member Brewer. And I'm going
15	to ask Council Member Vacca to speak on these
16	three pieces of legislation, and then Council
17	Member KoppellI'm sorry. Council Member Vacca,
18	then Council Member Brewer, then Council Member
19	Koppell.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you,
21	thank you Madam Speaker. I think too often when

thank you Madam Speaker. I think too often when 22 we think of disabled individuals, we often don't think of those who are visually impaired, and we 23 don't think of people who are blind. They have 24 unbelievable challenges as they try to navigate 25

2

1	STATED MEETING 53
2	City streets. What we did in the Transportation
3	Committee, via the bills that we're passing
4	introduced by Council Member Brewer and I, is to
5	try to make it easier for this population. We
6	want them to know via the New York City DOT
7	website when there are major street configuration
8	changes. And we want them to knowobviously they
9	can't see what's printed, so we want that in a
10	verbal way, so that they can go about their daily
11	responsibilities with this important information
12	at their fingertips. Having that type of access
13	to the internet for a blind person often is not a
14	luxury, it's a necessity as they go about their
15	day-to-day chores. And Council Member Brewer's
16	bill, and I'll let her talk about it even further,
17	does speak to pedestrian signals and making them
18	audible, so that a blind or visually impaired
19	person can be able to press a button and hear
20	whether they should walk, whether they should
21	wait, whether they can stop totally. So, we want
22	to make accessibility for this special community
23	really a priority. I know we have much more to
24	do. You know, my father was blind until his
25	passing six years ago. And I can only tell you

1	STATED MEETING 54
2	that we lived with those challenges. My father
3	was used to hearing a car coming, because there
4	was no other way for him to know should he cross
5	that street or not. I wish that we had that
6	technology all those years that we have today. I
7	wish that we had advocates there 30 years ago,
8	like we have today, fighting for this group of
9	people. So, it's a special time for me. I hope
10	that we can do more, and I want to do more, and I
11	urge my colleagues to vote yes. Thank you.
12	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very
13	much, Chair Vacca. Council Member Brewer?
14	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you
15	very much. I want to thank the Speaker and then
16	in particular, Council Member Vacca. Intro 183
17	will require the New York City Department of
18	Transportation, in consultation with the Mayor's
19	Office for People with Disabilities, and advocates
20	for members of the visually impaired community to
21	install, as you heard, accessible signals,
22	accessible pedestrian signals, at 25 intersections
23	every year. This is a beginning. And this
24	legislation will also require an annual report on
25	the status of the APS program, which shall include

1	STATED MEETING 55
2	amongst other things detailed information on the
3	cost of the program, potential funding sources,
4	and the ranking, most importantly, of the top 50
5	intersections. And the reason that's important,
6	50 intersections recommended for the APS, is that
7	all of us know, I'm sure, people who might go to
8	VISIONS, people who might go to Jewish Guild for
9	the Blind, people who might go to Lighthouse or
10	other wonderful programs and institutions in the
11	five boroughs. But people who are blind are just
12	like anybody else that want to go to all the busy
13	intersections. They want to be part of the life
14	of the city. Many people work. Dr. Karen Gourgey
15	at Baruch College has been instrumental in pushing
16	this legislation, along with Lester Marks in the
17	Lighthouse; Ken Stewart, a friend of mine and the
18	Speaker's, a former member of Community Board 4;
19	and all the folks who are part of VISIONS, and
20	particularly Annalyn Barnbier. And I say all of
21	this because this is a long time in coming, this
22	particular legislation. We've been working on it
23	for about five years. I'm very excited. Other
24	cities have taken leadership, but ours is a bigger
25	city. And I'm sure that with the advocacy

1	STATED MEETING 56
2	community, we will make sure that this program is
3	implemented at all the right intersections. The
4	bottom line is that APS are as essential to the
5	visually impaired community as crossing signals
6	are to the sighted. Thank you very much.
7	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very
8	much, Council Member Brewer. Council Member
9	Koppell?
10	COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Very
11	briefly, Madam Speaker and members. This bill is
12	a movement, further movement towards making sure
13	that people who need wheelchair accessible cabs
14	and livery service can get that service and know
15	that they are entitled to it. Thanks to the State
16	Legislature and the Governor, we're going to have
17	many more accessible livery cabs and yellow cabs
18	on the street. And this makes it clear in the
19	taxi or the livery cab bill of rights that
20	accessible vehicles are available. We hope that
21	before too long all yellow cabs and ultimately all
22	livery cabs will be wheelchair accessible. We're
23	moving in that direction, and this is part of that
24	very worthwhile movement. Thank you.
25	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very

1	STATED MEETING 57
2	much, Council Member Vacca. We are also voting
3	today to override two vetoes of legislation that
4	came out of the transportation committee, and
5	again, I want to thank Lyle Frank, Molly Murphy,
6	Dan Avery, Jarret Hova, Laura Popa and Rob Newman
7	for their work on these overrides. First the
8	Mayor has vetoed Intro 490-A, a piece of
9	legislation introduced by Council Member Gennaro,
10	and then he's vetoed Intro 546-A, a piece of
11	legislation introduced by Council Member
12	Greenfield. 490-Aboth of these came through the
13	Transportation Committee. 490-A is an
14	unbelievably commonsense piece of legislation. We
15	all know how muni meters work. You actually have
16	to get out of your car and go to the muni meter
17	and put your credit card in or put the money in.
18	You can't use mental telepathy to send your
19	payment from the driver's seat of your car to the
20	muni meter. It takes time to walk from here to
21	there, but in those few minutes it takes to walk
22	from your care to the muni meter and back to your
23	car, you can until this law, get a ticket. It is
24	the ultimate governmental kick in the tuchus, that
25	while you're trying to pay, you're going to get a

1	STATED MEETING 58
2	ticket that you're going to have to pay more for.
3	And very simply, we're saying give people five
4	minutes, the time it takes to walk from here to
5	there. Now, the Administration has said that this
6	is going to lead to fraud. Furthest thing from
7	the truth, because the only tickets that are
8	covered in this bill, because of concern about
9	fraud, are electronically written tickets. And in
10	that electronic system, you will only be able to
11	void those that are in five minutes, not six
12	minutes, not seven minutes; it will be programmed
13	that way. Second, the Department of Finance is
14	going to be required through this legislation to
15	issue a yearly report on what tickets have been
16	cancelled and send that report to the City Council
17	so this can be monitored. So there really is no
18	reason not to support this legislation, and I
19	would urge all of my colleagues to vote to
20	override the veto today. Second, Intro 546-A is a
21	piece of legislation that will prohibit the
22	Department of Sanitation from sticking those big
23	neon stickers on your car window because you
24	violated alternate side of the street parking.
25	When this veto is overwritten you'll still get a

1	STATED MEETING 59
2	ticket, because when you break alternate side of
3	the street, you should get a ticket. But you
4	won't come out with a big neon sticker on your car
5	that is only there to embarrass you, that it is
6	incrediblyI know from personal experiencehard
7	to get off of your window. Now, the Mayor's
8	Office has said we need these stickers because
9	they have made our city streets cleaner. The
10	facts don't bear that out. In the first ten years
11	that the Department of Sanitation used these
12	stickers, according to the Mayor's Management
13	Report Data, the streets of the City of New York,
14	which were 73% clean before stickers, went up one
15	tenth of one percent in the first decade that
16	stickers were used. So, clearly stickers alone
17	had a statistically insignificant effect on making
18	our streets cleaner. What changed in the decades
19	since our city went from 73% of streets cleanest
20	rating to into the 90s? We hired more people to
21	clean the street. The City Council allocated and
22	constantly restores extra money for extra litter
23	basket pickup. Whether you like the program or
24	not, WEP workers now go out in the thousands and
25	clean city streets. So they're not, if you look

1	STATED MEETING 60
2	at the facts, any cleaner because of thesewell,
3	they're one tenth of one percent cleaner because
4	of the stickers. But the 20 plus percent jump in
5	cleanliness has no relationships, if you study the
6	facts, to these stickers at all. So, I urge all
7	of my colleagues to override both of these vetoes.
8	Let me call again on the Chair of our
9	Transportation Committee, Jimmy Vacca, then on
10	Council Member Gennaro to speak to 490-A, and then
11	Council Member David Greenfield to speak to 546-A.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you.
13	This is an important issue for all of us today
14	because it relates to the issue of parking
15	fairness. We have had a history in our city of
16	the I Got You ticket. When we implemented the
17	five-minute grace period in 2009 pertaining to
18	alternate side street cleaning, we were told the
19	roof would cave in, that was a terrible piece of
20	legislation; and we had to override the Mayor's
21	veto. But you know what's happened since that law
22	was enacted? Our streets have not gotten dirtier
23	and the roof did not cave in. So, this Council
24	has been on record as taking positions that will
25	make sure that those who deserve to get a ticket

1	STATED MEETING 61
2	get the ticket, but those who don't deserve to get
3	it will not. And if they do, they should have
4	recourse. It really is finding someone guilty
5	before they're allowed to plead innocent. When
6	they get that green sticker on their window,
7	they're found guilty on the spot. Why, when
8	they're already receiving a summons that they do
9	have an opportunity to adjudicate? And with the
10	growth of muni meters, our city is going to be in
11	the next 12 months 100% muni metered. And with
12	the growth of muni meters, well, we have a
13	challenge before us, for senior citizens, for a
14	disabled person, for a lady or a gentleman who has
15	children, baby carriages, they deserve several
16	minutesno more than fiveto go and get the muni
17	receipt from the box and put it in their window.
18	Again, it's only called fairness. So, I do hope
19	that the Council will override the two vetoes that
20	the Mayor has issued in both these matters, and I
21	thank my Committee members and their staff for
22	their assistance.
23	SPEAKER QUINN: Council Member
24	Gennaro.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Yes.

1	STATED MEETING 62
2	Thank you, Madam Speaker. Thank you, Mr. Chair.
3	I certainly wish to be associated with your good
4	remarks on both of these bills, but let me talk
5	about 490. That was the one that I had the good
6	fortune to put forward. And somewhere in the City
7	right now, someone is walking to a muni meter,
8	maybe they're elderly or maybe they have some kids
9	with them, and maybe they have to wait on line
10	between one or two people who are also buying the
11	slip, and when they go back to their car they're
12	going to have a ticket. And this bill will fix
13	that. And this can't happen soon enough. I'm
14	very grateful to the Speaker and all my colleagues
15	for, number one, passing this bill, and doing the
16	right thing today and making this override. And
17	so I thank the Speaker and I thank Chairman Vacca.
18	Thank you.
19	SPEAKER QUINN: Council Member
20	Greenfield.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank
22	you, Madam Speaker. I have to tell you, I'm
23	actually very excited today. For me, this is why
24	I became a City Council Member, to solve the
25	everyday problems of my constituents. And I want

1	STATED MEETING 63
2	to thank the Speaker for her leadership on this
3	issue, and I want to give special thanks to Rob
4	Newman and Lyle Frank and Laura Popa, and the rest
5	of the terrific Council Transportation Committee
6	for their hard work to the bill, and of course our
7	Chairman, Jimmy Vacca, and his aide, Andrea
8	Pender. You know, as a result of this vote,
9	sanitation workers will no longer be the judge,
10	jury and punisher when it comes to plastering
11	impossible to remove stickers on vehicles when
12	drivers allegedly violate alternate side parking
13	regulations. I say allegedly, because I've had
14	more people come to me in praise of this
15	particular legislation than any other legislation.
16	And one story hit home, which I mentioned before,
17	and it's a story of an individual, a constituent,
18	who was rushed to the hospital in an ambulance.
19	And thank god, after a couple days he got out and
20	he was fine, only to find that of course he had to
21	move his car on alternate side. He had a ticket
22	and a sticker. He fought the ticket. He won in
23	court, but that sticker, remnants of it are still
24	stuck on his window. The bottom line is that our
25	sanitation crews can now focus on doing what they

1	STATED MEETING 64
2	do best, help keeping our streets clean. If
3	anything, the City will now get cleaner as
4	sanitation workers will have more time to clean,
5	rather than affix these impossible to remove
6	stickers. And so I thank my colleagues for
7	standing up for average New Yorkers in helping
8	making daily life in the City a little bit saner,
9	a little less frustrating, and simply put, our
10	government should not be in the business of
11	defacing private property, and publicly shaming
12	its citizens for a minor parking violation. Thank
13	you all so much.
14	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Council
15	Member Greenfield. I also want to thank Chuck
16	Davis, and the staff of the Rules, Privileges and
17	Elections Committee for the appointees today to
18	the Arts Commission and the City Planning
19	Commission, and that concludes Communications from
20	the Speaker.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Discussion
22	of General Orders. Council Member Barron?
23	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you,
24	my colleagues. I rise to speak against the St.
25	Vincent's project. And I want to just bring this

1	STATED MEETING 65
2	to the attention of my colleagues. There are some
3	West Villagers, residents, who are going to be
4	severely hurt by this project. The medical
5	services to that community is dismal. They're
6	going to have to travel distances. We're not
7	asking them to build another hospital, but the
8	rich Rudins can do better than a one-bed or two-
9	bed medical facility that's not going to have
10	anything in it that comes near to meeting the
11	medical needs of that community. In addition to
12	that, they're going to have luxury housing. They
13	already lost a hospital. They lost 3,500 jobs.
14	They jobs that this project is going to create
15	won't come near that. So there are some people in
16	that community that are very upset by this
17	project. The rich Rudins could have gone back to
18	the drawing board, and maybe not a full hospital,
19	but put something in on geriatrics, pediatrics,
20	something, a trauma unit, or something to make the
21	medical needs of this community met. This is a
22	life or death issue. People could actually die if
23	they don't get the proper medical services. So,
24	to say you're not building a hospital so we have
25	to take this; no, you're not building a hospital,

1	STATED MEETING 66
2	but the rich Rudins could have done much better
3	for the medical services for that community, could
4	have done much better on affordable housing for
5	that community. So, there are some people in that
6	community that are very upset at this, and they
7	should be, and I want to encourage my colleagues
8	to vote no on these four or five bills and resos
9	so that they can go back to the drawing board.
10	And as hard as they may have worked, the rich
11	Rudins can do better. Thank you.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Quiet
13	please. Council Member Koslowitz. Hold on, put a
14	mic on. Point of special order, we didn't have
15	Land Use Call-ups, so.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank
17	you, I'd like to vote Aye on all general coupled
18	orders and also the resolutions for today.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council
20	Member Gennaro. You've got to get the mic over.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Mr.
22	Leader, I request consent to vote on the full
23	calendar and all the resolutions?
24	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: So ordered.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: I vote Aye

1	STATED MEETING 67
2	on all the bills and all the resolutions.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you.
4	Okay. Now back to General Order discussions.
5	Council Member Jackson. Robert Jackson.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you,
7	Majority Leader. My colleagues, I rise to express
8	support of Intro 18-A. As it was stated by our
9	Chair of Finance during the Committee hearings, he
10	thanked all of those parties involved, including
11	the Real Estate Board, including 32 VJ and all the
12	others that were involved in moving this forward
13	to where agreement was reached, or consensus. And
14	as you know, when you reach a consensus, you don't
15	get everything, but you negotiate to where
16	agreement can be reached. So, I am proud as a
17	member of this City Council to be able to vote in
18	favor of 18-A, which is going to increase the
19	wages of certain employees over the next several
20	years. Knowing that developers will be receiving
21	City money, hard-earned tax dollars in order to
22	move forward with their projects, and so those
23	employees that are working for them, or we're
24	renting space where there's more than 50% of
25	employees that are not earning a whole lot of

1	STATED MEETING 68
2	money will benefit from it. But also, my
3	Colleagues, I rise in support of Intro 183-A, on
4	page 8, and our Chair Jimmy Vacca spoke about his
5	father. And let me speak to you as a brother-in-
6	law, where my brother-in-law and sister-in-law are
7	totally blind from retinitis pigmentosa. And in
8	fact, my brother-in-law works in Brooklyn and he
9	travels every day by public transportation and has
10	to cross a huge highway in order to get to work.
11	And in fact about a month ago he was going into
12	the subway and he came back home because he
13	crashed into some signit may have been a
14	telephone pole or somethingand there was a big
15	gash and bleeding from his head; he didn't go to
16	work that day. But he's been travelling the New
17	York City streets ever since he's been 19, and
18	he's now 50 years old. So, I ask you to support
19	all of these particular intros. Thank you very
20	much.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council
22	Member Fidler.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Thank you,
24	Deputy Majority Leader. I am not voting in favor
25	of the Art Commission nominees today, I'm going to

1	STATED MEETING 69
2	be abstaining. And it's not because they aren't
3	qualified, such as the Art Commission is set up.
4	My problem is the Art Commission or the Public
5	Design Commission, as it's also called, itself. I
6	have been told by people who work in City
7	agencies, particularly in the Parks Department,
8	that 50% of the cost overruns and time delays that
9	are connected with projects occasioned by the Art
10	Commission, often on issues that are trivial,
11	arbitrary and capricious. I don't understand why
12	we need a commission to tell designers what's in
13	good taste. Who appointed people to say, this is
14	good taste? Who decided that a sculptor or an art
15	historian can tell me what sense belongs around
16	Frasier Park as opposed to a different fence? Why
17	can't I put the roof on top of the bocce court in
18	Marine Park so my bacci players can play in the
19	rain? Because the Art Commission doesn't think
20	it's fancy enough and we can't afford the one that
21	they think is fancy enough? But the Parks
22	Department thinks it's just fine, and we'll use it
23	someplace else. And further, you cannot get
24	minutes to an Art Commission hearing. They do not
25	have them. Try to FOIL information at the Art

1	STATED MEETING 70
2	Commission. In a government that's supposed to be
3	transparent, this is the least transparent agency
4	in the entire government, and that says a lot.
5	They hold their meetings in the back room, discuss
6	their business, do their deliberations, come out
7	and tell you what they've decided. It is the most
8	undemocratic non-transparent, money-wasting agency
9	in the City of New York. So, I am abstaining
10	today on these nominees, because there is
11	certainly nothing about these nominees. But I
12	would urge all of you to look at the bill that
13	I've introduced to eliminate the Public Design
14	Commission, the Art Commission. Put your name on
15	it. Let's make government work more efficiently,
16	and let's save some money.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Quiet,
18	please. Members too. Peter Koo? Council Member
19	Koo?
20	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Mr. Majority
21	Leader, I would like to ask for permission to vote
22	on all Land Use matters, and general orders, and
23	also the other resolutions.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: So ordered.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote Yes on

71 1 STATED MEETING 2 all matters. Thank you. COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you. 3 Anybody else on General Orders? Report on special 4 5 committees? б THE CLERK: None. 7 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Reports of 8 standing committees. 9 THE CLERK: Report of the Committee on Finance. Introduction 18-A, prevailing wage 10 11 requirements. 12 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled 13 on General Orders. 14 THE CLERK: Preconsidered M 772 and 15 Reso 1269 and Preconsidered M 773 and Reso 1270, 16 City Council Budget. 17 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General Orders. 18 THE CLERK: Preconsidered LU 582 19 20 and Reso 1271, Bronx. 21 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General 22 Orders. 23 THE CLERK: Preconsidered LU 583 24 and Reso 1272, Brooklyn. 25 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General

72 1 STATED MEETING 2 Orders. THE CLERK: Preconsidered LU 584 3 and Reso 1273. 4 5 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General Orders. б 7 THE CLERK: Preconsidered LU 585 and Reso 1274, Bronx. 8 9 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General 10 Orders. 11 THE CLERK: Report of the Committee 12 on Land Use. LU 567 and Reso 1275, enclosed sidewalk café, Brooklyn. 13 14 SPEAKER QUINN: Motion to 15 disapprove. THE CLERK: LU 572 and Reso 1276 16 17 through LU 576 and Reso 1280 on page 3, landmark designations. 18 19 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General 20 Orders. 21 THE CLERK: LU 578 and Reso 1281, 22 unenclosed sidewalk café, Manhattan. 23 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled to be filed 24 pursuant to a letter of withdrawal. 25 THE CLERK: LU 579 and Reso 1282,
1	STATED MEETING 73
2	and LU 580 and Reso 1283 on page 4, unenclosed
3	sidewalk cafés.
4	SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
5	Orders.
6	THE CLERK: LU 581 and Reso 1284,
7	amendment to the zoning resolution.
8	SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
9	Orders.
10	THE CLERK: Report of the Committee
11	on Rules, Privileges and Elections, M 749 and Reso
12	1285, approving the appointment of Philip E.
13	Aarons to the New York City Art Commission.
14	SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
15	Orders.
16	THE CLERK: M 570 and Resolution
17	1286, approving the appointment of Maria Elena
18	Gonzalez, New York City Art Commission.
19	SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
20	Orders.
21	THE CLERK: Preconsidered M 771 and
22	Reso 1287, approving the appointment of Michelle
23	R. de la Uz, New York City Planning Commission.
24	SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
25	Orders.

1	STATED MEETING 74
2	THE CLERK: Report of the Committee
3	on Transportation, Intro 183-A, accessible
4	pedestrian signs.
5	SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
6	on General Orders.
7	THE CLERK: Intro 449-A, livery
8	passenger bill of rights.
9	SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
10	on General Orders.
11	THE CLERK: Intro 490-A, cancelling
12	tickets upon showing of a valid muni meter
13	receipt.
14	SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
15	Orders.
16	THE CLERK: M 746, Mayor's Veto,
17	introductory number 490-A.
18	SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled to be
19	filed.
20	THE CLERK: Introduction 546-A,
21	enforcement of alternate side of the street
22	parking rules.
23	SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
24	Orders.
25	THE CLERK: M 747, Mayor's Veto,

75 1 STATED MEETING 2 introductory number 546-A. SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled, to be 3 filed. 4 5 THE CLERK: Introduction 745-A, pedestrian related project information. б 7 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on General Orders. 8 9 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: General Order Calendar. 10 11 THE CLERK: LU 559 and Reso 1288 12 through LU 563 and Reso 1292, St. Vincent's 13 Medical Center. 14 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General 15 Orders. 16 THE CLERK: Resolution appointing 17 various persons Commissioner of Deeds. SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General 18 19 Orders. And at this point I'd like to ask for a 20 roll call on all items that have been coupled on 21 the General Order Calendar. 22 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Roll call. 23 THE CLERK: Arroyo. 24 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye. 25 THE CLERK: Barron.

1	STATED MEETING 76
2	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.
3	I vote No on LU 559 through 563, the St. Vincent's
4	project. I vote No. I abstain on the Art
5	Commission appointments, and Aye on all the rest.
6	THE CLERK: Brewer.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you
8	very much. I vote Aye on all. I do want to
9	mention regarding St. Vincent's, I'd like to be
10	associated with the remarks of Council Member
11	Weprin, who said it so articulately. And having
12	negotiated a lot of deals, I know how hard they
13	are, but I'd like to be associated with his
14	remarks. I do support the Art Commission. Two
15	excellent appointments today, however, I do think
16	the streamlining issue is a real one. I have lots
17	of projects regarding parks. I know how easy it
18	is, or the request is made to go around the Art
19	Commission by doing certain things involving the
20	procurement process. So, I do think there's a lot
21	of streamlining necessary, but I do think that it
22	serves a role. Thank you very much.
23	THE CLERK: Cabrera.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.
25	THE CLERK: Chin.

1	STATED MEETING 77
2	COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.
3	THE CLERK: Comrie.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Aye on all.
5	THE CLERK: Crowley.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye.
7	THE CLERK: Dickens.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.
9	THE CLERK: Dilan.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Aye on all.
11	THE CLERK: Dromm.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye on all.
13	THE CLERK: Eugene.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.
15	THE CLERK: Ferreras.
16	CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Aye on all.
17	THE CLERK: Fidler.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Aye on all
19	with the exception of 749 and 750, resolutions
20	1285 and 1286 in which I emphatically abstain.
21	THE CLERK: Foster.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Aye on all.
23	THE CLERK: Garodnick.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: No on
25	490-A, Aye on the rest.

1	STATED MEETING 78
2	THE CLERK: Gentile.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.
4	THE CLERK: Gonzalez.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Aye on
6	all.
7	THE CLERK: Greenfield.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I agree
9	with Fidler. Though, I am voting Aye on all.
10	That's to pre-judge those fine candidates, but I
11	do look forward to working with him on his
12	legislation and I thank him for his coherent
13	point.
14	THE CLERK: Halloran.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: I vote
16	Nay on 18-A. Nay on 18-A. Aye on the rest, and I
17	am enthused by the enthusiasm of Mr. Fidler and
18	look forward to joining him in his bill, along
19	with the rest of my Republican colleagues, who
20	have been saying that for years. Welcome to the
21	club.
22	THE CLERK: Ignizio.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: No on 18-
24	A, Aye on all others.
25	THE CLERK: Jackson.

1	STATED MEETING 79
2	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Aye on
3	all.
4	THE CLERK: James.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: May I be
6	excused to explain my vote?
7	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: So ordered.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: I
9	congratulate Michelle de la Uz as a Commissioner
10	of the New York City Planning Commission. She's a
11	constituent and a fine individual and I welcome
12	her to the Commission, and I lookwith regards to
13	Council Member Fidler's comments, I support his
14	comments, but I think it would be better served
15	not to eliminate the Art Commission, but in fact
16	merge them with the Department of Design and
17	Construction, since their duties overlap. That's
18	a bill that I have introduced as well. And I
19	believe that their duties are duplicative, and I
20	vote Aye on everything else. Thank you.
21	THE CLERK: Koppell.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: May I have
23	permission to explain my vote?
24	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: So ordered.
25	Yes. Unfortunately I can't join in overriding the

1	STATED MEETING 80
2	veto of the Mayor on 490-A. To explain, this is a
3	problem. Jimmy Vacca explained the problem well,
4	but it's a problem we've already solved. Because
5	Dan Garodnick, and I was a co-sponsor, has a bill
6	that was signed by the Mayor that says that if you
7	send in the muni meter receipt and it was issued
8	within five minutes of the ticket, and now those
9	tickets are electronically issued, as was
10	mentioned in the discussion, you can automatically
11	get your ticket cancelled. So, there's a
12	solution. The solution of this bill will
13	unfortunately in my view lead to all kinds of
14	disputes on the streets of our city, between
15	people who think the parking enforcement agent
16	shouldn't have issued the ticket, or they say five
17	minute have not passed, the parking enforcement
18	says five minutes have passed; they get into some
19	altercation. I see a lot of disputes on the
20	streets. We already have a lot of antagonism to
21	the parking enforcement agents. In addition,
22	there will be offers of gifts if they would only
23	cancel the tickets. You know, maybe
24	electronically that will be made difficult, but I
25	can see problems. We have problems in the Bronx

1	STATED MEETING 81
2	with ticket fixing. Whether that will happen here
3	or not I'm not sure. But we've solved the
4	problem. Why do we want to introduce something
5	that will solve more problems? So, I can't
6	support the override of the veto, although I
7	appreciate the sentiment behind it. So, I will
8	then withdraw my request, vote Aye on all; No, on
9	the override on 490-A. Thank you.
10	THE CLERK: Lander.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye on all.
12	THE CLERK: Lappin.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Oh, sorry.
14	It's right in front of me. I would like to
15	associate myself with the comments of my
16	colleague, Council Member Fidler. I'd like to
17	congratulate Councilman Melissa Mark-Viverito and
18	everyone else on the prevailing wage bill, and
19	vote Aye on all.
20	THE CLERK: Levin.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.
22	THE CLERK: Mark-Viverito.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye
24	on all.
25	THE CLERK: Mealy.

1	STATED MEETING 82
2	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye on all.
3	THE CLERK: Nelson.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Me too as
5	well, and Aye on all.
6	THE CLERK: Palma.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye on all.
8	THE CLERK: Recchia.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Aye on
10	all.
11	THE CLERK: Reyna.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Aye on all.
13	THE CLERK: Rodriguez.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye on
15	all.
16	THE CLERK: Rose.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I'd like to
18	acknowledge the efforts on the part of Chair Vacca
19	and Council Member Brewer for the accessible
20	pedestrian signals, and for championing the cause
21	for people with special needs, and I vote Aye on
22	all.
23	THE CLERK: Sanders.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Aye on
25	all.

1	STATED MEETING 83
2	THE CLERK: Seabrook.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Aye on
4	all.
5	THE CLERK: Ulrich.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye on all.
7	THE CLERK: Vacca.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I ask for
9	permission to explain my vote?
10	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: So ordered.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I'm going to
12	vote Aye on all, except I'm going to abstain on M
13	749, M 750, Resolution 1285 and 1286. At this
14	point, this is not personal with me regarding the
15	Art Commission. This is institutional. I cannot
16	understand how an agency of the City of New York
17	in 2012 cannot produce minutes of their
18	proceedings. There is something called the Open
19	Meetings Act. This is a fact in this state for
20	years. I have in my own districtfirst of all,
21	we should all know that the Art Commission, by
22	their activity, has increased the cost of capital
23	projects in this city unbelievably by their
24	procrastination, postponement, years of questions
25	that go on and on. And as it goes on and on, the

1	STATED MEETING 84
2	taxpayer pays more and more. A project starts
3	here and ends up there. Secondly, I mentioned the
4	issue of minutes. I mentioned that there's a lack
5	of transparency in this agency. This agency is
6	driving other agencies in the City crazy. Ask any
7	other City agency about the Art Commission. They
8	will tell you that they're being driven out of
9	their minds. In my own district I have a bridge,
10	the City Island Bridge. They're going to demolish
11	the bridge, put a new bridge up. It's going to
12	cost \$120 million. The Art Commission approved
13	this. I went to the Art Commission. I called
14	them up. I said, can I have the minutes of the
15	meeting where you approved this. They say, Mr.
16	Vacca, we don't keep minutes. What is this?
17	They're on the New York City .gov website. What
18	are they, a private entity? I heard at the
19	Committee Meeting on Rules today that they
20	sometimes do these things in executive session.
21	Well, let me tell you what executive session is.
22	Executive session is when you discuss pending
23	litigation. Executive session is when you discuss
24	personnel items. It's not when you discuss a
25	public structure that's historic that you've

1	STATED MEETING 85
2	decided to approve demolition of, and then you
3	then approve a new bridge to take its place. Give
4	me a break. Until there's reform I'm not voting
5	for anyone else on the Art Commission, period.
6	[applause]
7	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Tell us how
8	you're really feeling.
9	[laughter]
10	THE CLERK: Vallone.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: No on 18-
12	A, Aye on the rest.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: You guys
14	got that?
15	THE CLERK: Yes. Van Bramer.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on
17	all.
18	THE CLERK: Vann.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Aye on all.
20	THE CLERK: Weprin.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye on all.
22	THE CLERK: Williams.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS:
24	Congratulations to Michelle de la Uz. Very good.
25	I'm impression by Lou Barron and Jimmy Barron.

1	STATED MEETING 86
2	But I'm going to vote Aye on all the rest and
3	hopefully we can do some work to make this thing
4	happen properly. Thank you.
5	THE CLERK: Wills.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I vote Aye
7	on all, except for the override of 490. I believe
8	that that bill is going to cause alterations
9	between those who are giving out the tickets and
10	people on the street. And I believe that the
11	bills that Garodnick and Oliver Koppell have
12	already put in solves that problem. Thank you.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Are you
14	voting No or abstaining on that? We weren't
15	clear.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I'm
17	abstaining on that vote and I'm voting Aye on
18	everything else.
19	THE CLERK: Oddo.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Thank you.
21	May I be temporarily excused to explain my vote?
22	THE CLERK: So ordered.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: I'll be
24	voting No on 18-A and Yes on all others. And I
25	just want to say that I know that this is the

1	STATED MEETING 87
2	floor of the City Council, and we're not supposed
3	to talk about raw politics, but they're opening up
4	some envelopes in Brooklyn for a State Senate
5	race, and I want to say that I will be rooting
6	against my colleague, Lew Fidler, in hoping that
7	he loses for no other reason but for the fact I
8	want to keep him here in the City Council. When I
9	listened to him speak just now, it reminds me how
10	much of a commonsense, smart public official he
11	is. And I think we could use that here and
12	continue to use that in the City Council. So, for
13	very selfish reasons, I hope things don't turn out
14	all that well in the recount. You know, Lew talks
15	about a bill, and a few years ago there was this
16	really smart good-looking guy from Staten Island
17	who happens to be more on the conservative end of
18	the spectrum. I said on the conservative end of
19	the spectrum. And he teamed up with this fabulous
20	young lady who represented Greenwich Village on
21	the far, or the left of the spectrum, and whole
22	bunch of conservative and moderate and progressive
23	council members joined on this bill. And it was a
24	bill to do away with the Art Commission. And my
25	colleague Gale Brewer probably remembers this.

1	STATED MEETING 88
2	Henry Stern was fighting with the Art Commission
3	about the Yard Arms, I think Reba White Williams.
4	And it was this big thing. But they were the most
5	smug, arrogant, insular group of folks in City
6	Government. You would think they were the Parks
7	Department. And we introduced this bill. We
8	introduced this bill and the New York Times
9	discovered it and said, wow, what bill would have
10	Chris Quinn and Tom Ognibene and Jimmy Oddo, and
11	left, and center. And it was a bill to do away
12	with the Art Commission. And a funny thing
13	happened. We started getting invites for lunches
14	to go up to the rarified air to the third or
15	fourth floor up there, and they started responding
16	to us, along the lines of what Jimmy Vacca was
17	talking about, about projects going over budget,
18	and what Lew was referring to. And it's just
19	amazing to see that at the end of my tenure here
20	in the Council that some things never change. And
21	I would encourage my colleague Lew Fidler and
22	other colleagues, if it's not a direct
23	elimination, let's figure out a way. Eric Ulrich
24	just said, we should have a call-up provision.
25	There has to be something to inject some

1	STATED MEETING 89
2	accountability into this agency. So, what's old
3	is new again. I support Council Member Fidler and
4	any of my colleagues that comes up with a rational
5	plan to rein in some of the smug, insular,
6	arrogant attitude that lofts down from high above.
7	Thank you.
8	THE CLERK: Speaker Quinn.
9	[off mic]
10	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you.
11	All items on today's General Order calendar were
12	adopted by a vote of 49 in Affirmative, 0
13	negative, and 0 abstentions, with the exception of
14	Land Use Item number 559 and Resolution 1288
15	through Land Use 563 and Resolution 1292, which
16	was adopted by a vote of 48 in Affirmative, 1
17	negative, and 0 abstentions, and M 749 and
18	Resolution 1285, which was adopted by a vote of 46
19	in the Affirmative, 0 negative, and 3 abstentions;
20	and M 750 and Resolution 1286, which was adopted
21	by a vote of 46 affirmative, 3 abstentions; Intro
22	18-A, which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the
23	Affirmative, 4 in the negative, and 0 abstentions;
24	Intro 490-A, which was adopted by a vote of 46 in
25	the affirmative, 2 negatives, and 1 abstention.

1	STATED MEETING 90
2	And that's everything on the general order
3	calendar. Now we'll go tonow we have discussion
4	of resolutions. Introduction and readings of
5	bills. Quiet, please. We still have the meeting
6	going on. Quiet please.
7	SPEAKER QUINN: Quiet or we're
8	going to have to clear the balcony.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: So,
10	discussion of resolutions. Council Member
11	Jackson, resolution 803-A, please.
12	SPEAKER QUINN: Officers, if we
13	could clear the balcony.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Please be
15	quiet as you're leaving. The meeting is still
16	going on. Council Member Jackson.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Can I get
18	a mic? Thank you. My colleagues, I rise on page
19	13, is resolution 803, regarding an amended
20	resolution calling upon the State Legislature to
21	pass and the governor to sign the New York State
22	Dream Act, which would grant benefits to eligible
23	undocumented immigrants. If you don't know, I
24	represent Northern Manhattan, which includes
25	Washington Heights, Inwood and Harlem. And in

1	STATED MEETING 91
2	fact, hundreds of thousands of individuals that
3	are trying to get a higher education, this would
4	help. And as you know, the more education you
5	receive, the better off your families will be in
6	the long run, because the more income a college
7	educated individual earns compared to a high
8	school education. And in the long run, this is a
9	win-win situation for the individual families and
10	individual members, and also our great city, and
11	our great state. And I ask all of you to support
12	Resolution 803, commonly known as the Dream Act.
13	Thank you.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council
15	Member Williams.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I just
17	wanted to lend my voice to the importance of this
18	resolution. It is a no-brainer. I'm hoping that
19	people in the state and actually in federal
20	government will hear what's going on. I think we
21	have a tendency to use, abuse and accept all of
22	the good things that immigrants are bringing, and
23	then not giving them equal share of providing the
24	best that they can for city, state and our
25	country. I am a first generation Brooklynite. My

1	STATED MEETING 92
2	parents hail from Grenada. I understand firsthand
3	what it is like to be from an immigrant family.
4	This is a no-brainer. What we're saying is that
5	for students who came through nothing of their
6	own, who are here, need to have the opportunity to
7	better themselves, get a better education, so they
8	can do what's better for the places that they
9	live. Other than that, they may choose wrong
10	choices, when then further lead for more police
11	activity in certain communities. So, I'm hoping
12	that we see the interconnectedness of all of these
13	things, pass this overwhelmingly, and I hope
14	people hear us. Thank you.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council
16	Member Rodriguez.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank
18	you. And I'm speaking on behalf of the resolution
19	to support the Dream Act. Sometimes people, they
20	ask about work, sometimes it's people to rise
21	and take the streets and hold protests. The
22	answer is that people get frustrated. People get
23	to the point and say we will take it no more. And
24	when we've got talented young people doing good in
25	school, being there, doing the right thing, and

1	STATED MEETING 93
2	now we getting close to closing the state budget,
3	and the Dream Act has been left out of this
4	negotiation. And most likely, this will not pass
5	at a state level. And we know that. And it is so
б	unfortunate, that we're sending the message to our
7	young people that in the City and the State of New
8	York, that we don't care for them. Now they are
9	80s, they're getting 90s; they're doing the best
10	they can. They want to be the next engineer, the
11	next doctor, the next architect. They need to be
12	part of the workforce. And the state needs more
13	of those people ready to compete. And we, as all
14	of my colleagues, Council Member Barron has said,
15	we are not begging. We are not asking. We are
16	demanding because undocumented, we pay a lot of
17	money. So, it is so unfortunate that we are so
18	close to getting the state budget passed, and we
19	know that most likely our
20	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:
21	[Interposing] Time's up, Council.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ:
23	Governor Andrew Cuomo and our Majority Leader,
24	they have not include the Dream Act in their
25	negotiation.

1	STATED MEETING 94
2	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Time's up,
3	Council Member.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank
5	you.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you.
7	Council Member Danny Dromm.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you
9	very much. I look forward to passing this
10	resolution in the Council today, along with the
11	Dream Fund resolution as well. I'd like to thank
12	Speaker Quinn for her leadership and championing
13	of immigrant rights in the City of New York. What
14	happens to a dream deferred, Langston Hughes, gay
15	poet of the Harlem Renaissance famously asked.
16	Denying educational opportunity to our best and
17	brightest, who are Americans in all but name, is
18	cruel to these youth and unwise for our city and
19	state. Governor Cuomo, these young people's
20	dreams have been deferred too long. In hearings
21	last Tuesday, the Committee on Immigration heard
22	compelling testimony from young New Yorkers
23	striving to succeed. These youth bravely came out
24	as undocumented in order to shed light on the
25	injustices of our immigration system. These

1	STATED MEETING 95
2	dreamers, who are our greatest asset, are now
3	clamoring for the opportunity to lead our city
4	toward a better future. Let's give them the
5	chance to realize their dreams. We demand that
6	Governor Cuomo push this legislation forward
7	before the April 1st deadline. Thank you.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Last
9	speaker on this, Council Member Eugene.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you
11	very much. I stand in support of the Dream Act,
12	and I want to commend the Speaker for her
13	leadership on this issue, and I also want to
14	commend the Chairman of the Immigration Committee,
15	Council Member Dromm, and all my colleague co-
16	sponsors. You know, United States as you know, is
17	a country that was founded by immigrants, and the
18	contribution of immigrants is remarkable. So,
19	those young people, they are yearning. They want
20	to go to school. They want the opportunity to
21	have a good education. And this is our moral
22	obligation to try to do everything that we can do,
23	to have the young people get the education that
24	they deserve, because allowing them to have the
25	right to go to college is a good investment for

1	STATED MEETING 96
2	the City of New York. It's a good investment for
3	the State of New York, and it is also a good
4	investment for United States. And I commend all
5	of you. We should do everything that we can do to
б	give the right opportunities to these young people
7	who will be our future leaders. Thank you.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Speakers on
9	Resolution 1219, a resolution calling upon the
10	State Legislator to pass and the Governor to sign
11	legislation establishing the New York Dream Fund
12	Commission. No speakers on 1219? So, now we'll
13	vote on the two resolutions, 803-A, and 1219. All
14	in favor?
15	VOICES: Aye.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: All
17	opposed.
18	[pause]
19	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Ayes have
20	it. And now we'll call on Council Member Rosie
21	Mendez, who made it before the meeting ended.
22	Yay.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote.
24	Excuse me, I'm a little out of breath. I vote Aye
25	on all. Thank you.

1	STATED MEETING 97
2	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you.
3	Now speakers to our now preconsidered resolution
4	1261, a resolution condemning the senseless
5	shooting of Trayvon Martin. Speakers to that
6	resolution. Council Member Inez Dickens?
7	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you,
8	Deputy Majority Leader. Today we stand and stood
9	this morning, symbolically, and in solidarity.
10	And I want to thank Council Members Tish James and
11	Melissa Mark-Viverito, in bringing us together,
12	united. Hoodies in protest to the negative
13	stereotypes that protest racism, to protest the
14	brutal assassination of Trayvon Martin. We stand
15	united against the over 500-year atrocity of
16	racism, an unfortunate American institution.
17	Symbolization is not the sole answer to right wing
18	extremism that is gripping every inch of our
19	country. This extremism, this conservative
20	plague, has once again given pardon, approval to
21	atrocities against humanity, in particularly
22	atrocities against brown and black people. I'm
23	not speaking of any one political party, because
24	the Tea Party philosophy comes in both Republican
25	and Democratic flavors. Further, I'm not merely

1	STATED MEETING 98
2	talking about black and brown people, because
3	racism plague is pandemic and breeds wholesale
4	destruction without regard for race, color, creed
5	or sexual preference. But as a Black woman who
6	has fought for civil rights for my entire life
7	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:
8	[Interposing] Time.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS:as an
10	elected who daily fights for our young people who
11	are in crisis, I want
12	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:
13	[Interposing] Time's up.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS:to say,
15	that we stood together today. We will continue to
16	stand together to fight this racism.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you.
18	Council Member Barron.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you
20	very much. My colleagues, it was good today that
21	we had our hoodies on and we had our Skittles, but
22	that's not why Trayvon is dead. That is not why
23	Ramarley Graham in the Bronx is dead. It's not
24	because a law in Florida that Trayvon is dead.
25	There was no law in New York that killed Amadou

1	STATED MEETING 99
2	Diallo and Sean Bell. Neither of them had a
3	hoodie on. Neither of them was trying to get
4	Skittles. It wasn't a law that killed little
5	Timothy Stansbury on a rooftop. Ramarley Graham
6	is horrible. Police went into his house, killed
7	him in his bathroom in front of his six-year-old
8	brother and put a gun to his grandmother's head,
9	and he didn't have any weapons, or was not
10	committing any crime. We have to take off these
11	hoodies when you come back to work tomorrow and
12	deal with racism, race. We have to deal with
13	race. Clearly the real criminal in this is not
14	just Zimmerman, it was the system that did not
15	arrest him. It was the system that let the
16	killers of Amadou Diallo go, let the killers of
17	Sean Bell go. This system is racist; it's still
18	in place, and any one of us, this could happen to,
19	and there will not be justice. So, it was good
20	symbolically today, and to my White colleagues
21	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:
22	[Interposing] Time.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:we thank
24	you for wearing the hoodies, but you can wear a
25	hoodie and carry a gun, and you more than likely

1	STATED MEETING 100
2	will not be shot and killed.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council
4	Member Robert Jackson.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you,
6	Majority Leader. I rise, my colleagues, and
7	obviously the picture of Trayvon Martin, just a
8	couple of facts that people didn't talk about. I
9	truly believe that there was racism involved. And
10	I read online, the New York Post the other day,
11	where it said that this individual who killed him
12	had made approximately 42 complaints to 911 over
13	the past couple of years, and one was even against
14	a little boy that was about seven or nine years
15	old, and he reported him as a suspicious character
16	in the community. And obviously the officer,
17	detective at the scene wanted to file manslaughter
18	charges, but the State Attorney involved said no.
19	And I say to all of you, that even though this is
20	symbolic, this is important overall. We must stop
21	racism wherever it stands. As I said, it doesn't
22	matter if I have on a suit or this hoodie, I'm
23	still the same person. Thank you.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council
25	Member Al Vann.

1	STATED MEETING 101
2	COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Yeah, I
3	didn't realize this had to be said in a minute.
4	It's a very important issue. First of all, I
5	think the greatest pain that one can experience in
6	life is to be predeceased by one's own child. I
7	believe that the unbearable pain is even worse
8	when such a death is both a violent and an
9	unjustified one. I believe that I can speak for
10	everyone here of the heartfelt sympathy that we
11	extend to the family of Trayvon Martin. I pray
12	they will be strong. I hope they will eventually
13	find some measure of peace, and I know that this
14	peace will only come when justice is found for
15	their son. We must obtain justice for their son,
16	and then they will find some measure of peace.
17	Trayvon Martin's parents have tothey're grieving
18	and they're suffering, and at the same time, their
19	dead child is being victimized. I mean, it's the
20	ultimate insult, the ultimate horrifying thing
21	that could happen to anyone. They're beingtwice
22	they're being horrified. Their child has been
23	killed, then secondly those that are responsible
24	for arresting and holing for trial and
25	prosecuting, they are attempting to cover up that

1	STATED MEETING 102
2	which has occurred. You can't imagine the pain
3	and suffering that they must be going through.
4	I've lived on this planet for seven decades and
5	some. I've experienced racism down south, up
6	north, in military uniform, in civilian clothes;
7	so that, you know, racism is a reality. It's
8	getting better. We've improved. A long way to
9	go. But fragments of racism are at the core of
10	the discrimination and the other injustices that
11	black and brown people still face in America.
12	Institutional racism encourages individual acts of
13	racism. Institutional racism gives license to
14	those who are sworn to protect the law to become
15	lawbreakers. There are parallels between Florida
16	and New York City. They have young Black and
17	Latino men, and in New York City, we have young
18	Black and Latino men. In Florida they have a law,
19	this Stand Your Ground. In New York City we have
20	Stop and Frisk. We can give voice, as I think
21	thousands of people are all over this country, to
22	the injustice for Trayvon, and bringing justice
23	there. But we can do more than give voice here.
24	We can do something about the situation in New
25	York City. Yes, let's demonstrate. Let's

1	STATED MEETING 103
2	protest. Let's demand justice for Trayvon, but
3	let's make sure that we stop Stop and Frisk. We
4	must stop Stop and Frisk. Finally, and I
5	appreciate the opportunity. In demanding justice
6	for our young brother Trayvon, we're also sending
7	a message to all of our young men around this
8	country. We love you. We've failed you, but we
9	recommit that we are going to do better to
10	preserve you and protect you. You deserve that
11	from the country of your birth. Thank you.
12	[applause]
13	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council
14	Member Williams.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I didn't
16	want to follow Council Member Vann.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: That was
18	the only Comrie minute that we're allowing.
19	Everything else is on the clock, so.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Well, I
21	just wanted to say I stand here, Black, with a
22	hoodie, locks, and earrings, and I love hip-hop,
23	but I am not a criminal. I am a New York City
24	Council Member, and I am an unarmed civilian. And
25	I wish there was more humor to that, but perhaps

1	STATED MEETING 104
2	people who look like me should walk around with
3	these shirts and we'd have some less problems.
4	And while we are here, and I am here also in
5	solidarity with Trayvon Martin and his family, I'm
6	also in solidarity with Ramarley Graham, who also
7	was wearing a hoodie and closer to home, John
8	Collado, and all the others seeking justice. So,
9	we should be doing what we're doing for Trayvon.
10	We have to do more at home. When we take off the
11	hoodies, I'm hoping that we will push to end the
12	policies like Stop and Frisk, to push to fix a lot
13	of the racist policies that are being allowed to
14	fester in the police department, that are causing
15	a lot of our problems here, so young Black men
16	have to be scared of getting shot by other young
17	Black men and police officers. And that's a
18	problem. And we can deal with both of those
19	issues at the exact same time. And Senator George
20	Maziarz, from Niagara Falls, who wants to have the
21	same Stand Your Ground law in New York State as in
22	Florida, needs to be stopped right now. Thank
23	you.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council
25	Member Rodriguez.

1	STATED MEETING 105
2	COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: First of
3	all, I would like to thank the Speaker and my
4	colleagues Melissa Mark-Viverito and Tish James
5	for their leadership in this. Second, I'd like to
6	invite those of you who are not Black and Latino
7	in this room or throughout the City, to please put
8	yourself in our shoes, to please look at those
9	experiences that we have when we have lost Leona -
10	- when we have lost Juan Rodriguez, Diallo,
11	Rodney King, Sean Bell, John Collado back in
12	September, and Trayvon Martin. I don't want to
13	see any White family going through this experience
14	that we've been going through. But when we are
15	here to call everyone is, first supporters to get
16	justice to Trayvon Martin, and also please, let's
17	deal with the reality. Let's deal with the
18	conditions that make ourespecially young people-
19	-to live in communities without feeling that we
20	are protected, to live and work in the street
21	where we don't see that we're being treated equal
22	to other people. So, I hope that we get justice
23	for Trayvon Martin
24	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:
25	[Interposing] Time.

1	STATED MEETING 106
2	COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ:but
3	also we have to close the gap, and also we're
4	calling on the Justice Department to continue the
5	investigation in Florida, but also to come to the
6	city and look at how the NYPD abuse their forces,
7	also at Stop and Frisk. Close to 700,000 Black
8	and Latino people
9	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE:
10	[Interposing] Time.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ:and
12	also abusing their power in the protests in the
13	Wall Street Occupation. Thank you.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council
15	Member Mealy.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Good
17	afternoon everyone. I want to speak today about
18	the troubling issue of guns in our community.
19	Many of us are wearing hoodies today to show
20	solidarity and support in the fight for justice
21	for Trayvon Martin. Trayvon Martin was killed by
22	a vigilante with a gun. Congresswoman Gabby
23	Giffords was horribly injured by a madman with a
24	gun. Last week, this weekend, cleaning a
25	community garden, I found a .9mm gun, and someone

1	STATED MEETING 107
2	else found a shotgun. It sickens me to think
3	about what might have happened if a young person
4	or a criminal had come across these guns. We have
5	to do all we can to remove guns from our
6	community. In Florida, Arizona, and in the
7	Brooklyn, and across this nation. I wear this
8	hoodie today as a sign of sympathy for victims of
9	gun violence, and of my commitment to the fight
10	against gun violence as we move forward. No
11	justice, no peace.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council
13	Member Foster.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Thank you.
15	I wasn't going to stand and speak, because I think
16	everyone has said everything and something
17	eloquently. But as a new mother, I couldn't sit
18	down, because I can't imagine losing my daughter,
19	and she's only 10-months old. So, my condolences
20	go out to the family of Trayvon Martin, and the
21	fact that they have to go through this. But I
22	want to say, and I think it's important that we
23	understand that racism is alive and well. And
24	when people talk about a post-race society, we're
25	not there. White boys are not killed for being

1	STATED MEETING 108
2	White, walking in a neighborhood with hoods. 88-
3	year-old White men are not pulled over like my 88-
4	year-old father is pulled over because he looks
5	suspicious. We have to start addressing these
6	issues and talking honestly about race. And we
7	have to start letting our Black boys know that
8	they are valued, that their life means something.
9	Because while police and vigilantes like Zimmerman
10	are killing them, we are killing each other. And
11	until they know that they are loved and valued and
12	comes from kings and princes and have a purpose on
13	this earth and that God was not on a lunch break
14	when they were made, they will continue to believe
15	that their life is worth nothing, so they can take
16	someone else's life. So, I hope when we take off
17	these hoodies, when we come back to work tomorrow,
18	that we are committed talking honestly about
19	saving our Black boys and Latino boys. Because if
20	not, our daughters are going to grow up and
21	they're not going to have husbands, and they're
22	not going to have anyone to create and build
23	strong Black and Latino families, because we're
24	going to be waiting on buses to go visit them in
25	prison. Thank you.

1	STATED MEETING 109
2	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council
3	Member Seabrook.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Thank you
5	very much, Mr. Chair. I think Helen Foster summed
6	it all up in what she said. And I didn't wear a
7	hoodie today; I wear one all my life on the basis
8	of the color of my skin. And if anybody believes
9	that Trayvon got stopped for a hoodie, there's
10	something wrong. Because as Helen said, White
11	kids wear hoodies too, but they don't get shot
12	like that. And I think thatthe reason I want to
13	respond to this is because one of my constituents
14	was killed. Ramarley Graham was my constituent
15	that lived not far from me. And we can't have
16	selective response to injustice. If we're serious
17	about injustice, then it's for everybody or for
18	nobody. We have not had a resolution for a guy
19	that lives in our neighborhood, and we're reaching
20	beyond. Not that I'm condemning it. I applaud
21	it, but I think that it's important that we also
22	take care of the folks at home. And so that
23	response has to be. And I would hope that we
24	would look at it. It is not about Stop and Frisk
25	as much as it's about racial profiling. Stop and

1	STATED MEETING 110
2	Frisk is not an issue. If a guy got a gun, he
3	should be stopped and frisked and everybody else.
4	It's you're selective about who you're stopping,
5	and it's called racial profiling. So let's not
6	let someone else give us the argument on the basis
7	of Stop and Frisk, and the real issue is racial
8	profiling. And let's deal with that issue. Thank
9	you very much.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: That's it
11	on the discussion of the resolution. All in favor
12	of preconsidered Resolution 1261, say Aye.
13	VOICES: Aye.
14	VOICES: Amen.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Amen. Any
16	opposition? Hearing none, the resolution is
17	passed. General discussion. Council Member
18	Dickens, did you still want a general discussion?
19	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Yes, thank
20	you. Just quickly. This is on preconsidered Reso
21	1255, which ensures that tenants that currently
22	receive preferential rent will have their
23	agreement extend throughout the duration of their
24	tenancy. It calls upon the CEO of the New York
25	State Homes and Community Renewal to amend the

1	STATED MEETING 111
2	rent stabilization code to disallow preferential
3	rents that are not for the duration of the
4	tenancy. It is also asking the state to amend the
5	code so that all preferential rent agreements are
6	amended to include the duration of the tenancy. I
7	want to thank the Speaker, the Speaker's staff,
8	and Benjamin Goodman and the rest of the
9	infrastructure division for working on this. I
10	ask my colleagues to support this preconsidered
11	reso. Thank you.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council
13	Member Jackson. Time to rise.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you.
15	My colleagues, I rise to askyeah, time to rise,
16	you're right. I rise in respect to Resolution
17	1263, a resolution submitted by our colleague, Al
18	Vann and myself, calling upon the State
19	Legislature to amend the State Education Law in
20	relation to Mayoral control of the New York City
21	School System, by requiring that the respective
22	community education councils approve a co-location
23	of a school closure or phase-out proposal before
24	it may be presented to the PEP, the Panel for
25	Educational Policy, which is comparable to the

1	STATED MEETING 112
2	citywide Department of Education. And I have
3	attended many PEP meetings where I have called
4	them a rubber stamp. And some people have said to
5	me they're less than a rubber stamp, because at
6	least a rubber stamp leaves an imprint. But
7	clearly when we talk about having the community
8	involved in the decision-making process, we need
9	to have CECs make a determination of a co-location
10	or a school closure within their own community
11	district boundaries. So, I ask all of you, if you
12	have not signed on already, to sign on to
13	resolution 1263 sponsored by our colleague Al Vann
14	and myself. Thank you.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Council
16	Member Foster?
17	COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Thank you.
18	I just wanted to, last Saturday on St. Patrick's
19	Day, I got into a car accident, actually a three-
20	car accident. And I just want to thank Chuck,
21	because I can do lots of things, but I'm a
22	panicker, so I panicked. But EMS was great, my
23	daughter was in the car. All of us were taken to
24	Harlem Hospital, and Harlem did an amazing job in-
25	-just beyond in terms of taking care of us, making

1	STATED MEETING 113
2	sure the baby was fine, and then calming my
3	husband and myself down, because the whole family
4	was in the accident. And I'm very appreciative.
5	Thank you, Chuck. Thank you, Chris. Thank you
6	Inez came to the hospital to see me. And
7	especially, special thank you to the EMS and the
8	Harlem Staff, because they did go above and
9	beyond, and made what was a horrible scary
10	situation much better. So, thank you.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Okay.
12	Council Member Williams?
13	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank
14	you. Just first, the continuation from my last
15	piece, I did want to thank all of my White
16	colleagues who wore hoodies as well, for showing
17	some solidarity. And I do hope when we're making
18	decisions in terms of budget and policy we
19	remember the speeches that were made here, because
20	I believe the same racism we're talking about is
21	pervasive in many of the decisions that are made
22	in where resources should go. I want to point to-
23	-some people on their desk may have had some
24	paperwork from a police package that I put in a
25	few weeks ago, a few months ago. If you have the

1	STATED MEETING 114
2	paperwork that means you're one who signed on. A
3	few people actually thought they were signed on
4	where they weren't. I have some resolutions that
5	I'm asking people to look at, please. Two of them
6	have to do with trying to curb the sugar problem
7	in our communities that is ravaging us. One of
8	them has to do with supporting the End Racial
9	Profiling Act of 2011. The other one is another,
10	a police bill, in relation to making the Police
11	Commissioner an elected position. I'm just trying
12	to find creative ways to get some accountability
13	from a department that I believe is not
14	accountable enough. I would ask people to sign on
15	so that we can push the conversation forward. And
16	I also would like to say, much of my ire is not
17	related to the many men and women, as I like to
18	call blue shirts, many of who want to do a good
19	job, are doing a good job. I believe they deserve
20	and should have better leadership from the top and
21	from the Mayor so they can perform their functions
22	better. Thank you.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Councilman
24	Gentile.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Thank you.

1	STATED MEETING 115
2	Those unemployed need not apply. That's what
3	we're reading more and more versions of in
4	classified ads today, and that's why Council
5	Member Comrie and I are introducing intro 814.
6	That intro will help stop that phenomenon of
7	discrimination against the unemployed, so I'd ask
8	you to take a look at it, because it really asks
9	the question, if you're otherwise qualified, how
10	does being unemployed make you ineligible for a
11	job. It's really counterintuitive and really
12	unconscionable. Really, the bottom line is that
13	any language in an ad that says unemployed need
14	not apply or anything like that is really nothing
15	less than another form of employment
16	discrimination. That's why this piece of
17	legislation, intro 814 that Council Member Comrie
18	and I are introducing, will effectively end this
19	perverse Catch 22 that has served only to deepen
20	our unemployment crisis here in New York City.
21	So, I ask all of you to take a look at that, 814,
22	and please sign on. And just one reminder. Take
23	a look at the flyer. Remember Library Day out
24	here in City Hall Park, next Statedbefore the
25	next Statedon April 18th.

1	STATED MEETING 116
2	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Finally,
3	Council Member Tish James?
4	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: All of the
5	comments here today with regards to this
6	resolution over Trayvon Martin really speak to the
7	pain that all of us are feeling and experiencing.
8	It's really therapeutic that we have an
9	opportunity to speak here this afternoon about
10	this tragedy and the ongoing tragedy in this city
11	and in our respective districts. Unfortunately a
12	couple of weeks ago Police Commissioner Kelly
13	stated that elected officials, particularly
14	elected officials of color, had no solutions to
15	the crime in our respective districts. That
16	remark went unchallenged. That remark was wrong;
17	it was inaccurate. Each and every Council Member
18	here in the City of New York has spoken out, has
19	funded prevention programs, has funded
20	intervention programs in their respective
21	districts. And so that statement, I thought,
22	should not have gone unchallenged, and
23	unfortunately the media did not put him on the
24	hook. And so I and others this weekend, we're
25	having marches in our respective districts,

1	STATED MEETING 117
2	marches against violence. I am having a march on
3	Good Friday with some members of the clergy in my
4	district and throughout the borough of Brooklyn.
5	We are marching through a number of public housing
6	in Brooklyn. I urge all of you to join me and
7	stop the violence, to get guns of the street, and
8	to give people hope and inspiration, and to
9	provide after school programs. Thank you.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Seeing no
11	others. I'm alsomy community is having a march.
12	I'm honored and privileged to coordinate with my
13	precinct council and other community groups this
14	Saturday at 10:00, starting on Linden Boulevard in
15	Community Board 12, Linden Boulevard and Francis
16	Lewis, proceeding to St. Albans Park. I invite
17	any members and any members of the public to
18	attend, because our communities across the country
19	are outraged, and my community in District 27
20	would like to celebrate. Seeing no others, the
21	meeting, the Stated Meetingoh, extension of
22	remarks? None. The Stated Meeting for March
23	28th, 2012, is hereby closed. Thank you.
24	[pause]
25	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Hello,

1	STATED MEETING 118
2	hello? Sorry. I have to do an update because
3	Council Member Mendez joined us, so I have to read
4	the General Order Calendar vote again. Sorry,
5	vote tally sheet. All itemscan I start? Can I
6	start? Okay. All items on today's General Order
7	Calendar were adopted by a vote of 50 affirmative,
8	0 negative, 0 abstentions, with the exception of
9	Land Use 559, Reso 1288 through Land Use 563, and
10	1292, which were adopted by a vote of 49
11	affirmative, 1 in the negative, 0 abstentions; and
12	M 749, Reso 1285, which was adopted by a vote of
13	47 in the affirmative, 3 abstentions; M 750 and
14	Reso 1286, which was adopted by a vote of 47 in
15	the affirmative with 3 abstentions; Intro 18-A,
16	which now is adopted by a vote of 46 in the
17	affirmative, 4 negatives, 0 abstentions; Intro
18	490-A, which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the
19	affirmative, 2 in the negative, 1 abstention, and
20	that is everything on today's general order
21	calendar. Thank you all for attending. And now
22	the Stated Meeting for today, March 28th, is
23	adjourned. Thank you.

CERTIFICATE

I, Erika Swyler, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

the life

Signature

Date _____4/11/2012_____