CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON VETERANS
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL RIGHTS

-----X

January 27, 2012 Start: 10:12 a.m. Recess: 12:15 p.m.

HELD AT:

Council Chambers

City Hall

B E F O R E:

JULISSA FERRERAS MATHIEU EUGENE Chairpersons

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Larry B. Seabrook
Julissa Ferreras
Margaret S. Chin
James G. Van Bramer
James Sanders, Jr.
Lewis A. Fidler
Vincent J. Gentile
Fernando Cabrera
Daniel Dromm

David G. Greenfield

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Vanny Chen Cousin of Danny Chen

Kwan Ang Board Member OCA New York

Christine Quinn Speaker

Thomas Krever Executive Director Hedrick Martin Institute

Lionelle Hamanaka Military Families Speak Out

William Gilson Veterans for Peace

Alec Schierenbeck Manhattan Borough President's Office

Iris Quinones Rep. Velazquez

Herb Ruben Project Director Veterans Mental Health Coalition of New York City

Stacey Latimer Founder/CEO Love Alive International

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

John K. Yang

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

)	CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS:	Good

morning. I am Julissa Ferreras and I will be chairing for the Committee on Civil Rights during today's hearing. Council Member Rose could not be with use here today because she is out on medical leave and we wish her quick recovery. I would like to thank Council Member Eugene, Chair of the Committee on Veterans for co-chairing this hearing with me. I would also like to thank Council Member Chin for introducing the important resolution that after hearing and considering witness testimony, the Committee on Civil Rights will vote on today. I would like to recognize that we are being joined by Speaker Christine Quinn who has been very supportive of this resolution and this issue. Resolution 1188 was drafted and introduced in response to the untimely death of Army Private Danny Chen who while serving in Afghanistan appears to have endured racially motivated harassment by his peers and superiors. It is clear that the military opposes discrimination and harassment. In fact, each branch of the military has detailed policy prohibiting such conduct. Unfortunately, however,

it appears that these policies may have fallen on
deaf ears. Private Chen's death is just one of
the recent reminders that we have been given
regarding this kind of behavior in the military.
Resolution 1188 speaks directly to that point.
Resolution 1188 calls on the Department of Defense
to examine its policies around cultural diversity
and sensitivity in an effort to prevent
discrimination and harassment within the military.
The hope is that this internal examination will
improve the daily lives of those serving our
country. I am pleased to be given the opportunity
to co-chair this hearing and to lead the Committee
on Civil Rights in its vote on Resolution 1188.
With that I would like to give my colleague,
Council Member Eugene, the opportunity to make a
statement. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: Thank you very much Council Member Ferreras. Good morning and welcome to the joint meeting of the Committee on Veterans and the Committee on Civil Rights. My name is Mathieu Eugene and I chair the Committee on Veterans. Before we begin, I would like to thank the Speaker for all her support for the

resolution. And also for her leadership in
addressing this very important issue. And I want
to thank all of you for being here. The Committee
on Veterans is here today to consider a Resolution
1188, which as you have already heard, call on the
United States Department of Defense to closely
examine its anti-harassment and anti-
discrimination policies and to impose more
effective and comprehensive training for
military personnel to prevent the discrimination
and harassment of all military personnel. Each of
the armed forces, the Army, Navy, Marines, and Air
Force have anti-harassment and anti-discrimination
policies. The Army's policies have fallen far
short of being effective. It is vitally important
both for the safety and wellbeing of servicemen
and women and for the effective operation of the
armed services that the Department of Defense
establish is zero tolerance policy for harassment
and policy. I want to express my sense of
condolences to the Chen family. We are grieving
with you and hope change to the military policy
comes swiftly. Thank you.

CHRISTINE QUINN: Thank you very

much Dr. Eugene and also thank you Council Member
Ferreras for stepping in for Council Member Rose.
I also want to thank Council Member Margaret Chin
who is not only the lead sponsor of today's
resolution as someone who has been standing with
the Chen family since this tragedy first happened.
And Margaret I just want to say I think without
your efforts, this tragedy would not have gotten
the attention that it has. So I want to thank you
so very much for that. And I also want to
recognize the efforts of Congresswoman Nydia
Velasquez who couldn't be with us today but her
office is who has also been standing shoulder to
shoulder with Margaret and the Chen family. I
want to recognize and thank the members of the
Chen family who are here. Suzanne Chen, Danny's
mother, Yin Chow Chen, his father, Lucy Chen, his
aunt, Vanny Chen, his cousin who will testify as
well as a number of other members of the family
who are in attendance. I also want to thank the
members of the advocacy community, the Asian-
American community, and the veterans and civil
rights community who are with us today for today's
hearing. I also want to thank the Chen family who

spent a few minutes before this hearing and gave	3
us the opportunity to meet with them privately.	
We very much appreciate that. You know, it is	
impossible for any of us to imagine the pain of	
losing your only child. But then to lose an only	ly
child under circumstances as tragic and horrible	9
as this. And I just want to say and I think I	
speak for all of my colleagues. Everyone in	
Danny's family has acted in a way that is	
courageous and brave and dignified and graceful	
And without your work and your outspokenness, the	ne
country would not know the problem of bullying a	and
harassment in the military. And as you said	
upstairs, you want to make sure this does not	
happen to anybody else. But no one could have	
blamed you if you said nothing after a tragedy	
after this. And I just want to thank you on	
behalf of really all of us in New York City for	
the tremendous courage you are showing at such a	Э
difficult time. Private Chen's death clearly	
appears to have been the result of racially	
charged harassment and bullying and it is good	
that the military has policies on paper. But is	E
all they are all policies on paper, then how are	3

they protecting the men and women who are out
there protecting us every day. And the point of
today's hearing and today's resolution is to keep
the pressure on the pentagon and the Department of
Defense and the military. We are asking men and
women to volunteer to put their lives at risk to
protect this country. It is an unbelievable
sacrifice and Danny made when hea top student
decided to join the Army. He and his family
should know and every member military family
should know that we are offering them as our front
line of protection the same protection they are
giving all of us as Americans. Danny was out
there every day fighting to keep us free as
Americans and what happened to him can only be
described as a terrible form of Un-American
behavior. I want to make sure the record reflects
that earlier today the Pentagon called the Deputy
Legislative Director, Alix Pustilnik of the City
Council. They said they were not able to prepare
testimony because they are preparing for
congressional hearings, but they wanted to make
sure that the City Council and the Chen family
knew they were aware of the resolution and the

hearing and wanted all the materials relevant to it sent to them. We stand at the ready to stand with all of you in the Chen family and support Margaret in her work and make sure that this effort doesn't end until the military has admitted what happened, put all the facts out there and has responded in a comprehensive way to make sure all members of the military are free from harassment or discrimination of any kind at all. We can't really call ourselves a free country if our troops are not free and safe as who they are. So I just want to thank everyone for being here today and just say this resolution is part of our efforts, whatever else we can do please just let us know.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you madam speaker. And now I would like to give an opportunity for Council Member Margaret Chin to have an opening statement.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you madam chair. And thank you Speaker Quinn. Good morning. I am Council Member Margaret Chin and I represent District 1, Lower Manhattan. I'd like to thank my colleague Council Member Julissa

Ferreras for serving in Council Member Rose's

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

absence and Council Member Mathieu Eugene for cochairing today's hearing. I want to especially thank Speaker Quinn for attending this hearing today and also for her unwavering support for the Chen family. In addition to Speaker Quinn, public advocate Bill Debazo (phonetic) and myself, 44 other members of the City Council have signed on to co-sponsor this Resolution 1188. This level of support from my colleagues is both amazing and humbling. Private Danny Chen's story and the resilience of the Chen family has touched New Yorkers across our city. The Chen family has joined us today. Danny's mother, Suzanne Chen, and Danny's father, Yin Chow Chen, as well as Danny's aunts and uncles and cousins. The Chen family has been so strong and I am honored that they are here today. Finally I would like to thank the council's staff for all their assistance for organizing today's hearing. The death of Private Danny Chen and the circumstances under which he died has galvanized the Asian-American community in New York. Danny was born in China Town and grew up on the lower east side. attended PS 130, middle school 131 in China Town

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

and graduated from Pace University High School. He was a patriotic young man who wanted to serve his country. Danny made his intention to enlist in the U.S. Army known to his family and friends early on. After serving his country, he planned to join the NYPD. His mother did not want him to go. His father said he was old enough to make his own decision. The only Asian-American in his unit, Danny completed basic training at Fort Benning, Georgia. The harassment and jokes about his ethnicity started almost immediately. According to Army investigators, after two months in Georgia, Danny's relationship with his platoon deteriorated. His correspondence home began to show signs of strain. After basic training, Danny was sent to Fort Wainwright in Alaska before being deployed to one of the most dangerous places in southern Afghanistan, Kandahar Province. On October 3rd, 2011, two months after being deployed, Danny was found dead of what the Army has called an apparent self-inflicted gunshot wound. He was 19 years old. Over the last three months, details have been to emerge regarding the circumstances of Danny's death. Army investigators have confirmed

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

that Danny was subjected to regular and extreme abuse and maltreatment prior to his death, including being belted with rocks, made to perform extreme amount of exercise, called ethnic slurs, and given excessive guard duties among other insults. While we may never know the full story of how and why Danny died, we do know that Danny was subjected to racially-motivated hazing and bullying prior to his death. This abuse was perpetuated by his fellow soldiers and ignored by his superiors. In the aftermath of Danny's death, servicemen and women across our nation have recounted their own experience with hazing and bullying while serving in the military. These personal stories and the testimony of the experts we will hear today, strongly suggests that Danny's experience was not an isolated one. I find it despicable that any young person serving our country should be subjected to discrimination and abuse by his or her fellow soldiers for any reason whether it is because of their race, gender, religion, sexual orientation, or anything else. It is the job of our military to protect American values such as tolerance and freedom, not destroy

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I also find it despicable that although them. charges have been leveled against eight soldiers in connection with Danny's death, just this week Army investigators recommended that one charge of involuntary manslaughter be dropped for a defendant in the case. This is unacceptable. The Army maintains they have zero tolerance for hazing and bullying but we demand more than just lip service. We demand action. We demand justice for Danny. The resolution under consideration today calls on the military to closely examine its policy regarding cultural diversity and sensitivity and to impose more effective and comprehensive training regiments for military personnel in these areas. Elected officials from U.S. Senate, House of Representatives, and this council have echoed the call for more transparency and accountability when it comes to hazing in our Armed Forces. Our goal is to prevent discrimination, harassment and the death of any servicemen or women because of how they look, sound, or any other personal characteristic. I want to thank all of you who have come here to testify today on this very important resolution,

б

particularly OCA New York for taking the lead on this issue and Private Danny's Chen's family who have agreed to speak during this difficult time.

Thank you again, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you

Council Member. I'd like to read into the record—

we have received a written statement from Speaker

Sheldon Silver in support of the message of the

Resolution 1188 and we will be begin by calling up

the first panel. Benny Chen, cousin and Vanny

Chen and Kwan Ang (phonetic) of OCA New York.

While our panel gets ready, we're going to be——I'd

like acknowledge that Council Member Danny Dromm

of Queens has joined us.

VANNY CHEN: Good morning everyone.

I am Vanny Chen. I am Danny Chen's cousin and I'm here today with Danny's parents and aunts and uncles to show our support for this resolution and to speak a bit about Danny himself. Danny was a first generation American. He volunteered himself to the Army but in October he had died in Afghanistan with unfinished goals such as being a police officer. I remember when Danny came back from basic training at Fort Benning, he had told

me all about his experiences and things he had learned. And I remember clearly one of the things he was taught was that there was to be open racism in the Army. It's strange now to find that Danny was hazed for being Chinese while he was in Afghanistan. The family and I are here today to hope that there will be reform in the Army so that nothing like this will happen to anyone else ever gain. Please don't let Danny's death be in vain. Thank you.

KWAN ANG: Good morning. My name is Kwan Ang. I am a board member of OCA New York. Founded in 1976, OCA New York is a non-profit civil rights organization dedicated to advancing the political, economic, social wellbeing of Asian-Americans. We are one of 80 chapters and affiliates nationwide of OCA. OCA New York has been community advocate combatting hate crimes, media accountability, voting rights, immigration reform, and language rights. OCA New York supports New York City Council Resolution 1188-2212 introduced by Council Member Margaret Chin. OCA New York is the lead advocacy organization seeking justice for Private Danny Chen, a 19 year

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

old soldier. After being hazed, Danny died at his Army base in Afghanistan on October 3, 2011. Starting with his funeral in China Town, OCA New York has supported and accompanied Danny Chen's parents every step of the way. We initiated an online petition in English and Chinese demanding a transparent investigation. The petition has generated over 5,000 signatures. We created a YouTube video titled, What Happened to Danny, that has been seen by almost 40,000 viewers worldwide. And we led a march from the Army recruitment center in China Town to a vigil at Columbus Park with 26 co-sponsoring organization and nearly 500 participants. Consequently, on December 21, 2011, the Army charged eight superiors including one officer with one or more charges ranging from dereliction of duty to involuntary manslaughter and negligent homicide. As a result of our united advocacy, a historic two hour meeting took place at the Pentagon between two top Army leaders and a contingency of local and national elected officials and Asian-American community leaders. U.S. Representative Nydia Velasquez and Council Member Margaret Chin were present. We discussed

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

the necessity for the following reforms. one, the command officer must be held accountable. It's the leadership at the top that must set the tone for zero tolerance policy against hazing and other forms of harassment. It is important to establish and actionable guidelines to ensure that command officers are on notice that there will be consequences if these bad behaviors that take place on their watch regardless of they were aware of the mistreatment. Number two, there must be community input into enlistee and officers - training. Few Asian-American enlist in the Army and enter academy. Knowledge of history including contributions made by Asian-American military personnel past and present are key to developing mutual respect in the Army for soldiers who have diverse backgrounds. - - experiencing diversity issues and combating hate crimes, we have offered to work with the Army to create an interactive video. This video would be mandatory for all members of the Army to view as part of its diversity training. Number three, there should be intervention at the recruitment stage of both enlistees and officers in the academy. There must

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

be greater intervention at the recruitment stage to illicit information regarding the prospective recruits attitudes toward diversity. If any member of the Army cannot - - respect because of racial dislike, we believe he or she is not fit to be in that role. OCA New York supports Resolution 1188-2012 more effective and comprehensive training of military personnel in cultural awareness, diversity, and sensitivity is needed. We support the resolution for the following reasons. The present system that is in place fatally failed Danny Chen. Danny was mistreated from his enlistment in basic training to his deployment in Afghanistan. The racial taunts during training was noted in his letters home and in his diary. In Afghanistan, Army investigators found Danny had been subjected to daily abuse by his superiors for nearly six weeks prior to his death. The abuse consisted of physical hazing, excessive work detail, and guard duty. Racial taunting with names like gook, chink, and dragon lady. And acts of humiliation, such as ordering him to give directions in Chinese to his fellow English speaking soldiers. He had rocks thrown at

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

his back where he was ordered to crawl over 100 He had bruises and cuts on his back when his sergeant dragged him over 50 meters of gravel. Investigators found evidence that the platoon sergeant and the leader were aware of this assault and chose not to report it. OCA New York has learned of numerous similar incidents. Three U.S. Marines are currently facing court martial for contributing to the death of 21 year old U.S. Lance Corporal Harry Lu. We have received complaints of military soldiers being hazed, retaliated against for filing complaints, racial taunt and delayed action by the Inspector General. OCA New York has received an outpouring of support and offers not to only help seek justice for Private Danny Chen but also stop hazing in the military. His case has generated interested from Beijing, England, and Australia to all over the country including Alaska, North Carolina, Seattle, and California. We are advocating that everyone contact their local representatives to introduce and pass similar resolutions. We applaud the New York City Council for taking the lead and being a role model for the rest of the country to follow.

2 | Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very much for your testimony. And now we are going to have an opportunity for some council members to ask questions. And this is actually addressed to OCA and then Council Member Eugene and Council Member Dromm both have questioning. And of course Madam Speaker.

CHRISTINE QUINN: Do you believe that the military's cultural sensitivity and anti-harassment training adequately addresses the unique needs and experiences of your community.

KWAN ANG: Evidently not because of this case and Lance Corporal Lu's case. And a lot of cases we haven't heard yet. So it's in the policy—the zero tolerance for hazing—but it goes on. So we believe the culture has a problem—the culture of the Army. We'd like to correct that culture.

CHRISTINE QUINN: Do you have any suggestions of how we can begin to improve the training. But also if there is someone who is listening to this testimony—a family member who may be receiving just like Danny did to his

family--what are you suggesting are the steps that they can take?

suggestions to the Army at the Pentagon as mentioned in my testimony. So if they followed that, I think it would be okay. A commanding officer must be held accountable. That sets the tone for the Army that, you know, this is not allowed, top down. Okay? There must be community input to enlistee or officer diversity training. We have some experience in training, so we should give some input—the community should inject input into the Army. And three there should be intervention at the recruitment stage of both enlistees and officers at the academy. We want to weed out bad officers that don't belong in the Army.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very much. And again, for the family, thank you for being so strong and for being here today. We do have further questioning. Council Member Eugene and then Speaker Quinn.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very much madam chair.

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

of the process, we want to learn a little bit more and have your testimony taken into the record. So some of the question may--we may ask you to say a lot of what you said already. But it's for clarity on the testimony. So we thank you for being here.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very much for your patience. I won't be long. I won't ask too many questions. But first let me commend and thank you, the cousin of Danny, and also the family members for your courage. And I know that it would be --. And I want to also--I want to say also the loss of Danny is not only a loss for the family members, but also it is a loss for New York. It is a loss for the country. we believe that regardless of what we are going to do, we cannot bring him back. But it is very important that we stand together behind him and to make sure the federal government do the necessary due diligence and take initial steps to review and upgrade the policies and others to prevent such thing to happen again. And to the cousin, I know that this is a horrible situation for you and

emotionally this is very tough for you. But as a young person what type of suggestion and advice-is there anything you would like to say, anything you would like to see happen in the military with regard of the treatment of the young soldiers.

VANNY CHEN: Like I said, I would hope that there would be reform in the Army because what happened to Danny was really severe and I wouldn't want anybody to go through what torture that Danny had gone through.

very much. Sir, I know that you have been advocate and you have been a wonderful—doing a wonderful job on behalf of your community and behalf of the people of New York. In addition to the resolution, what do you think that you can do together with the City Council. Is there anything that you believe that we can do by working together?

KWAN ANG: Yes. I think the City
Council can write to the House and the Senate for
a congressional hearing on hazing. And I think
Senator Gillabrand already did that. So I think
if everyone follows that would be additional

б

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

pressure for the Army to respond and correct the

culture of the Army. I'm not saying the policy is

not right. I'm saying it's great. The policy is

great, but let's do it, you know?

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very much. Thanks to both of you. Thank you madam chair.

CHRISTINE QUINN: We will absolutely, one, follow up with Senator Gillabrand's office and then, two, draft a letter and we'll circulate it at next week's dated meeting and I can't imagine we won't have anything but the vast majority of the 51 members who will sign it. Also, we can work with our community outreach staff and circulate our resolution to other city council's in New York State and across the country. We've done that on other initiatives and asked them to replicate it. So we'll work with Council Member Chin's staff on that as well to try to get a national drum beat going. One of you just used the word torture. And when you were detailing some of the things that happened to Danny like being dragged across gravel, having rocks thrown at him, that is actually the word

that popped into my head and weand appropriately
sodon't treat prisoners that way. And when
people are found to have treated prisoners that
way they are strenuously punished by the military
as they should be. That word, I think, it's
horrible to have to use it in the context of how
one member of the military treated another
American member of the military, but I don't
really think there is another word. I think that
is tragically the right word. I was wondering if
you could shareand I apologize for even asking
because I think it's painful, but I think it is
important for the record and the city to
understand any other information you have about
what Danny was forced to go through. Maybe
anything you've learned from his diaries or
anything like that.

KWAN ANG: We haven't received his diary yet.

CHRISTINE QUINN: Okay.

report and we're going to visit Dr. Henry Lee and ask for his comments. I just wanted to make sure about the word hazing. Hazing is used in the

KWAN ANG: We may never, but at

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 least this is a start.

3 CHRISTINE QUINN: Absolutely.

4 Thank you very much. Thank you madam chair.

5 KWAN ANG: Thank you Ms. Quinn.

Council Member Greenfield from Brooklyn.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you madam speaker. Now we will hear from Council Member Dromm and we have been joined by Council Member Seabrook, Larry Seabrook of the Bronx. And

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very much madam chair and Speaker Quinn. just so difficult for me to even begin this discussion because it is an issue that hits home so personally to me. I note to the speaker and I note to many of the members of this panel as well that have been victims of the type of harassment that Danny was subjected to. I'm a member of the gay community and gay service members were also killed in their tour of duty. And for many of us, this violates the principles that America stands for. And it was these principles that Danny went into the Army to fight for and to stand up for. And so to hear this--and when I heard it first on the news I was just outraged. I was filled with

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

anger and didn't really know what to do or how to express it. But we have wonderful representatives here. I was Margaret on television. I saw the speaker. And I'm also the chairperson of the Immigration Committee of the City Council. And the work that we have done here with the support of our speaker has been everything which is the opposite of what happened to Danny. We have tried to work to make this city a more tolerant place, a more accepting place, and by example show the rest of the country what should be done as well. me, basically what happened to Danny was a hate crime--nothing more, nothing less--because it was motivated by people's misperceptions of what it means to be Asian-American. And any time a hate crime happens, the community must come together, stand up, and speak out against this type of violence, against this type of treatment of a fellow American. And that's why I felt so compelled to be here today to listen and to hear the stories of the family and others who will testify so that the rest of America will know the type of pain that this causes to so many of us in the various communities that we represent. That

being said, I was dismayed to hear in the news-and I wanted to get your opinion about how
forthcoming the military was concerning the
details of Danny's death. I believe that these
soldiers should be prosecuted to the fullest
extent of the law possible. I am disheartened to
hear that the charges have been reduced and I
think one of the purposes of this meeting should
be to continue to press for full prosecution in
this case.

that they cannot talk about this case until-because it is under investigation. So that is one
issue I have. And the second issue is when they
respond they say they we have zero tolerance
policy in the Army. And they say zero is the
correct number. Then why is it going on, you
know? So they don't want to talk about the case
because the case is still ongoing at that time.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I find that answer to be unacceptable. I think we as elected officials needs to continue to fight to make sure that you get more information. We will be there to support you in that effort. That is part of

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

the reason we are having this hearing today, I

believe, to shine the light on what's going on and

to continue to keep pressure on the military until

the family gets the answers that they need and

deserve.

KWAN ANG: Thank you councilman.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you Council Member Dromm. We have been joined by Council Member Gentile. And also before Council Member Chin takes the mic for her questioning, I think there's something that at least touched me specifically and I'm an only child. And I know that Daniel was also. And not that if he had a sibling his death would have meant any less or more, but the fact that it's only children, we also have the responsibility of continuing our families and our culture and our history. And I think that it makes this loss that much more difficult that this family. This was the future that this nucleus had and to lose an only child is ten times as worse as anything. So Council Member Margaret Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. I just would like to ask Mr. Ang from OCA to give a

response. I mean when we met with them at the Pentagon, one of the questions we asked was how many soldiers of Asian background that die in noncombat duty. Because a lot of this information, it's not out there. And when we were speaking with the family earlier, if they've heard about it. I mean, I think parents would have to really reconsider if their sons and daughters are going to be treated unfairly in the Army and I think that's why those kind of statistics are important and was the Army--did they send us the information that we asked.

mentioned numbers, but they didn't want us to distribute it to the world. But they mentioned that since 911, there's 46 Asian-American suicides, six were homicides. But they said, don't send that out yet because we didn't verify that statistics. But we asked 25 questions--we gave them 25 questions, they responded. So we have to the response. We have the statistics in writing. So if you need a copy of that we can always send it to the press. But that it.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: But I think that's what is important in this case my fellow council member and the speaker. It's that a lot of family who have lost their kids--lost their sons and daughter--who didn't speak up or didn't know how to do it. Or didn't know what happened. We haven't heard about it.

KWAN ANG: It's probably--there are some Chinese-American's religion. Once the person is gone, is gone. And the religion may not allow them to hurt other people. So that's one case. And also they don't have maybe high educational background to even respond. So that's where we came in, you know, our organization.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: But I think with this case with Private Danny Chin that we are now beginning to hear of the story. I mean even just this morning when I met with the family, the two aunts have heard from other relatives that this happened to their kid a couple of months what happened to Danny. So I think it is so important for us to continue to mobilize and organize because we cannot allow our country to treat our servicemen and daughters, people who serve the

Army. They need to treated with respect and they need to be protected. So I really want to thank OCA for your lead. And Benny, I know it is very difficult, for you to talk about your cousin. But maybe you can share with us a little bit more about his hopes and aspirations so that we can truly honor his memory to make sure that this will never happen to any other family.

BENNY CHEN: Well, Danny had the aspiration of becoming a police officer, serving for New York City. I remember just thinking back from when we were little kids. We were sharing stories about who we wanted to be and I told him that I wanted to be a doctor. And he told that he wanted to be a policeman. I think it began from there.

CHRISTINE QUINN: I just want to--I apologize, I'm going to have to leave to go to another appointment. But Margaret I just wanted to underscore one thing you said, which is that silence breeds silence. And that the first time somebody breaks that silence in issues like this, you often then see a tidal wave of other information. So what has happened here is

2	incredibly significant because it's really the
3	first time that silence has been broken. And not
4	only I think are we going to hear many more
5	stories than we could ever have imagined that will
6	continue to shock us. It is really going to open
7	it up so people in the future know they come
8	forward. And that, in addition to the policy
9	changes we will accomplish, is going to really
10	also change the culture. I believe that people
11	who engage in this type of behavior whether they
12	are in the military or anywhere else, believe and
13	correctly that they will get away with it, that
14	they won't get caught and that nobody will care.
15	And the truth is it doesn't appear that anybody
16	did care in the military in the case of Danny.
17	Now we're saying that isn't the case anymore that
18	people are actually watching, that people are
19	going to look for this type of behavior and people
20	do care. And so the breaking of this silence is
21	an incredibly significant thing and the first real
22	step. So I just wantedthat was done by the
23	family and it isI can't even imagine how
24	difficult. So I just really want to thank you for
25	that.

б

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Thank you
madam speaker. And now we will be calling up the
next panel. Thank you so much for your testimony
and for giving voice to Danny. Thank you. The
next panel, we are going to call up Thomas Krever
from the Hedrick Martin Institute, Lionelle
Hamanaka of Military Families Speak Out, and
William Gleason from Veterans for Peace. And if
you can come up and speak in the order you were
called. While we set up the second panel, this is
just a reminder to put your phones on silent.
These hearings are being recorded and the cell
phone ringers pick up. We've also been joined by
Council Member Lou Fidler of Brooklyn. You may
begin your testimony.

extend my condolences. I'm so deeply sorry for your loss, deeply, deeply sorry. And I want to thank the city council for hosting and convening this and ensuring this for future generations should not happen again. My name is Thomas Krever. I'm the executive director of the Hedrick Martin Institute. It is the nation's oldest and largest LGBTQ youth service organization. I want

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

to thank the city council for the opportunity to testify before this committee on the vital issue of diversity in the Armed Forces. The Hedrick Martin Institute serves over 2,500 young people from over 300 zip codes throughout the greater tri-state area. And we know the value of diversity. Our nation, arguably the greatest nation this world has ever known, finds itself at a crossroads laden with challenges but also ripe with opportunity. Opportunities to embrace on an ever-deepening level the mantra of with liberty and justice for all, especially in the Armed Forces whose members are charged with the critical task of protecting our own inalienable rights. our work with LBGTQ youth from ages 12 to 24 years of age, HMI extols the values and virtues of embracing diversity whether it be racial, religious, gender identity, sexual orientation, or the many other threads that come together to make our society the greatest and most diverse on the planet. We teach our young people that by embracing diversity, their lives will be enriched, their opportunities increased and their worlds expanded. I firmly believe the same standards of

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

diversity practiced at HMI can also effectively be utilized and realized in the armed services. Military Leadership Diversity Commission established by our own Department of Defense defines diversity as all the different characteristics and attribute of individuals that are consistent with the Department of Defense's core values integral to the mission readiness and the accomplishment and reflect the country we This definition concisely captures two serve. fundamental arguments for diversity in any organization or work place. First, there is simply fairness. In this country we believe that it is wrong to discriminate. Second, diversity leads to improved performance and capability for groups and organizations and that's something we certainly want for our Armed Forces. A study by Thompson and Guler (phonetic) shows that when diversity is not managed effectively it can actively reduce capability most frequently through reduced communication and increased conflict. They also go on to write that effective diverse teams don't just happen. Rather they must be designed, implemented, and managed in order to

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

maximize the potential advantages and minimize the potential disadvantages. And these potential disadvantages are irreversible. When first approached to come before you today to speak on such a topic of diversity in the military, frankly I hoped that I would be able to offer some kernel of wisdom, some sort of knowledge. From my years of human services, I've seen up close the price that society pays when the respect for diversity is absent. As a former gang intervention expert, I learned firsthand how I could intervene effectively even with the most hardcore individuals whom society believed would never respect diversity around them. And I was able to alter their lives. First, exposing them to diversity and then by teaching them the tools to become comfortable and then finally embracing it. Private Danny Chen lost his life because he was in an environment that did not teach its members the necessity and value of diversity, thereby allowing them the most thuggish and dehumanizing of behaviors to become the accepted norm. Instead of seeking out and celebrating diversity and the differences as we do at HMI, a lethal environment

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

was created. I firmly believe that the military can truly learn from best practices such as HMI engages in on a daily basis with a population struggling to overcome the effects of bullying and bias because of the very thing that makes them so unique, their diversity. What we must do as a society is not just pay lip service to the ideals of diversity, but rather disseminate these proven interventions to as wide an audience as possible. This is more than a case of being politically correct. As we have seen far too often at HMI and has been so recently demonstrated by the tragic case of Private Danny Chen. We simply cannot afford as a society not to enshrine diversity as an ideal that stands beside life, liberty, and the pursuit of happiness. In a non-diverse society, there is no life, there is no liberty, and there is no happiness for those whose differences are not celebrated. After this convening, I will leave today. I will go back to my young people. I will look them in the face and I will be blessed for that encounter. I will look them in the eye and I will promise them that they will be kept safe, not only today, not only tomorrow, not only

2.

through their adolescence, but in the many years
that follow. I close by sharing with you two
fervent hopes I have for the future of both our
young people and our country. First, may those
young people who choose to serve in our Armed
Forces discover the same respect for and
celebration of diversity that they know here at
HMI. Second, may their diversity, which they
learned to cherish as a source of strength at HMI
be seen as source of strength my our own military
as well. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you for your testimony. And you may begin.

LIONELLE HAMANAKA: My name is

Lionelle Hamanaka. I'm a member of Military

Families Speak Out, a national group of families

related to soldiers who have served since 911 and

we are opposed to the war in Iraq and we're

opposed to war in Afghanistan. And anything I say

about the war is only because—will provide an

insight into maybe the objective conditions that

this incident happened. Military Families Speak

Out supports the Chen family, the Chinese—American

community, and joins the coalition to investigate

Private Chen's case. As family members of
soldiers, we experience the terror of wondering if
our kids will be killed by the enemy and to have
to worry about loved ones suffering because of
fellow members in the military is completely
intolerable. My two uncles were in the Second
World War. They were part of the $442^{ m nd}$ Battalion,
which received the highest level of honors, medals
for bravery in the entire history of the Armed
Forces in this country. My father was a medic for
a year. So we have contributed to Armed Forces in
the past. We recently saw on TV the photograph of
a soldier who died after 14 deployments to Iraq
and Afghanistan. On behalf of that fearless
patriot who responded to the call of a desperate
military with selfless sacrifice, we must point
out that the two million soldiers who have endured
multiple deployments despite some being
incapacitated by post-traumatic stress or other
injuries would never commit murder or abuse a
solder leading to suicide. Leaders like General
Colin Powell and General Eric Shinseki are
examples of hard won racial equality in the
military and I'm sure that they don't want their

2	legacy to be ruined. At this state of war Peggy
3	Coleman wrote, when their most basic beliefs about
4	right and wrong, conscience, compassion and
5	humanity are shattered, soldiers can be
6	transformed in malignant ways. Some of them urge
7	to destructive behavior will be directed outward.
8	Danny Chen's death was a terrible blow to American
9	democracy. The New York Times reported that
10	military suicide and rape rate is at an all-time
11	high. If we care about our military and our
12	national security, we must care about Daniel Chen
13	and the crimes of omission or commission by
14	privates or officers and not let violent offenders
15	into the service. Because the recruiters get
16	perks and bonuses for recruiting a lot of people
17	and sometimes they may overlook or allow people
18	that have been violent in the past into the Armed
19	Forces. The original goals Bin Laden's of Al
20	Qaeda have already occurred. The American people
21	are tired of war. According to the Army Times, 52
22	percent of U.S. troops do not believe the way in
23	Afghanistan will succeed. I only mention this
24	because it creates an environment where soldiers
25	sometimes do commit terrible crimes. In Vietnam

soldiers wore strings of ears that they had taken off the enemy around their belts. In the war in Korea soldiers threw babies up in the air and captured them on the tips of their bayonets. So sometimes war crimes are committed. It is a tragedy that any soldiers of our Armed Forces should dishonor it be victimizing an American hero like Daniel Chen who represented the best of our youths. Military Families Speak Out stands with you.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you for your testimony. You may begin.

Gilson. I am an officer of Veterans for Peace, chapter 24 in New York City. To the City Council, I say thank you for your efforts and what you are doing. To the Chen family I am extending my deepest sympathies. I would like to now read a statement that Veterans for Peace has made.

Chapter 34 of Veterans for Peace stands today in solidarity with the family of Private Chen and the entire Chinese-American community in endorsing Resolution 1188 to be sent to the Department of Defense and the U.S. Army. It is especially sad

to honor the beloved member of Private Danny Chen,
one of the best of his community. For the better
part of a year, I and other members of our chapter
held a weekly vigil in front of 143 Chamber
Street, the U.S. Army recruiting center, urging
the recruiters to be honest and truthful in
advertising Army careers. Today, we call upon
that same department of the Army to revisit and
change its deplorable attitudes on culture,
racial, ethnic, sexual, and religious sensitivity
towards its members. Let us no longer accept the
stock reply, this is a result of a few bad apples.
What we are dealing with is the systematic problem
of many barrels of bad apples. This insensitivity
starts at the very top and filters down. It is a
culture of wanton disregard for individual human
rights. Veterans for Peace joins the outcry to
end military abuse. Veterans for Peace demands
justice and will settle for nothing less. Thank
you.
CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you
very much for your testimony. We have some

CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: Thank you very

questions. Co-chair Eugene.

much, madam chair. I just want to thank all three of you for your testimonies and to Lionelle, I want to commend you and thank you for being here today. I know that you are a strong advocate for our veterans. Every time that we have a public hearing regardless of the topic, you have been always here coming in to support our veterans and to testify. And I know also you have a son in the Army and you are a mother also. I know how deeply you are affected by the situation. But I commend you for that. And to Bill, thank you also for the wonderful job you are doing and thank you for being here. Let me ask you one thing, have you met with a service member who have shared similar story of abuse as reported by Danny Chen.

BILL GILSON: I have not directly or personally, but I know--I read. And I know we are informed as a veterans organization and we happen to be a very progressive one. Most of the facts that happened around this entire issue, sad to say, are kept secret. And if it isn't for brave families, like the Chen family, speaking out and people on the city council like Council Member Margaret Chin trying to push for answers, nothing

ever happens. Right now, one in three women in the United States military, across the board, are being sexually abused. That's not a figure out there for many people to read. It's certainly not going to be in the New York Times. But this is the reality of what is going on in the armed services. They have a dirty act to clean up and it's a big problem. That I do know

advice would you have for soldiers or veterans who have been facing abuse like Chen? Is there any advice you would like to give them or something you would want to say in case of veterans or servicemen or women are facing those type of abuse? What do you think they should do? How do you think that they should handle the situation?

BILL GILSON: Well, I think it is easy to say follow the chain of command, go see the chaplain, all the quick simple solutions that most of the services offer. The saddest thing is it doesn't work. There is a cover up at the very top. That's what happens. So what do you do? I would say try to get your family members engaged. Try to write you political leaders and get them on

United States military. I think we all should be aware of the fact that what just has happened with six Marines with pictures of people urinating on the so-called enemy. This is what has happened in the United States military. And we, if we do not speak up, are allowing it to just continually be done over and over again. This is our job to change the culture, to put the pressure on where it belongs and to change and hopefully prevent this from ever happening again.

CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: What do you think should be put in place to prevent harassment or tragedy like this one to happen again?

Commission or any type of structural system. You believe that it should be put in place to prevent such tragedy and to eliminate harassment of our service men and women.

BILL GILSON: The system is broken, plain and simple. We have to demand accountability. People have to be brought trial, found whatever-guilty-heard and prosecuted. We are not up to this task, not at all. We have just-this week again-passed comment on six

24

25

2	former Marines in 2005 that killed over 24
3	innocent Iraqis in their night clothes. Every
4	charge has been dismissed. The worst that can
5	happen to the sergeant that led this massacre is
6	that he will be reduced to Private. That is
7	wrong. I have a problem with that. I think we
8	all should have a problem with that.
9	CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: Thank you very
LO	much, sir.
11	BILL GILSON: Thank you.
12	CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: Thank you
13	madam chair.
L4	CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you.
15	And now we will have questioning by Council Member
16	Dromm.
L7	COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you
18	very much. I wanted to just go back to Mr.
19	Krever. In your testimony you said that we must
20	do as a society is not just pay lip service to the
21	ideals of diversity. I feel that the Armed Forces
22	has just paid lip service. They have this ideal

of American inclusivity that is not always really

there. I'm wondering what your feelings are on

that. I'm wondering if the Armed Forces has ever

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

reached out to an organization such as your or any of the other organizations that are represented here to do any cultural training, sensitivity training, or in any way, shape, or form help people to change their inner feelings.

THOMAS KREVER: Thank you Council Member. Well, I want to say the first thing and also to counsel Council Member Eugene is the fact that no one in this room can tell us or tell you-answer your question on what is the process in terms of transparency within the military is an indictment in and of itself. So if I may, I have--which I do think answers and you'll call me if it doesn't on it. There are several things and the tragedy is that there are so many things that could have, should have, and still need to be done. And so it's transparency of the current state. Right? So where are we now? Where's the military now? What is the curriculum they use? What is the program that they use that really directly addresses this? It's using that curriculum whether it exists or not if not creating it. But how are the various stakeholders who need to be engaged to ensure this cultural

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

competency, to address all this -isms and the phobias however they may manifest. It's zero tolerance so that if and when this happens there is immediate swift consequences proportionate to the situation or incident. It is clear support for victims, for the victims' families, and for the greater community. I think what you are witnessing here to today is the lack or the realization from the military that this does not just affect one family or one particular group. So what are the services that are in place codified to ensure the entire community is also supported. It is education and, yes, rehabilitation when possible of the bully, of the hazer. We are hopeful when we look at it as ignorance and an opportunity to educate. hopeful that is the case. It's ongoing. And this is key. This is where many will fall short. ongoing and consistent diligence by military to support and ensure that the lip service ends. that there is an active lull and active clear cut path that the community can accountably watch, be involved in and ensure that measures are taken. It's education of the greater community so that we

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

do know what the process is to halt such tragedies in the military. And it's retraining of the officers at all levels of government and military to recognize the incident, to stop the incident and to know what to do about it. And what resources to utilize. Your second question, no they do not directly engage at the Hedrick Martin Institute and one of the things that we have done at HMI is ensure--to your point which I think is absolutely on point--that our young people do realize what's beyond the commercial in terms of those 30 seconds of joy and serving on a tropical island somewhere, that they have the realization of what they are getting into. We're not antimilitary by any means. We just want them to have a full education and understanding of who and what they are enrolling in.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: How important is transparency to the process you are describing because what I am hearing from the testimony so far is that there has been no transparency in terms of what the Army has found out, in terms of what they are doing, in terms of what they've done in the past. How important is

2 transparency?

THOMAS KREVER: I think it is no less than critical with any systemic issue that we deal with, in this case the military. I do want to appreciate the healthy stress—or, yeah, the stress between transparency and the necessity for not being transparent particularly with the military. But I think it does not let the military off the hook so to speak around their responsibility to actively work with the community to find those areas that can and must be transparent and then fully commit the resources to ensuring that dialogue happens.

What I heard from the news reports is that initially there was much resistance to any transparency at all. And I believe that when those types of things happen, it sends a message to the perpetrators of these types of crimes that there will be some type of cover provided to them. Would you agree with that?

THOMAS KREVER: The psychology is absolutely there. It sends a message to the bully that they will protected, that they will be

guaranteed a level of safety that they should nothave. And that this too shall pass.

in the gentleman's testimony before—I'm sorry I believe it was from OCA—the lack of transparency with that organization and other organizations that are trying to get information about what exactly happened her is evidence of that. And that lack of transparency to me makes this hate crime as I called it before even worse than it has to be.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you

Council Member Dromm. And we have also been
joined by Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer of

Queens. This is a question for Mr. Gilson. Do
you think that the lack of diversity at the top
ranks of the military contributes to the cover up
or quote-unquote cover up at the top that you
mentioned.

BILL GILSON: I think it has a lot to do with it. And also I think you could put any program into effect and if you don't enforce it and you don't monitor it, and you don't make the results of what's going on transparent, it's

2	doomed.	And I	I think	that	in a	a lot	of	cases	that's	S
3	just what	t is l	nappenin	ng in	the	milit	cary	r. It	's all	
4	 window di	ressin	ng.							

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Now in your experience, what can we do as a community as elected to encourage this diversity at the top ranks that I think is so vital to how we move forward?

with you more that we do need the diversity and we need the pressure from the community. That's what we do need. To ask our elected officials to bring forth the means by which—be it resolutions, be it bills—to make the military do the right thing.

And then make sure that they are doing the right thing because they don't do it very well.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very much for your testimony. And actually we have a question from Council Member Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you for your testimony. Mr. Gilson, a question for you. I know we are talking a lot about obviously things that need to happen in terms of diversity in the ranks and more training. I have

2.

to tell you though from where I sit from my
vantage point, I mean, this just seems to me to be
sort of good old fashioned racism, good old
fashioned discrimination, good old fashioned
sexism. And so when we speak of lip service, I
think it is worse than lip service. Because in
fact, in my opinion, I think what we see here is
complicity by the military in these situations.
What's your perspective on that?

BILL GILSON: I would agree with you. I've think you've nailed it. That's exactly what is going on. Right now with the Don't Ask Don't Tell, everybody believes that fight is over. Well, guess what? Transgenders right now in the United States military are still being discriminated against and they are not part of Don't Ask, Don't Tell. So again it is nothing more than a cover up and until these people, the Pentagon, the Department of Defense are pushed to the wall literally and made to do the right thing, they are simply not going to do the right thing. And it is a cover up, as you say, just for everything that is bad that is out there. The racism, the hatred, the denial of human individual

rights, that is what is going on in the United

States military. And to deny that is to be on

another planet.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I want to thank you. I want to thank all of you for your testimony. I want to thank the Chen family, you know, for myself as an observer just processing the information is really shocking and appalling and I want to thank you for your bravery. And I want you to know that as elected officials we are going to do everything we can to ensure that something like this never happens again.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you for your testimony. And I want to call up our next panel. Alec Schierenbeck of the Manhattan Borough President's Office and Iris Quinones of Representative Velazquez's office. This is a reminder to the committee members, we are going to be voting on a resolution. We are asking if you can summarize your testimony so that we can make sure we get this vote in.

ALEC SCHIERENBECK: Sure. My name is Alec Schierenbeck. I'm here on behalf of Manhattan Borough President Scott Stringer to

IRIS QUINONES: Good morning. My

name is Iris Quinones and I'm here on behalf of
Congresswoman Nydia Velazquez to testify in
support of Council Member Chin's resolution on
hazing. First I want to extend my condolences
again to the Chen family on behalf of
Congresswoman Velazquez. Thank you for the
opportunity to comment on this vital topic. Let
me commend Speaker Quinn and Council Member Chin,
Eugene, and Rose for offering this resolution,
which I urge the council to adopt swiftly.
Following the tragic loss of Private Chen, all New
Yorkers and indeed Americans everywhere are
focused on ensuring our fighting men and women are
protected from hazing and abuse. Private Chen's
loss is a profound tragedy not only for his
family, but for the entire China Town community
and all of New York. We owe it to Danny's family
and all of those who knew him to ensure that there
are protections in place that prevent future
incidents of hazing and abuse. The loss of any
soldier due to inadequate hazing protections
should be an outrage. But it is particularly
disturbing when incidents of hazing are motivated
by racial or ethnic prejudice. Immigrant and

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

minority communities comprise a significant part of our fighting forces. With minorities making up 30 percent of active duty forces or 517,000 personnel. The United States Army was a pioneer in the 1950s in moving towards racial integration and today maintains a reputation as one of society's most diverse institutions. When young people from the minority community contemplate joining the service, they should have confidence that their background will not make them a target for harassment or unfair treatment. This is vital not only from the standpoint of fairness, but also to ensure that our military continues drawing from as broad a pool of talent as possible. resolution before the city council correctly calls the Department of Defense to closely examine its policies surrounding cultural diversity and sensitivity, to improve training in this area for military personnel. It is clear to be that the military needs a top down review at its practices in this area. In that regard, I recently joined with Senator Gillabrand in writing to the Secretary of the Army. Our letter asks a series of important questions regarding the Army's

policies toward hazing. Among other questions, we want to know whether the Army is tracking how many cases of hazing occur each year, when they last reviewed their hazing policies, and how antihazing training is emphasized in basic training. It is important for all of us to fully understand the Army's hazing policies so we can press for the improvement and see any gaps in these protocols closed. The resolution before the council will honor Danny Chen's memory by preventing future incidents in discriminatory hazing. I urge you to pass the resolution immediately. Thank you again for the opportunity to present my views.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you for your testimony. Since they are giving testimony representing their members, we are not going to open it up to questioning. So thank you. We're going to be calling up our next panel. This is our fourth and final panel. So after this panel we will be calling up the vote. Mr. Herb Ruben, Veterans Mental Health Coalition of New York City. Mr. Stacy Latimer, Love Alive International. And Mr. John K. Yang. While they're coming up to testify, we have received

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Legal Defense Network. Judy Chu, Chair of the

Congressional Asian Pacific American caucus in

support of Resolution 1188. You may begin your

testimony in the order you were called.

HERB RUBEN: Thank you. My names is Herb Ruben. I'm the Project Director of Veterans Mental Health Coalition of New York City. Our organization was co-founded in 2009 by the Mental Health Association of New York City to promote the mental health and wellbeing of New York City service members, veterans and their families through education, information, collaboration, and the promotion of a comprehensive array of services. The coalition has established a subcommittee on efficacy called the Veterans Action Committee of New York City on whose behalf I'm speaking today. I'd like to add that I am a veteran myself, having served 32 months with the 1st Marine Division between 1943 and 1946 including combat service in Okinawa. tragic and untimely death of any veteran fills us with sadness and mobilizes action. I'm certain that it is in this spirit that Resolution 1188 is

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

being advanced. I'm equally certain that the Department of Defense will want to recognize and embraced the intent and the purpose of this resolution. It's important to note that largely as a result of our involvement in Iraq and Afghanistan all branches of our military have devoted increasing time to developing cultural training for operational readiness. Such training is primarily related to understanding the cultures and customs of Muslims and the Arab world. For example, U.S. Army intelligence at Fort Huachuca in Arizona has created an 80 hour program in cultural awareness for other military facilities. This focus is largely outward in knowing more about the culture of those with whom we're fighting. It is generally presumed that within our own ranks, we have whites and blacks and Latinos and Asians and Muslims, if only out of necessity have learned to live with one another, know one another and will cover each other's back. However, military personnel sometimes can also be brutal in seizing upon a weakness they perceive in another member of the unit making life difficult if not miserable for that individual. While this

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

may be played out with prejudicial comments, what is needed I believe is less related to cultural training but more related to addressing the power and what I call the sport of putting someone else down and defining who is in and who is outside of the unit. The person who is being victimized under these circumstances may be too afraid to bring his or her grievance within the chain of command. For his or her protection, something else is desperately needed. For example, an ombudsman attached to the division to whom the victim can turn in safety. I also want to bring to the attention of committee members a significant news release this last week. Army Vice Chief of Staff General Peter Chiarelli at a Pentagon news conference announced that "suicides among soldiers in the active duty guard and reserve total 278 last year, down 9 percent from 2010." Chiarelli added, "I think we've at least arrested this problem and hopefully will start to push it down." Chiarelli was releasing a 200-page report for commanders, health care providers, and other military leaders meant to assess the physical and mental health condition of the force,

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

disciplinary problems, and any gaps in how the Army deals with them. It follows up on a 2010 report that said that the Army was failing some soldiers by missing signs of trouble or by looking the other way as commanders try to keep up with tight deployment schedules needed to fight in both Iraq and Afghanistan. Chiarelli said commanders are getting more troops into substance abuse programs, are kicking more out of the service for misconduct, and are barring others with alcohol and drug convictions from joining in the first place. But General Chiarelli can only speak for the Army and not the other branches of military service. This statement reflects a sensitive and compassionate awareness of the issues inspiring Resolution 1188. I urge members of the committee on Civil Rights and Veterans to obtain a copy of General Chiarelli's 200-page report and to find some hope in the steps being taken so that the tragedy that brings us together today cannot occur again. Thank you for the opportunity to testimony.

STACEY LATIMER: Good morning to Speaker Christine Quinn who invited me to come to

2	the New York City Council Committee on Civil
3	Rights and Committee on Veterans to the Chen
4	family. My name is Stacey Latimer. I am a
5	resident of Brooklyn, New York. I am the CEO and
6	founder of Love Alive International, a faith-based
7	non-profit organization committed to empowering
8	individuals and communities who are pressed by
9	structures, systems, and cultures to develop a
10	comprehensive and sustained approach to combat
11	health disparities, such as HIV/AIDS and create a
12	health and social system that treats people
13	equitably and produces conditions in which all
14	people can achieve optimal health. I am the
15	senior pastor of Love Alive International
16	Sanctuary of Praise, a worship center of New York
17	City, a non-denominational group of believers that
18	honor the teachings of Jesus Christ. I am here
19	this morning in support of Resolution 1188, which
20	calls on the United States Department of Defense
21	to closely examine its policies around cultural
22	diversity and sensitivity among military personnel
23	following the tragic death of New York City Army
24	Private Danny Chen. Yet another young person's
25	life senselessly cut short at the expense of other

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

biases and hate. In a land of the free, this is unacceptable. As a veteran of the United States Army, a same gender loving man of African descent and an HIV positive resident of the United States, I am an ideal candidate to bear witness of the need for the U.S. Department of Defense to closely examine its policies around culture diversity and sensitivity. And do more to help to prevent discrimination and harassment among military personnel following this tragic death. Racism, bullying, sexism, homophobia, and abuse of power by superiors should not be tolerated anywhere at any time. Yet we understand that injustice and corruption grown like cancer in every sector of our culture and society whether it be personal, business, corporate, and military of which, if not regulated becomes a destructive force. I entered the Armed Forces October of 1985. My first encounter with misuse of power was from my drill sergeant who was determined to have inappropriate sexual relations with me. One of the methods by which he instigated this was placing me on CQ duty alone that he might have a chance to make his sexual advances without witnesses. A very

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

difficult time for me of which I did not trust that people would believe me and that I would be made to be the bad person or the evil one. Another incident was during my permanent party assignment. I worded in PAC, which is the Personnel Administrative Center at Four Story in Virginia Beach, Virginia. PAC was the place all information was routed through whether it was medical, personal, and professional. And even though confidentiality was a part of protocol, it was rarely kept for people talk, especially about our personal and our religious convictions. also necessary to remember that when individuals are transferred from one department, battalion, or base that the consumer files may stay in the file cabinet and are not part of the transfer. But the information obtained travels with the individual's trust or lack of trust. And in some cases that can be deadly. I received my HIV diagnosis while on active duty and after working in PAC I knew that information would easily and quickly circulate among my colleagues. Once the word travelled, it wasn't my colleagues per se that posed most of the problems, but my superiors

within the chain of command that posed the
problems. When I received my HIV diagnosis my
commander was a Lesbian. I believe that not only
her nurturing qualities as a woman played a role,
but also her being a part of the same gender
loving community provided her the capacity to be
sensitive to the stigma and cultural nuances I
faced. She and I were able to work around my
diagnosis without me leaving my job allowing me
the opportunity to continue doing my job
exceptionally well. But when the command changed,
the new commander who obviously had a problem
either with my HIV status or my sexuality. Out of
nowhere all kinds of things began to happen
without him having to be accountable. The first
time I made acquaintance with him was at 5:12 a.m.
in the morning as he yelled at the top of his
lungs while standing over my bed, you are not
special. You will get up and be in formation in
seven minutes. And that was due to the fact that
prior to the command change, my commander and I
had worked out a schedule that could work around
my health issues as well as keeping me employed.
As an employee of PAC, I had access to enough

resources that allowed me the ability to travel to 2 Walter Reed Army Medical Center for help. 3 infectious disease staff of the hospital 4 5 intervened. After a conference call that consisted of a psychiatrist, psychologist, my 6 commander and other administrative staff, infectious disease felt it necessary for my safety 9 and wellbeing that I not go back to my command due 10 to harassment that was audibly through the 11 conversation my commander bluntly said that if I 12 was sent back that he would get me. I was 13 admitted to Walter Reed ward 52 and soon that 14 ward, which was basically developed for people who 15 had long term illnesses that could take care of 16 themselves was now packed with people or either 17 had AIDS or HIV. And on that ward we were 18 stigmatized. The ward throughout the whole 19 hospital was known as the AIDS ward. There were 20 many levels of discrimination that were degrading 21 and humiliating. And of course this was years 22 Today I support Resolution 1188 which calls 23 the Department of Defense to closely examine these 24 policies. I do this not because I am angry over 25 something from yesterday for their will always be

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

a yesterday to things that need and must be changed in order that the humanity and rights to privacy and liberty be guaranteed as the constitution has ordered. Hopefully this will help this become real for many people. We all have come far and long enough on this journey to comprehend we cannot legislate love. I cannot or can you make people care for and love one another. As an act in response to the preservation and honor of life itself, which is a precious gift from god, we must do what is within our power to set standards for justice in a culture where corruption and hate are spewed at people over and over again without aggressive intervention. Leaving the individual with what they feel is no hope. But we--you can do your best through the regulations, guidelines, and laws to effect immediate change. Change can affect and curve the tide of abuse and harm. Resolution 1188 is a step in the right direction. It is pro-life. As a 23 year plus participant with the Jackson Foundation, which is HIV/AIDS research through military medicine, I am afforded an opportunity to participate and facilitate group sessions with HIV

2	positive active duty soldiers on an ongoing basis.
3	Several are testifying to being separated from
4	their peers doing various exercises to be
5	humiliated and degraded. Many of their
6	testimonies will make you wonder if we are still
7	living in 1987 at a time when HIV was justwe
8	didn't know what it was, whether it was airborne
9	or so forth. There are soldiers in 2012 living in
10	a mental hell as they serve their country while
11	they endure stigma sometimes violence, racism,
12	sexism, homophobia, and abuse of power. I believe
13	that Resolution 1188 is not the means to the end
14	of all these problems, but this is a step in the
15	right direction of protecting the precious rights
16	of all as we honor the diversity within the makeup
17	of community and humanity.
18	CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very much for your testimony. And you may begin sir.

JOHN YANG: My sincerest sympathies and condolences to the Chen family. Ladies and gentleman of the New York City Council, I would like to extend my appreciation and gratitude to New York City Councilwoman Margaret Chin.

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: I'm sorry.

3 Can you please state your name for the record?

JOHN YANG: My name is John Yang.

5 I would like to extend my appreciation and gratitude to New York City Councilwoman Margaret 6 Chin for making me aware of this hearing and for providing a formal letter for me to attend to 9 provide testimony about my experience of abuse, discrimination, harassment, and maltreatment while 10 11 on active duty service with the United States 12 Army. Before I provide my testimony, I would like to voice my concerns. I'm concerned about my 13 14 safety and the safety of my family because on January 23rd, 2012, when I visited this building 15 16 and this office to retrieve the formal letter of 17 invitation from Ms. Margaret Chin's office, the 18 same evening I received a harassing phone call 19 which could be construed as threatening, which 20 indicates that my email communications may have 21 been intercepted or my telephone conversations may 22 have been intercepted. Or somebody in this 23 building notified somebody on the outside of my 24 visit and intention to attend this hearing to provide testimony or a combination of the three 25

aforementioned scenarios or all three of the aforementioned scenarios could have occurred. I did not notify anyone that I intended to attend this hearing to speak and provide testimony about my experience. Therefore, because my concerns for my safety and the safety of my family, I would like to have on the record that I will be provided immunity and protection for my testimony because my testimony has far-reaching implications and serious ramifications. The same implications and ramifications facing the Marines and soldiers that mistreated Lance Corporal Harry Lu and Private Daniel Chen. Unfortunately, Lance Corporal Harry Lu and Private Daniel Chen cannot be here to testimony about their experience.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: This is a public hearing, so your testimony will be made public because it is recorded. But if you do have concerns and we still want to hear your testimony, perhaps we can do it at a private meeting. But that's a decision you will have to make. But the reality is that this is a public open forum and we would not be able to offer you those protections that you are seeking. Perhaps if we schedule a

private meeting, we are able to make arrangements.

am not prepared to provide testimony and speak in this public forum. If one of the council members could state on the record if they can say quote,

John Yang you will receive immunity and protection for the testimony that you will provide for the abuse and discrimination and harassment that you experienced during your active duty service with the U.S. Army. But since you had said that it's better left for a private meeting or forum, then I think that would be better.

are no--as members we cannot offer you that at this opportunity. So perhaps you can reach out and we can follow up with you on a private--listening to your perspective and your opinion on a private matter. Thank you though for taking the time and sitting through the hearing for the testimony. Do my colleagues have any [pause]. Council Member Eugene--and prior to the co-chair testifying, I just want to say I really appreciate both of your testimony. It always adds the substance that we need and the teeth to hear

especially from former military and present
military. It always makes a difference for us as
elected. Council Member Eugene.

much madam chair and thank you to all three of you for your courage and for your testimony. Thank you very much. Mr. Ruben, in your testimony you said that military personnel are sometimes—can also be brutal and seize upon a weakness that are perceived in other members of the unit and making life difficult. Based on your experience and your expertise, what do you believe that can be done to prevent such things to happen?

HERB RUBEN: I think we ought to recognize that many members of the military are relatively young. They're maybe 18, 20, 22 years of age. But they all grew up here in our cities. We need to take a look at whether we've done a very adequate job of being able to deal with those issues within our school system. Throughout community lives and the diversity that New York City represents, we find the same kind of picking on a putting people down. While it often may be expressed around racial or religious terms, I

don't believe that's the real issue. The real issue has to do with the need to elevate one's sense with a greater sense of power, the need to engage with others in what I call—it's a sport, that's a very poor term. But it does become a sport to gang up on someone else. I think it may be a mistake to place the emphasis on the cultural training. I don't think that's the issue. I mean, throughout our school systems and throughout the military, people with diverse backgrounds get along very well together. I think we have to recognize that it's a universal issue that doesn't start in the military, but it really starts here within our own communities.

CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: We know that training is not the only--has not been the only--situation. As we speak, probably there are many, many other soldiers who are in the same situation. We know also prevention is the best thing in medicine, in life. When you are able to prevent, this is cheaper, this is more effective. So in terms of prevention, is there anything that you can add?

HERB RUBEN: Yeah, I put forward an

idea because I don't think one can rely upon the military chain of command. One would hope that they would act, but in many instances they won't. Or in many instances the person that is being victimized will be afraid of going up that chain of command. I'm suggesting the possibility of an ombudsman being created for a division or a battalion. Someone who has the ability to be able to listen to the person who is being victimized and has the authority to take some action. It's a concept that we use in our civil life and it's a concept that often works very effectively.

much. Also, in your testimony you say that the person who is being victimized under these circumstances may be too afraid to bring his - - within the chain of command. What do you think that should be done--that could be done to have the people facing harassment to overcome the fear and to go forward and speak. Is there anything that you believe that can be done to help them?

HERB RUBEN: We need to create more perfect human beings. We need to create a climate that really comes down hard wherever that takes

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

place. But more than anything else at the moment-that's a long term process--we have to provide an
avenue whereby the person who is being victimized
does have some recourse. And I don't believe that
recourse is going to come from the chain of
command most times. And that's why I'm suggesting
the possibility of the military doing something
which it would probably never think of in creating
an ombudsman concept.

CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: Thank you very much. Thank you sir. And Mr. Stacey, I'm going to ask you the same question because you have been there. You have been in this situation. I don't know if you spoke how did you handle the situation. What do you think that should be done or could be done to help people facing harassment in the military to overcome the fear to go and the right thing in order to stop that. Is there anything that you think that you did and that was helpful to you? Or is there anything that you believe that, you know, a soldier could do to try to protect himself or herself when facing harassment?

STACEY LATIMER: Well, I think that

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

it really works on an individual basis because everybody is not empowered to speak once they have been oppressed or once they have been victimized. But I do think there are a couple of things that we can do. With the things that are already in place, I think each battalion needs a committee that oversees and searches out such behavior. think through the work that we've done around HIV, we understand that it is necessary to have peers at the table that can speak in reference to the target population or in reference to individuals. And so I think that if we created committees that took the time to make each battalion accountable for their actions and that committee also be the researcher to look into reports and be made up of peers of soldiers, I think that would benefit -- and plus give soldiers the security to know that their voices are heard and it's not just one of those good old boy kind of situations.

CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: But as far as you know, is there any structure in place where the soldier can go to address the issues, to make complaints about harassment they are facing.

Anything in place for them to try to get some

protection or make their voice heard.

HERB RUBEN: Just like any company 3 there are procedures, protocols in place, but it's 4 5 the fact whether you trust those protocols. Again, wherever you have people, you have issues 6 of trust and mistrust. And so inside the military no different than whether it's the police 9 department, you have sectors where people come 10 together to protect their own. And so those that 11 are being violated by the good old boy mentality 12 don't feel secure enough that the systems that are 13 already in place is going to protect them. 14 like if a police officer was being violated by his 15 fellow officers, more than likely from what we 16 know about the camaraderie among police officers, 17 the police officer is not going to feel secure 18 reporting police officers because of that good old 19 boy mentality. Pretty much the something in the 20 military. You just don't feel like you are 21 protected because the culture that has existed and 22 continues to exist is going to work against you. 23 CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: Thank you very 24 much. Thanks to all three of you. Thank you

madam chair.

25

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you.

3 We are going to. Council Member Fidler?

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: We're ready to go to a vote, right? As I'm not a member of the committee that's going to be voting on this resolution today and as a co-sponsor of the resolution I just wanted to say a few words if I could. First, I want to express my personal and sincere condolences to the Chen family. I think it's been sad that there is no greater tragedy or sorrow than a parent or a caregiver buries their child. I hope that the things that we do here today and the things that happen hereafter will make Private Chen's death not--while senseless-not in vain. Bullying is a horrendous problem in our society. It's not new. But it has taken new turns. Teenagers in school now bully on the Internet. With the click of a mouse, they can destroy someone's life and we don't do enough to teach them not to do that. In the military, we have to acknowledge that we have men and women who are serving who are teenagers who are carrying guns. And there's probably very few things that are as empowering and as emboldening in life as

walking around with an AK47 and sometimes that 2 leads us to a locker room or frat party mentality 3 about who we are and we forget the consequences of 4 5 the words, the deeds, that sometimes we're responsible for. The military needs to be 6 cognizant of that. They need to be aware of just the circumstances that they are putting young men 9 and women in. And the fact that now in a diverse 10 world, there are many, many different types of 11 people from different backgrounds who want to 12 defend our country and our nation. And we need to 13 make it possible and acceptable. In fact, we need 14 to encourage that those diverse people feel that 15 they can stand up for our nation. And I know that 16 my colleagues are going to vote for this 17 resolution today. I urge them to do so. And I am 18 very proud to be a co-sponsor of it. Thank you 19 Council Member Fidler and thank you for your 20 testimony. I would like to thank everyone for 21 coming to provide testimony today. I would like 22 to give a special thanks to the family of Private 23 Chen for coming today and providing testimony and 24 for your strength and of course we share our 25 condolences. With that I would like to give an

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

opportunity to Council Member Margaret Chin who
introduced the resolution and then council member
and co-chair Eugene who would also like to make

5 some comments prior to us calling up the vote.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you madam chair. I also wanted to extend a thank you to the family of Danny Chen, especially to the mom and dad for being here and for having to sit through the hearing. And I know from the mother-every time she is at a press conference, she tells me that every time she hears the stories again and the testimony again and it really hurts. And I'm sorry that we have to put you through that again. [foreign audio] So I think that this is a good beginning, so that we will make sure that Danny Chen did not die in vain, that his life will always be remembered and cherished. And that we will prevent this kind of tragedy from ever happening again to another family. And I also wanted to thank everyone who came here to testify today, especially OCA New York, and also to all our elected officials that represent the lower Manhattan area, Congresswoman Nydia Velazquez, State Senator Squadron, Speaker Silver, also

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2	submitted testimony and also Congresswoman
3	Judy Chu who lost a nephew who lost a nephew to
4	bullying and hazing in the Marines and she also

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you Council Member Chin. Council Member Eugene.

sent her testimony. So that you madam chair.

CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: Thank you very much madam chair. Again I want to express my heartfelt condolences to the members of the family and I want to thank co-chair Ferreras and also I commend and thank Council Member Chin for a wonderful job well done. And I think that we've changed military policies and system. I hope that. And I think also that we've made our military system better and that we changed our soul -- United States because any time we can do something to improve our system, that it would benefit all of us. And to all of you here, thank you very much and the veterans and men and women in service who are here. Thank you for your service to this nation. Thank you. Because of your sacrifices we can enjoy the liberty that we all cherish and it is because of your services-because of your sacrifices -- that we can be here

2	today. And again thank you. Regardless of what						
3	happened to Chen, which is a tragedy, we are						
4	against, but I want to let you know veterans and						
5	the men and women in service, you are all heroes						
6	and we owe to all of you a good deal of gratitude.						
7	CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you						
8	and I would like to take this time to also extend						
9	the speedy recovery of Council Member Rose who we						
10	hope will be joining us again very soon. And for						
11	me it's been honor to be able to chair this						
12	committee for her today. And with that I believe						
13	that the Committee on Civil Rights is ready to						
14	vote on Resolution 1188 and I urge all my						
15	colleagues to vote yea.						
16	WILLIAM MARTIN: William Martin,						
17	Committee Clerk, roll call vote on the Committee						
18	on Civil Rights Resolution 1188. Council Member						
19	Ferreras.						
20	CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: I vote aye						
21	and again I encourage my colleagues to do the						
22	same.						
23	WILLIAM MARTIN: Seabrook.						
24	COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Thank you						

madam chair. Just to explain my vote here. I

think that just listening to the testimony here, 2 there are a couple of things that need to be 3 4 stated as being as one who had the opportunity to 5 grow up in a segregated America. There is no such 6 thing as a perfect human being, but we must be perfect about treating people as human beings. And if we develop a sense of treating everybody as 9 a human being, we wouldn't have all the problems in which we have. Less than 60 years ago, America 10 11 had a segregated Army. So I think we need to look 12 at what took place here and don't trivialize this as bullying and hazing, this was out and out a 13 sense of racism that exists. Racism is the 14 15 inherent belief of superiority and the Army has 16 been a product of that for many, many years. 17 if you look at it historically of how it has been done and I think to do this, this resolution is 18 19 important, but to the Chen family, I say to you 20 that you should have this light shining about your 21 son and you should tell this story to America so 22 that America will understand what happened to your 23 There was a lady named Mrs. Till who said I 24 want America to see what they did to my son. 25 that story changed how we deal with people in

б

America. Your story has to be told and it should								
be all over this country of what happened. And I								
think that peoplewhen you read the story and								
transcript of what took placeit wasn't just								
hazing and bullying. When you start looking at								
all of the bigotry, the racism, and everything								
else that existsand America has lived too long								
with racism, sexism, bigotry, homophobia and done								
too little about it. I think this will be a step								
in the right direction, but I think that what								
needs to be donedon't let anybody tell you that								
we've heard enough of your story. You tell your								
story and we should tell your story. And I vote								
yes on this resolution.								

WILLIAM MARTIN: Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote aye.

Thank you.

WILLIAM MARTIN: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: With condolences to the Chen family and with thanks to my colleague Margaret Chin being such a champion on this issue, I vote aye.

WILLIAM MARTIN: By a vote of four in the affirmative, zero on the negative, and no

2	abstentions,	the r	esolution	is	adopted.	Members
3	nlease sign	the co	mmittee r	enor	t Thank	VO11

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you 4 and this hearing is called to an end. 5

I, Matt Williams, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature

2/7

Date _____2/7/2012