

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

CHARTER MEETING

-----X

January 4, 2012  
Start: 1:05 p.m.  
Recess: 2:30 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers  
City Hall

B E F O R E:

CHRISTINE C. QUINN  
Speaker  
JOEL RIVERA  
President Pro Tempore

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Council Member Maria del Carmen Arroyo  
Council Member Charles Barron  
Council Member Gale A. Brewer  
Council Member Fernando Cabrera  
Council Member Margaret S. Chin  
Council Member Leroy G. Comrie, Jr.  
Council Member Elizabeth S. Crowley  
Council Member Inez E. Dickens  
Council Member Daniel Dromm  
Council Member Mathieu Eugene  
Council Member Lewis A. Fidler  
Council Member Helen D. Foster  
Council Member Daniel R. Garodnick

## A P P E A R A N C E S

## COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Council Member James F. Gennaro  
Council Member Vincent J. Gentile  
Council Member Sara M. Gonzalez  
Council Member David G. Greenfield  
Council Member Daniel J. Halloran III  
Council Member Vincent M. Ignizio  
Council Member Robert Jackson  
Council Member Letitia James  
Council Member Peter S. Koo  
Council Member G. Oliver Koppell  
Council Member Karen Koslowitz  
Council Member Brad S. Lander  
Council Member Jessica S. Lappin  
Council Member Stephen T. Levin  
Council Member Darlene Mealy  
Council Member Rosie Mendez  
Council Member Michael C. Nelson  
Council Member James S. Oddo  
Council Member Annabel Palma  
Council Member Domenic M. Recchia, Jr.  
Council Member Diana Reyna  
Council Member Ydanis A. Rodriguez  
Council Member James Sanders, Jr.  
Council Member Larry B. Seabrook  
Council Member Eric A. Ulrich  
Council Member James Vacca  
Council Member Peter F. Vallone, Jr.  
Council Member James G. Van Bramer  
Council Member Albert Vann  
Council Member Mark S. Weprin  
Council Member Jumaane D. Williams  
Council Member Ruben Wills

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Carol Shine  
Counsel to the Committee on Land Use (retiring)  
New York City Council

Al-Haj Talib W. Abdul-Rashid  
Imam  
Mosque of Islamic Brotherhood, Inc.

1  
2                   SPEAKER QUINN: So, happy new year,  
3 everybody. Hi, guys. So, if I could ask Council  
4 Members--anyone who wants to, but in particular  
5 Comrie, Levin, Lander and Weprin to come up. I  
6 know. Well, as Brad makes his way down, if I  
7 could also ask Carol Shine and everybody else who  
8 is here from Land Use to make their way up to the  
9 front of the Council Chambers, please. And we are  
10 calling Carol up because after how many years of  
11 service to the City of New York? 20 years of  
12 service to the City of New York, in different  
13 capacities, Carol Shine is [applause] moving on  
14 and I want to say Carol has very great shoes on  
15 for the day. Come on up, Carol. Gale and all of  
16 her colleagues, come on up. We just wanted to  
17 take a moment to thank you, Carol, for all of your  
18 great work, for all of your thoroughness, for all  
19 of your diligence, for coming in and seeing, and I  
20 think Gale might agree with this--there's Gale--  
21 particularly coming in to see Council Members,  
22 namely me, with legal answers we didn't like. But  
23 nonetheless, never being moved off of what you  
24 knew was legally correct. And you have been a  
25 consummate professional to work with, thorough,

1  
2 lovely, pleasant, patient, and I just wish you all  
3 the best and thank you so very much for all of  
4 your great work. [applause] And let me turn the  
5 mic over to the Chair of our Land Use Committee,  
6 Leroy Comrie.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I--today we  
8 are losing Carol, we are losing my shine, as I  
9 would like to say--

10 SPEAKER QUINN: [off mic] Awwww.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: --as I  
12 would like to say, because she has truly made me a  
13 Chair that has been thorough and concise and  
14 making sure that we cross all our i's and dot all  
15 the t's, because even though we have a great time  
16 in our committee, and we're, we kind of keep it to  
17 making sure that we are enjoying our company,  
18 Carol makes sure that we're handling our business.  
19 [laughter] And you know, it makes the committee  
20 meetings go very quickly because she is so  
21 detailed and making sure that everything that we  
22 do do in the committee is handled properly, all  
23 the subcommittee meetings, all of the committee  
24 meetings are done according to the law and  
25 according to [laughter] everything that needs to

1  
2 be done, because you know, there's always, and as  
3 you know, any New Yorker that's not satisfied can  
4 challenge us, but we've been able to survive every  
5 challenge because Carol has made sure we've done  
6 it right. [applause] So, I just want to say on,  
7 you know, I'm really going to miss her because I  
8 like to tease her and she's, she's a great person,  
9 she makes it easy for me to do what I've done,  
10 it's made it easy for me to, and the subcommittee  
11 chairs, and I know that now that I won't have  
12 anybody clipping my New York Times crossword  
13 puzzle, we are making sure that as a gift to  
14 Carol, she gets a lifetime subscription to, to the  
15 New York Times crossword puzzle, it's just one of  
16 the small tokens of appreciation, but I will miss  
17 you, you've truly been a help and a blessing to  
18 me, Carol, and I wish you a long, happy, happy,  
19 healthy and successful retirement. Thank you very  
20 much. [applause]

21 SPEAKER QUINN: And Brad or Mark, I  
22 don't know if Steve is here, but Brad or Mark or  
23 Steve, do you want to add anything? [background  
24 comments]

25 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: I just

1

2 don't want to prolong her--

3 SPEAKER QUINN: Her agony.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: --

5 emotional, I know Carol. But I, too, I mean,  
6 Carol's one of those people that a lot of people  
7 don't know who are outside the Council, but she  
8 makes the place run. And she's one of those  
9 dedicated people that we wish everyone in  
10 government was like this. Who does what the law  
11 requires, everything according to Hoyle, whoever  
12 that is. I think he's [background comments] Oh,  
13 yeah, I thought he used to be a council member at  
14 large, I don't know. [laughter] No, I know, I  
15 was just joking. Anyway, but always by the rules  
16 and making sure that everyone does it right,  
17 trying to treat the body with dignity, which  
18 sometimes Leroy lacks and I lack [laughter,  
19 ooohs!)

20 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Amen, I'll  
21 cop to that, I'll cop to that.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Okay. And  
23 [laughs] And but, but really, she's been a  
24 delight to work with, someone who meant to so much  
25 to this body, and I don't know what we're going to

1  
2 do without you, Carol. And we do wish you all the  
3 best. Thank you. [applause]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I just  
5 really want to add my voice of thanks, you know,  
6 we step into these roles and we're trying to make  
7 significant decisions, and the people who really  
8 know what's going on. Not just what the rules are  
9 and what the law requires, but really what, how  
10 the decisions matter and how they matter to people  
11 on the ground. It makes a big difference. And so  
12 to get, know in a way that makes you laugh, but  
13 also to get, "Hey, here's a way that we could  
14 think about doing this," that improves the project  
15 and does it in a way that we're allowed, makes a  
16 big difference in the lives of New Yorkers. So,  
17 we're going to miss you and the City's going to  
18 miss you. Thank you for everything that you've  
19 done. [applause]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you,  
21 Madam Speaker, I just want to add my voice.  
22 Carol, you've been a wonderful guide to me, in my  
23 first couple years here in the Council, and your  
24 advice has been just wonderful and irreplaceable.  
25 And you've been a wonderful mentor to me and a

1  
2 wonderful teacher. And I will be forever  
3 appreciative. Thank you. [applause]

4 SPEAKER QUINN: And if I could ask  
5 the clerk to read the proclamation.

6 CLERK: Council, City of New York  
7 Proclamation. Whereas, the Council of the City of  
8 New York is proud to honor Carol J. Shine on the  
9 occasion of her retirement from the New York City  
10 Council. And whereas, Carol joined the City  
11 Council staff on October 15, 1991, in the newly  
12 created Land Use Division, which was formed after  
13 New York City voters approved the sweeping changes  
14 outlined in the charter revision of 1989. And  
15 whereas, the members of the Land Use Committee  
16 were greatly impressed by Carol from the  
17 beginning. In her role as project manager, Carol  
18 was primarily responsible for the review of  
19 authorizing resolutions for franchises, concession  
20 applications, and revocable consents, and provided  
21 expert advice and analysis to committee members on  
22 the authorizing resolutions for private, pay,  
23 telephone franchise and cable television. And  
24 whereas, Carol soon moved to a legislative counsel  
25 position in which she served under Christopher

1  
2 Collins, then General Counsel of the Division, and  
3 expanded the scope of her responsibilities to  
4 include planning activities, dispositions and  
5 affordable housing projects. And whereas, in  
6 February 2006, Carol was promoted to General  
7 Counsel of the Land Use Division where has  
8 provided stellar service to all of the City  
9 Council Members, but especially to Chair of the  
10 Land Use Committee, City Council Deputy Majority  
11 Leader Leroy Comrie. [cheers] And whereas, after  
12 earning her undergraduate degree in anthropology  
13 from Beloit [phonetic] College, Carol launched her  
14 degree at Drexel Burnham Lambert, Inc., during the  
15 day and attended Brooklyn Law School at night.  
16 That experience honed her profound abilities to  
17 multitask at all hours, day and night [laughter]  
18 which she has demonstrated throughout her tenure  
19 at the City Council. And whereas, Carol has truly  
20 exemplified the very best in public service. Over  
21 the course of the last 20 years at the Council,  
22 she has applied her intelligence, her sense of  
23 purpose, her sharp legal mind, and her fine  
24 research skills to set and uphold the highest  
25 standards in all aspects of her work. She has

1  
2 also tempered her counsel with an unfailing sense  
3 of propriety, old fashioned hard work and  
4 commitment to excellence. Now therefore be it  
5 known that the Council of the City of New York  
6 gratefully honors Carol J. Shine for her  
7 tremendous service to the Council. And we  
8 publicly thank her for her outstanding work on  
9 behalf of her fellow New Yorkers. Christine C.  
10 [cheers, applause]

11 CAROL SHINE: All right, well.  
12 Yes, on? Yes. Who knew my claim to fame was  
13 going to be that I said "No" all the time, but  
14 [laughter] but I would like remind you that I may  
15 be gone but you're still going to hear that voice  
16 in your head. [laughter] Anyway, thank you all.  
17 [applause]

18 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Carol.  
19 And [laughs] and that will conclude ceremonials  
20 for this charter meeting.

21 [pause, background noise]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Oh, there  
23 will be a reception for Carol on the 14th, on the  
24 16th Floor, right after the Stated Meeting. All  
25 Members are invited, and any interested parties

1  
2 are invited. 16th Floor, 16th Floor, Land Use  
3 area.

4 [pause, background noise]

5 CLERK: Could I have your  
6 attention, please, at this time. Please place all  
7 cell phones and pagers to vibrate. All cell  
8 phones and pagers to vibrate. All non-Council  
9 employees, please leave the main floor of the  
10 Chambers. Thank you.

11 [gavel]

12 PRESIDENT RIVERA: I call this  
13 meeting, the Charter Meeting of January 4, 2012,  
14 into session. My colleagues please rise for the  
15 Pledge of Allegiance. [pledge of allegiance]  
16 Roll call?

17 CLERK: Arroyo.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: [off mic]  
19 Here.

20 CLERK: Barron.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [off mic]  
22 Here.

23 CLERK: Brewer.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [off mic]  
25 Here.

1

CLERK: Cabrera.

2

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: [off mic]

3

Here.

4

CLERK: Chin.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [off mic]

6

Here.

7

CLERK: Comrie.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: [off mic]

9

Here.

10

CLERK: Crowley. Dickens.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: [off mic]

12

Here.

13

CLERK: Dilan. Dromm.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: [off mic]

15

Here.

16

CLERK: Eugene.

17

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: [off mic]

18

Here.

19

CLERK: Ferreras. Fidler.

20

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: [off mic]

21

Here.

22

CLERK: Foster.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: [off mic]

24

Here.

25

1

CLERK: Garodnick.

2

3

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [off

4

mic] Here.

5

CLERK: Gennaro. Gentile.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: [off mic]

7

Here.

8

CLERK: Gonzalez. Greenfield.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: [off

10

mic] Here.

11

CLERK: Halloran.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: [off mic]

13

Here.

14

CLERK: Ignizio.

15

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: [off mic]

16

Here.

17

CLERK: Jackson.

18

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: [off mic]

19

Here.

20

CLERK: James.

21

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: [off mic]

22

Here.

23

CLERK: Koo.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [off mic]

25

Present.

1

2

CLERK: Koppell.

3

COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: [off mic]

4

Here.

5

CLERK: Koslowitz.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: [off

7

mic] Here.

8

CLERK: Lander.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [off mic]

10

Here.

11

CLERK: Lappin.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: [off mic]

13

Here.

14

CLERK: Levin.

15

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [off mic]

16

Here.

17

CLERK: Mark-Viverito. Mealy.

18

Mendez.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: [off mic]

20

Here.

21

CLERK: Nelson.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: [off mic]

23

Here.

24

CLERK: Palma. Recchia. Reyna.

25

Rodriguez.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off  
3 mic] Here.  
4 CLERK: Rose. Sanders.  
5 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: [off mic]  
6 Here.  
7 CLERK: Seabrook.  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: [off mic]  
9 Here.  
10 CLERK: Ulrich.  
11 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: [off mic]  
12 Here.  
13 CLERK: Vacca. Vallone. Van  
14 Bramer.  
15 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: [off  
16 mic] Here.  
17 CLERK: Vann.  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: [off mic]  
19 Here.  
20 CLERK: Weprin.  
21 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: [off mic]  
22 Here.  
23 CLERK: Williams.  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic]  
25 - - still here.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CLERK: Thank you. Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [off mic]

Here.

CLERK: Oddo. Rivera.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Here.

CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

SPEAKER QUINN: [off mic] Here.

CLERK: We have a quorum.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you.

Quorum is present, my colleagues, please rise for the invocation being delivered today by Imam Al-Haj Talib W. Abdul-Rashid from the Mosque of Islamic Brotherhood, Inc.

AL-HAJ TALIB W. ABDUL-RASHID:

Blessed new year to everyone. Peace be unto you all. Shalom - - . Almighty God, Creator of the Heavens and the Earth and all things in between, you of the most beautiful names used by your servants to call upon you, Almighty and Everlasting God. You who are called Almighty God or Ja [phonetic] or Dios or Yahweh or Jehovah or Mumba, you whom we Muslims call Allah. We pray this day with gratitude and sincerity - - Our Lord, you are the source of peace and from you

1  
2 come peace. Praise and glory be unto you oh Lord  
3 of glory and honor, your law. You spoke to your  
4 servant Jeremiah, saying "And seek the peace,  
5 safety and security of the City where I have sent  
6 you. Pray to the Lord for it, for in its peace,  
7 safety and security, you will enjoy success."  
8 Therefore, we pray this day for peace, safety and  
9 security, for this City, our City of New York,  
10 that we might enjoy success for all of its  
11 inhabitants. We pray for justice, for there is no  
12 meaningful and authentic peace without justice.  
13 We pray for tranquility of mind and spirit for the  
14 least amongst us, as well as for the prosperous,  
15 that every man, woman, youth and child might be  
16 secure from poverty and safe from the ravages of  
17 greed. We pray for safety and security from  
18 hatred, prejudice, bigotry unfounded and  
19 unwarranted suspicion, fear mongering and  
20 terrorism in all of its forms, for surely these  
21 are not the higher qualities of the human mind,  
22 nor the blessed qualities of the human spirit.  
23 Open our hearts and minds that we might learn from  
24 our mistakes of the past year and utilize these  
25 lessons to make this a better year for all of the

1  
2 inhabitants of this City. Grant us knowledge,  
3 wisdom, understanding, humility, sensitivity,  
4 courage, compassion, empathy and love, oh God.  
5 Increase the transparency of those who govern our  
6 City, and strengthen us, the people, that those  
7 with authority might be rendered fully accountable  
8 for their actions. All of these things we pray in  
9 your most holy name, Amin and Amen.

10 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
11 much. Now, Council Member Dickens.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you,  
13 Majority Leader. One quote I want to give you,  
14 and this is a quote, "We are unapologetically  
15 Muslim and uncompromisingly American." That is a  
16 quote by Iman Talib Abdul Rashid. This Iman is a  
17 patriot of peace and justice. His visionary  
18 leadership and unflinching belief in the spirit of  
19 humanity helps to build a strong America, where  
20 one day we can all be an equal part of the  
21 American Dream. Iman has taken the leadership  
22 prior to the recent Queens bombings, and after the  
23 bombings, standing tall to denounce hate, the  
24 crimes that hate perpetrates on society, and those  
25 who commit such crimes, regardless of who commits

1  
2 them. Iman Talib, thank you, thank you, for  
3 standing tall during a difficult time. I make--  
4 thank you, Madam Speaker, I make a motion to  
5 spread the invocation in full upon the record.

6 PRESIDENT RIVERA: So ordered.

7 Adoption of the minutes?

8 CLERK: None.

9 PRESIDENT RIVERA: None? Messages  
10 and papers from the Mayor?

11 CLERK: None.

12 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Communication  
13 from City, County and Borough Offices?

14 CLERK: Preconsidered M737,  
15 transferring funds between agencies.

16 SPEAKER QUINN: Finance.

17 CLERK: M738, Bay Station license.

18 SPEAKER QUINN: Transportation.

19 And if I could ask my colleagues before we move on  
20 with the agenda to please stand. Thank you. On  
21 December 17, 2011, Dr. Josephine English, who was  
22 91, passed away in Brooklyn due to complications  
23 from gallstone surgery. Dr. English was one of  
24 the first African-American female obstetricians in  
25 New York, and during her nearly 60 year medical

1  
2 career she delivered thousands of babies,  
3 including six of Betty Shabazz and Malcolm X's  
4 children. Born in 1920 in Inglewood, New Jersey,  
5 English graduated from Hunter College and earned  
6 her medical degree in Nashville in 1949. She  
7 began her career at Harlem Hospital, and then  
8 started the Women's Community Health Clinic in  
9 Bushwick in the 1950s, and other practices in Fort  
10 Green in the 1980s. When asked by the Daily News  
11 in 2010 why she became an obstetrician, she  
12 replied, "It's the only type of medicine where the  
13 family's happy to see you." Dr. Josephine English  
14 is survived by her four children and numerous  
15 grandchildren. On December 26, 2011, Constantine  
16 "Connie" Sodomani Aristoff [phonetic] who is 81,  
17 passed away due to esophageal cancer. According  
18 to the New York Times, Connie was a prince who's  
19 notable, who's nobility dated, like literally a  
20 prince, was a prince who's notability, nobility, I  
21 can't, it's hard for Irish people to talk about  
22 royalty and get the words our right, let me try  
23 that again. Aristoff was in fact an actual prince  
24 who's nobility dated back to the 15th Century here  
25 in New York. He was a kind of super citizen,

1  
2 conservationist, performing innumerable decision  
3 making roles in jobs dealing with the environment  
4 in and around New York City. Mr. Aristoff served  
5 as Highway Commissioner, then Transportation  
6 Commissioner under Mayor Lindsay, and then served  
7 three Governors as a member of the MTA. From 1989  
8 to '93, he served as the federal EPA head for the  
9 New York region, where he oversaw programs dealing  
10 with the controlled air and water pollution,  
11 industrial discharges, toxic substances,  
12 pesticide, ocean dumping, as well as federal  
13 superfund issues for the cleanup of hazardous  
14 waste sites. He was instrumental in obtaining a  
15 hard fought waiver for New York City that has  
16 saved the City billions of dollars by not  
17 requiring us to build a federally mandated but  
18 unnecessary water filtration plant. He is  
19 survived by his wife Ann, his children, which  
20 include former Council Member and former Finance  
21 Commissioner Andrew, and numerous grandchildren.  
22 And I would like to call on our Environmental  
23 Protection Chair, Jim Gennaro, to say a few words.  
24 We got to get you the mic, so--

25 [pause]

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you,  
3 Madam Speaker. Connie was someone, you know,  
4 known to everybody in the New York environmental  
5 community, and he really was a prince. And I just  
6 want to spend about 30 seconds just telling the  
7 fight that he fought, that we wouldn't have to  
8 filter the water. He, you know, was a regional  
9 head of the EPA here, but he had to fight the EPA,  
10 the water people within the EPA, and like the head  
11 of the EPA at the time, William Riley, who did  
12 not, who did not believe in New York City's  
13 ability to keep their water system clean and pure  
14 in perpetuity. They put together a blue ribbon  
15 panel which proved that this could never be done,  
16 but Connie was not going to be deterred. He  
17 fought the EPA, he got that for the City, and his  
18 work lives on today, this is something that we  
19 will always have, we will never have to filter our  
20 water because of his belief in us. He was also  
21 the first Chairman of New York State Autobahn.  
22 That was the first time this national organization  
23 had a state office, and this led the way for other  
24 state offices for Autobahn. He's on many, many  
25 other things, he was a friend of mine and a friend

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

to many. And we will deeply miss him.

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Chair  
Gennaro.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you.

[pause]

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Mr.  
Majority Leader.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you, Madam  
Speaker. Petitions and communications?

CLERK: None.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Land Use call  
ups?

CLERK: None.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Communication  
from the Speaker?

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. We're  
voting on a number of important pieces of  
legislation today. The first one being Intro 567-  
A which comes out of the Transportation Committee.  
I want to thank Novarto Lopez, Lyle Frank and  
Laura Popa, for their work on this bill. I want  
to thank the sponsor of the bill, Minority Leader  
Oddo, and the Chair of the Transportation  
Committee, Jimmy Vacca. If we could get a little

1  
2 quiet. Into 567-A is an idea that was brought  
3 forward by Minority Leader Oddo. And it's a  
4 simple idea: we should empower New Yorkers with  
5 the facts about their streets. We should give New  
6 Yorkers the information of what rating their  
7 street surfacing gets from the Department of  
8 Transportation. We should give New Yorkers about  
9 when their street was last paved, resurfaced. Are  
10 there capital dollars allocated to your street?  
11 Was your street rated satisfactory by the  
12 Department of Transportation but you look out  
13 there and it looks poor and there's a pothole, in  
14 your opinion? Why do we want New Yorkers to have  
15 this information? Why do we want community boards  
16 to have this information? One, because community  
17 boards make recommendations--to the Mayor, to the  
18 Council, to the Borough Presidents about what  
19 streets they want taken care of in the capital  
20 budget. This information will help them serve  
21 their community board residents better. Two, we  
22 want New Yorkers to have this information, because  
23 if we see the Department of Transportation has  
24 said that a street is of the highest rating, and  
25 we don't know that New Yorkers see it otherwise,

1  
2 we can't work with them and DOT to fix it and  
3 bring it up to the level it should be at. So this  
4 bill really speaks to the Council and the Minority  
5 Leader's commitment to involving New Yorkers in  
6 the large team that makes this City better. Two,  
7 it'll create an interactive map function that will  
8 become a permanent part of government, so we can  
9 always get the information at our fingertips. And  
10 I really want to thank the Chair and the Minority  
11 Leader for bringing us this bill which will help  
12 us all do a better job serving our City and making  
13 our streets safe and usable. This isn't about  
14 just our streets looking nice, which is good, it's  
15 making sure they are safe for everyone who is  
16 using them. Let me first call on the sponsor of  
17 the bill, Minority Leader Oddo, and then the Chair  
18 of the Committee, Jimmy Vacca.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Thank you,  
20 Madam Speaker. The, the Mayor and the  
21 Administration often talk about technology and  
22 transparency. And those of us in this body often  
23 talk about engaging and empowering our  
24 constituents, and I believe this bill marries  
25 those concepts. The Charter says that the

1  
2 Department of Transportation has to evaluate 50  
3 percent of the City's streets. In recent years,  
4 DOT has evaluated around 90 percent. And DOT  
5 literally has a program where two employees drive  
6 down streets, one drives and the other person has  
7 a handheld device where they mark off potholes,  
8 street cuts, imperfections in the roadway. And  
9 from that personal observation, that particular  
10 street gets a rating from one to ten. What this  
11 bill does is say to DOT and the City, "Take that  
12 information and put it online, and put it in the  
13 form of a map where any New Yorker in any 51 of  
14 the Council districts, can go on to see what his  
15 or her street is rated. And as the Speaker said,  
16 what we hope will happen is those constituents  
17 will say, "Hey, wait a second, DOT says my  
18 street's a nine and that it's in good condition;  
19 in fact, it is not." And then they can start the  
20 process, they can reach out to 311, they could  
21 reach out to the DOT, reach out to the community  
22 board, the local Councilperson, etc., etc. So  
23 that we can focus very limited resources on those  
24 streets that need it most. We all fight at budget  
25 time, side-by-side with Commissioner Sadik-Khan,

1  
2 to ensure that the lane miles each year are as  
3 high as possible. That's how we get to drivable  
4 streets, by curb-to-curb restoration. What this  
5 will do, hopefully, and by the way, in case folks  
6 don't remember, it was this Speaker that put in an  
7 additional \$5 million into the capital budget to  
8 maintain those levels a couple of years ago. It  
9 was actually the Staten Island Council Delegation  
10 that has put in \$2 million over the last few years  
11 to maintain the levels of road repair on Staten  
12 Island. We want to make sure that money is  
13 focused on those streets that need it most, and we  
14 want New Yorkers to get engaged in the process.  
15 If you're not happy, if you're not happy with the  
16 evaluation, let us know. I want to thank Lyle  
17 Frank and Laura Popa for their hard work in  
18 putting this together. I just want to say for the  
19 record, we asked DOT to do this in the form of a  
20 simple request in a letter in January of 2010.  
21 They said they would do it. It has taken a while  
22 to get the technology on board, and we went to the  
23 Speaker and said, "You know what? Let's codify  
24 this as an incentive to the current folks, but  
25 also to make this permanent for future DOT

1  
2 Commissioners in future administrations, and  
3 that's the genesis of this bill. I want to thank  
4 Lyle and Laura for their hard work, and I also  
5 want to thank in my office, my wonderful Counsel  
6 Chris DiCicco for all his hard work on this.  
7 Thank you. And one last person, of course, the  
8 great Jimmy Vacca, the Chair of the Transportation  
9 Committee, whose passion and commitment on this  
10 issue is wonderful. Thank you.

11 SPEAKER QUINN: Let's now hear from  
12 the great Jimmy Vacca. [laughter]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I will let  
14 that description stand, and relinquish my speech.  
15 [laughter] It may not be that great. I want to  
16 thank Speaker Quinn and Council Member Oddo. You  
17 know, we always see reports all the time saying to  
18 us, "How great a percentage of our streets in the  
19 City are acceptably in good service condition?"  
20 75, 80 percent of our streets in our City are in  
21 acceptable condition, when it comes to their  
22 surface pavement. But the reality is, the  
23 condition of your block is what you know. The  
24 condition of the streets that you cross every day,  
25 or that you ride on, that's what you know. And

1  
2 what are the ratings of those streets in your  
3 community that you frequent, that you use every  
4 day? Well, we don't know. Through this  
5 legislation, there will be a public knowledge out  
6 there about the condition of the street that  
7 they're interested in, usually the street where  
8 they live, and in their particular neighborhood.  
9 I think it goes to how we formulate capital  
10 projects and what we have done in-house, through  
11 in-house resurfacing programs. Some streets we're  
12 told require capital improvement, but those of us  
13 who've been a while, around for a while, know that  
14 capital improvements take five, ten, 15, 20 years  
15 before a shovel is put in the ground. So we don't  
16 want residents who are being told "Your street  
17 must await capital improvement," to never see  
18 their street resurfaced or strip paved. And under  
19 this bill, we can advocate for what we want for  
20 our neighborhoods, we can tell people, "You're  
21 empowered based on this information not to wait  
22 for a capital project that may or may never come.  
23 Your curb conditions, your ponding situation on  
24 your block, the pothole situation is serious  
25 enough where our ratings indicate your community

1  
2 is due in-house forces to get this done and to get  
3 it done quickly. So, I think it's a good bill, I  
4 think it aims in the right direction, I think it  
5 gives citizens power. And I think that it's time  
6 that this knowledge is out there in the public.  
7 So, I thank Council Member Oddo of course and all  
8 the Committee staff and the Speaker, and I hope  
9 the Members will vote yes. Thank you.

10 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very  
11 much, Chair Vacca. Also, we're voting today on  
12 Intro 585-A a piece of legislation introduced by  
13 Council Member Jimmy Va--I'm sorry, Council Member  
14 Domenic Recchia, that comes out of our Housing and  
15 Buildings Committee, Chaired by Eric Dilan. I  
16 want to thank Samara Swanson, Dan Avery, Barbara  
17 Hom [phonetic], Laura Regine [phonetic], and most  
18 importantly Laura Popa for their work on this  
19 bill. 585-A will limit the face--585-A will take  
20 the federal green labels plus standards for  
21 carpets. Make sure that no carpets are sold in  
22 New York City that are not in compliance with  
23 those standards. This will make sure that in  
24 residences and office buildings that carpets are  
25 not ones that are emitting volatile organic

1  
2 compounds which can be a contributor to sick  
3 building syndrome, something that can cause  
4 significant health problems for workers and  
5 residents, and I want to thank Council Member  
6 Recchia for his work on this bill, and in  
7 particular again want to thank Laura Popa. This  
8 piece of legislation is part of the overall green  
9 building codes legislative work and one of the,  
10 probably over 70 pieces of legislation that will  
11 be passed as a result of that work. Let me call  
12 on Council Member Recchia.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Thank you,  
14 Madam Speaker. I also want to thank Laura Popa  
15 and her entire staff for helping get this  
16 legislation passed today. This legislation aims  
17 to reduce the amount of volatile organic compounds  
18 present in carpets sold here in New York City. It  
19 is simple common sense that we pass this  
20 legislation to regulate and reduce the amount of  
21 these chemicals found in carpets. As the main  
22 sponsor of this bill, I believe we must take all  
23 necessary steps to ensure the health, safety, of  
24 our residents and children, do our best to always  
25 improve the quality of life for the taxpayers of

1  
2 the City New York. I encourage all my colleagues  
3 to vote aye in passing this legislation today.

4 Thank you.

5 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Council  
6 Member Recchia. We are also voting today on a  
7 budget modification. I want to thank Chair  
8 Recchia and the Finance Committee for their work  
9 on it. I want to thank Preston Niblack, Jeff  
10 Rodus, Tanisha Edwards, Nicole Anderson, Latonia  
11 McKinney, Nathan Toth, Regina Poreda-Ryan, Scott  
12 Crowley and Pam Corbett. This budget modification  
13 will significantly save \$400 million in the City's  
14 budget money that will help us prepare for dealing  
15 with the budget deficit in next year's budget, but  
16 also this budget modification marks Council  
17 priorities. In it, we objected to and prevented  
18 the cuts to the Office of the Chief Medical  
19 Examiner, cuts that would have delayed the Chief  
20 Medical Examiner's ability to process DNA tests,  
21 such as rape kits, cuts that we believe would have  
22 made it harder for the District Attorneys to  
23 prosecute people who have been charged with crimes  
24 and made it harder for the police to arrest  
25 individuals that they believe had committed crimes

1  
2 in the City of New York. It's important to note  
3 that the requests for DNA testing have gone up  
4 significantly to the Chief Medical Examiner while  
5 his staff has gone down. We've also prevented  
6 cuts to the Beacon School Program and to the  
7 Cornerstone Program, as well as prevented a cut of  
8 a million-and-a-half dollars to the Health and  
9 Hospital Corporation, which had it been taken  
10 would have resulted in an impact on HHC's ability  
11 to serve New Yorkers. So, I want to thank  
12 everyone who worked on this budget modification.  
13 I also, in addition to the legislative matters,  
14 want to congratulate Sara Gonzalez and her husband  
15 Eli on their 38th wedding anniversary, which is  
16 [applause, cheers] today. And that concludes  
17 communications from the Speaker.

18 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you, Madam  
19 Speaker, we now move on to discussion of General  
20 Orders. We have Council Member Barron.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you  
22 very much, happy new year, as I intend to make  
23 your new year a very interesting one, to say the  
24 least. I rise, and let me start right away, I  
25 rise to speak against this budget modification.

1  
2 This is a continuation of the budget process, as  
3 you know, it's the usual process where the Mayor  
4 offers cuts and we restore some of the cuts, do  
5 our job; but the bottom line in this budget mod  
6 some of you are going to be right outside again  
7 'cause there are layoffs, the attrition positions  
8 that will not be filled, there's a hiring freeze,  
9 there's a cut to libraries, there's still going to  
10 be some cuts to education. And this is going to  
11 happen because there's a \$4.6 billion deficit  
12 coming up next year. With this, it might reduce  
13 it some, and the Mayor's also now listening to us  
14 finally understand he might use the healthcare  
15 retirement money to bring the deficit down to \$2  
16 billion. But because we thought that the Governor  
17 did so well in his Ponzi scheme of a new tax code,  
18 that takes less from the millionaires, had we left  
19 it as it was we would've gotten \$4.9 billion. But  
20 the Mayor, the Governor's new tax scheme cuts it  
21 back to \$1.9 billion, and he gave half of that  
22 away to get the votes. So next year, watch what  
23 the State does to us. And then we're going to be  
24 strapped with cutting some now, and cutting more  
25 next year, as we go outside and talk about we're

1  
2 for the 99 percent. We need to be for the 99  
3 percent inside, and make sure that they don't do  
4 these kinds of cuts [applause] that's going to  
5 happen, and with this budget modification. So I  
6 urge you to vote no, and let 'em go back to the  
7 drawing board, let's use the power of the City  
8 Council to protect the people that are going to be  
9 hurt by this budget modification. It's a  
10 continuation of the same old same old. Happy new  
11 year. [laughter]

12 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
13 much. Seeing no other members, I will now move on  
14 to reports of standing committees.

15 CLERK: None. Oh, report of the  
16 Committee on Finance, Preconsidered Intro 749,  
17 Mayor's Preliminary Management Report.

18 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
19 Orders with a message of necessity.

20 CLERK: Resolution 1174, various  
21 business improvement districts.

22 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
23 Orders.

24 CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1192,  
25 organization funding.

1

2

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General

3

Orders.

4

CLERK: Preconsidered M737, Reso

5

1195.

6

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General

7

Orders.

8

PRESIDENT RIVERA: General Order

9

Calendar?

10

CLERK: Intro 567-A.

11

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General

12

Orders.

13

CLERK: Intro 585-A.

14

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General

15

Orders.

16

CLERK: Resolution appointing

17

various persons Commissioner of Deeds.

18

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General

19

Orders, and at this time point I'd ask for a roll

20

call on all items coupled on the General Order

21

Calendar, and I just want to remind my colleagues

22

that we are voting on numerous, about four or five

23

resolutions, at the end of, after the, the General

24

Order Calendar.

25

CLERK: Arroyo.

1

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: [off mic]

2

Aye.

3

CLERK: Barron.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote no

5

on, I vote no on Preconsidered Reso M737,

6

Preconsidered M30--M737, and its accompanying Reso

7

1195, the budget modification, I vote no for that

8

and I vote aye on all the rest. .

9

CLERK: Brewer.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [off mic]

11

Aye.

12

CLERK: Cabrera.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: [off mic]

14

Aye.

15

CLERK: Chin.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [off mic]

17

Aye.

18

CLERK: Comrie.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: [off mic]

20

Aye.

21

CLERK: Crowley.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote

23

aye.

24

CLERK: Dickens.

25

1

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: [off mic]

2

Aye.

3

CLERK: Dromm.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: [off mic]

5

Aye.

6

CLERK: Eugene.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: [off mic]

8

Aye.

9

CLERK: Fidler.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: [off mic]

11

I'd like - - vote - - .

12

CLERK: Foster.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: [off mic]

14

Aye.

15

CLERK: Garodnick.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [off

17

mic] Aye.

18

CLERK: Gennaro.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: [off mic]

20

- - yes.

21

CLERK: Gentile.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: [off mic]

23

Aye.

24

CLERK: Gonzalez.

25

1

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Aye.

2

3

CLERK: Greenfield.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: [off

5

mic] Yes - -

6

CLERK: Halloran.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: [off mic]

8

Aye.

9

CLERK: Ignizio.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: [off mic]

11

Yes.

12

CLERK: Jackson.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: [off mic]

14

Aye on all.

15

CLERK: James.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: May I be

17

excused to explain my vote?

18

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Yes.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: I'd like to

20

comment on Dr. Josephine English who passed away.

21

Dr. English was one of the first black women

22

obstetricians in Brooklyn. She was a caring soul,

23

a leader in the community, who was dedicated to

24

the arts. She converted a church in Fort Green

25

into the legendary Paul Robeson Theater, the

1  
2 Adelphi Medical Center, a senior citizen center,  
3 the Up the Ladder Daycare Center, and an  
4 afterschool program, as well as a significant  
5 number of youth camps. Her legacy should be  
6 honored by our commitment to renovating the Paul  
7 Robeson Theater. The love within the community  
8 for Dr. English is symbolic of her infinite soul  
9 and incredible contributions to the Borough of  
10 Brooklyn, and I would hope that beyond recognizing  
11 her that we would make a commitment to rebuilding  
12 Paul Robeson Theater. I also want to recognize  
13 and acknowledge the fact that Hazel Younger passed  
14 away during the holidays, as well. She was an  
15 active member in the community board, she worked  
16 with Council Member Fidler, Council Member Barron  
17 and Senator Sampson. And I also want to thank my  
18 colleagues, all of those who extended sympathy to  
19 the family, the Gillespie Family, the woman in  
20 Prospect Heights who was torched to death. And I  
21 just specifically want to single out Council  
22 Member Koo and Council Member Williams for  
23 reaching out to the community. Thank you, and I  
24 vote aye.

25 CLERK: Koo.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [off mic] I

3

vote aye.

4

CLERK: Koppell.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: [off mic]

6

Aye.

7

CLERK: Koslowitz.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: [off

9

mic] Aye.

10

CLERK: Lander.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [off mic]

12

Aye.

13

CLERK: Lappin.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: I would

15

like to vote aye and also add my words. I was

16

very privileged to represent Connie Aristoff and

17

he was a real pillar of the community, both the

18

community in terms of neighborhood in the

19

community and the larger sense, and he will

20

certainly be missed. Thank you.

21

CLERK: Levin.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [off mic]

23

Aye.

24

CLERK: Mark-Viverito. Mealy.

25

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [off mic]

1

2 Aye.

3

CLERK: Mendez.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: [off mic]

5

Aye.

6

CLERK: Nelson.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: [off mic]

8

Aye.

9

CLERK: Palma.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic]

11

Aye

12

CLERK: Recchia.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: May I be

14

excused to explain my vote?

15

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Yes.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: I'd like

17

to thank my entire Finance staff for working

18

diligently on this mod, especially our Director,

19

Preston Niblack, and the First Deputy, Jeff Rodus,

20

and my attorney, Tanisha Edwards, and the entire

21

Finance staff for doing a great job. And I vote

22

aye on all.

23

CLERK: Reyna.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: [off mic]

25

Aye on all.

1

CLERK: Rodriguez.

2

3

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off

4

mic] Aye, except the [on mic] budget modification

5

for which I vote no.

6

CLERK: Sanders.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: [off mic]

8

- - .

9

CLERK: Seabrook.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: [off mic]

11

Aye.

12

CLERK: Ulrich.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: [off mic]

14

Aye.

15

CLERK: Vacca.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [off mic]

17

Aye.

18

CLERK: Vallone.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: [off mic]

20

Aye.

21

CLERK: Van Bramer.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: [off

23

mic] Aye.

24

CLERK: Vann.

25

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: [off mic]

1

2 Aye.

3

CLERK: Weprin.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: [off mic]

5

Aye.

6

CLERK: Williams.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [pause] I

8

vote aye, except Reso 1192, which I abstain.

9

CLERK: Wills.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [off mic]

11

Aye.

12

CLERK: Oddo.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: [off mic]

14

Yes.

15

CLERK: Rivera.

16

PRESIDENT RIVERA: I vote aye.

17

CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

18

SPEAKER QUINN: [off mic] Aye.

19

[pause]

20

PRESIDENT RIVERA: All items on

21

today's General Order Calendar were adop--hold it,

22

hold that note. [pause]

23

CLERK: Williams.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I vote

25

aye on all except for Preconsidered M737 and Reso

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1194-5, which I abstain.

[pause]

PRESIDENT RIVERA: All items on today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, with zero in the negative, and six abstentions, with the exception of Preconsidered M737, and Resolution 1195, which was adopted by a vote of 44 in the affirmative, with two in the negative and one abstention.

Introduction and reading of the bills?

SPEAKER QUINN: All bills are referred to Committees as indicated on the agenda.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Okay, discussion of general, of resolutions. We're going to go in order, so the first one we're going to speak about is Resolution 821-A, an amended resolution calling on the United States Congress to pass and the President to sign into law, HR 591 and S 35, which would close the background check loophole at gun shows by establishing a background check procedure for all firearms sold at gun shows and - -

SPEAKER QUINN: [interposing] Could we get some quiet, please, if folks can take--the Committee Room is open if you need to step into

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

there, but if we could get quiet.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Next item,  
please.

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you, Madam  
Speaker. Legislation requiring background checks  
for all private firearm sales. Anyone wishing to  
speak on this resolution, raise your hands now.  
First we have Council Member Peter Vallone,  
followed by Council Member Robert Jackson.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you,  
I'd like to thank the Mayor and Speaker for  
keeping my Committee so busy combatting illegal  
guns and of course the staff deserves a lot of  
credit, Carmine and Sal and the rest, I'd like to  
thank the great Jimmy Vacca who has nothing to do  
with this, but I'm covering my bases. And, you  
know, we have been doing all we can at the local  
level to combat illegal guns, but the federal  
government has to do more. We passed three Resos  
out of my Committee today, one by Gale Brewer  
about increasing penalties for gun--one by Inez  
about increasing penalties for gun trafficking and  
one by Gale Brewer about reciprocity of gun

1  
2 licenses. And my Reso which calls on the federal  
3 government to close the gun show loophole and the  
4 Craig's List loophole. Right now, criminals can  
5 still get guns and bring them into the City  
6 without background checks, and that's ridiculous.  
7 The federal government needs to do something about  
8 that. And that's what my Reso calls on them to  
9 do. Thank you.

10 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Council Member  
11 Jackson.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you.  
13 My colleagues, I rise in order to support this  
14 resolution and I ask all of you to vote in favor  
15 of it. Knowing what my colleague, Peter Vallone,  
16 Jr., had just stated, let me just talk from a  
17 position of the Co-Chair of the Black, Latino and  
18 Asian Caucus. Because when you look at all of the  
19 killings and deaths that occur in the New York  
20 City, statistics will show you that the majority  
21 of the people that are being killed and injured  
22 are blacks and Latinos. And majority of those  
23 guns are legal guns that have been brought into  
24 our City through various ways. And so, this here  
25 would help to stop the flow of guns coming into

1  
2 our great City. And hopefully, eventually, it  
3 will stop the amount of killings and murders that  
4 take place in our City. So, I ask you to all  
5 support Reso 821-A. Thank you.

6 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
7 much. Next we have Council Member Halloran.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Mr.  
9 Majority Leader, Ms. Speaker, Madam Speaker, I'm  
10 regrettably going to stand up in opposition to the  
11 Resolutions before this body with regards to the  
12 Second Amendment of the United States  
13 Constitution. HR 822 was passed with bipartisan  
14 support in the Congress, and that is because the  
15 United States Constitution's Second Amendment,  
16 after the Heller and McDonald decisions clearly  
17 and unequivocally stated that individual citizens  
18 have a right to keep and bear arms. The full  
19 faith and credit clause of the Constitution  
20 requires that every state recognize those laws  
21 that appertain to the protection of rights of  
22 other citizens, even without their state. And in  
23 this particular case, we're talking about the  
24 right to keep and bear arms, a Second Amendment  
25 Bill of Rights issue. If we were talking--

1  
2 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Pardon me, Co--  
3 Council Member, I think you're talking about  
4 Resolution 1122?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Yes, I'm  
6 sorry, we're on 8--

7 PRESIDENT RIVERA: We're on 8--  
8 we're still on 821.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: 821, my  
10 apologies.

11 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Well, just, you  
12 can continue, just, you know.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: I  
14 appreciate it. We have in New York City a series  
15 of bills, of Resos in front of us, that deal with  
16 the rights of our citizens and the rights to keep  
17 and bear arms. Council Member Vallone is  
18 completely correct when he says that the federal  
19 government has dropped the ball. But that doesn't  
20 mean that we in the Council have the job of  
21 replacing either the Supreme Court or the federal  
22 legislators. We have many issues we should be  
23 dealing with in time, and we should not be wasting  
24 our time on Resolutions that will actually not  
25 affect the legislation at the state or national

1  
2 level, and I suggest the Council gets busy with  
3 the business of our business. Thank you, Mr.  
4 Chair.

5 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
6 much, Council Member. Seeing no others, we're  
7 going to take the vote on 821-A. All in favor,  
8 say aye.

9 COUNCIL: Aye.

10 PRESIDENT RIVERA: All opposed say  
11 nay. Any abstentions? The ayes have it. We will  
12 now speak and Council Member Halloran already  
13 spoke on this Resolution, on Resolution 1122-A, an  
14 amended Resolution calling on the United States  
15 Senate and the President to oppose HR 822 known as  
16 the National Right to Carry Reciprocity Act of  
17 2011, which would allow a resident from one state  
18 who has a license to carry a concealed handgun to  
19 lawfully carry his or her handgun into a different  
20 state regardless of the licensing eligibility  
21 standards in the other state; amended and adopted  
22 by the Committee on Public Safety. Anyone wishing  
23 to speak on this bill, first we have Council  
24 Member Gale Brewer.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you

1  
2 very much, I want to thank Chair Vallone, Speaker  
3 Quinn and Will Colgrove [phonetic] from her office,  
4 and certainly staff, but Richard Aborn [phonetic]  
5 who's a known leader in this field. And as we  
6 have discussed, this particular act, known as HR  
7 822, National Right to Carry Reciprocity Act of  
8 2011, it would allow a resident, if it was passed,  
9 from one state who has a concealed carry handgun  
10 permit to lawfully carry his or her handgun into a  
11 different state, regardless of the licensing  
12 eligibility standards in the other state. It was  
13 passed in the House on November 16, 2011, and we  
14 don't want to pass in the United States Senate.  
15 It has received a lot of attention recently due to  
16 the case of Meredith Graves, a tourist from  
17 Tennessee who brought her gun to the 9/11  
18 Memorial. And she was arrested. And we don't  
19 want her to be arrested for what appears to be an  
20 innocent mistake. However, we want to emphasize  
21 by passing this resolution to make it clear that  
22 visitors from different states that have different  
23 laws requiring concealed weapons, we don't want  
24 here in New York, people walking into museums with  
25 loaded weapons. And we want to make sure that our

1

2 own decisions, we want to make our own decision  
3 when it comes to firearm regulation, and not defer  
4 to--

5 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Council Member--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: --the  
7 national lowest common denominator. So, I urge  
8 everybody to pass this resolution. Thank you.

9 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you. Next  
10 we have Council Member Robert Jackson, followed by  
11 Council Member Koppell.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you,  
13 my colleagues, I rise in support of Resolution  
14 1122-A, and obviously Gale Brewer has given some  
15 statistics on it. But clearly, the Mayor and the  
16 Police Commissioner are against this particular  
17 matter, and in favor of this Resolution. We don't  
18 want New York City, people to be coming in here  
19 when our laws basically say, "You should not be  
20 carrying guns" and it makes it very, very  
21 difficult to get a licenses to carry, even legally  
22 in New York City. And for people to carry guns in  
23 New York City from other states, from New Jersey,  
24 from Connecticut, from wherever, it's just causing  
25 a ruckus here in our City. We don't need that,

1  
2 and in fact Gale indicated one individual that was  
3 going into the 9/11 Memorial, when it said, "No  
4 guns are allowed," so she went to go check in her  
5 gun with the police officer there, and she was  
6 arrested. But also there was someone else  
7 traveling and either they were at LaGuardia or  
8 Kennedy Airport, and in fact they had a gun in the  
9 case, but they were arrested for carrying a gun.  
10 We don't need that in New York City, and I ask all  
11 of you to support Reso 1122-A. Thank you.

12 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
13 much, next we have Council Member Koppell.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: While I,  
15 while I generally very much respect the legal  
16 acumen of my colleague, Council Member Halloran,  
17 there's nothing I believe in the debate over the  
18 Second Amendment that prevents states from reg--  
19 appropriately regulating guns. I think the,  
20 there's never been a ruling that says that states  
21 can't have licensing requirements for carrying  
22 guns, and there's certainly nothing in the full  
23 faith and credit clause that says that New York  
24 State has to regulate, has to forego regulation of  
25 visitors to New York State with respect not only

1  
2 to carrying guns but all sorts of other things,  
3 merely because the laws may be different in  
4 Mississippi or California or wherever. So, I  
5 really think the legal argument that he seeks to  
6 make is a flawed argument. The idea that we  
7 should allow people to carry guns in New York the  
8 way people carry guns in some other states, I  
9 think is anathema to most of us, and I think it is  
10 important that we speak out. I hope that people  
11 speak out all across the country so that the  
12 Senate, United States Senate, will not follow the  
13 House in what is much misguided legislation. I  
14 support the Resolution.

15 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
16 much. Next we have Council Member Williams,  
17 followed by Council Member Vallone, then Council  
18 Member Barron.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank  
20 you. I'm happy to support all of these  
21 resolutions and anything that can help curb the  
22 gun violence. I think we should all support. In  
23 addition, I hope that we have the same fervor when  
24 it comes to things that I think run tandem with  
25 this, like policies and budget resources that can

1  
2 go to the communities, where a lot of violence are  
3 taking place. I think the violence has more to do  
4 with geography and economic status than anything  
5 else, different persuasions that have lived in  
6 poverty have had violence just as much as these,  
7 and we need to attend to that as well. Doing  
8 these are great, but without tandem policy and  
9 resource problems, we will have violence, maybe  
10 not gun violence, if some of these things help  
11 bring it down, but something else would replace  
12 it. So, I hope we have the same kind of fervor  
13 when the further discussions come. Thank you.

14 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
15 much. Now, next we have Council Member Vallone.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you.  
17 While I absolutely do support this Reso, I do want  
18 to address legitimate concerns raised by same.  
19 Regarding cases like Meredith Graves, I wrote in  
20 an op-ed today that citizens with valid permits  
21 from other states who have no criminal records and  
22 don't intentionally try to break out laws, should  
23 not be facing three-and-a-half years in jail. And  
24 our law does need to be amended. But till then,  
25 I've spoken to the District Attorneys, they can do

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

and will use discretion in cases like this, and I can't point to one right now where someone like this has gone to jail. But again, they shouldn't even face three-and-a-half years in jail. But I do support this, this Resolution, because we here in New York City should be in charge of our own guns, we should not be forced to honor a permit from a place like Florida, which in 2007 gave 1,700 weapons to felons, in violation of national law. So we should be in charge of our own laws, but they do need some amending. Thank you.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very much. Next we have Council Member Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I rise to support these Resolutions, but I also agree that the most violent act on a community is the economic oppression of that community. There's no justification for the violence, but we have a deeper issue. Commissioner Kelly needs to really investigate his Police Department 'cause the people who are doing the guns in our neighborhoods don't apply for licenses. They don't go and apply for anything. These are low level gun dealers and some of the police participate in dealing guns in

1  
2 our community, and some have been arrested for  
3 that. So, when you have police dealing guns, and  
4 we have low level gun dealers who don't apply for  
5 permits, whether it's at a show or anything else,  
6 could care less about any amendment, we have a  
7 serious problem in this City, and these  
8 Resolutions that we're passing now are good for  
9 political face, but the reality is that it's not  
10 going to change the serious problem we have in our  
11 neighborhoods with this gun violence.

12 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
13 much [applause] Silence, silence, please, thank  
14 you. Council Member Halloran.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Thank  
16 you, I'm going to use only 30 seconds, I  
17 appreciate the Chair's indulgence because of the  
18 split time for the last resolution. Let me just  
19 point out that those who hold DMV licenses, which  
20 is a privilege, driving is a privilege not a  
21 right, are entitled to reciprocity in all 50  
22 states. It wasn't just this one woman who was  
23 arrested; in fact, a United States Marine was  
24 arrested at the Empire State Building, doing the  
25 same thing, attempting to check his weapon in,

1  
2 when he saw the signs that handguns were not  
3 permitted. I appreciate Chair Vallone and the  
4 Speaker's overall interest in reducing violence,  
5 but the reality is, there are laws on the books  
6 which make this a crime. I don't believe that's,  
7 that's correct constitutionally. I will differ  
8 with the esteemed former Attorney General, who I  
9 also have great respect for his legal acumen. I  
10 believe the Heller and McDonald decisions have  
11 changed the playing field, and I would point out  
12 that New York City doesn't issue permits. We  
13 don't. And that, and the only way to get one is  
14 to be rich. If you have \$5,000 a week to deposit  
15 in the bank, you can get a pistol permit; if you  
16 don't, you're never going to get one. And that,  
17 ladies and gentlemen, is discrimination. So,  
18 thank you very much, I appreciate the indulgence.

19 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
20 much. Next, now we'll call the vote for Reso  
21 1122-A. All in favor say aye.

22 COUNCIL: Aye.

23 PRESIDENT RIVERA: All opposed say  
24 nay.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: [off mic]

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Nay.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Any abstentions. The ayes have it. Next we will be discussion Resolution 1171, resolution supporting S1973, the Gun Trafficking Prevention Act of 2012, which would amend the United States Code by creating the crime of trafficking or assisting in the trafficking of a firearm, adopted by the Committee on Public Safety. And members that would like to speak on it. Council Member Dickens first.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you, Majority Leader. I want to thank Speaker Quinn and her staff, as well as Chair Vallone and the rest of the Public Safety Committee, and the public safety Committee's Counsel, Carmine Guiga, in his help, their help and support for Resolution 1171, which supports S1973, the Gun Trafficking Prevention Act of 2012, which would amend the United States Code by creating the crime of trafficking or assisting in the trafficking of a firearm, should garner support. This piece of legislation covers five crucial aspects, which are to focus on entire criminal networks, enacting tough penalties for criminals, cracking down on

1  
2 corrupt gun dealers, providing funding for the ATF  
3 and providing protection for responsible, law  
4 abiding gun owners. In all, almost every aspect  
5 of gun trafficking is penalized and covered by  
6 this legislation. We must stop gun violence,  
7 illegal guns kill, ask our children--

8 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Council Member.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: --and ask  
10 our parents. We must pass all of these  
11 resolutions. Thank you.

12 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
13 much. Next we have Council Member Jackson.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you,  
15 my colleagues, I rise again regarding this  
16 resolution, 1171-A, sponsored by our colleague  
17 Inez Dickens. Understanding that anyone that's  
18 involved with trafficking of, and assisting in  
19 trafficking of firearms, and that is even from  
20 dealers that are known to sell illegally or  
21 inappropriately, in my opinion, to people that are  
22 buying guns in order to transport them to New York  
23 City and our urban area. So anyone involved in  
24 helping to bring guns illegally should be  
25 prosecuted. And hopefully in the long term, we

1  
2 will have less guns on our street and less murders  
3 and killings and stickups and all of the things  
4 that are occurring in our community. So, I ask  
5 all of you to support Intro, Resolution 1171.  
6 Thank you.

7 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
8 much. Seeing no others, we'll call the vote on  
9 this Resolution. Resolution 1171, all in favor  
10 say aye.

11 COUNCIL: Aye.

12 PRESIDENT RIVERA: All opposed say  
13 nay. Any abstentions? The ayes have it. Next  
14 we'll be discussing Resolution 1172, Resolution  
15 opposing the United States Supreme Court's  
16 interpretation of Constitution and Citizens United  
17 regarding the constitutional rights of  
18 corporations, supporting an amendment to the  
19 Constitution to provide that corporations are not  
20 entitled to the entirety of protections or rights  
21 of natural persons, specifically so that the  
22 expenditure of corporate money to influence the  
23 electoral process is no longer a form of  
24 constitutionally protected speech, and calling on  
25 Congress to begin the process of amending the

1  
2 Constitution, adopted by the Committee on  
3 Governmental Operations. Anyone wishing to speak  
4 on this item? [applause] [gavel] Silence,  
5 silence in the [gavel] silence, please, thank you.  
6 First we have Council Member Lander, Lander.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you  
8 very much, Mr. Majority Leader. I'm honored to be  
9 sponsoring this resolution along with Council  
10 Member Melissa Mark-Viverito, Council Member  
11 Levin, all members of the Progressive Caucus, and  
12 many other Council Members. And I want to thank  
13 Speaker Quinn and Chair Brewer for their  
14 leadership in moving this resolution along so that  
15 New York City can join the growing chorus of  
16 cities calling for a constitutional amendment to  
17 overturn Citizens United. We're kicking off the  
18 2012 electoral season at a time of unfortunately  
19 historic lack of faith in our democracy. There  
20 are many reasons for this, but one critical one is  
21 the sea of unrestricted corporate dollars flowing  
22 into electoral campaigns all around the country.  
23 Americans of all stripes, left, right and center,  
24 know that corporations aren't the same as people.  
25 They don't laugh or cry, and more importantly they

1  
2 can't possibly merit the rights and  
3 responsibilities of individuals, of citizens, of  
4 free people. Supreme Court was wrong to find that  
5 corporations are people, and the consequences,  
6 especially the unlimited flow of dollars into  
7 elections, are truly disastrous for our democracy.  
8 And so New York City is now growing a chorus of  
9 cities around the country calling for a  
10 constitutional amendment. I do want to thank the  
11 grassroots groups who have been pushing--

12 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Council Member.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: --this  
14 around the country, Occupy Wall Street, Move On,  
15 Common Cause, and the WFP, but it's not a issue of  
16 left or right--

17 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Council Member.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: --it's an  
19 American issue, and we should all support  
20 protecting our democracy and the rights of free  
21 people. Thank you very much. [applause]

22 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
23 much, next we have [gavel] silence up--silence.  
24 Thank you. Next we have Council Member Jackson.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you,

1  
2 my colleagues. I rise again on this Resolution,  
3 1172, and obviously our prime sponsor, Brad  
4 Lander, has spoken about it, but it clear that, as  
5 he indicated, corporations are not human beings,  
6 they cannot give blood or organs or plasma and all  
7 the other things that human beings need in order  
8 to survive. And I say that when it comes to  
9 electoral reform, and the electoral process, even  
10 here in the City Council, as far as the Campaign  
11 Finance Board, Members of the City Council, based  
12 on the rules and regulations and laws, can accept  
13 contributions from individuals and PACs that are  
14 registered with the Campaign Finance Board, but we  
15 cannot accept foreign money and things like that.  
16 Corporations cannot give. So, I say to all of  
17 you, that if you really truly believe in this  
18 justice system, support this Resolution knowing  
19 that we're sending a clear message to our  
20 government that it's not right. Thank you.

21 [applause]

22 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
23 much. [gavel] I'm going to ask everyone in the  
24 balcony to please refrain from applauding. Thank  
25 you. Next we have Council Member James.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Cities  
3 around the country, from Madison to Los Angeles,  
4 are passing similar resolutions, and I am proud  
5 that New York City is standing on the right side  
6 of history. As more resolutions are passed, state  
7 legislatures are encouraged to take up the call to  
8 pass binding legislation, a constitutional  
9 amendment allowing New Yorkers to define the  
10 rights and responsibilities of corporations in a  
11 way that more appropriately fits the reality of  
12 their situation. It's common sense that  
13 corporations are not people, and granting  
14 corporations the rights of peop--of persons, such  
15 as unregulated speech, privacy and protection from  
16 search and seizure, without also expecting  
17 responsibilities of them has caused enormous  
18 damage to our society and way of life. The recent  
19 Citizens United decision overturns 100 years of  
20 judicial precedent. We should not grant  
21 corporations the rights of citizens and we should  
22 return democracy to the people. I vote and  
23 encourage all of my colleagues to vote aye.

24 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
25 much. Next we have Council Member Halloran.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Thank  
3 you. I will rise in opposition to this resolution  
4 for three reasons. The first is, in light of real  
5 constitutional issues like term limits and a  
6 balanced budget amendment, this amendment should  
7 fall into a campaign finance amendment, which is  
8 far more broad and actually will fix the problem  
9 rather than create a new one. It's incredibly  
10 hypocritical for this body to say that we want to  
11 ban corporations from giving money, when unions  
12 can give unfettered amounts of money in local  
13 Council races. And then come to this body to  
14 lobby for their jobs. Now, I support our public  
15 service unions, but that doesn't mean there isn't  
16 an inherent conflict of interest created when  
17 they're giving money to political campaigns and  
18 then coming to those politicians they've elected  
19 and talk about their salaries, their benefits and  
20 their role in government. To say that  
21 corporations unduly influence elections is  
22 absolutely true. But to, at the same breath, not  
23 recognize that unions do the same thing, and sit  
24 here and not modify our campaign finance laws,  
25 which we actually have control over, as opposed to

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

the federal laws which we don't--

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: --seems to me to be the height of hypocrisy. So, I oppose the resolution, not in principle, but on the specifics as they exist. And I appreciate all the work the Speaker has done to try to--

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: --reform that. Thank you.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you.

Council Member Levin, followed by Weprin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very much, Mr. Majority Leader, and thank you, Madam Speaker. I rise in support of Resolution 1172. This is a, this is an important stand for us to take in standing up to the really undue influence of corporations and of corporate interests in our national elections. I think that you don't have to look too much further than former House Speaker Newt Gingrich in seeing what corporate dollars could do that there's no accountability and the way that SuperPACs have been used, just in this Republican primary, is

1  
2 showing us what the results of Citizens United  
3 decision has been thus far. I think that it's  
4 right and just for this body to stand up and say  
5 that we need to limit that influence, we need to  
6 stand up for ordinary citizens in this country,  
7 and make sure that their voice is heard and is not  
8 drowned out by the din of corporate influence.  
9 Thank you very much.

10 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
11 much. Next we have Council Member Weprin.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Thank you,  
13 Mr. Leader. I, I rise in support of this  
14 resolution, as well. Above your head emblazoned  
15 is the words of Abraham Lincoln, "A government of  
16 the people, by the people, for the people." I  
17 have no doubt in my mind that Abraham Lincoln was  
18 not discussing a corporation when he made that  
19 statement. Justice Stevens in his dissent in this  
20 case talked about a corporation not having a  
21 conscience, not having beliefs or feelings, no  
22 thoughts or desires; corporations help structure  
23 and facilitate the activities of human beings, but  
24 are not themselves members of "We the people ..."  
25 by whom the Constitution was established. And it

1  
2 is, while I share frustration that this doesn't  
3 accomplish what we hoped to accomplish right off  
4 the bat, putting Tish James on the Supreme Court  
5 might, but--but eventually we will get that  
6 Justice who, who will understand that this is not  
7 a rational decision, and that corporations and the  
8 money that they are raising, and the ads they are  
9 buying, are poisoning our democratic process. I  
10 support this legislation. Thank you.

11 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
12 much, Council Member; next we have Council Member  
13 Brewer followed by Barron.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you  
15 very much. I want to thank, since it's  
16 Governmental Operations Committee, Seth Grossman  
17 and Tim Matusov, who are the staff members for the  
18 Committee. And I obviously rise in support of  
19 1172, thanking Council Members Lander and Melissa  
20 Mark-Viverito, and also the Speaker. And I wanted  
21 also reference Justice John Paul Stevens, as  
22 Council Member Weprin did. He said, "While  
23 American democracy is imperfect, few outside the  
24 majority of this Court would have thought its  
25 flaws included a dearth of corporate money in

1  
2 politics." And then The Times in talking about  
3 Iowa just this week, mentioned again, it's not  
4 exactly the same, but it did say septic tanks into  
5 which wealthy individuals and corporations can  
6 drop unlimited sums of money when they were  
7 talking about some of the SuperPACs having  
8 influence in Iowa. And in the caucuses. So, I'm  
9 here to be supportive, I want to thank both the  
10 CFB, the Campaign Finance Board, and Common Cause,  
11 for testifying in support of our Resolution at the  
12 Committee. Thank you very much.

13 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
14 much. Next we have Council Member Barron.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you  
16 very much. First of all, there's no comparison  
17 with unions and corporations. [laughter] Unions  
18 are regulated [applause] unions are regulated,  
19 these corporations are off the hook, totally out  
20 of control, and it couldn't have happened to a  
21 better person than Newt Gingrich. [laughter,  
22 applause] 'Cause this was a person who supported  
23 corporate elites having their way and contributing  
24 as much as they want to campaigns; now it turned  
25 around to bite him and he's crying like a little

1  
2 baby. I'm so glad it happened to him, so that  
3 they can get the clear message that this is  
4 putting money, money as the primary source of  
5 influence on elections. People could literally  
6 buy elections. Mitt Romney had some of his own  
7 people on that corporate board and some of his own  
8 donors were contributing to that corporation that  
9 had unlimited money to spend to kill somebody else  
10 and support his campaign, but it couldn't happen  
11 to a better person than New Gingrich.

12 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Next we have  
13 Council Member Williams, followed by Council  
14 Member Ulrich.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank  
16 you. I actually, to the surprise of some people,  
17 think there was some legitimate points in the  
18 Citizens United decision. But they were  
19 questionable at best, and while I do respect my  
20 colleague Halloran, I do also with my colleague  
21 Barron, the corporations and unions are a terrible  
22 comparison. The unions, was what Barron has said,  
23 are comprised of people, and it's the people who  
24 create that power; corporations is comprised of  
25 money, and it's the money that the people are

1  
2 listening to. And too often, we, in our society,  
3 we err on the side of money, and not on the side  
4 of people. As an organizer, one of the things I  
5 believe firmly is we have to shift the power from  
6 the powerful, rich few, to the multitudes and the  
7 people of many. And I believe that's one of the  
8 things that's happening with Occupy Wall Street,  
9 and I'm very proud to support this resolution.

10 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Council Member  
11 Ulrich.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Mr.  
13 Majority Leader, I rise today with a first. I  
14 actually agree with Charles Barron. And but  
15 that's because I'm supporting Governor Romney for  
16 President, so I'm happy that [laughter] I'm happy  
17 that Newt Gingrich did not win the Iowa caucus and  
18 he won't win New Hampshire. But that's a side  
19 note. So, Charles, on that point, we agree and we  
20 are glad that Newt Gingrich will not be the  
21 Republican nominee for President of the United  
22 States. But we are getting to the fundamental  
23 question of whether corporations are or are not  
24 people. And on this issue, Charles and my  
25 colleagues, I respectfully disagree. I do believe

1

2 that corporations are people. Everything that  
3 corporations earn [hissing] eventually goes back  
4 to people in the forms of dividends and a return--

5 SPEAKER QUINN: Give the, please  
6 give Council Member Ulrich.

7 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Yeah, silence in  
8 the balcony and please put a couple of seconds  
9 more on Council Member Ulrich's clock.

10 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: --  
12 Corporations are people in that everything  
13 corporations earn goes back to the people in the  
14 form of dividends to the shareholders. Now you  
15 can believe that or you cannot believe that, I  
16 guess it depends on what your view--

17 SPEAKER QUINN: We need to add more  
18 time to Council Member Ulrich's clock since he's  
19 being disrupted by hissing. So, put five seconds  
20 more back on, please.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you,  
22 thank you, Ms. Speaker. As I was saying,  
23 corporations are people because everything that  
24 corporations earn get returned to the people in  
25 the forms of dividends and the returns to the

1  
2 shareholders. A corporation is made up of people,  
3 a corporation provides jobs for people. We are  
4 not a social democracy, we are a free country with  
5 free enterprise, and corporations deserve a voice  
6 in government as much as the special interests and  
7 the unions, and the public sector organizations  
8 do. I'm voting against this Resolution because I  
9 believe in freedom of opportunity and freedom of  
10 speech, which is in the Constitution. Thank you,  
11 Mr. Majority; thank you, Madam Speaker.

12 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
13 much. [background noise] Council Member  
14 Rodriguez.

15 [pause]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I can  
17 agree that a corporation is made--I can't agree  
18 with my Republican colleague there: a corporation  
19 is made by people, and however we had good people  
20 and we got bad people. And I think that  
21 corporation have been trying to control the  
22 electoral process nationwide, and sometimes even  
23 citywide. And I believe that the message that New  
24 York City have been getting the last couple of  
25 months, especially by the Occupy movement, is that

1  
2 enough is enough. The working class and the  
3 middle class have been sending a message. And it  
4 doesn't matter how much the Mayor tries to evict  
5 the movement from the City, this movement is going  
6 nowhere and this movement will continue growing.  
7 Because this movement is based on the - - the  
8 working class and the middle class, and this  
9 movement is saying we are fed up on looking at  
10 this corporation, trying to control elections.  
11 And I believe that it is time for our generation  
12 to look back and say, "How society has been  
13 working for the last two or three decades? Which  
14 changes should I make?" And I believe bringing  
15 changes which the power should be based on the  
16 people.

17 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Council Member.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Not  
19 based on the corporation, is the right thing to  
20 do, and that's why I support Resolution 1172.  
21 Thank you.

22 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
23 much. Hold on one second. [pause] Seeing no  
24 others speaking on this matter, we're now going to  
25 call--Okay, Council Member Van Bramer.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank  
3 you very much. I just wanted to add my thoughts  
4 on this issue. And my very good friend, Council  
5 Member Ulrich and I have to disagree on this one.  
6 I think the essence of free speech is equality in  
7 the ability for all people regardless of who they  
8 are and how many resources they come to, that they  
9 have an equal say in the process. And to say that  
10 corporations do not have an outsized influence, an  
11 outsized voice, in our process flies in the face  
12 of all reality. Clearly they have more than their  
13 share of influence, more than their share of free  
14 speech, and to equate them with an individual or  
15 to equate a corporation with a union that  
16 represents working people and as a collective,  
17 empowers those people to have a fair shot at going  
18 toe-to-toe with corporations, is just dead wrong.  
19 I support this, the Supreme Court was wrong, we  
20 are right to pass this Resolution. Thank you.

21 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
22 much. Seeing no others on this Resolution, I will  
23 now call the vote for Resolution 1172. All in  
24 favor say aye.

25 COUNCIL (MOST): Aye.

1  
2 PRESIDENT RIVERA: All opposed to  
3 say nay.

4 COUNCIL MEMBERS (FEW): Nay.

5 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Any abstentions?  
6 The ayes have it. There are no other resolutions,  
7 so now we go [applause] [gavel] Okay, silence,  
8 silence in the balcony, please. [gavel] We need  
9 to get silence in the balcony. Thank you very  
10 much. Next we'll move on to general discussions.  
11 Seeing Council Member Rodriguez.

12 [pause]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Okay.  
14 Today I'm introducing a Resolution which also is  
15 supported the Speaker Christine Quinn and the  
16 Immigration Chairman, Danny Dromm, which is a  
17 introduction resolution to authorize the Council  
18 to join an amicus brief being sent to the Supreme  
19 Court as they prepare to decide on the fate of  
20 Arizona Senate Bill 1070. In the year-and-a-half  
21 since it's been 1070 was signed into law, it has  
22 come to represent the worst aspect of our  
23 country's attitude towards immigrations. But  
24 requiring immigrants--

25 SPEAKER QUINN: If we could just

1  
2 get a little quiet as folks exit, also, and put a  
3 couple of seconds back on for Council Member  
4 Rodriguez. Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: --by  
6 requiring immigrants to carry their registration  
7 papers with them at all time, it in my, it is a  
8 stigmatize thing, by requiring law enforcement to  
9 detain anyone they suspect of being undocumented  
10 immigrant, they criminalize them. I am an  
11 immigrant. Many of the Council Members in this  
12 room are immigrants, too, nearly 40 percent of the  
13 people in this City are immigrants, and so many  
14 more have parents and grandparents who were  
15 immigrants. We are a City of immigrants and as  
16 such it is our duty to support their right. I  
17 urge all of my colleague in the Council to sign to  
18 this Resolution and to help us to send a message  
19 that New York City strongly supports the rights of  
20 immigrants not only here but across the country.

21 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very  
22 much. Seeing no others, this meeting is  
23 adjourned.

24 [gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, JOHN DAVID TONG certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "John David Tong". The signature is written in a dark ink and is positioned to the right of the printed word "Signature".

Date January 20, 2012