CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

----X

October 27, 2011 Start: 10:10 a.m. Recess: 10:40 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers

City Hall

B E F O R E:

MARK S. WEPRIN Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Council Member Leroy G. Comrie, Jr. Council Member Daniel R. Garodnick Council Member Vincent M. Ignizio

Council Member Robert Jackson Council Member Jessica Lappin Council Member Diana Reyna

Council Member Ydanis A. Rodriguez Council Member Larry B. Seabrook

Council Member James Vacca Council Member Albert Vann

Council Member

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Carlo Fortunato Owner La Piazzetta

2	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Good morning,
3	everyone, I'm sorry for the delay. We're going to
4	get started. We have a number of café
5	applications here today, sidewalk café
6	applications, that we're going to start right in
7	with Land Use No. 495, which is Cariño Café or
8	restaurant. And I would like to ask Yesenia, come
9	on up, come to this table. Santibanez. Sorry,
10	you what? [background comment, pause] Yeah, no
11	problem, all right, have a seat. Trying to move
12	we're just taking 'em in order, so we're happy to
13	get back to you. All right, next will be from La
14	Piazzetta. And that is, whoever you are, start
15	coming up, and I'll figure who you are, what your
16	name is. Okay. Carlo Fortunato. And what I'd
17	like you to do is please go to the microphone,
18	you'll push the button, state your name, describe
19	your application and where we are with this. And
20	before you do that, let me just say, we are here
21	with Council Member Robert Jackson, Council Member
22	Al Vann, Council Member Leroy Comrie, Council
23	Member Dan Garodnick, Council Member Larry
24	Seabrook from the Committee, and we're joined by
25	Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez. Thank you.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES
2	CARLO FORTUNATO: Good morning.
3	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Hi, just make
4	sure the mic's on, it's sometimes counterintuitive
5	there.
6	CARLO FORTUNATO: Well. Good
7	morning, name Carlo Fortunato. We're proposing
8	unenclosed sidewalk permit, for three tables and
9	14 chairs.
10	[pause]
11	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay. Could I
12	ask this queI know there was some issue with the
13	planters in front of the restaurant.
14	CARLO FORTUNATO: Yes.
15	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Can you just
16	make it, tell me what happened with that?
17	CARLO FORTUNATO: They were removed
18	yesterday, and I have a photograph here with me,
19	along with
20	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [interposing]
21	All right, if you can give that to the Sergeant-
22	at-Arms. [pause] Okay. Looking at a picture of
23	a street, I have a picture before and after
24	picture, you're going to have to trust me on this,
25	panel, so we don'tand planters are in the first

NESTOR ROSARO: That's okay.

their attorney, they've never had any complaints
about excessive noise, sell to minors, anything
like that, the zone of the premises. It's a very
clean, family oriented restaurant. They want to
put in four tables outside, so to have a sidewalk
café. I think this will be good for the
community, 'cause it would add, you know,
something to the community. They, they have
approved plans from the Department of Consumer
Affairs, which Councilman Jackson has. The plans
show that there's sufficient space between the bus
stop and the sidewalk café. And, you know, I
think it should be approved because it is a nice
restaurant, and it's going to add to the
community. They're not, you know, all family
oriented, they close by 11:00 o'clock. Over the
restaurant is like a, there's no apartments over
the restaurant, so they've never had any problems
with excessive noise.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay, thank

you. The, there was the one issue, I know I got a

letter to this effect, has to do with, from Mr.

Rossi [phonetic] about the A-framed menu that was

placed in front of the restaurant.

)	NESTOR	ROSARO:	Yes.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: I understand there's an agreement to remove that A-framed menu?

NESTOR ROSARO: She has removed it already, and she did sing the agreement to keep it off there, off the sidewalk.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Right, and that's the letter I have, which is addressed to me and Members of the Committee, saying that A-frame is gone. Council Member Jackson, who represents this area, would you, would you like to say anything, R.J.?

thank you, Mr. Chair. I've lived in that area for over 35 years, and in fact my children all went to the school which is right around the corner. So I know the area very, very well. And in fact, I've been to the restaurant one time when our U.S. Senator Gillibrand, we had a reception for her there, a lunch reception. It is a family restaurant. I don't have any issues and concerns as far as anything that they do. I haven't received any complaints about noise or anything else. And in fact, after they filed their

petition, I went by there, on a very, very busy
day, a Sunday in which we had the medieval
festival up in Fort Tryon Park, where during the
course of the day there was 60,000 people in the
park. So, traffic on Fort Washington Avenue and
all of the restaurants, extremely heavy, and in
fact, I went by the restaurant and it was booked.
I mean, they were filled to the brim. And I
looked at the sidewalks, I know the bus stop in
question, so any issue or concern that anyone has,
I don't have them, as someone that lived in that
area, that have experienced that. I do know that
there is no noise complaints. There was an issue
raised as far as the sidewalk is not wide enough.
I don't have that concern. And so I'm in
agreement with the Department of Consumer Affairs,
and approving this permit as per requested, for
four tables with 16 chairs. So, I would recommend
to my fellow, I was going to say fellow employees
[laughter] my fellow Council Members
CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: We all work
for you, Robert.
COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON:my

fellow Council Members that we approve this

2 request. Thank y

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you,

Council Member Jackson. Obviously he likes this

restaurant and approves of this café request.

Does anyone on the panel or anyone here would like

to make a statement or comment? Okay, seeing

none, great, thank you very much.

NESTOR ROSARO: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: We appreciate your coming down and sorry to have kept you here so long.

NESTOR ROSARO: That's okay, thank you very much.

We'll be voting at the end of the Committee. The next i--[pause] Okay. We're going to call on--we have someone here for--Alligator Lounge, which is Land Use No. 502. And that's on Metropolitan Avenue. Okay. I don't think she filled out a slip, but we're going to let her go. Do you need her to fill it out now? She, can you bring her a slip just to fill out right there while she sits there.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: The young lady?

Thank you, Mr. Chair, and to the Committee. I just wanted to apologize for not being here for La Piazzetta. had had conversations with the owners of La Piazzetta, and I just wanted to confirm approval in support of La Piazzetta's sidewalk café application. And moving onto the Alligator Lounge, I just wanted to clarify certain concerns that were raised at the community board level. Did you participate at the public safety committee hearing process at the community board level, Ms.

19

20

21

22

23

24

since then, I recently became the manager, that

22 give out free--should I explain like what we--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Sure, that

24 would help. [laughs]

25 CANDICE MURPHY: Okay, for--

2	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I've never
3	been to your establishment.
4	CANDICE MURPHY: Okay, well, for
5	every alcoholic beverage that you purchase, you
6	get a free personal inch, ten inch pizza. That's
7	just plain cheese and you can add, you know, a
8	dollar per topping if you want toppings. But we
9	do have a kitchen and we do prep food there. We
10	have a brick oven. So I mean, we, we do on like
11	a, on a good night, around 300 pizzas. I mean,
12	they're all, and they're all free, it comes out
13	of, you know, I mean, it comes out of our pocket.
14	But he said that it, because it's free it wasn't
15	considered a restaurant. But I can tell you that
16	every single of my employees has gone through the
17	food handler certification, and I actually have my
18	card I brought with me, if I can show you guys.
19	[pause] And our pizza's better than the
20	Charleston.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: [laughs]
22	CANDICE MURPHY: [laughs]
23	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Thank you
2.4	verv much

CANDICE MURPHY: I have actually

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 16
2	been through the program twice. On accident, but
3	I have been, so it's kind of drilled in my memory.
4	And
5	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Of course.
6	CANDICE MURPHY:we are, and when
7	the Health Department came in for our last
8	inspection, we had no violations, no warnings at
9	all, or any sort ofwe got an A on door, which
10	I'm sure you know, 'cause I'm sure you know about,
11	that they're very strict with the way that they
12	give their letter grades now. And we had
13	absolutely nothing wrong with the, with the
14	restaurant. So.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Okay.
16	CANDICE MURPHY: So, I do consider
17	ourselves a restaurant.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Right, so
19	you have a food handling license.
20	CANDICE MURPHY: Mm-hmm.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Your permits
22	are up to date.
23	CANDICE MURPHY: Mm-hmm.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: you are
25	considered a restaurant according to DOH

regulations. You h	have gone through the process	
for food handling l	licensing for each of your sta	ff
members handling fo	ood. I understand it's brick	
oven pizza, and it'	's free, with the additional	
toppings being one	dollar per topping.	

CANDICE MURPHY: Yep.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: The issue of the patio being open late, did you by any chance write a letter confirming what you have agreed upon with the community board regarding a consensus as to being aware as the manager and the conscious effort in making sure that beyond 1:00 a.m., the establishment will shut down what would be the patio being out late?

CANDICE MURPHY: Mm-hmm. I did
not, at the last, I didn't realize that they
wanted a letter. But at the last meeting I went
to, I, you know, explained to them that I have
been ev--I mean, I go in every, every single shift
and make sure they've put the patio in. And I
call the bar, you know, just to make sure, because
we've been taking this very seriously.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Mm-hmm.

CANDICE MURPHY: And they said that

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2	they've seen it out there still, which I have not
3	And I, I mean, I call every day. So, maybe there
4	was some sort of misunderstanding, but I'm more
5	than willing to sign a letter, and I'm willing to
6	work with the community board and, you know, you
7	know, check in with them, you know, monthly, if
8	they want, just to

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA:

CANDICE MURPHY: 'Cause I'm, I'm as concerned about, you know, of course, if people are complaining about something, I want to know something about my restaurant.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Can you have a, the letter addressed to this Committee.

CANDICE MURPHY: Mm-hmm.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: So that we have a copy to our, in our files, in our records, as well as just cc'ing the community board, so that at least they're aware that this was discussed here at the City Council level, and your agreement in that letter is agreeing to secure that the patio service is shut down after 1:00 a.m. Your hours of operation. What are they regarding the establishment?

know, random things. But nothing to do with noise, at all.

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Okay.

2	CANDICE MURPHY: And I just, I've
3	never had anyone come in and complain, and I mean,
4	of course, I would deal with it
5	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Right.
6	CANDICE MURPHY:right away, but
7	I'm, I've just, it's never been an issue. Our
8	doors are closed, 'cause we've got big open doors,
9	that go onto the patio. I mean, we close those at
10	8:00 o'clock. And the music's never that loud. I
11	have a decibel reader, I forget what themy, my
12	sound engineer goes outside with the decibel
13	reader, he actually makes sure that we are not
14	going over. We don't want violations for it being
15	too loud, of course.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Right,
17	right.
18	CANDICE MURPHY: But I mean, our
19	speakers aren't that loud anyway, so.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Mm-hmm.
21	CANDICE MURPHY: And after, I mean,
22	our door guys know that because there's people
23	that live on each side, I have signs up saying
24	that, "Do not sit on the step," so people don't do
25	that. I mean, I can't control what, what they do,

_	
2	CANDICE MURPHY: Thank you.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA:clarifying
4	a lot of these concerns.
5	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Ms. Murphy, if
6	I can jump in, any letter that you do write to the
7	community board or anyone else, please make sure
8	to give it, send us a copy, too.
9	CANDICE MURPHY: Definitely.
10	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Peter, we
11	never remember his last name either, it's very
12	confusing. You got to send it to Peter and Land
13	Use, and that's good, you know.
14	CANDICE MURPHY: [laughs]
15	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Janice
16	[phonetic] is a tough name to, people don't
17	remember. Anybody else have any questions about
18	this item? [pause]
19	CANDICE MURPHY: [laughs] Every
20	day. [laughs]
21	[pause]
22	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay, we have
23	a time constraint on, so if you can get that
24	letter, you know, we're going to take up the item
25	today.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 23
2	CANDICE MURPHY: Okay.
3	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: But we need
4	you to get us that letter and the letter's out,
5	before, later toby the end of today, or tomorrow
6	at the latest, you know?
7	CANDICE MURPHY: No, no problem. I
8	can do it today.
9	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Andokay. So
10	if you can do that, then because we'll be
11	considering it with the Land Use Committee, and
12	before that we want to do that. When is the Land
13	Use? [background noise] Next week, right? But
14	we need it, we need it today, anyway, just to make
15	sure we got it.
16	CANDICE MURPHY: No problem.
17	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay?
18	CANDICE MURPHY: Sure.
19	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you.
20	Anyone else
21	CANDICE MURPHY: Thank you.
22	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN:comments or
23	questions? [pause, background comments] Yeah,
24	okay. [laughter] All right, thank you very much.
25	She couldn't get out of that seat fast enough.
	<u> </u>

renewal of our outdoor café permit, at ten tables, 20 seats. There were several concerns raised at the community level that we have since addressed.

24

2.

Ready to present to the Board with a letter saying
that we've addressed those, including removing one
of our tables due to the fire escape coming down
in the café area, noise level, as well as some
planters that were outside, as well.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay.

Terrific, I'm sorry, Jessica. Knocked everything off the desk here. Well, thank you very much. I have a letter here. Who is Ryan Tarantino?

RYAN TARANTINO: That's me.

Okay. A letter from Ryan Tarantino to Speaker
Quinn about this. And I'll just read you these,
the items on this letter that were written.

Number one was we will remove one table and two
chairs; number three, four and five, respective,
in order to allow for the safe deployment of an
overhead fire escape ladder, as you mentioned, in
accordance with New York City Fire Department
regulations. This change will be reflected in
revised plans submitted by the New York City, to
the New York City Department of Consumer Affairs.
Two, we will remove the two topiary planters
located on either side of the restaurant entrance.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2	Lot	of	anti-planters	things	going	on	today.

3 Number three, in response to community concerns

4 about the level of noise emanating from the

5 restaurant, we have installed a half-inch thick

6 curtain that has been fire rated. Whatever the

7 heck that means. Four, we have removed the

8 platform which was formerly in the sidewalk café

9 zone, in accordance with the New York City

10 Consumer Affairs regulation. Mr. Tarantino, those

11 things all still apply, correct?

RYAN TARANTINO: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: I understand from Speaker Quinn's office that she is, has agreements on this, and everything is okay, had gotten the nod from the audience. And does anyone else on the panel have anything they want to say to these two gentlemen? [background comment] Good luck. Even Diana Reyna doesn't have anything to say to these gentlemen, I'm surprised. - - Okay. [background comments, crosstalk, pause] All right. Any copies you send to DCA, as you say in your letter, please send us a copy, as well.

RYAN TARANTINO: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Okay.

FRANK NALAVACO: Yes. Nalavaco, I'm the representative for Hashi Sushi Fusion, Inc. And they needed to reduce the amount

23

24

2	of tables and chairs due to a fire escape issue.
3	I have a letter, if I can just read off the
4	letter. This letter was written from the
5	President of Hashi Sushi. I, Liliana Rodriguez,
6	President of Hashi Sushi Fusion, have made the
7	following changes to my sidewalk café: I have
8	removed four tables, eight chairs from the
9	southern end of the outside café area, freeing up
10	approximately 27 square feet of sidewalk area.
11	The tables and chairs were removed from both front
12	and back lines of the café. This was done in
13	order to allow a fire escape ladder full
14	deployment onto the sidewalk, allowing for proper
15	egress of persons in case of emergency. The plans
16	have been updated and they also show the
17	installation of a New York City MUNI parking
18	meter. The removal of the tables and chairs is
19	permanent, and will not be added back as part of
20	any future renewal of this sidewalk café license.
21	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Thank you very
22	much. I just want to say Council Member Lappin is
23	here, as well as Council Member Vacca. Council
24	Member Jackson, did you want to make a comment

about this? I know you had the discussions.

item? Seeing none, we thank you very much.

Т	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 3.
2	sorry, yes, Yesenia.
3	YESENIA SANTIBANEZ: Good morning.
4	This letter goes to, to your Council Member Reyna.
5	This letter serves as our agreement with the
6	Chair, Council Member Mark Weprin, and the
7	encompassing members of the Subcommittee on Zoning
8	and Franchises, that we will commit to the
9	following: one, to remove the planter located on
10	the right side of the restaurant (see attached
11	photo showing the removal of the planter).
12	Sincerely, Yesenia Santibanez,
13	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Note to other
14	restaurateurs in the City, no planters, I guess,
15	all right? That's the message of the day.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: [off mic]
17	Well, you can.
18	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: You can, I
19	don't know.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: [off mic]
21	You can, there's a rule.
22	STEVE WYGODA: Yeah, if it's within
23	the
24	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: [interposing]
25	Right, I understand. Within rules, but just seems

2	today. Yeah, we have a picture here of the
3	restaurant without the, without the planter, that
4	was in front of the houimproperly put. And
5	there's the space where it used to be. Ms. Reyna,
6	did you want to comment andon this?
7	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Thank you,
8	Mr. Chair. I just wanted to ask, Ms. Yesenia, as
9	the owner, are you aware that you can have a
10	planter, it just has to be part of your
11	architectural designs.
12	YESENIA SANTIBANEZ: Yes, yes.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Okay. And
14	you're choosing not to include it in your
15	architectural design, is that the cases?
16	YESENIA SANTIBANEZ: That's
17	correct.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Okay.
19	Fantastic. I just, I don't want the
20	misinterpretation that you cannot have a planter.
21	The issue is that the architectural designs do not
22	reflect so.
23	YESENIA SANTIBANEZ: I
24	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And so it
25	comes up as an issue, it flags it.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 34						
2	CHAIRPERSON WEPRIN: Aye.						
3	COUNSEL: Council Member Lappin.						
4	COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: [off mic]						
5	Aye.						
6	COUNSEL: Council Member Reyna.						
7	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I vote aye.						
8	I just wanted to express that the letter for						
9	Alligator Lounge should be submitted before the						
10	end of this business day, for the record, thank						
11	you.						
12	COUNSEL: Council Member Comrie.						
13	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I vote aye.						
14	COUNSEL: Council Member Jackson.						
15	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Aye on						
16	all.						
17	COUNSEL: Council Member Seabrook.						
18	COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: [off mic]						
19	Aye on all.						
20	COUNSEL: Council Member Vann.						
21	COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: [off mic] Aye						
22	on all.						
23	COUNSEL: Council Member Garodnick.						
24	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.						

COUNSEL: Council Member Vacca.

[background noise, silence until

1		SUBCOMMITTEE	ON	ZONING	AND	FRANCHISES	3	6
2	end]							

I, JOHN DAVID TONG certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature

Date November 16, 2011