

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

-----X

October 5, 2011
Start: 2:37 pm
Recess: 3:53 pm

HELD AT: Emigrant Savings Bank
49-51 Chambers Street

B E F O R E:
JOEL RIVERA
President Pro Tempore

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Christine C. Quinn
Maria del Carmen Arroyo
Charles Barron
Gale A. Brewer
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Inez E. Dickens
Erik Martin Dilan
Daniel Dromm
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras
Lewis A. Fidler
Helen D. Foster
Daniel R. Garodnick

A P P E A R A N C E S

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

James F. Gennaro
Vincent J. Gentile
Sara M. Gonzalez
David Greenfield
Daniel J. Halloran III
Vincent M. Ignizio
Robert Jackson
Letitia James
G. Oliver Koppell
Karen Koslowitz
Brad S. Lander
Jessica S. Lappin
Stephen T. Levin
Melissa Mark-Viverito
Darlene Mealy
Rosie Mendez
Michael C. Nelson
James S. Oddo
Annabel Palma
Domenic M. Recchia, Jr.
Diana Reyna
Joel Rivera
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Larry B. Seabrook
James Vacca
Peter F. Vallone, Jr.
James G. Van Bramer
Albert Vann
Mark S. Weprin
Jumaane D. Williams

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Rocky Sanabria

Drew Champagne

Doris Champagne-Gilkes

Patricia Gilkes

Ariel Zwang

CEO

Safe Horizon

Steve Parrish

Board Chair

Safe Horizon

Liz Roberts

Chief Program Officer

Safe Horizon

Nathan Fields

Senior VP

Safe Horizon

Michael Polenberg

VP for Government Affairs

Safe Horizon

Rev. Que English

Bronx Christian Fellowship

1
2 SPEAKER QUINN: We're going to
3 start ceremonials, so if we could get a little
4 quiet. They may have to leave before we get into
5 the thick of the Stated Meeting, but I just wanted
6 to mention that Council Member Brewer is hosting
7 Mr. Harvey Lichtman's Brandeis High School Civics
8 class. So if they could stand up so we could
9 recognize them.

10 [Applause]

11 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you guys very
12 much for coming. That'd be terrific. All right,
13 so we have three ceremonials today. The first one
14 is being led by Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer,
15 and if I could ask Jimmy and Rocky and his family
16 to come on up. I just had the great honor of
17 getting to meet and spend--why don't you guys go
18 on the other side--spend a little time with Rocky,
19 so when I say listen up and pay attention to this
20 ceremonial, because this is a remarkable,
21 remarkable young man, I am not kidding. So Jimmy,
22 thank you for making sure I got to spend some time
23 with Rocky and that all of the members get to meet
24 him as well. Let me give the microphone to Jimmy.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank

1
2 you very much, Madame Speaker, and thank you to my
3 colleagues who are here. Rocky Sanabria is
4 someone who gives me great hope that our world is
5 going to be a better, more just and safer place.
6 At 13 years of age, a Woodsider who goes to school
7 in Maspeth Queens, despite years of bullying and
8 some school administrators who were--to be kind--
9 less than sensitive, Rocky has persevered and now
10 has a 93 average in school.

11 [Applause]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Is a
13 playwright in his own right, and a few months ago
14 wrote me a letter, the most powerful letter I've
15 ever received. We weren't sure--we didn't know
16 you yet, we didn't know how smart Rocky was--but
17 we called mom, who is right here, and said "did
18 you write that letter for Rocky?" She said "oh,
19 no, he wrote ever word of it." So we had a
20 meeting in my office last month, and Rocky said,
21 despite all that's been done to Rocky that what he
22 wants to do is make the world safer for other kids
23 and to make sure--they don't have to be
24 transgender, they can be African American, Latino,
25 immigrants, overweight--Rocky said my story will

1
2 make it safer for all of them if I can tell my
3 story. And he wants to be a motivational speaker.

4 [Applause]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So, we
6 wanted to honor him today for his courage and for
7 his life story. But also, and this is the biggest
8 treat of all, I knew that at a ceremonial, Rocky
9 would actually get a turn at the mic and deliver
10 his first public remarks to launch his career as a
11 motivational speaker.

12 [Applause]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So I
14 just want to thank the Speaker, I want to thank
15 all of my colleagues. I want to recognize his
16 parents, who are here today, Gina Michael Sanabria
17 are both here.

18 [Applause]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: His
20 sister is here, and this is so significant, his
21 best friend Andres from school is here. And
22 grandma is sitting in the back. She's a little
23 bit shy, but grandma is in the back. So thank
24 you, Rocky, that meeting was one of the best
25 meetings. I've taken thousands of meetings since

1
2 I've been a Council Member. That was the single
3 best, most profound meeting I've ever. So thank
4 you for being who you are, and thank you for all
5 the great work you're going to do and all the
6 people you're going to help.

7 SPEAKER QUINN: What's going to
8 happen is the clerk's going to read this, and then
9 we're going to hear from you. Before I ask the
10 clerk to read the proclamation, I said some nice
11 things, which aren't the half of it about Rocky.
12 I really want to take a moment also to thank his
13 parents and his sister, and his grandmother in the
14 back, thank you, and his friend Andres.

15 [Applause]

16 SPEAKER QUINN: Rocky is clearly
17 somebody who is super smart, incredibly
18 articulate, and really strong. When I said to him
19 I'm sorry for everything that's happened to you,
20 he said, "well, it just makes me stronger." That
21 is an outlook that is best learned from your
22 parents. He is so lucky to have you guys and his
23 sister and his friend. So many transgendered
24 people don't have that, and it makes it an even
25 harder road. I just want to thank you guys so

1
2 much, because you're a great power of example
3 about what love in a house can do for children.
4 So thank you very, very much, all of you, for
5 being such great supports to Rocky. Now, if we
6 could ask the clerk to read the proclamation.

7 CLERK: Council, City of New York
8 proclamation. The Council of the City of New York
9 is proud to honor Rocky Sanabria for his
10 outstanding work illuminating the experiences of
11 transgender youth. And whereas, Rocky was certain
12 of his gender identity since he was 2-years-old.
13 At the age of 4, he asked mother, "what if there
14 was a girl and a boy that lived inside her body?"
15 Then he would ask what she seems in him and
16 correct her when she said a girl. Rocky was very
17 lucky to have a very supportive mother, father and
18 sister.

19 And whereas, school was more
20 challenging. After kindergarten, the principal
21 removed Rocky from gen ed classes and placed him
22 in special education classes, citing his tomboy
23 issues. And whereas, in the first grade, Rocky's
24 own classmates were harsh. When lines of students
25 were divided with boys in one line and girls on

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

the other, Rocky was pushed into the middle and told he didn't know who he was.

And whereas today, at the age of 13, Rocky attends I.S. 73 as a student in eighth grade. Last year was the hardest of all, but it made him stronger. When he's not singing, playing the drums, guitar and entertaining others, he spends his free time writing screenplays. He also wrote a play which was to be performed by the seventh grade, maintains a 93 percent average for the seventh grade and was place in SP, which is higher than his honors class.

And whereas despite all the challenges that Rocky has endured, he remains positive and continues to be true to himself. He also seeks to connect with other kids facing their own unique issues.

And whereas, by staying true to himself, Rocky has fostered a greater understanding of gender identity and gender expression throughout our community. We wish Rocky continued success in his battle and in all of his endeavors in the years ahead.

Now, therefore, be it known that

1
2 the Council of the City of New York is proud to
3 honor Rocky Sanabria for his outstanding service
4 and contributions to the City of New York.

5 Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for the entire
6 Council, Jimmy Van Bramer, Council Member 26th
7 District Queens, Daniel Dromm, Council Member 25th
8 District Queens, Rosie Mendez, Council Member 2nd
9 District Manhattan.

10 SPEAKER QUINN: Yay.

11 [Applause]

12 SPEAKER QUINN: Rocky, the mic is
13 now yours.

14 ROCKY SANABRIA: Well, I would like
15 to thank Councilman Van Bramer and his staff for
16 their time and this great opportunity. I'd also
17 like to thank my mom, dad, family and friends for
18 their love and support. My endocrinologist once
19 told me that ever problem leads to a great
20 opportunity. Boy was he right. My goals and
21 dreams for the future is to become a motivational
22 speaker. What a great way to start.

23 [Applause]

24 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you so much,
25 Rocky. Thank you so much. Great job. One more

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

pic.

[Pause]

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you guys very much. Stay in touch, Rocky.

[Pause]

SPEAKER QUINN: All right, next, we're going to have a ceremonial led by Council Member Barron, who is going to salute another remarkable young New Yorker.

[Pause]

SPEAKER QUINN: If Drew and his family could come on up, that would be terrific.

[Pause]

SPEAKER QUINN: Let's hear it for Drew.

[Applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Let's give, a real hero. This is the young man, as he comes forward, who saved his mother. He called 911. It's been all over the television. Come on over, Drew. Seven-years-old. The story is incredible. He's been in the news, in the newspaper, on every channel. This young man is special. And he, when his mother was fallen very, very ill, not only did

1
2 he call 911, but he let them know that they better
3 hurry up and get here. And he gave them his
4 father's phone number. He gave them the phone
5 number to the family that lived downstairs. He
6 gave his relatives' number and he knew exactly
7 what to do in an emergency, and they got there
8 quick. Now his mother is doing very, very well
9 now.

10 [Applause]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thanks to
12 our little hero. So let's give him..

13 [Applause]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: This is
15 Drew Champagnie and this is Ms. Donna Gilkes
16 Champagnie and this is the grandmother, Patricia
17 Gilkes. So let's give them a big handclap.

18 [Applause]

19 SPEAKER QUINN: What a remarkable
20 story. Drew, you could remember more phone
21 numbers than I could on any day. So thank you so
22 much for saving your mom and showing all of us how
23 we can help out in emergency situations and
24 keeping your head calm. Thank you very, very
25 much, Drew. If we could, ask the clerk to please

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

read the proclamation.

CLERK: Council, City of New York
proclamation. Whereas, the Council of the City of
New York is proud to honor Drew Champagnie for his
life-saving heroic call to 911. Whereas, shortly
after 8 a.m., on the morning of Tuesday, September
20th, 2011 in East New York Brooklyn, Drew was
home with his mother, Doris Champagnie-Gilkes, who
was preparing him to go to school. Suddenly, when
his mother collapsed and started suffering from a
seizure, without panicking, Drew went downstairs,
picked up the phone and dialed 911.

And whereas, fortunately Drew's
grandmother and uncle, a New York City paramedic,
had taught Drew what to do in case his mother had
a seizure. When the 911 operator answered, Drew
did not simply scream help, like many other people
might. "She fell down," he said. "She's shaking.
My mom is sick. Come as fast as you can." He
then calmly told the dispatcher his address,
apartment number, phone number and his father's
cell phone number.

And whereas, within minutes,
paramedics arrived at the Cypress Hills home; Drew

1
2 let them in and they swiftly reached Drew's ailing
3 mother and after a series of tests at Kings County
4 Hospital, she was soon in stable condition.

5 Because of Drew's quick thinking action, Ms.
6 Champagnie-Gilkes is alive today.

7 And whereas, Drew has repeatedly
8 demonstrated the critical importance of parents
9 teaching their children to call 911 in an
10 emergency. On September 22nd, 2011, Drew was
11 official sworn in as a junior emergency medical
12 technician.

13 [Applause]

14 CLERK: By FDNY Fire Commissioner
15 Salvatore Cassano, Chief of Department Edward
16 Kilduff and Chief of EMS Abdo Nahmod. Now,
17 therefore, be it known, that the Council of the
18 City of New York gratefully honors Drew Champagnie
19 for responding to unexpected life-threatening
20 situation with a courageous call to 911 and for
21 serving as a wonderful role model for New Yorkers
22 of all ages. Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for the
23 entire Council; Charles Barron, Council Member
24 42nd District Brooklyn; Robert Jackson, Council
25 Member 7th District Manhattan, Fernando Cabrera,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Council Member 14th District the Bronx.

SPEAKER QUINN: Yay, a junior EMT.

I am impressed.

[Applause]

SPEAKER QUINN: Very impressed.

Mom, would you like to say a few words?

DORIS CHAMPAGNIE-GILKES: Thanks to the Council for recognizing Drew. Drew is like my little angel. He's always watching over me. I'd like to thank my mother. She's the one that teaches him everything, even his homework. She's a good mother. Thank you, mom, I love.

[Applause]

PATRICIA GILKES: I want to thank my councilman very much for doing this job, for doing what you do for Drew. Thank you so much. And I want to say thank you to everybody that's here. I was in Barbados when I happened, so I wasn't at home. Thank you.

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. Drew, do you want to say anything?

DREW CHAMPAGNIE: Thank you.

SPEAKER QUINN: All right.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Good

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

enough.

[Applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: One of the things, we know that Drew is very honorary firefighter too, because we need more blacks in the Fire Department. Drew has helped us with that. But they can't count that. All right. Thank you very much.

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you all very, very much. You all take care and be well.

[Pause]

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very much. We have one more ceremonial. If I could, ask the folks from Safe Horizons to make their way up. We have Ariel Zwang, the CEO; Steve Parrish, the board chair; Liz Roberts, the chief program officer; Nathan Fields, the senior vice president for the shelters and the hotlines and Michael Polenberg, who used to work here at the City Council, is now the VP for government affairs. It's amazing we even still talk to Safe Horizons.

We wanted to take a moment on this Domestic Violence Awareness Month--all the Council Members, come on up--to thank Safe Horizons. You

1
2 guys are amazing partners with us right now in the
3 domestic violence outreach effort that Chair
4 Ferreras has developed with Police Commissioner
5 Kelly. But really Safe Horizons, every month,
6 every day is there for the Council, for victims of
7 crime, victims of domestic violence, sexual
8 assault and really helping these New Yorkers no
9 longer be victims but become survivors.

10 You are a critical arm of city
11 government. You deliver service in a better, more
12 efficient, more sensitive way than we ever could,
13 we are just honored to be associated with you, and
14 grateful and thankful for all the support you give
15 us.

16 This month I hope is a month where
17 we engage more New Yorkers in our battle against
18 domestic violence. I know you are all helping us
19 do that. Let me give the mic to the great chair
20 of our Women's Issues Committee, Julissa Ferreras.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Thank
22 you. The Speaker said everything so perfectly.
23 But I just wanted to say thank you in particular
24 to partnering with us with the workplace training.
25 I think it's very important and what you're going

1
2 to be doing with the chamber, we're really making
3 history here. Safe Horizon is about, you know,
4 you think being safe and giving people a new life
5 and seeing to the horizon and seeing hope, but
6 you've also made the city a lot safer. I thank
7 you for that. I'm sure the women's caucus also
8 stands with us together, because we're lucky to
9 have you as a partner.

10 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very,
11 very much. If I could, ask the clerk to read the
12 proclamation please?

13 CLERK: Council, City of New York
14 proclamation. Whereas, for 31 years, Safe Horizon
15 has responded to domestic violence, child abuse
16 and other violent crimes by helping the victims
17 and their families heal and rebuild their lives.
18 It provides a wide array of practical services,
19 from a new lock and 24 hour hotlines to safe
20 shelter and food, as well as central support
21 services, like mental health counseling.

22 And whereas, Safe Horizon also
23 raises awareness of issues of violence and abuse
24 and their impact on the home, the workplace and
25 communities, through speaking engagements, media

1
2 outreach and integrated public awareness campaigns
3 which educate millions of people and inspires them
4 to take action.

5 And whereas, Safe Horizon is
6 partnering the with City Council on the Speaker's
7 four-point domestic violence initiative and will
8 train chambers of commerce in all five boroughs on
9 how to recognize the signs of domestic violence
10 among their employees and how to develop safety
11 policies to help protect employees from further
12 violence or abuse.

13 And whereas, Safe Horizon is a
14 fiscal conduit for the City Council's Domestic
15 Violence Empowerment Initiative and provides
16 training and technical assistance to community-
17 based organizations in all five boroughs.

18 And whereas, Safe Horizon provides
19 expert legal counsel to indigent victims of
20 domestic violence in Family Court and the
21 Integrated Domestic Violence Court through the
22 City Council's Assigned Domestic Violence Council
23 Initiative. Victims who have counsel are much
24 more likely to complete their activities in court
25 and receive protection as well as custody of their

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

children.

And whereas, Safe Horizon operates the city's 24-hour domestic violence hotline, and answered nearly 120,000 calls in 2010 from victims of domestic violence.

Now, therefore, be it known that in observance of October as National Domestic Violence Awareness Month, the Council of the City of New York is proud to honor Safe Horizon for its outstanding service to victims of domestic violence. Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for the entire Council; Julissa Ferreras, Chair of the Committee on Women's Issues; Jessica S. Lappin, Co-chair of Women's Caucus; Rosie Mendez, Co-chair of Women's Caucus.

[Applause]

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very much. Let give the mic over to Ariel, and again just thank you all so very, very much.

ARIEL ZWANG: Speaker, thank you very much. Thank you also to the Women's Caucus and the entire Council for this proclamation. And even more, for your leadership for shining a light in the darkness. For so many people who may be

1
2 afraid to come out, your four-point plan and the
3 attention that you're giving to this issue makes
4 it possible. I would also like to thank the
5 Council for supporting not only our domestic
6 violence work but our work with children who are
7 victims of abuse, homeless youth as well. We have
8 a very, very great deal for which we are grateful
9 to the Speaker and the entire Council. Thank you
10 very much.

11 SPEAKER QUINN: Let me just say, if
12 you ever want to see something that will just kind
13 of blow your mind, go to one of Safe Horizon's
14 Child Advocacy Centers and you're at first
15 overwhelmed by the inhumanity in the world. And
16 then you are lifted up by the level of humanity in
17 the world and how people are made well again and
18 how children are put back together. So, thank you
19 guys. I don't honestly know how you go to work
20 every day and face that, but you do, and you help
21 those children heal in the most remarkable of
22 ways. So, thank you all very, very much. Thank
23 you all. Oh, let's take a picture just with the
24 Women's Caucus. So, yeah, yeah, men, get out,
25 except for these two guys from Safe Horizon.

1

[Pause]

2

3

SPEAKER QUINN: [off mic] It's not
you, Fidler, so get out.

4

5

[Pause]

6

SPEAKER QUINN: All right, thank
you all. With Fidler's ridiculing, that concludes
today's ceremonials. Make note, there will be no
ceremonial for Fidler or Halloran for quite some
time. Only kidding.

10

11

[Pause]

12

CLERK: Ladies and gentlemen, can I
have your attention please? At this time, please
place all cell phones and pagers to vibrate.
Thank you.

13

14

15

16

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: My
colleagues please rise for the Pledge of
Allegiance.

17

18

19

[Pledge of Allegiance]

20

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Roll call?

21

CLERK: Arroyo?

22

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.

23

CLERK: Barron?

24

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes.

25

CLERK: Brewer?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here.
3 CLERK: Cabrera?
4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.
5 CLERK: Chin?
6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.
7 CLERK: Comrie?
8 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: [No
9 response].
10 CLERK: Crowley?
11 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [No
12 response].
13 CLERK: Dickens?
14 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.
15 CLERK: Dilan?
16 COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: [No
17 response].
18 CLERK: Dromm?
19 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.
20 CLERK: Eugene?
21 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.
22 CLERK: Ferreras?
23 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Here.
24 CLERK: Fidler?
25 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Foster?

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: [No
response].

CLERK: Garodnick?

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

CLERK: Gennaro?

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: [No
response].

CLERK: Gentile?

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

CLERK: Gonzalez?

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Here.

CLERK: Greenfield?

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.

CLERK: Halloran?

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Here.

CLERK: Ignizio?

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Here.

CLERK: Jackson?

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Here.

CLERK: James?

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Here.

CLERK: Koo?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [No response].

1
2 CLERK: Koppell?
3 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Here.
4 CLERK: Koslowitz?
5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.
6 CLERK: Lander?
7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.
8 CLERK: Lappin?
9 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Here.
10 CLERK: Levin?
11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.
12 CLERK: Mark-Viverito?
13 COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:
14 Here.
15 CLERK: Mealy?
16 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present.
17 CLERK: Mendez?
18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.
19 CLERK: Nelson?
20 COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Yes.
21 CLERK: Palma?
22 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.
23 CLERK: Recchia?
24 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Here.
25 CLERK: Reyna?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Here.

CLERK: Rodriguez?

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.

CLERK: Rose?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

CLERK: Sanders?

COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: [No
response].

CLERK: Seabrook?

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Here.

CLERK: Ulrich?

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: [No
response].

CLERK: Vacca?

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

CLERK: Vallone?

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

CLERK: Van Bramer?

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

CLERK: Vann?

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Here.

CLERK: Weprin?

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Here.

CLERK: Williams?

1

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

2

3

CLERK: Wills?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [No

5

response].

6

CLERK: Oddo?

7

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: [No

8

response].

9

CLERK: Rivera?

10

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Here.

11

CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

12

SPEAKER QUINN: Here.

13

CLERK: We have a quorum.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: My

15

colleagues, please rise for the invocation being

16

delivered by Reverend Que English from the Bronx

17

Christian Fellowship.

18

REV. QUE ENGLISH: Let us pray.

19

God, we first want to thank you for life. We ask

20

now that you provide strength and wisdom to our

21

Council as they gather today to vote on issues

22

facing our city. Grant them divine guidance and

23

constantly keep before them the big picture, and

24

that is to see justice served to the people of New

25

York City, to see healing come to this city, to

1

2 realize the power of unity, the power of one
3 voice. And lastly, we ask that as they tend to
4 the needs of their community that you remember
5 their needs as well. We ask this of you today and
6 thank you for honoring our prayers. Amen.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
8 very much. Council Member Cabrera?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I hereby
10 make a motion to spread the invocation in full
11 upon the record.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.
13 Adoption of the minutes, Council Member Gonzalez?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Motion
15 that the minutes of the Stated Meeting of
16 September 8, 2011 be adopted as printed.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.
18 Messages and papers from the Mayor?

19 CLERK: M654 withdrawing Paula
20 Berry for appointment to the Waterfront Management
21 Advisory Board.

22 SPEAKER QUINN: Received, ordered,
23 printed and filed.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA:
25 Communications from City, County and Borough

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Offices?

CLERK: M655 and 656, Third Party
Transfer Program.

SPEAKER QUINN: Housing and
Buildings.

CLERK: M657 through M676 on page
four, base station licenses.

SPEAKER QUINN: Transportation.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Petitions
and communications?

CLERK: None.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Land Use
Call-ups?

CLERK: M677 and 678, sidewalk
cafes.

SPEAKER QUINN: If we could couple
those and please have a roll call on the coupled
Land Use call-ups.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.

CLERK: Arroyo?

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

CLERK: Barron?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes.

CLERK: Brewer?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPEAKER QUINN: Could we get a little quiet in the chambers please?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Silence in the chambers.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.

CLERK: Cabrera?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

CLERK: Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

CLERK: Crowley?

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye.

CLERK: Dickens?

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.

CLERK: Dilan?

COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: [No response].

CLERK: Dromm?

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

CLERK: Eugene?

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

CLERK: Ferreras?

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Aye.

CLERK: Fidler?

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Aye.

1

CLERK: Foster?

2

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Aye.

3

CLERK: Garodnick?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank

5

you. I'd like to vote aye on the Land Use call-

6

ups and ask permission to vote on the General

7

Order calendar at the same time.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: And I'd

10

vote aye on the call-ups and the General Order

11

Calendar. Thank you.

12

CLERK: Gennaro?

13

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: [No

14

response].

15

CLERK: Gentile?

16

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Yes.

17

CLERK: Gonzalez?

18

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Aye.

19

CLERK: Greenfield?

20

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.

21

CLERK: Halloran?

22

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Aye.

23

CLERK: Ignizio?

24

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Aye.

25

1

CLERK: Jackson?

2

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Aye.

3

CLERK: James?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Aye.

5

CLERK: Koo?

6

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [No response].

7

CLERK: Koppell?

8

COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Aye. Mr.

9

Majority Leader, I ask unanimous consent to vote
aye on General Orders Calendar and any
Resolutions.

10

11

12

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

13

CLERK: Koslowitz?

14

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

15

CLERK: Lander?

16

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [No

17

response].

18

CLERK: Lappin?

19

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Aye.

20

CLERK: Levin?

21

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

22

CLERK: Mark-Viverito?

23

COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye.

24

CLERK: Gennaro?

25

1

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Yes.

2

3

CLERK: Mealy?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye.

5

CLERK: Mendez?

6

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

7

CLERK: Nelson?

8

COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Aye. And I

9

request unanimous permission to vote aye on all

10

coupled general orders.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Thank you.

13

CLERK: Palma?

14

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

15

CLERK: Recchia?

16

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Aye.

17

CLERK: Reyna?

18

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Aye.

19

CLERK: Rodriguez?

20

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

21

And I would like to ask permission to vote on

22

General Order Calendar and any other Resolution.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

25

CLERK: Rose?

1

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

2

3

CLERK: Sanders?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: [No

5

response].

6

CLERK: Seabrook?

7

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: [No

8

response].

9

CLERK: Vacca?

10

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye

11

and I ask permission to vote aye on all General

12

Order Calendar items and Resolutions.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

14

CLERK: Vallone?

15

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I vote aye

16

and also ask unanimous consent to vote on all

17

General Order Calendar items.

18

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I vote aye

20

on all of those. Thanks.

21

CLERK: Van Bramer?

22

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on

23

all.

24

CLERK: Vann?

25

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Weprin?

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye.

CLERK: Williams?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

CLERK: Oddo?

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Yes.

CLERK: Rivera?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

SPEAKER QUINN: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Today's

Land Use call-ups were adopted by a vote of 43 in the affirmative with zero in the negative.

Communications from the Speaker?

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very, very much. We are voting today on a number of Finance Committee items, including a transparency resolution, and I want to thank Chair Recchia for his work on that. Also, a number of Land Use items and I want to thank Chair Comrie for his work on that, and the Finance and the Land Use staff.

Most significantly, we are voting on Intro 624-A today. 624-A is basically a

1
2 significant reworking of Local Law 35 that was
3 passed by the Council in 1994. I want to thank
4 Rob Newman, Alix Pustilnik, Shannon Manigault and
5 Tim Madison, who were the staff who worked on this
6 important piece of legislation for quite some
7 time.

8 The point of Intro 624-A and Local
9 Law 35 for that matter is to make sure that we are
10 spending taxpayers' dollars efficiently and well.
11 We have all seen a rush to contract out by the
12 City of New York and other city and state
13 governments. In fact, the contract budget grew by
14 6.5 percent last year. That is 2 percent more
15 than any other part of the budget.

16 There are probably quite a few
17 times when we can get services delivered more
18 cheaply and more efficiently by contracting them
19 out. But there are also probably just as many
20 times where we can get them more cheaply and more
21 efficiently by allowing city workers to continue
22 to do them.

23 Our job as the city legislative
24 body that passes the budget is neither to expand
25 the number of workers or expand the number of

1
2 contracts. Our primary job is to protect the
3 public purse and to make sure taxpayer dollars, as
4 scarce as they now are, are spent well, and that
5 we are getting good services for the lowest cost
6 possible.

7 To make sure we are doing that, it
8 makes sense that anytime we contract out, the city
9 agency who wants to contract out conducts an
10 analysis and actually runs the numbers to see if
11 contracting out will save the city taxpayers'
12 money. Because if it will not, what is the
13 rationale for doing it? If at a time like this it
14 doesn't save us money?

15 624-A quite simply will make it so
16 the City of New York has to follow Local Law 35.
17 Since 1994, two analyses as required by Local Law
18 35 were done by the Giuliani administration and
19 none by the Bloomberg administration. The
20 administrations contended there were loopholes in
21 the law that didn't hold them accountable.

22 We have addressed that in 624 and
23 made it abundantly clear that when we spend
24 taxpayer dollars we are going to make sure we are
25 doing it in the most cost-effective way possible

1
2 and we're going to do that thoughtfully before we
3 contract out, by doing a fiscal analysis, just
4 like we do before we pass any piece of legislation
5 here in the City Council.

6 Beyond that, 624-A requires that
7 every city agency articulate a yearly contracting
8 out plan with the possibility to update and amend
9 it throughout the course of the year. That means
10 an agency is going to have to stop and think on a
11 regular basis what are we thinking of contracting
12 out. And they're going to have to transparently
13 make that clear to us and the public. That will
14 give us a greater chance to plan oversight, but
15 also it will give contractors, particularly
16 smaller contractors, minority and women-owned
17 businesses an earlier heads-up about the type of
18 requests for proposals that will be coming out, so
19 they can start working in advance.

20 Also, as we've seen across the
21 country, it will give unions a heads-up. And many
22 unions in other parts of the country have begun to
23 bid for contracted out work with lower thresholds
24 for salaries and benefits. There is no reason to
25 think that won't happen in New York.

1
2 Just to be clear, our concern that
3 contracting out may be costing us more money has
4 been completely verified by national studies
5 showing that the federal government, in fact, is
6 spending more by contracting, not spending less.
7 We can't risk that. As yet another letter asking
8 for mid-year cuts has been sent to city
9 commissioners.

10 So in addition to thanking all of
11 the staff who worked on this piece of legislation,
12 I want to thank the chair of the Contracts
13 Committee, Darlene Mealy, who shepherded this bill
14 through her committee, and is also the prime
15 sponsor of the legislation. Let me call on Chair
16 Mealy for a few words.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you,
18 Madame Speaker. I want to thank Rob Newman,
19 Shannon Manigault and Tim Madison for helping me
20 with this legislation. As chair of the Council
21 Committee on Contracts, I am also here today as a
22 proud sponsor of Intro 624-A: Outsourcing
23 Accountability Act, OAA, which amends Local Law 35
24 of 1994.

25 The Council enacted Local Law 35 in

1
2 1994 to establish a procedure that would ensure
3 that outsourced contracts that might displace city
4 employees were in the best fiscal interest of New
5 Yorkers. But since that time, the city has read
6 the law so narrowly that the goal of Local Law 35
7 has not been realized. Intro 624-A should close
8 the gap between the intent of the law and the way
9 that it has been interpreted and applied.

10 Now, earlier this year, former
11 deputy mayor of operations published an article
12 about city outsourcing. He acknowledged that in
13 many instances the city would be better served by
14 choosing to have city employees perform services
15 rather than outsource work to vendors. He went on
16 to highlight the cost savings of in-sourcing work.

17 Proposed Intro--

18 SPEAKER QUINN: [interposing] If we
19 can get a little quiet. Thank you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Proposed
21 Intro 624-A: Outsourcing Accountability Act will
22 improve Local Law 35 in four ways. First, the law
23 would require the city to provide public notice of
24 the intent of agencies to solicit bids, renew or
25 extend existing service contracts. The Mayor

1
2 would be required to publish an annual contracting
3 plan at the beginning of each year, each fiscal
4 year, that gives detail of each agency's intended
5 service contracts. With this additional
6 transparency, city employees and private vendors
7 will benefit from an increased opportunity to
8 compete for city work.

9 Second, the law would expand the
10 universe of service contracts. The revised law
11 would apply to standards and professional
12 services. Such service contracts would include
13 those based on specialized field experience, such
14 as consulting, information technology and
15 accounting, as well as more general labor, such as
16 secretarial, janitorial and food-related services.
17 The law would also apply to contract extensions.

18 Third, the law would change the way
19 that agencies determine displacement. The law
20 would amend the definition of displacement to
21 include positions through attrition. Also,
22 because in the last ten years no agency has ever
23 filed displacement and performed a cost analysis
24 benefit, to revise the law would compel a cost
25 benefit analysis under certain circumstances,

1
2 including the announcement of a program to
3 eliminate the gap or any other cost cutting
4 announcements relevant to city employees.

5 Finally, the law would strengthen
6 the certification procedure when agencies
7 determine that a contract would not displace city
8 employees. Agencies would be required to provide
9 detailed information concerning non-displacement
10 determinations and the capacity within the agency
11 to perform the work in-house.

12 Overall, this bill brings
13 transparency, accountability, cost efficiency to
14 the city's outsourcing of service contracts. Now,
15 in these tough economic times, it is important
16 that the city save money whenever, wherever and
17 however it can. These changes will ensure that
18 when the city outsources, it does so with its eyes
19 wide open and in the best economic interest of all
20 city taxpayers. I am proud to sponsor this
21 legislation. I hope that you will join me in
22 voting yes for this great legislation. I thank
23 you, Madame Speaker.

24 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very
25 much, Chair Mealy. I'm now going to ask Council

1
2 Member Julissa Ferreras to speak on the matter,
3 and other members may want to speak as well, that
4 is not related to a piece of legislation we are
5 voting on today, but Council Member Ferreras
6 approached me before the Stated and raised the
7 issue of a young man in upstate New York who
8 recently took his life as a result of bullying. I
9 think Council Member Van Bramer having brought
10 Rocky here for the ceremonial this morning, this
11 is unfortunately a very appropriate thing to add
12 to Speaker's time. If we could get a little quiet
13 please?

14 I just want to make note that the
15 young man who took his own life as a result of
16 bullying had done an "It Gets Better" video, which
17 in some ways is even more upsetting in the context
18 of all of this. I want to thank all of my
19 colleagues because we have been working very hard
20 on the issue of bullying, both through our work
21 with Chair Jackson and others on respect for all,
22 our work with Robert and Chair Rodriguez through
23 out work with all of the colleges in New York City
24 on trying to address suicide prevention and
25 bullying on college campuses. I want to

1
2 particularly thank and applaud the work of Jill
3 Desrosiers from our Community Outreach staff on
4 that work with the colleges. This work is
5 challenging and the problem continues, as we were
6 reminded today with Rocky and as this suicide
7 tragically reminds us.

8 I just want to thank Julissa for
9 her sensitivity in reminding us to take a moment
10 today and remember this young man's life, and
11 thank all of my colleagues for their ongoing work
12 on this issue, both as it relates to our public
13 schools, our colleges and just our general City of
14 New York. So, Chair Ferreras?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Thank
16 you, Madame Speaker. If for any reason at any
17 point we may have thought that Respect for All
18 Week wasn't motivation enough, I hope that we stop
19 and think about Jamey Rodemeyer, a 14-year-old who
20 took his life in Buffalo, after making a video on
21 the "It Gets Better" campaign, letting young
22 people know that it gets better, that you may be
23 bullied and you may be abused but it gets better.
24 Unfortunately, for Jamey, it didn't get better.

25 On the early weeks of September, he

1
2 took his own life at his parent's home, because of
3 the pressures. The last posting that he made,
4 because he created a video, a kind of video log or
5 diary, he stated, "I always say how bullied I am,
6 but no one listens. What do I have to do so
7 people will listen to me?"

8 I just want to have this
9 opportunity so that Jamey knows wherever he is,
10 and we know that he's in a great place now, that
11 we are listening. This city does pay attention,
12 and we are doing everything that we can to stop
13 bullying. This is something that does not
14 represent who we are as New Yorkers; it doesn't
15 represent who we are as human beings. Jamey will
16 not have died in vain if we just make every step
17 possible.

18 He took his life a few days after
19 the Speaker and myself announcing a campaign that
20 we had started with the New York Mets where we had
21 a couple of New York Mets baseball players tape a
22 PSA, and we want to make it available to the
23 Department of Education but also to all the other
24 elected offices, if you want to run this campaign
25 in your offices. Bullying is a very serious

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

problem that we have in our city.

I thank you, Madame Speaker for allowing me this opportunity. Jamey, wherever you are, you are not forgotten. We're sorry that you're not here with us any longer.

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very much, Chair Ferreras. I don't think anyone else wanted to add anything. Thank you very much, Julissa. That concludes communications from the Speaker.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you, Madame Speaker. We'll now move on to discussion of General Orders. We have Council Member Charles Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very much. My colleagues, I am replying to a request from many community members on the Crotona Park East West Farms rezoning plan. I want to vote no to that. I know we, by law, are voting it through as an 80/20 affordable housing formula. I hear talk of it possibly going up to 50/50. But community members are concerned about that.

They're also concerned about the dislocation of workers. There is some employment,

1

2

some jobs there that will no longer be there.

3

They're concerned about the project not having a

4

labor agreement yet. Some of the locals have some

5

concerns about it, about wages for workers, about

6

safety for workers. I think this project needs to

7

go through the process with better guarantees,

8

greater guarantees.

9

So, on that, and I know there was

10

talk about 30 percent affordability, 50 percent

11

affordability, but what has to be passed right now

12

is 80 percent market and 20 percent affordability,

13

is what is actually passed by law, which means

14

that this neighborhood could be gentrified if in

15

fact everything doesn't go according to promises

16

and plans. And also park space is another concern

17

about this particular project. So I'm always

18

concerned about rich developers gentrifying our

19

neighborhoods, promising affordability and then

20

not delivering on it.

21

So I would encourage a no vote, and

22

I want to vote no on all LU items from 485 to 490,

23

and I request unanimous consent to vote aye on all

24

other General Order items.

25

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Council Member Jackson?

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you, Majority Leader. My colleagues, I rise this afternoon in support of Intro 642 regarding Local Law 35, as a former chair of the Contracts Committee, and dealing with the whole issue of contracting out. During executive budget hearings, during preliminary budget hearings, I always raise the issue of can you save more by reducing your contracting out?

And in fact, approximately a year and a half ago, in preliminary budget hearings or executive budget hearings, I forgot, the Finance Commissioner said that he was going to eliminate an outside contract and have the work done in-house by employees of the Department of Finance. With that one contract, it was an IT contract, he was expected, I believe, to save--if my memory corrects me--\$5 million within one year. That's the type of savings that we need to look at all over the place.

Now, also, Dennis Walcott, the Chancellor, during the executive budget hearings saying they were eliminating one IT contract and

1

2 they were going to do the work in-house. And as a
3 result of that, they were going to save millions
4 of dollars.

5 SPEAKER QUINN: Can we get a little
6 quiet please? Add time back for R.J.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: This law
8 is so important, as the Speaker has said, as
9 Darlene Mealy has said, before any agency of
10 departments contract out, we want to make sure
11 that they need to do that. If employees of the
12 city can do it better, cheaper, then they should
13 do the work in-house and not contract out.

14 So I ask all of you to support that
15 in mind of commissioners coming in front of us
16 saying that instead contracting out, they're now
17 doing the work inside and saving millions of
18 dollars. As you know, millions of dollars will
19 mean a number of employees will not be laid off in
20 the future. Thank you very much.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
22 very much. Seeing no others, we'll now move on to
23 reports of special committees.

24 CLERK: None.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Reports of

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

standing committees.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on Finance, proposed Resolution 959-A, Westchester Square Business Improvement District.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General Orders. I'm sorry; amended and coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1068, Expense Budget.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Preconsidered LU 494 and Reso 1070.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land Use, LU 468 and Reso 1071 and 484 and Reso 1072, sidewalk cafes.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: LU 485 and Reso 1073 through LU 490 and Reso 1078, on page seven, Industco Holdings.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Orders.

CLERK: LU 491 and Reso 1079,
zoning amendment.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
Orders.

CLERK: LU 493 and Reso 1080, Bronx
Child Care Center.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
Orders.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: General
Order Calendar.

CLERK: Intro 624-A, agency service
contracts.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
Orders.

CLERK: Resolution appointing
various persons Commissioner of Deed.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
Orders. And at this point, I'd like to ask for a
roll call on all items that have been coupled on
the General Order Calendar please.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.

CLERK: Arroyo?

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Brewer?

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye on all.

And I want--

CLERK: [interposing] Cabrera?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all
and congratulations to Council Member Mealy.

CLERK: Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

CLERK: Crowley?

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye on
all.

CLERK: Dickens?

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye on
all, and congratulations to Council Member Mealy
for a job well done to protect our jobs.

CLERK: Dilan?

COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: I would like
to request unanimous consent to vote on all Land
Use call-ups.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: I'd like to
vote aye on all Land Use call-ups and aye on all
coupled General Orders.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.

1

CLERK: Dromm?

2

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye on all.

3

CLERK: Eugene?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye on all

5

and congratulations to Council Member Mealy.

6

CLERK: Ferreras?

7

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Aye on

8

all.

9

CLERK: Fidler?

10

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Aye.

11

CLERK: Foster?

12

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Pass.

13

CLERK: Gennaro?

14

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Yes.

15

CLERK: Gentile?

16

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye on

17

all.

18

CLERK: Gonzalez?

19

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Aye on

20

all.

21

CLERK: Greenfield?

22

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.

23

CLERK: Halloran?

24

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Aye on

25

1

2 all.

3

CLERK: Ignizio?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes.

5

CLERK: Jackson?

6

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Majority

7

Leader may I be excused to explain my vote?

8

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you.

10

Regarding the transparency resolution, I am an

11

advisory board member of the Union Settlement

12

Association, Inc., in East Harlem, as I was

13

involved in the Upward Bound program in high

14

school. And so, under the Adult Literacy Services

15

Initiative, I need to disclose that I am an

16

advisory board member. In such capacity, I do not

17

vote on any budgets or anything like that or hire

18

employees or anything, but advise them on the

19

direction of the agency involved. So with that, I

20

vote aye on all.

21

CLERK: James?

22

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: May I be

23

excused to explain my vote?

24

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

25

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: In regards

1
2 to 624-A, as a former chair of the Contracts
3 Committee and who has held several hearings with
4 regards to this matter, this administration has
5 engaged in a pattern and practice of slowing
6 privatizing government.

7 This piece of legislation, which is
8 sponsored by the now chair Council Member Mealy,
9 and I congratulate her, is a great step forward in
10 attempting to address the trend of the
11 displacement of municipal workers and the
12 continued layoffs at DC 37, particularly in the
13 area of child care and now in school aides and the
14 administration's attempted layoff of teachers.

15 I applaud this measure and I thank
16 the Speaker and the chair Council Member Mealy.
17 Congratulations. I vote aye on all.

18 CLERK: Koslowitz?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote
20 aye.

21 CLERK: Lander?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
23 permission to vote aye on all the Land Use call-
24 ups on the previous item on the calendar, and
25 request permission to explain my vote.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes and

3

yes.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I vote aye

5

on all items on today's calendar, including the

6

West Farms rezoning, because I believe we're going

7

to get a lot of affordable housing out of it and a

8

new school. I do think there are broader issues

9

in the land use process for how communities can,

10

for example as the great folks are doing at the

11

Bronx River Greenway, plan for the future and use

12

development to shape the needs that communities

13

have, guarantee long-term affordability and get

14

the infrastructure and open space that they need.

15

That I hope the Council can continue to consider

16

how we can adjust as we go forward. Thank you, I

17

vote aye.

18

CLERK: Lappin?

19

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: I'd like to

20

disclose that the Turtle Bay Music School is

21

getting a CASA grant today and my son takes piano

22

classes there, and vote aye.

23

CLERK: Levin?

24

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye

25

on all.

1

2

CLERK: Mark-Viverito?

3

COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye

4

on all.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye.

6

CLERK: Mendez?

7

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

8

CLERK: Palma?

9

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

10

CLERK: Recchia?

11

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: May I be

12

excused to explain my vote?

13

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: There is

15

money in this transparency reso that goes to my

16

daughter's school. So I have to put that on the

17

record. I vote aye on everything else.

18

CLERK: Reyna?

19

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Aye on all.

20

CLERK: Rose?

21

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yes. Aye.

22

And I want to congratulate Council Member Mealy on

23

such a good job. Thank you.

24

CLERK: Seabrook?

25

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Yes, Mr.

1

2 Majority Leader, with unanimous consent, I'd like
3 to vote on all Land Use call-ups and previous
4 call-ups.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: And I'd
7 like to vote aye as well and congratulations to
8 Councilwoman Darlene Mealy for an outstanding job.

9 CLERK: Van Bramer?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

11 CLERK: Vann?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Yeah, to be
13 excused, I'd like to congratulate Council Member
14 Mealy, you did a fine job. It's a very, very good
15 bill. In the event that faith-based initiative is
16 a part of the transparency resolution, in the
17 event that it is, I'd like to acknowledge that I'm
18 a member of the board of Black Leadership
19 Commission on AIDS. I'm not certain, but I am a
20 member, in case they're getting funds in this
21 particular resolution. I vote aye on all.

22 CLERK: Weprin?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye.

24 CLERK: Williams?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'd like

1
2 to congratulate Council Member Mealy on a job well
3 done and the Speaker on her leadership. Let's not
4 underestimate the greatness of this bill in trying
5 to curb the wanton spending that the Mayor has
6 shown, particularly when it comes to contracts, at
7 a time when he's asking everybody to cut back.

8 I'd like to vote aye on all, with the exception of
9 Land Use 485 to 490, in which I'd like to abstain.

10 CLERK: Foster?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: I'd like to
12 vote aye on all, with the exception of Land Use
13 485 through 490 and the accompanying resos, I
14 abstain.

15 CLERK: Oddo?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Yes.

17 CLERK: Rivera?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes to all.

19 CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

20 SPEAKER QUINN: Aye on all.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: All items
22 on today's General Order Calendar are adopted by a
23 vote of 46 in the affirmative with zero in the
24 negative with zero abstentions, with the exception
25 of Land Use item 485 through LU 490 and the

1
2 accompanying resolutions, it was adopted by a vote
3 of 43 in the affirmative with one in the negative
4 and two abstentions, and the revised Land Use
5 call-ups are adopted by a vote of 46 in the
6 affirmative with zero in the negative.

7 Introduction and reading of the bills.

8 SPEAKER QUINN: All bills are
9 referred to committees as indicated on the agenda.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Discussion
11 of resolutions? Seeing none, there are no
12 resolutions. We now go to general discussions.
13 Council Member Melissa Mark-Viverito?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:
15 Thank you. I wanted to talk about the Occupy Wall
16 Street. I want to say that obviously Occupy Wall
17 Street has stirred the conscience of our nation
18 with protests focused squarely on the ethic of
19 greed that has consumed Wall Street. I rise today
20 to encourage the members of this Council to
21 support their cause. The protestors call
22 themselves the other 99 percent. Why? Because
23 they represent the majority of Americans who have
24 been hit hardest by the great recession. While
25 the top one percent earns 25 percent of our

1
2 nation's income, controls 42 percent of financial
3 wealth and receives tax breaks and mega-million
4 bonuses, the rest of Americans are struggling to
5 get by. Hounded by spending cuts and wage
6 freezes, the other 99 percent are strangled by a
7 mountain of debt with no relief in sight. This is
8 wrong and Occupy Wall Street represents a
9 collective effort to highlight that injustice.

10 I've heard several pundits and
11 colleagues complain that the protestors lack a
12 purpose or program. Nothing could be farther from
13 the truth. They want what we all want, a more
14 just and equitable society, a brand new deal, if
15 you will. More equity is better for the long-term
16 prosperity and the evidence has been there for
17 decades. The current issue of Finance and
18 Development, the IMF's quarterly magazine,
19 economists explained that countries where income
20 was more equally distributed tended to have longer
21 growth spells. In fact, making the economy's
22 income distribution just 10 percent more equitable
23 prolongs the typical growth spell by 50 percent.

24 America has not invested in
25 equality in a long time. Since 1973, the median

1
2 wage of workers has stagnated. And in 2010, for
3 the first time since World War II, the median
4 income actually declined. All the while, the top
5 one percent continues to increase its income and
6 Wall Street CEOs have more than quadrupled their
7 salaries. With this kind of inequality, it's no
8 wonder that booms and busts that plague our
9 economy and decimate our communities--

10 SPEAKER QUINN: [interposing] A
11 little quiet for the Council Member.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: --
13 have become more frequent. New York State has
14 gotten caught up in this race toward inequality.
15 As of 2010, we became the state with the greatest
16 income inequality, with median incomes in New York
17 City dropping 5 percent and poverty claiming 20
18 percent of our residents. This is appalling.

19 The other 99 percent need a fair
20 deal, and that's what Occupy Wall Street is
21 pursuing. If they are successful, every American,
22 including the wealthiest will benefit
23 tremendously. Shared prosperity is the only kind
24 that lasts. Thank you.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Council

1
2 Member, thank you very much. Next we'll go to
3 Council Member Brewer.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you
5 very much. I just want to mention a couple of
6 piece of legislation that we're introducing today.
7 One has to do with biographies for co-named
8 streets. I know that we all have the opportunity
9 to co-name streets after people who have meant a
10 lot in our community, in our city, who have
11 unfortunately passed on. One of the challenges is
12 the general public passing by the street may not
13 know who that person is. So I'm asking that we
14 pass a law that would require a website on the
15 City Council or the City itself, the
16 administration to indicate the names and a short
17 bio.

18 Second, we have a bill that would
19 state where there is a taxi stand, vendors should
20 not be. I think that would seem common sense, but
21 unfortunately that is not the reality. I'm very
22 supportive of most vendors, but I also am
23 supportive of taxis being able to have the stands
24 that have been assigned to them. Thank you very
25 much.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you.

3

Next, we go on to Council Member Jackson.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you,

5

Majority Leader. My colleagues, I rise in order

6

to talk about the proposed layoffs this coming

7

Friday of over 700 employees at the Department of

8

Education. First, let me say to all the

9

individual members, and you know who you are,

10

speaking up on behalf of all of the people that

11

will be impacted this Friday, and to my colleagues

12

of the Black Latino and Asian Caucus that we met

13

with Chancellor Dennis Walcott and his staff, and

14

to our Speaker Christine Quinn and the staff for

15

dealing with Mayor's Office and talking directly

16

with the Mayor and trying to save these layoffs,

17

and our Finance Chair Domenic Recchia.

18

The impact--as I stated at the

19

press conference yesterday--the majority of these

20

people are women. The majority of these women are

21

black and Latino. The majority of all of them

22

earn between \$11,000 and \$17,000. Some of them

23

\$29,000 and \$30,000, but the majority are \$11,000-

24

\$17,000, and many of them head of households. In

25

fact, when they're laid off Friday, many of them

1

2 will go to social services, either welfare,
3 Medicaid, child care services. So I'm asking, are
4 we really saving money by laying off these
5 employees?

6 I know it's not over until it's
7 over. So I still have hope that something could
8 happen, even though it doesn't look that way. I
9 thank everyone for their involvement and trying
10 their best to try to save these vulnerable
11 employees and in the long run helping to keep our
12 schools staffed at a level that will be
13 satisfactory to the administration and to the
14 parents who send over 1.1 million schoolchildren
15 to its system.

16 So I thank you on behalf of all of
17 DC 37, but the struggle continues. Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
19 very much. Next, we'll move on to Council Member
20 Williams.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I wanted
22 to affirm my support of the spirit of the Occupy
23 Wall Street. I think many of us talk the talk and
24 these young people have decided to walk the walk.
25 Many of the great changes that happen, if not all

1
2 of them, started with young people. I think we
3 should do what we can to guide that energy so it
4 can really lead to some kind of changes that most
5 of us believe in. So, I want to, again, affirm
6 the support of the spirit. I hope other people
7 will as well.

8 I also wanted to concur with my
9 colleague Robert Jackson. As mentioned before, at
10 a time of ridiculous spending when it comes to
11 contracts, we are laying off people who can least
12 afford to do so and will actually have the least
13 impact on the budget, but have a great on the
14 students in the educational system. Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you.
16 Next, we move on to Council Member Rose.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you,
18 Mr. Chair. I urge my colleagues to sign on to
19 Resolution 1069, which calls upon the Metropolitan
20 Transportation Authority to allow seniors and
21 disabled persons to receive fare discounts on
22 express buses during rush hours, between the hours
23 of 6 a.m. to 10 a.m. and 3 p.m. to 7 p.m., Monday
24 through Fridays.

25 Currently, disabled persons and

1
2 seniors aged 65 and older, receive half price fare
3 on local bus and subway service any time of the
4 day, however they are not eligible for the fare
5 discount on express bus service during rush hours.
6 Many seniors and people with disabilities live on
7 a fixed income.

8 And those on social security and
9 social security supplemental income have not
10 received a cost of living adjustment in their
11 benefits in the past two years, while bus and
12 subway fares increased twice in the past three
13 years.

14 With recent changes to cut door to
15 door service and to increase Access-A-Ride's
16 feeder service to and from fixed routes, it is
17 critical for us to support the implementation of
18 this concession, given the citizens of New York
19 City with the greatest need for transportation
20 alternatives better access and more travel
21 opportunities.

22 I ask that you lend your support
23 for the seniors and disabled people of New York
24 City by signing on to this resolution. Thank you.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you

1
2 very much. Next, we'll move on to Council Member
3 Dromm.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you
5 very much. Today, I'm introducing Resolution 1064
6 with Council Member Julissa Ferreras. It's our
7 hope that this resolution will draw attention to a
8 critical deadline coming up. So far, the United
9 States Congress has not moved to reauthorize the
10 Violence against Women Act, or VAWA. The lapse of
11 this law would be a huge step backwards for women
12 in this country. With the stakes so high,
13 literally the lives of countless women across the
14 United States, we must do all we can to raise our
15 voices to call for the still very necessary
16 reauthorization of VAWA.

17 I want to bring to your attention
18 one especially important provision of VAWA. Since
19 its initial authorization, VAWA has had a
20 tremendous impact on members of our immigrant
21 communities who are also domestic violence
22 survivors. VAWA allows these individuals to
23 petition for legal status without relying on
24 abusive U.S. citizen or permanent resident
25 spouses, parents or children.

1
2 For many immigrant domestic
3 violence survivors, the sponsoring member will
4 threaten to withhold legal immigration sponsorship
5 as a tool of abuse. VAWA has provided a lifeline
6 to these immigrants to escape the abuse and apply
7 for lawful permanent residency on their own. It
8 would be tragic if VAWA were not reauthorized.
9 Therefore, I respectfully ask all of you to join
10 me and Council Member Ferreras to signing on to
11 Resolution 1064. Thank you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you.
13 Next, we have Council Member Ferreras.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: October
15 is a very important month for women in particular
16 because it is when we acknowledge breast cancer
17 awareness month. It is also domestic violence
18 awareness month.

19 Violence against women is committed
20 on a daily basis here in New York City and around
21 the country. Whether it is domestic violence,
22 sexual assault or stalking, this violence has an
23 enormous emotional, physical and economic impact
24 upon individuals and families.

25 In 1994, Congress passed the

1
2 Violence against Women Act, VAWA, a bill
3 authorized by then Senator Joe Biden. VAWA
4 provides \$1.6 billion to enhance investigation and
5 prosecution of violent crimes perpetrated against
6 women, imposed automatically a mandatory
7 resolution on those convicted and allows civil
8 readdress and causes prosecutors choose to leave
9 un-prosecuted.

10 Most of New York's sexual assault
11 examiner programs are supported by federal VAWA
12 funds which are administered by the Division of
13 Criminal Justice Services. Many city-based
14 domestic violence programs received funding
15 through VAWA grants. Most of New York City's
16 domestic violence and sexual assault service
17 providers are recipients of VAWA funding,
18 including the New York City Family Justice Center.
19 Despite improvements in services to combat
20 violence against women in New York City, continues
21 to need much funding provided under the VAWA.

22 In 2010, police responded to
23 249,440 domestic violence incidents or roughly 680
24 incidents per day. As the expiration of VAWA
25 looms in the horizon, I ask you to join me and

1
2 Council Member Dromm in support of this resolution
3 asking Congress to reauthorize VAWA so we can
4 continue to receive these much-needed funds to
5 combat domestic violence. Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you.
7 Next, we have Council Member Ignizio.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Thank you
9 very much. My colleagues, I just wanted to point
10 out I introduced a bill today, Intro 688. The
11 reason being is previous administrations required
12 verification when it came to exemptions on
13 property, whether you're a veteran, whether you're
14 senior. As of late, the administration currently
15 hasn't done so and currently has now just changed
16 their policy since I exposed the issue in the New
17 York Post about a couple of months ago.

18 As with all city agencies, they
19 said, oh yeah, we're working on this, we're
20 working on this. But they got caught, quite
21 frankly, giving away fraudulently in my view, tax
22 exemptions to people who did not qualify for
23 senior tax exemptions, for veteran tax exemptions,
24 for clergy. These things come out of your and my
25 pocket.

1
2 Ultimately, I think the process
3 that's in place now with the verification form,
4 you'll notice in your district offices that the
5 forms for property tax exemption have changed
6 dramatically, but we need to codify that. Really,
7 the rule of this legislature and any legislature
8 for that matter ought be that future generations
9 should not have to endure this.

10 Previously, they did check, under
11 Commissioner Cerullo when he was Department of
12 Finance Commissioner, they did have a verification
13 requirement. Then it kind of went away under lax
14 verification. Now it's back again. We in this
15 Council do need to codify this that there is a
16 check to assure that those who truly did serve
17 this country and earn their tax exemption will
18 actually receive it. And people who did not, will
19 be shown to be committing fraud and then
20 ultimately will endure the penalty.

21 So I encourage you all to sign on
22 to Intro 688. I will request that we do a hearing
23 on this and pass this bill as soon as possible to
24 codify now what the Department of Finance says it
25 is doing happily and we should assure that it goes

1

2 on for future administrations. Thank you very
3 much.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you.
5 Next, we have Council Member Levin.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you,
7 Mr. Chairman. I just want to associate myself
8 with the remarks earlier by Education Committee
9 Chairman Robert Jackson regarding the proposed
10 layoff of school aides and paraprofessionals and
11 parent coordinators coming up at the end of this
12 week.

13 I applaud the Speaker's staff and
14 everyone that's working, and Council Member
15 Jackson, and everyone that is working very
16 diligently and doing everything that we can to
17 avoid what would be a tremendous impact to a lot
18 of families.

19 Also, I want to offer a warm
20 welcome back to our General Welfare Chair Annabel
21 Palma.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
23 very much. Next, we have Council Member Gonzalez.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Thank
25 you. I ask my colleagues to sign on to Resolution

1
2 1067. This resolution supporting New York State
3 Chief Judge Jonathan Lippman's call on the New
4 York State Legislature to pass and the Governor to
5 sign legislation raising the age of criminal
6 responsibility for non-violent offenses to 18 and
7 permit the cases of 16 and 17-year-olds charged
8 with such offenses to be adjudicated in the Family
9 Court rather than the adult criminal justice
10 system.

11 By signing on to this legislation,
12 I believe that we're sending a clear statement, a
13 statement that our youth deserve an opportunity,
14 an opportunity to alternatives and hopefully
15 eliminate the possibility of being exposed to a
16 criminal system at their age. It also provides
17 them alternatives so that in the future they can
18 become productive citizens of our society. Thank
19 you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
21 very much. Next, we have Council Member Eugene.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you
23 very much. Thank you. I just want to say a few
24 words to follow up on Monday's Immigration
25 Committee hearing on Intro 656, which seeks to

1
2 address many immigrants being detained at Rikers
3 Island with the threat of being deported. I would
4 like to thank Madame Speaker for her effort in
5 addressing this issue, along with Council Member
6 Melissa Mark-Viverito, Danny Dromm, chair of the
7 Immigration Committee and all the co-sponsors,
8 advocates and supporters who have been active on
9 this issue.

10 Although we are not voting on this
11 bill today, I just want to express my appreciation
12 to everyone who has been involved in drafting this
13 legislation and working with the administration to
14 move this bill forward.

15 Many immigrants who have been
16 living in New York City for decades, who are
17 contributing to their communities and part of the
18 fabric of our city are often detained and held in
19 custody for years. As you know, the current
20 system causes a major disruption in the lives of
21 families and affects the trust of immigrants to
22 law enforcement, officials in government as well.

23 I want also to express my support
24 for all the school support aides and other
25 employees whose jobs are threatening to be lost.

1

2 School support staff often receives lower pay and
3 benefits compared to the teachers and
4 administrators, yet they are just as much a part
5 of the education success of our children. It is
6 not fair to target these workers to be laid off.
7 I'm glad to stand with the workers in this fight.
8 Thank you very much.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
10 very much. Seeing no others, this meeting is
11 adjourned.

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Donna Hintze certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature *Donna Hintze*

Date October 28, 2011