

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS

AND DISPOSITIONS

1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS

----- X

October 8, 2024
Start: 11:19 a.m.
Recess: 11:39 a.m.

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Kamillah M. Hanks, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Justin L. Brannan
Oswald Feliz
Christopher Marte
Sandy Nurse

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS
AND DISPOSITIONS

2

A P P E A R A N C E S

Hallah Salet, Deputy Director for Brooklyn
Planning at New York City Housing Preservation
and Development

Winthrop Wharton, BFC Partners

Binh Ly, New Construction Finance at New York
City Housing Preservation and Development

Aleena Farishta, Director of Brooklyn Planning at
New York City Housing Preservation and
Development

Ryan Moroz, Director of Homeownership
Opportunities and Preservation at New York City
Housing Preservation and Development

Lawrence Bell, Asset Manager of Nehemiah HDFC

Barbara Manu, self

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS AND
DISPOSITIONS

3

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Mic check, mic check,
this is a mic check on the Subcommittee on Landmarks,
Public Sitings and Dispositions. Today's date is
October 8, 2024, in the Committee Room recorded by
Walter Lewis.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning, and
welcome to today's New York City Council hearing for
the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings and
Dispositions.

At this time, we ask that you silence all
electronic devices and at no time is anyone to
approach the dais.

If you would like to sign up for in-
person testimony or have any other questions during
the hearing, please see the Sergeant-at-Arms.

Chair, we're ready to begin.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: [GAVEL] Good morning,
everyone. Welcome to the meeting of the Subcommittee
on Landmarks, Public Sitings and Dispositions. I am
Council Member Camila Hanks and I am the Chair of the
Subcommittee. Today I am joined by my Colleagues,
Council Members Marte and Nurse.

1
2 Before we begin with today's agenda, I
3 will remind everyone that this meeting is being held
4 in a hybrid format.

5 For members of the public who wish to
6 testify remotely, we ask that you first register
7 online, and you may do so now by visiting
8 www.council.nyc.gov/landuse to sign up and then sign
9 into the Zoom and remain signed in until you are
10 called to testify.

11 For anyone with us in person and wishing
12 to testify, if you have not already done so, please
13 see one of the Sergeants to fill out a speaker's card
14 and we will call your name at the appropriate time.

15 For anyone wishing to submit written
16 testimony on the items being heard today, we ask that
17 you please send it via email to
18 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Include the land
19 use number and/or project name in the subject line of
20 your email. Video and audio testimony will not be
21 accepted.

22 I will remind members of the public that
23 this is a government proceeding and that all decorum
24 shall be observed at all times and, as such, members
25

1 of the public shall remain silent until called to
2 testify.
3

4 The witness table is reserved for people
5 who wish to testify. No video recording or
6 photography is allowed at the witness table. Further,
7 members of the public may not present audio or video
8 recordings as testimony may be submitted but may
9 submit transcripts of such recordings to the Sergeant
10 for included in the hearing record.

11 On today's agenda, we have two related
12 Pre-Considered Land Use for Article XI tax exemption
13 and disposition known as the Coney Island Phase 3 in
14 Council Member Brannan's District in Brooklyn and
15 three related Pre-Considered Land Use items for South
16 Bushwick Neighborhood Homes in Council Members
17 Gutiérrez's and Nurse's District in Brooklyn as well
18 as several votes.

19 I want to also just pause and say we've
20 been joined by Council Member Brannan and Council
21 Member Feliz.

22 Now, I will open the public hearing for
23 the two related Pre-Considered Land Use items of
24 Coney Island Phase 3 project submitted by the New
25 York City Department of Housing Preservation and

1
2 Development, or HPD, for the Article XI tax exemption
3 and disposition in Council Member Brannan's District
4 in Brooklyn.

5 Appearing today on this proposal will be
6 Winthrop Wharton, BFC Partners, Hallah Salet, Deputy
7 Director of Brooklyn Planning, HPD, and Binh Ly,
8 Senior Project Manager, HPD.

9 Again, those wishing to testify remotely
10 may register online by visiting the Council's website
11 at [council.nyc.gov/land use](http://council.nyc.gov/land-use).

12 Counsel, will you please administer the
13 affirmation?

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Applicant
15 panelists, would you please state your name for the
16 record? Raise your right hand. I will ask you the
17 question. State your name and answer the question.

18 Do you swear or affirm that the testimony
19 you are about to give will be the truth, the whole
20 truth, and nothing but the truth, and that you will
21 answer truthfully to all Council Member questions?

22 DEPUTY DIRECTOR SALET: I do.

23 WINTHROP WHARTON: I do.

24 SENIOR PROJECT MANAGER LEE: I do.

25 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, applicant
panelists.

For the viewing public, if you need an
accessible version of this presentation, please send
an email request to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

Now, the applicant team may begin.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR SALET: Thank you for
having us today. Again, my name is Hallah Salet. I'm
the Deputy Director for Brooklyn Planning at HPD, and
I am here today with Win Wharton, the partner for BFC
Partners, as well as Binh Ly from New Construction
Finance, who will be here for questions. Next slide,
please.

HPD is seeking the approval of a post-
ULURP Article XI tax exemption for five sites as well
as an Article XI disposition for two City-owned
sites. These requested actions would facilitate the
construction of a new mixed-use building, providing
approximately 419 affordable rental units, as well as
approximately 10,800 square feet of commercial space
and approximately 9,000 square feet of community
facility space. Next slide.

The development site is located in Coney
Island, fronting Surf Avenue between West 17th Street

1 and West 19th Street. The site is currently a parking
2 lot, as well as a New York City Health and Hospital
3 Medical Center to be relocated in the neighboring
4 development known as Coney Phase 2. This site is
5 well-serviced by transit, located three blocks from
6 the Coney Island-Stilwell Avenue D, F, and Q subway
7 trains, as well as multiple bus lines. Next slide.

9 The development site is comprised of both
10 City- and privately-owned sites. Two of the lots,
11 shown here in blue, are City-owned and make up the
12 disposition area. The remaining three sites, shown in
13 orange, are privately-owned. Next slide, please.

14 I'll now pass it over to Win to discuss
15 the proposed development.

16 WINTHROP WHARTON: So Coney Island Phase 3
17 is an 11-story building, about 400,000 square feet in
18 total, 420 units, 100 percent affordable, and being
19 developed under HPD's Mix and Match program. It
20 includes 11,000 square feet of ground floor retail
21 and 9,000 square feet of community facility space,
22 and there's a mix of studios, one bedrooms, twos, and
23 threes for individuals and families up to 110 percent
24 of AMI. Next slide, please.

1
2 DEPUTY DIRECTOR SALET: Lastly, the
3 project, as Win mentioned, will be utilized by HPD's
4 Mix and Match with units ranging from 30 percent to
5 90 percent AMI. The building will provide a mix of
6 studio one, two, three bedrooms, with nearly half of
7 the units comprising family-sized units.

8 Additionally, 15 percent of the units would be set
9 aside for formerly homeless individuals. This
10 concludes our presentation, and we're happy to take
11 any questions.

12 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you very much.
13 I'd like to recognize any of my Colleagues who have
14 any questions or remarks.

15 Seeing none, thank you. This applicant
16 panel is now excused.

17 Counsel, are there any members of the
18 public wishing to testify on this item?

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Madam Chair, we
20 have no registrations online.

21 If there is anyone in the room with us
22 today wishing to testify on the Coney Island Phase 3
23 proposal, please see a Sergeant-at-Arms to fill out a
24 speaker card.

2 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Counsel.
3 With there being no more members of the public who
4 wish to testify regarding Pre-Considered Land Use
5 items for Coney Island Phase 3, this public hearing
6 is now closed, and the items are laid over.

7 Next, I will open a public hearing for
8 the three related Pre-Considered Land Use items for
9 the South Bushwick Neighborhood Homes, also submitted
10 by HPD for three separate actions, including an
11 Article XI tax exemption for all tax properties in
12 this project and two applications for amendments to
13 previously approved UDAAP approvals and UDAAP tax
14 exemptions. (INAUDIBLE) to set the subset of the
15 properties, collectively the properties are located
16 in Council Member Gutiérrez's and Nurse's District in
17 Brooklyn, and appearing today on this proposal is
18 Aleena Farishta, Director of Brooklyn Planning, HPD;
19 Ryan Moroz, Director of Homeownership Opportunities
20 and Preservation, HPD, and Lawrence Bell, Asset
21 Manager of Nehemiah HDFC.

22 Again, those wishing to testify must
23 register online, visiting the Council's website at
24 council.nyc.gov/land use.

Counsel, would you please administer the
affirmation?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Panelists, would
you please raise your right hands?

Do you swear or affirm that the testimony
you are about to give will be the truth, the whole
truth, and nothing but the truth, and you will answer
truthfully to all Council Member questions?

DIRECTOR FARISHTA: I do.

DIRECTOR MOROZ: I do.

ASSET MANAGER BELL: I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, panelists.

Please begin.

And, excuse me, for the viewing public,
if you need an accessible version of this
presentation, please send an email request to
landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov, and now the
applicant team may begin.

DIRECTOR FARISHTA: Thank you, Council
Members. Good morning. My name is Aleena, and I'm
from HPD. Today, we're here to present to you about
the project. Good morning. Thank you, Council
Members, for your time. We're here to present on this

1 project, South Bushwick Neighborhood Homes. Next
2 slide, please.

3
4 HPD is seeking approvals for an amendment
5 of a previously approved Urban Development Action
6 Area and Urban Development Action Area Project
7 approval for three sites to provide for the option to
8 be owned by a CLT and ground leased as well as an
9 Article XI tax exemption of six sites, three of which
10 are City-owned and three are privately owned.

11 Overall, the project will consist of a cluster of six
12 sites and a total of 19 homeownership units and four
13 rental units under HPD's Open Door Program. Next
14 slide, please.

15 This project, as I noted, is a cluster of
16 six sites within Bushwick, Community District 4 of
17 Brooklyn. 1277 DeKalb Avenue is located in City
18 Council District 34 and the four other sites, 1143
19 Hancock Avenue, 676 Central Avenue, 1262 to 1264
20 Bushwick Avenue, and 641 Chauncey Street are located
21 in City Council District 37. These are vacant sites,
22 and they're within the R6 zoning district, and the
23 lots range from 1,500 square feet on average, and we
24 hope that through this project that we'll be able to
25 develop affordable homeownership. Next slide, please.

ASSET MANAGER BELL: Good morning. The proposed development is being developed in partnership with Nehemiah HDFC, RiseBoro Community Partnership, and Neighborhood Restore HDFC who all together bring a total of 75-plus years of affordable development experience throughout New York City. Next slide, please.

The proposed development, as was stated, consists of five newly constructed buildings, approximately 19 homeownership units and four rental units. This will break out into three fee simple homes and two co-ops. The fee simple homes and the co-ops will be managed by Interboro CLT, and the amenities include in-unit washers and dryers, bicycle storage, a rear yard, and some green space. The buildings are to be developed to Enterprise Green Community standards. Next slide, please.

The proposed project will be developed under HPD's Open Door Program. The unit mix will include one-, two-, and three-bedroom units with a heavy concentration on family-sized units at 78 percent of the units being family-sized units. Affordability to households with incomes 80 to 110 percent of AMI. The long-term affordability will be

1 ensured with a 40-year Article XI real estate tax
2 exemption that is co-terminus with the 40-year
3 regulatory period, and all homeownership units will
4 be available through HPD's Housing Connect 2.0. Next
5 slide.
6

7 DIRECTOR FARISHTA: That's all we have for
8 today. We'll take any questions. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. I'd
10 like to recognize any of my Colleagues who have
11 questions on this project.

12 Seeing none, thank you. This applicant
13 panel is now excused.

14 Counsel, are there any members of the
15 public that wish to testify?

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Madam Chair, we
17 have no one signed up online to testify, but I
18 believe you have one person in the room to testify on
19 this item in person.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay, thank you. I'll
21 call Barbara Manu to come up and speak.

22 Please begin.

23 BARBARA MANU: Good morning. My name is
24 Barbara Manu. Thank you for giving me this
25 opportunity to come here and talk to you. For over 32

1 years, I've never been to City Hall. This is my
2 second time. I have two children, and we are
3 homeless. We've been homeless since June 2018. We
4 became homeless because the apartment that we were
5 living were unlivable so the City moved us to a
6 shelter. So after trying so many years, we couldn't
7 find a place and we've been homeless, moving from
8 state to state, continent to continent. I support
9 what the housing developers, new developing housing
10 are doing, but in the meantime, my problem is back in
11 2017 when we became homeless, every new apartment
12 that was built, our applications was denied. I have a
13 26-year-old, mentally severe, disabled, and also have
14 type two, currently still in a shelter and have no
15 income, have no income, so I need the City to help
16 us. We had a Section 8. Right now, we don't know who
17 is using the Section 8. Thank you.

18
19 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. I
20 appreciate your testimony.

21 Are there any other members of the public
22 wishing to testify?

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Anyone else in the
24 room wishing to testify, please see the Sergeant-at-
25 Arms to fill out a speaker card.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: With there be no other members of the public wish to testify on the three Pre-Considered Land Use items for South Bushwick Neighborhood Homes, the public hearing is now closed and the items are laid over.

Next, we will hold votes on a number of items previously heard by the Subcommittee, including those that we have heard today. We will vote to approve Land Use items 158, 159, and 160 for the South Jamaica Gateway rezoning, an application by HPD and several private applicants for zoning map amendment and a zoning text amendment, a designation of an Urban Development Action Area, approval of an Urban Development Action Area Project, and disposition of City-owned property. These actions are to facilitate development of two mixed-use residential and community facility buildings containing approximately 143 affordable units in Jamaica, Queens in Speaker Adams' Council District and Council Member Dr. Williams' District.

We will also vote to approve Pre-Considered Land Use items related to the applicant numbers G 240058 XUK and G 240064 NUK, which are applicants brought by HPD for the MHANY Multifamily

1 Preservation Loan Program project. This includes the
2 designation of an Urban Development Action Area,
3 approval of an Urban Development Action Area Project,
4 disposition of City-owned property, and approval of
5 the Article XI tax exemption to facilitate the
6 preservation of affordable housing project. This
7 project is located in multiple neighborhoods
8 throughout Brooklyn, and upon completion of the
9 rehabilitation of the four buildings, there will be a
10 total of 12 rental units and one commercial space
11 under HPD Multi-Preservation Loan Program.

12
13 We will also vote to approve Pre-
14 Considered Land Use items for the Coney Island Phase
15 3 project under application numbers G 240059 XAK and
16 G 240060 XAK submitted by HPD for an Article XI tax
17 exemption and disposition approval in Council Member
18 Brannan's District in Brooklyn.

19 We will also vote to approve three
20 related Pre-Considered Land Use items for South
21 Bushwick Neighborhood Homes under applications G
22 240061 XAK and G 240062 XUK and G 240063 XUK,
23 submitted by HPD for three separate approvals,
24 including an Article XI tax exemption for all six
25 properties in this project. The two applications for

1
2 amendments to previously approved UDAAP approvals and
3 UDAAP tax exemptions as applicable to two different
4 subsets of properties known as South Bushwick
5 Neighborhood Homes 2 and South Bushwick Neighborhood
6 Homes 3. The properties are located in Council
7 Members Gutiérrez's and Nurse's Districts in
8 Brooklyn.

9 We will also vote to approve Land Use
10 Items 130, a landmark designation of a Brooklyn
11 Edison Building in Council Member Restler's District
12 in Brooklyn and Land Use Items 148, a landmark
13 designation of 1 Wall Street Banking Room Interior in
14 Council Member Marte's District in Manhattan.

15 Members of the Subcommittee who have
16 questions or remarks on today's items, please let me
17 know.

18 Seeing none, I will now call the vote to
19 approve LUs 158, 159 and 160, Land Use Items 130,
20 148, and Pre-Considered Land Use Items related to
21 application numbers G 240058 XUK and G 240064 NUK, G
22 240059 XAK and G 240060 XAK, G 240061 XAK, G 240062
23 XUK and G 240063 XUK.

24 Counsel, can you please call the roll?

25 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Chair Hanks.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS AND
DISPOSITIONS 19

2 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Aye on all.

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Council Member

4 Brannan.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you. I just
6 want to explain my vote. I want to thank BFC for
7 their partnership on Coney Island Phase Three, and
8 I'm excited to get this done. I vote aye on all.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Council Member

10 Feliz.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Aye on all.

12 Congratulations everyone.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Council Member

14 Marte.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: I vote aye on all.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Council Member

17 Nurse.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: I vote aye. Thank
19 you.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Counsel.

21 That concludes today's business. Oh, I'm so sorry,
22 you have to read the, sorry. My apologies.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: By a vote of five
24 in the affirmative, zero in the negative, and no
25

1
2 abstentions, the items are adopted and referred to
3 the full Land Use Committee.

4 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: That concludes today's
5 business. Thank you everyone and members of the
6 public, my Colleagues, Subcommittee Counsel, Land Use
7 Staff, and Sergeant-at-Arms for your participation
8 today.

9 This meeting is hereby adjourned. [GAVEL]

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 13, 2024