

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE
AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER
EQUITY AND THE COMMITTEE ON
CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

----- X

April 25, 2024
Start: 1:16 P.M.
Recess: 3:57 P.M.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Carmen N. De La Rosa,
Chairperson for the Committee on
Civil Service and Labor

Farah Louis,
Chairperson for the Committee on
Women and Gender Equity

Nantasha Williams,
Chairperson for the Committee on
Civil and Human Rights

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Tiffany Cabàn
Erik D. Bottcher
Eric Dinowitz
Oswald Feliz
Jennifer Gutiérrez
Kamillah Hanks
Rita Joseph

COUNCIL MEMBERS: (CONTINUED)

Farah N. Louis
Christopher Marte
Julie Menin
Francisco P. Moya
Yusef Salaam
Rafael Salamanca
Nantasha Williams

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Katrina Porter
DCAS, Chief Human Capital Officer

Silvia Montalban
DCAS, Chief Citywide Equity & Inclusion Officer

Sideya Sherman
MOERJ, Chief Equity Officer & Commissioner

Kadian Outer
DCAS, Office of Citywide Recruitment

Sandford Cohen
DCAS, General Counsel

Daniel Pollak
OLR, Deputy Commissioner

Jeanne Victor
EEPC, Executive Director

Russell Ferri
EEPC, Director of Research

Gloria Middleton
CWA 1180 President

Arthur Cheliotas
CWA 1180

Gregory Mantsios
The Murphy Institute, CUNY

Michael Greco
Local 2507, Vice President

Dalvanie K Powell
United Probation Officers Associate

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Kyle Simmons
Local 924, President

Beverly Neufeld
PowHer New York

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 5

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Check one, two. Check one,
3 two. This is a prerecorded sound test for the
4 Committee on Civil Service and Labor jointly with
5 Women and Gender Equity. Today's date is April 25,
6 2024. It's being recorded by Michael Leonardo in the
7 Council Chambers. [00:00:24] - [00:00:43]

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good afternoon and welcome to
9 today's New York City Council Hearing for the
10 Committees on Women and Gender Equity, Civil Service
11 and Labor and Civil and Human Rights. At this time,
12 we ask that you silence all cellphones and electronic
13 devices to minimize disruptions throughout the
14 hearing. If you have testimony you wish to submit
15 for the record, you may do so via email at
16 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Once again, that is
17 testimony@council.nyc.gov. At any time throughout
18 the hearing, do not approach the dais. We thank you
19 for your kind cooperation. Chairs, we are ready to
20 begin.

21 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much.

22 [GAVEL] Good afternoon. I am Council Member Carmen
23 De La Rosa, Chair of the Committee of Civil Service
24 and Labor. I am joined by my colleagues Chair Farah
25 Louis of the Women and Gender Equity Committee and

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 6

4 Chair Nantasha Williams of the Civil and Human Rights
5 Committee.

6 Today's hearing is a collaborative effort to
7 explore strategies to address pay disparity in our
8 city's municipal workforce. Today, we will be
9 questioning the Administration about the City
10 Council's third round of findings from Local Law 18
11 of 2019, which analyzes pay disparities based on
12 race, ethnicity, gender other protected classes among
13 municipal employees.

14 As the Council's data team has noted in their
15 report, city agencies have largely succeeded in
16 ensuring that employees of all genders and races are
17 paid the same similar salaries within the same
18 titles. But that does not mean that our work is
19 done. The analysis conducted by the data team based
20 on employee data from 2021 continues to show that
21 overall the city's workforce still exhibits
22 substantial gaps in pay between men and women and
23 between White and non-White employees. This is
24 largely caused by a high concentration of women and
25 racial minorities in titles that are lower paid.

While managerial titles with better pay have
higher concentrations of White and male employees.

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 7

1
2 In addition, the data suggests that overall headcount
3 reductions during and after the height of the COVID-
4 19 pandemic, disproportionately affected women of
5 color. Agencies with higher concentrations of women
6 and employees of color saw a substantial reductions
7 in staff. While agencies with higher concentrations
8 of men and White employees saw a relatively stable
9 headcount. These findings demonstrate a long-
10 standing trend of women and non-White employees being
11 undervalued and underpaid. The Council is committed
12 to improving access to opportunities for the
13 recruitment, retention and promotion of women and
14 people of color to strengthen our cities diverse
15 workforce and set a high standard for cities across
16 the country.

17 In addition to today's oversight topic, we will
18 be hearing the following legislation to enhance
19 promotional opportunities and diversify well-paid
20 titles.

21 Intro. 743 sponsored by myself, which would
22 require DCAS to offer career and counseling to long
23 term municipal employees, so that they are aware of
24 the many opportunities for upward mobility within
25 civil service.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 8

4 Intro. 767 sponsored by Council Member Crystal
5 Hudson, which would require DCAS to distribute a
6 workplace culture survey to all municipal employees
7 and then submit a report that summarizes the findings
8 for each agency, so that we can identify issues
9 within workplace cultures that may not otherwise be
10 captured by the data we already collect.

11 Intro. 809, also sponsored by myself, which would
12 require DCAS to report on its decision-making process
13 for expanding eligibility for promotional exams to
14 fill vacant managerial positions. Intro. 828,
15 sponsored by Chair Louis, which would require DCAS
16 and CUNY to distribute information about the civil
17 service process and related CUNY courses and programs
18 to students.

19 Intro. 829, also sponsored by Chair Louis, which
20 would require DCAS to engage in public outreach to
21 promote civil service examinations throughout the
22 city. And finally Resolution 346-A which is
23 sponsored by myself, which would call upon DCAS to
24 consider an employees participation in agency
25 provided trainings and other extra-curricular
initiatives when scoring promotional exams.

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 9

I'd like to thank the Committee Staff for their
work in preparing for this hearing. Policy Analyst
Elizabeth Arzt, Legislative Counsel Rie Ogasawara.

I'd also like to thank my staff Chief of Staff James
Burke, Kiana Diaz, and Fraynette Familia. I would
also like to give a special thanks to the Council's
Data Team including Rose Martinez, Alaa Moussawi,
Melissa Nunez, Eric Koepcke, Reese
Hirota for all their hard work on this years
pay disparity report.

With that, I'd like to turn it over to my Co-
Chair Farah Louis for her opening remarks.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you Chair De La Rosa.
Hello and welcome everyone. My name is Council
Member Farah Louis and I Chair the Committee on Women
and Gender Equity. First, I want to thank my
colleagues Chairs of the Committee on Civil Services
and Labor and the Committee on Civil and Human Rights
Council Member Carmen De La Rosa and Council Member
Nantasha Williams for organizing this hearing today.
An important hearing to address the pay equities in
the municipal workforce.

For far too long, the city has struggled with
both gender and racial economic equity. The Council

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 10

1
2 has attempted to address this issue throughout the
3 years, including by passing legislation to focus on
4 remedying these problems on the municipal level.

5 In this effort, I introduced and the City Council
6 enacted Local Law 29 of 2023, which sought to expand
7 the information available to the City Council to help
8 our continued work in this area. However, the
9 Council's report on the city's progress on pay equity
10 released this past week shows that there is still
11 more work to be done. As Chair De La Rosa mentioned,
12 this addition of the report continues to show that
13 occupational segregation remains a serious issue in
14 our municipal workforce and that women of color once
15 again are disproportionately impacted by this
16 disparity. The report found that pay disparities in
17 the municipal workforce are heavily attributed to the
18 fact that women of color are concentrated in
19 particularly low paying roles. For every dollar
20 earned by White male employees, all other workers
21 earn an average of \$0.82. Of this pay gap, White
22 female employees account for 13.1 percent. Non-White
23 male employees, 31.5 percent and non-White female
24 employees, 55.4 percent. Non-White workers earn
25 \$0.84 cents for every dollar earned by White workers,

1 with non-White male employees accounting for 32.4
2 percent and non-White female employees accounting for
3 67.6 percent of this gap. I know that was a lot of
4 numbers.
5

6 Female employees earn \$0.84 cents for every
7 dollar earned by male employees with White female
8 employees accounting for 15 percent for non-White
9 female employees, 85 percent of the pay gap. The
10 Committees look forward to hearing from the
11 Administration the work that's being done to address
12 these vast disparities and what more can be done on
13 the Council side to make sure that we fill these
14 gaps. I also look forward to hearing from members of
15 the Administration about two pieces of legislation
16 that are being heard at this hearing. Intro. 828 and
17 Intro. 829, relating to careers in civil service for
18 CUNY students as well as relating to the promotion of
19 civil service examinations both of which could help
20 efforts to promote diversity and the city's
21 workforce.

22 I would like to thank members of the
23 Administration, the Department of Administrative
24 Services, the advocates and members of the public who
25 have joined us today. I would also like to thank

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 12

1 members of my staff Daniel Heredia, Shona Duncan, and
2 Jaimelymn Elien, as well as our Committee Staff,
3 as well as Committee Council Sahar Moazami, and
4 Senior Legislative Policy Analyst Cristy Dwyer for
5 their work on this hearing. Thank you. I will now
6 turn it over to Chair Williams for her opening
7 remarks.
8

9 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you Chair. Good
10 afternoon everyone. My name is Nantasha Williams and
11 I serve as Chair to the Committee on Civil and Human
12 Rights. I also want to start by thanking my
13 colleagues Chair Louis and Chair De La Rosa for
14 organizing this important hearing today. First and
15 foremost, I want to echo my colleagues in saying
16 that the continued pay gaps in occupational
17 segregation within our municipal workforce are
18 unacceptable. The city is obligated to fix these
19 inequities and I look forward to hearing from the
20 Administration today about the work that remains to
21 achieve this goal.

22 I won't repeat what my colleagues have said but I
23 do want to draw attention to the fact that the pay
24 disparity report at the center of this hearing is not
25 the only evidence we have of inequities affecting

1 city employees. Reports from the Equal Employment
2 Practices Commission or EEPC for short, which audits
3 every city agency on a four-year cycle identify
4 similar trends as this years pay disparity example –
5 I'm lying, pay disparity report with the back for
6 example, the EEPC has repeatedly found that
7 significant occupational segregation occurs between
8 and within agencies and that agencies and job titles
9 where male and White employees are over represented,
10 tend to have higher pay. In contrast, agencies in
11 roles where women and people of color are over
12 represented, tend to have lower pay, even where those
13 require higher levels of education or experience.

14 The EEPC has also identified disproportionate
15 headcount reductions in agencies primarily staffed by
16 women and people of color. What's more the agencies
17 that under hire women and people of color also have
18 higher attrition rates for those groups, which
19 further compound inequities within the city's
20 workforce. These trends date back to at least 2019,
21 before the pandemic.

22 I look forward today to hearing more about EEPC's
23 findings can complement and deepen our understanding
24 of the pay disparity reports findings and about our
25

1 current or planned efforts to address these egregious
2 long-standing inequities. In addition, while the pay
3 disparity report only include data for workers
4 employed directly by the city, a discussion of the
5 city's responsibilities for pay equity is not
6 complete with mentioning the large number of
7 contractors who perform work for the city. While the
8 city does not directly determine employment terms for
9 city contractors, the city budget does make sector
10 specific allocations and can determine contractors
11 pay increases for cost-of-living adjustments. These
12 contractors perform a wide range of work on behalf of
13 city government. For example, an estimated 90
14 percent of human services programming including
15 critical and court mandated services are provided by
16 the nonprofit sector under contracts with the city.

18 What we know about these contracts suggests that
19 the same pay disparities in occupational segregation
20 that we see at city agencies are replicated or even
21 amplified among contractors. Current and future
22 efforts from city government including the EEPC, the
23 Mayor's Office of Equity and Racial Justice and the
24 Pay Equity Cabinet must keep the holistic impact of
25 city policies in mind as they work with agencies

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 15

1
2 towards making the city a more equitable place to
3 work and live. Finally, before we begin, I would
4 like to thank my staff Amir Abbady, Whitney Mulzac,
5 as well as Committee Staff for the Committee on
6 Civil and Human Rights Jessica and Wiam for their
7 hard work in preparing today's hearing.

8 I also want to reiterate my colleagues
9 appreciation for the Council's Data team for putting
10 together the pay disparity report that is subject of
11 today's hearing. Now, I'll turn it back to Chair De
12 La Rosa.

13 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you Chairs. I
14 would also like to recognize that we've been joined
15 by Council Members Menin, Bottcher, Salaam, Salamanca
16 and Cabàn and online by Council Members Moya and
17 Feliz. I now invite the representatives from DCAS,
18 MOERJ, OLR to offer their testimony. We have Deputy
19 Commissioners Katrina Porter, Silvia Montalban,
20 Commissioner Sideya Sherman and Deputy Commissioner
21 Dan Pollak to come up to the witness table, which you
22 already beat me to that. First, to deliver their
23 testimony and answer Council Member questions, then
24 we will ask representatives from EEPCC to come up to
25

1
2 the witness table and answer our questions as a
3 second panel.

4 I now turn to the Committee Counsel to administer
5 the oath for this panel of Administration officials
6 including Kadian Outar. I'm messing up your name,
7 hopefully not, sorry and Sanford Cohen who are
8 present in the Chamber for Q&A.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear testimony
10 from the Administration before we begin I will
11 administer the affirmation. Panelists please raise
12 your right hand as well as those who are present for
13 Q&A. I'll read the affirmation once and then call on
14 each of you individually to respond. Do you affirm
15 to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but
16 the truth before this Committee and to respond
17 honestly to Council Member questions?

18 PANEL: Yes.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Deputy
20 Commissioner Porter, please begin.

21 KATRINA PORTER: Good afternoon Chair De La Rosa,
22 Williams and Louis and members of the Committee on
23 Civil Service and Labor, Civil and Human Rights and
24 Women and Gender Equity. I am Katrina Porter, the
25 city's Chief Human Capital Officer and Deputy

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 17

1 Commissioner for Human Capital at the Department of
2 Citywide Administrative Services, commonly known as
3 DCAS. I am joined today by my colleagues Silvia
4 Montalban, DCAS Chief Citywide Equity and Inclusion
5 Officer, Deputy Commissioner Dan Pollak, First Deputy
6 Commissioner at the Office of Labor Relations and
7 Sideya Sherman, Chief Equity Officer and Commissioner
8 at the Mayor's Office of Equity and Racial Justice.
9

10 I'd like to first begin by thanking you for this
11 opportunity to discuss pay equity in the municipal
12 workforce, a matter that I am deeply invested in
13 improving. Equity is at the forefront of the work we
14 do at DCAS to better serve all New Yorkers. This is
15 true of the way we think about addressing pay
16 disparities among our municipal workforce and the
17 strategies we employ to help close the gap.

18 As a Black woman who has chartered my entire
19 career in city government I am keenly aware of the
20 challenges that have created barriers to advancement
21 and have limited earnings for some based on their
22 race or gender. Despite witnessing pass inequities
23 first hand, I am fortunate to be involved in the
24 efforts to revolutionize and reimagine the municipal
25 workforce every day. Our vision has never been

1 clearer and we view our work from a lens that
2 magnifies equity. Our agency is committed to
3 providing opportunities for all New Yorkers and
4 leveling the playing field through the civil service
5 process. Since we last testified on this matter, the
6 city has made significant progress to diversify our
7 talent pools, increase equity and access and remove
8 barriers to municipal employment including through
9 the ongoing review of our minimum qualification
10 requirements.
11

12 In June 2023, we supplemented the bachelor's
13 degree requirement for certain job titles. To date,
14 we have completed our review of 23 entry level titles
15 with the potential to impact 20,000 jobs and expand
16 eligibility for civil service positions that were
17 previously restricted and made difficult for many
18 applicants to meet minimum qualification
19 requirements.

20 With an updated review, the city is now more
21 inclusive and equitable, focusing on relevant work
22 experience and practical skills rather than formal
23 education. We are also building the foundation to
24 expand and review to eventually include supervisory
25 and discretionary positions and titles where we have

1 historically seen the greatest pay gaps. Moreover,
2 last year, we spearheaded the innovative and
3 impactful New York City government hiring hall model
4 to help fortify our workforce. With 16 New York City
5 government hiring hall hotels, we touched every
6 corner of the five boroughs and yielded more than
7 2,000 same day job offers.
8

9 Today, of the 2,000 job offers, the city has
10 onboarded 1,540 candidates and there are over 1,325
11 still working at agencies citywide. Collectively,
12 these efforts have helped us better position the City
13 of New York as both an employer of choice and an
14 employer of opportunity for all New Yorkers. Truly
15 reflecting the diversity of the city we serve. As we
16 continue to focus on strengthening our workforce,
17 increasing diversity and creating new opportunities,
18 we are also cognizant of the challenges posed by
19 historic and systematic inequities as it relates to
20 occupation segregation and pay equity.

21 We have shown continued intentionality in
22 revamping our approach and thinking innovatively
23 about weaving equity into all aspects of recruitment
24 and workforce development and training. This
25 includes working to address occupational segregation

1
2 by enhancing recruitment for a more diverse pool of
3 titles in EEO job categories that are highly paid but
4 predominantly White or male.

5 The Council's most recent published paid
6 disparities report shows there have been strides in
7 minimizing the pay gap. Compared to the first
8 report, Black employee salaries have improved by nine
9 percent compared to White employees. Our Hispanic
10 and Latino colleagues have improved seven percent and
11 our Asian employees have also improved their salaries
12 by seven percent.

13 Based on these numbers, it is evident that there
14 are major shifts happening and the tireless efforts
15 that we have been making to promote municipal
16 employment in every corner of the city has been
17 yielding tangible results. Our first line of defense
18 has and will continue to be our civil service system.

19 By design, it prioritizes merit and fitness and
20 mitigates issues with pay inequity. Furthermore, the
21 salaries for the vast majority of employees are set
22 through collective bargaining between the city
23 represented by the office of labor relations and
24 unions representing our city's workforce. So, our
25

1 employees themselves have a seat at the table through
2 their union representation.
3

4 In addition to utilizing our civil service system
5 to increase equity, we've also been laser focused on
6 bolstering diversity. In Fiscal Year 2022, the
7 cumulative representation of historically
8 marginalized groups among new hires exceeded those
9 who self-identify as White in all job categories.
10 The number also tells a story of advancement in the
11 workplace for women.

12 Among new hires, female appointments exceed the
13 appointments in more job categories than previously
14 reported including Administrative support, officials
15 and administrators, professionals and
16 paraprofessionals, excuse me. This also should
17 suggest that we are actively remedying the impacts of
18 occupational segregation as women have been hired in
19 the categories of protected services fields that are
20 typically male dominated but are diversifying.

21 We recognize that inclusive recruitment and
22 targeted outreach to marginalized groups is a vital
23 part of increasing diversity and access. With that
24 in mind, we continue to focus on creating
25 opportunities and sharing resources for those

1 interested in municipal employment through DCAS's
2 Office of Citywide Recruitment or OCR. In Fiscal
3 Year 2023, OCR participated in over 209 outreach
4 events and reached nearly 26,000 participants sharing
5 widely the benefit of city employment and promoting
6 pathways into civil service for New Yorkers.
7

8 OCR's recruitment efforts also target students
9 enrolled at colleges and universities including
10 promoting and disseminating information about
11 internships and fellowship opportunities like our
12 civil service pathway fellowship, which is uh, uh,
13 the civil service pathway fellowship at DCAS and City
14 of New York Partnership is a two-year fellowship that
15 provides recent CUNY graduates with pathways to
16 permanent legislative permanent civil service
17 employment.

18 With all of the efforts in mind, we are confident
19 that the work we're doing makes our city's workforce
20 more equitable starting from recruiting through
21 career training, development and advancement. As
22 such, we value the Council's input and welcome
23 discussions related to the proposed legislation being
24 considered today. It is important to highlight that
25 we have already set into motion a number of

1 initiatives and strategies whose goals are reflected
2 in some of your bills. And so, I'll go into our
3 position around a few of your bills.
4

5 Intro. 743, we agree in spirit with the bill and
6 want to highlight that the city has employed similar
7 strategies in municipal government for many years
8 now. Across agencies citywide, career counseling is
9 already offered to employees. In considering the
10 intricacies and logistics of career counseling, we
11 wish to remind the Council that hiring and promotions
12 occur at the agency level, thus DCAS insight into the
13 full breadth of opportunities and paths to
14 advancement is limited and beyond the scope of our
15 purview.

16 Considering that there are over 300,000 total
17 city employees, the type of resources that would be
18 needed to centralize career counseling through DCAS
19 as prescribed by the language and the legislation,
20 would be significant and frankly impractical. That
21 said, we welcome a future dialogue with the Council
22 about how we can make the existing career counseling
23 process work better to equitably uplift and empower
24 our city's workforce.
25

1 Intro. 767, similarly Intro. 767 seeks to gain
2 insight on city employee experiences in the workforce
3 that we have been actively working to gather. DCAS
4 is constantly checking the pulse of the fellow
5 agencies on what they need to help retain and improve
6 employee engagement and satisfaction. We think there
7 is an opportunity to harmonize this bill with our
8 latest efforts to achieve these shared goals and
9 welcome future discussions with Council about the
10 best way to mend that work together.
11

12 Intro. 809, DCAS has serious operational concerns
13 about this bill and seeks a future discussion with
14 the Council to better understand its intent in
15 proposing this legislation and the goals it is
16 designed to achieve.

17 Aside from our view that any perspective
18 implementation of this measure would be impractical,
19 the data that would need to call to produce an annual
20 report as this bill prescribes lies beyond the scope
21 of our current resources. Additionally, DCAS wants
22 to take an opportunity to briefly acknowledge the two
23 other bills being considered by the Council here
24 today, Intro.'s 829 and 828 and 829, unfortunately we
25 will not be able to comment on these measures given

1
2 the recent inclusion to the agenda for this hearing,
3 thus not affording us an opportunity to review the
4 language and prepare commentary on them.

5 In conclusion, we thank the Council for its
6 ongoing commitment increasing pay equity and
7 improving the city's municipal workforce. Having
8 fellow partners in government provides us with an
9 appropriate channel to cross pollinate and reimagine
10 the city's workforce to best serve all New Yorkers.
11 As reselected by this hearing, combating disparities
12 based on race, ethnicity and/or gender and
13 occupational segregation is indeed an all-hands-on
14 deck issue. As you have heard from our testimony,
15 DCAS undertakes many initiatives and offers many
16 pathways to address inequities in pay and we will
17 continue to do so in close coordination and
18 collaboration with our fellow agencies and the
19 Council. Please know that our continued pursuit for
20 equal opportunity and equity for all New Yorkers is
21 reflected in the work we do every day.

22 Thanks again and at this time, I am happy to
23 answer any questions.

24 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you Deputy
25 Commissioner Porter. I want to recognize we've been

1
2 joined by Council Member Gutiérrez. I also want to
3 say that although you've testified that you will not
4 be commenting on both Intro.'s 828 and 829, this
5 panel and this Council intends to ask the questions
6 on the record. CUNY is a pathway for the workforce
7 in our city. It is our public university system and
8 within your purview of making sure that there are
9 pathways to employment for our graduating students,
10 it is absolutely appropriate to ask about this as
11 well as public outreach which is a part of the
12 mandate of the agencies. So, we will be asking our
13 questions and we hope that you know if you don't have
14 answers today, we will certainly get answers back
15 from you in the short order.

16 KATRINA PORTER: Understood.

17 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: I'm going to start my
18 questioning by directing you all to the screen here
19 to my right. On the screen is a bar chart that's
20 showing the percentage of workers receiving salaries
21 below the midpoint of their salary band. A salary
22 band is the range between minimum and maximum
23 salaries that an employee in a given title makes.
24 The first bar to the left in light gray is the
25 citywide percentage with 47 percent of workers making

1 below the midpoint of their salary band. Next to it
2 is a set of bars with the percentages by gender, who
3 are making below the midpoint of their salary band.
4 Female workers are in orange at 56 percent and male
5 workers are shown in dark gray at 41 percent. The
6 last set of bars are the percentages by race and
7 ethnicity. Employees who identify as Asian, Black,
8 Hispanic, Latino, and other, are depicted in the
9 orange and between 49 and 54 percent are making below
10 their salary bands midpoint compared to 36 percent of
11 White workers who are depicted in the dark gray.
12

13 As you can see, the data and analysis found that
14 across the municipal workforce female employees are
15 significantly more likely to receive salaries below
16 that midpoint of their salary band when compared to
17 their male counterparts. Similarly salaries for non-
18 White employees are much more likely to fall below
19 the midpoint of their salary band. How are pay and
20 salary bands determined in this case and what is the
21 Administrations explanation as to why so many women
22 and people of color are disproportionately falling
23 below their bands midpoint even after controlling for
24 work experience?
25

1
2 KATRINA PORTER: So, I'll start off by saying
3 that as you make approximately 95 percent of the
4 titles in the city's portfolio, uhm the salary bands
5 and ranges are determined through collective
6 bargaining. And so, with that, I would like to turn
7 it over to my colleague who may be able to shed more
8 light.

9 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Can you just repeat that
10 real quick? I apologize.

11 KATRINA PORTER: No problem. So, I was
12 explaining that the majority, almost 90 percent of
13 the titles in the city's portfolio, the salaries and
14 the salary ranges are determined through collective
15 bargaining, so I want to turn it over to my colleague
16 Dan.

17 DANIEL POLLAK: Thank you for that question Chair
18 De La Rosa. So, salary bands are set in collective
19 bargaining agreements. You know we have differences;
20 some collective bargaining agreements establish a set
21 salary rate for a title, some establish different
22 rates based on years of service and some establish a
23 minimum and a maximum salary as well as often a rate
24 that's applicable to new hires. So, you know I'm not
25 sure whether this data relates only to where there's

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 29

1 a minimum and a maximum or if it also includes where
2 there are set salaries based on years of service.

3 So, you know, I couldn't speak fully on it without
4 knowing exactly what went into it. In terms of how
5 salaries are determined, if it's set by the
6 collective bargaining agreement, then it's set by
7 that. In the event there is a minimum and a maximum
8 that's set by the agency including through a process
9 with the Office of Management and Budget that all
10 kind of personnel actions need to go through.

11
12 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Can you speak to the
13 process?

14 DANIEL POLLAK: I'm not the best person to speak
15 to it fully but essentially when there's any type of
16 personnel action, it's reviewed by the Office of
17 Management and Budget. The agency you know makes a
18 request for the personnel action and it's reviewed by
19 OMB.

20 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: And then in terms of the
21 explanation as to why so many women and people of
22 color are falling below the midpoints after
23 controlling for work experience?

24 DANIEL POLLAK: So, yeah, like I said, I'm not
25 sure I should answer that without kind of getting

1
2 more into the data and what it includes and what it
3 doesn't include, you know I don't have an answer for
4 that at this time.

5 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: We welcome a response
6 back to the Committee and if the response includes
7 you know we have to talk to OMB. If you could help
8 us you know try and get some information from OMB on
9 this issue. I think this really speaks to the heart
10 of the Council's findings here, which are showing
11 that women and women of color, workers of color are
12 falling disproportionately below. So, it's important
13 for us as a Council to really understand not only the
14 process, understanding and respecting collective
15 bargaining but understanding how those processes work
16 and why this specific sector of workers in the city
17 are disproportionately falling below.

18 DANIEL POLLAK: Understood Council Member, we'll
19 get back to you.

20 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you. We're going
21 to change up our agenda for right now because we know
22 that MOERJ has to step away is our understanding.
23 So, we're going to skip over to the questions and
24 then for MOERJ and then go back to some charts that
25

1
2 have been put forth for our Chairs to ask questions
3 on those.

4 So, the first question for MOERJ, alphabet soup
5 today, is improved language accessibility for current
6 and perspective civil service employees. Are you
7 aware of any civil service positions that would not
8 require fluency in English and are exams and written
9 - this is both for DCAS and MOERJ. And are exams and
10 written educational outreach materials translated?
11 If so, what are the most common languages in your
12 experience?

13 SIDEYA SHERMAN: So, I actually will defer to
14 DCAS on that and they could speak to the covered
15 languages.

16 KATRINA PORTER: Thanks Chair De La Rosa. So,
17 most of our, all of our documentation is disseminated
18 in English. You asked about civil service exams and
19 so, those documentations they are only disseminated
20 in English.

21 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Positions that require
22 fluency in English; are you aware of any civil
23 service positions that do not require fluency in
24 English?

1
2 KATRINA PORTER: Uhm, so what I will say is that
3 there are some civil service titles that require you
4 to be fluent in certain languages.

5 So, for example, there may be like an interpreter
6 bilingual or an interpreter that may need to have
7 proficiency in you know a certain language.

8 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Do you know like
9 percentagewise how many titles or the percentage of
10 titles that require fluency in English. Is it like a
11 majority of the titles?

12 KATRINA PORTER: Yeah, a majority of our titles
13 require that you understand and be understood in
14 English.

15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay and do you know the
16 opposite, how many don't require that?

17 KATRINA PORTER: I don't but I can look into it.

18 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay and then obviously
19 the educational materials, are they translated into
20 other languages?

21 KATRINA PORTER: They are not.

22 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: They're not. Is there
23 are reason for that?

24 KATRINA PORTER: Uhm, I will - I don't have an
25 answer for that but I can definitely circle back.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: I wonder, do those
3 materials not fall under the mandate of the seven
4 major languages of you know the city should be
5 putting out outreach materials for?

6 KATRINA PORTER: San, do you? Can I have -

7 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yes, he's been sworn in
8 so he can answer questions. The question is, since
9 most of your outreach, educational outreach materials
10 is in English, as Deputy Commissioner has testified,
11 do they not - do those materials not fall under the
12 city's mandate of the seven major languages that
13 should be translated into the seven major languages
14 in the city?

15 SANFORD COHEN: Well, my understanding is that we
16 translate many of our documents into the languages
17 that are required under the Administrative Code.

18 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: I'm specifically asking
19 about exam. So, educational exam, like prepped
20 materials or -

21 SANFORD COHEN: We don't create any prep
22 materials for our exams.

23 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay.
24
25

1
2 SANDFORD COHEN: So, the basic rule is that all
3 city employees need to be able to communicate and
4 understand English.

5 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Hmm, hmm.

6 SANDFORD COHEN: Because as government employees,
7 they need to be able to take instructions in English
8 and communicate with the public. So, that's bottom
9 line. That's been in existence for -

10 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Well, even if someone
11 can speak English, sometimes we think in other
12 languages. I am you know a Spanish speaker, Native
13 Spanish speaker right, so I learned Spanish and then
14 I learned English and so, sometimes I think in
15 Spanish. And so, when we see questions, for example,
16 you're preparing for a test, you can see it in
17 Spanish and translate it in your head into English.
18 And so, my question is as a study guide, as documents
19 that are necessary for workers to study, are they
20 available in a workers Native language?

21 SANDFORD COHEN: DCAS does not produce any
22 materials that are study guides for civil services.

23 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Who produces the
24 materials?

25 SANDFORD COHEN: Pardon me?

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Who produces the study
3 materials for civil services?

4 SANFORD COHEN: Those are private enterprises
5 that provide the study materials, it's not DCAS or
6 any other city agency.

7 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: So, there's not type of
8 resources or you know anything that can help a worker
9 that is not predominantly English speaking, even
10 though they may be able to communicate and speak and
11 understand English to prepare for an exam?

12 SANFORD COHEN: Not that DCAS produces.

13 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: And don't we think that
14 that might hinder some minority groups from being
15 able to move forward in their careers if there isn't
16 materials in those languages?

17 SANFORD COHEN: I don't know whether it hinders
18 them or not but there is the basic rule that people
19 need to be able to understand and communicate in
20 English.

21 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you for answering
22 the question. I know you're answering it from a more
23 technical perspective but I will say that it sounds a
24 lot like learn English, we're in America. That is
25 not the case of our city. That is not the case of

1
2 our workforce. That is not the case when we're
3 trying to have a workforce that is reflective of our
4 city population. And so, I'm looking forward to
5 engaging with the Administration on how we can make
6 this process a little easier because if a person
7 can't fully comprehend what they're studying and we
8 know people learn in different ways, it's very
9 difficult for them to be able to take a test, even if
10 they're taking it in English and pass that test and
11 comprehension is important in order for us to have
12 you know folks pass and move forward in this system.
13 I think you wanted to add?

14 KATRINA PORTER: Yes, I just wanted to add,
15 excuse me that the notice of exam that's issued in
16 preparation for an exam, it's a very detailed
17 document and it does give you know interested
18 candidates an opportunity and insight into what will
19 be on the examination. So, it's very detailed. It
20 will give them a subject area and a brief description
21 of what that area may cover. And so, usually you
22 know candidates will use that you know to study for
23 the right uh -

24 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: How long is that
25 document?

1
2 KATRINA PORTER: It's a very long document and it
3 contains a lot of valuable information to the
4 candidate to help them prepare for the exam. So, it
5 talks about you know the uhm, the roles and
6 responsibilities of the job. Like, what to expect if
7 you're in the title, the salary, you know the
8 eligible titles, the subject areas that will be
9 tested during the exam.

10 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: In your experience, do
11 you think that DCAS would have the capacity to maybe
12 work with another agency or a sister agency, acquire
13 an agency to translate some of those materials that
14 you already have available to other languages.

15 KATRINA PORTER: I think it's worth further
16 discussion but I wouldn't want to commit to anything.

17 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay. I'm going to pass
18 it to my fellow Chairs, just because I know that
19 we're short on time. We'll come back to this. Thank
20 you.

21 KATRINA PORTER: You got it.

22 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Those are great questions and
23 I just want to highlight being a daughter of a
24 Haitian immigrants, you could learn a language
25 because you need to communicate and be able to

1 navigate getting around different settings that
2 you're apart of but it doesn't mean that it's a part
3 of you. So, the literacy component is important, so
4 thank you Chair De La Rosa. I have a quick question,
5 two quick questions. Your mandate includes
6 establishing standards for data disaggregation
7 including related to race and gender. Such standards
8 may also include income and socioeconomic status.
9 What patterns has this agency identified, including
10 with respect to wage and occupational segregation
11 based on the city's pay equity reporting data? And
12 then the second question is, what has the agency
13 identified in the pay equity reporting to address the
14 bridging gaps that you've seen in the reports?
15 You've highlighted some of in your statement but it
16 will be great to understand what that is.

18 KATRINA PORTER: Yeah, so I think the greatest
19 tool that we can employ right now to better
20 understand the occupational segregation issue through
21 the city is to identify the vendor to you know
22 complete the study. And so, that's been our main
23 focus is on identifying that vendor so that we can
24 actually look at the data from a title-to-title
25 perspective, which is you know the main focus here is

1
2 occupational segregation. And so, we think once we
3 identify that vendor, we'll have a better idea of
4 where we need to focus.

5 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: And how do you identify the
6 vendor?

7 KATRINA PORTER: So, this is mandated through
8 Local Law 27 and so, we've recently reissued a
9 request for quote to uhm you know to identify an
10 outside expert to conduct the analysis. We're
11 expecting responses from these vendors by the end of
12 April and hopefully we'll have a vendor selected soon
13 enough.

14 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: And have you all also
15 considered the inequities with paid sick leave,
16 parental leave and other forms of leave that might be
17 important in these conversations?

18 KATRINA PORTER: I'm not sure. I would have to -
19 Dan?

20 DANIEL POLLAK: Yeah, in terms of uhm, leave
21 benefits, you know those benefits are obviously
22 negotiated. Most civilian employees have similar
23 leave benefits as laid out in the citywide collective
24 bargaining agreement but you know we're always you
25 know discussing with our unions issue of leave,

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 40

1 including paid family leave, which many of our unions
2 have opted into the state program.
3

4 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you. If MOERJ could
5 answer the same question.

6 SIDEYA SHERMAN: Regarding what data -

7 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Pay leave, any type of leave.

8 SIDEYA SHERMAN: Sure, so I mean that's probably
9 a better question for our colleagues at OLR but just
10 to speak to the point that DC Porter raised earlier,
11 our office and our role in this right is really
12 through our partnership with DCAS and the pay equity
13 cabinet. The work that we're pursuing is the job
14 evaluation study, which would also meet compliance
15 with Local Law 27 that offers an opportunity for the
16 city to look at comparable worth across titles where
17 we see concentration of women and people of color.
18 It also offers an opportunity for us to understand
19 compensation within the same titles, so to the slide
20 Chairwoman De La Rosa shared earlier, right, that
21 would help us dig in further and really understand
22 what's causing the disparity there.

23 This is the first time the city has pursued this.
24 This would be one of the largest studies in any
25 municipal city and so, we look forward to sharing our

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 41

4 report with the Council Members. As DC Porter
5 shared, we have a solicitation out. We hope to have
6 that closed by the end of the month. We'll bring
7 vendors on and the first report would help us analyze
8 at least 50 to 60 titles in this way.

9 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you we look forward to
10 that report and the last question, in 2023, the pay
11 equity cabinet issued a request for proposals to
12 identify a minority and women owned business
13 enterprise vendor to complete a pay equity analysis
14 of approximately 60 job titles throughout city
15 government.

16 Is this the same RFP as the one required by Local
17 Law 27 to conduct a comparative worth analysis?

18 KATRINA PORTER: Yes.

19 SIDEYA SHERMAN: Yes, so and just to give some
20 context. Uhm, the cabinet had began to pursue a job
21 evaluation study. At the same time, the Council was
22 proposing similar legislation, so there was an
23 opportunity to for alignment and so, that allows us
24 to pursue that study and fulfill the Local Law
25 compliance.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: And is this the only RFP
being issued by the pay equity analysis?

1
2 SIDEYA SHERMAN: So, this is being issued through
3 DCAS's Co-Chair of the cabinet and it's the only RFP
4 at this time.

5 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Alright, thank you. I'll
6 hand it over to Chair Williams.

7 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you. Uhm, hello
8 Commissioner. Your mandate which you are in the
9 early stages of developing and implementing, you know
10 that your office is fairly new, includes giving
11 support to all agencies to develop policies and
12 practices that combat wage and occupational
13 segregation and promoting equitable hiring practices.
14 What do you foresee being the key pillars of your
15 strategy as it relates to combating wage and
16 occupational segregation?

17 SIDEYA SHERMAN: Sure, so as you know Chair we
18 uhm, we have a number of new mandates by virtue of
19 the 2022 election which also includes supporting
20 agencies to produce their first ever racial equity
21 plans. We are going through that process as we speak
22 and we design that process in a way where we're
23 asking agencies to focus on the core pillars of
24 government, right? How they allocate their budget.
25 How they hire and staff their organizations. How

1 they design their programs etc., and so, our goal is
2 in addition to the many efforts of DCAS in addition
3 to the work of the pay equity cabinet, individual
4 agency work will also take place through these plans.
5 And so, we're providing like guidance as part of the
6 overall planning process and they certainly would
7 have access to these type of reports right, to make
8 assessments in their own organizations.
9

10 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you. Uhm, Section
11 3402 of the Charter, as added by Local Law 121 of
12 2022, stats that the task force on racial inclusion
13 and equity has the duty to develop initiatives and
14 policies to increase racial equity within agencies.
15 How has this taskforce been doing that and can you
16 please give some examples of the task force's work?

17 SIDEYA SHERMAN: Sure, so for contacts the task
18 force grew out of the pandemic. It was convened
19 during the pandemic, brought leaders of color
20 together, also helped spark what became the Pay
21 Equity Cabinet.

22 In this Administration as we move past at least
23 the you know earlier ways of the pandemic, our focus
24 has been on bringing the task force together to
25 concentrate on the Bronx in particular, right? So,

1 originally the task force identified 33 neighborhoods
2 that were most impacted by COVID. Many of those
3 communities were concentrated in the Bronx. And so,
4 that's the work that the task force has been doing.
5 We, over 2022 and part of 2023, we had working groups
6 within government to identify strategies to address
7 some of the disparities you see in the borough.
8 Earlier this year, we kicked off engagement across
9 the borough, so we've had workshops within the Bronx.
10 In language workshops in Spanish, we have a youth
11 workshop coming up where we're engaging communities
12 to identify those strategies and then we would move
13 forward with a response plan that's addressing some
14 of the issues that we see there.

16 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you Chair
18 Williams. I know your time is up but I wanted just
19 to ask you a quick question. Section 3403 of the
20 Charter, as added by Local Law 121 of 2022, states
21 that the Mayor and their Administration must issue a
22 bi-annual citywide racial equity plan with the goal
23 of eliminating racial equity. According to the
24 Charter, the citywide racial equity plan is due
25 tomorrow April 26th, and should be made available to

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 45

4 the public and submitted to both the Speaker and the
5 Council and to the Commission on Racial Equity. Does
6 MOERJ have any involvement in the development of this
7 plan? And if not, is anyone in the Mayor's Office
8 working with you all on this? Do we know if it's on
9 track to be released by tomorrow?

10 SIDEYA SHERMAN: Sure, so we're leading that
11 planning effort and based on the timeline that our
12 office was established, our timeline for releasing
13 the report was moved. And so, we share that publicly
14 and we'll make sure that that's on our website and we
15 also are working with the Commission on Racial Equity
16 who is our accountability body to make sure that
17 we're exchanging information as we go through that
18 process.

19 So, agencies have received a briefing. We have
20 kick off training and we look forward to keeping the
21 Council apprised.

22 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: And what's the new
23 timeline? Do you have a date?

24 SIDEYA SHERMAN: So, the new timeline is to have
25 a preliminary plan by the fall that would be shared
with the public and then we would move toward the
final plan by the end of the year.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay, thank you and then
3 one last question. As of March 2024, only 8 of the
4 38 budgeted positions for MOERJ were filled. Have
5 you made any progress in filling vacancies and what
6 are the challenges associated with having so many
7 positions remain vacant? What recruitment steps have
8 you taken to address?

9 SIDEYA SHERMAN: Sure, so uhm you know my number
10 one priority is recruitment and obviously we, you
11 know have established a new office in a challenging
12 recruitment environment. I'm happy to share that our
13 pipeline is filling up. We certainly, we brought on
14 some new people just within the last two weeks. We
15 have some new people starting as well. We're looking
16 for a number of equity planning managers who will be
17 working with agencies. It's a very particular skill
18 set certainly and we want to make sure we get it
19 right. And so, we've been advertising on those roles
20 and unfortunately we have some candidates in the
21 pipeline.

22 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great. Uhm, I want to
23 just check real quick if anyone has any other
24 questions because they are stepping away. We will
25 send you the rest of our questions and if you could

1 help us by getting some answers back to the
2 Committee, that would be great.

3
4 SIDEYA SHERMAN: Absolutely.

5 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: It's good to see you.
6 Thank you for coming. We're going to go back into
7 our questions of the rest of the Admin team that's
8 here and I know that there's some graphics for Chair
9 Louis and Chair Williams.

10 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Alright, so if you could
11 take your attention again to the screen there is a
12 bar chart showing the percent change of agency
13 headcount before and after the peak of COVID. The
14 agencies with headcount decreases are in red. This I
15 don't think is the right - is this the right chart?
16 Okay, uhm are in red while those with increases are
17 in blue. The agencies are ordered with those on top
18 having the large reductions in headcount. This
19 year's pay equity analysis indicated that the COVID-
20 19 crisis disproportionately affected female
21 employees of color. As we can see from this graphic
22 from 2019 to 2021, agencies with predominately female
23 and or non-White employees such the Department of
24 Human Services, the Human Resources Department and
25 the Department of Social Services as well as the

1 Department of Probation and the Department of
2 Education experience substantial reductions in
3 headcount, in particular, DHS experienced an almost
4 19 percent decrease.
5

6 In contrast, agencies with predominantly male and
7 or White employees like NYPD, DSNY, and DOT maintain
8 relatively stable headcounts with decreases below
9 five percent and in fact, the Fire Department and the
10 Parks and Recreation Department, ACS and the Office
11 of Technology and Innovation increase staff
12 headcount. As we look at this data and note the
13 disproportionate impact that headcount reductions
14 have had on women of color in the municipal
15 workforce, we would like to know what steps DCAS and
16 the Mayor's Pay Equity cabinet have taken to address
17 the recruitment and retention of female employees of
18 color.

19 KATRINA PORTER: Thank you so much for that
20 question. So, what I can say is that DCAS's, one of
21 DCAS's missions is to provide support to city
22 agencies to help them retrain and attract talent.
23 During 2023, DCAS embarked on the Hiring Hall
24 Initiative which was directly to support agency
25

1 hiring needs because the city's vacancy rate was at a
2 high level.

3
4 And so, through that effort, you know we
5 coordinated with the agencies to bring them in and to
6 actually bring the candidates to them and in the
7 communities that we serve and as I mentioned in my
8 testimony, we were able to reach about 14,000 New
9 Yorkers who were interested in available positions of
10 which 2,000 received job offers, and a number of
11 those employees are still with city government which
12 may have affected the vacancy rates for these
13 agencies.

14 What I also want to state is that DCAS, we do not
15 have insight into agencies vacancy rates. Hiring is
16 decentralized and it happens at the agency level, so
17 beyond, you know support through hiring hauls or
18 through our Office of Citywide Recruitment, you know
19 we wouldn't have any information beyond that, so
20 yeah.

21 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Yeah, I want to say I
22 appreciate that response. Just a question though
23 like DCAS, are you responsible for trainings, right?
24 Yes, okay, I just want to make sure we're on the same
25 page and are you responsible for looking at attrition

1 rates in agencies? Like, I know you say you don't
2 have access to what those vacancy numbers are but do
3 you have the capacity to provide any levels of
4 oversight around some of these agencies when you're
5 seeing certain trends like the one depicted on the
6 screen now?
7

8 SILVIA MONTALBAN: So, Chair Williams, if I could
9 compliment something of what our Deputy Commissioner
10 Porter said first and we can also answer your
11 question. I did want to point out that we also in
12 DCAS in addition to what Deputy Commissioner Porter
13 said is that we also take other proactive steps to
14 inform agencies about their workforce statistics and
15 their utilization data in particular, so that they
16 can be cognizant of where they have those under
17 represented areas for women and people of color and
18 in what job groupings. They're actually advised to
19 review this information on a quarterly basis with
20 lead stakeholders within their agency, that is the EO
21 office or agency Heads, Human Resources
22 professionals. And so, I think it actively utilized
23 that data to inform those recruitment efforts, that
24 they really should be using to target those
25

1
2 populations that are effecting their attention rates
3 and vacancy rate.

4 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Just a quick follow up on
5 that. So in terms of like retention because you know
6 I do appreciate what you said Commissioner around
7 like the hiring. I know the Mayor's Office is having
8 another hiring hall in my district and I know that
9 the Administration has been aggressive and appreciate
10 the Administration working to really fill a lot of
11 these vacancies but more so retrospectively looking
12 at like retention practices.

13 So, if you do see in which I know data can be
14 skewed right? Because I'm looking at Department of
15 Corrections. Like we know there were tons of
16 departures for reasons that are very specific to the
17 pandemic and it just so happens that workforce is
18 also has a high population of women and people of
19 color but just in terms of like the actual retention
20 practices, is there anything that DCAS is doing or
21 can do to try to address ways, the reasoning behind
22 why you see these departures in these particular
23 agencies. Like what might be happening within that
24 agency that is effecting the departure.

1
2 SILVIA MONTALBAN: So, yes, I mean there's a
3 series of things that DCAS tries to employ and advise
4 agencies to do and it can be anything from engaging
5 focus groups as well of different types of cohorts of
6 agencies to also have a discussion to determine what
7 factors maybe driving the decisions for people to
8 separate or move on from agencies. As you correctly
9 alluded to though, the pandemic had a big impact on
10 our workforce overall and drastically changed our
11 workforce landscape. However, there are other
12 factors that obviously we can assess through many
13 tools such as focus groups and other types of
14 surveying, which I'm sure you wanted to discuss at
15 some point as well.

16 And I can get into, I know you had other
17 questions, so maybe I'll turn it over to Commissioner
18 Porter because I know you had other questions.

19 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: No, I think I'll just turn
20 it over to Chair Louis but would be interested in the
21 data I guess it seems to be qualitative if it's focus
22 groups and or any quantitative data by way of surveys
23 to just understand what you are seeing and hearing
24 and how your agency is working to create or reframe
25 certain retention practices.

1
2 So, just I'm more so interested in like the
3 details of it, so I look forward to talking to you
4 about it after.

5 SILVIA MONTALBAN: You did allude to training and
6 you know that I'm sure you know is associated with
7 professional development opportunities for employees
8 and we work very hard to see how we can curate the
9 training portfolio at DCAS. So, there are adequate
10 training courses for individuals to advance. In
11 addition, I just wanted to say that we employ a lot
12 of measures as well in guiding agencies about their
13 recruitment and hiring practices. For example, in
14 alignment with Executive Order 21, Local Law 67.
15 We've ensured that agencies not inquire about salary
16 histories right in order to level the playing field
17 to determine how people are compensated fairly based
18 on qualifications and the requirements of the job.
19 We also obviously employ a broad sense of outreach
20 and work with agencies again to strategize their
21 recruitments efforts for very hard to recruit titles.

22 I'd be very glad to get into that. I know that
23 you're short on time but if you ask me later, I can
24 certainly elaborate.

25 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: On the screen is a figure displaying pay gaps between gender and racial ethnic groups and the percent of change in this gap from 2018 to 2021. The bar of the White male reference group is \$1.00. The bar of Hispanic Latino men depicts \$0.95, which is an improvement of 4.7 percent from 2018. The bar for White female employees depicts \$0.91, an improvement of 6.2 percent. The bar of Asian men depicts \$0.90, an improvement of 3.7 percent. The bar for men identifying as being some other race depicts \$0.84, an improvement of 9 percent from 2018.

Following that, the bar of Asian female employees depicts \$0.83, an improvement of 3.8 percent. The bar for Black male employees depicts \$0.81, which signifies an improvement of 5.9 percent. The bar for female employees identifies as being some other race depicts \$0.69, an improvement of 3.8 percent from 2018 to 2021.

The bar for Hispanic Latino female employees depicts \$0.68 cents, an improvement of 3.3 percent and finally, the bar for Black female employees depicts \$0.68 showing the smallest improvement of 3 percent. According to the Pay Equity Report

1 Findings, pay disparities are largely attributed to
2 the low pay of non-White female employees in the
3 municipal workforce. Non-White female employees are
4 concentrated in particularly low paying roles, even
5 relative to White female employees and non-White male
6 employees.
7

8 As we see in this graph, for every dollar earned
9 by White male employees, all other workers earn an
10 average of only \$0.82. Does the Administration have
11 proposals and ideas to diversify higher paid senior
12 roles and what more can the Administration do to
13 rectify this issue?

14 KATRINA PORTER: So, thank you for that. You
15 know as I stated, the Administration is committed to
16 addressing you know pay gaps and disparities across
17 the city and we've been doing many things to address
18 this. I would just go back to the efforts that we're
19 undertaking around minimum qualification
20 requirements, expanding you know access to city jobs.
21 I would also like to highlight our partnership with
22 CUNY, the Civil Service pathway fellowship. It's a
23 two-year fellowship for CUNY grads, which will allow
24 them a seamless entry into civil service and uhm,
25 what else are we doing? We have many different

1 programs going on but those are two, the two most
2 impactful ones that we're dealing with right now and
3 then just going back to that evaluation of the data,
4 the pay equity data will help us focus our efforts to
5 better address this.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: And I just want to say if you
8 guys agree to all of our bills, it will help your
9 numbers to.

10 KATRINA PORTER: Silvia, do you want to add?

11 SILVIA MONTALBAN: Sure. I just wanted to add
12 also we have a tool, which is a salary benchmarking
13 tool and that also has - we've shared it with
14 agencies so it allows them to as well as use the tool
15 when they're considering how to make these job offers
16 with the minimum, median and maximum salary of
17 certain salaries within certain job groupings. So,
18 that helps them to you know level the data, compare
19 the salary information against other agencies of a
20 similar size and function and that brings a little
21 bit more consistency to how they're able to assess
22 and make fair job offers. So, we've you know tried
23 to provide a lot of guidance as well around their
24 interviewing and structured interviewing and
25 consistency and how they approach and assess

1 candidates that way as well. Also, the way that they
2 interview people in making sure that questions are
3 consistent among the groups of applicants for those
4 positions and also, they're giving guidance on how to
5 indicate in their annual EEO plans how they have
6 tried to develop and implement protocols for in title
7 promotions and salary increases. They're required to
8 include justifications about their promotions.

9 Obviously that's a practice in general and they're
10 advised to review on a regular basis the demographics
11 of those who receive promotions and to share the
12 information in the aggregate with their agency head
13 and human resources.

14 They want to see what barriers there are for
15 selection and promotion, so I just want you to know
16 that we're offering that kind of guidance.

17 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: I have a quick follow up to
18 that. Based on the responses we received during
19 today's hearing, when looking at these trends, does
20 DCAS have any data on the casualty of trends?
21 Whether that is through exist interviews, through
22 agencies, and with DCAS efforts, with DCAS efforts to
23 reduce attrition amongst EEO groups such as women and
24 people of color help by mandating these agencies
25

1 providing data to DCAS. So, would you guys be able
2 to provide that? It sounds a lot like what Chair
3 Williams mentioned earlier but it would be good to
4 highlight that further.
5

6 KATRINA PORTER: Yes, we do deploy exit survey.
7 We will be deploying an exit survey through Local Law
8 130, so we're in the process of collecting data from
9 agencies, so that we can put together the survey for
10 a release during the beginning of Fiscal Year 2025.
11 So, we should have more data soon.

12 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you. I'm going to turn
13 it back over to Chair De La Rosa.

14 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you. We want to
15 acknowledge that we've been joined by Council Member
16 Joseph and Council Member Marte was here as well
17 earlier. So, I do want to and I apologize if we're
18 asking questions kind of all over the place at this
19 point but I do want to go back to Local Law 18 of
20 2019. In May 2021, DCAS issued recommendations for
21 the development and implementation of pay,
22 employment, and retention equity plans. The Mayor's
23 Office of Data Analytics found that White male
24 employees usually hold lower titles in a series such
25 as staff analysts or trainees for shorter periods of

1 time compared to people of color or female employees.

2 DCAS pledged that within the year, they would
3 continue to work with the Office of Data Analytics to
4 produce a thorough progression analysis that would
5 allow the city to understand and address roadblocks
6 to career progression. What is the status of the
7 analysis and can DCAS share findings with us at this
8 time?
9

10 KATRINA PORTER: Okay so uhm compliance with
11 Local Law 18 is among one of DCAS's priorities with
12 regards to understanding pay equity and we do work
13 very closely with OTA to analyze data and we also you
14 know share data with them for them to conduct their
15 analysis. So, for this year we provided OTA with the
16 required data in February and we're actually awaiting
17 OTA's analysis of that data, which is usually
18 available around May. Once we receive that data,
19 then DCAS will analyze it and then you know we can
20 provide you data at that point.

21 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great, thank you so
22 much. We look forward to looking at that and does
23 DCAS believe that offering career counseling services
24 to advise employees of dead-end titles or promotional
25 opportunities will help Black female employees

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 60

4 advance in the workforce, and I know you testified
5 that this is already kind of done across agencies but
6 is this something we believe will help move the
7 needle?

8 KATRINA PORTER: Absolutely we totally agree that
9 career counseling is a valuable tool to help
10 employees understand their trajectory. However, as
11 the bill is written, you know putting the onus on
12 DCAS to administer those career counsel sessions is
13 just not feasible at this time but once again, we're
14 absolutely open to having further discussions on how
15 we can figure out the best way to provide our city
16 employees with those services.

17 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great, I want to ask
18 about the Civil Service Ambassador program, which was
19 a bill that we passed in collaboration last term.
20 The agency reported that in 2023 it participated in
21 86 in person outreach events and 70 virtual events.
22 Does the agency track the number of people who have
23 received job offers or who learned about civil
24 service opportunities through these outreach
25 programs?

26 KATRINA PORTER: So, I'll turn this over to my
27 colleague Silvia Montalban.

1
2 SILVIA MONTALBAN: Sure, thank you. So, yes,
3 thank you for the question on that. So, we've built
4 upon our existing and ongoing efforts to educate the
5 public and different communities about the civil
6 service careers through the pathways identified in
7 that Local Law and so, just to reiterate, we did have
8 over 209 outreach events and those have reached
9 25,600 people and of those events, 86 were actually
10 qualifying pathways under the Local Law.

11 It is important also to just indicate that with
12 respect to the tracking, the number of job seekers,
13 DCAS doesn't have oversight of course into the hiring
14 process as we mentioned before of the agencies and
15 the promotions, because they're decentralized and
16 they're extension of those job offers but
17 notwithstanding, we have added a field in our city
18 personnel system so that candidates could be able to
19 indicate where and self-report where they learned
20 about the job opportunity. That will help us track
21 that more accurately and we've also added a field for
22 agencies to use for them to indicate how their new
23 hires were found and through what job-related events.
24 So, you know we'll be able to be able to track better
25 that.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great and the agency
3 reported a participating in 9 outreach events in high
4 schools and 15 at college and universities. What is
5 the feedback that the agency is getting from young
6 people at these events?

7 SILVIA MONTALBAN: So, you know I don't want to
8 speculate. We, you know, it's always very positive
9 that I do know because we've been to the events and
10 people are very engaged. I could ask our executive
11 director of Citywide Recruitment who is always in the
12 frontline meeting a lot of people. Maybe she might
13 have some insight about the young - Kadian Outar.

14 KADIAN OUTAR: Can you repeat the question again
15 please.

16 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay, so the question
17 was basically you all have been at high schools and
18 university campuses. What's the feedback that the
19 agency is getting from young people at these events
20 for the Civil Service Ambassador program?

21 KADIAN OUTAR: So, some of the main feedback has
22 been that they were not aware of the different types
23 of opportunities available in city government. Most
24 people are familiar with their uniform titles and
25 uniform agencies but they weren't aware of the

1 breadth of opportunities and even the process we're
2 getting them. Just an example, yesterday we were
3 speaking to our core members and the first thing they
4 are saying is, "wow, this information is so
5 important, I didn't know that there was an option for
6 me to go into city government and we have been
7 getting a lot of requests to participate in more
8 events to bring this information to more students and
9 even those that are further along in their careers.
10

11 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much. I'll
12 pass it over to the Co-Chairs for any questions.

13 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you Chair De La Rosa.
14 I have a couple of questions but I'll start here. I
15 heard the disclaimer earlier that you won't be able
16 to provide information about 828 and 829 but I just
17 want to share its executive level representatives for
18 the Mayor's Office. I'm pretty sure there's some
19 information you could provide today, so I'm going to
20 start asking the questions because I know that you're
21 more than capable of providing some information to
22 us. So, regarding Intro. 828 sponsored by myself and
23 co-primed by Chair De La Rosa would require DCAS to
24 collaborate with CUNY to develop written materials to
25 educate students about the city's civil service

1 system and various opportunities to engage with the
2 civil service through CUNY's curriculum programs. We
3 understand that you may not have had a chance to
4 prepare for this question given this short notice but
5 do you think that you can provide or discuss some of
6 the course work programs and initiatives offered by
7 CUNY that relate to civil service that you would
8 include in these written materials?
9

10 KATRINA PORTER: So, thank you for that and you
11 know as I mentioned just a short time ago, we have a
12 strong partnership with CUNY already through our
13 fellowship program, so we don't foresee this being a
14 big issue. I also want to hand it over to Kadian
15 Outar to talk more about her outreach through the
16 Office of Recruitment.

17 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you.

18 KADIAN OUTAR: Thank you. Across the last eight
19 years since the Office of Citywide Recruitment has
20 been established, we have formed strong partnerships
21 with the CUNY schools, not only connecting with their
22 career services offices, but looking at professors
23 and Chairs in specific departments as it relates to
24 positions within city government. So, a part of our
25 assistance agencies with their recruitment, depending

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 65

1 on their needs, we would reach out to those specific
2 areas in schools to try to set up either information
3 sessions or career workshops to introduce agencies to
4 the - and students to the opportunities available.
5

6 So, we also specifically reach out to CUNY
7 schools to participate in their career fairs that
8 they usually have twice per year and then we engage
9 again not only just the career services but sometimes
10 they have different groups, different programs to
11 make sure that they have the connection and
12 understanding of the opportunities within city
13 government. So, we continue to work with them and we
14 absolutely will continue to expand our relationship
15 with those groups.

16 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: It's great that you guys are
17 doing all these outreach efforts but you both did not
18 highlight the written materials part, so it would be
19 good to know as you're reaching out and
20 collaborating, do you also include information that
21 they could implement within written materials that
22 they give to students?

23 KADIAN OUTAR: So, the outreach that we do with
24 the CUNY students, during every session, we're doing
25 information sessions. We are providing them with a

1 civil service one on one. We are providing them with
2 the notice of exam depending on the session. We're
3 also providing them with the exam schedule, kind of a
4 summary sheet of how to move through the application
5 process to work with city government. We're
6 providing them with FAQ's, brochures, so depending on
7 the nature of the event, we do provide them with a
8 lot of different resources and also linking them to
9 places. We have videos on how to actually submit and
10 application on OASIS, so we do a lot in terms of not
11 just speaking to them even if we're just seeing them
12 at a career fair for two minutes, we're still
13 following up to provide them with additional
14 information. We also have a newsletter, jobs
15 newsletter that is sent out every month and for folks
16 that are signed up and our career services partners,
17 they get information on the current exams that are
18 open for filing each month. The opportunities that
19 are available, the citywide or city sponsored
20 recruitment events that are happening as well as
21 information on any kind of fellowships or internships
22 that available.

24 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you for that. Intro.
25 829, also sponsored by myself would require DCAS to

1 conduct an ongoing advertising campaign to promote
2 civil service examinations. You highlighted some of
3 this so if you could just share a little bit more.
4 Are there any other educational outreach initiatives
5 besides the student fellowship such as civil service
6 ambassador programs? I didn't hear about the
7 ambassador programs, so it would be great to
8 highlight that, that could model this advertising
9 campaign and in the past, what methods of educational
10 outreach to the public have proven to be the most
11 effective besides the fellowship program?

13 KADIAN OUTAR: So, as you can see that is very
14 impactful because our schedule is always too full
15 because so many people want us to come out into the
16 community. And so, we as a part of the updated job
17 wars that we have, we continuously post events that
18 are happening. But we also promote on our social
19 media pages. We also again share flyers with the
20 communities whenever we're hosting different events
21 but outside of just even DCAS, on a citywide scale,
22 there are agencies that have their own recruitment
23 and marketing campaigns where you will see postings
24 on the subways or sometimes I'll ride in the subway
25 and I take a picture this is what the agencies are

1
2 doing to promote their opportunities and furthermore
3 for one of our Local Laws, you will see some
4 information around what other agencies are
5 specifically doing and expenditures around those so
6 that's to come.

7 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Do you fund those campaigns?

8 KADIAN OUTAR: I'm sorry?

9 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Do you fund those campaigns?

10 KADIAN OUTAR: Uh, no.

11 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Maybe you should fund them.

12 Uhm, alright, the last question, the 55A program is a
13 program designed to promote equity and inclusion
14 among civil service job candidates with a certified,
15 mental and physical disability and evaluates people
16 based on their qualifications and their interviews,
17 rather than through a competitive examination. So, I
18 wanted to know which NYC agencies offer 55A program
19 participant please?

20 SILVIA MONTALBAN: Sure, I can answer that and we
21 also have our leader here who is in charge of the
22 program, so this is really great. So, we have
23 approximately 34 agencies that actually are utilizing
24 the program now and they're primarily one of the
25 larger top five are the larger agencies, which are

1 Department of Social Services, Department of
2 Education, Department of Health and Mental Hygiene,
3 Department of Finance and the NYPD. It is important
4 to note that the program is available for use by the
5 city agencies that fall under DCAS jurisdiction and
6 we are very assertively promoting the program to all
7 agencies to utilize it as a pipeline into hiring and
8 versifying their workforce for competitive status
9 positions. So we find that the program has been
10 successful. There has been interest generated. Of
11 course people come in and out of the program because
12 the people promote out of it and so, they move on but
13 new people come in but right now we have 34 agencies.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Do you know in totality how
16 many participants you have citywide?

17 SILVIA MONTALBAN: Yes, currently as of March 31st
18 of this year we have 333 program participants.
19 Kadian, I don't know if you want to say anything
20 else.

21 KADIAN OUTAR: I'll just add to what Silvia, our
22 Deputy Commissioner said is that we do have folks
23 that are coming in and out of the program but one of
24 the great things that we're seeing is the influx of
25 new people that are getting into city government

1 through the 55A program. And that is due to the
2 extensive outreach that we do specifically to
3 communities for people with disabilities. We also
4 work a lot with educating the agencies, training them
5 on how to do recruit within the different city and
6 disability communities and with the things that you
7 know understanding how to communicate and
8 understanding what the 55A program is and what is
9 not. And so, we try to take on different approaches,
10 one educating the public but also making sure that
11 our city agencies are educated on the program so when
12 folks are applying and you know indicating that
13 they're interested in the 55A program, the agencies
14 are aware of what it is and how to use it to
15 diversify their workforce.
16

17 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Alright, thank you. I'm
18 going to hand it back over to Chair De La Rosa.

19 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Chair Williams?

20 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: I'm good, thanks.

21 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay. Uhm, so there are
22 a few more questions. I'll ask - although obviously
23 the Administration is not obligated to comment on
24 resolutions, Reso. 346A does call on DCAS to exercise
25 its discretion to grant additional points on

1 promotional exams to applicants who have completed
2 the agencies executive development and management and
3 supervision trainings as well as those who have
4 earned a degree or certificate from the City
5 University of New York or a similarly accredited
6 institution. Does the agency have a position or a
7 comment on this Resolution at this time?
8

9 KATRINA PORTER: We're concerned about the
10 equitable distribution of those points on civil
11 service exams but once again Chair De La Rosa, I'm
12 hoping to having a conversation so that we can figure
13 out you know what's possible based on civil service
14 law.

15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great, thank you so much
16 for your consideration. In regards to Intro. 743
17 again about career counseling services, do you
18 foresee any barriers or challenges to offerings such
19 counseling services? You already spoke about your
20 jurisdiction and you know how it will be hard to
21 implement that across agencies but wanted to hear
22 your take on sort of any other barriers.

23 KATRINA PORTER: Yes, you know once again we're
24 supportive of that type of service for city employees
25 but as the bill is written, it's not feasible for

1 DCAS to administer career counseling for 300,000 plus
2 city employees. However you know as stated earlier,
3 career counseling is happening across the city even
4 at DCAS, the agency. We have a career counselor and
5 the services that are provided by our HR department,
6 they're very popular. The career counselor put out
7 her schedule and within a day or two she is booked
8 for the entire year. So, we know that there is value
9 in this type of service, we just want to make sure
10 that we're providing it at a high level because it is
11 very important for employees to understand you know
12 how to elevate in their current capacities.

14 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great. Okay, so Intro.
15 809, which requires DCAS to post an annual report on
16 its website that describes the factors that are
17 considered by the Department when they decide to
18 expand or not expand the eligibility for promotional
19 exams. For most vacant competitive class positions
20 at the managerial or supervisory level, promotional
21 exams are available to employees who currently hold
22 the position in the direct line of promotion for that
23 vacant title. This bill would require DCAS to
24 explain the decision-making process behind expanding
25 eligibility to employees who are in comparable

1 positions to that vacant title or to employees who
2 are currently serving in a related line of promotion.
3 For which agencies does DCAS have a career ladder
4 trajectories mapped out? For example, the NYPD has
5 career ladders mapped out where an employees upward
6 trajectory within the agency will follow a specific
7 structure from officer to sergeant to lieutenant to
8 captain and so on. Is there - has DCAS thought about
9 upward trajectories and how to map that out for other
10 agencies?
11

12 KATRINA PORTER: Each title in the cities
13 portfolio, their promotional track is available in an
14 internal system that we call title specifications
15 online. So, we have that information readily
16 available. We're just a bit unclear about the goal
17 of that particular bill but once again, we would love
18 to meet and just talk through the purpose and goal of
19 that particular bill.

20 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yeah, absolutely I'm
21 happy to have that conversation offline. I think the
22 intent and the spirit is really to provide
23 information so that folks know this is the clear path
24 within this title and this is something that I aspire
25 to right? But we can certainly have those

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 74

4 conversations. Any other questions Chair Williams?

5 Alright, I think we're good. Thank you all so much
6 for coming out today.

7 KATRINA PORTER: Thank you so much.

8 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: We're looking forward to
9 a conversation. Thank you.

10 [01:23:16] - [01:23:24]

11 Okay, thank you. We're going to ask Jeanne
12 Victor and Russell Ferri, Russell Ferri sorry from
13 the Equal Employment Practices Commission to come up
14 to the witness table and begin your testimony once
15 the Committee Counsel swears you in. So, Jeanne
16 Victor and Russell Ferri. [01:23:43] - [01:24:24].

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Good afternoon. Do you
18 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and
19 nothing but the truth before this Committee and to
20 respond honestly to Council Member questions?

21 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Do you all have
22 testimony or just Q&A today? Yeah, so please begin.
23 Thank you.

24 JEANNE VICTOR: So, good afternoon Chair De La
25 Rosa, Chair Hudson, Chair Louis, Chair Williams and
members of the Committees on Civil Service and Labor,
Women and Gender Equity, and Civil and Human Rights.

1 My name is Jeanne Victor and I'm the Executive
2 Director of the Equal Employment Practices
3 Commission, otherwise known as the EEP, a small
4 independent nonmayoral oversight entity charged with
5 auditing the EEL programs of city entities. In
6 addition, we perform research into the under
7 utilization of women and people of color in
8 accordance with Local Law 13 of 2019.

9 To my right, I am here with our Director of
10 Research Russell Ferri. In the three years that I've
11 held the Executive Director position, I have seen a
12 great deal of movement by City Council and DCAS to
13 address inequities in the work place. Most recently,
14 requiring accident reviews, offering employee
15 development, such as management skill training,
16 training, hiring managers and unconscious bias and
17 human resources efforts to employ people with
18 disabilities, just to name a few.

19 Yet despite all the effort inequities
20 unfortunately continue to exist. I want to start by
21 saying that disparities between White men, women and
22 people of color are pervasive nationwide. In
23 February 2024, the McKenzie Institute for Black
24 Economic Mobility published a report entitled, The
25

1 State of Black Residents, the Relevance of Place to
2 Racial Equity and Outcomes, and noted that there are
3 substantial gaps between Black and White residents in
4 virtually every county in the United States. In
5 fact, their analysis determined that there is no
6 where in the United States where outcome for Black
7 residents equal those of their White neighbors and as
8 they look across the past decade to gauge the rate of
9 progress, they note that while multiple metrics have
10 been improving for Black residents, those gains have
11 not closed racial gaps in any meaningful way as White
12 outcomes improved to the same degree or even more so.
13 They concluded that at the current pace it could take
14 more than 300 years for Black residents across the
15 nation to reach parity with their White neighbors.
16 Progress has not yielded parity.

17
18 In our 2022 report, as part of the EEPC's
19 research activities into the underutilization of
20 women and people of color in the city's workforce, we
21 created a chart depicting job group composition and
22 median salary by race, ethnicity, and gender as well
23 as conducted an analysis of six job titles in the New
24 York City workforce, mainly police officer,
25 correction officer, school safety agent, sanitation

1 worker, case worker, social worker, and fire fighter.

2 Here's what we found. White workers tended to be
3 more populous in titles in the higher pay job groups,
4 such as sanitation worker, fire fighter and police
5 officer, and women and people of color tended to be
6 more populous in titles in the lower paid job groups,
7 such as school safety agent, social worker, case
8 worker. Despite the requirement that social workers
9 have a master's degree and case workers have a
10 bachelor's degree.
11

12 All the other titles analyzed in this report have
13 either a 60-college credit requirement or a high
14 school diploma requirement. In the fourth quarter of
15 FY21, under utilization was identified in 22 of the
16 city's 29 job groups. Women were underutilized in 20
17 of the job groups, Black employees were underutilized
18 in 13 job groups and Hispanics and Asians were each
19 underutilized in 10 job groups. But the over
20 representation of women and people of color in the
21 correction officer, school safety agent, social
22 worker, case worker titles, suggested the presence of
23 occupational segregation, which is defined as the
24 concentration of individuals from certain groups,
25

1
2 typically racial, ethnic and/or gender groups into
3 certain occupations and job groups.

4 Historically this has manifested with White men
5 disproportionately employed in higher paying jobs and
6 women and people of color employed in lower paying
7 jobs. For this reason, we recommended at that time
8 that the city aggressively offer training for workers
9 in those job groups that are at the lower end of the
10 salary scale, such as case worker, food preparation,
11 guards, clerical etc..

12 To encourage those workers who are able and
13 interested in gaining skills to qualify for higher
14 salary jobs the opportunity to do so. In this way,
15 workers in these job groups may find opportunities
16 for future growth, which may provide career pathways
17 for women and Black, Hispanic, Asian employees to
18 advance their careers into jobs with higher wages.
19 Targeted training would also provide additional
20 opportunities for new workers interested in starting
21 a career with the City of New York. By investing in
22 its employees, the city can create jobs for new
23 employees who may be at the beginning of their
24 careers while encouraging current employees to
25

1
2 qualify for higher paying roles within the city's
3 workforce.

4 Since our 2022 report, since then McKenzie and
5 Company as a management consulting firm, published an
6 article in December 2023 on generative AI's impact on
7 Black economic mobility, and McKenzie states that new
8 wealth created by digital and AI capabilities flows
9 through an economy where the median Black household
10 has only about 15 percent of the wealth held by the
11 median White household. The data are striking.

12 According to McKenzie, the median Black family has
13 masked about \$44,900 in wealth while the median White
14 household holds 285,000 dollars in total assets.

15 Without correcting longstanding patterns, generative
16 AI has the potential to increase this racial wealth
17 gap. Black Americans capture only about \$0.38 of
18 every dollar of new household wealth due to AI
19 despite representing 13 percent of the population.

20 If this trend continues and projections of the growth
21 of Black households are accurate by 2045 racially
22 disparate distribution of new wealth created by
23 generative AI could increase the wealth cap between
24 Black and White households by \$43 billion annually.

1 The article states that Black workers are
2
3 increasingly over represented in four of the top five
4 occupations at risk of automation. Office support,
5 production work, food services and mechanical
6 installation and repair and if reskilling efforts are
7 not undertaken now, this trend only stands to worsen.
8 According to their analysis of the data, 24 percent
9 of all Black workers are in occupations with greater
10 than 75 percent automation potential compared with
11 just 20 percent of White workers and then conclude
12 that gen AI will likely alter the professional
13 pathways that Black workers rely on to move from low
14 wage to higher paying roles. The authors go on to
15 say however that leaders have an opportunity to build
16 equity and fairness into their developing generative
17 AI strategies and associated applications and can
18 accelerate the closing of the racial gap by preparing
19 workers to meet the needs of a post gen AI landscape.

20 McKenzie's recommendation is to prepare workers
21 by training them in skills that cannot be easily
22 displaced by technology in the near future by
23 emphasizing foundational and nuanced skill building
24 instead of role specific training.
25

1
2 So, in conclusion, the growth of AI only adds to
3 the urgency of addressing pay disparities in the
4 city's workforce because if the city fails to get
5 ahead of it, it can set back all of the gains and
6 progress that have been achieved to date and
7 exacerbate the existing racial gap. What is required
8 is a program of ensuring equal pay for equal work,
9 identifying and removing barriers embedded in hiring
10 and promotional practices, analyzing the civil
11 service system to ensure hiring and promotional
12 practices are fair and equitable, employee
13 development and career counseling, understanding why
14 employees choose to leave, continuously reviewing
15 relevant employment metrics to ensure all of the
16 city's efforts are making a difference and tweaking
17 those efforts when necessary.

18 Thank you for inviting me and Russell to speak
19 with you today and we're happy to answer any
20 questions you may have.

21 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Hello, thanks for
22 coming. I always appreciate the work that you all
23 do. So, we know that you mandated some monitoring
24 because of data analysis on equity and city agencies,
25 employment policies, programs and practices through

1
2 which you guys identified that the city underutilizes
3 with many people of color, particularly in higher
4 paid positions. Does your data suggest any casual -
5 causal, excuse me, connections between
6 underutilization and pay inequity or other patterns
7 in the city's hiring or retention of employees? For
8 example, are there any patterns of certain types of
9 inequities or violations being more common? In
10 particular, occupations or salary bans?

11 RUSSELL FERRI: So, thank you for the question.
12 Unfortunately the data that we have does not allow us
13 to make any strong causal claims that you would
14 suggest in the question. Certainly we're aware of
15 other studies that have been done of similar
16 populations that are able to sort of make it those
17 kinds of differences but with the data that we have
18 available to us, I couldn't in good conscious claim
19 that there's - that we could make any strong causal
20 claims like the kind that you would - that you ask
21 about.

22 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: So, is it the data or is
23 it just the inability to like run a particular
24 analysis on the data? So, you don't have the data or
25

1 is it, you don't have like maybe the right tools to
2 analyze some of the data that could answer that?
3

4 RUSSELL FERRI: It's more that we don't have the
5 data.

6 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay. Uhm, in its 2023
7 annual report EEPC recommended that the city
8 researched the drivers of occupational segregation.
9 This was in connection to EEPC's findings that women
10 and people of color continue to be underutilized in
11 the city workforce due to both under hiring and
12 higher attrition rates. Can you share more about
13 what EEPC's analysis suggests about the relationship
14 between occupational segregation and other forms of
15 inequity that exist within the municipal workforce?

16 RUSSELL FERRI: So, there's a couple of issues
17 there and as you all have pointed out in some of the
18 graphs that you were showing earlier, right? There
19 certainly is occupational segregation in the city
20 that is also pervasive throughout the vast of the
21 country. In terms of things like the attrition rates
22 and the hiring rates, the point that we were making
23 in the reports, is that in addition to the fact that
24 you have these positions that already are disparate
25 in terms of you know disproportionately either too

1 many women and people of color compared to what you
2 would expect or too few is that the hiring patterns
3 and the attrition patterns tend to only make it
4 worse. So, it's one thing to say it's -the city is a
5 civil service system, people tend to stay and so
6 therefore it takes time for things to change but even
7 when people are coming onboard or leaving, they're
8 leaving at disproportionate rates that tend to only
9 exacerbate the problems. And certainly, I can't say
10 confidently with the data that we have that that is
11 you know particularly true in terms of higher or
12 lower paying positions but I would suspect that that
13 is the case.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Are you able to track
16 other forms of compensation such as the availability
17 of key benefits like paid sick and parental leave in
18 your work?

19 RUSSELL FERRI: Uh, no we are not other than
20 what's publicly available in union contracts and
21 negotiations but we don't have any other data beyond
22 that.

23 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay, so it's not
24 something that you can include in like future
25 reports?

1
2 RUSSELL FERRI: Not with what we have right now
3 no.

4 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay, uhm, how many
5 suspected or alleged human rights law violations do
6 you typically in covering your reporting? I don't
7 know if this is something that you do or something
8 that is more so related to the work of CCHR. Like, I
9 don't know if you're referring things to CCHR, I know
10 CCHR has its own challenges because they don't really
11 provide oversight to city agencies.

12 JEANNE VICTOR: Right, so when it comes to uhm
13 human rights law violations, if we encounter
14 something during the course of an audit, we will
15 refer it to CCHR. Uhm, I can think of one or two
16 occasions where we've done that. There was one
17 occasion though that uhm we became aware of a
18 violation and we went to the Law Department with that
19 and it was a violation that the Law Department was
20 working on with the agency.

21 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: So, you sent it to CCHR
22 but ultimately CCHR sent it to the Law Department or
23 how did the Law Department get involved?

24 JEANNE VICTOR: No, for one of the violations
25 that I learned of, I sent it to the Law Department.

1
2 I contacted Law Department to find out if anything
3 was being done to address the violation and I was
4 told that yes, they were working on it because that
5 particular agency was under the auspices of a
6 monitor, so they were working in concert together.

7 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: But are you required to
8 refer things to CCHR by way of lieu?

9 JEANNE VICTOR: Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay, so it just depends
11 on what the things are whether or not you refer to
12 CCHR or the Law Department?

13 JEANNE VICTOR: No, normally we would just refer
14 everything to CCHR.

15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay. Okay, I got to
16 ask more questions but I don't know if my colleagues
17 or Chairs have any other questions.

18 Okay, I'll keep going. In addition to conducting
19 audits, EEPC also makes recommendations for agencies
20 to improve their hiring and retention practices. You
21 know it was interesting to hear from DCAS because you
22 know of course we want to see recruitment practices
23 that really build the diverse workforce but I think
24 some of the issues that we're seeing require a
25 retrospective analysis of retention.

2 So, just wondering what kind of compliance have
3 you seen from agencies and following your
4 recommendation? When an agency does follow EEPC
5 recommendations has EEPC seen or documented any
6 impacts on the practices themselves in terms of
7 improvement? And are there any best practices that
8 EEPC would recommend to be implemented more widely by
9 city agencies?

10 JEANNE VICTOR: Okay, uhm, so when it comes to
11 following recommendations, EEPC the way that we
12 conduct our audit is we have a series of audit
13 standards that we look at what the agency is doing
14 against the audit standards. In this case, we're
15 doing an audit on underutilization of women and
16 people of color and we have about 20 standards that
17 we look at and uhm, in reference to retention and to
18 hiring, we uhm we look to see that they have the
19 structure in place. We don't necessarily - we're not
20 there long enough to know if it's working. What we
21 want to look at is whether or not they have the
22 program in place and we ask them to provide evidence
23 that they have the program in place. We want to see
24 policies and we want to see emails. Like for
25 example, if you know one of our standards is that you

1
2 have to have posted your EEO statement. If you know
3 we're auditing the agency and we ask them, give us
4 evidence that you've posted your EEO statement, we'd
5 either like to see a photograph of it some place
6 where it's posted for everyone to see and an email
7 advising all employees that this is where the policy
8 has been posted. Or we'd like to see an email to all
9 employees that says here's a copy of the policy for
10 your use.

11 So, we look and see if they have the framework in
12 place to make sure that their program is compliant.
13 So, in terms of compliance, we don't leave the audit.
14 We don't close the audit until 100 percent of the
15 standards are met. So, once the standards are met,
16 the agency receives a determination of compliance and
17 we move on. We reaudit the agency in four years but
18 there could be completely different standards because
19 we might be doing a sexual harassment audit at that
20 point.

21 So, we might be looking at the program from a
22 different perspective. So, you know one thing that
23 uhm, I'll say is that when agencies are subject to
24 the EEPC audit and we're looking at the standards, we
25 don't necessarily know that those standards remain in

1
2 place because as we move on and come back, we may not
3 be looking at the same exact standards again four
4 years from now. Does that make sense?

5 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Yes, but I'm wondering how
6 you do cross reference to make sure that the
7 standards have been kept in place over a period of
8 time once they make whatever remediation.

9 JEANNE VICTOR: So, that is something that we
10 would very much like to do but we're not able at this
11 point to do any spot checks or to go back and to see
12 if the standards are still in compliance with their
13 program because we're a small agency and we just
14 don't have the ability to do that at this point.

15 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Okay, do you have any
16 other suggestions around how to strengthen the work
17 that your agency is doing in relations to pay equity?
18 And just a random question, do you work with DCAS at
19 all? Like is there any like cross sharing? Like how
20 do you work with DCAS?

21 JEANNE VICTOR: So, uhm, historically the EEPC
22 has been independent, which meant that it really
23 functioned on its own with very little input from
24 other agencies but since I've been in place, we have
25 been working with DCAS. Most recently, we are

1 reviewing our audit standards with them to make sure
2 that what DCAS is telling the agencies at what I'll
3 call the frontend of the process and we're looking at
4 the backend of the process because we're going back
5 and making sure that things are in place. We want to
6 make sure that what DCAS is telling the agencies and
7 what we are telling the agencies are in alignment.

9 So, yes we are working together to make sure that
10 they are fully aware of what the audit process looks
11 like. What we are asking agencies to produce in
12 terms of this particular audit and that we're all in
13 agreement with what the standard should be. And I
14 wanted to go back to your first part of your question
15 because if you could just repeat that one more time.

16 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Yeah, you know I always
17 love to get you guys on the record about like certain
18 things that we could do to strengthen the work that
19 you do to hold agencies accountable to remediate
20 issues and/or to do more to address a lot of the
21 employment practices that are both you know
22 nationally trending but also like very specific to
23 New York City.

24 JEANNE VICTOR: I think there's plenty of room
25 for improvement. I think there are a lot of things

1 that we can do to make things a lot better. For
2 instance, uhm, we want to make sure you know it's my
3 goal that agencies have zero corrective actions.
4 When I go into audit an agency, I am expecting there
5 to be zero corrective actions because that means
6 their program is incompliance and that they don't
7 have to have corrective actions.
8

9 One thing I noted is that in last years audit, we
10 audited 43 agencies. Our top 3 audit standards where
11 we had corrective actions, were uhm one was designate
12 a career counselor and we talked about - that you
13 know was part of the discussion in the last panel.
14 We had 13 corrective actions for designating a career
15 counselor. The annual workforce data review, which
16 was another area where agencies just were not really
17 sitting down with their agency head and their EEO
18 Officer and their HR Officer to talk about the areas
19 of underutilization and to determine what kind of
20 plan they were going to adopt to address it. We saw
21 that lacking. And then our biggest number of
22 corrective actions involve training for personnel
23 involved in recruiting and hiring. We want to make
24 sure that the people that are making the decisions at
25 the table, that are interviewing the candidates, that

1 they are trained and recognized unconscious bias.

2 That they recognize what the process should be. Uhm,
3 and we found that you know, training was part of the
4 corrective action. So, these are things that I think
5 that the agencies can do better. I think that if I
6 had -

7
8 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Can you share the
9 agencies? The top three agencies that were subject
10 to these corrective actions?

11 JEANNE VICTOR: I don't have that with me but I
12 can get that for you.

13 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Okay and then you
14 mentioned like a really interesting topic around AI
15 and you know it's definitely a very trending thing
16 right now and so, again just wondering what specific
17 recommendations you have if any about how we can work
18 to address that on a city's level.

19 JEANNE VICTOR: So, uhm McKenzie, in their report
20 was suggesting or recommending that workers be
21 trained and you know one of the things that you know
22 we might want to focus on is not necessarily training
23 every single person in the workforce. Not
24 necessarily looking at a career counselor for every
25 single person in the workforce because not everybody

1 is in that position but I think really identifying
2 the roles like clerical, like I said case worker
3 during my testimony. You know the certain roles
4 within city government that will be impacted by AI
5 and really focusing on those particular titles and
6 offering career counseling to those folks because
7 those people are going to be most impacted by the
8 changes that are coming.
9

10 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you. I don't think
11 I have any other questions. I would be interested in
12 knowing how much you think it will cost to build out
13 your agency to be able to do spot checks and really
14 make sure that a lot of the remediation and
15 corrective actions are being addressed because what
16 is the point of auditing and providing these
17 recommendations to not know if they're actually being
18 put in place and to not be able to quantify what the
19 impact is if any around whatever corrective measure
20 is supposed to be taken up by the agency. So, just
21 for sure, I would love to know like if you had a wish
22 list of you know the things that you feel like your
23 agency really needs to do your work most robustly,
24 what would that be and how much would that cost? So,
25 not for now but if you can send it sooner than later.

1
2 JEANNE VICTOR: Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Alright, well we thank
4 you for being here today and thank you for answering
5 the questions. Thank you.

6 I now open the floor up to public testimony.
7 Before we begin, I remind members of the public that
8 this is a formal government proceeding and that
9 decorum shall be observed at all times. As such,
10 members of the public shall remain silent at all
11 times. The witness table is reserved for people who
12 wish to testify. No video recordings or photography
13 is allowed from the witness table. Further, members
14 of the public may not present audio or video
15 recordings as testimony but may submit transcripts of
16 such recordings to the Sergeant at Arms for inclusion
17 in the hearings record.

18 If you wish to speak at today's hearing, please
19 fill out an appearance card with the Sergeant at Arms
20 and wait for your name to be called. Once you've
21 been recognized, you will have two minutes to speak
22 on today's hearing topic of pay disparities in the
23 municipal workforce. If you have written statements
24 or additional written testimony you wish to submit
25 for the record, please provide a copy of that

1 testimony to the Sergeant at Arms. You may also
2 email written testimony to testimony@council.nyc.gov
3 within 72 hours of this hearing. Audio and video
4 recordings will not be accepted.
5

6 I now will call our first panel, which include
7 representatives of CWA 1180 and the Murphy Institute
8 at CUNY Ms. Gloria Middleton, Mr. Arthur Cheliotas,
9 and Gregory Mantsios. Please come up to the witness
10 stand and thank you for your patience and waiting
11 today. [01:51:59] - [01:52:30] When ever you are
12 ready Ms. Middleton.

13 GLORIA MIDDLETON: Good afternoon Committee
14 Chairs De La Rosa, Williams, and Louis, Committee
15 Members and City Council Members. My name is Gloria
16 Middleton, I am President of Communication Workers of
17 America Local 1180. My union represents almost 9,000
18 active city administrative and private sector workers
19 and close to 6,000 retirees. One of our main
20 objectives as a union representing predominantly
21 women and women of color has always been to fight for
22 equal salaries for all but you all know that.

23 Local 1180 has been one of the leading outspoken
24 voices in the past decade for women and women of
25 color. Pay inequity is not a new problem in the City

1 of New York. You know that too. In 2016, we
2 successfully sued the City of New York in an EEO
3 lawsuit that resulted in a \$15 million win for our
4 members because the facts were on our side. That
5 lawsuit was pivotal in our decision to recommend
6 legislation forcing the city to look at statistics
7 that would eliminate pay parity for all municipal
8 workers throughout every agency.
9

10 We sit here today as a result of that
11 legislation. Local Law 18 with firsthand information
12 that proves what we already knew to be true. The
13 results of the recent pay equity report released by
14 the Council demonstrates that large, gender and
15 racial pay gaps still exist in the New York City
16 municipal workforce. It is hard to fathom that years
17 after I first started testifying at Council hearings
18 about this ongoing issue, here we are again.

19 The wage gap between White men and women and
20 women of color earn continues to rob a clear sector
21 of workers of fair wages and the economic stability
22 to support themselves and their families. Local Law
23 18, which requires an annual study of the city's
24 workforce salaries, clearly needs strengthening. We
25 must pass laws to advance promotional and career

1
2 development opportunities that include using the
3 civil service system and encouraging women and
4 minorities to obtain college degrees while employed
5 as a means to increase salaries. My members ask me
6 over and over again, how do I get to the maximum
7 salary of my title?

8 I received my BA; my MA and my agency does not
9 recognize my competency or my sacrifice. It's
10 unconscionable that as of 2021, the latest year for
11 which data is available, city government workers of
12 color earn just \$0.84 for every dollar paid in salary
13 to White workers. With two-thirds of that wage gap
14 being due to disparate salaries for female employees
15 of color. With the latest study showing that
16 persistent wage gaps are largely due to occupational
17 segregation, whereby women and people of color are
18 concentrated in job titles that historically pay
19 less, Local 1180 stands behind the Council's four
20 bills seeking to promote diversity in the upper ranks
21 of government. Everyone, regardless of race or
22 gender has a right to be compensated fairly and
23 adequately for their hard work in keeping this city
24 running. Thank you.

1
2 ARTHUR CHELIOTES: Good afternoon. My name is
3 Arthur Cheliotas. I am the President of Local 1180
4 and currently the business manager.

5 I started working for the city in 1972, probably
6 before any of you were born sitting on the panel here
7 and what I can tell you from the start is it was
8 clear to me that in fact, women and minorities were
9 not being treated the same. When I was elected
10 President in 1975, we focused on that issue because
11 we seen what the Koch Administration had done to
12 minimize the salaries of women and minorities and to
13 make it difficult for them to get promoted.

14 And your chart that you had up before regarding
15 the salary ranges and where women and minorities
16 fall, you should remember that within each job title,
17 there were assignment levels and management has the
18 discretion to appoint people to each of those
19 assignment levels.

20 As some of the staff here can testify, we are
21 constantly filing out of title grievances, out of
22 level grievances. It was people doing the work at
23 higher levels but not being compensated for it and to
24 remedy this, one of the things that we had done is we
25 created steps to settle our EO case, to make sure

1 that the minimum salaries went up every year to give
2 the people who were doing the job, getting the
3 experience, but not being given the opportunities of
4 being discriminated against, would at least get some
5 increase as they moved up the ranks. Again, hearing
6 some of the testimony earlier, DCAS through all the
7 fights that we have had has not been a facilitator,
8 even though they're of equal employment
9 opportunities. They've been an impediment. They
10 have at every turn not provided the information that
11 was needed for our EO case. They claimed they didn't
12 have it. That's what created this report that you
13 have today.

14
15 And so, the question is what do we do going
16 forward? We have invested hundreds of thousands if
17 not millions of dollars in giving our members tuition
18 credits so that they can get college degrees,
19 bachelor's and master's degrees and as Gloria pointed
20 out, and then what? Nothing moves along. And so, I
21 think it's up to you to take a long look at things
22 like promotional opportunities for people that earn
23 degrees and the recent civil service exam for
24 promotion to police officer. Included a very
25 interesting thing. It included traffic enforcement

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 agents, associate traffic enforcement agents, school
5 security officers, that's a large group of minorities
6 and women who now will have access and at a
7 promotional level to be hired as police officers,
8 making a demographic difference in the constitution
9 of police officers in New York City. And that's one
10 example what could be done. The other I think the
11 Dean from the School of Labor Studies will talk about
12 is the para to teacher program and I've gone beyond
13 my time and thank you for listening.

14 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much.

15 GREGORY MANTSIOS: Good afternoon and thank you
16 for the opportunity to speak to you today. My name
17 is Greg Mantsios, I am the Founding Dean of the CUNY
18 School of Labor and Urban Studies. A school that's
19 dedicated to public service and social justice.

20 Our work spans nearly 40 decades. Over the
21 course of that time, uh four decades, four decades,
22 I'm not that old. Over the course of that time, we
23 have provided higher educational opportunities to
24 thousands of public sector workers, predominantly
25 women and people of color. Our students from CWA,
1180, and DC 37 and others received very generous
tuition benefits from their unions. These students

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

1 work hard. They're juggling jobs and family
2 obligations and ten classes in the evening and devote
3 their times to studies outside of the classroom. And
4 they do extremely well. Yet the number one complaint
5 that I have heard for 40 years is that despite the
6 educational achievements that our students receive
7 from these unions, too many of these students feel
8 trapped. Trapped by a system that keeps them on low
9 paying career paths. I should point out that this is
10 not the case for other students and just one example
11 that Arthur mentioned, you know the DOE and UFT work
12 with us to establish a program for paraprofessionals
13 to pursue a career in education and they provide
14 everything from tuition to you know course work. We
15 do career counseling. We do special tutoring and see
16 those paraprofessionals through their careers as
17 public-school teachers. I can get into more details
18 about that later if you'd like but job segregation
19 and pay disparity especially in the context of
20 educational achievement is anathema to the American
21 dream and it would be ideal that education creates
22 upward mobility.
23

24 We've been singing a song of inequality for a
25 long time but there's a new urgency in this program

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

1 because of the 2024 pay disparity report. It shows
2 us that there is a historical pattern and consequence
3 of job segregation and wage disparity and secondly,
4 there's a clear path forward. The consequences of
5 the past practices are shameful but the path towards
6 the future is clear. We commend 1180 and the Council
7 for taking up the issue and for creating remedies
8 that they are proposing. The report calls on DCAS to
9 reconsider practices that "rank eligible candidates
10 for promotions so as to better recognize highly
11 skilled and motivated employees" to riantly reward
12 the employees who are currently trapped in lower
13 paying and segregated jobs. We urge the city to one,
14 provide the students with additional points on the
15 civil service exam and it is done with veterans and
16 the armed services.

18 Two, provide pay increases for those who complete
19 a college courses study as is done by the DOE for
20 teachers who complete a master's plus 30 credits.
21 And three, provide courses of study that meet city
22 agency needs and allow graduates to take selective
23 certification exams and we're very happy to sit down
24 with DCAS to identify subject matter and skill sets
25 that will prepare city workers to entry into these

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 segregated, especially into segregated occupational
5 titles.

6 These measures will break what the report calls
7 the cycle of occupational segregation. Thank you for
8 your time and consideration.

9 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you all so much.
10 I have to say that uhm, we're here in large part
11 because of the work that you all have set forth. I
12 said to Gloria earlier that Local Law 18 is your
13 baby.

14 ARTHUR CHELIOTES: Yes it is.

15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: It's our job to raise it
16 so that we can fix the problem and of course CUNY,
17 you know we were talking about CUNY. CUNY is the
18 natural partner for our workforce. And so, sometimes
19 it's a little maddening to sit here and you know we
20 have no answers to the question about if CUNY should
21 be the pathway. We know that is the pathway.

22 Education is the passport to the future. We know
23 that right? So, I do have a question in terms of
24 what we presented today as a Council, right under the
25 leadership of our Speaker, we are so laser focused on
closing this gap and some of the ideas that have come
out include offering career counseling, right? Which

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 is done but is not done in a way that is structural
5 across agencies making sure that workplace culture
6 surveys are in place. Making sure that promotional
7 uhm, exams - well, making sure that we understand and
8 that DCAS reports on the decision-making process for
9 promotional exams. Making sure as Chair Louis
10 mentioned, CUNY is a big part of that pathway to
11 employment. Making sure that the public is engaged
12 in the outreach and then, finally looking at ways in
13 which promotional points can be assessed right in the
14 upward mobility of employees.

15 Which one of these bills or can you give us your
16 professional sort of criteria in terms of which one
17 of these bills would be most impactful in your
18 estimation in us closing the gap and what are some of
19 your thoughts about us as a city being able to
20 administer these things in a way that is impactful
21 for workers?

22 GLORIA MIDDLETON: Well, using the CUNY program
23 as a pathway, we have suggestions and Greg can speak
24 mor to it about getting to high school students and
25 letting them know about being able to come into city
service and there is a program that we have talked
about with the Administration which would educate

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 young people as to how important it is to have a
5 civil service job and how secure it is.

6 As far as DCAS, there's a lot of things that DCAS
7 said that while I know they have good intentions,
8 their hands are sort of tied by the agencies. The
9 power, they don't have the power that they need to
10 hold these agencies accountable. In my opinion, in
11 my experience, it seems like the agencies do their
12 own thing and it takes a lot for DCAS to hold them
13 accountable. We're going through something right now
14 with a civil service list for a particular agency
15 where they did not abide by the civil service rules.
16 They picked and chose who they want to become
17 Administrative managers because there was that band
18 when everybody scores 100. And we're asking DCAS to
19 now go back because they're supposed to certify who
20 they called and it's supposed to be done within 30
21 days. It was not done within 30 days, so you're
22 telling me that DCAS does not have the power to
23 oversee what these agencies are doing. If a member
24 hadn't spoke up and we hadn't caught it, they would
25 have gotten away with it. So, there has to be more
accountability for the agencies to report to DCAS. I

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 think they need a little more power in order for
5 these gaps to be taken care of.

6 ARTHUR CHELIOTES: Yeah, I think the issue of
7 targeting segregated classifications and putting in a
8 course of study that allows them to take promotional
9 exams to better paying jobs is a vehicle that can
10 undo a lot of what is going on and we have offered
11 with DCAS in the past. Tell us what the agencies
12 want. Tell us what skill sets you need. We will
13 work with the university to get those skill sets but
14 then give these people a leg up. Like they did with
15 the promotional exam for police officer. That's a
16 classic example.

17 There's also the issue you spoke about earlier
18 about language skills. There is a system already in
19 place of selective certifications but someone who has
20 scored let's say 30 on a civil service list but if
21 you are a Spanish speaker, you might be put number
22 one, on a Spanish speaker selective certification.
23 Those are all opportunities to deal with targeted
24 groups.

25 The other thing I spoke about earlier was step
plans. Our union with our settlement put in step
plans for administrative managers. Much of what DCAS

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 reported recently about the increase in pay for
5 minorities and women is attributed to that, to our
6 case. Not to what they did. It needs to be further
7 analyzed because I believe that only by aggressively
8 pursuing them and forcing them to do things, things
9 will get done. There is also another part to this,
10 you've got to fund them. You've got to give them the
11 resources to do the job. Just because they might be
12 given the authority to enforce the laws, if they
13 don't have the funding to hold exams frequently, then
14 you're not going to achieve what you need to achieve
15 and the classic example of this, White male dominated
16 positions usually in the uniform forces have regular
17 civil service exams.

18 Meanwhile, job titles that are held by
19 predominately White minorities and women, maybe once
20 a decade. Well, that means your potential to move up
21 the ranks is limited to once every ten years rather
22 than once every three or four years. So, holding
23 promotional exams frequently, giving a bridge for
24 lower paying jobs to those promotional exams, is a -
25 and the other aspect of it is citywide lists.

26 If you are on a promotional list, you're usually
27 limited to your particular agency, which might be a

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 small agency that doesn't have that many
5 opportunities to move up but there might be other
6 agencies that exhaust their promotions immediately
7 and then have the right to go to a more competitive
8 list.

9 Why not have a promotional citywide list so that
10 those people who are blocked in their particular
11 agency have the opportunity to move to another agency
12 and make the higher pay? Those are all mechanisms
13 clearly available under the current rules of the City
14 Charter and the personal rules of the City of New
15 York and I have appended all those to my testimony
16 that was given out and then I posted on your website.

17 GLORIA MIDDLETON: Okay, I'd like Greg to talk
18 about it.

19 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yeah.

20 GREGORY MANTSIOS: We've spoken today about the
21 fellowship program that CUNY has that brings college
22 graduates into civil service. Gloria was referencing
23 a proposal that we actually have before the City
24 Council now through the Social Justice Training Corp.
25 It's modeled after ROTC. It starts with high school
and prepares students from disadvantaged communities
to enter into career paths that take them through

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

1 college, from high school where they start to take
2 college courses then they go into our program, take
3 their college courses with us, earn a certificate in
4 community leadership and pursue that through their
5 bachelor's degree. We provide them with career
6 counseling that would get them into public service or
7 social justice advocacy work. It's a great program.
8 We've had other good ideas; I think the career
9 counseling is a great idea. I think the word culture
10 survey is a great idea. The two programs though that
11 involve CUNY, as wonderful as they are, they don't
12 address the fundamental problem that we're talking
13 about here, which is the current workforce. You know
14 what are we going to do for the current workforce to
15 remedy an injustice that they're carrying still
16 today. I mean, what do we say to the students who
17 are continuing to tell us the workers and our
18 students who continue to tell us, I'm trapped. I
19 can't get above where I am and so, I think the
20 recommendation for providing points on civil service
21 exam is a great way to address that issue. I think
22 authors point about selected certification exams is
23 another great way to address that issue. The point
24 that I made, pay increases that are tied to
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 educational achievement is another way to address
5 that. We're talking about people working really
6 hard, are highly motivated as the report says, you
7 want to reward those people. Work hard and highly
8 motivated. When you go to school at the end of a day
9 after juggling everything else, you know all day long
10 and you go to school, that's a sacrifice that's
11 showing motivation. There ought to be a connection
12 as there are in so many other professions and jobs
13 between your educational achievement and your pay.

14 So, those are just some of the ideas I think that
15 are worth addressing.

16 GLORIA MIDDLETON: So you said which one of your
17 Resolutions that we think is more important. We like
18 all of them.

19 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: We like your answer.
20 Chairs, any other questions for the panel? Okay, we
21 thank you so much for being here and the members for
22 waiting and sticking around. This is truly important
23 and your feedback, I took so many notes just from
24 your feedback. We're very grateful, thank you.

25 PANEL: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: We're going to call the
next panel. The second panel, can we please have the

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 following people come up to the witness table Michael
5 Greco, Christopher Leo Johnson, Dalvanie Powell and
6 Kyle Simmons. [02:14:24] - [02:14:39]. We'll start
7 with Michael when you're ready.

8 MICHAEL GRECO: Thank you very much. Good
9 morning, my name is Michael Greco, I am the Vice
10 President of Local 2507 representing EMTs, paramedics
11 and fire inspectors serving the FDNY. I want to
12 thank the Speaker and the Committee here today for
13 their tireless work to address the issue of pay
14 disparity in the city's workforce. Pay inequity has
15 a devastating impact on our members all EMS member in
16 the department, which maintains a severely segregated
17 workforce, the FDNY.

18 If we want to correct pay inequity in our
19 workforce, it is not enough to just work to open
20 doors to the jobs that have been traditionally
21 withheld from women and non-White municipal employees
22 like that of fire fighters. Although that work is
23 important, we also have to change the value we place
24 on the work done in those titles that have larger
25 amounts of women and non-White employees like EMS.
And I know everyone says well, but what about the
budget but this argument that other things are more

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 important to spend money on, just reflects our lack
5 of prioritizing women and people of color. Paying
6 employees equitably should not be a budgetary issue.
7 Budgetary limitations cannot be an excuse to subject
8 the city's employees to exploitative work conditions.
9 Our members live hand to mouth, most live below the
10 poverty line, many are on government subsidies. Our
11 members are in a constant state of stress as they
12 slip into more and more debt just to stay alive, so
13 that they can serve in extremely high stress demanding
14 jobs. Meanwhile they watch as their colleagues are
15 given unlimited paid sick leave, salaries, almost
16 twice what they are paid and benefits and working
17 conditions substantially different.

18 All of this just perpetuates a culture of and the
19 mentality that allows for segregation and keeps women
20 and people of color in poverty. This is not the
21 effect employment opportunities with the City of New
22 York should have. Year after year, the FDNY appears
23 before this body, trying to convince it hiring 70
24 women as fire fighters is a big step forward in
25 correcting the deeply rooted culture of
discrimination in the FDNY. But we know two decades
after the [INAUDIBLE 02:16:59] class action, we have

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 made little change. The EMS unions also filed a
5 complaint in 2019 and the Federal Equal Employment
6 Opportunity Commission, which found that the FDNY
7 discriminates in its pay practices towards EMS first
8 responders. A half a decade later, the city has done
9 nothing to remedy this. As long as you allow one
10 group to be undervalued, you will have a system where
11 there is the has and has nots and you will continue
12 to see a segregated workforce like [INAUDIBLE
13 02:17:28] is that.

14 The only way to close the gap is to not just open
15 doors to diversify White and male jobs, but to also
16 give proper value to the jobs in which women and
17 people of color perform. I thank you for your time
18 and commitment to this important work. I know you
19 wanted to add towards the end collective bargaining,
20 while it's important, they've nicknamed that now
21 pattern bargaining. So, that is a problem when it
22 comes to equity and diversity because if you have a
23 very high paid workforce like PD, like FD, and
24 they're getting \$100,000 and the pattern is ten
25 percent, you end up giving the higher paying
workforce a \$10,000 raise while the underprivileged

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 or the underserved that's making \$50,000 gets a
5 \$5,000 raise.

6 So, you just get exponentially further and
7 further apart, so that is a big problem. Each
8 services should be able to bargain for what they're
9 worth and any change that should be made, we
10 shouldn't be told, "well, we'd like to help you but
11 then 250,000 other people are going to you know be
12 arbitration eligible." So, thank you very much for
13 your time and I thank you for everything you've put
14 into this.

15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much.
16 Thank you.

17 DALVANIE POWELL: Good afternoon Chair and
18 Members of the Committee. I am the President of the
19 United Probation Officers Association. I thank the
20 Committee on Parity Disparity in the Municipal
21 workforce for affording me on behalf of the members
22 of United Probation Officers Association.

23 Currently, there are approximately 650 probation
24 officers and supervising a large number of our
25 members are women and people of color, significantly
lower than nearly two decades ago. Prior to Mayor
Bloomberg's Administration, there was approximately

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 1,550 probation officers but those numbers have
5 steadily dropped to more than half in the recent
6 years, even as our workload has increased due to a
7 combination of factors such as bail reform and
8 implementation of the race and age delegation that
9 increase the number of people we serve. To continue
10 performing our duties to the best our abilities, we
11 need your help.

12 The Department of Probation serves issues with
13 retention - has severe issues with retention and
14 recruitment. According to the Department of Citywide
15 Administration, we fall under the category of hard to
16 hire. Why? Because our members are leaving for other
17 high paying positions within the criminal justice
18 system. While there are civil service examinations
19 for probation officers in July 2022 and one
20 supervised probation officer in May 2021, there has
21 not been an exam for the Administration Probation
22 Officer since 2017. Though we just recently
23 scheduled one for July 16th of this year.

24 In addition to the increased caseloads, moral has
25 plummeted and our members are beyond frustrated
because our salaries are the lowest in the
metropolitan area including Long Island, Westchester

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

1
2 County, Suffolk County. Our compensation lags behind
3 other law enforcement agencies although we perform
4 the same work as our colleagues in the nearby
5 jurisdiction, adhere to the same job requirements,
6 work with the same population and face the same
7 similar dangers and our salaries are \$30,000 less
8 than the those working in Department of Corrections
9 and even those considered community corrections
10 supervisions. Our members have been without a
11 contract since November 2020. This is simply not
12 acceptable. While we're in contract with
13 negotiations that has moved like a snail.

14 While there is a salary range for our title under
15 the current and past contracts, many of our members
16 are suppressed to the low end of the range with
17 little opportunity to earn more nor do our members
18 ever reach the top salary for our title like other
19 Peace Officers. For example, the rate for a
20 probation officer hiring range is \$45,934, the
21 [INAUDIBLE 02:21:18] rate is \$51,903, the mass is
22 \$76,483 and now it takes a Probation Officer 11 years
23 to get \$57,880 in comparison to a correction officer
24 who are \$96,803 after five years, a finding that City
25 Council pointed out in 2019.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 We are aware that not only adults in city law
5 enforcement workforce has reached their maximum
6 salaries but there are several civilians who also
7 reach their top salaries as well. For example,
8 Deputy Sheriff's were also Peace Officers but
9 considered civilians earn \$92,000 after five in a
10 half years. Additionally, dozens of UPOA members are
11 earning below contract wage rates which we have been
12 demanding that the city rectify.

13 Simply put, we are - please bear with me, I'm
14 almost finished. We are continually being asked to
15 do more with less to do more, we must find ways to be
16 more efficient and productive and receive additional
17 training and better equipment. Our members have the
18 skills and knowledge. They have bachelor's and
19 master's degrees and education and/or Spanish in
20 social work to serve our clients so they can live
21 productive law-abiding lives. Our members are peace
22 officers, we manage caseloads and who are part of a
23 taskforce with other law enforcement agencies such as
24 marshals, drug enforcement, NYPD and among others.
25 We carry firearms, make arrests, execute warrants and
we also prepare reports for cause for sentencing
reasons. We must be designated as uniformed law

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 enforcement members instead of civilians because we
5 perform the same work as NYPD and we face the similar
6 dangers. Recently, let me give you an example. In
7 2022, one of my members was severely injured when she
8 was trying to make an arrest and she's been out for
9 18 months on an assault grant. And this is one of
10 the reasons why we need to be classified as law
11 enforcement. Additionally, we are charged by the
12 city to oversee over 15,000 men, women and youth who
13 have been convicted of crimes and sentenced to
14 probation instead of jail, bail and prison.

15 We are responsible for ensuring that they do not
16 violate the terms of their probation and we work to
17 turn their lives around. This alone saves the city
18 and state considerable costs so they do not return to
19 recidivate. I am concluding.

20 I would like to request that after this hearing
21 that the UPOA can simply arrange meetings with the
22 Committee to present a more in-depth picture and
23 discuss on how we can work together to improve the
24 work of city, of probation officers and supervise and
25 receive appropriate amount of funding so that we
perform our duties efficiently and effectively.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 Most importantly, our salaries must be
5 restructured to reach the pay in five in a half years
6 and must be adjusted in parity with the Peace
7 Officers such as Corrections Police Officers and
8 Sheriffs. I thank you and I apologize.

9 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: No, no worry. Thank
10 you. Just about your request. We can't meet as a
11 Committee in closed doors because of open meetings
12 law but I'm happy to meet with you as the Chair of
13 the Committee to discuss.

14 DALVANIE POWELL: I'll give my card.

15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yes, you can give it to
16 my staff after the hearing.

17 DALVANIE POWELL: Thank you so much.

18 KYLE SIMMONS: Good afternoon Committee Chair. I
19 want to thank you for this opportunity to speak. My
20 name is Kyle Simmons. I have been the President of
21 the New York City Labors Union Local 924 since
22 December 2021. It's an entry level prevailing rate
23 title into the construction industry and you heard
24 from these distinguished panelists in reference to
25 their credentials behind it. Their positions that
they hold. I'm a firm believer it has nothing to do
with credentials, educational backgrounds and things

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 of that nature. It's a systemic pattern to keep
5 people of a certain race and gender economically
6 down.

7 The reason why I come to that conclusion a long
8 time ago, because in my title as an entry level into
9 the prevailing rate, my members come in at \$75,760 a
10 year. It's a labor class title. There is no formal
11 education required, no experience necessary for these
12 positions. The City of New York in the construction
13 industry have approximately 14,000 skilled trades
14 members. So, you can have an understanding what
15 laborers do. You have to look at the hospital
16 setting. The doctors are the skilled tradesmen. The
17 skilled tradesmen are the doctors, the plumbers, the
18 carpenters, the electricians. The laborers are the
19 nurses. We are the support staff that help these
20 individuals. My membership because there is no
21 competitive examination. It's a very appointed
22 position. Each and every one of you all could be
23 appointed to these positions easily. Why is there
24 only 450 laborers, support staff, besides all the
25 duties we know the nurses do, the laborers got other
responsibilities they could do under the prevailing
rates that you also besides that. If you got 14,000

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 skilled tradesmen that is mostly White male and the
5 salaries that you may say that these laborers come in
6 at 75,000, these individuals are making well, close
7 to \$100,000 and more. They make \$10 to \$15 more an
8 hour than the laborer makes. Either they're doing
9 unskilled work and receiving these benefits that
10 they're not supposed to receive for doing unskilled
11 work and they look a certain way and when you only
12 have 450 laborers that are the support group for
13 these individuals, who is doing all the work and what
14 do they look like and it goes beyond that because
15 they're looking at promotional opportunities. When I
16 look at it as a whole, it's giving the individuals
17 the correct titles in the first place based upon the
18 work that they are actually doing. Not what it says
19 on the paper because they may say they're doing
20 janitorial work when in fact, their sisters diploma,
21 the electrician or the carpenter and they're
22 receiving less wages than they are supposed to
23 receive and what do they look like?

24 When you look around at agencies, let's look at
25 the Parks Department. Our union was found there in
1945. To this day, there is not one laborer in
there. Yet they still have the skill trades for

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 working in there. So, who is performing those duties
5 and what do they look like and how much are they
6 being underpaid?

7 Beyond that, it has to do with who is supervising
8 these individuals. As a laborer, I'm fighting these
9 battles right now how they have secretaries of no
10 knowledge of the construction industries, given
11 laborers their responsibilities of work to do. You
12 have police officers giving laborers responsibility
13 to do but in these other trades, they use the right
14 supervision. They're in the right meetings to do
15 their trade. I have in NYCHA, I'm fighting with them
16 right now, out of the 450 laborers that are in my
17 group right now, 250 of them was just hired between
18 2018 and today and the only reason why they are there
19 is because the Federal Monitor had made them hire the
20 support group that is there.

21 In homeless services, they got 20 something
22 laborers in there but not one of them are assisting
23 the 80 skilled tradesmen they have employed in there.
24 So, they're not giving them the opportunity to
25 actually learn the trade. Yes, they're making plenty
of money but when they are assigning them to
janitorial duties like cleaning toilets, people of

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 color we're talking about. They are assigning them
5 to traditional duties that came out of the days when
6 there was slavery and the Jim rules and regulations.
7 They don't see us as working-class individuals no
8 matter how much education you all may have. They
9 will continue to low grade you in a different
10 category when it comes down to the work.

11 These rules have been in place for the longest
12 time and if it wasn't for the Local Law 18 where you
13 all could do your all investigation, they never fixed
14 any of this. Until this day, they still haven't
15 really fixed anything. They come up here and they
16 tell you a lot of stuff and it looks really good on
17 paper but the actual what is being done is not really
18 there.

19 Now, I work for the Department of Environmental
20 Protection Agency and when they was looking to
21 diversify it and give opportunities to individuals
22 and they says oh, we went and we gave tests for the
23 sewer treatment workers, the construction laborers,
24 you know you got to take a test for all of that.
25 Yes, they pay a little bit more than the laborers
make but I says, why never we offer the opportunity
for the city laborers position because you are public

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 utility. You're supposed to be paying prevailing
5 wages for these types of jobs and you hear crickets.
6 There is never a response to, it's a labor class
7 title. It's an appointed position. After one year,
8 you become permanent. No formal education. No
9 experience necessary. It's on the job training.
10 It's an opportunity.

11 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Mr. Simmons, can we ask
12 that you give the Committee - I don't know if you
13 have in writing some of the information that you're
14 sharing with us. We'd love to follow up but we're
15 short on time just because you know we're going over
16 the clock. I'd like to follow up with you on this
17 specific matter and see if we can come to a place
18 where we can reconcile some of what's been going in
19 your industry specifically. I don't know if you have
20 your testimony written. If not, you can submit to us
21 72 hours after the hearing, up until 72 hours after
22 the hearing. So, I'll give you the email address for
23 that and if you could get that to us, I'd also
24 appreciate meeting with you offline. Is that okay?

25 KYLE SIMMONS: That will be fine. I was just
about this hearing and I came -

CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: No, I appreciate it.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 KYLE SIMMONS: And I came in out of the fly you
5 know no written testimony but I can write something
6 up for your Committee to look at.

7 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you. The email
8 address is testimony@council.nyc.gov and we'll give
9 it to you in writing right after this. I do have a
10 question for EMS. What would be the most helpful in
11 aiding workers to break the pattern of low bargaining
12 trends that you referenced in your testimony, in your
13 opinion?

14 MICHAEL GRECO: Well, right now, like I said, we
15 have an EEOC determination that ruled that the FDNY
16 has been discriminatory in their pay practices and
17 treatment of EMS, so instead of having the City of
18 New York - like, I know they're walking out but 1180
19 went through many years of fighting a very similar
20 discrimination lawsuit. It would be helpful if they
21 don't decide to send us to court for the next 15
22 years and actually listen to what the recommendation
23 from EEO was and utilize that as a break from the
24 pattern and also take a look at the [INAUDIBLE
25 02:33:37] and the decision because they went to
arbitration and the arbitrator awarded a higher than

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 pattern because of COVID and because of the medical
5 field.

6 So, I believe after the past 3 years, 4 years,
7 that my members have been you know working literally
8 to death. We have 11 people have committed suicide
9 since COVID. We've had multiple COVID related
10 deaths, so to simply prove that our members showed up
11 during a major pandemic when everybody and I was
12 doing Council hearings from Zoom's and everybody, a
13 lot of people still working from home, our members
14 showed up. So, it's time to you know stop the games.
15 Look at the lawsuit. Look at the decision and come
16 to the table with a significant offer that's above
17 pattern. So, that would be the help.

18 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Chairs, you all have any
19 questions? Okay, so I'm going to ask my staff to get
20 the contact information so that we can have separate
21 meetings offline. I'm looking forward to continuing
22 to dive deeper into the separate issues here.

23 DALVANIE POWELL: I just want to tell you we have
24 EEOC case pending too with the same attorney as 1180
25 and you guys too, so we're going through the same
exact thing.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great, thank you so much
5 and Kiana my staff, will follow. Thank you. Okay,
6 thank you all who came here to share your thoughts
7 and experiences today. If there is anyone in Chamber
8 who wishes to speak but has not yet had an
9 opportunity to do so, please raise your hand and fill
10 out an appearance card with the Sergeant at Arms in
11 the back of the room. Seeing no hands in Chamber, we
12 will now shift to Zoom testimony. Beverly Neufeld,
13 please begin your testimony when the Sergeant at Arms
14 indicates that you may begin.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

16 BEVERLY NEUFELD: Thank you so much. This has
17 really been a fascinating - can you hear me?

18 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yes we can Beverely.

19 BEVERLY NEUFELD: Thank you. This has really
20 been a fascinating hearing and I've sat through the
21 whole thing and I'm really glad I did. So much
22 wonderful information. I want to thank the Committee
23 Chairs for the seriousness of the way you're handling
24 this also DCAS, the data team, CWA, certainly the
25 Mayor's Office of Equity, all important players in
making pay equity happen in New York City.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 I'm Bev Neufeld, Founder and President of Power
5 New York. I think some of you know me. I've been
6 before the Council before, most recently, about the
7 salary transparency bill, which is now law and which
8 we will seek to improve with Intro. 808 later on this
9 year. Local Law 18 put New York City on the map in
10 terms of the fight for gender and racial equity in
11 the United States and with the requirement to
12 evaluate the workforce and to create transparency but
13 the goal was not just to do that. The goal was to
14 fix disparities and once again New York City Council
15 is breaking ground by using the data to address
16 disparities with concrete actions. I congratulate
17 you. I believe the bills that are being introduced
18 will address some of the root causes of the racial
19 and gender discrimination. I've been working on this
20 now for 20 years and I'm really thrilled to see these
21 concrete actions.

22 One of the greatest causes as you recognize is
23 occupational segregation. Council Member De La Rosa,
24 your bill on career development will be very helpful.
25 I will with my testimony, offer another example of
how pathways of equity are being prorated for women
that has been led by the Institute for Women's Policy

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 Research. They looked at actual skillsets and saw
5 how they could be adjusted to better paying jobs.

6 Workplace culture is -

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

8 BEVERLY NEUFELD: Council Member Hudson and I
9 think that is really important. Please do try to get
10 feedback on programs that could be solutions that
11 people will be able to share like childcare and
12 accessibility. Opportunity equity is now considered
13 one of the key issues in the international community
14 to create pay equity, the European Directive is
15 requiring this information and it's considered so
16 important.

17 Please do not under value one piece that was
18 discussed, which is the devaluing of the work that
19 women do. Caregiving work mostly, mostly done by
20 women of color. That's one of the biggest reasons
21 that you pointed out, the huge gap for Black women is
22 because it's almost 100 percent Black women and women
23 of color doing this work. So, there's a way to
24 evaluate it and I want to say that Commissioner
25 Sherman is addressing that through Equal Pay for Work
of Equal Value Analysis and I can only tell you that
will be an important solution.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 Council Member Williams, you mentioned contractor
5 is a huge issue, I hope we can talk more about that.
6 New York City government is a role model for the
7 country but it's a role model for the private sector.
8 We call on the private sector to analyze, address
9 disparities, set goals, close the wage gap. It's
10 exactly what you were doing. You were standing up
11 doing it and we hope that other city's will and the
12 private sector will as well.

13 I will offer you also, in my testimony, a fact
14 sheet that was handed out at a recent event that the
15 Speaker spoke about pay equity and I will share that
16 with you as well. Thank you so much for hearing this
17 and also, really thank you for these important
18 solutions.

19 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much
20 Beverly for your leadership and PowHer for all you've
21 done throughout the years and continue to do to
22 uplift not only women, but all of us here in the
23 city, so we are appreciative.

24 Great, thank you so much. If you are currently
25 on Zoom and wish to speak but not yet had the
26 opportunity to do so, please use the raise hand
27 function and our staff will unmute you. Seeing no

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4 hands, uhm, we're going to conclude. I want to note
5 that every one can submit written testimony to
6 testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72 hours of this
7 hearing.

8 To conclude I would like to first thank our Co-
9 Chairs, Chairs Williams and Louis who have joined me
10 today to express the Council's dedication to
11 improving pay equity in our city's workforce, as well
12 as to all the staff who have helped prepare this
13 hearing. In addition, we would like to take a moment
14 to express thanks to all of our interested advocates,
15 organized labor and everyone who testified and
16 attended today's hearing. Thank you so much for the
17 work that you do and with that, this hearing is now
18 concluded. [GAVEL]

19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 24, 2024