

**Testimony of Commissioner Carlos A. Ortiz
New York City Department of Consumer and Worker Protection**

**Before the Committee on
Consumer & Worker Protection**

Hearing on Street Vending in New York City

December 13, 2023

Introduction

Good afternoon, Chair Velazquez, and members of the Committee on Consumer & Worker Protection. I am Carlos Ortiz, Assistant Commissioner of External Affairs at the Department of Consumer and Worker Protection (DCWP). Thank you for the opportunity to testify today on issues related to street vending.

General Vendors

The Department of Consumer & Worker Protection issues General Vendor licenses to those who sell goods or services in a public place, such as the street or sidewalk. There are currently ~1900 licensed General Vendors. The number of licenses issued to non-veteran general vendors is capped at 853 licenses and the waiting list for non-veteran applicants is currently closed. License applications for General Vendors are available to veterans or the surviving spouses or domestic partners of a veteran.

Introduction 1162 provides amendments to general vendor and mobile food vendor regulations governing display and bookkeeping requirements. The Administration supports this legislation, which was also recommended by the Street Vendor Advisory Board (SVAB) convened pursuant to Local Law 18 of 2021.

Conclusion

Thank you for the opportunity to testify before the committee on issues and legislation supporting some of our smallest small businesses. I welcome any questions you may have for further discussion.

**Testimony of
Ryan Merola, Deputy Commissioner
New York City Department of Sanitation**

**Hearing before the New York City Council
Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection**

**Wednesday, December 13, 2023
1:00 P.M.**

Oversight – Street Vending in NYC

Good morning, Chair Velazquez and members of the Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection. My name is Ryan Merola, and I am the Deputy Commissioner for External Affairs at the Department of Sanitation. Thank you for the opportunity to offer testimony on DSNY's role within the City's vending landscape.

In March, Mayor Adams announced the transition of the Office of Street Vending Enforcement from the Department of Consumer and Worker Protection to DSNY. Legal street vending is a vital part of New York City's economy, and compliance with vending rules is essential to keeping our City clean.

In our capacity as the City's primary enforcement agency for street vending, we focus on the infractions that affect communities the most, things like obstructing sidewalks, curb cuts, and building and subway entrances, leaving equipment and goods out overnight, and creating dirty conditions. This is a compliance-first approach, rather than a license-check-first approach. When infractions are observed, DSNY starts with warnings, which can take a few forms: we post warnings in neighborhoods 24-hours ahead of enforcement, or we directly engage with vendors to explain the infraction we observed.

Once we have warned, our enforcement actions run the gamut from issuing a violation for an infraction to confiscations of vending setups and product. Vending setups and product from general vendors are stored at our facility in East New York and available for retrieval. Any food that DSNY takes is either donated to local food pantries or placed in DSNY composting bins and brought to an organics processing site. We have 30 local food pantries with whom we partner citywide and who have received more than 100,000 pounds of produce since April 1. The food that we cannot donate is processed as organic material.

DSNY's vending enforcement unit is comprised of 40 uniform Sanitation Police Officers that operate citywide daily. Since OSVE's transfer to DSNY on April 1, DSNY has conducted more than 5,000 inspections and issued 1,056 violations.

I would now like to turn to several pieces of the legislation under consideration.

Intro 1060 would prohibit vending or vending-related activity in bicycle lanes. We agree with this legislation.

Intro 1253 would allow street vendors to vend on the sidewalk so long as vendors are within two feet from the curb or within two feet from an obstruction that blocks the curb. DSNY has concerns about the current formulation of the legislation. Today, the City's rules require that vending occur within 18 inches of the curb. The proposed expansion of the City's street vending siting rules, not to two feet from the curb but to two feet beyond an obstruction, presents complications for sidewalk usage. Siting changes must be a part of a larger conversation on how our public space is maintained.

Intro 1264 would remove all criminal misdemeanor penalties from vending enforcement. DSNY does not engage in criminal summons issuance. We only issue civil violations for vending infractions. As Commissioner Tisch stated earlier this year, DSNY will only engage in civil summoning when conducting vending enforcement.

Thank you again for the opportunity to testify, and I am happy to answer any questions.



**NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF
HEALTH AND MENTAL HYGIENE**
Ashwin Vasani, MD, PhD
Commissioner

Testimony

of

Corinne Schiff, JD
Deputy Commissioner of Environmental Health
New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene

before the

New York City Council
Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection

on

Street Vending in NYC

December 13, 2023
New York, NY

Good afternoon Chair Velázquez and members of the Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection. I am Corinne Schiff, Deputy Commissioner for Environmental Health at the New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene. On behalf of Commissioner Dr. Ashwin Vasan, thank you for the opportunity to testify today on the Health Department's oversight of mobile food vending and legislation before the Committee.

The Department's mission is to protect and promote the health of all New Yorkers, including by promoting the safety of food sold from food carts and trucks. We do this by issuing permits to operate a food cart or truck, issuing licenses to the people who vend food, providing mandated training for vendors on food protection, and conducting food safety inspections.

I want to start by providing a brief update on the Department's implementation of Local Law 18, which expanded opportunities for street food vending. Local Law 18 established a new mobile food vending license, called a supervisory license, and a new kind of permit, a supervisory license permit. The mobile food vending license authorizes a person to vend and a permit authorizes a food cart or truck to be used for vending. A food cart or truck with a supervisory license permit must be operated by a person with a supervisory license.

The Department is charged with issuing 445 applications for a supervisory license each year for 10 years as of July 2022. Supervisory license applications are issued to people on waiting lists in accordance with the local law's detailed criteria and prioritization. Vendors on the waiting lists can track their progress on the Department's new lookup tool, available on our website. Once a person has a supervisory license, they are entitled to apply for a supervisory license permit for a food cart or truck at any time; there is no deadline to apply.

We are now in year two of the program, and the Department has issued all 890 supervisory license applications that were required to be released by June 30, 2024. Of those, as of early December, 342 vendors have applied for this license, and the Department has approved all of the applications, issuing 342 supervisory licenses. 108 of the 342 new supervisory license-holders have initiated the supervisory license permit process to obtain authorization for a food cart or truck. The Department has issued 50 of these permits, and the other 58 supervisory license-holders are completing their permitting submissions. The other 234 supervisory license-holders may apply for the supervisory license permit at any time, and we are standing by, waiting for their permit applications.

Since Local Law 18 changed the license and permitting process, the Department has been conducting outreach and education to help vendors understand the new requirements. Before Local Law 18, the cap and waiting lists were for permits, and there was a deadline for a vendor called off the permit waiting list to apply. The Council's new approach under Local Law 18 sets a cap and waiting lists for the new supervisory license, rather than the permit, and there is a deadline for a vendor called off the supervisory license waiting list to apply. Once the vendor has their supervisory license, however, there is no deadline to apply for the supervisory license permit.

Turning to Introduction 1188, which would eliminate the requirement that a person applying for a mobile food vending license have a New York State certificate of taxing authority, limiting that requirement to mobile food vending permittees and supervisory licensees: this proposal will relieve burden on the industry without compromising food safety, and the Department has no concerns with the bill but would like to work with the Council on the effective date.

Thank you for the opportunity to testify. I am happy to take your questions.



**Testimony to the New York City Council City Council
Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection
Oversight: Street Vending in NYC**

Wednesday, December 13th, 2023

Good afternoon. My name is Balanda Joachim, and I am a Campaign Organizer at the Association for Neighborhood and Housing Development, ANHD. I would like to thank Chair Velazquez and the Committee for the opportunity to testify today.

ANHD is one of the City's leading policy, advocacy, and capacity-building organizations. Our membership consists of over 80 neighborhood-based and city-wide nonprofits that have affordable housing or equitable economic development as a key part of their mission. We work with our members to build community power and ensure the right to affordable housing and thriving, equitable neighborhoods for all New Yorkers. ANHD is also a member of United for Small Business New York City, USBnyc, which is a coalition of community organizations fighting to protect small businesses and non-residential tenants from the threat of displacement.

ANHD's members provide technical assistance to small businesses and organize merchants in New York City's communities of color and immigrant communities. We know that in these communities, street vendors—our smallest businesses and most entrepreneurial merchants—are an essential part of the social fabric and offer affordable and culturally relevant foods and goods. In addition, street vendors advance citywide economic growth, provide countless local jobs, and present microbusiness opportunities for immigrants and people of color. Yet the current way the city regulates street vendors often leaves many in the shadows, harassed, unfairly arrested, and unregulated.

The City Council can act now to ensure a functioning regulatory system for vendors by supporting the passage of **Intro 1264 and Intro 1253** with urgency, as part of the Street Vendor Reform legislative package. We also support the passage of **Intros 1060, 1062, and 1188**.

Intro 1264 introduced by Council Member Krishnan, reduces the criminal liability on food and merchandise vending, ensures that our city's smallest businesses face civil, rather than criminal

summonses. No one should be at risk of arrest for being 1 inch too far from the curb, or having a box on the ground, especially in an industry primarily composed of immigrants. Furthermore, it was included as a unanimous recommendation from Mayor Adams' [Street Vendor Advisory Board](#), which included representatives from city agencies, street vendors, retail food stores, property owners, small businesses, and community organizations.

Siting rules and regulations for licensed and permitted vendors are highly regulated, noting the time, place and manner in which vendors must operate. **Intro 1253 introduced by Council Member De La Rosa** continues this tradition, but it addresses a critical safety hazard that vendors face when they are required to have their puscharts too close to the street, placing them very close to speeding cars. This bill allows 2 feet between the vending unit and where the sidewalk abuts the curb.

While not on the agenda today, we look forward to City council addressing the most critical reform to the street vending industry, **Intro 1270**, as soon as we enter the new year. Today, many would-be entrepreneurs are forced to rely on underground markets or work without a license due to the state of our City's street vending system. This bill would ensure business licensing and regulatory compliance of all mobile food and merchandise in order to bring street vending out of the shadows and effectively regulate all vendors. This orderly system would improve the safety of goods sold, increase compliance on our sidewalks, and raise tax and fee revenues for the city during this fiscally difficult time.

Thank you for accepting our testimony today. It is ANHD's hope that the City Council takes the critical step of passing all of the legislation on the agenda today, and ensuring Intro 1270 is on the agenda early next session.

Hello and good afternoon, my name is Maryam Khaldi, and I'm here on behalf of the Arab American Association of New York. AAANY was founded not even a month before the attacks of September 11th, 2001 to respond to the needs of low-income, recent Arab immigrants in NYC. After 9/11, AAANY stepped into an advocacy role, recognizing that the onslaught of surveillance tactics, hate crimes, and community isolation would not be solved by direct services alone.

I want to extend my thanks to the Committee for holding this hearing and giving organizations like AAANY the opportunity to speak to the importance of the Street Vendor Reform package. Like for so many New Yorkers, street vendors are a cherished part of my daily life, and they are vital members of my community. Vendors have made NYC's street food famous across the world, and they deserve to be treated with dignity and respect. Many members of my own Arab American and Arab immigrant community are street vendors. They are beloved in their neighborhoods – and in some cases, they are able to grow their businesses into thriving restaurants.

All street vendors deserve this opportunity. They deserve a functioning regulatory system. They deserve safety and security. This reform package will ensure all that and more. Intro 1264 will reduce criminal liability for street vending and make it safer for all of us. Intro 1253 offers necessary regulatory reform that will address longtime safety hazards for street vendors. We'd also like to highlight the importance of Bill 1270, which would increase the number of food vendor supervisory licenses and general vendor licenses available each year, and look forward to it being on the Agenda in 2024

All the measures in this reform package are critical for our effort to create economic opportunities for immigrants and minority groups all over New York who have long been celebrated for their culinary and cultural contributions to our city – but criminalized or jeopardized for seeking to make a living off of it. This moment calls for transformational change, and the Street Vendor Reform package promises that and more.

Thank you again for your time and consideration.



December 13, 2023

Dear City Council and Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection,

The Belmont Business Improvement District's (BID) mission is to promote and expand the economic wellbeing of the Real Little Italy of The Bronx, a business and cultural hub that has uniquely defined this community for over a century. We pursue an unwavering commitment to maintaining strong connections and local networks of support in Little Italy. Our nonprofit organization is designed to support the flourishing of the commercial district in Belmont, and is therefore strongly opposed to the proposed package of street vending legislation that The New York City Council Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection is reviewing. The bills are very problematic for numerous reasons since they would lift the cap on the number of licenses for both food and general vendors, decriminalize vending and allow pushcarts to set up shop two feet from curbs.

Small businesses make up the fabric of their unique communities, hire a local workforce, and contribute significant taxes and revenue to the city. It's becoming harder and harder to own and operate a business in New York City. Brick-and-mortar businesses are heavily regulated, inspected, and the cost of doing business continues to rise. As small businesses continue to recover from the pandemic, they are still competing with large retailers and online corporations. Adding an influx of street vendors, who aren't subjected to similar overhead costs, and aren't heavily regulated surrounding health and safety and placement, creates an uneven playing field and will negatively impact bottom lines of small businesses, and the chance of their survival. As the NYC BID Association shared, "we do not want a future where countless storefront businesses are closed while tens of thousands of street vendors operate with little enforcement of important rules across the city."

From our on the ground observations, we have seen vendors clog sidewalks and streets, and create unsanitary conditions. Vendor set ups, and/or their personal vehicles, take up essential parking spaces in Belmont (Exhibits 1 & 2, pictured below). Our commercial district engages with several million customers a year, over 80% of whom drive from between 10 and 40 miles away, and bring many millions of dollars in economic activity to the neighborhood and for the city. Access to these blocked parking spaces is critical for our customers, and therefore our ability to do business. Specifically, on Fordham Road, we've seen vendors block the bus lane with their personal vehicles so they have access to additional merchandise for re-stocking purposes at all times. This slows down bus speeds, something the administration has been adamant on improving. Vendors set up by bus stops as bus stops provide a guaranteed customer flow. Adding more vendors will create further congestion in similar areas that are equally important to be kept clear. Furthermore, legislation allowing vending within two feet from the curb will surely impact pedestrian safety and ADA regulations, particularly in neighborhoods with narrow sidewalks, like our Belmont district. The public will be exposed to a real danger if vendors are not following critical placement or health laws. More so, we are concerned the city will not have the resources to manage an increasing

number of vendors over the next five years, let alone an unlimited number of licensees by 2029. Creating a division within the Department of Small Business Services (SBS) focused on helping street vendors seems counterintuitive to their small business support and advocacy services. SBS should focus on helping the small businesses that make neighborhoods thrive. The regulatory agencies that oversee business practices should do the same for street vendors; around public health, public safety, consumer protection, and siting.

As the NYC BID Association expressed, “as we’ve seen with an explosion of unregulated cannabis stores, decriminalization and new licensing efforts with the best of intentions can lead to business enterprises openly flouting various laws to the public’s detriment.” We too fear something similar may happen here if the new vending bills are approved.

80 years ago, Mayor LaGuardia took vendors off streets and relocated them in to City Markets. Today, right here in the Bronx, the Kingsbridge Armory remains vacant. Has this location been considered as a space for vendors? There are likely similar locations in every borough. Wantonly opening up every block and corner in this city for vending is irresponsible. The city has not taken a holistic approach to vendor placement. More so, has the city considered job training resources for vendors? Perhaps this would enable vendors to instead work in brick-and-mortar businesses which would benefit small businesses who are seeking employees, while also decreasing the unemployment rate.

The Belmont BID, and BIDs across the city and nation, work to ensure the success of their storefront businesses and enhancement of their district. We are concerned about any wholesale lifting of the vending cap, the lack of clearer rules, the ability to conduct proper enforcement, and that there are not equal regulations and inspections for vendors as is in place for brick-and-mortar businesses. We do not believe that the bills being proposed will preserve or enhance our community, and will only hurt our small businesses further, diminishing what we as a community have worked to build for over a century.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Peter Madonia", is centered on a white background.

Peter Madonia

Chairman

Belmont Business Improvement District



Exhibits 1 & 2: Vendors have often been observed utilizing parking spaces as if the parking space is theirs as a right of where they operate their “business.” Vendors vehicles parked on East 187th St, and Arthur Avenue in the Bronx.



**Testimony to the New York City Council City Council
Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection
Oversight: Street Vending in NYC**

Wednesday, December 13th, 2023

Good afternoon. My name is Emith, and I am a community organizer at Brandworkers. I would like to thank Chair Velazquez and the Committee for the opportunity to testify today.



Brandworkers supports NYC & NJ local food manufacturing workers to organize their workplaces into strong, worker-led unions. We envision local food manufacturing workers with the tools, training, solidarity; and ultimately, the power necessary to transform their industry & participate in our collective liberation. We believe that street vendors are part of the local food industry and deserve to have the basic rights that small businesses and other brick-and-mortar businesses have.

- ***Economic Contribution:*** The history of street vending in the City of New York showcases its significance in New York City's economy. From contributing to the sale of 15% of produce in 1927 to providing nearly 18,000 jobs in 2015, street vending has played a vital role in the city's growth, supporting immigrants, people of color, and military veterans to successfully operate microbusinesses. Yet the current way the city regulates street vendors often leaves many in the shadows, harassed, unfairly arrested, and unregulated.
- ***Diversity:*** As our City's smallest businesses, street vendors reflect the great diversity of our communities, and are a true embodiment of the entrepreneurial spirit of our city. Innovating, creating, and investing in our local economies, vendors are out every day to provide for their families and feed their neighbors—often targeted and criminalized for doing so.
- ***Need for Regulatory Reform:*** This package of bills will let vendors provide the services New Yorkers want - in a regulated, predictable, enforceable system - and give them a real chance to build wealth in their neighborhoods. The City must not criminalize street

vendors for trying to provide for their families, but instead cut the red tape and facilitate a healthy regulatory environment for our smallest businesses to thrive

The City Council can act now to ensure a functioning regulatory system for vendors by supporting the passage of **Int. 1264 and Intro 1253** with urgency, as part of the Street Vendor Reform legislative package. I also support the passage of **Intros 1060, 1062, and 1188**.

Intro 1264 introduced by Council Member Krishnan, reduces the criminal liability on food and merchandise vending, ensures that our city's smallest businesses face civil, rather than criminal summonses. No one should be at risk of arrest for being 1 inch too far from the curb, or having a box on the ground, especially in an industry comprised of primarily immigrants. Furthermore, it was included as a unanimous recommendation from Mayor Adams' [Street Vendor Advisory Board](#), which included representatives from city agencies, street vendors, retail food stores, property owners, small businesses, and community organizations.

Siting rules and regulations for licensed and permitted vendors are highly regulated, noting the time, place and manner in which vendors must operate. **Intro 1253 introduced by Council Member De La Rosa** continues this tradition, but it addresses a critical safety hazard that vendors face, as it creates a safety hazard which places them a foot and a half or less from the curb - very close to speeding cars, and easily at risk of displacement from longtime vending locations.

While not on the agenda today, we look forward to the City Council addressing the most critical reform to the street vending industry as soon as we enter the new year, as outlined in **Intro 1270**. Today, many would-be entrepreneurs are forced to rely on underground markets or work without a license due to the state of our City's street vending system, taking advantage of workers, customers, and fellow small businesses.

- **REGULATION**: outlines measures to ensure business licensing and regulatory compliance of all mobile food and merchandise in order to maintain an orderly, regulated street vending system while creating economic opportunity for our City's smallest businesses.
- **NATIONWIDE CONTEXT**: would bring street vending out of the shadows, our city would join cities across the US that do not place arbitrary caps on vending, but instead effectively regulate all vendors.
- **FISCAL IMPACT**: will improve the safety of goods sold, increase compliance on our sidewalks, raise tax and fee revenues for the city during this fiscally difficult time.

Thank you for accepting our testimony today. It is [your organization's name] hope that the City Council takes the critical step of passing all of the legislation on the agenda today, and ensuring Intro 1270 is on the agenda early next session.

Emith Escobar from Brandworkers



**Testimony to the New York City Council City Council
Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection
Oversight in support of Ints. 1264, 1253, 1060, 1062, and 1188: Street Vending in NYC**

December 14, 2023

My name is Lamya Agarwala, and I am the Supervising Attorney at the Council on American-Islamic Relations, New York (CAIR-NY). I would like to thank Chair Velazquez and the Committee for the opportunity to provide written testimony.

Street vendors embody the spirit of New York City

CAIR-NY's mission is to protect civil liberties, enhance understanding of Islam, promote justice, and empower Muslim Americans. As our City's smallest businesses, street vendors reflect the great diversity of our communities, and are a true embodiment of the entrepreneurial spirit of our city. Innovating, creating, and investing in our local economies, vendors are out every day to provide for their families and feed their neighbors—often targeted and criminalized for doing so. As of 2018, more than 57 percent of street food vendors in New York City are Muslim.¹

The history of street vending in the City of New York showcases its significance in the local economy. From contributing to the sale of 15% of produce in 1927 to providing nearly 18,000 jobs in 2015, street vending has played a vital role in the city's growth, supporting Muslims, immigrants, people of color, and military veterans to successfully operate microbusinesses. Yet the current way the city regulates street vendors often leaves many in the shadows, harassed, unfairly arrested, and unregulated.

This package of bills will let vendors provide the services New Yorkers want - in a regulated, predictable, enforceable system - and give them a real chance to build wealth in their neighborhoods. The City must not criminalize street vendors for trying to provide for their families, but instead cut the red tape and facilitate a healthy regulatory environment for our smallest businesses to thrive.

Passing introduced bills will protect street vendors and allow them to thrive

¹ [MAP-NYC-Report-Web-3.pdf \(ispu.org\)](#)

The City Council can act now to ensure a functioning regulatory system for vendors by supporting the passage of **Int. 1264 and Intro 1253** with urgency, as part of the Street Vendor Reform legislative package. CAIR-NY also supports the passage of **Intros 1060, 1062, and 1188**.

Intro 1264 introduced by Council Member Krishnan, reduces the criminal liability on food and merchandise vending, ensures that our city's smallest businesses face civil, rather than criminal summonses. No one should be at risk of arrest for being one inch too far from the curb, or having a box on the ground, especially in an industry comprised of primarily immigrants. New Yorkers should not have to risk their freedom just to make an honest living. Furthermore, it was included as a unanimous recommendation from Mayor Adams' [Street Vendor Advisory Board](#), which included representatives from city agencies, street vendors, retail food stores, property owners, small businesses, and community organizations.

Siting rules and regulations for licensed and permitted vendors are highly regulated, noting the time, place and manner in which vendors must operate. **Intro 1253 introduced by Council Member De La Rosa** continues this tradition, but it addresses a critical safety hazard that vendors face, specifically the dangerous proximity of a foot and a half or less from the curb - very close to speeding cars and risk of displacement from longtime vending locations.

We look forward to the City Council addressing the most critical reform to the street vending industry as soon as we enter the new year, as outlined in **Intro 1270**. Today, many would-be entrepreneurs are forced to rely on underground markets or work without a license due to the state of our City's street vending system, taking advantage of workers, customers, and fellow small businesses. The bill outlines measures to ensure business licensing and regulatory compliance of all mobile food and merchandise in order to maintain an orderly, regulated street vending system while creating economic opportunity for our City's smallest businesses.

Passing these bills would not only improve the safety of goods sold, increase compliance, and raise revenue for the City, but it would also bring street vending out of the shadows and into alignment with cities across the United States that effectively regulate all vendors.

Thank you for accepting our testimony. It is CAIR-NY's hope that the City Council takes the critical step of passing all of the legislation on the agenda and ensuring Intro 1270 is on the agenda early next session.

Lamya Agarwala
Supervising Attorney
CAIR-NY



**Testimony to the New York City Council City Council
Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection
Oversight: Street Vending in NYC**

Wednesday, December 13th, 2023

Good afternoon. Thank you Chair Velazquez and the Committee for the opportunity to testify today. My name is Oksana Mironova and I am a Senior Policy Analyst at the Community Service Society of New York. CSS is a 175-year-old non-profit dedicated to fighting poverty and improving the lives of working New Yorkers. During these two centuries, what has also been constant is that as each new wave of immigrants have arrived in our now diverse city, they have resorted to street vending as a means to find a foothold in the city's economic ladder. A 2015 study by the non-partisan Institute for Justice found that street vendors contributed \$71 million in local, state, and federal taxes, and supported over 18,000 jobs. And yet, the way the City administration treats the street vendors not only marginalizes their existence, but also imposes untold hardship on these hardest working small businesses.

Thus, I am here to request that the City Council act now to ensure a functioning regulatory system for vendors by supporting the passage of **Int. 1264 and Intro 1253** with urgency, as part of the Street Vendor Reform legislative package.

Intro 1264 introduced by Council Member Krishnan, reduces the criminal liability on food and merchandise vending, ensures that our city's smallest businesses face civil, rather than criminal summonses. No one should be at risk of arrest for being 1 inch too far from the curb, or having a box on the ground, especially in an industry comprised of primarily immigrants. Furthermore, it was included as a unanimous recommendation from Mayor Adams' [Street Vendor Advisory Board](#), which included representatives from city agencies, street vendors, retail food stores, property owners, small businesses, and community organizations.

Siting rules and regulations for licensed and permitted vendors are highly regulated, noting the time, place and manner in which vendors must operate. **Intro 1253 introduced by Council Member De La Rosa** continues this tradition, but it addresses a critical requirement, that vendors be located 18 inches from the curb, which creates a safety hazard for the vendors, placing them very close to speeding cars, and easily at risk of displacement from longtime vending locations.

In addition, I would also recommend the passage of Intros 1060, 1062, and 1188, all three of which introduce modifications to the administrative code overseeing street vending would make lives easier for our smallest entrepreneurs.

But to effect real change in the street vending industry, the City Council needs to consider deliberating Intro 1270—a bill that would gradually lift the caps on licenses and permits available for vending and thus folding thousands of current vendors into the city and state’s mainstream economy. Today, many would-be entrepreneurs are forced to rely on underground markets or work without a license due to the state of our City’s street vending system, taking advantage of workers, customers, and fellow small businesses. Such a change would allow for better regulation of street vendors while also generating more tax revenue for city and state coffers.

As our City’s smallest businesses, street vendors reflect the great diversity of our communities, and are a true embodiment of the entrepreneurial spirit of our city. Innovating, creating, and investing in our local economies, vendors are out every day to provide for their families and feed their neighbors. Let us take this moment to make it easier for them to succeed.

Thank you again for the opportunity and please reach out to me if you have any further questions.

For questions, please contact Debipriya Chatterjee, Senior Economist at CSS, at dchatterjee@cssny.org.

New York City Council Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection
Wednesday, December 13th, 2023
Oversight Hearing: Street Vending in NYC
Elana Ehrenberg, Design Trust for Public Space

Good afternoon, my name is Elana Ehrenberg, and I'm the Director of Strategic Partnerships at Design Trust for Public Space, a 28 year old non-profit dedicated to enlivening New York City's shared civic spaces to create a vibrant, inclusive, and sustainable city. I would like to thank Chair Velazquez and the Committee for the opportunity to testify today.

Street vendors have been important to the fabric of New York's neighborhoods for a long time. These microbusinesses face challenges in order to operate in our public realm— in particular, caps on general vendor licenses as well as the inevitable waiting lists and black markets that result from these caps. This package of bills will let vendors provide the services New Yorkers want — in a regulated, predictable, enforceable system — and give them a real chance to build wealth in their neighborhoods. The City must not criminalize street vendors for trying to provide for their families, but instead cut the red tape and facilitate a healthy regulatory environment for our smallest businesses to thrive.

The City Council can act now to ensure a functioning regulatory system for vendors by supporting the passage of **Int. 1264 and Intro 1253** with urgency, as part of the Street Vendor Reform legislative package. We are particularly interested in amending siting rules and regulations for licensed and permitted vendors, which are highly policed and inequitably enforced, noting the time, place and manner in which vendors must operate. **Intro 1253 introduced by Council Member De La Rosa** addresses a critical safety hazard that vendors face, as current regulations place them a foot and a half or less from the curb, very close to speeding cars, and easily at risk of displacement from longtime vending locations.

With new rules being developed for our Dining Out NYC program, and the Mayor's City of Yes for Economic Opportunity, we believe there is a missed opportunity to include street vendors in plans addressing small businesses operating in the public realm. In the long term, the City should consider allowing a consortium of permitted vendors to apply to manage "designated vending zones" that promote new and innovative vending practices. The permit should allow for flexible site-planning on sidewalks, streets, and

other public spaces to be managed by this consortium or a community-based organization. Care should be taken to formalize the “natural occurring” markets where vendors congregate but don’t have a CBO or plaza management partner. This type of regulation would bring street vending out of the shadows, our city would join cities across the US that do not place arbitrary caps on vending, but instead effectively regulate all vendors.

Thank you for accepting our testimony today. It is our hope that the City Council takes the critical step of passing all of the legislation on the agenda today, and we look forward to seeing Intro 1270, and other legislation that supports our city’s smallest businesses and entrepreneurs on the agenda early next session.

FOR THE RECORD

SUBJECT: Urgent Matters Regarding Disabled Veterans Street Vendors in NEW YORK CITY

Dear Elected and Unelected Officials and Leaders of City Agencies;

We trust this message finds you in better health than we unfortunately have.

As service-connected Disabled Veterans who operate as street vendors, we have chosen to participate in today's meeting to address issues that have long been overlooked or neglected by city agencies and its lack of sufficient vendor enforcement policies, police and agents knowledgeable in the laws concerning GBS 35a. Today presents a rare and unique opportunity for us to voice our concerns and assert our rights.

Our primary focus is on the well-being of Veterans, particularly mental health, and other challenges we face. We believe that proactive measures can help prevent the alarming rates of suicides among Veterans and Disabled Veterans in particular. We are a group that has selflessly served and sacrificed our body and mind for the country that we all love. Unfortunately, In New York State alone, a disheartening one-third of the homeless population consists of Veterans. Many of these veterans could make a living and become more productive citizens, if the city made it easier for these veterans to work the streets without being in constant fear. Many of us have PTSD and can't tolerate confrontation and intimidation by other types of vendors, police and other enforcement. Some of us can't respond in socially acceptable ways, so we avoid working in contested areas to avoid trouble.

As Disabled Veteran Street vendors, our work on the streets of New York is driven by necessity rather than choice. We find ourselves in this line of work as it is often the only means to support our families. In a previous hearing at the City Hall, we emphasized the difficulty of securing traditional employment due to frequent hospital visits to address injuries sustained



Today, as elected officials, we implore you to communicate to city agencies the imperative to respect the state rights of Disabled Veterans vendors. Discrimination against Veterans must cease, and the sacrifices made for our country should be acknowledged and respected.

Below are some of the many specific issues faced by Disabled Veterans vendors on a daily basis in the streets of NEW YORK CITY:

ISSUE 1. ****Regulation Compliance****: Disabled Veteran vendors are unable to work freely in the streets due to the non-compliance of regulations from other types of Street Vendors. These vendors include, but are not limited to Food, General, 1st amendment and various illegal and unlicensed vendors. While all vendors must adhere to rules, Disabled Veterans are subjected to both city and NY State regulations. We need you to enforce the laws on the books, so that these other types of vendors don't occupy the locations that were given us under GBS 35a.

ISSUE 2. ****Lack of Support from City Agencies****: These other types of Street vendors are issued summonses without clear instructions to abandon and relocate to areas that are approved for them. The nominal fines imposed are insufficient deterrents for these repeat offenders and enforcement is soft on these consistent lawbreakers. We need harsher penalties and stronger deterrents to keep these wrongdoers from constantly stealing our spots.

ISSUE 3. ****Identity Changes and Fingerprinting****: These other types of Street vendors often change identities to avoid penalties by going to their embassies and have their name changed by officials there. They rack up thousands of dollars in fines with one name and reapply for another license with another name. These specific offenders are illegal aliens. So, we need fingerprinting during the application process for DCWP and DOHMM licenses and permits. We encourage mandatory fingerprinting for all vendor license applicants to ensure accountability.

Our demands from NEW YORK CITY elected officials and agencies include:

RESOLUTION 1. ****Direct Contact with NYPD****: Establish a direct line of communication with the NYPD for Disabled veteran street vendors requiring assistance or facing threats.

RESOLUTION 2. ****Direct Contact with DCWP and DOHMH****: Facilitate direct communication with DCWP and the DOHMH, ensuring that agents are familiar with NYS GBS 35a vending laws are also available to assist Disabled Veterans in license renewal and application processes.

RESOLUTION 3. ****Administrative Judge and Special Court for Veterans****: Appoint an Administrative Judge familiar NYS GBL 35a laws from the Office of Administrative Trials and Hearings (OATH). Also establish a special court for Disabled Veterans under the NYS GBS 35a court system to hear our cases. This agency should offer the necessary counseling and guidance for Disabled Veterans who have been unfairly enforced upon; especially those with conditions like PTSD and other mental and physical problems.

RESOLUTION 4. ****Investigation into the Street Vending Project Funding****: Initiate an investigation into the funding of the Street Vending Project, a part of the Urban Justice Center. **THEY DO NOT REPRESENT DISABLED VETERAN VENDORS**. Please ascertain the director's eligibility for holding a DCWP Specialized Yellow License. We have reason to believe that he fraudulently obtained his license and has never served in the armed forces of the United States. This amounts to, no less than, **STOLEN VALOR** and quite possibly prosecutable crimes.

Additionally, we propose allowing Disabled Veterans to regain control of the many unused or underutilized newsstands, possibly converting them into coffee kiosks or other types of small businesses. We want to work collaboratively with the city on this initiative. This not only benefits Disabled Veterans by providing sheltered work opportunities, but also contributes positively to the city's economic landscape.

We sincerely hope for your prompt attention and action on these critical matters.

Sincerely



Disabled veterans of New York ,
Disabled veterans street vendors committee board members :specialized license
holder :

George Singleton (president) 942 - 702 7008
gevsing52@gmail.com

Abdel Jamila (vice president) 917 - 502 8945
adan@14jam@yahoo.com

Tito Valarezo (treasurer) 942 - 702 7008
tita.valarezo@gmail.com

Mike cook (secretary general) 917 - 808 9111
mikecv@gmail.com

Abdel jamila (assistant secretary general)
adan@14jam@yahoo.com

Rabah Belkbir (advisor) 646 - 657 8525
disabledamericanveteran72@gmail.com

Walter Wells (advisor)

Norman Allred (advisor)

Beazer Pitiger (advisor)

James kushner(advisor)

Robert Muhammed (advisor)

Fordham Road Business Improvement District
Testimony before New York City Council Committee on Consumer & Worker Protection
Wednesday, December 13, 2023

Thank you Chairman Velazquez and members of the Committee on Consumer & Worker Protection for the opportunity to submit testimony today.

My name is David Rose and I am the Chairman of the Fordham Road Business Improvement District, the largest commercial corridor in the Bronx, home to over 300 businesses both large and small that have been a part of the Fordham community for generations. The series of vending bills this City Council is proposing is incredibly problematic on numerous fronts, and we strongly oppose this legislation.

Firstly, conducting this hearing during the peak of the holiday season is particularly concerning for many of our businesses, as this period can determine the success or failure of their entire year. The busy nature of this season has made it challenging for our businesses to attend and submit testimony, further limiting their ability to voice their concerns directly to the committee. As a matter of principle, the timing of this hearing is tone deaf at best.

More critically, the new series of bills this City Council is introducing is piling onto the significant flaws of Intro 1116 that the last City Council passed in 2021. These bills would lift the cap on the number of food and general vendors, decriminalize street vending and allow pushcarts to essentially be two feet from the curb. Similar to Intro 1116, these bills lack a clear roadmap for obtaining permits and ensuring compliance with existing rules and regulations.

We are repeating the mistakes of the past by not taking a harder look at where the existing licenses have been allocated and exploring opportunities for vending in food or business deserts that could benefit from such opportunities. Furthermore, the expansion of food vendor licenses, as stipulated in Intro 1116, which added 4,000 new food vendor licenses over a ten-year period, has not been completed and in fact, the roll out of such permits has been slow. Why lift the cap altogether when we haven't even finished implementing Intro 1116?

These proposed bills, akin to Intro 1116, fail to address the bigger picture of enforcement. It is not only about enforcement of vendors on the sidewalks, but also those who set up in bus lanes, obstructing sanitation vehicles, blocking pedestrian pathways, and creating challenges in navigating our business corridor. The legislation should consider larger quality-of-life issues affecting our neighborhood and others as well.

Moreover, the series of legislation adds unnecessary bureaucracy by creating a division within the NYC Department of Small Business Services (SBS) to support street vendors, potentially creating a conflict of interest. Efforts by SBS to engage with the street vendor community through various pilot programs make this division seem redundant and a misuse of taxpayer dollars.

In conclusion, as a representative of over 300 businesses on Fordham Road, operating in New York City is already challenging due to bureaucratic hurdles, rising costs, and numerous quality-of-life challenges. Our businesses are resilient, but they have been through a gauntlet of challenges, from the pandemic and

looting to shoplifting. Additionally, the presence of hundreds of unauthorized vendors packing Fordham streets has had a significant impact on their bottom lines. This impact is especially pronounced when multiple vendors are found selling the same items in front of their stores at a fraction of the cost, for which our businesses diligently pay taxes, insurance, and other regulatory fees.

For these reasons, among many others, we urge the City Council to reconsider these bills to prevent our business corridors from struggling and suffering. Let's learn from past mistakes and find ways for all to coexist together. That is what we asked for three years ago, and it's what we are asking now.

Thank you.

###



New York City Council Committee on Consumer & Worker Protection

RE: Street Vending in NYC

December 13, 2023

Thank you to Committee Chair Council Member Marjorie Velazquez and members of the Committee on Consumer & Worker Protection for holding this hearing, and Council Members Julie Menin, Carmen De La Rosa, Shekar Krishnan, and Gale Brewer, and Public Advocate Jumaane Williams, for your efforts to support New York City's street vendors. I am testifying on behalf of Hot Bread Kitchen, an organization that promotes economic mobility for women and gender-expansive people, immigrants, and people of color through job training and placement, food entrepreneurship programs, and an ecosystem of support in New York City, using our city's vibrant food industry as a catalyst for career growth. Hot Bread Kitchen strongly supports this package of bills that would reform New York City's street vending system, radically shifting the landscape for our city's smallest vendors for the better.

Over the past 15 years, Hot Bread Kitchen has supported over 200 small businesses through our food entrepreneurship program, HBK Incubates, which provides technical assistance and support for underserved entrepreneurs who are working to seed, start, and scale their culinary ventures. Several of our members have started their businesses as street vendors, while most others operate at a similar size and scale—with similar challenges and needs for support. We do this work because we know that business ownership can be a pathway to economic mobility and long-term wealth generation for entrepreneurs and their families, especially if they are newcomers to this country working to establish a life in New York City.

The proposed legislation would provide badly needed regulation and reliability to a system that poses huge challenges for the smallest of NYC's small businesses. Ensuring access to licensing and permits and reducing criminal liability for street vendors would enable these entrepreneurs to sustain and grow their operations, providing them with true pathways to wealth generation. Street vendors will finally have a fairer shot at the fruits of entrepreneurship—without fear of criminalization, fines, or lost revenue—through the combination of increasing access to business licenses, decriminalizing vending, ensuring safer vending locations, and—most aligned with Hot Bread Kitchen's work—providing services for street vendors through the Department of Small Business Services. These bills are badly needed to ensure equitable entrepreneurship opportunities in New York City and would help thousands of small business owners across the five boroughs, including Hot Bread Kitchen members.

Hot Bread Kitchen commends the City Council for these proposed reforms of the street vending system. We hope to see these bills passed and more opportunity for street vendors across New York City.

Azra Samiee
Sr. Director of Small Business Programs
Hot Bread Kitchen



Hudson Square
Business Improvement
District

December 14, 2023

Committee on Consumer and Workers Protection
Oversight – Street Vending

Re: Intro 1253

Board Members

- Jeffrey Sussman, Chair
Edward J. Minskoff Equities Inc.
- Steve Marvin, Secretary
Olmstead Properties
- Clara Anderson
Residential Tenant
- Aldrin Bonilla
The Fund for the City of New York
- Valerie De La Rosa
Community Board 2
- Neha Desai
Hines
- Violet Engel
New York Genome Center
- Amanda Gluck
Stellar Management
- Mathew Graziano
Resident (Owner)
- Brett Greenberg
Jack Resnick & Sons
- Armando Gutierrez
New York Public Radio
- Melle Hock
Edelman
- Christopher Lee
Port Authority of NY & NJ
- Shih Hua Liong
Google
- Kelsey Louie
The Door
- John Maltz
Greiner-Maltz
- Phil Mouquinho
PJ Charlton Restaurant
- Ivo Philbert
Jackie Robinson Museum &
Foundation
- Jackie Renton
Atlas Capital Group
- Sujohn Sarkar
Trinity Real Estate
- Rhonda Singer
GFP Real Estate
- Cass Smith
Cass Calder Smith Architecture +
Interiors
- Adam Steckler
Storage Mart

Elected Officials

- Mayor Eric Adams
- Comptroller Brad Lander
- Borough President Mark D. Levine
- Council Member Erik Bottcher

Samara Karasyk
President & CEO

I am Samara Karasyk, President of the Hudson Square Business Improvement District (HSBID) and am writing to submit written comments on Introduction 1253, which would permit street vendors to vend within two feet from the curb or as close as possible to an obstruction. We are concerned about how this would deteriorate pedestrian safety and accessibility on our local streets and sidewalks.

Since 2009, HSBID has overseen the transformation of Manhattan’s former Printing District into a thriving creative hub. The area we manage is generally bounded by Clarkson in the north, 6th Avenue in the east, Canal Street in the south, and West Street in the west. Our mission is to put Hudson Square on the map by capturing the spirit of innovation that is thriving in the commercial spaces and bringing that energy into the public realm, while promoting social, economic, and environmental sustainability. HSBID’s primary function is to undertake capital and place-making projects that improve the neighborhood’s conditions with respect to pedestrian safety (and sanity), streetscape, and retail (ground-floor) environments.

Unlike other BIDs that focus mostly on sanitation and security, we were founded to implement streetscape improvements to make Hudson Square a place for people instead of cars. To that end, the BID has installed over 500 Hudson Square Standard Trees with enlarged tree pits and permeable pavers, expanded and renovated a 7 block stretch of Hudson Street with wider sidewalks, greening and seating, and created new open spaces at Spring Street Park and Freeman Plazas.

Given this focus, HSBID is concerned about Int. 1253’s proposed changes which would allow for vendors to operate in front of “obstructions.” While the term “obstruction” is undefined, we understand it to include bike racks, planters, bollards, tree pits and other street furniture. This would represent a significant change to our streetscape without consideration of clear path requirements, sidewalk clutter, and the usability of and access to street furniture. We believe that lack of access to street furniture and street vending taking place so close to “obstructions” would have a significant and negative impact on pedestrian mobility. People would have less of a clear path to maneuver around other people and objects, directly impacting their safety. Benches could become inaccessible. Seating amenities are critical for people with mobility challenges who might need a moment to rest while walking along the street. Seating also plays a critical role in creating a welcoming and safe people-focused community. Hudson Square has also seen a significant increase in biking since the pandemic and access to bike racks is critical for our community.

While we value and appreciate the important role that street vendors play in our urban landscape, we hope that key government agencies, BIDs, and other key



Hudson Square
Business Improvement
District

neighborhood stakeholders are consulted before any action is taken. In New York City, there are many actors that need access to our streets and sidewalks, and we must take a comprehensive look at all user needs to balance them appropriately and enhance the urban environment thoughtfully. We look forward to working with our colleagues in government to ensure that our streets continue to be places for all people – where adults and children can walk safely without challenges to their mobility - so that everyone can take advantage of the rich street life that all our wonderful city has to offer.

Hudson Yards Hell's Kitchen Alliance
412 W 42nd Street, 3rd Floor
New York, NY 10036
212-239-1619



December 13, 2023

Re: Written Testimony on Intro 1253

Dear City Council of New York City:

Intro 1253 is a public space power grab masquerading as an unnecessary safety initiative that will prioritize private for-profit interests over pedestrians and street furniture.

Intro 1253 claims to be about safety: *“Currently, the law requires pushcarts to abut the curb, endangering the safety of vendors who must exit their carts onto the street, and potentially, into oncoming traffic.”* However, the Department of Health’s own guidelines already allow vendors a 6-12” buffer from the curb (see page 20 of *“What Mobile Food Vendors Should Know,”* linked below). A cursory tour of NYC streets will show anyone that the city currently allows vendors to set up slightly off the curb. Codifying that existing allowance into law is a reasonable change. However Intro 1253 goes much further.

A 2-foot buffer from the curb and the ability to set up in front of any street furniture would DRAMATICALLY change the streetscape for the worse. Carts would be set up in the middle of the pedestrian flow and block trees, fire hydrants, bike racks, etc. Those two provisions have nothing to do with safety. They are a brazen power grab by private interests that have no regard for public space.

Sidewalks are primarily for walking. Intro 1253 betrays that basic function to benefit for-profit private interests over the public good.

Thank you,

Dan Scorse
VP of Operations
HYHK

Link to DOH’s *“What Mobile Food Vendors Should Know,”*
<chrome-extension://efaidnbmnnnibpcajpcglclefindmkaj/https://www.nyc.gov/assets/doh/downloads/pdf/rii/regulations-for-mobile-food-vendors.pdf>



JEWES FOR RACIAL & ECONOMIC JUSTICE

Testimony to the New York City Council City Council Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection Oversight: Street Vending in NYC

Wednesday, December 13th, 2023

Good afternoon. My name is Josh Bloom. I am a member leader at Jews for Racial & Economic Justice (JFREJ), as well as our liaison to the Street Vendor Justice Coalition. I would like to thank Chair Velazquez and the Committee for the opportunity to testify today.

JFREJ is the home of the Jewish Left in NY. For over 30 years, we have organized alongside our neighbors on behalf of a myriad of issues affecting the city and state of New York, tackling labor disputes, healthcare, immigration, law enforcement, hate crimes, and so much more. We understand that true safety and prosperity come from community and solidarity, and we are rooted in the Bundist principle of *doikayt*, meaning “hereness” — New York is our home, and we organize to make it the best possible version of itself.

And our work with street vendors is part of that. Were they just our neighbors — immigrants, veterans, women trying to earn a living as NYC’s smallest business owners but running up against an intransigent, irrational, and outdated regulation system — we would still support them. We understand the significant contributions they make to our city both economically and culturally. Vending is *good* for New York.

But vendors are also part of our history as Jewish New Yorkers! The modern vending industry traces its roots to Jewish pushcart vendors on the LES around the turn of the 20th century. Recent immigrants from Eastern Europe turned to vending to support themselves and their families because it provided flexibility and freedom in employment — Jews would not have to risk workplace harassment due to religion, they could take off on the Sabbath and schedule their shifts around childcare, they could work immediately before they had finished learning English, and they could provide culturally appropriate goods and meals to their own community. Some of the businesses did so well that they’re still around today as brick-and-mortar chains!

But, just like today, it was not easy for our ancestors to vend. They were buffeted by arbitrary and aggressive policing, complaints about sanitation and competition with shopkeepers, and anti-immigrant rhetoric. The names have changed, but the situation has not. And the best solution is to pass these reforms. This package of bills will let vendors provide the services New

Yorkers want -- in a regulated, predictable, enforceable system -- and give them a real chance to build wealth in their neighborhoods. The City must not criminalize street vendors for trying to provide for their families, but instead cut the red tape and facilitate a healthy regulatory environment for our smallest businesses to thrive

The City Council can act now to ensure a functioning regulatory system for vendors by supporting the passage of **Int. 1264 and Intro 1253** with urgency, as part of the Street Vendor Reform legislative package. I also support the passage of **Intros 1060, 1062, and 1188**.

Intro 1264 introduced by Council Member Krishnan, reduces the criminal liability on food and merchandise vending, ensures that our city's smallest businesses face civil, rather than criminal summonses. No one should be at risk of arrest for being 1 inch too far from the curb, or having a box on the ground, especially in an industry comprised of primarily immigrants. Furthermore, it was included as a unanimous recommendation from Mayor Adams' [Street Vendor Advisory Board](#), which included representatives from city agencies, street vendors, retail food stores, property owners, small businesses, and community organizations.

Siting rules and regulations for licensed and permitted vendors are highly regulated, noting the time, place and manner in which vendors must operate. **Intro 1253 introduced by Council Member De La Rosa** continues this tradition, but it addresses a critical safety hazard that vendors face, as it creates a safety hazard which places them a foot and a half or less from the curb - very close to speeding cars, and easily at risk of displacement from longtime vending locations.

While not on the agenda today, we look forward to the City Council addressing the most critical reform to the street vending industry as soon as we enter the new year, as outlined in **Intro 1270**. Today, many would-be entrepreneurs are forced to rely on underground markets or work without a license due to the state of our City's street vending system, taking advantage of workers, customers, and fellow small businesses. But by eliminating the cap on permits, not only will the City help vendors who will no longer have to pay exorbitant rental fees or risk fines and arrest, the City will help *itself* by funneling all vendors into the regulated system. The economic benefit will be maximized, enforcement expenses will be minimized, and everyone will be on the same page about how to run their business in best accordance with city guidelines. Just like licensing for any other business.

Thank you for accepting our testimony today. It is our hope at JFREJ that the City Council takes the critical step of passing all of the legislation on the agenda today, and ensuring Intro 1270 is on the agenda early next session.

Josh Bloom
Jews for Racial & Economic Justice



MONICA BLUM
PRESIDENT

1881 Broadway, Suite 2R
New York, NY 10023

T 212.581.3774 F 212.581.3563
mblum@lincolnsquarebid.org
www.lincolnsquarebid.org

December 13, 2023

Statement by Monica Blum, President of the Lincoln Square Business Improvement District, to the NYC Council Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection regarding the Oversight of Street Vending in NYC (T2023-4325) and related bills.

Thank you to Council Member Marjorie Velázquez, Chair; Council Members Brewer, Bottcher, Abreu, Menin, and other members of the Consumer & Worker Protection Committee for the opportunity to submit testimony regarding the recent package of bills pertaining to street vending in NYC. My name is Monica Blum and I am the President of the Lincoln Square Business Improvement District (BID). We represent some 250 businesses and not-for-profit and cultural organizations on the Upper West Side of Manhattan. Our district extends from The Shops at Columbus Circle at 58th Street and along Broadway, Columbus Avenue and Amsterdam Avenue up to 70th Street and of course includes Lincoln Center for the Performing Arts. Annually, Lincoln Square draws millions of visitors who, along with residents, employees, commuters, street furniture, and vendors create extremely congested sidewalks in our district. The Columbus Circle subway station is the 7th busiest in New York City. And DOT in its Pedestrian Mobility Study has designated Broadway, the spine of our district, as a Global Corridor – the busiest rating.

Our testimony today focuses primarily on the impact of these bills on the sidewalks. Currently, throughout the course of one day we have on average 26 mobile food vendors -- that number significantly increases during warmer weather and was considerably higher when we had fewer retail vacancies – on the sidewalks within a 10 block stretch in Lincoln Square, primarily on Broadway which is our busiest thoroughfare. Over the years, we have developed good working relationships with most of our vendors. We have worked with our partners at the NYC Departments of Sanitation, Consumer & Worker Protection and Health and Mental Hygiene, as well as the 20th Precinct, to insure that vendors in Lincoln Square comply with the various laws and regulations. Two years ago we did a walk through in our district with DCWP who visited every vendor to explain the rules. The new DSNY enforcement unit, in particular, has been extremely helpful with the vendors particularly at Calabrese and Keegan Plaza at Columbus Circle, which has been a vending hot spot for many years. In addition to working with DSNY's Enforcement Unit, we worked closely with the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, and DCWP to address a handful of vendors whose permits had expired or those who left carts unattended overnight. We recommend that this DSNY Enforcement unit be expanded and educational programs be expanded.

It is our understanding that the package of bills before you today includes recommendations from the “Overview and Recommendations from the Street Vendor Advisory Board” dated May 2022; however, one bill **Int. 1253-2023 that you are considering would permit vendors to be 2 feet from the curb. That was not one of the Advisory Board's recommendations and we are strongly opposed to its passage for many reasons.**

Changing this rule should not be considered without taking into account the current state of affairs in New York City. The Department of Sanitation has issued new regulations that affect all businesses pertaining to setout times of garbage and now requires that all businesses put their waste in large bins which are to be placed at the curb. DOT has issued a Pedestrian Mobility Study rating sidewalk congestion and evaluating the use of sidewalks.

Int. 1253-2023 would permit vendors to be 2 feet from the curb whereas now they must abut the curb. This would result in narrowing our sidewalks, and impacting pedestrian safety in already congested areas. In areas where there are tree grates, planters, city benches, vendors could arguably go in front of these, and clear pedestrian paths would be further reduced. The City just embarked on a massive tree planting effort and vendors would clearly place their carts in front of these new young trees if they were not required to be at the curb. Permitting vendors to be away from the curb makes no sense in light of increased pedestrian traffic on our sidewalks and is in direct conflict with DOT's Clear Pedestrian Mobility plan. Some BIDs, including ours have installed Citibins in the curb in an effort to remove bags off the sidewalks, which is an initiative of great importance to DSNY. These bins must be accessible from the street and from the sidewalk. Surely, we don't want to replace garbage bags with multiple vendor carts. We oppose Int. 1253-2023 and don't think any changes related to distances and clearances should be made. These rules were developed for the safety of pedestrians and to insure walkability in New York City.

We note for the record we are generally opposed to lifting the cap on licenses - Int 1270-2023 - for vendors until a thorough evaluation of regulations and existing conditions are explored with an emphasis on pedestrian safety, accessibility and training of vendors.

Since I last testified on a similar package of legislation in 2019, the retail market in New York has changed dramatically, as tighter margins and e-commerce threaten retail businesses city-wide. In our district alone, the retail vacancy rate has doubled, and pedestrian counts remain down, as businesses close and many have adopted a three-day work week. It is clear that our brick-and-mortar businesses, restaurants and delis face many challenges with new Sanitation rules, constant legislative mandates, and increased competition from vendors, meal delivery services, and e-commerce. Increasing the number of mobile food vendors would increase the burden on our brick-and-mortar businesses who provide valuable goods and services to our communities. We note that most of the new businesses that are opening and doing well are small cafes, bakeries and small specialty food shops.

One of the major shortcomings of the current bills is that there is no mechanism for the siting of vendors, which is something that is critical if the numbers were to increase or if the distance from the curb were to change. Our sidewalks are a precious commodity and are becoming increasingly crowded; they are for public use and not for private use absent appropriate input, stakeholder notification, and agency review. As we all know, often times food vendors set up directly in front of brick and mortar businesses and sell similar food products. In our district, sadly two small businesses, a family owned deli and a Mexican restaurant, were forced to close due to the fact that in one case a truck and in the other a cart stationed themselves directly in front of the businesses.

Until recently, Lincoln Square had a vending “hot spot” at Calabrese and Keegan Plaza (not an official plaza), an incredibly congested sidewalk area at the main entrance to the 7th busiest subway station, Columbus Circle/59th Street, where some 10 vendors competed for limited space daily with bike hawkers, a weed seller, street performers and the general public, including tourists, going to and from Central Park, the Shops at Columbus Circle, Lincoln Center, Mt. Sinai West, John Jay College, and Fordham University, among other places. The NYPD was called frequently to intervene in some pretty violent situations and fighting between vendors.

Thanks to the intervention of the new DSNY Enforcement Unit the situation at Calabrese and Keegan Plaza has improved. The new unit insured that all the vendors at that location were in compliance with the rules, and were close to the curb, and were not blocking busy crosswalks as they had been doing. Calabrese and Keegan Plaza is far less crowded, and crosswalks are no longer blocked and pedestrians can move about safely and still get their drinks and assorted food. Unfortunately, some mobile food vendors remain on the subway grates, but it’s our understanding that only general vendors are prohibited from vending on sidewalk grates, which is another example of the piecemeal nature of these bills.

New York City and our streets and sidewalks have changed dramatically in recent years. There has been a tremendous increase in street furniture, including new and improved bus shelters and newsstands, the addition of wayfinding signage, benches, trash and recycling receptacles, bike share stations, bike racks, bike lanes and the addition of a million trees and Citibins and waste receptacles. And that does not include the new Outdoor Dining program that will be implemented in 2024, which also has clear pedestrian path siting requirements. Home deliveries in residential neighborhoods such as ours bring huge trucks with delivery people trying to cross crowded sidewalks to bring goods to residents, too. And people are eating out less and getting food delivered by bike delivery people who often leave bikes on the sidewalks.

I commend the Council for taking on the issue of street vending in NYC. I have been working on this issue as the head of Lincoln Square for 27 years, and know how complicated this is. However, I do not think that throwing the baby out with the bathwater is the solution. Rules were created for safety reasons and requiring vendors to abut the curb was included to insure pedestrian safety and is essential to insuring pedestrian safety, and accessible pathways, particularly in congested areas. Broadway is defined by DOT as a Global corridor because of heavy pedestrian traffic. In conclusion, we urge you not to pass **Int. 1253-2023** and any other legislation that will change our streetscape forever and not necessarily for the better. Over the years there have been some legislative changes, cherry picking, as it were. We need an expanded enforcement unit, a comprehensive review of current restrictions, a database of all vendors, and a siting plan for all vendors that makes New York City sidewalks a model rather than a chaotic jumble of pedestrian obstacles. One off changes don’t solve the problems. You cannot un-ring the bell. Thank you for your thoughtful consideration of our concerns.



December 13, 2023

**Testimony of Nelson Eusebio
Director of Government Relations
National Supermarket Association**

Before the

New York City City Council Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection

Regarding

Street Vending in NYC Oversight

Good afternoon all — thank you Council Committee Chair Velazquez and the entire Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection for the opportunity to submit testimony today on the proposed bills surrounding street vending in our city. I am Nelson Eusebio, Director of Government Relations of the National Supermarket Association. NSA is a trade association that represents the interests of Hispanic, minority, and immigrant independent supermarket owners in New York and along the East coast. In the five boroughs alone, NSA represents over 400 stores that employ over 15,000 New Yorkers.

Today we would like to focus our testimony on the larger policy ideas being discussed, such as eliminating the cap on street vendors. While we are just beginning to engage in productive dialogue with the sponsor of the bill, we remain incredibly concerned with the current state of affairs that are taking place in regards to vendors on the streets of New York City, in particular, in neighborhoods such as Corona and Fordham Road to name a few.

Many commercial corridors in which vending takes place are already overcrowded and impacting brick-and-mortar businesses with sidewalk congestion and unfair competition. NSA and our members have never seen such poor conditions in our communities as it relates to the landscape of our sidewalks - that is because the existing vending rules are flawed and not sufficiently enforced. This is dangerous for pedestrians, dangerous for consumers and it's unfair to our members who, themselves immigrants, work hard to pay rent, payroll, and all of the other costs associated with brick and mortar, only to be undercut in price by a fruit and vegetable stand propped up right outside of our doors.

It is clear that we are operating in a broken system largely taking place in the outer boroughs and disproportionately impacting minority owned businesses. Much needs to be done to fix it. This will take time and it will be hard work. NSA is willing to put in that work but it's imperative that we have a seat at the table. This is not the case with the existing framework of the Street Vendor Task Force.



We urge the council to correct this framework and add NSA and other minority owned business stakeholders to the task force and we also urge you to put a pause on changing policy without true stakeholder engagement and a clear path forward to achieve common goals. We feel strongly that the solution is NOT simply to eliminate the cap.

Thank you for your attention to this matter and for allowing me to share testimony.



**Testimony to the New York City Council City Council
Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection
Oversight: Street Vending in NYC**

December 13, 2023

Testimony of the New York Immigration Coalition

Good Afternoon. My name is Liza Schwartzwald, Director of Economic Justice and Family Empowerment at the New York Immigration Coalition, an umbrella policy and advocacy organization that works statewide with over 200 immigrant-serving member organizations. Thank you to Chair Velazquez and the members of the City Council for convening this hearing and allowing us the opportunity to testify.

Immigrant entrepreneurs contribute a substantial amount to our local government, investing over \$23.5B in New York State taxes annually. Street vending is one of the small businesses that allows them to do that while also making a real living for themselves. Street vendors reflect the great diversity of our communities, and are a true embodiment of the entrepreneurial spirit of our city. Innovating, creating, and investing in our local economies, vendors are out every day to provide for their families and feed their neighbors—but they are often targeted and criminalized for doing so.

The City Council must act now to ensure a functioning regulatory system for vendors by supporting the passage of Int. 1264 and Intro 1253 with urgency, as part of the Street Vendor Reform legislative package. We also support the passage of Intros 1060, 1062, and 1188.



Intro 1264 introduced by Council Member Krishnan, reduces the criminal liability on food and merchandise vending, ensures that our city's smallest businesses face civil, rather than criminal summonses. No one should be at risk of arrest for being 1 inch too far from the curb, or having a box on the ground, especially in an industry composed of primarily immigrants. This is common sense, which is why it was included as a unanimous recommendation from Mayor Adams' Street Vendor Advisory Board, which included representatives from city agencies, street vendors, retail food stores, property owners, small businesses, and community organizations.

Siting rules and regulations for licensed and permitted vendors are highly regulated, noting the time, place and manner in which vendors must operate. **Intro 1253 introduced by Council Member De La Rosa** continues this tradition, but it addresses a critical safety hazard that vendors face, as it creates a safety hazard which places them a foot and a half or less from the curb - very close to speeding cars, and easily at risk of displacement from longtime vending locations.

While not on the agenda today, we look forward to the City Council addressing the most critical reform to the street vending industry as soon as we enter the new year, as outlined in **Intro 1270**. Today, many would-be entrepreneurs are forced to rely on underground markets or work without a license due to the state of our City's street vending system, taking advantage of workers, customers, and fellow small businesses.



New York City has long prided itself on being a city of vibrancy, diversity, and endless opportunity. This package of bills will let vendors provide the services New Yorkers want - in a regulated, predictable, enforceable system - and give them a real chance to build wealth in their neighborhoods. The City must not criminalize street vendors for trying to provide for their families, but instead cut the red tape and facilitate a healthy regulatory environment for our smallest businesses to thrive.

Thank you for the opportunity to testify.

Submitted by:
Taina B. Wagnac
Sr. Manager of State and Local Policy
New York Immigration Coalition



Regarding Street Vending; Intros 1253 and 1264

Good afternoon. My name is Kathleen Reilly Irwin, and I am the NYC Government Affairs Manager for the New York State Restaurant Association. We are a trade association representing food and beverage establishments in New York City and State. We are the largest hospitality trade association in the State, and we have advocated on behalf of our members for over 80 years.

We would like to take this opportunity to share feedback from the perspective of brick-and-mortar food service establishments, regarding the issue of street vending. First, we recognize that street vendors, like restaurant operators and staff, are hard-working people trying to make a living. We recognize that street vendors, like restaurant operators and staff, often have immigrant backgrounds, and that working with and selling food is a transferrable skill that many people follow to find their first employment in New York City.

Restaurants are subject to regulation by many city agencies, and besides their compliance obligations, they are subject to extremely high rent payments, property taxes, utilities, and the commercial rent tax for those south of 96th street in Manhattan – all expenses related to their fixed location, their right and responsibility to operate in their neighborhoods, keep their sidewalks clean and clear, and serve their communities. Street vendors also certainly have a part to play in feeding and serving their communities. For there to be order, fairness, and navigability in the streetscape, New York City has siting guidelines that regulate where street vendors can be located: only on sidewalks with a 12-foot clear path, more than 20 feet from a building entrance, and more than 10 feet from a crosswalk or subway entry. However, restaurants regularly observe non-compliance with siting guidelines in their communities. Brick-and-mortar restaurants' top priority is proper enforcement of current street vendor regulations.

We see today that several Intros (Intro 1060; Preconsidered Intro 4381) seek to further, reasonably, restrict the areas where street vendors may operate. We agree that bike lanes and certain areas on bridges are inappropriate for vending, and we only ask that enforcement of these newly prohibited zones go hand-in-hand with proactive enforcement and education about areas already restricted for vending.

Intro 1264 would remove misdemeanor penalties for street vending violations. We agree that enforcement should not have to rely upon the threat of criminal consequences. However, it does rely on the necessary funds and staffing to enforce, and appropriate consequences to dissuade flagrant and repeat offenders. If enforcement and education are proactive, and achieve strong compliance results using civil penalties, then misdemeanor penalties should not be necessary. If enforcement is largely not effective, and fines are considered the cost of doing business, then it would be a concern to remove the option for misdemeanor penalties as a last resort.

Intro 1253 would give vendors two feet of space between the curb and their carts to vend. If an

obstruction exists on the sidewalk, it would allow vending as close as possible to the obstruction. The NYS Restaurant Association would ask that clear path requirements for this circumstance be added, to take into account the additional sidewalk space occupied by a vendor standing two feet farther into the walking lane.

Thank you for taking the time to consider our testimony today. We share the priority of creating a fair set of regulations to cultivate vibrant streetscapes and neighborhoods in New York City, and the New York State Restaurant Association looks forward to being a continued partner on this issue moving forward.

Respectfully Submitted,

Kathleen Reilly Irwin

NYC Government Affairs Manager

New York State Restaurant Association

401 New Karner Road

Albany, New York 12205



**Testimony to the New York City Council City Council
Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection
Oversight: Street Vending in NYC**

Wednesday, December 13th, 2023

Good afternoon. My name is Juan Nuñez, and I am the Kingsbridge Armory Organizer at the Northwest Bronx Community & Clergy Coalition. I would like to thank Chair Velazquez and the Committee for the opportunity to testify today.

The Northwest Bronx Community & Clergy Coalition unites diverse people and institutions to fight for racial and economic justice through intergenerational organizing to transform the Bronx and beyond. We've also been organizing for the equitable redevelopment of Kingsbridge Armory for over 26 years and were part of the Together for Kingsbridge Working Group, along with the Street Vendor Project. We have been working closely with the vendors at the Armory, or as we prefer to call them, our city's smallest businesses, to offer support and resources to help them. However, the current way the city regulates street vendors often leaves many in the shadows, harassed, unfairly arrested, and unregulated. This package of bills will let vendors provide the services New Yorkers want - in a regulated, predictable, enforceable system - and give them a real chance to build wealth in their neighborhoods. The City must not criminalize street vendors for trying to provide for their families, but instead cut the red tape and facilitate a healthy regulatory environment for our smallest businesses to thrive.

The City Council can act now to ensure a functioning regulatory system for vendors by supporting the passage of **Int. 1264 and Intro 1253** with urgency, as part of the Street Vendor Reform legislative package. I also support the passage of **Intros 1060, 1062, and 1188**.

Intro 1264 introduced by Council Member Krishnan, reduces the criminal liability on food and merchandise vending, ensures that our city's smallest businesses face civil, rather than criminal summonses. No one should be at risk of arrest for being 1 inch too far from the curb, or having a box on the ground, especially in an industry composed of primarily immigrants. Furthermore, it was included as a unanimous recommendation from Mayor Adams' [Street Vendor Advisory Board](#), which included representatives from city agencies, street vendors, retail food stores, property owners, small businesses, and community organizations.

Siting rules and regulations for licensed and permitted vendors are highly regulated, noting the time, place and manner in which vendors must operate. **Intro 1253 introduced by Council Member De La Rosa** continues this tradition, but it addresses a critical safety hazard that vendors face, as it creates a safety hazard which places them a foot and a half or less from the curb - very close to speeding cars, and easily at risk of displacement from longtime vending locations.

While not on the agenda today, we look forward to the City Council addressing the most critical reform to the street vending industry as soon as we enter the new year, as outlined in **Intro 1270**. Today, many would-be entrepreneurs are forced to rely on underground markets or work without a license due to the state of our City's street vending system, taking advantage of workers, customers, and fellow small businesses. Our vendors deserve to operate their businesses with dignity and respect. Many of the vendors at the Armory live in the community and are simply trying to make ends meet. Some work and are out there trying to make extra money to feed their families, some lost their business and had to move to the streets. Others have been waiting years to get a proper license. [

Thank you for accepting our testimony today. It is the Northwest Bronx Community & Clergy Coalition's hope that the City Council takes the critical step of passing all of the legislation on the agenda today, and ensuring Intro 1270 is on the agenda early next session.

Juan Nuñez NWBCCC



TESTIMONY BEFORE NYC COUNCIL – COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION
Oversight – Street Vending
December 13th, 2023

Chair Velazquez and Members of the New York City Council, my name is Erin Piscopink, and I am a Co-Chair of the NYC BID Association. The Association is comprised of the 76 Business Improvement Districts across the city that are as diverse as the city itself. BIDs are on the frontlines of neighborhood vibrancy, recovery from the pandemic and public realm management. It is therefore critical that BIDs have a seat at the table when making public policy decisions about our streetscape.

We understand that New York City has always had street vendors, small entrepreneurs who are trying to make a living and support their families. The same motivation drives our storefront businesses, including the small shops and restaurants that make our communities unique. As stewards of vibrant neighborhoods, BIDs welcome law-abiding licensed street vendors in their districts. Some have voluntarily added vendors to their boards. However, BIDs cannot stand by while a massive number of unlicensed vendors openly flout placement and other rules meant to protect pedestrians and public health and safety. We welcome commonsense changes to laws that will make it easier for street vendors to make a living, but only in conjunction with the enforcement of siting criteria and other regulations meant to ensure things like clear path for pedestrians and distance from storefront businesses.

BIDs actively participated in the Street Vendor Advisory Board which issued a number of recommendations in the Spring of 2022. This included agreement on several reforms to the vending system that would be helpful to vendors. Several of the bills on the agenda today reflect those recommendations, but some do not. Specifically:

We support Int. 1060 and preconsidered bill 4381 which would prohibit vending on bike lanes and on bridges.

We also support Int. 1062 and 1188 which will provide greater flexibility to street vendors on the display of goods, bookkeeping requirement, and employees.

While we generally support the de-criminalization of street vending, we do want to ensure that agencies have the appropriate tools to enforce siting, health, and other critical regulations. We therefore request further conversation on Int. 1264.

We have significant concerns about Int. 1253, which would allow for vendors to operate in front of “obstructions.” Obstruction is undefined, but we understand it to include bike racks, planters, bollards, and other street furniture. We believe that this significant change without consideration of clear path requirements, visual clutter, and the usability of street furniture would be unwise. We hope that key agencies, BID leaders, and other key stakeholders will be consulted and that the impact of this legislation will be further studied before any action is taken.

While not on the agenda today, we also want to speak briefly on Int. 1270 sponsored by CM Sanchez. This legislation would require the city to make available over 15,000 new vendor licenses over the next 5 years, and then an “unlimited” number after that. We believe this legislation is premature at best. The changes in Local Law 18 of 2021 – which requires a gradual increase in the number of licenses along with increased enforcement and impact studies – have yet to be fully realized. We still need stronger, wholistic siting criteria for vendors as well as true enforcement of the city’s laws and rules regarding vending.

If we don’t put those two things in place, we risk a situation similar to what’s happening with unregulated cannabis dispensaries. When you add new licenses and remove criminal penalties – even with the best of intentions – you risk an explosion of new enterprises that flout city rules with little recourse. Issuing tens of thousands of new licenses without a real economic or land use assessment would be unfair to both existing vendors and brick and mortar businesses. We don’t want a future where tens of thousands of vendors flood our streets while storefront businesses struggle to survive or close.

We look forward to continuing our work with the Council and administration on this important policy discussion. Thank you.



**Testimony to the New York City Council City Council
Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection
Oversight: Street Vending in NYC**

Friday, December 15th, 2023

Good afternoon. My name is Jackson Chabot, and I am the Director of Advocacy and Organizing at Open Plans. Open Plans' mission is to transform how people experience New York City's streets. Street vendors have always been an integral part of our public space ecosystem. In spite of street vendors' role in our city; the street vending regulatory framework has long criminalized and penalized them. Holistic regulatory reform is much needed. This package of bills will let vendors provide the services New Yorkers want - in a regulated, predictable, enforceable system - and give them a real chance to build wealth in their neighborhoods. The City must not criminalize street vendors for trying to provide for their families, but instead cut the red tape and facilitate a healthy regulatory environment for our smallest businesses to thrive.

The City Council can act now to ensure a functioning regulatory system for vendors by supporting the passage of **Int. 1264 and Intro 1253** with urgency, as part of the Street Vendor Reform legislative package. I also support the passage of **Intros 1060, 1062, and 1188**.

Intro 1264 introduced by Council Member Krishnan, reduces the criminal liability on food and merchandise vending, ensures that our city's smallest businesses face civil, rather than criminal summonses. No one should be at risk of arrest for being 1 inch too far from the curb, or having a box on the ground, especially in an industry comprised of primarily immigrants. Furthermore, it was included as a unanimous recommendation from Mayor Adams' [Street Vendor Advisory Board](#), which included representatives from city agencies, street vendors, retail food stores, property owners, small businesses, and community organizations.

Siting rules and regulations for licensed and permitted vendors are highly regulated, noting the time, place and manner in which vendors must operate. **Intro 1253 introduced by Council Member De La Rosa** continues this tradition, but it addresses a critical safety hazard that vendors face, as it creates a safety hazard which places them a foot and a half or less from the curb - very close to speeding cars, and easily at risk of displacement from longtime vending locations.

While not on the agenda today, we look forward to the City Council addressing the most critical reform to the street vending industry as soon as we enter the new year, as outlined in **Intro 1270**. Today, many would-be entrepreneurs are forced to rely on underground markets or work without a license due to the state of our City's street vending system, taking advantage of workers,

customers, and fellow small businesses. We need a system that outlines measures to ensure business licensing and regulatory compliance of all mobile food and merchandise in order to maintain an orderly, regulated street vending system while creating economic opportunity for our City's smallest businesses.

Thank you for accepting our testimony today. It is Open Plans hope that the City Council takes the critical step of passing all of the legislation on the agenda today, and ensuring Intro 1270 is on the agenda early next session.

Best,

Jackson Chabot
Director of Advocacy and Organizing
Open Plans

City Council Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection
“Oversight: Street Vending in NYC”
Wednesday, December 13th at 1 PM, in person & via Zoom
Riders Alliance Testimony

Good afternoon. I'm Mayra Aldas, i'm the Lead Organizer at Riders Alliance. Thank you, Chair Velazquez, and the Committee for this opportunity.

Our organization is proud to be part of the Street Vendor Justice Coalition. Today, I'm here to stress the critical importance of street vendor rights, an issue close to my heart and integral to our coalition efforts.

Street vending has a rich history in New York City, contributing significantly to our economy. From supporting immigrants to providing jobs for people of color and military veterans, it's a cornerstone of microbusinesses. However, the current regulatory landscape leaves many vendors in the shadows, facing harassment and unfair arrests.

Street vendors, as the smallest businesses, mirror the diversity of our communities. They embody the entrepreneurial spirit, innovating and investing in local economies. Yet, they face unjust targeting and criminalization.

The proposed legislative package, including Int. 1264 and Intro 1253, is crucial. Int. 1264, introduced by Council Member Krishnan, reduces criminal liability on vendors, aligning with unanimous recommendations from Mayor Adams' Street Vendor Advisory Board. Intro 1253, presented by Council Member De La Rosa, addresses safety hazards and maintains regulated siting rules.

Looking ahead, we urge the City Council to prioritize Intro 1270 in the new year, a critical reform for the street vending industry.

This legislation isn't just about New York City. It's about nationwide progress, bringing street vending out of the shadows and ensuring a well-organized system. Moreover, it will positively impact safety, compliance, and revenue generation during challenging fiscal times.

In conclusion, on behalf of Riders Alliance, we urge the City Council to pass all legislation on today's agenda, prioritizing Intro 1270 in the upcoming session. Thank you for your attention and commitment to fostering a thriving and equitable street vendor environment.

Mayra Aldas-Deckert
Riders Alliance

TAKEROOT JUSTICE

Testimony Before the New York City Council Consumer and Worker Protection

Oversight: Street Vending in NYC

December 15, 2023

The Equitable Neighborhoods practice of TakeRoot Justice is pleased to present this testimony to the Committees in support of the campaign for equitable vending conditions led by our partners at the Street Vendor Project.

TakeRoot works with grassroots groups, neighborhood organizations and community coalitions to help make sure that people of color, immigrants, and other low-income residents who have built our city are not pushed out in the name of “progress.”

We believe that vibrant street life, access to economic opportunity and food/retail at affordable prices for New Yorkers of every income level are crucial to equitable neighborhoods; thus, we echo the vendor demand for a rational, decriminalized approach to regulating vending on NYC streets. As our City’s smallest businesses, street vendors reflect the great diversity of our communities, and are a true embodiment of the entrepreneurial spirit of our city. Innovating, creating, and investing in our local economies, vendors are out every day to provide for their families and feed their neighbors—often targeted and criminalized for doing so.

This package of bills will let vendors provide the services New Yorkers want - in a regulated, predictable, enforceable system - and give them a real chance to build wealth in their neighborhoods. The City must not criminalize street vendors for trying to provide for their families, but instead cut the red tape and facilitate a healthy regulatory environment for our smallest businesses to thrive

The City Council can act now to ensure a functioning regulatory system for vendors by supporting the passage of **Int. 1264 and Intro 1253** with urgency, as part of the Street Vendor Reform legislative package. I also support the passage of **Intros 1060, 1062, and 1188**.

Intro 1264 introduced by Council Member Krishnan, reduces the criminal liability on food and merchandise vending, ensures that our city’s smallest businesses face civil, rather than criminal summonses. No one should be at risk of arrest for being 1 inch too far from the curb, or having a box on the ground, especially in an industry comprised of primarily immigrants.

Furthermore, it was included as a unanimous recommendation from Mayor Adams' [Street Vendor Advisory Board](#), which included representatives from city agencies, street vendors, retail food stores, property owners, small businesses, and community organizations.

Siting rules and regulations for licensed and permitted vendors are highly regulated, noting the time, place and manner in which vendors must operate. **Intro 1253 introduced by Council Member De La Rosa** continues this tradition, but it addresses a critical safety hazard that vendors face, as it creates a safety hazard which places them a foot and a half or less from the curb - very close to speeding cars, and easily at risk of displacement from longtime vending locations.

While not on the agenda today, we look forward to the City Council addressing the most critical reform to the street vending industry as soon as we enter the new year – reforming the vendor permitting system as outlined in **Intro 1270**. That bill outlines measures to ensure business licensing and regulatory compliance of all mobile food and merchandise in order to maintain an orderly, regulated street vending system while creating economic opportunity for our City's smallest businesses.

Today, many would-be entrepreneurs are forced to rely on underground markets or work without a license due to the state of our City's street vending system, taking advantage of workers, customers, and fellow small businesses.

Thank you for accepting our testimony into the record and considering it carefully. It is TakeRoot's hope that the City Council takes the critical step of passing all of the legislation on the agenda today, and ensuring Intro 1270 is on the agenda early next session.

Paula Z. Segal
Senior Staff Attorney
Equitable Neighborhoods Practice
TakeRoot Justice
123 William Street, #401/4th Floor
New York NY 10038
psegal@takerootjustice.org
p: (646) 459-3067
takerootjustice.org
@TakeRootNYC

Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection: Oversight Hearing on Street Vending
STATEMENT OF THE BROADWAY LEAGUE OPPOSING Intros 1253 and 1654

The League has been the principal trade association for the commercial Broadway theatre industry in New York State and across North America for over 90 years. Today we represent more than 700 theatre owners, producers and road presenters nationwide – with over 400 maintaining offices in New York City. We express our gratitude to Chair Velazquez and other distinguished members of the Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection for the opportunity to comment on the proposals under consideration. The League also thanks Council Member Bottcher for his continued support and leadership on issues affecting the businesses, residents and visitors to Times Square.

The Broadway League takes no position on Intros 1060 (prohibiting vending or vendor-related activity in bicycle lanes), 1062 (vendor display and storage of goods, etc.) or 1188 (requirement of food vendors to obtain a certificate of authority to collect sales tax). However, **we oppose Intros 1253 (related to permitting street vendors to vend within two feet from the curb) and 1264 (repealing the misdemeanor criminal penalties for general vendors and mobile food vendors)**. We believe these proposals would add to the congestion in midtown and heighten the significant enforcement challenges facing the City.

During the 2018-to-2019 theatre season, the last year for which we have complete economic data, the Broadway industry contributed a record \$14.7 billion to the economy of New York City and supported 96,900 jobs. This season (2022-to-2023), the industry garnered 12.3 million admissions, 16.8% shy of the record-breaking season pre-COVID. Approximately 35% of attendees were people from the New York City metropolitan area, 47.5% were theatregoers from the US but outside New York City and its suburbs, while 17% (or 2.1 million admissions) were visitors from other countries. 95% of attendees reported plans to see another Broadway show in the future. It is crucial to the future of New York that the theatergoing experience - from the moment a patron arrives in Times Square to his or her departure - is positive.

Times Square is the hub of the Broadway theater district and a major cultural venue in Midtown Manhattan. The pedestrian intersection has one of the highest annual attendance rates of any tourist attraction in the world, estimated at 60 million pedestrians annually. The designation of Broadway (between 42nd and 47th Streets) as an outdoor plaza has only increased vehicular and pedestrian traffic and attracted a greater number of street performers, costumed characters and vendors.

As noted, Times Square is already one of New York's most traffic-infused neighborhoods. Navigating midtown is a significant burden and an array of side-walk activity regularly drives pedestrians into the streets, diverting attention from storefronts and generates enormous amounts of trash. The area has also seen a recent proliferation of crime around recently opened marijuana stores, as well as an increase in loitering due to migrant housing in the community.

Allowing vending carts to sit two feet from the curb, using precious real estate, reduces available space for vehicles and pedestrians and contributes to overcrowding and disorder in the neighborhood. Further, City resources are already overtaxed. NYPD, FDNY and other agencies work tirelessly to enforce existing laws and ensure public safety. Eliminating all misdemeanor criminal penalties for general vendors and mobile food vendors sends the public message that the City does not take such offenses seriously and therefore invites flagrant violation of the law. For the above reasons, we wish to note that The Broadway League would also oppose any legislation that might increase or eliminate the cap on city-wide vending permits, unless any such newly issued permits were specific to locations outside of the Midtown Core.

Thank you again for this opportunity. On behalf of the Broadway theatre community, the League applauds the Council's ongoing dedication to addressing these concerns in a fair and balanced manner.



**NYC Consumer and Worker Protection Committee
Hearing on Street Vendor Legislation
Dec 13, 2023**

Good afternoon, and thank you to Chair Velazquez and the Committee members for holding this hearing on the street vending bills being heard today. Transportation Alternatives advocates for safe, equitable, and vibrant streets across the five boroughs.

Street vendors are part of the lifeblood of New York City, providing tens of thousands of jobs and microbusinesses, and supporting immigrants, people of color, and military veterans. They work every day in New York's public spaces as an essential part of the fabric of neighborhoods and streetscapes across each borough.

Current regulations, however, are inadequate in providing proper guidance to vendors, and this package of bills will address many of the current injustices and allow vendors to conduct business within a framework that is regulated, predictable, and enforceable. The City must not criminalize street vendors for trying to provide for their families, but instead cut the red tape and facilitate a healthy regulatory environment for our smallest businesses to thrive.

As part of the Street Vendor Reform package, we call on the Council to support and pass **Int. 1264 and Intro 1253** before the end of the year.. With Intro 1264, which reduces the criminal liability on food and merchandise vending, ensures that our city's smallest businesses face civil, rather than criminal summonses. Intro 1253 addresses the safety hazard of placing street vendors extremely close to the curb. We also support the passage of **Intros 1060, 1062, and 1188**, and call on the Council to take up **Intro 1270** early next session.

Thank you for your time and consideration of these bills.



Street
Vendor
Project

**NYC City Council Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection
December 13, 2023**

Testimony of Matthew Shapiro, Esq.
Legal Director, Street Vendor Project at the Urban Justice Center

My name is Matthew Shapiro and I am the legal director of the Street Vendor Project at the Urban Justice Center. The Street Vendor Project (SVP) is a membership-based organization of over 2,000 street vendors who work in NYC's public spaces. We organize vendors to have their voices heard when it comes to policies that affect them as well as provide legal and small business services to maintain and grow their businesses.

I am pleased that many of the bills being discussed today will start to correct the double-standard that has long existed in regards to the regulation of street vendors compared with other small businesses. Vendors have long been subject to burdensome laws and rules that don't apply to other similar businesses such as restaurants and storefronts.

For example, we strongly support Intro 1062, which would repeal the requirement that vendors produce their records of daily sales, purchases, and expenses. Other businesses are not subject to such a requirement and there is no reason that vendors should either. Intro 1062 also repeals confusing language about general vendor stands and clarifies that general vendors can use umbrellas to protect themselves from the sun and rain. This recognizes the realities of working outside throughout the year. Finally, Intro 1062 amends 17-315(c) of the NYC Administrative Code to allow vendors to store items "on" (in addition to inside and under) their carts. The original intent of this law was to ensure that vendors do not occupy excessive sidewalk space and this bill will ensure that.

Intro 1188, which we also strongly support, requires only vendors who apply for a Permit or Supervisory License obtain a Sales Tax Certificate of Authority and Tax Clearance Certificate. Currently, there are many vendors who get a mobile food vending license, not to own their own business, but to work for or with someone else on a food cart or truck. These vendors are not business owners, but rather workers who have nothing to do with sales tax payments for the business. However, they are still required to obtain a sales tax certificate as a business owner. These vendors currently have to report their sales tax every three months (by putting \$0) and can be subject to fines and penalties if they forget or are late.

Intro 1188 also needs to amend NYC Administrative Code 17-310 to also ensure that only vendors who renew a permit or Supervisory License (that is, business owners), are required to provide a Sales Tax Clearance before renewal. Finally, It should be noted that even restaurant owners are not required to show a sales tax clearance prior to renewing their Health Department food permit. Vendors, for some

reason, are, but this bill can go a long way in reducing the burden for many vendors who don't own the actual business.

SVP supports the intent of Intro 1060 in that vendors should not be obstructing bike lanes. In fact, DOT already has a rule, 34 RCNY 4-08(e)(9) which prohibits vehicles from obstructing bike lanes. Since this law already would apply to a food truck, we are concerned that vendors could be fined twice for the same activity. This already happens with other vending laws. For example, unlicensed food vending is prohibited by the Administrative Code and the Health Code. The Health Department frequently writes unlicensed vendors two separate tickets, each for a \$1000 and each for the same reason. This is simply unfair. Intro 1060 should ensure that vendors are not fined twice for the same thing at the same time.

We also support the intent of T2023-4381 to regulate vending on City bridges. As you know the DOT recently proposed a rule to ban vendors from bridges which will completely destroy the livelihoods of vendors who have been selling food and merchandise to residents and tourists on the Brooklyn Bridge. We acknowledge that more rules and enforcement may be needed to ensure that pedestrians have safe passage and vendors can continue to exist. However, we have some concerns with how the bill is currently drafted. The language first prohibits vending on bridges, but then allows vending when there is a 16 foot clear path. The bill should be amended to clarify that vendors are affirmatively allowed to vend on paths that meet with width requirement.

Also, the proposal to require 20 feet between each vendor is problematic because there is no real way for this to be enforced. For example, if there is 15 feet between two vendors, how will the enforcement agents know which vendor is responsible? In 1978, a similar law requiring space between vendors on a normal sidewalk was struck down by the Courts as being unconstitutionally vague since it doesn't indicate which vendor would be in violation and how enforcement agents could determine who is liable. See *People v. Christian* 96 Misc. 2d 1109.

In order to make sure vending on the bridges is done in an orderly manner, the City should increase enforcement of the existing siting laws. The congestion on the Brooklyn Bridge is due to vendors taking more than the allowable space. Enforcement should ensure that general vendors occupy no more than 8 feet by 3 feet of space to allow enough space for people to walk.

We are looking forward to working with the Council on all of these bills to make sure there is safe and viable street vending in New York City.



Good afternoon. My name is Mohamed Attia, I'm the managing director of the Street Vendor Project at the Urban Justice Center. I would like to thank Chair Velazquez and the Committee for the opportunity to testify today.

The street vendor project, SVP, is a member-led organization with 2,900 street vendor members. We organize with the vendor community; we advocate for a fair and just system for them and we provide essential services that the community desperately needs.

For centuries street vending has been a platform for thousands of New Yorkers, immigrants, people of color, military veterans and entrepreneurs who are seeking a chance for upward economic mobility for themselves and their families. However, for decades they've been dealing with an unfair system, unjust laws and arbitrary rules.

The bills before you today are essential to move us forward towards a fair system, where vendors are not treated as criminals, and to a place where they're not fined for minor nonsense impossible-to-follow rules.

Starting with intro 1264, to reduce the criminal liability on street vending violations, it's a bill that we believe is important to make sure we're treating vendors as small businesses, not as criminals. As a former food vendor myself, I received several criminal tickets and visited the midtown community criminal court for violations such as being few inches closer to the crosswalk than I'm supposed to be, or for not having my licenses warn.

Also, intro 1253 will create safer space for vendors to be close to the curb of the sidewalk and ensure pedestrian access while staying safe in our public space.

And we can't discuss street vending without highlighting the fact that we're dealing with an outdated system that prevents vendors for accessing licenses or permits. Decades ago, the city placed caps on the number of licenses and permits that are required for vendors to operate their businesses. The cap on merchandise vending licenses is set to 853 licenses, one of the most arbitrary numbers we ever heard of.

To give you an example of what that cap means, going off the rate of how these licenses are circulated and how the waiting list is moving, the person who's at the end of the waitlist, (Jamshed Taj) who placed their name on it back in 2016, they're likely going to have a chance to receive a license in 70 years from now. by the end of this century!

Not sure if they'll be alive by then, but likely their grandchildren will receive this letter from DCWP!

The city has tremendously failed in regulating street vending and supporting the smallest business community, and sadly the vendors community are paying for that failure. On one hand, the city isn't offering licenses to vendors, and on the other hand the enforcement officers are fining the vendors for not having that same license that the city is denying the vendors to receive.

The vendors are the victims of dealing with outdated laws, and arbitrary caps and rules that are barring them from formalizing their businesses.

A thorough reform of the vending industry is overdue in our city, and now we have a chance to act and move forward legislations to address the elephant in the room that so many people are too shy to talk about.

I want to thank CM Sanchez and Farias for introducing intro **1270**, and we're looking forward to having a hearing on it in the near future.

Thanks

Mohamed Attia
Mattia@urbanjustice.org



TESTIMONY OF VOLUNTEERS OF LEGAL SERVICE
New York City Council Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection
Oversight: Street Vending in NYC
December 13, 2023

Good afternoon. My name is Annie Xie and I am a Staff Attorney with the Microenterprise Project at Volunteers of Legal Service (VOLS). VOLS is a legal services nonprofit founded in 1984. Our mission is to bridge the justice gap in underserved communities through increased pro bono legal services. For over 20 years, the VOLS Microenterprise Project has helped existing and aspiring small business owners and entrepreneurs access high-quality free legal services from our dedicated staff and our network of pro bono attorneys. VOLS helps small business owners with transactional small business legal needs, including entity formation, drafting and reviewing contracts, and understanding industry-specific regulations. We partner with community and economic development organizations to connect with clients who would benefit from our legal assistance, focusing on minority-, women-, immigrant-, and veteran-owned businesses.

For many New Yorkers, entrepreneurship is an effective path out of poverty and into financial stability and independence. Entrepreneurship takes many forms, including street vending, which provides crucial economic opportunities particularly for immigrants, minorities, and veterans. The repeal of misdemeanor criminal penalties for food and merchandise vending will help ensure that street vendors do not face the threat or fear of arrest as they seek to provide for themselves, their families, and their communities.

At VOLS, we hear from all types of entrepreneurs, including street vendors, about the challenges of navigating what seems like a regulatory maze. These difficulties are often compounded by language barriers. In our work we recently learned about a licensed fruit vendor



who had hundreds of dollars of produce thrown out by the Department of Sanitation, which issued two violations that the fruit vendor could not understand, in part because they had limited English proficiency. Another food vendor, a Black, U.S. Navy veteran on Social Security, recently approached VOLS in frustration because his food cart permit decal was stolen, and he could not access any information on what to do next. He filed a police report but received two tickets for operating without a permit. These examples highlight the hurdles that street vendors encounter in addition to potentially facing criminal penalties.

Beyond considering the decriminalization of street vending, we believe that expanding access to licensing, as outlined in Intro 1270, will allow street vendors to formalize and grow their businesses under a fair regulatory system. This way, street vendors would no longer have to choose between operating without a permit or renting a permit from an existing permit-holder in the underground market (either by going into severe debt or exhausting their life savings). Intro 1270 also calls for the training that is part of the food vendor licensing process to include information on the particular vending restrictions of prospective license holders. It is immensely valuable for entrepreneurs to know what restrictions apply to their specific business. We also want to highlight that it is critically important that this information be made language accessible.

Street vendors reflect the city's diversity and embody the city's entrepreneurial spirit. Street vendors are among the smallest of New York City's small businesses, and yet they form an essential part of our communities and our local economies. Thank you for accepting our testimony and for supporting the needs of New York City's street vendor entrepreneurs.

**AFFINITY REALTY, LLC
320 NASSAU BOULEVARD
GARDEN CITY, NEW YORK 11530**

December 8, 2023

New York City Council

Dear City Council Members,

My name is Agostino Vona and I am an owner of the property known as and located at 625 Wortman Ave, Brooklyn, New York (the "Premises"). The premises is located directly across the street from where Aqua Duck Flea Market formerly operated at 612 Wortman Avenue, Brooklyn, New York. I purchased the building in November of 2022 and have retained Green Holland Management, to market the Premises for lease in the spring of 2023.

During the course of the last several months, we have had numerous prospective tenants and brokers tour the property. However, all of the prospective tenants immediately dismissed the building as a potential fit for them because of the many illegal street vendors surrounding the building. The reasons they cite are as follows: obstruction of loading docks, obstruction of access points to the building, mounds of improperly disposed trash on the streets, vehicles and trailers with no license plates parked along the street next to the building which all create unimaginable congestion in an industrial zone meant for companies to conduct their business.

The aforementioned issues will undoubtedly prevent any business from operating and conducting commerce out of the Premises. We have been supporting and carrying the building empty now for over a year, while staying current with our mortgage and the real estate taxes. I kindly ask for your help and urge you to assist in eliminating these vendors from the streets (Wortman Ave, Logan St., Milford St.) surrounding the Premises so that I can lease my building and start to receive income on the property. Not only does the current condition affect our Premises it is a blemish to the community and its members.

Should you have any further questions, I would be happy to speak with you. I can be reached at 516-507-2827

Sincerely,



Agostino Vona

Good Day My name is Anisa Wagner I am the sole owner of Catch It Seafood Box located in district 9 of the village of Harlem. I am a recently joined proud member of the Street Vendors Project. I wanna thank the panel of city council members and council woman Velazquez for opening the floor to our concerns. We at this time are asking to be handled with dignity and respect. I have been in business since 2017 paying sales tax to the city and state as required. I have acquired every permit documentation (sales tax certificate) food handling permit temporary vending permit available to me. The unavailability of access to full licensure to run my business properly is insane. Which forces vendors that want to be law abiding vendors / business owners to fall in to the hands of NYPD and their handlings. Many times to receive harsh treatment. Hear our voices loud and clear and allow our small businesses to build the opportunities to excel. The vast majority of street food vendors are following healthier cleaner protocols than most brick and mortar food entities. My customers constantly express how they much prefer purchasing food that is prepared in front of them as appose to the rodent infested brick and mortar establishments. This method of black market underground permit acquisition is absurdly ridiculous. There should be more policing from the appropriate agencies put in place to regulate and criminalize those actions. Many of those license holders have met their American dream and are back home in their native countries living their best lives. All while still collecting thousands that turns into millions of our tax paying American dollars. This is clearly unfair. I'm born, raised and educated right here in NYC. Why can't I sell my gourmet food selections in my community to the masses? They appreciate me. I'd also like to acquire a permit to vend fresh uncooked options as well. Which will then enable me to offer SNAP recipients items. PLEASE allow street vendors to preform a prosperous totally LEGAL way of life. Revise and revamp the system. There are so many ways to allow EVERYONE the opportunity to grow!!

Appreciate your time as we wait patiently for results that benefit street vendors.

Thank you
Anisa Wagner

My name is Ibra Diagne; firstly, thank you Chair Velazquez and the Committee for giving me the opportunity to testify today. I want to start by saying that I have been a vendor in Lower Manhattan for fifteen years. I live in Harlem and work in lower Manhattan since I first migrated to the United States back in October 2005. I am part of a very low-income family that relies on me to survive. I have a wife and 8 children. My youngest being 17 years old who is still in school and relies on his dad for his education, food, and stability. My dream is to get my own general vendor license, so that I can work without fear. In fact, I have been on the waitlist for 6 years to get my own license.

My number is 7642 on the waitlist. There are over 7,000 fellow New Yorkers before me, who have the same dream. And even though I am trying to do everything right, get my own license, and run my own business -I have been arrested many times just for being a vendor. I want to be clear, even though we are so often stereotyped, I have not once sold illicit or counterfeit merchandise. I have been arrested for not having the very license I am on a waitlist to get!!

Each time my merchandise is confiscated, I lose money, and it makes it harder to support my family. Why did I choose to be a vendor? Because I am old, I am not strong enough to do many jobs. So, when the choice is vending, or being homeless, I choose to work. I pay my taxes; I contribute to the United States economy.

I am hoping that the Intro 1264, which will eliminate criminal penalties for food and general vendors passes because we vendors are worried about how it would impact our immigration status. I am currently looking for an immigration attorney, and I am concerned that when I want to change my status, this may come back to bother me. I fervently hope that this bill is passed so that arrests can end, and people will not be detained any longer.

Rather than criminalizing street vendors for attempting to support their families, the city should reduce red tape and create a regulatory climate that is conducive to the growth of our smallest enterprises. I hope that this licensing issue will be settled quickly since we as vendors will not deal with it. My children hearing that their dad is incarcerated is not what I desire. I do not want to hurt their education and life.

Thank you and I pray for your support of this bill and saving millions of families around the country.

Hello. Thank you for providing this space to testify before you this afternoon. My name is Jennifer Salgado, a proud Bronxite and the lead organizer at The Street Vendor Project (SVP). SVP is a member-led organization with more than 2,900 members who are working to create a vendor led movement for permanent change. Although, I am here to voice my overall support for all the bills presented today, I am here to speak on the absolute need to move forward Intro #1264, a bill sponsored by council member Shekar Krishnan that will decriminalize street vending across the city.

Over the past 2 years I have been working with vendors in Fordham Rd up in the Bronx, where folks have been the victims of constant harassment from the local precinct. Many of these vendors have received criminal tickets which force them to go to criminal court simply for not having a license or a permit. I come to this work not only because I believe in social justice but because I draw from my own experience as the daughter of a former street vendor. When my mother arrived to this country 30 years ago there weren't many avenues she could pursue to secure a job and sustain my sisters and I so she turned to street vending, as her father in Mexico had taught her. Being a street vendor granted her the agency to be her own boss and therefore be more available and present for us, her children. In 2014, on Valentine's Day, she along with other vendors – guess where? If you guessed Fordham rd. you're right. She and the other vendors present were harassed by the local precinct and later arrested. Her crime? Selling flowers and bears without a license. She and other mothers sat in a cold cell for 24 hrs before seeing a judge until they were finally released. This is what outdated laws do to hard working mothers.

I want us to take a second to recognize that this incident happened almost 10 years ago, and we are still seeing the criminalization of vendors today in the same neighborhoods. It's our hope that City Council takes actionable steps that moves legislative reform forward, like that found in the Street Vendor Reform Package, so that vendors like those in Fordham and throughout the city can operate their business like any other business. It's time to reform the street vending industry and to put an end to the system that has and continues to criminalize valued community members and would-be entrepreneurs. It is the responsibility of the city to act, to effectively regulate this industry, and create good jobs for New Yorkers. As ~~this~~ this city's legislators have the power to make history for vendors by moving forward legislation like Intro #1253, #1264, #1268 and #1270. Thank you for your time.

FOR THE RECORD
FOR THE RECORD
FOR THE RECORD

Hello, and thanks to the Organizing Committee

"I thank Chairman Velazquez and the Committee for the opportunity to testify today"

I am Jiang Hongbo living in Elmhurst, selling my favorite natural plant products such as American ginseng, Astragalus, Angelica and tea in Flushing. My child is in high school and I am a member of the street vendor project.

As part of a legislative plan to reform street vendors, the City Council can now take action to ensure the proper functioning of the vendor regulatory system by urgently supporting the passage of Int. 1264 and Intro 1253.

I set up a stall in Flushing to work and survive, because I was often arrested by the police for setting up a stall, and I lived in fear and dread every day. I wanted to run away whenever I saw the police, for fear of being arrested, having my goods confiscated, and being fined.

Often hiding, I feel worse than a thief.

Because the human body is small and weak, unable to work for life, and no funds to do better projects. There is also a high school child at home, life is very stressful, just want to be able to freely support themselves and their children through street vendor work.

It is important for me to get a job as a street vendor so that I can support myself and my children by selling, and if I am caught selling or banned from selling, I may lose my income, be displaced, and have my food, clothing, and shelter disrupted.

I look forward to the City Council addressing the most critical reform issues for the street vending industry as soon as we enter the new year, as outlined in Brief No. 1270. Today, many potential entrepreneurs are forced to rely on vending systems on the streets of our cities, working in underground markets or without papers, taking advantage of workers, customers and other small businesses.

Some street vendors have started businesses by setting up stalls and have now successfully set up shop.

I also want to become a street vendor to get the freedom and dignity to survive, to get the opportunity to start a business through street vendors, to help my children successfully complete their studies and fulfill their dreams through street vendors.

I would like to thank the organizing committee and President Velazquez for giving me the opportunity to testify today and accepting my testimony. Thank you!

Good afternoon Councilmember Velasquez and councilmembers here present, my name is Juana Encarnacion, I am an ice cream and arepa vendor.

I am here along with my colleagues, to ask that you don't take away the bread from our childrens' hands. The current legislation is unjust and full of persecution, our greatest sin is not having working papers to access another job.

As a mother, as a head of household, it is increasingly difficult for me to support my children. In addition to the dangers of working outside on the street, now we have to hide from the police and sanitation because we do not have permits or licenses.

I would like that as an act of justice for you to approve this package of laws that will alleviate our burden, thank you.

Buenas tardes Concejal Velasquez y a la comisión aquí presente, mi nombre es Juana Encarnación, soy vendedora de helados, arepa, avena.

Estoy aquí al igual que mis compañeros, para pedir que no se nos arrebatte el pan de nuestros hijos, la actual legislación es injusta y llena de persecución, nuestro mayor pecado es no tener papeles para acceder a otro trabajo.

Como madre de familia cada vez me cuesta más llevar el sustento a mis hijos, a parte de los peligros de la calle ahora tenemos que

escondernos de la policía y sanitation por qué no tenemos permisos ni licencia.

Quisiera que como un acto de justicia ustedes nos aprueben este paquete de leyes que alivianan nuestra carga gracias.

612 Wortman Avenue LLC

c/o GTJ REIT, Inc.
1399 Franklin Avenue, Suite 100
Garden City, NY 11530

December 11, 2023

Dear Speaker Adams and New York City Council Member:

I am the President of GTJ REIT, Inc., the owner of a property located at 612 Wortman Avenue, Brooklyn, New York. We have been deeply invested in the community and a neighborhood property owner and employer for over 80 years.

I write to ask for your help regarding illegal and dangerous business being conducted on the city sidewalks around our property and adjacent properties that has negatively impacted the health and safety of those in our community and has made it more difficult for school buses to get New York City children to school safely and on time.

Unlicensed, illegal street vendors have seized the sidewalks around our property and are conducting what is essentially an illegal flea market on city sidewalks. It is our understanding that a particularly enterprising person is taking advantage of the situation and even charging the illegal vendors to use the city sidewalks.

The unlicensed, illegal vendors are blocking the sidewalks and forcing pedestrians out into heavily trafficked streets. This is a disaster waiting to happen. Garbage trucks, MTA Buses, School Buses, Tractor Trailers and other large, heavy commercial vehicles commonly operate on the roads adjoining the sidewalks. Additionally, vendors are illegally preparing, cooking and selling food, without the appropriate food handler's permits or health and safety safeguards.

Our Tenant located at 612 Wortman Avenue provides school bus services to NYC public school students and is frightened for the safety of their drivers and the pedestrians that have been forced into the street. The need to navigate around both the illegal sidewalk vendors and the pedestrians in the streets has delayed the school bus drivers from getting kids to school on time and has unnecessarily delayed the bus drivers from getting home after work.

I could go on for pages regarding the negative impact that the illegal vendors have had on the community, but I wanted to keep this letter to a single page as I know how busy the Council is. We have numerous photographs of the illegal vendor activity on Wortman Avenue and Logan Street. Should you have any questions, I would be happy to speak with you and I can be reached at 516-693-5500.

Sincerely,



Louis Sheinker

Good afternoon. My name is Mame Niang, and I am the West African organizer at the street vendor project. Thank you, Chair Velazquez and the committee for the opportunity to testify today. Street Vendor Project is a non-profit organization that advocates for street vendors around NYC. We teach them the rules and regulations, conduct outreach every week to ensure they are up to date with new information on vending, and ensure they are safe while they are at their stand.

Street vendor rights are essential to me because I have family members who are street vendors. My biological sister is an unlicensed merchandise vendor in lower Manhattan. She has been a vendor since 2000. Vending is all she knows; she has been arrested for not having a license. I remember about 2 years ago, she was arrested, and the judge asked her to pay a bond of \$2,500 and to also do community service. At that time, she didn't have money because she lost all her merchandise that she bought the day before. So, my mom had to send her some money from Africa so that she could be released from jail.

I started to be interested in vending in 2022 when I first had a summer internship at the street vendor project. I started meeting West African vendors with so many stories to share and went through a lot just for being a vendor. I met some business owners who went bankrupt and decided to vend near their old location to keep their customers. I also met some who were old and had so many people who relied on them, and I met with those who were undocumented and couldn't do any other job except vending. I want to emphasize that these people who has contributed to the U.S. economy by paying their taxes yearly and making NYC successful. I am without a doubt that NYC will be lonely and desperate without these wonderful street vendors.

As the West African organizer, I know the African community is going through hard times just for being a vendor. I met so many vendors complaining about businesses being slow and getting criminal tickets all the time just for not having a license that they have been on the waitlist for so many years.

Rather than criminalizing street vendors for attempting to support their families, the city should reduce red tape and create a regulatory climate conducive to our smallest enterprises' growth. Please make passing 1264 a top priority so vendors can operate safely, and be treated like the small businesses they are, not criminalized or in fear of arrest.

Please help street vendors feed their families without fear of being arrested. We need street vendors just like they need us.

Thank you.

December 13, 2023

Oversight: Street Vending in NYC

Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection

Thank you Chair Velazquez and the Committee for the opportunity to testify today. My name is Selasi Margarito Lopez, I am a general merchandise vendor and a member of the Street Vendor Project. Currently, I work on the Brooklyn Bridge selling souvenirs, hats and keychains etc. Today I'd like to support two bills that will regulate the general vending system which are Intro 1264 and 1253, part of the Street Vendor Reform legislative package. I also want to express support for the City Council member Ms. Gale Brewer's idea to allow vending on Bridges (T2023).

After getting out of the military and becoming a general merchandise vendor, it made me realize not everybody has the privilege and opportunity to make a living in a suit. I realize that life has a different path, and as a general merchandise vendor, it became a path I took along with others that I believe deserve the chance to live the American dream, for the mere fact that they're not robbing, begging, stealing, the only crime being committed is making life as a vendor.

And while not on today's agenda, we look forward to the City Council addressing the most critical reform to the street vending industry as soon as we enter the new year, as outlined in Intro 1270. Today, many would-be entrepreneurs are forced to rely on underground markets or work without a license due to the state of our city's street vending system, taking advantage of workers, customers, and fellow small business.



December 11, 2023

Dear Honorable members of the City Council of New York,

I am here today to address a matter of profound significance to the cultural and communal fabric of New York City—a matter that has, for far too long, been subjected to undue threat and over-criminalization. Community members seeking to make an honest living have regrettably faced disruptions due to restrictive measures on street vending.

In the collective imagination of our city, the iconic imagery of Halal carts, fruit stands, and hotdog vendors stands as a testament to the vibrancy and diversity that defines New York. Whether it be a tourist savoring the delights of our renowned street food or a Council member enjoying a morning coffee en route to today's proceedings, these businesses contribute immeasurably to the vitality and cultural richness of our metropolis.

It is incumbent upon us to ensure that those who bring life and culture to our city through their entrepreneurial spirit are treated with the utmost fairness and equity. The challenges faced by street vendors, including the confiscation of their means of livelihood, necessitate a reevaluation of the existing regulations governing their trade.

Today, I stand before you not only to draw attention to the challenges faced by these dedicated business owners but also to express my sincere congratulations and unequivocal support for the introduction of the bills currently under consideration. These legislative initiatives mark a pivotal step toward fostering a more just and supportive environment for street vendors in our beloved city.

In recognizing the integral role played by these entrepreneurs in shaping the identity of New York City, we affirm our commitment to a fair and equitable society. Let us collectively work towards preserving the vibrancy of our streets, ensuring that the pursuit of honest work is met with respect, protection, and opportunities for growth.

Thank you for your time and consideration.

Sincerely,

Joel Feliciano
Chief Operating Officer
Yemeni American Merchants Association

To those individuals who must make difficult decisions and pass legislation that is fair to all parties and treats all parties equal and demands the same compliance requirements of each.

My name, title nor occupation is important.

I have managed more than a few properties on East and West Fordham Road for 24 years, have managed these properties from my office in the district and have seen first hand the damage done to brick and mortar stores when illegal vending persists near their stores (where they are prohibited 6 days a week by law) and comply with none of the rules and regulations that the stores must comply with.

My short and sad tale is about one of several such stores, built, owned and operated by immigrants. I knew this immigrant family for close to 15 years. They operated this fruit and vegetable store for many years providing for their family and putting their children to school. When it was time for the older generation to earn money for their retirement, the store was driven out of business by illegal vendors on THEIR sidewalk. Not just one vendor but more than a few. The vendors who were not licensed nor insured nor complied any of the rules that the stores did, sold their goods at lower prices because of the money they saved by not being in compliance and incurring the costs that a store did. They didn't follow the rules but the store did. The store was the real victim here. Not the unlicensed vendor who even with a license would not be able to vend on Fordham Road 6 days a week.

If street vendors are considered small businesses then they should be subject to the same rules and regulations as all other small businesses. They should have licenses, they should be legal in the location they do business, they should maintain general liability insurance, workers compensation insurance, disability insurance, file all city, state and federal income and sales tax forms, pay monetary penalties when they are not in compliance, etc.

The victim here is not the street vendor.

The victim here is the street vendor that is considered a small business but is not required to follow the same rules as any other small business.

The sad tale ends by the family giving back the keys because they could not compete with street vendors feet from their store with no enforcement of the law (ie removal).

I do not know what happened to this family as I lost touch with them.

Their story would be just as sad as the vendors who tell sad tales of being harassed by police when they are breaking the law.

Thank you for considering the issues and passing legislation that does not give street vendors a handicap at the expense of law abiding small businesses, many of which are immigrant families just as street vendors are.

Lastly, when I hear some refer to street vendors and the heart and soul of our community, how are they the heart and soul of Fordham Road if they live an hour or two away but come to Fordham to steal business from stores?

To Whom it may concern,

My name is Edgar Telesford. I am a father, a husband, and a proud street vendor. I've been vending now for the past five years. I wasn't always a street vendor. I was trained as a teacher. I have a BS in biology with a minor in chemistry. And a Masters in Management. I was in the elite Teaching Fellows Program with NYC Dep of Education, and I was working on my second Masters in science education at Teachers College at Columbia University when a freak accident happened to me on the job 06/06/2014.

When the dust settled I landed in the hospital with a broken tibia and fibula. I spent 5 days in the hospital and several months in a wheel chair, walker, crutches, and endured months of agonizing physical therapy.

However, six weeks following my injury while on medical leave, I was fired from the DOE. My record was blemished by NYC DOE. All sources of income and health coverage vanished. If not for family and friends, I don't know what, or where I would be. After my long recovery, I was ready to work, but still no school would hire me. I was 12 months behind in rent. And was facing eviction. It was then that I had to swallow my pride and hit the streets.

I knew very little about street vending.

It was the community of vendors who embraced me. They gave me suggestions on where to buy, what to sell, when to sell, and where to sell. I began selling bottled water on W125th. I became known as the "Waterman." And regained my dignity, self respect, and pride. The things that NYC stripped me of I recovered in the streets as a vendor.

The street vendor community is made up of some of the warmest, most giving people that I have ever met. They are men and women who are mothers and fathers, sons and daughters, grand mothers and grandfathers. They are

a group of some of the most ethical people with the highest degree of integrity that I've ever met.

Street vending and the vending community has helped me to keep my head above water. We need vending licenses so that we are not continually vilified and harassed by city agencies. Moreover, it will remove the constant fear of having our merchandise confiscated. Street vending is what made Woolworths and the other business owners along the Bowery and Delancey Street. In many instances it was and is the genesis many small, to medium size businesses.

Our uniqueness is our differential advantage to the business district .Our products are unique and cannot be found in the large department stores. These unique businesses accounts for a large part of the foot traffic in many business districts. In Harlem, we are the fabric of the community and the business corridor in particular. Busloads of visitors come from all over the world to see what unique gifts they can take back to their homelands, or sometimes just to take pictures with the vendors.

There is nothing unique about a Starbucks, CVS, Burlington, McDonalds, Target, or TJMax. From Alabama to Alaska, or from California to the Carolinas, they are all the same. If you see one, you've seen them all. But creative artwork, out of print books, unique scented oils, creative tee-shirts, colorful hand woven cloths from all over the world, what could be more unique than that.

I plead for the vendors and myself, for the City to grant more license to the street vendors. Covid has left us in shambles. And the aid that was given to many large business owners, never trickled down to the street vending community. I am often asked would I return to teaching if given an opportunity. As much as I loved teaching and making a difference in the lives of others, due to age

discrimination, I don't believe that New York City will hire me.

The beauty about street vending is that it is a profession that does not discriminate. There are no age, language, race, gender or special abilities needed. It is one of the very few places where the market is pure and has very little outside manipulations. Please grant us our wish to become compliant and grant us our licenses. The City that once prevented me from earning a living to survive, is now preventing me from creating a life.

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: CARINA KANG

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12-13-2023

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: AMY OCLWA

Address: [REDACTED] Whitney Ave

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/2023

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: EMILY LAM

Address: [REDACTED] 251 ST Bellerose

I represent: mandarin

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: JULIEN YAN

Address: [REDACTED] 239th Queens

I represent: Mandarin

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Mi Jin Fang

Address: [REDACTED]

I represent: Flushing

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 1264 Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: YUN LIN

Address: Mandarin

I represent: _____

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Spanish

Appearance Card

[]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 126 Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Narcis

Address: [redacted]

I represent: Vendedores Ambulantes

Address: 111 44 Street

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Spanish

Appearance Card

[]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 126/123 Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/23

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Lucia Maldonado

Address: _____

I represent: Self

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Arabic

Appearance Card

[]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 126/123 Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12-13-23

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: AHMED Mounad

Address: [redacted] Livingston AVE

I represent: me

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 1264/253 Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Nova Felder

Address: [Redacted]

I represent: Masala Titled Holam 10 45/SVP

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Spanish

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 126h Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Jorge

Address: [Redacted] 50 AVE

I represent: Vendedores en los barrios

Address: 111 41 st

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Spanish

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 126h Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Adelaida Simon

Address: [Redacted] West 6th street

I represent: SVP

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Spanish

Appearance Card

[]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 1264 Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Priscilla

Address: [redacted] 50 AVE

I represent: vendoboo ambulante

Address: 11 41 st

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Mandarin Translation

Appearance Card

[]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: He Fang

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

[]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 1264/1253 Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12-13-78

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Nazih Atia

Address: _____

I represent: Street Vendor Project

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

Name: Shuang hui wei (PLEASE PRINT) chinese

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Spanish

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/23

Name: F. R. Ramirez (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: _____

I represent: ISVP's Vendors de Corona

Address: Queens Hwy 11368

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

english

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

Name: MICHAEL PHILLIPS (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 12531266 Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: 12-13-73

Name: Ahmed Abdelgafar (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: _____

I represent: Street Vendor Project

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: _____

Name: Spanish (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

SPANISH
I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: 12-13-73

Name: Spanish (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 126h Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/23

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Selma Rodriguez

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 126h Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/23

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: @lealilde Suarez

Address: [REDACTED] Ericsson St

I represent: Street Vendor Project

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 126h Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/23

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Ruth Palacios

Address: [REDACTED] 159th Street [REDACTED] Jamaica NY 11433

I represent: SVP

Address: 40 Rector Street

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 1766 1753 Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12-13-23

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Yolanda Lopez

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/23

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Johana Encarnacion

Address: Weschester Ave.

I represent: SVP

Address: 40 Recker Street 9th floor

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/2023

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Mame Niang

Address: I 141 St

I represent: Street Vendor Project

Address: 40 Recker St

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Balanda Joachim

Address: 50 Brod St

I represent: ANHD/SVP

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/23

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Mohammed Haque

Address: 100 St Ozone Park

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/23

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Guadalupe Sosa

Address: E 116th Street

I represent: Street + Vendor Project

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Al Kim 1/17

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Jiang Li Xie

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Guilia

Address: [redacted] 97th street

I represent: Spanish Interpreter

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Kelly

Address: [redacted] 17th St Corona NY

I represent: Spanish Interpreter

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Rosa Barulina

Address: [redacted] 12 AV

I represent: SVP Español

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Sandra Ramon

Address: [redacted] 95 ST

I represent: Traduccion Español

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

*Spanish
Interp.
Nicks

Appearance Card

[]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/2022

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: CARLA de Jesus Rodriguez

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

[]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Anthony Brown

Address: [redacted] 202ST

I represent: Disabled VETS

Address: BROOKLYN BRIDGE

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

[]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: ALVIN WRIGHT

Address: 6425 BROADWAY BRONX, NY

I represent: Disabled VETERAN VENDORS

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: IRENE

Address: [REDACTED] 97th street

I represent: spanish

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Armenio Garcia

Address: [REDACTED] Jelicho Ave

I represent: SVP

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12-13-2024

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Patricia Viquez

Address: [REDACTED] 124th St College Point

I represent: NY 11356

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

[]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/23

Name: Anisa Wagner (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: _____

I represent: Catch It Seafood Box

Address: 2332 Adair Clayton Powell Blvd NY NY

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

[]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/23

Name: Erin Piscopink (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: _____

I represent: BID Association

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

[]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

Name: _____ (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12-13-2003

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Tyasha M'Call

Address: [redacted] pent mt Bx W-1 10447

I represent: vendor power

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Licente Belmonte

Address: [redacted] Grand Concourse

I represent: SVT

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: MARIAA-CASTILLO

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____



Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms



**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Ryan Merola

Address: Commissioner of Vending, DSUV

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Wenlong Li

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Carlos Ortiz A C for External

Address: Affairs

I represent: _____

Address: _____



Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms



**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/23

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Matthew Shapiro

Address: 40 Rector St 9FL NY 10008

I represent: Street Vendor Project

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. A11 Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: DEC 13/2023

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: DAN ROSSI

Address: [REDACTED] Spotters NY BX NY 10474

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 1264 Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/2023

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: ANNIE XIE

Address: 40 WORTH ST SUITE 329 NEW YORK
10013

I represent: VOLUNTEERS OF LEGAL SERVICE

Address: 40 WORTH ST SUITE 329 NEW YORK
10013

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12/13/23

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Klara Diagne

Address: [redacted] W 116th St

I represent: SVP

Address: 40 Rector St

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 1264 Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12-13-23

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Mohamed Attia

Address: _____

I represent: street vendor project

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 1264 Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 12-13-23

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Mohamed Awad

Address: _____

I represent: street vendor project

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 1266 Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: 12-13-73

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Calvin Baker

Address: _____

I represent: Street Vendor Project

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 1266 Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: 12-13-73

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Lia chun shan

Address: _____

I represent: Street Vendor Project - 73

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 1266 Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: 12-13-73

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: CECILIA AD

Address: _____

I represent: Street Vendor Project

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 1264 Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Jonathan Salgado

Address: _____

I represent: The Street Vendor Project

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Nikaly Solano

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Loticia Amorewo

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

◆ Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms ◆

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Michael Meyer

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: M.D. Rahman

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms