

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

----- X

December 20, 2023  
Start: 11:43 a.m.  
Recess: 12:09 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Kamillah Hanks, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Joann Ariola  
Erik D. Bottcher  
Justin L. Brannan  
Tiffany Cabán  
Carmen N. De La Rosa  
Robert F. Holden  
Rita C. Joseph  
Althea V. Stevens

OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS ATTENDING:

Jumaane Williams, Public Advocate  
Shahana Hanif  
Alexa Avilés  
Linda Lee  
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers  
Oswald Feliz

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning and  
3 welcome to today's New York City Council hearing for  
4 the Committee on Public Safety.

5 Please silence all cell phone and  
6 electronic devices.

7 Chair, we're ready to begin.

8 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.  
9 Good morning. I apologize I'm not on screen but I'm  
10 under the weather.

11 I am Council Member Kamillah Hanks, and  
12 I'm the Chair on the Committee of Public Safety. I am  
13 joined by Council Members Holden, Ariola, De La Rosa,  
14 Caban, Stevens, Brannan, Botcher, and Joseph.

15 Today, this Committee will vote on a  
16 package of bills that aim to increase public  
17 transparency regarding NYPD operations, and I believe  
18 addressing these issues are essential to increasing  
19 public safety, confidence, and the trust in NYPD and  
20 law enforcement. My top priority is ensuring that all  
21 citizens feel safe and recognizing the fundamental  
22 role that NYPD plays in achieving this objective.  
23 While the call for transparency is undeniable, it is  
24 equally crucial to reckon with the potential  
25 consequences of police operations and community

2 relationships, but I assert that a collaborative and  
3 thoughtful approach is indispensable to strike that  
4 balance that ensures transparency while preserving  
5 the efficiency of law enforcement and fostering  
6 positive community relations.

7           The well-being and safety of our citizens  
8 demand a comprehensive solution that navigates the  
9 complexities of transparency and effective policing,  
10 and I believe that these bills seek to do that. The  
11 bills being voted on today are as follows: Proposed  
12 Introduction number 538-A sponsored by Council Member  
13 Hudson in relation to requiring the NYPD to report on  
14 instances in which an individual denied an officer  
15 consent to a search, Proposed Introduction number  
16 585-A sponsored by the Public Advocate Jumaane  
17 Williams in relation to providing NYPD body-worn  
18 camera footage to the Department of Investigation,  
19 Proposed Introduction number 586-A, sponsored by the  
20 Public Advocate Jumaane Williams in relation to  
21 requiring the NYPD to report on police civilian  
22 investigative encounters, Proposed Introduction  
23 number 638-A sponsored by Council Member Stevens in  
24 relation to reporting on the use of large donations  
25 received by the NYPD, Proposed Introduction number

2 781-A sponsored by the Public Advocate Jumaane  
3 Williams in relation to requiring the Police  
4 Department to report on the justification for a stop  
5 in a vehicle encounter reporting, Proposed  
6 Introduction Number 944-A sponsored by myself,  
7 Council Member Hanks in relation to the evaluation of  
8 civil actions alleging improper conduct by the NYPD,  
9 Proposed Introduction 948-A sponsored by Council  
10 Member Louis in relation to requiring NYPD to report  
11 on information and data regarding Department  
12 operations, Proposed Introduction number 1011-A  
13 sponsored by Council Member Brooks-Powers in relation  
14 to providing information on the Reduced Fare programs  
15 to persons issued a summons for fare evasion, and  
16 finally, Resolution number 473, sponsored by Council  
17 Member Cabán calling for the New York State  
18 Legislature to pass and the governor to sign  
19 S1099/A1963, which will protect youth during  
20 custodial police interrogation.

21 I will now pass it along to the public  
22 advocate, Jumaane Williams, for his opening  
23 statement.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JUMAANE WILLIAMS: Thank  
25 you very much, Madam Chair. As mentioned, my name is

2 Jumaane Williams, the Public Advocate for the City of  
3 New York, and I'd like to thank Chair Hanks and the  
4 Members of the Committee on Public Safety for holding  
5 this vote.

6 I first just wanted to set some context  
7 of why I continue to do what it is I do. I want to  
8 talk about Samia. Samia, in 2011, was 20 months old,  
9 and I keep her picture from the Daily News on my wall  
10 ever since in my office. She was shot in the eye at  
11 20 months and she lost her eye. My daughter is about  
12 20 months now, and that hits a lot different when you  
13 start having your own children, but I keep it there  
14 to remind me why to continue to do what I do. When I  
15 think of her, I think of a 13-year-old that also lost  
16 his eye from a shooting in my former Council  
17 District, I think of the grandmother I visited who  
18 was shot by a stray bullet and was paralyzed, I think  
19 about Terea Starnes (phonetic), I think about Alex  
20 Rodriguez, I think about all, Dominic Silvestre, the  
21 people who were shot and killed when I was growing  
22 up, and I think about the first protest my mother  
23 took me to of Patrick Dorismond who was shot and  
24 policed by the back. I think about Abner Louima, I  
25 think about so many names that we've heard of, and

2 that is because of the over-policing that was  
3 supposed to address the violence I also try to think  
4 about, and it has not. Because since the '90s and  
5 since 2011, the numbers have only grown of people who  
6 were killed in the street violence and also killed by  
7 police violence. I say that particularly to some of  
8 the loudest voices in opposition, not people who have  
9 general concerns because I understand, but the  
10 loudest people who have the loudest opposition are  
11 the ones who are not dealing with these issues in  
12 their District. They are not dealing with the real  
13 street violence and the real over-policing. So many  
14 of us who have been dealing with this in our  
15 communities know that our communities are sandwiched  
16 between real street violence and real over-policing  
17 that's not keeping them safe, and they deal with the  
18 impacts of that over and over again so I have tried  
19 in whatever capacity to try to deal with the real  
20 street violence and the real over-policing. If the  
21 people who have the loudest voices, I'm not sure how  
22 many funerals you've gone to, but you talk to most of  
23 us that deal with this, whether it is street  
24 violence, I've gone to police funerals, and I've gone  
25 to funerals of people who've been killed by police,

2 and the pain looks very much the same so the only  
3 thing I was asking is that you take us at our word  
4 that we have to deal with this trauma on a daily  
5 basis, and simply adding more police doesn't solve  
6 the problems because now we are arresting the  
7 children of the people we arrested 30 years ago when  
8 we said it would solve the problem. If we go back  
9 about 12 years when we passed the Community Safety  
10 Act in this same house, all of the opposition I'm  
11 hearing now I heard then, except it didn't come to  
12 pass. We went on a 10-year decline of crime of  
13 historic measures. We all agree now that there were  
14 abuses of stop, question, and frisk. The reason we  
15 know that now is because there was data. It's because  
16 we got the data, and we looked at it. Part of the  
17 remedial process that everyone agrees was needed to  
18 address the biases in stop, question, and frisk and  
19 the abuses that happened there was to have an account  
20 of all stops. This was the recommendation to remedy  
21 the thing that we all agreed upon. The recommendation  
22 was that officers account for all of the stops that  
23 they're doing and then in a randomized check with  
24 cameras and other information, the monitor has said  
25 that there was an under-reporting, an under-reporting

2 of Level 3 stops, commonly known as 250s or the Abuse  
3 of the Stop, Question, and Frisk, and part of that  
4 reason is because there is probably an over account  
5 of those stops being Level 1s and being Level 2s. All  
6 this bill, 586, the hype of the bill does is say  
7 let's not use anecdotes, let's not use one or two  
8 experiences, let's all look at the same data the same  
9 way we did 12 years ago so we can all come to  
10 agreement of what that data says. Without that data,  
11 we're all flying without the proper information so we  
12 don't have a full picture of how many people are  
13 stopped and why they're stopped even if it's lower-  
14 level stops. By the way, those lower-level stops are  
15 often indistinguishable to Level 3 stops. That's why  
16 we're voting today on Intro. 586. It will require the  
17 NYPD to report on all levels of police stops and  
18 encounters. To be clear, we can do this a very  
19 simple way. I know there's a use of the word  
20 paperwork. Everything is electronic now. It's a  
21 simple dropdown menu with four or five questions that  
22 should take 20 to 30 seconds. One of those questions,  
23 by the way, we added on because the NYPD asked us to  
24 add that question on even as they're saying it's  
25 going to take too long. These Level 1 stops do not



2 include, and if you read the bill, it's very clear,  
3 we made it a point to make it clear that it does not  
4 include casual conversations or normal interaction  
5 with communities like saying hello, a tourist asking  
6 you for directions, going into a bodega and asking  
7 the bodega how everything's going, the bodega owner,  
8 or going to a group of young people asking them how  
9 the neighborhood is, is there any problems we should  
10 know about. All we want is the demographic data. We  
11 don't need the pedigree, the name, or the address of  
12 the person who's there. So I'm just asking folks, so  
13 that we're not talking at each other, that we get a  
14 holistic picture of the data so we can talk to each  
15 other looking at the same thing and remembering every  
16 time, every single time, the response to transparency  
17 and accountability is the world is going to fall  
18 apart with crime. It has never happened. It only  
19 feels different because now is the next time, but it  
20 has never happened, and I hope that people will take  
21 time to think about that, particularly the loudest  
22 voices that are not dealing with these issues. This  
23 is not textbook. This is not on TV. This is very real  
24 for those of us who are dealing with it.

2 I want to thank the Speaker for her  
3 leadership on this issue. It's a difficult issue, but  
4 we can all work together for better policing, which  
5 is what we want, and safer streets, and I want to  
6 thank my co-sponsor, Tiffany Cabán, for her  
7 leadership and co-sponsorship as well. That's on 586.

8 According to the New York Civil Liberties  
9 in 2022, 49 percent of drivers arrested following  
10 traffic stops were black and 59 percent were Latinx.  
11 My bill, 781, which requires NYPD to include in  
12 vehicle encounter reports the justification used by  
13 officers to conduct a vehicle stop if an observed  
14 offense was cited as a justification for vehicle stop  
15 and whether the offense was at the level of an  
16 infraction, violation, misdemeanor or felony in order  
17 to effectively address racial bias in policing. We  
18 need to know the full scope of the problem. Oversight  
19 bodies, including the Department of Investigation,  
20 have had difficulty receiving NYPD body-worn camera  
21 footage. This lack of compliance with requests for  
22 access to body-worn camera footage seriously impedes  
23 investigations by oversight agencies, including the  
24 CCRB and the Department of Investigation, OIG NYPD.

2 Bill Intro. 0585 seeks to increase and  
3 expedite oversight agencies access to body-worn  
4 camera footage. This bill will require the NYPD to  
5 share all body worn camera footage requested by the O  
6 OIG NYPD within five days of the recording.

7 I want to thank all of my Staff that  
8 worked on this over the past few years. First, Nick  
9 Smith Deputy Director; Jeffrey Severe, Deputy Public  
10 Advocate for Justice and Safety; Solomon Acevedo,  
11 Deputy Public Advocate for Housing and Health Equity;  
12 Gwen Saffran, Senior Policy and Legislative  
13 Associate, as well as the Communities United for  
14 Police Reform, also the Committee Staff, Jeremy  
15 Whiteman, Josh Kingsley, Rob Calandra, and a special  
16 huge big shoutout to two folks who particularly over  
17 the last months have really got this over the hump.  
18 I'm just sincerely thankful for all the work and time  
19 and lost nights that they put in, and that's Veronica  
20 Aveis, Chief Deputy Public Advocate for Policy, and  
21 Rosie Mendez, former Council Member and Director of  
22 Legislation and Policy, and I'm hoping everyone will  
23 take heed to what I just spoke about and so many  
24 people are feeling and people like my mom, who a  
25 bullet went through her car just two summers ago, I'm

2 thankful she's not in it. This is personal. We want  
3 safer streets and better policing. Both of those  
4 things can happen at the same time. These bills help  
5 achieve that. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Public  
7 Advocate. With that, will the Clerk please take a  
8 roll call vote? I vote aye.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
10 you. Chair Hanks, thank you. Brannan.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Holden.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Permission to  
14 explain my vote.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You may go ahead.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Let me talk about  
17 Intro. 586 for a couple of minutes I guess I have. At  
18 an off-topic press conference by the Mayor, Deputy  
19 Mayor Fabian Levy reported approximately 8.5 million  
20 9-1-1 calls annually. Let's do that. Let's talk about  
21 that. The NYPD's testimony on Intro. 586 in March in  
22 which I stayed and listened to the testimony by the  
23 police revealed 3.2 million Level 1 police encounters  
24 yearly. So let's talk about that. Anybody ever listen  
25 to the scanner? I do. I listen to my police scanner

2 many times while I'm at my desk. It's just to get a  
3 feeling of what's going on in the community. Each  
4 unit, each police car, each unit is holding five 9-1-  
5 1 calls. That means they're delaying getting to them  
6 because there's so many calls coming through. That's  
7 with a full roll of police officers in the precinct.  
8 Now we're down to about half in many regards in many  
9 precincts, half the police officers, so you're asking  
10 these units to report on a pulldown menu, according  
11 to the Public Advocate, which doesn't exist yet, by  
12 the way, and here's the Level 3 form. It's got about  
13 50 questions. Alright, that's Level 3. So you're  
14 asking them, the police officers, to add Level 1 and  
15 Level 2 stops. And, again, the paperwork alone will  
16 hinder police efficiency, keeping officers behind  
17 their desk instead of on patrol. So what the Public  
18 Advocate wants to do is just the opposite. He wants  
19 to keep people safe. This is going to have the  
20 opposite effect of just more paperwork, and that's  
21 what, that's again, people who don't understand  
22 policing, who don't understand the everyday life of a  
23 police officer. They should go on a ride-along. I  
24 went on two ride-alongs, but go on a ride-along and  
25 see what the officers face before you come up with

2 bills that will be impossible to really take forward  
3 in any meaningful way. This is not going to be good  
4 for public safety. Again, the police staffing  
5 shortage coupled with crime rates on so many things,  
6 the police response is certainly going up. The time  
7 that it takes to even answer a call is ridiculous.  
8 Now, with fewer cops, more reports, public safety is  
9 out the door in New York City if this bill passes so  
10 aye on all except 538-A, 586-A, 781-A, 944-A, 948-A,  
11 1011-A, and Reso 473. Thank you.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
13 you. Cabán.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Permission to  
15 explain my vote.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Go ahead.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay. I am really,  
18 really proud to vote aye on this entire package of  
19 bills coming through this committee. I think that the  
20 people most directly impacted by these bills, black  
21 and brown New Yorkers who day after day have dealt  
22 with their constitutional rights being violated, have  
23 dealt with what we now know because of prior  
24 legislation like the Community Safety Act that are  
25 disproportionately impacted by this kind of policing,

2 I dare to say that black and brown, low-income, new  
3 Yorkers know exactly what police officers do, and  
4 that is why we're here today. I also know, having  
5 been a career public defender, cross examining lots  
6 of police officers, knowing exactly every single  
7 piece of paper, DD5, they have to fill out, and the  
8 amount of time it takes to do so that anybody who  
9 dares to say that this is such a burden is just  
10 simply trying to avoid transparency and  
11 accountability. If we are going to truly make our  
12 city safe across every borough, for every single New  
13 Yorker, it starts with the people who have been less  
14 safe because of the way that we enforce the law and  
15 implement policing so this is certainly the first  
16 step in the right direction. I'm really, really proud  
17 of the commitment of my Colleagues and working  
18 together to make sure that the NYPD complies so I  
19 very proudly vote aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: De La  
21 Rosa.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: A minute to  
23 explain my vote?

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Go ahead.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you. I  
3 just want to say that it is both offensive and a  
4 fallacy to insinuate that those of us that are  
5 supporting these bills don't understand how the NYPD  
6 polices our communities given that I represent a  
7 community that has been at the crosshairs of the war  
8 on drugs and I myself have been stopped and summoned  
9 by police officers. We know exactly what policing  
10 looks like in our communities, and what we are  
11 looking for here is transparency so for anyone to  
12 insinuate that we do not understand what policing  
13 looks like unless we ride along, I invite you to come  
14 to my District and watch it for yourself. I vote aye  
15 on all.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Joseph.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Aye on all.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Mealy.

19 Stevens.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Permission to  
21 explain my vote?

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Go ahead.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Everyone know  
24 that I came to the Council to represent young people  
25 because their voice doesn't feel heard, and today I'm



2 excited to vote aye on all because the reality is the  
3 young people who come from the community that I live  
4 in, the community that I represent, and the community  
5 I've dedicated my life to for over 20 years, does not  
6 feel safe, and it is also very reprehensible when I  
7 hear that we don't understand policing when I was  
8 actually a police cadet and worked in a police  
9 department for the entirety of my college career so I  
10 do believe that this is what we need in moving in the  
11 right direction so we can have the data to support  
12 what we already know, which is that we have  
13 disparities and not equality when people are feeling  
14 safe throughout the city. So again, I vote aye on  
15 all. Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
17 you. Ariola.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Permission to  
19 explain my vote?

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Go ahead.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Some of the bills  
22 up for vote today leave me deeply concerned about the  
23 future of safety in our city. In speaking with  
24 several current and former law enforcement officials  
25 about the effects of Intro. 586 and what it will have

2 on the people of New York, I have found the responses  
3 to be near unanimous. These bills will negatively  
4 alter public safety in this city. Just recently  
5 speaking about Intro. 586, Queen's DA Melinda Katz  
6 stated devoting the time this bill would require to  
7 for voluminous record making will serve only to  
8 divert limited resources from law enforcement's  
9 mandate to protect and serve the public. Bronx DA  
10 Darcelle Clark echoed this sentiment, saying in her  
11 own statement that Intro. 586 will lead to longer  
12 response times to crimes and fewer positive  
13 interactions between police and the public. These are  
14 not opinionated talking heads. They are Democratic  
15 District Attorneys with years of real-world  
16 experience in law enforcement, and they both agree  
17 that these bills will bog down our officers with  
18 additional paperwork and negatively impact the  
19 community policing component of the NYPD. Therefore,  
20 I'm voting yes on 585 and 638, and no on all the  
21 rest.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
23 you. One moment. Bottcher.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: No on 586, aye  
3 on all the rest, and I want to congratulate all my  
4 Colleagues on today's legislation.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
6 you. Proposed Introductions 585-A and 638-A are  
7 adopted by the Committee with 10 in the affirmative,  
8 zero in the negative, and no abstentions; Proposed  
9 Introductions 538-A, 781-A, 944-A, 948-A, 1011-A, and  
10 Reso 473 are adopted by the committee with eight in  
11 the affirmative, two in the negative, and no  
12 abstentions; and finally, Proposed Introduction 586-A  
13 is adopted by the Committee with seven in the  
14 affirmative, three in the negative, and no  
15 abstentions.

16 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. With that,  
17 this hearing is adjourned. Thank you. [GAVEL]

18 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: William  
19 Martin, Committee Clerk. Vote revision for Committee  
20 on Public Safety.

21 The following items were adopted by the  
22 following numbers. We have Introductions 585-A and  
23 638-A are adopted with nine in the affirmative, zero  
24 in the negative, and no abstentions. Proposed  
25 Introductions 538-8, 781-A, 944-A, 948-A, 1011-A, and

2 Reso 473 are now adopted with seven in the  
3 affirmative, two in the negative, no abstentions, and  
4 finally Proposed Introduction 586-A is six in the  
5 affirmative, three in the negative, no abstentions.  
6 That was a vote revision. All items are still passed  
7 by the Committee. Thank you.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 25, 2023