

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

----- X

October 24, 2003
Start: 1:23 p.m.
Recess: 6:20 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: Alexa Avilés
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Diana Ayala
Charles Barron
Carmen N. De La Rosa
Darlene Mealy
Chi A. Ossé
Lincoln Restler
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Pierina Ana Sanchez
Julie Won

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Tamika Mapp
District Leader 86th Assembly District

Alexa Cruz
NYCHA resident

Barbara McFadden
President of Nordstrom Houses

Maisha Morales
Good Old Lower East Side

Lisa Bova-Hiatt
NYCHA Chief Executive Officer

Jonathan Gouveia
NYCHA Executive Vice President of Real Estate

Vlada Kenniff
President of NYC Public Housing Preservation
Trust

Brian Honan
Senior Vice President for Intergovernmental
Relations

Eva Trimble
Chief Operating Officer at NYCHA

Andrew Kaplan
NYCHA Chief of Staff

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Hector Vasquez
Fulton Tenants Association

Lucy Newman
Legal Aid Society

Brigitte Charlton-Vicenty
Inner City Green Team

Renee Keap [sp?]

Dana Elden
President of St. Mary's Park Houses

Diana Blackwell
President Fred Samuel Resident Association

Jacqueline Lara
Fulton Houses Resident

Christina Chaise
2nd Vice President at Ravenswood Houses

Joshua Barnett
President of Chapter 25 Local 375 at NYCHA

Karen Blondel
President of Red Hook West

Miguel Acevedo
TA President of Fulton Houses

Tanesha Grant
Parents Supporting Parents

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Theo Chino
Social Democrats of America

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Welcome to the New
3 York City Council hearing for the Committee on Public
4 Housing. Please silence all electronic devices. If
5 you wish to submit testimony, you may do so at
6 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Please do not approach
7 the dais. If you need assistance, we'll be more than
8 happy to help you. Thanks for your cooperation.

9 Chair, we're ready to begin,

10 [gavel]

11 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: This meeting is
12 coming to order. Good afternoon everyone, and
13 welcome to this hearing of the Committee of Public
14 Housing. I am Council Member Alexa Avilés, the Chair
15 of the New York City Council's Committee on Public
16 Housing. I would like to thank you all for attending
17 this oversight hearing on the current state of the
18 New York City Housing Authority, the RAD/PACT program
19 and the Public Housing Preservation Trust. We are
20 joined by my colleagues Deputy Speaker Ayala, Council
21 Member De La Rosa, and Council Member Brewer, and I
22 believe we may have a-- Council Member Barron online.
23 The New York City Housing Authority is almost 90
24 years old and has been on a circuitous journey over
25 the decades on how to address the compounding impacts

1 of mismanagement, crumbling infrastructure, and a
2 consistent de-funding by all levels of government.
3 Residents have witnessed a number of plans from comp-
4 mod, to in-fill, to selling off air rights, to
5 demolition, to the PACT program while being under
6 monitorship [sic], and of the most recent creation,
7 the Public Housing Trust, among others. While all of
8 these iterations have been a number of management and
9 organization-- with all of these iterations there
10 have been a number of management and organizational
11 reshuffles, new programs and new plans, and many
12 simply recycling promises of the past with tweaked
13 approached and new faces. NYCHA looks different
14 today than it did a decade ago, and will look even
15 more different a year from now. What has not changed
16 is that the residents of NYCHA still face conditions
17 now New Yorker should have to live with, and they
18 have questions that deserve to be answered. It is no
19 wonder there is so little trust from residents who
20 have been sold all of these plans while the quality
21 of life and their rights seem to deteriorate before
22 their eyes. My goal for this hearing is to provide a
23 space for those questions and for NYCHA to provide
24 answers about the future of public housing in our
25

1 city. Today, we will delve into where NYCHA is, the
2 state of NYCHA, the PACT program and the future of
3 the Trust. The majority, approximately 68 percent of
4 NYCHA residents today are still under the traditional
5 Section 9 public housing funding with the most
6 recently completed PNA putting forward a staggering
7 78 billion dollar need across all the development,
8 and residents still living in subpar conditions.
9 While we must give NYCHA credit for the improvements
10 that have come in certain aspects, there's clearly so
11 much work to be done. Poor and working class New
12 Yorkers can see the threat of displacement and
13 gentrification a mile away. Residents are waiting
14 for a clear plan and action to address these
15 conditions and deserve clear and transparent
16 communications about what is being done and
17 accountability for implementation of those plans and
18 when they go wrong. We have heard mixed stories
19 about the work that has been completed and what still
20 needs to be done from a growing number of residents
21 living in PACT developments where private developers
22 should be addressing those needs. While NYCHA has
23 certainly incorporated resident feedback in more
24 recent PACT processes, the Authority is full steam
25

1 ahead with programs without a comprehensive
2 assessment of its impact. Lastly, we're only two
3 weeks away from the resident of Nostrand Houses
4 starting to vote on whether or not they will join the
5 Public Housing Trust. Regardless of the outcome of
6 the vote, Nostrand residents and all NYCHA residents
7 are entitled to answers about the next steps in the
8 Trust process, including which developments are next
9 to vote. A through-line on all these topics and my
10 questions will be transparency and accountability.
11 Transparency from NYCHA is necessary so that the
12 Council and NYCHA residents can make informed
13 decisions and be part of the process to continue to
14 improve NYCHA. And to that end, we will be hearing
15 two bills I've sponsored, Introduction 646 and
16 Introduction 648. Intro 646 would require a report
17 on the PACT program, so far detailing the conversion
18 and selection, as well as the number of evictions
19 taking place before and after the conversion. This
20 will help future residents decide whether to vote on
21 joining the PACT program and provide clarity on what
22 if any displacement has taken place due to the PACT
23 program. Intro 648 would require NYCHA to provide a
24 report on the units that have been vacant for more
25

1 than 30 continuous days. The report would include
2 the reasons why the unit was vacant to supplement the
3 public information on NYCHA's website, which shows an
4 alarming growth in the vacant units across NYCHA
5 properties. NYCHA residents, workers, government
6 officials must be held accountable to ensure that we
7 are delivering on our responsibilities to ensure that
8 we protect and preserve New York City's greatest
9 social housing asset, the New York City Public
10 Housing Authority. I would like to thank my staff,
11 Christina Bottego, Edward Cerna, Amarachi Ngadi,
12 along with Public Housing Committee Staff, Jose
13 Conde, Charles Kim, Conner Mealey, Christopher
14 Zawora, Nicholas Montalbano for all the work they
15 put into this hearing. And in keeping with the
16 tradition of this committee, before we hear from
17 NYCHA we will first hear from a panel of residents.
18 I will turn it over to Committee Counsel to call up
19 the first witnesses.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We'll call up the
22 first witnesses of in-person for the resident pre-
23 panel. If you wish to testify and you've not done
24 so already, please see the Sergeant at Arms at the
25 back of the room to fill out a testimony slip. The
first

1 panel of witnesses will be Barbara McFadden, Tamika
2 Mapp, Alexa Cruz [sp?], and Maisha Morales. Aixa
3 Cruz [sp?], my apologies. The first [inaudible] Ms.
4 Morales, Aixa Cruz, Tamika Mapp, and Barbara
5 McFadden. So, we can start on the-- sure.

7 TAMIKA MAPP: Chair and esteemed City
8 Council Members I want to express my gratitude for
9 the opportunity to address you today. My name is
10 Tamika Mapp. I'm the District Leader for the 68th
11 Assembly District Part D and the State Committee
12 Woman for the 68th Assembly District. I am here to
13 speak on behalf of the NYCHA tenants in my community
14 who are deeply concerned about the potential
15 conversion of the New York City public housing to
16 RAD/PACT or the Preservation Trust Program. NYCHA is
17 a vital lifeline representing the very essence of
18 true affordable housing in our great city. It serves
19 as a sanctuary for thousands of families who would
20 otherwise struggle to find a place they can call home
21 in a city where the cost of living continues to rise.
22 We stand at a crucial juncture of where the
23 preservation of NYCHA is paramount. The consequences
24 of a converted NYCHA to alternate programs are there.
25 We risk worsening an already critical issue of

1
2 homelessness, potentially addressing the overall
3 burden placed on shelter system which is already at
4 capacity. It is our moral duty to safeguard these
5 homes, these lifelines for countless New Yorkers.
6 But our responsibility doesn't end with preservation.
7 It extends to accountability. NYCHA has been plagued
8 by years of mismanagement and neglect, resulting in
9 deplorable living conditions for many residents.
10 It's unfathomable that individuals have families
11 living in homes riddled with mold, mildew, and
12 without adequate heat, despite faithfully paying
13 their rent on time each month. This is an injustice
14 that cannot go unaddressed. If any other landlord
15 subjected the tenants of such conditions, they would
16 be held accountable, and NYCHA should be no
17 exception. I implore the City Council to act swiftly
18 to fully fund Section 9, ensuring that the financial
19 resources are available to address the present issues
20 facing NYCHA. We must allocate the necessary
21 resources to repair and maintain these public housing
22 units, guaranteeing safe and dignified living
23 conditions for all NYCHA residents. Furthermore, we
24 must establish an independent audit board to
25 rigorously oversee every dollar that NYCHA spends.

1
2 This board will ensure that tax payer's funds are
3 used efficiently and effectively with a focus on
4 quality work rather than quick fixes. Such oversight
5 is critical to rebuilding trust within the community
6 and ensure the hard-earned money of the New York City
7 residents is put to good use. In conclusion,
8 preserving NYCHA is just not a matter of policy, it's
9 a matter of justice and compassion for those who rely
10 on these homes, and you can see my other written
11 testimony that is submitted already. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you.

13 ALEXA CRUZ: Hi. I am Alexa Cruz [sp?]
14 and I live in NYCHA since 1969, and I remember my
15 building was built in 1963. It's not 90 years old.
16 And my building is pretty well-structured from-- of
17 hurricanes and fireproof and all etcetera. The move
18 us to the regular buildings. The new construction,
19 it's all sheetrock and it's hazardous to everyone.
20 And I am not happy with the RAD/PACT, because they
21 have a one to 20 years that they can keep the Section
22 8, and after 20 years, maybe 10, 15, we will be out
23 of our apartments and we'll we out of the city,
24 because we won't be able to afford apartments
25 anywhere in New York City, and we will be out in the

1 streets, and I am afraid of that. I pray every day
2 that NYCHA does pay-- that HUD pays NYCHA so that we
3 can get those billions of dollars that we were
4 supposed to get years ago when the billions of
5 dollars were distributed to NYCHA, and none of the
6 repairs were made, and everything is falling apart,
7 because they literally are doing it on purpose so
8 they can knock us down. They don't even call the
9 police on the drug dealers in front of the building.
10 They pass them. They just don't-- they ignore them.
11 They just want to get rid of us, period. Thank you.

12 BARBARA MCFADDEN: Good afternoon
13 everyone. My name is Barbara McFadden. I happen to
14 be the president at Nostrand Housing and the First
15 Vice Chair for CCOP. First and foremost, I want to
16 begin-- because something that Nostrand Housing do,
17 we partner with different entities, and NYCHA happens
18 to be one of them, and one thing that I want to put
19 on the record and say, NYCHA has a new team and I've
20 very happy and satisfied with the new team. I'm not
21 talking about the old team 10 years or 20 years ago.
22 I'm talking about the new team now. In order for me
23 to tell everyone about the team and the greatness
24 they've been doing with us, partnering with us at
25

1
2 Nostrand Houses, I'm going to start presenting the
3 names as I follow through. First and foremost I want
4 to begin by thanking our CEO Ms. Lisa Bova-Hiatt, our
5 President of the Citywide Chair, Mr. Daniel Barber,
6 Mr.-- I want to thank also Mr. Jimmy Santana. I want
7 to thank Ms. Eva Trimble, Ms. Ukah Busgith. I would
8 like to thank Mr. Andrew Kaplan, Mr. Brian Honan,
9 Courtney Yu, Mondu [sp?], Mr. Leroy, Rodney Gwyn,
10 Mckiva [sp?], Erica Danisha [sp?], Danny Mahia [sp?],
11 Mr. Curtis Williams, and Mr. Posey Amirillia [sp?].
12 Let me explain to you why I thank them. Because we
13 heard so many bad things in the past about NYCHA,
14 it's like a black cloud. As me working for the New
15 York City Board of Ed as a substitute teacher, I
16 learned to be optimistic, take the good with the bad.
17 I don't just want to bring to the table any
18 negativity, I want to talk about the goodness and the
19 goodness that NYCHA been doing for us. First and
20 foremost, I want to begin by saying I was appointed
21 to be on the Trust Board by Mayor Adams. We've been
22 doing 100 engagement around Nostrand Housing. And
23 let me break that down about engagement. We partner
24 with Sheepshead Bay High School. We partner with
25 Shell Bank [sic]. We had different workshops

1 explaining what Trust was, explaining what Section 9
2 was, explaining what RAD/PACT. Even though Nostrand
3 is first in history to do the voting process, most
4 and foremost it's providing our residents with
5 engagement, providing our residents with knowledge.
6 People are going to fear. Oh, my am I going to lose
7 my home? Course, I'm a resident at Nostrand Housing.
8 I would feel the same way if I wasn't provided with
9 the proper knowledge or I have people on the sideline
10 with scare tactics. No, I'm not going for that. If
11 you want to know what's going on, we have a resident
12 leader at Sheepshead Bay Nostrand, and that's me,
13 McFadden. Contact me. McFadden, y'all doing
14 engagement, is it possible we can do some door
15 knocking? We're door knocking on the 32 buildings.
16 We're putting pamphlets on the doors. We're talking
17 to the residents. We're hearing their voices. Every
18 residents have a voice, even though I support the
19 Trust Preservation and I was appointed to sit on the
20 board by Mayor Adams, all my residents throughout the
21 five boroughs of NYCHA have a voice, whether it's the
22 trust, whether it's the Section 9 or whether it's
23 RAD/PACT. But most and foremost, by being I support
24 the Trust, we're proving our residents with
25

1 engagement and we're providing them with knowledge.

2 All questions are being answered, and if there's

3 something that they don't know, we will say to them

4 we would get back to you. And I'm happy because this

5 is history in the making. We have a lot of backlog

6 repairs, and people need their homes done. Part of

7 living healthy is being healthy. If you get your

8 apartment--

9
10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Ms.

11 McFadden, if you wouldn't mind wrapping up your

12 comments really quickly, because we want to ask you

13 questions.

14 BARBARA MCFADDEN: Okay. So first and

15 foremost, as I was saying, you know, part of being

16 healthy is living healthy. You getting your

17 apartment done over, new equipment like stoves and

18 refrigerators and things like that, new bathtubs,

19 come on. Nostrand Housing is old, 50 years and more.

20 And I yield.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you, Ms.

22 McFadden.

23 MAISHA MORALES: Good afternoon. My name

24 is Maisha Morales. I'm here today not only as a

25 former NYCHA resident and also a former resident that

1 lived in a Section 8 building, but as an advocate for
2 NYCHA residents for over 15 years through Good Old
3 Lower East Side, but also currently as a staffer for
4 a government official. And we all know the
5 conditions, the deplorable conditions that residents
6 at NYCHA have been living under, right? And these
7 repairs have to be done. Partly, the responsibility
8 of why they're in these conditions falls under
9 government, all levels of government, especially the
10 state. I'm here to share my constituents'
11 experience, right, who were not able to have the
12 privilege to be here today. The RAD/PACT conversions
13 in our districts, residents one year later are
14 receiving letters that-- with a bill-- and I've
15 shared with maybe one or two of you here. Billing
16 people for repairs down to per square mile, these are
17 some of the things that some these developers are
18 doing. They are experiencing a high rate of people
19 of eviction. Seniors being told they have to down-
20 size and sending a senior from Gowanus and sending
21 them to Far Rockaway, displacing them from their
22 communities. These are real things that are
23 happening. Unfortunately, there's always-- there's
24 never enough money for NYCHA residents. Section 9
25

1 has been proven that it is the best form of housing,
2 right? Section 8, I'm going to share my experience.
3 My parents were displaced in 1989 because my mother
4 got a raise and made two dollars more than the
5 Section 8 income guideline, and her rent went up to
6 \$1,700 in 1989, and we were displaced. I say all
7 this to say Section 9 is the best form of housing.
8 We need to protect our tenants, and I ask all of you
9 here to please work alongside with your comrades and
10 make sure that Section 9 is fully-funded, that you
11 stay Section 9. It is the best form, and most
12 importantly, that you all work together, the feds,
13 the state, and City Council. Thank you.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you, Ms.
16 Morales. Before I ask some questions, I want to
17 recognize we've been joined by Council Member Ossé,
18 Council Member Won, and Council Member Salamanca.
19 Thank you for being here. I'd like to know-- Mrs.
20 Cruz, to go back to you for a second. Can you tell
21 me how long your development underwent RAD and PACT?

22 ALEXA CRUZ: Now it's under Section 9.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay.

24 ALEXA CRUZ: So, we don't-- it's not
25 effective yet.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

19

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay.

ALEXA CRUZ: But I don't want RAD/PACT. I want Section 9, and I believe that-- and they want to demolish the building, and the only way that they can surrender our rights is they demolish our buildings, and we will lose our rights, and we will return over to RAD/PACT.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: What development are you from?

ALEXA CRUZ: I'm on Chelsea.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay. Can you tell me a little bit-- we're going to talk more about Chelsea, but tell me from your experience, what's been the engagement around the status of Chelsea?

ALEXA CRUZ: The engagement on the repairs and all that?

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah, on the repairs and--

ALEXA CRUZ: [interposing] Our repairs-- my building is pretty good. My building is excellent. I mean, all I need in my apartment is to plaster under the sink which they made some repairs there and that's it, but my apartment is in good

1 condition and the building is in good condition. It
2 just needs renovation.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Were you engaged in
5 any of the public meetings that were had about the
6 plans for Chelsea?

7 ALEXA CRUZ: I went to the meetings and
8 they told me that-- they said that they were going to
9 renovate it, and they need [sic] renovate it, and I
10 don't understand what was RAD and PACT until I
11 started to look it up in the NYCHA application about
12 the RAD/PACT and then I started researching a lot of
13 stuff and finding out a lot of stuff about Section 8
14 and then Section 9. Section 9 is supposed to be
15 forever. It's suppose-- it has no expiration. We're
16 protected, but Section 8, it has up to 20 years. So
17 what happens to tenants that can't afford, and
18 they'll raise that median rate, the high rent. What
19 happens to them? They go in the streets, or they
20 have to move elsewhere. Where?

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Did you participate
22 in a survey around choosing the future of the
23 development?

24 ALEXA CRUZ: Yes, I participated it. I
25 thought it was good at the beginning, and then I

1 realized it wasn't, so then I-- I don't want it,
2 because it's not a security for me. It's not a
3 security to anybody that has low income.
4

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay, thank you.

6 Thank you so much. Ms. Mapp, I'm curious, can you
7 tell me a little bit more about-- I've heard many
8 residents call for an independent audit of NYCHA.
9 Can you tell me more specifically about how you think
10 this is an important thing for us to do?

11 TAMIKA MAPP: Yes, I think it's important
12 because like any corporation, when you spend
13 corporate's money there's accountability in making
14 sure that the vendor is up to code. I don't think the
15 New York City Housing Authority has any preferred
16 vendors. They just go either with their friends or
17 what's the cheapest model. You know, you get what
18 you paid for. So if I have a vendor that's an
19 elevator friend, and he's my friend or connected to
20 somebody that works at NYCHA, I'm going to keep on
21 going to that vendor. It's not going to be fixed.
22 It's going to be a patch, because I already know in
23 three weeks I'm going to be called again to fix that
24 patch and it's more money coming in for me. If we
25 have an independent board, we could say, okay, we

1 spend let's say \$500,000 on fixing this elevator.
2 Why? What's wrong with this company? Then we could
3 start doing a little bit more research on the
4 vendors. It is a good vendor, how many reviews
5 they've got. You know, how many buildings they fixed
6 and stayed in great shape versus the fix and repair.
7 And you know, as a City Council Member, our job-- you
8 know, any elected official's job is accountability,
9 and the City Council has a right to scrutinize NYCHA
10 for everything that they did. I say if I was ever a
11 City Council, I would sue them, because of the simple
12 fact that no one should have to live in mold, mildew,
13 and anything. If I was a private-- if they was a
14 private landlord, they would be in court, everything
15 happening, but since they fall underneath the federal
16 guidelines it's like they get a pat on the back,
17 let's try to figure out-- [inaudible] more money.
18 And if they're already mismanaging the money they
19 get, what are they going to do with the money they're
20 going to get for this RAD/PACT and conversion. You
21 know, I'm from Pittsburg, Pennsylvania. My mother
22 went through the same thing. She lived on top of the
23 hill, the top of the hill is still vacant. They
24 demolished the building and she's in this little tiny
25

1
2 little apartment because she had to downsize, and
3 they're just holding onto thread in Pittsburgh,
4 Pennsylvania. So it's not even a New York issue.
5 It's a whole United States issue for public housing.
6 Public housing is our true affordable housing,
7 because if public housing goes, so do our renters and
8 so do our affordable co-ops. And we need to make
9 sure that we have public housing in the state of New
10 York, especially in the City so people can have a way
11 to live and making sure they have a roof over their
12 head and not being homeless. We already have a
13 homeless crisis. As we could see with Section 8, if
14 you make a dollar or two dollars more like Ms.
15 Morales says, they're homeless. We're else they
16 going to go?

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you. Thank
18 you for pointing out this is-- we've seen a national
19 pattern in terms of the demise of public housing
20 across the country. It's drives very much why we
21 want to make sure to preserve and protect public
22 housing in New York City. Thank you. Ms. McFadden,
23 I know you mentioned, you are the first development
24 to go through for the voting of the Trust. Can you
25 tell us a little bit about like what the process has

1
2 been to-date and how many residents you've been able
3 to engage, and where do you find the challenges of
4 communicating what is happening?

5 BARBARA MCFADDEN: First, in order for me
6 to be transparent, give me the first question only so
7 I could respond to that.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: I hear that. So the
9 first question was how many residents have you been
10 able to engage with the voting process to-date, and
11 then where are the challenges in communicating what
12 is happening and what you're working on?

13 BARBARA MCFADDEN: I want to be fair with
14 answering the question, because it's been a lot of
15 residents. My reason for not giving an actual number,
16 because when you do tremendous amount of resident
17 engagement, you get a sign-in sheet. So I would have
18 to get calculate all those to give you an actual
19 number, but what I can say to be fair, my just
20 recent-- let me just think. I like to be fair. Last
21 week we had engagement with the President of the
22 Trust, Ms. Vlada, she was there along with a host of
23 NYCHA employees and residents. Turn out, when I
24 looked around the room, we had about in total 100-
25 something people that particular day last week. And

1
2 what I will say I find a little difficult with
3 engagement, and I'm going to explain this piece, I
4 have-- I don't want to mention the senior name,
5 because I'm great with confidentiality. I have a
6 senior, right? She lives in Nostrand Housing, and
7 she has an aide, a home health aide. If you're a
8 senior that is not mobile, you're not going down to
9 check your mail, you send your home health aide,
10 right? People knock on the door, you're not getting
11 up to the door. You send your home-- so actually,
12 that particular senior is missing out, and I'll
13 explain to you why. Because I didn't see her at none
14 of my engagement pieces. That's what roles [sic] in
15 tenant [sic] with me. So I will say that all that
16 good engagement that I was giving out throughout
17 Nostrand housing with the team, with the volunteers,
18 she was missing all those pieces, but when I knocked
19 on her door, she asked me, "Who are you?" I said I'm
20 Ms. McFadden. I happen to be the President here at
21 Nostrand Housing, and I know you and I know who you
22 are. I know what apartment you're in, that's why I
23 knocked on your door. It's called a wellness check,
24 and I hope other resident leaders do the same thing
25 what I do. When you don't see Ms. Joann or Ms. Mary

1
2 come out her door, with the permission of the
3 management team, you do a wellness check. You're not
4 just checking on that tenant about the engagement
5 pieces that's going on in Nostrand Housing, you want
6 to make sure that senior is well and she's not dead
7 in her home. So I said to her, you know, Nostrand
8 Housing is doing a voting process. Of course, she
9 was like, "What is that?" I'm patient. I work with
10 children at the Board of Ed, so I know how to talk
11 with people. I know how to interact with people, and
12 I know how to be patient with my seniors. I
13 explained that to her. Guess what, I know when I
14 walked away she forgot, but it's up to me again to go
15 back to reach out to her. And I hope that answered
16 your question.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And we're going to
18 talk more about this for sure. Thank you. I mean,
19 this is exactly the kind of engagement that, you
20 know, I think many-- for many hearings we've been
21 talking about. What kind of supports are you
22 receiving as a TA President to ensure you're able to
23 do engagement? Because obviously you're working full
24 time and this is a fulltime job.

1
2 BARBARA MCFADDEN: First and foremost, I
3 love the new NYCHA team. I'm not over-exaggerating.
4 I'm all about fairness, because I'm a type of person
5 like this, if you treat me nice and you treat me with
6 response even when I'm wrong, you can get 100 percent
7 of me, but if you come at me yelling and screaming, I
8 will shut down, just like a child I will shut down.
9 You can get 100 percent out of me just alone your
10 approach. It only take 2.0 seconds to be kind to
11 anyone. NYCHA, new team under the leadership of Lisa
12 Hiatt Bova, Ava, Mr. Leroy, the President of the
13 Trust, Valda [sic], Courtney, I don't mean to do that
14 and get that overwhelmed-- Mr. Brian Honan. They're
15 always reaching out to me, "Ms. McFadden, we have
16 some fliers for you. Ms. McFadden, even though you
17 have a volunteer team of children in Nostrand Housing
18 that's putting fliers up in the 32 buildings, that's
19 going to each six floors with six apartment-- we got
20 a team that don't mind coming out on the week and
21 helping you. And I really appreciate that support,
22 because I'm not going to lie, if I get overwhelmed,
23 they pick me up, "Come on McFadden, we need you, we
24 work together." And that's all about teamwork.
25 Teamwork makes the dream work. And most and

1
2 foremost, the residents they come first. We work for
3 them.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Brian, why am I not
5 getting fliers? You got some 'splaining [sic] to do
6 with the other Council Members you don't call back.
7 Thank you, Ms. McFadden. Ms. Morales, can you tell
8 me a little bit about-- you mentioned this billing
9 situation for residents. What have you see on the
10 ground in certain RAD/PACT? Color that for us for
11 the record.

12 MAISHA MORALES: So, initially, we had
13 one development, Jonathan Williams, what used to be
14 Jonathan Williams Houses, reach out to us, because
15 one year after they went through the conversion, they
16 just received a list. It was like a four-page list
17 of what repair fees would look like, from a nail to a
18 tile. We definitely advocated on their behalf. I
19 will say currently, because it's fair that I give an
20 update, that Congresswoman Velazquez's office got
21 involved, and that situation was addressed, and it is
22 no longer a thing, a rule. But I think the bigger
23 picture is what if those residents didn't know to
24 come to their public officials, right? You have to
25 make a stink about it. What if those public

1 officials really didn't care like Congresswoman
2 Velazquez or the office I work for? What's going to
3 happen to those developments? And that's the bigger
4 issue. And another experience has been when they do
5 the-- what I'm hearing and what I've seen is when
6 they do remodel the apartments, they're really shoddy
7 work, right? I know one resident two days later
8 after the windows were installed they fell on her
9 head while she was sitting on her couch. You have
10 the appliances that may look pretty because they're
11 shiny and they look like stainless steel, but they're
12 still poor quality. And then you have to deal with
13 the possibility that now you may get charged for
14 that, right? Those have been-- and we had another
15 development who also received a list of repairs and
16 that, again, we were able to address and put a stop
17 to that. What I've realized is there-- and I will
18 say you have NYCHA's staffers, especially at the
19 borough office, who are willing to work with us,
20 right? I'm not going to say they're impossible. But
21 it shouldn't take that entire process to eventually
22 get to a public official. Part of the issue is the
23 lack of communication with the developers and NYCHA,
24 even though initially they have these meetings and
25

1
2 these agreements. I believe there's some loopholes,
3 you know. In one specific development they-- 75
4 apartments received down-sizing and eviction notices
5 and were threatened. It took of our office to step in
6 to be able to bring in NYCHA, and they felt they were
7 able to do this, and it turns out NYCHA's like, no,
8 they're grandfathered in under Section 9. So why
9 didn't the developer know this, right? Why didn't
10 their team? So I think that their communication
11 needs to be better. I think for me, the same money--
12 if we're pouring in millions of dollars to private
13 developers, why can't we just pour them into NYCHA?
14 Because with all due respect, those making the
15 decisions do not look like the residents, right? Do
16 not have that experience, many of them, right? There
17 needs to be more resident engagement. We need to
18 build-- there is leadership as we see in this room
19 here, right? There needs to be more-- it needs to be
20 led by the people. It is public housing. so, I
21 think-- I hope that answers your question, but I
22 guess in all to say that while we're able to
23 intervene, I can't say that that's going to happen
24 for every development.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: No, thank you. I
3 think you point out certainly one of the mantras.
4 It's not only is public housing one of New York
5 City's greatest assets, but the public housing
6 residents themselves are the greatest asset. And how
7 they are centered and not de-centered and the fight
8 around that is a serious one. And even how-- I mean,
9 even getting resident engagement to this point in the
10 RAD/PACT program did not come because of the
11 benevolence of developers or anyone else. It became
12 because residents wasn't having it, and it's not the
13 right thing to do quite frankly. So I think there's
14 certainly much to be gained [inaudible]. We want to
15 hear today more how are residents in decision-making
16 roles here, how are they supported fully, and you
17 know, so I'm delighted to hear that there is
18 improvements with what Ms. McFadden is mentioning is
19 terms of the level of engagement and support that is
20 received. We know that's the standard. It should
21 be. So, I thank you for all your testimony, and we
22 will hear more from the Administration and more to
23 come, and thank you for your advocacy. I'd like to
24 recognize Council Member Restler and Council Member
25 Mealy.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I'll now call up the
3 representatives of NYCHA. Sorry, just one second.
4 We'll just have one more resident on the pre-panel,
5 Ms. Torres.

6 AIXA TORRES: Good afternoon everyone,
7 chairman-- woman Avilés and all the Council Members.
8 Today, I'm not going to use all the titles that I
9 hold. I am going to talk to you as Aixa Torres, a
10 resident of Alfred E. Smith Houses and the needs that
11 the residents have in terms of the realities. First
12 of all, the need for having residents have more input
13 into NYCHA in terms of decisions that are made, and
14 even though resident engagement and I have a good
15 relationship-- I actually chair-- and I'll use this
16 title. As the CCOP member, I chair the Resident
17 Engagement Committee, and we have been working hand-
18 in-hand with the resident engagement staff to do a
19 guide, to do a template for the bylaws, looking at
20 bylaws for those resident associations that are not
21 incorporated and those that are incorporated. And so
22 there has been a dialogue. However, when we deal
23 with our apartments, right, and we deal with the
24 quality of life that we have-- and I just buried like
25 three people in Smith. One of them definitely 9/11

1 cancer. There were things that were not done. There
2 has to be a better understanding of each development
3 and their needs. Going to RAD is not going to help.
4 Going to PACT is not going to help. Doing the Trust
5 is not going to help. What we do need, all that
6 money that is being spent should go into resident
7 training management to give the residents the power
8 to make educated decisions about our developments and
9 the quality of life that we have, and I say this very
10 humbly, that I have been fortunate that I have
11 residents who are knowledgeable, who support the
12 resident association, and so we've been able to do a
13 lot of things in Smith. But at the end of the day,
14 we still need those kind of trainings, and I think
15 that the money would be best spent in teaching us
16 about resident management, teaching us those things
17 that are hands-on. And also, understanding, right,
18 that residents from public housing are human beings,
19 and that, you know, we pay taxes. A lot of residents
20 in Alfred E. Smith have served this country. Some
21 have died. And so I say all of this to say that we
22 can work-- we can do you and us. A lot of times for
23 Smith Houses, it's been you and us with NYCHA, and
24 then we've had moments where it's been a "we", and
25

1
2 it's been wonderful, right? And I would hope that
3 that's the kind of work that we can do moving
4 forward. However, we have to be as the 964, and
5 that's the whole thing about Section 9. Regulations
6 say we have to be part of that process from
7 conception, and when we ae from the conception, you'd
8 be surprised. And for the record, we have a Supreme
9 Court Justice that came out of public housing. I can
10 tell you so many people that have come out of public
11 housing who have been productive citizens, that it
12 is-- you know, it's beyond my 10 fingers, right? And
13 so that being said, I think that the new
14 Administration, right, needs to remember that and
15 read-- and really treat us with respect in terms of
16 what knowledge we hold. I have lived in public
17 housing for 60 years. Everybody's story is different
18 of why I still live in public housing, but the
19 reality of it is, that as a retired person on a
20 pension and social security, I cannot afford anything
21 but public housing, so that I can live decently with
22 quality of life, and I think that people need to
23 understand that. And I ask the Council, when you
24 give money, please-- to the developments-- make sure
25 that some of it-- and you make your decisions besides

1
2 the repairs and things like that-- that you actually
3 do for resident management, for those of who think or
4 know that we can actually manage our own developments
5 and make better decisions than a manager who never
6 been inside our apartments or ever lived in public
7 housing to make those decisions. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much,
9 Ms. Torres. You bring up two very important points.
10 When it's an "us" it works and it feels good, and
11 that is what we are striving for. It should be more
12 of an "us" charting forward in a similar path. And
13 also, thank you for hitting on resident managed
14 corporations and the need for investment in the
15 residents. Again, greatest asset the NYCHA has at
16 its disposal, and I look forward to hearing more from
17 the authority around how it's going to invest-- I'm
18 sorry, I'm hearing-- how it's going to invest in its
19 residents and then in other forms as well, such as
20 resident managed corporations. So thank you so much.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Alright, we'll now
22 have the representatives of NYCHA come up to be sworn
23 in. If you all could just raise your hand, I'll swear
24 you in, and then if you could state your name and
25 your title for the record, that would be great.

1
2 Please raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell
3 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
4 in your testimony before this committee and to
5 respond honestly to Council Member questions? And
6 then if you could just identify yourself and your
7 title for the record, that'd be great.

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:

9 Jonathan Gouveia, Executive Vice President of Real
10 Estate Development.

11 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Lisa

12 Bova-Hiatt, I'm NYCHA Chief Executive Officer.

13 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Vlada Kenniff,

14 President of Public Housing Preservation Trust.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You may begin.

16 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT:

17 Thank you. Chair Alexa Avilés, members of the
18 Committee on Public Housing, other distinguished
19 members of the City Council, NYCHA residents,
20 community advocates, and members of the public, good
21 afternoon. I'm Lisa Bova-Hiatt, NYCHA's Chief
22 Executive Officer. I am pleased to be joined by Vlada
23 Kenniff, President of the NYC Public Housing
24 Preservation Trust, and Jonathan Gouveia, NYCHA's
25 Executive Vice President for Real Estate Development.

1
2 Thank you for this opportunity to discuss our mission
3 to bring billions of dollars of desperately needed
4 investment to residents' homes. These critical
5 efforts will improve the quality of life for NYCHA
6 families today and for the generations to come, and
7 they will ensure that we remain a bastion of
8 affordable housing in our city. I would like to
9 acknowledge the comments that you will hear and have
10 heard from residents who are benefitting from this
11 work. Every day my colleagues and I strive to make a
12 difference for the families we serve, and this is
13 exactly the impact we're endeavoring to make. Every
14 NYCHA stakeholder is painfully aware of the need to
15 take action now with bold and innovative housing
16 preservation programs. There are currently more than
17 \$78 billion worth of capital needs across our
18 portfolio, as manifested daily- to the detriment of
19 residents- by leaking roofs, bursting pipes, failing
20 heating systems, inoperable elevators, and mold and
21 lead that needs abating. Simply put, we need more
22 federal funding to provide residents the quality of
23 life they deserve. Today I'll provide an overview of
24 our plans to address these significant needs and
25 issues through the Trust, PACT, and our capital

1 investment program, strategies that will strengthen
2 communities and ensure the longevity of public
3 housing in New York City. Our housing preservation
4 programs comprehensively renovate residents' homes
5 while ensuring that residents retain all their rights
6 and protections, including permanently affordable
7 rent. These strategies also keep our developments
8 public and make resident engagement a key focus of
9 the process. The New York City Public Housing
10 Preservation Trust is an exciting, first-of-its-kind
11 path for public housing. The Trust, a public agency
12 that was created last year and signed into law by
13 Governor Kathy Hochul, will completely transform the
14 homes of up to 25,000 NYCHA families, subject to
15 residents' votes. Under the Trust model, NYCHA
16 remains the permanent owner of the land and
17 buildings. NYCHA enters into a long-term ground
18 lease with the Trust while residents convert to
19 Section 8 project-based vouchers, a subsidy worth
20 double NYCHA's current federal subsidy. Similar to
21 how other government entities raise revenue for
22 capital improvements, the Trust will secure financing
23 to fund comprehensive building renovations, guided by
24 input and partnership from residents at the
25

1 development. Additionally, the Trust can employ
2 procurement enhancements like design-build or
3 construction manager at risk to bring better value to
4 residents. After the renovations, the Trust will
5 work with NYCHA to operate the properties, preserving
6 the municipal workforce, many of whom are NYCHA
7 residents. Resident participation is a fundamental
8 component of the Trust's establishing framework.
9 Residents will have a true role in deciding the
10 future of their homes. From the very beginning,
11 residents were involved in shaping the legislation
12 that established the Trust as well as the procedures
13 for the voting process required by the legislation.
14 Starting next month, residents of our first voting
15 site, Nostrand Houses, will be able to decide whether
16 they want to have their developments renovated
17 through the Trust or PACT, or whether they want to
18 remain in the current Section 9 program. Residents
19 will be able to vote online, by mail, or in person.
20 As outlined in the Trust voting procedures, the 30-
21 day voting period follows a 100-day resident
22 engagement period where residents can get any
23 questions answered in a series of meetings and events
24 at their development. As of today, we have had
25

1 individual conversations with over 67 percent of
2 eligible voters through door-knocking, phone-banking,
3 meetings, and events. We even opened a dedicated
4 office at Nostrand to assist and inform residents.
5 It's an exciting moment, and we look forward to
6 announcing additional voting sites soon. While we've
7 been engaging Nostrand residents on this historic
8 vote, we've been building the infrastructure of the
9 Trust as a public agency. Earlier this year, Mayor
10 Adams and NYCHA appointed seven members of the Trust
11 Board, including two residents. Last month, the
12 Trust Board appointed Vlada Kenniff as President of
13 the Trust. Ms. Kenniff, who spearheaded critical
14 sustainability advancements while serving as NYCHA's
15 Senior Vice President for Sustainability, is
16 overseeing the Trust's day-to-day operations.
17 Jillian McLaughlin, who previously served as NYCHA's
18 Deputy Chief of Staff, recently joined the Trust as
19 its Chief Operating Officer. Lisa Lim, a veteran in
20 the sphere of real estate law and affordable housing,
21 and also a NYCHA alum, was selected as the Trust's
22 General Counsel. The PACT program also leverages the
23 more dependable and lucrative Section 8 funding
24 stream to comprehensively renovate residents' homes,
25

1 providing them with brand-new kitchens, bathrooms,
2 windows, and apartment floors; updated common areas
3 and building systems such as elevators, boilers,
4 roofs, windows, and facades; and improved grounds,
5 including landscaping, lighting, security, and
6 playgrounds. In addition to comprehensive repairs and
7 building updates, including the abatement of
8 environmental hazards, our PACT partners bring
9 residents professional property management and
10 enhanced on-site social services and community
11 programming. After conversion, all PACT developments
12 remain under public control. NYCHA remains the
13 permanent owner of the land and buildings,
14 administers the Section 8 subsidy, and continues to
15 monitor conditions at a development following its
16 conversion to Section 8. Under PACT, residents keep
17 all their rights and protections, including
18 permanently affordable rent, succession rights, and
19 the right to organize. NYCHA ensures that residents
20 are involved at every step of the PACT planning
21 process. To keep residents informed and answer any
22 questions, we host regular meetings, including
23 monthly meetings with resident associations, and
24 conduct tabling, office hours, open houses,
25

1 information sessions, and workshops. A PACT Resource
2 Team is available to support residents by connecting
3 them with trusted, third-party advisors and
4 consultants, and free legal assistance is available
5 to residents via a PACT hotline operated by the Legal
6 Aid Society. And we seek resident expertise and
7 input to plan investments based on resident
8 priorities. Starting in 2020, resident leaders now
9 select the developers, general contractors, property
10 managers, and social services providers who will
11 elevate their quality of life. In 2023 alone,
12 resident leaders across 30 developments, representing
13 over 14,000 residents, have selected PACT partner
14 teams to provide their communities with tailored
15 investments through the program. Together, our
16 partners and residents have started to create
17 detailed community plans to memorialize their
18 planning and decision-making during the pre-
19 development process. Overall, 138 NYCHA developments
20 comprising more than 37,000 apartments are in pre-
21 development, are under construction, or have
22 completed construction through the PACT program. We
23 are on track to comprehensively modernize a total of
24 62,000 apartments through PACT, dramatically
25

1 improving the quality of life for more than 142,000
2 residents. As Betances Houses Resident Association
3 President Sabrina Hill once told us, "When PACT came
4 in, it changed a lot of our lives. Everything was
5 upgraded, from the bath fittings to the cabinets to
6 the kitchen, the flooring. It's been amazing. I
7 feel that due to the change, this is a better way of
8 living. It's a big shift, and we love where we are."
9 This sentiment is shared by residents across our
10 portfolio whose homes have been completely
11 rehabilitated through PACT. NYCHA has worked with an
12 external consultant to survey residents at those
13 developments over the past year, and residents have
14 expressed strong satisfaction with the renovations to
15 their apartments, buildings, and grounds. The
16 majority of residents who responded to the survey
17 have also expressed satisfaction with their new
18 property management company. We are committed to
19 evolving the program and changing our approach to
20 engagement and oversight as we hear directly from
21 residents about what is working and what we can
22 improve. At the same time we're pursuing these vital
23 housing preservation initiatives, we're putting the
24 capital funding we receive to good use for residents,
25

1 investing more than \$1 billion annually over the next
2 several years through a range of capital programs.

3 While it's a fraction of the needs, this work
4 complements our PACT and Trust efforts to repair and
5 preserve residents' homes in the near term, upgrading
6 hundreds of roofs and heating, elevator, and waste
7 management systems, installing CCTV, lighting, and
8 other security and safety enhancements at many of our
9 properties, abating lead-based paint in thousands of
10 apartments, and completing comprehensive
11 modernization of several of our large properties.

12 The majority of our properties are more than a half
13 century old and have not received the regular
14 investment that all buildings need. Making piecemeal
15 fixes is neither sufficient nor sustainable, and we
16 must use every tool and resource available to improve
17 residents' quality of life. By comprehensively
18 renovating our buildings, transforming them into
19 brand-new homes, we can wipe out the ever-escalating
20 repair backlogs, provide safe and healthy homes, and
21 implement the latest sustainable technologies,
22 benefitting not just residents but our city as a
23 whole, all while providing jobs and other economic
24 opportunities for the community. The future of
25

1 public housing in New York depends upon the actions
2 we're taking now. It is indeed a pivotal moment at
3 the Authority, and we appreciate your support as we
4 continue down this path of stronger communities and
5 longevity for public housing. Of course, we will
6 continue to work closely with our partners, including
7 residents and the Council, as we make progress.
8 NYCHA is committed to transparency, it's one of our
9 guiding principles, and we look forward to
10 collaborating with the Council on Intros 646 and 648,
11 regarding NYCHA's PACT program and vacant units.
12 Thank you, and we are happy to answer any questions
13 you may have.

15 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much
16 for your testimony. I'd like to acknowledge Council
17 Member Sanchez, and we will actually start off with
18 our colleague's questions, because I know you have
19 many places to go. We're going to start with Council
20 Member De La Rosa.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you so
22 much, Chair Avilés, for allowing us to ask questions
23 first, and thank you the residents who testified and
24 to NYCHA for being here. I did have a question about
25 air rights. I mean, that is a question that we get

1
2 often when we're in our communities in terms of what
3 are the sites that have been identified. What are
4 the plans for air rights, and if that is a
5 conversation that is occurring, what is the expected
6 revenue at all for the sale of air rights across
7 NYCHA properties?

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Sure.

9 To-date, we've closed three air rights transactions,
10 and it is certainly a valuable source of revenue that
11 can be put back into the host community when we sell
12 air rights. They are complicated to use. You need a
13 receiving site, and a lot of our developments are
14 within, you know, they take up the entire block, so
15 they're not a lot of receiving sites, but where there
16 are opportunities where we share a block with an
17 adjacent land owner, there are opportunities to talk
18 about air right sales. So there are a couple of
19 discussions that we're having right now. We always
20 include residents. We want to understand what their
21 priorities are in terms of how to use the proceeds,
22 and so we should be announcing a few in the coming
23 months, but there's not a huge pipeline of those
24 deals at this time.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Okay, thank
3 you for answering that question. Around the same
4 line, is there-- what is the type of background work
5 and due diligence that happens when you all are
6 picking developers to work with? I know in my
7 community, for example, there was a rezoning a few
8 years back, and some of the developers,
9 unfortunately, have records of not only exploiting
10 workers but also dangerous construction sites. So
11 I'm interested in knowing, sort of, what is the due
12 diligence that is happening when you all pick
13 developers?

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Do you
15 mean specifically for air rights, or just generally?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: In general
17 for PACT and RAD and these types of projects.

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: sure.
19 So what we've been doing over the last few years is
20 actually, I think, pretty robust. We do a--
21 basically a three-step process. The first is a pre-
22 qualification process. So we-- every year we open up
23 that process, and we have prospective developers as
24 well as general contractors and property managers
25 submit their qualifications to NYCHA. We review

1 those qualifications and they're either then pre-
2 qualified or not, and if they are-- make it to that
3 pre-qualification list, then we draw from that list
4 when we're putting out a request for expressions of
5 interest, primarily for the PACT projects. From
6 there, when we are contemplating a PACT project at a
7 specific site, we are working with residents, and as
8 our CEO mentioned, now residents review with us.
9 Well, first, they actually inform some of what goes
10 into the procurement. So we hear from them what they
11 need and they want and that's built into the
12 procurement. Then during the actually process,
13 they're reviewing proposals, and they also interview
14 prospective respondents with us, and we take them on
15 tours of work that's been completed by development
16 teams that have either done PACT projects or if they
17 haven't done NYCHA work yet, we take them to sites
18 where-- the residents can see up close and personal
19 what kind of work they've done, and then jointly we
20 make those selections.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: One last
23 question if I may, around tenant engagement. I know
24 that in your testimony you were robust about saying
25 in all the places where tenants can give their

1 feedback and are welcome to give their feedback, but
2 it still seems on the ground when I'm talking to
3 residents, that there is a lot of fear and a lot of
4 hesitation with some of the PACT and RAD projects.
5 So, what do you feel has worked in terms of resident
6 engagement, and what hasn't in order to understand
7 the push-- why the pushback continues? I think some
8 of the questions that some of the tenant-- the
9 resident panels brought up are legitimate ones, and
10 so, you know, as a Council Member it's difficult for
11 us to support projects if our constituents and
12 residents of those developments do not. And so how
13 do we reconcile that?

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So, I
15 would recognize that the projects, the developments
16 that have gone through PACT in your district, it is
17 true, it was from an older era when we would put out
18 a procurement and we would do the review and make the
19 selection on our own. So if you're hearing from
20 residents in those developments, that is certainly
21 accurate. Those procurements would have gone out
22 around 2019. Since that time, we've been doing what,
23 you know, you heard from our CEO and what I
24 reiterates. So I think, again, having the residents
25

1
2 involved early on so that they help shape the
3 procurements and have them help. You know, again,
4 review the proposals, interview respondents has been
5 tremendously beneficial for us as a process, but also
6 for the residents.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, I'd like to
8 follow up on the air rights questions. Can you-- can
9 you tell us what three transactions have cleared,
10 where?

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
12 Manhattanville, Ingersoll, and Hobbs Court.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Where [inaudible] [off
14 mic]

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
16 Manhattanville, Ingersoll, and Hobbs Court.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Where is Hobbs
18 Court?

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
20 Manhattan, upper Manhattan.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Upper Manhattan,
22 okay. And you mentioned that there are a couple in
23 the pipeline. Can you talk more specifically about
24 that? Like, how many-- actually, let me take a step
25

1 back. How many of, in those three transactions,
2 square feet of air rights were sold?

3 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: How
4 many square feet? I can give you-- I can send you
5 the actual square footages when we-- after the
6 hearing. But in terms of dollar value, it's about
7 \$55 million in the aggregate between all three.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And so is-- I guess
9 for, let's say, Ingersoll, whatever the portion of
10 that sale for Ingersoll, is that going directly back
11 to the--

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
13 [interposing] Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Ingersoll
15 development?

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Our
17 commitment is to always put the dollars back into the
18 host community.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And then who decides
20 how that money gets deployed with--

21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
22 [interposing] We work with resident leadership to
23 identify the priorities, and obviously, you know, we
24 have a sense of what the needs are so we want to make
25

1
2 sure that it's addressing, you know, a fundamental
3 need within the development.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And how much of air
5 rights are kind of in the pipeline, or being explored
6 to be sold?

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
8 again, we do have a lot of-- it's been well-
9 documented that we have a lot of underutilized
10 development rights. The trick is how to actually use
11 them, right? Again, when we have a lot of our
12 developments that are essentially super blocks and we
13 are the prime land owner, there's no receiving site
14 to sell them to. So there are a handful of sites
15 where we share a block with an adjacent land owner or
16 multiple adjacent land owners, and there may be an
17 opportunity to have those conversations. So they're
18 not that many opportunities to sell air rights.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Do you have a
20 specific number of projects that you're actively
21 working on in terms of preparing for sale?

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: There's
23 one right now which I-- is pretty public. We're
24 working with the residents of Campos Plaza on both a
25

1
2 PACT project as well as sale of air rights to an
3 adjacent land owner.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay. I'm sorry, I
5 got-- it goes in and out-- I guess [inaudible]
6 Council Member Ossé.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Thank you Chair
8 Avilés and good afternoon. I wanted to start off by
9 asking-- I represent the 36th District which includes
10 the neighborhoods of Bed-Stuy and northern Crown
11 Heights, and I wanted to ask-- because there's been a
12 lot of chatter in many different NYCHA developments
13 that I represent-- are there any developments in my
14 district that are being considered for RAD/PACT or
15 Trust conversion?

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
17 within your district, the Brooklyn bundle closed and
18 it was completed as of a couple of years ago. I
19 believe you're aware that we're at the cusp of
20 actually closing the Reid Park Rock consolidation
21 which should happen actually in a couple of weeks,
22 and then there's also Ocean Hill Stuy Gardens which
23 we would expect to close in later 2024.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: That's you. Yeah,
25 that's you. That's not my district, but thank you

1
2 for that. But are any currently in talks? Is there
3 any engagement going on in any of my other
4 developments?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Not at
6 this time.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Not at this time,
8 okay. And you'll notify my office when that will
9 potentially happen?

10 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Okay, thank you.

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: And
13 just to clarify, there are some buildings within Reid
14 Park Rock that fall into both of your districts, so
15 that's why-- I mean, I was answering that question.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Right.

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: But
18 some of them are also in your district.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Right. I also
20 wanted to ask, what savings has NYCHA incurred with
21 RAD/PACT and Trust conversions?

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
23 with the deals that we've closed, we are addressing
24 several billion dollars' worth of physical needs.
25 So, you know, those are liabilities that would

1
2 otherwise be on NYCHA to address, and the ongoing
3 operations and maintenance.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: So you would say
5 that there are savings that are going towards
6 investing into other developments, perhaps?

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
8 Absolutely.

9 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: The
10 money that we've received from our PACT conversions
11 is being used for operating, our operating needs
12 given the lack of sufficient funding that we get from
13 Section 9, from the federal government.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Is there a total
15 amount of savings that you've all calculated since
16 you started instituting the RAD/PACT conversions?

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So, the
18 deals that we have closed-- so this is everything
19 where the construction's complete or construction's
20 underway is addressing about \$4 billion worth of
21 physical needs. So, that is a proxy for what we are
22 saving, to your question.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: So, you know, I've
24 heard from many of my constituents and even on some
25 of the panels that we've heard from today that, you

1 know, folks are opposed to the RAD/PACT conversions
2 with the NYCHA developments, and I understand that I
3 guess the meaning for NYCHA to move in this direction
4 is a lack of capital funds that it would need or
5 would take to restore many of the NYCHA developments
6 that we have across the City. Has NYCHA or has the
7 agency looked into the Infrastructure and Jobs Act,
8 the bi-partisan infrastructure bill that President
9 Joe Biden passed last year, and any of the funds that
10 will be going towards public housing, both in the
11 needs of capital investment as well as in jobs
12 training. I don't remember the young lady's-- the
13 young lady who testified earlier about job training
14 for NYCHA residents, specifically, but I think it
15 would be a great idea to explore the monies that
16 exist there coming from the federal government. Has
17 there been any conversation that NYCHA's had with,
18 you know, our state partners, with our federal
19 partners, with HUD specifically, in bringing that
20 money down. I think it was a trillion dollars that
21 was allocated towards infrastructure jobs.

22
23 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Thank you for that
24 question, and I'll answer it in my previous capacity
25 as the Senior Vice President for Sustainability.

1
2 Before I left, we've been able to secure
3 approximately over \$180 million through the various
4 IRA and grants related to micro-mobility
5 infrastructure, green infrastructure. So to the
6 extent that we're able to maximize every application
7 that we could submit, I believe we submitted 22
8 applications for various grants on all levels. Some
9 of it actually did go to what we called and continue
10 to call the Clean Energy Academy.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Right.

12 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: So, to answer your
13 question, we-- NYCHA has tried its best and will
14 continue to try its best to pursue all grants that
15 are out there.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Have you secured
17 any funding from any of those applications yet, or--

18 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: [interposing] About
19 \$180 million.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: \$180 billion, wow.
21 Through HUD or to NYCHA?

22 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Million, \$180
23 million.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Million, oh.
25

2 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: I wish it was
3 billion, then we wouldn't have--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: [interposing] I got
5 excited for a second.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: We wouldn't be sitting her.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Yeah.

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
9 Council Member--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: [interposing] I
11 know.

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yeah,
13 that was the--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: That would be
15 amazing. Keep on working hard, you guys. You're
16 almost there.

17 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So, Council
18 Member, all the testimonies--

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: [interposing] Sorry,
20 just one second. I have to swear you in.

21 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Oh, sure,
22 I'm sorry.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Could you please
24 raise your right hand? Do you affirm to tell the
25 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in

1
2 your testimony before this committee and to respond
3 honestly to Council Member questions?

4 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yes. My
5 name is Brian Honan. I'm Senior Vice President for
6 Intergovernmental Relations for NYCHA. Council
7 Member, all the testimony I heard from residents, I
8 totally understand. These are very complicated
9 programs. Many residents have lived in public
10 housing, some of them for their whole life, some of
11 them for decades. This is the program that they
12 know. This is the program that has provided them with
13 stability, and we are asking them to have a lot of
14 trust in an agency that, let's face it, for years has
15 not been trustworthy. And so we're asking them to
16 take a big leap of faith in a program that is
17 complicated. But you know, for residents who have
18 gone through this program-- in Council Member Mealy's
19 district, I remember about 10 years ago we invested
20 in Saratoga Square which is a senior development
21 which has totally been transformed, and to this date,
22 10 years later it still looks beautiful. Council
23 Member Restler's district, Independence, Williams,
24 Warren Street, all these developments that, you know,
25 it is now today almost the end of October and I have

1
2 not heard from the resident there about heat once,
3 which is amazing because usually I would have been
4 out there several times a week, because they had a
5 mobile boiler for over a decade. In Council Member
6 Sanchez's district, I was just with Ms. Williams at
7 Bailey Houses where she said she was going to leave
8 NYCHA if not for RAD/PACT, and now she feels hopeful
9 for the first time. In your district at Armstrong,
10 the development was eating itself alive from the mold
11 inside of it, and today the residents there open up
12 their doors proudly to show us their apartments. This
13 program is scary, because it's a big change, but I
14 dare anybody to show me a development that has gone
15 through the program after all the construction is
16 done, and show me a development where you say things
17 were better before.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Could we-- sorry,
19 I'm done after this. Can we schedule a walk-through
20 of Armstrong Houses--

21 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: We can,
22 yeah.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: [interposing]
24 together. I would love to--

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Definitely, would love to do it.

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: go do that with you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you, Brian. I'd think that needs to be reframed a little bit. Better than before when it's really bad is not a good comparison. I understand your point, right? There are improvements, and we have to acknowledge where there are improvements and residents are living a better life that they deserve in a unit that is healthy and worthy of them so. You know, we want to acknowledge where there have been absolute improvements and supports. But those stories bring no consolation to those residents who are in conversion processes or who haven't been converted at all who are sitting there, right? And those are the residents and units that we are deeply concerned. And so, yes, we have to acknowledge where there have been improvements and a lot of hard work put in for sure. But daring to somebody to say they wouldn't go back to what it was before, knowing it was terrible before, is like a-- not [inaudible]

1
2 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:

3 [interposing] And Council Member, maybe-- I'm
4 definitely under seeding [sic] it, but you know, some
5 of these developments-- Betances was mentioned
6 earlier. Baychester was mentioned earlier. These
7 are model places to live now, and if you look at the
8 places, you know, and they're not only like the best
9 NYCHA complexes around their area, in some cases
10 they're the best housing complexes around the area.
11 These are places that people are proud to live in.
12 One story I tell over and over again, you know,
13 somebody told me now, "I'm the one who hosts the
14 holidays, you know, in my apartment now. I never was
15 able to do that before. Why? Because I'm so proud
16 of where I live."

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Definitely sounds
18 like stories I've heard of NYCHA in the past, for
19 sure, before all PACT conversions. Let's move on to
20 Council Member Restler.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Firstly, thank
22 you Chair Avilés for your leadership and always
23 holding exactly the right hearings on the most
24 important topics, and appreciate the opportunity to
25 ask questions. Am I supposed to call you President,

1
2 or? What am I-- I feel like I've called you Chair
3 forever, and now there's a different Chair and I
4 don't know what to do.

5 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT:

6 Everyone loves to call me Chair. But I-- you can
7 just call me Lisa. That would be probably the
8 easiest.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: But not

10 president?

11 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Not

12 President.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Alright.

14 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: You

15 can call Vlada the president.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I can call Vlada

17 president. Well, I'll call you Ms. Bova-Hiatt for

18 the purpose of this hearing, and if you come up with

19 a better way for me to respect you, please let me

20 know. Firstly, thank you for coming to testify today

21 on this important topic, and congratulations on

22 bringing Julian [sic] back to NYCHA and to city

23 government. She's one of the most talented and

24 dedicated people I know. I have been incredibly

25 impressed by Vlada's work on sustainability, and I've

1 said at this committee many times that I feel like
2 NYCHA's doing the most innovative work around
3 sustainability of any city agency. So, you're going
4 to have to continue to prioritize that at the Trust,
5 and I hope this is continued to be a major priority
6 across the Housing Authority. So it's-- that we're
7 not robbing Peter to pay Paul on this one. But
8 congratulations on the appointment. Looks like
9 you're building a great team at the Trust. I am
10 hopeful and optimistic in the Trust as a model, but
11 I'd like to focus to my questions today about RAD and
12 PACT. As Brian so eloquently mentioned-- and that
13 was a great speech Brian. I hope that you guys put a
14 recording of that online. I was like, you know, I got
15 a little teary on that one. But you've been doing
16 this a long time and you do it well. The-- you know,
17 my concern is the unevenness in RAD and PACT. You're
18 bringing a lot of different developers. Some of them
19 I think are doing good work and are responsive to
20 tenants. Others, I'm concerned, are not, and I'm
21 just trying to understand-- you know, we look at Open
22 Data violations and see several developments with
23 persistent violations that are very concerning. A
24 fair amount of money has been put into those
25

1
2 developments already on the renovations, but how are
3 you all effectively monitoring ongoing issues
4 relating to mold, failing elevators, pest
5 infestations, and making sure that we're holding the
6 less good actors accountable? Because look, I don't
7 trust any developers ever, that's just my rule in
8 approaching the world. And inherently some are going
9 to do a less good job than others. So how are you
10 making sure that the folks that are doing a less good
11 job are performing? And just the corollary question-
12 - and this is an area that's frustrating to me, and
13 Brian always gets surprised when I say this, but some
14 of my RAD and PACT operators are not as responsive to
15 tenant concerns around repairs and day-to-day issues
16 as they're accustomed to, and it's been frustrating
17 that they can't get a hold of the staff in the right
18 ways. And so these are areas where I think there's
19 opportunities for critical improvement. I'm actually
20 just going to keep asking my questions, because I
21 think Jonathan can keep track of this stuff as I'm
22 going, and I know "not chair" Ms. Bova-Hiatt can as
23 well. The other things I just wanted to ask are, can
24 you confirm that all NYCHA RAD/PACT developments are
25 guaranteed a right to counsel for tenants that are

1
2 eligible for it. And the other thing that I'm
3 concerned about is, we are seeing that-- we want to
4 make sure that tenants in our RAD/PACT developments
5 are afforded the same rights as NYCHA tenants are.
6 And I've been-- firstly, I wanted to make sure that
7 NYCHA-- first thing I'd like to ask that NYCHA
8 revisit the transfer system for RAD and PACT. If a
9 tenant who's living in Jonathan Williams wants to
10 transfer, they're really limited in what they can do.
11 What we had agreed, as Brian will remember and
12 Jonathan will remember was that between Berry and
13 Johnathan and Independence in Williamsburg that you'd
14 be able to transfer between them. We have not seen
15 that happen. We'd also been told that there'd be a
16 priority for Brooklyn residency after years of
17 negotiation. That has not happened as far as I can
18 tell. So those are two areas of localized concern in
19 south Williamsburg. But more broadly, giving
20 somebody a voucher and saying good luck is not the
21 same as helping somebody transfer within the NYCHA
22 system, and I believe that these developments, RAD
23 and PACT developments, are still part of the NYCHA
24 family, as I think you do too, and so I really hope
25 that you'll revisit transfer policies so that

1
2 somebody who wants to leave Jonathan Williams and
3 stay within the NYCHA system can move, whether it be
4 to a Trust development with Nostrand or to a NYCHA
5 Development at Taylor Wythe, whether the heck it may
6 be. So, I just asked a lot of questions because I've
7 already gone over time and I'm still over time. So
8 if you could try to do your best to answer them all
9 I'd greatly appreciate it.

10 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Okay,
11 so in terms of construction quality and ongoing
12 maintenance-- in 2020 we established a number of
13 teams within both the real estate group and within
14 NYCHA to ensure compliance. Within real estate
15 there's an asset management team and a design and
16 construction team. Both of those teams are
17 constantly looking to ensure that a minimum standard
18 is applied in terms of the construction across, so we
19 wanted to make sure that there wasn't variation from
20 development to the development. And it is true, some
21 of the early projects you will likely see some
22 variation because those teams did not exist.
23 Certainly, from 2020 and going forward, that is the
24 focus. We want to make sure that there's a common set
25 of materials used, construction processes, etcetera

1 across the portfolio, and then that construction
2 team, design and construction team also has folks
3 that are going out every single day doing inspections
4 and making sure that the construction is-- you know,
5 fulfills our expectations. On the asset management
6 side, we require monthly reporting on a whole range
7 of issues: tickets, resolution on those tickets,
8 legal proceedings and alike. So we are making sure
9 that the developers are-- and the ongoing property
10 managers are responding to the needs of the buildings
11 either during construction or post-construction and
12 to the stabilization period like the developments in
13 your district are. And I will say, one of the things
14 that we've done is we've established a number of
15 thresholds, you know, particularly challenging areas,
16 the pillar areas that are part of our HUD agreement.
17 So, pests, molds, leaks, etcetera, all of those have
18 been-- all of the metrics that we use have been
19 harmonized with what we apply to NYCHA. So there is
20 no disadvantage to being in the PACT program. It is
21 the same as being within conventional NYCHA. And we
22 track every month. So if we're noticing that, you
23 know, there's an uptick in work orders or resolution
24 time is slowing down, we have conversations with the
25

1
2 development teams. It has been said in prior hearings
3 we have the ability to replace property managers if
4 we need to. We have not come to that yet, but we
5 will if have to.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: But you haven't
7 done so in any--

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
9 [interposing] We've not had an occasion yet to do
10 that.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Or push to
12 replace staff if there's staffing issues or push the
13 development teams to invest more resources? I mean,
14 it's just-- it'd be helpful if you could demonstrate
15 accountability for the folks that you don't are doing
16 as good of job as they should be. I-- as Brian said,
17 everyone's taking a leap of faith with this program.
18 There's a ton of push-back. Some developers, and I
19 see it in my district, I think have done a good job.
20 I get very few complaints. I'm very happy that
21 there's no heating issues in Independence, but that
22 doesn't mean the tenants are happy with the
23 conditions day-to-day, and I feel like we don't have
24 the mechanisms for accountability that we used to
25 with NYCHA to really push you all. It's a lot harder

1
2 to do it with a third party, and how are you
3 demonstrating that you're holding them accountable?
4 What record do you have at this point, three years
5 in, to show that accountability?

6 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
7 we do-- I mean, I don't want to get into personnel
8 and HR matters, but I can say that before we get to
9 the point of removing a partner, we do have those
10 kinds of conversations. We have had issues where--
11 and again, I'm not going to get into specific
12 personnel matters-- but where we had conversations
13 about staff needs to be replaced because they're not
14 serving the residents. So if there's still
15 persistent problems in the developments in your area,
16 we can have a conversation and surface those and have
17 those conversations with the PACT partner.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I just think it
19 would be helpful. If you're going to persuade
20 everybody that we should supportive of this.
21 Demonstrating how you're holding developers
22 accountable who may not be living up to our
23 collective expectations would be helpful. Without
24 naming names or giving specific examples of the
25 developments, you know, and the team. Showing what

1
2 you've done to improve the responsiveness and the
3 condition would mean a lot, and I'd strongly
4 encourage you to think about how you can give those
5 examples to the committee and to the public moving
6 forward to demonstrate that you're taking this
7 seriously.

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Thank
9 you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And then just on
11 right to counsel, transfers, both within the three
12 Brooklyn south Williamsburg developments and
13 transfers more broadly, if you could comment on those
14 briefly. I'm sorry Chair Avilés.

15 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT:
16 Sure. PACT residents like any other tenants do have
17 the right to counsel. And your section with respect
18 to taking-- the transfer system.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Transfers both
20 broadly for a night-- for a RAD and PACT tenant to be
21 able to transfer another NYCHA development. I think
22 that policy should be revisited. Is that's something
23 you'd be open to considering? And then--

24 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT:
25 [interposing] Yes, that's the-- the simple question

1
2 is yes, we are taking a very hard look at our
3 transfer system, and are absolutely open to expanding
4 the parameters within which a resident can. So more
5 on that.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Great. We
7 appreciate that. and then lastly, as Mr. Gross [sic]
8 walks into the room on cue, the transfers-- my tenant
9 association president from Jonathan Williams--
10 transfers between the three South Williamsburg
11 RAD/PACT developments, Jonathan Williams,
12 Independence, and Berry [inaudible] and the Brooklyn
13 preference upon vacancy, were two things that we
14 negotiated quite painstakingly over a period of
15 years, but haven't yet seen incorporated into the
16 policies of NYCHA and the RAD and PACT operator.

17 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I
18 think we can follow up with you on that separately.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: We look forward
20 to it. Thank you.

21 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT:
22 Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Just to follow up
24 very quickly-- thank you Council Member. Is there a
25 current policy that is developed for all RAD/PACT

1
2 bundles or-- in terms of transferring, or is it
3 dependent on the boroughs?

4 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: No,
5 not at this time.

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Council Member
7 Mealy?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Hi, and
9 congratulations, and I want to concur with my
10 colleague. Brian Honan really did a great job on
11 that. But I have a couple of questions, and I hope I
12 can get them answered quickly. I have to talk about
13 the Trust. In your statement, Chair, you said the
14 Trust will work with NYCHA to operate properties,
15 preserving municipal workforce, many of whom are
16 NYCHA residents. Arthur Warren [sp?], he's not in my
17 district, but he calls all the time and say NYCHA no
18 longer gives the community the jobs that is supposed
19 to be set aside for NYCHA employee-- NYCHA residents.
20 How is that program going? How many of NYCHA
21 residents getting some of these jobs on these
22 contracts with these developers?

23 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Thank you
24 so much for that question, Council Member. And I
25 know Mr. Warren very well. He's had me out to his

1 development in Long Island Baptist plenty of times.
2 And so with the Trust, the Trust is going to retain
3 the municipal workforce. Those are NYCHA workers.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But how many
5 workers are the residents?

6 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yeah, so--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] What
8 was the name of-- it's a number to that program.
9 What's the name of it?

10 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So, Section
11 3.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Section 3. He
13 harassed me on that.

14 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So, about
15 22 percent of NYCHA workers are also residents. So--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Do
17 you have a breakdown on that, because--

18 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:
19 [interposing] We can provide--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Just
21 with Long Island Baptist.

22 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Oh, for Long
23 Island Baptist.
24
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I haven't gotten
3 any from my district.

4 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yeah, so
5 Mr. Warren-- what Mr. Warren complains about-- he
6 just had a new boiler placed, you know, in his
7 development, and he's looking for new hires on the
8 capital work, and so--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But isn't that
10 section should have been doing it years--

11 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:
12 [interposing] Correct, yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: ago? And this is
14 not one year he been calling me in regards to it.

15 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: No, yep.
16 Believe me, I--

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] so
18 something is wrong with that. We have to address
19 that. We could talk about that later, but that's a
20 major issue. And another issue I have is what audit
21 review or oversight is done by NYCHA of the
22 developers after the y finish their work?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So, as
24 I mentioned earlier, we do have an asset management
25 team within the real estate group, and we collect

1
2 monthly reporting on their performance around
3 tickets, legal proceedings, so evictions, whether
4 that's for nonpayment or hold-overs. Our leased
5 housing department still oversees the Section 8
6 subsidy, and there's ongoing--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Y'all
8 have it open where someone could see how often you
9 checked on the developer at the work is done?

10 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Sorry,
11 can you repeat that?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Do you have
13 anything that the community could see that after the
14 work is done you have audit them? They have done the
15 work property. And I believe one of my colleagues
16 just put some legislation in, in regards to that.

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes,
18 so--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Do
20 you have anything documented?

21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We do.
22 We put together monthly reports. So far it's
23 internally.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: To who?
25

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:

Internally, but we are planning to put up a website that will-- or rather put it on our website, a dashboard that will-- that summarizes the performance for each of the developments.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Can I have one more question, ask something? Over the summer related NSN [sic] the developer chosen for the Fulton Elliott Chelsea Pack conversion announced they plan to demolish the existing NYCHA buildings and replace them with a campus of mixed-- new mixed use buildings. Where is that plan in the process right now? Because Mr. Honan know that I had Hope Six in my district and they knocked it down, and not one tenant is back in the new housing there. So we don't want to repeat program to happen.

[applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, what safeguards do the community or this-- this development not in my district, but I'm concerned about the whole city at-large. We need sustainable affordable housing, and NYCHA is that, and if we outsource it, we will not be able to live here anymore. And I have one quick question. You just

1
2 said that people will still be living in NYCHA, and
3 the developer-- when I came in-- sorry for being
4 late-- I came in and one of the tenant leaders was
5 speaking. He said the contractor was kicking the
6 tenants out, but only by them coming to the
7 organization, they had to tell them no, they had
8 succession to stay there. Imagine if that-- those
9 tenants did not go to that organization. They would
10 have been kicked out. So, what safeguards are we
11 doing for our residents?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So, on
13 Fulton and Elliott, Chelsea-- well, first I'll say,
14 obviously there were challenges and weaknesses with
15 the Hope Six program, not just in New York but across
16 the county. So,--

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] But
18 mine was egregious.

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes,
20 and many--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Not
22 one person came back.

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Right,
24 I agree.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: And they still
3 talking about it today.

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
5 Absolutely.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: And that was 20
7 years ago, so you know that hurt my community.

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
9 Absolutely, understood. And you know, one of the
10 things that the Federal Government came up with was
11 the RAD program which addresses a lot of the
12 shortcomings of that program, and that's the national
13 version of this. In New York, we worked in 2015 with
14 a whole round of stakeholders to build in extra
15 protections. So the RAD program here has a lot more
16 protections than Hope Six ever did. And I would say
17 that--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Okay,
19 so if a-- Park Rock in my district, they said they
20 were bamboozled, really. If they want to opt out, is
21 there any chance for them to opt out now? And the
22 contractor just called me, so I'm looking forward to
23 sitting down and talking to the contractor. That's a
24 good thing. But I'm meeting with them. What can I
25 tell them now?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
we are working towards--

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] And
I'm finished, Chair. Thank you for giving me this
leeway.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We are
working towards the closing of that transaction. It
will be in middle of November. So that conversion is
going to happen in the coming weeks.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Almost a done
deal?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Well, they came to
my advisory board meetings, and the community should
know every fourth Saturday we meet and the whole Park
Rock came to my office, and they really concerned
about it. They don't really understand it. so I'm
looking forward maybe someone can meet with me and
them to make sure that we can reassure them that
maybe it'll go well. Maybe it won't.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
Absolutely.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But we gonna [sic]
start fighting now.

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Did
3 you want me to address the other questions that you
4 raised?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: If the Chair give
6 me the latitude [sic].

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Please.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you.

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So on
10 Fulton Elliot Chelsea, as-- so RAD has been used in
11 New York so far for strictly preservation. It has
12 been used in other parts of the country to do
13 rebuilding. We see the Fulton and Elliott Chelsea
14 project as a PACT/RAD project. It is not separate.
15 It is not a new program. It is basically using the
16 same tools and latitude that HUD has given other
17 public housing authorities across the country to
18 bring to New York. So, it is going to be a PACT
19 project or RAD project with all the rights and
20 protections that are in all of the other preservation
21 projects that we do.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Love to meet with
23 y'all [sic].

24 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Oh,
25 and in terms of the timing, so we are going to begin

1 the environmental review process in the coming weeks.
2 We expect to issue the notice of intent to start the
3 environmental impact statement process in the middle
4 of November and public scoping hearings will happen
5 in early to mid-January.

6
7 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Council
8 Member, I'll be in touch with you, and we'll come to
9 your next meeting.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you. Thank
11 you, Chair, for this important hearing.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you, Council
13 Member. Council Member Sanchez?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.
15 Thank you so much, Chair. And thank you to the team
16 for these very helpful prep materials. Hi, hi NYCHA.
17 How are you? Hopefully that's okay, but we know
18 there are challenges. So I'm going to pull a Lincoln
19 Restler, and I'm going to ask a million questions and
20 hope that I can get responses to many of them. But I
21 wanted to start with the trust, and in particular,
22 you know, start with some of the very strong
23 hesitations that residents had moving into the
24 process. you know, I was ultimately supportive of the
25 Trust myself, but with, you know,-- considering it is

1
2 extremely imperfect tool that injects the private
3 market into a space where the federal government is
4 refusing year after year after year to participate,
5 and so you know, some of those protections-- some of
6 those hesitations that tenants had, and I'm sure
7 folks continue to have, were around tenant
8 protection. So, I-- you know, I'm familiar, of
9 course [inaudible] with many of the ways that tenants
10 protections have been strengthened in ongoing PACT
11 conversations, but if there are additional ways that
12 tenant protections have been strengthened or being
13 considered to be strengthened through the Trust
14 process, can you update on those? Second, you know,
15 there were hesitations because, you know, nothing is
16 a guaranteed revenue stream, including tenant
17 protection vouchers. So, just wondering your
18 assessment about the guarantee of tenant protection
19 vouchers as a way to leverage more investment into
20 the Trust process. And third, about voice. So it's
21 really impressive to see that 67 percent of eligible
22 voters at Nostrand have been engaged through door
23 knocking, phone banking, and meetings. You're
24 welcome. You took a staffer from my office who's
25 working on that now. I miss her, she's great. But

1 this is probably without knowing Nostrand personally,
2 probably not enough, and at the same time so much for
3 NYCHA to do, right? Those two things are always
4 true. So my question with respect to the engagement
5 at Nostrand is how replicable is this? How
6 replicable is this going to be in other developments
7 where the Trust process is going to take place, and
8 how are the tenants reacting? So those are my Trust
9 questions. And then my PACT questions-- thank you,
10 Brian, for mentioning Ms. Williams from my district.
11 So-- Ms. Wilson from my district. So I have the
12 northwest Bronx PACT bundle. The vast majority of
13 the buildings in that bundle are in my council
14 district. It's actually the vast majority of my
15 developments are going to end up going through RAD.
16 So, first, is a critique and the second is a
17 question. So the critique is: going to the PACT
18 resident meetings post-selection of a development
19 team has been astounding. There are hundreds of
20 people who are coming out to these. That was not the
21 case when we were talking about PACT in the first
22 place. There were folks who were not engaged. Folks
23 did not know about the process. So what are you
24 learning about how to reach out to residents and get
25

1 that kind of turnout at NYCHA? That's the
2 critique/question. And then the question is around
3 coordination with NYCHA investments. So, I have an
4 example. At Bailey Houses there are roof repairs
5 happening through NYCHA, NYCHA's capital team. At
6 the same time that they're slated for PACT
7 conversion, and it doesn't seem like there is
8 communication and coordination with the development
9 team. So, how often is this happening, and how is
10 NYCHA ensuring that we're not wasting funds? Because
11 NYCHA's doing improvements that we're also financing
12 a new team, a private team, to come in and also do
13 it. Thank you. Those were my million questions.
14 Good to see everybody.

16 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Sure.
17 Thanks so much, Council Member, and you got a lot in
18 in two minutes. So, I'll go backwards. So, I just
19 met last week about the capital project at Bailey.
20 The roof will be completed. It was already started,
21 and it will be completed before the conversion is
22 underway. There was also funding in there for the
23 community center, and what we agreed on that is we're
24 going to see where the scope comes in, and hopefully
25 the developer will be able to cover that work. If

1 not, the elected officials that allocated that money
2 said that they would, you know, keep the money-- you
3 know, park the money there, and if it needs to be
4 invested, you know, into a property they would do so.
5 So SAM [sic] grants, which are state funding grants
6 can go as an economic development project, you know,
7 to any PACT/RAD developments. City capital is a
8 little bit more complicated because there is a
9 private entity there, but we-- you know, we haven't
10 had that so far yet, but it's something that we
11 continue-- we're continuing to having conversations
12 with OMB. In terms of the o--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: [interposing]
15 Sorry, I didn't quite understand. So, how is it
16 coordinated? Is the scope of work reduced from the
17 private team?

18 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So,
19 depending on the project, what we tend to do is-- we
20 will, you know, when a developer is selected-- and
21 Jonathan could probably talk to this better-- is
22 that, you know, raise is to developers that this is
23 something the tenants have identified. It's
24 something that they want. If it can be-- you know,
25 and also urge them to make it part of the scope. So,

1 usually it is a quality of life project. It is-- you
2 know, it is a playground upgrade. There's a
3 community center upgrade. It is, you know, some-- a
4 security upgrade. These are things that often are
5 part of the scope anyway, and if they're not, we
6 encourage them to do so. If they can do it with
7 their funds rather than, you know, your
8 discretionalated [sic] dollars. You know, at the end
9 of the day, I think people just want to see the
10 project happen, you know, whether it's done with City
11 capital dollars or whether it's done with, you know,
12 proceeds from these deals, I think at the end of the
13 day the end goal is the same. So, we work with them
14 from the beginning and we try to, you know, make
15 these-- in the end of the day, the goal is to make
16 the project work. So, in terms of the, you know,
17 how-- we're being slow with the elections on purpose,
18 right? Nostrand is our first development and we want
19 to see how-- you know, if-- you know, how we can do
20 this. We want to see how it goes. We're not
21 announcing three, four, five, six elections at the
22 same time. We do have a campaign staff that is there
23 fulltime. We are knocking on doors. We're making
24 phone calls. We're putting fliers under people's
25

1 doors. We're holding meetings. We're doing
2 everything a transition campaign would do, and we're
3 reaching voters. I knocked on someone's door the
4 other day, and they rattled off all the choices, and
5 you know, and they opened their apartment door and
6 they asked me to look at their apartment, because--
7 and they told me their concerns. Their concerns were
8 around, you know, were relocation, and totally made
9 100 percent sense to me. But you know, people-- the
10 hardest thing when you do this type of engagement is
11 to get people to understand the issue. I think at
12 Nostrand we've been very successful and I think
13 people are ready to make the choice. They're going
14 to have 30 days to do so, and they're going to have
15 all the good government ways to do it. They're going
16 to be able to vote online. They're going to be able
17 to vote by mail, and they're going to be able to vote
18 in-person. So we are hoping for a big turnout. When
19 that is done we're going to be able to, you know,
20 decide, you know, can we run two elections at the
21 same time? Can we run three? But I don't want to--
22 I want to be able to make-- have an election. Have a
23 post-mortem after that and decide, you know, how
24
25

1 technical assistance, right? So we're no longer, you
2 know, just on us to explain. We allow residents to--
3 like, we fund a program where residents can pick
4 whatever services they want. It doesn't have to be
5 us dictating what it is they need to hear or learn
6 about. Whatever of the-- whatever piece of technical
7 information they feel they lack, they can access
8 those funds. We also have independent resident
9 advisors sort of modeled on what we had done with
10 Fulton with CHPC. It was sort of this third-party
11 who was advising the residents there how to navigate
12 the procurement process. So these days, we have at
13 every development that is standard.

15 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: And
16 then just getting back to the trust. I think we're
17 continuing to try to answer all of your questions.
18 But when-- on August 1st when the Trust was first
19 announced, we went out to Nostrand. The Mayor was
20 there. I was there. Our board members, Ms. McFadden
21 was there, and you could feel excitement, but also a
22 tremendous amount of trepidation, and it think that
23 goes to your earlier point, that people don't
24 necessarily understand the technicalities of the
25 Trust. And we have spent hours and days-- you know,

1 we have incredible metrics around the amount of
2 engagement. The amount of door-knocking, the amount
3 of meetings, both on Zoom and in-person. I remember
4 on that first day there was a woman in the audience
5 who was heckling the Mayor. She was very concerned
6 about where she was going to live and what the
7 transformation was going to mean to her, and she was
8 very angry, very aggressive. We invited her to a
9 meeting that evening where everything was explained,
10 and she started out-- she was one of the first people
11 to raise their hands to say that she didn't want any
12 change at her development, as is her right. By the
13 end of the evening, she was like, "I'm for the
14 Trust." Now, that might change, who knows. But you
15 see as Brian said, you're knocking on people's doors.
16 They actually understand what the three choices are,
17 and that provides me a tremendous amount of hope that
18 the engagement is there. And now I'm going to turn
19 it over to Vlada to talk a little bit more about the
20 Trust generally.

22 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Thank you, Lisa. And
23 again, I'm six weeks in, so I'm still going out into
24 the community.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: [interposing]
3 Congratulations.

4 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Thank you. And I'm
5 talking to the residents. I'm meeting with them
6 directly. I want to hear back from them directly what
7 it is that they want out of the trust. To directly
8 answer your question about the vouchers, we are
9 coordinating with HUD and we are confident that we
10 can secure the vouchers. They haven't brought up any
11 concerns. There are a ton of protections, to answer
12 your second question. There are tenant protections
13 that are baked into the state legislation and the
14 federal legislation attached to the vouchers. So I
15 continue to be confident that those tenant
16 protections will be available to the residents that
17 opt in to the trust. But the democratic process of
18 the residents learning about the options,
19 understanding what, you know, what the options are is
20 really, really important in this case, and we're
21 hearing that from the residents.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you so
23 much. He Leroy. Thank you, Chair.

24 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Council Member Won.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Thank you so much,
3 Chair Avilés. My first question is for Queensbridge
4 Houses. The last correspondence that we had with
5 you, Brian Honan, was about the Queensbridge Houses
6 sinkhole that's supposed to cost \$2.5 million that
7 the Mayor's Office has said that they have allocated,
8 and we know that there was a total for this year
9 alone only in the Council funding-- not considering
10 state and city additional funding-- is \$1.5 billion
11 for NYCHA. So, can you help me understand why
12 Queensbridge Houses, the playground that they have
13 has been in sinkhole disrepair for more than two
14 years now, and you continue to not make repairs?

15 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Council
16 Member, I'm unaware of the funding that came just
17 dedicated for the sinkhole, but certainly I can
18 contact colleagues at City Hall to find out more
19 about that. In fact, I just had a conversation with
20 Steph [sic] at OMB the other day about that, and I'm
21 not aware, but it's fine. We do have \$1.5 billion
22 budget, but it's not all capital. It's much less
23 than that in capital-- throughout a portfolio that
24 is, you know, over 300 developments, and in five

1
2 boroughs throughout the City. So, yes, I totally
3 understand--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: [interposing] Well,
5 can you help me understand then the process in which
6 how you determine how to prioritize capital funding?
7 Because if children who do not have access to a
8 playground and it's also posing a threat to people
9 walking on the NYCHA grounds, then what qualifies for
10 you to make investments, to make repairs, that has
11 been year and years old?

12 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Sure. Most
13 of-- so, and I'll let our CEO talk about this, but I
14 can start off there. Most of our capital funding is
15 dedicated to the pillar areas that were identified in
16 2019 HUD agreement. Those pillar areas are heat,
17 mold, lead, and pests, and--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: [interposing]
19 Asbestos, pests.

20 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I'm sorry?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: No, you're going
22 through them all.

23 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: And pests,
24 exactly. So that eats up most of our capital budget.
25 While playgrounds are very important and I'm

1
2 definitely not discounting you, they do not fall in
3 that category. So, this is not-- you know, this is
4 an agreement that is-- was negotiated by the City of
5 New York, the southern district, and to HUD. We have
6 to adhere to them. They have definite deadlines.
7 And that's where investment is going to. Totally
8 understand, I'm not discounting the frustration that I
9 hear in your voice, that I hear from the residents in
10 Queensbridge, but you know, this is what-- you know,
11 this is what we're dealing with limited budget.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Okay, because I also
13 want to acknowledge that we have Samantha from--
14 Congresswoman Nydia Velazquez's office who has been
15 extremely supportive of Queensbridge residents, and
16 we also sent you letter with the State Assembly
17 Member as well as a State Senator asking you to make
18 the repairs now for multiple years. My next question
19 is for Woodside Houses. Can you confirm that
20 Woodside Houses now fully has heat and hot water,
21 because we have not for many, many years?

22 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yes.
23 Woodside Houses is back. Not only mobile boilers any
24 more. It is 100 percent back on the boilers that
25 are, you know, in the heating plant. NYCHA spent the

1
2 money in order to make sure that happened. We're
3 still waiting for FEMA funding, because that, you
4 know, development was hit really hard from Ida. We
5 have not been reimbursed one penny for that. But the
6 five mobile boilers that were there are no longer in
7 use. The chimney has been replaced. Millions of
8 dollars have been spent. Thousands of hours have
9 been spent, and a lot of advocacy from your office,
10 from the other elected officials, you know, to make
11 sure that we were, you know, we were doing that work
12 was, you know, definitely helped there, too. But I'm
13 happy to say that the-- we're back on to the heating
14 plant there, and also happy to say that we're hearing
15 fewer complaints.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Okay, for Woodside
17 Houses like you just mentioned for Hurricane Ida, we
18 had three to four feet of rain, rain flooding, and
19 just recently two weeks ago we had another three to
20 four feet of rain that flooded out the senior center,
21 the children's afterschool program center, and the
22 community center. What is the actual update or the
23 status of the cloud burst [sic] technology that was
24 committed by NYCHA for Woodside Houses?

25

1
2 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: sure. And
3 I'm going to ask my colleague Vlada to talk a little
4 bit more about this, but I will tell you that, you
5 know, it is something that maybe we could talk
6 offline about, because I think, you know, together we
7 can also go to FEMA with the other local elected
8 officials, because this is something where they can
9 be helpful, and this is something where we've seen--
10 it's been frustrating. Let's just put it that way.

11 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: I'm happy to answer
12 in my previous capacity as the Senior Vice President
13 of Sustainability. Applications to FEMA have been
14 submitted and we're waiting approval, but we've also
15 went ahead and started to implement the Clean Heat
16 for All Program. This is the development where you
17 seen 36 heat pumps, window heat pumps that have been
18 installed. And the idea there is that once the
19 technology is proved [sic] out and the residents are
20 happy, it would be scaled across the portfolio and
21 that we don't have to deploy centralized
22 infrastructure that's typically in the basement that
23 would not be protected if there's another rain or
24 cloud burst similar to the one that happened during

1
2 Ida. And so that's the approach there, and we're
3 very happy with the results so far.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: So, can you give me
5 a timeline on what we can expect for cloud burst
6 technology? So you said that you applied for it and
7 you're waiting for approval. Who are you waiting for
8 approval from, and what is the timeline after you
9 receive that approval?

10 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: I would have to get
11 back to you. It is-- I haven't had an update in a
12 while since I started my new role as the President of
13 the Public Housing Preservation Trust, but NYCHA can
14 get back to you on those timelines.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Okay. We'll be
16 following up with the Congresswoman's office, my
17 office, the State Assembly, and State Senator. And
18 then my last question is for rat mitigation. We've
19 rat proliferation and pest proliferation at
20 Queensbridge Houses, Ravenswood Houses, and Woodside
21 Houses, so much so that people had to be transferred
22 because the rats were living on top of the human
23 beings in these houses. What are you doing to make
24 sure that we have more aggressive rat mitigation plan
25 for those NYCHA houses?

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT:

We're going to call up Eva Trimble. She is our Chief Operating Officer.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Just very quickly before you-- could you raise-- would you please raise your right hand? Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee and to respond honestly to Council Member questions?

CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Yes.

Thank you, Council Member. Our Pest Control Department has been very active at Queensbridge and Ravenswood as well with the rat complaints. We've done extensive baiting as well as borough closures there. We're happy to follow up with you and give you more details about the work that we've been doing there.

COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Okay. We'll follow up because the TA Presidents from all three NYCHA's have asked us to request more aggressive mitigation, even within the last week, because they're seeing more and more rat infestations, and they are just so frustrated.

CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE:

Absolutely. We actually have a new rat grounds crew that we just started a few weeks ago, and I'll talk to the team to have them sent out there.

COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Okay. Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you. Council Member Brewer?

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much. The issue of keys, the keys that are more automatic than a regular key, keypads. And so as you know Weiss Towers is going through many challenges because of PACT/RAD. We're working on them. You're very responsive. And if it wasn't for Rose Alba Rodriguez [sp?] it would be a mess, and she's there almost every afternoon taking complaints and then forwarding them to you, and I appreciate the response, but two questions. One, what about the keys, because they're not working? So what are we doing about the key situation? And then second, as you go into the Trust, what are you learning, not just in a-- before the project goes, but while the construction is taking place? That's the problem we're having. So what are you learning from the

1
2 RAD/PACT construction process that might be helpful
3 for the-- if there is a Trust process?

4 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: I can talk a little
5 bit about what we're sort of envisioning for the
6 Trust. It-- the Trust is-- likely be a mix between
7 capital delivery methods that NYCHA uses and what
8 PACT is using, and one of the things that I'm
9 hearing-- it's interesting that you brought up the
10 keys. In the conversations with the residents,
11 security is one of the top concerns, so that's
12 something that we're taking back and considering that
13 to be in the scopes. Construction will likely be as a
14 result of two alternative delivery methods that are
15 available to us under the legislation. We earlier
16 spoke about Polo [sic] grounds and the design build
17 delivery method. That delivery method is avail be to
18 the Trust, and that will be likely the way that we
19 will proceed. There's also construction management
20 at risk, another delivery method, and those delivery
21 methods are robust in being able to make sure that we
22 manage construction in a transparent and public way.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: But the tre-- but
24 the problem with public safety is the following: If
25 you're in a fancy building and your key fab [sic]

1 doesn't work at midnight, you call the doorman.
2 There's nobody to call at NYCHA. So, I really need
3 to understand. It's an example. It's a real
4 example. The keys do not work. The computer is not
5 working. It's midnight, your home with your family,
6 and you can't get into your apartment. So, I think
7 you should get rid of the key fobs for the individual
8 apartments, not necessarily for the front door. I'm
9 just saying, this is coming up. Is it coming up
10 anywhere else? It's coming up at PS139, too.

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So, on
13 the PACT key fob issue, and I-- Eva can speak to the
14 NYCHA. It's similar issue for NYCHA itself, but you
15 know, PS139 and Weiss, yes, it's absolutely been
16 frustrating. There've been some technical glitches.
17 Thanks to Reselda [sic]. You know, she raises these
18 issues with me, and we--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing]
20 Everybody knows Reselda. The whole city knows
21 Reselda.

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So, I
23 think we are actually-- that should be-- that whole
24 issue should be close to being resolved, and if not,
25 we will continue to press the development team to get

1
2 it fixed, because it's unacceptable that from time to
3 time they do not work.

4 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Thank
5 you. Yes, we're aware that there are key fob issues
6 across many-- across the portfolio. One of the
7 things that we've been trying to remind residents is
8 that there-- while there's not, you know, a super on-
9 site, the CCC is 24/7, and so that they can call and
10 we can send someone out there to help them get in.
11 We don't want to ever see someone locked out of their
12 building. So, we do have 24/7 teams that will come
13 and help, and so please, you know, encourage your
14 residents that you speak with to call the CCC if they
15 ever need it. In addition, we-- our Office of Safety
16 and Security works closely with the door
17 manufacturers and the intercom manufacturers to try
18 to update the fobs. It is important that we keep
19 phone numbers up-to-date, because it is linked to the
20 phone numbers, the intercom systems, and the fobs are
21 assigned to individuals. So it's very important that
22 we work closely with our Office of Safety and
23 Security and residents to keep their information up-
24 to-date. If they need another fob, they reach out to
25 Safety and Security and we'll issue that to them.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. I mean, I
3 don't want to belabor the point, but I can just let
4 you know, you can't leave people-- the CCC, I don't
5 know when you show up. There is no super necessarily
6 to call, come on, and it is-- you know, it's one
7 o'clock in the morning. So, I do think you have to
8 be very careful, because it is a very different
9 experience than a building that has a doorman
10 downstairs. If the key doesn't work, you're going to
11 have to go back to the old key. Something to really
12 take into consideration.

13 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE:

14 Understood. Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Alright, thank you,
17 Council Member. So, I-- now the fun begins. I'm
18 going to take it back a little bit to the beginning,
19 and would love to really speed through much of these
20 questions for the record. So forgive if some of them
21 may be duplicative, but we want to just be clear on
22 the record. So, you mentioned in your testimony,
23 Chair, that 37,000 units are slated in pre-
24 development, under construction, or completed
25 construction for RAD/PACT. Can you provide us a

1
2 breakdown within that 37 what each-- the number for
3 each of those groupings?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I can
5 do that. So, 5,830 units have construction complete.
6 Another 13,171 units have construction under way, and
7 then the balance, 18,708 are in that pre-closing,
8 pre-development stage, and we expect to close out all
9 of those between 2024 and 2025.

10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay. How many PACT
11 developments-- oh, actually you just mentioned that,
12 the 18,000 units you're expecting to-- I think I just
13 confused that. Can you say that last--

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
15 [interposing] So, those are in the process.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: The ones that are
17 closing in the last-- in the next couple of years.

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: That's
19 18,700.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And that's 2023-
21 2024?

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
23 There's actually the Reid Park Rock that I mentioned
24 earlier that's closing in a couple of weeks, and then
25 the balance would be 2024 and 2025.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay. And what is
3 NYCHA's plan for the number of developments in
4 Section 9? So, we heard-- and I just want to say,
5 Brian you mentioned that majority of your resources
6 are dedicated to the pillar areas. I'd like to hear
7 what is the plan to address, obviously, traditional
8 Section 9 needs and repairs? and more specifically
9 I'd like to know what is the breakdown between the
10 money that is allocated to the pillar areas and what
11 is remaining and how does that-- how does the
12 remaining resources get allocated?

13 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I can
14 start. So, the balance of the Section 9 portfolio,
15 we have comprehensive modernization which is-- will
16 address 3,690 units across four developments. We
17 just announced the designated developers for St. Nick
18 and Todt Hill, and that will be holistic,
19 comprehensive rehabilitation of those programs. As I
20 also mentioned in my testimony, we have billions of
21 dollars that we put into capital repairs each year
22 across our developments, which supplements the
23 operational work that is done by our Operations Team.

24 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, the comp-mod,
25 the comp-mod program is in one development?

1
2 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: It's
3 a-- we just announced it in Todt Hill Houses in
4 Staten Island and St. Nick, and that will provide a
5 comprehensive, holistic rehabilitation very similar
6 to what's going on in RAD/PACT and with the Trust for
7 Section 9 for those developments.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay, so for comp-
9 mod currently, it only covers two development of the
10 remaining 300 developments?

11 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: We're also
12 using funding that we-- from rezoning at Wyckoff and
13 Gowanus Houses in Brooklyn to do what we call a
14 partial comp-mod there. It wasn't fully funded like
15 St. Nicholas and Todt Hill. The truth is, you know,
16 for the dura-- you know, for the duration of the
17 agreement, I think for the foreseeable future, all
18 the money that we receive from the federal government
19 most likely will be going to these pillar areas, you
20 know, because we have-- we have a mandate to, you
21 know, work to abate the entire portfolio of lead. We
22 have a mandate to make sure that we improve steadily
23 on mold. You know, pests were just raised by Council
24 Member Won. Pests are a tremendous issue throughout
25 the portfolio. We have-- and we have, you know,--

1
2 and we also have a mandate to make sure that we're
3 responding to close out heat and hot water outages.
4 The thing that makes me optimistic is that on each of
5 these areas, we now have subject experts with
6 dedicated departments put in place that are under the
7 COO's office that we've never had before. So, the
8 money that we are getting is going to dedicated areas
9 that are, you know, that will better improve people's
10 health, but also they also are-- have dedicated teams
11 to do it before. It's not just a hodge-podge. It's
12 not just, you know, one-off. And we are seeing
13 improvements and the numbers bear that out.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, just for the
15 record to make sure I'm understanding because I've
16 heard residents talk Red Hook about comp-mod and how
17 a comp-mod is coming, and comp-mod is going to
18 happen, and I'm not hearing that that-- I'm hearing
19 it's only happening in two developments.

20 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yeah, so
21 comp-mod came again, like all things in modern NYCHA,
22 a lot of them come from the 2019 agreement. Comp-mod
23 came from city funding from the 2019 agreement. It
24 was dedicated to two development, and St. Nicholas--
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Only
3 two developments?

4 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Only two
5 developments, correct.

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: For the record,
7 okay.

8 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: We received
9 additional, you know, funding from the Gowanus
10 rezoning and that is going to provide, you know, some
11 very needed repairs for those developments, but not
12 the same level as St. Nicholas.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: You can tell me how
14 much money is dedicated to the comp-mod for those two
15 developments?

16 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: It's
17 \$740 million.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: \$740 million. And
19 700 and-- that is the totality of comp-mod for the
20 entire--

21 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT:
22 [interposing] For these two-- these, yes, exactly.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay.
24
25

1
2 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: And
3 honestly, it would be great if we could do more. We
4 just don't have enough money.

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay. No, I think
6 this is the purpose of the questions. I think there
7 is a real misunderstanding that there is this program
8 called comp-mod that residents are waiting for, and
9 in fact there is no comp-mod, with the exception of
10 these two developments. I've heard in many
11 developments residents talk about the promise of
12 comp-mod, but we have no money for that.

13 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: We
14 have no money for that.

15 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: That's correct.
16 Okay. So that's-- I wanted to check in on that. so
17 in terms of the-- so I guess if we were planning
18 backwards, the entire-- the capital budget for
19 repairs that we mentioned, I think you said, Brian,
20 \$1.9 billion?

21 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: No, I think
22 that was the number that Council Member Won, you
23 know, mentioned, but I think she was thinking in
24 NYCHA's overall budget, which you know, also includes
25 both public housing and Section 8. So I think on the

1 capital funding for a year, it's close to about \$700
2 million.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: How is that so, if
5 \$740 million is dedicated to comp-mod?

6 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So, the
7 funding for comp-mod was city funding. That came from
8 the 2019 agreement.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Then what is the
10 total capital--

11 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:
12 [interposing] Total--

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: for improvements,
14 yeah.

15 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Oh, for
16 those two developments or for--

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: The whole pie.

18 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: For the
19 whole portfolio.

20 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Why
21 don't we just follow up with that?

22 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yeah, okay,
23 we can get it.

24 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay. Can you tell
25 us what the current role of the CEO of NYCHA is?

1
2 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Just
3 want to make sure. I oversee the day-to-day
4 operations of the portfolio. I also work with my
5 executive team to think about strategic planning
6 across our portfolio, and I am very dedicated to
7 making sure that affordable housing in New York City
8 is here for generations to come.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And what is the
10 current role of the Chair of NYCHA? And the reason,
11 obviously, we're asking this on the record is there's
12 still a great deal of confusion and a lack of
13 understanding that those roles were desegregated. So
14 for the record, can you tell us what the current
15 Chair role at NYCHA?

16 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Sure.
17 And just to be clear, the role of the Board Chair is
18 actually set forth in our bylaws. As part of the HUD
19 Agreement in 2019, we undertook a transformation
20 plan, and part of that was restructuring what our--
21 what NYCHA looked like. So as part of that
22 transformation plan, the roles of the Chair and CEO
23 are bifurcated. There is now other public housing
24 authority, to my knowledge, across the country, that
25 had both a Chair and a CEO. That was one in the

1 same. As with any other Board, the Board approves
2 all of our contracts. Jamie Ruben [sp?] who is our
3 Board Chair has a very deep history in both
4 government. He was the former head of the State
5 Housing Authority. So he comes to us with a lot of
6 creative ideas in trying to manage our portfolio into
7 the next century.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you. And can
10 you tell us a little bit about why NYCHA saw the need
11 to separate these roles?

12 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: It
13 was part of the transformation plan that was required
14 under the HUD Agreement from 2019.

15 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Do you remember why
16 it was part of the transformation plan?

17 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Eva,
18 why don't you?

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: The rationale-- I
20 guess what I'm looking for is the rationale behind
21 the separation of the roles.

22 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Sure.
23 As Lisa mentioned, the previous arrangement of having
24 a combined Chair and CEO does not exist as far as we
25 know in any other PHA, and it's really meant to be a

1
2 check and balance, as well as providing a different
3 type of leadership. So, as Chair they are here to
4 govern the Board of NYCHA. So they lead the other
5 boards. They can create committees through the
6 bylaws. They help provide an overall governance and
7 accountability as well as setting the priorities.
8 That is the role of the Chair. They are no involved
9 in day-to-day business. That is the role of the CEO.
10 And so it's a-- just a different form of governance,
11 and as part of the HUD agreement, to go to your
12 original question, one of the goals of the HUD
13 agreement was to create a stronger governance and
14 accountability structure for NYCHA, and a key to that
15 governance was improving our Board of Directors.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Great. Thank you.
17 Thank you. so are these changes in leadership--
18 after the changes in leadership structure, does NYCHA
19 believe that they have enough independence to voice
20 concerns when city, state, and federal policy does
21 not favor NYCHA?

22 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Can
23 you repeat that question?

24 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah, so after with
25 this new structure that we have separated roles, do

1
2 you feel that there is enough independence in those
3 roles to be able to voice concerns and push back when
4 there's discord in policy that is not favoring NYCHA?

5 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Oh,
6 I think absolutely. Now we have two people who can do
7 that, our Board Chair and our CEO.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Has that come up?

9 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: No,
10 but I mean both Jamie and myself are constantly
11 advocating, both our city, state and federal
12 partners.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Do you think there
14 are other changes that are needed to-- for NYCHA's
15 governing bodies?

16 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I
17 think as we mature as an agency, there could be.
18 Jamie and I are basically new-ish to our roles. I've
19 been here longer. We were both appointed permanently
20 in July, but as part of the long-term strategic
21 planning, I think there are always changes that can
22 be made.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: How much-- actually,
24 how much does HUD contribute to the salary of the CEO
25 and the Chair? Does it continue to do so?

1
2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: The
3 Chair is an unfunded-- the Chair does not receive
4 any--

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Right.

6 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE:
7 compensation.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: That's right.

9 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: And my
10 salary like every other executive member is paid for
11 the by the COCC funds. We do not get funds from HUD
12 specifically for my salary or anyone else's salary.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay. Because in
14 the prior iteration, they did contribute a
15 significant amount of funding to the salary.

16 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: That--
17 I'm unaware.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah, so okay.
19 Alright, let's move on to the Trust. So in terms of
20 the Blueprint for Change, the transformation plan
21 recommends that NYCHA may propose that the Chair and
22 NYCHA directors become unpaid positions appointed by
23 the Mayor. Can NYCHA provide us with an update on
24 this recommendation?
25

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 117

2 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Can
3 you repeat that question?

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yes, in the
5 transformation--

6 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT:
7 [interposing] [inaudible] Trust--

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: there was a
9 recommendation that the Chair and NYCHA Directors--

10 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: So,
11 the Chair of NYCHA is an unpaid position.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Right.

13 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Our
14 Board of Directors receive a small stipend that's--

15 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing]

16 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT:
17 create-- that's set by state statute, but they do not
18 receive any other salary or any other type of
19 compensation.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And that's-- that'll
21 be the-- that's for NYCHA generally and then for the
22 Trust it'll operate in a similar way?

23 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Oh,
24 she--

25

1 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Sorry,
2
3 I think I'm conflating both the things.

4 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Yeah.

5 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: So, the Trust does
6 have a separate board.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yes.

8 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: It's a nine-member
9 board. It is largely a volunteer position with a
10 stipend similar to NYCHA's board.

11 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: and how will the two
12 entities relate?

13 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: so,
14 we're two separate organizations. The Trust was
15 created by state statute. They operate separately.
16 Right now, like any new organization, they're being
17 incubated by NYCHA, because we were the entity that
18 petitioned the state legislature and the Governor to
19 create it, but at some point, they will be completely
20 on their own.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. So are the--
22 I think this is--

23 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT:
24 [interposing] OF course, I should just add that I--
25 the CEO of NYCHA is the Chair of the Trust Board.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah, I know. This is what's driving me crazy. I have all the titles wrong.

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I know. So I'm the Chair--

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Like the Chair and the President--

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: of the Trust Board, but the CEO of NYCHA, but not the president. Vlada's the--

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] And the board members, yeah. So, forgive me. Forgive me. I'm absolutely confusing myself. Can you describe the organizational structure that you're planning for the Trust?

PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Thank you for that question, Chair. Right now we are three people that Lisa mentioned in the testimony. We are not looking to grow much more. We're looking to have a core small central team, and as the developments opt-in into the Trust through the voting process, we are looking to hire capital delivery staff to support the re-capitalizations of the developments that opt in.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Do you have a sense
3 of how many staff you will need to add in for capital
4 delivery or the other pieces?

5 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: We're working on our
6 operational plan as we speak. I'm hoping to update
7 you on any more definitive answer in future council
8 hearings.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And the enacting
10 state law requires that the Trust Board meet
11 regularly. What does that mean for the schedule for
12 the Trust Board meetings?

13 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: We have set regular
14 meetings. They're now bi-monthly, and they are on
15 the calendar. The next one is coming up on November
16 22nd.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. And what
18 are the planned agreements that the Trust will have
19 with NYCHA?

20 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: I'm sorry, can you
21 repeat the question?

22 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: What kind of
23 agreement does the Trust-- the Trust is a separate
24 entity incubated by NYCHA, but what are the
25 operational agreements between these two bodies? I'm

1 some of the processes there. The three work streams
2 that would kick in right away are the financing--
3 we'll be working with our financing partner HDC. The
4 lease holds, the reason the organization was created
5 is that the lease hold will allow NYCHA and the Trust
6 to access the Section 8 vouchers. You've heard from
7 the NYCHA CEO that-- and frankly, the HUD agreement
8 is the result of the failing building systems. I'm a
9 building systems person, and so all of the things
10 that are in a HUD agreement, pests, mold, they're
11 failing systems. The plumbing systems that are
12 failing. And so the Trust was created to raise enough
13 funding to be able to do a comprehensive upgrade, and
14 so that's the work stream that will begin. The second
15 work stream will be the disposition of Section 9 to
16 section 8 vouchers. That's a work stream that we'll
17 be working very closely with NYCHA on. And the last
18 work stream is the procurement process for the actual
19 recapitalizations of the buildings using one of the
20 alternative delivery methods that I mentioned, and
21 typically that process takes about 18 to 24 months,
22 based on what we've seen from PACT or the capital
23 delivery programs.
24

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Council

Member, can I just say, too, they'll be-- continue to [inaudible] throughout this process to make sure that residents have a lot of decision-making. So under the Trust legislation, residents will have also the ability to choose the construction partners here. There will be a lot of work done at these properties. Some of these construction firms will be there for literally years, and one of the complaints that we heard from many residents, especially when we contemplating this legislation, is that construction companies often-- that the ones that NYCHA, you know, has hired, you know, in the past, the work is not up to-- you know, not up to-- you know, done to the standard that the people like. The contractors are respectful. They don't know who they are. And so if they feel like, you know, that the residents are, you know, the ones who hired them, that we create a relationship, that there has to be a partnership. And if it was just done there, too, that would only be half the job. The residents also keep a quality assurance committee, you know, together. so those firms have to come back on a regular basis to report back and say, you know, when I came here I said that

1
2 we were going to work six days a week in order to get
3 the work done faster, and that we were going to hire
4 this many residents, and quarterly [sic] they'll have
5 to give a progress report, and you know, make sure
6 they did what they said.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay. In terms of
8 the-- what's the criteria that you'll be using to
9 select developments for Trust?

10 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: What I'll say is that
11 physical needs assessment is one of the driving
12 criteria, and the deterioration of their properties,
13 but across the portfolio there are fewer and fewer
14 developments that don't have comprehensive needs.
15 And so for the Trust, it's resident leadership that
16 would want to opt-in, I think would kick in the
17 voting process, and I'll pass it on to Brian to
18 answer on the voting process.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: I'm sorry, before
20 Brian, you take it over, the PNA you mentioned is the
21 driving force, and clearly the needs are significant
22 across the board. Have you identified a threshold of
23 need that would be met? How do you discern when
24 everything is crumbling?
25

1
2 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I don't
3 think there's a development in the portfolio that
4 cannot use a--

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Yeah,
6 exactly.

7 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: [inaudible]
8 so--

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So how do you do
10 that?

11 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So, the
12 high needs is, you know, every development, really.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Right.

14 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: But I think
15 one thing that's different than, you know, past
16 programs is we are looking to go to developments
17 where residents are open to having a conversation,
18 where residents are open to engagement, where
19 residents are open to say, okay, we'll have a vote.
20 Not even necessarily we'll have a vote to support the
21 trust. It's we'll have a vote to do something
22 different. And even after listening to all of the
23 benefits of the Trust, all of the benefits of PACT
24 and RAD. Residents can say, you know what, I'm not
25 convinced, and I'm going to-- you know, at this time

1
2 we're going to stay as we are right now. And so
3 rather than go in there like a bull in a china shop,
4 rather than go in there and say, you know, this is a
5 program that we think is best for you, we're going in
6 there and having conversations with--

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] so,
8 the only criteria you're using is resident leadership
9 that wants you to come in.

10 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Exactly,
11 and have these conversations.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And that's a TA
13 President that is inviting you to come in? Because
14 that's what we're talking about. We're not talking
15 about a survey that has gone out that residents are
16 saying, because that's the work that happens post.
17 You're being invited.

18 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So I can
19 tell you how we did it at Nostrand. Yes, we did have
20 many conversations with Ms. McFadden. That is 100
21 percent true. But Ms. McFadden is, you know, a very
22 important person in Nostrand. She was a--

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing]
24 Without question. Brian, I'm not here judging that.
25 I just want clarity.

1
2 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yeah, so it
3 wasn't just--

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] So,
5 it's with-- upon invitation of a resident, a TA
6 leader is where you will-- that is the criteria
7 you're using to take the next step. And obviously,
8 you're having some conversation, but that's the
9 criteria that we're using currently.

10 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: It is not
11 the only factor, right? So, the TA leader at, you
12 know, Nostrand and the other developments where we've
13 had conversations said, you know, I don't want to be
14 the only one who makes this decision. And they said,
15 you know, meet with my board, meet with a larger
16 group of residents. in some developments we may have
17 a TA President who says, "You know what, I do speak
18 for my residents, and if we feel confident that this
19 will-- you know, that we can-- you know, we can move
20 forward with that, we will do it, you know, in that
21 way too. But I think it is better, you know, having
22 many voices, not just one voice. I think we'll end
23 up with a better outcome.

24 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: With the voting
25 already underway at Nostrand, we know NYCHA has a

1 docket of developments that will soon undergo voting
2 process. When will NYCHA release the list of the
3 next developments slated for the Trust?
4

5 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So, as I
6 mentioned earlier, Council Member, we are being very
7 slow, you know, here in our conversations. What I
8 don't want to do today is rattle off a list of
9 developments. We've made that mistake in the past.
10 Ms. Doris was up here, you know, in the day, and Ms.
11 Torres really made her name fighting the Bloomberg
12 Administration on an in-fill plan that residents
13 learned about in the media. It was a-- I can't-- you
14 know, having live through it and I could tell you it
15 was an awful way to start the program. And so I
16 don't' want to sit here and rattle off developments
17 and then, you know, cause, you know, some anxiety for
18 the residents. What I think is better is to have a
19 conversation with residents. Have residents agree,
20 you know, to hold an election and then tell the
21 public. So, you all have told us, residents have
22 told us, advocates have told us, let residents make
23 these decision. We've heard you.

24 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, you'll let us
25 know when it's moving forward?

2 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: We will let
3 you know. We will let you know. We also invite you
4 to participate.

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Oh, boy. In terms of
6 the-- can you tell us what the timeline for transfer
7 to the trust after a successful vote will look like?

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Please, raise your
9 right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
10 whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
11 testimony before this committee and to respond
12 honestly to Council Member questions?

13 ANDREW KAPLAN: I do.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And if you could just
15 state your name and your title for the record.

16 ANDREW KAPLAN: Andrew Kaplan, Chief of
17 Staff at NYCHA. So, Vlada covered this a little bit
18 before, so I'll just be very brief. But that 18 to
19 24 month timeline, that outlined a couple of the
20 different work streams including the conversion
21 process.

22 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Move closer.

23 ANDREW KAPLAN: Sorry. The conversion
24 process, the financing arrangement in partnership
25 with HDC, and resident engagement throughout are some

1
2 of those steps that happened over that 18 to 24
3 months.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: The IBO raised
5 concerns about the amount of tenant protection
6 vouchers that would be needed to transfer the planned
7 25,000 units into the trust. Has there been any
8 prior approval or appropriation of the money to fund
9 those vouchers as of today?

10 ANDREW KAPLAN: So, each year congress
11 appropriates new funds into-- for example, the tenant
12 protection voucher account. And housing authorities
13 like NYCHA are able to draw down at that account, and
14 then it becomes part of the ongoing obligation of the
15 Section 8 program just like any other project based
16 Section 8 voucher. So that would be the same sort of
17 thing that would happen with the Trust just as it
18 does with the PACT program, and that happens towards
19 the end of the process, when you actually formally go
20 through, and you submit and are able to get the
21 vouchers for that specific development. Well ahead
22 of that, there are conversations with all of the
23 various offices at HUD, and we have a lot of
24 experience doing this with the PACT program, and so
25 far there have not been any issues. We talked about

1
2 this well in advance and have shared some of the
3 timelines we just went through with you. We continue
4 to coordinate with them, and you know, so far there
5 have not been any flags.

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: so, you have no
7 reason to believe that Congress will delay
8 appropriation or provide much less of the vouchers
9 than you're expecting?

10 ANDREW KAPLAN: Not at this time. I
11 mean, we continue to work--

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Have
13 you met the Congress? Okay. Got it. Given the
14 uncertainty of the moment, you're still feeling
15 confident in congressional appropriations, sufficient
16 congressional appropriations to meet both the
17 RAD/PACT goals that you're working towards and the
18 Trust goals at the same time?

19 ANDREW KAPLAN: I can't predict the
20 future--

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] You're
22 an optimistic man.

23 ANDREW KAPLAN: Nor will I try to, but
24 just given the factors that, you know, we see in
25

1
2 terms of the overall politics of the situation,
3 that's the best assessment at the time.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: What will you do if
5 you do not receive the appropriation levels?

6 ANDREW KAPLAN: So, just in terms of what
7 happens with a specific project, and then you know,
8 if others want to chime in overall. You know, again,
9 this happens in advance of the actual conversion,
10 right? So there's no risk to the project. It would
11 be something that would be flagged well ahead of
12 time, and at that time we have to work with HUD, of
13 course, first and foremost about what the most
14 appropriate course of action is. Sometimes that
15 means, you know, some sort of delay, you know, into
16 the next fiscal year, but it really is dependent on
17 the specific situation. So it's hard to say without
18 having that specific case, and again, that hasn't
19 happened yet, so we'd have to, you know, take it as
20 it comes.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Sure, sure. So, in
22 terms of-- yeah, I guess along the same vein, I'd
23 love to understand the discussions around the risks
24 associated with using congressional appropriations
25 also as a basis for the bonds that-- and what

1
2 contingencies you have in place to make sure that
3 you're able to raise that capital?

4 ANDREW KAPLAN: Yeah, absolutely. So
5 there's a number of things that go into play. Vlada
6 mentioned a lot of the legal pieces, so I won't
7 touch on that because it was already covered, but
8 just in terms of some of the ways that often times
9 financing is arranged, and again, this is just kind
10 of giving examples. There are often reserves that
11 are put in. There also debt service coverage ratios.
12 There are a number of different ways to make sure
13 that there's room, both for kind of day-to-day
14 emergencies, but then these sort of long-term risk
15 factors like for example appropriations.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: In terms-- I guess
17 the reserves, you're talking about who's putting in
18 what reserves. We have none [sic].

19 ANDREW KAPLAN: Just in terms of
20 structuring of finance, right?

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing]
22 [inaudible]

23 ANDREW KAPLAN: That is sort of a bond
24 issue.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And can you remind
3 me, does New York-- is New York State or City
4 backing?

5 ANDREW KAPLAN: So, they have the right
6 to cure.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: What contractual
8 protections will be put in place to prevent a
9 creditor from gaining any interest in NYCHA
10 developments in the event of a default on Trust debt?

11 ANDREW KAPLAN: So, for-- caveat like
12 we've been saying, we're going through the process
13 right now, and so the exact specifics of this will be
14 worked out as we go through, alongside HDCR financing
15 partner. But just a few things to mention. So, for
16 example, in the legislation it outlines that the use
17 of the facility as low-income housing with the rights
18 and protections codified have to remain in any event,
19 and so that would have to be codified as part of the
20 agreement, you know, whether that is the financing
21 agreement itself, I'm not sure exactly which document
22 per say, but that would have to be part of the
23 arrangement pursuant to the law.

24 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you. In terms
25 of tenant communication, during the voting process,

1
2 what's been NYCHA's process for presenting the
3 information in a fair and unbiased manner to tenants?

4 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Sure. So,
5 first all of our meetings are covered in English,
6 Spanish, Chinese, and Russian. So we're doing them
7 in the covered languages. So we want to make sure
8 that, you know, all residents, you know, clearly
9 understand the choices that are offered. We present--
10 - we give, you know, equal time to the three options
11 that are presented. We present them, you know, in--
12 the benefits and also the concerns that people have
13 had, and then we save as much time as possible for
14 questions. Our original presentation, you know, that
15 we are-- our introduction presentation is quite long
16 because it is a lot of information, but we usually--
17 you know, the meetings usually have presentation,
18 have Q&A. We have now started to break them down,
19 you know, so this way people could just focus on the
20 Trust, people could just focus on PACT, people could
21 just focus on Section 9, as well. This Saturday,
22 we'll be going out holding meetings just in Spanish.
23 We'll be holding meetings just in Russian as well.
24 We're doing smaller meetings, too, with people who
25 have specific concerns. You know, some people have

1
2 concerns with relocation. Some people have concerns
3 with what does it mean to be a Section 8 tenant. And
4 so we're-- you know, as we have these meetings, as we
5 have more information, we're having-- you know,
6 people have niche concerns, and we want to-- you
7 know, we want to make sure that we focus on those
8 issues as well.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: In terms of-- thank
10 you and I've seen some of the materials, and you're
11 clearly making a huge effort to improve engagement,
12 so thank you for that. I share Council Member
13 Sanchez's concern about it's more than we've seen,
14 probably not enough, but how are we going to
15 replicate that standard?

16 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: No, I-- you
17 know, I clearly getting turn up-- as anybody knows
18 who has to do that, it's a very hard thing to do, get
19 people to come out to a two, three-hour meeting. But
20 we are seeing people come out. Vlada was just down,
21 and she said there was standing room only there, you
22 know, to listen to her introduction, you know, to the
23 meeting. We've had other meetings where we wish the
24 turnout was better, but this is where those
25 individual conversations that we're having with

1
2 people either at their door or, you know, over the
3 phone are so important. Because sometimes, you know,
4 people-- like, I go to a meeting, and I don't want to
5 get up there and ask a question. You know, I'm--
6 maybe I'm not as assertive as everybody else, but you
7 know, I don't want everybody to know my business or
8 anything like that. And so when you go to somebody's
9 door step and they tell you, you know-- you know,
10 people have told me, like, "I've lived here for 32
11 years. The only thing I own in my life is everything
12 in my apartment. You're telling me that you're going
13 to be able to pack this up and put into storage, or
14 you're going to put it in another apartment, and I'm
15 not going to have to worry about it?" That's a
16 concern I really want to know about, because I want
17 to make that person feel really confident that, you
18 know, they can do this and they can believe in the
19 program. But that's not something you'll hear at a
20 meeting necessarily, but you'll hear that when you
21 talk to somebody one-on-one. So we're not relying on
22 one way to reach people. We're relying on, you know,
23 all the traditional ways a campaign would do it.

24 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: No, that's great.
25 And we have a highly technical term for that. It's

1 called meeting people where they are. So, thank you.
2 Thank you for that. We've heard tenants say we
3 shouldn't have to sacrifice our Section 9 lease to
4 get repairs that we deserve. How does NYCHA address
5 these concerns during this voting process?
6

7 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: You know,
8 I--

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] The
10 Chair want's to respond.

11 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Oh, go
12 ahead, yes, yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Everybody wants to
14 respond.

15 ANDREW KAPLAN: I can start and then I'll
16 pass-- sorry. We need more mics up here. So maybe I
17 can start and then I'll let Lisa. So, I mean, I
18 think at the end of the day, the goal remains, and I
19 think others on the panel have said it, to map over
20 the rights and protections and also get the repairs,
21 that's the goal at the end of the day.

22 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Just remind me, the
23 Section 8 voucher has exactly the same protections as
24 a Section 9? I know the legislation has something
25 different, too. So this is part of the confusion of

1
2 residents when we say you have the same rights, but
3 all those documents say different things.

4 ANDREW KAPLAN: so, and to the extent that
5 Jonathan wants to talk about the PACT program also we
6 can get into that. Of course, Section 8 has several
7 different types. There's the tenant-based Section 8
8 which, you know, is different from what we're talking
9 about here. We're talking about project-base Section
10 8.

11 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Right.

12 ANDREW KAPLAN: But even just normal
13 project- based Section 8 is different than the
14 project-based Section 8 that comes with a conversion
15 form Section 9 with the RAD program. There's all
16 sorts of rights and protections that map over from
17 the public housing program into the project-based
18 voucher. Same sort of thing with the Trust, and so
19 the Trust legislation that you mentioned does cover
20 the fact that the rights and protections map over and
21 calls out several specific ones as well as part of
22 the legislation.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Does all of the
24 rights map over?

1
2 ANDREW KAPLAN: So, the legislation-- the
3 trust legislation carries them all over. I mean, the
4 nuances that, you know, for example, the
5 administration of the program and certain elements of
6 the Section 8 program you could qualify as different
7 because they are being run by our leased housing
8 department, for example. Some of the forms look
9 different, but in terms of things like rent and the
10 grievance process and the succession rights and all
11 of those sorts of things, yes.

12 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So, I
13 definitely hear what residents say about why, you
14 know, in order to get the repairs they need. Do we
15 have to, you know, go through a different program? I
16 think our goal here is to make sure that we preserve
17 this housing stock, right? And we have to use all
18 the tools that are available, you know, to us. And
19 it is-- you know, in a lot of ways it is a shame that
20 the program that was created in the 1930s was not
21 property funded, you know, throughout the years, and
22 the federal government walked away from it. This is
23 not a New York problem. This is a nationwide
24 problem. If were-- you know, if we were un
25 Philadelphia right now, if we were in Chicago right

1
2 now, if we were in San Francisco right now or
3 Baltimore, we'd be having the same conversation. I
4 do not know of a Housing Authority anywhere in the
5 country that is able to run, you know, housing just
6 using federal funds alone. You know, and so we have
7 to use, you know, whatever program is available.
8 Right now, the program that the federal government
9 offers is RAD and PACT. We've heard many residents
10 have concerns about that, and so we created an
11 alternative, a local alternative, you know, called
12 the Trust that keeps out the private entity. It took
13 us two years to come up with the legislation. We
14 heard many folks, you know, say that they wanted to
15 make sure that 964, you know, is included, you know,
16 in the Trust. We copied and pasted 964 when we put
17 it in the Trust. They wanted to make sure the Baez
18 [sic] protections were, you know, in the trust. We
19 took Baez and we put it into the Trust. We wanted to
20 make sure the succession rates were there. We made
21 the succession rates even stronger than the probably
22 housing succession rates. Residents won't pay more
23 than 30 percent, and also right-sizing is not
24 required, you know, under the Trust. We heard a lot
25 of people-- in some ways I often joke that we were

1
2 not very good negotiators, because we didn't make it,
3 you know, "if you support the Trust, then you get
4 this." It was "if these were good for tenants'
5 rights, we will put this in the legislation," and we
6 did.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you. Was
8 there anything that needed to be left out from the
9 Trust regs?

10 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I don't-- I
11 can't think of it, but if there are issues that are
12 brought to us, and they would, you know, further
13 tenants' rights, I'd be happy to have conversations
14 with people, and I'd be happy also to go to Albany
15 and, you know, to amend the legislation.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Really? No, that's
17 helpful. It sounds like obviously in these
18 conversations you're triaging what people are saying
19 are the most important? Nevertheless, we're saying
20 they're the same, but they're not the same, because
21 maybe some less important pieces were left behind,
22 right? So, it's just this constant circular
23 argument. They're all the same, but they're not the
24 same. This is what we're trying to get at, just
25

1
2 final clarity. What is covered? What is not
3 covered? And that's what it is.

4 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I think for
5 the-- largely for the things that people care about
6 most, I think, you know, they're in there, the 964,
7 succession rates, the fact that, you know, tenants
8 pay less than, you know, 30 percent of their income,
9 you know, towards rent, rightsizing, all those are
10 within the legislation. All of those are protections
11 that tenants continue to receive, and also due
12 process as well.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. So, another
14 way to do this, and apologies for this, can you
15 provide to the Council the pieces that were not
16 transferred over? We'll work it backwards. In terms
17 of the tenant protections from 964, anything that was
18 not transferred over.

19 ANDREW KAPLAN: I mean, we can certainly
20 follow up if there's anything particular, but I think
21 to Brian's point, the transfer over-- there's a
22 generic statement that transfers over the rights of
23 the Section 9 program, and then underneath that it
24 just enumerates certain ones as examples.

2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay. So Brian said
3 not everything was transferred over. The most
4 prioritized things were.

5 ANDREW KAPLAN: Were enumerated in the
6 legislation as examples.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Alright. We're in a
8 weird circular problem right now. The--

9 ANDREW KAPLAN: I'm sorry if we're not
10 being clear.

11 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Were 100 percent of
12 the 964 regulations transferred over into the Trust
13 resident protections, 100 percent?

14 ANDREW KAPLAN: Yes. It says full-- I
15 forget-- I can pull up the exact quote--

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Okay,
17 I just--

18 ANDREW KAPLAN: It's full 964--

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Y'all
20 just said different things. I want you to know. I
21 know I'm not a little crazy. I didn't have lunch,
22 but-- 100 percent were transferred over?

23 ANDREW KAPLAN: Of 964.

24 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah, okay.

1
2 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: On 964,
3 correct, yes.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: We got there. We
5 got there. Y'all said different things. In terms
6 of-- how is NYCHA ensuring that technical language,
7 for example, around the bond financing during pre-
8 vote presentation is made accessible.

9 ANDREW KAPLAN: So, this is something
10 that, you know, we take very seriously. Of course,
11 we want to make sure that we are communicating as
12 much information as clearly as possible. We do have
13 materials that are included in the presentation, and
14 then often times, you know, there will be discussion
15 or questions, and so we'll provide more specific
16 answers based on those questions.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So we're working on
18 it.

19 ANDREW KAPLAN: As we said before, you
20 know, we know--

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] It's
22 complicated. I mean, I think this is important work.
23 And just for a plug, Center for Urban Pedagogy does
24 amazing work at breaking down very complicated
25

1
2 issues, and there it is. You see, this is why we pay
3 Vlada the big bucks.

4 ANDREW KAPLAN: Absolutely.

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: She has the props.
6 What's the grievance processes in place should
7 residents have questions, any aspect of the voting
8 process?

9 ANDREW KAPLAN: So, for-- we have a
10 third-party independent election administrator who is
11 conducting and overseeing the vote, and folks can
12 submit to that administrator. I believe it's through
13 72 hours after the vote.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, if a resident
15 right now, let's say at Nostrand, is not engaged and
16 concerned or just sees somewhat-- not above board
17 presentation and they have an objection or concern
18 they want to register. And while Ms. McFadden is
19 amazing, they may not want to go to Ms. McFadden.
20 Where do they go with their grievance or concerns?

21 ANDREW KAPLAN: So, of course, they could
22 send it to us and we could direct it to the third-
23 party administrator or directly to the third-party
24 administrator.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, when you say
3 they send it to us, what do you mean exactly for the
4 record? Do you mean they called the CCC and register
5 it? Where do they go?

6 ANDREW KAPLAN: yeah, so there's several
7 options. I mean, of course, we want to make it as
8 seamless and easy as possible, so we have the in-
9 person office. we also have specific email address
10 set up for the voting process, but if someone does
11 end up calling the CCC or come in through another
12 place at NYCHA, that then gets redirected back to
13 the-- to the team.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So email where?
15 Where do they send an email to?

16 ANDREW KAPLAN: I don't have the exact
17 email address off the top of my head. We can
18 certainly follow up with that exact address. It's
19 like voting@NYCHA or something like that, but I'll
20 get you the exact address.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Voting, a telephone
22 number-- I've heard many residents won't do in-person
23 complains for fear of retribution and not great
24 relationship with employees. So we want as many
25 options as possible. So after the conversion to the

1 Trust, what is the plan for tenant outreach for
2 vendor selection and need analysis? And maybe it's
3 too soon to tell. Will it be similar to RAD/PACT?
4 Are you--

5
6 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Under the
7 legislation, we are required to work with the
8 residents and my track record, I think, should show
9 you that I'm looking forward to working with the
10 residents. I would like to reserve time to really
11 come up with a thoughtful answer for future Council
12 testimony.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah, and I think
14 it's along the lines of what Council Member Brewer--
15 there's a lot of experience with a wide arrange of
16 programs and delivery models. So I think where we
17 can extract the lessons learned and not replicate
18 them. That would be the best. Will tenant outreach
19 be taken over by a new team? Will it just be managed
20 from within the Trust, or how does that happen?

21 PRESIDENT KENNIFF: so, I have mentioned
22 a small core team. We are looking at property--
23 toward a property engagement role that both does
24 resident engagement and property engagement. So that
25 is a component of the team where, you know, we want

1 to make sure that the Trust is represented. But it
2 is-- this is a partnership with NYCHA. We are
3 incubated. We are, you know, seamlessly
4 transitioning from vote to the Trust, and we'll
5 continue to work with the NYCHA on the various work
6 streams that I had mentioned before.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. Thank you.
9 So, moving over to RAD/PACT, I don't-- I want you to
10 be engaged. You noted the conversion have provided
11 four billion dollars in relief to NYCHA. Do you know
12 if that-- is that above or on par with expected--
13 with the expectations of what the program would
14 provide?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Do you
16 mean, does it correlated with a PNA before we started
17 the project?

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Well, does it
19 correlate to what was-- what were the initial
20 projections, right? I've seen over the years when a
21 number of projections around the amount of relief
22 that RAD/PACT would actually provide in relationship
23 to the needs. So I'm wondering is it providing the
24 amount of relief on track with your projections? Is
25 it underperforming, over-performing?

1 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: It's
2 hard to compare the final project cost with early
3 projections. I think what we really need to focus on
4 is what is the end result, what is the product that
5 residents are getting, and that gets shaped in the
6 pre-development process. So we select a development
7 team. They spend about year going through and
8 investigating the buildings, really understanding
9 what that scope of work is and developing that for
10 us. That is reviewed by us in the design and
11 construction team that I mentioned. It's reviewed by
12 HUD and it's signed off, and it's meant to meet all
13 of the physical needs that are identified in that
14 whole process. I know there was a hearing a couple
15 of weeks ago about the PNA, and you know, the PNA is
16 a sample, right, of buildings, sample of apartments
17 within those buildings and it is meant to reflect
18 NYCHA's cost and a certain approach to head [sic]
19 nailing those renovations. What we have found from
20 project to project at this point-- I know, you know,
21 37,000 apartments in a program that's a big number,
22 but relative to our portfolio we still have a long
23 way to go. It's a fairly still somewhat small sample
24 size. My point is we have a lot of different
25

1 building types, a lot of campus typologies, buildings
2 of various ages, different construction methods, and
3 so the point is we have some projects that have come
4 in under the PNA, and we've had some projects come in
5 over the PNA, and it is-- so it is hard to really
6 compare and say are you measuring-- are we achieving
7 the PNA. The point is, are we delivering on the 20-
8 year needs. That's what we have to solve for.

10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: right. No, I
11 appreciate that, and I know there's obviously a
12 complex analysis here. Nevertheless, we're pursuing
13 a program for a purpose, right? And there are
14 investments that we're making in that program, and so
15 we want to, you know, ensure that that is being
16 looked at as critically as possible. So I appreciate
17 that. In terms of the funding goals set forth in--
18 oh, are the funding goals set forth in the PACT
19 program realistic due to the high interest loans that
20 are impacting the real estate industry? How are you
21 engaging with that?

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: What
23 do you mean by the funding?

24

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: The high-interest
3 loans, like how is that impacting your projections
4 for how you'll be able to move these bundles forward?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So--

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Are
7 they eating into what you're expecting to be able to
8 deliver on?

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Sure, I
10 mean, yes. You know, when we started PACT we were in
11 a different environment when interest rates were
12 close to zero, and certainly with the pandemic went
13 even further and closer to zero, and so that allowed
14 us to do certain things, and now that interest rates
15 have been going back up it has certainly been a
16 challenge, but we're committed to delivering, again,
17 on the 20-year need. We want to make sure that these
18 buildings are rehabbed and put on a solid footing
19 for, you know, the next 100 years in fact. So, the
20 way we structure these deals-- Andrew mentioned
21 earlier having capital reserves in the life of the
22 Trust. That's the same for PACT. We want to make
23 sure that this is, you know, not a one-time
24 investment, but hopefully is going to be the one-time
25 major overhaul, and then you have regular program of

1 maintenance going on every 15 to 20 years, right? So
2 that is what we're working towards, and so it's made
3 the task certainly more challenging in a high-
4 interest-- or higher interest rate environment, but
5 so far it has not stopped us from getting projects
6 done.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. In terms
9 of-- do you keep track of the staffing levels at
10 developments pre and post conversion?

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We do,
12 although it is really an apple to oranges comparison,
13 because the actual numbers are pretty comparable, and
14 that may indicate, you know, depending on your
15 perspective that's good or bad. But the reality is,
16 is the way NYCHA organizes its work and the work
17 rules associated with NYCHA is very different than
18 what the PACT partner says. So, it's not easy to say
19 well, there's a number here and compared to NYCHA and
20 that's good or bad. It has to be what are the
21 employees doing at the sites.

22 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Are you-- have you
23 disaggregated that and where it make sense? Like, in
24 particular groundskeepers, right? Like all the
25 operational people that it takes to maintain the

1
2 properties. Do you see any differences with maybe
3 certain different jobs?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We have
5 certainly looked at absolute numbers, and we've
6 looked at general job categories and we can share
7 that information.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: But generally you
9 see they're-- I mean, you said they're apples to
10 oranges, but they're also kind of comparable.

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: The
12 absolute numbers are generally comparable, but--

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Oh, I
14 got it.

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: the
16 type of work that's happening is different.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Different, got it.
18 Okay. Yeah, we'd be happy to see the disaggregated
19 numbers. What's the expectation around how many more
20 developments will be converted into the PACT program?
21 You mentioned the number. We said there was 18,000
22 over the next two years, three years, right, to 25?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes,
24 2025.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Can you tell me what
3 the number is for the next year, how many you're
4 expecting to convert in the next fiscal year?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
6 our fiscal year, which is the calendar year--

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Oh,
8 right.

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
10 2024 would be about 10,000 that we're aiming to
11 close.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. in terms
13 of-- and we talked a little bit about this throughout
14 the hearing, but just to have it all in one place,
15 what are the metrics that you use to evaluate the
16 PACT developments? You mentioned, you know, the
17 monthly reporting, but what are the metrics that
18 you're looking at?

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
20 the monthly reports are huge, and we're going to
21 continue to build out the analytics around that. So
22 we have a first iteration of this, which again, we're
23 going to have an online dashboard. You'll all be
24 able to critique that, and I know with the
25 legislation that you've introduced, there's going to

1
2 be some other things it will include. But even
3 beyond that, we're certainly happy to continue to
4 look at different ways of measuring success.
5 Something else that we've introduced recently is
6 resident surveys which I think is critically
7 important. So for any project where construction has
8 been complete for on year, we are now conducting
9 surveys. I will not get into the details yet,
10 because we're going to have sessions with the TA
11 leadership at each of these developments to talk
12 about the results. But I can say as a general matter,
13 people are satisfied with both the end result, but
14 also just ongoing maintenance and operations. And
15 again, we're going to have meetings with the
16 residents at each of these developments and go over
17 the results with them, and then we can share that
18 out.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: so, but what are
20 some of the metrics that you look at when your team
21 is looking at these monthly reports? What are they
22 looking for specifically? Like, the high level, like
23 not obviously the details of it, but--

24 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
25 [interposing] I mean, it's really work orders, and

1 specifically focused on the pillar areas that we've
2 discussed before and legal proceedings. Those are
3 the biggest things that we look at to make sure that
4 residents are being served.

5
6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, the pillar
7 areas, legal proceedings-- and what was the other
8 one? I think I missed one.

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Those
10 are the two major ones.

11 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Oh, those are the
12 two main areas.

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Right.
14 And we also track financial performance and other
15 things, and of course we take it seriously, but what
16 we look at as it relates to resident experience is
17 work orders, resolution to those work orders, and the
18 legal proceedings.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay, that's what I
20 missed. I'm having trouble hearing. So, work orders
21 was what you said. I thought I heard you say it.

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Right.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILES: but losing my mind.
24 Thank you for that. And in terms of the surveys, how
25 many PACT developments have you surveyed to-date?

1
2 I'm delighted to hear that you're engaging resident
3 feedback on that. How many have you been able to
4 complete?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: There
6 are about five projects that we have-- that we're in
7 some stage of the survey process right now, and we
8 can report back.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: and are you doing
10 them in all the converted developments?

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Oh,
12 yes, we're committed. This is going to be a
13 permanent feature of the program. So as other
14 developments reach completion, and then there's that
15 year of stabilization, we'll then do the surveys.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. In terms
17 of-- has NYCHA conducted an analysis on evictions
18 that have taken place at PACT sites after conversion?

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes.
20 In fact, you know, we track-- again, because as I
21 mentioned, we track legal proceedings. So we have
22 real-time data on a month to month basis. There have
23 been 109 evictions since the program began in 2016
24 with Ocean Bay. I know this has been covered a lot.

1
2 The bulk of those evictions happened at Ocean Bay for
3 reasons that have been previously discussed.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yep.

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Those
6 cases have been reviewed and found to be perfectly
7 legitimate. So it's relatively light. And I will
8 say, the other thing that we rolled out in 2020 is a
9 set of housing retention guidelines, and it is our
10 expectation and in fact a requirement that the PACT
11 partners follow these guidelines. And so what am I
12 talking about? It basically means provide a level of
13 deep customer services. So it's not enough to simply
14 see a resident not pay rent and then start a
15 proceeding or to have some other hold-over type issue
16 and then start a proceeding. We want them to go in,
17 understand, and talk to the residents, and they need
18 to demonstrate to us that they made multiple attempts
19 to talk to residents to understand what is the
20 problem. So if you're not paying your rent, did you
21 lose your job; have your hours been reduced? Then
22 point them into a direction of the resources, whether
23 that's a recertification with NYCHA or other
24 resources that could help them get back on track. So
25 we don't-- you know, it is a long process. we

1 watched the whole evolution from pre-eviction
2 outreach and the engagement that they're doing with
3 residents to understand those issues, and we need to
4 make sure that they have followed all of those steps,
5 and that they've adequately engaged our residents.

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. Do
7 resident-- do residents have the access to see what
8 these agreements look like, or the expectation?
9

10 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
11 Guidelines you mean?

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah, yeah, yeah.

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We
14 could certainly release it. There's no reason not
15 to.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Just curious.
17 What's the most common reason that a private
18 management company has started eviction proceedings?

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
20 mean, it's pretty--

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Of the
22 160 [sic]

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: evenly
24 I think between nonpayment and hold-over type issues.

2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. Okay. So,
3 we understand that RAD/PACT is not covered by the HUD
4 Agreement, and in the absence of the agreements
5 protections, how are tenants in RAD/PACT guaranteed
6 the necessary work under the pillars? So you're
7 tracking it-- not required under the HUD, is that
8 correct?

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
10 we're not subject to the HUD agreement but that
11 doesn't mean--

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Right.

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: that
14 we're not subject to other HUD rules. So, as I
15 mentioned earlier, as part of a PACT project, we have
16 to address the 20-year physical needs. So, by
17 default, you know, that covers the project. But
18 also, as it relates to more specific types of issues
19 like lead abatement and dealing with mold and other
20 environmental hazards, we have harmonized our rules
21 and procedures with the rest of NYCHA. So, again,
22 that there's no difference between being in Section 9
23 or being in a PACT project.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. Are the-- I
3 can't remember this. Are the agreements between
4 NYCHA and the developers in the program made public?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We
6 have template documents on our website. So people can
7 see--

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] But
9 not the actual agreements.

10 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No,
11 no.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Is there a reason
13 why you wouldn't make those public?

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
15 mean, generally we want to be able to negotiate with
16 the PACT partners and get the best, you know, terms
17 given the specifics of any given project. I mean,
18 there is a template set of documents, but there are
19 certainly variations based on conditions and other
20 issues at each site. So we want to make sure that
21 we're having, you know, good faith negotiations with
22 our development team. So that's the main reason.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, is a concern
24 that we're talking about after the agreement is--

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:

[interposing] Those could be then--

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: making it public.

Is it concern of copycat problems--

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:

[interposing] used like to inform other negotiations,
right.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Right.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: I just wanted to
make sure I understood. What are the metrics
available regarding timeframes for completion of work
orders at RAD/PACT developments?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We can
share that with you. We have it in our monthly
reports. And so we've set timelines for resolving
all of these issues.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Do they mirror what
the timeframes for repairs at regular developments
would be?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Can
you repeat that?

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Do they mirror the
3 same time expectation for regular traditional Section
4 9?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:

6 Generally. Specifically as it relates to dealing
7 with environmental hazards that I mentioned, we
8 didn't want to have people in reality or be in
9 perception to feel like they were disadvantaged if
10 they're going through PACT so those are the same. We
11 can confirm as it relates to some of the other non-
12 environmental hazards like elevator outages and
13 alike.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay, but you keep
15 track of those timeframes--

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:

17 [interposing] Yeah.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: and have metrics
19 around it? Great, we'd love to see them. For
20 Section 9 residents, mold remediation is required to
21 be completed within 18 months. Does that also look
22 like the RAD/PACT repair and remediation timeframe?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We
24 worked out an agreement with the special master and
25 plaintiffs in Baez. So again, we can send you the

1
2 specifics on, you know, simple repairs versus complex
3 repairs.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yep.

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: And
6 the different timelines associated with each.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, that's-- you
8 read the document and you discern it? Is that what
9 the answer was?

10 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No,
11 we'll follow up. We can walk you through it. We'll
12 send you the document, whatever forum is most
13 helpful.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay. Let's see.
15 Okay. Is the-- in terms of the dashboard around
16 capital projects, is the-- the developers that are
17 doing capital projects under RAD/PACT also a part of
18 that dashboard? Are residents able to--

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
20 [interposing] It's a separate dashboard, yeah.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: A separate
22 dashboard. Residents are able to still track what is
23 happening in the development in terms of capital
24 repairs in the same way?

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 166

2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Sorry,
3 I don't fully--

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] NO,
5 no, it's okay. I'm--

6 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
7 [interposing] Are you just asking if our [inaudible]
8 is on the capital?

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: I'm losing steam so
10 I probably make no sense at all. So, apologies. Is
11 there a capital tracker for those developments under
12 RAD/PACT that allow residents to track--

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
14 [interposing] OH, I see what you're saying.

15 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: capital repairs
16 publicly?

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No, not
18 at this time.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Is there a
20 consideration to do that?

21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
22 Certainly something we can explore. I mean, one of
23 the things that we will have on the dashboard is
24 overall progress towards completion, but at this time
25

1
2 it wasn't designed with a specific breakout of every
3 type of work that's being done.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So tell me more
5 about this dashboard you've mentioned several time.
6 What's going to be on it and what are the timeframes
7 associated?

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
9 it has admittedly taken a while, because we want to
10 make sure we get both the data right and we wanted to
11 make sure that it is user friendly and digestible and
12 all that. Hoping to have it before the end of the
13 year, but you know, the areas that we're focusing on,
14 again, relate to work orders at each of the projects,
15 and again with a focus on the pillar areas, and
16 resolution to resolving those work orders. Legal
17 actions, so evictions essentially form financial non-
18 payment or holdover. It's also going to cover the
19 overall progress as I mentioned, not by stream of
20 work. It's say, you know, Williamsburg Houses 50
21 percent at this month, and it'll obviously work its
22 way to 100 so you can you seen generally where you
23 are in the timeline, and it also will track Section 3
24 performance.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

168

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. And when is the hope for rollout?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Hopefully the end of this year.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: End of the year, okay. Yeah, yeah, so let's-- let's I guess switch into-- right. Oh, yes, yeah, yeah. Thank you. Yeah, so in terms of Intro 646, we were wondering what are the distinctions between what the bill is asking for and what the dashboard will be rolling out?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I mean, I think I have to study the legislation a little more closely, but I think there-- my first read on it was that a lot of what you're asking for is what we: A, either intend to put on the dashboard, or B, have at our disposal. So this is a good effort towards transparency and we're supportive.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Great. So that sounds like you're very supportive and anticipating. In terms of-- so for some of the developments with persistent HPD violations post-conversion, how are you performing the reviews there? You're receiving monthly reports, yet we're hearing some of the

1
2 development are still having quite a large number of
3 violations. How-- what's happening there?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
5 I mean, I think we're going to need to do dig into
6 that comment that was made earlier, because you know,
7 look, I think violations can be filed at any point
8 along the lifecycle of a project. It could be pre-
9 development, during construction and maybe even
10 immediately after construction. Obviously, our
11 expectation is that once you've done a full
12 renovation and you're into regular operations, you
13 should not be seeing a lot of these violations,
14 right? It's inevitable that even the best operators
15 will have violations. That happens. So I can't say
16 that there will ever be no violations, but I would--
17 again, that was the first that I had heard of that,
18 and so I would want to look into it to understand
19 which developments are getting violations and when
20 are they getting those violations as it relates to
21 where we are in the project lifecycle, and then we
22 can report back.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. Yeah, I
24 mean, I would imagine NYCHA will want to proactively
25 cull HPD violations--

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:

[interposing] Yep.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: as opposed to the reverse where folks are telling you they're happening. And I believe there is some work that is supposed to be happening in regards to HPD violations and some reporting. Does that ring a bell, recent legislation that we're waiting to hear implementation and update about?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: There is-- yeah, yes, there's state legislation that would require HPD to put code violations on their site, and it is something that we're working with that agency in order to do. You know, I think there's an IT issue on their side, but it is something that they're actively working to get into compliance with.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And you mentioned earlier that so far we haven't had any RAD/PACT developers who have received any fines for poor management? Fines or termination of contracts, so far we've been good on that end. Okay, thank you. In terms of-- what does the outreach look like post-conversion? Do you maintain-- I know you put together these great teams pre-- what happens post?

1
2 Do those teams dissipate? What is the engagement?
3 Who's in charge of engagement?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No,
5 we're very much involved in engagement all the way
6 through construction, because as has been discussed
7 in various context during this hearing and in other
8 hearings, there's still a lot of anxiety and
9 confusion and alike, so we recognize that we have to
10 be there and have a presence throughout the
11 construction period. So that is what we are doing as
12 a matter of course for all other current projects,
13 and I would expect we'd continue that going forward.
14 You know, by the time we get to the end of
15 construction, we generally would roll back. That's
16 not to say we go away. You know, issues come up on
17 projects that have been completed, and we of course,
18 are going to respond, but it's a less intensive
19 engagement.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. Thank you.
21 Do RAD and PACT developers have a right to alter
22 NYCHA eviction qualifications? Those PACT
23 development are no longer Section 9 and are not
24 covered under the HUD agreement.

2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: do
3 they have the right to change--

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] To
5 alter NYCHA eviction qualifications.

6 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No,
7 and their lease that they use was actually created by
8 us--

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Okay.

10 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: with
11 all of the rules and the frameworks in that, and
12 reviewed by Legal Aid. And so, you know, they can't-
13 -

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] They
15 can't change that lease--

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
17 [interposing] change the lease, and therefore they
18 can't change the rules.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. Thank you.
20 With private management taking the lead on rent and
21 eviction notices, has NYCHA engaged with management
22 companies on developing outreach plans to make sure
23 residents are properly informed of the change?

24

25

1 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
2 that's the housing retention guidelines that I
3 mentioned.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Oh, got it.

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So, we
6 proactively took that step in 2020, and it's been, I
7 think, very successful. We get regular reporting on
8 all of their activities, and we make sure that
9 they're doing engagement.

10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you. And in
11 terms of-- let's see. Let's move over to Chelsea--
12 to Fulton Elliott for a second. So, in terms of--
13 you mentioned-- can you walk us through one more time
14 what the next steps that are going to happen around
15 this conversion?

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
17 immediate next steps fall into two categories. One
18 would be the environmental review process.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Right.

20 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So the
21 notice of intent will be published in the middle of
22 November. That sets us up for the beginning of the
23 public scoping sessions that would be in January, and
24 then we would expect a draft EIS, you know, once
25

1 everyone has heard from the public and all that input
2 has been incorporated, the draft EIS should be about
3 April of 2024 with a final EIS being published
4 towards the end of 202 which would then allow us to
5 start the ULURP process either early-- or sorry, late
6 2024 or early 2025. The other thing that is not part
7 of a formal process, you may have heard of the
8 Meanwhile Plan. And so this is an effort to start to
9 make improvements early on. So one of the areas that
10 residents have prioritized would be security. So
11 what the Essence & Related team is proposing to do is
12 to provide on-site patrols of both Fulton and Elliott
13 Chelsea. These would be unarmed folks who would have
14 eyes on the street and residents would have an
15 ability to, you know, flag issues, or they would--
16 obviously if they spot issues they can work with NYPD
17 and NYCHA to remedy any issues. Once we, you know,
18 get the environmental clearances, that level of
19 security will be enhanced. Right now they can't make
20 any changes to the building, so they would improve
21 the door locks, cameras, all of that sort of thing,
22 and make those physical improvements to also enhance
23 the security.
24

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So who's paying for
3 this?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: It's a
5 project cost and Essence & Related pay for that.

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, Essence &
7 Related are paying for all the needs currently in
8 Chelsea Fulton right now?

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No,
10 just the-- the first phase would be the security
11 enhancement that I mentioned. So they would pay for
12 that.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And is that-- they
14 already have a signed agreement?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: It'll
16 be an amendment to the license agreement that we have
17 with them.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Oh, okay. When was
19 the license agreement signed?

20 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: It
21 would have been when we designated them in 2021, and
22 that allowed them to do the inspections on-site and
23 engagement and other things that they were doing from
24 2021 to the present. It does not contemplate
25

1 security and other changes, so we have to-- we have
2 to modify the license agreement to account for that.

3 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: got it. And has HUD
4 approved the disposition of the developments?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Not
6 yet.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: In terms of
8 relocation planning, can you talk to us a little bit
9 about what that-- if there has been an agreement?
10 Has it been drafted and submitted? What does it look
11 like?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So, 94
13 percent of residents would stay in their existing
14 apartment until their brand new apartment and brand
15 new building are ready for occupancy. So they'd move
16 once, and they'd only have to do that when there's a
17 new building. The other six percent are related to
18 Chelsea addition and Fulton 11 [sic]. So, one
19 building at each campus. Those folks would have to
20 be temporarily relocated because each of those
21 buildings would have to be the first two on each
22 campus to be demolished once people have been
23 relocated and then rebuilt. There are a number of
24 vacancies. We always hold vacancies when we do a
25

1 PACT project, so we have a number of vacancies at
2 both sites, and our plan is to put the vast majority
3 into vacant units at Fulton and Elliott Chelsea. To
4 the extent that, you know, resident preference or
5 because household composition doesn't match available
6 unit size, they would be temporarily relocated to
7 sites off-campus but still within Chelsea so that
8 they can maintain schools, doctors, etcetera.

9
10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Do you know how many
11 people constitute the six percent?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: It's
13 about 120 households.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And how many
15 current-- how many units are currently vacant?

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: It's
17 around 80 or so.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So why was the
19 decision made to move forward with demolition of
20 NYCHA buildings prior to the required ULURP process?

21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
22 it's not a decision per say. What we did is we had--
23 responding to resident feedback. We had started a
24 robust engagement process early this year to talk
25 about the options, the options being a rebuilding

1 scenario, one with ULURP, one as-of-right, and also
2 sticking with the original plan of rehabbing all of
3 Fulton Elliott Chelsea, plus one in-fill building at
4 Elliott Chelsea. And so that ran us through the
5 spring and early summer of this year, and we
6 conducted the survey and residents selected the new
7 construction. So, it is a proposal, and we are
8 moving forward based on that resident feedback.

10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And this is the--
11 you're referring to-- well, I know there were many
12 meetings. Are you referring to the survey that was
13 conducted?

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: The
15 survey and the meetings all happened simultaneously.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Did you-- I haven't
17 seen the survey. I've heard a lot about this survey,
18 but I have not seen it. Do you-- did you maintain
19 metrics on how many people responded to the survey
20 and where the responses were coming from?

21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes,
22 CHPC worked as a survey administrator, so we did not
23 collect the actual surveys because we wanted it to be
24 separate from us, and they calculate-- they collected

1
2 the surveys which could be done on paper and also
3 online, and then they tabulated the results.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Great. I'd love to
5 see the survey and the results that were collected.

6 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Okay.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Were you--
8 obviously, without sharing personal information, were
9 you able to disaggregate where they came from, from
10 within the development? Like, is they're evenly
11 distributed or you see maybe more coming from one
12 area than another. Like, what kind of demographics
13 were kept on the Reponses?

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So, we
15 don't have it at that level, but we have it, you
16 know, across-- we're treating this as one project.
17 So we have across Fulton and Elliott Chelsea. We
18 didn't break it down by apartment number or building
19 number and the like.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Right, but they are
21 three-- it's three developments, right?

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
23 Technically four.

24 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Technically, four.
25 Potentially we have four different identities, right?

1
2 People are very particular about their homes. It'd
3 be curious to see like what the representation is
4 across those. In terms of-- when Chelsea Elliott
5 Fulton is rebuilt, what would be the breakdown of
6 Section 8, Section 9, and market-rate apartments?

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
8 all 2,056 NYCHA apartments would be rebuilt. We are
9 proposing to add roughly an additional thousand
10 affordable, not replacement, but affordable.

11 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: What does affordable
12 mean? Because in New York City that could mean
13 unaffordable.

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: The
15 exact-- right. The exact income bands are still
16 being worked out, but we anticipate being MIH-
17 compliant, and then 2,500 market-rate.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, the 1,000 is
19 meant to be the MIH-compliant, 20 percent, and then
20 30, 3,500 market-rate?

21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: 2,500.

22 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: 2,500, pardon. And
23 the 2,056 will be 100-- will be shifted from Section
24 9 to Section 8.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes.

And again, as I mentioned earlier in this session, this is entirely a PACT project. Again, new for New York to use RAD in this way, but not new in other parts of the country.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: well, we're not wanting to follow other parts of the country, that's for sure. How does adding market-rate apartments to the development site help NYCHA achieve this mission?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I mean, the main piece here is that it helps finance the rebuilding of NYCHA apartments, and they're going to get fully modern apartments with all of the requirements that we would expect today. So, you know, things that a lot of folks might take for granted will be built into these buildings. So you're going to get, you know, ADA-- complete ADA accessibility, sustainable buildings, other building amenities like a doorman and a mail room, and all these things that you could not get in, you know, a standard rehabilitation of our projects. The other thing that we've heard from residents and I think there's some here today who are going to be speaking, is that they wanted to be integrated. They did not

1
2 want to stand out as they feel they have been in the
3 last number of years as the whole area around Chelsea
4 has developed. So they want to be better integrated
5 into the community.

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: so, I don't know how
7 many buildings there are, but essentially the Section
8 8, the affordable, and the market-rate units are all
9 going to be dispersed within one build-- let's say
10 for intents and purpose, it was one building, it'll
11 be mixed in.

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: The
13 original thought that we had was to do exactly that.
14 So you'd have a number of buildings, new buildings
15 across both Fulton Elliott Chelsea. We'd have
16 market-rate, affordable, and NYCHA all interspersed,
17 but to do that logistically would take too long, and
18 what we heard from residents is that they want, they
19 need-- want and need relief quickly. So they wanted
20 to have purpose built NYCHA replacement out of the
21 gate. So that's the commitment, to build the first
22 2,056 apartments first before anything else happens.
23 What we are trying to do is make sure that those
24 NYCHA buildings are dispersed throughout the site.
25 So each building--

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Got
3 it. Got it. So the--

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: will be
5 entirely NYCHA, but you will not have like a corner
6 that's NYCHA and then everything else. We're trying
7 to mix and match and again, in response to resident
8 feedback.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. Okay, I
10 understand better. I mean, is the mixed income
11 development the-- I mean, NYCHA's currently mixed
12 income, so it's not distinct in that way. But is
13 this like what NYCHA is moving towards for the
14 future, this kind of--

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
16 [interposing] I think it is certainly a possibility,
17 right? I can tell you that since the news of Fulton
18 and Elliott Chelsea has come out, we've had residents
19 at other development ask us to start talking about a
20 similar concept.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Why did NYCHA decide
22 to revisit a voting process that had already occurred
23 in 2019?

24 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
25 it wasn't-- there wasn't a voting process in 2019.

1 We started a working group in 2019 which ran 'til
2 2021. And that-- at the end of that process, general
3 consensus was rehab of the 2,056 apartments and one
4 in-fill building at Elliott Chelsea. It was going to
5 be-- well, there were a number of sites identified, I
6 should clarify, for potential in-fill. The project
7 that was selected had one in-fill project at Elliott
8 Chelsea with 120 units, 50 percent market, 50 percent
9 affordable. As we-- so that was at the end of 2021.
10 As we went into 2022 and Essence & Related were
11 starting to do their investigations, there were two
12 things happening. One was consistent with what
13 you've seen with our escalating PNA, and related to
14 some of the comments I was making earlier in response
15 to one of your questions, the deterioration was far
16 worse than anticipated so the costs were starting to
17 escalate. At the same time, some residents were
18 starting to ask about this new building at Elliott
19 Chelsea and asking when they could move into that
20 building, and that was not meant to be replacement
21 housing. And so the question kept coming and that's
22 when we decided well, if resident leaders at Fulton
23 and Elliott Chelsea want to explore this, we can
24
25

1
2 explore it, and that's what then led to what we did
3 earlier this year with the engagement process.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, there wasn't--
5 so you're saying there actually wasn't really a
6 voting-- I mean, didn't residents vote for the first
7 iteration?

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: It was
9 not a vote. It was a-- there was a working group and
10 residents were on the selection committee that ended
11 up picking the Essence & Related team, but there was
12 not a vote.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And the survey,
14 you're considering a vote?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No,
16 it's-- we-- it's a survey.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, the survey is
18 not considered in your eyes a binding vote, it is
19 merely a temperature check?

20 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
21 mean, it is binding enough that we're going to move
22 forward and do the-- go through the public approvals
23 process.

24

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: I mean, did the
3 residents understand it as a binding vote? How is
4 that portrayed?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
6 yeah, I know--

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Because
8 a survey is very different, right? A survey is like,
9 give us your ideas, which may change tomorrow.

10 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well, I
11 will tell you, the decision-- the decision and the
12 design on the survey, again, was done in partnership
13 with resident leadership. And I know, again, some
14 folks from Fulton are here today who were part of the
15 decision-making and hopefully they'll get a chance to
16 speak to this, but the path that we took was really
17 based on the feedback that we got from residents.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Right, but the
19 question is, did residents understand that this
20 survey was being considered a binding vote?

21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
22 mean, we never phrased it as a binding vote, so--

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] And
24 it's not being used as a binding vote.

1 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No,
2 but it is taking us down this road of this public
3 approvals process that we're going to start that I--

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] You
5 see the challenge here, right?

6 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I hear
7 what you're saying, but there's a public process
8 that's about to begin, and there'll be lots of time
9 for more engagement.
10

11 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Right, based on a
12 survey that is a temperature check, not hat
13 potentially residents-- and I don't this, so-- I
14 don't-- I've heard varying perspectives around this,
15 but it sounds like there wasn't clear indication that
16 NYCHA would use this survey as a binding vote
17 document.

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I,
19 again--

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] By
21 which to then do a process.

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: we
23 never called it-- we never called it a binding vote,
24 but we made clear that if they selected one of those
25 three options that I had talked about, that that

1 would be the option that we would pursue. So that
2 was said repeatedly.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And was there a
5 threshold of-- I guess in the same way that the Trust
6 is creating a voting process, was there a threshold
7 that was determined around this?

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: In
9 terms of the number of people who'd have to select an
10 option? Is that what you mean?

11 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah, yeah.

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: More
13 than 50 percent.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay. It wasn't a--
15 just happened?

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No, it
17 was more than 50 percent, and to be clear, what we
18 had said was anyone who's over the age of 18 and on a
19 lease was eligible to fill out a survey.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Is that the same--
21 is that the same threshold that's being used for the
22 Trust?

23 ANDREW KAPLAN: In terms of first pass
24 the post [sic], right? So, the option with the most-

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Closer and louder.

ANDREW KAPLAN: Vote's wins, yes, but the minimum participation threshold is 20 percent.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: For the-- for the Trust it is to be eligible to vote in that process you have to be-- is it head of household?

ANDREW KAPLAN: It's anyone-- yeah, so it's anyone who's on the lease or on the household composition above the age of 18.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And is that the same criteria used for the other-- for the survey?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes, it was anyone over 18 who was on the lease.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Great. Alright, I guess we'll-- when we get the materials, we'll-- let's see. How is-- I guess, how is NYCHA going to provide for accommodations, particularly for vulnerable populations? I think one of the buildings may be a senior development, or what percentage of this development is seniors and potentially disabled right?

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
3 Chelsea addition is a seniors building. What-- I'm
4 not clear on your question, can you repeat?

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah, yeah, in terms
6 of particular accommodations for them.

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So, as
8 part of our engagement, we had very specific and
9 focused and intentional meetings with residents as
10 both Fulton 11 and Chelsea addition, the two
11 buildings that would require a temporary relocation,
12 and so there's a whole set of engagement that we've
13 been doing that's very much focused on their needs.
14 Essence has brought on HOU which is an organization
15 that is focused on protecting tenant rights, and they
16 have been doing in-depth surveying of residents to
17 understand their needs. So, you know, is there
18 medical equipment or do they need special
19 accommodations? So we are compiling all of that data
20 so that we can understand how we can serve them and
21 make sure the transition is as seamless as possible.

22 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. And doesn't
23 NYCHA maintain data that way?

24 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes,
25 but I mean, I think we want the most current and

1
2 real-time data. Obviously, with all of what's going
3 on and the conversations around this project, we want
4 to make sure we're hearing from people and their
5 relevant concerns, again, in real-time.

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: right. I don't mean
7 to be funny. I just-- I've heard NYCHA say we
8 maintain, we know where the residents are who are
9 medical fragile or need additional help. In terms
10 of-- how is NYCHA managing tenant concerns around
11 relocation right now?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: In
13 what way? I mean, again, we are surveying to
14 understand--

15 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Are
16 you still having meetings? I'm hearing a whole lot
17 of anger amongst, across residents, a lot of
18 misinformation, you know, a lot of feeling about it.
19 So I'm interested in knowing beyond what Related is
20 doing. Related is protecting their interest. I want
21 to know who's protecting the residents' interest, and
22 how do we make sure that they are engaged and they
23 are being supported? We don't have a good track
24 record with demolition. We heard it from Council
25 Member Mealy.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Right.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Those folks never returned home. And across the country, demolition has generally not allowed people to return home. We, in New York City, when we demolish any kind of low income housing, generally people don't return. It's taken 20, 30 years. So I guess, given the height of emotion and concern, what is NYCHA currently doing to support residents in understanding and supporting dialogue, because things are definitely getting heated.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Sure.

So, we've been engaged in very robust conversations in regular meetings with our residents since this pivot earlier this year happened. In the last month or two, we've been doing-- we've continued that engagement, but a little less intensively than in the spring and summer so that we can actually develop the plans around the EIS. As I mentioned, the HOU is doing their surveying and their analysis. And you know, as we get ready to start the EIS process, we're going to ramp back up the intensive engagement that we have done throughout this entire process, because as you've said, we want to make sure we get it right.

1 We don't want anybody to get lost in the shuffle. We
2 want to make sure that this is a benefit for
3 residents of Fulton Elliott Chelsea.
4

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Is there a place
6 for-- I've heard from some residents who don't feel
7 like they can use the usual mechanisms, right? That
8 they feel estranged from the tenant leadership
9 representation, or they quite frankly don't trust any
10 of us. What are the places that they can go to put
11 forward their grievances and their experiences around
12 this process?

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
14 mean, it's a good question. I mean, I think
15 typically they've gone to electeds, they've gone to
16 advocates and that is typically how we've heard if
17 they don't trust, you know, the resident leadership
18 or they don't trust NYCHA. I think that's probably
19 the best set of options that there are.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: But then y'all tell
21 us everything is great and it's robust engagement, so
22 how are we collecting these and responding in real
23 time?

24 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
25 it is robust and I do think there is a common thread,

1
2 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Our
3 rent collection numbers are still about 62 percent
4 which is really impacting our operations, as you can
5 imagine. So we're remaining consistent at this
6 point.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Oh boy. In terms of
8 the \$163 million that was set aside for ERAP [sic],
9 we know that \$128 million was specifically for NYCHA.
10 As of today, have you received any of that money?

11 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Yes.
12 We are very thankful to our state partners in OTDA.
13 We've been working collaboratively, and as of
14 yesterday we've received \$67.9 million from OTDA.
15 What they've agreed to do, which we are very thankful
16 for, is take the highest 12 months of rent arrears.
17 So it is taking some time to go through each of the
18 tenant files and make sure that it's properly
19 credited.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: I'm not sure I
21 understand the method. The highest--

22 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: So,
23 most of our tenants have been in rent-- most of our
24 tenants who are in rent arrear--

25 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Right.

1
2 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: have
3 been in rent arear since March of 2022. If you--
4 excuse me, March of 2020 when the pandemic started.
5 As you may recall, one of the benefits of being a
6 public housing resident is if your rent or your
7 income decreases, your rent decreases. What we are
8 doing is applying funds from OTDA for the highest 12
9 months out of the three years of arears.

10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. And when is
11 OTDA expected to fund the remaining amount?

12 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: We
13 are continuing to work with them. We've identified--
14 they're going through the applications that they've
15 identified as NYCHA residents. So it's a very time
16 consuming and laborious process, but they've been
17 working very collaboratively with us and our team,
18 and for that I'm really thankful.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah, sure. Is
20 there-- as you're going through the process, will
21 then residents be notified that they're--

22 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT:
23 [interposing] Yes, so we will notify them, and then
24 what our intention is to direct them to one-shot
25 deals, to payment plans, because the money that

1
2 they're receiving from OTDA is capped at 12 months,
3 and as I just said, you know, we're nearing the end
4 of 2023. So, the tenants who have applied for ERAP
5 have been in rent arrears for close to three years.
6 So they will need supportive services for the balance
7 of their rent arrears. We need to get them back into
8 the cadence of paying rent.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: thank you for that
10 update. There's so much anxiety on the ground around
11 where folks are with it.

12 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: For
13 all of us.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And I'm sad to see
15 that we're still at 63 percent. I know this is huge
16 challenge. How many evictions has NYCHA filed in
17 this past year?

18 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: So,
19 as you know, NYCHA's goal is to keep people housed
20 and resolve tenant arrears. We are really the
21 landlord of last resort in New York, so we take that
22 obligation very, very seriously. Since the end of
23 the eviction moratorium in January 2022 we have
24 executed 33 evictions, two in 2022, and 31 in 2023.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay, thank you. How
3 many NYCHA apartments are currently vacant?

4 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I'm
5 going to turn it over to Eva Trimble.

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Finally.

7 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Right
8 now NYCHA has approximately 4,900 vacant units
9 available.

10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, obviously, given
11 our hearing several months back on these vacancies,
12 we're definitely left with this sense that NYCHA's
13 warehousing these units for the purposes of
14 fulfilling future plans. In addition to complying
15 with the new lead remediation standards, how is
16 NYCHA's vacant units being utilized moving forward?

17 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Right
18 now we are, I wouldn't say warehousing, but we are
19 holding vacant units in preparation for important
20 relocations as part of our capital preservation
21 programs. That includes both the Comp-Mod, PACT/RAD,
22 and in the future for the Trust, and we do that
23 number one, because the work that we're doing in
24 these properties involves environmental and
25 comprehensive rehab and it's not safe for the

1 residents to stay in place, and number two, it's very
2 important to us that our residents stay in their
3 communities for a variety of reasons, schools,
4 doctors, things like that. And so it's important to
5 keep those apartments available for these programs in
6 order to make sure those preservation capital
7 projects work as smoothly as possible. Right now,
8 other than that, our vacant units are used to both
9 facilitate transfers from within NYCHA, emergency
10 transfers and others, as well as for the 250,000
11 people waiting on the public housing waitlist right
12 now.
13

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Oh, yeah. And in
15 terms of-- I mean, will priority of vacant units be
16 provided to unhoused domestic violence survivors
17 and/or relocated PACT residents? Like, how do you
18 prioritize among those populations?

19 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Right
20 now we have a tenant selection program that is-- that
21 sets forth the priorities and the selection process
22 for vacant units as they're-- once a vacant unit is
23 completed with the turnover work, then we make the
24 selection through the system of the next available
25 perspective tenants.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, tell more about the tenant selection program? Like, how are they doing that prioritization?

CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: We can certainly follow up with you separately. It's a pretty nuanced process, the tenant selection program, but it does set forth different priorities for both transfers and new applicants, and issues like domestic violence, emergency transfers-- you know, right now we have about 2,800 people on our emergency transfer list, but 10,000 people on the transfer list overall, and these get prioritized with new applicants as well.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: 2,800 is part of the 10,000, or--

CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE:
[interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: in addition to?

CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: It's part of.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Has the City provided any additional resources to address staffing concerns or contracts for outside vendors to complete

1
2 tasks such as paint and plaster jobs for the
3 vacancies.

4 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: So,
5 we're very grateful to the City for the \$65 million
6 in expense and \$8 million in capital that they've
7 provided for the vacant unit readiness program. That
8 is absolutely a key resource that is helping us
9 turnover units right now. Primarily that funds
10 vendor work. Items like plastering is a trade that's
11 very hard to find in the market right now, so NYCHA
12 supplements with our own staff for that kind of trade
13 work.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And have you been
15 able to see a quicker turnaround because of it? I
16 know we were up to like 400 days of sitting on-- not
17 sitting on-- where units were not yet ready.

18 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: That's
19 about what we're still experiencing right now, only
20 because we are still working through some of the
21 older vacancies in our pipeline, so they are well-
22 aged, but we are seeing more production coming out of
23 our program right now as we've moved to really focus
24 on this and improve some of the internal processes to
25 make it work better.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: I would imagine when
3 developers take over RAD/PACT developments, they're
4 faced with the similar challenges of remediation. Why
5 are they able to move things so quickly and it takes
6 us so long?

7 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Well,
8 they're-- I mean, I'll let Jonathan speak, but
9 they're doing comprehensive capital work. They're
10 not doing repairs. So, you know, it's much-- you
11 know, when you're replacing an entire stack and an
12 entire plumbing line, you're fixing future leaks,
13 you're fixing future problems. Right now when we're
14 coming in and doing turnover, we're doing minor
15 repairs that, you know, represent the needs in our
16 buildings right now. Obviously those leaks come back
17 until we're going to fix the underlying plumbing
18 issues.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. In terms
20 of-- yeah. Similarly, for Intro 648, is there a
21 distinction between what the Admin is doing right
22 now, what NYCHA is doing right now, and what the bill
23 is requiring?

24 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Much of
25 the information required in the bill is available

1 through data that NYCHA already produces. So we're
2 happy to work further with you on this, on this bill
3 to see what we can do.
4

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah, I mean,
6 obviously our big concern is 5,000 apartments with a
7 10,000 transfer list and 250,000 people waiting, and
8 over a year of getting those apartments online. It's
9 truly just untenable, so we've got to figure out how
10 to support and move that forward. Let me-- last
11 questions. If we could move to resident-managed
12 corporations very quickly. How does NYCHA-- and I
13 know we've talked about this before, but for the
14 record, how does NYCHA provide support for residents
15 interested in resident-managed corporations?

16 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Sure.
17 So any residents that request or express interest in
18 a resident management corporation, we've referred
19 them to HUD. It is a process that is outlined by
20 HUD, and I think they have to submit a request and
21 they have to prepare a plan for-- technical assistant
22 plan with HUD in order to go through that process. I
23 believe we've had a few requests that have come to
24 us, but have never completed the HUD process.
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

204

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And does NYCHA provided any training or support for that process?

CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: HUD does, yes.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Oh, HUD does, okay. Has there been-- have there been any RNC's completed to-date?

CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Not in New York City to my knowledge?

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Oh, okay.

CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: And my understanding is only a few across the country.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Say again? I'm sorry, I couldn't hear you.

CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: I think there's-- I don't believe there's been any in New York City, and I think there's only been a few in the country.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: I think with that, we-- I think with that we are ready to turn it over to public testimony. I want to thank you for your patience and responding to the Council Member's questions and the work that you do. Thank you.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We'll now move to
3 public testimony. For those wishing to testify, if
4 you have not already done so, please see the Sergeant
5 at Arms in the back of the room and fill out a
6 testimony slip. Even if you're registered online,
7 please still fill out a testimony slip with the
8 Sergeants in the back of the room. We will move to
9 in-person testimony first, and then to testimony on
10 Zoom. If you are wishing to testify on Zoom, after
11 in-person testimony, we will-- you will be prompted
12 one by one with a prompt to unmute yourself on your
13 computer. All those testifying today either in
14 person or virtually are encouraged to submit
15 testimony at council.nyc.gov/testimony or via email
16 at testimony@council.nyc.gov. I'll now call up the
17 first panel of in-person testimony. Hector Vasquez,
18 Marnie Hilassa [sp?], John Mudd [sp?], and Gloria
19 Tull [sp?], if you could come up to the dais, or to
20 the table? You can start when ready, Mr. Vasquez.

21 HECTOR VASQUEZ: Gotcha [sic]. Good
22 evening. My name is Hector Vasquez, and I'm here
23 today to speak as a resident of NYCHA Fulton Houses
24 and former resident of Elliott Chelsea Houses for
25 over 30 years. I'm also a disabled veteran raising

1
2 two children in deplorable conditions that we have
3 been forced to endure for a long time. Mine's one of
4 many families who are forced to live in conditions
5 that post serious risk to our wellbeing and that of
6 our children. I'm truly disappointed in folks who
7 are speaking out against this plan out of
8 misinformation and no real knowledge with what's
9 happening with the proposals. I've been part of the
10 working group for-- you know, since the beginning and
11 even been following up with subcommittees and
12 everything else. I'm also a member of the Fulton
13 Tenants Association and a former member of the
14 Elliott Chelsea Tenants Association. So I've been
15 heavily involved with this proposal since pretty much
16 day one. It's been-- I guarantee you that it has been
17 tenant-driven. We've had tenants involved with this
18 program since day one, along with politicians and
19 various leaders in the community, CHPC-- we had-- the
20 Humane [sic] Society was also there as well to advise
21 Community Board Four members. So we had people from
22 specialties, all walks of life, but basically we
23 folks who are also against this plan, and
24 unfortunately it's really fear mongering that's been
25 going on, making folks panic with misinformation

1 about what's being proposed. We've all gone above
2 and beyond. NYCHA, Related & Essence, the tenants
3 associations along with a bunch of residents that are
4 for the plan that have put out this proposal in plain
5 English, Spanish, Russian, whatever language you need
6 it. It was presented. We did-- there was phone
7 calls being made. There was meetings, tenant's
8 association meetings every month on top of workshops,
9 door-to-door. Our doors would always open. Our
10 numbers were given out for contact for any
11 information that anybody needed, and still we still
12 have folks who just basically didn't show up at the
13 meetings for whatever reason, and they're just going
14 by hearsay. And it's unfortunate, no matter how many
15 times you assure them in writing and it's all
16 documented, and all-- there's been a lot of-- even
17 Community Board Four had meetings that are readily
18 available, and still you can view them on YouTube on
19 the CB4 website. So, basically everything was
20 presented in a clear and concise way in many
21 languages. So, we've been trying to be as
22 accommodating as possible to make sure that moving
23 forward everybody's involved and understands what
24 they're getting into. As far as the-- I'll just end
25

1 this up. As far as the survey that was done, it was
2 not blindly given. We went on a tour and basically it
3 was broken up into building blocks to accommodate
4 everybody on different days and it was announced to
5 everyone which days they would be going if they
6 wanted to go. And if they couldn't, other
7 accommodations would be made for them. And we took
8 tours of Related properties in Roosevelt Island and
9 in Brooklyn, and we were very impressed with what
10 they had to offer there. Then when we were brought
11 back to the community centers where a long
12 presentation was made on the three proposals that
13 included the remodeling of the buildings which
14 unfortunately is not in the budget anymore, because
15 it ballooned from initially about \$300 million to
16 about \$1.3 billion, because of the changes in
17 asbestos regulations and lead abatement regulations.
18 The values have gone-- the values of failures [sic]
19 have gone down in those, so unfortunately a lot of
20 the apartments that passed before, did fail. So, and
21 as you know, we know asbestos or lead abatement can
22 be moved forward without-- with tenants inside the
23 apartments, making it very cost-prohibitive. So,
24 basically, I just wanted to say, we are still living
25

1
2 in very unsafe and disgusting conditions which
3 continue to get worse every day. The longer we delay
4 this solid plan, the greater the risk. We-- we will
5 lose our homes because it will become uninhabitable.
6 Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much,
8 Ms. Vasquez, and thank you for walking us through
9 what you've experienced in the development and the
10 engagement. When you mentioned-- you mentioned the
11 survey, build the block. Can you tell me a little
12 bit more about how it was constructed and what do you
13 mean by build the block?

14 HECTOR VASQUEZ: Oh, basically what
15 happened was when the tours were set up, it was way
16 in advance. People were notified when the dates
17 would be so they could schedule accordingly and let
18 the people know that they were going, and basically
19 it had to be broken up block by block, meaning 19th
20 Street was the first to go, along with parts of 18th
21 Street, because it was just too many people to
22 accommodate in one shot. We would have had to have
23 10 busses possibly [inaudible].

24 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: I got it. I got
25 what you're saying now. For the survey, right-- so,

1
2 it-- what I was trying to get at when I was talking
3 to NYCHA staff was a clear articulation around how--
4 what the survey instrument's purpose was. And you
5 know, a binding vote is very distinct from a survey
6 we're trying to learn like what you're interested in
7 and what you would like to see.

8 HECTOR VASQUEZ: Right.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, in your opinion,
10 do you-- having seen the survey and done all this
11 work, do you think it was clearly articulated that
12 this was kind of a survey to get temperature versus a
13 binding vote, this is your future?

14 HECTOR VASQUEZ: Well, basically at this
15 point we were ready to make a decision. So,-- and
16 most of the tenants were aware of this at the time.
17 As far as the semantics of it being a vote or a
18 survey, I mean, it's going back and forth. But
19 honestly, the way I understood it and the way it was
20 presented, it was a PowerPoint slides for each
21 option, and it was explained what it would entail,
22 the length of time it would take, what accommodations
23 would have to be made. So it wasn't just saying
24 here, here's a survey, you know, pick and choose. It
25 was clearly explained what each was, and it was

1 nothing really new other than the plan for new
2 buildings. That was kind of new, and you know, it
3 was thought that basically there would be pushback on
4 it, because it was something that was understood in
5 the beginning.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Right, was discussed
8 before.

9 HECTOR VASQUEZ: But hence, that's why
10 the meetings happened, and it was attempted to
11 clearly explain what was going to happen possibly.
12 And again, it's a proposal.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Right.

14 HECTOR VASQUEZ: It wasn't etched in
15 stone, but basically it was a choice that everybody
16 was willing to make, and unfortunately not everybody
17 would show up at these meetings, as usual.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Sure.

19 HECTOR VASQUEZ: So, it-- you know,
20 hence, these four [sic]-- maybe the numbers were not
21 as high as we would like, but unfortunately it's the
22 same at these TA meetings as well. We're lucky if we
23 get, you know, maybe 40-50 people at these meetings,
24 when meanwhile we have thousands of people in these
25 developments.

1 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Good ol' democracy.
2
3 Thank you so much, Mr. Vasquez.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I'm going to call the
5 next panel. Thank you very much. The next panel
6 will be Ray Serrano [sp?], Regita Guitierrez [sp?],
7 Eddie Allen [sp?], and Lucy Newman. If you're still
8 present, you can come up to the table. I'll call in
9 folks. Rosalyn Connolly [sp?], Joel Grosse [sp?],
10 Renee Keap [sp?], and Brigitte Charlton-Vicenty.
11 Anyone remaining can come up to the table.

12 LUCY NEWMAN: Hi. My name is Lucy Newman.
13 I'm a Staff Attorney at the Legal Aid Society.
14 Lovely to see you. Thanks for holding this hearing.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, you can come to
16 the table. You can come to the table. You can come
17 to the table as well, Mr. Keap. You can go ahead.

18 LUCY NEWMAN: Okay. I just want to talk
19 a little bit about PACT conversions and mainly around
20 the impact that they have on households. Obviously,
21 we do staff a help line that takes calls from people
22 that either facing a PACT conversion or have gone
23 through a PACT conversion, and we help them with
24 issues that they may be experiencing. I think it's
25 really important for people to understand that these

1 are not just simply transactions. They are people's
2 lives and they do cause a lot of disruption into
3 people's lives. Things have definitely got better
4 over time compared to some of the earlier PACT
5 conversions, especially those big mega bundles that
6 were done early on in the program. But there's
7 definitely some things that we would like to see
8 moving forward, and in terms of creating kind of a
9 seamless transition for people. It is a very
10 confusing transition to go from being public housing
11 to being Section 8, that in itself is a big change in
12 the way in which someone's subsidy, their federal
13 rental assistance subsidy is managed, and that's not
14 to be taken lightly in terms of people's confusion,
15 both before and after the conversion. A couple of
16 things, we really do want the authority to focus on
17 transfers prior to the conversion to ensure that
18 people who are on the wait list currently with
19 approved transfers get those transfers done either
20 inter or intra-development before the conversion.
21 And obviously that does have to fall within the
22 background of the tenant selection assignment plan.
23 So it's not that easy but I think it's something that
24 they can do as long as they focus on it early on in
25

1 the conversion process. That also goes to then the
2 issue of vacancies, because they are holding units
3 vacant, so they should be prioritizing those to put
4 those transfers into. One of the things we do hear a
5 lot about is that prior to a conversion when NYCHA
6 knows that they're going to offload the site, a lot
7 of the maintenance issues go down. So for example,
8 people are not getting the repairs that they need,
9 because there's definitely a sense that what's the
10 point of making repairs if we're not going to have to
11 be responsible for these units going forward. But
12 you know, some of these people are living in very,
13 very dangerous conditions, and in addition to that,
14 those conversion processes take a while, so they
15 really are entitled under law to those repairs.
16 Couple of other things. The-- we do really encourage
17 NYCHA to bring out a universal transfer policy
18 between the Section 8 and the Trust and Section 9
19 programs so that people can continue accessing
20 transfers throughout what will historically be
21 NYCHA's public housing developments. And we also
22 really urge the authority to make copies for every
23 individual of their tenancy file, their public
24 housing tenancy file, because after the conversion
25

1
2 there are a lot of issues that arise which people
3 need that public housing tenancy file for, and it's
4 very difficult for them to get it either by FOIL,
5 because it takes too long or because it's
6 prohibitively expensive to pay for copies. So we
7 really urge them to do that. In terms of the PNA,
8 I'm really hoping that you'll hold a separate hearing
9 on the Fulton Elliott Chelsea issue. I think there
10 is some really worrying things round how the PNA went
11 from \$366 million to allegedly \$1.3 billion. We have
12 asked to see copies of the new PNA, and I think many
13 parties are waiting to get copies of that. I also do
14 think that there are many issues around that survey.
15 For example, in the survey, there was no mention of
16 demolition at all. When you look at the three
17 questions that were posed to people. And we've had
18 now many briefings on what it is that the proposal
19 entails, and it is very, very hard to understand the
20 moving and restacking of all the decks. And so I
21 think it is something that this committee should have
22 a hearing on. In terms of Intro 646 and 648, we
23 support them fully. Obviously, we believe in
24 transparency, and the greater amount of transparency
25 that residents have, the better it will be for all.

1
2 We also do-- would urge the committee to look into
3 also amending the City law that would entitle NYCHA
4 public housing residents to get HPD inspections and
5 violations placed which they don't currently have,
6 which every other renter in New York City does have
7 access to and which PACT residents do now have
8 available on 311 and HPD. So that's really it for
9 today, and we'll submit our written testimony to the
10 [inaudible]. Thank you.

11 BRIGITTE CHARLTON-VICENTY: Thank you.
12 Hello, good afternoon. My name is Brigitte Charlton-
13 Vicenty, and I'm not sure if I'm here--

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: [interposing] Sorry,
15 just move a little closer to the mic so that we can
16 get the record. Thank you so much.

17 BRIGITTE CHARLTON-VICENTY: if I'm here
18 at the right public hearing for public housing. I am
19 a vendor with NYCHA and I have an organization called
20 Inner City Green Team, and we are operating out of
21 Wagner Houses. This is regarding recycling and waste
22 and issues, so I don't know if I should be
23 presenting.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You can certainly
25 give the testimony. I believe there was a sanitation

1 environment and help transform the lives of residents
2 living in New York City Housing Authority Development
3 through recycling, outreach, education, job training
4 and paid work that can lead to a lifetime of
5 employment and civic engagement. When first
6 testifying before this committee was because as a law
7 abiding citizen, I thought I was doing the right
8 thing by placing my recyclables in the appointed bins
9 at my development in 2006. This is when I witnessed
10 my recyclables being thrown away with the garbage. I
11 was shocked to learn that all my efforts over the
12 years were in vain because NYCHA was not in
13 compliance with the recycling laws of New York City.
14 Afterwards, I began taking my recyclables to my
15 children's school in Harlem. Being that this effort
16 was just a drop in the bucket, I knew something had
17 to be done. I had a vision in 2011 after discovering
18 that NYCHA's recycling program was non-existent, and
19 found the perfect opportunity, at least I thought, to
20 help establish a recycling program in my development
21 when I came across a NYCHA posting urging residents
22 to get involved with Commissioner Lopez's green
23 agenda. Consequently, I started a resident Green
24 Committee in my development with the confidence of
25

1
2 fulfilling the Commissioner's agenda to help green
3 public housing. Towards that end, I held public
4 meetings and events to raise awareness and educate
5 NYCHA residents of our recycling and energy
6 efficiency, conducted door-to-door service to
7 ascertain residents' interest in learning and
8 participating in a recycling program, organize a
9 recycling rally to mobilize residents around the
10 issue, and created the door-to-door, floor-to-floor
11 recycling pilot project which proposes a unique
12 solution not only to help NYCHA come into compliance
13 with New York City recycling law. For 12 years I
14 have led battles in trenches for me and my fellow
15 residents' right to recycle. I wanted to do the right
16 thing, all while working to prove my concept, but for
17 eight years-- but the first eight years were riddled
18 with a host of setbacks from being threatened with
19 eviction, Inner City Green Team filing a lawsuit with
20 the NRDC to force NYCHA to come into compliance, and
21 battling with a slew of adversaries and not being
22 fully funded or supported by city agencies. I
23 envisioned a NYCHA door [sic] recycling collection
24 service model which proposed a unique solution not
25 only to help NYCHA come into compliance with the

1 recycling law, but build a model for residents to
2 become educated about how and why to recycle, and
3 create sustainable green collar [sic] jobs to help
4 address high unemployment rates amongst NYCHA
5 residents. Under this initiative, NYCHA residents
6 will be hired to go to each unit in the development
7 to collect the recyclables residents set out. This
8 white glove service approach incorporates education,
9 outreach, ease of use, accessibility, digitized data,
10 and rewards to influence behavior change. In 2017, an
11 international competition, the NYCX [sic] Collab
12 [sic] Challenge sought solutions to improve recycling
13 capture rates at NYCHA developments, increase
14 resident engagement, mitigate litter, reduce the
15 amount of time that NYCHA employees spend dealing
16 with waste and involve the community in a meaningful
17 way. I applied and with the \$20,000 to implement my
18 program at the Brownford [sic] Houses and in just
19 four months the recycling rates tripled. More than
20 seven tons of recyclables were diverted from the
21 waste stream during the pilot. Lessons learned from
22 the pilot demonstrated that this community-based
23 recycling program can yield impressive results within
24 a short period of time. An addition 10 tons was also
25

1 diverted at the end of the pilot program. It was a
2 struggle to keep the program running when being
3 flouted by then NYCHA interim Chair and DSNY
4 Commissioner Kathy Garcia, who functioned as our
5 nemesis and used her authority to intercept our
6 progress. Through fund-raising and using my personal
7 savings, I was able to run the program for another
8 year until COVID shut us all down. In late 2020, I
9 had the opportunity to present my solution to former
10 NYCHA Chair Gregory Russ, and he expressed interest
11 and wanted to know more about the work. With
12 enduring support from Vlada Kenniff, the then VP of
13 Sustainability, Inner City Green Team was awarded an
14 RFP to implement the program at the Wagner Houses the
15 following year. Since my first testimony to this
16 council in 2013, my organizations has made strides to
17 increase residential recycling at NYCHA developments
18 in Brownsville and East Harlem. At the Wagner houses
19 alone we have diverted over 100,000 pounds of
20 materials from landfill. As a resident-led
21 organization Section 3 vendor, my organization has
22 officially been in contract with NYCHA since June
23 2022. The staff consists of five NYCHA residents and
24 three targeted Section 3 team members who collect
25

1
2 NYCHA recycling and conduct outreach and education
3 services on a weekly basis. Although we have now had
4 the dedicated support of my fellow residents and
5 sincere commitments from the Office of
6 Sustainability, it's not enough. The past year has
7 been daunting to operate effectively on the Wagner
8 campus. The recently dismissed property manager made
9 reckless and hellish efforts to stop our operation,
10 after she was prohibited by the legal department from
11 shutting down our Earth Day in 2022, she was on a
12 vengeance-filled warpath fabricating slanderous
13 statements about operations on campus and changing
14 the locks of the rooms where she initially permitted
15 us to utilize. In meeting after meeting, she could
16 not justify the reason for her actions. Wagner
17 Houses is a 26-acre campus with dozens of
18 underutilized rooms, which many have sat dormant for
19 decades. We originally operated in the three rooms
20 for admin use, store equipment, engage the residents,
21 and sorting the materials. Being housed on campus is
22 imperative, and residents witnessing us in action has
23 been an effective way to convert resident's thoughts
24 and behavior's.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

223

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Ms., are you-- are you near the end?

BRIGITTE CHARLTON-VICENTY: I'm going to close it out.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And please feel free to submit your full testimony.

BRIGITTE CHARLTON-VICENTY: Yes, yes. So I'll ask-- it's been a lot, but I'll ask-- so we'll talk about the expansion plans and then I'll just close it out. It'll be about another minute, is that okay?

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Public testimony, a quick question.

BRIGITTE CHARLTON-VICENTY: Okay, no. You want me to--

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] I want to close out right now and we and continue talking afterwards.

BRIGITTE CHARLTON-VICENTY: We ask, dear members of the Council, I implore you to do what is necessary to help stop this prime example of what a contradiction looks like. I plead with the Council to hold NYCHA managers and departments more accountable, and comply with all NYC waste management

1 laws and rules, allow adequate space at developments,
2 wherever space is not being utilized to fulfill Inner
3 City Green Team's contractual obligations and work
4 with intention to provide our residents with all the
5 services they need and deserve. Make stipulations
6 for us to be fully supported at every NYCHA
7 development, and help Mayor Adams hold up his
8 candidacy pledge to fully fund NYCHA-- recycling at
9 NYCHA, and repurpose unutilized funds earmarked for
10 NYCHA capital project's for Inner City Green Team
11 operations. Thank you for listening.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much.

13 Oh, I just want a quick question for Lucy before we
14 jump to you, Ms. Keap. Could you-- Ms. Newman, can
15 you tell us-- you mentioned about providing tenancy
16 files, could you explain that a little bit more about
17 what you're seeing on the ground and how we could
18 rectify it.

19 LUCY NEWMAN: Yeah, sure. So every
20 household in public housing has what's known as a
21 tenancy file which contains copies of the leases that
22 have been signed over the years, recertifications,
23 also interview notes from any interaction with
24 management, copies of requests that may have been
25

1
2 the residents but also to the new management to be
3 able to just have that on-hand.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you. That's
5 very helpful and it definitely sounds like one of
6 those things that should be part of a process of
7 preparation to support residents. Thank you. Thank
8 you for that. And thank you for the other
9 suggestions, and things we should be looking into.
10 Have you requested a copy of the PNA for Chelsea
11 Fulton?

12 LUCY NEWMAN: Yeah, I think a number of
13 people have requested it. Community Board Four did.
14 I know that some other people have. So I think they
15 said it's in progress, or that they're going to get
16 it, but I would need to check to see what the status
17 of that is.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Great. More to
19 come. Thank you so much for your patience--

20 LUCY NEWMAN: [interposing] Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: and being here. Ms.
22 Keap. Thank you. Renee [sp?] thank you so much.

23 RENEE KEAP: Hello, thank you for having
24 me back. Let's see. We can continue to say the
25 residents have been engaged. Define residents.

1
2 Mostly, you're talking about tenant association
3 presidents and their allies. If you only speak with
4 them, you're missing thousands of other people that
5 actually live there as well. The lack of
6 transparency is alarming. It has not been tenant-
7 driven. It has not. The way we find out things is
8 coming to hearings. We come here, we find out
9 things. We go to Community Board, basically full
10 board-- the two we-- actually they're always at is
11 now Housing, Health, and Human Services and Chelsea
12 Land Use. That's how we find out everything. We find
13 out the plans. We find out the size of the
14 apartments. We find out that we're the ones who are
15 going to be stacked up, and then they're going to
16 have the smaller apartments, the other mixed income.
17 Thank you for saying that we are mixed income. So
18 few people actually recognize that. I'm tired of it.
19 Jonathan Gouveia, he has a hard time answering a
20 question. Not surprising. Last week he was standing
21 in a corner in the dark making sure he couldn't
22 answer or wouldn't answer questions, and gave it over
23 to Justin Lamarella [sp?]. I agree with Lisa Bova-
24 Hiatt says when PACT came it has totally changed our
25 lives. It has changed mine. I am now fighting not

1 to have my home demolished, not to have colonial
2 language used that we must be like everyone else. We
3 are ourselves. We were here before so many of the
4 other buildings that stick out like an eyesore. We
5 do not need to conform to others. We need to be who
6 and what we are. We are public housing residents.
7 We are the ones who do a great deal of work in this
8 city. And one more thing, it takes a lot more than
9 someone who looks like me. Someone who is of my color
10 is the person who is the front person for Related.
11 And also, let's look at the leadership of the New
12 York City Housing Authority. They're all women.
13 It's a meaningless thing. They have chosen to
14 continue the bad practices. Never have I seen them
15 run around so hard to get that ERAP money. I'm like-
16 - they could have done that. To have the city and
17 state refund the 21 developments that were their
18 obligations. We are in this mess because nobody has
19 accountability. And one more thing, the word
20 demolition was not used on those surveys. Needless
21 to say, when you don't have that word, it changes
22 everything. So the fact that we are in this mess is
23 a lack of transparency, is a lack of truthfulness.
24 And it's not just things aren't transparent. Ten
25

1
2 association leaders are saying things like, this is
3 the same public housing that you have now. There's a
4 difference between Section 8 and-- project-based
5 Section 8 and under Section 9. The confusion is
6 mainly everyone. HOU, Housing Opportunities
7 Unlimited, actually had the nerve to tell somebody
8 they have to live a year in the new buildings and
9 then they could get a Section 8 voucher. Come on
10 now. It's either you're lying on purpose to get
11 people to do what you want, and they are not a third
12 party that's uninterested. They have been hired to
13 actually get surveys, to get tenants to basically
14 throw away their rights. And CHPC, let's be real.
15 Let's look at who's on their board: Monadack [sic],
16 Artemis, Datner, Hudson River, Hudson River Park,
17 Hudson Yard Station, Hershin [sp?], Singer, and
18 Epstein LLP, Senderro Verde [sp?], Donby [sic], L&M,
19 CNC Management. They are PACT partners, part of the
20 Edenwall [sp?] Bundle and various others. We have
21 Goldman Sachs and Company, Van Dyke Three. These
22 people are not non-interested parties. They all have
23 something to gain. Thank you.

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

230

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much for your testimony and pointing out some very important elements here. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there are any other folks wanting to testify in-person, please see the Sergeant or indicate now. Otherwise, we'll go to Zoom testimony. As a reminder, everyone testifying in-person or on Zoom is encouraged to submit testimony to the Council website or testimony@nyc.gov. I'll now begin calling the folks who are signed up to testify on Zoom. When I call your name, you'll be prompted to unmute. Please begin as soon as you're unmuted. Dana Elden? You may begin.

DANA ELDEN: Good evening. Good evening.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Good evening, Ms. Elden.

DANA ELDEN: Yes, can you hear me?

CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: yes, we can.

DANA ELDEN: You can hear me? Okay, great. I did write good afternoon, but it's now evening. Good evening, Councilwoman Avilés, members of the Council and NYCHA and my constituency. Peace and blessings to you all. I'm Dana Elden, President

1 of St. Mary's Park Houses Resident Council. I'm here
2 today to voice my dismay and disapproval of
3 privatization of public housing, including the usage
4 of private developers and investors who will
5 capitalize off of our homes. RAD and PACT and the
6 Trust has become a master plan to end public housing,
7 and ultimately displace thousands of families and
8 many seniors from their homes. I am one. I am a
9 senior and disabled, so I am concerned. Here at St.
10 Mary's we have 73 vacancies. The breakdowns between
11 Section 8 and Section 9 are unknown, versus six
12 vacancies from two years ago, as I was alerted to
13 this by Councilman Salamanca at the last housing
14 vacancy hearing. Why isn't NYCHA working towards
15 fixing these apartments? That's revenues that my
16 development is missing out on, and why is it that I
17 keep hearing about millions of dollars that NYCHA
18 received and not seeing where the money has gone.
19 Why, is my question. As an independent auditor is
20 needed to assess where this money is being spent. A
21 week after the Trust bill was passed, we held a
22 meeting for our residents to examine how residents
23 felt. Unanimously, it was voted to remain Section 9.
24 We want to continually make the point that NYCHA's
25

1 residents do not want their homes privatized here.
2
3 Additionally, residents must be able to make
4 decisions for the future of their homes. The
5 immediately solution is for all levels of government
6 to fully fund NYCHA under Section 9. Needless to
7 say, I'm appreciative of Ms. Trimble, Ms. Bova-Hiatt,
8 and Mr. Brian Honan for accepting St. Mary's Park
9 Houses' wishes to-date to remain Section 9. However,
10 I'm curious as to how long that understanding will
11 remain as such.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

13 DANA ELDEN: I question the adoption of
14 the-- excuse me? I question the adoption of the 964
15 into the state's law 9409. The social and economic
16 impact on many of our low income residents will
17 endanger their ability to service themselves in a
18 community where mixed income placements will
19 influence how merchants and their price merchandise
20 will occur. Also, the movement of residents
21 throughout the City will impact our senior
22 population, especially will have to adjust everything
23 in their lives from shopping to doctors and everyday
24 activities will be impacted. Some of these
25 adjustments can impact the residents so drastically

1 that it can be life-threatening, and quite frankly 70
2 percent of the residents that I have spoken to do not
3 want to be relocated. The residents should have a say
4 as to what happens to them. No one personal group
5 other than the residents themselves should make the
6 decision to go with a conversion under Section 8
7 and/or with the Trust. Transparency is paramount, in
8 explaining the differences between Section 9, Section
9 8, RAD/PACT, and Section 8 with the Trust conversion.
10 Quite frankly, 90 percent of the residents citywide
11 that I've spoken to do not know exactly what RAD/PACT
12 or the trust is, nor the changes that would occur
13 with their leases and their rights to represent
14 themselves, and NYCHA insists upon telling residents
15 their perspective. Actually, there are no pros and
16 cons to their representation of converting to Section
17 8 and Section 8 under the Trust. I'm sorry, but a
18 bunch of new cabinets, floors, shiny refrigerators,
19 and a basketball court or garden doesn't satisfy my
20 palate. My rights are more important to me than
21 those things, especially when you're talking about my
22 hoe. It's not the Taj Mahal, but it's my sanctuary,
23 and I want to keep it and the community I live in
24 just the same. I yield the floor.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much,
3 Ms. Elden.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Diana Blackwell?
5 Please unmute.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Start.

7 DIANA BLACKWELL: Good evening Chair
8 Avilés and members of the Housing Committee. My name
9 is Diana Blackwell. I'm the current President Fred
10 Samuel Resident Association and Co-chair of MSWAB
11 NYCHA Recycling Committee. I'm here today to prove
12 support for the RAD/PACT program, which I have been a
13 part of since its inception in 2015. I believe that
14 this program is a reset for NYCHA as public housing
15 and for future affordable housing. Here at NYCHA, the
16 need for repairs has increased and is daily
17 increasing, and the money from Congress, when finally
18 received, will never be enough for the cost of
19 repairs. Assistance in the forms of private
20 partnership and the government Section 8 program
21 through the RAD/PACT can work if there is a joint
22 effort between residents, NYCHA and the private
23 partners. When speaking of the conditions here at
24 NYCHA, no one knows better than the residents what
25 the living conditions are. NYCHA management work at

1
2 these campuses, but at the end of their work day,
3 return to their healthy home. Private partners manage
4 the property, but they return to their healthy homes,
5 but residents live here day and night in conditions
6 that are deplorable, where the repairs are slow, are
7 of poor quality or not at all. The reality of
8 RAD/PACT is that NYCHA, which is rather scary, will
9 still be involved, but not as the manager of the
10 property. To most, this conversion news of new
11 management will bring hope for a quality of life
12 deserving of the rent that NYCHA residents pay.
13 Fast-forwarding to the future. Our homes must be
14 sustainable according to the New York City
15 Sustainability Plan. NYCHA has proven in the past to
16 lag behind in necessary improvements for updating our
17 buildings and bringing them to code. Good news,
18 NYCHA does have a sustainability plan, and its goals
19 are to reduce greenhouse gas emissions by 80 percent
20 by 2050, improve indoor environment, gardens, and
21 urban agricultural programs. Ensure operations of
22 waste and water and efficiency of infrastructure.
23 This cannot--

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] time has
25 expired.

1
2 DIANA BLACKWELL: be done alone. Help is
3 needed from outside funding sources from which
4 RAD/PACT provides an answer. It is not the only
5 answer, but one of the answers. It is not a perfect
6 plan. With the joint efforts between residents and
7 NYCHA, the private partners, it will be a start. I'm
8 just going to add this last thing and then I will
9 conclude. On this last note, I'd like to make mention
10 that some of these partners, these developers have an
11 idea [sic] will continue generating funds for these
12 campuses. They need to be heard with serious
13 consideration. It should never be that we should
14 return or run short of funding like NYCHA has and the
15 residents find themselves back in the same situation.
16 With this, I thank you, and I yield.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much,
18 Ms. Blackwell. We hear you.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next witness will
20 be Jacqueline Lara.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has started.

22 JACQUELINE LARA: Oh hi. My name is
23 Jacqueline Lara and I'm from Fulton Houses, and one
24 of the residents that oppose the demolition. In
25 2019, de Blasio put a working group together to stop

1
2 the protest that we had then [inaudible] two
3 demolitions of my building and one on 19th Street.
4 And when he put this working group together, there
5 was only six residents that the TA presidents choose
6 to, you know, to be on their side. So there was only
7 12 residents in total [inaudible] this working group
8 and that was it. No other residents from the
9 outside. I fought to come in because I wanted to
10 hear what they were deciding about my building and,
11 you know, about the development. And the conclusion
12 of this working group there was not supposed to be no
13 demolition at all. It was the RAD/PACT. In my
14 opinion, it was the RAD/PACT. I think they should
15 have a town hall. [inaudible] these people are
16 deciding on massive construction. I don't-- we're
17 not involved. We don't hear too much. Yeah, they did
18 put some meetings, but they never answer. You could
19 ask the same question, they'll get frustrated because
20 in reality they'll go around the answer. They will
21 never tell you the real answer. I mean, we heard
22 more in this hearing than when we heard in any kind
23 of meetings. I have the survey in front of me,
24 because I kept a copy. I did not vote, because it
25 just didn't sound right. A, construction with

1 rezoning, targeted five years. B, new construction
2 within existing zoning, target six to eight years.
3 And then [inaudible] was not telling you much.
4 Rehabilitation of your existing units. That's it.
5 That's all that was there. So, I mean, they didn't
6 give you much of a choice there, actually. So, you
7 know, I disagree with what they're deciding. I do
8 not want demolition. I've been here 21 years. I
9 don't have not even a roach. It's how you handle
10 your apartment. My apartment is not falling
11 apartment. These developments are not falling
12 apartment. NYCHA's been neglecting our buildings
13 left and right, graffiti everywhere. I mean, dogs
14 pooping everywhere. They're not enforcing no laws in
15 this development. So, you know, of course things are
16 going to start falling apart. They're not doing
17 anything. They're not listening to us. yes, we've
18 been to Community Board Four, looked at all the
19 YouTubes [sic] [inaudible] and they're lying. The
20 only residents that are engaging with the TA
21 president is like we said, like they're prep [sic]
22 boys. That's what we call them, the prep boys.
23 Those are the only ones that are involved in the
24 meetings that they be having, because we're not in
25

1
2 those meetings, and there's a lot of things that are
3 being said and done that we don't know about. We
4 have to find out things in Community Board Four or we
5 find out through the hearing like we just found out.
6 So please, you know, no demolition. It was not on
7 the survey, and this is a survey. This is something
8 that we thought about, or what do you think about.
9 This is not something that's [inaudible]. No, we
10 don't need no demolition. And I want to keep it-- as
11 a matter of fact, you know, for being such little
12 snake [sic], I would like to keep it Section 9. It
13 would be perfect, and you know what, I got no
14 roaches, no mice. I have no problem in my apartment
15 at all. Unless somebody comes and throws a box of
16 roaches in front of my door, because retaliation is
17 ridiculous as well. I don't know my consequences
18 after this hearing, but I'll tell you right now,
19 anything happens, you know who to go to. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you, Ms. Lara,
21 we hear you.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: the next witness will
23 be Christina Chaise.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is starting.

25

2 CHRISTINA CHAISE: Hello? Oh, okay. I
3 don't have my--

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: [interposing] Hi, we
5 can hear you.

6 CHRISTINA CHAISE: comments in front of
7 me, but I thank you for the time. I'm the second
8 Vice President at Ravenswood Houses as well as an
9 advocacy coordinator at Take Root Justice. I mean, I
10 can definitely cite the statistics and the facts that
11 we know about RAD and PACT with regard to residents
12 not really being able to access their agreements
13 [sic], the processes as well as succession rights.
14 Even though technically, yes, it's in paper, a lot of
15 our advocates at NYLAG have been sharing experiences
16 on the ground with regard to assisting residents with
17 their legal right. And we know how predatory the
18 Preservation Trust is with regard to the ability to
19 access \$10 billion in loans and bonds, but meanwhile
20 we know that less than 10 percent of their capital
21 budget was actually accessed last year. Long story
22 short, we know that NYCHA has-- does not have the
23 track record for us to put faith in any of the
24 choices, really, and I think the reason why we're so
25 gung-ho about saving Section 9 and preserving it as-

1
2 is, is because it's the only robust set of rights
3 that will allow us to genuinely have some forms of
4 self-determination. I think it's atrocious that with
5 regard to Fulton Elliott and Chelsea, and [inaudible]
6 Chelsea addition that you want to build even more
7 than what public housing units was already there
8 that's going to be marked rent, and only 1,000
9 affordable. I think that's disgusting. It think it
10 makes clear that this is a land grab, and you're
11 going to move those bodies into a small area of land
12 and just build. Meanwhile we already have so much
13 building already happening. So many--

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Your time
15 is expired. Thank you.

16 CHRISTINA CHAISE: of which are
17 inaccessible, and we cannot afford, and so we need to
18 preserve Section 9 public housing, because it is the
19 only form of secure and stable housing for our most
20 vulnerable working-class family. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much,
22 Ms. Chaise.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next witness will be
24 Joshua Barnett [sp?].

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is starting.

1
2 JOSHUA BARNETT: Okay, hi. I also had
3 good afternoon. I'll say good evening. I want to
4 thank Alexa Avilés for holding this hearing and all
5 the work you do to support public housing. I will
6 condense this, because I know it's late and
7 everybody's been very patient. My name is Josh
8 Barnett. I'm a member of Local 375 D37 [inaudible]
9 and President of Chapter 25 Local 375 at NYCHA. I've
10 also worked at NYCHA fulltime for the Housing
11 Authority as a registered architect since 1999, and
12 I'm also here to speak against the privatization of
13 public housing and ask that NYCHA and the City
14 Council really work to obtain more public funding
15 stream instead of relying on the private sector. And
16 I'm also speaking as a union rep, because I see in
17 RAD/PACT a real [sic] full of wage-busting and union-
18 busting, and no one's really talked about so far. We
19 do know, obviously, the repairs to NYCHA's public
20 housing are direly needed. We deal with capital
21 repairs in my division every day, and I fully
22 understand the desperation on the part of the
23 residents for long over-due upgrades no matter what
24 the funding source, and we deal with that. People
25 have said 40 years of chronic underfunding and

1
2 deferred maintenance on buildings that were really
3 poorly constructed to begin with. But privatization
4 really isn't the answer, and RAD is privatization no
5 matter what they say about who holds the deed to the
6 property. This is yet one more transfer of a vital
7 public service to private management, as people have
8 said, transferring over to corporations whose bottom
9 line is the bottom line, and they wouldn't be doing
10 it if they weren't-- if there wasn't a profit motive
11 involved. And this is creating a two-tiered system
12 for residents that work is-- leaving in the end, most
13 of the NYCHA developments underfunded and more
14 susceptible to the ravages of climate change that we
15 saw during Hurricane Katrina, and the thing is, we
16 don't have to go this route. We know the money is
17 there. NYCHA really doesn't talk about the fact that
18 tax rates on the ultra-rich are lower than they've
19 ever been, including in the City, and they're not
20 pushing for higher tax rates on Wall Street. The
21 state is not stepping up, and NYCHA's really not
22 pushing the state to step up.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [inaudible]

24 JOSHUA BARNETT: They have \$600 million
25 for stadium for the Buffalo Bills, but not for public

1 housing? And we also know that most of NYCHA's
2 funding comes from HUD and we don't see NYCHA
3 advocating for things like cuts to the military
4 budget or supporting legislation like the Green New
5 Deal for public housing, where [inaudible]
6 Velasquez's restitution bill for NYCHA. But from the
7 point of the view of the staff, which members they
8 were not talking about for four hours really.
9 RAD/PACT really represents potential union-busting.
10 If we look at the legislation, there are no
11 provisions to hire civil service, no provisions to
12 hire union, no provisions to hiring [inaudible] labor
13 contracts, no provision to maintain Section 3 hiring
14 for the residents, and this doesn't just hit the
15 staff. When you lower wages like that, you have to--
16 you can turn it over to any fly-by-night maintenance
17 company and the residents now going to be dealing
18 [sic] as they always in unstable and unaccountable
19 workforce that's going to make conditions even worse
20 in the long-run. And RAD and PACT been there with
21 NYCHA's ongoing outsourcing to expensive private
22 consultants. It's what we deal with all the time.
23 On my floor where I work in Long Island City, you
24 literally can't tell--
25

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time is
3 expired. Thank you.

4 JOSHUA BARNETT: the difference between a
5 union worker and a consultant except by the color of
6 their ID badge, and that really is an expense that
7 NYCHA hides, and we do need an overall audit on that.
8 And the dangers of privatization are not limited to
9 public housing. We see what happens when schools,
10 libraries, parks, and transportation are turned over
11 to private developers and private management. And
12 so, you know, I'm just going to end. We're bringing
13 in private funding. It's really spelling the end of
14 public housing as we know it, and we really need a
15 moratorium on public/private partnerships and much
16 stronger advocacy for public funding streams, the
17 audit as we've talked about, and this seems like a
18 cure, but it's really a poison pill in the long-run.
19 This is the last stock of affordable housing we have
20 in this city and we have to keep it public for the
21 sake of the workers, the residents, and the
22 community. So thanks very much. We'll send this in.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you, Mr.
24 Barnett. Thank you so much for your advocacy.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next witness will
3 be Karen Blondel.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

5 KAREN BLONDEL: [inaudible] put in the
6 chat what your name is and we will change it for you-
7 - can you hear me?

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yes, we can hear
9 you.

10 KAREN BLONDEL: Sure. I will-- I have
11 felt well all day, but I've sat this through this
12 hearing since one o'clock, so it's been really long,
13 but it's been pretty informative. My name is Karen
14 Blondel. I am the President of Red Hook West. I am
15 also a board member for the public housing Trust, and
16 once again, the reason why I'm on that Trust Board is
17 because it is a new creation as of 2022, and as a
18 long-term public housing resident who's been veal-
19 pinned [sic] in public housing for over 40 years, I
20 find it important at my age right now, which is 60,
21 to know what is going on form the inside. So I
22 became an advocate for public housing about 10 years
23 ago which was right before the Southern District
24 lawsuit filed by public housing residents. my issue
25 here today is that we keep on saying we want to stay

1 Section 9. Staying Section 9, the rules are still
2 the same. We have something coming up in January
3 called Hotma, H-O-T-M-A, where they're trying to say
4 that if you're over income in public housing, they
5 want you to pay fair market for these same
6 infrastructures that everybody's been complaining
7 about all day. My problem is that the federal
8 government, as in the past, when it comes to taking
9 care of its own here in the United States, especially
10 black Americans, because we remember from the
11 Emancipation Proclamation of 1865 and that by 1877
12 the Dixiecrats had made a deal with the Lincoln
13 Republicans, and we were cast to the wolves. That
14 continues to happen to this day. We've been begin
15 for money. I done been to so many hearings, so many
16 rallies, and everything with Congress people, state
17 officials, city officials. So I feel a little
18 insulted that we sit here and get mad at--

19
20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time is
21 expired. Thank you.

22 KAREN BLONDEL: New York City Housing
23 Authority for being the one that has to utilize the
24 tools that the federal government put in place under
25 the Obama Administration. So we need you guys to

1 start having hearings with the federal government,
2 the State and the City, and us asking the questions
3 to find out why when one person is helping us, or one
4 government agency, or level, the other two are being
5 adversarial. Thank you very much.

6
7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you, Ms.
8 Blondel. I agree 100 percent. The federal
9 government has clearly been defunding NYCHA for
10 years, and it's creating this incentive to move to
11 Section 8 and other mechanisms. More to come on
12 that.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: the next witness will
14 be Miguel Acevedo.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

16 MIGUEL ACEVEDO: Thank you. Good
17 evening, and thank you for being there and being so
18 patient to listen to public housing residents in the
19 New York City Housing Authority. I want to say that
20 I fully support everything that is said on supporting
21 Section 8, because Section 9 as you just finished
22 hearing, as everyone knows, has not been funded for
23 decades. President Obama came up with this Section 8
24 program to preserve and protect public housing to
25 make sure we're not removed from the map and there's

1 no longer, like what happened in places in Chicago
2 and New Jersey where public housing was eliminated.
3 This has to be supported, because Section 8 is the
4 only real funding that will continue to protect and
5 preserve public housing. I'm also the TA President
6 that people been talking about at Fulton Houses, and
7 I want to say that the survey that took place gave
8 every single opportunity for every single tenant to
9 participate in the survey which was considered a
10 vote, also a survey, because they asked the tenants
11 in multiple different languages, multiple different
12 days, and even on the internet to pick and choose
13 what they think is best for Fulton Elliott Chelsea.
14 So we took it as a vote. They told us that a vote
15 would be taken, and in the end three or four months
16 later, we were told 60 percent of the people that did
17 vote that had the opportunity that they wanted to
18 vote, voted for rebuilding these buildings and
19 putting new buildings up. Maybe the word demolition
20 wasn't mentioned, but they said replacement buildings
21 will be built in this survey. Thank you for giving
22 me this opportunity to speak tonight.
23
24
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much,
3 Mr. Acevedo. Thank you for your patience and waiting
4 to testify.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next witness will
6 be Tanesha Grant.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

8 TANESHA GRANT: Good evening everyone.
9 Thank you, Chair and City Council Committee, for
10 having this meeting. My name is Tanesha Grant and I
11 am the Executive Director of Parents Supporting
12 Parents New York. As a community organizer on the
13 ground, I am a witness to the disinvestment in public
14 housing and its residents. I also know that a lot of
15 NYCHA are not fully aware of what the RAD/PACT and
16 Trust programs are. There isn't transparency at all.
17 I had a client who was lied to and told she had
18 Section 8. They did not tell her the apartment is a
19 Section 8 apartment. That is very different than
20 what she was told. All NYCHA residents are being lied
21 to and are signing leases simply because they want
22 their public housing apartments to be upgraded.
23 Residents deserved upgrades years ago. It is the
24 leaders who have neglected NYCHA across the City for
25 decades fault. This is the fault of past and present

1
2 leaders. It is an insult to listen to people talk
3 about creating all these new programs instead of
4 simply upgrading the structure of NYCHA buildings.
5 These so-called upgrades do nothing in most cases to
6 update the infrastructure of the actual NYCHA
7 building. The Preservation Trust implementation is
8 undemocratic, holding residents' votes with 20
9 percent threshold is not tenant engagement. At least
10 60 percent of residents should decide that they want
11 these programs. The Preservation Trust Board is also
12 not democratic. NYCHA residents only have four out
13 of nine seats, and all are appointed by the Mayor,
14 and not the-- and not the-- not appointed by the
15 residents of NYCHA at-large. The PACT conversions,
16 the residents don't even get to vote. Residents
17 still do not know what RAD/PACT is and how it impacts
18 their leases. The narrative "better than before" is
19 a horrible thing to say. It implies that people
20 should be grateful to have work done in their
21 apartments. Let me remind everyone, high-quality
22 public housing is a human right.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

24 Thank you.

1
2 TANESHA GRANT: The fact that majority of
3 the people in charge of RAD/PACT and Trust are white
4 people is also disrespectful to the lived experience
5 of the majority of non-white people who make up
6 public housing residents. We the people demand that
7 Section 9 public housing be invested in now. We will
8 not stand by and watch these programs kill public
9 housing. Public housing is the only deeply-
10 affordable housing in New York City. We will
11 continue to organize with our community partner,
12 Residents to Preserve Public Housign, and we hope the
13 City Council stands with us to stay Section 9, and
14 make sure public housing is not privatized by private
15 companies that never even step foot in NYCHA as a
16 resident. Thank you for listening to my testimony,
17 and we will be--

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much,
19 Ms. Grant. Always bringing wisdom to the testimony.
20 Thank you.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next witness will
22 be Theo Chino [sp?].

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

24 THEO CHINO: Hello? Hi, my name is Theo
25 Chino. I'm the First National Secretary of the

1 Social Democrats of America, the social [inaudible]
2 in the Democratic Party, also known as the Committee
3 of the Second Socialist International. Regarding
4 this bill, we understand it's a requirement of the
5 Trust law that the State has passed, but as a type
6 two [sic] socialists, we believe that tenant are not
7 landlord and it is not their job to care for the
8 property. It is public housing. It is the
9 government's job to care for public housing. RAD/PACT
10 are liberal program. Any city needs public housing.
11 It is the job of the government to provide it, and
12 any elected official calling themselves progressive
13 and supporting RAD and PACT are liberal and should
14 register in the Republican Party. These politician
15 are not progressive. Hopefully, in the future, we
16 can revert back to a model that can look like the
17 Vienna model. Anyone who don't know the Vienna
18 model, they can check it on our website, Socialist.us
19 and click on the Vienna model link. But regarding
20 Intro 646, they should be made universal. 646 should
21 apply to all the housing stock in New York City,
22 including the private stock, NYCHA, the one managed
23 by HPD, and the HDFC conversion. It shouldn't be
24 that we learn of contract content such as the amount
25

1
2 of the money dispersed when the worker lose a finger
3 and the document becomes public in a court case. We
4 can do better, and we socialists have more than 150
5 years of experience in building and managing public
6 housing. Yes, we have made mistake, but any
7 government in the world that has experimented with
8 the private model knows the future. It has been
9 tried and it has failed. In the end, the public had
10 pay for it while the private corporation owner walked
11 away richer and the tax payer poorer. The US
12 Constitution Preamble is "We the People", not the
13 "corporation will." The Constitution say "We the
14 People of the United States in order to form a more
15 perfect union, establish justice, ensure domestic
16 tranquility and provide for common defense, promote
17 general welfare, and secure the blessing and liberty
18 for ourselves and our posterity do ordain this
19 constitution."

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired. Thank
21 you.

22 THEO CHINO: Corporation do not actually-
23 - are part of the Constitution. I know my testimony
24 goes a little bit beyond NYCHA, but this city needs
25 to learn that these developer have done to the HDFC

1 conversion. Yes, they are few success, but many more
2 failure. We will begin-- we'll be at the same place
3 in 20 years, when the subpar work need to be replaced
4 and money invested. Public housing is public
5 housing, and it is the government's responsibility to
6 keep it. The idea of a Trust is about making people
7 believe that they are owner, and because it is not
8 their job, it's unfair to add this burden and
9 workload on them. The City needs a vision and start
10 moving towards a model that is made for the tenant so
11 we can ensure domestic tranquility and promote
12 general welfare. Another idea we socialists like to
13 have, tax the rich. Thank you very much for your
14 time, and I hope you can come up with new solution.

15
16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much,
17 Mr. Chino. And with that--

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: [interposing] Having
19 no one else in-person and no other persons virtually,
20 I'll turn to the Chair to close the meeting.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Great. So I just
22 want to thank everyone, and on that note I have to
23 lift up the incredible suggestion and the right thing
24 to do would be to tax the rich to ensure that public
25 housing remains public and in the public domain and

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

is safe, dignified, affordable housing for all.
Private market solutions will not support. We know
what the private market does. Housing is a human
right. Thank you.

[gavel]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 10, 2023