

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

-----X

March 2, 2011
Start: 1:46 pm
Recess: 3:41 pm

HELD AT: Council Chambers
City Hall

B E F O R E:
JOEL RIVERA
President Pro Tempore

- COUNCIL MEMBERS:
- Speaker, Christine Quinn
 - Council Member Charles Barron
 - Council Member Gale A. Brewer
 - Council Member Fernando Cabrera
 - Council Member Margaret S. Chin
 - Council Member Leroy G. Comrie, Jr.
 - Council Member Elizabeth S. Crowley
 - Council Member Inez E. Dickens
 - Council Member Erik Martin Dilan
 - Council Member Daniel Dromm
 - Council Member Mathieu Eugene
 - Council Member Julissa Ferreras
 - Council Member Lewis A. Fidler
 - Council Member Daniel R. Garodnick
 - Council Member James F. Gennaro
 - Council Member Vincent J. Gentile

A P P E A R A N C E S

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Council Member Sara M. Gonzalez
Council Member David G. Greenfield
Council Member Daniel J. Halloran III
Council Member Vincent M. Ignizio
Council Member Robert Jackson
Council Member Letitia James
Council Member Peter A. Koo
Council Member G. Oliver Koppell
Council Member Brad S. Lander
Council Member Jessica S. Lappin
Council Member Stephen T. Levin
Council Member Melissa Mark-Viverito
Council Member Darlene Mealy
Council Member Rosie Mendez
Council Member Michael C. Nelson
Council Member James S. Oddo
Council Member Annabel Palma
Council Member Domenic M. Recchia, Jr.
Council Member Diana Reyna
Council Member Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Council Member Deborah L. Rose
Council Member James Sanders, Jr.
Council Member Larry B. Seabrook
Council Member Eric A. Ulrich
Council Member James Vacca
Council Member Peter F. Vallone, Jr.
Council Member James G. Van Bramer
Council Member Albert Vann
Council Member Mark S. Weprin
Council Member Jumaane D. Williams
Council Member Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Joshua Bartholomew
Reverend
Abyssinian Baptist Church

Constance T. Robinson-Turner
Recipient
Ceremonial for Outstanding Citizen

Vinton Thompson
President
New York Metropolitan College

Asantewaa Harris
Media Coordinator, Black Farmers and Urban Gardeners
Community Vision Council

1
2 PRESIDENT RIVERA: --and we're
3 going to be changing the format for today's
4 meeting. If everyone can please take their seats,
5 put their cell phones on silent, all staff please
6 exit the member area. We're going to start off
7 with the pledge of allegiance, go into the roll
8 call, and do ceremonials after the roll call. So
9 at this point in time I ask all my colleagues to
10 please rise for the pledge of allegiance. [pledge
11 of allegiance] Roll call.

12 [pause]

13 CLERK: Arroyo. [pause] Barron.
14 [pause] Brewer.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.

16 CLERK: Cabrera.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

18 CLERK: Chin.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

20 CLERK: Comrie.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: [off mic]

22 Here.

23 CLERK: Crowley.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

25 CLERK: Dickens.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

5

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: [off mic]
Here.

CLERK: Dilan. [pause] Dromm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: [off mic]
Here.

CLERK: Eugene.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.

CLERK: Ferreras.

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Here.

CLERK: Fidler.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: [off mic]
Here.

CLERK: Foster.

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: [off mic]
Here.

CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

CLERK: Gennaro. [pause] Gentile.
[pause] Gonzalez.

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: [off mic]
Here.

CLERK: Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: [off
mic] Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

CLERK: Halloran.

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: [off mic]

Here.

CLERK: Ignizio.

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes.

CLERK: Jackson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: [off mic]

Here.

CLERK: James.

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Here.

CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

CLERK: Koppell.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: [off mic]

Here.

CLERK: Koslowitz. [pause]

Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

CLERK: Lappin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Here.

CLERK: Levin. [pause] Mark-

Viverito. [pause] Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present.

CLERK: Mendez.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.
3 CLERK: Nelson. [pause] Palma.
4 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.
5 CLERK: Recchia.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Here.
7 CLERK: Reyna.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Here.
9 CLERK: Rodriguez.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off
11 mic] Here.
12 CLERK: Rose.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.
14 CLERK: Sanders.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Present.
16 CLERK: Seabrook. [pause] Ulrich.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.
18 CLERK: Vacca.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.
20 CLERK: Vallone.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: [off mic]
22 Here.
23 CLERK: Van Bramer.
24 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.
25 CLERK: Vann.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: [pause] Here.

3

CLERK: Weprin.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Here.

5

CLERK: Williams.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic]

7

Here.

8

CLERK: Wills.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Here.

10

CLERK: [pause] Oddo.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: [off mic]

12

Here.

13

CLERK: Rivera.

14

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Here.

15

CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

16

SPEAKER QUINN: [off mic] Here.

17

CLERK: We have a quorum.

18

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Quorum is

19

present. At this point in time I would like to

20

call on my three colleagues who have to leave.

21

First we have Council Member Julissa Ferreras.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: With

23

permission, I'd like to vote on all items on

24

today's calendar, President Pro Tems.

25

PRESIDENT RIVERA: So ordered.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: I vote
3 aye on all land use call ups and general orders
4 and on all resolutions.

5 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you. Next
6 we have Council Member Annabel Palma.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: With
8 permission, I'd like to vote on all items on
9 today's calendar.

10 PRESIDENT RIVERA: So ordered.

11 SPEAKER QUINN: But before Council
12 Member Palma leaves, let's all give her a thank
13 you round of applause for the beautiful cake she
14 made for Council Member Lappin. [applause,
15 cheers] And we clearly know Annabel has a future
16 in cake making, so thank you Annabel.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I hope, I
18 hope it, I hope it was good. [laughs]

19 SPEAKER QUINN: It was delicious.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Oh, it was
21 delicious, thank you, Annabel.

22 PRESIDENT RIVERA: I hope they save
23 me a, a piece.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I vote on
25 all land use call ups, all general orders and all

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

resolutions.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: So ordered.

Finally, we have Council Member Robert Jackson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you.

With permission, I'd like to vote on all items on today's calendar.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: So ordered.

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you.

I vote aye on all land use call ups and general orders and all resolutions.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: At this point in time we're going to rise for the invocation being delivered by Reverend Joshua Bartholomew from Abyssinian Baptist Church.

[pause]

JOSHUA BARTHOLOMEW: Sisters and brothers.

[pause]

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Testing. Okay.

[pause]

JOSHUA BARTHOLOMEW: Sisters and brothers, let us pray. [pause] Almighty God, we,

1
2 we thank you for this day. We thank you for your
3 love, your grace and your mercy. We are grateful
4 dear Lord for the all of the many blessings you
5 have bestowed upon us, and we ask now that you
6 forgive us for all of our sins so that we can meet
7 with clean hands. Please bless this gathering
8 with the presence of your Holy Spirit. Help us to
9 join our minds and our hearts and our spirits
10 together, so that we may have a fruitful meeting,
11 a productive meeting in your name. Pray dear Lord
12 that as we move forward, you help us to always
13 keep in the front of our minds, the fact that you
14 have blessed us with so many privileges, and the
15 fact that we can serve in the positions we serve,
16 are a privilege and an honor. So be with us now
17 and guide all that we say, and guide all that we
18 receive, in Jesus our resurrected savior's name,
19 let the people of God say amen. [Audience: Amen}

20 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very
21 much. Council Member Dickens?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you,
23 Reverend Bartholomew, from the historic Abyssinian
24 Baptist Church, from the great village of Harlem,
25 for having prayer over the house of the people.

1

2 Motion to spread the invocation in full upon the
3 record.

4

PRESIDENT RIVERA: So ordered. At
5 this point in time, we're going to start the
6 ceremonials.

7

[pause, background noise]

8

SPEAKER QUINN: Our first
9 ceremonial is going to be led by our majority
10 leader, Joel Rivera, and it is for Constance T.
11 Robinson-Turner. So if the folks who are here for
12 this ceremonial can make their way up to the
13 front. Joel, why don't you go get in the middle.
14 [applause]

15

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very
16 much, Madam Speaker. At this point in time, in
17 celebration of Women's History Month, I found an
18 individual who is prominent not only within the
19 City of New York, but someone who has dedicated
20 herself to the entire State of New York in public
21 service. So if at this point in time we could
22 have Constance Robinson-Turner and her family
23 please join us and the members of my staff, as
24 well.

25

SPEAKER QUINN: And also, in

1
2 addition to Constance and her family, and Majority
3 Leader Rivera's staff, if any of the Members want
4 to come up and join in for the ceremonial, please
5 feel free.

6 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Now, briefly,
7 Constance Robinson-Turner is someone that we may
8 all be familiar with. She's actually the
9 Administrator to the NYU Dentistry Program, which
10 runs the mobile dental vans that come out to many
11 of our districts. And I am honored and proud that
12 she has been able to join us here today to be
13 recognized for not only her service in, with NYU,
14 but also the service she's provided to the City of
15 New York. And I know her husband, her proud
16 husband is here, her proud daughter, and her
17 friends and family are here to celebrate in her
18 recognition and celebration. [applause] So,
19 Constance, thank you very much for your lifelong
20 service and thank you very much for being a
21 stellar New Yorker. [background noise] And if
22 the Clerk can please read the proclamation.

23 CLERK: Council, City of New York,
24 Proclamation. Whereas, women of every race, class
25 and ethnic background have made contributions to

1
2 the growth and strength of New York City in
3 countless recorded and unrecorded ways. Each year
4 during Women's History Month, we remember and
5 celebrate women from all walks of life who have
6 shaped this great City. And whereas, Constance T.
7 Robinson-Turner was born in the village of Harlem
8 and raised in Hollis [cheers] And raised in
9 Hollis, Queens [cheers] She is a product of the
10 public school and university system, having
11 attended PS 118, Junior High School 109, Benjamin
12 Cardozo High School [cheer] and the City College
13 of New York. Constance then earned a Master of
14 Science degree in Administration at Audrey Cohen
15 College, married and became the mother of twin
16 girls. [applause] And whereas, Constance T.
17 Robinson-Turner has served in various positions in
18 the New York State Assembly, was a founding member
19 and former Chairwoman of the Society of the
20 Preservation of Wilborn Temple Church of God and
21 Christ, is a member of the Hollis Presbyterian
22 Church and serves on New York University's
23 Community Fund Committee. And whereas, presently
24 as Administrator of the New York University
25 College of Dentistry, "Smiling Faces, Going

1
2 Places" Mobile Dental Van Program, Constance T.
3 Robinson-Turner has increased access to oral
4 healthcare to children, for whom dental care is
5 least acceptable by, accessible by providing
6 comprehensive dental care in their communities.
7 Now therefore be it known that the Council of the
8 City of New York recognize in Constance T.
9 Robinson-Turner, we have an outstanding citizen
10 worthy of our highest respect, esteem and
11 admiration. Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for the
12 Entire Council; Joel Rivera, Majority Leader,
13 Council Member, 15th District, The Bronx.

14 SPEAKER QUINN: Yay! [applause]

15 Well, thank you, thank you, thank you, and we
16 would ask you to say a few words. Let me hold
17 that for you.

18 CONSTANCE T. ROBINSON-TURNER: Good
19 afternoon, all. Speaker Quinn, Majority Leader
20 Rivera, and all of you distinguished Members of
21 the City Council. I thank you for this honor.
22 I've come home after working in Albany and the
23 State Legislature for many years. I've been doing
24 public service for at least 30 years. And it is
25 an honor today to come home to my home town, my

1
2 city, and to be honored by the governing body. I
3 accept this on behalf of the many children that we
4 serve in the NYU Dental Van Program. And I thank
5 you for your utmost support on behalf of the
6 college, the president and the dental school, and
7 we ask for your continued support. Thank you.

8 [applause]

9 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very
10 much. Keep up the great work. Thank you very
11 much. Jamie, we have that camera? Okay, there's
12 your camera. [laughter] There you go. [pause,
13 background noise] Thank you all. [crosstalk]
14 Okay, the next ceremonial is going to be led by
15 Council Member Dr. Mathieu Eugene. Is Dr. Eugene
16 here?

17 MALE VOICE: [off mic] Yes.

18 SPEAKER QUINN: Oh, okay, great.
19 And it's for the Metropolitan College of New York.
20 So if the folks from Metropolitan College could
21 make their way up, that would be terrific.

22 [applause]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you.
24 The President of Metropolitan College and the
25 staff, please, and the students. [pause,

1
2 background noise] Come on, please. Metropolitan
3 College is an exceptional academic institution
4 that has been creating leaders in New York since
5 its inception in 1964. Under the leadership of
6 the President, Dr. Vinton Thompson, and his
7 wonderful, exceptional staff, Metropolitan College
8 continue to pursue its mission. But in 19--2010,
9 on January 12, 2010, Haiti was struck by terrible
10 tropical, terrible earthquake.

11 SPEAKER QUINN: Can we just get a
12 little quiet for the ceremonial, please. Shhhh.
13 Thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: On January
15 12, Haiti was hit by a horrific earthquake and
16 devastation, the devastation was horrible. The
17 entire international community came together to
18 send the relief to Haiti, and the Speaker Quinn
19 and all my colleagues at the City Council, did
20 everything possible to send relief to Haiti. And
21 Metropolitan College went beyond its mission by
22 creating a scholarship program to help student
23 from Haiti to come to United States, especially to
24 New York, to study and receive a master degree in
25 public administration, emergency and disaster

1
2 management. Because the sad part of the situation
3 in Haiti was the lack of infrastructure, to
4 respond to the emergency, to minimize the damages,
5 and to save life. This is the reason today I am
6 proud to join the Speaker Christine Quinn to honor
7 this wonderful institution. And I want, on behalf
8 of all my Haitian brothers and sisters, and on
9 behalf also of the student, I want to thank the
10 President, Mr. Thompson, and also the wonderful
11 staff, part of the staff Mr. Ali and Mr. Steven,
12 and all those at Metropolitan College, who work to
13 make this - - possible. Also, to the Speaker,
14 thank you very much.

15 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very
16 much, and thank everybody at Metropolitan College
17 for your support and work around the tragedy in
18 Haiti. And let me ask the Clerk to please read
19 the proclamation.

20 CLERK: Council, City of New York
21 Proclamation. Whereas, the Council of the City of
22 New York is proud to honor Metropolitan College of
23 New York, for its extraordinary service and
24 contributions to the Haitian community and others,
25 particularly during the most challenging of times.

1
2 And whereas, when the tragic earthquake rocked
3 Haiti on January 12, 2010, the faculty and staff
4 at Metropolitan College of New York, MCNY, asked
5 what they could do to help. Working together,
6 they realized they were in a unique position to
7 not only help train Haitians about how to rebuild
8 their country, but also to help them learn how to
9 prepare more effectively for the future. And
10 whereas MCNY's 16 month Masters of Public
11 Administration in emergency and disaster
12 management, is a highly specialized degree that
13 covers planning, management, logistics, response ,
14 relief, recovery and economics associated with
15 managing emergency situations. The scholarship
16 program also incorporates MCNY's constructive
17 action curriculum that works to develop a hands-
18 on, comprehensive emergency management experience,
19 and plan that can be adapted and implemented in
20 Haiti. And whereas in September 2010, MCNY
21 bestowed full scholarships upon six promising
22 Haitian students for the school's emergency and
23 disaster management graduate program to educate
24 and train them as new leaders and help
25 institutionalize emergency management in their

1
2 native country. Upon their graduation, these
3 students will play key roles in shaping and
4 providing direction for the emergency management
5 and recovery efforts so desperately needed to
6 rebuild a better Haiti. Now therefore be it known
7 that the Council of the City of New York most
8 gratefully honors Metropolitan College of New York
9 for its tremendous service to the Haitian
10 community. Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for the
11 entire Council; Mathieu Eugene, Council Member
12 40th District, Brooklyn.

13 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very much
14 and who's going to speak for the college? Okay.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: President.

16 SPEAKER QUINN: The President,
17 that's a good person.

18 VINTON THOMPSON: Vinton Thompson,
19 President of Metropolitan College of New York. I
20 am deeply honored, Speaker Queen, Councilperson
21 Eugene, for the honor that's come to the college.
22 But I have to say that the, the real heroes behind
23 all this are really the resilient people of Haiti.
24 It's our intention in this program to empower the
25 people of Haiti through empowering the students in

1
2 this program, to rebuild, to recover, to come back
3 and build a better Haiti. And it's our honor, a
4 real honor, a real honor, is to be able to assist
5 in this, on the part of New York City, as an
6 important institution in Manhattan, lower
7 Manhattan, and the City of New York. So I thank
8 you all for this wonderful recognition of the,
9 what our students are doing, and what they will do
10 in Haiti for the Haitian people. Thank you so
11 much.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: [off mic]
13 Thank you much.

14 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very,
15 very much. [applause] And thank you very, very
16 much. And I want to thank you guys and the other
17 folks who are a part of ceremonials today, for
18 giving us flexibility in our schedule. So three
19 of our members are actually going over to the
20 Dominican Republic on a humanitarian trip, so it
21 kind of follows all of your work. So thank you
22 very, very much. Let me call up Council Member
23 Tish James who is going to lead our third and
24 final ceremonial. And if folks from the Black
25 Farmers and Urban Gardeners can make their way up

1
2 and this resolution's signed by Margaret Chin,
3 Tish James, Melissa Mark-Viverito, Fernando
4 Cabrera, Al Vann, Charles Barron, Debbie Rose and
5 me, but everybody is welcome up.

6 [background noise]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Yeah,
8 definitely. They're coming. [laughs]
9 Definitely. Here she comes. Come on, come on.
10 So, the Black Farmers and Urban Gardeners is an
11 arm of Black Urban Growers, an alliance of
12 predominately black urban farmers and gardeners,
13 food activists and allies, all united in
14 rebuilding community wealth and health, by
15 reconnecting to the land and traditional roles as
16 agriculturalists and environmental stewards. The
17 organization recently hosted a conference in
18 November 2010. There had to be at least 2000
19 individuals in attendance, and they continue to
20 build grassroots alliance with local not-for-
21 profits and farming groups. As most of you know,
22 President Barack Obama recently signed a bill
23 authorizing \$1.2 billion, with a B, to settle a 14
24 year old discrimination case filed by thousands of
25 black farmers, against the USDA. 22,722 black

1
2 farmers sued the USDA for unfairly denying them
3 loans between 1983 and 1997, loans that were, that
4 were routinely given to white farmers. Of the
5 claimants, 15,000 successfully proved
6 discrimination practices and received
7 compensation. Farming has played a traditional
8 role in the African-American community, from
9 sharecropping and other farming methods utilized
10 by landowning blacks following slavery. Indeed,
11 sharecropping was one of the few options for
12 penniless freedmen to conduct subsistence farming
13 and support themselves and their families. We are
14 experiencing a boom in urban areas of localized
15 food demand, through community supported
16 agriculture, farmer markets and food co-ops. And
17 it is fitting that urban black farmers claim their
18 rightful place in the development of new and
19 healthier food access methods, particularly in
20 communities that are underserved and serve as food
21 deserts. And so at this time, all of the
22 colleagues in the City Council, led by the Speaker
23 of the New York City, we salute black farmers for
24 all that they are doing, as part of this
25 revolution. [cheers, applause] Clerk, please

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

read the proc.

CLERK: Council, City of New York Proclamation. Whereas, in observance of Black History Month, the Council of the City of New York is proud to honor Black Farmers and Urban Gardeners. Black Farmers and Urban Gardeners is a consortium of grassroots groups, nonprofit organizations and individuals working together to ensure that people of color are included in the food conversation. In November 2009, this alliance began organizing and hosting a series of community events with the purpose of starting a conversation around food. And whereas, black farmers and urban gardeners is an organizations founded to engage people of African descent, in the critical food and farm related issues that directly impact health and economic security. Despite the rich farming history in the United States, people of African descent remain grossly underrepresented in our nation's farming population, making up less than one percent. And whereas, in February 2010, black farmers and urban gardeners organized its first conference and fundraiser where they enlisted a network of

1
2 activists to make real and immediate strides in
3 resolving the food crisis for African-American New
4 Yorkers. In November 2010, they held their first
5 annual conference with discussions, workshops and
6 strategy development to forge food, farming and
7 policy solutions for the black community. And
8 whereas, only in its second year, Black Farmers
9 and Urban Gardeners is a powerful catalyst for
10 positive changes. It has challenged the status
11 quo and offered innovative alternatives to address
12 inequalities in our food system. Today, the
13 organization continues to build a national network
14 of producers, consumers, and everyone in between,
15 to create sustainable solutions. Now therefore be
16 it known that the Council of the City of New York
17 honors Black Farmers and Urban Gardeners for their
18 outstanding service and contributions to the
19 community. Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for the
20 entire Council; Letitia James, Council Member,
21 35th District, Brooklyn.

22 SPEAKER QUINN: Yay! And a lot of
23 other Council Members. [applause] And first let
24 me just thank Tish for organizing this ceremonial.
25 Secondly, let me thank you, thank this group for

1
2 your great vision and commitment to New York. You
3 know, one of the things that I talk a lot about in
4 our food works work, is that people think urban
5 means you can't have farms. People think urban
6 means you can't have gardens. People think urban
7 means you can't create the food you need for your
8 citizens. And that is simply not true. Also,
9 people forget that the iss--think, you know,
10 organic and things like that are not something
11 that all communities are interested in and think
12 our goals shouldn't be the make sure everyone has
13 the same access to the highest quality food,
14 whether it be a green market or at supermarkets,
15 and our campaign to rid the City of urban deserts
16 is really supported by your work, as farmers and
17 urban gardeners, but really even more importantly
18 for your advocacy work and your raising
19 consciousness about this issue. So thank you guys
20 so much for being here, and for being part of our
21 work, [applause] and I look forward to a lot of
22 success in the future and I don't know who's
23 speaking for your--okay.

24 ASANTEWAA HARRIS: Thank you,
25 Speaker Quinn. My name is Asantewaa Harris.

1
2 Thank you, also, Council Member James, and all of
3 the distinguished Members here. I represent
4 Community Vision Council, which was a grassroots
5 organization that partnered in the planning of the
6 conference. We continue to look forward in
7 supporting our community and getting healthier
8 food. We have been engaged in intergenerational
9 activities. It's so important that we have this
10 message that food is so important to us. We have
11 been encouraged by people from other cities, where
12 they have a food policy council. So, I'd like to
13 share that with the Council Members here that
14 begin to look at how we can begin to look at a
15 healthier food shed for New York City. Thank you
16 so much. [cheers, applause]

17 SPEAKER QUINN: Tish, I hate to
18 have you had done work and pulled this together
19 and then to ask me to ask you to do more work, but
20 it would be great if you could get the folks from
21 the Black Farmers and Urban Gardeners to have a
22 meeting with Sara Brannon, our Food Policy staff
23 member in our policy unit, and get you guys more
24 involved in our work on food works, and us more
25 involved in your work. So, all right, great,

1

2 thank you all. And that concludes ceremonials for
3 the day. And can we do something about the heat
4 in here and get--

5 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Yeah, if we can
6 get the heat lowered. Ladies and gentlemen,
7 please take your seats. We're going to proceed
8 with the agenda for today's, on today's calendar.
9 If everyone can please find their seats. [pause,
10 background noise] Thank you very much. Okay. At
11 this point in time, I'm going to ask the Speaker
12 of the City Council to please proceed.

13 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. If I
14 could ask my colleagues to please stand. We have
15 two individuals whose passing that we need to
16 unfortunately note. The first, on February 26,
17 2011, former New York State Health Commissioner,
18 Dr. Richard Danes, who was 60, died unexpectedly
19 at his home in Dutchess County New York. Dr. Danes
20 had left a lucrative private sector career to join
21 the Spitzer and then Patterson Administrations.
22 As State Health Commissioner, he prompted,
23 promoted the development of primary care in
24 patient centered medical homes, and also created a
25 new office in the Health Department, to focus on

1 health information technology. Dr. Danes led
2 former Governor David Patterson's efforts to
3 create a "fat tax," to fight childhood obesity.
4 He was a graduate of Cornell University Medical
5 College. He had recently taken a position at the
6 New York Academy of Medicine. He is survived by
7 his wife, Linda, his three children, his parents
8 and a grandson. His funeral was held this morning
9 in Manhattan. On March 1, 2011, someone who is a
10 longtime member of the Council family, Nicholas
11 LaPorte, Jr., who was 61, passed away. He had
12 been the first director of the Council's
13 infrastructure division, and he passed away after
14 a long illness. Until his passing, Nick served as
15 Vice-Chair of the New York Civil Service
16 Commission, and was the Executive Director of the
17 Associated Buildings and Owners of Greater New
18 York. A lifelong New Yorker, Nick attended Wagner
19 College, Baruch College, and earned his law degree
20 at St. John's University. His late father,
21 Nicholas LaPorte, Sr., was a former Council Member
22 and Richmond County Democratic Chair. Nick is
23 survived by his son Matthew, his daughter-in-law
24 Anna, and his god--granddaughter Eva. His funeral
25

1
2 will be held on March 4th on Staten Island. And
3 our thoughts and prayers go out to Nick and all of
4 his family, but also his friends, many of whom are
5 still members of the Council staff, and former
6 members of the Council staff that we all see on a
7 regular basis. So let's keep Nick, his family and
8 his friends in our thoughts and prayers. [pause,
9 moment of silence] Thank you, Mr. Majority
10 Leader.

11 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very
12 much, Madam Speaker. We're now going to proceed
13 with the adoption of the minutes. Council Member
14 Nelson. [pause] Council Member Reyna, will you do
15 the honors of the adoption of the minutes?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I move that
17 the minutes of the Stated Meeting of February 2,
18 2011, be adopted as printed.

19 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very
20 much. We are now going to move on to messages and
21 papers from the Mayor.

22 CLERK: M 394, Preliminary Mayor's
23 Management Report.

24 SPEAKER QUINN: Received, ordered,
25 printed and filed.

1
2 CLERK: M 395 through 402,
3 Preliminary Budget Items.

4 SPEAKER QUINN: Finance.

5 [gavel]

6 CLERK: M 403.

7 SPEAKER QUINN: Received, ordered,
8 printed and filed.

9 CLERK: M 404, withdrawing Nancy G.
10 Chaffetz for reappointment to the Civil Service
11 Commission.

12 SPEAKER QUINN: Received, ordered,
13 printed and filed.

14 CLERK: Preconsidered M 405,
15 submitting Frank V. Carone for appointment to the
16 Taxi and Limousine Commission.

17 SPEAKER QUINN: Rules, Privileges
18 and Elections.

19 CLERK: Preconsidered M 406,
20 submitting Nora Constance Marino for appointment
21 to the Taxi and Limousine Commission.

22 SPEAKER QUINN: Rules, Privileges
23 and Elections.

24 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Communications
25 from the City, County and Borough Offices.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: M 407, Public Advocate's report.

SPEAKER QUINN: Received, ordered, printed and filed.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Petitions and Communications.

CLERK: None.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Land Use Call Ups?

CLERK: M 408 through 410, sidewalk cafés.

SPEAKER QUINN: If those could all be coupled on a land use call up vote, and if we can please have a roll call on the Land Use Call Ups.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: So ordered.

CLERK: Arroyo. [pause] Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I request unanimous consent to vote aye on all, I mean, Yes.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: So ordered.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Res, sir.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye on all general order items. Thank you.

1
2 CLERK: Brewer.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.
4 CLERK: Cabrera.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.
6 CLERK: Chin.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.
8 CLERK: Comrie.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: [off mic]
10 Aye.
11 CLERK: Crowley.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye.
13 CLERK: Dickens.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: [off mic]
15 Aye.
16 CLERK: Dilan. [pause] Dromm.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye on all.
18 CLERK: Eugene.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.
20 CLERK: Fidler.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: [off mic]
22 Aye.
23 CLERK: Foster.
24 COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Aye.
25 CLERK: Garodnick. [pause]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Gennaro. [pause] Gentile. [pause] Gonzalez.

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: [off mic]

Aye.

CLERK: Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.

CLERK: Halloran.

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Aye.

CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

CLERK: Ignizio.

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Aye.

CLERK: James.

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: [off mic]

Aye.

CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

CLERK: Koppell.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: [off mic]

Aye.

CLERK: Koslowitz. [pause]

Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

CLERK: Lappin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: [off mic]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Aye.

CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

CLERK: Mark-Viverito.

COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: [off
mic] Aye. [laughter]

CLERK: Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye.

CLERK: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

CLERK: Nelson.

COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Aye.

CLERK: Recchia.

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Aye.

[pause]

CLERK: Reyna.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Aye.

CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

CLERK: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

CLERK: Sanders.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Aye.

CLERK: Seabrook.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Mr.
Majority Leader, with unanimous consent, I'd like
to vote on all land use call ups and general
orders.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: So ordered.

[pause]

CLERK: Ulrich.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye.

CLERK: Vacca.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

CLERK: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: [off mic]

Aye.

CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

CLERK: Vann.

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Aye.

CLERK: Weprin. [pause] Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic]

Aye.

CLERK: Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye.

CLERK: Dilan.

COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Aye.

1

CLERK: Gennaro.

2

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: [off mic]

3

4 Yes.

4

CLERK: Gentile.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.

6

7 [pause]

7

CLERK: Oddo.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: [off mic]

9

10 Yes.

10

CLERK: Rivera.

11

PRESIDENT RIVERA: I vote aye.

12

CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

13

SPEAKER QUINN: [off mic] Yes.

14

15 [pause]

15

16 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Today's land use

16

17 call ups were adopted by a vote of 48 in the

17

18 affirmative, with zero in the negative. We now

18

19 move on to Communication from the Speaker.

19

20 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very

20

21 much. If we can get a little quiet, please.

21

22 [gavel]

22

23 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Take all

23

24 conversations outside and please turn off your

24

25 cell phones; silence in the chambers.

25

1
2 SPEAKER QUINN: Before I speak
3 about legislation, I just want to take a moment to
4 announce a changing staffing here at the Council
5 which the person I'm going to single out is going
6 to hate, but that's life. Detective Ronny
7 Connolly, Ronny, could you step up.

8 RONNY CONNOLLY: Step up.

9 SPEAKER QUINN: You're a member of
10 a paramilitary organization, Ronny, you've been
11 ordered. Ronny, who I think most folks know from
12 when he was on the door at City Hall, and more
13 recently a member of the Speaker's detail, is
14 abandoning all of us, a big flat leaver is what we
15 call him, and he will Friday retire from the NYPD
16 and move to Las Vegas with his family. So
17 [applause] I just, in addition to wanting to
18 embarrass Ronny, just wanted to take a moment,
19 most importantly on behalf of myself, on behalf of
20 Kim, and on behalf of my father, but on behalf of
21 all of us at the Council, to thank you so much for
22 your service to our City, for your service to this
23 institution, for your unwavering loyalty and
24 support and love to me over the time you have been
25 a part of my detail, we really, really, really are

1
2 going to miss you. So thank you so much, Ronny,
3 and thank you so much, Ronny, and best of luck.
4 Thank you. [applause, whistle] And, Ronny is
5 being replaced by Police Officer Ray Garolla
6 [phonetic], who everyone can meet over here in the
7 gold tie. [applause] Ray, Ray will now be
8 partnered with Detective Ray Hadi [phonetic], so
9 we're merely going to call Officer Garolla Number
10 Two. So if you hear me refer to Two, that is Ray
11 over there. He may not have known that was his
12 new name, on the force, but Two is his new name.
13 Thank you very much for that moment of personal
14 privilege, so to speak. Let me now talk more
15 seriously about the legislation that we are voting
16 on today. First, let me note, Intro, let me thank
17 the Rules Committee and Majority Leader Rivera for
18 moving forward on two appointments to the Taxi and
19 Limousine Commissioner, Frank Carone and Nora
20 Constance Marino. Secondly, let me thank Jeff
21 Haberman--shh, Ramon, shh--Jeff Haberman, Bob Ahom
22 [phonetic], Laura Rogers and Ben Goodman for their
23 work on Intro 291-A. Intro 291-A is a piece of
24 legislation introduced by our former colleague,
25 Public Advocate Bill de Blasio. It increases

1
2 penalties for failing to provide adequate heat and
3 hot water, which is obviously an enormous problem
4 for tenants living in New York City. I want to
5 thank the Public Advocate for his work on this, I
6 want to thank the Chair of Housing and Buildings
7 Committee, Eric Dilan, for his work on this, and
8 call on the Chair to say a few words.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Thank you,
10 Madam Speaker, and I'll be very, very brief,
11 'cause I know we have a huge agenda before us
12 today. This bill will affect approximately 900
13 buildings that are repeat heat violators
14 throughout the City. So, my message simply is
15 that providing heat and hot water in buildings
16 where tenants live is a fundamental responsibility
17 of building ownership. So if you're a good
18 homeowner, if you're a good landlord, you have
19 absolutely zero to worry about in this bill. It's
20 not going to cost you extra to operate your
21 buildings. But if you're a repeat offender, and
22 you, on multiple occasions, you don't pay for heat
23 and hot water, or you consistently have heating
24 systems breaking down in your building, we're
25 going to raise the cost of operating on you. Very

1
2 simply, providing no heat and hot water cannot be
3 an excuse to avoiding paying for fuel oil in your
4 buildings, and we think this looks to do so. Now,
5 I was pleased with the data. Again, the data says
6 only 900 buildings citywide have been affected in
7 the past two heat seasons. So that alone that
8 says that most owners are doing the right things
9 in this regard. But there's still 900 buildings,
10 and god knows how many tenants that go without
11 heat on multiple occasions, so we are hopeful that
12 this and maybe some future pieces of legislation
13 can look to correct this problem that's affected
14 this City and my district for many, many years.
15 So, I'd like to thank you, Madam Speaker.

16 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very
17 much, Chair Dilan. Let me next speak to Intro 26-
18 A, which is a piece of legislation that deals with
19 the sale of tax liens. I want to thank Kate Seely
20 Kirk, Anthony Brito, Emre Edev, Preston Niblack
21 and Tanisha Edwards, and this--

22 [pause, break in audio for over a
23 minute, then testing of system]

24 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Testing, 1, 2.
25 Okay. It's back. Try Jimmy, try--

1
2 SPEAKER QUINN: Hello. Oh, this
3 works, that's fine. Gets me off my heels, anyway,
4 that's the whole point, I think. I was saying, I
5 wanted to thank Kate Seely-Kirk, Anthony Brito,
6 Emre Edev, Preston Niblack and Tanisha Edwards,
7 and if we could give a big round of applause for
8 the tax lien team, so to speak, who did a really,
9 really great job on this bill. [applause] I want
10 to thank the Chair of the Finance Committee,
11 Domenic M. Recchia, Jr., for his work on the tax
12 lien bill. But in particular, and if we could get
13 a little quiet for a moment. [gavel] I want to
14 think the lead sponsor of 26-A, Al Vann. The
15 point of what we are doing today is in large part
16 to make sure people who owe the City money have to
17 pay that money. But Al realized, based on what
18 happened last time, that sometimes there are
19 people who haven't been able to pay, not because
20 they're scofflaws, not because they're deadbeats,
21 but because they can't pay. And for the City to
22 then force them out of their homes and to lose
23 their homes serves no one at all. And Al made it
24 his mission, literally over the past year plus, to
25 make sure that when the tax lien sale authorizing

1
2 resolution needed to be renewed, that it was
3 renewed with a heart in the way that got City
4 money it was owed, but watched out for low income
5 people, watched out for the men and women of our
6 services who were returning from war, watched out
7 for people who are on government subsidies. So Al
8 has made this an incredibly thoughtful and
9 protective piece of legislation. In it we have
10 also empowered the City to sell liens around HPD
11 violations, which will be another important tool
12 in our effort to crack down on bad landlords. But
13 I really want to ask everyone to join with me in
14 thanking Al Vann for his tremendous work on this
15 legislation. [applause] Let me first call on the
16 Chair of our Committee, Domenic Recchia, and then
17 the sponsor of the bill, Al Vann.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Thank you,
19 Speaker Quinn. I want to thank you for your
20 leadership on this bill, and to my colleague, Al
21 Vann, for sponsoring this legislation, he worked
22 tirelessly, day in and day out. But I also want
23 to thank the Finance Committee, especially the
24 lien team under leadership--

25 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Can we get a

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

little quiet, please.

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: --of

Preston Niblack--

SPEAKER QUINN: Shhhh.

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: And also

Al Vann's entire staff. By working together, we were able to achieve something that we have been trying to do for years in this City. By extending the Finance Commissioner's authority to sell tax liens and authorizing the City to conduct standard loan lien sales, on emergency repair charges, we are giving them the tools they need to collect on outstanding bills, and to raise more revenue for the City of New York. But at the same time, we're providing protections for homeowners so that they don't lose their homes. If they're having hard time making ends meet, we are providing protection. With the current state of the economy, we need to do everything we can to keep people in their homes. I hope that my colleagues join me in rising in the months ahead, because our true fight is about to begin with the Water Board and in convincing them, and the Department of Environmental Protection, to take measures into

1
2 account where they will not increase water rates
3 any more, but to lower them below ten percent. I
4 have sent the letter to the Water

5 [pause, break in audio for several
6 moments, background noise]

7 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Testing 1, 2.
8 Okay, the mics are back on.

9 SPEAKER QUINN: Keep rolling, Dom.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Hello?

11 All right. Okay, so, I sent a letter to the Water
12 Board urging them to set this year's rating below
13 ten percent, so we provide more relief to New
14 Yorkers. But I just want to thank everyone, and I
15 encourage you to vote aye, but Al Vann, this is
16 your bill, you did a great job, and working with
17 you was a great pleasure and honor, and after so
18 many years of being in public service, your dream
19 has come true.

20 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very
21 much, Domenic, and let me now call on the sponsor
22 of the bill, Al Vann. [applause]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Thank you
24 very much, Speaker. One of my dreams, Domenic,
25 one. Very important one. I rise today to ask for

1
2 a yes vote on Intro 26-A. The Lien Sale Reform
3 and Authorization Bill, which I first introduced
4 during the past legislative session in 2009, and
5 then reintroduced in 2010. Since that time we
6 have had several hearings on the bill to best
7 understand how to reform the City's lien sale
8 process, to protect our most vulnerable homeowners
9 from having their property tax, water and sewer
10 debts, sold during its annual sale. Now for the
11 first time, the City's lien sale law will include
12 a set of comprehensive reforms that help to strike
13 a balance between our fiscal obligation to
14 encourage homeowners who can afford to pay their
15 municipal debts to pay up, while building
16 protections into the law to assist our most
17 economically vulnerable and distressed homeowners,
18 who probably are not able to pay, do not have the
19 ability to pay. And they can't pay because of the
20 fixed income or the loss of income. They are not
21 able to pay because of their fixed income or their
22 lost income. And there is a distinction between
23 the two, and we acknowledge this, and we strike a
24 critical and fiscally responsible balance. I'm
25 very proud of this bill because my staff and I

1
2 worked hard, hand-in-hand, to craft this
3 legislation, with legal advocates across the City.
4 Now, the legal advocates have clients who are
5 mostly seniors, disabled, on fixed income, and
6 veteran homeowners who have been adversely
7 affected by the lien sale. Intro 26-A includes
8 provisions that reform the lien sale process from
9 the point of early delinquency to the lien sale
10 notice phase, and even after a lien has been sold.
11 This bill includes more notice, legislates a
12 process to deliver timely and effective outreach
13 services, to help qualified homeowners get the tax
14 exemptions that will exclude them from the lien
15 sale. Intro 26-A even cuts the interest rate in
16 half, post-lien sale. Cuts the interest rate in
17 half, post-lien sale. For the majority of
18 homeowners who have this misfortune of having
19 their liens sold, they will take advantage
20 obviously of this provision. One of the most
21 substantial provisions of this bill is the
22 inclusion of an affordable and flexible payment
23 plan. Intro 26-A requires that a payment plan
24 with zero down payment, with up to eight years to
25 pay. And this is being offered to any delinquent

1
2 homeowner who needs it, or who requires it. This
3 bill addresses a very significant barrier that has
4 caused many homeowners to repeatedly end up on a
5 lien sale, after entering payment plan agreements.
6 The inclusion of both affordable and flexible
7 terms in the bill, will make it so that all
8 homeowners will have the tools they need to pay
9 and stay current, on their tax and water debts.
10 And finally, the bill doubles the delinquency
11 threshold amount, to be included in the lien sale,
12 from \$1,000 to \$2,000 for water and sewer debt,
13 for class I, II and III family properties.
14 Thereby making it more difficult for a homeowner
15 to end up in the lien sale in the first place.
16 Increasing the threshold amount was a reform that
17 we fought really hard for the Administration to
18 include in this bill. I understand the tremendous
19 economic pressure New York homeowners have been
20 under, particularly in the last five years, with
21 an increase in water rates by more than 60
22 percent, despite the significant revenue increase
23 to Department of Environmental Protection's
24 budget, particularly and specifically from
25 standalone water liens. I'd like to thank, as the

1
2 Speaker and others have done, but it, we can't do
3 it too often, all of the advocates who helped us
4 to really craft this bill, including NIDAP
5 [phonetic], South Brooklyn Legal Services, Legal
6 Aid Society, and Queens Legal Services. I want to
7 thank the Council's Finance and Lien Sale Team,
8 for all their tremendous work on the bill,
9 including Preston Niblack, Tanisha Edwards, Emre
10 Edev and Kate Seely-Kirk. I also want to offer
11 special thanks to my City Hall staff for their
12 hard work and effort, Mandalla Jones [phonetic],
13 my Budget Communication Director, and a lot of
14 work by my Legislative Director, Donny Lebron
15 [phonetic], who met regularly with the advocates
16 to make certain that we had all the evidence we
17 needed. And finally and critically, Chairman of
18 Finance Committee, Domenic Recchia, and most
19 critically, Speaker Christine Quinn. Finally,
20 finally, I've been in office now some, elected
21 office, some 36 years. And I've been in office
22 that long because of bills like this. This is a
23 bill that really help people that need it. It
24 help people from protecting and perhaps preserving
25 their most sacred resource, their home, their

1
2 house. And I can't think of anything I'm more
3 proud of with this Council, 'cause I know you're
4 going to vote the right way, than this particular
5 bill. This is, this makes government looks good,
6 this is what government is supposed to do. And
7 the process, the fact that requires a balance
8 between the Administration and the Council, which
9 means there had to be negotiations. And yes,
10 negotiate implies that you compromise. It does
11 not have everything that we wanted, and it does
12 not have everything that the Administration
13 wanted, but it struck a balance, and that balance
14 protect our most vulnerable New Yorkers who own
15 property and I'm very proud of that fact, and very
16 proud of this body. Thank you, Madam Speaker.
17 [applause]

18 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. Thank
19 you, Al, and I think I speak for all of my
20 colleagues when we, I say we are very proud of
21 you. So thank you very much, Al. Lastly, let me
22 speak about, and just so you know, we're having
23 power problems in the whole building, so that's
24 the situation. - - on? [background noise] Oh,
25 there we go, we're back on. Okay, now, let me

1
2 speak about Intro 371-A, the pregnancy services
3 center piece of legislation, and thank you
4 Minority Leader Oddo. Let me first--I'll move,
5 then, Dan. Let me speak from this side, since
6 Council Member Halloran found their irony in that.
7 Let me first thank a lot of staff who worked long
8 and hard on this bill: Rachel Cordero, Alex
9 Pistilnick, Lauren Axelrod, Jeff Metzler, Adera
10 Simon who isn't on the Council staff anymore, but
11 let me thank all of them, and whether you think
12 this bill is the wrong or right thing, I would ask
13 you to give them all a round of applause in
14 support of this. [applause] And I want to thank
15 the Minority Leader for his offer, but thank god
16 my sound is back on. Intro 371-A, let me, before
17 I speak of the bill, thank Council Member Julissa
18 Ferreras who has left already, the Women's Issues
19 Committee Chair, for moving the bill through her
20 Committee, and holding a long and productive
21 hearing on the matter. Let me also thank Council
22 Member Jessica Lappin who has worked long and hard
23 for quite some time on this piece of legislation.
24 She's been incredibly focused, really dogged in
25 moving this bill forward and making sure we had a

1
2 constitutionally sound bill, so I really want to
3 thank you, Jessica, for your hard work on this.

4 If anybody's noticed that [applause] Jessica's had
5 two bills in the two meetings, yes, that is true,
6 and I think it's part of the reason she is
7 expecting this baby was to move her legislation
8 out quickly, before she took maternity leave. But
9 seriously, Intro 371-A is an important piece of
10 consumer protection legislation. A two year
11 investigation was conducted, and our hearing her
12 testimony that supported the findings of the
13 investigation. It is a fact that there are
14 centers in the City of New York that provide an
15 array of reproductive services from abortion to
16 adoption referral. It is true that there are
17 other centers in the City of New York that only
18 counsel women on the option of adoption and they
19 are clear and transparent and up front about that,
20 and there is nothing wrong with that. That is an
21 important option. That transparency is key.

22 Those centers do not attempt to deceive women and
23 should--pretend that they are medical offices.

24 There are other institutions that the research had
25 stories from people who have been patients there,

1
2 or thought they were patients there, there are
3 centers in the City of New York, that present
4 themselves as medical offices. What does that
5 mean? Think about every time you've been to a
6 doctor's office? If you were blindfolded and
7 walked into a building and left in an office, and
8 the blindfold was taken off, you could quickly
9 figure out you were in a doctor's office without
10 there being a big sign. Someone gives you a
11 clipboard, and asks you for medical information.
12 People are wearing scrubs. People conducting
13 things like sonograms or different tests. But
14 these centers that we are focused on are in fact
15 not medical offices. And the facts have shown
16 that in this subset of these centers, they present
17 themselves as medical offices when they are not.
18 They do not make clear what services they do and
19 do not provide, and the facts have also born out
20 that they provide women with misinformation. And
21 we've heard from social workers, and women who
22 have suffered significantly, and had their choices
23 limited, and their health impacted, because of
24 that misinformation. Now, all of us in this
25 Council support people's rights to have whatever

1
2 positions they want. And based on that belief,
3 and being someone who attempts to be clear in her
4 positions, I don't understand why anyone would
5 oppose this piece of legislation. If you are
6 running a center that only provides some services
7 to women, and not others, I have to assume if that
8 is your life's work, you are proud of the services
9 you provide. Why would you want to hide that?
10 Why wouldn't you want to be abundantly clear about
11 what you do provide and what you find distasteful
12 and you will not provide. How can the idea of
13 transparency in the services one provides be
14 anything that anyone disagrees with. Now some
15 will say that this bill is unconstitutional
16 because a bill in Baltimore was unconstitutional.
17 This bill is different than the law that was
18 passed by the Baltimore City Council. It very
19 clearly focuses on a harm that was done to women,
20 the harm of women being deceived and believing
21 they were in a medical office, when they were not.
22 It has a narrow field of harm. It is broad,
23 though, in that we cover centers generally. This
24 does not say you don't have to disclose
25 information if you provide abortion services, it

1
2 says you have to say if you do or do not. It does
3 not say you don't, are not impacted by the law if
4 you provide emergency contraception, it says you
5 have to say if you do or you do not. It does not
6 say if you provide prenatal care you are exempt,
7 it says you have to say if you provide prenatal
8 care or if you don't. It is an equal standard of
9 disclosure, that is different. People have the
10 right to run centers that they believe will help
11 women. No one has the right to deceive people at
12 all, particularly when they are in a vulnerable
13 moment, where they deserve all information that is
14 available for them to make a critical decision for
15 them and their families. I want to thank everyone
16 in the Council regardless of what your position,
17 yes, no, or abstained on this bill. The Council
18 has conducted a thorough and extensive discussion,
19 debate, amendment, hearing process on this bill.
20 It is perfectly fine in my opinion for people to
21 disagree. But we have conducted a process of
22 which I think we all feel we had an opportunity to
23 participate, that was guided by the clear rules of
24 the City Council, and one that has led to an
25 amended version of this bill which I believe, as

1
2 does our General Counsel's office, as does the
3 Corporation Counsel of the City of New York, will
4 more than stand any legal challenge, if one,
5 someone decides to bring one. So, I want to thank
6 all of my colleagues, and I really also want to
7 thank the opponents of this legislation, whether
8 they be Council Members or other organizations.
9 Council Member, Minority Leader, excuse me, Oddo,
10 many months ago raised an issue about "What about
11 centers that don't deceive? That are clearly
12 adoption only? Why should they be treated the
13 same way?" He raised a very good point in a
14 leadership meeting, and it was aggressively
15 followed up on, and if you are doing that
16 transparently, you are not covered by the bill.
17 So when I thank everyone, I want to thank the
18 opponents and the proponents, who made this a
19 better bill, and that is an example of real
20 democracy, a place where whether you are for our
21 legislation or against us, you have an equal seat
22 at the table, and crafting legislation, and
23 getting changes into a bill whether you're a
24 member or an advocacy group, does not mean that at
25 the end of the day you have to vote yes, or issue

1
2 a statement in support of the bill. So, again,
3 let me thank everyone, and Jimmy, again for the
4 microphone, thank you very much. But most
5 importantly, I want to thank the sponsor, prime
6 sponsor of Council Member 3--of Intro 371-A,
7 Council Member Jessica Lappin.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Thank you,
9 Madam Speaker. This,. this is about truth in
10 advertising. And to be clear, this bill only
11 regulates centers that are deceiving women into
12 thinking that they are in a medical facility, when
13 they are not. And what those centers are doing is
14 incredibly dangerous, and we have a real record in
15 this City of serious harm to women. So we are
16 passing this bill today to protect those women and
17 their health. And as the speaker detailed, what
18 this bill will do will require centers to disclose
19 in advertising and in their offices if there is or
20 is not medical staff supervising; if they do or do
21 not offer abortions, emergency contraception, or
22 prenatal services, or referrals for those
23 services. It also requires them to tell women
24 that they should consult with a licensed medical
25 provider if they are or believe that they may be

1
2 pregnant. And I think also just as importantly,
3 it requires that the information a woman gives to
4 these centers be treated confidentially. Women
5 are giving incredibly personal information, and
6 right now it is completely unprotected. This
7 measure is not about free speech or First
8 Amendment rights, it is dramatically different
9 than what was passed in Baltimore, and again the
10 Speaker detailed some of the ways, so I won't go
11 into it. But I want to be clear that we, people
12 in this City, have the right to believe and to say
13 whatever they like, not just in New York, but in
14 this country. But they can't do it while they're
15 wearing scrubs and making you think that you are
16 in a doctor's office. A Center that's only
17 providing counseling and social services will not
18 be impacted by this bill. It really only covers
19 places that any reasonable person would think is a
20 medical facility. I think a reasonable person
21 would think a place providing an ultrasound or a
22 sonogram, is a medical facility. And when women
23 are facing what is probably the most difficult
24 decision of their lives, they have a right to
25 accurate and unbiased medical information, and

1
2 this bill protects them and their health. There,
3 the Speaker mentioned all of the individual staff
4 members who have worked very, very hard on this
5 legislation. I wanted to thank them, as well. We
6 have been working on this bill for almost a year,
7 and it has been a very intense and collaborative,
8 and at some times emotional process. And they
9 have been nothing but responsive, intelligent, and
10 handled this issue with great intellect. I wanted
11 to thank each and every one of my colleagues who
12 sponsored the bill, and those who didn't, who gave
13 us feedback, who worked with us, who made it a
14 much better bill. And I do believe the bill we're
15 voting on today is much stronger than the one that
16 was first introduced. And I have to thank the
17 Speaker, I thank her every time we pass one of my
18 bills, but this is a really special one. It's
19 incredibly important to me and it also shows that
20 she has, continues to demonstrate just an
21 unwavering, courageous commitment to women in this
22 City and to their health. So thank you.

23 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very
24 much. And that concludes Communications from the
25 Speaker.

1
2 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very
3 much, Madam Speaker. We will now move on to
4 discussion of--

5 SPEAKER QUINN: Oh, I'm just sorry,
6 I'm sorry, let me just, I'm sorry, just quickly I
7 just want to note that the Preliminary Budget,
8 Preliminary Mayor Management Report, and Agency
9 Oversight Hearings Schedule is attached to the
10 agenda, so that's very important for folks to make
11 note of that. Also, watch on the website and in
12 your mailboxes, in case things change, but make
13 note of that. I also wanted to announced you
14 should've gotten an email yesterday, but Tuesday,
15 Finance Chair Domenic M. Recchia, Jr., is going to
16 be leading Council Members to Albany to do
17 lobbying on State budget cuts. So we would
18 welcome as many Council Members as possible,
19 please see Preston or Jeff Rodus with that. But
20 again, our Finance Chair and Helen Foster will be
21 at State and Federal Leg, taking folks up Tuesday,
22 and then other times in the future. Thank you.
23 Sorry about that.

24 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very
25 much, Madam Speaker. And we now move on to

1
2 Discussion of General Orders. First we'll start
3 off with Council Member Tish James. [pause]
4 Okay, we'll move on to Council Member Foster.
5 [pause] Next, we'll--Next we'll move on to
6 Council Member Chin.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. I
8 want to speak in support of 371-A, following what
9 the Speaker and Council Member Lappin talked about
10 earlier, and I really want to thank them for their
11 leadership. This legislation will protect women
12 and consumers, especially in our immigrant
13 communities and low income communities, where they
14 are the targets of these pregnancy service centers
15 that engage in deceptive practice. It is
16 important that we have this legislation, and I
17 urge my colleagues to support it. Thank you.

18 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very
19 much, Council Member, we will now move on to
20 Council Member Reyna.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Thank you,
22 Pro Tem. I rise in support of Intro 371-A.
23 Providing women with information who then will be
24 able to make an educated and informative choice.
25 Today Intro 371 is a piece of legislation that

1
2 would require pregnancy centers to provide clear
3 signage disclosing what they do offer and what
4 they do not. These crisis centers will be obliged
5 to put up signs posting whether or not they are
6 licensed medical professional. Requiring centers
7 to give clients confidentiality protections,
8 disclosing personal or health information without
9 consent is not something that we want to deceive
10 anyone, and should not allow by enabling it.

11 Women throughout New York City will now know what
12 they are getting at a pregnancy crisis center.

13 Requiring centers to clearly state their available
14 services, women can make a more informed decision
15 on the services they seek. Nobody has the right
16 to prevent a woman from taking care of her own
17 health. I'd like to thank our sponsor, Council
18 Member Jessica Lappin, who has worked tirelessly
19 on this piece of legislation, and the leadership
20 of our fellow female and advocate, but most
21 especially Speaker, Christine Quinn, for charging
22 us with the support that we needed in order to get
23 this piece of legislation negotiated and
24 efficiently passed in this Council.

25 Congratulations to Jessica Lappin once again.

1
2 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very
3 much. At this point in time, I want to call
4 Council Member Dan Halloran.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Thank
6 you, Mr. Majority Leader. Congress and several
7 states shall make no law abridging freedom of
8 speech. "The government cannot, consistent with
9 the First Amendment, require a pro-life pregnancy
10 related service center to post a sign, as would be
11 required by this ordinance." O'Brien v. the Mayor
12 of City of Baltimore, holding in the most recent
13 federal decision. "Freedom of speech is the
14 matrix, the indispensable condition of every other
15 form of freedom." Justice Cardozo quoted in that
16 case. "The government must abstain from
17 regulating speech when the specific motivation,
18 ideology or opinion of the speaker is the
19 rationale for the restriction." United States
20 Supreme Court, Rosenberg v. Rector at 515 US 819.
21 It is very clear this is an unconstitutional piece
22 of legislation. The fact that it has been
23 amended, and I salute Julissa Ferreras for
24 listening to my concerns and actually
25 incorporating some of them. I appreciate very

1
2 much that she was willing to take the time to do
3 that. However, contrary to the Speaker's
4 comments, this bill is in fact more restrictive
5 than the speech requirements in that bill, and I
6 say that as someone who's practiced constitutional
7 law, and is actually admitted to the United States
8 Supreme Court to practice. In the Maryland law,
9 it was only signage, there was only a requirement
10 to post signage. In this, there's not only a
11 requirement to post signage, there's a requirement
12 to buy advertising and include those disclaimers
13 in the advertising you have to purchase. In
14 addition, there is oral disclosure requirements.
15 Let's talk about the confidentiality in reporting.
16 I don't believe this law satisfied the State
17 mandatory reporter requirements. I believe that
18 it does not comport with the requirements of that
19 particular, of that particular section of the
20 statute. And that's a State issue, so I don't
21 know that that's the case. It leaves the details
22 of the signage and the method of the signage to
23 the hands of the Department of Consumer Affairs.
24 So it does not spell out and promulgate specific
25 restrictive requirements, as was intimated in the

1
2 Baltimore decision, it leaves them to the vagaries
3 of an administrative agency. In addition, this
4 statute provides for criminal incarceration of up
5 to six months for failing to comply with a signage
6 requirement. A signage requirement. You're going
7 to put someone in jail for six months 'cause they
8 don't want to put up a sign. Tell me where in the
9 City of New York that is the case. In addition,
10 the Committee's report fails to note that in my
11 cross-examination and questioning of the
12 witnesses, Dr. Blank of the New York City
13 Department of Health conceded she has no open
14 reports of the kinds of allegations NARAL made.
15 There has been not State or local investigations
16 which have substantiated any of those claims.
17 Deputy Commissioner for Consumer Affairs conceded
18 there were no such fraud complaints, no
19 regulations comparable to any other not-for-
20 profit, and that they have no open, pending or
21 prior lawsuits or claims related to the claims of
22 NARAL. NARAL admitted that its report was--

23 SPEAKER QUINN: Can we get a little
24 quiet, excuse me Council Member--

25 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Sure.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPEAKER QUINN: Can we just get a little quiet.

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: NARAL--

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you.

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Madam Speaker. NARAL in its report admitted that it was not following scientific method, did not use any social science protocols, and had no control factors in what it was reporting on. In sum, it conceded that its report was a biased report not following the sociological method. Now, to be sure, choice is the issue here. I agree completely that after the decision in Roe v. Wade, the law of the land is that women have a right to choose abortion. Similarly, Catholic and Christian organizations have the right to not choose abortion, and to promote an environment in which there are options other than abortion. And in New York City, the abortion rate to pregnancies is 41 percent; in the minority communities, that number is 60 percent. That means 60 percent of all pregnancies end in an abortion. That is problematic. What happened to the phrase, "It was going to be rare, legal but rare." That's gone

1
2 now. Finally, let me also note, that throughout
3 the dialogue on this issue, we've talked about
4 deceptive practices. Planned Parenthood at the
5 hearing said, "Places like Bridge to Life and
6 Sisters to Life are clearly deceptive names." But
7 Planned Parenthood, which acknowledged in the same
8 hearings they provide no parenting services
9 whatsoever, no postnatal care and no follow up,
10 isn't deceptive. I submit to you the facts in
11 fact are the facts, and they're plain as day.
12 This is an unconstitutional infringement, it's
13 violative of a recent federal court decision, and
14 a series of precedents. It will be struck down.
15 And to be quite blunt, I really don't think the
16 Corporation Council, who just got rebuffed by the
17 Supreme Court, and told that they don't know what
18 they're talking about it when it comes to
19 separation of powers, with the taxi situation, is
20 one to speak on what will or will not be held as
21 constitutional by the Supreme Court of the United
22 States. I think a plain reading of the First
23 Amendment is in order. Thank you and I appreciate
24 the extension of time. [applause]

25 [gavel]

1
2 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Silence in the
3 chambers. Silence in the chambers, thank you very
4 much. We'll move on to the next Council Member,
5 Council Member Melissa Mark-Viverito.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:

7 Thank you. I want to rise in support of Intro
8 371-A. Before I make my comments, I just want to
9 clarify two points of misinformation in the
10 statement by my colleague. This bill does not
11 enforce, does not force the buying of any sort of
12 advertisements, one; and two, there's no criminal
13 violation for not putting up the sign, only for
14 those that are interfering with that process.
15 That needs to be clarified. Let me just say that,
16 you know, the social structure of our country has
17 embedded in it inequities that permeate throughout
18 various areas of our lives. Intro 371-A is one
19 way in which we can positively address the
20 inequities in reproductive health, and lessen the
21 power these centers have over women, and in
22 particular women of color. The National Latino
23 Institute for Reproductive Health provides
24 research that clearly shows that African-American
25 women and Latinas are more likely to be uninsured

1
2 or underinsured, and often lack basic access to
3 birth control and comprehensive sex education, due
4 to fundamental structural inequities in society.
5 Our country is continuously being faced with
6 controversial issues, and it is important that we
7 embrace measures that promote choice and
8 democracy, versus exclusion and degradation. It
9 is important we remain committed to justice in
10 thought and action, and stray from archaic
11 mindsets and theories. State Representative Lisa
12 Shepperson and State Representative Sue Wallace
13 are both female Republicans in the Wyoming
14 Legislature, who have shed the burden of upholding
15 Republican ideals that degrade me and all women
16 and seek to strip me and all women from having the
17 ability to choose for themselves what reproductive
18 health options they will exercise. Instead, these
19 two brave Republicans are standing up for women's
20 rights in order to ensure that women maintain
21 their ability to decide what happens with their
22 bodies. These women were bold enough to speak out
23 against their party, which strives to limit
24 government interference in personal and business
25 matters, yet does not afford women and

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

reproductive health--

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: --

the same respect. I not only applaud these Wyoming reps, I applaud our Speaker and our colleague, Council Member Lappin, for their valor in standing up for women--

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Council Member, if you could sum up.

COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: --

particularly, women of color--I was told I have an extension--Okay?--in this City, and seeing this not as a pro-choice or anti-choice issue, but as one that safeguards the health and dignity of a woman's choice, and upholding the justice that we deserve. So, I want to thank them and I thank all my colleagues, and I urge my colleagues to sign on and support and vote for Intro 371-A.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very much, Council Member. We'll next move on to Council Member Fernando Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much, distinguished Members of the City Council. Let me address Bill 371. The real

1
2 matter before us fundamentally is free speech.
3 Regardless of whether you are pro-life or pro-
4 choice. It is unprecedented in the history of the
5 City Council to impose upon nonprofit
6 organizations to post a sign that requires them to
7 state what they do not do. Similar legislation
8 has been mentioned already, has been found to be
9 unconstitutional as recent as three weeks ago.
10 Also, there is not one recorded incident from a
11 City agency, State agency or scientific data that
12 supports the notion that women are being
13 misguided. The following statistics actually
14 point to something very different. With 41
15 percent of all pregnancies ending in abortions,
16 the constitutional right to choose enjoys a
17 popularity in this City that is unrivaled in any
18 other place in the nation. Women enter these
19 centers freely, and when they are told they do not
20 perform abortions, the majority leave just as
21 freely and go to a place the abortion. We have
22 before us the needs of our constituents who will
23 be better served by the moneys and resources that
24 will be spend on an appeal battle, and which is
25 certain to lose in the courts. I also like to

1
2 say, appreciate the civil discourse that has been
3 taking place between the members on this really
4 emotional issue, and I really appreciate that, and
5 I commend all the members on both sides. Thank
6 you very much. [applause]

7 [gavel]

8 PRESIDENT RIVERA: If you can
9 please keep it down in the back, we do not want
10 people applauding or booing or making any noise.
11 We want the members to be able to speak. Next
12 we'll move on to Council Member Brewer.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you
14 very much. I want to join those accolades, giving
15 accolades to Council Member Lappin and the Speaker
16 and the staff. Having headed up the Commission on
17 the Status of Women many years ago, and having
18 spent some time in some of the clinics that do
19 provide abortion, and having worked to make sure
20 that they were safe, we used to have to make sure
21 of that on a regular basis, I want to just mention
22 a couple of things to follow up on the medical
23 issues. I believe that in a regular,
24 professional, medical doctor's office, HIPPA and
25 ERISA, HIPPA being the privacy federal act, and

1
2 ERISA being the one that provides insurance, both
3 mandated, are both Acts that are very clearly part
4 of a regular doctor's offices, office; and in the
5 ones that have been described and clearly
6 delineated, so that this bill makes sure that what
7 we're talking about is very specific, and not as
8 grandiose as what Baltimore is considering. But
9 in those two insurance, would not be available, in
10 the offices that we are describing under the bill,
11 which is one more reason to support 371-A. The
12 second issue I wanted to mention is, in terms of
13 this reporting. My guess is that people do not
14 report because they don't know they're in a
15 illegal situation, or in a situation that is not
16 of the highest medical care. And my guess is that
17 even 311 will have to fix this, wouldn't know what
18 to do with such a call. And so I'm, want to make
19 it clear that sometimes people just don't report,
20 because they don't know that there's something
21 wrong. So I offer my wholehearted admiration and
22 support for 371-A, and look forward to making sure
23 that we do have continually good healthcare in the
24 City of New York. Thank you.

25 [pause]

1

2

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Council Member

3

Rose.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I rise to

5

speak in favor of Intro 371-A. And I know that

6

there is a lot of emotionalism regarding this

7

issue. And it has opened up a lot of old wounds

8

from Roe v. Wade. But this is not Roe v. Wade,

9

this legislation is about full disclosure,

10

consumer protection and truth in advertising. I

11

voted yes in Committee yesterday for this bill

12

because it will put an end to the deceptive

13

advertising that has misled many women and teens

14

over the years about the type of services provided

15

at certain facilities. This bill will not

16

diminish a woman's options or ability to avail

17

themselves of the services provided at a pregnancy

18

service center. Nor does it ask these centers to

19

change their service delivery model. It just

20

requires that these centers accurately state the

21

services that a woman can receive there. And so I

22

implore my colleagues to vote for Intro 371 in

23

good conscience. Thank you.

24

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very

25

much. Next we'll move on to Council Member

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you.

I rise today to speak in favor of Intro 371, where knowledge is power, providing women with as much information so that they can make informed decision is the correct thing to do. I want to thank my colleague, Jessica Lappin, for all her hard work. Speaker Quinn. And today, I invited my high school intern, Amelia Holcomb, to join us for what I expect will be passage of this very important bill, so that young women like her can get the most information in this City. Thank you.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very

much. Next we'll move on to Council Member Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you

very much. I stand today as a proud supporter of Intro 371-A, and I thank Speaker Quinn and Council Member Lappin for their leadership in this effort. Last month, I stood with most of our Republican colleagues in opposition to the smoking ban in parks, because I felt it went too far in infringing individual liberties, but today, supporting individual rights means making sure

1
2 that women are not deceived, tricked or
3 intimidated when they seek medical services and
4 related advice and counseling around a pregnancy.
5 Opponents of abortion have the right to provide
6 counseling and advice, and this bill does
7 absolutely nothing to infringe on that. But they
8 do not have the right to deceive, trick or
9 intimidate women who are seeking family planning,
10 contraception, or indeed abortion. Unfortunately,
11 there is a history of efforts to intimidate women
12 at exactly the moment when they approach Planned
13 Parenthood and other clinics, with threats and
14 attacks, and I believe unfortunately that these
15 centers are an extension of that same effort to
16 intimidate women at exactly this vulnerable
17 moment. This bill has been crafted to
18 specifically address that issue, and I'm proud to
19 be a supporter of it.

20 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very
21 much. Next we'll move on to Council Member
22 Williams.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you
24 very much. I have to say, you know, I'm going to
25 support this bill, but I am, I'm disappointed in

1
2 so much talk about abortion, pro-choice/pro-life.
3 I tried to remove that out of my decision making.
4 I believe that the first bill actually was about
5 the opinions of the centers, and less about the
6 deception that was discussed. And I wish we
7 could've had the discussion solely about deceptive
8 practice, 'cause I think that's what we all tried
9 to get at. And having discussion about pro-
10 choice/pro-life, makes it a much more emotional
11 bill than it really needs to be. And I thank the
12 Speaker for responding to some of my objections in
13 the first bill and many others, to really make it
14 narrowly focused. Because I think if you fit two
15 or more of these descriptions, then you really are
16 trying to deceive someone. And I think we should
17 try to focus on that, 'cause when we don't, people
18 get harmed, and I just want to add a personal
19 story, which I may get in trouble with, but I saw
20 a sign outside that said, "Fathers mourn lost
21 fatherhood." And I know this is a woman's issue,
22 and it needs to be, but [pause, weeping] No, no.

23 FEMALE VOICE: He's going to
24 finish.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

remember seeing the sonogram of my child.

SPEAKER QUINN: [off mic] Just take your time, Jumaane, there's no clock, don't worry about it.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'm asking and begging--I'm sorry.

SPEAKER QUINN: [off mic] I'm not going anywhere, you got all the time you need. [background noise] Why don't we pass him back.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Council Member Oddo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Yeah, that's tough to follow. I simply wanted to state that, you know, the First Amendment is a very precious right, and it is highly protected for good reasons. So much so that earlier today the United States Supreme Court ruled in favor of the Westboro Baptist Church folks. You may not recognize the name, but you know who they are. They're the bunch of sick individuals who go outside military funerals and protest and spew their anti-gay, anti-American, anti-humanity bile. Yet the Supreme Court ruled eight-to-one today to protect their First Amendment right. And I

1
2 respect the comments earlier that said that this
3 bill has been changed and is distinguished from
4 the statute that was struck down in Baltimore;
5 yet, it still regulates when and how pro-life
6 groups will address the issue of abortion and
7 contraception. The government is still telling
8 these groups they have to discuss it, and that in
9 my opinion, violates the First Amendment, and
10 that's why I'll be voting no.

11 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very
12 much. We'll next move on to Council Member
13 Koppell.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Ladies and
15 gentlemen, I hope we've completed the discussion
16 of 371, because I'm not addressing that. I will
17 vote in favor of that. But we have on the agenda
18 today the two resolutions appointment two members
19 of the Taxi and Limousine Commission. Not being a
20 member of the Rules Committee, I didn't have the
21 opportunity to attend the meeting and question
22 them. But I cannot vote to support the
23 resolutions without stating that in my vote, and I
24 think the vote of many others here, is done in
25 part, or as part of the vote, urging them to pay

1
2 attention to the access of the disabled to
3 taxicabs. After all, they're primarily
4 responsible for regulating taxicabs. And before
5 that Commission, in a very short time, will be a
6 proposal to approve one model of taxicab to be
7 used for the City of New York for the next ten
8 years. And though one of the proposals is for a
9 fully accessible cab, several others are not. And
10 at least in my vote, for these two new members of
11 the Commission, I expect them to do everything
12 possible to assure that taxicabs in New York will
13 be accessible to disabled as every bus is now
14 accessible to the disabled. It's a matter of
15 individual rights, it's something I'm particularly
16 concerned with, and have been for many years, but
17 also particularly concerned because I'm Chair of
18 the Committee on Disability Rights, of this
19 Council. We have over 34 members who have
20 sponsored legislation to require that those new
21 taxicabs be accessible to the disabled. If those
22 two members who are being confirmed by this
23 Council today are here, I hope they hear my
24 message; if they're not here, I hope they get my
25 message. I believe that they have an obligation

1

2 to do everything possible to make those new cabs
3 accessible to the disabled, and we'll work toward
4 that with you, my colleagues and the Speaker.
5 Thank you.

6

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very
7 much. Next we move on to Council Member Levin.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you
9 very much. I just, on that topic, just want to
10 follow up and state that one of the appointees
11 that we're voting on today, Frank Carone, from
12 Brooklyn, I just wanted to, I didn't get a chance,
13 'cause I'm not on the Rules Committee, to speak
14 about Frank, but I just would like to encourage my
15 colleagues to vote enthusiastically for his
16 confirmation. He's somebody that I've known for a
17 number of years, and I could say honestly that he
18 is one of the most civically engaged and decent
19 people that I know in public life. And so, I just
20 wanted to put that on the record, and encourage my
21 colleagues to vote enthusiastically in support of
22 his confirmation. Thank you very much.

23

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Seeing no
24 others, we're now going to move on to Reports of
25 Special Committees.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: None.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Reports of
Standing Committees.

CLERK: Report of, report of the
Committee on Finance, Intro 26-A, sale of tax
liens.

SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and couple
on general orders with a message of necessity.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on
Housing and Buildings, Intro 291-A, Housing
Maintenance Code.

SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
under on general orders.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on
Land Use, LU 316.

SPEAKER QUINN: Just one second,
please. [pause, background noise] Disapproved
and laid over.

CLERK: LU 317 and Reso 695 and 318
and Reso 696, sidewalk cafés.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on, on
general orders.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on
Rules, Privileges and Elections, Preconsidered M

1
2 405 and Reso 697, approving the appointment of
3 Frank V. Carone, Taxi and Limousine Commission.

4 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general
5 orders.

6 CLERK: Preconsidered M 406 and
7 Reso 698, approving the appointment of Nora
8 Constance Marino, Taxi and Limousine Commission.

9 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general
10 orders.

11 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
12 Women's Issues, Intro 371-A, pregnancy services
13 centers.

14 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
15 on general orders.

16 PRESIDENT RIVERA: General Order
17 Calendar?

18 CLERK: Resolution appointing
19 various persons Commissioner of Deeds.

20 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general
21 orders and at this point I'd like to ask for a
22 roll call on all the items that are coupled on the
23 general order calendar. Want to remind my
24 colleagues that there are resolutions to vote on
25 at the end of the meeting, that the budget

1
2 negotiating team is meeting after this Stated. We
3 are presently scheduled to meet in 250 Broadway on
4 the 16th floor, though we will see if we can stay
5 in this building. So, check with Chuck, Ramon,
6 Preston or Jeff before you leave to see whether
7 it's here or in 250, and please note the schedule
8 again on the Preliminary Budget and the Mayor's
9 Management Report. Thank you very much.

10 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very
11 much. Roll call.

12 CLERK: Arroyo. [pause] Brewer.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.

14 CLERK: Cabrera.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA:
16 Congratulations to Council Member Al Vann and
17 Intro 26-A, I vote no on 371, and aye on all
18 others.

19 CLERK: Chin.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

21 CLERK: Comrie.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Aye on all.

23 CLERK: Crowley.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Can I have
25 permission to explain my vote?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PRESIDENT RIVERA: So ordered.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Okay. On Intro 371-A, I'd like to thank the Speaker and Council Member Jessica Lappin for the amendments to this bill, which has come a long way, since it was first introduced. I believe the initial bill was far too broad and it would've impacted centers that clearly do not purport to be medical centers, such as those run by the archdiocese of New York, and Brooklyn and Queens. The bill we are voting on today is aimed only at centers which do not have a medical professional on site, but purport to offer medical services. Simply put, if you are offering people medical advice, it should come from a medical practitioner. You don't have to pro-abortion or against abortion to agree with this bill. Everyone has the right to their own beliefs, and this bill, as it stands today, further protects that right. That is why I'm voting in favor of Intro 371-A. And aye on all.

CLERK: Dickens.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS:
Congratulations to my colleague, Council Member Vann, and to Council Member Lappin, for the hard

1
2 word they each did with their staffs on these very
3 difficult bills. Aye on all.

4 CLERK: Dilan.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: I vote aye
6 on all.

7 CLERK: Dromm.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Eugene.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I want to
11 abstain on Intro 371-A and I vote aye on all the
12 rest.

13 CLERK: Fidler.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: - - Rivera,
15 with your permission, I'd like--

16 PRESIDENT RIVERA: So ordered.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: --thank
18 you, I'd like to first congratulate my fellow
19 Assistant Majority Leader Al Vann for negotiating
20 a bill which strikes such an important and
21 delicate balance between keeping people in their
22 homes and protecting their right to remain there,
23 and the rights of those of us who pay water rates
24 and water bills in this City, which are
25 exceedingly high, knowing that those who can and

1
2 should are in fact paying them. And I think it's
3 a very difficult balance to strike, and this bill
4 has done that, and I, I congratulate and thank
5 Council Member Vann for his work on that. Second,
6 and I know he's left the building, but Council
7 Member Barron and I would each like to take full
8 and complete credit for the passage of the Heat
9 Act today. [applause] Despite the fact that we
10 were not there at the beginning to sponsor it nor
11 do any of the hard work to negotiate it, we'd
12 still like to take credit. And with that, I vote
13 aye on all.

14 CLERK: Foster.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Aye on all.

16 CLERK: Garodnick.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Moment
18 to explain my vote.

19 PRESIDENT RIVERA: So ordered.

20 SPEAKER QUINN: Just let me let the
21 record reflect, I think the Assistant Majority
22 Leader may have stole the Minority Leader's joke
23 that was in leadership earlier, but we'll have to
24 have a Speaker's ruling on this latter.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Let's not

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

get into a quibbler of who's going to get credit for the joke now. [laughter]

SPEAKER QUINN: There will be an official Speaker's ruling on later on who the author of the joke is, there'll be a press conference this afternoon. Thank you, Council Member Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I wanted to just add my congratulations to Council Member Lappin, to you Speaker Quinn, to the advocates in support of the Intro 371. I am very proud to support this bill, I think that women's reproductive rights are under attack all around this country, and certainly when there are issues of possible misleading or deception, that is where perhaps they are most vulnerable. And so I think that this law is important, and I'm very pleased to be supporting a Member of this Council. I also wanted to note, Madam Speaker, that our electrical issues, which we experienced before, were the result of a small fire at a substation right on the border of Council Member Mendez' and my district, at the Con Edison power plant, and apparently nobody was

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

hurt, but I just wanted to report that to you all.
And I vote aye, thank you.

CLERK: Gennaro.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Mr.
Leader, I'd like the opportunity speak on my vote,
if I could.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: So ordered.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Yeah, I
want to thank Council Member Vann for 26-A, it's a
great work, and I thank him for that. With regard
to 371-A, I'm, I'm not a sponsor of the bill, I'm
not one of the bill's great champions, but I, you
know, did get involved with the archdiocese to
talk about some of the earlier parts of the bill
that were more problematic. I was happy to try to
play a role and we did make some good changes. I
wish to be associated with the remarks of Council
Member Crowley, in that we were able to do that.
There was a statement, there was a statement made
by the Catholic Community, you know, Relations
Council, that this bill is being designed to
prevent pro-life advocates from speaking freely,
and that it places some kind of restrictions on
the centers. If I really believed that was so, I

1
2 would not be voting for this bill, but I am going
3 to vote for the bill, 'cause I just don't think
4 those statements are completely accurate.

5 Regarding some other things that were mentioned
6 earlier, regarding the, you know, need for centers
7 to spend money on ads, it's my understanding that
8 that is absolutely not the case, and with regard
9 to putting people in jail for violating the
10 signage provisions, it is my understanding that
11 that is not the case also. And so I want to put
12 that statement on the record, I'm not a sponsor
13 for the bill, but I'm glad that we made it better.
14 I'm happy to vote for it. I do vote yes on 371-A,
15 on 26-A, which I think is really terrific, and yes
16 on everything else.

17 CLERK: Gentile.

18 SPEAKER QUINN: I'm sorry, Council
19 Member Gentile, I just wanted to say we will be
20 doing Budget Negotiating Team in the lounge here,
21 so folks should know that, don't go to 250, please
22 stay here. Sorry, Vinnie.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Okay. No,
24 on 371-A, aye on the rest.

25 CLERK: Gonzalez.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Aye on
all.

CLERK: Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Mr.
Leader, may I take leave to explain my vote?

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank
you. Several months ago, my colleague Council
Member Lappin called me out of courtesy to inform
me that she planned to introduce legislation to
regulate practices at crisis pregnancy centers. I
explained to her that after reviewing her bill, I
would oppose it, because I believe that has
drafted the bill violated the First Amendment of
our constitution. Earlier this month, the federal
court in Baltimore agreed with my assessment on a
strikingly similar ordinance passed by the
Baltimore City Council. The original draft of
today's bill was overly broad, punitive and in my
view, unconstitutional. That bill would have
forced honest organizations, including those
operated by Catholic nuns who are clearly not
engaging in deceptive practices, to post truth in
advertising information, and only apply to pro-

1
2 life organizations, not pro-choice ones. To
3 Council Member Lappin's credit, she took my
4 criticism, and that of other interested party,
5 including the Catholic Church, and modified her
6 bill significantly. Today's revised bill is
7 broader in scope, it applies to both pro-life and
8 pro-choice organizations, but is narrowly tailored
9 to specifically target crisis pregnancy centers
10 that engage in deceptive practices. Specifically,
11 this legislation targets centers that hold
12 themselves out as medical facilities when they are
13 not. I spent many hours studying the Baltimore
14 decision, Intro 371, today's revised Intro 371-A,
15 as well as constitutional precedents, and I
16 believe that the revised bill passes
17 constitutional muster because of those important
18 changes, most importantly it specifically targets
19 dishonest practices by some, but not all crisis
20 pregnancy centers. To be honest, there are too
21 many abortions in New York City, and I believe
22 that we should all do our best to lower the
23 shocking statistic that 41 percent of pregnancies
24 in this City end in abortion. I also believe that
25 those who work or volunteer at the limited number

1
2 of crisis pregnancy centers, that will be impacted
3 by today's bill, have good intentions; however,
4 even if you have the best intentions, you still
5 have to be honest, and so I vote yes on
6 Introduction 371-A.

7 FEMALE VOICE: Wow. [applause]

8 CLERK: Halloran.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: First let
10 me say with regards to the appointments, I have
11 the privilege of knowing Nora Constance Marino for
12 a very long period of time. Before she was a
13 constituent of mine, she was a friend; before she
14 was a friend, she was an employee. So, I've known
15 Nora for a very, very long time, and I am thrilled
16 to see her nomination here. I of course urge my
17 colleagues to support it. Let me be very clear,
18 Section 20818, Section 5 of the law--

19 SPEAKER QUINN: I'm sorry, Dan, I'm
20 not trying to inter--but could we just get quiet
21 again, and give the Council--Great, thank you,
22 sorry.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Thank
24 you, Madam Speaker. 20818, Section 5, "Any
25 intentional disobedience or resistance to any

1
2 provision of the order as issued pursuant to this
3 paragraph, including the using, occupying,
4 permitting of another person the use occupy the
5 premises, without permission of the Department, is
6 described in this subdivision bill, shall in
7 addition to any other punishment, be punishable by
8 a fine of not more \$1,000 or imprisonment not to
9 exceed six months." So to my colleagues who don't
10 know how to read, that's the answer to the
11 question as to whether or not this has a criminal
12 penalty in the statute. Please turn to Section 5
13 of 818, Section 20 of the bill. Let me leave you
14 with the words of Ronald Reagan, "Let us be sure
15 that those who come after us will save us in our
16 time that we did everything we could to be done to
17 keep ourselves free, that we kept the faith, and
18 that we maintained freedom." We're not doing that
19 here today. [applause]

20 CLERK: Council Member, you have to
21 vote.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Aye on
23 all except for Intro 371-A.

24 CLERK: Ignizio.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes, thank

1
2 you, if I can just briefly explain, clearly I'm
3 voting no on 371-A and yes on all others. But I
4 am a perpetual optimist, and I am one who really
5 believes in good people in this body and good
6 people in this City, who really want to do right
7 as they see it by the City as a whole. And I see
8 today's bill as, as a good thing, I can find a ray
9 of hope in today's bill, as well. Because the
10 issue of abortion in the City has come to the
11 fore, and this body as dignified as it is, seeing
12 the statistics, seeing the numbers, and there is
13 both a liberal, a conservative, an independent
14 reasons why people believe it's so high. But if
15 people truly meant it, people in the back of this
16 room who are fighting for this bill not to pass,
17 the people of Planned Parenthood and NARAL who are
18 fighting for it to pass, if they really took a
19 step back, I genuinely believe in their heart they
20 would say, where we all agree is the overall
21 number in this City is too high. And there's
22 reasons for it. What are those reasons? Is it
23 poverty? Is it teenage pregnancy? Is it people
24 who are just really get into it and find
25 themselves in a bad place? And isn't it our

1
2 responsibility to peel back the onion a couple
3 more than saying, "I'm pro-choice, I'm pro-life,"
4 and that's it, and go off to your individual
5 corners. No, it's the responsibility of this body
6 to say "Why am I pro-choice? Why am I pro-life?"
7 Well, that's okay, you can tell me that. But
8 there's a lot of young women in this City that are
9 pregnant, and continue to be pregnant. And I just
10 believe that it is incumbent upon all of us to
11 find out why, how, what we can do to help, and how
12 we can all work together. The most pro-choice
13 person in this body and the most pro-life person
14 in this body, and to stand together and say, "We
15 need to lower abortions in the City, and in this
16 country, throughout." We can surely all agree on
17 that. And that's really where the challenge is.
18 Voting on this bill is easy for some and more
19 difficult for others, but overall you're going to
20 stand up and you're going to say yes or no. The
21 hard part is to peel back that onion and say why?
22 What is the issue? What is the reason?

23 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Council Member?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: And how do
25 we try to help these women in this City really

1
2 find effective reasoning of their own and to
3 actually help them if they really have issues by
4 lowering the amount of abortions in this country
5 and City. Thank you very much.

6 CLERK: James.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Thank you.

8 The purpose of 371 is to mitigate the effect of
9 deceptive advertising and not express disagreement
10 with a particular viewpoint. Recently, as most of
11 you know, I was joined with a number of women who
12 called for the advertiser of a certain billboard
13 in New York City to remove it. It was offensive
14 to African-Americans. The reality is, is that a
15 disproportionate number of African-American women
16 unfortunately have abortions. But the question is
17 why, as was previously asked. And the question is
18 why are we afraid to talk about sex to our young
19 people? Why are not dealing with the fact that a
20 disproportionate number of individuals have a lack
21 of access to healthcare? Why is it that we're not
22 speaking more about preventive causes in our
23 schools? Those are some of the issues that we
24 have to continue to address. This bill is an
25 effort to advance truth in advertising and it is

1
2 not in violation of the First Amendment, because
3 this bill is narrowly focused and narrowly
4 tailored. And in fact the Baltimore, the
5 Baltimore legislation provided us with a roadmap
6 so that we could pass constitutional muster. We
7 have a compelling interest to mitigate deceptive
8 advertising. We have an attempt, we have a
9 government interest to promote transparency, full
10 disclosure, facts and nothing but the facts. I
11 vote aye on all.

12 CLERK: Koo.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote no on
14 Intro 371-A and yes on the other ones.

15 CLERK: Recchia.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Aye on
17 all.

18 CLERK: Koppell.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Aye on
20 all.

21 CLERK: Lander.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: With thanks
23 to Council Member Vann and Council Member Lappin
24 for their leadership, with respect for my Brooklyn
25 colleagues, Council Member Greenfield and Council

1
2 Member Williams for showing some real courage
3 today, with appreciation to all my colleagues for
4 the civil tone of the debate and with a commitment
5 to Council Member Halloran that I'll work hard to
6 improve my reading skills, I proudly vote aye on
7 all. [laughter]

8 CLERK: Lappin.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Aye.

10 CLERK: Levin.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission
12 to explain my vote.

13 PRESIDENT RIVERA: So ordered.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you.
15 I'm going to vote aye on all items today. I want
16 to offer my congratulations to Council Member
17 Lappin. And I want to especially offer my
18 congratulations to Council Member Vann. I know
19 that he and his staff have worked tirelessly for a
20 very, very long time on the reform of the water
21 liens and he has really stepped up to be a great
22 leader for his community and for the City of New
23 York, so with that vote aye on all.

24 CLERK: Mark-Viverito.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: I

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

want to thank my colleague, Council Member Vann,
and again thank Council Member Lappin and our
Speaker, and with my vote I vote in defense of
women's health, dignity and justice, and I vote
aye on all.

CLERK: Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye
on all and no on 371-A.

CLERK: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye on all.

CLERK: Nelson.

COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: May I be
excused to explain my vote?

PRESIDENT RIVERA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: That's too
bad, 'cause I really don't want to. I'll vote aye
on all. [laughter] We needed a little comic
relief.

CLERK: Reyna.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I vote aye
on all.

CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

CLERK: Rose.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I vote aye on
3 all and I commend Council Member Vann for the
4 extremely hard work that he put into passing the
5 water lien bill. And, and Domenic Recchia, thank
6 you so much.

7 CLERK: Sanders.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Permission
9 to explain my vote.

10 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: I just
12 want to remind my colleagues that there are, there
13 are issues of job creation, taxes, health and
14 education that urgently need our attention, and
15 unemployment is ravaging men and women out here,
16 and we, we sure need to put a little bit of this
17 passion onto these issues. When originally
18 proposed, I had several serious reservations about
19 the bill. However, subsequent revisions to the
20 bill have alleviated many of these concerns. In
21 its current form, the bill makes clear that in
22 order to operate a pregnancy service center, must
23 have an individual who is a licensed medical
24 practitioner. To me, after all is said and done,
25 women certainly have the right to choose. We as a

1
2 society have to make sure that, that there are
3 real options for people, and that means health,
4 that means education, that means jobs, that means
5 these things that we, we can really make a
6 difference at here. I am voting aye on all today.

7 CLERK: Ulrich.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote no
9 on 371-A and aye on all others.

10 CLERK: Vacca.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye on all.

12 CLERK: Vallone.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Maybe
14 briefly explain.

15 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Excuse to
17 explain. I want to thank Jessica Lappin. She
18 reached out to me and many others many times and
19 the present incarnation of this bill is a vast
20 improvement over the original one. I still happen
21 to believe, though, that this is unnecessary and
22 unconstitutional. The Health Department and the
23 Attorney General already have the power to
24 prosecute any fraudulent or deceitful activity,
25 and in fact they have in the past. I believe this

1

2 bill targets pro-life groups and holds them to a
3 standard that no other group is held to, so I'm
4 going to vote against 371-A and aye on the rest.

5 CLERK: Van Bramer.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER:

7 Permission to briefly explain my vote. First I
8 want to--

9 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: --

11 congratulate Al Vann who spoke very movingly this
12 morning about his bill and his career in public
13 service. I think it meant a lot to me as someone
14 who's just beginning. I also want to say thank
15 you to Jessica Lappin who is a courageous leader
16 and I think I can safely say, because Julissa
17 Ferreras is somewhere on a plane for the Dominican
18 Republic, that she is my favorite Council Member.
19 Thank you.

20 CLERK: Vann.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: I'd like to
22 thank all my Council Member for your many
23 expressions. I vote aye on all.

24 CLERK: Weprin.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: I vote aye

1
2 on all and I wish Council Member Lappin well with
3 the rest of her planned parenthood. [laughter]

4 CLERK: Williams.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be
6 excused to explain my vote?

7 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Last time
9 I tried on 371-A, didn't work out so well, so I'm
10 not going to say too much, except I do think I
11 want to follow Council Member and James in saying
12 that we should focus on why these rates are so
13 high, and I hope we can spend some of these, this
14 energy into getting those rates a little lower. I
15 want to congratulate Frank Carone for being
16 appointed, and for de Blasio and Dilan for 26-A
17 and Vann for 291-A. I vote aye on all.

18 CLERK: Wills.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: May I have
20 30 seconds?

21 PRESIDENT RIVERA: yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I want to
23 congratulate Council Member Vann and staff and
24 thank you to this body for handling this debate in
25 a way that no matter which side you are on, it's

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

kept public confidence in this governing assembly.

To Jumaane, what we discussed earlier has been proven this afternoon, and I vote aye on all.

[laughs]

CLERK: Oddo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: May I be temporarily excused to explain to Council Member Nelson that I'm the funny one in this body?

[laughter]

PRESIDENT RIVERA: So ordered.

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: I vote no on Intro 371-A and yes on all others.

CLERK: Rivera.

PRESIDENT RIVERA: I vote aye on all.

CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

SPEAKER QUINN: Just before I vote aye on all, I want to extend my regrets, if you will, to Council Member Gennaro, who was clearly-- Is Jim still here?--he was clearly robbed at the Academy Awards.

MALE VOICE: Yes, indeed.

SPEAKER QUINN: I think it was an outrage, "Gasland" should've won best documentary,

1
2 this "Inside Job," clearly, so I just think we're
3 all standing in some level of grave disappointment
4 today. But that said, we forged ahead and I vote
5 aye on all.

6 [pauses]

7 PRESIDENT RIVERA: All items on
8 today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a
9 vote of 49 in the affirmative, with zero in the
10 negative and zero abstentions, with the exception
11 of Intro 371-A, which was adopted by a vote of 39
12 in the affirmative, nine in the negative, and one
13 abstention, and the revised land use call ups were
14 adopted by a vote of 49 in the affirmative, with
15 zero abstentions. At this point we'll move on to
16 Introduction and Reading of the Bills.

17 SPEAKER QUINN: Bills are referred
18 to Committees as indicated on the agenda.

19 PRESIDENT RIVERA: If we can get
20 silence in the back. Discussion of resolutions.
21 Seeing none, we will now move onto the--Council
22 Member Vann, apologize.

23 SPEAKER QUINN: If we could just
24 get quiet as folks, members, as folks exit, we
25 have--

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: No, no, we
3 have general discussion, I'm sorry.

4 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Okay, there's
5 resolutions.

6 SPEAKER QUINN: Three resolutions,
7 is that correct, that we're voting on today?

8 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Yes.

9 SPEAKER QUINN: Does anyone want to
10 comment on the resolutions? Hearing none, let's
11 move forward to the vote on the resolutions.

12 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Okay. We have
13 three resolutions, Resolution 666-A, Reso 670-A
14 and Reso 672-A, all in favor say aye.

15 COUNCIL: Aye.

16 PRESIDENT RIVERA: All opposed say
17 nay.

18 COUNCIL: Nay.

19 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Any abstentions?
20 The ayes have it.

21 SPEAKER QUINN: Just want to remind
22 folks if you're voting no or abstaining, just make
23 sure you see the Clerk.

24 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you. We
25 now move on to general discussion. We have

1

2 Council Member Tish James. Okay, we will move
3 forward to Council Member Vann.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Yeah, thank
5 you. I asked the my colleagues to sign on to Reso
6 69--

7

SPEAKER QUINN: Can we get a little
8 quiet, please. And add the time back on the
9 clock, please.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Yeah, I need
11 a lot, 'cause I'm going to get this in one minute.

12

SPEAKER QUINN: You're getting two.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: I asked my
14 colleagues to sign on Reso 694. Next Thursday on
15 March 10th, New York State will recognize Harriet
16 Tubman Day, an annual celebration of the life and
17 legacy of a truly remarkable American icon. It is
18 a day when we remember and reflect on the
19 courageous and persevering spirit of this
20 humanitarian and equal rights protecting woman who
21 risked her life to lead more than 700 slaves to
22 freedom. Known as the most famous conductor of
23 the anti-slavery resistance network, known as the
24 Underground Railroad, the life of Harriet Tubman
25 continues to inspire today's leaders and

1
2 generations of Americans. In fact, this past
3 February, four U.S. Senators, including New York's
4 Charles Schumer and Kristin Gillibrand, introduced
5 Senate Bill S247, to create two national historic
6 park sites in New York and Maryland, in the armor,
7 in the honor of Harriet Tubman. Maryland, you may
8 recall, was where Harriet Tubman was born a slave,
9 and where she led numerous Underground Railroad
10 voyages to free peter, to free the people. After
11 she escaped slavery and having fought in the Union
12 Army in the Civil War, and relocated to Auburn,
13 New York, to care for her elderly parents, and
14 there she founded the home for the elderly
15 African-Americans, this is where she passed. The
16 National Park Service endorsed Senate Bill S247
17 and determined through a multi-year study that
18 Auburn is a suitable location, and of course there
19 will be one in Maryland, as well. I also urge you
20 to sign onto Reso 694, and on March the 10th, come
21 to Boys and Girls High School, in between the
22 hearings for Harriet Tubman Day celebration. And
23 I thank you for this opportunity. Harriet Tubman,
24 right on.

25 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

much, next we'll move on to Council Member Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very much. I urge my colleagues to take a look at and sign onto Intro 494, which I'm introducing today, it's a real common sense approach to one of the challenges of the foreclosure crisis.

Unfortunately, that foreclosure crisis continues unabated in our City, with over 30,000 buildings with pending foreclosure actions, and unfortunately the lenders, despite the fact that they received substantial government bailouts, have offered too little to lend--to homeowners or to our community. They have failed to do modifications on the vast majority of mortgages. When they do foreclose, they often leave buildings, whether single family or multifamily, to deteriorate and cause harm to their neighbors and to entire communities. This bill would say that when a lender commences a foreclosure action, they've got to post a compliance bond. So if the City has to come in and do emergency repairs or there are fines or fees from the Department of Buildings or Department of Housing on that building, there's somebody to backstop that and

1
2 taxpayers don't get stuck with the bill. That
3 would help make New York City in addressing the
4 foreclosure crisis, and I hope you'll consider
5 signing on. Thanks very much.

6 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very
7 much, next we move on to Council Member Ignizio.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes, thank
9 you, at the risk of becoming Johnny One-Note, I
10 wanted to give the PCB update for this month. You
11 know, clearly eight weeks ago, I had launched into
12 a tirade in regards to PCBs in our schools. I at
13 that point tried to encourage the Administration
14 to get involved and to take on a whole issue with
15 regards to the schools, and there wasn't much
16 interest. This week, I found out that the Mayor
17 was interested. He, now he's interested in doing
18 a \$708 million cleanup. That's great, and I think
19 that's a wonderful step. But clearly, doing more
20 with less doesn't apply to the Administration's
21 rules. Because in the instance of doing more with
22 less, there is a scenario that has been going on
23 across this country, that companies will come in,
24 replace the old lights for free, put in the new
25 lights, for free, the City would pay, or the

1
2 municipality, we're talking about across the
3 country, would pay the standard electric rate, and
4 the savings that were garnered therein would go
5 towards paying the company back. That's doing
6 more with less. For some reason, the
7 Administration would rather spend \$708 million
8 over a ten year period. This would get done
9 faster, within two years' time, at night, on the
10 holidays, and during the vacations, not during
11 school hours as the Mayor told a colleague of mine
12 very recently. It would also be revenue, cost
13 neutral. They come in and they save the money, as
14 I said. And it would also be safer for the kids,
15 because it will be done within two to three years,
16 not ten years. Clearly, recognition of this has
17 not been citywide. I am hopeful to stand here
18 today and encourage those in the media to ask the
19 Mayor, "Why won't you avail yourself of this
20 program that municipalities around the country
21 have, that gets it done cheaper, faster and more
22 efficiently?" That's a question where I'm hopeful
23 that my colleagues, and that the media, will take
24 up and ask the Mayor himself, because quite
25 frankly I'm at a loss. I've also encouraged some

1
2 legal experts to speak to the Administration about
3 suing Monsanto, the company who made PCBs, to get
4 some money back. My understanding is that meeting
5 is going to take place in the next couple of
6 weeks, hopefully with a good outcome that the City
7 can get some money back. Thank you all very much.

8 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you. Next
9 we have Council Member Brewer.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you
11 very much. I have a couple of bills, but one that
12 I want to bring to your attention is Intro 488.
13 As you know, the New York City Board of Elections
14 testified at one of our hearings that they are
15 willing to put ballots up before we actually vote,
16 so that many of us who don't know everything
17 that's going to be on the ballot can see a sample.
18 And so that's what Intro 488 is doing. I want to
19 say that the Board of Elections does deserve
20 credit. I've been working with them and DOITT,
21 which is our technology agency, to try to figure
22 out how 6,000 election districts, which is what we
23 have in the City of New York, would include sample
24 ballots. So it's not an easy task, but one that I
25 think we're capable of. I also want to bring to

1
2 your attention, Reso 686. Obviously, New York is
3 in the forefront, but not every state is, to ban
4 large capacity ammunition magazines. I think
5 everybody, at least I know, would be interested in
6 this. It is a ban in New York, but not across the
7 country. Los Angeles and New York are both
8 introducing similar resolutions today, and I hope
9 that you'll be supportive. Obviously, you know
10 what happens if these guns go off. Thank you.

11 PRESIDENT RIVERA: Thank you very
12 much. Seeing no others, this meeting is now--now
13 adjourned. Don't forget, ladies and gentlemen,
14 that we do have budget negotiating team in the
15 back, immediately right after, so please stay put.
16 Meeting is adjourned.

17 [gavel]

18 [background noise until end]

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, JOHN DAVID TONG certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "John David Tong". The signature is written in black ink and is positioned to the right of the printed word "Signature".

Date March 21, 2011