

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE
CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

1

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND
INFRASTRUCTURE

----- X

April 24, 2023
Start: 10:14 a.m.
Recess: 2:40 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Selvena Brooks-Powers, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Joann Ariola
David M. Carr
Amanda Farias
Ari Kagan
Linda Lee
Farrah N. Louis
Mercedes Narcisse
Lincoln Restler
Carlina Rivera
Nantasha M. Williams
Julie Won
Kalman Yeger

OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS ATTENDING:

Erik D. Bottcher
Robert F. Holden
Jennifer Gutierrez

A P P E A R A N C E S

Ydanis Rodriguez, Committee of the New York City Department of Transportation

Sean Quinn, Assistant Commissioner for Street Improvement Programs at the Department of Transportation

Rick Rodriguez, Assistant Commissioner for Intergovernmental and Community Affairs at the Department of Transportation

Julia Kite-Laidlaw, Director of Safety Policy at the Department of Transportation

Kim Royster, Chief of Transportation at the New York Police Department

John Chell, Chief of Patrol at the New York Police Department

Michael Clarke, Director of Intergovernmental Affairs at the New York Police Department

Richard Davey, President of New York City Transit with Metropolitan Transportation Authority

William Schwartz, Deputy Chief, Government and Community Relations at Metropolitan Transportation Authority

Anna Pycio, Lyft and Citi Bike

Lacey Tauber, Brooklyn Borough President's Office

Eric McClure, Executive Director of Streets PAC

Mary Beth Kelly, Families for Safe Streets

Elizabeth Adams, Deputy Executive Director for Public Affairs with Transportation Alternatives

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Gabriel Russell

Gerald Ross, officer of New York Cycle Club

Raul Rivera, TLC driver advocate

Charles Guthrie

Israel Acevedo

Jackson Chabot, Director of Advocacy and
Organizing at Open Plans

Ligia Guallpa, Executive Director of Workers
Justice Project and Los Deliveristas Unidos

Lionel Morales, Communications Outreach and
Marketing Manager of the Black Car Fund

Roy Fishman, member of Transportation
Alternatives

Sarah Lind, co-Executive Director at Open Plans

William Medina, leader of Los Deliveristas
Unidos and a member of the Workers Justice
Project

Paul Schreiber

Shawn Garcia, Senior Organizer for Equity and
Partnerships at Transportation Alternatives

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 4

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: This is a microphone
3 check for the Committee on Transportation. Today's
4 date is April 24, 2023. Located in Council Chambers.
5 Recorded by Steve Sadowsky.

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning and
7 welcome to the New York City hybrid hearing on the
8 Committee on Transportation.

9 At this time, please silent all
10 electronic devices.

11 Chair, we are ready to begin.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [GAVEL] Good
13 morning and thank you for joining today's hearing of
14 the Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure.
15 Today's hearing is about bicycles, micro-mobility,
16 and street enforcement. In addition, we will be
17 hearing a number of pieces of legislation. Intro.
18 289, Intro. 417, Proposed Intro. 501-A, Intro. 712,
19 Intro. 816, Intro. 853, Intro. 926, and Intro. 927.

20 Today's hearing is part of an ongoing
21 discussion stemming back to our street safety
22 infrastructure hearing earlier this year as the
23 Committee evaluates how we make our streets safer for
24 everyone. To that end, today's hearing has two
25 primary focuses. Number one, the state of our street

2 infrastructure including infrastructure devoted to
3 cycling and micromobility, and, two, how our laws are
4 enforced by the Department of Transportation, NYPD,
5 and other to make our streets safer for all road
6 users. As always, safety is at the heart of the work
7 of this Committee. As discussed at our hearing in
8 February, we note that while we saw some improvements
9 in select Vision Zero metrics in 2022, total traffic
10 fatalities remained at their second highest since
11 Vision Zero began. More children died on our streets
12 than in any other year since Vision Zero. Further, in
13 just the first three months of 2023, 10 cyclists died
14 on our streets. For context, in 2018, just 10
15 cyclists were killed in the city over the entire
16 year. This is unacceptable. This Committee and this
17 Council are committed to addressing this crisis of
18 traffic violence on our streets. Cycling in New York
19 City has rapidly expanded since 1980 when the City
20 first began collecting cycling ridership data. This
21 increase has coincided with major investments into
22 the City's cycling infrastructure. As of 2021, 1,456
23 miles of bike lanes have been built, including 590
24 miles of protected lanes. It is no coincidence that
25 between 2008 and 2019 the number of daily cyclists in

2 the city increased by 116 percent. Today, about
3 880,000 New Yorkers regularly ride a bike at least
4 several times each month. Bike-sharing has also
5 contributed to this uptick in cycling. In 2013, Citi
6 Bike was introduced in New York. In the last decade,
7 Citi Bike usage has grown dramatically from about
8 92,000 annual members in Fiscal Year 2014 to about
9 230,000 annual members in Fiscal 2022. The ability to
10 make short affordable trips allow those who do not
11 own a bike to use them to get to where they need to
12 go. However, Citi Bike infrastructure has not been
13 equitably distributed. Its services have been
14 concentrated only in certain parts of the city, and
15 its benefits are felt only in certain communities. We
16 should continue to explore how we expand bike-sharing
17 to all including by revisiting dockless bike-sharing,
18 which was briefly piloted by the Department of
19 Transportation. Although this popular pilot ended
20 amid the pandemic, we hope to work with DOT to
21 determine whether creative initiatives like this,
22 those that spread cycling opportunities throughout
23 the city can be revived.

24 Today, we will hear bills that center
25 equity in our efforts to improve our bike

2 infrastructure, including legislation to require
3 mapping across all five boroughs of current bicycle
4 infrastructure conditions and to explore whether and
5 where charging stations for e-bikes can be built for
6 exclusive use by food delivery workers.

7 In addition to bicycles and cycling, we
8 will talk today about micromobility options such as
9 e-bikes, e-scooters, and mopeds. In April 2020, New
10 York State legalized certain e-bikes and e-scooters
11 and created three classes of e-bikes based on how
12 they operate, fully electric or pedal-assisted, and
13 how fast they travel. The DMV created specific
14 regulations about where e-bikes and scooters can
15 operate, how fast they can go, and if a helmet is
16 required among other things, and in July 2020, the
17 City enacted Local Law 72 and 73 amending the
18 Administrative Code to remove barriers to the use of
19 certain e-bikes and e-scooters in the city that were
20 legal under State law. This has dramatically shifted
21 the way people use these devices to navigate our
22 streets. It is important we strike a balance as we
23 regulate these devices, permitting constructive use,
24 including for commercial purposes like delivery, but
25 also guaranteeing safety. They should not be a danger

2 to the user as lithium-ion batteries have across the
3 city nor be hazardous to pedestrians, vehicles, and
4 others. As part of Local Law 74, DOT was required to
5 create a pilot program for shared electric scooters
6 in the city, effectively combining the idea of a
7 bike-share program with e-scooters. In October 2020,
8 DOT selected three companies to operate the pilot,
9 Lime, Bird, and Veo, and DOT launched about 3,000 e-
10 scooters in the East Bronx in August 2021. In June
11 2022, DOT doubled the fleet of e-scooters to 6,000
12 and expanded service into several other neighborhoods
13 nearby. DOT found that e-scooters were heavily
14 utilized during the pilot with an average of 2,800
15 trips per day and more than 86,000 riders accounting
16 for over 1 million trips in the 12-month period. DOT
17 also concluded the pilot had a robust safety record
18 with no reported fatalities and just a few minor
19 injuries. Since then, in November 2022, DOT released
20 an RFP to expand micromobility and possibly make the
21 pilot permanent. Just like the dockless e-bikes,
22 expanding shared e-scooters provides an opportunity
23 for equitable growth of mobility options in New York,
24 and we look forward to working with DOT on this
25 expansion.

2 Safely expanding these options also
3 requires effective enforcement of the rules of our
4 roads. Although DOT maintains and enhances the
5 transportation infrastructure in the city, the NYPD
6 has the task of traffic enforcement and is
7 responsible for performing a wide variety of public
8 safety and traffic management functions. Under the
9 NYPD's Transportation Bureau, the NYPD oversees
10 pedestrian, cyclists, and motorists' safety on the
11 city's highways and local streets and manages traffic
12 control. There are several units under this Bureau
13 including the Traffic Management Center, Traffic
14 Operations District, Traffic Enforcement District,
15 and Highway District, all of which have distinct jobs
16 and roles.

17 Today, I want to talk about whether the
18 NYPD is effectively protecting road users including
19 cyclists and micromobility users. How are the laws
20 that protect all users of the roads being enforced
21 and regulated? Are police helping to keep bike and
22 bus lanes clear or are they blocking lanes
23 themselves? Is NYPD helping us to achieve Vision Zero
24 objectives? We also note an apparent decline in
25 Vision Zero enforcement by the NYPD in recent years.

2 Vision Zero summonses declined by 23 percent in
3 Fiscal Year 2020 and by 57 percent in Fiscal Year
4 '21. This decline took place as the incidents of
5 traffic violence increased. The question of how we
6 enforce the rules of the road and who should enforce
7 them is an important component of today's discussion.

8 Today, we will hear a bill sponsored by
9 Council Member Restler, Intro. 501, which would allow
10 New Yorkers to report when bike and bus lanes are
11 obstructed. I want to express my sincere gratitude to
12 Council Member Restler for working with me to address
13 some of the global concerns that I share with other
14 stakeholders about this legislation. Though I still
15 harbor serious concerns about a bill that would
16 deputize civilians to adopt responsibilities of law
17 enforcement, which in some cases could result in
18 conflict in public spaces between New Yorkers. I
19 think back to 10-year-old Justin Wallace in my
20 District who was struck down by a bullet because of
21 two adults having a dispute over a parking space. I
22 think about the Fare Evasion Officer shot just last
23 week. Enforcement can be dangerous. With that in
24 mind, I recognize we all have the same common goal,
25 safer streets for all, and I remain committed to

2 working collaboratively to address the actual issue
3 at hand. I look forward to a productive discussion
4 today exploring various forms of enforcement
5 including how automated camera enforcement could be
6 expanded on our streets to address these sorts of
7 violations.

8 As I come to a close, I want to emphasize
9 the importance of the Council's oversight authority
10 on these issues and our capacity to pass laws that
11 improve both our infrastructure and enforcement
12 regimes. I look forward to the conversation on
13 today's slate of bills including the following:

14 Intro. 289, sponsored by Council Member
15 Rivera, which would require DOT to develop a map of
16 current bicycle infrastructure conditions.

17 Intro. 417, sponsored by Council Member
18 Restler, which would consolidate the Community Board
19 and Council Member notice requirement for bike lanes
20 with the requirement for major transportation
21 projects.

22 Proposed Intro. 501-A, also sponsored by
23 Council Member Restler, which would create a new
24 violation and civil penalty for hazarded obstruction
25 by a vehicle of a bicycle lane and bus lane which bus

2 lane restrictions are in effect, sidewalk, crosswalk,
3 or fire hydrant when such vehicle is located within a
4 radial distance of 2,640 feet of a school building,
5 entrance, or exit.

6 Intro. 712, sponsored by Council Member
7 Bottcher, which would require DOT to report on
8 evasion of red light cameras or school speed cameras
9 by motor vehicles with unreadable license plates.

10 Intro. 816, sponsored by Council Member
11 Restler as well, which would suspend Alternate Side
12 Parking regulations on Tisha B'Av.

13 Intro. 853, sponsored by Council Member
14 Ariola, which would require the Department of
15 Transportation to install intermediate reference
16 location signs commonly known as mile-markers at
17 1/10th of a mile intervals along designated stretches
18 of Cross Bay Boulevard, Beach Channel Drive, Rockaway
19 Point Boulevard, and Rockaway Beach Boulevard.

20 Intro. 926, sponsored by Council Member
21 Farias, which would require DOT to conduct and submit
22 to the Mayor and the Speaker of the Council and post
23 on its website an annual study on cycling activity in
24 the city for the previous year.

2 Intro. 927, sponsored by Council Member
3 Gutierrez, which would establish a task force to
4 determine whether and where charging stations for
5 bicycles with electric assist can be built for
6 exclusive use by food delivery workers.

7 We will now hear from several of the
8 sponsors regarding their bills beginning with Council
9 Member Rivera on Intro. 289, and I believe Council
10 Member Rivera is online. She is still on maternity
11 leave, and we are so excited to hear from her.

12 Council Member.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Hi. Good morning.
14 Thank you so much, Madam Chair. So good to see you.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: We miss you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: And thank you for
17 the opportunity to speak on this bill remotely,
18 Intro. 289. For New Yorkers who rely on the City's
19 network of bike lanes to get where they need to go,
20 the lack of real-time information on bike lane
21 conditions can be dangerous and often prohibitive to
22 those who may want to start biking. My bill, Intro.
23 289, would create a citywide bicycle infrastructure
24 map hosted by the Department of Transportation to
25 provide cyclists with live updates regarding current

2 conditions including traffic congestion or
3 obstructions caused by construction, inclement
4 weather, and other hazards for example. We all know
5 that building out green infrastructure requires
6 community engagement and can take weeks or even
7 months to fully realize and, with an over-congested
8 grid, private cars, those for hire, big box trucks,
9 fueling our service sector and growing e-commerce
10 demands we must create a safer, accessible New York
11 for cyclists and for all New Yorkers. We don't have a
12 moment to lose. As was mentioned by the Chair, 11
13 cyclists killed on New York City streets just this
14 year and, according to the Daily News, bicycle use
15 hit record levels of cycling here in 2022, reporting
16 an average of more than 24,000 riders crossing East
17 River bridges each weekday in 2022. Along with Chair
18 Brooks-Powers and my Colleagues on the Committee on
19 Transportation and Infrastructure, I look forward to
20 working closely with the Administration on their
21 feedback on Intro. 289 so that together we can
22 deliver New Yorkers real-time access to safe biking
23 infrastructure that leaves no neighborhood behind.
24 Thank you very much.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. We
3 will next hear from Council Member Restler on Intro.
4 417, Proposed Intro. 501-A, and Intro. 816. Busy day,
5 Council Member.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you so
7 much, Chair Brooks-Power. It is a busy day. It's a
8 great day for this Committee to be hearing so many
9 wonderful bills. Congratulations to my Colleagues and
10 thank you to you for your leadership in giving these
11 bills an opportunity to be heard.

12 There are nearly 1,500 miles of bike
13 lanes in New York City, but just a third of them are
14 actually protected, just a third of them are actually
15 safe. Every single day, cars are illegally parked in
16 bike lanes, entering in and out of bike lanes,
17 impeding the safety of cyclists, impeding the safety
18 of pedestrians. We must do better. A recent study
19 that I found fascinating by a technology company
20 found that they estimate there are 6.8 million bike
21 lane violations per year in New York City but only
22 74,000 citations. 1 percent of the time is a citation
23 issued. What does that mean? If you're getting away
24 with doing something illegal 99 percent of the time,
25 you're going to keep doing it and doing it and doing

2 it again and making our communities unsafe. We must
3 do better. I ride my bike every single day. The most
4 dangerous parts of the day are swerving out of bike
5 lanes because cars are parked illegally. People are
6 dying in our streets. Traffic violence is real. The
7 Commissioner knows all too well that we have serious
8 challenges, serious safety challenges in our
9 community every single day that largely are due to
10 the lack of enforcement to keep our communities safe
11 so we need to get more protected bike lanes built.
12 That's what 417 will do. It will speed up the
13 bureaucratic timelines. DOT only has six or seven
14 months of the year when the weather works to build
15 new bike lanes. We need to expedite the amount of
16 bike lanes that are constructed in New York City if
17 we're going to hit the goals of the Master Streets
18 Plan and get 250 miles of bike lane built by 2026,
19 which I know Commissioner Rodriguez is eager to do.
20 We need to pass Intro. 417 to speed up bike lane
21 construction.

22 But that's not enough. We need to empower
23 citizens to start holding illegal drivers
24 accountable. The NYPD has failed to do its job. It is
25 time that we empower everyday New Yorkers to hold

2 people accountable who are making it dangerous for
3 the parent with a stroller, dangerous for the person
4 in a wheelchair, dangerous for the cyclist on the
5 street, and ensure real accountability. Our
6 legislation does just that with Intro. 501. This will
7 save lives.

8 Lastly, I'd just like to note Tisha B'Av
9 is one of the most holy days in the Jewish community,
10 and it commemorates the destruction of the Temple in
11 Jerusalem thousands of years ago. It is a day when
12 people in my community and Chair Brooks-Powers'
13 communities and many communities across the City
14 people are praying from early in the morning until
15 late at night. They should not be burdened with
16 Alternate Side Parking on such a holy day, and I hope
17 that we modify our regulations to accommodate this
18 day of such import to our community.

19 Thank you very much and hope we can get
20 each of these bills and appreciate PD and DOT for
21 joining us.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. We
23 will next hear from Council Member Bottcher on Intro.
24 712.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Good morning. It
3 took us many years to get the number of red light
4 cameras and speed cameras that we have and getting
5 24/7 cameras was a really big win, but we know that
6 many drivers are evading these cameras by illegally
7 defacing or obscuring their license plates. New
8 Yorkers see it. I see it when I walk around. We see
9 the license plate covers that prevent the cameras
10 from seeing it from a tall angle. We pieces of paper
11 and, quite frankly, some of them are city vehicles,
12 some of them are NYPD-owned vehicles. What we don't
13 know is the exact extent of this problem. We sort of
14 know because through FOIA requests we've learned that
15 between 2020 and 2022 drivers evaded red light and
16 speed cameras 1.5 million times, but that information
17 is not freely available on an ongoing basis so the
18 legislation that I've introduced, Intro. 712, will
19 require the Department of Transportation to regularly
20 report, publicly report the number of times that
21 these cameras have been evaded by defaced or obscured
22 license plates. This will give us the ability to
23 fully understand the extent of this problem, to track
24 our progress on this problem because no one should be
25 able to freely evade these cameras, and I know that

2 the Department of Transportation cares a lot about
3 this, and I look forward to working with you on this
4 and with my Colleagues. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you so
6 much. Next, we will hear from Council Member Farias.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Thank you, Chair.

8 With the expansion of e-scooter programs in the Bronx
9 and biking in New York City at all-time high, it is
10 essential that we keep our riders and cyclists safe
11 as they commute throughout our neighborhoods. That's
12 why I'm proud to have introduced Intro. 926, which
13 will require the Department of Transportation to
14 conduct an annual study on bicycle activity. This
15 legislation would allow our City to have data that
16 would help adapt to the real needs of our cyclists
17 and our infrastructure, something we currently lack.
18 We as a City need to know the most frequented biked
19 streets, bridges, and what the best recommendations
20 are for improving bike safety in those areas.

21 Communities around the city are in high need of more
22 protected bike lanes, more bikeable streets,
23 greenways, and more that allows commuters and
24 families to travel at their own pace and lessen our
25 collective reliance on cars. In Council District 18,

2 we will soon be getting three protected bike lanes,
3 something my community and I have been in
4 anticipation of. While this is a huge win for our
5 District, it is not useful for us to just lay down
6 infrastructure and not monitor its effectiveness.
7 That's why we need an annual study on bicycle
8 activity mandated now, for the safety and well-being
9 of our current and future bikers. I look forward to
10 working with the New York City Department of
11 Transportation and my Colleagues to continue to
12 ensure our transit system and infrastructure are
13 serving our city. Thank you to the current sponsors
14 of the bill, Council Members Brooks-Powers, Restler,
15 Caban, and Hudson, and thank you, Chair, for the
16 allotted time and DOT for being with us here today.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you so
18 much. Finally, Council Member Gutierrez on Intro.
19 927.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIERREZ: Thank you,
21 Chair. E-bikes are an increasingly popular mode of
22 transportation for both delivery workers and everyday
23 commuters who want to reduce their carbon footprint
24 or seek alternatives as the MTA becomes more and more
25 expensive. We simply cannot ignore the popularity and

2 importance of micromobility. It is real, and e-bikes
3 are here to stay. We have all heard about the
4 devastating and often fatal e-bike related fires like
5 the one on Goodwin Place in Bushwick in my District
6 and throughout the City. We have to keep pushing the
7 City to do more and think critically about how to
8 keep New Yorkers safe. Intro. 927 requires the City
9 to create a task force to study the feasibility of
10 building charging stations for e-bikes. They will be
11 tasked with developing a comprehensive report that
12 details recommendations for legislation and policy
13 related to the construction, locations, cost and
14 operations, fees for use, and fire safety. I want to
15 recognize my Colleagues today who are hearing bills
16 related to supporting much-needed infrastructure, the
17 studies of bike activity, the importance of charging
18 stations, and, overall, how to make our city safer
19 for everyone. Thank you, Chair.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

21 Before we turn to testimony, I'd like to recognize my
22 Colleagues joined here today. We have Council Member
23 Rivera online, and we're also joined in the Chamber
24 by Council Members Louis, Farias, Narcisse, Restler,
25

2 Williams, Carr, Ariola, Cagan, Gutierrez, and
3 Bottcher.

4 We now turn to testimony. I look forward
5 to hearing from the City Administration, advocates,
6 and members of the public regarding the oversight and
7 legislation at this hearing.

8 I just want to reiterate also my request
9 going forward that we do expect to receive testimony
10 ahead of when we sit down in our sits at the dais.
11 Every agency including TLC and the MTA has been able
12 to comply with this request. We ask this of DOT and
13 the NYPD as well.

14 I want to thank my Staff and Committee
15 Staff as well for their hard work. Samuel Breidbart,
16 Counsel to the Committee, Kevin Kotowski, Senior
17 Policy Analyst, John Basile, Senior Policy Analyst,
18 Mike Sherman, Senior Finance Analyst, Jorge Munoz-
19 Reyes (phonetic), Communications, Jack Siegenthaler
20 (phonetic), my Policy and Budget Direct, and Renee
21 Taylor, my Chief-of-Staff.

22 I will now ask the Committee Counsel to
23 go over a few procedural items and swear in the
24 representatives from the Administration. Thank you.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you,
3 Chair. I'm Sam Breidbart, Counsel to the
4 Transportation and Infrastructure Committee of the
5 New York City Council.

6 As mentioned, our first witnesses will be
7 from the Department of Transportation, Commissioner
8 Ydanis Rodriguez, Assistant Commissioner for Street
9 Improvement Programs, Sean Quinn, Director of Safety
10 Policy Julia Kite-Laidlaw, Assistant Commissioner for
11 Intergovernmental and Community Affairs, Rick
12 Rodriguez, and we're joined as well from the NYPD,
13 Chief of Transportation, Chief Royster, Chief of
14 Patrol, Chief Chell, and Director of
15 Intergovernmental Affairs, Michael Clarke.

16 I will now administer the oath and would
17 ask that you please raise your right hands.

18 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
19 whole truth, and nothing but the truth before this
20 Committee and to respond honestly to Council Member
21 questions?

22 ADMINISTRATION: (INAUDIBLE)

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you.
24 You may begin when ready.

2 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, Chair.

3 It is always nice to be here, remembering those 12
4 years that I served as a Council Member and the last
5 eight as a Chairman.

6 On protocol, one thing that I can tell
7 you is that in my eight years as Chairman I never got
8 a testimony in advance from prior DOT Commissioners,
9 neither the agency gets the questions from the
10 Council, so I'm more than happy to continue speaking
11 about it on the way of procedure, (INAUDIBLE) we get
12 the questions in advance from the Council or in my
13 eight years I was never expected as a Chairman that
14 DOT Committee, the agency, would give the testimony
15 so this is part of the protocol.

16 First of all, thank you for all of you
17 who spent car-free on Saturday, Earth Day, April
18 22nd, in the street, persuading, educating our
19 communities about the importance of protecting our
20 planet and especially thanks to Shekar Krishnan who
21 also at 34th Avenue led like a big day of activities
22 also together with DOT as he has been able to be a
23 great partner, reimagining 1.3 miles of street that
24 used to be only for cars and now that's a real
25 modernization (INAUDIBLE) 34th Avenue has become a

2 place used for cyclists, pedestrians, and for a lot
3 of activities, educational and recreational.

4 Good morning, Chair Brooks-Powers and
5 Members of the Committee on Transportation and
6 Infrastructure. I am Ydanis Rodriguez, Commissioner
7 of the New York City Department of Transportation.
8 With me today are Sean Quinn, Assistant Commissioner
9 for Street Improvement Programs, Rick Rodriguez,
10 Assistant Commissioner for Intergovernmental and
11 Community Affairs, and Julia Kite-Laidlaw, Director
12 of Safety Policy. We are also joined by Chief Kim
13 Royster, Chief John Chell, and Director Michael
14 Clarke from the New York City Police Department.
15 Thank you for the opportunity to testify on bicycles,
16 micromobility, and street enforcement on behalf of
17 Mayor Eric Adams.

18 I want to start by sharing the good news.
19 Bike ridership in New York City has reached a new
20 all-time high. On a typical day, there are more than
21 550,000 cycling trips made in New York City with
22 cyclists biking more than 200 million trips annually.
23 In 2022, we saw record cycling counts over East River
24 bridges and in Midtown Manhattan. For the first time
25 ever, more than 24,000 trips were recorded over East

2 River bridges during an average in-season weekday.
3 East River bridges average 24-hour selective weekday
4 bicycle count. Biking is a healthy, fun, and
5 sustainable way to travel around the city. That's why
6 we want to be sure that the working-class community
7 also gets involved into the benefits of biking and
8 walking. The number of New Yorkers who bike to work
9 has more than doubled from 2011 to 2021.

10 Despite this, I also want to acknowledge
11 the difficult year we are having in terms of cyclist
12 fatalities. So far, 12 cyclists have lost their lives
13 this year on New York City streets. We mourn their
14 loss along with their family, friends, and neighbors.
15 One life lost is too many, and we are committed to
16 continuing our efforts to ensure all road users can
17 safely travel on New York City streets, regardless of
18 whether they are walking, biking, or driving. I want
19 to assure New Yorkers that cycling in our city is a
20 safe mode of transportation and together, in
21 partnership with the Council, we can make this
22 exciting, healthy, and essential way to travel even
23 safer.

24 DOT is taking a number of steps to
25 enhance safety for the growing number of cyclists,

2 including expanding bike infrastructure and
3 conducting education and outreach. DOT continues to
4 grow our 1,500 miles of bike lanes citywide, the
5 largest network in the nation, which includes 645
6 miles of protected lanes. As we announced this
7 morning, DOT is on track to install a record number
8 of protected bike lanes in 2023 and to harden more
9 than 10 miles of existing bike lanes. These projects
10 include corridors with high ridership, bridges, and
11 projects in Priority Investment Areas laid out in the
12 New York City Streets Plan. Some highlights include
13 3rd Avenue in Manhattan, Soundview in the Bronx,
14 Ashland Place and Navy Street in Brooklyn, Goethals
15 Road North in Staten Island, and Addabbo Bridge in
16 Queens.

17 To enhance safety on existing bike lanes,
18 we will continue the bike lane hardening program to
19 install Jersey barriers and the Better Barriers
20 program to test new materials along bike lanes in all
21 five boroughs. We will test new materials at targeted
22 locations citywide, including Second Avenue, from
23 63rd Street to the Queensborough Bridge in Manhattan
24 and at 11th Street and Jackson Avenue in Queens. The
25 agency has also created the first wider bike lanes on

2 9th Avenue in Manhattan and has plans for more this
3 year.

4 The City also continues to work to build
5 a comprehensive citywide greenway network. Last
6 month, Mayor Adams announced the City is developing
7 plans for a seven-mile greenway along the Harlem
8 River in the Bronx, creating a continuous path from
9 Van Cortlandt Park to Randall's Island Park. This is
10 how the Mayor is showing that the Bronx is as
11 important as other boroughs here in our city. The
12 greenway would reconnect the residents of Bronx to
13 their waterfront while also creating a safe
14 transportation corridor for cyclists and pedestrians.

15 This Administration is committed to
16 leveraging new technology to improve the lives of New
17 Yorkers. To ensure we are building the right projects
18 in the right places, DOT recently launched an
19 innovative pilot program to use advanced technology
20 to measure transportation uses on New York City
21 streets. DOT has placed street activity sensors at 12
22 locations around the city to collect data and
23 generate detailed reports that will allow planners to
24 better understand the uses of city streets and inform
25 future street redesigns.

2 To help us build bike lane infrastructure
3 faster, DOT strongly supports Introduction 417
4 sponsored by Council Member Lincoln Restler. This
5 bill would consolidate the Community Board and
6 Council Member notice requirement for bike lanes with
7 the requirement for major transportation projects.
8 This would create a single, uniform process for DOT
9 to provide notice about major projects.

10 Passed in 2011 in response to the
11 implementation of the Prospect Park West bike lane,
12 Ad Code 19-187 imposes notice and comment
13 requirements for Community Boards and Council Members
14 on bike lane projects and changes, followed by an
15 additional waiting period after DOT has received
16 input. Given the seasonal nature of DOT's
17 construction season, these requirements can result in
18 projects being postponed until the following year and
19 make coordination challenging.

20 Another section, Ad Code 19-101.2,
21 imposes a similar but shorter process on Major
22 Transportation Projects, projects that involve four
23 or more consecutive blocks and remove at least one
24 travel or parking lane. This bill would preserve the
25 important role of Council Member and Community Board

2 input in major DOT projects. It would streamline
3 requirements for public input on such projects and
4 remove the unnecessary waiting period after a hearing
5 takes place and DOT has received and reviewed public
6 comments. It would allow DOT to follow a single
7 timeline for notice and comments on its major
8 projects instead of two requirements with different
9 timelines and slightly different details. It would
10 also reduce the amount of administrative work for DOT
11 employees which would allow our agency to focus on
12 other important projects such as additional outreach
13 and planning.

14 Turning to education, earlier this month
15 DOT launched a public service announcement in
16 partnership with TLC to raise awareness of the deadly
17 practice of dooring, opening a car door without first
18 checking to see if a bicyclist is approaching. The
19 video set to the hit song by Chubby Checker teaches
20 New Yorkers to do *The New York Twist*, using the far
21 hand to reach for the door handle, which forces
22 passengers and drivers to look back and protects the
23 cyclists.

24 DOT also conducts outreach to cyclists in
25 their neighborhoods. In 2022, we distributed 15,500

2 helmets at 40 helmet-fitting events and 9,600 light
3 sets at 16 bike light giveaways, reaching many parts
4 of the city with on-street outreach. Thank you to the
5 Council and Council Members who also contributed on
6 this initiative. We also debuted the Bike the Block
7 program, using Open Streets as a venue for multiple-
8 block community events featuring local partners and
9 Bike New York to foster and encourage bike riding for
10 all. We hosted 10 events in four boroughs and saw
11 over 2,000 attendees. This year, we are continuing to
12 grow these programs. By Labor Day, DOT in
13 collaboration with Bike New York will have 25 helmet
14 fittings, over 10 bike light giveaways, six Learn to
15 Ride events, by the way, it was nice to be back in
16 October in Brooklyn where there were adults that
17 didn't know how to ride a bike and in three hours
18 Bike New York was able to those individuals how to
19 ride a bike, and over 10 Bike the Block events. We
20 will continue more robust bike outreach and education
21 through the fall as part of our back to school and
22 Biketober efforts, making 2023 the largest bike
23 outreach year in the history of DOT.

24 DOT will also launch a public awareness
25 campaign on the safe operation of e-bikes. A number

2 of the recent cyclist fatalities were single vehicle
3 crashes on electric bikes. The public awareness
4 campaign will focus on educating New Yorkers about
5 how to properly accelerate, brake, and operate at an
6 appropriate speed. The campaign will include both
7 public marketing and direct community outreach to
8 teach new riders what to expect when they operate an
9 electric bike. DOT will engage folks who use shared
10 electric bikes as well as those buying electric bikes
11 at the point of sale.

12 To enhance safety for micromobility
13 users, last month, Mayor Adams announced Charge Safe,
14 Ride Safe: New York City's Electric Micromobility
15 Action Plan to promote the safe charging and use of
16 emerging legal micromobility options. The plan
17 focuses on the following key areas: promoting the
18 growth of safe e-micromobility and cycling, promoting
19 and incentivizing safe battery use, increasing
20 education and outreach to electric micromobility
21 users, advocating for additional federal regulation
22 of these devices, and expanding enforcement against
23 high-risk situations.

24 Finally, we continue to call on our
25 colleagues in Albany to pass the ROADS legislative

2 package which stands for Removing Offenders and
3 Aggressive Drivers from our Streets. These bills aim
4 to increase accountability among dangerous drivers
5 and keep those with a history of dangerous driving
6 behavior off our streets, which would enhance safety
7 for road users.

8 Now, turning to the rest of the bills
9 before the Committee today. Intro. 926 sponsored by
10 Council Member Farias would require DOT to conduct an
11 annual study about cycling activity. DOT already
12 posts cycling ridership and activity data on our
13 Cycling in the City webpage, and this information is
14 also available through Open Data. Moving forward, DOT
15 will be updating the website throughout the year as
16 data becomes available, rather than annually. We
17 would be happy to discuss this data with Council
18 Member Farias, the Chair, and the whole Council. By
19 the way, Council Member Farias has been a great
20 partner as DOT working with her always identifies
21 well how we can build more bike lanes and develop
22 more infrastructure to make our streets safer for
23 pedestrians and cyclists. Thank you.

24 On Intro. 289 sponsored by Council Member
25 Rivera, which would require DOT to develop a

2 searchable map of the city's bike lanes that includes
3 current conditions. Cyclists should have safe
4 infrastructure to travel around the city. Pursuant to
5 Local Law 124 of 2019, which was also sponsored by
6 Council Member Rivera and I when I used to be a
7 Council Member, DOT now requires that all DOT
8 construction permittees maintain a temporary bike
9 lane if such construction affects a street with a
10 bicycle lane. This law was passed to ensure cyclists
11 continue to have safe lanes even when streets are
12 under construction. It was an honor for me to work
13 with Council Member Rivera as a co-prime on that
14 bill. While DOT supports the intent of this bill, we
15 have some operational concerns about developing such
16 a map that we would be happy to discuss further with
17 Council Member River and other great partners
18 promoting biking in our city.

19 Next, on Intro. 501-A sponsored by
20 Council Member Restler. This bill would create a new
21 hazardous parking violation for obstructing a bike
22 lane, bus lane, sidewalk, crosswalk, or hydrant
23 adjudicated at OATH as well as a new citizen
24 complaint system for these violations.

2 Compliance with our traffic and parking
3 rules is essential, whether by private, commercial,
4 for-hire, or government vehicles. Otherwise, our
5 streets cannot function properly for all street
6 users, and safety, mobility, and emergency response
7 can be negatively affected. This Administration is
8 open to exploring new models to enhance safety and
9 help our street designs function effectively and to
10 discussing this bill with the Council Member. The Law
11 Department also continues to review the legislation.

12 Next, Intro. 712 sponsored by Council
13 Member Bottcher which would require DOT to report on
14 evasion of red light and speed camera programs by
15 vehicles with unreadable license plates. The City is
16 already closely tracking the practice of obscuring
17 license plates to avoid paying camera violations and
18 other tolls. Rather than tying resources to monthly
19 reports that could potentially raise further
20 awareness about this practice and encourage more
21 people to do it, we believe our focus should be on
22 working with other agencies to address the problem.
23 We would be happy to have further conversations with
24 the Council about this issue and the steps this
25 Administration is taking to address it.

2 Next, on Intro. 927 sponsored by Council
3 Member Gutierrez. This bill would require the city to
4 create a task force to study electric bike charging
5 stations for delivery workers. This Administration
6 has already created an interagency Electric
7 Micromobility Task Force that released the Charge
8 Safe, Ride Safe: New York City's Electric
9 Micromobility Action Plan that I mentioned earlier.
10 DOT has several staff members on the task force and
11 has a keen interest in the issue.

12 As part of this action plan, DOT has
13 launched a pilot program in partnership with EDC and
14 the Brooklyn-based business incubator, Newlab, called
15 the 2023 DOT Studio. The one-year research and
16 development program is focused on testing different
17 technology solutions for public e-micromobility
18 charging. As part of this curriculum, we are
19 conducting extensive market research and stakeholder
20 engagement to help identify the best battery charging
21 solutions to deploy. Food delivery workers, Fire
22 Department, and other relevant stakeholders will be
23 involved in testing these battery charging solutions
24 to determine the ones that are more viable and
25 responsive to New Yorkers' needs. By the end of the

2 pilot program, DOT and its partners expect to have an
3 in-depth understanding of what is workable and
4 scalable in New York City and to use that information
5 to plan future programs. We are happy to discuss this
6 pilot and the task force further with the Council and
7 how we can work towards our shared goal of enhancing
8 safety for delivery workers.

9 In conclusion, I would like to thank the
10 Council for the opportunity to testify today. We look
11 forward to working together to create a safer city
12 for pedestrians, cyclists, micromobility users, and
13 drivers. In one minute, (speaking Spanish). We will
14 now answer any questions.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
16 We'll start with cycling in the City. Cycling in New
17 York City we know has rapidly expanded and improved
18 since 1980 when the City first began collecting
19 cycling ridership data. This growth is in part due to
20 a great investment in cycling infrastructure by the
21 City enabling bike riding to become a viable form of
22 transportation for both commuting and recreation.
23 Between 2008 and 2019, the number of daily cyclists
24 in the city increased by 116 percent. Just wanted to
25 jump to a couple of questions around biking data.

2 What is the current estimated bike ridership per day
3 and per year?

4 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: I'm going to pass
5 to our Colleague here, who will be explaining the
6 details on it.

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: Sure. Thank
8 you for the question. Current numbers show that we
9 have 550,000 daily trips on bicycle a day with over
10 200 million trips a year. We get that number from our
11 census, Journey to Work data.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
13 that. How has it changed in the past couple of years,
14 especially due to the pandemic?

15 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: We
16 definitely saw a boom in cycling during the pandemic
17 as people shifted off of the subway and off of other
18 various modes onto cycling. During the pandemic, we
19 set up some temporary bike lanes to encourage
20 cyclists, focusing our efforts around hospitals and
21 emergency workers. I think during that time people
22 were able to see the benefits of cycling, how easy it
23 was to get around time, and many kept riding after
24 that time. We've also seen an explosion of working
25 cyclists using bikes and e-bikes for cycling so those

2 numbers are also factoring into the rise of cycling
3 in New York right now.

4 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: If you don't mind,
5 add into that, those of who were at the Council at
6 the time and those who are here, the Council Members
7 who were part of the Administration, also played an
8 important role with phase 3 of Citi Bike. It was
9 during COVID that we expanded Citi Bike to Washington
10 Heights and to the Bronx as also working together
11 with Council Member Rafael Espinal and Council Member
12 Fernando Cabrera and myself, we also worked with DOT
13 at that time so that DOT was putting together the
14 pilot program for the scooters so while we are seeing
15 in 2010 there was an average of 200 individuals
16 riding bikes so now on an average day we have 550,000
17 daily so that, using bikes is not only something that
18 is part of the deliveristas that they use the bikes
19 to go to work or it's not only something of the upper
20 middle class. I feel what we have seen is that
21 (INAUDIBLE) and visitors are into the bikes and then
22 DOT is also expanding the investment, building the
23 infrastructure so that it also makes safe for those
24 New Yorkers and visitors to ride the bike in our
25 streets.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I was just
3 about to ask, since the City has opened back up, have
4 you seen any changes in the trend? Is it still
5 trending up? Has it kind of plateaued? What does it
6 look like now?

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: It
8 definitely reached a peak during the pandemic,
9 settled down a little bit the year after the pandemic
10 as people were adjusting, and now we're seeing it
11 raise again. I think people are seeing the health
12 benefits, the environmental benefits, just the
13 overall picture of what it means to cycle in the city
14 has really been coming clear in the past year.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I know you
16 mentioned just now the Bike to Work data is what you
17 pretty much use, but are there any surveys or methods
18 that DOT uses to track this data and how will DOT use
19 the traffic sensors announced last week to evaluate
20 cycling trends?

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: We use a
22 number of different methods to get the variety of
23 trends throughout the city. The census data is
24 helpful for overall sort of commuting trips in the
25 city, but we do have automated counters at several

2 locations, our East River bridges, on a couple of our
3 greenways around the city, the Pulaski Bridge, Kent
4 Avenue, 8th Avenue, and a couple of the protected
5 bike lanes in Manhattan. We're also looking to
6 install more automated counters in the outer boroughs
7 working with the Department of Parks and Recreation
8 to ensure we're getting a larger picture of the daily
9 cycling in New York, and the new sensors that we
10 announced last week are really going to help us get a
11 better picture of the makeup of cycling. A lot of our
12 data collected so far gives us a general picture, but
13 the sensors will allow us to understand how many are
14 regular bikes, how many people are using e-mobility,
15 how many people are using different types of scooters
16 as they travel around the city so opening up that
17 picture using those sensors is going to give us a
18 really good picture of the makeup of cyclists in New
19 York.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Does DOT plan
21 on expanding the number of sensors and, if so, how
22 many more?

23 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: With the
24 Safe Streets for All grant that we were just awarded
25 this year, we're looking at expanding the sensors

2 around the city. I think we're looking up to about
3 100 locations, and that will collect also pedestrian
4 data as well, and that will feed into some of the
5 micromobility toolkit that we're developing along
6 with that grant as well.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. How
8 many bike lane miles have been implemented in the
9 city as of today?

10 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: There's
11 over 1,500 bike lane miles in the...

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Wait. Can you
13 give me that number again?

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: 1,500.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: 1,500? Okay,
16 and how many of these miles are protected bike lanes?

17 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: It's over
18 600. It's around 624, and that includes on-street
19 protected bike lanes as well as bike lanes that are
20 in park paths, greenways, along the waterfront, on
21 the bridges, things like that.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: In 2022, the
23 City fell short of its mandatory minimum for
24 protected bike lanes under the Streets plan. Will it
25 make up for its shortfall?

2 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: That's a goal. We
3 need the partnership of the Council to get those
4 numbers. We want to be sure that...

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What does the
6 partnership look like?

7 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: As we go through
8 Council Districts, we need support. That's just
9 something that, you know, first of all, that we had a
10 great team of engineers, DOT did a great job, and, as
11 I said before, now that I'm leading this agency, I
12 inherit the agency with great leaders doing plans.
13 They've been doing a lot of great work. The question
14 right now is how can we expand it so yes, we are on
15 target to accomplish our goal of the numbers of bike
16 lanes that we need to do, but that's why it's so
17 important that also we work together with the
18 partnership with the Council as we go through
19 community because now, as we're expanding, it's not
20 only community that is mainly only middle class and
21 upper class because biking, as I say, I was born in
22 the Caribbean, 1965. My father had a bike. What's
23 happening is that we've been told that a car is a
24 symbol of progress and a bike is a symbol of poverty
25 in many cultures. We want to change that narrative.

2 We want to be sure that people get it that, as I was
3 riding the bike with the (INAUDIBLE) he would say if
4 you ride a bike half an hour every day, you would
5 spend an average of six years of your life, so we are
6 also getting to the educational component in our
7 communities to be sure that as we look for the
8 expansion of bike lanes, it's not only the middle
9 class and the upper class but it also goes to our
10 working-class community.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I know DOT in
12 the past has said it's been as a result of the supply
13 chain so it feels like every time we have a hearing,
14 it kind of shifts if it's the Council or if it's the
15 supply chain, but it would be good to really have a
16 better understanding of our how we can help DOT to
17 meet its goal.

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: I just
19 want to take the opportunity to underscore what would
20 be extremely useful in advancing the goals of this
21 Neighborhood Streets Plan is Intro. 417, simplifying
22 and clarifying those notice requirements would be
23 very, very helpful to put us on our path to meeting
24 those goals.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: This year, the
3 Streets Plan benchmark is 50 miles of protected bike
4 lanes. Will DOT meet that benchmark?

5 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: That's the goal.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Also, I'd like
7 to acknowledge that we've been joined by Council
8 Members Yeger and Holden.

9 Shifting a little bit for a moment to
10 Citi Bike. Are there specific areas that you believe
11 are underserved by Citi Bike that could benefit from
12 increased expansion?

13 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: Definitely yes. As I
14 said as being in your role, Chair, we were able to
15 see how DOT, the Council, and Citi Bike worked on the
16 expansion of Phase 3. That's when we were able to
17 expand Citi Bike to the South Bronx and also
18 Washington Heights and Inwood and other working-class
19 communities so we're always looking on how this great
20 partnership that we have with New York City DOT and
21 Lyft running the Citi Bike will continue looking for
22 opportunity on how we expand. One goal that we have
23 under this administration led by Mayor Eric Adams and
24 I is that we want to connect all communities through
25 micromobility and bike share and Citi Bike so that

2 mode of transportation that has proven that it's
3 important for the health of the individual is
4 efficient and it's good for our planet.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
6 that. What does the City look for in an area to begin
7 to determine where to place Citi Bike?

8 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: Right now, I think it
9 has been, first of all, we need to be sure that
10 there's a formula at work because this is not only
11 DOT, it's the private sector also who is also getting
12 (INAUDIBLE) responsibility, we invested, so we
13 believe that (INAUDIBLE) Citi Bike, the largest one
14 in the nation, when we compare to other
15 municipalities, has proven that it's working. I think
16 that we've been able to see that expansion of Citi
17 Bike that started first only in the downtown area of
18 Manhattan. I feel that what we have seen is
19 expansion, and we will always continue conversation
20 with Citi Bike to expand that service. As you know,
21 not only are we looking for the infrastructure that
22 we continue building so that it is safe for those who
23 use Citi Bike or other type of electric scooter or
24 electric bike to be safe, but also one thing that we
25 are looking is about how we continue providing some

2 subsidy for residents or NYCHA and the food stamp,
3 something that we're doing right now, because we know
4 that it is important to promote biking as so
5 important for the health but also we know that we
6 have to look for how to make it affordable and how to
7 continue making it safe for when a New Yorker rides a
8 bike in our streets.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm just not
10 clear. I just want to get a better idea of what the
11 City actually looks for to determine where to place
12 Citi Bike.

13 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: Let me pass it to
14 Sean if he can pull some detail, but, as I say, we
15 are looking at communities that were not included in
16 the beginning, that's how we've been doing it. We're
17 also looking at the financial to be sure that also
18 the resources are there from the public and private
19 together in order to cover more neighborhoods, but
20 Sean would also add other.

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: Are you
22 asking about individual stations or just expansion
23 generally?

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: The expansion
25 in general in terms of the communities.

2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: I think
3 right now one of the most important pieces is
4 continuity from neighborhood to neighborhood so as it
5 expands through the different boroughs, just making
6 sure that those boroughs are connected so that you're
7 not sort of stranded in one part of the neighborhood
8 and have nowhere else to reconnect into the system so
9 I think that will be one of the big pieces, but then,
10 as the Commissioner said, there's a couple of other
11 factors that go into the decision-making.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay. Also, as
13 you're looking at expansion, does the City survey
14 potential riders in neighborhoods where Citi Bike is
15 not yet located to understand the potential demand?

16 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: I'm not
17 sure of the answer, like the specific outreach we do
18 for that expansion.

19 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: Can you elaborate the
20 question?

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I was just
22 wondering if the City surveys potential riders in
23 neighborhoods where Citi Bike is not yet located to
24 understand the potential demand, like there may be a
25 demand for it. For example, in Southeast Queens, we

2 don't have Citi Bike in my District, but are you
3 surveying communities like that to see if there's a
4 need there or an interest in them?

5 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: We also look at, and
6 I don't know if Julia would like to add something
7 about how we are also engaging with members of the
8 community from the educational perspective about the
9 importance of biking. First of all, I think that we
10 all know, as I said, the numbers are there. We're
11 reaching historical numbers of 550,000 in ridership
12 every day in our city. Mayor Adams is committed for
13 equity to be part of whatever decision or investment
14 we make, and Citi Bike is the best model that we have
15 where the public and private are working together. We
16 feel that Phase 3, we were able to make definitely
17 expand Citi Bike to areas that it was not there
18 before. We also continue to look for new locations
19 and how we can expand it.

20 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: Yes. I'll add to
21 that, like my Colleague said, what we look for is
22 continuity, but we also have data showing us that we
23 know people want to bike in all different communities
24 from all different kinds of backgrounds with all
25 different features so we know that cycling is popular

2 citywide and that also there's an element of if you
3 build it, they will come so we are very confident
4 that we know where cyclist patterns are and we do
5 look forward to future expansion in the future.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
7 that. If Citi Bike is unwilling to expand to certain
8 neighborhoods, has the City considered partnering
9 with another bikeshare company to bring them into
10 other neighborhoods?

11 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: So far we're
12 comfortable with how we're working with Citi Bike. As
13 I said before, it's a great model that we have that
14 it's the largest (INAUDIBLE) that we have in the
15 nation, this one here in New York City, so we feel
16 that how we've been working has been successful, but,
17 also, as you know, we passed a bill in the past here
18 in the Council led by Council Member Rafael Espinal
19 and Fernando Cabrera, I was also part of that group,
20 that created the scooter program in the Bronx, the
21 pilot program working with DOT, so we feel that where
22 we are right now there's no reason why we should not
23 see a continuation of the partnership between DOT and
24 Citi Bike. We're working well. We feel that there's
25 always other possibilities. In this case, we were

2 looking at the scooter micromobility as the one that
3 the study was a pilot program and we see also
4 potential to keep growing.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: In terms of
6 dockless bikeshare, what is the status of
7 implementing and expanding a larger dockless
8 bikeshare program within the city?

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: Generally,
10 after the pilot of dockless that we did several years
11 ago...

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Which I loved,
13 y'all snatched it out of Rockaway but we could talk
14 offline about that.

15 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: Yeah, it
16 was nice in the Rockaways and a couple of other
17 locations, but the dockless industry itself has
18 changed since then. I don't think it's something that
19 we've ruled out, but it's something that may not be
20 viable at the scale that it once was so that's
21 something that would have to be factored in as we
22 look at future expansion of that.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What occurred
24 in 2021 in regards to the DOT's issuance of a Request

2 for Expressions of Interest and the choosing of Beryl
3 as a new operator of a dockless program?

4 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: I don't have any
5 details. I can get back to you.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, thank
7 you. How did COVID-19 impact the implementation and
8 further expansion of the dockless bikeshare program?

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: I think
10 that was a huge factor in why that didn't end up
11 getting off the ground. I think there was a lot of
12 different usage factors going into it, unsureness of
13 the industry in general, which I was sort of saying
14 before, the dockless industry shifted quite
15 dramatically during the pandemic and that's a factor
16 in thinking about moving forward.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: (INAUDIBLE)
18 PlaNYC released last week, it mentioned expanding
19 dockless shared e-bikes. Is the City exploring a new
20 program?

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: For
22 dockless e-scooters?

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: For the
24 dockless shared e-bikes.

2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: I'm not
3 sure.

4 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: I believe we're
5 currently examining what would be possibilities for
6 shared e-scooters following, as you mentioned
7 earlier, the continued success and the excellent
8 safety record of our project in the Bronx.

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: And as
10 you may be aware, the RFP is currently out for that
11 expansion.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm sorry. Can
13 you just say that last point?

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: As you
15 may be already aware, there is an RFP that is
16 currently out for the e-scooter expansion.

17 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: This is the result of
18 the pilot program that we did. We learned a lot from
19 this pilot program. We saw that the pilot program
20 with the electric scooter was popular in the Bronx,
21 people were using it, so that's how, based on the
22 information that we learned, that we are in the
23 process right now of an RFP.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay. I'm
3 going to just jump to street enforcement. I'll come
4 back to micromobility in round two of my questions.

5 For street enforcement, the City is
6 continually working towards the goal of Vision Zero,
7 namely no traffic fatalities, but we have seen
8 extremely troubling trends in recent years with an
9 increase in the number of traffic fatalities and yet,
10 despite this increase, Vision Zero related moving
11 summonses issued by the NYPD have significantly
12 declined. In Fiscal Year 2018 and 2019, 698,709 and
13 696,012 summonses were issued by NYPD which
14 corresponds with lower levels of traffic fatalities.
15 However, in Fiscal Year 2020, Vision Zero summonses
16 dropped by approximately 23 percent to 537,742. In
17 Fiscal Year 2021, the Vision Zero related moving
18 summonses issued by NYPD declined again to 298,377, a
19 decline of approximately 57 percent. Can you define
20 what a Vision Zero related moving summons is?

21 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: Before you hear from
22 Chief Royster who will get into the details, I want
23 to say that Vision Zero is working. Vision Zero is a
24 combination of engineering, redesigning our streets,
25 enforcement with the NYPD, and education, and those

2 three elements is proving that it's working. When we
3 look at the numbers of pedestrians that unfortunately
4 have lost their lives in 2022, we have one of the
5 lowest years since 2013. Now there are new challenges
6 that we have, most related to reckless drivers. The
7 group of drivers who contribute unfortunately to
8 those crashes that take the life away of so many
9 beautiful people, they have been driving drunk,
10 speeding, without license, but I can say that we are
11 confident that with the progress that we did in 2022,
12 reducing to the lowest numbers of pedestrians losing
13 their lives in our city, we will continue working.
14 Now, you will hear from the NYPD about their part of
15 Vision Zero related to enforcement.

16 CHIEF ROYSTER: Thank you, Commissioner.

17 Good morning, Madam Chair and Members of the Council.
18 The question was can I define what a Vision Zero
19 violation is. When we look at Vision Zero, we look at
20 violations that can cause injuries or death, and that
21 would be in the category of speeding, failure to
22 yield to a pedestrian or bicyclist, improper turn,
23 using your cellphone, texting, disobeying a sign.
24 That would be the categories that we look at Vision
25 Zero. Currently, year-to-date, as we look at our

2 Vision Zero enforcement, we have increased 34 percent
3 for the same time period of 2022. We do believe that
4 traffic safety is public safety, and looking at
5 education as well as engineering and outreach are the
6 components on which we go out into the community to
7 make sure we not only do enforcement but also educate
8 the drivers that these are some of the categories
9 that they should be aware of that will actually cause
10 fatalities. As the Commissioner has mentioned, in
11 2022, we did see a decrease in overall fatalities,
12 especially in the area of pedestrians and bicyclists.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
14 Chief. Thank you for being here also.

15 Are there staff shortages in the Traffic
16 Enforcement Unit of the NYPD?

17 CHIEF ROYSTER: At the current time, the
18 Traffic Enforcement District has over 2,400
19 supervisors and traffic enforcing agents that go out
20 every single day, during inclement weather, and they
21 are the eyes and ears in keeping our communities
22 safe. Right now, we have a decrease that results in
23 291 agents.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Are there
25 resources needed do you feel?

2 CHIEF ROYSTER: When we look at resources,
3 we not only look at the agents that are out there but
4 also the vehicles that we would need to effectively
5 do enforcement. For example, under the Traffic
6 Enforcement District, we have a operational component
7 which is Towing, and so we definitely would have
8 agents that are required to tow vehicles, but we also
9 would necessarily need the tow trucks to tow those
10 vehicles also, regular tow trucks as well as heavy
11 duty tow trucks as we saw post-COVID an increase in
12 truck parking and so we were laser-focused on making
13 sure that we went to the communities that were seeing
14 this quality-of-life issue and started towing
15 vehicles that were in residential communities during
16 hours of darkness which is 9 p.m. to 5 a.m.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
18 that. In what areas of the city have the most
19 summonses been issued?

20 CHIEF ROYSTER: I don't specifically have
21 that breakout, but I will tell you that when we look
22 at our data and, if you're talking about Vision Zero
23 summonses, what we do is look at the data that tells
24 us where most of the collisions with injuries as well
25 as fatalities occur around the city, and one of the

2 areas would be the south area of Brooklyn as well as
3 the Bronx, and so when we see that there's been an
4 uptick in this data, what we do is put together our
5 High Visibility Corridors, which would address those
6 areas where we've seen an uptick in collisions or
7 fatalities. What does that mean? It actually means
8 putting together a plan. That plan requires our
9 Traffic Enforcement agents to go out into that area
10 and make sure that they issue parking violations that
11 they see in the area where we've had an increase of
12 collisions or fatalities or injuries. The other
13 component to that is outreach, and that plays a very
14 large part on our enforcement plan. Our Outreach Team
15 is partnered with the Street Team from the Department
16 of Transportation, and we actually issue outreach to
17 not only establishments or the community but also
18 drivers, and we're able to track that information,
19 and then we follow that up with enforcement.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: As we go
21 through the next few questions, would somebody be
22 able to find out the areas for us in terms of the
23 communities where they're most and least issued?

24 CHIEF ROYSTER: Are you addressing Vision
25 Zero summonses or parking summonses?

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Vision Zero.

3 CHIEF ROYSTER: Okay.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

5 More than 9 in 10 bicycling on sidewalk tickets
6 issued in 2022 were given to New Yorkers of color
7 including over 50 percent to black cyclists. What
8 kinds of guidance and training does NYPD give its
9 officers for bicycling on sidewalk enforcement?

10 CHIEF ROYSTER: I will say this.

11 Enforcement is done by the respective precincts as
12 well as the Transportation Bureau. The number one
13 thing that we talk about in the Traffic Safety Forum
14 which is done every single week with our 77 precincts
15 as well as our DOT and Vision Zero partners is to
16 talk about equitable enforcement, not just giving out
17 a summons to give out a summons, and that's also
18 coupled with outreach. Officers are trained on what
19 to look for as well as how to prepare a summons. For
20 example, one of the things that we've noticed is that
21 the biking community has expanded all over the city,
22 and we do know that people are not aware of the rules
23 and regulations of the road, especially riding on the
24 sidewalk where our older adults and our children are
25 victims, and one of the things is that they focus on

2 the fact of informing riders but also following up
3 with a summons.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: How is NYPD
5 addressing the inequity that's apparent in the
6 enforcement that's happening?

7 CHIEF ROYSTER: As I mentioned before,
8 during the Traffic Safety Forum, we want to look at
9 the types of summonses that are being issued and what
10 are they being issued for, and those summonses are
11 being issued for the most dangerous things that can
12 happen. For example, riding through a red light. That
13 not only would affect the cyclist, but it also is
14 going to affect a pedestrian that is walking across
15 the street, and so we want to make sure that the
16 summonses are written properly but not only written
17 properly but issued for a violation that's occurring
18 in the community.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
20 that. How many traffic fatalities and serious
21 injuries have occurred involving various
22 micromobility devices in 2022 and year-to-date?

23 CHIEF ROYSTER: When we mention
24 micromobility, we know that after COVID we started to
25 see an explosion of these devices in the street.

2 People use them for a mode of transportation, but
3 they're not aware of all of the traffic laws. They're
4 not aware of what's legal and what's not legal, and
5 so when we talk about the micromobility, we're
6 looking at devices that are electric scooters, we're
7 looking at e-bikes, we're also looking at non-street-
8 legal motorized scooters, so we've seized over 2,300
9 of them this year. Those that fall into the category
10 of not-street-legal, which they don't have a V-I-N
11 number and they do not have a plate number. We've
12 seized them this year based upon our point-of-sale
13 enforcement, and what that means is that we've
14 identified establishments by the help of Department
15 of Transportation to let us know establishments that
16 are selling these devices. We do an outreach
17 operation, which we go into the establishments two
18 weeks and inform the establishments that these
19 particular micromobilities are illegal and, once we
20 do that, we follow up with enforcement. What does
21 that enforcement mean? We go into the location, and
22 that's the precinct officers as well as the
23 Transportation Bureau, we go into the establishment,
24 we seize the devices that are not street-legal, and,
25 once we seize them, our legal department works with

2 us and issues a cease-and-desist letter because, as I
3 mentioned before, a lot of people that are purchasing
4 these devices are not aware that they're not street-
5 legal and they're dangerous.

6 DIRECTOR CLARKE: Council Member, we got
7 an answer about where the Vision Zero summonses are.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

9 DIRECTOR CLARKE: Brooklyn South year-to-
10 date has the most with 31,285 and then Bronx is
11 second most at 28,000. Staten Island is the least
12 amount of Vision Zero summonses.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

14 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: Chair, you asked
15 also about deaths and serious injuries year-to-date
16 with micromobility. Our serious injury data is
17 subject to a bit of a delay because of
18 classification, but, in terms of deaths, we've had
19 five year-to-date, which we categorize as "other
20 motorized." This has been a mix of standing e-
21 scooters, although none from our shared Bronx scooter
22 program, and it's also including the illegal
23 motorized devices. We've had four motorcyclist
24 deaths, and then we've had eight legal e-bike deaths.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
3 that.

4 How does NYPD enforce obstructions in
5 bike lanes and bus lanes?

6 CHIEF ROYSTER: Our enforcement is
7 twofold, and the reason why I say that is it's not
8 only just enforcement but it's education, but we also
9 work very closely with MTA. What we do is make sure
10 that we go to a location where we've seen a large
11 number of vehicles parked in bus lanes or parked at
12 bus stops, and I just want to provide you with the
13 data that we have year-to-date when we're talking
14 about vehicles parked in bus stops or bus lanes. So
15 year-to-date, we've issued 85,000 summonses for
16 vehicles parked in bus lanes or bus stops. As of
17 2022, there were 300,000 citations issued for
18 vehicles parked in bike lanes or bus stops.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: So it was
20 300,000 for the entire year of 2022...

21 CHIEF ROYSTER: Yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And then as of
23 year-to-date, it's 85,000 for this year?

24 CHIEF ROYSTER: Yes.
25

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: That's bus
3 and...

4 CHIEF ROYSTER: Bike lane and bus stop.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And bus stops.
6 What about bike lanes?

7 CHIEF ROYSTER: For bike lane enforcement,
8 for 2022 we have issued 66,000 violations for parking
9 in bike lanes, and year-to-date we've issued 21,000.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: You said
11 56,000 was 2022?

12 CHIEF ROYSTER: 66,000 for 2022.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: 66, excuse me,
14 and then year-to-date is 21,000.

15 CHIEF ROYSTER: Yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: There are
17 frequent reports of NYPD vehicles blocking either
18 bike lanes or bus lanes. I've observed it myself at
19 times, especially when I did my Transportation and
20 Infrastructure tour in Council Member Schulman's
21 District as well. Does NYPD provide guidance to
22 officers as to when such vehicles are permitted to
23 obstruct these lanes and what is it?

24 CHIEF ROYSTER: There are several measures
25 that have been taken internally about NYPD members

2 parking in bus lanes or bike lanes, and I just want
3 to say back in 2021 the Traffic Enforcement agents
4 were actually given a digital system to work with to
5 make sure that people that were parking in bike lanes
6 or bus lanes and actually whether or not there were
7 placards attached. One of the things that we do is
8 make sure that all officers are aware of the
9 prohibitions of parking in bike lanes and bus lanes,
10 and this is done digitally throughout the Department
11 so electronic message is sent to everyone. In
12 addition to that, during our Traffic Safety Forum
13 meetings, when we are meeting with the executives
14 from the borough as well as the relative executives
15 from the precinct, this is also a discussion during
16 the Traffic Safety Forum. Each precinct executive in
17 the rank of the ICO, which is the Integrity Control
18 Office, which is a lieutenant, does inspections
19 around the precinct or the facility. The Borough
20 Investigations Unit is responsible for also doing
21 inspections, and we've also made sure that there is a
22 radio dispatcher during each platoon that will do a
23 recording to instruct officers or members of the
24 Department about parking in bike lanes or bus lanes.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What do you
3 mean by digitally when you say that?

4 CHIEF ROYSTER: It's a handheld device
5 that will be able to scan a registration to determine
6 whether or not that vehicle is attached to a member
7 of the NYPD if it is not a marked patrol car.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: There are also
9 reports of NYPD vehicles parking on sidewalks. Does
10 NYPD provide guidance to officers as to when such
11 vehicles are permitted to park on sidewalks and what
12 is that?

13 CHIEF CHELL: Good morning. How are you?
14 As a three-time Commander of three precincts,
15 probably one of my biggest pet peeves around
16 precincts is parking on sidewalks. It's not right. In
17 that vein, between our Integrity Patrol Officers, our
18 Borough Inspections Teams, my Inspection Teams, we've
19 went out and did over 5,000 inspections for that
20 matter. 5,000 inspections around precincts as relates
21 to parking on sidewalks, plate covers, bent plates,
22 parking violations, and I will say that we've issued
23 Command disciplines where we take the time
24 (INAUDIBLE) for this, we've given negative what we
25 call craft which affects their yearly evaluation.

2 I've been in the seat for about four months now. It's
3 one of my priorities. How do we get the message out?
4 When I have my Borough Commander meetings, it's one
5 of my top topics. I've also got the unions involved
6 so when I explain to them what we're doing and the
7 rules of engagement, I don't want to hear any
8 negative feedback so they're on notice also. The
9 plate covers, in terms of plate covers around
10 vehicles, if we're going to enforce this citywide, we
11 have to keep our own house straight, and I'm very
12 critical and I am a little heavy-handed when it comes
13 to plate covers and violations, and it's going to
14 continue that way. I've been doing it for four
15 months, and it'll continue.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
17 that. I'm going to come back to some of these as well
18 later.

19 I'm going to just jump really quickly to
20 legislation and then hand it over to my Colleagues to
21 ask questions as well.

22 Commissioner, is the Administration
23 supportive of the bills heard today?

24 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: Which one?
25

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Is the
3 Administration supportive of all of the bills being
4 heard today, or any of them, and, if so, which?

5 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: Definitely we love
6 Lincoln Restler's bill that someone who also has been
7 a great partner when it comes to promoting everything
8 that is related to improved safety for pedestrians
9 and cyclists in his District and the City so his bill
10 would definitely shorten the period of time, it would
11 reduce 30 days without compromising the time that
12 Council Members and Community Board will have to get
13 feedback on the projects. We feel that it is
14 important to shorten the period of time for the
15 feedback because, as you said, Chair, when you look
16 at all those big projects that we have in the Street
17 Master Plan and many others that are not included,
18 like Open Restaurants is not included, Open Streets
19 is not included so after COVID the Council and the
20 Administration has identified other things that we
21 are doing that is not mentioned in the Street Master
22 Plan so because of the work that we have to do
23 basically during the spring, the fall, and the
24 summer, we think that by reducing this time the bill
25 that Council Member Lincoln Restler, his bill will

2 help definitely the Agency and the whole City to be
3 in a better place to get the numbers of bike lanes
4 that we need in our city.

5 The others you heard, there's other bills
6 that we definitely want to have more time for us to
7 get back to the Council, continue the conversation
8 with you. There's other bills like the one by Council
9 Member Rivera that we feel that is unnecessary, we
10 don't have to pass a bill because we think that the
11 bill that we pass, her bill that I also had the honor
12 to be with her, also allowed the Agency to have the
13 tools that we need.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: For Intro.
15 289, how does the City monitor and track bike lane
16 and conditions of these bike lanes including
17 obstructions?

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: Currently,
19 we have a permitting system that requires people
20 doing work in or around a bike facility to apply to
21 the City, get a special permit, and then put a
22 maintenance and protection of traffic plan in place.
23 All of those permits last year, since the bill past,
24 we've issued 337,000 permits with a bike lane
25 stipulation specifically. All of that is tracked

2 through that permitting process. We also have
3 inspectors that are going out and making sure that
4 the permits and MPTs are being adhered to, and, if
5 they aren't, they're working with the permittees to
6 fix the situation or were issuing summonses to those
7 permittees.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: But that
9 sounds like that's how DOT knows where the
10 obstruction is, but how would cyclists know?

11 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: The permit,
12 I believe on DOT's website, there's a general way
13 that you can look up permits to see if there's work
14 on a specific location. There's no live map, there's
15 no specific map to it. You would have to look up
16 permits by street.

17 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: And there are also
18 occasions where there may be emergency work done
19 which can't necessarily be foreseen ahead of time and
20 may be of varying length depending on say if a water
21 main burst.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: So it sounds
23 like it's something that we don't have right now and
24 probably could be beneficial to cyclists, like if we
25 are taking the train, we have an alert to tell us

2 that there are delays with the public transportation
3 system.

4 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: I think
5 we're happy to continue talking about this with the
6 Council Member and the Council as a whole. There's
7 technical challenges to creating such a map, and
8 keeping it live would be one of those concerns, but
9 we are not writing it off. We want to have more
10 conversations about it for sure, and we could talk
11 through the pros and cons.

12 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: That is an approach
13 that we have again, as we say we support the bill,
14 the one that Council Member Lincoln has...

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Which bill? He
16 has a couple today.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: All of them.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: He said slow
19 down.

20 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: 417 is the one that
21 we are ready as an Agency to express our full
22 support.

23 With the others, what we are saying is
24 that we are more than happy to continue conversation,
25 and that's because, as I said in the beginning, we

2 are holding this hearing in a historical moment where
3 we have seen an increase of daily ridership of
4 550,000, where we have seen 200 million trips
5 annually now of New Yorkers and visitors using bike,
6 so biking came to New York City to stay. Biking is a
7 benefit for the health, it's a benefit for its
8 efficiency, and it's good for the planet so we share
9 the spirit on most of the bills here. We just feel
10 that we just need time to continue having the
11 conversation and more than happy to continue talking
12 to you as a Chair, the Council Members who hold those
13 bills, and the Council as a Body.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. For
15 Proposed Intro. 501-A, does DOT or the NYPD have any
16 concerns about deputizing civilians to enforce the
17 law?

18 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: (INAUDIBLE) get into
19 that bill, the NYPD, they will get into that bill.

20 DIRECTOR CLARKE: I think we do have some
21 concerns. Look, we take parking enforcement very
22 seriously. Last year, we issued I believe 8.8 million
23 parking summonses. This year, year-to-date has been
24 about 2.6 million so we have agents out there every
25 day, but even our agents get assaulted. Recently, we

2 had someone point a gun at our agent, so we have our
3 agents who have the protection of an NYPD uniform and
4 a State law that makes their assault a Class D
5 violent felony getting assaulted dozens of times a
6 year so we are certainly concerned with potential for
7 violence of everyday citizens using this program. In
8 addition to that, the Law Department is currently
9 reviewing this for any legal concerns, and I think
10 there are real operational concerns on using this
11 program, both in the setup of the program but also in
12 actually collecting money at the backend that are
13 difficult and would have to be worked out.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: That part, I
15 think in the amended version does not have the bounty
16 piece to it.

17 DIRECTOR CLARKE: I get that, but I still
18 think there's an issue of docket-ability so if you
19 have a parking summons and you don't pay it, the
20 Sheriff's Department can go put a boot on your car,
21 they can seize your car for nonpayment. For this,
22 that mechanism doesn't exist so we would have to do
23 more work to make it enforceable which could be
24 significant.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Have you seen
3 this work in any other programs at all, like this
4 type of dynamic?

5 DIRECTOR CLARKE: I don't know about other
6 jurisdictions. I don't know if that exists. I haven't
7 heard of it. It's possible. Obviously, we have the
8 DEP Idling Program, but, again, that's a different
9 nature. That is only trucks and buses which are
10 commercial entities, which is easier to do some of
11 this enforcement on rather than personal vehicles.

12 CHIEF ROYSTER: Madam Chair, just to give
13 some context and some data. On the average, we have
14 about 40 agents that are physically assaulted while
15 they are giving summonses to a vehicle that's parked,
16 and it's over 100 agents that have been harassed,
17 spit at, or pushed.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
19 that.

20 For Intro. 927, has DOT faced community
21 resistance in the placement of the delivery worker
22 hubs Mayor Adams announced last year?

23 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: That
24 program is being run through the Department of
25 Preconsidered.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, so we
3 can reach out to them offline with additional
4 questions about the hubs.

5 With that, I'll pass it to my Colleagues.
6 I'll come back on round two with additional
7 questions.

8 First, we'll hear from Council Member
9 Holden.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chair.
11 Commissioner, since we passed the bill, I guess it
12 was 2020 in the Council, about legalizing e-bikes and
13 e-scooters, have you seen problems at all? Would you
14 do anything differently when you pass that bill?

15 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: What we have seen,
16 Council Member, is an increase of more New Yorkers
17 using..

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, we know more
19 people are using it, but are there any problems with
20 it?

21 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: As I explained to
22 you, what we have seen is an increase of more New
23 Yorkers using a scooter. With the program that we put
24 in place, the pilot program that we created, has been
25 very successful and has been safe, and that's why

2 right now we are in the process of moving forward a
3 potential to put out an RFP to explore the
4 possibility to expand that service, again, the
5 scooter services that it provided as part of this
6 pilot program. There is other behavior in the bill
7 that was not scooter that are not necessarily part of
8 that pilot program, but what we know is that it
9 definitely is improving the educational component is
10 important, so as New Yorkers are getting an electric
11 scooter, they should know the responsibility that it
12 comes with.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Right, but they're
14 getting on electric mopeds, scooters, you name it,
15 you've seen it, one-wheel electric which I believe
16 are illegal, and I would say on some, I mean I've
17 never seen it this bad and I'll ask the Chief this
18 question too, but we've seen so many just running red
19 lights like it didn't exist, we're seeing e-vehicles
20 of every sort, even large motorcycles now which I
21 never saw on the sidewalk, we're seeing them on the
22 sidewalks. It seems like anything goes in New York
23 City, going down one-way streets... Is my time up
24 already? That's impossible.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: It is, but you
3 can finish your question.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Are we giving two
5 minutes?

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Yes, but you
7 can come back in round two, but you can finish your
8 question.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I can't even get a
10 question out in two minutes.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Go ahead.
12 Continue.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: What we're seeing
14 is this general lawlessness on the streets, mayhem
15 actually, especially throughout the city. In
16 Manhattan, you have to have eyes in the back of your
17 head as either a pedestrian or a motorist. You see
18 it, you have to see it. Chief, I would ask you. In
19 your time in the NYPD, have you seen anything like
20 this?

21 CHIEF CHELL: No doubt about it. Illegal
22 motorcycles, ATVs, gas mopeds that aren't registered,
23 ATVs that aren't street-legal, dirt bikes that aren't
24 street-legal, in the last couple of years we've seen
25 an influx in terms of just the amount of usage and

2 crimes being committed, especially on motor scooters,
3 two people on a bike committing robberies or
4 shootings, we see it. We gave a good effort last year
5 in terms of removing these bikes from the street,
6 over 10,000. This year, we've committed many more
7 resources to this. We're already over about 3,500 of
8 these types of bikes removed from our streets. We
9 have weekends what we call "all-outs" if you will.
10 Highway, aviation, patrol services, TBTA to stop as
11 we see the groups of bikes riding around the streets
12 with no regard for the law so we're definitely paying
13 strong attention and we're definitely getting more
14 involved in this endeavor, but, yes, to answer your
15 question.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Chief, and I'll
17 you this also, Commissioner. Would you say that you'd
18 like to have these registered, these vehicles,
19 especially the mopeds that go at a good clip, that
20 you said some crimes are being, a lot of crimes are
21 being committed on these scooters because they're
22 allowed, number one, and they're not registered so
23 you can't track them, there's no insurance on them,
24 and there's no license plate on them. Would you as
25 law enforcement Chief of NYPD, wouldn't you have at

2 least some mechanism to take them off the streets
3 easier if they didn't have a license plate and they
4 should have and then certainly identifying somebody
5 in a crime?

6 CHIEF CHELL: For the gas-powered mopeds,
7 yes, we'd like them to be registered and insured for
8 a variety of reasons, find out who they are, they pay
9 their tolls, they pay their summonses, they're
10 registered, insurance, god forbid we have an
11 accessible, people have recourse vis-à-vis insurance.
12 Yes, of course, that would be highly beneficial. In
13 terms of crime, unfortunately, they don't have,
14 again, the illegal mopeds or unregistered mopeds
15 don't have license plates so when crimes are
16 committed we have to track that video and we have to
17 find distinguishing characteristics on that bike to
18 actually figure out what kind of bike it is sometimes
19 so, yes, it would be a great benefit obviously.

20 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: Just to be clear,
21 when I go out (INAUDIBLE) anything is addressing
22 this, first of all, that question, one is the law to
23 allow New Yorkers to use scooters, that's a State
24 law. What DOT did was a pilot program where we gave
25 opportunity to Veo, Lime, and Bird, three scooter

2 companies to start pilot programs in the Bronx. That
3 pilot program is safe, proving that residents of the
4 Bronx that they didn't have Citi Bike, they were
5 using it to work, they were using it in their
6 community, and because of the positive feedback that
7 we got from the pilot program, then we are in the
8 process to a potential RFP to expand it even further
9 from the Bronx. When it comes to the number of
10 individuals using scooters in the City of New York,
11 that's a State law that allowed for that to happen. I
12 feel that the reality is that as part of the 550,000
13 daily individuals who use bikes to go to work, to
14 have fun, to enjoy our city, there are places where
15 micromobility is not so important. Definitely, we had
16 to learn, continue learning every day, and one thing
17 that we do as DOT, also together with NYPD, is to go
18 out to educate those who use the scooters about their
19 responsibility as they use the scooter. We also need
20 help to continue expanding the infrastructure of more
21 protected bike lanes because, as much expansion as we
22 do on a bike lane in protecting it, there's going to
23 be more space not only for individuals who use their
24 bike but also to use the scooters in those locations.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I want the
3 question asked, have you considered having these
4 registered and have a license plate on them because
5 they go at a good clip? Let's say they're going 25
6 miles an hour. They're running red lights. What
7 should the police do? They can't chase them. The
8 police are not going to chase them, and we can't
9 identify them so if they hit us, if they hit a
10 pedestrian and they take off, what are we doing? We
11 have no identification whatsoever.

12 CHIEF ROYSTER: With regard to
13 registration of the various vehicles which happens at
14 the State level with the DMV, the DMV can only
15 register vehicles that have a vehicle identification
16 number, and these are assigned at the federal level
17 so right now there would be no powers for the City or
18 the State to be able to create that kind of vehicle
19 identification number, and that lack of a VIN is
20 actually what makes the illegal mopeds so illegal,
21 the fact that they are the type of vehicle that
22 should have a VIN but they don't. That's precisely
23 what makes them not able to operate because they
24 don't fit into the legal definition of an e-scooter,

2 and they don't have the VIN that allows them to be a
3 limited use motorcycle or a motorcycle.

4 From a safety perspective, being that's
5 what I'm tasked with, what we see makes things all
6 the more safer is having more people do something. If
7 we had more people on these legal e-bikes and on
8 these legal scooters we get a safety in numbers
9 effect, and what we don't want to do is start putting
10 in potential barriers to people taking up what is a
11 legal mode of transit because we believe that
12 actually is what makes it less safe.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you so
14 much, and, Council Member Holden, we can circle back
15 for additional questions. I just want to allow
16 Council Member Rivera to ask questions while we have
17 quorum, and we also have been joined by Council
18 Member Lee. I just ask the Members of the Committee
19 to just be mindful that we have Council Member Rivera
20 on so we need quorum for her to be able to ask
21 questions. Council Member Rivera.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you very
23 much. Thank you, Commissioner, thank you, everyone,
24 for your time today and for testifying.

2 I know you mentioned a bill that I had
3 passed that the Commissioner had proudly cosponsored
4 and led the way with me on creating alternative
5 routes when bike lanes are impacted by street work or
6 construction. Clearly, the map is different. Intro.
7 289 is different. Is it that the City doesn't have
8 sufficient resources to conduct the necessary repairs
9 and engineering solutions for our bike lane
10 infrastructure that this bill would identify? What
11 are some of the challenges? I mean this is a map to
12 route the way we would walk or the way we would
13 drive. If you could expand on that. Considering
14 equitable access to bike lanes, does the
15 Administration anticipate a real-time map that could
16 identify patterns of disparate bike lane conditions
17 across the five boroughs? That pertains to Intro.
18 289.

19 The last question I have is today I saw
20 there was an announcement that 10 miles of hardened
21 bike lanes were going to be announced that included
22 1st, 2nd, and 3rd Avenues in Manhattan, and where are
23 those improvements planned, how are they determined,
24 and is this part of a larger effort to, for example,
25 reimagine 3rd Avenue which is a very busy corridor in

2 Manhattan that does not have the same protections as
3 1st and 2nd Avenue?

4 With that, Madam Chair, those are my
5 questions. Happy to repeat for clarity and thank you
6 very much.

7 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: Mayor Adams has
8 provided DOT the resources that we need in order for
9 us to do the job so when he added almost 500 million
10 dollars in his State of the City it's because he does
11 believe we have to continue building the
12 infrastructure and having all the resources that we
13 need at DOT to do our job. With that, as I said,
14 Council Member, you are one of the great leaders here
15 also, and we had the honor to be working together. I
16 hope that everyone will continue with the same
17 passion and commitment to promote our city as
18 pedestrian and cyclist friendly as you do. This is
19 not about the lack of resources. This is about we
20 don't believe that with the previous bill that you
21 were the prime, that you gave me the opportunity for
22 me as the Chairman of this Committee to work with you
23 to pass it, we thought that that bill was enough, but
24 what I said, as you heard before is that we will be
25 happy to discuss further with you the intent. We do

2 believe in the spirit, and we are committed to
3 identify any resources that we have to put in place
4 to see the expansion of New York City as more
5 pedestrian and cyclist friendly. As you know, 550,000
6 daily trips on bike is a historic moment, and we are
7 not going backward so your leadership and commitment
8 is important, and we will continue, again, to work
9 with you around this bill.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: You mentioned
11 operational concerns, so what exactly do you mean by
12 that?

13 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: No. What I said is we
14 have the resources, Mayor Adams is providing DOT the
15 resources that we need. He increased our budget last
16 year. He added almost 400 million dollars in his
17 State of the City for DOT to have what we need to
18 continue doing our work, but I'm more than happy to
19 continue conversations with you and the Chair around
20 this bill.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Okay, if you could
22 just mention some of the announcements including 1st,
23 2nd, and 3rd Avenues in Manhattan as well as there
24 were announcements for across the boroughs, but those
25 are particular to my District so, with that, thank

2 you, Madam Chair, for the time and for my Colleagues
3 for staying to allow me to ask questions.

4 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: Our person in charge
5 of Intergovernmental, he will add, but before that,
6 yes, today, we announced that as we have conversation
7 with the advocates in the past from Bike New York to
8 TA and Families for Safe Streets, the quality of
9 improving the level (INAUDIBLE) the tools that we use
10 to harden the protected bike lane is very important,
11 it's priority for us as a City, so that's why last
12 year we accomplished 10 miles of hardening protected
13 bike lanes. In 2023, we are going to be also
14 (INAUDIBLE) and will include 3rd Avenue (INAUDIBLE)

15 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: Yeah, we're
16 very excited about this morning's announcement and
17 thank you for asking for more detail.

18 The 1st Avenue hardening location is
19 actually going to be at 1st Avenue and 125th Street
20 where we've seen some cyclist injuries and crashes
21 coming off the Willis Avenue Bridge.

22 On 2nd Avenue, we're looking at the
23 approach to the Queensborough Bridge where we don't
24 have protection right now in a very high-volume bike
25 corridor.

2 The 3rd Avenue announcement, we're
3 looking at, and to answer your question directly,
4 this is the start of the larger 3rd Avenue process so
5 this year we're focusing on the Upper East Side, but
6 we will be moving this year also to start
7 conversations below 59th Street about the corridor
8 there so we want to transform 3rd Avenue. It's one of
9 the last untouched avenues in terms of bike and
10 pedestrian infrastructure so we're excited to really
11 get that process off the ground.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
13 Next, we'll hear from Council Member Narcisse.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Good morning,
15 Commissioner, and good morning, everyone on the
16 panels.

17 First, Commissioner, I'm going to say I
18 welcome the programs that you're having around the
19 bike helmets. You're welcome in the southeast of
20 Brooklyn starting from Canarsie by NYCHA and
21 Sheepshead Bay.

22 I'm happy to have that econv. One of the
23 concerns I've been having, I heard my Colleagues
24 talking about the e-bikes. Where are they supposed to
25 be? Are they supposed to be on the bike lane, on our

2 streets, or on the bike lane because I'm confused
3 when I see them?

4 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: The electric bike,
5 the scooter?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Yeah.

7 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: They are allowed to
8 also share the use of the bike lane, and that's why,
9 as I said before, this is a partnership with the
10 Administration, with the Council working together to
11 continue expanding the numbers of bike lanes,
12 especially the protected ones because what we are
13 seeing is that, as I said, in the past when you saw
14 cycling it was more upper class, middle class
15 community. Now what we are seeing is biking has been
16 expanded, and people have been seeing the benefit of
17 biking for their health and for the environment so we
18 do believe that as we will see that number increase,
19 there will be, not only for the people using bikes
20 but also electrical scooter, we have to continue
21 expanding the miles of bike lane and protected bike
22 lane.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: I was going to
24 the scooter part, they belong the same on the bike
25 lane too?

2 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: Yes, I think a
3 good rule of thumb is that anywhere a pedal bike
4 would go, an e-bike would go as well provided it's a
5 legal e-bike...

6 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: And we're
7 talking about the big scooter that's going about 50
8 miles an hour?

9 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: If it looks like a
10 small motorcycle, it is not allowed in the bike lane
11 at all. If it's what we've been referring to as an
12 illegal motorized scooter or an illegal moped, those
13 are not allowed anywhere on the streets but
14 especially not in the bike lanes, but, if it is an e-
15 bike with pedals, it can go anywhere a standard bike
16 can.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Okay, but I
18 would say mobility is important, but our safety is
19 more important, and now the speed that their going, I
20 feel like we need to do more educational things,
21 whether we can (INAUDIBLE) in the parks, trying to
22 encourage, maybe we can visit a certificate, like
23 after you do certain hours of safety, because right
24 now the seniors are crossing, and those mobility
25 bikes, whatever, they think that they can go

2 anywhere, and that's wrong for our city so it's a
3 safety issue. As a nurse, I would say that we need to
4 look into it. The best way we can bring it all over
5 our city to encourage, if we have to do ads, whatever
6 it takes, but right now we have to do better than
7 that.

8 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: Agreed that we do
9 have to look after the most vulnerable road users who
10 are the pedestrians, and I'd like to just bring up
11 again the Charge Safe, Ride Safe plan that was
12 realized by the Mayor's Office just a few weeks. It
13 describes in more details some of DOT's...

14 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: I don't want to
15 stop you but my time is over, but I think it can be
16 cute having a lot of educational things, pamphlets,
17 printouts, but if it's not reaching to the people,
18 the core folks that we want to reach out to, then
19 it's just making a nice beautiful pamphlet for the
20 website or wherever. Anyway, I don't want my Chair to
21 get me, but think about that, and I'm willing to
22 partner and work with that because it's a concern for
23 me. Thank you.

2 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: Yes, we're doing
3 plenty of work on streets, our Bike the Block project
4 (INAUDIBLE)

5 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Another great
6 project because we're here to make New York City a
7 better city for all of us, safe, and a city where we
8 can work, play, enjoy, and that's what I'm committed
9 for. Thank you.

10 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: Council Member, as
11 you know, when we visited your District and many of
12 you, former Colleague that I was, one of the things
13 that I saw is that I'm doing the Commissioner in your
14 borough once a month, and what I'm doing right now is
15 being sure that I go back to the same borough every
16 five months so that idea, not idea, the plan we have
17 is to be sure that the conversation about biking and
18 walking and transportation, we want to do it from the
19 grassroots perspective so the conversation, as you
20 say, the educational piece is not only a flier. We
21 have a team at DOT that we go into the senior
22 centers. We go into the school. We go into the
23 interfaith community. I'm more than happy, again, to
24 go back, any particular (INAUDIBLE) that you feel
25 that we should do, more than happy to partner because

2 you're right, there is a demand of more New Yorkers
3 using electrical bike and the electrical scooter and
4 bike is all about how do we learn to share the space
5 and the protection of all New Yorkers, especially
6 pedestrians, but most importantly the most vulnerable
7 ones, the senior citizens, will always be a top
8 priority for Mayor Adams, for also DOT, and for the
9 NYPD.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: THANK YOU,
11 Commissioner. I'm looking forward to seeing you
12 again. Thanks.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you both
14 and next we'll hear from Council Member Restler.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Great. Thank you
16 so much, Chair. Thank you, Commissioner Rodriguez,
17 for your kind words. I heard you say that you love
18 Lincoln Restler and all my legislation and how
19 supportive you are so I appreciate it. Share the
20 love. Thank you very much. I think that's the first
21 Adams' administration official to convey that
22 sentiment. I hope you got that done, Alfonso
23 (phonetic), in the back. Thank you very much.

24 In all seriousness, I have a few
25 questions for the NYPD. Thank you very much, Chief

2 Chell and Chief Royster, for joining us today and for
3 your hard work. I appreciate, Chief Chell, your
4 comments that it's not right the way that we see NYPD
5 officers parking around precincts, but it's also
6 ubiquitous so the idea that you all have done 5,000
7 inspections when a recent study by a University of
8 Berkley professor found that 70 of 77 precincts had
9 illegal parking around them by NYPD officers means
10 that you all are not doing anything so I don't
11 understand what the impact of the inspections is, why
12 not makes updates to the patrol guide, why not give
13 announcements at roll call, why not actually give the
14 direction. As Chief of Patrol, these folks are
15 reporting to you and so it's your direct
16 responsibility to have them not park illegally,
17 dangerously on our streets, unless I'm missing
18 something.

19 CHIEF CHELL: I'm not aware of the study
20 you're referencing, but I would strongly disagree
21 that I'm not doing something. I'm probably doing more
22 in the four months than has been done in a long time.
23 I have multiple inspections units going out. I am
24 taking vacation days that are also financially
25 punitive. I am taking this very seriously.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I would love to
3 see data on that because I have seven precincts, the
4 84, the 88, the 90, the 94, I have PSA1, I have PSA3,
5 I have the 76, the 789 precincts. Excuse me, nine
6 precincts. I have never, ever not seen illegal
7 parking in front of a precinct. I walk by them every
8 single day. It is ubiquitous, the idea that there is
9 any enforcement or accountability around this issue
10 at all is a joke. If this is a new endeavor by the
11 NYPD..

12 CHIEF CHELL: I don't agree with that
13 assessment whatsoever. It's not a joke, and I do take
14 it seriously, and I welcome anytime you're walking
15 around one of those precincts to send me a picture
16 and I will deal with asap.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: You share your
18 phone number, and you will get texts from me every
19 single day. If you want to go for a walking tour with
20 me in the 33rd Council District...

21 CHIEF CHELL: Let me tell you, all kidding
22 aside. I welcome these blog sites. When I catch wind
23 of something, I'm on it, and I got the unions
24 involved too. I'm putting them on notice what's going
25 on here. I've been a three-time Commander. It would

2 drive me insane when I would see a car literally
3 parked on the sidewalk blocking people from walking.
4 I understand what the issue is, and I am definitely
5 dealing with it and I am not treating it like a joke...

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: How many people
7 have lost vacation days as a result of their illegal
8 parking activity?

9 CHIEF CHELL: I've given out 39 command
10 disciplines. Command disciplines can range from
11 anywhere from, depending on what type of command
12 discipline (INAUDIBLE) up to 5 days, up to 10 days.
13 When it comes to plate covers, it's an issue that
14 we've been dealing with for years. I'm a little
15 heavy-handed like I said. I'll take up to two
16 vacation days. On a monetary value, that's almost
17 1,200 dollars.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I'm not very good
19 at math, but I think there are 30-something thousand
20 NYPD officers at this, 30-something violations, so
21 one of out every 1,000 officers occasionally gets a
22 violation for a ubiquitous, ubiquitous offense. If
23 the NYPD officers themselves are not following the
24 law, and they are not, then how can we expect for
25 there to be any enforcement against the public? NYPD

2 wrote tickets in response to just 1.9 percent of the
3 more than 76,000 service requests in the 3-1-1 system
4 for illegal parking in bike lanes, 1.9 percent. That
5 is by far the lowest rate of violations being imposed
6 for any 3-1-1 complaint. One out of 50 times, NYPD is
7 issuing a violation for somebody doing something
8 illegal that puts our lives in danger. Chief, I ride
9 a bicycle every day, and it's scary to have to swerve
10 out of the bike lanes into traffic and the NYPD fails
11 to enforce, so if the NYPD isn't taking enforcement
12 seriously, and clearly the data shows over an
13 extended period of time y'all are not taking
14 enforcement seriously.

15 CHIEF CHELL: As far as Patrol Service
16 (INAUDIBLE) our enforcement is up as it relates to
17 hazardous (INAUDIBLE) summonses, 35 percent, so my
18 numbers might be different from yours, but, again, I
19 don't accept the premise that we're not taking it
20 seriously.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: When you look
22 back in Fiscal Years '18 and '19 to 698,000, 696,000
23 summonses issued by NYPD to 2021 down to half as many
24 summonses issued by NYPD in Fiscal Year '21, under
25 300,000, so a reduction of more than 50 percent. When

2 we're not enforcing against these issues, it
3 encourages illegal, dangerous behavior, and it's
4 leading to deaths. Commissioner Rodriguez is out here
5 hustling every day to try to make Vision Zero a
6 reality, but the lack of NYPD partnership and
7 accountability makes it impossible. People are dying
8 because we are failing to enforce the laws, enforcing
9 them against police officers, enforcing them against
10 public New Yorkers as a whole who are not complying
11 with the law and parking dangerously.

12 CHIEF CHELL: Right. Well, I represent
13 Patrol Service Bureau and not the whole Police
14 Department. In terms of enforcement, in terms of
15 being out there, I am personally out on those streets
16 with those cops when it comes to enforcing...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I appreciate it,
18 but 39 issues of command discipline in a department
19 with 30-something thousand officers, we're talking
20 about 1 in 1,000 officers is getting a slap on the
21 wrist when it is a ubiquitous issue where we are
22 consistently not following the law. More
23 problematically, PD is not enforcing, and perhaps
24 this is for Chief Royster, not enforcing across the
25 board, right? 76,000 violations were submitted to 3-

2 1-1. 1.9 percent, 1.9 percent of the time are we
3 actually enforcing. It's just a joke. If the NYPD is
4 not willing to take this seriously, then why not
5 empower citizens to do the work for you? I think we
6 all want to see our streets safer. Why not empower
7 citizens to do the job that NYPD has failed to do?

8 CHIEF ROYSTER: Council Member Restler, I
9 do agree with you that this is a perennial concern,
10 especially when you're talking about officers parking
11 inappropriately around precincts. Chief Chell has
12 mentioned that in the last couple of months he has
13 taken a laser focus on it. However, throughout the
14 couple of years, I would say starting with 2021, I
15 know that you had mentioned that why isn't this
16 mentioned at roll calls. It is mentioned at roll
17 calls. There are site inspections that are done.
18 There are borough inspection teams that are going
19 out, and, if I may say, there are announcements that
20 are made. We will continue to focus on this.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Chief, I live on
22 the street corner of a precinct, and I walk by it
23 every single morning on my way to my Citi Bike dock
24 to commute into work. Never in my entire life have I
25 not seen cars illegally parked on the sidewalk, and I

2 tell you I have nine precincts in my District. It is
3 ubiquitous at every single one, every single one so
4 the idea that your guys are telling the officers not
5 to do it, they are willfully consistently ignoring
6 and they're then not enforcing it against New Yorkers
7 who are doing the exact same thing that they're
8 doing, which is parking illegally and making it
9 harder for cyclists, harder for pedestrians with a
10 stroller, harder for a person in a wheelchair to get
11 by safely on our streets.

12 CHIEF ROYSTER: I understand your concern,
13 and also I take in consideration also that the
14 landscape around the precincts are congested, but it
15 does, it does not require that we don't focus on them
16 not parking on the sidewalks. Chief Chell and I have
17 spoken, overseeing Transportation Bureau as well as
18 Patrol Services Bureau, we will continue to make sure
19 that the officers in the precincts will not park on
20 the sidewalk.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: To me, if we
22 can't even enforce among our own officers, then
23 there's no way y'all are enforcing with the public at
24 large, right? If you can't get the people who are
25 responsible for implementing the law to follow the

2 law then how are we going to expect them to actually
3 enforce it citywide? I focus on this issue because
4 it's symptomatic of the broader landscape in which
5 this issue is totally ignored, and it is dangerous,
6 and I take traffic violence just as seriously as any
7 other form of violence in my community and across
8 this city, and we have to drive it down with a laser
9 focus, and the failure of the NYPD to enforce against
10 these issues over years, over many, many years makes
11 our streets unsafer, and so, again, my question is
12 why not empower citizens to do the work that NYPD has
13 refused to do?

14 CHIEF CHELL: I've only been doing this
15 four months, and I'm taking it seriously, and I look
16 forward to our exchange of communication...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: You're going to
18 regret that.

19 CHIEF CHELL: (INAUDIBLE) seriously, and I
20 welcome it. I don't shy away from this whatsoever.
21 It's very important to me.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Let's have some
23 fun.

24 CHIEF CHELL: Okay, let's have some fund,
25 and you reference 3-1-1, like illegal parking with 3-

2 1-1, we've increased our 3-1-1 response to illegal
3 parking vis-à-vis 3-1-1, we're increased our
4 enforcement 65 percent so, again, I understand your
5 frustration, but I just won't accept the premise that
6 we're not doing something about it.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Okay. Chair
8 Brooks-Powers recognized right, smartly that there
9 are many other Colleagues here. I will shut up, but
10 I'm going to come back so we'll continue the
11 conversation. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Yes, we will
13 have a part two of Council Member Restler.

14 I do want to acknowledge that I agree in
15 terms of the parking with the officers. Even in my
16 District, we have chronic parking on the sidewalks
17 where pedestrians cannot walk past. I do, however,
18 recognize that there's a parking need as well
19 because, as we are building, we're building and
20 reducing parking, forcing people to park more onto
21 the streets and limiting that access so the City
22 really has to come up with a way to address that,
23 whether it be creating a parking lot for the
24 precincts, but we understand that when we have an
25 emergency, the police have to get in the car or in

2 some type of a vehicle to get to that emergency so I
3 do want us to look at it objectively, but I will say
4 that we have that issue in my District as well, and I
5 would like that resolved but I also advocate for them
6 having the parking space from the Administration to
7 make sure that that can happen.

8 Next, we will hear from Council Member
9 Louis.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you, Chair.
11 Thank you, Commissioner and both Chiefs, for being
12 here today, and I want to echo the sentiments of the
13 Chair and Council Member Restler, and I want thank
14 you, Commissioner, because we kind of issue our own
15 violations to officers that are violating areas in
16 the 63rd Precinct so thank you for your support on
17 that.

18 I have two quick questions. I promise,
19 Chair, not to take up too much time. I'll wait for
20 the second round if I have to. My first question is
21 towards DOT, and I wanted to know how can the agency
22 utilize Intro. 417 to support Community Boards that
23 would like to support the bike lanes but are not in
24 agreement with the proposed area DOT identified for
25 bike lanes, especially in residential areas in

2 particular? That's both for myself and Council Member
3 Narcisse and Council Member Yeger who was here. All
4 of us hear those concerns in Community Board 17 and
5 18 all the time.

6 The second question is in regards to Citi
7 Bike. I heard in testimony and in conversation
8 earlier that this is supposed to be a collaborative
9 effort and somewhat of a consultation when the Citi
10 Bike proposal is given to our Districts and our
11 Community Boards. It doesn't come off that way when
12 they come to the Community Board. It comes off as a
13 definitive decision, sometimes a bit disrespectful so
14 I wanted to know if there was a way for us to work
15 with this agency maybe at a higher level to address
16 some of the Citi Bike proposed areas in our Community
17 Boards because what's happening is the proposal is
18 sent to us, the representatives come and introduce it
19 to the Community Board and it's implemented, and they
20 share with us that there are over 700 comments online
21 on proposed areas, but that conversation is never had
22 with the actual community or Community Boards so I
23 wanted to talk a little bit about that and see how we
24 can collaborate with your agency to see the proposed

2 areas for Citi Bike if it could be in non-residential
3 areas. Thank you.

4 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: I'm going to take the
5 last one first and then Sean will explain the second
6 one.

7 Mayor Adams has instructed all
8 Commissioners, including myself, to develop the best
9 relationship between our agency and Council Members
10 (INAUDIBLE) elected officials so, if there anything
11 that we have to do to improve the level of sharing
12 potential areas where we believe that it's important
13 for us to expand our Citi Bike and the bike-sharing,
14 scooter, more than happy, committed to have that
15 direct dialogue. We feel that the agency has been
16 doing outreach, but there's always space for us to
17 grow. I think that as we hear from all of you, which
18 is about are we expanding Citi Bike, are we expanding
19 scooters across the five boroughs so the answer is
20 yes, but then we have to be partners because it is to
21 be or not to be. If we are committed to also expand
22 where bike-sharing, Citi Bike, scooters, and other
23 micromobility and be part of that community that is
24 growing, we definitely need support from all the
25 stakeholders including our Colleagues at the Council.

2 I also am committed to work with you and the rest of
3 the Colleagues to improve the level of participation
4 and engagement that we should have with you as we're
5 thinking about where to expand with Citi Bike.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: We sent a lengthy
7 letter to your office with concerns but also
8 recommendations on where the Citi Bikes could
9 actually be installed, and we grabbed that
10 information from the actual Community Board and
11 residents as opposed to what was proposed to our
12 Community Board.

13 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: More than happy to
14 follow with you. Again, the level of participation
15 that the Mayor wants from Council Members as partners
16 as we move this agenda of our city to make it safer
17 for pedestrians, for cyclists is something that all
18 Commissioners are being instructed to work on so let
19 me follow with you and the rest of the Council
20 Members on anything that we can improve for that
21 level of engagement.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: In regards to
23 Intro. 417, if you all can answer that, I would
24 appreciate it.

2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: Thanks for
3 the question on that. For Intro. 417, it does not
4 take out the Community Board and elected officials
5 process, it just modifies it so that we don't have
6 these extended waiting periods that were built into
7 the bike lane projects specifically. It consolidates
8 the two actions into one, still involves the
9 community and elected officials as needed. I would
10 say we usually do go above and beyond in a lot of
11 these communities when we're proposing new bike
12 infrastructure instead of just a touchpoint with the
13 Board or a Council Member, we have our street
14 ambassadors, we have online portals, we have a lot of
15 engagement that we like to do, and I know we've been
16 talking to some of the faith communities in your
17 District and CB14 and 17 to get feedback from those
18 communities as well. We think it's really important
19 to grow the bike network in districts where we've
20 seen a high number of ridership and a high number of
21 injuries so welcome the feedback on how we can best
22 do that, especially I think CBs 14 and 17 are bike-
23 priority districts for us so having that continued
24 conversation, I believe we've had a lot of good
25 feedback from your office on where to focus our

2 efforts, and this bill will help us get there faster
3 without cutting out a lot of that process.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: If the concerns of
5 the people in Community Board 17 can be at a
6 heightened level, we'd appreciate it. They don't like
7 Citi Bike or bike lanes, just letting you know, but
8 14, they love it. Thank you.

9 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
11 flagging that because I get a lot of incoming from my
12 Community Boards as well. We're still fighting
13 through the changes DOT made on Seagirt and Far
14 Rockaway where there was extensive community
15 engagement, but DOT decided to go the direction they
16 wanted to, and there are some safety challenges with
17 the lanes that have been placed there and the parking
18 the way they designed it.

19 Next, we'll hear from Council Member
20 Farias.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Thank you. I just
22 want the record to reflect, I'm going to talk about
23 my Introduction, and you have here in your response
24 for your testimony about Open Data NYC, I just want
25 the record to reflect that Open Data NYC in my

2 experience, and I haven't looked at this specific
3 data that's available there as of yet, but it has
4 been very unreliable, and I do want to echo the
5 sentiments of Council Member Restler and the rest of
6 my Colleagues, but I do not want to belabor the point
7 on enforcement around parking.

8 I just have a couple of quick questions.
9 When looking at the data that already exists on
10 cyclist ridership and activity data, are we
11 comprehensively looking at this at a certain point or
12 quarterly or annually and taking that data and
13 looking at how we're making infrastructure decisions?

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: Sure, yes,
15 that's a good question. We have some automated
16 counters that are counting every day, daily,
17 throughout the city so we're getting a picture of
18 what's going on at those locations, primarily the
19 East River bridges, some of our greenway paths,
20 locations like that that we're getting that feedback
21 daily and then we're putting that information on the
22 website as it comes in. Previously, we had been doing
23 annual updates but, now as the data is coming in,
24 we're putting it on the website so you can see trends
25 in real-time. We use the census data and a lot of the

2 other sort of citywide data to capture trends over
3 time so it's not a granular street-by-street figure
4 or understanding of what's going on, but we can look
5 to see who's riding, why they're riding, where
6 they're riding using the combination of the
7 Department of Health and the census data to get that
8 picture. As I mentioned before, with the new Safe
9 Streets for All grant that we received, at DOT, we're
10 going to be expanding the number of sensors that we
11 have around the city, and we're going to look to
12 place those sensors on a variety of different street
13 typologies from protected lanes to neighborhood
14 networks to streets that don't have bike facilities
15 so that we can get a good picture overall of the
16 broad state of cycling in New York.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay. Can I have
18 two more small questions?

19 They're related. I just wanted to be
20 clear. Right now, this is just an administrative
21 policy, correct, that you folks have decided to do?

22 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: That's
23 correct. We have made commitments to this in our
24 various Green Wave Plan and it's agency policy, yeah.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Sure, so because
3 it's administrative, would we be opposed to this
4 being mandated annually or every 30 days or quarterly
5 because this bill is to mandate it and ensure that we
6 are doing this versus right now it's an
7 administrative policy where you could change the
8 rules as you are right now with updating it more
9 frequently?

10 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: More than happy to
11 continue the conversation with you, Council Member.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Great. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

14 Next, we'll hear from Council Member Bottcher
15 followed by Council Member Holden.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: Hi. Could you
17 give an update on how many citations have been issued
18 for defaced or obscured license plates in the last
19 few months? At the end of last year, the New York
20 Times reported that in December of last year 5,490
21 had been issued during traffic stops compared to
22 14,000 the year before, but they also reported that
23 there was an increase in the number of summonses to
24 parked vehicles, 24,273 in 2022 compared to 20,056 in
25 2021. Do you have numbers for this year-to-date?

2 CHIEF ROYSTER: Yes, I do. I'm just going
3 to say that since COVID we saw this particular issue
4 multiply tenfold in the city. We call it ghost cars.
5 We saw that people were driving with fraudulent
6 plates, people were driving with paper plates that
7 were expired. We do know that during the time of
8 COVID, the agencies that would basically handle
9 plates, renewing plates or registration, had closed,
10 and there were some people that took advantage of it.
11 Not only did they take advantage of it, but we also
12 saw that there was a correlation in these types of
13 plates on vehicles being involved in crimes, and so
14 when Chief Chell and I, working together with Patrol
15 as well as the Transportation Bureau, were laser
16 focused on getting these things off the street. Last
17 year, there were 258 summonses to vehicles with
18 covered or obstructed plates, there were 4,100
19 drivers that were arrested for operating forged or
20 altered plates, and 7,500 cars were seized for having
21 fraudulent plates. This year, 86,000 summonses were
22 given to vehicles with covered or obstructed plates,
23 1,100 drivers that were operating the vehicle with
24 forged or altered plates were arrested, and over
25 1,900 cars were seized for fraudulent plates or were

2 parked illegally while displaying a temporary paper
3 plate. As I mentioned before, we're laser focused on
4 this issue because we know that it's, one, trying to
5 avoid any type of red light summonses on an automated
6 enforcement that we have, any type of speed
7 summonses, and also tolls, and we work not just with
8 Patrol Services Bureau but also our other Vision Zero
9 partners, MTA, TBTA, the State Police, and the
10 Sheriff's Office.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Could you repeat
12 the numbers for summonses last year versus this year-
13 to-date?

14 CHIEF ROYSTER: Last year, for the
15 complete year of 2022, there were 258,000 summonses
16 to vehicles with covered plates.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: And so far this
18 year again?

19 CHIEF ROYSTER: 86,000.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: For the DOT, how
21 many vehicles have been captured by your cameras that
22 are unreadable plates so far this year?

23 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: We can get you the
24 most recent numbers offline, but we have to emphasize
25

2 that we don't have the number of vehicles, we have
3 the number of events...

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: That's what I
5 meant, yeah.

6 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: Which is the
7 number of times it's triggered. It could be one
8 vehicle that triggers it several times, but we'll
9 find as of today and we'll get back to you on that.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Do you have the
11 numbers for 2022?

12 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: Again, we can
13 provide those to you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Okay. Are those
15 numbers publicly posted anywhere? How do people find
16 those out?

17 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: We don't publicly
18 post them, no. We have them internally as part of our
19 unit that runs all of our automated enforcement
20 programs.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: So the bill that
22 I introduced that's being heard today would require
23 them to be publicly posted. What's your position on
24 that?

2 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: This is one case
3 in which we're concerned that sunlight may not be a
4 disinfectant. It might be something that perhaps
5 invites a bit of a social contagion that if we are
6 showing people look at all these people who have done
7 it, they might think they might do it too to be
8 completely honest. We know it's something that the
9 NYPD is tackling to a very admirable extent and that
10 we're going to continue to be doing, and we want to
11 focus our resources on tackling the problem, rather
12 than just publicizing the extent of it.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Have the number
14 of incidents of unreadable plates gone up or down in
15 the last few months, in the last year?

16 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: I'd say in the
17 past few months, things have been rather static, but,
18 as the Chief said, this is a problem that arose with
19 COVID.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Looking forward
21 to partnering with you and my Colleagues further on
22 this.

23 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chair.
25 Just a couple of followup questions, but while we're

2 on that subject of obscured plates, what's the fine
3 for that? Does anybody know, for obscured plates?

4 CHIEF ROYSTER: If you have a covered
5 plate, the fine would be 65 dollars.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: 60?

7 CHIEF ROYSTER: 65 dollars.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: 65 dollars. That's
9 ridiculous.

10 CHIEF ROYSTER: To your point, a person
11 having an obscured plate or obstructed plate or an
12 altered plate will take the chances of keeping that
13 plate..

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, because it
15 pays. It pays. You can get away with it obviously.
16 Even if you get caught, 65 dollars. What's the toll
17 on the Midtown Tunnel? I mean if you go through it
18 five times, four times, you're ahead of the game so
19 if you get caught once out of a hundred, and probably
20 the odds are less than that, we're in trouble here,
21 folks, because we're not enforcing, I mean that
22 should be a 500 dollar fine. If you obscure your
23 plate and you're beating all the cameras and you're
24 getting through all the tolls. Is there technology
25 that we could read those and police can identify

2 where they're going? Is there a camera that does
3 that?

4 CHIEF CHELL: I don't believe so.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: No? There's a
6 license plate reader we have, but we don't have that
7 technology?

8 CHIEF CHELL: No, we don't have something
9 like that.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So the same people
11 that are obscuring their plates are also committing
12 crimes as the Chief had said so it seems to me that
13 if we want to cut this, we want to cut the crime, we
14 want to cut people cheating, by the way I see it
15 everywhere, people obscuring their plates, they'll
16 put silver paint over one letter and that's it or it
17 looks like it's chipped or they'll bend their license
18 plate, but we have opportunities here to really crack
19 down on this, and we will probably lower the crime
20 rate if we did that.

21 Getting back to the original about
22 whether these electric vehicles could be insured and
23 have a license plate, would you be against that if we
24 could do it?

2 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: First of all, the
3 first part about the 65 dollars fine for (INAUDIBLE)
4 there's a lot of I can say low-fee that is State and
5 Council law so I think that this could be a good
6 opportunity to look at not only those 65-dollar fines
7 for those who block plates reading on the cameras, at
8 some point have to look at if it's a City, and if it
9 is the City, it's going to be the Council, or, in
10 most cases, it is the State so that's what it is.

11 When it comes to the second part of the
12 question, as you say, should people who use
13 electrical scooter, right, is that what you're
14 saying, that...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: There's different
16 electric vehicles. I mean if it's a small little
17 scooter-type, very small, I don't see putting a
18 license plate on that, but I do see something like a
19 moped where they're traveling at a good rate of speed
20 and even e-bikes, some of them, the Chief said it's a
21 problem with crime, that a lot of the crimes that
22 we're seeing are committed by people with
23 unidentified, they're on a vehicle that there's no
24 plate.

2 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: I'm happy that you're
3 defining what you're referring to as those mopeds.
4 Many times, they are even being sold in discount
5 stores in the City so this is something that the
6 Sheriff, Anthony Miranda, also working with NYPD and
7 us and the Mayor, we've been taking very seriously
8 going after those who first of all sell it. The
9 second thing is about, as you explained, is more the
10 federal and the state so I think that because it's
11 something related to legislation, now it's going to
12 be about you as a legislative body that had..

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: But the State gave
14 us permission, they gave each town in New York State
15 permission to do what we want, to legalize them or
16 not, but we can also put restrictions on certain
17 vehicles..

18 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: Not a moped, because
19 as you refer, talking about those mopeds who are big..

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, the bigger
21 ones.

22 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: So that the State
23 doesn't give..

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: We can't do it
25 because they have a VIN number.

2 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: Actually, they
3 don't, and that's the problem for most of them. A lot
4 of those moped-type vehicles are not street legal to
5 be operating in New York City in the first place, and
6 that's why NYPD has been seizing them because they
7 have no VIN. Therefore, they cannot be registered and
8 they shouldn't be sold for use.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: The CO over our
10 precinct actually went into some of these bike shops,
11 and they actually scratched off the VIN number. They
12 actually took it off, so that's what the CO did when
13 we confiscate them or we find them. Again, there's
14 this lawlessness that we're seeing that we have to
15 get control over somehow, and we need a plan and we
16 need both agencies to get together here, NYPD and
17 DOT, to figure out how do we stop the widespread
18 lawlessness, mayhem that we're seeing where vehicles
19 are passing lights like they didn't exist, and that
20 is a huge problem for everyone, pedestrians,
21 motorists, and even the riders of these vehicles. We
22 just saw an individual killed. Again, we've all seen
23 it. I just can't believe where somebody just blows a
24 light, but they're going top speed, and I just can't
25 believe that they're rolling the dice.

2 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: Definitely, this is a
3 priority for this administration. As you heard and as
4 you know, Mayor Adams has said that traffic and
5 traffic also includes some of those reckless users of
6 those big mopeds, they are part also of those who
7 contribute to crashes in the city, so Mayor Adams is
8 taking this very seriously, and the NYPD and DOT, we
9 work very close. I can definitely (INAUDIBLE)
10 continue conversation because at some level it's
11 about also legislation where you as a Body also can
12 be very helpful too.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you. Thank
14 you, Chair. (INAUDIBLE)

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: No problem.
16 Over here just breaking myself up. Council Member
17 Restler.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Great. Thank you
19 so much, Chair. Firstly, just a question for DOT. You
20 all have some quite ambitious goals around new bike
21 lane construction, I think 250 miles by 2026. Do you
22 think it's feasible to reach those goals without
23 Intro. 417? What do you think, Sean?

24 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: (INAUDIBLE) Council
25 Member, as you know, you've been there before in this

2 administration, as a Council Member, I was on that
3 (INAUDIBLE). New York City has a lot to show to other
4 municipalities on how we have built the level of
5 infrastructure. More to come, more work. This is not
6 only about that we have a big vision. This is also
7 about that other cities, when we go to any
8 conference, they're looking at New York City so when
9 we had the Citi Bike, we have the largest one. When
10 you see the (INAUDIBLE) bike lanes that we have
11 built, also other people looking at us, but more than
12 happy, again, but Sean can take you into more
13 details, but I can say that all New Yorkers should be
14 very proud that riding a bike in New York City is
15 safe. We are looking to improve the safety in our
16 city for cycling, but it is safe to ride a bike in
17 the city.

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: I think
19 this bill will help for sure. I know, as we announced
20 this morning, we are looking to do a record year of
21 protected bike lanes across the city. I think the
22 bill will also help us just build in predictability
23 to what we can get done each year. It'll help us plan
24 better. It'll help us maximize the use of the
25 implementation season. Generally, it's a little bit

2 around the edges of how this bill will help, but I
3 think overall it helps us plan better go get more in
4 the end.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Great. Thank you
6 very much. I know we were a bit behind in the last
7 PMMR report so I'm happy to hear that you have
8 heightened your goals for the current Fiscal Year.

9 Chief Chell, did you miss me?

10 CHIEF CHELL: I can't wait to get your
11 phone number. This is a start of a (INAUDIBLE)

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I can't wait to
13 get yours. This is likely the best first date I've
14 ever had.

15 No, in all seriousness, your generous
16 suggestion, and I really do appreciate it, to allow
17 me to take some photos and send them to you with the
18 issues that I'm seeing in my District, I know Chair
19 Brooks-Powers would love to do the same as would
20 probably every single one of my Colleagues because
21 it's such a widespread issue around the City of New
22 York, that's exactly why we've introduced Intro. 501.
23 That's the purpose of the bill so it shouldn't be up
24 to me or her to have your phone number to get some
25 accountability, to have find the Chief of Patrol for

2 the largest police department in the entire country
3 to get some accountability on illegal parking
4 activity. We should be empowering everyday New
5 Yorkers to do exactly that, to hold bad actors
6 accountable who are making our streets unsafe. That's
7 why we've introduced this legislation. It shouldn't
8 be about special connections. It should be about
9 making our streets safer.

10 CHIEF CHELL: I'd also suggest, I know the
11 Precincts have their Precinct Council Meetings, which
12 we send our representatives so by all means, whoever
13 represents you in the 90 and the precincts, have them
14 show up with the pictures. The Commanding Officer has
15 to stand there in front of his whole constituents and
16 say hey, when you present the problem, he has to fix
17 so a direct line to me, absolutely, but there are
18 other levels to choose...

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I have terrific
20 working relationships with many of my Commanding
21 Officers, and I have the utmost respect for them..

22 CHIEF CHELL: (INAUDIBLE) tell them what
23 you said here today.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I'll tell you
25 which ones are the best. They still have widespread

2 illegal parking around their precincts, and we have
3 widespread illegal parking around our community. If
4 you walk around downtown Brooklyn any day of the
5 week, and Chair Brooks-Powers was gracious enough to
6 do that with me as she went around the city on her
7 tour with other Council Members, we have widespread
8 placard abuse, widespread illegal parking, it is
9 dangerous on our streets. Our bike lanes that should
10 be safe places to get around are not because of these
11 widespread issues, and that's why we need Intro. 501
12 to hold bad actors accountable and actually make sure
13 that people are paying a fine when they are not
14 complying with the law. I know that you all expressed
15 some concerns around potential conflicts between New
16 Yorkers who might be taking photos of people who are
17 parked illegally, and Chief Royster mentioned the
18 hard work of Traffic Enforcement Agents, which we
19 respect, they are also uniformed, highly
20 recognizable, they are placing the tickets directly
21 onto dashboards. It's a very different type of
22 interaction than a member of the public who's taking
23 a photo from a healthy distance of illegal activity.
24 To the best of your knowledge since you've all
25 referenced the DEP Idling Program, have there been

2 issues of conflict between New Yorkers taking three
3 minutes of video, minutes of video of trucks that are
4 idling illegally? Are you aware of enforcement
5 against TLC drivers, conflicts between TLC drivers
6 and New Yorkers that have led to fights or conflicts?

7 DIRECTOR CLARKE: I believe there was an
8 article recently about the DEP program where the
9 people who use it talk about what they're doing to
10 try and prevent them from having these conflicts, the
11 tactics they use, but they did recognize that there
12 is conflict at times when this happens.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Okay, but as
14 leadership in the Police Department who I'm sure
15 would be getting these very complaints and be aware
16 of the issues if there were conflicts at any scale,
17 are you aware of conflicts at scale, is this
18 something that's been brought to either of the
19 Chiefs' attention?

20 CHIEF ROYSTER: I must say that I'm not
21 aware of it. I'm not saying that it may not happen..

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Fair.

23 CHIEF ROYSTER: But I'm not aware of it.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: But, Chief
25 Royster, you have a distinguished record of

2 leadership in the Police Department over many years,
3 I would think that you would be somebody who would be
4 aware of issues should they be widespread, should we
5 have problematic concerns. To me, if we already have
6 a DEP Idling Program where there are minutes of video
7 that is being captured of trucks, if we already have
8 a TLC Citizen Enforcement Program where we have many
9 thousands of taxis and FHV's moving around the city
10 and we haven't had those issues, why are you all so
11 convinced that citizen enforcement against illegal
12 parking would be different?

13 CHIEF ROYSTER: You know you bring up a
14 good point, and TLC is a very good Vision Zero
15 partner, and I'm going to look into if this is
16 occurring in their agency.

17 DIRECTOR CLARKE: I will say that the
18 Idling Program is a different nature. It is mostly
19 commercial trucks, employees, and a lot of the
20 commercial employees, there is a certain amount of
21 cost of doing business that they're willing to
22 tolerate some ticket-getting, right, that's part of
23 what they understand operating in New York City so I
24 do think...

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Maybe. These are
3 also folks who might feel like their jobs are on the
4 line if they're caught doing something that's illegal
5 and that they're at risk of tickets. I mean, it's an
6 assumption that you're making, and I'm happy to make
7 a bunch of assumptions too. I just think that we have
8 two programs where we have citizen enforcement that
9 have been in place in the City of New York and we
10 haven't had the kind of conflicts that you all are
11 saying are going to happen if we do this, that the
12 sky would fall if this were to be implemented, and I
13 think considering, frankly, the failure of the Police
14 Department to enforce on these issues, it's clear
15 that it's time for citizens to step up and to make
16 our streets safer. If we're going to achieve Vision
17 Zero, which Mayor Adams has said he believes in, I
18 know Commissioner Rodriguez believes deeply in, we're
19 going need to have more tools at our disposal to make
20 our streets safer.

21 DIRECTOR CLARKE: Again, I think we
22 disagree that we've not been doing enforcement. We
23 wrote 8.8 million parking summonses last year, 2.6
24 million so far this year.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Michael, PS38

3 parent, so I'm a big fan. We're doing a great job of
4 renovating the schoolyard. You should come over and
5 check it out.

6 NYPD wrote tickets to just 1.9 percent of
7 the more than 76,000 service requests to 3-1-1 about
8 illegal parking in bike lanes going back to October
9 of 2016. Overall, 16 percent of complaints, we saw
10 violations issued that were made to 3-1-1 over that
11 same period so at an eighth of the frequency or the
12 ratio. This is by far the lowest area where we see
13 NYPD following up and issuing tickets. 1.9 percent,
14 that's means one out of 50 times somebody's actually
15 getting a ticket for parking illegally in a bike
16 lane. I get that there's a lot of different traffic
17 enforcement priorities that we have around the city,
18 but this is real, and it's being ignored.

19 DIRECTOR CLARKE: Right, but 3-1-1 is not
20 the only area. We still have our Traffic Enforcement
21 Agents out writing tickets on all of these issues so
22 I don't think it's fair to say we're not responding
23 at all. We are putting people out there to write
24 tickets on a variety of parking issues.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: You're right. Not
3 responding at all is untrue, but not responding
4 anywhere near enough, and our streets remain unsafe
5 because of the rare enforcement that we see from the
6 NYPD on this area, and if we're going to reach our
7 climate goals, transportation represents the second
8 largest source of emissions in New York City, 25
9 percent of carbon emissions come from transit, then
10 we need to get people onto bicycles safely around the
11 City of New York, and they're only going to do that
12 if we have real protected bike lanes and we are
13 enforcing against illegal cars that make it dangerous
14 to ride our bicycles, and that's why 501 is so
15 important. It's why the Chief said we should be
16 sending photos to him for there to be accountability
17 on this illegal activity. We should have every New
18 Yorker be able to send those photos in to hold bad
19 actors accountable. Thank you very much.

20 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: One thing, Council
21 Member, is that Mayor Adams not only said that he
22 believes, he's putting the money on Vision Zero as
23 he's also adding the State of the City more than 400
24 million dollars for DOT, and the Administration also
25 is open to exploring a new model, as I said before,

2 to enhance safety. As you know, we are not saying the
3 Administration is against the bill. What we are
4 saying is that the Administration would like to
5 discuss this bill further with the Council as there
6 are a number of issues that need to be worked
7 through.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Commissioner, I
9 appreciate it. I appreciate the great work that DOT
10 is doing in District 33, except for that three-letter
11 word that begins with B and ends with E. I love
12 working with you and your team and I really
13 appreciated how responsive and helpful you've been in
14 addressing safety issues in our District. I was just
15 chatting with your Chief-of-Staff in the back, next
16 up is Atlantic Avenue, so we'll be excited to get you
17 out there and do some work to make that safer but,
18 really, you guys have been great and I appreciate
19 your partnership.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
21 that. I want to jump back into my round two
22 questions. Council Member Holden, you're good? You
23 don't have any additional? Okay.

24 I wanted to touch on micromobility.
25 Micromobility has gained popularity with the advent

2 of e-scooters, e-bikes, mopeds, and motor scooters.

3 In April 2020, New York State legalized certain e-

4 bikes and e-scooters, delineating e-bikes by class

5 based on speed and use. In July 2020, the City

6 enacted Local Law 72 and Local Law 73, amending the

7 Administrative Code to remove barriers to the use of

8 certain e-bikes and e-scooters in the city that were

9 authorized under New York State law. In July 2020,

10 New York City enacted Local Law 74 that required DOT

11 to create a pilot program for shared electric

12 scooters in the city. The program was implemented in

13 August 2021 with 3,000 vehicles in the East Bronx. It

14 underwent further expansion in June 2022 with the

15 doubling of its fleet size and expansion into other

16 neighborhoods. After what was deemed a successful

17 launch and implementation, DOT has stated their

18 support for a permanent e-scooter program. How many

19 e-bikes does DOT estimate are currently on the road?

20 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: The scooter,

21 electrical bike or scooter?

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: The e-bikes.

23 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: How many do we have

24 right now, Citi Bike?

25

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: No, the e-
3 bikes, just broadly.

4 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: Just
5 generally? We don't have that specific breakdown but,
6 as I was saying, with the new sensors that we have in
7 place, we hope to have a better picture moving
8 forward.

9 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, and, as you
10 said, the pilot program that many showed interest in,
11 DOT selected Bird, Lime, and Veo. They were proven
12 that they were very successful as they were running
13 the pilot program in the Bronx, and that's why we
14 learned a lot from them, and now we are in the
15 process of putting together the RFP.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: The City has
17 not released its Mobility Report since 2021. No
18 report was received for 2022. Will this report be
19 issued?

20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: The
21 Citywide Mobility Report? I believe we've been
22 collecting the data, but I don't have the exact
23 timeline on...

24 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: We'll follow up
25 with you on that.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: How many
3 summonses has the NYPD issued with regard to illegal
4 use of an e-bike, such as on the sidewalk?

5 CHIEF ROYSTER: Could you repeat the
6 question?

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: How many
8 summonses has NYPD issued with regard to illegal use
9 of an e-bike, such as on a sidewalk.

10 CHIEF ROYSTER: If you'll just allow me to
11 refer to my notes.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Absolutely.
13 While you're looking, Commissioner, can you just let
14 me know how many e-bikes are operated by delivery
15 workers? Do you have an idea of how many?

16 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: I don't (INAUDIBLE)

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: No? Okay.

18 CHIEF ROYSTER: I don't have that broken
19 out that way, but I can get it for you.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
21 Chief. How is the City working to address safety
22 issues related to dangerous driving and faulty or
23 unsafe products related to micromobility devices?

24 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: When it comes to
25 reckless drivers, Vision Zero, which is, as you know,

2 an initiative that was not only the administration,
3 put in place by the Council being partners with that.
4 Also, the Council was able, as I was there, to put
5 the resources so that we also invest in Vision Zero
6 Awareness Campaign so we do have resources that we
7 use for educating the drivers, especially everyone
8 has to slow down. The top priority is for pedestrians
9 to be safe and for cyclists to be safe so, beside the
10 other work that is done from the NYPD side, we also,
11 at DOT, we do a lot of education when it comes to
12 encouraging and letting drivers know that they have
13 to slow down.

14 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: With regard to
15 faulty products, again, I would point to the report
16 from the Citywide Interagency Micromobility Task
17 Force which speaks specifically about a lot of the
18 concerns related to electric micromobility, in
19 particular fire safety. FDNY has been working with
20 the national Product Safety Commission, airing its
21 concerns about fire safety and lithium-ion batteries,
22 and one of the other concerns that we have, quite
23 frankly, and a reason why you'll hear us talk about
24 the problem with the illegal mopeds is that not only
25 are they not legal but one of the good reasons behind

2 this is that they're not appropriately regulated, we
3 know that they're not necessarily safe for the rider,
4 and we want to prevent from both spending their money
5 and risking their safety on something that may not be
6 able to handle the roads the way they're using them
7 so it is a particular concern to us, and we're
8 working with the appropriate federal bodies.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

10 Commissioner, when you talk about the drivers also, I
11 imagine that you include the drivers of the bikes as
12 well because I know when I was in Council Member
13 Won's District, there was a lot of speeding in some
14 of those bike lanes as well so when we talk about it,
15 I'm assuming that the Department of Transportation is
16 looking at how all drivers can be better under Vision
17 Zero, correct?

18 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: We do, and that's why
19 we have our Educational Department at DOT, and we
20 also work with the deliveristas and we also work with
21 some of the bike shops so that everyone is part of
22 the educational piece. However, what we know is that
23 the numbers that we all have concerns about cyclists
24 and pedestrians losing their lives is coming mainly
25 from reckless drivers that are not necessarily the

2 majority of the drivers. It's a few bad apples, those
3 who are driving with suspended license, those are the
4 ones that are speeding, those are the ones that are
5 driving drunk, so, as you know, it's one thing that
6 also with the speed cameras, another area where we
7 worked together when we also got the speed cameras to
8 be 24/7. We also saw a reduction of more than 70
9 percent in those locations where we have a speed
10 camera so our business under the Administration of
11 Eric Adams and all of us is to be sure that we take
12 traffic violence as another violence that we have to
13 eradicate so, yes, we have to educate the cyclists,
14 we have to educate all of us, but the end of the day
15 you have never heard of a cyclist that killed a
16 driver (INAUDIBLE) car lost his life because the
17 cyclist hit the car..

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: No, we hear of
19 pedestrians though.

20 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: So at the end of the
21 day, well, if you look at the numbers, most
22 pedestrians losing their life is the result of
23 reckless drivers, and, as I said before, one loss is
24 too many. By 2022, we saw the lowest number of
25 pedestrians losing their life as a result of crashes

2 in New York City since 2013. That's because we are
3 redesigning our street. That's because we are working
4 with the NYPD on their enforcement part. That's
5 because we are also doing the educational part.

6 There's other motorists and drivers who are speeding,
7 others were on the highway, and other, in this case
8 cyclists, the 12 that we have lost so far, that is
9 too many, so we are tackling different directions.

10 Our commitment is that we will do whatever we can to
11 be sure that New York City is safe for everyone but
12 especially for pedestrians and cyclists.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
14 that. I'm just going to ask a few more questions and
15 then I know we've been joined by the MTA.

16 Is the NYPD trained similarly to the FDNY
17 in addressing lithium-ion batteries and unregistered
18 illegal micromobility devices?

19 CHIEF ROYSTER: Madam Chair, I'm not sure
20 how the FDNY is trained, but I do know we're part of
21 the Micromobility Panel, but I will say that NYPD is
22 trained specifically to look at the micromobilities
23 that have actually populated the street, and I think
24 I mentioned to you before that point of sale
25 operation that we do, it requires every officer to be

2 trained on what to look for, how to weigh the object,
3 and whether or not that particular object has a VIN
4 number which would make it illegal to ride in the
5 street so they do that, they get that training from
6 our Legal Department as well as Chief (INAUDIBLE) and
7 my office prior to doing the actual operation.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. How
9 does the City ensure that batteries for such devices
10 are disposed of safely?

11 DIRECTOR CLARKE: The safe disposal of
12 batteries is something the Department of Sanitation
13 handles, and I know they have information on their
14 website about what can be and cannot be disposed in
15 regular trash and they have safe disposal events. I
16 recently used one, not for batteries, but they do
17 have those events periodically and some regularly for
18 disposal when it should not be in the regular trash,
19 but I don't know the rules personally on what goes in
20 (INAUDIBLE) in terms of batteries.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: For the e-
22 scooter pilot, how did DOT select Lime, Bird, and Veo
23 to operate the pilot?

24 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: There was opportunity
25 as any pilot program for a number of providers, such

2 as Bird, Lime, and Veo, to respond (INAUDIBLE) but
3 DOT looked at everyone who responded and we feel that
4 the Agency chose the best ones that were better ready
5 to be part of this project, but, again, the most
6 important is that as I was visiting that site where
7 the pilot program was taking place, as we were also
8 finishing a number of more protected bike lanes in
9 that area in the Bronx, what we know is that people
10 love that initiative, and those three, Bird, Lime,
11 and Veo, they did a great job, and now as part of the
12 process of the RFP, there's going to be opportunity
13 for anyone that will be interested to respond to the
14 RFP when the RFP is out.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: How were the
16 areas in the Bronx decided upon?

17 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: (INAUDIBLE) at that
18 time, I was a Council Member, and I know the efforts
19 to allow a scooter here, I can tell you when I
20 personally came back, I went to Israel with Council
21 Member David Greenfield so when I came back from
22 there, I was there and I was invited to ride a
23 scooter in the Holy City so when we came back, we
24 started this conversation, and it was Council Member
25 Rafael Espinal, Council Member Fernando Cabrero, the

2 one who led, I also joined the effort, so I know that
3 Council Member Cabrera was committed because the
4 South Bronx was not included in the past for any type
5 of bike-sharing or Citi Bike. I feel that this has
6 been part of what we understand and we all agree that
7 we had an opportunity to connect our community with
8 bike-sharing, with Citi Bike, but also with the
9 scooters so I feel that we identified the need, but,
10 at that time, I can tell you that Council Member
11 Cabrera also played an important role advocating for
12 the Bronx to be included as the area where this pilot
13 program was happening.

14 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: If I could add to
15 that, also when we looked at the areas, the East
16 Bronx seemed like an area that would have a lot of
17 opportunity for these scooters to be utilized as a
18 way to kind of be that last mile connection for
19 people's work and other trips that they need to be
20 taking. If you look at the subway lines there, they
21 are largely longitudinal. People need to be able to
22 make the connections between them without necessarily
23 having to go all the way into the hub or into
24 Manhattan so we saw that as an area for opportunity.
25 Also, the eastern part of the Bronx, the terrain is

2 relatively flat than in the western part of the
3 Bronx, and we know we're working with vehicles that
4 have relatively small wheels. We wouldn't necessarily
5 want to be the first place we trialed them one that
6 has a lot of elevation changes. Finally, the law as
7 it was written prohibited this from being done in
8 Manhattan specifically so we knew that we were going
9 to be using an outer borough location, and the East
10 Bronx was outside at that time the Citi Bike
11 expansion area so it was an area where there was a
12 definite need and where these scooters appeared like
13 they could best fill it.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Do you believe
15 that such a program is an effective way in which to
16 provide those in areas without close and affordable
17 transit access to get to their destinations? I
18 imagine so.

19 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: Yes, and I think
20 the report that we published evaluating the program
21 shows how it pans out and that it really was quite
22 successful in achieving those goals. When we were
23 issuing the RFP, we did ask these companies, all of
24 them, to show how they were going to address equity,
25 how were they going to have options for people with

2 low incomes, NYCHA residents, etc. We had them
3 demonstrate their safety records, what kind of
4 features are you going to have to prevent some of the
5 bad behaviors we'd seen in other cities that had been
6 hazardous like double riding or riding on the
7 sidewalk or leaving scooters strewn on the pavement.
8 We were very, very thorough in the RFP for asking
9 these companies to demonstrate how they were going to
10 make New York City's program really the gold
11 standard, and we're very, very proud and very pleased
12 with how it turned out.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. Now
14 with respect to Intro. 417, during summer break for
15 Committee Members, the Department of City Planning
16 gives Community Boards extra time for ULURP
17 applications certified in late May or June so that
18 Boards can consider applications in September. Will
19 DOT do the same if this bill is passed?

20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: I know
21 that's built into the existing bike lane bill. I
22 think that's something we can speak to with the
23 Council Member as it works toward passage.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Will DOT
25 inform the Community Boards in writing that a study

2 is about to take place instead of informing them that
3 the study is done?

4 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: We
5 generally inform the Community Board when a plan has
6 been developed. We'll have done some outreach prior
7 to going to the Community Board so there are various
8 ways for people to know that a study is underway.

9 For the Mobility Report question, we have
10 rolled all of that data, most of that data into the
11 Streets Plan so we won't be releasing an individual
12 Mobility Report any longer. It's all on the Streets
13 Plan with the update coming in February.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: My
15 understanding is that's a mandated report though.

16 DIRECTOR KITE-LAIDLAW: I know that we
17 have a Mobility Report in which we collected data
18 last October, and we're going to be releasing a
19 report later this spring so that may be the one in
20 question.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
22 the clarification.

23 Thank you for the panel for being here
24 and answering all the questions today.

2 We are joined by Richard Davey, President
3 of New York City Transit with MTA. I ask that if you
4 could stay, you'd remain under oath just in case any
5 additional questions may come up. It won't be for a
6 long time. It'll be just for at least this panel.

7 DIRECTOR RODRIGUEZ: If we have to go, we
8 always leave someone from the team so there will be
9 someone here.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Our next
12 witness will be from the New York City Transportation
13 Authority, Richard Davey, President. I will now
14 administer the oath. We're joined by Will Schwartz as
15 well. I'll administer the oath if you're up there.

16 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
17 whole truth, and nothing but the truth before this
18 Committee and to respond honestly to Council Member
19 questions?

20 PRESIDENT DAVEY: I do.

21 DEPUTY CHIEF SCHWARTZ: I do.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: You may
23 begin.

24 PRESIDENT DAVEY: Great. Thank you so
25 much. Again, good afternoon. I want to thank the

2 Council for having us here today including the Chair
3 Brooks-Powers. I think we've had a chance now to work
4 together and be together on a number of issues, and I
5 appreciate your leadership and partnership.

6 Obviously, I'm here today to talk about
7 why at MTA and New York City Transit why we care
8 about the rules of the road. Today's hearing has
9 focused on several proposals with the theme of
10 keeping streets that our buses traverse cleared of
11 hazardous obstructions and the City's and MTA's
12 collective ability to enforce that. I want to talk
13 today about some of the successes that we have had
14 so far with our growing Automated Bus Lane
15 Enforcement, our ABLE program, and how it's
16 helping to deliver faster and better bus service
17 for our customers across the five boroughs.

18 The ABLE program was first authorized
19 by State law in 2010 which allowed for gantry
20 mounted cameras to be installed and to enforce bus
21 lane violations. From 2010 to 2019, the program
22 was expanded by several acts of the State
23 Legislature with support of the City Council. By
24 2019, the State Legislature removed the caps on
25 the number of bus routes, times of day, and

2 numbers of cameras that we and the DOT were
3 authorized to use. With this expanded
4 authorization, MTA and DOT announced a renewed
5 push to expand the ABLE program as part of the
6 City's Better Buses Restart Program in 2021. By
7 the end of 2022, the MTA has now launched bus-
8 mounted cameras on 16 routes, again across the
9 five boroughs. In no uncertain terms, camera
10 enforcement is one of the most efficient and
11 effective tools at our disposal. Unlike our
12 subways which, of course, enjoy usually their own
13 right-of-way, our buses rely on their very
14 congested streets, sharing their path with
15 commercial and private vehicles, cyclists, and
16 pedestrians. We work in partnership with DOT to
17 deliver better buses and cameras are one piece of
18 that puzzle. Transit signal prioritization, bus
19 lanes and busways, bus stop balancing, effective
20 scheduling and dispatching, and targeted parking
21 regulations all the travel lanes clear all work to
22 give buses prioritization and ensure we can
23 delivery reliable service. But when those busways
24 and bus lanes are blocked, or a delivery truck
25 chooses to use a bus stop to make its delivery, we

2 can't provide the service our customers and your
3 constituents deserve.

4 Adding automated camera enforcement to
5 the menu of options for better buses is key. Since
6 we have added ABLE to various routes, we have seen
7 an average speed improvement of around 5 percent.

8 Faster buses mean more people will choose to take
9 the bus. Overall, the MTA has lost nearly a third
10 of its ridership from the pandemic, but the

11 reality is buses were already losing riders before
12 the pandemic began. When it was faster to walk
13 than take the bus, people just wouldn't choose the

14 bus, but the benefits of ABLE extend beyond just
15 speed improvements. ABLE has a significant impact
16 on safety as well, I know another issue important

17 to this Committee, with an average decrease in
18 collisions of 26 percent along ABLE-enforced bus
19 routes. Let me say that again, 26 percent

20 decrease. As you can see, ABLE, in addition to
21 these other tools I mentioned, leads to a more
22 attractive option for our customers to use. Look,

23 for example, at the M14 for instance. We

24 implemented a busway, added camera enforcement,

25 and what we have seen is incredible. 24 percent

2 improvement in travel times, 42 percent reduction
3 in collisions, and a 14 percent increase in
4 weekday ridership. While the speed and ridership
5 data are encouraging, so too are our recidivism
6 rates. I am encouraged by the fact that over the
7 lifetime of the program, 80 percent of drivers
8 receive one ticket, and never receive another. We
9 are changing behavior. Beyond that, 12 percent
10 receive two tickets, and then are never again
11 charged, changed because of the good behavior. It
12 is commercial violators that are more likely to be
13 the repeat offenders, and they also account for a
14 decent portion of violations issued in general.
15 The fact, however, is that the program will
16 hopefully put itself out of business over time as
17 drivers understand there is real enforcement going
18 on.

19 As we look to the future with all the
20 success we have seen to date, we are optimistic
21 there is more that we can do with automated camera
22 enforcement. This year, in 2023, we are equipping
23 another 600 buses with cameras and so, by the end
24 of the year, around 80 percent of our bus lanes
25 will be covered with automated enforcement. With

2 the help of the Chair and your Colleagues, we are
3 also seeking to expand on what we can enforce
4 which is part of why I join you today. Governor
5 Hochul has proposed legislation in the executive
6 budget that would allow for MTA and DOT to go
7 beyond the bus lane. As proposed, the bill would
8 allow us to use automated camera enforcement to
9 enforce double-parking, bus stop violations, and
10 bike lane violations that end up impeding the
11 progress of a bus. I want to thank the Chair and
12 the other 33 members of the Council that sent a
13 letter of support calling for the bill to be
14 included in the enacted State budget.

15 The additional violations that we would
16 be authorized to enforce would seek to achieve
17 some of the same goals and some of the others
18 being debated today seek to address and do so in a
19 tried and reliable manner. Through a true State
20 and City partnership the MTA, NYC DOT have put
21 together a system that is working and delivering
22 the results we envisioned. We hope to continue to
23 push the envelope and grow the program to clear
24 the street for our buses and to help create a

2 safer streetscape for our customers, pedestrians,
3 and so on.

4 I am personally encouraged, if not a
5 little disappointed, to see Washington, D.C. beat
6 us to the punch by announcing recently that they
7 too will begin using the same camera tools to
8 clear bus lanes and bus stops. If it is a sign of
9 the efficacy of these tools for transit systems
10 across the country, I'd expect to more and more
11 over time. We can't have Washington, D.C. beating
12 us, really, come on.

13 Thank you, again, for having me here
14 today, Chair. I appreciate the opportunity to
15 speak on this issue and, as I mentioned at the
16 top, appreciate your leadership in continuing to
17 help us transit for all New Yorkers.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you so
19 much. Much appreciate. I have no complaints about
20 my train ride today so I'm in a good mood.

21 In all seriousness, how many summonses
22 have been issued due to the automatic bike lane
23 enforcement pilot?

24 PRESIDENT DAVEY: It's about 243,000 I
25 think have been issued through the end of March

2 have been issued, and, as I mentioned, the good
3 news is that about 80 percent or so folks, once
4 they receive one ticket do not reoffend. They get
5 the message and find somewhere else to park.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you
7 for that. You just answered my next question. How
8 can automated cameras the MTA uses be used to
9 enforce against obstructions of bus lanes also
10 enforce against obstructions of adjacent bike
11 lanes?

12 PRESIDENT DAVEY: The technology that
13 we've adopted would allow us to look at, so,
14 today, we obviously enforce bus lanes, but
15 tomorrow with the bill that is pending in the
16 Legislature that the Governor filed, it would mean
17 two things. One is bike lanes as you mentioned and
18 the second is bus stops. I'm pretty passionate in
19 particular about bus stops. It's a matter of
20 equity, particularly for our disabled customers
21 who need to be able to have the access to the curb
22 in order to safely get on and off a bus. You've
23 seen the ramps that we deploy, 100 percent of our
24 buses are accessible, and we deploy ramps to our
25 customers in wheeled mobility devices, for

2 example, or parents with strollers for that
3 matter, to get on the bus, but in some instances
4 if you have a car parked in a bus stop, we're
5 letting customers out in the middle of traffic.
6 This is not safe at all so the new legislation
7 will allow us to, I think, make it more safe and
8 frankly more equitable for our customers with
9 disabilities.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm excited
11 to hear that part and the prioritization of the
12 bus stops as well. In front of my Laurelton office
13 we have a bus stop, and when our office closes for
14 the day I've gone there in the evening and it's
15 just been night and day, you'll see cars lined up
16 in that bus stop, and people getting let out in
17 the middle of the street so I'm pretty excited
18 about this technology and the opportunity to
19 support this moving forward as well as the fact
20 that it can cover some of the bike lanes which
21 we've heard today is of interest to myself and to
22 my Colleagues, and we're in the process of trying
23 to find out what the best way is, the safest way,
24 but to get to the same resolution which is to have
25 safer roadways.

2 PRESIDENT DAVEY: Absolutely, and as you
3 mentioned, the technology will also allow us to
4 enforce bike lane enforcement as well so if there
5 are cars parked in bike lanes, we'll be able to
6 snap a picture of the driver's plate, the license
7 plate, and send them a ticket as well. As you
8 said, I think the technology is exciting because
9 it definitely changes behavior, and so if we're
10 seeing that in bike lanes, 80 percent of folks not
11 getting another ticket, I would expect the same to
12 be true in bus stops and bike lanes as you
13 mentioned.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
15 One moment, please.

16 PRESIDENT DAVEY: Sure. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I think my
18 Colleague has questions so we're just letting him
19 come back in.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you,
21 Chair. Always good to see both. Thank you for
22 joining us today.

23 Just wanted to ask how many buses are
24 now equipped with cameras for enforcement?

2 PRESIDENT DAVEY: We're at about 450
3 right now, Council Member. By the end of the year,
4 we'll have 1,000. To give you a sense, our bus
5 fleet is about 6,000 give or take.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Do we have a
7 game plan to get to 6,000 timeline?

8 PRESIDENT DAVEY: The answer is no. We
9 probably won't retrofit all 6,000 buses, frankly,
10 because we see with a certain portion of buses,
11 50, 60 percent, that is doing the job. As we buy
12 new buses in the future, though, this will be part
13 of the standard feature, if you will, that's
14 purchased so we'll retrofit some buses going
15 forward, as I said 1,000. We'll probably get to
16 maybe 2,000 or so, and then as we purchase new
17 buses...

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Do we have a
19 timeline to get to 2,000?

20 PRESIDENT DAVEY: Not off the top of my
21 head, no. We'll get a 1,000 this year, is what
22 we've committed to, and, beyond that, I think we
23 have to look at our procurement, the technology
24 that's available if you will.

25 DEPUTY CHIEF SCHWARTZ: Can I jump in?

2 PRESIDENT DAVEY: Yeah, sure.

3 DEPUTY CHIEF SCHWARTZ: Council Member,
4 the current MTA capital program has around 85
5 million dollars for automated bus cameras, the
6 actual hardware. A piece that President Davey
7 didn't mention yet was that by the end of this
8 year with that 1,000 cameras, around 80, 85
9 percent of the bus lanes that we operate will be
10 covered by camera enforcement so the existing
11 authorization that we have is solely around bus
12 lanes so we prioritize that so we'll have pretty
13 good coverage by the end of this year.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: But only one
15 out of six buses going down that bus lane is going
16 to have a camera on it?

17 DEPUTY CHIEF SCHWARTZ: That is correct.
18 That is correct, but, again, we have more money in
19 the capital program to keep building on that, and,
20 again, with the existing authorization that we
21 have, we'll have pretty good saturation by the
22 end...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: With 1,000
24 cameras in place, do you have anticipated annual
25

2 revenue for what you're hoping to generate from
3 this?

4 PRESIDENT DAVEY: We don't have an
5 anticipated revenue, and, frankly, we don't budget
6 revenue for this program. I have been on the
7 record as saying I would love the program to
8 eventually go away, meaning we wouldn't be
9 collecting any dollars, but we don't have a
10 revenue projection.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I just mean to
12 say I'd imagine it will be revenue-generating
13 program for the MTA and so the capital resources
14 that we invest on the front end to get cars out of
15 bike lanes will pay for itself and them some.

16 PRESIDENT DAVEY: For sure. We collected
17 about 11 million dollars so far in revenue as a
18 result, but I don't think that we think about it
19 as return on investment in that respect. What we
20 very much see is the bus speeds and customer
21 satisfaction in the places we have ABLE
22 enforcement is better than average.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Do you yet have
24 any data on folks who have received tickets for
25 being parked in bus lanes not changing behavior?

2 PRESIDENT DAVEY: We do. About 80
3 percent of first-time offenders do not offend
4 again so we see a huge behavior change and then an
5 additional 12 percent that receive a second ticket
6 don't reoffend. What we're seeing is...

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm sorry.
8 How much are those tickets?

9 PRESIDENT DAVEY: 50 dollars and then
10 they go up in price, a maximum of 250 dollars, so
11 a 50-dollar ticket does...

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Go up in price
13 if you've had multiple violations...

14 PRESIDENT DAVEY: Correct. That's if you
15 reoffend. That's right. What I was going to say,
16 Council Members, though, is that where we see
17 frankly issues are the commercial vehicles, right,
18 where they either build the cost into doing
19 business or what have you and they tend to be the
20 reoffenders, but the average New Yorker, personal
21 vehicle, gets a ticket and says I'm not doing that
22 again, which is exactly what we want. We want that
23 behavior change.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Yeah. The
25 stipulated fine program is a challenging one in

2 how we better incentivize behavior change from
3 those corporations that are responsible for so
4 much of the illegal activity. Is there anything
5 that we can do from the Council to help support
6 expedited and expanded ABLE enforcement?

7 DEPUTY CHIEF SCHWARTZ: I think that
8 President Davey covered it in the testimony.
9 You've already done a great service in the letter
10 that was led by the Chair and signed by a total of
11 34 Members of the Council asking that the final
12 enacted State budget includes the legislation that
13 we're here talking about today so we greatly
14 appreciate that partnership, and I think for now
15 you've done your part so thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you for
17 pushing on this issue. It's really important.
18 Thank you to the Chair for her leadership on it.
19 That was a great letter, and I was really proud to
20 sign on. I think it's a combination of the
21 aggressive enforcement of cameras on as many buses
22 as possible, but we also need to do a better job
23 of designing our streets so that buses can move
24 efficiently, and I'm really excited to support
25 more busways in District 33. We have a couple of

2 plans in the works that I think are going to be
3 great, and I hope that we can see those expanded
4 across the city.

5 PRESIDENT DAVEY: I should say, by the
6 way, on the street designs, we worked very closely
7 with our partners at the DOT, some of them are
8 still here, and we've been granularly looking at
9 even some of our underperforming bus routes and
10 looking at potholes or pedestrians in the street
11 and really getting granular in the tactics of
12 improving our bus system, and, again, our DOT
13 partners have been terrific in responding to that
14 sort of very tactical, so we've got the big policy
15 today, obviously it's important, but the tactical
16 stuff that's happening as well has also been
17 terrific. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I would love
19 to follow up in terms of your data with the
20 potholes because I'm sure there's some correlation
21 in terms of the communities that are receiving the
22 resources from DOT to do the milling of the roads
23 and their repaving and so I wanted to see if
24 there's some ways we can work together on that so
25

2 I would love to see some of the data if that's
3 available.

4 PRESIDENT DAVEY: Sure.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

6 PRESIDENT DAVEY: Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Next, we are
8 going to be going into public testimony, but we're
9 going to be starting with testimony from Lyft.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you,
11 and I'll just make some remarks before that.

12 We will be turning to public testimony.
13 For public testimony, each panelist will be given
14 two minutes to speak.

15 For panelists testifying in person,
16 please come to the dais as your name is called and
17 wait your turn to speak.

18 For panelists who are testifying
19 remotely, once your name is called, a Member of
20 our Staff will unmute you, and the Sergeant-at-
21 Arms will give you the go ahead to begin. Please
22 wait for the Sergeant to announce that you may
23 begin before delivering your testimony.

24

25

2 I would like to now welcome Anna Pycior
3 from Lyft and Citi Bike to answer some questions
4 from the Members.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sorry. Point
6 of clarification, you're not here to answer
7 questions. Thank you for coming out, and I've
8 spoken to folks over at Lyft about my thoughts
9 about Citi Bike and, just staying in line with
10 that, I had asked a question earlier of DOT and I
11 didn't really get a clear answer from them, but
12 I'm curious if Lyft currently surveys potential
13 riders in neighborhoods where Citi Bike is not yet
14 located to understand the potential demand.

15 ANNA PYCIOR: Yes, thank you for the
16 question, Chair, and thank you for having me up
17 here. We do do an annual multimodal report at Lyft
18 which I'm happy to share with you which is third-
19 party sourced for surveys nationally. Lyft manages
20 bike-share networks across the nation so we do
21 know trends nationally as well as I would venture
22 to say citywide. We are in the midst still of
23 phase 3 expansion as the Commissioner had
24 mentioned, and, as we go into those communities,
25 we certainly in partnership with DOT who

2 ultimately gets to do the location decisions, we
3 do community events and understand the community
4 concerns and questions.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: How granular
6 do those surveys get in terms of New York City?

7 ANNA PYCIOR: I'm happy to find out and
8 get you the stats. We also are transparent about
9 the data and the backend so I'm happy to get that
10 to you.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
12 What does Citi Bike look for in an area to begin
13 to determine whether or not they're going to
14 expand there?

15 ANNA PYCIOR: Absolutely. As the DOT
16 staff said at the dais, it is largely about making
17 it a contiguous service area so there aren't gaps
18 between rides and you aren't stranded in an island
19 of no docks so certainly it is those adjacent to
20 existing locations. When Lyft took over the
21 contract with the City, they invested up front 100
22 million dollars in the Phase 3 expansion, and we
23 are still in the process of seeing that through.
24 We've made serious progress and are now entering
25

2 the areas of further into Queens, further into
3 Brooklyn, and further up in the Bronx.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Since it has
5 to be contiguous, that means that it's going to
6 take a while to get to Southeast Queens is what it
7 sounds like.

8 ANNA PYCIOR: It is the furthest out
9 though I'm personally a very big fan of your
10 District.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. I
12 am as well, and we'd like to have bikes as well.

13 Also, wanted to talk about the
14 increased prices at the start of the year. How did
15 Lyft determine the new prices?

16 ANNA PYCIOR: Absolutely. We have
17 increased cost due to service demands, inflation
18 as well as, honestly, the increased rider demand.
19 These were an adjustment in line with previous
20 adjustments by Lyft and past operators of the
21 system, and I should add that we have maintained
22 the nation's largest reduced fare bike-share
23 program to the tune of a 7-million-dollar
24 investment annually by Lyft and all SNAP and NYCHA
25 residents are eligible. We are very proud of that

2 program and would love to partner with any and all
3 Members of the Council who are interested in
4 spreading the word.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I would,
6 but... How is the outreach in terms of NYCHA
7 developments and what have you for them to be able
8 to participate?

9 ANNA PYCIOR: Absolutely. This year
10 alone, especially during peak riding season so
11 beginning around now, Lyft will be sending out
12 teams to over 300 community events, many of which
13 are events that we, ourselves, have started. We
14 have 10-thousand-dollar grants to community
15 organizations that we give out for weekly rides as
16 well as we attend tenant association fairs and
17 anywhere that you may see SNAP outreach, in
18 underserved areas or areas where people get other
19 points of service to make sure that they're aware.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Lyft was in
21 the news on Friday for laying off a third of its
22 staff. How will these reductions affect Citi Bike
23 services?

24 ANNA PYCIOR: Thank you for the
25 question. Lyft is committed to Citi Bike. We have

2 a contract with the City that we will be seeing
3 through. We continue to make millions of dollars
4 of investments in the hardware for the system, and
5 we will remain committed to our partnership with
6 the Administration, with Commissioner Rodriguez,
7 and with the Council.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

9 ANNA PYCIOR: Thank you.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you.

11 We will next hear from Lacey Tauber from the
12 Brooklyn Borough President's Office, Eric McClure,
13 Mary Beth Kelly, and Elizabeth Adams.

14 You may begin when ready.

15 LACEY TAUBER: great. Thank you so much.

16 My name is Lacey Tauber. I'm here representing
17 Brooklyn Borough President, Antonio Reynosa. Good
18 afternoon and thank you so much for holding this
19 important hearing today.

20 This year has already been a disaster
21 on our streets. I'll skip over all the stats, but
22 we have to remember that these numbers are people,
23 and I know you'll hear today from families and
24 friends of those whose lives have been upended by
25 these tragedies. It's unacceptable, and we must

2 implement better policies for more safety and
3 infrastructure now to protect New Yorkers. The
4 Borough President supports all of our efforts to
5 make our streets safer, but we want to focus
6 testimony today on Intros. 417 and 501-A while
7 acknowledging that these bills are a small part of
8 a much larger effort needed to get us back on
9 track to achieve Vision Zero.

10 For Intro. 417, the purpose of the bill
11 is really to underscore the fact that bike lanes
12 and other safety improvements are infrastructure
13 and to remove barriers to implementation. You've
14 heard a lot about this bill today that I won't
15 repeat, but essentially the existing law can delay
16 critical safety projects, sometimes by up to an
17 entire calendar year, and Intro. 417 would remove
18 these unnecessary delays and will help DOT
19 expedite its pipeline by creating a single
20 timeline for its projects. You heard them today
21 say they love this bill. It also has the support
22 of three other Borough Presidents, and the BP
23 wants to thank them, Council Member Restler, and
24 the 38 other Council Members who have prioritized
25 safety by sponsoring it and encourage Chair

2 Brooks-Powers and the Speaker to move this bill
3 quickly.

4 On 501-A, you've heard a lot about this
5 today too. There's just more cars and trucks on
6 the road, more potential for conflicts with
7 pedestrians and cyclists. Enforcement is not
8 keeping up with dangerous driver behavior, and the
9 citizen-led enforcement system that this bill will
10 create will help deter these dangerous practices
11 without increasing interactions between New
12 Yorkers and the NYPD.

13 Finally, two other proposals on today's
14 agenda. I could just say the Borough President is
15 supportive of Intro. 712 and Intro. 927. Wants to
16 see a lot more enforcement of these ghost cars and
17 out-of-state plates and wants to help support any
18 policies that create space for e-bike charging
19 stations and support our deliveristas and
20 encourage local elected officials to step up and
21 support this critical infrastructure in their own
22 communities as well. Thank you so much.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

24 ERIC MCCLURE: Good afternoon, Chair
25 Brooks-Powers, Council Member Restler. Thank you

2 for holding this hearing today. My name is Eric
3 McClure. I'm the Executive Director of Streets
4 PAC. We strongly support Intro. 417 which will
5 eliminate an unnecessary and burdensome waiting
6 period for bike lane installation that treats such
7 projects differently from all other street work,
8 righting a backlash error wrong that was passed in
9 2011 to needlessly hamper implementation of
10 cycling infrastructure. Ensuring the Department of
11 Transportation can move ahead quickly on bike
12 projects will get safer designs on the ground
13 faster and help the City meet ambitious bike lane
14 mileage targets.

15 We also strongly support Intro. 501-A,
16 which will allow civilian reporting of vehicular
17 hazardous obstruction violations. Illegal parking
18 is epidemic in New York City, and, unfortunately,
19 current enforcement of such violations is
20 negligible at best, frequently overly deferential
21 to drivers, and police officers and other City
22 employees are often the ones committing these
23 offenses. Empowering citizens to report these
24 violations eliminates bureaucratic hurdles, and
25 similar programs have worked to good effect in

2 reporting illegal idling and violations by for-
3 hire drivers. We do, however, urge the Council to
4 eliminate the provision in the bill that requires
5 that reportable vehicles be unoccupied. This
6 carve-out will reduce the program's effectiveness,
7 and we believe the concerns about potential
8 conflict are overblown, given little evidence of
9 altercations between drivers and users of the TLC
10 or DEP reporting systems. Council Member Restler
11 made the point earlier, but I was struck when
12 Chief of Patrol Chell invited the Council Member
13 to send him photos of violations around precincts
14 in his District, which is exactly what this bill
15 would allow anyone to do without the special
16 privileges conferred upon a Council Member or a
17 ranking NYPD officer.

18 We also believe the type of searchable
19 map that Intro. 289 would mandate is a good idea.
20 Council Member Rivera's Local Law 124 enacted in
21 2019 already requires the provision of temporary
22 accommodations when street work impedes on
23 existing bike lanes, though adherence to the law
24 is far from universal. While we don't think NYC
25 DOT's operational concerns are without merit,

2 we're hopeful that further discussions can lead to
3 a workable and mutually agreeable outcome.

4 I'll just really quickly wrap up by
5 saying as for Intro. 712, 926, and 927, while we
6 believe they're all well-intended, we would prefer
7 that the Council legislate action rather than
8 additional study, especially in the areas around
9 which these bills are oriented. I do have some
10 additional points in my written testimony which
11 you can refer to.

12 On 927, on the deliverista hubs, I just
13 would like to close by saying any legislation in
14 this regard should compel work on a hub network to
15 proceed as quickly as possible. We're six months
16 past the point where the Administration announced
17 that they were going to create deliverista hubs,
18 and we also should eliminate any needless
19 hamstringing by Community Boards as we saw
20 recently at CB7 in Manhattan. Thank you very much.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

22 MARY BETH KELLY: Thank you, Chair
23 Brooks-Powers, Speaker Adams, and the entire
24 Transportation Committee for being here.

2 My name is Mary Beth Kelly, and I'm a
3 founding member of Families for Safe Streets, a
4 group which should not exist. In June of 2006
5 while I was cycling with my husband, Dr. Carl
6 Henry Nacht, he was hit by a reckless driver, a
7 reckless NYPD tow truck driver, who was speeding
8 and failed to yield at an intersection. Henry died
9 of his injuries three days later. An internist, he
10 had been caring for New Yorkers for over 30 years.
11 Every one of them lost their doctor that day, my
12 daughter and son lost their father, I lost my
13 partner of 34 years, and the City lost a healer
14 and a servant. He once told me I am happiest when
15 I'm serving, and I had no doubt. That's who he was
16 as a person. He lived his integrity. He lived his
17 life as a mitzvah.

18 While we are here today in support of
19 Intros 501, 712, 927, 926, 289, I'd like to spend
20 this testimony speaking to the importance of
21 Intro. 417 in particular. This bill would allow
22 NYC DOT to more rapidly implement Safe Streets
23 infrastructure such as protected bike lanes by
24 consolidating the current community engagement
25 process on street safety. 2022 saw the most

2 children killed in traffic crashes in the Vision
3 Zero era, and now even five months into 2023 we're
4 on a course for the most overall traffic
5 fatalities since Vision Zero was adopted. After
6 years of progress, we're rapidly losing ground.
7 It's clear that the current process for
8 implementing Safe Streets projects is failing us.
9 I have been doing this work for almost 17 years
10 and have seen firsthand how inappropriate the
11 current lengthy Community Board approval process
12 is, one that often relies on delay, delay, delay
13 rather than action.

14 I'll give one example. Amsterdam Avenue
15 saw four years long delays by Community Board 7
16 and 9. Only after years of protest did they
17 implement the infrastructure that was needed or
18 approve of it, and most tragically and
19 unacceptably, there were lives lost during that
20 time. It continues.

21 The horrific reactive dynamic that goes
22 on at Community Boards is rather than being
23 proactive and preventive, it is a key reason why
24 the City is falling short of meeting the legally
25 mandated benchmarks that you on the City Council

2 passed as part of the Streets Master Plan. Among
3 other things, it mandates 30 miles of protected
4 bike lanes, 20 miles of bus lanes, etc. Most
5 importantly, it reduces crashes and saves lives. I
6 will just sum up by saying that I have personally
7 witnessed this for years, and most recently even a
8 week ago Community Board 7 changed what was to be
9 a resolution to see the plan from the DOT for
10 Crosstown bike lanes which we badly need in
11 Manhattan to a study because one person on the
12 Community Board Transportation Committee wanted to
13 change that wording and so, of course, it got
14 changed. Typically, we have 90 days, three months,
15 once even something is resolved to get put into
16 play, and this is the type of thing that goes on
17 all the time. I'm not going to bring my husband
18 back. I only do this because I want to prevent
19 other people from going through what my family, my
20 community has gone through. No child going to
21 school, no one returning because they went out
22 with their loved one to have a meal doesn't arrive
23 home should happen. Thank you very much.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you
25 and I extend my deepest condolence to you.

2 MARY BETH KELLY: Thank you.

3 ELIZABETH ADAMS: Good afternoon. Thank
4 you, Chair. I'm Elizabeth Adams. I'm a Deputy
5 Executive Director for Public Affairs with
6 Transportation Alternatives. Thank you for holding
7 this hearing.

8 The bills today that are being heard
9 will go a long way to address street safety,
10 transportation access, and a more equitable future
11 for our public space. Transportation Alternatives
12 supports Intro. 417, 501, 927, 926, 712, and 289,
13 which will remove delays and barriers to safe
14 streets infrastructure, make e-micromobility
15 charging stations more accessible, clear our bus
16 and bike lanes, and require a better assessment of
17 bike infrastructure conditions and needs citywide.

18 I want to focus on 501 and 417 today
19 because these changes are essential. We need to
20 speed up our infrastructure projects. We need to
21 keep our bus and our bike lanes clear so the
22 infrastructure that we have built actually does
23 work, and we need to prioritize equitable
24 enforcement through automated programs like the
25

2 ABLE program discussed today, and we need to keep
3 our bus lanes, crosswalks, and bike lanes clear.

4 Bike ridership in New York City has
5 reached an all-time high. Yet, as you've heard
6 today, we are in a crisis. Twelve cyclists have
7 already been killed this year, the highest rate
8 since Vision Zero started. People are calling for
9 more sustainable modes of transit, looking to get
10 around in new ways, including with e-
11 micromobility, and we have an obligation to
12 provide the street safety measures and charging
13 stations that make it possible for more people to
14 access biking. The need is urgent. New York is far
15 behind our Street Plan requirements, and DOT did
16 not meet the bike and bus lane goals for 2022,
17 and, at TA, we've tracked just 0.36 miles built
18 out of the 50 bike lane miles required for 2023.
19 We're heartened by the announcement this morning
20 of the 10 hard miles, but we know that this is
21 urgent, and we have to get projects in the ground
22 now. Every day that an infrastructure project is
23 stalled or a bus or bike lane is blocked, New
24 Yorkers are forced to ride in unsafe conditions.

2 This has real-life costs as you've heard this
3 morning and today.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you
5 for that. Finish your thought. I'm sorry, Liz.

6 ELIZABETH ADAMS: I was just going to
7 say there's a lot we can do. We need to get
8 projects in the ground now. Thanks.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sorry. I
10 thought you were finished.

11 I just have a couple of questions.
12 First, Lacey, do you know whether or not the
13 Brooklyn Borough President supports enforcement by
14 way of speed cameras?

15 LACEY TAUBER: It's not something that
16 we've talked about, but I think he's generally
17 supportive of enforcement that isn't really
18 increasing interactions between the NYPD and New
19 Yorkers in general so my guess would be yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: That's a
21 good point because I think a lot of folks that
22 support the speed camera enforcement support it
23 because it limits the engagement between law
24 enforcement and civilians. Right now, Intro. 501
25 would essentially deputize civilians, making them

2 de facto law enforcement, and they now would be
3 engaging with civilians, and I'm curious, and,
4 Liz, you can answer this also or anyone on the
5 panel, if there are concerns about engagement with
6 law enforcement and civilians, do we not see that
7 for civilian-to-civilian? We heard MTA on the
8 panel earlier talk about ABLE, which could capture
9 some of this as well so I'm interested in
10 understanding what that level of support would be
11 because, I will say, the end goal for all of us,
12 including me, is about safer streets, but at the
13 same time I don't think it would be responsible to
14 put civilians in that line of conflict
15 potentially, and it's not to say everyone would
16 have that experience, and I think that Council
17 Member Restler and I really worked hard to try and
18 figure out how we could address that because it's
19 not solely me that have concerns about it, there's
20 a lot of stakeholders and other Members that feel
21 this way as well in terms of concerns about what
22 that engagement could be so I'm really interested
23 in understanding that a bit better.

24 ELIZABETH ADAMS: I'll just share. I
25 think what we'd like to see first and foremost is

2 DOT doing enforcement of our streets and our bike
3 lanes and our bus lanes, and we have not seen our
4 government agencies, as Council Member Restler
5 laid out with NYPD, we have not seen agencies
6 doing this job at all. It is government in action
7 and failure and it's irresponsible that they are
8 continuing to let infrastructure that taxpayer
9 dollars are investing in year after year to not
10 work, to not be effective so we would love DOT now
11 to do enforcement, and then I would also say when
12 we look at the City's Idling program that has been
13 in place for years we haven't seen that lead to
14 interactions between people that have been
15 upsetting or things like that. I think the
16 precedent that we have shows us that this has
17 worked, that it can work, that it is working.
18 Lastly, I would say we support the provision that
19 allows people to not be in cars at the same time.
20 I think we support the bill. We can't continue to
21 do nothing, and this bill I think is a real
22 concrete way that gives people the ability to take
23 action when, frankly, their government hasn't been
24 doing it.

2 MARY BETH KELLY: I'd just like to add
3 to what Liz is saying. Having been someone that
4 worked long and hard on the speed camera program
5 and even went to jail for a night when we blocked
6 traffic on 3rd Avenue when they stopped the speed
7 camera program one summer and speeding went way
8 up, that putting the speed cameras in place, the
9 issue never came up about interface between police
10 enforcement and the general public, violators. It
11 was always because there was no enforcement, and
12 the only way we could get that enforcement was to
13 introduce electronic enforcement so that was a
14 non-issue in the whole process of when we were
15 getting that bill passed and the original pilot to
16 be continued.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: That's
18 interesting from your perspective because I know
19 in the past and on record we've been told,
20 especially when we were being lobbied last year to
21 support expansion to 24 hours, it was because of
22 the limited exposure to law enforcement, and that
23 has been the reason or the impetus in terms of why
24 we needed to expand it.

2 MARY BETH KELLY: My understanding was
3 that schools were being used way past the 4
4 o'clock cutoff that had been in place and we
5 needed the coverage 24/7.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: No, but I
7 appreciate the perspective. I will say also, just
8 going back, Elizabeth, to what you said in terms
9 of the DOT enforcement. Right now, it's under the
10 purview of the NYPD so we need to get NYPD to act
11 and do their job, which in speaking with Chief
12 Royster today and hearing from her folks, they
13 seem eager to want to do more. We'll see what that
14 looks like. I'm really supportive of ABLE, which
15 is the camera enforcement with MTA, especially in
16 terms of their track record with it, an 80 percent
17 decline in recidivism when it comes to that. It's
18 less engagement person-to-person. I feel like it's
19 safer. I would love to work with the advocates and
20 see how we, again, we all have the same end goal
21 for this, and I think that that could be one of
22 the many solutions, and I think there are ways
23 that New Yorkers can definitely help. If they want
24 to be in this space, there are Traffic Agent
25 roles, people who care about this work go into it,

2 and that's a path as well, but to deputize
3 civilians to do that is extremely dangerous, and
4 it's not like you're walking around with a
5 licensed weapon or if you're able to arrest
6 someone or if you're able to do any of that stuff
7 but to take a photo.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: To take a photo from a
9 distance...

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: To just take
11 a photo, right?

12 ELIZABETH ADAMS: I'll also say that we
13 also have a reporting system now. We have 3-1-1.
14 People do submit complaints now. I think that's
15 kind of built into a lot of how our City work
16 already functions, and so I think that that really
17 provides a model for people not going out and
18 being super-unexpected or reckless so I think a
19 lot of this is in place to some extent in
20 different ways, and I think we trust New Yorkers
21 to...

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I mean I
23 trust them too. I just worry about them.

24 LACEY TAUBER: Can I add something to
25 that? I think that's a really good point, and I

2 think this would, the way the bill is written now,
3 it would go beyond and require folks to take a
4 training course. You don't have to do that right
5 now to report to 3-1-1 so I feel like this would
6 be an extra step that would help people learn how
7 to do this safely. Actually, I think it would be
8 nice to see something in this bill that would
9 perhaps anonymize submissions just because I'm
10 really concerned about the harassment that's been
11 happening of people who are using the 3-1-1
12 system, and I would worry about that in this case
13 as well and wonder if there's a way to make sure
14 that folks who are using it wouldn't have their
15 information reported to the NYPD to try to make
16 sure that doesn't happen to them.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Again, I
18 think you kind of underscored some of the concerns
19 in terms of safety, right, because if you have to
20 think about being anonymous to report someone and,
21 let's be clear, not everyone is going to do it for
22 the reason of safety. We have people that walk up
23 to black and brown people every day and accuse
24 them of things every day and engage law
25 enforcement and so it's just a really big concern

2 for me from a number of perspectives so I want to
3 be fully transparent, but I am committed to
4 working with you all and finding a resolution, and
5 I hope that working with Council Member Restler
6 and each of you that we can have something that's
7 even stronger that gets it done.

8 ERIC MCCLURE: I do want to just quickly
9 tack on I think the power dynamic is very
10 different between a police stop and someone
11 reporting illegal parking with an app.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I think if
13 you tell a black and brown person that, they may
14 feel differently.

15 ERIC MCCLURE: Certainly, I think that's
16 the case, but also in reporting a violation you do
17 need to present evidence. I did snap a picture of
18 you and Council Member Restler during the
19 testimony so it can be done surreptitiously. I
20 think, given the experience with the DEP program
21 and with the TLC program, and you guys asked the
22 question, there just is not a lot of evidence of
23 that kind of negative interaction so I do
24 appreciate your concerns very deeply, and the last
25 thing we want is more violence on New York City

2 streets than what we have now, but I do think,
3 with the vacuum of enforcement that clearly was
4 underscored in this hearing today that we need an
5 alternative to what's not being done right now to
6 keep the streets safer.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I thank you,
8 Eric, and I value you, you know I reach out to you
9 with questions all the time so I'm thankful that
10 you answer my calls and my emails, and I know,
11 Elizabeth, you had mentioned also in terms of the
12 Idling Program, but I will say the difference is
13 that's what commercial vehicles, and I remember
14 when I first got appointed as Chair to this
15 Committee, one of the initial conversations with
16 one of the advocates viewed car ownership as a
17 privilege, and to some it may be a privilege but
18 we don't know what goes into having that car
19 because it's actually a financial burden that
20 people in communities like the one I represent
21 have to depend on, and at times they're sharing
22 them just to get to work or to get to drop their
23 kids off or get where they need to go and so it's
24 not truly a privilege, it's because we don't have
25 the same access, and so when you talk about

2 summoning someone in that way, I think their
3 response may be different because that's, like if
4 someone loses their car and they can't get to work
5 or they can't get their daughter or son to school,
6 that's a different dynamic than someone who has a
7 commercial vehicle and that they build that into
8 their business model so I think we have to really
9 listen to one another in terms of what some of the
10 challenges are so that we can think about what the
11 appropriate way to address this will be. Again, we
12 have the same end result. As you all know, I've
13 cried about children getting hit by these cars in
14 my District, especially Davina Afokoba, a 10-year-
15 old who was just walking home from school so this
16 is something that's very important to me. As a
17 middle school student, I witnessed a classmate get
18 hit by a vehicle and knocked (INAUDIBLE) onto the
19 highway as a child so this is real for me as well.
20 I don't take it lightly, but at the same time
21 there are other dynamics that have to be weighed
22 in and valued as well.

23 MARY BETH KELLY: Chair, I would just
24 like to encourage that if there is anyone in your
25 District that would benefit from the support

2 services of Families for Safe Streets, please send
3 them our way.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you
5 for that, and I know that Priscilla, Davina's mom,
6 has been engaged since the hearing we had earlier
7 this year, and I thank you for the support.

8 Thank you.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you.
10 We'll next call up Alia Soomro.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: She had to leave.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Sorry, she
13 had to leave?

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Yeah.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: We'll call
16 up Gabriel Russell, Nina Sabghir, she left, Gerald
17 Ross, Junda Xu, and Raul Rivera.

18 You may begin when ready.

19 GABRIEL RUSSELL: Simply put, without
20 the bounty program and if it's in a very limited
21 area, the reporting bill has no teeth. No one's
22 going to report anything, even in the incredibly
23 finite area, and then the problem isn't going to
24 fix anything. This is just feelgood measures.
25 Whereas if everyone knows that everyone around

2 them could report them, it would create an
3 atmosphere of fear in the drivers so they would
4 actually learn to obey the rules instead of just
5 doing whatever they want. Simply put, any
6 altercation, even just two days ago I yelled at a
7 guy who was blocking the bike lane when I was
8 biking by and he came out and he hassled me
9 because he felt there were no consequences because
10 that's how these people work. These are people who
11 would drive in New York. They don't have regard
12 for New Yorkers. Also, a lot of these people are
13 people without front plates. The NYPD isn't
14 enforcing that. They've realized they can beat all
15 the automated systems just by taking off their
16 front plate and driving around. If we were to say
17 put that reporting authority into the hands of the
18 people, it might actually get fixed, but right now
19 with this incredibly compromised version, nothing
20 will get fixed.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

22 GABRIEL RUSSELL: I yield my time.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: You may
24 begin.

2 GERALD ROSS: I'm Gerald Ross. I'm an
3 officer of New York Cycle Club. We're a
4 recreational cycling club with roughly 3,000
5 members spread throughout the whole five boroughs,
6 and I'm here to heartedly endorse Intros 289, 417,
7 501, and 926. We think all of them have the
8 potential of enhancing bike safety and bike use,
9 and that's what we're all about. We do a lot of
10 education ourselves and do a lot of group riding.
11 I want to especially focus on 501. I think the
12 citizen reporting system is an excellent idea,
13 mainly because New York PD is just not doing its
14 job. We've all seen it. We see the double-parked
15 cars, we see the cops doing nothing but talking to
16 each other and playing on their phone and they
17 don't pay any attention to serious traffic
18 violations so we need some reporting system, and I
19 think Council Person Restler pointed out there's
20 been a reporting system for the truck exhaust
21 (INAUDIBLE) nobody's been damaged by that. The
22 idea that civilians put themselves in danger is a
23 myth. Again, that's an excuse for law enforcement
24 not acting like law enforcement. All four bills do
25 enhance the cycling experience. I've been riding

2 myself in the city for close to 40 years, 50 years
3 even, and seen a lot of improvement and a lot of
4 room for more improvement and just here to support
5 all that on behalf of myself and our 3,000 co-
6 members. Thank you very much.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

8 RAUL RIVERA: Good afternoon. My name is
9 Raul Rivera. I'm a TLC driver. I'm a TLC driver
10 advocate. Just to get it out of the way, we want
11 to say thank you to the Chair for meeting with us
12 back in June of 2022. We hope to get a followup
13 meeting. I think there was a miscommunication. We
14 know that you met with us, but we need a followup.
15 We want to push our bills, and they go nowhere
16 without you, and we say thank you for that.

17 Some of the things I'm going to say are
18 going to be a little bit, how do I say, a little
19 bit out there, but I think it's important. We care
20 about this Committee. We want this Committee to be
21 the best Committee ever. We want to advocate for
22 this Committee. We want this Committee to be
23 powerful and, personally, me, as a member of
24 Families for Safe Streets, as a native New Yorker,
25 as a TLC driver here in the city, as a crash

2 survivor, I truly believe there should be some
3 kind of investigation into Transportation
4 Alternatives and all the power that they yield
5 over this city. They are basically the DOT of New
6 York. We have to be very careful. This Committee
7 should advocate for the constituents, not for an
8 organization that receives money from Uber, from
9 Lyft, from Lime so we're going to speak more about
10 that. We want you guys to be aware of this. You
11 know Transportation Alternatives, and we ask for
12 an investigation. I do. I do, our group does.
13 Also, we talk about safety. We have to remember
14 Nina Kapur. Nina Kapur was a reporter with CBS.
15 She was a passenger on a Revel scooter. She didn't
16 have a helmet. In July of 2020, she lost her life.
17 She was 26 years old, and this city, if we can
18 mandate vaccines and we can mandate all kinds of
19 stuff, why can't we mandate helmets? Helmets save
20 lives. They're not 100 percent, but they save
21 lives. I believe in helmets, and someone out of
22 the 51 Council Members, someone should say you
23 know what, let's do a bill, let's pass a bill to
24 mandate helmets. We have to wear seat belts. We
25 get tickets if we don't wear a seat belt so you

2 get a ticket if you don't wear a helmet. It's
3 going to save lives, many lives. Thank you for the
4 time.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you
6 for that. First, thank you for acknowledging that
7 we did meet.

8 RAUL RIVERA: Of course. There's not
9 much you can say in two minutes.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: No, I know.
11 I just always caution folks in terms of how we
12 engage one another. I'm very easy to connect with.
13 I'm not hard to find so we'll talk offline in
14 terms of next steps, but, again, just be mindful
15 of the engagement because...

16 RAUL RIVERA: Definitely.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Online
18 sometimes I feel like advocates, they're very
19 passionate but it could be interpreted very
20 differently.

21 RAUL RIVERA: We don't operate with
22 feelings. We operate with commonsense.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Right.

24 RAUL RIVERA: We have nothing personal
25 against anyone.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Yeah, and
3 it's not about being personal, but it's about the
4 proper way to engage folks so I just want to be
5 clear on that.

6 I do like the idea about the helmets,
7 and maybe that's something we can explore also.

8 RAUL RIVERA: It would save lives. No
9 doubt about it.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I appreciate
11 everyone for their testimonies today. Thank you.

12 GERALD ROSS: If I may interrupt. I've
13 seen one person die because he fell off a bike
14 bareheaded. I've seen three or four people,
15 including myself, not die because we had a crash
16 and fell and the helmet saved our lives.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I think it's
18 worth the conversation.

19 RAUL RIVERA: Transportation
20 Alternatives never touches the topic. They never
21 do. They never do. I think it's very important,
22 and it's an injustice to the people who die in the
23 city. When I was in my accident, I had my seat
24 belt. I was almost killed. A NYC FDNY firefighter
25 ran the light, and I t-boned him with my truck. I

2 got an injured spine now. I got plenty of pain
3 going down my legs. Nobody did anything. If it
4 wasn't for my video, my dashcam, nobody would
5 believe me. I'll share that video with you. The
6 truck that I hit flipped several times. It almost
7 hit a young girl in the corner. Luckily, the light
8 pole stopped the vehicle from flipping, and she
9 was able to run away.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you
11 all for your testimonies today.

12 RAUL RIVERA: Thank you.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you
14 so much. We will now move to online testimony.

15 We'll begin with Charles Guthrie
16 followed by Israel Acevedo and Jackson Chabot.

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

18 CHARLES GUTHRIE: Hi. My name is Charlie
19 Guthrie. Let me just turn on the camera. Council,
20 thank you for the opportunity to testify. I'm
21 going to just move to a quieter spot.

22 I'm supportive of all the bills under
23 discussion today. I'm a cyclist, pedestrian, and
24 parent. It's important to me that I be able to
25 safely bring my 3-year-old daughter to her school,

2 either on foot or on my bike with me. Some day I'd
3 like her to be able to bike on New York City
4 streets herself so I support anything that makes
5 our streets safer for all.

6 I'm here to speak in favor in
7 particular for Intro. 417 and Intro. 501. Intro.
8 417 would allow DOT to install bike lanes more
9 quickly and easily and so that would be great.

10 Intro. 501 is critical for pedestrians
11 as well as cyclists by improving enforcement for
12 traffic laws. Council Member Brooks-Powers, I hear
13 your concerns about hypothetical conflict between
14 citizens, but I think you have to weigh that
15 against the visible and evident and very real
16 traffic violence that we're seeing as a result of
17 dangerous conditions from illegally parked cars.
18 The ideal solution would be for NYPD to enforce
19 these laws themselves, but NYPD has not been
20 consistent in doing that.

21 I do want to continue to voice my
22 support for all of the bills that are being
23 considered but 417 and 501 in particular.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you
25 for that.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you.

3 We'll now move on to Israel Acevedo followed by
4 Jackson Chabot and Ligia Guallpa.

5 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

6 ISRAEL ACEVEDO: Good afternoon. Good
7 afternoon. Can you hear me?

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: We can
9 hear you.

10 ISRAEL ACEVEDO: Okay. Good afternoon.
11 My name is Israel Acevedo, and I was born and
12 raised in Brooklyn New York. I am a New York City
13 for-hire owner/operator, and I have been in this
14 industry for eight years. I am most proud of the
15 transportation industry. I am also a cyclist and a
16 pedestrian. I want to send my deepest sympathy to
17 all the victims and their families that have been
18 affected by irresponsible drivers. But I also want
19 to mention that I drive professionally six days a
20 week, I've been in this industry for eight years,
21 right, and I also see the engagement of a lot of
22 irresponsible cyclists and a lot of irresponsible
23 pedestrians, right, and so is Vision Zero possible
24 yesterday? It's definitely possible, but everybody
25 has to play their part, right. What I hear a lot

2 is it's the driver's fault, it's the driver's
3 fault, it's the driver's fault, but clearly at
4 this hearing, right, we've heard many Council
5 Members and many people who testified that
6 cyclists are blowing through the red lights,
7 right, and they're recklessly driving these e-
8 bikes and they're just doing whatever they want to
9 do, right. You understand what I'm saying? In
10 order for there to be zero fatalities, everybody
11 has to play their part. Unfortunately, the only
12 ones being held accountable here is the driver.
13 The cyclist is not being held accountable. The
14 pedestrians are not being held accountable when
15 they jaywalk. Do you understand what I'm saying?
16 There has to be some type of equal balance here,
17 right. Are there irresponsible drivers?
18 Absolutely. Listen, I've been in this industry for
19 eight years. I've gotten two speed camera tickets
20 in eight years, one red light camera ticket, okay,
21 so it's not about the car. It's about the
22 operator, right. In addition to Intro. 501, right,
23 Mr. Restler's bill, I have a high concern for
24 assault from drivers...

25 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

2 ISRAEL ACEVEDO: On civilians. The time
3 is expired already?

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: You can just
5 finish your thought, but, yes, your time has
6 expired. You can just finish your thought and
7 submit everything else in writing.

8 ISRAEL ACEVEDO: Okay. I just want to
9 briefly say I have nothing against (INAUDIBLE)
10 transportation, but that should be by choice, not
11 by (INAUDIBLE) and Transportation Partners should
12 not be waging war against cars as they accept
13 money from Lyft, Uber, Revel, and the (INAUDIBLE)
14 and many others in the auto industry. Accepting
15 money from these companies and waging war against
16 cars is hypocritical. This organization has no
17 integrity. I will submit everything else by email.
18 Thank you, Council Member Brooks-Powers, for
19 letting me testify.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you.
22 We'll now hear from Jackson Chabot followed by
23 Ligia Guallpa and Lionel Morales.

24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

2 JACKSON CHABOT: Good afternoon, Chair.

3 Good to see you. Thank you for having me. My name
4 is Jackson Chabot. I'm the Director of Advocacy
5 and Organizing at Open Plans, and I'm here today
6 to testify in support of Intro. 712. My colleague,
7 Sara Lind, will testify shortly about our support
8 for Intro. 417 and 501.

9 I want thank you, Chair, for first of
10 all being a co-sponsor to this bill. Each day we
11 don't report on unreadable license plates is
12 another day that an unknown and a growing number
13 of drivers blatantly disregard our laws, degrade
14 our social norms, and commit further crimes. Right
15 now, the current known consequences range from
16 loss of toll and ticket revenue to criminals using
17 vehicles with unreadable plats to commit serious
18 crimes. According to the MTA CEO remarked last
19 year that the agency loses something like 50
20 million dollars. However, analysis by Streetsblog
21 revealed that this number is actually closer to
22 144 million. For context, this money would be more
23 than double what the Fair Fares program budget
24 allocation is. What's more, this February the MTA
25 arrested 32 drivers who had fines amounting to

2 900,000 dollars for toll evasion. According to
3 Staten Island Live, last year the MTA suspended
4 the registration of 15,000 vehicles for unpaid
5 tolls, impounding 1,800 vehicles, and recovering
6 approximately 21 million in tolls and fees owed,
7 all of which represented single-year highs. This
8 is all lost revenue for the MTA and what our city
9 direly needs. This alone shows how widespread the
10 problem is and just with respect to tolls, let
11 along the safety implications. On top of all of
12 this, unreadable plates hinder the City's ability
13 to issue tickets for illegal parking and other
14 infractions. More seriously, unreadable plates
15 including paper plates have been used to commit
16 serious crimes such as hit and runs, including
17 high profile incidents transpiring over the past
18 several years that include the death of 5-year-old
19 Jonathan Martinez in East Elmhurst at the hands of
20 a driver of a vehicle with an untraceable plate.

21 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

22 JACKSON CHABOT: The evidence is clear
23 we need this bill to report on the full scope and
24 scale of the problem. Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you.

3 We'll now hear from Ligia Guallpa followed by

4 Lionel Morales and Roy Fishman (phonetic).

5 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

6 LIGIA GUALLPA: Can you hear me?

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Yes, we
8 can.

9 LIGIA GUALLPA: Okay. Good afternoon.

10 Thank you so much to the Chairwoman of the
11 Transportation and Infrastructure Committee and
12 all the Members of this Committee for the
13 opportunity to testify on behalf of the Workers
14 Justice Project and Los Deliveristas Unidos. My
15 name is Ligia Guallpa. I'm the Executive Director
16 of the Workers Justice Project which organized as
17 Los Deliveristas in 2020.

18 Today, I'm testifying in support of the
19 package of bills being heard today, particularly
20 Intro. 417, Intro. 427, which will make e-
21 micromobility charging stations more accessible,
22 our buses and bike lanes usable, and will better
23 assess bicycle infrastructure, conditions, and
24 needs citywide.

2 During the pandemic, more than 65,000
3 deliveristas showed up through the darkest days of
4 the pandemic, through the rain, snow to ensure
5 that communities across the city were fed and safe
6 at home. Most New Yorkers benefited from delivery
7 of deliveristas who transported medicine,
8 groceries, meals on e-mobility devices like e-
9 bikes. The growing dependency on e-bikes is fueled
10 by the demand of food delivery app companies that
11 have recklessly widened delivery radius, forcing
12 delivery workers to travel longer distances to
13 fulfill orders as quickly as possible. Our city's
14 streets have become the workplace of thousands of
15 deliveristas who are essential to our city's
16 economy and have demonstrated to be vital in
17 supporting New Yorkers in times of hurricanes and
18 a pandemic. We now have a shared responsibility to
19 make our city streets safe by expanding public
20 charging infrastructure like the street
21 deliverista hubs to serve the needs of delivery
22 workers and make e-micromobility possible for New
23 Yorkers citywide. We're proud to be working with
24 Mayor Adams, the Department of Transportation,
25 even the Department of Parks in building the

2 first-in-the-nation deliverista hubs for delivery
3 workers. We're excited to be partnering with DOT
4 in testing new technologies that will bring much
5 needed infrastructure for deliveristas...

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

7 LIGIA GUALLEPA: And hardworking New
8 Yorkers. I just want to say thank you to Council
9 Members Jennifer, Lincoln, Carlina, and Amanda for
10 working towards really building a new future of
11 safe micromobility not only for all New Yorkers
12 but essential workers like los deliveristas, and
13 we really look forward to transforming our city's
14 infrastructure who are the workplace of thousands
15 of deliveristas. Thank you for the opportunity to
16 testify.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you
18 and thank you for the work that you do. As all New
19 Yorkers and, quite honestly, the world thought in
20 the pandemic, you all are essential workers, and
21 this Council is committed to working to make sure
22 that you have devices that are safe so thank you.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you.
24 We'll now hear from Lionel Morales followed by Roy
25 Fishman and Sara Lind.

2 LIONEL MORALES: Good afternoon, Chair
3 Brooks-Powers and Members of the City Council's
4 Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure. My
5 name is Lionel Morales, and I am the
6 Communications Outreach and Marketing Manager of
7 the Black Car Fund. Our Executive Director, Ira
8 Goldstein, regrets that he cannot be here today,
9 but we both thank you for the opportunity to
10 testify on behalf of our covered drivers.

11 My testimony today will focus on
12 Proposed Introduction 501A. While we have always
13 supported the intent of this legislation, when it
14 was initially proposed we were concerned that it
15 would likely result in unintended consequences
16 unless changes were made. Specifically, unlike the
17 existing Citizens Air Complaint Program, this bill
18 contained no language outlining a burden of
19 evidence that would be required for civilian
20 reports. We were concerned that this coupled with
21 the provision that provided for a financial reward
22 for civilian complaints would have created
23 conditions that would result in drivers regularly
24 facing unjustified complaints and penalties. TLC-
25 licensed drivers are allowed to make quick pick-

2 ups and drop-offs in bus lanes, but this
3 unfortunately is not necessarily common knowledge.
4 If civilians were incentivized to file complaints
5 with an ambiguous burden of proof, there is no
6 doubt that many TLC-licensed drivers would have
7 been unfairly penalized. It is clear this concern
8 was heard, however, during the legislative
9 process. The changes that have been made to Intro.
10 501A, specifically the requirement for a vehicle
11 to be unoccupied for a violation to be issued,
12 removes this concern. We also appreciate that the
13 addition of this requirement will prevent
14 potential altercations which is good for everyone.
15 As the bill moves forward, we believe that a
16 burden of proof for civilian complaints should be
17 clearly outlined. As currently drafted, the
18 civilian complainant would only be required to
19 allege that the vehicle is unoccupied. The Citizen
20 Air Complaint Program requires a time and date-
21 stamped video as part of its evidence
22 requirements. Something like this would prevent a
23 perfectly timed photo from resulting in an
24 unjustified penalty for a TLC-licensed driver.

2 Again, I'd like to thank the Chair and
3 Members of this Committee for this opportunity to
4 testimony.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you.

7 We'll now hear from Roy Fishman followed by Sara
8 Lind and William Medina.

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

10 ROY FISHMAN: Hello. Can I be heard?

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Yes, we
12 can.

13 ROY FISHMAN: Seems like my video isn't
14 working. Thank you for allowing me to speak today.
15 I've been listening to the Zoom for a while now.
16 It seems to me I don't hear Staten Island
17 mentioned very much. I am a member of
18 Transportation Alternatives, living in Staten
19 Island, and I feel that Staten Island needs
20 transportation justice just like the other
21 boroughs. We need miles of protected bike lanes
22 like the other boroughs. We need bike-share like
23 the other boroughs. I don't need to see traffic
24 (INAUDIBLE) on streets that our activists have
25 long complained about, and greenways just like the

2 other boroughs. I don't Staten Island mentioned
3 very much when they speak about the city. Another
4 thing that we've long been advocating for, and if
5 MTA is listening, again we need a bike/pedestrian
6 lane on the Verrazzano Bridge. Why should we be
7 the only borough that has bridges that are
8 connected to the other boroughs? I do support 501A
9 to allow civilian enforcement of double-parked
10 vehicles in bike and bus lanes. I do support bill
11 417 to allow quicker installation of bike projects
12 by reduction of community notice time. I think
13 passage of these bills would make a better city
14 for its residents, and, also, I applaud the
15 introduction of the Dutch Reach that would mandate
16 drivers reach over to the left side so they can
17 look behind them to make sure they're not dooring
18 someone approaching their door as they open it.
19 Thank you very much.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you
22 so much. We'll next hear from Sara Lind followed
23 by William Medina.

24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

2 SARA LIND: Hi. My name is Sara Lind.
3 I'm the co-Executive Director at Open Plans, and
4 we're testifying today to enthusiastically support
5 Intros 417 and 501A. Both are critical to make our
6 streets safer for all users.

7 417 rightly rectifies a 2011 law that
8 was passed explicitly to slow down bike lane
9 installation, but biking in the city is increasing
10 all the time and it's here to stay so the City
11 must adapt our streets to make them safe for
12 biking, and that means protected bike lanes. 417
13 is a commonsense solution to speed up notice while
14 still giving time for engagement. This critical
15 safety infrastructure is desperately needed, and
16 any delay risks people's lives.

17 Every New Yorker who spends any time
18 walking around our streets knows that there is a
19 culture of lawlessness when it comes to parking.
20 Drivers will park almost anywhere because they
21 know there is almost zero chance they'll get a
22 ticket. It remains clear that NYPD is either
23 unwilling or unable to enforce parking laws, and
24 this is all the more true since NYPD vehicles are
25 often the biggest offenders. Without enforcement,

2 we know for sure that this chaos on our streets
3 will continue indefinitely. Intro. 501 is an
4 effort to rectify the situation, and we already
5 have successful civilian enforcement programs in
6 place for idling and TLC violations with no
7 evidence of conflict. Also, this program would not
8 result in anyone losing their car and, to be
9 clear, every single New Yorker should be following
10 the law and not endangering other people through
11 illegal parking. Even if you need a car to get
12 around, that doesn't give you the right to park
13 illegally with impunity. Bottom line, we'd like to
14 see this bill passed, implemented, and the program
15 iterated and scaled up citywide.

16 That said, automated enforcement is a
17 more robust objective and effective method of
18 enforcement, and this Council should support two
19 bills currently introduced at the State level, the
20 bill to expand the automated bus lane program,
21 which thank you all for your support on that, and
22 the bill to pilot a bike lane enforcement program.
23 The effectiveness of automated enforcement to
24 change behavior shows that people will change
25 their behavior when they know that there is

2 consistent enforcement, but it will likely be
3 years before automated enforcement is rolled out
4 in a meaningful way citywide which is why we need
5 Intro. 501A as well. Thank you.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you
7 so much. We'll now hear from William Medina
8 followed by Paul Schreiber and Shawn Garcia.

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

10 WILLIAM MEDINA: Good morning. My name
11 is William Medina. I'm a leader of Los
12 Deliveristas Unidos and a member of the Workers
13 Justice Project. Thank you to the Chair of the
14 Transportation and Infrastructure, Selvena Brooks-
15 Powers, and all of the Members of this Committee
16 for the opportunity to testify today in support of
17 the package (INAUDIBLE) Intro. 0927, which
18 establishes a task force to explore the
19 development of e-bike charging stations New York
20 City and a real pathway to transform and improve
21 e-micromobility infrastructure for New Yorkers.
22 The crisis our city is facing is the lack of
23 infrastructure such as protected bike lanes, e-
24 bike charging stations, and a real plan that
25 allows us to move towards a new future of safe

2 micromobility. In recent years, I have witnessed
3 how my fellow deliveristas have died due to the
4 lack of safe bike paths and lithium batteries.
5 Now, we are more than 65,000 deliveristas who
6 continue to face the same risks without having a
7 safe place to charge our batteries, without the
8 resources to invest in new certified e-bike
9 batteries that can cost between 500 to 1,000, and
10 without a minimum pay that can allow us to
11 transition to a future in which we can prioritize
12 the well-being of our families at risk. Los
13 Deliveristas Unidos, our e-bikes and lithium
14 batteries are essential to transport food,
15 medicine, and essential good to meet the base
16 needs of New Yorkers. During the pandemic, we have
17 demonstrated how essential we are to our city
18 infrastructure and economy. Electric bicycles are
19 the most...

20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

21 WILLIAM MEDINA: Sorry, okay. I just
22 want to say the last part.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Yeah, finish
24 your thought. Go ahead.

2 WILLIAM MEDINA: Okay. Thanks to the
3 Council Member Jennifer Gutierrez, Lincoln
4 Restler, Amanda Farias, Carlina Rivera for making
5 this package of legislation possible and the Chair
6 of this Committee for her support. Los
7 Deliveristas Unidos are here to continue working
8 together for a better future. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you.
11 We'll now hear from Paul Schreiber followed by
12 Shawn Garcia.

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

14 PAUL SCHREIBER: Hello. Thank you very
15 much. I have four things to talk about so I'm
16 going to be quick.

17 My number one is the widespread problem
18 of paper license plates throughout New York City.
19 Since the complaint program was put into effect
20 last July, 10,743 complaints have been made; only
21 1,055 of them, that's less than 10 percent, have
22 resulted in a summons and only one has resulted in
23 an arrest. This is a widespread problem the NYPD
24 is clearly ineffective in solving it.

2 The second thing I'd like to talk about
3 is Intro. 501. Intro. 501 was a good idea. It has
4 been watered down to the point in which it is
5 useless. I am disappointed and embarrassed to hear
6 the Members sort of bend over backward, feigning
7 concerns of safety and security. The TLC Oath
8 Reporting Program has been in effect for years.
9 There have been thousands of reports. This has not
10 been a problem where people are in any way unsafe
11 making these reports. What people are unsafe from
12 is from the NYPD who are harassing people who are
13 reporting illegal parking. If you care about the
14 safety of New Yorkers, you will do something about
15 the 200 people a year who are dying on our streets
16 and you will do something about the law
17 enforcement agency harassing reporters.

18 The next thing I want to talk about is
19 blocked bike lanes. They are constantly a problem.
20 I live near Downtown Brooklyn, and Bond Street is
21 filled with cars more often than it is not. The
22 second thing here is the Schermerhorn Protected
23 Bike Lane, protected in air quotes because it's
24 protected only by paint and soft-hit posts which
25 are constantly damaged, and this is full of cars.

2 It is full of trucks. Not a day goes by in which
3 you cannot find someone putting the lives of
4 cyclists at risk through their hazardous and
5 reckless behavior. Another thing as a cyclist you
6 have to worry about is illegal mopeds, these Class
7 3 mopeds that don't have a VIN, that don't have a
8 license plate that are running the wrong way,
9 they're running on sidewalks. There is no effort
10 by the NYPD whatsoever at enforcing the existing
11 law. DOT claims they are working on education.
12 They've been working on education for 10 years.
13 Everybody is well-educated what is and isn't legal
14 and...

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

16 PAUL SCHREIBER: To act now before more
17 people are dead as a result of these unlicensed
18 motorcycle drivers.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you
20 so much. We'll next hear from Shawn Garcia.

21 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

22 SHAWN GARCIA: Hey. Good afternoon,
23 Chair Brooks-Powers, and thanks so much for the
24 Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure
25 holding this really important hearing today.

2 My name is Shawn Garcia. I am the
3 Senior Organizer for Equity and Partnerships at
4 Transportation Alternatives. I wanted to speak to
5 two things today. First being the question around
6 e-micromobility and really how it's the key to a
7 more sustainable mobility system and really takes
8 City officials investing time and resources today
9 to build out the infrastructure that's going to
10 make our future possible, and New Yorkers have a
11 real chance to be leaders in this space. Intro.
12 927 is a good step in that direction. E-
13 micromobility devices, as earlier testimonies have
14 said, are critical tools for over 65,000 delivery
15 workers throughout New York City each day and on-
16 street charging stations and hubs make it easier
17 for deliveristas to complete their work and
18 overcome limited options over long shifts that can
19 exceed sometimes 12 hours a day and also with many
20 residential buildings banning mobility devices
21 with electric assist, many workers, on-street
22 charging may be their only feasible solution going
23 forward so we support Intro. 927. We recommend the
24 bill, though, include a mechanism for implementing

2 charging stations once the work of the task force
3 is completed.

4 The second thing that I want to talk
5 about is the question of street enforcement. We
6 really need to address the current inequities of
7 our city's bike infrastructure. In the 10 City
8 Council Districts with the highest number of
9 residents who people of color, there are 64
10 percent few streets with protected bike lanes, 64
11 percent few streets, and then in City Council
12 Districts where the majority of residents are
13 black, we see that figure being closer to 70
14 percent few streets with protected bike lanes. As
15 a result of this inequitable infrastructure, BIPOC
16 New Yorkers face the brunt of lack of safe street
17 measures...

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

19 SHAWN GARCIA: And are
20 disproportionately targeted for tickets and
21 arrests.

22 I just want to close out by saying
23 where we see the highest rates of people being
24 disproportionately hit with tickets for going on
25 sidewalks, we're seeing 90 percent of biking on

2 sidewalk tickets going to black and brown New
3 Yorkers, 90 percent, and these are the same
4 communities that don't have that bike
5 infrastructure that we are speaking about. In
6 places where we do see infrastructure implemented
7 like in the case of Prospect Park West, we saw a
8 reduction of 97 percent of ticketing happening so
9 it shows that it really does impact the community
10 and especially communities of color when we're
11 investing in bike infrastructure. I want to thank
12 you so much today.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thanks so
14 much, Shawn. It's good to see you.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BREIDBART: Thank you
16 so much. If we have inadvertently missed anyone
17 that is registered to testify today and has yet to
18 have been called, please use the Zoom hand
19 function if you're testifying remotely, and you'll
20 be called in the order that your hand is raised
21 and, if you're testifying in person and we have
22 not called you please come to the dais.

23 Seeing no one, I will now turn it over
24 to Chair Brooks-Powers for closing remarks.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. I
3 thank everyone who participated in today's very
4 important hearing. I look forward to continuing
5 the conversation.

6 With that, this Committee hearing is
7 adjourned. [GAVEL]

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 2, 2023