

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON
TRANSPORTATION AND
INFRASTRUCTURE

----- X

Monday, April 10, 2023
Start: 1:18 p.m.
Recess: 4:55 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Selvena N. Brooks-Powers,
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Joann Ariola
- Alexa Avilés
- David M. Carr
- Amanda Farías
- Ari Kagan
- Linda Lee
- Farah N. Louis
- Mercedes Narcisse
- Lincoln Restler
- Nantasha M. Williams
- Julie Won

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Eric Beaton
Deputy Commissioner
Transportation Planning and Management
NYC Department of Transportation

Charles Ukegbu
Assistant Commissioner
Regional and Strategic Planning
NYC Department of Transportation

Diniece Mendes
Director
Office of Freight Mobility
NYC Department of Transportation

Rick Rodriguez
Assistant Commissioner
Intergovernmental and Community Affairs
NYC Department of Transportation

Erik Worobey
Deputy Inspector
New York Police Department

Michael Clarke
Director
New York Police Department

Gloria Boyce Charles
Resident of Brookville Community

Sarah Elbakri
Community Resilience Coordinator
UPROSE!

Kevin Garcia
Transportation Planner
NYC Environmental Justice Alliance

Zach Miller
Metro Region Operations Manager
Trucking Association of New York

Lacey Tauber
Office of Brooklyn Borough President

Barbara Brown
Southeast Queens Community Task Force

Eric McClure
Executive Director
StreetsPAC

Joseph Fama
CEO
Empire Commercial Services

Christian Fama
Empire Commercial Services

Alex Stein
Resident of New York City

I.G. Don Terius[ph?]
Resident of New York City

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good afternoon and welcome to
3 today's New York City Council meeting on
4 transportation. At this time, please place your
5 electronic devices on vibrate or in silent mode, and
6 throughout the meeting please do not approach the
7 Dais. If you have a question, please approach one of
8 the Sergeant At Arms. Thank you chair you may begin.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Good afternoon and
10 thank you for joining today's hearing of the
11 Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure.
12 Today's hearing is about truck-- city truck routes, a
13 topic that affects all New Yorkers who rely on the
14 city's expansive truck routes to provide our
15 residents with food and important goods. The
16 trucking industry is also a driving force in our
17 city's economy providing good-paying jobs throughout
18 the five boroughs, including in my own district in
19 Southeast Queens.

20 During the height of the COVID 19 pandemic, truck
21 drivers and delivery workers were essential employees
22 who worked tirelessly to provide New Yorkers with our
23 essential food, household items, and medicine.
24 Before I begin, I would like to take a moment to
25 thank all these workers for their indispensable hard

2 work and dedication to helping all New Yorkers when
3 they needed it most.

4 Today, I would like the committee to bring
5 ongoing conversations within the trucking industry to
6 the forefront so that we can provide how the city
7 shares its roads and trucks. While not a reflection
8 on the individual truck drivers and delivery workers
9 I mentioned, trucking in the city can produce
10 negative consequences in our communities such as
11 traffic, noise, and pollution. Often these problems
12 disproportionately affect low-income and communities
13 of color, where high rates of respiratory illnesses
14 like asthma are common due to the emission of truck
15 exhausts in the air. This inequity is adversely
16 affecting New Yorkers including children throughout
17 the city, and sheds light on the need for mitigation
18 efforts in coordination with the communities most
19 affected. It is also affecting drivers themselves
20 who are forced to endure difficult and possibly
21 unhealthy working conditions.

22 Each year approximately 365 million tons of cargo
23 enter leave or pass through the city. Nearly 90% of
24 that cargo is being carried by trucks. By 2045, the
25 same proportion of cargo is expected to be delivered

1 by trucks, but the tonnage carried is expected to
2 increase by 68%.

3
4 Prior to the pandemic, and 2019 1.8 million
5 packages were delivered to New Yorkers on a typical
6 day, this number skyrocketed to 3.7 million packages
7 after the pandemic started, and it is likely to
8 increase due to consumer changes and e-commerce
9 shopping. Predictably, this high volume of
10 deliveries causes considerable congestion on city
11 streets. Lack of space for these vehicles can create
12 a situation where drivers have little choice but to
13 block car traffic, bus lanes, and bike lanes. This
14 creates a dangerous situation for pedestrians,
15 cyclists, and drivers which can ultimately undermine
16 the city's expansive investment into Vision Zero, and
17 the Department of Transportation's traffic mitigation
18 efforts. It also creates traffic delays for New
19 Yorkers during peak traffic hours, particularly
20 residents in transportation deserts such as my own
21 district, who often have no choice but to drive to
22 work. And yet the city's truck route has remained
23 largely unchanged since the 1970s.

24 The increase in deliveries has also exacerbated
25 the problem of overnight truck parking in residential

1 neighborhoods. While it is illegal to park a
2 commercial vehicle overnight on residential streets
3 in the city, residents in many neighborhoods
4 including those near major freight hubs, such as JFK
5 in my own district report that trucks are regularly
6 flouting that prohibition. This problem is in part
7 due to federal regulations, which requires drivers to
8 take mandatory tests, at which point they must pull
9 off the road in search of parking. Since the city
10 has an insufficient number of designated lots in
11 which they can park, truckers have often have no
12 choice but to park on residential streets, causing
13 congestion on streets and noise pollution from idling
14 vehicles.

15
16 It is my sincere desire to have a healthier and
17 more equitable city, one that provides a higher
18 quality of life for all New Yorkers. As such, it is
19 my hope today that the committee explores
20 comprehensive solutions to these trucking problems
21 that the city faces. It is important to create space
22 to see how this Council can use its legislative
23 muscle to drive this conversation along.

24 The difficulties we explore today are not new,
25 and it will take time to solve. However, our hearing

2 will allow stakeholders to discuss these issues while
3 allowing the Committee to hear several new bills.

4 Today we will hear from the Department of
5 Transportation, who will testify before the Committee
6 on truck routes within the city. The committee hopes
7 to hear what this Administration is doing to address
8 the issues I outlined, as well as updating us on the
9 city's off our delivery program, and the neighborhood
10 loading zone program.

11 We would also like an update on how the
12 Department of Transportation is working to improve
13 truck deliveries in the city, including what it may
14 have learned from former Mayor Bill de Blasio's
15 congestion action plan.

16 We also understand that were joined by members of
17 NYPD and we will have some questions in terms of
18 enforcement and resources as well.

19 Finally, I would also like the Administration to
20 address the work of the Southeast Queens Community
21 Task Force led by Southeast Queens community leaders
22 Bill Perkins, Barbara Brown, Gloria Bush-Hall, and
23 too many to name quite honestly, because it's really
24 a collective effort across Southeast Queens and in
25

1 the greater borough, to address environmental
2 concerns in Southeast Queens.

3
4 In addition to the oversight portion of today's
5 hearing, we are hearing several bills and a
6 resolution that seeks to improve the city's truck
7 route infrastructure. Intro Number 708 sponsored by
8 Councilmember Avilés, would require the Department of
9 Transportation to redesign the city's truck route
10 network to improve safety increased visibility,
11 reduce traffic congestion and emissions and reduce
12 vehicle miles traveled. DOT, in redesigning the
13 network, would be required to consult with the city
14 agencies, affected residents, and representatives
15 from business and environmental and climate justice
16 organizations, street safety organizations,
17 industrial business zone administrators, and the
18 trucking logistics and last-mile delivery industries.
19 Intro Number 708 would also require that the
20 Department of Transportation implement daylighting at
21 each intersection adjacent to the truck route
22 network, and review and replace truck route signage
23 where necessary.

24 Intro Number 906, sponsored by Councilmember
25 Brannan, would require an agency or office designated

2 by the Mayor to, by December 31, 2023, identify one
3 location in each borough where it would be feasible
4 and appropriate to create designated off-street
5 parking for tractor trailers. Intro number 906 would
6 require the designated agency or office to create
7 such parking by December 31, 2025. Intro Number 924,
8 sponsored by Councilmember Avilés, would require the
9 Department of Transportation to report on the utility
10 and feasibility of using street design as a means to
11 limit or reduce the use of streets in residential
12 districts by commercial vehicles by December 31,
13 2023. Resolution Number 460 sponsored by
14 Councilmember Fariás, a resolution calling on New
15 York State Legislature and Governor to fully fund the
16 MTA in the state's upcoming fiscal year 2024 budget,
17 in an effort to ensure that public transit riders
18 have effective affordable public transportation. The
19 MTA maintains fiscal stability in the face of a
20 looming fiscal cliff, and the MTA operate more
21 frequent buses and train service statewide.

22 We will now hear from several of the sponsors
23 regarding their bills beginning with Councilmember
24 Avilés on Intro 708 and Intro Number 924.

2 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Good afternoon. Thank you
3 Chair Brooks-Powers for this hearing today on Intro
4 708 and Intro 925, and thank you for your support on
5 these important pieces of legislation. I also want
6 to thank all of the last mile and environmental
7 justice advocates in the room today and online who
8 have been work-- who have worked tirelessly on this
9 issue, and whom I'm sure we will be hearing from
10 during public testimony today.

11 I represent Council District 38 in Brooklyn,
12 which encompasses a waterfront industrial business
13 zone. Since the pandemic our neighborhoods have
14 experienced a rapid proliferation of last-mile
15 logistics facilities, flooding our streets with
16 massive uptick in trucks, traffic, and air pollution
17 in what is already an Environmental Justice
18 Community.

19 In attempting to tackle this issue with our city
20 agencies, I have been told by many agencies that the
21 problems posed by last-mile logistics are too large
22 and complex. I reject that notion that our
23 communities must continue to suffer the ills of an
24 antiquated and racist land use policy simply because
25

2 we are unwilling to untangle the bureaucracy that we
3 have created.

4 While fixing the underlining systemic issues
5 requires a hard look at our city wide land use
6 policies, our communities cannot wait. There are
7 short-term measures we can undertake now that will at
8 least help mitigate further damage to our communities
9 and our health, and we are here today to discuss some
10 of those solutions.

11 Intro 708 requires that the Department of
12 Transportation redesign the existing truck route to
13 improve safety and reduce both traffic congestion and
14 emissions. It requires that the DOT undertake this
15 work under advisement from impacted residents,
16 environmental justice advocates, street safety
17 advocates, as well as those knowledgeable of the
18 trucking industry. In addition to this measure, we
19 must also look at how the existing network
20 contributes to unintended consequences, including
21 oversized trucks illegally using our residential
22 roadways, threatening our infrastructure, and our
23 safety.

24 It is not enough to say that improper roadway--
25 roadway use is a state enforcement issue. The city

2 must ask itself what is within our power to-- within
3 our power to protect our residents. It is no
4 surprise to me that the residents of Red Hook have
5 come up with solutions before our city agencies, and
6 that they are the inspiration of Intro 924. This
7 bill calls on DOT to report on the feasibility of
8 using Street design as a means to limit or reduce the
9 use of residential streets by commercial vehicles. I
10 look forward to hearing from the agency today on real
11 city-level solutions that can be implemented and that
12 will help protect our communities.

13 In closing, I would like to say that the days of
14 simply accepting the same old model of extraction is
15 over. Last-mile freight significantly contributes to
16 congestion not only in the neighborhoods I represent,
17 but citywide. Since the pandemic the rise of e-
18 commerce has required an additional 7800 freight
19 vehicles to be on the road each day in our city
20 streets. At eight hours a day, this means that we
21 are adding 60,000 vehicle hours each day to our
22 collective roads, are lungs, and Amazon is reaping
23 all of the profits as we suffer.

24 We cannot be a green city without looking at this
25 problem. It's all just talk if we allow large

2 corporations to continue to exploit our land with no
3 thought given to the impact on our residents. Our
4 communities can no longer bear the brunt of the
5 entire weight of rampant consumerism. We cannot be a
6 city that stands for justice and equity if we don't
7 take action now. It is time to update the policy,
8 the framework, and I want to thank you all for
9 hearing these important pieces of legislation and
10 discussing them. Thank you Chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you so much.

12 And we will next hear from Councilmember Amanda
13 Farías.

14 COUNCILMEMBER FARÍAS: Thank you Chair Brooks-
15 Powers for hosting today's important hearing.

16 Currently, New Yorkers are waiting anxiously to
17 see what the fate of our city will be in this year's-
18 - for this year as we watch for the state's budget to
19 be finalized. Our neighbors and advocates across the
20 state, with the leadership of Senator Andrew
21 Gounardes and Assemblymember Zohran Mamdani have been
22 calling on the Governor to fully fund the MTA, and
23 prioritize our working-class New Yorkers who run the
24 city.

2 The City Council is full of dedicated transit
3 advocates, many who are sitting with me here today.
4 With this resolution, we are sending a strong message
5 to Governor Hochul that New Yorkers are in critical
6 need for more reliable public transportation, and we
7 have to do everything we can to make that a reality.

8 That is why I'm proud to be a primary sponsor of
9 resolution 460, and I thank all my colleagues who
10 have signed on this far. I look forward to
11 discussing the importance of it more in today's
12 hearing.

13 I'd also like to say that much of our city's
14 traffic infrastructure was built for the reliance of
15 cars and trucks to bring our communities together.
16 And I'm excited about hearing intro 708 and 924
17 today. With-- with the current infrastructure that
18 we have that's narrow-sighted, has made my community
19 along with many other citywide severely impacted by
20 health implications from congestion, car and truck
21 idling, and by more trucks on our local streets.
22 Residents are not only seeing high asthma rates, but
23 see their commutes prolonged with trucks obstructing
24 roadways, blocking visibility to crosswalks for
25 pedestrians, and taking much needed parking spots as

2 they continue to park on residential streets
3 overnight.

4 We have to redesign the city's outdated truck
5 route infrastructure to improve safety, quality of
6 life and reduce emissions throughout the city. We
7 cannot continue to be reactive when our trucks get
8 stuck on their train platforms and park illegally in
9 our neighborhoods. We need a proactive plan from the
10 administration and the DOT. That is why my
11 colleagues and I are working to pass Intro 708 and
12 924 to redesign the truck route network, and
13 officially put an end to decades of environmental and
14 community injustices actively committed against our
15 black, Latino, and AAPI neighborhoods in our outer
16 boroughs. Thank you for allowing me time.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you so much for
18 that. And I know some folks may be wondering why the
19 MTA Reso, but it is timely right now as Albany
20 continues to work to pass its budget. And so thank
21 you so much Councilmember Farías for pushing this
22 important piece of legislation forward.

23 Today we are joined by Councilmembers Louis,
24 Farías, Lee, Narcisse, Restler, Williams, Won, Carr,
25 Ariola, Kagan, and Avilés.

2 We now turn over to testimony. I look forward to
3 hearing from the city Administration, advocates, and
4 members of the public regarding-- regarding the
5 oversight and legislation at this hearing.

6 I want to thank my staff and committee staff as
7 well for their hard work. Samuel Breitbart, Counsel
8 to the Committee, Kevin Kotowski, Senior Policy
9 Analyst, John Basille, Senior Policy Analyst, Jorge
10 Munez Reyes, Communications, Jack Siegenthaler, my
11 Policy and Budget Director, and Renee Taylor, my
12 Chief Of Staff.

13 I will now acts the Committee Council to go over
14 some procedural items and swear in the
15 representatives for DOT.

16 COUNSEL: Thank you Chair. I'm Sam Breitbart
17 Counsel to the Transportation and Infrastructure
18 Committee of the New York City Council. Our first
19 witnesses will be from the Department of
20 Transportation: Eric Beaton, Deputy Commissioner for
21 Transportation Planning and Management, Charles
22 Ukegbu, Assistant Commissioner for Regional and
23 Strategic Planning, Diniece Mendes, Director of the
24 Office of Freight Mobility, and Rick Rodriguez,

2 Assistant Commissioner for Intergovernmental and
3 Community Affairs.

4 And we're also joined by from the NYPD, Deputy
5 Inspector Erik Worobey and Director Michael Clarke.

6 I will now administer the oath. Please raise
7 your right hands.

8 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth,
9 and nothing but the truth before this committee, and
10 to respond honestly to councilmember questions?

11 ALL: I do.

12 COUNSEL: Thank you, you may begin when ready.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Good afternoon,
14 Chair Brooks-Powers and members of the Committee on
15 Transportation and Infrastructure. I am Eric Beaton,
16 Deputy Commissioner for Transportation Planning and
17 Management at DOT. With me today are Charles Ukegbu,
18 Assistant Commissioner for Regional and Strategic
19 Planning, Diniece Mendes, Director of the Office of
20 Freight Mobility, and Rick Rodriguez, Assistant
21 Commissioner for Intergovernmental and Community
22 Affairs. We are also joined by Deputy Inspector Erik
23 Worobey and Director Michael Clarke from the New York
24 City Police Department.

2 Thank you for the opportunity to testify on
3 behalf of Mayor Adams and Commissioner Rodriguez, on
4 the administration's freight vision and the city's
5 truck route network.

6 In recent decades, New York City has experienced
7 record growth in terms of population, jobs, and
8 commerce. Our complex freight network, with trucks
9 delivering 90% of our goods has played a critical
10 role in this growth. The growth of e-commerce, which
11 was accelerated by the COVID-19 pandemic, has
12 dramatically increased freight volumes not only
13 between businesses but to our residences as well.

14 More than 80% of New Yorkers receive at least one
15 package at home each week, and 18% receive packages
16 on four or more days per week, leading to an increase
17 in delivery vehicles on city streets.

18 Between January 2020 and December 2021 we
19 estimated that freight traffic across the Hudson
20 River increased by over 50%, and we expect that the
21 amount of freight that the amount of freight will
22 continue increasing. Earlier estimates projected
23 regional freight movement growth of 68% between 2012
24 and 2045.

2 To respond and prepare for this growth, DOT is
3 undertaking a number of initiatives with our partners
4 in and out of government to transform the way freight
5 moves throughout the city. This includes developing
6 "Delivery New York, a Smart Truck Management Plan for
7 New York City," which lays out the city's freight
8 vision. We have also identified opportunities and
9 strategies to build on EDCs Freight NYC Plan with our
10 report, "Delivering Green, a Vision for A Sustainable
11 Freight Network Serving New York City," and
12 coordinate with New York State's Freight
13 Transportation Plan. These initiatives focus on
14 managing demand, enhancing safety, network
15 connectivity, curb access, and promoting sustainable
16 last-mile delivery.

17 To manage demand, the city supports off our
18 deliveries through DOTs Off-Hour Deliveries Program.
19 Launched in 2019, the program encourages goods
20 delivery during the off-peak hours of 7 p.m. to 6
21 a.m. in busy parts of the city. Off-hour deliveries
22 reduce congestion, improve bus speeds, and decrease
23 the opportunity for conflicts with pedestrians and
24 cyclists.

2 With participation at over 1,100 business
3 locations citywide DOT continues to explore new ways
4 to expand the program. DOT also aims to manage
5 demand and reduce truck congestion through piloting
6 the adoption of microhubs, or spaces on or off
7 street, where goods are loaded from larger freight
8 vehicles to smaller, low-or-no emission vehicles, or
9 human powered modes such as cargo bikes or hand carts
10 for final delivery.

11 In compliance with Local Law 166 of 2021, DOT
12 issued a request for expressions of interest to seek
13 feedback on challenges and opportunities for pursuing
14 microhubs. DOT will establish a pilot program to
15 support the creation, operation, and expansion of
16 microhubs this summer, as detailed in our report
17 released last week.

18 DOT also works to enhance safety, network
19 connectivity, and curb access for trucks. The agency
20 does this through truck route management, redesigning
21 streets to reduce conflicts, expanding loading zones,
22 and engaging on truck safety, education, outreach,
23 and partnerships.

24 I want to take a moment to explain what a truck
25 crew is, since we understand that it can be a

2 concerning designation. Our truck route rules are
3 meant to keep truck drivers on truck routes until
4 they are as close as possible to their final
5 destination. In areas where we do not have truck
6 routes, truck drivers can still travel to get to
7 their final destinations, but may do so on any street
8 that provides a direct connection without regard to
9 the size or land use on that street, and will do so
10 as they serve homes and businesses all over the city.
11 A truck route is really a restriction to minimize the
12 negative effects of truck traffic by limiting what
13 roads trucks can use to get close to the stores,
14 restaurants, and homes that need them.

15 The city's truck route network established in the
16 1970s and with small updates in 2015 and 2018, has
17 not been substantially updated to reflect changes in
18 residential and commercial land use patterns, the
19 transportation network, and delivery patterns from e-
20 commerce. The Administration supports changes to
21 update the truck route network to make sure that
22 communities are appropriately protected from truck
23 traffic, and removing designations or inappropriate
24 or redundant.

2 DOT also redesigned streets to reduce conflicts
3 between trucks and other modes, increase
4 predictability of movements, and improve visibility
5 of vulnerable road users. For example, our redesign
6 of 34th Avenue in Queens both physically restricts
7 the ability of trucks to make through trips and adds
8 loading zones on cross streets. To provide delivery
9 alternatives. In another example, DOT completed a
10 major redesign of the 20th Street local truck route
11 in Brooklyn by creating a new protected bike lane
12 connection, increasing pedestrian space, and calming
13 traffic, along with a one-way conversion. This
14 reason redesign creates a safer, more reliable
15 connection for cyclists, pedestrians, and truck
16 drivers alike.

17 We also work directly with the trucking industry
18 by education and outreach to help keep our streets
19 safe. Last year, DOT launched a recurring truck
20 smart campaign to encourage and promote the safe
21 operation of trucks on New York City streets,
22 leveraging social media channels, billboards, PSA
23 videos, radio communications, reaching over 1.5
24 million impressions. The agency continues to expand
25 the number of designated parking spaces for loading

2 to reduce double parking, and to keep bike and bus
3 lanes clear. Last week DOT released the Loading Zone
4 Report required by Local Law 168 of 2021. DOT has
5 developed the required methodology based on
6 population density, land use, and the number of
7 existing loading zones that we use to determine where
8 loading zones are necessary to enhance safety and
9 reduce traffic congestion.

10 Since the beginning of 2020, DOT installed over
11 2000 loading zones citywide. Going forward, we will
12 continue to install loading zones, prioritizing zones
13 on transit corridors, bike corridors, and street
14 improvement projects and other safety redesigns, and
15 corridors with high volumes of double-parking
16 violations and crashes involving double parked
17 trucks, as well as in response to requests from
18 communities, businesses, and elected officials.

19 DOT also works to promote sustainable last-mile
20 delivery through a number of programs. With the
21 commercial cargo bike program, DOT incentivizes
22 adoption of sustainable and efficient freight
23 delivery by making designated loading and unloading
24 space available for cargo bikes on the street. The
25 program has grown to seven participating companies

2 and over 400 cargo bikes. Cargo bikes can load and
3 unload wherever commercial vehicles can and are
4 exempt from parking meter payment. DOT is also
5 pursuing rule and legislative changes to make the
6 program permanent and remove legal barriers to expand
7 the use of cargo bikes, including supporting S1975,
8 A3874, sponsored by Senator Ramos and Assemblymember
9 Jackson, which would increase the legal widths of
10 cargo bikes to allow more efficient, ergonomic, and
11 readily available designs.

12 DOT and EDC have jointly launched the blue
13 highways program to evaluate marine-free highway
14 development, and encourage the use of New York City's
15 waterways to move goods into and around the city.
16 The city will be releasing an RFEI later this year to
17 better understand industry challenges and
18 opportunities, including ways to implement and
19 support businesses engaging in marine freight
20 operations and supporting infrastructure.

21 Trucks will continue to be a part of the delivery
22 mix in New York City, and so we are committed to
23 making sure that trucks on our streets are as safe
24 and sustainable as possible. One example of our work
25 here is the New York City Clean Truck Program,

2 through which DOT offers rebate incentives to truck
3 owners to replace or retrofit their diesel trucks
4 with alternative fuel or zero emissions trucks. The
5 program is focused on trucks in industrial business
6 zones located near environmental justice communities
7 that have historically been subjected to a
8 disproportionate amount of diesel exhaust emissions.

9 Another example is our work with EDC to develop a
10 citywide freight decarbonization and truck
11 electrification strategy, including developing design
12 plans to install a network of up to 100 publicly-
13 accessible truck charger stations.

14 The city has also long been a leader in requiring
15 side guards and other safety technology, and will
16 continue to work with our state and federal partners
17 to make additional safety technology mandatory.

18 Now turning to the bills before the committee
19 today, first Intro 708 sponsored by Councilmember
20 Avilés, which would require a truck redesign.

21 As I discussed earlier, the administration
22 supports making revisions to our truck routes, and
23 supports the portion of the bill that will require a
24 truck route redesign. To respond to several other
25 elements of the bill, the bill would mandate initial

2 and final reports on proposed changes with public
3 comment requirements. Our current process for making
4 changes to the truck route network, however, already
5 has its own hearing and public comment process as
6 required by the City Administrative Procedures Act
7 known as CAPA. While we value public input, we
8 should ensure that the legislation creates a process
9 that comports with CAPA. The bill would also require
10 DOT to implement daylighting at each intersection
11 adjacent to the truck route network. We have found
12 daylighting valuable in some places, but not in
13 others, and it is critical that DOT retain the
14 discretion to determine where to use it.

15 Next on intro 906, sponsored by Councilmember
16 Brennan, which would require an agency or office
17 designated by the Mayor to identify one location in
18 each borough where it would be feasible and
19 appropriate to create designated off-street parking
20 for tractor trailers, and establish such parking by
21 the end of 2025.

22 After hearing from elected officials and the
23 community about overnight truck parking concerns, the
24 city kicked off a multiagency Overnight Trucking Task
25 Force. This task force consists of multiple mayor's

2 offices, NYPD, DSNY, DOT, EDC, DCAS, City Planning,
3 and the Sheriff's office.

4 The goal of the task force is to come up with
5 long-term sustainable solutions to this issue, as
6 enforcement is only part of the solution. The task
7 force is using data analysis and mapping to identify
8 the areas with the highest incidence and potential
9 sites for truck parking. The group also conducted a
10 community survey to better understand the problem.
11 Thanks in part to our partners in the Council who
12 helped promote the survey, you received over 2000
13 individual responses. The administration plans to
14 announce more detailed recommendations this spring.
15 We agree that off street parking is an important part
16 of solving this problem, and we look forward to
17 discussing the bill further with the Council.

18 Next Intro 924, sponsored by Councilmember
19 Avilés. This bill would require DOT to study street
20 design as a means to limiting or reducing the use of
21 streets in residential neighborhoods by commercial
22 vehicles. As described earlier, DOT has a robust
23 toolbox that encourages safe operation of vehicles
24 including trucks. Part of the challenge is that on
25 many streets, trucks are delivering packages, picking

2 up waste, delivering oil, and otherwise supporting
3 residential neighborhoods. While we agree with the
4 intent of this bill, we are concerned that the
5 additional effort and report writing would be better
6 spent focusing on solutions in specific locations.

7 In conclusion, I would like to thank the Council
8 for the opportunity to testify today. We look
9 forward to working together to create a safer, more
10 sustainable, and efficient freight system that grows
11 the economy, supports freight-related jobs, and
12 delivers the goods that residents and businesses
13 need. We now welcome your questions.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for that.
15 Once again, I'm going to request that the
16 Administration provide testimony in advance of our
17 hearings. It's very difficult for us to prepare to
18 have a thoughtful conversation when we're getting the
19 testimony as we're sitting down at our seats, to
20 listen and digest this information. I made this
21 request before and I hope that it is heard. Thank
22 you.

23 So let's start with general truck and freight
24 trends. Each year about 365 million tons of cargo
25

2 enter, leave, and pass through New York City with 89%
3 of it being carried by truck.

4 In 2045, the same proportion of cargo is expected
5 to be delivered by truck, but the tonnage is expected
6 to increase by 68% to 548 million tons. How does the
7 Department of Transportation monitor truck and
8 freight trends in New York City, and are the
9 projections discussed above accurate as of 2023?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure, and I'm going
11 to ask my colleague Diniece Mendes to speak to it a
12 little bit too.

13 But we know that the current situation is already
14 problematic, and we know that growth will only become
15 worse. And so we are putting a lot of effort into
16 making sure that we're monitoring what is happening
17 on our streets today through-- we use-- we collect
18 data from a lot of different sources. We do public
19 surveys. We monitor what's happening on our streets.
20 And we know that we do need to make changes to make
21 sure that the future is not just filled with trucks.

22 But I'd like to turn it over to Diniece to talk
23 about all the different ways we collect that data and
24 use it.

2 MS. MENDES: Thank you Eric, and thank you Chair
3 for the question. So the stats that you pointed out
4 are accurate, and we continue to monitor and collect
5 data moving forward to make sure that were keeping
6 abreast of the changes.

7 As you can understand this is a very dynamic
8 situation, particularly after the COVID-19 pandemic,
9 where we saw just a more dramatic shift to
10 residential areas in terms of increased deliveries.

11 We typically look at truck volume crossings on
12 our major bridges and highways as additional pulse,
13 and we also look at anonymized GPS data to look at
14 origin and destination trends to see where the major
15 hubs in particular are attracting areas that are
16 generating a lot of freight activity.

17 Our most recent reports show that about 120,000
18 trucks cross New York City boundaries on a daily
19 basis, and that particularly fluctuates throughout
20 the year. But that's a general average of truck
21 trips.

22 And then more generally, the average truck trips
23 throughout a-- in a traffic stream can average
24 between 8% to 12% of the traffic stream.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for that.

3 And when you say that you know changes are needed to
4 be made, what has DOT done to date to be able to
5 bring about these changes?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure. And we've
7 really put a lot of effort into building our freight
8 program over the years. One that I'll highlight
9 really is our off-hour deliveries program that a few
10 years ago didn't exist at all, and has since signed
11 up over 1100 businesses that have agreed to move
12 their deliveries from daytime to nighttime in the
13 busiest parts of the city. We also really put a lot
14 of effort into installing loading zones. And I think
15 our focus on loading zones has really changed in
16 recent years too. Loading zones used to be something
17 that was really limited to our commercial and
18 industrial parts of the city, which used to receive
19 the vast majority of deliveries. Over the recent
20 years and particularly accelerated by the pandemic,
21 we've seen a much larger increase in residential
22 deliveries, where now the majority of deliveries are
23 made on our residential blocks. And that has
24 resulted in double parking, and other-- and blocked
25 bus stops and fire hydrants and other things that we

2 don't want to see. So with the development of our
3 neighborhood loading zone program, we've started to
4 install those on residential blocks as well to make
5 sure that those deliveries can happen in ways that
6 are not impacting the community in bad ways. So we
7 have a very large and diverse program, lots of pieces
8 of which we've talked about here, but happy to go
9 into more detail, into any-- that you would like more
10 on.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. Just
12 staying in line with the trucking freight trends:
13 How many packages are expected to engineer exceed
14 daily this year, up or down from the 3.6 million per
15 day in March 20-- per day in March 22? Like is it
16 going to be more or less than, that you feel the
17 packages are expected to enter to New York City?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Well, the trend in
19 recent years has only been in one direction, which is
20 up and up. You know there's obviously some-- some
21 limit to that, but we haven't hit it yet. I mean, we
22 do think that those package deliveries are part of
23 what's making New York City a livable place right
24 now; that in a lot of communities it may be the best
25

2 way to-- to get goods and part of what makes living
3 in parts of the city more affordable.

4 But we know that it comes with a balance, and
5 that more and more deliveries, even if it works for
6 an individual, don't always work for a community.
7 And that's part of what our job is, is to make sure
8 that New Yorkers are getting what they want and what
9 they need, but that it's happening in a way that
10 isn't overly burdening any part of the city.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And how has DOT
12 factored in these projections and implemented
13 policies regarding trucking in New York City?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Right. So, I mean,
15 this is what we're here to do, is to make sure that
16 we are taking into that into account and making
17 changes. You know, we can't control whether a truck
18 is going to enter the city. You know, there's a
19 large interstate commerce system, and if a truck
20 wants to come in we can't stop it at the border. But
21 we can provide the right rules and incentives to make
22 sure that the trucks that do come in are doing it in
23 the most safe and sustainable way possible.

24 So we want fewer truck miles on our streets. One
25 of the goals of our microhub program is-- is that

2 trucks are not driving around and around
3 neighborhoods, going 20 feet and going around the
4 corner, and going another 20 feet to make deliveries.
5 We want the truck to arrive and stop, and then make
6 that final delivery by foot, by bike, by some more
7 sustainable mode and therefore reduce the amount of
8 total miles on our streets. We want to provide these
9 incentives to make truckers do the right thing.

10 MS. MENDES: I'd also add that, as you've heard
11 in testimony today, there's no one-size-fits-all. We
12 really have to tackle this problem across all
13 elements and really thinking about a holistic
14 approach with the different strategies. So you've
15 heard Eric also highlight the goods movement by
16 water, really trying to reduce that demand on our
17 infrastructure, while also better managing the trucks
18 that do remain on our streets.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. I want to
20 talk about truck routes next. How many miles of
21 roads long is the New York City Truck route network?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So we currently have
23 about 1300 miles of truck routes in New York City.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And when was the last
25 time the New York City Truck route map was updated?

2 MS. MENDES: So the map was last updated 2022.
3 But the latest rules, in terms of the truck route
4 network, was updated in 2018.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What were the main
6 updates?

7 MS. MENDES: In 2022, or 2018?

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: The one that had the-
9 - the significant amount of updates to it.

10 MS. MENDES: In 2018, the rules were to provide
11 expanded access for sealed ocean container terminal
12 container-- containers to come in from-- from New
13 Jersey through Staten Island to the Global Container
14 Terminal. So that was a very minor change.

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: And just to be clear
16 that, in our view that the truck route network has
17 not had a major change since it was created in the
18 1970s. There have been a number of minor edits over
19 the years to accommodate very specific issues. But
20 the network as it exists in our rules is very, very
21 similar to how it was first created.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: That's where I was
23 going to go with this. I'm glad you clarified that,
24 because I know by all accounts from DOT, publicly it
25 has been that it's been since the 1970s. But when

2 you talk about 2018 expanded access, what does that
3 mean exactly?

4 MS. MENDES: So particularly, there were some
5 challenges and really on the sort of the operational
6 burden for freight coming into-- from New Jersey to
7 the Global Container Terminal in Staten Island that
8 really put New York City at a competitive
9 disadvantage for bringing goods into the region. So
10 we worked across lines with the Port Authority of New
11 York and New Jersey as well to advance these rules
12 that allowed the sealed ocean container terminals to
13 come across the Goethals, through-- to go to the
14 Global Container Terminal without the need of a
15 permit.

16 So the footprint of the rules that were advanced
17 did not add any additional miles to the truck road
18 network. But it designated a particular route that
19 the sealed ocean container terminals can access from
20 the Goethals Bridge to the Global Container Terminal.
21 And these are larger vehicles, over 80,000 pounds, et
22 cetera.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And when that edit
24 was made, was there any consultation with the
25 impacted communities?

2 MS. MENDES: We held our CAPA hearing, we worked
3 very closely with the Staten Island community.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: You said the capital
5 hearing you said?

6 MS. MENDES: I'm sorry, the CAPA process, the
7 Citywide Administrative Procedural Act, which is
8 typically what we need to use for advancing
9 rulemaking, which requires a public hearing.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sorry, if you could
11 talk louder into the mic, because I was having a hard
12 time hearing you. So that's why I was asking.

13 MS. MENDES: I'm not sure, is it--

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: But I think it's the
15 construction possibly. But I heard you just now.

16 MS. MENDES: Okay.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And when you said it
18 was the capital hearing--

19 MS. MENDES: CAPA.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: CAPA. Okay.

21 MS. MENDES: C-A-P-A. Sorry.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay. And was that
23 held within the communities that were affected?
24 Where was that meeting held?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So the hearing
3 itself was held in downtown Manhattan, but we did do
4 outreach in the area. That particular rule change
5 happens to be in a very specific industrial area,
6 immediately adjacent to the Goethals Bridge. So
7 there isn't-- there isn't like a residential
8 community that's directly affected, but we did work
9 with the local stakeholders in developing the
10 specific route.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And then, just--
12 Didn't I hear you when you spoke about it in 2022,
13 what some of those changes were?

14 MS. MENDES: Yeah. So that was specifically an
15 update to the map itself that we publish, and put on
16 our website. And the map included additional
17 information about new rules on the back of the map,
18 which is mainly our critical publication that we give
19 to truck drivers. And we also work with PD to hand
20 that out to truck drivers when they're doing
21 enforcement. We also included information about low-
22 clearance structures. I remember that Councilmember
23 Fariás mentioned hitting MTA structures and things
24 like that. So we included more information for truck
25

2 drivers to make more informed decisions about which
3 routes they choose.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And what types of
5 issues are-- And I'm going to come back in terms of
6 the information that the truck drivers get, but just
7 staying in line with this right now, what type of
8 issues are considered when making changes to the New
9 York City Truck route map? How are like safety,
10 equity, and health concerns considered?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah, and it's a
12 good question. And it's-- it's one-- I can talk
13 about how we will think about it, but like, the
14 honest answer is we haven't done a lot of work on
15 this in the past. And it's something that we-- we
16 agree we should be doing. But we use a lot of the
17 data that Diniece talked about, including, you know,
18 the looking at origins and destinations, where trucks
19 are really trying to get to, and then trying to look
20 at, which are the streets that are least impactful on
21 neighborhoods, and helping the trucks get there?

22 So we, you know, if there's a port facility or an
23 industrial business zone, we know that trucks are
24 going to be traveling there, but we want to make sure
25 that they're on streets that are really appropriate

2 for trucks, and wherever possible through other
3 industrial or commercial neighborhoods, wherever
4 possible on wider streets, not narrower streets, in
5 trying to find you know-- not that any street wants
6 more trucks, but trying to find the places that are
7 least impactful. So we will want to do that, and
8 want to do it while also making sure that we have a
9 cohesive network, right? It doesn't make any sense
10 of the truck route is on street one on in this area.
11 And then street four in this area, with the trucks
12 having to travel in between. The network does need
13 to connect to itself in reasonable ways, and we just--
14 - we want to find the best streets on which to do
15 that.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And would you be
17 willing to work with myself and my colleagues to make
18 sure that this is happening?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure. Absolutely.
20 We think that local input with you know, from
21 yourselves from other community members is going to
22 be very important to make sure that people both
23 understand what we're doing and why. But also so
24 that we get appropriate feedback on-- on the issues
25 and concerns that they have.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And with the-- the
3 change of the in those two years that you mentioned,
4 or just in general since 1970, has the map changed to
5 reflect the increase in e-commerce and the increased
6 need for trucks to move along routes previously only
7 designed for smaller vehicles? And if so how?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So the answer is the
9 map has not changed very much. Now we-- as Diniece
10 said, we've made specific changes in response to
11 specific issues like the Global Container Terminal,
12 but the map is very similar. And we think taking a
13 fresh look in light of-- of changing delivery
14 patterns makes sense.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What triggered those
16 changes? So you said that it was specific to the
17 need or recognizing the need, but what actually
18 triggers that action from DOT currently?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yep. So they're
20 initiated by us, but they request comes from
21 different places. I don't know if you want to talk
22 about the Global Container Terminal, or Charles,
23 maybe?

24 MR. UKEBU: Yup. Let me speak to some of the
25 factors. We have to recognize that the industry

2 itself is changing. In the 50s, you had the advent
3 of the containers that came in as a new means of
4 moving goods in a secure way and a safe way.

5 Well, one of the challenges we had here is that
6 as we got into the 70s and 80s, and even as recently
7 as 2015, we had to reconfigure access to, most of you
8 know, about 53 foot trailers. So it's not that the
9 roads had to be-- but we had to do re-designate,
10 knowing that destinations here or there, the
11 destination near the JFK area is a very important
12 destination, and you have to move goods to Long
13 Island. So we had to re-designate and work through
14 the federal process that's supposed to permit
15 interstate commerce to ensure that cross-- access
16 from Long Island Expressway into JFK Airport, going
17 across all the way north to Whitestone Bridge, Throgs
18 Neck Bridge, going to George Washington Bridge so
19 that containers can come in into our area. That's
20 one industry trend.

21 The other industry trend we're seeing really has
22 to do with given the nature of the vehicles
23 themselves. We're trying to ensure that-- Diniece
24 already spoke about the Global Container Terminal.
25 This really is sealed ocean containers that make our

2 whole metropolitan area, our port area more
3 competitive, and save jobs in the Staten Island
4 community, and in fact all over the city. So we had
5 to accommodate that so as to remain competitive.

6 There are other industry changes that are
7 happening that relate to even the nature of the
8 breakbulk function that happens with these truckers.
9 For example, they load pods into these-- whether it's
10 containers and sometimes into trucks, and they want
11 to move these as units, as secure units. Most of us
12 have seen packages that come to our neighborhood.
13 And you have these little containers that-- they are
14 basically pre sorted, and they are being moved to
15 particular dest-- well, in this case, we talk about
16 zip codes for the US Postal Service. In some cases,
17 it's actually sorted on the basis of neighborhoods,
18 at the block-by-block level.

19 So now we have our buildings with our high
20 density, multiple units in a particular area. That
21 means they have to service different apartments,
22 different-- in some cases, you have businesses at the
23 bottom.

24 I've said all this to say there's the industry,
25 but there's also the demand side, which is the

2 buildings and where the people live, and we-- our job
3 is to balance that and ensure that the routes that we
4 have will accommodate the businesses that need to get
5 to any one of these locations.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for that.
7 And Local Law 189 required a DOT report to the
8 Council, in which DOT committed to developing
9 guidance for implementing a delivery service plan and
10 partnership with building and property owners. Does
11 New York City have a delivery service plan? If so,
12 can you provide us with more information on how the
13 plan was developed and how it will be implemented?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yep. So I think
15 we'll-- we'll get back to you on that. The-- I think
16 it was really DCAS that was tasked with the activity,
17 Citywide Administrative Services. We of course,
18 supported them. But I don't think we have the
19 details on the final results here.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay. The truck
21 routes disproportionately burden environmental
22 justice communities. We know that emissions from
23 trucks contribute to respiratory illness in
24 communities adjacent to the truck route, or where
25 trucks frequently idle. Has DOT worked with the New

2 York City Health + Hospitals to do an air quality
3 study along the truck route?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So we do work
5 closely with-- with Health + Hospitals. When they
6 collect data, we look at how that relates not just to
7 truck routes, specifically, but even to you know, to
8 environmental justice communities and industrial
9 business zones.

10 But you know, I think what we've been really
11 focusing on is trying to get the trucks on our street
12 to be as-- as few as possible, and then the ones that
13 are there as polluting as little as possible. And
14 maybe Charles, you could talk a little bit about the
15 Clean Trucks Program that really focuses on those
16 communities.

17 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: Yes. One of the
18 examples of-- in fact, it is actually a pioneering
19 example of where we took an initiative to target a
20 particular community that we knew, or had reports of
21 significant health impacts, that some of which--

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Which community?

23 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: That'll be the
24 Hunts Point and Mott Haven communities in the South
25 Bronx. So we have the New York City Clean Trucks

2 actually initially was the Hunts Point Clean Trucks
3 Program, by which we provided incentives to companies
4 that are registered in that particular zip code, and
5 we used-- we gave them incentives, basically giving a
6 rebate for them to purchase and get rid of the older,
7 more polluting engines, and ensure that these
8 committees vehicles will access those communities at
9 the-- at least every two weeks, they must come in
10 there. So we know that the benefits are accruing to
11 those when we change these trucks to cleaner, burning
12 diesel engines, newer engines. Most of them are
13 2020-- 2012 or newer engines.

14 We also encouraged them to transition to electric
15 vehicles, you know, which are really clean burning.
16 So far, we had-- as of 2015 we had done 500 such
17 retrofits. At this point, I think we're at about 600
18 or so engines that we have removed of the roadways.

19 But I said as a general effort, we're also doing
20 the Cross Bronx Expressway study, which-- which we'll
21 call actually the reimagining the Cross Bronx
22 Expressway, which is ongoing at this time to do a
23 whole revisioning of that whole corridor to figure
24 out how best we can reconnect communities, ensure
25 that we provide incentives to clean the trucks that

2 are running on that on that highway, and at the same
3 time work with the community to ensure that other
4 health ailments-- and by the way, the Department of
5 Health is a partner on the Cross Bronx Expressway
6 with State DOT, Department of City Planning, and the
7 city DOT.

8 So there are multiple ways by which we're working
9 with the Department of Health. We recognize the
10 deleterious effects of trucks. But it's only one
11 component of those health effects. And that's what
12 we have been schooled by the Department of Health,
13 and that's the way to address the issue.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And would DOT be open
15 to doing such a study? An air quality study?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah, I think we'd
17 want to know more about the specifics of what you're
18 looking for. But we agree that air quality is one of
19 the major issues around truck traffic and
20 environmental justice communities. So, you know, I
21 think as I mentioned my testimony, we're always
22 inclined towards action rather than just study. But
23 to the extent that more data can help support the
24 action--

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I feel the same, but
3 I know the data is what informs the actions most of
4 the time with DOT, or that's at least what you all
5 testify most of the time.

6 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: Can I just add to
7 that?

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sure.

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: I think--
10 Especially to that issue, the Clean Trucks Program
11 really was actually following the data. We knew that
12 the Hunts Point Community was one of those areas, or
13 is one of those areas that has three times or more,
14 based on the Health Department data, of asthma
15 hospitalizations in the area.

16 So when we applied for this project, it was based
17 on that-- that statistic, working with Community
18 Board 2 in South Bronx, and I think Councilmember
19 Salamanca was working in that area.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Yup. I was there
21 last week.

22 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: Great.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: There's a lot of work
24 to be done. There's a lot of truck congestion in
25 that area, as well as Councilmember Farías's district

2 with the major thruways that go through that
3 district.

4 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: Yes. And to the
5 data that you pointed to: We also are expanding this
6 study to-- I'm sorry, this project to all citywide
7 effort, because we did get VW Settlement money. By
8 which-- It was in 2020, we expanded the whole
9 initiative to-- to make sure that all industrial
10 business zones in the city, most of which are
11 adjacent to environmental justice communities, based
12 on New York State Department of Environmental
13 Conservation EJ criteria. So it makes them eligible
14 for this. So we are really-- This is a very
15 effective program. We can-- We would like to discuss
16 more if necessary.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And when the truck
18 route changes, like as you're looking at this now,
19 there'll be legacy effects on those streets that were
20 a part of the old truck route? Those streets may
21 need repaving or other remediation. How will the
22 Department of Transportation make sure that such
23 remediation takes place?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah. It's a great
25 question, and something that that we think is

2 critically important is that as we look at the truck
3 route network, it won't just be about making, you
4 know, changes to the rules and in the rulebook, but
5 we do have to look at the specific streets and make
6 sure that they are designed appropriately.

7 Whether it's a street that we're adding a truck
8 route, or a street that we're removing a truck route,
9 you know, whether it needs new safety features,
10 whether it needs resurfacing, you know, it could be
11 that some of them need a full reconstruction that we
12 would pursue with DDC, that making sure that those
13 streets are capable of handling trucks, or are
14 designed to discourage trucks where appropriate.
15 Like that's-- that's part of it. It's not just about
16 the rule. It's about the looking at the design and
17 the communications at the same time.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. Next I
19 want to talk about parking for trucks. So the
20 increase in deliveries has exacerbated the problem of
21 overnight truck parking in residential neighborhoods.
22 Not only does it lead to unsafe conditions for all
23 road users, it can also cause increased traffic
24 congestion, increased emissions, and noise pollution

2 for idling vehicles, particularly in outer borough
3 neighborhoods near major freight hubs.

4 What type of planning is DOT doing to ensure that
5 there's an adequate amount of parking spaces for
6 trucks, and has DOT applied for recently announced
7 federal grants to assist with truck parking?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure. And we
9 totally agree that this has become a much more
10 serious issue in recent years, particularly with some
11 of the federal law changes around hours of service
12 rules. We have seen, you know, in Southeast Queens,
13 Southern Brooklyn, large parts of the Bronx, you
14 know, not a comprehensive list by any means. And it-
15 - We know that it goes beyond DOT, or beyond DOT and
16 NYPD, because we can't enforce our way out of the
17 issue, although enforcement is a piece of it. It's
18 why we've really brought together this citywide task
19 force that includes DCAS, and includes EDC, some of
20 these other agencies that are a little bit more
21 experienced with some of the off-street parking
22 issues, so that when we come back to all of you with
23 a more detailed plan, it can be a serious plan that
24 really looks at how we provide real opportunities for
25 trucks to get off the street and park, while also

2 making sure that we continue enforcement, and
3 continue doing what we need to do to deal with the
4 day-to-day problem.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Does DOT work with
6 JFK Airport and other freight hubs to ensure that
7 there's adequate parking for trucks that service out
8 of these areas? And what has been done? And what
9 can be done in the future, particularly for JFK,
10 where significant investments have been made?

11 MS. MENDES: Thank you for the question. We see
12 our partners at the Port Authority of New York In New
13 Jersey as a critical to be part of this conversation.
14 I know we testified a few months ago, or thereabout.
15 But this-- this is a critical part of that
16 conversation. We are certainly thinking about how we
17 can think about how we can address this issue from
18 the city side of things, if there are any
19 opportunities for activating sites that may be city
20 owned. We also see this as a partnership with the
21 private sector, because the city cannot do this
22 alone.

23 And more broadly, as we think about the longer
24 term solutions, we are also thinking about supporting
25 federal funding opportunities that we can perhaps go

2 after for standing up the longer term school truck
3 parking facilities.

4 But the short answer is yes, we are working very
5 closely with the Port Authority as well as others,
6 and city agencies to work through this solution not
7 just for Southeast Queens, but citywide.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What has the citywide
9 taskforce on illegal parking done in terms of
10 reducing illegal parking?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So the task force
12 hasn't come out with its recommendations yet, but
13 maybe I'll talk to-- just because we haven't come up
14 with recommendations doesn't mean we're not doing
15 anything either. Maybe I'll turn it over to my
16 colleagues at PD to talk about how we're making sure
17 that we are being responsive in the short term, even
18 as we develop long term answers.

19 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Absolutely. I'm proud
20 to be a member of the task force, fortunately, with
21 DOT and many other city agencies. And one of the
22 short term actions that have come out of it is the
23 enforcement of the overnight truck parking in all
24 boroughs. I am-- It's somewhat good to report that
25 towing and parking enforcement for overnight trucks

2 that are parked in residential communities has risen
3 very substantially. What the taskforce is able to do
4 is track the 311 complaints and streamline them for
5 us so we can conduct enforcement where it's needed
6 most.

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: And Chair, I
8 just want to add, when we have finally solidified the
9 recommendations from the task force, we will be
10 coming to you and the Committee to make sure that
11 everybody understands the recommendations, so that we
12 can partner on making sure that we address overnight
13 truck parking.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: So do you have a
15 timeline with that in terms of when we get expects
16 recommendations to start coming out?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah. I think we've
18 said spring. We don't have a more specific date than
19 that yet.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What type of staff
21 and resources does the task force have?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So I think that the
23 task force itself is really composed of resources
24 from the agencies involved. They haven't hired
25 separate staff. But I think we can say like the

2 agencies are taking this very seriously. Diniece and
3 her team have spent substantial effort from the DOT
4 side, and I know commensurate from other agencies as
5 well. To really look at how to solve this problem.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay. I'm going to
7 just touch two more categories, and then I'm going to
8 pass it to my colleagues to ask theirs, and then I'll
9 do a round two.

10 But in terms quickly of traffic safety, does DOT
11 track as a part of Vision Zero the number of truck
12 fatalities and serious injuries?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Absolutely. A part
14 of our data-driven effort on Vision Zero is we look
15 at where truck fatalities, where truck-driven
16 injuries happen, what parts of the city. One of the
17 things that are freight team does is they focus on
18 safety projects on corridors with high numbers of
19 truck-related incidents.

20 So, you know, one thing I'll say, to be clear is
21 that trucks are not an overly disproportionate amount
22 of-- of the fatalities on our streets. You know, it
23 varies a little bit year to year. But trucks cause
24 fatalities about in proportion to their mix of
25 vehicles on the street. So we-- we do make sure that

2 what we're doing is not just truck-focused, but is
3 focused on making the streets safer for everybody,
4 which also affects trucks.

5 But one of the lenses through which we look is
6 trying to make sure that if there are streets that
7 are seeing a particularly number of truck related
8 injuries, that we make sure we do projects in those
9 areas. So we-- we want to make sure that as we
10 redesign our streets, we're addressing truck issues,
11 but addressing everything having to do with traffic
12 crashes, as well

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Out of the crashes
14 that you have recorded as a part of Vision Zero, do
15 you have an idea in terms of what proportion of those
16 accidents are on the truck route versus off of the
17 truck route?

18 MS. MENDES: Our previous analysis indicated
19 about 68% of the crashes, or, I'm sorry, injuries,
20 were on truck routes, designated truck routes.

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: And just as a
22 reminder. Those truck routes, we again try and site
23 on those widest corridors, so they tend to also
24 happen to be the busiest places throughout the city.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: For 2022, and year to
3 date, what are the current statistics on-- on truck
4 fatalities and serious injuries?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Alright. So for
6 2022 there were 42 fatalities that involved a truck
7 out of 259 total fatalities citywide. And there were
8 111 truck-involved severe injuries out of 2734,
9 severe injuries citywide.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And when compared to
11 previous years, what type of trends are you seeing?
12 What are your estimates for future years?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Well, we want those
14 numbers to come down, right? They-- You know, if the
15 number is not zero, then it's too high.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: But what are the
17 trends?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So the trend has
19 been a little bit all over the place. The previous
20 year 2021 had fewer truck-related fatalities at 23
21 out of 273. But overall, they had been higher in
22 prior years. In 2019, it had been 37 truck involved
23 fatalities, in 2017, 40. So we have not seen a
24 particular up or down trend around truck related
25 fatalities in particular. But that's not the trend

2 we want. The trend we want to downward. And so we
3 know we have to lean in even harder to make sure that
4 the numbers are going down, not staying level.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, and then the
6 last category of questions that I'm asking now is
7 neighborhood loading zone program: In July of 2019,
8 the City implemented the Neighborhood Loading Zone
9 Pilot Program in response to the increase in e-
10 commerce deliveries on residential streets and for-
11 hire vehicles-- vehicle trips throughout the city.

12 In an effort to reduce double parking and
13 unwanted standing behavior, and to create a safer and
14 more efficient environment for all road users, the
15 Neighborhood Loading Zone Program provides space at
16 the curb during the daytime and evening hours for
17 package zone-- excuse me, for package deliveries by
18 commercial vehicles, taxi and care service pickup and
19 drop off, and active loading and unloading of
20 personal vehicles. The program was specifically
21 designed to reduce conflicts between trucks and
22 cyclists while also providing bus-- excuse me,
23 improving bus travel times. DOT's website currently
24 lists 361 zones in the program. Is this figure
25 correct?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Just for-- Thank you
3 for a very excellent description of the program. I
4 think you got it just right. I'll-- I'll turn it
5 over to Diniece to talk about the numbers.

6 MS. MENDES: Thanks, Eric. And so as of April of
7 2023, There are currently 330 neighborhood loading
8 zones installed citywide 145 of which we've installed
9 last year, just last year alone. And we also have
10 about-- up to about 100-- 50 have been installed so
11 far this year, and another 100 are pending
12 installation.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Is that 50 or 150?

14 MS. MENDES: 50 have been installed so far this
15 year and 100 are pending installation as we speak.
16 So within the next few months those will likely be
17 implemented as well.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Can you also let me
19 know where these zones primarily exist?

20 MS. MENDES: So these zones are--

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: [TO MS. MENDES:]
22 [inaudible] to the new website?

23 MS. MENDES: Yeah. So we, just last week put the
24 announcement and the launch of our Loading Zone
25 Report, we have a publicly accessible map that's

2 interactive. You can go on the website at
3 nyc.gov/loading, and you'll be able to find out where
4 the-- the zones are installed. Generally they're in
5 more residential areas, they're spread out across the
6 city. We have them-- a footprint in every borough.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What's like the
8 numbers per borough?

9 MS. MENDES: We can get back to you on that-- on
10 the details.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Do you think someone
12 can find that out while we're going through the rest
13 of the questions? Thank you.

14 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Can you have them repeat
15 the website again?

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Can you repeat the
17 website again, please?

18 MS. MENDES: nyc.gov/loading.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: How does-- How has
20 DOT work with communities and elected officials to
21 keep neighborhoods informed about this program? And
22 what feedback have you received from community
23 members?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Right. So as we do
25 new loading zones, we've typically worked with the

2 Councilmember. We also notify the community board
3 and take feedback. You know, we know that these
4 needs to be where-- in appropriate places all over
5 the city. So we you know, we try to make it a
6 balance between not just asking, "Do you want that
7 here?" But we tried to say like, "Is this there a
8 reason this place doesn't work? Is there another
9 place that might make sense?" But we do get a lot of
10 feedback. That feedback varies tremendously from
11 neighborhood to neighborhood. I think we've had some
12 neighborhoods that have been very excited by the
13 program, and have wanted more, and other
14 neighborhoods that have been very concerned about
15 parking loss or other changes. I think as they've
16 gone in, we've tended to see people appreciate it and
17 appreciate the lower double parking. But we know
18 that it's a new-- it's new, and it's a change. And
19 so we try to like really work with communities to
20 understand why we're doing it and make sure we get
21 appropriate feedback on-- if it's problematic
22 someplace, maybe we can look someplace else instead.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: How does DOT balance
24 this program with ensuring that parking for private
25 vehicle does not dramatically decreased?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah. It's a
3 challenge because we're not-- not making more curb
4 space. So everything that we're doing is about how
5 we manage that curb space as well as we can. And,
6 you know, typically, when we do a neighborhood
7 loading zone, it's in effect, something like 8 a.m.
8 to 6 p.m., Monday through Friday, and then returns to
9 residential parking in the evenings when people might
10 come back from work and on the weekends. And we try
11 to balance it that way. But part of it is is that
12 we're dealing with the reality of this huge increase
13 in residential deliveries, and it's space that we
14 feel is still really serving the residents of that
15 community. It's not space that's serving sort of an
16 outside entity. So we try to make it work as best we
17 can for every community in which we work.

18 MS. MENDES: And, sorry, we have the numbers by
19 borough, if you're ready.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Please.

21 MS. MENDES: Okay. So, the highest number of
22 loading zones are in Queens 115, Brooklyn 104,
23 Manhattan 81, The Bronx 51, and Staten Island 18.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. Staten
25 Island is 18.

2 And this question is for DOT and NYPD. How do
3 you enforce the Loading Zone Program? Is it
4 summonses? Is it boots on vehicles? Is it
5 impoundment?

6 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Sure, they provided us
7 with the list of those locations, and we have the
8 traffic agents go there, and if they see a violation,
9 they start off by issuing a summons. But yes, the
10 vehicle would also be eligible for a boot or a tow.
11 But primarily it's enforced with parking summonses.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And after you receive
13 like-- and you observe that a truck may have two
14 summonses, for example, on the windshield, how soon
15 is it that you escalate to booting or towing that
16 vehicle? And what-- what allows for that level of
17 discernment from NYPD to take that those steps?

18 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Sure. I-- If I heard
19 you correctly, you said if the truck has multiple
20 summons on it?

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Yeah, like if--
22 because sometimes you walk past these trucks and they
23 have like one and one summonses.

24 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Right. Okay. Right.
25 For the loading zones that are for trucks only, we

2 mostly focus on the cars. But for other truck
3 violations, it really does depend on the space and
4 the availability of that tow, if it's a large truck.
5 And that's why very fortunately, as we mentioned, the
6 Truck Parking Taskforce kind of coordinates and
7 groups their complaints to us, so we can really get
8 those trucks that have been there, that have two or
9 three summonses, two or three complaints, and we can
10 go to that same neighborhood and get multiple trucks
11 on the same night and bring them to a designated
12 location, rather than like you said, keep on putting
13 another summons on it, which addresses the condition,
14 yes, but it really doesn't permanently rectify it.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And where are you
16 seeing most of the summonses being issued?

17 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Sure. When it comes
18 to the trucks, it is citywide. Some of the hotspots
19 is Southern Brooklyn, South East Queens, and the
20 Central and South Bronx, as well as parts of Northern
21 Queens as well. That's where a lot of the complaints
22 and the residents are voicing it to us.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And what long term
24 solutions has DOT considered for making the loading
25 zone pilot program permanent?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure. I think at
3 this point, we don't view it as a pilot. We really
4 do view it as a permanent program and part of our
5 toolbox. But one of the things that we're doing is
6 we've-- we're in the process of creating a new
7 traffic rule that we think better describes the
8 situation.

9 For anyone who's familiar with our Neighborhood
10 Loading Zones, the regulatory sign often says, "No
11 Parking." And from a regulatory perspective, that's
12 appropriate because it allows loading and unloading
13 of goods. But people in the community don't always
14 know what that is. They say, "Why did you take away
15 my parking and put up No Parking." And instead, the
16 new rule will let us put up signs that say, "Loading
17 Zone," which we think is much more clear about what
18 that space is meant to be used for in a way that we
19 think our-- our legal rules can better match our
20 public communications about the program. So even as
21 it's a permanent program, we do think it can be
22 better than how we've done it so far, in terms of
23 making that space clear to the public.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. Now, I'll
3 yield the rest of my questions for now on call on
4 Councilmember Narcisse.

5 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you. Thank you,
6 Chair. And thank you for being here, Deputy
7 Commissioner, I believe, and all of you that's here.
8 I appreciate your time.

9 Um. Now by talking, since we're always talking
10 about the waterway, I'm wondering is ferry sound
11 somewhere that we can do more transportation when it
12 comes to our delivery? I-- Is that in the plan?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yes, it is. And
14 I'll turn over to Diniece to talk details. But-- But
15 not every piece of freight can be moved by water, but
16 we think more can be than is today. And that's
17 something that we are actively pursuing with our
18 colleagues at EDC.

19 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Okay.

20 MS. MENDES: Thanks, Eric. And thanks for the
21 question. Approximately 8% of our freight comes in
22 by water. We certainly think that there are
23 opportunities to reduce our over-reliance on trucking
24 in the long term, and we've announced our program,
25 The Blue Highways Program, which is a multi-year

2 partnership with EDC and the private sector. This
3 looks at in-depth practices, understanding the
4 challenges the barriers for shifting more goods to
5 come in by water.

6 The city has also been thinking about what are
7 the infrastructure investments that will likely be
8 needed to accommodate those shifts by water, and
9 thinking about how do we create that network, that
10 hub and spoke system.

11 So as Eric announced in his testimony earlier
12 today, we will be releasing a solicitation later this
13 year that calls on marine operators and freight
14 operators who are interested in operating marine or
15 doing-- moving freight by water to respond to that
16 that RFEI, and we will be then setting up a pilot
17 program. There are certainly more opportunities for
18 us to drive more incentives. And we're-- will be
19 thinking about what levers the city has to shift more
20 freight by water.

21 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: That's good. I just
22 have one question. Do you-- do you track the summons
23 that you're giving right now to the trucks that parks
24 on our streets?

25 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Yes. Yes we do.

2 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: And is there a rise on
3 the summonses that you're giving to the trucks now?

4 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Yes. We're seeing
5 this year a rise in moving violations, that means
6 when they're operating the truck, and we're also
7 seeing a rise when the truck is parked, as well as a
8 rise in towing them. So we're seeing rises across
9 the board in enforcement.

10 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: And how much are the
11 summons is that you giving?

12 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Sure. So the parking
13 summons is overall is a little over 161,000. The
14 moving violation is approximately 7,500. Those would
15 be the summonses.

16 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: The trucks that park--
17 the trucks that park on our street. Because right
18 now, in the Canarsie area, and I know people calling
19 me from Queens: How many in total have you towed?
20 Because I've seen them parking for-- for months, for
21 years, some of them.

22 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Okay. So in southern
23 Brooklyn area, and this is more than just the
24 Canarsie area--

25 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Flatlands area?

2 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Sure. To those
3 vehicles, large trucks that are parked is
4 approximately 4400 this year in southern Brooklyn.
5 That is not tows. That is the parking summonses.
6 The toes in that area would be approximately, with
7 the boots, around 21.

8 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you. Please keep
9 on removing them. Because that's the most complaints
10 I get every day.

11 MS. MENDES: And we're also happy to sort of
12 field those specific problematic locations. So
13 please feel free to share that with us and we'll--

14 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: And it's a sanitation
15 thing too, because they're dirty. They gather all
16 the wind that blows all the garbage on the street.
17 Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

19 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you, Chair.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Next we'll hear from
21 Councilmember Restler.

22 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Great, I didn't see that
23 one coming. I firstly-- Just, well, let me firstly,
24 just thank our chair for her leadership and bringing
25 attention to this issue. And for the great pieces of

2 legislation from Councilmembers Avilés and Farías
3 that I strongly support.

4 I-- I also want to thank the Deputy Inspector. I
5 think you are the single most responsive person in
6 the entire police department. I don't know how
7 you're on top of every issue across all of our
8 districts and precincts. But, like there's no issue
9 too small. And you literally are on top of it in
10 real time, every time. And I really appreciate it.
11 You're just--

12 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Thank you--

13 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: --are a tremendous public
14 servants. And I--

15 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: It's a privilege to
16 serve. I know how important it is to hear from the
17 community. And I appreciate you kind of packaging up
18 all those complaints as well as the other
19 Councilmembers and giving it to me so we can take
20 action. We should--

21 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: I have an infinite number
22 of complaints. I do.

23 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: I wish we could do
24 more.

2 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: I'm a-- I'm a profess--
3 my professional job is to be annoying. But you help
4 solve them, and my community really deeply
5 appreciates it. I hadn't realized you've been
6 promoted from Captain to Deputy Inspector. So
7 congratulations. I apologize for-- for not catching
8 that sooner.

9 There were a couple of things I wanted to ask
10 about today, though on trucks. Oh, I'm already at 47
11 seconds. I was regretting nice every time.

12 So firstly-- Just can I ask for really quick
13 answers? So on the-- I was excited about that Big
14 Apps Challenge, or the Apps Challenge you guys did
15 earlier this year? What's the current status of the
16 app? And how soon until DOT can require all trucks
17 to use it?

18 MS. MENDES: Thanks for the question. It's still
19 under development. And we're continuing to work with
20 our university partners, and we're thinking about
21 enhancing--

22 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Any more specific timing
23 update that you can give than that?

24 MS. MENDES: We can get back to you on the
25 details.

2 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Okay. I-- There was also
3 a previous hackathon, I think it was 2019, that led
4 to the development of an online tool. The DOT was
5 using cameras to detect 53 foot trailers. What's the
6 status of that? All of-- I mean, all of us get an
7 inordinate amount of complaints about these trucks
8 that are illegal on our streets. And it feels like
9 unless we're able to get the deputy inspectors'
10 attention and that enforcement, we're not getting the
11 responsiveness that we need. I really strongly
12 support automated enforcement here. We're excited
13 that you all have been pursuing some of these apps,
14 but want to see more aggressive and swift
15 implementation.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah, I think we're
17 really on the same page there. I think we've done a
18 lot of really good testing of technology in a lot of
19 different arenas, and the technology has gotten a lot
20 better.

21 As you well know, we need permission from Albany
22 to do anything around automated enforcement. And,
23 you know, there's things we're pushing for this year.
24 There'll be things we're pushing for in future years.
25 We think more automated enforcement is absolutely the

2 future of-- of how to really get at a lot of these
3 issues.

4 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Automated enforcement for
5 illegal 53 foot trucks on our streets requires Albany
6 legislation?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yes.

8 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: And have we active-- has
9 the Administration been actively been pushing for
10 changes this session?

11 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: So, as you're
12 well aware, we're in the midst of negotiating that
13 budget that is, you know, a couple of days late at
14 this point. But I think we're not opposed to things
15 like this. You know, as somebody that has had their
16 vehicle destroyed by a 53 footer, I think there's a
17 lot of energy that we can be focusing on there.

18 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Okay. I know I'm over
19 time. So thank you very much, Chair.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. Next
21 we'll hear from Councilmember Williams followed by
22 councilmember Lewis.

23 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Thanks, Chair. And
24 thanks for being here. I just wanted to go back to
25 the Overnight/Illegal Trucking Taskforce. Can you

2 provide some more details? For instance, who is the
3 main driver, like which agency?

4 MS. MENDES: Thank you. The task force is being
5 led by the Mayor's Office of Operations, and the
6 other agencies including DOT, includes EDC, DCAS,
7 NYPD, Department of City Planning, DFNY, as well as
8 the sheriff's office.

9 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: So is it the Mayor's
10 Office of Operations that is actually, like,
11 corralling everybody?

12 MS. MENDES: Yes, we--

13 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Who's-- Who's in charge
14 of that office?

15 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Daniel
16 Steinberg is the Director of the Mayor's Office of--

17 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Daniel?

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Steinberg.

19 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Steinberg. Okay. Um,
20 another question I have in terms of like the work of
21 the task force: How are you all working between
22 agencies? As an example, I love how DOT kicked to
23 the NYPD to talk about the band-aid, the amazing
24 band-aid stuff that they've been doing. But we
25 really know that it needs more comprehensive

2 solutions to really get to the root of the problem.

3 And so how are you sort of cross-coordinating between

4 the various agencies that play a role in this, to

5 ensure that you're taking into account a myriad of

6 things, like federal regulations? Are you also in

7 active conversations with the trucking association as

8 well?

9 MS. MENDES: Great questions. And we certainly

10 rely on the strengths of a lot of the agencies that

11 are part of the task force, and really, what makes

12 the most sense in terms of their contributions,

13 particularly in looking at our survey of publicly-

14 available assets or city, or lots that could

15 potentially be used for truck parking.

16 But it requires a lot more thinking beyond that,

17 you know, working with our partners at PD as well as

18 DSNY. They've been able to provide us with a

19 targeted information on where enforcement is

20 happening today, but also doing an analysis of 311

21 complaints, et cetera, to match our efforts for

22 enforcement with where the actual complaints are, and

23 really making those sort of whole and thinking about

24 how we targeted in our interventions.

2 So your question about the longer-term solutions,
3 I think this is where we see the-- the opportunity
4 for the short-term, sort of quick fixes and
5 responses, as well as the longer term planning and
6 coordination that's needed to build the appropriate
7 off-street infrastructure. That requires making sure
8 that our regional transportation plan, our vision
9 plan, includes lists about truck parking.

10 But we also recognize that this is a national
11 safety issue, and a national issue of concern.
12 Secretary Pete Buttigieg talked about this as a
13 safety issue first and foremost. We are working very
14 closely with the trucking industry to help promote
15 industry surveys, to help get the information and
16 messaging out to truck drivers about the rules for
17 operating in New York City, particularly for not
18 parking overnight.

19 We also are working with the industry to collect
20 a list of locations for truck parking, off street
21 legal truck parking facilities, and making sure that
22 we can make that more public-- more widely available
23 to truck drivers.

24 I think in creating more awareness and outreach
25 does really help to drive the message home for the

2 folks that do want to comply. We know that there are
3 bad apples, and we're working with our enforcement
4 agents to root those out. But it's first and
5 foremost a safety issue, and we want to make sure
6 that we're providing legal spaces off street for
7 truck drivers to rest. Thank you.

8 COUNCILMEMBER LOUIS: Thank you, Chair, for this
9 very important hearing. And thank you all for being
10 here to testify today. Some of my questions were
11 answered. So I have followups based on testimony,
12 and I'll be really quick before the Chair, because of
13 my time.

14 So the first question: I'll just say the
15 questions and then you guys can respond afterwards.
16 So this is in response to you, Deputy Commissioner
17 Beaton. You said that DOT-- This is regarding Intro
18 708. In your statement, you stated that DOT is
19 seeking to retain discretion to determine
20 implementation and identifying daylighting
21 intersections near truck route networks. So I wanted
22 to know what formula and tool. You did go a little
23 bit into this, but you didn't specifically state what
24 formula and tool is being used by DOT to determine
25 viability of daylighting areas as opposed to others.

2 And I bring that up, because-- and I'm raising this
3 concern here for the record, because there are
4 different truck route areas that are not considered
5 truck route areas where we have several fatalities.
6 So as you shared the numbers today, it lets me know
7 that there's something probably wrong with the
8 formula or tool.

9 And the second question is in regards to Intro
10 924 on the study street design. Your testimony
11 suggested that additional efforts and reporting and
12 writing would be better have spent focusing on
13 solutions. And I wanted to know what were those
14 solutions that DOT had that you all wanted to share
15 with us regarding this particular bill? Because
16 maybe that could help strengthen the bill a little
17 bit. I think the bill is great. But maybe your
18 solutions could help strengthen it more. So those
19 are my two questions. Thank you.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure. Thanks. In
21 some ways, they're really related questions, because
22 they're both about street design and how we think
23 about street design for trucks.

24 So around daylighting, and daylighting is a
25 subject that's come up many times over the years, we

2 have some concerns that if used in the wrong places,
3 daylighting can make some intersections less safe.

4 And, you know, there-- there's many different types
5 of intersections. But one example is something that
6 we found that is particularly dangerous is vehicles
7 making turns too fast, right? You know, if you're
8 turning very slowly, you have a good chance to watch
9 for pedestrians crossing the street. If you turn
10 fast, you're much more likely to hit someone. And if
11 you hit someone, you're much more likely to cause
12 severe injury or death. We've reduced the ability of
13 vehicles to turn fast in part by tightening the those
14 corners a little bit by saying you have to turn
15 slowly because that corner is actually kind of sharp.
16 If we daylight the corner and do it without doing
17 other physical interventions, then it actually makes
18 it easier for-- for vehicles to turn more quickly.
19 And in particular, on long truck routes that can make
20 it easier for trucks to turn off of the truck route,
21 onto perhaps a street where it shouldn't be. You
22 know, daylighting is also something often used to
23 make it easier for trucks to make turns.

24 And so thinking back to your other question, we
25 can do things like make corner radii tighter, so that

2 it's physically harder for a truck to make a turn
3 onto a street where it shouldn't be. We can use one-
4 way conversions, so that you know, a truck or another
5 vehicle can get on a block if it really needs to be
6 there, but it can't drive a whole length along a
7 block because a block goes the wrong way. We can use
8 speed humps and other speed reducers to reduce the
9 ability of trucks to travel on those streets.

10 In most cases, we can't totally prohibit trucks
11 because there's a garbage truck or there's other
12 things that need to be on that street. But we can
13 make the street much less attractive to trucks that
14 it's not a good cut through anymore.

15 And we use a lot of the data that Diniece talked
16 about to try to identify places that are seeing
17 particularly large amounts of these-- of off-route
18 truck activity and use that toolbox.

19 Thank you. And I think street cushions would be
20 helpful if you could be a little bit more generous
21 and less stingy with those in the requests that we
22 make. But thank you for that information. I'll hand
23 it back over to the Chair.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. Next
3 we'll hear from Councilmember Avilés followed by
4 Councilmember Farías.

5 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you Chair. I have
6 so many questions all over the place, so I'm going to
7 use-- try to use my time expeditiously. But I'll be
8 back. In terms of the-- I'd love to hear more
9 explanation around the requirements for CAPA as it
10 relates to your concerns in one of the bills, in
11 terms of the public notification.

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure. And I'm not
13 the agency lawyer. So I'm not-- I can't recite
14 chapter and verse of CAPA. But basically, there's a
15 very specific process for changing rules, which
16 includes our truck routes, about how we release them,
17 how we publish them, how we have public hearings.

18 And so we're not inherently against some of the
19 suggestions in the bill about having public
20 interaction. We just want to make sure we're not
21 doing it in a duplicative way. So I think we can
22 have a good conversation about how to line those up.

23 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: So despite being an
24 expert, you-- you cite it. So do you think what is
25 currently used is robust enough?

2 So I think that for what you're talking about, we
3 need more public outreach than-- than what is
4 required in CAPA. I think we just want to make sure
5 that we're not, like, having two hearings a week
6 apart to satisfy two slightly different legal
7 processes. You know, if there's something required
8 by CAPA, we should make it useful. If there's more
9 that we want to do on top of that, that's reasonable.
10 We just want to make sure it's efficient.

11 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Sure, I definitely would
12 like to make sure that public input is-- is
13 meaningful, and certainly we are not wasting anyone's
14 time. We have way too much work to do for a city.
15 So I look forward to seeing what the specifications
16 are, and comparison on what is more efficient and
17 robust. And yeah, and the goal that it-- that it
18 actually--

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure And we're
20 happy to have a conversation too. It's...

21 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Great. In terms of the--
22 We talk a lot about last miles-- [BELL RINGS] Dang.
23 That was very quick. We talk a lot about water
24 freight. And in particular, we have, you know,
25 hundreds of miles of coastline. We have very minimal

2 number of actual ports that receive goods, and
3 yourself mentioned 8 percent of moving our goods is
4 done by the water. Can you tell me, given Red Hook
5 Container Port's importance to the region, not only--
6 and to New York City in terms of goods and services,
7 what specifically beyond an RFI? Is the city
8 committed to investing in maintaining and bringing
9 that port to its full capacity?

10 MS. MENDES: So, I think for that, to have a more
11 robust conversation on that, we'll likely need to
12 have our partners at EDC as well as the Port
13 Authority to be part of that conversation. We're not
14 in the driving seat, but we are working very closely
15 with EDC on that.

16 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Yeah. What I'm trying to
17 get at is how-- how hard is our city driving, or
18 asking for investment in that port? Given its
19 material importance to the city as one of the few
20 ports in New York City that's operational, and we saw
21 the how important that was during the pandemic, lack
22 of refrigeration in the city, only having, what?,
23 three days of food possible, and yet our city is
24 anemically investing, or not clearly articulating the
25 critical nature of investing and ensuring that our

2 ports are not only working, but we're maximizing them
3 for a city of 8 million people. I don't see the
4 match.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah. Those are all
6 very good points. I think it's just that
7 relationship is really managed by EDC. So we don't
8 have the people here who can speak well to it.

9 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: I'm going to let my
10 colleagues answer, and we'll be back.

11 COUNCILMEMBER FARIÁS: Hi, everyone, thank you so
12 much for being here today, and for testifying and
13 answering everyone's questions. I'm going to try to
14 speed through mine. If not, I'll be back for round
15 two.

16 How frequently have we revisited the major or
17 minor truck routes happening locally? When we route
18 streets, or add bike lanes, reconfigure roadways, or
19 include any of our like pedestrian spaces? Like how
20 often are we revising those truck routes?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So the answer is
22 very rarely, to in some cases almost never, and there
23 are places where we've done like a one-way conversion
24 on a on a truck route, and having created one that

2 goes the other direction. And that's-- we agree that
3 it makes sense to take a look.

4 COUNCILMEMBER FARÍAS: Yeah, so they-- so we're
5 not comprehensively looking at our streets? We're
6 kind of targeting it by when an issue comes up or
7 revision comes up, we do that and then see down the
8 line when it's flagged that like a truck route is
9 maybe like now D-mapped in a way or not connecting.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Right. I think our
11 team has a list of those types of places. But
12 because we haven't really addressed the truck route
13 network, that many of them are actually just still
14 missing links.

15 COUNCILMEMBER FARÍAS: Got it.

16 MS. MENDES: I'd also-- I'd also add that we,
17 through our coordination process, and we also think
18 about sort of making sure that we can still
19 accommodate deliveries, particularly on truck routes
20 that may get a street redesign. But it's still part
21 of our process to ensure that loading zones are
22 provided, that they are still safe accommodation for
23 delivery vehicles.

24 COUNCILMEMBER FARÍAS: Yeah. I'm more still
25 thinking of like some of our minor truck routes that

2 go through local streets. Obviously, when we-- I
3 under-- completely understand, it makes sense, that
4 when we're impacting a commercial district or
5 commercial zone or anything like that, that we are
6 taking that into consideration.

7 What has been the conversation or commitments, if
8 any at all from other municipalities like Long
9 Island, Westchester County, or even State Department
10 of Transportation to help alleviate the burden of
11 knowing that New York City is taking on most of our
12 transportation and logistics outward?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: I'd say we regularly
14 talk to our colleagues. I don't think that any of
15 them are anxious to take problems off of our hands.

16 COUNCILMEMBER FARÍAS: [BELL RINGS] Okay.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: We'll come back to
18 you.

19 COUNCILMEMBER FARÍAS: Okay. I'll be back.
20 We'll have Councilmember Williams, followed by
21 Avilés-- Sorry, Councilmember Lee, sorry, followed by
22 Councilmember Williams.

23 COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. Actually, I'll be
24 quick because a lot of my colleagues have already
25 asked my questions. But I just wanted to say first

2 of all, thank you so much, because we all know this
3 is a multi-prong approach. It's not just enforcement
4 is just-- not just the truck routes. And so it
5 takes, it takes a village that's for sure. So I want
6 to thank all of you for your hard work and effort.

7 And I guess I just wanted to piggyback off of
8 Councilmember Avilés's question about the CAPAs.
9 Because they thing that the thing that strikes me in
10 the testimony is the part where it says, "In areas
11 where we do not have truck routes, truck drivers can
12 still travel to get to their final destinations, but
13 may do so on any street that provides a direct
14 connection without regard to the size or land use on
15 that street, and will do so as they serve homes and
16 businesses all over the city."

17 So I guess my question is, and correct me if I'm
18 wrong in terms of my interpretation of that, is that
19 they have discretion in terms of which streets to go
20 on, as long as it's seen as a direct connection, is
21 that correct?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Right. So
23 essentially, a truck is supposed to use the truck
24 route network to get as close as possible to its
25 final destination, and then can use local streets.

2 But if a particular destination is far from truck
3 routes, there may be many different routes that get
4 you back to a truck route, and a trucker will just
5 take whatever looks best.

6 And, you know, the point of truck routes is
7 really to try to keep them on a more limited set of
8 streets as long as possible.

9 COUNCILMEMBER LESS: Right. Okay. And the only
10 thing-- final thing I'll mention is that I know that,
11 you know, you mentioned you're looking-- you know,
12 you're willing to work with us on the feedback piece
13 of it. And I would highly recommend, you know,
14 because we know that the I believe the last one you
15 said was in 2018, and that was in lower Manhattan.
16 But, you know, we all know that after COVID, the
17 truck routes have-- and the amount of goods that are
18 coming in have changed drastically. And so, you
19 know, they are different parts of the city that are
20 very different. Like Eastern Queens versus Western
21 Queens is totally different. So if we can talk about
22 having-- Again, I don't know what the what the
23 process is in even changing the CAPA process. But if
24 there's a way to have multiple hearings or feedback,
25 community listening sessions in each borough, I think

2 that would be great. Because, you know, the-- I'm
3 going to transit desert, for example. So you have to
4 use a lot of cars and trucks to get around anywhere
5 in my district, not the railways or any other
6 transportation. So it would look different in each
7 district. And so if you could work with us on that,
8 that'd be awesome.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure. And to be
10 clear, I really don't mean to imply that CAPA means
11 we can't do other public outreach. It's more just,
12 we want to-- there are specific things we need to do.
13 And we want to make sure that anything aligns where
14 possible.

15 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: Let me also add
16 that with regard to that CAPA process, the rules that
17 when we present them, a lot of them are actually
18 based on the feedback we've already received from
19 various constituencies. I think we cited the one
20 with Staten Island. It was based on the input from
21 the business community, as well as the community
22 districts in the area. So it's not as if there is
23 no-- there is. Right. Yes. Thank you.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. And next
3 we'll hear from Councilmember Narcisse, followed by
4 Williams.

5 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: One of the things I
6 forgot to ask: Do you have a special unit in the
7 NYPD that is assigned to take care of that, since
8 it's such a problems that we all face in New York
9 City?

10 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Yes. We have within
11 the traffic enforcement district--

12 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Yes.

13 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: -- we have a towing
14 operations section that has regular duty tow trucks
15 as well as large heavy-duty tow trucks that can take
16 care of the trucks that are parked overnight. Within
17 the NYPD, we also have motor carrier safety units
18 that's really specialized in truck violations such as
19 the over-width, over-length, and especially the over-
20 weight.

21 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Okay. So how many
22 incidents-- because there's many times that I see
23 trucks pass by where they're not supposed to be
24 understood that have low wires? So how many
25 incidents you have where you have wires coming out

2 of, and people calling? Do you have any report on
3 that?

4 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: I don't have that.
5 No. Not the wires, no.

6 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Do you have increased
7 penalties for repeat offenders that, you know, for
8 the truck drivers that either parks or getting
9 tickets on the road?

10 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Yes. There are
11 certain violations that have escalating penalties.
12 Most notably, certain codes within the overnight
13 truck parking. Code six would be the most notable,
14 as well as, I mentioned, we have some specially
15 trained Motor Carrier Safety Units. They have access
16 and enforce federal motor carrier safety regulations.
17 And there's a database that actually tracks it. So
18 if that particular driver or company got multiple
19 violations with-- for the same offense, the fine
20 scale would escalate. Yes.

21 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Okay. And then I'm not
22 going to take too long, but I have people watching,
23 and they keep telling me-- I mean, they just told me
24 that twice that I forgot to mention Sheepshead Bay
25

2 has the same problem as well, and Garrison beach. So
3 thank you.

4 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Duly noted. For the
5 folks that are watching, we look forward to helping
6 out.

7 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Yes. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

9 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I want to go
10 back to the Overnight/Illegal Trucking Taskforce.
11 Would it be possible to get a briefing? So I know
12 you guys are going to do recommendations, so maybe
13 I'll leave you-- only you said spring, and it is kind
14 of about to be spring. So if we could get a briefing
15 within the next couple of months, that'll be great,
16 because it's hard to ask detailed, nuanced questions
17 in a hearing. And I've asked the Administration
18 multiple times before you guys created the task
19 force. I suggested that you create the task force.
20 You created the task force, never circled back to us,
21 and there's no details on what's actually happening
22 with the taskforce. So can we get a briefing?

23 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: So I believe
24 we're in close enough to be making recommendations

2 fairly shortly. And we would love to give you the
3 full detailed accounting of those recommendations.

4 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Great. Great. The
5 other question I have is for the NYPD. Can you talk
6 a little bit about the sustainability of what you're
7 doing? Because I know I've had tons of conversations
8 with chiefs and inspectors at precincts, and you
9 know, from what they've told me there's a true
10 capacity issue. And I know that in Southeast Queens
11 specifically, I want to thank Chief Williams for
12 identifying a specific location where you are
13 temporarily staging trucks. But can you talk about
14 the sustainability? Because what you're doing right
15 now is not sustainable. It's great, and we love it,
16 but it's not sustainable. So could you talk about
17 how the department has been looking at doing robust,
18 sustainable enforcement? I know this is not a budget
19 hearing, but are there any like budget asks or
20 allocations of resources specifically for the
21 trucking unit? Because there's not a lot of trucks.
22 There's only a few people that are actually like,
23 have a CDL license to even drive the trucks necessary
24 to tow the trucks. It's like a compound issue. So
25 if you could share

2 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Absolutely. Great
3 point you brought up about the limited capacity.
4 I'll speak to that in a minute. So we do, as
5 mentioned, have a certain amount of tow truck drivers
6 that are trained to drive the heavy duty tow trucks.
7 But of course, we're conducting enforcement to try to
8 get to the ultimate goal of 100% compliance.

9 Now, we do have three tow pounds that are
10 designated, and as the chiefs mentioned, they were
11 absolutely correct, they are at capacity.

12 So as you alluded to, we did very fortunately,
13 with some of the help of the council here, get some
14 space temporarily in Southeast Queens. I won't
15 mention the location here publicly, but we did get
16 some space. That is a temporary measure as we work
17 towards the taskforce's ultimate goal of finding
18 enough truck parking. And as we mentioned, we look
19 forward to sharing those results with you.

20 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: And I hope also you're
21 looking at long-term solutions for towing storage,
22 because even abandoned vehicles, even when we want to
23 get vehicles off the street, capacity for tow trucks,
24 large space when cars or trucks are towed is
25 unavailable. So is the department also looking at

2 that? Because I know a lot of the tow pound areas
3 were close last couple of years. So are you guys--

4 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: In short? Absolutely.
5 Yes, we are.

6 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay, I just have one
7 very quick question about JFK. I know through the
8 JFK redevelopment, they're going to be building out
9 new cargo space. And I know you said you're working
10 with the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey.
11 But if you can give us some more details on what the
12 nature of that coordination is. A few years ago, I
13 sat in a meeting. EDC was was in the meeting, not
14 DOT. And the coordination didn't seem as robust as I
15 felt it should be, considering that the city owns the
16 airport property and pretty much owns a lot of the
17 space around the airport. So what is the-- the
18 coordination with the city and the port authority to
19 really supporting the truck infrastructure around the
20 airport, and coming into the airport?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure. So like--
22 like you say, because EDC is sort of the leaseholder
23 for the airports, they do typically take the lead on
24 those discussions. We do work-- work with them. We--
25 - We review the environmental review. We work on--

2 Several of our neighborhood studies around that area
3 have focused on sort of the immediate environs of
4 JFK. As we think about our potential truck route
5 changes, it's certainly an area we'll want to take a
6 look at. We've done a lot of safety work on some of
7 the major streets around the airport. So I think we
8 do coordinate. EDC is just in the lead for the City
9 on that work.

10 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. I hope like when
11 you guys have your taskforce, it means that you do
12 think about it in that way too, because there might
13 be some current opportunities that are not being
14 taken advantage of specifically around JFK if there's
15 not a coordinated effort to work not only with the
16 various city agencies but, you know, by state agency
17 that is also playing a role, or can play a more
18 critical role involving trucks. Thanks Chair.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you so much for
20 that. Next is Councilmember Avilés, followed by
21 Fariás, and then I'll go into my second round of
22 questions.

23 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Great. Thank you Chair.
24 In In circling back to Intro 708, and the potential
25 of-- of looking at redesigning the-- the truck

2 network. Theoretically, let's say we pass this piece
3 of legislation. Can you walk us through what the
4 process would look like and a timeframe?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure. So I'll start
6 and then Diniece or Charles, if either of you want to
7 add, can. But, you know, first of all, we're not
8 starting from zero on this right. There is-- We've
9 heard a lot of community feedback. We've also done
10 some of our own analysis to identify some places
11 around the city where we-- we feel like there's some
12 need. I think, you know, we'll work with you on the
13 details, but we'll want to have a public outreach
14 component of the process where we take other feedback
15 on places that we might not have heard about, or, you
16 know, places of concern. And we would take all of
17 that feedback in, and then we would come back to the
18 public with something like a draft set of changes.
19 So we would make a proposal where we think, you know,
20 we would add these, remove these, and I think we
21 would want to present that to the public for
22 feedback.

23 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Would you expect 2 years,
24 3 years, 15 years?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Well, it depends a
3 little bit on how the feedback goes. But I think at
4 the shorter end of that range. You know, something
5 like one to two years from when we get started,

6 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: I think what I'm trying to
7 get at is a little bit of managing expectations. I
8 mean-- To get a speed bump takes us four years, I am
9 a little concerned that this is going to be even
10 longer. And the environment continues to change.
11 And I understand you're obviously not operating from
12 zero, you have quite a quite a bit of data.

13 So in terms of-- I understand the-- the
14 administration's concern around retaining discretion
15 for daylighting. And neighborhoods are different and
16 have different requirements. Can you walk us through
17 what some of the considerations for daylighting. And
18 if in fact, I have seen throughout my district, where
19 the exit to the highway is, giant tractor trailers,
20 not being-- it is the truck route, and they cannot
21 make turns. And there is daylighting there, but
22 there are cars parked in the daylighting, or it's
23 empty, and they still can't make the turn because
24 they're riding into the bike lane.

25 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Right, and--

2 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: What criteria is used to
3 even make-- to approve that?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Right. So-- and
5 that makes the point very well. Intersections around
6 the city are different from each other. And we don't
7 have sort of one-size-fits-all. We do this at this
8 10,000 intersections, and do this at this 10,000.
9 But we do need to look at them individually. And
10 even if we do daylighting should it be 20 feet, or 30
11 feet, or 40-- you know, what's the right design? I
12 think it's really safety and access. Like our first
13 concern at all times has to be: Are we designing the
14 streets in a way that is safe? That we're, you know,
15 getting the benefits of daylighting in terms of
16 visibility without having a negative effect on
17 turning speeds or other things that might be
18 problematic for safety.

19 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: So like on the current
20 route, does DOT go back and assess, if their hearing
21 crashes? And they've already instituted, let's say,
22 a daylighting zone to try to improve safety, but it's
23 clearly not working.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah.
25

2 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: How often is DOT going
3 back to look at these intersections and-- and adjust
4 the design?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah. I mean, we
6 adjust tens and tens of thousands of regulations a
7 year including daylighting. So if you're seeing an
8 issue, we're happy to go back and look at that
9 particular location. But we do regularly revisit
10 places around the city when we get feedback.

11 MS. MENDES: I'd also add that oftentimes there
12 may be issues that maybe a corridor type of treatment
13 may be needed. And so I think Eric mentioned this at
14 the beginning and as part of his testimony, we look
15 at corridors that have higher incidences of truck-
16 related crashes, and think about other types of
17 safety interventions to make those corridors safer.
18 That could also be a designated truck route, or it
19 could be a non-truck route. So that's part of our
20 sort of thinking and toolkit as well.

21 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Sure. Thank you for that.
22 And the important element I actually wanted to hear
23 exactly on this issue of the corridor. My district
24 is home to Third Avenue, a notoriously dangerous
25 truck route in an industrial-- mixed

2 residential/industrial/manufacturing district.

3 Notorious, and I say over 30 years multiple federal
4 investments. What concrete things has DOT done to
5 improve safety on Third Avenue, because I cannot see
6 them, and the continued amount of crashes and
7 fatalities on Third Avenue also bears no evidence of
8 any improvements.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Right. So-- So
10 right now we are undertaking a, as you as you know, a
11 major Third Avenue study. We're both looking at
12 under the highway as well as the farther north, as
13 you get into Gowanus. And we agree that it's a street
14 where there's a safety problem, and it's in need of
15 changes.

16 We have done some things on Third Avenue. We
17 restriped the area around the-- under the highway to
18 narrow the lanes and create better safety buffers. A
19 few years ago, we've done a number of safe street
20 improvement projects, such as where new-- the new
21 schools are going near 59th Street. We've worked
22 with-- on better lighting near 36th Street.

23 So I wouldn't say that we've totally ignored it.
24 But we also fully agree there's more to do. And
25 that's why we really, rather than just sort of

2 treating an intersection at a time, are taking that
3 full corridor look.

4 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: So I appreciate that. And
5 I realize I'm way past my time. I appreciate the
6 paint on the floor. That is certainly helpful. The
7 lighting? It feels very piecemeal. You put extra
8 lights in front of Industry City and the rest of the
9 corridor is dark. You paint in front of the school,
10 but the rest of the corridor, it doesn't have like
11 visible stripes on the floor. I don't understand the
12 piecemeal implementation of any kind of safety. In
13 fact, the BQE is getting repaired by the State, which
14 took out most of the lighting under there. Nothing.
15 I don't-- I appreciate that-- this study after
16 decades of requests from our community is finally
17 being implemented as is-- will be Red Hook. It is
18 the pace of these issues, and the urgency which we
19 still fail to see. And I want to see a full
20 comprehensive implementation of a corridor, not two
21 blocks here, six years later one block at the end. A
22 full implementation that is cohesive. I-- That's
23 what I think is a lot of frustration for many
24 councilmembers across the city. So I think with
25 that-- I'll have more questions later.

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: We hear you.

3 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Councilmember Farías?

4 COUNCILMEMBER FARÍAS: And like the Terminator,
5 I'm back, y'all. Okay, really quickly. How do you
6 folks envision-- and this is to the PD-- envision
7 traffic enforcement's role in managing illegal street
8 parking that interferes with where and how trucks can
9 move, deliver, sort goods. I mean, I'm not just
10 talking about outer boroughs issues either. I mean,
11 my borough is impacted definitely by a lot of this,
12 but also, you know, coming to work when I drive, if
13 there are certain streets in Manhattan, even right
14 here down on Broadway, where there's Amazon trucks,
15 FedEx trucks that are pulled over, you know, blocking
16 an entire roadway. And I rarely see traffic
17 enforcement happening in the island of Manhattan.

18 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: Okay. So that's a
19 very good point you bring up. Somebody mentioned a
20 little while ago about the truck not being able to
21 turn because there was a car illegally parked in the
22 turning lane, and then the truck was forced in the
23 bike lane.

24 So DOT, as we know, is doing an excellent job
25 with reengineering and making safety improvement.

2 But some of those is only as good as the enforcement
3 to make sure that they are kept for their designated
4 use. For example, a bike lane must be clear for it
5 to work for cyclists.

6 So this year, we've issued approximately 2.4
7 million parking summonses citywide with-- granted a
8 heavy part of that being in the borough of Manhattan,
9 so I can assure you that our traffic agents are out
10 there enforcing it, but yes, more needs to be done
11 and we look forward to that. You mentioned about the
12 Amazon truck and UPS truck not being able to access
13 the curb, and wind blocking the whole street. That
14 could be because a car is illegally parked in maybe a
15 truck loading zone. So I need to get that car out of
16 there and make sure that person doesn't go back
17 through enforcement, booting, and towing. Clearly
18 enforcement is the most forward-facing issue of that.

19 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Yeah. So my follow up is
20 going to be: Do we anticipate traffic enforcement
21 needing more resources regarding the increasing of
22 these issues, or just to address them? I mean, I can
23 name a handful of blocks just surrounding city hall
24 where there's no standing signs or no parking signs
25 and there are cars parked with or without permits.

2 But I know in Manhattan permits are not used in those
3 standing or no parking. So are we anticipating more
4 enforcement needed or...?

5 DEPUTY INSPECTOR WOROBEY: So I'm glad you
6 brought it up. We could use as much as we can get.
7 We do have some vacancies currently. Before I come
8 here asking for more resources, we do have vacancies
9 within our traffic agent ranks.

10 I could send you something to put out to social
11 media that maybe you can help us get, because we have
12 some great traffic agents, many from immigrant
13 communities. And we could use more to fill our
14 ranks. But we currently have vacancies, and we do
15 want to fill those so we can do more enforcement.

16 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: And with the call for
17 PEGs, additionally, that the Mayor has recently asked
18 for, are those vacancies going to remain? Or are you
19 anticipating removing them?

20 DIRECTOR CLARKE: So I think that is something
21 that our budget team is still working on, how to
22 figure out how to get through the 4% PEGs. So I
23 can't-- Today, we can't tell you exactly how that
24 will work--

25 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Okay. TBD.

2 DIRECTOR CLARKE: Yeah.

3 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Okay. Got it. Can I ask
4 one follow up? I'm sorry. Okay, and just a followup
5 to Councilmember Avilés's question: Do you folks
6 reevaluate the corridors and intersections without
7 complaints or without 311 complaints, like if an
8 accident happens does that trigger a reevaluation of
9 the street corridor? I just want a clarification on
10 that, because I know we are a reactive city because
11 we don't have enough enforcement that can just happen
12 on its own. And so most times when an issue comes
13 up, you have to call the complaint in.

14 So are we doing that? Like if someone gets hit
15 or a fatality happens, then we reevaluate, or do
16 we...?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: We try to do both,
18 right? We want to be as proactive as possible. We
19 want to redesign streets before there's an incident.
20 But if there is a fatality, if there is a serious
21 injury, we do go back and look at that again, to see
22 if there's anything more, if there's anything changed
23 that that we need to be doing. We also look more
24 broadly at corridors that have more serious injuries,

2 more fatalities, and make sure that we are going back
3 and redesigning those.

4 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Great. Thank you, folks,
5 for my questions. And thank you Chair for the
6 additional time.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. I'm going
8 to go to my round two now questions. And then if any
9 members have any additional questions we can revisit.

10 So let's go back to curbside space for a little
11 bit. A 2016 City Commission congestion study titled
12 "The FHB Transportation Study" asserted that traffic
13 congestion is significantly affected by how curb
14 space is managed. Noting that when there's adequate
15 space at the curb for trucks and delivery vehicles,
16 and those vehicles double park, they can remove a
17 full lane or more from traffic service, which I see
18 often even in this area where they're double and
19 triple parked in some instances. Has DOT
20 commissioned other similar or more recent studies to
21 assess congestion and how curbside spaces managed and
22 utilized.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So I wouldn't say
24 we've-- we have a new study of it, but we fully agree
25 with those conclusions that-- that proper management

2 of curbside space is very important for congestion,
3 for safety, for business operations. You know,
4 there's-- for bus speeds. A lot of the things we
5 care about really do come back to how well we manage
6 the curb. And it's why we have new ideas like the
7 microhubs. And I think we're excited to get into
8 doing more active curb management, particularly in
9 the busier parts of the city.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: But considering that
11 we haven't really seen any impact from these new
12 initiatives, would you say it is a resource issue as
13 to why you're unable to really see a difference in
14 this? Or is there some other reason?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Well, some of the
16 things are just new. So we haven't measured yet.
17 But for example, the Neighborhood Loading Zone
18 Program, when the initial wave went out, we did do a
19 lot of measurements and found that double parking
20 really did reduce on-- on the streets. It's not just
21 we create the loading zones, and they filled up with,
22 you know, with people who shouldn't be there. We
23 really found that when you provide the appropriate
24 space, trucks use them, you know, people picking up
25 and dropping off a person with a disability use them.

2 And they were effective. We had fewer blockages of
3 bike lanes, fewer blockages of bus stops. So that's
4 an example of a program that's now a couple years
5 old, where we're able to look back, as we do the
6 microhub pilot. We'll be measuring that in the same
7 way, making sure that it doesn't just work in theory,
8 but that we really do see the changes we want to see
9 on the street. And with every new thing that we do,
10 we will be measuring to make sure that they are
11 effective.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What would you say
13 were some of the recommendation and main takeaways of
14 the study and how has DOT implemented those
15 recommendations?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: I guess I'm not
17 specifically familiar with-- with the study you're
18 talking about. But in general with curb management,
19 we have I've been doing more-- more to create loading
20 zones, more to create things around the city that are
21 just better managing our curb. We're expanding
22 metering to encourage turnover in commercial areas.
23 So we-- I think we are doing a lot to try to better
24 manage the curb with more to come.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And-- And I know that
3 2016 is some time ago, and you probably weren't
4 within the agency. So I'm interested in, like, in
5 terms of continuity, when you have these studies,
6 what's happening, and why hasn't it been done since
7 then, right? Are you still going based off of-- Is
8 the agency still working off of the findings from
9 that 2016 study? Or are you just implementing new
10 initiatives without looking back at what some of the
11 recommendations may have been from this report?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Right. So you know,
13 maybe I didn't quite catch the report, but there is
14 actually a lot of continuity in the agency.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: It's the-- it was a
16 study that was commissioned in 2016, and it was
17 called FHV Transportation Study.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Okay. Yes. Yes,
19 our policy unit led that under the director. The
20 policy unit is still there. We are familiar-- We
21 are-- It absolutely still informs what we're doing.
22 The FHV landscape has obviously changed a little bit
23 since then, both with the new rules that TLC has put
24 in, as well as the effects of the pandemic, and some
25 of the financial changes within the industry. So I

2 think we continue to use that where it's appropriate,
3 but we also collect new data and update what we're
4 doing where appropriate too.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: But what are some of
6 the main takeaways from the study?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So I think one of
8 the main takeaways from that study was just what a
9 large percentage FHV traffic makes up within Midtown.
10 That, you know, we're talking obviously, with good
11 reason about trucks today. But you know, there are--
12 there are locations in that study, where more than
13 half or even more than two thirds of the traffic on
14 the streets were yellow taxis and FHV's. As we think
15 about congestion within, you know, within Midtown and
16 some of the closer-in areas in particular, downtown
17 Brooklyn, Long Island City, it's clear that we-- that
18 we had to look at some of the issues around taxis and
19 FHV's to address that congestion. Some of that has
20 been done through working with TLC, and they've
21 implemented a number of new rules, particularly
22 around high-volume app services. We've also
23 increasingly looked at creating pickup and drop off
24 zones for those FHV's, so that where-- in busy areas,
25 they don't have to sort of block a second lane to do

2 that pick up and drop off space. We have-- we've
3 also been working on taxi relief standards, because
4 we know that driving those vehicles is actually a
5 very difficult business, and trying to provide places
6 where they can legally stop and take a-- get a meal
7 or take other types of breaks. And we've been
8 working closely with TLC on implementing those.

9 So we-- I think there are a number of things that
10 we continue to implement, while still recognizing
11 that the landscape has shifted a little bit,
12 particularly in midtown, since 2020. And looking at
13 the new data wherever that's appropriate.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Delivery and
15 logistics industry representatives have noted
16 specific challenges they face in the city, including
17 trucks having to block bus and bike lanes while
18 making deliveries, the three-hour time restriction
19 imposed on vehicles in commercial loading zones,
20 vehicles with placards parking in commercial loading
21 zones, and construction activity in and around
22 commercial loading zones. What is DOT doing to
23 ensure that deliveries in the city are more efficient
24 in these spaces, and has DOT study the effects of the

2 three hour time restriction in commercial loading
3 zones?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yes. So it's a
5 really good point, because, you know, again, as
6 Diniece said, there are bad apples out there. But we
7 think the vast majority of truck drivers want to do
8 the right thing. But we have to provide space for
9 them to do the right thing. And if you go-- go on a
10 street, if they need to deliver something heavy,
11 they're going to be close to their destination. And
12 if the truck loading zone is blocked, they're--
13 they're going to continue-- they're going to park
14 wherever they can.

15 So part of it is comes through design, and we
16 want to create rules and create street designs that
17 try to-- that create the right amount of space for
18 this. And then as we've talked about, the other part
19 of it is enforcement and when we create clear rules,
20 making sure that other vehicles are not blocking
21 those spaces, you know, not a construction worker
22 with a construction hat in the in the window, that--
23 and we've worked very closely with our colleagues
24 here to make sure that those rules are being enforced
25 correctly. And we have talked about the three-hour

2 limit. You know, part of the goal is to try to
3 encourage turnover, that it's not meant to be a space
4 where trucks just can occupy it all day. But, you
5 know, if there's places where three hours really
6 isn't enough, I think we've been open to-- to
7 thinking about different rules and different ways to
8 manage our curb space.

9 MS. MENDES: And just to add to that, the
10 microhubs pilot that we referenced, that we're-- we
11 are hoping to launch later this summer, will also
12 sort of help to address some of the areas that have
13 high demand. We know that there are particularly
14 areas that have sort of very sort of a high vertical
15 and dense market where they aren't able to serve as
16 many customers. So locating some of these hubs in
17 areas that can help to offset that can also help to
18 address some of those broader issues, in terms of
19 dwell time and elements at the curb.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Just touching on
21 congestion pricing for a little bit. How does DOT
22 expect congestion pricing will affect the truck
23 routes?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Right. And, you
25 know, we obviously, we've been very close partners

2 with the MTA as they've been pursuing their-- their
3 environmental review, which we-- you know, we all
4 hope will finish soon. So the details of the effect
5 on the-- on trucks will depend on the plan that's
6 eventually chosen by the-- by the MTA and what
7 tolling aspects they choose.

8 Certainly we're very aware of trying to make sure
9 that anything that's chosen is has an eye towards
10 reducing the effects of truck traffic, that they're--
11 that we're not just pushing it into different
12 neighborhoods, that we are encouraging the off-hour
13 deliveries the way we do through our program. So I
14 think we're excited to continue working with the MTA
15 on those-- those specific details.

16 How will DOT ensure that that congestion pricing
17 does not merely just redirect traffic to low-income
18 communities and communities of color? Like what--
19 Like how are you working-- making sure that doesn't
20 happen?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Right. So we're
22 working very closely with them. Obviously, in the
23 draft environmental assessment, in some of the
24 scenarios, there was an increase in-- in truck
25 traffic in areas like the South and Central Bronx.

2 And so we both want to work with the MTA on the
3 appropriate tolling scheme to make sure that they
4 choose the right scenarios, and then to the extent
5 that it does shift some truck traffic, we want to
6 work with things like the clean trucks program that
7 Charles talked about, to make sure that anything that
8 can be seen as a negative effect, we really are
9 offsetting with other investments, because we think
10 that congestion pricing is a very good thing for the
11 city. But we do need to make sure that it's done
12 correctly, so that it's good for everyone. And isn't
13 just creating winners and losers. xxx

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you, and how
15 does DOT work with like Google Maps and those type of
16 companies to integrate truck routes in certain areas?

17 MS. MENDES: Sure. Great question. So we, so
18 our truck route map and network data is available on
19 our website, as well as open data for any companies
20 that wish to obtain that and ways to integrate that
21 within their platform. So we make that readily
22 available.

23 Just last year, we worked with Google so that
24 they can use our truck routing data to develop
25 capabilities to integrate that into their platforms.

2 We've not seen sort of the latest of that. But we
3 are actively working on engaging with these routing
4 companies, particularly. Generally, we know that
5 commercial-grade GPS devices or software are a lot
6 more expensive, particularly for the owner/operators
7 than sort of the regular, the broader companies in
8 general. So we see that there's a need to create or
9 promote the use of commercial GPSs for routing
10 vehicles.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Do you have reason to
12 believe that these companies are directing trucks off
13 of the truck route at all?

14 MS. MENDES: Not necessarily. I think they do a
15 good job at putting out their liability disclaimers
16 and everything in terms of "it is your
17 responsibility" to determine, you, know how you use
18 their-- their platforms. And I think that's
19 something that we can certainly try to find ways to
20 learn a little bit more about how that's actually
21 being done. But they aren't really capturing if this
22 person is identifying as a commercial vehicle
23 operator or truck operator, and that's something I
24 think we can certainly find ways to improve.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I think we should
3 definitely work towards it. Because I know
4 oftentimes when they get stopped in my community, in
5 particular, they often revert back and say, "Well,
6 this is what the direction is telling me to go."

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah. And we see
8 that happening a lot. Like this often comes up with
9 Waze in particular, because the more aggressively
10 route people. We-- There's a government partnership
11 program with them, where when we're seeing a frequent
12 thing, it doesn't mean that an individual might not
13 get routed on a particular day, but if everyone is
14 being routed down Second Avenue instead of Third
15 Avenue, then we can go to them and say, "You need to
16 take this out of your options list." And, you know,
17 I wouldn't say that it's been perfect, but they--
18 they have listened when we've raised frequent issues.
19 And you know, it's a little becomes a little bit of
20 Whack-A-Mole. Like, we wish the companies were more
21 proactive, as Diniece said, to push better commercial
22 GPS instead of just people using their phones.

23 But when we do see frequent issues, we have
24 contacts with the companies. So if the places you're

2 seeing it a lot, please let us know, and we will help
3 follow up with those companies and try to address it.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. I wanted
5 to circle back to a question I missed in terms of
6 parking for trucks. What type of planning is DOT
7 doing to ensure that there's an adequate amount of
8 parking spaces for trucks? Has DOT applied for the
9 recently announced federal grants to assist with
10 truck parking? So the second part of the question is
11 the part I didn't recall hearing an answer, in terms
12 of the federal grants.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah. So the answer
14 to that is: Not yet. But we as we come up with these
15 more specific plans, we certainly expect, just as we
16 have in many other places, to be applicants for those
17 federal programs.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Off-hours delivery
19 program: In 2010, and coordinating with partners in
20 the federal government, academia, and private
21 industry, DOT piloted off-- piloted the off hours
22 delivery program. The program offers financial
23 incentives to businesses that agree to receive
24 deliveries during overnight hours instead of during
25 the business day. When did the off-hours delivery

2 program become a permanent program in New York City?

3 What type of financial incentives are offered to the

4 businesses that are part of this program? How has

5 DOT conducted outreach to businesses to generate

6 interest in the program? And lastly, what type of

7 support does DOT offer to businesses transitioning

8 into the program?

9 MS. MENDES: Yep. Quite a few questions. And
10 we'll try to answer that as succinctly as possible.

11 So yes, you were writing stating that there was a
12 pilot program where we relied on federal funding for
13 the pilot program. The program became permanent in
14 2019. There was a mayoral press conference about
15 expanding the commitments for off-hour deliveries.

16 Currently, we do targeted outreach to vertically
17 integrated chains, folks that may have a little bit
18 easier path in transitioning to the off hours. And
19 we are targeting areas south of-- south of 59th
20 Street in Manhattan, downtown Brooklyn, more busy
21 areas in different parts of the city.

22 We have leveraged a combination of in-person
23 outreach, as well as marketing campaigns. We've been
24 expensive, placing ads in advertorial-- advertorials,
25 in trade publications to really get at the leaders

2 that can make decisions about making this change,
3 because it is a wholesale change for that particular
4 company.

5 So we've leveraged all parts of outreach. We've
6 also leveraged working with the trucking industry to
7 promote this as a critical strategy, particularly for
8 transporters. They see the win-win here in terms of
9 improve efficiency for the operations. But the
10 challenge has often been in working with receivers
11 who oftentimes control when those deliveries get to
12 those particular areas.

13 And then I think there was a last-- your last
14 question, can you just repeat that?

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What types of support
16 does DOT offer to businesses transitioning into the
17 program?

18 MS. MENDES: Great, excellent. So we have
19 dedicated staff that provide sort of technical
20 assistance in helping to make that switch, whether it
21 be a transporter or a business looking to receive
22 deliveries during the off hours, and what that may
23 look like. We go through an onboarding process. We
24 oftentimes, particularly for companies that come to
25 us, we will also do matchmaking. So, "Hey, you're

2 looking to do deliveries during the off hours, this
3 other business might be interested." And then we
4 also help to facilitate that connection to improve
5 efficiency as well and also more outsized impact.

6 We provide guidance, particularly for noise
7 mitigation to make sure that they are being good
8 neighbors, particularly if they are delivering
9 overnight. And then, where possible, we look to
10 provide curb access, which is sort of one of our
11 bigger, bigger levers. We are looking at ways to
12 sort of add more incentives to the program. And we'd
13 be happy to sort of talk to you more details about
14 that as we advance.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. How is
16 DOT implementing federal funding and increased
17 education to improve truck route rule compliance, and
18 what type of outreach is done for drivers and
19 businesses?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure. So this has
21 generally been a city funded program, but we do have
22 an extensive program really focused on education and
23 outreach.

24 MS. MENDES: So we have a multipronged approach.
25 We use our truck route maps. We've distributed at

2 least 18,000, or upwards-- close to 20,000 maps just
3 within the last year, since the new map has been
4 issued.

5 But on average, we, we found out a lot of those
6 maps either working with our partners at PD,
7 particularly when they are doing the enforcement to
8 make sure that truck drivers are aware of the routes
9 and of the rules. We also work with our partners
10 within the Trucking Association to help to promote
11 and disseminate that information. Our freight
12 webpage is also a great resource as a one-stop shop,
13 particularly for truck operators.

14 And just in testimony, Eric mentioned our Truck
15 Smart campaign, which we launched last year. We've
16 produced a truck safety guide for truck operators to
17 make sure that they have all the information about
18 how to operate safely within New York City. That--
19 that guide is available digitally on our website, as
20 well as in print. We've also created different
21 languages, in three different languages to make sure
22 this more accessible to other truck drivers that are
23 particularly operating.

24 Certainly there's room to improve. You know, we
25 have also deployed education outreach teams, as part

2 of the Vision Zero work to make sure that there's
3 increased awareness, particularly when we stop
4 drivers if it's dusk-- the dusk-to-dawn campaign or
5 others.

6 We've also leveraged our truck educational--
7 Trucks Eye View, which is a public education campaign
8 working with communities, and bringing more awareness
9 to vulnerable road users about the larger blind spots
10 associated with trucks.

11 So we are really targeting drivers. But we're
12 also targeting cyclists as well as pedestrians as
13 well. It's really a wide spectrum. And I'd be happy
14 to answer any more questions. But there's always
15 room to improve. And we're looking at ways to do
16 that.

17 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: I just wanted to
18 add, that with regard to the-- I wanted to point out
19 about rental companies, truck rental companies.

20 Sometimes those could be some of the offenders too,
21 that go with over-height vehicles onto parkways or
22 areas that have low clearances. So we-- as part of
23 that outreach and education, we also send these
24 outreach materials. Here's a the truck route map to
25 the U-Hauls and the Penske and all the other rental

2 companies. So they're aware of when somebody's
3 renting a truck, like especially at the end of the
4 month, when they're going to move from one place to
5 the other. They tell them, "Here is the rules," so
6 that they are aware about it.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you, and have
8 there been any programs to streamline deliveries to
9 big buildings and office complexes?

10 MS. MENDES: Not specifically. I think we have
11 several programs on our end, like our off-hour
12 deliveries program that looks at sort of the high
13 demand areas that could potentially be, you know, a
14 large building. We see this as sort of our broader
15 approach to improve sort of efficiencies for
16 deliveries, whether it be providing a loading zone,
17 et cetera, to help to facilitate better deliveries at
18 that particular establishment.

19 So it is really a broad approach or that were
20 like applying with multiple strategies. We have seen
21 opportunities to maybe better develop resources for
22 building owners and property managers to think about
23 how they can improve deliveries for that particular
24 facility. And those are some things that we you've
25 highlighted in Deliver New York as recommendations

2 for producing better resources. So that's something
3 that we can certainly continue to elaborate on.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for that.

5 And what is DOT doing ensure that it receives the
6 most federal funding that it can particularly from
7 the infrastructure investment and jobs at?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure, we know we are
9 very excited about all the opportunities from the
10 bill and the IGA. We are applying for every single
11 program that we that is appropriate for us. And
12 we've been, I think, actually quite successful--

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What types of grants
14 has DOT applied for in, one, related to trucking and
15 deliveries?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So like, for
17 example, the Reyes Grant, where Charles mentioned,
18 we're looking at the Cross Bronx, the-- the ATTAIN
19 Grant. You know, I think there's a lot-- We expect
20 to have grant applications as well around some of the
21 new electric vehicle programs that were just
22 announced. So I think there are some of these that
23 are more specifically truck-oriented. There are
24 others where trucks are an important component of how
25 we're planning overall. So it's hard to separate out

2 ones that are just truck, but trucks are obviously a
3 very important component of a lot of these other
4 grants that we've applied for.

5 And one thing we've been very successful so far,
6 both writing good grants and working with our folks
7 in Washington to help make the case for why our
8 grants are so important. And, you know, certainly
9 our congressional delegation, and our senatorial
10 delegate delegation has done great work as well. So
11 we're going to continue every opportunity we can for
12 federal money.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And how does DOT
14 leverage existing partnerships locally, nationally,
15 and internationally to improve delivery and logistics
16 systems and adapt new technology?

17 MS. MENDES: Thank you for your question. We
18 know that this issue is not unique to New York City
19 or even the US. In fact, there are forums like C40,
20 which is a network of cities that meet together to
21 talk through best practices, share lessons learned,
22 particularly around freight, curb management, et
23 cetera. We are an active partner and member of that
24 coalition.

2 We also share best practices with other local
3 cities, like Seattle, or comparable cities like DC,
4 and have regular communications about what strategies
5 have worked, and how we can also share. I think
6 what's also unique in this space is that New York
7 City has been a leader in implementing and piloting a
8 lot of strategies and finding ways to move forward,
9 particularly in an era that has been long, sort of
10 forgotten or an afterthought in planning and
11 transportation. So this is really an opportunity
12 that New York City has taken head-- head on.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Just want to touch on
14 some of the legislation that's being considered today
15 also. So for Intro 708, would DOT be supportive of
16 implementing daylighting at each intersection
17 adjacent to the truck route network?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yes. That's why I
19 mentioned this in testimony. But the answer is no,
20 we don't think that a blanket policy is appropriate.
21 I think as we designate a new truck route, we will
22 want to look at the truck route as a corridor for
23 where treatments like daylighting might be
24 appropriate. But we don't think it makes sense as a
25 as a requirement for every location.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Would you agree to
3 say that trucks may have limited visibility because
4 of the height and size of the vehicle?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So some trucks have--
6 - have larger visibility issues. And we-- That's--

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm talking about the
8 ones that's carrying most of the freight -- the
9 semis, the 18-wheeler trucks. Like, would you agree?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So they often have
11 visibility issues. Those visibility issues are not--

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Often? I think it's
13 pretty much factual that they do, which is--

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So most of them do.
15 The visibility issues aren't always in front. You
16 know, the visibility issues are often sort of behind
17 and on either side, which is not something that's
18 necessarily addressed by daylighting.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: When you see the
20 crashes that incorporate the trucks, do you find that
21 those accidents have been wires from the front or
22 sides, more so, or the back more so?

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So there's a--
24 there's a mix, right? There's a type of crash where,
25 you know, if a person, particularly a shorter person

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 131

2 is crossing directly in front of a truck, like right
3 in front, there's a visibility issue there. And we
4 there's a couple of very, very sad times every year
5 when we see that issue. I think the larger number do
6 tend to happen when a truck is either turning or sort
7 of changing lanes, and it's sort of in that spot
8 that's behind. And that's a real issue. It's part
9 of why we both--

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: So turning, which is
11 why we think that daylighting makes sense, right?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So it-- I would
13 respectfully disagree, because we think that
14 daylighting really helps the truck turn at a higher
15 speed. What we want to do on turns is make the turn
16 as tight as possible, so that a truck turns very
17 slowly and very obviously. And if we daylight in a
18 way that's-- that's not correct--

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: But we're not-- we're
20 not debating in terms of what type of daylighting,
21 we're just saying to daylight so that there could be
22 increased visibility for the truck when they have to
23 make the turn.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So we-- I guess, I
25 would say I don't think that that type of visibility

2 is what the lighting does. Daylighting helps the
3 visibility when a truck is looking forw-- any vehicle
4 is looking forward. And a pedestrian is stepping
5 out. It's not really--

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What about-- What
7 about daylighting with physical infrastructure along
8 with it?

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So I don't think
10 that that addresses the type of crash that you're
11 talking about. We think that that is more valuable
12 than just daylighting with signs only. But it still
13 gets at the forward-looking visibility, not as much
14 to helping address the blind spot of the trailer.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Well, we understand
16 that like. There's not one dynamic that's going to
17 cure all of the issues, but at a very minimum,
18 putting daylighting would be addressing one form of
19 crashes that we're seeing, and increased visibility.
20 Has DOT engaged with the Trucking Association to see
21 what their thoughts are in terms of having greater
22 daylighting to provide greater visibility?

23 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: I just want to
24 jump in. Just-- I think the point Eric is trying to
25 make is that daylighting in some circumstances can

2 make worse the geometries not, not be neutral. So
3 that's-- that's one of the major concerns with the
4 mandate that is requiring for when we revisit a truck
5 route, that if we're mandated to do something,
6 there's the possibility that it would make safety
7 lesser.

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Right. And we think
9 daylighting is appropriate. And I don't mean to say
10 that daylighting is not something we would ever want
11 to do. It's the blanket requirement that we have an
12 issue with, doing it every single location.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What is the average
14 cost to replace truck route signage along the New
15 York City Truck route network?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: I don't think-- a
17 couple of couple hundred dollars per location. You
18 know, it's more efficient, if you're doing a lot in a
19 series versus having to just send a crew out. The
20 actual sign is probably \$40.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And as we're, like,
22 looking to move Intro 708 forward, can DOT commit to
23 working with the sponsor on addressing some of the
24 concerns you may have, but at the same time being
25 able to help us craft the legislation, so we're

2 implementing something that can help bring greater
3 safety as it pertains to the trucks and where they
4 are?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah. So we're
6 happy to work with you.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay. Intro 906:
8 Does DOT take into account tractor trailers and
9 parking areas when designating-- I guess it's kind of
10 hard to say because I haven't really updated it-- but
11 the New York City Truck Route Network. Oh, I guess
12 will you take into account?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah. I think
14 that's actually a good question looking forward.
15 Like is something we should take into account, the
16 recommendations from the task force.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And how are tractor
18 trailers regulated in New York City right now?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So tractor trailers
20 are regulated at every level of government. We have
21 a series of traffic rules in the city that apply, in
22 particular, as Charles mentioned, around over-length
23 trucks, often called 53 footers, so it's really end
24 to end can't be more than 55 feet. There are also
25 important regulations at both the state and federal

2 levels that I think our colleagues mentioned. They
3 are specially trained folks who know how to enforce
4 those regulations as well.

5 So there's a lot of regulations there's certain
6 ones that we can control at the city level, and we
7 want to use those to the maximum of our ability, but
8 some of it does involve working with state and
9 federal partners as well.

10 And for Intro 924 has DOT previously studied how
11 street design can be used to deter commercial
12 vehicles from using residential streets?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So we have not come
14 out with what I call a published study on it. I
15 don't have a document I can send you to on our
16 website. But it is something that that we have
17 thought about and are using in many of our street
18 redesigns today, both for trucks and for other
19 through traffic that isn't appropriate.

20 So it's-- We do have the tools in our toolbox and
21 in places where we see issues we use those, and we're
22 happy to work with the sponsor or anyone else looking
23 at locations of concern.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: You're right.
25 Because as you're doing Vision Zero, and you know,

2 the streets plan, there may be an opportunity, once
3 again to kind of factor in the truck route as well.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yup.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And then in your
6 testimony as you were talking about the citywide
7 freight-- decarbonization and truck electrification
8 strategy, what's your timeline for that?

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: [TO ASSISTANT
10 COMMISSIONER UKEGBU:] Charles?

11 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: [TO DEPUTY
12 COMMISSIONER BEATON:] Yeah, I'm actually going to
13 yield to Diniece on that.

14 MS. MENDES: Sure. We're looking to wrap that up
15 by early next year. We've done quite a lot of work
16 in terms of engaging with critical stakeholders who
17 are going to be critical to-- to helping to
18 decarbonize and sort of the carbon neutrality by
19 2050, which is part of the city's sustainability
20 goals.

21 Right now, the study is focusing on what are the
22 barriers to truck electrification and the broader
23 shift to cleaner trucks and cleaner vehicles that are
24 operating on our streets? And how do we address
25 these challenges? What are the levers? What are the

2 incentives that we need to push forward at the city
3 level? And then how do we scale up with the
4 infrastructure to support that shift to cleaner
5 vehicles? So that's the broad scope. I'd be happy
6 to answer any additional questions.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: But what's the
8 timeline though.

9 MS. MENDES: I said within the next year. So
10 early next year.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sorry I missed that
12 part. Okay.

13 MS. MENDES: That's okay. That's fine.

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: I also want to
15 add that there are programs in place right now that
16 we'll want to leverage as we go forward. For
17 example, the Clean Trucks Program includes
18 significant requirements, especially using the
19 supplemental VW settlement money that we got, that
20 specifically requires us to spend it on electric
21 vehicle truck procurements and incentives. So there
22 is a way by which we can expedite this process so
23 that it's not just a long term vision, but we can
24 have some early action implementation.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, and then my two
3 last questions: One, when you were talking about
4 Intro 708, you just spoke about the fact that you
5 have your own hearings and public comments. How
6 frequently do you conduct these hearings?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So it's really tied
8 to when we're doing any kind of rule change, which,
9 you know, our truck routes are in our rules. So
10 those are a rule change. But so, you know, when
11 we're changing the loading regulations, any of these
12 are a rule change. So it's a-- Within that-- Within
13 that law, there's specific timelines for when you
14 publish public notice, when you have to have the
15 public hearing, and how those are conducted.

16 So the-- the number and frequency are variable
17 based on how many rules we're adjusting in a year.
18 But it's-- it's a required part of the process.

19 As I've said, we're happy to look at things that
20 we can do above and beyond that, but there are just
21 certain-- certain things that we have to do, and
22 certain things that we can't do in close proximity
23 to-- to those hearings. So we just need to be
24 thoughtful about the requirements so that we're not
25 tying ourselves in a knot.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Oh, okay. I'm going
3 to kick it over to Councilmember Avilés for more
4 questions.

5 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you. Thank you.
6 I've wanted to touch base on a couple of different
7 things. In terms of the Clean Truck Program. Can
8 you tell me exactly how the total funding allocation
9 for this program what has been utilized today and has
10 it reached more than just, I guess, the area of the
11 Bronx?

12 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: Right. With
13 regard to the Clean Trucks Program, we have spent--
14 actually it is funded at about \$30 million thus far.
15 We have done about-- Up to 2015, we did up to 500
16 trucks. While that includes basically retrofits, as
17 well as new truck replacements, and then in some
18 cases they were just purchases of battery electric
19 vehicle programs. As of this year, I think we are at
20 about 600 trucks so far.

21 In terms of the starting location, as I mentioned
22 before, it started in the South Bronx. But in 2020,
23 when we got the VW monies, we extended it to a city--
24 as a citywide initiative to all industrial business
25 zones. And the-- the benefit, there was really these

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 140

2 are industrial business zones that are also adjacent
3 to environmental justice communities.

4 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: 100 percent, yeah.

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: So this was a big
6 benefit for us.

7 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: So what-- The \$30 million
8 dollars is the total amount of the program? What has
9 been expended to date?

10 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: I think-- I can
11 get back to you with regard to the exact numbers.

12 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Okay. And I'd love to
13 know a breakdown, if in my -- I have one of the
14 largest industrial manufacturing zones -- how much of
15 our industrial manufacturing partners have taken
16 advantage of that? In fact, I know Red Hook
17 Container Terminal has another port elsewhere in New
18 Jersey, and with the support of federal funding, they
19 transition their entire fleet. But has not been able
20 to do that in New York City because they have not
21 been able to access additional subsidized support.

22 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: Understood.

23 That's a good quite a good point. Well, one of your
24 resident businesses, Manhattan Beer[?] is one of our

25

2 big clients that has actually taken significant
3 advantage of this.

4 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Okay. Well, we want to
5 encourage our entire industrial manufacturing fleet--

6 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: Absolutely.

7 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: --to go green. Without
8 question. So I'd love to follow up.

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: But also just as
10 a point of information, just remember also that
11 sometimes there's a constraint about the replacement
12 cycle of trucks.

13 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Sure.

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER UKEGBU: You know, trucks,
15 they have a 12-year service life. If you just
16 purchased your trucks, and then we require you to
17 give back this truck, so as to take it off the
18 roadway as it is heavier polluting, you have to
19 assess the benefit of costs. And that's what we do
20 with you to figure out what the best replacement that
21 you can do on what your cycle for doing that.

22 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Right in terms of the
23 neighborhood commercial truck, an interesting
24 corridor we have is our Eighth Avenue corridor in
25 Sunset Park. A very, very challenging corridor. We

2 saw the placement of quite a number of truck loading
3 and unloading as loans. And I can't tell you-- I
4 have never been on Eighth Avenue and have observed
5 one truck actually using the truck loading and
6 unloading those because they're normally just cars
7 sitting there all day long, all night long. No one
8 observes the truck loading and unloading zones. One
9 of the most congested corridors in New York City, and
10 probably very, very unsafe for-- for many of our
11 residents. Can you tell me a little bit about--
12 Have you gone back to see the effectiveness of
13 hanging up all the signs on Eighth Avenue? And how
14 does the city-- how is it going to continue to
15 implement and monitor that?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah. No, I mean,
17 Eighth Avenue is a place we've looked at quite a bit
18 over the years. And, you know, I think the truck
19 loading zones, we agree, are not providing all of the
20 needs of that corridor. You know, we-- As you may
21 know, late in the last administration, there was a
22 proposal to do a more aggressive treatment that was--
23 just got a challenging reception locally. I think we
24 still feel like on Eighth Avenue as well as Seventh
25 Avenue, there are real concerns about safety, about

2 bus speeds, about commercial access. And, you know,
3 I think we-- we welcome working together on how to
4 revisit those corridors.

5 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Yeah. Or how DOT
6 coordinates with PD around how those corridors are
7 engaged, right? Those-- That specific truck loading
8 and unloading if. If there's never anyone doing
9 enforcement, ever, that doesn't change anything. We
10 haven't seen any enforcement there at all. No change
11 of behavior.

12 So I guess, I'd like to know, like, in those
13 instances, right?, we understand there's like a
14 culture of practice that's not great here. How--
15 What is a proactive plan that the agency takes when
16 it is trying to kind of shift a culture of practice
17 in a corridor that is problematic? Do you just let
18 it be and nobody pays attention? Or is there some
19 kind of strategy that you attempt to implement?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: I would say that
21 that corridor is particularly problematic in part
22 because of how the last administration left things.
23 You know, I think in general, we- we try not to just
24 say we're going to enforce our way out. Like, I'm
25 sure, if I asked my colleagues to go, they could be

2 they're much, much more. But what we typically like
3 to do is work with the BID, work with, you know, the
4 local community, and try to get good information out,
5 and, you know, try to have it be education as much as
6 it is enforcement. I think there's still some bad
7 feelings there that are not totally resolved and has
8 made that interaction more challenging.

9 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Yeah. If you if you know
10 me, you know enforcement is not the first approach I
11 would like to take. But we see no presence at all.
12 In fact, no even engagement around the fact that, you
13 know, this is a new treatment, right? There's none,
14 no engagement at all, from any agency on that
15 corridor. So I hear you about the last
16 administration. But I think it begs the question of
17 if we are going to implement a change, right?, and
18 allocate agency resources. And we know, this is an
19 important one, albeit controversial, there has to be
20 consistent engagement for residents, both to
21 understand the meaning of the treatment, and for-- to
22 change behavior. But putting up signs and then
23 walking away is not acceptable. And in fact, it just
24 actually does the opposite. It has a deleterious
25 effect on residents who feel like, "Well, you know,

2 the City doesn't care. They just hang up a sign and
3 it doesn't-- nothing, nothing matters."

4 So we have to continue-- We'd love to continue
5 the conversation, because we're starting to see this
6 behavior happen in many other commercial corridors in
7 our district. It's the same kind of like benign
8 neglect, and no...

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah. Absolutely.
10 Let's talk more about it. Because I think both
11 making sure that what we have out there works, and
12 seeing if there's even more we can do for safety
13 would be really appropriate there.

14 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: And in the just a bit of a
15 meta question in terms of truck redesign. I mean,
16 how-- how does the agency incorporate environmental
17 impacts around how it is looking at redesign or-- or
18 even allowing. So for instance, I've said this to a
19 number of times, Van Brunt Street is-- is one of the
20 two streets, truck routes. It was it has received no
21 infrastructure upgrades, yet the city has allowed six
22 last-mile facilities in the process of being
23 developed, which will introduce thousands of trucks.
24 This street has no treatment, and will have no
25 treatment despite it already crumbling

2 infrastructure. How does the City proactively look
3 at an Environmental Justice Community and
4 environmental justice criteria before it allows the
5 proliferation of these kinds of facilities and
6 impacts?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yes. So I mean, I
8 can't speak to the land use issues. Obviously, we
9 haven't we have colleagues in the city that are
10 better suited to that. But I think what is true is
11 we've seen that there's been a real change in Red
12 Hook. You know, we've done a number of studies in
13 Red Hook in the past, and there were changes. You
14 know, there's new traffic signals along Van Brunt
15 Street that were not there previously, but those were
16 all before sort of these new land use changes came
17 about, and I think that's why we think it's very
18 appropriate that we're refocused on the-- taking a
19 fresh look at the transportation issues around Red
20 Hook, and, you know, without-- we're still at the
21 beginning of the study, but it's a little hard to
22 imagine that we'll get through it and say nothing at
23 all about Van Brunt Street. So more to come.

24 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Yeah. No, the frustration
25 is the post-- Right? It's always the post-mortem:

2 What we could have changed after we introduced
3 multiple facilities, and-- and allow the use of a
4 corridor that is wholly incapable of sustaining what
5 we are allowing to proliferate, right? That's the
6 frustration of the community.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah.

8 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: And the fact that they
9 have been sounding the alarms on this, and it takes
10 us 10 years to actually finally get to a place of
11 agreement to implement the study, and the context has
12 changed and become significantly worse. So-- So I
13 guess I, just as a point of comment, would love to
14 really see how, and understand how the agency is more
15 proactive and inter-coordinating with other agencies,
16 when they understand something is happening in an
17 Environmental Justice Community that it-- it have
18 clear thresholds and understanding around-- we know
19 this community cannot suffer 15-more-1000 trucks a
20 day. And yet, you know, it's like turning a blind
21 eye. So like to proactively engage and look at,
22 comprehensively, how we become a safer and better
23 city, and how communities who have been historically
24 neglected are looked at first and foremost in impact.
25 So just broad points.

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah. Point well
3 taken.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, we're now going
5 to move to public testimony. I ask that NYPD and DOT
6 leave someone behind in case we need to ask any
7 additional questions on this, and and also hear from
8 the public.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yup. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

11 COUNSEL: Thank you. We'll now move to public
12 testimony. Each panelist will be given two minutes
13 to speak. For panelists testifying in person, please
14 come to the dais as your name is called and wait for
15 your turn to speak. And for panelists who are
16 testifying remotely. Once your name is called, a
17 member of our staff will unmute you, and the Sergeant
18 At Arms will give you the go ahead to begin. Please
19 wait for the Sergeant to announce that you may begin
20 before delivering your testimony.

21 I would like to now welcome Gloria Boyce Charles,
22 Sarah Elbakri, Kevin Garcia, and Zach Miller to
23 testify.

24 You may begin when ready

25 You may begin.

2 MS. BOYCE CHARLES: Good afternoon, everyone. My
3 name is Gloria Boyce Charles, I'm from the Brookville
4 Community in Southeast Queens. We are just next to--
5 adjacent to the JFK International Airport. I want to
6 thank the Councilmember Selvena Brooks-Powers for
7 chairing this important Committee and for supporting
8 the legislation on this important matter.

9 I must say that, I think that it's always a good
10 thing to revisit and redesign something that hasn't
11 been looked at for a long time, such as our truck
12 routes, given the changes and projections regarding
13 truck traffic. But I have to say that I've been
14 listening all afternoon and I'm a little confused
15 about some of the things I'm hearing.

16 A lot of what's going on in our community is not
17 necessarily a matter of how trucks are-- are routed
18 it's a matter of how trucks are being monitored and
19 how enforcement is taking place. Per Section 385 of
20 the DOT Vehicle and Traffic Law, it says that a 53
21 foot trailer-- trailer is allowed only limited travel
22 through New York City to reach destinations on Long
23 Island using the following routes. And it talks
24 about I-95. It talks about I-295. It talks about I-
25 495. And we seem to be suggesting that one of the

2 biggest problems that we have with trucking activity-
3 - trucks going up and down our streets and parking on
4 our streets-- is that they're not managed.

5 The biggest problem is they're not supposed to be
6 there. They are not supposed to be in our
7 communities in the first place. And I didn't hear
8 anybody acknowledge that today. And that's very
9 concerning. It makes me wonder if in redesigning the
10 truck routes, there is going to be an effort to
11 normalize their activity on our streets, and just
12 ignore the fact that there's a rule on the books that
13 says they're not supposed to be there at all. Now
14 when you hear from Miss Barbara Brown from the
15 Eastern Queens Alliance, she'll reinforce that: that
16 that's something she, you know, she found because in
17 our communities we've been complaining for a long
18 time. And we were always told that, you know, the
19 trucks have a right to come up and down your streets
20 if they're trying to get to a warehouse that they
21 need to be at.

22 But the fact of the matter is 53-foot trucks,
23 foot trucks don't have that right. It says right
24 here that 53-foot long trailers are not allowed to
25 make pickups or deliveries in any of the boroughs of

2 New York City. So I'm very concerned about the
3 attempt to normalize that activity this afternoon.
4 Maybe I'm not understanding something.

5 Now, there were other things that were said
6 today. And if you'll allow me another couple of
7 minutes, I just want to-- I just want to share a few
8 thoughts.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: So you could just do
10 it in another minute. But Ms. Boyce Charles, you can
11 also submit written testimony as well.

12 MS. BOYCE CHARLES: Yes. I'm going to actually
13 go out and revise my-- my testimony based on what I
14 heard today. But I'm very happy that, you know,
15 there's going to be some ground truthing on the part
16 of DOT as they prepare their report, and to do the
17 redesign.

18 I hope that that ground truthing is done in a
19 robust manner. I hope that they will come into our
20 communities not just to send somebody to look at a
21 couple of areas and, you know, click a button and say
22 how many trucks are moving about and what sizes they
23 are, not just by having some public hearings that 50
24 people show up to, but I hope that they will actually
25 send people who are going to be writing these reports

2 into our communities to walk up and down our streets,
3 to talk to our people, and to see the-- the
4 disruption of these 53 foot tractor trailer trucks in
5 our communities. They should see how people who have
6 homes are being imposed upon by truck repair shops
7 and trucking warehouses just on the other side of the
8 street. They should-- they should see how one of our
9 residents has a big white fence with tire tracks in
10 it from 53 foot truck-- tractor trailer trucks trying
11 to-- driving into her fence in an effort to park
12 their trail-- their tractor trailer in to a garage
13 bay that that really is not suited for a truck that
14 large. They should see how cars are being
15 sideswiped, and how streets are being put into
16 disrepair. And you know, the general disruption, how
17 people's homes are being compromised, cracks in our--
18 cracks in our ceilings, et cetera, based on all of
19 this activity.

20 And they should take a look at the research
21 that's been suggested here today that points to the
22 chronic illness in our communities and the high rate
23 of low birth weight and premature death, that-- that
24 that results from breathing in polluted air that they
25 contribute to.

2 They should come and they should see. And when
3 they do that, I hope that that will inform their
4 report and the way they route the trucks. I have
5 more to say but I will stop here. I will submit it
6 in my testimony. And I thank you so much for
7 indulging me. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you

9 Hello, everyone. My name is Sarah Elbakri. I'm
10 the Community Resilience coordinator of UPROSE!.
11 Thank you for the opportunity to provide testimony
12 today on behalf of Sunset Park and the Environmental
13 and Climate Justice Communities and Advocates in
14 support of legislation, intros 708 and 924. UPROSE!
15 Is Brooklyn's oldest Latino community-based
16 organization, where black and Indigenous Women of
17 color led intergenerational grassroots, and working
18 at the intersection of racial justice and climate
19 change in Sunset Park, Brooklyn, and beyond.

20 Sunset Park is an Environmental Justice Community
21 that has endured a legacy of toxic exposure and been
22 the reluctant host to a myriad of discriminatorily-
23 sited environmental burdens. UPROSE! is part of a
24 citywide coalition, the Last-Mile Coalition, which
25 advocates to regulate last-mile trucking facilities

2 in New York City and reduce the extreme truck
3 trucking issue in the city.

4 The explosive and unchecked growth of the e-
5 commerce industry and last-mile warehouses in New
6 York City is an environmental justice issue. And
7 these facilities are not regular warehouses. They're
8 mega in size, and bring many negative impacts to the
9 environment, health, the local economy, safety, and
10 traffic in surrounding communities.

11 These facilities exacerbate truck traffic that is
12 already very high in the city, and bringing them to
13 residential areas with narrow streets that weren't
14 designed for these uses, worsening air pollution and
15 asthma rates that are already extremely high, health
16 concerns, increasing congestion, and pedestrian
17 safety issues.

18 And these last-mile warehouses continue to be
19 sited and built in low income working class
20 communities of color like Sunset Park, with no
21 notice, or environmental review, or community
22 engagement processes.

23 There are at least two new mega-warehouses coming
24 to Sunset Park. And leaving this issue unregulated
25 and community health unprotected is unacceptable. So

2 as an Environmental Justice Community, Sunset Park
3 already deals with the cumulative impacts of other
4 polluting infrastructures such as the Gowanus
5 Expressway and BQE. And today, we continue to fight
6 for clean air, safe and healthy neighborhoods for
7 black and brown people that have been historically
8 overburdened and neglected by extractive
9 unsustainable practices that value profit over
10 people.

11 So the legislation proposed by Councilmember
12 Avilés that's up for hearing today is imperative to
13 protect the human rights of communities like Sunset
14 Park by redesigning New York City's truck routes, to
15 start improving safety of our streets, reduce
16 traffic, reduce congestion and reduce emissions. And
17 we believe this legislation will help start
18 addressing these negative impacts of e-commerce
19 facilities, last-mile warehouses in working class
20 communities of color and as climate and racial
21 justice advocates, UPROSE! urges the City Council to
22 do right by the most vulnerable and pass this
23 legislation which prioritizes community health and
24 justice. Thank you again.

25 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

2 MR. GARCIA: Good afternoon. Thank you for your
3 time-- for your time to speak today. My name is
4 Kevin Garcia and I'm the Transportation Planner with
5 the New York City Environmental Justice Alliance.
6 NYC-EJA is a nonprofit citywide membership network
7 linking grassroots organizations from low-income
8 neighborhoods and communities of color in the
9 struggle for environmental justice. NYC-EJA is also
10 a part of the Last-Mile Coalition, a citywide
11 coalition of environmental justice and public health
12 advocates fighting to regulate last-mile trucking
13 facilities in New York City.

14 I'm here to express NYC-EJA's support of Intro
15 708 and Intro 924. In the last decade, the e-
16 commerce market has exponentially grown, and the
17 demand for online goods has risen. Because goods in
18 New York City are transported primarily by trucks
19 last-mile warehouses tend to be sited by highways and
20 can only be sited in manufacturing and C8 districts.
21 In New York City, to meet the demand for next day and
22 same day delivery, there has been an unregulated
23 growth of last-mile warehouses that have been sited
24 in environmental justice communities. The size of
25 these facilities coupled with the demand of online

2 goods has led to an increase in the number of vans
3 and trucks needed to deliver goods to last-mile
4 warehouses and to complete the trip to their final
5 destination.

6 This increase in traffic has led to an increase
7 in tailpipe emissions, noise pollution, and public
8 safety concerns and Environmental Justice
9 Communities.

10 While passenger vehicles make up the majority of
11 the tailpipe emissions in New York City, heavy duty
12 vehicles make up 6% of the vehicle activity but
13 contribute 52% of on-road vehicle tailpipe PM 2.5
14 emissions, and 51% of on road vehicle NOx emissions
15 in New York City. A 2016 New York City DOH study
16 estimated that PM 2.5 pollution from traffic sources
17 contributed to 320 premature deaths and 870 emergency
18 department visits and hospitalizations every year.

19 The same agency found that the hospitalizations
20 for preventable asthma occurred disproportionately in
21 the poorest neighborhoods at a rate of up to 30 times
22 more frequent than in the wealthiest communities.

23 Trucks carry most freight in New York City and is
24 expected to remain the predominant mode past 2045 on
25 an already-constrained transportation network. Thus,

2 we strongly urge the City Council to move forward
3 with Intro 708 and Intro 924 to protect our
4 communities by redesigning the city's truck routes
5 and streets to reduce traffic in our communities and
6 reduce pedestrian safety concerns and improve air
7 quality. Thank you again.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

9 MR. MILLER: Good afternoon. Good afternoon
10 Chair Brooks-Powers and members of the Transportation
11 and Infrastructure Committee. My name is Zach
12 Miller. I'm the Metro Region Operations Manager for
13 the Trucking Association of New York. The safe and
14 efficient movement of goods and services are vital to
15 the economic vitality and growth of commerce in New
16 York City and the greater metropolitan region.
17 Trucks move goods and freight to grocery stores
18 markets and restaurants manufacturing facilities,
19 office buildings, construction sites, and residences.
20 Trucks come in many shapes and sizes.

21 The nature of communities local business and
22 industries dictate the truck traffic, which DOT uses
23 to determine whether a truck route is needed to
24 facilitate freight movement. The truck route network
25 is a key safety tool and we must ensure trucks stay

2 on route. That is why we are supportive of Intro 708
3 which would require DOT to redesign a safe truck
4 route network in consultation with city agencies,
5 affected residents, and representatives from
6 business, environmental and climate justice
7 organizations, street safety organizations,
8 industrial business zone administrators, and the
9 trucking logistics and last-mile delivery industries.

10 DOT's Office of Freight Mobility as part of their
11 best-- best practices engages with the various
12 stakeholders and agencies that are highlighted in the
13 bill and does so consistently. This has greatly
14 improved freight efficiency and served the city
15 especially well during the worst of the pandemic.

16 We agree that it is wise to codify these best
17 practices into law. With about 1300 miles of
18 designated roadways, NYC has one of the most complex
19 truck routes systems in the nation. We credit DOT
20 with their redesigned truck route network, outreach,
21 and map distribution as part of their Delivery New
22 Yorkers smart truck management plan for New York
23 City. It is crucial that this network be closely
24 monitored and improved, and we are delighted to see
25 the Council support DOT's efforts to do this.

2 The best way to ensure a safe and efficient truck
3 route network is not to reduce the options for truck
4 drivers to take, but to provide them with the tools
5 they need such as overnight truck parking,
6 neighborhood loading zones, curbside access, well-
7 maintain roads, and stronger signage in and around
8 the 21 IBCs throughout the city. It is also in the
9 best interest of all New Yorkers that we keep the
10 truck route network and bike lane network separate as
11 much as possible. Too often we have seen bike lanes
12 placed right in front of freight terminals which
13 creates the potential for unnecessary conflict.

14 We also must give credit to civic groups such as
15 the Queens community Task Force for solutions to
16 illegal truck parking. In their quest to solve the
17 overnight truck parking shortage, seeks to ensure
18 that traffic flows and delivery patterns are factored
19 in to provide both clear access to truck drivers, and
20 safe streets for communities. We appreciate both the
21 City Council and Adams Administration's dedication to
22 solving the overnight truck parking shortage and are
23 supportive of Intro 906.

24 This commonsense legislation will ensure our hard
25 working truck drivers will have a safe place to park,

2 and our communities will have safer cleaner streets.

3 Not only that, but it will help to facilitate even

4 greater sustainable and efficient initiative

5 initiatives such as off-hour deliveries, microhub

6 distribution centers, and electric vehicle charging

7 hubs, all of which need infrastructure to succeed and

8 our major goals for both DOT and TANY.

9 As always, the Trucking Association of New York
10 looks forward to ongoing collaboration and dialogue
11 with the City Council. Thank you for your time.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

13 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you so much. Well
14 done on the speed reading.

15 MR. MILLER: It reminds me I need to get glasses,
16 unfortunately.

17 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: I have the same-- I share
18 the same issue. Thank you. Mr. Miller, can you tell
19 us-- you heard the engagement around daylighting, the
20 city's resistance to having a blanket policy. Can
21 you talk to us about it?

22 MR. MILLER: Yeah. And I'll be honest, that was
23 the-- the paragraph I kind of skipped through here.
24 But we are-- I'm just going to read it.

2 Lastly, we are happy to see an emphasis placed on
3 daylighting at intersections adjacent to the truck
4 route network. In providing information from fleets
5 to open plans as part of their upcoming curb report,
6 we learned how frustrated many fleets are by curb
7 parking at intersections, with some asking us to
8 request the City to remove such parking. This is yet
9 another tool that DOT can utilize to make our streets
10 safer and to increase efficiency throughout the
11 trucker network.

12 So yeah. I mean, we-- Again, I would--
13 Engineering questions, you know, we would defer to
14 DOT and urban planners. But there is that
15 frustration, especially with some of the larger
16 trucks that deliver to job sites, construction sites,
17 that the-- the cars parked right there makes it
18 really difficult for them to turn. And I respect the
19 concern regarding speed. We want, you know,
20 vehicles, especially larger vehicles to move as
21 slowly as possible. But they kind of do by nature.
22 I mean, the trucks we're talking about are not going
23 to take wide, fast turns at these intersections, it's
24 almost impossible for them to do that.

2 Smaller vehicles, the box trucks, the cargo vans,
3 you know, again, I would defer to DOT. Perhaps
4 that's what they're referring to. But in terms of
5 the-- the space to turn: Yeah, many of our-- our
6 members flag that for us is as they'd love to see
7 some more daylighting at these intersections.

8 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: No. Thank you. That's
9 the experience that we see in the community every
10 single day. I have never seen a large truck speed
11 through a turn. There's just-- It's impossible to
12 do that given the conditions on New York City
13 streets. So thank you. Thank you for that.

14 I'd like to hear from the other members of the
15 panel in terms of what would you like to concretely
16 see or offer in terms of solutions the city should
17 truly look at moving forward in this context?
18 Additional recommendations?

19 MS. BOYCE-CHARLES: Well, if I may, I would like
20 to see more regulation around actually 53-foot trucks
21 not being allowed in-- in our city streets. I think
22 that these trucks should be offloading somewhere
23 else, dividing their load, and smaller conveyances
24 should be coming into our community.

2 I think that there should be regulation around
3 how many trucks can go up and down any given street
4 at any point in time. And I really think that there
5 needs to be more-- It needs to be built into the to
6 the report and the rerouting strategy, the whole
7 issue of how we're monitoring, measuring, evaluating,
8 enforcing, and holding people at the agency level
9 accountable. Who's held accountable to address our
10 issues?

11 A lot of times when we have issues and we go to
12 DOT, they say, "Oh, well, that's-- we're only
13 monitoring. It's an it's an NYPD issue." You go to
14 NYPD and well, they can't help you, because they
15 don't have enough boots. And then when they get
16 enough boots, they don't have enough places to take--
17 to tow the trucks too.

18 And so there's so many agencies engaged in so
19 much of passing the buck. And so there's a lack of
20 accountability and transparency. If all of these--
21 all this monitoring is taking place that I heard
22 today, where is that made available to the general
23 public? You know, transparency about who's-- who's
24 owning these warehouses in our community? And how
25 can we as community members reach out to these

2 people, to let them know how we feel about the way
3 they're doing business in our communities. And it's
4 not just trucking warehouses that are 500,000 feet or
5 more. I live in a community where warehouses are
6 embedded. I don't know how many square feet that
7 warehouse is. I know that it supports the air cargo
8 traffic for the air cargo for the JFK Airport. But,
9 you know, that needs to be consulted with too, and
10 managed too.

11 So, you know, I'd like to see a lot more of that
12 kind of coordination and attention to detail in our--
13 in our communities. Don't get me started.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you so much for
15 your testimonies.

16 MS. ALBAKRI: Oh, yeah, I was going to add, so--

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Oh. Sorry.

18 MS. ALBAKRI: --in terms of what we would like to
19 see: Definitely less trucks overall. And we think
20 that this could be achieved by transitioning more
21 towards using the waterfront and using more maritime,
22 rail, and clean transport. And specifically what
23 we've been hearing from community members is they
24 want to see more enforcement of overweight trucks
25 that are contributing to the crumbling neighborhood

2 infrastructure, you know, that weren't designed for
3 these huge trucks to come through on a daily basis.
4 And then also more-- more monitoring and
5 comprehensive proactive planning. So I think the
6 legislation that we're here to support today is a
7 really great step in the right direction to update
8 the truck routes that haven't been since the 1970s.

9 MR. GARCIA: And if I may, yeah, I think we would
10 like to see more low-traffic neighborhoods, more
11 daylighting, and other speed reduction measures. But
12 as mentioned by the other panelists, enforcement is
13 key, right? We can redesign our truck routes, we can
14 redesign our streets, but the enforcement of these
15 rules is also important.

16 We'd love to see more micro distribution hubs. I
17 know we're talking about the Department of
18 Transportation. But you know, our coalition has
19 submitted a zoning text amendment, which would define
20 and create a special permit process for these last-
21 mile warehouses, which are, you know, demanding
22 hundreds, thousands of more trucks to these
23 facilities to make these deliveries to the facility
24 and to the destination, and our infrastructure just
25 cannot take it. Thank you.

2 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: That's right. Thank you.
3 Because I think what we're also seeing is these
4 facilities are being built of, right, totally evaded-
5 - evading any evaluation of environmental impacts and
6 communities, and so something has got to change here.
7 It is unacceptable for corporations to come in and
8 build and not have any accountability or
9 responsibility for the impacts of their business on
10 our community residents. So thank you for that work.

11 COUNSEL: Thank you so much. We'll now move to
12 Lacey Tauber from the Office of the Brooklyn Borough
13 President.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 Hello, can you hear me?

16 COUNSEL: Yes, we can.

17 MS. TAUBER: Okay, great. Um, good morning Chair
18 Brooks-Powers and members of the Committee. Thank
19 you for holding this hearing today. As you may know,
20 environmental justice and reducing truck traffic in
21 environmental justice communities have been a major
22 priority of the Brooklyn Borough President since he
23 started his career.

24 And so we wanted to be here today to express
25 support for passing Intro 708 and 924, in addition to

2 just talk a little bit about, you know, some recent
3 successes we've had, including, you know, waste
4 equity, commercial waste zonings. But we really need
5 to build on this victory, and the next front, as
6 you've heard is really going to be regulating other
7 types of trucks, especially due to the rise of e-
8 commerce. In the last three years, the largest
9 percentage of 311 complaints about engine idling, air
10 quality, and truck activity have come from Brooklyn's
11 Waterfront Communities that also border the BQE, with
12 the largest uptick coming from neighborhoods where
13 the last-mile facilities have sprung up in industrial
14 zones. And we're working very proactively on
15 legislation about this. But in the meantime, I
16 really want to express support for the microhubs,
17 non-truck types of delivery methods, expanding cargo
18 bike delivery programs, state legislation to legalize
19 the larger bikes that can go further and hold more.

20 We really want to see these bills passed. We
21 want to see creative sign interventions, we want to
22 make sure that the planning includes diverse
23 stakeholders from within the industry and those who
24 are impacted by it, and we want to encourage the
25 council to hear Intro 721, which would explore how to

2 integrate truck routes with GPS, so that private
3 drivers can plan the routes more efficiently.

4 And finally, I will just say, we're very excited
5 about the expansion of loading zone, program off-hour
6 deliveries. As I mentioned, implementation of
7 commercial waste zones is going to be huge here.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

9 MS. TAUBER: And enforcement, especially of
10 oversized trucks. Thank you so much. I submitted
11 written testimony that goes into more detail.

12 COUNSEL: Thank you. We'll hear next from
13 Barbara Brown.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 MS. BROWN: Good afternoon, I want to thank
16 Councilmember Selvena Brooks-Powers for holding this
17 hearing. I'm going to send in testimony, so right
18 now I'm going to react to some of the things that
19 I've heard today. We are mainly concerned about the
20 air cargo industry and how it's impacting our
21 communities in Southeast Queens. And as Miss Charles
22 said earlier, the illegal truck parking-- illegal
23 truck parking is a problem. But it's really a
24 byproduct of a lack of enforcement of the 53-foot
25 rule in our area.

2 Since 2015, when the Port Authority was given
3 permission to receive goods from air cargo through
4 the Van Wyck expressway, the problems have increased
5 exponentially. And when we have asked the port
6 authority about making sure that those 53 footers go
7 back out over the Van Wyck, or that they follow the
8 rules, their attitude has been that that's not their
9 problem: Enforcement of where the trucks go after
10 they leave the airport is somebody else's problem.
11 It's-- it's NYPD, it's DOT, but it's not-- it's not
12 their problem.

13 So the law regarding 53 footers definitely needs
14 to be enforced. They're not supposed to be on city
15 streets. And they only are supposed to be-- if they
16 are given permission to deliver to a local entity.
17 It's-- it's supposed to be because they are carrying
18 an indivisible load which and probably 90% of the
19 time that's not an issue.

20 The-- It was mentioned that marine freight is
21 being considered by the DOT. And I think that that's
22 a great idea. And my question is: Have you
23 considered-- has the DOT considered--

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

2 MS. BROWN: integrating the air cargo at JFK into
3 that marine freight ruling or provision since they're
4 right there on Jamaica Bay.

5 We are in support of all of the rules that are
6 being discussed today. The daylighting: We are a
7 little bit concerned about the terms of impact on
8 residential communities. So I like some of the
9 suggestions that I heard about earlier.

10 We need to in terms of those, that whole intro,
11 we need to make sure that all of the civic
12 associations and community boards that are going to
13 be impacted are really included in the discussion.

14 And quite frankly, it talks about the Port
15 Authority and EDC. It didn't mention what-- Those
16 are part of the problem, because they're not
17 enforcing the rules and EDC holds-- has the ability
18 to-- to decide how some of the land is used around
19 JFK, and more-- They keep bringing in more and more
20 air cargo.

21 So they're taking a bad situation and making it
22 worse. And this supply chain delay problems are also
23 an issue. Just skimming through the-- the parking
24 lots that the Intro 906 speaks of should not-- We
25 want to make sure that those parking lots are not

2 right across the street from people's homes or our
3 parks. So that leads to those choices about where
4 they need to be carefully looked at.

5 And unless the Port Authority opens up some of
6 its excess land to parking of trucks, there probably
7 needs to be more than one parking lot in the air
8 cargo industry area.

9 So those are just some main things. The use of
10 traffic cameras. I'm glad to see that that is there.
11 And I will put a question here: Will that include
12 issuing of tickets and fines and all the rest of the
13 things that they do to the general public, but we
14 have been talking about why trucks are not being
15 monitored by traffic cameras.

16 I will be submitting more detailed testimony and
17 changing some of it in light of things that I heard
18 today. But thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you so much.
20 And just for point of clarification. What year did
21 you say that the Port Authority received that
22 approval?

23 COUNSEL: Miss Brown, are you still there?

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Please unmute her.

25 COUNSEL: Kevin, can you please unmute?

2 MS. BROWN: Oh, yeah. I didn't realize that was
3 re-muted. Yeah. 2015.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: 2015. And who gave
5 that approval?

6 MS. BROWN: It's my understanding it was the
7 City. It was something that went before City
8 Council. They petitioned the City to allow the 53
9 footers to come into the airport through Van Wyck
10 Expressway. Because up until that point, they
11 weren't allowed in the city at all.

12 Okay, thank you.

13 COUNSEL: Thank you. We'll hear next from Eric
14 McClure.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

16 MR. MCCLURE: Good afternoon, Chair Brooks-
17 Powers, Councilmember Williams, Committee Council.
18 My name is Eric McClure. I'm the Executive Director
19 of StreetsPAC. Commerce in New York City is heavily
20 reliant on trucking with about 90% of the goods
21 transported in or through the city are carried by
22 trucks. And while truck trips have boomed over the
23 past few years driven by New Yorkers thirst for e-
24 commerce and home delivery, that number is expected
25 to increase by two thirds over the next 20 years.

2 So we're faced with a quandary. While we
3 certainly need to shift significant amounts of large
4 scale shipments to waterborne and rail freight and a
5 big portion of last mile deliveries to e-bikes and
6 other smaller more nimble vehicles, it's clear that
7 truck deliveries, and lots of them, aren't going
8 away.

9 That underscores why it's necessary to optimize
10 the city's truck routes and why we support intro 708,
11 which requires redesign of New York City's truck
12 route network to improve safety, increase visibility
13 and reduce congestion, and emissions, and vehicle
14 miles traveled.

15 We don't expect that a truck route redesign will
16 radically change the existing route map, but with the
17 rapid proliferation of last-mile delivery facilities
18 updates are almost certainly needed. And we strongly
19 support the provision in the bill that would require
20 visibility improvements at intersections on truck
21 routes.

22 A significant share of fatal pedestrian and
23 cyclist crashes in New York City occurred
24 intersections. Taking steps to improve visibility's
25 common sense, While also taking into account the

2 Department of Transportation concerns that such
3 setups do not enable faster turns.

4 We also need to get better and smarter at
5 enforcing truck route regulations. With advances in
6 navigation technology, no truck should be off route
7 except when using the most direct last-mile path to a
8 delivery or pickup. And we should explore using GPS
9 tracking to enforce violations. We also need to
10 adopt a zero tolerance approach to 53 foot trailers,
11 with funds great enough to keep them off city streets
12 period.

13 In addition, we must continue to move
14 aggressively toward off-hour deliveries,
15 consolidation of local deliveries, and expanded use
16 of microhubs and dedicated commercial and residential
17 delivery space at the curb. Councilmembers, a
18 supermajority of whom are sponsors of Intro 708 needs
19 to be prepared to support recommended truck route
20 changes with the knowledge that no constituent is
21 going to embrace having trucks on their block, and
22 the--

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS TIME EXPIRED:

24 MR. MCCLURE: car owners will fully propose
25 removal of parking spaces to increase visibility.

2 Improving truck logistics for everyone will
3 require some shared sacrifice, and it's vital to
4 bettering quality of life across New York City.

5 Let me in closing just say that Councilmember
6 Avilés and I-- I served as Chair of Brooklyn
7 Community Board 6 share the Red Hook neighborhood in
8 our catchment areas, and Red Hook has been overrun by
9 last-mile delivery facilities. Certainly the truck
10 routes in and out of Red Hook need to be looked at
11 very closely and updated where necessary. And the
12 city as a whole needs to take a really aggressive
13 approach toward limiting the proliferation of last-
14 mile facilities, especially in neighborhoods like Red
15 Hook that in are Environmental Justice Communities.
16 Thank you very much.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

18 COUNSEL: Thank you. Thank you. We'll hear now
19 from Joseph Fama.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

21 MR. J. FAMA: Thank you very much for this
22 opportunity. Chairwoman Brooks-Powers. I appreciate
23 it. And I just wanted to let you know that we
24 support Intro 708 and the other bills as well. My
25 credentials of course, I'm a former DOT Assistant

2 Commissioner in the City of New York, and for the
3 last 30 years I have been the CEO of Empire
4 Commercial Services, which represents about 200
5 trucking companies here in the city. Everybody from
6 DHL, to Poland Spring, to Dunkin Donuts, and a host
7 of others. They also support 708, primarily because
8 of the daylighting provision. They all believe, and
9 we believe it's very important to move ahead with the
10 daylighting.

11 We tend to look at it sometimes not
12 circumspectly. We-- I heard discussion today from
13 DOT about visibility of the truck drivers. We also
14 see it as a problem of visibility for the pedestrians
15 and the bicyclists. Because when you have a large
16 vehicle parked within 25 feet of the corner, the
17 pedestrian can't see what's coming around the corner.
18 It's not just what can the driver see, but the
19 pedestrian and the bicyclist.

20 So we believe having those corners clear, will
21 make it easier for the driver, easier and safer for
22 the pedestrian.

23 There is a weakness though, in this program. And
24 that is that if there are vehicles, and especially
25 large vehicles parked in that space, and they are

2 members of the Stipulated Fine Program, that parking
3 violation automatically gets a reduction for the
4 commercial operator.

5 So we believe that--

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired

7 MR. J. FAMA: --that program needs to be
8 reviewed, that the no-standing violation should not
9 receive any reduction.

10 And further, a lot of the complaints today were
11 about the residential streets having overnight or
12 late-night parking of commercial vehicles. That's a
13 Code 78 violation, which also gets an automatic
14 reduction. So whether-- whether DOT is going to
15 determine the daylighting are the Council is going to
16 exercise its powers and take control of that, we take
17 the teeth out of it if we're going to give away
18 reductions for violating those parking rules anyway.

19 So our suggestion is: We remove the reduction
20 for all the no-standing violations under code 78
21 violations. Thank you, Councilmember Powers.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. We'll now
23 hear from Christian Fama.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.
25

2 MR. C. FAMA: Hello. Christian Fama from Empire
3 Commercial Services. Thank you, Councilmembers for
4 having us. I'm a little disappointed that there's
5 not more people in the room to hear this. But spot
6 on. I heard a lot about enforcement. And I'm going
7 to try to be as concise as I can.

8 But the daylighting provision and 708 is by far
9 the most important provision in terms of safety for
10 not only the truck drivers but the pedestrians and
11 the cyclists as well. DOT testified 260 fatalities
12 this year. But then, you know, also said that
13 daylighting wasn't an issue in terms of safety. So
14 it was a little bit of a contradiction.

15 We have an amendment proposed to 708 to eliminate
16 reductions for no-standing violations issued to
17 commercial vehicles that are parked in the
18 daylighting zone. Because again, it's a bit of, you
19 know, a contradiction where you're going to try to
20 enforce, enforce, enforce, but then give automatic
21 reductions for the violations you're trying to
22 enforce upon.

23 I'll touch quickly on the commercial loading
24 zones: Same deal. The commercial loading zones get
25 currently 100% reduction. So what you have now is

2 vehicles warehousing themselves in the commercial
3 loading zones, which is why they're not empty. So I
4 think there needs to be a hard look at the stipulated
5 fines, and the reductions being given in that program
6 that are undermining and undercutting some of the
7 proposed City Council legislation and things the City
8 Council is trying to do. And it's really going to
9 take the teeth out of the whole daylighting, if these
10 companies are receiving an automatic 20% or 25%
11 reduction on their violation. On top of all the
12 safety issues obviously.

13 The last thing I'll leave you with: The same
14 thing for the commercial overnight parking has been a
15 solid complaint from everybody that's been here.
16 That ticket received a 40% reduction in the
17 stipulated fine program. So again--

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

19 MR. C. FAMA: --to disincentivize the companies
20 from parking the vehicles overnight, you should
21 probably start with stop giving them a 40% automatic
22 reduction on every single ticket they get in the
23 stipulated fine program.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

2 COUNSEL: Thank you. And we'll hear next from
3 Nicole Epstein Schwartz.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

5 VIEWER: Hi. This is Oliver [inaudible]. I'm
6 not actually scheduled to speak on this. I work with
7 Nicole. We're just attending the Zoom just as a
8 spectator here. I'm terribly sorry for--

9 COUNSEL: Sorry. Sorry. Can you restate your
10 name? Oh, you're not you're not testifying?

11 VIEWER: We're not testifying. I'm sorry. Yeah.
12 We were just-- we were just spectating here.

13 COUNSEL: Okay.

14 VIEWER: Sorry about-- Sorry about any
15 confusion. We will next hear from I.G. Don Terius
16 and Alex Stein.

17 [background voices]

18 MR. STEIN: Why does he have to-- he's homeless.
19 Yeah, he's just showing what's going on in the city.
20 So you guys have to respect him.

21 Alright, guys, my name-- My name is Alex--

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Excuse me. I ask
23 that you please put on your shirt.

24 MR. STEIN: Wait. Why?

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I just asked you
3 please put on a shirt.

4 MR. TERIUS: Just to prove my point. I'm a navy
5 veteran.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And I thank you for
7 your service sir.

8 MR. STEIN: He's my-- he's my wife's boyfriend
9 too. And so we're here to talk about the
10 transportation issue.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: That's fine. But
12 before we get started, I just ask that you please put
13 on--

14 MR. STEIN: Is there a dress code.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I just ask that he
16 put on his shirt, please.

17 MR. STEIN: [TO MR. TERIUS] Well, you gotta cover
18 up your nipples. [TO COUNCIL:] I don't know. I
19 just wish everybody else could be naked in the city.
20 But outside-- you go outside this city, there's a
21 bunch of naked homeless people here. And we're
22 talking about transportation. I'm here with my
23 wife's boyfriend. It's just ridiculous that you guys
24 are going to persecute him because he's a black man.
25 That's why you guys are doing this. That's why you

2 guys are doing this. That's why your bring so much
3 attention to him. When we walked in here, it was
4 absolutely unreal the amount of security that he went
5 through compared to the amount of security that I
6 went through. And this is my wife's boyfriend. I
7 mean, the things that he does to my wife is
8 incredible. And we're talking about transportation.
9 Let's talk about Pete Buttigieg, the Transportation
10 Secretary, and he's the best Secretary I've ever had,
11 because he's a homosexual. And as a matter of fact,
12 that's why I started to become bisexual to be more
13 like Pete Buttigieg. And that's why I've started to
14 have relationship with men on the side. And that's
15 why I have Grindr.

16 So listen, we need to get federal funding,
17 Selvena. Is that how you say your name? Selvena
18 Brooks-Powers. We got to get some federal funding
19 from Pete Buttigieg, because listen, Joe Biden's over
20 there. I know his son's smoking crack in the
21 Ukraine, but that doesn't matter. I mean, Pete
22 Buttigieg you know, I know he's like on a gay cruise
23 with his husband and they're, you know, like,
24 breastfeeding their babies and stuff, but they can
25 help the transportation issues we're having here in

2 New York. I mean, that's the federal boss dog. I'm
3 Primetime 99. I'm a pimp on a blimp. So I wrote this
4 song.

5 New York City is so dang bad. This apple is
6 rotten. What have we gotten? Nothing but violence.
7 All I hear is silence from our leaders. My man's
8 tidies are out, and they will bleed us because he
9 gets cut with a knife. He sleeps with my wife. This
10 city is damned too expensive to get an apartment. We
11 need to lower the rent. But instead we're going to
12 charge these poor drivers more money. But all I want
13 to do is get vaccinated, stick that vaccine in my
14 arm, I want to vaccinate with this love charm.

15 I love you guys, I'm Primetime 99 Selvena, and my
16 wife's boyfriend has a lot of issues. And you know,
17 I just hate these trucks when they're trying to take
18 a nap and I'm playing Xbox and they're trying to make
19 love, these-- these trucks are making too much noise
20 and they're just polluting too much gas and they're
21 just making it difficult for my wife and her
22 boyfriend Don Terius to really enjoy themselves--

23 [BELL RINGS]

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. Time.

2 MR. STEIN: Yeah, but everybody else got to speak
3 past the time limit, so I just have a couple more
4 minutes. So what I'm saying is in this city, we have
5 serious issues and my songs aren't going to solve it
6 and we have Eric Adams in the nightclub you know
7 doing God knows what.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sir if you're not
9 going to stay on topic, your time is finished.

10 MR. STEIN: I can't talk about Eric Adams? Is he
11 not on topic?

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: We're talking about
13 truck routes today.

14 MR. STEIN: That's what I'm saying. So is Eric
15 Adams not in charge of the city? Is he not in charge
16 of the truck routes?

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Are you finished with
18 your remarks on trucking?

19 MR. STEIN: No. I'm not finished. I'm not
20 finished. I just want to say that everybody else
21 gets to come here and pontificate for 5 or 10
22 minutes, and I tried to talk about something and you
23 try to shut me down. What is that? Is it because
24 I'm a homosexual? Is it because I'm bisexual?

25 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you, sir.

2 MR. STEIN: Is that why? I think they don't like
3 that I'm bisexual.

4 MR. Terius: Alright. Anyway, guys, thank you so
5 much. I might I.G. Bum. Please help the homeless.
6 It's a serious situation out there. I have to deal
7 with the, you know, the trucks and all that, as I'm
8 trying to sleep on a box on 42nd, and I think it
9 should be addressed. Homeless people are people too.
10 And I'm a veteran of this country, titties and all

11 MR. STEIN: Those are veteran titties. Alright
12 guys, and if you guys can give the death penalty to
13 Donald Trump, that would be great too, because we
14 know Alvin Bragg is a really great guy. But listen,
15 it's not about Alvin Bragg. It's not about the city
16 that's crumbling. It's not about the fact that
17 people are overdosing on fentanyl constantly. You
18 guys want this city to fail, but I don't because I
19 love this city like Frank Sinatra said, "If you can
20 make it here you can make it anywhere," and I'm
21 Primetime 99 Alex Stein.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you sir.
23 That's all.

24 COUNSEL: Thank you if we have inadvertently
25 missed anyone that is registered to testify today,

2 and has yet to have been called, please use the Zoom
3 hand function if you're testifying remotely, and you
4 will be called in the order that your hand has been
5 raised. If you're testifying in person, please come
6 to the Dais. Seeing no one, we will move to closing
7 remarks from chair Brooks-Powers.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you, Sam, and
9 thank you to all that came out today to testify. We
10 thank the Administration for coming in answering all
11 the questions and look forward to the follow up. And
12 with that we conclude this hearing.

13 [GAVEL]

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date 04/15/2023