

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

----- X

March 14, 2023
Start: 10:33 a.m.
Recess: 12:56 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: Eric Dinowitz
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
Charles Barron
Gale A. Brewer
Oswald Feliz
Inna Vernikov

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Hector Batista
CUNY Executive Vice Chancellor and Chief
Operating Officer

Wendy Hensel
CUNY Executive Vice Chancellor and University
Provost

Christina Chiappa
CUNY Vice Chancellor for Budget and Finance

James Davis
PSC-CUNY President

Alan Yu
Executive Director of New Yorkers for Children

Salimatou Doumbouya
Chair of CUNY Student Senate

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning and welcome to today's New York City Council hearing for the Preliminary Budget hearing on Higher Education. At this time, we ask that you silence all cell phones and electronic devices to minimize disruptions throughout the hearing. If you wish to testify today, please see the Sergeant at Arms and fill out one of these slips. Thank you for your cooperation. Chair, we are ready to begin.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [gavel] Good morning. I'm Eric Dinowitz, Chair of the Committee on Higher Education and I would like to welcome all of you to our hearing on the Fiscal 2024 Preliminary Budget for the City University of New York. We are joined today by Hector Batista, Executive Vice Chancellor and Chief Operating Officer, Wendy Hensel, Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost, and Christina Chiappa, Vice Chancellor for Budget and Finance. Thank you for joining us. It has been my honor to sit as Chair to this committee. As a CUNY alum myself and as the son of a CUNY alum, I know firsthand and my family knows firsthand just how important and critical CUNY is to the success of our city to my personal success and to the success of my

former students, as a former public school education teacher. CUNY has been an incredibly valuable resource for them and has had long-lasting impacts on their lives. We are aware of the issues that CUNY has experienced and will endure within the upcoming Fiscal Year. During this Preliminary Budget hearing there are five areas that I will cover: PEGS impact to community colleges; disproportionate funding between our community colleges and senior colleges; CUNY programs that have eliminated or reduced funding; the State's Executive budget compared to the City budget; and rise in tuition costs increasingly makes affordability difficult which flies in the face of their mission to provide degrees without debt, which is in your advertisements. The OMB required agencies to cut their vacancies in half for the Mayor's Vacancy Reduction Plan. According to the Preliminary Budget for Fiscal 2024, \$4.8 million dollars will be eliminated through PEGS and will increase to \$9.5 million dollars for the upcoming fiscal year and the out-years. These PEGS will affect community colleges and their non-pedagogical staff. While funding is decreasing, costs such as collective bargaining, inflation, and pandemic costs

are increasing creating structural deficit for the University. Additionally, it is unclear exactly which vacant positions will be removed and if these positions are instrumental in some of our CUNY initiatives. There are disproportionate funding cuts. Community college is possibly the most needed institutions are receiving decreased amounts of funding. The Fiscal 2024 Preliminary Plan shows the following: a 168 million dollar decrease to personal services and other than personal services in the CUNY budget. These cuts will affect mostly community colleges, and we need to understand how CUNY's programming is being affected by this budget. Reports also show that funding for more than 10 CUNY programs have been reduced or eliminated. Some of these new programs that we have just started since last year such as CUNY Reconnect, where \$4.4 million dollars is needed to be restored, and others that have demonstrated positive impacts like the \$15.8 million dollars for the Vallone scholarships and \$4.5 million dollars for Research Institutes. These programs provide vital services to students by providing academic, social/emotional support, and training for future careers, and they were not

included in the Preliminary Plan. It is important to examine the origins of these issues now so that hopefully in the future we will not see these resources hemorrhage like they are today. Recently, the Mayor made an announcement expanding the CUNY 2X Tech program towards first-generation college students of color and to begin a new nursing initiative that creates a pathway into the field. Both of these programs will provide incredible resources. However, we need to better understand how these programs are funded and how CUNY will provide outreach to ensure students enroll and reach the Mayor's targets for these programs. And finally, we will examine CUNY's rise in tuition costs and how this will affect affordability. It is understood that when enrollment decreases that there is a reduction in revenue and it will eventually raise costs. However, I'm questioning the resourcefulness of CUNY and their ability to recruit new students, something I believe we've brought up at every single hearing since I've been Chair, including their advertising strategies, something that has been brought up I believe at every hearing since I've been the Chair. Increased enrollment can help remedy some

of these issues, and without it there will be
invariable costs to CUNY and its students which
mostly impacts our community colleges. Is CUNY
implementing new approaches to attract students? I'm
very concerned about this present moment and the City
and CUNY taking its rightful position to ease the
current economic and social plans for its students.
The Council's approach to its preliminary budget
hearings it to ensure that the City's budget is fair,
transparent and accountable to all New Yorkers.
While efficiency and performance have always been
priorities of the body, today we plan to scrutinize
the organization of the City's budget more closely.
Our intent is to create transparency between CUNY and
the Council on all that keeps these schools thriving.
We will now hear testimony from the Administration.
Before we begin, I will administer the affirmation.
Panelists, please raise your right hand. Do you
affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing
but the truth before the Committee and to respond
honestly to Council Member questions? Thank you.
You may begin when ready.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Good

morning Chairperson Dinowitz and other members of the

City Council Higher Education Committee. Thank you for the opportunity to testify today about CUNY's budget. My name is Wendy Hensel and I'm the Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost for the City University of New York. I'm joined today by Hector Batista, CUNY's Executive Vice Chancellor and Chief Operating Officer, and Christina Chiappa, our Chief Financial Officer. I joined CUNY's team approximately 10 months ago and have been privileged to witness during that time the collaboration between the University and the City Council for the benefit of all New Yorkers. Thank you so much to this committee and the entire Council for your steadfast support of CUNY. We are here today to talk about our budget, and so it's important to first briefly report on how CUNY has continued to realize its mission and produce value for our students and New York over the past year. CUNY continues to distinguish itself and be recognized for our quality, affordability, and unparalleled record as an engine of upward mobility for our students and their families, and by extension, the City and State. Recent accolades include two of our CUNY Community Colleges, Hostos and Kingsborough, are among the 10 finalists in the

quest for the prestigious 2023 Aspen Prize for Community College Excellence, regarded by many as the highest recognition for community college achievement in the nation. We're rooting for them, and the winners will be announced in April. Six CUNY Senior Colleges were among the top performing public colleges in the northern United States in the 2022 US News rankings, and seven CUNY colleges were among the top 20 universities. Ten CUNY colleges were among the nation's best in promoting economic mobility according to Third Way, a public policy think-tank that is creating economic mobility index for students from low and moderate income families. Queensborough Community College ranked as the best community college in New York State for its stellar educational outcomes and affordability by finance website Wallet Hub, and the City College of New York was recognized as the top ranked public college in the nation by the education research organization Degree Choices. Apart from these institutional accolades are the countless honors and awards individual CUNY faculty member, staff, and students have won in a wide range of fields over the past year. To give you just a few example, Professor Dennis Parnell Sullivan won the

Abel Prize for Mathematics, often called the Nobel Prize of math. Pulitzer Prize winning composer Tania Leon was named a 2022 Kennedy Center Honoree, and two distinguished CUNY Professors and Poets, Kimiko Hahn and Patricia Smith were elected to the Board of Academy of American Poets. At the same time, CUNY continually demonstrates its commitment to New York and the positive impact that we have on every facet of life in this city. To cite just one recent example, New York City Public Schools Chancellor Banks and our own Matos Rodriguez announced a groundbreaking \$14 million dollar partnership to train thousands of current and future public school teachers to deliver practical community science and digital literacy skills to students across the City. We believe it's the largest effort of its kind in the nation. Often overlooked, meanwhile, is CUNY's excellence as a research powerhouse propelled by more than 10,000 researchers and staff within growing-- with growing support from public and private funders. Although historically CUNY research grants total about \$500 million each year. In the first half of this Fiscal Year, these grants already amount to \$417 million. That is a CUNY record, and if the trend

continues, we will end the Fiscal Year with the largest amount of external research funding in our history. All told, we have more than 2,100 research grants for projects that are being carried by researchers from the Graduate Center, our graduate and professional schools in every one of our 18 undergraduate campuses. They're working to alleviate disparities in public health and pursuing advances in computer science, data science, biomedical engineering, and more. Just a few areas where our researchers are making measurable differences to our city, state, and nation. A key focus, as well, is CUNY's diversity, which contributes mightily to these outcomes. In 2022, the CUNY Graduate Center was found to be the second-most gender diverse of the nation's R1 Higher Education Institutions. Additionally, 20 percent of the Graduate Center's fulltime graduate students identify as under-represented minorities. Along with CUNY's ability to harness expertise across its 25 geographically proximate campuses and build focused and transdisciplinary research teams that are recognized globally, CUNY is a major research center. Research at CUNY is also an important catalyst for degree

completion and building a more capable and diverse workforce. As you mentioned, CUNY like so many other institutions of higher learning has faced enrollment challenges consistent with nationwide pandemic trends. We are making strides in enrollment through creative approaches and a focus on expanding CUNY's access mission to higher education. We opened this semester with a wonderful announcement about CUNY Reconnect, our initiative to re-engage thousands of New Yorkers who began college by stepped out before they completed their degree. CUNY Reconnect was proposed and championed by New York City Council Speaker Adrienne Adams and funded by the City. I'm happy to report that more than 16,000 students have signed up for classes through Reconnect this academic year, surpassing the original goal of enrolling 10,000 returning students. We are grateful for this support which has made a real difference in people's lives. We're also working hand-in-hand with New York City public schools to make sure high school seniors have the information and counseling when they need to apply to and enroll in CUNY. Approximately, 80 percent of our student population attended city public schools. We are proud of them and from March

1st to April 15th, CUNY will be waving the \$65 dollar application fee for the New York City public schools students to encourage them to continue their education at CUNY. This is not just about boosting enrollment. It is a campaign to empower our young people and prepare them for New York City's workforce. We also know that a key aspect of student success is creating clear pathways between academic studies and the careers that students want. We are equipping our students with good job offers after graduation by forging new public and private partnerships such as the CUNY Inclusive Economy Initiative which aims to connect 80 percent of CUNY graduates to careers by the end of the decade through paid internships and also mentorship opportunities. Another partnership with New York City, CUNY Upskilling [sic] will help thousands of New Yorkers acquire the skills and knowledge they need to secure jobs in the field that are most in-demand. We know the impact the paid internships have on our students' success: higher starting wages, a higher number of students who graduate with job offers, and invaluable experience that helps them get a foot in the door. We are expanding all of these opportunities with your

help and the help of the state, but more needs to be done. We are eager to expand the percentage of our students taking advantage of these programs, but we need help to do that. Finally, I wanted to briefly address an area that I know has been of special interest to this committee, the rise of anti-Semitism nationally, including in higher education. I'm pleased that we are engaging in important work on many fronts to combat hate and ensure the full inclusion of our Jewish students. To give just a few examples, the University is partnering with Hillel International's Campus Climate Initiative to address the global uptick in anti-Semitism while fostering a welcoming community for Jewish students. Seven CUNY colleges are taking part working with Hillel to understand how Jewish students feel on campus and adopt policies and programs that meet their needs. This academic school year, CUNY also distributed \$750,000 to 24 colleges and the central office to address all forms of bigotry including anti-Semitism. The central office is providing professional development and faculty engagement while the colleges are hosting programmatic opportunities, training, and events that strategically respond to discrimination

and meet the needs of their communities. CUNY also recently announced the launch of an online portal to report instances of discrimination and retaliation, allowing for a standardized process from which the university can analyze trends and reported incidents. Our college presidents are required to file semi-annual reports on cases that are submitted through the portal and to use the data to develop policies and training. I'm happy to provide you with more specific details in the question and answer session if you would like to explore any of these initiatives further. Chairperson Dinowitz and Members of the Committee, the University community deeply appreciates your continued commitment to high-quality CUNY education. This concludes my testimony, and Executive Vice Chancellor and Chief Operating Officer Hector Batista will now continue.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you. And before your testimony, I just want to recognize we've been joined by Council Members Barron and Hanif.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Good morning, Chair Dinowitz and members of the City Council Higher Education Committee. Provost Hensel described some of the actions being undertaken to

realize CUNY's full potential to uplift New York. As so many of you recognize, CUNY is an important component of recovering and building our community, especially those that have been disproportionately impacted by the pandemic. Nearly, 80 percent of our undergraduate students are students of color, 23 percent is Asian Pacific Islanders, 26 percent black, and 30 percent are Latinos. More than 80 percent of CUNY graduates stay in New York and contribute to the City's economic and civic culture. Half of our undergraduate students come from households with less than 30,000 annual income, 45 percent of our students are the first in their family to attend college, and 50 percent work who are going to school. CUNY student graduates serve our city's most critical workforce sector including nurses and teachers. In fact, each year CUNY graduates about 1,800 nurses which represents half of the new nurses in the City in any typical year. The University also awards 5,000 degrees and certificates in education and supplies a third of new teachers for New York City public school system. CUNY's scale cannot be ignored. I would be remiss if I did not address the structure deficits CUNY is facing. These are due to

increased enrollment and related to tuition [inaudible] as well as unfunded mandatory cost increases. These deficits are hard to overcome with the efficiencies target that the City has put in the Preliminary Budget which I will discuss in more details later in my testimony. Provost Hansel described our efforts to increase enrollment, and we're doing even more to mitigate these deficits. One [sic], first the efficient reinvestment, or ERI. This initiative that includes an agenda of project designed to produce greater efficiency and cost-savings for CUNY. This first phase of the initiative involves automating processes that were once manual. Eight systems have been implemented resulting in savings of \$14 million dollars. Five other ERI projects are still being implemented, and we expect that will bring an additional \$39 million dollars of additional savings. A new enterprise resource planning solution, HR Finance, will align business operation to industry best practice that results in significant and additional productivity savings. Another effort is through leasing savings. We implemented nine lease transactions resulting in our greatest savings of about \$103 million dollars

between FY22 and FY35, and \$9.2 million dollars of capital contribution for landlords. In order to best serve New Yorkers we are modernizing university transforming our operation through enhanced technology. We replace CUNY First [sic], which is our main database system. This system supports our students, faculty, and staff, and manages the administration functions and human resources including recruitment and payroll, and provides financial accounting management funds to supporting CUNY's business operation. We are replacing the system and migrating to our core function that is cloud-based supported. This will provide the university the opportunity to improve agility, simplify system administration and empower users. We're also replacing Blackboard which allows students and faculty to participate in class, deliver online or use online materials and activities to complement the face-to-face teaching. We will migrate to the new learning management system which will impact all faculty and students and implement a new customer service relation management system which will manage all aspects of CUNY communication with students beginning from recruitment to when they graduate in

their journey at CUNY. Additionally, we will deploy the new system of technology to recon-- focusing on enrollment and focusing on adult continuing education. This will provide the most seamless pathway to become degree-seekers and demand workforce. As we transform, we will engage in multi-facet cyber security initiative to identify and protect against potential risks and threat the University IT [inaudible]. Turning to the City's Preliminary Budget. The January Plan includes an additional pack of \$4.8 million dollars for FY23 which analyzed goes up to \$9.6 for FY24. PEGS in the current year total \$39.1 which that grows to \$49.7 in FY24. CUNY has received funding for some mandatory costs such as fringe benefit, building rent, collective bargaining which are very helpful, but these reductions are significant and unsustainable in long-term and consider the financial challenge that the University is facing. We also have unfunded costs across the University. Additionally, we have ongoing programs that have not been funded. They total \$2.5 million dollars. These are Accelerated Completed and Engaged program which is an ASAP [sic] equivalent for the senior colleges. ACE speeds up

time graduation significantly, thereby reducing the cost for the students in the university. CUNY Inclusive Economy is funded-- was not funded for \$5 million dollars. The initiative is a public/private partnership that aims to connect CUNY graduates to careers, important to both students' economic mobility and the City's economic recovery after the pandemic. The Brooklyn Recovery Core [sic] Program at Medgar Evers for \$1 million dollars is also not funded. This program matches students, interns who are not-for-profit organizations, small business in central Brooklyn to engage in real world hands-on learning experience projects, and also help in the recovery of-- in Brooklyn due to the pandemic. We greatly appreciate the City Council pass and continue support for CUNY. The Preliminary Budget does not include funding for over \$30 million dollars for funds [inaudible] council, which brought [sic] by the Council in Fiscal Year 2023. Those programs are the Vallone Scholarship, Citizens Now, Research Institute, Development Education program. We're asking the Council to restore those items as well as \$4.4 million dollars as the Chair alluded in the CUNY Reconnect and advocate for its expansion since it's

been a huge success. On the state side, we are trying to-- we're relying on the funding floor that has been provided to the community college that maintains prior year funding. However, in FY24, the State Executive Budget language indicates that funding floor will not be considered. We do not have funding-- if we don't have the funding floor, we will then realize a loss of about \$59 million dollars for the University. Before I discuss the capital budget, I want to share with you the protective steps that we're taking to improve our facilities. We're performing facility condition assessment study to have better control of existing condition of each building component and its immediate maintenance across the University. We're also assessing and finalizing and working with the DOB on an initiative to allow us to be able to better respond and be able to address the open violations and upgrading our building maintenance work order tracking system to improve and retain preventative maintenance tracking system. Finally, we are realizing our maintenance team to provide more central support to campuses for improved building maintenance. CUNY is utilizing best practice to develop the standards to better

support and better address all our facility needs across the system. By doing these measures, we'll be able to continue to provide our campuses with the support that they need. On the capital side of the budget, we have over 300 million-- 29 million square feet in over 300 buildings across the university. Those buildings are extremely important for us to continue to do the work that we do as a university. CUNY focuses on maintaining and improving those essential to our success. The project in our capital program preserves the university infrastructure recapture spaces that are under-utilized, improve technology, provide campus expansion where necessary. Improving the university facility's infrastructure for further use enable CUNY to serve the city and the region. With graduates trained in high-demand positions, having these facilities in the state of good repair is what they need. As you know, the Senior College capital projects is funded 100 percent by the state. We also get some funding from elected officials. Our community college, though, are 50 percent funded by the City and 50 percent funded by the State. The State requires that the City provides the first 50 percent and then the City will then come

and provide the additional funding. We're asking for \$755 million dollars in capital support. Thanks to the City and the State past support, we have recently completed 184 projects, allowing us to increase our completion rate to approximately 10 percent.

Currently we have about 340 active projects, 52 in the Bronx, 69 in Brooklyn, 23 in Staten Island, 104 in Manhattan, and 94 in Queens. It is estimated that the budget remains in construction values about \$1.1 billion dollars. The University is also focused on its efforts of climate change, sustainability, and energy conservation targets. Local Law 97 ask the university to reduce the greenhouse gas by 40 percent. Baseline in 2006 to 2026, CUNY completed a detailed Action Plan or EMP initially to be able to really focus on our community college. We're now developing a plan for 11 senior college. We know how important it is for CUNY to do its share, and we're now on target to be able to complete and be able to meet that goal. But we need additional funding to continue to meet that goal. We need funding for about \$600 million dollars. While there are a number of challenges, we're extremely optimistic about the future of this great university. Your investment and

support of CUNY build a strong and more vibrant New York and one that exclusive [sic] benefits New York City regardless of race, social economic status, immigrant status. On behalf of CUNY, I would like to thank members of the City Council Higher Education Committee and Mayor Adams for your continued commitment to CUNY. That concludes my testimony, and we're happy to answer your questions. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you for your testimony. I'd like to note that we've been joined by Council Member Vernikov. I was really taken by, you know, your testimony outlining all of the programs that CUNY provides, including ASAP and ACE, which I just assume are all on the chopping block given the dire cuts. So we're going to start with-- I just want to start with that, because it was one of the most recent things you said about ASAP and ACE. And you mentioned in your testimony, I don't know the exact line, but that these actually produce cost-savings because it allows students to graduate on-time. Is that accurate?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA:

That's correct.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And do you have a cost benefit analysis of what a dollar in to ACE and ASAP produces?

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: Yes, we do. There was a study done, and a couple years ago when we were doing ASAP, right, and the ACE now expands to--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] Yeah.

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: about seven senior colleges. So there was a big study done that did show that it actually-- because students are graduating quicker, it is actually less costly to us, so we do have that study.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Do you have those numbers with you?

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: I would have to look behind me. No, we could provide that to you.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Please do. You know, we're going to hear a lot-- you know, you hear a lot of savings--

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: [interposing] Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: and those are in huge quotation marks, because programs like ACE and

ASAP, when we get the numbers we'll be able to say-- whoever you're looking back at-- for certain that we're not saving money. We're-- by what do you call, pennywise, pound foolish? That's the phrase my mom used.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: And I-- I can give you some data in terms of the graduation rates which you can then infer the tuition savings. In just the few years that we've been doing ACE in the senior colleges, the transfer student two-year graduation rate at Lehman where we did a pilot was 61 percent versus 30 percent without this program, which is quite astonishing. At John Jay, the four-year graduation rate with ACE was 60 percent versus 41 percent without it, and at the moment there is no funding in the budget for ACE.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, so a program that obviously helps students, but also saves money--

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL:
[interposing] Correct.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: is set to be cut. Okay, I just want to make that very clear for anyone watching and listening. We're cutting a few bucks, but we're losing more money because we're not

investing in this program. I'll get back to some of the programs, but I did want to start with that one, because it was one of the things that was mentioned in your testimony. The vacancy reduction memo issued in November described the change in the City's hiring process, and in the policy that allowed agencies to fill one of every two vacant positions. Can you describe how this has impacted CUNY? And has your hiring process changed at all in the past few months?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: So, thank you, Council Member. We actually do not follow that process, because we're a state and a state instrumentality [sic], but as you know, we have because of these cuts, we have instituted our own sort of Vacancy Review Board that sort of looks-- is looking how to make sure that we are just watching our hires to ensure that we're hiring in the right strategic ways that are an investment in terms of enrollment and areas that are going to continue to grow the university.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Right, but I think that's the second part of the question, which is I know it doesn't directly impact you, but have you, you know, in a sense implemented that policy in a

sort of de facto way because of the PEGS? Have you changed your hiring policies as a result of, you know, sort of following in line of what the actual city agencies are doing?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Yeah, so we've asked every college to submit a financial plan, and with that it's also our hiring plan that really shows how the college is going to really manage that particular college and look at how the investment in hiring is connected to growth, right? So in areas, as I mentioned, of enrollment and other areas like that we are really allow-- we're really focusing on making those highest go-- move forward, but in terms of-- because we had these cuts, we had to implement certain criteria across the university. First set of PEGS is at two percent that save roughly about \$75 million dollars and the second PEG is about five percent, which is going to roughly save about another \$100 million dollars. So, the idea here is to really try to-- as we're trying to navigate these very challenging times, to be very prudent in terms of how these hires across university are being implemented.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I imagine with these cuts there's a big challenge in getting-- let's see-- more Abel prize winners for mathematics, Kennedy Center honorees, distinguished poets. I imagine these cuts are going to make it harder to find distinguished professors such as those.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: It's extremely challenging not only to recruit that type of talent, but more importantly to retain it when we don't maintain competitive salaries for these types of distinguished professors, that's correct.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: So, in the PEGS it's \$4.8 million for FY24 and \$9.5 for the out-years. So the OMB reports it will be 156 vacant civilian positions that will be removed from CUNY's budget. And so can you speak about the current impact of these vacancy reductions beyond, you know, fewer poets and Abel prize winners?

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: Sure, I don't think we could talk about the PEGS in isolation, because what's going on at the community colleges is much more than just the PEGS. So since 2020 the colleges have lost over \$130 million dollars of tuition revenue, plus we have the PEGS, right, that

1 you mentioned, the ones that we just received in the
2 January Plan, but according to our calculations, the
3 total is-- rises to about almost \$50 million dollars.
4 And then we have the added pressures of the
5 inflation, I think as you mentioned in your words,
6 and also we have some other mandatory costs that are
7 not funded as well. So, I think the overall-- these
8 overall items really add up to the fact that the
9 colleges are taking some really-- some really deep-
10 dive measures in order to save money. Hector
11 mentioned the two savings plan. Such a large part of
12 our budget is people, personnel, and so of course
13 that's going to be an area that's going to get very
14 hard by these cuts. The PEGS plus tuition revenue
15 that we're also losing.

17 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, so you know,
18 we're told in these-- I'm interested to know what you
19 foresee-- oh, I want to mention we've been joined by
20 Council Member Brewer. Thank you for joining-- what
21 the impact of these PEGS are, and one of the
22 clarifications, you know, when we say civilian,
23 pedagogical and civilian positions-- and can you
24 better define what pedagogical staff is versus
25 civilian. And so for example, would a counselor or,

you know, a support staff for the ACE program or
ASAP?

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: Those would be
pedagogical.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Those are
pedagogical.

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: Yeah. They're
instrumental to the academic program. Just to circle
back to your question--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] Well,
let me just-- everything's instrumental to the
academic program.

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: That's true.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And you know, we--

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: [interposing]
But it is student-touching. I think that's one of
the distinctions that we make. If it encourages
retention, graduation or student success, it would be
pedagogical.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Does that include
your mental health counselors?

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: That includes the
Office of College for Students with Disabilities?

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And that includes your Single Stop Successor programs, for instance, working the food pantries, HRA, housing help, healthcare help?

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: I think it depends. I'm going to say it depends a little bit. Because my understanding of the distinction that is made in the City, that a lot of the non-pedagogicals are the facilities, public safety, but it also could touch some of the different levels of some of the staff within the office, office assistants and things like that as well, the support staff.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Are you pedagogical?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: I most certainly am.

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: I would say, yes, I think that we would be considered in that category.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: What it sounds like, you know, what I'm hearing you say is that, you know, it's almost like don't worry about these cuts,

because no position will be cut of anything that impacts student--

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: [interposing]

No--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I mean, but that's what it-- you know, that's what it sounds like. So, you know, I'm trying to get a sense of how impactful this will be--

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL:

[interposing] Let me give you an example.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Yeah.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Yeah, I think it's perhaps easier. This is such a large scale operation that sometimes seeing it at the smaller level helps communicate the impact. So I have the answer to your question, because of my very quick folks behind me. The ASAP--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] Thank you folks behind her.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: ASAP costs per graduate is \$6,500 dollars less than a comparable student. Right now there is no funding for ACE despite the fact that the City in 2020 began this program, and it currently has students that are

1 in a multi-year phase. So if there's no continuing
2 support for the program, there's no continuing
3 support for students who are already in the program.
4 So it's not about just the expansion of the program
5 which we'd like to do, but the continuation of it.
6 So as a result, for example, you asked the impact.
7 Right now, I have asked to put a hold on my ACE and
8 ASAP rehires to fill these positions as we identify
9 whether we're going to be able to serve these
10 students at the level that we promised to do so,
11 because we can't bring them in without a commitment
12 to continue.

14 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: You say it saves
15 \$6.5 thousand dollars per student, is that what you
16 said?

17 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: That
18 is correct?

19 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And how many
20 students is there?

21 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: There
22 are 80-- well, over the time since it's been in--
23 there are 25,000 per year in ASAP. There's about-- I
24 don't want us to give you the wrong number-- 5,150 in
25 ACE. There have been 88,000 over the course since we

1 started doing ASAP. So, I mean, this is probably I
2 think 25 percent of our enrollment in community
3 college.

4
5 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, so it sounds
6 like significant savings to me.

7 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Very
8 significant.

9 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay. So, I just--
10 - I'm just-- it's still unclear to me what are these
11 vacant positions or these non-pedagogical positions
12 that will be removed or that you can't do hiring for
13 because of the PEGS and because of, as you mentioned,
14 the other cuts that CUNY's receiving?

15 VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: Yeah. So I
16 could try again. So, while this last round of PEGS
17 really focused on the non-pedagogical positions,
18 because of our tuition problems, previous PEGS also,
19 there are other positions, many of those that you
20 mentioned, that we're not going to be able to see or
21 backfill or hire new ones because we don't have the
22 budget capacity to do so.

23 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: So, I'm trying to
24 clarify. The document that we get in the Council says
25 that we won't lose any pedagogical staff, but what

you're telling me is that's actually not the case, because that's just impossible to do.

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: Yes, yeah.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, so we're being told-- OMB? Through OMB, right? So we're being told one thing by OMB from the City, but the people, but you who are actually doing the work, doing the hiring and supporting, you know, doing the work for our CUNY system are telling us it's just not the case. With these cuts you will have to either not rehire or cut pedagogical staff.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: It's impossible to absorb 170 million dollar cut at the Community College level without affecting instruction. We will do our absolute level best to meet the needs of our students, but there is no question that there will be an impact.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, so I just want to summarize the past, I don't know, 10 minutes. We're making-- we're cutting funding from CUNY, and losing even more money as a result because of the \$6,500 dollar per student in programs like ACE and ASAP, and despite what we're being told, CUNY is going to lose pedagogical staff because it is

impossible to otherwise make the hundred-somewhat million dollar savings. That's correct, right? Okay. That sounds awful. You know, and again, as someone who benefitted from CUNY and whose students for almost 14 years in my career benefitting from CUNY and finding job prospects and finding success, the idea that these are going to be cut and they're not going to be able to find that success is absolutely heartbreaking and not the direction which we need to go in this city. I want to talk briefly about the CUNY Reconnect program. It's a program to help adults return or reconnect to higher education. Although it was recently reported that CUNY has allowed recent high school graduates to attend this program instead of the intended demographic since they need the same support that CUNY Reconnects-- CUNY Reconnect provides. Can you just describe that process a little more?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: CUNY Reconnect is really about connecting directly with students who have stopped out, and I don't know about that connection to high school students. We can ask that question here in a second.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: But it is a high touch engagement to really reach out and very specifically and very personally identify what are the barriers to your re-entry to school, how can we assist you, and how can we help put you in the correct school that meets your needs? And obviously, given the incredible success. Again, the target was 10,000 students. We are now at I believe 16,600, somewhere in that nature. So, at least as it relates to adult stop-out students, I know that's the original intent, but many of these personal, as you can imagine, are working in admissions, and so there may be some additional students who are also benefited from that staffing.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Right. So what would happen if more recent high school graduates enroll and get the support of CUNY Reconnect? How will you serve the intended demographic?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Well, they would be traditional first-time freshman, and so all of the supports that we have in place-- it's a little different for our stop-out [sic] students where we're specifically focusing on the retention aspect. If it was a first time freshman, that would

be ACE, ASAP, those programs, connecting them in, TAP, part-time TAP, and the advisement structure.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: So, I mean, it's very similar. The difference is that with the adult students who stop out, there tend to be more myriad concerns about past data and things of that nature that we work through with them very specifically. But any students who's in that same circumstance would benefit.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Alright, and just-- just going back to the finances now. The 16,000 students, you know, you mentioned enrollment is down. Enrollment's always a struggle. Is there any sense about how much funding that those 16,000 students provide to CUNY through their tuition?

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: I don't have that. Do you have that, Wendy?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: I don't have that breakdown, but we could definitely get it for you.

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: We would have to break out the [inaudible] versus the community college students.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Yeah, and I think you understand the intent of the question financially, is what does the \$4.4 million dollar investment get us.

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I'm-- it is the right thing to do, to ensure that students have access to education. It's the right thing to do to provide the resources and the supports they need to re-engage in college, but I would also guess that there's a financial gain just as there in ACE. It is the right thing to do to support students through counseling, but it ends up saving us money. And I'm going to guess, if you provide that information, the CUNY Reconnect probably has similar financial benefits.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: It does, and the one thing that I would urge this council to consider is it's not just the benefit to the students of the enrollment and the tuition and the support that goes into serving our students at-scale, it's the economic benefit to the City of New York of significant additional revenue over the course of that individual's lifetime.

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: We will get the final number, but if we had to assume all 16,600 students attended a community college for one year, that brings us an 80 [sic] million dollars of additional funds. So, the number will be higher, right? Because there'll be some students that go to senior colleges, but if we just assume all the community colleges, that's how that math works out. So it's a big number.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: No, I heard you. I just want that number to sink in. So we're going to potentially cut 4.-- we're going to save \$4.4 million dollars, and it's going to cost \$80 million dollars for that savings.

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: We would lose \$80 million dollars in revenue.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Roughly.

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Roughly. I usually don't like back-of-the-envelope math, but I--

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: [interposing] I just did--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: think that's a good rough conservative estimate. Okay. Not the

1 wisest investment choices in this budget. I want to
2 turn it over to some of my colleagues who had
3 questions, and I'll come back for my questions. But
4 Council Member Barron had a question about the
5 Preliminary Budget as well.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very
8 much. You know, I want to start off with what you
9 expect, is criticism of continually coming before us,
10 even though 26 percent of the students are black, not
11 one black person is represented up there presenting
12 the interest of students. That has to stop. I'm
13 going to repeat it every time you indulge in that,
14 and I can't fathom that there's not a black person
15 competent enough to come before us and make some of
16 these presentations and be on this level. That's
17 number one. Second criticism is of your Chancellor.
18 I've been trying with the black faculty to get a
19 meeting with him. I think I would have done better
20 with trying to get a meeting with Obama when he was
21 president than your chancellor. He is not-- he wants
22 to meet with us separately, and I don't think that he
23 should try to divide, and I don't know what's the
24 purpose of it, but he refuses to meet with the black
25 faculty and myself together. and we simply want to

1 address the interest of making sure that black
2 faculty is hired, more black faculty are hired, and
3 also that they-- when it comes to getting the same
4 treatment as others when they're going for
5 establishing books and trying to get tenure and all
6 of that stuff, we want that dealt with. Having said
7 that, want to ask you a couple questions. One, the
8 Excelsior Program that the Governor had committed
9 years ago that we were-- many of us were against for
10 middle-class students-- what's the status of that?
11 Two, I think you have the ability to raise tuition.
12 I hope you're not going to raise tuition on the
13 students. Three, you know, we come to these hearings
14 and we talk about the cuts for this Seek [sic]
15 program and all these other programs, that's going to
16 be restored. In this whole budget debate, it's the
17 annual budget dance on many of the things that we
18 talked about today is going to be restored. The
19 Governor does it. The Mayor purposely cuts council
20 initiatives so we cannot talk about the macro-aspects
21 of things and talk about these little programs and
22 then they'll all be skinnin' and grinnin' at the end
23 saying, "Wow, we did it. We restored these
24 programs." We need to stop that. That cut in the
25

community college is tremendous. That \$4.-some odd million is going to be put back, because that's a easy on. When I was up in the State Assembly I said, oh, my God, they cut Seek, they cut this, they cut that. At the end, it was all put back. CUNY, the public commitment to CUNY in terms of macro-dollars, even the \$745 million you're talking about out of a capital budget of what, a five-year \$93 billion dollar city capital budget, and a 10-year \$169 billion dollar capital budget, and we're seeking \$745 million? The bigger issues in CUNY around the budget have to be dealt with. And I also want to hear your comments on getting to a free tuition, not the Excelsior sham, but a real free tuition CUNY as it was when whites came to CUNY initially. The free academy when it was white immigrants, as soon as we came in comes tuition. We don't have enough money. We want to get out of public education, just like they want to get out of public housing and privatizing this capitalist economy. So I want to hear some of your more progressive thoughts on CUNY, not the same old annual budget conversation on programs that are going to be restored, when in fact, we have a major problem with the flat commitment on a

State level which should be increased, and a decreased commitment on the City level with this closet Republican Mayor. So I just want to hear some of your comments on that.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Thank you, Council Member for your question. I am-- we are very proud of the work we've done when it comes to racial diversity within the University. At the Chancellery level, 61.5 percent are minority--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]
Before you give me your statistics and you're proud of diversity, I want to address the fact that you don't bring not one black person with you to present, not the diversity on all of that other level. Because you know, diversity can mean different things to different people. I'm talking about black people and how come none are presented here, and how come the Chancellor won't meet with myself and the black faculty to deal with the issues that we need more black faculty and more black faculty tenured, not just statistics. Give me few more minutes, please.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [inaudible]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: No, I could do what I want to do. You didn't elect me, my people did. So you can't tell me--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] Then your time's up. I'm asking you as Chair to ask a question--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] Well, then I'll keep talking until--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: not pontificate. Okay?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: because you pontificate. You spend a long time asking things--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] Yeah, I'm the Chair.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: and saying things.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: and when you're chair, you can do the same thing.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And when I'm elected--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] I'm simply asking you--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: member of this body, I'm going to continue.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: to ask a question.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'm going to
continue.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Not go on a
tirade. You can ask--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] And
don't tell me pontificating--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] the
questions about--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]
That's an insult.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: If the question's
about diversity, please ask.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Don't tell me how
to ask and what to say. You don't tell me what to
say or how to ask--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] Then
your time's up and we'll move on to Council Member
Hanif--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] Then
I'll just keep talking.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: who had a
question.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Well, I'ma [sic] keep talking until I get a chance to be respected. Don't you tell me how to ask something--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] I'm not telling you to ask, I'm telling--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: and I'm pontificating.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: You to use the five minutes you're allotted.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: We could have finished by now, but you always do this with me--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] But you're not asking a question.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: because you don't like what I'm saying.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: No, that's irrelevant.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: That's what you always do. That's what you always do.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: You're giving a speech for five minutes and it's not asking a question.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Well, I'm going to be--

1 COMMUNITY ON HIGHER EDUCATION 50

2 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] We
3 have members of CUNY here--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] I'm
5 going to say--

6 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: you're welcome to
7 ask a question.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'm going to say
9 what I have to say. You're not going to tell me how
10 to say it, whether I--

11 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] I'm
12 not telling you how to say anything.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: can make a
14 statement or not.

15 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: If you have a
16 question--

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] We
18 could have been finished.

19 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: direct it towards
20 them.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: We could have
22 been finished.

23 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: If you would've
24 asked your question, we could have been finished.

25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: We could have been finished if you didn't interrupt.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: So if your question is about diversity and black faculty,--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] I'll ask my own question.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: please ask. But you haven't been.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I don't-- don't tell me what to do. Don't tell me what to do.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Your five minutes are up. I'm extending your time--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] I'ma keep talking until I get to the answer.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: so that you can ask a question. If you choose not to ask a question, you're welcome to not ask a question.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I don't like your condescending lecture to me, so stop it.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: There's no lecture.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Stop it, and just let me finish.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Council Member--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]
Stop it, and let me finish.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: would you please
direct your question?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Stop it and let
me finish. So you can continue your answer.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: So,
thank you, Council Member. So, as I was stating,
we're very proud of the diversity that we have across
the university. The chancellor has really focused on
even at the President level, eight of our presidents
are black and African-American.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I understand. I'm
talking about the black faculty, though.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: On
the faculty side, I could give you--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] The
problem.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA:
Excuse me?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: It's a problem
with black faculty. I've been meeting with them.
They're saying they're having a problem getting
tenure-ship.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: We will take your concern back to the Chancellor and promptly get back to you with your request for a meeting. Are you-- you asked me a question connected to our-- the chancellery. Even just sitting behind us we have a Vice Chancellor who's been in front of this committee testifying, Vice Chancellor Maybank who's a Vice Chancellor for Student Affairs. So, we, you know, we're very proud of the diversity that we-- the chancellery and across this un-- and at the highest level of the university. So we will continue--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] What about the student tuition? The tuition, are you going to increase tuition on students?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Tuition is one of those-- is one of the many things that we look at as we are-- we look at our budget. We've always been supportive of the tuition as one of the many things that we look at, right? Ultimately, when we go in front of the board, the board is the one that decides.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Are you going to increase the tuition on the students?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA:

Ultimately, when we go in front of the Board, the Board is the one that decides. As we go through this process, we will then look at how much resource we get from the City and the State to determine what we need to do next in order to make sure we continue to run--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] Do you plan on recommending the tuition increase?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA:

Again, once the-- the budget on the state side and on the city side gets finalized, we will then go in front of the board and know exactly how much money we have in order to determine whether tuition-- but I also will say that we haven't raised tuition on the community side in almost eight years, and--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]

Okay, well that--

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA:

[interposing] on the four-year schools, almost four years.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'm just hoping that continues.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: So, we understand our students, our student population and how difficult tuition increase is for them, but this is one of the many things that we look at when we're bringing the budget forward in front of the Board. And hopefully we'll do extremely well with all of you and that wouldn't be something we'll take into consideration, but and--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] Why is the community college cuts but it doesn't include Hunter College campus, because they don't get the same cut as you're doing with the community colleges in the budget?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: I'm sorry, I don't understand--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] We'll be addressing that. I believe your original questions were about tuition and about black faculty. I heard the Vice Chancellor talk about the meeting and discuss tuition. So I thank you for your questions, and we'll move on to Council Member Hanif.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I wasn't asking you. I was asking him.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Please.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you so much.

I'm Council Member Shahana, former CUNY student, proud graduate of Brooklyn College, and the way I like to talk about CUNY is that CUNY saved my life, and it is the gateway to a stronger democracy in our city. It is the gateway to incredibly talented public servants and elected officials, and so we really, really need to make sure that disinvestments are not the conversation that we're talking about every year. It is really incredibly frustrating to know that CUNY is once again on the chopping block, particularly in a moment when we need to be fast-tracking and finding ways to bring in more students and support current students, and of course, support faculty and especially faculty of color, and you raised the point about retention, and so we're aligned in those facets. What input did you receive from the CUNY community including students, faculty, and staff before making the decision to make these cuts?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Are you referring to the savings, the Savings Plan that we put forth? What are you--

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: [interposing] Tell me about the savings, and then you can also-- we can also walk into the OMB proposed cuts as well.

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: So, we have two savings targets for the colleges, two percent in Fiscal 23 and that grows to about five percent in Fiscal 24. So, we had asked-- we had given the colleges targets on what their cuts would be individually, and each of the colleges had been instructed to-- when they develop their savings plans that they have to consult with and engage both student and faculty elected leaders.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: How does that happen? Could you walk me through that?

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: Yeah, I could tell you from my perspective, this is really something that's done by campus, and maybe I don't know if Wendy or Hector want to chime in. Typically, there are committees on the campuses. There's a Budget Committee that entails-- that includes both elected and student leaders. I would say that each college definitely engages that committee, but they probably have some other individual processes that I

probably just wouldn't be able to talk to right now.

But--

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: [interposing] So,
there isn't--

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: it's definitely
something we made very clear that we made very clear
that they need to do when developing their plan.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: They're instructed
to do--

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: [interposing]
Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: but there's no
sort of standard way of bringing in those comments or
feedback.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: The
committee and structure and faculty governance would
be somewhat unique on each campus, so that's one
piece of it. It wouldn't be a specific go to this
committee, because the committees are different. But
it would be with faculty leadership in terms of that
dialogue. The other piece, I've worked very closely
with all of the chief academic officers across CUNY
to identify hiring priorities for faculty so that we
ensure that as they're strategies-- as you pointed

1 out, we have to take an investment strategy even in a
2 time of serious budget cuts so that we ensure that we
3 preserve their strategic directions about new
4 programs and what the needs are on campus as they
5 come forward to us.
6

7 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: And
8 one more point. We heard from our presidents that
9 they needed to do more consultations, so we extended
10 the deadline of--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: [interposing] What
12 was the timing for the comment period?

13 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: It
14 was several months. It was several months. And we
15 extended that, that period, by an additional two
16 weeks, because-- and we made it very clear that it
17 was extremely important for them to have additional
18 consultation to make sure that all those voices were
19 sort of heard. And furthermore, on some campuses--
20 most campuses have also a Vacancy Review Board so
21 there's an additional process. I also meet, like
22 Wendy, I also meet with the comparable COOs in
23 something called the Administrative Council where we
24 also have further discussions about how these cuts
25 will be implemented and make sure there's

consultation. So we definitely try to make sure that the message gets out across the university.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Sure, I get that. I guess I was hoping that you'd be able to provide if it's a two-month feedback period versus a six-month, and then you mentioned that it was extended to two weeks. And then my other expectation was that you'd be able to share-- given that it's the first time I'm hearing that it differs from school to school, what exactly the input process looks like. So I'll reach back out for that information. And then on OMB, they're the ones setting the PEG goals for CUNY, correct? Did OMB indicate that PEGS would be reconsidered if they impact educational equality, student or faculty retention or any other key equity or quality indicators at CUNY?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: We have not heard that, no.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: What have you heard from them?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: We just heard that these PEGS were--

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: [interposing] Just the PEGS.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: And then is the Administration willing to consider these cuts if there is potential negative impact on students and educational quality for CUNY? Are you able to respond to that?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Is your question are we going to do those-- are we going to implement the PEGS, if it's going to effect--

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Correct.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: You know, obviously, all those thing take into consideration. We do have to manage the university in a fiscally responsible way, and we take all those into consideration as we're making decisions.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: I mean, I think it's fiscally irresponsible if we are losing students or the capital needs are at a high, higher than ever before and all things considered. So we really need to focus on restoring CUNY, and to Council Member Barron's point, bring it back to its visionary early days when it was tuition free, and anchor it in ways that support it for generations to come. I don't want to come back here next year building on this

1 conversation about disinvestments. And so really
2 hoping that our fight will be to expand on
3 appropriate care and strengthen investments for CUNY
4 and not cuts.

6 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you, Council
7 Member Hanif. I do want to recognize we've been
8 joined by Council Member Feliz. And I also want to
9 reiterate something that Council Member Hanif touched
10 on that we've discussed in this hearing, which is the
11 role of central CUNY in support its individual
12 campuses, right, where there is a point at which
13 there is model that should be used to in this case
14 engage people. We've discussed and we've
15 acknowledged it last June when we said there's no
16 reporting mechanism, central reporting mechanism for
17 hate crimes and discrimination. You have since made
18 that adjustment, and I thank you for that, and I
19 think it's important to recognize that there are a
20 lot of initiatives that do need a central role. I
21 want to turn it over to Council Member Brewer for her
22 questions.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very
24 much. The first is library hours. The students I
25 talk to complain that they're not what they used to

be. Is there a cut to library hours across all campuses, and can they go from one campus to the other to use the library?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: My understanding is that it's set by campus as they distribute their resources. I don't know if you--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing]
Okay, but I'm just saying overall somebody should look at it, because the complaint is that there are cuts. You want to have almost 24 hours for libraries. So, I do think you should look at it. Students complain about it all the time. And with all due respect, I wouldn't just say it's up to the campus. I would say we're going to deal with it. Are you going to deal with it, look at it?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: We're going to take a look at it and get back to you, Councilwoman, for sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Second, I'm a big believer in the-- and I know the Chair is also-- with the DOE and CUNY and the Affinity contracts and the Early Learn, CUNY Early Colleges. So describe what happens with the DOE when funding has been decreased and do the vacancy reduction plans have anything to

do with these reductions? If so, how? I always believe, actually-- not only do I believe in this program, but like Hunter Science, etcetera, I think CUNY should take over some of these CUNY-- some of these DOE campuses, because you do a great job, but you need the funding. Let's just talk about the Early Colleges.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: So, there's approximately 20 Early Colleges and P-Tech schools, and I thank you probably know that CUNY waives its tuition for all courses and then shares specific direct instructional costs with the Department of Education, things like faculty and textbooks, and at the moment we serve about 9,400 students, 71.7 percent of which earn college credit before graduation. So a very significant--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] I know them well.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Yeah. And in fact, I was as a newcomer was surprised to hear that the average number of credits earned is 25.2, which you know, is an entire-- almost an entire year of college.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [inaudible] with
Hunter Science, keep going.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL:
Another 55 percent of those who are enrolled enroll
within six months at CUNY. So it's also a clear
pipeline into higher education. There are-- there's
some discussion of cutting that budget from the
Department of Ed, as they have their own PEGS to
address.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Cut the whole
thing?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Not
cut the whole thing, but cut some portion of that.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: You don't know
what portion?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: I do
not.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: So, CUNY would cut
and DOE would cut, is that what you're trying to tell
me?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: I'm
not suggesting that we would cut, I'm suggesting that
if funding from the Department of Ed also is reduced

by the City as it relates to these programs, then we have a double impact that affects these students.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: So we need to--

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL:

[interposing] So, we'll have to manage that.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: We need to pay attention to that.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, what about a-- with all the cuts in general, particularly the community colleges, how do you attract faculty if you've got, you know, these kinds of cuts? What are doing specifically and what can we-- what can you say about how the cuts would hurt attracting faculty, full-time faculty?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Sure. There's no doubt that money matters in terms of recruiting, right? And so to the--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] What do you spend now, or how do you-- what kind of dollars do you spend now attracting faculty? Is there some budget associated with it?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: It's done by colleges. As colleges allocate which areas

they believe they need for instructional purposes and maintaining class size, different areas they're trying to grow. So that would be a very micro kind of decision at the college level. One of the things that I hear-- I know you hear from the students about library hours. I hear from faculty that we aren't able to provide professional development money to attend conferences and to do training and to continue advance their own professional skills. That's in very limited supply now, and it's very likely to be more so later. And so, you know, we are left with trying to identify non-monetary ways of retention, things like creating research-- faculty fellowships and research and creating new recognition for teaching and service and things that we can try and continue to encourage that--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: that achievement.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: What about graduation rates, same question. How specifically do the budget cuts impact? I'm focusing on community colleges, because that's what the City does in general.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Yeah,
so there's no question that it has an impact, because
the number one programs that we have right now are
ACE and ASAP, focusing on community specifically
would be ASAP.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: John [inaudible],
yes.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: And
so--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing]
That's all-- we called it the John Program before you
were here.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Thank
you. Those graduation rates raise as a whole for all
community college students with these programs. They
raised significantly for those students in these
programs. So to the extent that they're compromised
at any level, it-- and frankly our ability to scale
them to a broader set of students so that it's not
just a small portion that are served by these more
intensive services. It's problematic.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And then in the
PC Newsletter, PSC Newsletter, but in general because
I'm a tech person, what cuts to the technology world

do these cuts represent? In other words, do you see any cut to technology which is obviously the lifeline for all of us now in terms of-- is it capital? But it's also I would assume an expense.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: So, the staffing part, I would say the answer to that is yes. That's a very difficult thing to do, and that's a particular area where very high salary compression is in play. We've been fortunate to have 40 million dollars from the state in the last year for strategic initiatives and investments that we're using very specifically to answer some of the challenges that Chair Dinowitz just identified, programs and systems that don't speak to each other. We need to integrate these systems and we're doing a lot of work to upgrade them with this one-time money that's enormously welcomed but obviously is one-time money.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Alright, and just finally and then I'll stop. On capital budget, I'm sure we'll have more questions, but you're planning the north building at John Jay for Guttman. I would like just an update on that as soon as possible, but also I think you should put some affordable housing

in there and not just condos. Could you respond to that?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Thank you, Councilwoman.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: If I have to sign off on it, you will not be doing all condos.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Thank you for-- as you know, we have an active RFP out in the community and basically the goal for that-- of that RFP is to really look for a future home for government. Happy to sit down with you and walk you through what the project is going to look like, but we're going to-- we're probably about two months away from getting all the RFPs and being able to understand what the market bears and be able to have a more lengthier discussion.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: It's not about the market. It's not just about the market.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: I understand your question. I mean, obviously, CUNY's mission-- we're not in the housing business, but CUNY's mission--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] I am.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: CUNY's

mission is a mission that really makes sure that we are serving the, you know, a broader community. So as we look at our development, we will make sure that we're serving a broader community. Obviously, we will look at all the proposals and be able to make a determination. We do have to go in front of our Board of Trustees in order-- when we get the final proposals. And our Board has made it very clear to us that a lot of factors have to weighed in there.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: But you have the whole--

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA:

[interposing] But our main goal-- Councilwoman, let me be clear, our main goal is to find a home for Guttman. This a long time coming. It's something we're committed--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] I know all about Guttman. I was there when it started, but the issue is I need to make sure that that has some affordable housing. Thank you very much, Mr. Chair. I made my point.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you, Council Member Brewer. Council Member Vernikov?

COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Thank you, Chair Dinowitz. Thank you all for being here to testify. I'm Council Member Vernikov. I'd just like to comment and say that I think we can all agree that CUNY has many different issues, but I think it's quite dishonest and frivolous to accuse CUNY of being bad in its diversity, especially when it comes to black faculty and students. Last hearing, we saw Chancellor, Vice Chancellor Maybank and Senior Vice Chancellor Glenda Grace with us to testify. So I just-- with that, I'll ask my first question. Has CUNY resumed all projects that were delayed due to COVID-19? And if so, which projects?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Say that again, I'm sorry, Councilwoman.

COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Has CUNY resumed any projects that were delayed due to COVID-19 and the pandemic?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Okay, sorry. I'm sorry. We have, Councilwoman. We are-- as I stated in my testimony we have I think about 184 active projects right now across the University, and I gave a-- and I'm happy to provide you with the details, how it breaks down by borough, which totals

about \$1.2 billion dollars. So, one of the things that is important for our Chancellor and for me is to really improve our completion rate, and I'm happy to report on these projects we've increased our completion rate by 10 percent, which is, you know, a step in the right direction but still not what we need to be. So a lot of inferences have been put on-- Our new Vice Chancellor Mohamed Attalla has been charged with really putting together a very comprehensive initiative to be able to address how we as a university really responds to-- in a most expeditious way respond to the-- to be able to complete these projects in a timely manner. Part of it is connected to us making sure that our partners in this, DASNY, meets their obligation in terms of completion rates, but we've done some reorganization internally to be more nimble and be able to respond to projects. For example, a partnership that we're doing with Department of Buildings to be able to really deal with a lot of the violations, a reorganization, being able to bring in a lot more expertise internally from architects to people on our own staff to be able to be more nimble, be able to respond to these projects in a more timely manner.

1
2 And lastly, we're also going to be doing a lot more
3 projects ourselves. We rely a lot on DASNY. We
4 think they can handle a lot of the larger projects,
5 but a lot of the smaller projects we think that we
6 could handle those. That-- when I come back in front
7 of you again I'm going to be happy to report, you
8 know, kind of the progress that we've made in that
9 regard.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: So you'll be
11 able to let us know how many total project, yes?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Thank you. And
14 what are CUNY's total appropriations we authorized in
15 Fiscal Year 2024?

16 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Just
17 the capital?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Yes.

19 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: We're
20 asking for about \$745 million dollars from the City
21 to meet our-- but I think we-- I'll get you a more
22 correct number.

23 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Oh, on
24 the city side our capital appropriation is \$1.2
25 billion dollars.

COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: And how much of CUNY's capital commitments have been spent down in Fiscal 2024?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: We're going to have to get back to you on that.

COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Okay. Okay, thank you. That's all.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you, Council Member Vernikov. Can you just clarify the \$1.2 billion dollars and the \$745 million dollar? Two number-- I wasn't clear to me what those two numbers were.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Well, the \$745 reflects the active projects that we have right now in our current-- in our current pipeline and the \$1.9 is the request that we're moving forward.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: From the City?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Uh-hm.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And the \$1.9-- \$1.2 or \$1.9?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: \$1.2.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Two. And those are specifically for the community colleges?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: The \$1.2 is--

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: [interposing] For all.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: for all, yeah.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: How much of that do you expect to be matched by the state?

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: So, for Fiscal 24, the State has matched about \$120 million.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: About 70 percent of that.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Seventy, 70 percent of the \$1.2 billion request would be matched by the State.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Right.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay. You know, I think another example of pennywise pound foolish when capital dollars are matched, we can get that-- that good investment. And do those capital dollars

1
2 include heating and building upgrades to Bronx
3 Community College?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Yes.

5 Well, we have a lot of-- quite a few active projects
6 at Bronx Community College. As you know, we have-- I
7 know we've discussions with you about that school.
8 We came in the central offices and provided some
9 support to really deal with some of the underlying
10 issues that they were having, but now we have really
11 moved some of those projects forward to be able to
12 really address, you know, an infrastructure that
13 really has some challenges. I think one of the things
14 that I-- as I mentioned in my testimony, we're doing
15 an assessment across university of all our facilities
16 and all our systems. By the end of this year, we will
17 have a handle on all our system and the age of our
18 system so we could properly target those systems that
19 have not met their life line-- you know, they're
20 going to be-- they're in a state of probably not good
21 repair that we have to address, so that way we could
22 be a little bit more targeted in terms of responding
23 to that.

24

25

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: So you don't quite know the scope of the problem at BCC, or you don't know the financial scope of it is what I'm hearing?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: No, we do know that but I mean we thought that because of the challenge at B-- that we were having at Bronx Community College, you know, we decided to do a system-wide analysis of all our system. We brought in a company to really begin to address that, and in January we started with about a half a dozen colleges, and by the end of this year we will have a complete assessment of our 300 buildings and 29 million square feet of space.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Forgive me for-- did you not do that during COVID when we were-- ventilation was sort of the number one issue? Did that assessment not occur in 2020, 2021?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: We did, but what I'm trying to get, and I'm not being very clear. What I'm trying to say is that we're not only taking-- we're taking it a step further. We're not looking at all other areas, not only heating and ventilation, just system-wide across the university to make sure that we have a real handle on what other

things that could come to a state of-- that we need to-- in term of the state of the repair.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: So for example?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA:

Bathrooms, windows replacement, all those kind of system upgrades, wiring connected to the, you know, technology, just kind of looking at the whole system across the university.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I do want some clarity on this. I'm a little confused. You know, I understand-- bathrooms and windows, but things like IT, I thought that during COVID when things were remote and sort of after the height of the pandemic when CUNY was still doing a lot of their work remotely and we spoke at this committee about remote education, that IT would have been one of those things that has already been assessed. Is that not the case?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: No, during COVID what we really focused on, we brought in-- we brought engineers to really look. There was a lot of discussion by members of our staff connected to how clean our air was in each of the classrooms. So we did assessments across the university. It was

1
2 a-- there was a report that was given to us to better
3 understand where-- at that time, there was a lot we
4 didn't know about the pandemic in terms of-- there
5 was a lot of talk about HEPPA filters and all these,
6 so we did an assessment to really assess the state of
7 our infrastructure connected to ventilation. We had
8 that assessment. Now we've taken that a step further
9 and now we're really doing an assessment across the
10 university that encompass a list of facility-related
11 areas such as windows and, you know, those kind of
12 areas--

13 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] No,
14 I--

15 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: you
16 could understand that.

17 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: No, you made that
18 clear. You did a great job in articulating that. I'm
19 just curious when you mentioned IT because I would
20 have assumed that in an era where everyone moved
21 online and in an era where CUNY is engaged in things
22 like remote learning, that the IT at a campus-- and
23 system-wide would have already been assessed, but
24 that--

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA:

[interposing] Well, as I--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: That's not the case. Is that-- do you understand my question about just that IT component.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: We're doing-- in my testimony I stated that we're doing a couple of things, right? We recently have-- we're having the-- we're in the marketplace just bringing to our Board a new upgrade to replay CUNY First, right? That's going to address HR, finance. So we're moving sort of in that direction. On the learning side, our provost recently brought to the Board a new response to the online learning, and she could talk--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] So like Blackboard?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Correct, and I think part--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] which I used. I'm going to miss it very much. But I just-- just the Blackboard and the HR, that's under capital? That's under your capital plan?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay. That's helpful. That's clarifies my--

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL:
[interposing] Also just to add to it, of course we are really looking at our infrastructure in the technology as we're expanding it. So even if it was adequate for the moment of COVID when we were moving to that, we are trying to move to an entirely different level as it goes to online education, hybrid education, and things that we couldn't do on a dime during that assessment, but that will be necessary for the future of academics and CUNY.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And in this assessment, is ADA compliance in this assessment?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Say that again.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: You are assessing which areas need windows, heat--

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA:
[interposing] So, roofing--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: IT, bathrooms, elevators, ramps, and sensory-- please.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA:
Roofing, windows, grounds, exteriors, filtration,

plumbing, steamfitters, elevators, escalators, I mean we're getting a complete assessment of the university so we understand where we need-- and the age of those systems, right, so we could begin to address, not be dealing with repairing systems when we have an emergency. So try to be a little bit more proactive.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: And the ADA, to answer your question, the ADA is overlaid on all of those things. As it relates to technology, that's more in my department, and the new LMS has automatic ways to do different presentations, different coding, so it's a very significant focus that we have in terms of accessibility within the classroom as we have different types of technology. But he was talking about the ADA specifically.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Oh, ADA.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Right. I mean, things as basic as an elevator that doesn't exist. That's, I mean, about as basic as you can get. You now, in many cases, we Council Members are being asked to, you know, put forward, you know, discretionary funding which, you know, I don't know if I speak for everyone, but a lot of us are very

happy to invest discretionary funding in CUNY, but especially when it comes to ADA compliance, and again, basically things like elevators at almost basic level. I would think that as part of your capital plan, central would be the ones putting the funding towards that.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: And that is true, and it's going to be part-- what this assessment is going to allow us to do is to really have a better handle on all those areas that we need to really hone in a little bit more, right? As opposed to be responsive to emergencies, we're going to be more proactive, but I think that that is a role that Central should play, and it's a role that we-- by doing this assessment is a role that we're going to play sort of going forward. And I think that this will-- really our focus is to really begin to get our facilities to a state of good repair. And in order of us to be able to do that, we have to really understand where we need to either rehab it, knock it down, or repair it. And I'm stepping that right in that direction is by doing this assessment and hopefully once we get this information, then we're

going to be able to target what college needs the most attention in the investment.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I mean, I can tell you-- I can tell you right now that Bronx Community College, I mean, it's just one of the more recent ones I've spoken to, but they're in need of an elevator, and it's-- an elevator is not a nicety, it's about access. And so is my assumption that things like ADA compliance and elevators will be apriority for CUNY central and not be reliant on which Council Members, you know, have discretionary funding and are willing to give it-- to allocate that funding, and it's not just Bronx Community. It's throughout the entire city. And so can be sure that the ADA compliance including elevators will actually come out of the central funding and not be reliant on discretionary funding?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA:

Council Member, one thing that I want to share the numbers, I want to sort of-- our need, our need is about \$5.2 billion dollars. We get about 1.2 billion dollars in terms of the core maintenance. So our need is tremendous. I think we're-- with this approach we're trying to really tackle those areas

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: It's actually heartbreaking to hear that we're triage when we're talking about our students and the success of our city. I understand you get the money you get from the City and the State. Are there other funding sources? Are there other refunding sources that correlate to specific projects or that go into your fund for capital projects? For example, federal dollars, private donations, things of that nature?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: So, recently we've applied to a couple of federal grants to try to subsidize to try to bring in some additional resources. We're also trying to-- some of the reinvestment that we're doing across the efficiency programs, trying to see how we can maybe retarget some of those resources across the university. We're also doing a, you know, an assessment of our facilities to see within we-- maybe through P3 or projects along those lines we could bring some additional revenue to be able to address the challenges that we have from a facilities perspective.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Do you conduct student surveys indicating student-- you know, how pleased they are with the system or why they might have left? And in that question-- in that survey, if you do it, does it include questions on facilities, including ADA compliance, including things like holes in a ceiling which we've seen in some classrooms, access to physical space like libraries as Council Member Brewer was talking about?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: We do an annual students survey satisfaction. It's a

national survey. I don't know the specific questions as it relates to that. I can address your point. It is certainly-- I've spoken to a lot of students. When the external facility quality doesn't match the quality in the classroom, it does have a depressing effect, of course it does, but we do the very best we can with the funds that we have to continue to meet the need of our aging infrastructure.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Certainly, and I would hope that if it doesn't exist already, that included in your survey, questions or things that are directly related to the budget needs and the budget asks. I would add that I hope that you're surveying people reconnecting through CUNY Reconnect, and you know, discussing and surveying why they left in the first place, why they made that choice or why they were forced to leave, you know, in the first place?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Yes, that is very much what we're doing. That's part of the Reconnect, and if you'd like to see that student survey, I'd be happy to share with you.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I'd love to.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: It's very interesting. There's a lot of information in there. You know, one of the things that--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] Is that by the way-- are those survey data public? Are they online?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: That I don't know.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I see your--

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: [interposing] Public and online.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: They are online, okay, that's wonderful. And when you do this survey of your facilities, are the needs going to be posted online or is that going to be kept to internal discussion?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: I was just getting an answer to your-- to the ADA.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: So, we have approximately 103 million dollars specifically dedicated to projects, active projects connected to ADA such as bathrooms, elevators across the university. It is part of an ongoing five-year

1 plan that we-- system-wide that we put forth. Happy
2 to share that with you at some point. Also, once we
3 get the assessment, happy to-- once we look at it and
4 understand it a little bit more, happy to-- yes, I'll
5 provide some of that information to the Council.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Please do, and I
8 think especially vital for the public is to know
9 which specific areas of the university system are ADA
10 compliant, are welcoming for people with disabilities
11 both those that are visible and not visible. And the
12 103 million dollars for ADA compliance, you know, I
13 just want to go back, whether it's for that or the
14 entire capital. You said-- entire capital plan. You
15 said you applied for federal grants, is that right,
16 for capital funding?

17 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: You
18 responded to-- that was a response to what other
19 resources we're going after.

20 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Yeah.

21 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: On
22 capital.

23 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [inaudible]

24 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Not
25 necessarily on ADA, but as on capital.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Right, right, right. [inaudible] federal grant. Did you also say private donors?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: NO what I said was, we were looking at-- we're looking at our facilities to see where we could maximize our facilities, if there's some sort of partnership between private public partnership where we could maximize some of our facilities to try to bring additional revenues to the university. That's something we're looking at and seeing. Right now, we're in the stages of just evaluating that process to see.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: So you--

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: [interposing] Or there might be some opportunities to bring resources.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, so you have no examples currently of public private partnerships for capital projects that you're currently engaged in, like a model of what that looks like?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: One is North Hall [sic] is an example of that, right?

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I'm sorry, the?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: North Hall is an example of that.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: Right? Where we're putting one of our sites out to the marketplace in order to find a permanent home for one of our community colleges, but the revenues that we're going to receive from that project, we will get-- we will get a permanent home for one of our community colleges.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I would note that money exists in the private marketplace whether it's through grants, donations, or public private partnerships. I think recently Hunter College got a gift of--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] Fifty-two.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Fifty-two dollars, 52,000? How much was it?

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Million.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Million dollars, 52 million dollars President Rabb [sp?] was able to secure \$52 million dollars in private donations, and

I think that' an incredible feat. I think it's the most any president has every been able to--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] Big.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: It is. I love having a personal fact-checker here in the committee. \$52 million dollars, President Rabb was able to get \$52 million dollars for Hunter, and that's an incredible feat, but I believe it is one that can be repeated, and I believe there is money in the private marketplace of people in organizations who want to invest in our future, and as much as our city is intending to divest, we do have private organizations and individuals who want to invest.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Don't do that. Don't do that. Just give me my opportunity to speak. Don't do that.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [inaudible]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: No, don't do that. Don't lecture me. Just say-- if I say I have a question, just let me question or statement or whatever else I want to make. Don't do that. Don't do that.

1 COMMUNITY ON HIGHER EDUCATION 94

2 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, so I'll move
3 onto my next question which is about some of the
4 programs--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] What
6 I wanted to ask you, I wanted to--

7 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] In
8 your opening--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] I
10 wanted to talk more--

11 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing]
12 Council Member Barron, it is not your turn to speak,
13 okay?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: It is my turn to
15 speak. You been speaking--

16 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] I
17 have--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]
19 You've been monopolizing the whole meeting.

20 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you so much,
21 I--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] I
23 have questions, and I have things I need to say.

24 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, and so when
25 it's your turn, you'll ask the questions, but--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] It is my turn now. It's my turn ow.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: it's not currently your turn. It is not currently your turn, Council Member Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] Well, anyway, I just wanted to ask you-- I wanted to ask you a question about--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] I-- first of all, on behalf of the Committee--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] a piece of funding that was--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] I'm going to apologize the two of us are speaking--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] allocated by the state.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: It is not currently his turn to speak.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: The state was allocated--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] I'm going to ask about my questions--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] [inaudible] it was 20 million.

2 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: which are about
3 some of the programs that you had spoken about in
4 your opening--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]
6 Well, I think that you should-- I'm not going to let
7 you not allow me to speak. You monopolizing the
8 whole meeting.

9 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Council Member
10 Barron, you'll have an opportunity to speak--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] A
12 Chair is a facilitator, not a dictator. You are a
13 facilitator, not a dictator.

14 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Correct, I'm
15 currently facilitating.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: You can't
17 monopolize the whole meeting--

18 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing]
19 Council Member Barron,--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] then
21 when you--

22 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I'm currently
23 facilitating.

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: When I say I have a question, you gonna [sic] say, do you have a question, that's what I said.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: That's-- you didn't say that.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I said I have a question.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Council Member Barron, you'll have--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] And just let me ask my-- let me deal with my--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: an opportunity to speak. The opportunities--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Excuse me?

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: You'll have an opportunity to ask your question.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'm doing it now.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: No, you're not.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, I am.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: It is not currently your time.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, it is. You can't have the whole meeting. You are a Chair, a facilitator not a dictator. This thing is going to

your head. You can't dictate-- we speak for five minutes, then the Chair--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] I'm sorry, Council Member Brewer?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: He's been speaking for about a half an hour already?

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I'm sorry, Council Member Brewer?

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I was going to say, you go and then Charles go, and then I go-- [inaudible]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: You go-- you've been asking-- you've been talking for the last half hour. This is monop-- you know, you don't understand what a Chair's role is. It's a facilitator, not a dictator.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: We'll, I'd love to have your TED Talk on it later. I'd love to have your professional development. Unfortunately, I didn't receive that professional development, so I'm going to continue with a few more questions. Then you'll have your questions. Then Council Member Brewer will have her questions. Thank you. I wanted to talk about a handful of the programs that you may

1 have mentioned in your opening statement, but one of
2 the first ones I want to focus on is CUNY Tutor
3 Corps, and it's going to go along the same lines of
4 questions about ASAP. You have CUNY Tutor Corps as
5 funded at how much?
6

7 VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: I'm sorry--

8 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] CUNY
9 Tutor Corps is funded out how much?

10 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: I
11 can't hear you.

12 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: CUNY Tutor Corps
13 is a program where CUNY students tutor high school
14 and middle school students. It's something that I
15 brought up on other hearings. We had a K-12 hearing,
16 I think it was two months ago. If you could
17 reiterate how much funding that receives?

18 VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: Give me one
19 second.

20 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Sure thing.

21 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: It's
22 \$1.7 million.

23 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, \$1.7 and
24 that's also on the chopping block, right?
25

1 COMMUNITY ON HIGHER EDUCATION 100

2 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: 3,400

3 students. It certainly is impacted.

4 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I'm sorry, 3,400

5 CUNY students?

6 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL:

7 Correct.

8 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, and it's

9 \$1.7 million and these CUNY students get paid. This

10 is a paid internship program.

11 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: They

12 do. It's a double stimulus, both for the students

13 and DOE who are getting the advantage of that

14 mentorship and for our students who then are getting

15 paid.

16 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: That's right. \$1.7

17 million dollars, so this is set to be cut based on

18 the current budget, correct?

19 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: I

20 believe so. It has been cut.

21 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: It has been cut.

22 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Yes.

23 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: What do you mean

24 it has been? So in this current school year, are

25

there CUNY tutor-- CUNY Tutor Corps students currently assisting 6-12 DOE students?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: There are. It is-- it has been cut in the proposed budget.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, and do you have a sense of, again, how many students-- the impact of this program, how many students graduate as a result-- how many high school students graduate as a result of this program because of the tutoring?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: I know it's one of our most successful programs, but I don't have that specific data, so I can follow up with that.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Yeah. Right. So it's that same question about sort of that impact of these programs that are being cut. If you just give me a moment, I want to go back to your testimony. So the 10 finalists for the quest for the prestigious 2023 Aspen Prize, will that support for those students be able to continue if in the current budget? I assume those students were given-- the students that won that award-- oh, we were among the 10 finalists, the Hostos and Kingsborough, I'm sorry.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Two of our community colleges are among the finalists for the best in the nation.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Right. And do you expect the budget cuts to impact sort of that standing?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Again, ultimately money affects quality. We do the best that we can with the resources that we have.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, the \$14 million dollars partnership to train thousands of current and future public school teachers to deliver practical community science, is that a program that is set to be cut in FY 24?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: I'm sorry?

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: The-- New York's \$14 million dollar partnership to train thousands of current and future public school teachers to deliver practical computer science and digital literacy skills to their students across the city. Is that set to be cut?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: I believe so.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Great. Is there more?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: I know there's-- what I can say is there's \$9 million dollars that are cut from the perspective budget that all relate to college readiness, including some of these programs that you're-- Adult Literacy, Competency for Public Teachers, Fatherhood Academy, CUNY Start and Math Start, and the CUNY Tutor Corps.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Right.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: That's all under that heading of college readiness.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: The \$65 application fee you waived it this year for NYC Department of Education students. Do you expect to be able to waive the application fee next Fiscal Year?

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: That is under discussion. We would like to. We did not waive it this year, to be clear. We waived it for a six-week period for Department of Education students. Many of our Department of Ed students already get a waiver, but not all of them. So this time period of six weeks is for all DOE students.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, thank you.

And lastly, the \$750,000 for the 24 colleges to address bigotry, including anti-Semitism, am I to assume that that will not be renewed for next year? Is that money that's supporting your interfaith and interethnic group, that's going to be cut?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL:

There's-- that was a one-time allocation, so there's nothing to cut, but it would be affected by the overall resources that are available.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Well, I would just add that I would hope that among the other things we hope to restore, that that funding be baselined. You know, the reason being-- as any educator understands, education's continual and is-- you [inaudible] two or four-year college, there are new students every year and a cohort of students leave typically every year.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: It's an ongoing need to be sure, yes, absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Yes. I will turn it over to Council Member Barron. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I wanted to ask remediation. Is remedial classes only offered at

two-year colleges or did they restore it to the four-year colleges?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: As of this year, there are not more remedial education classes. They've all been transitioned to Developmental Education co-requisite classes for credit, and that is a national--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] Oh, for credit.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Yes, for credit, so that no student is taking a course for no credit as they enter.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: There you go. Is it in both?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: And that was cut in the budget.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Is it in both two and four-year?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: That is correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Alright. And then I had gotten a \$20 million dollar Martin Luther King Scholarship Fund when I was in the State Assembly. They-- that was for non-tuition costs.

1 Many of our students are suffering the cost of books,
2 transportation, childcare, clothing, food. The non-
3 tuition costs sometimes can be higher than the
4 tuition itself. So I had put that into a-- and got
5 it funded, but I think what the State did was say
6 that you had to use some of your pandemic money, your
7 federal money, to do that as opposed to putting in
8 extra money for it. Do you know the status of that?

10 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Well,
11 I can tell you that all of the funds are as of June--
12 or is it June 30th-- from the federal government,
13 COVID relief funds are no longer in play. So that--
14 many of those funds were used for relief, emergency
15 relief services for students who had cost needs or
16 emergency needs beyond the classroom. So that
17 funding is gone.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: But the \$20
19 million was for a scholarship fund that's supposed to
20 really come from the State budget. So what they did,
21 I think, is they pushed it into your COVID money or
22 do they have a separate--

23 EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL:
24 [interposing] I'm not familiar with--
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]

Okay, if you could check that out.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: It's looks like none of us are familiar with that.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And then finally, the real job is on the City Council. You know, you are strapped with a lot of financial constraints, but it's this council that has the power and authority to pass a budget that says, \$5 billion out of the capital money for CUNY, and \$5 billion dollars out of \$93 billion five-year or \$169 billion five-year. so when we come and you testify before us, there's some fiscal constraints you have that this very City Council is putting on you by passing budgets. The Mayor doesn't pass the budget. He just proposes a budget. So we have 31 women. We have over 30 people of color. We even have some socialists and radicals. We can't tell a conservative Mayor that no, we're not going to pass a budget that doesn't have \$5 billion for CUNY in capital money. So that's the route that I'm going to be taking during these budget negotiating times, because this council, very disappointingly, last year passed a budget that had stuff in it that should not have been cuts in it,

1 that should not exist, just so that you know that we
2 don't have a deficit. We have 83-- \$8.3 billion in a
3 reserve fund, and the unexpected revenue last year
4 and this year from Wall Street was in the billions,
5 and so there's no reason why CUNY should be treated
6 the way it is. So when you see me fervently fighting
7 like this, it's not personal. It's for my students,
8 and it's so that this council could rise up against
9 the mayor that's cutting millions from every agency
10 except the police and doesn't adequately fund us.
11 And this is important for you to understand, so when-
12 - if you see my impatience with a lot of the softball
13 micro questions that easy for you to answer, that
14 sometimes we got to get to the macro questions on
15 what's going on in s state that has \$224 billion and
16 \$102.7 billion in the city. And that is not
17 pontificating, that is speaking truth to power.
18 Thank you.

19
20 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. One
21 expense question and one capital. Again, for the
22 students, I know there are cuts I assume to the
23 mental health programs, the nursing programs, and I
24 know these are extremely well-utilized programs. Can
25

you be specific as to what programs are being cut for both of those two, mental health and nursing?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: I'm not familiar with any programs that are being cut. There may be restricted resources. Mental health is--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing]
That's the same. To me, that's the same thing, I have to say. Go ahead.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Well, the big challenge with mental health is that many of those positions were funded by the COVID relief dollars which are no longer available. And as I'm sure you know, the intensity of the need of our students for those services only continues to grow.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Very aware of it. But my question would be, what would you need to continue those services as opposed to saying we cut because we don't have this federal money, we're not going to discuss it anymore. That's something that we should be advocating for. Those services are desperate. We need it.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: We spend about \$5 million dollars a year.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: For the mental health and the nursing or just the mental health?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: That's just the mental health.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Nursing, I would have to look at a different calculation. Some of that's in the campus at the campus level.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, but across the campuses it's \$5 million for the mental health.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: That we were spending [inaudible]. Oh, that is the percentage that we're losing from the COVID stimulus fund.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: That's what you're losing from COVID. Do you know how many services are being cut as a result? I know you said a little bit here and a little bit there. Is that what you're trying to say?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: It's a staffing issue that I know that we're committed to finding a way to staff, but we could get you that information of what the impact is.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And the same thing on the nurses. If you're saying that there are cuts to nursing or not?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: Nothing specific again. As it relates to nursing, we recognize that the need to grow those programs is intense, and so we are doing the best that we can to move things around, but obviously it's easier with additional resources.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Alright, but it would be good for us to know what the need is and what the-- those are two big needs.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR HENSEL: We'll follow up with that.

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: I mean, we did get cut on the state side.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: That I know.

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: A million dollars for nursing, a million dollars for mental health.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, but you don't know if it'll be restored.

VICE CHANCELLOR CHIAPPA: Hopefully, it will through the process, but we don't know right now.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, number two, I am not a big supporter of what happened at Brookdale. The Chancellor knows that. Leave that aside. What's going to happen to the hole in the ground that Jennifer Rabb [sp?] was able to access and now it sits there? Who's in charge? What's happening?

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: As part of the Brookdale project--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] I know what happened at Brookdale, but--

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: [interposing] No, no, I understand that, but I just want to-- There was an MOU--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] [inaudible]

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: There was an MOU that was done many years ago by the previous Administration. They connected the so-called Home to Ground and a couple other--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] Yes.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: So,
as part of that unbundling [sic] MOU, that the 73rd
Street, 74th Street site reverts to the City of New
York. CUNY as part of that, whenever the City, the
Economic Development Corporation does a development
in that site, we have asked for 100,000 square feet
to be allocated to CUNY for Hunter's use.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: At the hole in--

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA:
[interposing] That still remains to be seen when that
project moves forward, but that is part of the
request that we made as part of that agreement.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. So the
City has it. You're requesting at 74th and 1st
100,000 square feet.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA:
That's correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: But you don't
have any commitment.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: No,
we don't have a commitment.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very
much.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I would like to
thank--

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA:
[interposing] Can I, Council--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] Yes.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: I
just want to go back to Bronx Community Colleges.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Sure.

EXECUTIVE VICE CHANCELLOR BATISTA: I
knew that we had-- we're doing a-- so currently at
Bronx Community College we have 16 projects that
we're moving forward, 10 in the design, six in full
construction totaling about \$280 million dollars, and
they're really focused on the areas that you raised,
ADA, elevators. The elevators in [inaudible] in
construction right now-- boilers. So we're in
bathrooms. So we're addressing a lot of those
concerns. Happy to provide that information to you,
but I just went back and looked at it, and that's
what we've been doing.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you. I want
to clarify that some of those funding sources, again,
included Council discretionary funding, and that's
happening throughout the system that whether it's our

CUNY schools, our DOE schools, our libraries, we are often the ones who are providing the funds that should be part of the central budget. Again, you know, elevators aren't a nicety. They should be there, and it shouldn't require council discretionary funding to fund what should be there in the first place. So, you know, I'd love to get more details on that. It is important that we're doing ADA compliance and all of the other upgrades to our facilities, but again, the discretionary funding going towards what should be there, you know, I was a little-- you know, we're all happy to invest our money on what's important, but it really shouldn't be necessarily just discretionary dollars going to these initiatives. I want to thank you all for your testimony for today and for coming and we will call the next panel. As a reminder, if you are here and you would like to testify in person, please fill out a slip at the Sergeant at Arms desk in the back. And the first person we're going to call up to testify in-person is James Davis, President of PSC-CUNY. We'd also like to call Alan Yu up to this panel. Mr. President, President Davis, please begin, and I'll--

sorry. People testifying have three minutes for their presen-- for their testimony. Thank you.

JAMES DAVIS: Thank you, and you have a copy of my written testimony, so whatever we don't get to, I hope you'll consult the written testimony. Thank you, Chair Dinowitz and Council Members for the opportunity to speak to you today. As President of the 30,000 member professional staff congress, I'm here to ask you to invest in CUNY and to oppose the budget cuts that have been proposed by the Executive. Representing faculty and professional staff at CUNY's 18 colleges and six graduate and professional schools, the PSC must advocate for our members, our students, and the communities that CUNY serves. Right now, New York's historic public higher education system is at serious risk. Under-investment has placed in jeopardy the opportunities afforded to current and future students. As an unrivaled catalyst for social and economic mobility, CUNY deserves to be protected and fully-funded. Investments in CUNY yield immense dividends, not only the kind that can be quantified in our tax base or our students' earning potential, but also the impact to cross generations on families and communities.

So, my first message is no more cuts. The City cannot allow austerity budgeting to undermine educational quality and access. The combined effects of the expiration of federal pandemic funds and the cuts in the PEGS will be excruciating. After suffering PEGS already of more than \$39 million in the current Fiscal Year, additional cuts of more than \$10 million have been demanded for Fiscal 24 for a total reduction of nearly \$50 million dollars. Should those proposed cuts be implemented, the university will lose 211 pedagogical staff in addition to the 128 they've already lost to attrition and to community colleges. Additional 4.75 percent reduction is proposed, as you know, for the out-years, and that will crush CUNY just as we are helping to bring the City back from the pandemic. Fewer staff to assist students and guide them to graduation, fewer counselors and fewer fulltime faculty at colleges that are already relying disproportionately on adjuncts to deliver our academic programs. Resources are needed to enhance these student supports and advising services that includes additional funds for the ASAP program that we've already been speaking about along with

investments in advisors, transportation subsidies, supplemental mental health services, and improved English language access programs. I see my time is short. There are a number of key investment proposals that are included in the written testimony. So let me just wrap up by saying that in anticipation of an adverse budget, the CUNY Administration has demanded cuts to our colleges which if implemented will be catastrophic. They have targeted \$128 million dollars in university-wide savings, \$34 million of which at the community colleges. Rather than deprive our students, faculty, and staff of these much needed resources, the City should honor the transformative impact CUNY has on the economy and prevent those cuts from being implemented. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you. You may begin your testimony.

ALAN YU: Good afternoon Chair Dinowitz. I'm Alan Yu, the Executive Director of New Yorkers for Children, NYFC, a nonprofit that works to improve the wellbeing of people in the child welfare system with a focus on youth aging out of foster care. We provide educational, mental health, and financial support to over 1,000 youth annually, while also

developing innovative initiatives to fill gaps in this system. We do this through our longstanding partnership with the Administration for Children's Services, foster care agencies and many community organizations. Thank you to the City Council for the \$50,000 dollar award this current Fiscal Year which is enabling us to serve youth in our Fostering Empowerment Program and our Back to School Program. For the upcoming Fiscal Year, NYFC is respectfully requesting that the City Council renew our award and make deeper investments in our programs' population. Additional resources are crucial for NYFC to support our clients in more comprehensive ways and lead to increased educational attainment, mental wellness, and career development for youth aging out. Over 7,000 students in the City spend time in foster care every year, and they're disproportionately black and from low-income communities. Though they represent a relatively small portion of the public school population, youth in the foster system have some of the most complex educational needs and bleakest academic outcomes of any student group. One in five students in the City who spent any time in foster care drop out of high school. By State test

standards, 80 percent of foster care students were not proficient in reading and math, and that was before the pandemic, and half are chronically absent from school. Because many of the young people we serve have experienced multiple overlapping traumas on the individuals and systemic levels, we provide free mental health support from credentialed staff that facilitate healing and growth. Another key aspect of NYFC's programming philosophy is alleviating the root causes of poverty for the people we serve. Through our commitment to providing young people with emergency cash support, we aim to empower youth to make their own financial decisions and surmount crises that might otherwise disrupt their lives. Overall, an investment by the City Council at NYFC means an investment in youth and families in the child welfare system in NYC. our commitment to strengthening channels to post-secondary programs, college, and careers, particularly for students on alternative paths to graduation is instrumental in ensuring our youth are not overlooked, creating more equitable outcomes. Thank you all for your time, and I look forward to continuing our work together.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Wow, thank you.
Did you rehearse that speech?

ALAN YU: I did.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And you knew
you're getting three-- perfect. You could have-- he
almost didn't need the buzzer. Thank you. I have a
few questions actually for both of you. So, you
know, President Davis, I think one of the things that
you recognized, that this committee recognizes is the
importance of that-- services that are considered
outside of the academic pedagogical [inaudible] but
really aren't. Something as simple as metro cards
for students over the summer. And you talk a lot
with your faculty. Can you speak a little more to
the impact of programs like ASAP and something as
simple as providing free metro cards to them?

JAMES DAVIS: Sure, and thank you for the
question. You know, the ASAP program has been widely
decorated around the country because of its success
at improving graduation rates. The graduation rates
are tremendous and the CUNY Administration spoke to
those. Our ideal goal would be that the ASAP model of
advisement would be replicated across all of the
community colleges. It's so successful. The ratio of

one academic advisor for every 150 students would immediately improve the graduation retention rates across the universities. Along with that, as your question suggests, we really need to support the whole students who comes to CUNY, and that's not unique to CUNY, but certainly the communities that CUNY serves. We know that those students benefit from, for example, the security of knowing that they can get to campus without having to choose between their metro card fare and whether they can pay rent or put food on the table. so those kinds of subsidies in terms of textbooks, academic support, tutoring support, and transportation support have been so critical to the success rates of the students in the ASAP program.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And speaking of the whole student, Mr. Yu, in your testimony you said one in five students who spent any time in foster care dropped out of high school, and 80 percent of foster care students were not proficient in reading and math. Do you-- now, typically students who are in college probably aren't in foster care, is that accurate to say? They're adults at that point?

ALAN YU: Yeah, so this is particularly for youth aging out of foster care and really looking at the educational continuum and just that if they are disadvantaged in their secondary programs, that we need to provide safety net and resources to set them up for future success.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: and do you-- I see the data that you have for high school, students in foster care. Do you collect data on students who exit foster care and their success in college?

ALAN YU: We collect data for our program participants, and I believe there's some ACS data as well, which I can provide to you after the meeting.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And you know, I know we didn't speak about all of the -- I'll read some of them that President Davis was going to-- I'll summarize mental health services for \$10,000, 50 full-time mental health counselors, English language access, for example, and of course the ASAP for ALL we'll call it. It's not what you call it in your testimony, but I'll call it. You call comprehensive student support and advising, we'll call ASAP for All or ACE. It's support. And do your-- do you have interaction with the youth that you-- exiting foster

care, any data or anecdotes about students who have benefitted or engaged in these programs and how it's impacted their lives?

ALAN YU: Yeah, definitely. So our signature program Nick's Scholars is our deepest touch program, and it provides wrap-around services and approximately \$10,000 dollars of essential support to students aging out of foster care. And this program has a very strong track record to-date. Seventy -five percent of our Nick's scholars graduate on time, while 94 percent remain in college and 90 percent of our scholars graduate from college compared with national averages where only 10 percent of youth in foster care enroll in college, and only 26 percent remain in college.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: It's amazing. It's like you invest in something and students succeed. I want to ask one other question to President Davis. So we have the budget report from OMB, and it seems to indicate that we'll be losing sort of the non-pedagogical or civilian staff and most of the cuts will come other than personnel services. Has then been your analysis after the seeing the budget

proposal that most of the funding cuts will be other than personnel services?

JAMES DAVIS: Our sense is that there will also be vacancies left vacant in pedagogical positions, and as my colleagues in the CUNY Administration indicated, that can mean both on the faculty side and also on other kinds of student support roles. So it's not restricted only to civilian positions, but also to pedagogical positions more broadly.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Right. Excuse me for one moment. And what are some of the capital that you're-- you know, you have a-- you and your members have a different perspective than perhaps CUNY central. Your members are in the buildings every day. Can you speak a little to the capital needs that your members have shared with you, some of those needs that will allow them to do their jobs that are preventing the students from succeeding?

JAMES DAVIS: Sure. I think that Vice Chancellor Batista alluded to the years and years of deferred maintenance, and our member's experience that every day and our students do as well. There's so much variability in terms of the state of repair

of our buildings. It sends a terrible signal to students who come into CUNY if they have to come into a dilapidated classroom, if the library, you know, has mold or has leaks in it, and again, that's the accumulated deterioration of many, many years of under-resourcing, but in fact, it goes to your previous question as well. Because if the capital budget is consistently insufficient, and you also can't hire the electricians and the painters and the plumbers who can do the work, that's a recipe for continued infrastructure issues.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Well, CUNY should be training electricians and plumbers as workforce development. My last question is about childcare programs. We didn't touch on it specifically at the hearing. Sorry, with CUNY Administration. I visited a wonderful childcare program at Hostos Community College. The best part of my week was getting to read to these young children. These were children of students who were able to, you know, drop their kids off so they can go to classes. And you're saying the childcare program is set to be cut by 600,000 dollars. Can you describe the impact that will have on our students and faculty? And I'll just add if

perhaps Mr. Yu, you've had young people you've worked with who've benefitted from this program, and what the cuts would mean to those students.

JAMES DAVIS: I'll start and I'll try to be brief.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay.

JAMES DAVIS: You know, many, many of our students are parents and it's an extraordinarily challenging thing to be pursuing a degree even under the best of circumstances if you have children, and it's especially difficult if you're not sure what kind of childcare can be provided. So the campus childcare facilities give priority to students over faculty and staff, as they should, but the needs are enormous. And I think one of our concerns is, you know, so many of our students do work and they do also have either elder care or childcare. So, you know, to come back to something you said before. A cut of \$600,000 to childcare facilities at CUNY, you know, is penny wise and pound foolish, and it's really actually an enormous deterrent to supporting those very students who we want to see come back to the classroom. We're going to lose them frankly to the University of Phoenix and these other online

universities because out of convenience's sake, but we want them at CUNY.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: So do I.

ALAN YU: We would also agree with that, that anything the City Council can do to reduce barriers [inaudible] for students that are continuing their higher education, and you know, childcare is a big issue for our students that we now have children of their own, and so that's something we would support.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you. And we'll-- I assume that you don't have the data. That's really CUNY's job, but we will request from CUNY how many students are in a CUNY school only because they're able to through childcare and how many students we would lose. Earlier in the hearing we were talk-- just financially, not-- you know, morally and for the future of our city it's the right thing to do, but this is a budget hearing. But we already spoke about at least \$80 million dollars, you know, benefit just from that \$4.4 million dollar investment in CUNY Reconnect. ASAP had similar results, thousand and thousands and thousands of dollars just by doing the right thing and investing

in our students. I think this is another example of it doesn't-- it doesn't cost relatively that much to provide this childcare, but it's allowing students to stay enrolled or become enrolled in college and really better the lives for themselves and for their families. I want to thank you both for your testimony today and for the answers to the questions. Thank you. I'll now call up Salimatou Doumbouya. Salimatou Doumbouya. Apologies for the mispronunciation. You may begin.

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: Okay. Alright. Good afternoon. I would like to first thank the members of this committee and the Chair for allowing me to testify in front of you today on behalf of the CUNY Students. My name is Salimatou Doumbouya and I Chair the CUNY University Student Senate where I represent 220,000 degree-seeking students and 150,000 continuing education students of the City University of New York. I would like to start by saying that we are in support of the funding that CUNY is requesting from the City and also from the State, the support for STEM students, the state matching fund for endowment contributions, all the way to modernizing the CUNY system, especially in the infrastructure.

But today, I would like to come before you with very specific things that the students need as things that support us in our everyday lives. The first thing is going to be transportation support for CUNY students. The same way ASAP and all the really great programs provide Metro cards to students, we feel like it's time to expand it to people who may not necessarily qualify of ASAP, to undocumented students, to international students, and finding a way to provide metro cards and transportation services to all the students in CUNY by default. We would also like to emphasize the importance of food security. Today, some buildings in CUNY still do not have a cafeteria, and the buildings are not always collocated. So students have to commute in between classes in order to have food, and when they cannot commute all they have is a vending machine, and we all agree that soda or snacks is not enough to be able to concentrate inside a classroom. And the last thing is going to be textbooks and course materials. We can never stress it enough. We think that these are necessities that all students should have regardless of their status, regardless where they come from, just because they are CUNY students. We are going to reiterate that we

are against any tuition increase, that education is a right, and we are here open to have conversations about how we can facilitate a CUNY for all and a CUNY that provides vital services to all of our students. Thank you. [inaudible] I did not.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Very good. I just want to talk a little bit about food security. So you are, as you said, the sole trustee on the Board for CUNY.

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: In my district, for example, districts throughout the City, council districts throughout the City, we have partnerships with food pantries. For example, we work with some of the local ones, Mashlamont [sic] Community Center, and then we work with some of the bigger ones like Common Pantry and Met Council. That's funded through our food pantry initiative and through discretionary funding. Does CUNY or any of the campuses have similar partnerships for food-- I know it's a little different what you said about cafeterias, but to your knowledge, does CUNY have any partnerships with existing food pantries?

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: Individual campuses do provide and create their own systems of having these partnerships and getting funding for their food pantry.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And you are-- are you concerned that those pantries will be cut?

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: Those pantries may be cut, although we are having great donors and great funding. I'm more so talking about a campus as a whole may have a food pantry, but do all the buildings of this campus have food services, because the pantry needs a central location, but in between classes what are students get in.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And you're saying-- you were saying that each campus should have some sort of cafeteria with fresh food, and--

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: [interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: and not just vending machines.

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: Yes, yes.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And Soda.

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: Not even two weeks ago I have witnessed it and students witness it every day. Cafeteria's- we do have our food pantries that

we're really grateful for, but cafeterias are also important. When we talk about infrastructure, we think it should definitely be included. And they're there, but some of them are closed. And this goes back to the question that you asked about what CUNY has been doing during the pandemic. I had the same question the day we passed the budget proposal, the budget request, and I think it's a very important question, because we feel that a lot of things could have been done when students were not on campus to prepare for their return.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I seem to recall having a diet of Twix and Coca-Cola at times. Not proud of it. So you also mentioned text books and course materials. So CUNY students are supposed to pay a technology fee, is that correct?

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: Yes, we pay a technology--

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: [interposing] And how much is that technology fee.

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: It varies, I believe.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: By campus?

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: I think so. Either by campus or it's six [sic] fee [sic], but we do all pay that technology fee. I'm not sure.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, \$75 dollars?

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: Probably.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay. And is that-- I guess it's in addition to the average of \$1,200 a year for textbooks?

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: Yep.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: To your knowledge-- CUNY in their testimony had spoken about efficiencies, technology efficiencies, the example they gave was Blackboard, rest in peace. It wasn't the best system, I guess. But to your knowledge, does that include upgrades to resources for students? For example, not needing a textbook and providing an e-textbook or providing some sort of online resource to negate the need for students to spend that much or any money at all?

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: Yes, a centralized system where we could find these resources for free would be very useful and would make some IT developments make sense.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: To your knowledge, does that exist, though?

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: We do have-- well, on Blackboard-- on CUNY First when we choose our classes, we do have a thing where we can select zero textbooks cost for a class, but that's not always what we go for, and a lot of the classes when I go for STEM specifically, we do need these textbooks. I rarely heard a student who said I did not have a textbook for that-- I did not need a textbook for that class, except if they are in a special program, because then they're different.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Or for like English, you know, where most old books are public domain.

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I'd hope they would--

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: [interposing] But a lot of the time we kind of have to go out of our way to get these textbooks. I'm talking about a centralized system where that is provided easily to the students.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Right, and I think what we're talking about-- what I would say is sort of you know, small investment centrally so that according to your numbers each students could save some if not all of that \$1,200, and you know, using that buying power of CUNY or using technology to reduce the cost. And you said two in three students do not purchase a required textbook and one in four drop a course.

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: Uh-hm.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: That's terrible. And that survey date, that's from the Bureau of Labor Statistics or that's specific to CUNY?

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: That I have it in the sources back here.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: OF course she has references.

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, so we'll have to look at that. We'll have to look at that separately. But I think that speaks, you know, again to what CUNY is doing to attract and retain students.

SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: And I would also like to add that these are asks that did not start

1 today, and I am a little bothered that we always have
2 to come back and ask for the same things that are
3 supposed to get this university great. It will be
4 amazing if the next student trustee, the next year of
5 USS doesn't have to worry about this because it's a
6 done deal and we can start building from there.

8 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Well that would be
9 wonderful, and thank you for the work that you're
10 doing and the advocacy that you're doing. I think
11 it's very important and hopefully very impactful.
12 Thank you.

13 SALIMATOU DOUMBOUYA: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: On Zoom, we have
15 Sadaya Hoke [sp?], Heather James, Greg Morris, Alex
16 Stein, and Juan Calcutta [sp?]. If Sadaya Hoke is
17 on, we can unmute them. If we inadvertently missed
18 anyone who would like to testify in-person or on
19 Zoom-- if you're in-person please visit the
20 Sergeant's desk to complete a witness slip, and if
21 you're on Zoom, please use the raise hand function in
22 Zoom, but otherwise we've heard from everyone who has
23 signed up to testify today. Seeing no one else, I
24 would like to note that written testimony which will
25 be reviewed in full by committee staff may be

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

submitted to the record up to 72 hours after the
close of this hearing by emailing it to
testimony@council.nyc.gov. And this hearing is
adjourned.

[gavel]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMUNITY ON HIGHER EDUCATION

139

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 21, 2023