CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION

----- X

Wednesday, March 1, 2023

Start: 1:14 p.m. Recess: 2:28 p.m.

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM, CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Shekar Krishnan, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

David M. Carr Eric Dinowitz Robert F. Holden

Rita Joseph Linda Lee

Christopher Marte

Julie Menin

Francisco P. Moya Mercedes Narcisse Lincoln Restler

Rafael Salamanca, Jr.

Sandra Ung

Marjorie Velázquez

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Iris Rodriguez-Rosa
First Deputy Commissioner
NYC Department of Parks and Recreation

Matt Drury
Director of Government Relations
NYC Department of Parks and Recreation

Sherrise Palomino
Director of Advocacy and Programs
New Yorkers For Parks

Maria Garrett
New Yorkers For Parks and
Brooklyn Parks and Open Space Coalition
President, Fresh Creek Civic Association

Tom Gogan Spokesperson Move the Money New York City Campaign SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good afternoon and welcome to today's New York City council hearing for the committee on Parks and Recreation. If you wish to submit testimony, you may at testimony@council.nyc.gov. At this time, please silence all electronic devices. Chair, we are ready to begin.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: Thank you so much. Good afternoon, everyone. And welcome to our hearing today on March 1, 2023, for our Committee on Parks and Recreation, and I'd like to welcome all my colleagues who are here today. We'll begin with my opening statement followed by— if other council members who join, whose bills are being heard today want to make an opening statement, we'll open it up to them as well.

Good afternoon, I'd like to welcome you all to this hearing, which we'll consider four pieces of legislation before the Committee.

At first glance, these bills may seem to be unrelated, but they actually connect on the crucial point of making our park system much more accessible to New Yorkers, to make sure every New Yorker has

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 access to high-quality and well-maintained
3 greenspace.

A couple of these bills relate more to the recreational and environmental benefits of parks, while the others relate to the physical infrastructure within our parks. But as we know, all of these components are interconnected, and matter to our park system, which is an issue as much of public health as it is having access to areas to play, for recreation and for our mental health and well being. For example, Intro 0007, sponsored by Councilmember Ayala, would require the city to make memberships for recreation centers free for young adults between 18 and 24 years old. This would help increase youth participation in rec center activities, especially since young adults would no longer be required to pay the yearly \$25 fee. Recreation centers are one of the major vehicles at the city's disposal towards promoting physical activity and other types of recreation.

Making our recreation centers free and accessible to our youth is also a matter of public safety, as it engages in our youth in activities in our parks that keeps them engaged. Rec centers are open all year

2.2

2.3

round, and during inclement weather or the winter months, they offer consistent opportunities for social interaction and recreation to many New Yorkers who could be otherwise isolated. And this especially matters for our youth. The City should take every reasonable step it can to encourage more participation in physical activity and other types of recreation, making our public spaces far more open, accessible, and free for our communities to be able to engage as a matter of public health, mental

Intro number 213 also sponsored by Councilmember Ayala, would require the Parks Department to conduct a study on the prevalence of community gardens engaged in urban farming and agriculture and to provide recommendations to the Mayor and the Council on how to better support and increase such farming and agriculture.

health, well being, and again public safety.

Community gardens play a crucial role in the life of our city. They help provide needed green space among— in areas that were once lacking, foster a greater sense of community among local residents, provide educational opportunities for our children, and produce and farm numerous kinds of food products

access to healthy food.

2.2

2.3

through urban agricultural practices. This is
especially important in communities of color, where
the fact is having access to fresh, healthy green
food, having more access to agriculture that's
locally grown and produced is a much more difficult
issue, directly creating inequities when it comes to

More support for urban agriculture, community gardens, and farming leads directly to better and healthier food access, which leads to better and healthier communities.

I'd like to see how we as a city can increase support for urban farming and community gardens and make it less burdensome on gardeners to make the best use of the gardens and farms they operate. I think we can agree that there are ways for the city to make urban farming more welcoming and less restrictive for those who seek to farm in a safe and reasonable way, directly producing far better health outcomes and access to fresh and healthy food.

The two remaining bills would help to improve access to public bathrooms, which is an often overlooked but very important aspect of our park services. Intro number 128 sponsored by

Councilmember Salamanca would require that every park bathroom have a safe, sanitary, and convenient diaper changing table. Currently, diaper changing tables are required by Local Law 34 of 2018, which mandated that new or renovated buildings containing places of public accommodation include diaper changing tables that are accessible to everyone, regardless of gender, but it did not apply to parks.

As any parent of young children can attest, and I can certainly do so myself bring my young children, when especially when they were once babies to the parks, having access to changing stations, when visiting a park or playground is something that is sorely lacking on a wide scale. I have personally experienced this problem, I still do with my younger son is still in diapers too, and as much as he refuses to wear them, and I know many parents around our city struggle with the same problem too. It's just a matter of fact that we need to make our parks, our public spaces much more accessible and easier for parents, especially parents of young children.

This bill is a straightforward solution to a problem faced by so many parents who would like to

2.2

2.3

2.2

2.3

spend even more quality time with their children
benefiting from our parks and open spaces.

Lastly, Intro number 576, sponsored by

Councilmember Joseph, would require the Parks

Department in collaboration with any other city

agency that maintains a public bathroom to inspect

and issue a report on each public bathroom every six

months. The report would include information about

the features of each public bathroom, and the

condition and functionality of those features, and

would also be made available on the Open Data Portal,

and a website maintained by the city.

This bill is so crucial because part of making our parks accessible to everyone is to make sure that our public bathrooms are well maintained and cost effective as well. The number of times I've heard from constituents who have gone to parks, as many of my colleagues have had, but to find the bathroom wasn't well-maintained, or it was locked, creates an issue that we need to address as a city. And one of the first ways to do so is to make sure that we are regularly, under Councilmember Joseph's bill, inspecting, reporting and studying data on our public bathrooms.

2.2

2.3

I think this bill couldn't be more timely, especially with the recent news that the Parks

Department will be installing five Portland Loo's prefabricated bathrooms in five parks throughout the city as a pilot project.

This is a promising step towards ensuring that city goers have access to public restrooms, and a bill like Intro 576 is necessary towards giving us the information that's essential to ensure they are well maintained and readily accessible across our city.

From making rec centers free for young New Yorkers, to improving bathrooms for parents and all users, to expanding urban agriculture to more communities, the bills this committee will consider today highlight how we can improve various park features by helping more New Yorkers access all of the benefits of our public parks.

Again, the goal of this committee has been to make sure that every New Yorker, every single community has access to high quality green space. Parks is an issue of social justice and equity.

I look forward to examining these bills in more detail, and I'd like to welcome the administration

COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION

2 and the advocates who have come today to testify.

3 | Thank you very much.

2.2

2.3

I'd also like to read off the names of my colleagues who are here today. Councilmember Holden, Councilmember Moya, Councilmember Dinowitz, Councilmember Marte, Councilmember Menin, Councilmember Narcisse, Councilmember Velázquez, Councilmember Carr, Councilmember Joseph, and Councilmember Salamanca.

And now for opening statements, we'll turn it over to Councilmember Joseph to speak about her legislation today.

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you, Chair. Hello, I'm Councilmember Rita Joseph of the 40th Council District. I'm thrilled today, we are hearing my bill, Intro 576, a local law to require reporting on features and conditions of public bathrooms.

Last year, we had the passage of Intro 258, a bill that required the parks department and DOT to publish a report on feasible locations to install public bathrooms in every zip code across the five boroughs, which marked an important first step towards— towards ensuring all New Yorkers have access to public bathrooms.

2.2

2.3

The city lack of public restrooms is an issue of equity, public health, sanitation, and basic human rights. While other modern cities have taken steps to prioritize public restroom access, New York continues to lag behind.

I want to give a thanks to Borough President Mark
Levine for his partnership on this legislation. He
has been an outspoken champion on this issue for
years. I'm so grateful to work with him and see the
public bathrooms installed, and also my bill get
passed in this committee. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: Thank you so much,

Councilmember Joseph. We've also been joined

virtually by Councilmember Ung. And now I'll turn it

over to Councilmember Salamanca to make an opening

statement about his legislation.

COUNCILMEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you, Mr. Chair, and members of Committee on Parks for allowing me to speak on bill, Intro 128. Intro 128 is a commonsense legislation. Currently thanks to legislation authored by my former colleague Rafael Esplanade in 2018, New York City requires diaper changing stations to be available in all bathrooms in new or recently renovated public buildings where merchandise is sold,

2.2

2.3

class A gathering spaces such as a theater, bowling alley, museums, and class M spaces such as shopping malls. A year later in 2019 the state followed suit and enacted legislation that required changing stations in bathrooms and some use groups across New York state. As a father of a eight-year-old son,

Sorry, my Aiden was four years old at the time. He's eight now.

these laws at the time were long overdue.

Surprisingly, though, the one place I noticed did not require diaper changing stations were in New York City Park bathrooms and comfort stations. Despite being a place where young families spend a great deal of time, the lack of changing stations left parents changing their children's diapers on park benches, park equipment, their laps, or even on the ground, all unsanitary locations.

When I first introduced this bill and October 2019, only about 37% of almost 1500 park bathrooms has sufficient changing stations. Since then, Park has stepped up to double the number of changing stations in city bathrooms, which I commend them for. However, we need legislation that will require we reach 100% fulfillment rate in a timely manner. That

- 2 is why I introduced Intro 128 which will require
- 3 every parks bathroom to have safe and sanitary diaper
- 4 changing accommodations. Without Intro 128 parents
- 5 throughout the city will face another summer of
- 6 changing their children's diapers on the ground or on
- 7 park benches. Thank you, Chair Krishnan for allowing
- 8 me to speak on my bill.
- 9 CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: Thank you so much
- 10 | Councilmember Salamanca. Now I'll turn it over to our
- 11 | Senior Counsel of our committee, Kris Sartori, to
- 12 | swear in today's witnesses.
- 13 COUNSEL SARTORI: Thank you Chair. Kris Sartori
- 14 Committee Counsel. Do you affirm to tell the truth,
- 15 | the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your
- 16 | testimony before this committee and to respond
- 17 | honestly to Councilmember questions?
- 18 | FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: Yes, I
- 19 do.

- 20 I do.
- 21 COUNSEL SARTORI: You may begin.
- 22 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: Thank
- 23 you. Well, good afternoon Chair Christian members of
- 24 the parks committee and other members of the City
- 25 | Council. I am Iris Rodriguez-Rosa, the First Deputy

2.2

2.3

Commissioner of New York City Parks. I am pleased to be joined here today by our Director of Government Relations, Matt Drury. I want to start by noting our appreciation for the council's continued advocacy and support for our city's parks, which leads us up to the topic of today's hearing. The four pieces of legislation being heard today. Intros 007, 128, 213, and 576. I start with Intro 007, that would require the agency to offer free Recreation Center

memberships for young adults ages 18 to 24.

The New York City Parks is so very proud to offer membership to the young adults of 18 to 24 years old in an affordable and extensive network of 36 recreation centers throughout New York City, including the indoor pools, weight rooms, basketball courts, dance studios, art studios, game rooms. Our recreation centers offer a wide range of programs for people of all ages, with a variety of free or low-cost membership options. In September 2021, as we reopened our recreation centers to open to the public following the COVID pandemic closures, we were pleased to introduce free annual membership for New Yorkers ages 18 to 24. Our city's young adults can now enjoy for no cost whatsoever incredible access to

2.2

2.3

the recreational opportunities, social engagement, community interaction, and the healthy lifestyles offered by our recreation centers. We are pleased to report that the response to these new free memberships have been absolutely positive, resulting in an increase in young adult memberships of nearly 30% compared to the pre-COVID enrollment. Since Intro 007 would codify the successful existing policy already in place as established by the agency rules, New York City Parks supports the intent of the bill and has no concerns. And as a former Chief of Recreation, I say that this is something that the population was looking forward to and are very much engaged on.

So we'll now move on to Intro 128 and Intro 576, both of which involve the topic of public restrooms. Intro 128 will require the agency to install a diaper changing station in every restroom located in a city park. New Yorkers rely on access to our parks' restroom facilities for their comfort, convenience, especially families with young children. We recognize that diaper changing stations are a vital amenity for parents looking to keep the little ones happy, healthy, and clean. Which is why we have made

diaper changing stations available in the vast
majority of our parks' restrooms.

In October 2019, our maintenance and operation staff inventoried our parks public restrooms, and determined, of course, that only 37% of the roughly 1300 restrooms, under our care or for changing tables. This was absolutely unacceptable to us, and we began a concerted effort to rectify the situation.

I am pleased to confirm that as of today, more than 700 of our park restrooms offer diaper changing tables. Diaper changing stations are now a standard feature installed in any park restroom that is now being newly built or fully renovated, and we are hoping to install more of these amenities in the remaining park restrooms, where installation is feasible.

Good given that we already seek to install diaper changing stations in park public restrooms wherever possible and have made great strides and expanding their availability in recent years, we support the intent of Intro 128 and would welcome the opportunity to work with the sponsor to incorporate any minor technical edits.

2.2

2.3

2.2

2.3

Now we move on to Intro 576. This would require the agency to inspect all public restrooms located on city property or operated and maintained by a city agency and submit biannual reports on those inspections. The bill further compels the creation of a city website listing all said public restrooms along with the relevant inspection reporting data.

The cleanliness and safety, of course, of our park restrooms is a top priority for New York City

Parks. As New Yorkers we rely on the access of these facilities for their comfort and convenience. The agency deploys thousands of dedicated employees to care for our parks, including our parks' restrooms, and these cleaning and maintenance activities are supervised by an organized and focused team of chiefs, supervisors, and managers.

Close to 1300 restaurants are located in parks throughout the city, by far the most widely accessible public amenity available to all New Yorkers in need of a restroom. We actively monitor and inspect the condition of our park features including park restrooms in several ways. Most notably the Parks Inspection Program, as we know it, it's called PIP. It is detailed, objective, quality-

2 assurance program led by our Operations and

2.2

2.3

Management Planning Division, conducted independently

4 from the agency's maintenance and operation staff.

PIP, as we know it, inspectors report on the cleanliness and safety of the park properties as experienced by the public at that moment, regardless of cleaning schedules or other pending work. City Parks and the restaurants within them receive comprehensive and independent PIP inspections two to three times a year, which is above and beyond the frequent internal assessments led by our parks supervisors, as well as the consistent presence of parks maintenance staff in our parks, who are able to identify and address conditions and concerns in real time.

PIP inspections results are shared with management throughout the agency to review performance and take corrective action. This data is also summarized on our agency website, and the granular data for these various efforts are made publicly available on the city's Open Data Portal.

We appreciate the intent of Intro 576 as New York
City Parks is proud of our efforts to keep our park
public restrooms in the best condition possible. It

2.2

2.3

should be noted that the requirements of the bill, as

currently drafted, are somewhat duplicative as

rigorous inspections and reporting protocols for our

park features and amenities, including park restrooms

7 and parks already makes granular inspections that are

have already been codified by Local Law 67 of 2022,

8 fully available to the public.

Further, the bill as currently drafted would require the agency to take on duties and responsibilities that are maybe outside of the agency's purview. To that end, we would welcome the opportunity to further discuss the broader goals of the legislation with the council.

Lastly, Intro 213 would require the agency to convene a study of parks community gardens in food, farming, and processing. New York City Parks Green Thumb Division is proud to be the nation's largest urban gardening program. It was created in 1978. Our Green Thumb Team sustains over 550 community gardens, 350 of which are on Parks property, and supports thousands of volunteer gardeners throughout New York City. We work closely with the garden groups that care for these spaces on a day-to-day basis, and offer a wide range of resources, training,

2.2

2.3

support, so they can operate the garden in the manner
that best suits their needs.

We very much recognize the issues of food insecurity that face all too many New Yorkers, and our Green Thumb Team works very closely with the Mayor's Office of Food Policy, and the Mayor's Office of Urban Agriculture as many of our community gardeners do grow fruit and vegetables primarily for personal consumption. However, it is important to keep in mind that the majority of our gardens have an extremely small footprint, and the level of food production that takes place is relatively minimal, in the minimal scale.

We appreciate the intents of 213 and we already make a great deal of information about our community gardens publicly available in a variety of fashions.

Much of the information referenced in Intro 213 is either already included in the existing report, such as the annual food policy report compiled by the Mayor's Office of Food Policy, or would be extremely time consuming and labor intensive to obtain from our volunteer gardens. As such, we believe the bill as drafted is somewhat duplicative and would end up diverting finite agency time and resources away from

2 the Green Thumb Division's primary objective: making
3 these community garden spaces the best that they can

4 be. But we would welcome the opportunity to work

5 with the Council to discuss the broader goals in

6 consultation with the Mayor's Office of Food Policy

and the Mayor's Office of Urban Agriculture.

I want to thank you for allowing us the opportunity to discuss these pieces of legislation with you. We'd like to thank the Council for their continued interest and advocacy regarding these topics, as we know how important parks and open spaces are to the constituents in your districts. there are questions regarding any of the legislative bills, we will be happy to answer those at this time. And I just want to say that when it comes to community gardens, we are so interested in what they do. And we have, we have a close relationship with them through the Green Thumb Program. And I'm very proud of the-- for example, the one at Echo Key that I'm sure that some of you may be familiar with, that was almost abandoned, but a nice young group of people took it over to be able to establish it and help it grow. And I was so happy to be part of that,

1

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

We have some that may be closed for various reasons.

2 It could be construction going on, or-- but most of 3 them are definitely open and available to the public.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: And the pandemic forced the closure of rec centers for an extended period of time for public health reasons. What are some of the lessons that the parks department has learned from COVID in terms of how different rec centers were adapted to different uses? What are some of the takeaways that you all are implementing now, given what was faced before?

many of the things that we learned during COVID is to be able to also quickly adapt to the changing situations that may occur. And I'm very proud to say that the recreation division and public programs aspect of it actually was exceedingly creative in the ways that they were able to still try to serve the public. Even though the recreation centers were closed, there was still some outdoor activities that were able to be had, fitness wise, and otherwise for the for the public to be able to enjoy. We did not, you know, shut down service altogether. So we were able to try to make sure that we adapted.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: And-- And so before I continue, I neglected to mention that we've also been joined by Councilmember Restler and Councilmember Lee. I'm sure to get you.

And another question I had was: What is the usual process that the Parks Department goes through when it determines membership fees for rec centers? How have the rates been determined? Has there been consideration to giving discounts to other individuals as well?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: So we have-- we realized that the young people, the ages of 18 to 24, are still struggling and going to school and going to college. So the agency did realize the importance of being able to provide free programming for them to be able to come in, to exercise and be able to engage with the-- with the other public.

We also -- The young people, the youth are totally free. So they -- they come in, and they're able to enjoy after-school programming, recreational sports opportunities, and things of that nature. We also have, I believe, is the senior, you know, the senior rate is very minimal, as well. And I think we

2.2

2.3

are open to being able to look at other ways of being able to provide membership.

MR. DRURY: And I'll just add on a procedural, process, note that the agency, whenever we institute a new discount or a new price structure, it's actually adopted by agency rule, and in accordance with the Citywide Administrative Procedure Act. You know, so it's instituted, there's a public hearing, and it's-- and it's, you know, it's open for public comment and input for a period of time. And then it's formally adopted as an agency rule, and added to the rules of the city of New York. So it's-- it's codified in that in that regard.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: I see. And moving to

Intro number 128, the diaper changing stations, does

DPR have any data on the number of parks bathrooms
that have diaper changing stations?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: Yes, we have. We have over 700 of the of the 1300 comfort stations have diaper changing stations, and we are looking to, of course, continue to— to be able to provide more changing stations as we go along in locations that can allow for it.

2.2

2.3

COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: Mm-hmm. And when new bathrooms are built or renovated through capital projects, does the Parks Department take it upon itself to install diaper changing station as part of the project?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA:

Absolutely. That's absolutely part of every design that has to do with the comfort station, whether it's a new park, or new comfort station, or renovate-- or renovating a comfort station, we definitely include that.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: And we'll go back to bathrooms a bit on the other bill, but just a couple of questions on Intro 128, on community gardening and urban agriculture: What portion of the parks budget, Green Thumb or otherwise, is devoted to promoting or supporting urban agricultural programs and community gardens?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: Well, there is a budget that's already appropriated for the for supporting the-- the Green Thumb Program, which the resources are used, you know, equitably throughout the-- throughout the city to be able to do that. We've provided anywhere from snowblowers to

2.2

2.3

2 other different amenities, to be able to provide for

3 | them, to be able to-- and material. We've provided

4 some-- some soil and and lumber for them to be able

5 to continue to enhance their gardens.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: Do you know roughly what percentage of the budget is towards the-- the Green Thumb Program by the way?

MR. DRURY: So the Green Thumb budget isn't structured in a way that that is dedicated towards specific uses that the gardens may or may not have. It's a broader sort of support network, where we have outreach coordinators, like dedicated staff, maintenance and operation staff that are dedicated, that help assist, you know, the garden groups that are managing the spaces. So the budget isn't structured in quite that manner. You know, a good majority of the gardens, do, you know, grow some fruit or vegetables for sure. But the-- And we support those efforts in a variety of-- in terms of best practices, and advisement, and supplies, as the Commissioner noted, but the budget per se isn't exactly dedicated in that regard.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: Okay. And what can gardens do -- and we've gotten this question, since

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

this hearing was publicly noticed, too -- but what

can gardens do with the food they farm? Can they

sell them to the community? What are things they can

5 do with the food that they grow?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: Well, the garden is -- because it is such a -- you know, the footprint is a small footprint. It's not so-- it's only so much that they can grow. So they are able to utilize it for their members, and the garden members, and be able to do that. They are able to sell it if they wish to sell it. And they're able to even go to a farmers market if they can. It's a small-- you know, it's a small amount of produce, but they, you know, they it's-- it's very open ended as to what they can do with it. So -- And we welcome it. There's about, I would say about 80% of the garden groups try to do some sort of produce developing and the others may be more flowering, but yes. So they could sell them as produce, or go to farmers markets and sell them there too.

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: Yes. Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: And then moving to Intro 576 on public bathrooms, just a couple questions.

process for our parks.

2.2

2.3

Let's just-- Taking a step back. There's obviously been reporting recently around the Portland Loos, the pilot project that you all are trying across the five boroughs. I think you've heard a lot from you know, this committee, myself included too also about just how expensive, before this pilot parks bathrooms can be as part of the overall capital construction

So I know this is being done as a way to-- to pilot new and different techniques. Can you talk a little bit about what led to this decision to-- the decision to go with the contractor that's installing these loos? And what is-- what is the objective here of-- of experimenting with these different bathrooms?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: So The Parks Department is always looking for ways to be able to provide the amenities that they so sorely may need. So we look for creative ways to be able to do that. So throughout— The research that the capital division has done, was able to identify this particular Portland Loo, this particular restroom that could possibly retrofit, and fit in some of these locations that don't currently have bathrooms. And we will definitely be able to inspect them as we

- 2 inspect any of the other comfort stations to make
- 3 | sure that they are properly maintained to do that.
- 4 The cost associated with-- with the bathrooms, and we
- 5 have five locations throughout the city as pilot
- 6 projects to see how they work out, and hopefully they
- 7 | will work out for the best.
- 8 CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: And what-- You know, one
- 9 of the biggest things that came out also was just the
- 10 cost associated with the installation of the
- 11 | bathrooms. It's still, I think, in total \$5 million,
- 12 or around there. And obviously the part of the aim
- 13 here is to is to reduce the cost. So where-- where
- 14 | is this expense coming from? Why is it still so
- 15 expensive, even with this pilot, to-- when it comes
- 16 | to installation?
- 17 | FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: So we-
- 18 | That's a good question, Councilmember. So what it
- 19 | is, is that, when you're putting a pilot project like
- 20 | this together, and you're doing something, we also
- 21 want to make sure because the cost does not include--
- 22 | is not only just the unit itself, but it's also the
- 23 utilities that have to be run to be able to do that,
- 24 | the-- the sewer system and the water flow to be able

2.2

2.3

2 to make sure that-- so that's where the costs
3 associated as such to be able to do that.

MR. DRURY: Also, I'd be remiss if I didn't point out that the \$5 million is for five sites, you know, just to be clear. So that number, obviously, has gotten a lot of attention. But I think there's been some confusion about, but to clarify, this will provide for five new parks get— that currently lack bathrooms, that will— that will that will have them.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: And what's the timeline for their implementation? And also, if— if users have feedback about it, for example, if the bathrooms seem too small for them, are there other features that are missing, what— what's the timeline? What's the best way for— for New Yorkers to submit feedback about how these bathrooms are working, given that it's a pilot project?

MR. DRURY: Yeah, the project is currently in design. So this is, you know, essentially, as the Commissioner noted, this is essentially a capital project. Just-- You know, it will regard you know, legitimate, significant construction, et cetera, groundwork, etc. So it isn't designed now, and then will head into procurement. So I think, you know, we

- 2 | are still looking at, you know, a few years before
- 3 | these are, you know, installed and fully constructed.
- 4 And then from there, there will clearly be a
- 5 monitoring, you know, process where, you know, we
- 6 will obviously, as, as the Commissioner noted, be
- 7 | inspecting and engaging with the public that are--
- 8 | that are using it. And I think there'll be, you
- 9 know, we are considering this a pilot, so we're open
- 10 to any and all creative approaches, and, you know,
- 11 and see what works and what doesn't, and I think
- 12 | that'll be sort of an organic and dynamic process.
- 13 CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: And so does parks have a
- 14 | way -- if not, I would urge you all to consider it to
- 15 -- to solicit feedback about the bathrooms and how
- 16 | they'll be used?
- MR. DRURY: I should mention, sorry, really
- 18 | quickly, that the projects like our other capital
- 19 projects are going through, you know, Community Board
- 20 review, like we presented -- we will -- we are
- 21 presenting to the local Committee Boards and to the
- 22 | Public Design Commission. You're right. So it is
- 23 going through sort of a robust and engaged, you know,
- 24 process, and then afterwards, you know, I think the
- 25 agency is consistently engaged with our local park

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 partners, and then the people that use our parks

3 | every day, and I think there'll be a robust effort to

4 make sure we're gathering that feedback. We're

5 keenly, obviously, focused on-- on tracking this,

6 this-- this this pilot, so I think we're-- the agency

7 is going to be pretty paying close attention.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: Okay, well, we'll keep a close eye on it too. And let's keep in close touch about it as well. And of course, you know, more generally too, anything we can do to to keep exploring ways to reduce the costs of installation of bathrooms in our parks, with overall parks construction, I think is a vital part of the process here. And so we would really, you know, urge you all to-- to look at ways to continue making the capital construction process, not just for parks, but for bathrooms too, much more cost efficient and on a more condensed timeline too.

My final question before I turn it over to colleagues is just: Is there any data that indicates how many bathrooms are ADA compliant and which ones need to be repaired to make them ADA compliant?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: We will have-- So-- So, we want to make sure that what

- 2 happens is that any-- Of course, any new
- 3 conversation that comes online has to be ADA
- 4 compliant and wherever possible, we try to see if
- 5 there-- if the current bathroom is able to easily be
- able to be adapted to be able to make a ramp or
- 7 | something available. But we also have to take into
- 8 consideration the stalls, you know, to make sure that
- 9 | they're ADA compliant.
- 10 So wherever possible that we have the opportunity
- 11 | to do that, we try to be able to make things
- 12 adaptable.

- 13 CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: Thank you very much. Now
- 14 | I'll turn it over to our colleagues on the committee
- 15 who have questions, starting with Councilmember
- 16 Holden.
- 17 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chair. And
- 18 | nice to see you, Commissioner and Matt. Thank you so
- 19 | much for your testimony. We're all on the same team.
- 20 And we all want our great parks, and I'm very proud
- 21 of my parks. I do have issues though with capital,
- 22 and you know that. You knew this was coming. So I
- 23 have a 24 by 36, I guess a park house we call them.
- And we're going to renovate two bathrooms, we're
- 25 going to brick point the building. And originally I

2.2

2.3

asked the Queens Parks Commissioner docket for a price and I got six-point-whatever-four, \$6.4 million for two bathrooms. I balked. I, I just went kind of crazy. Because I said, that's ridiculous. I could build a beautiful mansion for that. And we-- You know, this is the same thing I've said over and over again. So I got him to relook at it, you know, look at it again. And he said, "Oh, we made a mistake. It's \$3.7 million," which almost was cut in half. But still, it was outrageous to me that a building. And I guess the building dates to the early part of Juniper Valley Park, which is probably 1940.

So I'm wondering, I mean, I asked the contractor to look at, an independent contractor. He said I could do this for \$100,000. And I know that that's ridiculous. Because I said, "Well, you probably not looking at all the things that have to be done." But he said, "This is absurd that the city of New York would pay \$3.7 million to essentially renovate two bathrooms." The men's room has two stalls, two toilet stalls, and two urinals and a sink. Right now we have stainless steel, which is horrendous in there. And it's a-- it's a mess right now. And I want to-- I put the money toward it. I just-- I'm

2.2

2.3

renovating— renovating other parks, and I can't put it. The community wants a restroom and I can't do it, because the cost is just so ridiculous. And I, you know, I desperately want to know if we can go to— you know, I know the answer. I've asked this a number, but design build might be the answer. And if Parks can really tell us what they're doing to try to get that. But also, how do we— I mean, do we look at the cost of just demolishing the building? I mean, you could just start again and probably might—might save some money. Because I just can't imagine a building a of 24 by 36 with a men's room and a

And I could build probably legitimately three bathrooms for that if you went to private industry or-- but can you talk about design built? Can-- Is there a chance?

women's room, and not huge, costing that much.

MR. DRURY: So I'm happy-- Well, firstly-- First and foremost, I just want to clarify, you know, we understand that you know that construction in New York City is exceedingly expensive. Obviously, you know, the city's processes. The administration is going through a really dedicated effort to take a look at the capital process and bringing those costs

down, making it more time and cost effective. 2 3 You know, to the contractor that you -- you know, I 4 would strongly encourage them to get involved if they can, you know, because we you know, we put these 5 projects out to bid, and if he'll come in for 6 7 \$100,000, that's music to our ears. So, right? Like 8 these-- these costs are aren't set by the agency. This is -- You know, these estimates that we're providing are our best guess at the at the bids we've 10 11 been receiving, you know, just to be clear. So, you

know, if you if you can encourage that contractor to

get involved in terms of doing business with the

city, that sounds -- that sounds fantastic.

But more to the point, I'm happy to announce that design build authority has been granted by the State for the city to execute. It is— it is a specific universe of projects that are eligible. But I can—I can highlight that we're now currently working with DDC to— on a what you might call a bundling project for our comfort stations, where we're going to be taking a look at multiple projects advancing through the design build process, which we think will result in significant time and cost savings.

1

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

2.2

2.3

COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, I mean, because I have so many— I just have so much capital to do and then I have so much to do—— like, people want pickleball courts now. That's a big thing. And I want to fund that, but I have this bathroom, that's a restroom, that's ridiculous.

If you could look at a cost of demolition and just rebuilding it. It's not a great building. I mean, it's just a very plain structure. But when I get an estimate of \$2.4 million for demolition, plus repairing the roof, and brick pointing essentially, of \$2.4 million it seems way, way out of line. Like I said, for \$2.4, you could probably put up a new building, rather than renovate this. This—Achitecturally, it's a box.

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA:

Councilmember, the park is which one? The park that
you're referring to, that you were interested in?

COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Is there a parks-- Again, the design, I'm not-- I'm not looking for an Elmhurst Park spaceship that we have. It's a very-- it's interesting architecturally, but there's a lot of wasted space in there. I'm not-- I'm just looking for a functional-- You know, and it could be a little

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 more interesting looking. Because there's nothing
3 unique about this design. I think we could get into

something a little bit nicer and more friendly.

But we all take pride in our parks. But I have baseball fields to renovate. I have, you know, some innovative ideas, because I do come from a baseball area, and I do-- I have maintained baseball fields. I have some ideas, but I keep getting ridiculous costs. One-- one baseball field \$11 million, when St. John's University can do it for \$1.2 million. So that -- these are the things that I-- I've spoken to Parks, but I never seem to get anywhere. I never-- I can't get any satisfaction of why this is costing so much, other than maybe our contract, we don't have enough, whatever it is, we have a limited amount and we take we take too long to pay. I don't know what it is. But I think we need some creative approaches. And I'm certainly willing to work with Parks. I'm getting to a point where it takes so long to bill, that I'll be long gone before I see this to fruition. But we need -- we kind of need answers. Like, I went through the first administration, or you know, we went through four years, and Raphael was involved, Salamanca was involved, and we're trying--

10 want to have some kind of realistic timetable and

realistic price. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

12 Sorry.

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: Thank you so much,

Councilmember Holden. Now we have Councilmember

Salamanca followed by Councilmember Joseph.

COUNCILMEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you, Mr. Chair. It's great seeing you, Commissioner.

I just very quickly have a few questions on your- your statement here. You did mention that you are
supportive of the bill 128. However, there are some
minor technical edits. Can we just speak on what
those edits would be?

MR. DRURY: Yeah, I'm happy to address. Yeah, we-- we'd love to work with you and your team regarding that the way the bill is structured, we

2.2

2.3

just want to make sure that there is, you know, we're obviously— there are obviously various ways to do this. We want to make sure that the bill reflects—there is a just a practical reality that, you know, some of our comfort stations are decades old, as Councilmember Holden noted, and literally aren't configured in such a manner that can act— that can

physically host a diaper changing station.

Thankfully, it's a pretty small percentage of the-- of the universe, thankfully, but we do want to ask, sort of what we might call sort of administrative adjustments to the language to kind of allow for, you know, conditions of that, some degree of flexibility to make sure that we don't run afoul of the intent of the law.

COUNCILMEMBER SALAMANCA: What is the cost, the general cost for installing a diaper change station in a Parks bathroom?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: I think each-- each one is approximately \$400 to be able to put a diaper changing station.

COUNCILMEMBER SALAMANCA: It's not-- not too expensive.

COUNCILMEMBER SALAMANCA: And how many comfort stations does Parks Department have under their jurisdiction?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: We have 1300--

COUNCILMEMBER SALAMANCA: 1300?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: About 1300 comfort stations, and we have about— about 700 of them are right now retrofitted with some diaper changing stations as it is. So that represents about 70% of the locations, and we are continuing to do—to do more.

and quality of life issues seem to be an issue in some of my parks, especially— and you— you're familiar with this Bill Rainey Park, Starlight Park?

And I know that there are issues, and especially in some of these parks, most of the illegal activities that seem to occur, seem to happen around the comfort stations. And there has been— they— I have spoken to many parks employees that work there.

And there is fear that there may be some illegal

activities happening in these bathrooms.

2.2

2.3

occur in these comfort stations?

Is there a fear that these comfort stations may

promote some-- some type of illegal activities that

I know that there's issues with prostitution in some of my parks.

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: So,
Councilmember, that's a good question. And thank you
so very much. And, as you may be aware, there are
many times that, you know, we are confronted with
locations and situations that they may occur. And as
a public facility, you know, there's always
situations that occur there. And we try as best as
we can, to try to have presence around these comfort
stations. So that way to try to minimize any kind of
illegal activity that go on. We also work with, you
know, the park enforcement. And we also thank you
very much for being so very attentive to that, in
terms of trying to have park enforcement around.

But we try to do the best we can to try to minimize by having as much presence as we can to clean these-- these comfort stations. And as we do that, you know, people come out of the comfort stations and...

2.2

2 COUNCILMEMBER SALAMANCA: All right. I just have 3 one more question, if I may, on the gardens.

I'm a big fan of our community gardens, and I give them funding, you know, through our parks initiatives. Something that I did in this last budget was irrigation systems. I gave two of my parks funding for— to install— so that they can actually have water inside their gardens.

Is— Is this something that Parks Department—
And so I am working with Green Thumb on getting— on getting them installed. My understanding it is going to happen by May. Irrigation systems is something that's necessary. And something that I saw, at least in the Wishing Well Garden is, in order for them to get water, they needed to run a hose across the street from the garden so that they can get water inside. And I know that they worked with DEP and they have these— these, I don't know what you call them, these gallons of water to try to retain water. But that really doesn't work much. Well, at least in that— in that particular garden.

Is Parks Department moving-- Do you know if Parks Department in the future is moving forward on

2.2

2.3

1

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 installing irrigation systems for some of these 3 gardens?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: So this is something that we will work with the Green Thumb Garden Program to try to make sure, to see wherever possible, whenever there's a renovation of a garden and things like that, that is one of the features that we tried to make sure that it's included in that, as such. For example, the Garden at Echo Key up in the Bronx, we tried to make sure when it was renovated to try to make sure that we had some sort of water source to make it easier and more convenient. Many of these gardens have seniors that are the ones that are operating them. So we're-- we clearly understand the importance of it.

COUNCILMEMBER SALAMANCA: All right. Thank you. Thank you, Commissioner. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: Thank you, Councilmember Salamanca. Next, we have Councilman Joseph followed by Councilmember Narcisse.

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you. How are you? Hope you're well. I have a quick question for you. In your statement over here, you said, "Have already been called on codified by Law 67 of 2022." You said

- 2 this law was a duplicate. When I looked it up myself
- 3 while we were sitting here, Law 67 requires, in
- 4 relation to reporting on Parks and playground
- 5 inspections conducted by Department of Parks, while
- 6 Intro 576 will require reporting on features and
- 7 conditions of public bathrooms. I believe those are
- 8 | two different things. So please tell me the
- 9 difference because you said they were duplicates.
- 10 And when I read it again, I'm sitting right here and
- 11 I was like puzzled. I pulled it up. Law 67 and 0576
- 12 | are two different.

- MR. DRURY: Yeah, sure. I'm happy to speak to
- 14 | that, Councilmember. And, again, we--
- 15 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Can you put up your mic.
- 16 | Can you speak up? Because I can't hear you.
- MR. DRURY: Yes, of course. Thank you.
- 18 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you. Yes, it's
- 19 \parallel duplicative in the sense that the that the local law
- 20 | that exists compels those inspections of parks and
- 21 park features, and comfort stations. The parks--
- 22 | You know, the-- the restaurants that are under our
- 23 jurisdiction and management are one or one of those
- 24 structural features. So in essence, the existing
- 25 | local law, I think, we believe, sort of encompasses

2 many of the points made in the-- in the legisla-- in the proposed legislation.

2.2

2.3

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: So playgrounds and bathrooms, so maybe-- maybe they need to modify Law 67 Because it doesn't state public bathrooms. It says playgrounds. It says playgrounds and recreation centers. I don't see bathrooms or-- in there.

MR. DRURY: I'll double check the way the bill--but I believe it mentions structural and related because.

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Do you want me to pull it up, because I can pull it up right now, and we can read it, because I just finished reading it and I didn't see that in there.

MR. DRURY: Okay, well, we're happy to meet with you and take a closer look. I mean, again, just to be very clear, we-- we very much appreciate you know, we are dedicated to keeping our-- our bathrooms.

We're proud of our bathrooms. We are the largest source of access to these. We understand there's always going to be a clamor for more, and, you know, we are a big part of that access and looking to expand that. And we, you know, we make all that information publicly available in terms of those

COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION

2.2

2.3

inspections that are taking place we. So we appreciate the-- the intent of the bill and want to work closely with you on that.

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Absolutely.

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA:

Councilmember Joseph, thank you so very much for that question. And it's important. One of the things that that we look at very closely is also the amenities that are available in these comfort stations, you know, to make sure that there's, you know, bathroom tissue, that there is soap, and that these kinds of amenities are provided within these—these comfort stations as well. But thank you for bringing that to our attention, Councilmember. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Absolutely. I know earlier, you mentioned how many-- you have 1300 public bathrooms, currently have working bathrooms. How many bathrooms you have that are not working out of the 1300?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: The number fluctuates from time to time, because we do receive-- and I say constantly-- depending on the situation, and we try to remedy the situation. For

it right away to take care of it.

2.2

2.3

example, sometimes these comfort stations, because of
plumbing issues, and plumbing issues can be anything
that they-- there's, you know, it's clogged or
something of that nature. And then we try to rectify
that as soon as possible to make sure that the
bathroom is available for the public. So we get on

I do not have a number right now in terms of how many are actually closed but we will get back to you.

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Get back to me. Okay, wonderful. Well, how long does it take to fix those issues? What are the timelines?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: It depends. It depends on the type of issue. We try to send the plumber out, for example, if it's a clogged issue that's happening, or syringes that are found in the bathroom, so we try to send the plumbers out right away. As soon as the supervisor recognizes that, we have trades that are— that come out to take care of it.

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Okay, what is the monetary and time cost to retrofit existing bathrooms to make them more usable? Adding-- You said that already, adding the baby changing stations, suitable

2.2

2.3

2 lightnings, accessibilities like railings and
3 wheelchair ramps?

MR. DRURY: So-- yeah. So the cost of sort of what you might call targeted repairs can-- can vary widely. Some if it's a-- if it's a sort of minor issue, you know, replacing a single fixture. That, you know, that can cost hundreds of dollars or something along those lines. We also engage in full-scale, you know, renovations or reconstructions of comfort stations. And as some of your colleagues have noted, you know, construction in New York City is very expensive, admittedly. And so we have seen comfort-- bids for projects to reconstruct comfort stations coming in at several million dollars.

So the-- depending on the work being done, it can it can range fairly widely.

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: How about if we were adding railings and wheelchair ramps to make it ADA compatible?

MR. DRURY: Yeah. During any reconstruction, we certainly make sure that accessibility is, you know, is a core feature of that. The actual cost of the individual elements, I-- we would have to double check with our capital team.

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: So you'll be getting back to me again.

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: Oh, absolutely, Councilmember.

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: No problem. How many public restrooms in parks are open year round? And how many are closed for certain periods of time?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: We always try to have all the comfort stations, as long as they are in repair, that they're good in good order, have them open year round, regardless of the weather and the season. There are different hours, depending on daylight hours, availability of daylight hours. So we do change the times that we may close the bathrooms if it's you know, depending on the season.

MR. DRURY: There are-- There's a small number of stations that also-- that are winterized. But it's a very-- it's a very small number.

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Okay, so it's there's-there is a small number correct, depending on the time.

MR. DRURY: Correct.

2.2

2.3

2.2

2.3

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Okay. Um, are there any plans to increase the number of parks bathrooms that are open year round? Is that something you're looking into?

MR. DRURY: Sorry, say again?

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: The park bathrooms. Are any plans to increase the number of parks bathrooms that are open year round? You said some of them are close sometimes. Is that going to change?

MR. DRURY: Right. The ones that are winterized are just, from technical perspective are actually because they usually lack the heating systems. But—but if and when there's the opportunity to reconstruct and build in some of those, you know, increased utilities, you know, obviously increased access is—is always something we strive for, for sure.

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: For example, my park is

Prospect Park. Sometimes we have flooding. So

during-- Does the Department check how often

bathrooms are shut down due to flooding storms?

What's the usual timetable to get back online?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: Well, if the particular comfort station is-- a flooding

situation that's going on, of course we-- we send our trades and the plumbers to be able to go out there, depending on the severity of the situation, if it's something that can be, you know, can be done with the plumber. If it's more severe situation, then we may need to be able to get some more equipment to be able to take care of it. So it also depends on the

condition in the situation that happens.

- COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Okay, and I know sometimes—— I'm sorry, Chair. I know sometimes sanitation is the reason why most New Yorkers do not use parks. What is the—— parks bathrooms. What is the department doing to address this?
- FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: Can--Can you repeat the question, Councilmember?
- COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Cleanliness is usually the issue-- reason why folks do not use public restrooms. But I must shout out mine, the one on Parade Grounds in Brooklyn that-- the young lady that takes care of my bathroom in Parade Grounds. Shout out to her. My bathroom is amazing.
- FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA:

 Terrific. That is -- That is so good to hear that.

2.2

2.3

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: She takes pride in keeping that bathroom so clean.

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA:

Absolutely. And that is the reason why we try to, as best we can, to try to have, when we do the inspection program, we're very cognizant of the utilization of those bathrooms.

It doesn't matter where the bathrooms may be, in what park that may be, but we're very conscientious about the cleanliness and the maintenance of the bathroom. So we have-- you know, we take care of the amenities. And if there's something that's happening that they noted by the-- by the park worker, they are supposed to let the supervisor know right away so we can take care of it right away.

COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Wonderful. So my last question is: What's the status on the report listing suitable locations for public bathrooms across the city? That was the bill I have currently.

MR. DRURY: Yeah. We'll have to check. My understanding is The Mayor's Office and Parks is going to work, obviously, with DOT and other entities. So I will have to check on the team

2.2

2.3

2.2

2.3

questions at the Education hearings. So this is vice versa. This is your chance.

I just had one more follow up question before turning it over to Councilmember Narcisse. Just on Councilmember Joseph's point, similarly. So do Park bathrooms generally open and close with the opening and closing hours of the park where it's located, or it's different operating hours?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: The hours are different. The hours are different.

Usually some of the-- most of the parks are closed by about 9:00 or 10:00 at night, depending if it's a large-- large park, it's 1:00 in the morning. But the hours-- in the winter hours we close earlier. We close at around for 4:00. And in the-- in the winter, we close at about 7:00 or 8:00 at night. I mean, in the summer. i'm sorry. In the summer, we close it about 7:00 or 8:00 at night, because that's, you know, in terms of daylight hours.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: Mm-hmm. Got it. Okay Thank you. Councilmember Narcisse.

COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: I think most of my question that I was writing now, is already asked. But first I want to commend all my colleagues for

- 2 | these bills that they are putting for-- I mean, in
- 3 | the forefront, because that will actually make our
- 4 | bathroom parks more accessible, and more-- I mean,
- 5 | friendlier and more welcoming for all New Yorkers.
- 6 And thank you, Commissioner for being here and
- 7 answering those questions. Thank you Chair.
- 8 One other thing. I have to shout out for two
- 9 | beautiful parks that I have. I have Canarsie park
- 10 and I have Marine Park. Beautiful parks. So thank
- 11 you for the work. But we still have some other
- 12 | things that we need to do. Additionally, we're going
- 13 | to have a new bathroom actually in Canarsie Park.
- 14 And I say thank God for it. And thank you for my
- 15 | predecessor that started putting money in there, and
- 16 for me to finish.
- 17 My-- Is the rate that is coming back now with
- 18 | COVID, are people using the bathroom more often now?
- 19 | FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: Yes.
- 20 No, absolutely. I mean, we-- we never really-- I
- 21 | mean, there was just a period of time during COVID.
- 22 But we have all the bathrooms open as long as
- 23 they're, you know, in good condition. We definitely
- 24 make sure that they're open to the public. We--

2 That's a public amenity that we're totally

2.2

2.3

3 responsible for and committed to.

my-- the Chair ask a question how-- or I mean, what the timing for the park-- for the bathroom in the parks. From my understanding, they're not closed at the same time, like from-- For example, let me ask you the question: How often are they open? What's the hours like? Are they open seven days a week?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: Yes, the bathrooms are open seven days a week. And during the winter, they're open till about 4:00. And then in the summer, they're open till about 8:00.

COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: You know what bothers me a lot, is just when they have activity on Saturdays in the park. And there is no more Park workers. The bathrooms are closed. So how are people supposed to be-- continue using the park while there is no bathroom?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: Well, if there's a program, or a specific program that's going on. For example, if there's a you know, there's a ballfield or something that's going on, and they have permits, that's something to be able to

make sure that the operations team knows about it,

and they're aware of it to maybe keep the bathroom

possibly open a little bit longer. But that is

5 something to the discretion of the borough to be able

6 to do that.

2.2

2.3

COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Okay. We talk about the bathrooms, how many bathroom we have in the parks, but I want to find out how often that you assess the equipment, besides the bathroom. How-- how often that you assess the equipment within the parks use?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: So we try to get to the park that— We have the parks inspection program, which we're very, very proud of, which is a separate division from the Operations Division, to try to maintain the integrity of the inspection. And we try to inspect the park, a particular park, anywhere from two to three times a year.

COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Two to three times a year. Right now I have in Marine Park, we have a bridge that is accident prone to happen very soon.

And I'm very concerned about how often-- If they assess this bridge, when I went to assess it from the naked eye. I'm not an engineer or anything that-- in

2.2

2.3

2 terms of bridges, but you can see that is about to
3 collapse. So who's inspecting them?

MR. DRURY: Just for a little clarity, we might need to get-- in terms of the precise. Is it a pedestrian bridge? Or is it is a--

COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: It's an over-the-water bridge that's in marine park by the marshland.

MR. DRURY: But in general, there's-- there certainly is structural elements like that, that are within a park.

COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: The structure. You can obviously see the structure.

MR. DRURY: Those are very much included in the parks inspection program that the commissioner referenced. And if there is an amenity or a feature that's— that you see falling into disrepair, you know, that could be obviously a lot of these things, you know, get to see real heavy use, and a lot of visitations. So that is overtime that— that can certainly take place. But uh, I guess we'll have to check with our team and double check on if they're aware of that project. If not, we'd love to work with you and make sure we're— everyone gets brought up to speed on that specific structure.

4

1

2

6

7

8

10

11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Since most of my questions were answered, I'm going to ask you the last one. For ADA compliance, I'm looking at the parks bathrooms. Some of them are very tight in use. So in your mind right now, from the data that you have, how many actually, practically are going to be, can be a ADA compliant?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: have to look at -- We try wherever it's possible, whenever there's a renovation or reconstruction of-of a comfort station, that is definitely part of the you know, part of the-- the construction is to make sure that it's ADA compliant. If there's anything possible within the constraints of what we have of our resources, because again, we have to look at the footprint of what's available to be able to do to make it compliant, because sometimes the stalls may not allow for it at the current -- or the footprint may not allow for the -- for the turn on it.

So we have to look at-- We're looking at that. And that is something that is exceedingly important to us, to try to be able to accommodate wherever possible.

2.2

2.3

COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Chair, give me an extension. In terms of rats in our parks, some of the parks, I have witnessed, and I have video. So how are we doing with the rats in-- in our park? In our parks, I should say?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: So the parks department is very much involved. We have, you know, the City of New York is very much, as you may be you may be aware that in terms of the rat population in New York City, it's something that—that I know this administration is taking very, very seriously. And they have—they have a task force that that is working on the dealing with the situations not only in the parks, but also in particular neighborhoods that the rat condition exists.

So we have exterminators in the Parks Department that are trained individuals that go out and do-- you know, they see the burrows in our parks, and they deal with those situations accordingly.

COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: I have a big problem in Canarsie Park.

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: In Canarsie Park?

COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: I have witnessed them.

And the children were playing. And I think is a disgrace in how we do business. I'm not saying my park is dirty or anything. But obviously there was rats running around. So if you could help with our New York City, not only Canarsie Park, where they have rats running around like this, it is not appropriate for children to be running with rats.

 $\label{thm:commissioner} \mbox{ FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: } \mbox{ Thank} \\ \mbox{ you. }$

COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: And especially in the areas that need it the most, the underserved community. We don't want to have any underserved communities anymore, when it comes to our parks, when it comes to our public, you know, services that we are having. Throughout New York City, we have to strike a balance and make sure that it's better. So children should not be running in the park with—with rats.

So I'm going to leave it as that. Thank you, Chair. You know, we love Park, and we appreciate you. Thank you.

2.2

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: That's right. Thank you so much, Councilmember Narcisse. That, I think, concludes the questions from our Committee.

And so I want to thank you all so much for your testimony today. And thank you for all your work with us around the park system and making it-- making sure every New Yorker has access to green space.

And we've got a lot of work to do there. But I appreciate the commitment from you all to-- to make that a reality. So thank you all so much.

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ-ROSA: Thank you. Thank you, Chair Krishnan, and thank you members of the Parks Committee of the City Council. Thank you so very much for the opportunity. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: Thanks for your testimony.

And now we'll turn it over to our public testimony.

We've got a few witnesses virtual, and so we'll begin with Sherrise Palomino from New Yorkers For Parks.

MS. PALOMINO: Good afternoon. My name is

Sherrise Palomino, and I'm Director of Advocacy and

Programs at New Yorkers For Parks. We are a founding

member of the Playfair Coalition, which includes over

400 organizations from across the five boroughs.

2.2

2.3

Thank you to the parks committee for the opportunity to speak about our city's need for 1% for parks.

I also want to thank Chair Krishnan, for his leadership on this important issue.

The bills before the committee supports equitable access for young people at recreational centers that provide much needed opportunities for youth development, increased critical work for community gardens that provide urban farming and so much more.

Community gardens play a crucial role in communities of color by providing fresh and healthy foods, especially in the South Bronx and other food deserts.

Supporting an increasing urban farming has significant public health impacts. We must invest in New York City Parks' Green Thumb Program and expand urban agriculture to make these programs accessible to all New Yorkers in equitable ways.

Increasing the New York City Parks department's budget to 1% of Parks can do this. With a well-funded parks department, our parks and recreation centers can be properly maintained. Allocating 1% of the city's operating budget to New York City parks

2.2

2.3

much more.

would generate cleaner and safer parks, comprehensive access to the city's 10,000 acres of natural areas and trails, protect vulnerable wetlands susceptible to changing climate, free access to programs and recreation centers for New York City children, and so

We are overdue for transformative investment in our park system. 1% of the city budget for parks could ensure that recreation centers are fully staffed and functioning to provide the programming that young people need.

The New York City Parks Department does a valiant job and maintaining these aging resources, but needs more funding to do so. This is one of the many reasons why New Yorkers for parks and the Playfair coalition are calling for an increase in the parks budget to 1, A call the majority of the city council members support along with Mayor Adams. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: Thank you so much

Sherrise, and thank you for the great work that New

Yorkers For Parks does every single day to fight

tirelessly for our parks system, and a budget that

truly reflects the values of our parks in New York

City.

COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Next, we have virtual, Maria Garrett.

MS. GARRETT: Good afternoon. Thank you for having me today. I also work with a New Yorkers For Parks to make sure that we get the funding that we need for the parks. I'm also part of BPOSC. the Brooklyn Parks and Open Space Coalition. live in Canarsi. Good afternoon, Councilmember Narcisse. I also am the President of the Fresh Creek Civic Association here in Canarsie. And I also have cleanups over at the nature preserve. I do that at least once or twice in a year. I also have an interest in the urban gardens. I'm so glad that there was a bill addressed to urban gardening. That's very important, especially to the Canarsie area, because we do have Parklands and we do have one garden that we have in Canarsie over by Canarsie Park on Schenck. That garden, I helped them to formulate that -- that garden, community garden.

And there are other places in Canarsie that the residents have been looking at, that they're interested in opening up more gardens and also teaching the children in the school system how to do gardening and grow their own vegetables and fruits.

And I think that's a very good way to encourage

- healthy eating in our communities. And I would look 2 forward to that program being passed, and also making 3 4 sure that the parks have open-- open comfort stations, because I frequent that park often. Often I frequent Canarsie Park, because over there, I run 6 7 along the path. And like the Councilmember said, 8 Narcisse, there are rats. There is a lot of rats over there in the park, and I see them when I'm out there. So I encourage the council to go for that 1% 10 11 increase because it's very important that we have our 12 parks open, and that they're maintained so that--13 that the community could frequent those parks and be 14 safe in doing so. Thank you so much for your time. 15 CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: Thank you so much, Ms. 16 Garrett, and thank you for your passion and 17 dedication to our parks from-- in Brooklyn to across
 - That is our virtual testimony. And so now we're going to move to our in-person testimony where we have Thomas Gogan.
 - MR. GOGAN: Good afternoon Chair Krishnan,
 Councilmember Holden, and all the other
 councilmembers who were here during the hearing.

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

the city too.

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

I'm Tom Gogan. One of the spokespeople with the Move the Money New York City campaign. I'm a parks user, a regular parks user, a walker not a runner at my age, a parent, a former city employee, and somebody who has been involved in community and labor organizing in and around New York for decades.

I'm not an expert on the parks other than as a user. I, in general, support all of the proposals before you today.

I would like specifically, though, to talk about the reality that our parks have actually been cut back for years. It really goes back to the days of the fiscal crisis back in 1975. I don't think we've ever really recovered from that period. There's all this discussion, you see it in the newspapers, over something like 21% of our city employees, there are vacancies throughout most of the departments of the I don't know what the Parks Department numbers city. look like. I would urge the Committee to look at that and see how many vacancies there are in terms of Parks Department employees, we certainly need a lot of capital improvements in the parks. I completely agree with the comments about rats and restrooms that have been made already today.

2.2

2.3

We need-- Parenthetically, I could be called the son of-- of a community garden in Boston, when I was very little. My parents gardened in one of the public parks in mass in Boston. We could use more of that. So I definitely support the community garden aspect.

In general, though, we certainly need far more resources for our parks. And one of the sources of those— of those financial resources could be if we would move the money from the— the unbelievably, I would almost call it obscene level of pentagon spending— spending. Please, I'm urging the City Council to speak up and call on many of those resources to be redirected to our communities. And that very much includes our parks. Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: Thank you so much for your testimony. It's certainly true that our parks spending has gone down actually since the 1970s until today. Before it was over 1%. And now we're at—we're under it with about I think—I could be wrong, but off top my head, roughly a little more than 200 vacancies that we're facing in this preliminary budget in crucial positions that maintain our parks.

2 And we're-- will be focusing on those and calling

3 more attention to it in our budget hearings coming up

4 later this month, and in the next few months, too.

But thank you so much for your testimony. We appreciate it.

MR. GOGAN: And thank you.

CHAIRPERSON KRISHNAN: I think that— that concludes our hearing. I just want to close by saying, again to our parks department, thank you for coming to testify today and to our Councilmembers who are introducing legislation— or hearing legislation today. That's key to really maintaining and improving the green space in our city, and their accessibility, from our diaper changing stations, to our bathrooms, rec centers, and community gardens.

This is how, in addition to the investments in our park, these are the kinds of things that we need to be investing in to actually have a world-class park system that we that we truly deserve. And these are all key parts of it to make our parks more accessible. So looking forward to continuing to see these— these pieces of legislation move forward. We were very proud to hear them today. And I want to

2.2

2.3

COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION thank you all so much for joining and we'll now gavel out. [GAVEL] This hearing is now over.

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date 03/08/2023