

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

STATED MEETING OF THE  
CITY COUNCIL

----- X

Wednesday, December 21, 2022  
Start: 2:20 p.m.  
Recess: 3:56 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Adrienne E. Adams, Speaker

COUNCILMEMBERS:

- Speaker Adrienne Adams
- Shaun Abreu
- Joann Ariola
- Alexa Avilés
- Diana Ayala
- Erik Bottcher
- Justin L. Brannan
- Gale A. Brewer
- Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
- Joseph C. Borelli
- Tiffany Cabán
- David M. Carr
- Carmen De La Rosa
- Eric Dinowitz
- Amanda Farias
- Oswald Feliz
- James Gennaro
- Jennifer Gutiérrez
- Kamillah Hanks
- Shahana Hanif

Robert F. Holden  
Crystal Hudson  
Rita Joseph  
Ari Kagan  
Shekar Krishnan  
Linda Lee  
Farah N. Louis  
Christopher Marte  
Darlene Mealy  
Julie Menin  
Francisco P. Moya  
Mercedes Narcisse  
Sandy Nurse  
Chi A. Ossé  
Vickie Paladino  
Keith Powers  
Lincoln Restler  
Kevin C. Riley  
Carlina Rivera  
Pierina Ana Sanchez  
Lynn Schulman  
Althea Stevens  
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.  
Sandra Ung  
Marjorie Velázquez  
Inna Vernikov  
Nantasha Williams  
Julie Won  
Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 STATED MEETING OF THE CITY COUNCIL

4

2 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: [GAVEL] Good afternoon  
3 and welcome to the Stated Meeting of December 21,  
4 2022. I am Majority Leader Keith Powers. I'd like  
5 to thank everyone here for joining us. If you'd like  
6 to follow along, the agenda for today's meeting is  
7 posted on the city council website.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Please join us for the Pledge  
9 of Allegiance.

10 All rise.

11 ALL: I pledge allegiance to the flag of the  
12 United States of America to the Republic for  
13 which it stands, one nation under God, indivisible,  
14 with liberty and justice for all.

15 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Roll call.

16 CLERK: Abreu?

17 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: Here.

18 CLERK: Ariola?

19 COUNCILMEMBER ARIOLA: Present.

20 CLERK: Avilés?

21 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Presente.

22 CLERK: Ayala?

23 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: Here.

24 CLERK: Barron?

25 CLERK: Bottcher?

1 STATED MEETING OF THE CITY COUNCIL

5

2 COUNCILMEMBER BOTTCHEER: Here.

3 CLERK: Brannan?

4 COUNCILMEMBER BRANNAN: Here.

5 CLERK: Brewer?

6 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Here.

7 CLERK: Brooks-Powers?

8 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Here.

9 CLERK: Cabán?

10 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Present.

11 CLERK: Carr?

12 COUNCILMEMBER CARR: Present.

13 CLERK: De La Rosa?

14 COUNCILMEMBER DE LA ROSA: Here.

15 CLERK: Dinowitz?

16 COUNCILMEMBER DINOWITZ: Here.

17 CLERK: Farias?

18 COUNCILMEMBER FARIAS: Present.

19 CLERK: Feliz?

20 CLERK: Gennaro?

21 COUNCILMEMBER GENNARO: Here.

22 CLERK: Gutiérrez?

23 COUNCILMEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Presente.

24 CLERK: Hanif?

25 COUNCILMEMBER HANIF: Here.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE CITY COUNCIL

6

2 CLERK: Hanks?

3 COUNCILMEMBER HANKS: Present.

4 CLERK: Holden?

5 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Here.

6 CLERK: Hudson?

7 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Here.

8 CLERK: Joseph?

9 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Here.

10 CLERK: Kagan?

11 COUNCILMEMBER KAGAN: Present.

12 CLERK: Krishnan?

13 COUNCILMEMBER KRISHNAN: Here.

14 CLERK: Lee?

15 COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Here.

16 CLERK: Louis?

17 COUNCILMEMBER LOUIS: Present.

18 CLERK: Marte?

19 COUNCILMEMBER MARTE: Here.

20 CLERK: Mealy?

21 COUNCILMEMBER MEALY: Here.

22 CLERK: Menin?

23 COUNCILMEMBER MENIN: Here.

24 CLERK: Moya?

25 COUNCILMEMBER MOYA: Here.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE CITY COUNCIL

7

2 CLERK: Narcisse?

3 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Present.

4 CLERK: Nurse?

5 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Present.

6 CLERK: Ossé?

7 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: Present.

8 CLERK: Paladino?

9 CLERK: Restler?

10 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Here.

11 CLERK: Richardson Jordan?

12 CLERK: Riley?

13 COUNCILMEMBER RILEY: Present

14 CLERK: Rivera?

15 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Present.

16 CLERK: Salamanca?

17 COUNCILMEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

18 CLERK: Sanchez?

19 COUNCILMEMBER SANCHEZ: Present.

20 CLERK: Schulman?

21 COUNCILMEMBER SCHULMAN: Here.

22 CLERK: Stevens?

23 COUNCILMEMBER Stevens: Here.

24 CLERK: Ung?

25 COUNCILMEMBER UNG: Present.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE CITY COUNCIL

8

2 CLERK: Velázquez?

3 COUNCILMEMBER VELÁZQUEZ: Present.

4 CLERK: Paladino?

5 COUNCILMEMBER PALADINO: Present.

6 CLERK: Vernikov?

7 COUNCILMEMBER VERNIKOV: Present.

8 CLERK: Williams?

9 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

10 CLERK: Won?

11 COUNCILMEMBER WON: Present.

12 CLERK: Yeger?

13 COUNCILMEMBER YEGER: Here.

14 CLERK: Borelli?

15 COUNCILMEMBER BORELLI: Here.

16 CLERK: Powers?

17 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Present.

18 CLERK: Speaker Adams?

19 SPEAKER ADAMS: Present.

20 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you we'll now have

21 Today's invocation which will be delivered by Rabbi

22 Iris Richman, the founder of Jewish Voices Together

23 located at 244 Union Avenue in Brooklyn. Welcome.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

25

2 RABBI RICHMAN: Let us together seek blessings  
3 from the Holy One, the creator of light, and source  
4 of all blessings, יִצְרַן אֱלֹהִים, the one who forms light.  
5 Let us be able to truly see the light.

6 From the earliest times in human history, in a  
7 variety of festivals that transcend time and space,  
8 people have felt the need to come together and  
9 celebrate light during this season of darkening  
10 shortened days. In fact, today is the shortest day  
11 of the year.

12 As we feel light recede, we experience a calling  
13 during this time to seek out sparks, whether by  
14 celebrating the miracle of Hanukkah, and the flames  
15 that continue to illuminate the Holy Temple, or by  
16 celebrating the birth of a child who brought  
17 enlightenment to so many, or by celebrating light of  
18 the seven principles of faith and purpose.

19 Yet, as many of us are experiencing and  
20 anticipating a festival of light and joy, let us  
21 remember that for so many, especially the vulnerable,  
22 and some of our newest New Yorkers, finding that  
23 light may be a struggle, and the opportunity to bask  
24 in its illumination and warmth may be a miracle. Let

2 us take on both the joy and the quest for the bounty  
3 of blessings for all.

4 In this season of rededication of the light, you,  
5 the honorable members of this council have the  
6 opportunity and responsibility to define the values  
7 of this great city, to once again, from the budget  
8 legislation to determine how material resources  
9 should be distributed, especially for those who  
10 struggle to find the light, even the smallest sparks.

11 In this season, rededication Let us remember the  
12 third principle of Kwanzaa: To build and maintain  
13 our community together and make our brothers and  
14 sisters problems, our problems and to solve them  
15 together.

16 One of our challenges as humans is that we cannot  
17 always see the light, we can understand that the  
18 ability to develop that vision is a real miracle.  
19 May your creation of legislation be your discernment,  
20 enabling you to truly see, opening your mind and your  
21 heart.

22 In Hebrew, there are many names and descriptors  
23 of God, which correspond to the way that each of us  
24 wants God to be present for us in the world. At the  
25 beginning, I called the power upon God as אור, 'I called the power upon God as אור,

2 "the one who enabled light to exist", but what is  
3 light if we cannot see it?

4 So in addition to seeing God as יִצְרֵן אֹרֶךְ, the one  
5 who forms light, in Hebrew, we also call upon God as  
6 פּוֹתֵחַ עֵינַיִם עִיווּרוֹת "opener a blind eyes", let us ask  
7 for the ability to see what must be seen and to not  
8 turn away. Let us always remember that even in a  
9 season of darkness when we join together and stand  
10 for right, we can always find that light, and let us  
11 all say, Amen.

12 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you and thank you  
13 for being with us here today. I want to call on  
14 Councilmember Jennifer Gutierrez just read the  
15 invocation on the record.

16 COUNCILMEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you Majority  
17 Leader. Rabbi Iris Richman grew up in the Bronx and  
18 graduated from Hunter College High School. She is a  
19 member of the bar in New York and was ordained as a  
20 Conservative Rabbi by the Jewish Theological Seminary  
21 in Manhattan. She has worked to develop ethical  
22 standards to ensure that kosher food is produced with  
23 justice for workers, animals, and the environment,  
24 and she teaches in a variety of synagogues and Jewish  
25 organizations across the city. She is the founder of

1 STATED MEETING OF THE CITY COUNCIL

12

2 Jewish Voices Together an organization that works to  
3 increase peaceful coexistence and unified Jewish  
4 action. She is also the very proud mother of my  
5 chief of staff, Anna Fessendor. I would like to  
6 thank Rabbi Richman for being here today, and I make  
7 a motion for unanimous consent to spread the  
8 invocation in full upon the record.

9 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you and welcome.  
10 And we always live a Hunter College High School grad  
11 as well. So thanks for being here with us here  
12 Today. We're going to now call on having the  
13 adoption of the minutes by Councilmember Sandra Ung.

14 COUNCILMEMBER UNG: I make a motion to the  
15 minutes of the stated meeting of November 22, 2020 to  
16 be adopted as printed.

17 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Messages and  
18 papers from the mayor.

19 CLERK: None.

20 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Communication from city  
21 county and borough offices.

22 CLERK: M 104, comptrollers estimates.

23 SPEAKER ADAMS: Received, ordered, printed, and  
24 filed.

25

2 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Petitions and  
3 communications.

4 CLERK: None.

5 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Land use callups.

6 CLERK: None.

7 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll now  
8 have communication from Speaker Adrienne Adams.

9 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you, Majority Leader and  
10 good afternoon, everyone. Over the past two days,  
11 this council held a historic Committee of the Whole  
12 oversight hearing to examine the city's response and  
13 delivery of services to migrants seeking asylum. As  
14 I have repeatedly stated, New York City is a  
15 sanctuary city. And we welcome those seeking asylum  
16 with open arms and hearts. It is our responsibility  
17 as a city to provide them with services, resources,  
18 and the tools to build safe and dignified lives, just  
19 as we must for all New Yorkers who call our city  
20 home.

21 We acknowledge the inherent challenges of  
22 addressing this unprecedented crisis, and we thank  
23 the hard work of municipal employees, nonprofit and  
24 community partners, and everyday New Yorkers who have  
25 stepped up to meet the needs of asylum seekers.

2 These needs include shelter, clothing, food, physical  
3 and mental health care, education, transportation,  
4 language access, and legal services.

5 Yet we know gaps in critical services and support  
6 remain. Last week, John Ortega, a 26 year old father  
7 seeking asylum died by suicide, marking the second  
8 death of a migrant in our city's shelter system. We  
9 heard from public testimony yesterday that there are  
10 others who have attempted suicide. Because of the  
11 stigma around mental health, combined with the  
12 traumatic conditions that many face prior to and  
13 during their journey, it is especially important that  
14 we are proactive in providing culturally competent  
15 mental health care.

16 As I said yesterday, during the hearing, the  
17 council has an obligation to improve conditions  
18 across the shelter system, provide mental health  
19 services, and meet the vast array of needs of people  
20 who have already been through so much. We have to  
21 think creatively and work collaboratively to provide  
22 both immediate and long-term solutions. From the  
23 onset of this crisis, this council has sought to play  
24 a constructive role in supporting people seeking  
25 asylum in our communities that host them. We have

2 recognized the importance of partnership and support  
3 from our state and federal governments, while  
4 continuing to fulfill our role of holding city  
5 agencies accountable. We have also prioritized the  
6 development of solutions to improve policies and  
7 services by listening to and leveraging the input of  
8 community based organizations on the ground,  
9 providing essential support.

10 Today, the council released a new report  
11 outlining the challenges to effectively supporting  
12 asylum seekers and New Yorkers alike, paired with  
13 policy recommendations that can help address them.  
14 These policy solutions will benefit all New Yorkers,  
15 especially those who lack access to safe and stable  
16 housing, or need culturally competent services. In  
17 some cases, our recommendations will be followed with  
18 accompanying legislation

19 These recommendations are organized by points in  
20 time on a migrant's journey, from pre-arrival  
21 priorities to needs upon arrival, and long-term needs  
22 for those who decide to stay in New York City. Our  
23 policy proposals cover a range of ideas such as  
24 housing, economic opportunity, food insecurity,  
25 health care, and education. These policies can only

2 be achieved with the partnership of the  
3 administration, and our state and local federal  
4 partners. I look forward to working with my  
5 colleagues in government, community organizations on  
6 the frontlines, and all stakeholders to enact these  
7 holistic and comprehensive reforms. By working  
8 together, we can improve the lives of migrants  
9 seeking asylum and all New Yorkers who are building a  
10 life in our great city.

11 On a related note, one of the stressors of this  
12 crisis is the housing crisis facing our city. Last  
13 week, I unveiled my housing agenda, which provides a  
14 comprehensive set of housing solutions that  
15 prioritize equitable and responsible affordable  
16 housing development, deeper levels of affordability,  
17 and housing preservation. This year alone, the  
18 council has approved over 40 projects to create more  
19 than 12,000 units of new housing, with more than 63%  
20 being affordable. However, overall housing  
21 production has not kept pace with the growing need in  
22 our city, worsening our affordability crisis. As  
23 part of this plan. I intend to Introduce legislation  
24 to establish a citywide Fair Housing Framework, which  
25 will create targeted goals for every community

2 district to ensure affordable housing development is  
3 an equitably shared goal. At the same time, I rolled  
4 out a Planning and Land Use Toolkit, which provides  
5 guidance and tools for Councilmembers, communities,  
6 and land use applicants to successfully advanced  
7 projects that balance important neighborhood needs  
8 with citywide housing goals. It places an emphasis  
9 on comprehensive planning that can make the land use  
10 process more effective, reliable and responsive. It  
11 is my hope that the toolkit will help the council to  
12 continue advancing solutions that provide safe,  
13 stable, and affordable homes to New Yorkers. My  
14 housing agenda seeks to contribute solutions in this  
15 urgent moment that we can collectively advance  
16 through partnership across government.

17 Before I continue, I want to express my support  
18 for our colleague Councilmember Bottcher. Two nights  
19 ago, he was targeted by hateful attacks at his home  
20 and his office, including alleged acts of  
21 trespassing. These vile actions are completely  
22 unacceptable. I've been disturbed by the ways in  
23 which homophobic and transphobic hate has become more  
24 frequent along with other forms of hate. It is  
25 unacceptable and disgraceful, and we will continue to

2 reject any attempt to normalize it. I of course,  
3 send my love and support to Councilmember Bottcher  
4 and the LGBTQIA+ community and all of my  
5 Councilmembers that have been affected to this term  
6 due to hate coming to their districts and their  
7 homes. We will continue to stand with you against  
8 hate and in support of your humanity.

9       Next, I want to take a moment to remember the  
10 lives of two New Yorkers who died while on the job.  
11 Our city is mourning the loss of firefighter William  
12 P. Moon, II, who was critically injured last week at  
13 his firehouse in Brooklyn. Firefighter Moon was a  
14 21-year member of the FDNY who served our city with  
15 dedication and bravery. Our hearts are with his  
16 family, his friends, and his community. We're also  
17 grieving the loss of Linden Samuel, a construction  
18 worker who died last week while working at a building  
19 site in the Bronx. A native of the US Virgin  
20 Islands, Samuel is remembered as a hard-working and  
21 loving husband and father. We extend our heartfelt  
22 condolences to his wife and children during this very  
23 difficult time.

24       December 14, marks 10 years since the mass  
25 shooting tragedy at Sandy Hook Elementary School in

2 Newtown, Connecticut. The loss of 26 people,  
3 including 20 children, is still incomprehensible. As  
4 we reflect a decade later, we must never forget the  
5 lives of the people who were taken much too soon from  
6 us. Colleagues, please join me in a moment of  
7 silence to honor them. Firefighter William Moon,  
8 Linden Samuel and others whom we have lost in our  
9 city.

10 Thank you.

11 Five days ago, on December 16, we observed the  
12 51st anniversary of Bangladesh Victory Day, which  
13 commemorates the independence of Bangladesh. I'm  
14 proud to represent Southeast Queens, which is the  
15 home to a flourishing Bangladeshi community, and  
16 we're grateful for their contributions to our city.  
17 I also want to recognize the historic representation  
18 of Councilmember Johanna Hanif, the city's first  
19 Bangladeshi and Muslim woman elected to the New York  
20 City Council.

21 [APPLAUSE]

22 I hope everyone had a meaningful Victory Day.

23 Tonight is the fourth night of Hanukkah. And as  
24 Jewish families across New York City and around the  
25 world gathered to celebrate, I want to extend my

1 STATED MEETING OF THE CITY COUNCIL

20

2 warmest wishes for peace and joy during this season.

3 As our Jewish communities continue to face rising

4 antisemitism, it is critical that we uplift love and

5 light over hate and darkness. On behalf of the New

6 York City Council, khag Hannukah sah-meh-ahkh.

7 As this is the final stated meeting of 2022 -- I

8 can't believe it; yeah, we did it -- I want to thank

9 each and every one of my colleagues on both sides of

10 this amazing aisle in the New York City Council for

11 your hard work, your dedication and service on behalf

12 of all New Yorkers and your constituents.

13 We've accomplished so much in our first year, and

14 we will continue to work together to improve the

15 lives of everyone who calls the city home.

16 Colleagues have a merry Christmas, Happy Hanukkah,

17 happy Kwanzaa. Happy New Year. Happy anything else

18 that may make you happy.

19 Finally, please join me in wishing Councilmember

20 Carmen de la Rosa a happy early birthday.

21 [APPLAUSE]

22 Now let's move on to our stated agenda.

23 Today we're voting on several legislative rules

24 and finance items.

25

2 First, we will vote on the following appointments  
3 Isabel Castilla, as a member of the New York City  
4 Public Design Commission, James Van Bramer as a  
5 member of the New York City Public Design commission.

6 Next we will be we will be voting on the  
7 following finance items: A pre-considered Resolution  
8 sponsored by Councilmember Justin Brannan, to amend a  
9 previous exemption for one building in Hell's  
10 Kitchen, and a transparency resolution approving new  
11 designations and changes of certain organizations  
12 receiving funding and the expense budget.

13 And we will vote on the following pieces of  
14 legislation, several of which came from proposals in  
15 my State of the City to increase park space and  
16 underserved communities, expand opportunities for New  
17 Yorkers with disabilities, and enhance language  
18 access.

19 First, we'll vote on three pieces of legislation  
20 from the parks committee, two of which relate to  
21 improving the efficiency of the parks capital project  
22 process, and one that focuses on expanding green  
23 space. Introduction 174 A, sponsored by our Parks  
24 and Recreation Committee Chair Councilmembers Shekar  
25 Krishnan, will improve transparency and the sharing

2 of information about Parks' capital projects. The  
3 bill would improve the web-based capital tracker  
4 which posts details about the status of each project  
5 by requiring the Parks Department to post additional  
6 information, such as the total number of projects in  
7 its portfolio, the reasons for any delays, the dates  
8 that projects were fully funded, projected and actual  
9 cost overruns, individual sources of funding, and the  
10 length of time it took to complete each project.

11 Introduction 842 A also sponsored by  
12 Councilmember Krishnan, would require the Parks  
13 Department to prepare a strategy to identify ways to  
14 reduce the duration of capital projects by at least  
15 25%. Some of the proposed ideas include implementing  
16 incentives for early completion, increasing the  
17 standardization of various processes, timelines, and  
18 forms, improving coordination with utility companies  
19 and examining possible changes to regulatory barriers  
20 that slow the process down. The strategy would have  
21 to be submitted no later than December 1, 2023.

22 And Introduction 680 A, also sponsored by  
23 Councilmember Krishnan, would help the city identify  
24 more areas that can be greened or made into small  
25 parks. This bill would require various city agencies

2 to survey dead ends, highway entrance and exit areas,  
3 and other city owned vacant land particularly in  
4 environmental justice communities to determine the  
5 feasibility of planting trees or other vegetation in  
6 those areas, or possibly turning them into small  
7 parks. The survey will be completed by April 1,  
8 2024, and would include an analysis of the condition  
9 of each survey site as well as the feasibility of  
10 planting trees or other vegetation or the  
11 installation of bioswales, small parks, or other  
12 green spaces for each site. This bill originated  
13 from an idea Introduced in my State of the City  
14 address earlier this year, so I am so proud to see  
15 how it developed further from that foundation. We  
16 thank our staff, Chris Satori, and Patrick Mulvihill.

17 Next we will vote on legislation to help New  
18 Yorkers track our city street cleaning efforts.  
19 Intro 630 A sponsored by Sanitation Committee Chair  
20 Councilmember Sandy Nurse, would require the  
21 Department of Sanitation, or DSNY, to equip all  
22 street sweepers with Global Positioning System GPS  
23 technology and ensure that the GPS is functioning  
24 during street cleaning operations. This bill would  
25 also require DSNY to create a page on its website

2 where New Yorkers could track and confirm the  
3 completion of street cleanings. In addition, the  
4 bill would require DSNY to submit biannual reports  
5 for two years on city street cleanings and for the  
6 reports to be made publicly available on DSNY's  
7 website. We thank our staff Jessica Steinberg Albin.

8       Next, we will vote on a few bills expanding  
9 opportunities for New Yorkers with disabilities.  
10 Introduction 681 A sponsored by our Mental Health  
11 Disabilities and Addiction Committee Chair  
12 Councilmember Linda Lee would require the Department  
13 of Small Business Services, or SBS, the Mayor's  
14 Office of talent and workforce development, MOTWD,  
15 and the Mayor's Office for People with Disabilities,  
16 MOPD, to collaborate in creating and publicizing a  
17 workforce development program for people with  
18 disabilities in New York City. The bill would also  
19 expand the existing NYC:ATWORK Program by requiring  
20 SBS, MOTWD, and MOPD to maintain an online resource  
21 to connect employers and job seekers, including a  
22 current list of all vacant positions from  
23 participating employers.

24       Introduction 682 A, also sponsored by  
25 Councilmember Lee, would require the Mayor's Office

2 for People with disabilities to work with every city  
3 agency to devise five-year accessibility plans from  
4 each agency no later than March 14, 2024. These  
5 plans will outline the steps each agency will take  
6 over the next five years to improve physical and  
7 digital access to its workplace, services, and  
8 programs. Thank you to our staff Sandra Sucre and  
9 Christy Dwyer.

10 Next, we will vote on a language access  
11 legislative package. I am glad that the council is  
12 voting on these bills today to ensure that New  
13 Yorkers whose primary language is not English can  
14 receive the services they need.

15 Introduction 136 B sponsored by our Contracts  
16 Committee Chair Councilmember Julie Won would require  
17 an agency designated by the mayor to conduct a survey  
18 of community-based organizations to assess their  
19 capacity to provide translation, interpretation, and  
20 other related language services. Within one year of  
21 the bill taking effect, the agency would be required  
22 to produce a report detailing the survey's findings  
23 and recommend steps to remove barriers facing  
24 community-based organizations in providing language

2 services to New Yorkers. Thank you to our staff Alex  
3 Polinof and Alex Yabla.

4 Introduction 700 A, also sponsored by  
5 Councilmember Won would require city agencies to  
6 translate commonly distributed documents that relate  
7 to the enforcement of local laws and rules. This  
8 would include documents such as the plain-language  
9 summaries that are handed out to small business  
10 owners on business education days. These documents  
11 would need to be translated into each of the 10  
12 designated citywide languages, which are the top 10  
13 languages spoken by New Yorkers with limited English  
14 proficiency.

15 Next, the Business Owners Bill of Rights and the  
16 Food Service Establishment Code of Conduct are  
17 documents produced by the city that inform small  
18 businesses of their rights during inspections and  
19 other enforcement activities. Introduction 699 A  
20 sponsored by Councilmembers Sandra Ung would require  
21 these documents to be translated into additional  
22 languages and include additional information about  
23 language access services provided by the city. In  
24 addition, the bill would require city agencies that  
25 regularly conducts inspections to report annually on

2 the number of bilingual inspectors they employ.

3 Finally, the bill would require the Office of  
4 Administrative Trials and Hearings to provide small  
5 business owners with translations of written  
6 decisions upon request.

7       Introductions 697 A also sponsored by  
8 Councilmember Ung would help ensure that city  
9 agencies are prepared to serve large populations who  
10 are migrating to the city and do not speak one of the  
11 designated citywide languages. Going forward if  
12 there was a conflict, natural disaster, or other  
13 event that is likely to cause a significant number of  
14 individuals to arrive in the city and seek city  
15 services, the Office of Language Services coordinator  
16 would need to identify the primary languages spoken  
17 by those individuals and list those languages online.  
18 City agencies providing food, shelter or other urgent  
19 assistance would then need to translate relevant  
20 documents and make interpretation services available  
21 in the languages identified.

22       Finally, Introduction 382 A sponsored by  
23 Councilmember Gale Brewer would provide in-language  
24 guidance to small business owners who receive a  
25 settlement offer from the city after being charged

2 with a violation of a city law. Specifically, the  
3 bill would require each settlement offer sent by the  
4 Department of Consumer and worker protection, or the  
5 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to include a  
6 multilingual notice that informs the small business  
7 owner that they are being charged with a violation of  
8 the law, and directs the owner via a QR code to a  
9 portion of the agency's website with plain language  
10 information about responding to settlement offers.  
11 Both the notice and the plain language information  
12 would need to be translated into each of the  
13 designated citywide languages. We thank our staff CJ  
14 Murray and Erica Cohen.

15 Thank you for your attention. Now, I will turn  
16 it back into the hands of our majority leader.

17 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, Speaker  
18 Adams. We're now going to move into the discussion  
19 of general orders. We will start with Councilmember  
20 Nurse.

21 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Thank you, Majority Leader.  
22 Before I talk about my bill, I just want to also  
23 express my complete solidarity and support for  
24 Councilmember Eric Bottcher. I just want to let you  
25

2 know we all got your back, and we stand with you and  
3 what you're doing to fight back.

4 Today we're voting on my first bill, Intro 630,  
5 which I'm calling Sweep NYC. This bill is pretty  
6 straightforward. We're going to put a GPS tracker on  
7 all the DSNY street rooms, and then New Yorkers are  
8 going to be able to track that in real time to see if  
9 their streets were actually cleaned for the day, and  
10 keep an archive of it. So it's a pretty concrete,  
11 direct problem-solving bill, and I encourage all of  
12 you to vote in favor of it. And I just want to thank  
13 Speaker Adams for her support of this legislation.  
14 And thank my staff, Anelle Hernandez, our Committee  
15 Counsel, our Sanitation Task Force, and the committee  
16 as well for all their support. Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you and  
18 congratulations. We'll go now to Councilmember Lee,  
19 followed by Councillor Won.

20 COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. Good afternoon,  
21 Madam Speaker, Majority Leader, and colleagues.  
22 Today it is my honor to discuss two pieces of  
23 legislation related to the disabilities community.

24 First bill Intro 681 would codify New York City  
25 At Work, a workforce development program within the

2 Mayor's Office of People With Disabilities that  
3 provides resources and direct support to job seekers  
4 and employers for the purpose of promoting employment  
5 to people with disabilities.

6 And the next bill, Intro 682, would require the  
7 Mayor's Office of People With Disabilities to collect  
8 five-year accessibility plans from each New York City  
9 department office and agency. And as a social worker  
10 formerly from the nonprofit sector and now chair of  
11 this committee, I've seen how the pandemic has  
12 disproportionately affected the nearly 1 million New  
13 Yorkers with disabilities. This legislation is about  
14 making good on the promise of equal access while  
15 helping the city on its economic road to recovery.  
16 And I just wanted to do a special shout out to all  
17 the advocates in the disability community whose  
18 voices were needed and appreciated during this long  
19 process of creating these two bills. And it's really  
20 proving what we already knew, which is that with  
21 technology, people who want to work in the community  
22 can work and should be able to work, and who now have  
23 access to that. Just wanted to say thank you to my  
24 staff, as well as our committee staff Committee  
25 Counsel Sarah Suture, Senior Legislative Policy

2 Analyst, Christie Dwyer, and shout out... special  
3 shout out to the folks in the front here from Mayor's  
4 Office of People With Disabilities. I just want to  
5 thank -- I know she's not here -- Commissioner  
6 Christina Curry. We have Assistant Commissioner  
7 Martha Jackson, who's with us, Counsel Emily Sweet,  
8 and of course the rest of your team. So I just thank  
9 you for all of your hard work in helping us to get  
10 this passed. And I'm so excited that you're here and  
11 of course to Speaker Adams for making this a part of  
12 your State Of The City agenda and pushing this  
13 through.

14 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll go to  
15 Councilmember Won followed by Councilmember Brewer.

16 COUNCILMEMBER WON: Thank you Majority Leader.  
17 It is with a heavy heart that I speak today for Intro  
18 136 and Intro 700. Intro 136 was brought to the  
19 floor two weeks after giving birth, and Intro 136  
20 stemmed from the death of a two-year-old as well as  
21 his parents when Woodside flooded from Hurricane Ida,  
22 and we heard directly from the loved ones of the  
23 deceased of how important it is that they have  
24 language access and translation, especially from the  
25 government, in times of emergency as well as for

2 government services, aftermath of such a tragedy.

3 And now I am here closing off the year of passing our  
4 bills for language access, and it is now a week since  
5 John Ortega passed away from committing suicide in a  
6 shelter in my district.

7       When we talk about language access, it truly is a  
8 matter of life and death. And no matter how long  
9 you've lived in the city, whether it is for a week, a  
10 year, or 80 years, every single resident here  
11 deserves to be treated with dignity and honor and  
12 with deep love and care from our city government.  
13 And I know that with all of the support of the  
14 lawmakers here today that we're here to make that  
15 difference. And with 136 B and \$5 million in Council  
16 funding -- thank you to the speaker as well as the  
17 mayoral admin -- we will be creating the first ever  
18 in the country a language access co-op, in  
19 partnership with local nonprofits where we will no  
20 longer have to depend on a language access line that  
21 is out of state, so that when someone comes with an  
22 emergency with mental health needs and is  
23 contemplating taking their own life, that they do not  
24 have to be passed a phone to speak to someone in Ohio  
25 to be understood, but they will have someone who is

2 culturally competent, who understands our city, who  
3 understands their immigrant experience, who knows  
4 local resources and how to reach them directly in  
5 their very own vicinity. And it will also create  
6 jobs for the local community members through this  
7 language access co-op, and Intro 700 would expand our  
8 Language Access Law to require agencies to translate  
9 written materials when enforcing city laws and  
10 carrying out compliance because we have heard  
11 directly from so many immigrants who find work in  
12 small businesses that they need help understanding  
13 especially during times of the pandemic on what  
14 exactly is a new regulation.

15 So thank you so much to the speaker as well as my  
16 team. And I just want to thank Lorena Lucero, Carlos  
17 Menchaca, Karolina Gil, Isaac Lasenstein, Kevin  
18 Koprowski, Nancy Corona Farasalam, and so many others  
19 who are making this happen. Can I just add one more  
20 sorry. I also want to support the appointment of my  
21 predecessor Jimmy Van Bramer to the New York City  
22 Public Design Commission. And I know that former  
23 Councilmember Jimmy Van Bramer spent 12 years serving  
24 Western Queens as well as the city overall and he

2 will be bringing a vision of inclusivity equity and  
3 efficiency. Thank you.

4 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: We're going to now go to  
5 Councilmember Brewer followed by Councilmember  
6 Krishnan.

7 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much. I'm  
8 going to talk about Indro 382. This bill would  
9 require each settlement offer by the Department of  
10 Consumer and Worker Protection and Health Departments  
11 to be accompanied by a multi-lingual notice. And why  
12 was that important? It because it's going to inform  
13 the recipient that they're receiving a settlement  
14 offer, because they are being charged with a  
15 violation of the law. This is all for those who are  
16 not able to understand what they are getting. It  
17 directs the recipient through different mechanisms to  
18 the website about information about what the  
19 settlement offer does, but it's in language that they  
20 can understand. They have to be translated into  
21 designated citywide languages, the top 10.

22 This is not new to me. In 2002 with then  
23 Councilmember John Liu, we introduced Local Law 73.  
24 I think -- I don't know -- that it was the first law

2 that mandated translations and that was in the human  
3 service agencies.

4 We know that half of New Yorkers 3.8 million of  
5 us speak a language other than English. 1.8 million  
6 are not English proficient. And more importantly,  
7 47% of small business owners are foreign born. We do  
8 have Local Law 30. City agencies are covered by it.  
9 And they're supposed to provide telephone  
10 interpretation in 100 languages. But we learned at  
11 the asylum hearings that the speaker kindly called  
12 recently (Committee of the Whole) that that line is  
13 often overbooked.

14 We know also that I think this is, even more  
15 importantly, how busy 311 is, which is that 1.1  
16 million 311 callers requested an interpreter in 2020.  
17 So these laws are incredibly important by language  
18 access. And I just said earlier, and I think that  
19 this body is yes, very diverse, but might be the most  
20 multilingual, maybe more than Congress, the State  
21 Senate, State assembly may be more than any other  
22 city council in the United States. Congratulations,  
23 everybody.

24 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We will now  
25 go to Councilmember Krishnan.

2 COUNCILMEMBER KRISHNAN: Thank you, Mr. Majority  
3 Leader. Today we will vote on three pieces of  
4 legislation from the parks committee, of which I'm  
5 proud to be the lead sponsor. As we all know, our  
6 focus as a council has been to expand green space and  
7 access to green space for every New Yorker. And to  
8 do so from a standpoint of communities that have  
9 prioritizing communities that have some of the least  
10 amount of green space in this city. We've seen how  
11 restorative and crucial our parks are, especially  
12 coming out of the pandemic. These pieces of  
13 legislation address a critical issue, which is how to  
14 expand green space and to do so more effectively and  
15 efficiently with the capital process that is much,  
16 much faster in doing so. I, and I'm all our  
17 colleagues I know, have heard from so many  
18 constituents and wanting to know more about when our  
19 parks will be built, if there are delays, why there  
20 are delays and how we can speed up the process of  
21 building our parks and playgrounds, projects that we  
22 fund as a city council.

23 Our first Intro, number 174 A, requires the Parks  
24 Department to expand on its capital projects tracker,  
25 to include more detailed information like reasons for

2 delays, projected and actual cost overruns, and the  
3 time it takes to complete each project.

4       Intro 842 A requires the Park Department to  
5 coordinate with other agencies to prepare a strategic  
6 blueprint to reduce the duration of capital projects  
7 by at least 25%. I'm grateful to have worked with  
8 the Playfair Coalition, New Yorkers For Parks, and  
9 organized labor including Laborers Local 1010 and DC  
10 37 in coming up with this legislation.

11       Finally, Intro 680, which has been on the  
12 Council's radar for years, and was the focus of  
13 Speaker Adams State of the City address this past  
14 May. This bill would require a city agency and  
15 office to conduct a survey of streets with dead ends,  
16 parcels of vacant land owned by the city, and land  
17 that abuts highway entrances and exit ramps to  
18 examine the feasibility of these sites for planting  
19 trees, for micro parks, for bioswales, prioritizing  
20 environmental justice and communities most impacted  
21 by environmental justice.

22       I'd like to thank the speaker for her leadership  
23 and for bringing these bills to the floor for a vote.  
24 The committee staff Chris Sartori, Patrick Mulvihill,  
25 and the legislative unit for all their assistance in

2 drafting these bills, and my staff Chuck Park and  
3 Greg Clark for their assistance and I urge all my  
4 colleagues to vote in favor of these bills. If we  
5 are to be a city that expands green space and so  
6 equitably these bills are a crucial part of the  
7 process to doing so. Thank you.

8 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you,  
9 Councilmember. Seeing no one else signed up to  
10 speak, we're now going to return to messages and  
11 papers from the mayor.

12 CLERK: Excuse me. M-105 Budget Modification.

13 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Reports of special  
14 committees.

15 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on general  
16 orders.

17 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Hold on one second.

18 Okay, we're going to return back to messages and  
19 papers from the mayor.

20 CLERK: M 105. Budget Modification.

21 SPEAKER ADAMS: Finance.

22 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Report of special  
23 committees.

24 CLERK: None.

25

1 STATED MEETING OF THE CITY COUNCIL

39

2 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Report of standing  
3 committees.

4 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Contracts,  
5 Intro 136 B, Language Services.

6 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on general  
7 orders.

8 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Finance, pre-  
9 considered Reso 440, Transparency Resolution.

10 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on general  
11 orders.

12 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 154 and Reso 451  
13 Property Tax Exemption.

14 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on general  
15 orders.

16 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Governmental  
17 Operations, Intro 382 A, Settlement Offers.

18 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on general  
19 orders.

20 CLERK: Intros 697 and 697 A and 700 A,  
21 Supplemental Language Access And Translation  
22 Services.

23 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on general  
24 orders.

25

1 STATED MEETING OF THE CITY COUNCIL

40

2 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Mental Health,  
3 Disabilities, and Addiction, Intro 681 A and 682 A,  
4 Workforce Development and Five-Year Accessibility  
5 Plan.

6 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on general  
7 orders.

8  
9 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Parks and  
10 Recreation, Intro 174 A, Capital Expenditures.

11 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on general  
12 orders.

13 CLERK: Intro 680 A, Survey For Small Parks And  
14 Green Spaces.

15 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on general  
16 orders.

17 CLERK: Intro 842 A, Duration Of Capital  
18 Projects.

19 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on general  
20 orders.

21 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Rules,  
22 privileges and elections M 101 and Reso 452 approving  
23 the appointment of Isabel Costilla, Public Design  
24 Commission.

25 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on general orders.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE CITY COUNCIL

41

2 CLERK: M 102 and Reso 453, approving the  
3 appointment of James Van Bramer, Public Design  
4 Commission.

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on general orders.

6 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Sanitation and  
7 Solid Waste Management, Intro 630 A, Tracking of  
8 Street Cleaning Operations.

9 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on general  
10 orders.

11 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Small  
12 Business, Intro 699 A, Language Access For Small  
13 Business Owners.

14 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on general  
15 orders.

16 CLERK: On the general orders calendar,  
17 resolution appointing various persons Commissioner of  
18 Deeds.

19 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on general orders.

20 I now ask that the clerk take a roll call vote on  
21 all of the items coupled on today's general orders  
22 calendar.

23 CLERK: Menin?

24 COUNCILMEMBER MENIN: Aye on all.

25 CLERK: Louis?

2 COUNCILMEMBER LOUIS: I vote aye on all.

3 CLERK: Abreu?

4 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: I vote aye on all.

5 CLERK: Ariola?

6 COUNCILMEMBER ARIOLA: Aye on all.

7 CLERK: Avilés?

8 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Ayala?

10 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: Aye.

11 CLERK: Barron?

12 CLERK: Bottcher?

13 COUNCILMEMBER BOTTCHER: Permission explain my  
14 vote?

15 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

16 COUNCILMEMBER BOTTCHER: I just want to quickly  
17 thank all of my colleagues for the incredible,  
18 incredible messages of support. I knew that this  
19 body would be there during this tough time, but it's  
20 even just blown me away all the support. And you  
21 know, this week has been such a story of contrast,  
22 starting with back on Saturday, just being at a  
23 library where you had families trying to go to the  
24 library, with their kids out of love, met with  
25 vicious, vicious hatred and vulgarity and bigotry

2 that escalated into people terrorizing innocent  
3 staffers at the district office, vandalizing  
4 property, making threats over the phone, visiting a  
5 block of private residence and terrorizing a block  
6 full of people, and assaulting a neighbor. And I  
7 want to express solidarity with the other members of  
8 this body who've also been targeted, including  
9 Councilmember Krishnan whose home was visited by the  
10 same people just this fall over his support for Drag  
11 Story Hour.

12 So I know that we outnumber these lonely souls in  
13 in so many ways, but we've got to continue fighting  
14 back loudly and publicly against this horrible,  
15 horrible bigotry, and I know we will in this body. I  
16 also want to congratulate Councilmember Nurse on her  
17 first bill about the camera... the GPS on the street  
18 sweeper. We get a lot of complaints about... people  
19 complaining about their streets not being swept.  
20 That will fix this problem for New Yorkers. Happy  
21 holidays everyone.

22 [APPLAUSE]

23 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Councilmember, how do  
24 vote.

25 COUNCILMEMBER BOTTCHEER: Aye on all.

2 CLERK: Thank you, Councilmember  
3 Brennan?

4 COUNCILMEMBER BRENNAN: Aye.

5 CLERK: Brewer?

6 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Aye.

7 CLERK: Brooks-Powers.

8 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Permission to  
9 explain my vote.

10 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

11 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: I wanted to just  
12 take a moment to commend my colleague Councilmember  
13 Krishnan for the package bills he advanced. For  
14 passage today, Councilmember Krishnan has put forward  
15 bills to increase transparency and speed for capital  
16 projects in our parks. Many of us have experienced  
17 frustration with the timeline for parks projects, so  
18 many of which have been delayed and ended up over  
19 budget.

20 Historically, we've also seen disparities in the  
21 investment in parks across the city. In recent  
22 years, the city has sought to invest more in  
23 underserved communities, these communities will  
24 benefit when new parks projects move more quickly.

25

2 I hope these bills will lead to more transparency  
3 and more effective, efficient processes for parks  
4 projects across the city. I'm proud to co-sponsor  
5 these bills. And again, I think Councilmember  
6 Krishnan for his work. And with that I vote aye on  
7 all.

8 CLERK: Cabán?

9 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Congrats to CM Nurse.  
10 Solidarity always with Councilmember Bottcher and my  
11 queer siblings. And aye on all.

12 CLERK: Carr?

13 COUNCILMEMBER CARR: So to disclose on the record  
14 that we're funding CUNY in this transparency  
15 resolution, and my spouse is a student at CUNY. I  
16 vote aye on all.

17 CLERK: De La Rosa?

18 COUNCILMEMBER DE LA ROSA: Aye on all, and total  
19 solidarity with Councilmember Bottcher.

20 CLERK: Dinowitz?

21 COUNCILMEMBER DINOWITZ: Yes. Aye.

22 CLERK: Thank you. Farias?

23 COUNCILMEMBER FARIAS: I vote aye on all.

24 CLERK: Feliz?

25

2 COUNCILMEMBER FELIZ: Hi, everyone. First I'm  
3 president. I was having some technological issues  
4 when the roll call was done. I am here, and I vote  
5 aye on all. And I also want to tell my seatmate and  
6 Councilmember Eric Bottcher, and the entire LGBTQ  
7 community that in the city of New York, hate will  
8 never, ever win. Thank you.

9 CLERK: Thank you, Councilmember. Gennaro?

10 COUNCILMEMBER GENNARO: Aye.

11 CLERK: Gutiérrez?

12 COUNCILMEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Aye.

13 CLERK: Hanif?

14 COUNCILMEMBER HANIF: Aye.

15 CLERK: Hanks?

16 COUNCILMEMBER HANKS: Aye.

17 CLERK: Holden?

18 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: I vote aye.

19 CLERK: Hudson?

20 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Aye on all.

21 CLERK: Joseph?

22 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Aye on all.

23 CLERK: Kagan?

24

25

1 STATED MEETING OF THE CITY COUNCIL

47

2 COUNCILMEMBER KAGAN: Aye on all. And I would  
3 like to disclose that my daughter is a student of  
4 CUNY college.

5 CLERK: Krishnan?

6 COUNCILMEMBER KRISHNAN: Permission to explain my  
7 vote?

8 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

9 COUNCILMEMBER KRISHNAN: I just wanted to send  
10 love and solidarity to Councilmember Bottcher. We  
11 will all stand together against his hate and  
12 intolerance, and support Drag Story Hour. And with  
13 that I wanted to vote aye on all.

14 CLERK: Thank you. Lee?

15 COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye on all.

16 CLERK: Marte?

17 COUNCILMEMBER MARTE: Aye on all.

18 CLERK: Mealy?

19 COUNCILMEMBER MEALY: Aye on all.

20 CLERK: Moya?

21 COUNCILMEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

22 CLERK: Thank you. Narcisse?

23 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Aye on all.

24 CLERK: Nurse?

25 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Aye on all.

2 CLERK: Ossé?

3 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: Aye on all, and solidarity  
4 with Councilmember Bottcher, and all my LGBTQ  
5 colleagues who have encountered this hate, and shame  
6 on a fellow member of this body who spreads vile,  
7 disgusting language that is very similar to the  
8 harassers that harass... (crosstalk)

9 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Please make your  
10 comments in general. No comments about colleagues  
11 please. Thank you.

12 CLERK: Can I have your vote please.

13 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Councilmember, your  
14 vote, please.

15 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Councilmember, you need  
16 to vote.

17 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: I said aye on all.

18 CLERK: Thank you. Paladino?

19 COUNCILMEMBER PALADINO: Aye on all. Merry  
20 Christmas, everybody.

21 CLERK: Thank you, Restler.

22 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLERT: Aye on all. Congrats to  
23 the sponsors. And... and love to Councilmember  
24 Bottcher.

25 CLERK: Richardson Jordan?

2 CLERK: Riley?

3 COUNCILMEMBER RILEY: Aye on all. Congrats to  
4 Councilmember Nurse on passing her first bill, and  
5 I love you, Erik. Sending love to you from District  
6 12. Thank you.

7 CLERK: Rivera?

8 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye.

9 CLERK: Salamanca?

10 COUNCILMEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

11 CLERK: Thank you. Sanchez?

12 COUNCILMEMBER SANCHEZ: I vote aye on all, and in  
13 solidarity with you, Councilmember Eric Bottcher, and  
14 all of the LGBTQ community in our city. We see you,  
15 and we stand with you.

16 CLERK: Thank you. Schulman?

17 COUNCILMEMBER SCHULMAN: Aye on all, and I stand  
18 in solidarity with my LGBTQIA+ caucus members,  
19 including and specifically Erik Bottcher.

20 CLERK: Stevens?

21 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: Aye on all.

22 CLERK: Ung?

23 COUNCILMEMBER UNG: Aye on all.

24 CLERK: Velázquez?

25

2 COUNCILMEMBER VELÁZQUEZ: I'd like to disclose my  
3 brother's a board member of Samaritans of New York  
4 and my husband is a deputy commissioner of DUP. Aye  
5 on all. And I love you, Erik.

6 CLERK: Vernikov?

7 COUNCILMEMBER VERNIKOV: Aye on all.

8 CLERK: Williams? Councilmember Williams?

9 CLERK: Won?

10 COUNCILMEMBER WON: Permission to explain my  
11 vote.

12 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

13 COUNCILMEMBER WON: Aye on all, and I just want  
14 to voice my solidarity with Erik Bottcher. We  
15 support you 100%. And I also stand in solidarity  
16 with the LGBTQ community as well as Drag Story Hour.  
17 And I also want to again, voice my support for former  
18 Councilmember Jimmy Van Bramer, who was one of the  
19 first of the openly gay men elected to the City, who  
20 will bring a vision of inclusivity, equity, and  
21 efficiency to the Public Design Commission. Thank  
22 you.

23 CLERK: Thank you. Yeger?

24 COUNCILMEMBER YEGER: Aye.

25 CLERK: Thank you. Councilmember Williams?

2 CLERK: Borelli?

3 COUNCILMEMBER BORELLI: I vote aye on all, and I  
4 would like to wish the Speaker our staff and my  
5 colleagues a great Christmas or Hanukkah or Kwanzaa  
6 or whatever holiday you choose, and a happy new year  
7 to all.

8 CLERK: Thank you. Powers.

9 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: I vote aye on all.

10 CLERK: Speaker Adams.

11 SPEAKER ADAMS: I'd like to disclose for the  
12 record that I am a member of the Greater Allen AME  
13 Cathedral, and we are funding Allen AME Rockaway  
14 Boulevard Adult Center in this transparency Reso. I  
15 vote aye on all.

16 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. All items on  
17 today's general order count are adopted by a vote of  
18 48 in the affirmative, zero in the negative, and zero  
19 abstentions.

20 We will go to the Introduction and reading of  
21 bills.

22 SPEAKER ADAMS: All bills have been referred to  
23 committees as indicated on today's agenda.

24 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. There are no  
25 resolutions on today's calendar, so we are now going

2 to move into general discussion. And we'll start  
3 with Councilman Riley.

4 COUNCILMEMBER RILEY: Thank you, Majority Leader.  
5 Happy first year to my colleagues in City Council.  
6 It has been a tremendous year. I come to you today  
7 as the co-chair of the BLAC Caucus, because yesterday  
8 was a turmoil within our city government, when we're  
9 talking about slashing funds from a very specific  
10 tool that we all utilize to get the quality of life  
11 within our communities, which is discretionary  
12 funding.

13 Coming from the council and the state, one of the  
14 inquiries I used to get as a constituent liaison was  
15 from a lot of nonprofits within our communities that  
16 do such tremendous work. And when we're kind of  
17 talking about slashing money from these nonprofits  
18 who have been stepping up, during times where our  
19 communities and our cities really need it, I think  
20 we're doing a tremendous disservice to them, but not  
21 only to them to the black and brown people that we  
22 represent within our communities.

23 So as the culture the BLAC Caucus, I think what  
24 the administration is trying to do to us and do to  
25 our communities is horrible, is distasteful, and is

2 just plain right wrong. And if we're going to  
3 actually say that we care about communities, I don't  
4 think this is the proper way of doing it. I think we  
5 spend so much time in government with creating  
6 enemies without getting any allies. And if the  
7 administration wants an ally within the City Council  
8 wants to actually get some things done, I think they  
9 should come to the table and kind of have this  
10 discussion with us, so we could kind of figure out  
11 the best solution for us moving forward.

12 We know we're in a fiscal deficit. We know  
13 there's a lot going on. We actually took office  
14 after the pandemic. So with that being said, I think  
15 we should spend more time working together and stop  
16 utilizing tools like social media to fuel this  
17 tension amongst each other, because at the end of the  
18 day, the only ones that's being harmed are people  
19 from our community. So with that being said, I don't  
20 like to say too much. But that's just my two cents  
21 on this issue. Thank you.

22 [APPLAUSE]

23 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, we're going  
24 to Councilmember Lee, followed by Councilmember

2 Hudson, followed by Councilmember Joseph, followed by  
3 Councilmember Cabán.

4 COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Sorry. I didn't know you  
5 were going call me right away.

6 So this is just in regards to the budget  
7 modifications. Especially given the past two days'  
8 worth of hearings with the asylum seekers, I would be  
9 remiss not to mention my concerns with the budget mod  
10 that was introduced, for many, many reasons. Because  
11 we know that we're still recovering from the  
12 pandemic. There's a lot of issues around mental  
13 health and the proposed PEG, specifically the nearly  
14 \$7 million being cut to mental health and addiction  
15 services at a time where the city has proven that we  
16 need to invest in mental health the most.

17 We need to support our nonprofit organizations  
18 that are providing crucial services day in and day  
19 out, and just make sure that they're getting the  
20 reach the communities are getting the resources that  
21 are much needed at this time, especially as we're  
22 still recovering. And so I'm committed to  
23 ensuring... as chair of the committee, I'm committed  
24 to ensuring more access to mental health services to

2 all New Yorkers who need it and plan on supporting  
3 this so thank you.

4 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll now go  
5 to Councilmember Hudson, followed by Councilmember  
6 Joseph.

7 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Thank you. Slashing  
8 funding from vital city resources while  
9 simultaneously gutting the agencies that offer our  
10 neighbors care and support is wholly irresponsible  
11 and negligent. The proposed cuts in the  
12 administration's November financial plan and budget  
13 modification are illustrative of a mayor more  
14 concerned about waging political battles and truly  
15 getting stuff done.

16 Despite IBO projecting a \$2.2 billion surplus for  
17 this fiscal year and the federal government  
18 announcing that New York City will receive hundreds  
19 of millions of dollars in funding for asylum seekers,  
20 the mayor has turned his favorite tactic of cutting  
21 funding and stoking fear with xenophobic dog  
22 whistles.

23 As it stands are \$100 billion budget already  
24 dedicates less than half of 1% to older adults, even  
25 though we have an ever growing population of older

2 adults, which is expected to reach 1.4 million by  
3 2040. And three of New York City Aging's major  
4 programs have extensive waitlists with more than 1700  
5 older New Yorkers awaiting case management services  
6 and hundreds more awaiting homecare services or home  
7 delivered meals. Yet the mayor argues we can slash  
8 \$12 million in funding for New York City Aging  
9 because he sees "less than needed case management  
10 services" and because we don't need to fill the  
11 vacancies he himself created.

12 The cuts for older adults don't stop with NYC  
13 aging everyday resources like libraries and cultural  
14 programs that provide safe community centered spaces  
15 that combat social isolation, digital illiteracy and  
16 other systemic woes facing our older neighbors are  
17 seeing tens of millions of dollars gutted from their  
18 budgets. And to make matters worse, the mayor  
19 yesterday asked the council to slash \$300 million in  
20 discretionary funding that goes directly to vital  
21 community-based organizations that supplement our  
22 city services. So I would like to reiterate what my  
23 colleagues have said regarding the budget  
24 modification. Thank you.

2 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll go to  
3 Councilmember Joseph followed by Councilmember Cabán.

4 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you Majority Leader.  
5 Additionally, I want to reiterate my commitment to  
6 protecting public school funding. We were very proud  
7 of our... our agreement in the mid-year adjustment.  
8 With that being said, I will be keeping a very  
9 watchful eye -- and I said that from the day one I  
10 became the Ed Chair -- a watchful eye over the  
11 budgets... education budget as it pertains to  
12 education. Advocating for our students is my top  
13 priority. And I encourage all of my colleagues,  
14 which you have done, to join me in our shared efforts  
15 in improving our public schools. Thank you.

16 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll go to  
17 Councilmember Cabán followed by Councilmember Hanif.

18 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. With the  
19 holiday season upon us, we are called to show  
20 kindness, generosity, and goodwill to all. And as  
21 temperatures drop we as New Yorkers must especially  
22 extend heartfelt compassion to our homeless neighbors  
23 who are bracing for another brutal winter without the  
24 warm comfort of home that we here all enjoy.

2 Before I tell you about a bill I'm introducing  
3 today in that spirit, I want to join my colleagues  
4 also speaking against the mayor's cruel and dangerous  
5 austerity program in general, and his harsh budget  
6 modification in particular.

7 I ask you, Mr. Mayor, how much more punishment  
8 can New Yorkers take at a time when the city prepares  
9 to end this fiscal year with a \$2 billion surplus?  
10 How can you in good conscience slash jobs and cut  
11 vital services? How can you take away library staff  
12 and hours, CUNY professors, supportive housing,  
13 mental health services, and other programs that  
14 working New Yorkers depend on? And how can you blame  
15 the service cuts on the asylum seekers arriving in  
16 our city? We must remember that Christmas celebrates  
17 the nativity of a refugee child, his parents turned  
18 away from the only Inn in town and forced to give  
19 birth in a wretched manger. Let us show our  
20 neighbors in need the grace and mercy we would show  
21 that baby.

22 Now to my legislation: Homeless New Yorkers need  
23 care not cops, and today I've introduced Intro 856 in  
24 partnership with Councilmember Ossé in the support of  
25 a wide array of organizations, including folks that

2 do on-the-ground homeless outreach. This bill would  
3 mandate that homeless outreach be conducted first and  
4 foremost by non-violent service workers trained in  
5 trauma and informed care and able to provide tangible  
6 support items like warm socks or a hot cup of coffee.  
7 And furthermore, it would prohibit the city from  
8 issuing tickets or summonses simply for fitting  
9 together bedding or temporary shelter. Homelessness  
10 is not a crime. It is a call to tenderness and  
11 empathy. And this is especially important as the  
12 mayor directs law enforcement agencies to force our  
13 struggling neighbors into public hospitals that are  
14 already overwhelmed and understaffed. Such a policy  
15 is the exact opposite of the benevolence and love the  
16 season calls us to summon within. And I urge my  
17 colleagues to show their holiday spirit to support  
18 this bill and oppose the mayor's austerity agenda.

19 Thank you.

20 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, Councilmember  
21 Cabán. I'm just going to quickly call on  
22 Councilmember Brooks-Powers, who asked to do a  
23 disclosure on the record.

24 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: I'd like to  
25 disclose that we are funding a program by the great

2 Alan AME Cathedral where I am a member. We are also  
3 funding work with ESOTA, where my child participates  
4 in one of their programs.

5 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We're going  
6 to go to Councilmember Hanif, followed by  
7 Councilmember Kagan.

8 COUNCILMEMBER KAGAN: Thank you so much. I'm  
9 here to share that I oppose the deep cuts proposed by  
10 Mayor Adams's latest austerity budget reflected in  
11 the November financial plan and budget modification.  
12 Thank you to Speaker Adams and many of my colleagues  
13 for standing firm in opposing austerity budgets and  
14 calling on the mayor to strengthen investments in  
15 city services for New Yorkers.

16 Despite the fact that OMB has reported \$2.2  
17 billion in higher than anticipated tax revenue, this  
18 budget modification is full of cuts: \$61 million cut  
19 from the DOE in addition to the \$469 million not  
20 being reinstated and almost \$10 million cut from  
21 CUNY, all while we prepare to welcome thousands more  
22 asylum seekers into our city, many of which are  
23 school-aged children. We're also seeing millions cut  
24 from DYCD, HPD, and other social safety net programs

2 across agencies at a time when many agencies have  
3 vacancy rates of nearly 20%.

4       Additionally, this budget modification exempts  
5 the NYPD from the 3% pay cut requirements demanded of  
6 other agencies, doubling down on the mere strategy of  
7 prioritizing a bloated police budget over the  
8 essential services that our working class communities  
9 rely on. I reject this mayor's divisiveness and will  
10 not allow him to pit New Yorkers against one another.  
11 I look forward to working with my colleagues for a  
12 budget that addresses the core needs of families,  
13 students from 3k to CUNY, provides dignity to asylum  
14 seekers, and invests in urgent social services to  
15 keep a safe and recover from the compounding crises.  
16 Thank you.

17       MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll go to  
18 Councilmember Kagan followed by Councilmember Nurse.

19       COUNCILMEMBER KAGAN: Thank you. Good afternoon,  
20 everyone. Today I'm excited to introduce my new  
21 bill, Intro 860, which will reduce the length of the  
22 traffic studies conducted by the Department of  
23 Transportation from the current 36 months to 18  
24 months. Traffic studies are very important for the  
25 safety of both pedestrians and drivers. When

2 Community Boards or Councilmember requests a new  
3 traffic light, or pedestrian crosswalk, or stop sign,  
4 or speed bump, the DOT usually conducts a traffic  
5 study. My bill for the first time qualifies what a  
6 traffic study is, and is required to conduct for no  
7 longer than 18 months, and in case of negative result  
8 to provide to Councilmember and Community Board, the  
9 written explanation of the denial within 14 days.  
10 This measure will provide more transparent and more  
11 efficient ways for the Department of Transportation  
12 to respond to community concerns about road safety.  
13 Thank you.

14 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We're going  
15 to just briefly go to Councilmember Williams who was  
16 having technical difficulties, but would like to  
17 vote.

18 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Can you hear me now.

19 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: We hear you.

20 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Yay. Hello, everybody.  
21 Thank you Majority Leader. I would like to ask for  
22 unanimous consent to vote on the general orders  
23 calendar.

24 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: I see no objection.  
25 It's granted. Go ahead and vote.

2 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I vote aye  
3 on all. Happy holidays everyone. Love you, Eric.

4 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you and just  
5 update today's vote: All items today passed by a  
6 vote of 49 to zero to zero.

7 We're now going to Councilmember Nurse followed  
8 by Councilmember Gutiérrez, followed by Councilmember  
9 Ossé.

10 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Thank you Majority Leader.  
11 Colleagues, I'm also extremely alarmed and concerned  
12 with Mayor Adams austerity budget. Our city is still  
13 recovering from two years of unprecedented hardship.  
14 Our city's children are still facing ongoing social  
15 and emotional challenges. Our vital service  
16 providers and city workers are abandoning their posts  
17 in droves because they can't afford to work and live  
18 here. Our city government is barely carrying out  
19 critical functions to protect tenants, children, and  
20 family. Now the mayor wants further cuts to key  
21 institutions that contribute to public safety and  
22 public prosperity such as our libraries, CUNY, and  
23 social services.

24 It is unconscionable to balance our city's budget  
25 on the backs of the working class and those living in

2 poverty. And in a time of worrying instability, we  
3 must double down our investment in people and our  
4 public institutions. I hope now that we've all had  
5 almost a full year working together under our belts,  
6 as we take time and a break and spend time with loved  
7 ones, that we really can rest up and prepare to come  
8 back next year and fight against this austerity, and  
9 we need to fight back as a council, and we can't let  
10 this man force austerity down our throats and on our  
11 communities. So I'm really looking forward to  
12 fighting back with all of you louder and stronger,  
13 and I'm really, really heartened to see so many  
14 colleagues speaking up today. Thank you.

15 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, Councilmember  
16 Nurse. We'll go to Councilmember Gutiérrez, followed  
17 by Ossé, followed by Councilmember Sanchez.

18 COUNCILMEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you Majority  
19 Leader. It's been almost a year since many of us  
20 first walked into this building as first time  
21 Councilmembers, and throughout this year, we've all  
22 stood on the steps outside with our advocates and  
23 allies, and we've sat right here and listen to New  
24 Yorkers recount their traumas of navigating our  
25 city's broken systems hearing after hearing. I've

2 listened. I've sympathized. I've collaborated.  
3 I've engaged. But I refuse to be indifferent. That  
4 is because I wasn't elected by my community to be  
5 indifferent. I'm a member of this body because I  
6 promised them that I would speak out against  
7 inequities, because like them, I know what it feels  
8 like to wait on the phone or a long line for hours to  
9 get benefits, only to be turned away or hung up on.

10 So no, I will not be silent when New Yorkers,  
11 especially the most vulnerable will suffer the  
12 consequences of millions of dollars of undefined cuts  
13 to social services, \$20 million in cuts to ensure  
14 safe housing like NYCHA and supportive housing, over  
15 \$13 million to our libraries, or let \$9.7 million be  
16 ripped from CUNY. And I'm definitely not going to  
17 stand here when our schools are facing over \$75  
18 million in additional cuts. I'm speaking out because  
19 Mayor Adams's austerity budget is not in the interest  
20 of the residents of Bushwick, Williamsburg, or  
21 Ridgewood, or across our city.

22 This budget is stripping the city's most vital  
23 social welfare infrastructures at a time when all we  
24 should be doing is investing heavily into them. I  
25 oppose the deep cuts proposed by Mayor Adams latest

2 austerity budget that contains devastating reductions  
3 with untold long-term damage to city services,  
4 especially while city agencies have double digit  
5 staffing vacancy rates across our most critical  
6 programs, a problem that this mayor has only  
7 exacerbated in his short tenure.

8       The truth of the mayor's austerity budget is not  
9 actually about a fiscal crisis. It's not about  
10 public safety. And it's definitely not about doing  
11 what is best for everyday New Yorkers. Some may say  
12 that this modification is just business as usual.  
13 But if we're not going to speak up against cuts to  
14 our most essential services right now, that when is  
15 the right time? I'm speaking out against the mayor's  
16 budget to make sure that I'm elevating the voices of  
17 my community and working families across our city.  
18 This is the kind of fight that we were all elected to  
19 have. Thank you.

20       MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll go to  
21 Councilmember Ossé, Councilmember Sanchez,  
22 Councilmember De La Rosa.

23       COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: I'm proud to join  
24 Councilmember Cabán in introducing legislation to  
25 protect homeless New Yorkers. Our Care Not Cops bill

2 would take a data-driven approach to improve public  
3 safety without sacrificing the civil rights and  
4 dignity of our neighbors.

5 People living on the street already face cruel  
6 conditions. We must provide them with mental health  
7 care and social service to get back on their feet,  
8 not subjected them to state sanctioned violence. The  
9 police don't even want this responsibility they  
10 weren't trained for, so let's give the work to those  
11 who do.

12 But suffocating Social Services is providing to  
13 be the administration's M.O. June's city budget was  
14 a disappointment. Now the mayor's proposed  
15 modification doubles down on his conviction to  
16 throttle our most vital institutions. Public  
17 servants and the public they serve will suffer. Our  
18 libraries cannot afford the \$14 million plus cut he  
19 seeks, neither can our city. This mayor calls Bed  
20 Stuy home, a community in which I represent. He  
21 knows the acute needs we face. He knows the crucial  
22 work for seniors, youth, parks, and sanitation that's  
23 done by local black nonprofits. And he knows his  
24 plan to cut a half a billion dollars from our  
25 discretionary funding will starve them.

2 Our federal representatives did their job and  
3 secured nearly \$1 billion in funding to address the  
4 migrant crisis. Now it's time for Mayor Adams to do  
5 his. The bill we introduced today is a Band Aid for  
6 a wound we should not have. Homelessness is a  
7 symptom of the same divestment from education and  
8 mental health care that has been degrading New York  
9 for years, a divestment that most members of this  
10 body ran for office pledging to end and one that  
11 would be accelerated by this modification.

12 A majority of this council has a sworn obligation  
13 both to our constituents and to our own campaign  
14 promises to resist these cuts and protect our city.  
15 The \$2 billion surplus in our hands is an opportunity  
16 to invest in our infrastructure and our people. This  
17 body must act as a unified voice to stand up to the  
18 cruelty coming from the mayor's austerity budget, for  
19 our constituents and for our future. Thank you.

20 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll go to  
21 Councilmember Sanchez, followed by Councilmember De  
22 La Rosa, followed by Councilmember Ayala.

23 COUNCILMEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you Majority  
24 Leader. I join in strongly opposing the unnecessary  
25

2 deep cuts proposed by Mayor Adams austerity budget  
3 that was shared with the Council this this year.

4 My concerns are broad, yet as Chair of Housing  
5 and Buildings, I express particular concern today  
6 regarding cuts to our housing and social service  
7 agencies. \$90 million in cuts to HPD would reduce  
8 assistance for rental subsidy programs, supportive  
9 housing programs, and emergency shelter operation at  
10 a time when eviction rates are the highest that  
11 they've been. Unacceptable. Reductions in city  
12 assistance to NYCHA? Unacceptable. Instead, we  
13 should be focusing on reducing sky-high vacancy rates  
14 in these agencies -- 23% at DOB, 18% at HPD, and 29%  
15 within the office at HPD Office of Development, which  
16 provides the ability for New York City to build new  
17 housing. HPD needs more investment, not less.

18 Thank you to our Speaker for releasing a housing  
19 agenda that acknowledges this. In social services,  
20 the high vacancy rates are felt on the ground.

21 Constituents in my district that did not have a  
22 Thanksgiving dinner because of delays in processing  
23 their benefits. Unacceptable. Thank you to Deputy  
24 Speaker Ayala for holding a hearing on this critical  
25 issue.

2 Low-income New Yorkers facing record levels of  
3 evictions without access to counsel is unacceptable.  
4 New Yorkers can't afford the untold long term damage  
5 to agencies that provide housing, senior services,  
6 youth services, community development, parks,  
7 education and other vital services for New Yorkers.  
8 Let's support one another especially our most  
9 vulnerable in the greatest city in the world, home to  
10 the most diverse leadership, both in terms of  
11 personal backgrounds and lived experiences to ever  
12 lead a municipality. Let's be that. Let's live  
13 that. Thank you.

14 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. I just want  
15 to let people know we have about 15 more people  
16 signed up. So if you can be efficient, that is  
17 appreciated. We will now go to Councilmember De La  
18 Rosa, followed by Councilmember Ayala, followed by  
19 Councilmember Marte.

20 COUNCILMEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much. I  
21 am a proud member of this body and today I stand in  
22 solidarity with my colleagues in the Council in  
23 expressing concern about the deep cuts proposed by  
24 Mayor Adams latest austerity budget reflected in the  
25 November plan and in the budget mod. Time and time

2 again, programs and social services that our  
3 communities desperately need are on the chopping  
4 block. Double digit vacancy rates plague many  
5 government agencies, negatively impacting our ability  
6 to deliver critical services to New Yorkers.

7 We have been sounding the alarm on the alarming  
8 vacancy rates in city agencies that deal with social  
9 services, housing, education, human rights, and  
10 mental health. My office has received hundreds of  
11 housing cases and cannot provide tenants with  
12 adequate answers because we are still dealing with  
13 long wait times for interviews, and agencies take  
14 months to respond. Those wait times will only  
15 increase if these budget cuts continue forward.  
16 Agencies like the Department of Aging, the Department  
17 of Consumer and Worker Protection, our public  
18 libraries, CUNY, our Parks and Recreations department  
19 face budget cuts that will exacerbate existing issues  
20 impacting New Yorkers. Cutting these agencies will  
21 inflict great harm to New York City families,  
22 particularly low income families that rely upon these  
23 city resources.

24 Not only have the \$469 million cuts to education  
25 made in the FY 23 budget not been restored, but this

2 budget modification seeks to slash an additional \$79  
3 million from our Department of Education's budget,  
4 and the very social safety nets that keep many of  
5 these families afloat.

6 Yesterday we heard the mayor threaten our  
7 nonprofits with 50% cuts despite the work that  
8 they've done to keep our city running in the midst of  
9 compounding crises.

10 Without the help of organizations like NMIC, the  
11 Dominican Women's Development Center, Cabrini Shrine,  
12 and countless others in my own district, asylum  
13 seeking families coming to our city would not be able  
14 to have their needs taken care of. This is not a  
15 moment for us to allow vulnerable communities to be  
16 pitted against each other for critical services they  
17 need. With a surplus of \$2.2 billion in the current  
18 fiscal year, these cuts are unnecessary and threaten  
19 the very livelihood of New Yorkers. I stand in  
20 opposition to these cuts. Thank you.

21 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll go to  
22 Councilmember Ayala, followed by Councilmember Marte,  
23 followed by Councilmember Velázquez.

24 COUNCILMEMBER AYALS: Thank you, Mr. Majority  
25 Leader. I think... I... Really I stand in awe. I'm

2 just, you know, so disappointed with the proposed  
3 cuts to this year's budget modification. I think  
4 we've all seen and I... This week, if you haven't  
5 been watching, we've held a number of hearings where  
6 we heard directly from providers that are on the  
7 ground that are servicing asylum seekers coming into  
8 New York City, who shared stories with us about not  
9 being reimbursed for, you know, things such as food.  
10 Most... you know... Most, if not all of these  
11 individuals that are coming into the city have... do  
12 not qualify for government aid, and they're not  
13 getting SNAP benefits. And that means that these  
14 providers are having to come up with breakfast,  
15 lunch, and dinner, and snacks. And that has that has  
16 resulted in you know, families eating sandwich after  
17 sandwich after sandwich.

18 And so yeah, you can say that we're feeding  
19 people, but I guess the... you know, the devil is in  
20 the details. What exactly are we feeding folks?  
21 Right? They don't... There is no money for that.  
22 I'm just, you know, really disappointed because  
23 we're... It seems like we have contradictory  
24 information coming from City Hall. We have a housing  
25 plan, and yet we're making cuts to positions that

2 would staff HPD for inspections, for legal services  
3 that would ensure equal represent... adequate  
4 representation in court. We have families that are  
5 not receiving SNAP benefits, because the rate of  
6 application processing is at 46%, because of the...  
7 you know, short... every single agency is short-  
8 handed at this point. And as opposed... Instead of  
9 trying to figure out a solution to higher up, the  
10 proposal is just to eliminate these jobs, without any  
11 assurance that they're going to ever come back.

12 So, you know, as the Chair of the General Welfare  
13 Committee, I can't find them cutting back on any  
14 crucial services like housing, and homeless services,  
15 domestic violence prevention, and services for crime  
16 victims, especially now when our city is faced with  
17 multiple overlapping crises.

18 As someone who has been on the receiving end of  
19 the services, I know how critically important and  
20 even life-saving these services are. As a body, we  
21 have a responsibility to ensure that we equip our  
22 local nonprofit service providers with the tools that  
23 they need to effectively provide services that our  
24 constituents know and trust. We should be right  
25 sizing those budgets, not cutting them. Thank you.

2 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll go to  
3 Councilmember Marte, followed by Councilmember  
4 Velázquez, followed by Councilmember Brewer.

5 COUNCILMEMBER MARTE: How can I, how can our  
6 mayor stand and say New York City is back? How can  
7 he stand and say we're a "city of yes" when he is  
8 saying no to the most vulnerable? When he is saying  
9 no to parents who are looking for 3K spots in their  
10 district, when he is saying no to CUNY students who  
11 are going to lose their teachers. He is saying no to  
12 every single one of my colleagues here when he says  
13 50% cuts to nonprofit after-school programs,  
14 community organizations that make this city run every  
15 single day.

16 The reason why the city is bouncing back is  
17 because we're investing in it. These cuts are  
18 horrendous, and it's only going to take us backwards.  
19 And I'm really proud to stand with a lot of my  
20 colleagues and the speaker in saying no to these  
21 cuts, and continue to invest in our communities,  
22 especially the most vulnerable. Thank you.

23 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll go to  
24 Councilmember Velázquez, followed by Councilmember  
25 Brewer, followed by Councilmember Krisnan.

2 COUNCILMEMBER VELÁZQUEZ: Thank you Majority  
3 Leader. I want to take a moment to speak about the  
4 mayor's request for the council to reduce the funding  
5 we allocate to nonprofits service providers by 50%.

6 Local community-based organizations are essential  
7 to the health and well-being of our neighborhoods.  
8 They are embedded in our communities and do the hard  
9 work of reaching people in places where access to  
10 essential services can be difficult. We rely on our  
11 nonprofit partners like Kips Bay Boys and Girls,  
12 Northeast Bronx Senior Center, Destination Tomorrow,  
13 and IDC.

14 We rely on them to serve New Yorkers just as they  
15 rely on us to support their work. Our city's  
16 children, homeless youth, elders, and immigrant  
17 communities all need our continued investment. The  
18 council is focused on delivering resources and  
19 essential services to New Yorkers who are currently  
20 experiencing the compounded negative effects of  
21 overlapping crises. We cannot abandon our nonprofit  
22 and community partners when they need our support the  
23 most. The suggestion to pull funding from already  
24 underserved populations during this critical times  
25 makes it clear that this administration has more work

2 to do. They need to see firsthand the vital role  
3 that community-based organizations play in keeping  
4 our communities healthy and safe. We encourage the  
5 administration to come to our communities to meet us  
6 where we are to see the positive and lasting impact  
7 that these local organizations have for New Yorkers.

8 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll go to  
9 Councilmember Brewer, Councilmember Krishnan, then  
10 Councilmember Avilés.

11 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much.  
12 Believe it or not, this is 20 years in elected office  
13 for me at the end of December, and I have worked  
14 before in the mayor's office. I know that... In a  
15 previous Mayor's office. And these are tough issues.  
16 And I appreciate the administration reaching out.

17 But it was a surprise that the mayor -- and I  
18 think it was actually a surprise to some of his staff  
19 people -- that he's asking for half of our  
20 allocation... half of \$563 million.

21 When the money that we allocate -- and I know  
22 this is true of my colleagues, I can certainly say  
23 that every dollar I've allocated -- keeps the  
24 community safe, keeps it clean, and of course, if I  
25 had my way, the libraries would be open seven days a

2 week for many, many hours. That's what we should be  
3 doing.

4 In my case, positive influence works with people  
5 who live in NYCHA, with basketball, with young people  
6 keeping them off the street. Green Keepers run by  
7 Goddard Riverside works with young and older  
8 individuals who have mental health challenges and are  
9 able to work and they keep our streets clean. They  
10 supplement what the Department of Sanitation does.

11 We have to work... If I had my way, I would give  
12 a lot more money to the mental health organizations.  
13 Right now, they have a 40% vacancy. Now I know this  
14 is always told across the country, "Gale, everybody  
15 has the same issues." But you know what? We're New  
16 York. We should be doing things differently.

17 There's no way that those mental health organizations  
18 should be without money. So what do we got to do?

19 Mr. Mayor, be more transparent how much of those  
20 tents really cost. How much does (inaudible) really  
21 cost? How many more U of A's Can you please provide?

22 The baseline... Many more agencies that actually  
23 bring in money should be baselined with their staff  
24 budgets. They weren't in your budget. I know there  
25 are big problems, but you know what, Mr. Mayor and

2 your administration? You cannot do it alone. You  
3 need us. We need you. And that's the way we're  
4 going to solve the problems and it's the only way  
5 we're going to solve these tough issues. Thank you.

6 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll go to  
7 Councilmember Krishnan followed by Councilmember  
8 Avilés.

9 COUNCILMEMBER KRISNAN: Thank you Majority  
10 Leader. I just wanted to lay out some basic math and  
11 facts. Revenue is going up. Needs are going up.  
12 That was before, as we revealed during our hearing:  
13 That needs are going up at a remarkably fast rate  
14 given the asylum seekers who are coming here. Yet,  
15 we are facing a budget modification that slashes  
16 spending. A proposal to cut funding from the council  
17 that supports the very groups on the frontlines who  
18 are doing the work every single day to support our  
19 asylum seekers who are coming here, especially where  
20 city agencies have failed, and don't have the  
21 capacity to do so.

22 I look at a budget modification among a number of  
23 problems. I see, one, an elimination among many  
24 other PEGS of 200 vacancies at the Parks Department,  
25 cuts to CUNY and higher education. I also see cuts

2 to our libraries, critical institutions for our  
3 communities, and especially egregious -- as if they  
4 all weren't egregious -- but especially egregious, is  
5 the cuts to 3K. And no amount of explaining like  
6 right-sizing or anything else could possibly explain  
7 why we would cut back on an early-education program  
8 that must be universal, that clearly has shown  
9 benefits for children for their entire lives. Yet  
10 here we are facing a number of austerity measures in  
11 this modification that are utterly outrageous.

12 At a time like this, and the crisis that we face  
13 now, with revenue up as well, the fact that we would  
14 be looking to cut crucial city services, cut from  
15 agencies that provide those services, cut from  
16 organizations that are doing the work every day where  
17 those services are failing is absolutely  
18 unacceptable.

19 If anything in a moment like this, especially  
20 when our revenue is up, we should be spending more,  
21 and much more to support those who are desperately in  
22 need of help, who are coming here in desperate need  
23 of help. Thank you.

24

25

2 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll go to  
3 Councilmember Avilés followed by Councilmember  
4 Narcisse.

5 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you Majority Leader.  
6 For the past year, we have fought hard to protect our  
7 public school system, a system that serves more than  
8 1 million New York City children and youth. We have  
9 fought to protect the thousands of educators that  
10 work in it, a workforce of the city that is doing  
11 their best under extraordinarily difficult  
12 circumstances. And yet despite our efforts, the  
13 mayor slashed school budgets, excess teachers, cut  
14 programs, and then tried to gaslight parents and New  
15 Yorkers. The mayor claims to get stuff done. We  
16 should all be asking, "What does 'this stuff' mean?"

17 Allow me to clarify what some of this stuff that  
18 is being proposed in the mayor's latest budget  
19 modification proposal, cutting another \$75 million  
20 from public schools, cutting \$13.6 million from  
21 libraries, cutting \$9.7 million from CUNY, cutting  
22 more than \$20 million from the New York City Public  
23 Housing Authority. There is no reason for these  
24 shameful cuts to these essential services that  
25 support working class New Yorkers, when... when we

2 will end the year with a \$2.3 billion surplus.

3 Blaming migrants is a shameful lie.

4       The mayor has demanded these cuts since January  
5 of this year. This modification is not about fiscal  
6 prudence. It's about shifting resources to the  
7 mayor's priorities and avoiding democratic  
8 accountability. We will not allow the mayor to pit  
9 neighbor against neighbor to justify destabilizing  
10 our communities. I will not allow the administration  
11 to engage in rhetoric that is not only untrue, but  
12 that stokes fears to convince us that there's only  
13 one path to take.

14       My colleagues and I are here to forge another  
15 path. We know that community safety starts with  
16 investments in education, libraries, public housing.  
17 The council is a co-equal branch of government.  
18 Let's act like it. We say no to Mayor Adams fear  
19 city. I oppose these deep cuts proposed by the  
20 mayor's latest austerity budget reflected in the  
21 November financial plan budget modification. Thank  
22 you.

23       MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll go to  
24 Councilmember Narcisse followed by Councilmember  
25 Farias.

2 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you Majority  
3 Leader. Thank you Madam Speaker. As you all know,  
4 our city continues to battle a serious COVID  
5 pandemic, with over 3000 cases being diagnosed per  
6 day and the possibility of tridemic with dramatically  
7 high influenza numbers and RSV, which is still  
8 prevalent. Coupled this with crippling staffing  
9 shortages and our hospital are in desperate need of  
10 lifelines. Some of them are on life support, and New  
11 Yorkers lives are being put at risk.

12 I understand we are facing some difficult  
13 economic choices and cuts, unfortunately, are  
14 inevitable. But I ask my colleagues to carefully  
15 consider the impact of any cuts to our healthcare  
16 system, and recall the height of the pandemic in 2020  
17 when ambulance noises refused to let us sleep. We  
18 cannot go to sleep because of the noise, and we know  
19 one person or two folks are going to the hospital and  
20 not going to come out. When we all clearly  
21 understand the need to reenforce and strengthen our  
22 hospital.

23 As far as the mayor: When you want to go fast,  
24 you go alone, when you want to go far you go  
25 together. But I recall when you came, you said you

2 want the city a better city. But who knows the  
3 community best? The City Council. Each of us are in  
4 the site where we know what's going on. We know  
5 where the inequities are located. We know where to  
6 put the funding. This is us, the mayor, and we are  
7 part of a system where we're going to keep you  
8 accountable, and you have to be responsible, and  
9 right now we talking about the inequities in a black  
10 and brown community. They are on life support, most  
11 of the organizations.

12 So if you continue playing that game, there is  
13 places to play a game... but certainly not people's  
14 lives.

15 As far as I'm concerned. We are here to come to  
16 work. I have been a nurse for over three decades. I  
17 have been in business. I have been around, but Mr.  
18 Mayor, this the city council with the leader of Madam  
19 Speaker, Adrienne Adams, we have been working so hard  
20 every day, diligently to make sure that the city of  
21 New York and the needs of the city of New York is  
22 being addressed. We're not playing a game. We are  
23 serious and you have to stop your game.

24 And happy holidays, all.

25 [LAUGHTER]

2 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Happy holidays to you,  
3 Councilmember Narcisse. We'll go to Councilmember  
4 Farias, and then we have Councilmember Restler,  
5 Councilmember Brooks-Powers, Councilmember Won. And  
6 then we go on break.

7 COUNCILMEMBER FARIAS: Thank you, Majority  
8 Leader. I want to echo the sentiments of my  
9 colleagues regarding their statements on the mayor  
10 slashing our budgets.

11 As co-chair of the Women's Caucus, it's appalling  
12 to me that this request is being made of the Council.  
13 At a time when access to abortion and reproductive  
14 health care are under attack, we cannot afford  
15 attempts to cut funding from the organizations that  
16 provide these essential services. Women still make a  
17 fraction of the wages men receive, and we know the  
18 nonprofit service providers that support women and  
19 families are the backbone of healthy and safe  
20 communities. Community-based organizations are  
21 filling the gaps in critical services that the  
22 government is failing to provide for all New Yorkers.  
23 Any suggestions to strip vital resources from the  
24 council's women's initiatives is insulting and

2 dangerous, especially after we took action to provide  
3 access to abortion health care through this funding.

4 If we are serious about promoting maternal  
5 healthcare, protecting access to abortion and doula  
6 services, supporting survivors of domestic violence,  
7 and fostering leadership among young women, the city  
8 must honor its commitments to support service  
9 providers.

10 Drastic and short sighted cuts to committed  
11 investments will only harm and undermine our  
12 communities and their recovery. And, and I ardently  
13 oppose that. Thank you.

14 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll go to  
15 Councilmember Restler, Councilmember Brooks-Powers,  
16 and finally Councilmember Won.

17 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Thank you majority  
18 leader. I would like to express my strong opposition  
19 to the mayor's austerity budget modification. I am  
20 truly heartened by the words from my colleagues and  
21 appreciative of the leadership of our speaker.

22 I have to ask: When do we say enough? When will  
23 we no longer go along with this mayor? When will we  
24 stop signing off on his draconian policies? We have  
25 a budget surplus to date this fiscal year. There is

2 no need to be cutting libraries. There is no need to  
3 be cutting CUNY, our engine of socio economic  
4 mobility there. We should not allow for another  
5 penny of cuts to our Department of Education. No  
6 more cuts to supportive housing. No cuts to mental  
7 health. No cuts to early childhood education. We  
8 must fight back.

9 Last week at Councilmember Ayala's hearing of the  
10 General Welfare Committee, the HRA administrator  
11 noted that not in her 40 years of service have we had  
12 so few staff at our anti-poverty agency. We are  
13 failing to provide food stamps and public assistance  
14 to vulnerable New Yorkers because we have slashed  
15 funding for city government. We cannot starve this  
16 beast.

17 It is clear that the mayor's five years as a  
18 Republican are more indicative of his politics today  
19 than any other period in his life. He is more  
20 aligned with our colleagues on the Republican side of  
21 the aisle than this Democratic conference.

22 We have to fight back. Today, he said that he  
23 wants our discretionary funds to be used, instead of  
24 the taxpayer dollars currently being used, to give  
25 migrants things like MetroCards. That is offensive

2 and wrong on every level. We are proud to welcome  
3 immigrants, and he might want to realize that  
4 discretionary funds are also taxpayer dollars.

5 So we are all here together to support New  
6 Yorkers in need. And it's time that we fight back  
7 against the mayor and his austerity politics once and  
8 for all. Thank you.

9 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, we'll go to  
10 Councilmember Brooks-Powers and Councilmember Won.

11 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. I just  
12 wanted to mention them Introducing several bills  
13 today. First Intro 855, which I'm proud to prime  
14 sponsor along alongside co-prime sponsors Farias and  
15 Cabán.

16 This bill closes a major loophole in the city's  
17 campaign finance law. Currently independent  
18 expenditures in support of opposition to a candidate  
19 are subject to reporting and notice requirements.  
20 These vendors have to be transparent about where the  
21 money is coming from. But those who spend money on  
22 ballot proposals aren't subject to these  
23 requirements. This law would get rid of this  
24 discrepancy and improve transparency in our local  
25 elections.

2 The second bill I'm introducing today is Intro  
3 854, which would require DOT to daylight a minimum of  
4 100 intersections annually, with a priority on  
5 intersections that experience more crashes each year.  
6 Daylighting means preventing parking near an  
7 intersection. This allows drivers and pedestrians  
8 alike more visibility at crossings, and discourages  
9 drivers from cutting corners quickly. data suggests  
10 that installing daylighting features, improves street  
11 safety and reduces the likelihood of an accident at  
12 our intersections.

13 I'm proud to be introducing these bills and  
14 encourage my colleagues to join as co-sponsors.  
15 Thank you.

16 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. And finally,  
17 Councilmember Won.

18 COUNCILMEMBER WON: Thank you so much Majority  
19 Leader. I just want to stand in solidarity with my  
20 colleagues in speaking out against the budget mod  
21 austerity measures, because it's clear when you take  
22 funding away from resources, especially for  
23 nonprofits that are contracted out to do the work  
24 that our agencies simply are not able to do right  
25 now, there are real consequences. We just had

2 someone pass away from suicide, because they were not  
3 able to receive mental health services in their  
4 language or just overall. And we just heard from the  
5 Chair of Mental Health of how important it is that we  
6 do not cut funding for mental health at this moment.

7 So in addition to everything that we heard of DOE  
8 having \$80 million cuts, CUNY having \$12 million cuts  
9 and so much more, we cannot stand by as the mayor now  
10 is proposing that we cut \$563 million from  
11 discretionary, which is already what we have said is  
12 barely enough to serve our city, and every single one  
13 of us would use our discretionary funding to help our  
14 neighbors in our own districts, and we cannot stand  
15 by as he continues to make these threats. This is  
16 not a mayor for the people, and this is truly not  
17 acceptable. Thank you so much.

18 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. And do we  
19 have anyone else signed up. I think everybody took  
20 their time to speak today. I just want to echo many  
21 of my colleagues sentiments about what's ahead in  
22 2023. But also want to just say a very big thank you  
23 to the Speaker and all the staff here for a very  
24 productive and challenging 2022. We know 2023 is  
25 filled with many more challenges, but looking forward

2 to serving alongside everyone, and thank you for a  
3 very productive year.

4 With that, I'll give it back to Madam Speaker.

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you majority leader I wish  
6 all of my colleagues a happy healthy holiday season,  
7 prosperous new year. Let's get it together. We got  
8 a lot to look forward to in 2023, and I can't think  
9 of a better group to do it with. God bless you. The  
10 stated meeting of December 21, 2022 is hereby  
11 adjourned.

12 [GAVEL]

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 28, 2022