

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC
HOUSING

----- X

Wednesday, December 14, 2022
Start: 10:15 a.m.
Recess: 1:20 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway Committee Room,
14th floor

B E F O R E: Alexa Avilés, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Diana Ayala
Charles Barron
Carmen N. De La Rosa
Chi A. Ossé
Lincoln Restler
Pierina Ana Sanchez
Julie Won

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Keith Grossman
Senior Vice President
Operations Support Services
New York City Housing Authority

Javier Almodovar
Senior Director
Heating Management Services Department
New York City Housing Authority

Brian Honan
Senior Vice President
Intergovernmental Affairs
New York City Housing Authority

Joy Sinderbrand
Senior Vice President
Capital Programs
New York City Housing Authority

Vlada Keniff
Senior Vice President
Sustainability
New York City Housing Authority

Aixa Torres
Resident Association President
Alfred E. Smith Houses

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning and welcome to
3 the New York City council hearing of the Committee on
4 Public Housing. At this time, can everyone please
5 silence your cell phones? If you wish to testify
6 today, please come up to the sergeant's desk to fill
7 out a testimony slip. Written testimony can be
8 emailed to testimony@council.nyc.gov. Again, that is
9 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Thank you for your
10 cooperation. Chair, we are ready to begin.

11 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Good morning, everyone.
12 This meeting is coming to order. Good morning and
13 welcome to the hearing of the Committee on Public
14 Housing. I am Councilmember Alexa Avilés, and I
15 Chair the Committee on Public Housing. I'd like to
16 thank you all for attending this oversight hearing to
17 examine NYCHA's winter readiness. This topic is
18 especially important and timely now that we have
19 fully moved into cold weather, and with the coldest
20 months of the season yet to come. We are joined we
21 are soon... Is there anyone online? Oh, okay.

22 It is no secret that NYCHA has struggled to
23 adequately provide heat and hot water to its
24 residents. In fact, it has been such a struggle that
25 heating is one of the reasons a federal monitor was

2 appointed to oversee NYCHA. According to the most
3 recent quarterly report issued by the monitor, NYCHA
4 has seen some improvements since it began
5 implementing its heating action plan. Yet we
6 continue to hear horror stories of tenants suffering
7 because their heat has been out for so long, and for
8 stretches of time. For example, Woodside houses has
9 had persistent heat issues since Hurricane Ida, and
10 overall last heating season there was a sharp uptick
11 in outages compared to the previous heating season.
12 There was also an increase in the duration in the
13 time of outages.

14 The monitor's report found that NYCHA failed to
15 fully implement its summer preventative maintenance
16 program in 2021, and that staff and NYCHA's heating
17 department failed to follow the procedures for
18 logging maintenance and inspection work. This likely
19 led to the to worse heating conditions last summer,
20 and who knows what the impact of this will be this
21 season?

22 Today I'm interested to learn how prepared NYCHA
23 is for the present heat season. I want to learn in
24 detail what improvements NYCHA has made to its
25 Heating Management Services Department operations,

2 how NYCHA is better monitoring the work of employees
3 and contractors, and whether NYCHA has successfully
4 completed its preventative maintenance program this
5 summer, and more.

6 The law requires minimum indoor temperatures
7 during heating season. This is required whether it's
8 a private landlord or NYCHA. All New Yorkers,
9 whether residents of public housing or other housing,
10 have the right to safe and habitable housing, and
11 that includes heat and hot water as required by law.
12 If any other landlord is required to ensure their
13 tenants receive adequate heat, there's absolutely no
14 reason we shouldn't expect the same from NYCHA. And
15 listening to the weather forecasts, we are certainly
16 moving into a very cold winter over the coming week,
17 and we must ensure that residents are safe and secure
18 and that we are ready.

19 I would like to thank my staff Christina Botego,
20 Edward Cerna, James Neumeister, along with a public
21 housing committee staff, Audrey Sun, Jose Conde,
22 Ricky Chowla, and Connor Meili, for all the work that
23 they've put into this hearing.

24 And with that, we will turn it over to... to
25 committee counsel.

2 COUNSEL: I will now administer the oath to the
3 administration. Please raise your right hand.

4 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth
5 and nothing but the truth in your testimony before
6 this committee and to respond honestly to
7 Councilmember questions?

8 ALL: I do.

9 COUNSEL: Thank you, you may begin when ready.

10 MR. GROSSMAN: Morning, Chair Avilés members of
11 the Committee on Public Housing and other
12 distinguished members of the city council, NYCHA
13 residents, community advocates, and member of the
14 Public Good morning. I am Keith Grossman, NYCHA
15 Senior Vice President for Operations Support
16 Services. I am pleased to be joined by Javier
17 Almodovar Senior Director of the Heating Management
18 Services Department, and Brian Honan, Senior Vice
19 President for Intergovernmental Affairs, and other
20 members of the NYCHA team.

21 We share your belief that NYCHA residents should
22 have adequate and consistent heat in their homes.

23 Thank you for this opportunity to discuss the
24 advances we have made over the past several years to

2 improve the delivery of heat and hot water services
3 to residents.

4 While there is more that must be done, the puck
5 the progress can be summarized this way: Through
6 targeted operational investments and improvements to
7 process and management, we have brought down the
8 number of heating outages by 37% this heating season,
9 compared to the same period of time last year.
10 Additionally, we have reduced the time it takes to
11 restore heat outages in that same time period by 13%
12 from eight hours to seven hours.

13 Our progress is guided by our federal-monitor-
14 approved action plan, which outlines the procedures
15 and protocols we follow to prevent and respond to
16 outages. The action plan also details how we
17 communicate with residents about outages and repairs,
18 provide warming centers in certain scenarios, and
19 investigate outages that cannot be restored within 12
20 hours. Along with this master action plan, we
21 created individual Heating Action Plans for every
22 NYCHA development, which outlined custom solutions
23 for each developments unique challenges. Our goal is
24 to restore heat within an average of 12 hours
25 overall, within 24 hours of 85% of heating outages,

2 and always within 48 hours. So far, this heating
3 season we have exceeded these targets resolving all
4 heat outages within 24 hours and within an average of
5 seven hours. Please note that an outage pertains to
6 a total disruption of service on an entire apartment
7 line hallway building section of a development or
8 entire development. Outages may be planned for
9 scheduled maintenance or unplanned due to unforeseen
10 emergencies. In the event of a planned outage, NYCHA
11 notifies residents in advance via robocalls and
12 notices posted throughout the development.

13 I would now like to walk you through some of the
14 specific work we have accomplished to better deliver
15 heat services to residents.

16 To prepare for each heating season, our Heating
17 Management Services Department, HMSD, conducts annual
18 preventative maintenance to preserve and restore the
19 reliability of nearly 5000 pieces of heating
20 equipment. This involves cleaning, lubricating,
21 adjusting, repairing and replacing worn components,
22 and ensuring that equipment and mechanical areas are
23 unsatisfactory operating condition. In preparation
24 for the current heating season, HMSD and our vendors
25 performed annual preventative maintenance and made

2 repairs where applicable to 99.9% of all heating
3 equipment. Additionally, we engaged a vendor to help
4 conduct preventative maintenance on some of the
5 boilers citywide, enabling HMSD staff to focus on
6 repairs to the heating distribution system. To
7 clarify, boilers and/or hot water and units generate
8 heat or hot water, and the distribution systems such
9 as vacuums, tanks, pumps and pipes deliver heat to
10 residents' homes.

11 Each year we develop a list of critical heat and
12 hot water equipment and systems that need replacement
13 or extensive repair, and we procure extra parts so
14 that we are prepared when key items fail. For the
15 past three years we have invested a total of \$49
16 million in operational funding in our heating
17 infrastructure before the heating season has even
18 begun. We maintain a reserve of staged and non-
19 staged mobile boilers that can be activated in the
20 event of a large scale heating service disruption.
21 There are currently 33 mobile boilers in total, of
22 which 25 are connected to developments and eight can
23 be deployed when needed. We also increased staffing
24 coverage ahead of the winter season winter heating
25 season by adding evening plumbing teams and

2 electrical teams available to be deployed in response
3 to outages. Additionally, an overnight 12 to 8am
4 Plumbing team is added when temperatures are below 32
5 degrees.

6 For this heating season, we increased our
7 headcount. We have hired additional field
8 supervisors, and are in the process of hiring 70
9 permanent maintenance workers to support the
10 reorganization of HMSD into a neighborhood-based
11 model. As part of NYCHA's transformation efforts,
12 the heating neighborhood model will reorganize our
13 coverage of developments from the current 13 clusters
14 into 25 neighborhoods. Smaller portfolios will
15 enable each field heating superintendent and
16 administrator to fully understand the needs of each
17 heat and hot water system within their neighborhood.
18 Neighborhoods we led will be led by a Field Heating
19 Superintendent who will report to the Heating
20 Neighborhood Administrator or HNA. The HNA will
21 report to one of three Field Operations Deputies and
22 ultimately to the head of HMSD.

23 We will establish a data analytics unit that will
24 use key performance indicators to identify and track
25 areas where we need to improve. A planning and

2 skilled trades unit will address patterns of heat
3 complaints and service disruptions before and during
4 the heating season. HMSD special teams, composed of
5 highly experienced heating staff, will address the
6 more complex issues that arise and perform
7 preventative maintenance and repairs. The chief
8 benefit of this reorganization is that crucial
9 decision making which occurs during an outage is
10 moved closer to the root of the issue. Additionally,
11 NYCHA's heating staff will gain a deeper
12 understanding of a particular development's needs and
13 challenges, work orders and resources will be better
14 distributed, and there will be greater collaboration
15 between residents, NYCHA staff and community
16 organizations.

17 This new staffing model will also align
18 additional managerial employees to the evening heat
19 desk operations, streamlining decision making for
20 issues that arise after traditional business hours
21 and during weekends and holidays.

22 In sum, the heating neighborhood model will
23 increase accountability, oversight and efficiency
24 promoting more hands on management of our heating
25 assets and for faster resolution of issues. This

2 reorganization builds on the increased oversight
3 created by the heat desk, which is a 24/7 operation
4 established that monitors potential service
5 disruptions from various data and dispatches staff
6 accordingly.

7 Other ways we improved heat services for
8 residents include implementing a 24/7 staffing model
9 for repair teams, establishing or activating the
10 situation room when necessary to expedite service
11 restoration, and enhancing our staff training.

12 Additionally, we have modernized heating controls
13 at 48 developments, which involves the installation
14 of a building management system and apartment
15 temperature sensors. We are in the process of
16 completing this work at an additional 12
17 developments. Apartments that were typically
18 overheated are now at a more comfortable range of 72
19 to 74 degrees during the day and 69 to 71 degrees at
20 night. With the heat coming on in cycles to prevent
21 overheating and underheating and to reduce energy
22 costs. We can also monitor building temperatures and
23 heating systems and hot water systems in real time at
24 these developments. We also enhanced our
25 communication with residents and that involves

2 ensuring that residents are notified of outages
3 through building fliers and robocalls, enabling
4 residents to automatically let us know if they are
5 still experiencing a service disruption when they
6 receive a service restoration robocall. We can then
7 address any lingering issues. And posting
8 information about outages on our website and social
9 media. Residents can also get notifications about
10 outages on their smartphones via our upgraded MyNYCHA
11 app.

12 We added additional triage questions that
13 residents are asked when they submit heat complaints
14 via the Customer Contact Center, CCC, or MyNYCHA app.
15 With this additional data, we can more effectively
16 deploy the appropriate staff to complete repairs. We
17 do request that all residents report issues they are
18 experiencing through either the CCC or MyNYCHA app,
19 so we can most effectively identify and respond to
20 issues.

21 The challenge and their solutions: Our heating
22 operation is vast, and our infrastructure and
23 buildings are old. Despite the improvements to the
24 way we work, aging infrastructure remains a
25 significant obstacle. The average age of our boilers

2 is 26 years old, beyond the 20 to 25 year average
3 expected useful life of a boiler. Beyond boilers, it
4 is often issues with heat distribution systems and
5 heating components that cause outages. That is why
6 our work of boiler overhauls and preventative
7 inspections and maintenance is critical to the
8 delivery of heating services to residents. We have
9 identified funding to address some of the issues.
10 Through 2026, we are replacing 346 boilers across 76
11 developments, thanks to \$3.4 billion in city state
12 and federal funding. We will address an additional
13 nearly 900 boilers at over 100 developments through
14 the PACT program by 2026. Since 2019, we have
15 replaced 82 boilers through capital projects, and
16 addressed over 250 boilers through PACT.

17 And we're not just replacing in kind but are
18 putting in place more effective systems. For
19 instance, to improve hot water service, we are
20 incorporating modern designs in our new heating
21 plants, decoupling hot water equipment from heating
22 equipment so that issues with one do not affect the
23 other. Where possible, we are moving away from steam
24 generating hot water systems by developing geothermal
25 energy and electric heat pumps, and improving the

2 building envelope through window replacements,
3 advancements that help reduce outages, enhance
4 systems performance, benefit the environment, and
5 keep residents safe and comfortable.

6 Through the Clean Heat For All Challenge, a
7 collaboration between NYCHA, the New York Power
8 Authority, and the New York State Energy Research and
9 Development Authority, an additional \$70 million
10 investment will result in the development and
11 production of 30,000 new heat pumps for NYCHA
12 residents. This environmentally friendly, easily
13 installable technology will provide reliable heating
14 and cooling for thousands of residents. We invested
15 more than \$300 million in energy performance
16 contracts, replacing boilers, and modernizing heating
17 systems at 70 developments. We are also taking
18 advantage of direct-install programs, where local
19 vendors repair and replace apartment radiator valves
20 and traps at no cost to NYCHA. The work is funded by
21 the local utilities. These efforts improve steam
22 distribution and residents comfort.

23 But for the bulk of our portfolio, the aging
24 infrastructure presents near daily challenges, and
25 there is no funding to address it. Through

2 preservation programs like PACT and the trust,
3 however, we can generate the funding needed to
4 provide residents with fully upgraded heating systems
5 and improve quality of life.

6 In conclusion, one of our top priorities is to
7 ensure that residents have adequate and consistent
8 heat. NYCHA is committed to continuous improvement,
9 to overcome the challenges that are inherent to
10 managing aging buildings, which have been underfunded
11 for decades and become a better landlord for our
12 residents. That means looking back to see where we
13 need to improve operationally as we do each heating
14 season. It also means looking ahead to see where we
15 can strategically invest our limited funding, and how
16 we can raise the significant funds needed through
17 innovative approaches like PACT and the trust.

18 While we may not yet be where we need to be, we
19 are making progress. As the federal monitor, Bart
20 Schwartz, stated in his recent reports, "NYCHA has
21 made significant upgrades to its overall heating
22 program, which among other things led to a much more
23 effective offseason maintenance program this past
24 summer." He also said, "These planned improvements
25 represent a substantial commitment by NYCHA to

2 improve its heating services." NYCHA has quickly
3 begun work on many of these initiatives, including
4 obtaining funding for much of the proposed staffing
5 increases and revamping its entire heat staff
6 training process.

7 The council's partnership is vital to our
8 continued progress. We thank you for your support as
9 we work to improve the quality of life for NYCHA
10 residents. And we are happy to answer any questions
11 you may have. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much for your
13 testimony. And I'd like to recognize our being
14 joined by Councilmember Barron. Thank you,
15 Councilmember.

16 Okay, great. So I think we'll... we'll jump into
17 some questions.

18 So I certainly have some questions related to
19 your... to the testimony that you just provided to
20 us. But I'm going to kind of go back to some basics
21 first.

22 Can you tell us: How does NYCHA identify issues
23 with their heat operations before a significant
24 outage occurs?

2 MR. GROSSMAN: So thank you for your question,
3 Chair, and thank you for the opportunity to provide
4 testimony. We... Through... Through constant...
5 Through our... Through our summer overhaul program,
6 we identify areas that potentially have need, by
7 identifying these critical items and infrastructure,
8 that need replacement. In doing so we're able to
9 kind of target where we need to have extra attention.

10 Additionally, after every heating season, we
11 compile a list of our 25 worst performing plants.
12 And in doing so, we put extra resources into those
13 plants the following overhaul season. It's
14 predictive, and it allows us to attempt to solve the
15 problem before it happens.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So in terms of... in terms
17 of all the... the mechanisms... all the mechanisms
18 across the NYCHA portfolio are... are asset tagged,
19 and we know the condition? The full inventory has
20 been done on all of the mechanisms across NYCHA?

21 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah. So we're obviously aware of
22 all of our heating equipment. I think one of the...
23 what we're... what we're working on is, you know,
24 tying those into the asset management system, but we

2 are fully aware of all of our heating
3 infrastructures.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. And in terms of...
5 Obviously, a 37% reduction in this heating season,
6 and certainly reducing the time period in this
7 heating season, obviously, is... is a great start.
8 And we hope that we'll maintain it, given that we are
9 still very early, and the cold has yet to truly come.
10 So, you know, I'm glad we're off to a good start this
11 year.

12 How many... You noted 5000 pieces of equipment,
13 but how many boilers are in NYCHA?

14 MR. GROSSMAN: Right. So the 5000... Thank you
15 for your question. Yeah, so the 5000 pieces of
16 heating equipment are represent our heating pumps,
17 vacuum tanks, hot water systems, but the answer to
18 number of boilers is 1281.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And on average, how long
20 does it take to inspect the boilers?

21 MR. GROSSMAN: So I'll ask Javier to give the
22 rundown.

23 MR. ALMODOVAR: Good morning everyone. [clears
24 throat] Excuse me. So the... On average, the
25 overall inspection process takes approximately three

2 to five days on newer equipment, and can take several
3 weeks on our older equipment. And it's pretty
4 much... The amount of time it takes is... is pretty
5 much based on the amount of follow up work that's
6 required. Naturally, our older equipment requires
7 far more follow than our newer equipment, and
8 therefore most of the time is spent with our older
9 equipment.

10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So I would assume that a
11 good proportion of the equipment is older?

12 MR. ALMODOVAR: That's correct.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So on average, it could take
14 several weeks just for an inspection of the
15 equipment?

16 MR. ALMODOVAR: Well, the inspection entails the
17 repairs that are required with that. So when we
18 perform the annual overhaul and inspection process,
19 as Keith mentioned earlier, we... we lubricate, we
20 clean we adjust, we repair and replace worn
21 components to restore the equipment's reliability...
22 um... preserve the equipment's reliability, rather.

23 And in terms of our boilers, that process
24 requires us to take the equipment apart, open it up,
25 clean it internally and externally.

2 Our oldest pieces of equipment are hot-water
3 generators, and primarily our... our boilers as well.
4 And the followup repairs on our boilers can be
5 anything from major boiler welding or extensive
6 plumbing repairs as well.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. And in terms of...
8 I'm sorry, I wanted to go back quickly to that 37%
9 reduction. Does that include both unplanned and
10 planned outages?

11 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you. In terms of... I
13 guess I was wondering -- obviously, we're... we're
14 early in the heating season -- wondering if... if any
15 patterns have started to emerge in terms of the
16 existing or potential heat outages? And what... what
17 might we anticipate for the remainder of this winter
18 season? Obviously, you have your target list of
19 the... I'd love to hear the developments... the top
20 25 developments with the poorest performance. But
21 I'd like to hear more about what you're anticipating
22 this winter season.

23 MR. GROSSMAN: Absolutely. And we can provide
24 that to you after... afterwards as a follow up. So
25 thank you for that. I think that's a great question.

2 So some trends that we are seeing is... Using our...
3 our analytics, we are sending the right folks
4 earlier, and that leads to that lower restoration
5 number. So through the additional questions asked by
6 the CCC through our, you know, knowledge of the
7 heating systems were able to send the right staff
8 based on the repair needed. So that's... that's
9 significant.

10 But what we're seeing as far as what's causing
11 the service disruption is primarily related to our
12 distribution equipment. We talk a lot about boiler
13 replacements and... and how that relates to improve
14 service, but we are putting new boilers into original
15 heat distribution equipment which includes piping,
16 radiators, pumps. Pumps are replaced fairly
17 regularly, but the piping is still most likely
18 original to the building. So where we're seeing our
19 significant outages, they are related to
20 distribution.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Hmm. And in terms of in
22 thinking about the ways all these heating issues
23 arise, I just wanted to... to talk a little bit about
24 Bronx River senior housing development, and the
25 heating issues that they faced in the winter of 2021.

2 It seems that the seniors living in that
3 development didn't have heat for months, and as the
4 winter went on remained unaddressed. Pipes burst,
5 caused flooding in the development. I suspect, the
6 distribution system clearly was in shambles. And I'm
7 sure that for many of the seniors living there, it
8 was probably one of the worst winters they had ever
9 experienced. Can you walk us through a few things
10 related to that instance? Can you tell us what the
11 source of the heating failure was at Bronx River?
12 How did it get to that point where pipes were
13 bursting? Why did the development experience no heat
14 for such an extended period of time? And I have
15 several other questions.

16 MR. GROSSMAN: So I can I can give you the high-
17 level answer for that, Chair. Thank you.

18 So to start with, obviously, the deterioration is
19 rooted in disinvestment over a number of years, and
20 the dire need for that capital funding that we... we
21 had both spoken about in our opening statements.

22 To Bronx River, specifically, it's an older type
23 of system, it's called a hydronic loop. So
24 essentially there is a heating source, right? It
25 provides steam up through the building, and it's a

2 continuous loop. Every time there's a leak, you have
3 to turn the whole system down, you have to repair the
4 leak, and then you have to recharge the system. And
5 often what we find in those older loop systems is
6 that recharging the system needs another... leads to
7 another leak.

8 Also, as I mentioned, this is original piping.
9 Constantly heating, expanding, and contracting,
10 heating and cooling, heating and cooling puts fatigue
11 on those pipes. And what... Again, what we find with
12 the hydronic loop systems across the city was that
13 the constant expansion and contraction can create
14 issues.

15 What we did this year was looked at the
16 developments where there are hydronic loop systems
17 and what we did: We ran a preseason test. We
18 actually pressurized the lines to try to identify any
19 leaks, so we could do a while it was warmer, we could
20 make some repairs. We were fairly... We were fairly
21 successful. We found a leak here, there. We made
22 some repairs. And thus far, you know, we are still
23 seeing some distribution issues. But we're at least
24 a little bit more aware, right?, through that
25 preseason test. So late September, right before the

2 heating season, we pushed that information out as
3 well.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And how many of the systems
5 are this... this loop system? Currently?

6 MR. ALMODOVAR: I don't... Well, we have 669
7 package style boilers. The exact number of loop
8 systems... I don't want to misspeak, I don't have
9 that exactly, but I relate to package boilers to the
10 hydronic loop systems because the package boilers are
11 the ones that support that type of system primarily.
12 But we can... we can. [speaks off microphone to Mr.
13 Honan and Mr. Grossman].

14 MR. GROSSMAN: So I will add to that. The
15 buildings of that age, with that system that we did
16 the pretest on. It was specifically in some of
17 our... with some of our more vulnerable populations.
18 I believe the number -- I will... I will correct
19 after the fact -- was around 10 when we ran we ran
20 those tests. We're going to pull that number for you
21 now.

22 Additionally, you know, there's some you know,
23 just to go back to Bronx River, there are some
24 additional associated plumbing issues related to that
25 building, right?, that were not only heating related.

2 There was you know, leaks in... in waste acts[?] and
3 sewage lines, leaks and domestic hot water lines.
4 And the... the plumbing issues overall, unrelated to
5 heat created, some significant downtime, right?,
6 because we had to shut down the heating system to get
7 into a space where it was too hot, and make it safe
8 for our workers to work.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Right I think... I think
10 what it does is also beg the question on whether a
11 development like the Bronx River, or like where it
12 faired in the queue, and how... how NYCHA uses the
13 criteria of a vulnerable population, right? And why
14 it was allowed to... to get to that point, given the
15 deterioration, given what we know. So how are we
16 using... How are we making those real time
17 assessments? And curious around, like, what
18 temporary relief did NYCHA offer to the tenants in
19 that situation to resolve the problem? Were there
20 temporary boilers that were put in? So, like, how
21 does it... How does it get that bad? Is what we're
22 getting at.

23 MR. HONAN: So I'll let Javier talk about the
24 temporary relief, but... So I think at Bronx River,
25 in addition, it wasn't that... I would say we went a

2 significant amount of time where we were able to
3 provide consistent heat, but it wasn't like there was
4 like weeks where there was no heat. In fact, I
5 remember Christmas Eve specifically, where Javier and
6 I were on the phone like all day, because it was
7 restored out, restored out, restored out. And the
8 reason for that is that if you look at the boiler
9 system, it actually isn't running all that bad, or
10 that uncharacteristic of a NYCHA development. But if
11 you look at the plumbing behind the walls, it is
12 unfortunately even worse than, you know... way worse
13 than even you know most of our developments. It is a
14 complete stack failure. And we... and Javier's team
15 would go out, and they would break walls and replace
16 piping here. But unfortunately, the pipes are so
17 brittle, that once they touch the pipes on you know
18 floor number eight, they break in floor number five.
19 And that's why we are seeing this restoration and...
20 and also outage restoration outage during the course
21 of that day, on Christmas Eve, and it wasn't just
22 Christmas Eve but it's the day that, you know, stands
23 out to me. We must have had five or six outages...
24 you know... restoration outage, restoration outage,
25 to the point where it was, you know, I was even

2 afraid to report it out, because I didn't know how
3 long it would... would hold.

4 To the residents there, we have spent a
5 tremendous amount of time with them, both, you know
6 in public meetings, inside people's apartments. And
7 we are now going to unfortunately have to vacate the
8 building. And we're offering you know tenants
9 relocation. The relocation first will be to Bronx
10 River proper. But other folks have asked for
11 relocation in other NYCHA developments, and other
12 people have said, "You know what, I think I'm ready
13 to start something new," and ask for vouchers. And
14 we have accommodated folks on... on all levels with
15 that.

16 It was incredibly difficult because these are
17 seniors. And you know, we literally sat with
18 meetings where people were, were crying because they
19 were like, it is not only physically difficult, but
20 it's also psychologically difficult to not know what
21 you're going to expect. But Javier's team almost
22 lived at Bronx River Addition, you know, last year.

23 And... But this is something that I fear is...
24 Bronx River Addition is not all that unique. It's
25 just the first one. And NYCHA's biggest problem in

2 many ways is the things we aren't seeing. It's the
3 things that are behind the walls. The plumbing that
4 causes so many issues, not only with heat, but also
5 with mold... with... with, you know, deterioration,
6 you know, in terms of leaks. And with, you know,
7 many other issues that we're seeing that are a result
8 of aging plumbing, that is usually original to the
9 building. And I don't know if... Javier, if you have
10 anything to add.

11 MR. GROSSMAN: So I want to make a quick
12 clarifying statement. So you asked about mobile
13 boilers and how they can help. Mobile boilers are a
14 great piece in the toolbox. But they're only the
15 steam generation part of the puzzle, right?

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Right.

17 MR. GROSSMAN: They don't solve the distribution
18 problem. If they did... we would probably have more
19 of them, right? No. But... But they but they do
20 provide a service, right? They do... They do what
21 they're supposed to do, but we cannot do so without
22 piping in place. I just wanted to clarify that.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: No. Thank you for the
24 clarification. We've been... I'd like to acknowledge
25 my colleagues, Councilmember De La Rosa has joined

2 us, Councilmember Lincoln Restler, and on Zoom we
3 have Councilmember Sanchez and Councilmember Won.

4 So, in terms of, you know... I have talked to
5 several of the remaining Bronx River tenants, and you
6 know, NYCHA has certainly made an effort to meet the
7 tenants where they are, and having the relocation
8 support person on site made a huge difference for the
9 residents there. And so, you know, I know this is
10 very traumatizing for those residents. And, you
11 know, I just keep them at the top of our minds, and
12 hopefully we can continue to make, you know,
13 relocation as painless as possible and as close to
14 what they know as home as possible. So...

15 MR. GROSSMAN: Absolutely. And we have... As you
16 know, there's eleven residents remaining, and we will
17 have staff fully stationed there until they're
18 fully... you know, out, comfortable in their... in
19 their new home.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And what's the timeframe
21 around that? I mean, as we enter again, another
22 potentially terrible winter season, what... what's
23 the remedy for those residents to make sure that they
24 are safe?

2 MR. HONAN: So I think a lot of it is we are
3 really going by an individual family approach in
4 these apartments. And really, you know, making sure
5 that people are ready to go. You know... You know,
6 for some of these, some of these families, this has
7 been their home for... even though it's a senior
8 development, they've lived there for 20 years, in
9 some cases. And so, for instance, we're... we're
10 literally going inside people's apartments and
11 saying, like, "Where is it that you want to go? How
12 is it do you want us to PACT up your stuff?" You
13 know, I mean... "Do you have support in this area?"
14 Because you know, seniors, you know, need to go
15 places where they're close to their... their doctors,
16 they're close to their churches, they're close to
17 their friends and families, and they have a support
18 system.

19 And so working with families individually, it has
20 definitely slowed the process down. But it's worth
21 it because we're going to make sure that people are
22 located in places where they're comfortable with.
23 The fact that we're down to 11 families is really
24 encouraging. And we believe that we will, you know,

2 by this heating season, you know, all eleven will be
3 you know, moved.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. Well, we will...
5 will stay... stay on top of it and tracking it
6 closely.

7 I'm going to ask a few more questions, and then
8 I'd be happy to open it to my colleagues who I know
9 are, are very busy.

10 MR. HONAN: And also, Councilmember, too... we
11 send Councilmember Faras a weekly report, and we can
12 send this committee the same thing, on Bronx River
13 Addition, on the number of families who have been
14 moved this week, and the number of families still
15 pending. So...

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yes, and they have a very
17 active TA, so they're keeping me posted...

18 MR. HONAN: Yes. Norma keeps us busy...

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: ...on progress for sure.

20 Can you... We alluded this... to this a little
21 earlier: What developments are on the worst
22 performance heating lists in terms of their
23 equipment? And what are the plans to replace them?
24 And where are they in the process?

2 MR. GROSSMAN: So I'm actually... I'm going to
3 ask our colleague, Joy Sinderbrand, to talk about
4 our... some of our worst performances, specifically
5 the process to replace those boilers. And then we
6 can... When she when she's answered that part of the
7 question, we'll give you our worst performance from
8 last year.

9 MS. SINDERBRAND: Thank you. I'm sorry, I
10 couldn't be there today. I'm unfortunately sick.
11 But I really appreciate the opportunity to talk about
12 the work that NYCHA is doing to improve its heating
13 portfolio...

14 COUNSEL: Yes, thank you. I'm sorry. I don't
15 mean to interrupt, but I do need to re-administer the
16 oath before you give your response to the to the
17 question. If you can bear with me.

18 Please raise your right hand. Do you affirm to
19 tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the
20 truth and your testimony before this committee? And
21 to respond honestly, to Councilmember questions?

22 MS. SINDERBRAND: I do.

23 COUNSEL: Thank you so much, you can proceed.

24 MS. SINDERBRAND: So Keith, thank you for handing
25 that over. I wanted to start off by saying, NYCHA is

2 really committed to making as many investments as
3 quickly as possible in the developments that that are
4 in need of them.

5 As Keith and Javier have talked about, there
6 really is a very long list of developments that have
7 been underfunded, and underinvested for... for
8 decades. And so the progress that we're making is
9 really aligned with our goals in the HUD agreement.
10 Since we signed that agreement in 2019, we have made
11 3... we've had over 360 boilers replaced between
12 NYCHA and our PACT program. And then we have another
13 700 that are in the queue at 108 developments, both
14 for NYCHA-managed properties and through the PACT
15 program. So we're... we're really looking by 2026 to
16 make sure we've addressed the... the worst of the
17 heat and hot water systems.

18 I think what's critical is -- is back to the
19 example that you gave Councilmember -- is that
20 replacing the boiler doesn't necessarily solve all
21 the problems. And we do need additional investment
22 for these developments to make sure that the
23 distribution systems at the development and the
24 support systems for the heating portfolio can really
25 serve the residents.

2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much, Joy. Can
3 I... When you say there are 700 in the queue, what
4 does that mean, specifically? And what I'm really
5 looking for us to understand: What is realistically
6 and feasibly going to be addressed in this, you know,
7 coming calendar year? I think... I think residents
8 hear they're in the queue that is unending, and they
9 experience... you know, they continue to experience
10 kind of outages. So can you tell me specifically:
11 What is going to be targeted and addressed in this
12 coming heating season?

13 MS. SINDERBRAND: Well, some... Let's talk about
14 the calendar year, because we... we tend not to
15 necessarily do the most impactful part of heating
16 replacement work during the heating season, because
17 we want to make sure residents have... have
18 consistent and reliable heat.

19 But I gave two categories of investments. So the
20 NYCHA-managed portfolio is under a commitment through
21 the HUD agreement to have 346 boilers replaced by the
22 end of 2026. And, you know, we've been using this
23 boiler replacement number, but I actually want to
24 reinforce that we're actually moving away from one-
25 to-one boiler replacement, from centralized boiler

2 plants. We're moving towards some of the more
3 sophisticated and energy-efficient equipment that
4 that Keith described, and that we're glad to describe
5 some more, so that residents have really the latest
6 state of the art technology, both through their...
7 their heating systems, if it's for a building or
8 development, but... but sometimes it's going to be
9 apartment-based, so really serving the individual
10 apartment. And that's a really critical shift for
11 NYCHA.

12 We're looking at that NYCHA portfolio and major
13 capital work to get 121 boilers... 121 more boilers
14 done in calendar year 2023. And that gets us on
15 track... that has us on track to meet the HUD
16 agreement goal of 346 boilers in 2026.

17 The other number I gave is the number that NYCHA
18 is doing with its partners in the Permanent
19 Affordability Commitment Together Program. And so
20 there's another 100 developments that are getting,
21 you know, 700 boilers. These developments tend to be
22 smaller buildings that have individual boilers in
23 their buildings. That's why there's so many boilers
24 for... for that number of developments.

2 But really, the goal is to hit as many
3 developments as possible as quickly as possible,
4 recognizing, as I think your... your implying that
5 the market does have a constraint, and we have to
6 phase this out so that it can be done realistically
7 with... with the budget we have and with the market's
8 capacity to actually construct these.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And in terms of the boilers
10 that are in the... those developments that are in the
11 PACT program, those aren't necessarily improvements,
12 who are capitalized by NYCHA. That is the private
13 management company, right?

14 MS. SINDERBRAND: Well, I think what I want to
15 sort of make sure we're recognizing is that residents
16 are going to have improved heating system. And
17 whether that's constructed through NYCHA's Asset and
18 Capital Management Division, or whether that's done
19 through a partnership with PACT, or whether it's done
20 through a pilot program with NYSERDA or NYPA, we're
21 getting these systems rolled out as quickly as we
22 can. And so the goal is to have all of those
23 parallel channels happening at the same time, so that
24 we can get residents the improvements they need as
25 quickly as possible.

2 MR. HONAN: And I think the point Joy... Joy,
3 you know, makes so well is that we're taking
4 advantage of wherever we can get funding. So whether
5 it is through state funding, through funding that
6 came with the federal agreement, whether it is
7 through weatherization funding that comes from the
8 state, whether it is partnerships with NYSERDA, or
9 partnerships with... with PACT. And yes, you know,
10 the PACT deals are not necessarily investments that
11 NYCHA made, but they're making a huge difference, you
12 know, for the residence who benefit. Councilmember
13 Restler, you know, joined us forever in his district
14 at Independence Towers. There were mobile boilers
15 there that were... Whenever the temperature, you
16 know, dip below 32, we had a crisis. You know, I
17 knew that we were sliding down poles when Rabbi
18 Niederman, would, you know, get in touch with me and
19 say we have an issue at independence. And it also
20 burned really dirty. So it was almost like we had a
21 locomotive running in front of this building. And we
22 now have a cleaner system. It's providing consistent
23 heat. And the residents don't say, "Well, did NYCHA
24 make this investment? Or did you know a private
25 entity make the investment?" What the residents care

2 about is that they're comfortable in their apartment.
3 And, you know, that's the goal.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah. No, without question.
5 Clearly, that's not a point of contention, as
6 ensuring that residents get what they need. I think
7 what I'm... what I'm particularly wanting to
8 desegregate here is the constant call for the need
9 for capital. Right? And there are... When... When
10 developments are moved into the RAD PACT, right?, it
11 shifts... it shifts the burden of that capital repair
12 to the private management companies, right?, which
13 effectively would allow NYCHA to shift its funding to
14 a more concentrated group of developments, right? So
15 your pie... the pie that NYCHA is managing isn't
16 necessarily decreasing. That doesn't mean the needs
17 are not increasing, but your pie is not decreasing.
18 And so I think, what I'm trying to drive as well:
19 That is important. And we want every resident
20 regardless of the financial status that provides
21 capital repairs, to make sure they have safe and
22 healthy homes and heated homes.

23 I want to get a better grip on what NYCHA is
24 doing with the capital resources that it currently
25 has, and how it is effectively targeting, right?,

2 certainly, the... the worst performers, we also know
3 that... that those developments that were moved into
4 RAD and PACT are also not the worst-performing
5 developments, right?, the ones that need the most
6 care, although certainly needed care, as you point
7 out, in Independence.

8 So I think... That's what I... That's what I
9 want clarity on this aggregating here. How much of
10 the portfolio that is under duress, under NYCHA's
11 direct hand, is getting addressed?

12 MR. HONAN: So, you know, especially with state
13 and city funding, what... you know, what we look to,
14 with the investments that were made, you know, in
15 those portfolios, each of our boilers are marked...
16 graded, with 5 being like the worst performer, way
17 past its shelf life, you know, needs investment
18 yesterday, and 1 being a, you know, a boiler plant
19 that is operating, you know, you know... it's a
20 pretty modern system and it is in good shape. So
21 when we worked it out with the state and we worked
22 out with the city on where they're going to invest
23 the money, we give them our 5's and 4's:
24 Developments that already past their shelf life or
25 approaching that. And that's what we want to make

2 sure that investment was targeted to. And so we saw,
3 you know, many plants where, you know, they had, you
4 know, five boilers, and three of them already
5 offline. And we're... we're like, holding the whole
6 thing together with duct tape and glue. But those
7 are the places where we're going to see, you know,
8 investment.

9 So it wasn't just... You know, we wanted to make
10 sure that we had a... a metric of where the
11 investment was going, it wasn't just going to the, to
12 the loudest voices, it was going to where there was
13 the most need.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Will you be providing the
15 council with that list? And I'd love...

16 MR. HONAN: Sure.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: ...I want... I really want
18 to understand specifically, of these 121 boilers that
19 we expect to come online in 2023. And I do
20 understand that that is not the complete picture to
21 ensure heating. So I will... I heard you, I heard
22 you. But in terms of those 121, you know, the 5...
23 are these all 5's and 4's? And where are they
24 specifically in, you know... in the entire portfolio?
25 I'd like to know, development-specific information.

2 MR. HOFFMANN: Sure. I'm going to go back to Joy
3 on that.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: You're on mute, Joy.

5 MS. SINDERBRAND: Thank you. I couldn't unmute
6 myself. Sorry about that. Thank you for that
7 question. I really appreciate the opportunity to
8 talk about our capital planning process.

9 So as... as Brian mentioned, as NYCHA gets access
10 to funding, we have a rubric that allows us to really
11 highlight the developments that have the most need,
12 and this takes into account outage information that
13 we have from the Customer Care Center, it takes into
14 account that the information that Javier and his
15 staff can bring to us based on where they're
16 investing the most of their time and their money to
17 keep the systems going. We also have complaint
18 information, and then we use That to prioritize
19 developments.

20 One of the things that we're doing, mentioned
21 being strategic, is we're aligning our prioritization
22 goal development with our understanding of the PACT
23 pipeline. So really trying to make sure that that
24 we're addressing and development either in one

2 pipeline or the other, and keeping those projects
3 moving.

4 At this point, though, there are certainly
5 additional developments that... that need investment
6 to the distribution systems and the support systems
7 for the boilers. And we don't have the funding for
8 all of those projects, and so we continue to
9 prioritize using the data sources that we have
10 available.

11 MR. HOFFMANN: If I may add, you know, Joy's team
12 on the capital side, and the operational team --
13 Javier and myself -- we meet regularly. We meet
14 every two weeks. We discuss the ongoing projects,
15 and we understand. So I just... An example of... of
16 this is, if... if the capital team is working on a
17 project, we may refer repairs back and forth between
18 the two. Our worst... Our worst performer with
19 outages last year was Wagner. It wasn't on the
20 capital list necessarily, but knowing that there was
21 going to be no capital funds available, we put op...
22 we made operational investments through different
23 vendors, and provided extra attention. And actually,
24 this year, it's not even on our list of outages.
25 Right? So, by... by providing that extra attention

2 through... through both overhaul and the capital
3 process, we find this... we kind of are trying to
4 strike this balance, where we're putting in the
5 additional work and focusing to make sure that
6 there's you know, constant need. So our top
7 performers last year was Wagner. It's not on the
8 list this year.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So with that, I'd like to
10 turn it over to council... Actually, I acknowledge
11 being joined by Councilmember Diana Ayala, and
12 then... Thank you for being here, Deputy Speaker.
13 I'd like to turn it over to Councilmember Barron.

14 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: Uh, thank you very much
15 Chair. I always appreciate your steadfast, being on
16 top of these issues. This is very critical to all
17 our residents in NYCHA.

18 You know, when I read the reports, and then I
19 live the reality, there's some disconnect. So in the
20 reports, its "improvement here" and "we're doing well
21 here", "we just need a little more money for this and
22 a little more money for that". One thing I do
23 realize is that the federal government, state, and
24 city government are not given enough money to deal

2 with these obligations. And this place is loaded
3 with money.

4 So I'm very angry at the City Council that has a
5 \$94.7 billion capital budget. And there's just a
6 minimal amount given to NYCHA. The state has a \$60
7 billion capital budget, a minimal amount, Chuck
8 Schumer and them talking about \$80 billion, or maybe
9 went from \$40 billion to \$80 billion. And when we
10 don't see that kind of money coming in, it's a
11 problem.

12 On top of that, when money does come in
13 management is a problem at NYCHA. How... I noticed
14 you shake your head at that... oh because... no, you
15 shook your head for not having the money, but I
16 didn't see you shake your head for the management.

17 MR. GROSSMAN: We know... we know sir.

18 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: Did you see the heads stop
19 shaking? I just noticed the heads stop shaking. But
20 management is a problem. You know, I have several
21 developments like Pink Houses, Boulevard, Linden
22 Houses, Brookline, Breukelen, Cypress, Penn Wortman.
23 When they shifted to PACT, they thought everything
24 was going to be so much better. And so far, it
25 hasn't been up to their expectations. We're having a

2 meeting tonight at Linden houses. They did the
3 outside facades to make it look different -- and I'm
4 not sure that little cheap stuff is better than the
5 bricks -- but they did some outside facade instead of
6 painting the bricks and... which is much better than
7 the fake stuff they put up there, and then some
8 inside-the-house little things. But when it came to
9 the boilers, when they first came in they had issues,
10 as you remember, when they first came in. So even
11 though you're saying PACT is providing this -- and
12 then by the way for record, I was against that; I
13 think that we should have resident management. If
14 money can be shifted from Section 9 to Section 8,
15 then resident management and you can get them up to
16 snuff and manage their own residence -- but PACT has
17 been a problem. It's been a real challenge. We're
18 going to face some of those things tonight.

19 So I just want to know: The thing that has been
20 -- for the two decades, I've been dealing with NYCHA
21 -- is the distribution system. That's the big
22 problem. And I see... we mentioned boilers, but
23 boilers are only as good as the distribution system.
24 So if you put the boilers in, and the system isn't
25 right, we have a major, major issue. So I just want

2 to know if you can give me an update on the ones in
3 my development...

4 MR. GROSSMAN: Sure.

5 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: ... and send our office
6 where we have 5's, 4's, you know, 1's, you know,
7 what's happening in my development, and are you all
8 monitoring PACT more, or just assuming, you know,
9 they are doing the right thing?

10 MR. HONAN: So... and thank you Councilmember.
11 I've always appreciated, even... even when you're,
12 you've been hard on us, it always is something
13 that... it's like, "He's right." You know, so it...
14 so we appreciate the... the constant, I would say
15 call to do better. And I think that's what we...

16 I think on the heating side, and I think it's on
17 a lot of things in terms of NYCHA, that we have a
18 two-prong problem, right? We do... You're 100%
19 right. We have a funding problem that everybody
20 knows about. We also have a management problem, as
21 well. And we acknowledge that as well. The heating
22 team, though, I have seen improvements in the way
23 they're managed. And I really do with, you know...
24 with love, for the committee to come to Long Island
25 City, to see the way they are managed, you know, much

2 different. They are using 21st century technology in
3 order to be able to monitor, you know, temperatures
4 inside buildings, you know, without having to send
5 staff, you know, immediately out there. So when they
6 can see it, you know, from Long Island City, it
7 definitely helps. It's 24 hours now. We all
8 remember a time when you know a resident call at one
9 o'clock in the morning, they'd say, "Call back at
10 eight." You know, that's unacceptable. If you're
11 cold at one o'clock in the morning, it doesn't matter
12 if you have cold then or if you are cold at one...
13 you know, 1 pm, we need to respond. They are 24
14 hours, seven days a week. They also have more teams
15 that are local. You know, if everybody was based out
16 in Long Island City, and you're all the way out in
17 Canarsie, that is... how long does that take to get
18 out there and get teams out there? So we are doing
19 things, I think, smarter. And on the management end,
20 I think we are definitely handling things.

21 The two developments that you... you know, you
22 mentioned: Pink houses is getting a new boiler
23 system. But the thing that we see at Pink and at
24 Breukelen: They're both huge developments. I mean,
25 just... just... you know, so... so, when you have

2 those developments that are really large, the
3 distribution becomes even more of a problem. Because
4 when you have a central heating plant, and you need
5 to get, I mean, Breukelen, I think is like 17 acres.
6 You know, so getting, you know, the heat from one and
7 the development to the other is a tremendous
8 challenge.

9 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: What about Long Island
10 Baptist?

11 MR. HONAN: Long Island Baptist... um... Mr.
12 Warren complains about a lot of things at Long Island
13 Baptist, but heating isn't something I hear as much.
14 But that is only one building, you know, so that...

15 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: No it's not...

16 MR. HONAN: well, it's like two or three, two or
17 three buildings. Excuse me. It's a much smaller
18 development. So it is, you know, not as much of much
19 of an issue.

20 On the PACT and RAD, we're one year on PACT and
21 RAD in your district. We do monitor them closely. I
22 usually think on those projects that it is usually
23 the second year we can we really judge them, because
24 they're still... it's still like an ongoing
25 construction.

2 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: Yeah. But the only
3 problem with that is you're judging them on the
4 second year. We're cold on the first year.

5 MR. HONAN: That is true.

6 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: We're cold on the first
7 day.

8 MR. HONAN: I'm not saying that...

9 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: So while you all do these
10 kinds of evaluations... You know, when we look at
11 the macro picture and evaluating things, it's a
12 disconnect from the everyday reality that a resident
13 has to live through. You know how many times I've
14 called you with heating problems...

15 MR. HONAN: Yup, I understand.

16 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: ...and all of that, and,
17 you know, countless times. So while we see all of
18 these studies and all of these reports, and "let's go
19 to Long Island", whatever, every day, it's a real
20 serious problem in NYCHA, and... and I'm just
21 concerned. We're coming up on January and February.
22 And I'm really concerned. Are we're going to do
23 something different than what's been happening thus
24 far? Particularly in the ones of my district,
25 because I have huge developments.

2 MR. HONAN: Yes, you do.

3 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: And when you have huge
4 developments, new boilers, you know, have to be
5 connected to a decaying distribution system.

6 MR. HONAN: That's right.

7 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: And that causes major
8 problems. Something has to be done about that.

9 MR. HONAN: So, I don't imagine anytime in the
10 near future, where we are going to be in a place
11 where we're going to say, "Heating is not a challenge
12 for NYCHA." It will be because of the aging
13 infrastructure. I think where it is on us, and I
14 think where we've made improvements is the way we
15 manage it, is the way we staff it, is the way we look
16 at it from a strategic angle. And I think we're
17 doing that. Those are the areas we're doing better.
18 But it will always be... It will be a challenge, for
19 a number of reasons. Largely, because of, you know,
20 aging, largely also because of, you know, some...
21 some things, but I think, you know, you'll... you're
22 going to see improvements this year compared to last
23 year.

24 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: Well, you know, that's
25 very important because Malcolm X taught us that if

2 someone stabbed you in the back, and the knife is
3 nine inches in your back, and you take it out six
4 inches and say, "Hey, we've got some improvement
5 here," we're still fatally wounded.

6 MR. HONAN: That's correct.

7 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: So we just want to make
8 sure that you don't see your progress as... that we
9 should be dancing in the street about, because...

10 MR. HONAN: I don't think that's what we're
11 saying.

12 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: ...your progress, your
13 improvement doesn't mean that those of us who... and
14 I lived in a NYCHA development. I grew up in the
15 Lillian Wald Houses, and right across the street from
16 Jacob Rees, where they had all those challenges. And
17 I know what it is, you know, to deal with no heat in
18 the wintertime. So...

19 MR. HONAN: Nor do... Statistics don't mean
20 anything to, you know, a senior at Corsi Houses who
21 is really cold.

22 COUNCILMEMBER BARON: Exactly. Exactly.

23 MR. HONAN: You know, so like... You know, so
24 the statistics don't make them feel any warmer. But
25 you know... So our obligation is to make sure that

2 everybody is, you know, with it, you know, in
3 apartments that you know, where the temperatures are
4 above the legal limit.

5 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: Well stay on top of PACT.
6 They are talking a good talk, but the walk is
7 different.

8 MR. HONAN: Okay.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you, Councilmember
10 Barron. I'd like to recognize that we have
11 Councilmember Ossé on Zoom, and I'd like to turn it
12 over to Councilmember Restler for his questions.

13 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Thank you so much Chair
14 Avilés. I really, as always, just appreciate the
15 exceptional job you've been doing leading the Public
16 Housing Committee. We... All... All of our the
17 residents in the 7 NYCHA developments in the 33rd, we
18 appreciate the work that you've been doing here.

19 I... I really want to follow up on what
20 Councilmember Barron was focusing on, which I think
21 is critically important. The highlighting of the
22 replacement of the boilers is really important. And
23 these are vital investments, and NYCHA deserves
24 credit for replacing boilers at meaningful scale
25 across our system. Because, you know, as you noted,

2 Brian... And Brian, I do not understand how you have
3 a personal relationship with every tenant leader in
4 the city of New York, but it is quite... it's really
5 quite impressive. But as you were noting, I've been
6 going to Independence Towers when the heat's gone out
7 since when I had brown hair, which is a long time
8 ago. And you know, it is an extraordinary relief to
9 the residents of those towers to finally have a
10 functional heating system. Nothing brings me more
11 joy than to go down to their new boiler plant, and to
12 see the state of the art investment that they've...
13 they've received, and they're benefiting from. I
14 have lots of concerns about the RAD program. But I
15 am very pleased with the heating infrastructure that
16 we have in that development, and my tenants value it
17 enormously, and rightly so.

18 But what concerns me is when I go to the NYCHA
19 developments in my district, like Gowanus Houses
20 where, finally, we're seeing the boilers replaced,
21 but the distribution system isn't being upgraded.
22 And the resources haven't been dedicated. So you're
23 fixing the boilers. But if we haven't actually
24 invested in the piping and the infrastructure to get
25 the heat out to the buildings in the development,

2 then what's it good for? Right? I mean, it's good
3 for something but it's not good for enough. And
4 we're still going to have issues.

5 I continue in the... You know, I can send you
6 all the text messages I get at Saturday morning at 2
7 am, where we don't have heat in Taylor/Wythe, or
8 where we're having issues in Gowanus. I was out this
9 last year... last year's winter more times than I'd
10 like to... then I can count when we had heating
11 outages at Gowanus. So... Not more times I can
12 count but multiple times. I don't mean to say
13 something inaccurately. So, I appreciate Chair
14 Avilés's highlighting of 121 new boilers being
15 invested in in 2023. Can you speak to the
16 distribution systems for those developments and more
17 comprehensive investments beyond just simply the
18 boiler upgrades?

19 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah, absolutely. Thank you,
20 Councilmember. So to kind of clarify your point a
21 little bit...

22 (background voices)

23 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Sorry. I just have to
24 apologize. These two Councilmembers both grew up in

2 Lillian Wald. Isn't that extraordinary? I didn't
3 know that.

4 MR. GROSSMAN: Really!

5 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: There you go. All right.
6 So we got to do an event to celebrate a Lillian Wald
7 soon. But I apologize. As you were saying.

8 MR. GROSSMAN: So... So... Thank you for that.
9 So we... To kind of compound your point and drive it
10 home, right? So it's not just the piping within the
11 buildings. As we get into these large development
12 structures, we have underground steam leads, right?
13 As you walk around a NYCHA development, you've
14 probably seen them before: The candy cane vent,
15 which is relieving pressure from an underground steam
16 main to avoid undermining. It's significant. It is
17 costly. It is unfunded. And we're... We use these
18 to make sure that the heating system continues to run
19 and prevent any back feed into our boiler rooms.

20 The current tally on... on this... on replacement
21 of these items is about \$37 million. And that's...
22 that's for a number of them across the city.

23 To your second question, I'd actually like to
24 bring in my colleague Vlada Keniff. I think she'll
25 need to be sworn in, if that's okay, to talk about

2 some of our... how we're looking forward with some
3 different systems, whether they be geothermal or some
4 of our heat pump systems that we're very excited
5 about.

6 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Great. So am I.

7 COUNSEL: Please raise your right hand. Do you
8 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing
9 but the truth and your testimony before this
10 committee? And to respond honestly, to Councilmember
11 questions?

12 MS. CANIFF: I do.

13 COUNSEL: Thank you, you may begin.

14 MS. KENIFF: Hello, I'm Vlada Keniff. I'm the
15 Senior Vice President for Sustainability at NYCHA.
16 And distribution has been a huge concern,
17 particularly for my team, as well as combustion-based
18 gas fired boilers. We want to get away from
19 combustion technologies that are original to the
20 vintage of the buildings. And so, you know, as soon
21 as I came into my role, we started to look at
22 alternatives. We've piloted some technologies, and
23 realized very quickly that the clean key technologies
24 that are currently on the market are far more
25 expensive than boiler replacements. And so

2 typically, the budgets that we get only really get us
3 a boiler replacement. And so we quickly realized
4 that if we're serious with Local Law 97 compliance,
5 and really providing clean heat to our buildings and
6 changing them, we would have to essentially change
7 the market. And so we last year had released what's
8 called the Clean Heat For All Challenge to HVAC
9 manufacturers and asked them to create a unit that
10 would actually compete with the cost of boilers, and
11 would be easy to install in our buildings without
12 having to upgrade electrical work. The electrical
13 work is, as many of you know, extremely costly,
14 especially post-COVID.

15 And so we are very proud to say that we had two
16 very qualified respondents, Gradient is a startup out
17 of California, and Midea America, who is an
18 established a HVAC manufacturer, and they've created
19 these really excellent units that are U-shaped.
20 They'll go over a windowsill. And they will provide
21 both heating and cooling. Our first development
22 where we are... have mobilized to do this work, to
23 pilot up approximately 30 of these, of each one of
24 these manufacturers is Woodside. And we are hoping
25 to get through one heating season, make sure that it

2 works with... for residents, it works for our
3 operational staff, it works for our heating
4 departments. And... and our intention is to purchase
5 30,000 of these. They are funded.

6 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: They're funded?

7 MS. KENIFF: They are funded. And we will
8 essentially be creating a market. We have understood
9 that, you know, NYCHA's scale can create a market.
10 And so we carefully crafted the specifications,
11 carefully... carefully worked with the HVAC community
12 to understand what's on the market, what can happen
13 very, very quickly, and then develop a product that
14 is UL listed and tested and is safe, and can provide,
15 again, both heating and cooling and really allow us
16 to get away from having to talk about distribution
17 issues and boilers forever.

18 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Well, that's very
19 promising to hear, and I'm excited to learn more. We
20 would... we are going through a comp-mod process
21 Gowanus and Wycoff right now. We're doing... We're
22 going to be doing work in the next couple of years to
23 improve apartments, kitchens, and bathrooms. It
24 certainly feels like it's the right opportunity for
25 us to also be addressing the heating issues, whether

2 it be through upgrades of the piping, or potentially
3 installation of these new HVAC units that you've
4 described.

5 I'm a huge advocate for heat pumps. I would love
6 to see NYCHA be leading the way in sustainable
7 energy, and think that 30,000 is a big number and is
8 a very positive thing. So excited to hear how things
9 go at Woodside this winter. Maybe Julie will let us
10 come out for a site visit with her, and Councilmember
11 Won, but, you know, this is critically important, and
12 I'm happy to hear that there are some areas of...
13 some positive new developments.

14 We're doing... There's a geothermal tower
15 getting built on the Greenpoint waterfront with 800
16 Plus units that I'm really excited about. If you're
17 ever interested in meeting with the development team
18 there and how they're making geothermal work in New
19 York City, in... you know, it's a new development,
20 but in a new skyscraper, you know, we'd love to
21 connect you... We want to be... You know, NYCHA
22 should be leading the way here. Oftentimes, NYCHA
23 residents are forgotten, left behind, get the worst
24 environmental outcomes on like heating and gas

2 policies. Let's... They should be at the front of
3 the line.

4 MS. KENIFF: Yeah. We also believe in that, very
5 much so, which is why we you know, launched the clean
6 heat for all challenge. We also do have two
7 geothermal installations at Jackson, and... and
8 Eastchester Gardens, for domestic hot water. So
9 we're really, really excited about that. We are
10 pursuing additional funding everywhere that we can.
11 And with the onset of IRA, it is very, very important
12 that we continue to do that.

13 I think also the Clean Heat For All Challenge
14 will allow us to position ourselves to be able to
15 pursue some of that funding that will become
16 available. Again, there's not a ton of information
17 that's available to have certainty around it. But I
18 think that the fact that we are being proactive, puts
19 us in a very good position.

20 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Great. I would love, and
21 I'll shut up. Chair Avilés, thank you for giving me
22 a moment to speak over the time allotted. But I'd
23 love for you to meet with our office in the comp-mod
24 team to discuss how we can integrate some of this
25 work in Gowanus and Wycoff in particular, because it

2 feels like a real opportunity while we have major
3 capital projects happening there.

4 MS. KENIFF: Thank you, Councilman.

5 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Thank you.

6 MR. GROSSMAN: And Councilmember, actually, I
7 would love to take a... bring our heating team out
8 there to see how the... how they're operationalizing
9 once it was installed. That's something that
10 we're... that we're still kind of working through
11 here. So let's see somebody who's successfully using
12 it would be really helpful.

13 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Yeah, we'd love them.

14 MR. GROSSMAN: Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you, Councilmember
16 Restler. I can't underscore enough everything that
17 you just said: NYCHA residents... NYCHA should be at
18 the front of the line. And... and I'd love to hear
19 more around the pursuit of investment in in these
20 technologies and the creation of the market, because
21 certainly with the size and scope and investment that
22 we are going to be asking for, I'd love to hear more
23 specifically what the NYCHA plan... advocacy plan is
24 to request funding, how much funding it's requesting

2 from the federal government and the state government
3 to materialize and expand this work. So thank you.

4 I'm going to turn it over to Councilmember Diana.
5 Ayala.

6 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: Thank you, Madam Chair.

7 Good afternoon. Is it? It's afternoon yet? I don't
8 know. Good morning. It's been a long day already.
9 But my question is regarding -- and I'm sorry if I
10 missed this, but I was at another hearing across the
11 street -- what the number of developments with
12 portable boiler systems is and the number of staff
13 positions assigned to provide oversight of those
14 developments.

15 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah. So the we have 33 mobile
16 boiler assets and 25 are connected to developments
17 currently. I can give you the... I can get the
18 specific... For those specific developments, I could
19 get you those numbers. But we have currently 565
20 heating staff assigned. I'll get you the numbers for
21 the for the mobiles... for the developments with
22 mobiles.

23 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: 565 heating staff?

24 MR. GROSSMAN: Correct. All right. Yeah. I
25 mean, I will say that, you know, independent of

2 what's happening at Wagner, I didn't get as many...
3 my office didn't get as many heating... heat-related
4 calls last winter. I don't know if to attribute that
5 to warmer weather (chuckles), or just because the
6 systems were running some... somewhat better. I hope
7 it's the latter. But I think that my biggest pet
8 peeve here is that the lack of... of communication
9 between NYCHA and you know, the elected officials'
10 offices to just, you know, give us a heads up. I...
11 You know, oftentimes I'm finding out about, you know,
12 the situations in the news. I'll turn on New York
13 One and you know, there's one or two of my
14 developments and I haven't received word from NYCHA
15 that this is happening.

16 And you know, most recently, Brian and I had a
17 couple of conversations regarding Tuft Houses and
18 emergency situation that was occurring, and I'm not
19 sure that it's been, you know, remedied permanently
20 yet, but we had three or four days of outages where
21 the entire building was, you know, had no
22 electricity, which meant that they had no elevators,
23 which, you know, meant that there was security
24 concerns. And so, you know, I think that that level

2 of communication for me is key... is really important
3 in order for me to be able to do what I have to do.

4 For instance, in this, in this case, with, with
5 Taft, there was a serious concern on saf... around
6 safety. The buildings were pitch black, it was, you
7 know, nighttime, and there was no portable light that
8 was put in place to ensure that, you know, people
9 could come in and out of the building. I'm sure as
10 people who are leaving work, and you know, and coming
11 home, they were running into that situation, and it
12 was pitch black. And that's... that's dangerous.
13 And it was just like, I don't... those steps. I you
14 know, I... I have trouble kind of gauging where
15 NYCHA's... You know, what NYCHA's position is, like,
16 right? What is the strategy here for these types of
17 emergencies?

18 MR. HONAN: So quickly on Taft. I think we were
19 learning about that at the same time. So I think
20 that's why, you know, there was no advance notice.
21 Taft was... Those buildings were running on a
22 generator. There were two buildings at Taft that
23 were running on a generator. They are now back on
24 the grid. So we're good. We were good there. But
25 it was a really bad Friday to Sunday where we were

2 having outages and on... on and off. The
3 communication between... You know, we were late...
4 we were definitely late to the communication. But
5 once we did get this going. You know, I had several
6 conversations over the weekend with Beverly, the TA
7 president there. And then on Monday, you know, where
8 she was, you know, really appreciative to you and
9 your staff. And she said... You know, she said to
10 me, at the end, she said, "You know, it's the
11 Councilmembers office and you guys are the only ones
12 I'm talking to. There's some other people here that
13 who are just trying to create some trouble." But you
14 know... But she said that. But... But I think you
15 know, there are... We do try to send elected
16 officials notices when we know of an outage coming.
17 So it's a unpl... you know, it's... if it's a
18 planned outage, but there are some things that happen
19 in real time. And I will, you know, continue to, you
20 know, tell myself and my staff that, you know, we
21 need to do a better job in those cases. But, you
22 know, in that case, when it was pointed out to us, we
23 were... we were able to act pretty, you know, pretty
24 quickly there and went back on the grid there. So
25 I'm... I'm happy with that.

2 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: Now, in regards to the
3 number of outages... heating outages last year, am I
4 correct in I my observation? Were the number of
5 complaints lower last year than they had been in
6 previous years?

7 MR. GROSSMAN: So our... [bell rings] That gets
8 me every time. I used to work for the DOE. You
9 think I'd be used to the bell by now.

10 But yeah. So we are... So we are seeing less
11 outages over... over this period last year. Less...
12 less outages between this year... this year and
13 the... over the same period last year. Did I say
14 that right?

15 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: Mm-hmm.

16 MR. GROSSMAN: We have less outages this year
17 than last year? Okay. Thank you.

18 So we are seeing less. I think just to, you
19 know, to re-clarify again, right?, the outages... the
20 outages... that whole section of a development, a
21 single building a stair hall, an apartment line or
22 hall, you know, those average numbers are down.
23 Maybe we're... Maybe... Are you referring to
24 complaints being higher this year?

2 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: Are they lower? Are
3 they...? You know, I mean, where do they have...? I
4 haven't...

5 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah, they're lower. Right.

6 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: Because, I'm saying... what
7 I'm seeing in our office is that, yeah, we do get
8 them sporadically. Most specifically from like the
9 larger buildings and some of the senior buildings,
10 but not at the rates that I have... that I've seen in
11 the past. Like I mean, I... You guys know we've sat
12 at meeting after meeting, just trying to come up with
13 a strategy to prepare for the upcoming winter. And
14 last year seemed to be pretty quiet. This year, you
15 know, so far it hasn't been that bad.

16 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah, absolutely. And to answer
17 your previous question, we will follow up with
18 those... the staff assigned for mobile boilers will
19 follow up with you afterwards. We're consolidating
20 into those questions.

21 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: So the answer to the
22 question regarding the number complaints...

23 (crosstalk)

24 MR. GROSSMAN: The number of staff assign...

2 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA:no, the number of
3 complaints...

4 MR. GROSSMAN: Oh, I'm... I'm getting to that
5 right now.

6 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: ...so the citywide
7 complaints are down?

8 MR. GROSSMAN: Correct. Yes.

9 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: Okay.

10 MR. GROSSMAN: And I think that... that goes to a
11 lot of what we're talking about, right? We... We
12 have invested additional resources in overhaul. We
13 have adjusted our overhaul... overhaul process. And
14 it goes to something that we started doing this year
15 with some of our sites that have known significant
16 numbers of complaints. We have set up... Brian...
17 Brian's team and... and my team, and Javier's team
18 have been meeting regularly with the resident
19 associations so that we can hear their complaints.
20 And actually, they've led to some resolution, right?
21 We understand that there is a... the G line is
22 constantly having an issue as an example. And now we
23 go in and really focus our efforts on the G line and
24 fix the issue there.

2 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: Yeah. I've always found
3 that interesting, how one side of the building is hot
4 and the other side of the building is cold.

5 MR. GROSSMAN: Right, and each... We could get
6 into the technical answer, of course, but
7 essentially: Right boiler... you know, the steam
8 comes out of the boiler... in a steam generator
9 building, every system works a little differently,
10 but the basic is that it comes out of the boiler,
11 goes into the distribution system, and then goes up
12 risers and those buildings. Each riser typically has
13 a zone valve that opens and closes based on
14 temperature, in BMS buildings and we can manually
15 adjust those.

16 So for example, one side of the building the zone
17 valve... all the zone valves might be working and
18 then one stair... or one line has a zone valve that
19 is malfunctioning. And we can go replace that zone
20 valve.

21 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: Now... I'm sorry, I just
22 have one more question, Chair. The... In regards to
23 the window replacements, because I know that in
24 Corsi... at Corsi houses, for instance, Allie Eason,
25 who's the president there, had like really drafty

2 windows and her apartment was always freezing. And
3 there seems to be some sort of contract to replace
4 all of the windows in that development... well, at
5 least some. And hers was one... her unit was one of
6 those buil... those units that... were the windows
7 were changed. And she said that it was like night
8 and day. There was a significant, you know, change
9 in temperature in her apartment. And so I wonder, is
10 that part of the capital plan moving forward? Is
11 there an ongoing contract to replace, you know,
12 older, draftier windows?

13 MR. HONAN: Yeah. I mean, I think that is a huge
14 issue portfolio-wide, and Vlada could talk about it
15 more. But Corsi is a perfect example. Like, I
16 almost get set my alarm to about usually like
17 Saturday at about nine o'clock at night, where I
18 would hear from folks at Corsi telling me that
19 they're feeling cold. I would tell Javier and his
20 team. They would send folks out there. And they'd
21 say, "Well, it's about 72 degrees and folks
22 apartments." It's true. Both things were true at
23 the same time. People did feel cold, and it was 72
24 degrees in apartments. But because the windows are
25 so bad, it was like, you know, if you were sitting

2 anywhere close to the window, all you felt was that
3 draft.

4 You know, so if we... Again it is: We could
5 have the boilers going. We could even have the
6 distribution system going. But if you have the
7 windows, then all the heat going out the windows.
8 It's... You know, it's like banging your head
9 against the wall. So it's part of a strategy, and
10 Vlada could talk about that more.

11 MS. KENIFF: Yes. Thank you, Councilmember, for
12 that question. We have replaced some windows in a
13 few developments through the Weatherization
14 Assistance Program, state funding, and it is a
15 limited number of buildings, and it does make a huge
16 difference. We recognize that. Windows are very,
17 very expensive. It is a... It is a core part of our
18 Clean Heat For All Strategy. Wherever we are
19 pursuing the window heat pumps, we are also
20 advocating for window replacement funding. We do
21 think it's a critical part of sealing the building.
22 So Woodside will get window replacements, and any
23 other... other subsequent building where we are
24 pursuing the window heat pump strategy will also get
25 window replacements.

2 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: I appreciate that. And I
3 just want to put out there that, like, I get that,
4 you know, you're looking at it from a management
5 perspective. But when we're working with older
6 adults, and you put them all in one building, you
7 should be mindful that older adults typically get
8 colder faster and they get hotter faster because they
9 don't have the same right layer of fat buildup that
10 we do when we're younger. And so that makes them
11 susceptible to... to weather changes. So where it
12 might feel like it's 72... like the weather... the
13 temperature that you're reading may say that is 72,
14 it may feel colder to the older adult population.
15 And I think that making a distinction is really
16 important. Thank you so much.

17 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah, thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much,
19 Councilmember. Unfortunately, Councilmember Julie,
20 Won could not ask her question directly. So this is
21 a question from her. She is on Zoom.

22 "In terms of the Queensbridge Houses, hot water
23 and heat outages have been happening over the last
24 three weeks. Why and how does NYCHA determine
25 maintenance being contracted out?"

2 "And Queensbridge heat and how water maintenance
3 has been contracted to a third party vendor, GHS,
4 instead of utilizing NYCHA's heating plant
5 technicians. It seems that it has been taking even
6 longer to fix."

7 "Also, what is the actual problem for
8 Queensbridge heating plant? And is it on site or is
9 there a heating plan or a third party?"

10 And lastly,

11 "What is the latest update for Woodside houses
12 heating plant? We continue to get complaints for
13 heat and hot water outages."

14 MR. GROSSMAN: Copy. Alright. So I'll start
15 with Queensbridge.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: I can read it again.

17 MR. GROSSMAN: No, no. That's okay. I got... I
18 think I have the... the gist of it. We've... we've
19 spoken about a number of times. So... part of the...
20 the issue with the... the cause of the Queensbridge
21 heat and hot water shutdowns: They're... They're
22 actually planned, scheduled shutdowns typically
23 during the day. We're working closely with our
24 partners at DEP to try to minimize any inconvenience
25 to residents on this, but they're actually doing a

2 water main replacement on the street along Vernon
3 Boulevard. So what we've been... We've had kind of
4 a round of scheduled daily outages. I think what...
5 I think part of the concern that she mentioned with
6 George S. Hall is actually once the... once the water
7 is returned, we go through a process with them, and
8 we're coordinating with property management staff.

9 The outage creation: Let me... let me just talk
10 about outage creation for a second. For a planned
11 outage, right?, DEP or DEC requests that planned
12 outage. Obviously, we grant them that planned
13 outage. We need a water main. We understand. And
14 the property management teams will create that outage
15 and you'll see it on our website, right? There's a
16 little bit of some back end work. But that's how you
17 see it. When service is restored, typically the
18 recharge into the building with that water stream,
19 uh... they're actually physically shutting off water
20 utility to the building, right? So, the recharge of
21 the building with that water stream may move some
22 pipes, adjust some valves.

23 And I think some of the issues that we had
24 initially was the coordination on the... on the
25 return of service. So DEP may have finished a little

2 bit late or a little bit early. And we may have lost
3 communication with the property management staff. So
4 I think what we... what we did kind of initially
5 after that first really long outage was every day
6 have communication with... between property
7 management staff, George S. Hall, heating management
8 staff, and we've actually seen improved... outages
9 have been closed out... both actually closed out by
10 returning service and closed out on the website
11 more... more efficiently. That's something that
12 we've been working on, and it was really a
13 communication issue.

14 That was Queensbridge. As far as Woodside...

15 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: I guess before you before
16 you move on to Woodside: I think that... So you
17 address kind of... maybe a process breakdown that
18 happened. I think what my colleague is asking is:
19 How... How and why does NYCHA choose contractors?
20 And in particular, why was GHS chosen instead of
21 using in-house NYCHA workers?

22 MR. GROSSMAN: For... Specifically for
23 Queensridge, but actually in general, right?, we...
24 understand... understanding that in general, we hired
25 third party contractors a number of years ago, when

2 our with our... with... when we were faced with some
3 low staffing numbers to supplement that and provide
4 the service.

5 As we mentioned in our testimony, our staffing
6 numbers are... were increased this year. Wow that
7 relates to third party sites, we're still evaluating.
8 However, what I want to just kind of note in here is
9 that at this time, we have 54 candidates identified
10 for a maintenance worker position. We are waiting on
11 some start dates and availability for them. We need
12 to schedule some obviously onboarding training for
13 them for the heating department. And we have 13...
14 I'm sorry, 13 HPTs in the pipeline, if I'm reading
15 this correctly.

16 So we're trying to increase that frontline staff
17 and where we can deploy them appropriately as
18 possible. We have the ability to remove a third
19 party vendor once we have the appropriate headcount
20 to cover that site, and we will do so.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So if I'm hearing you
22 correctly, what you're saying is you use them because
23 you had them on contract already, but with...

24 MR. GROSSMAN: We used them because we needed
25 them.

2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: There were there were no
3 allocations to the Queensbridge site of NYCHA staff.
4 They were all deployed elsewhere?

5 MR. GROSSMAN: That's... So yeah, that's
6 actually... Yeah, right. It's a ways out there.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And in terms of... I guess,
8 in terms of that contract in particular, are you
9 suggesting that as you begin to staff up, you can
10 alter that contract? You can stop using contractors
11 at any point in time?

12 MR. GROSSMAN: So, I think that's something that
13 we're evaluating, and we're happy to keep the
14 committee posted on that as... over time. But as we
15 increase headcount, it's... it's potentially a
16 measure that we are exploring, but we've made no
17 decision on it yet.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Are there any NYCHA...
19 Currently, are there any NYCHA employees from the
20 heating unit that deploys specifically to Woodside?
21 Or is it just the contractor? I mean, I'm sorry, to
22 Queensbridge?

23 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah. So we... we obviously work
24 with the vendor, right? So the third party
25 contractor is responsible for the boiler room, and

2 the ancillary equipment like vacuum tanks and pumps.
3 Typically, what would happen is property management
4 staff and property management maintenance workers
5 will handle anything in the apartment, right? It's
6 unfair of us to send a third party contractor to a
7 resident's apartment, recognizing that we want them
8 to work with NYCHA staff directly.

9 On the on-off hours, should we need assistance in
10 an apartment or outside of that boiler room or
11 ancillary equipment space, our heating roving teams
12 will respond to those developments. We don't just
13 leave them in a lurch. That's not how it works.
14 Essentially, just to clarify my previous, you know,
15 third-party vendors -- I think we were I think we
16 were saying the same thing -- but third party vendors
17 result in a more manageable workload for HBTs, and
18 that's why we use them. That was all

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: I thought... Brian did you
20 want to jump in.

21 MR. HONAN: No. I just wanted to say... So, you
22 may remember in 2017 we had a heating season that,
23 you know, made headlines that folks, you know,
24 really... it was a terribly cold winter, but at the
25 same time, too, we were not prepared for it. At

2 that... you know, after that season, we did make the
3 decision to augment our staff, because we were
4 terribly understaffed with... you know, with... you
5 know, with the private partners. In addition, those
6 many of those systems also have newer systems in
7 place where, you know, they were better equipped to
8 manage those boiler plants. But as we're staffing
9 up, it is something that, you know, we have a few
10 seasons behind us, and it's good to evaluate what's
11 working about it, what's not working about it.

12 And also too, you know, whatever we want to move
13 forward with just making sure the rules are defined,
14 because usually what happens is the Tenant
15 Association, or the management staff... you know,
16 people say like, "Well, I know the way it used to
17 work always, but I'm not..." you know, even though we
18 talk, it takes a little while for things to sink in
19 when you change things, and it is just making sure
20 that we're all on the same page.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. Thank you. Um, in
22 terms of in terms of... Let's see, make sure. Oh,
23 you mentioned the water main is being replaced, but
24 did you touch on exactly what the actual problem for
25 the Queensbridge heating plant is?

2 MR. GROSSMAN: So I... So...

3 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Did I get it? Did I miss
4 it?

5 MR. GROSSMAN: Kind of. So what... We need water
6 to generates hot water, right? Without water...

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So it's... it's primarily
8 that. It's...

9 MR. GROSSMAN: It's... Right. It's...

10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it.

11 MR. GROSSMAN: Boiler... Steam... Steam
12 generating boilers require water for feedwater, and
13 when there's no water it's... so it kind of... right?
14 It's a compounding issue. Lack of water when needed
15 to make heat is, you know.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. So I guess what I
17 wasn't capturing there was how much... in addition to
18 the water main replacement, if there was actual
19 problems also with the plant that is... that are
20 being addressed simultaneously?

21 MR. ALMODOVAR: No, we're not seeing problems
22 with the plant outside of that.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay, great. Thank you. In
24 terms of... I guess the update for Woodside Houses
25 heating plant?

2 MR. GROSSMAN: Absolutely. So I'll start with a
3 recap, and thank you for... Thank you, Councilmember
4 Won, wherever you are, thank you for asking this
5 question.

6 So NYCHA completed prior... prior to Ida, NYCHA
7 completed \$1.2 million in operational investments and
8 upgrades to the boiler at Woodside Houses. They were
9 damaged during that storm in September of 2021.

10 As you know, the development has been running on
11 mobile boilers, they have had consistent inadequate
12 heat this heating season. In fact, we added an
13 additional mobile boiler at the end of last heating
14 season working with Council to get that, you know,
15 working with Council, through Council's request to
16 put that in place to provide additional redundancy.
17 There was one building outage that was planned (we
18 were repairing a hot water generator) this year, and
19 there was one single outage this year that... for
20 heat and hot water.

21 So we understand the urgency of the work being
22 done and we continue to invest resources and staff
23 time to get the plant back online. Most recently, a
24 smoke test was conducted on November 18, to ensure
25 that the chimney is able to withstand the smoke that

2 needs to be expelled from the building once the
3 boiler room was brought back online. The smoke test
4 was conducted by a vendor procured by heating
5 management services at a cost of about \$45,000.
6 Unfortunately, the test failed.

7 All of these tests that we have gone through and
8 all of the work that we have done are really to
9 ensure the safety and security of our residents.
10 Obviously, a leaking chimney with boiler output is...
11 is probably not something we want folks ingesting.
12 And that's the reason for all of these tests, right?
13 So we take that seriously. And before we can go back
14 online, all of these things need to be in place.
15 Currently, we're waiting for the materials to make
16 the repair to the chimney liner. They were ordered.
17 And we are waiting for them to come in so that we can
18 make the repair and hopefully clear this final
19 hurdle. I can't give you a timeline because I
20 don't... I... We don't know the... the amount of
21 time we'll take to get the materials in.

22 But I do want to say this: We are providing
23 adequate heat. We have some specific issues with
24 residents in singular apartments. We respond to
25 those issues as we would anywhere else. And we will

2 continue to respond when tickets are put in, and we
3 will continue to work with residents and our resident
4 leadership there. We have done a significant amount
5 of engagement with both... both the Council, and our
6 resident leaders, and our property management staff.
7 And we've really worked as a team there to ensure
8 that they understand every step of what's going on
9 and gather their input.

10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Great. Thank you for that.
11 I hope, Councilmember Won, your questions have been
12 answered. In terms of... Based on the data that
13 we've collected from the NYCHA website, the median
14 hours to resolve an unplanned heat outage increased
15 from 7.35 hours and 2019-20 heating season, to 7.97
16 in the 20-21 heat season, and to 8.4 hours in a 21-22
17 heat season. What do you think is causing this
18 increase?

19 MR. GROSSMAN: So, as I mentioned earlier, we're
20 actually... we're actually coming back down into the
21 seven hour mark. So we've made advances over the
22 past several years to improve the delivery of heat
23 and hot water services to residents. As you know,
24 we're... you know, the legal requirement is returned
25 heat within 24 hours.

2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Right.

3 MR. GROSSMAN: After the monitor... after the
4 monitor agreement was put in place and the agreement
5 was put in place, we agreed to do it in 12 hours,
6 less than everybody else. And we're currently
7 exceeding that by over four hours, in that target.
8 And we aim to continue to improve on there.
9 Obviously, we would all like to sit here and say that
10 there should be no heat outages. We know that's not
11 possible. It's Murphy's Law, things will break, but
12 what our goal is to keep well under that 12-hour mark
13 and at and thus far, as I said, we're about 37% below
14 that.

15 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So again, we applaud 50 days
16 into the heating season, and we have good... good
17 grades. Nevertheless, the monitor's report did note
18 that, I guess, that there wasn't a completion of the
19 summer preventative maintenance program last year.
20 Are these two things connected? And can you speak to
21 that? And explain why did... why that did not
22 happen?

23 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah. So I don't think that... I
24 want to correct the record on that slightly.

25 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay.

2 MR. GROSSMAN: We did... We did complete our...
3 our annual overhaul last year. I think we ran into
4 some issues with it. But this year, we took note of
5 some areas where we were running behind. Right? So
6 we started... we start our distribution earlier. We
7 started... I'm sorry... We started our overhaul
8 earlier. And I'd actually like to give you a full
9 rundown because I think it paints a better picture on
10 what we've... what we've learned from and... and how
11 we've improved that process.

12 MR. ALMODOVAR: Okay. Hello. Thank you for that
13 question. So, we did find that a lot of our problems
14 were distribution in nature last year. And some of
15 the things that we did differently this year, during
16 the annual overhaul process, was, as Keith said, we
17 did start earlier. We started with our hot water
18 units in February. And we have two types of hot
19 water systems. We have the instantaneous hot water
20 heaters. And we have the hot water generators, which
21 are large tanks. We start with the instantaneous
22 units because it does allow us to take one side of
23 the system down because these units have built in
24 redundancies. And it allows us for... for... it
25 allows for us to perform the overhaul process without

2 creating a service disruption. Then from... from
3 there, we moved into boilers in... in April. We look
4 at our larger developments with multiple boilers...
5 with five or more boilers, again, because they have
6 built in redundancies, and it allows us to take one
7 boiler down and perform the overhaul on that
8 equipment. And from there, we moved into our
9 distribution systems in May and continue through the
10 summer months.

11 But as I said earlier, we... we saw last year
12 many outages related to distribution. So what we
13 actually did different this year, we procured a
14 vendor to perform some of the annual overhaul on the
15 boilers at some of those sites where we saw an
16 increase in... in outages related to distribution, so
17 that our staff that would normally perform that
18 portion of the overhaul can focus more on some of the
19 repairs on the distribution side. And that... And
20 that's... that's been helping.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So is the plan moving
22 forward... Is the plan to bring that capacity in
23 house? Or do you expect to continue to use
24 contractors to supplement that capacity?

2 MR. GROSSMAN: So I think... I think we...
3 This... This particular overhaul vendor, the plan is
4 to continue using them and to adjust what they do,
5 right, as... as this is a new process. And like, as
6 you stated previously, we... we are 50 days into the
7 heating season. And we want to see how that process
8 runs, so do a full kind of after-action on that.

9 We do plan on continuing to use that overhaul
10 vendor. But we are through... through those new...
11 that new headcount that we mentioned, we are
12 evaluating not just... Having... Having a lot of
13 staff is great, but we're actually looking at that
14 staff to see what kinds of staff we need, right?
15 There are certain staff with skilled trade
16 backgrounds and certain skilled trades that will be
17 very helpful: Welding, boilermakers, steamfitters,
18 plumbers. As you know, we've increased our plumbers
19 and electricians in just the heating department, but
20 looking to bring the right type of staff on is
21 something that we're very serious about. So that way
22 we can bring that in house, right? There are some
23 things that we have to send to a welder. There are
24 certain filings that have to go out to a vendor. But
25 wherever possible, we're trying to create that

2 contingency in house, so we always have that to fall
3 back on.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Great. I guess I'll...
5 we'll... since we're talking about staff, we'll
6 move... we'll move to staff. Because it... yeah, by
7 no means suggesting that the quality... the quantity
8 of reserves the issue of... or... or addresses the
9 issue of quality or training, for that matter,
10 having... having qualified staff to do the job. So
11 current you mentioned the Heating... HMDS has 565
12 (is it?) full-time employees. How many of those are
13 supervisors to oversee, kind of, the boiler systems-
14 wide?

15 MR. GROSSMAN: So I'll... I'll take you through a
16 little bit of how this new model works here, right?
17 So we have the Director of Heating Management
18 Services. And each... There is... We split the
19 city into three graph geographical regions. There's
20 a deputy director in charge of... It's a little...
21 It's a little slightly different for geography
22 purposes, but we split... just Manhattan and Staten
23 Island is one Deputy Director. Brooklyn and South
24 Queens is another deputy. And the Bronx and North
25 Queens is a third deputy. Each deputy has two

2 administrators that split their areas, and then we
3 divided ourselves into 25 uh... neighborhoods. So
4 that's our management. If you if you follow me,
5 there's a director, three deputies, six
6 administrators, and then 25 superintendents.

7 So by increasing that number of superintendents,
8 we've increased our oversight on the boiler. In the
9 past, they were overseeing potentially 13
10 developments, or even 25, or, you know, 25-plus
11 heating staff, 30 or 40 HPTs. Now, we've brought
12 that number down. So their... their span of control
13 is really 15 with a max of 23. Um...

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Which is still pretty high,
15 as far as I have learned.

16 MR. GROSSMAN: Which is still pretty high. But
17 it's not necessarily all on duty at once. That's
18 covering multiple shifts. So the number of plants
19 and developments that they're overseeing is six
20 instead of 13 or 14.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Oh, okay.

22 MR. GROSSMAN: It's a little better when you put
23 it that way, yes. A little more reasonable for the
24 span of people.

2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And in terms of the
3 distribution of its 25 neighborhoods across the five
4 boroughs? Obviously, not all the developments are
5 distributed evenly. So is... How did you... How
6 does that distribution look like?

7 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah, right. So we... It's...
8 It's a combination of geography, and... like I said,
9 we really wanted to consider a span of control. In
10 the Bronx, for example, right?, there's a development
11 with 40 boiler rooms, right? They have 40 different
12 spaces, and it's huge. Maybe... Maybe what we did
13 was give them one less development... give that super
14 one less development, and, you know, allow them to
15 have span of control over that larger space than the
16 others. And it's... it's living and breathing. We
17 just implement... Actually, I'm very proud of... We
18 got... This was approved and funded in August. And
19 we actually just fully implemented the management
20 structure of this new model Monday... like two days
21 ago. So we have this group in place. Developments
22 have been broken out, and now we're working on
23 refilling our frontline staff... ranks, to fully
24 complete the model. We also added some management to
25 the overnight heat desk. You know, this... We run

2 24/7. And that additional oversight of the evening,
3 we're actually kind of seeing that pay dividends
4 already. I think Javier got one less phone call
5 yesterday. But no, we got we got a significant
6 number of less phone calls, and that person is
7 actually handling... handling the after-hours
8 operation, checking in on our roving teams. You
9 know, we can't be here 24/7 and that person is
10 actually providing oversight to the teams that we
11 don't have... we don't have eyes on at night.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So just to take it back...
13 really quickly back to the to the summer maintenance
14 program. So the... the monitor's report directly
15 contradicts your... your testimony here. And, you
16 mentioned obviously, that you have... that you've...
17 you've made some adjustments. However, the monitor's
18 report says that the work was actually not done, and
19 this is based on your own data... let's see... where
20 it said the equipment inspections were... was not
21 adequately prepared for the start of the heating
22 season.

23 MR. GROSSMAN: So that was... Chair if I'm not
24 mistaken, that was referring to last year, correct?

25 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: For the 20... Yeah 2021.

2 MR. GROSSMAN: Alright. 2020-21. 21-22. Sorry.

3 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: It was the previous... was
4 about the other season.

5 MR. GROSSMAN: Right. So I... and right and
6 I... we acknowledge... so that... what I want to say
7 is we did... I'm going to go back. I'm getting
8 there. So we did complete 92.3% of... an overhaul on
9 92.3% of our assets last year. And that was at the
10 start of heating season. We did eventually complete
11 100% of it. And even this year, we're at 99.9%.
12 Because we have one boiler that required extensive
13 repairs. Those numbers tell a story about how we
14 started earlier, we we focused on our on our worst
15 performers, and we made some improvements. But what
16 they don't say is that we were able to provide heat
17 at... This year, we're able to provide heat at every
18 development. It looks like we were incomplete.
19 We're 99.9%. That's great. It's still not 100.
20 However, we have enough boilers operational to
21 provide heat adequately at every development.

22 The 90... The issue last year was there were a
23 couple of developments that were not ready. I don't
24 have them off the top of my head. Javier can speak
25 to them, or we can follow up with you. But that may

2 not have been fully ready to go. We recognize that
3 and we took that as an opportunity for improvement,
4 which we... which we met that goal this year.

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. Got it.

6 Apologizing for confusing the years, but it's
7 certainly heartening to hear that from that very
8 stark finding, that there was corrective action made
9 and... and the work continues to proceed. And we
10 will see the full data of, you know, the... the
11 material output of that, as... as time goes on. So
12 thank you for that correction and apologies for...
13 for my own confusion there.

14 In terms of... I guess back to the staffing. So
15 with this new kind of... with this new structure that
16 is in place, how many staff do the supervisors
17 oversee?

18 MR. GROSSMAN: Anywhere from... The total is
19 anywhere from 15 to 23. And that's dependent upon
20 staffing levels in those developments. At any given
21 time, it's... they're overseeing the group working
22 on duty at six to seven developments, if that makes
23 sense. The reason for that increased staffing levels
24 if we have a night watch. So somebody may have a
25 night watch and be responsible for an additional five

2 people or something like that. And it's because they
3 have more folks working, but in the same number of
4 developments. We really tried to keep that number
5 six, maybe seven at the most.

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. And in terms of...
7 How are the supervisors trained. Training across
8 NYCHA continues to be a real sticking point. How are
9 the supervisors trained for your units? And what is
10 what is the frequency of that training and contact
11 look like? (background voices)

12 MR. GROSSMAN: (to Mr. Almodovar) Okay, that's
13 what I was going to say. (To Committee) So... So
14 heating is a... is a very... is a very specific area,
15 right?, and you have to have heating-specific
16 training. So all of our supers have management
17 experience potentially outside of the heating
18 department, but also the knowledge associated with
19 heating systems to have that role. So it's... it's
20 something that, fortunately, we've... we've
21 identified some folks who were able to come up with,
22 but it is something that they do come into the part
23 with. I will say that I... we always want to do more
24 training. And this is an area that we would like to
25 see increased training and as well, not just on the

2 supervision side, on... on the on the kind of the
3 troubleshooting side, and how... and working
4 specifically with the heating components in their
5 area. But I think that's also an on-the-job
6 training, right? Because if they have that heating
7 knowledge, and they go out into the field, work
8 through their boiler rooms, begin to understand those
9 boiler rooms. And they're... they are learning as
10 well. So this... this new group of heating supers,
11 we're very excited to have them. We're very excited
12 about their previous experience. And our
13 administrators and deputy directors are working with
14 them to make sure that they fully understand their
15 needs in their areas. It's... It also goes to the
16 neighborhood model as well.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. So what specific
18 kind of training do you intend to employ?

19 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah, so as I said, it goes...
20 I'll give you an example, to answer this question if
21 I may, right? So we... As we recognize areas where
22 our staff is having issues, what we've started to do
23 working with the learning and development team and HR
24 is identify... create specific classes on a topic,
25 feed water treatment and analysis, for example.

2 We're bringing staff in to go to that training. And
3 we're doing the same thing with different aspects:
4 supervisory training, additional handheld trainings,
5 approval trainings, right?, because this, this may be
6 a new heating super -- they may be new back to the
7 department as a super, they were probably an HPT...
8 most likely an HPT or maintenance worker with us
9 beforehand, and coming back -- so some of our
10 vendors, ensuring they have those numbers. But I
11 think those specific areas, as we start to evaluate
12 this new team, will come up with trainings for these
13 supervisors. And I don't want to say that we have a
14 specific idea right now. That would just be unfair.
15 But as we start to see areas where they're struggling
16 and do that initial evaluation in this new model, we
17 will come up with trainings that we make them attend.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: That that is... that is
19 certainly fair. I think, you know, what is important
20 to us is that, obviously, that the staff get
21 robust... robust training, right?, and timely
22 training, given that there's so much kind of on the
23 ground learning in the developments themselves. And
24 it seems like such a highly technical nature to this
25 work, and probably with systems that are relatively

2 outdated and very particular, for safety purposes,
3 first and foremost, it seems like a very important
4 aspect. So we'd like to hear more about how what the
5 identification of what that looks like and what
6 NYCHA's plan is to engage in continuous and robust
7 training for its staff.

8 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah, absolutely. And I thank you
9 for bringing that up. And I'm going to take this as
10 an opportunity to talk about some of our HPT
11 training.

12 We have done some, some really great work (and
13 before I say this, I'm happy to share it with you, I
14 know you're going to ask, and I'm happy to share it
15 with you)... We've done some really robust work on
16 updating our HPT curriculum, and... and the way we
17 train them, not necessarily the material, right? You
18 know, a valve is still a valve right? There still
19 have to learn how to fix it, and we do understand
20 that. But what we're doing is, we've adjusted the
21 curriculum to make sure that there's areas -- as we
22 see out in the field, right? -- there are areas of
23 focus that we need to focus more upfront with our
24 staff. They should be... They're potentially coming
25 in as a blank slate, or a very inexperienced slate, I

2 should say. A very minimally used slate. So we...
3 we want to make sure that they're receiving the right
4 training. So we've done some robust work on that
5 working with our L&D teams.

6 What we've also done is we've enhanced the way we
7 communicate with... the way the... the instructional
8 team communicates with our heating field staff. HPTs
9 get evaluations. They are consistent. And they are
10 communicated between the instructor. If they if the
11 instructor sees somebody is struggling on a topic in
12 class, when they're on their field training day,
13 that's communicated to the field instructor and field
14 supervisor to ensure that they are getting the proper
15 help that they need. We've created... we've built an
16 extra help days, and additional trainings on specific
17 topics where folks are falling behind in the
18 evaluation.

19 And most importantly, through that... through
20 this kind of training... this community... this
21 relationship with both of our both our field staff
22 and our instructors, we have actually been able to
23 make these improvements. But the other thing that
24 we're doing is working with lattice team to identify
25 these new technologies, right?, we're going to have

2 to train staff how to fix those long term. And as we
3 worked through the... the pilot at Woodside Houses,
4 one of the pieces that we're working on is we asked
5 upfront, we want a unit that our heating staff can
6 play with, and they can take apart and understand how
7 it works. And the company was great to... was
8 gracious enough to provide us with one, so we can
9 understand it. And these are some of the things that
10 we will continue to do as we get new technology,
11 because it's vital that not only do we know how to
12 fix the old stuff, but we have to learn how to fix
13 the new stuff so it doesn't become like the old
14 stuff.

15 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. Thank you. Thank
16 you. That's very helpful and obviously very
17 promising, and we want... want our... our teams to
18 have all the... the tools and practices at their
19 disposal so that they're effective.

20 Can you tell me how many how many employees NYCHA
21 is seeking to hire for? Are there gaps for the HMSD
22 that you're seeking to hire?

23 MR. GROSSMAN: So there's openings? Yes, there
24 are vacancies.

25 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: How many vacancies?

2 MR. GROSSMAN: I'm going to get you the exact
3 number. It's right in front me. I apologize. But
4 roughly... You have it in front of Javier? I'm
5 sorry, I just want to get you the correct number.
6 Touchscreens are great, unless you have fat fingers,
7 my apologies.

8 Okay, so we currently have... And they are just
9 general vacancies, and these are the folks that
10 haven't received a start date yet. We have 44 HPT
11 vacancies. And we have 81 maintenance worker
12 vacancies. We've identified 54 candidates for
13 maintenance worker. And we have identified... We
14 were able to pull 11 HPTS off of the most recent
15 exam. As far as managerial vacancies, like I said,
16 we just filled all but one of our super vacancies.
17 That candidate is in the pipeline. Our administrator
18 vacancies are in progress. And we're doing some very
19 heavy recruiting with... with HR on this. And
20 another team that we meet regularly with, right?, to
21 ensure that we have a correct line of... a direct
22 line of communication.

23 What I'll also say is I -- you made reference,
24 and I kind of skipped over it before, but... because
25 I was talking about the stuff I'm excited about --

2 but I do want to say we had a backlog of HPTS due
3 to... a backlog HPTS who were untrained due to COVID.
4 That last group is scheduled to start in January, and
5 they will be joined by 11, new HPTS, who are just
6 hired.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: That's great.

8 MR. GROSSMAN: So we will... the backlog will
9 just be the people who are new there. Actually this
10 group will still be on probation. I can get you the
11 breakdown afterwards as well, but we have we have
12 cleared our backlog of untrained HPTS starting in
13 January. So we're looking to start 2023 with no
14 backlog.

15 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: That's exciting. I guess
16 when... when these vacancies are filled, in your
17 professional estimation, do you think this is
18 sufficient to be able to address the scale and scope
19 of the issues?

20 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah, I do believe it will. I
21 think... We're very hopeful that it will. But I do
22 believe also, and as I've stated a number of these
23 items, constant evaluation is the key to this, right?
24 So if we see that... What we have realized is that we
25 wanted a higher skill level in our heating department

2 on the front line, so we kind of adjusted the mix of
3 HPTs and maintenance workers. Maintenance workers
4 typically have a higher skill set out of the gate.
5 We've adjusted the mix. It's hovering around 50/50,
6 as opposed to you know, heavily new train... newly
7 trained staff, right? We have a large number of
8 staff that have under five years here. And then like
9 I said, it's the right staff. So we're still
10 evaluating how this increase in maintenance workers
11 is going to help us. That's in process right now.
12 This is... This is new to us. This is new for us, I
13 should say. And it's the right kind of staff, right?
14 Do we need to... we have a lot of maintenance workers
15 now. Do we need additional skilled trades? Do we
16 need... do we have too many skilled trades? Do we
17 need more frontline staff? And I think as we move
18 into this new model, with increased supervision,
19 really looking at the root cause of our issues, we'll
20 be able to understand what that need is.

21 That was a very long winded way of saying I'm
22 very hopeful. And yes, I do believe and I'm very
23 hopeful that this does solve those problems.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. In terms of the...
3 I guess I was wondering how you... I guess how your
4 department recruits from NYCHA residents.

5 MR. ALMODOVAR: Let me just start by saying that
6 before I was a NYCHA employee, I was a resident as
7 well. And one of the programs that I came through is
8 the Housing Youth Training Program, which is one way
9 that we're trying to respond sometime down the road.
10 And so naturally, all applications, if you're a
11 resident, we encourage in our postings that the
12 residents apply. And the program that I came
13 through, afforded me, a young man back then, a lot
14 younger than I am now, of course, the opportunity to
15 learn a new trade, and that's something that we want
16 to re-establish in this... in this department.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And is there... is there...
18 Can you can you say the name of the program? And are
19 there some concrete steps that NYCHA is taking to
20 reestablish such a program?

21 MR. ALMODOVAR: The program that I came through
22 was the Housing Youth Training Program. (inaudible,
23 speaking to Mr. Grossman}

24 MR. GROSSMAN: And the current... the current
25 program that... the current program that we have

2 is... is called the Caretaker Age Program. So
3 essentially, we... heating funds, caretakers are
4 working in development for four days, and then do a
5 fifth day of heating training. That took a pause
6 during... during COVID. And we've actually just
7 restarted that program. It's a one year program.
8 And that way, it sets them up and prepares those
9 folks who are... it's through the Reese Program, but
10 it actually prepares those folks, not only for a
11 career in heating, but to get on the HPT list, which
12 is a civil service exam.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: (inaudible) We're doing the
14 same thing... playing with a microphone. Do you
15 know how many people are currently involved in that
16 program?

17 MR. GROSSMAN: I will get you the exact number.
18 I... I'll follow up with you on that. I want to say
19 it is... it's around it's around the neighborhood of
20 ten, but I'll get you the exact number.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Great, I think, you know, we
22 can't... we can't underscore enough how important it
23 is to expand those programs, given... given the scale
24 of the need. And certainly, the residents. In terms
25 of... One of the issues that we hear about from

2 residents, in terms of heat issues, is that NYCHA
3 staff often take room temperatures in the kitchen or
4 in the bathroom, where temperatures are generally
5 higher than the rest of the apartment. How is...
6 How is NYCHA management communicating with line staff
7 that this is not a correct procedure?

8 MR. ALMODOVAR: (to Mr. Grossman) Can I get it?
9 Yep. (to Committee) That's... That's a great
10 question. And it's also a topic that I take very
11 seriously. So having been in the role of performing
12 that work, I know the exact step-by-step process that
13 has to be taken.

14 And so what I do at the start of every heating
15 season is I push out an instructional memo that
16 dictates that exact process. We issue it to staff,
17 we ensure that they read it, understand it, ask
18 questions, and sign for it. And then from there, we
19 look at work orders. And wherever... wherever we do
20 see that the process is not being followed, then we
21 address that individual. If they're not taking the
22 temperatures appropriately, if they're making up
23 temperatures, not attaching the photo, we've seen a
24 couple a couple of things we've come across through

2 that QA, and of those work orders. And when we do
3 come across those things, we hold people accountable.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And what does that look
5 like?

6 MR. ALMODOVAR: The accountability, part of it?

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah.

8 MR. ALMODOVAR: Well, it is a progressive
9 disciplinary process. The instructional memo is the
10 written instruction, and then anything after that is
11 a counseling memo. Then if you do it twice, then
12 you're upon a local hearing. If you do it three
13 times, then we're... you're facing the general
14 hearing, where you're actually maximum punishment is
15 your terminated.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Is there engagement with
17 residents in that process?

18 MR. GROSSMAN: In the... which process?

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: I guess just in the
20 feedback, right? Obviously you're looking at
21 staffing patterns of noncompliance of procedures. I
22 would suspect there's probably some engagement with
23 residents that is reflective of noncompliance.

24 MR. GROSSMAN: Of course. Yeah, absolutely. And
25 whenever a resident brings a concern... any resident

2 brings that concern to... to us, we investigate it
3 fully and completely. Another... Another piece of
4 this is also, like I said, I think this where we're
5 looking to see improvement is this... you know, this
6 enhanced supervision that I mentioned through the
7 neighborhood model, and to Javier's point, the first
8 thing we really... we want our staff to succeed.

9 You know, progressive discipline is a tool in the
10 toolbox. But as I, as I alluded to earlier, right?
11 Feedwater analysis: We recognized it as an area for
12 improvement. And instead of, you know, providing
13 memos, we want to bring that staff in, we want to
14 make sure that they have the right baseline. And
15 then it becomes... it benefits... it's actually a
16 personal... a personality issue. We can we can
17 address that, or a lack of understanding, we can
18 address that. But we, we do want our staff to
19 succeed. So we try to start with a reeducation.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah, sure. And a cultural
21 practice, right?, and excellence that we want the
22 agency to make sure it espouses in every unit of its
23 performance. In terms of... If we could go back to
24 funding, our favorite topic of all time.

2 So within the past few fiscal years, the city has
3 invested I guess, \$28 million in operating funds to
4 replace heating equipment components. Given the, I
5 guess, poor track record in... in spending city funds
6 -- and I think this is probably more particular to
7 capital than operating -- can you update us on... on
8 how the spending is occurring?

9 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah, absolutely. I'll... I'll
10 bring in... call in to the bullpen for Joy
11 Sinderbrand to join us. While she's back there.

12 MS. SINDERBRAND: Thank you for the question.
13 And I'm going to have to get back to you about that
14 specific tranche of funding. But I would say in
15 general, I think what's really critical is to talk
16 about how much more effective NYCHA is getting at
17 spending all dollars, including city dollars, and
18 we're... we're participating on the Capital Process
19 Reform Task Force with other city agencies to really
20 try to improve our city dollar spending on the
21 capital side. But in the meantime, one of the things
22 that we are doing is partnering with each of our...
23 each of our counterparts, whether it's the... the
24 comptroller's office, or OMB, to make sure that we're
25 proceeding as efficiently as we can. But I will

2 circle back to... when I find out which of the \$28
3 million tranche was funded.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Sure, and Joy, if you could:
5 In that learning, and in that process, are... have
6 there been any specific changes that the agency has
7 made to... to relieve some of these... these
8 challenges or delays?

9 MS. SINDERBRAND: Yes, and I think there's been
10 considerable changes, although I realize that some of
11 them are probably not very visible to the person on
12 the street or the person at the development. As the
13 monitor mentioned in their recent report, we've
14 improved the quality of our project schedules, our
15 schedule management, and our reporting. And we're
16 standardizing engagement both internally and
17 externally. So what that means is, we're working
18 with other parts of NYCHA in prioritization, the
19 design, the construction, and the turnover processes
20 of equipment to make sure that there's success in
21 long-term maintenance. And conversely, we're
22 increasing our engagement externally, with the new
23 standard operating procedure, and we're staffing up a
24 new team in capital to increase our ability to touch
25 every development with... with capital improvements

2 on a recurring basis so that we can keep people up to
3 speed. And I really think that that's very
4 important. You've talked a lot about resident
5 engagement. I know in Red Hook, we certainly had the
6 resources to do that. We'd like to expand that type
7 of... that type of engagement to many more projects.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So in terms of... in terms
9 of capital drawdown, is there a metric that you're
10 using, to kind of... to assess progress? Because I
11 know in prior... in prior years, that... that (and I
12 might be using the wrong word, so forgive me), but
13 drawing down on capital resources was very, very low.
14 And I think the lowest among all city agencies. Is
15 there a metric that you're using to assess, keep
16 yourselves on track, push harder?

17 MS. SINDERBRAND: Sure, and I will certainly
18 circle back with our progress. Across multiple
19 funding streams, we have various goals. On the
20 federal side, we have a timeline goal of how quickly
21 we need to spend money. Certainly on the scope side,
22 we've made commitments to HUD about what we are going
23 to deliver. So we need to get those projects done.
24 And then as you're saying on the city side and the
25 state side, it can often take some time to get to

2 substantial obligation. And that often is because
3 the design process for these projects is such a
4 substantial part of the... of the work. And so
5 during design, you don't spend as much money, but
6 because of the complex context, because of the
7 stakeholder engagement, that process might last for
8 some time. And then... now as many of our projects
9 are going into construction, you're going to start
10 seeing those drawdowns happen much more quickly. And
11 again, we are on track to meet our HUD commitments
12 for boiler replacement in 2026.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Is that is that unique to
14 me? I feel like the federal level dollars y'all do
15 really great with. It's the city and state dollars
16 that linger no-man's land. Is that... Is that usual
17 that you're generally on track to meet, you know, the
18 HUD spending requirements? She got muted.

19 MS. SINDERBRAND: I apologize. I'm so used to
20 automatically muting when I'm done talking.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: I do it all the time.

22 MS. SINDERBRAND: I will not touch the mute
23 button anymore. So that... You're correct. There
24 are different... different processes for spending
25 money from... from the federal, from... mainly the

2 HUD part, although there are other federal sources
3 that that we pursue, especially with disaster
4 recovery side than on the state and the city front.

5 On the state, we certainly have to come to an
6 agreement on how we're going to spend money. That
7 can take some time. And we work very closely with
8 the state to make sure that that we are moving that
9 process along as quickly as possible.

10 On the city front, I think you're very familiar
11 with the challenges of expending city capital
12 dollars. We are in the queue with all the other city
13 agencies trying to get work done. And so our goal on
14 the city front again: We're participating in that
15 task force, but we also are working on what we can do
16 internally to create as much efficiency as possible,
17 so that the packages that we're giving to our
18 counterparts at comptroller or OMB don't... don't
19 need to be returned, they don't prompt questions.
20 And... And so that's something that that's a
21 continuous improvement process that we've been...
22 we've been working on over the last year.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it? Thank you. Okay.
24 It was exactly one of the questions I was going to
25 ask in terms of the procurement process, that we know

2 has so many delays. I was curious around how City
3 Council could be helpful in correcting some of those
4 procurement issues, and obviously working with this
5 task force.

6 You did it again.

7 MS. SINDERBRAND: It's under my hands. Because
8 it's automatic. So yes, I appreciate that. And you
9 know, one of the... one of the new mechanisms that
10 NYCHA has been able to take advantage of, the Design
11 Build Legislation, is really an opportunity to see if
12 we can speed up that procurement process, right?
13 Instead of... Instead of going out to the market for
14 design and then going out again for construction, you
15 can really... you go into market once, you have a
16 single contract, and that contractor, you know, goes
17 through an iterative process of design and
18 construction. They're working very closely with the
19 residents. And that's something that we've been
20 using increasingly across the portfolio. And we have
21 it at several heating projects. And so we're
22 tracking what benefits are coming from that model.
23 And... and tempting to use it in some other
24 categories as well. It's certainly not for every
25 category of construction, but... but it is really...

2 it is really helpful to have a single point of
3 responsibility where the designer and the contractor
4 are working together from the beginning. And that's
5 something that we hope will really speed up the...
6 the construction process.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So recently, news reports
8 mentioned that NYCHA informed the monitor, HUD, and
9 the US attorney that it would be difficult to meet
10 some of the HUD NYCHA deadlines due to the drop in
11 rental revenue. Are these reports accurate? And if
12 so, can you speak more about the reaction to that
13 information?

14 MR. GROSSMAN: So I am going to pass it to Brian
15 momentarily, but I did want to update the record.
16 I... We had spoken about this before. I just want
17 to clarify this right. There are 10 residents in the
18 Caretaker Age Program. Over the next two years, 100
19 residents are slated to be trained through the Clean
20 Energy Academy in clean-energy related skills. And I
21 don't recall if you ask this but I will give you the
22 info anyway: Of our 187 HPTs, 53 are NYCHA
23 residents. Of 235 of our maintenance workers, 27 are
24 NYCHA residents. I'd just update that record. And
25 Brian?

2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you.

3 MR. HONAN: Thank you. Yes, Councilmember. So
4 the funding that we're talking about here is expense
5 funding that... not capital, you know what Joy is...
6 You know, so we should be on still on track for those
7 capital improvements. However, we do have a real
8 concern on the expense side. We are, at the total
9 reuse about \$450 million and rent makes up about 30%
10 of our budget. Of that \$450 million, over \$150
11 million is funding that we believe would be ERAP
12 eligible. And so these are, you know, tenants who
13 fell behind during the pandemic, like many tenants
14 throughout New York City, who did not live in public
15 housing.

16 Unfortunately, the state legislation de-
17 prioritized federally-assisted tenants, and so they,
18 like their neighbors, filled out applications, or
19 they work with NYCHA to... and we applied on their
20 behalf. And unfortunately, they've been, you know,
21 waiting to hear but you know, I don't think they're
22 going to hear back. The waiting is also a bit of
23 a... is a big issue too, because, you know, while
24 their ERAP applications are pending, they can't
25 qualify for things like One Shot, right? So... So

2 they... So there are... There's other assistances
3 available to them that they can't take advantage of.
4 But this is a tremendous hole in our budget and it
5 is... it is something that we are working through
6 now. But it is something that, you know, unless we
7 figure out a way, it will impact services as well.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you for that. Can
9 you... Can you, I guess, paint the picture of what
10 services we're talking about?

11 MR. HONAN: So... So expense funding, you know,
12 covers, you know, of course, staff. It covers... It
13 covers, you know, repairs time. It covers ground
14 keeping. We don't... You know, we... we haven't
15 fully fleshed out our budget, you know, right now, in
16 terms of, you know, where it's gone to see an impact,
17 but you don't see a huge, you know, a hole in your
18 budget like this, you know, \$450 million, without it,
19 you know, without it impacting something. I don't
20 have a clear picture exactly where but it is... you
21 know, and the monitor is 100%, right?, that, you
22 know, you can't sustain this type of hit without
23 feeling it. And we will come back to you and to and
24 to this Committee, you know, too, to, you know, talk
25 about longer terms, and talk also give you a preview

2 and then have longer conversations about a budget
3 moving forward. We're on the... We're on the
4 calendar year. And so, you know, so our budget will
5 be, you know, we'll work... we'll work that through
6 with you as well.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Right. Particularly
8 concerning under the context of the city is, you
9 know, the... the Mayor announced an additional round
10 of PEGS moving forward. So we're talking about
11 additional cuts in a very desperate situation to
12 NYCHA, and we're deeply, deeply concerned.

13 Can you tell us more specifically, what the plan
14 is in terms of the specific requests that are being
15 made to our... to our state and federal colleagues in
16 terms of increases, and to the city for that matter?

17 MR. HONAN: Sure. So we have regular
18 communication both with HUD, congressional staff, and
19 with the governor's office and the state legislative
20 staff. I remember a time when for more than 10
21 years, the state just ignored NYCHA and said it's not
22 our... not our issue, not our problem. I will say
23 since 2015, we have been in the budget, you know,
24 every year with the exception of one. So that is an
25 improvement. We will continue to work with the

2 legislature and the governor's office for capital
3 funds, as well. We have also, you know, had
4 conversations with them about, uh, you know, about
5 our budget and, you know, in about, you know, ERAP as
6 well. And we'll continue to do that. In terms of...

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So what's the ask, Brian?
8 What... what's the ask from our state colleagues,
9 specifically for capital and specifically for
10 operational funding?

11 MR. HONAN: We... We are not there yet. We
12 haven't finalized the legislative agenda, but we...
13 when we do, I can come back to you with that. But I,
14 you know, I just... I don't want to, I don't want to
15 give away the good part of the story until it's...
16 it's there. But... But we will come back to you on
17 that. In terms...

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: When?

19 MR. HONAN: The legislative session starts in
20 January. So we can... You know, we'll... we'll come
21 back to you in the beginning of the legislative
22 session.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: In January, great. Yep. A
24 couple of weeks here.

2 MR. HONAN: Okay. In terms of federal, we do,
3 you know, regularly talk to HUD about, you know,
4 taking advantage of every opportunity that's out
5 there, whether it's grants, whether it is, you know,
6 different types of funding that are afforded to, you
7 know, housing authorities, you know, in distress.
8 HUD has been, you know, really good about saying, you
9 know, you need to make sure that you take advantage
10 of every dollar that's out there. And, you know, and
11 I believe that we are doing that, unlike, you know,
12 in the past, you know, but, you know, and so we do
13 talk with them regularly. And we also do talk to the
14 to the delegation regularly. And we'll continue to
15 do that too, as well.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So, I would love to hear
17 specifically what assistance you're seeking for HUD.
18 Not only... I'm sure... I know... I know, you engage
19 in multiple programs. But to really have us
20 understand what the asks are, I will tell you that it
21 is, In my very short experience here has been
22 generally nebulous, to understand both how hard NYCHA
23 is advocating for... for specific programs, and the
24 scale and scope of the actual money it pursues...

25 MR. HONAN: Sure. Sure.

2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: ...at each level of
3 government, and obviously I know it changes. But the
4 target is ever moving, and makes it very difficult to
5 see how it holds its line. And what it truly needs,
6 rather than just like taking whatever it gets, which
7 is what you ultimately have to do. But...

8 MR. HONAN: I don't think... Yeah, I don't think
9 I would characterize as that. I mean, I think we
10 have a robust program on all levels. I mean, I lived
11 in Albany last year, practically and you know...

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: For the trust.

13 MR. HONAN: Yeah, not only for the trust. Though
14 pre-budget as well, you know. Well, they could...
15 they weren't allowing people on pre-budget. So...
16 But I did spend a lot of time on the... you know,
17 doing things virtually, you know, pre-budget, you
18 know, and we were successful to get the largest grant
19 in... we got \$350 million in, you know, last year's
20 state budget.

21 And before that, you know, with the federal
22 partners, we were in constant communication on Build
23 Back Better. I went from... I feel like Build Back
24 Better was a bad relationship. I went from not
25 believing to truly believing and thinking that it's

2 not going to let me down. And then unfortunately, it
3 did. But it was... You know, it is something on all
4 levels of government. You know, this isn't something
5 that we're... we're not... you know, we're not doing
6 it like a community organization where we're out in
7 front, we're holding rallies. It is a lot of stuff
8 that is, you know, it is stuff that you don't see
9 every day, but it is stuff that is definitely done.
10 But we'll be happy to, you know, set up something
11 with you where we talk about, you know, our strategy
12 on all three levels.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: I appreciate that. And I do
14 recall our conversations over the level of funding
15 you were advocating from the state, which I find
16 shockingly low, given the scale and scope. So I
17 think, we don't have to... we certainly don't have
18 to debate that. I think my... my point in the
19 question is that residents, the public, do not see
20 how NYCHA is fighting for itself in these realms,
21 because there's so much behind the, you know, behind
22 the doors, negotiation going on, right? And I think
23 it makes a difference. But this is not unique to
24 NYCHA. That is certainly every agency. It blows my
25 mind, how agencies are making do with inadequate

2 resources, right?, and workers are doing quite
3 amazing stuff, but won't actually ever admit that it
4 is fully inadequate, and that they need a more robust
5 level of funding to truly meet the needs.

6 MR. HONAN: No, I agree. And it's something I've
7 talked to Jay Barber and the CCUP about. It wasn't
8 always this way too. We used to go to Washington
9 together, you know, with buses. We used to go to
10 Albany together with buses. And, you know, we've
11 talked about doing you know, definitely starting with
12 Washington early next year, and get... you know,
13 advocating together. I mean, we are way more...
14 we're much more effective when we work together. We
15 are... We agree way more than we don't, and... and it
16 is... and also legislators respond, you know, when
17 they hear their, you know, it is, you know, the
18 constituents and the people are facing this every day
19 are the ones, you know, making the ask. So, yes, a
20 partnership will work better. And I think, you know,
21 it's part of a plan for 23.

22 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you. Thank you so
23 much. So I guess we're getting close to wrapping up
24 here. We've covered... We certainly covered a lot of

2 ground and thank you for... for your work and
3 patience with the questions.

4 I just wanted to quickly segue to resident
5 engagement. From the hearing last year, I understand
6 that the Heating Action Plan outlines a communication
7 protocol with residents regarding outages and
8 repairs. Can you again a walk us through that
9 protocol?

10 MR. GROSSMAN: Absolutely. So for... for a
11 plan... for a planned outage, we give 48 hours
12 notice... at least 48 hours notice, and then again
13 the morning of notice to... to our residents an hour
14 before the outage starts on the day off. We do that
15 so that there's ample time to prepare for that hot
16 water outage or heat outage. And also in the
17 morning, if you're in the middle of using the hot
18 water heat, it gives you time to finish up what
19 you're doing. What we've also added is... is the
20 ability when we close the outage with the robocall,
21 you can still say that you have an issue as a
22 resident, or through the app you can say that there
23 is an issue. And you can... that will alert us that
24 we need to do some additional follow up.

2 As I stated earlier, we we've added some triage
3 questions into the application when reporting an
4 outage. And also within the within the CCC
5 additional questions. Another improvement in the app
6 that... I'm sorry that will guide us in our
7 response. Another improvement in the app is they
8 can... you can elect to receive push notifications
9 through the MyNYCHA app for real time heating
10 disruptions.

11 What I'll also say is we... we aside from the
12 action plans, we just have made a better effort this
13 heating season. We reached out to all the District
14 Council Chairs prior... prior to the start of heating
15 season... or on the first day of heating season, to
16 educate them on some of the additional work that we
17 did after last year's heating season. And we're
18 engaging with... you know, we're... we're also
19 tracking complaints as opposed to just outages.
20 We're looking at high complaint counts. In an area
21 if it's concentrated, we're going to reach out to
22 that type of association, that Resident Association
23 and really work with them to find out what the
24 problems are.

2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. In terms of
3 unplanned outages, what's the expected timeframe that
4 NYCHA will inform residents in?

5 MR. GROSSMAN: So there's a couple of ways that
6 we can notify of unplanned outage. One is we can see
7 a high ticket count, we will send out a robocall.
8 Once we once we receive high ticket account, we'll go
9 investigate, and we'll... wait, I'm going to cough.

10 MR. ALMODOVAR: So with unplanned outages, the
11 expectation is to get to the root of the problem
12 immediately. In most cases, we know what failed, and
13 when we create the unplanned outage, it captures the
14 affected area. And immediately within the hour of
15 that outage being created, a robocall goes out to the
16 residents in the affected area informing them of the
17 service disrupt... disruption, whether it's heat or
18 hot water. And what we do is we move quickly to, as
19 I said, initially, we identify what the root cause
20 is, and then we start dispatching the appropriate
21 staff. The idea behind all that is to immediately
22 restore services, at least within the first six to
23 eight hours is what we constantly aim for.

24 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. So... So within...
25 within the hour of your becoming aware of an outage,

2 you're deploying a robocall. Do you do use other
3 forms of communication for residents?

4 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah, so we... the building is
5 automatically fired a Post-It. Buildings are
6 actually fired a Post-It, and it's... where we meet
7 the requirement of... within two hours. (background
8 voices) Right. And the resident and, yeah, and the
9 Tennis Association or Resident Association leadership
10 is notified as well.

11 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Great. I would love for
12 other Councilmembers to be included, particularly
13 when you're doing planned outages. I have never
14 received a notice of a planned outage. But I get all
15 the notices from the residents, both planned and
16 unplanned. I think that would help also
17 Councilmembers to be able to help you respond to
18 residents that are concerned and experiencing
19 outages.

20 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah. So we're happy to follow up
21 with you on that.

22 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Great. In terms of... you
23 know, I think what we saw during Hurricane Sandy was
24 interesting building networks, right?, throughout
25 communities that helped to support... inform each

2 other when things were happening. I was curious if
3 in... in the thinking around, obviously resilience
4 and communication networks with tenants, obviously,
5 you have your TAs. But TAs are often very limited in
6 both their reach and sometimes they too are seniors.
7 Has NYCHA ever thought about building out some other
8 kind of resident-to-resident communication system,
9 like where there are building captains, or something
10 that is much more dispersed, right, where the
11 responsibility for sharing the information is more
12 dispersed across residents? This happened during
13 Hurricane Sandy in many of the NYCHA developments.
14 In fact, that's how, you know, the neighbors
15 supported each other. So it happens informally. I
16 was just curious if NYCHA ever considered using that
17 model.

18 MR. HONAN: So Vlada's team actually is doing
19 some of this. And Vlada maybe you could talk... talk
20 about it and something that we could build on to as
21 well.

22 MS. KENIFF: Yeah, great question. So
23 particularly for BMS, because it's a system we've
24 been rolling out in the last two years, although we
25 do a lot of communication pre-construction, it's

2 really not felt until the heat, you know, goes from
3 80-plus degrees to the comfortable 72 to 74. And so
4 we recognize that more communication needs to happen
5 in that particular space. We've partnered with Green
6 City Forest, the young people there, to go door to
7 door and do communication, particularly with the
8 vulnerable populations in the past.

9 Brian, and Javier and my team have established
10 communication with the TA leadership. But I think
11 Green City Forces, whom we turned to often for that
12 kind of support. But it is something that, you
13 know... Community-based information sharing is
14 something that's hard to build centrally. You know,
15 to the extent that we can continue to build that up,
16 I think is really, really important.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah, thank you.

18 MS. KENIFF: And I just wanted to come up and
19 share some information cards that Javier's team
20 shares about the building management system, and our
21 Green City... Green City Force colleagues, so you can
22 see them in Spanish and English.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Great. Thank you. Thank
24 you so much.

2 MR. GROSSMAN: I think that's... We appreciate
3 that feedback. And I think that's something that
4 we'll... we'll take back. There are some resident
5 associations that do that already. And I think this
6 is something we can definitely take back to them and
7 work on it.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah, very much like a, you
9 know, local CERT teams, right?, where it happens
10 informally, but the truth of the matter is that as
11 much as we can support that approach, it'll impact
12 everything, right? Everything from the water to the
13 heat, to any emergency situation that occurs on a
14 campus. They'll have a better awareness and a system
15 for communicating, that we've seen to be very
16 effective. So thank you. Thank you for sharing
17 that.

18 I just want to quickly segue to some gas outage
19 questions.

20 I understand that that time to restore gas
21 outages was down in 2021 to 96 days from the previous
22 year. What do this year's numbers look like?

23 MR. HONAN: I don't believe we have that. But
24 Joy, maybe we could talk about some of the challenges
25 of, you know, restoring gas. I just want to make

2 sure that everybody understands that the gas is
3 cooking gas. It's not related to heat. But so we
4 can definitely follow up with that, but you know, the
5 challenges... the challenges to restoring gas, though
6 definitely remain.

7 MS. SINDERBRAND: Thank you. Thank you
8 Councilmember for that question. And I'm glad to
9 hear that you observed our improvement in
10 performance. I did not bring those... those numbers
11 with me today. But... But what you're seeing is
12 really the effect of that standardization we're
13 talking about, really having clear processes that
14 cross the agency's divisions and departments, because
15 the restoration of gas involves so many players, both
16 within the agency and an external agencies. And so
17 we're happy to share documentation about those...
18 those steps and getting you the numbers... what
19 our... what our current restoration time is.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Great. No. I recognize
21 that obviously that this was not the focus of the
22 hearing. It is a persistent, and very long... you
23 know, significantly longer than heat outages, right?,
24 where it's six months, nine months, a year, without
25 cooking gas is just mind blowing, honestly. And we

2 keep... we keep seeing more and more of these
3 persistent outages and not very good solutions for
4 residents. This is a huge economic impact for
5 residents, not only economic, but health. And so
6 it's just... it's a... it's a major issue that we
7 need to figure out how to address.

8 MR. HONAN: Yeah, and I... Just one last thing.
9 I don't want to go on about it, but I think also too
10 is just another real symptom of the major
11 infrastructure issue that we have. Going back to
12 what we were talking about with Bronx River, you
13 know, in the beginning of the hearing, you know, gas
14 outages usually are a plumbing issue. It's usually
15 a... It is usually the gas risers or the piping
16 associated with them are leaking, and they're...
17 and... and I also have been saying internally too,
18 that we need... we should probably start to change
19 our language on it, because I think when people hear
20 "outage", they associate it with like a heating
21 outage or no water outage, and they think it's
22 something that, you know, we could send a staff
23 there, they can, you know, do some repairs and get it
24 back going in a few hours. It is much more like a
25 big capital construction project. It usually

2 involves, you know, asbestos abatement, it usually
3 involves, you know, replacing piping and getting
4 behind walls. And then a lot of coordination with
5 residents, with Department of Buildings, with the
6 utility companies, a lot of, you know, vendors many
7 times. So it is it is often, you know, comparable to
8 a capital improvement more than an outage.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Right? Yeah. No, and
10 given that we are expecting... given the
11 infrastructure challenges that we know, it would be
12 fair to expect they're going to continue, and they
13 may increase. And so the question then becomes, you
14 know, how... how do we mitigate. And the current...
15 the current program of hot plates?

16 MR. HONAN: Sure. I think all smart things go
17 back to Vlada. And, and so one of the things that
18 we've been looking to is... is how do we, you know,
19 think in the future, like, is there a way to get us
20 off gas and to electrify buildings? And it's
21 something that Vlada has been looking into, too.
22 Because, you know, a world without, you know, relying
23 on gas would be, you know, I think all of our dreams.

24 MS. KENIFF: So, I can speak to this a little
25 bit. I think that this the same engineers that

2 helped to write the specifications for the heat pump,
3 have been inspired and have developed a battery
4 operated induction stove. We are very interested and
5 we're following this closely. Of course, lithium ion
6 batteries are a concern in apartments. So we're
7 going to be very, very careful in you know, bringing
8 this technology if we ever consider it. And, you
9 know, we'll continue to look at other options. But,
10 you know, the idea of: how do we completely eliminate
11 the gas risers so that it doesn't become a huge
12 construction project is a very important idea that
13 we're exploring.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah... And also thank you
15 for that. It's important for the future of our city.
16 But also, you know, the program currently that exists
17 in terms of restaurant allowance for meal purchases,
18 has a... truly a lot to be desired. I think there
19 needs to be some more creativity there for some
20 communities that don't have a robust restaurant, and
21 I'm talking specifically about Red Hook. We have
22 four restaurants in the neighborhood. It's not an
23 option, right? So essentially, residents are truly
24 getting no relief in having to do spend significantly
25 more income which they're often struggling with to

2 address this. So I think we will we'll need to
3 return and figure out how can we be more creative and
4 solution-oriented to this persistent and clearly
5 expensive problem that that we're facing.

6 In terms of... Just, I wanted to quickly, one
7 last piece on the capital funding. You mentioned a
8 good number of boilers that had been replaced. I
9 guess... I just... I wanted to make sure that we have
10 on the record in terms of... it says that we have the
11 capital plan to replace 297 boilers by the end of
12 2096. And Joy, you mentioned the 123 for this
13 particular year. This was with state funding, as I
14 understand it, is that correct, Joy? The 297 boilers
15 by the end of 2026, that we talked about a little
16 earlier.

17 MS. SINDERBRAND: 346 boilers in total, by the
18 end of 2026 is NYCHA's commitment in the HUD
19 agreement.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: In the HUD agreement, okay.

21 MS. SINDERBRAND: Yeah. I might have... I'm not
22 sure if I used an increment instead of...

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: No, I may have... I may very
24 well have. There's... we have so many different

2 numbers... so many different numbers from different
3 pots.

4 Can I ask, what is... what is the criteria that
5 NYCHA uses to determine a new heating system for a
6 building?

7 MS. SINDERBRAND: Sure. It's a collaborative
8 process. So I definitely need to add on, but... but
9 when we have the resources to do heating plant
10 replacements, we're taking into account developments
11 with the most need for investment. And so we use the
12 data sources available, resident complaints, outages,
13 information from the heating department on sites that
14 require the most funding and manpower to keep
15 operational, and then certainly that... that on-the-
16 ground inspection that... that has been done, you
17 know, that some hands on the equipment to say what
18 the condition of the equipment is.

19 That said, right now, we have no additional
20 funding capacity for projects. So if it's not
21 already in our pipeline, or it's not one of the few
22 pilot projects that Vlada is being progressed, then
23 then right now, we cannot add new developments to
24 that list.

2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So the so the money that is
3 sitting unspent, that was has been allocated for
4 capital projects is all designated to specific
5 projects. There is no untagged?

6 MS. SINDERBRAND: Yes, our entire five-year
7 capital plan is committed with the priorities of the
8 HUD agreement, and then the pillars that we focus on
9 as an agency. And really, with the exception of very
10 minimal discretionary dollars, we don't have any
11 wiggle room.

12 MR. HONAN: Councilmember, I want to say, from
13 now until 2026, we have over \$2 billion planned for
14 investment in our heating system. \$1.3 billion of
15 that are federal funds. \$200 million from energy
16 performance contracts. In state funds, it's \$353
17 million. In city funds, it's \$200 million, and then
18 city funds tied to the agreement is \$171 million.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. Thank you. So in
20 terms of... if... if development has been under the
21 RAD and PACT conversion, and they're in need of a
22 boiler upgrade or repair, is that... is that amount
23 captured under the capital plan?

24 MS. HONAN: That's not this. No, these are these
25 are just for traditional... you know...

2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay, so that would...
3 that... that's all... and with... who... who tracks
4 actually the capital needs for the RAD-PACT
5 developments?

6 MR. HONAN: Under our real estate team, there is
7 a team that tracks you know, the construction they're
8 doing, you know, how they're doing it, you know,
9 making sure that they're... they're also working
10 through compliance issues. And you know, so there is
11 a team that, you know, that looks at them and
12 monitors their performance.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Got it. Thank you for that.
14 I think... I think this might be it. Excuse me for
15 one quick second, I just want to... I guess checking
16 in really quickly on Sotomayor Houses in the Bronx:
17 We understand that there was a boiler replacement
18 paid for with state funding and experienced a failure
19 after flooding. Can you talk about what, if anything
20 NYCHA is doing to address the issues from a more
21 holistic perspective to avoid, obviously, building
22 and flooding type of situations?

23 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah. So I think this goes back
24 to something that we've discussed a number of times,
25 right? I think it's better coordination and

2 communication amongst, you know, just even our
3 different business units within NYCHA.

4 You know, we... we work with... like, going into
5 this neighborhood model for heating is very
6 important. That increased oversight, and that
7 increased cooperation between the local teams allows
8 for a faster response. So to use the Sotomayor, for
9 example, right?, there was a capital... a capital
10 project in a heating room that was affected by the
11 responsibility of property management, and then that
12 team. What we... What we learned, and what we take
13 away from that is better enhanced coordination.

14 So the three teams actually meet bi-weekly
15 together to discuss issues and elevate issues. And
16 then, you know, we have our, our one-offs with...
17 with ANC, and our one-offs with property management
18 as well.

19 MR. HONAN: And Joy can speak to this probably
20 better than almost anyone, you know, because the
21 projects that she is... you know, oversaw with, you
22 know, Sandy, you know, and you'll see... you'll see
23 it The Rockaways. You'll see it in Red Hook. They
24 didn't just build back where it was, right? They now
25 are above ground, you know, in most cases, too, and

2 so, you know, we are... they're going to be much more
3 resilient.

4 Other projects like that I could just think of
5 off the top of my head is like, in Marcy houses,
6 they're going to get a... they're not... we're not
7 just going to go back to the basement there, we're
8 going to, you know, come up and have a... on... you
9 know, a new building that will, you know, serve as
10 the heating plant. It'll be much more resilient. It
11 will be much less likely to be flooded, you know,
12 things like that, too. Because when they build these
13 systems, you know, it... we didn't face the same
14 climate crisis that we have right now. And the idea
15 of the... you know, there would be... one day, there
16 would be six feet of water and heating plant just
17 seemed unimaginable. But you know, now, you know,
18 we've learned stuff from, you know, we need to, you
19 know... The thing about ocean Bay, you know, which
20 we were able to do with federal funding, you know,
21 with FEMA dollars, is we were, you know, we have
22 heating... heating systems on the roofs of those...
23 those buildings, so... and it's also unique to the
24 one building, and it's not the entire development.

2 So if we have an outage there it is one building,
3 it's not the entire complex.

4 So there are ways that we can do this that are
5 much smarter, much more resilient, and will... you
6 know, it's, you know, it's better use of the public
7 dollars.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: So is that a... is that a
9 criteria that is embedded, kind of in all the design
10 project assessments when you're replacing? Like, is
11 that a whole...?

12 MR. GROSSMAN: Yeah, so... I'm going to pass to
13 Joy for to... just clarify one item. At Sotomayor
14 specifically, it was a it was a tank room that
15 flooded. It caused a number of problems in in going
16 back into the boiler room, but the boiler itself
17 didn't flood. Again, that's just a waste stack or a
18 waste line. I hate to come full circle to complain
19 about this again. But this goes to antiquated
20 disinvestment in our plumbing systems over a number
21 of years. And that's... We see a lot of this. It's
22 unfortunate and... but, you know, we've,
23 unfortunately had to get very good at working with
24 our partners, and our... in our different business
25 units to respond effectively to these leads from

2 above. Whether it comes from a heating line or a
3 domestic water line, or even worse as a waste line,
4 but to answer your question on... on the other
5 resiliency question, I'll defer to joy.

6 MS. SINDERBRAND: I appreciate the opportunity to
7 talk about NYCHA's climate adaptation plan. Because
8 last fall, when... when NYCHA released the plan, we
9 knew... we... we knew that it was it was new to... to
10 the agency as a whole. The Sandy recovery projects
11 invested about \$2.7 billion to date and had raised up
12 critical equipment at 200 buildings. That
13 incremental cost isn't typically funded when... when
14 critical infrastructure is funded. As Keith has said
15 earlier, with funding for a boiler. And so... so
16 what we're trying to do now is really make sure that
17 the design teams and the design build teams have
18 access to all the information we've gathered on the
19 risks that NYCHA developments are facing, whether
20 that storm surge, extreme heat, extreme rain,
21 groundwater, extreme wind, and really building that
22 into the design process. In some cases, that will be
23 an incremental cost that's variable. In other cases,
24 it will be a cost will require us to pursue
25 additional funding, possibly through the disaster

2 recovery funding sources, and we're certainly looking
3 to CDBG-GDR money to fund those increments to raise
4 boiler rooms above grade.

5 And finally, I just wanted to mention that this
6 is just the start. So you know, Vlada's roof... is
7 piloting a lot of really great... really great
8 systems and the Cleaning Heat For All System is,
9 again, just by virtue of design, moving that critical
10 equipment from a centralized plant, from a basement
11 up into the unit. So it's really not at... at that
12 same risk of flooding. And if something happens,
13 that one unit can be replaced without impacting other
14 apartments. So we are definitely building the same,
15 as we work with MOCEJ on the Local Law 41 Climate
16 Design Resiliency Guidelines.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much joy. I
18 know there is an enormous amount of work being done.
19 And yeah, it's... I think the entire city has to
20 include the costs of climate change and everything
21 that it does from how it operates... how its staffing
22 gets deployed, quite frankly, right?, and how... and
23 how they, they interact with this new reality, to,
24 you know, very technical capital projects.

2 So I think, you know, not particularly unique to
3 NYCHA. But I think my... our worst case scenario, in
4 terms of the deployment of public dollars is
5 "business as usual" and then having to correct it
6 after the fact, which we have seen a lot of, which is
7 an utter waste of public dollars, and frustrating for
8 everyone involved, quite frankly. So I'm glad to
9 hear of that, you know, integration. And obviously,
10 NYCHA has really felt it firsthand, right? So I
11 appreciate that.

12 I guess. With that, we can turn it over to
13 public comment. I want to thank you all for your
14 testimony, your time and your work. And there are
15 millions of other questions I didn't ask that I will
16 ask off the record. But I appreciate certainly
17 the... the work and the strides that have been made
18 and the continued commitment to do better by
19 residents every single day.

20 The night is young on our winter season. So
21 we'll be back to reconvene around how both the
22 preventative measures and the improvements that
23 everyone is working hard on materialize at the end.
24 So thank you for that.

2 MR. GROSSMAN: And thank you for the opportunity.
3 We really do appreciate it. We always appreciate
4 your continued support and especially appreciate
5 your... your recognition of the hard work of our
6 staff. I know that means a lot for them, as it does
7 for me. So... So thank you and I'm sure we'll be
8 speaking offline soon.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: We'd like to call on Aixa
10 Torres.

11 MS. TORRES: Hi, good afternoon.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

13 MS. TORRES: I'm on Zoom. I'm on the Zoom.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: We hear you.

15 MS. TORRES: Okay, good afternoon.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

17 MS. TORRES: So the heating system. of the
18 people that I saw from NYCHA, the only one that I
19 know, because I have him on speed dial and I have
20 real emergency is Javier Almodovar, and he... I...
21 he's the only one I really deal with when it comes to
22 heating.

23 However, my issue and my comment about this
24 whole... We are one of those developments of the
25 state funded they are getting new boilers. I have

2 been told that the contractor that is going to do my
3 development is Richards Plumbing. And I am furious.
4 I really... you know and the response was... oh,
5 they... they were the lowest bidder. Um I don't
6 understand why they were picked. They're horrible.
7 They've already been in Smith. We... We had them do
8 something that was simple, and it ended up taking
9 months. And then another vendor had to be hired to
10 fix up their mess-up.

11 So, to the tune of \$31 million, somebody explain
12 to me, and I would like to know why this decision was
13 made, that procurement has done something like this.
14 And I know that I've spoken to other TA presidents
15 who have... who were now in this thrust of getting
16 new boilers, will it really make a difference in our
17 apartments, right? Will the apartments be normal in
18 terms of heat and cooling? Or are we just going to
19 have the same thing that we have now, where one side
20 of the building is Antarctic, and the other one is
21 in... is in Africa from heat, right? So I... I
22 really don't understand why, you know... or no one
23 has yet to answer me what... like for Smith, why we
24 have a we have a plumber, who... like we did for the
25 Sandy... who did a horrible job. Then they had to

2 come in and spend some more money in our development.
3 And... And as everyone knows, there is no... there is
4 no love lost between Ms Cinda[sp] Brian[sp] and I,
5 because of her disrespect. And she has yet to answer
6 any of my questions.

7 And so, you know, this is my testimony. The
8 heating issue has to be really... people have to be
9 really part of the process. And we really have not
10 been part of the process. Yes, I have... I have the
11 plans for the boiler. I have... I have commented.
12 I've had experts look at it, and all of that. But
13 when it came to the selection of the plumber company,
14 knowing that they're horrible, and that I've
15 complained about them a lot. Please explain to me
16 why they have been... they've... they've actually...
17 for doing a lousy job, they... they you know... What
18 is it? You do a lousy job and so you get... you get
19 more contracts, and make more money in NYCHA?

20 And so I... I have a problem. I have a problem
21 with my boiler... the boiler system that's going up,
22 that yes, we've approved? I'm not going to say we
23 haven't, because NYCHA is going say, "Oh, but you..."
24 No. But I don't approve of the vendor... of the
25 contractor, because he's been horrible. And, yes,

2 they've sent somebody. I assure you, that's not... I
3 don't want to hear any of that.

4 I have a resident who has died on my board from
5 911 cancer, because the people from the resiliency
6 did not listen to us about taking precautions with
7 the dust and everything else. I have a board...
8 another board member who's... who had to have surgery
9 for cancer because... for the same reason.

10 And if I sound angry, I am. You know, there...
11 there's no getting around my grief and my anger about
12 how NYCHA has handled contractors. And they're being
13 awarded for doing lousy jobs. And I yield the floor
14 and I thank you for giving me the opportunity to make
15 this comment. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you so much, Miss
17 Torres. We will need to continue that inquiry around
18 specific contractors. That is for sure. You... We
19 will follow up with you.

20 Next. Oh there's no... Well, on that note, I
21 think this is the only public testimony we had for
22 today, which is highly unusual, but here we are.
23 More to come. I want to thank everyone. Thank you
24 Aixa, for being here, for the work you do with the
25 residents every single day. Thank you to the staff.

2 Obviously this is an ongoing story. We are at the
3 beginning of our heating season and we will see
4 how... how this all performs. But I wish everyone a
5 healthy, safe holiday, and more work to come. I
6 appreciate you all. Thank you very much

7 [GAVEL]

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date 12/21/2022