CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON FIRE AND CRIMINAL JUSTICE SERVICES

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE

-----X

January 24, 2011 Start: 6:00 pm Recess: 7:58 pm

HELD AT: Council Chambers City Hall

BEFORE:

ELIZABETH S. CROWLEY Chairperson, Fire and Criminal Justice Services

JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS, not present Chairperson, Oversight and Investigations

PETER F. VALLONE, JR., not present Chairperson, Public Safety

LETITIA JAMES Chairperson, Sanitation and Solid Waste

A P P E A R A N C E S [CONTINUED] COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Council Member Maria del Carmen Arroyo Council Member Fernando Cabrera Council Member Helen D. Foster Council Member G. Oliver Koppell Council Member Annabel Palma Council Member Larry B. Seabrook

A P P E A R A N C E S [CONTINUED]

Letitia James Chairperson Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste

James Vacca Chairperson Committee on Transportation

Council Member Vacca thanks: Council Member James, Council Member Palma

Elizabeth Crowley Chairperson Committee on Fire and Criminal Justice Services

Annabel Palma Chairperson Bronx Delegation

Council Member James acknowledges: Ruben Diaz Borough President Borough of the Bronx

Maria del Carmen Arroyo Chairperson Committee on Health

Council Member Arroyo thanks: Hostos Community College for hosting the hearing All the Committee staff for their work

Council Member James thanks: Hostos Community College for hosting the hearing

Fernando Cabrera New York City Council Member

Council Member Cabrera thanks: Speaker Quinn, Council Member James and Hostos Community College for organizing the hearing A P P E A R A N C E S [CONTINUED] G. Oliver Koppell New York City Council Member Council Member Koppell thanks: Sanitation workers in his district for their work Andrew Sandler, Council Member Koppell Staffer for his work Council Member James acknowledges: Representative from Council Member Joel Rivera Representative from Council Member Larry Seabrook Iggie Terranova Community Affairs Unit Department of Sanitation George Torres Mayor's Office of Community Affairs Ruben Diaz, Jr. Borough President Borough of Brooklyn Herman Francis Community Board 1 John Rosenkowski Bronx community resident Linda Pedrosa Concerned citizen, visually impaired Steven Bailey Vice Chairman Concerned Residents Organization, Inc. Howard Gisky Concerned citizen Alvin Rodriguez Concerned citizen

4

A P P E A R A N C E S [CONTINUED]

Barbara Gibson Concerned citizen

Walter Nessler Concerned citizen

Abraham Jones Executive Director Claremont Neighborhood Centers, Inc.

Bonita Johnson Recording Secretary Local 100 Transport Workers Union

Doni Walker Santiago St. Andrews Home Owners

Professor Hetty Fox Longtime Bronx Resident Sociologist and Author

Carl Jimenez Concerned citizen

Angelo Vega Concerned citizen

Mike Pacolli Concerned citizen

Kenny Agosto District Leader 80th Assembly District

Joseph Garber Director Civil Service Merit Council

Kevin Harvey Local 100 Transit Workers Union

A P P E A R A N C E S [CONTINUED]

Camilla Jackson Throgs Neck and northeast Bronx

Christine Williams Brooklyn resident

Deborah Meyers Bronx resident CERT team member

Mr. Almonte Concerned citizen

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 7 2 [Background conversation] MR. EDDIE RENTO CORIASO: Today's 3 an offsite hearing, today's Committees are going 4 5 to be Sanitation and Solid Waste Management, the Committee of Public Safety, the Committee on Fire б 7 and Criminal Justice Services and the Committee on 8 Oversight and Investigations. Today's date is 9 January 24, 2011 and it's being recorded by Eddie Rento Coriaso. 10 11 [Gavel banging] 12 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Good evening and welcome--is this on? Thank you. Good evening 13 14 and welcome to the Joint Hearing of the New York 15 City Council. I am Letitia James from the 16 Council's Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste 17 Management. I am joined this evening by Council 18 Member Helen Foster who's just joining us, Council 19 Member Maria del Carmen Arroyo, and to my left 20 Council Member Jimmy Vacca and Council Member 21 Cabrera all representing the Bronx delegation. On December 26th and 27th in the City 22 23 of New York was hit by a blizzard. In a span of less than 24 hours the entire city was blanketed 24 25 with snowfall ranging from 14 to 29 inches. We've

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 8 also been joined by Council Member Annabel Palma. 2 The City's snow removal services 3 4 and infrastructure for reasons not yet totally 5 clear completely failed to keep up with the storm. When most New Yorkers awoke on the morning of the 6 27th a significant number of roads were untouched 7 by plows, making normal roads of transit nearly 8 9 impossible. In conjunction with and as a result of that failure to remove snow from City streets, 10 11 emergency response including fire, police and 12 ambulances were crippled. Mass transit which 13 typically technically continued to run through the 14 storm was paralyzed. 15 The result of these failures were 16 very real and very tragic consequences. These 17 failures raised questions about the City's 18 preparedness for and response to this storm. 19 Furthermore these questions also extend to our 20 preparedness for other and greater disasters. 21 These questions should and must be answered. New 22 York City has dealt with plenty of storms of 23 similar scale. And I, like many other Council 24 Members, have often sung the praises of 25 Commissioner Doherty and the Department of

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 9 Sanitation for their excellence response and hard 2 work in addressing those storms. 3 But not this time. In this time 4 5 the City failed to meet its own high standards or even the basic needs of its citizenry. And we are б here today to hear from residents in the Borough 7 8 of the Bronx about how this failure impacted your 9 lives and what you think we can do to prevent those impacts in the future. At a Council hearing 10 11 last week or the week before, Commissioner Doherty 12 testified in a very constructive and open manner 13 about what took place during the Christmas 14 blizzard. At that hearing we focused on the 15 larger systematic and operational issues that 16 impacted the City's preparation and response to 17 the storm. We also heard administration 18 19 testimony from Deputy Mayor of Operations, Steven 20 Goldsmith, the Commissioner of the Office of 21 Emergency Management, Joseph Bruno and Fire 22 Commissioner Salvatore Cassano. In addition we 23 heard from a variety of unions and civic groups 24 impacted by the storm and its cleanup. I believe 25 that most viewers and participants in that hearing

2 found it both constructive and respectful.

Today we are continuing the second 3 phase of hearings which involves gathering direct 4 5 testimony about the storm and its aftermath from the public on a Borough by Borough basis. We have 6 7 already begun. We've already had hearings in the 8 City's other four Boroughs. Today we will hear 9 from the people of the Bronx. I know that many of us endured experiences that were painful and 10 11 caused us real harm. We want to hear about those 12 experiences but I request that everyone strive to 13 make constructive comments to add to what we know 14 about solving what went wrong. No one knows as 15 much about what happened during and after that 16 storm than all of you residents of the Bronx. So 17 educate us but please keep it civil and please 18 keep it to at least three to four minutes. 19 Finally I'm glad to note that we

20 are joined by representatives of the Department of 21 Sanitation, the Mayor's Community Affairs Unit. 22 But from what I understand as has been the 23 practice, these representatives will make brief 24 remarks after my colleagues have concluded their 25 opening statements and will remain at tonight's

2 hearing to listen to the testimony provided by the public. Unfortunately they will make a statement 3 4 but will not answer any questions which I believe 5 and I cannot speak for my colleagues is б outrageous, unacceptable and an act of disrespect 7 to the residents of the Bronx. The fact is that 8 at that initial hearing a number of my colleagues 9 wanted to ask pointed questions. And they should 10 have. And those questions should have been asked 11 and answered here at the Borough hearings. And to 12 have a representative, a very fine representative 13 who has been at every hearing but nonetheless 14 someone who was not in a position to answer the 15 questions of my colleagues and your questions, again is a slap in the face to this body as well 16 17 as to the residents of the Bronx. The Mayor of the City of New York 18

failed us during the blizzard and again once again is failing us this evening. And last but not least when the Mayor of the City of New York gave his State of the City address, my position is that he should have said two words. I'm sorry. Well actually it's three. He failed to. And to me that says a lot about what he feels about the

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 12 residents of the City of New York who were 2 inconvenienced and some who lost their lives 3 during the blizzard. 4 5 At this time I'm going to turn it over to the Chair of Transportation, Council 6 7 Member Jimmy Vacca. COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you 8 9 Tish and thank you all for coming. I know you all 10 have snow on your minds because we got a snow job on December 26th and the days after that. As 11 12 Chairman of the Committee on Transportation I 13 address the failures of the MTA. We had an Oversight Hearing at City Hall and the MTA 14 15 failures were very significant. Those of you who 16 looked for a bus on all those days after the storm 17 know what I mean. Bus service was stranded. We 18 waited and waited. Busses never came. The MTA 19 was not prepared. We had busses with no chains 20 going up and down Bronx streets getting stuck. 21 And then when those busses got 22 stuck, what happened? More busses were sent after 23 the busses that were stuck and they all end up, and you know what they all had in common, they 24 were all stuck. Does this make sense? How are we 25

communicating within the MTA to tell other bus drivers don't come on this street it's not been plowed. We have one bus stuck. We don't want other busses stuck. Trains not running. Trains-in Queens, was there for seven hours, seven hours, people were not saved for seven hours in the cold without use of facilities. This is unacceptable.

9 And then in the midst of the storm of December 26th, on December 30th the MTA raises 10 11 the tolls, raises the fares. It goes to the heart 12 of what are we paying for. Why don't we get the 13 service we pay for? Why wasn't the MTA declaring 14 a snow emergency of their own to clear the tracks 15 and get the busses onto our blocks? And I think 16 you'll be learning in the weeks to come how much 17 money did the MTA lose in lost revenue from people who could not access trains and busses and how 18 19 much money did they spend on overtime.

20 So I thank the Council. I thank 21 Chairman Tish James and of course the Bronx 22 delegation, Annabel Palma our Chair for convening 23 this hearing. I know we will get your testimony. 24 We at the City Council are determined to get 25 answers because what happened December 26th, in the

2	Sanitation Department, Department of
3	Transportation, Office of Emergency Management, or
4	the MTA, can never happen again. We cannot be
5	left stranded ever again. We have to make sure
6	that all hands are on deck whenever we have a
7	blizzard. And that this City does its best to
8	cope with even the most difficult of weather
9	conditions. Thank you Chairman James.
10	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: So the Bronx
11	are kind of quiet. Is the Bronx in the house?
12	AUDIENCE: Yea [clapping].
13	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you. Are
14	you justdo you need to defrost, is that it?
15	Could you warm up a little bit? I came all the
16	way from Brooklyn. Could you clap? Could you
17	clap? Thank you. Let's clap for Council Member
18	Vacca's opening statement. Thank you very much.
19	The next speaker is Council Member Crowley, the
20	Chair of the Fire and Criminal Justice System.
21	Thank you.
22	CHAIRPERSON CROWLEY: Thank you
23	Madam Chair James. Council Member Elizabeth
24	Crowley, I chair Fire and Criminal Justice on the
25	

2	So it's a pleasure to be here in the Bronx with
3	you tonight. When we had our hearing on January
4	10^{th} the Administration told us they were
5	unprepared. They made a mistake. They did not
6	call a now emergency. And because they did not
7	call that snow emergency they failed us as a City.
8	They didn't move the people at the right time and
9	we had implications in the communities that were
10	felt for days. Out in Queens we were paralyzed.
11	We couldn't get out of our homes
12	and when it comes to emergency services we need to
13	make sure that an ambulance can get to an
14	emergency situation within minutes not hours. And
15	the situation with so many ambulances getting
16	stuck in the snow is simply unacceptable. So like
17	my colleague Jimmy Vacca said we need to make sure
18	we get to the bottom of this dysfunction so we can
19	assure you, the people of the City of New York,
20	that this will never happen again. Thank you.
21	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you. And
22	now we will hear from the Chair of the Bronx
23	delegation, Council Member Annabel Palma.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Thank you.
25	Good evening everyone. I'm Council Member Annabel

2 Palma and I want to thank Speaker Quinn, Council Member James, Vacca and Crowley for convening 3 these hearings across the City of New York. I 4 5 know it's been a daunting task but nevertheless I think that's the least that we owe the public to 6 7 make sure that we are able to go to them and get 8 their suggestions and ideas on how helpful the 9 City can be so this doesn't happen to them again. You know, I know that we all experienced the same 10 11 difficulties across the City and in some areas 12 worse than others.

13 It's something that should have not 14 It's something that I know the had happened. 15 Council along with the Administration, once we 16 convene all the information, is going to work hard 17 on making sure that if there's a next time around 18 or when the next time comes around and hopefully 19 it's not tonight with the snow that's being 20 announced that we are prepared to make sure that 21 we can continue to move the citizens of New York 22 swiftly and making sure that services continue to 23 run. It was an unfortunately event that we had to 24 endure. We're still, in some of our neighborhoods still have mountains of snow from that first 25

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 17 2 blizzard that fell. And so we want to make sure that 3 4 that's not repeated, that the City is prepared, in 5 making sure that this City is able to function under any weather conditions that we may be faced б 7 with. So I want to thank you for coming out 8 tonight. I think it's extremely important. I was 9 listening to a segment on Channel 4 last week 10 where, you know, the reporters were sort of 11 chuckling and said, you know, it's great that 12 they're having these hearings but I hope these are 13 not just venting sessions. 14 And I can tell you that the reason 15 these hearings were convened, they're not to be, 16 you know, they're not venting sessions for us. We really want to hear suggestions from you the 17 people that were affected by this blizzard and the 18 19 lack of services that were not delivered to you on 20 that day. And some are still experiencing some of 21 the impact that we were hit with that day. So I 22 really take these hearing seriously. And I really 23 hope that you use the time to really voice your 24 concerns and give us your suggestions so that 25 we'll be able to help the Administration put a

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 18
2	plan together to avoid a situation like this in
3	the future. Thank you.
4	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you.
5	We've been joined by Council Member Oliver Koppell
6	from the Bronx as well as the Borough President of
7	the great Borough of the Bronx. Let's give him a
8	round of applause, Ruben Diaz.
9	[Applause]
10	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Borough
11	President, you can either sit here or we'll hear
12	from you shortly, whatever you prefer. Okay we'll
13	call you shortly. Next we hear the Chair of the
14	Health Committee, Council Member Maria Carmen del
15	Arroyo.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Is it on?
17	Yes. And the Council Member that represents the
18	Council District where we're in so I want to
19	welcome you all to Council District 17. I want
20	to, at the risk of repeating myself, I would just
21	thank also Community College for hosting this
22	event for us this evening. I want to say an
23	incredible thank you to the Chairs of the
24	Committees that have had this conversation across
25	our City over the last month. And I think Council

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 19
2	Member James if you remember you asked us to be
3	civil so that I think we're just trying to
4	practice to be civil. That's why we're so quiet.
5	[Laughter]
6	COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: So welcome
7	all of you. We look forward to hearing from you
8	and hearing your concerns and some of your
9	personal stories about the experiences that you
10	had or someone close to you had and how we as a
11	city can better prepare for the even that would
12	inevitably hit us. I don't know about you but I'm
13	sick of snow. And it's only the first real month
14	of the season. I'm not sure what lies ahead for
15	us but we need to be much better prepared to
16	address the needs of our constituencies in the
17	event that we experience a storm of the magnitude
18	that hit us around our holidays. So thank you
19	Council Member James and the Co-Chairs of this
20	Committee. And the Committee staff who have
21	worked so hard to put all of the documents
22	together. Who are the people who are going to
23	take the notes and make sure that we have all of
24	the details and the points that you make to us and
25	help us focus our energy to prevent this from

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 20
2	happening again.
3	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you. I
4	too want to thank Hostos College for hosting us
5	and thank them for their hospitality. Council
6	Member Cabrera.
7	[Background noise]
8	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: No? Okay.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Anyway
10	good evening everyone. I'll sit close to my Dean
11	of the delegation. I want to give a special
12	thanks to the Speaker as well and to the Chairs
13	and to all the Council Members here and our hosts
14	but most important to everyone that came out
15	tonight. I know it's cold. We could have stayed
16	home. But by showing up, you're showing that you
17	truly care. I tell you I recount that night when
18	we had the blizzard I was coming out of Ewing
19	[phonetic] College after doing a television show.
20	And I drove right by, right on Heath Avenue, and I
21	was driving on my 4 by 4, barely making it through
22	the street. I came across something I had never
23	seen right here in the Bronx. A wall of snow
24	about eight feet tall. I couldn't even get
25	through. I barely was able to get back out. Then

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 21 2 I relied nobody's driving tonight. I'm one of the few drivers. I probably seen one other driver. 3 And I mention that because one of 4 5 the things that the Administration has told us is б that part of the problem or the biggest problem 7 was that there was no snow emergency that was 8 called upon. But there's nobody in the streets. 9 There is nobody driving around. And so it wasn't 10 that we had massive amount of people in the 11 streets, massive amount of people especially in 12 the evening time driving. I believe that it was a failure of action. And we had a failure of 13 communication, communicating to our constituents, 14 15 especially when it came down to the MTS. It was 16 mentioned by Chair Vacca. 17 And it was just a failure of really 18 of stepping up and doing what was required and 19 what is expected. And so let me just make this 20 last point. Last June in one of the hearings with 21 Sanitation and Finance Committee, I made mention 22 of the fact that why is it that when there is 23 snow, and I go to Manhattan, it seems that it's 24 always clean but then when we're in the Bronx, the 25 streets seem to be neglected when it comes to snow

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 22
2	removal. And I just hope that this is going to be
3	a wakeup call. And I believe there is a wakeup
4	call taking place here on the Administration's
5	part. Thank you so much and thank you for coming
6	out tonight.
7	[Applause]
8	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you.
9	Yes, Council Member Koppell. Is it on?
10	[Testing mics]
11	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Here you go.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: I may not
13	pretend to be you since you take your pictures.
14	So I want to thank you Chair Vacca from the Bronx.
15	I want to particularly thank Tish James and
16	Elizabeth Crowley for coming from other boroughs
17	to be with us this evening. And I recognize that
18	the snow emergency was indeed a major disaster in
19	other parts of the City and parts of the Bronx as
20	well. And we'll hear tonight and I'll be
21	interested to hear. I know that there are City
22	I'm sure that there are City officials here and
23	Sanitation Department officials here.
24	And if they're going to say
25	something that is somewhat contrary to what others

2	say but that's not to say, and I want to emphasize
3	this, that any of you may say I doubt in any way
4	and I acknowledge that the situation was truly
5	horrific in many parts of the City. And we've
6	heard about that already and I don't need to go
7	into that. But I do want to say because I've got
8	to thank those people who served my district, that
9	they were well-responsive. Our office was open.
10	Andrew Sandler [phonetic] who is here this evening
11	was there all day.
12	We got relatively few calls which
13	usually is an indication that it isn't so bad
14	because I hear that colleagues got dozens or even
15	hundreds of calls. We got very few calls in my
16	district. And when we called the Sanitation
17	Department and called particular'cause it wasn't
18	perfect, when we called particular problems to
19	their attention, they responded. So I want to be
20	frank about it and say thank you to those who
21	served my district.
22	There is a lesson to be learned
23	though. Because if they could do it in my
24	district and we don't normallywe don't have just
25	brood wide atreate but a lat of normal strests

broad wide streets but a lot of narrow streets,

25

2	windy streets, we have hills. We have all these
3	conditions and yet we managed to get through
4	pretty well. So if they could do it in the 11^{th}
5	Council District which goes all the way to
6	Riverdale all the way over to White Plains Road,
7	they could do it other places. And so it sort of
8	illustrates it, the job can be done reasonably
9	well and it wasn't in so many parts of the City.
10	But I do want to acknowledge the folks who worked
11	in my district for the job they did for us. Thank
12	you.
13	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: I just want to
14	acknowledge the fact that we have a representative
15	from Council Member Joel Rivera's office who could
16	not join us and Council Member Larry Seabrook's
17	office as well. And let me just say that this is
18	not a therapy session. We will conclude these
19	hearings with a series of recommendations
20	including but not limited to clarification on

21 chain of command as well as protocols for snow 22 emergency declarations as well as a series of 23 legislation.

And let me also say that in defense of Manhattan, when we attended the Manhattan

2	hearing there were residents there north of $96^{ ext{th}}$
3	Street, residents from Chinatown in the Lower East
4	Side who also complained that their streets were
5	not plowed. So when we talk about Manhattan we
6	have to be very specific. But if they can do it
7	for Council Member Koppell then they should do it
8	for the entire City. Thank you Council Member
9	Koppell. Our next speaker is Iggie Terranova from
10	the Community Affairs Unit of the Department of
11	Sanitation. He's also joined by George Torres
12	from the Mayor's Office, also from Community
13	Affairs. Mr. Terranova?
14	MR. IGGIE TERRANOVA: Good evening
15	Council Members. I am Iggie Terranova and I am
16	here tonight representing the Department of
17	Sanitation on behalf of Commissioner John J.
18	Doherty. I am here tonight to listen to the
19	community's concerns regarding the Department's
20	response to the December 26 $^{ m th}$ blizzard. Despite
21	our efforts our snowplowing operations did not
22	meet the standards to which New Yorkers have come
23	to expect from the Department which is also what
24	we have said is not acceptable.

25

We are continuing to assess the

storm's response with other City agencies and will implement changes necessary to enhance interagency coordination as well as communications with the public. Some of those changes were already implemented during the last two snow storms and the impending snow storm coming the next couple of days.

9 We take pride in our work and will 10 continue working hard to restore the Department's 11 reputation for being the world's best snow 12 fighters. I will now listen to your comments and 13 take them all back to Commissioner John J. 14 Doherty. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you Mr. 16 Terranova. Again my message to the Mayor of the 17 City of New York, I hope that you would not--you 18 would take this in the spirit that this is offered 19 and not as a personal attack. I think that I'm 20 glad that you were here but I believe that Borough 21 Superintendents from each respective Borough 22 should have been here to answer questions. That's 23 the least that the Mayor of the City of New York 24 could have offered to the residents of the Bronx. 25 It's unacceptable that there is no one here to

1 Co	1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 27	
2	answer the questions of my colleagues as well as	
3	the questions of the residents of the Borough of	
4	the Bronx. And I thank you for attending.	
5	[Applause]	
6	MR. TERRANOVA: Thank you.	
7	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: The next	
8	speaker is, and I guess I say this at every	
9	Borough, every hearing, the greatest Borough	
10	President [laughing] in the Bronx. Let's give it	
11	up for Borough President Ruben Diaz.	
12	[Applause]	
13	BOROUGH PRESIDENT RUBEN DIAZ, JR.:	
14	Thank you Chairwoman James and to all of the Chair	
15	members and City Council Members. Welcome for	
16	those of you, for the two of you who are not from	
17	God's country. Welcome to God's country. I love	
18	to see the Bronx delegation here as well and to	
19	all of my fellow Bronxites, thank you for coming	
20	out even though this blizzard was on December 26 $^{ t th}$	
21	and we saw on the 27^{th} and the 28^{th} the poor	
22	response from the City, and there's been two	
23	subsequent snowfalls since that we really can't	
24	complain too much about. I think that it is	
25	important that we are all here tonight. And I	

want to thank you and the Speaker of the City
Council. I want to thank the City Council as a
body for being as diligent as you are, as to what
occurred on December 26^{th} and the 27^{th} and the 28^{th} .
We know and I know that there was a comment made
earlier about us being mindful and respectful in
terms of other Boroughs.
CHAIRPERSON JAMES: It didn't apply
to you.
[Laughter]
MR. DIAZ: But the reality is that
first let me just say that I think it's
disrespectful that none of the Commissioners are
in the Bronx. I think that it's disrespectful
that none of the City Hall Administration's
leadership is here and they were at other hearings
in another Borough. Okay so we are taxpayers as
well. We here in the Bronx are so upset and the
Council Member Koppell said that he didn't receive
a lot of telephone calls, naturally I did. I not
only received telephone calls in my office but I
only received telephone calls in my office but I received telephone calls at home. And my dogs, on

2	And I thought that after the snow
3	had fallen I was going to be able to get in my car
4	and go to K-Mart which is down the strip on Story
5	Avenue and I could not, two days after the
6	snowfall. So when traditionally when we get major
7	streets like Story Avenue and White Plains that
8	are plowed, that was not the case, myself and my
9	two sons had to walk from Story Avenue to K-Mart
10	to get dog food and come all the way back. Now.
11	I'm not complaining about that. I'm still young
12	and strong and so are my children.
13	But what I am complaining about is
14	the fact that you have senior citizens who could
15	not get medication, who had Bronxites who could
16	not go to doctors' appointments. We received a
17	telephone call, Madam Chair, from a family who had
18	lost a loved one and they drove me to the funeral,
19	it made the event even more so because they were
20	getting stuck out in the snow. We heard, we had,
21	of course, we also had our fair share of emergency
22	units that were stuck and ambulances and fire
23	trucks.
24	And I thought it was pretty
25	pathetic that on one hand you had the Mayor of the

2	City of New York in one of his press conferences
3	saying that everything was okay. And then during
4	the press conference there was literally a split
5	screen and one of the news stations where he's
6	saying everything is okay don't panic and on the
7	other side, you had sanitation trucks and
8	ambulances literally spinning their tires and
9	stuck in the middle of the street.
10	The reason why we're so outraged
11	here is not just because of what occurred during
12	this blizzard. We know for the most part that the
13	City has done something well and we hope and not
14	to have anything personal against the gentleman
15	who testified earlier, it helps to have the City
16	come and admit that something went wrong. But we
17	want to know why did it go wrong, why wasn't there
18	an emergency call, and who is responsible. And
19	what's going to happen to those individuals?
20	We as elected officials we're
21	always held to be responsible when something
22	negative happens. And in this case somebody
23	really dropped the ball. You know I hate to say
24	it but what happened during this blizzard was what
25	happened last night with the Jets. The City just

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 31		
2	came up short. And we as New Yorkers, just the	
3	same as we are heartbroken today over the Jet's	
4	loss, we'll continue to be heartbroken.	
5	But here in the Bronx where we have	
6	the outrage is that this blizzard was just	
7	symbolic of the overall treatment that we get in	
8	terms of the lack of services in the Borough.	
9	Remember when we have snow storms with, of course,	
10	less footage or inches that fall, we always get	
11	train stations where the snow is not taken off the	
12	staircases.	
13	We always have streets that aren't	
14	plowed. And that continues to be the case time	
15	and time again whether for instance the MTA is	
16	coming out with a report on the different stations	
17	that are going to be done over and, you know, it	
18	always seems like the Bronx does not get its fair	
19	share. And we're sick and tired of it. We're	
20	sick and tired of being treated as we're not	
21	citizens of New York. We're sick and tired of	
22	being the stepchild of the City. We're not going	
23	to tolerate it. I'm so proud as the Borough	
24	President that all of the Bronxites have come out.	
25	[Applause]	

2	MR. DIAZ: And in the future, not
3	only do we want you to come up with
4	recommendations as to how is it that the City is
5	going to declare emergencies, in the future we
6	also want your body as a City Council delegation
7	to look at to how was it that you're going to have
8	equity, parity and equal treatment and a fair plan
9	for snow removal as well as other services, not
10	just to Manhattan, not just to the more affluent
11	sections of New York City but to all of New York
12	City.
13	We are taxpayers. We're raising
14	our families here. We are Bronx proud. And we
15	love our Borough and we're not going to tolerate
16	this from this Mayor who wants to run for
17	President of the United States and can't even have
18	a plan of action for a blizzard. So I don't know
19	if he wants to manage something nationwide or
20	international, in this case he can't even manage
21	what's happened right here at home. So.
22	[Applause]
23	MR. DIAZ: I think that you guys in
24	the City Council have been just amazing. I would
25	urge you to continue to ask the questions that

2	need to be asked, to hold peoples' feet to the
3	fire and hopefully in the future what comes out of
4	the blizzard of 2010 is something that will
5	prevent not only the poor cleanup or the poor
6	plowing but equitable, fair treatment for all New
7	Yorkers. So thank you very much for coming to the
8	Bronx. Thank you Bronxites for allowing me to go
9	first. I respect you all.
10	[Applause]
11	MR. DIAZ: And, you know, we just
12	need to keep on going until we here get our fair
13	treatment and people know that the Bronx is not to
14	be messed with. Thank you.
15	[Applause]
16	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you
17	Borough President. Thank you for warming up the
18	crowd. Thank you.
19	[Applause]
20	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: The next
21	speaker is Herman Francis representing Community
22	Board 1. Could you please put on the clock?
23	Three minutes for every speaker thereafter.
24	[Pause]
25	MR. HERMAN FRANCIS: Good evening.

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 34 2 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Mr. Fran--good 3 evening. MR. FRANCIS: A man once said that 4 5 history is a great teacher. All we have to do is look in the archives of previous administrations 6 7 and the plan was already in place about snow 8 removal. This is not an issue of snow plowing. 9 Of course we're not in the country. We are on a 10 land area of the metropolis of the state, build 11 that--people are stacked on top of each other. 12 During the Radner [phonetic] administration, the 13 plan was in place. 14 All snow was to be put on what we 15 call snow streets. Then the worker would come by 16 and pick it up, put it in the truck and take it to 17 the river and dump it. And then a crew came 18 behind them, over the fire hydrants and the rest 19 of the snow was pushed down the sewers or the 20 manhole covers. Somebody got the idea of salt, so 21 the snow was now pushed down there. 22 The former Mayor of New Orleans, 23 Ray Nagin, learned this lesson the hard way when 24 Katrina hit. Where he made decisions based on 25 pure economics not to shut the city down. He left

a whole bus fleet and most of the police
department was bailed out because they wanted to
take care of their families. He then--even George
Bush had to get rid of his fellow in FEMA because
of the incompetence.

Ray Nagin knows that the next time 7 8 when he gave his police department time off a week 9 ahead of time to take care of their families and close the city down. The decision last time of 10 December 26th was made based on pure economics. My 11 12 understanding is they'll all declare a snow day. 13 City workers get paid who do not show up and those who do show up get time and a half. Ever since 14 15 Ragmore [phonetic] and Roberts got to get and 16 eliminated the Lines Law [phonetic], services in 17 this state have been slowly going down step by 18 step by step.

19 The Sanitation Department, I did 20 not blame them at all because they have a rule put 21 in place since that they need 24 hours notice to 22 do whatever they're going to do. The only one who 23 can sign off on that is the Mayor. And this was 24 just he created as head of Emergency, well the 25 Federal government has a statute there that any

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 36		
2	emergency that comes up due to an act of God's	
3	natural, all city vehicles, all public vehicles	
4	are to be used to assist the public.	
5	That's why the Mayor of New Orleans	
6	lost his bus fleet 'cause he did not use it to	
7	assist the public. And that's why every time	
8	something happens around here in New York City	
9	that comes with an act of God or Mother Nature,	
10	the MTA does not abide by that, that common	
11	sense.	
12	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Hum.	
13	MR. FRANCIS: 'Cause they all do is	
14	follow new rules and bureaucrats and it's above -	
15	- sign off on it. That Sunday December 26^{th} , I got	
16	a phone call a little after 9:00, about joining	
17	the demonstration that day. I looked out my	
18	window and heard the wind out, now moaning, and I	
19	apologized to my colleagues for not joining them,	
20	but after I heard the wind hit the door I said no	
21	way. If I can look out my window and hear that	
22	wind and see that snow coming I've got to ask, why	
23	wouldn't have hadwhy do we need a head of	
24	Emergency for whatever?	
25	H: Um-hum.	
2	MR. FRANCIS: Well to add to what	
----	--	
3	he did was he laid the groundwork for a suit of	
4	malfeasance and gross incompetence by jeopardizing	
5	the public by his refusal to act from the safety	
6	of the public. My saying is what can you do as	
7	public citizens, I know the City Council now will	
8	deal with it. Those we can organize, put some	
9	funds together and hire an attorney and take these	
10	public officials, take the Mayor to court for	
11	malfeasance.	
12	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you Mr.	
13	Francis. Next speaker is Bonita Johnson,	
14	representing the Transport Workers Union, Local	
15	100, the Recording Secretary. Not here yet? Next	
16	is John Rukowsky [phonetic], I apologize if I	
17	butchered your name. How d you pronounce your	
18	name Sir?	
19	MR. JOHN ROSENKOWSKI: Rosenkowski	
20	[phonetic].	
21	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Rosenkowski, I	
22	apologize. He's done this before.	
23	MR. ROSENKOWSKI: Oh yes I have.	
24	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Oh yeah.	
25	MR. ROSENKOWSKI: [Speaking too	

close to the mic, lots of reverb] Good evening. 2 I'm John Rosenkowski, Bronx community resident. 3 At the January 4th City Council hearing you have 4 5 experienced the same arrogant and dangerous attitude from the MTA that we have know for over a б 7 decade. The MTA has solved their budgetary 8 problems on the backs of the people and - - . 9 They - - - - station agent. Paralyze the City 10 during - - to announce the Mayoral cuts. They 11 were even considering fees such as using stimulus 12 money for operations, - - on their boondoggles 13 and - - massive debt. The MTA - - by their - -14 examples - - but the point - - all station agents. 15 And simply - - safety. The MTA - - but refuses 16 to work with - - and rejects any idea which 17 doesn't allow any input from the - - only. With -18 - the MTA has no public support, no public - -19 ability and has - - of the people and their own 20 employees. These provisions came up before a 21 superficial - - of changes. The MTA is a public 22 authority which means that you who live in New 23 York City, who use the subways, who - - the people have no authority over last - - policy and how our 24 25 hard-earned money is spent. This is the height of

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 39 absurdity. The solution is obvious. It's time to 2 get the MTA - - out of our way. Treating - - that 3 4 we - - tolerate and have - - city - - subways 5 and busses as it does everywhere else. And it must be - - and continued - - that the bare 6 7 incident [phonetic] have a pain cost to - - . 8 this is the only way to rectify this poor - - . -9 - . Which is - - far to go. You are in a position to effect real change by empowering 10 11 yourself and empowering the people, the community, 12 the -- system that is seems to -- of the people 13 of New York City. Thank you very much. 14 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you Mr. 15 Rosenkowski, thank you very much. Linda Pedrosa? 16 [Pause] 17 MS. LINDA PEDROSA: Good evening Madam Chair--18 19 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 20 Good evening. 21 MS. PEDROSA: --distinguished members of Council. I'm just a concerned citizen. 22 23 What I experienced, I live in the foreign section of the Bronx. In the years that I've been living 24 25 in the City of New York I have never, ever seen

2	Fordham Road which is one of the main arteries
3	where traffic flows. I saw busses stuck. I saw
4	cars stuck. It was difficult for me as a legally
5	blind and vision impaired person to walk. And I
6	had to cross the sidewalk. I have to jump over
7	that pile of snow. It was so difficult for me.
8	Imagine me who is still young, what about the
9	senior citizens? But really what disturbed me
10	from Mayor Bloomberg and Commissioner Doherty that
11	he would give an A-plus to the sanitation workers.
12	In my personal opinion I would give them a D-
13	minus.
14	But I notice that Mayor Bloomberg
14 15	But I notice that Mayor Bloomberg said everything is fine. Of course for him
15	said everything is fine. Of course for him
15 16	said everything is fine. Of course for him everything is fine. But not for us here in the
15 16 17	said everything is fine. Of course for him everything is fine. But not for us here in the Bronx. Because we as citizens, we have the same
15 16 17 18	said everything is fine. Of course for him everything is fine. But not for us here in the Bronx. Because we as citizens, we have the same equality as anybody else. We are still taxpayers.
15 16 17 18 19	said everything is fine. Of course for him everything is fine. But not for us here in the Bronx. Because we as citizens, we have the same equality as anybody else. We are still taxpayers. We work to payto improve our quality of life. I
15 16 17 18 19 20	<pre>said everything is fine. Of course for him everything is fine. But not for us here in the Bronx. Because we as citizens, we have the same equality as anybody else. We are still taxpayers. We work to payto improve our quality of life. I feel sad for most people who had to go to work,</pre>
15 16 17 18 19 20 21	<pre>said everything is fine. Of course for him everything is fine. But not for us here in the Bronx. Because we as citizens, we have the same equality as anybody else. We are still taxpayers. We work to payto improve our quality of life. I feel sad for most people who had to go to work, especially for those emergency vehicles who</pre>
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	<pre>said everything is fine. Of course for him everything is fine. But not for us here in the Bronx. Because we as citizens, we have the same equality as anybody else. We are still taxpayers. We work to payto improve our quality of life. I feel sad for most people who had to go to work, especially for those emergency vehicles who couldn't go through to carry out the sick people.</pre>

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 41		
2	of the Mayor will take care of these problems but	
3	most of all, the most important thing, if Mayor	
4	Bloomberg would be out of the City, don't come	
5	with excuses.	
6	And even though he would be far	
7	away, don't come with excuses. And he'd still be	
8	in charge. And leave somebody else in the City to	
9	be in charge when the Mayor is not around. The	
10	only way to be is having integrity, honesty and	
11	truthful because the truth sets us free. And	
12	that's what it's all about for all of us as	
13	citizens and me, our native burns [phonetic]. I	
14	love the City and I wish these things would be	
15	improvements in positive ways. Thank you so much.	
16	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you Ms.	
17	Pedrosa. Thank you very much. Thank you. A	
18	number of individuals also join you. One of the	
19	things that we heard throughout all of our	
20	hearings is about chain of command. Another issue	
21	was about local control. So I thank you for your	
22	testimony. Steven Bailey? Representing the	
23	Concerned Residents Organization, Inc. Are they	
24	only from the Bronx?	
25	MR. STEVEN BAILEY: No we're	

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 42
2	concerned residents. Yes, good evening everyone.
3	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Good evening.
4	MR. BAILEY: My name is Steven
5	Bailey. I'm the Vice Chairman of the Concerned
6	Residents Organization located in the southeast
7	section of the Bronx. In April I'm going to be 65
8	years old.
9	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: God bless you.
10	MR. BAILEY: The point is that you
11	look at me and you see that I can get around. I
12	can walk. I can talk. I can do a lot of things.
13	But there are people in my neighborhood, in our
14	area, in the good Councilwoman Arroyo's and
15	Palma's districts and Mr. Vacca too who don't have
16	the facilities that I have, that don't have the
17	facilities that a lot of people don't have.
18	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Right.
19	MR. BAILEY: The snow on Story
20	Avenue, White Plains Road was 2.5. 3 feet high.
21	People had to stand at least 10 feet away from the
22	curb in traffic looking for a bus. Senior
23	citizens were held captive in their apartments
24	because the crosswalks weren't clean, the bus
25	stops weren't cleaned and you'd see two sanitation

trucks going up and down Story Avenue, going
[making noises] and they were shoveling nothing
but hard concrete. No one cleaned the bus stops.
No one cleaned the pedestrian walkways. The snow
was so high.

And I mean you can make a claim 7 8 that okay you make a small hole in a mound of snow 9 and you can get out to the street. There was no 10 small hole. A lot of people were held captive. 11 The City lost a lot of money because seniors go 12 out and spend when they have to. The City lost a lot of money because the gypsy cabs, the 13 14 unlicensed cabs that run down Story Avenue and up 15 Story Avenue took money away from the MTA for the 16 simple reason is that a lot of people couldn't 17 wait for the bus because the bus stops were 18 inaccessible.

You had to either climb two feet of ice and snow to get out into the street, if you didn't get run over, so you could catch a bus that might not have come. So my plead, my request is that you take this back to whoever you have to take it back to and let them know that the senior citizens of which I am one, the senior citizens

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 44
2	are not going to take this any longer. If we have
3	to march on City Hall, if we have to march on
4	somebody, we are going to march and we are going
5	to get our just due. Thank you.
6	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you Mr.
7	Bailey. Mr. Bailey let me just say that all,
8	again through the other four boroughs we heard
9	about pedestrian walkways not being shoveled, bus
10	stops, crosswalks as well as curb cuts. And one
11	of the recommendations that I am pushing for is a
12	study with respect to the economic impact of this
13	blizzard, a census of all of the people who have
14	died.
15	In Brooklyn we heard about a death
16	of a woman who washer husband was left in the
17	apartment with her body for four days. We heard
18	about a similar circumstance in Queens as well.
19	And so there has been no census of the number of
20	deaths. And last but not least the impact to
21	senior citizens, senior citizens in all four
22	Boroughs talked about how they were prisoners in
23	their own homes. I thank you for your testimony.
24	I thank you for your remarks.
25	MR. BAILEY: Thank you.

1 Co	nmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 45
2	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Howard Gish?
3	How do you pronounce your last name Sir?
4	MR. HOWARD GISKY: Gisky
5	[phonetic].
6	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Gisky, I
7	apologize.
8	MR. GISKY: I
9	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
10	Take it easy.
11	MR. GISKY: Okay. Hi I'm Howard
12	Gisky. Other than the comments that Mr. Koppell
13	said earlier and I would note that on 238^{th} Street
14	the snow was not cleared over the major degan
15	[phonetic] which has always been cleared before.
16	So we did have some problems in Mr. Koppell's area
17	as well.
18	I also note it's common knowledge
19	in our area through a press organ there that Mayor
20	Bloomberg with the GPS in his jet was in Bermuda.
21	So we know that. Everybody knows that. Okay.
22	It's proven. Okay. Now the thing is because of
23	budget cuts in Sanitation we know that Sanitation
24	members were laid off. We know that Sanitation
25	leadership was demoted. Okay. We know there we

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 46
2	demoralization because of the budget cuts.
3	The budget cuts have continued in
4	all areas. The situation will get worse. The
5	only thing that we can do to appeal to the
6	situation is appeal to our government in New York.
7	But our government in New York does not seem to
8	want to bail us out. So the government in New
9	York State has to appeal to the Federal
10	government.
11	And up to now our Federal
12	government, our President, US Congress have let us
13	down because they have bailed out the financial
14	system to \$17 trillion and have not bailed out New
15	York City, have not bailed out Sanitation, have
16	not bailed out the snow. All right. So what we
17	need is a law which I can give to everybody who
18	wants called Glass Steagall [phonetic]. Glass
19	Steagall was from Franklin Roosevelt
20	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
21	Do we have a copy of that Sir?
22	MR. GISKY: Yeah sure.
23	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Sergeant at
24	Arms, he'll? Thank you. Continue.
25	MR. GISKY: Okay. Glass Steagall

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 47 was from Franklin Roosevelt which was to separate 2 the commercial banks from the deposit banks. 3 4 That's how we got Morgan Bank separate from Morgan 5 Stanley. This is been widely circulated and this would end the bailout of the derivatives which is б 7 destroying the United States. If we let the 8 states go bankrupt, if we let the City go 9 bankrupt--10 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 11 Mr. Gisky, can I ask you to stay on point with 12 respect--13 MR. GISKY: [Interposing] Okay--14 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: --to the 15 blizzard? 16 MR. GISKY: --all right, all right, 17 listen--CHAIRPERSON JAMES: --I understand 18 19 your point. I got you. 20 MR. GISKY: --okay. Okay. The 21 thing about the blizzard--22 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 23 Yes. 24 MR. GISKY: --is that an 25 organization called LaRouchepac.com has gotten out

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 48 2 this legislation for the Glass Steagall legislation. 3 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Yes. 4 5 MR. GISKY: If we do not pass the б Glass Steagall legislation everything that we're 7 saying tonight is lies. Because we are not going 8 to be bailed out. 9 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: I got you--10 MR. GISKY: [Interposing] We're 11 only going to get bailed out by the Federal 12 government by having Glass Steagall to stop the 13 bailout of the banks. 14 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you. 15 MR. GISKY: If you bail out--no, 16 no, I'm not finished. Because if you want, would 17 like to look at LaRouchepac.com--18 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 19 Yes. 20 MR. GISKY: --you could also look 21 at the works of Franklin Roosevelt who was the Governor of New York State as well. You can look 22 23 at the works of Alexander Hamilton. Alexander 24 Hamilton had the US Constitution promoted, bailed out [starts shouting louder] I mean - - the New 25

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 49 2 York's government - - the states. The states are being asked - - you are destroying the United 3 States. Where--I want everybody on the City 4 5 Council to say we want a resolution for the Glass б Steagall - - congressman--7 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 8 Thank you for that --9 MR. GISKY: --and if you want any 10 more details about Glass Steagall, I can tell you 11 to look at LaRouchepac.com. 12 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you. 13 MR. GISKY: Thanks. If you want to 14 save the United States as a patriot, I hope you 15 will too LaRouchepac.com. 16 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you Sir, 17 thank you Sir. Thank you. Alvin Rodriguez? 18 Thank you. Are you going to stay on point? 19 MR. ALVIN RODRIGUEZ: Oh well, yeah 20 I think so. 21 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: I think so. 22 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I'm not here as 23 merely a Bronx resident. I don't think any of us 24 are. I know Howard. I happen to agree with 25 Howard so it's not really about a snow storm per

2	se but it's about what I think most people would
3	have to agree is the collapse that New York is
4	experiencing on many fronts. And that is of deep
5	concern. And action is required. There's a
6	fellow by the name of Ferdinand Pecora [phonetic]
7	who established a Pecora condition which led to
8	the Glass Steagall Act.
9	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Mr. Rodriguez.
10	We all know about the Glass Steagall Act. We all
11	get information from LaRouche. This is about a
12	blizzard that occurred over the holiday. And the
13	question is what recommendations, if any, we can
14	put forward to prevent it from happening again.
15	Do you have any recommendations Sir?
16	MR. RODRIGUEZ: [Interposing]
17	Right, I want to put forward again that people
18	look into this Glass Steagall, citizens too that
19	are here.
20	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: I heard the
21	last gentleman and we will take into consideration
22	putting forth a resolution. Do you have anything
23	else to add?
24	MR. RODRIGUEZ: Hum, no, not
25	really

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 51
2	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
3	Thank you very much. We've been joined by Larry
4	Seabrook. The next speaker is Barbara Gibson.
5	Barbara Gibson? Thank you.
б	[Pause]
7	MS. BARBARA GIBSON: Good evening
8	panel. My name is Barbara Gibson. And I'm here
9	representing the God Country. I'm from the
10	boogey-down Bronx. And I've never experienced
11	this before. And I have some suggestions for you
12	all. I don't have no reason to tell you that I
13	don't think you should do certain things.
14	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Okay.
15	MS. GIBSON: But starting with the
16	workers that's supposed to be cleaning the
17	sidewalks.
18	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Um-hum.
19	MS. GIBSON: And I want to know
20	who's supervised them. I have observed eight
21	workers standing around looking at each other. I
22	think you need a new system and having a
23	designated location for each one that's going to
24	be doing the sidewalks. And at the bus stop, you
25	need to clear just about the whole sidewalk. Now

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 52
2	up at White Plains Road and Gun Hill, we're
3	servicing the 40it's the 41 bus and the 39. And
4	for you to have just a little pathway for those
5	people to get on and off the bus
6	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
7	Yeah.
8	MS. GIBSON:It's ridiculous.
9	Regarding the area where the children go to
10	school, I observed that some of the workers are
11	store owners, they're not even coming out to clean
12	in front of their stores. So we need a little bit
13	more supervision to see that the workers are doing
14	what they are supposed to do and then maybe we can
15	have a better input for the seniors to go out and
16	to be those that like to go like I do. So
17	hopefully you will take that into consideration.
18	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Ms. Gibson can
19	we give the exact locations to Mr. Terranova with
20	respect to those employees? We would appreciate
21	it.
22	MS. GIBSON: Thank you.
23	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: He's right
24	there. Thank you Ma'am. Thank you for your
25	testimony. Mr., I think this is Walter Nessler?

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 53
2	Walter Nessler?
3	[Pause]
4	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Okay. [off mic
5	conversation]
6	MR. WALTER NESSLER: Good evening
7	Council Members.
8	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Good evening.
9	MR. NESSLER: Thank you for the
10	opportunity to provide some testimony on the most
11	recent snowfall. Jim Vacca, how are you? Good to
12	see you. Oliver Koppell I'm very happy to
13	understand that Riverdale has gotten such good
14	attention up in your district in Riverdale. Well
15	let me tell you about our district down here in
16	District 18, Community Board 9. We host three
17	sanitation facilities on Zereeger [phonetic]
18	Avenue.
19	To this day, as I sit here, giving
20	you testimony, Pugsley Creek Park has not had one
21	of its sidewalks shoveled. We have over a mile's
22	worth of sidewalks that haven't seen a shovel
23	since December 27^{th} storm. So I'm glad that your
24	district is getting the attention. But Annabel,
25	our district is not. If we're hosting the

2 Department of Sanitation with two of their 3 facilities, the least that they and Parks 4 Department should be able to do is maintain their 5 sidewalks so my mother who's 86 years old can walk 6 to church safely, so our students can go to school 7 without having to walk in the middle of Macomb 8 [phonetic] Avenue.

9 This is unconscionable that the 10 treatment that we get, particularly in our 11 district, is unacceptable. Oliver Koppell maybe 12 we should all move to Riverdale. Okay but I will 13 tell you know those of us who live in Clausen 14 [phonetic] Point get totally underserved and have 15 been for the three generations that my family has 16 lived in Clausen Point.

And I here will give you that testimony as an eye witness. Okay. And unfortunately this is continuing to happen. Okay? And I'm not only here upset with the Mayor, okay, but clearly our City Council people are not representing our district to the level that I think we should be.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I would like 25 to respond to you. I've been working with the

Department of Sanitation. I unfortunately cannot 2 go out and plow every single street in the 3 district. You have a different opinion on how my 4 5 office runs. I believe that I just--we're not б here to disagree on whether you believe, whether 7 I'm doing a good job or not. The majority of the 8 district believes that they're being represented. 9 Obviously the issues that we are 10 experiencing with this snowfall and the topic that 11 we're discussing here today have been throughout 12 the City, not only in District 18. So if you 13 don't like the way I represent you I particular, 14 that' something that you and I have discussed in 15 the past. Something that you and I will continue 16 to discuss until the day that I'm no longer in 17 office. And you then maybe can get elected into office yourself. 18 19 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Council Member 20 Koppell do you have something to say or no? 21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: No I just 22 think it's an unfair comment. 23 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: I--I agree. 24 MR. NESSLER: [Interposing] Well I 25 retract the comment--

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 56 2 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] Mr. Nessler? You've had your opportunity. Thank 3 4 you Sir. 5 MR. NESSLER: I still have a few seconds left, thank you. б 7 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Okay. Oh okay. 8 MR. NESSLER: Thank you I 9 appreciate that --10 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 11 12, go ahead. 12 MR. NESSLER: This is a democracy. 13 Okay. I apologize if you're taking that 14 personally. But--15 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: 16 [Interposing] This is not a back and forth. I 17 don't take it personal, the topic is on the snow--[Crowd reacting, shushing] 18 19 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: -- on the 20 snow removal. And we asked ... 21 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Excuse me 22 [banging the microphone] 23 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: And we have 24 asked people to stay on the topic of the snow 25 removal. Obviously you and I will continue to

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 57
2	have our differences but this is not, this is not
3	the forum to do it in
4	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
5	No
6	COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA:to
7	MR. NESSLER: [Interposing] Can you
8	explain why we do not have our sidewalks shoveled
9	on Macomb Avenue or our students are walking in
10	the street and our seniors can't go to church or
11	to the stores
12	COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA:
13	[Interposing] And I will make sure that again I
14	reach out to the person I was working with in the
15	Administration on the snow removal and bring it to
16	them again
17	MR. NESSLER: [Interposing] Okay
18	and
19	COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA:because we
20	have been working since that day to make sure that
21	folks in our district get the same services that
22	the rest of the City deserves.
23	MR. NESSLER: All right apparently
24	according to Oliver Koppell we are not. Now in
25	closing one final note

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 58 2 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] Okay excuse me, excuse me--3 MR. NESSLER: --I still--4 5 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] I б just want to say something--7 MR. NESSLER: -- I had seconds taken 8 away from my testimony. 9 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: -- I just want 10 to respond and you can respond in like kind--11 Mr. NESSLER: [Interposing] Yes. 12 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: --excuse me. 13 Excuse me. No one is talking to you. I am 14 talking. I have the floor. Thank you. 15 [Audience shouting] 16 Mr. NESSLER: I thought I had the 17 floor--18 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 19 Let me just say, you--you will--I just want to--MR. NESSLER: --my three minutes 20 21 but I've been interrupted. 22 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: --Sir. You 23 will have an opportunity to respond but let me 24 just tell you what I would like to say. As Chair of the Sanitation Committee I represent the 35th 25

2 Councilmatic District and my District in fact was 3 not plowed. You would think as the Chair of the 4 Sanitation they would have addressed the issues I 5 was on the phone very early in the morning and it 6 appears as I put out a call to all of my 7 colleagues.

8 It was an issue which was not just 9 related to Council Member Palma's District but in fact throughout the entire City of New York. 10 And 11 I just want to say that the Administration, there 12 was a complete breakdown in communication with the 13 Administration. Every individual was out of town 14 for the most part. And they had to regroup and 15 had to address the conditions the day after the 16 storm.

17 And in fact the Emergency Command 18 Center was not open until 4:00 o'clock that 19 afternoon or going into the evening. So I 20 understand. I don't want this to be a back and 21 forth but understand the -- I don't think the 22 responsibility falls on the shoulders of Council 23 Member Palma. We did not elect her to be 24 Commissioner of Sanitation. I think you should 25 redirect your anger at--to the proper source. You

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 60 2 may respond. 3 MR. NESSLER: Okay in response 4 Honorable James. 5 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Yes. б MR. NESSLER: Okay. We are citizens of this city. We have homeowners shovel 7 8 their own sidewalks. We as business people shovel 9 our own sidewalks. The Board of Education shovels its schools. Our churches shovel their schools. 10 11 Everyone shovels their schools with the exception 12 of Parks Department--CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 13 14 Right. 15 MR. NESSLER: --and the Board--and 16 the Sanitation Department. 17 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: I agree. 18 MR. NESSLER: I agree. Exactly. 19 You agree. Now whether who's in town or not in 20 town, it really falls on the Council people also 21 to make sure that this shouldn't have happened, 22 not that it did happen, that it shouldn't have 23 happened. And the last point which I brought out, 24 we're still sitting there a month later after this storm and we still do not have sidewalks shoveled. 25

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 61 2 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: I understand. 3 Make your--MR. NESSLER: [Interposing] Okay? 4 5 And we're all-б CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 7 That was--[Crosstalk] 8 9 MR. NESSLER: --and the media was very well - - you made all the points--10 11 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 12 Valid--valid points and those should be taken care 13 of--14 MR. NESSLER: [Interposing] There 15 is one bright spot to this. 16 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Yes. We're all 17 here today. 18 MR. NESSLER: Yes. The Borough 19 President--20 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 21 Thank you. 22 MR. NESSLER: --would be happy to 23 know that we all have \$12 an hour living wage jobs 24 shoveling snow in this Borough. 25 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you.

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 62	
2	Thank you Sir. Thank you very much. Abraham
3	Jones? Claremont Neighborhood Centers, Inc.? Mr.
4	Jones?
5	MR. ABRAHAM JONES: Good evening.
6	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Good evening.
7	MR. JONES: My name is Abraham
8	Jones. I'm the Executive Director of the
9	Claremont Neighborhood Centers located at 489 East
10	169 Street right off 3 rd Avenue which happens to be
11	in Councilwoman Helen Diane Foster's district. I
12	live in the Bronx and work in that borders
13	Councilwoman Arroyo's district and Councilwoman
14	Helen Diane Foster's.
15	And I would just like to, you know,
16	we all know what the issue with the problem was.
17	On that particular day my wife who is relatively
18	healthy but was experiencing some heart
19	discomfort. And so listening to the reports she
20	really did not want to go to the hospital. And so
21	thankfully my staff as a resident and also as the
22	Executive Director of a community based
23	organization I was in the dual role of being a
24	resident but also knowing that my center needed to
25	be open.

2	I happened to have one of my
3	employees who astwo of my employees had 4-wheel
4	drive vehicles so I really had no difficulty
5	getting my wife to a hospital, an emergency room.
6	But in retour I happened to notice something and
7	that's going to be one of my recommendations. As
8	a community center I felt very strongly that we
9	needed to be open. And so despite some of the
10	challenges we were open.
11	Staff reported and we opened,
12	recognizing that especially after my experience at
13	the hospital, realizing people were doing double
14	shifts, that we needed to be open because folks
15	that are employed and work in medical facilities
16	needed to get to work. And so we struggled. We
17	opened the centers. Well it's two daycare
18	centers. And of the five people who brought their
19	children, which was okay, two of them were
20	hospital workers.
21	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Um-hum.
22	MR. JONES: So I feel very, very
23	good about that as a community organization doing
24	my part in this storm. Two recommendations I
25	would like to make. One of the things that I

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 64	
2	noticed in my travels is that those busses that
3	had gotten stuck were the double busses.
4	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Yes.
5	MR. JONES: Because the busses
6	couldn't navigate. I think one of the
7	recommendations need to be that in the event that
8	we have these kind of emergencies, that those
9	busses need not be on the road.
10	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Right.
11	MR. JONES: The second thing is I
12	felt that as a community based organization I
13	called 911, I called 311, 317, on several
14	occasions and never did I hear anything saying
15	well even that folks that would be needed to
16	report to Sanitation for temporary work. I think
17	that as a community based agency that there needs
18	to be a temporary or emergency workforce. That
19	people who have already been identified so that in
20	the event that there is an emergency like that
21	it's the one telephone call telling them where
22	they need to report.
23	As a community based organization
24	we deal with things, we deal with individuals that
25	would have loved to go out and earn a day or two's

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 65
2	wages. And I spoke to Council Member Foster. The
3	other thing I want to say is even today in front
4	of the park located on 157, 158 th Street, in front
5	of a small park, today, getting on the bus,
6	yesterday getting on the bus, you still have to
7	travel across ice and snow to get on the bus. And
8	I think some of the difficulty is that where
9	they're local parks, small parks.
10	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Um-hum.
11	MR. JONES: It's the trouble still
12	even today getting on the bus. The other thing is
13	since you are looking at it I'd be interested to
14	know just how many of those double busses were
15	actually stuck.
16	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: That's an
17	excellent point. We heard and I'm sure we will
18	hear from members of Transport Workers Union. We
19	heard about it in Manhattan how the rapid transit
20	busses were all stuck. They cannot handle snow
21	beyond a certain feet. I'm sure Transport Workers
22	Union will speak to that when they testify but
23	that's an excellent recommendation, particularly
24	with respect to the community centers, the CBOs,
25	I'm sure you provided those recommendations to

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 66	
2	Council Member Foster.
3	MR. JONES: Yes.
4	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: And they will
5	be included in our report. And last but not
6	least, you're absolutely right, as of yesterday in
7	my district, Parks Department, some of the parks
8	still had not been shoveled. And I left a message
9	for Commissioner Benepe to address that. I thank
10	you for your comments here today.
11	MR. JONES: Thank you.
12	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you. And
13	Council Member Vacca.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Just let me
15	clarify. We had 650 busses stuck according to the
16	MTA. Most of them, a lot of them were double-
17	decker busses and at my hearing we pointed out
18	that the double-decker busses, what we call
19	articulated busses are notwell I don't know,
20	they're articulated busses.
21	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: That's right.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: They are not
23	able to make turns or to go up hills during ice
24	and snow. They probably should not have been
25	used. The other busses didn't, non-articulated

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 67 busses should have chains. And by having chains 2 they can navigate much better. So that is I think 3 one of the mistakes in the process that the MTA 4 5 made. And I expect that they have learned their б lesson. I hope they--7 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 8 You hope. And that was sort of my point with the 9 chains but it got lost in the drama. Anyway, 10 Bonita Johnson, Recording Secretary of the 11 Transport Workers Union, is Ms. Johnson here? 12 MS. BONITA JOHNSON: Yes I am, 13 thank you. 14 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you. 15 [Off mic shouting] 16 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: We're going to 17 get to that. Sir, sir, sir, sir? [Off mic shouting] 18 19 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Sir. Sir. Let 20 me just say this. No I got you. We got you. 21 Thank you Sir but snow emergency in every Borough 22 every people talked about the failure a snow 23 emergency as being point number one. But I thank 24 you for your testimony --25 [Off mic shouting]

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 68
2	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: We got you.
3	You already testified. It's now Ms. Johnson's
4	turn. Let's be respectful, thank you. Ms.
5	Johnson.
6	MS. JOHNSON: Thank you
7	Council, thank you
8	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
9	Boy they're warming up now. My goodness.
10	MS. JOHNSON: I have prepared a
11	small statement after questions I can answer on
12	behalf of the Transport Workers Union Local 100,
13	I'll be glad to do so.
14	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you.
15	MS. JOHNSON: All New Yorkers know
16	what happened on the 27^{th} when mass transit in this
17	city simply failed. [Speaking too close to the
18	mic, reverb] While some blame the blizzard
19	demand that this Council focus on the real problem
20	regarding transportation. That problem is always
21	at the top of MTA. Deputy is present at this
22	hearing today, many of our neighbors and our
23	riders to state clearly that we must not ever
24	allow this to happen again. Not to our riders,
25	not to us.

2	Our transportation service of this
3	city of the city that we Let's go over a
4	few facts really quickly. On December $24^{ ext{th}}$, the -
5	- Weather Service forecasted a chance of snow in
6	excess of five inches. This gave transit more
7	than enough time to implement what it calls Plan
8	4. Under Plan 4 thousands of workers report at
9	special times to special locations for emergency
10	duty at the ready to respond to whatever the
11	weather brings. During this visit no such order
12	was ever issued.
13	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Right.
14	MS. JOHNSON: Transit's top
15	managers failed in responding to this city's
16	needs. It failed horribly in providing adequate
17	assistance to its own workers were left
18	stranded on the busses and trains for hours. And
19	in some instances for days. No communication, no
20	food, no nothing. Transportation access did not
21	exist for most of us and did exist it was
22	extremely dangerous.
23	At the January 14^{th} hearing, MTA
24	dispatched Mr. Pendergrass as a seasoned operation
25	manager to be the Transit Authority's official

2	poster boy for We've that a real
3	critical look cast at his boss Mr. Walter. An
4	individual that has already demonstrated a
5	dismissive approach to the needs of this city by -
6	- hundreds of transit workers when first he held
7	from could have been used to retain jobs and
8	help keep this city safe.
9	Clearly this does not appear to be
10	a manager who cares one iota for the riders of
11	this city or TWU Local 100 transit workers. It
12	isn't as though transit hasn't been through
13	repeated snow storms. In the past, we hear today
14	of the December 27 th blizzard, transit and its many
15	dedicated workers coped just fine.
16	An example would be the snow fall
17	of February 26 th to the 27 th , 2010 which by the
18	record book is a little bit more than we just
19	received. At that time Plan 4 was in effect.
20	Thousands of us transit employees were dispatched
21	and with the help of operational manager we both
22	we worked collectively to keep the city moving.
23	City Council, let's truly
24	implore our government to reflect on
25	accountability It comes from the top. From

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 71 this point, at most of these hearings, MTA has 2 continued to be a no-show. Not even bothering to 3 concern itself with the consistent needs of the 4 5 riders or even some locals. I urge everyone of us, New York City riders, Bronx Councilmen and 6 Women, Transportation leaders, all of us here at 7 this hearing today to take our demands right to 8 9 the face of the MTA. CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Could you 10 11 conclude Ms. Johnson? 12 MS. JOHNSON: Yes. 13 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you. MS. JOHNSON: The next MTA board of 14 - - January 26th at 9:00 AM. The location is 367 15 Madison Avenue between 44th and 45th. Let's let the 16 17 MTA know that we are not a bunch of - - sheep 18 which will just quietly tolerate depraved 19 indifference. Our - - is much more important than anybody knows. Thank you for listening. 20 21 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you. Thank you. Thank you for letting everyone know 22 23 that the next MTA board meeting is on January 26th at 9:00 AM. The address is 347 Madison between 24 $44^{\rm th}$ and $45^{\rm th}.$ The next speaker is Donnie Walker 25

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 72 2 Santiago. Doni? MS. DONIE WALKER SANTIAGO: Donni 3 [phonetic]. 4 5 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Donni, thank б you. 7 MS. SANTIAGO: Even though my mother did say Doni. 8 9 [Chuckling] 10 MS. SANTIAGO: So we have a 11 disagreement. Good evening. 12 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Good evening. 13 MS. SANTIAGO: Honorable Council 14 Members, my first time getting a chance to speak 15 before you all. I'm from the District of 16 Honorable Annabel Palma. And I want to speak to a couple of issues in our district as well as other 17 issues. One--the thing that I would like to say 18 19 is the Bronx is always considered, as everyone has 20 said, like the stepchild. 21 And whenever you hear the comments, 22 the outer Boroughs, that's putting us in a 23 stepchild thing. I mean I think the language 24 matters and in this case when we keep hearing the 25 outer Boroughs, you know it's very much like of
2	you go to Cuba they have Afro-Cubans, Afro-Cubano,
3	there's realthere's a real divide that really
4	exists. And I'm not trying to pick on Cubans but
5	there you go there, if you go there and you can
6	actually if you can go to Cuba you can actually
7	get to the real African roots which is nice one
8	hand but it also has this kind of separation
9	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
10	We got you.
11	MS. SANTIAGO:and when we get
12	this outer Boroughs, we know we're getting bad
13	news. So that's one of the things that I want to
14	say. We do need to look at, in my area, weI'm
15	with St. Andrews Home Owners. And where we are
16	everyone is a homeowner. They've done a lot of
17	shoveling. I can tell you right now I've got a
18	big mountain in front, the sidewalks going over to
19	where the busses are now have been shoveled but
20	getting across the street is a chore.
21	I've seen some workers out there,
22	not enough, they're not hiring enough people.
23	They need to bring people in. They need to do
24	training so that those people are at the ready
25	when something happens such as this kind of thing

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 74 2 so that they can be called. You know, there should be a team of people in each person's 3 4 district, maybe it should be run by the Council 5 Members office, somebody distinctly who can be in б charge of that. 7 This has been an unacceptable failure at all levels. And, you know, to say well 8 9 it's this person's fault, it's that person's fault, obviously there's a lot of hands. And 10 11 everyone needs to take responsibility. There were 12 no coordination of services. I've heard things 13 that they were blaming Sanitation workers, that's 14 a copout. I mean I'm going to just put it out 15 there. 16 We have some of the best of New 17 York City employees who are blue collar workers 18 from EMS people who suffered tremendously not 19 being able to get to their destination. A New 20 York City Police Department did an excellent job 21 with the resources they had available. Bus 22 operators, heroes. 23 I mean being out there, getting 24 stuck, they should not have been sent out. They should have been kept back because if the roads 25

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 75 are not clear a bus shouldn't go out. Salters, 2 plows, should be before the bus. Articulated 3 busses should be able to be out there and if they 4 5 can't then it's a problem with the plowing. You know, New York City Sanitation б 7 workers, they were out there. They weren't directed correctly, that's a different problem. 8 9 Just I want to just say two things with regard to the Mayor. In my family, in my household people 10 11 couldn't go to work. They lost days of work. 12 They don't get that made up and the Mayor was 13 suggesting people go to the theater. Not a good 14 suggestion. Just want to out that out there. 15 And I want to say that I'm hoping 16 that out of this that this is not taken lightly, 17 that this is given the due respect it does 18 deserve, and that something progressive does come 19 out of this. Thank you. 20 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Ms. Santiago I 21 really appreciate that. Thank you. 22 [Applause] 23 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Professor Hetty 24 [phonetic] Fox? Professor Fox? 25 [Pause]

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 76 2 PROFESSOR HETTY FOX: Well good evening Council Members. 3 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Good evening. 4 5 PROFESSOR FOX: Members of the public, of the Bronxites, glad to see you. Mr. б 7 Seabrook, foster, everybody else, I can't say all 8 the names. In any case thank you so much for 9 coming. Many of you may know that I'm one of the 10 longest Bronx residents on the same block since 11 1943. 12 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Hum. 13 [clapping]. PROFESSOR FOX: And I'm a home 14 15 owner and I'm a sociologist. I came back from 16 teaching college and had to spend the last 40 years saving my block. I'm appalled that we're 17 18 the poorest part of the United States because we 19 had little geniuses running all over the place. 20 So I've designed a new education 21 system, wrote a book called Neighborhood Rules of 22 Order, Jealousy Be Gone and it's relevant because 23 I didn't like the comment that Sadik-Khan made 24 when she attacked Ray Kelly for the error that she 25 made in that whole process. I thought that that

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 77
2	was pretty crummy. And I think it has a lot to do
3	with some of the jealousies that are happening
4	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
5	We all agree.
6	PROFESOR FOX:preventing people
7	from being able to make the right decisions. I'm
8	really upset that we didn't have the top
9	leadership that should have been there. A Mayor
10	is a city's father. I cannot understand a father
11	leaving his family in the middle of one of the
12	biggest blizzards that New York has ever seen. I
13	was here in 1947 for that 5-footer. And we had a
14	lot of fun. But my dad and my uncle had to shovel
15	the snow from the corner down into the sewer
16	because the oil truck had to come and deliver oil
17	because we were out of heat.
18	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Hum.
19	PROFESSOR FOX: So I mean it was
20	great. We made tunnels and it was so much fun
21	because I was 10. It's not fun for many people
22	who are older. It's still fun for me. I'm only
23	73.
24	[Laughter]
25	PROFESSOR FOX: Because I still

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 78
2	love to shovel and I still love the City, I still
3	love the City
4	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
5	It must be something in the water in the Bronx
6	because you look fabulous.
7	PROFESSOR FOX: Well, thank you.
8	Well I run a Play Street every summer but every
9	four years because, you know, the neighborhood is
10	the main focus that we should be, you know,
11	endeared to, and this is what I think the Mayor
12	misses totally. If he understood that family and
13	neighborhoods are very important to protect, he
14	would have been there on the spot. He would not
15	have been, you know, trying to protect himself by
16	having gone and saying that he's entitled to his
17	private life. We all are, you know, but not in a
18	situation like that. I just don't agree that that
19	should have happened.
20	Sanitation has been marvelous.
21	Having to keep that street clean for a play street
22	so that children can play up and down and, you
23	know, how we used to drop the gum on the block and
24	kiss it up to God so that we didn't get germs
25	[laughing] well that's how clean the street should

2 be and Sanitation has been fantastic to keep their 3 job going as well as they have over the years. 4 I'm very, very supportive of Sanitation because 5 they have helped us in 34 years of keeping that 6 play street. So keeping healthy and keeping well 7 is extremely important.

I'm not as pleased to know that 8 9 we've had Mayors but not many city mothers. We 10 need someone to whisper in somebody's ear and say, 11 darling, this is not right. Right? Okay. And we 12 need the money that we're supposed to have in the Bronx. All right, 'cause we've got little 13 geniuses as I said. Thank you so much. 14 15 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you 16 Professor Fox. We've had some mothers, not 17 whisper in his ear but sort of yell at him but. 18 PROFESSOR FOX: Thank you. 19 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Carl Jimenez. 20 Mr. Jimenez? 21 MR. CARL JIMENEZ: Yes. Hi. Thank 22 you very much. CHAIRPERSON JAMES: You're welcome. 23 24 MR. JIMENEZ: The blizzard of December 26th or 27 or whenever it was, was huge, 25

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 80
2	it was bad. But I've been through worse blizzards
3	than that.
4	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Yeah.
5	MR. JIMENEZ: And what it threw,
6	and so the blizzard was not the problem. The
7	problem was the Sanitation Department and Mayor
8	Bloomberg. They didn't tackle the issue when they
9	were supposed to. They, they did not properly,
10	they did not on time, and so the city drowned in
11	two flakes of snow. We had some snow but, you
12	know, I seen worse in my lifetime.
13	I lived in Chicago for many years
14	and I seen much worse blizzards there. And the
15	city never stops because of that. Here the city
16	stopped totally. I mean it was totally paralyzed.
17	I called 311 at least 3 times, twice I waited
18	almost an hour before someone answered. And when
19	finally someone answers they said we can't take
20	this call and hang up.
21	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Hum.
22	MR. HIMENEZ: I called again after
23	waiting an hour, they said the same thing, we
24	can't take this call and hang up. The third time,
25	nobody even answered even though the phone was

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 81
2	ringing and ringing for a long, long time.
3	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Hum.
4	MR. JIMINEZ: And no one even
5	answered. So how is it that, you know,
6	everything, when everything is fine and dandy, all
7	the busses are running fine and dandy, the trains
8	are running fine and dandy, but we got two flakes
9	of snow so the city drowns. Bare ice [phonetic].
10	So what is the taxpayer's money, where is it going
11	to? I thought the taxpayer's money was going to
12	Sanitation.
13	So Sanitation can deal with the
14	issues. Where is it? Where is Bloomberg when
15	this is happening? So, you know, I mean, unless,
16	you know, I think Bloomberg but in the way he
17	handled how to run the city. Rather than taking
18	off and going to Bermuda or wherever he went, he
19	should have been right here looking at the
20	situation. And get on top of the Sanitation
21	Department and not promote them or demote them
22	later on, deal with the problem at hand. Thank
23	you very much.
24	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you Mr.
25	Jimenez. Thank you very much. You're absolutely

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 82 2 right, this was a man-made disaster. Angelo Vega. Mr. Vega? Followed by Mike Rico, Mr. Rico if you 3 can move up to the front that would be greatly 4 5 appreciated. After Mr. Rick, Mr. Agosto. б MR. ANGELO VEGA: This is going to 7 be short and sweet. CHAIRPERSON JAMES: 8 Thank you. 9 MR. VEGA: This is--nothing--10 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 11 We appreciate that. 12 MR. VEGA: -- - - Segal - - . 13 Snow. Who takes care of the snow in the City? 14 Sanitation. They got the plows. They've got the 15 equipment. What happened to the equipment? I was 16 reading and if it's correct they didn't have the proper equipment. They didn't have the belts, the 17 18 chains that are going around the wheels. 19 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Um-hum. 20 MR. VEGA: So they don't get stuck. 21 They were missing pieces to their shovels that 22 they needed to get out. So they shoveled. I've 23 seen how Sanitation works. They're not a bad 24 operation. But if you don't have the supplies, 25 you don't have the tools, what can you do? Now

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 83
2	the Mayor, the Mayor, oh my god, the Mayor, where
3	was the Mayor?
4	The Chief, the chief CEO of New
5	York City. He was out to lunch. Okay he was out
6	to lunch. Where's his second in command and third
7	in command? They were out to lunch. Who's
8	minding the store? Nobody. Now. You're going to
9	want toyou going to run a store like that? No.
10	you going to run a city like that? Absolutely
11	not. Now who'swho takes responsibility for
12	that? I haven't heard anybody get demoted.
13	I haven't heard anybody getI mean
14	the top guys, the guys that are supposed to tell
15	the Sanitation who's got this command and you've
16	got those guys, you've got these guys. I haven't
17	heard anybody of that jurisdiction and that
18	authority getting fired or demoted. No I haven't.
19	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Nope.
20	MR. VEGA: I'vewhat I heard was
21	the little guy, oh he's the responsibleno, no,
22	no, no, no, no, no. We don't start at the bottom.
23	Every timethis is all I've been listening to
24	throughout this whole society. Everything is the
25	bottom. You've got a financial problem on Wall

Street, go to the guy on the bottom. Excuse me?
Go to the guy on the bottom, why don't we try up
on the top. The top. Let's got to the top first
and then start from there. Now my experience as a
professional driver for 17 years, driving around
Manhattan, the 5 Boroughs, is guess what, who gets
cleaned first?

AUDIENCE: Manhattan.

9

10 MR. VEGA: Manhattan. That's 11 right. Good. Manhattan gets cleaned first. And 12 particularly Rockefeller Center. They get cleaned 13 first, absolutely, around there. Wall Street gets 14 cleaned first. Now let me see, I've got a list of 15 things here. Now this is, you know, the woman was 16 talking about sociology. This stuff is all 17 stratified.

You look at whose head is rolling 18 19 first, the little guy's. That's, you know, 20 stratification, you see the way we do this whole 21 thing is going, it's that they get the small guy, 22 why not the big guy? Why not the big guy? And as 23 far as the neighborhoods who get cleaned first, 24 guess who gets cleaned first. All--the wealthy 25 people.

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 85 2 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you Mr. 3 Vega. 4 MR. VEGA: Okay. 5 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: And thank you for that audience participation. Mike Rico? б 7 MR. MIKE PACOLLI: Mike Pacolli 8 [phonetic]. 9 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Mike Pacolli, I 10 apologize. Mr. Pacolli I apologize. After Mr. 11 Pacolli, Kenny Agosto the District Leader of the 80th Assembly District, followed by someone from 12 13 Brooklyn, Joseph. Joseph Garber. 14 [Pause] 15 MR. PACOLLI: I'm not going to read 16 from my thing. I gave it to my Councilman Vacca--17 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 18 Thank you. 19 MR. PACCOLI: I'm going to read one 20 paragraph at the end. Just a couple of things. I 21 did call to complain to Sanitation after speaking 22 with 311 and I also called to complain to MTA. 23 Sanitation had a message. They had a message saying they're not taking any complaints because 24 25 they're working to remove the snow. That's not an

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 86
2	answer. I went back to 311, they said but that's
3	how it is. And MTA and Sanitation does their own.
4	I called MTA to complain. I did
5	get a person. I was shocked because I thought
6	they were on 24 hours. But they would only tell
7	me information about where to go to get a bus and
8	they couldn't tell me if the bus was running. So
9	maybe 311 should take over or be another line to
10	call.
11	So how are you going to document
12	emergencies if you have Sanitation emergencies and
13	MTA emergencies and you can't give them the
14	emergency? And you can't give it to 311 because
15	311 says you've got to go to MTA and Sanitation.
16	Another thing is I had to go to
17	training that particular day for the agency I work
18	for which was in Brooklyn. And I live in Pelham
19	Bay. Now I'm not going to say the streets weren't
20	plowed because 138 th Street, 3 rd Avenue, right off
21	of here was. They put down a lot of salt and it
22	was pretty good actually. The side streets were a
23	terror. And I'm not going to say in Brooklyn that
24	the main streets, you know, Schermerhorn,
25	Livingstone, right in the downtown area of Hoyt

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 87 2 weren't plowed, they were. CHAIRPERSON JAMES: 3 They were. 4 MR. PACOLLI: But again when you 5 come out of Nevins, huh, at the train station, it's--to go half a block to get on Livingstone, it б was guite an ordeal, huh. And even though the 7 8 city building wasn't shoveled, there was a lot of 9 ice. So and also when for Council Member Vacca especially to take this up, until this new person, 10 11 Mr. Waller, came, there were no rats on the 138th 12 Street train station. It was really funny 13 because--14 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 15 [Laughing] 16 MR. PACOLLI: I mean you saw them 17 on the tracks. Once in a while they pop up. But 18 I mean you've got rats running around a lot of 19 stations including 138 actually running on the 20 platform with the people. 21 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Ooo, geeze. 22 MR. PACOLLI: And it was really 23 funny because that particular day there was a lot 24 of snow and ice on the platforms. So even the -- I 25 don't know if the rats were having a bad time of

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 88
2	it or if they were having some fun going up and
3	down, but, you know, I mean, you know, and I'm
4	going to read this.
5	The Teflon Mayor is finally losing
6	his coating. In my book he has always been
7	inadequate and any Mayor that chooses City Time
8	over an automated system we already had called
9	Auto Time is either corrupt or incompetent. The
10	bad old days are coming back to the MTA with its
11	new director and chairman.
12	And the Honorable Councilman who
13	was opposite my great union leader and chief and I
14	also saw him on New York 1 and very time he talks
15	he says something to stick up for the Mayor,
16	should also put in an investigation on who ordered
17	the streets of the Mayor and other dignitaries
18	taking away those big Sanitation trucks away from
19	their route because I think that caused a lot more
20	than a couple of supervisors telling people not
21	to
22	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
23	Mr. Pacolli, let me just understand your
24	recommendation. Your recommendation on 311 is
25	that whenever we have an emergency they should

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 89 take the calls--2 MR. PACOLLI: [Interposing] They 3 should take the call. 4 5 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Got it. MR. PACOLLI: --and not so go to-б 7 anyway. 8 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 9 Thank you, that's a good one. Thank you. I 10 appreciate that. Kenny Agosto? Hey. 11 MR. KENNY AGOSTO: Hey. 12 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Augusto 13 [phonetic] my buddy. MR. KENNY AGOSTO: Good evening 14 15 Chairwoman James. 16 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Good evening. 17 MR. AGOSTO: Crowley, Vacca, distinguished members of the Bronx City Council 18 19 delegation, fellow Bronxites. My name is Kenny Agosto. And am District Leader of the 80th 20 21 Assembly District in the Bronx and a lifelong 22 resident. I represent parts or whole parts of the 23 neighborhoods of Alex [phonetic] and Bedford Park, 24 Bronx Park East, Bronxdale, East Chester Gardens, 25 Fort Independence, Indian Village, Jerome Park

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 90 2 Reservoir, Laconia, Morris Park, Norwood, Pelham Bay, Pelham Gardens, Pelham Parkway, Van Cortland 3 Village [phonetic], Van Ness and Westchester 4 Square, from - - time. 5 б CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Laughing] 7 MR. AGOSTO: The storm began before 10: 30 AM on Sunday December the 26th. Our 8 9 transit workers, our EMS workers, our Sanitation workers were doing their jobs. I have an issue at 10 11 the top. And I love what the Mayor does in our 12 neighborhoods with our walls getting painted and 13 doing service of bringing trees but there's a critical failure here. People died. 14 15 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Um-hum. 16 MR. AGOSTO: Okay? Yvonne 17 Freedman, 75, woke up with chest pains. Her 18 daughter tried to reach 911 for almost half an 19 hour to no avail. After 3 long hours, Mrs. 20 Freedman was dead. 21 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Yep. 22 MR. AGOSTO: A 22-year old college 23 student after 9 excruciating hours in labor gave birth to a baby. 24 25 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: That's right.

2	MR. AGOSTO: She called 911. her
3	water broke, she called 911. She didn't see
4	anyone for almost 12 hours. The baby was
5	pronounced dead. Mr. Ishmael Vasquez [phonetic],
6	82 years old, lifelong worker, he worked hard.
7	For his city to respond to him if he needed it,
8	his time, God called his time and he died. His
9	body was in the house for 27 hours. That is
10	disgusting. It is hurtful. The Mayor of New York
11	City is the person we elect to represent us. If
12	any of you or any of us here were on call and we
13	didn't respond to the call we would be fired.
14	AUDIENCE: That's right. Exactly.
15	MR. AGOSTO: I'm not saying we're
16	supposed to know where he goes on his private time
16 17	
	supposed to know where he goes on his private time
17	supposed to know where he goes on his private time but if he's on call he needs to be here. He needs
17 18	supposed to know where he goes on his private time but if he's on call he needs to be here. He needs to be basically on his cell phone in Bermuda or
17 18 19	supposed to know where he goes on his private time but if he's on call he needs to be here. He needs to be basically on his cell phone in Bermuda or wherever he's at. People died. People couldn't
17 18 19 20	supposed to know where he goes on his private time but if he's on call he needs to be here. He needs to be basically on his cell phone in Bermuda or wherever he's at. People died. People couldn't get to their appointments. People couldn't
17 18 19 20 21	supposed to know where he goes on his private time but if he's on call he needs to be here. He needs to be basically on his cell phone in Bermuda or wherever he's at. People died. People couldn't get to their appointments. People couldn't travel. And where where people get demoted,
17 18 19 20 21 22	supposed to know where he goes on his private time but if he's on call he needs to be here. He needs to be basically on his cell phone in Bermuda or wherever he's at. People died. People couldn't get to their appointments. People couldn't travel. And where where people get demoted, people get over there, what's going on in OEM, the

have their heads roll but there needs to be
something that's more than a 15-page, 15-point
plan after the fact. We can't do this. I want to
thank particularly the Council Members here
because I know I sat down the 29 th with the
Honorable James Vacca and we spoke about the
neighborhoods and everything. So I want to thank
each and every one of you for being here and thank
you forbut take it home, take it home, that we
cannot let this happen again. Thank you very
much.
CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you Mr.
Agosto. Thank you very much. Thank you very much
and thank you for acknowledging the young lady who
and thank you for acknowledging the young lady who lost her baby. That was a family friend. I
lost her baby. That was a family friend. I
lost her baby. That was a family friend. I really appreciate and thank you for all of that.
lost her baby. That was a family friend. I really appreciate and thank you for all of that. Joseph Garber? Mr. Garber you're an out of
lost her baby. That was a family friend. I really appreciate and thank you for all of that. Joseph Garber? Mr. Garber you're an out of towner, what are you doing here?
lost her baby. That was a family friend. I really appreciate and thank you for all of that. Joseph Garber? Mr. Garber you're an out of towner, what are you doing here? MR. JOSEPH GARBER: Out of towner
<pre>lost her baby. That was a family friend. I really appreciate and thank you for all of that. Joseph Garber? Mr. Garber you're an out of towner, what are you doing here?</pre>
<pre>lost her baby. That was a family friend. I really appreciate and thank you for all of that. Joseph Garber? Mr. Garber you're an out of towner, what are you doing here?</pre>

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 93 came here this evening to finish--2 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 3 4 Yes. 5 MR. GARBER: --remarks that I б couldn't make in Brooklyn because I stuck to my 7 three minutes. Number one, you're very correct--CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 8 9 You honored your word, you said you were going to 10 come to the Bronx--11 MR. GARBER: [Interposing] Yeah. 12 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: --you did say. 13 MR. GARBER: I want to reiterate, I 14 was not happy the way homeowners and store keepers 15 were cleaning streets in Brooklyn North 1, Wee 16 [phonetic] Avenue, Bedford Avenue, Division 17 Avenue. CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Um-hum. 18 19 MR. GARBER: I almost slipped and 20 if you go now you will see that the ice situation 21 is getting worse. I think there has to be a local 22 law or revision of the snow protocol by DSNY to 23 include what happens when the snow becomes ice. 24 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Right. 25 MR. GARBER: And how we deal with

2	that. I think there has to be some amendments.
3	Now the average person thinks that the Department
4	of Sanitation is solely in the Bureaus of and
5	Collection, snow removal, recycling, etcetera. I
6	therefore want to call your attention to the
7	official directory of the City of New York known
8	as the New York City Green Book and read pages 286
9	to 292 and you will be educated as to the diverse
10	bureaucratic structure
11	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
12	Okay what paragraphwhat paragraph Mr. Garber?
13	MR. GARBER: No, read the pages.
14	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Okey-dokey.
15	MR. GARBER: Okay? The pages.
16	Okay. Now. I think, I would suggest that the
17	
	Department of Sanitation and the City Council
18	Department of Sanitation and the City Council possibly hire the American Society of Public
18 19	
	possibly hire the American Society of Public
19	possibly hire the American Society of Public Administration, the American Management
19 20	possibly hire the American Society of Public Administration, the American Management Association to do an oversight study on the
19 20 21	possibly hire the American Society of Public Administration, the American Management Association to do an oversight study on the structure. I believe there are duplicate
19 20 21 22	possibly hire the American Society of Public Administration, the American Management Association to do an oversight study on the structure. I believe there are duplicate functions in the Department of Sanitation or

2 Okay. Areas that are problems. When city 3 property is affected, it's not working. I have a 4 5 street that has both parks and a public school. And I had to call Rosemary Thayer [phonetic] the 6 7 Brooklyn head of Brooklyn North Parks and she didn't even return my call. The Department of 8 9 Education, I had to call the Tweed Courthouse. 10 Now we have a problem, we have a problem as far as 11 the bus terminal. I was just there this 12 afternoon. That whole bus terminal at Washington Plaza is one block, they don't clean the 13 14 sidewalks. So we have to look at--this has to be looked at. Okay? Now let me, I prepared notes 15 16 here. The Housing Authority is a problem. 17 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Yes. 18 MR. GARBER: The last snow storm, 19 the last snow storm in February '10, February '10, 20 I called Gloria Finkelman [phonetic] to tell her 21 it's an icy condition. And she screamed at me. 22 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Hum. 23 MR. GARBER: She screamed at me and 24 I still have the message if any of you want to hear about it. Okay? So if we're in a city there 25

2	has to be better coordination. Better
3	coordination. I've studied the Department of
4	Sanitation through various courses at John Jay.
5	I've written term papers. I read Sweep. But
6	we've got to be organized better. We've got to
7	have a better structure on the district level.
8	I'll continue, god willing, at the Brooklyn, but I
9	said I'm going to comment here. Thank you.
10	[Applause]
11	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Mr. Garber I'll
12	see you on Wednesday. I can I see your Green book
13	and I just want you to know that the Chairwoman of
14	NYCHA, the public hearing, Council Member Rosie
15	Mendez is considering a hearing with respect to
16	NYCHA because NYCHA was not activated.
17	And you're absolutely right. An
18	amendment to the snow and ice removal protocol is
19	absolutely286 to 292, pages. May I see it?
20	Thank you Mr. Garber. I'll see you in Brooklyn on
21	Wednesday. Thank you Sir.
22	Kevin Harvey representing Transport
23	Workers Union Local 100. Do you know the bus to
24	take to the school Mr. Garber? Yeah I'm sure you

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 97	
2	I know you will. Kamala Jackson after Mr. Harvey.
3	Ms. Jackson followed by Christine Williams and
4	then our last speaker is Deborah Meyers. If all
5	of those individuals could move up closely that
6	would be greatly appreciated. Mr. Harvey?
7	MR. KEVIN HARVEY: Good afternoon.
8	Good evening Councilwoman.
9	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Good evening.
10	MR. HARVEY: I had talked last
11	time, I was going to continue what I mentioned
12	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
13	[Laughing]
14	MR. HARVEY:now you remember me,
15	right?
16	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Oh yeah.
17	MR. HARVEY: I live on the
18	northeast part. I do 270, last week I'm a worker
19	of MTA in Manhattan. Today I'm a resident of the
20	Bronx. And I received that he was the state
21	senator. I live in Boston Road in East Chester.
22	East Chester Garden. My mother lives in Dutomore
23	[phonetic] Projects. So those streets was
24	untouched. And I left between 8:00 and 8:30, East
25	Trust [phonetic] and Boston was unwalkable.

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 98 People was walking in the streets. 2 Usually a snow storm like this, the 3 magnitude, the would pull the busses off the 4 5 streets. If you know the Bronx, the Bronx has a lot of hills. So a lot of the busses cannot make б 7 it up the hill, whether it's short busses or the 8 long busses. We've also got Westchester's busses 9 coming through especially on Boston Road. They were pulling their busses off. East Chester--not 10 East Chester, East Tremont, now 180th Street around 11 12 West Forum Depot [phonetic] wasn't plowed. Got 13 distressed busses stuck. So they get stuck, those busses don't carry chains. They just go. So they 14 15 get stuck in - - and wider. So that becomes a 16 problem. 17 As far as communication I expressed 18 to Ms. James last week for the MTA, it comes from 19 the top. It starts with the governor. You know 20 the MTA is under the governor's jurisdiction, not 21 the city. 22 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Right. 23 MR. HARVYE: The governor said 24 listen all busses off the road 'cause there's 25 nothing you can really do about it. You've got to

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 99
2	pull the busses off the road like in 1996 we had a
3	snow storm in January around this month. Governor
4	Pataki calls WAC [phonetic] the busses got pulled
5	off the road.
6	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: That's right.
7	MR. HARVEY: End of story. There
8	was nothing the Chairperson can do about it. To
9	the lack of communication, was weak. Even though
10	Governor Paterson should have called it. He
11	should have called it. That's what you should
12	know, he should have called it. As far as the
13	housings, I could go into the housings. Any old
14	projects, my mother say, there's I can go
15	on my head, Lincoln Project [phonetic], that's my
16	home project which is 132^{nd} Street which is
17	Governor Paterson's neighborhood. Those streets
18	wasn't touched.
19	So Sanitation must have got some
20	specific order to hit certain streets, below Times
21	Square, that gets hit first. Clean that up.
22	Everybody else can wait. The outer Boroughs is
23	goingthe northeast part of the Bronx that was
24	and you covering the depot, go to the depot. I
25	ain't seen no busses. It appears right now the

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 100 2 bus stops about 8--CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 3 4 Mr. Harvey--5 MR. HARVEY: --yeah. б CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Mr. Harvey can 7 you talk because you educated me about the 8 articulated busses, can you say a sentence about 9 that? 10 MR. HARVEY: I could - - . 11 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Just--12 MR. HARVEY: [Interposing] 13 Articulated busses are the long busses which now, usually, in Manhattan, my depot on 26th Street, 14 15 Hunter Street [phonetic], my core depot has those 16 busses. In the Bronx, Gun Hill [phonetic], Kings 17 Bridge and West Forum, those depots have those busses. Those busses can be fitted with chains. 18 19 But at that particular time those busses didn't 20 have no chains. And they did have chains still 21 sitting on the ground. They pop off. So those 22 busses get stuck. 23 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Right. 24 MR. HARVEY: That's it. Now. This is what I should have been to last week 25

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 101 2 [phonetic]. Due to the fact that those busses get stuck, those busses move, you could be a driver, 3 4 you step on the gas - - you stand behind in the 5 back of the busses, the way those busses would slide, like jackknife. б 7 And if you're not looking, you're 8 not--you're looking somewhere, those busses just 9 slide into you. You will slide. Now we get run 10 over. They would turn around and say we'll blame 11 us for moving those busses. Why didn't you turn 12 around so those busses should have never been out there. Now they're facing a lawsuit. That's just 13 14 a person. It could happen with cars, the busses 15 could slip up a whole around against a car, just 16 like they're lined up here. That's a lawsuit. 17 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Well had 18 Governor Paterson declared a snow emergency would 19 those busses have been on the street? 20 MR. HARVEY: No. They wouldn't 21 run. CHAIRPERSON JAMES: And Mr. Walter 22 23 did not reach out to Mr. Paterson, correct? 24 MR. HARVEY: No. 25 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Has anyone been

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 102
2	disciplined as far as you know?
3	MR. HARVEY: Yeah, they left us
4	they people been stranded, that was the
5	discipline.
6	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: You mean,
7	stranded, the workers.
8	MR. HARVEY: Yeah, the rest of us
9	just as no communication, we called counsel, it
10	took forever to call back. Now we're out there,
11	we're on our own like I explained to you last week
12	we was on our own. My chairman, he came and
13	pickedthe other person, the next day.
14	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: And we also
15	heard from a worker who unfortunately wanted to
16	had no facilities
17	MR. HARVEY: [Interposing] Yes. I
18	was just about tothat was one of my coworkers.
19	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: That was rather
20	unfortunate. She had to use facilities on the
21	bus.
22	MR. HARVEY: And I talked to her
23	Friday 'cause we went out Friday and she said it
24	was a shame. Even in the sun, bus size, size, I
25	mean one plus one equals two.

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 103
2	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you Mr.
3	Harvey.
4	MR. HARVEY: Thank you.
5	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Ms. Camilla
6	Jackson? Followed by Christine Williams, followed
7	by Deborah Meyers. Go ahead Ms. Williams, I mean
8	I'm sorry, Ms. Jackson. Ms. Jackson.
9	MS. CAMILLA JACKSON: Good night
10	dignitaries.
11	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Good night.
12	MS. JACKSON: I represent Throg's
13	Neck area of the Bronx. And I also represent the
14	northeast Bronx in which I worship. I have lived
15	in the Bronx most of my 23 years here. And I
16	thank you in time for your advance in listening to
17	me. For all of our loyalty, let me just say first
18	and foremost, we deserve better quality.
19	We constantly pay our tax money,
20	our hard-earned dollars for the inflation of all
21	these prices, especially at the height of the new
22	year and we deserve better quality. Where is the
23	quality? My goal is that I would like to see a
24	consistency in services justly disbursed
25	throughout the metropolitan area. That is my
25	throughout the metropolitan area. That is my

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 104
2	issue. I don't believe, just like the other
3	gentleman said, that people should have died. I
4	was really disheartened to learn that people died.
5	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Yes.
6	MS. JACKSON: And no fatalities
7	should have happened especially if hospitals were
8	open. That should have been thorough, especially
9	these areas that are densely populated with
10	hospitals around the area, you know? Also I
11	wanted to say that it is truly an unfortunate
12	circumstance and I hope it will never happen
13	again. I hope we learn from here on.
14	I also wanted to say that in short
15	it is my hope that during subsequent inclement
16	weather days that we will witness a more thorough
17	level of quality throughout the metropolitan area
18	not just okay, you know, Throg's Neck are just,
19	you know, this, you know, I hope there will be a
20	continuity that could be very evident. That we
21	don't feel, you know, deprived and feel like we're
22	being ticketed for not being able to park
23	correctly and all these things.
24	I just feel like it's a form of
25	injustice that we're being ticketed. I mean I

2	know some people were ticketed and, you know, in
3	areas where it was heavily, it was densely, you
4	know, populated with a lot of snow and there was
5	no where to put it. You know? Also in relation
6	to the subsequent trash removal, I had a question,
7	if the sanitation would be willing to possiblyI
8	was a little lost in theas far as when they were
9	resuming trash pickup and what they were picking
10	up.
11	So for weeks, you know, I would
12	just see me or my neighbors just piling up garbage
13	and it's just like when are they coming, what are
14	they coming for. It needs to be more thoroughly
15	addressed. And you know just like you have
16	service advisories, you know, some means of
17	reaching out to us and letting us know, even if
18	it's via the media. Just letting us know when
19	you're going to resume it, what you're picking up
20	and what we are to do. And also there's currently
21	right now what I must say as I take two busses to
22	get to work. Over by the Williams Bridge and
23	Astor Avenue area.
24	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Um-hum.
25	MS. JACKSON: It is really, it's

2	really disheartening that a lot of home owners and
3	a lot of people just in general on a whole aren't
4	being as thorough with the cleanup as well and
5	doing their part as well, you know. ThereI mean
6	there's a bus stop right outside of my house and
7	it's really just a sheet of ice. And so we're
8	waiting in the street and the curb, right there at
9	the curb so the bus is pulling up, it's not really
10	pulling up to the stop, you know, so that poses a
11	significant danger, a possible danger.
12	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Ms. Jackson, if
13	you can give that address to the gentleman here so
14	they can remove the ice as soon as possible we
15	would greatly appreciate it. And I believe
16	MS. JACKSON: [Interposing] I can
17	give them a section of the
18	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
19	Okay.
20	MS. JACKSONwhere theyeah.
21	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: And we all
22	agree that they should have done a better outreach
23	with respect to recycling, resuming recycling and
24	garbage collection.
25	MS. JACKSON: Yes

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 107 2 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] Thank you so much--3 MS. JACKSON: --thank you so much 4 5 for your time. CHAIRPERSON JAMES: --thank you б 7 Ma'am, thank you for coming out. 8 MS. JACKSON: Thank you. 9 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Christine Williams? 10 11 MS. CHRISTINE WILLIAMS: Yes I'm 12 from Brooklyn. CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Yea 13 MS. WILLIAMS: Yea. It's like you 14 15 look familiar, right? 16 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Oh but we're 17 outnumbered so let's be quiet. MS. WILIAMS: Okay. I'm going to 18 19 just make this one quick 'cause I'm the last 20 speaker. 21 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: No you 22 actually--there's two more. 23 MS. WILLIAMS: All right. I'm make 24 it quick anyway. 25 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Okay.

2	MS. WILLIAMS: I said enough at the
3	other one so I just wanted to bring out a point
4	that I left out the last one in Brooklyn about how
5	the MTA actual workers were treated that day,
6	especiallyand my heart goes out to the bus
7	drivers who were out there, hours, days, no change
8	of clothes, no bathroom, no food. I'd also like
9	to bring out in the subway side of the house, the
10	station agents have in the booth it's called an
11	EBCS system, emergency booth communication system.
12	Now the main part of this is
13	emergency booth communication system. The key
14	word is, phrase, is emergency. Okay? That,
15	whatever happened on the 26^{th} fiasco was definitely
16	an emergency. Those boxes were silent. People
17	were in the booths, hours, tours on end, no
18	communication from station command. They didn't
19	know whether they were getting relieved, they
20	didn't know what was going on, no trains, no
21	busses. They were like trapped in that box for
22	like hours.
23	One lady told me she didn'tshe
24	worked that night, she didn't get out until like
25	the next afternoon. And they expected her to come
1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 109

2	back. When she was leaving the booth, that's when
3	her tour was supposed to start again. So they
4	expected her to come back and theydon't you know
5	they marked her AWOL for that? I'm like come on.
6	They're marking people AWOL for you can't even
7	make it because there is no transportation and
8	it's like ridiculous. But I just wanted to bring
9	out the actual systems they have in place to "use
10	in emergencies".
11	I'm not saying they weren't working
12	but nobody bothered to say anything on them. And
13	then when they tried to call down at station

14 command all they got was a busy signal like they 15 took the phone off the hook 'cause they didn't 16 want to be bothered and they were overwhelmed but 17 there were people out there stranded. I did want 18 to just say that.

And I also wanted to say about the conditions of the stations' steps. That when you don't call a snow emergency, they don't hold the people back to clean the steps. You know what I'm saying? They never called it so they didn't say. You should have called it. Have the people come in, clean the steps, the steps were so bad. I've

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 110 2 got pictures on my cell from right now, you couldn't even see the steps. It was like a slide. 3 4 People were just getting on it, taking their 5 chances and sliding down rather than waling down and breaking their neck. б 7 And then people were saying, oh, 8 why didn't the MTA clean the steps. I'm wrapping 9 it up. Because there weren't--it wasn't a snow 10 emergency being called to hold the people back so 11 they left. If they were able to leave. But I 12 just wanted to give a, you know, a clearer on what those working for the MTA because I was actually 13 14 at that MTA, when they testified. 15 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Yes. 16 MS. WILLIAMS: Shocking. 17 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you Ms. 18 Williams. 19 MS. WILLIAMS: Thank you. 20 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Let me, let 21 me clarify what happened. The MTA was--the MTA 22 waited much too long to declare a level 4 23 emergency. 24 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Exactly. 25 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: They

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 111 2 announced a level 1 emergency but a level 1 emergency is no where near the scope of the 3 blizzard that we faced. 4 5 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Exactly. б COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: So they 7 announced a level 1 which really does not entail 8 the use of any additional resources beyond what 9 they would normally have out there. 10 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Exactly. 11 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: So they 12 waited too long to declare the level 4. 13 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Um-hum. COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: The MTA 14 never set up an emergency command center. We had 15 16 this as part of the testimony before my Committee. 17 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: I was there. COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: And it was 18 19 alarming that --20 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 21 Yeah. 22 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: --that in a 23 situation like this you do not even have an 24 emergency control center --25 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 112 2 Comm--um-hum. COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: -- for the 3 4 largest transit system in the country. 5 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: In the world. б COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: And probably 7 in the world. So there were major errors made which I think ended up to the detriment of the 8 9 riders and the staff. And I do feel that the--you know, no pun intended, that there were a lot of 10 11 people asleep at the switch at the MTA. And we 12 know from past--CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 13 14 That's right. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: --hearings, 16 we know from past history that there was similar 17 storms in the past. CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Um-hum. 18 19 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: The MTA did 20 not learn from those lessons--21 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 22 Right. 23 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: --and 24 repeated the lessons again this year. 25 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you,

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 113 exactly right, thank you. 2 FEMALE VOICE 1: Deborah Meyers? 3 MS. DEBORAH MEYERS: Good evening 4 5 everyone. My name is Deborah Meyers. I want to thank you all for coming to the Bronx. I want to б 7 recognize my Councilwoman, Council Member Helen 8 Diane Foster, Happy New Year to you darling. 9 Since I'm the last, I'm not going to talk about 10 everything that happened in the past. 11 I just want to say to you, hello my friend, I live in the 16th Council District in the 12 Bronx here and the 14th Council District is 13 14 opposite on the Grand Concourse. Because I live 15 near Bronxwood - - Hospital we seem to get a lot 16 of services pretty quickly. I think the 17 Sanitation Department in the Bronx, Distinct 7, not Distinct 7, District 5 and District 4 have 18 19 done a pretty good job in our Borough. 20 My only--one of my major concerns 21 with the Sanitation Department is because we have snow laborers that come out, an emergency is being 22 called, we don't have enough slots. Each 23 Sanitation district is given 36. And there are 24 25 100's of people who come out, they leave their

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 114 2 house at 4:00 o'clock in the morning to get those jobs. But I don't know where the money's at in 3 the budget but I will ask the City Council to 4 5 increase that budget for the Sanitation Department to hire those snow laborers. 6 If you need 100, you need 100 in 7 8 certain districts. You can't use just 36 people 9 to go and clean the crosswalks, the fire, you 10 know, hydrants and the bus stops to make sure the 11 people are able to get on in the front and also, 12 you know, a spot for the wheelchair handicap 13 people. And I just want you to know that many of 14 the handicapped people were very much affected by 15 this snow storm. 16 And we really need to look into 17 where we went wrong. Let this be a lesson that 18 this--we're a team, there's no I in team. We are 19 all responsible for what is happening in not only 20 our Council District but within the whole City. 21 And that's why I'm happy you're here. The other 22 thing I want to say to the City Council, when the Sanitation was unable to pick up garbage right 23 24 after Christmas, a lot of, you know, I know in my 25 building, the garbage was left piled up near my

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 115 2 emergency exit. Now I'm on the CERT [phonetic] team for my district here also. We have --3 4 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 5 Could you explain to everyone what a CERT member, team member is? б 7 MS. MEYERS: Okay yeah. 8 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Because that's 9 really important. MS. MEYERS: All right. It's very 10 11 important and I will hope many of you will join 12 your CERT team. 13 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Right. 14 MS. MEYERS: The CERT team is a 15 volunteer group under the Office of Emergency 16 Management. It's called the Community Emergency 17 Response Team. 18 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Right. 19 MS. MEYERS: We attend 11 weeks of 20 training under Office of Emergency Management, 21 headed by the Fire Department, the Police 22 Department, the Ambulance Corps, and we learn 23 about medical emergencies, how to help someone, 24 light search and rescue, about if there's a power 25 failure or, you know, like--

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 116
2	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
3	Um-hum.
4	MS. MEYERS:the wires fall, we
5	know what to do. I know my time is up but this is
6	very important.
7	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Go ahead.
8	MS. MEYERS: Every member of the
9	community can go and join the community CERT team
10	and take this 11 weeks of training for free. And
11	then you will be empowered to know what to do to
12	help the first responders when they come out. And
13	if they can't make it, we're there to go out and
14	work in our community.
15	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you Ms.
16	Meyers, because the CERT teams were not activated
17	during this blizzard
18	MS. MEYERS: [Interposing] No they
19	were not active and they should have been
20	activated because we're volunteers.
21	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Right.
22	MS. MEYERS: It's not like we're
23	there
24	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
25	Exactly.

1 Committees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 117 2 MS. MEYERS: --just to do it for free. I mean we do it but we're volunteers. 3 4 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: And so one of 5 the recommendation is obviously to work closely with the CERT teams and to activate them and to б establish protocols when you should be activated. 7 8 Particularly giving a list of all the seniors in 9 the neighborhood because there were a number of seniors, we heard from testimony, went without 10 11 food for a number of days because the volunteers 12 could not get to them. 13 MS. MEYERS: Not only did they go 14 without food, you know, some people are living on 15 high--you know--16 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 17 Yes. MS. MEYERS: --in the NYCHA 18 19 buildings on top floors. How are they supposed to 20 come down the elevator if the--21 CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing] 22 Exactly. MS. MEYERS: --elevator is broken 23 24 or getting out of the building. And I want to 25 thank you all for coming here tonight but it's

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 118
2	notwhat I'm saying here tonight is really
3	serious. Just think about the fact that we're in
4	the post-9/11.
5	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Yes.
6	MS. MEYERS: And this was a snow
7	blizzard and we're still looking out for terrorism
8	and what happens. And we need to really think
9	closely about how we are going to protect our
10	City. Not only during a blizzard but just in case
11	of a terrorist attack at the same time that we
12	have a snow blizzard. Thank you.
13	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Thank you Ms.
14	Meyers. Thank you Ms. Meyers. The last speaker
15	[Audience shouting]
16	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: We understand.
17	Our last witness is Mr. Almonte. But just let me
18	say this, Mr. Almonte, you have testified at two
19	previous hearings. You testified with respect to
20	LaRouche. Are you going to say the same thing
21	that you said in the previous, the two previous
22	hearings?
23	MR. ALMONTE: More or less.
24	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: So we're not
25	going to allow you to testify because it's not

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 119
2	relevant to the issue at hand.
3	MR. ALMONTE: Yes it is because I
4	said more or less so the part that's less is the
5	part that's going to be relevant to this hearing.
б	[Laughter]
7	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: You may come
8	and testify but if it's not onif it's not
9	relevant Sir, we are going to recess this hearing.
10	So it should be relevant.
11	MR. ALMONTE: All right.
12	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Okay? Thank
13	you Sir.
14	MR. ALMONTE: And with all due
15	respect I think that what I said last time was
16	relevant to
17	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
18	Let's hear it.
19	MR. ALMONTE: All right.
20	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Begin.
21	MR. ALMONTE: So all right,
22	obviously the Council Members aren't happy with
23	that I did the last two, so I'll do something that
24	I didn't do the last one and I'll express an
25	opinion.

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 120
2	
3	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
4	Okay.
5	MR. ALMONTE:I think I have a
6	right to that. Everyone does. All right. So
7	I'll read a passage, I'll read the Preamble to the
8	Constitution. I think people are familiar with
9	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: [Interposing]
10	Mr. Almonte
11	MR. ALMONTE:this. All right.
12	This is just related to what I'm going to say.
13	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Go ahead.
14	MR. ALMONTE: We the People of the
15	United States, in order to form a more perfect
16	Union and establish justice, ensure domestic
17	tranquility, provide for the common defense,
18	promote the general welfare and secure the
19	benefits of liberty to ourselves and to our
20	posterity, do ordain and establish this
21	Constitution for the United States of America.
22	Now I'd like to think that Mayor
23	Bloomberg is bound to this promises, right? Why
24	is it that people are dying in the streets when
25	this happens and all these things seem to be

1 Co	mmittees on Fire, Public Safety, Oversight & Sanitation 121
2	falling into place to kill the people that are
3	supposed to promote the general welfare? That's
4	my opinion.
5	CHAIRPERSON JAMES: Excellent
6	point. Thank you Mr. Almonte, this hearing is now
7	recessed.
8	[Gavel banging]
9	[Audience shouting, conversations
10	in the background]

CERTIFICATE

I, Laura L. Springate certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Lama L. Springate

Signature ____Laura L. Springate_____

Date _____January 31, 2011__