

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

-----X

January 18, 2011

Start: 2:09pm

Recess: 3:28pm

HELD AT: Emigrant Savings Bank
49 - 51 Chambers St.

B E F O R E:

CHRISTINE C. QUINN
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Maria Del Carmen Arroyo
Charles Barron
Gale Brewer
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret Chin
Leroy G. Comrie, Jr.
Elizabeth Crowley
Erik Martin Dilan
Daniel Dromm
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras
Lewis A. Fidler
Helen D. Foster
Daniel R. Garodnick
James F. Gennaro
Vincent J. Gentile

A P P E A R A N C E S

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

David G. Greenfield
Daniel J. Halloran III
Vincent Ignizio
Letitia James
Peter Koo
G. Oliver Koppell
Karen Koslowitz
Brad Lander
Jessica S. Lappin
Stephen Levin
Melissa Mark-Viverito
Darlene Mealy
Rosie Mendez
Michael C. Nelson
James S. Oddo
Annabel Palma
Domenic M. Recchia, Jr.
Diana Reyna
Joel Rivera
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
James Sanders, Jr.
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Peter F. Vallone, Jr.
James G. Van Bramer
Mark S. Weprin
Jumaane D. Williams
Rubin Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Vincent Murdock
President
African-American Benevolent Soc of Dept of Sanitation

Leon Davis
Cook
Friends House

Noor Ul Anwar
Security Guard
Friends House

Sat Kirin Kaur Khalsa
Sikh Darma of New York

1
2 SPEAKER QUINN: All right I think
3 we're going to get the ceremonials started, since
4 Council Member Sanders has dutifully gotten
5 everyone in place, which we love. So let me turn
6 the mic over to Council Member Sanders.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS, JR.: Thank
8 you, Madam Speaker. 1935 was a bad year for
9 America. It was a very good place not to be
10 around. The Great Depression has really hit, and
11 at that time a fraternity comes into being. We
12 gather together and we understand that it is a
13 need to bring dignity to labor, and dignity to
14 Black sanitation workers at that. 1935 may have
15 been a bad year, but it was a year that we were
16 turning things around in America. And this is the
17 75th anniversary of this great fraternity. Seventy
18 five years ago, one year is amazing, to go ten
19 years is ... to go 75 years, you're either doing
20 something right, or you're on the way to doing
21 something right. So I'm very happy to have
22 brought all of you to City Hall so that we all can
23 recognize our 75th anniversary. And at that I'm
24 going to let our Speaker speak.

25 SPEAKER QUINN: I just want to

1
2 concur with everything James Sanders just said.
3 Seventy five years, most groups fall apart when
4 you're deciding what the stationery should look
5 like, or who the first president should be, and
6 you guys in staying together for 75 years and
7 committing to service to this city for 75 years,
8 and committing to service to each other for 75
9 years, is quite a remarkable feat, and I know it
10 has done a lot to make our Sanitation Department
11 and our entire city government a better, stronger
12 and more diverse city government. So thank you
13 all very much. You've taken on this extra work
14 without any extra pay, and probably not a lot of
15 support, probably no support in the beginning from
16 the agency. So thank you guys very, very much for
17 believing so strongly in your city and yourselves
18 and in our great Department of Sanitation. So
19 thank you very, very much. And let me ask the
20 clerk to read the proclamation, and then we will
21 hear from the president or the vice president, or
22 whomever you chose to speak.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Council, City of
24 New York, proclamation. The Council of the City
25 of New York is proud to honor the African-American

1
2 Benevolent Society of the Department of Sanitation
3 for 75 years of outstanding service. And whereas
4 on May 22nd, 1935 the secretaries of the New York
5 City Department of Sanitation, DSNY, Matthew
6 Maypair (phonetic), and the Deputy Commissioner,
7 Matthew DiCirio, organized a meeting at the
8 municipal building with as many black men within
9 the DSNY as possible.

10 SPEAKER QUINN: Can we get a little
11 quiet in the back, please, for the reading of the
12 proclamation? Thanks. Sorry, Mike.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Black men were the
14 only group within the Department that had yet to
15 organize, and Secretary Maypair organized the
16 meeting to correct. And whereas from that first
17 meeting attended by ten men the organization
18 quickly grew. In the beginning there were only
19 847 black men in the DSNY. Today the African-
20 American Benevolent Society of the New York City
21 Department of Sanitation is as strong as ever and
22 its membership includes both men and women. All
23 of the members share a commitment to excellence,
24 not only to the workplace, but also within the
25 community. In recent years, the African-American

1
2 Benevolent Society of the Department of Sanitation
3 has led or participated in many successful events
4 or trade shows, open houses, seminars,
5 sponsorships to community fairs, sports events and
6 educational activities. And whereas as
7 individuals and as a group members have played a
8 role in increasing tolerance and understanding
9 throughout the DSNY, while advancing the welfare
10 and interests of its members in elevating their
11 social standing. They have overcome many
12 challenges to correct an unjust past, to build a
13 bright future for the organization, and all the
14 members of the DSNY. And whereas the members of
15 the African-American Benevolent Society are truly
16 worthy of the nickname, "New York City's
17 Strongest", and we wish them continued success in
18 the years ahead. Now therefore be it known that
19 the Council of the City of New York most
20 gratefully honors the members of the African-
21 American Benevolent Society of the Department of
22 Sanitation on the occasion of their 75th
23 anniversary, for their stellar service to the City
24 of New York and to the community at large.
25 Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for the entire

1
2 Council, James Sanders, Jr., Council Member, 31st
3 District, Queens.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS, JR.: The
5 occasion would never be complete without hearing
6 from our ... before even our illustrious president,
7 we need to hear from our Chair, Letitia James.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Thank you
9 very much. So as we celebrated Martin Luther
10 King's birthday yesterday, it's important to
11 remember that he went to Memphis to march with
12 sanitation workers, to affirm the value of their
13 work. And so we here in the City Council wanted
14 to tell you that we again support you and affirm
15 the value of your work and the work of all
16 municipal employees. And on a personal note, as
17 you know, my brother was a member of DSNY, and
18 when he lost his wife, my sister-in-law, all of
19 you stood with my family, and on behalf of my
20 family, I just want to say thank you, and God
21 bless you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS, JR.: Mr.
23 President, this is your moment.

24 MR. MURPHY: Good afternoon,
25 everyone, without God none of this would be

1
2 possible, so I would like to thank Our Lord and
3 Savior for making this moment possible. Also, I
4 would like the founders of this great organization
5 that took the lead in 1935, Mr. Mapier and Mr.
6 Simmons, for making that bold step out on faith.
7 Last but not least, I would like to thank Mr.
8 Michael R. Bloomberg, the Mayor of this great
9 city, the Commissioner of the Department of
10 Sanitation, John Doherty, Madam Speaker, special
11 thanks to City Councilman James Sanders, Jr.,
12 legislative director Marlene J. Tapper, and to my
13 board of director members of the African-American
14 Benevolent Society. Thank you very much for your
15 time.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS, JR.: Thank
17 you, Madam Speaker.

18 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you all very
19 much, and thank you for your service, and I hope
20 we have a lot less snow. Thank you guys very,
21 very much, take care, be safe. All right, we have
22 our second ceremonial, which is being led by
23 Council Member Rosie Mendez. So Rosie and the
24 gang, come on up.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I get to

1
2 introduce them? Oh. Thank you, Madam Speaker.
3 My colleagues, today we're going to honor two
4 heroes, workers at Friends House, which is a home
5 to ... permanent housing for people who have AIDS or
6 HIV. And on one night in September, these two
7 brave men got everyone out of the building and
8 maintained the fire with a fire extinguisher until
9 the Fire Department got there. If it was not for
10 their heroism and going beyond the scope of their
11 jobs, who knows what would have happened to the
12 people who live there and what would have happened
13 to the building, and I can't think of a bigger
14 tragedy than people who were formerly homeless to
15 possibly be homeless again. So, thank you, Madam
16 Speaker, for allowing us to be here today. And
17 what happens next?

18 SPEAKER QUINN: Let me just, before
19 we ask the clerk to read the proclamation, and
20 then we'll hear from both you guys if you want to
21 say anything. I just want to thank you, it's on
22 some level no surprise that you would act in such
23 a heroic way, given that you had, you know, that
24 the work you do already indicates that you're both
25 gentlemen with huge hearts and very giving souls.

1
2 But even that said, even the best of people would
3 have waited for, you know, the Fire Department or
4 EMS or whomever to get there. So just thank you,
5 before all of this, for your service to people in
6 need. And now, thank you even more for being
7 exactly what Rosie said, true New York City
8 heroes. So thank you, guys, very much. And if we
9 can ask the clerk to read the proclamation.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Council, City of
11 New York, proclamation. Whereas Friends House is
12 a Quaker-sponsored community that provides housing
13 and vital support services to people living with
14 AIDS who were formerly homeless, or marginally
15 housed. And whereas Leon Davis has been employed
16 by the Friends House as a part-time cook since
17 July 1998. Over the course of the last twelve
18 years he has earned great respect for his positive
19 outlook, and for being someone who goes above and
20 beyond his job description. And whereas Noor Ul
21 Anwar, originally from Pakistan, attended the
22 government College of Technology in Karachi, he
23 worked in Pakistan as an electrical engineer and a
24 supervisor. Since May of 2010, he has worked as a
25 security guard for the Sentinel Group, which

1
2 assigned him to work at Friends House. And
3 whereas on the Sunday afternoon of September 5th,
4 2010 a fire broke out on the fourth floor roof
5 deck of the Friends House split-level seven-story
6 building. As flames began to engulf the roof
7 deck, Mr. Ul Anwar pulled the fire alarm to alert-
8 -

9 SPEAKER QUINN: (Interposing) Could
10 we get a little quiet for the reading of the
11 proclamation? If we could ask the folks in the
12 lounge to keep it down, please.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Mr. Ul Anwar pulled
14 the fire alarm to alert everyone in the building
15 and contact local authorities. With not a second
16 to spare, Mr. Davis grabbed the small extinguisher
17 in the kitchen to keep the fire at bay, while the
18 residents and staff led the building to safety
19 until the Fire Department arrived. And whereas
20 Mr. Ul Anwar and Mr. Davis deserve our enduring
21 gratitude for their courageous response, which
22 saved one of our community's cherished
23 institutions as well as the lives of its residents
24 and staff. Now therefore be it known that the
25 Council of the City of New York is proud to

1
2 publicly honor Leon Davis and Noor Ul Anwar for
3 their heroism in response to the fire at Friends
4 House. Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for the entire
5 Council, Rosie Mendez, Council Member 2nd District
6 Manhattan.

7 SPEAKER QUINN: Yea. Thank you
8 guys very much. Would either of you or both of
9 you like to say a few words?

10 MR. DAVIS: Sure, I'd just like to
11 thank Friends House and the City Council for this
12 honor.

13 MR. ANWAR: I want to say thank you
14 to City Council and Friends House and my company,
15 Sentinel Group. Thank you.

16 SPEAKER QUINN: True to most
17 heroes, they have very little to say. So thank
18 you guys very much. And keep up the great work
19 and, I'm sorry Karen, that concludes the
20 ceremonials for today.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Ladies and
22 gentlemen, can I have your attention please? Can
23 I please have your attention? At this time,
24 please place all cell phones and pagers to
25 vibrate. Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: My
colleagues, please rise for the Pledge of
Allegiance. I pledge allegiance to the flag of
the United States of America, and to the Republic
for which it stands, one nation under God,
indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.
Thank you. Roll call?

COUNCIL CLERK: Arroyo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Brewer.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.

(no response)

COUNCIL CLERK: Chin

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Comrie.

(no response)

COUNCIL CLERK: Crowley.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Dickens.

(no response)

COUNCIL CLERK: Dilan.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Here.
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm.
4 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Ferreras.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Here.
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Fidler.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Here.
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Foster.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Here.
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Garodnick.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Gennaro.
16 (no response)
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Gentile.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Gonzalez.
20 (no response)
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Greenfield.
22 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Halloran.
24 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN III: Here.
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Ignizio.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Here.

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Jackson.

(no response)

COUNCIL CLERK: James

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koppell.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Lappin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Mark-Viverito.

COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:

COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

1
2 COUNCIL CLERK: Nelson.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Here.
4 COUNCIL CLERK: Palma.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.
6 COUNCIL CLERK: Recchia.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA, JR.: Here.
8 COUNCIL CLERK: Reyna.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Here.
10 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.
12 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rose.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.
14 COUNCIL CLERK: Sanders.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS, JR.:
16 Present.
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Seabrook.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Here.
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich.
20 (no response)
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Vacca.
22 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.
24 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE, JR.: Here.
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

3

COUNCIL CLERK: Vann.

4

(no response)

5

COUNCIL CLERK: Weprin.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Here.

7

COUNCIL CLERK: Williams.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

9

COUNCIL CLERK: Wills.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Here.

11

COUNCIL CLERK: Oddo.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Here.

13

COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Here.

15

COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

16

SPEAKER QUINN: Here.

17

COUNCIL CLERK: There is a quorum.

18

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you

19

very much, a quorum is present. My colleagues,

20

please rise for the invocation being delivered by

21

Sat Kirin Kaur Khalsa.

22

SAT KHALSA: Please take a moment

23

to go within and watch your breath, so we can have

24

a moment together to unify in our purpose, in our

25

mission of service. There is but one God, all

1
2 victory is his. May his sword be our protection.
3 This is the ballad of the Divine Master, composed
4 by the Tenth Guru. (prayer recited in foreign
5 language). O Divine Father, Mother, friends, we
6 stand before this most esteemed time and space
7 that's been granted to us. We ask for the
8 infinite consciousness that dwells within each one
9 of us, to guide us, to give us the understanding,
10 the patience, the wisdom, and the fortitude to
11 face all the challenges with a dignity, with a
12 willingness, to live in understanding, so that
13 this esteemed body, the New York City Council, and
14 all its members, may serve with majesty and grace.
15 We thank you for the blessing of allowing us to do
16 this service and may we keep up to the victory.
17 Thank you. Through nanek, may thy name forever
18 increase, may your spirit be exalted and may all
19 people prosper by thy grace. (invocation in
20 foreign language) Thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you.
22 Council Member Weprin.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Thank you
24 very much. I'd like to make a motion to spread
25 the invocation in full upon the record please.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.

Adoption of the minutes- -

SPEAKER QUINN: (Interposing) Just before you adopt the minutes, if I could ask my colleagues to please rise. If my colleagues could rise. As we noted, when many of us were joined together at last week's snow oversight hearing, but this is the first time we've been joined together in a full stated meeting, on January 8th, 2011 at a public even in Tucson, where constituents would come and meet and express their support or concerns to their congresswoman, Gabrielle Gabby Giffords, a gunman opened fire, killing six people and wounding thirteen. President Obama stated, "The people were there that day so representatives of the people answering to their constituents could carry their concerns to our neighbors' capitol." It was a 'Congress on your corner', but it was just an updated version of government of and by and for the people. We and all of the Congresswoman's doctors and staff are amazed and grateful at how well she seems to be defying the odds. The six

1
2 victims who were killed were a cross section of
3 America: a Federal judge, who left morning mass to
4 stop by to say hello to his long-time friend, the
5 Congress member; a widowed great grandmother from
6 New Jersey who spent her winters in Arizona to get
7 away from the cold and snow; two elderly married
8 couples, who each, when the gunshots rang out,
9 tried to shield their spouses, with the result of
10 one of the husbands giving his life for his wife,
11 and for the other couple, both were shot and the
12 wife passed away; a young Congressional aide whose
13 true passion was helping people; and a nine year
14 old girl, Christina Taylor Green, who had recently
15 become a member of her student council. Our
16 thoughts and prayers go out to all of the victims
17 and the families of the massacre, once again, we
18 and the City Council stand for a moment of silence
19 after a senseless and tragic act of gun violence.
20 I wanted to call on our colleague, Council Member
21 Oliver Koppell, who is a personal friend of
22 Congresswoman Giffords, to say a few brief words.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Thank you,
24 Madam Speaker. I am a good friend of
25 Congresswoman Gabrielle Giffords. In fact, Gale

1
2 Brewer and I sponsored a party for her, I guess
3 it's now about a year ago. She's really a
4 wonderful person and a great representative. I
5 might say that she would fit in in about ten
6 seconds in this body, and everybody would both
7 care for her a great deal and respect her a great
8 deal. And I'm just, I know all of us are just
9 delighted that she seems to be coming around and
10 has survived this terrible attack, and I couldn't
11 stand here and speak about her without also just
12 expressing my deep sorrow at the loss of life and
13 at the event so similar to the events that we all
14 hold in our districts. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

15 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Council
16 Member Koppell. Council Member Brewer?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I want to
18 thank Oliver for introducing me to, as she's
19 known, Gabby. And I remember saying to her
20 something like, you are really a New Yorker,
21 you're so alive and you're so knowledgeable on all
22 the issues, and you're just perfect. And she
23 said, Gale, I'm a three-generation Arizonian, I
24 love my people, and I really want to help them.
25 And I think that's Gabby.

1
2 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. Before
3 I call on Council Member Melissa Mark-Viverito to
4 share some words with us of the first 9/11
5 emergency responder who had passed away since the
6 passage of the Zadroga health bill, I just want to
7 share something with my colleagues that I shared
8 with folks at a couple of the Martin Luther King
9 ceremonies I went to yesterday. In the paper
10 yesterday was coverage of the funeral of one of
11 the men who had died, was killed in Arizona. It
12 was the couple, I'm sure you've read about them,
13 they were high school sweethearts, they had fallen
14 out of touch, they had gotten married about ten
15 years ago, after their first spouses had passed
16 away. And he threw his body over her and saved
17 her life. She was shot but survived. And I was
18 very struck by what she said at the funeral, to me
19 it resonated Martin Luther King's message. But I
20 think it's a good message on every day, and
21 particularly the day after Martin Luther King's
22 birthday. She went up to the front of the church,
23 she's in a wheelchair, and she said of her
24 husband, "He loved God and he loved me. He gave
25 his life so that I could live. And life will be

1
2 very, very hard without him, but what I owe him is
3 to live it to the fullest, because that is why he
4 threw himself over me." And I was just very, very
5 struck by that and thought they were words that
6 would be good for me, and I guess all of us, to
7 carry with us, and to try to live in honor of.
8 Council Member Mark-Viverito?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:

10 Thank you, Madam Speaker. A few weeks ago
11 President Obama signed the 9/11 Zadroga Health
12 Bill, a bill whose passage we in the Council
13 supported for many, many years. On January 9th,
14 2011, firefighter Roy Chelsen, 51, became the
15 first firefighter and the first first-responder to
16 die as a result of his heroic actions on 9/11
17 since the signing of this historic and important
18 bill. Just moments before the second tower
19 collapsed, he ordered his fellow firefighters of
20 Engine Company 28 inside Tower One to get to those
21 people who could be saved, and to get out of here.
22 Roy Chelsen then stayed on at Ground Zero,
23 spending weeks digging through the rubble. He was
24 later diagnosed with incurable bone marrow cancer,
25 linked to this time at Ground Zero. Steven

1
2 Cassidy, President of the UFAA, said that
3 firefighter Roy Chelsen was one of those classic
4 unbelievably-tough New York City firefighters. He
5 did not say a lot, but when you needed him, he was
6 there. There are a lot of firefighters alive
7 today because of him. When firefighter Chelsen
8 died, he was surrounded by many family, friends
9 and fellow firefighters. They found it ironic
10 that our hero of 9/11 passed away on the date of
11 1/9/2011. Firefighter Roy Chelsen is survived by
12 his wife Trish and their son Christopher, and in
13 recognizing Roy Chelsen and his memory, we also
14 recognize all those who gave of themselves on that
15 day.

16 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Council
17 Member. Thank you, Mr. Majority Leader.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you,
19 Madam Speaker. Adoption of the minutes, Melissa
20 Mark-Viverito?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: I
22 make a motion of the minutes of the Stated Meeting
23 of December 8th, 2010 be adopted as printed.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: As so
25 ordered. Messages and papers from the Mayor?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL CLERK: M334, submitting Rudy Washington for re-appointment, Civil Service Commission.

SPEAKER QUINN: Rules, Privileges and Elections.

COUNCIL CLERK: M335, submitting Charles D. McFaul for appointment to the Civil Service Commission.

SPEAKER QUINN: Rules, Privileges and Elections.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Communication from city, county and borough offices.

COUNCIL CLERK: None.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Petitions and communications.

COUNCIL CLERK: None.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Land use call-ups.

COUNCIL CLERK: M336 through M339.

SPEAKER QUINN: If we could couple those all, please, and have a coupled vote on the land use call-ups, if we could have a roll call, please.

1
2 COUNCIL CLERK: Arroyo.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.
4 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.
6 COUNCIL CLERK: Brewer.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.
8 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.
10 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin
11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.
12 COUNCIL CLERK: Comrie.
13 (no response)
14 COUNCIL CLERK: Crowley.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye on all
16 call-ups and with permission, aye on all general
17 orders.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you.
20 COUNCIL CLERK: Dickens.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.
22 COUNCIL CLERK: Dilan.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Aye on all
24 call-ups.
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ferreras.

(no response)

COUNCIL CLERK: Fidler.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Majority
Leader Rivera, may I be briefly excused to explain
my vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: All right,
the truth is I really don't want to explain my
vote, I just want to say, let's go Jets, we're
going to win the Super Bowl, and I vote aye on
all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Foster. Foster.

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Gennaro.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: I vote yes
on the Jets, and yes on the call-ups too.

COUNCIL CLERK: Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.

1
2 COUNCIL CLERK: Gonzalez.
3 (no response)
4 COUNCIL CLERK: Greenfield.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.
6 COUNCIL CLERK: Halloran.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN III: Aye.
8 COUNCIL CLERK: Ignizio.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Aye.
10 COUNCIL CLERK: Jackson.
11 (no response)
12 COUNCIL CLERK: James
13 (no response)
14 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.
16 COUNCIL CLERK: Koppell.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Aye.
18 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.
20 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.
22 COUNCIL CLERK: Lappin.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Aye.
24 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL CLERK: Mark-Viverito.

COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Nelson.

COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Aye on all
land use call-ups and I request your unanimous
consent to vote aye on all general order calendar
items.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.

Did you cast your vote? Council Member Nelson,
did you cast a vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Recchia.

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA, JR.: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Reyna.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rose.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Sanders.
4 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS, JR.: Aye.
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Seabrook.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Aye.
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye.
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Vacca.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE, JR.: Aye.
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Vann.
16 (no response)
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Weprin.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye.
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Williams.
20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Wills.
22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye.
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Oddo.
24 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Yes.
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

SPEAKER QUINN: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Today's land use call-ups were adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, with zero in the negative. Communications from the Speaker.

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. We are voting on two pieces of legislation today that we believe will help make sure that the animals of the city of New York are treated better and more appropriately. I want to thank Joe Mancino and Terzah Nasser for their work on this legislation, first proposed Intro 328A, a piece of legislation introduced by Council Member Lappin, and I want to thank Chair Arroyo, both of the pieces of legislation we're voting on today have made their way through the Health Committee which she chairs. 328A is a piece of legislation that recognizes that it is important for New Yorkers to license their dogs, and also important for New Yorkers to spay and neuter their dogs. We have an enormous problem in New York and throughout this country of unwanted dogs ending up in animal shelters. And a

1
2 very, very large percentage of those dogs end up
3 being euthanized because the organizations that
4 are running the shelters are unable to find people
5 who can adopt them. Spaying and neutering is a
6 critical part of trying to reduce the number of
7 unwanted dogs in New York. In an effort to make
8 sure that people of low and moderate income can
9 get their dogs spayed and neutered, Council Member
10 Lappin has put out a piece of legislation that
11 increases the licensing fee for people who do not
12 spay and neuter their dogs from about \$11 to
13 around \$30. This is a much smaller difference
14 between the fees for spayed and neutered dogs and
15 unspayed and unneutered dogs compared to any other
16 city in the country. The increase in the fee will
17 go into a dedicated fund within the Department of
18 Health and Mental Hygiene that will be set aside
19 to cover the cost of spaying and neutering for
20 low-income New Yorkers. I want to thank Council
21 Member Lappin for her work on this, I want to
22 thank Chair Arroyo, I also want to thank Assembly
23 Member Rosenthal and Senator Tom Dwayne, who have
24 set up the mechanism on the state level that
25 allows us to do this as a municipality, and I also

1

2 thank Council Member Lappin for her overall
3 efforts to improve the quality of life of animals
4 in the City of New York. Council Member Lappin?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Thank you,
6 Madam Speaker. Having a pet brings a lot of joy
7 and love into your life, but it is a- -

8 SPEAKER QUINN: (Interposing) Could
9 we get a little quiet, particularly in the back of
10 the chambers?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: But it is a
12 big responsibility, and we want to remind people
13 that it is the law, you should license your dog,
14 it's the best way to find your animal if it gets
15 lost, if there's an outbreak of disease, it's the
16 best way for us to keep your animal safe. There
17 are free and low-cost options out there for
18 people, so money should not be a factor. But
19 we're adding this additional incentive to both
20 raise revenue, to reduce the number of unwanted
21 pets in the city, and also to encourage people to
22 do the right thing. Only about 20% of the dogs in
23 the city are licensed, it's a very low rate, and
24 so we're going to be working on an education and
25 outreach campaign. But we want people to go to

1
2 nyc.gov to register your animal, it's the best
3 thing for them, for you, and for the city. And I
4 wanted to thank the Speaker, I want to thank the
5 Health Chair, in addition to Assemblywoman
6 Rosenthal and State Senator Tom Dwayne, I also
7 wanted to mention Assembly member Micah Kellner,
8 who has been and is an ardent animal-rights
9 activist and worked very closely with us and with
10 the ASPCA in drafting this bill. Thank you.

11 SPEAKER QUINN: And thank you very
12 much, Council Member Lappin, for mentioning the
13 ASPCA. They and a long list of other animal
14 rights organizations deserve a lot of gratitude
15 for their work on your piece of legislation, but
16 also on Council Member Vallone's bill, 425A. I
17 also want to thank Chair Arroyo for shepherding
18 that piece of legislation through her Committee.
19 425A is a piece of legislation that deals with
20 strengthening the enforcement and the penalties
21 and the rules around a particular type of animal
22 cruelty that is tethering animals. This piece of
23 legislation sets a clear timeframe over which, if
24 you're tethering your animal without appropriate
25 water, food or shelter, you can be fined and

1
2 penalized. It also clearly says what type of
3 collars and chains can and cannot be used if
4 you're tethering your dog. This is a problem we
5 see actually many dogs ending up injured and not
6 being able to recover from the injuries of having
7 pinch or choke collars around their necks for days
8 and days at a time. So I want to thank Council
9 Member Vallone for pointing out this problem,
10 pointing out that New York's laws were not as
11 strong as some other jurisdictions, and making
12 sure we remedied that with 425A. Let me call on
13 the sponsor of the bill, Council Member Vallone.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE, JR.: Thank
15 you, Madam Speaker. Tethering up animals for a
16 long period of time is a form of animal abuse. It
17 endangers the animal and it also endangers people
18 passing by, because they're three times more
19 likely to bite. So today we go, take a big step
20 towards protecting our kids and our animals, and I
21 want to thank the Speaker and Chair Arroyo and the
22 ASPCA and everyone involved for protecting some of
23 our most helpless. Thank you.

24 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very
25 much. And I just want to thank Chair Rivera and

1
2 Chuck Davis for moving forward four of the five
3 appointees to the Lobbying Commission. I want to
4 thank former Council Member Herb Berman, Jamila
5 Bragg, Lesley Horton and Margaret Morton for
6 agreeing to be on the Commission, and we expect
7 with one more appointment pending, to get that
8 Commission moving very quickly. And that
9 concludes communications from the Speaker.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
11 very much, Madam Speaker, we move on to discussion
12 of general orders. I see none at this time, we'll
13 move to reports of special committees.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Reports of
16 standing committees.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the
18 Committee on Health, Intro 328A, Dog Licensing.

19 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
20 on general orders.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 425A,
22 Restraining Animals.

23 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
24 on general orders with a message of necessity.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Committee on Land Use, LU 267 and Reso 632, UDAAP
Brooklyn.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general
orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: LU 278 and Reso
633, and 279 and Reso 634, zoning amendments.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general
orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: LU 281 and Reso 635
through 283 and Reso 637, landmark designations.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general
orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: LU284 and Reso 638,
landmark designation.

SPEAKER QUINN: Motion to
disapprove.

COUNCIL CLERK: LU 285 and Reso
639, landmark designation.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general
orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: LU 286 and Reso
640, zoning map amendment.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general
orders.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered LU
287 and Reso 641, UDAAP Bronx.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general
orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the
Committee on Rules, Privileges and Elections, Pre-
considered M340 and Reso 642, approving the
appointment of Herbert Berman, Lobbying
Commission.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general
orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered M341
and Reso 643, approving the appointment of Jamila
Ponton Bragg, Lobbying Commission.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general
orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered M342
and Reso 644, approving the appointment of Lesley
Horton, Lobbying Commission.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general
orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered M343
and Reso 645, approving the appointment of
Margaret Morton, Lobbying Commission.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general orders.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: General order calendar?

COUNCIL CLERK: Resolution appointing various persons Commissioner of Deeds.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general orders. And at this time I would like to ask for a roll call on all items that have been coupled on the general order calendar.

COUNCIL CLERK: Arroyo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: May I be excused to explain my vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: First, and I certainly agree that spaying and neutering is very, very important and should happen, and tethering shouldn't happen, but I think we already have fines and fees and laws on the books already. To increase the costs of that and increase the penalties to me is a regressive form of taxation. I believe that we should get more into education,

1 signage and enforcement of what already exists.

2 So for that I'm going to vote no on Intro 328A and
3 no on Intro 425A, and aye on all the rest.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Brewer.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I'm voting
6 aye, I do want to say good things about Herbie
7 Berman, somebody who has one of the biggest hearts
8 in public service. And I know that one of the
9 items that will be on the agenda will be small
10 groups that are bringing their causes to City Hall
11 and how they do or do not interact with the issue
12 of lobbying. And I know that's something that I
13 met with some of these groups as Chair of
14 Governmental Operations. So we look forward to
15 working with the entire Lobbying Commission and
16 I'm delighted that Herbie Berman is going to be
17 the Chair. Thank you very much, I vote aye.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Comrie.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE, JR.: Aye,

24 could I (inaudible)?
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So ordered.
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Dickens.
4 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Dilan.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Aye.
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Ferreras.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Aye.
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Fidler.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: It's truly
15 a privilege to vote for Herb Berman for anything,
16 so I vote aye on all.
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Foster.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Aye.
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Garodnick.
20 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Gennaro.
22 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Yes.
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Gentile.
24 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Yes.
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Greenfield.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I
congratulate Melissa and Peter for looking out for
our vulnerable animals, and I vote aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Halloran.

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN III:
Permission to explain my vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN III: I'm
going to vote aye on all the rest but 328A. I am
one of the 20% of New Yorkers who actually bothers
to register his dogs, and they're purebred Great
Danes. And I really don't feel that spending \$68
to register my dogs which stay in my house and in
my yard and don't contribute to the dog problem is
the solution. I would point out, as the person
who introduced this resolution indicated, 80% of
the dogs in this city are unlicensed. Those are
the ones causing the population to increase, not
the people who are actually responsible enough to
register their dogs. So 320,000 unregistered dogs
out there are going to effectively cause the
homeowners in my district and the other districts
who actually have yards, to have to pay more to
support something that they don't need, that

1
2 they're not the cause of, and once again the
3 government is finding another way to increase by
4 300% the fees that my taxpayers are paying. We do
5 it with water and sewer, we do it with property
6 tax, and at the end of the day, now we're taxing
7 our dogs. I think it's come time that the city
8 stop taxing its citizens and start reducing the
9 unnecessary spending it engages in, and stop
10 penalizing the responsible owners. I vote no on
11 328A, because as was pointed out, it's not going
12 to solve the problem, because the 80% of the
13 people don't bother to register their dogs in the
14 first place, so they're not going to pay this fee,
15 so it's not going to go into the city's coffers,
16 and those dogs are not going to be affected. This
17 is a bill without a purpose.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Ignizio.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes, I
20 never thought I would say this, but I want to
21 associate myself with the comments of my friend
22 and colleague, Charles Barron, on 328A and vote no
23 on that, and vote no on Land Use 282 as well,
24 thank you.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: James

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye on
all except 328A, I vote no.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koppell.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Aye on
all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: May I
please be excused to explain my vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I too
want to congratulate Herbie Berman, as I know him
as Herbie, I served eleven years with him in the
City Council, and I think that Herb Berman is a
great choice, and I congratulate him.

COUNCIL CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
leave to explain my vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: As much as
I'm intrigued by joining the Barron-Ignizio-
Halloran alliance, I'm actually going to speak to
Land Use 267- -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ:

(Interposing) I have to vote.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ... and Reso 632, the North Side Town Hall is a fantastic project and one that I did some work on in my prior job, so I'm going to abstain on Land Use 267 and Reso 632 and vote aye on all others.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Lappin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: I wanted to say to Council Member Fidler that Herbie Berman used to be a Brooklyn boy, but now I'm very proud to say he is a resident of District 5. Yes, and he worked on Roosevelt Island even before that, so I'm very proud to be voting aye on all, and congratulations Herbie.

COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I'd like to offer my congratulations to Herb Berman, but also to Jamila Ponton Bragg, Lesley Horton and Margaret Morton as well, as members of the New York City Lobbying Commission. And with that I vote aye on

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Mark-Viverito.

COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: With
a great thank you to Jessica and to Peter for
their bills, I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye
on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote no
on LU 284 and accompanying Reso 638 and aye on the
rest. Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Recchia.

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA, JR.: It's
a great pleasure to vote for Herb Berman and
Margaret Morton and all the other people on the
Lobby Board. So I vote aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Reyna.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I vote aye
on all and congratulations to Herbie Berman.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL CLERK: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Sanders.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS, JR.: Aye
on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Seabrook.

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye
on all except Intro 328A, and I congratulate
Charles Barron on becoming a Republican.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS, JR.: He's
always been one.

COUNCIL CLERK: Vacca.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE, JR.: Aye
on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on
all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Weprin.

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Williams.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be
3 excused to explain my vote?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: First I'm
6 going to also say I'm happy to vote for Herb
7 Berman. Ten, fifteen years ago I went to a lot of
8 people trying to get some advice on politics. I
9 went to some people who actually looked like me,
10 hoping I'd get a good response. The first person
11 to take me to City Hall was my then-Council Member
12 Herb Berman. So it's a pleasure to be able to do
13 that today. Also, I'm going to vote aye on all,
14 including Intro 425A, but I did want to mention I
15 did have some concerns about possible abuses of
16 it, and neighbors calling neighbors for trivial
17 things and if they have a barbecue or something
18 and they want to keep their dog tied up, but I
19 decided the abuses that are going on currently
20 outweigh the possible abuses of the law. But
21 hopefully if this becomes a problem, we can
22 revisit it. Aye on all.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Wills.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye on all.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Dilan.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: I'd like to
3 request unanimous consent to change my vote?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: I change my
6 vote to no on 328A.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Oddo.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: I vote no on
9 Intro 328A and yes on all others, and if I could
10 just add a comment or two, to what Councilwoman
11 Melissa Mark-Viverito talked about, that's
12 firefighter Roy Chelsen. A couple of years ago,
13 Council Member Ignizio and I hosted a press
14 conference to encourage New Yorkers to donate
15 blood marrow, and we met Roy and his amazing wife
16 and amazing sister Joan, and if those of us in
17 this body can carry himself and herself with a
18 fraction of the courage that Roy and his wife
19 Trish and his sister and his family did, we'd be a
20 lot better off. And two of my best friends in the
21 world, Dave Hughes and Steve Materra, worked with
22 Roy at 28 and 11, and a couple of weeks ago it
23 looked like he had a match and it looked like
24 things were going to turn out for the best, and it
25 really looked like we had a miracle. And that

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

didn't work out, and I just appreciate the comments from Melissa and God rest his soul.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, and I want to thank the Minority Leader and Council Member Melissa Mark-Viverito for their comments. And on a lighter note I want to say I vote aye on all, with particularly the enthusiasm of getting to vote for Herbie Berman, and any commission that gives all of us time to spend ... gives all of us the opportunity to spend a little more time with Herbie Berman is a good government commission, because it's good for all of us. So aye to all, but particularly to Herbie, and I can't wait to see who wins the fight between Fidler and Lappin on who actually represents him.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you very much. All items on today's general order calendar were adopted by a vote of 48 in the affirmative, with zero in the negative and zero abstentions, with the exception of Proposed Intro

1
2 328A, which was adopted by a vote of 41 in the
3 affirmative, with seven in the negative and zero
4 abstentions, and Proposed Intro 425A, which was
5 adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, with
6 one in the negative and zero abstentions, and Land
7 Use Call-up 282 and Reso 636, which was adopted by
8 a vote of 47 in the affirmative, one in the
9 negative and zero abstentions, and Land Use Call-
10 up 267 with Reso 632, which was adopted by a vote
11 of 47 in the affirmative, zero in the negative and
12 one abstention, and Land Use Call-up 284 with Reso
13 638, which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the
14 affirmative, one in the negative, zero
15 abstentions, and revised land use call-ups were
16 adopted by a vote of 48 in the affirmative, with
17 zero in the negative. At this point we'll go on
18 to introduction ... at this point we'll move on to
19 introduction of reading of the bills.

20 SPEAKER QUINN: All bills are
21 referred to committees as indicated in the agenda.
22 I would just like to add for the record that
23 there's quite a conversation on the floor amongst
24 the members about the seeming resurgence of bow
25 ties at today's stated meeting amongst staff and

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Council members, I just want to note that important point for the record.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Being that there are no resolutions, we will move on to general discussion. First we have Council Member Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very much. I am introducing three bills today that I wanted to draw to the attention of my colleagues, two of which relate to street fairs and one of them is to help tenants communicate with their landlords. First regarding street fairs, Intro 457 would require the posting of an interactive map indicating anticipated street closures for scheduled street events on the website of the Office of Citywide Event Coordination and Management. We need to give advanced notice not only so that people will know about these events, but also to help New Yorkers to avoid the travel delays resulting from altered traffic patterns, particularly in the spring, summer and early fall. This bill will also require online disclosure of the sponsor of each

1
2 street fair, providing the public with the name of
3 the non-profit organization to whom a percentage
4 of the street fair's profit will be paid. The
5 second, Intro 458, also addresses disclosure of
6 street fair locations. This bill would require
7 SBS, Small Business Services, to post on its
8 website information regarding all approved street
9 events, including street fairs. Since street
10 fairs can provide local small businesses access to
11 an increased number of potential customers, we
12 need SBS to share this information more widely.
13 Also to be provided on that website is information
14 regarding how small businesses can obtain permits
15 necessary to participate in those fairs. Lastly,
16 the third bill that I'm introducing today, Intro
17 459, I'm doing along with Council Members Mark-
18 Viverito and Chin, and that would require owners
19 of multiple dwellings to register a current email
20 address with the Department of Housing
21 Preservation and Development. Last year this body
22 passed legislation requiring landlords to register
23 their contact information with HPD, in order to
24 improve the ability of tenants to communicate with
25 their building owners. Because email is obviously

1
2 an important tool in facilitating communication,
3 it also makes sense to include that in the rent
4 registration, the leases and the lease renewals,
5 so I encourage my colleagues to join me in signing
6 on to all three of these bills, and thank you very
7 much.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
9 very much. Next we move on to Council Member
10 James.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Thank you.
12 Tonight we will be holding the first sanitation
13 hearing in the "outer boroughs" on Staten Island.
14 Unfortunately, I was just informed five minutes
15 ago that the administration has decided not to
16 send any member of the New York Department of
17 Sanitation. In fact, they are only sending
18 members of the Community Affairs. First, let me
19 just say that the hearing did not close, it was
20 adjourned. Two, that this decision is an act of
21 disrespect to the citizens of Staten Island, and
22 to this body. Three, I believe citizens have a
23 right to confront and to ask questions of relevant
24 agencies as it relates to snow removal. And four,
25 this decision will do nothing, nothing, to advance

1
2 public service, democracy and public input in the
3 City of New York. I would hope that the
4 administration going forward would change their
5 decision and would put forth a superintendent of
6 each respective borough at our hearings. And also
7 I apologize to the Staten Island delegation, and I
8 would hope that everyone would still come out to
9 the hearing this evening. And above all, I
10 apologize to the citizens of Staten Island, they
11 deserve better.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
13 very much. Next we have Minority Leader Jimmy
14 Oddo.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Thank you.
16 You know, during the general order vote we had a
17 little fun with Council Member Barron, Council
18 Member Ulrich and Ignizio. But there's a serious
19 side to that, and I think we over the last several
20 years in this body have learned to have political
21 discourse and debate in a very civil manner. I
22 for one thought this President's speech was
23 remarkable a few days ago, and I got to thinking
24 about our own institution, in how we have been
25 able to speak to each other, even during heated

1
2 moments, with a respectful tone. There have been
3 some exceptions over the year, and frankly I've
4 been in the middle of a few of them. Maybe it
5 took the events with former colleague James Davis,
6 but when everyone is having this debate nationally
7 about discourse, and I look to what happens in
8 Albany and Washington and I look here in this
9 body, we are different, and I want to commend all
10 of my colleagues, and perhaps because we have been
11 able to coexist in a respectful manner, we were
12 able to sit shoulder to shoulder to shoulder
13 during that hearing on Monday. And as I wrote to
14 the Speaker, and then I wrote to each of you, I
15 was particularly proud of the institution. We all
16 feared that it was going to become a circus and we
17 were going to grandstand for the cameras, and
18 maybe with a hiccup or two, that did not happen.
19 And I thought that we did right by the public. I
20 thought that we elicited amazing testimony on the
21 record and I just remind my colleagues of how we
22 handle ourselves, let's continue to do that, let's
23 debate vociferously, but always respectfully, and
24 perhaps we can continue to set the tone across
25 this city, across this state, and maybe even

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

across this nation.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you very much. Next we have Council Member Brewer.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. I am just bringing to your attention Intro 452, basically it talks about the fact that in the schools we would like to purchase locally, as opposed to overseas or from other parts of the United States. I know this is seen as a credit to the Speaker and Margaret Nelson and her ... Sarah and other members of the staff, and Rihanna in our office, we have been working hard to fulfill, working in the schools is particularly challenging because they have a budget max and they have certain procedures in procurement that they need to follow. So we look forward to that debate and look forward to passage of that bill. I also wanted to just mention two interns, Maria Macauley (phonetic) is at Hunter, a student in our office, and Jordan Diminich (phonetic) is also a Hunter student, and they're wonderful interns. Thank you very much.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you. We move on to Melissa Mark-Viverito.

COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:

1
2
3 Thank you. I want to ask my colleagues to sign on
4 to Reso 626, a resolution that calls upon the
5 United States Congress to reinstate the privileges
6 formerly held by the Puerto Rican resident
7 Commissioner and other delegates, allowing them to
8 vote on amendments and procedures in the Committee
9 of the whole. I want to read quickly from an
10 editorial that came out in El Diario, this is
11 quite outrageous. "Only days after taking control
12 of the House, Republicans squashed legislation
13 that would have allowed Puerto Rico's resident
14 Commissioner, Pedro Pierluisi, and other delegates
15 to keep certain voting powers. For example, under
16 current House rules, representatives of the
17 District of Columbia, Guam and other U.S.
18 territories can vote on the floor on amendments.
19 All Republicans voted in favor of rescinding the
20 votes of delegates, while Democrats opposed the
21 move. Republicans plan to finish this hatchet job
22 during a full House vote on the new rules package.
23 In plain politics, Republicans are ignoring a long
24 historical truth that they have had a pardon.
25 U.S. citizenship was cast on Puerto Ricans who are

1
2 denied the right to choose their status. So the
3 island should not be penalized for a situation it
4 did not hatch. On the eve of the Republican
5 maneuver, two Puerto Rican soldiers were killed in
6 Iraq. They and others did not give half their
7 effort on the battlefield, simply because they
8 weren't born in a state." That's the editorial
9 from El Diario. I want to also just comment,
10 Congressman Serrano has been very vocal on this
11 matter, who said, "This is a shameful step
12 backwards that House Republicans took today, and
13 it is a slap in the face of the millions of
14 citizens and people living under the U.S. flag in
15 these territories. They have had the ability to
16 have their voices heard in the U.S. House of
17 Representatives for only four short years, and
18 there's no excuse for taking that right away from
19 these duly-elected leaders." So again I would ask
20 my colleagues to join in Reso 626 that is calling
21 on the U.S. Congress to reinstate the ability of
22 the territories and those under U.S. flag to vote.
23 It's a small measure, again this Puerto Rico and
24 many of the territories have served with great
25 distinction in the U.S. Army and the U.S. armed

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

forces. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you very much. Next we move on to Council Member Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I'd like to use this opportunity to thank two of my interns, Miss Rae Wan, Miss Rachel Rae Wan, and Mr. Andy Ray Wen. They're in the back, we thank them for their service and contributions to our community. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: All right, thank you. Next we move on to Council Member Fidler.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Thank you. Apropos of the comments of Minority Leader Oddo and Councilwoman James, I want to indicate that I also was extremely proud of the performance of this body at the Sanitation hearing about the blizzard. Frankly, I can well understand the feeling of the administration that they are not anxious to play "thank you, may I have another". But frankly, a lot of questions were necessarily left unanswered, and as a Council Member representing part of this city that took it the worst, I want to know, I want to hear from my

1
2 local Sanitation superintendent, I want to know
3 what he told them, what equipment he asked for,
4 when he asked for it, and how long it took them to
5 respond. I think those are the questions that my
6 constituents who are inconvenienced would like to
7 ask and be answered, and not to be sent some flak
8 whose job it is to make people feel good about the
9 fact that they were buried in two feet of snow, to
10 face those people directly. I think it's the
11 height of arrogance, the height of arrogance to
12 issue your own plan, not listen to the ideas and
13 suggestions of others who might make it better,
14 and to end this inquiry before it is done. The
15 people and the officials, the local officials, the
16 Department of Sanitation, in particular, needs to
17 be at all of the borough hearings to face the
18 people that they have inconvenienced. They
19 shouldn't have to wait for a subpoena to come and
20 to do the right thing.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
22 very much. Next we move on to Council Member
23 Williams.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you
25 very much. Before this, I just want to also

1
2 concur that I think we did a great job, and I
3 appreciated the opportunities I had, and I
4 appreciate the leadership of the Speaker and in
5 particular, Council Member James. I'm asking my
6 colleagues to please support Resolution 631,
7 calling on the New York State Legislature to
8 reintroduce and pass legislation that will require
9 ex-felons to be fully informed of their voting
10 rights. I think as a society we try to say that
11 we're making sure that everybody has the ability
12 to have another chance if necessary, but we don't
13 put those into practice, and I think a lot of
14 felons are under the erroneous perception that
15 they are unable to vote and therefore cannot fully
16 participate in society and begin to reintegrate.
17 So I'm hoping that I can get some support on that.
18 Thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you.
20 Next we have Council Member Ignizio.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes, thank
22 you very much to my colleagues. I first want to
23 address the Sanitation issue in my district. I
24 concur with my colleague, Council Member Fidler,
25 that it truly is the height of arrogance, and not

1
2 only is it the height of arrogance, you left my
3 district without being plowed till Friday, and
4 then you don't even have the - I won't say that
5 word - you don't even have the gumption to come
6 and fess and speak to them, and let them know why?
7 What happened to "the buck stops at my desk"?
8 what happens to an administration built on
9 accountability? And then when accountability
10 comes to before the people, you don't show up.
11 And I think that needs to be echoed throughout the
12 media and political people throughout this city.
13 Secondly, and one where I wanted to praise the
14 administration, is when I last spoke, we were
15 talking about PCBs in schools. And there is no
16 policy, there was no plan, there was no discussion
17 about what to do. Well, over the last two weeks,
18 with the assistance of Deputy Chancellor Grimm and
19 Deputy Mayor Walcott, there was a plan, and we
20 came up with a solution whereby, which may not be
21 100% for some but it's progress in my view,
22 whereby every custodian would check every school
23 light in their school for PCBs leaking. This is
24 not fun for me, I don't desire to be, you know,
25 either praised or bashed in the press for this. I

1
2 just genuinely believe there may be an issue here
3 that is potentially hurting our children in the
4 long term. Not an immediate risk, but over the
5 long term. And I believe this Council ought to
6 lead the way, both legislatively and giving a
7 voice to this issue to say that PCBs in our
8 schools, we know they're toxic, we know they
9 shouldn't be there, and let's find a way of
10 ridding them from our schools. So I wanted to
11 congratulate and thank those who are working with
12 us, including New York City lawyers, including the
13 UFT, including any and all that want to be a part
14 of this movement, and really think that 20 years
15 from now we'll look back and we'll say we did the
16 right thing here today, and we'll continue to do
17 it tomorrow. Thank you very much.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
19 very much. Next we have Council Member Ulrich.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you,
21 Mr. Majority Leader. In keeping with the tone and
22 subject of civility and collegiality which we were
23 speaking of before, I would like to remind my
24 colleagues that in two days we will celebrate the
25 50th anniversary of the swearing in of John F.

1
2 Kennedy as the 35th President of the United States,
3 and it was a remarkable accomplishment, not only
4 for the Kennedy family, but for so many groups and
5 for so many young people who aspired to something
6 greater than themselves. And we all know that in
7 his speech, you know, the famous line where he
8 says, "Ask not what your country can do for you,
9 but what you can do for your country", but I was
10 always ... I always found even more profound the
11 closing of that speech, which I just want to read
12 because of obviously the pertinency and we're only
13 two days away from it. He concluded his speech by
14 saying, "Finally, whether you are citizens of
15 America or citizens of the world, ask of us the
16 same high standards of strength and sacrifice
17 which we ask of you, with a good conscience our
18 only sure reward, with history the final judge of
19 our deeds, let us go forth to lead the land we
20 love, asking His blessing and His help and knowing
21 full well that here on earth God's work must truly
22 be our own." Those were very touching words then,
23 they are very touching words now, they continue to
24 inspire so many people to live to a higher
25 standard, to seek things that are greater than

1

2 ourselves, to be kind and compassionate to one
3 another, and that challenge remains with us today,
4 and I hope that we can take a little bit of that
5 with us, not only today, not only two days from
6 now on the anniversary, but each and every day.
7 Thank you.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
9 very much. Next we have Council Member Sanders.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS, JR.: Thank
11 you, sir. Just yesterday we marked the birth of
12 Martin Luther King, the Reverend Doctor Martin
13 Luther King, Jr., who also spoke of the very same
14 things that my colleague Ulrich was just saying a
15 few moments. So I trust that we will also take
16 those things to mind and try to really live up to
17 it. Wouldn't it be nice if America can finally
18 live up to it? And let's take one day at least
19 where we live up to all of these things that we
20 say. But I also want to draw your attention, as
21 my colleague from Staten Island pointed out, that
22 we do ... we're finding that there are cancer-
23 causing carcinogens in some of the schools, and
24 that we need to do something about this. We need
25 to do it in a responsible fashion. We need to do

1
2 it in a ... as fast as we possibly can. We need to
3 test any school that is possibly affected, and
4 remedy that situation well. We should not wait
5 till a later date. When we send our children to
6 school, we send our children to learn how to read,
7 write and do arithmetic. We do not send them to
8 come home in a worse shape than we send them out.
9 Therefore, let us do everything we can to make
10 sure that schools are indeed a safe place. I join
11 in the call for remedying any school that is found
12 with this problem. Thank you very much.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you
14 very much. Seeing no others, this adjourns
15 today's meeting. Thank you.

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Richard A. Ziats, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.



Signature _____

Date January 22, 2011