

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

----- X

Tuesday, November 22, 2022

Start: 10:15 a.m.

Recess: 11:16 a.m.

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM, CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Justin L. Brannan, Chairperson

COUNCILMEMBERS:

- Diana Ayala
- Charles Barron
- Gale A. Brewer
- Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
- David M. Carr
- Amanda Farias
- Kamillah Hanks
- Crystal Hudson
- Ari Kagan
- Farah N. Louis
- Francisco P. Moya
- Chi A. Ossé
- Keith Powers
- Pierina Ana Sanchez
- Marjorie Velázquez
- Julie Won
- Lincoln Restler

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Calvin T. Brown
Deputy Commissioner
Department of Small Business Services
DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BROWN:

Lindsey Stewart
Resident and Business Owner
DUMBO BID

Jackie Florsheim
Resident
DUMBO BID

Henry Florsheim
Resident
DUMBO BID

Suzanne Quint
Resident
DUMBO BID

Thea Grant
Resident and Business Owner
DUMBO BID

Craig Anthony Miller
Artist
DUMBO BID

Cynthia McKnight
President
Community Education Council 13

Land Grant
Resident
DUMBO BID

Richard Moore
Artist
DUMBO BID

Eleanor Alper
Artist
DUMBO BID

Magdalena Levy
Resident and Business Owner
DUMBO BID

Michael Iannaco
Resident and Business Employee
DUMBO BID

Marilynn Donini
Employee, St. Ann's Warehouse
DUMBO BID

Mallory Kasdan
Founder of the DUMBO Action Committee
DUMBO BID

Marcia Hillis
Resident and Artist
DUMBO BID

Eliza Thomas
Resident
DUMBO BID

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: We're about to start. Quiet
3 please. Welcome to today's New York City Council
4 hybrid hearing of the Committee on Finance. To
5 minimize disruption please everyone, place all
6 electronic devices to vibrate or silent mode. If you
7 wish to submit testimony, you may send it to
8 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Again, that's
9 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Thank you for your
10 cooperation. Chair BrannAn, we are ready to begin.

11 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: [GAVEL] Good morning and
12 welcome to today's Finance Committee meeting. I'm
13 Councilmember Justin Brannan. I have the privilege
14 of Chairing the council's Committee on Finance.
15 Today, we've been joined by Councilmembers Ossé,
16 Kagan, Hanks, Louis, and won.

17 Today the committee will be hearing and voting on
18 three items: A BID-related Introduction, an Article
19 11 tax exemption, and a transparency Resolution.
20 First, Intro 789 would authorize two BIDs (Business
21 Improvement Districts) to increase the amounts they
22 expend annually as follows: 125th Street BID to
23 \$1,687,028, and the DUMBO BID to \$2.5 million.
24 Council previously approved Resolution 362 on
25 November 3rd, setting today as a date for a public

2 hearing on this legislation. The budget increases
3 have been requested by the property owners within the
4 boundaries of each BID, and would be used to enhance
5 the services provided. The details about which BIDs
6 would see increases and the amounts sought are set
7 forth set forth in the briefing documents prepared by
8 the finance staff. To adopt this we must first make
9 sure that proper notice was given, that the increase
10 in annual amounts to be expended are in the public
11 interest, and that the tax and debt limits prescribed
12 in the law will not be exceeded. Pre-considered
13 Resolution 398 would authorize an Article 11 property
14 tax exemption for 12 buildings with 251 units in
15 Councilmember Gutierrez's district. This tax
16 exemption will allow the buildings to refinance
17 existing debt, pay off existing arrears, conduct a
18 rehabilitation scope, and remain operationally sound.

19 Finally, the transparency Resolution sets forth
20 the new designation and changes in the designation of
21 certain organizations receiving local aging, anti-
22 poverty and youth discretionary funding, and funding
23 pursuant to certain initiatives in the budget. As
24 with all transparency resolutions, Councilmembers
25 will have to sign a disclosure form indicating

2 whether or not a conflict of interest exists with any
3 of the groups on the attached list.

4 If any Councilmember has a potential conflict of
5 interest with any of the organizations listed, he or
6 she has the opportunity to disclose the conflict at
7 the time of their vote. As a reminder, please
8 disclose any conflicts you may have with proposed
9 subcontractors used by organizations sponsored by
10 counsel discretionary funding. These disclosures
11 must be made before the subcontractor can be
12 approved. Disclosure forms must be completed and
13 submitted prior to the vote on the transparency
14 resolution that may be emailed to Julius Kuranda, who
15 is also present today in chambers to answer your
16 questions.

17 Deputy Commissioner Calvin Brown from the
18 Department of Small Business Services is here to
19 testify regarding the requested assessment increases,
20 and representatives from the two BIDs are here to
21 answer any Councilmember questions.

22 We've also been joined by Councilmembers Ayala,
23 Brewer, Powers, and Barron, and we'll hear from
24 Deputy Commissioner Brown now after he is sworn in by
25 counsel.

2 COUNSEL: Good morning. Do you affirm to tell
3 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
4 before this committee and respond honestly to
5 Councilmember questions, Deputy Commissioner.

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BROWN: I do.

7 COUNSEL: Thank you please proceed.

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BROWN: Good morning, Chair
9 Brannan and the Finance Committee. I'm Calvin T
10 Brown, the Deputy Commissioner for Neighborhood
11 Development at the Department for Small Business
12 Services, and I'm joined by my colleagues Emily
13 Edward, and Lesley Velasquez, members of the Business
14 Improvement Team at the agency.

15 I wish to express my support for the law
16 providing an increase in the amount to be expended in
17 two Business Improvement Districts, or BIDs. At SPS
18 we are working hard to open the doors for New Yorkers
19 across the five boroughs, focusing on creating
20 stronger businesses, connecting New Yorkers to good
21 jobs and fostering thriving neighborhoods. We
22 oversee and support the city network of BIDs and
23 groups who wish to form new BIDs in their
24 communities. We believe BIDs are central to these
25 efforts as valuable and proven partners in fostering

2 the vitality of the city's neighborhoods and
3 commercial districts.

4 Throughout the pandemic and recovery BIDs have
5 been called upon to deliver an increase the level of
6 services and support to small business in their
7 neighborhoods. The mayor's economic blueprint also
8 places the BID It's in front and center and several
9 initiatives to rebuild and reinvent our commercial
10 corridors and central business districts. In order
11 to respond to these new challenges and opportunities,
12 every single BID has been evaluating their budgets
13 for savings and cost efficiencies.

14 Part of our role in overseeing and supporting the
15 city's existing network of 76 BIDs includes guiding
16 them through the legislative processes, including
17 increases to their assessment cap. To propose an
18 increase in assessment BIDs must complete a
19 multilevel review process overseen by SPS. The BID
20 Board of Directors which include property owners,
21 merchants, residents, as well as representatives from
22 the city controllers, borough president, city
23 council, and SPS must review and approve the proposed
24 assessment increase. Additionally, SBS requires all
25 BIDs to submit a five-part justification outline in

2 how the increase will be allocated, minutes from the
3 board meeting when the increase was approved, and
4 letters of support by all city Councilmembers
5 representing the BID boundary.

6 SPS then reviews these justifications and
7 determines whether they are sufficient to bring to
8 city council. As required by law, each of the two
9 BIDs published a notice of this public hearing at
10 least once in a local newspaper having general
11 circulation in the district specifying the time and
12 place of today's hearing and state in the proposed
13 amount to be expended annually. It is a priority of
14 SPS that assessment increases proposal focus on
15 enhancing programs and services provided to the
16 district. The two BIDs proposing assessment
17 increases are doing so to address vital needs and
18 changing conditions on the ground. The increases
19 will further expand, reinforce, and strengthen
20 existing core services currently provided in a
21 districts, and include funds for streetscape
22 improvement, open street programming, new public
23 events and added staff capacity. Additionally,
24 portions of these increases will be used to sustain
25 or increase current levels of sanitation and public

2 safety programs and services impacting the rising
3 costs related to inflation.

4 The proposed increases vary according to the
5 budget size, district size, and the proposed changes
6 in programs and services. The proposed increases are
7 125th Street from \$1,240,462 to \$1,687,028. DUMBO
8 \$1,250,000 to \$2,500,000. The city's 76 BIDs invest
9 over \$160 million into neighborhood economies in the
10 form of supplemental services and programs that serve
11 nearly 25,000 ground floor businesses across the
12 city. In partnership with the city government BIDs
13 help spur job creation, improve the quality of life
14 for New Yorkers and visitors, enhance the city tax
15 base, and strengthen the local economy.

16 Representatives from each of the BIDs requested an
17 assessment increase our present to answer any
18 questions pertaining to their specific request.
19 However, I'm also happy to answer any questions that
20 the council may have. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Commissioner.
22 We've also been joined by Councilmembers Farias,
23 Restler, Carr, Brooks-Powers, and we have
24 Councilmembers Sanchez and Moya on Zoom.

25 Do we have any questions for the commissioner?

2 Okay, thank you very much.

3 Next we have Lindsey Stewart from DUMBO BID,
4 Jackie Florsheim, DUMBO BID, and Henry Florsheim,
5 DUMBO BID.

6 Okay, whoever wants to go first. So, I don't
7 know if that's on.

8 MS. STEWART: Good morning everyone. My name is
9 Lindsey Stewart. I am a resident and business owner
10 in DUMBO. The DUMBO BID plays an important role for
11 my business, helping us promote, standing by us
12 through the pandemic, holding Zooms with loan
13 specialists, adopting at every turn, keeping people
14 out on the street cleaning when we were the most
15 afraid of everyone's health, and giving people safe
16 events to come together and bring back the people to
17 the neighborhood.

18 Did you know that we have 90 plus small
19 businesses still in DUMBO? Only two or three closed
20 during the pandemic. That is amazing and I credit
21 the work of the BID. We are not out of the woods of
22 recovery. Maybe we never will be. DUMBO is a mixed-
23 use neighborhood, offices and residents, arts and
24 culture, and yes, tourism brings everyone to Brooklyn
25 that helps lift up the whole borough. The hybrid

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 12

2 work model means less customers during the week. It
3 means we need more visitors even more. Trash seems
4 to be increasing with the visitor crowds and we
5 definitely need more resources to keep the
6 neighborhood shining. Having a well-funded BID for
7 the neighborhood that welcomes everyone to Brooklyn
8 is a no brainer. I support Alexandra and her team.

9 MS. FLORSHEIM: Good morning all. I'm Jackie.
10 And Henry and I have been living in DUMBO for over 15
11 years. And one of the things that attracted us to
12 DUMBO was the arts community, many of whom have lived
13 in DUMBO far longer than we have. Really we would
14 call them pioneers. Along with them, we love all of
15 the DUMBO BID's work, whether it's free concerts and
16 art shows in the archway, the Brooklyn Flea, DUMBO
17 Drop to raise money for our local schools, children's
18 activities, and so much more. We definitely support
19 the BID getting the funding it needs to keep things
20 going. As Lindsey said, they kept things going
21 during the pandemic, and we need them more than ever.
22 We love sharing DUMBO, right Henry?

23 MR. FLORSHEIM: Hi, I'm Henry. We love seeing
24 all the tourists from other boroughs, states, and
25 countries. It's a melting pot. It's so good that

2 everyone, not only local residents, can enjoy this
3 special place. DUMBO was planned as a destination
4 with the waterfront walks, ferries, Brooklyn and
5 Manhattan bridges, now a new library, the carousel,
6 and many, many weddings in the park.

7 Visitors to DUMBO keep our local business going.
8 Restaurants like Superfine and shops like Glam and
9 Thea Grant.

10 MS. FLORSHEIM: And we do love giving directions
11 to our visitors to the neighborhood, just as we
12 expect it when we go to other neighborhoods. So we
13 think it's like having the best of New York right in
14 our neighborhood.

15 MR. FLORSHEIM: Our backyard.

16 MS. FLORSHEIM: Yeah. Thank you everyone.

17 MR. FLORSHEIM: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Okay, now we
19 have Daniel Meyer or Meya.

20 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Chair Brannan, may I?
21 Can I say Can I just thank the panelists from... from
22 our community?

23 CHAIR BRANNAN: Yeah, go ahead. I just want to
24 thank the panelists, especially my former teacher,
25 Jackie, for everything that she does. She's the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

14

2 best. So thank you for everything you do and for
3 everything you've done for so many years for people
4 in our community. Thanks Justin.

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Lincoln Restler, this is
6 your life.

7 [LAUGHTER]

8 Okay, we have next up Daniel Meyer or Maya. I'm
9 sorry, I can't read your handwriting, Suzanne Quint,
10 Craig Anthony Miller. You guys here?

11 (BACKGROUND VOICE): Yeah.

12 So Suzanne Quint, Daniel Meyer, and Craig Anthony
13 Miller. And last one, Thea Grant. Come on up.

14 You want to just go left to right? Sure.

15 MS. QUINT: That's fine.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

17 SUZANNE QUINT: Hi, everyone. I'm Suzanne Quint.
18 I'm a DUMBO resident for 10 years. I actually just
19 came off of the Community Board serving there and I'm
20 on the Steering Committee for our new-ish and
21 burgeoning neighborhood, group DUMBO Action
22 Committee.

23 I wanted to just start in response to the
24 gentleman from Small Business Services who said that
25 the BIDs needed to present sort of a detailed five-

2 point plan is what I heard in terms of the increase
3 in expenses, and that's really the nature of my
4 concern. Not that... I'm sure as a business person,
5 there are needs and inflationary expenses that need
6 to be accounted for. But I am very concerned about
7 how this sizable increase is spent. And it wasn't
8 available to me, to see what those... how the money
9 would be spent.

10 So let me just say, I'd like to start just by
11 saying... I want to paint a picture of the
12 neighborhood which may be different than what you
13 see. Those who visit DUMBO, they see tourism, they
14 see the... the tech triangle. But DUMBO is first and
15 foremost today a residential neighborhood. In the
16 last sentence census, we had a 68% increase in
17 residents. It's the second highest increase in
18 residents in all of New York City. And today, there
19 are more residents than office workers in DUMBO, and
20 that really changes the complexion, and the
21 priorities, and the need.

22 The DUMBO BID, which does and has done good work,
23 is a powerhouse. In the years where the residential
24 population was smaller and less organized, they

2 became the de facto voice, not for a street, not for
3 an area, but for the entire neighborhood.

4 With this proposed substantial increase in
5 budget, we do need the residential voice to be heard.
6 With today's budget, the DUMBO BID spends by my
7 calculation 50% on programming and promotion. This
8 is largely for events in our view used to drive more
9 tourism and thus more congestion. And anyone who has
10 spent time in DUMBO on a warm weekend knows how
11 congested it is. We are extremely concerned that
12 more budget equals more programming and promotion,
13 which equals more tourism and more congestion, which
14 is no way has been met with adequate support from
15 city agencies and services.

16 I want to go on record on three things on behalf
17 of residents. Residents are extremely concerned that
18 more dollars to this increase go to programming and
19 promotion, which are done without consultation and
20 sometimes regard for the residents of the
21 neighborhood. Residents would like a substantial
22 portion of the increase to go to things like traffic
23 enforcement in the neighborhood. Residents also ask
24 the DUMBO BID to allocate a few seats on its board...
25 the few seats on this board which are filled by

2 residents to be purely residents. There are two
3 residential representatives on the board today which
4 also have business interests in the neighborhood.
5 And we feel it's important to have the voice of the
6 many, many residents to be heard in some way on the
7 board. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: There's no one on the board
9 right now who's just a resident?

10 MS. QUINT: Just a resident? No. There's the
11 two residential representatives. One is a business
12 owner as well. And one works in commercial real
13 estate and actually was in the most recent ULURP,
14 represented the... the real estate developer.

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Go ahead.

16 MR. MEEK: Hey, good morning. My name is Dan
17 Meek. Nice to meet you all. I've been a seven-year
18 resident in DUMBO. I am here and testimony against
19 the BID increase, primarily sharing Suzanne's
20 concerns around transparency and oversight.

21 Number one, how have the tenants in the building
22 has been notified that there will be an increase. In
23 addition, DUMBO has a unique opportunity that we host
24 a weekly event, that the DUMBO also receives funding
25 for, as well as events throughout the year up to

2 \$20,000 to \$30,000 a year in which they can gather
3 funds.

4 So I have concerns about the transparency and
5 accountability around how they're actually
6 fundraising and how they're spending that
7 fundraising. They also have access to two public
8 spaces in addition to open streets that they do for
9 primarily private programming throughout the year,
10 and unfortunately have not been receptive to
11 residents' concerns. I believe this committee is
12 here to ensure there's accountability and prudent
13 financial decisions. I wouldn't go in front of
14 another board and ask for a million-dollar increase
15 without transparency on how that will be spent when
16 the leader of the executive team is paid over
17 \$200,000 In addition to accumulating funds through
18 private events. So I have concerns and wanted to
19 voice my concerns that there should not be an
20 increase for the BID in DUMBO.

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

22 MS. GRANT: This is the active one. Does it
23 matter which one? Okay. Great. Hi. Good morning.
24 My name is Thea Grant. I represent myself and my
25 business partner. We have a small business in DUMBO.

2 I myself am a native Brooklyn Heights, resident, born
3 and raised, now raising my children here in Brooklyn.
4 We've owned a business in DUMBO since 2007, and have
5 had a retail store since 2017 in DUMBO. DUMBO has
6 experienced a renaissance in my lifetime and has
7 evolved from an abandoned and savage cityscape to a
8 refined, landscaped, manicured, and highly sought
9 after destination both for New York residents and
10 their visitors.

11 DUMBO is a destination. There's no doubt about
12 it. A destination which became a depression era
13 dustbowl during the pandemic, emptying out and losing
14 a majority of its denizens, the tourists, the local
15 daily workforce, anybody on the streets. That was
16 devastating for those of us who were the small
17 businesses, creative businesses, I should have
18 mentioned that we own a jewelry store that carries a
19 variety of antique and vintage curiosities and other
20 small artists are represented there.

21 There was a beacon among the chaos, our local
22 BID, which has always been for us a small but
23 extremely stellar, creative, and productive team,
24 which leads programming of all kinds, both for
25 children, for artists, for visitors, for locals, and

2 has provided platforms and supported the people of
3 the neighborhood, in our... in our opinion, the
4 artists being something that's really important to
5 us, the original pioneers in our neighborhood.

6 DUMBO is historically a Victorian 19th century
7 neighborhood. It has not ever seen the increase of
8 the people, the new residents that are coming in.
9 There is a huge amount of tourism. And we do have
10 concerns having seen this change happen, that those
11 changes be reflected in... in how the neighborhood
12 has been organized and managed. I do believe the BID
13 is the organization for the job. They have shown us
14 that they really do keep in mind all of the interests
15 in the neighborhood. Whenever somebody comes into
16 our store and says, "We're new to the neighborhood,
17 what can you tell us?" We say, "Well, you should
18 really sign up for the BIDs email. You should really
19 take one of their maps. You should really get to
20 know your neighborhood. This is a group that will
21 help you find out what's going, on what opportunities
22 are available, and you can get very involved, or you
23 can just come and see the performances that they
24 helped to put on."

2 All in all, that's what I want to leave you with
3 is that my impression is that the BID brings us all
4 together. It supports and breathes life into the
5 community, which is why we remain in DUMBO and will
6 continue to stay in DUMBO as a small business,
7 because we really believe that what they're doing is
8 supporting all of us. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

10 MR. MILLER: Good morning, everyone. My name is
11 Craig Anthony Miller, and I'm here to speak on behalf
12 of most, if not all the artists that are in DUMBO
13 today. I started in DUMBO so long ago. I have
14 probably been here for 19 years now or something like
15 that. And I have to say that when I first got here,
16 there was not too much going on as far as like, how
17 the artist was getting, by how the artist was
18 surviving. And until the BID has started to, you
19 know, started marketing and keeping the arts within
20 the community, things have gotten so much better. I
21 mean, to be honest, the DUMBO community... the
22 bedrock of the DUMBO community is the art community.
23 This is... This has been the case since the 70s, and
24 so much to the point that the name DUMBO itself was
25 coined by the artists.

2 And you know, yes, the neighborhood has grown, it
3 has gotten to the point where everybody wants to be a
4 part of this community. It is a destination place.
5 We have tourists coming in from everywhere, not just
6 to see a bridge, but to see, you know, the livelihood
7 of this community. And you know, it's one of the
8 things that I was most concerned with was what was
9 going to happen to the creative side, what was going
10 to happen to the artists. And you know, the BID has
11 gone well above and beyond, and making sure that
12 there are programs every single month, that keeps the
13 artists engaged with the community, keeps the small
14 businesses engaged with the artists, and so on.

15 There's not a month that goes by where you won't
16 find something... something happening for the
17 community where everybody can participate. This...
18 This past summer was a big event for us at the 60
19 Collective and you know, Washington Street is
20 probably the hub of where the you know, the tourists
21 come to hang out. And you know, this BID stepped up
22 in so many different ways to make sure that most of
23 those tourists did stick around and support the small
24 communities, the small businesses, and the artists
25 they are so you know, I get the concern of, you know,

2 having too many people there, but I think that most
3 people come to this community because of how popular
4 it is. It's a beautiful space. And I think that the
5 BID is, you know, just doing everything and concerned
6 for everyone in the neighborhood.

7 I say that, you know, there's not enough that
8 they can do like this. I mean the money is
9 important. I think with the increase, we'll be able
10 to manage so many more things and, you know, keep...
11 keep the community relevant to so many other
12 different communities within the neighborhood.
13 Within Brooklyn alone. I'm sorry, I want to I just
14 want to point out just a couple more things.
15 Tourists come to New York City, really, to see the
16 vibrancy of the art programs, okay? Bushwick has
17 been a community that has been very well known for
18 the murals. DUMBO is catching up so fast, we have a
19 small space, but there's not one block that you could
20 walk by and not really be mesmerized by the art in
21 our community. And I think that as long as the
22 artists stay relevant and thriving, I think the
23 community will continue to grow and everybody will
24 have a space there. You know.

2 I just keep going on but I know we don't have too
3 much time. I'm in support to... for the for the
4 budget increase. And I think that with that money,
5 that will be the next 25-30 years of funding and
6 programs, things like Live at Archway, holding
7 classes over the summer for... to teach people
8 workshops, and doing fundraisers for the local
9 schools. The BID is very instrumental in all of this
10 and I appreciate them so much. And I hope you go
11 ahead and allow this increase. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Thank you all.
13 Okay, now we have Land Grant, Cynthia McKnight,
14 Elaine or Eleanor Alpie, and Richard Moore, or Miri?
15 That's it. We've also been joined by Councilmembers
16 Velázquez and Hudson. You can begin if you'd like.

17 Good morning City Council. My name is Cynthia
18 McKnight, President of Community Education Council 13
19 and former PTA president of the Dock Street School in
20 DUMBO, a public title one middle school.

21 It is apropos that I'm speaking this week of
22 Thanksgiving in support of the DUMBO improvement
23 district increase. The Dock Street School opened in
24 September of 2016 with over 90% of the students from
25 very-low-income families. We were a school in a new

2 building without basic equipment such as printing
3 paper, calculators, enrichment programs, and
4 activities for our school-dependent students. The
5 Dock Street School is thankful that the DUMBO
6 improvement district came to our rescue and partnered
7 with us to create the DUMBO Drop and epic Block Party
8 fundraiser that provides much needed funding to the
9 Dock Street School and PS 307, another local title
10 one elementary school.

11 This event also attracted tourists who donated to
12 this fun event. The money allowed us to address the
13 equity issues in black and brown schools. Contrary
14 to what people think, your tax dollars which fund
15 public education are not enough to give our students
16 everything that they need.

17 The Dock Street School is also grateful for the
18 amazing opportunities that the DUMBO improvement
19 district connected us to our students were able to
20 work with talented artists and do art projects with
21 artists who look like them. Our school trips to
22 black-and-woman-owned art studios in DUMBO were very
23 impactful. Words cannot express how thankful to Dock
24 Street School community is to the DUMBO improvement
25 district when in 2020 COVID devastated already

2 vulnerable population. Many of our families did not
3 have food to eat on the weekends when there were no
4 school meals available. Once again the DUMBO
5 improvement district came to our rescue and started a
6 program of organizing the DUMBO community to purchase
7 meals that tremendously helped Dock Street and 307
8 families and the local DUMBO restaurants.

9 I can go on and on about the DUMBO companies that
10 the DUMBO improvement district connected us to that
11 expose our students to technology, design thinking,
12 architecture, et cetera, and I noticed this
13 positively changed the trajectory of our students'
14 lives. This is why I urge you to support the DUMBO
15 improvement increase.

16 I just wanted to share that I see Councilmember
17 Charles Barron. I grew up in East New York Linden
18 Houses, Lincoln Restler, and Councilmember, the work
19 that the DUMBO community... it impacts your area as
20 well. I have personally delivered food and
21 resources, clothing, to churches and schools in your
22 district. And of course, Lincoln Restler is a big
23 supporter, and even in Bed-Stuy, District 13 impacts
24 all the way from Bed-Stuy, all the way to DUMBO, but
25 as I say, we have many people who live in East New

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 27

2 York and Brownsville. And so thank you, and have a
3 Happy Thanksgiving.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. We won't let
5 your friendship with Charles Barron affect the
6 decision to...

7 [LAUGHTER]

8 Please continue.

9 Thank you very much. Good morning, ladies and
10 gentlemen. My name is Land Grant. Trust me, it's
11 true.

12 I'm not really engaged in real estate, except for
13 the real estate of cyberspace. I live in in DUMBO on
14 Washington Street, kind of the core, or the main...
15 main drag of our neighborhood. I've been in the
16 neighborhood for now about 13 years, prior to that 27
17 years in Brooklyn Heights. So I know this area very,
18 very well. On top of that, I've done a number of
19 projects for... for the... the various economic
20 development organizations of our fair borough of...
21 DUMBO, I'm sorry, of Brooklyn. I'll try it one more
22 time. Of well, let's just say Brooklyn. As a
23 result, such programs as... as DUMBO, or rather,
24 Brooklyn Goes Global is a program that I helped start
25 some now 30 years ago. And it's lasted at least 20

2 years, and probably is still going. I come from the
3 world of tech via Apple, which is a company I've
4 worked for the last five years. I'm not here to
5 represent them. But I am here to state that tech is
6 a major factor in the world of Brooklyn, specifically
7 the tech triangle, which... of which our BID is a
8 member. So I speak to the biggest success in the
9 local area, which is a company that started the world
10 of 3D printing on a on a scale for individuals. That
11 was MakerBot, which is just up the hill in downtown
12 Brooklyn. And I think that that's an example of a
13 fabulous tech building block that we could do more
14 of in the BID, and I think that's, that's an area
15 that needs additional support. And the funds that
16 are that are available to the BID, I think we'll find
17 some usage in that area as well.

18 I work directly with people who come to the city
19 in terms of destination interests. I'm a sales
20 specialist in the in the Oculus, two blocks south of
21 here, in the World Trade Center. And we see a great
22 number of individuals from all over the world coming
23 to New York. My... my interface with them has to do
24 with telling them about not just our products, but
25 what the world of New York is all about. They're

2 often looking for destinations, and the one they
3 already know about is DUMBO. They tell me about
4 DUMBO. And I try my best to reinforce how important
5 DUMBO is. I actually commute by foot over the
6 Brooklyn Bridge both directions every day, to get to
7 my job. And that's one of the places where tourists
8 are going. I would say 50% of what we see at my...
9 my local business, if you can call Apple local, is
10 tourism. Much of it is national tourism, but a lot
11 of it is international tourism. So we're introducing
12 Brooklyn and... and the DUMBO residents to a whole
13 new type of influence, all of which speaks well
14 for... for our city and for our local neighborhood.

15 So I think that there are various ways to
16 increase what we're already about. Destination is
17 the name of the game. People are eager to be
18 involved in things that are vibrant, alive, and looks
19 like everybody is having a good time. And generally
20 speaking, when you come to DUMBO, you do have a good
21 time.

22 So I'm very much in favor of our BID. Thank you
23 and what they're about. Thank you.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. We still have
3 folks on Zoom who are going to testify so we got to
4 keep everyone to a two minute clock. Go ahead.

5 MR. MOORE: Good morning. I think it is... yes
6 it is still morning. Good morning. I feel like
7 Methuselah here. I've lived in worked in DUMBO for
8 50 years. I was one of the actually the first person
9 to have a loft there. And a business. I had a
10 factory on Pearl Street, in which I designed and
11 manufactured my own furniture, distributed to the
12 major department stores, Macy's, Gimbels,
13 Bloomingdale's, and Gilchrist you name it, I was
14 selling my products, as well as having my own retail
15 stores throughout New York City. I went from there
16 to other things, but basically, I've been in DUMBO, I
17 helped named DUMBO, at the meeting when we had our...
18 the BLT... the Brooklyn Loft Tenants Group -- that's
19 what we call ourselves -- and things have changed in
20 50 years. I'll tell you, it's gotten... it's gotten
21 really, really dynamic.

22 Yes, there's an art community, the art community
23 developed DUMBO, there's no doubt about that. In the
24 70s, we had open studios where I think the New York
25 Times recorded one year we had over 100,000 visitors

2 came to walk through DUMBO before residents... before
3 they were people. These are just artists who taken
4 over loft spaces like myself. Thank goodness, I was
5 able to buy my space. I've been in the same space
6 for 50 years, and it looks like it, as some people
7 can contest. My art work has been published around
8 the world. I've done sculptures of furniture using
9 various different things. The New York Times The
10 London Times, Japanese magazines and design... all
11 out of DUMBO. This all comes out of DUMBO. This is
12 where I work. This is where I live. So it's a
13 special place for me especially. What else can I say
14 other than right now in terms of my credentials, I am
15 the community partner for the 84 precinct for Sector
16 B which is our boy, which is DUMBO Farragut housing,
17 oh, Fulton Street. I'm also the PBBM's community
18 representative for Brooklyn Bridge Park. I also am
19 the captain for the stewardship programs for the
20 parks department. I prune all the trees in DUMBO and
21 North heights, Vinegar Hill, and Farragut housing on
22 the street trees. I'm the guy who goes around
23 pruning them. What else? There's so many other
24 things that I do. But let's just start there. I
25 have to say I support the BID very strongly. It's

2 been years. I mean, what they what they started out,
3 it's a struggle figuring out what was right and what
4 was wrong. Everyone makes mistakes. They have
5 corrected their mistakes. I think what Suzanne said
6 about having more representation of people who are in
7 the community that lived there, the residents is
8 essential, because there are complaints that are
9 justifiable. And again, when they're made, the BID
10 works very hard to correct those mistakes, which
11 is... which is what it's all about. I am a
12 businessman who was the president of the Fulton Ferry
13 Business Association. I went around and spoke to
14 many of the businesses now. They're still 30% below
15 pre pandemic levels. So they're struggling. They
16 all support the BID, most of them at least 99% of
17 them do, in terms of the foot traffic.

18 We have to be honest, also, the tourists come to
19 DUMBO for one reason. And that's this. [MR. MOORE
20 stands up and shows DUMBO bridge shirt under jacket]
21 This is what they want to see. This is where they
22 are. This is why the tourists come to DUMBO. And
23 the businesses have to keep them there. That's their
24 objective. And the BID helps in keeping those people

2 there by having there certain activities, which is
3 important and it works.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

5 MR. MOORE: So I don't want to keep going on and
6 on. But basically I do support the BID. I think
7 what they've done during the pandemic was monumental,
8 and what they're continuing to do is important. And
9 so I hope that their... their proposal is accepted.
10 Thank... thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: One moment. Okay. Go
12 ahead. You have two minutes.

13 MS. ALPER: We should have given... I'm Eleanor
14 Alper, as my legal name, my married name. I am
15 Eleanor Kopenko, as an artist. If you've been to
16 DUMBO, you may have seen my... my fun seats, the
17 benches. They're not all there now because of the
18 pandemic. They've had to make room for the food
19 sheds.

20 Anyway, I support DUMBO because for many, many
21 years, before my husband passed away, I lived in the
22 West Village at 2 Fifth Avenue, right on the arch a
23 tourist destination food people from all over the
24 world. I like to live with other people want to go.
25 As an artist I want to experience other cultures and

2 I know other cultures want to come here. DUMBO is an
3 amazing destination and it's... but I want to speak
4 mainly about being a grandmother and the joy it gives
5 me to go to see all of the events that are under the
6 archway, to see every Thursday night in summer 50 or
7 60 toddlers dancing to the bands, people getting
8 together to just be neighbors. DUMBO is a community
9 of families. And I think the BID has done more to
10 keep us that way. And if there's any time left, you
11 should hear more from Richard.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Okay, now we
13 have Magdalena Levy? Thank you all. Magdalena, you
14 have two minutes.

15 MS. LEVY: Thank you. Well, this is not very
16 easy for me. But I'm going to be quick. I'm here as
17 a restaurant, and as a small business owner, I have
18 been very vocal regarding traffic chaos in DUMBO.
19 And it's... it's a big problem. And it's definitely
20 a big problem for my business. I have a flower shop.
21 And it's just not working for me. I just feel that
22 the... the program, the grant program, Open Streets,
23 works great in other, bigger neighborhoods, but not
24 in DUMBO. It seems like the current situation right
25 now, more than... it's given more importance to

2 tourists than to the needs of residents. And I feel
3 that the BID doesn't really listen to the needs of
4 residence. So I'm talking here as a resident and as
5 a business owner.

6 And again, my... my big concern is that the more
7 budget, the more programming will be created, and
8 we'll lure more people in, more traffic, and more
9 chaos. For us, in order to deliver flowers, even
10 four or five blocks in the neighborhood, can take
11 easily 40 minutes. And this is basically a result of
12 having a Main Street closed in DUMBO, Washington
13 Street, which is organized by DUMBO BID, and by the
14 Department of Transportation.

15 I just don't understand why Washington Street has
16 to be controlled by DUMBO BID, when they also have
17 control of the Arch, and soon they will have control
18 of Anchorage Street. So I just hope that once
19 Anchorage Street is open, why can we have Washington
20 Street back? And basically, that's it. I mean,
21 my... my main concern is that I just want traffic to
22 just be less chaotic for my business. Otherwise, I
23 will... I will have to move. If this coming summer,
24 things continue the way they are, I will have to move
25 my flower shop out of DUMBO. That's it. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Now we have
3 Michael Iannaco.

4 MR. IANNACO: Good morning. Thank you all. As
5 an employee of a company who is based on 55,
6 Washington Street, an architecture office, we have
7 more than 180 employees there. And I think for us
8 having Washington Street closed down, and all of the
9 facilities and all the cultural events that have been
10 offered, especially during the pandemic has been
11 really appreciated from our workforce. I think it's
12 not only you know, having the possibility to bike to
13 work and to be able to avoid the car traffic and, and
14 the overall vehicular traffic, but also being able
15 to... to provide those one on one spaces outside the
16 office within the city to get to know not only our
17 co-workers, but also getting to know their local
18 residents, the local business owners and other
19 people, tourists who are there in the region. So I
20 think we've seen a lot of great value and not only
21 supporting our office, but we also try and give back
22 to the community as well. Several times a week we
23 order lunch for our employees. And very often we'll
24 go to local locally-owned businesses for that, you
25 know, for that purpose, because we want them to be

2 involved within the local community of DUMBO. So not
3 only do I work there, but I'm also a resident nearby.
4 So I just don't go there during the week. But I also
5 try and go there during the weekends when there are
6 all there are these events that BID supports and BID
7 offers which I have come to really enjoy during my...
8 my years. And I know my co-workers have as well.

9 I think we're in a very unique position in DUMBO
10 because of the Brooklyn Bridge Park, because of the
11 connections, and because of all of the events that
12 BID has, you know, proposed, and hopefully will
13 continue to propose in the future.

14 So clearly, I... I'm... I'm a supporter of... of
15 the expanding budget for the for the BID. And I just
16 want to say, you know, I think whenever someone goes
17 to DUMBO, they immediately understand the importance
18 of the public realm, the importance of the connection
19 with the surrounding neighborhoods, and it's not just
20 a tourist area, but it's I think gets much more than
21 that. And I think as a business, we hope that we're
22 adding to that through our employees involvement
23 within the local community, but also integrating
24 within the within the neighbors there as well. Thank
25 you for your time.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Now we have
3 Marilyn Donini.

4 MS. DONINI: Thank you. Thank you and good
5 morning. I'm here to, to speak in support of the
6 BID. My name is Marilynn Donini and I work at St.
7 Ann's Warehouse. St. Ann's is a nonprofit theater
8 located at 45 Water Street in DUMBO. Since 2001, St.
9 Anne's has been in DUMBO, where we've transformed
10 three different industrial spaces into theatrical
11 venues, first at 38 Water than at 29 Jay. And now we
12 reside in the Tobacco Warehouse in Brooklyn Bridge
13 Park, where we've been since 2015, and where we have
14 now a permanent home, which was partly built with
15 support from the city. So thank you, city.

16 So I must say that the BID has been a very good
17 partner for St. Ann's. We... They've really helped
18 us a lot. When we first came to DUMBO, it was very
19 hard to build an audience down there. We have 50,000
20 people now who come to St. Anne's in a year. In the
21 early days, we had, we had very small audiences, and
22 people were really afraid to come in there. The
23 streets were really lonely at night. It was very
24 dark. And it was really like kind of like a daunting
25 experience for those who are coming from Manhattan

2 and other parts of Brooklyn. When we came to DUMBO,
3 the neighborhood was just getting going. And... but
4 we saw that there was like gigantic potential there.
5 And I think a lot of that... a lot of the growth has
6 had to do with the support of the BID and the way
7 that they've helped nonprofits and for-profit
8 organizations like St. Ann's. There was like
9 incredible features in DUMBO. There are cobblestone
10 streets. There is great history, there is gorgeous
11 architecture. And there's an amazing Waterfront
12 Park, which has become an incredible destination for
13 everybody. And St. Ann's, in the last two years...
14 or say, the last two and a half years since the
15 pandemic, has been able to use the park for
16 programming, which has been an incredible benefit for
17 our... for our audience and for the community.

18 Anyway, so onward. Since there was tremendous
19 growth in... in DUMBO, it's now become an incredible
20 destination for New Yorkers and visitors alike. And,
21 and I think that this... a lot of this growth is due
22 to the BID because of what they provide. They
23 provide safety, they provide cleanliness, they
24 provide activities, and they provide marketing for
25 organizations to be able to promote their work.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Marilyn. Thank
3 you.

4 MS. DONINI: Okay, so anyway, so I'm in favor of
5 the BID and thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Okay, now we
7 have a testimony from some folks on Zoom. Mallory
8 Kazdan, Marcia Hillis, and Elisa Thomas

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Mallory, are you there?

11 MS. KASDAN: I'm trying. It's not letting me go
12 on to video. Can I do audio only?

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: That's fine. Go ahead.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

15 MS. KASDAN: Hi. Okay. Hi. My name is Mallory
16 Kasdan. I am the founder of the DUMBO Action
17 Committee. Dan and Suzanne also spoke. I've been in
18 Danville for 19 years, I came when, yes, there were
19 very few people down here. There was a lot of
20 wonderful artists doing wonderful work, which I am a
21 writer, and I support that and always wanted to be
22 around creative people, which is part of the reason
23 my husband and I moved here. We started a family
24 here. We send our kids to local public schools. And
25 I've been pretty active in the community, mostly

2 involving traffic and safety, which has been a
3 problem down here for quite a long time. It's one of
4 the motivators that led me to start the DUMBO Action
5 Committee.

6 As the Double Action Committee, I've worked
7 alongside of the BID quite well for many years. And
8 I do support a lot of what they have done for the
9 community. However, I think we're dealing with an
10 entirely different neighborhood, obviously, than we
11 had when I moved here in 2003. And as a... as a
12 spokesperson, I guess for residents since I have a
13 resident organization that represents 800 people, I
14 would just like to say, you know, the BID does do
15 good work, but we really need them to step up with
16 this additional funding to enforce some of the chaos
17 I think the Magdalena was referring to as a result of
18 all the programming that they do.

19 While the programming may be great for office
20 workers and people that come in on the weekends. For
21 residents. It's really a nightmare, and we really
22 need someone to acknowledge the reality of that. I
23 mean, all these people testifying, they're wonderful
24 DUMBO is wonderful. Yes, I could find a lot of
25 residents to also say DUMBO is a wonderful community.

2 I was here during the pandemic, I supported local
3 businesses. I spent a lot of time advocating on
4 behalf of this community. And I just want to make
5 sure that residents are actually heard in this
6 process. It just doesn't seem right. The residents
7 are saying we need more accountability. And the BID
8 is not answering to that. And certainly the
9 accountability and transparency of knowing where this
10 money is going to go. So I would like to go on
11 record saying, we really would like to see some of
12 this money going to enforcement of tourists, both
13 cars and people, more sanitation, and less
14 programming, because residents I don't think use the
15 programming nearly as much as some of the other
16 speakers here have intimated. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you Mallory. Marcia
18 Hillis.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

20 MS. HILLIS: Hi, so I'm Zooming in from my phone.
21 I have been a DUMBO residents and artist here since
22 1989, and I'm just here to speak... to reiterate what
23 Mallory said about transparency for the funding.

24 Personally, I would like to see money going
25 towards taking care of our street trees, as somebody

2 who was one of the first people to work with the
3 parks department to get trees planted in this
4 neighborhood. Our trees are not very well taken care
5 of. More programming is not what our community
6 needs. We do have vibrant programming that's
7 provided by the BID. However, it does tip the
8 balance. It's... it's also keeping small businesses
9 away from the neighborhood. I've spoken to small
10 business owners who discounted opening their
11 businesses in DUMBO because they said, "Oh, that's
12 just where tourists go." So there needs to be a
13 balance. There does... We do need to have
14 residential... purely residential membership and
15 representation on the board. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Marsha. Now we
17 have a Lisa Thomas.

18 MS. THOMAS: Hi, It's Eliza. I echo Mallory,
19 Marsha. I think before David, and who else spoke?...
20 But as a resident... strictly as a resident who has
21 lived here for a dozen years, there has been no
22 accountability or transparency as to where this money
23 is going. I have deep concerns with the congestion,
24 the traffic, the sanitation, the subway, the
25 infrastructure doesn't support the actual residents

2 as it is, and adding even more tourists in without
3 acknowledgement is really disconcerting.

4 The fact that there isn't any purely residential
5 representation is also very disconcerting, especially
6 when you know the only people here who have actually
7 spoken with numbers or people from the residents
8 saying that, you know, there's a 68% increase in
9 residents. No one's speaking within facts. It's all
10 very emotional. Because we love our neighborhood.
11 We love our artists. That's why many of us came,
12 moved here, bought property here. So that...
13 Putting that aside, though, factually, there's never
14 been any kind of accountability for how this has
15 actually grown business. Like what percentage? At
16 what dollar? For all of these people that we're
17 bringing in and congesting and making the quality of
18 life for residents here really difficult. We're
19 already under so much stress, just with the
20 construction alone, the dust, the noise, the idea
21 that many of us have had to you know, work from home
22 because of the pandemic, having our water shut off
23 during the day is not fun. We're dealing with a lot
24 of that stress on top of now saying, let's add more

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

45

2 money, more programming, etc. When we really haven't
3 gotten our, our stuff kind of organized as it is.

4 So while I appreciate the BID very, very much, I
5 appreciate many of the people who have testified
6 here, I don't think that this is a matter of being
7 pro or anti-BID. It's about having a voice as a
8 resident, and having that transparency. That's a lot
9 of money to ask for without any kind of breakdown for
10 where it's going and why. And there's been no
11 acknowledgement thus far on the safety and... of us
12 just walking in the sidewalk. It's kind of... I
13 don't feel like people are really appreciating the...
14 the neighborhood as it is not as the luster that we
15 want it to be and where it can be.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNON: Thank you, Eliza.

17 MS. THOMAS: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNON: Okay. Now we're going to
19 call the inimitable Billy Martin to call the roll.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Good morning, William Martin,
21 Committee Clerk. Roll call vote Committee on
22 Finance. All items are coupled. Chair Brannan.

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I vote aye.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ayala?

25 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: I vote aye.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

46

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Moya?

3 COUNCILMEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. Powers?

5 COUNCILMEMBER POWERS: I vote aye.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Louis?

7 COUNCILMEMBER LOUIS: Aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Brooks-Powers?

9 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Aye.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron?

11 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: I need to explain my vote.

12 First, Mr. Chair, this is just for the BIDs, or is it
13 for that property tax exemption too?

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: This is everything.

15 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: This is everything. Okay,

16 first I'm voting no on the property tax exemption.

17 Those are already in existence. It is not affordable

18 at all. That is 207 units that are 95% to 115% of

19 the AMI, and only 37 units are so-called affordable.

20 So I'm voting no on that. I know what that means,

21 in tax exemption, that it was going to get

22 foreclosures, and all of that, but a project like

23 that needs to be much more affordable. So that's a

24 no.

25

2 I'm really mixed. I have mixed feelings about
3 this BID here. While, my sister mentioned my name,
4 that doesn't mean to get the vote right away, but
5 thank you very much. And I do believe in you, and
6 your program. And I do believe that it should
7 definitely be funded. And so to my artists...
8 brother as well.

9 But I am concerned about what I'm hearing, you
10 know, from the community. And I don't think that's a
11 tall ask to say to be transparent. I don't think
12 it's difficult to ask for transparency. So if... It
13 is going to pass. I know that. But at least we
14 should pass it with the conditions... with the
15 concerns of those who say we want transparency, more
16 residential involvement. So if we could at least do
17 that. I think that should be heard, just because
18 it's one, or two, or three people speaking against a
19 project doesn't mean it's something that we should
20 just rubber stamp and let it go forward without
21 taking that into consideration.

22 So I'm not going to vote against it. But I am
23 going to offer critical support that the voice voices
24 of the unheard be heard, and that we do something Mr.
25 Chair, if you could write a letter or something to

2 the BID and say that we would like to see the
3 transparency, be real, and we would like to see more
4 residential involvement. But with that, I vote aye
5 on all.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Brewer?

7 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: I vote aye. I do want to
8 congratulate Barbara Askins, who is the head of the
9 125th Street BID, who's been a friend for a long time
10 and who's doing some very innovative policy on the
11 125th Street BID, but needs extra funding to make
12 them more effective. I vote aye and congratulate
13 her. Thank you.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Farias?

15 COUNCILMEMBER FARIAS: I'd like to first disclose
16 that, in this vote, my sibling attends Castle Hill
17 Middle School, and my parent is an employee at NYU
18 Langone. And I vote aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Hanks?

20 COUNCILMEMBER HANKS: Aye on all.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Hudson?

22 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: I vote aye on all. And I
23 would like to disclose on the record that my domestic
24 partner is employed by Planned Parenthood Federation
25 of America. Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

49

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kagan?

3 COUNCILMEMBER KAGAN: I would like to disclose
4 that my daughter is a CUNY college student for
5 transparency resolution. Also, like after listening
6 to all of these testimonies, I decided to abstain on
7 the DUMBO increase. And I vote aye on everything
8 else.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Councilmember Barron.

10 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: I just want to disclose
11 that my son works for Brick Brooklyn, as a camera
12 guy. Just so it is on the record.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ossé?

14 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: Permission to quickly
15 explain my vote.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yes.

17 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: I just wanted to thank...
18 Craig... right?, for your testimony and the work that
19 you do as an artist and also acknowledging how all
20 these people moved to Brooklyn in New York City
21 because of the art... the artists that existed most
22 especially in Brooklyn, so that's uh, your... your
23 you know, support for the BID. I vote aye on all,
24 and especially the DUMBO. But thank you for your
25 testimony.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

50

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Sanchez?

3 COUNCILMEMBER SANCHEZ: I'd like to disclose on
4 the record that my sibling works at CUNY MCC, and I
5 vote aye on all.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. Velázquez?

7 COUNCILMEMBER VELÁZQUEZ: I'd like to disclose on
8 the record, my brother is part of Samaritan... on the
9 board of Samaritans, and my husband is at DEP, and I
10 vote aye on all.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Won?

12 CHAIRPERSON WON: Aye on all.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Carr?

14 COUNCILMEMBER CARR: I'd like to disclose on the
15 record that my spouse is a student at CUNY, and we
16 are funding CUNY in the Transparency Resolution, and
17 I vote aye on all.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. Result of tallies
19 for the Committee on Finance. We have Introduction
20 789, adopted by the Committee with 16 in the
21 affirmative, zero in the negative, and one
22 abstention. Pre-considered Resolution adopted by the
23 Committee, 17 in the affirmative, zero in the
24 negative, no abstentions. Land Use Item 147 adopted
25 by the committee with 16 in the affirmative, 1 in the

2 negative, and no abstentions. That is a full
3 committee, Mr. Chair.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Billy. I want
5 to give any members who still haven't given
6 disclosure so... Selvena?

7 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: I just want to
8 disclose that I'm a member of the Greater Allen AME
9 Cathedral, and we are voting to fund one of the
10 community based programming.

11 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Good okay with that, this
12 meeting is adjourned. Thank you, everybody.

13 [GAVEL]

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date 11/26/2022