

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE  
ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 1

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION  
JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC  
DEVELOPMENT

----- X

October 20, 2022  
Start: 1:13 p.m.  
Recess: 3:55 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Eric Dinowitz, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Amanda Farías, Chairperson  
Charles Barron  
Gale A. Brewer  
Oswald Feliz  
Alexa Aviles  
Jennifer Gutiérrez  
Ari Kagan  
Kevin C. Riley  
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.  
Nantasha M. Williams

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Lauren Anderson, City University of New York  
University Associate Provost for Careers and  
Industry Partnerships

Kenneth Adams, President of LaGuardia Community  
College

Dr. Jane MacKillop, PhD, City University of New  
York Dean of School of Continuing Education and  
Professional Studies at Lehman College

Dwana Franklin-Davis, CEO Reboot Representation

Siobahn Cavanaugh, Career Exploration Program  
Manager at MediaMKRS

John Williams, Cofounder and CEO of Reel Works

Priscilla Trieu, senior at Queens College

Chouaib Fadili, student at Kingsborough Community  
College

Gerarda Shields, Dean of the School of Technology  
and Design at City Tech

Eli Dvorkin, Center for an Urban Future

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE  
ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 3

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good afternoon and  
welcome to today's New York Council hearing for the  
Committee on Economic Development and Higher  
Education.

If you wish to submit testimony, you may  
at [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov).

At this time, please silence all  
electronic devices.

Thank you for your cooperation. Chair, we  
are ready to begin.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Good afternoon,  
everybody. I am Council Member Eric Dinowitz, Chair  
of the Higher Education Committee. [GAVEL]

Welcome to our joint hearing with the  
Committee on Economic Development Chaired by Council  
Member Amanda Farías. While today's oversight hearing  
is entitled Workforce Development Opportunities at  
CUNY, it's clear that any opportunities at the City  
University of New York, or CUNY, are set within the  
larger context of workforce development here in New  
York City so we are fortunate to have the Committee  
on Economic Development here with us to discuss that  
broader context, and I want to thank Chair Farías for

joining us today and for working together with the  
Committee on Higher Education.

Let me begin with a focus on CUNY. Last  
month, I was honored to be a member of a panel put  
together by the Center for an Urban Future for a  
policy symposium on harnessing CUNY as a launchpad  
into tech careers. The thumbnail description of the  
symposium referred to CUNY's enormous but still  
largely untapped potential to serve as a launchpad  
for New Yorkers of color into well-paying tech  
careers. As it turned out, many of the remarks that  
were made at the symposium were actually applicable  
to many New Yorkers and to careers in many other  
sectors of the economy as well. I want to thank Abby  
Jo Sigal of the Mayor's Office of Talent and  
Workforce Development for inadvertently writing most  
of the opening statement. It's not plagiarism if you  
cite your sources so I'm citing her. She was one of  
the outstanding speakers on the panel which also  
included CUNY Chancellor Matos Rodriguez. I learned a  
lot from them, and I proudly say that as a lifelong  
learner, which is something I think we all should be.  
At one point, Executive Director Sigal said something  
that went something like this, what does it take to

put career success as a priority of students, what happens when we shift the goal to not being degree completion but really thinking through career success earning power of students, what we're talking about here is not marginal shifts if we want to make that change. Many of us in the room know the research that, given where today's economy is, most jobs, certainly those that are fulfilling economic secure jobs require an employer valued post-secondary credential, and she cited that number at 85 percent of higher. She continued, it won't just be government, it won't just be employers because in order to make the change we have to do it together. We can't people into good jobs unless the employers are very much at the table, and we can't leave CUNY out of the picture. CUNY serves too many people, and it's too great a resource, and we can't do it unless government prioritizes this change as our economic development strategy. Talent is our biggest asset. We have to invest in it.

Importantly, it reminded me about some of the work that we're doing in this Committee, some of the work that we've highlighted recognizing CUNY not in a bubble, not in a silo, but in the broader

context of what it brings to our city, how we have to work with our institutions before, during, and after CUNY to provide success for our students. It reminds me of the legislative mission of CUNY, which is to be a vehicle for upward mobility for the disadvantaged in New York City.

Toward the end of the symposium, she commented we have this mindset that you go to school for the first 20 or 25 years of your life and then you go to work for the next 50, or if you're lucky 30, years of your life. That's not really reflective of the labor market now which is rapidly changing. We should be shifting from that linear model to a more braided model where you're working and learning, beginning in high school and having it be lifelong, and we need to make sure our educational institutions and our employers are set up for that braided learning model. We can't do that without CUNY. That's why the work that CUNY is doing and having people come back, really figure out how CUNY is that lifelong partner for New Yorkers, is going to be critical, and you can be sure the Chancellor responded immediately that CUNY School of Professional Studies which was created to serve adult

learners can and should be at the center of Executive  
Director Sigal's braided model.

We look forward this afternoon to hearing  
more about CUNY's programs that are meeting both the  
workforce development needs of our city and the  
education demands of our traditional and adult  
students, to understand in the larger economic  
development context that we New Yorkers find  
ourselves in to thinking about what the goal for  
economic development in our city should be and to  
discovering where the gaps are that need to be  
filled.

I want to acknowledge my Colleagues on  
Higher Education Committee who are present, Council  
Member Charles Barron, Council Member Gale Brewer,  
Adjunct Professor, Council Member Oswald Feliz,  
Adjunct Professor at CUNY.

I'd also like to thank Adam Staropoli, my  
Director of Legislation, Jenna Klaus, my Chief of  
Staff, Chloe Rivera, Committee Senior Policy Analyst  
who is transitioning off the Committee,  
heartbreaking, Regina Paul, Committee's Policy  
Analyst, and Nia Hyatt, the Committee's Senior  
Finance Analyst.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE  
ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 8

I would now like to invite Chair Fariás to give her opening statement after which I will swear in our witnesses.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you so much, Chair Dinowitz, and thank you to the Members of both Committees for coming together to hold this joint hearing.

My name is Amanda Fariás, and I have the privilege of Chairing the Economic Development Committee. We're joined today by Council Members, I was going to announce everyone, but Committee Members Rafael Salamanca and PhD student Nantasha Williams, and Council Members Brewer and Barron and Feliz who have joined us.

While the Economic Development Committee regularly holds hearings on the City's workforce development systems, today's hearing marks the first opportunity to this Committee to discuss CUNY's specific role in workforce development. We on the Committee look forward to hearing testimony today from CUNY regarding its integration with industries throughout the city, evaluate CUNY's various apprenticeship programs, and understand how CUNY fits into the city's larger workforce development toolbox.



COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE  
ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 9

In particular, we would like to know how CUNY's job training courses are adapting to the new realities of work such as college for all versus prepping graduates for career readiness, streamlined job processes to connect graduates from accredited courses, bridge programs within our institutions, and what efforts CUNY is making to push its graduates towards meaningful, life-sustaining careers.

CUNY and the city's Economic Development Corporation launched a partnership for green workforce programs last month to train college students for careers in clean energy. The Committee is also interested in hearing more details about that partnership and what role, if any, the Council can play in seeing that initiative bear fruit.

Additionally, we look forward to hearing from CUNY on their experiences with the Mayor's Office of Workforce Development today on its efforts to coordinate the city's workforce development efforts by coordinating and improving the city's many workforce development programs, lots of workforce and development in that sentence, and if those have directly impacted the work occurring on our CUNY campuses. In 2020, the Office of Workforce

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE  
ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 10

Development updated its work within the five industry partnerships contained in its Career Pathways Plan, healthcare, technology, construction, food and beverage, and industrial manufacturing. Each of these industry partnership working groups developed its own to combat unemployment during the pandemic, and we would like to discuss how those have performed today as well.

The Committees hope to hear from CUNY and the Office of Workforce Development about the progress that has been made in adapting to assist the city's economy emerge from the pandemic, how the new administration is focusing on its efforts towards improving the city's workforce development infrastructure, and what, if anything, the Council can do in its legislative capacity to assist in those efforts. The focus of this hearing will be able to check in on how CUNY's initiatives have progressed in the wake of the COVID-19 pandemic and what plans lie ahead for the city's various workforce development programs.

Before I turn it over to CUNY, I'd like to just take a moment to thank the staff on the Economic Development Committee, Senior Counsel Alex

Paulenoff, Senior Policy Analyst William Hongach, and  
Financial Analyst Glenn Martinelli for all their hard  
work in putting this hearing together. I'd also like  
to thank my Legislative Director Rebecca Nieves for  
all of her work.

With that said, I will now turn the floor  
over to my Colleague and the administration.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you, Chair  
Fariás, for your opening statement.

I'd like to remind everyone who wishes to  
testify in person today that you must fill out a  
witness slip. It looks like this. It's located on the  
desk of the Sergeant-at-Arms near the entrance of the  
room. Please fill out the slip even if you have  
already registered in advance that you will be  
testifying in person today.

To allow as many people to testify as  
possible, testimony will be limited to three minutes  
per person whether you are testifying in person or on  
Zoom.

I'm also going to ask my Colleagues to  
limit their questions and comments to five minutes.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE  
ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 12

Please note that witnesses who are here  
in person will testify before those who are signed  
into the Zoom webinar.

I'd like to recognize our first panel and  
then swear them in. Lauren Anderson from CUNY  
University Associate Provost for Careers and Industry  
Partnerships, Kenneth Adams, President of LaGuardia  
Community College, and Dr. Jane MacKillop, PhD, CUNY  
Dean of School of Continuing Education and  
Professional Studies at Lehman College.

In accordance with the rules of the  
Council, I will first administer the affirmation to  
witnesses from the City University of New York who  
will make up the first panel. Please raise your right  
hand.

Do you affirm to tell the truth, the  
whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your  
testimony before this Committee and to respond  
honestly to Council Member questions?

ADMINISTRATION: (INAUDIBLE)

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you. As a  
reminder to all of our witnesses, please state your  
name prior to your testimony for the record. The  
floor is yours.

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Lauren  
Anderson, University Associate Provost for Careers  
and Industry Partnerships at the City University of  
New York.

Good Afternoon, Honorable Chairs Dinowitz  
and Farías and Members of the City Council Committees  
on Higher Education and Economic Development. Thank  
you for the invitation to speak today on workforce  
development at The City University of New York.

My name is Lauren Andersen, and I have  
the honor of serving as the University Associate  
Provost for Careers and Industry Partnerships and  
Chief Workforce Officer at CUNY. In this capacity, I  
oversee a newly restructured office, the Office of  
Careers and Industry Partnerships, that was recently  
elevated to report directly to the Chancellor as well  
as to the University Provost.

I am joined today on the panel by my  
esteemed colleagues Ken Adams, President of LaGuardia  
Community College, and Jane MacKillop, Dean of the  
School of Continuing and Professional Studies at  
Lehman College. We look forward to sharing an  
overview of the work underway at CUNY to support a

thriving and inclusive workforce in New York City and  
to answer any questions that you may have.

The CUNY Office of Careers & Industry  
Partnerships has two goals. The first is to ensure  
that more graduates of CUNY's degree and non-degree  
programs can successfully launch and advance in  
careers of their choosing more quickly and at  
competitive salaries. The second is that NYC  
businesses and organizations can find the talent,  
expertise, and services they need to grow and create  
more job opportunities for New Yorkers.

The elevation of this office to sit  
within the Chancellor's Cabinet is a reflection of  
the role that CUNY plays as a leading engine of  
inclusive economic recovery in New York City.

New York's recovery must be equitable. It  
has to lift all New Yorkers, particularly communities  
of color and residents who were underrepresented in  
careers long before the pandemic. No other  
institution is better positioned to lift up all New  
Yorkers than CUNY.

Advancing economic mobility, as the Chair  
referenced, is in our DNA. It was instilled 175 years  
ago with the founding of CUNY's progenitor, a school

called the Free Academy. The Free Academy was created to educate and provide access, equity, and opportunity to people from families of modest backgrounds and qualify them for usefulness hereafter.

Through decades and generations, CUNY has shaped and transformed the city's professional and middle class. It has gained a national reputation for propelling more graduates up the economic ladder than all Ivys, Stanford, Carnegie Mellon, and MIT combined, and now CUNY is committed to transforming itself into the higher education system our city needs today and in the decades to come.

Central to this transformation is ensuring that even more CUNY students have the exposure, preparation, experience, and connections needed to fuel an inclusive and thriving workforce.

As members of your two Committees know well, there is no silver bullet to transforming talent pipelines across this city. Together, CUNY is working with public, private, and non-profit sector partners to advance a constellation of big, ambitious aspirations that aim to transform the way we do

business at our core, not just around the margins  
where it is easy.

Before diving into these ambitious  
initiatives, it's worth sharing the four key  
principles that drive CUNY's approach to workforce  
development: equity, partnership, sustainability, and  
modernization.

First, when it comes to equity, CUNY is  
committed to meeting New Yorkers where they are.  
CUNY's 25 campuses support 2,806 academic or for-  
credit programs. This includes 670 programs in STEM  
fields which constitute many of the critical sectors  
of the City's economy. Over the past five years,  
CUNY has deliberately invested in growing the  
number of degrees awarded in these areas as the  
Chair alluded to. For example, CUNY has  
successfully doubled the number of TECH bachelors  
degrees awarded, and we did that one year ahead of  
our five-year goal.

Additionally, CUNY serves over 160,000  
students through non-credit-bearing programs,  
including industry-recognized certifications and  
micro-credentials designed and delivered in  
partnership with employers.



Whether a New Yorker is just starting off on their career path or looking to gain a specific skill to advance in their chosen line of work, CUNY has solutions to meet their needs.

Beyond meeting students where they are, CUNY is also committed to identifying and working to close disparities in career outcomes among our graduates. This includes not just disparities observed by race, gender, and ethnicity, but also other key factors such as socio-economic and transfer status.

Partnership is also essential. Ensuring New Yorkers have the skills needed to thrive and drive a healthy economy cannot be achieved by any one entity alone. At CUNY we know we must partner with industry, government, non-profits, and employers of all sizes and sectors, in all boroughs, to move the needle.

As part of this effort, CUNY is thrilled to work closely with the NYC Economic Development Corporation and numerous City and State agencies to achieve this mission. For example, CUNY has a long history of collaborating

with EDC on cybersecurity including launching a  
new degree programs at CCNY.

Even the most successful interventions  
though will not make a dent if they aren't  
sustainable. Ensuring CUNY students are prepared  
for the workforce is not a one-time project. It is  
core to our mission. That's why we are pursuing  
investments and policies that are not only short-  
term programs to meet the needs of our employers  
today but also the long-term infrastructure CUNY  
needs to evolve as jobs evolve over time.

CUNY's philanthropic partners have  
provided tremendous financial support to pilot  
effective and scalable workforce solutions, and  
we're also with industry to ensure that the  
taxpayers are not carrying the cost of building a  
talent pipeline alone. For example, eight CUNY  
campuses have partnered with Amazon to provide  
access to degrees for 30,000 workers across the  
five boroughs, with Amazon footing the bill.

Lastly, deploying modern tools will be  
necessary if CUNY is to equip and connect New  
Yorkers to careers at scale. With over 245,000  
degree-seeking students and 160,000 non-degree

seeking students, CUNY needs modern technology to amplify the effect of our faculty, our staff, and employer partners in preparing students for the workforce.

Moreover, given that half of CUNY students work while they are in school and have other demands on their time, career preparation services and connections to employers must be accessible on demand. We must ensure that CUNY has the modern systems needed to make this a reality.

Driven by these key principles, CUNY is pursuing a holistic approach to preparing students for the workforce. First, we're focused on increasing exposure to and preparation for potential careers from day one. Before students reach CUNY's doors, we're partnering with NYC Public Schools through initiatives like Future Ready to increase awareness of potential pathways to careers through career-connected learning. Once at CUNY, students benefit from faculty-led initiatives like the Career Success Fellows that aim to integrate career aspirations into the classroom to help students connect their coursework to the future they desire. We're also

ensuring programs deliver skills aligned with industry needs by investing in an industry-campus backbone through initiatives like CUNY Futures in Finance, which was created in partnership with Bloomberg, Centerbridge Partners, and Goldman Sachs to increase the number of CUNY students launching careers in the financial sector, or the CUNY Inclusive Economy Initiative, which this year will embed industry specialists and hybrid academic/career advisors in 17 departments. With support from Mayor Adams, the industry specialists will focus on tech, healthcare, and climate resiliency amongst others since we know that is where the demand is rising. Through programs like Tech-in-Residence Corps, industry professionals are also recruited directly and trained to teach themselves for-credit courses on rapidly evolving in-demand topics like Blockchain and cybersecurity. Over 3,000 students across 10 campuses have been taught by adjuncts from companies including LinkedIn, Google, Etsy, and more, and this work is not only focused on degree-seeking students. CUNY just launched a second round of the CUNY Upskilling Initiative, which

will provide over 2 million dollars to CUNY adult and continuing education departments to equip over 2,000 New Yorkers with in-demand skills at low or no cost. This new round included specific funds to support employer engagement and the development of credit articulations for selected courses. Second, awareness and skills are not enough; students also need experience. As many have heard him say, our Chancellor hopes to be known as the Patron Saint of Internships, and we know that CUNY computer science majors who participated in an internship at three times more likely to have a job at graduation, but currently only 9 percent of students participate in paid internships. More must be done to expand these opportunities. The demand is there. This summer, CUNY Career Launch, a university-wide internship program supported by Mayor Adams to connect 2,000 students to 20 dollar an hour jobs, received 11,000 student applications for 2,000 spots. 88 percent of the students enrolled had never had an paid internship, and 274 employers participated.

Thanks to a new 4-million-dollar investment from Governor Hochul, we will be

expanding these internship opportunities university-wide this coming spring through a new Spring Forward program, but internships, as you have alluded to actually, are not the only solution. Through partnership with the NY Jobs CEO Council, five CUNY colleges have also launch paid apprenticeship programs within their Applied Associates of Science degrees. Thanks to these collaborations with EY, Mastercard, and others, students begin to work and earn as part of their degree path, but more needs to be done to meet the scale of demand for these opportunities.

Finally, CUNY must work to create proactive connections to career opportunities. Over 40 percent of our students identify as first in their families to go to college. Many lack the professional networks or family connections needed to understand and break into high-growth sectors, and so we must make these proactive connections to employers for them. We are doing this by making it easier for employers to navigate to the right destination within the CUNY system by expanding the front door for industry through a new Industry Support Hub located within the Office of Careers

and Industry Partnerships, and we partner directly with employers as well as through the NY CEO Council, which has pledged to hire 25,000 CUNY students by 2030.

Finally, we're working closely with City Agencies to meet the demands of the public workforce. For instance, nearly 1/3 of the City's new teachers each year are CUNY graduates, a pipeline we are actively growing in partnership with NYC DOE to meet the needs of our Public School system.

Ultimately, the success of these initiatives will be measured not just by how many students are served, but by how many students are consistently employed at market-rate salaries following graduation in careers that they aspire to.

We look forward to working with the City Council to bolster these workforce development outcomes for CUNY Students and thank you very much for your interest and support on this critical topic.

I will now turn things over to President Adams at LaGuardia.

2 PRESIDENT ADAMS: Thank you, Lauren.

3 Good afternoon, everyone.

4 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Is your  
5 microphone on?

6 PRESIDENT ADAMS: How's that?

7 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Wonderful.

8 PRESIDENT ADAMS: I'm Kenneth Adams. As  
9 Lauren pointed out, I'm the President of LaGuardia  
10 Community College in Long Island City.

11 Good afternoon, Chairs Dinowitz and  
12 Fariás and Members of the City Council Committees  
13 on Higher Education and Economic Development.  
14 Thanks for the opportunity to speak with you today  
15 about Workforce Development at CUNY and, in my  
16 particular case, at LaGuardia Community College in  
17 Long Island City.

18 LaGuardia's Adult and Continuing  
19 Education Division is the largest workforce  
20 development organization in CUNY. We serve a  
21 diverse group of students from across Queens and  
22 beyond through more than 140 adult education  
23 courses and workforce training programs.

24 In FY '22, our Adult and Continuing  
25 Education Division served 9,434 students, most of



1 them low-income Queens residents, many of them  
2 immigrants. These individuals come to LaGuardia  
3 seeking to improve their English, earn their GEDs,  
4 or learn new technical skills in order to get a  
5 living-wage job and support their families. Of  
6 that total, about 2,600 of those students were  
7 young New Yorkers, young people aged 14 to 14, in  
8 our SYEP program, our Summer Youth Employment  
9 program, which we've run for many, many years.  
10

11 LaGuardia's workforce training programs  
12 are designed in collaboration with our employer  
13 partners, and they serve on our advisory boards  
14 and help us design curriculum and training  
15 activities. Our training is developed to teach  
16 high-demand skills and competencies needed by New  
17 York City employers today. Most of LaGuardia's  
18 workforce training programs are in three basic  
19 areas: healthcare, technology, and the  
20 construction trades.

21 Before taking a workforce training  
22 course, many of our students begin with an Adult  
23 Education program. Given that 47 percent of the  
24 residents of Queens were born outside of the U.S.,  
25 one of our most popular programs is the TELC, or

The English Language Center, where we teach several levels of ESL, English as a Second Language. The TELC at LaGuardia is the largest English language program in New York City and has been around since our founding 51 years ago. Since 1971, we have served over 275,000 students from over 80 countries.

Let me take a moment to briefly mention some of the examples of workforce development programs that we are currently running right now. Just a couple of examples. LaGuardia, along with our sister college in the Bronx, Hostos Community College, recently launched an initiative to help low-income communities in Queens and the Bronx that were impacted by the COVID-19 pandemic. It's called The NYC Accelerated Workforce Recovery Hub, and it will provide workforce training for high-demand jobs for at least 400 New Yorkers over an 18-month trial period. By helping our colleges, both LaGuardia and Hostos working together on this, expand support services that connect graduates to jobs and higher education, the initiative is expected to impact over 3,000 students as we roll it out.

The Hub is funded by a seed grant of 1.65 million dollars from the New York Community Trust.

Here's another one. LaGuardia's new ACE, ACE stands for Adult and Continuing Education, scholarship program is a model, actually a unique model, in CUNY. Using funds provided by the LaGuardia Foundation, funds that are raised privately, we provide scholarships to low-income New Yorkers looking for workforce training. This is essential since, as you know, government student financial aid, think Federal Pell or New York State TAP, has historically been limited to college students in degree programs. There is no government financial aid for students who just want non-credit workforce training or even ESL or Adult Education. Students in non-credit workforce training programs have to pay cash. This has been particularly challenging for low-income New Yorkers coming out of the pandemic. Not anymore at LaGuardia, where we have provided over 1 million dollars to date in scholarships to students in ESL, GED, workforce training programs like Pharm Tech, Plumbing, Electrical, Electronic Medical Records, and much more.

Here's a third example. LaGuardia is grateful for Speaker Adams' strong support for CUNY Reconnect, an initiative I suspect you are all familiar with. CUNY Reconnect aligns very well at LaGuardia with our Credits for Success Initiative. We launched this initiative in back in February to encourage working-age New Yorkers with some college but no degree to return to CUNY, in our case LaGuardia, to continue their educations. As the Speaker has pointed out, nearly 700,000 working-age New Yorkers are kind of in that category. They started college, often at CUNY, but they never completed their degree. Through the Credits for Success initiative, students with prior college experience enrolling at LaGuardia are able to receive academic credit for the knowledge and skills acquired outside the classroom while they have been working, for example, or serving in the military. Former CUNY students also may be eligible to have their outstanding tuition balances forgiven. The program is funded by a 1-million-dollar grant that we got from the Robin Hood Foundation. Our own Foundation where we raise money privately, provides the

funding for the debt relief for those students that want to come back but they have an unpaid balance, which would otherwise keep them from enrolling at CUNY.

Here's a fourth and final example. Our Cyber Analyst Certificate Program is a newly created program at LaGuardia. It is designed to meet the growing demand for cybersecurity professionals all across New York City and beyond. The program is taught by industry experts who work in the field. It trains students interested in computer networking and repair for jobs that involve protecting organizations, including government agencies, from breaches in cybersecurity, and it helps them launch their careers as a cyber analysts.

These are just a few examples of the many workforce development programs that we have at LaGuardia.

I thank you very much for your interest in all this, and down the road I would be very happy to entertain your questions. Thanks.

DR. JANE MACKILLOP: Good Afternoon,  
Honorable Chairs Dinowitz and Farías and Members

of the City Council Committees on Higher Education  
and Economic Development. Thank you for the  
invitation to speak today on workforce development  
at the City University of New York.

My name is Jane MacKillop, and I have  
the honor of serving as Dean of the School of  
Continuing and Professional Studies at Lehman  
College, the only senior CUNY College in the Bronx  
and a Hispanic and Minority Serving Institution.  
Lehman College is a recognized driver of economic  
mobility, and its success has most recently been  
lauded by Degree Choices, which ranked Lehman  
number one nationwide among 300 Best Hispanic-  
Serving Institutions for 2022.

It is my great pleasure to tell you  
about the Lehman College School of Continuing and  
Professional Studies. Our mission is to create  
educational and training opportunities as well as  
entrepreneurship and business development that  
will enhance the economic security and expansion  
of our community. The Bronx, as you know, is one  
of the poorest counties in New York State whose  
health and economic outcomes need all of us  
working together to remedy.

We are the bridge between the college,  
and by extension CUNY, and the Bronx. We fulfill  
Lehman College's fourth strategic plan goal, that  
is commitment to community, a goal which  
undergirds the college's strategic direction on  
workforce development and upward mobility.

The School of Continuing and  
Professional Studies comprises four interconnected  
programs and an offsite location: CUNY on the  
Concourse. The focus of our education and  
workforce development programs is in three main  
areas: health, business, and IT. Before the  
pandemic lockdown, we served around 13,000  
community residents per year but fewer since then,  
and that's about half of the total number of  
people attending the college. We provide tuition-  
based preparation for certificates and licenses.  
In 2021, 3,557 people completed training to obtain  
certification. The Workforce program manages the  
grant and contract funded training programs. For  
example, over 200 out-of-school youth, high school  
students, and home health aides are trained annually  
in medical fields.

Beginning summer 2022, Lehman, in partnership with the SBS and NYACH, launched the NCLEX-RN English Language Learning Training Program, which I have to tell you was modeled on LaGuardia's, thank you, LaGuardia, to enable internationally trained nurses to improve their English language skills and obtain licensure and employment as Registered Nurses. The Small Business Development Center supports start-ups and small businesses with access to capital and business support. In the year just ending, Bronx SBDC served 743 businesses, saved or created 706 jobs, and accessed almost 18 million in economic impact. Finally, the Adult Degree Program enables adults who, as Ken mentioned, have some college but no degree, a real target area for CUNY, to get across the finish line and complete what they started. These four programs open up a world of opportunity.

Located in the old Alexander's department store building is Lehman's off-site location, CUNY on the Concourse, which consists of HyFlex enabled classrooms, labs, and a business development center. Since 2015 the Bronx Business



Tech Center at CUNY on the Concourse has been funded through an allocation from the City Council, thank you, City Council, providing training in AR/VR technology, other IT training, and supporting the Bronx Business Tech Incubator clients. The City Council allocation has also supported the Small Business Internship Program, in which students are trained in practical business skills and then intern for four weeks with local small business, which is also in turn supported by the SBDC. This virtuous circle of interconnecting opportunities is an example of CUNY students having the exposure, preparation, experience, and connections needed to fuel an inclusive and thriving workforce.

Another example of this virtuous circle is the Tech Talent Pipeline/CUNY2X which trained and placed in internships over 160 students; 61 of whom obtained job offers within three months after of an average of 89,000 a year, and students have been employed at Apple, Amex, Home Depot, and Zillow at annual salaries of over 100,000 a year.

COTC, CUNY on the Concourse, hosts a number of grants and contracts including the

Business Technology Mentorship Program for the  
Tech Incubator Clients and other New York City  
small businesses. This created a free program in  
emerging technologies and mentoring for 214  
businesses in the five boroughs in 2021.

Another grant to assist businesses was  
the SBS-funded NY Means Business, which focused  
on businesses in communities hardest hit  
by the pandemic such as M/WBEs. The  
funding enabled us to provide digital  
skills training to 149 small businesses  
and their 348 employees. As Associate  
Provost Anderson has mentioned already,  
the Upskilling Initiative at Lehman  
College is aimed at supporting community  
members and students by providing  
relevant, short-duration, skills-based  
training to meet New York City's  
employment demand. Upskilling so far has  
served 680 participants, 350 Lehman College  
students, and 330 community residents, and has run  
34 courses.

Early in 2022, it became clear that the  
Marijuana Regulation and Taxation Act was going to

affect New York State by opening up a previously  
illegal agricultural and retail business sector. In  
January, Lehman offered a Science of Cannabis  
certificate course in partnership with McMaster  
University in Hamilton, Ontario.

In spring 2022, Borough of Manhattan  
Community College and Lehman applied for funding  
from DOL, we got 2 million over 3 years, for the  
first Cannabis Workforce and Business Development  
training program. This is for all interested but  
specifically for justice-impacted people planning  
to take advantage of social equity licenses. The  
program includes training by BMCC in customer  
service, becoming a harvester or cultivator, and  
security, and Lehman College with work with  
entrepreneurs who've obtained a license to start  
and manage cannabis-related businesses, and  
they'll be housed at CUNY on the Concourse.

These are some examples of the four key  
principles that drive CUNY's approach to workforce  
development, equity, partnership, sustainability,  
and modernization. I would like to add another key  
principle, which is innovation. We are nimble in  
addressing emerging opportunities in economic and

professional development. As is shown by our response to the emerging cannabis sector, we think outside of the box, as was shown in our response to the COVID lockdown by offering free, grant-funded training for small businesses and the virtuous circles of internships for students linked to employers.

Thank you so much for the opportunity to describe Lehman's workforce development, or some of. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I know that was some. I know that the work you do is extensive so I know that was some. I love this phrase "virtuous circle," which I think a lot of my questions are going to focus on.

I just want to get some of the numbers first. You said 2,806 career-related credit-bearing certificates or?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: No, that is degrees overall. Any sort of credit-bearing so associate's, bachelor's or certificate.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, I didn't take a good note-taking course in college so that's where that came from.

You mentioned 160,000 students in non-credit certificate courses.

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Yes, that's right.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: How many certificates and micro-credentials does CUNY offer?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: If you are looking at the credit-bearing side, we offer about 430 of them across 22 campuses, but when you're looking at the non-credit-bearing side part of the challenge at CUNY is that we don't have a single system for collecting all of the non-degree program enrollment or registrations. They're reported by each college in terms of enrollment and headcount I believe is the other and so essentially the challenge is that we've never had a central system for collecting all of the various ways that students are participating in non-degree programs, but we have it now. We are in the process of implementing it.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: You already got my next question was why, but, okay, good. This goes kind of to the virtuous circle, which I think is a good phrase, in my opening statement I mentioned the braided model, there's lots of different ways to

describe this, but how does CUNY or an individual campus I guess in this case determine what micro-credentials, what certificates, and what degrees they're going to offer?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Would you all like to start with the campus perspective, and I'm happy to add to it?

PRESIDENT ADAMS: Let's try it that way. Just one campus' answer. My colleagues and I at LaGuardia work off the principle that a workforce training program starts and ends with an employer so what we can't do is sort of just think up something because it sounds good or even a great faculty says it's a wonderful idea.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: You could, but it wouldn't be effective.

PRESIDENT ADAMS: It wouldn't be effective, so we really have to have good relationships with employers across the sectors that I mentioned like healthcare, IT, construction, and so on, and let them take the lead in sort of indicating where training programs are needed and indicating in that process what skills and competencies they're looking for and to get them to help us develop the

training curriculum. There's a flexibility in non-credit workforce training programs that you don't have in degree programs because we put together a program in electronic medical records with Weill Cornell Medical Center for example. They wrote the curriculum for us, and, as long as we know it's working and the students are learning the skills and getting the jobs and being successful, that's the check on that.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Can I pause there just to ask what does success look like?

PRESIDENT ADAMS: Success looks like a high completion rate of students in a training program, 80 or 90 percent finish.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Is that LaGuardia?

PRESIDENT ADAMS: For most of our programs, yes.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I'm sorry. I just want to get my questions. I'm not going to not let you finish. I just want to make sure, so your general completion is 89 percent which you consider a high rate and does CUNY generally have those numbers yet or that's something that you're working on?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: For non-degree-seeking programs, each campus collects it individually and in varying ways with varying metrics so we don't have a single system yet for that. That's what we're implementing.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I love that word yet because you're implementing. Completion rate is one of the metrics that you're going to use to determine the success of the program, and is there a specific target? Is 89 percent the target for success? Is that how you determine whether it is successful?

PRESIDENT ADAMS: That's the first metric, but it's not the important one. The important is the student getting the job for which she's been seeking training and being successful in that job and getting a wage gain. If someone worked in retail at minimum wage and came to LaGuardia for a workforce training program in IT, success would be getting a job in that field of interest and a higher wage, a living wage so we want people to ramp up in wages and we want them to get the jobs that result from the training.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: By the way, I know I'm looking at you because you're talking, but the



questions that I'm asking are really for anyone who's able to answer, and what is your success rate of students getting employed and also staying employed and how long do you track the students after they've left your program and gotten employed to know if they kept their job or got promotions? Is that data that you track?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: I can answer that for the University system as a whole. For any sort of credit-bearing program or degree program, for example, yes, we have something that actually is public and available that any one can use. It's called our Wage Dashboard. You can look and see by program across every campus what are the wage outcomes for students a year out, five years out, 10 years out. We do that in partnership with the New York State Department of Labor Wage Record System. That is wonderful and very helpful but not entirely complete or sufficient. It doesn't tell us things like occupation, for example, that students are looking to move into or have moved into, and so we have also recently put in place a pilot cap and gown survey to really the understand the time of graduation are people graduating with these offers.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Metric, we got completion, we got job placement and salary, but we don't have which jobs they have?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: We don't have their titles.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, so we don't know if they're getting promoted, for example, within the field?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: We will know from a monetary perspective if they get promoted but not in terms of titles. Unfortunately, the State is not collecting that information to provide it.

PRESIDENT ADAMS: Do you want a complicating detail it?

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I'd love it, yeah.

PRESIDENT ADAMS: Vice Chancellor Anderson is referring to a system that's used around the country where you use the tax system because you have to pay unemployment taxes to the state and you have a Social Security Number tagged to that, and you can get from the State Department of Labor UI System the wage of the person that is paying unemployment, the person is paying it for that person, and you can get the general sector, the general industry, but this

only works for students in CUNY that have been pursuing a degree and in the CUNY general database of student records because then there's a Social Security Number, there's a student, you graduated, you went on with your degree, and we can do that check with the State Department of Labor to see how you're doing, but for the students in our continuing ed programs, they're not in the CUNY centralized database system. As Laura was explaining, they're in our own systems unique to every campus so there are two tracking systems, but we are working to consolidate the latter. We're getting a new system for all of the 25 schools to track the outcomes for their non-credit students. Here's the wrinkle. Our workforce programs, we call them either fee-based, like you want to take the program you have to pay tuition because, remember, I said before there's no financial aid, or grant-funded so Jane mentioned some programs funded by the City. Some of our programs are grant-funded. Those funders will require that we track, you asked before, Mr. Chairman, six months out, 12 months out, those funders build that into the system that we count those individuals, we track them, we know they're on the job, they're earning

money, they're getting promotion. When our programs are fee-based, i.e. someone walks down Thompson Avenue and goes into one of our IT Tech training programs and pays the tuition out of their pocket, it's much, much harder to track them because to keep the tuition low and affordable, we can't afford the infrastructure to have someone calling and surveying and tracking them down and we're not part of the broader CUNY system. This will be fixed when, as Lauren points out, these systems come together. In the meantime, we track CUNY students who receive degrees through the State Department of Labor and then at that campus level our non-credit workforce training students because of requirements of grant-funded programs and then individually we do our best, cell phones, surveys to keep up with them. We also offer courses in a continuum so when you do Plumbing 1, if you come back for Plumbing 2 we know that you're about to get a promotion. There are many succession courses. Our ESL students, for example, will transition into workforce training programs, our GED students will transition into an IT program, and so we can stay in touch with them.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, good. That's good.

PRESIDENT ADAMS: It's a less than perfect answer, I realize.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: But the answer's the answer, right, it is what it is, but that you're centralizing some of the data, and this is, by the way, throughout the hearings we've had since January it seems that there has been a lot of missing centralized data, whether it's workforce development or some of the other hearings we've had, but it is encouraging to hear that with this system more of the data is becoming centralized. The purpose of this is to find out the success and how we can do better for our students. Without it, it's kind of hard to measure the impact of these programs.

I'm going to ask a question, but I'm going to guess we don't have the full data yet. This symposium I mentioned in my introduction, one of the things that was interesting to me, a little sad but interesting, is that when it comes to CUNY students versus, let's say, students who attend private college, beyond the opportunities for internships that the students at private colleges have for

various reasons, companies are more likely to employ students who go to, let's say, Columbia NYU than a CUNY student, less likely to, I'm going to put this in heavy quotations so I know who's reading a transcript will see it's in quotations, "take a risk," and for video, "take a risk" on CUNY students. Are you tracking or are you able to compare the outcomes for your students versus the outcomes for those in the private universities?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: We do have the ability to do comparative outcomes. Our Office of Applied Research, Evaluation, and Data Analytics, or REDA, is able to look at our institutions compared to other higher education institutions, and the important thing to note there is market. It does not make sense to compare us to everyone in New York. It really has to be in the same communities and the same areas because the job opportunities are really specific to those regions, but, yes, they can do that.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: That stated, because that is interesting, right, because essentially CUNY students are competing against, like I said, Columbia NYU students and all sorts of other

private colleges we have throughout New York City,  
and we have CUNY throughout New York City.

Before we continue, I do want to  
recognize that we've been joined by Council Members  
Kagan and Riley.

I'm interested in two other things. I  
want to make sure Council Member Fariás has an  
opportunity to ask questions and our Members and I  
have a bunch, but two things, one is I visited CUNY  
on the Concourse. I was really very impressed with  
the Small Business Incubator, I'm not sure that's the  
right term, but really providing consultation, CUNY  
students providing consultation to some of our small  
businesses, and you mentioned in your testimony  
partnership with SBS, but I'm interested to drill  
down on the word partnership because the grant  
opportunities, and I know you mentioned they're  
tracking data that these grants require, but I went  
on the Small Business Services website to look for,  
very easily find, consultants. I didn't easily find  
CUNY on the Concourse as one of the opportunities I  
have as a small business to get support, and I'm  
working what work, if any, I know work's being done  
on data, but what work, if any, is being done or can

be done to more closely work with SBS to really integrate the incredible opportunities that you're providing for the community and that SBS and you are providing for the students to more tightly integrate that as a service that SBS provides for the broader community and to really readily make that available. Just to make very clear, when I visited, we're talking about students who speak a multitude of languages, and we know language access has been a consistent issue, especially with this Council, but a lot of the problems that our small businesses face, language access has been one of the issues for them, getting things like PPP loans, we know businesses in the Bronx just didn't get them, so, again, what work, if any, is being done in collaboration with SBS to provide those services, to do that outreach beyond the funding of the grants?

DR. JANE MACKILLOP: We worked with SBS on two grants that I referenced, and so they would be advertised on their website. They wouldn't be advertised as COTC necessarily. They would be advertised as Lehman College, but they are located at CUNY on the Concourse. The services that we offer at CUNY on the Concourse are on our website. We



absolutely should link them to SBS if that's going to be helpful, but the actual grants are very clearly, I think, on their website.

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: I was just going to say at a slightly more macro level, obviously our SBS colleagues are not here to testify to all of the ways that they work together with CUNY, but, for instance, if a seat belt were to go to a Workforce1 Center to hire, that Workforce1 Center which is run by SBS has many local partnerships with community-based organizations and so the SBS Workforce1 Centers in the Bronx would know that these programs are going at Lehman College, Hostos, Bronx Community College, they're part of the local community partner network so there's a lot of referrals that happen on the ground in these walk-in centers to make sure that small businesses connect at a local level, but, even more broadly, we at a central level have been working really closely with SBS, specifically as it relates to M/WBE support as well as student entrepreneurs to make sure that CUNY students and our supplier diversity work is leveraging SBS' networks.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: After the hearing,  
if you could send over the demographic data of the  
students that you provide, non-credit, credit, micro-  
credentials, etc. The last question I have for now  
and then I'm going to turn over to my co-Chair does  
speak to that macro level. It's something I brought  
up at the last hearing. It's something that seems to  
be a consistent theme is that the work you're doing  
and the steps you're taking really, I think, are  
impactful to our city and can be more impactful, but  
when I go online and I google I need a job or I need  
job training, y'all don't show up. You know what  
shows up, is DeVry, everything else except CUNY, and  
it seems a real shame to me that it is not easy. It's  
the same sort of issue with being really integrated  
with the Academic Development Corporation, being  
integrated with SBS, and it's the same thing you  
raised about a lot of the internships you have, a lot  
of the jobs you're placing are based on relationships  
so it almost seems to me that there needs to be, I  
don't know, employed a development person, an  
advertising person. If you have that, cool, but it  
seems to me that there's more work to be done to be  
developing those relationships with private industry,

but, more importantly, selling yourselves and making sure that the programs you have are readily available and well-advertised. The answer last time was well, these colleges spend 100 million dollars on advertising. Maybe that was a made-up number, I don't know. Once things get above like 1,000 dollars I have trouble fathoming the amount of money that exists, but, since the previous hearings, have any efforts been made to hire a development person, a coordinator to do outreach to more businesses to develop more relationships and to really sell the services that CUNY has so you can attract more people looking for training in their jobs?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: I will say two things at a high level and then turn it over to my colleagues who do this every single day on the ground.

It does take work to build relationships with jobseekers as well as with employers, and, historically, CUNY has not had very robust infrastructure that supported for engaging employers, like specific folks who are dedicated to doing that, not just within career services offices but within adult and continuing ed and with other departments as

well. That's not usually a thing that historically over the past couple of decades has been funded as part of our infrastructure. That is, fortunately, changing. The CUNY Inclusive Economy Initiative is an example where we're supporting tax levy lines for industry specialists in particular sectors to build those relationships with the community and with businesses so we hope to see that grow, and, in addition to marketing, something that's really important to note is not just the work you're doing to advertise but what are the institutional funnels that will bring people in the door. One example, you mentioned NYC EDC, we are starting to embed in their economic development programs a link and a preference for CUNY talent pipelines, the property (INAUDIBLE) RFP that they just put out is a great example, cybersecurity is another, because you need that sort of institutional structure, not just did someone see this ad in the right place, but I wonder, because your point is well taken, that's still very important, if my colleagues have anything to say about their approaches to community engagement and marketing too.

PRESIDENT ADAMS: A high level answer and then something a little more specific, but back to your observation earlier about what you googled, I suspect, Mr. Chair, that if you googled I'm looking for a degree CUNY would probably come up somewhere, right, but when you say I'm looking for job training CUNY doesn't come up. That's the problem. I mean I'm going back to what you put your finger on because I couldn't agree more that that's a challenge, and I think part of it is the long-held view, the great reputation of CUNY, as an institution with its 25 schools and everything where people go to get a degree as a degree-granting institution where the goal of attending CUNY is to get an associate or a baccalaureate or a graduate degree, and, what the Chancellor is doing, and I think this is really important and all of us are trying to advance this work at the local level, is saying that's not enough. To really be a driver of economic mobility, to really be a driver in the New York City economy, CUNY has to ensure that its graduates get jobs, that there has to be a job. Put another way, I don't know any students at LaGuardia that say they're just coming for a degree. No, they're coming to get an education that

leads to a job so they can put money in their pocket and food on the table so the outcome they seek is a job at a living wage, and we need to do a better job, so that when you go into your phone, right, to say that there's a lot of ways CUNY can do that, first among them by granting you a degree but also with all these workforce training programs we're talking about this afternoon, these are programs that from three to six to nine months give you the skills that you need to get a good job at a living in these sectors that we're talking about, but, oh, it's not a degree, it's a certificate, it's a different type of credential. The whole them in this country for years, everyone has to go get a baccalaureate degree. Yes, that's a good goal, but for many people there's no time, there's no money, there's something else in between on the way to that which is a practical credential that gets me a job, money in my pocket, food on the table. Moving the needle on workforce outcomes as opposed to simply focusing on degree outcomes is a mission of the Chancellor, I think it's fair to say, and one that we're trying to work at the ground level intensively. In terms of marketing, listening to you, we have no money in LaGuardia budget (INAUDIBLE)

marketing. We have 20,000 students so I think it's word of mouth and our community partners. We couldn't do it without them.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I actually know a great incubator, CUNY on the Concourse, that could help you with your advertising.

PRESIDENT ADAMS: (INAUDIBLE) marketing expertise. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: So we'll ask her how she could help your University and advertising your great programs.

DR. JANE MACKILLOP: I think you've hit on a huge gap. You're absolutely right. You google I need a job, and CUNY doesn't turn up. The reason is exactly what President Adams said because a lot of people come to us through word of mouth. The principal reason, when we do surveys of our students, how did you find out about our program, oh, my auntie told me, or the person downstairs, and that's really a very, very powerful way to recruit students, and also it's, as Ken said, through employers. In the Bronx, the primary area of employment is healthcare. That's a huge thing in the Bronx, and that's how we recruit people is through the health providing

agencies, the hospitals, the doctors' officers, and  
so on. A lot more of this is word of mouth, perhaps,  
than we take credit for.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Yeah. I recognize  
word of mouth is very powerful, and I do want to  
highlight and uplift and encourage you to do more  
work with our high schools. It's not enough. We talk  
about word of mouth and you think about sort of  
groups of people who are talking to each other very  
often, the students who are most marginalized who  
most need to hear that there are opportunities  
outside of a bachelor's degree, outside even of an  
associate's degree. The students that I taught for 14  
years who are struggling just to get the local  
diploma, and, if they had been provided this  
opportunity or knew about this opportunity as a  
legitimate and successful pathway for them, I think  
they would've found a lot more success early on.

I'm going to turn it over to my co-Chair,  
Chair Farías.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Finally. No, I'm just  
kidding. I have to acknowledge Council Member  
Gutierrez has joined us here today.



I recommend bringing back to your advertising or IT department a quick key log advertising so the next time Chair Dinowitz google searches how can I find a job, CUNY is at the top of it. It's pretty inexpensive.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I want to be clear. I'm not looking for a new job. For anyone watching.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Sounds like it. I have some workforce-oriented questions that I'd love to kind of go through, and I'm sorry if they feel a little jumping around because you've sparked a lot of different questions as you've all testified.

First and foremost, could you provide some examples of how CUNY has worked with other agencies? I know we've mentioned NYC EDC, a pseudo-agency, also SBS, but can you mention how they've worked with other agencies on its workforce development initiatives?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Sure. Again, I'm sure my colleagues have a number of examples so happy to turn it over to them too. We collaborate in a number of ways. One is working with agencies that have a specific line of sight into how the economy is evolving and where jobs will be in the future so we

have partnerships with multiple agencies, yes SBS,  
yes EDC, but also Department of Health and Mental  
Hygiene and others, Department of Ed who seek  
workforce shortages and can help inform us from that  
perspective as demand and employers.

Additionally, we work really closely with  
agencies not just as partners for training their  
clients but partners for training their staff so our  
School of Professional Studies has a very robust  
relationship with several city agencies to be able to  
actually embed themselves to do training, they have a  
program with ACS and several others so that staff on  
the ground are receiving this training in partnership  
with CUNY schools, and then, additionally, we do  
partner as vendors or partners together with city  
agencies who are looking to launch specific  
programming for specific types of clients. Jane  
obviously mentioned one of the ways in which Lehman  
has partnered with SBS, but we have examples of that  
across the board with other city agencies who have  
partnered directly with CUNY to support specific  
programming. DYCD and DCLA are two as well that  
obviously have partnered with us on Career Launch  
across all of CUNY and the CUNY Cultural Corps, which

is an internship program, but there are many examples.

PRESIDENT ADAMS: Two quick ones I think good examples for LaGuardia. The New York City Department of Education, DOE. School cafeteria workers are represented by DC37. School cafeteria workers can come to LaGuardia for our program in nutrition and culinary arts, and that is a 60-credit associate degree program, but they can take most of the classes at night. The union benefit fund from DC37 covers all of the tuition. When you complete the program and get the degree, you get a promotion to school cafeteria supervisor. You are now the boss of the school cafeteria, and you get at least a 20,000-dollar wage gain. We've run this for a number of years. I just signed a renewal of the contract with DC37 and DOE so it's an example of one of those partnerships.

Second one, brand new. DOHMH, Department of Health and Mental Health, which is based nearby in Long Island City which is nice for us. We've just launched a federally funded program to train mental health peers. This is a program where we recruit individuals from across the city, not limited to

LaGuardia students by any means, who have experienced a diagnosis with a mental health condition. We train them to leverage their experience with their diagnosis so that they can be of assistance to people who are going through treatment for a mental health condition, and this is almost like a coach sort of position. It's not clinical, but it's someone who can be on the front lines in an emergency room, in the back of an EMS truck with someone who's experiencing a mental health condition or trauma, and these peers, again this is a program where you have a lot of support through DOHMH, we had to put together a kind of complicated partnership. A third of the training is an internship, a paid internship, at a facility, again could be an emergency room, a community-based organization, where they're providing assistance to people, again that peer support, to help them get through the treatment or succeed in their treatment plan. We just launched this, and, again, we have a debt really to DOHMH, just another example.

DR. JANE MACKILLOP: Perhaps I could add some much smaller scale examples. We work with community-based organizations such as Westside Housing, New Jewish Home, we do training for them. We

also work with unions, particularly with 1199. We have several programs with 1199 so we're working with a hospital workers union, and then we also work with manufacturing companies such as GAL where we're training their employees in English language so that they will be able to manage in an emergency so that they have sufficient language on the shop floor to be able to cope with any kind of emergency situation and just to navigate the work.

PRESIDENT ADAMS: Your question, Chair Fariás, is really, really important. It raises a broader theme, if I may, of how do we build stronger connections between CUNY and New York City as the biggest employer in town. After all, New York City government is the biggest employer, the biggest company, right, so another quick example, when I was at, as you'll recall, Bronx Community College, we had a partnership with New York City DEP, Division of Wastewater Management down on Queens Boulevard. It was called electronic engineering. It was an AAS degree, 60 credits, and DEP needed our students, our graduates to work in sewage treatment plants to monitor water quality and basically the degree, this is sort of a junior engineering degree. It turned out

1 that training in that program was exactly what the HR  
2 department at DEP, it's about 1,500 people,  
3 wastewater management, was looking for. It created a  
4 pipeline, and so, again, what I'm coming back to and  
5 I love your question for this reason is how do we  
6 create more pipelines between, I'll be biased and  
7 talk about our seven community colleges that have  
8 these technical training programs, and very specific  
9 titles that are good-paying union jobs, and I don't  
10 just mean the city. I could say the same about the  
11 MTA and State agencies as well. That, I think, is a  
12 really important opportunity.  
13

14 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: This is exactly why I  
15 was asking this question. I come from a background,  
16 as we've spoken about and we know where we overlapped  
17 at Bronx Community College, working at a non-profit  
18 organization who was providing an accredited  
19 apprenticeship that was registered with the  
20 Department of Labor that actually flowed people right  
21 into a municipal job. That wasn't just a job. It was  
22 a career. For us looking at this from a city  
23 perspective, as folks that are trying to look at the  
24 larger scheme of where our recovery is and where is  
25 our economy going and how do we get people back to

work, really in our own backyards we have streamed pipelines that are connected from high school to a CUNY to a unionized job that has a curriculum, that has a multitude, really like a tree with a bunch of branches, into a multitude of titles that are life-sustaining career opportunities. I appreciate the answers, and I know we can probably talk about that one topic for a really long time, but it is really important to look at these initiatives and how they can connect back to our municipal workforce. The City is the largest employer, and we have to do better at connecting the people most in need, the people in industries that may be phasing out, and what could those credentials be matched to to put them into another opportunity.

I just wanted to ask, and I know you've touched on this a little bit. I have a question here that says what tools does CUNY use to determine what areas the City should be prioritizing when developing these workforce initiatives, but I feel like you touched on it lightly. Are there specific data points or trends that we see, I don't know, every time we fiscally forecast or anything like that where maybe CUNY readapts some of their trainings or are we

seeing consistency because we are doing a partnership with DC37 and so we know that workforce will always be retiring and there will always be a need to fill gaps. What kind of tools are we using to prioritize where these workforce development programs are created?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: At a high level, on the degree side, you cannot apply to move forward a degree program through CUNY unless you state in it evidence that there is demand for it in the labor market, and there are a number of tools that campuses use to use that labor market information including Lightcast (phonetic) is one that we have across the board for the private sector and for the public sector. That is oftentimes not sufficient so to go back to something President Adams said, oftentimes those high level numbers don't really give you the complete insight you need to know whether or not a particular job is actually going to be something that is open and accessible to someone who has a particularly aligned credential which is why we work so closely with the employers themselves and the agencies themselves that lead to those roles. Depending on which part of the workforce you're



1 looking at, the ways that we approach that can be  
2 different. We do partner very closely with DCAS and  
3 others to understand across the City's workforce  
4 where are their gaps, (INAUDIBLE) build programs out  
5 around that, and have encountered together some  
6 challenges with doing that and where there might be  
7 policy mechanisms that can be put in place to open  
8 that up, but, on the employer side, as President  
9 Adams mentioned, it's a combination of labor market  
10 information, talking directly to employers, having  
11 employers on your advisory council, and in some cases  
12 where new programs, degree or non-degree, don't need  
13 to be created (INAUDIBLE) anew, there's actually an  
14 opportunity to partner with industry to teach  
15 slightly updated and improved courses in a particular  
16 program, and the reason for that is there may be some  
17 things that are consistent, consistent partnerships  
18 that you've built with agencies or employers over  
19 time, but those skills are very likely evolving no  
20 matter what the consistent pipeline is so we have  
21 various tools to do that.

23 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Great. Go ahead.

24 PRESIDENT ADAMS: The local perspective,  
25 from a campus anyway, we've heard a lot about the

great resignation and a lot of people leaving jobs and leaving including municipal and state workforces and it's true, and that gives us a chance to think about programs we have that are already solid and successful before we run and invent new ones because, indeed, an example at LaGuardia, and we've always done a lot in healthcare, we're in the middle of an initiative I call 3,000 Heroes because by 2027, five years hence, we will have trained 3,000 nurses, LPNs, EMTs, and paramedics for the City of New York, 3,000 heroes. We don't need to create any new program, and we can keep doing that, and we can actually with new resources we could probably exceed that number of 3,000 heroes. We desperately need to do better at LaGuardia in terms of training bilingual special ed teachers for the DOE. I mentioned the DOE before. We have an early childhood education program. We just brought on a new professor who's a specialist from the DOE in special ed, and we've got to ramp that up. What I'm saying is I think a lot of the opportunities out there can be served through training programs that we already have that may need to be scaled up or slightly improved before we run out and do something new.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Great. Thank you for that. Just in relation, and I know we spoke about this right before we started this hearing, but can you speak a little bit more about how CUNY is working with students to create the job pipelines that are beyond the skillsets they're learning, more of the job adjacency, and that branch out that we were kind of talking about.

PRESIDENT ADAMS: One of the best ways to do that for our students, whether they're in non-credit certificate programs or seeking degrees, and Lauren mentioned it, are paid internships, and we have precious few in CUNY and it's a real problem. You cannot dream what you've never seen, and our students haven't seen those jobs and so they don't understand the concept of job adjacency where you get an internship, let's say as a junior bookkeeper in a financial services firm downtown here somewhere because you're an accounting major and you want to transfer to Baruch and it's that internship where you start to look around and say wait, what is that person doing, that's an interesting job, it wasn't what I went to school for but that person is making more money or having more fun or doing some

1 interesting work so you have to get in there with  
2 that internship to see the adjacent jobs and see  
3 broader opportunities and go back and say I see that  
4 now, I can dream it. We do four things, two well, two  
5 if I can say we need to do a better job. Our faculty  
6 are excellent at helping students gain knowledge and  
7 skills, but, in addition, they need experience and  
8 relationships, and it's really through internships,  
9 work-based learning, things out in the community,  
10 things with the summer jobs where they get experience  
11 and build new relationships and then to your point  
12 the other jobs that are out there, the adjacent jobs,  
13 get to know the industry and open up the horizons.

15 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: That's great. Thank  
16 you. I have a couple more questions, but I know  
17 people might be wanting to ask, I just want to follow  
18 up on top of resources and really giving a holistic  
19 approach to our students. I came from a non-profit  
20 unionized job training world where I always had to  
21 find the ways to make it the easiest way to get a  
22 trainee to show up or an apprentice to show up. We  
23 haven't really touched on this at all, but this  
24 really doesn't directly correlate with our workforce  
25 programs and job training. What additional resources,

if any, are you folks seeing at CUNY need to be supplemented to have retention and to make sure people can participate within the job training programs, childcare, bilingual job trainings, stipends, transit vouchers, etc.? Are you seeing influxes in that post-pandemic? Are you seeing one more than other?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Sure. I'm happy to answer at a high level. Yes, quite often the colocation of services for students alongside training of the degree is a necessity, to move them into the futures that they want to be in and, in addition to some of the ones that you mentioned, transportation very often in our non-degree programs, we have subsidies for Metro cards, etc., if we're partnering with other agencies and funders to do that because we know that that's a barrier to getting to the job because, even if you're being trained for a job in Queens, the job you might ultimately need to fill may be in Manhattan, may be in Brooklyn, may be elsewhere so certainly transportation is a piece. You did hit on some of the other big ones, childcare. Food insecurity is actually a huge issue for our students and so we've launched a number of

partnerships to make sure across the University that our students have access to food across the board. There is something that has really helped as well that isn't talked about as much when it comes to retention through programs. Part of that is when it's delivered and how, so we're seeing prior to the pandemic a very low percentage of our students participated in, say, career services or the kind of services that could help them envision where they wanted to go in the future. Thanks to the pandemic, now even though we're, thanks to the pandemic, one of the silver linings of the pandemic was now that we are back on campus students are continuing to access those services that keep them engaged but doing so at a higher level and doing so remotely through online supports, and what we've found in some of our degree programs is that when you pair academic advisement with that sort of career advisement you see the time to graduation really go down and increase of persistence so that's another realm where it's a supportive service that you wouldn't necessarily think of, but it is increasing thanks to new ways of delivering it alongside these programs.

DR. JANE MACKILLOP: What we've heard is that there are these services at CUNY, particularly on the degree side, on the non-credit side, on the job training side where the funder has provided money for career services, for childcare, for transportation, for snacks and food and so on, that works very well, but, as President Adams mentioned, if you're paying for training yourself, you're doing it out of pocket, you don't get any of those services because all of the colleges are trying to keep the tuition as low as we possibly can. If we charge more for these services, people won't be able to take the training so this is, I think, a huge gap and something that we would very much like to remedy at Lehman. It is sometimes possible at other colleges because they use grant funding for that purpose, but that's a real lag for the certificate students who are paying out of pocket.

PRESIDENT ADAMS: If I may just real quick, housing. Our most critical need for students is affordable housing. We have a thing called LaGuardia Cares where they go for assistance. Last week, I had two students sleeping in their cars. We have students in the shelter system. It's very hard

to stay in school. When things went online and you didn't have good wi-fi at the shelter, how are you going to keep up with class so we have to come up with some housing solutions. Remember, we don't have dorms. We're a "commuter school," but we've got a lot of students who really have housing problems right now.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Great. Thank you so much for that. Last three questions and we can be as brief as possible so we can move on to questions from Colleagues. How is CUNY using its apprenticeship programs and other tools at its disposal to assist in the industries that have been hardest hit by the pandemic, including tourism, restaurants, retail, arts and entertainment?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Currently, we are, as I mentioned before, supporting apprenticeships in a number of ways. We are integrating them into our applied associate's programs in some cases. Across five of our colleges, we're doing that because we think it's really important not just to do it in isolation but to do it as part of a degree program. In those particular areas, they are mostly focused on high-demand



occupations that have been built directly with employers. We, to my knowledge, do not have any in tourism or hospitality or retail at the moment. We do have on the non-degree side a number of partnerships actually with SBS around something called First Course which is for line cooks that is essentially an accelerated training apprenticeship course. It is not a registered apprenticeship, but these students, I think it was delivered in partnership with Hostos and KBCC, have the opportunity to learn through an intensive training and then actually as part of their work get an on-the-job component which is very similar. These are efforts that are occurring in different ways across our campuses that we are really starting to commit to scaling up across the board. We just received an additional 2 million dollars from the State to do this work more at all 10 of our colleges that offer applied associates, and our employer partners all right already talking about the hospitality industry as a potential area for expansion there.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Great. Twofold question, how does CUNY interact with the Office of Workforce Development and the EDC, the Economic

Development Corporation, and then if someone can touch on, in 2020 the Mayor's Office of Workforce Development and the Office for Economic Opportunity launched a jobs portal website, working.nyc.gov, and I wanted to know if CUNY was included in the portal. If so, if there's any CUNY-included data from the site that's tracked to see when jobseekers connect to employers, and, yeah, so we can start first off with interactions with workforce development and EDC.

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Sure.

Absolutely. For the Mayor's Office of Workforce and Talent Development, we have regular standing meetings. I have been appointed the Chief Workforce Officer, and, therefore, I am part of the interagency taskforce that the Mayor's Office of Workforce and Talent Development is running. Additionally, our Chancellor co-Chairs the Future of Workers Taskforce which the Mayor and Abby Jo Sigal are running as well so we have regular and frequent interactions. In fact, I just came from a meeting with them, DOE, and DYCD right before this. For NYC EDC, similarly, we have not only regular standing meetings but also are working together day-in, day-out on actual implementation projects, again integration into the

economic development initiatives that they're already doing as well as they directly fund some of the work that we're doing across our campuses. For Climate Week, we just announced 4 million dollars in partnership with them for green energy jobs, which is something that we're working on. For the NYC Opportunity data portal that you referenced, that includes a number of agencies that have submitted data to a central portal. CUNY is currently not represented in that, and the reason for that is this challenge that we came back to that Chair Dinowitz was asking us about, which is that we don't have a single system for collecting information for non-degree programs, and a lot of the programs that are mentioned in that particular database are really focused on accelerator training, industry-informed training, and that's the thing that we don't have capacity to report at scale across our campuses. However, we have had conversations with them about what the future would look like for CUNY to start contributing to that overall database.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Great. Thank you so much, and I'll yield my time.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you. I'm  
going to turn it to Council Member Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very  
much. Let me first say that I am a CUNY graduate. I  
have a bachelor's degree from Hunter College and an  
Associates of Science Degree, it was back then New  
York City Community College, now it's Technical  
College, and I've been Chair of the Higher Education  
Committee for eight years, and I've heard this  
before. I've heard just about everything you can say  
about CUNY, and what I'm going to focus on because  
it's always left out is black students and black  
faculty and black administrators. We should never,  
ever have a hearing where only white administrators  
are presenting. Not one black face is sitting up here  
making a presentation. 25 colleges, 7 community  
colleges, you can't find one black administrator to  
give a perspective on black students and black  
faculty? This has to stop. It's unconscionable and  
unacceptable. I also think that the Chancellor should  
be at hearings like this. I appreciate your presence,  
but when we have hearings of this nature I think it's  
very critical that the Chancellor comes so we can see  
in addition to your CUNY-wide presentation, because

now we're LaGuardia and Lehman, and then you give the perspective on the whole system. That's unacceptable for me, and I appreciate you. I'm not saying anything negative about you, but, in addition to you, there needs to be a black face up there and we need to point out black students because what happens, and I think you mentioned it, in our communities you're talking homeless shelters, we're saturated with homeless shelters and the black Mayor is putting more in our community than the white community, so we're saturated with homeless shelters. The poverty rate in our communities, black and brown, is 33 to 40 percent poverty. The unemployment rate is double digit. When you look at that factor and look how black students fare in CUNY, what happens to black students if and upon graduation? Do they get market-rate salaries in career paths that they choose to be in? That's one question I would like. What is the data on that? How black students are faring, not just in CUNY, but upon graduation? What do they get? When we look at the fact that we live in, whether y'all like it or not, well y'all probably do like it, a colonial capitalist system and its ideology that permeates every institution and in the minds of millions of New

Yorkers is racism. That's the ideology. Capitalism is the system that creates the poverty and unemployment so when the whole nation talks about unemployment coming down, not in our community. When they talk about all of these opportunities that people are having and how great programs are going, not in our communities, so I would like for us to have more focused attention on black students because when we talk about diversity, diversity, inclusion, diversity can mean anything, diversity can exclude blacks, as long as you diversify, you got woman, got Asian, got this one, that one, that's diversity, and I've been at hearings where they had diversity without a black person so just as you spoke of the free academy, whites, that's when it was free, free academy, it was the white immigrants that came, there was no tuition, it was free, and they, because of their complexion, had access to social and economic mobility and even when we were already here so the white immigrants, yeah, they were discriminated, they were called different names and stuff, but they had access to social and economic mobility, came at the bottom with us and went up, but now it's tuition based. It should be a free academy again now that we have all of this,

and you know what it could happen because all the money for TAP and all the money for all of these programs, if you took that money and put it in the CUNY budget, we can have a tuition-free academy, and we should focus on those students, and I'm not saying other students aren't in need, but we should focus on black students because our perspective is usually neglected at these hearings or it's universally meshed in with everything else and you don't get a real picture. The only question I have is how are black students faring upon graduation in terms of market-rate salaries in the areas of their choice?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Thank you for that, and I do acknowledge that our panel is not reflective of our student body. We don't have those numbers here today, but we are happy to look into them and get them to you afterwards.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, but that's what I usually hear, but I think these things are important, and you don't have them here today because that's not a priority for you. Your priority is what you presented, and this is why we need to focus on the black presence in CUNY. Faculty members are having problems going through the system so that they

can have permanent employment, tenure. I'm finished, but black faculties are having difficulties getting tenure. That's ridiculous, 21st century, black faculty having problems getting tenure so we have all those kinds of issues in CUNY and they need to be seriously addressed. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you, Council Member. I'll reiterate the question just for the Council Member and the panel that earlier in my question we did ask for the demographic data. I know those questions were sent to you before the hearing so we'll certainly make sure that those are shared with Council Member Barron and I have complete faith you'll be able to send those to us.

I want to turn it over to Council Member Gutierrez.

COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIERREZ: Thank you, Chairs Dinowitz and Farías. I apologize. I was in the (INAUDIBLE) but I was streaming it so I did catch all of your opening remarks. I just have some technical questions if you could shed some light on. I'm curious about the Tech-in-Residence program. In your opening remarks, you shared that your goal is to



double it by 2022. Can you just share what that number is?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: A couple of different things there. CUNY had something called CUNY2X Tech. The goal was to double the number of tech bachelors awarded at CUNY by 2022. We did that. We managed to cross that threshold in four years instead of five. Tech-in-Residence Corps was a really important part of that solution. That brings industry professionals into the classroom to teach in-demand topics, and that particular initiative has grown exponentially. I'm not sure that it's doubled over the same period of time, but it currently serves about 3,000 students.

COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIERREZ: The Tech in bachelors programs, what are those numbers?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Our goal was to increase from I think it was 995 to 2,000, and we exceeded that goal.

COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIERREZ: Fantastic. Do you have any demographic information for those graduates?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Again, not on us, but we can look into that.

COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIERREZ: I'm curious to know racial demographic, ethnic demographic, and also where they're coming from throughout the city, throughout the five boroughs.

My second question is multilingual or non-English-speaking students, how are they awarded access to some of these programs, how are they made aware at the different institutions of some of these incubators, what does that specific outreach look like, and what are some of the qualifications that they need to be able to qualify to participate in these programs?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Do you want to take a stab at that?

PRESIDENT ADAMS: Sure. Let me try to answer that, at least in the case of LaGuardia's workforce training programs. They're almost all taught in English, and we do lots of outreach all across Queens, of course, and we have several services that are helpful to students for whom English is still an obstacle to a training program. One is the Center for Immigrant Education and Training that we run where we help recently arrived immigrants in Queens, in many cases women with

children, we train them or help them to navigate the DOE so they can become advocates for their small children in elementary schools, public schools. That activity gives us a chance to get to know them better and help them with jobs and employment and other issues as they transition into Queens life so we have the Center, but the other thing I think that's most important, and I mentioned it earlier, is that LaGuardia is the largest provider of ESL, English as Second Language, education in the city. We've been doing it since 1971, 275,000 students. Many, many different levels of English as a Second Language instruction including we are now one of the few remaining intensive English programs meaning you can get an F1 visa to come to this country to learn English with LaGuardia with that student visa. Those programs are expensive and intensive because it's so many hours per week, but we're a very large provider so we have a wide range. Finally, coming out of the pandemic, we've had a huge surge in enrollment in our ESL programs which has been very encouraging, and I think it's a lot of people who lost their jobs. These were immigrants in Queens who worked in low-wage service jobs. We're providing scholarships for them

to come and learn English at the TELC, and our enrollment has surged. It was over 200 percent greater than a year ago. We had 400 students on a waiting list, unfortunately, because we didn't have enough instructors this summer. First and foremost, we want to provide people with sufficient level of English so they can then take a workforce training program and go into a job where they're going to need enough English to do the job well.

COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIERREZ: My mom is actually one of the graduates from LaGuardia's ESL classes when they came here in '80 so totally aware of how robust LaGuardia's ESL program is and how valuable it is to the non-English-speaking community. I guess just to make my question more specific, of those participants that are enrolled in some of the ESL programming, how are they then connected to some of these tech opportunities and tech programs? I'm encouraged to learn that a lot of folks have been enrolling since the pandemic. I love hearing that. I would just love to understand what is the process then to engage them in creating an opportunity for pathways for some of these tech jobs. My last question before this runs out is I'm just curious to

1 know if you can share some information on what are  
2 some of your tech incubator goals for some of the  
3 other communities, obviously you have one I think in  
4 every borough, I think that's wonderful, but just  
5 curious to know if you have plans to expand those  
6 incubators. Thank you. Thank you, Chairs.

8 DR. JANE MACKILLOP: The City Council-  
9 funded incubator at Lehman, also the College of State  
10 in Queens, and we are looking to expand in a variety  
11 of ways by getting other grants funded so that we can  
12 offer additional opportunities. I'd just like to  
13 follow up on what was said earlier about programs  
14 that link English as a Second Language with training,  
15 and we have the NCLEX program that we're offering at  
16 Lehman at the moment which starts off with intensive  
17 English language support to help people to get ready  
18 for the test because that's really what they need to  
19 pass and then they're going to be registered nurses  
20 and, good knows, New York City needs more nurses so  
21 we're linking the ESL with the training and then with  
22 the jobs, and I think that's the model that we would  
23 like to expand in a number of different areas.

24 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you, Council  
25 Member Gutierrez. Council Member Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Hello. My questions aren't as succinct as others. The first question I have though is you mentioned employee partners. Do you have a list of employee partners that you can share, like who are they and how they are recruited.

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Absolutely. I don't have in front of me a comprehensive list...

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Yeah, a list to send later but just generally wanting to understand...

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Who they are (INAUDIBLE) Absolutely. There's a twofold approach here. One is our individual campuses are working really closely with businesses all the time, all 25 of them, both locally, small businesses as well as other corporate partners or otherwise so there's that work that's happening on the campus and, with these recent investments that I talked about, we're hoping that happens a lot more in a coordinated way. Additionally, there's the central office. Part of the challenge that we've heard from employers generally across the board in hiring CUNY students is that there are a million doors. Getting to the place you need to be is really hard to navigate our system, so

we have a central Office of Careers and Industry Partnerships where any employer that is looking to connect with CUNY students are welcome to come. We have a website that has an intake form, and we have a team that follows up with them to be able to then refer them to students on campuses that match what they are looking for. That is open to any employer partner, but we also do build specific partners, both with individual employers but also with groups of employers, so the NY CEO Council is a great example. They have 30 of the largest employers here in New York City that we work with regularly, both for hiring of students and also for these more targeted investments like adding apprenticeships into applied associate's programs. We also have some specific programs that are targeted not towards big businesses but towards small businesses. In addition to our Small Business Development Centers, we also have some programs like Internship to Employment that recruits students from across CUNY to become interns in their senior or recently graduated year to be able to intern for six weeks before converting to full-time employees at which point CUNY will actually subsidize those small businesses that hire them on so there are

a number of different channels that we work with  
employer partners. I'm wondering if you have any...

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: No, I just  
wanted to know general information, but just as a  
followup, for instance, the Internship to Employment  
program, is that a program that's offered at all CUNY  
schools or certain CUNY schools, are you working with  
like the Career Office, or how does that get trickled  
down to the many colleges you have?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Yeah, great  
question. We have different models for doing that.  
Internship to Employment specifically is open to any  
and all CUNY student that wants to participate, and  
it is administered centrally in partnership with  
campus offices. That is not only Career Services.  
That can be partnerships at the Provost or specific  
department levels. That could be partnerships with  
student services. It's very broad, or even direct  
marketing to students because that's something that  
we can do as well. There are other programs like  
Career Launch that actually invest in specific  
campuses, LaGuardia is one of them, it's our  
healthcare hub, to build the capacity of a campus  
itself to build those partnerships across the board.



COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: How do you make the decision in determining which colleges are offered like the Career Launch Initiative? Is it based off of a successful track record of doing other types of workforce development initiatives? How do you determine which colleges get what?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Yeah. That's a great question. In some of our programs, we have open RFPs. Absolutely any campus can apply, and then they are reviewed based on a variety of factors. Sometimes it is about a specific technical need or capacity that we need to offer for an employer, but other times it also has to do with ensuring that the portfolio of schools we select for programs that have a limited participation have geographic diversity across the five boroughs or have a representation of community colleges and senior colleges so depending on the program there may be different considerations, but those are the high level things that we consider.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. The Green Jobs Initiative that you mentioned, the 4 million dollars, is there a place or can you send more information on that because I would love to know again is this a central initiative or are specific

colleges being tasked with implementing what it'll look like, similar to the 16-million-dollar Inclusive Economy Initiative, wanting to understand and get a little bit more details on the plans, scopes of work, how will this actually be executed and implemented in a real way so are you able to send that to me too?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: We can definitely send it.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay, cool. You say you're a Vice Chancellor but you're also Chief Workforce Development Officer?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Yes, I'm an Associate Provost and Chief Workforce Development Officer.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay, Associate Provost and Chief Workforce Officer for New York City or just through CUNY?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: For CUNY, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. I just want to be clear on (INAUDIBLE) Great. Another question/comment I have, I used to work for the JFK Redevelopment Program, and there are a lot of different types of opportunities there. Your college

1 is in my District and in close proximity to the  
2 airport, the aviation program was started when the  
3 AirTrain was built, and so some of the things that I  
4 have been trying to do is figure out a way to create  
5 a specific workforce initiative that will support  
6 the, I don't know, it's probably going to be upwards  
7 of 18+ billion dollars project at JFK and so wanted  
8 to know, and this is why I'm asking these questions  
9 because I just want to understand how CUNY, whether  
10 it's the college specifically or CUNY as a system, is  
11 really working towards an actual pipeline, like here  
12 is the opportunity and how can we utilize the  
13 programs and services at our existing colleges to  
14 funnel people to opportunity so even going to the DOE  
15 there is York Early College Academy also in my  
16 District and so how can we even start in high school.  
17 There's another CTEA, not in my District, but a  
18 Career Technical Engineering Architectural high  
19 school, how can we utilize that particular high  
20 school to funnel our young folks into a continuing  
21 education program? Maybe they don't want to get a  
22 four-year degree or a two-year degree, they just want  
23 a certificate for construction. I know LaGuardia has  
24 a lot of construction programs, or maybe they do want  
25

an aviation degree at your college, but if you could just share how these decisions are made and what opportunities exist to really online very specific programs that I do feel would have a lot of potential.

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Sure. The way we are approaching it now is twofold. If JFK were to come to us tomorrow, just as an example, to CUNY Central at the systems level, we need to have a door they can come in that understands their needs and then connect them out to the schools that have aviation programs. In this case, York is really the leading contender there. There has to be some way that centrally we can have that kind of conversations with the opportunities that come to us, but equally important is we are making an investment locally in campuses so that they can build out this infrastructure themselves to work with, JFK in their own backyard in the case of York, and those kinds of partnerships really have to be specific to what the job opportunities are so there isn't like a one-size-fits-all systems approach to mapping out these are the general parameters. It really has to be what is the employer looking for in this particular case to

1 know can we go to high schools to see if students can  
2 plug in to this pipeline or are these jobs actually  
3 jobs where if someone were to get a non-credit  
4 certificate the employer would actually hire them so  
5 there's a process that we go through, both centrally  
6 and locally, but those are resources that absolutely  
7 are needed more, like our campuses need more capacity  
8 to be able to do that.  
9

10 Separately, I was just on the phone with  
11 the Aviation Department at York the other day so we  
12 should talk more about this if this is...

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Dr. Hsu.

14 ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Yes, I  
15 believe so.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. Yeah, so  
17 just transparently, the JFK Redevelopment Program,  
18 there is this idea that there will be a community  
19 benefit fund that's paid by the Port Authority and  
20 the terminal developers, but my thing is we always  
21 can use more money and there is existing money in  
22 different spaces, whether it's the 14 millions  
23 dollars or the 4 million dollars or I was just  
24 informed of an RFP at the state level for additional  
25 money for workforce development programs and how can

we cross coordinate all of this activity and resources to stand up, again, a specific program and initiative so I will make sure and come and talk to you about that and get your information. Just quickly, like the CUNY EOCs, I have to wrap it up, the CUNY EOCs, how are you interacting with the CUNY EOCs, so your college has a CUNY EOC sort of connected to them but it's separate and aside so how are you kind of leveraging CUNY EOCs and using that as a workforce development tool through CUNY?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Neither one of you has an EOC, right?

PRESIDENT ADAMS: Not now.

DR. JANE MACKILLOP: No.

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: York is not the only example. Obviously BMCC also has an EOC, and in those specific cases we actually are coordinating with SUNY more broadly. SUNY has a counterpart in their system the same way that we have in ours, and we are regularly coordinating to work together on policies that leverage the things we have on the ground. For instance, we're working together on things like financial aid for workforce credentials. In the case of the EOCs, right now that collaboration

happens largely locally within campuses that have that particular resource on their campus so I know there's a lot of coordination at BMCC between those particular teams, the non-credit teams that are CUNY run and the SUNY team, because we don't want to have the case where particular leads or capacity or needs are not being met when two teams that can meet them sit right next to each other so we have been trying to improve that coordination.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you, Chairs, for the time, and thank you so much for your answers.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you, Council Member Williams. Council Member Riley.

COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Thank you, Chair Dinowitz and Chair Farías. Good afternoon, everyone. Just one question. Being that cannabis is going to be a market that's coming into New York City, I know Medgar Evans has a program there, but is CUNY looking to expand workforce development in cannabis? It's going to be a 5-billion-dollar business, and we want to make sure that everyone's as educated and has the same opportunities as everyone. My Colleague, Council Member Williams, she asked a question about the

corporations. I know you don't have a list, but are any of those corporations in cannabis or have any work to do with cannabis? Thank you.

DR. JANE MACKILLOP: I love your question because this is something that we're particularly interested in at Lehman. We've been following what's happened with the MRTA since it was passed in March 2021, and we started in January offering a certificate with a university in Canada since Canada is three to four years ahead of us. We are now offering training to small businesses who have received licenses. As you know, the process is the legacy entrepreneurs have applied for licenses, from the Bronx about 30 have been submitted through the Bronx Defenders who have been supporting the legacy entrepreneurs. Once they get their licenses, we anticipate that they would then come to Lehman to CUNY on the Concourse where they would have space support services, an address and so on, and we would help them with their business plans and with setting up their business, and we're doing that with a grant from the Department of Labor in conjunction with the Borough of Manhattan Community College which is doing training in three areas, in security guard, retail,



and processor, and we are working with a bunch of different organizations within the city, with state agencies, city agencies, all sorts of organizations such as the Bronx Community Foundation, as I said the Bronx Defenders, the Bronx Cannabis Hub, and various other CBOs, and at this point, as you know, the goal is that the rollout of the businesses on the recreational side will not be big businesses. The intention is that it will be small businesses so since that's one of our areas of expertise, we're looking to provide small business support so we have currently this relatively small grant of 200,000 a year for three years, but we're looking for other funding so we can expand this opportunity.

COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Is that 200,000 each or is that throughout...

DR. JANE MACKILLOP: Yeah, it's each year.

COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Oh, each year, okay.

DR. JANE MACKILLOP: And then BMCC has 400,000 for the training. Not a large grant but something that will become central for this pilot and that we would like to expand.

COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Would love to talk more and see if we could be some assistance but thank you so much for your answer. Thank you, Chair.

DR. JANE MACKILLOP: Thank you for your question.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you, Council Member Riley. I'd like to note we've been joined by Council Member Aviles.

Next is Council Member Kagan.

COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Thank you so much. First, I would like to comment on the statement by my Colleague, Council Member Charles Barron. He spent five minutes teaching everybody about socialism, capitalism so I came from a socialist country to America. I came from the former U.S.S.R. I lived in a country where we have huge lines for food and there was a big deficit of simple food so that's socialism, and I don't see huge immigration from America to socialist countries, a lot of people emigrating to Venezuela, North Korea, etc. I don't see this movement. That's number one.

Number two, talking about blacks and whites and everybody else. As you noticed, I'm a little bit white. I came to America with no money, no

English. This country created a huge opportunity for my family, and I'm a proud graduate of CUNY, of Baruch College. My son studied at Baruch College and then transferred to Vanderbilt University. My daughter is right now at CUNY College, Brooklyn College. This country gave us everything, and talking about diversity, CUNY is one of the most diverse bodies in the country. I know it as a former student, I know what I see in Brooklyn College particularly, and the topic of this hearing is workforce development. He did not even ask one question about workforce development. I believe this is the best way for all communities of New York City, and, by the way, this City Council is led by an African American Speaker, first time in the history of New York City we have an African American female Speaker, Adrienne Adams, so this Council represents everybody, every single community, and workforce development is very, very important.

My question is how do you partner with communities where all CUNY campuses and all CUNY colleges are located because just this week I talked to Kingsborough Community College in Southern Brooklyn, and I noticed that they do work in some

way, shape, or form, but they do not really partner with community organizations because they spend most of their time inside college, and, as you notice, communities are usually outside of colleges so do you have any program, how do you partner with community organizations to improve our workforce development for everybody? Thank you.

DR. JANE MACKILLOP: We're out there.

Thank you for this comment and for your question. The way that we partner, we think of ourselves at Lehman College School of Continuing and Professional Studies as a bridge. We're the bridge into the community. We go to community events. We're part and parcel of all that's going on in the Bronx and in Upper Manhattan and in Lower Westchester, and our goal is to be part of what's happening, whether it's a fall festival, whether it's a DOE conference, whatever it might be we're there in force to make sure that we know what's happening in the community, and that's how we do it. Our college is a Hispanic-serving institution, it's a minority-serving institution, we have about 55 percent Hispanic, about 35 percent African American and black students, and we reach out to all of those communities in all sorts of ways, shapes, and forms,

and that's what we see as our goal. Going back to the larger question about outreach, in addition to having the website and the catalogue and all of the social medial marketing, we also are part and parcel of what's going on in the Bronx and we're at everything.

COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Thank you. I believe that workforce development is the best way to help all communities. We need more partnership with community organizations, not just inside the office, but even outside the offices.

DR. JANE MACKILLOP: That's right.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you, Council Member Kagan. Council Member Aviles.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILES: Good afternoon. Apologies for missing the early part of the presentation. Forgive me if you have covered any part of this. I represent District 38 in South Brooklyn which includes the neighborhoods of Sunset Park and Red Hook which are waterfront communities with certainly at one point a very robust industrial waterfront. As we are reimagining our waterfront into a healthier, greener industry, one of the things obviously with the coming of the largest wind power in Sunset Park, one of the things we've identified

1 obviously is the workforce pathways to this new  
2 industry. I'd love to know how the EDC who has a  
3 pretty significant footprint in the district and CUNY  
4 is preparing for green re-industrialization in our  
5 communities.  
6

7 ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Sure. I'll  
8 come at a systems level, and then I know, Ken, you  
9 all are doing some work on this too.

10 Last month, for NYC Climate Week, we  
11 announced together with EDC, CUNY and EDC about 4  
12 million dollars of city investment in green energy  
13 jobs including offshore wind, and some of those  
14 investments, about 2.9 million I believe, was in the  
15 capital investments that are needed to build the  
16 infrastructure to do green workforce development. For  
17 instance, at Kingsborough Community College,  
18 investing in renovating CUNY's only seafaring vessel  
19 to do maintenance of offshore wind facilities so we  
20 are actively partnering with EDC to know what they  
21 are projecting will come into the area, how they are  
22 expecting to work with developers around jobs, and  
23 then we are actively investing to build that  
24 infrastructure as those jobs come in to make sure  
25 that folks can have access to them.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILES: Are these the  
resources that have been allocated through the Sunset  
Park Taskforce through the EDC or are these  
additional resources?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: I'd have to  
defer to them on that.

PRESIDENT ADAMS: Good afternoon. I can  
give you a local example. It's not specific, I  
apologize, to Sunset Park or Red Hook, but at least  
for Long Island City which has some of the similar  
opportunities. I would be remiss in mentioning this  
if I didn't thank our Council Member, the Honorable  
Julie Won, who represent LaGuardia, the Queens  
delegation, and, indeed, Speaker Adams for the  
capital funding we got in this current year budget  
which will enable us to build a climbing tower for  
training of people interested in careers in  
maintaining turbines and other offshore wind-  
generating equipment. This tower, you should see,  
CUNY doesn't normally build something like this. It's  
tricky and it's complicated, but we're going to do it  
and we're going to do it with support of Council  
Member Won and the rest of you, and that's because we  
have these opportunities with the repowering of

Ravenswood, the old Con Ed plant, under its new ownership, Rise Light and Power, which will be bidding on the NYSERDA contracts to be part of the supply system, we'll see if they win, right, but to be one of the points of contact for power generated offshore, and, should that happen at Sunset Park, obviously various places are bidding on this, but the answer is we, yes, are preparing training programs in cooperation with these organizations and NYSERDA and EDC for workforce opportunities in these green industries that are right before us.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILES: That's exciting, and I'd love to see it in District 38.

PRESIDENT ADAMS: If you're willing to put on a climbing harness and a helmet, we can get you up to the 30-foot platform at the top.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILES: Absolutely. I think we are a community, obviously, that has long memories of working on the industrial waterfront and so any opportunities to get our young people on track for those jobs, particularly when Equinor opens up the assembly, we absolutely would love those opportunities and certainly I'd be remised if I didn't say I would love to have a CUNY site in our



1 district so our residents don't have to travel so  
2 far, and I'd love it to be free, but, nevertheless,  
3 thank you for that investment. I think it is a  
4 serious one that we need to make sure that our young  
5 people and our residents currently who don't have, 40  
6 percent of our community don't even have a high  
7 school diploma but they have great technical  
8 abilities and these are perfect jobs for our health  
9 and well-being as an environmental justice community  
10 as well so thank you for that work, and I look  
11 forward to more specifics and climbing the tower  
12 apparently.  
13

14 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you, Council  
15 Member Aviles. I have two quick followups to the  
16 points co-Chair Fariás said. One is do students who  
17 are matriculated, not doing credit-bearing, just the  
18 training that you do, do they have access to the same  
19 food pantries and the same services like you have  
20 employees who help students access SNAP benefits,  
21 HRA, etc., do the people engaged in the workforce  
22 development and the certificates and micro-  
23 credentials, do they have the same access to those  
24 services as students who are otherwise full-time  
25 students?

PRESIDENT ADAMS: I want to hear the official answer before I give you the unofficial answer.

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: It varies, and we do not have a policy that says that those services must be made available to all non-degree-seeking students.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Can you make it a policy? I mean that's talking about some of the issues, food justice, food security, housing that we're so concerned about with full-time students. Couldn't those be made available to anyone who's engaged at CUNY regardless of whether they're full time or non-credit-bearing certificate, micro-credentials, what have you? Say yes.

PRESIDENT ADAMS: It's complicated. Sorry to put it that way. Where we raise the funds privately, for example donations to our LaGuardia Cares program for the food bank or housing, our LaGuardia Foundation, all the colleges have a 501(c)(3) foundation, a separate fundraising arm, so the funds we raise there, at least at LaGuardia, we use for all students. That's how we're able to provide scholarships for students who want to start

by learning ESL or getting a GED or get training, but those are privately raised funds. We just did a fundraising campaign this spring, we raised 15 million dollars, very generous donors, and we're doing that, but that's LaGuardia. Here's the complicated part. Students who are in degree programs, matriculated students, at least in a community college tuition is 2,400 dollars a semester plus fees. Those fees, like the student tech fee, come to the college and enable us to provide a certain amount of services to those degree students because they paid the fee. As an example, students in workforce training programs, non-credit students, don't pay the tech fees so there's some services we have to, the students paid the tuition whether that's their own cash or with financial aid, they're entitled to certain services and the students who haven't paid that full tuition and fees, you have to find other ways to provide. Now, there's a workaround. You want to go to the library; we'll let you in the library. There's plenty of things you can do, but our childcare facility, for example, the way they're funded means the first people who get to use them are those people who paid for them.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I'm referencing, you know, we had a hearing, I think it was our second hearing we had, was about these single-stop successor programs where it was a single-stop to access HRA benefits, other health benefits, apply for SNAP, apply for whatever, and you've since moved to a more dispersed model, but I would hope that central CUNY recognizes that students regardless of what program you're in, whether you're paying that fee or not, do need access to housing and the food pantry and also to other things in order to be successful in any other parts of their education.

The last question I have follows up on Chair Fariás' question about city workers. I guess when there's a private industry, it feels like the company has decided that this is the direction, this is the number of slots we need, there are vacancies in this particular field or these particular skills. In city government, there's often, let's say, disagreement between, for example, the Council and the administration as to the number of housing inspectors there needs to be or something or what we need more of in the city and where we should be focusing our efforts so when you working with the

1 city and when they are telling you the needs that  
2 they have, the city, who's sort of the final arbiter  
3 of what the needs are in New York City? Is it a  
4 holistic approach, listening to what we're saying  
5 about our local communities or is it the executive  
6 branch, the Mayoral administration kind of in  
7 finality telling CUNY, look, we need more of this  
8 field?  
9

10 ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: At this  
11 systems level, we have a couple of different ways  
12 that we approach that. One is, as I mentioned before,  
13 we do work with DCAS to understand what the actual  
14 hiring projections are, regardless of who decides who  
15 should be hired where. We also work with 16 agencies  
16 through our CUNY Internship program which means that  
17 we are directly working with the agencies to  
18 understand where they project to be needing to hire  
19 people and where they're seeing vacancies, where they  
20 would really like to bring people in. We also have  
21 separate efforts through something called the Edward  
22 T. Rogowski Program to work directly with Council  
23 Members and other legislative bodies like Assembly  
24 Members or State Senate Members to ensure that we are  
25 helping to get folks into their offices, but the

decision-making apparatus, we sort of are much more technical on the ground to understand from the agencies directly who they anticipate hiring.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay. That answers my question actually. Chair Farías, do you have anything else?

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: I just have one quick one. I know coming from the non-profit side, whenever we did registered apprenticeships with like the Department of Labor, it also went all the way up to state, federal government and there were training dollars that we would get back as a non-profit organization for every single hour we were training people in whatever sector. Does CUNY have a stream of funding that is connected that way for any of the job training that you do or the unionized upskilling or curriculums you are training folks for?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: I'll let my colleagues who are directly working with unions talk about their arrangements there. We do have state funding streams that come to CUNY every single year. It's about 5.88 total...

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: And that's like a dollar-to-dollar match or something like that?

ASSOCIATE PROVOST ANDERSON: Actually, those are usually structured as a straight-out grant, not a matching grant, but those are the kinds of programs, one of them is for apprenticeships, that we leverage to help our campuses do that work.

PRESIDENT ADAMS: Chair Farías, I would add that the unions themselves are good indicators of workforce need. In other words, if you take the training and employment fund of SEIU 1199 which is a very big and sophisticated and well-funded workforce training organization, because they are on the ground at all the healthcare providers across the city with their members working in those organizations, they know where the training needs are and can often tell us in CUNY, again the leadership of these training funds, I mentioned the cafeteria workers from DC37, they're very good at letting us know where they see changes in the municipal workforce for their members because they're having retirements or because there are new opportunities so I think there's sort of three levels here. One is, yes, CUNY is so well-positioned to do workforce training for positions and good jobs and careers all across city government, you've got DCAS, you've got civil service, the agency

level employers in the civil service system which can make things complicated, and finally, of course, importantly you've got the unions as the intermediary and they really have a sense of where the needs are. If I can just make sort of one suggestion or an observation, it goes back to the idea of get on your phone and google the question of getting job training. Google the question of working for the Department of Sanitation or something. For someone who's not familiar with getting a city job, like many of our students, first gen immigrants, it can be really complicated to sort of figure out how do I get a job at a city agency, and I often question some of the credential requirements across government. I think most of you are familiar with this and we spoke about it at the recent CUF conference, Governor Larry Hogan this summer down in Maryland took I think 300 or 400 state job titles that always had required a baccalaureate degree and threw that requirement out the window, which opened up several thousand jobs to people in Maryland who only had associates degree or high school diplomas. They could now apply for these jobs in Maryland government because he just removed that barrier. He said you don't need a bachelors



1 degree for this particular position, and I think a  
2 scrubbing of credential requirements across city  
3 jobs, we might see opportunities to reduce barriers  
4 to employment for many, many people in this city if  
5 they could indeed do the job without a baccalaureate  
6 degree or a traditional credential, even an associate  
7 degree.  
8

9 DR. JANE MACKILLOP: I'd like to give you  
10 a couple examples from Lehman program that we have  
11 with 1199. When 1199 needs some short-term quick  
12 training, they come to us for us to do some kind of  
13 an upgrade, for example, patient care technician or  
14 something like that, so we might have a relatively  
15 small grant to serve, let's say, 60 union members  
16 with particular training, but we also have a sort of  
17 bridge program whereby union members can come into  
18 our Adult Degree Program and you should've got a copy  
19 of It's Never Too Late to Earn a Degree so they come  
20 into our Adult Degree Program and then, if they've  
21 got some credits already, then they're going to  
22 finish their degree. If not, they'll start as  
23 freshmen. We have quite a large grant with them to  
24 facilitate all of that.  
25

I'm going to throw out a wrinkle that we haven't talked about, undocumented New Yorkers, and we would have a whole lot more people in jobs if we didn't require them to be documented. I believe that in California this is currently under discussion as to whether people are required to be documented to get to be employed so I'm just throwing that out there because that's the sort of thing that really affects database management, if you require people to have a Social Security Number to be in a database so that you can track outcomes. If they don't, then you're going to lose those people. Either they won't enroll for that grant-funded training or you're going to simply not have them there, and that's one of the attractions of tuition-based training programs is that you're not required to give anybody your Social Security Number. That's just kind of food for thought. Since you've given us a huge amount to think about, I'm lobbing the ball back to you.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you for that. I think that's a very timely thing to bring up, and I appreciate you bringing it to the forefront, undocumented workers, especially with what we're seeing with the migrant asylum seekers that are

coming into the city and work authorizations and how  
at all levels of government right now we really have  
to work together to expedite for people's safety and  
just living standards, but I appreciate that and we  
will take that back and think about our own homework  
to work on, but thank you for entertaining my last  
question.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I would like to  
thank this panel for presenting and for answering our  
questions, and I want to thank you for your time.  
Thank you very much.

The next panel will be called.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The Committee now  
calls Dwana Franklin-Davis, Siobahn Cavanaugh  
(phonetic), and John Williams.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Please make sure to  
introduce yourself before you begin your testimony.  
Thank you.

DWANA FRANKLIN-DAVIS: Dwana Franklin-  
Davis, CEO of Reboot Representation. Good afternoon,  
Chairpersons Dinowitz and Fariás and other Members of  
the Committee on Higher Education and Committee on  
Economic Development.

Thank you for the opportunity to provide testimony before you on workforce development opportunities at the City University of New York. My name is Dwana Franklin-Davis. I am the CEO of Reboot Representation. We are a coalition of 21 companies in the technology space with the mission to double the number of Black, Latina, and Native American women graduating with computing degrees by 2025.

The coalition was born on the heels of a report that identified the lack of investment in Black, Latina, and Native American women graduating with computing degrees. For brevity, we use say BLNA as the acronym. In 2017, we surveyed 32 technology companies. Those organizations represented 500 billion in revenue, 500 million in philanthropic giving, and they were only spending 5 percent of that funding on women and girls in tech. Less than 0.1 percent went to Black, Latina, and Native American women and girls in tech. In 2017, that 0.1 percent was 335,000 dollars. That's it. We also examined who was graduating with computing degrees through the National Center for Education Statistics Classification of Instructional Programs, also known as CIP, and Code 11, which represents Computing and

Information Sciences and Support Services. BLNA women represented 4 percent of the graduating population, and that number was down by nearly 33 percent over the previous decade, and that number also was not projected to double to 8 percent until the year 2052 without interventions. The companies that participate in the coalition know that no one company created the inequities that we see in tech today, and no one company can fix it alone. The power of their collective action and pooled investment through the coalition allow us to invest in nonprofit programs and initiatives while making systemic changes that will impact the least represented in the technology space.

As our country and city continue to recover from the pandemic and as we brace for the looming recession, CUNY is prime to focus on workforce development and enable our citizens not only to thrive but also help New York lead the global economy. The last two years have shown all of us that tech transcends industry and that all pathways through the schools should reflect that. The diversity of CUNY schools and their programs should reflect the communities that they serve and the rich

diversity of this city. In order to understand the  
baseline foundation and design program and  
initiatives with this goal in mind, CUNY must collect  
and disaggregate data by both race and gender at the  
very least and treating students not as a monolith  
but providing programs that will serve the masses.  
Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you very  
much.

JOHN WILLIAMS: John Williams, CEO of Reel  
Works and Siobahn, we're going to do this together.  
We're going to share our time.

My name is John Williams. I am the  
cofounder and CEO of Reel Works, a Brooklyn-based  
youth arts and career development non-profit that has  
mentored and trained thousands of young New York  
filmmakers citywide through in-school, after school,  
CASA, and workforce programs over 20 years.

Today, our testimony is about MediaMKRS,  
Reel Works partnership with the Mayor's Office of  
Media, Entertainment and CUNY to build a media  
workforce that reflects the talent, diversity, and  
drive of New York City.

SIOBAHN CAVANAUGH: My name is Siobahn Cavanaugh, and I am the Career Exploration Program Manager of MediaMKRS overseeing our internship program, which will place 100 CUNY students into paid media internships in 2023.

JOHN WILLIAMS: Through MediaMKRS, CUNY students explore a career through multiple paid internships over a two-to-three-year period combined with workforce readiness training, one-on-one coaching, and industry backed credentials. We partner with over 80 employers including major studios like Paramount, Warner Bros, Discover, NBC Universal, Netflix, and Amazon. What began as a work readiness initiative has become a jobs program with 87 percent of our graduates securing employment within 12 months of graduation. Today, we are exploring, seeking, asking for new funding to expand MediaMKRS to reach an additional 100 CUNY students annually.

SIOBAHN CAVANAUGH: To date, MediaMKRS has served 154 CUNY students from 17 campuses who have completed nearly 300 paid internships. Students like Freda Gonzalez, a Brooklyn College Student who wanted to work in media but was not sure where to start. Freda joined MediaMKRS in 2020. In a year and a half,

1 she experienced three internships, starting with  
2 small production companies and finally landing at a  
3 global media company, RadicalMedia. Throughout these  
4 internships, Freda attended classes in workforce  
5 readiness training, received one-on-one coaching on  
6 how to interview for jobs, and attended career  
7 roundtables to learn about all of the different jobs  
8 in the entertainment industry. When she graduated,  
9 she was still very nervous about finding a job, but,  
10 thanks to MediaMKRS, Freda has knowledge, experience,  
11 a resume of success, and a network of professionals  
12 in the industry to help her land a full-time job as a  
13 production assistant at Showtime last year. Freda is  
14 one of 30 CUNY MediaMKRS students who entered the  
15 workforce this past year, 87 percent of whom are  
16 working fulltime at companies like Showtime,  
17 Paramount, Disney, and Warner Bros Discovery for  
18 starting salaries ranging from 30 to 60 grand.

19  
20 JOHN WILLIAMS: MediaMKRS works. This  
21 year, the Mayor's Office has renewed its support,  
22 will enable 100 CUNY students like Freda to explore  
23 careers in media entertainment. We're looking to  
24 double that number. We're currently seeking to raise  
25 350,000 dollars to pay internships and add an



additional Internship Coordinator to serve a total of  
200 CUNY students this year. Our three-year  
partnership with CUNY has proven the effectiveness of  
our approach, and we look forward to expanding our  
reach to provide opportunities for talented young New  
Yorkers to explore careers in New York City's 82-  
billion-dollar entertainment industry.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Just a quick followup  
question. Here, you have in your testimony that the  
Mayor's Office renewed its support enabling 100  
students to be a part of MediaMKRS. What's that  
budgetary amount? What's the allocation for 100?

JOHN WILLIAMS: It's about 400,000  
roughly. It splits between Reel Works and CUNY. Reel  
Works gets the funding that pays for the salaries,  
and CUNY gets about half the funding to pay for a  
staff member and wraparound support based in Brooklyn  
College. The program is moving from CUNY Central to  
Brooklyn College this year.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay, and the 350,000  
that you're seeking, it would be a total pot split  
between Reel Works and CUNY or 350,000 for Reel Works  
to expand the program?

JOHN WILLIAMS: I was thinking directly to Reel Works. It would allow us to hire for less money frankly and put more money into the pockets of the students to make sure they get their experience.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Can both of you, great pair, I loved the script, it was great, it was like a whole routine, so you spoke about the collaboration with CUNY in terms of serving CUNY students. Miss Franklin-Davis, can you please speak about not just the work you do but how you collaborate with CUNY or CUNY collaborates with you to help you and provide the services you provide?

DWANA FRANKLIN-DAVIS: Sure. We don't actually collaborate with CUNY yet.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Can you talk a little more about that?

DWANA FRANKLIN-DAVIS: Reboot with our mission is specific to serving Black, Latina, and Native American women because they are the least represented in the tech population, and Reboot was launched in 2018. An early program that we funded was called Women in Technology New York, now called Breakthrough Tech New York which is a program that

came out of CUNY or in collaboration with CUNY. We did fund that, but it is very challenging from our perspective to be able to work with the CUNY schools because we need data and we're big on being able to collect and disaggregate that as we want to focus on the least represented in the population and so at this point in time there hasn't been a program that we've been able to fund.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: It sounds like you're asking for the same thing that we were asking.

DWANA FRANKLIN-DAVIS: I'm sorry. Can you...

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I said it sounds like you have similar concerns that we on the Committee had earlier when we were asking for certain data points and how it's disaggregated by race, gender, ethnicity, etc., but is that the only holdup, making sure that you can address your mission, because CUNY doesn't disaggregate the data, it's difficult for you to do the work that you're seeking to do. Is the data the only holdup?

DWANA FRANKLIN-DAVIS: It also takes real partnership and collaboration so data is one because Reboot is funded from corporations and so that's the funding that we use to give to non-profit

institutions and so we have to report back to them.

We also, because we're big on data, work with a measurement and the evaluation firm, and, with regards to that, there's obviously some data privacy in sharing (INAUDIBLE) we have to agree on in order to be able to say what data can we share. Obviously, not identifying students is something that's key and important. In addition to that, more than 75 percent of the funding that we provide for our program or initiative needs to go towards BLNA women, and so I think that also could be challenging for CUNY to say how many BLNA women are in a specific program or a pathway that can be supported by an initiative.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I'm certainly interested in, after this hearing, talking with you more, and CUNY, as they're developing their data system and collecting this important data should probably be listening to the people who are doing the difficult work of workforce development so we should certainly discuss after the hearing kind of as CUNY is building from the ground up, the valuable data that they can centralize and collect. I want to thank you for joining the panel and thank you for your testimony today.

DWANA FRANKLIN-DAVIS: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The Committee will now  
call Priscilla Trieu and Chouaib Fadili.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Welcome and would  
you just please state your name before you start your  
testimony? Thank you.

PRISCILLA TRIEU: Good afternoon. My name  
is Priscilla Trieu, and I am currently a senior at  
Queens College. I am double majoring in psychology  
and communication sciences and disorders with a minor  
in linguistics. After I graduate in December, I plan  
to pursue a master's degree in speech pathology. In  
the future, I would like to serve my local community  
by delivering speech therapy to children with speech  
and language delays and developmental disabilities  
and supporting their families. Prior to CUNY Career  
Launch, it was difficult for me to find a job  
relevant to my job without much related work  
experience. However, through CUNY Career Launch, I  
had a paid internship in the healthcare field of my  
choice, which also allowed me to develop lasting  
connections and a stronger professional network. The  
Career Launch program has played an instrumental role  
in my success and has propelled my professional

career by providing with an internship at an early intervention agency as well as professional development, financial literacy, and mental wellness workshops. During my internship, I learned about the professional expectations, paperwork, and billing processes that the field of speech language pathology entails. I believe this knowledge will help me to become a well-rounded clinician in the future. Career Launch has also led me to my current employment position where I will be working as an administrative assistant for another CUNY internship program, the Spring Forward program at LaGuardia Community College. The support I've received from CUNY Career Launch has been unmatched, and I m extremely grateful for the opportunity that I was given this past summer. I truly hope that the program continues in the future so that other undergraduate students may have those opportunities as well. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you so much.

CHOUAIB FADILI: Hi, everybody. My name is Chouaib Fadili, and I'm at Kingsborough Community College studying. My major is business administration. Actually I moved to New York three years ago, and, when I moved here, I didn't speak no

English, and I had to learn by my own. Actually, from my friend, I've learned about one of the programs that CUNY offered which is CLIP program, CUNY Language Immersion Program, which helped me a lot in terms of improving my language, specifically academic language when it comes to reading books and writing essays, and I believe, thanks to this program, I've literally improved my English to the point that I didn't struggle when I took my credit classes and also I get A pluses on both my English classes. Last summer, thanks to CUNY, I had the chance to be part of the Career Launch program which gave me an opportunity to apply what I'm learning about business in a real experience, and I've had the chance to intern in the Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce. I was working with a team that we were working on helping small businesses to improve throughout the borough. I had the experience to attend different meetings. Just because it was my first internship and it was my first office job, I've never had an office job experience, it was a great chance for me to learn how to be in a meeting and how to participate and how to engage in a professional conversation. Also, we were doing field trips to different businesses where I had

to engage with business owners and speak to them about the program and what the program offered, like the different resources, so actually this was a great chance for me to get out of the class experience. I feel like I'm a business person in reality, not just doing homework, like when I was taking classes it was more like taking classes, doing homework, and that's it, but thanks to this internship to practice and learn a lot of skills and I do hope these kinds of opportunities keep happening because, especially like me as an immigrant and somebody who didn't speak English when I moved here, we do need these opportunities so we could succeed in the future. Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you so much for your testimony and congratulations. Really looking forward to see what the two of you do in the future. Thank you so much.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Our next panelist is Gerarda Shields.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Whenever you're ready.



GERARDA SHIELDS: My name is Gerarda Shields. I'm the Dean of the School of Technology and Design at City Tech, where we're over 6,000 strong.

Good afternoon, Members of the Committee on Economic Development, Committee on Higher Education, my fellow CUNY colleagues, and engaged community stakeholders.

To share a tagline that my Communications Design colleague, Professor Douglas Davis coined, City Tech is the Public Path to Possible. Our industry partners and employers celebrate our diversity and our unique program offerings. For example, the American Institute of Architects, AIA, Brooklyn proudly featured our first graduating class of Architecture students in their fall 2022 publication of Pylon, which you have a selection of as part of your packet, and the diversity speaks for itself, or you should have a copy of the packet. I can flip forward and show you it is there.

Since 2010, New York State Department of Transportation has hired over 150 City interns through their Transportation Construction Inspectors program. Last year, 35 City Tech interns were hired,

and that was 46 percent of the total hired by DOT,  
and, Chair Fariás, you had mentioned, I'm going off  
script for a second, you had mentioned adjacency, of  
those 35 students, 17 found full-time employment  
through the contractors and the consultants that DOT  
was working with so it was that exposure. Again, they  
were hired because we offer certifications through  
continuing ed that our other sibling organizations  
don't offer such as the ACI and OSHA.

Our reach goes beyond the built  
environment and into the digital experience. City  
Tech answers the call of Industry 4.0 with offerings  
in cyber security, cloud computing, additive  
manufacturing, augmented reality, big data and  
analytics, autonomous robots, and simulation.

We all need to reframe how we view  
digital technology because it permeates all  
industries and professions. Our technology can do  
the work faster, more efficiently and precisely, and  
retains a wealth of knowledge, and if you don't  
believe just ask Alexa. So, what is it that we as  
humans still bring to the table? Creativity, critical  
thinking, and craft. For over a decade now, we have  
worked in partnership with the Brooklyn Navy Yard to

support their 500 plus businesses in the technology and industry sectors. Nearly 200 of our students are employed in various capacities at the Navy Yard annually. On behalf of City Tech, please allow me to express our gratitude to the Council for their most recent financial support to strengthen this collaboration with the Navy Yards talent.

EY recognized the importance of technology and finance at AP Anderson mentioned this earlier. Last year, EY piloted an internship program with our computer information systems associate students which resulted in full-time hire.

Just this week, our Construction Management and Civil Engineering Technology Department hosted their annual jobs fair, and there was no shortage of job opportunities for the 200 students and the 25 employers from the public and private sectors. City Tech's ties to the local economy are strong, and we want to ensure we continue to serve its workforce development needs.

Thank you for the opportunity to address you today and for your continued support in making City Tech and all CUNY the Public Path to Possible. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you. City  
Tech is a Hispanic-serving institution?

GERARDA SHIELDS: Absolutely. Actually, we  
are celebrating our 25th year as a Hispanic-serving  
institution with 34 percent of our students being  
Hispanic descent and 28 percent being black.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And what does that  
mean in terms of equity? I know we're asking a lot  
about data, but what does it mean to you and to the  
College as it relates to data and results in terms of  
equity.

GERARDA SHIELDS: Something of interest,  
what makes City Tech in the CUNY system is that we  
offer, in particular, engineering technology  
programs, which is often a gateway for many of our  
underserved minorities, particularly our black and  
Hispanic students. Complete total segue in terms of  
topic. One of the challenges that we are facing, and  
this is actually at the State level and myself and a  
number of other campuses but also SUNY campuses, are  
working with state government to recognize that the  
engineering technology credential, which is  
accredited nationally just as engineering programs  
are, don't receive the same type of equity in terms

of professional licensure and access to promotion because it's labeled engineering technology, but it's really just more a different application of the degree so many of our students tend to, DOT is a perfect example, they tend to work in the government sector, they have very applications-based, on the ground types of jobs that are in the engineering disciplines, and they can go on for licensure, and actually the DOT requires that eventually. Our sibling school, City College, offers the traditionally engineering degree, and, because certain licensing requirements are different so our engineering technology students don't have access to the license until two years after our engineering counterparts so this is something that we've been trying to fight for, to say that in terms of equity because most of our students do fall under that population, one of my colleagues did a calculation and 40,000 dollars of salary is lost because of that gap and the ability just to get licensed. I don't know if that quite answers your question, but what we're trying to do is find equity in terms of our programs that very much serve our Hispanic and black students and something we're continuing to work on.

If I can find the legislation, I could pass it to you that's currently in the process of being passed, where they're trying to change the language from just candidates can approach licensure or are eligible for licensure, and right now it explicitly says only engineering, and we're trying to add the words and engineering technology because we have the STEAM Center High School in the Navy Yard, we have City Poly, we have P-Tech, we have all of these programs that are articulating directly into City Tech's programs, and we want to be able to provide those employment opportunities for them.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you for that and would be very much interested in that legislation. Thank you so much for your testimony today.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now call Zoom panelist Eli Dvorkin.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts now.

ELI DVORKIN: Hello. Can you see and hear me okay?

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: We sure can.

ELI DVORKIN: Terrific. Good afternoon.  
My name is Eli Dvorkin. I help run the Center for an

Urban Future. We're an independent research organization focused on building a stronger and more equitable economy in New York. I thank you so much for the opportunity to testify today.

I'm here to talk about one key aspect of CUNY's role in developing New York City's future workforce as a launchpad into the city's fast growing technology sector. Over the past decade, the city's tech sector has added 114,000 jobs, becoming the city's most consistent source of new middle- and high-wage employment, but even as demand surges New Yorkers of color and women remain strikingly underrepresented in the city's tech workforce. Fortunately, no institution is better positioned to help expand access to tech careers than CUNY. CUNY graduates nearly 4,000 students each year with technology degrees, more than any other university in the city. Approximately half of these students are black and/or Hispanic, and most come from households earning less than 40,000 per year. However, New York has only just begun to harness CUNY's remarkable potential to serve as the city's largest and most equitable springboard into tech. Today, most tech companies in the city employ few, if any, CUNY grads.

Just half of all CUNY computer science grads over the past five years were employed in computing jobs one year after graduation, and these graduates earn about 31 percent less than the average worker in the same computing occupations. One key reason for this is CUNY's internship gap, just 10 percent of all CUNY students report participating in a paid internship during their college careers. Fortunately, New York City has launched several successful programs that are helping CUNY students pursue degrees and break into the tech sectors, but these initiatives still serve only a fraction of the students who could benefit. For example, CUNY students who participate in the city's Tech Talent Pipeline Residency Internship Program are more than three times as likely to secure a full-time job after graduation as their peers. However, the program has only reached about 750 students over the past five years. CUNY's highly successful Tech Prep Program serves just 170 students annually, and the 20-million-dollar CUNY2X Tech Initiative which succeeded in doubling the number of students earning tech bachelor's degrees has only reached 7 of 25 colleges so far, and the funding expires this year. Our research finds that



most CUNY colleges have no more than two or three  
career counselors per 10,000 students.

What can city officials do? In the coming  
days, the Center for an Urban Future will be  
publishing a new report entirely focused on  
harnessing this opportunity, but, for now, please  
allow me to mention three specific recommendations.

One, build on the track record of CUNY2X  
Tech and launch a new CUNY Tech Success Initiative to  
sustain and scale all of these effective but small-  
scale efforts.

Two, support a major expansion of career  
services and employer relation staff at every CUNY  
college with the goal of bringing down the sky-high  
ratios of counselors to students and making CUNY much  
more accessible to employers.

Three, partner with tech industry leaders  
and current intermediaries to launch 2,500 new paid  
tech industry internships with a focus on recruiting  
from CUNY.

For more, check out all of our research  
at [nycfuture.org](http://nycfuture.org) and thank you all so much for the  
opportunity to testify today.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Perfect timing.

Thank you very much. I don't think we have any  
questions from the Committee. I want to thank you for  
your testimony.

I'd like to ask is there anyone else in  
the gallery who would like to testify today.

Seeing none, I want to thank you. I want  
to thank my co-Chair, Chair Farías, for co-Chairing  
this really important hearing with me about workforce  
development and CUNY.

With that, we are adjourned. [GAVEL]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date 10/29/2022