

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,

AND DISPOSITIONS 1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
SITINGS, AND DISPOSITIONS

----- X

October 6, 2022
Start: 10:27 a.m.
Recess: 10:56 a.m.

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Farah N. Louis, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Carmen N. De La Rosa
Christopher Marte
Sandy Nurse
Sandra Ung
Erik D. Bottcher
Althea V. Stevens

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,
AND DISPOSITIONS 2

A P P E A R A N C E S

Winifred Campbell, Deputy Director for Bronx
Planning Office at HPD

Rosa Kelly, Executive Director for Government
Affairs at HPD

Sandra Erickson, Sandra Erickson Real Estate
Mary Ellen Cooper, OCV Architects

Rosa Negron, Neighborhood Restore, Restored Homes

Ted Weinstein, Director of Bronx Planning at HPD

Ryan Moroz, Deputy Director of New Construction
Finance at HPD

Brittany Spence, Administrative Assistant at HPD

Josh Weissman, JCAL Development

1
2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS ONE: Mic check, mic
3 check. This is a mic check for the Committee on
4 Landmarks, Public Sitings, and Dispositions. Today's
5 date is October 6, 2022, located in the Committee
6 Room. Recording done by Pedro Lugo.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS TWO: Good morning,
8 everyone. Welcome to today's New York City Council
9 hearing on the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public
10 Sitings, and Dispositions.

11 At this time, can everyone please silence
12 your cellphones?

13 If you wish to submit testimony, you may
14 send it to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Again,
15 that's landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

16 If you wish to testify at today's
17 hearing, you can go up to the Sergeant's desk and
18 fill out a testimony slip.

19 Thank you for your cooperation. Chair, we
20 are ready to begin.

21 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: [GAVEL] Good morning.
22 I'm Council Member Farah Louis, Chair of the
23 Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings, and
24 Dispositions.

2 I am joined today by my Colleagues,
3 Council Members De La Rosa, Bottcher, Nurse, Ung, and
4 Marte.

5 Today, we will conduct votes and hold
6 public hearings on a number of items, but, before we
7 begin, I will recognize the Subcommittee Counsel to
8 explain today's hearing procedures.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Thank you, Chair
10 Louis. I am Arthur Huh, Counsel to the Subcommittee.

11 This meeting is being held in a hybrid
12 format. Members of the public who wish to testify may
13 do so in-person or via Zoom. Those wishing to testify
14 by Zoom for today's hearings were asked to register
15 online. If you have registered to testify and are not
16 yet signed into Zoom, please do so now and remain
17 signed in until after you have testified.

18 If you wish to testify via Zoom and have
19 not yet registered, please do so by visiting
20 www.council.nyc.gov/landuse and sign up now.

21 If you have written testimony that you
22 would like the Subcommittee to consider in addition
23 to instead of appearing before the Subcommittee or if
24 you require an accessible version of a presentation
25 given at today's meeting, please send an email to

landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Please indicate the
LU number and/or project name in the subject line of
the email.

Lastly, there may be extended pauses as
we encounter technical problems. We ask that you
please be patient as we work through any issues.

Chair Louis will now continue with
today's agenda.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you. I want to
first note that LU numbers 113 and 114 related to the
Gateway Site 26-A and Phase 5 Proposal will be
deferred and taken up at an upcoming meeting.

We will now vote to approve LUs 104
through 107 relating to the 705 10th Avenue DEP site
redevelopment proposal in Council Member Bottcher's
District in Manhattan. The proposal would facilitate
the development of a new eight-story mixed-use
building with approximately 157 units of affordable
housing, ground-floor community facility space, and a
publicly accessible open space to be operated by New
York City Department of Parks and Recreation. Council
Member Bottcher is in support of this proposal.

We will also vote to approve LUs 108 and
109 for the Cambria Heights 222nd Street and 227th

1 Street Historic District designations respectively in
2 Council Member Williams' District in Queens. Council
3 Member Williams is in support of these two Historic
4 District designations and has asked me to make a
5 statement on behalf, which I will now read.

7 "I am proud to support the designation of
8 two blocks in my District through today's vote on the
9 Cambria Heights 222nd and 227th Street Historic
10 Districts. Historic Districts are especially
11 important in black and brown communities, and I hope
12 more Historic Districts in Eastern Queens will be
13 designated in the coming years. These blocks were
14 developed in the early 1930s and are well-preserved
15 and are architecturally distinctive within the
16 Cambria Heights neighborhood. They stand out with
17 their whimsical and imaginative storybook style and
18 as examples of black and Caribbean homeownership. The
19 history of the black and brown communities has long
20 been ignored. I would like to thank the Landmarks
21 Preservation Commission for their equitable approach
22 to making our rich history visible because our
23 history is New York City's history. I urge my
24 Colleagues on the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public
25 Sitings, and Dispositions to join me in supporting

1
2 this designation and to vote yes to preserve the
3 unique part of New York City's history."

4 That concludes Council Member Williams'
5 statement.

6 I'd like to take this time to recognize
7 Council Member Bottcher or any of the Committee
8 Members who have any questions or remarks. I don't
9 know, Council Member Bottcher, if you have remarks
10 that you want to share today.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: Sure. Just want
12 to thank you, Chair Louis and all my fellow Committee
13 Members. Today, we're voting on an eight-story 100
14 percent affordable building that will provide 157
15 permanently affordable units. It's being built over
16 the rail cuts off of 49th and 10th in Hell's Kitchen.
17 It will also include a community arts and culture
18 facility, a public comfort station that is accessible
19 from a DEP-owned public space. In the last 24 hours,
20 we were able to get more family-sized units added to
21 the formerly homeless category, and we also were able
22 to get more assurances from DEP that the green space
23 will remain as green space for the community.

24 I want to thank my staff, Counsel, Land
25 Use, Community Board 4, Douglaston, and the Actors

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, AND
DISPOSITIONS

8

2 Fund, HPD, and the administration for working with us
3 to bring this project to fruition.

4 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you. Do any
5 Members want to provide remarks or have any
6 questions? No? Great.

7 I now call for a vote to approve LUs 104,
8 105, 106, and 107 for the 705 10th Avenue DEP site
9 redevelopment proposal and LU 108 for the Cambria
10 Heights 222nd Street Historic District and LU 109 for
11 the Cambria Heights 227th Street Historic District.

12 Counsel, please call the roll.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Chair Louis.

14 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: I vote aye.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Council Member De
16 La Rosa.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Aye.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Council Member
19 Marte.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Aye.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Council Member
22 Nurse.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Aye.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Council Member
25 Ung.

COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Aye.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Chair, the vote currently stands at five in the affirmative, zero in the negative, and no abstentions. We will keep the vote open in the event other Subcommittee Members join.

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you and congratulations, Council Member Bottcher and Council Member Williams.

I now open a public hearing on LUs 119 through 124 covering a number of applications put forth by HPD relating to property in the Bronx Council Districts represented by Chair Riley and Council Member Stevens and Council Member Sanchez.

We will be holding simultaneous hearings for three projects, all being put forth by HPD in coordination with the same development team as part of a scattered-site project and being financed together.

As an overview, the three projects known as Morris Heights NCP under LUs 119 and 120, Morrisania Open Door under LUs 121 and 122, and Morrisania Claremont Village Open Door under LUs 123 and 124. Each include requests for UDAAP designation

2 and project approvals as well as approval for the
3 disposition of city-owned property as well as a real
4 property tax exemption pursuant to Article 11 of the
5 Private Housing Finance Law. In addition, the
6 Morrisania Claremont Village Open Door project also
7 seeks approval for UDAP tax exemptions. We will be
8 hearing combined testimony from the project team
9 breaking down these three projects, but I just want
10 to note in closing that in total the projects will
11 facilitate the development of up to 75 units in a mix
12 of affordable homeownership and rental units across
13 the sites.

14 Now, we will hear a comprehensive
15 presentation from the project team from all three
16 projects and then we'll go into questions as needed
17 from the affected Members project by project. This is
18 complicated. That's what all that means. There are a
19 lot of details to go over here, and I just want to
20 remind everyone as appropriate to be clear about
21 which sites or projects are being addressed, whether
22 it's through Subcommittee questions and discussions
23 or through public testimony.

24 With that, I also want to remind everyone
25 that's wishing to testify remotely on these items, if

2 you have not already done so you must register online
3 and you may do that now by visiting our Council
4 website at council.nyc.gov/landuse.

5 At this time, I would now like to take a
6 moment to acknowledge all my Colleagues, Council
7 Members Stevens who is remote, Sanchez, and Riley if
8 any of them are available to provide remarks at this
9 time.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Yes. I would like
11 to provide remarks.

12 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: All right, you can
13 start, Council Member.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Good morning,
15 everyone. I wanted to make sure that I stopped in
16 just to say how strongly I support this project.
17 Especially throughout the Bronx, this is about
18 diversity, and often we don't have options for
19 homeownership in my District. This project, although
20 all of it is not in my District, the bulk of it is in
21 my District, and this would provide co-ops and two-
22 family homes which is desperately needed in my
23 community and promotes homeownership which leads to
24 generational wealth.
25

2 I also want to just give a special
3 shoutout because not only is this project being led
4 by a woman developer, which I also think is also
5 important that we continue to have diversity in the
6 developers that we're working in partnership, I
7 believe HPD has done a great job with working with me
8 to help me understand this project and all the things
9 so I'm really excited about this. This is something
10 that has been in the working for a very long time. It
11 was part of the Jerome Avenue redistricting so I just
12 want to shout out to my predecessor who worked really
13 hard to promote homeownership in this District and
14 now we are seeing it come to fruition, and I am in
15 full support of this project. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you, Council
17 Member.

18 Counsel, if you could call the first
19 panel for this item?

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: The applicant
21 panel includes Winifred Campbell and Rosa Kelly of
22 HPD along with Sandra Erickson, Mary Ellen Cooper,
23 and Rosa Negrón as project and team partners. Also
24 available for Q and A today, I believe we have Ted
25 Weinstein, Ryan Moroz, and Brittany Spence, all with

2 HPD, and Josh Weissman of JCAL Development Group.

3 We'll note that Ted Weinstein and Winifred Campbell
4 are joining us remotely I believe.

5 WINIFRED CAMPBELL: This is Winifred
6 Campbell. Should I begin the presentation?

7 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: We'll call on you at
8 some point. You can mute for now.

9 WINIFRED CAMPBELL: Okay. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: All right. Thank you.
11 Counsel, please administer the affirmation.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Panelists, would
13 you all please raise right hand, and I will call on
14 each one of you individually to answer the following.

15 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
16 whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your
17 testimony before this Subcommittee and in answer to
18 all Council Member questions? Rosa Kelly.

19 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR KELLY: Yes.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Sandra Erickson.

21 SANDRA ERICKSON: Yes.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Rosa Negron.

23 ROSA NEGRON: Yes.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Mary Ellen Cooper.

25 MARY ELLEN COOPER: Yes.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Winifred Campbell.

3 DEPUTY DIRECTOR CAMPBELL: Yes.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Do we have Ted
5 Weinstein? All right. That's it. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you, everyone.

7 For the viewing public, if you need an accessible
8 version of today's presentation, please send an email
9 request to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

10 Panelists, please restate your name and
11 organization for the record as you begin, and, if one
12 of you would please also let us know when you would
13 like to begin showing your presentation, our staff
14 will display that on the screen. You may all begin.

15 DEPUTY DIRECTOR CAMPBELL: Good morning,
16 again. This is Winifred Campbell. I'm representing
17 HPD, and we are ready to show our PowerPoint
18 presentation.

19 Thank you so much. Good morning, Chair
20 Louis and Council Members. The project that we're
21 presenting to you this morning is the Morrisania-
22 Morris Heights Cluster as already has been stated.
23 Next slide, please.

24 This cluster is a scattered site
25 proposal, and it spans six Bronx Community Districts

1
2 and four Council Districts. The project was a winning
3 proposal in a Request for Qualifications that invited
4 applicants to submit proposals to develop clusters of
5 small scattered infill sites that were otherwise too
6 small or too difficult to develop on their own so the
7 designated developer for this project is a joint
8 venture, Neighborhood Infill Partners, and you will
9 hear more about them later in the presentation. As
10 mentioned by the Chair, the Land Use actions that are
11 necessary for this cluster are Urban Development
12 Action Area Designation and Urban Development Action
13 Area Project approvals, the disposition of city-owned
14 land, and the approval of Article 11 and UDAAAP tax
15 exemptions. Next slide, please.

16 The cluster is broken up as follows.
17 There are two ULURPs. One in Council Districts 14 and
18 16, and it involves the new construction of 28
19 affordable rental units developed through HPD's
20 Neighborhood Construction Program, or as we call it
21 NCP. The other ULURP is in Council District 16, and
22 it will provide 23 affordable co-op units through
23 HPD's Open Door Program. The last component of this
24 cluster is the non-ULURP sites. These sites are in
25 Council Districts 12 and 16, and they will be

1 developed as two-family homes through the Open Door
2 Program. I will now turn the presentation over to
3 Sandra Erickson representing the development team.
4

5 SANDRA ERICKSON: Good morning, everyone.
6 Wonderful to be here. Thank you for your
7 consideration of our project. I'm Sandra Erickson,
8 representing Sandra Erickson Real Estate. I'm in
9 business since 1984, based in Community Board 5 since
10 1989 so we're neighborhood-based property owners and
11 managers. We have 35 Bronx buildings, affordable
12 housing that we're managing, and we have a very long
13 history of commitment to the community. I sit on
14 Community Board 7 for 23 years in the Bronx. I'm the
15 Vice President in the Bronx Chamber. I'm involved
16 with the economic development in the Bronx. We do SBA
17 lending along with many other community commitments.
18 Next slide.

19 Next, we have JCAL Development. They're a
20 Bronx-based affordable housing developer. They've
21 created more than 1,000 units of affordable rentals
22 and affordable homeownership, and they have an
23 extensive network of locally based M/WBE
24 subcontractors and suppliers.
25

1
2 Next, we have OCV Architects. They've
3 been in business for more than 30 years, designing
4 affordable and sustainable projects, and we have
5 worked with them for more than 20 years. Next slide,
6 please.

7 Here's a map of the project sites. I will
8 note that the site is so scattered that two of the
9 northern sites, 30 West 182nd and 1234 East 223rd are
10 in the north, not on the map, because otherwise you
11 wouldn't be able to see it. They're in Community
12 Boards 3, 4, 5, and 12, and Council Districts 12, 14,
13 and 16 as has been stated. Next, I will hand it over
14 to Mary Ellen Cooper from OCV Architects who is going
15 to give an overview of the development sites.

16 MARY ELLEN COOPER: Hello. Next slide,
17 please.

18 The first project is 30 West 182nd Street
19 in Community District 5, Council District 14. This
20 six-story site has 11 units total, 10 one-bedroom
21 units and one two-bedroom unit at the first floor.
22 The project offers rear yard recreation space for all
23 tenants. There are laundry facilities and (INAUDIBLE)
24 room. Next slide, please.

1647 Popham Avenue is in Council District 16 and Community District 5. There are 17 units total, five one-bedroom and 12 two-bedroom units. This site offers laundry, bicycle storage, tenant storage, and also has rear yard recreation space for everyone. Next slide, please.

1312-1314 Chisholm is in Council District 16, Community District 3, and has one studio apt, 11 one-bedroom apartments, and 11 two-bedroom apartments. The building has elevator, trash, laundry, recreation at the rear yard, tenant storage, and a fitness space in the cellar. Next slide, please.

The Open Door sites, there are seven two-family homes that are being developed for homeownership. The owner's unit will be a three-bedroom unit, and each building has a rental either two-bedroom or one-bedroom. These are in Council Districts 12, 14, and 16 and Community Districts 2, 3, 4, 5, 7, and 12. Next slide, please.

SANDRA ERICKSON: I'm just going to now talk about the affordability for the two rental buildings, the 30 West 182nd and 1647 Popham. The AMI rates are between 30 and 70 percent, the maximum

1 incomes 27,000 to 64,000, and the rents are between
2 577 dollars and 1,578 dollars. Next, I'm going to
3 introduce Rosa Negron from Neighborhood Restore,
4 Restored Homes who will discuss the affordability of
5 the co-op units.
6

7 ROSA NEGRON: Good morning and thank you.

8 My name is Rosa Negron with Neighborhood Restore
9 Restored Homes, HDFC. We will be managing the
10 marketing for these affordable co-ops.

11 The buildings are composed of 22
12 affordable units, one studio unit, 10 one-bedroom, 11
13 two-bedroom, and one is for the super. The target
14 income is 80 percent AMI with the sales prices for
15 the studio currently at 249,779, the one-bedrooms are
16 304,660, the two-bedrooms would be approximately
17 348,612 with a down payment calculated at 5 percent
18 of each of the sale prices. We imagine the cost would
19 be about 1,700 to 2,600 dollars a month.

20 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR KELLY: Next slide,
21 please. Hi. Rosa Kelly, Executive Director for
22 Government Affairs for HPD. I just wanted to flag
23 that HPD's Home First Assistance Program, which is a
24 down payment assistance program, is available. We're
25 happy to connect Council Members or interested

2 stakeholders if they want to learn more, and I think
3 it's just such a great program we wanted to make sure
4 that we're mentioning it here when we're talking
5 about these homeownership opportunities.

6 SANDRA ERICKSON: Thank you so much. The
7 next slide, please. The affordability for the two-
8 family homes. A couple of points. These homes must be
9 owner-occupied, has to be a first-time homebuyer, the
10 homebuyer is at 80 percent AMI as well as the tenant
11 that rents the other apartment. The sales prices are
12 between 471,000 and 530,000. I want to call your
13 attention to the net monthly housing costs, which
14 averages about 1,700 dollars, and this is very
15 exciting because the owner will have a three-bedroom,
16 two-bath home with parking in a rear yard all for a
17 net, after you consider the rental, of 1,700 dollars
18 so we're particularly excited about this, and they
19 also offer the Home First Down Payment Assistance,
20 HPD does, and Neighborhood Restore, Restored Homes
21 will be working with us on the marketing and also
22 counseling because these people will not only be new
23 homeowners but new landlords so they offer counseling
24 for that.

1
2 Now, we're opening it to questions and
3 answers.

4 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you. I have one
5 question, and then after that we'll move forward.

6 Council Member Stevens, do you have any
7 questions?

8 All right, she stepped out.

9 One of the concerns that was raised in
10 prior HPD development proposal discussions as well as
11 here with this package of applications is that the
12 average unit size for HPD development is often quite
13 small. Can you either of you please address that
14 concern for these projects specifically? More broadly
15 can you discuss the factors that go into the
16 decisions made? Thanks.

17 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR KELLY: I'll turn it
18 over to Mary Ellen in just a second to talk a little
19 bit about the site constraints, but I think in
20 general, as Winnie mentioned in her introduction, the
21 reason that we are packaging all of these scattered
22 sites together is because they are small lots that
23 were particularly difficult to develop and so we
24 always strive for the right balance of unit count
25 which matches the financing and affordability, and I

1 think that's sort of the balance that we're trying to
2 strike here and then I'll turn it over to Mary Ellen
3 to talk a little bit more about site constraints and
4 limitations that led to the unit mix and unit sizes
5 that we present.
6

7 MARY ELLEN COOPER: Okay. To start, the
8 average one-bedroom is around 500, 550 square feet,
9 and the two-bedrooms range between like 750 to 850
10 square feet so these units were developed, like she
11 mentioned, the sites are small, in particular 30 West
12 182nd Street is a 25-foot lot so in order to maximize
13 the amount of apartments we could only do the one-
14 bedrooms in this and still have light and air as
15 required by code. All of the larger buildings are
16 maxed out for available zoning FAR so we are building
17 this as much as we can and trying to get the most
18 units in each project.

19 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: All right. Thank you.
20 Council Member Stevens is back. Do you have a
21 question?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: No, I don't have
23 any questions. I just heard we were talking about the
24 size. That was one of my concerns, but the lots are
25 small, which is why I was like that makes sense, and

2 they're mostly one-bedroom and two-bedrooms so for me
3 that was a concern but also understanding the size
4 restraints and restrictions.

5 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: All right. Being that
6 there are no additional questions, this applicant
7 panel is excused.

8 Counsel, are there any members of the
9 public who wish to testify on LUs 119 and 124?

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Madam Chair, we'll
11 check with our remote coordination staff to see if
12 there are any witnesses.

13 If there is anyone here with us today in
14 the Committee Room who wish to testify, please see
15 one of the Sergeants-at-Arms to complete a speaker
16 card.

17 Okay. It appears that we have no public
18 testimony for this item so you can continue.

19 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: All right, being that
20 there are no members of the public who wish to
21 testify on LUs 119 and 124 relating to the Morris
22 Heights NCP, Morrisania Open Door and Morrisania
23 Claremont Village Open Door Proposals, the public
24 hearing is now closed, and the items are laid over.

25 I will hand it over to Counsel now.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Thank you, Madam
3 Chair. To just recap and announce the vote from
4 today, the items were adopted by a vote of five in
5 the affirmative, zero in the negative, no
6 abstentions, and they will be referred to the full
7 Land Use Committee.

8 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you. That
9 concludes today's business.

10 I want to remind you that if you have
11 written testimony on today's items, you may submit it
12 to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Please indicate
13 the LU number or the project name or project address
14 in the subject heading.

15 I would like to thank members of the
16 public, my Colleagues, Subcommittee Counsel, and Land
17 Use staff, and the Sergeant-at-Arms for participating
18 in today's hearing.

19 This meeting is hereby adjourned. [GAVEL]
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 17, 2022