

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL
STATED MEETING

----- X

September 6, 2022
Start: 10:29 a.m.
Recess: 11:02 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Adrienne Adams
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Shaun Abreu
- Joann Ariola
- Alexa Avilés
- Diana Ayala
- Charles Barron
- Joseph C. Borelli
- Erik D. Bottcher
- Justin L. Brannan
- Gale A. Brewer
- Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
- Tiffany Cabán
- David M. Carr
- Carmen N. De La Rosa
- Eric Dinowitz
- Amanda Farías
- Oswald Feliz
- James F. Gennaro
- Jennifer Gutiérrez

Shahana K. Hanif
Kamillah Hanks
Robert F. Holden
Crystal Hudson
Kristin Richardson-Jordan
Rita C. Joseph
Ari Kagan
Shekar Krishnan
Linda Lee
Farah N. Louis
Christopher Marte
Darlene Mealy
Julie Menin
Francisco P. Moya
Mercedes Narcisse
Sandy Nurse
Chi A. Ossé
Vickie Paladino
Keith Powers
Lincoln Restler
Kevin C. Riley
Carlina Rivera
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Pierina Ana Sanchez
Lynn C. Schulman
Althea V. Stevens
Sandra Ung
Marjorie Velázquez
Inna Vernikov
Nantasha M. Williams
Julie Won
Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Rabbi Joseph Potasnik
New York Board of Rabbis

PEDRO LUGO: Good morning. This is a sound check for the Stated Meeting. Today's date is September 6th, 2022, located in the Council Chambers. Recording done by Pedro Lugo [sp?].

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Quiet on the floor, please. Quiet on the floor, please. Sergeant Sadowsky? [sp?]

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning and welcome to today's hybrid New York City Council Stated Meeting. To minimize disruption, please place electronic devices on vibrate or silent mode. Thank you for your cooperation. We are ready to begin.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Ladies and gentleman, at this time, please place all electronic devices, all electronic devices to vibrate. Mr. Majority Leader?

[gavel]

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Good morning and welcome to the Stated Meeting of September 6th, 2022. I'm Majority Leader Keith Powers. I'd like to thank everyone for joining us here today. If you'd like to follow along, the agenda for today's meeting is posted on the City Council website.

COUNCIL CLERK: Please join us for the
Pledge of Allegiance.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Roll call.

COUNCIL CLERK: Abreu?

COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ariola? Avilés?

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Presente.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala? Barron? Bottcher?

COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan?

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Brewer?

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Brooks-Powers? Cabán?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Carr?

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: De La Rosa?

COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Dinowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Farías?

COUNCIL MEMBER FARÍAS: Present.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Feliz? Ayala?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Here. [inaudible]

4 somewhere but keep going.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Gennaro? Gutiérrez?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Presente.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Hanif?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Here.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Hanks?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Present.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Hudson?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Present.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Joseph?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Here.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Kagan? Krishnan?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Here.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Lee?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Here.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Louis?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Here.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Marte?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Here.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy? Menin?

1 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Here.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Here.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Narcisse?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: [inaudible]

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Nurse?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Here.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Ossé?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Here.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Paladino? Restler?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Here. Happy

12 birthday, Gale.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Richardson Jordan?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I hate birthdays.

15 Thanks you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDSON JORDAN:

17 Present.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Riley?

19 Rivera? Salamanca? Sanchez? Schulman?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Here.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Stevens?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Here.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Ung?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Present.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Velázquez?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VELÁZQUEZ: Here.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Vernikov? Williams?

5 Won? Yeger?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Present.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Adams?

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: Present.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. We'll

14 now have today's invocation which will be delivered

15 by one of my favorite constituents, Rabbi Joseph

16 Potasnik of the New York Board of Rabbis which is

17 located at 171 Madison Avenue in Manhattan?

18 RABBI JOSEPH POTASNIK: Madam Speaker,

19 distinguished members of the Council, I just want to

20 say to you some years ago I was invited to the

21 installation of Archbishop Timothy Dolan at Saint

22 Patrick's Cathedral. He sent me two tickets. I only

23 needed one for that occasion. As I arrived, there

24 was an elderly catholic woman who wanted to enter,

25 but she didn't have a ticket. So I walked over to

1 her and u said, "Here, I have an extra one. Please
2 take it from me." She said, "Oh, God bless you. Who
3 are you?" I'm a Rabbi. She said, "A Rabbi? Only in
4 New York for a Catholic to get into Saint Patrick's
5 Cathedral, you need a Rabbi to give you a ticket." I
6 think her message really was that we all believers of
7 different faith belong to one family must be there
8 for one another. My parents came to this country
9 after the Holocaust, having lost five children. One
10 of the first groups to reach out to them were the
11 nuns of Saint Mary's Church in Lynn, Massachusetts.
12 They understood that anti-Semitism is anti-
13 Christianity, is anti-Islam. When hate mongers
14 marched in Charlottesville, Virginia, a group of
15 Christians formed a protective perimeter around the
16 synagogue, and said to them, "You want them, you go
17 through us." When houses of worship are desecrated
18 in New York City, we all stand together and say
19 you've assaulted their tradition, you've assaulted
20 ours. So all of us have to stand in solidarity
21 against this scourge of hatred in our city, whether
22 it's on a subway, on a street, or even on a college
23 campus. Services don't conclude when we walk out of
24 the sanctuary. They continue when we serve one
25

1
2 another in the streets. Years ago, there was a
3 magazine called Life, some of you remember. After
4 Life, there was a magazine called People. After
5 People there was a magazine called Us. After Us,
6 there was a magazine called Self. We started with
7 life and we concluded with Self. We Jews read from
8 right to left. So first we begin self, and then it's
9 about us. We must bring decency and dignity to all
10 people on this journey we call life. Amen.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you, Rabbi
12 Potasnik. I'm now going to ask Council Member
13 Dinowitz to spread the invocation on the record.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Thank you. I'd
15 just first like to say, you know, Rabbi Potasnik that
16 was a beautiful invocation. And several notes, he's
17 the Executive Vice President of the New York Board of
18 Rabbis who under his leadership, the membership
19 almost doubled, and it is the largest
20 interdenominational body of Rabbis in the entire
21 world. Since 1972, he's been the spiritual and
22 educational leader of congregation Mount Sinai in
23 Brooklyn Heights, New York, and is presently Rabbi
24 Emeritus. He has served as Chaplain of the New York
25 City Fire Department since 1999. He-- Rabbi Potasnik

1 maintained a high profile helping many families cope
2 with the disaster of September 11th, but as you've
3 heard in his invocation, it is not just within the
4 Jewish community that Rabbi Potasnik does-- is
5 working-- especially now more than ever, that work is
6 extremely important. Rabbi Potasnik co-hosts The Rev
7 and the Rabbi on WABC Talk Radio 77 with Reverend AR
8 Bernard since 2018. He's the host of a TV program
9 Faith to Faith on JBS which is seen around the
10 country and invites people of all faiths to
11 participate in meaningful inter-faith conversation
12 and dialogue. He was at the Twin Parks fire funeral,
13 the tragic-- the funeral for the tragic fire and
14 spoke there, and sponsors Iftar dinners. And as he
15 said most importantly, even though he's from Bufton
16 [sic] he took Mariana Rivera to Israel twice, which
17 he's very proud of. So, he's the honorary president
18 of Religions for Peace International. It is a great
19 honor to have him here with us today in our city
20 doing the hard work of bringing people of different
21 faiths together in conversation, and I ask for-- make
22 a motion for unanimous consent to spread the record--
23 to spread the invocation in full upon the record.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. Thank
3 you Rabbi Potasnik for being with us today as well. I
4 always appreciate your presence and the humor you
5 also bring to this chamber. Thank you so much. I
6 also was remiss to mention that we had a birthday of
7 Council Member Hanks as well on Sunday. Let's give
8 her a big happy birthday.

9 [applause]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: We won't-- we
11 won't ask for a number. We'll just say happy
12 birthday. Anyway, now we'll move to the adoption of
13 the minutes.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Messages and
16 papers from the Mayor.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Communication
19 from City, County and Borough offices?

20 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Petitions and
22 communications.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Land Use Call-
25 ups.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. We'll
4 now have communication from Speaker Adrienne Adams.

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much,
6 Majority Leader. Good morning everyone. I too will
7 chime in on the chorus of happy birthdays to Council
8 Member Hanks, Council Member Brewer, and I believe
9 Tanisha Edwards, also. Happy birthday to all of you.
10 I want to also thank, if he is still in the-- if he
11 didn't leave the chambers, Rabbi Potasnik, who is
12 such an amazing spiritual figure for so many of us.
13 Thank you Rabbi for always bringing your wisdom to
14 these chambers, to the people's house. We thank you.
15 There's not much more, colleagues, that hasn't
16 already been said about the reductions to school
17 budgets over the past weeks. Today, we're voting on
18 Resolution 283A to call on the Mayor and Chancellor
19 of the Department of Education to immediately reverse
20 the DOE's reductions to school budgets. The
21 resolution calls on the Chancellor to submit updated
22 school budgets to the panel for education policy to
23 reflect the restoration and for a full accounting of
24 unspent federal stimulus funds by the DOE. It calls
25 on the Mayor to promptly use unspent federal stimulus

1 dollars and other funds to fully restore the 469
2 million dollars that the DOE has removed from school
3 budgets, which far exceeds the 131.5 billion dollars
4 that the Administration indicated in the City Budget
5 that would be reduced from school budgets.
6 Throughout the summer, the DOE has offered piecemeal
7 restorations that would not address the entirety of
8 the gap it created for schools. The Council is
9 making it clear today with this resolution that
10 school budgets should be fully restored. The DOE
11 should also immediately release any money it has been
12 willing to offer to our schools over the course of
13 the past weeks because of the act of withholding
14 money must stop. The lack of accountability and
15 transparency by the DOE, the funding of our schools,
16 and education policy will continue to be a priority
17 for this Council, our students, teachers, and school
18 communities deserve more support from the DOE, and
19 it's clear that much more oversight and
20 accountability is required. Thank you, Majority
21 Leader.

22
23 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you,
24 Speaker Adams. We'll now move into the discussion of
25 general orders if anybody has signed up. I see none.

1
2 Congratulations. We will now move to the report of
3 special committees.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Report of
6 standing committees?

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
8 on Education, Resolution 283A.

9 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on
10 General Orders.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: On the General Orders
12 Calendar Intro. 179A.

13 SPEAKER ADAMS: Laid over. I would now
14 ask that the Clerk take a roll call vote on
15 Resolution Number 283A.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Abreu?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Aye.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Ariola? Avilés?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron? Bottcher?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Aye.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL CLERK: Brewer?

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Brooks-Powers? Cabán?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Carr?

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: De La Rosa?

COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Dinowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Farías?

COUNCIL MEMBER FARÍAS: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Feliz?

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Gennaro? Gutiérrez?

COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Hanif?

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Permission to

explain my vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Go ahead.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you. I vote
aye. I'd like to thank Education Chair Joseph and
Speaker Adams for bringing this Resolution to the
floor today. This vote could not be more timely.

1 Right now, our teachers, principals and other staff
2 members are preparing for the first day of school
3 this Thursday and they're doing so with less
4 resources than they had last year, and that is
5 unacceptable. In my district like many other
6 districts across the City, teachers and staff are
7 being removed from the schools that they taught in
8 last year and years prior. These are teachers and
9 staff who are essential to arts education,
10 afterschool programs, and mental health supports.
11 They are depended on and beloved by the students,
12 parents, and staff that make up our school
13 communities. At the Education Committee meeting
14 where this resolution was heard, Comptroller Lander
15 clearly laid out how the Mayor and the Chancellor can
16 reverse the 469 million dollars in cuts to our
17 schools in a fiscally responsible way. The DOE
18 budgeted approximately 3.018 billion dollars in
19 federal stimulus funding in the 2021-2022 school
20 year. However, only 2.37 billion dollars were spent,
21 meaning over 600 million dollars were budgeted but
22 not spent. This money can be and must be rolled over
23 to the 2022-2023 school year. Our young people and
24 their families are recovering from the academic
25

socio/emotional and economic impacts of the pandemic.
We have an influx of new students with immense needs,
including the approximately 1,400 new school-aged
asylum seekers who have arrived in recent months.
Now is not the time to be asking our schools to do
more with less. I urge the Administration to heed
this resolution and provide our schools with the
resources they need. Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Hanks?

COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Yes. Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Holden?

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Hudson?

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Joseph?

COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Kagan? Krishnan?

COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Lee?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Louis?

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Permission to
explain my vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Yes. Sorry.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: It's okay, I get
3 it. I just want to thank Speaker Adams and Chair
4 Joseph for their leadership on this matter. I look
5 forward to us getting funds fully restored, but more
6 importantly I just want to make sure within the
7 appeals process of this situation that everything is
8 equitable for all districts. So, I will be
9 submitting something at a later time to Chair Joseph
10 to ensure that District 45 is well-represented in the
11 appeals process. Thank you. Aye.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Marte?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Aye.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy? Menin?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Aye.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Moya?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Narcisse?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: I vote aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Nurse?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Aye.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Ossé?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Aye.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Paladino? Restler?

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Permission to explain my vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Go ahead.

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you, Majority Leader. Firstly, just like to thank Speaker Adams and Chair Joseph and each of the members of this body who have pushed over these last few months to see funding restored to our schools, and I think this resolution is a very significant step in the right direction where we are strongly calling on the Mayor to do the right thing and fund our neighborhood schools. Without his intervention, we are going to see larger class sizes on Thursday, fewer music and art teachers, fewer dual language programs, essential cuts to our schools that we simply cannot afford. And they make no sense, because the Mayor has the resources at his disposal. He can fix this today, and this Resolution loudly and clearly calls upon him to do just that. And if he fails to, which I very much hope that he does not, but if he does fail to, I look forward to standing with each and every one of you in a muscular and robust budget mod fight in the weeks and months to come. Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Vote Council Member?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Sure, sorry
3 about that. I'm an aye, enthusiastic aye.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, sir.
5 Richardson Jordan?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDSON JORDAN: Aye.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. One moment.
8 Riley? Rivera?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Salamanca?
11 Sanchez? Council Member Schulman?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Stevens?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Permission to
15 explain my vote? No, I'm playing. Aye.

16 [laughter]

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, Council
18 Member.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I was going to
20 take your temperature there for a second.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: thank you. Council
22 Member Ung?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Aye.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Council
25 Member Velázquez?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VELÁZQUEZ: Aye.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Vernikov?

4 Williams?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I vote aye.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Council

7 Member Won?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Aye.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Yeger?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Borelli?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I recognize

13 explaining my vote is about as popular as the Red Sox

14 right now, but the nonetheless--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: [interposing] We

16 want the Red Sox to beat the Rays, so, they're

17 popular right now.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Mere

19 technicalities, Majority Leader. I think this vote's

20 an easy yes for all of us to make. Certainly, we all

21 support putting more money in the classrooms, less in

22 big tweed salaries, less on consultants the DOE seems

23 to need while they sacrifice art supplies and

24 athletic programs and things like that. But I think

25 we also have to acknowledge why we're in this

1 position that we're in, and it's because of a drop-
2 off in student enrollment, and that drop-off didn't
3 just start in the pandemic. It accelerated in the
4 pandemic. A 100,000 students left the New York City
5 public school system, but this decline has been
6 happening since 2015. Ten percent of our school
7 children have left the system. some because of
8 generationally failing schools, others during the
9 pandemic because our school system decided
10 unnecessarily to remain closed and to be as difficult
11 as possible for working parents, and others because
12 they felt that they can get a better education
13 elsewhere. So I think-- I hope, rather, that this
14 body would consider some of those reasons, and
15 consider that people that do leave the public school
16 system are still our constituent, and I would hope
17 that we would begin looking at other alternatives
18 such as tuition tax credits, vouchers, and the
19 expansion of the charter cap going forward. Again,
20 these aren't our enemies, people that leave the
21 public school system. They're our constituents.
22 They're parents who decide what hopefully they think
23 is best for their children, and I'd rather be on
24 their side than treating them as the enemy. So, I
25

1
2 vote yes on this resolution happily. I think the
3 tougher conversation might come if there's a budget
4 mod as Councilman Restler pointed out. It'll be a
5 very muscular debate, and I intend to hit the weight
6 room, I guess, for that. But thank you, Madam
7 Speaker, and with that I vote aye.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Council
9 Member Powers?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. I
11 will make remarks, sorry to Council Member Stevens. I
12 share some of Council Member Borelli's-- Minority
13 Leader Borelli's concerns about what is happening in
14 the school building when it comes to declined
15 enrollment, and I do think in the years ahead we are
16 going to have to face some difficult choices about
17 what that looks like for our school buildings and for
18 our school system. Declined enrollment means that we
19 are going to have potentially less money at some of
20 these schools buildings, and we're going to have to
21 tackle those questions about how to prioritize and
22 how to spend that money. We're going to have to look
23 as the Speaker has called on to look at the funding
24 formulas by which guide many of the funding decisions
25 that the school system makes. And I think we're

1 going to have to look at the loss of stimulus funding
2 and a lot of other stressed systems on our school
3 building and our school system, and have to face some
4 choices about exactly where to prioritize and make
5 prioritized. But I think for many of us we saw this
6 happen-- play out this year when we do believe there
7 is still money left over and this-- to help sort of
8 pad the budgets of the school system as we face that
9 declining enrollment. Give us the opportunity and
10 breathing room to make those choices and make those
11 decisions, and to make sure that none of our actual
12 schools are facing devastating cuts that could harm
13 arts programs or afterschool programs, or any-- or
14 teachers-- or just teachers themselves. So, I think
15 that for many of the colleagues here we've heard very
16 clearly from them that they want to make sure that
17 their schools are well-- of course, all of ours well-
18 funded, that they have the critical programs and they
19 don't lose those so close to the school year when
20 principals will have very little opportunity or time
21 to make the hard decisions that they may have to make
22 if we don't restore the funding. So, I want to give
23 a lot of credit to our Education Chair Rita Joseph,
24 to the Speaker, and too all the colleagues here,
25

1
2 because I know many of you have been hearing from
3 your parents and your teachers directly, and
4 principals, and advocating on their behalf, and
5 that's what our jobs are, and that I don't think
6 anybody wants to see a school building that doesn't
7 have an arts program in it or have the teachers they
8 need to support class sizes that make sense for our
9 public school students. So I'm an obvious aye on
10 this, but I do think that after this we do need to
11 make an effort not only to keep this money in the
12 budget, but then also have opened up discussions as
13 the Speaker has said about what does the formula look
14 like and what is the process going forward look like
15 so that we don't have to face this decision again.
16 And so I just want to say thank you to everyone who's
17 been out there leading this discussion. I hope that
18 we'll continue this into the school to make sure that
19 our schools get the serious discussion that they
20 deserve about how we should fund them in the years
21 ahead especially with, I think, some financial
22 challenges that might be facing the school system and
23 the City in the years ahead. So, with that, I am
24 voting aye, and want to thank everyone for all your
25 advocacy and efforts. I see Council Member Narcisse?

COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: I just want to
add, and--

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: [interposing] Hold
on--

COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: say thank you
to my Speaker. I'm voting aye, but what you just
said just touched something in my heart as a mother
of four children, and knowing the inequities in our--

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: [interposing]
Council Member, we're going to vote, and then I'll
call on you for General Discussion. Okay?

COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Okay, thank
you.

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Alright. We just
want to finish the vote.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Speaker
Adams?

SPEAKER ADAMS: I'd like to associate
myself with the remarks of the Majority Leader.
Thank you Majority Leader. In particular, thanks to
our Education Chair Rita Joseph, and the entire
Education Committee. I do vote aye.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. Before
3 we close the vote, now Council Member Narcisse, did
4 you want to make comments associated with your vote?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Yes. It is
6 imperative for us to understand in order to address
7 the inequities that we see in our communities. It
8 been decades where school were neglected, and having
9 a great Speaker, the first black woman to be a
10 Speaker of the Council and the mother and
11 grandmother, like she always said, and Rita, being a
12 teacher in the classroom telling us how difficult it
13 has been. So, we are doing our part, and I'm praying
14 that the Mayor understand, and I'm sure he should
15 understand by now the importance of refunding and put
16 the money where it belongs to our children classroom,
17 if the Chancellor really care as much as he said it.
18 So we praying that they understand, after vote today,
19 this is not a game. This is very important for them
20 to do what they're supposed to do in order to address
21 the inequities in education like we should. Thank
22 you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you,
24 Council Member Narcisse. Council Member Shekar

1
2 Krishnan, did you have something you wanted to add to
3 your vote?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Yes, thank you.
5 I just wanted to also emphasize in voting on today's
6 resolution, we as a body too are committing to the
7 long work ahead to demanding and ensuring more
8 accountability from the Department of Education. It
9 is very clear through this process how both un-
10 transparent the Department of Education has been with
11 information that they've shared with this body, with
12 the public, both in its accuracy, as well as the
13 timeliness of it, too. So one of the main things
14 that-- the work that we have ahead is to ensure that
15 the Department of Education is much more accountable
16 to us and provides detailed, specific information of
17 how they intend to spend their budget, and that they
18 will provide that information to us in a timely
19 manner. I think that is crucial that it's the
20 accountability that we demand from every single city
21 agency and the Department of Education must be held
22 to the same standard as well and must see themselves
23 held to the same standard. And that is the work that
24 we have ahead of us to ensure that DOE is actually--
25 that every single dollar that we as the City Council

2 put into the Department of Education, it is spent on
3 our schools, our children, and our classrooms. That
4 is something that we, I think, recommit to and ensure
5 that will happen going forward as well. Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. We
7 will hold the vote for one second, please.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Welcome. Council Member
9 Brooks-Powers?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Good
11 morning. I vote aye, enthusiastically.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. All
14 items on today's General Order Calendar are adopted
15 by a vote of 41 in the affirmative, 0 in the
16 negative, and 0 abstentions. We now the introduction
17 and reading of bills.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. There
20 are no resolutions on today's calendar, so we'll move
21 to General Discussion. I see no one signed up for
22 General Discussion.

23 [applause]

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: You know, this
3 could become a tradition. I'll now call on Speaker
4 Adrienne Adams to close today's Stated Meeting.

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: Prior to closure, on
6 behalf of this entire body we express our sincerest
7 condolences to Council Member Sandra Ung and the loss
8 of her father. We express our condolences and love
9 to you and your family. The Stated Meeting of
10 September 6th, 2022 is hereby adjourned.

11 [gavel]

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date September 12, 2022