CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

----- X

June 15, 2022

Start: 10:14 a.m. Recess: 1:08 p.m.

HELD AT: Hybrid Hearing - Committee Room

City Hall

B E F O R E: Rita C. Joseph

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Shaun Abreu

Alexa Avilés

Carmen N. De La Rosa

Eric Dinowitz Oswald Feliz

James F. Genarro Jennifer Gutiérrez Shahana K. Hanif Kamillah Hanks Shekar Krishnan

Linda Lee

Farah N. Louis

Julie Menin

Mercedes Narcisse Lincoln Restler

Pierina Ana Sanchez

Lynn C. Schulman Althea V. Stevens Sandra Ung

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Christopher Tricarico Senior Executive Director of Office of Food and Nutrition Services

Kevin Moran Chief School Operations Officer of Board of DOE

Donald Nesbit Vice President of Local 372 DC 37

Julia McCarthy
New York Health Foundation

Rachel Sabella No Kid Hungry New York

Kelly Wind Coalition for Healthy School Food

Ally Miller Edible Schoolyard NYC

Liz Accles Community Food Advocates

Debby Lee Cohen Cafeteria Culture

Roma Yang

Union Square Academy
 A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Philip Chong Quincy Asian Resource

Aideen Dela Cruz New York City DOE Physical Therapist

Jenny Valaderas [sp?] Union Square Academy

Eloisa Trinidad Chilis on Wheels

Tom Buckley

	4

2	CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Good morning. Good
3	morning and welcome to today's Committee hearing on
4	school food. I'm Rita Joseph, Chair of Education
5	Committee. Today we are having a hybrid hearing with
6	Council Members and some witnesses in-person while
7	others will be testifying remotely via Zoom. We ask
8	for your patience as we navigate this new
9	environment. We're here today to talk about school
10	foods, because there's nothing more important than
11	the health and wellbeing of New York City's more than
12	one million school children. According to the
13	Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, most
14	children in the United States get as much as half of
15	their daily calories at school. That makes school
16	food an essential part of students' nutrition and
17	health, as well as important tools in combatting
18	childhood hunger. Hunger has always been a critical
19	issue in New York City, but has become even worse
20	since the COVID-19 pandemic. Prior to the pandemic,
21	one in five New York City children were experiencing
22	food insecurity, but since the pandemic, the
23	proportion of food-insecure children have grown from
24	one and four. We also know that healthy eating in
25	childhood and adolescence is important for proper

2	growth, development and to prevent obesity in various
3	other health conditions, including diabetes, high
4	blood pressure, and heart disease, among others.
5	Additionally, in order to succeed in the classroom,
6	every student needs nutritious food in order to live
7	a healthy life and be their best at each school day.
8	As a classroom teacher for over 20 years, I know how
9	important school food programs are for students.
10	Hungry children cannot pay attention, concentrate, or
11	participate effectively in class. That's why I'm
12	such a huge supporter of the Breakfast in the
13	Classroom Program, which provides students with
14	breakfast in a bag to eat in the classroom after the
15	start of a school day. Most students are not able to
16	get to school early in the morning before school
17	starts to have a sit-down meal in the cafeteria.
18	Breakfast in the Classroom allows them to sleep later
19	and get both rest and food they need to stay alert
20	and focused in school. It also results in improved
21	behavior and fewer fights among students. The
22	Department of Education Office of Food and Nutrition
23	Services, known as OFNS, offer free breakfast, lunch,
24	and after school meals to all New York City public
25	school students during the school year. Each summer.

2	OFNS also provides free meals at hundreds of sites
3	across the City including designated public schools,
4	community pools, centers, parks, and food trucks. In
5	recent years, DOE's school food meal DOE's school
6	meal programs have gone a number of changes such as
7	phasing out unhealthy lunch, breakfast items
8	containing dangerously high-risk of sodium, fat, and
9	preservatives. And DOE says their nutrition standard
10	now exceed USDA standards. For school meals, DOE has
11	also established "Meatless Mondays" with all
12	vegetarian breakfast and lunch menus, expanded
13	efforts to use more locally-grown produce and install
14	salad bars in many school buildings to provide access
15	to more fresh vegetables and fruits. In addition to
16	breakfast in the classroom, DOE has other new
17	programs like Garden to Café schools which lets
18	students grow and harvest food at community gardens,
19	actually eat what they have grown. A few years ago,
20	DOE initiated a scratching cook scratch cooking
21	pilot which installed professionally trained chef at
22	several Bronx schools to develop scratch cooked meals
23	doing fresh using fresh ingredients to move away
24	from highly processed foods. The DOE also launched a
25	cafeteria re-design initiative for high schools to

2	transform them into food court type setting that
3	provides a more welcoming environment, more daily
4	menu options, and faster service. Students
5	obviously, like as high school with re-designed
6	cafeterias experienced a 35 percent increase in
7	student participation in school meals, but we've
8	heard that only 44 cafeterias across the City have
9	transformed to date. Food and nutrition education
10	programs are also critical because they provide
11	children with knowledge to make healthy food choices
12	and adopt lifelong healthy habits. I have firsthand
13	experience with nutrition education program called
14	Cookshop Classroom. Every Friday I'd conduct
15	interactive lessons and hands-on activities with
16	students and they would be so engaged and excited and
17	really look forward to participating. There's also a
18	Cookshop family component. I work with parents so
19	they can learn more about food and nutrition and cook
20	meals with their kids at home. Unfortunately, many
21	schools don't have nutrition education programs like
22	Cookshop, and even those that do not are unable to
23	provide enough hours of instruction. Bottom line is
24	we want all our children to have access to fresh,
25	nutritious, healthy food that's also appealing and

2	tastes good so they'll actually eat it and not throw
3	it in the trash. We know that efforts like scratch
4	cooking, salad bars, garden to café, and vegetarian
5	options are effective in providing more fresh, whole,
6	healthy food in students' diets, and we know that
7	universal free school meals, breakfast in the
8	classroom, and cafeteria re-design actually work to
9	get more students to participate in school meal
10	programs. We know that food and nutrition programs
11	like Cookshop empowers students to make healthier
12	choices. By introducing all of these initiatives
13	it's clear that OFNS really cares about providing
14	nutritious school meals, but we also know that more
15	can and must be done to get us to the goal of
16	providing all our children with fresh, nutritious,
17	healthy food so they'll grow up and live long healthy
18	lives. At today's hearing, the Committee hopes to
19	learn more from DOE about their efforts to improve
20	school foods program and increase the number of
21	students participating. We'd also like to hear
22	details about plans to expand existing successful
23	school food programs, as well as any new initiatives
24	in the works. In addition, we know that the pandemic
25	and school closures cause major disruptions to school

2	food programs, and we'd like to learn more about the
3	challenges presented to OFNS and any remaining
4	impacts on school food operations. We also hope to
5	hear recommendations for improvements from advocates
6	and other stakeholders. I want to thank everyone
7	who's testifying today. I want to thank the City
8	Council staff for all the work they put in today, Jan
9	Atwell [sp?], [inaudible], and Frank Perez [sp?]. I
10	also want to thank my staff, Stan Weinberger [sp?]
11	and Connor Irving [sp?]. I'd like to remind everyone
12	who wish to testify in-person today that you must
13	fill out a witness slip which is located at the desk
14	of the Sergeant at Arms near the entrance of this
15	room. To allow as many people as possible to
16	testify, testimony will be limited to three minutes
17	per person, whether you're testifying on Zoom or in-
18	person. I'm also going to ask my colleagues to limit
19	their questions and comments to five minutes. Now,
20	without any further, I'd like to first turn to the
21	first witness panel. Of course. And I also would
22	like to acknowledge my colleagues, Council Member
23	Carmen De La Rosa, Council Member Shahana Hanif,
24	Council Member Julie Menin, Council Member Eric
25	Dinowtiz, and Council Member Mercedes Narcisse. Jan

Adams and Chancellor Banks are committed to ensuring

every student has equal access to quality nutritious

24

2	meals to help them succeed in and out of school. The
3	Chancellor has set forth an ambitious vision to
4	transform our school system that encompasses four
5	pillars. One, reimagining the student experience.
6	Two, scaling, sustaining, and restoring what works.
7	Three, prioritizing wellness. Four, engaging
8	families to be our true partners. Those pillars are
9	at the heart of our School Food Program and are
10	reflected in these priorities, providing meals that
11	are both delicious and adhere to high nutritional
12	standards, transforming our students' dining
13	experience, incorporating community engagement and
14	student feedback to approve our menus, promoting
15	equity across the system. I would like to personally
16	thank the Council for its longstanding commitment to
17	ensuring that students have access to healthy meals
18	as well as successfully advocating for universal free
19	lunch, breakfast in the classroom, and funding the
20	first year of a halal and kosher meals pilot
21	programs. We look forward to our continued
22	collaboration. I would also like to thank the school
23	food advocates who we closely work with and who are
24	great partners to us. We are proud of the innovative
25	work carried out by our over 8,000 dedicated

2	employees and 1,300 kitchens. We serve more than
3	800,000 meals per day to students attending over
4	2,000 schools, including charters and non-public
5	schools. All meals adhere to our rigorous
6	nutritional and health standards for the New York
7	City Department of Health and go beyond the USDA
8	National School Lunch Program standards. Offering
9	breakfast, lunch, and after school meals offer
10	delicious healthy options that appeal to students of
11	all ages and diverse backgrounds. Each day, our
12	school food service workers prepare free breakfast
13	which can include fruits, yogurts, bagels, cereals,
14	and more available to every student to help ensure
15	that they start the day with a healthy and nutritious
16	meal. Further, we are proud to offer universal free
17	lunch, ensuring every student has access to high-
18	quality meals throughout the day. All of our
19	ingredients adhere to strict standards regarding
20	sodium, fat, sugar, and calories to ensure healthy
21	meals for all students. For example, we only
22	purchase antibiotic-free chicken tenders with sodium
23	not exceeding 480 milligrams, saturated fat under 10
24	percent of total calories, and breading containing at
25	least 51 percent whole grain. We also feature whole

2	fresh fruit and fresh vegetables, which about 20
3	percent come from New York State. We have made a lot
4	of progress over the years in creating delicious,
5	healthy, culturally responsive, positive dining
6	experiences for our students, and we are always
7	looking for ways to improve. In addition to
8	nutrition, the Department of Education is laser-
9	focused on equity. Our citywide menus include two
10	meatless days, 100 percent antibiotic-free chicken,
11	scratch recipes, and fresh vegetables and fruit with
12	every serving. The menus are available in nine
13	languages posted on our website, accessible through
14	our school food app, and are carefully planned by our
15	team of professional chefs. These menus are
16	identical in all districts. Beginning this fall, our
17	new Cook Ambassadors, one in every district, will
18	make certain cooks are continually trained in recipe
19	execution, ensuring all menu items are made
20	uniformly. Cook Ambassadors will also be trained in
21	scratch cooking techniques, food safety, and customer
22	service. Furthermore, the Taskforce on Racial
23	Inclusion and Equity, TRIE: neighborhoods are
24	prioritized when selecting schools for new programs.
25	These neighborhoods are defined as the most impacted

by COVID-19 in addition to communities that have a
high percentage of other health and socioeconomic
disparities. All upcoming cafeteria enhancement
experience sites and summer meal sites prioritize
these TRIE neighborhoods. CEE is a renovation of a
service line that allows more daily choices for
students as well as updated furniture and artwork
created by students from each school. We are in the
process of completing 40 more CEE during this Capital
Plan. We also plan to renovate all middle and high
school cafeteria service lines and are excited that
50 million was just added to the Capital Budget for
these renovations. We're also proud of the work we
have done in over 60 halal sites since the Council
pilot in 2019. All of these sites now have certified
kitchens and staff that serve approved halal meals.
We partner with the moms from across the City to
support the initiative and are in the process of
certifying 15 more sites that will begin serving
halal meals in September of 2022. Any schools
interested in becoming a halal-certified site should
engage their school community and reach out to my
office. The Chancellor's prioritization of community
engagement has renewed our focus on incorporating

2	feedback, which is the foundation of our school meals
3	program. To this end, we have embarked on an
4	extensive community engagement plan in which OFNS
5	representations attend all community education
6	council meetings. The OFNS representatives provide a
7	brief overview of our schools meals program, then
8	answer questions and gather feedback that is
9	synthesized and becomes the basis of a decision-
10	making around menus. This engagement will continue
11	in the fall when OFNS will join CEC, parent/teacher
12	associations, school leadership teams, and other
13	community-based meetings. In addition, starting in
14	September, we once again will be meeting regularly
15	with student ambassadors and student councils to hear
16	directly from them. Student taste testing which have
17	been taking place all year long will continue in the
18	fall as we work through new recipes and menu items.
19	Turning to our Summer Meals Program. We look forward
20	to offering free breakfast and lunch to anyone 18
21	years old and younger across the City during July and
22	August. Our priority is to be flexible in addressing
23	the needs of particular communities and we are
24	committed to expanding our reach and adding as many
25	sites as possible. To this end, we are accepting

applications for Summer Meal sites throughout June as
NYCHA and Parks Department continue to hire seasonal
staff throughout the month. Finally, I want to
recognize our amazing School Food service workers who
demonstrated their ongoing commitment to communities
during the darkest days of the pandemic. In a
Herculean effort, we transformed our school
operations to provide delicious, nutritious meals to
the entire City. From May 2020 to August 2021, our
food service workers prepared and served over 100
million meals, providing three meals a day to anyone
who needed them, children and adults alike. We are
incredibly proud of the work that they do. In
conclusion, I want to reiterate my gratitude to our
close partnership with Mayor Adams' Office and the
City Council. Students need to feel healthy and
well-nourished to thrive at school and beyond.
Thanks to the hard work of our food service workers,
we strive to make this a reality every single day
across this great city. We look forward to
continuing this work together to ensure the health
and wellbeing of all our children. Thank you, and we
are happy to answer your questions.

2	CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you. Kevin,
3	are you testifying as well? No, just here for
4	support. I'd like to recognize Council Member Linda
5	Lee. Thank you for being here. Alright, let's get
6	to questions. At the onset of COVID-19 pandemic in
7	March of 2020, DOE was forced to close schools,
8	buildings, and transitioned to remote learning, and
9	the Office of Food and Nutrition Services pivoted to
10	a grab-n-go service model offering free breakfast,
11	lunch to all students and to the general public to
12	roughly 500 school buildings across the City. In the
13	fall of 2020, schools reopened to a blended learning
14	model which called for a combination of remote and
15	in-person instruction. This meant that OFNS had to
16	operate hybrid model serving meals in schools to
17	students in attendance while continuing to provide
18	grab-n-go service for remote students as well. Did
19	OFSN have to hire additional staff to meet the demand
20	of this hybrid service model in each school? If so,
21	what was the new staff retained once school was fully
22	reopened and hybrid service was discontinued? Since
23	the onset of COVID-19 has OFSN experienced any
24	staffing issues related to the pandemic?

2.2

2.3

the schools.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO:

My voice

2	
_	

is loud enough, but— during the pandemic, we did not hire many student— new staff members. We lost several staff members during the pandemic, but we were able to function and serve the hybrid model with the staff that we had. Since early September of 2021 we have been hiring staff to make sure we cover all of the vacancies that we have. At the moment, we are almost back to the pre-pandemic levels of staff and have not missed any work that was needed in all of

remember, in September of 20-- September 13<sup>th</sup>, 2021 marked the full-term of in-person attendance for all students, teachers, and staff. Can you share with us what the average daily number of meals served between the start of the pandemic and the average daily meals served now? Have there been a reduction or increase in the number of meals served post-pandemic? If so, what do you attribute the change to?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: The average daily attendance of the City did decrease when we returned after the pandemic, after the school closures. We are currently serving an estimated

2.2

number of meals around 800,000 meals per day. That	
includes breakfast, lunch, snack and supper. That	is
definitely lower from what we were doing pre-	
pandemic, but that also takes into consideration les	SS
number of students that are attending New York City	
schools.	

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: And that was because of that, okay. What if residue [sic] of pandemic efforts— effects have impacted school meal programs since school resumed to full in-person instruction. For example, have there been pandemic-related supply chain issue? If so, how have they affected your operations?

proud to say that my office from the start of the pandemic decided to increase as many of our options that we have in our product basket. We did have specific supply chain issues, but it never prevented us from serving a reimbursable, healthy, nutritious, delicious meal to all the students that we were serving.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: And for now, everything is back to normal, running on time, on

2 schedule, and the needs of the students are being met?

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: single day, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: due to school closure transition to remote instruction in early in the pandemic, a federal program, the Coronavirus Pandemic EBT card was created to cover meal expense for students who typically receive free meals when the schools were learning remotely due to the pandemic. Because New York City's a universal free lunch district, all public school students are eligible to receive this PEBT regardless of their household income, immigration status. The benefits were retroactive to March 2020 and were loaded on EBT cards that were distributed by mail. Families are due to receive their third round of food benefits in the amount of \$375 per child in June of 2020. OFSN have any information about the EBT program and whether all New York City public school families receive it? Do you have any idea of how much funds for the city families were spent?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: The PEBT Program is not run by the New York City Department of

2.2

2.3

Education, but we do have the attendance records and the actual enrollment that we submit to the state to

4 make sure all children who are in our system and our

5 school board authority get the PEBT money.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Do you have any idea how much of the funds for the City families were spent? Do you know?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Say that again?

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: The funds that were spent on the families, do you know how much? Do you have an idea?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: At the current time I don't have that, but I can get that answer and come back to you.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: I would really appreciate that. Thank you. At the outset of the COVID-19 pandemic in 2020, I remember Congress passing the Families First Coronavirus Response Act which include child nutrition and the COVID-19 waivers that allowed all students regardless of financial status to eat breakfast/lunch at school for free. It also provided additional funding to schools to offset higher food and labor costs, and

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

flexibility to meeting changes needs due to supply
chain disruption and school closures. However, all

4 of these waivers are due to expire on June  $30^{th}$ ,

5 2022. One, what are the impact of the expiration of

6 child nutrition waivers have on summer meals for the

7 summer of 2022? What impact does the expiration of

8 child nutrition waivers have on school meals

9 operation for school 2022-2023? And how will the

10 supply chain challenges impact DOE's ability to meet

11 | federal meal patterns requirement? Did the waiver

12 make it easier to provide meals in the face of the

13 | supply chain challenges?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: We'll take one at a time.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: One at a time, yes, please do.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Yes, the waivers do expire on June 30<sup>th</sup>. So, starting for the first time in two years, this summer we will return to pre-pandemic rules and regulations around the summer meals program. What that means for students is, they must eat meals inside of the cafeteria, and any park or pool or any other area like that, they must eat within a designated area. They will no

2.2

2.3

longer be allowed to take meals off-site, which they

3 were allowed during the pandemic. That is one waiver

4 that expires.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Okay.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: During the school year, the new school year coming up, since we no longer are under the waivers, we will lose an approximate 15 percent of the reimbursement for a meal due to the summer pandemic waivers expiring. Supply chain challenges, once again, we do not have supply chain challenges. We are able to provide every single day three nutritious meals as needed that meet the reimbursable program that are healthy, nutritious, and delicious. I think I covered them all, or I missed that last one.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: you have one more.

You had one more. Your ability to meet the federal
meal pattern requirements, the meal pattern
requirements by the Federal Government.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: we always will meet the meal pattern requirements by the Federal Government with every meal that we do. Going back to what I said earlier, we make sure our product inventory investment is well-stocked. In any time we

	$\sim$
-	
L	')

## COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

may run out of something, which happens rarely, we
always have a back-up option that is served. Schools
know this. Schools have it on their menu. We also
have alternative options on our menu every single
day.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you. I'd also like to recognize Council Member Louis. Good morning. Good morning Council Member Alexa. Good morning Council Member Shekar. I will open the floor now to my colleagues for questioning. [inaudible] Dinowitz and then after, Council Member Lee.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Good

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Good morning.

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: I want to start by saying I'm very pleased to hear that there are 60 halal sites, certified sites, and the work that you're doing to provide more certifications at more schools, and I look forward to reaching out to you about that for certain. So one of the phrases you're using is nutritious and delicious. Do you eat the school lunch?

2.2

2.3

morning.

old.

\_

J

\_ \_

2.3

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: I have been eating school lunch ever since I'm four years

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Good.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Not only am

I in this position now, I was a principal previous to
this, a teacher, and a student in all New York City
schools including the fact that my mother worked in
the School Food Office and my school when I was in
Martin Van Buren High School in Queens.

it. I'm wondering-- because I didn't-- we weren't allowed to, by the way, as teachers we weren't allowed to which is I guess good because it's for the kids.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Teachers are allowed if you purchase meals.

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Oh, yeah, no thanks. But you know, the students would come up with their breakfast and everything that you're saying was on the plate, you had the fruit, the-- and they would just eat the cereal. They'd come up with their lunch, looks like a nice plate, and they would just eat the French fries. And so I'm wondering what

24 do is--

survey data ex-- I'm assuming you ask the kids how they feel about the food. Part of its cultural competency, but part of it is just, hey, what changes can we make to make sure you as a student are able to make those healthy choices, because we're not sure about that delicious part. So what survey data exists to see if the students are actually eating the food and enjoy the food?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: So, a couple of things, if you don't mind, I just want to make some clarifications.

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Sure.

program that we are in, New York City School Food
Authority, mandates that we always serve three
components. We offer up to five components,
including offering milk. So, students must take at
least three components when they're--

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: [interposing] I get it. Don't mean to-- times ticking. I know they take it. I'm saying they don't eat it.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: so what we

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: [interposing]

That's why I'm asking what the survey data is and how you're responsive to the desires of our students.

That's what I'm asking.

executive director tricarico: We test all our products that go on the plate in front of students. Every single item that goes on a tray is approved by a student panel, whether it's in the past or any upcoming items in the future. We do our best to talk to students about what they like, but we always have to do two things: do what they need, do what they like, and follow the USDA regulation.

panels, are those like public panels? Is it available online? And as you recognize each individual school community is different, you-- we spoke about halal food, which is great, but there's also other cultural differences depending on the community. Do you take the needs of each individual school or area into consideration with your student panels?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: All our cooks are trained, actually, to make sure that they're addressing any needs of the community, the

2	schools community specifically. We meet with
3	students at schools. We meet with students who are
4	on panels at schools, plus taste testing. Taste
5	testing is available at every school. All the school
6	has to do is ask for it. We will then come to the
7	school or bring children to headquarters where our
8	test kitchen is. but going back to the individual
9	communities, if the cooks know their communities,
10	which they are trained on, they are allowed to alter
11	the recipe with seasoning as long as that does not
12	change the nutritional value of the recipe to meet
13	the needs of that community. But I do want to stress
14	that menus are citywide. We look to make sure that
15	the plate that is served in the Bronx is served in
16	Staten Island and served in Queens and Manhattan.
17	And I missed the bar [sic] on that but I'm sure I'll
18	get to it eventually.

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: No, you-EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO:

[interposing] Brooklyn, sorry. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: that's-- you can exclude them, it's okay. I'm making people mad. That's fine with me.

4

5

6

1

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: I was a

principal in Brooklyn. 3

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: So, it's there.

email the questions, but I would like to know the

Have you -- I do want to talk further. Maybe I'll

7 considerations about understanding that there's more

8 than seasoning that goes into the cultural

differences in food choices. I want to ask one other

question. It's related to the Garden to Café 10

11 Program. You knew I was going to ask about school

12 gardens. You know, because it's not just the

13 existence of food, as you understand, it's the

14 students' relationship with food, and of course

15 growing the food themselves develops a positive

relationship with healthy nutritious and delicious 16

17 food. So, I'm just going to ask a few questions

18 around gardens. How many school gardens exist? Not

19 relationships with community gardens, but really on

20 the school campuses. How many school gardens exist?

21 How many -- are there plans for expansion of existing

2.2 gardens or to expand more -- to provide more school

2.3 gardens in existing schools? And are there efforts

underway to ensure that school gardens or space for 24

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 new school gardens is included in all new
3 construction?

KEVIN MORAN: Yeah, so thank you very much for the question. The Division of Operations does have an Office of Sustainability within the Division, and we right now currently have 952 garden spaces across the City. That is inclusive of indoor settings in aquaponics or other opportunities within the classroom. We do have outdoor options that is-sometimes there's access to a rooftop garden. Sometimes there's access to a greenhouse on campus like a larger space like Canarsi [sp?] High School, for example. We also have raised planter beds. You were aware of the space we have at Walton [sp?] and other places. So, we definitely want to expand. partner with Grow NYC and other partners. certainly expand our reach with efforts through [inaudible] grants through the Council's efforts. So where there's interest there, we'd like to cultivate that as well. So yes, we definitely have an opportunity now to expand and do more. New school construction does include some features. notably there's one that most people are familiar with, the Kathleen Grimm [sp?] school at Sandy Ground

Τ	COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION 32
2	[sp?]. That does have rooftop access that was built
3	as a net-zero school, which is really a highlight in
4	our kind of portfolio that it is solar and geothermal
5	and reduction of greenhouse gases with the focus on
6	actually having gardens on campus and on the rooftop.
7	So, yes, we want we are committed to that effort
8	and we will expand. I'd love to meet with you and
9	your team or any of those that are interested in
10	expanding more. But at current it's 952 sites across
11	the City.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: And is is
13	there additional investments made for the next fiscal

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

year that--

KEVIN MORAN: Well, the Council does provide 150,000 dollars for small school grants to start small, 5,000 dollar grants to start seeding the program quite literally, and so we'll look to you to continue the conversation about additional opportunities site-specific beyond the original groupings.

Thank you. COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you. I'd like to recognize Council Member Brewer, Council Member

2.2

2.3

Avilés, Council Member Gutiérrez, and Council Member

Abreu, and Krishnan. Thank you. Next question,

4 Council Member Lee?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Sorry, without the

Zoom hand function, I don't know what the order is.

So I'm getting-- I'm trying to get used to this.

Now, I'm trying to get used to the in-person. Okay.

Really quick question on the vendors that you utilize in the contracting process. So, just out of curiosity, how many vendors do you currently contract to for the school meals?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: so, we currently have three main distributors that purchase and deliver food to our schools, plus a lot of contract-direct relationships where we have a relationship with the vendor and they also deliver food to our schools. The exact number of all the vendors does change based on the number of contracts that we have, contracts that are expired, and contracts that are coming up. I can definitely follow up with the specific number, but going back to the original three main distributors that we use to purchase and deliver food that all must meet our regulations and standards.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Okay, and then how often are those contracts evaluated? So, is it like five years, three years? And then what's the RFP process? Can other folks get into that system? How does that work?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Excellent question. Yes, it's every five years. It's expiring at the end of 2024, and we're going to go through the process once again to go out and bid these massive great contracts.

also-- and this is connecting to the culturally competent meals. So is there room, I guess-- if you're in charge of the RFP process, can we add some kind of stipulation or sentence in there awarding contracts to folks that do serve culturally diverse meals? Because, you know, and it gets tricky, because I understand there's [inaudible] scale, right? Because we're talking about million students in the school system, but then how do we make sure that, you know, we're working with vendors that can actually cook the food in the way that folks are familiar or prefer?

3

4

5

6

7

8

)

1011

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

executive director tricarico: Excellent question. And this Chancellor is prioritizing that, and we-- as we write all new contracts and putting in language like that, including language around WMBE as well as local purchasing language in there as well.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Okay. And then one quick question. I don't know if this is going to be one of your questions, Chair Joseph, so I hope I'm not stealing one. But in terms of the construction and the redesign of the cafeterias, because like one of the things we did was-- you know, we're providing-- we have very little capital dollars from all of our pots, but you know, the air conditioning for staff that work in the kitchen is extremely important. And so, you know, I think some of the re-- and also, in terms of the re-design of the kitchens, it costs about \$500,000 from my understanding and only takes about a weekend, which seems very doable. And so how do we make sure that, you know-- you know, how's the DOE and the Administration working on that aspect of the construction to make sure that those are happening in each of our districts? What's the process? How do we access that money or request that money? Because I have 35 public schools that I need

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

to, you know, re-design. So if you could speak a little bit.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Yeah, thank you for that question. This capital plan we're actually in the process of doing 40 more cafeteria enhancement experiences. Just so everyone understands, that is a re-design of the cafeteria service line and where the children eat the food, as well as the cafeteria artwork that goes up. not a renovation of the kitchen, but we currently are looking to make sure we're identifying these renovations in all of the TRIE neighborhoods, Taskforce neighborhoods, as well as any future plans that we have for cafeteria enhancement. We'll go by student participation areas of need and areas in socio-economical situations that we would love to be able to increase participation in those schools.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Okay. Thank you.

KEVIN MORAN: So, if I could just build on Chris' comments. We're working in partnership with our facilities teams to make these happen with the School Food team. We're already up to 50 from previous plans, to Chris' point where there's like 40 in the pipeline. I want to thank the Chair and I

2	want to thank the Council for their advocacy for
3	additional funding. We'll more than double that in
4	the next plan, and happening now for the increase in
5	funding. That 50 million means 100 schools that will
6	get this cafeteria enhancement. And one of the
7	things, lessons learned over time, is we're able to
8	learn that sometimes while you're there, it's not
9	much to do the floor tile. It's not much to do the
10	lighting. It's not much to get inside the kitchen and
11	look at some of the ventilation concerns. You know,
12	and the things that we've learned over time on how
13	better the process. So we're super excited about the
14	100 additional, and we will be partnering with you,
15	Chris and team. We're making sure we're doing some
16	local outreach, that if you see a priority and say
17	this Jr. high school, this high school we want to
18	partner there and also look for efficiencies on our
19	operation scale, how we make things accessible and
20	other opportunities to use funding streams to better
21	the project along. The second part I heard around
22	ventilation I know you mentioned air conditioning
23	for our cafeterias, Chris and I talk about this
24	regularly, and we currently have at least 500, an
25	excess of 500 kitchens that have received that have

functioning air conditioning. We're just completed
32 since May, last May. We're adding now with
additional funding, and thank you again for this, is
that we're going to chase out 411 schools in the next
couple of years and get those 411. So we're closing
on 1,000. The remaining sites that do not have the
air conditioning in within the kitchen, we're
already started the overview and assessment of what
that cost would be, as it is a capital request for a
split unit, and they vary from kitchen to kitchen
based upon space to roof, space to exterior, where we
could put condensers and such, but very much top of
mind, and we'll keep you regularly updated as we kind
of complete these projects.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you so much.

Next person, Council Member Narcisse?

and thank you for being here. I would have a lot of questions, but I'm going to have to narrow it down. You know food and health have a direct relation in your body, right? And my community, the district I represent, right now we have the highest in diabetes comparing to the City, 30 percent compared to the City, about 24. Hypertension is killing us. So,

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

since food have a direct relation, so I want to know since we know the high-risk area, the high-risk that we've been talking about, it took the pandemic to highlight it, the problems that have burdened our community, and we cannot go backwards. We have to go forward. And one of the thing that we can do is making sure our children understand the relation with food and the health within the body. So, my whole thing-- first, before I get to my questions. Are the kitchen in our district working? Because I know I visited some, they need to be done. They need to be done over. We need a whole makeover, and the stove not working for some of them, and some of them don't have AC, and if you don't have air conditioner how are you going to cook. Even if it's winter time, you need a proper working kitchen. So having said that, since we know this pandemic has highlighted those problem for us and we know the percentage, so how is the food structure coming to our district? Are they still processing, because I'm hearing that you have great food, but I have visited my school. I have not seen great plate of food or the tray of food. that a part? And I heard you say it's throughout the We have a set of diets for everyone, right?

So.

2

3

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

1

So have you seen a decrease in the workers, the kitchen staff post-pandemic?

4 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: definitely post-pandemic. During the height of the 5

pandemic we lost around 2,000 employees. We are now almost back up to the regular staffing levels that we were pre-pandemic. I do want to reiterate that meals should be uniformed across the city. There are menus for the pre-k through eight and there are menus for high school. If there are individual situations and you go visit schools, please let us know immediately. We will go. We will partner with you. We will walk through those schools to make sure we address any issues that are there. Our job is to make sure we are serving nutritious, delicious, and healthy meals at every single school. We also offer salad bars at every single school, either as an actual bar or we're making the actual salads, presenting them to kids, and it is actually menu'd twice a week on our menus, actual salad in addition to the other entrée and the other components of the meal that we get. Very important that we continue to look at products that are lower in sodium, lower in sugar. We no longer serve juice in the morning. We make sure water is

1

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

available every single day in every single cafeteria.

3 Our milk is all low-fat and non-fat. We are always

4 encouraging our cont--

> COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: [interposing] I was getting to that. I guess somebody jump into it. I was getting to that, too. Go ahead, let him.

> > EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: We cut--

COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: [interposing] We don't want chocolate milk for our children. We have to have it decreased. We're not going to go back and forth, Council Member.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: This Mayor and Chancellor has charged us with making sure we continue to improve our menus to make them healthier every single day. All of our products, we look for healthier products. We have reduced processing of foods. We have reduced processed foods, specifically processed meats on our menu since 2019. serve beef once every three weeks. We have two meatless days, and we have Plant Power Fridays. I do want to mention, our Plant Powered Fridays are primarily scratch recipes that are cooked, fresh vegetables, are roasted every single week in the schools. It should be uniformed. If it is not

uniformed and you see something, let me know. We will personally go out together to make sure we fix all of this. My job is to service every student equally across the City.

COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: I love that, because I'm going to take you on for that. And if you know me, you should not promise to me, because I'm going to get it.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: I think Chair Joseph can second that I will go out to his school to make sure these things are happening.

COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Okay, okay.

And about staffing for the school aid-- I mean,
cafeteria.

very much for asking that question. Our employees are the most important think to us and the heart of our operations. Not all heroes wear capes, some do wear aprons. We have hiring halls almost every single Saturday. We've had these hiring since the beginning of February. We've interviewed over 3,800 individuals that are looking to work for our organizations. We have hired a good portion of that. We have—obviously, have a rigorous hiring process as well as

very much. My time is up. I'll come back

24

2.2

2.3

[inaudible].

Thank you. I

44

3

4

6

7 8

10

11 12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: I'd like to recognize Council Member Restler. Thank you. Next person Council Member De La Rosa?

COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA:

want to just piggy-back on the comments my colleagues have made about the kitchens. I think it's important. We've heard from union members and workers about the real risk to their health with overheated kitchens, and so I just want to make sure that, you know, that's top priority for this council. And I want to ask a question about inequities. been visiting the schools in my district. Some of these buildings are 100 years old, right, which I know it's a problem, but there are some schools that you go and they have a cool kitchen where they can actually cook and then there's school buildings where they can only heat up the food, right? I think that as we look to invest in our school buildings, we need to address those inequities because if we know everything that we know about school which is that most kids get their calories from school. I have an eight-year-old. She's always hungry. She goes to school at eight o'clock in the morning and she's there 'til five o'clock in the afternoon. So, they

2.2

2.3

need to have the adequate equipment to be able to

actually prepare nutritious food. So, how-- what is

the plan for dealing with [inaudible] inequity?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Thank you for that question, and I'm glad you recognized that. It's very important that we continue to have these conversations about the really older buildings with the smaller kitchens and see what the future holds for that.

KEVIN MORAN: So, I appreciate the question, and you do point out the varying ages of our structures. My three kids went to an elementary school that was over 100 years old, their junior high school 60 years old, and so we know that there's varying space challenges. We would like to see-meet the schools where they are, see what's available. We just redid a cafeteria at Brownsville Collaborative where we started moving the furn-- if you will, the chillers and the boxes, refrigerators, within the space, and actually taking the adjacent space to create more space for the kitchen and the workers. And so, I think the older designs do limit our ability to have a full functioning kitchen. Certainly new designs and scopes with the School

2.2

2.3

Construction Authority allow for such expansion, but I'd like to if there's a site specific that you want to go to, we'd love to partner on solutioning [sic] in real time, because sometimes there is space when our Office of Space Management Team to figure out other spaces where we can move things to create more space, so to speak. So we'll look forward to-- but we acknowledge that is an issue with the older buildings and we'd like to partner on some issues.

COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Great.

echo briefly, having this conversation and having—
and hearing about things about things that you see is
really important for us to be able to know and
address. So never feel that you can't call us up,
email us and ask us questions or ask us to a visit a
school where you have concerns.

you don't-- y'all don't know me very well, but I've never shy to call. I will say that one of things I'm concerned about is the hours for lunch. My child, again, you know, they have lunch at 10 o'clock in the morning. They already have breakfast at home and then lunch at 10 o'clock in the morning. The school

3

4

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

day ends at 5:00. What are we doing to look at— and you know, this is not passing blame at all, at the administrators of the school, because clearly they're doing the best they can with having to keep up with pandemic restrictions, having to make sure that kids are spread out. But what can we do to fix this a little bit or tweak the space so that more kids can have lunch at lunchtime?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: So, I think there's two things in that question. One is that the amount of space where children eat lunch. Back to what my boss was saying, Kevin, about expanding those conversations and talking about the renovations. But also as a former principal I had three lunch periods. Each lunch period was 50 minutes, and I had two grades in that lunch period. One grade would go outside or go into the auditorium while the other grade eats, and I'd have to switch after that. We need to be very creative and continue these conversations with principals, and I think during the pandemic we had to stretch out those lunch periods because of social distancing. We are really excited that come September we're returning to prepandemic services where will go back into the

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13 14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

cafeteria. We'll go back into all the other areas where students were going to hopefully reduce some of those issues that you mentioned.

COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you. CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you, Carmen De La-- I mean, Council Member De La Rosa. Council Member Louis?

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you, Chair, for the opportunity. Good morning. Thank you for joining us. I have a three-part question. One is on cafeteria re-design and the infrastructure implementation component, vegan options and MWBE's. Alright, so the first one is in regards-- and this was mentioned by my colleagues already. But regarding the cafeteria re-design initiative, I wanted to know does that include the infrastructure for the cooking area for our cafeteria workers that you all discussed here, and some of the members brought up earlier. That's the part one question, but there's a part B to that. We-- all of us advocated for capital funds cooking kitchens and cafeteria for all schools. Is that going to be part of the cafeteria re-design component initially that you mentioned today? Because if you get that done on

2.2

a weekend, and we already implemented the funding,
can we get that done by the summer, by the end of the
summer? So that's the first question. The second
question is in regards to [inaudible] rising [sic].
So, I saw on here grab-n-go, but I wanted to know
would there be a vegan option for [inaudible],
students participating in Summer Rising [sic]. And
are you all thinking about MWBE vendors for the vegan
options that we're trying to implement? So, vegan
Fridays, I love the idea. I think our Mayor is
amazing, I think, to bring this up. And the kids
complained the food wasn't good. Some of it wasn't
even vegan. So I wanted to know what does that look
like moving forward for your agency, and how could we
be helpful in that area? Thank you so much.

for those questions. All great questions. The cafeteria enhancement experience is only the cafeteria service line and the actually cafeteria where the children sit. It does not include any infrastructure work that needs to be done in the kitchen. It doesn't mean that we realize that some of that work does need to be completed and renovated as my-- as Kevin mentioned about these older aging

buildings. What we do in a weekend is we replace the
service line with new equipment, new self-service
equipment, new tables, and we partner with students
to create what that atmosphere will look like,
including artwork that's on the walls. It does not
include kitchen infrastructure. Two, Summer Rising
[sic], our menus are always meatless on Monday and
plant powered on Friday. The combination of the two
questions, our Friday main entrée is a scratched cook
plant powered vegan option. There are always other
options, vegetarian options, available on Friday for
students that may not want that individual vegan item
that is plant powered. So, I know you said not all
options are vegan, because they're not. We always
allow students to have that option, but our main
center of the plate will always be that plant powered
vegan option. We always want to give students
choices to be able to make some decisions for
themselves or at least talk to their parents about
those decisions. We communicated that, but I think
I, we, my team at the Department needs to do a little
bit better job on the menu. Next year, in September,
you will see that clearly pointed out in the menu so
there is no confusion around the options that are

## COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2.2

2.3

there. But I do want to reiterate, every day there
are alternative options. On Mondays that are
meatless, there are meatless alternative options for
students to take, not just the main option that's
there, and on Friday, there are a whole bunch of
different options on our menu, bottom right box in
blue and white font. You'll see all of the actual
options that are available. One of our stars is this
chickpea Mediterranean wrap that is a vegan entre
that is absolutely delicious.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: You sound like you like that one a lot. It sounds like you like that one a lot, so I hope you're enjoying it.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Yes, that is correct.

council MEMBER Louis: And how can we ensure everything that you just shared about Mondays and Fridays and different options? How could your agency and the council communicate that better so that it's across the board universal, that it's available?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: One, I hold myself and my team accountable to make sure that dos happen in every single school in every single

school on every single day we stay on mend, but it s
always good to have feedback from the community,
including our relationships with principals and
principals in charge during Summer Rising or the
public feeding sites. We rely on eyes and ears
throughout the entire school, and as mentioned
earlier, the more feedback we get, the better it is.
We are as transparent as possible. Our menus are
public on the website for a reason. If someone sees
something that is not on the menu, I need it to be
told to my office. But there are situations and
circumstances where supply chain or other things may
happen. We may get shorted from a vendor, etcetera,
but we will always address it. The MWBE
conversation, that is written. That language is
written into every single contract that we write, and
we look for that option as well as the local option,
and all future contracts that we are going into.
CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Council Member
Menin?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Thank you, Chair Joseph. So, I have a number of questions. for the summer meal programs, given that it's starting on June 28<sup>th</sup>, have you all sent out notice, and in how

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

1

many languages are you sending notice out, and what 3 is the form of the notice?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Thank you much for asking that question. As per the City Council law, we are required to post all the summer location by June 1st. That was posted by May 27th. In addition to that, we are actually sending home a letter. Each principal has a letter that will be back-packed to students before the last day of school, by the 20<sup>th</sup> in this envelope. In this envelope it actually has the nine languages that are translated for folks to find the summer sites. letter also says the three closest sites. If their building is not open. It'll be listed here for parents to go and find it. We always encourage folks to look on our website, on our web page, the summer look-up tool that'll give the most accurate data for the number of sites that are closest in that zip code.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Okay. question on procurement. Why does the DOE policy require distributors to directly purchase the Departments food, but DOE, as I understand it, it's choosing the food product. So my concern is that

Τ	COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION 54
2	it's really as the Comptroller's 2021 report
3	indicates it's cutting down on both competition, and
4	it's really creating an issue regarding transparency
5	EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Great
6	question. We create the spec [sic] of the type of
7	food we want based on the USDA requirements and the
8	New York City Department of Health requirements.
9	Yes, we have three main distributors and that
10	contract goes until the end of 2024, but in the past
11	three years we have prioritized contract-direct
12	relationships which answered a lot of the
13	Comptroller's concerns in that investigation. We
14	want to go more contract-direct, but we always have
15	to keep a safety net to make sure we have the
16	availability of food to make sure we never miss a
17	meal. We always have the supply. We always have the
18	inventory and we always have an intense large product
19	basket to make sure we meet the reimbursable national
20	program standards every single day.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: So, do you feel that you have answered the Comptroller's concerns adequately?

21

22

23

24

25

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: One hundred percent. That letter was written and the

2.2

2.3

investigation was done, I believe, towards the end of
17-18. Ever since then we have been working on all
of the things that were identified through a part of
that conversation to make sure we are moving in the
right direction as a department in the City.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: It would—— I think it would be helpful if I could ask Chair if we could get information on that to the committee, because I think the Comptroller raised some really important issues. So it'd be great to have that data.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Would love to.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: For the scratch cooking pilot program, are you going to be expanding it and into what neighborhoods if you are?

question, and it has come up in multiple conversations. Currently, and since the pilot, we have two main sites in the Bronx, one at Morris Campus which has multiple schools in it, and another at 218 in the Bronx. We quickly learned that not all kitchens, because of the size and infrastructure, can do scratch cooking from the beginning. What we did learn from those two sites is that we could create

2.2

recipes and use those two sites in the Bronx as test
kitchens to be able to create recipes and have them
on every menu in every school. We actually have
scratch recipes that were created at those two sites
that are on the menu every single day. We have
several options, including the options that are on
plant powered Fridays. Some of our roasted vegetable
recipes, some of our pasta recipes are actually
created at the scratch kitchen and then put on our
menus citywide. At the moment, we don't have any
plans to expand infrastructure, but we continue to
have plans to expand scratch recipes across all
schools and on every menu in the City.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: The number of food-insecure children in the city, as you know, is one in four. So what are the Administration's overall plans to address food insecurity?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: I think
the most important part to answer that question is to
continue to promote our menus, talk about our menus,
talk to school communities, engage the school
communities, engage stakeholders bout what we do and
what we provide in schools to make sure all parents

1	COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION 57
2	and children are aware of the free meals that we
3	offer for breakfast/lunch, snack, and dinner.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Okay. Thank you.
5	CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you, Council
6	Member. Council Member Abreu?
7	COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Thank you, Chair
8	Joseph. So, I just want to revisit the part of
9	excessive heating and the lack of air conditioning.
10	As you know, that has a huge impact on the
11	preparation of food, but also causes unhealthy work
12	conditions for school workers. How many school
13	kitchens currently lack air conditioning?
14	EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: A couple
15	of things, and then I'm going to ask Kevin to jump in
16	there as well. The health and wellbeing of our
17	workers is the most important thing.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Do you have a
19	number?
20	EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Yes, I do.
21	Currently, as Kevin mentioned, we have over 500
22	school kitchens that are air conditioned, but I also
23	want to make sure folks know that when it is hot, we
24	do shut the ovens off. It is policy to turn the

ovens off and go to a cold menu to protect our

25

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

workers. The other thing, too, is we ask them to move out of the kitchen to prepare meals to make sure there's alternative space in and around the cafeteria and the kitchen to be able to do that where the ovens are not and where there is better ventilation. As far as the air conditioning question, I'm going to ask Kevin.

KEVIN MORAN: Yeah, so I'd start with-thank you, Council Member, for the question. start with the prioritization in the summer months is to target the schools that have air conditioning. in the hottest stretches of the year that we're in air conditioned environments. To Chris' point, we do dial back the heat generating appliances within the kitchen when needed. Knowing that we're over 500 that have the air condition, I want to revisit just thanking the Council for their advocacy for the additional monies. The Chancellor is very clear on asking sure work environments are where they should be for our workers. We very much value them, thank them every day for their service. So, those 411 sites, we're going to get to as fast as we can. just completed since May 30 two of those. I visit regularly with Chris, and it really does make a

difference within the kitchen spaces. We do identify
that there are sites that are complex that lack
windows, where the current ventilation could be
improved, but through a different system and not
necessarily a split unit configuration that may work
there may not work elsewhere, or a window unit may
work there may not work elsewhere. So we're
definitely going to come back to the Council and kind
of pacing where we are to getting every single
school kitchen to a place where it's comfortable. I
would say we're building off the successes of the AC
for All initiative where every instructional space
was identified was air conditioned, and thank you for
the Council for years of advocating for that. Now,
moving to non-instructional spaces as we we're
going to focus that next and sure I'll get back to
you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Thank you. I have three more questions. So I just want to get through my time. By the way, I'm a big fan of the Chancellor, so. What is the average cost of installing the air conditioning in the kitchen, if you have that?

KEVIN MORAN: Yeah, window units are less
expensive. So you could have a scenario where you're
looking at 5,000 dollars for window [sic] frame
insulation, electric and that. There could be
instances where you're looking at 100,000 dollar
installation where a split-unit or condenser needs to
go, [inaudible] goes on the roof or exterior of
building, you may have seen some of those. I'm not a
huge fan [inaudible] prefer, but the longer the run,
the third or fourth, five stories buildings it's more
expensive cost prohibitive. So, they could
arrange
COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: [interposing] You
would say in what range?

KEVIN MORAN: The window units range [inaudible]

COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Thank you. What does-- does DOE have plans to install air conditioning every school kitchen? If not, why not? If you could speak to the short-term and long-term plan to prevent overheated kitchens this summer.

KEVIN MORAN: Absolutely. Goal setting to getting to a place where every kitchen is comfortable for all our workers. So, we are on pace

plant powered Fridays come from scratch recipes, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, that

25 | didn't--

2.3

24

1	COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION 62					
2	EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO:					
3	[interposing] There are other options that are					
4	available that are not scratch, but the main entrée					
5	that is presented on the menu comes from a scratch					
6	recipe.					
7	COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: But that					
8	doesn't imply that implies that then every school					
9	has that					
10	EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO:					
11	[interposing] Every single school that you see the					
12	menu option listed is the same across the city. So					
13	if rice and plantain power bowl is listed, it will be					
14	the same in every single school.					
15	COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, so every					
16	school has access to scratch cooked meals.					
17	EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Scratch					
18	recipes, yes.					
19	COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Scratch					
20	recipes, okay. Can you share what the cost of school					
21	lunch is, what's the cost to prepare it?					
22	EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Without					
23	labor it's around four dollars.					
2.4	COUNCIL MEMDED CUTTÉDDEZ. Without labor					

it's four dollars. And what do you think an increase

1

3

4

6

7

8

9

10 11

12 13

14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21 2.2

2.3

24

25

to that, how would it impact the variety or the quality of school lunches? Let's say an increase of a dollar or two from y'all.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: that allows us to explore other options and explore things that might be more favorable to students.

COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ:

considering we've had an extensive conversation on feedback, I think like a lot of my colleagues have been meeting with schools, speaking with students with even the staff, and I'm just curious to know, I'm aware-- I know that there's extensive testing done in research labs on school meals, and you are-the DOE is really forward about feedback from students, but I still-- kids are still complaining, right? They're still unwilling to eat the food. I know for a fact like just last week kids said, like, well, they just don't eat, right? It could be a myriad of reasons. I'm not blaming it entirely on the food, but what do you see as the main challenges on those areas? When you're getting feedback from kids from us here, what are some of the challenges that you're hearing, and what are you all planning for the future to solve for that?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO:

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

some of the most important things we need to do is to continue to engage stakeholders, and our stakeholders here are the school communities as well as students. We need to be in every single school. We're going to be doing that in the fall, meeting with PTAs, meeting with school leadership teams, meeting with students to make sure they understand the menu, but we're also talking more to principals and school administrations to help promote our meals in the schools. I'll give you an example. As principal, I had a child read the 100 percent attendance every single day of all the classes and talk about the menu choices. I was in district 32 in Bushwick, and I wanted to make sure that the kids understood what was being served and they had knowledge of that. But also, as a principal, I went down to the lunch room and I ate with my students. I think when we start to get more into that and we have the school administration, parents and students together and having the same conversation, we do increase participation across the I'm very proud to say that we still are serving over 800,000 meals per day, and I think that's important to recognize, especially given the

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Assistant Principal there, and then Principal at 75 for about 10 years.

COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Also in my district, fantastic.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: You can tell me the school where you went where the kids are saying they're not eating, I'd love to go and visit.

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

2	COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: I'll tell you
3	offline. But I appreciate that. And I was in
4	school, actually, when plantains were integrated into
5	the school lunch, and I can't tell you how you
6	know, that really changed the way that I approached
7	food, and so I just would love to see it more of an
8	expansion, and that's why I appreciate what you're
9	saying as far as outreach. So my last question is
10	related to summer meals, and I think during the
11	pandemic this really was a game-changer for our
12	families. One of the things I really loved to see was
13	that students could pick up and go, but also it was
14	available to their caregivers, to their parents as
15	well. I know that that's not something that looks
16	like it's in the budget, but is this is this a
17	concept that the DOE is looking at as a means to
18	combat food insecurity when we're offering free meals
19	to our students, that we continue to make it
20	available to their caregivers, their families as
21	well?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: We were extremely proud and honored to be able to serve New York City children and adults alike during the pandemic. Once we returned to in-person learning, we

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

transitioned the food public meal service to the City's robust food pantries throughout the City. We do have links on our website as well as the DSS website, which will give parents access to the food that they need.

COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Fantastic. And then my last question, going off a little bit of what Council Member Menin was asking about the outreach. The sites you said should have been up by May 27<sup>th</sup>. Are they--

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: There was a spreadsheet up by May 27<sup>th</sup>, and as of this morning, the look-up tool was active. When you go on our web page, all you need to do is put your zip code in, and then all of the sites within that zip code will come up, not just schools, but pools, park, NYCHA's developments, libraries will all be included in that. I do want to make sure that everyone understands, we're continuing to do outreach to our folks and to other city agencies to continue to increase the number of sites that will be serving meals throughout the summer.

COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, you said just today-- I'm sorry, I know I'm over time. I

would help us because we asked for bathrooms,

25

2.2

2	electrical, God knows what, and we could help with
3	the renovation of those kitchens if needed. So, it
4	would be good to have that up on the data point,
5	which is warming and which is scratch, and what we
6	can do to help. I never heard anybody ask. The
7	Principals don't focus on food. I'm going to be
8	honest with you. We do. You do. So we need that.
9	Also, how many schools have functioning dishwashers?
10	How many have, what I want, are the apple cutters?
11	mean, I know those are silly, but what do you have

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Yeah, I don't have them in front of me, but I can definitely get them to you.

those metrics? Dishwashers?

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, and then the deli-- what I call deli-style. How many schools have that, which I pay for brand dice [sic]? Is that something that is helpful? How many have it, etcetera?

Member, that C [sic] initiative actually. So the deli-style service is part of the C initiative. So that is part of our expansion. And any new school that is built--

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15 16

17

18

19

20

21

2.3

2.2

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] I'm talking about the old schools. I don't hold no damn new schools. I'm talking about the old schools.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: combination of both. We got the 50 million to do 100 more C deli-style, but also new schools that are built, we're always installing--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] I don't care about new schools. Manhattan doesn't have too many new schools. So, the deli-style will be going into every current school?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Our plan is to do every middle school and high school with any funding that can come, and of course, we thank the Council for the 50 million that's coming, and of course, we're going to love to partner with you to try to get more.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, so I need that data on dishwashers, warming, scratch.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: We have it all.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And I want apple cutters. Nobody eats a whole apple. I've been saying that for 20 years.

## COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

## 2 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO:

3 Understood.

2.2

2.3

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. I bought two, but you could buy some also. The issue of— this is, obviously, I'm a, as you know, a Nancy Eaton [sp?] fan big time.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: [inaudible]

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And the issue is how do you support a chef coalition to design menus and provide training for school cooks? You have great, great staff. I know them. But are you out doing that kind of outreach to see if there are other coalitions that could help with some of the designing of the menus and training?

very much for that. We actually partner closely with Wits [sp?] as well as the Coalition for Healthy School Food. We now have cook ambassadors, one in every district, which comes from the model from Nancy Easton and her team. They will help train those cook ambassadors to help train the individual cooks that are in every single kitchen that we have.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, and then what happens with the Friday-- we heard earlier about

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

the-- you're doing that-- I'm not big on healthy food or anything, just so you know. I like fresh food. I'm telling you right now I like fresh food. Mayor and I have had this disagreement for many years. I like fresh food. So the question is-- you and I have been up to Orange County. We've been to the black dirt lettuce. We've been all these different places together. So my question is what are we doing about working with Grow NYC, Cornell, etcetera. I know we have certain days, but to be honest with you the food metrics report, which I read religiously has -- indicates that the local dairy and produce to DOE has reduced a lot from 2018 to 2021. Now, I know it's hard sometimes to buy locally, but to me, that makes the food what-- appetizing to me and to every school child. So what are doing about this issue that I, again, have been talking about for 20 years?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: I appreciate those concerns, and we look to address all of those, especially now that we are coming out of the pandemic. I think during the pandemic--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] We didn't do it before the pandemic, Chris.

2.2

2.3

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: We are looking to increase all of our local spend as well as looking to increase all fresh vegetables from salad bars--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] How are we doing that? I'm sorry. How are we actually trying to increase those metrics?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: So, we're looking to have contracts that call out language for local vendors.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, because right now it's just "could", not mandated. Is there some way we could make it mandated that we purchase locally?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Would love to continue this conversation with broader folks--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] this is 20 years discussing this. He and I have been going back and forth. The final— the final issue is just in terms of the food— you know, you talked about training, I know you mentioned that, but how exactly does that take place in the schools, the training. How do you— working on this training program? Just can you be more specific?

3

4

5

6

7

8

10 11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

2.2

2.3

very much. 24

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Yes,

that's a great question. Prior to the pandemic, we brought everyone to headquarters from across the This was 1,600 cooks coming throughout the City. weeks, throughout the months to do training. realized that during the pandemic, we need to go to the schools. So we are now training one cook ambassador, which will be the head cook in every single district, which will then go into each of the schools in the district to help train the cooks that are in the schools.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. I could go on and on, but thank you very much. I think the Feds are also not helpful in terms of some of their allocations. I know you said four dollars, but there was an article in the paper the other day that the Feds are being challenging. Are you able to work on They're trying to hurt-- I don't know if it's that? New York, but around the country in terms of cutting.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: We'd love to continue those conversations.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Ah-ha, thank you

25

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

2.2 2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you, Council Member Brewer. Council Member Hanif?

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you. First I just want to thank you for meeting with me earlier this year to help me better understand the halal food expansion work in our schools. Growing up, going to public schools in this city, I didn't have the opportunity to like rejoice in the amount of food options that we have now, and I remember Muslim kids and I at PS230 we would need to tag team when there was pepperoni on the pizza and when there were ham sandwiches. And they weren't labeled, and so we had to do our best to determine which day we were almost about to eat pork, and then to understand why that was happening. So we're at a really unique place in our city in recognizing what food justice means. so really hats off to the advocacy that took place, and particularly by Muslim families to bring about the expansion which is now a permanent program. so I'm really excited by the expansion. I know that you mentioned that there are many more schools in the process of certifying. Are you able to provide us with a list of those schools? And in particular would love to know PS230, where I went to school,

Thank you

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

1213

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

what's the status with that school, and if you all are doing proactive outreach to ensure that schools know that this is possible.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO:

for those questions, and you're welcome for that visit that you and I had over Zoom, and it was a learning experiment for us well. One, I have to thank the Council for just helping us create the halal and kosher pilot that we did way back then, because this would not exist if it wasn't for the partnership of the Council. We are now in the middle of certifying 15 additional kitchens that will be inservice come September 2022, but we also are meeting with all community education councils, PTA, school leadership teams to get the word out about our program. And one of the other -- one of the things that is a requirement for my staff when they go to meet with schools is to talk about all of the options and halal and kosher are options there to continue to get the word out. We want to make sure that the Chancellor's vision about engaging stakeholders and engaging school communities stays. So any time this conversation about any option, including halal, comes up, we want to make sure the school community has a

J

conversation with the administration of the building, and that we are contacted and star the process from there. We want to get this information out as much as possible, and I think we've done a great job this year in increasing the number of sites, but we are open to conversations about more sites within the City.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: And do you have anything specific about PS230 at this moment?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: I will get back to you, I promise you.

that. I mean, it was really great to learn that over the last decade we have stopped using pork products. We no longer are providing fried foods. I think this is an interesting shift, and again, speaks to the food justice work that is so necessary at this time. Is there curriculum about the fact that there are all of these options? Like, are children learning what it means to have halal food and kosher food, vegan options, meatless Mondays. Is that being— is that something that they're learning in the process of their lunches.

_	COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION 70
2	EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Going
3	forward, we have a Principal's Guide that's available
4	for all principals that talks about all of our
5	options. We ask our staff when they're going to have
6	these stakeholder and community engagement meetings
7	to talk about all of those options. And one of the
8	things we're expecting to happen after that is the
9	principals and the teachers talk about what's
10	happening within the school lunch room. But then
11	there's a different component which I think is the
12	nutrition education piece, which lives within the
13	Office of Wellness, which I know they're tapping into
14	all of the things that we're doing within the school
15	food kitchens.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: So right now,
17	like, in the school curriculum there isn't something
18	built in where people are learning, oh, halal means
19	this and kosher means that, and here's what these
20	options
21	EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO:
22	[interposing] I don't
23	COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: [interposing] Okay.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: I'm not

25 sure.

24

\_

S

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: And then, I don't think I caught this, but how many schools have community gardens?

KEVIN MORAN: 952.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: And then is there an option for families to take home fresh produce? Like, how does the community garden work?

It ike to-- depending on the proximity. Some are within the-- the hydroponics are nested within classrooms. Some are raised bed outside where there's access, where it's open at certain hours, closed at certain hours. Sharing and distributing, we'll get back to you on terms of what is available to the community at-large.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Yeah, I was just curious. Given the scope of food insecurity, wondering if the community gardens have been an outlet for families to take home vegetables and/or is that something that we can pilot to ensure that families are able to take home food, or young people at any given day beyond eating in the schools are able to take home something?

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

KEVIN MORAN: Yeah, and as a follow-up, that's a great question. I'll make sure I get back to you on process and distribution to be sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you so much. And I was excited to hear about the rooftop access as a potential space for gardening. Would love to know how many schools -- how many schools are being utilized for this.

KEVIN MORAN: I'd say on the top line on rooftops it's complicated with the multiple means of egress and the way things we have to develop, but it's very affordable to do something on ground in raised planter beds. That's quick and easy, but I'll definitely get back to you on the number of rooftop installations we have currently.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Great. And I'd love the breakdown to be by school district. Thank That's all I have. you.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you, Council Member. Council Member Avilés?

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: [inaudible] hello, good afternoon. So I guess I have a couple of different kind of questions. We talked a little bit about the hiring halls. I was curious if you could

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

tell us how many vacancies we have and also what are the average wages for these positions?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: would say approximately about 500 vacancies we have across the City right now. That includes school lunch helpers, heavy-duty persons and cooks in the school, and the average wage for a school lunch helper is \$17 dollars and change an hour.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: And has there been any consideration around increasing that wage to attract people that cannot live in New York City on 17 dollars an hour?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: We work really close with our partners in the 372 Local DC37 and are having these conversations currently.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: In terms of -- we definitely like to consider those conversations. Clearly, with the increase in cost of everything in New York City, particularly housing, and wages that are not increasing nearly that much, this is a serious issue for all of us, and we wnt to retain our New Yorkers with living wage jobs. So, in terms of-in terms of the school food contracts, I represent District 38 in South Brooklyn, and we have a company,

2.2

2.3

the Preferred Meals Systems, also called the Marimott [sp?] Corporation, which has certainly a history with the City. We were just informed as of May that the company is closing, and there intention is to lay off all 300 employees, most who live in my district.

However, their contract seems to be ending the following year. Do you have any information that you can offer us that we can help our residents?

aware of the situation with Marimott Preferred Food.

Obviously, there was a national conversation about this as well. We are in the talks and working towards making sure there is zero disruption to food service that was coming out of Marimott. I can have more information for you later on, hopefully this month, but we are working to ensure that we will have no disruption to meal service coming out of Marimott.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Great. I am clearly concerned about disruption of meal service to our students and other entities that depend on that work, but I'm even more concerned about the workers who will just be let go in this economy and have no place to go. Also-- so I'd love to follow up with you on that. So, I'm a long-time mom, PTA mom who

2.2

2.3

ran around many public schools. It drove me crazy that there was practice that if a child was served a tray of something and they only wanted the apple on the tray, the worker could only give them the full tray, and they would take the apple and they would dump the rest of the food in the trash. Is this still a practice?

great question, question that comes up often. The
USDA regulation mandates in order to get reimbursed
for a meal, which we're part of the School Food
Authority in the USDA, we need to serve— excuse me,
we need to mandate and serve three components, but we
offer up to five components. So, three components
must be on the tray every single time a student takes
a meal, and we then get reimbursed for that. If the
student does not take the mandated three components,
the City does not get reimbursed for the meal.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: So, is there any way to address that we are just throwing perfectly good food in the trash, because we are stuck serving three components that are not going to be used?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: I appreciate that question, and actually there's been

2.2

2.3

conversations going on for the past several years, and starting this fall we'll have a small pilot program that we will be able to donate some of this food locally to food pantries. It will start very small, but it's something that we've been working throughout the pandemic to be able to do this. As a former principal, I also set up share tables within my cafeteria where food can be stored safely and then giving out afterwards. It is a practice that we rely on schools to be able to do because we need to make sure the food temperature stays safe, or if it's something that doesn't need to be refrigerated, it's even better, but we are working on that to be able to reduce waste within the schools.

think given the food insecurity that we see across the City, and this was several years back, and it's particularly egregious to watch perfectly good food being tossed in the trash for no reason other than an arbitrary contract by the Federal Government. So, I'd love to work with you more about that. We should be rescuing food 100 percent. There should be no throwing of perfectly good food into the trash. In terms of— actually, with school gardens— this might

2.2

2.3

be old news. I wanted to know if this was the fill
[sic] practice. Vegetables that were grown in school
gardens, the students were not allowed to take them
home in many cases, and this was a couple years back
so I don't know if this is old news. I'd love for you
to verify. Are schools, are children able to now
eat those vegetables that are grown and given to
their families?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: I think-yeah, Kevin's going to speak a little bit about it,
though. But I've personally been to schools where
I've seen it go home. I've seen--

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: [interposing] I know teachers would be like take it, but at the time it wasn't allowed, and I just don't know if that was a particular situation or generally there's particular permissions that need to be had around it.

KEVIN MORAN: The harvesting and the distribution of the food underpins that program. So I don't know if there's a place that would be preventing that from happening, but I'll follow up for sure. And if you have specific example, I'll go right to the school, but this is very important to the sustainability of the program.

2.2

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Absolutely,

great. I'll follow up, and it might be, again, old news. Chair, just one more quick question. In terms of hydroponic gardens, how many hydroponic gardens do we have in public schools? And I'd love to know, obviously, off the record what that looks like in my district.

EVIN MORAN: I don't know if I have the exact number of the hydroponics. Let me look, but if not I can definitely get it to you. That's expanding and something that's very popular. It's actually affordable and it's easier than raised planter beds, and it's within our control directly day to day. But I'll get you the accurate number on those labs now.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: And that number ws included in the total number of gardens [inaudible].

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Great. I think one of the challenges we saw with the gardens was it 100 percent depended on parent participation, working class communities where parents are working all day. They don't have time to garden. And so we saw the very immediate inequity happening in schools across the district where you had available partners having

2.2

2.3

Thank you.

beautiful gardens and schools that did not have that luxury have no gardens, and teaches hustling to do classwork with children and try to introduce gardens as well. So I would love to learn a little bit more about what's the plan to really support gardening and sustainability efforts equitably across the City.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you, Council Member. Council Member Stevens?

afternoon. I just have— and I'm sorry if this has already been asked. But one of the questions that I have, because especially in black and brown communities, a lot of us are lactose intolerant, but milk is the main source of drink for young people, which I do not understand. Can we talk about what does that look like for transition? I know at some schools, especially some of the newer ones, they have like water stations and stuff like that, but what are some of the other options, because I think it's crazy that we're still giving children milk.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: That's a great question. To be clear, milk is offered with every single meal, not mandated. So students always

2.2

2.3

should have the option of fresh water inside of the cafeteria, either through a water fountain, a bottle filler, or a water jet, which are those water coolers. Our mission is to make sure we get water jets on every single school food cafeteria service line, but if there are brand new water fillers with water fountains in there, we can supplement there. We are exploring, and we'd love to continue this conversation possibly with the Council around funding, about what alternatives to milk might look like in the future.

COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Yeah, I think that's important. We have to start having this conversation, because to me it's crazy. So many children are lactose intolerant, and even to say a water fountain— if you're eating your lunch there's not cups provided, like those things. So I think that we need to really start thinking about what those options really look like. We have children who drink the milk because they don't have other options, and then their stomach is upset for the rest of the day. And it's never addressed, even with the cereal. There's always a dairy option. There's no like oat milk or almond milk or anything else offered, and

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: You are correct. You need specific number to receive the hot dinner option. I'd love to continue this conversation about what it looks like going forward.

2.2

2.3

Obviously, this has a staffing impact. We would need the additional staff to stay afterwards. Snack, the cold snack that you're referencing really is packed by my employed during the day and then handed out usually by someone from the after school program. Hot meals, we require staff to be there, food safety temperature, as well as having a food safety handling certificate which is required any time hot meals are being served. But I'd love to explore and continue this conversation with you and the Council.

think it's just really important especially because if you go to a community center they'll have a hot food option, and then if you're in the school they have cold food options, and it becomes a real disparity, because a lot of our families actually depend on their young people to be fed in after school. So I think that that's really important. And I just had a follow-up question from Council Member Hanif where she was talking about the halal meals. I have a very large growing Muslim population in my district, and just wondering what does the selection process look like for the halal meal? And like, do parents have to, you know, reach out, or what does

2 that look like in order to start that process to get 3 those options in schools.

definitely not a selection process. The school community and the school Administration are interested in having halal meals in their school, all they have to do is make the request. But I just want to echo again what I said before is that the Chancellor requires and really wants to engage stakeholders in the community. So we require a principal to talk to the parent population at the school to make sure this is a choice they want to do. But I also want to say that the halal options in the schools—

COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: [interposing] Sorry, I just have a question.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: So, why do we have to have the principal engage parents? Because other folks don't have to engage parents for other food options. So, shouldn't it just be something where it's like, okay, this is a request that we should have because they see a growing population?

2.2

2.3

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

2	EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: We want to
3	make school that the school community is on the same
4	page with the request that they're making because
5	there are some changes that we have to make,
6	including bringing Imams into the school, certify the
7	kitchen and train the staff, and then we receive a
8	certificate from the specific organization that we
9	partner with. We just want to make sure that all
10	parents are aware that this is happening in the
11	school, and that is usually messaged by the school
12	administration and the principal. That's why we ask
13	for that partnership to have that done.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: That's
15	interesting. Thank vou.

interesting. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Council Member Krishnan?

COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Thank you so much, Chair Joseph, for hosting this hearing, too. Thank you both for attending as well. Kevin, I think-- I first want to say thank you for all your work with us early on in the year during the pandemic to get resources to our schools. I really appreciate how responsive you all were. You know, I want to echo some of the things that my colleagues have raised.

2	This is a really important topic and I know the
3	Department of Education is taking more steps for more
4	healthy, culturally appropriate culturally
5	responsive and appropriate food, as well. And you
6	know, just a couple things on those topics. First, I
7	do want to just echo what Council Member De La Rosa
8	had said about really ensuring that our school
9	cafeterias are properly ventilated, that our workers
10	there are able to work in the summer or in the fall
11	in situations where it's not extremely hot. So that
12	remains an ongoing concern of ours. I just want to
13	note that, that we'll be monitoring that. My first
14	question is, you know, knowing the meatless Mondays
15	and the vegan Fridays, as a vegetarian myself I'm
16	raising my children vegetarian, too, my wife and I.
17	You know, this is obviously an issue of personal
18	concern I have. while I appreciate the DOE's efforts
19	to incorporate vegetarianism and veganism into the
20	diet, the fact of the matter is that still the food
21	that I've seen that's served is not healthy
22	vegetarian food, and I think what we want to be
23	showing really is and that's the truth of it, it
24	is you know, just being vegetarian alone doesn't
25	automatically equate to healthy food, right? You

have to actually make choices and eat food that's not
processed, that's not high in cholesterol and fat,
even if there's no technically not meat on it. And
I'm not the DOE, I'm not sure has gotten there yet.
And so one question I had was from giving the
feedback from, you know, vegan Fridays or meatless
Monday's, too, are there any food consulting
organizations or dietary consultants or other
advocacy group that you all are working with to
figure out what is the best possible meal plan that
both reflects healthy food and vegetarianism?
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: That's a
great question and great concern. Thank you for
that. We actually worked specifically with wellness
in the schools, the Coalition for Healthy Food and a
lot of vegetarian/vegan organizations around the City
to create the menus. Coalition for Healthy School
Food actually works with us religiously, including

would love to go visit a school with you--

last week Friday at a school not too far from here,

to create additional vegetarian and vegan plant-

powered recipes. So we are going down that path. I

COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: [interposing]

25 Okay.

2.2

2.3

2	EXECUTIV	E DIRECTOR	TRICARICO:	to	point

out some stuff, take a look at some stuff and educate myself from your perspective, and hopefully you can be educated from my perspective and our perspective as a department about what's included in all of our food, low sodium, low fat, etcetera. But I do want to hear and see the concerns, because you have two kids in the school system--

COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: [interposing]
Absolutely.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: that are going to be eating this food. That's what matters the most.

COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Absolutely, and I would appreciate that, too, because I do know there are efforts, but you know, when I hear my child come home and say he's eating pizza, you know, or other stuff like that it's just while the philosophy and the policies are there on the ground level, may not always be getting there. So, I think it's-- and that's true across the schools. So, let's absolutely plan to do that and look forward to seeing more efforts from DOE in that regard. And my other question is, you know,-- and Council Member Hanif

alluded to this, too, but you know, we saw that
according to the CDC students in the US receive fewer
than eight hours of required nutrition education each
school year, far below the 40 to 50 hours that are
needed. Obviously, as a parent this is something
that I work on every day at home. It's also just,
you know, ensuring that, you know, my children given
all the stigmas and stereotypes about eating
vegetables and fruits and things like that. How do
we from a young age make sure that children feel
good, excited and want to eat, you know, healthy and
nutritious food, and of course, that's about
education. So, you know, I just are there upcoming
programs or what are some thoughts that we can do
here in the City to really engage students more
around nutrition education?

That is quite timely. In the past, we've aligned with our state standards and certainly track that schools were actually having nutrition and health class, and giving the hours of instruction mandated by the state on all level, but have— this Administration has been very purposeful in looking at this topic very closely. We're developing some

content now to further enrich, and I think it's more
about, you know, just the nutritional value but also
the culturally relevant experience to all and how
we are shaping our menus now, and we're going to do a
much deeper dive into how we supplement our current
nutrition and health classes. And so some in
physical education, but predominance being in our
health education classes. So, something we're
focused on as an administration now. The
Chancellor's very clear about how we develop
knowledge here and develop content and language
that's universal that people understand, to your
point earlier about you know, what is it to be vegan,
and there's so much to that, right? And we have to
catch up to kind of the larger educational experience
within classrooms about the experience in the
cafeteria.

COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Absolutely.

And I would just say in that regard, you know, it's—
and I look forward to seeing more, and you know, I
think it's— it's all connected, right? Like if we
want to have better food served in the system that,
you know, children will eat and get them more used to
it, too. From a young age these perspectives develop

2.2

2.3

2	on food that are much, much harder to undo later.
3	And so, you know, there's some good programs that
4	I've seen in the schools I visited around, as
5	mentioned before, whether it's farming techniques or,
6	you know, urban gardens and agriculture. And so, you
7	know, I just wonder if there are ways to link those
8	to education nutrition, but I think we're really we

KEVIN MORAN: And thank you very much.

I'd like to connect you to our office of school

[inaudible] possible as we think through this
together.

go to be in the business of changing mindsets, and

that's a much deeper work to [inaudible].

COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Sure.

 $\label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \endalign{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \label{eq:KEVIN MORAN: I think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \labelee \labelee think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \labelee \labelee think it'd be wonderful to} % \end{ \labelee think it'd be wonderful to}$ 

COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Absolutely, look forward to it. Thank you, appreciate it.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you, Council Member. My question is to piggy-back off of Council Member Krishnan. We know according to CDC, students in the US receive fewer hours, fewer than eight hours of nutrition education in schools, far below the 40 to 50 hours that are needed to effect behavior

and health.

2	change. So can you tell us how many schools offer
3	nutrition education programs, activities whether
4	conducted by the school staff alone or in conjunction
5	with organizations? How many CBO providers,
6	organizations, work in the schools to deliver food
7	and nutrition education, and how does the DOE track
8	the number of hours instruction students receive?
9	And have you conducted any evaluation of these
10	programs to find out which are the most effective?
11	KEVIN MORAN: So, top line on all health
12	education that's required, we do track that through
13	our systems. The STAR system actually look at
14	programming. For students in kindergarten through
15	five, they certainly have to have the health
16	instruction every year. The middle school students
17	have to have health education every day in every in
18	one semester for 54 hours. High school students are
19	the same. We're looking at building off that.
20	Ultimately, we do have state standards, and the City
21	can track that very locally through our systems. So,
22	it's something that we're, you know, I mentioned
23	earlier, trying to expand a bit more of our reach in
24	how much we offer this, both in physical education

J

2.3

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Are you able to evaluate and assess the ones that are working and the ones that are not working?

KEVIN MORAN: on the curriculum side, I'd have to get back to our Office of Teaching and Learning and see where the most effective programs that we perceive to are and where we're replicating that, but certainly is one of the pillars to replicating what works best. And so that's a great question and something I'll take back to our Division of Learning— Teaching and Learning and our wellness program.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you. One of the programs I used to run when I was still in school was cook shop. Is that something you guys are using or-- and is it something we plan to expand in other schools around the nutrition education programs?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: So, cook shop is not something that we are using agency-wide. It's something that we've hard up and sometime certainly we'll follow up on to see where it's being used, how it's being used, but it's not managed directly through our Department, and I'm not aware of schools at-large that are using it with great

## COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2.2

2.3

frequency, but something I'll follow-up. It's
certainly with the NYC Food Bank that I know works
more closely with, so we'll definitely follow up on
that item.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Yeah, because it doesn't only include the child's nutrition education, it also involves the parents and teaching them how to cook the food and duplicate the models as well. I'd like to recognize Council Member Sanchez. Thank you for being here. Do you have any questions? Any other person want to have— Council Member Krishnan, you're good? Council Member Dinowitz, you had another question?

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Thank you.

Thank you, Chair. I just wanted to know, the-- you mentioned earlier that families are no longer eligible to receive the school food, but they had been during the height of the pandemic, is that correct?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: yes.

During the pandemic we were serving the public meals.

Anyone that walked up to a door could receive a meal.

When we transitioned into-- back to student in-person learning, the program for public meals shifted to the

2

3

4

\_

5

7

8

-

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

1819

20

21

22

23

24

City's robust food pantries and other programs that they have.

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: so, I think we understand more now than maybe we did five, ten years ago the importance of things like community schools and schools as community centers as places where children and families go for more than just the eight o'clock to 2:50, whatever the school hours are. Are there any efforts centrally to partner with food pantries or trusted organizations that, you know, we fund in the Council that work with Council Members to provide maybe alternative options to the specific school food? Organizations like-- you know, we work with Met Council. We work with Common Pantry and they provide bags of groceries. Is there any effort centrally to work with these organizations to provide that food to the families outside of the school meals program?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: At the current time, I'm not familiar with any conversations that are happening, but as a city, as a Department, we would love to participate in those broader conversations for this specific initiative.

24

25

y. And just at ol composting this Council. conment and a
ol composting this Council.
this Council.
conment and a
1 1 .
e and what
that program
cups and the
ensure that
e schools,
?
I really
years, all
table. We
pictures of
ne exact year
ery both are
ery both are
-
-
_

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: I had to.

I couldn't hold that in, sorry.

that you already had an answer to that.

\_

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: I just want to clarify, the cups as well are compostable?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: The cups at the moment are not compostable, but we are in talks to try to get that done as well.

are my only additional questions. And of course, the other things mentioned earlier that we'll talk offline about my particularly schools and would love to get you to the district. Thank you both so much. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you, Council

Member. I had a very question that's very pressing.

I'm getting text messages about it. We know that the

Mayor had called the elimination of chocolate milk

from school menus due to high sugar content. So what

is the position of OFNS on this issue? How many

students currently choose chocolate milk over plain

milk, and how does the DOE-- has the DOE done an

analysis of the impact of eliminating chocolate milk

from school menus?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Currently, we still serve chocolate milk at schools. We are committed to having healthy options in schools for

a

students and we'll continue to engage all stakeholder in this conversation.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Okay, I hope they heard that, because I've been getting a lot of messaging about the chocolate milk, because even the adults drink it. We had another question, I'm not sure. I think Council Member Stevens asked for it, students who are lactose intolerant, do we have options for them?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Currently, water is available and must be available in every single cafeteria, so that is an option. Students that have a medical situation, a 504 or a prescription from a doctor can receive alternatives to milk. We are in talks around what the alternatives are to expand even further, but we're still in talks at this point.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Okay, because yeah, that was one of the questions, if there was option for soy milk, or option for oat milk, or options for almond milk.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: We have non-dairy milk available for children with a 504 accommodation or a health medication [inaudible]

2	
2	

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: And it's on-site and the staff knows to request it if it's available or

4

that's something that's being communicated? EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: It's on-

5

site every single school, and the nur-- every single 6

7

nurse in the school has an option for this as well,

8

and we rely heavily on the managers within the

school, the cooks in the schools, and the principals

10

that know the children, and communicate this

11

information to parents.

12

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Okay, very

much, Madam Chair. Apologies if you've covered this

since I was in and out listening to the hearing, but

just in comparison to the height of the pandemic, the

communities, you know, at a school, the Get Food NYC

program, how is that changing as we go into Fiscal

Thank you so

13

important. Thank you. Council Member Sanchez,

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ:

food programs that the DOE was running in

14

please?

Year 23?

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: SO, we are

really proud of the work that we did during the

pandemic, but we are really excited to return this

2.2

2.3

fall to all pre-pandemic regulations and the use of
the cafeteria. We will be back to normal service,
which is really exciting. We've learned lessons
during the pandemic, but I think it's really exciting
that we will once again see all cafeteria service
lines being used serving the best food we possibly
can and serving the healthy, nutritious and delicious
meals that we have.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay, so the emergency provision to community members outside of the school system is going to end?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: When we returned to in-person learning in September 2021, we transitioned that work to the City's food pantries and other food distribution sits. That information is on our website as well as the DSS website.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: I have a question for you around food waste. How do you-- how much food waste is the federal rule creates, and how do you collect data on food waste volume from the program?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: It's a very good question. My staff, they're all trained to do what's called batch cooking. We cook based on the

number of meals we serve. We cook based on the
attendance at the school, and we monitor this every
single day. It is a priority for our staff to make
sure they are doing this correctly. This sis also
recorded in all of our production records and all of
our books, which we are audited on. It also allows
us to cost-out every single meal, including labor.
Once a child takes the food away from the service
line and discards that, currently we do not track
that due to the fact that we would need more staff to
be able to do that. It's actually something that we
are looking into as we move forward with all of the
things that we want to do and some of the visions
that we do have four our city, but currently we do
not track food waste once it's taken away from the
cafeteria service line.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you both for your testimony today. Thank you so much. We'll be in touch and we'll have follow-up questions.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TRICARICO: Yeah, and we would love to partner, go to schools, take people on tours. It's something that we rally prioritize and want everyone to be able to see the good work that's being done. I'd just like once again just to

DONALD NESBIT: Good morning,

distinguished members of the Council and Education

Committee Chair, Rita Joseph. I'm Donald Nesbit,

Vice President for DC 37, Local 372. We represent

the members who work in school cafeterias, and prior

to being elected, I'm proud to say that my title is a

school lunch helper/cook. So I come from-- out of the

school food-- school food area of the school

building. I'm here repenting 24,000 members of my

Local, 9,000 who work in the school food section of

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

2	the school under the leadership of President Shaun D.
3	Francois, the first. On a normal day, children need
4	food in order to concentrate and learn in the
5	classroom. Local 372 is extremely supportive of the
6	breakfast program as well as the universal lunch
7	program. Every child that comes into a school
8	building should be fed and nourished. However, this
9	is demanding work. While current practices meet the
10	Department of Education the Office of school Food
11	Standards, the current guidelines stretch School Food
12	employee's thing. Between the breakfast in classroom
13	program and preparing for lunch in a short period of
14	time, on top of their core responsibilities, these
15	workers serve tens of millions of meals during the
16	pandemic to families, to the community as outlined
17	here today, and so they need more than a cla they
18	need true recognition. Furthermore, well-intentioned
19	law makers introduced legislation, for example Intro
20	199, that would require letter grades for sanitary
21	inspection. This bill doesn't include that the
22	Department of Health report would document areas of
23	the school building that are not necessarily kitchen
24	areas and would lead to further disciplinary or ways
25	to disciplinary action against the workers. The

2	strain in the workforce must be alleviated. Hiring
3	more school food more Local 372 School Food staff.
4	Respectfully, we request 1,000 additional workers to
5	alleviate the burden on the workers who are already
6	over worked due to workers leaving, due to the
7	mandates or whatever has happened during the
8	pandemic. More workers have retired than usual.
9	Another struggle faced by School Food employees which
10	has a direct impact to sanitation and hygiene. It is
11	a need for our cafeterias and kitchens to have
12	ventilation, proper ventilation, AC's, I mean cooling
13	areas. Most buildings that are built between 1930
14	and 1990 lack that proper design. In these kitchens
15	many thank you, Chair many of these Local 372
16	kitchen employees every day have little to no cooling
17	or ventilation and temperatures can reach over 130
18	degrees in some cafeterias. Working under these hot
19	conditions high temperatures are dangerous. It can
20	lead to workers passing out, experiencing heat
21	stroke. Heat stroke is the most serious illness
22	associated with work in hot environments. Workers
23	can suffer heat strokes, become delirious, confused,
24	convulsive, and comatose in some cases, and even
25	fatal. We must do something to correct this and be

2	proactive not reactive to the situation. City
3	Comptroller issued a report on this and in previous
4	City Council hearings, Council Member Treyger even
5	pushed he's here even pushed for the need for us
6	to do something immediately, because as a teacher e
7	saw the effects of kitchen worker who experienced
8	over-heated kitchens various time. So, resolution
9	it moved him to introduce Resolution 145-2019,
10	calling on the Department of Education to install air
11	conditions and cooling systems in New York City
12	public kitchens. In addition to ventilation, Local
13	372 supports the redesign of cafeterias which focuses
14	on increased numbers and student participation. But
15	finding healthy food options has been a push by the
16	Mayor and a priority. We're in support, but we will
17	reiterate that you need educational components are
18	to go with this. While implementing this policy is a
19	good step, or providing educational healthy eating
20	habit should be a focus to help our children be
21	mindful of healthy eating habits and healthier
22	choices. Children will be more inclined to eat
23	healthier options if they knew what foods are
24	beneficial to them, especially younger children. For
25	example, if you tell a child that eating carrots is

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

good for their vision and for their eyes, they'll be more inclined and likely to eat carrot compared to children who are unaware of its benefits. So, in conclusion, School Food workers are critical to a functioning school system. These workers come in every day, go above and beyond, sometimes come in before their time, leave later without being compensated. The City's children are their life's work, and in order for this program to succeed, we need adequate staffing, safe working environment, and nutrition education. And lastly, I'll end with this. This is something that should be all of our priorities, because children in our society are 20-25 percent of our population, but they are 100 percent of our future. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you so much.

Yes, you're right. They deserve more than a clap.

They were the heroes during the pandemic. I was still teaching prior to getting into the Council, so I saw firsthand what they did. Incredible, and I think we owe them more than that. So, what is that—we were—I think one of my colleagues that living wages be one of the things that the employees are offered, and safe working conditions. One of the things I know

2	Kevin talked about is installed AC's, so the workers
3	can cook in nutrition education. Well, we thank you
4	for your service. What is that you talked about
5	the Intro 191. What is the problem with that intro?
6	DONALD NESBIT: So, that bill doesn't
7	take into account that when the Department of Health
8	actually comes into a school, the Department of
9	Health does an extensive report, but it's not only
10	the kitchen that they do a report on. They also go
11	into areas like the custodian cleaning areas, like
12	the slop sink, which is not inside of the physical
13	kitchen, but it physically goes into a report. That
14	report is then issued to a supervisory or managerial
15	staff at School Food, and if there's a grade system,
16	it will only reflect on the staff of the kitchen, and
17	it will also lead to add another way of
18	disciplinary action against workers. Like we said,
19	they were heroes and sheroes [sic] for us. Adding
20	another layer of discipline and some of the report
21	doesn't even reflect the areas. I think it's just
22	unfair.
23	CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you for that.
24	I needed to know that. What is the starting salary

for someone who works at OFNS?

3

4

Ŭ

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2122

2.3

24

25

DONALD NESBIT: So, School Food employees, when they come into a job, it's 14-something an hour for senior school lunch helper and a school lunch helper. That increases over a two-year period and then they go to the incumbent [sic] rate, and as Kevin indicated earlier, it's on an average of about 17 dollars an hour.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: So, you're saying that that's not living wages for your members?

DONALD NESBIT: No. There's certainly a need to increase. If you look at, you do a comparison of School Food employees and hotels and other places, and they're certainly making salaries beyond our salaries. You look at some of the-- our kitchen-- kitchen employees do work on a level of sous chefs and chefs, and we know the type of money that they're making and this is their life work. This was my life work. Being a cook, I took into consideration that if I wouldn't eat it like this, I wasn't going to cook it for my students. Even in my visits going back to the school now, most-- I've been an officer for seven years on the union side, but I go back to the school, and just coming from that community where I worked at, so many students who

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

older brother and sisters went to the school have heard about my food and say, "Hey, when you're coming back?" Right? They cook for us now, I mean, our generation. And so many stories of this nature and the impact that we had within the schools, again, it should be more than a-- we really need to start looking at the work that they're actually doing and do a comparison of what a chef is doing and how much they are actually getting paid. We've also been making a push with the leadership in the Office of School Nutrition to actually consider our cooks for those chef positions. When the City is looking at chef positions to train, the cooks, we should get first priority as we are the ones that are actually doing those jobs on a daily basis.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: I hope Chris is taking notes. Is that one of the reasons it's been hard to staff schools?

DONALD NESBIT: It has been one of the reasons. Some individuals who have gone through the hiring halls— and I do have to give credit where it's due. Chris and I, we had a discussion on the need to hire more and release— create some relief for the workers that re current there. And so this

2.2

2.3

push has been both from the union and from management side to create hiring halls, create spaces where we will get more people the job, but what we're finding is, people get the job, a few of them have said, "I can't live on this." And within the first couple of days, they may leave the job, right, to go somewhere else. Even if the job doesn't include the health benefits and things that you get attached to a city job. People are just leaving because the money, they need to be able to survive.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Got it. Understood. Thank you for that. Next, Julia? How are you? Thank you.

JULIA MCCARTHY: Chairperson Joseph and distinguished members of the Committee on Education.

My name is Julia McCarthy and I'm a Senior Program

Officer with the New York Health Foundation. I'm

very grateful for the opportunity to testify today. I

want to take a quick moment to answer three questions

that were raised earlier. First, Council Member

Dinowitz, we will be releasing survey data that

polled families with children later this summer and

fall on their perspectives around school food, and I

look forward to sharing that with the Council.

2	Second, on questions that Brewer, Louis, and
3	Council Members Brewer, Louis and Council Members
4	Brewer, Louis, and Lee raised. We are also
5	supporting the Mayor's Office of Food Policy to
6	implement the Good Food Purchasing Program. That was
7	required through Executive Order eight, and that will
8	open up hopefully contracts to more diverse, local
9	vendors. And then third, directed to Council Members
10	Joseph and Krishnan, thank you for funding the Food
11	Ed Hub [inaudible] the Tish [sic] Food Center. They
12	actually aggregate sort of all information on
13	nutrition education and are tracking that and working
14	with the 80-plus groups across the City who provide
15	that. So, I'd say they're a great resource to answer
16	any further questions. Now turning towards my
17	testimony. Supporting healthier, culturally
18	responsive food is a core strategy of the foundation,
19	particularly in schools. In 2017, we supported
20	community Food Advocates to secure universal free
21	school meals for New York City's 1.1 million public
22	school children, and we are also now supporting an
23	advocacy campaign at the state level that would
24	expand free school meals for all students, building
25	on New York City's successes Both the Office of

Food Nutrition Service and the New York City Council
can take actions to prevent childhood hunger going
forward. So, looking first at the actions that the
Office of Food and Nutrition Service can take. We
applaud their continued focus on the role that school
meals play in maintaining students' health, and I
want to say as a backdrop, New York City School Food
is like New York as a whole. You know, we are sort
of setting the pace for the rest of the country and
we are still always recognizing that we need to
strive for more and can do better. You know, despite
OFNS' heroic daily efforts, there are looming federal
policy changes that will create barriers to flexible
school meal access, and we recommend that the Office
of Food Nutrition Service in collaborating with the
Mayor's Office of Food Policy develop a plan for
future school closures that's informed by the COVID-
19 pandemic. Focus groups conducted by the Tish Food
Center provide insight to how OFNS can continue to
improve, and I wnt to be clear again, these are
actions that OFNS has been taking and been working
with partners to continually improve on, but should
be considered seriously in this plan. That is first
to continue to offer flexible pick-up times and

2	expand the number and location of those pick-up sites
3	and make sure that they're in welcoming locations.
4	DOE can also strengthen communication about food
5	availability, providing information in multiple
6	languages and communicating changes in real time.
7	They can increase the variety of meals offered,
8	including hot meals and those that are culturally
9	relevant. And finally, ensure consistent
10	implementation across sites, especially in less
11	wealthy neighborhoods. Turning quickly to what the
12	City Council can do. First, I would say continue to
13	provide additional funding. I agree with what my
14	colleague here said that local funding could both
15	help mitigate the impact of higher food prices and
16	really help often as hire additional School Food
17	staff. Chris said that they're nearly back to pre-
18	pandemic levels, but those levels, but those levels
19	were too low. We know that additional School Food
20	staff and school food managers would help them to
21	better serve school communities. Next, we want to
22	advocate for school. We want the City Council to
23	advocate for school meal waivers to be made permanent
24	at the federal level. So federal these federal
25	waivers made meal provision during the pandemic

easier, and research from the Tish Food Center again
suggests that these measures, if made permanent,
would increase participation. And finally, we want
to support efforts like the push for universal school
meals at the state level. So we know, you know, that
these federal waivers may not come through past June
$30^{\rm th}$ , and the state still has an opportunity to act
and one that would provide economics of scale across
the state, including to New York City. And New York
City Council members can voice their support for free
school meals for all statewide should the Federal
Government choose not to act. New York Health
Foundation is grateful for the shared recognition and
the important roll school meals play in promoting
food, security and dietary health, and we look
forward to continuing to partner with the City.
CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you so much
both for your testimonies. I'd like to recognize
Council Member Feliz. Do you have any questions,
Council Member? Okay, thank you. Thank you both
for your testimony. Anyone else in the room need to
testify? We're going to now move to our Zoom
testimonies Heidi, would Heidi Zacharia [sp?]?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

## COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2	: Thank you for the opportunity to
3	testify at today's hearing. My name is [inaudible]
4	and I'm currently a seventh grader at
5	CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: [interposing] Yes,
6	this is a group of students that are testifying on
7	school food today. Thank you, Ms. Zacharia [sp?].
8	UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible] It is
9	important for the New York City Council hears about
10	our issue [sic] [inaudible] it's a serious issue that
11	needs to be addressed and [inaudible] There are
12	actually [inaudible]
13	CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: [interposing] We
14	cannot hear you.
15	UNIDENTIFIED: After much debate, we
16	decided [inaudible] to our cafeteria. I'm testifying
17	today on [inaudible]
18	CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: [interposing] Can you
19	turn up your turn up your microphone and speak up a
20	little louder?
21	UNIDENTIFIED: I am a Muslim student who
22	cannot eat current lunch food at my school, and I
23	want to vouch for the other students that share the
24	same situation. Our class chose this issue because

we [inaudible] that a lot of food [inaudible]

2.2

2.3

ultimately food and [inaudible] aren't as nutritious as they make it. [inaudible] not only is this unhealthy, but the [inaudible]. It's important that we accommodate those who [inaudible] of our community. Although [inaudible] everybody [inaudible] people within the community. [inaudible] examples of food are noodles, ravioli, waffle, and [inaudible] really can't fully apply this request I think it's important to make food more interesting options [inaudible].

made a letter and sent it to the principal and dietician. In this letter we talk about how at least 20 percent of the school population is Muslim [inaudible] and that's at least [inaudible]. And it would be very helpful because the school days are seven to 10 [sic] hours long, and it would make them more [inaudible]. This food also goes to waste, because most students don't want to eat that food. At this point, 40 percent of the school food gets thrown out in our school, and less food would get thrown out if we [inaudible]. So even though it makes [inaudible] less food go to waste. And I think that [inaudible] 372 [sic] dollars' worth of food for each

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 person is wasted every year, and 387 billion [sic] 3 [inaudible]. And less would go to waste if we 4 [inaudible]. And after that, that letter that we 5 sent to the dietician and principal, we made a survey to the school, and with this survey we talk about how 6 7 many students [inaudible] would they like [inaudible] implemented into the school lunch and how many would 8 like normal lunch. Ten percent of NYC is Muslim, which is about 800,000 students and a lot of the 10 11 schools and the other schools are allowed to eat 12 [inaudible]. So I think it would be important if we 13 also [inaudible]. Thank you for the opportunity to 14 submit this testimony about an issue that's important 15 to me and my classmates. My name is [inaudible].

UNIDENTIFIED: I'm sorry, can you speak up and put the mic-- turn it up.

: Our most-- our [inaudible] is trying

to [inaudible] school food [inaudible] because me and

some of my classmates [inaudible] that they had no

other options, and I think that [inaudible] a lot of

people [inaudible]. Another thing is that quality of

the food is really bad. We did more research from

other peers [sic] [inaudible] They have brown

broccoli [inaudible]

1	COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION 125
2	UNIDENTIFIED: We need the students to
3	speak up and maybe because there's two accounts, two
4	online, it would help if it turned one of them off.
5	Thank you.
6	: Having halal food [inaudible] amount
7	of people that are eating our school lunch, and it
8	also it also has [inaudible]
9	CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: We can't hear you.
10	Is it possible that you cannot use the headphones?
11	We can't hear you.
12	: [inaudible]
13	CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: I don't think so.
14	Hello?
15	: [inaudible]
16	CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: They cannot
17	UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible] now that
18	there's been a national pandemic, there's also
19	[inaudible]. Another reason why halal [inaudible]
20	The animal that is slaughtered [inaudible]
21	ROSA: Hi, I'm Rosa [sic] [inaudible] and
22	I will discuss issues that [inaudible] students have
23	to go without lunch. Not only is it unhealthy but
24	[inaudible] ravioli [inaudible]

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Okay, we will move on to the next panel.

2.2

2.3

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will be Rachel Sabella from No Kid Hungry, Amy Hamlin, Coalition for Healthy School Food, Kelly Wind, Coalition for Healthy School Food, Ally Miller, Edible School Yards, and Liz Accles, Community Food Advocates. Start with Rachel Sabella.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your three minutes start now.

RACHEL SABELLA: Before we move to public testimony, testing my audio.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Audio sounds good.

RACHEL SABELLA: Can I go?

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Yes.

RACHEL SABELLA: Okay, great. Thank you. Good afternoon. My name is Rachel Sabella. I'm the Director of No Kid Hungry New York with Share Our Strength. I want to start my testimony with saying I've been advocating on food insecurity on school meal programs for the last eight years, and I have never been a part of a hearing quite like this

before. I want to thank Chair Joseph for leading and
making this hearing happen. I've been cheering and
tweeting along, and we especially appreciate your
remarks tied to breakfast in the classroom and the
federal nutrition waivers. I also want to express my
deep appreciation to Speaker Adams for highlighting
school meal programs, the waiver programs as part of
her State of the City. The Council is a leading and
longtime voice for these programs and we're grateful
for the work that you've done and will continue to do
to connect more kid and families with meals. I'm
going to send my testimony written to everyone, but I
really want to highlight two key things right now and
themes that we heard throughout the pandemic. Food
insecurity: one in four kids in New York City could
face hunger since the start of the pandemic. We saw
progress reversed, but we saw the DOE jump in action,
the entire team at the Office of Food and Nutrition
Services, and especially the men and women of Local
372 DC 37 that have been on the frontline since day
one. Whether giving out community meals, making sure
breakfast in the classrooms and we hear you, Chair
Joseph, and we support you on this was implemented
in every single school building, even ones that said

2	they couldn't do it for the previous years. We want
3	to see that progress made permanent, and we want to
4	make sure that the Department of Education is making
5	sure every school fully implements grab and go
6	breakfast, delivery to the classroom, making sure
7	kids have that regular and equal access to meals. The
8	other point I want to make that's really important
9	today and is the most time-sensitive is we heard in
10	Chair Joseph's questions about the expiration of the
11	Child Nutrition Waivers. We still have a chance to
12	get these waivers extended, but only if everyone in
13	New York City takes actions now. From Mayor Adams to
14	Chancellor Banks, to Speaker Adams and the entire
15	City Council, we need you to raise your voices to
16	Senator Schumer, to Senator Gillibrand, to members of
17	the congressional delegation, several of whom used to
18	serve on this body, and make sure they know that
19	these waiver extensions are going to be extremely
20	important to feed more kids in New York City.
21	Parents can no longer pick up meals for their
22	children. Kids have to eat on-site with somebody
23	watching to follow those federal rules. And we heard
24	Chris say that they're looking at a 15 percent
25	reduction in federal reimbursements because of this

expiration of waivers. We can fix this, but we need Congress to take action now. So we look forward to working with this council. I look forward to meeting with everybody, passing on our testimony and being supports to you and the Department of Education as we continue to support the one in for children in New York City that face hunger. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next up is Amie Hamlin followed by Kelly Wind.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

KELLY WIND: Hi, this is Kelly Wind. I am testifying for Amie Hamlin, and both of us work for the Coalition for Healthy School Food. We are a nonprofit that introduced plant-based foods and nutrition education in schools to educate the whole school community about the health, environmental, and social justice issues of our food choices. We have worked in partnership with the New York City Office of Food and Nutrition Services since 2005. We are the nonprofit organization that helped to implement plant powered Fridays. We're also working with OFNS to develop additional plant-based recipes. We work with Title I schools since 2005 providing a variety

2	of resources and services including our Food on Earth
3	curriculum, guest speakers, family dinner nights,
4	teacher professional development, cooking classes,
5	visiting vegan chefs program for culinary high
6	schools, and virtual programming. We're grateful
7	that OFNS kept communities fed during the pandemic.
8	We are impressed with the partnership meetings which
9	provide transparency about what they are doing, as
10	well as an opportunity for all of the partners to
11	learn about each other's work. Of great interest to
12	us at the Coalition is the increased attention to
13	plant-based main dishes. A major cause of death and
14	disability in the US is the food we eat. High blood
15	pressure and high cholesterol are reversible in a
16	matter of weeks. Heart disease and Type II Diabetes
17	is reversible in a matter of months as Mayor Adams
18	did. Raising animals for food is one of the top
19	causes of climate change, and reducing or eliminating
20	meat and dairy is the biggest thing that an
21	individual can do to address climate change. But we
22	also want to point out that research from the British
23	medical Journal shows that vegans have a 73 percent
24	lower risk of developing moderate to severe
25	complications of COVID-19. So anything we can do to

move toward a more plant-based diet helps strengthen
our immune system. The Coalition is here to continue
to provide services to schools and work in
partnership with OFNS. We request a focus on three
budget priorities. One, provide funding to nonprofits
to provide research-based nutrition education in
schools. Most schools do not have the budgets to pay
for our services, and yet, our comprehensive
education for students, their families, teachers, and
other school staff creates real change in each school
community. Promoting the food available in school
cafeterias, as well as the nutrition, environmental,
and equity issues related to food choices. With
funds from City Council, we could teach more and fund
raise less. Two, provide funds to enable schools to
provide non-dairy milks upon request. Most students
of the global majority cannot digest cow's milk.
This is a serious equity issue. Lactose intolerance
is actually a normal condition. Mammals are not meant
to drink milk after weaning, nor are they meant to
drink the milk of another species. What this means
is that students of color may end up with a belly
ache or worse

1	COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION 132
2	KELLY WIND: as a result of drinking
3	cow's milk.
4	SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.
5	KELLY WIND: Three, support OFNS by
6	providing funding for 60 additional mangers so that
7	they can achieve optimal staffing levels, helping
8	ensure that children are well-fed and ready to learn.
9	While not a budget item, we also want to mention that
10	the procurement process for new foods is very
11	cumbersome. New suppliers can register, but BIDs are
12	not frequent and innovation is slow due to the
13	process. This means that it can take two to three
14	years to get a new food on the menu. While we
15	understand the need for competitive bidding, this
16	really impacts the ability of OFNS to add healthy new
17	items to the menus. We are grateful to the City
18	Council for its commitment to supporting healthy food
19	in schools. Thank you.
20	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next up is Ally
21	Miller followed by Liz Accles.
22	SERGEANT AT ARMS: the time starts now.
23	ALLY MILLER: Hi everyone. My name is
24	Ally Miller from Edible Schoolyard NYC. I'm going to

start just by saying thank you to Chair Rita Joseph

2	and all the distinguished members of the Education
3	Committee for holding this hearing and giving us this
4	opportunity to submit testimony. Edible Schoolyard
5	NYC partners with New York City public schools to
6	cultivate healthy students' school environments
7	through hands-on cooking and gardening education, as
8	well as supporting school cafeterias and healthy
9	school food. We're currently working with 10
10	schools, serving 3,500 students in Brooklyn,
11	Manhattan, and the Bronx where we are maintaining
12	caring for school gardens knowing that teachers and
13	school staff often do not have time or pay to
14	maintain school garden. We're leading student,
15	family, and community programs, and we're providing
16	healthy plant-forward food distributions. We know
17	that schools are critical spaces for students to both
18	receive and learn about food, and for many New York
19	City students, the bulk of their food and nutrition
20	is coming from schools. We believe that school food
21	needs to be nutritious, locally-grown, culturally
22	appropriate, and student-driven, and we believe
23	deeply that school food is most successful when
24	paired with food education. Because of this, we have
25	several recommendations, including more in our

2	written testimony. One, providing sustained flexible
3	funding for schools, knowing, again, that school
4	staff are often overworked, underpaid, and often
5	schools lack resources to bring in community-based
6	organization partners to care for school gardens, to
7	provide food education, to provide cafeteria-based
8	education, and to support with cafeteria composting.
9	We also support expansion of cafeteria-based
10	nutrition education such as OFNS' Garden to Café
11	program which is very limited right now. Our staff
12	right now are actually at this moment at PS109 in
13	Council District 14 in the Bronx, working with the
14	Garden to Café program to serve spinach, carrot salad
15	with a honey thyme shallot dressing, and local New
16	York State apples to students in the cafeteria. It's
17	been reported that the students are really loving it,
18	and we know that students who get to taste what is on
19	the menu beforehand and get to see how it relates to
20	their school environment, their school garden. They
21	will enjoy that food more. We also support providing
22	opportunities for more student-driven school food
23	menu items, giving students voice in what is on their
24	menu, especially making sure that that food is
25	quiturally relevant will support more students to

2.2

2.3

effort.

eat, choose, and enjoy that food. We also support asks to increase the capacity of OFNS. There's more school food managers and better retention of school food workers, as well as planning for increased accessibility and community feedback in planning for summer and emergency school food. Thank you so much to the committee for all of your time and your

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: thank you. Next up is Liz Accles followed by Debby Lee Cohen, Roma Yang, and then Philip Chong. Liz?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

Joseph and members of the committee. I'm so happy to be here today. It is refreshing to have a mayor and City Council that are focused holistically on students' school meal experience. So this has been a long time coming, and it's really just fantastic. I want to acknowledge all the work that the leadership in OFNS and everyone throughout the process have been doing for years, but really bringing innovation to children's experience in the last while. I am here on behalf of Community Food Advocates and the Lunch for Learning Coalition, and we are the coalition that

2	fought to get universal free school meals for all Nev
3	York City public school students, and have recently
4	in the last few years turned our efforts to making
5	sure the Department of Education's cafeteria
6	enhancement experience, which I call cafeteria re-
7	design, is scaled to all high schools and middle
8	schools. I'm so happy to hear so many people talking,
9	both Council Members and other folks testifying.
10	We're here for two reasons. One is first of all,
11	to celebrate the 50 million dollars that was included
12	in the City budget to expand cafeteria enhancement
13	experience to another 100 schools, which will serve
14	many, many thousands of children. Once those
15	schools all the funds that we currently have and
16	those new funds are rolled out, we'll have about a
17	third of the high schools and middle schools covered
18	under cafeteria enhancement, and as you know, anyone
19	who knows us knows that we we're focused and
20	persistent and we keep our eyes on the prize, and our
21	ultimate goal is to ensure that all students, all
22	high school and middle school students have an
23	enhanced cafeteria. So we'll be working, looking to
24	you and looking to the Administration to work
25	together to ensure that as we move forward we will

25

make sure that that is something that's applied 2 3 equitably across all schools. I just want to take one 4 more minute to say there's a lot that we learned from the pandemic and echoing both Chris Tricarico and Rachel, breakfast in the classroom and breakfast 6 7 after the bell by necessity was scaled across the 8 whole school system. we know that breakfast in the classroom and for all students grab and go meals in schools are essential and totally complementary to 10 11 the enhanced cafeterias, doing everything to make 12 sure we're getting meals to kids in ways that are 13 enjoyable, accessible, and also in terms of that, we 14 need to make sure there's proper staffing to make 15 sure all those things can be carried out SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired. 16 17 LIZ ACCLES: I wanted to thank you for 18 your time. 19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Liz. 20 up is Debby Lee Cohen followed by Roma Yang and 21 Philip Chong [sp?]. Debby? 2.2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now. 2.3 DEBBY LEE COHEN: Thank you Chair Joseph and committee members and also big thank you to all 24

the Council Members previously who asked excellent

2	questions. I'm Debby Lee Cohen. I'm the Executive
3	Director and Founder of Cafeteria Culture, the
4	Environmental Education Organization. I'm also Co-
5	Director/Producer of the award-winning, The Micro-
6	plastic Madness that starts Brooklyn's PS15 fifth
7	grade students. I'm a parent and educator and a
8	Stage IV cancer patient who is deeply concerned about
9	environmental and health impacts of our school
10	cafeteria garbage, especially plastics. Cafeteria
11	Culture was founded as Styrofoam Out of Schools. We
12	work with youth to creatively achieve zero waste,
13	climate-smart, school communities in a plastic-free
14	biosphere. We teach innovative environmental
15	education, foster youth-led solutions with citizen
16	science, civic action, film production, and the arts.
17	And we partner with school food directors and
18	students and through that partnership we catalyze the
19	elimination of Styrofoam trays from all New York City
20	schools and now 18 school districts across the
21	country. We're ready now to catalyze the elimination
22	of the remaining single-use plastics from New York
23	City school cafeterias, revive, refill, and reuse
24	models, and pilot new methods to dramatically reduce
25	wasted food. I just want to say that I'm testifying

2	today in part to highlight the positive incomes I'm
3	sorry, positive outcomes of our 13-year partnership
4	with OFNS including our most recent collaboration on
5	the first citywide plastic-free lunch day. I want to
6	urge the Council to increase financial support for
7	small nonprofits and community-based organizations
8	like Cafeteria Culture that are leading low-cost,
9	cutting-edge pilots that accelerate urgently needed
10	institutional change and benefit our students at the
11	same time. Thank you for the funding for New York
12	City Council funding over the years already for our
13	organization Cafeteria Culture. On May 16 <sup>th</sup> , 2022,
14	Cafeteria Culture in partnership with OFNS, Office of
15	sustainability, students, school staff led the first
16	New York City Plastic-Free Lunch Day. Over 750 New
17	York City elementary schools had school lunch
18	prepared without plastic on this day, providing a
19	glimpse of what a plastic-free school cafeteria
20	future can look like and that it's possible. All
21	schools were encouraged to join in the action, and I
22	encourage you to watch our short video. If you go to
23	plasticfreelunch.org, you can see our vide right
24	there that we made in partnership with OFNS and
25	Sustainability. And I do want to also give a shout

2.2

2.3

out to Chris and to Steven O'Brien [sp?] and all the directors of OFNS who supported this initiative. It was a bit of a lift during this time, and we waited for two years for it to happen. This was a student-suggested initiative at PS15 where the initiative first started and the students who first led this in 2018. We did a waste audit again with students there, and the number of plastic items from school lunch on--

SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time expired.

DEBBY LEE COHEN: We reduced 72 percent of the plastic items, or two pieces of plastic for meal— per meal. So imagine that over an entire school year with a 100 meals served— a million meals served per day. We have a great opportunity to put a big dent in our procurement of plastics while we save money. And to quote Scarlet, a fifth grade student at our partner school PS188, the Island School in lower Manhattan, "Maybe we could make plastic—free lunch one day, then make it a week, then make it months, and then years, and then make plastic—free lunch day every day." I just want to highlight here that these school pilots are benefiting students on

2	multiple levels, that this kind of collaboration and
3	in-classroom education and opportunities for students
4	to actually take action can be a really incredible
5	antidote for climate anxiety for our students. And
6	the negative and health consequences of our city's
7	plastic procurement cannot be understated. Reducing
8	the production, use and disposable disposal of
9	plastic
10	SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time
11	expired.
12	DEBBY LEE COHEN: advances our climate,
13	or city's climate goals. Thank you. I'll be
14	testifying at the Sanitation hearing as well. Right
15	now I'm going to that hearing, and I thank you again
16	for this great hearing and this opportunity to speak.
17	Thank you, Chair.
18	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Debby.
19	And next up is Roma Yang, followed by Philip Chong.
20	SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.
21	ROMA YANG: Good afternoon to all
22	panelists and Council Members. My name is Roma Yang
23	and I'm here on behalf of Union Square Academy for
24	Health Sciences hut I'm also here as a student

myself to speak on the food we consume every day in

school. Most of New York City schools meals are
usually provided at no cost because of the amount of
low income families residing in all five boroughs. I
personally remember paying for lunch only once ever
in my life and that was back in elementary school.
The only honest opinion or review you really get is
from a student who has consumed these school meals or
a daily basis. Many students rely on school meals
being their important meals of the day, which is why
making sure school meals should be filling and as
nutritious as possible. When I was asked what changes
we'd like to see in the NYC schools in the future, I
mentioned school lunches. There are a large number
of students in many schools and it's understandable
that it's hard to prepare hot lunches for a massive
group of students. However, so far the school lunches
I've had over the years have not been as filling and
as they should be nor are they super nutritious.
Recently, they've also gotten rid of the salad
options which I found very unnecessary. Seeing this
change in nutritious school lunches [inaudible]
appetizing, sooner than later would be phenomenal.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Roma.

Next up is Philip Chong, and the following panel will

3

\_

4

5

6

7

9

1011

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

24

25

be Aideen Dela Cruz, followed by Jenny Valaderas
[sp?], David Ross Edelman [sp?], and Eloisa Trinidad,
and Tom Buckley [sp?]. Next up Philip Chong.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

PHILIP CHONG: Thank you, Chair Joseph and Committee Members and Council Members. My name is Philip Chong, Executive Director at Quincy Asian Resource [inaudible] nonprofit organization mission to foster and improve the social, cultural, and economic and civil lives of immigrants and their families in order to benefit all communities. always collaborate with different resources and organization and partnership to provide culturally competent services such as workforce development, multi-lingual family and elder services, food security programs, adult education and such. We also a nonprofit to help support the [inaudible] program as an anchor Pan-Asian meal provider. We help mobilize the local immigrant-owned restaurant as a food provider and then tap into the [inaudible] sector [sic] to providing delivering network workforce to support the 127 million meals delivery to the homebound elders during the pandemic. Today, I want to share the initiatives that we have recently

2	launched in partnership with Montefiore Hospital for
3	a public school in the Bronx, PS199, the program
4	called Pathway to Healthy Adulthoods. As a father of
5	two daughters, they also rely on lunch. No matter how
6	much we pack at home they never really they never
7	really eat it. They always go to the cafeteria with
8	the friends, and we know that there's many factors
9	when they're deciding what they want to eat, and many
10	times coming home they always complaint about how
11	much they don't like the food. And we know that
12	this whatever they eat whatever they learn and
13	choices with food is would stem [sic] in terms of
14	how they grow, how they grow up as adulthood. So,
15	it's very important for this program. This program,
16	Pathway to Healthy Adulthood, we call it PHA, is a
17	collaboration between Quincy Asian Resources and
18	Montefiore School Health Program is to educate and
19	empower youth and their family members to become
20	stewards of their health while fostering the
21	healthier school and community environments. The
22	goal of the PHA is to bring culturally sensitive
23	fresh produce and nutritional education to high-needs
24	schools in the Bronx. And what we know that is a New
25	York a New York City [inaudible] borough [sic].

2.2

2.3

The PHA we launched as a pilot as PS199 in the South Bronx in April 2022. We plan to expand the program to a total of six schools every year in the Bronx starting in September. The challenges that we face, as I said earlier, hungriest borough in New York City. One of the four residents experience food insecurity and ranked 62<sup>nd</sup> out of New York's 62 counties in health outcomes. As a resident of the nation's poorest urban county, approximately 40 percent—

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You're time expired.

PHILIP CHONG: students live below the poverty level. So for this program [inaudible] food access, nutrition education, and social services. We provide fourth and fifth grade the program called Choose Health and Food Fun and Fitness Curriculum developed by Cornell University. We also every two weeks provide fresh produce boxes with eight to ten items variety to 300 student and their family members at 199, at PS199, and on top of it with our multilingual social service outreach coordinator, we provide different services including SNAP application, food assistance program, adult education workforce. We hope to expand this program

2.2

2.3

[inaudible]. This program is in the partnership with
Montefiore Hospital, Stop and Shop, City Harvest, and
also the support from the EGL Foundation. It's
thank you for the opportunity to let me speak to the
committee, and thank you so much for supporting this,
the whole overarching in terms of improving health
and food access to our students. Thank you

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Philip.

Next up is Aideen Dela Cruz followed by Jenny

Valaderas [sp?], David Ross Edelman, Eloisa Trinidad
and Tom Buckley. Aideen?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

Chairperson Joseph and to everyone. My name is
Aideen Dela Cruz, and I am a senior physical
therapist in the New York City Department of
Education for 16 years. I'm also the Vice Chair for
PT's [sic], for the PTOT [sic] Chapter in the UFT,
and one of the founding leaders of the grassroots
group, OTs and PTs for a Fair Contract. In 1975
President Ford singed into the law the Education for
All Handicap Children Act, also known as The Idea.
The law guarantees access to a free-- access to a
free appropriate public education in the least

2	restrictive environment to every child with a
3	disability. So many things have happened since for
4	our students with special needs. The DOE has offered
5	a smaller class setting appropriate for these
6	students when necessary. They're also offered
7	physical, occupational, speech, vision, and hearing
8	therapies as well as counseling as mandated in their
9	IEPs. They have been offered school buses to and
10	from school, use of elevators in order to access
11	their school environment, testing accommodations,
12	access to special education teachers,
13	paraprofessionals, adaptive equipment, adaptive paid
14	[sic] teachers, nurses, and so much more. However,
15	one thing that has been bothering me for years is
16	that the New York City Department of Education has
17	failed to provide one very final thing to our most
18	vulnerable students to thrive in our schools. In
19	1946, the school lunch program was made official when
20	President Truman signed the National School Lunch
21	Act. This act ensures all students all over the
22	United States a balanced meal while in the school.
23	this act is supposed to cover all students, but it
24	sadly does not cover special education students who
25	are on a special diet due to sensory and/or medical

issues like being fed through a G-tube, have 2 3 weaknesses in their oral, mandibular muscles, making chewing difficult for them, have issues with 4 swallowing and more. I have personally seen students starve during the school day because they cannot eat 6 the food offered in the cafeteria. I have seen students who at 1:00 p.m. would sleep in a classroom 8 because their bodies have shut down from not having fuel throughout the day. Some lucky students have 10 11 parents and quardians who would make sure that they 12 have an appropriate packed lunch or snacks to eat in the school, but at last I have also witnessed a lot 13 14 of students with parents and guardians for whatever 15 reason fail to send food for these kids. staff can only do so much in reminding parents and 16 17 quardians to send food for their kids who have 18 special dietary needs. Now I implore you call, do not 19 forget the small population of special education 20 students who are need of special diets as you talk 21 about budgets. Maybe there's a way you can place in their IEPs what kinds of food should be given to 2.2 2.3 these individuals during the school day as directed by their medical providers, and maybe there's a way 24 that DOE can supply these. All students deserve a 25

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10 11

12

13

15

14

16

17

18

19

20

2122

2.3

24

25

balanced meal, and all means that the special education students are included in that. Thank you for this opportunity to speak in behalf of our special education students.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: thank you for your testimony. Next up we have Jenny Valaderas [sp?], followed by David Ross Edelman [sp?].

JENNY VALADERAS: Good afternoon. I'm Jenny Valaderas. I go to Union Square Academy for Health Sciences. Food provided to us by the New York City Department of Education is important to me, and I believe it's something involved in students' everyday life. By providing nutritious meals, schools play a crucial role in creating lifetime healthy eating habits. I've been served stale waffles during breakfast and barely cooked chicken nuggets and fries. During the pandemic students were served ham and cheese sandwiches and peanut butter sandwiches, which as a student who's eaten them before know that they're not able to keep me energized throughout the school day. School lunches meet the high nutritional standards for a student to consume, but there are other ways our school food can be nutritious and yet tasty to eat. Changing our school foods would be a

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 huge improvement, because not only will students be 3 able to enjoy their meal but they will be able to 4 focus during their classes and go seven to eight hours energized and full knowledge. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thanks Jenny. up is David Ross Edelman, followed by Eloisa Trinidad.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time start now.

ELOISA TRINIDAD: Thank you. My name Eloise Trinidad -- sorry. My name is Eloisa Trinidad and I am the Executive Director at Chilis on Wheels in New York. Thank you to Chairperson Rita C. Joseph as well as the members of the New York City Council Committee on Education for holding today's oversight hearing and the opportunity to submit this testimony. Chilis on Wheels works to make healthy food accessible to communities in need. We do this through direct food relief, nutrition education in schools, mentorship and policy work to address the ongoing vulnerabilities and injustices of the food During the pandemic we expanded our services system. to include home grocery delivery to students and their families as well as plant-based community [inaudible] to serve students 24/7. We also set up

2	fresh organic produce distribution and grocery
3	distribution at DOE sites in Brownsville and the
4	South Bronx. We serve and continue to serve
5	thousands of food insecure individuals across New
6	York City [inaudible] our program during the
7	pandemic. 95 percent of the people and students who
8	request our services are not vegan, but have dietary
9	restrictions or simply want better tasting food that
10	is healthy or ingredients to cook from scratch. We're
11	incredibly grateful for all the improvements in
12	school that often has done in expanding culturally-
13	relevant and plant-based meals. However, dietary
14	restrictions and cultural relevancy do not disappear
15	during an emergency, a pandemic, during the summer,
16	or during part of the week. Therefore, those
17	requiring plant-based meals should have options every
18	day and they must be culturally relevant, which
19	explains the success of plantains in schools. To
20	address food insecurity, we must meet the needs of
21	everyone, especially those with dietary restrictions
22	as those populations have more challenging of a time
23	accessing meals when food insecure. Fully plant-based
24	meals as daily options should extend beyond hummus
25	and pretzels and peanut butter and jelly as these are

2	snacks and not adequate meals. Culturally relevant
3	plant-based meals meet the requirements of those
4	practicing Hinduism, Rastafarianism, Gainism [sp?],
5	Buddhism, 7 <sup>th</sup> Day Adventist, veganism, as those
6	philosophies and religions require animal-free diets,
7	and in many cases they can also meet the needs of
8	those practicing Islam and Judaism with proper
9	certification. The black population is also the
10	fastest growing demographic in the US to practice
11	veganism, and much of our youth is passionate about
12	climate change and animal welfare. All students
13	should have a choice beyond traditional cultural
14	relevance and feel empowered and supported in
15	deciding what they want to eat. This is an equity
16	issue. In addition, according to the National Center
17	for Bio Technology Information, adequate dietary
18	fiber intake is associated with better digestive
19	health and reduced risk for heart disease, stroke,
20	hypertension, and certain gastrointestinal disorders,
21	obesity, Type II diabetes, and certain cancers.
22	However, national consumption indicates that only
23	about five percent of the population, which includes
24	children, meet this requirements, and are not getting
25	adequate fiber intake. Therefore, providing adequate

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

1

and culturally relevant plant-based meals daily as an

3 option and in emergencies can potentially increase

our students' fiber intake, setting them up for a 4

healthy and proper future. Meals should not only be

plant-based; --6

SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time

8 expired.

> ELOISA TRINIDAD: they should be culturally relevant. As far as milk, about 75 percent of the global population cannot digest lactose after infancy. This percentage increases in BIPOC populations, and it is not a disability. Specific populations of color with high levels of lactase [sic] deficiency include about 95 percent of Asians, about 80 percent of African-Americans, and up to 100 percent of Native Americans, and about 80 percent of Hispanics, according to the National Institutes of Health. In addition, about 80 percent of Ashkenazi Jews are also lactose intolerant. New York City schools are not required to provide a student with a non-dairy substitute unless their parent submits a note from a physician or a caretaker. There requirement for a physician's note creates a financial and administrative burden for

1

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

parents, and disproportionately affects students of color. The cost of a physician visit and the lost time from work from a parent is unnecessary hurdle that prevents students from receiving appropriate nutrition at school. Students should be able to freely choose nutritious drink that--

SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Time expired.

ELOISA TRINIDAD: that will not make them sick throughout the day. Lactose intolerance is not a disability. The inability to digest lactose is a specific genetic trait like being left-handed. happens in most places around the world. Therefore, parents, students and school need more flexibility to ensure the student's meal program serves nutritious meals to all participants. In conclusion, we would like to see dietary restrictions that address more intentionally plant-based options become more culturally relevant, and provided daily with plantbased options to all students so everyone can have equal access to nutritious meals. We would also like to see more intentional nutrition in health education so that culture around food can shift towards a healthier and more sustainable one. We urge the

## COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2	Council	to	fund	our	school	sys	stem	as	well	as	our
3	communit	zy−k	pased	orga	anizatio	ons	to :	mak∈	e this	s ha	appen.

1

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your testimony. Next up is Tom Buckley [sp?].

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

TOM BUCKLEY: Thank you, Ms. Chairwoman and Education Committee Members. I know your meeting is focused on the important topic of school food, but I would like to share my thoughts about school safety, because without it there would be no kids at school to eat school food. Your meeting was the first one I could join since Uvalde. Thank you for this opportunity. I'm G. Buckley, a 10-year-old New York City resident, and I'm speaking because we have to help stop gun violence in schools. One way we can do this is by installing locking doors. If we installed locking doors in schools, we could trap intruders long enough for the police to get there in time and take over the scene. Another way we could make schools a safer environment for kids is by adding one or two more security guards in every school. This would be tougher for intruders to get inside the school, and these security guards should

2 be armed with a Taser at all times when on duty.

3 Arming our teachers will not help. one more way we

4 can make school safer is by adding scanners at

5 entrance doors, not just scanners in a fourth or a

6 half of schools. We need scanners in all schools. It

7 does not matter if the school is Catholic, private,

8 all boys, all girls, or public or co-ed. We need

9 scanners at the entrance doors of all schools. I

10 made the poster you see on the screen about two days

11 after the Uvalde shooting. At our local park, dozens

12 of kids and some adults signed it. I told some of the

13 | kids that I would speak to lawmakers, and they asked

14 | if the lawmakers could speak with them. Thank you.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your

16 | testimony. That's all of the panelists we have

17 | signed up. If we have inadvertently left anyone off

18 | who would like to testify, please use the raise hand

19 | function at the bottom of the Zoom chat and we will

20 | call on you. Seeing none. That's all the witnesses

21 we have today.

22 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: I would like to

23 | thank everyone who testified today. Thank you and

24  $\parallel$  see you at the next hearing.

[gavel]

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date July 27, 2022