

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, AND

DISPOSITIONS

1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS

----- X

June 7, 2022
Start: 10:02 a.m.
Recess: 11:43 a.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING - VIRTUAL ROOM 2

B E F O R E: Farah N. Louis, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Carmen N. De La Rosa
Oswald Feliz
Christopher Marte
Sandy Nurse
Sandra Ung
Inna Vernikov
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
Althea Stevens
Charles Barron

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS AND
DISPOSITIONS

2

A P P E A R A N C E S

David Harney
Jeremy Brooks
Kevin Parris
Perris Straughter
Stacey Pheffer Amato, Assemblywoman
Dolores Orr
Jacqueline Rogers
Sonia Moise
Glenn DiResto
Wanda Warden
Amber Clinkscapes
Marvyn Elias
ChantAndrea Blissett

1

2

SERGEANT PEREZ: All right. Good morning.

3

Welcome to New York City Council's remote

4

Subcommittee Hearing on Landmarks, Public Sitings,

5

and Dispositions.

6

Everyone, please turn on your videos at

7

this time.

8

Silence all electronic devices.

9

All written testimony can be submitted to

10

landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Again, that is

11

landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Thank you.

12

Chair Louis, we are ready to begin.

13

CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you. Good

14

morning. I'm Council Member Farah Louis, Chair of the

15

Committee on Landmarks, Public Sitings, and

16

Dispositions.

17

I'm joined today by my Colleagues,

18

Council Members Feliz, Ung, and Marte.

19

Today, we will vote on LU 52, the Sutter

20

Place NCP project and hold public hearings on LUs 61

21

and 62 for the EMS Station New Facility and LUs 67,

22

68, 69, 70, and 71 for the Resilient Edgemere

23

Project.

24

25

2 Before we begin, I recognize the
3 Subcommittee Counsel to explain today's hearing
4 procedures.

5 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Thank you,
6 Chair Louis. I am Jeffrey Campagna, Counsel to the
7 Subcommittee.

8 Members of the public who wish to testify
9 were asked to register for today's hearing. If you
10 registered to testify and are not yet signed into
11 Zoom, please sign in now and remain signed in until
12 after you have testified.

13 If you wish to testify and have not
14 registered, please go to www.council.nyc.gov/landuse
15 to sign up now.

16 If you are not planning to testify on
17 today's items, please watch the hearing on the New
18 York City Council website.

19 All people testifying before the
20 Subcommittee will be on mute until they are
21 recognized to testify. Please confirm that your mic
22 is unmuted before you begin speaking.

23 Public testimony will be limited to 2
24 minutes per witness. If you have written testimony
25 you would like the Subcommittee to consider in

2 addition to or in lieu of appearing before the
3 Subcommittee or if you require an accessible version
4 of a presentation given at today's meeting, please
5 email landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Please
6 indicate the LU number or project name in the subject
7 line of the email.

8 During the hearing, Council Members who
9 would like to ask questions should use the Zoom raise
10 hand function. The raise hand button should appear at
11 the bottom of the participant panel. I will announce
12 Council Members who have questions in the order that
13 they raised their hands.

14 Witnesses are reminded to remain in the
15 meeting until they are excused by the Chair.

16 Lastly, there may be extended pauses if
17 we encounter technical problems. We ask that you
18 please be patient as we work through these issues.

19 Chair Louis will now continue with
20 today's agenda.

21 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you. We've also
22 been joined by Council Members Vernikov, Stevens, and
23 Nurse.

24 Today, we will begin with the vote on LU
25 52 for the Sutter Place NCP project which we heard at

2 our meeting on May 11th. This application was
3 submitted by the Department of Housing and
4 Preservation and Development pursuant to Article 16
5 of the General Municipal Law and Section 197-c of the
6 New York City Charter requesting designation of an
7 Urban Development Action approval and Urban
8 Development Action Area Project for such area and
9 approval of the disposition of city-owned property to
10 a developer to be selected by HPD. This action would
11 facilitate the development of 4 buildings containing
12 approximately 46 affordable housing units and a
13 commercial space on property located at 492-496
14 Glenmore Avenue (Block 3725, Lots 12 and 13) as well
15 as 2358-2363 Pitkin Avenue (Block 4015, Lots 22, 23,
16 and 24) and 943 Dumont Avenue (Block 406, Lot 52) and
17 743 Blake Avenue (Block 3775, Lot 150) in the
18 Brooklyn Council Districts represented by Council
19 Members Nurse and Barron.

20 Does Council Member Nurse want to provide
21 any remarks? I know she's underground right now.
22 She's commuting still. Council Member Barron...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: I'm sorry, Chair.
24 That's not possible at this moment. I'll have to come
25 back on.

2 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: All right. I'm going
3 to call on Council Member Barron who is here and
4 would like to provide remarks. Good morning, Council
5 Member.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Good morning,
7 Chair. I just want to thank my partner, Council
8 Member Sandy Nurse. This was a long negotiating
9 process. The project didn't start off as what we
10 wanted it to be, but, when you hold onto your
11 principles and you're prioritizing your community and
12 the affordability and use the authority and power
13 that you have on the City Council, you can get a 100
14 percent affordable project. This is 100 percent
15 affordable, 50 percent of the AMI, a percentage at
16 that, and 40 down to 30 and where could you go to get
17 a 3-bedroom apartment for less than 1,000 dollars a
18 month in those kinds of categories so this is 100
19 percent affordable.

20 I want to thank Sandy Nurse and my staff
21 and her staff for reaching this conclusion. Thank
22 you, Madam Chair. Appreciate the opportunity to
23 speak, and we support it 1,000 percent.

24 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: We thank you and
25 Council Member Nurse for your leadership on this

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, AND
DISPOSITIONS

8

2 project. With the support of the local Council
3 Members, I now call for a vote to approve LU 52.

4 Counsel, please call the roll.

5 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Louis.

6 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: I vote aye.

7 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Feliz.

8 Council Member Feliz.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Aye.

10 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Council
11 Member Marte.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: I vote aye.

13 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Council
14 Member Nurse.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Aye.

16 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Council
17 Member Ung.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Aye.

19 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Minority
20 Whip Vernikov.

21 MINORITY WHIP VERNIKOV: Good morning. Not
22 Minority Leader yet. I vote aye.

23 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: By a vote
24 of 6 in the affirmative with 0 in the negative an 0

25 abstentions, the items is approved and recommended to

2 the full Land Use Committee, and the vote will be
3 held open.

4 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you so much and
5 congratulations Council Member Barron and Nurse.

6 We've also been joined by Majority Whip
7 Brooks-Powers.

8 We continue now with the first public
9 hearing on LU 61 and LU 62. Two applications related
10 to the EMS Station 17 New Facility submitted by the
11 Department of Administrative Services and FDNY LU 61
12 relates to an application that was submitted pursuant
13 to the Section 197-c of the Charter requesting
14 approval of a site selection of property located at
15 1257 Morris Avenue (Block 2450, Lot 42) in the Bronx
16 for use as an ambulance station. LU 62 relates to an
17 application that was submitted pursuant to Section
18 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter for the
19 grant of a special permit pursuant to Section 76-67
20 of the Zoning Resolution to allow an FDNY Emergency
21 Medical Services Station use in a residential
22 district. These actions would facilitate the
23 construction of a proposed 2-story EMS station
24 building on property located in a R7-1 district
25 located at 1257 Morris Avenue in the Bronx Council

2 District represented by Council Member Stevens. Is
3 Council Member Stevens available to provide remarks?

4 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: She is
5 here.

6 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Good morning, Stevens.
7 The floor is yours.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Hi. Good morning.
9 Thank you for having me here today. I am here and
10 excited to be here but just had a few questions that
11 I thought that we should bring up as far as a lot of
12 the community concerns with this EMS station
13 regarding noise, parking, and quality of life for
14 residents and so I just think that it's important
15 that when we're making these decisions that we're
16 making them in a holistic way that does not impact
17 the community in a very negative way, especially when
18 we have 2 EMS sites in very close proximity to the
19 one that they're alleging to build and some of the
20 questions I have, I just would like to make sure that
21 we have answers before we move forward because
22 quality of life for my residents is my top and number
23 1 priority.

24 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you so much,
25 Council Member Stevens, for your remarks. Counsel,

2 Majority Whip Brooks-Powers has to hop off at 10:30.

3 Is it okay for her to provide her remarks in advance?

4 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Yes, she
5 can provide her remarks in advance if she wants to
6 address the Resilient Edgemere now if she has to
7 leave.

8 MAJORITY WHIP BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
9 Chair. I'll also ask my questions and hope they'll
10 get answered at the appropriate time. Good morning,
11 everyone. Thank you once again to our Chair, Council
12 Member Louis, and the Committee staff for
13 facilitating today's hearing. I'd like to speak on
14 the items being heard today concerning the Resilient
15 Edgemere zoning proposal led by HPD..

16 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Majority Whip, you
17 went on mute.

18 MAJORITY WHIP BROOKS-POWERS. Thank you.
19 Led by HPD. The plan includes significant changes to
20 the fabric of Edgemere including significant down-
21 zoning near the Jamaica Bay coastline to minimize
22 damage caused by future floods, infill zoning and the
23 establishment of a community land trust in Central
24 Edgemere and up-zoning along Rockaway Beach Boulevard
25 to facilitate new development and boost commercial

1 activity. I am encouraged by some components of this
2 plan, particularly the measures that will make our
3 community more resilient to coastal flooding.

4 However, I have serious concerns which are shared by
5 many of my constituents. Last night, I hosted a town
6 hall where Edgemere residents received another
7 presentation from HPD and had the chance to share
8 their perspectives on the project and submit
9 feedback. It was a valuable session, and I'm glad to
10 have had the opportunity to hear directly from
11 constituents in advance of this hearing to ensure
12 that their voices are heard. This project does not
13 currently have the support of the community.

14 Community Board 14 unanimously disapproved the
15 proposal. However, despite points of opposition,
16 there was space to make improvements, including down-
17 zoning for resiliency, ensuring 100 percent home
18 ownership as HPD had committed previously, but, most
19 importantly, better infrastructure investments
20 including road widening and building a trauma center
21 hospital in the area. With that said, I look forward
22 to today's hearing and hope to hear from members of
23 the public who have signed up to testify.

1
2 Some of the questions that I'd like to
3 get a response from include could you describe what
4 regulations apply in the proposed Special Coastal
5 Risk District and how these will improve resiliency,
6 what proportion of the scattered sites in the HMA
7 will be open space as opposed to new housing, has
8 there been engagement with homeowners in the HMA and
9 LDA areas about the potential community land trust.
10 Questions around density that I have, what is the
11 total number of new housing units projected from this
12 rezoning, how many of these units are on HPD
13 controlled sites where there are (INAUDIBLE) for 100
14 percent affordability. The increased density in this
15 proposal is in the proposed HDP UDAAP project site
16 but also the block between Beach 49th and 50th
17 Streets, which is privately owned, why was this block
18 chosen to be rezoned to an R6A, will HPD engage with
19 the community before drafting the RFP for the UDAAP
20 sites and what kind of commitments can HPD make
21 regarding proposal requirements such as specific type
22 of community facilities? The Community Board has
23 expressed a clear preference for home ownership,
24 affordable housing. Can HPD commit to affordable home
25 ownership co-ops as part of the UDAAP project sites.

1
2 Finally, I just have a few questions around
3 infrastructure what investments is the city making to
4 deal with stormwater and high tide related flooding
5 in Edgemere, have DOT, DEP, SCA, and the Parks
6 Department committed to new infrastructure
7 investments to support thousands of new residents in
8 Edgemere coming from the Edgemere Commons, Arverne
9 East, and potentially this proposal as well, and how
10 is HPD coordinating with the other agencies. HPD
11 worked with DOT on a transportation study in the
12 Rockaways that was published in 2019. What projects
13 from that study, especially widening Edgemere Avenue
14 from Beach 32nd to Beach 56th, has the administration
15 committed to funding and on what timeline, and since
16 the closing of Peninsula Hospital the Rockaways are
17 not underserved, especially for acute and trauma
18 care. what commitments is the city making to bring
19 additional healthcare services to the community.
20 Those are the questions. I look forward to hearing
21 responses on the record from HPD. Thank you, again,
22 Madam Chair.

23 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you, Majority
24 Whip. We are joined today by David Harney, Jeremy
25

2 Brooks, and Irma Fontaine from the Fire Department.
3 Counsel, please administer the affirmation.

4 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Please
5 raise your right hands and respond when I call your
6 names.

7 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
8 whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your
9 testimony before this Subcommittee and in response to
10 all Council Member questions? David Harney.

11 DAVID HARNEY: I do.

12 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Who is
13 here? I see a David Harney and a David Harney. Please
14 state your names. You who are holding your hand up,
15 what is your name?

16 JEREMY BROOKS: Jeremy Brooks.

17 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Thank you.
18 We may continue with the agenda.

19 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: If you have a
20 PowerPoint presentation, it will be displayed when
21 you request it. You all may begin.

22 DAVID HARNEY: Good morning, Madam Chair.
23 Thank you for the opportunity to testify before you
24 this morning and the Members of the Subcommittee.

2 My name is David Harney. I am the Chief
3 of Staff to the Deputy Fire Commissioner for Support
4 Services. The application before you this morning,
5 Land Use URLUP number P2018X310, is for site
6 selection, acquisition, and for special permit so the
7 Fire Department might relocate EMS Station 17 from
8 its current site at 1080 Ogden Avenue to 1257 Morris
9 Avenue in Bronx Community Board 4 and so a community
10 center might be built at the site of the existing EMS
11 Station. If you would please put up our presentation,
12 I can walk the Committee through our proposal. Next
13 slide, please.

14 In 1996, the City's Emergency Medical
15 Services function was merged into the Fire
16 Department. One of the merger's goals was to increase
17 the number of EMS support facilities citywide. By
18 increasing the number of EMS stations, we'd be able
19 to reduce ambulance "out-of-service" times and keep
20 these units available in their response areas longer.
21 You must remember, back in 1996, EMS only had 16
22 stations citywide, with only 3 to service the entire
23 Bronx. However, today, our Bureau of EMS Operations
24 as 40 EMS stations, of which 10 are in the Bronx.
25 Next slide, please.

1
2 Next, it's important to understand EMS
3 Operations does not function in the same manner as
4 Fire Operations. In Fire Operations, fire companies
5 leave their firehouse in an emergency response
6 capacity with lights and sirens and travel to the
7 assigned incident. When the incident is completed,
8 they return to their firehouse to await their next
9 assigned call. However, EMS operates differently and
10 uses a strategy known as "dynamic deployment." Here,
11 ambulances leave the station mostly in a non-
12 emergency capacity, no lights, no sirens, and travel
13 to predesignated street corner locations known as
14 "atoms." Next slide, please.

15 From these "atoms," units are dispatched
16 to medical emergencies. Also, as in most EMS
17 incidents, the EMS unit must then transport patients
18 to area hospitals. After a patient has been
19 transferred to hospital staff, the EMS unit may
20 return to their "atom" or may need to go "out-of-
21 service" and return to their station to restock
22 supplies, decontaminate the ambulance compartment or
23 themselves, or for administrative reasons. Out-of-
24 service times affect ambulance availability so by
25 increasing the number of EMS stations, we reduce out-

2 of-service time, and greater in-service time equates
3 to lower emergency medical response time. Next slide,
4 please.

5 In terms of EMS Station 17, it's
6 currently located at 1080 Ogden Avenue in Bronx
7 Community Board 4. The building is the former
8 quarters of Engine 68. The company was housed here
9 until a new firehouse was built along with Ladder 49
10 in 1979. For approximately 20 years, the building was
11 used by our Building Maintenance Division as a
12 storage facility, but, in 1997, after the merger, the
13 building was renovated and became EMS Station 17.
14 Meanwhile, the building is most probably, we don't
15 have an exact date, over a century old, and the 3-
16 story wood-frame structure is the only building of
17 its type remaining in the agency's facility
18 inventory. Next slide, please.

19 In 2018, the agency performed a
20 structural review of the building. Here, we concluded
21 the facility had exceeded its useful life.
22 Specifically, the apparatus floor, as you can see on
23 the right, has a significant number of cracks and
24 open joints at the garage door's threshold. Rainwater
25 and melting snow has also entered the building's

1 structural system as you can see in the photo on the
2 bottom right of the basement. This has been
3 exacerbated by vehicles and equipment decontamination
4 work. To that end, and over the past few years, the
5 agency has conducted a variety of remedial efforts to
6 slow the building's deterioration as plans were
7 developed to replace this important facility. Next
8 slide please.

10 With funding support from City Hall to
11 replace this facility, in 2019 the agency selected
12 the vacant parcel at 1257 Morris Avenue as the
13 optimal site for a new EMS Station 17. Here on the
14 right, you can see photos of the vacant lot. Also
15 located in Bronx Community Board 4, the parcel, which
16 is under the agency's jurisdiction, measures
17 approximately 15,000 square feet and is adjacent to
18 the quarters of Engine 92/Ladder 44. Here, the agency
19 working with the Department of Design and
20 Construction plans to build a 2-story approximately
21 11,700 square-foot facility with below-grade parking
22 for the station's staff to serve as the new home for
23 EMS Station 17. Next slide, please.

24 While this project was slowed by COVID-
25 19, in December the City Planning Commission

2 certified the Fire Department/Department of Citywide
3 Administrative Services for a Uniformed Land Use
4 Review Procedure for this important project. The
5 proposed facility will have interior parking for 6
6 ambulances with one additional bay for vehicle
7 decontamination. Other areas of the proposed main
8 floor include offices for the on-duty lieutenant,
9 storage areas for vehicle supplies, oxygen, advanced
10 and basic life support ambulance, medical supplies.
11 What we mean by advanced versus basic, advanced life
12 support ambulances or what we call ALS ambulances,
13 they're staffed by paramedics while BLS ambulances,
14 basic life support, they're staffed by EMTs, an
15 elevator, a ready room, an eye-wash/decontamination
16 station, and an ADA-compliant restroom. Next slide,
17 please.

18 The proposed facility's second floor has
19 an office for the station's captain, male and female
20 locker rooms, bathrooms, a stress-reduction room
21 which is a nice name for a gym, a training area, an
22 outdoor terrace, a lactation room for EMS members who
23 are also nursing mothers, space for security and
24 telecommunications equipment, several storage areas,
25 the building's mechanical system/elevator controls,

2 and a custodial closet. Finally, the proposed
3 building's cellar will have off-street parking for 21
4 personal vehicles and a bicycle rack so there's no
5 impact on on-street parking. Meanwhile, the members
6 of Engine 92/Ladder 44 will continue to have off-
7 street parking on the remaining portion of the
8 existing lot. Next slide, please.

9 We also want to talk about the green
10 elements that we're very excited about putting into
11 this proposed facility. For more than a decade, the
12 Fire Department has been at the forefront in its use
13 of green energy. Across our portfolio of more than
14 400 buildings, we continue to retrofit aging or
15 costly utility systems with sustainable ones, such as
16 green roofs, solar voltaic electrical or solar hot
17 water systems, LED lighting, geothermal heating
18 systems, or natural lighting. The proposed new
19 quarters for EMS Station 17 is no different as it is
20 designed to be LEED Silver to comply with Local Law
21 86 of 2005 and installing a green roof in compliance
22 with Local Law 92 and 94 of 2019. You see the FDNY
23 Green logo, that is on all our ambulances, and I'll
24 discuss that in a moment. The lower image, that is of
25 the glass roof we installed on top of the new

2 quarters of Rescue 2 in Brooklyn to provide natural
3 light into the firehouse to reduce the need for
4 powered lighting. Next slide, please.

5 In order to achieve LEED certification,
6 the project relies heavily on improving the indoor
7 environment by monitoring carbon dioxide in densely
8 occupied spaces, selecting low-emitting materials,
9 monitoring potential sources of indoor contamination
10 during construction, and performing a "flush-out" of
11 the HVAC systems after construction to ensure a
12 contaminant-free system. Next, and in compliance with
13 Executive Order 395 of 2013, the proposed project
14 will also achieve the "Design for Active Occupants"
15 LEED credit which promotes occupant health by
16 encouraging stair use. Next slide, please.

17 Here, you can see the 2 images, these are
18 2 existing Fire Department facilities where we're
19 already utilizing not only green roofs but solar
20 water-heating systems. The vegetated (green) roof is
21 now a requirement for all new city buildings, and
22 this system captures stormwater while the proposed
23 building will include stormwater detention tanks to
24 help reduce New York City's Combined Sewer Overflow
25 during most rain events. Meanwhile, construction

2 materials will be locally sourced and durable to
3 ensure an extended lifespan. Finally, all in-building
4 equipment will be energy efficient and have Energy
5 Star ratings. For example, cooking will be performed
6 by electric fed stove instead of natural gas, which
7 is a non-renewable fossil fuel. Next slide, please.

8 We also want to talk about, and I
9 mentioned this before, the ambulance green elements.
10 Ambulances need electric power to operate vital
11 medical equipment, agency radios/mobile data
12 terminals, and to maintain ambient temperatures for
13 the medicines, patient care, and in both the crew cab
14 and patient bay. Historically, this has required
15 ambulance engines to remain idling while the EMS crew
16 is stationed at their "atom" while waiting for
17 assignment to medical emergencies. One ambulance, for
18 every hour of idling burns about a gallon and a half
19 of gas, diesel fuel, emits about 33 pounds of carbon
20 dioxide, and puts between 35 and 50 miles' worth of
21 wear-and-tear on vehicle engines. Next slide, please.

22 Several years ago, the agency had planned
23 to install charging stations at EMS "atoms." Here,
24 the crew would have been able to plug the ambulance
25 into a charging dock and then be able to turn off the

2 engine while powering all systems. However, industry
3 technology superseded this plan, and now the agency
4 utilizes an on-board system called "Stealth Power."
5 Here, you see our original design for the charging
6 stations and what the self-power unit looks like
7 which is located in the back of the ambulance. This
8 system provides powerful electrical equipment (air,
9 heat, light, laptops, radios, refrigerators, windows,
10 electric stretchers) without turning on the ambulance
11 engine. While an initial charge can maintain a
12 vehicle for more than 4 hours, the system will also
13 recharge itself when the vehicle is being driven, and
14 this has dramatically led to reduction in our use of
15 burning fossil fuels and reduction of engine hours
16 which helps us in the back end that we're not
17 replacing engine motors on a regular basis. Next
18 slide, please.

19 Currently, about 75 percent of our 700
20 ambulances are equipped with this system. All future
21 ambulances purchased will be equipped with this green
22 technology. The agency also has completed
23 specification development and will soon receive its
24 first emergency medical response vehicle equipped
25 with solar panels. This new system will also support

2 the vehicle's electrical needs while not requiring
3 the engine to idle. As such, this will further reduce
4 carbon emissions by our ambulance fleet and the
5 amount of engine wear-and-tear. Next slide, please.

6 Now we're going for the good part of the
7 facility. Here you see the floor plan for the main
8 floor of the proposed ambulance station. If you look
9 on the top of the floor plan and on the right side,
10 you see the outdoor parking spaces for the members of
11 Engine 92/Ladder 44. There you see the proposed
12 building which has BLS storage, a ready room, the
13 apparatus for the washing station, (INAUDIBLE) oxygen
14 and other supply areas. Next slide, please.

15 On the proposed second floor, you can see
16 the men's and women's lockers and bathrooms, the
17 mechanical equipment areas, the captain's office, the
18 security/telecom, the gym, the training area, the
19 dining room, and the outdoor terrace as well as the
20 staircases. Next slide, please.

21 Meanwhile, most importantly, here in the
22 basement you can see the 21 parking spaces and
23 bicycle rack. We have proposed to build as part of
24 this proposal so we're not competing with local
25 residents for on-street parking. Next slide, please.

2 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Mr. Harney.

3 DAVID HARNEY: Yes, ma'am.

4 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: We actually have this
5 entire presentation so, if you wanted to transition
6 to the next part, we could.

7 DAVID HARNEY: Okay. Very quickly. We can
8 roll through the other remaining slides very quickly.
9 Next slide, please.

10 The front of the building, looking at it
11 from a north to south view with Engine 92/Ladder 44
12 on the right.

13 Here you can see the building looking
14 north with the entrance to the garage to the proposed
15 facility, Engine 92/Ladder 44.

16 Again, looking south along the sidewalk.
17 Next slide, please.

18 Okay. The proposed action, the agency
19 worked with DCAS on the ULURP action which was the
20 site selection, but, because EMS stations are not
21 allowed as-of-right in an R7 zoning district, part of
22 this action is a request that a special permit be
23 provided by the City Planning Commission for this
24 proposed project. Meanwhile, the proposed station
25 will comply with all applicable bulk, height, setback

2 regulations as well as parking requirements in an R7
3 district. Next slide, please.

4 The proposed action was approved by Bronx
5 Community Board 4 on February 22nd and by the Bronx
6 Borough President on March 22nd. The City Planning
7 Commission then reviewed and approved the proposed
8 action on April 27th. With the Council's approval of
9 this proposed action, the long-term plan for EMS
10 Station 17's current location is to be transformed
11 into a community center as a component of the city's
12 borough-based jail program. However, this important
13 effort cannot commence until the proposed EMS station
14 is built. Next slide, please.

15 The Fire Department believes this
16 proposed new facility is important because it will
17 enhance the agency's EMS capabilities within Bronx
18 Community Board 4, not contribute to traffic/parking
19 issues along Ogden Avenue, provide our EMS staff with
20 a state-of-the-art facility while moving them out of
21 an old structurally failing building, not impact
22 parking/travel along Morris Avenue after it's built,
23 and create space for a community center. As such, the
24 Fire Department respectfully requests the City

2 Council Subcommittee support this proposed action.

3 With that, next slide, please.

4 We'll be happy to take anyone's
5 questions. I appreciate the Council's time and please
6 forgive me for running over.

7 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you so much for
8 your presentation. Are there any Council Members that
9 have questions? I know Council Member Stevens does.

10 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: If there
11 are any Council Members who have questions, please
12 use the raise hand button, and Council Member
13 Stevens, if you'd like to begin.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Yes. Good morning
15 and thank you guys for being here. Thank you, Chair,
16 for having this hearing and thank you, FDNY, for
17 being here. I just want to go on record saying I am
18 very aware of this project and even the community
19 center as I was one of the community members on the
20 MAP that fought to get the community center to be
21 there, but I still have quite a few concerns, and I
22 just have a couple of questions I would love to ask
23 to just get clarity and to make sure that we are able
24 to put systems in place that will hold people

2 accountable if there does become an issue in the
3 community.

4 Given the high number of FDNY facilities
5 in the surrounding areas, could your team explain the
6 rationale for choosing this location for the new EMS
7 facility, and what makes the facility different than
8 other FDNY facilities in the area?

9 DAVID HARNEY: Council Member, please
10 forgive me. You broke up at the end. Would you repeat
11 that, please?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: I said given the
13 high number of FDNY facilities in the surrounding
14 areas, could you team please explain on the rationale
15 for choosing this location for the new EMS facilities
16 and what makes this facility different than the other
17 facilities in the area?

18 DAVID HARNEY: Thank you very much for
19 your question. First and foremost, the agency chose
20 this location for a variety of reasons, one because
21 the relocation of the existing facility would not
22 affect the response times and the drive times of the
23 existing EMS units that are coming out of Station 17
24 in terms of the units of leaving their facility and
25 going to their (INAUDIBLE) the "atoms." The agency

2 also chose this location because the property was
3 under the Fire Department's jurisdiction and thereby
4 saving the city a considerable amount of money in
5 terms of property acquisition. From an operational
6 perspective and a financial perspective, this was a
7 win/win for the agency.

8 In terms of being different from other
9 facilities, as I noted in my presentation, this will
10 be a state-of-the-art facility that we're very proud
11 of because of all of the new components that were put
12 into it but also in terms of putting off-street
13 parking in the for the members so we're not competing
14 with local area residents for on-street parking,
15 which we know is an issue citywide, and we're doing
16 our best to address those. The proposed project will
17 still ensure that the firefighters assigned to Engine
18 92 or Ladder 44 continue to have off-street parking
19 while the members of the proposed EMS station will
20 have off-street parking as well so for these reasons,
21 we're very excited about this proposed project.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: One of my major
23 issues and questions have been is I know you put off-
24 street parking, there's a parking lot, but in every
25 facility that you see across the city there is

2 literally EMS trucks parked outside all those
3 facilities. A lot of times, folks still park on the
4 street, and those things will affect the quality of
5 life so how are you going to make sure that staff who
6 are coming there are using the facilities, that EMS
7 trucks are not parked on the street blocking the
8 traffic because that is a serious issue, especially
9 when I said there is literally 2 other facilities
10 that do it currently, and this is Morris Avenue,
11 which is a very busy street, which has one of the
12 only bus routes that go up through that location and
13 that could stop up traffic. I know that was taken
14 into consideration and just to say it won't happen,
15 it's already happening at other sites so how are we
16 really going to hold folks accountable to make sure
17 this is not happening?

18 DAVID HARNEY: Thank you for your
19 question, Council Member. The deployment methodology
20 that EMS uses, again, we do carry several number of
21 spares that will be in the station but there is
22 adequate room within the facility the way we have
23 designed the proposed facility so that we will
24 alleviate ambulances being parked out on the street
25 because there is not room within the station. You

2 have to realize that EMS Operations will not operate
3 like Fire Operations. In Fire Operations, tour change
4 occurs at 9 o'clock in the morning and 6 o'clock at
5 night. EMS tour change (INAUDIBLE) we have to
6 maintain a presence on the street at all times, EMS
7 tour change happens over several hours so the amount
8 of activity and the amount of vehicles being parked
9 at the station is very minimal and we designed a
10 facility with enough space to handle not only units
11 coming in and out for tour change...

12 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: (INAUDIBLE) No,
13 I'm sorry. I was hearing you. I'm sorry.

14 DAVID HARNEY: I'm sorry. Someone else was
15 speaking. I apologize. Again, we've designed the
16 proposed facility with enough space to maintain off-
17 street parking for spare ambulance that off-service
18 but also to account for ambulances during our tour
19 change matrix which will happen in the morning
20 between say 7 a.m. and 9 a.m. where you would see one
21 ambulance going in and out and maybe two ambulances
22 going in and out (INAUDIBLE) so there's enough space
23 within the proposed facility for the ambulances to go
24 into the station and to not park on the street at any
25 time.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: I hear you, but
3 what I'm saying to you is, and this has been my
4 issue. I feel like every time I have a question, you
5 guys give me a manual book response, but the reality
6 is, when I see the reality, even when I talked about
7 the units that put their sirens on consistently at
8 night because I lived up the block from one of the
9 units that's closest facility now, it was like that's
10 not the protocol, but those things are happening so
11 how do we make sure that we're mitigating these
12 things and actually being proactive and not just
13 saying that is not what they're supposed to be doing
14 when I am seeing currently at some of the other
15 locations those things are happening. My issue and my
16 confidence is low because it's your response to me
17 every time I have a question is that's not what's
18 supposed to be happening and I'm telling you it's
19 happening at other locations, how do I then have
20 faith that this is going to not happen at this
21 location?

22 DAVID HARNEY: I think that's something
23 that we'll bring back and look at in detail. If it
24 would be okay, Council Member, we'd like to get back
25

2 to you with a more official response if that would be
3 okay.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: No, absolutely,
5 because these are the questions that I have. I guess
6 the last question I have is just given the quality of
7 life issues that come with FDNY 24-hour public
8 service operation, can you please discuss the
9 mitigating efforts that the FDNY will commit in order
10 to mitigating any disruptions to the area. I hear you
11 saying you guys have the parking or whatever, but how
12 are we going to make sure that this does not affect
13 the quality of life, slowing up the bus service, and
14 I guess you're saying that you're going to have to
15 come back to me with those answers, but, like I said,
16 my main concern, I ask a question, you guys tell me
17 what's in the manual. However, I'm telling you that's
18 not happening at the current locations that's less
19 than a mile away so it's not giving me confidence. I
20 want to support this project. It makes sense. I get
21 it. But if these quality of life issues, let's be
22 clear, the residents are going to call my office with
23 them, right, so I'm going to have to deal with it so
24 I need to have the confidence that there's an actual
25 plan to make sure that these things are not happening

2 and that you're thinking about the residents there in
3 a very effective way because, like I said, at every
4 one of these locations which are all like 2 to 3
5 miles away, literally ambulances are parked on the
6 street, they're blocking up traffic, there's multiple
7 cars, not only are the trucks taking up parking,
8 they're blocking up the bus traffic, their cars are
9 out there, and, even with having parking lot and
10 those things, I am not confident that folks will
11 still not abuse some of the privileges that they have
12 as far as just kind of taking over the whole block.

13 DAVID HARNEY: Jeremy, go ahead.

14 JEREMY BROOKS: Thanks, everybody, for
15 taking the time today. Truly appreciate it and we
16 definitely hear your concerns.

17 One of the things that we can say and we
18 can do is work with our EMS Operations people to have
19 something come from them to the station itself and to
20 other stations where you feel like there is the
21 concern, and we could reiterate to them what the
22 protocol is. While, yes, it is in our books and
23 what's supposed to be done, like you said sometimes
24 things do not occur the way they way so what we will
25 do, we will converse with our EMS Operations to have

2 something come from the EMS Chief to the stations to
3 reiterate what our program and policy is and for the
4 Captains of those stations to also reiterate that to
5 their members to be facilitated down, and, when there
6 are issues, then we could address them at those
7 times.

8 DAVID HARNEY: Additionally, Council
9 Member, if I might add, the existing station
10 (INAUDIBLE) former firehouse which only has off-
11 street parking for 2 vehicles. The proposed EMS
12 station is more than 3 times that, has parking for 6
13 plus one in the decontamination bay so we have
14 drastically increased the amount of off-street
15 parking for our ambulances in the proposed facility
16 as compared to the existing facility.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Yeah, but I'm not
18 talking about the existing facility because I know
19 that it's a total nightmare because it's extremely
20 small. Ogden Avenue is just not a good location for
21 it. I'm talking about there's an FDNY1 site on
22 Portland Avenue, there's an FDNY site on Boston Road,
23 and, if you go over there, you will see all of the
24 vehicles are out, there's cars parked diagonal. Buses
25 are often stuck in traffic there because of the way

2 they have their cars parked. It's a total nightmare.
3 Like I said before, even with Portland, they have
4 their sirens blaring all the time and then it's like
5 that's not what they're supposed to do, but I know
6 because I lived up the block from there, and it's a
7 constant thing so, like I said, the issue is I know
8 that those are the protocols but those things are not
9 being in place currently and so to add another one on
10 top of that will change the quality of life
11 dramatically in this community, and I just want to
12 make sure that we are making sure and making every
13 effort to not really disenfranchise the community
14 here already. We already have a lot going on here and
15 so I understand the moving of it, I know Ogden Avenue
16 is not a place for it, I want to support this
17 project, but those questions need to be answered and,
18 even as far as the issues that we have at the current
19 sites, those need to be answered as well so my
20 confidence level is just not as high as it needs to
21 be for me to give the 100 percent support because,
22 like I said, I keep getting a manual answer when I'm
23 telling you these things are happening and those
24 aren't even being addressed.

2 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: I just want to step
3 in. Mr. Harney and Mr. Brooks, I hope you hear the
4 concerns of Council Member Stevens. She's trying to
5 circumvent a potential issue regarding quality of
6 life. What I recommend is that you all meet and have
7 a conversation, come up with a real solution and
8 strategy to address what she's asking for. If you
9 need the support of this Committee, if you need the
10 support of the Council Member, you should have a
11 strategy ready in order to address the concerns that
12 she's mentioning. I don't want you all to keep going
13 back and forth. The Council Member has made it loud
14 and clear she wants a better response so I hope you
15 all can provide that as soon as possible.

16 JEREMY BROOKS: No, of course, and we
17 appreciate the Council Member's concerns and all the
18 other community's concerns, and we will do a better
19 job at reiterating this to the stations as well, a
20 better ground presence to let the station know and
21 the members know going forward that this is something
22 that can't occur, and we will talk to our EMS
23 Operations people about reiterating all this to their
24 field units.

2 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: All right. Please
3 schedule a meeting with the Council Member before the
4 vote so that we can have a sincere conversation about
5 strategy.

6 JEREMY BROOKS: Of course.

7 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you so much. I
8 appreciate you all.

9 Counsel, are there any members of the
10 public that wish to ask questions?

11 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: First,
12 I'll ask if there are any other Council Member
13 questions.

14 Seeing none, there are no members of the
15 public signed up to testify on this item.

16 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you so much.
17 Seeing no other members of the public who wish to
18 testify on LUs 61 and 62, the EMS Station 17 New
19 Facility Project, the public hearing on this item is
20 now closed.

21 We will now move on to today's other
22 public hearing. I now open the public hearing on LUs
23 67, 68, 69, 70, and 71 for the Resilient Edgemere
24 Community Initiative, all submitted by the Department
25 of Housing and Preservation and Development.

2 LU 67 is a request for an amendment to
3 the zoning map submitted pursuant to Sections 197-c
4 and 201 of the Charter.

5 LU 68 requests approval of an amendment
6 to the text of the zoning resolution submitted
7 pursuant to Section 201 of the Charter.

8 LU 69 requests approval of the proposed
9 disposition of city-owned property submitted pursuant
10 to Section 197-c of the Charter for uses identified
11 in the Edgemere Urban Renewal Plan.

12 LU 70 requests the designation of an
13 Urban Development Action Area and approval of an
14 Urban Development Action Area Project for such an
15 area pursuant to Article 16 of the General Municipal
16 Law and Section 197-c of the Charter.

17 LU 71 requests approval of the 2nd
18 Amendment of the Edgemere Urban Renewal Plan pursuant
19 to Section 505 of Article 15 of the General Municipal
20 Law and Section 197-c of the Charter.

21 The proposed project area is conterminous
22 with the Edgemere Urban Renewal Area located within
23 the boundaries of Beach 35th Street to the East
24 Rockaway Freeway in Rockaway Beach Boulevard to South
25 Beach 50th Street and Beach 51st Street to the west

2 and Jamaica Bay to the north across 166 acres within
3 the Edgemere neighborhood of Queens represented by
4 Majority Whip Brooks-Powers. The proposed action
5 would implement several goals and recommendations of
6 the Resilient Edgemere Community Plan and an
7 interagency community planning initiative conducted
8 between 2015 and 2017 in the wake of Hurricane Sandy.
9 Key among the goals of that plan are protecting the
10 neighborhood from flooding, creating resilient
11 housing and maintaining the neighborhood's low-
12 density feel, improving streets and transit and
13 increase neighborhood amenities. In addition to
14 creating open space and reducing the density of new
15 construction closest to the waterfront, the project
16 is anticipated to create approximately 1,222
17 residential units on 41 projected development sites.
18 Of those residential units, approximately 673 would
19 be affordable rental and home ownership units on land
20 that is currently owned by the city and approximately
21 549 new units of housing would be created on
22 privately owned land.

23 Majority Whip Brooks-Powers already
24 provided her remarks on this project.

2 We are joined by Kevin Parris, Stephen
3 Erdman, Perris Straughter, forgive me, and Rosa Kelly
4 for HPD and David Velez and Allison Ruddock from VHB.
5 I now recognize the Subcommittee Counsel to
6 administer the affirmation.

7 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Do we have
8 everybody here? I'm seeing 4 people on the screen. 5,
9 we're supposed to have 6. There we are.

10 Please raise your right hands and respond
11 when I call your names.

12 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
13 whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your
14 testimony before this Subcommittee and in answers to
15 all Council Member questions? Kevin Parris.

16 KEVIN PARRIS: I do.

17 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Stephen
18 Erdman.

19 STEPHEN ERDMAN: I do.

20 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Perris
21 Straughter.

22 PERRIS STRAUGHTER: I do.

23 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Rosa
24 Kelly.

25 ROSA KELLY: I do.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, AND
DISPOSITIONS

43

2 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: David
3 Velez.

4 DAVID VELEZ: I do.

5 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Allison
6 Ruddock.

7 ALLISON RUDDOCK: I do.

8 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: The PowerPoint
10 presentation will be loaded when you call for it. You
11 all may begin.

12 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Again,
13 Council Member De La Rosa is here if she would like
14 to vote on LU 52.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Yes, please. I
16 vote aye.

17 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Thank you.
18 The votes on that are 7 in the affirmative, 0 in the
19 negative with 0 abstentions. The vote on that is now
20 closed.

21 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you, Counsel.
22 The PowerPoint presentation will be loaded when you
23 all call for it. You all may begin.

24 KEVIN PARRIS: Yes, I'd like to have the
25 PowerPoint brought up. We're ready.

2 Thank you. Good morning, Council Members.
3 Thank you for giving us some of your time to discuss
4 the Resilient Edgemere Community Plan. Next slide,
5 please.

6 Thank you. The Resilient Edgemere
7 Initiative is an interagency, community-based effort
8 to align New York City's climate change resiliency
9 investments in Edgemere with a long-term and
10 comprehensive community visioning for the
11 neighborhood. Edgemere is particularly vulnerable to
12 significant climate events such as coastal storms and
13 sea level rise, which has and continues to cause
14 physical and financial distress to the community. The
15 Resilient Edgemere Initiative as well as its
16 culminating plan continues to be the city's effort to
17 address these significant conditions. Next slide,
18 please.

19 Thanks. The Resilient Edgemere Community
20 Plan identifies a land use framework and a set of
21 strategies to create resilient and affordable housing
22 for a range of household incomes and sizes as well as
23 increase retail and community facility offerings,
24 mitigate future flood risk, increase waterfront open
25 spaces and improve the coastal ecology. Through these

2 measures, the plan positions Edgemere into the larger
3 city vision to improve the ability of flood-prone
4 neighborhoods to withstand and recover quickly from
5 future storms. Next slide, please.

6 The land use strategy proposed in this
7 application seeks to push future development and
8 density away from Jamaica Bay to more appropriate
9 locations further inland. When looking at Edgemere
10 through this lens, we have identified planning areas
11 and proposed specific actions within each of these
12 areas. Within our most vulnerable areas in Edgemere,
13 we have proposed a set of down-zonings that will
14 limit future development. Coupled with these down-
15 zonings, we have proposed a new special coastal risk
16 district to further limit development. We have
17 identified Rockaway Beach Boulevard as an appropriate
18 location to capture some of this displaced density
19 potential so we are proposing a modest up-zoning as
20 part of this application. Within these up-zoned
21 areas, MIH will be applied and enforced. Just
22 mentioning that this proposal seeks to take the most
23 conservative actions necessary to ensure proper
24 development occurs within the Edgemere community.
25 Next slide, please.

2 Looking at the zoning actions more
3 closely, this ULURP application seeks to down-zone
4 the areas closest to Jamaica Bay, which here you'll
5 see is the hazard mitigation area, from its existing
6 R4-1 and R4 into R3A, the existing R4 within the
7 limited development area to an R4-1, and portions of
8 the existing R4/C8-1 and R5/C1-2 within the
9 commercial corridor minus the up-zoning to R6A. Next
10 slide, please.

11 In addition to the zoning changes that I
12 just detailed, this application also seeks a UDAAP
13 designation for select sites as well as amending the
14 Urban Renewal Plan and proposing disposition
15 authority for all city-owned sites within the project
16 area. Next slide, please.

17 The city's work within Edgemere continues
18 to be a multi-agency effort. In wake of the
19 devastating effects of Superstorm Sandy, the city has
20 invested into Edgemere and the peninsula as a whole
21 to make it more protected from flood events as well
22 as more accessible to natural amenities. These
23 investments have taken the shape of improving the
24 park spaces at Bayswater and Rockaway Community Park,
25 the reconstruction of the Rockaway Beach Boardwalk,

2 improving the pedestrian sidewalk and roadways along
3 Rockaway Beach Boulevard from Beach 73rd Street to
4 Beach 88th Street, the continued sewer and road
5 condition improvements occurring between Beach 49th
6 and Beach 59th Street, the rehabilitation,
7 reconstruction, and elevation of approximately 109
8 damaged homes from Superstorm Sandy as well as the
9 ongoing work of the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers to
10 protect the peninsula from long-term erosion through
11 coastal protection projects along the Atlantic Coast
12 between East Rockaway Inlet and Jamaica Bay. The
13 goals of this proposal seek to continue to build upon
14 these investments to the Edgemere community. Next
15 slide, please.

16 As we highlight the city's investment
17 into the Edgemere community, I would like to
18 reference a key initiative that is further advanced
19 through this land use proposal. One key goal that has
20 been identified by community members as part of the
21 Resilient Edgemere Community Planning Initiative was
22 to identify those city-owned sites that could be
23 included in a community land trust, or CLT, and then
24 work with local organizations to develop a model for
25 future CLT ownership to facilitate long-term

2 affordability as well as resilient land management.

3 Here, the city's availability of land within Edgemere

4 coupled with having an active Urban Renewal Plan

5 presents us with a viable opportunity to move forward

6 with this recommendation. Within Edgemere, there are

7 a total of 119 lots that the CLT could acquire,

8 proposing that 62 of the lots available will be for

9 residential affordable home ownership development, 55

10 lots for open spaces programming, and 2 lots that can

11 permit commercial uses. Next slide, please.

12 I want to thank everyone for some of your

13 time to go over this initiative. Just also want to

14 note that we have all of Council Member Brooks-Powers

15 questions that were presented earlier, and we had

16 planned to address most of them during the Q&A

17 session, and, anything that we're not able to answer,

18 we'll get back to the Council in writing as a

19 followup.

20 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you so much for

21 your testimony. Counsel, I have a few questions, and,

22 after that, you can let me know if there are any

23 other Members with their hands raised for questions.

24 My first question is this project as

25 submitted to the Council would introduce over 1,000

2 new units of housing. Given the risk of climate
3 change, why is it appropriate to introduce so much
4 new housing to the Rockaway Peninsula in this and
5 other recent city-sponsored projects?

6 KEVIN PARRIS: I'd like to add that this
7 proposal is currently proposing an increase of
8 approximately, as you said, over 1,000 units through
9 the rezoning. I just reference that this is looking
10 at both the UDAAP sites and our privately owned site
11 so it's a balance of units between those 2 areas. On
12 the UDAAP sites, it's approximately 530 units, and,
13 again, what we're looking at is sort of shifting the
14 development potential that already exists towards the
15 Bay to a more appropriate location within the
16 community. These actions are coupled with other
17 resilient measures that are taking place out in this
18 community to further protect both the existing
19 residents as well as future residents coming as part
20 of future developments in the area.

21 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: As you mentioned, the
22 UDAAP proposed as part of this project would result
23 in the construction of over 500 units of affordable
24 housing. However, the project summary provides that
25 all units will be affordable to families earning

2 between 60 percent and 130 percent AMI and does not
3 specify whether the units will be rentals or co-ops
4 so I wanted to know why is HPD requesting such an
5 open-ended project approval?

6 KEVIN PARRIS: One key thing that's going
7 to happen on these UDAAP sites at a future date is
8 that these sites will go through our Request for
9 Proposals process, or an RFP process, and one of the
10 key steps in that process is our Community Visioning
11 Process where we go out into the community and engage
12 with the community members to really detail what the
13 vision of those sites should be, and we culminate all
14 of the feedback that we get from the community
15 members into a Community Visioning Report that's
16 tacked on as part of the RFP document that goes out
17 to the development community, and then the
18 development community responds to what the community
19 says that they want to see on their sites. The
20 programming for these sites have not been determined
21 yet. What was referenced as part of the document
22 materials pretty much leaves open the broad spectrum
23 of all of the programs that HPD currently has so that
24 when we go through that community process and we
25 hammer out what the programming that the community

2 would like to see on these sites would be, it would
3 still fall within that area that's part of this
4 application that the development community would then
5 have to be responsive to.

6 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: You mentioned
7 community. I hope you guys won't make a decision
8 without really involving them, having a real
9 conversation. Community Board 14 expressed a clear
10 preference for home ownership affordable housing as
11 part of this project. Are you all exploring ways to
12 increase home ownership in the plan? I know you
13 mentioned some of it, but, for the record, if you
14 could go into that a little bit more.

15 KEVIN PARRIS: I'll sort of separate that
16 a little bit. As we said, the CLT component has its
17 number of units is going to be for affordable home
18 ownership. We have also publicly committed and
19 constantly message that the sites that's going to be
20 part of this RFP, we are looking into exploring the
21 ability of home ownership. As we go through that
22 Community Visioning Process, we understand that we're
23 going to hear that again as part of being the request
24 and the need so that we will be prioritizing home
25 ownership as part of the competitive review process

2 when we see that that comes out as part of what the
3 community wants to see. When we go through the RFP
4 process and we are soliciting responses to that, we
5 would have a priority on those responses that have a
6 home ownership component as part of their plan.

7 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Why wasn't the
8 approach to do this before today's conversation? Why
9 is this happening after the conversation, if you
10 could elaborate more on that?

11 KEVIN PARRIS: You're referring to as far
12 as not going, if I understand the question correctly,
13 these sites are not currently slated to go through
14 our RFP process. They are part of our RFP pipeline,
15 and we've had engagement with the Community as it
16 relates to the overall Resilient Edgemere plan, and
17 this is a segment of that conversation that's going
18 to continue through even when we get to the RFP
19 process and following the RFP process. There has been
20 conversation, and we've heard some of the sentiments
21 that the Council Member has already shared here today
22 as well for home ownership and we expect to continue
23 to hear that as we go through our continued
24 engagement with the community.

2 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: I think a larger
3 conversation needs to be had regarding this so you
4 may have had a conversation, I know you heard from
5 Majority Whip Brooks-Powers, but a larger
6 conversation needs to happen. It needs to be in-
7 depth. This is my last question before we go to other
8 Members. Is HPD considering using this resiliency
9 planning approach, packing resiliency improvements
10 and reducing density in vulnerable areas with
11 planning for affordable housing and other community
12 needs, in other neighborhoods in the future?

13 PERRIS STRAUGHTER: I can take this
14 question. Thank you, Chair. There may be other
15 communities where this is appropriate. That said,
16 this community is somewhat special because HPD has so
17 much property here, and, in that way, it's very, very
18 unique, but we're certainly open to using this
19 approach in other areas. It's a conversation that
20 we've had and that we're having with both the
21 Department of City Planning as well as the Mayor's
22 Office of Climate and Environmental Resiliency and
23 Justice, I forget their exact name. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Oh, I do have one last
25 question. Regarding flooding, my stepfather lives in

2 this area so this is near and dear to me so I wanted
3 to know what are the flood protection measures
4 planned for the community by city and state and
5 federal agencies for the project area, what is the
6 evacuation plan?

7 KEVIN PARRIS: I can speak a little bit,
8 very briefly, on what I reference earlier. The U.S.
9 Army Corps of Engineers coastal protections for
10 Edgemere. They have a combination of hard and green
11 infrastructure designed to protect against flooding
12 within the coastal area. I don't have the specifics
13 in front of me. I can get back to the Council on what
14 that actually looks like but there is a plan
15 generated to protect the community from flooding, and
16 I can also get back to the Council on the second part
17 of your question as far as evacuation plans.

18 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: I just want to let you
19 know there are still residents in the area still
20 going through things so you may want to address some
21 of that before you continue those conversations.

22 Counsel, are there any other Council
23 Members with questions?

24 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Council
25 Member Nurse has questions.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: I just actually
3 have one question. If it's possible for us to have
4 that deck (phonetic) sent to us that you presented?

5 KEVIN PARRIS: Yes, that deck is with
6 Council now.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Okay. Thank you.

8 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: We'll make
9 sure it gets to all Members of the Committee.

10 If there are any other Council Members
11 who have questions, please raise your hands now.

12 I see no other Council Member questions.

13 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Counsel, are there any
14 members of the public that would like to ask
15 questions.

16 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: There are
17 members of the public, but, if you would like to
18 excuse this panel, I will then call them.

19 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Sorry. My computer
20 blacked out for a second. I want to thank this panel
21 for their testimony. This panel is now excused. I'll
22 hand it back to you, Counsel, just in case members of
23 the public want to share anything.

24 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Thank you.
25 Our first panel is Assemblywoman Stacey Pheffer,

2 Dolores Orr, Jacqueline Rogers, and Sonia Moise. When
3 we see them all on screen, the Assembly Member can
4 start this panel.

5 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Good morning, Assembly
6 Member, you can start.

7 SERGENT PEREZ: Time starts now.

8 ASSEMBLY MEMBER STACEY PHEFFER: Okay.
9 Good morning. Thank you, Chair Louis. It's great to
10 see you. Thank you for having this hearing. Before I
11 even get started, I just hope your stepfather is my
12 constituent. I just want to throw that out there.
13 Thank you for this opportunity. I appreciate this
14 time regarding the Edgemere Resiliency Program.

15 First, I want to say my dynamic City
16 Council Woman Selvena Brooks-Powers, Majority Whip,
17 absolutely gave a fabulous testimony and gave a lot
18 of sentiment of what she heard from the town hall
19 meeting that she hosted last night.

20 I'm going to give a formal testimony so
21 I'm just going to do what I do best is just talk out
22 of my heart today and the needs of my community. I'm
23 against this project in the sense of, nothing to do
24 with the resiliency and I think what I've been
25 hearing from your questions and HPD's response, I

2 think they've worked hard on this project, I don't
3 take away from the efforts put in, is that we're
4 talking about resiliency in the sense that we do need
5 resiliency in this community. We need storm
6 protection but not at the expense of over-development
7 that's continuing. We're talking about this Edgemere
8 project in a vacuum where there is so much
9 development that has been approved up-zoned between
10 the Peninsula Hospital site and downtown Far
11 Rockaway, and for a lot of possibly new City Council
12 Members, there's been a lot of up-zoning going on so
13 we're talking about all these benefits, which are
14 true benefits of having resilient buildings and
15 looking at infrastructure differently, but we're not
16 looking at the part that you, yourself, said, Chair,
17 that 1,000 new units in addition to all the up-zoned
18 which is probably about 4,000 units of housing in
19 addition to what's being able to be built as-of-
20 right, and there is definitely an over-development
21 going on here, and my Community Board Chair, Dolores
22 Orr, is on for testimony in this panel, and she will
23 speak about what our own Community Board has voted on
24 and spoke up about and I completely support my

2 Community Board and their participation as they are
3 the community and that's why they're there.

4 SERGEANT PEREZ: Time.

5 ASSEMBLY MEMBER STACEY PHEFFER: From the
6 point of the Peninsula, I'm sorry, what?

7 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: You can keep going,
8 Assembly Member.

9 ASSEMBLY MEMBER STACEY PHEFFER: I just
10 want to touch on that, and I think we have to look at
11 the promises that were made that were broken. There's
12 families that are living here 17 years in houses that
13 never saw the supermarkets, the commercial. Now we're
14 hearing about all this wonderful commercial
15 development that's going to come with it. Again,
16 we're mirroring the fact that thousands of people are
17 coming to an island, and I don't want to talk about
18 sinkholes and things like that but there's not been a
19 long impact study of an entire island peninsula of
20 what's happened to it. You, yourself, mentioned an
21 evacuation plan. I could talk about city people,
22 again, a person who has been born and raised on this
23 peninsula, it's been an issue that we talked about
24 for years. There has not been a clear evacuation plan
25 made. Yes, as Kevin Parris said, the Army Corps of

2 Engineer is making a more resilient community and
3 they are working on projects that are 20 years old,
4 but, if there was a big storm that came tomorrow on
5 the news, we would be stepping on each other to get
6 off this peninsula. There's nowhere to park. There's
7 many emergency efforts, I would say from the Office
8 of Emergency Management, that are not being addressed
9 on this peninsula. Evacuations of our students, of
10 our children, of our schools so we are building a
11 resilient area and it's much needed work, but it's at
12 least 20 and 30 years behind the investment that
13 should've been made on this peninsula. Our
14 infrastructure, our transportation. As a Member of
15 the Corporations Council on the State, I have yet to
16 have a conversation telling me how much more they're
17 adding to our buses and subway use, though there's a
18 new subway plan which is going to reduce, but
19 meanwhile there's thousands of people moving to this
20 peninsula. Take any weekend of good weather, and I'm
21 not just talking this summer, you can't even move
22 around this peninsula so I'm not sure when we
23 develop, and I'm going to keep saying over-
24 development, and I think you're the expert as Chair
25 of Land Use, but there's definitely something lacking

2 in a comprehensive plan from one end of the peninsula
3 which I do represent, from one side of the ocean to
4 the other side of what's being developed in the
5 safety and well-being of the people.

6 Additionally, I say this as a sarcastic
7 statement, a little salty, a little sassy, that's who
8 I am, but with all the development going on, I
9 haven't heard about the check amount for the Board of
10 Education to my school's investment. I haven't heard
11 about DOT investing money and that part of it.

12 There's no investment going on in our community we're
13 going to develop and then later on. I believe some of
14 that happened in downtown Brooklyn when it was being
15 developed that, after the fact, schools and
16 conversations were happening so we're not getting any
17 of that. Our services, the quality of life that the
18 people who have been living here, investing here, and
19 I see Jacqueline's on, and she'll talk about being a
20 person who bought a home 17 years ago.

21 Last point being is that I'm a person
22 who's benefited from living in a Mitchell-Lama co-op
23 for 31 years, and, if I tell you that generational
24 wealth, I've only afforded myself the life I have
25 because I've been able to live it in an ownership

2 apartment and have invested in my pension, paid down
3 debt because I've lived in this kind of lifestyle for
4 31 years. We've been fighting for that. There should
5 be much more home ownership and that quality of
6 bringing generational wealth. There's 5 housing
7 developments on this peninsula. There's additional
8 support of 17 nursing homes, 12 adult homes, and all
9 that, and everything else on this potential should be
10 developed as home ownership. Any other plan is
11 unacceptable. It cannot be on the backs of my
12 community.

13 That's my quick. I want to give it to my
14 community and my Chairs, but I want to thank you for
15 this opportunity. This is a very, very important
16 hearing. I'm available for any other discussion to
17 any City Council people, but, again, thank you very
18 much for the opportunity. I look forward to working
19 further and any other clarity we need on this point,
20 and I leave it to the rest of my panel that's here.
21 Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you, Assembly
23 Member. I'll yield to the Counsel if there's any
24 other members of the public.

2 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: The next
3 person testifying is Dolores Orr.

4 SERGENT PEREZ: Time starts now.

5 DOLORES ORR: Good morning and thank you
6 for this opportunity. My name is Dolores Orr. I am
7 Chair of Community Board 14 representing the 130
8 residents who currently live on the peninsula. Like
9 Stacey, I was born and raised and have lived my whole
10 life in this community.

11 I first want to say that we support
12 without a doubt the down-zoning that this project
13 calls for and New York City's decision to retreat
14 from the bay to keep our residents safe. That being
15 said, on February 8th, the Board opposed all up-
16 zoning changes that are defined in the Resilient
17 Edgemere Community Initiative. Why did we do that?
18 Because there are 12,000 units that have been built
19 or will be built in the next 3 years. That brings us
20 30,000 more residents estimated. We have the longest
21 commute to Manhattan if that's where you want to
22 work. We have one of the highest unemployment rates
23 in New York City with no foreseeable jobs coming. We
24 do not have adequate school seats. Our schools are
25 currently overcrowded, and we have no approved or

2 funding for any planned additional seats. In addition
3 to that, there is no, it's been 10 years since Sandy,
4 and OME has yet to give us an evacuation plan. How do
5 you add 30,000 plus another 5,000 on this project to
6 a barrier island and not have an evacuation plan? It
7 would be criminal for us to continue mid-to-high rise
8 development. Development has to be minimal. This
9 project has been around for a very long time. We also
10 have no reasonable access to any level trauma center.

11 SERGEANT PEREZ: Time.

12 DOLORES ORR: We cannot get to a trauma
13 center. I want to say that, again, I feel that New
14 York City has failed our black and brown communities.
15 The vision for an affordable 2-family home community
16 to live the American dream and then build
17 generational wealth is yet again being sidelined for
18 a mid-rise rental apartment where only the developer
19 or the landlord grows wealthy.

20 I will end by saying that our motion of
21 February 8th also included the requirement that HPD
22 continue and complete the original development plan
23 of 1 and 2-family homes to provide 100 percent
24 development of affordable home ownership. Thank you.

2 Oh, can I just say one other thing? I
3 apologize. HPD made a mention of multi-agency effort.
4 There is no multi-agency effort here. None,
5 whatsoever. They all work in their own little bubble,
6 and we'll worry about schools when the housing comes,
7 we'll worry about widening the roads after we put the
8 buildings in place so there is no multi-agency effort
9 whatsoever. Thank you for your time, and we hope you
10 can listen and support the community.

11 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Thank you.
12 The next witness is Jacqueline Rogers.

13 SERGENT PEREZ: Time starts now.

14 JACQUELINE ROGERS: Good morning and thank
15 you for giving me the opportunity to speak. My name
16 is Jacqueline Rogers. I am a homeowner in the
17 Edgemere community. I am also the President of the
18 Edgemere Alliance. We're a newly formed organization
19 to empower the community and bring economic and true
20 community development to the community. I bought my
21 house under the original Edgemere Urban Renewal, and,
22 to say the least, I am totally disappointed. I
23 believe my community has been abused and neglected,
24 and I feel that I and my community members have no
25 confidence in HPD or the city in respect to this

2 Resilient Edgemere. I was part of the Vision
3 Planning, the 15-month Vision Planning, that HPD
4 hosted in the Edgemere community. I personally got 75
5 homeowners to participate in that Vision Planning.
6 What came out of that Vision Planning is not what we
7 asked for, and I will ask if you can vote against
8 this Resilient Edgemere. Do not allow any type of up-
9 zoning to come into this area. It's a compact area.
10 It's a sandbar area. Like Assembly Woman Amato and
11 our Chair Dolores Orr for Community Board 14
12 indicated, we have been promised so much and have not
13 gotten absolutely nothing other than apartments. No
14 stores. We have nothing in our community. It's like,
15 no disrespect to Biloxi, Mississippi in the 1950s.
16 This is New York City. This is Queens. We do not need
17 all this over-development. We need resources. We need
18 community development that can help and uplift this
19 community. We are a sandbar. Homeowners' homes have
20 been impacted by the piling and the driving of piles
21 into the sandbar that we live on causing structural
22 damages to their homes. No outreach from HPD. No
23 followup through HPD. We were promised stores and
24 amenities. You can put the stores and amenities along
25 this area without impacting us with density.

2 SERGEANT PEREZ: Time.

3 JACQUELINE ROGERS: Can I finish, please,
4 as a community resident and as a taxpayer, please?

5 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Yes.

6 JACQUELINE ROGERS: Thank you. Arverne
7 East is going to (INAUDIBLE) and shadow Edgemere. We
8 do not currently have access to our beach. We have
9 not had beach access as far as actually being able to
10 get in the water, but, yet and still, a developer
11 that HPD basically sold the land to is now going to
12 put 1,600 apartment units in that area plus the
13 additional Edgemere Commons which is the former
14 Peninsula site is bringing 2,000 apartment units.
15 Edgemere is a small community. We're probably just 11
16 to 12 blocks wide and long and yet and still they're
17 looking to put all this density, apartment buildings,
18 in one concentrate area without bringing any kind of
19 full resources to the community. Where is EDC to get
20 jobs into this community? There are people screaming
21 to own their own business. This is a coastal
22 community. We should be built up like other coastal
23 communities so that it becomes a tourist area so that
24 we can benefit from the tourist dollars. We have to
25 do something more than housing, and I pray that you

2 hear us. We are saying no to this up-zoning. Please
3 hear us. Please do a tour of this community and see
4 the impact that HPD and the neglect that HPD and the
5 city has put on us for years. We're talking decades
6 of disinvestment, and I really wish somebody come
7 forward and see what we're going through. We do not
8 have the evacuation plan in place. There was a gas
9 leak weeks ago. No communication. No coordinated
10 efforts through the Fire Department, through the
11 Office of Emergency Management. Nothing. They're
12 unfortunately just dumping and building housing stock
13 without adequate wraparound resources for the
14 community. Thank you. I'm sorry to become emotional,
15 but something has to stop. This has to stop. We are
16 being abused out here. I thank you for your time.

17 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Next
18 witness is Sonia Moise.

19 SERGENT PEREZ: Time starts now.

20 SONIA MOISE: Hi. Good morning. My name is
21 Sonia Moise, and I am the President of Edgemere
22 Community Civic Association, and I have been a
23 Rockaway resident for 44 years. I have been a
24 homeowner in Edgemere for the past 16 years. Growing
25 up in Far Rockaway, I grew up NYCHA, and I was

2 fortunate enough to become a homeowner 16 years ago.

3 I can tell you all of the progress that the peninsula

4 has made. The only progress that the peninsula has

5 not made is within the Edgemere community. We have

6 been suffering for years. Edgemere is the only part

7 of Rockaway that has not been developed and has not

8 been developed correctly. We have been basically like

9 the red-headed stepchildren. None of our needs have

10 been met. We have been promised by HPD what they were

11 going to do, making the entire area 100 percent home

12 ownership. We were told that we would be given retail

13 stores, a supermarket, parks. We were told there was

14 going to be a school that was going to be built, and,

15 instead of the school being built which is basically

16 on my block, we had a COVID testing site, and that

17 came out of nowhere and none of the residents were

18 notified. We have been neglected. We are never

19 notified of anything. We have been fighting for years

20 with HPD, with the city, with elected officials, with

21 the local elected officials about what our needs are.

22 Now, all of a sudden, HPD wants to come out of

23 nowhere after Sandy to change the plans not once but

24 twice. Prior to Sandy, there was a plan implemented

25 by HPD. Since then, the plans have changed twice.

2 Within those change of plans, there has not been a
3 repeated environmental statement, which there should
4 be, before these plans ever took place. The area with
5 the up-zoning that they mentioned, which is between
6 Beach 39th and Beach 43rd Street along Rockaway Beach
7 Boulevard, those areas are way to dense. They will
8 cause more damage to the existing homes, and they
9 will cause more flooding in the area.

10 SERGEANT PEREZ: Time.

11 SONIA MOISE: Since Sandy, we have not
12 had, I'm sorry, but can I please continue? I would
13 really appreciate that.

14 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Yes.

15 SONIA MOISE: Thank you so much. Since
16 Sandy, we have not had any upgrades. We haven't had
17 no flood mitigation. There is no evacuation plan for
18 us. It's just a shame. You have other parts of New
19 York that was flooded. You have parts of Brooklyn
20 that was flooded. You have parts of Staten Island
21 that was flooded. They have flood mitigation in
22 place. What is the issue when it comes to Far
23 Rockaway, when it comes to the section of Edgemere,
24 when it comes to the east part of Rockaway? I'm
25 starting to feel as if we are being discriminated

2 against because of the people who make up the
3 community. The Rockaway peninsula, sadly, is very
4 divided, I should say. On the east part of Rockaway,
5 we are suffering. You go towards the west. They have
6 everything that's built, what they ask for is what
7 they get. The roads are better. They have better
8 infrastructure. They have better, when it comes to
9 retail. They have all those retails. They have all
10 those amenities. You come to the east part of
11 Rockaway, what do you want to do, what does HPD
12 always want to do? You want to dump on the east part
13 of Rockaway. We have tons of buildings that's going
14 up. We have tons of apartments. Why is it that you
15 want to put 5 to 8-story buildings in the dense area
16 of Edgemere? It's totally uncalled for. It's totally
17 useless. We have been begging for years, HPD promised
18 us the things that we would get which is amenities,
19 we want a school. We do not have another hospital. At
20 least give us an urgent care center, but you want to
21 overpopulate the area when you have nothing for the
22 people who are moving into the area. No schools. No
23 supermarkets. No retail. What about the people who
24 want to own businesses? We don't have a bank that's
25 here. Give us the things that we need to thrive so we

2 can create generational wealth. What we have right
3 now is absolutely nothing. HPD promised us our
4 amenities. Those are the things that we want.

5 As President of Edgemere Community Civic
6 Association, we wrote the board, we wrote HPD, we
7 wrote all of our elected officials, and the community
8 is not in favor of the up-zoning of the Resilient
9 Edgemere Project. The up-zoning which R4, R5, C1 to
10 C2, C8-1, R6A, and that C2-4 with plans to bring 6 to
11 8-story mixed used buildings with 530 dwelling units,
12 54,665 square feet of commercial space, and 266
13 parking spaces. The community feels this up-zoning
14 will bring potential flooding, damage to the
15 structure of surrounding homes due to the density in
16 the areas of Beach 39th Street to Beach 43rd Street
17 along Rockaway Bridge Boulevard, increase pollution,
18 increase noise pollution, quality of life issues,
19 overpopulation, an increase in flood and homeowners'
20 insurance premiums due to flooding and home damage
21 during and after construction, and hardship when it
22 comes to transportation.

23 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you.

24 SONIA MOISE: All I'm saying is just
25 please listen to the folks that live in the community

2 that we have been fighting and we're just frustrated,
3 and I'm sorry.

4 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Oh, I get it. I get
5 it. Thank you for your traffic.

6 SONIA MOISE: Thank you so much.

7 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you.

8 SONIA MOISE: I appreciate it. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: No problem. Anyone
10 else?

11 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Are there
12 any Council Members who have questions for this
13 panel?

14 Seeing none, we thank everyone for their
15 testimony, and this panel is dismissed. We will call
16 the next panel, which will be Glenn DiResto, Wanda
17 Warden, Amber Clinkscales, Marvyn Elias, and
18 ChantAndrea Blissett. When we see those witnesses, we
19 can begin. We'll just wait one moment for them all to
20 enter the hearing room. We'll begin with Glenn
21 DiResto.

22 SERGENT PEREZ: Time starts now.

23 GLENN DIRESTO: Good morning. HPD and the
24 City Council needs to understand we as Rockaway
25 residents are on a barrier peninsula with limited

2 job, healthcare, and transportation opportunities and
3 we can only grow so much without having a drastic
4 negative effect on our current and future residents.

5 This area of the Rockaways has already been approved

6 for large-scale developments and extremely limited

7 homeownership opportunities for residents. Downtown

8 Far Rockaway will have 3,200 units. Edgemere Commons

9 2,050 units. Arverne East 1,650 units. Now, we're

10 talking about another 1,000 units with Resilient

11 Edgemere. As residents, we are deeply concerned about

12 the clustering of affordable rental units with

13 limited opportunities for moderate and middle-income

14 households who seem to be forgotten about.

15 Additionally, almost all the 8,000 units, there is

16 only a few hundred of them available for

17 homeownership opportunities. The amount of affordable

18 rental units far exceeds other areas in New York

19 City, and the city of New York has not studied the

20 cumulative effect of all these different developments

21 at once. They've studied them all separately. They're

22 all right next to each other. They have not studied

23 in a holistic way the cumulative effect this is

24 having on us. With that said, the Rockaway community

25 desperately needs affordable homeownership

2 opportunities to be a major part of any development
3 going forward to ensure and promote economic
4 integration, ensure economic stability, and long-term
5 vitality of the community, and it will not displace
6 anybody.

7 SERGEANT PEREZ: Time.

8 GLENN DIRESTO: I leave you with this. You
9 give a man a fish, and he eats for a day. Teach a man
10 how to fish, and he eats for a lifetime. I ask that
11 in its current form that you please vote no on this
12 project and please make affordable homeownership a
13 major part of any developments going forward in the
14 Rockaways. Thank you.

15 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Thank you.
16 The next person testifying will be Wanda Warden.

17 SERGENT PEREZ: Time starts now. Ms.
18 Warden, you're on mute.

19 WANDA WARDEN: Okay. Can you hear me now?
20 Okay, yes. Thank you so much. My name is Wanda
21 Warden. I am a 50-year-plus resident of the
22 Rockaways. I'm afraid. I'm very afraid of the over-
23 development that is going on. We are in a food
24 desert. We are in a transportation desert. The 2,250
25 units coming where the old Peninsula Hospital site

2 is, the 1,650 units that's coming Arverne East in
3 addition to all the other builds that are coming. I
4 am also a Community Board member, and we do not
5 support this. I do not support this. I think our
6 Council Woman, Majority Whip Brooks-Powers, Stacey
7 Pheffer Amato, Dolores Orr, Sonia Moise, everyone
8 that spoke, I support that. We do not support this
9 over-development and we have no way to get off of
10 this peninsula in case of emergency. I'm afraid, and
11 I please ask that you vote no. Thank you so much for
12 your time.

13 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Thank you.
14 The next witness will be Amber Clinkscapes.

15 SERGENT PEREZ: Time starts now.

16 AMBER CLINKSCALES: Good day, everyone.
17 I'm just going to reiterate very likely I agree with
18 a lot of the panelists on here. I vote no against it.
19 HPD also, we held a meeting yesterday. There's so
20 many questions that we have. Reiterating back on the
21 homeownership, will HPD renovate or restore many of
22 the zombie properties that they currently have
23 throughout the Far Rockaways so that local residents
24 may have the opportunity to acquire them. Please
25 excuse the background noise. I'm currently traveling

2 on (INAUDIBLE) A Train. The second question I have is
3 being aware of climate change and the environmental
4 disparities that we have in the Rockaways, will HPD
5 encourage the developers to use sustainable materials
6 that are in accordance with what we are fighting for
7 right now in climate change. Will that be initiated
8 and encouraged in this project? Will HPD initiate
9 another meeting with the community residents so that
10 we all can voice our concerns directly with HPD so
11 that they can answer the appropriate questions that
12 we've been asking? Thank you.

13 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Thank you.

14 The next witnesses will be ChantAndrea Blissett.

15 SERGENT PEREZ: Time starts now.

16 CHANTANDREA BLISSETT: Good morning.my

17 name is ChantAndrea Blisset, and I've lived in
18 Rockaway for 49 years. I grew up out there, and I've
19 seen a very beautiful community. Edgemere was once
20 one of the quietest communities. We were always
21 small, very quiet, homeowners, and I'm seeing the
22 changes, and, like everyone else, I do not agree with
23 the changes. I do not want the Council to vote for
24 this because I do believe it is disrespectful. I do
25 believe that when we go to vote, when you go into the

2 polling center, you don't see very many people, I
3 think that is the attitude, well they don't vote so
4 we can do whatever we want out here, the people don't
5 care. Well, that's not true. I grew up out there. I'm
6 the principal of a high school in Brooklyn, Bushwick
7 actually. I have to leave my home community to travel
8 to go to Brooklyn to work. When I shop, I shop
9 outside of my area of Edgemere. There used to be a
10 CTown right within walking distance and a laundromat.
11 I've to go 2 towns over now to buy and shop. That's
12 shouldn't be. All of our dollars are leaving our
13 community, and it keeps us impoverished. It keeps us
14 in a situation where we're not really working
15 together as a community. Another thing about
16 homeownership, we're talking a lot about
17 homeownership, it's also important that we sell to
18 people who are planning to live in the homes because
19 it's one thing to have homeowners. It's another thing
20 to sell to someone who is just going to rent out the
21 house so now you're living next door to people who
22 don't own and you're dealing with the same situation
23 as if you're living next door to a huge people. All
24 these things need to be considered and some respect
25 needs to be paid to the people who have lived and

2 worked in Edgemere for many years. Many of my
3 neighbors have lived there for years, and I think we
4 deserve more than this. We do vote. Thank you so
5 much.

6 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Thank you.
7 Our next witness will be Marvyn Elias.

8 SERGENT PEREZ: Time starts now.

9 MARVYN ELIAS: Hey guys. How's it going?
10 My name's Marvyn. I live in the Edgemere community.
11 I'm relatively new to the community. I've only lived
12 out here for 18 years as a new homeowner. One of the
13 things that really strikes me about this
14 conversation, and this is a conversation that we've
15 had over and over, is that I can never find anyone
16 who lives in this community that votes in the
17 affirmative for any of these development projects but
18 yet still it seems to be a conversation that we seem
19 to have to have over and over and over again so I'm
20 not sure who's pushing the underlying agenda that
21 these are things that they think that we need in this
22 community. I've seen, over the years, what I've seen
23 in a small, middle-income community, people take
24 pride in homeownership, and I think one of the things
25 that gets lost in these large developments where

2 there aren't any homeowners is pride in sweeping your
3 street and keeping your sidewalks clean, etc. These
4 are things that are lost out when there's a push to
5 just monetize the available resources that are here
6 without having a true sense of what we want in this
7 community. Where people with kids want to have safety
8 and they want to have things that they can do on
9 weekends. We don't need any more lower-income
10 housing. If you move to places, Rockaway Park, I just
11 happened to drive through Rockaway Park a few weeks
12 ago, the disparity in the development in that
13 neighborhood compared to this, we appear to be a
14 third world country if you just drive through some of
15 those communities. There aren't any huge
16 developments, and the question is why? Why
17 continually are we being forced to have to defend the
18 things that we want if no one in HPD ever seems to
19 listen? We need things that you aren't proposing,
20 and, when we request these things, nothing ever gets
21 done. We need community centers. We need libraries.
22 We need playgrounds. These are things that we need.
23 We don't need an additional 40,000 people trying to
24 escape the Rockaways on effectively 3 roads of egress
25 during the summer months. It's insane. It takes me 40

2 minutes just to get out of the Rockaways to any of
3 the major highways and then an additional 20 minutes
4 just to drive to downtown Brooklyn. Why does it take
5 40 minutes? Because we just do not have the
6 infrastructure in place for these things and bringing
7 an additional 30,000 plus residents is not what we
8 need. We don't want it.

9 SERGEANT PEREZ: Time.

10 MARVYN ELIAS: We don't want it. I don't
11 know anyone anywhere has been okay with these sort of
12 requests to have these developments brought into
13 place. That's all I have to say.

14 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Thank you
15 to everyone for their testimony. This panel is
16 excused if there are no Council Member questions.
17 We'll just wait one second for that.

18 I see no Council Member questions so this
19 panel is excused. Thank you for your testimony.

20 Our next panel will be Leonard Yard,
21 Jason Greenburg, and we have an unknown caller. If
22 you're on the phone and have not put in your name, we
23 will admit you now. When we see these panelists in
24 the meeting, we will begin. Again, Leonard Yard. One
25 second, please. Is Jason Greenburg in the room? If

2 Jason Greenburg is in the room, could you please
3 raise your hand? None of these witnesses are
4 responding. We'll give it just one more second. The
5 meeting will stand at ease.

6 Again, we have an unknown caller. If you
7 wish to speak, if you're on the phone, you've been
8 given permission to speak. Please speak now.

9 All right. These witnesses are not
10 responding so we'll say there are no more public
11 witnesses.

12 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: I'm sorry, Counsel.
13 Assemblymember Amato has her hand up.

14 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Is the
15 Assemblymember there?

16 ASSEMBLY MEMBER STACEY PHEFFER: Yes, I
17 just wanted to tell you that Jason Greenburg was my
18 team member who was just signing up, I guess, for me.
19 I just wanted you to be clear that he's not a person
20 speaking.

21 SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL CAMPAGNA: Okay.
22 Thank you very much for clarifying that.

23 All right, Chair, there are no more
24 public witnesses for this application.

2 CHAIRPERSON LOUIS: Thank you, Counsel. I
3 want to take the time to thank Assembly Member Amato
4 for standing with your community and for your
5 leadership as well as Majority Whip Brooks-Powers.
6 Thank you Dolores, Jacqueline, Sonia, Wanda, Amber,
7 Glenn, Marvyn, ChantAndrea for your testimonies
8 today.

9 Seeing no other members of the public
10 wish to testify, LUs numbers 68 through 71 for the
11 Resilient Edgemere Project, this hearing is now
12 closed. That concludes today's business. I remind you
13 that if you have written testimony on today's items,
14 you may submit it to
15 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Please indicate the
16 LU number or the project name in the subject heading.

17 I would like to thank the applicants,
18 members of the public, my Colleagues, Subcommittee
19 Counsel, Land Use staff, and Sergeant-at-Arms for
20 participating in today's hearing.

21 This meeting is now adjourned.
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date July 15, 2022