

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

----- X

April 19, 2022
Start: 10:31 a.m.
Recess: 2:27 p.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING, VIRTUAL ROOM 2

B E F O R E: Amanda Farias,
Chairperson of the Committee on
Economic Development

Tiffany Cabán,
Chairperson of the Committee on
Woman and Gender Equity

Carmen De La Rosa,
Chairperson of the Committee on
Civil Service and Labor

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Speaker Adrienne E. Adams
Alexa Avilés
Jennifer Gutiérrez
Ari Kagan
Kevin C. Riley
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Nantasha M. Williams

COUNCIL MEMBERS: (CONT.)

Kamillah Hanks
Julie Menin
Francisco P. Moya
Erik D. Bottcher
Kristin Richardson Jordan
Eric Dinowitz
Sandy Nurse
Oswald Feliz
Althea V. Stevens
James F. Gennaro
Rita C. Joseph

A P P E A R A N C E S

Jacqueline Ebanks
Executive Director of the New York City
Commission on Gender Equity

Laura Gibson
Economic Development Advisor of the Mayor's
Office for Workforce Development

Lucinda Glover
Deputy Commissioner of the Workforce Development
Division at the Department of Small Business
Services

Claudia Flores
Assistant Vice President of Opportunity for the
Minority, Women and Disadvantaged Business
Enterprises at the New York City Economic
Development Corporation

Kathleen Culhane
President of NEW, Nontraditional Employment for
Women

Kate Krug
Executive Vice President of Nontraditional
Employment for Women or NEW

Sinade Wadsworth
Graduate of NEW

Lowely Cheung
IBEW Local 3 Journey Woman and Nontraditional
Employment for Women NEW Graduate

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

Santos Rodriguez

Testifying on behalf of Gary LaBarbera, President of the Building and Construction Trades Council of Greater New York, also referred to as the BCTC

Sierra Nezaj

Director of Communications and Grant Writing for Building Skills New York

Talisa Smith

Program Director of the Edward J. Malloy initiative for Construction Skills, CSKILLS

Megan Wylie

Deputy Political Director for the New York City & Vicinity District Council of Carpenters

Tierra Williams

Local 79 Organizer

Karla Cruz

Legislative and Policy Coordinator at Greater New York and Long Island Laborers-Employers Cooperation and Education Trust

Kyle Simmons

President of the New York City Laborers Local 924

Kayt Tiskus

Director of Legislative Strategy and Special Projects of Bowen Public Affairs Consulting

Shi Greene

Nine Year Union Member with Local 79 Laborers

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

Musfika Moshahid
Muslim Women Civic Empowerment Program
Coordinator at the Muslim Community Network

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 6

4 SERGEANT HOPE: Cloud is rolling.

5 SERGEANT LEONARDO: Good morning and welcome to
6 today's Remote New York City Council Hearing for the
7 Committee on Civil Service and Labor jointly with
8 Economic Development and Women and Gender Equity. At
9 this time, we ask that Council Members and Council
10 Staff, please turn on their video for verification
11 purposes.

12 To minimize disruptions throughout the hearing,
13 please place all cell phones and electronic devices
14 to vibrate or silent. If you have testimony you wish
15 to submit for the record, you may do so via email at
16 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Once again, that is
17 testimony@council.nyc.gov.

18 We thank you for your cooperation. We are ready
19 to begin.

20 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: [GAVEL] Good morning, I
21 am Council Member Carmen De La Rosa, Chair of the New
22 York City Council's Committee on Civil Service and
23 Labor. Before we begin, I would like to acknowledge
24 my colleagues and members of the Civil Service and
25 Labor Committee who have joined us so far. We have
26 Council Member — well, we have Madam Speaker, our
27 Speaker Adrienne Adams who has joined us this

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 7

4 morning. We have Council Member Moya, Council Member
5 Hanks, Council Member Dinowitz, Council Member Menin,
6 Council Member Bottcher, Council Member Nurse,
7 Council Member Feliz. I don't see anybody else. And
8 that's it on the Civil Service and Labor Committee
9 and now, I'll go on to read my opening statement.
10 I'm asking everyone to bear with me because I have
11 the flu and I'm struggling with my voice today.

12 So, thank you so much for being with us. As the
13 Chair and the Civil Service Labor Committee, it is an
14 honor to have you join us for this Oversight Hearing
15 on Gender Diversity in the Trades. Today's hearing
16 is a collaborative effort with the Committees on
17 Women and Gender Equity and the Economic Development
18 Committee, Chaired by my colleagues Council Member
19 Tiffany Cabana and Council Member Amanda Farias.

20 At today's hearing, the Committee will examine
21 how the city could help facilitate recruitment and
22 retention of women in the construction trades. We
23 will also be hearing legislation Intro. 179 of 2022,
24 sponsored by Council Member Francisco Moya, which
25 will create a taskforce to examine the role of women
in our traditional workplaces, such as women in

1 construction, utilities, maintenance, green and
2 transportation industries.
3

4 As COVID-19 continues to affect the lives and
5 livelihoods around the world, we can already see that
6 the pandemic and its economic fallout are having on
7 the regressive affects on gender equity. Recent
8 studies have documented the disproportionate economic
9 impact that the pandemic has had on women, especially
10 women of color. With women withdrawing from the
11 workforce at exponential rates, state and local
12 governments must take action now to ensure that
13 public funds are being used to create high quality
14 jobs that are equally accessible to women as they are
15 to men. Unionized construction jobs pave a path to
16 economic independence and security.

17 Construction, the construction industry workers
18 range from electricians, carpenters and plumbers can
19 earn a family sustaining wage without obtaining a
20 college degree. New York City's construction
21 industry has had a strong tradition of
22 apprenticeships and on the job trainings, which means
23 that job seekers with interest and aptitude can enter
24 the field without formal vocational education. Women
25 who do get access to the local construction industry,

1 typically earn 94.3 percent of what their male
2 counterparts earn. According to the AFLCIO, the wage
3 gap in the local construction industry is likely due
4 to a combination of factors such as prevailing wage
5 loss, apprenticeship programs for women and project
6 labor agreements.
7

8 In August 2022, the city signed a new series of
9 project labor agreements with the Buildings and
10 Construction Trades Council. The City touted these
11 agreements as a way to connect New Yorkers from
12 marginalized communities with apprenticeship
13 opportunities that will lead to long-term careers in
14 the construction industry. These new construction
15 projects of labor agreements contain a memorandum of
16 understanding which provides that 15 percent of the
17 annual apprenticeships lots should be reserved for
18 women, graduates of the Nontraditional Employment for
19 Women, also known as NEW.

20 My focus on today's hearing will be to evaluate
21 how the city is working with the building trades to
22 ensure that apprenticeship targets are beings met and
23 properly enforced and supported.

24 I am eager to hear from successful pre-
25 apprenticeship programs such as NEW who are supplying

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 10

4 a pipeline of qualified women workers to critical
5 local industries. I am hopeful that the city can
6 learn from new success and implement much needed
7 reforms in local construction industries to achieve a
8 greater gender equity and help women navigate the
9 challenges of the skill trades.

10 I would like to thank our Committee staff for
11 their hard work in putting together today's hearing.
12 Committee Counsel Bianca Vitale, Policy Analyst
13 Elizabeth Arzt and my staff, Chief of Staff James
14 Burke, Legislative Director Kiana Diaz, Legislative
15 Fellow Diago Kingtana(SP?).

16 I will now turn it over to the Chair of the
17 Committee on Women and Gender Equity Council Member
18 Tiffany Cabán for opening remarks.

19 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Thank you. Good morning.
20 Thank you Chair De La Rosa. Good morning, I am
21 Council Member Tiffany Cabán, Chair of New York City
22 Council's Committee on Women and Gender Equity and my
23 pronouns are she, her.

24 I'd also like to acknowledge my colleagues and
25 members of the Women and Gender Equity Committee who
26 have joined us so far today. Council Member
27 Richardson-Jordan, Riley, Stevens, and Gutiérrez. I

1
2 also wanted to echo the thanks for everyone who is
3 here today for this oversight hearing on Gender
4 Diversity in the Trades and hearing Council Member
5 Moya's Intro. 179 relating to creating a taskforce to
6 examine the role of women nontraditional work places.

7 It is well known that jobs traditionally
8 associated with cisgendered men, such as the building
9 trades we are discussing today, pay much higher
10 salaries than those like childcare and domestic work,
11 which are traditionally associated with women.

12 In 2020, construction was the fourth highest
13 paying employment sector in New York City with an
14 average salary of \$87,200 while domestic workers make
15 on average \$28,320. That's less than one-third as
16 much. At the same time, you know we're fighting to
17 raise the standard for pay in workplace protections
18 for our neighbors working in the later fields. It's
19 also important that we break down the barriers
20 keeping women and gender expansive New Yorkers out of
21 the former.

22 So, women make up just seven percent of New York
23 City's construction industry today and we can and
24 should do so much better. There are many reasons for
25 this disparity, some we know. Unsupportive work

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 12

1 environments, discrimination and harassment,
2 pregnancy and maternity accommodations, childcare and
3 more. And others, we will attempt to find out today.
4 Ultimately, it's my hope that we can develop
5 strategic recommendations for ending this double
6 standard and promoting gender equity throughout our
7 city's economy and that we can identify ways for the
8 Council to support labor unions and working with
9 women in apprenticeship to career pipeline.
10

11 Before we move on, I would also like to thank
12 Council Member Moya for partnering with me on Intro.
13 179. I am excited to work with my colleagues on
14 pursuing both this legislation and all these lines of
15 questioning in pursuit of the healthy, equitable city
16 we all want and deserve. In addition to my staff, I
17 would like to acknowledge the Committee Staff for
18 preparing today's hearing, Committee Counsel Brenda
19 McKinney, Senior Policy Analyst Chloe Rivera and
20 Financial Analyst Lauren Hunt.

21 I will now turn it over to the Chair of the
22 Committee on Economic Development Council Member
23 Amanda Farias.

24 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you and good morning
25 everyone. Thanks to Chairs De La Rosa and Cabán and

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 13

1 thank you to the members of all three Committee's for
2 coming together to hold this joint hearing today. My
3 names is Amanda Farias and I have the privilege of
4 Chairing the Economic Development Committee.
5

6 We are joined today by Committee Members Riley,
7 Williams Gutiérrez, Avilés, and Kagan. Today's
8 hearing marks the first time the session the Council
9 will have the opportunity to hear publicly from the
10 Mayor's Office of Workforce Development. An office
11 developed in 2014 for the purpose of standardizing
12 workforce efforts throughout the city.

13 At a hearing in March, the Economic Development
14 Committee expected to hear from that office but they
15 did not attend so we are glad to see them here today.
16 We would like to discuss the Office of Workforce
17 Developments Partnership with the Construction
18 Industry. In particular in order to evaluate the
19 success of its initiatives over the last eight years
20 and for the purposes of this hearing, what
21 specifically the office is doing to support women,
22 women of color and the LGBTQ Community and
23 Construction. We're also happy to see the Economic
24 Development Corporation here today. While we know
25 they will not be giving direct testimony, we will

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 14

1 certainly have some questions about EDC's Hire NYC
2 program which is designed to connect the city's low-
3 income residents to EDC projects. We would also like
4 to discuss the progress of the city's New York Work's
5 program to create 100,000 good paying jobs over the
6 next ten years and whether or not such program is
7 generating work for women and LGBTQ persons in
8 construction.
9

10 The Committees today hope to hear from the
11 Administration about the progress that has been made
12 toward advancing gender diversity of the trades and
13 how the Council can assist in furthering those
14 efforts. Before I turn it over to the
15 Administration, I'd like to take a moment to thank
16 the staff and the Economic Development Committee,
17 Legislative Counsel Alex Paulenoff, Senior Policy
18 Analyst William Hongach and Principal Financial
19 Analyst Aliya Ali for all their hard work in putting
20 this hearing together.

21 With that said, I will now turn the floor over to
22 the Committee Counsel Bianca Vitale to go over some
23 procedural items.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much Chair.

25 Before I actually go over procedural items, I'm going

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 15

4 to turn it over to Council Member Francisco Moya and
5 give him an opportunity to give remarks on his bill
6 that the Committees will also be hearing today, which
7 is Intro. 179 of 2022. Council Member Moya, you may
8 begin when you're ready.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: There we go, thank you.
10 Good morning everyone. Good morning Chairs, thank
11 you so much. Excuse me, I just had my tooth pulled,
12 so if I sound a little off, that's why. I think I'm
13 here to speak on behalf of Intro. 179. I want to
14 thank all three Chairs for allowing me the
15 opportunity to speak on this bill. We know that
16 there is much work to be done to advance women's
17 equity in the workplace, including nontraditional
18 careers such as the construction, utilities,
19 maintenance, green and transportation industries.

20 The genesis of this bill was conversations they
21 had with multiple women's committees from unions. I
22 heard from MTA bus drivers not giving accommodations
23 when pregnant and not being able to fit behind the
24 wheel. These women were forced to go on disability
25 rather than provide them with another assignment. I
heard from women flagging on subway tracks and

1 tunnels all alone. One who suffered a miscarriage on
2 the job.
3

4 I heard from women forced to change and
5 decontaminate from asbestos work in front of male
6 coworkers. I heard these struggles and the issues
7 women faced from discrimination to gaps in earnings
8 to reasonable work accommodations and work/life
9 balance for expected mothers and mothers managing
10 childcare challenges. My constituents have shared
11 this. Women I know have shared this and we've seen
12 how the pandemic exacerbated the issue women face at
13 work.

14 The bill I introduced last session, now Intro.
15 179 is specifically to require the creation of
16 taskforce to evaluate and then issue a report on the
17 role of women in nontraditional workplaces. This is
18 one step towards ensuring that we are not only
19 examining the role of women working in the
20 construction, utilities, maintenance, green and
21 transportation industries but that we have the right
22 representation in place to conduct this review. And
23 make recommendations for how the city could establish
24 a mechanism and build upon existing resources to
25

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 17

2 support and empower women to pursue and succeed in
3 careers in nontraditional fields.

4 My hope is that the creation of this taskforce in
5 subsequent review and recommendations will help this
6 city better tackle issues that lead to challenges
7 with recruitment and retention of women, sustained
8 negative work environments for women, impact on how
9 environments value diversity, equity and inclusion
10 and other significant barriers to success for women
11 in non-traditional workplaces.

12 Thank you and I look forward to hearing today's
13 testimony. Thank you so much.

14 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you Council Member
15 Moya. I'm going to turn it over to Bianca Vitale to
16 go over some procedural items. I also want to
17 recognize Council Member Rita Joseph who is a member
18 of the Civil Service and Labor Committee has joined
19 us. Bianca.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair. Good
21 morning everyone, my name is Bianca Vitale and I'm
22 Counsel to the Committee on Civil Service and Labor
23 for the New York City Council.

24 Before we begin, I want to remind everyone that
25 you will be on mute until you are called on to

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 18

4 testify when you will be unmuted by the host. I will
5 be calling on panelists to testify. Please listen
6 for your name to be called. I will be periodically
7 announcing who the next panelist will be. For
8 everyone testifying today, please note that there may
9 be a few seconds of delay before you are unmuted and
10 we thank you in advance for your patients.

11 All hearing participants should submit written
12 testimony to testimony@council.nyc.gov. At today's
13 hearing, the first panelist to give testimony will be
14 representatives from the Administration followed by
15 Council Member questions and then members of the
16 public will testify. Council Member who have
17 questions for a particular panelist should use the
18 raise hand function in Zoom and I will call on you
19 after the panelist has completed their testimony.

20 I will now call on members of the Administration
21 to testify. Testimony will be provided by Jacqueline
22 Ebanks, Executive Director of the New York City
23 Commission on Gender Equity. Additionally, the
24 following members of the Administration will also be
25 available for answering questions after testimony is
provided by Executive Director Ebanks. Laura Gibson,
Economic Development Advisory at the Mayor's Office

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 19

1 of Workforce Development, Lucinda Glover, Deputy
2 Commissioner of the Workforce Development Division at
3 the NYC Department of Small Business Services and
4 Claudia Flores, Assistant Vice President Opportunity
5 MWDBE at the NYC Economic Development Corporation.
6

7 Before we begin, I will administer the oath. I
8 will call on each of you individually for a response.
9 Please raise your right hands. Do you affirm to tell
10 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
11 in your testimony before this Committee and to
12 respond honestly to Council Member questions?
13 Executive Director Ebanks?

14 JACQUELINE EBANKS: I do.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Advisor Laura Gibson?

16 LAURA GIBSON: I do.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner Lucinda
18 Glover? Uhm, did you say I do?

19 LUCINDA GLOVER: I do.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay, great, sorry.
21 Assistant Vice President Flores?

22 CLAUDIA FLORES: I do.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you guys. Executive
24 Director Ebanks, you may begin when ready.

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 20

4 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Thank you so much. Apologies
5 for the technical difficulties this morning. Good
6 Morning Chairs Cabán, De La Rosa, and Farías, and
7 members of the Committees on Civil Service and Labor,
8 Economic Development, Women and Gender Equity. I am
9 Jacqueline Ebanks, Executive Director of New York
10 City's Commission on Gender Equity.

11 In this role, I also serve as an Advisor to the
12 Mayor on policies and issues affecting gender equity
13 in New York City for all girls, women, transgender,
14 and gender non-binary New Yorkers regardless of their
15 ability, age, ethnicity/race, faith, gender
16 expression, immigrant status, sexual orientation, and
17 socioeconomic status.

18 As noted by a few minutes ago, after my testimony
19 today, I will be joined by Economic Development
20 Advisor Laura Gibson of the Mayor's Office for
21 Workforce Development; Deputy Commissioner Lucinda
22 Glover of the Workforce Development Division at the
23 Department of Small Business Services; and Claudia
24 Flores, Assistant Vice President of Opportunity for
25 the Minority, Women and Disadvantaged Business
Enterprises at the New York City Economic Development
Corporation. We will all respond to your questions

1 on this critical issue of gender equity and diversity
2
3 in the trades.

4 As New York City recovers from the debilitating
5 impacts of COVID-19, the Adams Administration is
6 committed to building an inclusive and equitable
7 economy that is accessible by all New Yorkers
8 regardless of their gender identity or expression.
9 It is within this context that CGE works to remove
10 equity barriers across New York City and carry out
11 its activities across three areas of focus, within a
12 human rights frame and using an intersectional lens.
13 These areas of focus are Economic Mobility and
14 Opportunity where we seek to create in which people
15 of all gender identities and expressions live
16 economically secure lives and have access to
17 opportunities to thrive. Our secondary focus Health
18 and Reproductive Justice, where we pursue a goal of
19 fostering a city free from gender and race-based
20 health disparities. And our third and final area of
21 focus is safety with a goal of fostering a city free
22 from gender and race-based violence.

23 The issue of achieving gender equity and
24 diversity in the trades falls within CGE's work on
25 Economic Mobility and Opportunity. In this

1 portfolio, CGE strives to protect the rights of
2 workers, regardless of gender identity and
3 expression, and to promote equitable employment
4 policies and practices across all sectors, including
5 pay equity and sick and parental leave, to name a
6 few.
7

8 The Adams Administration is committed to an
9 equitable economy that connects New Yorkers to high-
10 quality jobs and in-demand skills, as illustrated by
11 the Mayor's Economic Recovery Blueprint. The
12 Blueprint outlines the city's commitment to providing
13 workers with the supports they need to succeed, from
14 access to childcare and broadband service to stipends
15 for low-income workforce program participants. To do
16 this work, the Adams Administration will collaborate
17 across agencies and sectors to develop and implement
18 targeted programs, amplify opportunities, and
19 facilitate outreach to excluded communities to
20 advance gender equity and diversity in the workplace.

21 Mayor Adams also recently advocated for important
22 policies at the state level to support working women,
23 including an expanded Earned Income Tax Credit and
24 critical childcare support, and got them. This means
25 EITC secured an increase to the program for the first

1 time in 20 years, adding an additional city
2 investment of \$250 million into the program.
3

4 Resulting in 800,000 working New Yorkers will now
5 have extra money in their pockets. Under the city's
6 expansion of the EITC, a single parent with one child
7 with an income of \$14,750 will see their benefit
8 increase from \$181 to \$905, a 400 percent increase,
9 and under the state supplemental payment, the EITC
10 benefit will increase from \$1,085 to \$1,357 for the
11 individual. For a married couple with two kids and
12 an income of \$25,000, their benefit will increase
13 from \$299 to \$897 under the city payment, a 200
14 percent increase. Under the state one-time
15 supplemental payment, their benefit will increase
16 from \$1,794 to \$2,243. I'll also note that New
17 Yorkers can access the EITC through filing their
18 taxes, and new free tax preparation is available for
19 most families with low and moderate income across the
20 five boroughs. In just the first part of the 2022 tax
21 season which kicked off in January, it's now closed,
22 New York City free tax prep, has helped New Yorkers
23 file more than 41,000 tax returns, save more than \$5
24 million in fees.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 24

4 Following Mayor Eric Adams' advocacy, the State
5 also acted and committed \$4 billion in funding to New
6 York City for childcare over four years. And we have
7 also secured authorization for our tax incentives
8 that will spur the private sector in creating 17,000
9 new childcare seats. It is this type of City-State
10 partnership that will help us address some of the
11 critical issues facing women and families today.
12 This work builds on recent accomplishments, including
13 a passage of the salary history ban, paid sick and
14 safe leave, a paid family leave policy, and the
15 packages of laws known as the Stop Sexual Harassment
16 in New York City Act, which all combine to create
17 safer workplaces, build greater economic opportunity
18 for New Yorkers, and further advance gender equity in
19 our city.

20 The Adams Administration is committed to
21 supporting women, transgender, gender non-binary and
22 nonconforming people in the workplace and identifying
23 opportunities for greater support in construction and
24 beyond. Many occupations in the United States are
25 marked by disproportionate representation along
gender, race, and ethnic lines. Labor market
segregation leads to inequity by crowding women and

1 people of color into occupations that offer lower
2 compensation, fewer benefits, and less economic
3 security.
4

5 1Many historical, social, and institutional
6 factors create and perpetuate this segregation,
7 including racism, sexism, gender role stereotypes,
8 and biases within the K-12 and postsecondary
9 education systems. According to the Institute for
10 Women's Policy Research, women make up four percent
11 of workers in construction occupations. The lack of
12 gender equity in the trades is just one example of
13 occupational segregation across the labor market.
14 Yet trade jobs offer enormous opportunities for
15 women, transgender, gender non-binary and gender
16 nonconforming people, and those who identify as
17 LGBTQ+. Trade jobs are often high-paying, with good
18 benefits and union representation and are avenues to
19 economic mobility and security without having to take
20 on the heavy burden of student debt, which is
21 disproportionately held by women.

22 Research from the Center for American Progress
23 found that construction workers, especially those in
24 a union, were better compensated than workers in
25 women-dominated occupations with similar educational

1 requirements, such as childcare workers, service
2 workers, and administrative assistants. Another
3 advantage of working in construction in particular is
4 the relatively low gender pay gap, women who can
5 access construction jobs earn 94.3 percent of what
6 men earn in the same work.
7

8 Despite the appeal of trade jobs, there are
9 several challenges that prevent women and TGNBNC
10 people from obtaining and maintaining employment in
11 the trades. These well-documented barriers include
12 racial and gender discrimination, societal norms such
13 as gender role stereotypes, cultural bias, lack of
14 access to childcare and pregnancy accommodations, and
15 negative and unsafe work environments, among others.
16 In a recent national survey of over 2,500
17 tradeswomen, 44 percent said that they had seriously
18 considered leaving their industry, citing lack of
19 respect and discrimination. Others mentioned lack of
20 pregnancy accommodations as a factor, and workers
21 with young children cited difficulties finding
22 childcare as another potential reason to leave the
23 trades. Increasing gender equity and diversity in
24 the trades requires addressing these barriers so that
25 women and TGNBNC workers feel welcome to join and

1 remain in the trades, which offer a stable and
2
3 lucrative career path with positive implications for
4 gender and wage equity.

5 Achieving gender equity will also require
6 unclogging the pipeline to leadership that keeps
7 women and TGNBNC workers from advancing to higher
8 positions in the trades. This work would benefit
9 greatly from more research and data on women and
10 TGNBNC trade workers in New York City to identify and
11 problem-solve around specific inequities. We thank
12 Chairs Cabán, De La Rosa, and Farías, and Council
13 Member Moya for their leadership on this issue.

14 The challenges around achieving gender equity in
15 the trades extends to women's employment across the
16 labor market, which was severely impacted by the
17 COVID-19 pandemic. Millions of women, particularly
18 women of color, sustained job losses or chose to
19 leave the workforce entirely to manage other
20 responsibilities, like caregiving. Yet opportunities
21 lay ahead as New York City begins to recover. We can
22 and will rebuild and refocus on supporting women and
23 TGNBNC New Yorkers in the workforce. The Adams
24 Administration is committed to ensuring a gender-
25 equitable recovery that promotes gender diversity in

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 28

1 all areas of employment, including and especially in
2 the trades. We support the intent of Intro. 179,
3 which proposes to establish a taskforce to establish
4 the role of women in the trades and nontraditional
5 workplaces and we look forward to discussing this
6 idea with you further. Thank you having us here
7 today. We are happy to take any questions you may
8 have.
9

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Executive Director
11 Ebanks. I will now turn it over to Chair De La Rosa
12 for questions.

13 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you Bianca.
14 Speaker Adams is coming right back to ask some
15 questions of the panel. Do we want to continue with
16 the next testimony until she returns?

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Uhm, so yeah, basically at
18 this portion I'm going to now turn it over to
19 yourself Carmen and also after your questions than
20 Chair Cabán and Chair Farias will be given an
21 opportunity to ask questions of the Administration.
22 As soon as the Speaker comes back on, then we can
23 pivot and open up the floor to her if she has any
24 questions for the Admin and then we will turn to
25

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 29

1 Council Members for the three committees for their
2 questions.
3

4 Panelists, please stay unmuted if possible during
5 this question and answer period. Thank you again
6 Executive Director Ebanks and Chair De La Rosa,
7 please begin when ready.

8 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great thank you so much.
9 So, I have a question about some of the project labor
10 agreements that in 2020, there was a citywide
11 renovation of project labor agreements that states
12 that apprenticeships jointly sponsored by local
13 unions in the building trades Employers Association
14 will reserve 15 percent of the annual apprenticeships
15 lots for women graduates of NEW.

16 I want to ask to see if you can respond as to how
17 was the 15 percent agreed to? How did we land on 15
18 percent and in 2021, how many apprenticeships did
19 this translate into on the construction job sites?

20 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Thank you so much Chair De La
21 Rosa for that question and my colleague, Deputy
22 Commissioner Lucinda – Laura Gibson. My apologies,
23 Economic Development Advisor Laura Gibson at the
24 Mayor's Office of Workforce Development will respond
25 that question.

1
2 LAURA GIBSON: Yeah, thank you and thank you
3 Chairs Cabán, De La Rosa and Farias. I'm grateful
4 for the opportunity to be here.

5 So, the PLA goals were made collaboratively with
6 the Building and Construction Trades Council and the
7 pre-apprenticeship training programs that fall under
8 the apprenticeship during this collective. These
9 training programs are referred to specifically
10 because they have longstanding relationships with the
11 unions and have worked historically to reserve a
12 negotiated number of slots that's appropriate for
13 graduates from their programs. So, they use that
14 process and historical data to come to those
15 percentages. As far as the 2021 apprentices, that's
16 somethings that very important to us and a good
17 question that I need to get back to you with the
18 data.

19 CHAIPREPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay, thank you, we
20 would appreciate that. I also have a question
21 specifically about the different agencies and the
22 PLA's that exist within those.

23 Presently HPD and EDC are not party to a PLA with
24 the city resulting in lax procurement practices that
25 lead to worker exploitation on affordable housing

1 projects and neighborhood rezonings. Why is the city
2 opposed to extending a PLA to other agencies to
3 implement standards on vital city development
4 projects.
5

6 LAURA GIBSON: Okay yes, I can take that as well.
7 Thank you. I mean, this is a larger conversation
8 that I think requires including our partners at HPD
9 and other stakeholders and we'd love to get back to
10 you on that start having that conversation.

11 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay and then another
12 question around PLA's, unions are required to provide
13 the City Office of Workforce Development reports on
14 one, apprenticeship training and recruitment
15 notifications and minimum qualifications. Two,
16 apprenticeship training programs of action plans
17 within 30-day of submission to the New York State
18 Department of Labor. Can the city share some of
19 those reports with the City Council?

20 LAURA GIBSON: Uhm, okay thank you. I'm not sure
21 that's something I need to talk - we put those goals
22 together collaboratively with the Building and
23 Construction Trades Council, so I don't feel like I'm
24 able to answer that now but we can definitely get
25 back to you on it.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay and then asking
3 about the PLA, which states that unions will
4 prioritize the referral of workers from zip codes
5 where at least 15 percent of the population lives
6 below the federal poverty level or are NYCHA
7 residents aiming to reach the overall goal of at
8 least 30 percent for all our work under the PLA
9 projects are logged by workers from these zip codes.

10 Can you describe how the prioritization
11 recruitment for these zip codes is going and uhm, are
12 women being also targeted within these populations
13 for recruitment?

14 LAURA GIBSON: Definitely, so we know that
15 unions, many of the local unions that are party to
16 the PLA have hiring hauls and establish out of work
17 lists, where workers are referred by the union to
18 specific jobs through contractor requests. So, those
19 typically include zip codes and as such, the unions
20 committed to leveraging these systems to prioritize
21 workers from the targeted zip codes. We're also
22 looking at community hiring legislation at the state
23 level so that the city can increase its ability to
24 refer workers from the zip codes. And hope to have
25 more results with that.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great and then my last
3 question, then I'll turn it over to Chair Cabán, is
4 have the dedicated slots across demographic groups
5 been an effective way to diversify in your opinion or
6 in your experience?

7 LAURA GIBSON: Uhm, yeah, I think I would say in
8 my opinion the pre-apprenticeship training programs
9 and our partnership there and the targeted
10 recruitment they do and just the years of established
11 relationships with the unions, uhm, is the greatest
12 asset to diversifying the trades. And we've had
13 great success there and that's where the city really
14 partners with the recruitment process is through
15 funding those programs.

16 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yeah, we know that
17 programs like NEW are showing success and a model for
18 how to enter that pathway to career. Are there any
19 enforcement mechanisms if the goals that have been
20 set are not met? And if so, who has oversight? Just
21 to have more clarity on how the industry works. Who
22 has oversight over the enforcement of the goals that
23 have been set out in the PLA's?

24 LAURA GIBSON: Okay, thank you. Currently
25 there's no penalties that the PLA has written so that

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 34

4 we will continue to work together with the Building
5 and Construction Trades Council and make changes as
6 appropriate. So, it's flexible and has been a very
7 collaborative, positive experience so far. It does
8 not include penalties.

9 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: So, so, so you're saying
10 that this would come out of the Mayor's Office for
11 Workforce Development or?

12 LAURA GIBSON: Yes, it's the Mayor's Office of
13 Workforce Development, the Buildings Construction
14 Trades Council and the pre-apprenticeship programs
15 under ARC all working together to meet the goals.

16 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great, thank you so much
17 for answering this first round of questions. I'm
18 going to pass it over to Chair Cabán.

19 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Thank you. I just want to
20 check for a moment, has Speaker Adams joined us again
21 or should I go ahead and continue?

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You may continue Chair Cabán.
23 She's not on, she's not back on yet. We'll let you
24 know.

25 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Awesome, thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No worries.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Okay, so I guess I'll start
3 with some of the – some questions around the barriers
4 to entry and retention. Careers of the trade have
5 the potential to provide obviously excellent
6 opportunities for unemployed and underemployed women
7 and gender expansive folks but there are numerous
8 barriers to entry. Putting childcare challenges,
9 transportation struggles and obviously a male
10 dominated workforce.

11 So, my first question is, what does the city view
12 as the largest barriers to recruiting women to work
13 in the construction industry. I know that it was
14 touched on in the testimony but I'd like to dig a
15 little deeper there.

16 JACQUELINE EBANKS: I think what we see Chair
17 Cabán and thank you for this question, that it's
18 really the combined effect of these barriers right?
19 It's – I don't know if we see one particular area
20 dominating. We have the history. We have the social
21 barriers. We have you know the cultural bias. The
22 predisposition to educate into tracks that require a
23 bachelors or a masters degree. And so, there's this
24 need to kind of shift the way we operate as a society
25 in general to value equally the disparate approaches

1 to career development right. And I think that's
2 probably you know the greatest challenge here is how
3 do we shift the preconceived and rooted notions and
4 needless to say, how do we disrupt discrimination in
5 general, right voices and sexism etc.
6

7 So, I think we're looking at a combined impact
8 and then working on – because if you think of the
9 multiplicity of people who enter, women, LGBTQ
10 individuals, transgender individuals at any one
11 point, they're faced with discrimination right. And
12 so, I think we are mindful of that as we do this work
13 to operating at the intersection of identities and
14 operating at the intersections at the multiple forms
15 of discrimination that exists.

16 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: And to your point or when you
17 flagged sort of the cultural bias, what does
18 dismantling those historical biases look like in
19 practice? What is being done and also in your view,
20 like what more could be done?

21 JACQUELINE EBANKS: I think I'd like to talk
22 about the importance of training here right. The
23 importance of education and public engagement. The
24 importance of increasing awareness of the
25 availabilities of these jobs and the fact that

1 individuals, women, LGBTQ and transgender, gender
2 nonbinary individuals can participate. So, it's the
3 issue of representation and how do we communicate and
4 I think that's why we're really proud of the
5 collaborative and multipronged approach to outreach
6 that we have. So, you know one of the things we do
7 is communicate the availabilities of each job in
8 these career paths. And so, you will find
9 collaboration with nonprofit partners in terms of
10 outreach and outreach in communities of high need.
11 You'll find postings on our bus sheds, things like
12 that. And then you'll find heavy use of social media
13 throughout all of our city agencies to promote
14 opportunities.
15

16 And so, I think that outreach piece is key. I
17 think entering into our schools and showing the range
18 of options and then, in EDC we have a program Women.
19 NYC, which elevates varies entry points into career
20 and also how women can pivot in careers to increase
21 higher earnings and to increase earnings. And so, I
22 think we're using those approaches in order to
23 disrupt and then, I want to say, it's how do we also
24 make the workplace safer, right. And we have these
25 robust laws that stop sexual harassment. That are

1 clear on the path to complaint. We have a robust
2 enforcement process within the city's Commission on
3 Human Rights and so, all of these things work
4 together to disrupt. So, we try to educate, increase
5 awareness and disrupt negative behavior and
6 discrimination as it exists.
7

8 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: So what I and correct me if
9 I'm wrong but what I heard is sort of like you know,
10 making it clear to folks that there is this onramp so
11 that we are achieving you know these diversity goals
12 and then also, these really strong enforcement
13 processes. Is there, what seems like a gap and I'm
14 hoping you can tell me if it's being filled or if
15 there's more to be done there, is like the actual
16 work with folks who may have been in this industry
17 for a long time. Have been part of the culture, hold
18 these biases and like the proactive efforts to start
19 dismantling those within the folks that are already
20 in the community.

21 JACQUELINE EBANKS: I would say that certainly,
22 uhm you know we have as a city, strong requirements
23 around training for unconscious bias, implicit bias,
24 all of these things. We would have to look to our
25 partners and unions and employers to determine the

1 degree to which they are actually implementing these
2 efforts. And holding them accountable to that is
3 that strong infrastructure.
4

5 I'm sure work is being done and I would defer to
6 my colleagues if they have anything to add. But we
7 clearly know that more can be done and we want to
8 ensure that we build you know that the efforts we
9 make are consistent and ongoing and that they are
10 sustained. I think that's really important. I think
11 we're building a system and it will be important to
12 our recovery to ensure that the system is one that
13 can be sustained.

14 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Thank you and I know we have
15 three Committees here, so I don't want to take up too
16 much time with my questions but would love it if you
17 all would be able to provide any information on some
18 of like the trainings that we're seeing that combat
19 just that.

20 A national survey of trades women found that most
21 women learned about the trades from a family member
22 or a friend. A few learned about them through school
23 or job centers and so, you just hit on some of the
24 spot that outreach but again, I just want some more
25 detail on exactly how it's operationalized. Like

1
2 what is the system that we are using to engage and
3 ensure that more gender diverse people are learning
4 about those opportunities presented by the trades.

5 I know you mentioned schools a little bit. If
6 you could describe any efforts the city has made to
7 attract young people, including through those
8 technical high schools and describe any work that the
9 city is doing to attract the involvement of more
10 increased recruitment of young LGBTQ+ folks in the
11 trades. And again, here I'm just looking for a
12 little bit more specificity on what it looks like.

13 JACQUELINE EBANKS: I would like to turn to I
14 think it's Deputy Commissioner Lucinda Glover. I
15 think she has some very specifics there but also add
16 that we can in follow-up to this in addition to what
17 Deputy Commissioner Glover will talk about. We have
18 some opportunity to provide greater detailed post
19 hearing. Lucinda.

20 LUCINDA GLOVER: Thank you and thank you Chair
21 for the question. My answer is in relation to the
22 Workforce One career center system and our associated
23 training. So, we work very closely with a network of
24 over 300 community partners to get the word out about
25 our career services and our training opportunities.

1 That includes community partners who are dedicating
2 to serving the LGBTQ+ community and partners who are
3 dedicated to serving women and youth.
4

5 We also have a Workforce One career center in
6 West Farms, which is dedicated to serving young
7 people. We do outreach through our sister city
8 agencies such as the Human Resources Administration,
9 Department of Education and NYC Housing Authority. We
10 do target in marketing through social media. We use
11 the Link NYC stations and bus shelters and we also do
12 targeted sourcing from Workforce One customer
13 database and as announced in the blueprint to
14 economic reform, we are also out and about in the
15 community with SBS's mobile operating unit, where
16 we're able to provide career services to people
17 through that unit. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Thank you. Uhm, I'm going to
19 shift a little bit. The construction industry has a
20 notoriously high worker turnover rates. In a
21 national survey of trades women conducted by the
22 institute for women's policy research, 44 percent of
23 trades women surveyed said that they would strongly
24 consider exiting the industry for various reasons.
25

4 Again, some of the things that were pointed out
5 in the earlier testimony, including but not limited
6 to childcare grasp in opportunities for advancement.
7 What supports and resources are available to help
8 retain women and LGBTQ+ folks apprentices once they
9 enter the construction workforce?

10 And two, sort of other pieces to that question
11 is, can you describe any efforts or programs and
12 resources focused explicitly on retaining LGBTQ+ New
13 Yorkers? And you know describe any effort to support
14 working mothers in the trades or those with families
15 who struggle with affordable, reliable healthcare.
16 And I think it's really just anecdotally from talking
17 to workers, particularly women in construction. It
18 seemed like there were lots of opportunities or
19 things to access in terms of getting a foot in the
20 door but retainment was a real issue.

21 JACQUELINE EBANKS: I think this is where we
22 would like to continue to do more data gathering but
23 we know that we also provide myriad programs. The
24 issue is such as you know, we have Metro Health Plus,
25 which helps folks access healthcare, affordable
healthcare.

4 We have certainly our childcare programs and so,
5 one of the things we need to wrestle with is, are we
6 connecting workers to these resources ready? And so,
7 we continue to look at this and continue to find ways
8 to improve but I want to ask my colleagues at EDC,
9 SBS and workforce if they want to add anything in
10 terms of their specific experiences in this area.

11 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: And in addition to that, if
12 there are things that don't exist but you all feel
13 like hey, these are things that we can't - we could
14 do or should look into trying to do.

15 CLAUDIA FLORES: Thank you for your question
16 Chair Cabán and thank you for having us here today.
17 I'm really excited to talk about these issues,
18 especially barriers that women are facing in the
19 trades.

20 So, at EDC, we really work directly with pre-
21 apprenticeship and direct entity programs. We're
22 piloting a program with both the nontraditional
23 Employment for Women and with PQA to link and provide
24 female jobseekers that are interested in union trades
25 with access to training and then jobs on construction
processes that are really led by the unions and their

1 apprenticeship program. So, we are, as Laura
2 previously mentioned, we want to really work in
3 partnership with the unions and uhm, and in
4 partnership with these direct entity programs to add
5 additional wraparound services that can support
6 retention in the trades.
7

8 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Thank you. I just also want
9 to briefly acknowledge that Council Member Gennaro
10 has joined us. Okay and just a few more questions.
11 What is the city doing specifically to address sexual
12 harassment and gender discrimination in the
13 construction trades?

14 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Thank you so much for that
15 question. I just want to refer to my testimony where
16 we talked about a really uhm, you know the Stop
17 Sexual Harassment Act, which was first passed in 2018
18 and Stop Sexual Harassment in New York City Act.
19 Which was these packages of laws that really focus on
20 training but also on the opportunity for complaint,
21 the protection of workers from retaliation and
22 increasing opportunity, information about how to make
23 the workplace safe. And also, the opportunity for
24 reasonable accommodations.
25

1
2 I think we have been very committed as a city and
3 the Adams Administration continues to do so to
4 recognize the importance of safety. The importance
5 in the workplace. The importance of really being
6 free from discrimination and free from any form of
7 violence within the workplace. So, we continue and
8 as we build out the blueprint, it's important that
9 the workplace be safe, so that people can remain in
10 jobs and build greater economic security in our city.

11 So, I want to point to the base of laws that we
12 have where we are held accountable through the
13 enforcement processes at the Commission and Human
14 Rights as well and that applies across all sectors.
15 And so, with that, I don't know if my colleagues have
16 anything else to add but I have to reiterate that
17 York City is deeply committed to ensuring safety for
18 all its workers, particularly women and LGBTQ
19 individuals. It is clearly unacceptable for an
20 individual to choose between their safety and their
21 economic viability and so, our law center on ensuring
22 that we break that connection and ensure that people
23 not only are safe at the entry level position but
24 safe throughout the workforce and can build careers

1 and economic independence. And I turn to my
2 colleagues for any more they want to add.
3

4 CLAUDIA FLORES: At EDC, we also require all of
5 our staff and our project management to undergo
6 specific training and we have very specific and
7 enforceable process to report anything that happens,
8 not just at EDC but on our work sites as well.

9 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Well, thank you. I'm going
10 to go ahead and turn it over to Speaker Adams to ask
11 some questions.

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you so much Chair Cabán and
13 thank you to all of our colleagues who are doing a
14 great job this morning in hosting us this morning
15 Chair De La Rosa and Farias as well.

16 You know Executive Director Ebanks, it's great to
17 see you this morning and I am really heartened by the
18 fact that you have mentioned the Stop Sexual
19 Harassment and New York City Act. One of the bills
20 I'm very proud to have championed in that package.
21 One of the very first in 2018 that a whole host of
22 women in this Council, only 11 strong then, felt very
23 emphatic about making sure that we gave those bills
24 the light of day. So, I'm very heartened to hear you
25 continue to reference this package of bills, which we

1 carried so proudly back in 2018. So, thank you for
2 that. Thank you for making us aware that this
3 legislation actually does have teeth and it has legs
4 and it matters to the women in the workplace, so
5 thank you very much for that.
6

7 My first question is, and I've been asked, I
8 apologize I have to jump off to give remarks in
9 another event. Does the city actually work with the
10 trades to encourage recruitment of women into
11 apprenticeship programs?

12 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Speaker Adams, if I may, I
13 just wanted to thank you for your leadership in you
14 know passing those bills. We were at a really
15 critical time; I think it was just at the emergence
16 of the Me Too Movement and New York City really
17 stepped up and became a leader in this country with
18 the passage of these bills.

19 I must say, just a personal, a moment of personal
20 privilege here, I am so grateful to be testifying
21 before this City Council with the most women we have
22 ever had and 31 and seeing that we're speaking with
23 three Committee Chairs who are all women, it is most
24 exciting and long time coming and we do look forward
25 to working with you, you know in continuing your

1 progress and ensuring that this progress can be
2 sustained.

3
4 So, regarding your question about working with
5 the unions and retention, I am just going to turn to
6 my colleagues. Maybe Laura from – Laura Gibson from
7 Workforce Development would want to start.

8 LAURA GIBSON: Thank you and thank you for the
9 question Speaker Adams. We did work collaboratively
10 with the BCTC and the pre-apprenticeship training
11 programs to set goals and the new citywide PLA's for
12 Women. We also target union apprenticeships through
13 NEW and work collaboratively with them to make sure
14 women are being given the opportunity to join the
15 trades. I think my colleagues may have more
16 specifics about their experience working with those
17 signature programs. I'm going to pass it over.

18 SPEAKER ADAMS: Can you specifically, can anyone
19 speak specifically to the question of apprenticeship?

20 CLAUDIA FLORES: Yup, I can. So, at EDC we are
21 piloting a new program where we utilize our capital
22 projects as opportunities to create pathways for
23 local women to join construction unions. And we do
24 that really in partnership with the pre-
25 apprenticeship and the direct entry programs, right.

1 So, we work hand and hand with NEW and with
2
3 Pathways to Apprenticeship to really create the
4 signature training programs that link local women job
5 seekers and in one project that we have done that is
6 in Coney Island, in the Coney Island Hospital which
7 is a Sandy recovery project. We received a lot of
8 interest from women in this project and we were able
9 to fund with Council Member Treyger a local training
10 program with P2A.

11 And this project also signed on to new signature
12 programs which is creating not just linking women to
13 the trainings but also, once they have gone through
14 the training and entered a specific union, they are
15 being called back on the site.

16 So, out of uhm, right we have hired about 101
17 women you know ranging in specific trades such as
18 like, electricians operating in the nearest
19 carpenters, painters, plumbers, iron workers, and
20 general labor. I was actually there a couple of
21 weeks ago doing a you know a job site tour and was
22 able to see women very hands on and finishing the
23 project. And just to let you know, we have about 100
24 women on site every day out of 400 local laborers
25 there.

1
2 SPEAKER ADAMS: That's really encouraging. Uhm,
3 so it sounds like the city is actually doing its part
4 in encouraging women to join the trades and providing
5 them with assistance that they need to ensure that
6 they actually stay in the trade?

7 CLAUDIA FLORES: Yeah, uh, I know that the
8 Administration has a very strong commitment to
9 providing wrap around services to women and
10 developing programming. I know we are doing a lot
11 and there is definitely more that we can do in that
12 space. But I know that there's other projects that
13 are coming up, especially the Public Health Lab on
14 projects that will also has specific goals with you
15 to make sure that local women can get access to these
16 jobs.

17 SPEAKER ADAMS: That's great. Does the city
18 actually track how long women stay employed in the
19 trades?

20 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Laura.

21 LAURA GIBSON: Thank you for the question. No,
22 we don't have specific - we don't have that data as
23 the city on how long women are retained in the
24 trades. It's not readily available to us. Good
25 question.

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 51

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: Uhm, you know a few weeks ago I
5 made a speech at the Association for a Better New
6 York at ABNY, calling for additional CTE programs and
7 more partnerships with businesses to expand
8 opportunities for CTE graduates. Are there CTE
9 programs that are tailored for women to enter into
10 the trades upon their graduation?

11 LAURA GIBSON: Not that I – yeah, go ahead,
12 please.

13 JACQUELINE EBANKS: We can certainly get
14 additional data but uhm, prior to joining the city,
15 I'll just share, I sat on the CTE Advisory Board,
16 which is housed within the Department of Education
17 and I know that it's really an extremely robust
18 program and we would really need to follow-up with
19 the Department of Education and the work that
20 continues to be done there. But they certainly do
21 have strong connections to nontraditional work and to
22 construction trades as well. So, we will bring that
23 information back to you.

24 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay, I would appreciate that. I
25 think it's really important for us to know what
26 trades would be included you know in the CTE program.
27 And my last question if there's an answer. If not,

1 then we need a follow-up to this one also. Are there
2 gender disparities in job placements in the trades
3 for CTE program graduates?
4

5 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Speaker Adams, if you would
6 permit us, we will follow-up with that question as
7 well post hearing. Thank you so much for asking.

8 SPEAKER ADAMS: Alright, thank you so much and
9 we'd appreciate that follow up. Thank you once
10 again. I may have more questions. Thank you very
11 much Director, Executive Director, your team and of
12 course my colleagues who are three women strong
13 Chairing this joint hearing this morning. Thank you
14 very much for your testimony.

15 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Thank you. Thank you Speaker
16 Adams and I do have a few more questions and I do
17 have a few more questions but I actually would like
18 to turn it over to Chair Farias and then also give
19 Committee Members an opportunity to ask questions and
20 I'll circle back around. So, I'll hand it over at
21 this point.

22 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you so much Chair
23 Cabán and Speaker Adams. So, the city has invested
24 in several initiatives aimed at addressing gender
25 inequity in the workforce, including addressing pay

1 equity and combating harassment and supplying
2 resources for people and parents in the workplace.
3 However, women currently make up only ten percent of
4 the construction industry.
5

6 I know we've heard of a few examples of this
7 already but what is the city doing specifically to
8 support women and LGBTQ+ New Yorkers in the trades
9 and can we get specific examples of this work? For
10 example, does EDC work with other agencies like SBS
11 or Women. NYC on workforce development initiatives
12 related to women in trades?

13 I heard working with NEW already and different
14 pathways but are there any specific current or
15 ongoing projects that we're seeing in example of this
16 work?

17 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Assistant Vice President
18 Claudia Flores would take that question.

19 CLAUDIA FLORES: Yeah, so, through Hire NYC, we
20 work hand and hand with SBS to really recruit locally
21 and work with you know they have over 300
22 partnerships with local workforce development
23 organizations and we really leverage their expertise
24 in this in that area. So, I would really like Deputy
25 Commissioner Lucinda go over - to go over that.

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 54

4 LUCINDA GLOVER: Thank you for the question. So,
5 through Hire NYC, 48 percent of people who have been
6 hired since the inception of that program are women.

7 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay, uhm, are there any
8 specific agencies outside of the EDC that are
9 specifically working to support doing this work for
10 women or for LGBTQ+ members for any projects that we
11 have going on in the city.

12 LUCINDA GLOVER: Uh HPD is also a part of the
13 Hire NYC program.

14 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay and does the city
15 partner with the state in any of these initiatives
16 and if so, how?

17 LUCINDA GLOVER: Uhm, in terms of workforce, SBS,
18 we're working in close partnership with our state
19 counterparts. A number of our Workforce One Career
20 Centers collocated with the states workforce centers.
21 We work hand and glove with them and talk to them on
22 a weekly basis to coordinate our services.

23 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: And in terms of this
24 coordination with the state, are most of these
25 supports or opportunities, are they most with the
Department of Labor apprenticeship area or are they
public/private partnership projects in the city?

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 55

4 LUCINDA GLOVER: Uhm, I don't feel I am able to
5 speak to the states opportunities right now but if
6 you would like more information, I can get that for
7 you.

8 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Yeah, well, I mean, I'm
9 asking in terms of the opportunities that we're
10 working with for women and LGBTQ+ members, for Black
11 and Brown men. You know, are we specifically relying
12 on like the Department of Labor apprenticeship
13 opportunities that are there? Or are these larger
14 projects that we're working on with the state?

15 LUCINDA GLOVER: So, uhm, the Department of Small
16 Business Services has done Apprentice NYC program,
17 which we recruit through the Workforce One Career
18 Center system and practice at a Workforce One 50
19 percent of our customers who we serve every year,
20 women and we use that system to recruit for our
21 apprenticeship programs, so under Apprentice NYC with
22 there are four programs that we stood up. The CNT
23 apprenticeship program, there's a line cook
24 apprenticeship, nurse residency and tech engineers.
25 So, there are the programs that we use the Workforce
One system to recruit people.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: I do want to talk a little
3 bit about outreach being done to recruit. I'm
4 hearing SBS Apprenticeship NYC and Workforce One
5 Centers. I think most of us on this call can agree
6 Workforce One Centers are not as available to a lot
7 of our community members nor are they doing direct
8 outreach.

9 So, can you detail where the city advertises
10 apprenticeship opportunities and how they are
11 specifically targeting women and LGBTQ members in
12 their outreach efforts? And also, if there's any
13 specific outreach being done for nonbinary and
14 transgender individuals in the city to participate
15 and proactively seek work?

16 CLAUDIA FLORES: Whenever we're recruiting, we
17 market those opportunities through a variety of means
18 including social media, the Link NYC stations, bus
19 shelters. We work closely with our over 300
20 community partners which includes partners who are
21 dedicated to serving women in the LGBTQ+ community.
22 So, we let our network of community partners know
23 when we're recruiting for trainings and specific job
24 opportunities. We also establish a website called
25 Great Discovery NYC in August of 2020 and that

1 provides a lot of fantastic information on what
2 someone can expect in one of our trainings, including
3 our apprenticeships and that information provides an
4 option to sign up to be notified when recruitment or
5 a particular training commences.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay and just specifically
8 on how we're aggregating all of this data and kind of
9 looking at it. Do you know if we are saying, you
10 know, I applied for this job because I saw it on the
11 bus shelter or I got it from my local CBO? And I ask
12 because my district particularly lacks bus shelters,
13 for example and also headquartered CBO's.

14 So, we aren't necessarily, my community members
15 specifically aren't necessarily being targeted for
16 these opportunities. So, are we overlapping that
17 data and kind of saying like, oh, this community
18 lacks outreach. How are we making efforts to get
19 there?

20 CLAUDIA FLORES: Thank you for the question Chair
21 and we really are always looking to enhance our
22 outreach. So, I'd be very happy to work with you to
23 make sure that we're getting into your community. We
24 do ask our customers to let us know how they hear
25 about our services and find a recommendation from a

1 family, a friend, or colleague is one of the most
2 common ways that they hear about us and then a
3 recommendation from a community partner or online
4 searches are the other ways but as I said, we you
5 know really do want people to know about our
6 services. So, I'd be very happy to work with you on
7 further outreach.
8

9 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: That would be great. I'm
10 sure there's a lot of other communities that also
11 don't have those things.

12 CLAUDIA FLORES: Any Council Members on the call.

13 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: And then my last question, I
14 have more specifically on Hire NYC in a little bit
15 but we do have members that have been patiently
16 waiting to ask. The last question I'll end with, in
17 2017, the de Blasio Administration released the New
18 York Works Program, creating Good Jobs Plan.

19 The plan set goal of using direct city action to
20 pour 100,000 new good paying jobs, paying at least
21 \$50,000 annually over the next ten years. Of those
22 new good paying jobs, the plan projected 240,000 new
23 jobs that would be created in the construction
24 industry through the city's investment in
25 construction for commercial, residential,

1 transportation and other infrastructure projects
2 throughout the city. As of 2022, how many of the new
3 jobs were created in the construction industry
4 through the plan?
5

6 CLAUDIA FLORES: I can take that. Uhm and thank
7 you for that question. So, when New York Works was
8 created, New York was at record levels of
9 employment and we were looking to lean into address
10 areas of the economy. But you know when COVID hit,
11 the economy changed in the city and the economic
12 impact of COVID really impeded our ability to
13 continue our work.

14 So, it is still a priority for us to return to
15 the levels of jobs prepandemic and we are still
16 pursuing some individual initiatives of the New York
17 Work Plan such as life sciences and [INAUDIBLE
18 1:12:01]. But this is really being done through the
19 blueprint for New York Economic Recovery Plan that
20 was announced a few weeks ago. So, we are addressing
21 these issues in a way that's more responsive really
22 to the current climate and the current strategy of
23 the Adams Administration.
24
25

1 So, again, we want to return to prepandemic
2
3 levels but we have to do so by building a stronger
4 and more equitable economy for the future.

5 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Yeah, so do we not have
6 numbers on how many jobs we're seeing throughout the
7 state?

8 CLAUDIA FLORES: No we don't at this time, you
9 know we don't and because the last update was in the
10 thick of the pandemic, we've really shifted to track
11 more relevant metrics such as businesses closed and
12 jobs lost. So, we you know obviously the pandemic
13 really -

14 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Sure. Well, still being
15 done during the pandemic, granted it was construction
16 that was necessary. Projects had to apply for
17 credentials to continue on their work. Were none of
18 the projects at EDC was implementing through this
19 necessary work to be done during the pandemic, that
20 we could have created new construction jobs?

21 CLAUDIA FLORES: I'm sorry, can you repeat the
22 question?

23 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: We were still allowed as a
24 city to perform construction throughout the pandemic,
25 especially if it was deemed necessary or you know

1 critical to moving a certain community project
2 forward. Were none of the projects that were done
3 through EDC deemed under that permissions? Under the
4 emergency creation that we had to continue
5 construction work to provide jobs?
6

7 CLAUDIA FLORES: Yeah, yeah, I mean, yeah the
8 city continued to push forward in certain
9 construction jobs during the pandemic and the people
10 that were on site were – you know our goal was to
11 make sure that those people were rehired uhm, on
12 those jobs. And if you want specific data, I mean we
13 can definitely look back and come back and continue
14 the conversation.

15 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Yeah, that'd be great. I'm
16 gonna – I have some data from the past that you all
17 have presented. I'll look it up in the time being
18 people are asking just if I could be a little bit
19 more specific if I can when I come back with my line
20 of questioning. Thank you so much Claudia.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much Chair
22 Farias. I'm now going to open up to Council Members
23 for questions. I will now call on Council Members in
24 the order they have used the Zoom raise hand
25 function. If you would like to ask a question

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 62

4 Council Members and you have not yet used the Zoom
5 raise hand function, please do so now. Council
6 Members, please keep your questions to five minutes,
7 the Sergeant at Arms will keep a timer and will let
8 you know when your time is up. You should begin once
9 I have called on you and the Sergeant has announced
10 that you may begin. First, we'll be hearing from
11 Council Member Dinowitz followed by Council Member
12 Menin and then Council Member Gutiérrez. Council
13 Member Dinowitz, you may begin when the timer starts.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Thanks Bianca. Thank
16 you Chairs Cabán, De La Rosa, and Farias. So, I want
17 to follow-up on Council Member Farias's questions
18 about recruitment. So, it sounds like there is work
19 being done to provide the support and the training
20 and the equity but when I hear recruitment, when I
21 hear bus shelters and online advertisement, it sounds
22 in many cases like it's up to the worker, the person
23 looking for a job to do outreach to utilize the
24 services you provide.

25 And you know a lot of someone's interests in a
profession may come from their experiences and the
experiences of those around them. In other words, if

1 most people in this line of work are men, you may not
2
3 – a woman may not see herself in this line of work.

4 So, I'm interested to know a little more about
5 the recruitment efforts you are doing to ensure that
6 access is equitable and every one can see themselves
7 in the job, specifically what agreements you have
8 with city agencies like the Department of Education
9 where a lot of work can be done going directly into
10 schools and recruiting. What agreements you have
11 with CUNY or what work is being done with Access VR.

12 LUCINDA GLOVER: Thank you. I can take that
13 question.

14 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Thank you Lucinda.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Thank you.

16 LUCINDA GLOVER: Thank you Council Member
17 Dinowitz. Uhm, so in addition to the bus shelters
18 and Link NYC and marketing ads, social media, we
19 really leverage our community partner network of over
20 300 organizations who you know who are in the
21 communities and engaging with community members and
22 we are also getting out into the community using the
23 mobile operating unit which is SBS's unit where we
24 can provide services at any location.

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 64

4 In terms of DOE, we are collocated with District
5 79 at West Farms Center, which makes it easy for
6 young people who are looking for work and also
7 looking to complete high school to navigate both of
8 our services. Uhm, and we you know we do a lot of
9 trainings with CUNY as well. And we are always open
10 to more opportunities to conduct outreach if there is
11 something in particular that you are looking for.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Well, yeah, I mean
13 District 79 is just one you know citywide program.
14 It's sounds like you are on one of the campuses.
15 What I'm asking is if you know schools have career
16 fairs right and we have administration I think and a
17 Chancellor I think who is - I mean, he was career
18 oriented or is putting a little more weight behind
19 that.

20 In other words, students at DOE schools, at our
21 public schools I believe need to know that this is an
22 avenue for them, particularly our women and the
23 proactive outreach I think needs to be done. And I
24 think it's wonderful that you're at the CBO's. In
25 many cases those are people who have already gone out
there and are looking for work but again, I think
that they need to see themselves in these jobs and

1 need the outreach done to them and that's at our
2 right, our public schools where most of our students
3 are and not the, including the District 79 but are
4 you know regular district schools. Including our
5 CUNY's, you mentioned something about CUNY but I'm
6 interested in my 36 second to know more about the
7 CUNY recruitment and I mentioned Access VR, which is
8 our students with disabilities often go into this
9 program go get the vocational training if you're
10 working with them or recruiting from there.
11

12 LUCINDA GLOVER: Thank you. Uhm, so, through our
13 funding restrictions, the Workforce One Career Center
14 system is actually only able to work with people who
15 are 18 and over. So, I think -

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

17 LUCINDA GLOVER: Some of your concerns really fit
18 into the remit of my colleagues at Department of
19 Youth and I'd be happy to share those with you.

20 We work with CUNY, you know various CUNY schools
21 on a number of our training programs in healthcare
22 and tech and you know we can provide you with more
23 information about those programs and Workforce One,
24 Career Center system also leverages access.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Yeah, would love to
3 continue the conversation. Thank you.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member
5 Dinowitz. Next, we'll hear from Council Member Menin
6 followed by Council Member Gutiérrez. Council Member
7 Menin, you may begin when the timer starts.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Thank you so much. I
10 really want to thank the four Chairs for this
11 incredibly important hearing and I want to follow up
12 on something that Council Member Farias mentioned and
13 it's something that I heard from EDC that I
14 personally found shocking. And so, I want to make
15 sure I heard it correctly and ask some follow-up
16 questions.

17 So, I want to talk about when Mayor de Blasio
18 announced in 2017, the jobs plan to create 100,000
19 good paying jobs. I remember this event. I was at
20 that announcement and did I hear EDC correctly in
21 saying that you don't any data on if any new jobs
22 were created?

23 CLAUDIA FLORES: So, as you know, COVID really
24 resulted in significant job losses for New York City
25 and we are still several hundred thousand jobs toward

1 a prepandemic employment level and we are starting to
2 return to those levels.
3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: I just want to interrupt
5 because this is sort of the same answer that you gave
6 to Council Member Farias and I really want to drill
7 down on this because we're all familiar with the job
8 loss unfortunately that New York faces in this COVID
9 reality but this program was announced in 2017. So,
10 you're telling me that there was no jobs created for
11 the rest of 2017, 2018, 2019 and the beginning of
12 2020. And I'm looking at the press release that
13 Mayor de Blasio announced then. It says that the
14 plan reflects \$1.1 billion in currently allocated
15 city spending and a further \$250 million that the
16 administration will apply in its November and January
17 updates. And then further it states the
18 Administration will report on the plans progress
19 annually.

20 So, what has happened the last couple years with
21 this plan?

22 CLAUDIA FLORES: Oh, we made an update in our
23 data publications in 2020 and that's really the last
24 data that we published and we have not done an update
25 since then.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: So, what happened to the
3 \$250 million that the Administration advertised that
4 it was putting in to this?

5 CLAUDIA FLORES: I don't, I'm sorry, I don't have
6 uhm, I mean it was used to really create jobs, I just
7 don't have the data at my disposal right now.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Can I then request to the
9 four Chairs that we immediately follow-up on this.
10 This is \$250 million that the de Blasio
11 Administration said they were allocating to create
12 new jobs. We have no information whatsoever that's
13 being provided today on a single job that was created
14 by this plan.

15 JACQUELINE EBANKS: We'd be happy to do our
16 research and get back to you on the data. I'm sorry
17 that its missing at this missing at this moment but
18 we will bring that information to you and follow-up
19 Council Member.

20 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Yeah, just a quick question
21 Council Member Menin, are you - do you still have a
22 line of questioning, I don't want to interject while
23 you're still doing a line of questioning.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: No, I just find this
25 shocking to be honest. I just cannot believe that

1 there's absolutely zero answers by EDC on this. This
2 plan was touted as creating over 100,000 good paying
3 jobs and there doesn't seem to be a single job that
4 was actually created nor can EDC count for where this
5 money went.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: No, 100 percent, it's
8 actually why I stopped my line of questioning to go
9 get this actual data that you pulled up, so thank you
10 for bringing it up.

11 You know, it is \$1.1 billion, to date over \$250
12 million in it's initial, between 2017 and 2018 that
13 have been already invested into this project that's
14 supposed to be at least giving some protected numbers
15 or data. I do have in front of me the projected
16 number of good jobs that were supposed to be actually
17 created was 35,875, what we received at that point in
18 2019, only 3,725 jobs were actually created and out
19 of those, 3,072, 82 percent of those were defined as
20 actual good paying jobs.

21 And so, I hear the Admin right now in EDC on not
22 having the data in front of them. It was the purpose
23 of my initial hearing with Council Member and Chair
24 Brewer a couple weeks ago and really wanting to be
25 able to go into this and understand why we are at

1 this given point, post pandemic, though this was
2 beginning prepandemic. Still not being able to
3 create or find the data on the jobs that were
4 created. And now, for me, what seems a bit
5 worrisome, is this is now getting looped into the
6 blueprint in a new administration with a new Mayor
7 that has to probably invest more money into this and
8 we still don't know where the investment actually
9 went to and how much was it in terms of benefiting
10 the lives of our New Yorkers in each of our
11 communities.
12

13 What I will say is, you know we are behind on
14 timeline on a lot of these job catalyts that were
15 committed like CUNY Tech, Cyber NYC, Block Chain
16 Center, NYC Tech Talent Pipeline, and Apprentice NYC.
17 Apprentice NYC was supposed to be done by 2020. That
18 seems completed but behind on the jobs, the projected
19 jobs and committed jobs they were supposed to do
20 along with the NYC talent pipeline and Block Chain
21 centers. I have no data for block chain, Cyber NYC
22 and CUNY along with Future Works NYC.

23 So, whatever background we need to do and data
24 finding would be really appreciated because we do
25 want to make sure going forward with the blueprint,

1 that we're putting the investments in the right
2 places and it's actually going to benefit local New
3 Yorkers and young people in our city that require
4 opportunity now and being hit heavily and really need
5 to focus on recovery. With that, I'll turn it back
6 over to my colleagues who have questions as I gather
7 the rest of the questions I have for our folks
8 testifying this morning.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Farias.
11 Council Member Menin, you didn't have any more
12 questions for the Admin? I just wanted to give you
13 an opportunity to finish if you had any before moving
14 on.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: I do, thank you. I did
16 have one more question and that's on workforce
17 development sites. How much money is being spent? I
18 know the Deputy Commissioner talked a little bit
19 about social media advertising but how much money per
20 year is being spent on advertising these workforce
21 development sites? In what languages is the
22 advertisements being disseminated? Could we get a
23 specific overview of that please? Thank you.

24 LUCINDA GLOVER: Thank you Council Member Menin.
25 I'm happy to provide that information to you. I

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 72

1 don't have it in hand but will get you how much we
2 spend on marketing and yes, we do marketing in
3 multiple languages and we'll provide that information
4 to you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Okay, thank you.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member
8 Menin. I will now turn to Council Member Gutiérrez.
9 You may begin when the Sergeant starts the clock.
10 Thank you.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Good afternoon. Thank
13 you to the Chairs of all the Committees for this
14 joint hearing this morning on this super important
15 issue. I just wanted to double down on Council
16 Member Menin's question about language, so if you
17 could share that information with everyone, all the
18 members, after today's hearing, that would be
19 helpful.

20 Uhm, I have two questions. The first one is what
21 kind of support are workers specifically – the women
22 workers, protection workers offered in regards to
23 support for time off? Not just for childcare but for
24 caregivers, a lot of the women are also taking care
25 of parents or an elderly person in the family, so

1 what kind of support and the staff look like? As
2 well as what kind of support is offered for any of
3 the workers facing housing insecurities is the number
4 one issue for the majority of the workers in my
5 district. And so, what accommodations are made?
6 What levels of support are offered to any of the
7 women in the industry that are experiencing issues in
8 housing court or displacement?
9

10 And then, my last question is related to any new
11 moms that are coming back to work for these
12 construction jobs. I, myself, at the Council find
13 that opportunities for pumping is a challenge in my
14 spaces. And so, I'm very curious as to what
15 infrastructures exist for our moms returning to the
16 workforce at construction sites. I know there is a
17 law but often times employers are skirting around to
18 implementing the law. And so, I want to understand
19 what that looks like for women coming back to
20 construction jobs specifically or any trade jobs.
21 What levels of support is offered to them? And where
22 are the shortcomings and what we can be doing to
23 protect them in getting back to work and ensuring
24 that they can do this safely and in a dignified way.
25

1
2 JACQUELINE EBANKS: I just want to underscore
3 that as an administration, I think this was also
4 borne out in the heavy advocacy. The Mayor did
5 support you know childcare and caregiving, especially
6 childcare funds that we got and the support around
7 EITC. We're just deeply invested in not just
8 recruiting and ensuring that women and LGBTQ
9 individuals have access to these nontraditional
10 workspaces but also that they are retraining there.

11 And so, in addition to really advocating for
12 additional resources because we know we don't have
13 enough. We want to make sure that we're in constant
14 communication with the populations that we serve so
15 that we can also create additional plans to enhance
16 what we have.

17 I'm just going to turn to my colleagues to see if
18 they have any specific details and uhm, if you all
19 could just - you know, I don't have a specific order,
20 so please go whomever.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Do you want to tackle
22 the pumping question first? Because that might be a
23 more direct answer.

24 JACQUELINE EBANKS: The pumping question?
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Yeah, what

3 accommodations are provided to any women coming back
4 to work at any dignified spaces to pumping. There is
5 a law but I'm a Council Member and I find myself not
6 finding those spaces adequate and dignified in my
7 spaces. And I'm in a pretty privileged position, so
8 I'd like to know what is the experience for women in
9 trade when coming back to work? What accommodations
10 are made and what is the plan where those spaces
11 exist and ensure that they are provided for them?

12 JACQUELINE EBANKS: I would just, you point out
13 we have the law and the lactation rooms and the
14 requirement that these spaces are set up Council
15 Member. The enforcement of which, I don't have the
16 answer to at this point. And I think that's one key
17 element of this work, so let me go back to my
18 colleagues at CCHR to see how we track enforcement
19 and how we're able to – and the pace at which we're
20 able to get employers to create the environment
21 appropriate to respond to nursing people. I think
22 that's a really key question. So, at this point, I
23 don't have the data and we have to go back to our
24 employers and we'll talk with our colleagues across
25

1
2 the city who especially in CCHR and get some data for
3 you on that and that process.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, I guess no one
5 else has anything. I appreciate it and I'm hoping
6 that at some point some of the partners on the call
7 can also respond to that. It can't be the only
8 question. Thank you.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member
10 Gutiérrez. Next, we'll be hearing from Council
11 Member Stevens followed by Council Member Hanks.
12 Council Member Stevens, you may begin when the
13 Sergeant at Arms starts the timer.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Hi, good afternoon
16 everyone or is it afternoon. It's something.

17 Well, thank you Chairs for putting this hearing
18 on and it's very important and I'm learning a lot.
19 And I wanted to just one, reinforce my power. I'm
20 also uncomfortable about the creation of these new
21 jobs and the lack of response that I think that it's
22 important that we are talking about initiatives in
23 these things, that they are actually being followed
24 through. So, I'm a little bit disappointed to hear
25

1 that there's no real answers around where we are with
2 that.

3
4 But I just had a really quick question because
5 Executive Ebanks had stated about how there needs to
6 be a shift in thinking in society around these jobs
7 and things like that. My question is simply, what is
8 being done around that shift, right? Because it's
9 nice to acknowledge it but what work are we doing to
10 actually help with the knowledge and also to promote
11 to young women and women of color and LGBTQ community
12 because I think one of my issues a lot of time is,
13 people don't know what they don't know. And
14 sometimes these jobs don't even seem attainable or
15 real to them because they are not seeked or a part of
16 it. And so, not necessarily around the recruitment
17 effort, what we're doing to get people inspired to be
18 a part of this workforce and be a part of this work.

19 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Thank you for that question
20 and you know, you're 100 percent right. We really
21 have to go out and engage and one of our strategies
22 has always been to go out into community and I'd say
23 across the Administration and I know that that will
24 continue to be heightened and in the Adams
25 Administration.

1 Uhm, COVID, notwithstanding, which has prevented
2 a lot of in-person gathering. We've tried to
3 leverage the technology and to hold webinars and to
4 engage people but we know the limitations of
5 technology with the digital divide as well.
6

7 So, this is I would think an effort, an area
8 where we have to do more going forward. We have
9 acknowledged the gap. One of the things we did on
10 COVID-19 at CGE was to develop a campaign called Show
11 Up for Gender Equity and it really talked about how
12 do you show up for gender equity in your home,
13 workplaces, at schools, etc.. And we were wrestling
14 with how do we make this work, which we consider
15 pretty wonkish, more accessible to the everyday New
16 Yorker. So that people are communicating about it
17 and knowing how their behaviors can change.

18 I think we just touched the tip of the iceberg on
19 this work and we want to deepen it and I think this
20 hearing is also showing how and what you're really
21 getting at is representation right? How do we show
22 to excluded populations that they have a space and an
23 opportunity to be employed and engaged in spaces that
24 they have been excluded and part of it is finding
25 individuals who now exist and have done great work.

1 So, my short answer is that we have more to do in
2 this area. You're absolutely right that we really
3 need as an administration to take a leading edge here
4 and reach out and connect with community directly. I
5 think many of the efforts we make will then be
6 informed by community and we will continue to improve
7 and really grow. I must say that you only are seeing
8 four of 70 agencies here. So, we aren't able to give
9 the full landscape of how people are connecting and
10 sharing you know various workforce development and
11 workforce engagement efforts across the city. We'll
12 try to spend some time to do more of that and put
13 that together in a really summary report for you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: And just, and just, and
15 just lastly my last question is just around, a lot of
16 - like a lot of entry level jobs where we do these
17 recruitments, that's what it looked that. So, what
18 does it look like for the mobility for people to
19 actually be management positions and positions of
20 leadership? Because that is one of my biggest things
21 where a lot of times we're seeing that, we're getting
22 those jobs or these things or these opportunities but
23 a lot of times it's low level. So, what does it look
24 like for mobility in these jobs and how are you
25

1 recruiting to have upward mobility or even starting
2 at the management level?
3

4 JACQUELINE EBANKS: We agree with you 100 percent
5 Council Member Stevens and this is what we referred
6 to in our testimony, that we really have to do more
7 work and research. That we have to care about the
8 entire pipeline. That we wanted to make sure that
9 somebody who enters can advance and that leadership
10 is at every level. That representation is at every
11 level. And so, that's something else we have to look
12 at the work we do. We want to certainly infuse at
13 the entry level but then, have as you're point out -

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

15 JACQUELINE EBANKS: I think have points of entry
16 at all phase of the pipeline and of the career path.
17 I would just say that's more work to be done. We
18 don't have the answer now and we know that we will
19 put that as a to do moving forward.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Thank you. I just think
21 that is really important and when we're thinking
22 about that, we need to think about all levels and not
23 just entry level positions because often people of
24 color and women and minorities as we know, typically
25

1
2 are given the entry level position but not the
3 management position, so thank you.

4 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Right, thank you.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member
6 Stevens. We'll now hear from Council Member Hanks.
7 You may begin when the timer starts.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Hi, good afternoon. Thank
10 you to all the Chairs that put this really important
11 hearing together. I really want to also thank my
12 colleagues for asking such incredible questions. I
13 had my hand raised and I put it down and raised
14 again, because we were all on the same page on this
15 all sounds really well and good but how is it going
16 to work in real time on the ground? And how are we
17 going to get it done?

18 So, my question revolves around not so much
19 recruitment but how are we going to engage the
20 criminal justice system? We have so many folks that
21 are young women who are involved in the system that
22 also need to be recruited and engaged, so there can
23 be pathways and alternatives to incarceration and how
24 are we interacting with our criminal justice system?
25 And Cure Violence programs who may have young people

1 who would be – young women who would prime for this
2 kind of jobs. And what were doing to also engage
3 that population?
4

5 LUCINDA GLOVER: Thank you. I can respond to
6 that question. Thank you Council Member Hanks. So,
7 at the Department of Small Business Services, through
8 our Workforce One Career Center system, we have a
9 program called Employment Works, which is
10 specifically targeted to people with a justice
11 involvement in their background. So, that's a three
12 day workshop where we work with people to support
13 them in their process of applying for a job and also
14 determining what some good job opportunities might be
15 for them at that point and time and how to handle the
16 conviction question and challenges like that. So,
17 it's a program that's delivered through primarily for
18 our Brooklyn and Bronx Workforce One Career Centers.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: And not all boroughs, like
20 Staten Island?

21 LUCINDA GLOVER: Uhm, we work as one system.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Okay.

23 LUCINDA GLOVER: And those workshops are being
24 delivered virtually at the moment due to COVID, so
25 people from any where across the city are able to

1 access those services virtually. But the staff, we
2 deliver them at the Brooklyn and Bronx centers.
3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Do you also – thank you
5 very much for that. Do you have a plan to work with
6 community courts and the court system that
7 recruitment can be robust in these spaces? I mean, I
8 think that you know many of our young women or women
9 period, uhm, again, which my colleagues have been
10 saying is that how are we going to effectively get
11 the word out and making sure that these interactions
12 are meaningful and we can get them connected and
13 create a true and a real pipeline to these kinds of
14 careers from all levels.

15 So, whether it's junior high school, which is you
16 know, exposing our women to these kinds of career
17 paths but uhm, I think that the pipeline question
18 definitely just needs to be a little bit more uhm, a
19 thought through in all avenues.

20 LUCINDA GLOVER: Hmm, hmm, sure and we can only
21 work very closely with the Department of Probation
22 uhm, in terms of sourcing people.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Great, that would be good.
24 Okay.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 84

4 LUCINDA GLOVER: But we'd be happy to talk to you
5 about additional outreach.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Thank you very much.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much Council
8 Member Hanks. I will give a moment for other Council
9 Members. If you have question for the
10 Administration, please use the Zoom raise hand
11 function. I'm giving a minute. If no other hands
12 are raised, I'm going to turn it back to the Chairs.

13 Okay, seeing as there are no other hands raised,
14 I will turn it back to Chair Cabán and Chair Farias
15 for additional questions of the Administration before
16 we move onto public testimony. Chair Cabán, you may
17 begin.

18 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Thank you so much. Uhm, I
19 want to briefly expand on Council Member Gutiérrez's
20 line of questions. I know that she hit questions on
21 the accessibility to lactation and some of the
22 caregiving needs but an additional question I had is,
23 can you describe the efforts to explicitly support
24 working mothers or parents whose children could not
25 attend daycare or school due to the COVID-19 – due to
the pandemic?

4 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Do my colleagues have any
5 response?

6 Again, I would suggest that we need to do some
7 research on that Chair Cabán. The system is larger
8 than the representation we have here, so I am unable
9 to say whether or not we had it. And so, I want to
10 make sure before giving a response.

11 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Before I continue my
12 questioning, I just want to echo my colleagues
13 disappointment and some of the lack of answers just
14 because we rely on the information provided here to
15 be able to you know introduce new legislation or
16 figure out like where we've got to go harder on
17 oversight or implementing some of these things. So,
18 it is a little bit frustrating and we really, really
19 would appreciate follow-up on a lot of the questions
20 that have been left unanswered.

21 And the last question that refers to sort of uhm,
22 maternity and childbearing is, what is the city doing
23 to address the needs of pregnant people on job sites,
24 including light duty while pregnant assignments?

25 JACQUELINE EBANKS: You know, we have made
provisions by law. We need to better assess how our
employers are implementing those laws but the

1 provisions are there and there is recourse again
2 through our – the Commission on Human Rights for
3 Complaints that doesn't really help a women who is
4 pregnant as time moves on, baby gets delivered. So,
5 we – I know and I really have to apologize for the
6 lack of response but we will look into this issue
7 further and I just want to provide you with a
8 complete response instead of leaving you with the
9 impression that nothing is being done. That's not
10 accurate and so, I want to be able to give you a
11 complete response. So, we will follow-up with this
12 as well.
13

14 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Thank you. We look forward
15 to the follow-up and then my last few questions are
16 just pertaining to grievance processes. How are
17 apprentices informed about their rights to file
18 complaints on the job site and specifically like,
19 including rights as a pregnant person on the job and
20 then also, do you post information about additional
21 outlets for supported resources for complaints like
22 the ability to submit a complaint through CCHR for
23 example?

24 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yeah, I mean, these – I will
25 take a bit and speak to the best of my knowledge of

1 the incredible work done with CCHR but they have
2 community convenings and processes regularly. Some
3 of which I no doubt, I don't doubt were limited
4 because of the COVID pandemic. So, they're always
5 engaging community and communicating to individuals
6 in community in multiple languages about the
7 recourses they have. We have again, incredible
8 protections and then with that, we have the
9 enforcement at CCHR. That again is just one element
10 of the work in order to protect our workers and to
11 increase safety in the workplaces.
12

13 There is indeed I think a heavy reliance on the
14 virtual world, social media, our websites. A lot of
15 information is posted but we have all alluded to the
16 digital divide and how that may not be accessible to
17 all New Yorkers. We're working to increase the
18 availability at this information, both in sort of
19 uhm, what I used to call hard copy, as well as in the
20 virtual space.

21 What we're describing to you is an effort that's
22 underway and is by no means perfect. So, we want to
23 partner with you to improve that and the difficulty,
24 you know we've had a heavy reliance pre-COVID on in-
25 person contact, right. We need to figure out and we

1 welcome your partnership in how do we have this
2 touch, this connectivity to community when a health
3 pandemic declares that we need to be further away
4 from each other. And I think that's a hurdle that we
5 strive to respond to as best we can but we know that
6 you know stress, it's problematic and that's
7 something I'm just saying. We would love partnership
8 with the City Council. I don't want to miss, so I'll
9 state that you know forget our community partners in
10 the nonprofit space and how very often many of them
11 are our eyes and ears in order to promulgate and to
12 provide these resources to New Yorkers.
13

14 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: And I know that there wasn't
15 a response to this before but something I would also
16 like to know in direct connection to this is like the
17 nature or the breath of the language access and
18 accessibility.

19 JACQUELINE EBANKS: It's multi- it's a lot, we'll
20 get you the data. It's of many languages Chair
21 Cabán. I don't want to overstate the number.

22 LUCINDA GLOVER: Can I just jump in in terms of
23 information provided to apprentices. So, for SBS, we
24 provide all of our apprentices with information on
25 their rights under the Equal Employment Opportunity

1 Act. There's guidance on grievance procedures under
2 the Workforce Innovation Opportunity Act, which is
3 the funding we received for our programs and we also
4 provide them with information on how to request
5 reasonable accommodations. And we also have career
6 or success coaches that help trainees navigate issues
7 that they have during the program.
8

9 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Thank you. Uhm, I'd like to
10 move into a specific question about sexual
11 harassment. It's on job sites. It's a leading
12 reason why women leave the construction industry.
13 Could you provide specific information on the
14 antiharassment training that workers receive during
15 their apprenticeship training? And can you describe
16 the process of handling gender-based harassment
17 complaints on the worksite? What are the
18 consequences for substantiated complaints? Can you
19 provide some examples of a conflict resolution? An
20 individual, their union, and a contractor might reach
21 in response to a harassment complaint. Yeah, some of
22 those pieces.

23 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Okay, I will say that new
24 workers need to be informed of their rights and go
25 through the sexual harassment prevention training

1 within 90-days of coming onboard and I just visited
2 the CCHR website this morning to get some details.
3 There is also - that website information about the
4 complaint process which includes of course reporting
5 to supervisors but also moving through the chain. And
6 then, all the way to the city through CCHR.
7

8 It is certainly much more detailed than that and
9 I would - I just don't want to misspeak, so again,
10 I'm going to ask that you allow me to follow-up with
11 a response, a more complete response. I don't know
12 if my colleagues have anything to add to that.

13 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Yeah, I would just make the
14 formal request for just a specific example of what
15 the conflict resolution process looks like. I'll
16 move into just my last area. My colleague that I
17 overlap at state levels, Senator Jessica Ramos has
18 spearheaded legislation that would ban employers from
19 using E-Verify systems. So, I want to know how
20 prevalent the use of E-Verify is and how common it is
21 for contractors to weaponize immigration status on
22 job sites.

23 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Any of SBSS, EDC Workforce?

24 LAURA GIBSON: Yup, I am familiar with E-Verify
25 and the issue and don't have that data immediately

1 but I think it's very important and would be happy to
2 look into it and get back to you with what we can
3 gather.
4

5 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Okay, again, right, like we
6 know very well especially in my community here in
7 Western Queens and I know that it's true in lots of
8 the Chairs communities, lots of our members
9 communities that you know our immigrant neighbors
10 make up a significant portion of the construction
11 workforce and also some of the most exploited and
12 most vulnerable.

13 So, I think that this is particularly important
14 information for us to have. Especially when we see
15 that our immigrant neighbors actually are
16 experiencing construction site deaths at the highest
17 rates around the city and that's certainly connected
18 to this I believe and how immigration status is
19 weaponized and unsafe environments can sometimes take
20 place because of that. So, would love a follow-up on
21 that. And that's - those are all the questions I
22 have so, happy to hand it over to our other Chair.

23 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you so much and thank
24 you Chair Cabán for asking that really important
25 question. I just want to dive into some workforce

1 development questions and then a couple of the Hire
2 NYC questions I have. So, the Mayor's Office of
3 Economic Opportunity launched a citywide data
4 platform in 2017 to analyze workforce program
5 services and outcome data from various city agencies
6 including some that we have here but not exclusive to
7 DPR, DYCD, HRA, SBS, NYCHA.
8

9 According to that portal, over 55,000 people out
10 of over 450,000 have participated in a workforce
11 development program since 2017 at more than one of
12 these city agencies. Do we consider that a good
13 number? And does this mean that work is being
14 duplicated in at 55,000 cases?

15 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Laura?

16 LAURA GIBSON: Well, I think - thank you for the
17 question. Uhm, whether or not it's something we
18 think is good, I think is a larger conversation that
19 we should have and include our colleagues at
20 opportunity and be collaborative on how we approach
21 that. So, I'd be welcomed to having that
22 conversation. Unfortunately I wasn't prepared to
23 look at those numbers or talk about it but I'd really
24 like to do that with you and everyone here.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you. And so, the
3 Office of Workforce Development and Economic
4 Opportunity launched the jobs portal working.nyc.gov,
5 which serves as a hub for employment related
6 resources offered by the city and its partners. Do
7 we know any feedback from the public? How it's been
8 received? And can you list if possible any city
9 agencies that participate and offer services through
10 the site?

11 LAURA GIBSON: Well, yes, I can. I actually
12 manage that website, so thanks for asking about it.
13 It's new and I'm thrilled to hear that people know
14 about it and are using it. We do that in partnership
15 with NYCO and they are the tech experts and then my
16 office provides the content. So, the goal is to
17 advertise all of the city sponsored or adjacent
18 workforce development programming and also, feature
19 jobs with large scale hiring. And we understand that
20 the system is siloed and so that's the whole point is
21 to try and get as much as possible onto that website.

22 So, it is still new, we haven't put out a report
23 yet but thank you for asking and we should. We do a
24 lot of consumer testing and heuristic testing. So,
25

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 94

1 we do have information on it but no one's asked for
2 it yet. So, we can definitely get back to you on it.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Yeah, I'd love that.

5 LAURA GIBSON: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Let's get it. That would be
7 great. And so, I guess, let me know if you can
8 answer this off the top of your head or not. I'm
9 glad that you are actually the person that's working
10 on it. Do we know how the data from the site is
11 tracked to see when job seekers connect to
12 appropriate agencies? And do we have any metrics?
13 I'm assuming that's a no because we haven't had a
14 report yet indicating the success rate of applicants
15 who apply to the site.

16 LAURA GIBSON: That's like an excellent question
17 and a wish list item. We're not able to collect data
18 on the individual people that are going to the site,
19 so we don't know how many people are getting
20 referrals and it's definitely an item we want to
21 pursue. So right now we don't know but we do have
22 information on how many people are coming, how long
23 they're staying on the site, where they're clicking
24 and what they are doing. I can give you some info on
25 that.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay, great, thank you. I
3 just want to switch it over to look at the structure
4 of workforce development system if possible. The
5 Invest in Scales NYC Coalition, there are at least 75
6 different workforce development programs in the city
7 run by 21 different agencies. I asked this
8 previously at my other hearing to SBS and EDC who are
9 present but we didn't have the opportunity to hear
10 from Workforce Development.

11 And so, just wanted to run through a couple of
12 them if they can be answered. Who is ultimately
13 responsible for overseeing the strategic direction of
14 all of these programs? And are there any steps that
15 the Admin is taking to ensure that different agencies
16 communicate and collaborate on workforce development
17 issues?

18 LAURA GIBSON: Uhm, thank you for the question, I
19 think I understand what you're asking and that it is
20 my office. I think we should, like that's something
21 I need to get back to you on. We have a new Director
22 who was just appointed and it's just early stages, so
23 I don't feel confident in my answer now, but thank
24 you for asking and we will get something clearer.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: For sure. Thank you and
3 then, uhm, if possible if anyone can answer, what
4 steps is the Administration taking to ensure that the
5 training programs available through the workforce
6 development system respond to the shifting needs in
7 our current labor market?

8 LUCINDA GLOVER: I can respond to that. So, uhm,
9 for the Department of Small Business Services, we
10 have an industry partnership model where we have the
11 tech talent pipeline. The food industry, the
12 manufacturing and industrial industry and the
13 healthcare industry partnerships.

14 So, they all engage with industry to understand
15 what the hiring needs are and what their critical
16 skill gaps are and the school gaps then inform the
17 trainings that SBS manages to directly address those
18 skill gaps.

19 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay great. I'd like to ask
20 some questions on citywide spending that have come to
21 mind post our EDC question. Do we have the numbers
22 on how much the city is currently spending on
23 workforce development programs? No, okay. I will
24 quit these questions. I won't ask the rest of them
25 because if we don't have the topline one, there's no

1 point in asking the smaller ones. So, I'll send them
2 over so we can get some answers. And then, just
3 wanted to know you know in the blueprint, the
4 administration plans to expand stipends for low
5 income New Yorkers participating in certain workforce
6 development programs. Stipends like metro cards,
7 childcare, housing or you know food, anything like
8 that not only will impact and benefit women in
9 construction and in these fields but also LGBTQ
10 members, youth, etc.
11

12 Do we know any of the eligibility criteria for
13 these stipends on the existing programs? How large
14 they are? What they cover? And if there's any plan
15 for expansion.

16 LUCINDA GLOVER: Thank you for the question
17 Chair. We're very excited about the expansion of the
18 stipend program and agree that you know it will
19 really support people when they haven't been able to
20 participate before the program.

21 Uhm, the requirements for trainings that someone
22 is either low income or no income and those
23 requirements set out on our career discovery website,
24 where people are able to learn about trainings and
25

1 so, those requirements will apply to accessing the
2 stipends as well.
3

4 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay, great thank you. Now,
5 some Hire NYC questions and then I'll be done on my
6 end.

7 The Hire NYC Development Program was designed to
8 connect the city's low-income residents to new job
9 opportunities generated by NYC, EDC and HPD.

10 However, there is little to no information publicly
11 available to assess the outcome of the program. Can
12 we get the current status of this program and does
13 the Administration have updated information to share
14 with the Committees about the outcomes of Hire NYC?

15 LUCINDA GLOVER: Uhm, thank you for the question
16 Chair. I can respond to that. The program is
17 active, so uhm, businesses that are contracting with
18 the city are required to register their hiring
19 opportunities and then the Workforce One Career
20 System will look for a candidates who are a good fit
21 for those opportunities and work for them.

22 Overall, in terms of all of the Hire NYC
23 opportunities, both the development opportunities and
24 permanent opportunities uhm, 48 percent of those
25 hires have been women and uhm, I can get you

1 information on the wages, if that's helpful as well
2 and if there's a breakdown of the Hire NYC data, I'm
3 happy to provide that too.
4

5 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you. That would be
6 great. Claudia, I saw that your hand was raised, did
7 you have something? No, okay, just wanted to make
8 sure. Uhm, since the programs inception, how many
9 construction projects have been included in the Hire
10 NYC development program?

11 LUCINDA GLOVER: That's a data point I wanted to
12 get back to you on but thank you for the question.
13 We'll have to get back to you.

14 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: No problem. Advocates have
15 raised concerns that Hire NYC Development Program is
16 not appropriate for the construction industry. Since
17 the program is limited to advertising individual jobs
18 without building a pipeline between employers and a
19 trained workforce. In what ways can the Hire NYC
20 Development program be improved to better connect
21 low-income New Yorkers with good paying construction
22 jobs?

23 LAURA GIBSON: I can take that, thank you. So,
24 some background, Hire NYC is a suite of initiatives
25 that was designed to create jobs for New Yorkers from

1
2 the Workforce One system and help businesses access
3 qualified talent. Due to legal limitations, this
4 policy lacks teeth needed to make it a hiring
5 requirement, an actual requirement.

6 So, the city is working to establish a pathway
7 for equitable community hiring by pursuing the
8 passage of state legislation that was to facilitate
9 hiring requirements that are focused on connecting
10 New Yorkers from low-income neighborhoods to those
11 job openings. And it would leverage the city's
12 purchasing power to create jobs for those communities
13 that are historically marginalized.

14 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Great, do we know if a state
15 legislation has already been put in?

16 LAURA GIBSON: Not yet.

17 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay, let's work on it
18 together. I'm happy to work together, let's do that.

19 LAURA GIBSON: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Yeah, of course. By any
21 chance do we – does NYC, EDC collect data demographic
22 information on the individual job seekers who are
23 participate in Hire NYC?

24 CLAUDIA FLORES: So, we work you know SBS leads
25 and manages the Hire NYC development program. They

1 do provide us with zip codes and some specific
2 demographics and we do collect it. But really, it's
3 really SBS has all that data.
4

5 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: And do we know if we collect
6 any information about the length of employment? Or
7 the wages paid to individuals at least in these
8 construction jobs?

9 LUCINDA GLOVER: We uhm, we don't have consistent
10 reporting on the length of the employment. Sometimes
11 that data's provided, sometimes not and sometimes
12 it's wrong, so we don't have good data but we do on
13 wages.

14 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you for that. How
15 does the EDC monitor compliance with the Hire NYC
16 Development program? Are there any penalties
17 enclosed for noncompliance?

18 CLAUDIA FLORES: So, we put the programmatic
19 requirements on our agreements with developers and
20 they in turn push that language down to their
21 subcontractors. But it's really, the way that the
22 language reads is that we put it in there, SBS is the
23 one that really manages that enforcement mechanism.
24 So, Lucinda, I mean, there's obviously liquidated
25

1 advantages on that and there's penalties but SBS can
2 go into detail.
3

4 LUCINDA GLOVER: So, individual agencies require
5 to make sure that their contracts compliance.
6 Complaint meaning that the contract has enrolled in
7 the Hire NYC portal and attested to any hiring needs
8 within 30-days of the contract registration. And
9 that all of the entry and mid-level job opportunities
10 are shared in the portal.

11 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay, great, thank you.
12 While Hire NYC Development Program does not require
13 an employer to hire the specific candidates the city
14 has referred, it does require that employers provide
15 an explanation as to why it did not hire the
16 candidates referred by the city. Can NYC, EDC report
17 on any trends it has observed based on the employer
18 explanations provided? Or any of that data
19 surrounding it?

20 LUCINDA GLOVER: Okay, I can - SBS is the data
21 holder. Uhm, and we can report back to you to see
22 what the feedback is. I would anticipate, I mean, we
23 ensure that everyone that we referred is qualified
24 but I anticipate that the feedback would be that the
25 person didn't meet all of the employers requirements.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: That's great, thank you so
3 much for answering all of my questions and I'm really
4 glad to hear that SBS is the data holder because we
5 have a lot of data and hopefully get it pretty
6 quickly.

7 With that, I will yield the rest of my time. I
8 do see we have another colleague that has questions
9 and I know everyone is patiently waiting to testify.
10 So, thank you everyone.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair. I'm going
12 to now turn it over to Council Member Menin for
13 additional questions of the Administration. After
14 Council Member Menin asks her questions, we will move
15 on to public testimony. Council Member Menin, you
16 may begin.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Thanks. I have a question
18 for EDC. In 2018, you all launched a program, Women
19 NYC. What's happening with that and how much money
20 has been spent overall on that program and what have
21 been the results and impacts?

22 CLAUDIA FLORES: So, Women NYC, I don't have the
23 exact budget numbers here today but I'm happy to get
24 more information from the actual project manager that
25 manages this program. It's not under my purview.

1 But I, you know, we have Women NYC is targeted
2 towards women and we have a number of programming,
3 including New Ventures 50 plus, which really empowers
4 women at all stages of their career to build strong
5 communities. And then we also have the New York City
6 Women's fund which provides grants up to \$50,000.
7 And we have provided about five and a half million
8 funds to help female identify and create and complete
9 projects in the sale and television, digital
10 entertainment theatre and music industries.
11

12 In 2018 and 2019, there was a total of about 3.5
13 million awarded alone. Additional funds that are
14 still available and there's going to be an
15 announcement very soon on that.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: I'm just having a little
17 trouble hearing you. I think the connection might
18 have uhm, had some interference. What would be
19 incredibly helpful is to understand how much since
20 2018 has EDC spent on salary? On advertising? On
21 marketing? On women NYC? You know I'm on the
22 website right now. I remember the launch and you
23 know it has very ambitious goals saying that it's
24 going to create all these different programs. Has it
25 created programs? Has it created jobs? What's the

1 impact then? If you could send that over, that would
2 be very helpful.
3

4 CLAUDIA FLORES: Definitely. I don't run Women
5 NYC, so I unfortunately can't talk to those specific
6 numbers but I will get back to you on that.

7 JACQUELINE EBANKS: It has created several
8 programs. One, in which I think you made it - they
9 had a partnership with AAUW around negotiating and
10 salary negotiations, which was really extremely
11 popular for a while. Again, pre-pandemic, just
12 really a robust programming and then the women that
13 the 50 plus grouping and the funding for a myriad of
14 you know entrepreneurial adventures as well. So, it
15 has been a very active program and fairly thinly
16 staffed unfortunately. So, we'll get that
17 information for you.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair Menin, are you done
19 concluding asking questions to the Admin. Awesome,
20 thank you.

21 Uhm, okay, thank you everyone. We've concluded
22 Administration testimony and will now turn to public
23 testimony. I'd like to remind everyone that we will
24 be calling in individuals one by one to testify.
25 Each panelist will be given four minutes to speak.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

106

1 After I call your name panelists, a member of our
2 staff will unmute you. Again, there may be a few
3 seconds of delay before you are unmuted and we thank
4 you in advance for your patience. Please wait a
5 brief moment for the Sergeant at Arms to announce
6 that you may begin before starting your testimony.
7 Council Members who have questions for a particular
8 panelist should use the use the raise hand function
9 in Zoom, I will call on you after the panel has
10 completed their testimony in the order in which
11 you've raised your hand.
12

13 I would like to now welcome Kathleen Culhane.
14 After Kathleen we'll be hearing from Kate Krug.
15 After Kate, we'll be hearing from Sinade Wadsworth
16 and last, we'll be hearing from Lowely Cheung.
17 Kathleen, you may begin when the timer starts.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

19 KATHLEEN CULHANE: Hi everyone. Kathleen Culhane
20 here. Good afternoon. I'm President of NEW,
21 Nontraditional Employment for Women. I'm happy to be
22 here with you this morning. This afternoon, it is
23 now.

24 So, first want to say thank you to Speaker
25 Adrienne Adams, Deputy Speaker Diana Ayala, Chair

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 107

4 Tiffany Cabán, Chair Amanda Farias. Chair Carmen De
5 La Rosa, and the Council Members of the Committee on
6 Women and Gender Equity, Economic Development, Civil
7 Service and Labor and the Staff who put this hearing
8 together.

9 I also thank Council Members Moya, Cabán,
10 Stevens, and Farias for sponsoring Intro. 0179,
11 legislation to create a task force to better
12 understand the role of women in nontraditional spaces
13 and how we can support them. As we celebrate the
14 Council's first women-majority, as we've spoken about
15 this morning, NEW is committed to working with our
16 legislators to identify opportunities through
17 programs and policy to bring gender equity to our
18 workforce.

19 When it comes to addressing gender inequality in
20 the labor market, unions make the biggest impact.
21 Union representation brings wage setting into the
22 open space and helps ensure that employers set wages
23 based on objective criteria, such as skill, efforts,
24 and responsibility. New York City building and
25 construction trade unions are dedicated to fair
schedules, fair wages, access to healthcare and
childcare, and paid leave for all working families

1 and women. These careers offer financial security,
2 with starting wages of \$19 per hour leading towards a
3 pathway to middle class wages and benefits through
4 their unions, opening doors to stability and
5 resources for women and their families.
6

7 The Bureau of Labor Statistics finds that
8 unionized women make on average 23 percent more than
9 women without a union. As we've also talked about
10 this morning, the pandemic laid bare the
11 disproportionately burdens placed on women and the
12 lack of resources dedicated to their needs. The
13 workforce ecosystem in New York City needs stronger
14 economic support to help New Yorkers facing
15 employment barriers and those with impeded access to
16 economic opportunities, particularly New Yorkers from
17 communities that have been historically marginalized
18 and disincentivized, like the low-income Black and
19 Brown women and women facing childcare concerns that
20 women supports and serves.

21 This has been paralleled by an increased need and
22 demand for workforce services from both New Yorkers
23 and employers, and also small businesses. NEW is
24 leveraging its 44 years of vital work preparing low-
25 income women for high-paying careers in the skilled

1 trades and providing wrap around services such as
2 increasing access to childcare through our
3 partnership with NABTU, the North America Building
4 Trades Union as one of two pilot cities in the Nation
5 to address nontraditional childcare needs and to
6 enhance access to construction education and careers.
7

8 As many of you know, NEW's programming transforms
9 the lives of women in underserved communities and
10 individuals with under represented backgrounds across
11 New York City who are providing pathways to careers
12 in the building and construction trades and through
13 our programs, we offer students no cost,
14 comprehensive training in both hard and soft skills
15 needed to thrive in the trades group. More than 82
16 percent of the individuals accessing new services
17 identify as a minority and additionally 80 percent
18 come from low income backgrounds that are under
19 employed, working minimum wage jobs. And 75 percent
20 receive some [INAUDIBLE 2:18:31]. Construction
21 trades careers increase the lifetime earning
22 potential for a woman with a high school equivalency
23 by 166 percent compared to other minimum wage jobs.
24
25

Gender equity is a critical, social, and economic issue and unions can help eliminate gender inequalities in the labor market.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You may finish Kathleen if you want.

KATHLEEN CULHANE: Okay, I will be quick. We ask the Administration today to increase awards for union contracts in New York City and thereby increasing the number of employment opportunities for tradeswomen.

NEW is eager to provide support for the Local Law proposed today in relation to creating a task force to examine the role of nontraditional workplaces, an area that we have decades of expertise to share. And I'm grateful for the time spent with you all today and look forward to working with you all to support future tradeswomen in our great city. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much Kathleen. We'll next be hearing from Kate Krug. Kate, you may begin when the Sergeant starts the timer. Thank you.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

KATE KRUG: Good afternoon everyone. My name is Kate Krug, I am the Executive Vice President of Nontraditional Employment for Women or NEW. Thank

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 111

1 you to Speaker Adrienne Adams, Deputy Speaker Diana
2 Ayala, Chairs Tiffany Cabán, Amanda Farias and Carmen
3 De La Rosa, and the Council Members of the Committee
4 on Women and Gender Equity, Economic Development, and
5 Civil Service and Labor and the Staff who put this
6 hearing together.
7

8 Women, particularly Black and Brown women, are
9 most impacted by economic crises. As you know, women
10 accounted for up to 54 percent of coronavirus-related
11 job losses. In some months of 2020, Black and Brown
12 women accounted for all net job losses. NEW offers a
13 holistic, career-oriented solution. NEW prepares,
14 trains, and places low-income women in careers in the
15 skilled construction, utility, and maintenance
16 trades, helping women achieve economic independence
17 and a secure future for themselves and their
18 families. At the same time, NEW provides a pipeline
19 of qualified workers to the unionized industries of
20 New York City.

21 Union representation brings wage setting into the
22 open and helps ensure that employers set wages based
23 on objective criteria, such as skill, effort, and
24 responsibility. Unionized women make on average 23
25 percent more than a women without a union. They are

1 also far more likely to have paid leave and stronger
2 protections against discrimination and sexual
3 harassment in the work place. These careers offer
4 financial security with starting wages of \$19 per
5 hour leading towards a pathway to middle class wages
6 and benefits through their union.
7

8 To enter a lucrative and sustainable field like
9 construction, women must have access to resources
10 that address specific needs in the industry. Since
11 1978, NEW has been a groundbreaking model that works
12 for women and for New York City. Through our
13 programs we offer students no-cost, comprehensive
14 training in both the hard and soft skills needed to
15 thrive in a trade career including advanced training
16 programs, an expanded employer base, wrap around
17 social services including our nontraditional
18 childcare pilot program in partnership with the North
19 American Building Trade Unions, and a growing number
20 of opportunities available to women through those
21 employers.

22 We envision a future where women are equally
23 provided with the skills and opportunities needed to
24 succeed in construction trades career. NEW believes
25 that equitable economic opportunities for tradeswomen

1 means increasing union construction projects in New
2 York City as well as creating stability and
3 efficiency of long-term construction by advocating
4 for diversity goals on projects. More than 82
5 percent of individuals accessing NEW's services
6 identify as a minority, additionally 80 percent come
7 from low-income backgrounds and are underemployed
8 working minimum wage jobs, with 75 percent receiving
9 some form of public assistance such as SNAP or TANF.
10

11 Gender equity is a critical societal and economic
12 issue and unions can help eliminate gender
13 inequalities in the labor market. We ask the
14 administration today to increase awards for union
15 contracts in New York City and thereby increasing the
16 number of employment opportunities for tradeswomen.
17 NEW is also eager is to provide support for the Local
18 Law proposed today in relation to creating a task
19 force to examine the role of women in nontraditional
20 workplaces, an area which Kathleen mentioned, we have
21 decades of expertise to share.

22 I'm grateful for the time today and spent with
23 all of you and look forward to working with you all
24 in the future to support the tradeswomen of New York
25 City. Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 114

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Kate. We'll now be
5 hearing from Sinade Wadsworth. Sinade, you may begin
6 when the Sergeant starts the timer.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

8 SINADE WADSWORTH: I am Sinade Wadsworth, I am a
9 graduate of NEW

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sinade, I think we're having
11 some technical difficulties. If you want to resume
12 and start again or we can circle back to you if you
13 are having tech issues. I see you present and yeah
14 it looks good if you want to start again.

15 SINADE WADSWORTH: Okay, good morning
16 representatives. My name is Sinade Wadsworth, I -
17 uhm, can you hear me? I don't know what's going on
18 here.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You're good.

20 SINADE WADSWORTH: Okay, sorry, okay. Eleven
21 years ago, I went to NEW or I'm a graduate of NEW.
22 Prior to that, I was on public assistance. I lived
23 in NYCHA and I was raised by my grandmother and seven
24 grandkids, right. And I say this to say that after
25 graduating Nontraditional Employment for Women, I
went through my apprenticeship program, became a
journeywoman and now I am the youngest and the first

1 female — first African American female council
2 representative for the New York City District Council
3 of Carpenters, thanks to my EST Joe Beggar. I will
4 say that if it wasn't for mentorship right, if it
5 wasn't for the opportunity. If it wasn't for the
6 union, I wouldn't be able to have moved up so fast
7 and I wouldn't be able to help people and open doors
8 for people behind me.
9

10 Right and so, that's in '22. We're still facing
11 the same issues, right. People are still struggling.
12 People are still working two and three jobs just to
13 make ends meet and that's unacceptable.
14 Unfortunately as an organizer, I see the challenges
15 every day that workers face, workers that look like
16 me. Workers that don't have representation. Workers
17 that don't have healthcare. Workers that are killed
18 on job sites and die on job sites and the next day is
19 back to business as normal right? That's not okay
20 and I thank you for all the things that you guys are
21 doing. I heard a lot of the dialogue going back and
22 forth when it comes to the city agencies, HPD, Hire
23 NYC, all these programs right.

24 NEW needs help because NEW is a solution to a
25 much larger problem. We don't have the market share,

1 right. So, if we don't have that market share, if we
2 don't have the opportunities, we're not in these
3 buildings, how can NEW keep helping people if they
4 don't have the opportunity, if they're not at the
5 table?
6

7 So, I commend everyone that is here today. Thank
8 you. Thank you for all the advocacy. Thank you for
9 everything that you are doing. Thank you for asking
10 the hard questions because again, NEW can't do it by
11 themselves right. They have to have access. They
12 have to have the doors open and just like NEW saved
13 me, I'm able to save other people.

14 Thank you so much. Thank you for the opportunity
15 and enjoy the rest of this wonderful day. Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much Sinade. We
17 will now be hearing from Lowely Cheung. Lowely, you
18 may begin when the timer starts.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time start now.

20 LOWELY CHEUNG: Good afternoon everyone my name
21 is Lowely Cheung, IBEW Local 3 Journey woman and
22 Nontraditional Employment for Women NEW graduate.
23 Thank you to the Speaker Adrienne Adams, Chair De La
24 Rosa, Chair Cabán and the Council Members of the
25

1
2 Committee on Women and Gender Equity, and the Staff
3 who put this hearing together.

4 40 years ago, I came to this country hoping to
5 find the American dream of upward mobility. I
6 followed the script and invested my time and energy
7 in higher education. My first degree was in Toy
8 Design, and I was working as a model maker for toy
9 companies. However, my job got outsourced to China.

10 At that time, I got paid \$15 an hour; in China,
11 the labor, doing the same job, got \$15 a day. So,
12 there was no competition and no future in that
13 career. So, I went back to college again and got
14 another degree, this time in Computer graphics. But
15 I could only find freelance jobs without health
16 insurance nor benefits.

17 During the Great Recession of 2008, there was
18 still no job. The recession dragged on for years.
19 So, in 2011, I was 46 years old with only a few
20 thousand dollars in my bank account. So, I can't
21 afford to go on vacation. I can't afford to buy a
22 house; I can't even afford to get sick. But also in
23 2011, I passed NEW buildings and I saw a group of
24 women carrying construction materials around. I
25

1 never knew that a woman could be a construction
2 worker. I signed up with NEW.
3

4 In 2022, I started my apprenticeship program with
5 Local Union #3 and learned to become an electrician.
6 Five and a half years later, at age 52, I became a
7 journeywoman. Thanks to my union, I now have
8 pensions, 401-K, health benefits and a bank account
9 with a year of emergency fund. I enjoy a middle-
10 class life, and my family benefits from a good union
11 wage too. I can support my two nieces to go to
12 college. One is studying in Buffalo University and
13 another is in Stony Brook University.

14 Thanks to NEW, doors are open to women in
15 different trade unions. Men and women in the union
16 get the same pay. Also, only in a union, a person
17 like me, an older minority woman can still have the
18 chance to learn a trade and live the American dream.
19 We women from NEW are willing to work hard to better
20 our lives. So, please provide jobs to unions, so we
21 tradeswomen can work.

22 I'm grateful for your time and I appreciate all
23 you try to do better for the women in the
24 construction trade. The problem of women
25 construction, the difficulty that they face has been

1
2 going on for a long, long time. So, I hope all your
3 hard work will pay off and make our life better in
4 the construction. However, providing jobs to unions
5 is the same as providing jobs to trade women.

6 So, thank you very much for listening to me. I
7 appreciate that.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Lowely. I will now
9 turn it over to Chair De La Rosa and Chair Cabán for
10 questions from this panel and then we will open it up
11 to Council Members if you have any questions for this
12 panel. Chair Cabán, I mean, Chair De La Rosa, sorry.

13 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you Bianca. So, I
14 had a question I wanted to ask. Can you outline the
15 process by which NEW graduates are recruited and
16 placed in unionized apprenticeship programs.
17 Specifically what percentage of NEW graduates are
18 immediately placed in a unionized apprenticeship
19 program upon graduation?

20 KATHLEEN CULHANE: Yes, thank you. I hope you
21 feel better soon.

22 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yeah, I hope it's going.

23 KATHLEEN CULHANE: I hear it. Yeah, so
24 recruitment is uhm, many ways. We do have the
25 similar to we heard today in terms that we have a

1 number of folks that come through our doors that have
2 heard from family members and friends that have gone
3 through our program. So, word of mouth continues to
4 be strong but we do put what resources we can into
5 recruiting working with Council Members and others to
6 go out into the community. We are looking to – we’ve
7 obtained some funding to hire a full time recruiter.
8 And we also work with community based organizations.
9 We host them for breakfast, virtual or otherwise to
10 work with community partners to refer folks to our
11 organization.
12

13 One of things that you know I’d have to mention
14 here that we find is that we find is that you know
15 I’d have to mention here that we find is that lack of
16 bridge programs in the city, we are a bridge program
17 to the apprenticeship, the unionized apprenticeship
18 programs but we often find that the seventh grade
19 math and reading level we look for someone to come
20 into our program, so that they can be ready to be
21 employed upon graduation.

22 Uhm, we often find that they are not able to meet
23 that requirement the first time around and need some
24 intensive training that we provide to then meet that
25 seventh grade math or reading level. And so,

1
2 partnering with those other bridge programs in the
3 city that there are not enough of and having the
4 resources to do that is on NEW's long wish list.

5 So, recruitment comes in many sources we have.
6 You know we talked a bunch today that uhm, that made
7 me think about you know we have in the past partnered
8 with the city for subway and bus ads. We've had some
9 uhm, small funding to do Link NYC ads in the past and
10 when we have those, it proved successful.

11 Jumping Council Member to placement, we typically
12 train and you know we're kind of back up to those -
13 getting back up to those prepandemic numbers. We
14 quickly went you know to a virtual then hybrid
15 environment. And so, we continue to train virtually
16 and then in our shop towards the end of our typically
17 you know two month program. Our last Fiscal Year,
18 this started this current Fiscal Year, this started
19 July 1, we've enrolled 196 students so far in our
20 core training programs that are day and evening.
21 We've placed 135 folks graduates that identify as
22 women into placement opportunities. 91 of them are
23 apprenticeships, some of them are other job
24 opportunities that they continue to work with us -
25 all of our graduates continue to work with us even if

1 they're in an interim position which is usually
2 career related. Ideally they are working in a stock
3 room, keeping up their physical skills or working on
4 a construction site, you know keeping in our
5 business. And then once there placed in
6 apprenticeships, their NEW for life, so we continue
7 to work with them for life. We typically see about a
8 75 percent graduation rate in our core programs. It
9 went down a little bit during the pandemic, but it's
10 rising and then we typically see about a 75 percent
11 placement rate off of graduation and sometimes those
12 career placements in the apprenticeship programs
13 could take three to six months because the
14 apprenticeship programs usually recruit from us
15 either on an annual basis twice a year, quarterly, so
16 we certainly, it's a big part of our program is
17 making sure that women continue to be engaged with us
18 and on their career path as they're waiting for those
19 permanent placements.
20

21 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you and then the
22 last question for me is how can the city help
23 programs like NEW to be more successful?

24 KATHLEEN CULHANE: Yeah, I mean we've touched on
25 it a lot this morning, I'm really excited for the

1 Local Law proposed. I've been with NEW about 15
2 years now and as President for the latter half
3 basically. And so, uhm, you know a number of long
4 term partners with us this morning and now this
5 afternoon. And so, we talked about a lot of things
6 that work right. And so, it is about getting the
7 word out in every neighborhood to every community.
8 It is about focusing on childcare in ways that we
9 haven't before and the new focus on childcare from a
10 city, state and federal level and from our partners
11 at NAPTU and with the Building and Construction
12 Trades Council in the city uhm is historic. That's
13 one of the many ways. I think like everything, I
14 think having a taskforce you know looking at the
15 data, is things that we're excited about and excited
16 that this we know just the start of further
17 conversations and work.

19 LOWELY CHEUNG: I want to add something. I'm
20 from an electrician union, so I'm also involved with
21 like a mentoring program from the union. So, I have
22 an access to the list of the new apprentice come in
23 every six month to our union.

24 Last time we have 120 new apprentice come in and
25 25 of them are women and 23 of them are from NEW.

1 So, NEW did an excellent job at channeling women to
2 unions. However, when a woman came to a union I
3 mean, most like I would say 25 percent from that
4 apprenticeship program only stay to become
5 journeyman. So, after that, you know there is other
6 work that have to be done to keep women in the trade.
7 Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you. Thank you
10 Lowely, that's a good point. And also, I think
11 points to the success of NEW but also some of the
12 obstacles that we continue to see for retention and
13 support of the women once they are through that
14 process. I'm going to pass it over to Chair Cabán.

15 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Yes, thank you. I just want
16 to echo my colleagues gratitude. Really, really
17 appreciate all of you for your testimony but also
18 recently had the opportunity to visit NEW with Chair
19 De La Rosa and Council Woman Sandy Nurse and was just
20 blown away by it. So, really appreciate you all. I
21 actually want to dig deeper into what was just said.
22 I know that NEW employs a retention coordinator to
23 help trades women navigate the challenge of the pre-
24 apprenticeship training. Would you all be able to go
25 into more detail on some of the common obstacles that

1
2 NEW's coordinator helps trades women overcome
3 specifically?

4 KATHLEEN CULHANE: Yeah and thank you Lowely.
5 Retention is a big piece right and so we are - we're
6 fortunate to have a director of social services Linda
7 Young whose been with NEW for 20-years and we have
8 you know five social work interns on her staff each
9 year and so, it starts with the recruitment piece and
10 it starts with potential students who maybe accepted
11 to our program but do not start core training class
12 until they have worked with social services in their
13 intake process.

14 Thinking about, do they have the back up to the
15 back up childcare before they start our class in
16 order to be successful? And so, we're thinking about
17 retention as we're thinking about you know starting
18 an art class in retention and the NEW's core program.

19 Then they go on to an advanced training program
20 in order to then go to be an electrician like Lowely
21 did. And then retention is for life and some of the
22 things that we're able to do is work with all our
23 students and graduates to make sure that they use NEW
24 as a resource and that they're also placed with
25 others you know, linked with other in terms of other

1 graduates that have been through what they've been
2 through. We also, you know when you start your
3 apprenticeship in addition to being able to do a
4 coffee run for maybe you know 25, 30 workers on the
5 job which we train for at NEW and being able to do
6 the lifting and carrying needed to usually you know
7 unload those trucks as a first year apprentice, we
8 also provide assistance with those you know union
9 dues that start right away before you're making your
10 money and the tool kit by trade. An electricians
11 tool kit, a carpenters tool kit. We make sure you
12 have access to you know the childcare that is
13 available in New York City and think about your
14 network. Think about nontraditional childcare and
15 all the ways that we can support that and so, those
16 are some of the things.

18 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Great thank you and I just
19 want to highlight what you said at the end in terms
20 of the working together to overcome some of the
21 childcare issues. Obviously days start early and
22 they're long hours and quite often outside of
23 childcare center hours and so, could you just provide
24 a little bit more detail on what that work looks like

1 to help find trades women solutions to that
2 particular challenge.
3

4 KATHLEEN CULHANE: Yeah, what that works
5 continues to look like is working with each
6 individual before they start our pre-apprenticeship
7 program in terms of what are the childcare options
8 NEW neighborhood linking with some of the Council's
9 in New York City that we work closely with that help
10 folks on an individual level think about what's in
11 their neighborhood.

12 One of the things that we know and will be
13 building on in our pilot with the BCTC in New York
14 City and NAPTU this year, is we know that for these
15 careers, there's not enough early morning childcare
16 but it's also really important for families to have
17 childcare in their neighborhood because you could be
18 working in Staten Island one day and Brooklyn the
19 next and the Bronx the next week on a job site. So,
20 it's not job site specific childcare doesn't really
21 work for New York City.

22 And then one of the things that we'll be able to
23 build on this year through that pilot is funding for
24 basically two handfuls about ten graduates for a year
25 to help them - help provide them with the childcare

1 that makes most sense to them. So, honoring you know
2 if they have a family member that they want to pay
3 for their childcare.
4

5 And then, providing research during this year,
6 not just around those ten families that we support
7 but models that work in New York City and otherwise
8 that can be – that can inform some of the additional
9 policy and advocacy work that we do around childcare
10 and a lot of you all with us today as well.

11 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Thanks so much. And then I
12 just have one last quick question. Can you describe
13 the various ways NEW tracks apprentices and graduates
14 of its programs including available data really to
15 the LGBTQ+ community?

16 KATHLEEN CULHANE: Yeah, we uhm, specifically
17 around the LGBTQ+ community. We track everyone that
18 we serve in terms of you know applicants, potential
19 students, they – it's self-reported. We put in some
20 additional measures to track that data just in the
21 last year or so, and so, we have some of that
22 information. And then we are able to track NOW
23 shifting to, you know we're able to track a graduate
24 throughout their apprenticeship. Those and our
25 relationships with our graduates but then also

1 working with the directors of the apprenticeship
2 program. We can gather that data in terms of, are
3 they still in the apprenticeship program? Are they
4 retained in the union? It becomes a little more
5 tricky once they journey out. Usually typically, at
6 year four to six depending on the trade. And so,
7 therefore we rely on you know our relationships with
8 our graduates as well to collect some of that data
9 and we're thinking about some ways we can enhance
10 that work.
11

12 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Well, thank you.

13 KATHLEEN CULHANE: You're welcome.

14 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Just one more question for
15 now and thank you so much for answering all of our
16 questions so far. What are some valuable lessons
17 learned from conducting remote options – operations
18 during the pandemic that you can share? Maybe
19 perhaps the city can build upon in their own
20 programmatic initiatives.

21 KATHLEEN CULHANE: Yeah, we talk a lot about
22 this. I talk a lot about this during these times is,
23 you know the opportunities that came out of the
24 pandemic and came out of these past couple of years.
25 One of the things that was an opportunity for us that

1 we continue to do is hold our information sessions in
2 a virtual environment.
3

4 Prepandemic, we would hold our information
5 sessions only in person at our restored fire house in
6 Chelsea, Tuesdays at 10:00 a.m., Wednesdays at 6:00
7 p.m. Now that we're holding them in day and evening
8 times in a virtual environment, we're seeing that
9 we're really able to reach many more New Yorkers and
10 beyond through a virtual environment. So, that's
11 something we're really continuing with and then as
12 well in our hybrid training, we're able to serve
13 folks in a different way and we're able to you know
14 honor a bit of the you know challenges that have come
15 to light in the past couple of years in terms of
16 getting to a training program you know for eight
17 weeks from you know 7:30 as early is on time is our
18 modo, so get there at 7:30 to start at 8:00, end at
19 4:00. Uhm, then maybe have some intensive math
20 classes after that. So, having a hybrid model where
21 we're able to really focus on our trades math and our
22 health and safety certifications with our partners at
23 NYCOSH and our job readiness and then doing the hands
24 on portion towards the end of the training in person,
25 is a model that really works for us.

1 So, that's two of the you know many ways that we
2 have lessons learned. We've also been really excited
3 with the increased interest really in our signature
4 projects program. And so, that was launched in 2010
5 and that's where owners and developers set goals
6 typically of 15 percent, trade with an hour goal for
7 the life of the project and then they work with NEW
8 to ensure that those goals are met by trade. And
9 there's been a real increased interest from owners
10 and developers since the pandemic and our city, state
11 and nations focus on diversity, equity and inclusion.
12 And so, that's a model that also really works.

14 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you for sharing that.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chairs, do you have any
16 further questions for this panel before I open it up
17 to the other Council Members? Okay, great. I will
18 now ask if there are anymore questions from Council
19 Members.

20 As a reminder, if Council Members have questions
21 for a particular panelist, they should use the raise
22 hand function in Zoom at this time.

23 Seeing no hands raised, I will call on the next
24 panel. I would like to now welcome Santos Rodriguez.
25 After Santos, we'll be hearing from Sierra Nezaj.

1
2 After Sierra, we'll be hearing from Talisa Smith and
3 then last, Megan Wylie. Santos, you may begin when
4 the timer starts.

5 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you very much Bianca.
6 Thank you Council Member De La Rosa. Sorry, can you
7 hear me? I just heard an echo on my end.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You're good. I think the
9 timer was starting.

10 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: Oh, thank you, thank you.
11 Council Member Cabán and Speaker Adams and all the
12 other Council Members for this hearing today. I've
13 actually heard a lot of good information coming
14 through this. I've been on as much as possible.
15 Excuse the sirens as well in Midtown.

16 But uh, so good afternoon. I am Santos Rodriguez,
17 testifying today on behalf of Gary LaBarbera,
18 President of the Building and Construction Trades
19 Council of Greater New York, also referred to as the
20 BCTC. The Building and Construction Trades Council
21 is an organization of local building and construction
22 trade unions that are affiliated with 15
23 International Unions in the North American Building
24 Trades Union. Our local union affiliates represent
25 approximately 100,000 union construction workers.

1 The Building Trades mission is to raise the standard
2 of living for all workers, to advocate for safe work
3 conditions - I'm sorry, I'm going to close the window
4 for a second. Please forgive me for that. With the
5 goal to advance all working conditions and raise
6 standards for all construction workers, the BCTC has
7 successfully advocated for legislation before this
8 Council, wage theft legislation in Albany, and wage
9 standards on certain construction projects that would
10 benefit all workers regardless of union status,
11 regardless of race, religion, ethnicity, or gender.

12 Membership in a labor union is the best way to
13 ensuring that workers are treated equally. Under a
14 collective bargaining agreement, we are paid based
15 upon the trade work that they perform. Employers do
16 not get to randomly decide how they will compensate
17 workers. If you are a plumber performing
18 construction on a new commercial development, you
19 receive the same wages and benefits as every other
20 plumber performing construction on a new commercial
21 development.
22

23 The collective bargaining agreement requires
24 this. Your employer cannot decide to pay you less
25 because of your race, sexual orientation or gender.

1
2 There is no similar protection for non-union workers
3 on private construction projects. There is no
4 similar mechanism for enforcing such as a requirement
5 without labor unions.

6 Additionally, the BCTC and its affiliates and
7 their signatory contractors invest heavily in
8 recruitment and training. To this end we work
9 closely with the ARC Affiliates, the Apprenticeship
10 Readiness Collective, which you heard from NEW
11 already, a group of four separate pre-apprentice
12 programs that recruit individuals across various
13 demographics in New York City, provide entry level
14 skills, and ultimately direct entry into an
15 apprenticeship program for a union construction
16 trade.

17 These four programs are, which I'm a proud
18 graduate: The Edward J. Malloy Initiative for
19 Construction Skills; Nontraditional Employment for
20 Women; New York Helmets to Hardhats; and Pathways to
21 Apprenticeship P2A. While each of these programs
22 target separate communities for recruitment, there is
23 no eligibility requirement or restrictions for
24 participation in any of these programs based on
25

1 gender, except for NEW, which focuses specifically on
2 women and non-binary individuals.
3

4 Notably women and non-binary individuals, can and
5 do participate in C-Skills, H2H and P2A. Graduates
6 from these programs are provided direct entry into a
7 construction union apprenticeship program. These
8 programs provide these individuals with much more
9 than just a job, it provides them with the skill and
10 base of support to begin careers in the construction
11 industry where they can earn family sustaining wages
12 and benefits. Established programs like these simply
13 do not exist in the non-union sector of the
14 construction industry. Efforts and diverse
15 recruitment aiming to improve the lives of workers
16 and provide them career opportunities do not exist in
17 the non-union sector.

18 There is no voice for workers in the non-union
19 sector, you're likely to hear more about the plight
20 of non-union contractors. The only way to guide
21 participation through a pre-apprentice program, to an
22 apprentice program, and ultimately into a career in
23 construction is -

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.
25

1
2 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: By working – can I have a few
3 more minutes?

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You may finish Santos, of
5 course.

6 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: Alright, thank you. Is by
7 working tirelessly to secure future work
8 opportunities for these individuals. Our Project
9 Labor Agreements ensure that work is performed on a
10 specific project utilizes union labor. This allows
11 our affiliated Unions to place the maximum amount of
12 apprentices allowed by law on projects. Where there
13 is no PLA, there is no guarantee that apprentices
14 will have a place to complete the field work portion
15 of the apprenticeship program. Where a project does
16 not utilize union contractors, there are no
17 apprentices working, learning, or growing on that
18 project period.

19 The BCTC and its affiliated Unions are doing what
20 we can to increase diversity in the trades, including
21 providing opportunities for more women and non-binary
22 individuals to enter the trades. We are increasing
23 recruitment efforts, working closely with pre-
24 apprentice programs, and seeking to secure PLAs to
25 ensure there are work opportunities for these

1 individuals. The number of individuals that can be
2 recruited into a pre-apprenticeship programs or
3 apprenticeship programs is tied to the amount, this
4 is very important, which is tied to the amount of
5 work a trade can project it will have to perform in
6 the future.
7

8 The more work opportunities trades have, the more
9 recruitment opportunities are available. Any one
10 construction project will eventually end. We are all
11 working to secure a pipeline to make sure that those
12 workers, and new workers, will continue to have
13 employment opportunities after the one project is
14 complete. We need to make sure these opportunities
15 continue to present themselves so that we can
16 continue to recruit, train, and prepare tomorrow's
17 construction workers.

18 We should all want the workers to build our
19 bridges, preparing our roads, rehabilitating our
20 airports, constructing high rise buildings in
21 Manhattan and low-rise apartment buildings in the
22 boroughs where our neighbors will live and raise
23 their families to build a highly trained and skilled
24 workforce that feels secure in employment and career.
25

1 We thank you for this opportunity to testify today.

2 Thank you for that. Thank you Bianca.

3
4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Santos. We'll now
5 be hearing from Sierra. Sierra, you may begin when
6 the timer starts.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

8 SIERRA NEZAJ: Hello, good afternoon everyone.
9 Thank you to the Council and the Committee Members
10 for allowing me to speak today. My name is Sierra
11 Nezaj, I am the Director of Communications and Grant
12 Writing for Building Skills New York. Building
13 Skills New York is a nonprofit construction workforce
14 development organization that connects under employed
15 New Yorkers to construction jobs throughout New York
16 City. Building Skills works with prospective
17 partners and under employed communities to connect
18 them with industry recognized training and
19 credentials to place them into meaningful employment.
20 We thank the Committees for the opportunity to
21 testify as part of the oversight of gender diversity
22 in the trades and the creation of the taskforce and
23 women and nontraditional employment.

24 Only about ten percent of payroll employees in
25 the New York City construction industry are women,

1 ranking 25th among big cities and falling below the
2 national average of 13 percent. December has
3 remained relatively stagnant since the 90's according
4 to a 2020 analysis of the Bureau of Labor Statistics
5 data. To combat this disparity, Building Skills New
6 York supports the creation of the Taskforce on Women
7 and Nontraditional Employment.
8

9 We propose working with the Council to place more
10 women into construction jobs. We are certain our
11 experience uniquely positions us to advocate for
12 women in construction and tackle issues that lead to
13 challenges with recruitment and retention of women,
14 sustains negative work environments for women, issues
15 impacting how these environments value diversity,
16 equity and inclusion and other significant barriers
17 to success for women in nontraditional workplaces.

18 Buildings Skills has worked with Council Member
19 Brooks-Powers, Riley, and Ayala among others to
20 connect their constituents to viable construction
21 jobs through job fairs, referral partner and district
22 office services.

23 Currently Building Skills is consistently working
24 to not only recruit more women for our programming
25 and place more women into meaningful employment but

1 also encourage the women we already work with to
2 remain confident and take charge of their careers
3 despite unequal representation in the construction
4 industry. They encourage women to build careers in
5 construction by facilitating all female OSHA 30 and
6 site safety training cohorts as part of our
7 Construction Career Accelerator program. Piloting
8 mothers in conjunction throughout May to celebrate
9 Mother's Day and inviting women who Building Skills
10 has placed into employment to speak to our current
11 construction skills training cohorts.
12

13 Building Skills also connects women to advanced
14 training, like for our scaffolding, flagging, HVAC,
15 X60 NG60 training to earn additional credentials that
16 will lead to career advancement and wage – In the
17 future we plan to also honor multiple women in
18 construction in an upcoming event, where they will be
19 given an opportunity and platform to speak to their
20 experience within the construction industry.

21 Additionally, while women who work in the
22 construction industry are more likely to work in an
23 office setting, 88 percent of women in Building
24 Skills places into employment work directly onsite,
25 including in positions like general labor, carpentry,

1 electrical and HVAC work. The average initial hourly
2 rate of women in Building Skills has placed into
3 employment has risen steadily. In addition, Building
4 Skills has placed over two dozen women in multiple
5 jobs in 2020. Children are not only committed to
6 being an entry point to the construction industry for
7 women but to helping women advance their careers and
8 be a resource for upward mobility, including
9 potential opportunities into pre-apprenticeship
10 programs and unionized building trades. Our goal is
11 to encourage who we serve to viable careers in the
12 construction industry that they are proud of. Thank
13 you for your consideration.
14

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Sierra. We'll now
16 be hearing from Talisa Smith. Talisa, you may begin
17 when the timer starts.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

19 TALISA SMITH: Thank you. Good afternoon. My
20 name is Talisa Smith, I serve as Program Director of
21 the Edward J. Malloy initiative for Construction
22 Skills, CSKILLS for short. I am testifying today on
23 behalf of Nicole Bertran, the Executive Vice
24 President of CSKILLS.
25

1 Construction Skills is a not-for-profit
2 corporation that administers an apprenticeship
3 readiness program for New York City public high
4 school seniors and adult residents seeking careers in
5 the unionized construction industry. Our
6 apprenticeship readiness program offers a nationally
7 recognized curriculum, the Multi-Craft Core
8 Curriculum MC3, and leads to direct entry access to
9 apprenticeship programs jointly sponsored by union
10 affiliates of the Building and Construction Trades
11 Council of Greater New York BCTC.
12

13 Since 2001, Construction Skills has contributed
14 to the development of a skilled and trained workforce
15 by recruiting, training and placing residents of New
16 York City into apprenticeship programs jointly
17 sponsored by union affiliates of the BCTC. To date,
18 Construction Skills has placed 2,350 New York City
19 residents into union apprenticeship programs. Our
20 participants live in all five boroughs of New York
21 City, 89 percent of these participants identify as
22 members of a minority community, and 80 percent
23 remain active in the industry today, working as
24 apprentices and journeypersons.
25

1 The success of Construction Skills can be
2
3 attributed to the commitment to diversity and
4 inclusion of the BCTC and its affiliates. In 2020,
5 after years of side by side collaboration, the four
6 workforce development organizations formally endorsed
7 by the BCTC have united to form the Apprenticeship
8 Readiness Collective ARC. ARC is a collective
9 intended to coordinate services and raise the profile
10 of direct entry programs in New York City. Its
11 affiliates include Construction Skills,
12 Nontraditional Employment for Women, Helmets to
13 Hardhats, and Pathways to Apprenticeship. Each ARC
14 affiliate stands ready with the skills and expertise
15 to provide direct entry access to family sustaining
16 careers in the unionized construction industry that
17 offers high wages, training and education, health
18 benefits and retirement security.

19 ARC affiliates provide apprenticeship readiness
20 and placement services to New Yorkers largely in
21 response to the construction industry's demand for
22 labor. Projects built using union labor means more
23 opportunity and new and existing workers to access
24 these family sustaining careers. One of the ways the
25 Council can support New Yorkers seeing these careers

1 is to help to ensure that work performed on projects
2 in the five boroughs utilize union labor. More union
3 jobs will create more opportunities for New Yorkers
4 served by the ARC affiliates. Thank you for the
5 opportunity to testify today.
6

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Talisa. We'll now
8 be hearing from Megan Wylie. Megan, you may begin
9 when the timer starts.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

11 MEGAN WYLIE: Thank you. Hi, my name is Megan
12 Wylie and I serve as the Deputy Political Director
13 for the New York City & Vicinity District Council of
14 Carpenters. Thank you to Chairs De La Rosa, Cabán,
15 and Farías, Speaker Adams and all Council Members
16 here today for holding this important hearing that
17 addresses an issue close to my heart; both as part of
18 a union working to fix an industry-wide gender gap,
19 and as a woman in a predominantly male field.

20 The district Council builds this city from the
21 ground up and keeps it running and our members are
22 highly skilled in everything from concrete formwork,
23 metal and wood framing, drywall, flooring,
24 architectural word work, roofing and many other
25 skills in between.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 145

1 On behalf of our 20,000 members who live and work
2 in New York City, I am proud to speak on the
3 importance of increasing pathways for women in the
4 construction trades, and our efforts to do so, as
5 well as in support of Council Member Moya's bill,
6 Intro. 0179, which would create a task force to
7 evaluate and report on female representation in the
8 trades.
9

10 The District Council of Carpenters is dedicated
11 to making sure our union resembles the diversity of
12 the city we work in and to ensuring that New Yorkers
13 from all paths of life have access to the life-
14 changing opportunities, such as higher wages, health
15 benefits pensions and workplace protections that come
16 with being in the union. Our efforts surrounding
17 gender diversity in the District Council of
18 Carpenters consists of two branches: recruiting women
19 previously unexposed to construction jobs and working
20 to improve the retention rate of female apprentices
21 and journeymen.

22 With a set number of slots and a randomized
23 lottery selection system for apprentices, the ability
24 to compensate for the gender gap is far too limited.
25 This is why Nontraditional Employment for Women, a

1 direct entry pre-apprenticeship program that we just
2 heard from, focused on recruiting low-income women,
3 transgender and non-binary individuals, is
4 particularly vital to developing a pipeline for
5 underrepresented communities.
6

7 Since 1978, NEW has placed women in over 3,000
8 industry careers, 700 of which were with the NYCDCC.
9 We urge the City Council to continue to fund NEW
10 through the Young Women's Leadership Development and
11 Job Training and Placement Initiatives. As stated,
12 however, recruitment is only half of the battle.
13 Many women who enter our apprenticeship program drop
14 out within five years, for reasons as mentioned by
15 Council Members today and we have made it our mission
16 to identify the causes of this trend and work to fix
17 them with various Council Members.

18 In the past two years, we have specifically
19 focused on our mentoring program, Sisters in the
20 Brotherhood. The SIB program consists of
21 approximately 800 members of the NYCDCC that focuses
22 on building a community and support network for women
23 in the union, through regular meetings, outreach to
24 high schools, trips to our training center in Las
25

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

147

1 Vegas with chapters of the SIB from across North
2 America, and other initiatives.

3
4 Thank you again to the Committees on Civil
5 Service & Labor, Women and Gender Equity, and
6 Economic Development for allowing me to speak on the
7 ways in which we are working to increase the number
8 of women in our union. We are grateful to work with
9 so many Council Members and to ensure we are
10 fostering opportunities for constituents in every
11 district, and we look forward to a day when the
12 construction trades no longer are a nontraditional
13 path for women.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Megan. I will now
15 turn it over to Chair Cabán first for questions
16 followed by questions from Chair De La Rosa and then
17 Chair Farias. Chair Cabán, you may begin when ready.

18 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Thank you. I just want to
19 thank everyone for their testimony. I want to
20 actually re-ask a question I asked of the
21 Administration because we didn't really get an answer
22 but feel like you all could speak to this.
23 Specifically around grievance processes. Could you
24 describe the process of handling gender-based
25 harassment complaints on the worksite? Specifically,

1 like what are the consequences for substantiated
2 complaints? And could you provide some examples of a
3 conflict resolution? An individual, their union and
4 a contractor might reach in response to a harassment
5 and counseling?
6

7 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: Well, I'll jump in really
8 quick and speak as a Council right. First, we have
9 sexual harassment training. We have harassment
10 training as early as apprentices and pre-apprentice.
11 I know the pre-apprentice programs have harassment
12 training also, right.

13 So, the grievance process, each individual union,
14 each individual affiliates have their own individual
15 grievance process. So, go into every single one, I'm
16 going to be honest with you, I don't know what they
17 all do. However, there is absolutely zero tolerance
18 when something is passed along to shop store, a
19 foreman, a business agent, right, that in turns goes
20 in between the trade itself and the owner of the
21 jobsite right.

22 So, what examples? I mean, we've had other
23 issues where we've had stand downs on jobs over
24 issues where myself, Gary LaBarbera, President of the
25 Building Trades, other principal officers have gone

1 to a job site and had a stand down to speak to the
2 audience, to the workers on site of what's acceptable
3 and not acceptable on job sites. There have been you
4 know, there have been contractors and owners that
5 have put you know, for people to speak, have put you
6 know like - I just drew a blank on a prize or
7 whatever, so they can come out and speak, right. Not
8 prize, I'm using the wrong word but you know what I'm
9 saying.
10

11 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Incentives?

12 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: Incentives, like so if someone
13 can speak on behalf of what really happened on the
14 situation to get to an arrest. Like, if it
15 escalates, we are completely on board with rectifying
16 whatever situation took place or we have to know
17 about it as well, right. When it comes to
18 harassment, it's not easy for everyone to come out
19 and speak about harassment. It's a very difficult
20 situation where we're speaking in general terms. And
21 women right now, I can tell you about what I've been
22 through right and how I've dealt with it but that's
23 not going to be the same way you probably go through
24 a situation and deal with it also, right.
25

1 So, I think it's up to the individual to speak up
2
3 and that's probably the most difficult thing we see
4 is when someone needs to speak up. What are the
5 consequences? The fear that they have? And you know
6 we see you have another speaker here today that can
7 probably speak to this more on harassment. We've
8 seen the Attorney General Tish James actually
9 prosecute, right on a nonunion construction site
10 because of the lack of enforcement.

11 So, you know I'll turn it over to anyone else on
12 the panel that can speak a little bit more to it but
13 on a general term, there's really zero tolerance on
14 our side. The grievance process - that has to be
15 reported to the shops foreman and up the channel on
16 the union side and on the owner side as well. I hope
17 that answered your question to a degree.

18 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Thank you. If nobody else
19 wants to chime in, I have one more question for you
20 all and it's just simply how can the City Council
21 collaborate with BCTC to better support recruitment
22 and retention of women and you know the gender
23 expansive folks in the skill trades.

1
2 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, thank you very much for
3 that question. I'll dive in and I'll pass it along
4 also.

5 So, there's a lot that City Council can do,
6 right. There's a lot that comes in front of City
7 Council throughout the years, whether we speak about
8 rezoning. The last big let's call it fight that we
9 had was over the New York City Blood Center, right.
10 That whole project. We go back to – we go back to a
11 job that you're all familiar with Amazon out in
12 Queens, right.

13 We had a deal with Amazon and we had a direct
14 pipeline to work with the people of Queens Bridge
15 Housing to bring people in. But I've been in the
16 industry now and I come through construction skills
17 right, I'm only speaking – I'm telling you my story
18 right.

19 I come through Construction Skills; I've been in
20 the business for 23-years. I come from a small local
21 out of NYCHA houses, out of Williamsburg Houses.
22 Right off 112 Sidewalk. You know, I was born and
23 raised there, right. Uh, and it's given me the
24 opportunity to speak up and provide more help for
25 folks like me that come in from our communities,

1 right. So, what we can do is, when a developer or a
2 contract that comes, what City Council could do
3 right, is assure that it's not - we don't talk about
4 just local jobs because that's a good talking point
5 right. But how do you provide a real career path?
6 What are the pipelines that you're utilizing that
7 contractors utilizing to get you more apprenticeship,
8 more pre-apprenticeships and the four apprenticeship
9 programs, pre-apprenticeship programs that we're
10 working with and we're talking to right now, right?
11 The more work that comes through the city that we can
12 identify, the greater the pipeline of workers, we can
13 continue to bring in from our communities.

14 I'll yield and Megan and Talisa can you know have
15 anything else to add. I think those are important
16 points.

17 MEGAN WYLIE: Thanks, I'll add if that's okay and
18 just to reiterate what Santos was saying, I agree. I
19 think just making sure that we're ensuring labor
20 careers by putting pressure on developers to make
21 sure that you know they're accepting bids and
22 listening to what our organizers have to say and in
23 addition, just making sure that you know we have
24 these requirements on projects and in addition, just
25

1
2 - well, you know our union in part- what our union
3 uhm, which I can speak on is really focused on is
4 working on outreach and while our organizers are out
5 in every neighborhood trying to spread the word at
6 high schools and career fairs and job sites, we also
7 just would love to work with more Council Members
8 just to you know reach their constituents, especially
9 communities that may not be exposed to construction
10 jobs otherwise.

11 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Thank you.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I will now turn it over to
13 Chair De La Rosa for questions.

14 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you. I have a few
15 questions. The first one is more of a general
16 question but how can unions be an example of how to
17 diversify industries for nonunion you know folks in
18 the industry? How can the unions be an example?

19 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: So, I'll jump in once again.
20 It's got to be you know, the building trades have
21 been doing an intentional change, an intentional
22 adjustment and looking at who reflects New York City,
23 right. How do we protect the workers? You heard me
24 speak of you know safety legislation to cover all
25 construction workers in New York City that passed

1 almost seven years ago now. You hear about certain
2 construction jobs that we try to lift the wage
3 standards, right.
4

5 So, you really have to answer to community right.
6 You have to make sure that you're providing the right
7 wages, the benefits. You have to see who's in need.
8 You know you heard the city speak earlier about the
9 City Project Labor Agreement and 15 percent of those
10 people that live on the 50 percent of the poverty.
11 That's a lot. That's all 50 percent of New York
12 City. We learned that with the partnership that we
13 have with the City of New York. That's a lot of
14 people, that's a lot of zip codes. That's a lot of
15 our neighbors right.

16 So, we have to make sure that how we lift those
17 people are I think - and look, you see it in us. You
18 know right now you have Megan from the District
19 Council of Carpenters. You have Talisa speaking on
20 behalf of construction. You have Kathleen speaking
21 and Kate speaking on behalf NEW, right. You have P2A
22 Sinade speak on behalf of NEW. You have Lowely right
23 speaking. These are all women. These are all women
24 that are in leadership roles that are pushing
25 forward. That's how you do it, you know. That's

1 exactly how you do it. And I hope that answers some
2 of that question.
3

4 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you. Anybody else
5 on the panel want to add? No, okay, my next
6 question, well, first of all I want to thank you
7 Santos specifically for mentioning the need to expand
8 the PLA's and to create opportunities for you know
9 for union jobs in our communities, especially as we
10 begin to discuss rezonings and other developments in
11 our communities. I think that that's always an
12 important point and one that fortifies a Council
13 Member right, who is trying to negotiate a project in
14 their own community to ensure that there are jobs
15 that create sustainable life for workers, for union
16 workers in our communities.

17 I wanted to ask you a little bit about the
18 dedicated slots across demographic groups. I asked
19 this of the administration, the answer was unclear,
20 so I'm re-asking. Do you believe that the dedicated
21 slots around demographic groups have been an
22 effective way to diversify the construction industry?

23 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: 100 percent. I believe in
24 that as I'm a sitting, living, beathing example of
25 it. Uh, 23-years in the business, came in through

1 Construction Skills, went through an apprenticeship
2 program through the enforce insulators of Local 12 in
3 New York City. I became their organizer. I became
4 their political director. I am now sitting here with
5 the Building Trades as Director of Community Affairs,
6 Chief of Staff, of Gary LaBarbera, representing over
7 100,000 construction workers and 15 international
8 affiliates that you heard in the statement. There is
9 absolutely a change in the industry. When you see a
10 report from the ARC affiliates and you see that 80,
11 89 percent are of minority status or identify as
12 minority. When you see that there's over 80, 85
13 percent retention rate. These are real lives. These
14 are real people we're talking about. These are real
15 changes that happen, right.

17 When we speak and you mentioned rezoning and you
18 know I was, you know we had a conversation about a
19 certain rezoning, I won't go into which one, right.
20 We had - before everyone on this call I believe was
21 here with City Council, but that was an opportunity.
22 That was an opportunity where rezoning was coming
23 into a neighborhood and its massive rezoning but when
24 we speak about life science, when you speak about
25 housing. When you speak about mixed-use housing and

1 you speak about schools, right, those are all good
2 potential good union construction jobs that can be
3 created. But we're not speaking about what stores
4 are coming in afterwards. What supermarket, UFCW,
5 United Food Commercial Workers, good union jobs. Our
6 RWDSU retail workers, right that are coming in, good
7 union jobs. When you talk about maintenance of a
8 building, 32BJ. When you talk about hotels, like
9 there's a real establishment that can be built out of
10 rezonings with new bus operators, more bus operators
11 coming in, new mechanics.
12

13 Those are all new trained conductors, like that's
14 all a way of envisioning what labor can bring to the
15 table and expanding on a rezoning that can really
16 work through and through.

17 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: So, you're kind of
18 alluding to the infrastructure around the after
19 effects of development in our communities, which is
20 something that we're definitely looking at. Just to
21 piggyback on that question a little bit. What can
22 the city do to better ensure predictability of
23 construction project hours, so that the Buildings and
24 Construction Trades Council for example can place
25

1 more graduates of the ARC pre-apprenticeship programs
2 into the pipeline?
3

4 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: It's the amount of work that's
5 being built right. We're only going to have in our
6 lifetime right now, right one JFK, one LaGuardia
7 Airport right. If we're talking about the NEW pump
8 station redevelopment, we got to see that as a big
9 opportunity to really bring in more people right. If
10 you think about projects that are coming on a
11 pipeline in Queens and in the Bronx, you know with
12 Fordham landing. These are all big projects that we
13 can tell you that for the most part right now, we're
14 speaking in and contemplating project labor
15 agreements and the discussions you know to talk about
16 those right.

17 But it's as simple enough as when a contractor,
18 developer comes to City Council and starts the
19 conversation with you. Even on affordable housing
20 and says hey, if you want affordable housing, we
21 can't supply union labor, right, that's the main
22 division right off the bat is that there's the first
23 argument, why? If City Council and Housing Council
24 can help, and simplify our programs, our four pre-
25 apprenticeship programs, ensure that the conflict, I

1 know you can't utilize union labor because it's
2 preempted and causes - but you can absolutely utilize
3 words like apprenticeship, pre-apprenticeship
4 utilization, community hire components and so, all
5 the language, even if it's on a private sector, I
6 truly believe that you have the upper hand when the
7 developers come into US City Council Members and
8 they're asking what your needs are because there's a
9 discussion of what you want to see from the project
10 also and what community wants to see from the
11 project, right is just that, right.

12 So, you know the numbers are probably changing.
13 It will probably get a little higher but a few years
14 ago, we did a commission study and we know that over
15 51 percent, over 51 percent of our over 100,000
16 members live within the five boroughs.

17 Now, let's think about that. Let's say 55,000,
18 let's say you know what it is, that's not 55
19 individuals, 55,000. That's 55,000 families, right?
20 That also in turn have other members that are looking
21 to feed into this pipeline as well because they know
22 how good it could be for them. If my kids today,
23 let's say 11 and 15, say, "dad, I don't think college
24 is for me." Would I be upset? Yeah, I guess maybe a
25

1 little bit but I know that there's a pathway to the
2 middle class in organized labor, right. There are
3 two roads to be successful in life. We just have to
4 make sure we know what we want in that.
5

6 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you for answering
7 the questions.

8 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I will now turn it over to
10 Chair Farias. Chair, you may begin.

11 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you and thanks for all
12 of those responses Santos. Just to stick on the pre-
13 apprenticeship programs. Two quick questions. How
14 do unions evaluate and determine when they are need
15 of additional graduates of direct entry pre-
16 apprenticeship programs to specifically meet annual
17 number of reserved slots for women.

18 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: It's determined by the
19 pipeline of work that's in the industry. So, so, you
20 know there's a roughly a ten year cycle in the
21 industry. We have a ten year high and a ten year
22 low, right. That's determined by the workload that's
23 coming in, right. Our pre-apprenticeship programs
24 and our apprentice coordinators have a direct line
25 with one another, right.

1
2 So, through Department of Labor website, if you
3 pull a search on DOR and apprenticeship New York City
4 or apprenticeship opportunities in New York City, it
5 will tell you what union is giving out applications
6 because by law, they have to post it. I forget, it's
7 30, 60 days before their actually given applications.
8 At that moment, our apprentice coordinators will
9 contact NEW skills P2A helmets. Hey, we need x, y, z
10 from your program to come by and interview or see if
11 they meet you know whatever requirements need to be
12 met.

13 It could be something as you know carrying a 50-
14 pound bucket right. Someone can't carry that, that's
15 going to be a burden. NEW has a rigorous program
16 where they train and if you guys were part of that,
17 they train, they make sure that the women that are
18 coming in are being able to work their way up to that
19 if they're not, right already there. And then, and
20 then there's a lot going on that we can do on that
21 but basically it is that a pipeline of work will set
22 for how many more folks we can bring in on a year to
23 year. And how many times a recruitment opens up on a
24 year to year also right.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Right, okay, is that the
3 same in terms of like, when additional apprenticeship
4 slots are available?

5 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: That is.

6 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay, alright great. Thank
7 you so much for that clarification.

8 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair. I will now
10 ask if there are any more questions from Council
11 Members. As a reminder, if Council Members have
12 questions for a particular panelist, they should use
13 the raise hand function in Zoom at this time.

14 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: Can I raise my hand?

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sure. Before we conclude, go
16 ahead Santos.

17 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: Just really quick, I just want
18 to add the childcare issue right. Childcare is huge.
19 NEW spoke, Kathleen spoke about the pilot program
20 that we and NAPTU, along with NEW are working
21 together. This is a real issue in our industry and
22 I'll tell you why. We don't work five to nine - I
23 mean a nine to five job or eight to four job. Our
24 members work. They get up 4:00, 4:30 depending on
25 where they're going to work at right. If there's a

1 concrete pour that starts at six o'clock in the
2 morning, that concrete pour is not done until they
3 finish pouring all the concrete, that can take to
4 six, seven o'clock at night.
5

6 So, to find childcare that is open sooner and
7 stays open later, is very important and I think this
8 is a huge problem across all sectors in the industry.
9 I don't think it's only a construction industry issue
10 but it's one of the highest issues that we have, is
11 finding that location that one, is open. And two,
12 that stays open later. Alright, so, thank you very
13 much for that opportunity Bianca.

14 COMMTITE COUNSEL: You're welcome Santos. I'm
15 going to give another second or two for Council
16 Member questions if any. Okay, I don't believe there
17 are any more questions, so we'll move on to our next
18 panel. I would now like to welcome Tierra Williams.
19 After Tierra, we'll be hearing from Karla Cruz and
20 then last on this panel will be Kyle Simmons.
21 Tierra, you may begin when the timer starts. Thank
22 you.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.
24
25

1
2 TIERRA WILLIAMS: My name is Tierra Williams, I'm
3 a Local 79 Organizer and thank you guys for allowing
4 me to speak today.

5 The primary barrier women face in entering the
6 construction field is not discrimination or
7 harassment. Those are the injustices I faced and
8 overcame as a nonunion worker. What women cannot
9 overcome is the lack of good jobs. Not just good
10 paying jobs but safe and supportive jobs.

11 Women have come a long way because of unions like
12 mine. Our collective voice through unions have
13 increased safety standards, protect the vulnerable
14 workers and restored confidence in under served
15 communities. Working nonunion for me was a dead end
16 job. I took nothing but losses and risks that put me
17 in a position to either get severely injured or never
18 return home to my son.

19 The union has fully restored my confidants. I'm
20 a healthy taxpayer of New York. The support given to
21 me from my individual brothers and sisters has helped
22 me to evolve and tap into areas within myself that
23 were clouded by struggle and depression.

24 The union has provided me with the safest and
25 most welcoming workplace environment a woman could

1 ask for. Here I can focus on my work ethic and don't
2 have to worry about discriminatory acts or wage
3 theft.
4

5 Since I've joined the union, I've never
6 experienced these injustices because I am entitled to
7 equal pay by our contract and we have shop stewards
8 and business agents to protect us if any job site
9 issues arise. All workers deserve viable wages,
10 family health insurance, emergency savings and
11 retirement benefits.

12 Women are especially the backbone of families and
13 deserve the same protections and privileges men have
14 historically enjoyed. We are the centers of our
15 communities but cannot fully participate in life if
16 we are struggling to survive.

17 Being able to have time for my rapidly growing
18 son, moving out of my grandmother's house, having
19 full medical coverage and looking forward to a well-
20 funded pension is a blessing that many women have not
21 yet received. You can help with that. As City
22 Council Members, you have tremendous power to create
23 opportunities for women to access union careers like
24 mine. You get to approve rezoning subsidies and tax
25 incentives for each estate project, real estate

1 project sorry. I'm asking you to consider holding
2 the door open for women. Women and people and of
3 color when you cast those votes. I'm asking that you
4 aid in taking care of the women that hold up our
5 communities. I am asking that you make sure that
6 these projects are done by union contractors which
7 will ensure women are welcome on the job, paid
8 properly, fully ensured and protected as every worker
9 should be.
10

11 Again, thank you for allowing me to speak today.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Tierra. We'll now
13 be hearing from Karla Cruz. Karla, you may begin
14 when the timer starts.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

16 KARLA CRUZ: Hi, thank you Chairs Cabán, De La
17 Rosa and Farias for hosting this Oversight Hearing on
18 Gender Diversity in the Trades. One of the main
19 challenges faced by women in the workforce is the
20 societal belief that our labor is not as valuable as
21 our male counterparts.

22 For a woman of color, our value is worth even
23 less. Gender pay inequality is not discriminatory
24 but a business model that suppresses general wage
25 world. We've spoken a lot this morning about what

1 can the city do? What can Council Members do to
2 ensure that there is more equity when it comes to
3 women in the trades and the only real answer to this
4 is, we need to start looking at the root problem of
5 what is causing women to leave nonunion job sites.
6 Women not to hold strong retention rates in the
7 nonunion development side and that is because there
8 have been policies put forth by city and other
9 administrations where HPD, who is a developmental
10 agency, doesn't have any labor standards when they
11 build all of the affordable housing on behalf of the
12 city.
13

14 We have EDC who continually awards developers who
15 contract us to non-union contractors. The only real
16 way though we'll be able to close gender wage gap is
17 through collective bargaining. And right now, a lot
18 of the affordable housing development, the majority
19 of affordable housing development that's being
20 developed by the city is being done by nonunion
21 contractors where these things just don't happen on
22 their own. Diversity doesn't happen on its own.
23 Changing societal beliefs that women are just as
24 valuable doesn't happen on its own and this is where
25 City Council needs to step up. Just like my sister

1 from Local 79 just mentioned, it's really your
2 responsibility on how we create policies that ensure
3 that rezoning's have labor standards. To make sure
4 that HPD is not hiding behind their accountability
5 and EDC as well.
6

7 We spoke about the oversites of PLA's, well, how
8 do we scale that? We have a structure where we work
9 with CSKILLS which recruits directly with high school
10 students. We work with NEW, which directly recruits
11 women. The structure is there but what we're not
12 talking about is how do we scale our structure? How
13 do we scale more jobs? How do we scale more of this?
14 And this goes back to the root problem of HPD and
15 EDC, pretty much developing and handing out millions
16 of tax money to nonunion contractors who don't have
17 any of these mechanisms that we have in our job sites
18 where women feel protected. Women feel safe to speak
19 about sexual harassment. There is a lot more
20 financial independence because the jobs that we're
21 able to provide actually carry family sustaining
22 wages and really change your financial stability.

23 So, I mean, I don't want to keep beating a dead
24 horse but we need to focus on the root problem and
25 that is something that this Council can really do to

1 bring more opportunities for women and create the
2 equity that we need. Thank you.

3
4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Karla. We'll now
5 be hearing from Kyle Simmons. You may begin Kyle
6 when the timer starts.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

8 KYLE SIMMONS: Good afternoon everyone. My name
9 is Kyle Darren Simmons and I have been the President
10 of the New York City Laborers Local 924, which is a
11 public service union since December of 2001. I want
12 to thank the City Council and all these Chairs for
13 holding this very important forum.

14 Most of the testimony I've been hearing has been
15 focused primarily around private sector workers. I
16 have to say as President of the City Laborers, which
17 is the only entry level in the City of New York, that
18 has the responsibility of assisting every field
19 tradesman that is employed by the City of New York,
20 which is roughly over 15,000 skilled tradesman made
21 up of stationary engineers, painters, carpenters,
22 roofers, tin knockers, steam fitters, electricians,
23 you name it, cement masons, they are all employed at
24 the City of New York.

We are an entry level position with the only prevailing rate construction title that works for the City of New York. That there is no formal education, no experience necessary, it's on the job training and it's an appointed position.

So, none of my members which I represent which over 75 percent of them are of minority origin can be employed by the city of New York, without any issue whatsoever in reference to the hiring process and gain on the job experience whether it in electrical work, plumbers, carpenters, painters work. And may be able to make a decision on what path that they would like to enter into in the future and have a permanent position.

Everyone of the individuals that are hired by the City of New York come in with a starting salary of over \$75,000 a year plus benefits.

There is no maturation to a specific title, whether a laborer has been employed for one year or been employed for 40-years, we all have the same salary coming in the door and going out the door. I can say being employed at DEP; they have been putting obstacles in the way in reference to hiring. Not only minorities but also women. I can give kudos to

1 New York City Housing Authority because as of July 1,
2 2018, they started to hire laborers and in the course
3 of this short time period, they may have hired maybe
4 over 130 city laborers and approximately 25 of them
5 or more, are women. And the majority of these
6 individuals that they have hired are minority workers
7 giving them the opportunity to learn a skill and the
8 opportunity most importantly is to take care of their
9 family the way we all should be able to take care of
10 our family.
11

12 I know the administration of the Adams, both
13 Adams, Speaker Adams and Eric Adams, they may mean
14 well but I can assure you, you have individuals that
15 are in place. Their mind set is 100 percent
16 differently. In reference to this initiative that
17 you're trying to put together right now. Because
18 I've been dealing with these individuals for an
19 extended period of time, putting these same issues on
20 the table.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

22 KYLE SIMMONS: On the individuals.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You may finish sir.

24 KYLE SIMMONS: Okay. I am employed by the
25 Department of Environmental Protection and right now,

1 they hired city park workers that make maybe \$30,000
2 a year. 300 of these individuals to work in streets
3 of New York City and as a utility, they are supposed
4 to hire prevailing rate titles and pay them
5 prevailing wages to perform these duties.
6

7 Most of these individuals are not only minorities
8 but they are also women and they're paying these low
9 wages and benefits, some of these jobs or most of
10 them are seasonal also. This is something that over
11 the course of four mayors that I've been here as
12 President have been doing and I've been calling it
13 attention to not only the Mayor's Office of Labor
14 Relations but DCAS and anybody that would listen and
15 because we are only 440 strong now, now mind you, our
16 primary responsibility is to assist the skill trades
17 individuals besides many other duties that we can do
18 on our own, including landscaping, snow removal,
19 driving vehicles, operating forklifts and things of
20 that nature that we can perform. There's only 440
21 laborers that are hired by the City of New York to
22 assist these skilled trades. So, how are assisting
23 these individuals and how much they are paying these
24 individuals? And I could assure you that a lot of
25 these individuals that are assisting these skill

1 tradesmen that are majority White males, are people
2 of color. And when you look in the Parks Department,
3 in the City of New York, there is not one city
4 laborer there today, yet you still got skilled
5 tradesman. You still got ball fields to maintain.
6 You still got roads to build. You still got pathways
7 to renovate and fences to erect. Yet, there is not
8 one city laborer performing those duties yet.

10 40 years ago, there was well over 1,800, 1,900
11 people. At it's high point, there was 4,000 city
12 laborers employed by the City Parks Department and
13 there's not one there today. Those are the avenues
14 and the obstacles that we all have to live with,
15 especially the women because a lot of these women in
16 the City Parks are performing skill trades work,
17 erecting fences and helping skilled tradesman but not
18 being paid the proper wages and benefits that they
19 are entitled to.

20 So, I'm not going to take too much more of your
21 time but at the end of the day, if you all would like
22 to continue to discuss these issues, that the City of
23 New York can rectify as employers themselves, I'm
24 hoping that this Introductory Bill 179 will also
25 elaborate and also speak to that, not only on the

1 private sector but also on the public service
2 employees that are employed by the City of New York
3 and also, link in that behalf.

4
5 And I thank you very much for your help and your
6 time and allowing me to speak on this very important
7 subject.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much Kyle. I'm
9 going to now turn it over to the Chairs for questions
10 for this panel. Chairs, do you have any questions
11 for the panel. Chair De La Rosa, I'm going to turn
12 it over to you now.

13 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yeah, I don't really
14 have questions. I just wanted to thank this panel
15 for giving us an underground view of what is actually
16 happening in your industries. I found your
17 testimonies to be important and gave us a view of
18 exactly where you're going through the supports we
19 need as stated by Tierra. The root causes stated by
20 Karla and this new issue that Mr. Simmons just
21 brought to my attention. I look forward to following
22 up individually after the hearing. So, thank you all
23 so much for being here and expressing your important
24 testimonies.

25 TIERRA WILLIAMS: You're welcome.

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 175

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair. I will now
5 ask if there are any more questions from Council
6 Members. As a reminder, if Council Members have
7 questions for a particular panelist, they should use
8 the raise hand function in Zoom at this time.

9 Let me give a moment. Okay, seeing no hands
10 raised, I will call on the next panel. Thank you
11 panelists. I will now be calling on Kayt Tiskus to
12 testify. After Kayt, we'll be hearing from Shi
13 Greene and then last we'll be hearing from Musfika
14 Moshahid. Kayt, you may begin when the timer starts.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

16 KAYT TISKUS: Thank you. Thank you, Chairs De La
17 Rosa, Fariás, and Cabán, Council Members who are here
18 and all of the staff who worked so hard to put this
19 hearing together.

20 My name is Kayt Tiskus, I'm the Director of
21 Legislative Strategy and Special Projects of Bowen
22 Public Affairs Consulting. I'm also a queer woman
23 and an activist and I do a lot of work with the
24 transgender, gender nonconforming, and nonbinary
25 community. And the reason that I'm here today is to
request that the Committees and Council support a
proposed new initiative we've been working on to help

1
2 LGBTQ+ people into union careers. We're calling it
3 the Pride at Work Initiative and we're asking that
4 the Council fund this proposed initiative in the
5 range of \$600,000 to \$700,000.

6 The initiative is meant to bring funded
7 organizations together in a multisectoral approach,
8 with multiple pathways into unionized jobs, focusing
9 on recruiting LGBTQ+ communities in New York City,
10 and primarily BIPOC LGBTQ+ communities. Sorry that's
11 a lot of acronyms in a row.

12 Overall, we will have the combined effort of many
13 entities working underneath the umbrella of this
14 initiative to help get LGBTQ+ people into stable
15 union careers. The important of which so many of my
16 colleagues have testified about today. We're working
17 with workforce organizations who maintain strong
18 union affiliations, LGBTQ+ organizations, we've got
19 support from the SEIU 1199 Employment and Training
20 Fund, and an ask from the Department of Citywide
21 Administrative Services to have an LGBTQ+ Liaison to
22 help do hiring halls for LGBTQ+ New Yorkers, and
23 otherwise work to ensure the Civil Service is a
24 maximally affirming work environment for people who
25

1 have a really wide variety of gender expressions.

2 DC37 supports that ask, too.

3
4 And I feel like many people have spoken very
5 eloquently about this today but why union employment
6 specifically is so important for this initiative?
7 LGBTQ+ people, especially Black and Brown LGBTQ+
8 people in New York City, are disproportionately
9 impacted by unemployment, and incomes below 200
10 percent of the poverty line.

11 Bowen Public Affairs, especially our principal
12 Andy Bowen, has worked with the City over the last
13 few years to help create the Unity Works workforce
14 program for LGBTQ+ youth and a manual on LGBTQ+
15 workplace inclusivity. However, much of the work
16 around LGBTQ+ workforce inclusion focuses on people
17 who are 25 and under and you know, people turn 25
18 everyday as we say.

19 Given the poverty rates and unemployment faced by
20 LGBTQ+ adults, it is clear that we need high-road
21 employment of the sort that we get from strong union
22 pathways, as have been discussed today in this
23 hearing. I'm happy to answer any further questions
24 that you might have, and ask you, Chairs, and your
25 Council colleagues, to support the Pride at Work

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

178

1 Initiative with initial funding in Fiscal Year '23 of
2 \$600-\$700,000.
3

4 Thank you so much for your time and
5 consideration.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Kayt. We'll now be
7 hearing from Shi Greene. Shi, you may begin when the
8 timer starts.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

10 SHI GREENE: Thank you. Can you guys hear me?

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yup, loud and clear Shi,
12 thank you.

13 SHI GREENE: Great thank you. Good afternoon and
14 thank you for the opportunity to testify on behalf of
15 gender diversity, equality, equity and inclusion. My
16 name is Shi Greene. I'm a nine year union member
17 with local 79 Laborers by way of being in
18 apprenticeship training. And the Executive Director
19 of Pathways to Apprenticeship, a registered direct
20 entry pre-apprenticeship training program under the
21 NYC Building Trades affiliates of the ARC,
22 apprenticeship readiness collective along with
23 Nontraditional Employment for Women, Helmets to
24 Hardhats and Construction Skills.
25

1 Pathways to Apprenticeship became a direct entry
2 in 2000 and since placed hundreds of women, Black and
3 Brown minorities and individuals into unionized
4 construction trades under the [INAUDIBLE 3:42:50].
5 The way it runs [INAUDIBLE 3:42:52] ranging between
6 four to six weeks of data training including sexual
7 harassment training by way of a two hour discussion
8 from Local 3 - [LOST AUDIO 3:43:03].
9

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Shi, I'm so sorry, I think
11 you're experiencing technical issues. And there's
12 like a playback. Hold on one second, we can start
13 this again. Oh my goodness, hold on one second. Oh,
14 there you are. Okay, so sorry about that. You can
15 start from the top and we can - do you want to just
16 test your audio again to see if you playback?

17 SHI GREENE: Sure, yeah, can you hear me? Okay,
18 great.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Coming in loud and clear.
20 Sergeant, can you just not have the timer on so Shi
21 can start again? Okay Shi, you can begin.

22 SHI GREENE: Thanks so much. So, I'll start
23 over. Good afternoon and thank you for this
24 opportunity to testify on behalf of gender diversity,
25 equality, equity and inclusion. My name is Shi

1
2 Greene, I'm a nine year union member with Local 79
3 Laborers by way of union apprenticeship training.
4 I'm also the Executive Director of Pathways to
5 Apprenticeship, a registered direct entry pre-
6 apprenticeship training program under the NYC
7 Building Trades and affiliate of the ARC,
8 apprenticeship readiness collectives along with
9 Nontraditional Employment for women, Helmets to
10 Hardhats and Construction Skills.

11 Pathways to Apprenticeship became a direct entry
12 in 2018 and has since placed hundreds of women, Black
13 and Brown minorities, injustice impacted individuals
14 into unionized construction trades. P2A runs about a
15 six week - I'm sorry about six cohorts per year,
16 ranging between four to six weeks of safety training
17 including sexual harassment training by way of a two
18 hour performance and discussion from Local 3
19 electrical journey workers as well as actors of the
20 working theater.

21 The city has been extremely supportive of these
22 trainings and continues to allow us the flexibility
23 to create more programming around safety, training
24 and inclusion. Each cohort seats about 25
25 participants and our continued goal is four to six

1 women per cohort. I'm excited about the proposal of
2 Bill Intro. 179 as I personally understand the
3 importance of women in the trades.
4

5 Prior to coming into Local 79 Laborers, I was a
6 single mom making minimum wage, working a nonunion
7 company. I was exploited, discriminated against and
8 disrespected. Had it not been for the Local 79
9 Laborers Apprenticeship opportunity, I would have
10 left the construction field completely, not knowing
11 what my next move would have been or where I'd be
12 today.

13 I'm living proof of the importance of
14 apprenticeship, pre-apprenticeship and union careers
15 in Construction for All, specifically for all women.
16 Though there were many personal boundaries, as a
17 single mother of two with the foster care and
18 criminal justice impacted background, I was able to
19 transition from Welfare and Medicaid insurance to a
20 six figure income and great healthcare benefits for
21 myself and my family due to my career in the building
22 trades.

23 Today, I am speaking on behalf of the Pride at
24 Work Initiative. Though P2A has always opened its
25 doors to the LGBTQ community unofficially, we have

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

182

1 recently partnered with Bowen Public Affairs
2 Consulting and Pride at Work to ensure all women
3 continue to be educated and included in these amazing
4 building trades opportunities.
5

6 We ask that you support the Pride at Work
7 Initiative that has been proposed to Council as it is
8 vital to helping LGBTQ+ communities, especially
9 BIPOC, transgender, nonconforming, and nonbinary
10 people find employment. This has the support of our
11 organization, the Iron Workers Union as well as
12 Nontraditional Employment for Women.

13 We appreciate the continued support of Team Moya
14 and hope to continue working together to provide
15 continued life changing opportunities for residents
16 of New York City by way of fighting for and creating
17 more unionized jobs. We must continue to emphasize
18 the importance of safe construction work by way of
19 union apprenticeship trainings into union
20 construction building trades.

21 Thank you again for this opportunity to speak.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Shi. We'll now be
23 hearing from Musfika. Musfika, you may begin when
24 the timer starts.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

1
2 MUSFIKA MOSHAHID: Hello, thank you all so much
3 for the opportunity to speak today. Greetings to the
4 Chairs and all members of the present Committees. My
5 name is Musfika Moshahid, my pronouns are she, her,
6 hers and I'm here as the Muslim Women Civic
7 Empowerment Program coordinator at the Muslim
8 Community Network.

9 So, the Muslim women Civic Empowerment program is
10 an initiative that the Muslim Community Network has
11 recently started this fall to empower any Muslim
12 women uhm, Muslim women that are often marginalized,
13 excluded and erased with the resources, skills and
14 information needed to be more civically engaged,
15 self-empowered and aware of their rights.

16 Through the program, we facilitate skill and
17 confidence building workshops, connections to
18 services, networks and resources and advocate for the
19 creation of inclusive spaces for Muslim women in
20 public, private and faith institutions.

21 I'm here today to amplify the voices of the women
22 from our program who have demonstrated the need for
23 access to free healthcare. I mean, sorry, free
24 childcare and its significance in eliminating poverty
25

1 and allowing them to participate in the labor market
2 for economic and financial stability.
3

4 While we acknowledge and commend the state for
5 allocating \$4 billion to New York City childcare, we
6 want to emphasize the need for these funds to be
7 distributed across the city and not forgetting the
8 childcare needs of women in areas that have always
9 been forgotten or neglected. We therefore urge the
10 Chairs and the members of the Committees present here
11 today to ensure that the proposed taskforce
12 acknowledge the role that access to childcare plays
13 and getting women to be more active in all workplaces
14 but especially those deemed as nontraditional.

15 Free daycare is essential and crucial if we want
16 to see more inclusive work spaces. In interacting
17 with the first cohort of women in the program, we
18 learned that when women are given the chance to
19 harness their own agency and build their leadership
20 skills, their confidence increases and they're
21 empowered to participate in different sectors of
22 society and feel confident their ability is not just
23 for themselves but in assisting others and improving
24 society.
25

1 So, with that being said, more funding and
2
3 support is needed for programs like the Muslims
4 women's program, skill enhancement and training
5 programs and adult literacy programs. Many women in
6 our program didn't read or write in English or any
7 language for that matter, so more adult literacy
8 programs are necessary to empower women, so that they
9 can better participate in this type of work or in any
10 type of work or facet of society.

11 Our women's program served women who spoke in
12 many different languages and we realize that without
13 the language accommodation, our program would not
14 have been possible and as a result, we believe that
15 language access and language diversity is essential
16 to conducting outreach around these types of trade
17 jobs and any type of career advancement. If we want
18 to reach marginalized hard to reach communities of
19 women, such as women of color, immigrant women, we
20 need to ensure that all outreach efforts are
21 consistently, linguistically diverse and inclusive.

22 Additionally, we want to urge Council Members to
23 pass a bill to lift the limit on the number of
24 available permits and licenses that are given for
25 offenders, so that more women can have the

1
2 opportunity to legally operate their businesses and
3 feel empowered as entrepreneurs with permits and
4 licenses.

5 Some of the women we work with struggle
6 financially and can't make ends meet because they are
7 not able to obtain a license to continue their
8 business safely. So, women are powerful contributors
9 to society as we all know but they have to be
10 provided with the right resources such as free
11 childcare, more training programs, especially for
12 women and ending barriers like limits on available
13 permits and license.

14 Once again, thank you so much to all the Chairs
15 and members of the Committee and the members of the
16 Committees on Women and Gender Equity, Committee on
17 Civil Service, Labor and Economic Development for the
18 opportunity to testify on this important matter.

19 Thank you so much.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much Musfika.
21 We will now turn to Chair Cabán for questions for
22 this panel. Chair Cabán, you may begin.

23 CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Thank you and similar to the
24 last panel, not really a question but a comment. I
25 want to just extend my deepest gratitude for you know

1 for the testimony offered and particularly personally
2 for the work being done around queer BIPOC folks in
3 this work. As a queer Latino myself, I am all too
4 aware of the you know the numbers around
5 incarceration, homelessness, unemployment, barriers
6 to access to healthcare. Vastly disproportionate
7 affect BIPOC queer folks and I see union jobs as the
8 path out of all of those things. So, just deeply,
9 deeply appreciative for the work that you all are
10 doing. Thank you.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Cabán. I'm
13 going to now ask if there are any more questions from
14 Council Members. As a reminder, if Council Members
15 have questions for a particular panelist, they should
16 use the raise hand function in Zoom at this time.

17 Okay, seeing as there are no hands raised, I will
18 uhm, I'm going to do a last round call for any
19 participants that we have inadvertently missed
20 anyone. If you have registered to testify today and
21 you have not been called on, please use the Zoom
22 raise hand function now and you will be called on in
23 the order that your hand has been raised.

24 Okay, seeing as there is no hands raised, I will
25 now turn it over to the Chairs for closing remarks.

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 188

4 Chair De La Rosa, you may give your closing remarks.

5 Thank you all.

6 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you. I want to
7 thank my colleagues Chair Cabán and Farias for coming
8 together and helping us to create a much needed
9 platform as we work to ensure the diversity and
10 gender equity not only exists but are retained in the
11 trades. I want to thank – I want to take the moment
12 to also thank NEW, the Building and Construction
13 Trades Council, the Laborers Local 79, the District
14 Council of Carpenters, Pride at Work, and all of the
15 advocacy organizations that have joined us and the
16 workers who have shared their important testimony
17 with us today.

18 It is clear from this hearing that this City
19 Council has the power to invest in the expansion of
20 apprenticeship programs and as has already been noted
21 as a priority by our Speaker Adrienne Adams and our
22 budget response, we must also continue to work to
23 support all of the workers, especially those who have
24 been traditionally excluded. Women, trans and
25 nonbinary workers, BIPOC workers, and those who face
mounting obstacles for success.

As the Chair of the Civil Service and Labor
Committee, I look forward to supporting Intro. 179
presented by Council Member Moya as the way for us to
take a focused and deep dive in examining the role of
women in nontraditional workplaces. We also look
forward to working with the Adams Administration to
explore ways to expand pathways to employment
including the strengthening and expanding the use of
PLA's to guarantee union jobs in community
developments across our city.

Our committee staff will work together to follow-
up with the administrative agencies that joined us
today, so that we can receive timely responses to the
pointed and important questions asked by Council
Members. And we will distribute those response to
Committee members as they come in. Thank you all to
the staff who made today's hearing a success. We
can't wait to see the progress that will come out of
this important hearing.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair Cabán, do you have some
closing remarks?

CHAIRPERSON CABÁN: Sure, I will be incredibly
brief. I know it has been a long day and I am just
simply going to cosign everything that my fellow

1 Chair has just said. Thank my fellow Chairs, all the
2 Committee Staff, every single person who testified
3 but especially you know the workers who testified
4 about you know their very personal narratives and
5 intimate experiences because those are the ones that
6 are going to deeply, deeply inform the work that we
7 do. We are deeply committed to making sure that we
8 follow-up on every answer we did not get today and
9 look forward to continuing to working on these issues
10 together. So, really appreciate you all. Thanks.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Chair Farias, do
13 you have any closing remarks?

14 Okay, I'm going to just turn it back over to
15 Chair De La Rosa to adjourn the meeting.

16 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you all for coming
17 and the meeting is adjourned. [GAVEL] Thank you.
18 Bye.

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 23, 2022