

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE
Jointly with the
COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION
and
COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

----- X

May 10, 2022
Start: 9:07 a.m.
Recess: 4:09 p.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 1)

B E F O R E: Justin L. Brannan, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Diana Ayala
Charles Barron
Gale A. Brewer
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
David M. Carr
Amanda Farias
Kamillah Hanks
Crystal Hudson
Ari Kagan
Farah N. Louis
Francisco P. Moya
Chi A. Ossé
Keith Powers
Pierina Ana Sanchez
Marjorie Velázquez

Speaker Adrienne Adams
Vickie Paladino
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Julie Menin
Nantasha Williams
Keith Powers
Erik Bottcher
Rita Joseph
James Gennaro
Sandy Nurse
Lincoln Restler
Althea Stevens
Shekar Krishnan
Sandra Ung
Jennifer Gutiérrez
Shahana Hanif
Oswald Feliz
Linda Lee
Eric Dinowitz
Mercedes Narcisse
Amanda Farías
Lynn Schulman

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

David Banks
New York City Schools Chancellor

Nina Kubota
President and CEO New York City
School Construction Authority

Cora Liu
Vice President of Capital Plan
Management, School Construction
Authority

Dan Weisberg
First Deputy Chancellor Department
of Education

Lindsey Oates
Chief Financial Officer Department
of Education

Kevin Moran
Chief Schools Operations Officer
Department of Education

Carolyn Quintana
Deputy Chancellor Division of
Teaching and Learning
Opportunities Department of
Education

Camille Varlack
Senior Advisor Department of
Education

Jawana Johnson
Chief of School Culture, Climate
and Wellbeing Department of
Education

Jade Grieve

Chief of Student Pathways
Department of Education

Thomas Taratko
Chief Executive Officer, Office of
Space Management, Department of
Education

John Shea
Chief Executive Officer Division
of School Facilities Department of
Education

Anuraag Sharma, Chief Information
Officer Department of Education

Rebecca Rawlins
Chief Executive Office of District
Planning Department of Education

Cristina Melendez
Executive Director of Family and
Community Empowerment Department
of Education

Kenita Lloyd
Department of Education

Jessica Tisch
Commissioner, Department of
Sanitation

Bridget Anderson
Deputy Commissioner, Department of
Sanitation

Gregory Anderson, Deputy
Commissioner, Department of
Sanitation

Chief Javier Lohan, Acting Deputy
Commissioner for Financial

Management and Administration,
Department of Sanitation

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE

6

2 SERGEANT SADOWSKI: We are alive I'm just double
3 checking the live stream. Live stream is good at
4 this time we'll start just please start the
5 recordings. Once again at this time, will Sergeants
6 please start the recordings?

7 Thank you.

8 SERGEANT PÉREZ: Recording into the cloud all set.

9 SERGEANT SADOWSKI: Thank you and good morning
10 and welcome to today's remote New York City Council
11 physical 2023 Executive Budget hearing of the
12 Committee on Education, and then later the Committee
13 on Sanitation and Waste Management. At this time,
14 would all council members and staff please turn on
15 their video.

16 To minimize disruption please place electronic
17 devices on vibrate or silent mode. All public
18 testimony will be given on May 25 at 10 a.m. If you
19 would like to submit testimony, you may do so at
20 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Thank you for your
21 cooperation we are ready to begin.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Sergeant. Good
23 morning, and welcome to the third day of fiscal year
24 23 Executive Budget hearings. Today we'll hear from
25 the Department of Education and Sanitation as well as

the School Construction Authority. I am Councilman Justin Brannan. I have the privilege of chairing the Finance Committee of the City Council, and I'm joined today by Speaker Adams, as well as my Co-Chair for our first hearings. Councilmember Rita Joseph, Chair of the Education Committee.

The Department of Education's projected fiscal 23 budget of \$30.95 billion represents 31.1% of the city's proposed fiscal 23 budget in the executive plan. The D.O.E.'s fiscal 23 budget in the executive plan is \$612.5 million less than its fiscal 22 adopted budget, primarily due to the large amount of federal stimulus funds budgeted in fiscal 22.

Overall, D.O.E. has a \$7 billion in federal stimulus funding, with a large portion of the federal stimulus funds allocated to supporting existing long-term programs. The Executive Budget includes nearly \$515 million in fiscal 25 program... for programs that will require funding after federal funds expire in December of 24. It is uncertain how the city will account for the costs of these expanded programs in fiscal 26 and beyond. Additionally, the previous administration used federal stimulus funds to restore baseline cuts through fiscal 2024 only with \$90.6

million in restorations for fiscal 23 and fiscal 24. These cuts to the D.O.E. budget will resume in fiscal 25 with \$87.6 million in reductions, which will impact air conditioning, school supports, the Education and Equity Program, arts instruction and Health Ed works.

I welcome the Department of Education and the School Construction Authority being here today, and I'll be focusing my questions on unspent FY 22 federal spending, enrollment changes, and any associated budget cuts that may result in those enrollment changes, school accessibility and something I care about very much: vision and hearing care, especially for those students that may not have access to such services.

And finally, for the School Construction Authority, I will look into the S.C.A.'s review of suitable sites for new school buildings. I want to thank the Finance Division who has been working very, very hard behind the scenes to make these hearings possible, especially Chelsea Beytemur, Masis Sarkissian, Dohini Sompura, and my Senior Adviser John Yeddin[sp?], for preparing for today's hearing especially.

I also want to thank all the Council staff that's involved in putting together this hearing behind the scenes.

I am now going to turn to my colleague, Chair of the Education Committee Rita Joseph, to deliver her opening remarks.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you Chair Brannan. Good morning, everyone. Good morning and welcome to education committee's hearing on fiscal 2023 Executive Budget. We have been joined by Chancellor Banks, First Deputy Chancellor Dan Weisberg, and D.O.E. Financial Officer Lindsey Oates, who will testify on D.O.E.'s Executive Budget.

I want to thank Chair Brannan for his overview of the D.O.E.'s budget and the Executive Plan, and in the interest of time, I'll keep my remarks brief.

For the executive budget hearing, I would like to focus on redistribution of \$421 million in the federal stimulus funding for new chancellor priorities for which \$310 million is reallocated in fiscal 2023 and \$111 million is relocated in fiscal 2024. These reallocations have a net zero effect on D.O.E.'s overall federal funding amounts, but

represent a shift and what programs the funding supports.

For existing funding categories within the D.O.E.'s budget impacted the shift include operational supports, academic recovery, students supports, curriculum support and IT supports. These changes are meant to fund the following chancellor and administration priorities: bilingual education expansion, digital learning, pathways expansion, safe supportive, schools, Summer Rising, contracted nurses, gifted and talented, literacy and dyslexia, translation and interpretation, and parent and family engagement. While the council look forward to hearing more about these necessary programs, and D.O.E.'s implementation plan, we must ensure that these programs offer focus, support to most of our vulnerable student populations. Additionally, we look forward to hearing how these new initiatives differ from enhancing existing D.O.E. programs. Lastly, while the executive budget shifts existing federal dollars to support several Chancellor's priorities and programs, we are disappointed that the Executive Budget failed to allocate funding for items called for in the Council's Response to the Preliminary

Budget. This includes funding for social, school based mental health staff, a citywide expansion of restorative justice, pay parity for special education pre-K providers, pay parity for daycare directors, increased arts and music, per pupil allotments, and hiring of Office of Foster Care staff. I look forward to your testimony on these issues.

Some housekeeping: The committee may not get all of the questions or you may not have responses, so we'll send follow up letters for unanswered questions. I will now turn to the Committee Counsel to Swain members of the Administration. Thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you chairs. Madam Speaker, did you want to say anything before we swear in the administration?

SPEAKER ADAMS: I will hold my questions for that time. Thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay, thank you. Okay, thank you, Chairs Brannan and Joseph, and Madam Speaker. Good morning, everyone, and welcome to the first agency hearing for May 10, The New York City Department of Education and the School Construction Authority. My name is Malcom Budehorn and I am Counsel to the Finance Committee.

I would first like to acknowledge council members present for the record. We are joined this morning by Council Members, Schulman, Brannan, Joseph, Farias, Narcisse, Dinowitz, Velázquez, Lee, Feliz, Brewer, Paladino, Gennaro, Hanif, Kagan, Louis, and Brooks-Powers.

Unlike in past council members and members of the mayoral administration will have the ability to mute and unmute themselves. When not speaking, we please ask that you remember to mute yourself. If people forget to do so and we hear background noise we will just go ahead and mute, you but remember, you will be able to unmute yourself in the future.

Council members who have questions should use the raise hand function in zoom. You will be called on in the order with which you raised your hand. And please remember that we have five minutes for the clock. We do have other agencies testifying today. So please listen for the cue from the Sergeant At Arms.

The following members of the administration are here to testify and/or answer your questions. David Banks, New York City Schools Chancellor, Nina Kubota, President and CEO New York City School Construction

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE

13

2 Authority, Cora Liu, Vice President of Capital Plan
3 Management, School Construction Authority, and from
4 the Department of Education, Dan Weisberg, First
5 Deputy Chancellor, Lindsey Oates Chief Financial
6 Officer, Kevin Moran, Chief Schools Operations
7 Officer, Carolyne Quintana, Deputy Chancellor
8 Division of Teaching and Learning Opportunities,
9 Camille Varlack, Senior Advisor, Jawana Johnson,
10 Chief of School Culture, Climate and Wellbeing, Jade
11 Grieve, Chief of Student Pathways, Thomas Taratko
12 Chief Executive Officer, Office of Space Management,
13 John Shea, Chief Executive Officer Division of School
14 Facilities, Anuraag Sharma, Chief Information
15 Officer, Rebecca Rawlins, Chief Executive Office of
16 District Planning, Cristina Melendez, Executive
17 Director of Family and Community Empowerment, and can
18 Kenita Lloyd.

19 I will first read the oath and after I will call
20 on each member from the administration individually
21 to respond. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
22 whole truth and nothing but the truth before these
23 committees and to respond honestly to council member
24 questions? Chancellor Banks?

25 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yes.

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE 14

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: President Kubota?

3 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: I do.

4 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Vice President Liu?

5 VICE PRESIDENT LIU: I do.

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: First Deputy Chancellor

7 Weisberg?

8 FIRST DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: I do.

9 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CFO Oates?

10 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: I do.

11 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chief Schools Operations

12 Officer Moran?

13 CHIEF OPERATIONS OFFICER MORAN: I do.

14 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Chancellor Quintana?

15 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: I do.

16 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Senior Advisor Varlack?

17 SENIOR ADVISOR VARLACK: I do.

18 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chief Johnson?

19 CHANCELOR BANKS: Not here at the moment.

20 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay. Chief Grieve?

21 CHIEF GRIEVE: I do.

22 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CEO Taratko?

23 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TARATKO: I do.

24 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CEO Shea?

25 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER SHEA: I do.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CIO Sharma?

CHIEF INFORMATION OFFICER SHARMA: I do.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CEO Rollins?

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER ROLLINS: I do.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Chancellor Lloyd? I saw you on the Zoom. Okay, we tried.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: She did respond.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: We'll try it one more time. Okay.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Can you see her now?

(background voices).

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Well, if you do answer any questions, just say "Yes, you do", before you speak.

Chancellor Banks, you can begin when ready.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you. And first of all I wanted to say Good morning to Madam Speaker, Adrienne Adams. I didn't realize he would be here with us this morning. Always good to see you. And good morning Chair Brannan, Chair Joseph, and all the members of the Finance and Education Committees.

We're here today. I'm pleased to join you all, along with several members of my team. I think you've pretty much mentioned all of our senior leadership and the key members of our team who are joining us

here today. We work together as a team. And in the course of this conversation today, many of them I will call on to help support me in answering any of the questions that you have. But thank you for the opportunity to testify about the mayor's Executive Budget for New York City public schools.

Before I begin, I would like to express my deepest thanks to this council for your partnership, advocacy and insight. Your dedication to our city's children is truly inspiring. And as I've said before, we're committed to working with you all hand in hand as partners, real partners, and improving the educational experience for all of our students. The council has been instrumental in securing funding through the American Rescue Plan act, that is helping our school communities to rebound from all the disruptions caused by this terrible pandemic. We've expanded P.S.A.L. so that students across the system have access to sports teams, and we're in the process of hiring dedicated staff for the first time ever to the office was a students in foster care. We're very excited about that.

The Council's partnership has also helped to provide the resources needed to ensure that every

school from every zip code receives funding to hire a full-time social worker. And with direct funding from The Council, we're also expanding language access, mental health services, community schools, and community access to school playgrounds. These are a lot of vital successes that we have accomplished really working together. Since I was last here with you almost two months ago, I've continued to visit schools across all five boroughs. And I've been so impressed at how our students are bouncing back academically and socially through the hands-on support and dedication of our educators.

Returning to face to face learning has restored a sense of normalcy in our classrooms, which you can see in the joy expressed in the faces of our students. You can really feel the sense of excitement and energy as you walk through our buildings. I visited over 40 schools in the four months that I've been in office, and it has really been just very inspiring to see our young people as they are back in the routine of being back in schools.

So one powerful indicator of that renewed enthusiasm is the overwhelming response to this year's Summer Rising program. Summer Rising will be

jointly administered by the DOE and DYCD, connecting 110,000 elementary and middle school students to fun, culturally relevant hands-on experiences to strengthen their academic, social and emotional skills. This is a real opportunity for students to sustain the joy of learning after the regular school year ends with rigorous academic programming while also experiencing all that our city has to offer beyond the classroom walls. We're prioritizing students in temporary housing and students with 12 month IEPs to ensure equitable access to this program, and we're really thrilled by the immense response. To date, we have almost 90,000 of our youngsters that have registered with their families.

We also recently announced the expansion of our Gifted and Talented Program is an important step that as a result of listening to what our parents wanted. We added 100 kindergarten seats and 1,000 third grade seats, expanding both entry points to all districts. And through this expansion, and updates to the admissions process, the city's Gifted and Talented program will serve every school district citywide for the first time, providing more opportunities for accelerated learning to even more families. At the

same time, we'll be implementing a much more equitable process than in the past to identify students who will most benefit from this accelerated learning opportunity. These expansions of Summer Rising and G&T are products of community engagement that we organize with families across the city. We've been listening. Our commitment to real community partnership doesn't begin and end with Gifted And Talented. We're going to bring the same level of deep real parent engagement to improving the quality of education of every school in every neighborhood. As I've said before, engagement is not a slogan for me. It is in my DNA, and it's something that we take seriously, day in and day out.

So let me turn now to the details of the mayor's Executive Budget. The Department of Education 2023 budget totals \$37.6 billion, which includes \$31 billion in operating expenses. Our funding is a combination of city state and federal resources, with city tax levy money making up the largest share at 54%, state funds at 36%, and federal dollars at 10%. To 2023 Executive Budget reflects a real reallocation of a portion of the federal Coronavirus aid provided through the Coronavirus Response and Relief

Supplemental Appropriations Act and the American Rescue Plan aligned with the priorities of the Adams administration. We plan to spend over \$3 billion of stimulus dollars in fiscal year 2022, and we're working with OMB to ensure the adopted budget reflects our final spending projections. \$2 billion of this funding has already been spent, including \$500 million in the last two months alone. We expect spending to continue apace this year, including significant payments for goods and services received in FY 2022 but not invoiced or paid until the summer.

I want to reassure the council and the public that federal funding is available over the next several years. Anything not spent this year as a result of pandemic-related supply chain and staffing challenges, is available to support our work next year. The investments in this budget reflect an advanced vision for the Department of Education that you have previously heard me put forward. I believe that for our schools to deliver on the original promise of serving as the engine of the American dream, we need to do things very differently in ways that build trust among our families and school communities one big step at a time.

Our schools need to connect with our students to the real world and what matters to them. I want to say that again: Our schools need to connect our students to the real world, and what matters to them. Preparing each and every one of our students to graduate with a pathway to a rewarding career, long term economic security, and equipped to be a positive force for change.

Together with Mayor Adams, our vision for our schools is built on four pillars that this budget makes real investments in. Number one, the first pillar is reimagining the student experience, which means redesigning what happens in our schools to be relevant and exciting to our students, while providing them with the skills and knowledge that are attractive ultimately to employers. This starts with our \$33 million investment in Pathways Expansion to improve economic mobility and security for all New York City public school students. There'll be more to come on that in the coming days. Our pathways expansion efforts will build on the effective programs we already have in place, such as the Thomas Edison CTE High School in Queens, which provides

training in fields like engineering and medicine to prepare students for life after high school.

Another way that our budget is reimagining the student experience is better supporting students with print based disabilities, including dyslexia. And there'll be more to come on that in the coming days as well.

Finally, and acknowledging the importance of 21st century learning, and building on what we learned during the pandemic we will enhance digital experiences across the system. That effort will also increase access to in-demand coursework, while further supporting students who face challenges in attending school in person. We've been listening to our parents and our families.

Number two, the second pillar, which we call scaling, sustaining, and restoring what works. And that entails identifying amazing practices throughout our system, and sharing them so that they become models that other schools can emulate.

In addition to our expanded Summer Rising and gifted and talented programs, we're enhancing bilingual education. Bilingual Education is the favorite program model for supporting the long term

success of English language learners that we hold to the same high expectations as all of our other students. Our plan includes strengthening and sustaining the quality of existing bilingual education programs, opening or growing 50 bilingual education programs in 2023. Supporting district wide planning to ensure a pathway to multilingualism for every student. And in order to accomplish this, we'll be investing in purchasing and developing curriculum and materials in students home languages, recruiting, training and staffing high quality certified bilingual teacher candidates, empowering families of multilingual learners, with resources to enable them to make informed decisions about bilingual education to increase awareness of bilingual program options and benefits, and also ongoing professional learning, program design and implementation support for school leaders and staff.

We have so many amazing practices throughout our system to hold up and share so they can be more broadly emulated. For example, Mark Erlenwein. He's the principal of Staten Island Technical High School. Just last week, he was honored as the New York State Secondary School Principal of the Year, in part for

encouraging students to have opportunities to redo some of their learning, versus relentlessly being pushed forward and wondering how to catch up. It's called Mastery Learning, and it's something that we want to study and have him share with schools all across the city. That approach of creating second and third chances cultivates perseverance and deeper learning. And another example is the Brooklyn Occupational Training Center, a district 75 school, which has continually innovated to engage students with wide ranging learning needs in a quality civics education. The teacher Matt Gorun[sp?], he has adapted participatory budgeting resources to engage students through big circle mapping, which allows verbal and nonverbal students to graphically represent their ideas and engage in discussion, debate, and to show support for each other.

So just want to tell you good things are happening in our schools. And we want to use technology to capture these practices in a way that makes sense for school principals to help better share best practices, and enable schools to collaborate, we're planning to create an app that school leaders and teachers can easily access from

their phone or desktop. We will ensure that principals are able to give feedback and partner with us before any future rollout of this technology.

The third pillar is prioritizing wellness. Because students who feel healthy, safe, well-nourished, and intellectually stimulated, are best able to concentrate and engage with their academic work. Safety has been at the forefront for too many of our students. So to that end, under this budget, our schools will contract with community based organizations that specialize in violence interruption programming, which empowers and equips young people with the tools that they need to make positive choices for themselves, and to uplift pro social development pathways as an alternative to violence. These strategies include social and emotional support for students, violence interruption techniques, like de-escalation, mediation, conflict resolution, and extended learning opportunities to ensure that students feel safe, supported and empowered in their school communities. And given that the pandemic is by no means over, we are also going to continue to strive to ensure that all of our schools continue to have nurse coverage in 2023.

And finally, without respect to our fourth pillar, engaging families to be our true partners. One of our top budget priorities for this year is to enhance our Family and Community Engagement Office by hiring community coordinators from underrepresented groups. We want to make sure that we're reaching families that we have rarely heard from in the past, and elevate their voices. Since approximately 40% of New York City Public Schools families speak a language other than English at home, we are also investing in improving response time for families requesting translation and interpretation services. We also know how important it is for students to see themselves in our curriculum. We've been hard at work building a more inclusive curriculum, and there will be more to come very soon when highlighting our AAPI curriculum work. Once details are finalized, we'll welcome the City Council to Tweet to share in that announcement, one of the work ahead.

Many of these investments are not only D.O.E. priorities, but outgrowth of conversations and collaborations with all of you as the City Council, as well as other stakeholders. We are acting on our promise to not only engage with this Council, but

directly incorporate your feedback and hoping to shape our budgetary and policy decisions. That is the true partnership that we will continue to nurture.

In conclusion, these investments will build on the progress that we have begun to make in rebuilding the trust of our families, and further excite them about sending their children to our schools. Be clear, we have lost 120,000 students over the last five years, and we have to do everything we can to give our families a reason to stay in our public schools.

So again, I want to underscore that we deeply appreciate the vital role that the council plays in working with the mayor, OMB, DOE and the various stakeholders in shaping this final budget. Together, we're creating a budget that advances the needs and priorities of our students and families. So I want to thank you. We're here to answer any of your questions.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: We're also now turning to our opening statement from SCA President CEO Nina Kubota.

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you. Thank you very much. Good morning Speaker Adams, Chairs Brannan and Joseph, and members of the Finance and Education

Committees. My name is Nina Kubota, and I am the President and CEO of the New York City School Construction Authority. In addition to our colleagues at the DOD, I'm joined by Cora Liu, Vice President of Capital Plan Management for the SBA.

We are pleased to be here today to discuss the February 2022 proposed amendment to the current FY 2020 to 2024 five-year capital plan. We thank the Council for their openness and have enjoyed the dialogue we have been able to share since the beginning of January. The council's participation and partnership has always been critical to the success of our projects and our schools, and we look forward to building upon our strong spirit of collaboration.

When I was last before you in March, we highlighted how the SCA operates on a fixed five-year capital plan with yearly amendments as set forth in our enabling legislation, and talk through what makes up the overall structure and implementation of our plan. The February 2022 proposed amendment to the fiscal year 2020 to 2024 plan totals \$20.6 billion and is the largest capital plan in our history.

The funding breaks down as follows: The capacity program, totaling \$9.84 billion, the capital investment category, with \$7.26 billion and finally our mandated program at \$3.51 billion. Since we last spoke, I'm happy to report that our proposed February amendment was approved by the Panel for Educational Policy on April 27, and will be part of the city's budget that this council reviews and adopts by June 30. We continue to work day in and day out to fulfill the city's commitment of adding 60,000 seats. Through the new capacity program, we are on our way to identifying locations for all new seats funded in this plan. Since February, we have sited in additional four projects, with over 1500 seats. Of the 45,883 seats to be constructed through the new capacity program, there are 25,525 seats already in progress and another roughly 5400 currently in the pipeline. That means we are two thirds of the way toward identifying these needed seats.

Additionally, we continue to make substantial progress in the creation of seats through our other capacity programs. We have four projects that are in process as part of the replacement program. A PSIS is located at 3761 10th Avenue in Manhattan, PS163 in

the Bronx, PS47 in Queens and a D75. School located at Willowbrook Avenue in Staten Island.

Through the class size reduction program, there are two currently two projects underway, one at Medgar Evers in Brooklyn, and another at the Harbor School located on Governors Island that will receive additional seats to alleviate overcrowding in the schools that otherwise would not have seen this investment, as they are located in an area without funded new capacity program C need. Through the class size reduction program, we are able to provide relief to these schools.

While the addition project at PS 96 and Queens was the first project to be funded from newly created a program to add capacity to support the removal of TCUs, it certainly won't be the last. We have several more that we are developing plans for and are looking forward to sharing them with The Council and the public as soon as we can. Due to the decline in enrollment and birth rate, we were able to shift funding that was previously dedicated for the new capacity program to other capacity programs I highlighted: Class size reduction, replacement, and capacity to support the removal of TCUs. Through

these expanded programs, as a result of the shift in funding, we will create about 14,000 seats bringing our total number of seats created to approximately 60,000. Last year, we received over \$800 million to support the Early Education Initiatives which sought to expand 3K citywide as well as upgrade certain Early Learning Centers as part of the ACS transfer of a number of sites into the DOE portfolio. This September, we are scheduled to open over 2900 3K seats at 23 sites across all five boroughs.

While creating seats is a vital part of what we do. We cannot forget that 200 of our buildings are over 100 years old, and the majority of our buildings are over 50 years old. The plan directs a total of \$7.26 billion for capital investments. The capital investment portion of the plan includes two main categories \$3.27 for the capital improvement program, which includes building upgrades and necessary capital repairs, such as roof and facade work, structural repairs, and safeguarding our buildings against water infiltration, and \$2.81 billion for school enhancement projects, which funds the realignment of existing facilities to better suit instructional needs, along with bathroom upgrades,

science labs, accessibility, and other necessary improvements. Every year, we make progress on removing TCUs. This plan dedicates \$352 million for the ongoing removal of these units, with dedicated capacity funding allocated to construct the needed seats to allow for the removal of the TCUs. As of the February amendment, we removed 266 of the original 354, and developed plans to remove an additional 45 units. Since February, we have identified the path for the removal of 10 more TCUs at three sites, now leaving us with a total of 33 TCUs located at 11 sites.

The mandated program category with \$3.51 billion allocated includes approximately \$650 million for boiler conversions in buildings currently using number four oil. The remaining funds are assigned to cover other required costs such as code and local law compliance, the SCAs wrap-up insurance, and completion of projects from the prior plan. Many factors contribute to the successes we have experienced in implementing our capital plans, but one of our strongest core values is our commitment to our MWBE contractors. The SCA is continually developing a larger and more diverse group of

contractors who can bid on our work and complete large and complicated projects.

We have been incredibly successful in increasing the participation of minority owned businesses. In this plan so far, the SCA has obligated over \$955 million in prime contractor obligations, and \$884 million in subcontractor awards to MWBE firms. Our mentor program seeks to cultivate smaller MWBE firms by providing them with the skills and experience needed to develop and grow within the construction industry, and to establish long-term business relationships with the SCA. We currently have 150 firms in our mentor program, and roughly 85% of those firms have won contracts. We intend to award over \$100 million in our mentor program to small contractors by the end of the fiscal year. We are incredibly proud of our accomplishments. We continue to identify more ways to build on these successes.

As a way to further support and develop our mentor firms, our maximum contract value that they will be able to bid on will increase to \$3 million in July. Once again, I can't overstate the importance of the partnership between the City Council, the SCA, and the DOE. Our collaborative relationship is vital

to the successful implementation of our capital plan that directly provides the state-of-the-art educational facilities that our students need to succeed. I thank you for allowing me to testify before you today. And I along with my colleagues at the Department of Education will be happy to answer any questions you may have. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you so much. President Kubota and Chancellor Banks. Before we get into questions from the committee, I want to hand it over to Speaker Adams.

SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much, Chair Brannan and good morning. Thank you Chair Joseph. Good morning to Chancellor Banks. Good to see you always. Good morning, President Kubota. Very glad to see you as well. And all of the teams and representatives of DOE and SCA. Good morning to all of you and to my colleagues as well.

I know that my colleagues have a lot of questions for you this morning. Mine have to do with something very, very specific and a concern dealing with community schools right now.

In 2021, the Coalition for Community Schools excellence advocated for the Office of Community

Schools within the DOE to revise the community school funding model in a way that would ensure equity on the average community school allocations. In June 2021, the D.O.E. released a new community school RFP and CBOs were notified about their new contract rates. The funding formula was adjusted from the prior solicitation in a way that increased the amounts for smaller schools that were in need of considerable support. However, the formula also decreased the awarded amounts to larger schools and campuses that were in need of support. In total 52 Community Schools were impacted by the shifting to funding in the RFP, including Richmond Hill High School in my district, which received \$400,000 less in this RFP. This school is vital to my community, and just because it's a largest school, it shouldn't be subjected to a formula that arbitrarily impacts their ability to deliver services to its students. To the Council, the importance of continuing to fund larger community schools was clear. We negotiated a \$9.16 million one-year restoration in fiscal 2022 to bring 52 Community Schools back to their pre RFP contract levels. Sadly, however, the Administration did not baseline this funding for the upcoming fiscal

year. So my question... my first question is: How was the formula to fund Community Schools determined? And why didn't the D.O.E. advocate for more funding for the RFP that allowed smaller schools to receive their resources, while not impacting larger schools and their historical funding?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Uh, I appreciate the... appreciate the question, Madam Speaker. I'm going to have... CFO Lindsay, you want to... you want to take a stab at that, please?

Lindsay?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Thank you, can you hear me?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yes.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Great. So thank you, Speaker Adams for the question. We have been... last year (audio fades out)

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Actually, Lindsay, you're we've you started out strong. And that totally faded out?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Oh. Can you hear me now?

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: That's better.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Yes. Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Chair Brannan. So thank you, again, Council, for the increased resources that we received this fiscal year in order to provide additional supports to the Community Schools Program. As we committed to at the time, that was meant to increase values to schools as part... that were awarded as part of the repeat of the system in fiscal year 21, and fiscal year 22. And we appreciate the interest in this program. And we were happy to have the resources available this year. I think we're continuing to look at the right sizing of the school budgets... or excuse me, the community school budgets going forward, and want to make sure, I think most importantly, that community schools across the system receive equitable funding. And that's what the original Community Schools RFP funding model was meant to support. And I can let Dr. Johnson speak to the future of the program.

CHIEF JOHNSON: Good morning. Thank you. Thank you again, Chair, for the question.

So where we are right now is we are actually looking to expand with the Community Schools initiative to increase an additional 40 schools to

really bring the number to well over 400. One of the things that we know is that historically, schools have used... we've utilized various funding sources in order to be able to fund community schools. And prior to the equitable funding formula, we had community schools that ranged from an annual budget of \$83,000, to schools that had budgets that were well over \$900,000. And so the equitable formula was seeking to really ensure that we were able to provide greater resources and greater support for those schools that really were underserved. As we think about that, the adjustment, there were 90... there were well over 90 schools that were also able to really get to closer to sustainable funding. There was a RAND report that was released that really advocated for the effectiveness of community schools with a greater amount of resources. And so we were incredibly thankful for the Council for being able to be able to provide the restoration funding last year to really enable the schools that received an adjustment to be able to transition into the new formula. And so we look forward to continuing to work in partnership with the Council to really figure out ways to explore the best... best allocation and then

the best source of resources to support community schools to ensure that we are best able to meet the needs of our students and families within these communities. Thank you.

SPEAKER ADAMS: I appreciate the response. But still getting to the core of my question, how did the DOE envision the larger schools to serve students with less resources, and did the do we provide any guidance on what programs and services could be reduced for the schools receiving less funding under the new RFP?

CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you chair. So in the original in the original allocation, schools received the prior... the prior budget. And so when they got the prior budget, they... they realized that there would be a shortfall. So restoration funding was really offered as a transitional source of funding to allow for CBO partners to really think about how can we reconfigure, and how could we reimagine what the programming would look like with a different set of resources? So the guidance was... initially when the funding was... was adjusted, here was what your new funding formula will be. And we understood that the timing for that was not ideal. And so the restoration

funding the city council was able to provide enabled CBOs to think about in this year, how do we adjust and transition for... transition our funding formula?

How do we transition our services to really be able to move more strategically? I will also say that by doing so... by making this adjustment, we were again, able to fund additional... additional schools to

provide them with additional resources. We are also able to engage in the expansion to increase the number of access to more students and more families,

SPEAKER ADAMS: we're actually going to lose a lot of services, and we're actually going to take away a lot of vital services in our schools by decreasing this funding. It's going to have a tremendous impact not just on a school in my district that I know of, but I'm sure in schools across the city. So it has the D.O.E. considered amending the RFP awards in FY 2023 with an additional \$9.2 million so that schools are able to remain whole for another year? And actually have the opportunity to further plan on how to provide services at a lower contract value beginning in FY 2024?

CHIEF JOHNSON: Thanks again for the question. At this point, we are exploring all different types of

financial resources and look forward to working closely with the with the Council to figure out if there are any additional options that we can explore.

SPEAKER ADAMS: I think that my suggestion is a good one. Again, a lot of students are going to be impacted by a tremendous shortfall. For one school alone, we're talking almost a half million dollars, and it will dramatically affect students and their care in our schools across the city. So I'm going to let my colleagues get in. I don't want to belabor that. But it is extremely important that we consider options for this.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: And I'm glad that you raise it Madam... Madam Chair. So is duly noted. And we will we will follow up on this right away.

SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much, Chancellor. Thank you, chairs.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Speaker. Before we get into further questions, I... I know it's going to be a long day. The committee may not get to all the questions, or D.O.E. may not have sufficient responses, although we hope that's not the case. But we will follow we will follow up with a letter for any of the unanswered questions that we'd like to get

back ASAP so it'll help in our in our budget negotiation.

Okay, I'm gonna get moving right into the unspent federal funding and the ARPA deadline. So the D.O.E.'s fiscal 22 budget includes \$2.57 billion in federal stimulus funding for short-term recovery efforts, such as academic recovery and operational supports. Additionally, the budget recognizes \$528 million in federal stimulus funded long term expansions. Has D.O.E. spent all of this funding in FY 22, and if not, how much of this funding remains unspent and for what programs and supports?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Lindsay

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: (inaudible)

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Lindsay, we can't hear you.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Can you hear me better now?

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Not really.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: It sounds like on your microphone or something.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Can you hear me better now?

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: It sounds like you're deep in a tunnel.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: It's not changing.

3 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: It could be your headphones.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Go ahead. Just...

5 Just talk.

6 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Can you hear me?

7 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Yes, we can clearly.

8 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: So thank you,
9 Chair Brannan, for the question we have... I really
10 appreciate the opportunity to talk through this
11 issue. So as we all know, we're super grateful for
12 the additional funding that we've received from the
13 federal government. And we have been funding this
14 funding throughout the school year, we're going to
15 continue to spend this through the rest of this
16 fiscal year. And we have several months left in the
17 fiscal year to continue the spending. And I think
18 that there have been some numbers that the
19 comptroller's office has shared recently about our
20 stimulus spending. And I think it's important to
21 reflect on... that of our, you know, over \$3 billion
22 that we have in fiscal year 23, err on the side of
23 funding. And again, there are reasons why there have
24 been a slow, slow starts to the spending of that
25 funding. We've had some staffing challenges, we've

had some programs that started later, and this administration has really taken a close look at the stimulus plan that were in place, and have wanted to make sure that the spending aligns with their priorities. A lot of these things have been issues that have been reported nationally in other school districts and the challenges that are facing similar things, not the least of which is the worldwide supply chain issues. And the way that that plays out in actual spending is that items are delayed in delivering, as many of us have experienced in our personal lives. So you may have bought a piece of equipment or furniture for your school in October, it may not yet have been delivered. We can't actually pay the bill until the item has been delivered, which means that spending is delayed because of the delays in delivery on a lot of those items. So that's why some of the trends may seem like they're low. Right now, we've spent about 60% of our stimulus budget. And like I said, we're continuing to spend every day. We've spent an additional \$500 million since the controller's office issued their report with their snapshot data. The good thing is, is that at the end of this fiscal year, if there is underspending, we

don't lose that money. That funding is available to us. And we'll work with OMB to move that funding from fiscal year 22 to fiscal year 23, just like we would with any other federal grants or any other grants that span multiple years. So that funding, would we determine if there is any underspending and what that value is? We'll get moved from fiscal year 22 To 23 to support other programs.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. I appreciate that. I mean, obviously, the reason why I'm asking is because the council has... has plenty of suggestions for how to spend that money. So can the D.O.E. rollover some of these unspent funds into fiscal 23 to support some of the priorities that we outlined in our preliminary budget response?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Absolutely, we can. And we'd certainly love to hear, you know, some of the suggestions from the Council as well. We always... we welcome that. As we said, we're looking to be real partners with you, but it absolutely can be rolled over, so that sense of urgency is not there. We... we don't intend to leave a funds unspent. That is not what we're doing. It's just a delay in the process as our CFO just explained.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. So something that's... that's near, dear, and personal to me is arts and music instruction in our public schools. Can the DOE use any of the unspent stimulus funds to support a minimum allocation of \$100 per student for core arts instruction programming?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Can you hear me.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yup, for now.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Okay. Sorry for the technical difficulties, I apologize. You would think after two and a half years of doing this, we would have it down. So in terms of arts funding, we're happy to review your proposal that was in your pulmonary budget response in more detail. In the meantime, what we have done with stimulus funding, is we have prioritized arts in the stimulus plan. The academic recovery allocations that went directly to schools, which was a \$350 million allocation requires 25% of that funding is spent directly on arts enrichment programming. And we've also have been working strategically with our office of supplier diversity to make sure that schools know what _____ programs are available in that space to make sure

that they can utilize that funding on their new E vendors, in addition to other vendors. And so those are things that we've been doing. In addition, you have us stimulus score of \$15 million reduction into the arts budget, which has been critical to getting post pandemic, or during pandemic arts programs back in schools, and we will continue to review opportunities going forward.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, we're pushing for the minimum allocation of \$100 per student because I know coming from a family of teachers, if they're given money, they're going to spend it on what they think is most important. If it's earmarked specifically for arts and music than it has to be used for arts and music, which is why we're... we're serious about that. So the ARPA in particular must be obligated by December 31 of 24. So how much in ARPA funding has been... has the D.O.E. allocated so far?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Give me one second while I get that number. So our ARPA allocation has... we've allocated about a billion dollars, I believe, of the ARPA funding.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: You said one 1 billion with
3 a B.

4 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Yes, sir.

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. And how much of the
6 ARPA funds have been spent and how much is allocated
7 in FY 23 in the out years?

8 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: The final, so...
9 Well, in the out years, we're continuing to finalize
10 how the budget will sort of work itself out. The
11 SRSA funding source, which is the earlier stimulus
12 allocation from the federal government that you may
13 be familiar with actually expires before the ARPA
14 funding. And so we've been strategically trying to
15 ensure that we are using the SRSA allocations first,
16 because they expire at the end of fiscal year 23. And
17 so, as we are strategically aligning those funds,
18 we're prioritizing those first because ARPA will last
19 a little bit longer.

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, you... you mentioned
21 a percentage before you said 60% had been spent, what
22 is... of what? What funding is that?

23 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Thanks for asking
24 me to clarify. 60% of the fiscal year 22, total SRSA
25

and ARPA allocations. So the federal education stimulus allocations.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Okay, I want to I want to move quickly but efficiently here.

So mid-year adjustment and enrollment change. So I'm interested to know what guidance D.O.E. has given schools regarding budget cuts. The FY 21 prelim budget identified a savings associated with enrollment decline totaling \$375 million in FY 23, and in the out years, offset by \$160 million in federal stimulus funding. So what guidance is D.O.E. given schools regarding right-sizing budgets in terms of cutting vacancies or personnel, or what programs or categories of funding might be exempt from a budget cut?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: So thank you, sir, for the question. We announced this plan with the Mayor in the middle of February, as you know, in the Preliminary Budget, and that's actually the earliest we've been able to announce to schools that we have information around their next year's budgets in terms of the whole timelines. And so as we move towards what we call our initial school budget allocations, which we are hopefully will come out in

the next few weeks, we will be providing additional information to schools around how to support... how they can be supported through their... these enrollment related reductions. And again, we're really grateful to have the federal stimulus funding to offset and give schools the time to right-size their operations to support the students that they have in their buildings now, and we'll share more information with schools as we usually do in the next couple of weeks around hiring and what the details of their budget are.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Generally, and this is somewhat related... Generally speaking, what... what are what are we doing to reduce classroom size?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yes, thank you. I'm sorry. I'm trying to go on mute... off mute... coming back and forth.

We've been spending a lot of time talking about that. We've been having a number of meetings with the UFT, Michael Mulgrew, having these conversations. Our First Deputy has been kind of leading the charge here, Dan Weisberg. Dan, do you want to speak to that?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Yeah, thanks very much, Chancellor. Thank you, Mr. Chairman. The first thing I'm... we're doing a number of things. I would say, Chair, that on the capital side, President Kubota could can talk about... or she's already mentioned in her opening remarks, but certainly can speak more specifically about the additional classrooms that we're building. There's basically two things you can do to lower class size. One is build more classrooms. The other is hire more teachers. We're doing both. On the human capital side, we... we have seen class size reduced this past year by over 6%. That's not happenstance. So the... the ability through... through you and a lot of people on this... this hearing to advocate for 100% funding of the fair student funding formula has had a huge impact. That has translated into, you know, the... that's hundreds of millions of dollars going directly out to schools, most of which -- and Lizzy will check me on this -- most of which is going to hire additional teachers. And so what we've seen over the last five years is, even though as the Chancellor pointed out in his opening remarks, we have 120,000, fewer students, we actually have more teachers during

that time. And a lot of that is due to fully funding the Fair Student Funding Formula. So we have also gotten direct help from the Council, which we are very grateful for, to allow us to further reduce class size, and we are seeing this happen across the city with lower class sizes. And that doesn't mean that we don't still have some classes, that should be smaller. And we're going to continue to work on this as the Chancellor said, with UFT and our labor partners and others, but we are making significant progress, both because we're building more classrooms in places where they need it, and because we are hiring and retaining more teachers.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I appreciate that. What's... the Council... obviously, it's a priority of the Council, the Speaker, and we want to support you however we can in making that happen. We're all on the same page. Is there is there a goal that.. that the D.O.E. has with regard to reducing classroom size? Whether it's online or... (crosstalk)

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: There is a... you know, we have contractual class size limits, which obviously we are we are bound to abide by. The SCA has utilization data that we look at very, very

closely in conjunction with SCA. So, you know, we... we don't have specific numerical targets at this point. But, but we do want to see in general, that each of our students ultimately is getting a good personalized experience.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I think it would be helpful to have some sort of goal, I mean, even if it was an ambitious one, or an aspirational one, you know, that we can work towards and, you know, we can keep ourselves honest and check ourselves and how we're doing as far as progress. You know, one of the things anecdotally... you know, I want our public schools to be the best in town, for there to be no other. You know... and this is coming from the son of a Catholic school teacher. So I want our public schools to be the best in town, and that to be the... the obvious option, the number one choice for folks. And I think what we're hearing, certainly through COVID, is what... you know, we're losing parents, because they... you know, just outside the city, they can, you know, have a Little House on the Prairie classroom. I understand that's outside the city, but I think it's something we should be working towards. So we want to be partners in that. So...

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yup. Yeah, we look forward to working with you on it as well, right? You know, there are a number of priorities. Safety is key, lower class size, but there's also a lot of research that says, you know, you've got to increase teacher quality. So that's a huge part of the focus that we'll be leaning in on as well. The reality is that you can reduce class size, but if you don't have a quality teacher in the classroom, it doesn't matter how small the class size actually is. So we got to do all of it. We've got to do it all together. And we continue... we'll continue to work with all of you and the Council on this. It's a priority for us as well.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, I want to I have just a couple more, and then I want to hand it over to Chair Joseph. So with regard to... to school accessibility and reaching maximum practical accessibility, in the follow up to the preliminary budget hearing, the DOE stated that it would take approximately \$4 billion over 20 years. Can the administration commit to appropriating the necessary level of funding in the capital commitment plan?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: I believe we've I believe we also have here... I believe we have Tom is with us, Tom Taratko. Tom, do you want to speak to that?

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TARATKO: Thank you, Chancellor, and thanks for the question . Well, I can't, uh, personally answer the... the commitment funding question. But I can tell you that with, I believe it's about 503 buildings that are... don't have any accessible option right now, and with the historic data that we've had, through this plan, doing 57 full accessibility projects to date, and the money that we spent on that, we projected that out to try to get a guesstimate, because we get asked every single year that I've been doing this and that's over 10 years, about how long is it going to take to make all our buildings accessible? At some point, we're going to hit a roadblock where the building's age, the configuration, the landlocked status of a Manhattan building, per se, will be adverse to making those buildings. We took an estimate that about 150 buildings will be that way. And then we projected out the average costs, looking at those remaining buildings and came up with a very, very guesstimate answer for you, but closer than we've ever had,

Chair. (crosstalk) So on the 4 million for every capital plan for the next four, I won't be here. So I can't answer that. Maybe Nina can. She's much younger, so I'll pass it over to her.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Nina is here as well.

(crosstalk)

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Right. I mean, the reason why I'm asking too, I mean, is, in the past, the Council has had to lobby for additional money in the five-year plan. And, you know, I think this is such an important long-term issue, that shouldn't be necessary.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Right. Right. Does the SCA want to speak to this as well? Nina?

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Yes. Thank you. Thank you, Chancellor, and thank you, Chair.

So absolutely, I think it is a... it is a priority for this Administration. As you can see, from the development of this capital plan, the fiscal year 2020 to 2024, we've heard all the advocacy for this program, and we've increased it fivefold from the last capital plan. We had less than \$150 million in the last capital plan and now we're at \$750 million. And I think that's really important to show

our commitment... our ongoing commitment. And that's a dedicated funding source for accessibility projects. Don't forget, as we do our capital improvement projects, if we touch an instructional room, we make that instructional room, if it's not already, accessible as well, so that... while there's \$750 million dedicated in this plan, we also have other streams that that make other rooms, bathrooms, and things of the like, accessible as well. So there is a lot of money dedicated to making our buildings accessible.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So how do we how do we define maximum practical accessibility? And how do we select which sites are chosen for accessibility projects?

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: I see Tom is coming off of mute... he's sort of (crosstalk) disability.

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TARATKO: Yeah. The Office of... of space management handles that, Chair. And we looked at... when we took over central... the central view of accessibility, we found that there was a large equity issue in the city of New York due to a lot of factors. So we went through with geographic need, or historically underserved

districts with the lowest percentage of accessible options for our students. That was first, we also looked geographically in that district, the larger districts that have might have highways crossing the options and trying to get as many options in a geographic area. We look at specialty programs. We look at the enrollment of the schools to serve as much as many children as we possibly can, for bang for the buck kind of thing, and we are at the end of this plan, we will have reached two goals that were stated in the previous Administration. One is to have 50% accessible options in every elementary building that has elementary grades, and the other will be 33% fully accessible buildings in every school district. So that'll be the first time that that equity will be out there in the city of New York. So we're very proud of that.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So... Thank you, Tom. What... what's the goal if we're... if we're... if the DOE is stating, it's going to take approximately \$4 billion over 20 years, how many sites, back in the envelope do we expect to still be inaccessible and 20 years?

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TARATKO: It's... it's just from a lot of knowledge of the buildings chair, but I would say somewhere between 150 to 200 buildings will be... those buildings over 100 years old that have historical classification, or are landlocked, or have configuration issues. Some schools are just too small and surrounded by other buildings and things where to put an interior elevator in there would take away the capacity of the classrooms, and therefore it would... it would not be a practical, you know, project to overtake. You'd be losing valuable seats in an area that might need it to do that. So that building would have to basically be knocked down and rebuilt in newer standards. So we're not close enough to that to give you those details yet, you know, that's in the out years, so... we're getting there.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, I want to switch gears, and then I want to hand it over to our... our Education Chair. So Vision and Hearing Care, something I was speaking to council member Schulman about. Does the D.O.E. offer free vision and hearing screening to students when they enter public schools?

I mean, when I was a kid, they used to do that. Do we still do that?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: I believe that we do. Dr. Johnson?

CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes. We currently offer free vision screening.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So we don't do the hearing test anymore?

CHIEF JOHNSON: Oh yes, we also do vision and hearing. My apologies chair.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: You do both?

CHIEF JOHNSON: Were you able to hear me?

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So you do both hearing and vision?

CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes, we do hearing and vision.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. And then... are children who... who show early signs of print-based and other disabilities given assistance in accessing vision care?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Can you repeat that question for me chair?

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Sure. So if you if you identify a student who has a vision or hearing issue, what's the next step?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: We couldn't hear you.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Can you... Can you hear me now?

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: It looks like she... speaking of vision hearing chair, it looks like she can't. Something must be wrong with her speaker.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. (background voices)

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, can you just repeat the repeat the question again?

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Sure. So yeah, if... I'm happy to hear we're still doing vision and hearing screenings in our public schools. So if a student then is, you know, identified that a kid has a hearing or vision issue, what's the next step?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: So, for disabilities, we have a multi-pronged approach that we're going to take, and I appreciate the question, I think it's... you're asking about both vision issues and about reading concerns, right? And so, any type of print-based disability, right now there are resources that students can use in terms of... if we're talking about vision, there are texts and technology that children can access that will help

them with the actual mechanics of reading. In terms of our larger projects that we're working on, and I think that we're spending a great deal of time planning out, and we've allocated some funding to it as well, we're really excited to be building out a grand-scale literacy approach that will ensure that teachers are trained not only in dyslexia awareness, but also in foundational explicit phonics instruction, and making sure that in grades K through 2, the schools have phonics curricula, so that all students really have access to that foundational reading instruction.

In addition to that, for our students who do not make adequate progress, we are building in... so right now all of our students are screened using general screeners in grades K through 2. Its Academics in grades 3 through 5. Schools have choices. If our students are not making adequate progress, we are currently piloting additional screeners, so secondary screeners, to look for signs of risk of dyslexia or other print-based disabilities. And when we have that information, we're partnering with different organizations to provide not only the intervention that's needed, but

also if students require an additional evaluation, so if we're looking at students who may require that third tier of intervention, we've partnered with organizations to provide evaluations as well. So all of that is going to become part of our larger plan for next year, so that a greater number of students have access to that kind of support.

In addition, we are opening to different types of programs. So one is a standalone school for dyslexia that will begin as an incubated model within a school in district 7. And we'll build out 2 sections. So grades three and four, that will become a school for dyslexia. And then in district five, we're actually building out a model that is just an extension of the grade. So an additional set of classes in grades one and two, that will provide really targeted intervention for students who need that kind of additional support. And we'll use both of those programs as opportunities to both train and support additional teachers and leaders. And in fact, we have a partnership with City College to do that pre-service kind of work as well.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: That's helpful. In addition to the vision and hearing screenings, in

addition to dyslexia... if... with regard to health care, access to vision or eye care, if a parent is seeking free or reduced cost for vision care, does the DOE provide any assistance? What's the contingency there?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Lindsey?

CHIEF JOHNSON: So, with regard to... thank you Chair for the question. With regard to vision screening, all entrants into the DOE are screened for vision in the... within six months of their entry. And so what that means is that all of our pre-K and kindergarten students are also required to do so in addition to our 3K students. When young people get to grades three through five, there is also some additional screening that occurs at that time. For schools that received the community school funding, there is additional dedicated vision screening and visual supports through the _____ partner partnership, and as well as for families, students in temporary housing. So when we think about families that are most impacted by many of these extenuating and challenging services, being able to provide the additional support for those families is one way that we're working to address this challenge.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, I appreciate that. I... uh. We've got a... we've got a long day here. So I want to hand it over to the Education Chair, Chair Joseph, and I thank you all for your time.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you.

CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you, Chair Brannan. I appreciate you. All right.

So, my first question is contracting nurses. Why is the DOE increasing the budget for contracted nurses by \$40 million. In fiscal 2023, the executive budget increased the budget for contracted nurses by \$49 million in fiscal 2023 from a baseline budget of \$28.3 million. So the Council was told each year building has access to nurses in the current school year, what is the purpose of nearly tripling the budget for the contracted nurses with DOE? And how is DOE determining which school will receive these nurses? How many nursing positions are in the schools now between contracted and DOE staff nurses? And how many will this add as well?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Thank you, Chair Joseph for the question.

The investment that you see in the executive budget actually just continues the same level of

contract nursing supports that exist in schools today, and it ensures that we're able to maintain the commitment of having a nurse in each school building, which is critical to obviously our health and safety investments. And it's something that we started at the beginning of the pandemic and have continued throughout the last several years and will continue again in the upcoming school year.

CHAIR JOSEPH: So I know some of the nurses also come from DOH. Is there a partnership between you and DOH? And do you know how many nurses are in our schools from DOH and DOE?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: I can speak to the... there is a partnership between DOE and DOH in regards to nursing. The funding that is in the executive budget supports the DOE contract nursing costs, but we do have partnerships with also Health and Hospitals. Some of their contract nurses support our schools. And so between the DOH nurses, the DOE nurses, and our contract nurses provided by H and H and D.O.E.'s contracts, we are able to make sure that our students get the health and safety care that they need.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: If you wanted a specific breakdown, you know, we could just get that to you.

CHAIR JOSEPH: Absolutely. Also, we addressed some pay parity between the nurses as well?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: The investment in the executive budget, Chair, is related to the cost of a contract nursing.

CHAIR JOSEPH: So the contract nurses... does it take away nursing nurses from DOE as well?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: No. The contract nursing is in addition to the services provided by DOH, H and H, and DOE nurses.

CHAIR JOSEPH: But is there... is there a pay disparity. You see... we see the 4410 with the... with the preschools for special education, there is a pay parity. Is there a pay parity between the nurses as well?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: So I think pay parity is a complex issue that we're having conversations with our city partners about across a variety of initiatives.

CHAIR JOSEPH: All right, well, that will be one of the things you can address when you answer the letters that I send you. I would love to see some of

the numbers and the breakdowns and the data for that.
Thank you.

Next one of my favorite items, part of this is also CTE. The Council was very happy to see \$33 million devoted to pathway expansions in the executive budget and the 2023 and \$52 million in the fiscal year 2024. Will this programming be different from CTE programs? Will these courses also offer college credits and other career pathways? How will the school identify for enrollment? And what is the funding breakdown between spending in high schools and middle schools for FY 23 and FY 24?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, no, we see this very differently. This is not just a traditional CTE expansion, although there'll be some of that, but we have a vision for a much greater expansion of... of CTE as a focus. And one of the things we've done, we brought on Jade Grieve. Jade, I ask that you speak to this question. This is really in many ways, the Northstar for this Administration, and the work that we're going to do as relates to creating pathways for our students. And Jade is the chief of... of career pathways of for us. Jade?

CHIEF GRIEVE: Thank you, Chancellor, and thank you, Chair, for the question. Can everyone hear me okay? Just checking audio. Okay.

So thank you. Thanks, again, for the question. I'm glad to be here to talk a little bit about.. about this work, and would like to at the outset, just acknowledge and thank the City Council for the consistent support to strengthen College and Career Pathways both through CTE programming, and through high-quality internships. I know this is a big area of focus and I appreciate the support.

As the Chancellor shared, we've kind of laid out here a really ambitious vision for expanding career connected learning as one of the big visions in the way that we'll charge towards the Chancellor's Northstar around long term economic security to ensure that all young people are leaving our schools with really strong preparation, awareness experiences, and really set up well to be on a rewarding pathway to a strong career.

One of the big areas of focus in this budget, as you mentioned, Chair, is around the expansion of what we're calling student pathways, which is really building actually, in many ways from the strength of

CTE programming. But I would say there's a few... a few kind of additional features, and actually, you touched on some of them in your in your question.

So were our plans here are to work with a set of schools next year, and as the Mayor said, in his State of the City, to expand that overtime citywide, where we'd hope all students have access to be in some of these high quality career pathways and student pathways. And we see these... these new career pathways having a really strong focus on like as an innovative model that's blending the best of college and career readiness and preparation.

And so there's a few features of that. One, that students would be getting the opportunity to, in addition to their academic experience, to really learn through the lens of career. So career connected thematic instruction. Two, that students... that every student would be getting strong advisement to help them kind of plan for their post-secondary path, whatever they might do be that college or career, and it's connected to the kinds of experiences they're having in school. Three, that all students would... would have a chance to get a head start, to really like get it get a sense of what

are the breadth of career... careers out there that they might be interested in. And we know that there's a lot to do, particularly given how fast the world of work is changing, to open up more awareness, and exposure to the different kinds of really good paying jobs and careers across the city. And that that ultimately is culminating in not just awareness, but that students are getting expanded work based learning opportunities, including paid work experience.

And then lastly, that students are getting this this this notion of a headstart. So we're getting the chance to... to try out... are these really the careers that they're kind of passionate about and find their purpose in.

And so to your question, Chair, that includes things like early college credit, and doing that in a meaningful way where students are getting not just any credit, but getting some sequences of... of credits, so really building meaningful amounts of credit in that career pathway, which will give them a chance to, if they want to head into post-secondary to really accelerate and kind of go in with full momentum, having some credit behind them already,

and/or that they could get the chance to get industry credentials. We know there are a bunch of opportunities, especially in places like in the fields of technology, that there are industry credentials that can open up some really strong entry level jobs for young people.

So those that's how kind of we're thinking about this new focus around career pathways and wanting to start with a set of schools to build that in partnership next year, and excited to... I would certainly love the opportunity to talk more to... to the Council about how that's how that's unfolding, and some other... we're currently in good and important engagement with schools and... and other partners around... around this scope of work.

There's a couple of other things that was... that was emphasized in the Mayor's speech that was touched on that relates to this... to this investment as well. The other is around youth apprenticeship, expanding opportunities for youth apprenticeship. I know that's been an interest of the of the Council, as well as wanting to do more in middle schools to really support broader career awareness. So we can happy to take some follow up questions, and further

if you'd like to see around some of the difference in cost, but certainly there in middle school we'll be much more focused on career awareness and exposure broadly, and in high schools, we see that's where there's a chance to kind of really go much deeper with the kinds of experiences that I mentioned before. And so there are cost differentials there and working through all of that.

CHAIR JOSEPH: How will the student know... how will the schools be identified for enrollment? How does the child know that the school offers this programming? How does how we plan on getting the word out?

CHIEF GRIEVE: So shortly, we hope to -- and I think the Chancellor mentioned in his opening remarks around more details to come -- but shortly, we hope to kind of open up the opportunities for schools to be part of the first cohort next year. So we'll be doing this... this pathways build next year in with a group of schools, and so there'll be opportunities to... for schools to apply to be part of that. And as we're doing that, we'll be thinking, the applications, and will be focused around ensuring that we're reaching the real equity lens on the kinds

of schools that we're able to bring in and work with to start to build this. So there'll be there'll be broad awareness around it. We'll certainly... and the Chancellor will be engaging in this to make sure that it's clear kind of where these programs and pathways will be. But really, just to emphasize that next year is the first year we'll be building these, and our hope is for that to be much broader and will continue to grow each year.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: And you should should just know, as well, Chair, that, you know, there have been a lot of schools in very specific districts around the city which have struggled, which have... which have really never had much exposure in terms of real career opportunities, and it is those districts, those schools, that are... we're going to give very short consideration to providing real opportunity for them.

You know, I've often said it's hard for kids to dream of becoming an investment banker, if they've never met one. And this is an opportunity that we believe in deeply, and... and one that we're going to... we're going to be engaging the community. And

we'll certainly engage council members as well in this process.

CHAIR JOSEPH: Wonderful. Will there be partnerships with CUNYs in our cities? You know, that's one of our....

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Absolutely. (crosstalk)

CHAIR JOSEPH: in the city.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: I had a meeting, had a meeting with Felix yesterday... the Chancellor of CUNY, and that's exactly what we're talking about, together with the mayor's office: How do we build real career pathways? So we're not operating in isolation, and that this is a real K-16 kind of continuum here. And so working together with our... with our partners at CUNY is going to be central to what we're doing as well.

CHAIR JOSEPH: Wonderful. Thank you so much.

Um, we've talked about New York City schools having a communications problem in the past, and that we need parents to know all about the great programs we have across the city. I want to know what plan do you... you plan to roll out additional great programs in underutilized schools? That's one of the things I complained a lot about, that we don't sell enough of

the public schools. So what are the plans? I'd love to hear them.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yep, yep. First of all, one of the things that we do know is that there are a lot of great things that are happening in our schools. Many people don't know that. Let me say that. We very often hear the narrative of nothing but negativity in our schools. And I will tell you, by having visited schools all over the city in the four months that I've been here, there are wonderful and amazing things that are happening in our schools that we should really be proud of, but more importantly, we should all know about.

And so, one, it helps for us to get _____ about what their peers are doing, and two, to build trust with our families to learn what's actually happening in our schools. And so it's a priority of our deputy chancellor, our Deputy Chancellor, Kenita Lloyd, is here. She's in charge of Family and Community Engagement as well as external affairs. And so Deputy Chancellor Lloyd, do you want to speak to this?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR LLOYD: Certainly. Thank you, Chair Joseph. So we are working... the Family, the

Office of Family and Community Engagement is working across all of our divisions here at DOE to break down silos, to share communications, and to increase the methods of communications that we have with our families. Those will... We are internally launching and creating and capturing new digital content that we look to share with our families, with our educators, and with our school leaders. We are exploring a variety of ways and innovative uses of new methods of communicating with families using technology, surveys, one-on-one communication, but also critically important is ensuring that all of those tools are available in languages that our families speak. I know that that is a huge priority of the Council, of your committee, and others. So we are working very diligently to expand the capacity in those areas to ensure that our communications are available in multiple languages and multiple methods across the agency and across the city.

CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: If I may add, you know, I know that thank you for that question. You and I have had wonderful conversations about practices we've seen in schools that are worth

sharing. And so part of the plan too, is to create opportunities for schools to learn from one another, to really create those kinds of networks between schools. And we've had some successful programs in the past, through New York City Public Schools. And so we're looking to revamp some of that, right?, to build off of what already existed, to take from what we've learned, and create opportunities for schools to learn from those schools that may already have really wonderful practices. And that will be through school inter-visitations, and also through technology. And so really using a school website, rather, the daily website in order to provide stories, almost, of schools where we can share the information about what practices a school is using, share some of their processes, share information, like templates and resources, and then really connect schools to one another so that they can learn about the challenges as well as what led to the successes.

CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you. My next question is going to be about one of my favorite things: class size. We know that many times schools are underutilized across the city. And that's an example. There can be a great school... as recent data shows

me... I was looking reviewing some stuff, and it said 255 schools with sixth to eighth grade classes have a class size under 23. Here alone in just these three grades of students enrolling under capacity school, we would have the same impact of creating 3000 seats, the same amount. So SCA is scheduled to open this fall across all grade levels. What can you guys tell me about class size? It's important to us we know that students do well when class sizes are smaller, and teachers also thrive because they have more time to dedicate to these students. So underutilized schools along with class size?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Sure. Well, first of all, just... just wrapping up on that final point you talked about, the overall narrative in communication as well, I just want to add in one other point, which is a very simple thing, right?, But the reality is that we're... we're completely overhauling our website, which is has been a disaster, and I've heard it from everybody. And it should be much more parent-friendly, and we are committed to that, and that work is happening as we speak.

So we spoke a little earlier about the class size issue, but Dan Weisberg, our first deputy, again, you

want to lean in and talk a little bit about that?

And then, together with Nina, you know, some of the efforts that we're making.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Thank you, Chancellor, and thank you Chair. That... you're 100% correct that we have a number of models, and we have more of them than we've had in the past to what the chancellor has talked about very directly that we have, we've lost enrollment, we've lost a lot of enrollment. So not surprisingly, we have a lot of under-enrolled schools. The medium-term strategy is to -- as the chancellor has talked about many, many times -- is to reestablish trust and win back families. And so I'm hoping, frankly, that we have in the coming years fewer underutilized schools. And that, you know, we but at the same time, we totally agree we need to hold the line on class size, which has been reduced significantly, as I mentioned earlier, as a result of the city council, our state partners, our federal partners that we have been able to, during this time, when you have seen enrollment dropped pretty significantly. The number of teachers is not dropped, in fact, it's increased. And so we do have lots of students that are getting more

personalized experience more personalized attention, because of that, because of things like fair student funding being funded fully because of the help we've gotten from... from the council. So, you know, this is going to be the challenge, I would say, but I feel very confident we're going to be able to meet it, which is, Madam Chair, increasing enrollment as much as possible, particularly in those under enrolled schools. Because as you know extremely well one of the problems with an under-enrolled school is, it is very, very difficult to provide a full slate of services and programming for students when you're under-enrolled. So we want to get the enrollment in those schools back up as much as possible at the same time holding the line on class size. And so that... that would be our... and see class size particularly in the early grades, continue to decrease and come down across the city. So that's the... that's the goal for us, and those are the two tracks we are going to be working on.

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: And if I may, you know, this is a multi-pronged approach, obviously you've heard everyone saying. And, you know, I don't want to minimize that that overcrowding is solved only by

doing these shifts, right? Building needs to occur and we are working on... on building. And instead of taking the... the 60,000 seats with this declining enrollment and saying, you know, we only really need 45, we really looked at it strategically with the DOE and said, "Where can we allocate those other 15,000 seats, approximately, to help those schools that might not be in an area of identified need?" So we truly believe that with the 45,000 seats that we'll be building in this capital plan to reduce current and projected overcrowding, along with the DOE helping to create those programs to attract and to retain our students that we can achieve the lower class sizes, and this has been a big push, I know, from all the advocates, to really lowering the class size as we have sort of done through our capacity calculations in the blue book: 23 for grades four through 8, 25 for 9 through 12. So our... our data is reflecting those class sizes, and now we're working with the DOE of how best to implement it.

CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you, I'd love to see that in detail as to how we move forward. We're the only district New York City public schools that has such overcrowding, and you know it doesn't benefit the

teacher or the students. So I'd love to hear further details on how we approach that in the next... in our follow up letter. Thank you so much.

I'm going to touch on bilingual education. What programming and initiatives with \$11.2 million in fiscal 2023, and \$13.2 million in fiscal 2024 for Bilingual Education Support? Is there any of this programming new? How many languages do you aim to target with these programs? And how many outside the common 10? So I'm going to start with those questions. And I have two follow ups.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you, Chair Joseph, appreciate the question. It's an incredibly important issue for us. So this is one that has come up here. We are investing a little over \$11 million in bilingual education for the coming year, and we are committed to providing our multilingual learners, especially our ELLs with high quality instruction, so that they can graduate on the pathway to a rewarding career, long-term economic security, and we want to make sure that they can be validated for what they bring to the classroom, their own language, right?

And you heard the chancellor in his opener, talk about investing in bringing in heritage language

curricula. Really, what we're looking to do is to expand bilingual programs, and so that looks like both the Transitional Bilingual and dual-language programs and really thinking about expanding where they're already in place, and opening new ones where they aren't yet. And so by 2023, we hope to open or grow about 50 bilingual education programs. We're collaborating with superintendents to review data on ELLs in their districts. And we're looking at building out a two-year plan so that we really can learn from what we're working on. We're working with the school development teams so that they can really help us through what it means to design an actual school so that it is meeting the needs of our language learners. And we'll... we'll have to obviously, look at other factors like current ELL enrollment, home language, parent choice, and pay attention to trends so that we can determine what languages we'll be building out in.

CHAIR JOSEPH: Out of the languages are you... are you planning on expanding out of the common 10. Or...?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: If there is a demand for any other language, then we would consider that

but otherwise, it would remain with the schools that we currently have in place. We don't want to open programs that just can't have continuity. And so we want to make sure that wherever we're opening a program, it is because there is enough of a population for that program to be sustainable, and that we actually have educators. So right now we're looking to partner with families and communities on local plans for those programs and for growth and expansion. And we'll use the data that we have in hand to make decisions.

CHAIR JOSEPH: As a former educator also, I know that you can build a bilingual program but also rates... retaining teachers... bilingual educators have always been a shortage across New York City, either with bilingual education licensing or even ESL licensing. How do you plan to address that as well?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you for that question. A really important question, and actually a conversation that we've been having with teachers very recently. We currently have incentives in place for our content area teachers to receive bilingual extensions. What we don't have yet and something that we've we're hoping to have conversations with

the state about is how we can go about actually getting those extensions for our current ELL teachers so that they can be content teachers as well. But we are looking to recruit more teachers with that bilingual license, and we've been working with our teacher recruitment and quality office to work on that very specifically, and have started having conversations with folks in higher learning, and we met actually with the State last week to talk a little bit about how we can work together on that teacher pipeline.

_____: (inaudible)

CHAIR JOSEPH: I can't hear. I didn't hear that.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Oh, I'm on mute. Okay. Can you hear me now, Chair?

CHAIR JOSEPH: Yes.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, one of the things we're excited about also is possibility of a partnership with the Dominican Republic, we've... We've met with the council, General there. They're excited about lining up dozens of their teachers to actually come and work here in some of our shortage areas. So these are conversations that are also happening and a part of a plan that we exploring. We're exploring

all possibilities, and to the degree that you all have other ideas and suggestions as well that would help us, I think we've got to think outside of the box, and not just continue to do it in the way that we've been doing it, and this relationship that we're forging with D.R. is something that is an out-of-the-box approach, and something we're excited about.

CHAIR JOSEPH: Bilingual pupil services is also a great pipeline for bilingual educators.

I will... um... how will the DOE identify which 50 schools will receive this new programming? Can you commit to working with council to identify these schools?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you for that question, Chair. Yes. So we're going to collaborate with superintendents. We're going to be looking at ELL data in their respective districts, and would absolutely welcome Council to be part of that process as well. And as you know, a real big priority for the Chancellor this year... actually, for this Administration in general, has been to engage the community in all processes. And so it'll be very important for us to make sure that we have really strong community engagement through our family and

community engagement, folks to that we are really listening to the needs of our communities.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah. That point again, it... for me, it will go without saying that engagement with the Council is something that I stand ready to do at any moment. And I welcome it, I don't believe that we can impact that... our students and our schools and our families at the maximum level, if we just think we're going to do it through the people who work here at the D.O.E. It will not happen. We can move it, but we won't be able to move in a maximum way. I see every one of you who are in the City Council. Each one of you are community leaders, you know, your schools in your community, you know the parents, you know the principals. So we... you know, we I don't ever want to be in a place of being adversarial at all. This is... we are... we should be real partners. And that's why I've sought to reach out to as many of you as I possibly can. And I say to all of you even now: Feel free to reach out to me with your ideas. We don't have to wait until the hearing. You can always share with me on a regular basis your thinking and your suggestions, and I'm in full partnership with you on all of this.

CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you Chancellor Banks. How much of this funding will support the hiring of the ELL instructional specialists? What does this timeline look like? How will you determine the placement? What specific role will the ELL specialists play in bilingual education? And how will you fund these positions after fiscal 2024?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: So part of that is that is the planning that is taking place right now, right? And so we are making decisions about each of those components. And then part of that means working with our local districts again. So really making decisions about how much staffing we already have in place, when we're looking only to expand. Do we have enough teachers in those... those buildings and in the schools? So all of that is being worked out at this time. And that \$11.2 million will... will be used in part for training, in part for the curricula, and in part for hiring personnel. We've already started working too with Council Members, and so we're really excited about continuing that. We met with district school district 24 and 30 _____ this week, and we anticipate that with the Chair's experience with English language learners as well,

that will, we'll certainly have a really strong partnership there. So we appreciate.

CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you. Thank you. Family engagement. I know that's one of the things that Chancellor Banks talks a lot about.

What programming initiatives will the \$13.8 million in the fiscal 2023 and the \$3.8 million in fiscal 2024 for parents and family engagement support? Is there any of this programming new? How many of the community coordinators will the \$1.8 million fund, and what will be the average salary?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR LLOYD: Thank you for that, Chair Joseph. So first, let me just say that... just to re-echo the Chancellor's sentiments about our commitment to increasing dialogue with families and parent leaders. We intend to use those funds to backfill vacant positions to start, in an attempt to increase staff capacity to support our ability to engage families. As some of you know that engagement happens on various ways and on a multitude of issues around the DOE, not only in family engagement, but through the Office of Student Enrollment, school utilization, focus groups and other methods that happened around the agency. So we really are working

interdepartmentally to share that... share that feedback. And as I said before, to break down those... those silos by having more people on the ground, more people working across our agency, and more people in direct conversation with families. We are exploring innovative methods to meet families where they are, such as the use of targeted... targeted surveys, additional digital content, videos, and a variety of other ways.

We're going to continue to engage families, parent leaders, advocates, through one-on-ones, through group meetings, through town halls... and town halls using every method that we have available so that no stone is left unturned.

CHAIR JOSEPH: The community coordinators you plan to hire... how much will you hire? How many can you hire? And what's the average salary?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR LLOYD: I will follow up with an answer on both of those, Chair Joseph.

CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you. Um foster care, the last time we met, we talked in the fall of 2021, after a lot of years of advocacy, the DOE committed to hiring seven, first ever team to focus on educational needs of students in foster care. How

many of the seven positions have posted up on the DOE sites? Have you begun the interviewing process? What does the hiring timeline look like? Can you share the average salary for these titles with us, please?

Thank you.

CHIEF JOHNSON: Morning again, Chair Joseph, thank you for the question. So we have posted... we posted four of the positions. As per our previous... previous hearing on foster care, we posted four of those positions. We are in the process of interviewing for those positions now, with a goal of hiring and filling those positions shortly. We intend to continue to negotiate... to expand... to increase the remaining positions available and with regard to the salary and and offerings they vary with... with regard to each of the positions and capacity, and I can get that information back to you at a later time.

CHAIR JOSEPH: Well, I look forward it... I definitely look forward to it because I would love that unit to be up and running. So by the fall the students are being served. It's been long overdue. Thank you.

My next question is for SCA. We've heard concern about SEM moving forward towards more prefabricated mainstream masonry panels over the use of typical handset brick laying. Can you give us some details on when SCA chooses to use utilize prefabricated masonry in the projects. Does it SCA have any analysis on the effectiveness of prefabricated versus traditional masonry? Is it cost? Impacts on job or the broader city economy? Can you answer that one? Please?

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you, Joseph, for that question. Yes, we have a team that's continuously... we have a unit within the SCA that's continuously looking at new materials, and they analyze it, and their usage and their durability. And we have to say that precast panel is being used a little bit more than the traditional masonry as... as we have in the past for both... both reasons that you cited quite honestly, cost and speed. We have found that it's... it is cost effective, and it is faster to install. So we have moved a little bit towards that. It doesn't happen in every application of our new school. And again, this is for new builds, so our traditional schools that have you know, bricks are already there.

When we replace those bricks, we are replacing them in kind. So we are replacing them with bricks.

CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you.

Um, Malcom, I'm opening up the floor to my colleagues for questioning.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you Chairs Joseph and Brannon. We will now turn to Councilmember questions. I do you want to remind all council members present, we're dealing with the two biggest committees, so we have lots of questions. I ask that you please stick to the five-minute timer and listen for the sergeant's queue. We do have another agency that has to appear before us later on today.

Many of you have come in and out of the zoom, so I have locked in your places with hands raised. So we're going to go off of my list. We're going to start with councilmember Gennaro followed by councilmembers Dinowitz, Hanif, Brooks-Powers, Narcisse, Louis, and any others, but we will first turn to Councilmember Gennaro.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you team moderator. Thank you, Chair Brannan. Thank you, Chair Joseph, I like to thank... I'd like to thank the

Chancellor for making a highlight of Edison High School in your remarks. That is in my district, and I worked hard with Principal Moses Ojeda. I want to give him a shout out. And I want to thank you, Mr. Chancellor for being very available and open to me and to SCA President Kubota, thank you for your investment in the Harvest School. I was part of that school's founding when it was in Bushwick, and further when it was moved over to Governor's Island, and that's going to be a big part of that, you know, institute is going to be founded there. So thank you for all that.

Let me get into my questions, of which I will be brief. This is for President Kubota. During your statement, you talked about the boilers in the schools that currently burn number four, and that are going to be upgraded. A local law, as you may know: all buildings must phase out number four oil by January 1, 2030. I'm trying to accelerate the citywide phase out of number four oil burning by five years to January 1, 2025, by local law. And I would ask... rather than discussion of it, I would ask that you send me some kind of analysis... your people would send me an analysis about your ability to meet

that 2025 number four oil phase out, if possible to do so. Certainly, you know, any correspondence between me and the SCA would also, you know, necessary loop Chair Joseph. I never, you know, believe in interacting with agencies, if I don't loop in the Chair. So let me just put that out there. And get into my next thing, and then just respond as you see fit, Madam President.

The Carbon Free and Healthy Schools Initiative, which is driven by Climate Jobs New York calls for a deep... deep energy retrofits and the installation of solar power and battery storage and advocates for schools and communities that have been historically under-resourced and also suffering from high rates of childhood asthma and the negative impacts of climate change. We asked that these schools be made a priority. If this effort is fully implemented, it would create over 60,000 good union jobs. It would save millions... save the schools millions annually in energy costs and make the schools healthier and safer.

So my question finally: Are there plans, you know, to make these improvements that I just outlined, and to increase energy efficiency and

prepare schools for decarbonisation, and... and for renewable energy sources, such as solar power panels. And feel free to talk about like the number four item that I put on the table. I haven't given you a lot of time, but there you have it.

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you. Thank you, Councilmember. Great questions. We love all of our sustainability measures.

Absolutely. We are certainly working not just with the administration, but with our partners at D.C.A.S. uh, to look at, you know, all things, both solar, and our boiler program as well. We are committed to coming off of number four oil as quickly as possible, and we are looking at alternative sources to that, right? We... we look at potentially electrification as one way, not just number four oil, reducing it to gas or biofuel, but we are exploring, and we constantly explore those different options.

And so that is all under discussion right now. And we're trying to think of the most cost effective, seamless way of doing it because we also, when we, when we move to electrification, we have to employ a whole different set of contractors rather than our traditional boiler moving from oil to gas. So that's

all under exploration right now. And we're happy to share, you know, more details about that, maybe a one on one, I'd love to have that discussion with you.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: But we also we are looking at energy conservation methods for building electrification, as I mentioned. We have our pre-K center opening at Hall of Science. That is 100% Electric.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Madam President, I would like to stay within the five minutes. You've been very gracious with your comments and your... you know, willingness to indulge, perhaps, you know, we should take this offline. And as I said before, I will not have any communications with you or the SCA that don't loop in Chair Joseph. So thank you very much. Thank you very much to the chairs and to the moderator. Thank you.

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember Gennaro. Next, we'll turn to Council Member Dinowitz.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time started.

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Good morning. Thank you, Chairs Joseph and Brannon. Thank you, Chancellor, Deputies, and Chiefs. I want to talk about the budget of federal stimulus money. I first want to clarify that 100% of the funding that's not being spent this year can be rolled over into next year? I just want to clarify that point.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Yes, Councilmember, that's absolutely correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Good to hear. There was a there was an article in Chalkbeat, in which... which one of your spokespeople said the opposite. I imagine there are a number of teachers and principals who are concerned. I'm happy to send you the article. I have the... It's okay.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Councilmember. I actually... if I make may clarify. Because I think what you're... (crosstalk)

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Sorry, it's okay. You can clarify later. I have four minutes and 15 seconds...

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: ... and I believe you. I just want to make sure... I trust what you're

telling me now, I believe you. I do want to focus on that money and how we're spending that money. I understand what you said in your statement about certain things not being able to be spent because... they... like furniture and supply chain issues. But I want to ask about the other funding for academic supports for teachers, things like tutoring, and that money is also not being spent. I just want to ask you about some of the issues in that portion of the spending, please.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Sure, and I do you want to just clarify your earlier question. I think the Chalkbeat article that you're referencing is talking about not allowing schools with underspending to roll funding from one year to another. We as an agency, and as a grantor, are able to roll funding and unspent money from one year to another. So I think that's an important clarification I just wanted to put on the record there.

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Thank you.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: In terms of the academic recovery allocations that we've made directly to schools, we are seeing spending in that

area. However, I just want to pull this back to the start of the school year when the VAX mandate was in place, when things were uncertain, we had the Omicron virus... or Omicron surge. There's been uncertainty throughout the school year, some of that has resulted in delays and spending on the school-based allocations, in addition to the well-publicized sort of staffing shortages that we've had as a result of some... of a variety of different things that I've mentioned. And so some of those things have combined towards underspending in schools, but we've heard, by and large, from principals that this funding has been effective and welcomed.

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Wonderful, I want to talk about those staffing issues, you know, Chancellor, CFO, everyone here, I really value a lot of the pillars that were laid out earlier this year. You know, and some of the things you said about K through 16 a continuum, that school is part of a continuum, you know, working with our city partners, and scaling and restoring what works, that's pillar number two, and I want to highlight, you know, a particular program that's called CUNY Tutor Corps. This is a program that allows CUNY Students to tutor.

Pretty self explanatory to tell. CUNY Tutor Corps, where CUNY students go into schools, middles, and middle and high schools and provide direct instruction and direct support to our students. And this results in positive outcomes, individualized attention, increased test scores, all of the things that we want to see. And in your conversations, I'm wondering if this particular program has come up. And if you've been able to talk about scaling this program? Because it works, and because it, I think fits in really nicely with pillar number two.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: I completely agree. And it's interesting that it came up yesterday when we met the Chancellor of CUNY. And so you're right. It is an example of exactly what we're talking about programming that actually works. Deputy Chancellor Quintana is the one who is really charged with driving this. Deputy Chancellor?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you. And thank you for that... thank you for that question.

So we are actually working together with CUNY, und using CUNY Tutor Corps. Particularly this summer, you'll see their work across some of our schools, and they are working with a number of schools right now

as well. And we want to build out some of that, not only to provide that type of intervention where there are gaps in learning, but also in partnership with career pathways work that Jade Grieve is leading, we're talking about using those opportunities to help build out future teacher pipelines, so that we have access to additional... or more exposure rather for students in college and students at our own schools to see teaching as a viable option.

So we are working together with CUNY. We're working with a number of other organizations to provide high-dosage tutoring, and we are piloting some of those now...

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: ... and we'll be using many of them in the summer as well, so that we can see what's really going to be beneficial for next year.

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: So can we look forward to seeing some of these unspent funds going towards this... going towards programs like CUNY... CUNY Tutor Corps? Can we look forward to those funds being spent? Because conversations are great,

they're slightly different than committing to that...
to that funding and investment.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Well, what we are committed to
is ensuring that we provide a level of excellence for
all of our students, and... and we've been engaged in
dozens of conversations with lots of different
service providers, and there have had a lot of great
ideas that have been brought to us. So are we
shifting... sifting through all of this to try to
figure out the best... the best things. And so we
appreciate the heads up on this. We've already got a
heads up on it. It sounds like a great program that
would be very helpful. It's being taken under strong
consideration.

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Yeah, it's a great
program that will help our students, our K-12
students, help the CUNY students get that experience,
and honestly help the teachers are already struggling
to address the individualized needs of our students.
And one can only throw around the word
differentiation so much before you actually have to
have a real plan and real... real individualized
attention and intervention. This is a wonderful
program, and I think that this money... this federal

stimulus money that's not being spent can certainly be used for this program.

Again, Chancellor, Deputies and Chiefs, I want to thank you all for your time, and Chairs, thank you.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll call on Council Member Brooks-Powers.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

Hi, and good morning. It's great to see you, Chancellor, and the team. I have some questions for the Department of Education and School Construction. I just want to ask all the questions and then allow both agencies to answer afterwards. So for the Department of Education, since the start of the pandemic, what mechanisms and resources have you enabled to ensure students in under-resourced areas have access to reliable broadband or other internet service? Especially for students in temporary housing? How have you been able to reach students that do not have access to reliable broadband? This is a consistent thing that I've been hearing in the community in terms of concerns throughout the pandemic, but even beyond. What was the success rate of your hotspot lending program? Do you plan to work

with the same providers to expand access? And how is AARP funding to expand its reach?

For School Construction Authority, many areas citywide like Edgemere in my districts are bracing for an influx of new development and residents as a result of new zoning projects and other significant housing investments. How are the department of Education and School Construction Authority preparing to meet the needs of families and residents in the areas experiencing significant growth? How has the pandemic affected the school construction authorities ability to complete capital projects in a timely manner? Are there any other factors causing delay? And I know I've been in communication with both agencies, pertaining to, one, the need for an actual school as a part of the Arverne East project where I know one has been sited, but still not anything put in motion for it, but then also in Arverne-By-The-Sea, there was a school promised to the community about 15 years ago, and through substantial delays from the past Administration, inflation has left a gap, and it is a \$7 million gap. I want to understand how we can be able to resolve that so that

they can be shovels in the ground for that school for the community. Thank you.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: So why don't we... why don't we start out with the issue around operations broadband and the hotspots? Camille Joseph Varlack, you've been, you've been driving that work. Do you want to provide some support around that?

SENIOR ADVISOR VARLACK: Thank you. Thank you, Chancellor. Thank you for the question. Actually, I'm going to ask our Chief Technology Officer, Anuraag Sharma, to go ahead and respond in detail with respect to the broadband and access questions.

CHIEF INFORMATION OFFICER SHARMA: Thank you for thank you for the question. You know, we are very, very committed to making sure that our students have the right devices and access to broadband when it comes to their academics. And so from the start of the pandemic, we have distributed over 675,000 LTE enabled devices, both Chromebooks and iPads. All of the services are split between two providers, Verizon, as well as T Mobile. So we continue to work with our schools as and when more device needs come up, we fulfill those across our school system.

In addition, we've also distributed over 29,000 hotspots, which have coverage as well, LTE coverage. And so schools are still able to request more hotspots as they need them. And we are able to fulfill those requests. And so right now we have inventory on both devices and hotspots for schools that... that need them they work through... through our team. They request them and we were able to get them in in very short order. So you know, we will continue to work on this program and expand as we need it for both LTE services across our system.

COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS. Thank you.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Nina. There were a number of questions around the school construction return.

COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS. Yes, hi, Nina. I don't see you on the screen through.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Did we lose her? She's trying to... she's trying to unmute let's give her a second.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: You should be able to unmute yourself, Nina.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Council Member said please. She doesn't want to lose her time.

COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS. I graciously ask for an extension of time from my Chairs to get my response. The connectivity of this broadband.

VICE PRESIDENT LIU: I'm not sure. Nina might be having some technical difficulties. This is Cora Liu, from the School Construction Authority. So I can try to answer your questions... some of your questions, Council Member Powers, I think your first question was about development.

We do work with all city agencies, whether it's city planning EDC, HPD, when there are both city lands as well as private development. So to make sure we are involved in the planning phase, and there are many times when there is the need or there is the possibility for land to be reserved, we try to grab them and to make sure that school planning is part of the overall rezoning planning. We review... review the citywide permit data for your buildings and development data from other developments annually to make sure we have the most comprehensive information in our planning for new seats.

I think your next question was about COVID's impact on our project schedule. Um, we definitely had... our project schedule has suffered from COVID.

There was a period of time all our projects were paused. So some of the projects were delayed. We have communicated with schools and other communities and stakeholders to make sure they understand the impact, that we're doing our best to try to catch up and make sure the schedules do not slip any further.

I think your third question was about the charter school... or the school that's planned as part Arverne-By-The-Sea development. As you know, we've been working with your office, as well as other agencies and city halls to try to fulfill the commitment of that, helping build a night school.

We have followup meeting, I think, scheduled for next week that we will hopefully to talk to you with more details about how to... how to help the charter organization and school to make it happen. So we love to connect with you more next time... next week.

COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS. Thank you. Thank you so much for that. And thank you for the work that you all do, because it School Construction Authority isn't normally a leader around MWBE's, and thank you Chancellor for your responses as well.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll call on Council Member Hanif

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you so much. I have a couple questions, and I'd like to start with how much will it cost the D.O.E. to fill the additional 1,363 current vacancies for school safety agents? Does the current administration plan to fill these vacancies, and how many?

And then as a follow up to that, I wanted to know, just based on some of the education equity advocates we've been working with, the recommended ratios of social workers and guidance counselors to adequately meet the needs of students is one social worker and one guidance counselor for every 150 students in most schools, and one for every 50 students in high-needs schools. And then to reach the recommended ratios over the next five years, the city should invest \$150 million to hire 500 new counselors and social workers this year. The current administration's prioritization of funding, additional school policing, infrastructure, culture and practices in a school system, where not every school has a social worker is absolutely

unacceptable. Will the administration commit to invest \$150 million to hire 500 new counselors and help students grow and thrive instead of hiring new school cops to replace current vacancies?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Thank you, Councilmember for the question. In terms of the school safety agent question, they're employees of the New York City Police Department. So we would defer those questions to them around cost estimates.

And then in terms of the social worker question, I'll start and then turn that over to Dr. Johnson. From our team to speak more. We have used stimulus funding to make great strides in the investment of social workers directly in our schools. We've added 600 social workers, guidance counselors, and other school psychologists with this funding, which has been hugely helpful and successful. And we continue that investment over the next couple of years. In addition, with the increase in the Fair Student Funding Floor, this school year, we've seen schools use that funding in some instances to also hire additional... additional social workers and counselors. And so I think we have seen investments in that area. We're always looking to do more, and

I'll turn it over to Dr. Johnson to share more details.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you.

CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you, Council Member for the question. I think, at the core of your question is this notion of how we provide supports to young people. And so by increasing the ratio of guidance counselors and social... social workers, as well as school-based mental health supports for young people, we provide greater access. I think we've got to rethink how we are actually calculating the ratio, and think about how we increase the number of people who have access to support for young people, both clinical supports, as well as non-clinical supports.

And so in doing so, we've... we've activated... in addition to the hiring that Lindsay mentioned, we've also activated Healing Centered Ambassadors, who are community and family members who are trained in de-escalation strategies, different engagement strategies. If you think about... if you think about it in this way: If we're able to activate and support community members, we actually have a generational strategy, because young people come from homes. And if young people are experiencing trauma,

a lot of times communities are experiencing trauma. So by activating the Healing Centered Ambassadors, we've been able to really deepen community strategies. We have Healing Centered Ambassadors across all of the districts, but we welcome funding to... to activate more. And we also are... we've launched a smaller pilot to deepen that work and have Healing Centered projects, where community members work in tandem with the social workers and guidance counselors within the community to think about targeted projects and to support young people to provide greater support.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: And how much funding is going towards the Healing Centered Ambassadors and how many exist right now across city schools?

CHIEF JOHNSON: So there are... I can get back to you in terms of the... the full funding, but there are 92 Healing Ambassadors across... across 16 targeted districts. We have a smaller pilot that we've launched to deepen... to deepen the work across an additional 20 targeted schools and locations.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: I really appreciate that. And I absolutely want to agree with your approach. I think that is the approach that's absolutely critical

to just the city's recovery at this moment. So really excited to learn more about the Healing Centered Ambassadors initiative.

And then very quickly, I want to ask about culturally competent curricula. The research is clear that students that engage in a curriculum that embraces and affirms their identities and cultures perform better and graduate at higher rates. Yet, according to a report from the New York City Coalition for Educational Justice, 84% of books in 10 commonly used elementary school curricula are written by white authors, and 51% have white main characters despite the fact that 85% of the city's public school students are black, Latinx, or Asian. What percent of percentage of current New York City students have access to a culturally responsive sustaining education? How many dollars in this proposed budget are dedicated to CRSE programming? And how does this compare to previous budgets? That is the first component. And then: Will the city commit to inclusion of Asian American history in any plans for culturally responsive education and curricula? You know, with increased... increase in targeted hate experienced in our Asian American communities and

resulting in trauma. It's just critical that CRSE in our city is inclusive of Asian American history.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Yes, thank you.

Thank you for that question, Council Member Hanif.

We're really excited actually about what we are able to... what we are proposing to do, actually, what we've already started to do with the collaboration of community organizations. We are building out a range of different curricula that reflect the ethnicity and history and... and lives of our varied student population. So we are in the process of building out a Black Studies curriculum that is actually happening through a number of community based organizations with the partnership with the Department of Education. We are also building out an AAPI curriculum, again, with universities and local organizations and the participation of varied members of the community as well. We already implemented an LGBTQ plus curriculum.

And each of these, the exciting part of this is that they are being integrated into what already exists. So our API and LGBTQ plus, for example, have already been... or we're working on rather, embedding them into our passports, social studies curriculum

that is already present in over 90% of our schools.

We are also working with each of these groups to make sure that we can integrate parts of these curricula into our different existing content areas, so that it isn't exclusively a part of social studies. But we want to make sure, more than anything, that a range of students can... can see the information and must see the information and not relegate it exclusively to a an elective course that maybe only happens in a high school that chooses to take it. And so that's one way that we're doing that. And we... for the AAPI, hope to pilot some of those lessons in the coming year, and then we will again, it's a 2-year process to complete the whole curriculum.

The... In terms of the other portions of CRSE that you've mentioned, we continue to use the framework that was developed with a partnership with NYU, and so that work continues and has not... has not slowed down actually, and it is going to be a very big part of what we will do and it's partnership actually, between Dr. Johnson's department in my own, that will work on making sure that all of our schools are building in culturally responsive curricula, culturally responsive practices, and culturally

responsive classroom libraries. One of the things that our team has also been working on is increasing the diversity of the texts that are available to our children through the online library. So through Sora, our kids have access to a range of books. And in fact, part of the Mosaic funding last year was used to create... or to send, actually, to schools diverse library collections, and we'll continue to do that this year, as well. And we are still building out Mosaic. And so we're really, really excited about that work. I know that we started the parent engagement last year, and so we're going to continue with that work. We've put together a small team that will build that out as well. And so you'll see that coming in, in future years, too.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: That's really wonderful. Exciting. I'd love to be invited to a classroom to see like how the API curriculum or the Black Studies programming is taught. I would be really excited. I was a Women's and Gender Studies major at Brooklyn College. And that was, I think, my first experience... sort of reading authors of diversity in the classroom. And so I would love to be engaged in

that. And then do you have a budget number that is going towards the CRSE in the... in the fiscal year?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Councilmember, I can speak to that. We're finalizing the budget based on the feedback from Carolyn and the Chancellor and others, and we'll be able to share an update soon.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you so much. My time is up. But I'll be following up with more questions about school bathrooms to the SCA. Thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next, we'll hear from Council Member Narcisse, followed by councilmembers Louis, Stephens, Baron and Carr, but we'll turn to Council Member Narcisse.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Good morning. Good morning Chair... Both chairs, Justin and Ritalin, and Chancellor, thank you for staying so long, and every step that make it possible. Thank you.

One of the question that I have while I was here is for SCA first. I'm hearing from the business perspective, being in business, I'm listening to Ms. _____ bringing the precast panel, right? So when your bring the precast panel, you're going to take

jobs out of the local. So I want to know how many masonry that producing block in our city, block manufacturers that we have. And I want... I would like for you to keep in mind when you take manufacturers, and most of those manufacturers are located usually in the places where people who need the most, and those school... those children are going to the school that they build, and they are taxpayers. So I want to know how it's going to affect them, because they're usually in a place where people need those jobs. SCA?

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you. I think I have this, right? Thank you, Council Member for that question, and apologies to the entire council for freezing. I'm glad Cora was able to address some of your questions.

So I think I mentioned before that... that, yes, while we look at precast as an alternative, we are not eliminating the use of brick and block. In fact, you know, I sort of alluded to this, most of our schools we are only building probably, you know, in the last couple of years, using precast as a... as a cost effective, accessible, and typically faster way of delivering new schools. But the remaining 1300 to

1400 of our school buildings are brick and block, and when we replace that -- which we do. We spend a lot of money on our masonry and our parapets, making sure that our buildings are watertight -- we are... we are replacing them in kind... So with brick and block. So it is a very small percentage of what we're doing. And again, we are just exploring different... different methods. You know, 20 years ago, there was a lot of, you know... do we do rainscreen? Do we do...? You know, almost all sorts of delivery methods in terms of exploring cost and speed.

COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Yeah, I understand that we have to be cost effective. And I'm one of the person that don't like waste, but at the same time, I have to keep in mind, who we are affecting the long term, not the short term, not what... what's in front of us. I thank you for that. I'm happy to hear that is a very small portion. We still have to maintain cost effectiveness

But in terms of the transfer, I have a problem with the transfer for the school. I know, we have five transfer schools, which is for the young folks that just arrived to America. So, for me, I know there's five transfer schools. And four of them are

in Manhattan. So what happened with Bronx, Brooklyn, Queens, Staten Island and all? Because we have so many, especially when it comes to Brooklyn. Who can answer that for me?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you for that question. One of the things that we have actually planned for upcoming school year is to expand the number of transfer schools that currently serve the needs of our English language learner population. And what we're looking to do is twofold: Wherever possible in future years to develop standalone schools, and wherever possible, actually, what we would prefer to do is to design, or redesign, existing transfer schools so that they can meet the needs of our English language learners by using models that are already successful. So one example of that is Ellis in the Bronx: We visited. They have great programs in place, a high literacy focus, and we want to make sure that we are using the leadership and the teachers that are there to design some of those transfer schools. And we are paying attention to those districts where they don't currently exist, where we have high numbers of students that have need, so that we can build those

in those spaces. And so we're working very closely with our school design folks, to make those decisions and to build those out as we can.

COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you, as an ELL student myself, I know that the rates of dropping out, and all this is can be addressed by making sure that they are accessible within the distance of one's... one's home. We know how young folks are. If their school is very far, there's a lot of excuses that we're going to get.

In terms of mental health, I'm very concerned as a nurse for so many decades... for three decades, actually. Last year, we allocated \$5 million, right?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: to make sure the school that addressed the mental health crisis and the services that was provided. So I want to know that in the school now, how are we going to continue having the needs that we need in our school building, especially with this pandemic, what we're dealing with?

CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you for the question, Councilmember. As I mentioned before, what we recognize is that mental health is layered and

complex. And so the idea of how we leverage clinical supports, as well as non-clinical supports are going to be critically important. When we think about the clinical supports that we have been able to invest and add the resources to the school community, we've been able to add 600 social workers to ensure that students at every school have access to either a guidance counselor, a social worker, or school based mental health center. And so access to the resources when young people need them are available to them. And then this notion of how we think about expanding access outside of that clinical support to engage community work: At this point, it is privately funded. And so being able to think about ways to leverage that funding, on a greater scale, I think, is a way that we get to maximize the mental health supports for young people in this critical time, because we know that it takes a village in order to support our young people.

COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Oh, I appreciate that. And I know my time is up, but we are talking about \$9.2 million, we talking about for the violence anti violence program in our school interruption program. So I want to find out if we did... I mean if D.O.E.

is going to provide any funding to utilize or hire restorative justice coordinators? Because that's one of the things that I had in mind. How does this initiative fall in D.O.T. existence? And how will you identify the school and CBOs to partner with? Because that's the key importance because the people in the community knows the community's best than anybody else.

CHIEF JOHNSON: No, I think that is a great question, Councilmember. And thank you for that question. I think when we talk about violence interruption, and we talk about restorative justice, restorative practices, we are really talking about how we are leveraging trusting relationships amongst young people. And so when we look at the intersection between restorative practices, and engaging restorative... restorative coordinators who can work within the school base, we know that our young people are in school for a certain number of hours, and then they go into the community, they go home. And so the idea of how we leverage our community partners to ensure that young people have support, to build trusting relationships, and also to intervene in those instances where they have been exposed to

community levels of violence and access. And so I think you and I were both at a school earlier this week talking about anti-gun violence, violence, engaging with a community... community partners who are doing justice work. And so we are currently working to... to allocate the funding to community based partners who are able to really kind of that engaged support... boots on the ground support, in addition to our restorative practices that we've already activated and engaged.

COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you so much, Chancellor. I'm going to be reaching out to you, you know why, already. Thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll turn to Councilmember Lewis.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you so much. Good morning, everyone. Thank you Chair Joseph and Chair Brannan. Thank you for highlighting in your questions class size, arts, music and programming and Executive Budget. Chancellor, I'm happy to see you and your whole team. Thank you for your diligence. I'll ask a couple of questions, and hopefully it can be answered here or via email. I look forward to

working with all of you. So regarding chronic absenteeism, reports showing that so far 73% of students can be considered chronically absent. So I wanted to know how does D.O.E. plan to address this, and what steps will the DOE take in the fiscal... upcoming fiscal budget to ensure that students have the support they need to be motivated to be present in the classroom? I also wanted to ask about D.O.E.'s plan for mental health, career, and guidance counseling for district 79 schools as well as district 75? So if that question was answered earlier, but I wanted to know how much funding was being put in the fiscal 23 budget for that.

And my last question is for SCA, I wanted to know, regarding infrastructure and addressing the need for smaller classroom sizes and fast tracking construction for that, has SCA considered expanding their MWBE vendors for the FY 23 budget and out years in order to achieve that goal for our scholars? Thank you so much.

CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you so much for the question, Councilmember Louis. So there are a couple of questions that you asked. And so I'll address a

couple of them, and then I'll defer to my colleague for the last question.

So with regard to chronic absenteeism, what we know is that in order for young people to learn, they have to be present in school. And so what we've done to address chronic absenteeism is we've activated our... our superintendents, and our borough community... our borough central offices to really kind of look at the data for... for chronic absenteeism. When we think about what the numbers represent, in order for a young person to be defined as chronically absent, they need to have missed over 17-plus days. And so when we talk about numbers of chronic absenteeism, right now, we can't actually talk about the rates of chronic absenteeism, but we can talk about projections for chronic absenteeism. And so what we are currently doing is working in partnership with our superintendents, as well as our borough central offices to really think about what it is, of course, that we can put in place to really ensure that young people who may have missed several days up to this point in... are able to continue to attend every... every day. We know students have to be present in order for them to learn. And so we've

1 been activating that. We've been working with our
2 attendance team... our attendance teachers to really
3 kind of get out and find... make certain that we know
4 where all the young people are, and to get them back.
5 And the other part of that is ensuring that our
6 school practices, curriculum opportunities, provide
7 engaging experiences that young people want to go to.
8 So when the chancellor talks about how we're
9 expanding... expanding career pathways, and providing
10 more engaging opportunities for young people, that is
11 also an attendance intervention strategy, because you
12 got to have a great place that you want to attend.

14 So that was the first question. Um, the second
15 question with regard to social workers... if you
16 just give me one moment.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Yeah, and I did hear you
18 mentioned it earlier. So I apologize. This is
19 regarding the district 75 and 79 schools as well for
20 the social worker (inaudible).

21 CHIEF JOHNSON: My apologies.

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: While Dr. Johnson
23 looks at that the information for that particular
24 question, I did want to address one of the other
25 questions that I think I heard you ask was, what are

the ways that we will engage students and sort of bring them back? Right? So Dr. Johnson alluded a little bit to that when she was talking about the instructional... instruction, right?, and making sure that our instructional core is strong, and that we are engaging students. We also talked a little bit about... you heard both chancellor and Jade Grieve talk a little bit about career pathways. And so those pathways are part of what we want to make sure are integrated into our core. The supports that were asked about earlier as well, that tutoring piece that really... the kids are voting with their feet. The parents are too. We want to make sure the resources are in place. And then really exciting, we have some opportunities to improve our digital learning. And so we're going to be training teachers to make sure that they have the tools that they need, and that they really do know how to access digital processes and digital strategies that they can use as well. And really exciting with that digital piece is that we intend to open to brand new virtual schools, so that students can have some more flexibility in how they go to school. And hopefully that will reengage some of those that...

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: ... we've lost as well, and so that we can bring them back in that way too. But the biggest piece is making sure that our schools are really reflective of the kids in front of us, that our teachers are well-trained to meet their needs, that they have the adequate supports in place, and that means not only the CRSE pieces that we talked about, the social work pieces that we talked about, but also making sure that our teaching and learning is grounded in inquiry, and is student centered. And so that that's the kind of support and training that we will offer across all of our schools.

CHIEF JOHNSON: Sorry, and thank you. My apologies for the delay, I wanted to ensure that I was able to give you accurate information.

So with regard to the specific ratios for district 75 and district 79, we'll get back to them. One of the things that we do know is that for the social worker support, district 79 students are connected to their home-based schools. And so they would still have access to the Social Work support that's available through their home-based schools.

But I'll find out the specific ratio as assigned and aligned to district 79, which we know supports adult education and several other... several other non-traditional academic pathways.

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Do we still have time for...

(crosstalk)

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: If it's okay, Chair Brannan and Joseph, my last question was for SCA regarding MWBEs and construction.

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Correct. So... So currently, we have about 2000 vendors prequalified with us, and about 1000 of them are MWBE's. I will say that 61% of our construction contractors are MWBE firms. So, you know, we are always looking to expand that. And how we do that is we work with the smaller firms through our mentor program. They are all MWBE's, and we work with them for over six to eight years mentoring them so that they can bid in sort of the open market at the SCA. And we started out with... we've recently changed it, we went to a \$1 million threshold that they could bid on to \$1.5 to \$2, and in July, we're going to increase it to \$3. So I will say we're always looking to attract not just MWBE firms, but smaller MWBE firms that we can, you know,

raise up. Look, we all have room for improvement, and we're always looking to refine and to, you know, get better. So I'm always happy to... to, you know, take some suggestions, but we have a pretty, pretty well developed program. And we're we want to expand it not just within the construction industry, but within our professional services. So that is something that we're looking to do starting this next fiscal year.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you, everyone. Thank you Chairs.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll go to Councilmember Stevens, followed by councilmember Barron.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Hi, good morning, everyone or good afternoon. I do not know what the time is at this point. Thank you, um, Chairs, for this hearing. I just have a couple of questions. And hello D.O.E.. It's very nice to see you guys.

So I'll start with my Summer Rising questions, and then I have some Bronx-wide questions that I wanted to ask today.

Number one, thank you guys. I know you guys have been super hands on the ground and doing... and doing a phenomenal job with getting Summer Rising off the ground, which is a huge task. And I know we've been meeting and talking consistently, but one of the things that I'm still getting a lot of calls back and pushback from is from my parents around the enrollment process, around how young people who were in current programs and schools weren't given priority. And now they're, you know, they're being told that they have to go to other locations that are really out the way, and really going to put a hardship on them. I've gotten calls within the last week with the same issue from actual parents. So one would love to hear how we're addressing this issue.

The next one is I'm in the D.Y.C.D. budget is we have Summer Rising baselined until 2026, but that is not the case in the DOE budget. What does... how do we plan on continuing this program if only one side has been funded? So could you talk a little bit about what that plan looks like?

Then another issue that we have and just... this is the Bronx-wide issue around teacher retention in the Bronx. We have some of the higher retention

rates in the Bronx, around retaining teachers, and getting teachers who actually want to work in the Bronx and stay there. So what is the plan? And what does it look like, um, in the next couple of years to build up this potential and getting teachers to come and wanting to stay in the Bronx. And then my last question, which is for SCA, is around trailers and one of the districts in the Bronx which is Councilmember Feliz's district 15. He has over 15 schools that have trailers in his district. Oh... he's here. So I'll let him ask this question. But he'll ask that question, so I'll... I'll yield back for that question. So I'll just go through those other questions I asked.

SENIOR ADVISOR VARLACK: Thank you very much Chair for... for the question. So we are extraordinarily pleased the opportunity to speak with both you and Chair Joseph in most recent weeks about Summer Rising, and we continue to work to make it sort of the best summer program that we have had thus far. We are aware that there are some families that have been locked out. We have encouraged those families to send emails to us, and we are retaining that information and staying in very close contact with them. As you

may be aware, last year there certainly were challenges. And there was a lot of feedback related to it that we wanted to make sure that we address this year. One of the feed... one of the... some of the feedback that we received had to do with making sure that the quality of the program was as high as possible, and making sure that we had sufficient staff for the number of students that we had. So as a result, we made sure working in partnership with our D.Y.C.D. partners, that we capped enrollment at approximately 110,000 students for K through eight, because we wanted to make sure that we would have sufficient staffing for all of those... all of those students. We did prioritize our students in temporary housing as well as students with 12 months IEPs, as well as our students that are going to be mandated for summer school. With respect to families that unfortunately did not have an opportunity to get their first choice they certainly have the ability to choose another spot within Summer Rising, another location. And separately, they have sent us... many of them have sent us emails and we are tracking those. So when enrollment closes, we will have an opportunity to sort of see which families that have

currently signed up for a spot that are continuing with Summer Rising, we will be actively engaging with those... with those families over the summer because we know that many families sign up for a... for a slot, and then they decide not to go. When those slots become available, as we believe some will, we will be reaching out to the families that have contacted us asking to either switch location or switch CBO providers.

With respect to your question on budget, I will ask our CFO, Lindsey Oates to take that question.

COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: I'm gonna... just before you answer that question, I just wanted to give a little feedback as well, because we have both parents... I got an email, basically, a parent was told that she should just get a babysitter because no spots will be opened up. So I just want to make sure that we are having messaging going out to everyone around providers and how they are relaying those messages to parents. And I'll be in contact with you to give you more details. That's a huge issue.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Be sure to get that to us directly, because we can follow up on that and who

told her that. We'll... we'll do some immediate follow up for sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Thank you.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Councilmember... Thanks, Chancellor. In relation to... in response to your question about the budget, the Department of Education has an existing budget that we are using for Summer Rising and we are also repurposing...

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: ... about \$176 million in stimulus funding to further expand the program this year. That's how we funded Summer Rising in fiscal year 21, and how we will fund the expanded program in fiscal year 23. And I... I obviously cannot speak to D.Y.C.D.'s budget, but we're grateful to have the funding resources to be able to invest in this really important program this summer.

COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: But my concern is that it is baselined in the D.Y.C.D.'s budget until 2026, but it's not baselined in D.O.E.'s, so that's... that's my concern. So what does this program look like in a year or two when it's not in your budget,

but it's in D.Y.C.D.'s budget, and it's literally a collaboration?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Understood. I hear your concern, and I appreciate that. And I think for a lot of these issues, where stimulus funding is temporarily supporting programs, we're working with our city partners on solutions for the out years.

COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: And then my last question was just around, um, teacher retention and the Bronx being very high. And what are we doing to address that?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Yeah. Thank you, Councilmember. You know, we're fortunate that teacher retention across the city is quite high, particularly in relation to what you see in other big urban districts. So it's... it's the most recent figures or teacher retention is about 94%. But you're 100% right, it tends to be higher in the Bronx. And so this is something we've got to be laser focused on. Part of... part of the strategy for that is fully funding F.S.F. which benefits disproportionately -- which is a good thing -- schools in the Bronx, gives principals there more

resources so that teachers there feel better support, and that could be in the form of lower class size, that could be in the form of additional programming, that could be in the form of additional mental health support to CBO partnerships. But we're... we're not standing pat on that. That's a number we watch very, very closely, and would love to talk to you about what you are hearing, and what... what additional targeted supports we can provide to make sure that we have a level playing field, that the principals and other leaders in the Bronx have the same opportunity to access talent, which is the most important thing: Access teaching talent and other staff talent, as they do in Manhattan or the other boroughs.

COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: No, I really appreciate that. But I think this is a major issue. And this is a service to our kids. So we definitely have to continue to work together in partnership and collaboration, not with just me, but with all the council members to really address this, because you know, with having teachers not saying, it has a toll on the kids... on the young people that we serve. So I definitely look forward to continue partnering with you guys on this issue. And, you know, although I

always have very pointed questions about Summer Rising, it is it is going well, and I just want to give you guys kudos for the continued collaboration between both D.Y.C.D. and D.O.H., because it's not an easy task, but you guys are getting it done. So thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll turn to Councilmember Barron.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very much, Chancellor, welcome. I was so perplexed and puzzled Chancellor. I thought you and the mayor were tight, and he's cutting a billion dollars from your budget and you tried to fix it to make it seem like that's alright. But uh, we'll talk about that when you come visit me.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: I'm coming to see you real soon too.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I know. You're on the schedule. But I thought you had it like that. I expected to see an increase in the budget, not a decrease. Anyway, I want to talk about how do we measure success? You know, oftentimes it is measured by the graduation rate.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: But I want to know the status on college readiness, and career preparedness.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Because the diploma means nothing if they're not prepared for a career or ready for college. And last I heard is that 80% of the students that are going into CUNY need remediation...

CHANCELLOR BANKS: That's right.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ... after coming through the system. So that's one thing. Secondly, they are predicting another crisis, another breakout for COVID. What are we going to do as a contingency plan for... if there's a COVID? outbreak in September? I know we talked about it. Y'all said you were doing stuff about it. We never heard a whole lot back. Will there be a virtual option for parents? Which I think should still happen right now. But I'd like for you to address that: Are we ready? Are we ready for that? And also the colocation of charter schools in our buildings. That's... that's horrific.

Buildings that we're designed for one principal, and one school, now have four principals, four schools, and it's cutting back on the very class size and

class expansion that we need for the students. So I want to know about that. And my wife, Inez Barron, former Council Member, Assemblymember, Senator Robert Jackson, and myself: We fought so hard for campaign for fiscal equity. And we got it \$1.5 billion for the next three years -- because of the federal money, not the state -- but how was that being used? Is that getting to our schools? Because sometimes we fight for these things, and we never see the benefits of it. I want to thank Council Member Hanif for that brilliant breakdown of the cultural relevant curriculum. I think we should heed to what she's saying.

And the School Construction Authority: A \$20.6 billion budget, how many new schools are being built in black and brown communities? I had to fight. I got a couple in mine, but that was a real battle. I'm concerned about all over. And then the contracts have to not just be for \$1 million or \$2 million. There are some black companies that can handle the same kind of contract that these white construction companies get.

And then is... Chancellor, is there still a rubber room? Do they still have that? I know you

may have changed the name, but is the... is the concept still the same when teachers are punished, because a lot of black faculty got stuck in rubber room years ago for some penalties. I wonder if that still exists, even if it's a change in name, what's the status of that?

And then also, how are you addressing the needs in black and brown communities? We need to computer labs, the science labs, the library updates, music teachers with the equipment, sports programs, after school programs, and wraparound services in our community.

And then finally, what are we going to do about civic and career education? You know, I really think that civic responsibility is important. Career education is important. There's one school in Manhattan that has career education school. It is really awesome. I'd like to have one in my district as well. So these are some of the questions, because firmly I believe that education should be for liberation. Education should be teaching our students about the true nature of the system they live under: A racist, colonial capitalist system, and we should tell the truth and not be afraid of

C.R.T. or whatever they're talking about. But the capitalist system... our children need to know about capitalism, socialism, African communalism, communism. Teach them about all the systems and how they work, because when they come out, the only thing they know is about a capitalist system that is inherently... inherently working against them, even if they get a PhD. So we got to... and I know, Commissioner Banks, that you're down with me with the revolution, so I know that you're going to be teaching our kids how to radically... radically -- just meaning getting to the root of the problem -- radically change this system. I appreciate it if you would respond to some of these questions.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Which ones you want me to respond to? All of that?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: All of them! (laughs)
All of the above.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Listen, let me just say this: I greatly appreciate you. I appreciate the spirit in which you asked all those questions. And I think at the core of all of it is really about... it really is about liberation. It's about transformation. I did

not come here to stand into defense of a system that has fundamentally failed so many of our children, particularly black and brown children. And I'm fully committed to the transformation of this system. I've said it from the time that I got here, and I will continue to do that. This team that I have, that we have assembled is fully committed to that as well. So just very quickly, you talked about college and career readiness, and this... this system has not done a good enough job.

We graduate children, but we don't graduate them with enough of an understanding, so that they... and the skills that they need to be successful in college, certainly not in careers. That's why this work that we're doing on Career Pathways is something that we're leaning into. We believe very deeply in it. We're going to give kids while they're in middle school and high school a real insight into what the real world actually looks like, and how they can be fully prepared to take their place in this 21st century economy. We're not just going to school, just to be going to school.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: But Chancellor, do you have any numbers on that? What's the percentage...

the last latest percentage on college readiness and career preparedness?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: I don't have it off the top my head, but we can certainly... about 58%, in terms of even college and career, particularly in...

(crosstalk)

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And in some schools... some schools, it's even lower than that. It is very low.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Absolutely. What it says is that we've got major work to do. It also connects to why we still have lost so many of our kids. It also connects to this whole notion of disengagement, and why it's hard to get teachers to come and work in the Bronx. These are all pieces of a puzzle that are working together, because there are some fundamental flaws in how we are doing our work in the first place, how we are measuring our schools. This is something that we're working together, even with our state representatives, that we should not measure the success of a school purely on standardized exams.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: That's right.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: You can do well on standardized exams all day and have no idea what the

City Council does. So when you talk about civic... civic education, that is something that we're leaning into, when I talk about the reimagined student experience. I want every child who graduated from the New York City public school, to be ready not only to vote, but to be able to take their rightful place in this democracy and understand how to make change within this system. You cannot make change if you have no idea what's going on. I want young people to be out here, be prepared to vote. I want them to come to your town hall meetings. I want them to understand what the attorney general does. There should be a student government in every school in New York City and there will be. So we... I just got here in January, and we've been using this time to try and just put a plan together. We are still in the midst of all that. So as we get into September, we'll really be able to hit the ground... hit the ground running.

As it relates to some of the issues around colocation, you know, we're doing the best that we can. There's not a lot of appetite at the state level for the continued creation of more and more charter schools. We're seeing less of that. But

what I do believe is that charter schools and traditional public schools have a lot that we can learn from each other. And we've got to... we've got to eliminate that divide. At the end of the day, they're all of our kids, and we've got to make sure that we're learning. When charter schools were created in the first place, they were meant to be places of innovation that the entire system would learn from, and somewhere along the way we got away from there. And as I've met with charter school leaders, I told them, I'm interested in scaling what they have learned, and share that across schools. But I'm also want to make sure that you know that we got traditional public schools that are doing amazing things, I'm sure in some of your district...

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: That's right.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: ... this idea that it's only that the charter schools that are doing great things is not true. There are great charter schools, and they are great public... traditional public schools. And we got to all work together to share...

(crosstalk)

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: But Chancellor, on that real quick: You're absolutely right on the original

intent of charter schools. That was to be a model for the rest of the schools, not setting up another tier education system, and then the private sector that's behind them, the hedge funds that's behind the charter schools and fronts, not for profits, let them pay for it. Not... don't take it out of our public school money. They're hiding behind there, creating not for profits. Let them pay for the physical facilities for charter schools.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Well, at the end of the day, charter schools are public schools, and parents... (crosstalk)

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: They say... they say public charter, but I'm not... don't mean to be rude... but a public charter is an oxymoron. You are either owned by the public school system, are you owned by a private not for profit or for profit. There's no in between Chancellor.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Well, listen, I'm not... I'm not here for that debate. That's for another time, but I am here simply to say, I was asked by this Mayor to be the Chancellor of the school system, and in doing that, my responsibility is to the children who are in these traditional public schools, to give

1 them the best quality education that we possibly can.
2 That's what I am committed to. As relates to the
3 virtual option, that is something I believe that
4 if... if we are, God forbid, hit with another massive
5 surge, and we got to close our schools down, I
6 believe that we are much better prepared now than we
7 were before. So much so that we will be announcing -
8 - and you heard a little bit mentioned today around
9 some virtual school options that are going to be full
10 time options where kids will be able to go to school
11 virtually -- we're going to use that... those schools
12 as also labs of innovation. We want to learn from
13 that, so that in fact informs how we will teach
14 virtually to all of our kids. I believe that virtual
15 learning is here to stay, whether or not we have a
16 pandemic or not. And we want to look at it from a
17 positive standpoint and figure out how do we use that
18 technology so that kids can think beyond the four
19 walls of the classroom and be exposed to the best
20 teaching the best experiences all over the world.
21 They ought to be global. So you can't be a global
22 citizen with a neighborhood mentality.

23
24 SERGEANT SADOWSKI: Time expired.
25

CHANCELLOR BANKS: ... the larger work, and that's what we tried to do. So I did my best to answer all 85 of your questions, and we can certainly follow up at a later time.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'll get the other 70 when you come to meet us.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: You got it, Charles.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we will call on Council Member Carr, followed by councilmembers Brewer, Faris, De La Rosa, Hanks, and we have others, but we'll turn to Councilmember Carr.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you so much. Thank you to our Chairs for putting together this hearing on the Exec Budget. Chancellor, it's good to see you as always. You know, you talked about charters, you know, conceived as a model for innovation, and you came and saw on yourself in my district earlier this year Bridge Prep, which is serving students who have dyslexia. And you know, as you heard from the parents there, you know, they and their children are looking forward to the future, and looking for a high school model that does what Bridge Prep is already doing. I'm glad to see that, you know, we're

investing more for dyslexic students, but I was wondering if you had any thoughts on that, and if you're willing to work with us to create that high school model so that students have that option as they age out of Bridge Prep?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Absolutely. And we certainly want to work with you. I just want to say that was one of the best visits I've had, to go out there to Staten Island and to see -- and primarily kids of color -- who are in this school that has as its focus students who are suffering from dyslexia. It completely aligns with what our mayor has been talking about. We've got to provide the kinds of services that our kids who have those kinds of challenges need, and they are there are thousands of them all across our school system. And so we are fully committed to doing that. Our Deputy Chancellor Quintana is leading... leading that work. And so we are absolutely going to continue to work with you. She was part of that... that visit as well. And we thank you also for... for you and former Borough President Otto for all the work that he did, in helping to create that model, because it can really be a real model for so many of our kids. We need to

learn from what they what they have done there, and we are pledging a commitment to you. I know, in the immediate term, they're looking for what the high school piece can be. I'm just asking that you stay working very closely with our Deputy Chancellor Quintana around that, and we're going to do the best that we can to be supportive.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Happy to do that. We really love to. And you're right, it's a very diverse campus, and they're flourishing students. And it's an it's great, and I and I hope that it's something that can be... can be brought to other boroughs as soon as possible.

As far as you know, gifted and talented goes, I'm really glad to see you know, the administration's commitment to that. In the past, we never had sufficient G&T seats on Staten Island. I, you know, we met many parents who were traveling off borough so that their children could have that opportunity. And I just wondering, you know, what... what, you know, number of seats do you think is sufficient to meet the need in Staten Island? And when do you think they would become available? And what's the process for determining where that's going to be?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, I'll speak to that a little bit. (inaudible) the borough, but we are committed to the concept for sure.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Yes, thank you. And thank you Chancellor for pitching the question in this direction.

So as you know, the process that we're using will pull from each of the different schools that are in a district. The top 10% of students then become part of the pool of students eligible for G&T. And so we're committed to building... or opening at least one G&T program in each district. And if there is greater need, and if we have schools and principals and teachers who are both willing and ready, then we can take a look at whether or not there's the capacity to add additional programs. But at the very least we would have one. And the idea is that because it is per district, you really can pull first from the community. So it would add those seats directly in Staten Island for students from Staten Island. And I think that that increases some of those... those opportunities for folks.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: And what's the concept of what the average program size would be in each district in terms of seats?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: So we're opening a section in kindergarten and in third grade where there isn't already a kindergarten and third grade, and we'll use those standard classroom designations in terms of space, in terms of union policies, and so we'll make decisions based... And also it really depends on the number of students that have parents who actually apply and are interested in the program. And we'll do our best to, you know, make spaces available for the number of kids who are invested in this type of work, and if we need to open additional programs, and we can certainly look into that.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you. And my last question is around what some of my colleagues were raising earlier, which is about the presence of social workers and guidance counselors in schools.

You know, I believe very strongly in a strong school safety program, but I do think that social workers and guidance counselors are essential to both the safety and the wellness of students on campus. And I'd love to get more details offline about you

know, what we have in our schools here on Staten Island, and what that is... whether or not that's meeting, establish metrics.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you, Council Member Carr. I look forward to engaging with you more deeply around the counseling and social work Support. I just would like to add at the highest level that every school across the entire city including the borough Staten Island, young people have access to a guidance counselor, social worker, or school based mental health center. So they do have access to this resource. What that looks like specific to your, your district or region, and we can engage at a later time. So thank you for the question.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: I appreciate that so much. And thanks for answering my questions. I really appreciate it.

CHIEF JOHNSON: Absolutely.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Council Member Carr. Next we'll turn to Council Member Brewer.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. Thank you very much Chancellor and all of D.O.E. I also like the fact that you're moving the enrollment centers

under a superintendent according to the newspapers.

So congratulations on many fronts. Nothing is easy.

A couple of questions on school food. I've always pushed to have more summer food opportunities. It's there but not used. I'm wondering what you're doing, budget wise, to allocate... to make sure parents know about the school food. And then according to the material we have \$25 million and cafeteria upgrades is possible. I put in some of those deli to some of the high schools it makes a huge difference. And I think school food is important. I know the Mayor talks about plant based, and that's important. But just to have it... to be an opportunity to... to use... to make people healthy is not always done because of how it is presented. So school food is one.

Then the second question I have is just on literacy: How much has been allocated? You know better than I that there has been a loss of it during this pandemic. All the principals are complaining to me. So what are we doing in terms of specifics? And also, is there a budget allocation for recruitment of math and science teachers, particularly, teachers of color? Because math and science are lacking. I know

lots of teacher types are lacking, but that's in particular.

And then in terms of SCA: Bathrooms. I know somebody, Councilmember Stevens, mentioned it, but I get all the time: I need new bathrooms. I'm like, why do I have to pay to not deal with this. So what are... is there an allocation for bathroom upgrade? And also, it takes about a year and a half for SCA to get the technology, even just for smart boards. So I'm just wondering, is there some other opportunity for speeding up the money that we use for SCA on technology?

And then finally, everybody's talking about social workers. I've been talking about for about 30 years. And the question is... I think there's a March 22 DOE report on social workers. It hasn't been completed, so... and I think it is mandated. So I just would hope that you would keep us very much up to date, because even though we say every school has a social worker, they don't because we call around.

I could go on. But those are some questions, and I appreciate everything you're doing.

SENIOR ADVISOR VARLACK: Thank you, Council Member, for your... your questions. I'd like to

start by just talking a little bit about the school food program. We are equally as pleased at the opportunity and the focus from both the Mayor as well as the Chancellor on school food. And it's certainly something that we talk about almost daily here at the department.

With respect to the cafeteria enhancement program, we are incredibly pleased with the progress that's been made to date. And we are looking to continue to invest and to move forward with enhancing those cafeterias across the city with... so that is certainly ongoing, and we can certainly have a conversation and share more specifics on... on what the plan is. And with respect to summer food, we are also looking forward to having a robust summer food program over the summer. We are working on finalizing those details and we will certainly be moving to advertise about what those programs are going to be and where they will be located in short order.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, because usually it's done the day school ends. So I assume that will not be true this year. That's been my experience in the past.

SENIOR ADVISOR VARLACK: Yes, that's true. I believe that advertising will actually be earlier this year.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I hope so. Then literacy in math and science.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: What happened?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Can you repeat that question, please?

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: What's the budget? And how are we making sure that literacy is funded appropriately of coaches, of teachers? Kids are not reading... we... every teacher and every principal tells me, and I know that from personal experience. And then are we allocating anything to recruit math and science teachers, particularly communities of color? You're really short on math and science teachers... not to mention other kinds of teachers, but those are two in particular. And a lot of the friends I know they're going to the private schools. Why are they going to the private schools as math teachers out of the University of Chicago and elsewhere? New Yorkers? Because it's easier. It's too hard to become a D.O.E. teacher. So they quickly

go to the private schools, and we need them here, not to mention the charter schools.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you, Councilmember Brewer, I think Chancellor Banks wanted to make a comment first.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: No no. I'm good.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Alright, then I'll answer the question. Incredibly important, and I absolutely agree. We need to be able to better support our students across our classrooms, not only those with print-based disabilities, but in general to make sure that they have the foundation and the mechanics of reading. And so we're going to, I think, it mentioned already the...

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: ...the process to support folks with the very specific training for dyslexia, and part of that is also just in general, bringing in an explicit phonics curriculum in grades K through two, making sure that we have supports in place so we are actually building out a team of coaches who will provide support K through two, a separate set of coaches for three through five, another for grades six through eight, and then

finally for grades nine through twelve, where we have not had across K-12. And so we're building this team of coaches. In addition, we'll be putting AIS points at every district, at least one at every district -- and in districts with higher needs two or more -- so that they can provide supports. And for schools that may have students who may need secondary interventions, who may need secondary... sorry, screeners and evaluations. And so those AIS points will be trained on how to support schools, but also on how to do those interventions themselves. So we're... we're offering opportunities to... for teachers to be trained. Initially, every teacher will receive free training for dyslexia awareness, and very specific skills to address the needs in classrooms. And that are skills that will... or strategies rather, that will benefit all students. And as I mentioned, we're going to use evidence-based foundational literacy programs. So curricula very specifically that schools will have choices to acquire, that comes with training. And then just ensuring that there are tiers of support, depending on what folks need. We're also employing -- and this is, I think, something incredibly important for a

budget meeting because one way of ensuring that even after these initial funds are not available in future years, but and to just to make sure that we don't need to keep investing in the same ways -- we're building a train-the-trainer model. And so we're really working on facilitators who have very explicit knowledge of... uh, Orton Gillingham, for example, is one of the... the programs, right?, so we'll use a train-the-trainer model to make sure that we have tiers of folks who are trained, and can provide support, and then additional training. So if they become certified, they can then train our teachers, they can train our leaders, and we'll have those sustainable practices in place.

And then as I mentioned, the opening of those two programs: one standalone school, and one program embedded within a school, provides a space for almost like a lab site for teachers to be trained for leaders to be trained, and for them to see those practices in place. So that we can build off what's there.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: What about math teacher... math teachers recruitment... math, math?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: So for math and science, and actually just any of our areas of need, right?, so we have an area of need with teachers for students with disabilities, for bilingual Ed, for a range of teachers. We're working very closely with our teacher recruitment and quality folks to recruit teachers using a range of incentives, including... sometimes it's not even recruiting brand new teachers, but rather looking for teachers who may want to have an extension to their licenses. We're also working with local institutions. We've been working with organizations like Burke out of Fordham University and at the state. I think I mentioned that I met last week with folks from the state directly to think about how we better recruit and prepare teachers. And I think that, you know, part of it is just making sure that they see this as a viable option, right?, that teaching is a viable option.

But the other piece is just making sure that there are adequate supports in place so that our teachers don't leave, right? If we're creating the kinds of environments that are really holding and supporting our teachers, affirming who they are,

making sure that they receive development, and then... then they'll stay. And I think... I don't know if Dan, if you want to add to that.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Yep. Thank you. Thank you, Carolyn. Just... I know, we're out of time... but councilmember, I would love to talk to you. Your point is so well taken that it's too difficult to become a teacher not just in New York City, but in the state, frankly, we may need your help.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I don't care about the state. I only care about New York City.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Sorry.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I just care about the city. I don't care about the state. I'm serious. I got it then, go ahead.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Just... just to say this is something we are really focused on. It's not only too difficult, but one of the reasons we lose great talent to like private schools. It's really expensive. It's really expensive. And one of the reasons we don't have the diversity that we should in our teacher core is because it costs a lot of money to become a teacher. Now we're doing some things...

I don't want to say... teaching fellows programs or other programs where we're trying to address that, but it's not enough. So we would love to work with you on that because it is it's a real problem.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Finally, just quickly SCA on the technology too long and the bathrooms.

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you councilmember quickly on the bathrooms. So we have \$50 million set aside in our bathroom upgrade program. But that is in addition to any of the bathrooms that we make accessible and renovate as part of our accessibility program as well. And we do do full scale bathroom upgrades during our full accessibility pro... projects.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: How much does each bathroom costs? It's like a million dollars. Some crazy amount of money.

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Yeah, so... so certainly, we have heard this in the past and we worked with our colleagues at division of school facilities where we are now doing a pair of bathrooms for boys and girls for \$170,000. So under the... under the \$50 million bathroom upgrade program, we are able to accomplish 150 pairs of bathrooms.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And then my tech.

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: On your tech... and
(inaudible) may still be on. But I will say two
things to that. One is that... you know, you're...
you, as a council member and former Borough
President, we're probably talking schools in the
January timeframe getting those allocations ready.
As it goes through the budget process, we don't... we
work with OMB to get the CP from them, probably late
fall even end of the calendar year. So we... you
know, we're trying to strategize with OMB of how we
can get that CP process done quickly. Because we
don't get that funding and we can't do anything, we
can't reach out to the schools and get the orders in
until that's complete. So that coupled with supply
chain issues, I think, is really where you're seeing
the delay. I will say we are trying to work with
them to speed up that process.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. Thank you very
much. Thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we will
turn to Councilmember Farias.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Hi, folks, and thank you so much for all the testimony today. And please, if any of the questions I'm about to ask have been already answered, just flag that for me and I can go back.

I really wanted to highlight really quickly... thank my colleagues, Chair Brannan, and Chair Joseph along with Speaker Adams for asking about our... the very many issues we have going on in our schools along with the community school models, and why funds need to be advocated for, specifically because schools in the Bronx and in my district really do need the wraparound services, additional supports due to lack of healthy food access, being in healthcare deserts, lack of equitable transit, etc. So thank you.

I just wanted to ask some questions around career and technical education. Do we... do we know or have a process for bolstering monetarily our CTE schools... individually our CTE schools right now?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Lindsey?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Councilmember Yes, we do provide additional resources to our CTE programs through a variety of different ways. We

recognize that our career pathways programs have really different expenses. Whether you're running a nursing program or a culinary program, you obviously have different supplies that you need, perhaps different teachers or access to experts. And so we do provide additional funding to support those costs.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay, great. And I guess... I'm sorry I did not frame this in the same... in this way that I particularly wanted it answered. But I know that for my for my previous experience in workforce and partnering up with our CTE schools that some students are literally placed in CTE because it's their last choice on their high school application, and it was not their first or second or third. And so are we looking at ways to increase outreach to get the students that enjoy working with their hands that enjoy working in a... in a field, that our CTE schools are, you know, training folks in right now? Are we looking at ways to even answer for the direct concerns that some of our parents have by their students going into a trade versus college where we, you know, have a DOE system for years that was solely focused on college for all?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: No, I agree. I appreciate that. That's a great question. And... and it is one of the challenges that we have, which is helping... helping everyone to understand that this new career pathways work that we're talking about is not necessarily traditional, you know, just CTE. There's going to be some traditional CTE and trade work, of course, but we're talking about a much broader plan than that. This is not your grandfather's CTE, right? I came up at a time where they would say to really smart kids, we want you to go to college, and the other kids who don't do so well, you know, do something with your hands, go into a trade. There were a lot of racial, you know, applications around that and language around. What we're talking about today are opportunities for kids who are coming out of high school to make \$75,000 and be... and be on a pathway to the middle class, to get off Mommy and Daddy's payroll and have like real skills to do real stuff. And... and that is what this this 21st Century economy is demanding. They're telling us you got to produce kids who have real skills, certifications to go in and not just, you know, not low level jobs, but high level jobs that... but they

require real skill. This is going to have tremendous implications for our workforce, our teachers to help the entire system to get better. And I don't know if you heard our chief of career pathways, will just ask her to take a minute on it as well, Jade Grieve, if you can just kind of expound a little bit on it. Because this is a really big deal for us. This is not just expanding on a few more CTE classes. That's not what we're talking about. Jade.

CHIEF GRIEVE: Thank you, Chancellor, and thank you, Council Member for the question. And just to say, we'd appreciate the chance to talk more about you about this with you, if you'd like given... given your interest. But just to share a little bit more about some of the career pathways programs that we're planning for launch in the coming school year, and then wanting to expand those right across the city beyond that, but we really see this as an opportunity to blend the best of college and career readiness.

So looking to really... and in... in the spirit of the Chancellor's push around redesigning the student experience to be to be blending both career-themed instruction within the walls of the academic experience, as well as giving students the

opportunity for... alongside that sequence advising and readiness around ensuring that they're all able to develop a very strong post-secondary plan, regardless of whether they're going to college, or career, coming out of school, ensuring that we're giving students the chance to...

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

CHIEF GRIEVE: ...really kind of get a broad sense of the career opportunities and get some get some career awareness, experience, and exposure as part of that. And then lastly, giving students a chance for a head start, so the Chancellor's talked a bit about some of the opportunities that that do exist with the right kinds of industry credentials, and certainly the chance to get some early college credit before they graduate.

So we see the opportunities of blending those, actually addressing some of the things that you raised in your question about this, about college for all and CTE. And this is really an opportunity to bring the best of those together. And we're excited to... to start that next year, next school year with some schools.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Great, thank you. And I know what the interest of time, if I can just ask the last couple of questions that you folks can briefly touch on, and then I will mute myself that if the chair allows. Chair?

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, that's fine.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay, thank you. Um, so the last thing I wanted to say about CTEs... or two things I want to say about CTE, really, that the pathway to employment part are finding those signatory employers that are really matching up with our CTE schools is critical, only because right now, from what I've seen, I've seen from my experiences, we have folks learning how to... or, or getting an internship at the MTA, for example, but then, upon graduation, are stuck on a two-three year waiting list for the civil service exam. I'd really like us to see... it's something I've been talking about for years while partnering up with the state to push back on finding a loophole or finding a credentialing way certification way to say, how do we move people, especially those that we are training and we know are ready to go right into the workforce? How do we move them beyond the civil service exam, or the waitlist

of the civil service exam, and then I'd like to hear what we're doing within our education system around bridge programming.

And then if we can touch on a budget for crossing guards across the board for all of our schools.

Recently, I had a crossing guard, one of my schools pass away, and within that week, unfortunately, we had a student that was hit by a car in that... in that school zone. So I know they're kind of needed across the board, and I just like to hear what does... what does that line item look like in terms of ensuring not only that we're training folks to become crossing guards and into those fields? But also, are we addressing the need that we have budgetarily to ensure that every school can get access to them?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Well, let me say... on the crossing guards piece, they know they technically are part of NYPD, and we probably have to address that with them. But to your first point, I think you're absolutely right. I... if our kids are getting a level of exposure, particularly in high school, we should put them in a position where they don't have to sit on the back of all of a waiting list for some

of these jobs. We should be preparing them for direct entry into some of these city positions. And it would certainly seem to me that that's something the City Council could help us with. We don't have direct authority, right with MTA, but I think you know, as council members, that's something that you can help to drive in partnership with us. That will be great on behalf of our kids.

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Great, thank you. You can sign me as a partner in that. I'm ready to tackle some of those issues with you. Thank you so much for answering my questions today.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. Next we'll turn to Council Member De La Rosa.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much, Chancellor and all the team and our Chairs for this wonderful hearing. Chancellor first let me say that you made me very happy this morning and very excited about the possibility for the partnership with the Dominican Republic. As you know, our community is one of the largest in the school system. And it's very important for us to have that reflection in the

leadership of your Administration. So thank you so much.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: (inaudible) Adasa! Adasa!

COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Exactly. Adasa.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: It's coming from.

COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Exactly. So, in that same vein, part of my question is about the hiring freeze, and if you've already answered this question, I'm happy to just look back at it as well. But in the March budget hearing, it was mentioned that there was a hiring freeze at the D.O.E.. We see that... that... We did not see a change in the PEG in the executive budget. So what is the status of the hiring freeze? And the reason I'm asking is because of obviously an underlying concern about special education students, our students, which we know are at a crisis point, right now. And so I'm trying to reconcile in my mind, how are we going to deal with the services that are needed if there is a freeze?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Councilmember, thank you very much for the question. There was briefly a hiring freeze put in place by the city, but that has since been lifted. And that hiring freeze never impacted school based positions. It doesn't...

and nothing is impacting school hiring now. And we expect that, you know, we will have more information about school hiring for the upcoming school year in the next couple of weeks.

As it pertains to our, sort of, non-school based positions, obviously, we review positions closely and work with our city partners, but there is no longer you know, full scale freeze on... on any positions.

COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Okay. And can you talk a little bit about the services for the ELL students and the special education students and what that looks like?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you, Councilmember De La Rosa. So in terms of services, we are continuing to build some of our inclusive programs so that we can expand what we have seen is working, right?, to one of the pillars of the chancellor. We're finding that programs that are inclusive for our students, first with special needs, are very... have shown it to be more effective, and have also shown to be less expensive. And so we're really looking at duplicating some of those efforts. So for example, the ASD Nest program, our horizons program, those types of programs where students are

receiving supports within the community school are most effective for our students with disabilities. In addition to that, we are building up practices across the curriculum. And so building out literacy practices, building out different types of strategies to meet the needs of students with math, and then really using some of those assessments that we've put in place, with screeners to find out what it is that students need in terms of intervention, and building out those strategies, for example, with our students with disabilities as well. So there are already programs very specifically to meet those literacy needs in the... in those... for that community.

For our English language learners. We talked a little bit about building out more heritage language opportunities, as well as some of those bilingual extension programs. And our biggest piece is making sure that our content area teachers as well as our English Language Learner teachers, and our teachers of students with disabilities are all well trained to meet the needs of our kids. So the responsibility isn't exclusively on the teacher who is an ELL teacher, or teacher of students with disabilities,

but rather all of our teachers really have those strategies in place.

COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Great. And I wanted to also uplift Council Member Gennaro's comments around carbon free and Healthy Schools. Chair Joseph and I just wrote an Op Ed in City Limits around this topic and the need to make sure that environmental justice communities like ours, are taken into consideration, especially the infrastructure needs in our schools. I've personally been touring the schools in District 6. There's a lot of need. One of those needs as well is the... the access to water fountains. You know, lead remediation in schools, some of these buildings are 100 years old, as you know. And so I wanted to just uplift those comments that my colleagues made. And of course, the class size comments. You know, there have been people that have been working on the reduction of class size, you know, while I was still in school, and so I want to uplift the need for us to take a look at it, right? Education has changed since the pandemic is upon us, and the ability for our children to have adequate class size continues to be a great need. And so I

wanted to just highlight both of those points. Thank you so much for answering our questions today.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you councilmember Council Member De La Rosa. Next... I do not see Council Member Hanks, so we will turn to Council Member Menin.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now. .

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Hi, thank you so much. And I really want to thank the chairs for this fantastic hearing. It's incredibly helpful to really drill down on these details. So I also, in continuation of what my colleague, Councilmember De La Rosa, just said, I also want to uplift the comments on class size matters. I really believe that the class size is absolutely imperative and really urge administration to take all the comments that were raised by my colleagues very seriously on that. So I had a question about funding for construction of outdoor play spaces, because we do have a number of schools that don't have gyms and then don't have outdoor play spaces, so I wanted to understand if there was any additional funding allocation for that to ensure that all the schools have that.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Nina still here?

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Regarding gyms, we did start an initiative where we did look at 76 buildings where there were not gyms, and in many cases we were able to create gymnasiums. This was an initiative that was started about eight years ago and has not seen funding in this capital plan to expand that to more schools. We... and under that we were able to create a prototype and installed are constructed 22 or 23 standalone gymnasiums. We... we do, you know, in terms of outdoor play space, we do have funding in the plan to either create or renovate a lot of the playgrounds, as well as over \$100 million for fields. So certainly we are looking at outdoor play space as a... as a priority for us. And also--I'm sure we'll get more questions on this--as we're removing the TCUs, we do renovate the playground, if an addition is not needed to be built in that space. We also try to, you know, be creative in some constraints of the building itself. And we do look to sort of... if there is space in the existing school, if there's any way that we can modify some of the spaces to create indoor play space, maybe like a multipurpose room, you know, aside from the cafeteria, I'm not saying that, but just where they could play indoors as well.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: So does that mean with this \$100 million fund that you just mentioned... I have schools in my district and I know other colleagues do as well, but for example, my district in the East Harlem part of my district, we have one of the highest childhood obesity rates and childhood asthma rates. We have schools in my district that don't have any outdoor play space. Is the administration then committing to create those outdoor play spaces? Like what will that \$100 million fund... how many schools will that cover? Does it cover all the schools that are in need?

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: So just to clarify, the 100 million that I was referring to was for athletic fields, mostly the those that exist, not so much new ones. And as I mentioned that we did... we did have some funding set aside for gymnasium... standalone gymnasiums. I don't think with the funding that we have, we can commit to creating play space for every school that does not have it yet. We do work with D.O.E. to make sure that outdoor play space is made available, whether it's through closing streets and things like that... not the ideal scenario, and I'm

sure you will... will agree to that. But we do also have \$50 million set aside for playground renovations. So we do have some money, but I cannot commit to saying that every school that does not have an outdoor play space will have an outdoor play space created by the SCA.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: And what about new construction for new schools?

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: That is... (crosstalk)

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Is that the commitment that SCA is making? That you are going to allocate that?

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: we do create outdoor play space with our new schools? Yes. Okay. Sometimes it's rooftop, But we try to do as much at-grade space, You know, when it's possible.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Yeah. Because in our district, as you know, we have many schools that are closing the streets, kids playing right by traffic. It's not as you said... it's less than AN ideal situation.

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Understood.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: I have another question if I still have time on dual languages. Can you talk a little bit... could someone from D.O.E. speak a

little bit about the dual-language programs, any commitment to it? We have a lot of inquiries in my district about dual language programs and what the administration's commitment is to that.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Yes, thank you for that question, Council Member Menin. We are looking to expand our bilingual programs and want to make sure that we are designing programs that are going to be successful for students using data and information that we have in collaboration with the folks at district. So working with superintendents, working with parents, we hope to open about 50 bilingual programs... open or expand rather about 50 bilingual programs, and we'll make decisions based on... on where and what languages with all of that information in that engagement.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Okay, thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember. Next we'll turn to Council Member Feliz followed by Council Member Hudson.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: All right, hello, everybody. So good to see everybody. Thank you,

Finance Chair Brannan and Education Chair Joseph, for this very informative hearing. And also, thank you, Chancellor Banks, very good to see you. Thank you and your team for the very important work that you do right here in the City of New York.

My questions are about trailer classrooms in our city, also known as TCUs. I have so many of them in my district. I think everyone in this room has many goals in common, including the goal of ensuring that every child in the city of New York gets the high quality education that they deserve, and I think we could also agree that in order to get that high quality education, we need a lot of tools, including educational spaces that are good for learning. And I'm extremely concerned about the fact that we still have so many Temporary Classroom Units. We call them to see us and we also call them non TCU temporary buildings. But at the end of the day, they're still trailer classroom buildings. Again, I have so many of them in my district. And I represent a very poor, very vulnerable district. And I think it's a big problem. Trailers that are 20 or 30 years old, or even older. Um, you could only imagine that condition. And it's a problem. And I'm not blaming

this administration. I know the administration has been in office for four months. And this is a problem that has been accruing over the years and decades. But, you know, obviously, all of us get to decide how we move forward on this issue of, you know, children, still learning in trailers, especially low income, vulnerable children.

So a few questions about the trailer classrooms, and for general context, can you provide information on how many trailer classrooms or trailer buildings we have in our city, including those that we call TCUs, but also those that we call non-TCU temporary buildings?

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you for that question, Councilmember. I know, Councilmember Stevens was afraid that you weren't going to be on to ask this very important question. So she even asked on your behalf. So thank you for bringing that up. And so... so we started out with 354 TCUs throughout our system. And we've removed about 270. And we have plans like... it's in process for many more. So we are working on plans to remove the remaining 33 for which we don't have plans. I will say that is for TCUs. Of those remaining 33, there are two in your

district at one school and two in councilmember Stevens, district one we're talking about the Bronx, as well. So there are four TCUs that we do not yet have plans for. We are working very hard to get plans for that. There is, as you mentioned, other temporary structures, which we you know... we were really looking at this as a multi-pronged approach. Let's get rid of all of the... the majority the 354 TCUs, and then let's go and look at the other temporary structures, the non-TCU temporary structures. And what we're trying to do is do it in a more systematic way. We have been able to remove some of them by creating additions, PS 105, in the Bronx, 95 and 96 in the Bronx, Q2, obviously in Queens, but we haven't been able to... we don't have the funding in this plan and we're trying to come up with a systematic way to remove those remaining temporary structures. There are about 65 of them and Chair Joseph shared with me pictures of PS85 in the Bronx when she was there with you, and I do see, can you see that this one... PS85 in particular is very long and is right next to the existing school building. Now that that temporary structure has about 200 kids supposedly enrolled, enrolled in that

building. And I want to say before I go on with that we do not count the capacity of those structures. So when you're looking at the Bluebook, the capacity of that temporary structure is not included. But for practicality purposes, it's... it's harder to remove something that contains 200 Children, where... where on the site is where the ideal place to build maybe an addition, without figuring out how to move those children while we build an addition. So this... our approach was really to get rid of the TCUs -- not an easy task, but easier because they are smaller structures -- and then let's work with the D.O.E. to come up with... do we temporarily re-site them? What can we do in order to build a more permanent structure? Sorry, I don't mean to interrupt.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: ... and how many... I'm sorry, I know time is limited. How many? So you mentioned 65 temporary structures. Can you give a breakdown of how many we have per borough?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: I'm happy to give that...

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Super-rough numbers if you don't have the hard numbers in front of you.

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Yeah, I don't have broken down by... I have it by council district. So I'm happy to send that to you afterwards, if you don't mind.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Yeah, okay, that's fine. And also, if the chair would permit, just a few more points on this very important topic.

CHAIR JOSEPH: Yes, Council Member, please go ahead.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you. I really appreciate it. Um, so approximately how much money... or is there any way that the SCA and the Department of Education could prioritize this issue? Many of these temporary... TCUs... trailer classrooms... let's call them trailer classrooms. So that's what they are, regardless of whether we call them TCU or non-TCU... many of them are located in school buildings that have really large playgrounds. The TCUs or the trailers are located right in the middle of the playground. So it is possible to basically construct a school extension right on the corner of the playground, and then demolish the TCU, or the trailer after that extension is built, so that you don't have to disrupt classrooms. You don't have to transfer the students to other areas. What can we do

to, I guess, accelerate the timeline. It is 2022. It is unacceptable that the poorest, most vulnerable children are learning in... in trailers with water leaks every time it rains, or with lack of proper ventilation, air conditioning system, what can be done at this level of government to accelerate that timeline?

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: So that's exactly what we're starting to look at now, is whether it's feasible to create an addition to remove such temporary structures. We were able to do that... exactly what you're talking about at PS96 in Queens, where we are building the addition, and after the addition is built are we able then to remove the TCU. So the kids will be in place during the duration. So again, I think, you know, we were so focused on the TCUs that, you know, like I said, we have about 65 or so of our... the TCBs or these other non-TCU temporary structures. That's exactly the deeper dive that we need to go into now.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Like, how much money would it cost to get all the TCUs and TCBs replaced? I know it's a super... you know, you're not going to have

the hard numbers there. But more or less, how much are we talking about?

PRESIDENT KUBOTA: It would be hard for me to give a number without looking at each one of those 65 or so sites. I think with the \$352 million that we have in this capital plan, we will be able to remove the TCUs. That's why, I want to just say if you could give us a little time to start looking at those TBCs, I don't want to give you a number that is so wrong, so if you give us a little time, we will certainly come back to you.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Okay. Well, thank you so much. And I hope that that SCA and also the Department of Education could, you know make this a top priority. We cannot talk about high quality education when children are learning in trailers. And again, I'm not blaming this administration. This has been happening for many decades. But I hope we could come up with a real plan to get this resolved soon because, you know, our generations cannot continue to wait for... for good education. Thank you so much.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you and next we'll turn to Councilmember Hudson.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Hi there. Thank you for the opportunity to just ask you a question. I know that my... many of my colleagues have asked a lot of really great questions, and apologies, I don't believe this has been asked yet I've been trying to follow along as best as I can, and trying to, you know, multi... multitask here. But you mentioned earlier about expanding the Gifted and Talented program. And in my district, I have one of the first schools to sort of self-select out of the Gifted and Talented program, and eliminate it really in an effort to achieve true parity in the education system. And we know that black and brown kids are disproportionately underrepresented in gifted and talented programs. So I would just like to know what you'll be doing to support and empower the school communities that have chosen not to participate in Gifted and Talented program, and how you'll ensure that the kids who have traditionally been left out of these programs will have access. And how much are you investing in the Gifted and Talented program for fiscal year 23? Thank you.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: No, I appreciate that, Council Member, and I appreciate when we had the opportunity to to visit my old elementary...

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Yeah, new bridges. That was great.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, which was PS167, back when I was a teacher there. But nonetheless, you know, what you raised is... is kind of representative of the challenge of being in a job like this. When you speak, there's no monolithic way that parents and communities feel. There are some parents which were desperate to have gifted and talented and told me at every turn. And then others who said, you know, we we don't support gifted and talented. But the reason that we made the decision to offer the opportunity to have a gifted and talented in every district was in fact, to help to diversify the Gifted and Talented program. If we put a Gifted and Talented program in Ocean Hill, Brownsville, we are going to get black and brown students who are part of the Gifted and Talented program. If I... there are many districts here that you all represent that if we open it up, we go to Southeast Queens, which is what they asked us

to do, by definition, we're going to diversify the program, which is one of the issues.

So the diversity question was a question I think, at its heart when.... when it was such a scarcity model in only a handful of spots. But by putting it in every district, it... were going to open it up to everybody. That's number one.

The other part of it is... because we've been asked by a couple of communities around not doing it at all. What we have said, and my position on it is this, I would let the community voice what they want to do by... by voting with their feet. So we will know in your district to anybody else's district, if there's no demand for it, then we won't have it.

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, great.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: But I didn't want to... and I've spoken to some school leaders and a couple other community leaders, and they were telling me, "We don't want it." I said, "Well, let's let the parents decide." You know, in one sense, we can't... you know, we've had a lot of conversations around mayoral control of schools and everything else. And people say to me all the time, the parents don't feel that they have a voice, that they don't have a seat at the

table. So I can't in one sense, say "I'm opening up to parents," and then another sense, say, "Well, I'm not... You're not going to get it because other folks have spoken for you." I can't do that. And so we're just opening up as an option. There will not be a Gifted and Talented program in your district if the parents in your district say we're not interested, then there won't be one. But if they if they fill up a classroom for kids, then we'll have it.

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, that... that's helpful. And just to be clear, it's you know, the... My district is very diverse, and all the schools are very different. So there might be even diversity in thought and in those requests in my district alone, and I have both districts 17 and 13. So school districts 17 and 13.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: What we want to do is we want to we want to just open it up, we want to get started. We're just trying our best to establish some kind of a baseline. And we're here to see what we learn and what the experiences are. And in some districts, they're going to want to expand it. Other districts may say we don't need it. We'll figure it

out. We going to try to give it a year to take a look at it.

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: That sounds good. And then just in terms of investment. Is there dollar amount that you're putting into the Gifted and Talented program to expand to every district?

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah. Uh, Lindsey, what do you got, Lindsey:

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Yeah, Councilmember is 1.9 million.

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay. Citywide?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, thank you. Thanks, Commissioner. Thank you all.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember Hudson. And I do not see Councilmember Nurse, so next we will turn to Councilmember Lee.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Oh, sorry. I didn't realize it could unmute myself. Hi, everyone. Thank you so much to our leadership, Madam Speaker, as well as Chairs Brannan and Joseph, and thank you so much Chancellor for being on here, as well as president Kubota, sorry, from SCA, and all the staff. Also

forgive me for being in and out, I was actually visiting schools for their career day. So hopefully that gives me a legitimate pass for if I missed something. But I actually wanted to focus... I know that a lot of folks have been asking about social workers and mental health is super important in the schools. And I specifically wanted to focus in on the \$5 million that was allocated for the mental health continuum. As you know, this is an important issue for me as Chair of the Mental Health Committee, and I just wanted to check in because I know this is... if I... if I'm understanding this correctly, it's the first initiative that D.O.E. has collaborated with H&H on, Health And Hospitals, and DOHMH to help the students that are severely... that have significant mental health challenges in the schools. And so I just wanted to get a sense of how the partnership... I'll ask all the questions at once, so you can just answer them one at a time.

But I just wanted to get a sense of how the collaboration is working with the other city agencies that are part of this model? Has it been going well? What are some of the challenges? And also, you know, how have the schools that... I believe it's been 50,

it's in 50, high-need schools in South Bronx and central Brooklyn. So I just wanted to know the status of the initiative in those schools specifically and how it's been going? And also, if it's something that you would support, which I hope you will, for FY 23, and then extending it into the budget? And also where... if you think there's certain increases that need to be made? Or if it's too early to tell? If you could just speak on that a little bit more.

CHIEF JOHNSON: Okay, sorry about that. Thank you for the question, Councilmember. So the mental health continuum: We've been working in partnership with Health And Hospitals. We've been working with other colleagues to really kind of explore and deepen this level of access. As we are examining the success of this particular initiative, one of the things that we're finding is... trying to figure out and trying to navigate access to the resources across the various agency pathways, and then coordinating... leveraging those resources to engage staff. And so that has been a place where we've... we've been looking for... we've been working collaboratively. We've also been working to figure out ways to

continue to provide continued and additional funding for this. And... and we found that leveraging the... the funds across the various teams, has presented a little bit of a challenge. So with regard to the specific progress for each of the 50 schools, I'd have to confirm with the team and get back to you to this, around the specifics for that.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Okay, and I guess if you could get back to me on, you know, if... if the numbers are low, because I would imagine \$5 million is a drop in the bucket when you're talking about city wide. And so even with the 50 schools, I would imagine it's not enough. And so if you guys could come back to us with some sort of evaluation or assessment on where you guys think the needs are, because I'd be very curious to see how it has been working in those schools where it's it started. And if you could give us a sense of what the challenges are and how much more resources you guys would need in terms of that program or initiative. So if you guys could get back to us. That'd be awesome.

CHIEF JOHNSON: Absolutely. Thank you for the question.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember Lee.
And next we'll turn to Councilmember Sanchez.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Good afternoon everyone.
Good afternoon, Chancellor. Good to see everyone.
So my... my question is going to be about students
living in shelter. So, no reason why you would have
necessarily seen, but you know, I had a shootout... a
shootout in front of my office yesterday in the
afternoon. Right after I finished chairing the
Executive Budget hearing, we all had to jump to the
floor and you know... just... just cover right as
nine, nine shots were fired, and one of my
constituents... her son was shot in the leg.

And, you know, for me, it's... I love these kids,
these are my kids. They're doing terrible things,
because of the realities that we grow up in, right?,
and the difficulties and some of them have just never
had a fighting chance, right? And so, when you look
at something like what's in my district, which is we
have, we have some schools where 40% of children are
living in shelter... or are living in temporary
housing, right? We have... we have... and it's by the
way, it's right by where my office is, right? And so

when we put these things together I, you know, I'm just so frustrated, right and angry. And I know that we all are in.... we share this, but what are what are we doing? Right?

So, you know, I know we need community coordinators, that Council's budget response is asking for 100 of these community coordinators for students living in temporary housing. We have to help our students, right? We have to, um, fighting for housing on the other side, but within our schools, you know, we have to, we have to be there for them. And not... not just the the community coordinators, but making sure that, you know, what I'm hearing from these principals in these schools with... with the high shelter and temporary housing numbers is social workers and guidance counselors, and folks to really be there for... for those wraparound services.

So I know we're asking for 100 Community coordinators, we absolutely need them, the students need the supports. And so my first question is just about the status of the 50 that you already committed to? And can we do more?

CHIEF JOHNSON: So thank you for the question, Councilmember. So as you know, we've been looking creatively at ways to really address some of the needs for students and families experiencing homelessness. And first, before I get into the depth of the question, I just wanted to pause for a moment to say: Are you okay?

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: I'm okay. My team is okay. Thank you so much for asking.

CHIEF JOHNSON: I think it... you know, that... that's just what sits at the core of the work is, you know, just ensuring that we and our families and communities are okay.

And so I think as we think about the supports that we are leveraging for students in temporary housing, we've been really excited to really access the American Rescue Plan funding to really be able to -- as you'd mentioned -- identified the 50... the 50 community coordinators to support students in temporary housing. As we figure out what makes sense and how we... how we align those additional supports, we realize we... we need additional supports. These particular supports... these additional 50 staff members will be shelter-based staff members and will

be able to work in partnership and coordination with the school teams and school coordinators. They will also work in collaboration with our school base, bridging... bridging the gap social workers, who are the team of social... social workers who are identified exclusively for the supports for students in temporary housing. And we've been able to hire 100 of those Bridging the Gap social workers, in addition to the existing number of 107 community coordinators that already exist. So the 50 will add to that core. And then they work in partnership with our family assistance. And so we have about 117 family assistance. And so when we think about leveraging these well over 300 staff members, and adding an additional 50 to this core, we really are working to meet the need. We do recognize that there's still more that needs to be done. And I've committed to kind of working in partnership to figure out creative ways to figure out sourcing... to sustain the sources for these for these families who are experiencing homelessness at this time.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay, thank you and are... is the D.O.E. applying for a second round of Homeless Children And Youth funding.

CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes. Yes. So in the first round, and there was about \$9 million that was allocated. And the second round of funding is slightly more expensive. It's roughly about \$23 or \$24 million. And we've been really excited to work... to really engage multiple voices and multiple stakeholders. So within the D.O.E., we're working not just within the Office of Students in Temporary Housing, but working across all of the sectors where families and students are affected. We've been working more deeply within the core members who are part of the... part of the team, and who actually have the direct experience with students and families who are experiencing homelessness...

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

CHIEF JOHNSON: and we also are working in partnership across agencies. And so being able to... to activate on the kind of the mayor's priority to work across... inter-agencies, and really to think about DSS to think about ACS, and to really incorporate all of the different ways that families are touched by this particular matter, and to use that to leverage how we are going to adequately be

able to allocate the funds. And so we're working to draft that response in the coming weeks.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you so much. I will just follow up and request a breakdown... if the DOE could provide a breakdown of where these 117 plus 50 workers are going to be located and how the service is going to be divided? That would be really helpful. And Chancellor Banks, I will be reaching out to do a walkthrough in my district. I would love to host you here.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: (inaudible)

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. I'm not seeing Council Member Restler. We will turn to our final Council Member for questions for the Department of Ed and the SCA, Councilmember Avilés.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Hello everyone. Thank you so much to chair Brannan and Chair Joseph and everyone else for being on this call for so for so many hours. I appreciate you and all the work you're doing.

I just want to first start wholeheartedly agreeing with Council Member Hanif, who talked about

culturally... culturally responsive and sustaining education. I had a very particular instance in my district where a principal told me that she had received these books, that she had instructed her teachers not to distribute and use because she found the books racist. They were books sent through the Mosaic Program. And I asked her to tell me which book they were, and we could sit together and look at it. In fact, they were not racist, they were anti-racist books. But what it led... what it led me to understand was she had received boxes and boxes of beautifully selected new resources without any training and support and PD opportunities for teachers that don't understand or haven't done the self-reflection work around what it is to be an anti-racist educator. So I would love to hear what the plans are to fill that gap. Because I suspect that this is the case across other school districts, and this is a critical component to getting us to the place that we need.

Also, I'd love to know a little bit more about the justification for... for funding, potentially almost 800 school safety officer positions, when the rest of the D.O.E. budget is getting cut. That's in

addition to what already exists. I don't understand that, particularly since we are I mean, we're just talking about the need for... you know, transition advisors and social workers, and still the lack of... while investment is increasing, and that still, so many of our schools need really that kind of support. It is the first thing I hear from schools in my district. We need more of these kinds of support. So I would love for y'all to respond maybe to those two questions.

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Yes, thank you. Thank you, Councilmember Aviles. Sorry for the echo. Sometimes it makes us feel like a superstar in here.

So I appreciate you asking about the books. And actually, that is something that that I learned when we when I arrived here: That there were, you know, really great resources that were sent to schools, and we're incredibly happy about the fact that schools have received these texts, and we want to continue to do that, to be able to provide more diversity in the types of books that we are providing to schools, both the hardcopy books that kids can hold in our part of their classroom library, and the books that they can access through the electronic library, through SORA.

One of the things that that we noted was that they were sent without that support. And so for the schools that are very-well-versed in what it means to be an anti-racist school, or that are already talking about and learning about liberatory practices, they're fine. But you're absolutely right that in other places, it looks like we may need to do other types of... of training, and to really have conversations with the community about what the books are that we're sending. If at any point, a school does have a problem with a book, there is a process to be able to contest that book as well, but I appreciate that you sat with them and looked through the books, to see that in fact that we're not racist. And so thank you for helping to do that. I know that the more that we can provide representations of who our community is, the kinder and safer that we're building across the community. So I appreciate that.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Well, I'd love to follow up on that please, in particular, because I think the principal has still decided she... she reads this a particular way, and has instructed all her teachers to put those books on the side and to ignore them.

And so I think it really speaks to what... what is the guidance, parents won't know that these books even exist because they don't come home. So how... how is it that that the DOE is ensuring that these curriculums are getting rolled out responsibly? And... and with adequate support? She wouldn't... I don't know if she identified that, if she even wants to have that battle. It's easier for her to just put them aside and direct her teachers to do otherwise. So I guess I'm curious kind of like what the mechanism is there to make sure that... that we are... we are pushing our schools down this path in a loving and gentle way but certainly with... with urgency because they can be ignored.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, let me just say this also... got to mute... you know, there was a large body of work that was done before we even came into office, that... that really dealt with a lot of anti-racist trainings for...

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

... all across the city. And so that's a body of work that we're going to continue to support. When you hear... I don't know that this is a wide ranging citywide issue, so to the degree that you hear about

it, please, you know, let us know directly, what school, what principal, and we can follow up on that for sure. But... but trust me during the last several years, this is a this was a big body of work. And... and you know, it's not easy work, and everyone is not fully prepared for it. And... but we are going to continue to be as supportive as we can to all of our schools and our superintendents and our principals to really make sure that they're getting the support that they need to do this work effectively. But I've not heard a lot of pushback. That's what I'm saying I don't... it doesn't strike me as something that's a city-wide response and that people feel as though they have not gotten fully prepared. You may get that in a case you were there, and that's why we do. Just bring it to our attention. We can follow up for sure.

CHIEF JOHNSON: And so, Councilmember, thank you. I've wanted to so I just wanted to address the second portion of... of your question. With regard to the SSA is an NYPD. With regard to SSA is they are NYPD staff, and so they're hired and organized through the NYPD. We do work in partnership with them to ensure that we're providing the appropriate supports to our

schools. And as we said, if we think about who our school safety agents are, if we think about how we align those with the both clinical and non-clinical supports, we are working to address some of the challenges that young people are facing in this space. And we do realize recognize that there is additional work that needs to be done in that space.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: I'm sorry, I'm sorry, I don't understand your response. Are you suggesting we need we need the 800, we can only get 50 transfer coordinators and 100 social workers but it is okay to do 800 Police in schools?

CHIEF JOHNSON: No council member I just... I guess to clarify, I was saying that the NYPD hires and maintains the school safety... school safety staff. And so when we think about young people creating a safe and supportive environment for young people, we think about how we how we sustain both the emotional safety as well as the physical safety. So there is a need for the SSAs, and NYPD will... will handle the... the staffing and the hiring of those. And on our part is we think about building out the emotional safety, the support for young people and supports in the schools. So apologies if I misspoke.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: No, no, no. I appreciate the clarification. Thank you.

CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember. And I note that the chancellor had to step away. But Council Member Restler has his hand up. So Council Member, the DOE team is up. The chancellor is still here. So if you just want to go and ask your questions, I will turn it back to the chairs.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: You can unmute yourself.

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Well great. What a gift. Thank you, Malcom. Well, let me firstly just recognize my good friend and our Distinguished Chair, Rita Joseph. I greatly appreciate her tremendous leadership. Everybody likes to say that December 23, she was still in the classroom. She... she taught her whole way through the campaign. She's an extraordinary person she thinks about her students. I was lucky to have her in my district, visiting a high school last week. And I've now made it to over 30 schools in my district. So I'm trying to keep up with you, Chancellor on your school visits. I like to start every morning with a school visit. It is

wonderful. It's... it's the best part of my day. I love getting to meet with our principals visit our students. I was at the Brooklyn International High School this morning, all English language learners. It's a really special place, project based learning approach. I just loved it. But it's good to have you Chancellor and your whole team. Thank you for for being with us.

The first thing I wanted to ask about is an issue of great concern to me, which is about the enrollment peg. And I understand that it's going to be somewhat moderated by the federal stimulus dollars and that you've tried to spread it out over a few years. But I'm still very concerned. And I ask: Could you please share the average net impact on fair student funding to each school in fiscal year 23, and the net impact of the fair student funding plus enrollment revenue adjustment in fiscal 23, and the following two years so that we can actually have a breakdown. Because I'm visiting the schools every day, and this is what they're freaked about. This is what my elementary schools and my middle schools are just unnerved about what it's going to mean for them next year. And they were planning to bring on a

librarian, and they're planning to do other things.

But they're now feeling like, we're going to be totally screwed by this peg and this reduction. It's a technical question, but if... if Lindsey or the team could help speak to it, I would greatly appreciate it.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: No absolutely. And Lindsey... Lindsey will speak to it. It's stuff that we talk about here every day, Councilmember, and I thank you for that. First of all, thank you for visiting your schools as intensely as you do. And we hear about it as well. It's all good. And we really appreciate you. And so... so Lindsay, will speak to you because it's a little bit of a conundrum that we're in. We've had declining school enrollment. And yet we've been using these funds, but they're stimulus funds, to kind of keep schools as close to you know, where they are as possible. But you know, it also becomes a challenge when the school had 500 kids, and now they have 250 kids, and they say, but don't cut my budget, right? So... uh...

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: But... but within reason, right? And I... the thing I really want to say is like, bring us in as councilmembers as

partners. I want to be the biggest marketing champion for my public schools. The amount that our charter... that the charters put into marketing is egregious relative to what we do. So let's be partners in trying to engage... I'm talking to families in my district every day all day. I want to get them into our public schools, let's work as partners in that effort. But I'm very keen on the numbers, if we have the chance to do it. And a chance I look forward to sit down with you and talking more about it.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Absolutely. I'd love to sit down some more, particularly around how we can do a better job of marketing, our schools. But in the meantime, Lindsey, if you would pick up the question.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Sure. Thank you, Councilmember for highlighting this really important issue. So we are really... and I'm really focused, the Chancellor's really focused on exactly what you just identified, which is getting schools information about their budgets as soon as possible. That's something that we want to be able to do in the next couple of weeks. And when we have that information, I'm happy to sit down with you and share the impact.

And again, really hoping that we can get school budgets out in the next couple of weeks. And I would also just ask that, you know, part of the marketing of our school system is ensuring that we're advocating to the state and the feds to support our school system as we're thinking about stimulus funding running out and making sure that we have the adequate resources that we need. And I know you'll join us in the fight for additional funding at the state at the federal level.

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I look forward to reviewing those budgets. And Lindsey, I appreciate your offer to meet, and I will gladly take you up on it. But the question I had was a kind of average across the board, which I'd imagine you'd have now. And so we'll put that in writing to you. But we'd really appreciate a quick reply if you could get that to us and realize it will take time to go school by school.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: The I do want to commend the Council Finance Team, Justin, the speaker, everyone, for pushing for more funding for CTEs, for ELLs, for community coordinators. We really need to

focus on... on students in temporary housing. And... and Chair Joseph's emphasis on students in foster care. Appreciate the emphasis there and appreciate the resources you all put in on Summer Rising. The areas that I really want to see more funding are on guidance counselors and social workers, around librarians, and really echo Chair Brannan's comments around arts education.

The other piece that I wanted to ask you about today, which is a major concern of mine, and then I'll do... sneak one last thing and if I can, that's a teeny one, is transfer schools.

The reports I'm getting are that because of this same...

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired. ... of schools not wanting to reduce the enrollment, we're not referring kids who should be in transfer schools to transfer schools. And I'm very concerned that we don't have enough central oversight... oversight from TWEED to make sure those referrals are happening. So kids who really would benefit from a transfer school environment are not there because students are trying to hold... because schools are trying to hold on to their students for the pursuit of per pupil funding.

And then I'm just going to tack on my last question before I get in trouble with the Distinguished Chair.

We now have more NYC ferry service that is being used by students to get to and from school. We have connections from Brooklyn to the Harbor School on Governors Island and others, but we don't have any student discount on the NYC ferry. This is city agency to city agency. We should be able to figure this out. I know that Mark Trager cares about this one. It would be great if we could get a commitment from D.O.E. leadership that they're going to help us work with EDC to subsidize fair usage for student commuters. So those are the two final questions if I can sneak those in. Can someone speak to transfer school?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Yes. Thank you, Councilmember. We would love to... you know maybe this... I've only been here for one week, but we'd love to hear more detail about that. Typically, it's the other way around, as you know, like, where we have students who may be over-age and under-credited, who get kind of encouraged to discharge themselves and aren't necessarily connected to transfer schools.

So we worry about those disconnected youth quite a bit. Certainly what we do see objectively and may support your point is attendance in transfer schools is really.... is really quite low. And so that is something that we are really focused on. And certainly, we want to make sure that all of our principals, all of our staff are thinking holistically, not just about, you know, the... what's going on at their particular school, what they can offer holistically about what programming is best for a particular young person. And if it's a transfer school, then the family and then the student ought to be given information about that. So if that's not happening in an attempt to prop up enrollment, we certainly would like to know about that. And we want to make sure that we have really high quality transfer schools for students who need that. And Chancellor mentioned this before, I'll just make a little plug, when we're thinking about virtual school, we're thinking about, in part, these students. When we're thinking about other programming, we're thinking about these students. We want to create actually a broader range of options for students who, you know, traditional schools may

not work for them for various reasons. But would love to connect with you to hear more specifics about that? Because if that's happening, that's a real problem.

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: We will send you a formal letter, and I appreciate your willingness to follow up and work with us on it.

And any... any comment on the ferries? Is that something y'all are thinking about working on? I know, it's a small little thing, but it would make a big difference to a bunch of families,

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: We are going to talk to Mark Trager on that one, as you suggest, and we'd be happy to... to, to get back to you on that.

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: That man loves the ferry. He is going to help. (crosstalk)

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: ... to help facilitate our students, and particular our students who come from low-income families to make sure they get to school.

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you very much. I appreciate it. Thank you all.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Council Member Restler. So Chairs, I will turn it back to you.

We've completed counseling for questions for SCA and DOE.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Chair Joseph, do you want to give a closing remarks?

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Oh, I just had two quick questions I wanted to answer: One: I know we have social workers in schools. What I'm hearing on the ground and as Council Restler, I visit schools, I live in schools. Those are my favorite buildings to be in, and I'm aware of everything. On one of the things we wanted to see as much as we put guidance counselors, social workers in schools, the training has to be there as well. That has to be PD provided to support what's happening in the classroom, especially around -- we throw this word around a lot -- social and emotional learning, but they're not connected to the classrooms. So there cannot be a disconnect, or we will not see the results that we're looking for. So I would love for someone to answer on that. And I have one other question as well.

CHIEF JOHNSON: Okay, thank you for the question Chair. So with regard to social emotional supports, we... as you know, we use the academic recovery funds to really launch the social emotional learning

screeners across all schools in the city. And what we were able to do with the social emotional screeners was to create a baseline of common language. And so by having schools kind of examine what are their social emotional supports that they provide for students, but also to look at young people and figure out where do they sit? Prior to that, we use teachers, anecdotal data, we use the range of different things, but now there is a set of common goals. And so looking to take the screener data, and then align that data to how we're leveraging social emotional support. So thinking about the training that happens, that connect... that's connected to the actual implementation execution, how you leverage the supports, and look at your young people, and how they performed according to the indicators... the eight indicators... indicators like optimistic thinking, responsible decision making self-awareness. So how do we look at where young people fit along that continuum? How do we put targeted supports in place? How do we leverage social emotional practices? And so we have the Harmony Program, which is available for all... all elementary schools. It's free. We have the Ruler

Program that we're utilizing. And then we've also been working with... with our schools to think about how do we leverage social emotional supports outside of just the... the separate social emotional space, but in the space where students spend the majority of their time, which is actually in the classroom? And how do we leverage those schools to deepen the learning and the academic outcomes?

And so working closely with DC Quintana, and the teaching and learning team, we've been thinking about how do we provide those wraparound supports for those young people? And how do we access those supports to really advance the academic outcomes? Because optimistic thinking helps you to prepare for problems that you need to go and solve. That math problem: You've got to think that you're able to do it in order to be able to engage with it.

So your question was around training for the adults? And so we've trained people around how to leverage and how to access and implement the screener, what are the systems and the conditions that you need in place to actually use a data driven strategy to align to the supports? And then we have targeted training and support that is within each of

the different mechanisms, but we also encourage school teams to use these data processes to say, what are the best supports that we need to put in place for our students in our population? And in our setting?

CHAIR JOSEPH: Okay, okay. All right, I'll come back... Another... another thing, um, when we... when we roll out curriculum, this is something I've seen 22 years in and out. When we roll out curriculums, they mean well. We celebrate them. And when it comes time to train the teachers, and the training... there's no training to really support the teachers. The training has to be ongoing, because the programs have different components, because you do have to touch the needs of your ELL students. You have to have touch the needs of your SWDs, especially in ICT settings, and self-contained, you have all of that where lessons have to be modified. What type of training and PD are we ongoing with these new curriculums? I know there is a new curriculum that is going to that's going to be rolled out soon. What... what does the training look like? And you have to invest in the trainings as well. So how does

that look like dollar wise? And how does it look like in the classroom?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you, Chair.

So it will... it's going to look... so it depends on the program. But what will happen is we will roll out professional learning sessions, a series of sessions, and we will necessarily follow that up with job-embedded support.

I think one of the things that we have noted is that when teachers attend a standalone training, that often it is really useful in that moment. But if they don't receive the support to really implement that or to understand how to integrate what they've learned into what they're doing, that it doesn't stick in the same way. And so we're going to make sure that there's that job-embedded support.

The other component that's really important to us, and we're working with DC Blackburn on this, with his team on this as well, is to make sure that our leaders are trained. And so superintendents and principals will need to know. And there will be strategic planning support for those principals, so that they really are integrating, and whether it's as you just heard, Dr. Johnson talk about the framework

for whole-child education that we're basing all of our work on, you know, thinking about supportive environments, as emotional development, the system of supports, all of those kinds of things that we want to make sure are really embedded in how we do schooling, or if it's just a specific program. So we talked about, you know, the K through 2, explicit instruction of reading... whether it's that sort of large scale, or the more specific, we want to make sure that there's strategic planning with the principals so that they are integrating that into the way that they work. And it really becomes part of the DNA of the school.

CHAIR JOSEPH: And working in cohorts also really helps, so having teacher support and turning keys to each other, also help also in how they retain the information and transfer and turn key to their colleagues. Um, that's it for me. Um, Chair Brannan?

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you Chair Joseph, Chancellor, and your team. Thank you so much. I appreciate your time today and doing your best to answer all of our questions. And if we have any outstanding issues that weren't sufficiently answered

today, we'll follow up and send a letter so that we can get that in writing. But we look forward to negotiating this budget together to get it to a good place that it serves all of our kids in public schools. So I really appreciate your time tonight. Thank you.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: We appreciate you, both of you as chairs, not just here today, but also thank you very much for just the continued partnership. We said we're going to be joined at the hip. We're gonna work together on behalf of all our kids, and we mean it. We look forward to continued partnership with you. In fact, we get to get up and stretch now.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: (Laughs) That's a luxury we don't have but enjoy. Thank you so much, Chancellor.

CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you, everybody. Bye-bye.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chair Brannan, we have a few minutes before we switch over to the Department of Sanitation. And for the record, we'll just... for the prior hearing, we'll just make sure that we... we were joined by Councilmembers Gutierrez, Ossé, Hudson, Moya, Hanks, Restler, Stevens, Speaker Adams, Krishnhan, Abreu, De La Rosa, Ayala, Carr, Barron,

Ung, Avilez, Sanchez, Mennon, Nurse, and Paladino. I think we have most of the City Council.

Chair Joseph, it was good seeing you.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Same here.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chair Brannan, will do a... once the admin is on for DSNY, we'll do a mic check and then we will just get right to it with you and Chair Nurse.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I'm just gonna grab a cup of water.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Have a great hearing, Council Member Nurse. I'm gonna stick around. I've never been to sanitation.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Tickets are \$5 for this.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Can I get... Can I get a matinee ticket? Council Member Barron, good seeing you too.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Good seeing you too.

CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you for those amazing questions.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh, I can't wait to get them in the district. I ain't finished with him!

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'm coming to visit you soon!

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, I'm looking forward to it.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Commissioner Tisch welcome. You should be able to unmute yourself.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: I just did.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay perfect. Deputy Commissioner Gregory Anderson?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: I'll make sure he's on in a second.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay. Deputy Commissioner Bridget Anderson?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: Good Morning or... good afternoon. Good afternoon.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Perfect we can hear you. And Chief Lohan? You should be able to unmute yourself.

CHIEF LOHAN: Good afternoon. I'm on.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Perfect. Thank you.

[266:15 to 268:45 SILENCE]

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Commissioner Gregory Anderson, do you want to unmute yourself just make sure we're able to hear your audio?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Hey there how are you?

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Perfect. Thank you.

All right chairs, just let me know when you're both ready.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: I'm ready whenever councilmember Brannan is.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, I'm good.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay. Give me just a moment to get started in just a second here. We're only four minutes behind schedule. Not bad. For the record, we'll just recognize who we're joined with:

Councilmembers Brannan, Nurse, Paladino, Barron, Ayala, Brewer, Gennaro, Louis, Ossé, Sanchez, Joseph, Farias, Hudson, and Bottcher.

Chair Brandon I will turn it to you for for your opening remarks.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN:

Thank you, Counsel. Good afternoon, and welcome to the second portion of today's fiscal 23 executive budget hearing. This afternoon we have the pleasure

of hearing from the Department of Sanitation, and I'm joined by my colleague and co-chair, Council Member Sandy Nurse, Chair of the Committee on Sanitation.

The Department of Sanitation is projected fiscal 23 budget of \$1.83 billion represents 1.8% of the city's proposed fiscal 23 budget in the Executive Plan. DSNY's fiscal 23 budget increased by \$50.5 million, an increase of 2.8% from the fiscal 23 preliminary plan of \$1.78 billion. The increase is a result of a number of actions taken, most significant of which are \$17.9 million for organic programs, \$7.9 million for waste characterization study \$13.3 million for motor fuel adjustment, and \$2.9 million for bike lane sweeping. I want to thank Commissioner Tisch for joining us this afternoon. I look forward to hearing more from the department on the executive budget plan. I'll be digging deeper into the issues of the FY23 Council budget response and especially the Administration's lack of funding for many of the programs that were highlighted in the Council and its budget, corner litter baskets, and the fact that no funding was included in the executive budget for a litter basket service, the restoration of curbside e-waste collection, overtime usage, and something I

know you'll be familiar with, which is sanitation service levels by district.

I appreciate the efforts of the department as made with programs like organics, but if we cannot get the basics right, as in getting our corner baskets picked up, then I'm troubled by all the other things that department wants to do, frankly. So forthright answers to these questions or more will be very important today as we as we get through this hearing.

I want to thank the Finance Division, especially John Seltzer, and Carillion Francisco, and my senior advisor John Yeddin for help in preparing for today's hearing. There's a lot of work that goes on behind the scenes to get these numbers right. And I appreciate their hard work. And I want to thank all the Council staff working behind the scenes to get this virtual hearing off the ground today.

I want to say that I've long said sanitation workers have one of the most thankless, and demanding and important jobs in our city, we leave our trash outside, and we expect it to disappear. We don't notice when it does disappear. We only notice when it doesn't, and that's when we all lose our minds.

So I appreciate that. I appreciate the work that our sanitation men and women do, and I call them everyday heroes for a reason. With that, I want to turn it over to my colleague and Chair of the Sanitation Department. I want to acknowledge the... the energy that Council Member Nurse has brought to sanitation, which is very helpful because frankly, back in the old days, it was me and Paul Vallone who were the only people who were yelling and screaming about sanitation funding. So it's nice that the cavalry has finally arrived. But now you've got the Finance Chair and the Sanitation Chair who care a lot about keeping our streets clean, and we want to work with you and get it right that especially as we recover from this pandemic.

So with that I want to turn it over to Co-Chair Sandy Nurse for her opening remarks.

CHAIR NURSE: Thank you. Good afternoon, everyone. Thank you Chair Brannan. I'm hoping to get one of those War On Trash posters for my backgrounds as well, and thank you for all your advocacy for the budget for a lot of the sanitation services we need. I want to thank sanitation committee members and other members for being here.

Congratulations Commissioner Jessica Tisch, and welcome to your first Sanitation Committee hearing. Great to see both Deputy Commissioners Anderson and Anderson, and additional leadership for joining us today.

As... as we have seen the city 311 data through the needs assessment reports of our community boards and in the media, sanitation affects public safety, public health, and environmental outcomes in every single neighborhood across the city. I along with many New Yorkers am impacted, and we've all been a little bit disappointed in the level of sanitation service our city has received over the past two years, mostly due to the deep cuts made by the prior administration. Last month, council members responded to the mayor's preliminary budget with a unified voice. The Department of Sanitation must be adequately funded and baseline, and we must invest in the waste infrastructure and operations required to achieve our city's long term zero waste goals. We're committed to addressing both the immediate needs of New Yorkers, those basic services the chair was speaking about and, investing in the absolutely critical long term innovative and sustainable waste

management systems we need to address environmental and justices and the climate crisis.

I'm looking forward to discussing FY 2003 budget, which totals about \$1.83 billion. While the administration included funding for new and restored programs that the council called for in our budget response, there truly is so much more to be done. A majority of our items were not funded including expanded, curbside organics, rat mitigation programs, litter basket service, uniform headcount restorations, civilian vacancy restorations, the build-out of a new organics processing facility, and funding for a long overdue Save As You Throw study. These restorations should have been prioritized by the Administration and from my perspective is a win-win-win for everyone. It seems that everyone in New York City really wants us to get on top of trash and rats.

Last month I alongside my fellow council members Keith Powers and Shahana Hanif introduced a robust Zero Waste legislative package for universal organic composting accessibility and for requiring the city to establish, report on, and meet our 2030 waste diversion goals. So I'm excited to work with you

commissioner to ensure New York City is positioned as a national and global leader on zero waste and sustainability, because we know the future of New York City depends on us getting it right and in time.

As always, I want to thank my wonderful legislative director Enelle Hernandez for her hard work preparing for this hearing. I also want to thank John Seltzer, Jessica Steinberg Albin, and Ricky Challah for supporting me as Chair. Thank you especially to John for answering as many questions as we had and the Finance Team for their analysis and insights on the sanitation budget.

Additionally, I want to applaud the leadership of Speaker Adams, Chair Brannan, the budget negotiation team, my fellow council members and all of the advocates and New Yorkers who raise their voices to demand a well-funded DSNY as prioritized in this year's budget process.

So thank you again, looking forward to this hearing. I will now turn it back to committee counsel.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Chairs Brandon and Nurse. Good afternoon and welcome everyone to the second agency hearing for May 10, The Department of

Sanitation. My name is Malcolm Butehorn, and I am counsel to the Finance Committee. There are some additional council members we want to acknowledge: Councilmembers Carr, Velázquez, and Kagan. Unlike in past I want to remind Council Members and members of the mayoral administration, you will have the ability to unmute yourselves. Council Members who have questions should use the raise hand function in Zoom. You will be called on in the order with which you raised your hand, and Council Members will be limited to five minutes. We please ask that you listen to the cues from the Sergeant At Arms. The following members of the administration are here to testify and are answer questions:

Jessica Tisch, Commissioner. Bridget Anderson, Deputy Commissioner. Gregory Anderson, Deputy Commissioner, and Chief Javier Lohan, Acting Deputy Commissioner for Financial Management and Administration.

I will first read the oath and after I will call on each member from the administration individually to respond. Do you refer them to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth before these

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE

239

2 committees and to respond honestly to council member
3 questions. Commissioner Tisch?

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I do.

5 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Commissioner Bridget
6 Anderson.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: I do.

8 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Commissioner Gregory
9 Anderson.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: I do.

11 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: And Chief Lohan?

12 CHIEF LOHAN: I do.

13 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. Commissioner
14 Tisch, you may begin when ready.

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you. Good afternoon
16 Chairs Brannan and Nurse and members of the City
17 Council Committee on Finance and Sanitation and Solid
18 Waste Management. My name is Jessica Tisch and I am
19 Commissioner of the New York City Department of
20 Sanitation. Thank you for the opportunity to testify
21 today on the department's executive budget for fiscal
22 year 2023. I am joined by Gregory Anderson, Deputy
23 Commissioner for Policy and External Affairs, Bridget
24 Anderson Deputy Commissioner for Recycling and
25 Sustainability. And Chief Javier Lohan, Acting

Deputy Commissioner for Financial Management and Administration.

I am delighted to be here in front of these committees today, and I look forward to working with you and this entire city council to clean up our streets and make New York City a more vibrant and sustainable place to live, a goal that I know we all share. I am a lifelong New Yorker, and that means I have spent my entire life admiring the work of the sanitation department and its 10,000 members of service, who have spent the last two years showing that they are the epitome of essential, the epitome of the neighborhood hero. They care about clean streets, they care about giving their neighbors that peace of mind they deserve, about getting our city moving and keeping our communities safe, healthy, and of course clean.

As this is my first hearing in my new role as Sanitation Commissioner, let me take a moment to introduce myself. I've worked in city government for nearly 15 years, most of that time was at the NYPD. And more recently, I served as Commissioner of the Department of Information Technology and Telecommunications during the pandemic. I consider

myself to be an effective problem solver who knows how to get things done for New Yorkers and will run through a brick wall trying. I've applied a can-do attitude to things like overhauling the city's vaccination approach, bringing down 911 response times, ending the digital divide for homeless children and their families, and rolling out body-worn cameras to every uniform member of service of the NYPD. And that's what I'm going to continue doing as Commissioner of the Department of Sanitation.

Over the past three weeks, I've gone to 6am Roll call garages in every borough. I've spoken to hundreds of sanitation workers about the work they do day in and day out, largely unseen from the public eye. And I visited our marine transfer stations to see the results of more than a billion dollars in investments in sustainable, effective, and equitable waste management infrastructure. I've been getting under the hood of this department, meeting with every chief and borough chief, understanding and digging into the department's programs, policies and priorities, and I feel quite blessed to be doing it.

I want to be very clear upfront that I agree with New Yorkers who feel that our study is meaningfully dirtier than it was before the pandemic, and that is not acceptable. I've long felt that to fix a problem, you have to understand it. And the good news is it's patently obvious to me what happened here. And even better news is that with your help in partnership, the Adams Administration will be addressing it aggressively.

First street sweeping, effective July 5, we will finally be sweeping the streets again, which will make a meaningful difference in the cleanliness of every neighborhood in this city. The partial suspension of alternate side parking was a pandemic measure to let people stay inside more, but it went on for far too long, and it largely sideline the most effective clean streets tool we have in our arsenal, the mechanical broom. When I say the mechanical broom, or street sweeper is the most effective clean streets tool in our arsenal, I mean it, they don't just sweep the trash on the streets to the curb, they suck it all up inside the cab. In fact, on an average shift, a single mechanical broom can suck up 1500 pounds of street litter. That's taking 1500

pounds of litter off the city streets on a single route. The dirty little secret here is that when ASP went to one day a week instead of two, in practice, it was like having no cleaning on lots of blocks in the city. Don't get me wrong. That's not because we stopped sending street sweepers to do their jobs. It's because the policy created a world where too many people saw once in a once-in-a-while ASP ticket as just the cost of doing business. Our sanitation workers operating the brooms estimated that 50 plus percent of cars didn't move for ASP under the more limited pandemic rules. So the pandemic policy change had a disproportionate effect on the amount of cleaning the agency could do. It was intended to halve it, but in practice it more than halved it. It follows that restoring ASP to twice a week should more than double the amount of cleaning weekend and we'll do. The restoration of full alternate side parking regulations comes with a headcount increase of 41 sanitation workers that had been cut in January 2021, and \$1.9 million in additional funding in FY 23.

Second topic is bike lane sweeping. This summer New Yorkers will see a new fleet of mini-sweepers

that can also be used as snow plows in the winter that we'll be performing year round cleaning and maintenance of the city's growing network of protected bike lanes. Bike lanes are a great thing. But the program was rolled out nearly a decade ago, and over 100 miles a protected bike line lanes have been built out without a practical plan in place to keep those bike lanes clean. That ends now. With the advocacy and partnership of Commissioner Rodriguez and the Department of Transportation, we are addressing this issue. This starts with a capital investment of \$6.7 million in a fleet of mini sweepers beginning with 10 units with sweeper attachments this summer. By the end of next year, we will have a permanent fleet of 45 total units in two different sizes to clean and plough even the narrowest protected bike lanes. We also have \$2.8 million in new expense funding in FY 23 to provide person power to operate and maintain this equipment for years to come, and purchase a suite of attachments that will make them some of the most versatile units in our street cleaning arsenal. This new stack will allow us to sweep protected bike lanes

year round with a goal of sweeping every lane once a week.

Third topic is litter baskets. We are committed to cleaning up our city. We hear your complaints about the overflowing conditions and agree that they are not dignified, they are not okay. In FY 2022, we have more than doubled the litter baskets service from pandemic lows in FY 21 to 588 weekly trucks. We would greatly appreciate any additional funding to expand services, and we stand ready to implement. The Adams Administration looks forward to working closely with the council to determine an appropriate level of service for all New Yorkers.

Can I guarantee after the adopted budget that New Yorkers will never see an overflowing litter basket again? No. But we will work to ensure that these conditions are minimized and call on all New Yorkers to do their part to keep our city clean. Overflowing litter basket issues that remain should be the result of the misuse of the litter basket rather than lack of service. Litter baskets are for walking trash only -- the coffee cup -- as opposed to residential or commercial trash, and when they are misused, it creates a blight on our communities.

Fourth topic is rats. On my third day on the job, I was thrilled to join Mayor Adams senior administration leadership and several council members to unveil the city's first clean curbs bins in Times Square, the first step in an effort to containerize trash that used to be piled in bags on the street, serving as a free all-you-can-eat buffet for rats.

DSNY and SBS recently announced the neighborhood challenge grant program for bids and community based development organizations to make public space and cleanliness improvements with a particular focus on bids in underserved communities. The department received 29 applications for funding last month and a second round of grant applications will open this summer. The city is moving ahead with a five-borough approach to the Clean Curbs pilots, deploying bins for residential BID and commercial waste using a combination of public and private funding. This new five-borough approach includes \$1.3 million in new funding in FY 2023 and recurring in the out years.

Fifth topic is dog poop. New Yorkers see it everywhere, and it has become a bigger problem over the past two years, yet in 2020 and 2021, a grand total of zero summonses had been written to people

who don't pick up after their pets. That changes now. This is about decency, courtesy and respect, and the Department of Sanitation won't tolerate it anymore.

Sixth topic is illegal dumping. For those who are unfamiliar with the term that's when a business which is required to dispose of its waste itself or through the use of a private carter decides instead to leave piles of trash bags in a vacant lot or even on a sidewalk. Illegal dumping tends to be a bigger problem in the most underserved parts of the city. It's a huge issue in Hunts Point. It's a huge issue in East New York. Here we are taking a several pronged approach. We are precision cleaning teams in each borough whose main job is to clean known dumping locations, but continuously chasing dumps doesn't solve the problem because it keeps happening. We have also stepped up our enforcement efforts over the past three months, investing in cameras in known dump locations to catch illegal dumpers in the act. When caught an illegal dumper is subject to a \$4,000 fine, and if they're using a car to transport the material, their car will be impounded. I want to be very clear that illegal dumping is a theft of public space, and

I can think of no more important use of our enforcement team's time than ensuring that those who are knowingly dumping their trash in our communities be held accountable for it.

The seventh topic is derelict vehicles. There are citywide problems and their local ones. Derelict vehicles are a local issue but with big implications for quality of life in the outer boroughs. We see this problem in parts of the Bronx, Southeast Queens, and central Brooklyn. Not only do these vehicles become eyesores, they also prevent our brooms from cleaning the streets. I am going to refocus on getting these vehicles off the streets, and we will be partnering with our counterparts at the NYPD to get this done. Clean streets should be the reality for all New Yorkers, regardless of where they live. I want to be clear that I do not believe in enforcement for enforcement's sake, and there are many problems that you can't and shouldn't enforce your way out of. That can be dangerous. But I do believe that enforcement must be a tool in our arsenal to deal with that very small percentage of New Yorkers and New York City businesses who choose not to do the simple right thing, who choose not to

abide by the straightforward laws and rules that relate to the cleanliness of our city. As an example, at two in the afternoon, New Yorkers should see virtually no trash bags piled up on the streets. But we do in every neighborhood and every community in our city. It can be a business that is decided to put their trash out early, over and over and over again, or a big chain retail store that rarely does its duty sweeping in front of its storefront. We have heard this a lot in particular in Bay Ridge. Well, to all the residents that have complained about this type of thing to 311, and to the Department of Sanitation, I say: I hear you, and we are going to do everything in our power to correct that behavior. And if we have to write summonses, well then so be it.

I also want to commit to you that my obsession with the cleanliness of our city today will not be to the exclusion of the important work that we have to do around securing our collective future. To the contrary, our work around sustainability could not be more urgent, and I am committed to elevating environmental justice as a core principle in all aspects of our work. That of course includes the

successful implementation of the ambitious Commercial Waste Zone Program, as well as following through with the groundbreaking Waste Equity Laws that the council passed during the last administration. The executive budget includes \$29.1 million in new funding in fiscal 23 to expand our commitments to zero waste and sustainable waste management long term. Most importantly, we have \$17.9 million in new funding for organics programs in FY 23, nearly zeroing out the reductions in organics funding under the preliminary budget peg program. Managing organic waste, which makes up 34% of our waste stream is an important part of achieving our zero waste goals, but we must ensure we do so both effectively and cost effectively. This new funding allows us to expand a program that we know works well and sets the stage by educating the next generation of New Yorkers. In partnership with DOE, we will begin expanding compost collection to all New York City public schools, nearly doubling the size of the school composting program that exists today. The budget includes funding to expand compost collection to all public schools, and to provide the education and support that school staff, including principals, custodians, teachers and food service

workers need to successfully divert their organic waste.

I thank the Council for their advocacy for this measure, and we look forward to working with you to ensure the rollout is successful at every school in every neighborhood. We will also leverage these expanded school organics routes to expand access to composting for residents. We will add 100 new smart bins near public schools for parents and community members to drop off their own food scraps. These bins which are accessed using an app or a free RFID card will be collected using the same trucks that already service our public schools and will be cited to maximize equity in our network of drop off sites citywide. The new funding for organics programs also continues, and baselines \$3.5 million in annual funding for our community composting partners and food scrap drop off sites that was first added to the budget in FY 22. This will support an expanded network of 221 partner hosted drop off sites in every community district citywide and provide vital support to our nonprofit partners that educate New Yorkers about the importance of composting and the connections of healthy and vibrant neighborhoods. I

met last week with many of the volunteers who work these sites and they are a blessing to the city.

Lastly, this new investment provides baseline funding for the department's annual fall leaf and yard waste collection program for the first time in many years. This program may just may be just 4 short weeks, but it regularly collects 3000 tons or more of leaves and other yard waste to be converted into valuable and nutrient rich compost. The executive budget also includes \$2.6 million to support the relocation of the Lower East Side Ecology Center compost site, which has been temporarily moved out of East River Park to facilitate the construction of the East Side Coastal Resiliency Project.

We won't stop there, I am taking a comprehensive look at our composting programs past and present to figure out what works and what doesn't. This administration is committed to making strides on organics, but we cannot throw good money after bad. I look forward to working with you all to discuss these programs and develop a path forward for the future. Aside from composting organics, the executive budget funds two important programs that

will help us plan for a more sustainable and equitable future of waste in New York City.

First, it includes \$7.9 million in FY 23 and \$8.4 million total to conduct a new waste characterization study. The waste characterization study gives us the clearest possible picture of what New Yorkers throw away on a daily basis, and helps us tailor existing and new programs and policies in our efforts to move toward zero waste. It will also be our first opportunity to see the detailed impact of bans on home products, and single use plastic bags. In addition, the executive budget includes \$550,000 in funds for the first phase of planning for our new Solid Waste Management Plan. This plan, on track to be completed in 2026, will be the first major update to the city's landmark 2006 comprehensive solid waste management plan, which laid the groundwork for our sustainable and resilient network of marine and barge based transfer stations that we rely on today.

Now I will briefly take you through the more technical details of the department's FY 23 budget. DSNY's fiscal year 23 executive budget includes \$1.83 billion in expense funding. This is broken down between \$1.06 billion and personal services to

support 9444 full time positions and \$775 million other-than-personal services, or OTPs. For fiscal year 22, the expense budget increased by \$100.2 million from the Preliminary Budget to the Executive Budget. This increase is largely due to personnel services adjustments due to increased spending in the current fiscal year and adjustments reflect actual spending during the 21-22 snow season. For fiscal year 23, the expense budget increased by \$50.4 million for the Preliminary Budget the Executive Budget. This increase is primarily driven by the new initiatives I mentioned earlier in my testimony, as well as adjustments to motor fuel, and heat, light, and power budgets to reflect increased costs for these line items given market conditions. DSNY's fiscal year 23 Executive Budget includes \$3.41 billion in capital funding and the 10 year plan, \$1.23 billion of which is for garages and facilities, \$1.96 billion for equipment, \$59.2 million for IT, and \$164 million for solid waste management infrastructure. The capital budget includes funding for several major facilities projects currently underway, including construction of the new sanitation Staten Island district 1 and 3 garage,

managed by DDC which has an overall budget of \$198 million and is forecast to be completed by 2024. That can't come soon enough. Construction of the new Brooklyn district 3 garage which has an overall budget of \$204 million, and is forecast to be completed by 2024, and upgrades to the facility that will serve as the new home for the Manhattan District 11 garage, which has an overall budget of \$26.9 million and will be substantially complete later this year.

I'll just close by saying this: I see these committees and every member of the City Council as partners in achieving all the goals discussed today. I have worked closely with the Council for over a decade, and your feedback, input, and even your criticism have consistently elevated my performance. My door will remain open to you at all times, and I will not shy away from tough conversations about the steps we need to take as a city to keep New York healthy, safe and clean. I look forward to many years of collaboration with each of you and with the many stakeholders that play an important role in our work.

Thank you again for this opportunity to testify today on the department's important work. My colleagues and I are now very happy to answer your questions.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Commissioner. We're all on board. Sounds... sounds great. We look forward to working with you. A clean neighborhood as a safe neighborhood and a safe neighborhood is the foundation for everything else. So we all want to get this right.

I want to dive in. The committee... we might not get to all of our questions... or we don't... We hope not, but if you don't have answers or responses, we'll send a followup letter for the unanswered questions, which are important to us as we go through our budget negotiations.

So let's dive right in. In the council's fiscal 23 budget response, we called upon the administration to add approximately \$96 million in expense items and \$1 million in capital items to the executive budget. However, as of the executive budget, only \$17.5 million was restored. Although we're happy to see some of these items included, we're still missing additional funding for some of the following items:

So \$22 million for additional litter basket service citywide, \$47.8 million to restore fiscal 23 budget cuts mainly for garaged utility or splinter group staff reductions, curbside organics program expansion, and civilian vacancies. \$4.8 million for additional rat mitigation program funding, \$3.6 million for curbside e-waste collection, \$3.4 million for additional enforcement personnel to help with illegal dumping that you mentioned, \$2.2 million to restore prior year lot cleaning cuts, \$864,000 to restore a prior cut for supplemental highway ramp cleaning, and \$1 million for the Same As You Throw Study, as well as \$1 million for a new organics processing facility.

So I'm rattling off all these items, because I'm hoping that you or someone at your agency can speak to whether the \$17.5 million that was restored... what, if any, conversations were had internally or externally regarding the council's budget response requests and how determinations were made? Because we're happy with a lot of this stuff. But it's not even close to the full loaf that were looking for.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you Chair for that question. I unfortunately cannot speak to the

conversations that happened internally as part of the Executive Budget process because I started here three weeks ago. It was after those conversations occurred. But what I can say is, I and the sanitation department... we are deeply appreciative of the council's advocacy for so many of these issues, and we were actually pleased to see that the Executive Budget funded a number of really important strategic programs that will lay the groundwork for things to come. Importantly, was the investment in cleanliness, restoring alternate side parking to twice a week, as I mentioned in my testimony, desperately needed and will make a huge dent in the cleanliness of the city, and also what I think are very smart investments in organics, not throwing good money after bad, not doubling down on a strategy that didn't necessarily work, but focusing our resources for the time being on strategies that we know will work. So an investment in organics in our schools... teaching the next generation of New Yorkers up front, giving them the muscle memory to separate out their organic waste.

Another one that I just like to highlight is the smart bins... that we're investing in 100 additional

smart bins that will be rolled out by 100 Public Schools, and they're an opportunity for parents, community members to drop off their organic waste in bins. This builds... this investment builds on a pilot program that we've conducted in... in Astoria, which has actually been wildly successful, where we've placed 20 Smart bins for organics collection throughout Astoria. Every day, every bin is full, it has pristine organic material, and that organic material is collected every day. So I guess, my high level answer to your very detailed question is: While I understand that the administration didn't fund everything, I think we made investments in... in a lot of the right places: Alternate side, organics, and of course I would appreciate any additional funding that is worked out in the adopted budget for litter baskets. With litter baskets more is certainly more.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Right. Yeah. Okay. I mean... it's... there's just a significant Delta there, right? We had... we called on the administration to add approximately \$96 million, and sanitation came back with \$17.5 million. So there's a significant gulf.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. And we expect the administration and the council to be able to negotiate some of the critical programs that you prioritize.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: All right, let's talk about litter baskets. This is one of my favorite subjects. So as you know, the council provides a substantial amount of funding each fiscal year to the sanitation department for supplemental sanitation services, as well to procure high end litter baskets. So in fiscal 22, the council allocated approximately \$5.2 million in funding across various discretionary initiatives for supplemental sanitation services. What... can you tell me, what is the primary service that Council Members fund your agency for?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Alright. It's really... it's really three things. So the first is purchase of new litter baskets, and then the associated service required for those litter baskets. We also have some council members who prioritize extra curbside pickups. So if the standard... if you want to add an extra day, prioritizing that. And then more recently, cameras at illegal dumping sites.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Council Member Brewer,
could you mute your phone?

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: I've gone ahead and done that.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Counsel.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Chair, I know that you have
funded extra curbside collection in your district.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, yeah. I mean, you
know what, in the... during COVID, In the DeBlasio
budgets, you know, the, the basic services were cut
so drastically that the money that I would normally
allocate to someone like the DOE fund, or ACE or
Wildcat to do supplemental services, me and a lot of
my former colleagues had to give that money back to
sanitation just to get us back up to... you know, you
can't go from six days a week basket pickup to three
days a week and think that, you know, it's just going
to work itself out.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: And we've seen the numbers
play out. So we saw in the 311 complaints, for
example, I used to run 311, we saw the number of
complaints around litter baskets literally double as
a result of the cuts like almost immediately.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yup. It's overnight. You
cut the sanitation budget, you feel it overnight.

Alright, let's keep moving. So the current number of weekly basket trucks citywide for fiscal 22 -- correct me if I'm wrong -- is 588, of which 452 are baseline and 136 trucks are supplemental due to one-time funding the council negotiated to be included at adoption this year. As of the executive budget, can you tell me what the baseline weekly projected litter basket service level for FY 23 is, and how does it compare to the current fiscal year?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. The baseline is still 452. And obviously, the 452 is lower than the 588, and we appreciate working with the council to come up with the right level of service to give New Yorkers the cleanliness that they deserve. As I said on litter baskets: more as more.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Alright, let's keep talking about my favorite topic. So the council would love to see twice a day litter basket pickups... twice a day corner basket pickups in every district citywide Monday through Saturday, which is why we call for an additional \$22 million on a city wide basis. How many districts would you say receive this level of service currently?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, geez. I mean, it's under 20% right now. So it's under 20% of the city... of districts in the city have twice daily pickup, and it's not even necessarily twice daily throughout the whole that... even the districts that are covered... that whole district. The way it's been is we have prioritized districts that have a lot of... that see a lot of foot traffic. So districts in Manhattan downtown Brooklyn, parts of Williamsburg, the vast majority of the city has once daily.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah. Once daily and how many times a week?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: It's... It's six.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, I'd love to get that to six days a week, twice a day. That's what we need because I don't want I don't want Council Member Nurse to kill me, but all this other... the composting is very... it's getting more and more important, and it's getting more mainstream which is great, right? But if I'm taking my kid to school and I see that overflowing garbage can then I get on the D train and I go to work and I come home I pick my kid up from school, that same basket is still

overflowing, and now it's... it's growing... it's multiplying. That's what people see. That's what they think. "Ah, the city is going to hell, you know, everything is falling apart." That's the stuff that they see. That's why corner basket pickup is so... is so crucial.

Let's talk about curbside e-waste collection.

Trying to narrow it a little bit more. The fiscal 23 executive budget does not restore one-time fiscal 22 funding of \$1.4 million for the Staten Island curbside e-waste collection, nor does the budget provide funding for the citywide curbside e-waste collection of which we call for it our budget response. Prior to fiscal 21, curbside e-waste collection programs serviced the Bronx, Brooklyn, Queens, and Staten Island. So if I have an old television to throw out, what do I do in fiscal 23?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: In fiscal 23, so far, you have three options. So if you live in a building that has 10 or more apartments, you can be part of the E-Cycle Program, which is funded by our ERP, which means you can... the building calls and makes an appointment for pickup, and the vendor comes and picks up. I think you said your old TV was the

example? The... obviously, that doesn't work for people who live, for example, in single-family homes. So for them, they have two additional options: They can drop that TV off at one of our special waste drop off sites. There's one per borough open every Saturday and the last Friday of each month. Or they can go to one of our safe disposal events. There are two per borough per year. So those are the two options that remain for them with the cut in the curbside program.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So I got a great idea: How about we allocate \$3.6 million to curbside e-waste collection?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: As... as you know, um...

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: What if I'm 95 years old, and and I need to throw out my television and I...

COMMISSIONER TISCH: I hear you and I agree with you... with the concept. My sense is, this was a data driven decision, right? You look at the tonnage and the amount that's collected through different programs, and if you have to make cuts to make cuts. Our... the truth of the matter is that when at when our curbside program for electronics was operating at its peak, which was in 2020, it collected under 1000

tons. So it's a very... very small numbers for,
uh... not as cost effective as other programs that we
have in place. When it's operating just in Staten
Island, obviously, the past year, that number has
been much smaller, it's been 129. But I think these
are difficult budgeting decisions where you look at
the... the tonnage and the data.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: All right, let's talk about
some overtime usage. As of March of this year,
uniform overtime spending was approximately \$227
million while your agency was budgeted for
approximately \$126 million as of adoption.
Additionally, personnel service adjustment of \$66
million was included in the executive budget, which
in part offsets overtime costs at sanitation. So how
much of the \$66 million for personal service
adjustment was specifically for uniform overtime?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: I believe it was \$43.4
million.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: \$43.4?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Correct.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. And what is driving
the increased uniform overtime usage?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: New things. This year, obviously, was extraordinary.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: But was a lot of that due to the... the staffing issues during COVID?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. There was there was a hiring freeze in the prior fiscal year, so that had us shorter staffed. Thank God we hired 1000 additional sanitation workers last summer, so that's been largely alleviated of late. We also had the vaccination mandates. We had a lot of staff sick leave increased, obviously due to COVID-19. And then we had one thing which I want to explain which was the allocation of our uniformed staff on overtime to cleaning the garages, to cleaning their workspace to keep them than safe and clean given the pandemic. So those four things together, have contributed to the overtime spend that you see.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, okay. I just, you know, I want to certainly want to honor... I believe it was nine sanitation workers who died during COVID, and the extraordinary work that they did.

Speaking... staying on headcount for a sec, I know... I believe there's one class scheduled for 140

heads, but don't we have it... don't we need like over 450?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: My understanding is that it was 250 in this class, which is great. And on that issue of headcount, that will get us to a good number of sanitation workers, especially as, like you look historically, so that brings us right up to like, pre-pandemic levels. And again, that was boosted by the largest class we've ever had, or at least in any sort of recent memory, of 1000 sanitation workers last summer.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, I'm going to finish up and then I want to hand it over to Chair Nurse.

How does the sanitation department currently determine how much funding or service specific districts receive? Is that based on what, you know, Council Members allocate or how does that work?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Well, it's... a lot of different factors go into it. So it's largely the responsibility of our bureau chiefs, obviously working with management. And that involves daily, weekly, monthly targets that are reviewed annually. We... they rely on field observation, they rely on tonnage trends, they rely on historical data, 311

complaints to determine needs, that's largely how it works.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Okay, I'm going to hand it over to Chair Nurse. I'm really hoping that we can work to restore and get closer to the ask that the council had of \$96 million. Borough equity is very important in this council. The idea that you can eat a sandwich off the off the ground in Manhattan, but not in Staten Island, or not in the Bronx. We don't want that we want everyone to have the same amount of garbage pickup across the city and prioritizing the neighborhoods that have been historically ignored or have had disinvestment. So we look forward to working with you on that. I welcome you, Commissioner look forward to working with you on one of my most important topics, I think, for all New Yorkers. And I'm glad that sanitation and the importance of sanitation is finally getting the mainstream attention that it truly deserves.

And with that, I want to hand it over to Chair Nurse who can take it from here. Thank you, Commissioner.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you, Chair Brannan. So I'm going to start with several questions around

program... organics programs and then move into some of the other items.

So for curbside organics collection program, the council requested \$18.2 million in FY 23 in our budget response, and we understand \$17.9 million was restored for other organics programs. Since the preliminary budget hearing, has there been any expansion of the program in the current fiscal year, FY 22, in terms of how many districts are currently being serviced?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: No, it's still the same: seven community districts for the curbside organics program that have been in place.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And for FY 23, are there any changes in terms of number of districts and number of households being serviced or will be served?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Not in terms of number of districts, but hopefully in terms of number of households. We encourage all New Yorkers in those districts to sign up for the opt-in program. So in those seven districts, if you haven't participated and you want to participate, we welcome your participation. We always welcome it. We encourage it.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And for the staff in FY 23 for this program, will those folks be on overtime or straight time?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: My understanding is that for the civilian staff, it's... it's straight time.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And for uniformed?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: For uniformed, it is overtime, because the program isn't baselined.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. And in your estimation, so we have Council Member Hanif here, who introduced a bill on universal curbside organics, which is really exciting, and hopefully will address some of the critiques of the program and why it wasn't successful. In your estimation, how much would it cost to operate a citywide universal curbside organics collection program, strictly on straight time, inclusive of the necessary outreach, education, staff, and new equipment required?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, my sense of that is that at its height, budgeted, the organics program costs \$30 million, what... and that was 24 districts. What that doesn't include, however, is the overtime that was spent on organics. One of the things I was surprised to see was that there isn't a breakout in

this department of what the overtime is used for.
It's a post that has to get filled. And so we don't
have -- or I have not yet seen -- a true overtime
cost associated with just the organics program. And
I think, you know, I had said that I want to review
what happened in the old programs and learn what was
good, what was bad. It's difficult to do that
without understanding the full cost of it. So it's
something that I'm hoping that we can parse through,
and that the agency can... can understand and of
course, be fully transparent to you about it

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: That would be great. Yeah,
it would be really great to get a sense of what this
program would cost to be successful so we can plan
for an effective budget.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Chair, I apologize. I was
told that I answered incorrectly on one question.
The uniform pickups for the seven community districts
for curbside organics are on straight time.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: On street time for moving
forward?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: It has been on straight
time, yeah.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, because I believe in a previous hearing, we were told it was on overtime... the program was being run completely on overtime.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: It was baselined now to seven districts, and so going forward, because it's baselined, it's going to be on straight time. Previously it had been on overtime.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Got it. Okay. Okay. Um, want to change to school organics. So for the school organic component, the rollout of... or the announcement of this is super, super exciting. It seems the program is budgeted for \$9.2 million in FY 23, and \$2.8 million annually thereafter to expand to 534 additional school buildings, and to establish public organic drop off sites using smart bins co-located at or near 100 school buildings. That's really awesome.

Can you speak to the success of the score clinics program that has existed in terms of participation? Or if you have diversion rates for what we're... what we're building on?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, I actually... I don't have the tonnage amounts in front of me, but we can get them to us super quick on the school's program.

But it has been one of our most successful organics programs with the participating schools. The thing that we're looking forward to is getting every public school in the city up and operational over the next two school years. We're going to roll this out in like four different tranches. So October and February of next school year, and the year after will bring groups of schools online. You may question the timeframe, but we've worked very closely with DOE on it. And it takes time to, you know, train the food service staff and the administrators, and to set up all of the bins and even start training... training the students. So that's a really important piece of the work and we want to make sure that this rollout goes well.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And so that will... this will cover -- I think that's what you said in your opening testimony -- will cover all public schools now?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes, every school building.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. And so when would you anticipate being fully operational in all schools over the next fiscal year,

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Not next school year, but the school year after that. I always screw this up. So that's... this is 21-22... in two school years.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. And then can you breakdown the FY 23 budget for school organics collection in terms of civilian staff versus uniform staff?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. There 325... It's \$9.2 million total, with \$325,000 for additional collection costs. So that's on the uniform side. We have \$1.2 million in civilian staffing costs. That's really to continue the organics program staff first added in FY 22, which wasn't baselined. We have \$2.4 million for bin procurement, maintenance, and signage for the schools. That separate from the smart bins for the parents and the community members that are going to be co located. That's \$500,000. And then we have \$5.2 million allocated for outreach staff. Those are the people who are going to, you know, go into each school, work with each school, to actually implement this and make sure that it gets rolled out smoothly.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: That's great. So I'll get back to the staff in a second. But for the 100 smart

bins, do you anticipate that being one per school... is the goal to have one per school, which I know can be challenging, especially if the program is successful, because we know that those bins are somewhat limited capacity. So what... what do you anticipate in terms of how many bins per school and the order I guess of the rollout? And then my... kind of like a sub-question to that is, are you all going to be prioritizing schools in environmental justice communities first? Or is are you going to be building out with different types of criteria?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, um, right now, we have half a million dollars in our budget to roll out 100 additional bins. I look at this as an expanded pilot, but also like phase two of the pilot that we've done in Astoria, with you know, 20-plus bins all in one in one neighborhood. So this is testing something different. If -- and I expect this will work -- if and when this works, we are excited to roll out these bins more broadly, including if it works to every public school in the city. But right now, the budget is for 100. And as to allocation, exactly where they're going to go, I agree with you, equity needs to inform all of our decisions in this

department, but in particular, the ones around smart bins and access to organics education. So we look forward to working with you and working with the committee as we make the decisions about where to place the first 100 bins. That hasn't been done yet.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, great. Do you do you have a timeline of when you want to make that decision by... so members, especially on the sanitation committee might be able to support on that?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. I'd like to do it immediately. The funding drops for us on July 1st. We're already working as much as we can on... as much as we can do without the funding in place on the procurement for the smart bins. So now in the... in the weeks between now and July 1st, I think is, you know, prime time to start thinking about and making some of these decisions because I really want to roll these things out aggressively. I think it can really like chart an important part of our future for organics in New York City.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah, I totally agree. The question about the... so when you said there's \$5.2 million for outreach staff: Do you have a sense of

how many positions that is? Is that temporary staff?
Are those contract staff? And what... what do you
anticipate the duration of their...?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: It's actually for... it's
for GrowNYC. They do our outreach for us. And
they're fabulous. I met a bunch of them last week at
an event. They are fabulous. They've worked with us
in the past on rolling out organics in schools. And
so this is to fund their work in outreach for the
schools to implement the program appropriately. So
the program is going to, as I said, be rolled out
over two school years. So that's what the outreach
will be.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Is that an expansion of
GrowNYC Staff or just to support the existing?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: You know, I want to let
Commissioner... Deputy Commissioner Greg Anderson
answer that question, because I'm not sure of the
answer.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yeah, Thank you,
Chair. Great to see you. Thank you, Commissioner
for passing me this one.

So that's a substantial expansion in their
outreach staff. So, the budget does include the

baseline support for the Recycling Champions Program, which had been previously cut. And then in the current fiscal year includes a substantial increase in that... the staff to do the education, and set up, and work with the custodians and food service staff at those schools.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. I'm going to shift to the community compost site relocation involving the Lower East Side Ecology Center. The FY 23 Executive Budget includes 448 and 129 in fiscal 2022 and \$2.19 million in fiscal 23, to support the LES Ecology Center, to build out a compost site on Rockaway Avenue in Brooklyn as a temporary location. Can you walk the committee through how DSNY will be assisting in that relocation and how long you all think it will take?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, I can. So we have \$2.6 million in the expense budget that has been allocated to this. Right now, they're located... well, they've historically been located in... at East River Park. They temporarily moved to another location, and we are looking to relocate them to a location... it's Jamaica... Jamaica Avenue... well in Rockaway, excuse me, in Rockaway. We are hoping to

get working on that relocation immediately. We think it could take up to a year. We should do it within a year, do that full build out work, and then they can stay in that location until they're able to move back to their initial home. Whenever the construction in that park is complete.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And so for this... what will happen to that site after the temporary relocation period is over? And additionally, is any of that funding coming from Parks at all? Or is it exclusively through DSNY?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: No. The funding for this was put into the DSNY budget. So we are taking the lead on building out their temporary location. We are working very closely with them on it. And we are committed to getting them a proper site that they can temporarily operate in for as long as it takes to get the park... their initial park site ready. As to what's going to happen to that site after they move back to East River Park, Greg... Deputy Commissioner Anderson, do you do you know what the plans are for that? I haven't been briefed on that yet.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Absolutely. So you know, we're... we're very excited to get the

Lower East Side Ecology Center in there. We're really hoping that they start to work with some local partners as well. There's some great community composters in that part of Brooklyn, including East New York Farms. And so we're hoping that in the long term, we can pull one of them in as an operator for that... that site and really work with the community to figure out what the right set of programming is that makes sense for that location.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. Um, and just while we're on the topic of our larger nonprofit community orgs that are supporting our organic goals: We know that Big Reuse is scheduled to lose their site under the Queens Bridge -- which is you know, truly unfortunate -- for a parking lot. What is the plan to support Big Reuse's operations that currently services Queens residents?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. So Big Reuse will be able to stay in their current location -- we're committed to that -- until we build out a new permanent site for them at the Greenpoint Marine Transfer Station. We have \$2.6 million in the sanitation budget, which we are putting towards that new... new project. We internally reallocated money

to do this, and we are committed to working with Big Reuse and with the Parks Department to ensure that they have a seamless transition from one location to the next, that the new site is well built out for them, as that will be a permanent site for Big Reuse.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Um, so one of the... the main things that they're upset about and we don't want to get too in the weeds of it, is that that essentially will... will kind of reduce a site for Queens, um, and so that's why they're concerned... they're concerned that you know, the Queensbridge residents, and some of the other areas do not have a composting operation. So just putting that out there. The \$2.6 million is that in... that's for FY 23?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. And for a couple of our hearings, we've been asking, what exactly does it cost to identify and build out kind of sizable scalable, at scale, composting facilities for the city in order to support achieving the universal organics potential? And we asked if \$1 million was realistic. We never... I don't believe we got an answer. Is it... is it in the \$2.19 million or \$2.6 million range? That is what it costs for a site?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Well, I guess... I can tell you the levers that affect the price, and I think that that will be helpful, because as... as we work together in the future on this, I think it's important to just understand the general levers.

The first is, are we acquiring a new site? Like is it a net new site to the city? That obviously, if you're going to acquire a new site adds a tremendous amount of cost. And then... or are you just... do you own the property and are you just going to construct the site?

Another big factor that contributes to cost is what scale are you going to do? Are you going to do 4 tons per day are you going to do 10 tons per day are going to do over 500 tons per day? We have different sites run by different entities, some of them the city, but they all have different processing capacity. So the amount of processing capacity does very much affect price. So that's the second lever.

And the third lever is: What type of composting are you doing there? Are you? Are you building out a large industrial setup, which obviously requires more... more cost? Or are you doing something more

straightforward? Is it outdoors? Or is it indoors?
Those are the different levers.

So we see with... with the Lower East Side Ecology Center, that it can be as inexpensive as \$2.6 or \$2.2 million, but you know, to do it much bigger, it can be, you know, \$50 million, \$100 million. It all varies based on what... what you set out to do. So I hope that helps answer some of the question.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: No, I appreciate that. This is the first time we've had a breakdown of what are those factors, we've been asking. So I really appreciate that.

Okay, I'm only going to ask a few more questions. I know a lot of folks are on here who can ask more detailed other stuff that's in the super weeds at the later end.

For public space containerization before we dive into FY 23, regarding the program, can you provide us an update on the current pilot for the FY 22 year?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, sure. So as you know, we announced and unveiled our first container in Time Square working very closely with the Time Square Alliance. That container is in place it's being used. It generally looks pretty good, although I

cringed when I went to visit it, and I saw some trash bags put out alongside of it, because the whole point was to put the trash bags inside of it, but... but generally, it has taken a large pile of trash and concealed most... most of it. The other big, big part of this is we are administering a grant program with business improvement districts. We got 29 applications from BIDs already. We're putting a second round out this summer where we're going to be working with BIDs, giving them grants to do things similar to what Times Square did. We're committed to testing these bins in all five boroughs, not just BIDs, but also residential commercial. We're working on our first residential pilot with a few blocks in in lower Manhattan that really have been aching to do this, and we're excited for their... their partnership. But we are looking to test all types of bins citywide in all... in all five boroughs. I'll just tell you that I had a very interesting conversation yesterday with the people who run sanitation in Barcelona, which is a leader in containerization. They containerized their waste a long time ago. I learned so much about it. I don't think we need to get into all the details of it at

this this hearing, but I would love an opportunity to walk you through what we learned. It was eye opening.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. So for FY 23, it says there's \$1.3 million in the out years to hire three staff for the for the program. Has this expanded at all or changed at all in terms of number of staff? And what are the kind of job titles or, you know, scope of work for these three, folks?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Greg, would you mind taking that one?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: No problem. Thank you Chair for the question. So the PS funding, which is around \$300,000, for the three staff lines include one line for our project manager for public space initiatives, who we brought on board earlier this year. And that was also funded for one year, at exec last year, so that's just a continuation of that line. And then for the other two, it's actually two new uniformed supervisors. And there'll be working in our collection office, doing site visits, reviewing Waste Management Plan submissions, and really just providing additional staffing capacity to

do the on the ground work that's necessary to implement these programs.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: So for the for the pilot programs, do we know the timeline or when you all will select where these other bins will be deployed? And do you know how many you anticipate deploying?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: I think the deployment will... will vary based on cost. What we were thinking for the BIDs we're estimating is about \$20,000 per container. It may be high, it may be low. It'll depend on how big and you know, a bunch of other bunch of other factors. We're hoping to make our first awards to BIDs soon in the coming weeks. We are reviewing all of the grant applications now and look forward to doing it and rolling out phase two of the grant program.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And so those grants are they inclusive of... I mean, I see there's three staff. There's a bunch of BIDs that want to do it. There's the \$20k per container, but then is the grant inclusive of what it would cost for outreach or any education for these pilot sites?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Greg, do you mind taking that one?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Sure.

Absolutely. So there's a few different tracks that we're working on. On the... the pilot for residential waste, we're absolutely expecting to do a substantial amount of outreach, working with not only residents in the districts where... where these are deployed, but also with the building staff who actually have to use them. So if the building has a super or porters or something like that, we want to make sure they understand how to use the bins appropriately, and are doing so. So really need to get their buy-in. On the BID side, we're expecting the BIDs will... will be the sole users of those bins. So less public interaction necessary, but absolutely we will support education and public outreach with the BIDs as necessary.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: So for the residential ones... I'm sorry, I'm asking for super details, and I didn't send some of these ones ahead... but for the residential ones, how many of those do you expect to pilot? And as though... how is the outreach being engaged? I mean, are you going to have a dedicated staffer do it across the different sites? Is that

the focus of some of these three people? I mean, I know that you said they're uniformed folks.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: I think the answer on how many residential is still TBD, to be honest. We want to make sure we hit all five boroughs. We want to make sure we get in some commercial, some BIDs, some residentials. I can't answer today how many are going to be residential, unfortunately, but we'll also look forward to working with you to sort that out and prioritize.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Alright. And do you have an initial timeline for when you think you'll be able to give like your first report, like you've got enough data under the belt enough time under the belt, where you'll be able to say, "Hey, these are some of our findings", because I know there's a special demand for this and push, and I'm a little worried that there's just going to be a lot of pressure to roll something out and not do enough time to adequately study it and make sure it's a success. So when what you think you'll get for assessment?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: I think that an assessment of this... to assess the program, you actually have to have bins placed, and the new budget to really

like begin to roll out test bins in all five boroughs hits on... on July 1st. I would imagine like a year from now, we will have -- I hope a year for now -- we will have rolled out some commercial, some residential, and some BIDs, and we'll have had an opportunity to look at how they're being used, what the stakeholders think and feel, how we can make improvements, but I wouldn't expect to see a real valuable assessment until at least next year at this time.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, thank you.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: That of course, also includes, you know, the other work that we're doing now meeting with other cities that have rolled out containerization. It's not just this pilot. Yes, this pilot is important to see how it works in in New York City specific. But like there's a lot of other research and work we can do at the same time to really hone our thoughts on it.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. I just have two more sets of questions. So the first one is related to headcounts. Um, this is around garage utility workers, splinter group workers, and civilian vacancies. The preliminary budget included \$5.1

million in savings in FY 23, growing to \$9.9 million in the out years to reduce 107 garage utility staff positions through attrition with the proposed reduction budget headcount for FY 23, and in the out years would be 378 positions for garage utility staff, if I'm accurate. Has this reduction been restored at all in the Executive Budget?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: No, it has not.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. Do you have an update on the projected impact that this might have in the out years?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: We're continuing to assess that, but I'll just say a few things on each. The splinter group staff reduction is something that I've personally managed through before, in particular, in my work at the NYPD, when we took cops out of some of the administrative commands, I ran IT. They took cops out of the administrative commands, and they put them back out... back out into the field. So I've managed through that before. It's difficult. You know, you lose something, you lose that on-the-ground, working knowledge, like how things actually... actually are. But I think it's something we can, and will have to manage through.

On the garage utility staff, I mean, those workers do some really important things. You know, they change tires. In the snow season, they put the chains on the vehicles, they put the plows on the vehicles. So I am expecting things should be well, my... my team here... my operational team here... the chiefs here are expecting that things should be okay as a result of this reduction, but if we have any issues during snow season in particular, we are committed to funding that on overtime, and we will give an assessment after snow season of how much overtime actually had to be used, if any, to make up for these cuts.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. My last set of questions is related to commercial waste zones. We just had a hearing on it, and I appreciate it all of the updates on the program so far from Justin Bland and Deputy Commissioner Greg Anderson. So for the... After our last hearing, it was mentioned that there are about 27 civilians staffing the CWE program -- and I'll ask you to correct me if I'm wrong -- and 10 dedicated to outreach. Can you remind us of the total cost of civilian staffing within the program?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Um, Greg, do you have the breakout for just the civilian staff?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yep. I'm opening it now. So in FY 23, the PS funding for civilian staff is \$2.2 million.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. It was also mentioned there would be funding for temporary contractors to support prepping the city for this program with outreach. So how much is allocated for these positions? Well, I also have several... several questions around it. How much is allocated for these positions? How many people will that employ? And how long do you expect them to be on... doing This outreach? And when do you think they'll start?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: So we think it's 30... We think it's 30 positions for outreach for the duration of the implementation period. As you know, as we've discussed, we're going to be implementing commercial waste zones zone by zone. So the outreach staff will work as long as the implementation takes.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. Um, and you said you want them to start this... this summer?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Uh, yeah. I mean, once we add the bids in and make award, yes.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. Does the program have a budget for translation service, and if so...

COMMISSIONER TISCH: The program does not have a specific budget for translation services, but we will be building language access into everything that we do related to commercial waste zones. I believe very much in language access, and will work very closely with Moya to make sure that we have the tools and the resources we need to do this important outreach language in every... outreach work in every language that is required.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. I mean, because this impacts, you know, the small business community, mostly, a lot of, you know... tons and tons of non-English speakers, do you think you have enough funding for covering that?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: I am committing to making language access a priority within the budget that we have allocated for commercial waste zones.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And is it beyond just the outreach staff? Are there going to be other forms of outreach, such as radio advertisements, newspaper town halls?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: We have \$750,000 in our budget for that type of outreach.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, those are all my questions. Thank you to the other members who've been waiting for a very long time. And thank you Chair, and thank you, Commissioner and Deputy Commissioners, and the rest of the staff here. I'm going to pass it back over to the Counsel or the Chair.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Chair Nurse. I'll take it from here. We also want to say we've been joined by Councilmember Powers, Williams, and Menin. I want to remind council members that we are limiting councilmember questions to five minutes. Please listen for the cue from the sergeant for when time is up. We are going to start with... Council Member Ayala is no longer on. So next on my list is Council Member Carr.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBERS CARR: Thank you Chairs Brannan and Nurse. Thank you Commissioner for being here today. You know my... I want to jump off where Chair Brannan was asking earlier about wastebasket service, especially because in that... you know that anecdote

he gave with those overflowing baskets you know, all too often, that trash doesn't just stay there. It rolls down the street and ends up in someone's property, and the inspector comes by at the wrong time, it could lead to some negative consequences for a business owner or building owner. In Staten Island, I believe we only have two days a week of basket service for public baskets. In FY 19, I think an extra \$250,000 was allocated to increase it to 4 or district 49 and 3 days in district 50. Sadly, that was a casualty of the COVID budget in FY 21. And you know it really... it really would be great for our borough if we could get closer to our sister borrows in terms of the frequency of service for public wastebaskets. It would do a lot to protect businesses and also keep the area clean. Can you... can you let us know if that's something you're willing to do and what the current allocation provides in terms of wastebasket service for the borough?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sure. First, I can tell... I can just repeat what I said in my testimony, which is that I appreciate any and all additional funding that may be put in place during the adopted budget

for litter basket service. I agree that it is absolutely fundamental to cleaning up the city and... and restoring cleanliness post pandemic. But I don't have the specific Staten Island numbers for you but I can commit to getting them to you right after this hearing. But what I will say on... on litter basket service is right now, we have approximately... we're at a service level of approximately once a day for little basket six days a week in most districts, not all districts. Obviously, we want to see that service level go up. And if and when we get additional funding to support litter baskets, we are going to look at things like who has the least service now? What are heavily trafficked areas? Where are the 311 complaints? Where are... what are the districts where our staff just knows intuitively where they see the problems most frequently? And we're looking forward -- if we get new funding for litter baskets -- to working with the council and being transparent about how we're making the decisions that we're making.

Greg, do you by any chance have the Staten Island numbers handy?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yeah, I do. So across the whole borough we have on weekdays, we have 10 litter basket trucks a week, and then 3 on Sundays. So one in each district on Sundays. I will say the allocations for the weekday trucks: It's six trucks in district one, which is the sort of North Shore and the area around Borough Hall, and then two trucks each, as you mentioned, Councilmember Carr in district two and district three, so certainly lower lower service levels in those two districts.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you for that. So I don't have much time left. So I'm just going to package my three questions together and hopefully get an answer from you. My predecessor championed the waste curbside pickup program, the pilot that started in Staten Island and began expanding, and unfortunately yet another casualty of the COVID budget. And now it seems like we're not going to have any of that program at all. Given how seriously you take the illegal dumping issue, and that's music to my ears, nothing was more effective in curtailing that in the borough than allowing for curbside pickup anyways, because that was principally what we were finding dumped in these vulnerable areas besides

contractor and construction waste. And so if we're going to be successful moving forward at tackling dumping, as you hope to do, we really need to preserve this program, particularly given Staten Island and other parts of the city don't have the kind of building stock that makes us eligible for the multifamily dwelling program. And so I really hope that you'll reconsider that cut in particular for Staten Island, but really, for all of our sister boroughs. And I just want to also ask: Is there any plan to add additional sanitation police. We only have one sanitation police officer for the borough, and despite attempts to you know, tackle littering from vehicles, we have a lot of vehicular based littering. We try to do more dumping stings. It's really difficult when we don't have the sanitation police, who as peace officers have... have a lot more powers to act. And then finally, with respect to swamp, it's amazing to think it's been almost 25 years already, and the most important principle to me that came out of that 06 plan was borrow equity. No borrow was ever going to be a dumping ground for another borrows waste again. We owned Fresh Kills...

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: and is that something you're going to commit to maintain in any update.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, so on, I'll take the three in order. On E waste, I appreciate your perspective about how valuable the program is. It's actually great for me to hear so early in my tenure. I agree that the program is... is a valuable program. And, you know, we'll look like based on all of the priorities on whether and if we can secure more funding for it. But I hear you loud and clear on E waste and in particular on the link to illegal dumping. On the swamp, uh, yes, I can commit to you an emphasis... a continued emphasis on borough equity in the next solid waste management plan. I particularly... we all particularly see the benefits to Staten Island over the past 20 years since the last plan, and for sure we will have the same commitment to borough equity there.

As to sanitation police, we don't have new funding to increase the size of the sanitation police, but we are... we do have vacancies like funded vacancies that we are working actually now I had a meeting with the enforcement team to fill. So there will be more sanitation police but not a

meaningfully... a meaningful amount more sanitation police, but I expect that in the in the weeks and months to come.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thanks for your answers. I look forward to talk more offline. And thank you chairs for giving me this opportunity.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember and next we'll turn to Councilmember Kagan followed by Councilmember Batra.

COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: First of all, thank you so much for this opportunity and for this great budget hearing about very important topic, sanitation. I have two questions to Commissioner. Number one: Are you planning to increase any kind of sanitation enforcement? And second question, in my district, specifically in Bensonhurst on 86th street between Bay Parkway and _____ Avenue, for many years community complaining about complete massive chaos, have ever been like Commissioner Teresa, Bensonhurst, 86 street, she did she for herself. I hear complaint repeatedly. My predecessor have complained repeatedly, but it's still total mess in terms of sanitation conditions on 86th.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: So on the first question about whether I'm looking to increase sanitation enforcement?

The answer is yes, I spoke a little bit about this in my testimony. I don't believe in... in enforcement for the sake of enforcement. But if a business or resident isn't going to do the right thing and abide by the... I think very straightforward rules and laws we have around keeping the city clean, then enforcement is a tool that we can and will use.

During the pandemic, our enforcement numbers went way down, like way down. And that I think is understandable. It's a result of people were out sick. Some of our enforcement agents were taken to do other types of COVID-related enforcement, so pulled for non sanitation duties. We have everyone back now in the sanitation department. And I think an important part of cleaning up our city is making sure that we do the enforcement that we have to do to keep the city... the city clean.

As to your invitation for me to come and visit with you and take a tour of your district, I'd love it. I spent the past several weeks meeting

sanitation workers, going to garages around the city. And now I'd really like to see your districts, understand what the very local issues are. I know that there are a lot of issues that are citywide, but even more that are local. And I want to make sure that I understand them and I'll be joined in each visit with my borough chief make sure that they see them too firsthand what I see and I appreciate the invitation. Happily take you up on it.

COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Thank you. I would welcome you to Bensonhurst.

COUNCIL MEMBER: Thank you, Councilmember Kagan. And next we'll turn to Councilmember Bottcher.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Thank you. Commissioner, how are you?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: I'm great, thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: My question is about rat mitigation. And, you know, I think most New Yorkers would be shocked to learn that the city cut \$2.2 million dollars in rat fighting funds in the sanitation budget two years ago. Last year, they were only partially restored around \$700,000, if I'm correct. In this budget, the city council asked the

mayor to add \$4.8 million for rat mitigation programs, and that didn't happen in the response to the city council, no additional funds were added for rat mitigation. Can you help us understand what's going on here? Why haven't we increased funding for rat mitigation at this time and how much is being proposed in this year's budget?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Alright. So there is a city wide task force on rat mitigation that the Department of Sanitation is a member of. We happen not to chair it. So the rat mitigation efforts in the city of New York are led by the Department... the Department of Health. So the sanitation budget isn't exactly the right place for rat mitigation. However, this administration is making a real commitment to rat mitigation that you can see in our budget, and that's through the... the \$1.3 million that was baselined in our budget for containerization. And so if containerization works -- and I will be the first to acknowledge that is a big if; there is a lot to learn over the next year -- but if containerization works, then that is a fabulous rat mitigation strategy. Obviously, it's a long term strategy. I would say, for the short term tactical stuff, though, the budget

for rat mitigation is and should be in the Department of Health.

COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: I am excited about the containerization pilot. But the rat mitigation funds that were cut were part of a city wide strategy with the Department of Health. But what those funds were for were for increased basket service in areas that were defined as rat reservoirs. Those areas didn't stop being rat reservoirs when COVID came.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. Yeah. That's... that's a great point, and I'm sorry I neglected to include this. We have said we would appreciate any additional funding may be added in the adopted budget for litter basket service. And as we hopefully roll out additional litter basket service, one of the criteria that we will use in determining how to allocate that extra budget will be about where we have major rat problems.

COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: Thank you, and I know that we're on the same page about the desire to get more funding for litter basket service, and I look forward to fighting for that with my colleagues very hard, because it's hard for me and others to explain to our constituents that in a city with \$100 billion

budget, we can't scrape together a few million dollars for rat mitigation programs. Thank you.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember. And next on my list... I do not see Councilmember Velázquez or Hanif. So next, we'll turn to Councilmember Hudson.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Thank you so much. Hello, Commissioner. And hello, Chairs. Quick question about alternate side parking. I'm wondering how much sanitation has allocated for alternate side parking regulations in this budget? And does the agency have plans to save funding by reevaluating holistically current alternate side parking standards to remove less dirty streets that currently have four times a week cleaning, when two times a week has kept it sufficiently clean? You know, I have streets in my districts that have alternate side parking four times a week compared to streets and other districts that have it just one time a week. And you know, I have heard from a lot of constituents about the challenges with needing to move their cars four times a week. So I just wanted to ask that question.

And then also regarding any plans and funding for community donation programs. So I know that programs exist, but I'm wondering if there are any plans to expand curbside pickup or drop off at specific sites and accompanying funding for that?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Um sure. So let me take the ASP question first. In the FY 23 budget, we had \$1.9 million of new funding and 41 headcount to restore... restore alternate side parking to pre-pandemic levels, which I said in my testimony is far and away the best clean streets tool that we have in our arsenal. Every mechanical broom on a single route, can pick up 1500 pounds of street litter... or a single mechanical broom, that is in addition to the \$6.7 million that we have allocated for new street sweepers, to sweep bike lanes in various sizes, which should be a very versatile fleet. We're really looking forward to that as well. So that's the budget side of street sweeping. I hope that answers that question.

The question as to looking at changing alternate side parking service levels in the city. I'm definitely open to it. That's not an overnight process. But I am open to working with this council,

understanding where we think we have too much, although I don't think we have too much right now, but once it's restored where we have too much, where we might not have enough.

I also note that there are some districts that don't have alternate side parking because when those rules were first put in place, they were more industrial districts and they've become more residential of late, so I do think wouldn't be a worthwhile effort to undertake a review of it, and I thank you for the suggestion and welcome the Partnership on it.

Greg, could you... would you mind taking the question on community donations? I know we have the \$475,000 for Stop And Swap, but do you have anything to add to that?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Sure, absolutely. So we have a whole range of programs to support the reuse industry in New York City. So we have a program called Donate NYC, that not only operates our Donated NYC exchange, where you can actually post goods that are available, find goods for donation, but we also have Donate NYC partners, which are, you know, the large Housing Works and Goodwill and

Salvation Army type organizations all the way down to neighborhood thrift stores and food pantries. So, you know, really working to support that work.

What the commissioner just mentioned, is our stop

And Swap events, which we run in partnership with

GrowNYC. We do have close to half a million dollars

in funding for fiscal 23 to operate those programs...

to operate those events throughout the city. And

those are great events where you can bring anything

you have that's gently used, and you don't want any

more, drop them off for other people to sort of pick

through, and take and then anything you see that that

you want there, you can take as well. So if you...

you know have your eyes on... on a pair of sneakers

or a nice leather jacket, you can grab that drop off

your... your books or your toaster that you don't

want anymore.

And then we also have a substantial programs

related to textile reuse and donation. So the

Refashion NYC program, which... which is for

buildings, 10 or more units, operated in partnership

with Housing Works, as well as a number of other

efforts to support textile reuse and donation across

the city.

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Thank you. And then just with my last few seconds, can you just explain how... for pilot programs how certain neighborhoods or communities are elected?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sure. I mean, if you're... let's take the containerization program, as I think the best example of a pilot program we have going on... going on right now. That one we've committed to doing five boroughs. And I think that one will largely be based on where there is real interest and commitment to getting it done. But I will say that equity will be a common theme that you will see across everything in my leadership in the sanitation department. So obviously that will inform our containerization and other pilots as well.

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, thanks for that. I would love to maybe have a follow up conversation about including my district in the... in the pilot program. We've got lots of willing participants.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: I welcome it.

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember Hudson, Councilmember Barron. I have you on my list

with your hand up, but it was down. I don't know if you did it on purpose or by accident, lowering your hand?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Uh, accident.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Oh, okay. So we'll turn to you now.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very much. A lot of my colleagues asked a lot of questions that I was that I was going to ask, but I do want to talk in general about environmental racism. You mentioned environmental justice, but when it comes to a lot of our poor black and brown communities, we have a lot of bus depots and waste transfer stations. So I know DEP and DEC and the Environmental Protection Agency of the federal government has a lot to do with these things, but how will you address the question of environmental racism when it comes to sanitation?

Unfortunately, for us, as black and brown people, racism permeates every institution and the Department of Sanitation is no exception. So we have to look at how regularly are... is trash going to be picked up? We have to look at all of the issues, whether it's, you know, little baskets, you name it, we have to make sure that there's equity in the treatment of

that. So how will you assure us... particularly the waste transfer stations? We have overwhelmingly, a number of waste transfer... land waste transfer stations, and then also have some boats that transfer trash out. How will you assure to us that equity occurs in every aspect of the agency, every aspect from the minute to the macro to the major when it comes to race. People like to ignore that will act like it doesn't exist, but it does. That's one question.

Secondly, and I think my colleagues already mentioned this, but I don't know how you say the Adam's Administration is working aggressively with you to deal with sanitation and keeping the city clean when we tried to restore \$47 million... zero and his budget, litter baskets as the Chair mentioned, \$22 million... zero in his budget, restored a baseline for sanitation cuts \$12 million... he did \$1.9 million and his budget, rat mitigation \$4.8 million... zero and his budget. And I can go on and on, and I think you already know, that is not my idea of somebody working aggressively trying to keep the city clean. And I know that one... that's not on you, but certainly hope my

colleagues in the city council are listening, that we should not accept a budget that does not have these restorations, and the enhancements when it comes to sanitation, because I have to believe sanitation along with health, education, and economic development to deal with poverty and unemployment is one of the most important aspects in our community.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: So let me take the waste equity and race question first. I think there are a number of relevant things here that we have and can and will do around waste equity.

The first is I take very seriously our responsibility to carry out Local Law 152, which is the waste equity law. And I can... I am proud to tell you that prior to my arrival here, the sanitation department had fully done what it needed to do under that Waste Equity Law, which is to cut permitted capacity at 22 facilities in North Brooklyn, Southeast Queens, and South Bronx. I think in North Brooklyn, it was by 50%. In Southeast Queens, it was by 33%. And the same for the South Bronx. In each of those areas, it cut permitted capacity... we cut permanent capacity by 10,000 tons per day. And so that is something that this

department is very proud of, and it is something that we will continue to do and continue to stay on top of.

I think the second piece on waste equity and the siting of facilities... The next conversation we have to have is about our solid waste management plan, which really charged the course for the next 20 years, and may bring it down to 10 years. But regardless, for a long time, how we make the fundamental decisions about where... where things are sited and how much permanent capacity where... that plan is, is due to the council and to the state in 2026. This budget funded, I think it was about a few hundred thousand dollars for the beginning... the first phase of development of the waste... the solid waste management plan, which is like the first opposite part...

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: ... is what is the state of affairs right now? And so just documenting that.

And so we look forward over the next three or four years to working closely with the council, to working closely with stakeholders as we develop the

solid waste management plan that is going to govern how the city deals with waste over the next 20 years.

And the last piece that I would talk about is commercial waste zones. And we implement that commercial waste zone law, that means that fewer truck miles are going to be run through communities in... in this city. And so I believe that a very important part of waste equity has... is wrapped up in commercial waste zones, and I would welcome it out. There's so much more I could say about each of these... these things, but I would appreciate the opportunity to discuss them with you.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, thank you very much for that answer. And I would like to meet with you, because years ago when I was in the city council and Gifford Miller was the speaker, we fought hard and he had to have a maritime us waste management facility in his neighborhood on 90-something street for the first time because Manhattan doesn't deal with the waste. The other boroughs...

COMMISSIONER TISCH: I have visited it.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right. So the other boroughs do... take care of all of the waste.

Manhattan doesn't do their share. So I think... you

know, I would love to have that discussion with you because, we live, as you know, in a capitalist society, and there's big cash in moving trash. So matter of fact, a lot of it has gone to USA Waste or Waste Management... I think they merged. And so there's a lot of dollars in privatizing trash collection. There's big cash in trash. So I'd love to have that conversation with you to see how we don't allow for that kind of capitalistic greed to render our communities dirtier... and inequity and picking up of trash. So thank you very much for your comment.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you Councilmember. And next we'll turn to Councilmember Ossé.

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Hi, good afternoon, Commissioner. And good afternoon, Chair Nurse. Thank you for hosting this amazing hearing, where we're gaining some insight into our sanitation budget and hopefully get to some... some solutions so that we can clean up our city. You know, I have a question that is related to Councilmember Barron's question.

You know... as you know, there's a \$31.1 million decrease for collection and street cleaning. And I

know that this decrease is mainly for uniform overtime, salaries, and fringe benefits. However, this will cut along with administration's failure to restore \$47.8 million to the Department of Sanitation. It will also decrease impact cleaning services in the city. How much of this money will go towards waste equity initiatives? And I know you touched on that with Councilmember Barron's question.

But also what is the index in which you are, you know, calculating which neighborhoods are most in need of sanitation services, especially to provide that equity that maybe is not provided in a neighborhood that I represent, like Bed Stuy versus another, maybe community in Manhattan?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you for that question, Council Member, and I apologize for not being at the last hearing on commercial waste zones. Just to explain, I know you're concerned about that, to explain, I was like a week and a half on the job, and I really... when I appear before the council, I really take very seriously giving accurate, complete information. So that was the reason for my absence. I didn't feel ready to give accurate, complete

information. What... your question was about...

Sorry.

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: In terms of how you're calculating...?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, yes. Yes. So, my... a big part of my background is in like data and IT, and I am a very data-driven person. I want this agency to become... or to continue to be, but to increase the amount that we rely on data. We collect so much data in this department, both internally and also as a city through 311. And that data should inform almost everything we... everything we do. So as new budgets... new budget cycles happen, as new, you know, cuts are required, or hopefully, funds are added, the allocation of that service will be based on... based on the data. And of course, an important consideration will also be equity.

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Thank you. The second question I have is related to something that is more current in our city right now. You know, I'm aware that the Department of Sanitation has played a role in the mayor's homeless encampment sweeps, removing people's belongings and property in these sweeps. You know, when our neighbors are facing the trauma of

homelessness, it is more devastating for them to lose whatever they have left, rather than letting them stay with it then. You know, the purpose of the Department of Sanitation is to remove waste and to ensure our streets are healthy and clean, not to further traumatize our neighbors.

So I wanted to ask you, how much of our taxpayer dollars is allocated to the Department of Sanitation is involvement in the street sweeps? And to follow up after that, what is the Department of Sanitation doing with property taken from our homeless neighbors?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, so, on this topic, Mayor Adams has been... been clear: We want to encourage vulnerable New Yorkers to come in off the streets and the subways into safer settings with dedicated services and support. He's also been clear that the city will not be dissuaded from offering vulnerable individuals on the street the supports that they are entitled to.

Our work on this on this interagency task force: We are one of a few agencies who work on these issues together. And our work in particular in the sanitation department is done by our precision... by

our precision teams. It is not, it's generally not done on overtime, it's done on straight time. So it's not adding to the overtime burden. But we take our precision sweep teams, and this is among the work that they do.

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: So this isn't an additional cost for these types of sweeps or services?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: It is not a new need. It is not an additional... it is not an additional cost. We have a unit in the sanitation department that does precision related work, and they allocate some of their time to participating interagency task force.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Thank you for those answers. And I hope to see you in the neighborhood, Commissioner.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: I'm looking forward to it.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember. Next, we'll turn to Councilmember Williams.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Hello, Commissioner. Again, congrats on your appointment. We loved Commissioner Grayson in my office, and we hope to have the same relationship and welcome you to come

and visit us as well. We were happy to have Commissioner _____ join us. And I also just really wanted us to think Q12 because they have been really helpful to us and very, very, very responsive. So I would be remiss if we did not think Q12 and Q13, who always come to our support.

The first question I have... I'm actually going to ask all of my questions, and then you can just answer them.

The first question I have is in regards to state and federal funding, we didn't see any increases in the state's funding. And we know that federal funding was a one-time deal. So I just kind of wanted to understand how the agency is accounting for not having those fundings, and if the agency thought to advocate at the state level for more funding.

The other question that I had, and maybe you'll appreciate this: You mentioned that you ran 311. And so the question that I have is in regards to 311. So in my district, when they made the special classification for illegal dumping, my district actually had the highest amount of illegal dumping in terms of the 311 calls. And so I know a lot of my colleagues mentioned enforcement, and just again

wanted to reiterate or ask what the agency plans to do specifically in areas that are prone to illegal dumping? The previous council member allocated money in cameras. I am also hopefully at allocating more money to cameras, wanting to understand even that. So outside of having actual enforcement agents, which I agree, we need to have more of those. And I noticed again, that line item was also decreased in this budget. But the timeline for cameras and installing the cameras, because this money was allocated last year, I plan to allocate more money to put more cameras, I just want to have an understanding of the timeline. And I have a very innovative idea to make one of our historically dumping areas, _____ a bike lane, since I've heard 1000 times on this hearing that you are planning to keep those clean. So perhaps if it was a bike lane, we wouldn't have illegal dumping in that area.

And the last and final thing that I wanted to say is I know we've been having a lot of conversations, my colleagues, are all you know supportive organics program. But it's my understanding is schools that currently have the program, there isn't really any incentives or encouragement for school professionals

to encourage the kids to actually participate in the program. And so if we're increasing support of the program, I just want to understand what type of coordination, encouragement, incentivization, I just needed to learn what is taking place to ensure that the person is actually working as intended to.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, I've written down all your questions. And here goes:

The question about turning a known dump site into part of a bike lane: Sounds great to me. What I can commit to you is I will work with you and I will work with the Department of Transportation to assess the feasibility and see if we can push that forward.

On cameras... This didn't earn me a lot of popularity in my time at the NYPD, but I was responsible for building the NYPD Domain Awareness System which included cameras and I would be thrilled to put my camera-related background to work for you and for illegal dumping. And so one of the things that I'm going to do when I dig in with the IT team here is to understand what the current approach is to cameras, and see how we can... can speed it up. Like once the cameras are procured, like those things should go up really, really, really fast. It's not

rocket science to do. So I'm going get back to you on timeline for cameras. I know we have a bunch of cameras on order. I'm going find out when they get in. But like, I don't want them sitting on shelves here. Like they're coming in, and then they're going up on... on street poles. That's the answer the camera question.

The other part of the legal dumping question, which had to do with 311 calls... how your district had the most 311 calls for illegal dumping. First, I'm very happy that we made that a specific category in 311 so that we can collect good data on it. I am going to dig into that data on illegal dumping and be very transparent about it. I've already dug into the 311 data on litter baskets and learned a whole lot. I can tell you that we have teams in each district that address illegal dumping, and what we will do is based on the data make sure that those teams are sized correctly...

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: ... or appropriately from district to district.

On the incentives for kids to do organics.

Greg, I apologize for leaning on you so much. Can you take that question? I'm not sure exactly what we do there. But Council Member, if we don't do enough, I am a person who is all about implementation. A programs is not worth it if it's not implemented correctly. If the kids don't use it, then what are we doing? So I'm very committed to making sure that all stakeholders from the students to the staff at school are bought in, understand it, and the schools are set up?

So Greg, what do we have today on... on getting the kids ready for organics?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Sure. And actually, Commissioner, if you don't mind, I'm gonna pass this over to Bridget Anderson and her team. Her team is going to oversee all the outreach work and education and oversees the school's organics program.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: Thank you Commissioner and Greg, and Councilmember. We are very excited to roll out this program citywide. We want to make sure that we are leveraging the learning curve we've had rolling out curbside composting for schools over the past several years.

1 This is... the heart heavy lift here is the DOE
2
3 and the... you know the enormous population that they
4 have to serve and motivate to do this program. So
5 our role is to enable and support them in doing that.
6 Part of it is the funding for the GrowNYC outreach
7 team. They have developed over the years a very
8 successful curriculum and program to support school
9 custodians, school staff, school students and
10 teachers. But we also know that you can't just go
11 there once leave and move on. There needs to be sort
12 of maintenance motivation. And that's something that
13 we're trying to figure out now: Is how do we make
14 sure that we have a light touch? Even after we've
15 done our intensive rollout, to make sure that staff,
16 there's turnover of staff, etc, that they remain
17 motivated. So we are happy to discuss that more with
18 you. But really, it is a partnership with us and the
19 DOE to make sure we have the buy-in by the right
20 people within every school.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I know my
22 time has expired. My other question is just the
23 funding... (crosstalk)

COMMISSIONER TISCH: I am not sure what funding that you're referring to. So maybe, Greg, do you have a sense of this?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yeah. So we did get a substantial amount of federal funding for the current fiscal year fiscal 22 as part of the Coronavirus relief bills that passed under the Biden administration last spring. And that was intended to be a replacement for lost revenue and was generally put toward our... our waste export funding. You're correct, Councilmember that funding is not renewed in fiscal 23. That's a one-time shot. But we did backfill those expenses with city tax levy funds. That's what they had been funded with previously, and that's what they'll go back to being funded with going... going forward.

And I do just want to put one pitch in here. I know the council has been very supportive of the extended producer responsibility programs, particularly for packaging. This is a place where it's not necessarily state funding in that it's not tax funding, but it's a place where state policy can really bring funding to our agency. And this is something that I know the legislature is considering

right now. They just passed a carpet recycling law that we hope the governor signs. Actually just today DC sent out a press release that the paint take back program is going into effect which is going to bring some funding for our special waste programs. So this is just another place where, you know, we could get potentially up to a \$100 million in funding if this program goes through. So any advocacy you or your colleagues can do, in addition to the resolution that you all passed earlier this year, would be very helpful.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Next is councilmember Brewer, then Councilmember Sanchez, then Councilmember Menon. We'll turn to Councilmember Brewer.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Hold on. No, she dropped off the Zoom. Okay. We'll circle back. Councilmember Sanchez?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: You asked me to bump you. Okay, we'll go to Councilmember Menin.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Okay, third time's the charm. Thank you so much. First of all, thank you,

Chair for holding this hearing. And good to see you, Commissioner.

So I really wanted to echo what my colleagues have previously said, about restoring the budget cuts, and particularly with increased litter basket pickup in my district, this is a hot button topic, and I know in so many other districts as well, and it's probably one of the top constituent issues that we are hearing from. But another issue that I'm hearing a lot from on constituents is since the announcement on alternate side parking, could you walk us through...? Will there be any changes to that? Is that now permanent? Are you going to be looking at any of the streets where there may be some issues? Because that's the question that we're constantly getting in the office.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sure. So on... I'll just take litter baskets first... with litter baskets, I could not be clearer that we appreciate any additional funding that is added into our budget to support litter baskets, and we are operationally ready to go and to increase service should the budget allow for it.

On alternate side, there are no changes. So... so basically, what we're going back to on July 5 is the same program we had before March 2020. So it's basically whatever the sign says. You're now following all of what the sign says rather than rather than half of it, which I know confused people for a while. But what I did commit to and I'll commit to you again on it, is that we're happy to take a look at refreshing alternate side parking. I mean, this is not an immediate thing, but undertake an analysis of it, to see if there are streets that didn't get it that should have it, or are there some streets that have too much or too little, or there's some districts that don't have it... have it at all, and have recently become or in the past few years become more residential. I'm happy to like put fresh eyes... fresh eyes to that type of analysis and work with the council.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: That would be incredibly helpful, because we do get a lot of questions from it and really doing a street by street analysis in neighborhoods to see which streets it makes sense on, which streets it doesn't make sense on would be very, very helpful.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you for that suggestion.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Okay. Great. Thank you, and thank you to the Chairs for organizing this. Thank you.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Council Member Menin. I don't see... oh, Councilor Sanchez. There we go. Because I don't see councilmember Brewer. So we'll turn to Councilmember Sanchez.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Great. Thank you, thank you so much, Malcom. And a huge shout out to Malcom for the endurance of just being here through all these hearings into our Sergeant At Arms. And everyone, of course, to chair Brannan. So thank you, thank you, Chair Nurse for this hearing... for Chairing this hearing.

So my question is... you may have addressed it earlier when you were talking about the illegal dumping, but I didn't quite hear. So my question is about the Precision Cleaning Initiative, which was launched in fiscal 22. So I know that you use borough-based teams to conduct the targeted cleanings for litter conditions, illegal dumping, and overflowing litter baskets. So just wanted to see if

there was an update of what this... what the program has accomplished in this last year and future years?

And let me just put a point... a finer point here. One, thank you so much for always answering our calls at Department of Sanitation. And, you know, whenever we have an issue I've had, you know, just great responsiveness. So just want to appreciate you all Commissioner, Deputy Commissioner.

And so that's part one of the question, and then part two is illegal dumping and more broadly, you know, just tips and advice for council members and how we can, you know, sort of curb that... and what... what the department's approach is to, you know, curbing that, like figuring out who's doing it and actually trying to stop it from the from the root.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, so I'll start with the answer to the second part of the question. I don't have in front of me, the data about illegal dumping district by district, and I'll ask once I'm done. Maybe one of my colleagues has it here. If not, we'll circle back with you really fast.

But as to the general approach on illegal dumping, it's three things. All of them are related.

One is enforcement, enforcement, enforcement enforcement. If you are caught... illegal dumping is a theft of public space. If you are caught engaged in illegal dumping, it is a \$4,000 fine. And if you're using a vehicle, your vehicle can be impounded. We take this very seriously. And I want to make sure that the enforcement efforts around illegal dumping are as robust as they need to be in the places that suffer most from it, because we know that this is not a citywide problem, it is a very local problem, and it affects very much the communities that have it. So the first was enforcement.

The second is Precision Cleaning, as you mentioned, we have these teams in every borough. Part of their work is to clean lots or places where illegal dumping has occurred. We will get you that data, but those cleanup efforts are very important. The before and after pictures are fantastic. The tragedy though -- and this is why I circles back to enforcement -- is that it keeps happening in the same places. So you clean it up one day, and then the next week, it's back. We are committed to continuing to clean it up and continuing to enforce it.

And that brings me to the third prong, which is cameras, cameras, cameras. I had mentioned to one of your colleagues that I have a lot of background and experience running camera systems. I very much believe in the value that cameras can add to stopping the blight of illegal dumping. And I'm looking to go all in on cameras where they are needed, and where they are needed is in these repeat locations. Like it's just too easy not to do. So I hope that answers your question. I'm wondering if Chief Lohan or Deputy Commissioner Anderson have any of the data around Precision Cleaning and how many dump sites we've cleaned this year? If not, Councilmember, we'll get back to you really fast with it.

CHIEF LOHAN: Yes. Good afternoon, everyone. I have some stats on Precision Cleaning. So since the program started to date, we assigned 3162 crews. They have been assigned to service 52,000 additional litter baskets, over 20,000 additional drop offs, and then over 10,000 additional block pieces swept. And you know with that we encounter discarded syringes, unfortunately, we removed over 1000 of those as well.

So it's been a pretty successful program, you know, we look forward to continuing that and

expanding that, and hopefully, refining that as time goes on.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Do you by any chance have any borough-by-borough or district by district information? If not, we can get back to the Council Member, after but in particular, any work we've done in the Bronx generally or Morris Heights?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

CHIEF LOHAN: Yes. I have... I have particular stats. I can definitely share that. If you want to get into that now. Or we could share that afterwards. I think that would be responsive to the Council Member's question.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Yeah, thank you. After... after is fine, you know, so we can get in writing. It's better for us.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, cool. We will send that over to you.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you so much.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember Sanchez.

I'm going to turn it back to the chairs. I know Chair Nurse had two quick follow ups and her closing

remarks, and then Chair Brannan for his closing remarks. So Chair Nurse.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah, I also just want to recognize Councilmember Ayala had come back on.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: I saw hand up.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: She was the first name... first hand up earlier, so I texted her to come back on.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you. I really appreciate that. Sorry, I had to jump off. I apologize now, Commissioner, if you have already responded to this question a million times. But actually, I have a couple. One is regarding the syringe litter program. I'm not sure now that we saw cuts in last year's budget. I'm not sure if that's the same this year... if those... those funds were restored. Obviously syringe litter continues to be a huge problem throughout the city. My district specifically has seen an increase in the last few years. So it's something that we lobbied for and were really excited to grow... and then it was abruptly cut. That's one.

I'll ask them that way so that we don't run out of time.

Two, I was... I'm very curious to find out how funding is broken down by district. Is it by garage? Is it by community? I, you know, I often feel like our community... and I know that Chair Brannan mentioned that we want what everybody wants. I want to kind of just state that I don't want what everybody wants. I want everybody to have what they have. But I want those communities that need more to get that more, because I find, you know, I know for a fact that, you know, the district south of me, you know, may not... you know, may have more access to resources to supplement cleaning needs to haul off their garbage with private, you know, groups, but in East Harlem and South Bronx, we don't have that that privilege. And so we have a lot of density and that means that we have a lot of garbage. So I would like to know how that... that budget is broken down.

Three: Where my garbage cans? My garbage cans are missing everywhere. There was a theory a couple of years ago... a rumor that segmentation kind of verify that they took the garbage cans because they didn't want household garbage on corners, but that

has resulted in a huge problem for us, because now people are just throwing, you know, their garbage on the street. So I would like my garbage cans back if possible.

And last but not least, I guess this is more of a comment than anything else, but on Bruckner Boulevard, there are some rails right underneath the highway that are technically in councilmember Salamanca's district in the Bronx. They smell horribly throughout the summer months, I was driving by I had my window closed, I had my air conditioning on and my entire vehicle smelled of nothing but garbage. I look to my left, and there's nothing but residential homes there. And I know that the wind is carrying that smell every single summer. So I wonder if that's something that you are aware of? Maybe anything that you can help with?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, Greg, I have not been fully briefed up on the syringe litter programs. I want to see if either Deputy Commissioner Anderson or Chief Lohan could take that one.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Sure I can... I can take that one. So councilmember, thank you for those questions. And I certainly understand the...

the challenges in your district, I've been on several walkthroughs, both in the Bronx, and the Manhattan parts of your district, specifically focused on this issue. And I'm happy to say that we do have the additional syringe litter staff on board again, after they were cut a year and a half ago, or so. So we do have the six dedicated staff there. We are doing daily patrols in the Bronx, and... and very frequent patrols in East Harlem as well as other places around the city where... where we do see those either 311 complaints or... or incoming from elected officials or otherwise. So that's a very important issue for us, and we certainly want to make sure that we're deploying those staff effectively. So if there are... if there are places where you're seeing accumulations of syringes, please let our team know and we'll certainly get them there.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Absolutely. Do you find that six... six... You have six dedicated staffers. Is that enough?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: As I think the commissioner has said before, we can always do more with more, but we're certainly getting to the most problematic locations on a very regular basis.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I appreciate that.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you so much, Greg.

The garbage cans in your district that have disappeared. It's the first I'm hearing of this. I commit to you that I personally will look into it. I know the value of a litter basket in a community, and losing them is a big deal.

I will say that if they were taken because they have household trash in them... household trash in litter baskets is a big deal. Part of the reason why we see overflowing litter baskets is not enough service, but the city will never be able to do enough service to make it so that putting houses...

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: ... or household trash in litter baskets won't cause overflowing conditions. I don't know if we have to do community education, public outreach, but litter baskets are for walking trash only. To the extent people misuse them it creates a problem for everyone. Now I'm not sure that the right course of action is to remove... remove the litter baskets. There are other steps you can take. But I look forward to talking to you offline, understanding where these litter baskets

were getting to the bottom, and hopefully restoring them Your service there.

Your question on Bruckner Boulevard: If that... it sounds terrible. I haven't experienced the smell myself. But if that is an issue that needs cleaning, we will obviously commit to doing that.

Greg, do you have more information in background on Bruckner Boulevard?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yeah, I do.

And... and thank you. For that question, Councilmember. It's certainly something that we've heard, particularly in the summer. There is an intermodal facility next to the Oak Point Yard, that does not handle containers of municipal solid waste, but does handle some material that comes out of DEP wastewater treatment plants. And, you know, we've worked with them over the years to try to address those odor concerns. We've also worked with DEP that's something that... that we sit down with them to talk through every summer. And you know, when we... when we notice that there are issues going on, we conduct enforcement as necessary as well. So that's something that we're certainly aware of, and are... (crosstalk)

COUNCIL MEMBERS AYALA: That's really important, because if you if you consider where that the placement of that rail yard, the fact that the families that are across the street that include children are already inhaling all of the fumes that are coming from carbon emissions, right? And then on top of it, the entire... that entire area, smells like a garbage can, every single summer. I mean, smells so bad. I felt really bad, you know, because that was the first time I had ever experienced it. And immediately I look left, and I'm like, oh my god, like I couldn't imagine having to live here. And smell that day in and day out.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Councilmember, I think your final question was how are resources broken down? It's really district by district. So by garage.

And I think maybe perhaps when you were on... so my background is really in data, and I want to take a very much a data driven approach to allocating resources in the department, how many people work in each garage, how many trucks we have in each garage, those... those types of things and take a fresh look at it. And we are committed to using our resources equitably. Meaning the districts that need it

2 should... should have it and districts that have too
3 much and can do with less should... should do with
4 less. So that's a general high level, how... how
5 it's done and how we plan to do it going forward. I
6 was wondering if you had a more specific question
7 about that?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Well, yeah... I mean...
9 you know, again, what I understand is that, you know,
10 other districts, that are neighboring districts
11 receive a lot more funding, in comparison to East
12 Harlem. Again, because I have a higher density and,
13 you know, problem, and this is not specific to East
14 Harlem. This is the in the Bronx, you know, you
15 can't... I mean, it's horrible. I mean, it is just
16 really, really, really dirty. And I'm not asking. I
17 think we all got 2 street sweeps a day, then we all
18 get 2 street sweeps a day, but is sanitation in a
19 position to identify communities like mine, that
20 obviously need maybe four, right?, because we don't
21 have those resources, my small businesses can pay to
22 have a garbage carted. We obviously, you know, don't
23 have sufficient garbage cans. We have a lot more
24 garbage on our streets than normal. So when we
25 put... we opened the streets now for the restaurants,

the most of my restaurants can't even benefit from that, because the rat population is now... you know, surrounding them, because they're looking for garbage that's readily available throughout the community.

So I want to know exactly how much each district gets because I would like to know why, you know, why there are disparities that exist in communities like ours. And I appreciate, you know, that you're brand new, and I look forward to working with you on this. I like to be fair, and I know that you just got here. So you know, this is this has nothing to do with you. You're inheriting the situation. But I... I feel that you know, for me, it's really important. And it's for many of my colleagues, the equitability and the distribution of services. But by that, I don't mean that everybody gets the same cut as a pie. By that I mean that our districts all look the same, because the ones that need more are getting more.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: I understand and what I... the way I think we should proceed is very soon, like this week, next week, like not two months from now. To sit down and walk you through what the resources are in your district, and understand like more specifically where in the district you're not getting

the service that is required, and see what we can do. As we get resources in, we want to allocate them, equitably. Now, the street sweeping is really hard. I'll be really honest, because street sweeping today... meaning to... to change quickly, because there are street sweeping rules, they're all posted, and to change those is a big to do, it's not that we won't do it, we can undertake an analysis, it's just not an immediate thing. So it's hard to add extra street sweeping immediately beyond what's... beyond what's already coming... starting July 5, with the return of alternate side. But we want to sit with you and make sure we understand what the needs are so that we can equitably allocate services across the city.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Okay. I appreciate that. Thank you so much. Thank you, Chair Nurse.

COUNSEL BUTEHORN: All right, thank you. I'll turn it back to you Chair Nurse and Chair Brannan.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you. I just had two or three questions. I know we're all probably losing our brain cells. I haven't eaten. I'm starting to get.... like my head is going crazy. So I'll try to be quick. These are just things I didn't want to ask

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE 346

2 because there was so many people waiting to ask. But
3 on leaf and yard collection. It's great to see
4 there's \$4 million baseline funding for that.

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Right.

6 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: But how... can you break that
7 down in terms of, you know, is that across the whole
8 city? Or how many districts is that? How much?

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It's citywide.

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: I know you mentioned it
11 earlier in your...

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, it's a citywide
13 program. Each district gets 2 Sundays a month in the
14 fall season. But it's run over... over four weeks, I
15 think or... or Greg, do you have how long the program
16 is... but it's two... it's two per district. And,
17 Greg, do you have in front of you the tonnage numbers
18 on fall leaf? Or Chief Lohan?

19 Oh, I'm sorry. I'm sorry. I said I said that
20 this was... was citywide. I meant the 38 leaf
21 districts. So it's not it's not citywide, but it is
22 in the 38 districts that have leafs. Sorry, go ahead
23 Greg.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yeah. And this
25 past... this past fall, we collected just under 2000

tones of leaves. That was an abbreviated program, because of some issues we were having in November. And then previously, we've collected as much as... 2017 was 3200 tons, 2019 was 3700 tons. So it can really... it can really be a substantial amount of material collected. It really does depend on the timing of the collections. The leaves fall at different times every year, sometimes they stay on longer. Sometimes they hit the ground in early November. So that's that is a factor.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, great. Um, Stop And Swap. Sorry, I'm just kind of trying to crank through because I know we're all brain dead.

What is the budget for the program in the... in FY 23? And then can you give just any anecdotal... or if you have data, kind of, you know, what's the participation, attendance numbers of these events, pre-pandemic versus what we're seeing now? In terms of just effective strategies? Or reuse strategies?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: So the Stop And Swap is funded at \$495,000, which we are... we're pleased to get. I have not yet been to a Stop And Swap event. So if Bridget or Greg or Chief Lohan can give some anecdotal details about it.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: Sure, yeah.

Thank you for that question. We are funded, as the Commissioner has said. Part of that is for one full-time person that we hired last year that wasn't fully baselined. And the remaining just shy of \$400,000 is for our relationship with GrowNYC, who runs the Stop And Swap program. We aim to have one per community board every year, and this year, attendance was highly variable because of COVID, and some of our sites, you know, had to limit participation, but we can see you know, more than 100 people in and out of a Stop And Swap at any one location. They are very much micro programs where we heavily do outreach in the neighborhood, so people can you know, walk their material in and out. Any material that is not actually swapped gets donated to a local donation outlet. So it's a... you know, in the, you know, 10s to 100s, I would say. And it also depends on how large the space is that were able to identify to run the swap.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And how much does an average swap cost to put on?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: It's a little bit variable based on... based on the space we get, but I can get back to you with an average cost.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. Yeah, I'm just... I would be curious to see like, you know, how much material is being, you know, swapped... or reused, how much material is actually then having to be donated after... just to understand like the effectiveness of this program as a reuse strategy?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: We can provide you that in writing. Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. My last question is around Save As You Throw, one of my favorite topics.

We did... the council did put in request for -- I can't remember if it's \$1 million or \$2 million at this point -- for a study on it. I know in the past, there was a contractor hired to conduct this study. So before we talk about why or why not it may not be included in the FY 23, is there anything that can be shared from the previous attempt at this? Were there any initial findings or anything that was... or is shareable to the committee?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: The last real look at this was 2014. There were plans to do it in 2017. And

then I understand that they got scrapped. So the last study of it is quite old. I'm happy to share it, if you're interested.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah, I would love that. And anything that... I mean, I know some motion was started in the second attempt, and I know that it was scrapped, but I'm just curious if there was anything that was ever documented or produced in terms of what they started to do, or...

COMMISSIONER TISCH: You and me both. I'm going to get that answer for both of us.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah, I would love that. Okay, great. Um, you know, I just... you know, curious what you feel about this, and if you think this is something that departments should prioritize, or that the administration should put some funding towards at least studying. We're putting a lot of money into a lot of innovative pilots and other creative strategies. So I'm curious, from your perspective, if this is something that we should work towards investing in.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Um, so we have a lot of studies going on, which we are thrilled to do, because that will very much inform our operations. I

think this is definitely a worthwhile thing to study. And certainly, if the last study was in 2014, like refresh and get really smart on. Practically I think, the right place to do it would be around the solid waste management plan. It's... it is a huge... it would represent a huge change to how sanitation works in New York City, and it's not something that I think can or should be... be rushed. And I think it is... it is so big, but it is probably best done as part of the larger plan for New York City.

CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. Awesome. Well, I know that there is another meeting after this for Chair Brannan. So I'm going to be done. I just want to, you know, finally... just my last word is to advocate for, you know, the rat mitigation zones, the places that haven't had any of the pilot programs, especially East New York, as I just want to uplift, Councilmember Barron's remarks, for some of these smart bins for the schools to have a chance to participate. I think this will be really exciting, especially if we have a site coming up on Rockaway Boulevard there, it could be a really great opportunity to lay the foundation for all the

1 outreach and education that is going to be required
2 to do potentially a universal program.

3 So thank you, again, Commissioner and Deputy
4 Commissioners and all the senior leaders and members.
5 I'm going to pass it back over to Chair Brannan.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you Chair Nurse.
7 Yeah, thank you to the commissioner, obviously in
8 your leadership team, for answering all of our
9 questions.

10 You know, if I'm reading between the lines, I
11 think, you know, you agree with a lot of what the
12 council is pushing for, you know, and I hope that OMB
13 makes note of that as well. We are really dedicated
14 to bringing the city back stronger than ever and
15 making sure that our neighborhoods are clean, and
16 that we have equity across the city in every zip
17 code. It is a big part of that recovery and a big
18 part of the way people feel about their
19 neighborhoods. If their neighborhood is clean, they
20 feel a certain way, and we want people to feel like
21 the city is back. And that's why we're fighting so
22 hard for a lot of these restorations in these
23 different programs. So, we look forward to working
24
25

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE

353

2 with you. Going forward again, welcome aboard

3 Commissioner Tisch.

4 And with that, I will adjourn.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE

354

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 15, 2022