

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE  
Jointly with the  
COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION  
and  
COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

----- X

May 10, 2022  
Start: 9:07 a.m.  
Recess: 4:09 p.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 1)

B E F O R E: Justin L. Brannan, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Diana Ayala  
Charles Barron  
Gale A. Brewer  
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers  
David M. Carr  
Amanda Farias  
Kamillah Hanks  
Crystal Hudson  
Ari Kagan  
Farah N. Louis  
Francisco P. Moya  
Chi A. Ossé  
Keith Powers  
Pierina Ana Sanchez  
Marjorie Velázquez

Speaker Adrienne Adams  
Vickie Paladino  
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.  
Julie Menin  
Nantasha Williams  
Keith Powers  
Erik Bottcher  
Rita Joseph  
James Gennaro  
Sandy Nurse  
Lincoln Restler  
Althea Stevens  
Shekar Krishnan  
Sandra Ung  
Jennifer Gutiérrez  
Shahana Hanif  
Oswald Feliz  
Linda Lee  
Eric Dinowitz  
Mercedes Narcisse  
Amanda Farías  
Lynn Schulman

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

David Banks  
New York City Schools Chancellor

Nina Kubota  
President and CEO New York City  
School Construction Authority

Cora Liu  
Vice President of Capital Plan  
Management, School Construction  
Authority

Dan Weisberg  
First Deputy Chancellor Department  
of Education

Lindsey Oates  
Chief Financial Officer Department  
of Education

Kevin Moran  
Chief Schools Operations Officer  
Department of Education

Carolyne Quintana  
Deputy Chancellor Division of  
Teaching and Learning  
Opportunities Department of  
Education

Camille Varlack  
Senior Advisor Department of  
Education

Jawana Johnson  
Chief of School Culture, Climate  
and Wellbeing Department of  
Education

Jade Grieve

Chief of Student Pathways  
Department of Education

Thomas Taratko  
Chief Executive Officer, Office of  
Space Management, Department of  
Education

John Shea  
Chief Executive Officer Division  
of School Facilities Department of  
Education

Anuraag Sharma, Chief Information  
Officer Department of Education

Rebecca Rawlins  
Chief Executive Office of District  
Planning Department of Education

Cristina Melendez  
Executive Director of Family and  
Community Empowerment Department  
of Education

Kenita Lloyd  
Department of Education

Jessica Tisch  
Commissioner, Department of  
Sanitation

Bridget Anderson  
Deputy Commissioner, Department of  
Sanitation

Gregory Anderson, Deputy  
Commissioner, Department of  
Sanitation

Chief Javier Lohan, Acting Deputy  
Commissioner for Financial

Management and Administration,  
Department of Sanitation

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE

6

2 SERGEANT SADOWSKI: We are alive I'm just double  
3 checking the live stream. Live stream is good at  
4 this time we'll start just please start the  
5 recordings. Once again at this time, will Sergeants  
6 please start the recordings?

7 Thank you.

8 SERGEANT PÉREZ: Recording into the cloud all set.

9 SERGEANT SADOWSKI: Thank you and good morning  
10 and welcome to today's remote New York City Council  
11 physical 2023 Executive Budget hearing of the  
12 Committee on Education, and then later the Committee  
13 on Sanitation and Waste Management. At this time,  
14 would all council members and staff please turn on  
15 their video.

16 To minimize disruption please place electronic  
17 devices on vibrate or silent mode. All public  
18 testimony will be given on May 25 at 10 a.m. If you  
19 would like to submit testimony, you may do so at  
20 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Thank you for your  
21 cooperation we are ready to begin.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Sergeant. Good  
23 morning, and welcome to the third day of fiscal year  
24 23 Executive Budget hearings. Today we'll hear from  
25 the Department of Education and Sanitation as well as

2 the School Construction Authority. I am Councilman  
3 Justin Brannan. I have the privilege of chairing the  
4 Finance Committee of the City Council, and I'm joined  
5 today by Speaker Adams, as well as my Co-Chair for  
6 our first hearings. Councilmember Rita Joseph, Chair  
7 of the Education Committee.

8 The Department of Education's projected fiscal 23  
9 budget of \$30.95 billion represents 31.1% of the  
10 city's proposed fiscal 23 budget in the executive  
11 plan. The D.O.E.'s fiscal 23 budget in the executive  
12 plan is \$612.5 million less than its fiscal 22  
13 adopted budget, primarily due to the large amount of  
14 federal stimulus funds budgeted in fiscal 22.

15 Overall, D.O.E. has a \$7 billion in federal  
16 stimulus funding, with a large portion of the federal  
17 stimulus funds allocated to supporting existing long-  
18 term programs. The Executive Budget includes nearly  
19 \$515 million in fiscal 25 program... for programs  
20 that will require funding after federal funds expire  
21 in December of 24. It is uncertain how the city will  
22 account for the costs of these expanded programs in  
23 fiscal 26 and beyond. Additionally, the previous  
24 administration used federal stimulus funds to restore  
25 baseline cuts through fiscal 2024 only with \$90.6

2 million in restorations for fiscal 23 and fiscal 24.  
3 These cuts to the D.O.E. budget will resume in fiscal  
4 25 with \$87.6 million in reductions, which will  
5 impact air conditioning, school supports, the  
6 Education and Equity Program, arts instruction and  
7 Health Ed works.

8 I welcome the Department of Education and the  
9 School Construction Authority being here today, and  
10 I'll be focusing my questions on unspent FY 22  
11 federal spending, enrollment changes, and any  
12 associated budget cuts that may result in those  
13 enrollment changes, school accessibility and  
14 something I care about very much: vision and hearing  
15 care, especially for those students that may not have  
16 access to such services.

17 And finally, for the School Construction  
18 Authority, I will look into the S.C.A.'s review of  
19 suitable sites for new school buildings. I want to  
20 thank the Finance Division who has been working very,  
21 very hard behind the scenes to make these hearings  
22 possible, especially Chelsea Beytemur, Masis  
23 Sarkissian, Dohini Sompura, and my Senior Adviser  
24 John Yeddin[sp?], for preparing for today's hearing  
25 especially.

2 I also want to thank all the Council staff that's  
3 involved in putting together this hearing behind the  
4 scenes.

5 I am now going to turn to my colleague, Chair of  
6 the Education Committee Rita Joseph, to deliver her  
7 opening remarks.

8 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you Chair Brannan.  
9 Good morning, everyone. Good morning and welcome to  
10 education committee's hearing on fiscal 2023  
11 Executive Budget. We have been joined by Chancellor  
12 Banks, First Deputy Chancellor Dan Weisberg, and  
13 D.O.E. Financial Officer Lindsey Oates, who will  
14 testify on D.O.E.'s Executive Budget.

15 I want to thank Chair Brannan for his overview of  
16 the D.O.E.'s budget and the Executive Plan, and in  
17 the interest of time, I'll keep my remarks brief.

18 For the executive budget hearing, I would like to  
19 focus on redistribution of \$421 million in the  
20 federal stimulus funding for new chancellor  
21 priorities for which \$310 million is reallocated in  
22 fiscal 2023 and \$111 million is relocated in fiscal  
23 2024. These reallocations have a net zero effect on  
24 D.O.E.'s overall federal funding amounts, but  
25

2 represent a shift and what programs the funding  
3 supports.

4 For existing funding categories within the  
5 D.O.E.'s budget impacted the shift include  
6 operational supports, academic recovery, students  
7 supports, curriculum support and IT supports. These  
8 changes are meant to fund the following chancellor  
9 and administration priorities: bilingual education  
10 expansion, digital learning, pathways expansion, safe  
11 supportive, schools, Summer Rising, contracted  
12 nurses, gifted and talented, literacy and dyslexia,  
13 translation and interpretation, and parent and family  
14 engagement. While the council look forward to  
15 hearing more about these necessary programs, and  
16 D.O.E.'s implementation plan, we must ensure that  
17 these programs offer focus, support to most of our  
18 vulnerable student populations. Additionally, we look  
19 forward to hearing how these new initiatives differ  
20 from enhancing existing D.O.E. programs. Lastly,  
21 while the executive budget shifts existing federal  
22 dollars to support several Chancellor's priorities  
23 and programs, we are disappointed that the Executive  
24 Budget failed to allocate funding for items called  
25 for in the Council's Response to the Preliminary

2 Budget. This includes funding for social, school  
3 based mental health staff, a citywide expansion of  
4 restorative justice, pay parity for special education  
5 pre-K providers, pay parity for daycare directors,  
6 increased arts and music, per pupil allotments, and  
7 hiring of Office of Foster Care staff. I look  
8 forward to your testimony on these issues.

9 Some housekeeping: The committee may not get all  
10 of the questions or you may not have responses, so  
11 we'll send follow up letters for unanswered  
12 questions. I will now turn to the Committee Counsel  
13 to Swain members of the Administration. Thank you.

14 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you chairs. Madam  
15 Speaker, did you want to say anything before we swear  
16 in the administration?

17 SPEAKER ADAMS: I will hold my questions for that  
18 time. Thank you.

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay, thank you. Okay, thank  
20 you, Chairs Brannan and Joseph, and Madam Speaker.  
21 Good morning, everyone, and welcome to the first  
22 agency hearing for May 10, The New York City  
23 Department of Education and the School Construction  
24 Authority. My name is Malcom Budehorn and I am  
25 Counsel to the Finance Committee.

2 I would first like to acknowledge council members  
3 present for the record. We are joined this morning  
4 by Council Members, Schulman, Brannan, Joseph,  
5 Farias, Narcisse, Dinowitz, Velázquez, Lee, Feliz,  
6 Brewer, Paladino, Gennaro, Hanif, Kagan, Louis, and  
7 Brooks-Powers.

8 Unlike in past council members and members of the  
9 mayoral administration will have the ability to mute  
10 and unmute themselves. When not speaking, we please  
11 ask that you remember to mute yourself. If people  
12 forget to do so and we hear background noise we will  
13 just go ahead and mute, you but remember, you will be  
14 able to unmute yourself in the future.

15 Council members who have questions should use the  
16 raise hand function in zoom. You will be called on  
17 in the order with which you raised your hand. And  
18 please remember that we have five minutes for the  
19 clock. We do have other agencies testifying today.  
20 So please listen for the cue from the Sergeant At  
21 Arms.

22 The following members of the administration are  
23 here to testify and/or answer your questions. David  
24 Banks, New York City Schools Chancellor, Nina Kubota,  
25 President and CEO New York City School Construction

2 Authority, Cora Liu, Vice President of Capital Plan  
3 Management, School Construction Authority, and from  
4 the Department of Education, Dan Weisberg, First  
5 Deputy Chancellor, Lindsey Oates Chief Financial  
6 Officer, Kevin Moran, Chief Schools Operations  
7 Officer, Carolyne Quintana, Deputy Chancellor  
8 Division of Teaching and Learning Opportunities,  
9 Camille Varlack, Senior Advisor, Jawana Johnson,  
10 Chief of School Culture, Climate and Wellbeing, Jade  
11 Grieve, Chief of Student Pathways, Thomas Taratko  
12 Chief Executive Officer, Office of Space Management,  
13 John Shea, Chief Executive Officer Division of School  
14 Facilities, Anuraag Sharma, Chief Information  
15 Officer, Rebecca Rawlins, Chief Executive Office of  
16 District Planning, Cristina Melendez, Executive  
17 Director of Family and Community Empowerment, and can  
18 Kenita Lloyd.

19 I will first read the oath and after I will call  
20 on each member from the administration individually  
21 to respond. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the  
22 whole truth and nothing but the truth before these  
23 committees and to respond honestly to council member  
24 questions? Chancellor Banks?

25 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yes.

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE

14

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: President Kubota?

3 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: I do.

4 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Vice President Liu?

5 VICE PRESIDENT LIU: I do.

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: First Deputy Chancellor

7 Weisberg?

8 FIRST DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: I do.

9 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CFO Oates?

10 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: I do.

11 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chief Schools Operations

12 Officer Moran?

13 CHIEF OPERATIONS OFFICER MORAN: I do.

14 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Chancellor Quintana?

15 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: I do.

16 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Senior Advisor Varlack?

17 SENIOR ADVISOR VARLACK: I do.

18 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chief Johnson?

19 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Not here at the moment.

20 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay. Chief Grieve?

21 CHIEF GRIEVE: I do.

22 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CEO Taratko?

23 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TARATKO: I do.

24 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CEO Shea?

25 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER SHEA: I do.

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CIO Sharma?

3 CHIEF INFORMATION OFFICER SHARMA: I do.

4 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CEO Rollins?

5 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER ROLLINS: I do.

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Chancellor Lloyd? I  
7 saw you on the Zoom. Okay, we tried.

8 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: She did respond.

9 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: We'll try it one more time.  
10 Okay.

11 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Can you see her now?

12 (background voices).

13 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Well, if you do answer any  
14 questions, just say "Yes, you do", before you speak.

15 Chancellor Banks, you can begin when ready.

16 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you. And first of all I  
17 wanted to say Good morning to Madam Speaker, Adrienne  
18 Adams. I didn't realize he would be here with us  
19 this morning. Always good to see you. And good  
20 morning Chair Brannan, Chair Joseph, and all the  
21 members of the Finance and Education Committees.

22 We're here today. I'm pleased to join you all,  
23 along with several members of my team. I think you've  
24 pretty much mentioned all of our senior leadership  
25 and the key members of our team who are joining us

2 here today. We work together as a team. And in the  
3 course of this conversation today, many of them I  
4 will call on to help support me in answering any of  
5 the questions that you have. But thank you for the  
6 opportunity to testify about the mayor's Executive  
7 Budget for New York City public schools.

8 Before I begin, I would like to express my  
9 deepest thanks to this council for your partnership,  
10 advocacy and insight. Your dedication to our city's  
11 children is truly inspiring. And as I've said  
12 before, we're committed to working with you all hand  
13 in hand as partners, real partners, and improving the  
14 educational experience for all of our students. The  
15 council has been instrumental in securing funding  
16 through the American Rescue Plan act, that is helping  
17 our school communities to rebound from all the  
18 disruptions caused by this terrible pandemic. We've  
19 expanded P.S.A.L. so that students across the system  
20 have access to sports teams, and we're in the process  
21 of hiring dedicated staff for the first time ever to  
22 the office was a students in foster care. We're very  
23 excited about that.

24 The Council's partnership has also helped to  
25 provide the resources needed to ensure that every

2 school from every zip code receives funding to hire a  
3 full-time social worker. And with direct funding  
4 from The Council, we're also expanding language  
5 access, mental health services, community schools,  
6 and community access to school playgrounds. These  
7 are a lot of vital successes that we have  
8 accomplished really working together. Since I was  
9 last here with you almost two months ago, I've  
10 continued to visit schools across all five boroughs.  
11 And I've been so impressed at how our students are  
12 bouncing back academically and socially through the  
13 hands-on support and dedication of our educators.

14 Returning to face to face learning has restored a  
15 sense of normalcy in our classrooms, which you can  
16 see in the joy expressed in the faces of our  
17 students. You can really feel the sense of excitement  
18 and energy as you walk through our buildings. I  
19 visited over 40 schools in the four months that I've  
20 been in office, and it has really been just very  
21 inspiring to see our young people as they are back in  
22 the routine of being back in schools.

23 So one powerful indicator of that renewed  
24 enthusiasm is the overwhelming response to this  
25 year's Summer Rising program. Summer Rising will be

2 jointly administered by the DOE and DYCD, connecting  
3 110,000 elementary and middle school students to fun,  
4 culturally relevant hands-on experiences to  
5 strengthen their academic, social and emotional  
6 skills. This is a real opportunity for students to  
7 sustain the joy of learning after the regular school  
8 year ends with rigorous academic programming while  
9 also experiencing all that our city has to offer  
10 beyond the classroom walls. We're prioritizing  
11 students in temporary housing and students with 12  
12 month IEPs to ensure equitable access to this  
13 program, and we're really thrilled by the immense  
14 response. To date, we have almost 90,000 of our  
15 youngsters that have registered with their families.

16 We also recently announced the expansion of our  
17 Gifted and Talented Program is an important step that  
18 as a result of listening to what our parents wanted.  
19 We added 100 kindergarten seats and 1,000 third grade  
20 seats, expanding both entry points to all districts.  
21 And through this expansion, and updates to the  
22 admissions process, the city's Gifted and Talented  
23 program will serve every school district citywide for  
24 the first time, providing more opportunities for  
25 accelerated learning to even more families. At the

2 same time, we'll be implementing a much more  
3 equitable process than in the past to identify  
4 students who will most benefit from this accelerated  
5 learning opportunity. These expansions of Summer  
6 Rising and G&T are products of community engagement  
7 that we organize with families across the city.  
8 We've been listening. Our commitment to real  
9 community partnership doesn't begin and end with  
10 Gifted And Talented. We're going to bring the same  
11 level of deep real parent engagement to improving the  
12 quality of education of every school in every  
13 neighborhood. As I've said before, engagement is not  
14 a slogan for me. It is in my DNA, and it's something  
15 that we take seriously, day in and day out.

16 So let me turn now to the details of the mayor's  
17 Executive Budget. The Department of Education 2023  
18 budget totals \$37.6 billion, which includes \$31  
19 billion in operating expenses. Our funding is a  
20 combination of city state and federal resources, with  
21 city tax levy money making up the largest share at  
22 54%, state funds at 36%, and federal dollars at 10%.  
23 To 2023 Executive Budget reflects a real reallocation  
24 of a portion of the federal Coronavirus aid provided  
25 through the Coronavirus Response and Relief

2 Supplemental Appropriations Act and the American  
3 Rescue Plan aligned with the priorities of the Adams  
4 administration. We plan to spend over \$3 billion of  
5 stimulus dollars in fiscal year 2022, and we're  
6 working with OMB to ensure the adopted budget  
7 reflects our final spending projections. \$2 billion  
8 of this funding has already been spent, including  
9 \$500 million in the last two months alone. We expect  
10 spending to continue apace this year, including  
11 significant payments for goods and services received  
12 in FY 2022 but not invoiced or paid until the summer.

13 I want to reassure the council and the public  
14 that federal funding is available over the next  
15 several years. Anything not spent this year as a  
16 result of pandemic-related supply chain and staffing  
17 challenges, is available to support our work next  
18 year. The investments in this budget reflect an  
19 advanced vision for the Department of Education that  
20 you have previously heard me put forward. I believe  
21 that for our schools to deliver on the original  
22 promise of serving as the engine of the American  
23 dream, we need to do things very differently in ways  
24 that build trust among our families and school  
25 communities one big step at a time.

2 Our schools need to connect with our students to  
3 the real world and what matters to them. I want to  
4 say that again: Our schools need to connect our  
5 students to the real world, and what matters to them.  
6 Preparing each and every one of our students to  
7 graduate with a pathway to a rewarding career, long  
8 term economic security, and equipped to be a positive  
9 force for change.

10 Together with Mayor Adams, our vision for our  
11 schools is built on four pillars that this budget  
12 makes real investments in. Number one, the first  
13 pillar is reimagining the student experience, which  
14 means redesigning what happens in our schools to be  
15 relevant and exciting to our students, while  
16 providing them with the skills and knowledge that are  
17 attractive ultimately to employers. This starts with  
18 our \$33 million investment in Pathways Expansion to  
19 improve economic mobility and security for all New  
20 York City public school students. There'll be more to  
21 come on that in the coming days. Our pathways  
22 expansion efforts will build on the effective  
23 programs we already have in place, such as the Thomas  
24 Edison CTE High School in Queens, which provides

2 training in fields like engineering and medicine to  
3 prepare students for life after high school.

4 Another way that our budget is reimagining the  
5 student experience is better supporting students with  
6 print based disabilities, including dyslexia. And  
7 there'll be more to come on that in the coming days  
8 as well.

9 Finally, and acknowledging the importance of 21st  
10 century learning, and building on what we learned  
11 during the pandemic we will enhance digital  
12 experiences across the system. That effort will also  
13 increase access to in-demand coursework, while  
14 further supporting students who face challenges in  
15 attending school in person. We've been listening to  
16 our parents and our families.

17 Number two, the second pillar, which we call  
18 scaling, sustaining, and restoring what works. And  
19 that entails identifying amazing practices throughout  
20 our system, and sharing them so that they become  
21 models that other schools can emulate.

22 In addition to our expanded Summer Rising and  
23 gifted and talented programs, we're enhancing  
24 bilingual education. Bilingual Education is the  
25 favorite program model for supporting the long term

2 success of English language learners that we hold to  
3 the same high expectations as all of our other  
4 students. Our plan includes strengthening and  
5 sustaining the quality of existing bilingual  
6 education programs, opening or growing 50 bilingual  
7 education programs in 2023. Supporting district wide  
8 planning to ensure a pathway to multilingualism for  
9 every student. And in order to accomplish this,  
10 we'll be investing in purchasing and developing  
11 curriculum and materials in students home languages,  
12 recruiting, training and staffing high quality  
13 certified bilingual teacher candidates, empowering  
14 families of multilingual learners, with resources to  
15 enable them to make informed decisions about  
16 bilingual education to increase awareness of  
17 bilingual program options and benefits, and also  
18 ongoing professional learning, program design and  
19 implementation support for school leaders and staff.

20 We have so many amazing practices throughout our  
21 system to hold up and share so they can be more  
22 broadly emulated. For example, Mark Erlenwein. He's  
23 the principal of Staten Island Technical High School.  
24 Just last week, he was honored as the New York State  
25 Secondary School Principal of the Year, in part for

2 encouraging students to have opportunities to redo  
3 some of their learning, versus relentlessly being  
4 pushed forward and wondering how to catch up. It's  
5 called Mastery Learning, and it's something that we  
6 want to study and have him share with schools all  
7 across the city. That approach of creating second  
8 and third chances cultivates perseverance and deeper  
9 learning. And another example is the Brooklyn  
10 Occupational Training Center, a district 75 school,  
11 which has continually innovated to engage students  
12 with wide ranging learning needs in a quality civics  
13 education. The teacher Matt Gorun[sp?], he has  
14 adapted participatory budgeting resources to engage  
15 students through big circle mapping, which allows  
16 verbal and nonverbal students to graphically  
17 represent their ideas and engage in discussion,  
18 debate, and to show support for each other.

19       So just want to tell you good things are  
20 happening in our schools. And we want to use  
21 technology to capture these practices in a way that  
22 makes sense for school principals to help better  
23 share best practices, and enable schools to  
24 collaborate, we're planning to create an app that  
25 school leaders and teachers can easily access from

2 their phone or desktop. We will ensure that  
3 principals are able to give feedback and partner with  
4 us before any future rollout of this technology.

5 The third pillar is prioritizing wellness.  
6 Because students who feel healthy, safe, well-  
7 nourished, and intellectually stimulated, are best  
8 able to concentrate and engage with their academic  
9 work. Safety has been at the forefront for too many  
10 of our students. So to that end, under this budget,  
11 our schools will contract with community based  
12 organizations that specialize in violence  
13 interruption programming, which empowers and equips  
14 young people with the tools that they need to make  
15 positive choices for themselves, and to uplift pro  
16 social development pathways as an alternative to  
17 violence. These strategies include social and  
18 emotional support for students, violence interruption  
19 techniques, like de-escalation, mediation, conflict  
20 resolution, and extended learning opportunities to  
21 ensure that students feel safe, supported and  
22 empowered in their school communities. And given  
23 that the pandemic is by no means over, we are also  
24 going to continue to strive to ensure that all of our  
25 schools continue to have nurse coverage in 2023.

2 And finally, without respect to our fourth  
3 pillar, engaging families to be our true partners.  
4 One of our top budget priorities for this year is to  
5 enhance our Family and Community Engagement Office by  
6 hiring community coordinators from underrepresented  
7 groups. We want to make sure that we're reaching  
8 families that we have rarely heard from in the past,  
9 and elevate their voices. Since approximately 40% of  
10 New York City Public Schools families speak a  
11 language other than English at home, we are also  
12 investing in improving response time for families  
13 requesting translation and interpretation services.  
14 We also know how important it is for students to see  
15 themselves in our curriculum. We've been hard at  
16 work building a more inclusive curriculum, and there  
17 will be more to come very soon when highlighting our  
18 AAPI curriculum work. Once details are finalized,  
19 we'll welcome the City Council to Tweet to share in  
20 that announcement, one of the work ahead.

21 Many of these investments are not only D.O.E.  
22 priorities, but outgrowth of conversations and  
23 collaborations with all of you as the City Council,  
24 as well as other stakeholders. We are acting on our  
25 promise to not only engage with this Council, but

2 directly incorporate your feedback and hoping to  
3 shape our budgetary and policy decisions. That is the  
4 true partnership that we will continue to nurture.

5 In conclusion, these investments will build on  
6 the progress that we have begun to make in rebuilding  
7 the trust of our families, and further excite them  
8 about sending their children to our schools. Be  
9 clear, we have lost 120,000 students over the last  
10 five years, and we have to do everything we can to  
11 give our families a reason to stay in our public  
12 schools.

13 So again, I want to underscore that we deeply  
14 appreciate the vital role that the council plays in  
15 working with the mayor, OMB, DOE and the various  
16 stakeholders in shaping this final budget. Together,  
17 we're creating a budget that advances the needs and  
18 priorities of our students and families. So I want to  
19 thank you. We're here to answer any of your  
20 questions.

21 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: We're also now turning to our  
22 opening statement from SCA President CEO Nina Kubota.

23 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you. Thank you very  
24 much. Good morning Speaker Adams, Chairs Brannan and  
25 Joseph, and members of the Finance and Education

2 Committees. My name is Nina Kubota, and I am the  
3 President and CEO of the New York City School  
4 Construction Authority. In addition to our  
5 colleagues at the DOD, I'm joined by Cora Liu, Vice  
6 President of Capital Plan Management for the SBA.

7 We are pleased to be here today to discuss the  
8 February 2022 proposed amendment to the current FY  
9 2020 to 2024 five-year capital plan. We thank the  
10 Council for their openness and have enjoyed the  
11 dialogue we have been able to share since the  
12 beginning of January. The council's participation  
13 and partnership has always been critical to the  
14 success of our projects and our schools, and we look  
15 forward to building upon our strong spirit of  
16 collaboration.

17 When I was last before you in March, we  
18 highlighted how the SCA operates on a fixed five-year  
19 capital plan with yearly amendments as set forth in  
20 our enabling legislation, and talk through what makes  
21 up the overall structure and implementation of our  
22 plan. The February 2022 proposed amendment to the  
23 fiscal year 2020 to 2024 plan totals \$20.6 billion  
24 and is the largest capital plan in our history.

2 The funding breaks down as follows: The capacity  
3 program, totaling \$9.84 billion, the capital  
4 investment category, with \$7.26 billion and finally  
5 our mandated program at \$3.51 billion. Since we last  
6 spoke, I'm happy to report that our proposed February  
7 amendment was approved by the Panel for Educational  
8 Policy on April 27, and will be part of the city's  
9 budget that this council reviews and adopts by June  
10 30. We continue to work day in and day out to  
11 fulfill the city's commitment of adding 60,000 seats.  
12 Through the new capacity program, we are on our way  
13 to identifying locations for all new seats funded in  
14 this plan. Since February, we have sited in  
15 additional four projects, with over 1500 seats. Of  
16 the 45,883 seats to be constructed through the new  
17 capacity program, there are 25,525 seats already in  
18 progress and another roughly 5400 currently in the  
19 pipeline. That means we are two thirds of the way  
20 toward identifying these needed seats.

21 Additionally, we continue to make substantial  
22 progress in the creation of seats through our other  
23 capacity programs. We have four projects that are in  
24 process as part of the replacement program. A PSIS  
25 is located at 3761 10th Avenue in Manhattan, PS163 in

2 the Bronx, PS47 in Queens and a D75. School located  
3 at Willowbrook Avenue in Staten Island.

4 Through the class size reduction program, there  
5 are two currently two projects underway, one at  
6 Medgar Evers in Brooklyn, and another at the Harbor  
7 School located on Governors Island that will receive  
8 additional seats to alleviate overcrowding in the  
9 schools that otherwise would not have seen this  
10 investment, as they are located in an area without  
11 funded new capacity program C need. Through the class  
12 size reduction program, we are able to provide relief  
13 to these schools.

14 While the addition project at PS 96 and Queens  
15 was the first project to be funded from newly created  
16 a program to add capacity to support the removal of  
17 TCUs, it certainly won't be the last. We have  
18 several more that we are developing plans for and are  
19 looking forward to sharing them with The Council and  
20 the public as soon as we can. Due to the decline in  
21 enrollment and birth rate, we were able to shift  
22 funding that was previously dedicated for the new  
23 capacity program to other capacity programs I  
24 highlighted: Class size reduction, replacement, and  
25 capacity to support the removal of TCUs. Through

2 these expanded programs, as a result of the shift in  
3 funding, we will create about 14,000 seats bringing  
4 our total number of seats created to approximately  
5 60,000. Last year, we received over \$800 million to  
6 support the Early Education Initiatives which sought  
7 to expand 3K citywide as well as upgrade certain  
8 Early Learning Centers as part of the ACS transfer of  
9 a number of sites into the DOE portfolio. This  
10 September, we are scheduled to open over 2900 3K  
11 seats at 23 sites across all five boroughs.

12 While creating seats is a vital part of what we  
13 do. We cannot forget that 200 of our buildings are  
14 over 100 years old, and the majority of our buildings  
15 are over 50 years old. The plan directs a total of  
16 \$7.26 billion for capital investments. The capital  
17 investment portion of the plan includes two main  
18 categories \$3.27 for the capital improvement program,  
19 which includes building upgrades and necessary  
20 capital repairs, such as roof and facade work,  
21 structural repairs, and safeguarding our buildings  
22 against water infiltration, and \$2.81 billion for  
23 school enhancement projects, which funds the  
24 realignment of existing facilities to better suit  
25 instructional needs, along with bathroom upgrades,

2 science labs, accessibility, and other necessary  
3 improvements. Every year, we make progress on  
4 removing TCUs. This plan dedicates \$352 million for  
5 the ongoing removal of these units, with dedicated  
6 capacity funding allocated to construct the needed  
7 seats to allow for the removal of the TCUs. As of the  
8 February amendment, we removed 266 of the original  
9 354, and developed plans to remove an additional 45  
10 units. Since February, we have identified the path  
11 for the removal of 10 more TCUs at three sites, now  
12 leaving us with a total of 33 TCUs located at 11  
13 sites.

14 The mandated program category with \$3.51 billion  
15 allocated includes approximately \$650 million for  
16 boiler conversions in buildings currently using  
17 number four oil. The remaining funds are assigned to  
18 cover other required costs such as code and local law  
19 compliance, the SCAs wrap-up insurance, and  
20 completion of projects from the prior plan. Many  
21 factors contribute to the successes we have  
22 experienced in implementing our capital plans, but  
23 one of our strongest core values is our commitment to  
24 our MWBE contractors. The SCA is continually  
25 developing a larger and more diverse group of

2 contractors who can bid on our work and complete  
3 large and complicated projects.

4 We have been incredibly successful in increasing  
5 the participation of minority owned businesses. In  
6 this plan so far, the SCA has obligated over \$955  
7 million in prime contractor obligations, and \$884  
8 million in subcontractor awards to MWBE firms. Our  
9 mentor program seeks to cultivate smaller MWBE firms  
10 by providing them with the skills and experience  
11 needed to develop and grow within the construction  
12 industry, and to establish long-term business  
13 relationships with the SCA. We currently have 150  
14 firms in our mentor program, and roughly 85% of those  
15 firms have won contracts. We intend to award over  
16 \$100 million in our mentor program to small  
17 contractors by the end of the fiscal year. We are  
18 incredibly proud of our accomplishments. We continue  
19 to identify more ways to build on these successes.

20 As a way to further support and develop our  
21 mentor firms, our maximum contract value that they  
22 will be able to bid on will increase to \$3 million in  
23 July. Once again, I can't overstate the importance  
24 of the partnership between the City Council, the SCA,  
25 and the DOE. Our collaborative relationship is vital

2 to the successful implementation of our capital plan  
3 that directly provides the state-of-the-art  
4 educational facilities that our students need to  
5 succeed. I thank you for allowing me to testify  
6 before you today. And I along with my colleagues at  
7 the Department of Education will be happy to answer  
8 any questions you may have. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you so much.  
10 President Kubota and Chancellor Banks. Before we get  
11 into questions from the committee, I want to hand it  
12 over to Speaker Adams.

13 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much, Chair  
14 Brannan and good morning. Thank you Chair Joseph.  
15 Good morning to Chancellor Banks. Good to see you  
16 always. Good morning, President Kubota. Very glad  
17 to see you as well. And all of the teams and  
18 representatives of DOE and SCA. Good morning to all  
19 of you and to my colleagues as well.

20 I know that my colleagues have a lot of questions  
21 for you this morning. Mine have to do with something  
22 very, very specific and a concern dealing with  
23 community schools right now.

24 In 2021, the Coalition for Community Schools  
25 excellence advocated for the Office of Community

2 Schools within the DOE to revise the community school  
3 funding model in a way that would ensure equity on  
4 the average community school allocations. In June  
5 2021, the D.O.E. released a new community school RFP  
6 and CBOs were notified about their new contract  
7 rates. The funding formula was adjusted from the  
8 prior solicitation in a way that increased the  
9 amounts for smaller schools that were in need of  
10 considerable support. However, the formula also  
11 decreased the awarded amounts to larger schools and  
12 campuses that were in need of support. In total 52  
13 Community Schools were impacted by the shifting to  
14 funding in the RFP, including Richmond Hill High  
15 School in my district, which received \$400,000 less  
16 in this RFP. This school is vital to my community,  
17 and just because it's a largest school, it shouldn't  
18 be subjected to a formula that arbitrarily impacts  
19 their ability to deliver services to its students.  
20 To the Council, the importance of continuing to fund  
21 larger community schools was clear. We negotiated a  
22 \$9.16 million one-year restoration in fiscal 2022 to  
23 bring 52 Community Schools back to their pre RFP  
24 contract levels. Sadly, however, the Administration  
25 did not baseline this funding for the upcoming fiscal

2 year. So my question... my first question is: How  
3 was the formula to fund Community Schools determined?  
4 And why didn't the D.O.E. advocate for more funding  
5 for the RFP that allowed smaller schools to receive  
6 their resources, while not impacting larger schools  
7 and their historical funding?

8 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Uh, I appreciate the...  
9 appreciate the question, Madam Speaker. I'm going to  
10 have... CFO Lindsay, you want to... you want to take  
11 a stab at that, please?

12 Lindsay?

13 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Thank you, can you  
14 hear me?

15 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yes.

16 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Great. So thank  
17 you, Speaker Adams for the question. We have been...  
18 last year (audio fades out)

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Actually, Lindsay, you're  
20 we've you started out strong. And that totally faded  
21 out?

22 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Oh. Can you hear  
23 me now?

24 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: That's better.

2 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Yes. Okay. Thank  
3 you. Thank you, Chair Brannan. So thank you, again,  
4 Council, for the increased resources that we received  
5 this fiscal year in order to provide additional  
6 supports to the Community Schools Program. As we  
7 committed to at the time, that was meant to increase  
8 values to schools as part... that were awarded as  
9 part of the repeat of the system in fiscal year 21,  
10 and fiscal year 22. And we appreciate the interest  
11 in this program. And we were happy to have the  
12 resources available this year. I think we're  
13 continuing to look at the right sizing of the school  
14 budgets... or excuse me, the community school budgets  
15 going forward, and want to make sure, I think most  
16 importantly, that community schools across the system  
17 receive equitable funding. And that's what the  
18 original Community Schools RFP funding model was  
19 meant to support. And I can let Dr. Johnson speak to  
20 the future of the program.

21 CHIEF JOHNSON: Good morning. Thank you. Thank  
22 you again, Chair, for the question.

23 So where we are right now is we are actually  
24 looking to expand with the Community Schools  
25 initiative to increase an additional 40 schools to

2 really bring the number to well over 400. One of the  
3 things that we know is that historically, schools  
4 have used... we've utilized various funding sources  
5 in order to be able to fund community schools. And  
6 prior to the equitable funding formula, we had  
7 community schools that ranged from an annual budget  
8 of \$83,000, to schools that had budgets that were  
9 well over \$900,000. And so the equitable formula was  
10 seeking to really ensure that we were able to provide  
11 greater resources and greater support for those  
12 schools that really were underserved. As we think  
13 about that, the adjustment, there were 90... there  
14 were well over 90 schools that were also able to  
15 really get to closer to sustainable funding. There  
16 was a RAND report that was released that really  
17 advocated for the effectiveness of community schools  
18 with a greater amount of resources. And so we were  
19 incredibly thankful for the Council for being able to  
20 be able to provide the restoration funding last year  
21 to really enable the schools that received an  
22 adjustment to be able to transition into the new  
23 formula. And so we look forward to continuing to work  
24 in partnership with the Council to really figure out  
25 ways to explore the best... best allocation and then

2 the best source of resources to support community  
3 schools to ensure that we are best able to meet the  
4 needs of our students and families within these  
5 communities. Thank you.

6 SPEAKER ADAMS: I appreciate the response. But  
7 still getting to the core of my question, how did the  
8 DOE envision the larger schools to serve students  
9 with less resources, and did the do we provide any  
10 guidance on what programs and services could be  
11 reduced for the schools receiving less funding under  
12 the new RFP?

13 CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you chair. So in the  
14 original in the original allocation, schools received  
15 the prior... the prior budget. And so when they got  
16 the prior budget, they... they realized that there  
17 would be a shortfall. So restoration funding was  
18 really offered as a transitional source of funding to  
19 allow for CBO partners to really think about how can  
20 we reconfigure, and how could we reimagine what the  
21 programming would look like with a different set of  
22 resources? So the guidance was... initially when the  
23 funding was... was adjusted, here was what your new  
24 funding formula will be. And we understood that the  
25 timing for that was not ideal. And so the restoration

2 funding the city council was able to provide enabled  
3 CBOs to think about in this year, how do we adjust  
4 and transition for... transition our funding formula?  
5 How do we transition our services to really be able  
6 to move more strategically? I will also say that by  
7 doing so... by making this adjustment, we were again,  
8 able to fund additional... additional schools to  
9 provide them with additional resources. We are also  
10 able to engage in the expansion to increase the  
11 number of access to more students and more families,

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: we're actually going to lose a  
13 lot of services, and we're actually going to take  
14 away a lot of vital services in our schools by  
15 decreasing this funding. It's going to have a  
16 tremendous impact not just on a school in my district  
17 that I know of, but I'm sure in schools across the  
18 city. So it has the D.O.E. considered amending the  
19 RFP awards in FY 2023 with an additional \$9.2 million  
20 so that schools are able to remain whole for another  
21 year? And actually have the opportunity to further  
22 plan on how to provide services at a lower contract  
23 value beginning in FY 2024?

24 CHIEF JOHNSON: Thanks again for the question. At  
25 this point, we are exploring all different types of

2 financial resources and look forward to working  
3 closely with the with the Council to figure out if  
4 there are any additional options that we can explore.

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: I think that my suggestion is a  
6 good one. Again, a lot of students are going to be  
7 impacted by a tremendous shortfall. For one school  
8 alone, we're talking almost a half million dollars,  
9 and it will dramatically affect students and their  
10 care in our schools across the city. So I'm going to  
11 let my colleagues get in. I don't want to belabor  
12 that. But it is extremely important that we consider  
13 options for this.

14 CHANCELLOR BANKS: And I'm glad that you raise it  
15 Madam... Madam Chair. So is duly noted. And we will  
16 we will follow up on this right away.

17 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much, Chancellor.  
18 Thank you, chairs.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Speaker. Before  
20 we get into further questions, I... I know it's going  
21 to be a long day. The committee may not get to all  
22 the questions, or D.O.E. may not have sufficient  
23 responses, although we hope that's not the case. But  
24 we will follow we will follow up with a letter for  
25 any of the unanswered questions that we'd like to get

2 back ASAP so it'll help in our in our budget  
3 negotiation.

4 Okay, I'm gonna get moving right into the unspent  
5 federal funding and the ARPA deadline. So the  
6 D.O.E.'s fiscal 22 budget includes \$2.57 billion in  
7 federal stimulus funding for short-term recovery  
8 efforts, such as academic recovery and operational  
9 supports. Additionally, the budget recognizes \$528  
10 million in federal stimulus funded long term  
11 expansions. Has D.O.E. spent all of this funding in  
12 FY 22, and if not, how much of this funding remains  
13 unspent and for what programs and supports?

14 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Lindsay

15 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: (inaudible)

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Lindsay, we can't hear you.

17 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Can you hear me  
18 better now?

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Not really.

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: It sounds like on your  
21 microphone or something.

22 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Can you hear me  
23 better now?

24 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: It sounds like you're deep in  
25 a tunnel.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: It's not changing.

3 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: It could be your headphones.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Go ahead. Just...

5 Just talk.

6 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Can you hear me?

7 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Yes, we can clearly.

8 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: So thank you,  
9 Chair Brannan, for the question we have... I really  
10 appreciate the opportunity to talk through this  
11 issue. So as we all know, we're super grateful for  
12 the additional funding that we've received from the  
13 federal government. And we have been funding this  
14 funding throughout the school year, we're going to  
15 continue to spend this through the rest of this  
16 fiscal year. And we have several months left in the  
17 fiscal year to continue the spending. And I think  
18 that there have been some numbers that the  
19 comptroller's office has shared recently about our  
20 stimulus spending. And I think it's important to  
21 reflect on... that of our, you know, over \$3 billion  
22 that we have in fiscal year 23, err on the side of  
23 funding. And again, there are reasons why there have  
24 been a slow, slow starts to the spending of that  
25 funding. We've had some staffing challenges, we've

2 had some programs that started later, and this  
3 administration has really taken a close look at the  
4 stimulus plan that were in place, and have wanted to  
5 make sure that the spending aligns with their  
6 priorities. A lot of these things have been issues  
7 that have been reported nationally in other school  
8 districts and the challenges that are facing similar  
9 things, not the least of which is the worldwide  
10 supply chain issues. And the way that that plays out  
11 in actual spending is that items are delayed in  
12 delivering, as many of us have experienced in our  
13 personal lives. So you may have bought a piece of  
14 equipment or furniture for your school in October, it  
15 may not yet have been delivered. We can't actually  
16 pay the bill until the item has been delivered, which  
17 means that spending is delayed because of the delays  
18 in delivery on a lot of those items. So that's why  
19 some of the trends may seem like they're low. Right  
20 now, we've spent about 60% of our stimulus budget.  
21 And like I said, we're continuing to spend every day.  
22 We've spent an additional \$500 million since the  
23 controller's office issued their report with their  
24 snapshot data. The good thing is, is that at the end  
25 of this fiscal year, if there is underspending, we

2 don't lose that money. That funding is available to  
3 us. And we'll work with OMB to move that funding  
4 from fiscal year 22 to fiscal year 23, just like we  
5 would with any other federal grants or any other  
6 grants that span multiple years. So that funding,  
7 would we determine if there is any underspending and  
8 what that value is? We'll get moved from fiscal year  
9 22 To 23 to support other programs.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. I appreciate that. I  
11 mean, obviously, the reason why I'm asking is because  
12 the council has... has plenty of suggestions for how  
13 to spend that money. So can the D.O.E. rollover some  
14 of these unspent funds into fiscal 23 to support some  
15 of the priorities that we outlined in our preliminary  
16 budget response?

17 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Absolutely, we can. And we'd  
18 certainly love to hear, you know, some of the  
19 suggestions from the Council as well. We always... we  
20 welcome that. As we said, we're looking to be real  
21 partners with you, but it absolutely can be rolled  
22 over, so that sense of urgency is not there. We...  
23 we don't intend to leave a funds unspent. That is not  
24 what we're doing. It's just a delay in the process as  
25 our CFO just explained.

2  
3 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. So something  
4 that's... that's near, dear, and personal to me is  
5 arts and music instruction in our public schools.  
6 Can the DOE use any of the unspent stimulus funds to  
7 support a minimum allocation of \$100 per student for  
8 core arts instruction programming?

9 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Can you hear me.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yup, for now.

11 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Okay. Sorry for  
12 the technical difficulties, I apologize. You would  
13 think after two and a half years of doing this, we  
14 would have it down. So in terms of arts funding,  
15 we're happy to review your proposal that was in your  
16 pulmonary budget response in more detail. In the  
17 meantime, what we have done with stimulus funding, is  
18 we have prioritized arts in the stimulus plan. The  
19 academic recovery allocations that went directly to  
20 schools, which was a \$350 million allocation requires  
21 25% of that funding is spent directly on arts  
22 enrichment programming. And we've also have been  
23 working strategically with our office of supplier  
24 diversity to make sure that schools know what \_\_\_\_\_  
25 programs are available in that space to make sure

2 that they can utilize that funding on their new E  
3 vendors, in addition to other vendors. And so those  
4 are things that we've been doing. In addition, you  
5 have us stimulus score of \$15 million reduction into  
6 the arts budget, which has been critical to getting  
7 post pandemic, or during pandemic arts programs back  
8 in schools, and we will continue to review  
9 opportunities going forward.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, we're pushing for the  
11 minimum allocation of \$100 per student because I know  
12 coming from a family of teachers, if they're given  
13 money, they're going to spend it on what they think  
14 is most important. If it's earmarked specifically  
15 for arts and music than it has to be used for arts  
16 and music, which is why we're... we're serious about  
17 that. So the ARPA in particular must be obligated by  
18 December 31 of 24. So how much in ARPA funding has  
19 been... has the D.O.E. allocated so far?

20 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Give me one  
21 second while I get that number. So our ARPA  
22 allocation has... we've allocated about a billion  
23 dollars, I believe, of the ARPA funding.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: You said one 1 billion with  
3 a B.

4 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Yes, sir.

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. And how much of the  
6 ARPA funds have been spent and how much is allocated  
7 in FY 23 in the out years?

8 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: The final, so...  
9 Well, in the out years, we're continuing to finalize  
10 how the budget will sort of work itself out. The  
11 SRSA funding source, which is the earlier stimulus  
12 allocation from the federal government that you may  
13 be familiar with actually expires before the ARPA  
14 funding. And so we've been strategically trying to  
15 ensure that we are using the SRSA allocations first,  
16 because they expire at the end of fiscal year 23. And  
17 so, as we are strategically aligning those funds,  
18 we're prioritizing those first because ARPA will last  
19 a little bit longer.

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, you... you mentioned  
21 a percentage before you said 60% had been spent, what  
22 is... of what? What funding is that?

23 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Thanks for asking  
24 me to clarify. 60% of the fiscal year 22, total SRSA

2 and ARPA allocations. So the federal education  
3 stimulus allocations.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Okay, I want to I  
5 want to move quickly but efficiently here.

6 So mid-year adjustment and enrollment change. So  
7 I'm interested to know what guidance D.O.E. has given  
8 schools regarding budget cuts. The FY 21 prelim  
9 budget identified a savings associated with  
10 enrollment decline totaling \$375 million in FY 23,  
11 and in the out years, offset by \$160 million in  
12 federal stimulus funding. So what guidance is D.O.E.  
13 given schools regarding right-sizing budgets in terms  
14 of cutting vacancies or personnel, or what programs  
15 or categories of funding might be exempt from a  
16 budget cut?

17 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: So thank you,  
18 sir, for the question. We announced this plan with  
19 the Mayor in the middle of February, as you know, in  
20 the Preliminary Budget, and that's actually the  
21 earliest we've been able to announce to schools that  
22 we have information around their next year's budgets  
23 in terms of the whole timelines. And so as we move  
24 towards what we call our initial school budget  
25 allocations, which we are hopefully will come out in

2 the next few weeks, we will be providing additional  
3 information to schools around how to support... how  
4 they can be supported through their... these  
5 enrollment related reductions. And again, we're  
6 really grateful to have the federal stimulus funding  
7 to offset and give schools the time to right-size  
8 their operations to support the students that they  
9 have in their buildings now, and we'll share more  
10 information with schools as we usually do in the next  
11 couple of weeks around hiring and what the details of  
12 their budget are.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Generally, and this  
14 is somewhat related... Generally speaking, what...  
15 what are what are we doing to reduce classroom size?

16 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yes, thank you. I'm sorry. I'm  
17 trying to go on mute... off mute... coming back and  
18 forth.

19 We've been spending a lot of time talking about  
20 that. We've been having a number of meetings with  
21 the UFT, Michael Mulgrew, having these conversations.  
22 Our First Deputy has been kind of leading the charge  
23 here, Dan Weisberg. Dan, do you want to speak to  
24 that?

2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Yeah, thanks very  
3 much, Chancellor. Thank you, Mr. Chairman. The first  
4 thing I'm... we're doing a number of things. I would  
5 say, Chair, that on the capital side, President  
6 Kubota could can talk about... or she's already  
7 mentioned in her opening remarks, but certainly can  
8 speak more specifically about the additional  
9 classrooms that we're building. There's basically two  
10 things you can do to lower class size. One is build  
11 more classrooms. The other is hire more teachers.  
12 We're doing both. On the human capital side, we...  
13 we have seen class size reduced this past year by  
14 over 6%. That's not happenstance. So the... the  
15 ability through... through you and a lot of people on  
16 this... this hearing to advocate for 100% funding of  
17 the fair student funding formula has had a huge  
18 impact. That has translated into, you know, the...  
19 that's hundreds of millions of dollars going directly  
20 out to schools, most of which -- and Lizzy will check  
21 me on this -- most of which is going to hire  
22 additional teachers. And so what we've seen over the  
23 last five years is, even though as the Chancellor  
24 pointed out in his opening remarks, we have 120,000,  
25 fewer students, we actually have more teachers during

2 that time. And a lot of that is due to fully funding  
3 the Fair Student Funding Formula. So we have also  
4 gotten direct help from the Council, which we are  
5 very grateful for, to allow us to further reduce  
6 class size, and we are seeing this happen across the  
7 city with lower class sizes. And that doesn't mean  
8 that we don't still have some classes, that should be  
9 smaller. And we're going to continue to work on this  
10 as the Chancellor said, with UFT and our labor  
11 partners and others, but we are making significant  
12 progress, both because we're building more classrooms  
13 in places where they need it, and because we are  
14 hiring and retaining more teachers.

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I appreciate that.  
16 What's... the Council... obviously, it's a priority  
17 of the Council, the Speaker, and we want to support  
18 you however we can in making that happen. We're all  
19 on the same page. Is there is there a goal that..  
20 that the D.O.E. has with regard to reducing classroom  
21 size? Whether it's online or... (crosstalk)

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: There is a... you  
23 know, we have contractual class size limits, which  
24 obviously we are we are bound to abide by. The SCA  
25 has utilization data that we look at very, very

2 closely in conjunction with SCA. So, you know, we...  
3 we don't have specific numerical targets at this  
4 point. But, but we do want to see in general, that  
5 each of our students ultimately is getting a good  
6 personalized experience.

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I think it would be helpful  
8 to have some sort of goal, I mean, even if it was an  
9 ambitious one, or an aspirational one, you know, that  
10 we can work towards and, you know, we can keep  
11 ourselves honest and check ourselves and how we're  
12 doing as far as progress. You know, one of the  
13 things anecdotally... you know, I want our public  
14 schools to be the best in town, for there to be no  
15 other. You know... and this is coming from the son of  
16 a Catholic school teacher. So I want our public  
17 schools to be the best in town, and that to be the...  
18 the obvious option, the number one choice for folks.  
19 And I think what we're hearing, certainly through  
20 COVID, is what... you know, we're losing parents,  
21 because they... you know, just outside the city, they  
22 can, you know, have a Little House on the Prairie  
23 classroom. I understand that's outside the city, but  
24 I think it's something we should be working towards.  
25 So we want to be partners in that. So...

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yup. Yeah, we look forward to  
3 working with you on it as well, right? You know,  
4 there are a number of priorities. Safety is key,  
5 lower class size, but there's also a lot of research  
6 that says, you know, you've got to increase teacher  
7 quality. So that's a huge part of the focus that  
8 we'll be leaning in on as well. The reality is that  
9 you can reduce class size, but if you don't have a  
10 quality teacher in the classroom, it doesn't matter  
11 how small the class size actually is. So we got to  
12 do all of it. We've got to do it all together. And we  
13 continue... we'll continue to work with all of you  
14 and the Council on this. It's a priority for us as  
15 well.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, I want to I have just  
17 a couple more, and then I want to hand it over to  
18 Chair Joseph. So with regard to... to school  
19 accessibility and reaching maximum practical  
20 accessibility, in the follow up to the preliminary  
21 budget hearing, the DOE stated that it would take  
22 approximately \$4 billion over 20 years. Can the  
23 administration commit to appropriating the necessary  
24 level of funding in the capital commitment plan?

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: I believe we've I believe we  
3 also have here... I believe we have Tom is with us,  
4 Tom Taratko. Tom, do you want to speak to that?

5 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TARATKO: Thank you,  
6 Chancellor, and thanks for the question . Well, I  
7 can't, uh, personally answer the... the commitment  
8 funding question. But I can tell you that with, I  
9 believe it's about 503 buildings that are... don't  
10 have any accessible option right now, and with the  
11 historic data that we've had, through this plan,  
12 doing 57 full accessibility projects to date, and the  
13 money that we spent on that, we projected that out to  
14 try to get a guesstimate, because we get asked every  
15 single year that I've been doing this and that's over  
16 10 years, about how long is it going to take to make  
17 all our buildings accessible? At some point, we're  
18 going to hit a roadblock where the building's age,  
19 the configuration, the landlocked status of a  
20 Manhattan building, per se, will be adverse to making  
21 those buildings. We took an estimate that about 150  
22 buildings will be that way. And then we projected  
23 out the average costs, looking at those remaining  
24 buildings and came up with a very, very guesstimate  
25 answer for you, but closer than we've ever had,

2 Chair. (crosstalk) So on the 4 million for every  
3 capital plan for the next four, I won't be here. So I  
4 can't answer that. Maybe Nina can. She's much  
5 younger, so I'll pass it over to her.

6 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Nina is here as well.

7 (crosstalk)

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Right. I mean, the reason  
9 why I'm asking too, I mean, is, in the past, the  
10 Council has had to lobby for additional money in the  
11 five-year plan. And, you know, I think this is such  
12 an important long-term issue, that shouldn't be  
13 necessary.

14 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Right. Right. Does the SCA  
15 want to speak to this as well? Nina?

16 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Yes. Thank you. Thank you,  
17 Chancellor, and thank you, Chair.

18 So absolutely, I think it is a... it is a  
19 priority for this Administration. As you can see,  
20 from the development of this capital plan, the fiscal  
21 year 2020 to 2024, we've heard all the advocacy for  
22 this program, and we've increased it fivefold from  
23 the last capital plan. We had less than \$150 million  
24 in the last capital plan and now we're at \$750  
25 million. And I think that's really important to show

2 our commitment... our ongoing commitment. And that's  
3 a dedicated funding source for accessibility  
4 projects. Don't forget, as we do our capital  
5 improvement projects, if we touch an instructional  
6 room, we make that instructional room, if it's not  
7 already, accessible as well, so that... while there's  
8 \$750 million dedicated in this plan, we also have  
9 other streams that that make other rooms, bathrooms,  
10 and things of the like, accessible as well. So there  
11 is a lot of money dedicated to making our buildings  
12 accessible.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So how do we how do we  
14 define maximum practical accessibility? And how do we  
15 select which sites are chosen for accessibility  
16 projects?

17 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: I see Tom is coming off of  
18 mute... he's sort of (crosstalk) disability.

19 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TARATKO: Yeah. The  
20 Office of... of space management handles that, Chair.  
21 And we looked at... when we took over central... the  
22 central view of accessibility, we found that there  
23 was a large equity issue in the city of New York due  
24 to a lot of factors. So we went through with  
25 geographic need, or historically underserved

2 districts with the lowest percentage of accessible  
3 options for our students. That was first, we also  
4 looked geographically in that district, the larger  
5 districts that have might have highways crossing the  
6 options and trying to get as many options in a  
7 geographic area. We look at specialty programs. We  
8 look at the enrollment of the schools to serve as  
9 much as many children as we possibly can, for bang  
10 for the buck kind of thing, and we are at the end of  
11 this plan, we will have reached two goals that were  
12 stated in the previous Administration. One is to  
13 have 50% accessible options in every elementary  
14 building that has elementary grades, and the other  
15 will be 33% fully accessible buildings in every  
16 school district. So that'll be the first time that  
17 that equity will be out there in the city of New  
18 York. So we're very proud of that.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So... Thank you, Tom.  
20 What... what's the goal if we're... if we're... if  
21 the DOE is stating, it's going to take approximately  
22 \$4 billion over 20 years, how many sites, back in the  
23 envelope do we expect to still be inaccessible and 20  
24 years?

2 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TARATKO: It's... it's  
3 just from a lot of knowledge of the buildings chair,  
4 but I would say somewhere between 150 to 200  
5 buildings will be... those buildings over 100 years  
6 old that have historical classification, or are  
7 landlocked, or have configuration issues. Some  
8 schools are just too small and surrounded by other  
9 buildings and things where to put an interior  
10 elevator in there would take away the capacity of the  
11 classrooms, and therefore it would... it would not be  
12 a practical, you know, project to overtake. You'd be  
13 losing valuable seats in an area that might need it  
14 to do that. So that building would have to basically  
15 be knocked down and rebuilt in newer standards. So  
16 we're not close enough to that to give you those  
17 details yet, you know, that's in the out years, so...  
18 we're getting there.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, I want to switch  
20 gears, and then I want to hand it over to our... our  
21 Education Chair. So Vision and Hearing Care,  
22 something I was speaking to council member Schulman  
23 about. Does the D.O.E. offer free vision and hearing  
24 screening to students when they enter public schools?

2 I mean, when I was a kid, they used to do that. Do we  
3 still do that?

4 CHANCELLOR BANKS: I believe that we do. Dr.  
5 Johnson?

6 CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes. We currently offer free  
7 vision screening.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So we don't do the hearing  
9 test anymore?

10 CHIEF JOHNSON: Oh yes, we also do vision and  
11 hearing. My apologies chair.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: You do both?

13 CHIEF JOHNSON: Were you able to hear me?

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So you do both hearing and  
15 vision?

16 CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes, we do hearing and vision.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. And then... are  
18 children who... who show early signs of print-based  
19 and other disabilities given assistance in accessing  
20 vision care?

21 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Can you repeat that  
22 question for me chair?

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Sure. So if you if you  
24 identify a student who has a vision or hearing issue,  
25 what's the next step?

2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: We couldn't hear  
3 you.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Can you... Can you hear me  
5 now?

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: It looks like she... speaking  
7 of vision hearing chair, it looks like she can't.  
8 Something must be wrong with her speaker.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. (background voices)

10 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, can you just repeat the  
11 repeat the question again?

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Sure. So yeah, if... I'm  
13 happy to hear we're still doing vision and hearing  
14 screenings in our public schools. So if a student  
15 then is, you know, identified that a kid has a  
16 hearing or vision issue, what's the next step?

17 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: So, for  
18 disabilities, we have a multi-pronged approach that  
19 we're going to take, and I appreciate the question, I  
20 think it's... you're asking about both vision issues  
21 and about reading concerns, right? And so, any type  
22 of print-based disability, right now there are  
23 resources that students can use in terms of... if  
24 we're talking about vision, there are texts and  
25 technology that children can access that will help

2 them with the actual mechanics of reading. In terms  
3 of our larger projects that we're working on, and I  
4 think that we're spending a great deal of time  
5 planning out, and we've allocated some funding to it  
6 as well, we're really excited to be building out a  
7 grand-scale literacy approach that will ensure that  
8 teachers are trained not only in dyslexia awareness,  
9 but also in foundational explicit phonics  
10 instruction, and making sure that in grades K through  
11 2, the schools have phonics curricula, so that all  
12 students really have access to that foundational  
13 reading instruction.

14 In addition to that, for our students who do not  
15 make adequate progress, we are building in... so  
16 right now all of our students are screened using  
17 general screeners in grades K through 2. Its  
18 Acadians in grades 3 through 5. Schools have  
19 choices. If our students are not making adequate  
20 progress, we are currently piloting additional  
21 screeners, so secondary screeners, to look for signs  
22 of risk of dyslexia or other print-based  
23 disabilities. And when we have that information,  
24 we're partnering with different organizations to  
25 provide not only the intervention that's needed, but

2 also if students require an additional evaluation, so  
3 if we're looking at students who may require that  
4 third tier of intervention, we've partnered with  
5 organizations to provide evaluations as well. So all  
6 of that is going to become part of our larger plan  
7 for next year, so that a greater number of students  
8 have access to that kind of support.

9 In addition, we are opening to different types of  
10 programs. So one is a standalone school for dyslexia  
11 that will begin as an incubated model within a school  
12 in district 7. And we'll build out 2 sections. So  
13 grades three and four, that will become a school for  
14 dyslexia. And then in district five, we're actually  
15 building out a model that is just an extension of the  
16 grade. So an additional set of classes in grades one  
17 and two, that will provide really targeted  
18 intervention for students who need that kind of  
19 additional support. And we'll use both of those  
20 programs as opportunities to both train and support  
21 additional teachers and leaders. And in fact, we have  
22 a partnership with City College to do that pre-  
23 service kind of work as well.

24 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: That's helpful. In  
25 addition to the vision and hearing screenings, in

2 addition to dyslexia... if... with regard to health  
3 care, access to vision or eye care, if a parent is  
4 seeking free or reduced cost for vision care, does  
5 the DOE provide any assistance? What's the  
6 contingency there?

7 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Lindsey?

8 CHIEF JOHNSON: So, with regard to... thank you  
9 Chair for the question. With regard to vision  
10 screening, all entrants into the DOE are screened for  
11 vision in the... within six months of their entry.  
12 And so what that means is that all of our pre-K and  
13 kindergarten students are also required to do so in  
14 addition to our 3K students. When young people get to  
15 grades three through five, there is also some  
16 additional screening that occurs at that time. For  
17 schools that received the community school funding,  
18 there is additional dedicated vision screening and  
19 visual supports through the \_\_\_\_\_ partner  
20 partnership, and as well as for families, students in  
21 temporary housing. So when we think about families  
22 that are most impacted by many of these extenuating  
23 and challenging services, being able to provide the  
24 additional support for those families is one way that  
25 we're working to address this challenge.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, I appreciate that.  
3 I... uh. We've got a... we've got a long day here.  
4 So I want to hand it over to the Education Chair,  
5 Chair Joseph, and I thank you all for your time.

6 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you.

7 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you, Chair Brannan. I  
8 appreciate you. All right.

9 So, my first question is contracting nurses. Why  
10 is the DOE increasing the budget for contracted  
11 nurses by \$40 million. In fiscal 2023, the executive  
12 budget increased the budget for contracted nurses by  
13 \$49 million in fiscal 2023 from a baseline budget of  
14 \$28.3 million. So the Council was told each year  
15 building has access to nurses in the current school  
16 year, what is the purpose of nearly tripling the  
17 budget for the contracted nurses with DOE? And how  
18 is DOE determining which school will receive these  
19 nurses? How many nursing positions are in the  
20 schools now between contracted and DOE staff nurses?  
21 And how many will this add as well?

22 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Thank you, Chair  
23 Joseph for the question.

24 The investment that you see in the executive  
25 budget actually just continues the same level of

2 contract nursing supports that exist in schools  
3 today, and it ensures that we're able to maintain the  
4 commitment of having a nurse in each school building,  
5 which is critical to obviously our health and safety  
6 investments. And it's something that we started at  
7 the beginning of the pandemic and have continued  
8 throughout the last several years and will continue  
9 again in the upcoming school year.

10 CHAIR JOSEPH: So I know some of the nurses also  
11 come from DOH. Is there a partnership between you and  
12 DOH? And do you know how many nurses are in our  
13 schools from DOH and DOE?

14 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: I can speak to  
15 the... there is a partnership between DOE and DOH in  
16 regards to nursing. The funding that is in the  
17 executive budget supports the DOE contract nursing  
18 costs, but we do have partnerships with also Health  
19 and Hospitals. Some of their contract nurses support  
20 our schools. And so between the DOH nurses, the DOE  
21 nurses, and our contract nurses provided by H and H  
22 and D.O.E.'s contracts, we are able to make sure that  
23 our students get the health and safety care that they  
24 need.

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: If you wanted a specific  
3 breakdown, you know, we could just get that to you.

4 CHAIR JOSEPH: Absolutely. Also, we addressed  
5 some pay parity between the nurses as well?

6 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: The investment in  
7 the executive budget, Chair, is related to the cost  
8 of a contract nursing.

9 CHAIR JOSEPH: So the contract nurses... does it  
10 take away nursing nurses from DOE as well?

11 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: No. The contract  
12 nursing is in addition to the services provided by do  
13 DOH, H and H, and DOE nurses.

14 CHAIR JOSEPH: But is there... is there a pay  
15 disparity. You see... we see the 4410 with the...  
16 with the preschools for special education, there is a  
17 pay parity. Is there a pay parity between the nurses  
18 as well?

19 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: So I think pay  
20 parity is a complex issue that we're having  
21 conversations with our city partners about across a  
22 variety of initiatives.

23 CHAIR JOSEPH: All right, well, that will be one  
24 of the things you can address when you answer the  
25 letters that I send you. I would love to see some of

2 the numbers and the breakdowns and the data for that.

3 Thank you.

4 Next one of my favorite items, part of this is  
5 also CTE. The Council was very happy to see \$33  
6 million devoted to pathway expansions in the  
7 executive budget and the 2023 and \$52 million in the  
8 fiscal year 2024. Will this programming be different  
9 from CTE programs? Will these courses also offer  
10 college credits and other career pathways? How will  
11 the school identify for enrollment? And what is the  
12 funding breakdown between spending in high schools  
13 and middle schools for FY 23 and FY 24?

14 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, no, we see this very  
15 differently. This is not just a traditional CTE  
16 expansion, although there'll be some of that, but we  
17 have a vision for a much greater expansion of... of  
18 CTE as a focus. And one of the things we've done, we  
19 brought on Jade Grieve. Jade, I ask that you speak  
20 to this question. This is really in many ways, the  
21 Northstar for this Administration, and the work that  
22 we're going to do as relates to creating pathways for  
23 our students. And Jade is the chief of... of career  
24 pathways of for us. Jade?

25

2 CHIEF GRIEVE: Thank you, Chancellor, and thank  
3 you, Chair, for the question. Can everyone hear me  
4 okay? Just checking audio. Okay.

5 So thank you. Thanks, again, for the question.  
6 I'm glad to be here to talk a little bit about..  
7 about this work, and would like to at the outset,  
8 just acknowledge and thank the City Council for the  
9 consistent support to strengthen College and Career  
10 Pathways both through CTE programming, and through  
11 high-quality internships. I know this is a big area  
12 of focus and I appreciate the support.

13 As the Chancellor shared, we've kind of laid out  
14 here a really ambitious vision for expanding career  
15 connected learning as one of the big visions in the  
16 way that we'll charge towards the Chancellor's  
17 Northstar around long term economic security to  
18 ensure that all young people are leaving our schools  
19 with really strong preparation, awareness  
20 experiences, and really set up well to be on a  
21 rewarding pathway to a strong career.

22 One of the big areas of focus in this budget, as  
23 you mentioned, Chair, is around the expansion of what  
24 we're calling student pathways, which is really  
25 building actually, in many ways from the strength of

2 CTE programming. But I would say there's a few... a  
3 few kind of additional features, and actually, you  
4 touched on some of them in your in your question.

5 So were our plans here are to work with a set of  
6 schools next year, and as the Mayor said, in his  
7 State of the City, to expand that overtime citywide,  
8 where we'd hope all students have access to be in  
9 some of these high quality career pathways and  
10 student pathways. And we see these... these new  
11 career pathways having a really strong focus on like  
12 as an innovative model that's blending the best of  
13 college and career readiness and preparation.

14 And so there's a few features of that. One, that  
15 students would be getting the opportunity to, in  
16 addition to their academic experience, to really  
17 learn through the lens of career. So career  
18 connected thematic instruction. Two, that  
19 students... that every student would be getting  
20 strong advisement to help them kind of plan for their  
21 post-secondary path, whatever they might do be that  
22 college or career, and it's connected to the kinds of  
23 experiences they're having in school. Three, that  
24 all students would... would have a chance to get a  
25 head start, to really like get it get a sense of what

2 are the breadth of career... careers out there that  
3 they might be interested in. And we know that there's  
4 a lot to do, particularly given how fast the world of  
5 work is changing, to open up more awareness, and  
6 exposure to the different kinds of really good paying  
7 jobs and careers across the city. And that that  
8 ultimately is culminating in not just awareness, but  
9 that students are getting expanded work based  
10 learning opportunities, including paid work  
11 experience.

12 And then lastly, that students are getting this  
13 this this notion of a headstart. So we're getting the  
14 chance to... to try out... are these really the  
15 careers that they're kind of passionate about and  
16 find their purpose in.

17 And so to your question, Chair, that includes  
18 things like early college credit, and doing that in a  
19 meaningful way where students are getting not just  
20 any credit, but getting some sequences of... of  
21 credits, so really building meaningful amounts of  
22 credit in that career pathway, which will give them a  
23 chance to, if they want to head into post-secondary  
24 to really accelerate and kind of go in with full  
25 momentum, having some credit behind them already,

2 and/or that they could get the chance to get industry  
3 credentials. We know there are a bunch of  
4 opportunities, especially in places like in the  
5 fields of technology, that there are industry  
6 credentials that can open up some really strong entry  
7 level jobs for young people.

8       So those that's how kind of we're thinking about  
9 this new focus around career pathways and wanting to  
10 start with a set of schools to build that in  
11 partnership next year, and excited to... I would  
12 certainly love the opportunity to talk more to... to  
13 the Council about how that's how that's unfolding,  
14 and some other... we're currently in good and  
15 important engagement with schools and... and other  
16 partners around... around this scope of work.

17       There's a couple of other things that was... that  
18 was emphasized in the Mayor's speech that was touched  
19 on that relates to this... to this investment as  
20 well. The other is around youth apprenticeship,  
21 expanding opportunities for youth apprenticeship. I  
22 know that's been an interest of the of the Council,  
23 as well as wanting to do more in middle schools to  
24 really support broader career awareness. So we can  
25 happy to take some follow up questions, and further

2 if you'd like to see around some of the difference in  
3 cost, but certainly there in middle school we'll be  
4 much more focused on career awareness and exposure  
5 broadly, and in high schools, we see that's where  
6 there's a chance to kind of really go much deeper  
7 with the kinds of experiences that I mentioned  
8 before. And so there are cost differentials there  
9 and working through all of that.

10 CHAIR JOSEPH: How will the student know... how  
11 will the schools be identified for enrollment? How  
12 does the child know that the school offers this  
13 programming? How does how we plan on getting the  
14 word out?

15 CHIEF GRIEVE: So shortly, we hope to -- and I  
16 think the Chancellor mentioned in his opening remarks  
17 around more details to come -- but shortly, we hope  
18 to kind of open up the opportunities for schools to  
19 be part of the first cohort next year. So we'll be  
20 doing this... this pathways build next year in with a  
21 group of schools, and so there'll be opportunities  
22 to... for schools to apply to be part of that. And  
23 as we're doing that, we'll be thinking, the  
24 applications, and will be focused around ensuring  
25 that we're reaching the real equity lens on the kinds

2 of schools that we're able to bring in and work with  
3 to start to build this. So there'll be there'll be  
4 broad awareness around it. We'll certainly... and  
5 the Chancellor will be engaging in this to make sure  
6 that it's clear kind of where these programs and  
7 pathways will be. But really, just to emphasize that  
8 next year is the first year we'll be building these,  
9 and our hope is for that to be much broader and will  
10 continue to grow each year.

11 CHANCELLOR BANKS: And you should should just  
12 know, as well, Chair, that, you know, there have been  
13 a lot of schools in very specific districts around  
14 the city which have struggled, which have... which  
15 have really never had much exposure in terms of real  
16 career opportunities, and it is those districts,  
17 those schools, that are... we're going to give very  
18 short consideration to providing real opportunity for  
19 them.

20 You know, I've often said it's hard for kids to  
21 dream of becoming an investment banker, if they've  
22 never met one. And this is an opportunity that we  
23 believe in deeply, and... and one that we're going  
24 to... we're going to be engaging the community. And

2 we'll certainly engage council members as well in  
3 this process.

4 CHAIR JOSEPH: Wonderful. Will there be  
5 partnerships with CUNYs in our cities? You know,  
6 that's one of our....

7 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Absolutely. (crosstalk)

8 CHAIR JOSEPH: in the city.

9 CHANCELLOR BANKS: I had a meeting, had a meeting  
10 with Felix yesterday... the Chancellor of CUNY, and  
11 that's exactly what we're talking about, together  
12 with the mayor's office: How do we build real career  
13 pathways? So we're not operating in isolation, and  
14 that this is a real K-16 kind of continuum here. And  
15 so working together with our... with our partners at  
16 CUNY is going to be central to what we're doing as  
17 well.

18 CHAIR JOSEPH: Wonderful. Thank you so much.

19 Um, we've talked about New York City schools  
20 having a communications problem in the past, and that  
21 we need parents to know all about the great programs  
22 we have across the city. I want to know what plan do  
23 you... you plan to roll out additional great programs  
24 in underutilized schools? That's one of the things I  
25 complained a lot about, that we don't sell enough of

2 the public schools. So what are the plans? I'd love  
3 to hear them.

4 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yep, yep. First of all, one of  
5 the things that we do know is that there are a lot of  
6 great things that are happening in our schools. Many  
7 people don't know that. Let me say that. We very  
8 often hear the narrative of nothing but negativity in  
9 our schools. And I will tell you, by having visited  
10 schools all over the city in the four months that  
11 I've been here, there are wonderful and amazing  
12 things that are happening in our schools that we  
13 should really be proud of, but more importantly, we  
14 should all know about.

15 And so, one, it helps for us to get \_\_\_\_\_ about  
16 what their peers are doing, and two, to build trust  
17 with our families to learn what's actually happening  
18 in our schools. And so it's a priority of our deputy  
19 chancellor, our Deputy Chancellor, Kenita Lloyd, is  
20 here. She's in charge of Family and Community  
21 Engagement as well as external affairs. And so  
22 Deputy Chancellor Lloyd, do you want to speak to  
23 this?

24 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR LLOYD: Certainly. Thank you,  
25 Chair Joseph. So we are working... the Family, the

2 Office of Family and Community Engagement is working  
3 across all of our divisions here at DOE to break down  
4 silos, to share communications, and to increase the  
5 methods of communications that we have with our  
6 families. Those will... We are internally launching  
7 and creating and capturing new digital content that  
8 we look to share with our families, with our  
9 educators, and with our school leaders. We are  
10 exploring a variety of ways and innovative uses of  
11 new methods of communicating with families using  
12 technology, surveys, one-on-one communication, but  
13 also critically important is ensuring that all of  
14 those tools are available in languages that our  
15 families speak. I know that that is a huge priority  
16 of the Council, of your committee, and others. So we  
17 are working very diligently to expand the capacity in  
18 those areas to ensure that our communications are  
19 available in multiple languages and multiple methods  
20 across the agency and across the city.

21 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you.

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: If I may add, you  
23 know, I know that thank you for that question. You  
24 and I have had wonderful conversations about  
25 practices we've seen in schools that are worth

2 sharing. And so part of the plan too, is to create  
3 opportunities for schools to learn from one another,  
4 to really create those kinds of networks between  
5 schools. And we've had some successful programs in  
6 the past, through New York City Public Schools. And  
7 so we're looking to revamp some of that, right?, to  
8 build off of what already existed, to take from what  
9 we've learned, and create opportunities for schools  
10 to learn from those schools that may already have  
11 really wonderful practices. And that will be through  
12 school inter-visitations, and also through  
13 technology. And so really using a school website,  
14 rather, the daily website in order to provide  
15 stories, almost, of schools where we can share the  
16 information about what practices a school is using,  
17 share some of their processes, share information,  
18 like templates and resources, and then really connect  
19 schools to one another so that they can learn about  
20 the challenges as well as what led to the successes.

21 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you. My next question is  
22 going to be about one of my favorite things: class  
23 size. We know that many times schools are  
24 underutilized across the city. And that's an example.  
25 There can be a great school... as recent data shows

2 me... I was looking reviewing some stuff, and it said  
3 255 schools with sixth to eighth grade classes have a  
4 class size under 23. Here alone in just these three  
5 grades of students enrolling under capacity school,  
6 we would have the same impact of creating 3000 seats,  
7 the same amount. So SCA is scheduled to open this  
8 fall across all grade levels. What can you guys tell  
9 me about class size? It's important to us we know  
10 that students do well when class sizes are smaller,  
11 and teachers also thrive because they have more time  
12 to dedicate to these students. So underutilized  
13 schools along with class size?

14 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Sure. Well, first of all,  
15 just... just wrapping up on that final point you  
16 talked about, the overall narrative in communication  
17 as well, I just want to add in one other point, which  
18 is a very simple thing, right?, But the reality is  
19 that we're... we're completely overhauling our  
20 website, which is has been a disaster, and I've heard  
21 it from everybody. And it should be much more  
22 parent-friendly, and we are committed to that, and  
23 that work is happening as we speak.

24 So we spoke a little earlier about the class size  
25 issue, but Dan Weisberg, our first deputy, again, you

2 want to lean in and talk a little bit about that?

3 And then, together with Nina, you know, some of the  
4 efforts that we're making.

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Thank you,  
6 Chancellor, and thank you Chair. That... you're 100%  
7 correct that we have a number of models, and we have  
8 more of them than we've had in the past to what the  
9 chancellor has talked about very directly that we  
10 have, we've lost enrollment, we've lost a lot of  
11 enrollment. So not surprisingly, we have a lot of  
12 under-enrolled schools. The medium-term strategy is  
13 to -- as the chancellor has talked about many, many  
14 times -- is to reestablish trust and win back  
15 families. And so I'm hoping, frankly, that we have  
16 in the coming years fewer underutilized schools. And  
17 that, you know, we but at the same time, we totally  
18 agree we need to hold the line on class size, which  
19 has been reduced significantly, as I mentioned  
20 earlier, as a result of the city council, our state  
21 partners, our federal partners that we have been able  
22 to, during this time, when you have seen enrollment  
23 dropped pretty significantly. The number of teachers  
24 is not dropped, in fact, it's increased. And so we do  
25 have lots of students that are getting more

2 personalized experience more personalized attention,  
3 because of that, because of things like fair student  
4 funding being funded fully because of the help we've  
5 gotten from... from the council. So, you know, this  
6 is going to be the challenge, I would say, but I feel  
7 very confident we're going to be able to meet it,  
8 which is, Madam Chair, increasing enrollment as much  
9 as possible, particularly in those under enrolled  
10 schools. Because as you know extremely well one of  
11 the problems with an under-enrolled school is, it is  
12 very, very difficult to provide a full slate of  
13 services and programming for students when you're  
14 under-enrolled. So we want to get the enrollment in  
15 those schools back up as much as possible at the same  
16 time holding the line on class size. And so that...  
17 that would be our... and see class size particularly  
18 in the early grades, continue to decrease and come  
19 down across the city. So that's the... that's the  
20 goal for us, and those are the two tracks we are  
21 going to be working on.

22 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: And if I may, you know, this  
23 is a multi-pronged approach, obviously you've heard  
24 everyone saying. And, you know, I don't want to  
25 minimize that that overcrowding is solved only by

2 doing these shifts, right? Building needs to occur  
3 and we are working on... on building. And instead of  
4 taking the... the 60,000 seats with this declining  
5 enrollment and saying, you know, we only really need  
6 45, we really looked at it strategically with the DOE  
7 and said, "Where can we allocate those other 15,000  
8 seats, approximately, to help those schools that  
9 might not be in an area of identified need?" So we  
10 truly believe that with the 45,000 seats that we'll  
11 be building in this capital plan to reduce current  
12 and projected overcrowding, along with the DOE  
13 helping to create those programs to attract and to  
14 retain our students that we can achieve the lower  
15 class sizes, and this has been a big push, I know,  
16 from all the advocates, to really lowering the class  
17 size as we have sort of done through our capacity  
18 calculations in the blue book: 23 for grades four  
19 through 8, 25 for 9 through 12. So our... our data  
20 is reflecting those class sizes, and now we're  
21 working with the DOE of how best to implement it.

22 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you, I'd love to see that in  
23 detail as to how we move forward. We're the only  
24 district New York City public schools that has such  
25 overcrowding, and you know it doesn't benefit the

2 teacher or the students. So I'd love to hear further  
3 details on how we approach that in the next... in our  
4 follow up letter. Thank you so much.

5 I'm going to touch on bilingual education. What  
6 programming and initiatives with \$11.2 million in  
7 fiscal 2023, and \$13.2 million in fiscal 2024 for  
8 Bilingual Education Support? Is there any of this  
9 programming new? How many languages do you aim to  
10 target with these programs? And how many outside the  
11 common 10? So I'm going to start with those  
12 questions. And I have two follow ups.

13 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you, Chair  
14 Joseph, appreciate the question. It's an incredibly  
15 important issue for us. So this is one that has come  
16 up here. We are investing a little over \$11 million  
17 in bilingual education for the coming year, and we  
18 are committed to providing our multilingual learners,  
19 especially our ELLs with high quality instruction, so  
20 that they can graduate on the pathway to a rewarding  
21 career, long-term economic security, and we want to  
22 make sure that they can be validated for what they  
23 bring to the classroom, their own language, right?

24 And you heard the chancellor in his opener, talk  
25 about investing in bringing in heritage language

2 curricula. Really, what we're looking to do is to  
3 expand bilingual programs, and so that looks like  
4 both the Transitional Bilingual and dual-language  
5 programs and really thinking about expanding where  
6 they're already in place, and opening new ones where  
7 they aren't yet. And so by 2023, we hope to open or  
8 grow about 50 bilingual education programs. We're  
9 collaborating with superintendents to review data on  
10 ELLs in their districts. And we're looking at  
11 building out a two-year plan so that we really can  
12 learn from what we're working on. We're working with  
13 the school development teams so that they can really  
14 help us through what it means to design an actual  
15 school so that it is meeting the needs of our  
16 language learners. And we'll... we'll have to  
17 obviously, look at other factors like current ELL  
18 enrollment, home language, parent choice, and pay  
19 attention to trends so that we can determine what  
20 languages we'll be building out in.

21 CHAIR JOSEPH: Out of the languages are you...  
22 are you planning on expanding out of the common 10.  
23 Or...?

24 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: If there is a demand  
25 for any other language, then we would consider that

2 but otherwise, it would remain with the schools that  
3 we currently have in place. We don't want to open  
4 programs that just can't have continuity. And so we  
5 want to make sure that wherever we're opening a  
6 program, it is because there is enough of a  
7 population for that program to be sustainable, and  
8 that we actually have educators. So right now we're  
9 looking to partner with families and communities on  
10 local plans for those programs and for growth and  
11 expansion. And we'll use the data that we have in  
12 hand to make decisions.

13 CHAIR JOSEPH: As a former educator also, I know  
14 that you can build a bilingual program but also  
15 rates... retaining teachers... bilingual educators  
16 have always been a shortage across New York City,  
17 either with bilingual education licensing or even ESL  
18 licensing. How do you plan to address that as well?

19 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you for that  
20 question. A really important question, and actually  
21 a conversation that we've been having with teachers  
22 very recently. We currently have incentives in place  
23 for our content area teachers to receive bilingual  
24 extensions. What we don't have yet and something  
25 that we've we're hoping to have conversations with

2 the state about is how we can go about actually  
3 getting those extensions for our current ELL teachers  
4 so that they can be content teachers as well. But we  
5 are looking to recruit more teachers with that  
6 bilingual license, and we've been working with our  
7 teacher recruitment and quality office to work on  
8 that very specifically, and have started having  
9 conversations with folks in higher learning, and we  
10 met actually with the State last week to talk a  
11 little bit about how we can work together on that  
12 teacher pipeline.

13 \_\_\_\_\_: (inaudible)

14 CHAIR JOSEPH: I can't hear. I didn't hear that.

15 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Oh, I'm on mute. Okay. Can  
16 you hear me now, Chair?

17 CHAIR JOSEPH: Yes.

18 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, one of the things we're  
19 excited about also is possibility of a partnership  
20 with the Dominican Republic, we've... We've met with  
21 the council, General there. They're excited about  
22 lining up dozens of their teachers to actually come  
23 and work here in some of our shortage areas. So  
24 these are conversations that are also happening and a  
25 part of a plan that we exploring. We're exploring

2 all possibilities, and to the degree that you all  
3 have other ideas and suggestions as well that would  
4 help us, I think we've got to think outside of the  
5 box, and not just continue to do it in the way that  
6 we've been doing it, and this relationship that we're  
7 forging with D.R. is something that is an out-of-the-  
8 box approach, and something we're excited about.

9 CHAIR JOSEPH: Bilingual pupil services is also a  
10 great pipeline for bilingual educators.

11 I will... um... how will the DOE identify which  
12 50 schools will receive this new programming? Can  
13 you commit to working with council to identify these  
14 schools?

15 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you for that  
16 question, Chair. Yes. So we're going to collaborate  
17 with superintendents. We're going to be looking at  
18 ELL data in their respective districts, and would  
19 absolutely welcome Council to be part of that process  
20 as well. And as you know, a real big priority for  
21 the Chancellor this year... actually, for this  
22 Administration in general, has been to engage the  
23 community in all processes. And so it'll be very  
24 important for us to make sure that we have really  
25 strong community engagement through our family and

2 community engagement, folks to that we are really  
3 listening to the needs of our communities.

4 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah. That point again, it...  
5 for me, it will go without saying that engagement  
6 with the Council is something that I stand ready to  
7 do at any moment. And I welcome it, I don't believe  
8 that we can impact that... our students and our  
9 schools and our families at the maximum level, if we  
10 just think we're going do it through the people who  
11 work here at the D.O.E. It will not happen. We can  
12 move it, but we won't be able to move in a maximum  
13 way. I see every one of you who are in the City  
14 Council. Each one of you are community leaders, you  
15 know, your schools in your community, you know the  
16 parents, you know the principals. So we... you  
17 know, we I don't ever want to be in a place of being  
18 adversarial at all. This is... we are... we should  
19 be real partners. And that's why I've sought to reach  
20 out to as many of you as I possibly can. And I say to  
21 all of you even now: Feel free to reach out to me  
22 with your ideas. We don't have to wait until the  
23 hearing. You can always share with me on a regular  
24 basis your thinking and your suggestions, and I'm in  
25 full partnership with you on all of this.

2 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you Chancellor Banks. How  
3 much of this funding will support the hiring of the  
4 ELL instructional specialists? What does this  
5 timeline look like? How will you determine the  
6 placement? What specific role will the ELL  
7 specialists play in bilingual education? And how will  
8 you fund these positions after fiscal 2024?

9 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: So part of that is  
10 that is the planning that is taking place right now,  
11 right? And so we are making decisions about each of  
12 those components. And then part of that means  
13 working with our local districts again. So really  
14 making decisions about how much staffing we already  
15 have in place, when we're looking only to expand. Do  
16 we have enough teachers in those... those buildings  
17 and in the schools? So all of that is being worked  
18 out at this time. And that \$11.2 million will...  
19 will be used in part for training, in part for the  
20 curricula, and in part for hiring personnel. We've  
21 already started working too with Council Members, and  
22 so we're really excited about continuing that. We  
23 met with district school district 24 and 30 \_\_\_\_\_  
24 this week, and we anticipate that with the Chair's  
25 experience with English language learners as well,

2 that will, we'll certainly have a really strong  
3 partnership there. So we appreciate.

4 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you. Thank you. Family  
5 engagement. I know that's one of the things that  
6 Chancellor Banks talks a lot about.

7 What programming initiatives will the \$13.8  
8 million in the fiscal 2023 and the \$3.8 million in  
9 fiscal 2024 for parents and family engagement  
10 support? Is there any of this programming new? How  
11 many of the community coordinators will the \$1.8  
12 million fund, and what will be the average salary?

13 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR LLOYD: Thank you for that,  
14 Chair Joseph. So first, let me just say that... just  
15 to re-echo the Chancellor's sentiments about our  
16 commitment to increasing dialogue with families and  
17 parent leaders. We intend to use those funds to  
18 backfill vacant positions to start, in an attempt to  
19 increase staff capacity to support our ability to  
20 engage families. As some of you know that engagement  
21 happens on various ways and on a multitude of issues  
22 around the DOE, not only in family engagement, but  
23 through the Office of Student Enrollment, school  
24 utilization, focus groups and other methods that  
25 happened around the agency. So we really are working

2 interdepartmentally to share that... share that  
3 feedback. And as I said before, to break down  
4 those... those silos by having more people on the  
5 ground, more people working across our agency, and  
6 more people in direct conversation with families. We  
7 are exploring innovative methods to meet families  
8 where they are, such as the use of targeted...  
9 targeted surveys, additional digital content, videos,  
10 and a variety of other ways.

11 We're going to continue to engage families,  
12 parent leaders, advocates, through one-on-ones,  
13 through group meetings, through town halls... and  
14 town halls using every method that we have available  
15 so that no stone is left unturned.

16 CHAIR JOSEPH: The community coordinators you  
17 plan to hire... how much will you hire? How many can  
18 you hire? And what's the average salary?

19 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR LLOYD: I will follow up with  
20 an answer on both of those, Chair Joseph.

21 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you. Um foster care, the  
22 last time we met, we talked in the fall of 2021,  
23 after a lot of years of advocacy, the DOE committed  
24 to hiring seven, first ever team to focus on  
25 educational needs of students in foster care. How

2 many of the seven positions have posted up on the DOE  
3 sites? Have you begun the interviewing process? What  
4 does the hiring timeline look like? Can you share the  
5 average salary for these titles with us, please?

6 Thank you.

7 CHIEF JOHNSON: Morning again, Chair Joseph,  
8 thank you for the question. So we have posted... we  
9 posted four of the positions. As per our previous...  
10 previous hearing on foster care, we posted four of  
11 those positions. We are in the process of  
12 interviewing for those positions now, with a goal of  
13 hiring and filling those positions shortly. We  
14 intend to continue to negotiate... to expand... to  
15 increase the remaining positions available and with  
16 regard to the salary and and offerings they vary  
17 with... with regard to each of the positions and  
18 capacity, and I can get that information back to you  
19 at a later time.

20 CHAIR JOSEPH: Well, I look forward it... I  
21 definitely look forward to it because I would love  
22 that unit to be up and running. So by the fall the  
23 students are being served. It's been long overdue.  
24 Thank you.

2 My next question is for SCA. We've heard concern  
3 about SEM moving forward towards more prefabricated  
4 mainstream masonry panels over the use of typical  
5 handset brick laying. Can you give us some details  
6 on when SCA chooses to use utilize prefabricated  
7 masonry in the projects. Does it SCA have any  
8 analysis on the effectiveness of prefabricated versus  
9 traditional masonry? Is it cost? Impacts on job or  
10 the broader city economy? Can you answer that one?  
11 Please?

12 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you, Joseph, for that  
13 question. Yes, we have a team that's continuously...  
14 we have a unit within the SCA that's continuously  
15 looking at new materials, and they analyze it, and  
16 their usage and their durability. And we have to say  
17 that precast panel is being used a little bit more  
18 than the traditional masonry as... as we have in the  
19 past for both... both reasons that you cited quite  
20 honestly, cost and speed. We have found that it's...  
21 it is cost effective, and it is faster to install. So  
22 we have moved a little bit towards that. It doesn't  
23 happen in every application of our new school. And  
24 again, this is for new builds, so our traditional  
25 schools that have you know, bricks are already there.

2 When we replace those bricks, we are replacing them  
3 in kind. So we are replacing them with bricks.

4 CHAIR JOSEPH: Thank you.

5 Um, Malcom, I'm opening up the floor to my  
6 colleagues for questioning.

7 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you Chairs Joseph and  
8 Brannon. We will now turn to Councilmember  
9 questions. I do you want to remind all council  
10 members present, we're dealing with the two biggest  
11 committees, so we have lots of questions. I ask that  
12 you please stick to the five-minute timer and listen  
13 for the sergeant's queue. We do have another agency  
14 that has to appear before us later on today.

15 Many of you have come in and out of the zoom, so  
16 I have locked in your places with hands raised. So  
17 we're going to go off of my list. We're going to  
18 start with councilmember Gennaro followed by  
19 councilmembers Dinowitz, Hanif, Brooks-Powers,  
20 Narcisse, Louis, and any others, but we will first  
21 turn to Councilmember Gennaro.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you team  
24 moderator. Thank you, Chair Brannan. Thank you, Chair  
25 Joseph, I like to thank... I'd like to thank the

2 Chancellor for making a highlight of Edison High  
3 School in your remarks. That is in my district, and  
4 I worked hard with Principal Moses Ojeda. I want to  
5 give him a shout out. And I want to thank you, Mr.  
6 Chancellor for being very available and open to me  
7 and to SCA President Kubota, thank you for your  
8 investment in the Harvest School. I was part of that  
9 school's founding when it was in Bushwick, and  
10 further when it was moved over to Governor's Island,  
11 and that's going to be a big part of that, you know,  
12 institute is going to be founded there. So thank you  
13 for all that.

14 Let me get into my questions, of which I will be  
15 brief. This is for President Kubota. During your  
16 statement, you talked about the boilers in the  
17 schools that currently burn number four, and that are  
18 going to be upgraded. A local law, as you may know:  
19 all buildings must phase out number four oil by  
20 January 1, 2030. I'm trying to accelerate the  
21 citywide phase out of number four oil burning by five  
22 years to January 1, 2025, by local law. And I would  
23 ask... rather than discussion of it, I would ask that  
24 you send me some kind of analysis... your people  
25 would send me an analysis about your ability to meet

2 that 2025 number four oil phase out, if possible to  
3 do so. Certainly, you know, any correspondence  
4 between me and the SCA would also, you know,  
5 necessary loop Chair Joseph. I never, you know,  
6 believe in interacting with agencies, if I don't loop  
7 in the Chair. So let me just put that out there.  
8 And get into my next thing, and then just respond as  
9 you see fit, Madam President.

10 The Carbon Free and Healthy Schools Initiative,  
11 which is driven by Climate Jobs New York calls for a  
12 deep... deep energy retrofits and the installation of  
13 solar power and battery storage and advocates for  
14 schools and communities that have been historically  
15 under-resourced and also suffering from high rates of  
16 childhood asthma and the negative impacts of climate  
17 change. We asked that these schools be made a  
18 priority. If this effort is fully implemented, it  
19 would create over 60,000 good union jobs. It would  
20 save millions... save the schools millions annually  
21 in energy costs and make the schools healthier and  
22 safer.

23 So my question finally: Are there plans, you  
24 know, to make these improvements that I just  
25 outlined, and to increase energy efficiency and

2 prepare schools for decarbonisation, and... and for  
3 renewable energy sources, such as solar power panels.  
4 And feel free to talk about like the number four item  
5 that I put on the table. I haven't given you a lot  
6 of time, but there you have it.

7 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you. Thank you,  
8 Councilmember. Great questions. We love all of our  
9 sustainability measures.

10 Absolutely. We are certainly working not just  
11 with the administration, but with our partners at  
12 D.C.A.S. uh, to look at, you know, all things, both  
13 solar, and our boiler program as well. We are  
14 committed to coming off of number four oil as quickly  
15 as possible, and we are looking at alternative  
16 sources to that, right? We... we look at potentially  
17 electrification as one way, not just number four oil,  
18 reducing it to gas or biofuel, but we are exploring,  
19 and we constantly explore those different options.

20 And so that is all under discussion right now.  
21 And we're trying to think of the most cost effective,  
22 seamless way of doing it because we also, when we,  
23 when we move to electrification, we have to employ a  
24 whole different set of contractors rather than our  
25 traditional boiler moving from oil to gas. So that's

2 all under exploration right now. And we're happy to  
3 share, you know, more details about that, maybe a one  
4 on one, I'd love to have that discussion with you.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

6 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: But we also we are looking at  
7 energy conservation methods for building  
8 electrification, as I mentioned. We have our pre-K  
9 center opening at Hall of Science. That is 100%  
10 Electric.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Madam President, I would  
12 like to stay within the five minutes. You've been  
13 very gracious with your comments and your... you  
14 know, willingness to indulge, perhaps, you know, we  
15 should take this offline. And as I said before, I  
16 will not have any communications with you or the SCA  
17 that don't loop in Chair Joseph. So thank you very  
18 much. Thank you very much to the chairs and to the  
19 moderator. Thank you.

20 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you.

21 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember  
22 Gennaro. Next, we'll turn to Council Member  
23 Dinowitz.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time started.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Good morning. Thank  
3 you, Chairs Joseph and Brannon. Thank you,  
4 Chancellor, Deputies, and Chiefs. I want to talk  
5 about the budget of federal stimulus money. I first  
6 want to clarify that 100% of the funding that's not  
7 being spent this year can be rolled over into next  
8 year? I just want to clarify that point.

9 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Yes,  
10 Councilmember, that's absolutely correct.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Good to hear. There was  
12 a there was an article in Chalkbeat, in which...  
13 which one of your spokespeople said the opposite. I  
14 imagine there are a number of teachers and principals  
15 who are concerned. I'm happy to send you the  
16 article. I have the... It's okay.

17 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Councilmember. I  
18 actually... if I make may clarify. Because I think  
19 what you're... (crosstalk)

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Sorry, it's okay. You  
21 can clarify later. I have four minutes and 15  
22 seconds...

23 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Sure.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: ... and I believe you.  
25 I just want to make sure... I trust what you're

2 telling me now, I believe you. I do want to focus on  
3 that money and how we're spending that money. I  
4 understand what you said in your statement about  
5 certain things not being able to be spent because...  
6 they... like furniture and supply chain issues. But I  
7 want to ask about the other funding for academic  
8 supports for teachers, things like tutoring, and that  
9 money is also not being spent. I just want to ask  
10 you about some of the issues in that portion of the  
11 spending, please.

12 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Sure, and I do  
13 you want to just clarify your earlier question. I  
14 think the Chalkbeat article that you're referencing  
15 is talking about not allowing schools with  
16 underspending to roll funding from one year to  
17 another. We as an agency, and as a grantor, are able  
18 to roll funding and unspent money from one year to  
19 another. So I think that's an important  
20 clarification I just wanted to put on the record  
21 there.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Thank you.

23 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: In terms of the  
24 academic recovery allocations that we've made  
25 directly to schools, we are seeing spending in that

2 area. However, I just want to pull this back to the  
3 start of the school year when the VAX mandate was in  
4 place, when things were uncertain, we had the Omicron  
5 virus... or Omicron surge. There's been uncertainty  
6 throughout the school year, some of that has resulted  
7 in delays and spending on the school-based  
8 allocations, in addition to the well-publicized sort  
9 of staffing shortages that we've had as a result of  
10 some... of a variety of different things that I've  
11 mentioned. And so some of those things have combined  
12 towards underspending in schools, but we've heard, by  
13 and large, from principals that this funding has been  
14 effective and welcomed.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Wonderful, I want to  
16 talk about those staffing issues, you know,  
17 Chancellor, CFO, everyone here, I really value a lot  
18 of the pillars that were laid out earlier this year.  
19 You know, and some of the things you said about K  
20 through 16 a continuum, that school is part of a  
21 continuum, you know, working with our city partners,  
22 and scaling and restoring what works, that's pillar  
23 number two, and I want to highlight, you know, a  
24 particular program that's called CUNY Tutor Corps.  
25 This is a program that allows CUNY Students to tutor.

2 Pretty self explanatory to tell. CUNY Tutor Corps,  
3 where CUNY students go into schools, middles, and  
4 middle and high schools and provide direct  
5 instruction and direct support to our students. And  
6 this results in positive outcomes, individualized  
7 attention, increased test scores, all of the things  
8 that we want to see. And in your conversations, I'm  
9 wondering if this particular program has come up. And  
10 if you've been able to talk about scaling this  
11 program? Because it works, and because it, I think  
12 fits in really nicely with pillar number two.

13 CHANCELLOR BANKS: I completely agree. And it's  
14 interesting that it came up yesterday when we met the  
15 Chancellor of CUNY. And so you're right. It is an  
16 example of exactly what we're talking about  
17 programming that actually works. Deputy Chancellor  
18 Quintana is the one who is really charged with  
19 driving this. Deputy Chancellor?

20 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you. And  
21 thank you for that... thank you for that question.

22 So we are actually working together with CUNY,  
23 und using CUNY Tutor Corps. Particularly this summer,  
24 you'll see their work across some of our schools, and  
25 they are working with a number of schools right now

2 as well. And we want to build out some of that, not  
3 only to provide that type of intervention where there  
4 are gaps in learning, but also in partnership with  
5 career pathways work that Jade Grieve is leading,  
6 we're talking about using those opportunities to help  
7 build out future teacher pipelines, so that we have  
8 access to additional... or more exposure rather for  
9 students in college and students at our own schools  
10 to see teaching as a viable option.

11 So we are working together with CUNY. We're  
12 working with a number of other organizations to  
13 provide high-dosage tutoring, and we are piloting  
14 some of those now...

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

16 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: ... and we'll be  
17 using many of them in the summer as well, so that we  
18 can see what's really going to be beneficial for next  
19 year.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: So can we look forward  
21 to seeing some of these unspent funds going towards  
22 this... going towards programs like CUNY... CUNY  
23 Tutor Corps? Can we look forward to those funds  
24 being spent? Because conversations are great,

2 they're slightly different than committing to that...  
3 to that funding and investment.

4 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Well, what we are committed to  
5 is ensuring that we provide a level of excellence for  
6 all of our students, and... and we've been engaged in  
7 dozens of conversations with lots of different  
8 service providers, and there have had a lot of great  
9 ideas that have been brought to us. So are we  
10 shifting... sifting through all of this to try to  
11 figure out the best... the best things. And so we  
12 appreciate the heads up on this. We've already got a  
13 heads up on it. It sounds like a great program that  
14 would be very helpful. It's being taken under strong  
15 consideration.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Yeah, it's a great  
17 program that will help our students, our K-12  
18 students, help the CUNY students get that experience,  
19 and honestly help the teachers are already struggling  
20 to address the individualized needs of our students.  
21 And one can only throw around the word  
22 differentiation so much before you actually have to  
23 have a real plan and real... real individualized  
24 attention and intervention. This is a wonderful  
25 program, and I think that this money... this federal

2 stimulus money that's not being spent can certainly  
3 be used for this program.

4 Again, Chancellor, Deputies and Chiefs, I want to  
5 thank you all for your time, and Chairs, thank you.

6 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you.

7 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll call  
8 on Council Member Brooks-Powers.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

10 Hi, and good morning. It's great to see you,  
11 Chancellor, and the team. I have some questions for  
12 the Department of Education and School Construction.  
13 I just want to ask all the questions and then allow  
14 both agencies to answer afterwards. So for the  
15 Department of Education, since the start of the  
16 pandemic, what mechanisms and resources have you  
17 enabled to ensure students in under-resourced areas  
18 have access to reliable broadband or other internet  
19 service? Especially for students in temporary  
20 housing? How have you been able to reach students  
21 that do not have access to reliable broadband? This  
22 is a consistent thing that I've been hearing in the  
23 community in terms of concerns throughout the  
24 pandemic, but even beyond. What was the success rate  
25 of your hotspot lending program? Do you plan to work

2 with the same providers to expand access? And how is  
3 AARP funding to expand its reach?

4 For School Construction Authority, many areas  
5 citywide like Edgemere in my districts are bracing  
6 for an influx of new development and residents as a  
7 result of new zoning projects and other significant  
8 housing investments. How are the department of  
9 Education and School Construction Authority preparing  
10 to meet the needs of families and residents in the  
11 areas experiencing significant growth? How has the  
12 pandemic affected the school construction authorities  
13 ability to complete capital projects in a timely  
14 manner? Are there any other factors causing delay?  
15 And I know I've been in communication with both  
16 agencies, pertaining to, one, the need for an actual  
17 school as a part of the Arverne East project where I  
18 know one has been sited, but still not anything put  
19 in motion for it, but then also in Arverne-By-The-  
20 Sea, there was a school promised to the community  
21 about 15 years ago, and through substantial delays  
22 from the past Administration, inflation has left a  
23 gap, and it is a \$7 million gap. I want to  
24 understand how we can be able to resolve that so that  
25

2 they can be shovels in the ground for that school for  
3 the community. Thank you.

4 CHANCELLOR BANKS: So why don't we... why don't  
5 we start out with the issue around operations  
6 broadband and the hotspots? Camille Joseph Varlack,  
7 you've been, you've been driving that work. Do you  
8 want to provide some support around that?

9 SENIOR ADVISOR VARLACK: Thank you. Thank you,  
10 Chancellor. Thank you for the question. Actually,  
11 I'm going to ask our Chief Technology Officer,  
12 Anuraag Sharma, to go ahead and respond in detail  
13 with respect to the broadband and access questions.

14 CHIEF INFORMATION OFFICER SHARMA: Thank you for  
15 thank you for the question. You know, we are very,  
16 very committed to making sure that our students have  
17 the right devices and access to broadband when it  
18 comes to their academics. And so from the start of  
19 the pandemic, we have distributed over 675,000 LTE  
20 enabled devices, both Chromebooks and iPads. All of  
21 the services are split between two providers,  
22 Verizon, as well as T Mobile. So we continue to work  
23 with our schools as and when more device needs come  
24 up, we fulfill those across our school system.

2 In addition, we've also distributed over 29,000  
3 hotspots, which have coverage as well, LTE coverage.  
4 And so schools are still able to request more  
5 hotspots as they need them. And we are able to  
6 fulfill those requests. And so right now we have  
7 inventory on both devices and hotspots for schools  
8 that... that need them they work through... through  
9 our team. They request them and we were able to get  
10 them in in very short order. So you know, we will  
11 continue to work on this program and expand as we  
12 need it for both LTE services across our system.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS. Thank you.

14 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Nina. There were a number of  
15 questions around the school construction return.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS. Yes, hi, Nina. I  
17 don't see you on the screen through.

18 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Did we lose her? She's trying  
19 to... she's trying to unmute let's give her a second.

20 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: You should be able to unmute  
21 yourself, Nina.

22 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Council Member said please.  
23 She doesn't want to lose her time.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS. I graciously ask  
3 for an extension of time from my Chairs to get my  
4 response. The connectivity of this broadband.

5 VICE PRESIDENT LIU: I'm not sure. Nina might be  
6 having some technical difficulties. This is Cora Liu,  
7 from the School Construction Authority. So I can try  
8 to answer your questions... some of your questions,  
9 Council Member Powers, I think your first question  
10 was about development.

11 We do work with all city agencies, whether it's  
12 city planning EDC, HPD, when there are both city  
13 lands as well as private development. So to make sure  
14 we are involved in the planning phase, and  
15 there are many times when there is the need or there  
16 is the possibility for land to be reserved, we try to  
17 grab them and to make sure that school planning is  
18 part of the overall rezoning planning. We review...  
19 review the citywide permit data for your buildings  
20 and development data from other developments annually  
21 to make sure we have the most comprehensive  
22 information in our planning for new seats.

23 I think your next question was about COVID's  
24 impact on our project schedule. Um, we definitely  
25 had... our project schedule has suffered from COVID.

2 There was a period of time all our projects were  
3 paused. So some of the projects were delayed. We  
4 have communicated with schools and other communities  
5 and stakeholders to make sure they understand the  
6 impact, that we're doing our best to try to catch up  
7 and make sure the schedules do not slip any further.

8 I think your third question was about the charter  
9 school... or the school that's planned as part  
10 Arverne-By-The-Sea development. As you know, we've  
11 been working with your office, as well as other  
12 agencies and city halls to try to fulfill the  
13 commitment of that, helping build a night school.

14 We have followup meeting, I think, scheduled for  
15 next week that we will hopefully to talk to you with  
16 more details about how to... how to help the charter  
17 organization and school to make it happen. So we  
18 love to connect with you more next time... next week.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS. Thank you. Thank  
20 you so much for that. And thank you for the work that  
21 you all do, because it School Construction Authority  
22 isn't normally a leader around MWBE's, and thank you  
23 Chancellor for your responses as well.

24 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you.

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll  
3 call on Council Member Hanif

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you so much. I have  
6 a couple questions, and I'd like to start with how  
7 much will it cost the D.O.E. to fill the additional  
8 1,363 current vacancies for school safety agents?  
9 Does the current administration plan to fill these  
10 vacancies, and how many?

11 And then as a follow up to that, I wanted to  
12 know, just based on some of the education equity  
13 advocates we've been working with, the recommended  
14 ratios of social workers and guidance counselors to  
15 adequately meet the needs of students is one social  
16 worker and one guidance counselor for every 150  
17 students in most schools, and one for every 50  
18 students in high-needs schools. And then to reach the  
19 recommended ratios over the next five years, the city  
20 should invest \$150 million to hire 500 new counselors  
21 and social workers this year. The current  
22 administration's prioritization of funding,  
23 additional school policing, infrastructure, culture  
24 and practices in a school system, where not every  
25 school has a social worker is absolutely

2 unacceptable. Will the administration commit to  
3 invest \$150 million to hire 500 new counselors and  
4 help students grow and thrive instead of hiring new  
5 school cops to replace current vacancies?

6 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Thank you,  
7 Councilmember for the question. In terms of the  
8 school safety agent question, they're employees of  
9 the New York City Police Department. So we would  
10 defer those questions to them around cost estimates.

11 And then in terms of the social worker question,  
12 I'll start and then turn that over to Dr. Johnson.  
13 From our team to speak more. We have used stimulus  
14 funding to make great strides in the investment of  
15 social workers directly in our schools. We've added  
16 600 social workers, guidance counselors, and other  
17 school psychologists with this funding, which has  
18 been hugely helpful and successful. And we continue  
19 that investment over the next couple of years. In  
20 addition, with the increase in the Fair Student  
21 Funding Floor, this school year, we've seen schools  
22 use that funding in some instances to also hire  
23 additional... additional social workers and  
24 counselors. And so I think we have seen investments  
25 in that area. We're always looking to do more, and

2 I'll turn it over to Dr. Johnson to share more  
3 details.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you.

5 CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you, Council Member for the  
6 question. I think, at the core of your question is  
7 this notion of how we provide supports to young  
8 people. And so by increasing the ratio of guidance  
9 counselors and social... social workers, as well as  
10 school-based mental health supports for young people,  
11 we provide greater access. I think we've got to  
12 rethink how we are actually calculating the ratio,  
13 and think about how we increase the number of people  
14 who have access to support for young people, both  
15 clinical supports, as well as non-clinical supports.

16 And so in doing so, we've... we've activated...  
17 in addition to the hiring that Lindsay mentioned,  
18 we've also activated Healing Centered Ambassadors,  
19 who are community and family members who are trained  
20 in de-escalation strategies, different engagement  
21 strategies. If you think about... if you think about  
22 it in this way: If we're able to activate and  
23 support community members, we actually have a  
24 generational strategy, because young people come from  
25 homes. And if young people are experiencing trauma,

2 a lot of times communities are experiencing trauma.  
3 So by activating the Healing Centered Ambassadors,  
4 we've been able to really deepen community  
5 strategies. We have Healing Centered Ambassadors  
6 across all of the districts, but we welcome funding  
7 to... to activate more. And we also are... we've  
8 launched a smaller pilot to deepen that work and have  
9 Healing Centered projects, where community members  
10 work in tandem with the social workers and guidance  
11 counselors within the community to think about  
12 targeted projects and to support young people to  
13 provide greater support.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: And how much funding is  
15 going towards the Healing Centered Ambassadors and  
16 how many exist right now across city schools?

17 CHIEF JOHNSON: So there are... I can get back to  
18 you in terms of the... the full funding, but there  
19 are 92 Healing Ambassadors across... across 16  
20 targeted districts. We have a smaller pilot that  
21 we've launched to deepen... to deepen the work across  
22 an additional 20 targeted schools and locations.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: I really appreciate that.  
24 And I absolutely want to agree with your approach. I  
25 think that is the approach that's absolutely critical

2 to just the city's recovery at this moment. So  
3 really excited to learn more about the Healing  
4 Centered Ambassadors initiative.

5 And then very quickly, I want to ask about  
6 culturally competent curricula. The research is  
7 clear that students that engage in a curriculum that  
8 embraces and affirms their identities and cultures  
9 perform better and graduate at higher rates. Yet,  
10 according to a report from the New York City  
11 Coalition for Educational Justice, 84% of books in 10  
12 commonly used elementary school curricula are written  
13 by white authors, and 51% have white main characters  
14 despite the fact that 85% of the city's public school  
15 students are black, Latinx, or Asian. What percent  
16 of percentage of current New York City students have  
17 access to a culturally responsive sustaining  
18 education? How many dollars in this proposed budget  
19 are dedicated to CRSE programming? And how does this  
20 compare to previous budgets? That is the first  
21 component. And then: Will the city commit to  
22 inclusion of Asian American history in any plans for  
23 culturally responsive education and curricula? You  
24 know, with increased... increase in targeted hate  
25 experienced in our Asian American communities and

2 resulting in trauma. It's just critical that CRSE in  
3 our city is inclusive of Asian American history.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Yes, thank you.

5 Thank you for that question, Council Member Hanif.

6 We're really excited actually about what we are able  
7 to... what we are proposing to do, actually, what  
8 we've already started to do with the collaboration of  
9 community organizations. We are building out a range  
10 of different curricula that reflect the ethnicity and  
11 history and... and lives of our varied student  
12 population. So we are in the process of building out  
13 a Black Studies curriculum that is actually happening  
14 through a number of community based organizations  
15 with the partnership with the Department of  
16 Education. We are also building out an AAPI  
17 curriculum, again, with universities and local  
18 organizations and the participation of varied members  
19 of the community as well. We already implemented an  
20 LGBTQ plus curriculum.

21 And each of these, the exciting part of this is  
22 that they are being integrated into what already  
23 exists. So our API and LGBTQ plus, for example, have  
24 already been... or we're working on rather, embedding  
25 them into our passports, social studies curriculum

2 that is already present in over 90% of our schools.  
3 We are also working with each of these groups to make  
4 sure that we can integrate parts of these curricula  
5 into our different existing content areas, so that it  
6 isn't exclusively a part of social studies. But we  
7 want to make sure, more than anything, that a range  
8 of students can... can see the information and must  
9 see the information and not relegate it exclusively  
10 to a an elective course that maybe only happens in a  
11 high school that chooses to take it. And so that's  
12 one way that we're doing that. And we... for the  
13 AAPI, hope to pilot some of those lessons in the  
14 coming year, and then we will again, it's a 2-year  
15 process to complete the whole curriculum.

16 The... In terms of the other portions of CRSE  
17 that you've mentioned, we continue to use the  
18 framework that was developed with a partnership with  
19 NYU, and so that work continues and has not... has  
20 not slowed down actually, and it is going to be a  
21 very big part of what we will do and it's partnership  
22 actually, between Dr. Johnson's department in my own,  
23 that will work on making sure that all of our schools  
24 are building in culturally responsive curricula,  
25 culturally responsive practices, and culturally

2 responsive classroom libraries. One of the things  
3 that our team has also been working on is increasing  
4 the diversity of the texts that are available to our  
5 children through the online library. So through  
6 Sora, our kids have access to a range of books. And  
7 in fact, part of the Mosaic funding last year was  
8 used to create... or to send, actually, to schools  
9 diverse library collections, and we'll continue to do  
10 that this year, as well. And we are still building  
11 out Mosaic. And so we're really, really excited about  
12 that work. I know that we started the parent  
13 engagement last year, and so we're going to continue  
14 with that work. We've put together a small team that  
15 will build that out as well. And so you'll see that  
16 coming in, in future years, too.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: That's really wonderful.  
18 Exciting. I'd love to be invited to a classroom to  
19 see like how the API curriculum or the Black Studies  
20 programming is taught. I would be really excited. I  
21 was a Women's and Gender Studies major at Brooklyn  
22 College. And that was, I think, my first  
23 experience... sort of reading authors of diversity in  
24 the classroom. And so I would love to be engaged in

2 that. And then do you have a budget number that is  
3 going towards the CRSE in the... in the fiscal year?

4 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Councilmember, I  
5 can speak to that. We're finalizing the budget based  
6 on the feedback from Carolyn and the Chancellor and  
7 others, and we'll be able to share an update soon.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you so much. My  
9 time is up. But I'll be following up with more  
10 questions about school bathrooms to the SCA. Thank  
11 you.

12 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next, we'll  
13 hear from Council Member Narcisse, followed by  
14 councilmembers Louis, Stephens, Baron and Carr, but  
15 we'll turn to Council Member Narcisse.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Good morning. Good  
18 morning Chair... Both chairs, Justin and Ritalin, and  
19 Chancellor, thank you for staying so long, and every  
20 step that make it possible. Thank you.

21 One of the question that I have while I was here  
22 is for SCA first. I'm hearing from the business  
23 perspective, being in business, I'm listening to Ms.  
24 \_\_\_\_\_ bringing the precast panel, right? So when  
25 your bring the precast panel, you're going to take

2 jobs out of the local. So I want to know how many  
3 masonry that producing block in our city, block  
4 manufacturers that we have. And I want... I would  
5 like for you to keep in mind when you take  
6 manufacturers, and most of those manufacturers are  
7 located usually in the places where people who need  
8 the most, and those school... those children are  
9 going to the school that they build, and they are  
10 taxpayers. So I want to know how it's going to  
11 affect them, because they're usually in a place where  
12 people need those jobs. SCA?

13 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you. I think I have  
14 this, right? Thank you, Council Member for that  
15 question, and apologies to the entire council for  
16 freezing. I'm glad Cora was able to address some of  
17 your questions.

18 So I think I mentioned before that... that, yes,  
19 while we look at precast as an alternative, we are  
20 not eliminating the use of brick and block. In fact,  
21 you know, I sort of alluded to this, most of our  
22 schools we are only building probably, you know, in  
23 the last couple of years, using precast as a... as a  
24 cost effective, accessible, and typically faster way  
25 of delivering new schools. But the remaining 1300 to

2 1400 of our school buildings are brick and block, and  
3 when we replace that -- which we do. We spend a lot  
4 of money on our masonry and our parapets, making sure  
5 that our buildings are watertight -- we are... we are  
6 replacing them in kind... So with brick and block.  
7 So it is a very small percentage of what we're doing.  
8 And again, we are just exploring different...  
9 different methods. You know, 20 years ago, there was  
10 a lot of, you know... do we do rainscreen? Do we  
11 do...? You know, almost all sorts of delivery  
12 methods in terms of exploring cost and speed.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Yeah, I understand that  
14 we have to be cost effective. And I'm one of the  
15 person that don't like waste, but at the same time, I  
16 have to keep in mind, who we are affecting the long  
17 term, not the short term, not what... what's in front  
18 of us. I thank you for that. I'm happy to hear that  
19 is a very small portion. We still have to maintain  
20 cost effectiveness

21 But in terms of the transfer, I have a problem  
22 with the transfer for the school. I know, we have  
23 five transfer schools, which is for the young folks  
24 that just arrived to America. So, for me, I know  
25 there's five transfer schools. And four of them are

2 in Manhattan. So what happened with Bronx, Brooklyn,  
3 Queens, Staten Island and all? Because we have so  
4 many, especially when it comes to Brooklyn. Who can  
5 answer that for me?

6 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you for that  
7 question. One of the things that we have actually  
8 planned for upcoming school year is to expand the  
9 number of transfer schools that currently serve the  
10 needs of our English language learner population.  
11 And what we're looking to do is twofold: Wherever  
12 possible in future years to develop standalone  
13 schools, and wherever possible, actually, what we  
14 would prefer to do is to design, or redesign,  
15 existing transfer schools so that they can meet the  
16 needs of our English language learners by using  
17 models that are already successful. So one example  
18 of that is Ellis in the Bronx: We visited. They  
19 have great programs in place, a high literacy focus,  
20 and we want to make sure that we are using the  
21 leadership and the teachers that are there to design  
22 some of those transfer schools. And we are paying  
23 attention to those districts where they don't  
24 currently exist, where we have high numbers of  
25 students that have need, so that we can build those

2 in those spaces. And so we're working very closely  
3 with our school design folks, to make those decisions  
4 and to build those out as we can.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you, as an ELL  
6 student myself, I know that the rates of dropping  
7 out, and all this is can be addressed by making sure  
8 that they are accessible within the distance of  
9 one's... one's home. We know how young folks are.  
10 If their school is very far, there's a lot of excuses  
11 that we're going to get.

12 In terms of mental health, I'm very concerned as  
13 a nurse for so many decades... for three decades,  
14 actually. Last year, we allocated \$5 million, right?

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: to make sure the school  
17 that addressed the mental health crisis and the  
18 services that was provided. So I want to know that  
19 in the school now, how are we going to continue  
20 having the needs that we need in our school building,  
21 especially with this pandemic, what we're dealing  
22 with?

23 CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you for the question,  
24 Councilmember. As I mentioned before, what we  
25 recognize is that mental health is layered and

2 complex. And so the idea of how we leverage clinical  
3 supports, as well as non-clinical supports are going  
4 to be critically important. When we think about the  
5 clinical supports that we have been able to invest  
6 and add the resources to the school community, we've  
7 been able to add 600 social workers to ensure that  
8 students at every school have access to either a  
9 guidance counselor, a social worker, or school based  
10 mental health center. And so access to the resources  
11 when young people need them are available to them.  
12 And then this notion of how we think about expanding  
13 access outside of that clinical support to engage  
14 community work: At this point, it is privately  
15 funded. And so being able to think about ways to  
16 leverage that funding, on a greater scale, I think,  
17 is a way that we get to maximize the mental health  
18 supports for young people in this critical time,  
19 because we know that it takes a village in order to  
20 support our young people.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Oh, I appreciate that.  
22 And I know my time is up, but we are talking about  
23 \$9.2 million, we talking about for the violence anti  
24 violence program in our school interruption program.  
25 So I want to find out if we did... I mean if D.O.E.

2 is going to provide any funding to utilize or hire  
3 restorative justice coordinators? Because that's one  
4 of the things that I had in mind. How does this  
5 initiative fall in D.O.T. existence? And how will you  
6 identify the school and CBOs to partner with? Because  
7 that's the key importance because the people in the  
8 community knows the community's best than anybody  
9 else.

10 CHIEF JOHNSON: No, I think that is a great  
11 question, Councilmember. And thank you for that  
12 question. I think when we talk about violence  
13 interruption, and we talk about restorative justice,  
14 restorative practices, we are really talking about  
15 how we are leveraging trusting relationships amongst  
16 young people. And so when we look at the intersection  
17 between restorative practices, and engaging  
18 restorative... restorative coordinators who can work  
19 within the school base, we know that our young people  
20 are in school for a certain number of hours, and then  
21 they go into the community, they go home. And so the  
22 idea of how we leverage our community partners to  
23 ensure that young people have support, to build  
24 trusting relationships, and also to intervene in  
25 those instances where they have been exposed to

2 community levels of violence and access. And so I  
3 think you and I were both at a school earlier this  
4 week talking about anti-gun violence, violence,  
5 engaging with a community... community partners who  
6 are doing justice work. And so we are currently  
7 working to... to allocate the funding to community  
8 based partners who are able to really kind of that  
9 engaged support... boots on the ground support, in  
10 addition to our restorative practices that we've  
11 already activated and engaged.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you so much,  
13 Chancellor. I'm going to be reaching out to you, you  
14 know why, already. Thank you.

15 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll turn  
16 to Councilmember Lewis.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you so much. Good  
19 morning, everyone. Thank you Chair Joseph and Chair  
20 Brannan. Thank you for highlighting in your  
21 questions class size, arts, music and programming and  
22 Executive Budget. Chancellor, I'm happy to see you  
23 and your whole team. Thank you for your diligence.  
24 I'll ask a couple of questions, and hopefully it can  
25 be answered here or via email. I look forward to

2 working with all of you. So regarding chronic  
3 absenteeism, reports showing that so far 73% of  
4 students can be considered chronically absent. So I  
5 wanted to know how does D.O.E. plan to address this,  
6 and what steps will the DOE take in the fiscal...  
7 upcoming fiscal budget to ensure that students have  
8 the support they need to be motivated to be present  
9 in the classroom? I also wanted to ask about D.O.E.'s  
10 plan for mental health, career, and guidance  
11 counseling for district 79 schools as well as  
12 district 75? So if that question was answered  
13 earlier, but I wanted to know how much funding was  
14 being put in the fiscal 23 budget for that.

15 And my last question is for SCA, I wanted to  
16 know, regarding infrastructure and addressing the  
17 need for smaller classroom sizes and fast tracking  
18 construction for that, has SCA considered expanding  
19 their MWBE vendors for the FY 23 budget and out years  
20 in order to achieve that goal for our scholars?

21 Thank you so much.

22 CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you so much for the  
23 question, Councilmember Louis. So there are a couple  
24 of questions that you asked. And so I'll address a

2 couple of them, and then I'll defer to my colleague  
3 for the last question.

4       So with regard to chronic absenteeism, what we  
5 know is that in order for young people to learn, they  
6 have to be present in school. And so what we've done  
7 to address chronic absenteeism is we've activated  
8 our... our superintendents, and our borough  
9 community... our borough central offices to really  
10 kind of look at the data for... for chronic  
11 absenteeism. When we think about what the numbers  
12 represent, in order for a young person to be defined  
13 as chronically absent, they need to have missed over  
14 17-plus days. And so when we talk about numbers of  
15 chronic absenteeism, right now, we can't actually  
16 talk about the rates of chronic absenteeism, but we  
17 can talk about projections for chronic absenteeism.  
18 And so what we are currently doing is working in  
19 partnership with our superintendents, as well as our  
20 borough central offices to really think about what it  
21 is, of course, that we can put in place to really  
22 ensure that young people who may have missed several  
23 days up to this point in... are able to continue to  
24 attend every... every day. We know students have to  
25 be present in order for them to learn. And so we've

2 been activating that. We've been working with our  
3 attendance team... our attendance teachers to really  
4 kind of get out and find... make certain that we know  
5 where all the young people are, and to get them back.  
6 And the other part of that is ensuring that our  
7 school practices, curriculum opportunities, provide  
8 engaging experiences that young people want to go to.  
9 So when the chancellor talks about how we're  
10 expanding... expanding career pathways, and providing  
11 more engaging opportunities for young people, that is  
12 also an attendance intervention strategy, because you  
13 got to have a great place that you want to attend.

14 So that was the first question. Um, the second  
15 question with regard to social workers... if you  
16 just give me one moment.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Yeah, and I did hear you  
18 mentioned it earlier. So I apologize. This is  
19 regarding the district 75 and 79 schools as well for  
20 the social worker (inaudible).

21 CHIEF JOHNSON: My apologies.

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: While Dr. Johnson  
23 looks at that the information for that particular  
24 question, I did want to address one of the other  
25 questions that I think I heard you ask was, what are

2 the ways that we will engage students and sort of  
3 bring them back? Right? So Dr. Johnson alluded a  
4 little bit to that when she was talking about the  
5 instructional... instruction, right?, and making sure  
6 that our instructional core is strong, and that we  
7 are engaging students. We also talked a little bit  
8 about... you heard both chancellor and Jade Grieve  
9 talk a little bit about career pathways. And so those  
10 pathways are part of what we want to make sure are  
11 integrated into our core. The supports that were  
12 asked about earlier as well, that tutoring piece that  
13 really... the kids are voting with their feet. The  
14 parents are too. We want to make sure the resources  
15 are in place. And then really exciting, we have some  
16 opportunities to improve our digital learning. And  
17 so we're going to be training teachers to make sure  
18 that they have the tools that they need, and that  
19 they really do know how to access digital processes  
20 and digital strategies that they can use as well.  
21 And really exciting with that digital piece is that  
22 we intend to open to brand new virtual schools, so  
23 that students can have some more flexibility in how  
24 they go to school. And hopefully that will reengage  
25 some of those that...

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

3 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: ... we've lost as  
4 well, and so that we can bring them back in that way  
5 too. But the biggest piece is making sure that our  
6 schools are really reflective of the kids in front of  
7 us, that our teachers are well-trained to meet their  
8 needs, that they have the adequate supports in place,  
9 and that means not only the CRSE pieces that we  
10 talked about, the social work pieces that we talked  
11 about, but also making sure that our teaching and  
12 learning is grounded in inquiry, and is student  
13 centered. And so that that's the kind of support and  
14 training that we will offer across all of our  
15 schools.

16 CHIEF JOHNSON: Sorry, and thank you. My  
17 apologies for the delay, I wanted to ensure that I  
18 was able to give you accurate information.

19 So with regard to the specific ratios for  
20 district 75 and district 79, we'll get back to them.  
21 One of the things that we do know is that for the  
22 social worker support, district 79 students are  
23 connected to their home-based schools. And so they  
24 would still have access to the Social Work support  
25 that's available through their home-based schools.

2 But I'll find out the specific ratio as assigned and  
3 aligned to district 79, which we know supports adult  
4 education and several other... several other non-  
5 traditional academic pathways.

6 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Do we still have time for...

7 (crosstalk)

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: If it's okay, Chair  
9 Brannan and Joseph, my last question was for SCA  
10 regarding MWBEs and construction.

11 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Correct. So... So currently,  
12 we have about 2000 vendors prequalified with us, and  
13 about 1000 of them are MWBE'e. I will say that 61%  
14 of our construction contractors are MWBE firms. So,  
15 you know, we are always looking to expand that. And  
16 how we do that is we work with the smaller firms  
17 through our mentor program. They are all MWBE's, and  
18 we work with them for over six to eight years  
19 mentoring them so that they can bid in sort of the  
20 open market at the SCA. And we started out with...  
21 we've recently changed it, we went to a \$1 million  
22 threshold that they could bid on to \$1.5 to \$2, and  
23 in July, we're going to increase it to \$3. So I will  
24 say we're always looking to attract not just MWBE  
25 firms, but smaller MWBE firms that we can, you know,

2 raise up. Look, we all have room for improvement,  
3 and we're always looking to refine and to, you know,  
4 get better. So I'm always happy to... to, you know,  
5 take some suggestions, but we have a pretty, pretty  
6 well developed program. And we're we want to expand  
7 it not just within the construction industry, but  
8 within our professional services. So that is  
9 something that we're looking to do starting this next  
10 fiscal year.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you, everyone. Thank  
12 you Chairs.

13 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll go  
14 to Councilmember Stevens, followed by councilmember  
15 Barron.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Hi, good morning,  
18 everyone or good afternoon. I do not know what the  
19 time is at this point. Thank you, um, Chairs, for  
20 this hearing. I just have a couple of questions.  
21 And hello D.O.E.. It's very nice to see you guys.

22 So I'll start with my Summer Rising questions,  
23 and then I have some Bronx-wide questions that I  
24 wanted to ask today.

2           Number one, thank you guys. I know you guys have  
3 been super hands on the ground and doing... and doing  
4 a phenomenal job with getting Summer Rising off the  
5 ground, which is a huge task. And I know we've been  
6 meeting and talking consistently, but one of the  
7 things that I'm still getting a lot of calls back and  
8 pushback from is from my parents around the  
9 enrollment process, around how young people who were  
10 in current programs and schools weren't given  
11 priority. And now they're, you know, they're being  
12 told that they have to go to other locations that are  
13 really out the way, and really going to put a  
14 hardship on them. I've gotten calls within the last  
15 week with the same issue from actual parents. So one  
16 would love to hear how we're addressing this issue.

17           The next one is I'm in the D.Y.C.D. budget is we  
18 have Summer Rising baselined until 2026, but that is  
19 not the case in the DOE budget. What does... how do  
20 we plan on continuing this program if only one side  
21 has been funded? So could you talk a little bit  
22 about what that plan looks like?

23           Then another issue that we have and just... this  
24 is the Bronx-wide issue around teacher retention in  
25 the Bronx. We have some of the higher retention

2 rates in the Bronx, around retaining teachers, and  
3 getting teachers who actually want to work in the  
4 Bronx and stay there. So what is the plan? And what  
5 does it look like, um, in the next couple of years to  
6 build up this potential and getting teachers to come  
7 and wanting to stay in the Bronx. And then my last  
8 question, which is for SCA, is around trailers and  
9 one of the districts in the Bronx which is  
10 Councilmember Feliz's district 15. He has over 15  
11 schools that have trailers in his district. Oh...  
12 he's here. So I'll let him ask this question. But  
13 he'll ask that question, so I'll... I'll yield back  
14 for that question. So I'll just go through those  
15 other questions I asked.

16 SENIOR ADVISOR VARLACK: Thank you very much Chair  
17 for... for the question. So we are extraordinarily  
18 pleased the opportunity to speak with both you and  
19 Chair Joseph in most recent weeks about Summer  
20 Rising, and we continue to work to make it sort of  
21 the best summer program that we have had thus far. We  
22 are aware that there are some families that have been  
23 locked out. We have encouraged those families to send  
24 emails to us, and we are retaining that information  
25 and staying in very close contact with them. As you

2 may be aware, last year there certainly were  
3 challenges. And there was a lot of feedback related  
4 to it that we wanted to make sure that we address  
5 this year. One of the feed... one of the... some of  
6 the feedback that we received had to do with making  
7 sure that the quality of the program was as high as  
8 possible, and making sure that we had sufficient  
9 staff for the number of students that we had. So as a  
10 result, we made sure working in partnership with our  
11 D.Y.C.D. partners, that we capped enrollment at  
12 approximately 110,000 students for K through eight,  
13 because we wanted to make sure that we would have  
14 sufficient staffing for all of those... all of those  
15 students. We did prioritize our students in  
16 temporary housing as well as students with 12 months  
17 IEPs, as well as our students that are going to be  
18 mandated for summer school. With respect to families  
19 that unfortunately did not have an opportunity to get  
20 their first choice they certainly have the ability to  
21 choose another spot within Summer Rising, another  
22 location. And separately, they have sent us... many  
23 of them have sent us emails and we are tracking  
24 those. So when enrollment closes, we will have an  
25 opportunity to sort of see which families that have

2 currently signed up for a spot that are continuing  
3 with Summer Rising, we will be actively engaging with  
4 those... with those families over the summer because  
5 we know that many families sign up for a... for a  
6 slot, and then they decide not to go. When those  
7 slots become available, as we believe some will, we  
8 will be reaching out to the families that have  
9 contacted us asking to either switch location or  
10 switch CBO providers.

11 With respect to your question on budget, I will  
12 ask our CFO, Lindsey Oates to take that question.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: I'm gonna... just before  
14 you answer that question, I just wanted to give a  
15 little feedback as well, because we have both  
16 parents... I got an email, basically, a parent was  
17 told that she should just get a babysitter because no  
18 spots will be opened up. So I just want to make sure  
19 that we are having messaging going out to everyone  
20 around providers and how they are relaying those  
21 messages to parents. And I'll be in contact with you  
22 to give you more details. That's a huge issue.

23 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Be sure to get that to us  
24 directly, because we can follow up on that and who

2 told her that. We'll... we'll do some immediate  
3 follow up for sure.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Thank you.

5 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you.

6 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Councilmember...  
7 Thanks, Chancellor. In relation to... in response to  
8 your question about the budget, the Department of  
9 Education has an existing budget that we are using  
10 for Summer Rising and we are also repurposing...

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

12 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: ... about \$176  
13 million in stimulus funding to further expand the  
14 program this year. That's how we funded Summer  
15 Rising in fiscal year 21, and how we will fund the  
16 expanded program in fiscal year 23. And I... I  
17 obviously cannot speak to D.Y.C.D.'s budget, but  
18 we're grateful to have the funding resources to be  
19 able to invest in this really important program this  
20 summer.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: But my concern is that  
22 it is baselined in the D.Y.C.D.'s budget until 2026,  
23 but it's not baselined in D.O.E.'s, so that's...  
24 that's my concern. So what does this program look  
25 like in a year or two when it's not in your budget,

2 but it's in D.Y.C.D.'s budget, and it's literally a  
3 collaboration?

4 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Understood. I  
5 hear your concern, and I appreciate that. And I  
6 think for a lot of these issues, where stimulus  
7 funding is temporarily supporting programs, we're  
8 working with our city partners on solutions for the  
9 out years.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: And then my last  
11 question was just around, um, teacher retention and  
12 the Bronx being very high. And what are we doing to  
13 address that?

14 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Yeah. Thank you,  
15 Councilmember. You know, we're fortunate that  
16 teacher retention across the city is quite high,  
17 particularly in relation to what you see in other big  
18 urban districts. So it's... it's the most recent  
19 figures or teacher retention is about 94%. But  
20 you're 100% right, it tends to be higher in the  
21 Bronx. And so this is something we've got to be  
22 laser focused on. Part of... part of the strategy for  
23 that is fully funding F.S.F. which benefits  
24 disproportionately -- which is a good thing --  
25 schools in the Bronx, gives principals there more

2 resources so that teachers there feel better support,  
3 and that could be in the form of lower class size,  
4 that could be in the form of additional programming,  
5 that could be in the form of additional mental health  
6 support to CBO partnerships. But we're... we're not  
7 standing pat on that. That's a number we watch very,  
8 very closely, and would love to talk to you about  
9 what you are hearing, and what... what additional  
10 targeted supports we can provide to make sure that we  
11 have a level playing field, that the principals and  
12 other leaders in the Bronx have the same opportunity  
13 to access talent, which is the most important thing:  
14 Access teaching talent and other staff talent, as  
15 they do in Manhattan or the other boroughs.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: No, I really appreciate  
17 that. But I think this is a major issue. And this is  
18 a service to our kids. So we definitely have to  
19 continue to work together in partnership and  
20 collaboration, not with just me, but with all the  
21 council members to really address this, because you  
22 know, with having teachers not saying, it has a toll  
23 on the kids... on the young people that we serve. So  
24 I definitely look forward to continue partnering with  
25 you guys on this issue. And, you know, although I

2 always have very pointed questions about Summer  
3 Rising, it is it is going well, and I just want to  
4 give you guys kudos for the continued collaboration  
5 between both D.Y.C.D. and D.O.H., because it's not an  
6 easy task, but you guys are getting it done. So  
7 thank you.

8 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll turn  
9 to Councilmember Barron.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very much,  
12 Chancellor, welcome. I was so perplexed and puzzled  
13 Chancellor. I thought you and the mayor were tight,  
14 and he's cutting a billion dollars from your budget  
15 and you tried to fix it to make it seem like that's  
16 alright. But uh, we'll talk about that when you come  
17 visit me.

18 CHANCELLOR BANKS: I'm coming to see you real  
19 soon too.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I know. You're on the  
21 schedule. But I thought you had it like that. I  
22 expected to see an increase in the budget, not a  
23 decrease. Anyway, I want to talk about how do we  
24 measure success? You know, oftentimes it is measured  
25 by the graduation rate.

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Right.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: But I want to know the  
4 status on college readiness, and career preparedness.

5 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Right.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Because the diploma means  
7 nothing if they're not prepared for a career or ready  
8 for college. And last I heard is that 80% of the  
9 students that are going into CUNY need remediation...

10 CHANCELLOR BANKS: That's right.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ... after coming through  
12 the system. So that's one thing. Secondly, they are  
13 predicting another crisis, another breakout for  
14 COVID. What are we going to do as a contingency plan  
15 for... if there's a COVID? outbreak in September? I  
16 know we talked about it. Y'all said you were doing  
17 stuff about it. We never heard a whole lot back.  
18 Will there be a virtual option for parents? Which I  
19 think should still happen right now. But I'd like  
20 for you to address that: Are we ready? Are we ready  
21 for that? And also the colocation of charter schools  
22 in our buildings. That's... that's horrific.  
23 Buildings that we're designed for one principal, and  
24 one school, now have four principals, four schools,  
25 and it's cutting back on the very class size and

2 class expansion that we need for the students. So I  
3 want to know about that. And my wife, Inez Barron,  
4 former Council Member, Assemblymember, Senator Robert  
5 Jackson, and myself: We fought so hard for campaign  
6 for fiscal equity. And we got it \$1.5 billion for  
7 the next three years -- because of the federal money,  
8 not the state -- but how was that being used? Is that  
9 getting to our schools? Because sometimes we fight  
10 for these things, and we never see the benefits of  
11 it. I want to thank Council Member Hanif for that  
12 brilliant breakdown of the cultural relevant  
13 curriculum. I think we should heed to what she's  
14 saying.

15 And the School Construction Authority: A \$20.6  
16 billion budget, how many new schools are being built  
17 in black and brown communities? I had to fight. I  
18 got a couple in mine, but that was a real battle.  
19 I'm concerned about all over. And then the contracts  
20 have to not just be for \$1 million or \$2 million.  
21 There are some black companies that can handle the  
22 same kind of contract that these white construction  
23 companies get.

24 And then is... Chancellor, is there still a  
25 rubber room? Do they still have that? I know you

2 may have changed the name, but is the... is the  
3 concept still the same when teachers are punished,  
4 because a lot of black faculty got stuck in rubber  
5 room years ago for some penalties. I wonder if that  
6 still exists, even if it's a change in name, what's  
7 the status of that?

8       And then also, how are you addressing the needs  
9 in black and brown communities? We need to computer  
10 labs, the science labs, the library updates, music  
11 teachers with the equipment, sports programs, after  
12 school programs, and wraparound services in our  
13 community.

14       And then finally, what are we going to do about  
15 civic and career education? You know, I really think  
16 that civic responsibility is important. Career  
17 education is important. There's one school in  
18 Manhattan that has career education school. It is  
19 really awesome. I'd like to have one in my district  
20 as well. So these are some of the questions, because  
21 firmly I believe that education should be for  
22 liberation. Education should be teaching our  
23 students about the true nature of the system they  
24 live under: A racist, colonial capitalist system,  
25 and we should tell the truth and not be afraid of

2 C.R.T. or whatever they're talking about. But the  
3 capitalist system... our children need to know about  
4 capitalism, socialism, African communalism,  
5 communism. Teach them about all the systems and how  
6 they work, because when they come out, the only thing  
7 they know is about a capitalist system that is  
8 inherently... inherently working against them, even  
9 if they get a PhD. So we got to... and I know,  
10 Commissioner Banks, that you're down with me with the  
11 revolution, so I know that you're going to be  
12 teaching our kids how to radically... radically --  
13 just meaning getting to the root of the problem --  
14 radically change this system. I appreciate it if you  
15 would respond to some of these questions.

16 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Which ones you want me to  
17 respond to? All of that?

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: All of them! (laughs)  
20 All of the above.

21 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Listen, let me just say this:  
22 I greatly appreciate you. I appreciate the spirit in  
23 which you asked all those questions. And I think at  
24 the core of all of it is really about... it really is  
25 about liberation. It's about transformation. I did

2 not come here to stand into defense of a system that  
3 has fundamentally failed so many of our children,  
4 particularly black and brown children. And I'm fully  
5 committed to the transformation of this system. I've  
6 said it from the time that I got here, and I will  
7 continue to do that. This team that I have, that we  
8 have assembled is fully committed to that as well.  
9 So just very quickly, you talked about college and  
10 career readiness, and this... this system has not  
11 done a good enough job.

12 We graduate children, but we don't graduate them  
13 with enough of an understanding, so that they... and  
14 the skills that they need to be successful in  
15 college, certainly not in careers. That's why this  
16 work that we're doing on Career Pathways is something  
17 that we're leaning into. We believe very deeply in  
18 it. We're going to give kids while they're in middle  
19 school and high school a real insight into what the  
20 real world actually looks like, and how they can be  
21 fully prepared to take their place in this 21st  
22 century economy. We're not just going to school,  
23 just to be going to school.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: But Chancellor, do you  
25 have any numbers on that? What's the percentage...

2 the last latest percentage on college readiness and  
3 career preparedness?

4 CHANCELLOR BANKS: I don't have it off the top my  
5 head, but we can certainly... about 58%, in terms of  
6 even college and career, particularly in...

7 (crosstalk)

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And in some schools...  
9 some schools, it's even lower than that. It is very  
10 low.

11 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Absolutely. What it says is  
12 that we've got major work to do. It also connects to  
13 why we still have lost so many of our kids. It also  
14 connects to this whole notion of disengagement, and  
15 why it's hard to get teachers to come and work in the  
16 Bronx. These are all pieces of a puzzle that are  
17 working together, because there are some fundamental  
18 flaws in how we are doing our work in the first  
19 place, how we are measuring our schools. This is  
20 something that we're working together, even with our  
21 state representatives, that we should not measure the  
22 success of a school purely on standardized exams.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: That's right.

24 CHANCELLOR BANKS: You can do well on  
25 standardized exams all day and have no idea what the

2 City Council does. So when you talk about civic...  
3 civic education, that is something that we're leaning  
4 into, when I talk about the reimagined student  
5 experience. I want every child who graduated from  
6 the New York City public school, to be ready not only  
7 to vote, but to be able to take their rightful place  
8 in this democracy and understand how to make change  
9 within this system. You cannot make change if you  
10 have no idea what's going on. I want young people to  
11 be out here, be prepared to vote. I want them to  
12 come to your town hall meetings. I want them to  
13 understand what the attorney general does. There  
14 should be a student government in every school in New  
15 York City and there will be. So we... I just got  
16 here in January, and we've been using this time to  
17 try and just put a plan together. We are still in  
18 the midst of all that. So as we get into September,  
19 we'll really be able to hit the ground... hit the  
20 ground running.

21 As it relates to some of the issues around  
22 colocation, you know, we're doing the best that we  
23 can. There's not a lot of appetite at the state  
24 level for the continued creation of more and more  
25 charter schools. We're seeing less of that. But

2 what I do believe is that charter schools and  
3 traditional public schools have a lot that we can  
4 learn from each other. And we've got to... we've got  
5 to eliminate that divide. At the end of the day,  
6 they're all of our kids, and we've got to make sure  
7 that we're learning. When charter schools were  
8 created in the first place, they were meant to be  
9 places of innovation that the entire system would  
10 learn from, and somewhere along the way we got away  
11 from there. And as I've met with charter school  
12 leaders, I told them, I'm interested in scaling what  
13 they have learned, and share that across schools.  
14 But I'm also want to make sure that you know that we  
15 got traditional public schools that are doing amazing  
16 things, I'm sure in some of your district...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: That's right.

18 CHANCELLOR BANKS: ... this idea that it's only  
19 that the charter schools that are doing great things  
20 is not true. There are great charter schools, and  
21 they are great public... traditional public schools.  
22 And we got to all work together to share...

23 (crosstalk)

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: But Chancellor, on that  
25 real quick: You're absolutely right on the original

2 intent of charter schools. That was to be a model  
3 for the rest of the schools, not setting up another  
4 tier education system, and then the private sector  
5 that's behind them, the hedge funds that's behind the  
6 charter schools and fronts, not for profits, let them  
7 pay for it. Not... don't take it out of our public  
8 school money. They're hiding behind there, creating  
9 not for profits. Let them pay for the physical  
10 facilities for charter schools.

11 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Well, at the end of the day,  
12 charter schools are public schools, and parents...  
13 (crosstalk)

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: They say... they say  
15 public charter, but I'm not... don't mean to be  
16 rude... but a public charter is an oxymoron. You are  
17 either owned by the public school system, are you  
18 owned by a private not for profit or for profit.  
19 There's no in between Chancellor.

20 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Well, listen, I'm not... I'm  
21 not here for that debate. That's for another time,  
22 but I am here simply to say, I was asked by this  
23 Mayor to be the Chancellor of the school system, and  
24 in doing that, my responsibility is to the children  
25 who are in these traditional public schools, to give

2 them the best quality education that we possibly can.  
3 That's what I am committed to. As relates to the  
4 virtual option, that is something I believe that  
5 if... if we are, God forbid, hit with another massive  
6 surge, and we got to close our schools down, I  
7 believe that we are much better prepared now than we  
8 were before. So much so that we will be announcing -  
9 - and you heard a little bit mentioned today around  
10 some virtual school options that are going to be full  
11 time options where kids will be able to go to school  
12 virtually -- we're going to use that... those schools  
13 as also labs of innovation. We want to learn from  
14 that, so that in fact informs how we will teach  
15 virtually to all of our kids. I believe that virtual  
16 learning is here to stay, whether or not we have a  
17 pandemic or not. And we want to look at it from a  
18 positive standpoint and figure out how do we use that  
19 technology so that kids can think beyond the four  
20 walls of the classroom and be exposed to the best  
21 teaching the best experiences all over the world.  
22 They ought to be global. So you can't be a global  
23 citizen with a neighborhood mentality.

24 SERGEANT SADOWSKI: Time expired.

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: ... the larger work, and  
3 that's what we tried to do. So I did my best to  
4 answer all 85 of your questions, and we can certainly  
5 follow up at a later time.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'll get the other 70  
7 when you come to meet us.

8 CHANCELLOR BANKS: You got it, Charles.

9 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we will  
10 call on Council Member Carr, followed by  
11 councilmembers Brewer, Faris, De La Rosa, Hanks, and  
12 we have others, but we'll turn to Councilmember Carr.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you so much. Thank  
15 you to our Chairs for putting together this hearing  
16 on the Exec Budget. Chancellor, it's good to see you  
17 as always. You know, you talked about charters, you  
18 know, conceived as a model for innovation, and you  
19 came and saw on yourself in my district earlier this  
20 year Bridge Prep, which is serving students who have  
21 dyslexia. And you know, as you heard from the  
22 parents there, you know, they and their children are  
23 looking forward to the future, and looking for a high  
24 school model that does what Bridge Prep is already  
25 doing. I'm glad to see that, you know, we're

2 investing more for dyslexic students, but I was  
3 wondering if you had any thoughts on that, and if  
4 you're willing to work with us to create that high  
5 school model so that students have that option as  
6 they age out of Bridge Prep?

7 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Absolutely. And we certainly  
8 want to work with you. I just want to say that was  
9 one of the best visits I've had, to go out there to  
10 Staten Island and to see -- and primarily kids of  
11 color -- who are in this school that has as its focus  
12 students who are suffering from dyslexia. It  
13 completely aligns with what our mayor has been  
14 talking about. We've got to provide the kinds of  
15 services that our kids who have those kinds of  
16 challenges need, and they are there are thousands of  
17 them all across our school system. And so we are  
18 fully committed to doing that. Our Deputy Chancellor  
19 Quintana is leading... leading that work. And so we  
20 are absolutely going to continue to work with you.  
21 She was part of that... that visit as well. And we  
22 thank you also for... for you and former Borough  
23 President Otto for all the work that he did, in  
24 helping to create that model, because it can really  
25 be a real model for so many of our kids. We need to

2 learn from what they what they have done there, and  
3 we are pledging a commitment to you. I know, in the  
4 immediate term, they're looking for what the high  
5 school piece can be. I'm just asking that you stay  
6 working very closely with our Deputy Chancellor  
7 Quintana around that, and we're going to do the best  
8 that we can to be supportive.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Happy to do that. We  
10 really love to. And you're right, it's a very  
11 diverse campus, and they're flourishing students.  
12 And it's an it's great, and I and I hope that it's  
13 something that can be... can be brought to other  
14 boroughs as soon as possible.

15 As far as you know, gifted and talented goes, I'm  
16 really glad to see you know, the administration's  
17 commitment to that. In the past, we never had  
18 sufficient G&T seats on Staten Island. I, you know,  
19 we met many parents who were traveling off borough so  
20 that their children could have that opportunity. And  
21 I just wondering, you know, what... what, you know,  
22 number of seats do you think is sufficient to meet  
23 the need in Staten Island? And when do you think they  
24 would become available? And what's the process for  
25 determining where that's going to be?

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, I'll speak to that a  
3 little bit. (inaudible) the borough, but we are  
4 committed to the concept for sure.

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Yes, thank you. And  
6 thank you Chancellor for pitching the question in  
7 this direction.

8 So as you know, the process that we're using will  
9 pull from each of the different schools that are in a  
10 district. The top 10% of students then become part  
11 of the pool of students eligible for G&T. And so  
12 we're committed to building... or opening at least  
13 one G&T program in each district. And if there is  
14 greater need, and if we have schools and principals  
15 and teachers who are both willing and ready, then we  
16 can take a look at whether or not there's the  
17 capacity to add additional programs. But at the very  
18 least we would have one. And the idea is that  
19 because it is per district, you really can pull first  
20 from the community. So it would add those seats  
21 directly in Staten Island for students from Staten  
22 Island. And I think that that increases some of  
23 those... those opportunities for folks.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: And what's the concept of  
3 what the average program size would be in each  
4 district in terms of seats?

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: So we're opening a  
6 section in kindergarten and in third grade where  
7 there isn't already a kindergarten and third grade,  
8 and we'll use those standard classroom designations  
9 in terms of space, in terms of union policies, and so  
10 we'll make decisions based... And also it really  
11 depends on the number of students that have parents  
12 who actually apply and are interested in the program.  
13 And we'll do our best to, you know, make spaces  
14 available for the number of kids who are invested in  
15 this type of work, and if we need to open additional  
16 programs, and we can certainly look into that.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you. And my last  
18 question is around what some of my colleagues were  
19 raising earlier, which is about the presence of  
20 social workers and guidance counselors in schools.

21 You know, I believe very strongly in a strong  
22 school safety program, but I do think that social  
23 workers and guidance counselors are essential to both  
24 the safety and the wellness of students on campus.  
25 And I'd love to get more details offline about you

2 know, what we have in our schools here on Staten  
3 Island, and what that is... whether or not that's  
4 meeting, establish metrics.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

6 CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you, Council Member Carr.  
7 I look forward to engaging with you more deeply  
8 around the counseling and social work Support. I  
9 just would like to add at the highest level that  
10 every school across the entire city including the  
11 borough Staten Island, young people have access to a  
12 guidance counselor, social worker, or school based  
13 mental health center. So they do have access to  
14 this resource. What that looks like specific to  
15 your, your district or region, and we can engage at a  
16 later time. So thank you for the question.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: I appreciate that so much.  
18 And thanks for answering my questions. I really  
19 appreciate it.

20 CHIEF JOHNSON: Absolutely.

21 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Council Member  
22 Carr. Next we'll turn to Council Member Brewer.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. Thank you  
24 very much Chancellor and all of D.O.E. I also like  
25 the fact that you're moving the enrollment centers

2 under a superintendent according to the newspapers.

3 So congratulations on many fronts. Nothing is easy.

4 A couple of questions on school food. I've  
5 always pushed to have more summer food opportunities.  
6 It's there but not used. I'm wondering what you're  
7 doing, budget wise, to allocate... to make sure  
8 parents know about the school food. And then  
9 according to the material we have \$25 million and  
10 cafeteria upgrades is possible. I put in some of  
11 those deli to some of the high schools it makes a  
12 huge difference. And I think school food is  
13 important. I know the Mayor talks about plant based,  
14 and that's important. But just to have it... to be an  
15 opportunity to... to use... to make people healthy is  
16 not always done because of how it is presented. So  
17 school food is one.

18 Then the second question I have is just on  
19 literacy: How much has been allocated? You know  
20 better than I that there has been a loss of it during  
21 this pandemic. All the principals are complaining to  
22 me. So what are we doing in terms of specifics? And  
23 also, is there a budget allocation for recruitment of  
24 math and science teachers, particularly, teachers of  
25 color? Because math and science are lacking. I know

2 lots of teacher types are lacking, but that's in  
3 particular.

4 And then in terms of SCA: Bathrooms. I know  
5 somebody, Councilmember Stevens, mentioned it, but I  
6 get all the time: I need new bathrooms. I'm like,  
7 why do I have to pay to not deal with this. So what  
8 are... is there an allocation for bathroom upgrade?  
9 And also, it takes about a year and a half for SCA to  
10 get the technology, even just for smart boards. So  
11 I'm just wondering, is there some other opportunity  
12 for speeding up the money that we use for SCA on  
13 technology?

14 And then finally, everybody's talking about  
15 social workers. I've been talking about for about 30  
16 years. And the question is... I think there's a  
17 March 22 DOE report on social workers. It hasn't  
18 been completed, so... and I think it is mandated. So  
19 I just would hope that you would keep us very much up  
20 to date, because even though we say every school has  
21 a social worker, they don't because we call around.

22 I could go on. But those are some questions, and  
23 I appreciate everything you're doing.

24 SENIOR ADVISOR VARLACK: Thank you, Council  
25 Member, for your... your questions. I'd like to

2 start by just talking a little bit about the school  
3 food program. We are equally as pleased at the  
4 opportunity and the focus from both the Mayor as well  
5 as the Chancellor on school food. And it's  
6 certainly something that we talk about almost daily  
7 here at the department.

8 With respect to the cafeteria enhancement  
9 program, we are incredibly pleased with the progress  
10 that's been made to date. And we are looking to  
11 continue to invest and to move forward with enhancing  
12 those cafeterias across the city with... so that is  
13 certainly ongoing, and we can certainly have a  
14 conversation and share more specifics on... on what  
15 the plan is. And with respect to summer food, we are  
16 also looking forward to having a robust summer food  
17 program over the summer. We are working on  
18 finalizing those details and we will certainly be  
19 moving to advertise about what those programs are  
20 going to be and where they will be located in short  
21 order.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, because usually  
23 it's done the day school ends. So I assume that will  
24 not be true this year. That's been my experience in  
25 the past.

2 SENIOR ADVISOR VARLACK: Yes, that's true. I  
3 believe that advertising will actually be earlier  
4 this year.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I hope so. Then literacy  
6 in math and science.

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: What happened?

8 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Can you repeat that  
9 question, please?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: What's the budget? And  
11 how are we making sure that literacy is funded  
12 appropriately of coaches, of teachers? Kids are not  
13 reading... we... every teacher and every principal  
14 tells me, and I know that from personal experience.  
15 And then are we allocating anything to recruit math  
16 and science teachers, particularly communities of  
17 color? You're really short on math and science  
18 teachers... not to mention other kinds of teachers,  
19 but those are two in particular. And a lot of the  
20 friends I know they're going to the private schools.  
21 Why are they going to the private schools as math  
22 teachers out of the University of Chicago and  
23 elsewhere? New Yorkers? Because it's easier. It's  
24 too hard to become a D.O.E. teacher. So they quickly

2 go to the private schools, and we need them here, not  
3 to mention the charter schools.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you,  
5 Councilmember Brewer, I think Chancellor Banks wanted  
6 to make a comment first.

7 CHANCELLOR BANKS: No no. I'm good.

8 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Alright, then I'll  
9 answer the question. Incredibly important, and I  
10 absolutely agree. We need to be able to better  
11 support our students across our classrooms, not only  
12 those with print-based disabilities, but in general  
13 to make sure that they have the foundation and the  
14 mechanics of reading. And so we're going to, I  
15 think, it mentioned already the...

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

17 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: ...the process to  
18 support folks with the very specific training for  
19 dyslexia, and part of that is also just in general,  
20 bringing in an explicit phonics curriculum in grades  
21 K through two, making sure that we have supports in  
22 place so we are actually building out a team of  
23 coaches who will provide support K through two, a  
24 separate set of coaches for three through five,  
25 another for grades six through eight, and then

2 finally for grades nine through twelve, where we have  
3 not had across K-12. And so we're building this team  
4 of coaches. In addition, we'll be putting AIS points  
5 at every district, at least one at every district --  
6 and in districts with higher needs two or more -- so  
7 that they can provide supports. And for schools that  
8 may have students who may need secondary  
9 interventions, who may need secondary... sorry,  
10 screeners and evaluations. And so those AIS points  
11 will be trained on how to support schools, but also  
12 on how to do those interventions themselves. So  
13 we're... we're offering opportunities to... for  
14 teachers to be trained. Initially, every teacher  
15 will receive free training for dyslexia awareness,  
16 and very specific skills to address the needs in  
17 classrooms. And that are skills that will... or  
18 strategies rather, that will benefit all students.  
19 And as I mentioned, we're going to use evidence-based  
20 foundational literacy programs. So curricula very  
21 specifically that schools will have choices to  
22 acquire, that comes with training. And then just  
23 ensuring that there are tiers of support, depending  
24 on what folks need. We're also employing -- and this  
25 is, I think, something incredibly important for a

2 budget meeting because one way of ensuring that even  
3 after these initial funds are not available in future  
4 years, but and to just to make sure that we don't  
5 need to keep investing in the same ways -- we're  
6 building a train-the-trainer model. And so we're  
7 really working on facilitators who have very explicit  
8 knowledge of... uh, Orton Gillingham, for example, is  
9 one of the... the programs, right?, so we'll use a  
10 train-the-trainer model to make sure that we have  
11 tiers of folks who are trained, and can provide  
12 support, and then additional training. So if they  
13 become certified, they can then train our teachers,  
14 they can train our leaders, and we'll have those  
15 sustainable practices in place.

16 And then as I mentioned, the opening of those two  
17 programs: one standalone school, and one program  
18 embedded within a school, provides a space for almost  
19 like a lab site for teachers to be trained for  
20 leaders to be trained, and for them to see those  
21 practices in place. So that we can build off what's  
22 there.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: What about math  
24 teacher... math teachers recruitment... math, math?

2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: So for math and  
3 science, and actually just any of our areas of need,  
4 right?, so we have an area of need with teachers for  
5 students with disabilities, for bilingual Ed, for a  
6 range of teachers. We're working very closely with  
7 our teacher recruitment and quality folks to recruit  
8 teachers using a range of incentives, including...  
9 sometimes it's not even recruiting brand new  
10 teachers, but rather looking for teachers who may  
11 want to have an extension to their licenses. We're  
12 also working with local institutions. We've been  
13 working with organizations like Burke out of Fordham  
14 University and at the state. I think I mentioned  
15 that I met last week with folks from the state  
16 directly to think about how we better recruit and  
17 prepare teachers. And I think that, you know, part  
18 of it is just making sure that they see this as a  
19 viable option, right?, that teaching is a viable  
20 option.

21 But the other piece is just making sure that  
22 there are adequate supports in place so that our  
23 teachers don't leave, right? If we're creating the  
24 kinds of environments that are really holding and  
25 supporting our teachers, affirming who they are,

2 making sure that they receive development, and  
3 then... then they'll stay. And I think... I don't  
4 know if Dan, if you want to add to that.

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Yep. Thank you.  
6 Thank you, Carolyn. Just... I know, we're out of  
7 time... but councilmember, I would love to talk to  
8 you. Your point is so well taken that it's too  
9 difficult to become a teacher not just in New York  
10 City, but in the state, frankly, we may need your  
11 help.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I don't care about the  
13 state. I only care about New York City.

14 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Sorry.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I just care about the  
16 city. I don't care about the state. I'm serious. I  
17 got it then, go ahead.

18 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Just... just to say  
19 this is something we are really focused on. It's not  
20 only too difficult, but one of the reasons we lose  
21 great talent to like private schools. It's really  
22 expensive. It's really expensive. And one of the  
23 reasons we don't have the diversity that we should in  
24 our teacher core is because it costs a lot of money  
25 to become a teacher. Now we're doing some things...

2 I don't want to say... teaching fellows programs or  
3 other programs where we're trying to address that,  
4 but it's not enough. So we would love to work with  
5 you on that because it is it's a real problem.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Finally, just quickly SCA  
7 on the technology too long and the bathrooms.

8 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you councilmember  
9 quickly on the bathrooms. So we have \$50 million set  
10 aside in our bathroom upgrade program. But that is  
11 in addition to any of the bathrooms that we make  
12 accessible and renovate as part of our accessibility  
13 program as well. And we do do full scale bathroom  
14 upgrades during our full accessibility pro...  
15 projects.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: How much does each  
17 bathroom costs? It's like a million dollars. Some  
18 crazy amount of money.

19 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Yeah, so... so certainly, we  
20 have heard this in the past and we worked with our  
21 colleagues at division of school facilities where we  
22 are now doing a pair of bathrooms for boys and girls  
23 for \$170,000. So under the... under the \$50 million  
24 bathroom upgrade program, we are able to accomplish  
25 150 pairs of bathrooms.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And then my tech.

3 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: On your tech... and  
4 (inaudible) may still be on. But I will say two  
5 things to that. One is that... you know, you're...  
6 you, as a council member and former Borough  
7 President, we're probably talking schools in the  
8 January timeframe getting those allocations ready.  
9 As it goes through the budget process, we don't... we  
10 work with OMB to get the CP from them, probably late  
11 fall even end of the calendar year. So we... you  
12 know, we're trying to strategize with OMB of how we  
13 can get that CP process done quickly. Because we  
14 don't get that funding and we can't do anything, we  
15 can't reach out to the schools and get the orders in  
16 until that's complete. So that coupled with supply  
17 chain issues, I think, is really where you're seeing  
18 the delay. I will say we are trying to work with  
19 them to speed up that process.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. Thank you very  
21 much. Thank you.

22 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we will  
23 turn to Councilmember Farias.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Hi, folks, and thank you  
3 so much for all the testimony today. And please, if  
4 any of the questions I'm about to ask have been  
5 already answered, just flag that for me and I can go  
6 back.

7 I really wanted to highlight really quickly...  
8 thank my colleagues, Chair Brannan, and Chair Joseph  
9 along with Speaker Adams for asking about our... the  
10 very many issues we have going on in our schools  
11 along with the community school models, and why funds  
12 need to be advocated for, specifically because  
13 schools in the Bronx and in my district really do  
14 need the wraparound services, additional supports due  
15 to lack of healthy food access, being in healthcare  
16 deserts, lack of equitable transit, etc. So thank  
17 you.

18 I just wanted to ask some questions around career  
19 and technical education. Do we... do we know or have  
20 a process for bolstering monetarily our CTE  
21 schools... individually our CTE schools right now?

22 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Lindsey?

23 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Councilmember  
24 Yes, we do provide additional resources to our CTE  
25 programs through a variety of different ways. We

2 recognize that our career pathways programs have  
3 really different expenses. Whether you're running a  
4 nursing program or a culinary program, you obviously  
5 have different supplies that you need, perhaps  
6 different teachers or access to experts. And so we  
7 do provide additional funding to support those costs.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay, great. And I  
9 guess... I'm sorry I did not frame this in the  
10 same... in this way that I particularly wanted it  
11 answered. But I know that for my for my previous  
12 experience in workforce and partnering up with our  
13 CTE schools that some students are literally placed  
14 in CTE because it's their last choice on their high  
15 school application, and it was not their first or  
16 second or third. And so are we looking at ways to  
17 increase outreach to get the students that enjoy  
18 working with their hands that enjoy working in a...  
19 in a field, that our CTE schools are, you know,  
20 training folks in right now? Are we looking at ways  
21 to even answer for the direct concerns that some of  
22 our parents have by their students going into a trade  
23 versus college where we, you know, have a DOE system  
24 for years that was solely focused on college for all?

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: No, I agree. I appreciate  
3 that. That's a great question. And... and it is one  
4 of the challenges that we have, which is helping...  
5 helping everyone to understand that this new career  
6 pathways work that we're talking about is not  
7 necessarily traditional, you know, just CTE. There's  
8 going to be some traditional CTE and trade work, of  
9 course, but we're talking about a much broader plan  
10 than that. This is not your grandfather's CTE,  
11 right? I came up at a time where they would say to  
12 really smart kids, we want you to go to college, and  
13 the other kids who don't do so well, you know, do  
14 something with your hands, go into a trade. There  
15 were a lot of racial, you know, applications around  
16 that and language around. What we're talking about  
17 today are opportunities for kids who are coming out  
18 of high school to make \$75,000 and be... and be on a  
19 pathway to the middle class, to get off Mommy and  
20 Daddy's payroll and have like real skills to do real  
21 stuff. And... and that is what this this 21st  
22 Century economy is demanding. They're telling us you  
23 got to produce kids who have real skills,  
24 certifications to go in and not just, you know, not  
25 low level jobs, but high level jobs that... but they

2 require real skill. This is going to have tremendous  
3 implications for our workforce, our teachers to help  
4 the entire system to get better. And I don't know if  
5 you heard our chief of career pathways, will just ask  
6 her to take a minute on it as well, Jade Grieve, if  
7 you can just kind of expound a little bit on it.  
8 Because this is a really big deal for us. This is  
9 not just expanding on a few more CTE classes. That's  
10 not what we're talking about. Jade.

11 CHIEF GRIEVE: Thank you, Chancellor, and thank  
12 you, Council Member for the question. And just to  
13 say, we'd appreciate the chance to talk more about  
14 you about this with you, if you'd like given... given  
15 your interest. But just to share a little bit more  
16 about some of the career pathways programs that we're  
17 planning for launch in the coming school year, and  
18 then wanting to expand those right across the city  
19 beyond that, but we really see this as an opportunity  
20 to blend the best of college and career readiness.

21 So looking to really... and in... in the spirit  
22 of the Chancellor's push around redesigning the  
23 student experience to be to be blending both career-  
24 themed instruction within the walls of the academic  
25 experience, as well as giving students the

2 opportunity for... alongside that sequence advising  
3 and readiness around ensuring that they're all able  
4 to develop a very strong post-secondary plan,  
5 regardless of whether they're going to college, or  
6 career, coming out of school, ensuring that we're  
7 giving students the chance to...

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

9 CHIEF GRIEVE: ...really kind of get a broad  
10 sense of the career opportunities and get some get  
11 some career awareness, experience, and exposure as  
12 part of that. And then lastly, giving students a  
13 chance for a head start, so the Chancellor's talked a  
14 bit about some of the opportunities that that do  
15 exist with the right kinds of industry credentials,  
16 and certainly the chance to get some early college  
17 credit before they graduate.

18 So we see the opportunities of blending those,  
19 actually addressing some of the things that you  
20 raised in your question about this, about college for  
21 all and CTE. And this is really an opportunity to  
22 bring the best of those together. And we're excited  
23 to... to start that next year, next school year with  
24 some schools.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Great, thank you. And I  
3 know what the interest of time, if I can just ask the  
4 last couple of questions that you folks can briefly  
5 touch on, and then I will mute myself that if the  
6 chair allows. Chair?

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, that's fine.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay, thank you. Um, so  
9 the last thing I wanted to say about CTEs... or two  
10 things I want to say about CTE, really, that the  
11 pathway to employment part are finding those  
12 signatory employers that are really matching up with  
13 our CTE schools is critical, only because right now,  
14 from what I've seen, I've seen from my experiences,  
15 we have folks learning how to... or, or getting an  
16 internship at the MTA, for example, but then, upon  
17 graduation, are stuck on a two-three year waiting  
18 list for the civil service exam. I'd really like us  
19 to see... it's something I've been talking about for  
20 years while partnering up with the state to push back  
21 on finding a loophole or finding a credentialing way  
22 certification way to say, how do we move people,  
23 especially those that we are training and we know are  
24 ready to go right into the workforce? How do we move  
25 them beyond the civil service exam, or the waitlist

2 of the civil service exam, and then I'd like to hear  
3 what we're doing within our education system around  
4 bridge programming.

5 And then if we can touch on a budget for crossing  
6 guards across the board for all of our schools.  
7 Recently, I had a crossing guard, one of my schools  
8 pass away, and within that week, unfortunately,  
9 we had a student that was hit by a car in that... in  
10 that school zone. So I know they're kind of needed  
11 across the board, and I just like to hear what  
12 does... what does that line item look like in terms  
13 of ensuring not only that we're training folks to  
14 become crossing guards and into those fields? But  
15 also, are we addressing the need that we have  
16 budgetarily to ensure that every school can get  
17 access to them?

18 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Well, let me say... on the  
19 crossing guards piece, they know they technically are  
20 part of NYPD, and we probably have to address that  
21 with them. But to your first point, I think you're  
22 absolutely right. I... if our kids are getting a  
23 level of exposure, particularly in high school, we  
24 should put them in a position where they don't have  
25 to sit on the back of all of a waiting list for some

2 of these jobs. We should be preparing them for  
3 direct entry into some of these city positions. And  
4 it would certainly seem to me that that's something  
5 the City Council could help us with. We don't have  
6 direct authority, right with MTA, but I think you  
7 know, as council members, that's something that you  
8 can help to drive in partnership with us. That will  
9 be great on behalf of our kids.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Great, thank you. You  
11 can sign me as a partner in that. I'm ready to  
12 tackle some of those issues with you. Thank you so  
13 much for answering my questions today.

14 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you.

15 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. Next we'll turn to  
16 Council Member De La Rosa.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much,  
19 Chancellor and all the team and our Chairs for this  
20 wonderful hearing. Chancellor first let me say that  
21 you made me very happy this morning and very excited  
22 about the possibility for the partnership with the  
23 Dominican Republic. As you know, our community is  
24 one of the largest in the school system. And it's  
25 very important for us to have that reflection in the

2 leadership of your Administration. So thank you so  
3 much.

4 CHANCELLOR BANKS: (inaudible) Adasa! Adasa!

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Exactly. Adasa.

6 CHANCELLOR BANKS: It's coming from.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Exactly. So, in that  
8 same vein, part of my question is about the hiring  
9 freeze, and if you've already answered this question,  
10 I'm happy to just look back at it as well. But in  
11 the March budget hearing, it was mentioned that there  
12 was a hiring freeze at the D.O.E.. We see that...  
13 that... We did not see a change in the PEG in the  
14 executive budget. So what is the status of the  
15 hiring freeze? And the reason I'm asking is because  
16 of obviously an underlying concern about special  
17 education students, our students, which we know are  
18 at a crisis point, right now. And so I'm trying to  
19 reconcile in my mind, how are we going to deal with  
20 the services that are needed if there is a freeze?

21 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Councilmember,  
22 thank you very much for the question. There was  
23 briefly a hiring freeze put in place by the city, but  
24 that has since been lifted. And that hiring freeze  
25 never impacted school based positions. It doesn't...

2 and nothing is impacting school hiring now. And we  
3 expect that, you know, we will have more information  
4 about school hiring for the upcoming school year in  
5 the next couple of weeks.

6 As it pertains to our, sort of, non-school based  
7 positions, obviously, we review positions closely and  
8 work with our city partners, but there is no longer  
9 you know, full scale freeze on... on any positions.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Okay. And can you  
11 talk a little bit about the services for the ELL  
12 students and the special education students and what  
13 that looks like?

14 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you,  
15 Councilmember De La Rosa. So in terms of services,  
16 we are continuing to build some of our inclusive  
17 programs so that we can expand what we have seen is  
18 working, right?, to one of the pillars of the  
19 chancellor. We're finding that programs that are  
20 inclusive for our students, first with special needs,  
21 are very... have shown it to be more effective, and  
22 have also shown to be less expensive. And so we're  
23 really looking at duplicating some of those efforts.  
24 So for example, the ASD Nest program, our horizons  
25 program, those types of programs where students are

2 receiving supports within the community school are  
3 most effective for our students with disabilities.  
4 In addition to that, we are building up practices  
5 across the curriculum. And so building out literacy  
6 practices, building out different types of strategies  
7 to meet the needs of students with math, and then  
8 really using some of those assessments that we've put  
9 in place, with screeners to find out what it is that  
10 students need in terms of intervention, and building  
11 out those strategies, for example, with our students  
12 with disabilities as well. So there are already  
13 programs very specifically to meet those literacy  
14 needs in the... in those... for that community.

15 For our English language learners. We talked a  
16 little bit about building out more heritage language  
17 opportunities, as well as some of those bilingual  
18 extension programs. And our biggest piece is making  
19 sure that our content area teachers as well as our  
20 English Language Learner teachers, and our teachers  
21 of students with disabilities are all well trained to  
22 meet the needs of our kids. So the responsibility  
23 isn't exclusively on the teacher who is an ELL  
24 teacher, or teacher of students with disabilities,

2 but rather all of our teachers really have those  
3 strategies in place.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Great. And I wanted  
5 to also uplift Council Member Gennaro's comments  
6 around carbon free and Healthy Schools. Chair Joseph  
7 and I just wrote an Op Ed in City Limits around this  
8 topic and the need to make sure that environmental  
9 justice communities like ours, are taken into  
10 consideration, especially the infrastructure needs in  
11 our schools. I've personally been touring the  
12 schools in District 6. There's a lot of need. One  
13 of those needs as well is the... the access to water  
14 fountains. You know, lead remediation in schools,  
15 some of these buildings are 100 years old, as you  
16 know. And so I wanted to just uplift those comments  
17 that my colleagues made. And of course, the class  
18 size comments. You know, there have been people that  
19 have been working on the reduction of class size, you  
20 know, while I was still in school, and so I want to  
21 uplift the need for us to take a look at it, right?  
22 Education has changed since the pandemic is upon us,  
23 and the ability for our children to have adequate  
24 class size continues to be a great need. And so I

2 wanted to just highlight both of those points. Thank  
3 you so much for answering our questions today.

4 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you councilmember  
5 Council Member De La Rosa. Next... I do not see  
6 Council Member Hanks, so we will turn to Council  
7 Member Menin.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now. .

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Hi, thank you so much. And  
10 I really want to thank the chairs for this fantastic  
11 hearing. It's incredibly helpful to really drill down  
12 on these details. So I also, in continuation of what  
13 my colleague, Councilmember De La Rosa, just said, I  
14 also want to uplift the comments on class size  
15 matters. I really believe that the class size is  
16 absolutely imperative and really urge administration  
17 to take all the comments that were raised by my  
18 colleagues very seriously on that. So I had a  
19 question about funding for construction of outdoor  
20 play spaces, because we do have a number of schools  
21 that don't have gyms and then don't have outdoor play  
22 spaces, so I wanted to understand if there was any  
23 additional funding allocation for that to ensure that  
24 all the schools have that.

25 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Nina still here?

2 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Regarding gyms, we did start  
3 an initiative where we did look at 76 buildings where  
4 there were not gyms, and in many cases we were able  
5 to create gymnasiums. This was an initiative that  
6 was started about eight years ago and has not seen  
7 funding in this capital plan to expand that to more  
8 schools. We... and under that we were able to  
9 create a prototype and installed are constructed 22  
10 or 23 standalone gymnasiums. We... we do, you know,  
11 in terms of outdoor play space, we do have funding in  
12 the plan to either create or renovate a lot of the  
13 playgrounds, as well as over \$100 million for fields.  
14 So certainly we are looking at outdoor play space as  
15 a... as a priority for us. And also--I'm sure we'll  
16 get more questions on this--as we're removing the  
17 TCUs, we do renovate the playground, if an addition  
18 is not needed to be built in that space. We also try  
19 to, you know, be creative in some constraints of the  
20 building itself. And we do look to sort of... if  
21 there is space in the existing school, if there's any  
22 way that we can modify some of the spaces to create  
23 indoor play space, maybe like a multipurpose room,  
24 you know, aside from the cafeteria, I'm not saying  
25 that, but just where they could play indoors as well.

2

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: So does that mean with this  
4 \$100 million fund that you just mentioned... I have  
5 schools in my district and I know other colleagues do  
6 as well, but for example, my district in the East  
7 Harlem part of my district, we have one of the  
8 highest childhood obesity rates and childhood asthma  
9 rates. We have schools in my district that don't  
10 have any outdoor play space. Is the administration  
11 then committing to create those outdoor play spaces?  
12 Like what will that \$100 million fund... how many  
13 schools will that cover? Does it cover all the  
14 schools that are in need?

15 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: So just to clarify, the 100  
16 million that I was referring to was for athletic  
17 fields, mostly the those that exist, not so much new  
18 ones. And as I mentioned that we did... we did have  
19 some funding set aside for gymnasium... standalone  
20 gymnasiums. I don't think with the funding that we  
21 have, we can commit to creating play space for every  
22 school that does not have it yet. We do work with  
23 D.O.E. to make sure that outdoor play space is made  
24 available, whether it's through closing streets and  
25 things like that... not the ideal scenario, and I'm

2 sure you will... will agree to that. But we do also  
3 have \$50 million set aside for playground  
4 renovations. So we do have some money, but I cannot  
5 commit to saying that every school that does not have  
6 an outdoor play space will have an outdoor play space  
7 created by the SCA.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: And what about new  
9 construction for new schools?

10 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: That is... (crosstalk)

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Is that the commitment that  
12 SCA is making? That you are going to allocate that?

13 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: we do create outdoor play  
14 space with our new schools? Yes. Okay. Sometimes  
15 it's rooftop, But we try to do as much at-grade  
16 space, You know, when it's possible.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Yeah. Because in our  
18 district, as you know, we have many schools that are  
19 closing the streets, kids playing right by traffic.  
20 It's not as you said... it's less than AN ideal  
21 situation.

22 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Understood.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: I have another question if  
24 I still have time on dual languages. Can you talk a  
25 little bit... could someone from D.O.E. speak a

2 little bit about the dual-language programs, any  
3 commitment to it? We have a lot of inquiries in my  
4 district about dual language programs and what the  
5 administration's commitment is to that.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

7 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Yes, thank you for  
8 that question, Council Member Menin. We are looking  
9 to expand our bilingual programs and want to make  
10 sure that we are designing programs that are going to  
11 be successful for students using data and information  
12 that we have in collaboration with the folks at  
13 district. So working with superintendents, working  
14 with parents, we hope to open about 50 bilingual  
15 programs... open or expand rather about 50 bilingual  
16 programs, and we'll make decisions based on... on  
17 where and what languages with all of that information  
18 in that engagement.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Okay, thank you.

20 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember.  
21 Next we'll turn to Council Member Feliz followed by  
22 Council Member Hudson.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: All right, hello,  
25 everybody. So good to see everybody. Thank you,

2 Finance Chair Brannan and Education Chair Joseph, for  
3 this very informative hearing. And also, thank you,  
4 Chancellor Banks, very good to see you. Thank you  
5 and your team for the very important work that you do  
6 right here in the City of New York.

7 My questions are about trailer classrooms in our  
8 city, also known as TCUs. I have so many of them in  
9 my district. I think everyone in this room has many  
10 goals in common, including the goal of ensuring that  
11 every child in the city of New York gets the high  
12 quality education that they deserve, and I think we  
13 could also agree that in order to get that high  
14 quality education, we need a lot of tools, including  
15 educational spaces that are good for learning. And  
16 I'm extremely concerned about the fact that we still  
17 have so many Temporary Classroom Units. We call them  
18 to see us and we also call them non TCU temporary  
19 buildings. But at the end of the day, they're still  
20 trailer classroom buildings. Again, I have so many  
21 of them in my district. And I represent a very poor,  
22 very vulnerable district. And I think it's a big  
23 problem. Trailers that are 20 or 30 years old, or  
24 even older. Um, you could only imagine that  
25 condition. And it's a problem. And I'm not blaming

2 this administration. I know the administration has  
3 been in office for four months. And this is a  
4 problem that has been accruing over the years and  
5 decades. But, you know, obviously, all of us get to  
6 decide how we move forward on this issue of, you  
7 know, children, still learning in trailers,  
8 especially low income, vulnerable children.

9 So a few questions about the trailer classrooms,  
10 and for general context, can you provide information  
11 on how many trailer classrooms or trailer buildings  
12 we have in our city, including those that we call  
13 TCUs, but also those that we call non-TCU temporary  
14 buildings?

15 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Thank you for that question,  
16 Councilmember. I know, Councilmember Stevens was  
17 afraid that you weren't going to be on to ask this  
18 very important question. So she even asked on your  
19 behalf. So thank you for bringing that up. And  
20 so... so we started out with 354 TCUs throughout our  
21 system. And we've removed about 270. And we have  
22 plans like... it's in process for many more. So we  
23 are working on plans to remove the remaining 33 for  
24 which we don't have plans. I will say that is for  
25 TCUs. Of those remaining 33, there are two in your

2 district at one school and two in councilmember  
3 Stevens, district one we're talking about the Bronx,  
4 as well. So there are four TCUs that we do not yet  
5 have plans for. We are working very hard to get  
6 plans for that. There is, as you mentioned, other  
7 temporary structures, which we you know... we were  
8 really looking at this as a multi-pronged approach.  
9 Let's get rid of all of the... the majority the 354  
10 TCUs, and then let's go and look at the other  
11 temporary structures, the non-TCU temporary  
12 structures. And what we're trying to do is do it in  
13 a more systematic way. We have been able to remove  
14 some of them by creating additions, PS 105, in the  
15 Bronx, 95 and 96 in the Bronx, Q2, obviously in  
16 Queens, but we haven't been able to... we don't have  
17 the funding in this plan and we're trying to come up  
18 with a systematic way to remove those remaining  
19 temporary structures. There are about 65 of them and  
20 Chair Joseph shared with me pictures of PS85 in the  
21 Bronx when she was there with you, and I do see, can  
22 you see that this one... PS85 in particular is very  
23 long and is right next to the existing school  
24 building. Now that that temporary structure has  
25 about 200 kids supposedly enrolled, enrolled in that

2 building. And I want to say before I go on with that  
3 we do not count the capacity of those structures. So  
4 when you're looking at the Bluebook, the capacity of  
5 that temporary structure is not included. But for  
6 practicality purposes, it's... it's harder to remove  
7 something that contains 200 Children, where... where  
8 on the site is where the ideal place to build maybe  
9 an addition, without figuring out how to move those  
10 children while we build an addition. So this... our  
11 approach was really to get rid of the TCUs -- not an  
12 easy task, but easier because they are smaller  
13 structures -- and then let's work with the D.O.E. to  
14 come up with... do we temporarily re-site them? What  
15 can we do in order to build a more permanent  
16 structure? Sorry, I don't mean to interrupt.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: ... and how many... I'm  
18 sorry, I know time is limited. How many? So you  
19 mentioned 65 temporary structures. Can you give a  
20 breakdown of how many we have per borough?

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

22 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: I'm happy to give that...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Super-rough numbers if you  
24 don't have the hard numbers in front of you.

2 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: Yeah, I don't have broken down  
3 by... I have it by council district. So I'm happy  
4 to send that to you afterwards, if you don't mind.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Yeah, okay, that's fine.  
6 And also, if the chair would permit, just a few more  
7 points on this very important topic.

8 CHAIR JOSEPH: Yes, Council Member, please go  
9 ahead.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you. I really  
11 appreciate it. Um, so approximately how much money...  
12 or is there any way that the SCA and the Department  
13 of Education could prioritize this issue? Many of  
14 these temporary... TCUs... trailer classrooms...  
15 let's call them trailer classrooms. So that's what  
16 they are, regardless of whether we call them TCU or  
17 non-TCU... many of them are located in school  
18 buildings that have really large playgrounds. The  
19 TCUs or the trailers are located right in the middle  
20 of the playground. So it is possible to basically  
21 construct a school extension right on the corner of  
22 the playground, and then demolish the TCU, or the  
23 trailer after that extension is built, so that you  
24 don't have to disrupt classrooms. You don't have to  
25 transfer the students to other areas. What can we do

2 to, I guess, accelerate the timeline. It is 2022.  
3 It is unacceptable that the poorest, most vulnerable  
4 children are learning in... in trailers with water  
5 leaks every time it rains, or with lack of proper  
6 ventilation, air conditioning system, what can be  
7 done at this level of government to accelerate that  
8 timeline?

9 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: So that's exactly what we're  
10 starting to look at now, is whether it's feasible to  
11 create an addition to remove such temporary  
12 structures. We were able to do that... exactly what  
13 you're talking about at PS96 in Queens, where we are  
14 building the addition, and after the addition is  
15 built are we able then to remove the TCU. So the  
16 kids will be in place during the duration. So again,  
17 I think, you know, we were so focused on the TCUs  
18 that, you know, like I said, we have about 65 or so  
19 of our... the TCBs or these other non-TCU temporary  
20 structures. That's exactly the deeper dive that we  
21 need to go into now.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Like, how much money would  
23 it cost to get all the TCUs and TCBs replaced? I know  
24 it's a super... you know, you're not going to have

2 the hard numbers there. But more or less, how much  
3 are we talking about?

4 PRESIDENT KUBOTA: It would be hard for me to  
5 give a number without looking at each one of those 65  
6 or so sites. I think with the \$352 million that we  
7 have in this capital plan, we will be able to remove  
8 the TCUs. That's why, I want to just say if you  
9 could give us a little time to start looking at those  
10 TBCs, I don't want to give you a number that is so  
11 wrong, so if you give us a little time, we will  
12 certainly come back to you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Okay. Well, thank you so  
14 much. And I hope that that SCA and also the  
15 Department of Education could, you know make this a  
16 top priority. We cannot talk about high quality  
17 education when children are learning in trailers.  
18 And again, I'm not blaming this administration. This  
19 has been happening for many decades. But I hope we  
20 could come up with a real plan to get this resolved  
21 soon because, you know, our generations cannot  
22 continue to wait for... for good education. Thank  
23 you so much.

24 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you and next we'll turn  
25 to Councilmember Hudson.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Hi there. Thank you for  
4 the opportunity to just ask you a question. I know  
5 that my... many of my colleagues have asked a lot of  
6 really great questions, and apologies, I don't  
7 believe this has been asked yet I've been trying to  
8 follow along as best as I can, and trying to, you  
9 know, multi... multitask here. But you mentioned  
10 earlier about expanding the Gifted and Talented  
11 program. And in my district, I have one of the first  
12 schools to sort of self-select out of the Gifted and  
13 Talented program, and eliminate it really in an  
14 effort to achieve true parity in the education  
15 system. And we know that black and brown kids are  
16 disproportionately underrepresented in gifted and  
17 talented programs. So I would just like to know what  
18 you'll be doing to support and empower the school  
19 communities that have chosen not to participate in  
20 Gifted and Talented program, and how you'll ensure  
21 that the kids who have traditionally been left out of  
22 these programs will have access. And how much are  
23 you investing in the Gifted and Talented program for  
24 fiscal year 23? Thank you.

25

2 CHANCELLOR BANKS: No, I appreciate that, Council  
3 Member, and I appreciate when we had the opportunity  
4 to to visit my old elementary...

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Yeah, new bridges. That  
6 was great.

7 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, which was PS167, back  
8 when I was a teacher there. But nonetheless, you  
9 know, what you raised is... is kind of representative  
10 of the challenge of being in a job like this. When  
11 you speak, there's no monolithic way that parents and  
12 communities feel. There are some parents which were  
13 desperate to have gifted and talented and told me at  
14 every turn. And then others who said, you know, we  
15 we don't support gifted and talented. But the reason  
16 that we made the decision to offer the opportunity to  
17 have a gifted and talented in every district was in  
18 fact, to help to diversify the Gifted and Talented  
19 program. If we put a Gifted and Talented program in  
20 Ocean Hill, Brownsville, we are going to get black  
21 and brown students who are part of the Gifted and  
22 Talented program. If I... there are many districts  
23 here that you all represent that if we open it up, we  
24 go to Southeast Queens, which is what they asked us

2 to do, by definition, we're going to diversify the  
3 program, which is one of the issues.

4 So the diversity question was a question I think,  
5 at its heart when.... when it was such a scarcity  
6 model in only a handful of spots. But by putting it  
7 in every district, it... were going to open it up to  
8 everybody. That's number one.

9 The other part of it is... because we've been  
10 asked by a couple of communities around not doing it  
11 at all. What we have said, and my position on it is  
12 this, I would let the community voice what they want  
13 to do by... by voting with their feet. So we will  
14 know in your district to anybody else's district, if  
15 there's no demand for it, then we won't have it.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, great.

17 CHANCELLOR BANKS: But I didn't want to... and  
18 I've spoken to some school leaders and a couple other  
19 community leaders, and they were telling me, "We  
20 don't want it." I said, "Well, let's let the parents  
21 decide." You know, in one sense, we can't... you  
22 know, we've had a lot of conversations around mayoral  
23 control of schools and everything else. And people  
24 say to me all the time, the parents don't feel that  
25 they have a voice, that they don't have a seat at the

2 table. So I can't in one sense, say "I'm opening up  
3 to parents," and then another sense, say, "Well, I'm  
4 not... You're not going to get it because other folks  
5 have spoken for you." I can't do that. And so we're  
6 just opening up as an option. There will not be a  
7 Gifted and Talented program in your district if the  
8 parents in your district say we're not interested,  
9 then there won't be one. But if they if they fill up  
10 a classroom for kids, then we'll have it.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, that... that's  
12 helpful. And just to be clear, it's you know, the...  
13 My district is very diverse, and all the schools are  
14 very different. So there might be even diversity in  
15 thought and in those requests in my district alone,  
16 and I have both districts 17 and 13. So school  
17 districts 17 and 13.

18 CHANCELLOR BANKS: What we want to do is we want  
19 to we want to just open it up, we want to get  
20 started. We're just trying our best to establish  
21 some kind of a baseline. And we're here to see what  
22 we learn and what the experiences are. And in some  
23 districts, they're going to want to expand it. Other  
24 districts may say we don't need it. We'll figure it

2 out. We going to try to give it a year to take a  
3 look at it.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: That sounds good. And  
5 then just in terms of investment. Is there dollar  
6 amount that you're putting into the Gifted and  
7 Talented program to expand to every district?

8 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah. Uh, Lindsey, what do  
9 you got, Lindsey:

10 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Yeah,  
11 Councilmember is 1.9 million.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay. Citywide?

13 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Correct.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, thank you. Thanks,  
15 Commissioner. Thank you all.

16 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember  
17 Hudson. And I do not see Councilmember Nurse, so next  
18 we will turn to Councilmember Lee.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Oh, sorry. I didn't realize  
21 it could unmute myself. Hi, everyone. Thank you so  
22 much to our leadership, Madam Speaker, as well as  
23 Chairs Brannan and Joseph, and thank you so much  
24 Chancellor for being on here, as well as president  
25 Kubota, sorry, from SCA, and all the staff. Also

2 forgive me for being in and out, I was actually  
3 visiting schools for their career day. So hopefully  
4 that gives me a legitimate pass for if I missed  
5 something. But I actually wanted to focus... I know  
6 that a lot of folks have been asking about social  
7 workers and mental health is super important in the  
8 schools. And I specifically wanted to focus in on  
9 the \$5 million that was allocated for the mental  
10 health continuum. As you know, this is an important  
11 issue for me as Chair of the Mental Health Committee,  
12 and I just wanted to check in because I know this  
13 is... if I... if I'm understanding this correctly,  
14 it's the first initiative that D.O.E. has  
15 collaborated with H&H on, Health And Hospitals, and  
16 DOHMH to help the students that are severely... that  
17 have significant mental health challenges in the  
18 schools. And so I just wanted to get a sense of how  
19 the partnership... I'll ask all the questions at  
20 once, so you can just answer them one at a time.

21 But I just wanted to get a sense of how the  
22 collaboration is working with the other city agencies  
23 that are part of this model? Has it been going well?  
24 What are some of the challenges? And also, you know,  
25 how have the schools that... I believe it's been 50,

2 it's in 50, high-need schools in South Bronx and  
3 central Brooklyn. So I just wanted to know the  
4 status of the initiative in those schools  
5 specifically and how it's been going? And also, if  
6 it's something that you would support, which I hope  
7 you will, for FY 23, and then extending it into the  
8 budget? And also where... if you think there's  
9 certain increases that need to be made? Or if it's  
10 too early to tell? If you could just speak on that a  
11 little bit more.

12 CHIEF JOHNSON: Okay, sorry about that. Thank  
13 you for the question, Councilmember. So the mental  
14 health continuum: We've been working in partnership  
15 with Health And Hospitals. We've been working with  
16 other colleagues to really kind of explore and deepen  
17 this level of access. As we are examining the  
18 success of this particular initiative, one of the  
19 things that we're finding is... trying to figure out  
20 and trying to navigate access to the resources across  
21 the various agency pathways, and then coordinating...  
22 leveraging those resources to engage staff. And so  
23 that has been a place where we've... we've been  
24 looking for... we've been working collaboratively.  
25 We've also been working to figure out ways to

2 continue to provide continued and additional funding  
3 for this. And... and we found that leveraging the...  
4 the funds across the various teams, has presented a  
5 little bit of a challenge. So with regard to the  
6 specific progress for each of the 50 schools, I'd  
7 have to confirm with the team and get back to you to  
8 this, around the specifics for that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Okay, and I guess if you  
10 could get back to me on, you know, if... if the  
11 numbers are low, because I would imagine \$5 million  
12 is a drop in the bucket when you're talking about  
13 city wide. And so even with the 50 schools, I would  
14 imagine it's not enough. And so if you guys could  
15 come back to us with some sort of evaluation or  
16 assessment on where you guys think the needs are,  
17 because I'd be very curious to see how it has been  
18 working in those schools where it's it started. And  
19 if you could give us a sense of what the challenges  
20 are and how much more resources you guys would need  
21 in terms of that program or initiative. So if you  
22 guys could get back to us. That'd be awesome.

23 CHIEF JOHNSON: Absolutely. Thank you for the  
24 question.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Thank you.

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember Lee.

3 And next we'll turn to Councilmember Sanchez.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Good afternoon everyone.

6 Good afternoon, Chancellor. Good to see everyone.

7 So my... my question is going to be about students

8 living in shelter. So, no reason why you would have

9 necessarily seen, but you know, I had a shootout... a  
10 shootout in front of my office yesterday in the

11 afternoon. Right after I finished chairing the

12 Executive Budget hearing, we all had to jump to the

13 floor and you know... just... just cover right as

14 nine, nine shots were fired, and one of my

15 constituents... her son was shot in the leg.

16 And, you know, for me, it's... I love these kids,

17 these are my kids. They're doing terrible things,

18 because of the realities that we grow up in, right?,

19 and the difficulties and some of them have just never

20 had a fighting chance, right? And so, when you look

21 at something like what's in my district, which is we

22 have, we have some schools where 40% of children are

23 living in shelter... or are living in temporary

24 housing, right? We have... we have... and it's by the

25 way, it's right by where my office is, right? And so

2 when we put these things together I, you know, I'm  
3 just so frustrated, right and angry. And I know that  
4 we all are in.... we share this, but what are what  
5 are we doing? Right?

6 So, you know, I know we need community  
7 coordinators, that Council's budget response is  
8 asking for 100 of these community coordinators for  
9 students living in temporary housing. We have to  
10 help our students, right? We have to, um, fighting  
11 for housing on the other side, but within our  
12 schools, you know, we have to, we have to be there  
13 for them. And not... not just the the community  
14 coordinators, but making sure that, you know, what  
15 I'm hearing from these principals in these schools  
16 with... with the high shelter and temporary housing  
17 numbers is social workers and guidance counselors,  
18 and folks to really be there for... for those  
19 wraparound services.

20 So I know we're asking for 100 Community  
21 coordinators, we absolutely need them, the students  
22 need the supports. And so my first question is just  
23 about the status of the 50 that you already committed  
24 to? And can can we do more?

2 CHIEF JOHNSON: So thank you for the question,  
3 Councilmember. So as you know, we've been looking  
4 creatively at ways to really address some of the  
5 needs for students and families experiencing  
6 homelessness. And first, before I get into the depth  
7 of the question, I just wanted to pause for a moment  
8 to say: Are you okay?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: I'm okay. My team is  
10 okay. Thank you so much for asking.

11 CHIEF JOHNSON: I think it... you know, that...  
12 that's just what sits at the core of the work is, you  
13 know, just ensuring that we and our families and  
14 communities are okay.

15 And so I think as we think about the supports  
16 that we are leveraging for students in temporary  
17 housing, we've been really excited to really access  
18 the American Rescue Plan funding to really be able to  
19 -- as you'd mentioned -- identified the 50... the 50  
20 community coordinators to support students in  
21 temporary housing. As we figure out what makes sense  
22 and how we... how we align those additional supports,  
23 we realize we... we need additional supports. These  
24 particular supports... these additional 50 staff  
25 members will be shelter-based staff members and will

2 be able to work in partnership and coordination with  
3 the school teams and school coordinators. They will  
4 also work in collaboration with our school base,  
5 bridging... bridging the gap social workers, who are  
6 the team of social... social workers who are  
7 identified exclusively for the supports for students  
8 in temporary housing. And we've been able to hire  
9 100 of those Bridging the Gap social workers, in  
10 addition to the existing number of 107 community  
11 coordinators that already exist. So the 50 will add  
12 to that core. And then they work in partnership with  
13 our family assistance. And so we have about 117  
14 family assistance. And so when we think about  
15 leveraging these well over 300 staff members, and  
16 adding an additional 50 to this core, we really are  
17 working to meet the need. We do recognize that  
18 there's still more that needs to be done. And I've  
19 committed to kind of working in partnership to figure  
20 out creative ways to figure out sourcing... to  
21 sustain the sources for these for these families who  
22 are experiencing homelessness at this time.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay, thank you and  
24 are... is the D.O.E. applying for a second round of  
25 Homeless Children And Youth funding.

2 CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes. Yes. So in the first  
3 round, and there was about \$9 million that was  
4 allocated. And the second round of funding is  
5 slightly more expensive. It's roughly about \$23 or  
6 \$24 million. And we've been really excited to  
7 work... to really engage multiple voices and multiple  
8 stakeholders. So within the D.O.E., we're working  
9 not just within the Office of Students in Temporary  
10 Housing, but working across all of the sectors where  
11 families and students are affected. We've been  
12 working more deeply within the core members who are  
13 part of the... part of the team, and who actually  
14 have the direct experience with students and families  
15 who are experiencing homelessness...

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

17 CHIEF JOHNSON: and we also are working in  
18 partnership across agencies. And so being able  
19 to... to activate on the kind of the mayor's priority  
20 to work across... inter-agencies, and really to think  
21 about DSS to think about ACS, and to really  
22 incorporate all of the different ways that families  
23 are touched by this particular matter, and to use  
24 that to leverage how we are going to adequately be

2 able to allocate the funds. And so we're working to  
3 draft that response in the coming weeks.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you so  
5 much. I will just follow up and request a  
6 breakdown... if the DOE could provide a breakdown of  
7 where these 117 plus 50 workers are going to be  
8 located and how the service is going to be divided?  
9 That would be really helpful. And Chancellor Banks,  
10 I will be reaching out to do a walkthrough in my  
11 district. I would love to host you here.

12 CHANCELLOR BANKS: (inaudible)

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

14 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. I'm not seeing  
15 Council Member Restler. We will turn to our final  
16 Council Member for questions for the Department of Ed  
17 and the SCA, Councilmember Avilés.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Hello everyone. Thank  
20 you so much to chair Brannan and Chair Joseph and  
21 everyone else for being on this call for so for so  
22 many hours. I appreciate you and all the work you're  
23 doing.

24 I just want to first start wholeheartedly  
25 agreeing with Council Member Hanif, who talked about

2 culturally... culturally responsive and sustaining  
3 education. I had a very particular instance in my  
4 district where a principal told me that she had  
5 received these books, that she had instructed her  
6 teachers not to distribute and use because she found  
7 the books racist. They were books sent through the  
8 Mosaic Program. And I asked her to tell me which  
9 book they were, and we could sit together and look at  
10 it. In fact, they were not racist, they were anti-  
11 racist books. But what it led... what it led me to  
12 understand was she had received boxes and boxes of  
13 beautifully selected new resources without any  
14 training and support and PD opportunities for  
15 teachers that don't understand or haven't done the  
16 self-reflection work around what it is to be an anti-  
17 racist educator. So I would love to hear what the  
18 plans are to fill that gap. Because I suspect that  
19 this is the case across other school districts, and  
20 this is a critical component to getting us to the  
21 place that we need.

22 Also, I'd love to know a little bit more about  
23 the justification for... for funding, potentially  
24 almost 800 school safety officer positions, when the  
25 rest of the D.O.E. budget is getting cut. That's in

2 addition to what already exists. I don't understand  
3 that, particularly since we are I mean, we're just  
4 talking about the need for... you know, transition  
5 advisors and social workers, and still the lack of...  
6 while investment is increasing, and that still, so  
7 many of our schools need really that kind of support.  
8 It is the first thing I hear from schools in my  
9 district. We need more of these kinds of support. So  
10 I would love for y'all to respond maybe to those two  
11 questions.

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Yes, thank you.  
13 Thank you, Councilmember Aviles. Sorry for the echo.  
14 Sometimes it makes us feel like a superstar in here.

15 So I appreciate you asking about the books. And  
16 actually, that is something that that I learned when  
17 we when I arrived here: That there were, you know,  
18 really great resources that were sent to schools, and  
19 we're incredibly happy about the fact that schools  
20 have received these texts, and we want to continue to  
21 do that, to be able to provide more diversity in the  
22 types of books that we are providing to schools, both  
23 the hardcopy books that kids can hold in our part of  
24 their classroom library, and the books that they can  
25 access through the electronic library, through SORA.

2 One of the things that that we noted was that  
3 they were sent without that support. And so for the  
4 schools that are very-well-versed in what it means to  
5 be an anti-racist school, or that are already talking  
6 about and learning about liberatory practices,  
7 they're fine. But you're absolutely right that in  
8 other places, it looks like we may need to do other  
9 types of... of training, and to really have  
10 conversations with the community about what the books  
11 are that we're sending. If at any point, a school  
12 does have a problem with a book, there is a process  
13 to be able to contest that book as well, but I  
14 appreciate that you sat with them and looked through  
15 the books, to see that in fact that we're not racist.  
16 And so thank you for helping to do that. I know that  
17 the more that we can provide representations of who  
18 our community is, the kinder and safer that we're  
19 building across the community. So I appreciate that.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Well, I'd love to follow  
21 up on that please, in particular, because I think the  
22 principal has still decided she... she reads this a  
23 particular way, and has instructed all her teachers  
24 to put those books on the side and to ignore them.

2           And so I think it really speaks to what... what  
3 is the guidance, parents won't know that these books  
4 even exist because they don't come home. So how...  
5 how is it that that the DOE is ensuring that these  
6 curriculums are getting rolled out responsibly?  
7 And... and with adequate support? She wouldn't... I  
8 don't know if she identified that, if she even wants  
9 to have that battle. It's easier for her to just put  
10 them aside and direct her teachers to do otherwise.  
11 So I guess I'm curious kind of like what the  
12 mechanism is there to make sure that... that we  
13 are... we are pushing our schools down this path in a  
14 loving and gentle way but certainly with... with  
15 urgency because they can be ignored.

16           CHANCELLOR BANKS: Yeah, let me just say this  
17 also... got to mute... you know, there was a large  
18 body of work that was done before we even came into  
19 office, that... that really dealt with a lot of anti-  
20 racist trainings for...

21           SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

22           ... all across the city. And so that's a body of  
23 work that we're going to continue to support. When  
24 you hear... I don't know that this is a wide ranging  
25 citywide issue, so to the degree that you hear about

2 it, please, you know, let us know directly, what  
3 school, what principal, and we can follow up on that  
4 for sure. But... but trust me during the last  
5 several years, this is a this was a big body of work.  
6 And... and you know, it's not easy work, and everyone  
7 is not fully prepared for it. And... but we are  
8 going to continue to be as supportive as we can to  
9 all of our schools and our superintendents and our  
10 principals to really make sure that they're getting  
11 the support that they need to do this work  
12 effectively. But I've not heard a lot of pushback.  
13 That's what I'm saying I don't... it doesn't strike  
14 me as something that's a city-wide response and that  
15 people feel as though they have not gotten fully  
16 prepared. You may get that in a case you were there,  
17 and that's why we do. Just bring it to our  
18 attention. We can follow up for sure.

19 CHIEF JOHNSON: And so, Councilmember, thank you.  
20 I've wanted to so I just wanted to address the second  
21 portion of... of your question. With regard to the  
22 SSA is an NYPD. With regard to SSA is they are NYPD  
23 staff, and so they're hired and organized through the  
24 NYPD. We do work in partnership with them to ensure  
25 that we're providing the appropriate supports to our

2 schools. And as we said, if we think about who our  
3 school safety agents are, if we think about how we  
4 align those with the both clinical and non-clinical  
5 supports, we are working to address some of the  
6 challenges that young people are facing in this  
7 space. And we do realize recognize that there is  
8 additional work that needs to be done in that space.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: I'm sorry, I'm sorry, I  
10 don't understand your response. Are you suggesting  
11 we need we need the 800, we can only get 50 transfer  
12 coordinators and 100 social workers but it is okay to  
13 do 800 Police in schools?

14 CHIEF JOHNSON: No council member I just... I  
15 guess to clarify, I was saying that the NYPD hires  
16 and maintains the school safety... school safety  
17 staff. And so when we think about young people  
18 creating a safe and supportive environment for young  
19 people, we think about how we how we sustain both the  
20 emotional safety as well as the physical safety. So  
21 there is a need for the SSAs, and NYPD will... will  
22 handle the... the staffing and the hiring of those.  
23 And on our part is we think about building out the  
24 emotional safety, the support for young people and  
25 supports in the schools. So apologies if I misspoke.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: No, no, no. I appreciate  
3 the clarification. Thank you.

4 CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you.

5 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember. And  
6 I note that the chancellor had to step away. But  
7 Council Member Restler has his hand up. So Council  
8 Member, the DOE team is up. The chancellor is still  
9 here. So if you just want to go and ask your  
10 questions, I will turn it back to the chairs.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

12 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: You can unmute yourself.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Well great. What a  
14 gift. Thank you, Malcom. Well, let me firstly just  
15 recognize my good friend and our Distinguished Chair,  
16 Rita Joseph. I greatly appreciate her tremendous  
17 leadership. Everybody likes to say that December 23,  
18 she was still in the classroom. She... she taught  
19 her whole way through the campaign. She's an  
20 extraordinary person she thinks about her students.  
21 I was lucky to have her in my district, visiting a  
22 high school last week. And I've now made it to over  
23 30 schools in my district. So I'm trying to keep up  
24 with you, Chancellor on your school visits. I like  
25 to start every morning with a school visit. It is

2 wonderful. It's... it's the best part of my day. I  
3 love getting to meet with our principals visit our  
4 students. I was at the Brooklyn International High  
5 School this morning, all English language learners.  
6 It's a really special place, project based learning  
7 approach. I just loved it. But it's good to have  
8 you Chancellor and your whole team. Thank you for  
9 for being with us.

10 The first thing I wanted to ask about is an issue  
11 of great concern to me, which is about the enrollment  
12 peg. And I understand that it's going to be somewhat  
13 moderated by the federal stimulus dollars and that  
14 you've tried to spread it out over a few years. But  
15 I'm still very concerned. And I ask: Could you  
16 please share the average net impact on fair student  
17 funding to each school in fiscal year 23, and the net  
18 impact of the fair student funding plus enrollment  
19 revenue adjustment in fiscal 23, and the following  
20 two years so that we can actually have a breakdown.  
21 Because I'm visiting the schools every day, and this  
22 is what they're freaked about. This is what my  
23 elementary schools and my middle schools are just  
24 unnerved about what it's going to mean for them next  
25 year. And they were planning to bring on a

2 librarian, and they're planning to do other things.

3 But they're now feeling like, we're going to be

4 totally screwed by this peg and this reduction. It's

5 a technical question, but if... if Lindsey or the

6 team could help speak to it, I would greatly

7 appreciate it.

8 CHANCELLOR BANKS: No absolutely. And Lindsey...

9 Lindsey will speak to it. It's stuff that we talk

10 about here every day, Councilmember, and I thank you

11 for that. First of all, thank you for visiting your

12 schools as intensely as you do. And we hear about it

13 as well. It's all good. And we really appreciate

14 you. And so... so Lindsay, will speak to you because

15 it's a little bit of a conundrum that we're in. We've

16 had declining school enrollment. And yet we've been

17 using these funds, but they're stimulus funds, to

18 kind of keep schools as close to you know, where they

19 are as possible. But you know, it also becomes a

20 challenge when the school had 500 kids, and now they

21 have 250 kids, and they say, but don't cut my budget,

22 right? So... uh...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: But... but within

24 reason, right? And I... the thing I really want to

25 say is like, bring us in as councilmembers as

2 partners. I want to be the biggest marketing  
3 champion for my public schools. The amount that our  
4 charter... that the charters put into marketing is  
5 egregious relative to what we do. So let's be  
6 partners in trying to engage... I'm talking to  
7 families in my district every day all day. I want to  
8 get them into our public schools, let's work as  
9 partners in that effort. But I'm very keen on the  
10 numbers, if we have the chance to do it. And a  
11 chance I look forward to sit down with you and  
12 talking more about it.

13 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Absolutely. I'd love to sit  
14 down some more, particularly around how we can do a  
15 better job of marketing, our schools. But in the  
16 meantime, Lindsey, if you would pick up the question.

17 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Sure. Thank you,  
18 Councilmember for highlighting this really important  
19 issue. So we are really... and I'm really focused,  
20 the Chancellor's really focused on exactly what you  
21 just identified, which is getting schools information  
22 about their budgets as soon as possible. That's  
23 something that we want to be able to do in the next  
24 couple of weeks. And when we have that information,  
25 I'm happy to sit down with you and share the impact.

2 And again, really hoping that we can get school  
3 budgets out in the next couple of weeks. And I would  
4 also just ask that, you know, part of the marketing  
5 of our school system is ensuring that we're  
6 advocating to the state and the feds to support our  
7 school system as we're thinking about stimulus  
8 funding running out and making sure that we have the  
9 adequate resources that we need. And I know you'll  
10 join us in the fight for additional funding at the  
11 state at the federal level.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I look forward to  
13 reviewing those budgets. And Lindsey, I appreciate  
14 your offer to meet, and I will gladly take you up on  
15 it. But the question I had was a kind of average  
16 across the board, which I'd imagine you'd have now.  
17 And so we'll put that in writing to you. But we'd  
18 really appreciate a quick reply if you could get that  
19 to us and realize it will take time to go school by  
20 school.

21 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER OATES: Sure.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: The I do want to commend  
23 the Council Finance Team, Justin, the speaker,  
24 everyone, for pushing for more funding for CTEs, for  
25 ELLs, for community coordinators. We really need to

2 focus on... on students in temporary housing. And...  
3 and Chair Joseph's emphasis on students in foster  
4 care. Appreciate the emphasis there and appreciate  
5 the resources you all put in on Summer Rising. The  
6 areas that I really want to see more funding are on  
7 guidance counselors and social workers, around  
8 librarians, and really echo Chair Brannan's comments  
9 around arts education.

10 The other piece that I wanted to ask you about  
11 today, which is a major concern of mine, and then  
12 I'll do... sneak one last thing and if I can, that's  
13 a teeny one, is transfer schools.

14 The reports I'm getting are that because of this  
15 same...

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired. ... of schools  
17 not wanting to reduce the enrollment, we're not  
18 referring kids who should be in transfer schools to  
19 transfer schools. And I'm very concerned that we  
20 don't have enough central oversight... oversight from  
21 TWEED to make sure those referrals are happening. So  
22 kids who really would benefit from a transfer school  
23 environment are not there because students are trying  
24 to hold... because schools are trying to hold on to  
25 their students for the pursuit of per pupil funding.

2 And then I'm just going to tack on my last  
3 question before I get in trouble with the  
4 Distinguished Chair.

5 We now have more NYC ferry service that is being  
6 used by students to get to and from school. We have  
7 connections from Brooklyn to the Harbor School on  
8 Governors Island and others, but we don't have any  
9 student discount on the NYC ferry. This is city  
10 agency to city agency. We should be able to figure  
11 this out. I know that Mark Trager cares about this  
12 one. It would be great if we could get a commitment  
13 from D.O.E. leadership that they're going to help us  
14 work with EDC to subsidize fair usage for student  
15 commuters. So those are the two final questions if I  
16 can sneak those in. Can someone speak to transfer  
17 school?

18 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: Yes. Thank you,  
19 Councilmember. We would love to... you know maybe  
20 this... I've only been here for one week, but we'd  
21 love to hear more detail about that. Typically, it's  
22 the other way around, as you know, like, where we  
23 have students who may be over-age and under-credited,  
24 who get kind of encouraged to discharge themselves  
25 and aren't necessarily connected to transfer schools.

2 So we worry about those disconnected youth quite a  
3 bit. Certainly what we do see objectively and may  
4 support your point is attendance in transfer schools  
5 is really.... is really quite low. And so that is  
6 something that we are really focused on. And  
7 certainly, we want to make sure that all of our  
8 principals, all of our staff are thinking  
9 holistically, not just about, you know, the... what's  
10 going on at their particular school, what they can  
11 offer holistically about what programming is best for  
12 a particular young person. And if it's a transfer  
13 school, then the family and then the student ought to  
14 be given information about that. So if that's not  
15 happening in an attempt to prop up enrollment, we  
16 certainly would like to know about that. And we want  
17 to make sure that we have really high quality  
18 transfer schools for students who need that. And  
19 Chancellor mentioned this before, I'll just make a  
20 little plug, when we're thinking about virtual  
21 school, we're thinking about, in part, these  
22 students. When we're thinking about other  
23 programming, we're thinking about these students. We  
24 want to create actually a broader range of options  
25 for students who, you know, traditional schools may

2 not work for them for various reasons. But would love  
3 to connect with you to hear more specifics about  
4 that? Because if that's happening, that's a real  
5 problem.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: We will send you a  
7 formal letter, and I appreciate your willingness to  
8 follow up and work with us on it.

9 And any... any comment on the ferries? Is that  
10 something y'all are thinking about working on? I  
11 know, it's a small little thing, but it would make a  
12 big difference to a bunch of families,

13 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: We are going to talk  
14 to Mark Trager on that one, as you suggest, and we'd  
15 be happy to... to, to get back to you on that.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: That man loves the  
17 ferry. He is going to help. (crosstalk)

18 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR WEISBERG: ... to help  
19 facilitate our students, and particular our students  
20 who come from low-income families to make sure they  
21 get to school.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you very much. I  
23 appreciate it. Thank you all.

24 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Council Member  
25 Restler. So Chairs, I will turn it back to you.

2 We've completed counseling for questions for SCA and  
3 DOE.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Chair Joseph, do you want  
5 to give a closing remarks?

6 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Oh, I just had two quick  
7 questions I wanted to answer: One: I know we have  
8 social workers in schools. What I'm hearing on the  
9 ground and as Council Restler, I visit schools, I  
10 live in schools. Those are my favorite buildings to  
11 be in, and I'm aware of everything. On one of the  
12 things we wanted to see as much as we put guidance  
13 counselors, social workers in schools, the training  
14 has to be there as well. That has to be PD provided  
15 to support what's happening in the classroom,  
16 especially around -- we throw this word around a lot  
17 -- social and emotional learning, but they're not  
18 connected to the classrooms. So there cannot be a  
19 disconnect, or we will not see the results that we're  
20 looking for. So I would love for someone to answer  
21 on that. And I have one other question as well.

22 CHIEF JOHNSON: Okay, thank you for the question  
23 Chair. So with regard to social emotional supports,  
24 we... as you know, we use the academic recovery funds  
25 to really launch the social emotional learning

2 screeners across all schools in the city. And what  
3 we were able to do with the social emotional  
4 screeners was to create a baseline of common  
5 language. And so by having schools kind of examine  
6 what are their social emotional supports that they  
7 provide for students, but also to look at young  
8 people and figure out where do they sit? Prior to  
9 that, we use teachers, anecdotal data, we use the  
10 range of different things, but now there is a set of  
11 common goals. And so looking to take the screener  
12 data, and then align that data to how we're  
13 leveraging social emotional support. So thinking  
14 about the training that happens, that connect...  
15 that's connected to the actual implementation  
16 execution, how you leverage the supports, and look at  
17 your young people, and how they performed according  
18 to the indicators... the eight indicators...  
19 indicators like optimistic thinking, responsible  
20 decision making self-awareness. So how do we look at  
21 where young people fit along that continuum? How do  
22 we put targeted supports in place? How do we leverage  
23 social emotional practices? And so we have the  
24 Harmony Program, which is available for all... all  
25 elementary schools. It's free. We have the Ruler

2 Program that we're utilizing. And then we've also  
3 been working with... with our schools to think about  
4 how do we leverage social emotional supports outside  
5 of just the... the separate social emotional space,  
6 but in the space where students spend the majority of  
7 their time, which is actually in the classroom? And  
8 how do we leverage those schools to deepen the  
9 learning and the academic outcomes?

10 And so working closely with DC Quintana, and the  
11 teaching and learning team, we've been thinking about  
12 how do we provide those wraparound supports for those  
13 young people? And how do we access those supports to  
14 really advance the academic outcomes? Because  
15 optimistic thinking helps you to prepare for problems  
16 that you need to go and solve. That math problem:  
17 You've got to think that you're able to do it in  
18 order to be able to engage with it.

19 So your question was around training for the  
20 adults? And so we've trained people around how to  
21 leverage and how to access and implement the  
22 screener, what are the systems and the conditions  
23 that you need in place to actually use a data driven  
24 strategy to align to the supports? And then we have  
25 targeted training and support that is within each of

2 the different mechanisms, but we also encourage  
3 school teams to use these data processes to say, what  
4 are the best supports that we need to put in place  
5 for our students in our population? And in our  
6 setting?

7 CHAIR JOSEPH: Okay, okay. All right, I'll come  
8 back... Another... another thing, um, when we... when  
9 we roll out curriculum, this is something I've seen  
10 22 years in and out. When we roll out curriculums,  
11 they mean well. We celebrate them. And when it  
12 comes time to train the teachers, and the training...  
13 there's no training to really support the teachers.  
14 The training has to be ongoing, because the programs  
15 have different components, because you do have to  
16 touch the needs of your ELL students. You have to  
17 have touch the needs of your SWDs, especially in ICT  
18 settings, and self-contained, you have all of that  
19 where lessons have to be modified. What type of  
20 training and PD are we ongoing with these new  
21 curriculums? I know there is a new curriculum that  
22 is going to that's going to be rolled out soon.  
23 What... what does the training look like? And you  
24 have to invest in the trainings as well. So how does

2 that look like dollar wise? And how does it look  
3 like in the classroom?

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR QUINTANA: Thank you, Chair.

5 So it will... it's going to look... so it depends on  
6 the program. But what will happen is we will roll  
7 out professional learning sessions, a series of  
8 sessions, and we will necessarily follow that up with  
9 job-embedded support.

10 I think one of the things that we have noted is  
11 that when teachers attend a standalone training, that  
12 often it is really useful in that moment. But if  
13 they don't receive the support to really implement  
14 that or to understand how to integrate what they've  
15 learned into what they're doing, that it doesn't  
16 stick in the same way. And so we're going to make  
17 sure that there's that job-embedded support.

18 The other component that's really important to  
19 us, and we're working with DC Blackburn on this, with  
20 his team on this as well, is to make sure that our  
21 leaders are trained. And so superintendents and  
22 principals will need to know. And there will be  
23 strategic planning support for those principals, so  
24 that they really are integrating, and whether it's as  
25 you just heard, Dr. Johnson talk about the framework

2 for whole-child education that we're basing all of  
3 our work on, you know, thinking about supportive  
4 environments, as emotional development, the system of  
5 supports, all of those kinds of things that we want  
6 to make sure are really embedded in how we do  
7 schooling, or if it's just a specific program. So we  
8 talked about, you know, the K through 2, explicit  
9 instruction of reading... whether it's that sort of  
10 large scale, or the more specific, we want to make  
11 sure that there's strategic planning with the  
12 principals so that they are integrating that into the  
13 way that they work. And it really becomes part of  
14 the DNA of the school.

15 CHAIR JOSEPH: And working in cohorts also really  
16 helps, so having teacher support and turning keys to  
17 each other, also help also in how they retain the  
18 information and transfer and turn key to their  
19 colleagues. Um, that's it for me. Um, Chair  
20 Brannan?

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you Chair Joseph,  
22 Chancellor, and your team. Thank you so much. I  
23 appreciate your time today and doing your best to  
24 answer all of our questions. And if we have any  
25 outstanding issues that weren't sufficiently answered

2 today, we'll follow up and send a letter so that we  
3 can get that in writing. But we look forward to  
4 negotiating this budget together to get it to a good  
5 place that it serves all of our kids in public  
6 schools. So I really appreciate your time tonight.  
7 Thank you.

8 CHANCELLOR BANKS: We appreciate you, both of you  
9 as chairs, not just here today, but also thank you  
10 very much for just the continued partnership. We  
11 said we're going to be joined at the hip. We're  
12 gonna work together on behalf of all our kids, and we  
13 mean it. We look forward to continued partnership  
14 with you. In fact, we get to get up and stretch now.

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: (Laughs) That's a luxury we  
16 don't have but enjoy. Thank you so much, Chancellor.

17 CHANCELLOR BANKS: Thank you, everybody. Bye-  
18 bye.

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chair Brannan, we have a few  
20 minutes before we switch over to the Department of  
21 Sanitation. And for the record, we'll just... for  
22 the prior hearing, we'll just make sure that we... we  
23 were joined by Councilmembers Gutierrez, Ossé,  
24 Hudson, Moya, Hanks, Restler, Stevens, Speaker Adams,  
25 Krishnhan, Abreu, De La Rosa, Ayala, Carr, Barron,

2 Ung, Avilez, Sanchez, Mennon, Nurse, and Paladino. I  
3 think we have most of the City Council.

4 Chair Joseph, it was good seeing you.

5 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Same here.

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chair Brannan, will do a...  
7 once the admin is on for DSNY, we'll do a mic check  
8 and then we will just get right to it with you and  
9 Chair Nurse.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I'm just gonna grab a cup  
11 of water.

12 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Sure.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay.

14 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Have a great hearing,  
15 Council Member Nurse. I'm gonna stick around. I've  
16 never been to sanitation.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Tickets are \$5 for this.

18 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Can I get... Can I get a  
19 matinee ticket? Council Member Barron, good seeing  
20 you too.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Good seeing  
22 you too.

23 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you for those amazing  
24 questions.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh, I can't wait to get  
3 them in the district. I ain't finished with him!

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'm coming to visit you  
5 soon!

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, I'm looking forward  
7 to it.

8 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Commissioner Tisch welcome.  
9 You should be able to unmute yourself.

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I just did.

11 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay perfect. Deputy  
12 Commissioner Gregory Anderson?

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I'll make sure he's on in a  
14 second.

15 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay. Deputy Commissioner  
16 Bridget Anderson?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: Good Morning  
18 or... good afternoon. Good afternoon.

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Perfect we can hear you. And  
20 Chief Lohan? You should be able to unmute yourself.

21 CHIEF LOHAN: Good afternoon. I'm on.

22 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Perfect. Thank you.

23 [266:15 to 268:45 SILENCE]

24

25

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Commissioner Gregory  
3 Anderson, do you want to unmute yourself just make  
4 sure we're able to hear your audio?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Hey there how  
6 are you?

7 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Perfect. Thank you.

8 All right chairs, just let me know when you're  
9 both ready.

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: I'm ready whenever  
11 councilmember Brannan is.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, I'm good.

13 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay. Give me just a moment to  
14 get started in just a second here. We're only four  
15 minutes behind schedule. Not bad. For the record,  
16 we'll just recognize who we're joined with:

17 Councilmembers Brannan, Nurse, Paladino, Barron,  
18 Ayala, Brewer, Gennaro, Louis, Ossé, Sanchez, Joseph,  
19 Farias, Hudson, and Bottcher.

20 Chair Brandon I will turn it to you for for your  
21 opening remarks.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN:

23 Thank you, Counsel. Good afternoon, and welcome  
24 to the second portion of today's fiscal 23 executive  
25 budget hearing. This afternoon we have the pleasure

2 of hearing from the Department of Sanitation, and I'm  
3 joined by my colleague and co-chair, Council Member  
4 Sandy Nurse, Chair of the Committee on Sanitation.

5 The Department of Sanitation is projected fiscal  
6 23 budget of \$1.83 billion represents 1.8% of the  
7 city's proposed fiscal 23 budget in the Executive  
8 Plan. DSNY's fiscal 23 budget increased by \$50.5  
9 million, an increase of 2.8% from the fiscal 23  
10 preliminary plan of \$1.78 billion. The increase is a  
11 result of a number of actions taken, most significant  
12 of which are \$17.9 million for organic programs, \$7.9  
13 million for waste characterization study \$13.3  
14 million for motor fuel adjustment, and \$2.9 million  
15 for bike lane sweeping. I want to thank Commissioner  
16 Tisch for joining us this afternoon. I look forward  
17 to hearing more from the department on the executive  
18 budget plan. I'll be digging deeper into the issues  
19 of the FY23 Council budget response and especially  
20 the Administration's lack of funding for many of the  
21 programs that were highlighted in the Council and its  
22 budget, corner litter baskets, and the fact that no  
23 funding was included in the executive budget for a  
24 litter basket service, the restoration of curbside e-  
25 waste collection, overtime usage, and something I

2 know you'll be familiar with, which is sanitation  
3 service levels by district.

4 I appreciate the efforts of the department as  
5 made with programs like organics, but if we cannot  
6 get the basics right, as in getting our corner  
7 baskets picked up, then I'm troubled by all the other  
8 things that department wants to do, frankly. So  
9 forthright answers to these questions or more will be  
10 very important today as we as we get through this  
11 hearing.

12 I want to thank the Finance Division, especially  
13 John Seltzer, and Carillion Francisco, and my senior  
14 advisor John Yeddin for help in preparing for today's  
15 hearing. There's a lot of work that goes on behind  
16 the scenes to get these numbers right. And I  
17 appreciate their hard work. And I want to thank all  
18 the Council staff working behind the scenes to get  
19 this virtual hearing off the ground today.

20 I want to say that I've long said sanitation  
21 workers have one of the most thankless, and demanding  
22 and important jobs in our city, we leave our trash  
23 outside, and we expect it to disappear. We don't  
24 notice when it does disappear. We only notice when  
25 it doesn't, and that's when we all lose our minds.

2 So I appreciate that. I appreciate the work that our  
3 sanitation men and women do, and I call them everyday  
4 heroes for a reason. With that, I want to turn it  
5 over to my colleague and Chair of the Sanitation  
6 Department. I want to acknowledge the... the energy  
7 that Council Member Nurse has brought to sanitation,  
8 which is very helpful because frankly, back in the  
9 old days, it was me and Paul Vallone who were the  
10 only people who were yelling and screaming about  
11 sanitation funding. So it's nice that the cavalry  
12 has finally arrived. But now you've got the Finance  
13 Chair and the Sanitation Chair who care a lot about  
14 keeping our streets clean, and we want to work with  
15 you and get it right that especially as we recover  
16 from this pandemic.

17 So with that I want to turn it over to Co-Chair  
18 Sandy Nurse for her opening remarks.

19 CHAIR NURSE: Thank you. Good afternoon,  
20 everyone. Thank you Chair Brannan. I'm hoping to  
21 get one of those War On Trash posters for my  
22 backgrounds as well, and thank you for all your  
23 advocacy for the budget for a lot of the sanitation  
24 services we need. I want to thank sanitation  
25 committee members and other members for being here.

2 Congratulations Commissioner Jessica Tisch, and  
3 welcome to your first Sanitation Committee hearing.  
4 Great to see both Deputy Commissioners Anderson and  
5 Anderson, and additional leadership for joining us  
6 today.

7 As... as we have seen the city 311 data through  
8 the needs assessment reports of our community boards  
9 and in the media, sanitation affects public safety,  
10 public health, and environmental outcomes in every  
11 single neighborhood across the city. I along with  
12 many New Yorkers am impacted, and we've all been a  
13 little bit disappointed in the level of sanitation  
14 service our city has received over the past two  
15 years, mostly due to the deep cuts made by the prior  
16 administration. Last month, council members  
17 responded to the mayor's preliminary budget with a  
18 unified voice. The Department of Sanitation must be  
19 adequately funded and baseline, and we must invest in  
20 the waste infrastructure and operations required to  
21 achieve our city's long term zero waste goals. We're  
22 committed to addressing both the immediate needs of  
23 New Yorkers, those basic services the chair was  
24 speaking about and, investing in the absolutely  
25 critical long term innovative and sustainable waste

2 management systems we need to address environmental  
3 and justices and the climate crisis.

4 I'm looking forward to discussing FY 2003 budget,  
5 which totals about \$1.83 billion. While the  
6 administration included funding for new and restored  
7 programs that the council called for in our budget  
8 response, there truly is so much more to be done. A  
9 majority of our items were not funded including  
10 expanded, curbside organics, rat mitigation programs,  
11 litter basket service, uniform headcount  
12 restorations, civilian vacancy restorations, the  
13 build-out of a new organics processing facility, and  
14 funding for a long overdue Save As You Throw study.  
15 These restorations should have been prioritized by  
16 the Administration and from my perspective is a win-  
17 win-win for everyone. It seems that everyone in New  
18 York City really wants us to get on top of trash and  
19 rats.

20 Last month I alongside my fellow council members  
21 Keith Powers and Shahana Hanif introduced a robust  
22 Zero Waste legislative package for universal organic  
23 composting accessibility and for requiring the city  
24 to establish, report on, and meet our 2030 waste  
25 diversion goals. So I'm excited to work with you

2 commissioner to ensure New York City is positioned as  
3 a national and global leader on zero waste and  
4 sustainability, because we know the future of New  
5 York City depends on us getting it right and in time.

6 As always, I want to thank my wonderful  
7 legislative director Enelle Hernandez for her hard  
8 work preparing for this hearing. I also want to  
9 thank John Seltzer, Jessica Steinberg Albin, and  
10 Ricky Challah for supporting me as Chair. Thank you  
11 especially to John for answering as many questions as  
12 we had and the Finance Team for their analysis and  
13 insights on the sanitation budget.

14 Additionally, I want to applaud the leadership of  
15 Speaker Adams, Chair Brannan, the budget negotiation  
16 team, my fellow council members and all of the  
17 advocates and New Yorkers who raise their voices to  
18 demand a well-funded DSNY as prioritized in this  
19 year's budget process.

20 So thank you again, looking forward to this  
21 hearing. I will now turn it back to committee  
22 counsel.

23 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Chairs Brandon and  
24 Nurse. Good afternoon and welcome everyone to the  
25 second agency hearing for May 10, The Department of

2 Sanitation. My name is Malcolm Butehorn, and I am  
3 counsel to the Finance Committee. There are some  
4 additional council members we want to acknowledge:  
5 Councilmembers Carr, Velázquez, and Kagan. Unlike in  
6 past I want to remind Council Members and members of  
7 the mayoral administration, you will have the ability  
8 to unmute yourselves. Council Members who have  
9 questions should use the raise hand function in Zoom.  
10 You will be called on in the order with which you  
11 raised your hand, and Council Members will be limited  
12 to five minutes. We please ask that you listen to  
13 the cues from the Sergeant At Arms. The following  
14 members of the administration are here to testify and  
15 are answer questions:

16       Jessica Tisch, Commissioner. Bridget Anderson,  
17 Deputy Commissioner. Gregory Anderson, Deputy  
18 Commissioner, and Chief Javier Lohan, Acting Deputy  
19 Commissioner for Financial Management and  
20 Administration.

21       I will first read the oath and after I will call  
22 on each member from the administration individually  
23 to respond. Do you refer them to tell the truth, the  
24 whole truth and nothing but the truth before these  
25

2 committees and to respond honestly to council member  
3 questions. Commissioner Tisch?

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I do.

5 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Commissioner Bridget  
6 Anderson.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: I do.

8 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Commissioner Gregory  
9 Anderson.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: I do.

11 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: And Chief Lohan?

12 CHIEF LOHAN: I do.

13 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. Commissioner  
14 Tisch, you may begin when ready.

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you. Good afternoon  
16 Chairs Brannan and Nurse and members of the City  
17 Council Committee on Finance and Sanitation and Solid  
18 Waste Management. My name is Jessica Tisch and I am  
19 Commissioner of the New York City Department of  
20 Sanitation. Thank you for the opportunity to testify  
21 today on the department's executive budget for fiscal  
22 year 2023. I am joined by Gregory Anderson, Deputy  
23 Commissioner for Policy and External Affairs, Bridget  
24 Anderson Deputy Commissioner for Recycling and  
25 Sustainability. And Chief Javier Lohan, Acting

2 Deputy Commissioner for Financial Management and  
3 Administration.

4 I am delighted to be here in front of these  
5 committees today, and I look forward to working with  
6 you and this entire city council to clean up our  
7 streets and make New York City a more vibrant and  
8 sustainable place to live, a goal that I know we all  
9 share. I am a lifelong New Yorker, and that means I  
10 have spent my entire life admiring the work of the  
11 sanitation department and its 10,000 members of  
12 service, who have spent the last two years showing  
13 that they are the epitome of essential, the epitome  
14 of the neighborhood hero. They care about clean  
15 streets, they care about giving their neighbors that  
16 peace of mind they deserve, about getting our city  
17 moving and keeping our communities safe, healthy, and  
18 of course clean.

19 As this is my first hearing in my new role as  
20 Sanitation Commissioner, let me take a moment to  
21 introduce myself. I've worked in city government for  
22 nearly 15 years, most of that time was at the NYPD.  
23 And more recently, I served as Commissioner of the  
24 Department of Information Technology and  
25 Telecommunications during the pandemic. I consider

2 myself to be an effective problem solver who knows  
3 how to get things done for New Yorkers and will run  
4 through a brick wall trying. I've applied a can-do  
5 attitude to things like overhauling the city's  
6 vaccination approach, bringing down 911 response  
7 times, ending the digital divide for homeless  
8 children and their families, and rolling out body-  
9 worn cameras to every uniform member of service of  
10 the NYPD. And that's what I'm going to continue  
11 doing as Commissioner of the Department of  
12 Sanitation.

13 Over the past three weeks, I've gone to 6am Roll  
14 call garages in every borough. I've spoken to  
15 hundreds of sanitation workers about the work they do  
16 day in and day out, largely unseen from the public  
17 eye. And I visited our marine transfer stations to  
18 see the results of more than a billion dollars in  
19 investments in sustainable, effective, and equitable  
20 waste management infrastructure. I've been getting  
21 under the hood of this department, meeting with every  
22 chief and borough chief, understanding and digging  
23 into the department's programs, policies and  
24 priorities, and I feel quite blessed to be doing it.

2 I want to be very clear upfront that I agree with  
3 New Yorkers who feel that our study is meaningfully  
4 dirtier than it was before the pandemic, and that is  
5 not acceptable. I've long felt that to fix a  
6 problem, you have to understand it. And the good  
7 news is it's patently obvious to me what happened  
8 here. And even better news is that with your help in  
9 partnership, the Adams Administration will be  
10 addressing it aggressively.

11 First street sweeping, effective July 5, we will  
12 finally be sweeping the streets again, which will  
13 make a meaningful difference in the cleanliness of  
14 every neighborhood in this city. The partial  
15 suspension of alternate side parking was a pandemic  
16 measure to let people stay inside more, but it went  
17 on for far too long, and it largely sideline the most  
18 effective clean streets tool we have in our arsenal,  
19 the mechanical broom. When I say the mechanical  
20 broom, or street sweeper is the most effective clean  
21 streets tool in our arsenal, I mean it, they don't  
22 just sweep the trash on the streets to the curb, they  
23 suck it all up inside the cab. In fact, on an  
24 average shift, a single mechanical broom can suck up  
25 1500 pounds of street litter. That's taking 1500

2 pounds of litter off the city streets on a single  
3 route. The dirty little secret here is that when ASP  
4 went to one day a week instead of two, in practice,  
5 it was like having no cleaning on lots of blocks in  
6 the city. Don't get me wrong. That's not because we  
7 stopped sending street sweepers to do their jobs.  
8 It's because the policy created a world where too  
9 many people saw once in a once-in-a-while ASP ticket  
10 as just the cost of doing business. Our sanitation  
11 workers operating the brooms estimated that 50 plus  
12 percent of cars didn't move for ASP under the more  
13 limited pandemic rules. So the pandemic policy  
14 change had a disproportionate effect on the amount of  
15 cleaning the agency could do. It was intended to  
16 halve it, but in practice it more than halved it. It  
17 follows that restoring ASP to twice a week should  
18 more than double the amount of cleaning weekend and  
19 we'll do. The restoration of full alternate side  
20 parking regulations comes with a headcount increase  
21 of 41 sanitation workers that had been cut in January  
22 2021, and \$1.9 million in additional funding in FY  
23 23.

24 Second topic is bike lane sweeping. This summer  
25 New Yorkers will see a new fleet of mini-sweepers

2 that can also be used as snow plows in the winter  
3 that we'll be performing year round cleaning and  
4 maintenance of the city's growing network of  
5 protected bike lanes. Bike lanes are a great thing.  
6 But the program was rolled out nearly a decade ago,  
7 and over 100 miles a protected bike line lanes have  
8 been built out without a practical plan in place to  
9 keep those bike lanes clean. That ends now. With  
10 the advocacy and partnership of Commissioner  
11 Rodriguez and the Department of Transportation, we  
12 are addressing this issue. This starts with a  
13 capital investment of \$6.7 million in a fleet of mini  
14 sweepers beginning with 10 units with sweeper  
15 attachments this summer. By the end of next year, we  
16 will have a permanent fleet of 45 total units in two  
17 different sizes to clean and plough even the  
18 narrowest protected bike lanes. We also have \$2.8  
19 million in new expense funding in FY 23 to provide  
20 person power to operate and maintain this equipment  
21 for years to come, and purchase a suite of  
22 attachments that will make them some of the most  
23 versatile units in our street cleaning arsenal. This  
24 new stack will allow us to sweep protected bike lanes

2 year round with a goal of sweeping every lane once a  
3 week.

4 Third topic is litter baskets. We are committed  
5 to cleaning up our city. We hear your complaints  
6 about the overflowing conditions and agree that they  
7 are not dignified, they are not okay. In FY 2022, we  
8 have more than doubled the litter baskets service  
9 from pandemic lows in FY 21 to 588 weekly trucks. We  
10 would greatly appreciate any additional funding to  
11 expand services, and we stand ready to implement.  
12 The Adams Administration looks forward to working  
13 closely with the council to determine an appropriate  
14 level of service for all New Yorkers.

15 Can I guarantee after the adopted budget that New  
16 Yorkers will never see an overflowing litter basket  
17 again? No. But we will work to ensure that these  
18 conditions are minimized and call on all New Yorkers  
19 to do their part to keep our city clean. Overflowing  
20 litter basket issues that remain should be the result  
21 of the misuse of the litter basket rather than lack  
22 of service. Litter baskets are for walking trash  
23 only -- the coffee cup -- as opposed to residential  
24 or commercial trash, and when they are misused, it  
25 creates a blight on our communities.

2 Fourth topic is rats. On my third day on the  
3 job, I was thrilled to join Mayor Adams senior  
4 administration leadership and several council members  
5 to unveil the city's first clean curbs bins in Times  
6 Square, the first step in an effort to containerize  
7 trash that used to be piled in bags on the street,  
8 serving as a free all-you-can-eat buffet for rats.

9 DSNY and SBS recently announced the neighborhood  
10 challenge grant program for bids and community based  
11 development organizations to make public space and  
12 cleanliness improvements with a particular focus on  
13 bids in underserved communities. The department  
14 received 29 applications for funding last month and a  
15 second round of grant applications will open this  
16 summer. The city is moving ahead with a five-borough  
17 approach to the Clean Curbs pilots, deploying bins  
18 for residential BID and commercial waste using a  
19 combination of public and private funding. This new  
20 five-borough approach includes \$1.3 million in new  
21 funding in FY 2023 and recurring in the out years.

22 Fifth topic is dog poop. New Yorkers see it  
23 everywhere, and it has become a bigger problem over  
24 the past two years, yet in 2020 and 2021, a grand  
25 total of zero summonses had been written to people

2 who don't pick up after their pets. That changes  
3 now. This is about decency, courtesy and respect,  
4 and the Department of Sanitation won't tolerate it  
5 anymore.

6 Sixth topic is illegal dumping. For those who  
7 are unfamiliar with the term that's when a business  
8 which is required to dispose of its waste itself or  
9 through the use of a private carter decides instead  
10 to leave piles of trash bags in a vacant lot or even  
11 on a sidewalk. Illegal dumping tends to be a bigger  
12 problem in the most underserved parts of the city.  
13 It's a huge issue in Hunts Point. It's a huge issue  
14 in East New York. Here we are taking a several  
15 pronged approach. We are precision cleaning teams in  
16 each borough whose main job is to clean known dumping  
17 locations, but continuously chasing dumps doesn't  
18 solve the problem because it keeps happening. We  
19 have also stepped up our enforcement efforts over the  
20 past three months, investing in cameras in known dump  
21 locations to catch illegal dumpers in the act. When  
22 caught an illegal dumper is subject to a \$4,000 fine,  
23 and if they're using a car to transport the material,  
24 their car will be impounded. I want to be very clear  
25 that illegal dumping is a theft of public space, and

2 I can think of no more important use of our  
3 enforcement team's time than ensuring that those who  
4 are knowingly dumping their trash in our communities  
5 be held accountable for it.

6 The seventh topic is derelict vehicles. There  
7 are citywide problems and their local ones. Derelict  
8 vehicles are a local issue but with big implications  
9 for quality of life in the outer boroughs. We see  
10 this problem in parts of the Bronx, Southeast Queens,  
11 and central Brooklyn. Not only do these vehicles  
12 become eyesores, they also prevent our brooms from  
13 cleaning the streets. I am going to refocus on  
14 getting these vehicles off the streets, and we will  
15 be partnering with our counterparts at the NYPD to  
16 get this done. Clean streets should be the reality  
17 for all New Yorkers, regardless of where they live.  
18 I want to be clear that I do not believe in  
19 enforcement for enforcement's sake, and there are  
20 many problems that you can't and shouldn't enforce  
21 your way out of. That can be dangerous. But I do  
22 believe that enforcement must be a tool in our  
23 arsenal to deal with that very small percentage of  
24 New Yorkers and New York City businesses who choose  
25 not to do the simple right thing, who choose not to

2 abide by the straightforward laws and rules that  
3 relate to the cleanliness of our city. As an  
4 example, at two in the afternoon, New Yorkers should  
5 see virtually no trash bags piled up on the streets.  
6 But we do in every neighborhood and every community  
7 in our city. It can be a business that is decided to  
8 put their trash out early, over and over and over  
9 again, or a big chain retail store that rarely does  
10 its duty sweeping in front of its storefront. We  
11 have heard this a lot in particular in Bay Ridge.  
12 Well, to all the residents that have complained about  
13 this type of thing to 311, and to the Department of  
14 Sanitation, I say: I hear you, and we are going to do  
15 everything in our power to correct that behavior.  
16 And if we have to write summonses, well then so be  
17 it.

18 I also want to commit to you that my obsession  
19 with the cleanliness of our city today will not be to  
20 the exclusion of the important work that we have to  
21 do around securing our collective future. To the  
22 contrary, our work around sustainability could not be  
23 more urgent, and I am committed to elevating  
24 environmental justice as a core principle in all  
25 aspects of our work. That of course includes the

2 successful implementation of the ambitious Commercial  
3 Waste Zone Program, as well as following through with  
4 the groundbreaking Waste Equity Laws that the council  
5 passed during the last administration. The executive  
6 budget includes \$29.1 million in new funding in  
7 fiscal 23 to expand our commitments to zero waste and  
8 sustainable waste management long term. Most  
9 importantly, we have \$17.9 million in new funding for  
10 organics programs in FY 23, nearly zeroing out the  
11 reductions in organics funding under the preliminary  
12 budget peg program. Managing organic waste, which  
13 makes up 34% of our waste stream is an important part  
14 of achieving our zero waste goals, but we must ensure  
15 we do so both effectively and cost effectively. This  
16 new funding allows us to expand a program that we  
17 know works well and sets the stage by educating the  
18 next generation of New Yorkers. In partnership with  
19 DOE, we will begin expanding compost collection to  
20 all New York City public schools, nearly doubling the  
21 size of the school composting program that exists  
22 today. The budget includes funding to expand compost  
23 collection to all public schools, and to provide the  
24 education and support that school staff, including  
25 principals, custodians, teachers and food service

2 workers need to successfully divert their organic  
3 waste.

4 I thank the Council for their advocacy for this  
5 measure, and we look forward to working with you to  
6 ensure the rollout is successful at every school in  
7 every neighborhood. We will also leverage these  
8 expanded school organics routes to expand access to  
9 composting for residents. We will add 100 new smart  
10 bins near public schools for parents and community  
11 members to drop off their own food scraps. These  
12 bins which are accessed using an app or a free RFID  
13 card will be collected using the same trucks that  
14 already service our public schools and will be cited  
15 to maximize equity in our network of drop off sites  
16 citywide. The new funding for organics programs also  
17 continues, and baselines \$3.5 million in annual  
18 funding for our community composting partners and  
19 food scrap drop off sites that was first added to the  
20 budget in FY 22. This will support an expanded  
21 network of 221 partner hosted drop off sites in every  
22 community district citywide and provide vital support  
23 to our nonprofit partners that educate New Yorkers  
24 about the importance of composting and the  
25 connections of healthy and vibrant neighborhoods. I

2 met last week with many of the volunteers who work  
3 these sites and they are a blessing to the city.

4 Lastly, this new investment provides baseline  
5 funding for the department's annual fall leaf and  
6 yard waste collection program for the first time in  
7 many years. This program may just may be just 4  
8 short weeks, but it regularly collects 3000 tons or  
9 more of leaves and other yard waste to be converted  
10 into valuable and nutrient rich compost. The  
11 executive budget also includes \$2.6 million to  
12 support the relocation of the Lower East Side Ecology  
13 Center compost site, which has been temporarily moved  
14 out of East River Park to facilitate the construction  
15 of the East Side Coastal Resiliency Project.

16 We won't stop there, I am taking a comprehensive  
17 look at our composting programs past and present to  
18 figure out what works and what doesn't. This  
19 administration is committed to making strides on  
20 organics, but we cannot throw good money after bad.  
21 I look forward to working with you all to discuss  
22 these programs and develop a path forward for the  
23 future. Aside from composting organics, the  
24 executive budget funds two important programs that

2 will help us plan for a more sustainable and  
3 equitable future of waste in New York City.

4 First, it includes \$7.9 million in FY 23 and \$8.4  
5 million total to conduct a new waste characterization  
6 study. The waste characterization study gives us the  
7 clearest possible picture of what New Yorkers throw  
8 away on a daily basis, and helps us tailor existing  
9 and new programs and policies in our efforts to move  
10 toward zero waste. It will also be our first  
11 opportunity to see the detailed impact of bans on  
12 home products, and single use plastic bags. In  
13 addition, the executive budget includes \$550,000 in  
14 funds for the first phase of planning for our new  
15 Solid Waste Management Plan. This plan, on track to  
16 be completed in 2026, will be the first major update  
17 to the city's landmark 2006 comprehensive solid waste  
18 management plan, which laid the groundwork for our  
19 sustainable and resilient network of marine and barge  
20 based transfer stations that we rely on today.

21 Now I will briefly take you through the more  
22 technical details of the department's FY 23 budget.  
23 DSNY's fiscal year 23 executive budget includes \$1.83  
24 billion in expense funding. This is broken down  
25 between \$1.06 billion and personal services to

2 support 9444 full time positions and \$775 million  
3 other-than-personal services, or OTPs. For fiscal  
4 year 22, the expense budget increased by \$100.2  
5 million from the Preliminary Budget to the Executive  
6 Budget. This increase is largely due to personnel  
7 services adjustments due to increased spending in the  
8 current fiscal year and adjustments reflect actual  
9 spending during the 21-22 snow season. For fiscal  
10 year 23, the expense budget increased by \$50.4  
11 million for the Preliminary Budget the Executive  
12 Budget. This increase is primarily driven by the new  
13 initiatives I mentioned earlier in my testimony, as  
14 well as adjustments to motor fuel, and heat, light,  
15 and power budgets to reflect increased costs for  
16 these line items given market conditions. DSNY's  
17 fiscal year 23 Executive Budget includes \$3.41  
18 billion in capital funding and the 10 year plan,  
19 \$1.23 billion of which is for garages and facilities,  
20 \$1.96 billion for equipment, \$59.2 million for IT,  
21 and \$164 million for solid waste management  
22 infrastructure. The capital budget includes funding  
23 for several major facilities projects currently  
24 underway, including construction of the new  
25 sanitation Staten Island district 1 and 3 garage,

2 managed by DDC which has an overall budget of \$198  
3 million and is forecast to be completed by 2024.  
4 That can't come soon enough. Construction of the new  
5 Brooklyn district 3 garage which has an overall  
6 budget of \$204 million, and is forecast to be  
7 completed by 2024, and upgrades to the facility that  
8 will serve as the new home for the Manhattan District  
9 11 garage, which has an overall budget of \$26.9  
10 million and will be substantially complete later this  
11 year.

12 I'll just close by saying this: I see these  
13 committees and every member of the City Council as  
14 partners in achieving all the goals discussed today.  
15 I have worked closely with the Council for over a  
16 decade, and your feedback, input, and even your  
17 criticism have consistently elevated my performance.  
18 My door will remain open to you at all times, and I  
19 will not shy away from tough conversations about the  
20 steps we need to take as a city to keep New York  
21 healthy, safe and clean. I look forward to many  
22 years of collaboration with each of you and with the  
23 many stakeholders that play an important role in our  
24 work.

2 Thank you again for this opportunity to testify  
3 today on the department's important work. My  
4 colleagues and I are now very happy to answer your  
5 questions.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Commissioner.  
7 We're all on board. Sounds... sounds great. We look  
8 forward to working with you. A clean neighborhood as  
9 a safe neighborhood and a safe neighborhood is the  
10 foundation for everything else. So we all want to  
11 get this right.

12 I want to dive in. The committee... we might not  
13 get to all of our questions... or we don't... We  
14 hope not, but if you don't have answers or responses,  
15 we'll send a followup letter for the unanswered  
16 questions, which are important to us as we go through  
17 our budget negotiations.

18 So let's dive right in. In the council's fiscal  
19 23 budget response, we called upon the administration  
20 to add approximately \$96 million in expense items and  
21 \$1 million in capital items to the executive budget.  
22 However, as of the executive budget, only \$17.5  
23 million was restored. Although we're happy to see  
24 some of these items included, we're still missing  
25 additional funding for some of the following items:

2 So \$22 million for additional litter basket service  
3 citywide, \$47.8 million to restore fiscal 23 budget  
4 cuts mainly for garaged utility or splinter group  
5 staff reductions, curbside organics program  
6 expansion, and civilian vacancies. \$4.8 million for  
7 additional rat mitigation program funding, \$3.6  
8 million for curbside e-waste collection, \$3.4 million  
9 for additional enforcement personnel to help with  
10 illegal dumping that you mentioned, \$2.2 million to  
11 restore prior year lot cleaning cuts, \$864,000 to  
12 restore a prior cut for supplemental highway ramp  
13 cleaning, and \$1 million for the Same As You Throw  
14 Study, as well as \$1 million for a new organics  
15 processing facility.

16 So I'm rattling off all these items, because I'm  
17 hoping that you or someone at your agency can speak  
18 to whether the \$17.5 million that was restored...  
19 what, if any, conversations were had internally or  
20 externally regarding the council's budget response  
21 requests and how determinations were made? Because  
22 we're happy with a lot of this stuff. But it's not  
23 even close to the full loaf that were looking for.

24 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you Chair for that  
25 question. I unfortunately cannot speak to the

2 conversations that happened internally as part of the  
3 Executive Budget process because I started here three  
4 weeks ago. It was after those conversations  
5 occurred. But what I can say is, I and the  
6 sanitation department... we are deeply appreciative  
7 of the council's advocacy for so many of these  
8 issues, and we were actually pleased to see that the  
9 Executive Budget funded a number of really important  
10 strategic programs that will lay the groundwork for  
11 things to come. Importantly, was the investment in  
12 cleanliness, restoring alternate side parking to  
13 twice a week, as I mentioned in my testimony,  
14 desperately needed and will make a huge dent in the  
15 cleanliness of the city, and also what I think are  
16 very smart investments in organics, not throwing good  
17 money after bad, not doubling down on a strategy that  
18 didn't necessarily work, but focusing our resources  
19 for the time being on strategies that we know will  
20 work. So an investment in organics in our schools...  
21 teaching the next generation of New Yorkers up front,  
22 giving them the muscle memory to separate out their  
23 organic waste.

24 Another one that I just like to highlight is the  
25 smart bins... that we're investing in 100 additional

2 smart bins that will be rolled out by 100 Public  
3 Schools, and they're an opportunity for parents,  
4 community members to drop off their organic waste in  
5 bins. This builds... this investment builds on a  
6 pilot program that we've conducted in... in Astoria,  
7 which has actually been wildly successful, where  
8 we've placed 20 Smart bins for organics collection  
9 throughout Astoria. Every day, every bin is full, it  
10 has pristine organic material, and that organic  
11 material is collected every day. So I guess, my high  
12 level answer to your very detailed question is:  
13 While I understand that the administration didn't  
14 fund everything, I think we made investments in... in  
15 a lot of the right places: Alternate side, organics,  
16 and of course I would appreciate any additional  
17 funding that is worked out in the adopted budget for  
18 litter baskets. With litter baskets more is  
19 certainly more.

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Right. Yeah. Okay. I  
21 mean... it's... there's just a significant Delta  
22 there, right? We had... we called on the  
23 administration to add approximately \$96 million, and  
24 sanitation came back with \$17.5 million. So there's  
25 a significant gulf.

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. And we expect the  
3 administration and the council to be able to  
4 negotiate some of the critical programs that you  
5 prioritize.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: All right, let's talk about  
7 litter baskets. This is one of my favorite subjects.  
8 So as you know, the council provides a substantial  
9 amount of funding each fiscal year to the sanitation  
10 department for supplemental sanitation services, as  
11 well to procure high end litter baskets. So in  
12 fiscal 22, the council allocated approximately \$5.2  
13 million in funding across various discretionary  
14 initiatives for supplemental sanitation services.  
15 What... can you tell me, what is the primary service  
16 that Council Members fund your agency for?

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Alright. It's really...  
18 it's really three things. So the first is purchase  
19 of new litter baskets, and then the associated  
20 service required for those litter baskets. We also  
21 have some council members who prioritize extra  
22 curbside pickups. So if the standard... if you want  
23 to add an extra day, prioritizing that. And then  
24 more recently, cameras at illegal dumping sites.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Council Member Brewer,  
3 could you mute your phone?

4 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: I've gone ahead and done that.

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Counsel.

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Chair, I know that you have  
7 funded extra curbside collection in your district.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, yeah. I mean, you  
9 know what, in the... during COVID, In the DeBlasio  
10 budgets, you know, the, the basic services were cut  
11 so drastically that the money that I would normally  
12 allocate to someone like the DOE fund, or ACE or  
13 Wildcat to do supplemental services, me and a lot of  
14 my former colleagues had to give that money back to  
15 sanitation just to get us back up to... you know, you  
16 can't go from six days a week basket pickup to three  
17 days a week and think that, you know, it's just going  
18 to work itself out.

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And we've seen the numbers  
20 play out. So we saw in the 311 complaints, for  
21 example, I used to run 311, we saw the number of  
22 complaints around litter baskets literally double as  
23 a result of the cuts like almost immediately.

24 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yup. It's overnight. You  
25 cut the sanitation budget, you feel it overnight.

2           Alright, let's keep moving. So the current  
3 number of weekly basket trucks citywide for fiscal 22  
4 -- correct me if I'm wrong -- is 588, of which 452  
5 are baseline and 136 trucks are supplemental due to  
6 one-time funding the council negotiated to be  
7 included at adoption this year. As of the executive  
8 budget, can you tell me what the baseline weekly  
9 projected litter basket service level for FY 23 is,  
10 and how does it compare to the current fiscal year?

11           COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. The baseline is still  
12 452. And obviously, the 452 is lower than the 588,  
13 and we appreciate working with the council to come up  
14 with the right level of service to give New Yorkers  
15 the cleanliness that they deserve. As I said on  
16 litter baskets: more as more.

17           CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Alright, let's keep talking  
18 about my favorite topic. So the council would love  
19 to see twice a day litter basket pickups... twice a  
20 day corner basket pickups in every district citywide  
21 Monday through Saturday, which is why we call for an  
22 additional \$22 million on a city wide basis. How  
23 many districts would you say receive this level of  
24 service currently?

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, geez. I mean, it's  
3 under 20% right now. So it's under 20% of the  
4 city... of districts in the city have twice daily  
5 pickup, and it's not even necessarily twice daily  
6 throughout the whole that... even the districts that  
7 are covered... that whole district. The way it's  
8 been is we have prioritized districts that have a lot  
9 of... that see a lot of foot traffic. So districts  
10 in Manhattan downtown Brooklyn, parts of  
11 Williamsburg, the vast majority of the city has once  
12 daily.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah. Once daily and how  
14 many times a week?

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It's... It's six.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, I'd love to get that  
17 to six days a week, twice a day. That's what we need  
18 because I don't want I don't want Council Member  
19 Nurse to kill me, but all this other... the  
20 composting is very... it's getting more and more  
21 important, and it's getting more mainstream which is  
22 great, right? But if I'm taking my kid to school and  
23 I see that overflowing garbage can then I get on the  
24 D train and I go to work and I come home I pick my  
25 kid up from school, that same basket is still

2 overflowing, and now it's... it's growing... it's  
3 multiplying. That's what people see. That's what  
4 they think. "Ah, the city is going to hell, you  
5 know, everything is falling apart." That's the stuff  
6 that they see. That's why corner basket pickup is  
7 so... is so crucial.

8 Let's talk about curbside e-waste collection.  
9 Trying to narrow it a little bit more. The fiscal 23  
10 executive budget does not restore one-time fiscal 22  
11 funding of \$1.4 million for the Staten Island  
12 curbside e-waste collection, nor does the budget  
13 provide funding for the citywide curbside e-waste  
14 collection of which we call for it our budget  
15 response. Prior to fiscal 21, curbside e-waste  
16 collection programs serviced the Bronx, Brooklyn,  
17 Queens, and Staten Island. So if I have an old  
18 television to throw out, what do I do in fiscal 23?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: In fiscal 23, so far, you  
20 have three options. So if you live in a building  
21 that has 10 or more apartments, you can be part of  
22 the E-Cycle Program, which is funded by our ERP,  
23 which means you can... the building calls and makes  
24 an appointment for pickup, and the vendor comes and  
25 picks up. I think you said your old TV was the

2 example? The... obviously, that doesn't work for  
3 people who live, for example, in single-family homes.  
4 So for them, they have two additional options: They  
5 can drop that TV off at one of our special waste drop  
6 off sites. There's one per borough open every  
7 Saturday and the last Friday of each month. Or they  
8 can go to one of our safe disposal events. There are  
9 two per borough per year. So those are the two  
10 options that remain for them with the cut in the  
11 curbside program.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So I got a great idea: How  
13 about we allocate \$3.6 million to curbside e-waste  
14 collection?

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: As... as you know, um...

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: What if I'm 95 years old,  
17 and and I need to throw out my television and I...

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I hear you and I agree with  
19 you... with the concept. My sense is, this was a  
20 data driven decision, right? You look at the tonnage  
21 and the amount that's collected through different  
22 programs, and if you have to make cuts to make cuts.  
23 Our... the truth of the matter is that when at when  
24 our curbside program for electronics was operating at  
25 its peak, which was in 2020, it collected under 1000

2 tons. So it's a very... very small numbers for,  
3 uh... not as cost effective as other programs that we  
4 have in place. When it's operating just in Staten  
5 Island, obviously, the past year, that number has  
6 been much smaller, it's been 129. But I think these  
7 are difficult budgeting decisions where you look at  
8 the... the tonnage and the data.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: All right, let's talk about  
10 some overtime usage. As of March of this year,  
11 uniform overtime spending was approximately \$227  
12 million while your agency was budgeted for  
13 approximately \$126 million as of adoption.  
14 Additionally, personnel service adjustment of \$66  
15 million was included in the executive budget, which  
16 in part offsets overtime costs at sanitation. So how  
17 much of the \$66 million for personal service  
18 adjustment was specifically for uniform overtime?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I believe it was \$43.4  
20 million.

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: \$43.4?

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Correct.

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. And what is driving  
24 the increased uniform overtime usage?

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: New things. This year,  
3 obviously, was extraordinary.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: But was a lot of that due  
5 to the... the staffing issues during COVID?

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. There was there was a  
7 hiring freeze in the prior fiscal year, so that had  
8 us shorter staffed. Thank God we hired 1000  
9 additional sanitation workers last summer, so that's  
10 been largely alleviated of late. We also had the  
11 vaccination mandates. We had a lot of staff sick  
12 leave increased, obviously due to COVID-19. And then  
13 we had one thing which I want to explain which was  
14 the allocation of our uniformed staff on overtime to  
15 cleaning the garages, to cleaning their workspace to  
16 keep them than safe and clean given the pandemic. So  
17 those four things together, have contributed to the  
18 overtime spend that you see.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, okay. I just, you  
20 know, I want to certainly want to honor... I believe  
21 it was nine sanitation workers who died during COVID,  
22 and the extraordinary work that they did.

23 Speaking... staying on headcount for a sec, I  
24 know... I believe there's one class scheduled for 140

2 heads, but don't we have it... don't we need like  
3 over 450?

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: My understanding is that it  
5 was 250 in this class, which is great. And on that  
6 issue of headcount, that will get us to a good number  
7 of sanitation workers, especially as, like you look  
8 historically, so that brings us right up to like,  
9 pre-pandemic levels. And again, that was boosted by  
10 the largest class we've ever had, or at least in any  
11 sort of recent memory, of 1000 sanitation workers  
12 last summer.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, I'm going to finish  
14 up and then I want to hand it over to Chair Nurse.

15 How does the sanitation department currently  
16 determine how much funding or service specific  
17 districts receive? Is that based on what, you know,  
18 Council Members allocate or how does that work?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Well, it's... a lot of  
20 different factors go into it. So it's largely the  
21 responsibility of our bureau chiefs, obviously  
22 working with management. And that involves daily,  
23 weekly, monthly targets that are reviewed annually.  
24 We... they rely on field observation, they rely on  
25 tonnage trends, they rely on historical data, 311

2 complaints to determine needs, that's largely how it  
3 works.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Okay, I'm going to  
5 hand it over to Chair Nurse. I'm really hoping that  
6 we can work to restore and get closer to the ask that  
7 the council had of \$96 million. Borough equity is  
8 very important in this council. The idea that you  
9 can eat a sandwich off the off the ground in  
10 Manhattan, but not in Staten Island, or not in the  
11 Bronx. We don't want that we want everyone to have  
12 the same amount of garbage pickup across the city and  
13 prioritizing the neighborhoods that have been  
14 historically ignored or have had disinvestment. So  
15 we look forward to working with you on that. I  
16 welcome you, Commissioner look forward to working  
17 with you on one of my most important topics, I think,  
18 for all New Yorkers. And I'm glad that sanitation  
19 and the importance of sanitation is finally getting  
20 the mainstream attention that it truly deserves.

21 And with that, I want to hand it over to Chair  
22 Nurse who can take it from here. Thank you,  
23 Commissioner.

24 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you, Chair Brannan. So  
25 I'm going to start with several questions around

2 program... organics programs and then move into some  
3 of the other items.

4 So for curbside organics collection program, the  
5 council requested \$18.2 million in FY 23 in our  
6 budget response, and we understand \$17.9 million was  
7 restored for other organics programs. Since the  
8 preliminary budget hearing, has there been any  
9 expansion of the program in the current fiscal year,  
10 FY 22, in terms of how many districts are currently  
11 being serviced?

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: No, it's still the same:  
13 seven community districts for the curbside organics  
14 program that have been in place.

15 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And for FY 23, are there any  
16 changes in terms of number of districts and number of  
17 households being serviced or will be served?

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Not in terms of number of  
19 districts, but hopefully in terms of number of  
20 households. We encourage all New Yorkers in those  
21 districts to sign up for the opt-in program. So in  
22 those seven districts, if you haven't participated  
23 and you want to participate, we welcome your  
24 participation. We always welcome it. We encourage  
25 it.

2 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And for the staff in FY 23  
3 for this program, will those folks be on overtime or  
4 straight time?

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: My understanding is that for  
6 the civilian staff, it's... it's straight time.

7 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And for uniformed?

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: For uniformed, it is  
9 overtime, because the program isn't baselined.

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. And in your  
11 estimation, so we have Council Member Hanif here, who  
12 introduced a bill on universal curbside organics,  
13 which is really exciting, and hopefully will address  
14 some of the critiques of the program and why it  
15 wasn't successful. In your estimation, how much  
16 would it cost to operate a citywide universal  
17 curbside organics collection program, strictly on  
18 straight time, inclusive of the necessary outreach,  
19 education, staff, and new equipment required?

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, my sense of that is that  
21 at its height, budgeted, the organics program costs  
22 \$30 million, what... and that was 24 districts. What  
23 that doesn't include, however, is the overtime that  
24 was spent on organics. One of the things I was  
25 surprised to see was that there isn't a breakout in

2 this department of what the overtime is used for.  
3 It's a post that has to get filled. And so we don't  
4 have -- or I have not yet seen -- a true overtime  
5 cost associated with just the organics program. And  
6 I think, you know, I had said that I want to review  
7 what happened in the old programs and learn what was  
8 good, what was bad. It's difficult to do that  
9 without understanding the full cost of it. So it's  
10 something that I'm hoping that we can parse through,  
11 and that the agency can... can understand and of  
12 course, be fully transparent to you about it

13 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: That would be great. Yeah,  
14 it would be really great to get a sense of what this  
15 program would cost to be successful so we can plan  
16 for an effective budget.

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Chair, I apologize. I was  
18 told that I answered incorrectly on one question.  
19 The uniform pickups for the seven community districts  
20 for curbside organics are on straight time.

21 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: On street time for moving  
22 forward?

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It has been on straight  
24 time, yeah.

2 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, because I believe in a  
3 previous hearing, we were told it was on overtime...  
4 the program was being run completely on overtime.

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It was baselined now to  
6 seven districts, and so going forward, because it's  
7 baselined, it's going to be on straight time.  
8 Previously it had been on overtime.

9 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Got it. Okay. Okay. Um,  
10 want to change to school organics. So for the school  
11 organic component, the rollout of... or the  
12 announcement of this is super, super exciting. It  
13 seems the program is budgeted for \$9.2 million in FY  
14 23, and \$2.8 million annually thereafter to expand to  
15 534 additional school buildings, and to establish  
16 public organic drop off sites using smart bins co-  
17 located at or near 100 school buildings. That's  
18 really awesome.

19 Can you speak to the success of the score clinics  
20 program that has existed in terms of participation?  
21 Or if you have diversion rates for what we're... what  
22 we're building on?

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, I actually... I don't  
24 have the tonnage amounts in front of me, but we can  
25 get them to us super quick on the school's program.

2 But it has been one of our most successful organics  
3 programs with the participating schools. The thing  
4 that we're looking forward to is getting every public  
5 school in the city up and operational over the next  
6 two school years. We're going to roll this out in  
7 like four different tranches. So October and  
8 February of next school year, and the year after will  
9 bring groups of schools online. You may question the  
10 timeframe, but we've worked very closely with DOE on  
11 it. And it takes time to, you know, train the food  
12 service staff and the administrators, and to set up  
13 all of the bins and even start training... training  
14 the students. So that's a really important piece of  
15 the work and we want to make sure that this rollout  
16 goes well.

17 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And so that will... this will  
18 cover -- I think that's what you said in your opening  
19 testimony -- will cover all public schools now?

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes, every school building.

21 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. And so when would you  
22 anticipate being fully operational in all schools  
23 over the next fiscal year,

24

25

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Not next school year, but  
3 the school year after that. I always screw this up.  
4 So that's... this is 21-22... in two school years.

5 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. And then can you  
6 breakdown the FY 23 budget for school organics  
7 collection in terms of civilian staff versus uniform  
8 staff?

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. There 325... It's  
10 \$9.2 million total, with \$325,000 for additional  
11 collection costs. So that's on the uniform side. We  
12 have \$1.2 million in civilian staffing costs. That's  
13 really to continue the organics program staff first  
14 added in FY 22, which wasn't baselined. We have \$2.4  
15 million for bin procurement, maintenance, and signage  
16 for the schools. That separate from the smart bins  
17 for the parents and the community members that are  
18 going to be co located. That's \$500,000. And then  
19 we have \$5.2 million allocated for outreach staff.  
20 Those are the people who are going to, you know, go  
21 into each school, work with each school, to actually  
22 implement this and make sure that it gets rolled out  
23 smoothly.

24 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: That's great. So I'll get  
25 back to the staff in a second. But for the 100 smart

2 bins, do you anticipate that being one per school...  
3 is the goal to have one per school, which I know can  
4 be challenging, especially if the program is  
5 successful, because we know that those bins are  
6 somewhat limited capacity. So what... what do you  
7 anticipate in terms of how many bins per school and  
8 the order I guess of the rollout? And then my...  
9 kind of like a sub-question to that is, are you all  
10 going to be prioritizing schools in environmental  
11 justice communities first? Or is are you going to be  
12 building out with different types of criteria?

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, um, right now, we have  
14 half a million dollars in our budget to roll out 100  
15 additional bins. I look at this as an expanded  
16 pilot, but also like phase two of the pilot that  
17 we've done in Astoria, with you know, 20-plus bins  
18 all in one in one neighborhood. So this is testing  
19 something different. If -- and I expect this will  
20 work -- if and when this works, we are excited to  
21 roll out these bins more broadly, including if it  
22 works to every public school in the city. But right  
23 now, the budget is for 100. And as to allocation,  
24 exactly where they're going to go, I agree with you,  
25 equity needs to inform all of our decisions in this

2 department, but in particular, the ones around smart  
3 bins and access to organics education. So we look  
4 forward to working with you and working with the  
5 committee as we make the decisions about where to  
6 place the first 100 bins. That hasn't been done yet.

7 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, great. Do you do you  
8 have a timeline of when you want to make that  
9 decision by... so members, especially on the  
10 sanitation committee might be able to support on  
11 that?

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. I'd like to do it  
13 immediately. The funding drops for us on July 1st.  
14 We're already working as much as we can on... as much  
15 as we can do without the funding in place on the  
16 procurement for the smart bins. So now in the... in  
17 the weeks between now and July 1st, I think is, you  
18 know, prime time to start thinking about and making  
19 some of these decisions because I really want to roll  
20 these things out aggressively. I think it can really  
21 like chart an important part of our future for  
22 organics in New York City.

23 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah, I totally agree. The  
24 question about the... so when you said there's \$5.2  
25 million for outreach staff: Do you have a sense of

2 how many positions that is? Is that temporary staff?  
3 Are those contract staff? And what... what do you  
4 anticipate the duration of their...?

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It's actually for... it's  
6 for GrowNYC. They do our outreach for us. And  
7 they're fabulous. I met a bunch of them last week at  
8 an event. They are fabulous. They've worked with us  
9 in the past on rolling out organics in schools. And  
10 so this is to fund their work in outreach for the  
11 schools to implement the program appropriately. So  
12 the program is going to, as I said, be rolled out  
13 over two school years. So that's what the outreach  
14 will be.

15 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Is that an expansion of  
16 GrowNYC Staff or just to support the existing?

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: You know, I want to let  
18 Commissioner... Deputy Commissioner Greg Anderson  
19 answer that question, because I'm not sure of the  
20 answer.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yeah, Thank you,  
22 Chair. Great to see you. Thank you, Commissioner  
23 for passing me this one.

24 So that's a substantial expansion in their  
25 outreach staff. So, the budget does include the

2 baseline support for the Recycling Champions Program,  
3 which had been previously cut. And then in the  
4 current fiscal year includes a substantial increase  
5 in that... the staff to do the education, and set up,  
6 and work with the custodians and food service staff  
7 at those schools.

8 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. I'm going to shift to  
9 the community compost site relocation involving the  
10 Lower East Side Ecology Center. The FY 23 Executive  
11 Budget includes 448 and 129 in fiscal 2022 and \$2.19  
12 million in fiscal 23, to support the LES Ecology  
13 Center, to build out a compost site on Rockaway  
14 Avenue in Brooklyn as a temporary location. Can you  
15 walk the committee through how DSNY will be assisting  
16 in that relocation and how long you all think it will  
17 take?

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, I can. So we have  
19 \$2.6 million in the expense budget that has been  
20 allocated to this. Right now, they're located...  
21 well, they've historically been located in... at East  
22 River Park. They temporarily moved to another  
23 location, and we are looking to relocate them to a  
24 location... it's Jamaica... Jamaica Avenue... well in  
25 Rockaway, excuse me, in Rockaway. We are hoping to

2 get working on that relocation immediately. We think  
3 it could take up to a year. We should do it within a  
4 year, do that full build out work, and then they can  
5 stay in that location until they're able to move back  
6 to their initial home. Whenever the construction in  
7 that park is complete.

8 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And so for this... what will  
9 happen to that site after the temporary relocation  
10 period is over? And additionally, is any of that  
11 funding coming from Parks at all? Or is it  
12 exclusively through DSNY?

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: No. The funding for this  
14 was put into the DSNY budget. So we are taking the  
15 lead on building out their temporary location. We  
16 are working very closely with them on it. And we are  
17 committed to getting them a proper site that they can  
18 temporarily operate in for as long as it takes to get  
19 the park... their initial park site ready. As to  
20 what's going to happen to that site after they move  
21 back to East River Park, Greg... Deputy Commissioner  
22 Anderson, do you do you know what the plans are for  
23 that? I haven't been briefed on that yet.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Absolutely. So  
25 you know, we're... we're very excited to get the

2 Lower East Side Ecology Center in there. We're  
3 really hoping that they start to work with some local  
4 partners as well. There's some great community  
5 composters in that part of Brooklyn, including East  
6 New York Farms. And so we're hoping that in the long  
7 term, we can pull one of them in as an operator for  
8 that... that site and really work with the community  
9 to figure out what the right set of programming is  
10 that makes sense for that location.

11 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. Um, and just while  
12 we're on the topic of our larger nonprofit community  
13 orgs that are supporting our organic goals: We know  
14 that Big Reuse is scheduled to lose their site under  
15 the Queens Bridge -- which is you know, truly  
16 unfortunate -- for a parking lot. What is the plan  
17 to support Big Reuse's operations that currently  
18 services Queens residents?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. So Big Reuse will be  
20 able to stay in their current location -- we're  
21 committed to that -- until we build out a new  
22 permanent site for them at the Greenpoint Marine  
23 Transfer Station. We have \$2.6 million in the  
24 sanitation budget, which we are putting towards that  
25 new... new project. We internally reallocated money

2 to do this, and we are committed to working with Big  
3 Reuse and with the Parks Department to ensure that  
4 they have a seamless transition from one location to  
5 the next, that the new site is well built out for  
6 them, as that will be a permanent site for Big Reuse.

7 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Um, so one of the... the main  
8 things that they're upset about and we don't want to  
9 get too in the weeds of it, is that that essentially  
10 will... will kind of reduce a site for Queens, um,  
11 and so that's why they're concerned... they're  
12 concerned that you know, the Queensbridge residents,  
13 and some of the other areas do not have a composting  
14 operation. So just putting that out there. The \$2.6  
15 million is that in... that's for FY 23?

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. And for a couple of  
18 our hearings, we've been asking, what exactly does it  
19 cost to identify and build out kind of sizable  
20 scalable, at scale, composting facilities for the  
21 city in order to support achieving the universal  
22 organics potential? And we asked if \$1 million was  
23 realistic. We never... I don't believe we got an  
24 answer. Is it... is it in the \$2.19 million or \$2.6  
25 million range? That is what it costs for a site?

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Well, I guess... I can tell  
3 you the levers that affect the price, and I think  
4 that that will be helpful, because as... as we work  
5 together in the future on this, I think it's  
6 important to just understand the general levers.

7 The first is, are we acquiring a new site? Like  
8 is it a net new site to the city? That obviously, if  
9 you're going to acquire a new site adds a tremendous  
10 amount of cost. And then... or are you just... do  
11 you own the property and are you just going to  
12 construct the site?

13 Another big factor that contributes to cost is  
14 what scale are you going to do? Are you going to do 4  
15 tons per day are you going to do 10 tons per day are  
16 going to do over 500 tons per day? We have different  
17 sites run by different entities, some of them the  
18 city, but they all have different processing  
19 capacity. So the amount of processing capacity does  
20 very much affect price. So that's the second lever.

21 And the third lever is: What type of composting  
22 are you doing there? Are you? Are you building out a  
23 large industrial setup, which obviously requires  
24 more... more cost? Or are you doing something more  
25

2 straightforward? Is it outdoors? Or is it indoors?  
3 Those are the different levers.

4 So we see with... with the Lower East Side  
5 Ecology Center, that it can be as inexpensive as \$2.6  
6 or \$2.2 million, but you know, to do it much bigger,  
7 it can be, you know, \$50 million, \$100 million. It  
8 all varies based on what... what you set out to do.  
9 So I hope that helps answer some of the question.

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: No, I appreciate that. This  
11 is the first time we've had a breakdown of what are  
12 those factors, we've been asking. So I really  
13 appreciate that.

14 Okay, I'm only going to ask a few more questions.  
15 I know a lot of folks are on here who can ask more  
16 detailed other stuff that's in the super weeds at the  
17 later end.

18 For public space containerization before we dive  
19 into FY 23, regarding the program, can you provide us  
20 an update on the current pilot for the FY 22 year?

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, sure. So as you know,  
22 we announced and unveiled our first container in Time  
23 Square working very closely with the Time Square  
24 Alliance. That container is in place it's being  
25 used. It generally looks pretty good, although I

2 cringed when I went to visit it, and I saw some trash  
3 bags put out alongside of it, because the whole point  
4 was to put the trash bags inside of it, but... but  
5 generally, it has taken a large pile of trash and  
6 concealed most... most of it. The other big, big  
7 part of this is we are administering a grant program  
8 with business improvement districts. We got 29  
9 applications from BIDs already. We're putting a  
10 second round out this summer where we're going to be  
11 working with BIDs, giving them grants to do things  
12 similar to what Times Square did. We're committed to  
13 testing these bins in all five boroughs, not just  
14 BIDs, but also residential commercial. We're working  
15 on our first residential pilot with a few blocks in  
16 in lower Manhattan that really have been aching to do  
17 this, and we're excited for their... their  
18 partnership. But we are looking to test all types of  
19 bins citywide in all... in all five boroughs. I'll  
20 just tell you that I had a very interesting  
21 conversation yesterday with the people who run  
22 sanitation in Barcelona, which is a leader in  
23 containerization. They containerized their waste a  
24 long time ago. I learned so much about it. I don't  
25 think we need to get into all the details of it at

2 this this hearing, but I would love an opportunity to  
3 walk you through what we learned. It was eye  
4 opening.

5 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. So for FY 23, it says  
6 there's \$1.3 million in the out years to hire three  
7 staff for the for the program. Has this expanded at  
8 all or changed at all in terms of number of staff?  
9 And what are the kind of job titles or, you know,  
10 scope of work for these three, folks?

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Greg, would you mind taking  
12 that one?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: No problem.  
14 Thank you Chair for the question. So the PS funding,  
15 which is around \$300,000, for the three staff lines  
16 include one line for our project manager for public  
17 space initiatives, who we brought on board earlier  
18 this year. And that was also funded for one year, at  
19 exec last year, so that's just a continuation of that  
20 line. And then for the other two, it's actually two  
21 new uniformed supervisors. And there'll be working  
22 in our collection office, doing site visits,  
23 reviewing Waste Management Plan submissions, and  
24 really just providing additional staffing capacity to  
25

2 do the on the ground work that's necessary to  
3 implement these programs.

4 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: So for the for the pilot  
5 programs, do we know the timeline or when you all  
6 will select where these other bins will be deployed?  
7 And do you know how many you anticipate deploying?

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I think the deployment  
9 will... will vary based on cost. What we were  
10 thinking for the BIDs we're estimating is about  
11 \$20,000 per container. It may be high, it may be low.  
12 It'll depend on how big and you know, a bunch of  
13 other bunch of other factors. We're hoping to make  
14 our first awards to BIDs soon in the coming weeks. We  
15 are reviewing all of the grant applications now and  
16 look forward to doing it and rolling out phase two of  
17 the grant program.

18 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And so those grants are they  
19 inclusive of... I mean, I see there's three staff.  
20 There's a bunch of BIDs that want to do it. There's  
21 the \$20k per container, but then is the grant  
22 inclusive of what it would cost for outreach or any  
23 education for these pilot sites?

24 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Greg, do you mind taking  
25 that one?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Sure.

3 Absolutely. So there's a few different tracks that  
4 we're working on. On the... the pilot for  
5 residential waste, we're absolutely expecting to do a  
6 substantial amount of outreach, working with not only  
7 residents in the districts where... where these are  
8 deployed, but also with the building staff who  
9 actually have to use them. So if the building has a  
10 super or porters or something like that, we want to  
11 make sure they understand how to use the bins  
12 appropriately, and are doing so. So really need to  
13 get their buy-in. On the BID side, we're expecting  
14 the BIDs will... will be the sole users of those  
15 bins. So less public interaction necessary, but  
16 absolutely we will support education and public  
17 outreach with the BIDs as necessary.

18 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: So for the residential  
19 ones... I'm sorry, I'm asking for super details, and  
20 I didn't send some of these ones ahead... but for the  
21 residential ones, how many of those do you expect to  
22 pilot? And as though... how is the outreach being  
23 engaged? I mean, are you going to have a dedicated  
24 staffer do it across the different sites? Is that

25

2 the focus of some of these three people? I mean, I  
3 know that you said they're uniformed folks.

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I think the answer on how  
5 many residential is still TBD, to be honest. We want  
6 to make sure we hit all five boroughs. We want to  
7 make sure we get in some commercial, some BIDs, some  
8 residential. I can't answer today how many are  
9 going to be residential, unfortunately, but we'll  
10 also look forward to working with you to sort that  
11 out and prioritize.

12 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Alright. And do you have an  
13 initial timeline for when you think you'll be able to  
14 give like your first report, like you've got enough  
15 data under the belt enough time under the belt, where  
16 you'll be able to say, "Hey, these are some of our  
17 findings", because I know there's a special demand  
18 for this and push, and I'm a little worried that  
19 there's just going to be a lot of pressure to roll  
20 something out and not do enough time to adequately  
21 study it and make sure it's a success. So when what  
22 you think you'll get for assessment?

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I think that an assessment  
24 of this... to assess the program, you actually have  
25 to have bins placed, and the new budget to really

2 like begin to roll out test bins in all five boroughs  
3 hits on... on July 1st. I would imagine like a year  
4 from now, we will have -- I hope a year for now -- we  
5 will have rolled out some commercial, some  
6 residential, and some BIDs, and we'll have had an  
7 opportunity to look at how they're being used, what  
8 the stakeholders think and feel, how we can make  
9 improvements, but I wouldn't expect to see a real  
10 valuable assessment until at least next year at this  
11 time.

12 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, thank you.

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: That of course, also  
14 includes, you know, the other work that we're doing  
15 now meeting with other cities that have rolled out  
16 containerization. It's not just this pilot. Yes,  
17 this pilot is important to see how it works in in New  
18 York City specific. But like there's a lot of other  
19 research and work we can do at the same time to  
20 really hone our thoughts on it.

21 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. I just have two more  
22 sets of questions. So the first one is related to  
23 headcounts. Um, this is around garage utility  
24 workers, splinter group workers, and civilian  
25 vacancies. The preliminary budget included \$5.1

2 million in savings in FY 23, growing to \$9.9 million  
3 in the out years to reduce 107 garage utility staff  
4 positions through attrition with the proposed  
5 reduction budget headcount for FY 23, and in the out  
6 years would be 378 positions for garage utility  
7 staff, if I'm accurate. Has this reduction been  
8 restored at all in the Executive Budget?

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: No, it has not.

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. Do you have an update  
11 on the projected impact that this might have in the  
12 out years?

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We're continuing to assess  
14 that, but I'll just say a few things on each. The  
15 splinter group staff reduction is something that I've  
16 personally managed through before, in particular, in  
17 my work at the NYPD, when we took cops out of some of  
18 the administrative commands, I ran IT. They took  
19 cops out of the administrative commands, and they put  
20 them back out... back out into the field. So I've  
21 managed through that before. It's difficult. You  
22 know, you lose something, you lose that on-the-  
23 ground, working knowledge, like how things  
24 actually... actually are. But I think it's something  
25 we can, and will have to manage through.

2 On the garage utility staff, I mean, those  
3 workers do some really important things. You know,  
4 they change tires. In the snow season, they put the  
5 chains on the vehicles, they put the plows on the  
6 vehicles. So I am expecting things should be well,  
7 my... my team here... my operational team here...  
8 the chiefs here are expecting that things should be  
9 okay as a result of this reduction, but if we have  
10 any issues during snow season in particular, we are  
11 committed to funding that on overtime, and we will  
12 give an assessment after snow season of how much  
13 overtime actually had to be used, if any, to make up  
14 for these cuts.

15 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. My last set of  
16 questions is related to commercial waste zones. We  
17 just had a hearing on it, and I appreciate it all of  
18 the updates on the program so far from Justin Bland  
19 and Deputy Commissioner Greg Anderson. So for the...  
20 After our last hearing, it was mentioned that there  
21 are about 27 civilians staffing the CWE program --  
22 and I'll ask you to correct me if I'm wrong -- and 10  
23 dedicated to outreach. Can you remind us of the  
24 total cost of civilian staffing within the program?

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Um, Greg, do you have the  
3 breakout for just the civilian staff?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yep. I'm  
5 opening it now. So in FY 23, the PS funding for  
6 civilian staff is \$2.2 million.

7 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. It was also mentioned  
8 there would be funding for temporary contractors to  
9 support prepping the city for this program with  
10 outreach. So how much is allocated for these  
11 positions? Well, I also have several... several  
12 questions around it. How much is allocated for these  
13 positions? How many people will that employ? And how  
14 long do you expect them to be on... doing This  
15 outreach? And when do you think they'll start?

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So we think it's 30... We  
17 think it's 30 positions for outreach for the duration  
18 of the implementation period. As you know, as we've  
19 discussed, we're going to be implementing commercial  
20 waste zones zone by zone. So the outreach staff will  
21 work as long as the implementation takes.

22 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. Um, and you said you  
23 want them to start this... this summer?

24 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Uh, yeah. I mean, once we  
25 add the bids in and make award, yes.

2 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. Does the program have  
3 a budget for translation service, and if so...

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: The program does not have a  
5 specific budget for translation services, but we will  
6 be building language access into everything that we  
7 do related to commercial waste zones. I believe very  
8 much in language access, and will work very closely  
9 with Moya to make sure that we have the tools and the  
10 resources we need to do this important outreach  
11 language in every... outreach work in every language  
12 that is required.

13 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. I mean, because this  
14 impacts, you know, the small business community,  
15 mostly, a lot of, you know... tons and tons of non-  
16 English speakers, do you think you have enough  
17 funding for covering that?

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I am committing to making  
19 language access a priority within the budget that we  
20 have allocated for commercial waste zones.

21 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And is it beyond just the  
22 outreach staff? Are there going to be other forms of  
23 outreach, such as radio advertisements, newspaper  
24 town halls?

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We have \$750,000 in our  
3 budget for that type of outreach.

4 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, those are all my  
5 questions. Thank you to the other members who've  
6 been waiting for a very long time. And thank you  
7 Chair, and thank you, Commissioner and Deputy  
8 Commissioners, and the rest of the staff here. I'm  
9 going to pass it back over to the Counsel or the  
10 Chair.

11 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Chair Nurse. I'll  
12 take it from here. We also want to say we've been  
13 joined by Councilmember Powers, Williams, and Menin.  
14 I want to remind council members that we are limiting  
15 councilmember questions to five minutes. Please  
16 listen for the cue from the sergeant for when time is  
17 up. We are going to start with... Council Member  
18 Ayala is no longer on. So next on my list is Council  
19 Member Carr.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

21 COUNCIL MEMBERS CARR: Thank you Chairs Brannan  
22 and Nurse. Thank you Commissioner for being here  
23 today. You know my... I want to jump off where Chair  
24 Brannan was asking earlier about wastebasket service,  
25 especially because in that... you know that anecdote

2 he gave with those overflowing baskets you know, all  
3 too often, that trash doesn't just stay there. It  
4 rolls down the street and ends up in someone's  
5 property, and the inspector comes by at the wrong  
6 time, it could lead to some negative consequences for  
7 a business owner or building owner. In Staten  
8 Island, I believe we only have two days a week of  
9 basket service for public baskets. In FY 19, I think  
10 an extra \$250,000 was allocated to increase it to 4  
11 or district 49 and 3 days in district 50. Sadly,  
12 that was a casualty of the COVID budget in FY 21.  
13 And you know it really... it really would be great  
14 for our borough if we could get closer to our sister  
15 borrows in terms of the frequency of service for  
16 public wastebaskets. It would do a lot to protect  
17 businesses and also keep the area clean. Can you...  
18 can you let us know if that's something you're  
19 willing to do and what the current allocation  
20 provides in terms of wastebasket service for the  
21 borough?

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sure. First, I can tell...  
23 I can just repeat what I said in my testimony, which  
24 is that I appreciate any and all additional funding  
25 that may be put in place during the adopted budget

2 for litter basket service. I agree that it is  
3 absolutely fundamental to cleaning up the city and...  
4 and restoring cleanliness post pandemic. But I don't  
5 have the specific Staten Island numbers for you but I  
6 can commit to getting them to you right after this  
7 hearing. But what I will say on... on litter basket  
8 service is right now, we have approximately... we're  
9 at a service level of approximately once a day for  
10 little basket six days a week in most districts, not  
11 all districts. Obviously, we want to see that service  
12 level go up. And if and when we get additional  
13 funding to support litter baskets, we are going to  
14 look at things like who has the least service now?  
15 What are heavily trafficked areas? Where are the 311  
16 complaints? Where are... what are the districts  
17 where our staff just knows intuitively where they see  
18 the problems most frequently? And we're looking  
19 forward -- if we get new funding for litter baskets -  
20 -- to working with the council and being transparent  
21 about how we're making the decisions that we're  
22 making.

23 Greg, do you by any chance have the Staten Island  
24 numbers handy?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yeah, I do. So  
3 across the whole borough we have on weekdays, we have  
4 10 litter basket trucks a week, and then 3 on  
5 Sundays. So one in each district on Sundays. I will  
6 say the allocations for the weekday trucks: It's six  
7 trucks in district one, which is the sort of North  
8 Shore and the area around Borough Hall, and then two  
9 trucks each, as you mentioned, Councilmember Carr in  
10 district two and district three, so certainly lower  
11 lower service levels in those two districts.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you for that. So I  
13 don't have much time left. So I'm just going to  
14 package my three questions together and hopefully get  
15 an answer from you. My predecessor championed the  
16 waste curbside pickup program, the pilot that started  
17 in Staten Island and began expanding, and  
18 unfortunately yet another casualty of the COVID  
19 budget. And now it seems like we're not going to  
20 have any of that program at all. Given how seriously  
21 you take the illegal dumping issue, and that's music  
22 to my ears, nothing was more effective in curtailing  
23 that in the borough than allowing for curbside pickup  
24 anyways, because that was principally what we were  
25 finding dumped in these vulnerable areas besides

2 contractor and construction waste. And so if we're  
3 going to be successful moving forward at tackling  
4 dumping, as you hope to do, we really need to  
5 preserve this program, particularly given Staten  
6 Island and other parts of the city don't have the  
7 kind of building stock that makes us eligible for the  
8 multifamily dwelling program. And so I really hope  
9 that you'll reconsider that cut in particular for  
10 Staten Island, but really, for all of our sister  
11 boroughs. And I just want to also ask: Is there any  
12 plan to add additional sanitation police. We only  
13 have one sanitation police officer for the borough,  
14 and despite attempts to you know, tackle littering  
15 from vehicles, we have a lot of vehicular based  
16 littering. We try to do more dumping stings. It's  
17 really difficult when we don't have the sanitation  
18 police, who as peace officers have... have a lot more  
19 powers to act. And then finally, with respect to  
20 swamp, it's amazing to think it's been almost 25  
21 years already, and the most important principle to me  
22 that came out of that 06 plan was borrow equity. No  
23 borrow was ever going to be a dumping ground for  
24 another borrows waste again. We owned Fresh Kills...

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: and is that something  
3 you're going to commit to maintain in any update.

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, so on, I'll take the  
5 three in order. On E waste, I appreciate your  
6 perspective about how valuable the program is. It's  
7 actually great for me to hear so early in my tenure.  
8 I agree that the program is... is a valuable program.  
9 And, you know, we'll look like based on all of the  
10 priorities on whether and if we can secure more  
11 funding for it. But I hear you loud and clear on E  
12 waste and in particular on the link to illegal  
13 dumping. On the swamp, uh, yes, I can commit to you  
14 an emphasis... a continued emphasis on borough equity  
15 in the next solid waste management plan. I  
16 particularly... we all particularly see the benefits  
17 to Staten Island over the past 20 years since the  
18 last plan, and for sure we will have the same  
19 commitment to borough equity there.

20 As to sanitation police, we don't have new  
21 funding to increase the size of the sanitation  
22 police, but we are... we do have vacancies like  
23 funded vacancies that we are working actually now I  
24 had a meeting with the enforcement team to fill. So  
25 there will be more sanitation police but not a

2 meaningfully... a meaningful amount more sanitation  
3 police, but I expect that in the in the weeks and  
4 months to come.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thanks for your answers. I  
6 look forward to talk more offline. And thank you  
7 chairs for giving me this opportunity.

8 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember and  
9 next we'll turn to Councilmember Kagan followed by  
10 Councilmember Batra.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: First of all, thank you so  
12 much for this opportunity and for this great budget  
13 hearing about very important topic, sanitation. I  
14 have two questions to Commissioner. Number one: Are  
15 you planning to increase any kind of sanitation  
16 enforcement? And second question, in my district,  
17 specifically in Bensonhurst on 86th street between  
18 Bay Parkway and \_\_\_\_\_ Avenue, for many years  
19 community complaining about complete massive chaos,  
20 have ever been like Commissioner Teresa, Bensonhurst,  
21 86 street, she did she for herself. I hear complaint  
22 repeatedly. My predecessor have complained  
23 repeatedly, but it's still total mess in terms of  
24 sanitation conditions on 86th.

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So on the first question  
3 about whether I'm looking to increase sanitation  
4 enforcement?

5 The answer is yes, I spoke a little bit about  
6 this in my testimony. I don't believe in... in  
7 enforcement for the sake of enforcement. But if a  
8 business or resident isn't going to do the right  
9 thing and abide by the... I think very  
10 straightforward rules and laws we have around keeping  
11 the city clean, then enforcement is a tool that we  
12 can and will use.

13 During the pandemic, our enforcement numbers went  
14 way down, like way down. And that I think is  
15 understandable. It's a result of people were out  
16 sick. Some of our enforcement agents were taken to  
17 do other types of COVID-related enforcement, so  
18 pulled for non sanitation duties. We have everyone  
19 back now in the sanitation department. And I think  
20 an important part of cleaning up our city is making  
21 sure that we do the enforcement that we have to do to  
22 keep the city... the city clean.

23 As to your invitation for me to come and visit  
24 with you and take a tour of your district, I'd love  
25 it. I spent the past several weeks meeting

2 sanitation workers, going to garages around the city.  
3 And now I'd really like to see your districts,  
4 understand what the very local issues are. I know  
5 that there are a lot of issues that are citywide, but  
6 even more that are local. And I want to make sure  
7 that I understand them and I'll be joined in each  
8 visit with my borough chief make sure that they see  
9 them too firsthand what I see and I appreciate the  
10 invitation. Happily take you up on it.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Thank you. I would  
12 welcome you to Bensonhurst.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER: Thank you, Councilmember Kagan.  
14 And next we'll turn to Councilmember Bottcher.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Thank you.  
17 Commissioner, how are you?

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I'm great, thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: My question is about  
20 rat mitigation. And, you know, I think most New  
21 Yorkers would be shocked to learn that the city cut  
22 \$2.2 million dollars in rat fighting funds in the  
23 sanitation budget two years ago. Last year, they  
24 were only partially restored around \$700,000, if I'm  
25 correct. In this budget, the city council asked the

2 mayor to add \$4.8 million for rat mitigation  
3 programs, and that didn't happen in the response to  
4 the city council, no additional funds were added for  
5 rat mitigation. Can you help us understand what's  
6 going on here? Why haven't we increased funding for  
7 rat mitigation at this time and how much is being  
8 proposed in this year's budget?

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Alright. So there is a city  
10 wide task force on rat mitigation that the Department  
11 of Sanitation is a member of. We happen not to chair  
12 it. So the rat mitigation efforts in the city of New  
13 York are led by the Department... the Department of  
14 Health. So the sanitation budget isn't exactly the  
15 right place for rat mitigation. However, this  
16 administration is making a real commitment to rat  
17 mitigation that you can see in our budget, and that's  
18 through the... the \$1.3 million that was baselined in  
19 our budget for containerization. And so if  
20 containerization works -- and I will be the first to  
21 acknowledge that is a big if; there is a lot to learn  
22 over the next year -- but if containerization works,  
23 then that is a fabulous rat mitigation strategy.  
24 Obviously, it's a long term strategy. I would say,  
25 for the short term tactical stuff, though, the budget

2 for rat mitigation is and should be in the Department  
3 of Health.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: I am excited about the  
5 containerization pilot. But the rat mitigation funds  
6 that were cut were part of a city wide strategy with  
7 the Department of Health. But what those funds were  
8 for were for increased basket service in areas that  
9 were defined as rat reservoirs. Those areas didn't  
10 stop being rate reservoirs when COVID came.

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. Yeah. That's...  
12 that's a great point, and I'm sorry I neglected to  
13 include this. We have said we would appreciate any  
14 additional funding may be added in the adopted budget  
15 for litter basket service. And as we hopefully roll  
16 out additional litter basket service, one of the  
17 criteria that we will use in determining how to  
18 allocate that extra budget will be about where we  
19 have major rat problems.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Thank you, and I know  
21 that we're on the same page about the desire to get  
22 more funding for litter basket service, and I look  
23 forward to fighting for that with my colleagues very  
24 hard, because it's hard for me and others to explain  
25 to our constituents that in a city with \$100 billion

2 budget, we can't scrape together a few million  
3 dollars for rat mitigation programs. Thank you.

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you.

5 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember. And  
6 next on my list... I do not see Councilmember  
7 Velázquez or Hanif. So next, we'll turn to  
8 Councilmember Hudson.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Thank you so much.  
11 Hello, Commissioner. And hello, Chairs. Quick  
12 question about alternate side parking. I'm wondering  
13 how much sanitation has allocated for alternate side  
14 parking regulations in this budget? And does the  
15 agency have plans to save funding by reevaluating  
16 holistically current alternate side parking standards  
17 to remove less dirty streets that currently have four  
18 times a week cleaning, when two times a week has kept  
19 it sufficiently clean? You know, I have streets in  
20 my districts that have alternate side parking four  
21 times a week compared to streets and other districts  
22 that have it just one time a week. And you know, I  
23 have heard from a lot of constituents about the  
24 challenges with needing to move their cars four times  
25 a week. So I just wanted to ask that question.

2 And then also regarding any plans and funding for  
3 community donation programs. So I know that programs  
4 exist, but I'm wondering if there are any plans to  
5 expand curbside pickup or drop off at specific sites  
6 and accompanying funding for that?

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Um sure. So let me take the  
8 ASP question first. In the FY 23 budget, we had \$1.9  
9 million of new funding and 41 headcount to restore...  
10 restore alternate side parking to pre-pandemic  
11 levels, which I said in my testimony is far and away  
12 the best clean streets tool that we have in our  
13 arsenal. Every mechanical broom on a single route,  
14 can pick up 1500 pounds of street litter... or a  
15 single mechanical broom, that is in addition to the  
16 \$6.7 million that we have allocated for new street  
17 sweepers, to sweep bike lanes in various sizes, which  
18 should be a very versatile fleet. We're really  
19 looking forward to that as well. So that's the  
20 budget side of street sweeping. I hope that answers  
21 that question.

22 The question as to looking at changing alternate  
23 side parking service levels in the city. I'm  
24 definitely open to it. That's not an overnight  
25 process. But I am open to working with this council,

2 understanding where we think we have too much,  
3 although I don't think we have too much right now,  
4 but once it's restored where we have too much, where  
5 we might not have enough.

6 I also note that there are some districts that  
7 don't have alternate side parking because when those  
8 rules were first put in place, they were more  
9 industrial districts and they've become more  
10 residential of late, so I do think wouldn't be a  
11 worthwhile effort to undertake a review of it, and I  
12 thank you for the suggestion and welcome the  
13 Partnership on it.

14 Greg, could you... would you mind taking the  
15 question on community donations? I know we have the  
16 \$475,000 for Stop And Swap, but do you have anything  
17 to add to that?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Sure, absolutely.  
19 So we have a whole range of programs to support the  
20 reuse industry in New York City. So we have a  
21 program called Donate NYC, that not only operates our  
22 Donated NYC exchange, where you can actually post  
23 goods that are available, find goods for donation,  
24 but we also have Donate NYC partners, which are, you  
25 know, the large Housing Works and Goodwill and

2 Salvation Army type organizations all the way down to  
3 neighborhood thrift stores and food pantries. So,  
4 you know, really working to support that work.

5       What the commissioner just mentioned, is our stop  
6 And Swap events, which we run in partnership with  
7 GrowNYC. We do have close to half a million dollars  
8 in funding for fiscal 23 to operate those programs...  
9 to operate those events throughout the city. And  
10 those are great events where you can bring anything  
11 you have that's gently used, and you don't want any  
12 more, drop them off for other people to sort of pick  
13 through, and take and then anything you see that that  
14 you want there, you can take as well. So if you...  
15 you know have your eyes on... on a pair of sneakers  
16 or a nice leather jacket, you can grab that drop off  
17 your... your books or your toaster that you don't  
18 want anymore.

19       And then we also have a substantial programs  
20 related to textile reuse and donation. So the  
21 Refashion NYC program, which... which is for  
22 buildings, 10 or more units, operated in partnership  
23 with Housing Works, as well as a number of other  
24 efforts to support textile reuse and donation across  
25 the city.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Thank you. And then just  
3 with my last few seconds, can you just explain how...  
4 for pilot programs how certain neighborhoods or  
5 communities are elected?

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sure. I mean, if you're...  
8 let's take the containerization program, as I think  
9 the best example of a pilot program we have going  
10 on... going on right now. That one we've committed  
11 to doing five boroughs. And I think that one will  
12 largely be based on where there is real interest and  
13 commitment to getting it done. But I will say that  
14 equity will be a common theme that you will see  
15 across everything in my leadership in the sanitation  
16 department. So obviously that will inform our  
17 containerization and other pilots as well.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, thanks for that. I  
19 would love to maybe have a follow up conversation  
20 about including my district in the... in the pilot  
21 program. We've got lots of willing participants.

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I welcome it.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, thank you.

24 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember  
25 Hudson, Councilmember Barron. I have you on my list

2 with your hand up, but it was down. I don't know if  
3 you did it on purpose or by accident, lowering your  
4 hand?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Uh, accident.

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Oh, okay. So we'll turn to  
7 you now.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very much. A  
9 lot of my colleagues asked a lot of questions that I  
10 was that I was going to ask, but I do want to talk in  
11 general about environmental racism. You mentioned  
12 environmental justice, but when it comes to a lot of  
13 our poor black and brown communities, we have a lot  
14 of bus depots and waste transfer stations. So I know  
15 DEP and DEC and the Environmental Protection Agency  
16 of the federal government has a lot to do with these  
17 things, but how will you address the question of  
18 environmental racism when it comes to sanitation?

19 Unfortunately, for us, as black and brown people,  
20 racism permeates every institution and the Department  
21 of Sanitation is no exception. So we have to look at  
22 how regularly are... is trash going to be picked up?  
23 We have to look at all of the issues, whether it's,  
24 you know, little baskets, you name it, we have to  
25 make sure that there's equity in the treatment of

2 that. So how will you assure us... particularly the  
3 waste transfer stations? We have overwhelmingly, a  
4 number of waste transfer... land waste transfer  
5 stations, and then also have some boats that transfer  
6 trash out. How will you assure to us that equity  
7 occurs in every aspect of the agency, every aspect  
8 from the minute to the macro to the major when it  
9 comes to race. People like to ignore that will act  
10 like it doesn't exist, but it does. That's one  
11 question.

12 Secondly, and I think my colleagues already  
13 mentioned this, but I don't know how you say the  
14 Adam's Administration is working aggressively with  
15 you to deal with sanitation and keeping the city  
16 clean when we tried to restore \$47 million... zero  
17 and his budget, litter baskets as the Chair  
18 mentioned, \$22 million... zero in his budget,  
19 restored a baseline for sanitation cuts \$12  
20 million... he did \$1.9 million and his budget, rat  
21 mitigation \$4.8 million... zero and his budget. And  
22 I can go on and on, and I think you already know,  
23 that is not my idea of somebody working aggressively  
24 trying to keep the city clean. And I know that  
25 one... that's not on you, but certainly hope my

2 colleagues in the city council are listening, that we  
3 should not accept a budget that does not have these  
4 restorations, and the enhancements when it comes to  
5 sanitation, because I have to believe sanitation  
6 along with health, education, and economic  
7 development to deal with poverty and unemployment is  
8 one of the most important aspects in our community.

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So let me take the waste  
10 equity and race question first. I think there are a  
11 number of relevant things here that we have and can  
12 and will do around waste equity.

13 The first is I take very seriously our  
14 responsibility to carry out Local Law 152, which is  
15 the waste equity law. And I can... I am proud to  
16 tell you that prior to my arrival here, the  
17 sanitation department had fully done what it needed  
18 to do under that Waste Equity Law, which is to cut  
19 permitted capacity at 22 facilities in North  
20 Brooklyn, Southeast Queens, and South Bronx. I think  
21 in North Brooklyn, it was by 50%. In Southeast  
22 Queens, it was by 33%. And the same for the South  
23 Bronx. In each of those areas, it cut permitted  
24 capacity... we cut permanent capacity by 10,000 tons  
25 per day. And so that is something that this

2 department is very proud of, and it is something that  
3 we will continue to do and continue to stay on top  
4 of.

5 I think the second piece on waste equity and the  
6 siting of facilities... The next conversation we have  
7 to have is about our solid waste management plan,  
8 which really charged the course for the next 20  
9 years, and may bring it down to 10 years. But  
10 regardless, for a long time, how we make the  
11 fundamental decisions about where... where things are  
12 sited and how much permanent capacity where... that  
13 plan is, is due to the council and to the state in  
14 2026. This budget funded, I think it was about a few  
15 hundred thousand dollars for the beginning... the  
16 first phase of development of the waste... the solid  
17 waste management plan, which is like the first  
18 opposite part...

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: ... is what is the state of  
21 affairs right now? And so just documenting that.

22 And so we look forward over the next three or  
23 four years to working closely with the council, to  
24 working closely with stakeholders as we develop the

2 solid waste management plan that is going to govern  
3 how the city deals with waste over the next 20 years.

4 And the last piece that I would talk about is  
5 commercial waste zones. And we implement that  
6 commercial waste zone law, that means that fewer  
7 truck miles are going to be run through communities  
8 in... in this city. And so I believe that a very  
9 important part of waste equity has... is wrapped up  
10 in commercial waste zones, and I would welcome it  
11 out. There's so much more I could say about each of  
12 these... these things, but I would appreciate the  
13 opportunity to discuss them with you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, thank you very much  
15 for that answer. And I would like to meet with you,  
16 because years ago when I was in the city council and  
17 Gifford Miller was the speaker, we fought hard and he  
18 had to have a maritime us waste management facility  
19 in his neighborhood on 90-something street for the  
20 first time because Manhattan doesn't deal with the  
21 waste. The other boroughs...

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I have visited it.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right. So the other  
24 boroughs do... take care of all of the waste.  
25 Manhattan doesn't do their share. So I think... you

2 know, I would love to have that discussion with you  
3 because, we live, as you know, in a capitalist  
4 society, and there's big cash in moving trash. So  
5 matter of fact, a lot of it has gone to USA Waste or  
6 Waste Management... I think they merged. And so  
7 there's a lot of dollars in privatizing trash  
8 collection. There's big cash in trash. So I'd love  
9 to have that conversation with you to see how we  
10 don't allow for that kind of capitalistic greed to  
11 render our communities dirtier... and inequity and  
12 picking up of trash. So thank you very much for your  
13 comment.

14 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you Councilmember. And  
15 next we'll turn to Councilmember Ossé.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Hi, good afternoon,  
17 Commissioner. And good afternoon, Chair Nurse.  
18 Thank you for hosting this amazing hearing, where  
19 we're gaining some insight into our sanitation budget  
20 and hopefully get to some... some solutions so that  
21 we can clean up our city. You know, I have a  
22 question that is related to Councilmember Barron's  
23 question.

24 You know... as you know, there's a \$31.1 million  
25 decrease for collection and street cleaning. And I

2 know that this decrease is mainly for uniform  
3 overtime, salaries, and fringe benefits. However,  
4 this will cut along with administration's failure to  
5 restore \$47.8 million to the Department of  
6 Sanitation. It will also decrease impact cleaning  
7 services in the city. How much of this money will go  
8 towards waste equity initiatives? And I know you  
9 touched on that with Councilmember Barron's question.

10 But also what is the index in which you are, you  
11 know, calculating which neighborhoods are most in  
12 need of sanitation services, especially to provide  
13 that equity that maybe is not provided in a  
14 neighborhood that I represent, like Bed Stuy versus  
15 another, maybe community in Manhattan?

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you for that question,  
17 Council Member, and I apologize for not being at the  
18 last hearing on commercial waste zones. Just to  
19 explain, I know you're concerned about that, to  
20 explain, I was like a week and a half on the job, and  
21 I really... when I appear before the council, I  
22 really take very seriously giving accurate, complete  
23 information. So that was the reason for my absence.  
24 I didn't feel ready to give accurate, complete

2 information. What... your question was about...

3 Sorry.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: In terms of how you're  
5 calculating...?

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, yes. Yes. So, my... a  
7 big part of my background is in like data and IT, and  
8 I am a very data-driven person. I want this agency  
9 to become... or to continue to be, but to increase  
10 the amount that we rely on data. We collect so much  
11 data in this department, both internally and also as  
12 a city through 311. And that data should inform  
13 almost everything we... everything we do. So as new  
14 budgets... new budget cycles happen, as new, you  
15 know, cuts are required, or hopefully, funds are  
16 added, the allocation of that service will be based  
17 on... based on the data. And of course, an important  
18 consideration will also be equity.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Thank you. The second  
20 question I have is related to something that is more  
21 current in our city right now. You know, I'm aware  
22 that the Department of Sanitation has played a role  
23 in the mayor's homeless encampment sweeps, removing  
24 people's belongings and property in these sweeps.  
25 You know, when our neighbors are facing the trauma of

2 homelessness, it is more devastating for them to lose  
3 whatever they have left, rather than letting them  
4 stay with it then. You know, the purpose of the  
5 Department of Sanitation is to remove waste and to  
6 ensure our streets are healthy and clean, not to  
7 further traumatize our neighbors.

8 So I wanted to ask you, how much of our taxpayer  
9 dollars is allocated to the Department of Sanitation  
10 is involvement in the street sweeps? And to follow  
11 up after that, what is the Department of Sanitation  
12 doing with property taken from our homeless  
13 neighbors?

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, so, on this topic,  
15 Mayor Adams has been... been clear: We want to  
16 encourage vulnerable New Yorkers to come in off the  
17 streets and the subways into safer settings with  
18 dedicated services and support. He's also been clear  
19 that the city will not be dissuaded from offering  
20 vulnerable individuals on the street the supports  
21 that they are entitled to.

22 Our work on this on this interagency task force:  
23 We are one of a few agencies who work on these issues  
24 together. And our work in particular in the  
25 sanitation department is done by our precision... by

2 our precision teams. It is not, it's generally not  
3 done on overtime, it's done on straight time. So  
4 it's not adding to the overtime burden. But we take  
5 our precision sweep teams, and this is among the work  
6 that they do.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: So this isn't an additional  
8 cost for these types of sweeps or services?

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It is not a new need. It is  
10 not an additional... it is not an additional cost.  
11 We have a unit in the sanitation department that does  
12 precision related work, and they allocate some of  
13 their time to participating interagency task force.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Thank you for those  
16 answers. And I hope to see you in the neighborhood,  
17 Commissioner.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I'm looking forward to it.

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember.  
20 Next, we'll turn to Councilmember Williams.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Hello, Commissioner.

23 Again, congrats on your appointment. We loved  
24 Commissioner Grayson in my office, and we hope to  
25 have the same relationship and welcome you to come

2 and visit us as well. We were happy to have  
3 Commissioner \_\_\_\_\_ join us. And I also just really  
4 wanted us to think Q12 because they have been really  
5 helpful to us and very, very, very responsive. So I  
6 would be remiss if we did not thank Q12 and Q13, who  
7 always come to our support.

8       The first question I have... I'm actually going  
9 to ask all of my questions, and then you can just  
10 answer them.

11       The first question I have is in regards to state  
12 and federal funding, we didn't see any increases in  
13 the state's funding. And we know that federal  
14 funding was a one-time deal. So I just kind of  
15 wanted to understand how the agency is accounting for  
16 not having those fundings, and if the agency thought  
17 to advocate at the state level for more funding.

18       The other question that I had, and maybe you'll  
19 appreciate this: You mentioned that you ran 311.  
20 And so the question that I have is in regards to 311.  
21 So in my district, when they made the special  
22 classification for illegal dumping, my district  
23 actually had the highest amount of illegal dumping in  
24 terms of the 311 calls. And so I know a lot of my  
25 colleagues mentioned enforcement, and just again

2 wanted to reiterate or ask what the agency plans to  
3 do specifically in areas that are prone to illegal  
4 dumping? The previous council member allocated money  
5 in cameras. I am also hopefully at allocating more  
6 money to cameras, wanting to understand even that.  
7 So outside of having actual enforcement agents, which  
8 I agree, we need to have more of those. And I  
9 noticed again, that line item was also decreased in  
10 this budget. But the timeline for cameras and  
11 installing the cameras, because this money was  
12 allocated last year, I plan to allocate more money to  
13 put more cameras, I just want to have an  
14 understanding of the timeline. And I have a very  
15 innovative idea to make one of our historically  
16 dumping areas, \_\_\_\_\_ a bike lane, since I've heard  
17 1000 times on this hearing that you are planning to  
18 keep those clean. So perhaps if it was a bike lane,  
19 we wouldn't have illegal dumping in that area.

20 And the last and final thing that I wanted to say  
21 is I know we've been having a lot of conversations,  
22 my colleagues, are all you know supportive organics  
23 program. But it's my understanding is schools that  
24 currently have the program, there isn't really any  
25 incentives or encouragement for school professionals

2 to encourage the kids to actually participate in the  
3 program. And so if we're increasing support of the  
4 program, I just want to understand what type of  
5 coordination, encouragement, incentivization, I just  
6 needed to learn what is taking place to ensure that  
7 the person is actually working as intended to.

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, I've written down all  
9 your questions. And here goes:

10 The question about turning a known dump site into  
11 part of a bike lane: Sounds great to me. What I can  
12 commit to you is I will work with you and I will work  
13 with the Department of Transportation to assess the  
14 feasibility and see if we can push that forward.

15 On cameras... This didn't earn me a lot of  
16 popularity in my time at the NYPD, but I was  
17 responsible for building the NYPD Domain Awareness  
18 System which included cameras and I would be thrilled  
19 to put my camera-related background to work for you  
20 and for illegal dumping. And so one of the things  
21 that I'm going to do when I dig in with the IT team  
22 here is to understand what the current approach is to  
23 cameras, and see how we can... can speed it up. Like  
24 once the cameras are procured, like those things  
25 should go up really, really, really fast. It's not

2 rocket science to do. So I'm going get back to you  
3 on timeline for cameras. I know we have a bunch of  
4 cameras on order. I'm going find out when they get  
5 in. But like, I don't want them sitting on shelves  
6 here. Like they're coming in, and then they're going  
7 up on... on street poles. That's the answer the  
8 camera question.

9 The other part of the legal dumping question,  
10 which had to do with 311 calls... how your district  
11 had the most 311 calls for illegal dumping. First,  
12 I'm very happy that we made that a specific category  
13 in 311 so that we can collect good data on it. I am  
14 going to dig into that data on illegal dumping and be  
15 very transparent about it. I've already dug into the  
16 311 data on litter baskets and learned a whole lot.  
17 I can tell you that we have teams in each district  
18 that address illegal dumping, and what we will do is  
19 based on the data make sure that those teams are  
20 sized correctly...

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: ... or appropriately from  
23 district to district.

24 On the incentives for kids to do organics.

25

2 Greg, I apologize for leaning on you so much.  
3 Can you take that question? I'm not sure exactly what  
4 we do there. But Council Member, if we don't do  
5 enough, I am a person who is all about  
6 implementation. A programs is not worth it if it's  
7 not implemented correctly. If the kids don't use it,  
8 then what are we doing? So I'm very committed to  
9 making sure that all stakeholders from the students  
10 to the staff at school are bought in, understand it,  
11 and the schools are set up?

12 So Greg, what do we have today on... on getting  
13 the kids ready for organics?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Sure. And  
15 actually, Commissioner, if you don't mind, I'm gonna  
16 pass this over to Bridget Anderson and her team. Her  
17 team is going to oversee all the outreach work and  
18 education and oversees the school's organics program.

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: Thank you  
20 Commissioner and Greg, and Councilmember. We are very  
21 excited to roll out this program citywide. We want  
22 to make sure that we are leveraging the learning  
23 curve we've had rolling out curbside composting for  
24 schools over the past several years.

2 This is... the heart heavy lift here is the DOE  
3 and the... you know the enormous population that they  
4 have to serve and motivate to do this program. So  
5 our role is to enable and support them in doing that.  
6 Part of it is the funding for the GrowNYC outreach  
7 team. They have developed over the years a very  
8 successful curriculum and program to support school  
9 custodians, school staff, school students and  
10 teachers. But we also know that you can't just go  
11 there once leave and move on. There needs to be sort  
12 of maintenance motivation. And that's something that  
13 we're trying to figure out now: Is how do we make  
14 sure that we have a light touch? Even after we've  
15 done our intensive rollout, to make sure that staff,  
16 there's turnover of staff, etc, that they remain  
17 motivated. So we are happy to discuss that more with  
18 you. But really, it is a partnership with us and the  
19 DOE to make sure we have the buy-in by the right  
20 people within every school.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I know my  
22 time has expired. My other question is just the  
23 funding... (crosstalk)

24

25

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I am not sure what funding  
3 that you're referring to. So maybe, Greg, do you  
4 have a sense of this?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yeah. So we did  
6 get a substantial amount of federal funding for the  
7 current fiscal year fiscal 22 as part of the  
8 Coronavirus relief bills that passed under the Biden  
9 administration last spring. And that was intended to  
10 be a replacement for lost revenue and was generally  
11 put toward our... our waste export funding. You're  
12 correct, Councilmember that funding is not renewed in  
13 fiscal 23. That's a one-time shot. But we did  
14 backfill those expenses with city tax levy funds.  
15 That's what they had been funded with previously, and  
16 that's what they'll go back to being funded with  
17 going... going forward.

18 And I do just want to put one pitch in here. I  
19 know the council has been very supportive of the  
20 extended producer responsibility programs,  
21 particularly for packaging. This is a place where  
22 it's not necessarily state funding in that it's not  
23 tax funding, but it's a place where state policy can  
24 really bring funding to our agency. And this is  
25 something that I know the legislature is considering

2 right now. They just passed a carpet recycling law  
3 that we hope the governor signs. Actually just today  
4 DC sent out a press release that the paint take back  
5 program is going into effect which is going to bring  
6 some funding for our special waste programs. So this  
7 is just another place where, you know, we could get  
8 potentially up to a \$100 million in funding if this  
9 program goes through. So any advocacy you or your  
10 colleagues can do, in addition to the resolution that  
11 you all passed earlier this year, would be very  
12 helpful.

13 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Next is councilmember Brewer,  
14 then Councilmember Sanchez, then Councilmember Menon.  
15 We'll turn to Councilmember Brewer.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

17 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Hold on. No, she dropped off  
18 the Zoom. Okay. We'll circle back. Councilmember  
19 Sanchez?

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

21 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: You asked me to bump you.  
22 Okay, we'll go to Councilmember Menin.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Okay, third time's the  
24 charm. Thank you so much. First of all, thank you,

2 Chair for holding this hearing. And good to see you,  
3 Commissioner.

4 So I really wanted to echo what my colleagues  
5 have previously said, about restoring the budget  
6 cuts, and particularly with increased litter basket  
7 pickup in my district, this is a hot button topic,  
8 and I know in so many other districts as well, and  
9 it's probably one of the top constituent issues that  
10 we are hearing from. But another issue that I'm  
11 hearing a lot from on constituents is since the  
12 announcement on alternate side parking, could you  
13 walk us through...? Will there be any changes to  
14 that? Is that now permanent? Are you going to be  
15 looking at any of the streets where there may be some  
16 issues? Because that's the question that we're  
17 constantly getting in the office.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sure. So on... I'll just  
19 take litter baskets first... with litter baskets, I  
20 could not be clearer that we appreciate any  
21 additional funding that is added into our budget to  
22 support litter baskets, and we are operationally  
23 ready to go and to increase service should the budget  
24 allow for it.

2 On alternate side, there are no changes. So...  
3 so basically, what we're going back to on July 5 is  
4 the same program we had before March 2020. So it's  
5 basically whatever the sign says. You're now  
6 following all of what the sign says rather than  
7 rather than half of it, which I know confused people  
8 for a while. But what I did commit to and I'll  
9 commit to you again on it, is that we're happy to  
10 take a look at refreshing alternate side parking. I  
11 mean, this is not an immediate thing, but undertake  
12 an analysis of it, to see if there are streets that  
13 didn't get it that should have it, or are there some  
14 streets that have too much or too little, or there's  
15 some districts that don't have it... have it at all,  
16 and have recently become or in the past few years  
17 become more residential. I'm happy to like put fresh  
18 eyes... fresh eyes to that type of analysis and work  
19 with the council.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: That would be incredibly  
21 helpful, because we do get a lot of questions from it  
22 and really doing a street by street analysis in  
23 neighborhoods to see which streets it makes sense on,  
24 which streets it doesn't make sense on would be very,  
25 very helpful.

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you for that  
3 suggestion.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Okay. Great. Thank you,  
5 and thank you to the Chairs for organizing this.  
6 Thank you.

7 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Council Member  
8 Menin. I don't see... oh, Councilor Sanchez. There  
9 we go. Because I don't see councilmember Brewer. So  
10 we'll turn to Councilmember Sanchez.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Great. Thank you, thank  
12 you so much, Malcom. And a huge shout out to Malcom  
13 for the endurance of just being here through all  
14 these hearings into our Sergeant At Arms. And  
15 everyone, of course, to chair Brannan. So thank you,  
16 thank you, Chair Nurse for this hearing... for  
17 Chairing this hearing.

18 So my question is... you may have addressed it  
19 earlier when you were talking about the illegal  
20 dumping, but I didn't quite hear. So my question is  
21 about the Precision Cleaning Initiative, which was  
22 launched in fiscal 22. So I know that you use  
23 borough-based teams to conduct the targeted cleanings  
24 for litter conditions, illegal dumping, and  
25 overflowing litter baskets. So just wanted to see if

2 there was an update of what this... what the program  
3 has accomplished in this last year and future years?

4 And let me just put a point... a finer point  
5 here. One, thank you so much for always answering  
6 our calls at Department of Sanitation. And, you  
7 know, whenever we have an issue I've had, you know,  
8 just great responsiveness. So just want to  
9 appreciate you all Commissioner, Deputy Commissioner.

10 And so that's part one of the question, and then  
11 part two is illegal dumping and more broadly, you  
12 know, just tips and advice for council members and  
13 how we can, you know, sort of curb that... and  
14 what... what the department's approach is to, you  
15 know, curbing that, like figuring out who's doing it  
16 and actually trying to stop it from the from the  
17 root.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, so I'll start with the  
19 answer to the second part of the question. I don't  
20 have in In front of me, the data about illegal  
21 dumping district by district, and I'll ask once I'm  
22 done. Maybe one of my colleagues has it here. If  
23 not, we'll circle back with you really fast.

24 But as to the general approach on illegal  
25 dumping, it's three things. All of them are related.

2 One is enforcement, enforcement, enforcement  
3 enforcement. If you are caught... illegal dumping is  
4 a theft of public space. If you are caught engaged  
5 in illegal dumping, it is a \$4,000 fine. And if  
6 you're using a vehicle, your vehicle can be  
7 impounded. We take this very seriously. And I want  
8 to make sure that the enforcement efforts around  
9 illegal dumping are as robust as they need to be in  
10 the places that suffer most from it, because we know  
11 that this is not a citywide problem, it is a very  
12 local problem, and it affects very much the  
13 communities that that have it. So the first was  
14 enforcement.

15 The second is Precision Cleaning, as you  
16 mentioned, we have these teams in every borough.  
17 Part of their work is to clean lots or places where  
18 illegal dumping has occurred. We will get you that  
19 data, but those cleanup efforts are very important.  
20 The before and after pictures are fantastic. The  
21 tragedy though -- and this is why I circles back to  
22 enforcement -- is that it keeps happening in the same  
23 places. So you clean it up one day, and then the  
24 next week, it's back. We are committed to continuing  
25 to clean it up and continuing to enforce it.

2 And that brings me to the third prong, which is  
3 cameras, cameras, cameras. I had mentioned to one of  
4 your colleagues that I have a lot of background and  
5 experience running camera systems. I very much  
6 believe in the value that cameras can add to stopping  
7 the blight of illegal dumping. And I'm looking to go  
8 all in on cameras where they are needed, and where  
9 they are needed is in these repeat locations. Like  
10 it's just too easy not to do. So I hope that answers  
11 your question. I'm wondering if Chief Lohan or  
12 Deputy Commissioner Anderson have any of the data  
13 around Precision Cleaning and how many dump sites  
14 we've cleaned this year? If not, Councilmember,  
15 we'll get back to you really fast with it.

16 CHIEF LOHAN: Yes. Good afternoon, everyone. I  
17 have some stats on Precision Cleaning. So since the  
18 program started to date, we assigned 3162 crews.  
19 They have been assigned to service 52,000 additional  
20 litter baskets, over 20,000 additional drop offs, and  
21 then over 10,000 additional block pieces swept. And  
22 you know with that we encounter discarded syringes,  
23 unfortunately, we removed over 1000 of those as well.

24 So it's been a pretty successful program, you  
25 know, we look forward to continuing that and

2 expanding that, and hopefully, refining that as time  
3 goes on.

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Do you by any chance have  
5 any borough-by-borough or district by district  
6 information? If not, we can get back to the Council  
7 Member, after but in particular, any work we've done  
8 in the Bronx generally or Morris Heights?

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

10 CHIEF LOHAN: Yes. I have... I have particular  
11 stats. I can definitely share that. If you want to  
12 get into that now. Or we could share that  
13 afterwards. I think that would be responsive to the  
14 Council Member's question.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Yeah, thank you.  
16 After... after is fine, you know, so we can get in  
17 writing. It's better for us.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, cool. We will send  
19 that over to you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you so  
21 much.

22 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember  
23 Sanchez.

24 I'm going to turn it back to the chairs. I know  
25 Chair Nurse had two quick follow ups and her closing

2 remarks, and then Chair Brannan for his closing  
3 remarks. So Chair Nurse.

4 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah, I also just want to  
5 recognize Councilmember Ayala had come back on.

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: I saw hand up.

7 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: She was the first name...  
8 first hand up earlier, so I texted her to come back  
9 on.

10 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you. I really  
12 appreciate that. Sorry, I had to jump off. I  
13 apologize now, Commissioner, if you have already  
14 responded to this question a million times. But  
15 actually, I have a couple. One is regarding the  
16 syringe litter program. I'm not sure now that we saw  
17 cuts in last year's budget. I'm not sure if that's  
18 the same this year... if those... those funds were  
19 restored. Obviously syringe litter continues to be a  
20 huge problem throughout the city. My district  
21 specifically has seen an increase in the last few  
22 years. So it's something that we lobbied for and  
23 were really excited to grow... and then it was  
24 abruptly cut. That's one.

2 I'll ask them that way so that we don't run out  
3 of time.

4 Two, I was... I'm very curious to find out how  
5 funding is broken down by district. Is it by garage?  
6 Is it by community? I, you know, I often feel like  
7 our community... and I know that Chair Brannan  
8 mentioned that we want what everybody wants. I want  
9 to kind of just state that I don't want what  
10 everybody wants. I want everybody to have what they  
11 have. But I want those communities that need more to  
12 get that more, because I find, you know, I know for a  
13 fact that, you know, the district south of me, you  
14 know, may not... you know, may have more access to  
15 resources to supplement cleaning needs to haul off  
16 their garbage with private, you know, groups, but in  
17 East Harlem and South Bronx, we don't have that that  
18 privilege. And so we have a lot of density and that  
19 means that we have a lot of garbage. So I would like  
20 to know how that... that budget is broken down.

21 Three: Where my garbage cans? My garbage cans  
22 are missing everywhere. There was a theory a couple  
23 of years ago... a rumor that segmentation kind of  
24 verify that they took the garbage cans because they  
25 didn't want household garbage on corners, but that

2 has resulted in a huge problem for us, because now  
3 people are just throwing, you know, their garbage on  
4 the street. So I would like my garbage cans back if  
5 possible.

6 And last but not least, I guess this is more of a  
7 comment than anything else, but on Bruckner  
8 Boulevard, there are some rails right underneath the  
9 highway that are technically in councilmember  
10 Salamanca's district in the Bronx. They smell  
11 horribly throughout the summer months, I was driving  
12 by I had my window closed, I had my air conditioning  
13 on and my entire vehicle smelled of nothing but  
14 garbage. I look to my left, and there's nothing but  
15 residential homes there. And I know that the wind is  
16 carrying that smell every single summer. So I wonder  
17 if that's something that you are aware of? Maybe  
18 anything that you can help with?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, Greg, I have not been  
20 fully briefed up on the syringe litter programs. I  
21 want to see if either Deputy Commissioner Anderson or  
22 Chief Lohan could take that one.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Sure I can... I  
24 can take that one. So councilmember, thank you for  
25 those questions. And I certainly understand the...

2 the challenges in your district, I've been on several  
3 walkthroughs, both in the Bronx, and the Manhattan  
4 parts of your district, specifically focused on this  
5 issue. And I'm happy to say that we do have the  
6 additional syringe litter staff on board again, after  
7 they were cut a year and a half ago, or so. So we do  
8 have the six dedicated staff there. We are doing  
9 daily patrols in the Bronx, and... and very frequent  
10 patrols in East Harlem as well as other places around  
11 the city where... where we do see those either 311  
12 complaints or... or incoming from elected officials  
13 or otherwise. So that's a very important issue for  
14 us, and we certainly want to make sure that we're  
15 deploying those staff effectively. So if there  
16 are... if there are places where you're seeing  
17 accumulations of syringes, please let our team know  
18 and we'll certainly get them there.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Absolutely. Do you find  
20 that six... six... You have six dedicated staffers.  
21 Is that enough?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: As I think the  
23 commissioner has said before, we can always do more  
24 with more, but we're certainly getting to the most  
25 problematic locations on a very regular basis.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I appreciate that.

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you so much, Greg.

4 The garbage cans in your district that have  
5 disappeared. It's the first I'm hearing of this. I  
6 commit to you that I personally will look into it. I  
7 know the value of a litter basket in a community, and  
8 losing them is a big deal.

9 I will say that if they were taken because they  
10 have household trash in them... household trash in  
11 litter baskets is a big deal. Part of the reason why  
12 we see overflowing litter baskets is not enough  
13 service, but the city will never be able to do enough  
14 service to make it so that putting houses...

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: ... or household trash in  
17 litter baskets won't cause overflowing conditions. I  
18 don't know if we have to do community education,  
19 public outreach, but litter baskets are for walking  
20 trash only. To the extent people misuse them it  
21 creates a problem for everyone. Now I'm not sure  
22 that the right course of action is to remove...  
23 remove the litter baskets. There are other steps you  
24 can take. But I look forward to talking to you  
25 offline, understanding where these litter baskets

2 were getting to the bottom, and hopefully restoring  
3 them Your service there.

4 Your question on Bruckner Boulevard: If that...  
5 it sounds terrible. I haven't experienced the smell  
6 myself. But if that is an issue that needs cleaning,  
7 we will obviously commit to doing that.

8 Greg, do you have more information in background  
9 on Bruckner Boulevard?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yeah, I do.

11 And... and thank you. For that question,  
12 Councilmember. It's certainly something that we've  
13 heard, particularly in the summer. There is an  
14 intermodal facility next to the Oak Point Yard, that  
15 does not handle containers of municipal solid waste,  
16 but does handle some material that comes out of DEP  
17 wastewater treatment plants. And, you know, we've  
18 worked with them over the years to try to address  
19 those odor concerns. We've also worked with DEP  
20 that's something that... that we sit down with them  
21 to talk through every summer. And you know, when  
22 we... when we notice that there are issues going on,  
23 we conduct enforcement as necessary as well. So  
24 that's something that we're certainly aware of, and  
25 are... (crosstalk)

2 COUNCIL MEMBERS AYALA: That's really important,  
3 because if you if you consider where that the  
4 placement of that rail yard, the fact that the  
5 families that are across the street that include  
6 children are already inhaling all of the fumes that  
7 are coming from carbon emissions, right? And then on  
8 top of it, the entire... that entire area, smells  
9 like a garbage can, every single summer. I mean,  
10 smells so bad. I felt really bad, you know, because  
11 that was the first time I had ever experienced it.  
12 And immediately I look left, and I'm like, oh my god,  
13 like I couldn't imagine having to live here. And  
14 smell that day in and day out.

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Councilmember, I think your  
16 final question was how are resources broken down?  
17 It's really district by district. So by garage.

18 And I think maybe perhaps when you were on... so  
19 my background is really in data, and I want to take a  
20 very much a data driven approach to allocating  
21 resources in the department, how many people work in  
22 each garage, how many trucks we have in each garage,  
23 those... those types of things and take a fresh look  
24 at it. And we are committed to using our resources  
25 equitably. Meaning the districts that need it

2 should... should have it and districts that have too  
3 much and can do with less should... should do with  
4 less. So that's a general high level, how... how  
5 it's done and how we plan to do it going forward. I  
6 was wondering if you had a more specific question  
7 about that?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Well, yeah... I mean...  
9 you know, again, what I understand is that, you know,  
10 other districts, that are neighboring districts  
11 receive a lot more funding, in comparison to East  
12 Harlem. Again, because I have a higher density and,  
13 you know, problem, and this is not specific to East  
14 Harlem. This is the in the Bronx, you know, you  
15 can't... I mean, it's horrible. I mean, it is just  
16 really, really, really dirty. And I'm not asking. I  
17 think we all got 2 street sweeps a day, then we all  
18 get 2 street sweeps a day, but is sanitation in a  
19 position to identify communities like mine, that  
20 obviously need maybe four, right?, because we don't  
21 have those resources, my small businesses can pay to  
22 have a garbage carted. We obviously, you know, don't  
23 have sufficient garbage cans. We have a lot more  
24 garbage on our streets than normal. So when we  
25 put... we opened the streets now for the restaurants,

2 the most of my restaurants can't even benefit from  
3 that, because the rat population is now... you know,  
4 surrounding them, because they're looking for garbage  
5 that's readily available throughout the community.

6 So I want to know exactly how much each district  
7 gets because I would like to know why, you know, why  
8 there are disparities that exist in communities like  
9 ours. And I appreciate, you know, that you're brand  
10 new, and I look forward to working with you on this.  
11 I like to be fair, and I know that you just got here.  
12 So you know, this is this has nothing to do with you.  
13 You're inheriting the situation. But I... I feel  
14 that you know, for me, it's really important. And  
15 it's for many of my colleagues, the equitability and  
16 the distribution of services. But by that, I don't  
17 mean that everybody gets the same cut as a pie. By  
18 that I mean that our districts all look the same,  
19 because the ones that need more are getting more.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I understand and what I...  
21 the way I think we should proceed is very soon, like  
22 this week, next week, like not two months from now.  
23 To sit down and walk you through what the resources  
24 are in your district, and understand like more  
25 specifically where in the district you're not getting

2 the service that is required, and see what we can do.  
3 As we get resources in, we want to allocate them,  
4 equitably. Now, the street sweeping is really hard.  
5 I'll be really honest, because street sweeping  
6 today... meaning to... to change quickly, because  
7 there are street sweeping rules, they're all posted,  
8 and to change those is a big to do, it's not that we  
9 won't do it, we can undertake an analysis, it's just  
10 not an immediate thing. So it's hard to add extra  
11 street sweeping immediately beyond what's... beyond  
12 what's already coming... starting July 5, with the  
13 return of alternate side. But we want to sit with  
14 you and make sure we understand what the needs are so  
15 that we can equitably allocate services across the  
16 city.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Okay. I appreciate that.  
18 Thank you so much. Thank you, Chair Nurse.

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: All right, thank you. I'll  
20 turn it back to you Chair Nurse and Chair Brannan.

21 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you. I just had two or  
22 three questions. I know we're all probably losing  
23 our brain cells. I haven't eaten. I'm starting to  
24 get.... like my head is going crazy. So I'll try to  
25 be quick. These are just things I didn't want to ask

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE 346

2 because there was so many people waiting to ask. But  
3 on leaf and yard collection. It's great to see  
4 there's \$4 million baseline funding for that.

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Right.

6 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: But how... can you break that  
7 down in terms of, you know, is that across the whole  
8 city? Or how many districts is that? How much?

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It's citywide.

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: I know you mentioned it  
11 earlier in your...

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, it's a citywide  
13 program. Each district gets 2 Sundays a month in the  
14 fall season. But it's run over... over four weeks, I  
15 think or... or Greg, do you have how long the program  
16 is... but it's two... it's two per district. And,  
17 Greg, do you have in front of you the tonnage numbers  
18 on fall leaf? Or Chief Lohan?

19 Oh, I'm sorry. I'm sorry. I said I said that  
20 this was... was citywide. I meant the 38 leaf  
21 districts. So it's not it's not citywide, but it is  
22 in the 38 districts that have leafs. Sorry, go ahead  
23 Greg.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER G ANDERSON: Yeah. And this  
25 past... this past fall, we collected just under 2000

2 tones of leaves. That was an abbreviated program,  
3 because of some issues we were having in November.  
4 And then previously, we've collected as much as...  
5 2017 was 3200 tons, 2019 was 3700 tons. So it can  
6 really... it can really be a substantial amount of  
7 material collected. It really does depend on the  
8 timing of the collections. The leaves fall at  
9 different times every year, sometimes they stay on  
10 longer. Sometimes they hit the ground in early  
11 November. So that's that is a factor.

12 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, great. Um, Stop And  
13 Swap. Sorry, I'm just kind of trying to crank  
14 through because I know we're all brain dead.

15 What is the budget for the program in the... in  
16 FY 23? And then can you give just any anecdotal...  
17 or if you have data, kind of, you know, what's the  
18 participation, attendance numbers of these events,  
19 pre-pandemic versus what we're seeing now? In terms  
20 of just effective strategies? Or reuse strategies?

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So the Stop And Swap is  
22 funded at \$495,000, which we are... we're pleased to  
23 get. I have not yet been to a Stop And Swap event.  
24 So if Bridget or Greg or Chief Lohan can give some  
25 anecdotal details about it.

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: Sure, yeah.  
3 Thank you for that question. We are funded, as the  
4 Commissioner has said. Part of that is for one full-  
5 time person that we hired last year that wasn't fully  
6 baselined. And the remaining just shy of \$400,000 is  
7 for our relationship with GrowNYC, who runs the Stop  
8 And Swap program. We aim to have one per community  
9 board every year, and this year, attendance was  
10 highly variable because of COVID, and some of our  
11 sites, you know, had to limit participation, but we  
12 can see you know, more than 100 people in and out of  
13 a Stop And Swap at any one location. They are very  
14 much micro programs where we heavily do outreach in  
15 the neighborhood, so people can you know, walk their  
16 material in and out. Any material that is not  
17 actually swapped gets donated to a local donation  
18 outlet. So it's a... you know, in the, you know, 10s  
19 to 100s, I would say. And it also depends on how  
20 large the space is that were able to identify to run  
21 the swap.

22 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And how much does an average  
23 swap cost to put on?

24

25

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: It's a little  
3 bit variable based on... based on the space we get,  
4 but I can get back to you with an average cost.

5 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. Yeah, I'm just... I  
6 would be curious to see like, you know, how much  
7 material is being, you know, swapped... or reused,  
8 how much material is actually then having to be  
9 donated after... just to understand like the  
10 effectiveness of this program as a reuse strategy?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER B ANDERSON: We can provide  
12 you that in writing. Absolutely.

13 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. My last question is  
14 around Save As You Throw, one of my favorite topics.

15 We did... the council did put in request for -- I  
16 can't remember if it's \$1 million or \$2 million at  
17 this point -- for a study on it. I know in the past,  
18 there was a contractor hired to conduct this study.  
19 So before we talk about why or why not it may not be  
20 included in the FY 23, is there anything that can be  
21 shared from the previous attempt at this? Were there  
22 any initial findings or anything that was... or is  
23 shareable to the committee?

24 COMMISSIONER TISCH: The last real look at this  
25 was 2014. There were plans to do it in 2017. And

2 then I understand that they got scrapped. So the  
3 last study of it is quite old. I'm happy to share  
4 it, if you're interested.

5 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah, I would love that. And  
6 anything that... I mean, I know some motion was  
7 started in the second attempt, and I know that it was  
8 scrapped, but I'm just curious if there was anything  
9 that was ever documented or produced in terms of what  
10 they started to do, or...

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: You and me both. I'm going  
12 to get that answer for both of us.

13 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah, I would love that.  
14 Okay, great. Um, you know, I just... you know,  
15 curious what you feel about this, and if you think  
16 this is something that departments should prioritize,  
17 or that the administration should put some funding  
18 towards at least studying. We're putting a lot of  
19 money into a lot of innovative pilots and other  
20 creative strategies. So I'm curious, from your  
21 perspective, if this is something that we should work  
22 towards investing in.

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Um, so we have a lot of  
24 studies going on, which we are thrilled to do,  
25 because that will very much inform our operations. I

2 think this is definitely a worthwhile thing to study.  
3 And certainly, if the last study was in 2014, like  
4 refresh and get really smart on. Practically I  
5 think, the right place to do it would be around the  
6 solid waste management plan. It's... it is a huge...  
7 it would represent a huge change to how sanitation  
8 works in New York City, and it's not something that I  
9 think can or should be... be rushed. And I think it  
10 is... it is so big, but it is probably best done as  
11 part of the larger plan for New York City.

12 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. Awesome. Well, I  
13 know that there is another meeting after this for  
14 Chair Brannan. So I'm going to be done. I just want  
15 to, you know, finally... just my last word is to  
16 advocate for, you know, the rat mitigation zones, the  
17 places that haven't had any of the pilot programs,  
18 especially East New York, as I just want to uplift,  
19 Councilmember Barron's remarks, for some of these  
20 smart bins for the schools to have a chance to  
21 participate. I think this will be really exciting,  
22 especially if we have a site coming up on Rockaway  
23 Boulevard there, it could be a really great  
24 opportunity to lay the foundation for all the

2 outreach and education that is going to be required  
3 to do potentially a universal program.

4 So thank you, again, Commissioner and Deputy  
5 Commissioners and all the senior leaders and members.  
6 I'm going to pass it back over to Chair Brannan.

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you Chair Nurse.  
8 Yeah, thank you to the commissioner, obviously in  
9 your leadership team, for answering all of our  
10 questions.

11 You know, if I'm reading between the lines, I  
12 think, you know, you agree with a lot of what the  
13 council is pushing for, you know, and I hope that OMB  
14 makes note of that as well. We are really dedicated  
15 to bringing the city back stronger than ever and  
16 making sure that our neighborhoods are clean, and  
17 that we have equity across the city in every zip  
18 code. It is a big part of that recovery and a big  
19 part of the way people feel about their  
20 neighborhoods. If their neighborhood is clean, they  
21 feel a certain way, and we want people to feel like  
22 the city is back. And that's why we're fighting so  
23 hard for a lot of these restorations in these  
24 different programs. So, we look forward to working  
25

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE

353

2 with you. Going forward again, welcome aboard

3 Commissioner Tisch.

4 And with that, I will adjourn.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE

354

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 15, 2022